

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON RULES, PRIVILEGES, AND  
ELECTIONS

----- X

December 9, 2021  
Start: 11:11 a.m.  
Recess: 11:42 a.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Karen Koslowitz  
CHAIRPERSON

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Adrienne Adams  
Margaret Chin  
Corey Johnson  
Steve Matteo  
Keith Powers  
Deborah Rose  
Mark Treyger  
Paul Vallone

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Leah Goodridge, Nominee for  
City Planning Commission

Joseph Douek, Nominee for  
City Planning Commission

1 COMMITTEE ON RULES, PRIVILEGES, AND ELECTIONS 3

2 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Rules, Privileges,  
3 and Elections called to order. Good morning and  
4 welcome to the Commit-- I don't have my glasses.  
5 Committee on Rules, Privileges, and Elections. My  
6 name is Karen Koslowitz and I am Chair of this  
7 Committee. Before we begin, I would like to  
8 introduce the members of the Roles Committee who have  
9 joined us today. Council member-- Is Adrienne here?  
10 Not in the room, though?

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Not in the room.

12 No.

13 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: All right. She is  
14 next door. Council member Margaret Chin, Council  
15 member Keith Powers. Is Keith here? Okay. And  
16 Council member Deborah Rose. I don't see Mark  
17 Treyger. And Council member Paul Vallone. I would  
18 also like to acknowledge Rule Committee counsel,  
19 Lance Polizzi-- Did I do it good?

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: You did great.

21 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Okay. And the  
22 staff members of the Council's investigative unit:  
23 Chuck Davis, chief compliance officer, and  
24 investigators Alicia Versel, Desiree Robinson, and  
25 Ramses Booten. We will consider the nomination of

2 Leah Goodridge and Joseph Douek for the City Planning  
3 Commission. Should Ms. Goodridge be appointed by the  
4 Council, she will be eligible to serve the remainder  
5 of a five-year term that expires on June 30, 2025.

6 Ms. Goodridge has been nominated by the Public  
7 Advocate. Should Mr. Douek be appointed by the  
8 Council, he would be appointed to a five year term  
9 that expires on June 30, 2023. Mr. Douek currently  
10 serves on the CPC by appointment of the borough  
11 president of Brooklyn. Today, we are considering his  
12 nomination for appointment by the Mayor. Chuck  
13 Davis, our chief compliance officer, has briefed all  
14 members of the committee regarding the contents of  
15 each candidate background and investigation.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Do you want me to  
17 read the boiler plate?

18 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Yeah. You want to?

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Pursuant to the New  
20 York City Charter, the City Planning Commission must  
21 consist of 13 members with seven appointments which  
22 includes the appointment of the Chair by the Mayor,  
23 one appointment each made by the Public Advocate and  
24 each borough president. All members except the Chair  
25 are subject to the advice and consent of the Council.

2 According to the Charter, the members should be  
3 chosen for their independence, integrity, and civic  
4 commitment. City Planning Commission members other  
5 than the Chair are not considered regular city  
6 employees and there is no limitation on the number of  
7 terms a CPC member may serve. However, CPC members  
8 are prohibited from holding any other city office  
9 while serving on the CPC. CPC has several  
10 responsibilities. Some of these include engaging  
11 in planning focused on the city's orderly growth,  
12 improvement in future development which should  
13 involve considerations concerning appropriate  
14 resources for housing, business, industry,  
15 recreation, and culture. Overseeing and coordinating  
16 environmental review mandated by the state's  
17 environmental conservation law in preparing required  
18 reports. The CPC also establishes various rules.  
19 Some of these rules consist of establishing minimum  
20 standards for certifying ULURP applications,  
21 establishing criteria associated with the selection  
22 of sites for capital projects. The member of the CPC  
23 who is designated as the vice chair receives an  
24 annual salary of 73,855. The other members receive  
25 an annual salary of \$64,224. We would like to

2 welcome Ms. Goodridge and Mr. Douek. Would you both  
3 please raise your right hands to be sworn in? Do you  
4 swear to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing  
5 but the truth?

