

COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

1

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL  
OPERATIONS

----- X

APRIL 5, 2022

Start: 10:04 A. M.

Recess: 10:33 A. M.

HELD AT: REMOTE HEARING (VIRTUAL ROOM 3)

B E F O R E: HON. SANDRA UNG, CHAIR

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

GALE A. BREWER  
SHAHANA K. HANIF  
LINCOLN RESTLER  
LYNN C. SCHULMAN

## COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Daniel Steinberg,

Director of the Mayor's Office of Operations; serves as The Chair of the Report and Advisory Board Review Commission

Fiona Peach,

Assistant Director of The Project Manager unit in the Mayor's Office of Operations; serves on the Report and Advisory Board Review Commission

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

3

[THIS PAGE LEFT INTENTIONALLY BLANK]

2 SERGEANT BRADLEY: Cloud recording is up.

3 SERGEANT LEONARDO: Great, Sergeant Polite with  
4 the opening, please?

5 SERGEANT POLITE: Thank you, good morning, and  
6 welcome to the remote hearing on Governmental  
7 Operations.

8 Will council members and staff, please turn in  
9 their video at this time? Thank you, to minimize  
10 disruptions, please place all electronic devices to  
11 vibrate or silent mode.

12 To send testimony, please send it to  
13 [testimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:testimony@council.nyc.gov), once again that is  
14 [testimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:testimony@council.nyc.gov).

15 Chair, we are ready to begin.

16 CHAIRPERSON UNG: [GAVELING IN] [GAVEL SOUND]

17 Good morning, I am Council Member Sandra Ung,  
18 Chair of The Committee on Governmental Operations.  
19 Today's hearing will focus on the 2021 waiver  
20 determinations of the Report and Advisory Board  
21 Review Commission.

22 As some of you may know, this commission is  
23 responsible for reviewing all reporting requirements  
24 in the New York City Charter and Administrative Code.  
25 If the commission determines that particular a

2 reporting requirement is no longer justified, it has  
3 the authority to waive the requirements. Any waiver  
4 made by the commission may be approved or rejected by  
5 The City Council in 121 (sic) (\*120) days. Last  
6 December, the commission voted to waive six different  
7 reporting requirements in the City Charter and  
8 Administrative Code. Each of these six requirements  
9 is described in detail in The Commissioner's  
10 determination letter, which was submitted to The City  
11 Council on December 30th, and it is available for  
12 download on the website of The Mayor's Office  
13 Operations.

14 For the members of the committee, the  
15 determination letter is also attached to today's  
16 committee report as Exhibit A... 1, rather,  
17 apologies.

18 Today the committee will hear from Daniel  
19 Steinberg, who is the Director of the Mayor's Office  
20 of Operations; who serves as The Chair of the Report  
21 and Advisory Board Review Commission to obtain  
22 additional context of the commission's recent waiver  
23 determination.

24

25

2 In addition, the committee will be considering a  
3 resolution to reject two of the waivers made by the  
4 commission and approve the remaining four.

5 The committee will also be hearing a companion  
6 bill to remove any language in The Administrative  
7 Code and Charter that would be nullified by the  
8 passage of the resolution.

9 And, with that, I want to thank Director  
10 Steinberg for joining us today. I also want to thank  
11 our committee staff, Senior Financial Analyst,  
12 Sebastian Bacchi, and CJ Murray, Senior Legislative  
13 Counsel for their work in putting this hearing  
14 together. Finally, I want to thank my own Chief of  
15 Staff, Alexander Hart for his assistance.

16 I will now turn it over to our moderator,  
17 committee counsel, CJ Murray, to go over some  
18 procedural items.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Chair. I am CJ  
20 Murray, counsel to The Committee on Governmental  
21 Operations. Before we begin testimony, I want to  
22 remind all hearing participants that you will be on  
23 mute until you are called on to testify, at which  
24 point you will unmuted by a member of the staff.

2 The first panelist to give testimony today will  
3 be Daniel Steinberg, Director of the Mayor's Office  
4 of Operations and Chair of the Report and Advisory  
5 Board Review Commission. In addition, Fiona Peach,  
6 Assistant Director of the Project Manager Unit in The  
7 Mayor's Office of Operations will be available to  
8 answer questions.

