

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

----- X

DECEMBER 8, 2021
Start: 1:20 P.M.
Recess: 1:37 P.M.

HELD AT: REMOTE HEARING (VIRTUAL ROOM 1)

B E F O R E: YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON

COUNCIL MEMBERS: SELVENA N. BROOKS-POWERS
FERNANDO CABRERA
RUBEN DIAZ, SR.
ROBERT F. HOLDEN
PETER A. KOO
STEPHEN T. LEVIN
MARK LEVINE
CARLOS MENCHACA
I. DANEEK MILLER
ANTONIO REYNOSO
DEBORAH L. ROSE

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

2 JOHANNA M. CASTRO: We're live.

3 SGT. SADOWSKY: Thank you and good
4 afternoon everybody. Sergeants will you please state
5 your recordings.

6 SGT. BRADLEY: PC is up.

7 SGT. SADOWSKY: Thank you.

8 SGT. POLITE: Recording to the cloud all
9 set.

10 SGT. SADOWSKY: Thank you and Sgt. Polite
11 with your opening statement.

12 SGT. POLITE: Thank you. Good morning
13 and welcome to the remote hearing on transportation.
14 Will Council Members and staff please turn on your
15 video at this time? Thank you. To minimize
16 disruptions, please place all cellphones and
17 electronics to vibrate. Chair Rodriguez, we are
18 ready to begin.

19 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you
20 Sergeants and again thank you to all of you and
21 everyone behind the computers, the tech team and all
22 for being able to connect all on the Council and all
23 New Yorkers on this public hearing. Good morning and
24 welcome to today's hearing of the Council
25 Transportation Committee. I am Ydanis Rodriguez, the

2 Chair of the Committee. Today we will be voting on
3 several pieces of Legislation including proposed
4 Intro 9-A as sponsored by Council Member Inez Barron
5 in relation to requiring that traffic control devices
6 be installed at intersections adjacent to a school.
7 Proposed Intro 1724-A is sponsored by Council Member
8 Ben Kallos in relation to a school bus stop camera
9 program. Proposed Intro number 2201-A is sponsored
10 by Council Member Carlina Rivera in relation to
11 allowing motorcyclists to challenge parking
12 violations electronically with photographic evidence
13 and proposed Intro 2417-A is sponsored by Council
14 Member Robert Holden in relation to prohibiting the
15 sale or distribution of materials that obscure or
16 distort the image of license plates. These bills
17 will help make New York City one of the safest cities
18 in the nation for pedestrians, cyclists and
19 motorists. The first two bills will help protect one
20 of our most vulnerable populations, our children.
21 Intro 9-A will require that a traffic control device
22 such as a traffic light or all way stop sign is
23 installed at all intersections adjacent to a school.
24 And Intro 1724-A will allow the city to install
25 cameras on a school bus stop arms to better enforce

2 traffic laws designed to protect children exiting a
3 school bus. Intro 2417-A seeks to address the
4 growing use of devices that obscure license plates on
5 motor vehicles by prohibiting the sale or
6 distribution of any materials of substance use for
7 the purpose of concealing or obscuring the numbers on
8 a license plate or distorting a recorded or
9 photographic image of a license plate device that
10 undermines our ability to enforce the rules of the
11 road. The bill would also involve penalties to
12 violators of at least \$300 for the first violation
13 and at least \$500 for all subsequent violations. The
14 final bill on today's agenda proposing Intro 2201-A
15 would ensure that motorcycle drivers are able to
16 challenge a parking violation even if they no longer
17 have a physical copy of the parking meter voucher.
18 This bill would create common sense law that make our
19 streets safer for all road users. I will now ask the
20 bill sponsors to speak briefly about their bill if
21 they would like to take their turn?

22 INEZ BARRON: Thank you Chair Rodriguez,
23 may I speak?

24 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Yes,
25 Council Member Barron.

2 INEZ BARRON: Thank you. I first want to
3 apologize for the background noise but I am out in
4 the Community. I am at a Community Center and we are
5 celebrating the 108th Birthday of one of our
6 constituents living here at the Carterwoods and
7 Senior Houses so that background noise you may be
8 hearing is a celebration on her behalf.

9 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: I'd
10 (inaudible).

11 INEZ BARRON: Yes. I do want, oh, hold
12 on one second please. They are accommodating me in
13 the office where I am. Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you
15 Si.

