CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

August 8, 2018 Start: 1:35 p.m. Recess: 4:34 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Corey D. Johnson

Speaker

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Adrienne Adams Diana Ayala Inez Barron Joseph Borelli Fernando Cabrera

Andy Cohen

Costa Constantinides

Robert Cornegy
Chaim Deutsch
Daniel Dromm
Mathieu Eugene
Robert Holden
Ben Kallos
Andy L. King
Peter A. Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Rory I. Lancman
Brad S. Lander
Stephen Levin

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Mark Levine

Francisco Moya
Bill Perkins
Keith Powers
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan Richards
Carlina Rivera
Ydanis Rodriguez

Debbie Rose

Helen K. Rosenthal Rafael Salamanca, Jr. Ritchie Torres

Mark S. Treyger Paul Vallone Kalman Yeger Steven Matteo Laurie A. Cumbo

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Letitia James Public Advocate

William Lohier 2018 Youth Poet Laureate

Rosalind Grush The Tank

Meghan Finn The Tank

Shaun J. Lee Reverend Mount Lebanon Baptist Church

2	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Hello, ladies and								
3	gentlemen, we are going to begin the ceremonial								
4	portion of our program. We're so happy to have you,								
5	Council Member Dromm. Would you please join us? I								
6	am so pleased to be here today. I am Majority								
7	Leader, Laurie Cumbo, and I am pleased to have three								
8	incredible ceremonials that will be done today to								
9	present for outstanding work in our communities in								
10	New York City. Today, I am very proud to be standin								
11	here with Council Member Debbie Rose as we celebrate								
12	the New York City Youth Poet Laureate Program for it								
13	10 years of outstanding work raising the voices of								
14	our young people to foster greater civic engagement								
15	and to increase youth voter turnout. This is a								
16	critical voice in the process of voting throughout								
17	New York City, and it's critical that we do all that								
18	we can to engage that voice and to give it power								
19	throughout New York City. We are very proud here								
20	today. As our colleagues know, the New York City								
21	Poet Laureate Program is a voting theme spoken word								
22	poetry competition aimed at increasing youth voter								
23	turnout by educating New York City students about								
24	their power to decide the leadership and direction o								

the City. Can we have all the people that are

2	associated with today's proclamation please come
3	forward? Center stage. So, as my colleagues know,
4	we have a dynamic young man who is here with us
5	today. He is a junior, about to be a senior at
6	Stuyvesant High School, and that's right, give it
7	up. [applause] And we are so proud to have him here
8	today, William Lohier is a dynamic young person who
9	is being celebrated today here at the New York City
10	Council. And why we want you to be here today, as a
11	student of Stuyvesant High School, the future is
12	yours. As a member and winning member of the Poet
13	Laureate Competition, we know that you have engaged
14	so many young people into the art of voting, and we
15	hope that through the power of your spoken word that
16	so many young people across the City of New York will
17	find a voice and understand their power, and we hope
18	that one day you will find your power sitting in one
19	of these seats here at the New York City Council.
20	Okay? [applause] So, this isn't just by accident.
21	This is because we are recruiting you to do dynamic
22	and amazing things here in New York City. So, I am
23	now going to turn it over to our clerk who is going
24	to read the proclamation, and then I'm going to turn
25	it over to Council Member Debbie Rose.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

1

COUNCIL CLERK: Council City of New York Proclamation: The New York City Council is proud to pay tribute to the New York City Youth Poet Laureate Program for 10 years of outstanding work raising the voices of William Lohier and other young people to foster greater civic engagement and increase the voter turnout, and whereas, coordinated by NYC Votes and its partner, Urban Word, the New York City Youth Poet Laureate Program is a voter-themed spoken word poetry competition aimed at increasing youth voter turnout by educating New York City students about their power to decide the leadership and direction of the City. Since its inception in 2008, the New York City Youth Poet Laureate Program has reached more than 100,000 youth across the five boroughs, and whereas, by providing young people with a platform for creative expression, the New York City Youth Poet Laureate Program promotes critical thinking of self and by extension a critical analysis of one's roles in one's community and government. The program provides the platform for youth to voice their opinions about their elected representatives and community issues and through peer-to-peer engagement encourage those around them to become civically