9 During the hearing, if a council member would  
10 like to ask a question of a specific panelist, please  
11 use the Zoom Raise Hand Function, and I will call on  
12 you in order. We will be limiting council member  
13 questions to five minutes, which includes the time it  
14 takes the panelist to answer your question. Please  
15 note that for ease of this virtual hearing there will  
16 not be a second round of questioning outside of  
17 questions from the committee chair.

18 As a reminder all hearing participants may submit  
19 written testimony to [testimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:testimony@council.nyc.gov) .

20 We will now hear testimony from the  
21 administration. Before we begin, I will administer  
22 the oath.

23 Daniel Steinberg, and Assistant Director Peach,  
24 please raise your right hand. I will read the oath  
25

2 once and then call on each of you individually for a  
3 response.

4 Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth,  
5 and nothing but the truth, before this committee, and  
6 to respond honestly to council member questions?

7 Director Steinberg?

8 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Yes.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Assistant Director Peach?

10 ASSISTANT DIRECTOR PEACH: Yes.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, you may begin your  
12 testimony.

13 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Good morning, everyone, can  
14 you hear me alright?

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes, we can hear you.

16 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Great, okay.

17 Good morning, Chair Ung and members of the  
18 Committee on Governmental Operations. My name is Dan  
19 Steinberg. I am Director of the Mayor's Office of  
20 Operations and serve as the Chair of the Report and  
21 Advisory Board Review Commission, which we'll call  
22 RABRC. I am joined here today by Fiona Peach, the  
23 Assistant Director of our Project Manager Unit who  
24 has led the revival of RABRC.



2 Before I address the items in front of us today,  
3 allow me to provide an overview on the work done by  
4 the Mayor's Office of Operations and RABRC.

5 The Mayor's Office of Operations was created in  
6 1977 by Executive Order. The office plans,  
7 coordinates, and directs governmental operations and  
8 holds City agencies and offices accountable.  
9 Operations has since grown into a project and  
10 performance management, research, and customer  
11 service engine that works to make New York City a  
12 fairer and more equitable place for all its  
13 residents.

14 The City relies on Operations to strengthen  
15 efficiency and coordination within government. To  
16 serve this purpose, Operations provides City agencies  
17 and offices with research and analysis, project and  
18 performance management, and advisory support. Some of  
19 these projects in the past have included key mayoral  
20 initiatives like the City's Vaccine Command Center,  
21 Vision Zero and IDNYC. The office also publishes the  
22 Mayor's Management Report, the only publication of  
23 its kind in the country to track agency performance  
24 year-over-year spanning over almost 2,000 performance  
25 indicators.

2 RABRC, meanwhile, was created in 2010 when voters  
3 approved a Charter Review Commission proposal to  
4 review and assess the continued usefulness of  
5 reporting requirements and advisory boards  
6 established by the City Charter, Administrative Code,  
7 and unconsolidated provisions of local law.

8 The commission is chaired by the Director of the  
9 Mayor's Office of Operations, and voting members  
10 consist of representatives from the City Council, Law  
11 Department, the Department of Information Technology  
12 and Telecommunications -- now under the Office of  
13 Technology and Innovation -- and OMB.

14 RABRC seeks to identify and eliminate outdated,  
15 duplicative, and unnecessary reporting and advisory  
16 board requirements -- with the goal of enhancing  
17 government efficiency and productivity -- hence the  
18 connection to Operations.

19 In weighing whether to grant a report waiver,  
20 RABRC considers four primary criteria that are  
21 outlined in the Charter.

22 1. Utility: Does the report provide useful  
23 information for evaluating activities or results of  
24 City programs? Does it provide useful information for  
25 assessing effective management of City resources?

2 2. Redundancy: Does the information exist  
3 elsewhere? Is it wholly or partially duplicative of  
4 another required report?

5 3. Relevance: Our world constantly changes. Is a  
6 particular report still necessary? Is it still clear  
7 in a very different policy context?

8 4. Benefit: Is the information in a report worth  
9 the cost of production? So, again, this involved kind  
10 of cost benefit methodology that doesn't come down to  
11 any one criteria, but really must be weighed together  
12 in relation to one another.