16 INEZ BARRON: Thank you. I appreciate
17 it. So, I do want to speak briefly about Intro 9,
18 this bill would require that by September 30th, 2022
19 the Department of Transportation identified each
20 intersection immediately adjacent to a school that
21 does not have a traffic control device such as a stop
22 sign or traffic control signal and that no later than
23 September 30th, 2024, the Department of
24 Transportation would have to install a traffic
25 control device at each such intersection. The type

2 of traffic control device installed would be in
3 accordance with the Federal Manual on Uniform Traffic
4 Control Devices and based upon DOTs Engineering
5 Expertise and Judgment. This bill was originally
6 introduced as a resolution and then after research it
7 was found that we could introduce it as a local law
8 so I'm very pleased to be able to introduce this
9 bill. As many of you know, I was a teacher with the
10 Department of Education for more than 36 years and
11 did retire as a principal and for me our children's
12 safety is at the top of the list of what it is that
13 we need to do make sure that all of the conditions in
14 our City are great and help protect the well-being of
15 all of our constituents. So, with that, I would like
16 to thank Speaker Corey Johnson, Jason Goldman, Chief
17 of Staff, yourself, Committee Chair Ydanis Rodriguez,
18 Jeff Baker, Directors, Tierra Zinac (SP?) Deputy
19 Director, Bradley the Assistant Deputy Direct, Elliot
20 Lin, Senior Counsel, Jessica Albin, Legislative
21 Counsel, Rick Alberto, Senior Policy Analyst, Kevin
22 Koslowitz, Policy Analyst and my staff, my Chief of
23 Staff Komawali (SP?) Clay, and Indigo Washington my
24 Legislative Director and CUNY Liaison. Thank you
25 very much Mr. Chair. I think you're on mute.

2 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Can you
3 hear me now? Thank you Council Member Barron. Now,
4 Council Member Holden.

5 ROBERT HOLDEN: Thank you to Chair
6 Rodriquez and Intro 9 by Council Member Barron,
7 better late than never, congratulations at least you
8 hung in there. It's a terrific bill and long, long,
9 long overdue. But talk about my Intro 2417 obscuring
10 license plates, prohibiting the sale in New York City
11 of apparatus or gadgets that obscure license plates.

12 INEZ BARRON: Thank you so much. I
13 appreciate it. Okay.

14 ROBERT HOLDEN: All right and this, this
15 is a big problem with me because, you know, as I
16 started to look around my neighborhood I saw a lot of
17 devices, in fact, I was right behind a vehicle that
18 had one of those James Bond kind of devices that
19 would come down over the license plate believe it or
20 not and they were riding on the wrong side of the
21 road, you know, going through (inaudible) and so
22 forth and so on, so, that's when I started to notice
23 it. I noticed these were on Amazon. I called Amazon
24 they are working on prohibiting the sale of these
25 before the law went into effect which I appreciate

2 but there are many other instances and obviously
3 these are used by people with bad intentions. They
4 want a license plate. They want to, they are
5 committing crimes many times thus evading the police.
6 So, this bill is a lot of sort and I just urge my
7 Council, my fellow colleagues to vote yes. Thank you
8 so much Chair.

9 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.
10 Council Member Kallos.

11 BEN KALLOS: I want to start with a huge
12 thank you to my friend, colleague and Chair of the
13 Transportation Committee, Ydanis Rodriguez. Thank
14 you for 12 years of service and I know you're not
15 done yet.

16 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

17 BEN KALLOS: I also want to thank you for
18 being a co-prime sponsor of Introduction 1724. We
19 wouldn't be here without you. I am Council Member
20 Ben Kallos and today we have an opportunity to make
21 the largest school district in the nation a lot safer
22 by requiring stop arm cameras, uh, to be installed on
23 school busses to better catch motorists who would
24 endanger students by illegally passing school busses
25 during drop off and pick up. Introduction 1724 was

2 introduced on the heels of a series of high profiled
3 instances of driver's around the city caught on video
4 going around stopped school busses. Sometimes
5 driving up in a way that actually left kids on the
6 hoods of these vehicles. The law will mandate
7 cameras on all the city's nearly 10,000 school busses
8 and enforce fines for first time offenders ranging
9 from \$250 to \$300 for second and third offenses.

10 According to the New York State Association of School
11 People, transportation, a study site about the
12 Governor's Traffic Safety Committee as part of
13 Operation Safe Stop, last year and estimated 50,000
14 throughout New York State illegally passed a stopped
15 school bus every day. A study by the National Safety
16 Council showed that 70 percent of deaths related to
17 school busses occur outside of the bus and it's been
18 found that more school aged pedestrians have been
19 killed during the hour before and after school than
20 any other time of day. During a one month, 26 school
21 day pilot by East Middle School District in Nassau
22 County conducted by Bus Control and the Logan Bus
23 Company, 10 school busses captured 615 violations for
24 an average of 2.3 violations per bus per day. 615
25 violations on 10 buses over 26 school days. During

2 that violation, using that violation rate model on
3 the New York City school bus fleet that has roughly
4 10,000 busses we can expect to see an estimated
5 23,000 violations per day and 4.2 million violations
6 per school year in the City. Under Legislation NYPD
7 Parking Violation Bureau would enforce fines for
8 first time offenders. This bill would also require
9 that some of the funds recouped from the fines be
10 given to New York City Department of Education. I
11 want to thank the transportation Chair, Ydanis
12 Rodriguez again from my team, Lofreda Lopez (SP?),
13 Adam Murinez (SP?) and everyone involved in what was
14 a length and long aging process. Thank you and I
15 urge my colleagues to vote no make our children
16 safer.

17 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you
18 Council Member Kallos and the rest of the Chair of
19 the other bill. I will now ask the Committee Clerk
20 to please conduct the roll call vote on the proposed
21 bills and I strongly recommend that my colleagues
22 vote yes on this important piece of Legislation.