6 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: All right.

7 [background comments]

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yeah. Yeah. Do  
9 you wish to make an opening statement?

10 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Ms. Goodridge, do  
11 you wish to make an opening statement?

12 LEAH GOODRIDGE: Yes, please. Good  
13 morning. I monitored to be here and to be the  
14 nominee of Public Advocate Jumaane Williams to join  
15 the City Planning Commission. If my nomination is  
16 confirmed, I would be an excellent addition to the  
17 CPC. First, I have dedicated my career to fighting  
18 for housing rights, racial justice, and community  
19 empowerment. I am currently the managing attorney  
20 for Housing Policy at Mobilization for Justice, one  
21 of New York's largest and oldest civil legal service  
22 organizations. This January will mark-- January--  
23 sorry-- marks six years at MFJ, but I have a decade  
24 of experience in this field. Through the Right to  
25 Counsel Law, many tenants come to my office seeking

2 help in fighting an eviction case. Over the years, I  
3 have argued at the New York State Court of Appeals on  
4 behalf of a NYCHA resident seeking to become  
5 remaining family member, launched a housing rights  
6 clinic at Brooklyn Law School, and led presentations  
7 at universities in the U.S. and abroad on housing  
8 rights and gentrification. For my work, I've been  
9 awarded the 2019 Public Service Award by the New York  
10 County Lawyers Association and the 2018 Rising Star  
11 award by New York nonprofit medium. As a housing  
12 rights attorney, I have developed an expertise in a  
13 key angle of the urban planning story which would  
14 greatly contribute to the work of the Commission.  
15 Second, I have experience serving on boards and have  
16 gained skills that will be transferable to the CPC.  
17 In 2018, Mayor Bill de Blasio appointed me as a  
18 tenant member on the Rent Guidelines Board. Similar  
19 to the CPC, there are meetings which last hours, link  
20 the reports, housing activists and property owners  
21 chanting outside and inside of the meetings, and  
22 fellow board members with various perspectives and  
23 personalities. While navigating the RGB, I have  
24 learned to conduct my own research, get my point  
25 across effectively, and ask pertinent questions. I

2 believe that the CPC is a much more intense  
3 environment than the RGB, but my background will  
4 guide me to be an effective Commissioner. Third, I  
5 am deeply passionate about New York City. I was born  
6 in Flatbush and raised in a Mitchell Lama housing in  
7 Brownsville, Brooklyn by my mother who emigrated here  
8 from Barbados. I was threatened with not getting  
9 oxtails for Christmas if I didn't say that last  
10 sentence. So I attended public schools. I've lived  
11 in three of the five boroughs, and I am an avid  
12 researcher up New York history. It would be an honor  
13 to be part of conversations and decisions on  
14 bettering New York City. I welcome any questions you  
15 may have.

16 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Thank you. Mr.  
17 Douek?

18 JOSEPH DOUEK: Thank you, Chair  
19 Koslowitz and honorable Council and committee  
20 members. For context and background, I am a born and  
21 raised Brooklyn I and has for over 20 years in New  
22 York City government. From 2001 to 2012, by the  
23 appointment of then city Council speaker, the  
24 Honorable Peter Vallone, Sr., I represented the  
25 Council on the Board of Directors of the New York



2 City Economic Development Corporation, EDC, for  
3 several terms. Having been continuously reappointed  
4 by successful councils and speaker. Concurrent with  
5 my service under EDC Board of Directors and its  
6 Executive Committee, from 2002 through 2012, I also  
7 had the privilege of representing the Brooklyn  
8 Borough President on the Board of Directors of the  
9 New York City Industrial Development Agency, IDA. I  
10 served on both the board and its Audit Committee. In  
11 2012, I was appointed by the Brooklyn Borough  
12 President to serve as a member of the City Planning  
13 Commission and, in 2017, I was reappointed by current  
14 Brooklyn Borough President and Mayor-elect, the  
15 Honorable Eric Adams. The tenure seen a change in  
16 administrations from Mayor Bloomberg to Mayor de  
17 Blasio and leadership change as at the Department of  
18 City Planning from Amanda Burden, Carl Weisbord, to  
19 Marisa Lago, and now Chair Anita Laremont. Mayor de  
20 Blasio, working in tandem with the City Council, has  
21 made affordable housing a linchpin and priority of  
22 his administration. Our city's pro-growth policies  
23 based on the reality of an increasing population, as  
24 well as a successful economy. However, the growth is  
25 also contributed to exacerbated housing affordability