2	engaged. And whereas, each year many talented
3	individuals compete to become the carefully chosen
4	New York City Youth Poet Laureate to serve as a
5	prominent leader in the youth community, champion the
6	voice of youth vote, perform and speak at events, and
7	conduct peer-to-peer voter engagement activities. It
8	is a great privilege to honor William Lohier for
9	winning this year's competition and engaging his
10	peers in these important responsibilities, and
11	whereas currently in his sophomore year at Stuyvesant
12	High School, William boasts a remarkable resume that
13	includes leadership positions for the school's Black
14	Students' League, as well as the Debate Team. A new
15	member to Urban Word NYC's Youth Board, he's an
16	incredible writer and performer. As the New York
17	City Youth Poet Laureate, William now performs and
18	speaks for his peers throughout the City encouraging
19	voting and civic engagement, and whereas, William's
20	poem "Voting in a Black Hole" exemplifies the bold
21	voice of his generation, particularly as it ends
22	with, "Vote, because our voices can break the laws of
23	physics, because our songs can outweigh the gravity
24	of any black hole, because our votes can look this
25	city in the eye and tame it, and say you have looked

presents itself. So, I know-- I have some things I

want to tell you not only about William, but I want

24

2	to tell you about the Youth Poet Laureate Program.
3	So, please indulge me, because it's really important
4	that we know who's supporting our young people and
5	the obvious outcome. And so, today, William, who is
6	the 2018 Youth Poet Laureate, is currently a
7	sophomore at Stuyvesant High School oh, senior.
8	Well, how did we demote him? Oh, you know what it
9	was, he's young enough to be a sophomore, but he's a
10	senior. And so he has a remarkable resume that
11	includes leadership positions for both the Black
12	Students' league, the Debate Team at Stuyvesant High
13	and a new member to Urban Word NYC's Youth Board.
14	He's an incredible writer and performer and
15	demonstrates outstanding skill and leadership. As a
16	New York City Youth Poet Laureate, William performs
17	and speaks for his peers throughout the City,
18	encouraging voting and civic engagement. The New
19	York City Youth Poet Laureate Program is celebrating
20	its $10^{ ext{th}}$ Anniversary this year. It is a voting themed
21	spoken word poetry competition which merges art and
22	civic engagement in order to energize and empower
23	young voters and it led by NYC Votes and Urban Word
24	USA. Since its inception, the program, the first of
25	its kind has impacted over 300,000 New York City

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 2 That deserves a big round of applause. 3 [applause] And has been recreated in 41 cities 4 throughout the country-- New York is a leader once again -- leading to the creation of the National Youth 5 6 Poet Laureate Program in 2017. We have celebrated 7 here at Mayoral Inaugurations, Federal Hall, and the Library of Congress, Kennedy Center, the Apollo 8 Theater each poet laureate who has published a book 9 of poems. By providing youth with a platform for 10 creative expression, the Youth Poet Laureate Program 11 12 promotes critical thinking of self, and by extension a critical analysis of one's role in one's community 13 14 and government. The program provides the platform 15 for youth to learn about elected officials -- did you 16 learn anything about us? -- and community issues, and 17 through peer-to-peer engagement encourage those 18 around them to become civically engaged. So, William is our 2018 Youth Poet Laureate, and he serves as a 19 20 leader of our city's youth community, a champion voice for the youth vote through community service, 21 2.2 performing and speaking, and conducting peer-to-peer

engagement activities. We want to thank William for

his contributions to not only civic engagement, but

engaging young people in positive activities and

23

24

2 leadership development. We are so proud to have you
3 here today.

1

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

[applause]

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, and we would love to have some words from you in whatever capacity you'd like to share those words, but I think we all know what kind of words we're looking to hear. But I just want to say, in this climate on education, and we're talking about specialized high schools and who can and who does not attend our specialized high schools, you are certainly a beacon of hope and an inspiration for so many young people to know that Stuyvesant High School, Bronx High School of Science, Brooklyn Tech, La Guardia, and all of these schools are for all young people of all races and religion. So, you are our beacon and you are our symbol and we are so very proud of you, and there should be so very many more of you. So, continue to shine your light bright, and we are so proud of you.