13 At its public meeting on December 10, 2021, RABRC  
14 voted to waive six reports.

15 1. Assessment of city facilities regarding  
16 certain clean on-site power generation technologies

17 2. High Pedestrian Crash Location Report

18 3. New York City Sports Commission Report

19 4. 911 Operational Time Analysis Report

20 5. Annual Youth Services Report

21 6. Community Services Block Grant (CSBG) Report.

22 According to the City Charter, the City Council  
23 has the authority to approve or disapprove these  
24 waiver recommendations. In the Preconsidered  
25 Resolution before this Committee today, the Council

2 intends to approve four of these recommendations and  
3 disapprove two of them. The two waiver  
4 recommendations the Council is disapproving, that is,  
5 the two reports that they intend to maintain, are the  
6 911 Operational Time Analysis Report and the Annual  
7 Youth Services Report.

8 Uh, so as you know, RABRC recommended waiving the  
9 911 Operational Time Analysis Report because it was  
10 deemed duplicative, uh, of the subject matter and  
11 substance of other mandated reports. The benefits  
12 and usefulness of the report did not outweigh the  
13 expenditure of public resources, and the report is  
14 irrelevant in light of changing circumstances,  
15 current information needs and technological advances.  
16 RABRC did not receive any public comments or  
17 Commissioner testimony in opposition to the waiver.

18 And, similarly, RABRC recommended waiving the  
19 Annual Youth Services Report, because it was  
20 determined that it was duplicative of other reporting  
21 the benefits and usefulness of the report did not  
22 outweigh the expenditure of public resources to  
23 produce it. And RABRC did not receive any public  
24 comments, uhm, in opposition to the waiver.

2 The RABRC members from the Administration stand  
3 by their votes as to the merits of the waiver  
4 recommendations, but fully recognize and respect  
5 Council's authority to disapprove the  
6 recommendations.

7 Operations agrees with Council that the  
8 information required to be in these reports is  
9 important for both policy makers and the public, and  
10 we are fully committed to making government data  
11 accessible.

12 And, most importantly, we look forward to working  
13 in partnership with The Council and building  
14 consensus toward future determinations.

15 The Mayor's Office of Operations and RABRC remain  
16 committed to enhancing government efficiency by  
17 eliminating redundant government reports while  
18 ensuring public access to government data. We look  
19 forward to working with each of you to identify  
20 reports that can be eliminated in the future, and we  
21 thank you for the opportunity to testify today.

22 In reality, we are very pleased that RABRC is  
23 getting serious attention, and we look forward to  
24 collaborating over the next eight months, as just  
25

2 recently entered the new cycle for considering  
3 reports and board retirement.

4 So, thank you again, and we are very happy to  
5 answer questions.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, I will now turn it  
7 over to Chair Ung. Chair, if you would like to ask  
8 any questions at this time, please feel free to go  
9 ahead.

10 CHAIRPERSON UNG: Thank you, and I, uhm, have been  
11 joined by my colleague City Council Member Gale  
12 Brewer.

13 So, one question, is how does The Report Advisory  
14 Board Review Commission identify reports that may be  
15 candidates for waiver?

16 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Apologies, I made the mistake  
17 of muting myself. If I do that, I guess I am muted,  
18 uh, in perpetuity.

19 Uh, so, right now, we entered a fairly involved  
20 process of reaching out to agencies and soliciting  
21 proposals and of course we welcome the proposals of  
22 any of The Commission members. And, Fiona, feel free  
23 to embellish or [INAUDIBLE 00:11:48]... (CROSS-TALK)

24 ASSISTANT DIRECTOR PEACH: Sure, so the... The  
25 regular process that we have entered now is, uh, on

1 an annual basis we solicit candidates from every City  
2 agency. Uh, Operations takes a first look to make  
3 sure the candidates meet the four criteria at length  
4 by, uh, at least one four criteria, at length by The  
5 Charter. And then the full commission reviews, and  
6 we go through a lengthy process of questions and  
7 answers, uh, between agencies and commission members.  
8 But we also do take, uh, suggestions from commission  
9 members if they happen to independently know of  
10 reports that might be outside of what agencies  
11 submitted.  
12

13 CHAIRPERSON UNG: Thank you. Uh, you also  
14 testified that the Annual Youth Service Report is the  
15 duplicative of other reporting. Can you give a  
16 little bit more detail about that? Where are the  
17 reporting of the Annual Youth Service Reports?