23 MATTHEW DISTEFANO, COMMITTEE CLERK: Good
24 afternoon, Matthew Distefano, Committee Clerk,

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION 12

2 Committee on Transportation roll call vote, all items
3 are coupled. Chair Rodriguez?

4 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

5 MATTHEW DISTEFANO, COMMITTEE CLERK:

6 Cabrera?

7 FERNANDO CABRERA: Aye.

8 MATTHEW DISTEFANO, COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo?

9 PETER KOO: Aye.

10 MATTHEW DISTEFANO, COMMITTEE CLERK:

11 Levin?

12 STEPHEN LEVIN: Aye.

13 MATTHEW DISTEFANO, COMMITTEE CLERK:

14 Rose?

15 DEBORAH ROSE: Aye. And I want to
16 commend my colleagues for this very thoughtful
17 Legislation that will ensure and enhance the safety
18 of all of our young people. Thank you.

19 MATTHEW DISTEFANO, COMMITTEE CLERK:

20 Levine?

21 MARK LEVINE: I vote aye.

22 MATTHEW DISTEFANO, COMMITTEE CLERK:

23 Menchaca?

24 CARLOS MENCHACA: I vote aye.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION 13

2 MATTHEW DISTEFANO, COMMITTEE CLERK:

3 Thank you. Miller? Council Member Miller? Okay.

4 Reynoso? Council Member Reynoso? Ruben Diaz Sr.?

5 RUBEN DIAZ SR.: I vote si.

6 MATTHEW DISTEFANO, COMMITTEE CLERK:

7 Holden.

8 ROBERT HOLDEN: I vote aye on all.

9 Congratulations to all the sponsors, well done, well
10 done.

11 MATTHEW DISTEFANO, COMMITTEE CLERK:

12 Brooks-Powers?

13 SELVENA BROOKS-POWERS: Aye on all.

14 MATTHEW DISTEFANO, COMMITTEE CLERK: Okay

15 at this point I will call out Council Member Miller

16 again, Council Member Miller?

17 ANTONIO REYNOSO: I vote aye on all.

18 This is Council Member Reynoso and I vote aye on all.

19 MATTHEW DISTEFANO, COMMITTEE CLERK: All

20 right, Council Member Reynoso. Thank you for the

21 aye. Council Member Miller? Okay, by a vote of 11

22 in the affirmative, zero in the negative and no

23 abstentions the items have been adopted.

24 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

25 I'd like to say thank you to everyone and also I want

2 to take the opportunity to say thank you to Council
3 Member Cabrera who also chaired the previous hearing
4 and he is Chairman of the Governmental Operation
5 Committee and everyone in that committee also who
6 voted in the vast majority supporting also the
7 municipal voting rights as we are getting ready to
8 make easier tomorrow voting, voting on that Bill.
9 With that, this hearing is adjourned.

10 MATTHEW DISTEFANO, COMMITTEE CLERK:

11 Council Member, I'm sorry we're going to hold it open
12 for Council Member Miller.

13 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Okay.

14 MATTHEW DISTEFANO, COMMITTEE CLERK:

15 Thank you.

16 I. DANEEK MILLER: Okay. Council Member
17 here.

18 MATTHEW DISTEFANO, COMMITTEE CLERK:

19 Council Member Miller.

20 I. DANEEK MILLER: Yes.

21 MATTHEW DISTEFANO, COMMITTEE CLERK: This
22 is transportation roll call vote.

23 I. DANEEK MILLER: Yep, yep, yep. I'm
24 going to vote, I don't. I was trying to pull up the

2 number because I'm, I'm mobile now. Um, the number
3 of the School Bus camera is what?

4 MATTHEW DISTEFANO, COMMITTEE CLERK: The
5 demonstration program for the school bus camera?

6 I. DANEEK MILLER: Correct.

7 MATTHEW DISTEFANO, COMMITTEE CLERK:
8 Council Member Kallos' bill?

9 I. DANEEK MILLER: Correct.

10 MATTHEW DISTEFANO, COMMITTEE CLERK:
11 1724-A.

12 I. DANEEK MILLER: Okay. So, I'm going
13 to vote. I'm going to vote aye on all with the
14 exception of 1724-A of which I will be abstaining,
15 need to know a little more about the program.

16 MATTHEW DISTEFANO, COMMITTEE CLERK: Okay
17 thank you. Revised vote, 12 in the affirmative, zero
18 in the negative, no abstentions with the exception of
19 proposed intro 1724-A which passed by a vote of 11 in
20 the affirmative, zero negative, one abstention.
21 Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Now, we're
23 ready to adjourn?

24 MATTHEW DISTEFANO, COMMITTEE CLERK: I
25 see someone's hand is raised. Nevermind. Okay.

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

16

2 CHAIRPERSON YDANIS RODRIGUEZ: Okay.

3 With that this hearing is adjourned. Thank you.

4 This meeting is adjourned.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date FEBRUARY 2, 2022