2 challenges and highlighted capacity limitations on  
3 our infrastructure. To that end, and to ensure more  
4 economic diversity in our city as it grows and  
5 becomes denser, the Department of City Planning  
6 introduced mandatory inclusionary housing, MIH and  
7 the City Planning Commission has subsequently  
8 [inaudible 00:10:54] the New York City Council passed  
9 MIH. The first mandatory program of its kind in this  
10 country. To quote then Deputy Mayor Alicia Glenn  
11 referring to MIH, those were foundational policies to  
12 help us confront the biggest crisis facing New  
13 Yorkers—the cost of housing. With MIH firmly in  
14 place, the city has a platform from which to launch  
15 its goal of attaining and retaining affordable units  
16 by leveraging private development that benefits all.  
17 As MIH is dependent on my uniform land use and review  
18 process, otherwise known as ULURP, which is a multi  
19 year process, we can only expect that, as more of  
20 rezonings take effect, MIH will be another strong  
21 tool in the toolbox to create affordable housing  
22 needed to maintain the diversity devoid of any  
23 pockets of poverty. There is no doubt that the  
24 pandemic has impeded the continuing rollout of MIH,  
25 as the administration and its agencies were put into

2 crisis mode dealing with this emergency. For a time,  
3 all ULURP actions came to a halt. While I wouldn't  
4 say that the pandemic is behind us and you can see me  
5 struggling with my map, I do believe that, change in  
6 policies and protocols, we are learning to cope with  
7 it and resuming a normal pace of land use actions.

8 Additionally, the many lessons we learn throughout  
9 this global health crisis need to be internalized as  
10 we plan the future of this great city. Building  
11 Mayor were covering for all of us, as Mayor de Blasio  
12 has said, means cutting red tape in supporting the  
13 efforts to make our communities healthier and more  
14 accessible. One example of a recovery oriented  
15 policy change is the newly adopted Elevate Transit.

16 Zoning for accessibility or CFA. Through CFA,  
17 developers work with the MTA to set aside space where  
18 needed for station elevators, it expands the sentence  
19 for developers to build elevators and related station  
20 upgrades and new high density buildings. CFA is a  
21 collaboration between the Department of City  
22 Planning, Metropolitan transit Authority, MTA, Mayors  
23 Office for People with Disabilities, and the City  
24 Council. Building on recommendations from the 2019  
25 city Council [inaudible 00:12:45]. In general, the

2 land use and review process provides for robust  
3 public input from all stakeholders, including local  
4 residents, community board members, Borough  
5 Presidents, and, finally, the City Council would  
6 serve as the check and balance. The public has  
7 multiple opportunities throughout the process to come  
8 and help shape the final product. I can definitely  
9 say that the past three years have seen a more  
10 collaborative approach by the agency whether it be  
11 interagency or with the Council. Ultimately, on one  
12 level or another, old policymakers are accountable to  
13 the true stakeholders which are the residents of this  
14 great city. They should know that, while we are  
15 doing, we can do more and will do more and I look  
16 forward to continue to serve and being part of the  
17 process. Thank you. And I am now available to  
18 answer any questions.

19 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: I have a question  
20 for Ms. Goodridge. Can you please confirm on the  
21 record that you will comply with the guidance you  
22 have received from the New York City Conflicts of  
23 Interest Board?

2 LEAH GOODRIDGE: Yes. I confirm that I  
3 will comply with all guidelines by the COI and all  
4 guidelines in general.