18 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Okay, I won't go through  
19 every data attribute, uh, in detail, but the... the  
20 data for the report can be found in the MMR, uhm, in  
21 Contract's data, on Open Data, uh, in PASSPort, and  
22 then separate reporting on Community Development  
23 Block Grant funding.

24 CHAIRPERSON UNG: Uhm, is it available in the Open  
25 Data Portal?

1 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Yes

2 CHAIRPERSON UNG: Oh, good... (CROSS-TALK)

3 ASSISTANT DIRECTOR PEACH: Some if is in available  
4 in the Open Data... (CROSS-TALK)

5 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Oh, I'm sorry... (CROSS-  
6 TALK)

7 ASSISTANT DIRECTOR PEACH: Portal.

8 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Thank you, Fiona.

9 ASSISTANT DIRECTOR PEACH: Yeah, but given the  
10 nature of having a lot of that information published  
11 in different places, it's not quite as simple as  
12 having it all on Open Data in one place.

13 CHAIRPERSON UNG: Thank you.

14 Uh, and can you just walk us through The  
15 Commissioner's reasoning for voting to waive the  
16 report on the 911 response times?

17 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Mm-hmm, yes, very similar,  
18 uh, in the sense that the police department reports  
19 response time data on Open Data and in the MMR and  
20 elsewhere. And, you know, we just feel that those  
21 are better more accessible, uh, more contextual ways  
22 to access that data. And it is required by local law  
23 -- a different local law -- to be reported on Open  
24



1 Data. So, it was determined that this report was  
2 duplicative and potentially confusing.

3  
4 CHAIRPERSON UNG: Okay, I am going to follow that.  
5 Why would it be confusing?

6 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Well, there are certain  
7 requirements that are not necessarily... that do not  
8 necessarily translate especially well such as the  
9 tour metric, which the tour time metric is something  
10 that's required by the initial report. But, uh, that  
11 is not necessarily a data point that straight forward  
12 to sort of calculate as, uh, the local sort of  
13 implies. It's not stable concept, because it refers  
14 to both time of day and a group of resources and they  
15 overlap in complex ways. So, you have some units  
16 working 12-hour tours while others are working 8-hour  
17 tours. So, it's not a straight forward data point in  
18 the way that the local law sort of frames it. Other  
19 than that, uh, all of the data in terms of response  
20 time is available, and, uhm, the local law that  
21 mandates that is very much in place.

22 CHAIRPERSON UNG: What is the local law that  
23 requires the information to be on Open Data?

24 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Fiona if you have it in  
25 front... Oh, I think I...

2 ASSISTANT DIRECTOR PEACH: I am looking for it.

3 So, the local law is actually relevant to the fire  
4 department. They were required to put their response  
5 time data on Open Data, and then the police  
6 department followed suit. Separately, there's a  
7 reporting requirement for the police department in  
8 the AD code to publish their response time data in  
9 the MMR. And that AD code provision is § 14149.  
10 And, that's the legal requirement for PD to publish  
11 their response time data in the MMR. But, there is  
12 no law requiring PD to publish their data to Open  
13 Data they're just following suit to the fire  
14 department related law.

15 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Thank you, Fiona, for  
16 clarifying. Apologies to The Council.

17 CHAIRPERSON UNG: Okay, understood.

18 I am done my questioning, thank you.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Chair. I am now  
20 calling council members in the order they have used  
21 the Zoom Raise Hand Function. Council members, if  
22 you would like to ask a question and you have not yet  
23 raised your hand, please do so now.

24 I see Council Member Brewer has her hand raised.  
25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you very much, Madam  
3 Chair, and I have to say I have been on the MMR  
4 Committee in the past, so I am quite familiar with  
5 what you do. I think there is a lot of work to be  
6 done still as the author of the Open Data bill, I am  
7 always pushing for more data, more transparency, and  
8 how you got there.

