

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS

----- X

December 14, 2021
Start: 4:40 p.m.
Recess: 4:54 p.m.

HELD AT: REMOTE HEARING (VIRTUAL ROOM 2)

B E F O R E: Mathieu Eugene
CHAIRPERSON

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Inez Barron
Daniel Dromm
Brad Lander
Bill Perkins
Helen Rosenthal

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS 3

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Recordings?

3 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: PC recording is up.

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Thank you. Cloud is
5 done. Good afternoon, everyone. Welcome to today's
6 remote New York City Council vote of the Committee on
7 Civil and Human Rights. At this time, would all
8 panelists please turn on your video? To minimize
9 disruption, please place all electronic devices to
10 vibrate or silent. Thank you for your cooperation.
11 Chair, we are ready to begin.

12 CHAIRPERSON EUGENE: Thank you so very
13 much.

14 [gavel]

15 CHAIRPERSON EUGENE: Good afternoon. My
16 name is Mathieu Eugene and I am the Chair of the
17 Civil and Human Rights Committee. Thank you for
18 joining our vote on Intro 1208-B and Resolution 8374.
19 Today, the committee will be voting on Intro 1208-B,
20 sponsored by Council member Rosenthal in relation to
21 [inaudible 00:01:10] employers from posting job
22 listings job minimum and maximum salary information.
23 Pay disparity based on race and gender is something
24 we, as a society, have been working to address for
25 generations. Despite many efforts made to end the

1 wage gap and achieve pay equity, this gap still
2 exists. In fact, research shows very little change
3 over the years and, as of 2020, women still earn 84
4 percent of what men earned. The movement to increase
5 pay transparency seeks to increase fairness for job
6 applicants while otherwise [inaudible 00:02:11] their
7 salary expectations in a vacuum. Intro 1208 would
8 have an increase in pay transparency by disclosing
9 salary ranges for advertised positions. On December
10 2nd, 2021, the committee held a hearing on Intro 1208
11 and heard the testimony from representatives from the
12 New York City Commission on Human Rights, advocacy
13 and community organizations, and members of the
14 public. This testimony was used to advise amendments
15 to the bill. Additionally, the committee will hear
16 Resolution [inaudible 00:03:03] vote on Resolution
17 8734, sponsored by Council member Paul Vallone by
18 request of the Mayor, declaring December 8th Sri Guru
19 Tegh Bahadur Jee Day-- I'm sorry for the
20 pronunciation if I didn't do it right-- in the city
21 of New York. Sri Guru Tegh Bahadur Jee was the ninth
22 guru of the Sikh religion. During his time as a
23 guru, he worked an extensive [inaudible 00:03:40] of
24 India to not only teach [inaudible 00:03:48] but to
25

2 create awareness of human rights, social justice,
3 secularism, and national unity. I'd like to thank
4 committee staff Jayasri Ganapathy committee counsel,
5 [inaudible 00:04:10] policy analyst, and Jack Cann
6 [sp?] finance analyst. And I would like to thank all
7 the staff from the City Council and all of the
8 wonderful people who have worked on those
9 legislation. And I want to also thank my staff
10 [inaudible 00:04:30] and I want to extend my
11 congratulations also to Council member Rosenthal and
12 Paul Vallone. Now, I will turn it over to my
13 colleague, Council member Rosenthal, to give her
14 opening remarks.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you so
16 much, Chair Eugene. Good afternoon. I'm Council
17 member Helen Rosenthal and my pronouns are she and
18 her. Thank you, Chair Eugene, for including my
19 bills, Intro 1208 now B, for pay range transparency
20 and Intro 2020-A for open captions in movie theaters.
21 Both bills are groundbreaking. On average, women
22 make roughly 85 cents for every dollar white men
23 make. Black and brown women make roughly 50 to 65
24 percent of what white men are paid. This bill
25 requires that all job postings and promotions include

2 the minimum and maximum salary offered. Pay
3 transparency brings us one step closer to pay equity.
4 In particular, this bill requires that advertisements
5 for private or public sector jobs, promotions, or
6 transfer opportunities in New York City include a
7 minimum and maximum salary. Employers who do not
8 disclose a salary range for open positions will be
9 engaging in unlawful discriminatory practices.