5 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: And this is for  
6 both candidates. Can you please describe how you  
7 would balance the critical need for more affordable  
8 housing in New York City with community concerns?

9 JOSEPH DOUEK: I'll begin the answer.  
10 So, I think that, you know, as the city grows  
11 denser-- if you look at the population, we're  
12 growing-- we're going to need to create more housing  
13 and more affordable housing and, basically, the ULURP  
14 process, like I said earlier, provides a robust  
15 public input from community members and stakeholders.  
16 And the original application, as you know, don't come  
17 out at the way they were originally presented to us  
18 and that is through the input that we get from the  
19 community members, the Borough Presidents, and the  
20 community boards. And, finally, at the end of the  
21 day, the City Council has the ability to modify any  
22 application as they see fit and within scope.

23 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Ms. Goodridge?

24 LEAH GOODRIDGE: I am a believe in  
25 community economic development which really puts

2 community centered approach in any urban planning and  
3 development. I'm also a housing rights attorney and  
4 believe that there should be more housing and,  
5 specifically, more affordable housing. I currently  
6 live in Brooklyn and sometimes I look up, you know,  
7 the affordable housing units and I have seen studios  
8 for 2004 in combat is middle or low income. And so,  
9 you know, affordable housing actually needs to be  
10 affordable, as well. So, the answer is, one, to  
11 center the community, as was mentored in the ULURP  
12 process, but also being transparent about what  
13 affordable actually means because it means different  
14 things to different people, apparently.

15 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Okay. Thank you.

16 Do any of my colleagues have any questions?  
17 Margaret?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you. Good  
19 morning. Mr. Douek? Douek? Yes. You are already  
20 on the City Planning and I'm sure you are familiar  
21 with my district.

22 JOSEPH DOUEK: Yes. I am.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: We come before you  
24 quite often. And in your testimony, you focus a lot  
25 on MIH.

2 JOSEPH DOUEK: Correct.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: How do you see  
4 really improving it that we can, you know, get more  
5 percentage of affordable housing? Because right now  
6 it's still very minimal. Like 30%, 20%, 25%. And  
7 that is a significant tool. And that is one  
8 question. And, maybe, also Ms. Goodrich could  
9 address that, too, because we want to utilize every  
10 tool to fight for more affordable housing. In the  
11 other question that I have is that, in the rezoning,  
12 there's always concerned about displacement,  
13 gentrification, right? So, I am just, you know,  
14 grappling with this issue of like how do we prevent  
15 that or how do we strengthen, you know, residents to  
16 make sure that they know how to fight back? And is  
17 there any way in the zoning text that would say  
18 something like, if you have to demolish a building,  
19 let's say, that you have to relocate the tenants and  
20 then have them to have the right to return so that  
21 you are doing MIH or could that be included in MIH  
22 for those units? Like if you have to displace five  
23 tenants, could you include that in MIH, right, so  
24 that we-- sort of like some assurance to, you know,  
25 long-term residents-- and a lot of them are seniors.

2 They are afraid that, oh, with this rezoning, they're  
3 going to tear down my building to build a bigger  
4 building because now they are allowed to. So, how do  
5 we make sure that we could protect especially long-  
6 term, you know, residents? And most of them, you  
7 know, I seniors and is there a way to kind of use the  
8 zoning disorder provide that protection?

9 JOSEPH DOUEK: Would you like me to  
10 start? So, MIH, as you know, is a program that  
11 creates affordable housing without any public  
12 investment. The private sector has to fund these  
13 affordable units for the city of New York. You know,  
14 we implemented it, I think, in 2017. 2016 or 2017  
15 and, obviously, projects need to go through a longer  
16 rezoning process and it takes time to actually bear  
17 fruit from the tree that was planted. So, I think,  
18 over time, you are going to see a lot more affordable  
19 units coming through MIH. But to get deeper and more  
20 affordability the city through HPD is going to have  
21 to step in and provide subsidies to complement the  
22 private-- to leverage more of the private investment  
23 that is being done. And the same thing with  
24 displacement. I think that the best way to combat  
25 displacement is through homeownership. You can't



2 throw you out of a home that you own or making it  
3 more affordable. And I think that, with HPD as the  
4 lead-- because that is what they would do, City  
5 Planning can begin effective role in helping shape  
6 policy that would in send more homeownership, which  
7 would be beneficial for all the residents, especially  
8 the seniors. So, that is my answer to that question.  
9 I will let nominee Goodrich pick up the rest.