9 So, one question I have even addition to this, I  
10 have a list of all of the reports that The City of  
11 New York is supposed to give to the City Council.  
12 And one of the challenges, and I didn't know if you  
13 looked at this, is a lot of them have not been  
14 fulfilled in terms of the material that they are  
15 supposed to give to The Council. Do you look at  
16 that? And what are you doing about it? I can give  
17 you... I've passed like three or four laws; I've  
18 been around for a long time, and I have passed three  
19 or four laws that are not being fulfilled.

20 So, what are you doing about that in addition to  
21 looking at the reports -- whether they should or  
22 should not exist -- some of them are not fulfilling  
23 what they are supposed to.

24 So, what is going on with that?

2 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Yes, I should let Fiona weigh  
3 in. But, uh, in a certain respect this entire RABRC  
4 work is a big compliance oversight exercise, because  
5 it does require us to look at the full body of  
6 reports that are required on the books and asses, you  
7 know, which one are being done dutifully and which  
8 have slipped over the years. And, so, this in a way  
9 this commission is a very important instrument for  
10 advancing both the compliance work, but also for  
11 identifying reports that have not been done -- and  
12 potentially escalating them through this instrument.  
13 And, in some cases, I think the fact that they are  
14 not done, that alone is not criteria for eliminating  
15 them obviously... (CROSS-TALK)

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Oh, no, I don't want to...  
17 (CROSS-TALK)

18 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Right...

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I don't want them... I  
20 don't actually want them eliminated, but I do want  
21 them [INAUDIBLE 00:18:43]... (CROSS-TALK)

22 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Of course, you want them  
23 done... (CROSS-TALK)

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [INAUDIBLE 00:18:44]  
25

2 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Yes, totally. So, we work  
3 closely with DORIS, The Department of Records,  
4 because they are the official warehouse and  
5 gatekeeper or record keeper of reporting  
6 requirements. And we would be eager to know of any  
7 reports that are not in compliance right now, because  
8 it very much is something that we take seriously.  
9 The City now has an internal compliance officer that  
10 works at City Hall, the former Deputy Comptroller for  
11 Audits, Marjorie Landa, and I think part of the  
12 prevue of her work is to really make sure that the  
13 City is in compliance with all of these reporting  
14 requirements. So, we have begun working closely with  
15 her on those sorts of issues. Okay, but, Fiona,  
16 please weigh in... (CROSS-TALK)

17 ASSISTANT DIRECTOR PEACH: Yeah, I'll echo that.  
18 I think we look at our role as RABRC exactly as The  
19 Charter describes it. And that is for us to waive  
20 unnecessary reporting requirements. We are not the  
21 compliance arm. It is not our job as RABRC to  
22 enforce the agencies to meet these reporting  
23 requirements, but we are very aware of agencies that  
24 are not meeting them through the DORIS Portal,  
25 because that is something that they have taken in as

1 a role due to a local law passed in -- I think it was  
2 2019.

3  
4 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Mm-hmm

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: And so I should talk to  
6 Pauline Toole then about making sure they get  
7 enforced, is that what you are telling me? This...  
8 I don't want to [INAUDIBLE 00:20:03]... (CROSS-TALK)

9 ASSISTANT DIRECTOR PEACH: She... Pauline Toole  
10 will be able to tell you who is not, uhm... If you  
11 look at the DORIS Required Publications Portal, it  
12 will show you the last date something was published.  
13 And she will be able to point you... (CROSS-TALK)

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I know I have that, I...  
15 (CROSS-TALK)

16 ASSISTANT DIRECTOR PEACH: those agencies. But,  
17 it's the agencies... (CROSS-TALK)

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I copied all of them... I  
19 copied the whole thing, so I have it right here. I  
20 have the list. I have the [INAUDIBLE 00:20:20] ...  
21 (CROSS-TALK)

22 ASSISTANT DIRECTOR PEACH: [INAUDIBLE 00:20:21]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: But, I want to know who is  
24 in charge... So, DORIS can give me the  
25 information... (CROSS-TALK)

2 ASSISTANT DIRECTOR PEACH: Yep... (CROSS-TALK)

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Whether it's Marjorie  
4 who's going to tell them... I could you know, I  
5 passed a bill about local food [INAUDIBLE 00:20:32]  
6 not giving us where they are employing and utilizing  
7 and buying local food -- just as an example -- for  
8 their agencies -- that is one example. They are  
9 doing two out of 35 mandated criteria. That is just,  
10 you know, one example. So, uhm, I am just trying to  
11 think of who... So, it's Marjorie that is going to  
12 tell me that she's going to tell the agencies what to  
13 do? I am trying to figure out how this silo stuff  
14 works.