10 Salary transparency is an actionable way to create a
11 more equitable workplace, both leveling the playing
12 field for job applicants and helping to identify
13 systemic pay inequities. Lack of upfront pay range
14 disclosure necessitates a salary negotiations in
15 which the employer always has the upper hand. This
16 often results in lower wages for women, people who
17 are black and brown, and those with disabilities--
18 upholding decades of systemic inequities and bias in
19 hiring. Studies show that women net seven to 25
20 percent lower pay rates than men when the rate is
21 arrived by negotiation. Lack of upfront pay
22 disclosure can also be especially harmful in the case
23 of low wage jobs. New Yorkers desperately seeking
24 employment learn only at the end of a lock process of
25 applications and interviews their salary and, at that

2 juncture, are more likely to accept poor terms than
3 had they known the terms in advance. Let's face it.
4 Lack of salary transparency is both discriminatory
5 and anti-worker. Every New Yorker should have the
6 right to determine whether they will be able to
7 support themselves and their families when they apply
8 for a job. It is time to level the playing field and
9 restore some dignity to New Yorkers seeking
10 employment.

11 Intro 2020-A requires New York City movie
12 theaters offer open captioning on screen captions for
13 25 percent of showings of each film up to four
14 showings per week. Half of those showings must be
15 during peak times-- on weekends and in the evenings.
16 Roughly one in five New Yorkers suffers from
17 deafness, ranging from moderate to total. Such a
18 significant segment of the population deserves to
19 fully enjoy movies with ease. While the Americans
20 with Disabilities Act currently requires closed
21 captions systems in movie theaters, long term
22 experience has shown that the equipment needed fails
23 far too often and, even if they do work, using these
24 devices take away from the enjoyment of the movie.
25 This unfairly burdens users of viewing devices.

2 Provided open captioning is an easy alternative for
3 cinema operators and does not diminish overall movie
4 attendance when scheduled along with uncaptioned
5 screenings which, of course, the movie theaters can
6 do. Open captioning in movie theaters also greatly
7 benefit the many New Yorkers who have limited English
8 language proficiency. Thank you and I'll pass it
9 back to Chair Eugene.

10 CHAIRPERSON EUGENE: Thank you so much,
11 Council member Rosenthal. And, again,
12 congratulations and thank you for your advocacy. And
13 I just want, before I turn it back to the counsel, I
14 want to acknowledge Council member Barron, Council
15 member Lander, and Council member Dromm. I don't
16 know if there are other Council members attending?
17 If not, with this, I turn it back over to the counsel
18 of the committee.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Good afternoon. This is
20 the Committee on Civil and Human Rights roll call
21 vote on proposes Introductions 1208-B, 2020-A, and
22 one preconsidered Resolution. Chair Eugene?

23 CHAIRPERSON EUGENE: I vote aye.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you. Council
25 member Barron?

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS 9

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. I vote
3 aye.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council member Dromm?

5 UNIDENTIFIED: Oh. Can we hold for a
6 moment?

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Certainly.

8 UNIDENTIFIED: Okay. You can go ahead.
9 Thank you.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Can I vote aye with
11 the exception of the one on the movies where I
12 abstain.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you. Council
14 member Lander?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I vote aye.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Committee counsel. The
17 one-- That is 2020-A?

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes. 2020-A is the
19 movies.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I believe so.
21 Thank you.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you, kindly.
23 Thank you very much. Chair Eugene, proposed--

24 CHAIRPERSON EUGENE: I vote aye.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you, sir.

2 CHAIRPERSON EUGENE: I'm sorry.

3 COMMITTEE CLERK: That's okay. Proposed
4 Intro 1208-B and the preconsidered Resolution were
5 adopted by a vote of four in the affirmative, zero in
6 the negative, and zero abstentions where Intro 2020-A
7 was adopted by a vote of three in the affirmative,
8 zero in the negative, and one abstention. Thank you.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: I believe we have
10 Council member Rosenthal with her hand raised.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you very
12 much. I just want to mention for the record that
13 there is misinformation that is going around about
14 the cost to movie theaters and it's unfortunate that
15 that is happening, but I have worked very closely
16 with all of the stakeholders-- I should say we have
17 worked closely. I really appreciate all the support
18 of the committee counsel and central staff on this,
19 but, you know, I am assured that-- I feel assured
20 that this is not causing undue burden on the movie
21 industry. Important to remember that the number of
22 open caption shows will be capped at four per week--
23 two of which would be during peek times and two
24 during non-peek times. There is a very complicated
25 algorithm that is used in this bill and so it could

2 be easy for one to say the language is just so
3 complicated that I'm voting no or I'm abstaining and,
4 just to be clear, that complicated algorithm is there
5 to make sure that smaller movie theaters are not
6 overburdened by this new law. And, again, for the
7 larger movie theaters, the maximum number of open
8 caption showings will be four. Thank you so much for
9 giving me that extra minute. I appreciate it.

10 CHAIRPERSON EUGENE: Thank you very
11 much. I think this is the last interventional
12 statement about these legislations. With that, the
13 meeting is adjourned. Thank you.

14 [gavel]

15 UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you,
17 everyone.

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date January 28, 2022