10 LEAH GOODRIDGE: One point that was  
11 raised was how to help residents fight back against  
12 gentrification and displacement. And from just an  
13 everyday New Yorkers perspective myself, one of the  
14 challenges is that a lot of New Yorkers are not even  
15 aware of any development, redevelopment, or rezoning  
16 until it is a very late stage. And so, I think that  
17 part of helping residents fight back against it is  
18 to-- you know, the accessibility component.  
19 Involving them a lot more and, you know, not just  
20 with the city Council member, but like how do we get  
21 out more information that this is happening? Because  
22 sometimes when the information is out, it's at the  
23 very late stage and then it is a blurb of like you're  
24 going to get kicked out. And that might not be  
25 representative of every single proposal or project.

2 So, that is one aspect. And then I think another  
3 point was raised of how to protect residents that may  
4 be displaced. That is something that I think about  
5 every day as a housing rights attorney. I think each  
6 project that comes through, there would have to be  
7 questions about who exactly would be benefiting from  
8 this project and what-- we would have to weigh the  
9 risks against the benefits. And so, for example, if  
10 the proposal would be 2000 affordable housing units,  
11 but then 5000 people will be displaced, well,  
12 clearly, there is more risk there than benefit. And  
13 then, if those folks are displaced and they are just  
14 displaced without any compensation and without  
15 anywhere else to live, then, clearly, the risks are  
16 more than the benefit. So, I think the developer or  
17 whoever is putting forth the proposal would need to  
18 include and be asked to these questions about what  
19 exactly they would do to increase the benefits for  
20 the community so that they are weighed more than the  
21 risks.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Yeah. I think  
23 right now it is really up to the Council member, you  
24 know, when we negotiate with the administration that  
25 we have to deal with this issue and we have

2 experienced in terms of, you know, giving, you know,  
3 tenants the right to return. I mean, that really  
4 depends on negotiation. But, definitely in terms of  
5 the process to really strengthen, as you say. A lot  
6 of people don't really know what their rights are.  
7 We really need to get the administration to commit to  
8 doing more, you know, education and outreach and  
9 making sure people know what their rights are and  
10 they can organize and fight back. And then, I think,  
11 with Mr. Douek, your suggestion, I mean, we should  
12 look at MIH and see if also it could relate to  
13 affordable homeownership. Because right now you  
14 people building condos, but there is no affordable  
15 homeownership. I mean, we get some rental units are  
16 some ways people will build a full building, build a  
17 full rental and then their building is condo. So,  
18 that is something that maybe in the future MIH will  
19 look at.

20 JOSEPH DOUEK: I would love to see  
21 that.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Yeah. So, the city  
23 planning, that you can--

24 JOSEPH DOUEK: That is something--

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: initiate that and  
3 see how we can help more affordable homeownership.

4 JOSEPH DOUEK: I concur 100%.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you. Thank  
6 you, Chair. Thank you.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you. I  
8 would just like to sort of piggyback on Council  
9 member Chin's remarks. Because we both have very  
10 hard and tough projects to get through and one of the  
11 things that I hear consistently, especially with my  
12 last project, was that people didn't feel like they  
13 had enough notice. They didn't have enough  
14 information that they weren't informed until too late  
15 in the process. Of course, I know that that is not  
16 the case, however, I was wondering if you both could  
17 comment on whether you think the public review  
18 process is significant enough and the notice that,  
19 you know, is given and, if, in fact, we should  
20 increase the number of sort of entry points that the  
21 public has to the process before the final  
22 determination is made?