15 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Totally. It is a very  
16 legitimate question. I think we are just muddling  
17 the waters in sort of conflating RABRC with The  
18 Office of Operations and our sort of mission in  
19 general. I think Operations is an appropriate place  
20 for you to escalate these types of compliance issues.  
21 And we are very happy to follow up and really take  
22 these issues seriously. So... (CROSS-TALK)

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, so I will give you  
24 my list, and then I would like to try to get... If  
25 they are not going to be complying, I want to know

2 why.... What's going... Is it a staff issue?

3 What... Excreta... what's going on? Because it  
4 makes no sense to have this information and not have  
5 it in the public and be transparent, because that's  
6 why the bill was passed.

7 Are you going to be looking at other waiver  
8 proposals in the future? What is the agenda here?

9 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Yes, the new cycle was just  
10 initiated last week. We had our first, uh, meeting.  
11 We actually conducted a more aggressive outreach to  
12 the agencies this time to make sure that we were not  
13 just circling the same agencies over and over.

14 Melanie La Rocca, who is the Chief Efficiency  
15 Officer, has gotten involved. So Melanie is now, uh,  
16 an advisory board member, uh, board member in an  
17 advisory role, but is very much our partner in this  
18 work. So, we have a robust, uh, lineup of potential  
19 reports for consideration. And the only point...

20 You know, it's an obvious point, but it's very  
21 important not to make assumptions based on the name  
22 or the topic report, you know, that each  
23 determination must be rooted in the formal criteria  
24 involving a redundancy, because there is no way to  
25 debate the merits of these recommendations without



1 digging in to the details. You know, in most cases  
2 the reports have been superseded by other reporting  
3 that is more frequent or more relevant or easier to  
4 digest. And so all of the reports sound very  
5 important, and they may have been very important in  
6 the moment that they were originally required. But  
7 we are just sort of suggesting that everybody dig in  
8 to the weeds with us and really take this  
9 seriously... (CROSS-TALK)

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay. Now, really  
11 [BACKGROUND NOISE] [INAUDIBLE 00:22:59] issue is that  
12 we are going to send... And I understand that it's  
13 to the Open Data platform, who... Is this... This  
14 is... It's not Operations, but who is in charge of  
15 making sure... It's not just do it... Who is in  
16 charge of refreshing, real-timing, double checking  
17 just that people make suggestions to Open Data? I  
18 know just sent the 911 to some convoluted, I don't  
19 know what the hell it was, uh, [INAUDIBLE 00:23:23] I  
20 don't know...

21 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Advent code number, yes...  
22 (CROSS-TALK)

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: But that's hard for people  
24 to know. When they see a report, then they have more  
25

1 understanding of where the data is. So... (CROSS-  
2 TALK)

3  
4 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Absolutely... (CROSS-TALK)

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I want to... Who is in  
6 charge of Open Data, making sure the suggestions that  
7 Noel Hidalgo, or anybody else who is in there, are  
8 responded to?

9 And there is work to be done on Open Data. I am  
10 on it all of the time. So, who is in charge of that?

11 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: That is The Mayor's Office of  
12 Data Analytics led by Martha Norrick. They really  
13 see their offices as, you know, in addition to all of  
14 the technical kind of contributions they make to  
15 Government Operations, they're the ambassadors of the  
16 City's data. You know, they run Open Data week, and  
17 they do conduct a lot of outreach and engagement.  
18 And, I have a feeling Noel has Martha on speed dial.  
19 So... (CROSS-TALK)

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: He does.

21 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Yeah, so, we work very  
22 closely with MODA, they are really our closest  
23 partners. And, uh, but, yeah... (CROSS-TALK)

24

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: So do they get consulted  
3 about, uh, the waiving of certain reports or not?  
4 Are they part of that discussion?