23 LEAH GOODRIDGE: I think in terms of, you  
24 know, accessibility, one of the main challenges is,  
25 you know, a lot of the notices may be given digitally

2 and, for a lot of seniors, we are seeing right now--  
3 I'm seeing as a housing rights attorney, everything  
4 right now is virtual and a lot of my senior clients  
5 are not really able to access housing court and they  
6 don't have a laptop and they are not aware of how to  
7 use, you know, the device on their phone. And so, it  
8 is exceedingly difficult even if there is notice.  
9 There is a question of how exactly is that notice  
10 being given and is that excluding are shutting out--  
11 not intentionally, but having the impact of not  
12 having as wide ever reaches possible. And,  
13 especially, with the main target audience that is  
14 going to be impacted the most, which are seniors who  
15 have been living most of the time in these projects  
16 in these spaces for 20 or 30 years and then there is  
17 a question of, well, where do we go? We are going to  
18 be displaced. So, I don't have all the answers, but  
19 I know where to start in the starting point would be  
20 looking at the accessibility and how the  
21 communications are put out and who the target  
22 audience is and who it is reaching.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Yeah. No. Did you  
24 have another comment?

2 JOSEPH DOUEK: I think anything that  
3 could be done to provide more notice. But as you  
4 stated earlier, I mean, the community and residents  
5 have multiple opportunities. They can comment  
6 present at the borough board, community Board, City  
7 Planning Commission, City Council-- and even prior.  
8 Many of the agencies do scoping meetings or meetings  
9 within the community on projects. But any  
10 opportunity to get more public input as well, at any  
11 point in the process.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I would like to  
13 really task both of you, if you are confirmed, that  
14 you look at the notification process and that you  
15 look at how to allow the residents to have more  
16 input, you know, at that public stage. At the public  
17 stages. You are absolutely right. There are three  
18 processes, but we continually hear that people who  
19 are directly impacted are finding out and tell the  
20 news media starts screaming like you are going to  
21 have this terrible affordable housing project in your  
22 neighborhood. So, I really would like to see  
23 examine. Because we know that a lot of people in the  
24 communities that are impacted by these projects don't  
25 have access to digital media and are not, you know,

2 technologically savvy. They are not the people who  
3 go to the community board meetings on the regular.  
4 You know, they certainly don't interact with the  
5 borough president's office. So, I just want City  
6 Planning to look at that process of how we notify  
7 people in the review period and access to the  
8 hearings. And that we have taken into consideration  
9 the people who have physical disabilities also.  
10 Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Any public  
12 comments? I don't see anybody. So, with that, I  
13 would like to now call the role.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: William Martin,  
15 committee clerk. Committee on Rules, Privileges, and  
16 Elections. The two M's which are coupled. Chair  
17 Koslowitz?

18 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: I vote aye.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Chin?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I vote aye and  
21 congratulations. Look forward to working with you.  
22 Thank you.

23 JOSEPH DOUEK: Thank you. Thank you.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rose?

1 COMMITTEE ON RULES, PRIVILEGES, AND ELECTIONS 24

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Congratulations. I  
3 vote aye and I don't look forward to working with you  
4 in the future. I'm out.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Vallone?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE:

7 Congratulations to both of you. May you have  
8 blessed and happy new year. And I vote aye on both  
9 of you.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Adams?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: I echo the  
12 congratulations to both of you. Thank you in advance  
13 for your hard work. I vote aye.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you. Powers?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: I do look forward  
16 to working with both of you and you're already on it,  
17 but congratulations and congratulations and good luck  
18 and, of course, we're here to be partners with you,  
19 as well. I vote aye.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: By a vote of six in the  
21 affirmative, zero in the negative, and no  
22 abstentions, both items have been adopted by the  
23 committee.

24 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Thank you very  
25 much. I will not be working with you, but



2 congratulations. I'm sure you're going to do a great  
3 job.

4 JOSEPH DOUEK: Thank you, Chair. Thank  
5 you, Committee member.

6 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Okay. With that,  
7 this meeting is adjourned.

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date January 27, 2022