5 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: They are not technically part  
6 of the committee, but I think you're right, that it  
7 makes sense to strengthen their relationship to this  
8 work. And I will take your recommendation... You  
9 haven't made that recommendation, but I think we  
10 should invite the director of MODA to future RABRC  
11 meetings.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: So, I should know this,  
13 but is the, uhm... (CROSS-TALK)

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time is expired.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Review Commission... I'm  
16 sorry, one more question, then I will... I could go  
17 on all day, Chair, as you know... But, this is my  
18 thing. I can go on [BACKGROUND NOISE]... I used to  
19 chair this committee. I know it. But, the first  
20 issue is, who is on this Review Commission. I know I  
21 should know this. Is it all internal or are there  
22 external people, too?

23 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: It... The external... Uh,  
24 no, it's... It's four appointees from The Mayor and,  
25 uh, The Council has, uh... (CROSS-TALK)

1 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Right...

2 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Right. Has... (CROSS-TALK)

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: We have one I think...

4 one person. Right... (CROSS-TALK)

5 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Let's see, [INAUDIBLE

6 00:25:10]

7 ASSISTANT DIRECTOR PEACH: Three from council...

8 (CROSS-TALK)

9 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Three from council.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay.

11 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: So, four... Right... OPS,

12 uh, OTI, OMB, and Law are the four administration

13 ones. That's right.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I think you should... If

15 I may suggest, at least on consultation, work with

16 some others so that you're not so saddled. That

17 would be my other suggestion. Thank you very much.

18 I could go on about the MMR, but I won't... (CROSS-

19 TALK)

20 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: No thank you. And Council

21 Member Brewer, I am a longtime fan, and I want you to

22 know that we have an announcement today. I can't

23 break news, but we are... we feel very good about

24 our work modernizing the MMR... (CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: And you need it...

(CROSS-TALK)

DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Exactly. It's in a sorry state in terms of the interface, uh, and the...

(CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [INAUDIBLE 00:25:44]

DIRECTOR STEINBERG: public's ability to access data, so... (CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you very much. I appreciate it... (CROSS-TALK)

DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Yep. So, stay tuned...

(CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you. Thank you, Madam Chair... (CROSS-TALK)

ASSISTANT DIRECTOR PEACH: I will just add one more point on the makeup of the commission. Those are... We seven voting members. We also have advisory members in DORIS. Pauline Toole sits with us, and we recently had, uh, Melanie La Rocca, Chief Efficiency Officer join us, so it would make sense to have other advisory members in the form of [INAUDIBLE 00:26:11]... (CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Maybe MODA [INAUDIBLE 00:26:12]... (CROSS-TALK)

2 ASSISTANT DIRECTOR PEACH: [INAUDIBLE 00:26:12]  
3 for MODA. Yep. [INAUDIBLE 00:26:14]... (CROSS-  
4 TALK)

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [INAUDIBLE 00:26:15]...  
6 (CROSS-TALK)

7 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: And one last point, the  
8 meeting was open to the public, and... (CROSS-TALK)

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: But nobody shows up  
10 [INAUDIBLE 00:26:20]... (CROSS-TALK)

11 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Well, a reporter showed up,  
12 which was good... (CROSS-TALK)

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Oh, good!

14 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Yeah... (CROSS-TALK)

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: And I bet I can say  
16 exactly who it was without even knowing.

17 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: I think you're right about  
18 that. And, but we welcome that. And, this really  
19 deserves kind of scrutiny. So... (CROSS-TALK)

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, thank you...  
21 (CROSS-TALK)

22 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Yep.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you.

24 DIRECTOR SILVESTRE: Sure.

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, I don't believe, uh,  
3 any other council members have their hands raised.  
4 And no members of the public have signed up to  
5 testify at today's virtual hearing. So, I will turn  
6 it back to you to close us out.

7 CHAIRPERSON UNG: Thank you. I also want to  
8 recognize we are joined by my colleague Council  
9 Member Hanif.

10 Again, thank you all for your testimony today.  
11 And, I guess... Oh, my gavel, sorry.

12 [GAVELING OUT] [GAVEL SOUND]

13 DIRECTOR STEINBERG: Thank you so much.

14 ASSISTANT DIRECTOR PEACH: Thank you, everyone.

15 CHAIRPERSON UNG: Thank you.  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date May 12, 2022