WILLIAM LOHIER: I'd like to thank the
City Council, of course, for this amazing
proclamation. I would like to thank Urban Word, my
family at Urban Word NYC, and of course, NYC Votes
for always encouraging me and for helping me speak

2	and lift my voice in spaces that mattered. And I'd								
3	like to thank all of you for being here, for clearly								
4	being invested in the future of our city. And before								
5	I read a short poem, I'd just like to say that there								
6	are nearly two million New Yorkers under the age of								
7	18. That's two million voices that do not have a say								
8	in who sits in this room, and those are two million								
9	people that every single decision that passes through								
10	this room has an effect on, and that ranges from								
11	decisions like the one made about the SHSAT,								
12	decisions about how we use/engage with								
13	transportation, how we are incarcerated, how we are								
14	policed, and these are decisions that all have an								
15	impact on us. So, I'd like to ask all of the City								
16	Council Members present to ask about us, to talk with								
17	us, to engage with us, because we have so, so much to								
18	say. [applause] And I was going to read a short								
19	poem about civic engagement, but it's very clear to								
20	me that every single person in this room knows								
21	everything that is at stake with all the decisions								
22	that pass through here. So, I'm going to read a								
23	short poem that I think, to me, encompasses part of								
24	the reason that I love New York City and part of the								

reasons-- and the reasons that I am proud to be a New

2	Yorker. So, this poem is called "As the City Slept."								
3	I sit next to a homeless woman in Starbucks. She								
4	asks me how I'm doing. I say, alright. She says she								
5	got hit by a car in Brooklyn and needs two								
6	painkillers for this ache in leg that won't go away.								
7	There's thunder in her voice, roaring up through								
8	sidewalks, her breath, the City's breath. She asks me								
9	to watch her stuff, walks out with a cigarette, and I								
10	watch her unfurl. Stark against the plain air I see								
11	the city coalesce around her exhaling, its breath								
12	rumbling through subway tunnels as it lifts the								
13	wreckage from her hips, clears away shattered glass,								
14	raises her eyes once again towards the sky; built a								
15	skyscraper out of her body, gleaming, celestial. And								
16	they call us The City that Never Sleeps, but some								
17	nights I think I can hear it dreaming, in the grit of								
18	a brown girl's black teeth, and they forget the City								
19	grows tired sometimes. Forget a quarter of New								
20	Yorkers were slaves once. Forget segregation.								
21	Forget gentrification. Forget stop-and-frisk.								
22	Forget our names. Forget our blood in this concrete.								
23	Forget there are days that Lady Liberty, after								
24	working double shifts every day for years needs to								
25	blow out her torch and settle down to rest, and we								

run against me, but you need to run. In Brooklyn,

alright, we'll talk. Brad Lander, watch out. Okay,

proclamation. Alright, thank you every one. We are

so we are now going to take a photograph with this

2.2

23

24

2	n ow going to be joined with Council Member Ben
3	Kallos who will be honoring The Tank. If everyone
4	that is here with The Tank, if you could come on up.
5	Wow, all of these amazing, cultural individuals.
6	Good afternoon. I am so proud to be here with The
7	Tank, and we are going to be honoring them for 15
8	years of profound cultural contributions to New York
9	City, and for the opportunities it has afforded
10	thousands of original young artists. The Tank is a
11	Manhattan-based multidisciplinary arts presenter and
12	producer dedicated to removing economic barriers from
13	the creation of new work by artists launching their
14	careers and experimenting within their art form. It
15	is also committed to upholding its mission in an
16	environment that is inclusive, which is so important,
17	and accessible to all people. So, I'm now going to
18	turn the mic over to my colleague Council Member Ben
19	Kallos who has brought this phenomenal group forward,
20	and we are so happy to welcome you here, the voices
21	of young people represented by women warriors today,
22	and we're so happy to have you. If my colleagues
23	could join me that would be phenomenal I'll now

turn it over to Council Member Ben Kallos.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

12

13

14

1516

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Good afternoon. Finding affordable space in the City of New York is next to near impossible, whether it's housing or for performing arts. And so initially we have places like the public theater, but there's-- really hard to get into that, and it really doesn't serve as many New Yorkers as it could, and so many years back I met folks from the The Tank, which was this place that was welcoming all sorts of artists doing all sorts of things. At the time they were doing something called Laughing Liberally, because at the time more than-- a long time ago we elected somebody we were concerned about, and so that's what gave birth to Laughing Liberally and other acts that weren't going to find a place to perform. Most recently, this group has won pretty much more awards than almost any other theaters. Last time I was there I saw a puppet of Karl Marx, and it is an award-winning puppet show that they put together. Now, they found a permanent home after years, and so glad, and that home is on--UNIDENTIFIED: 36th and 8th Avenue.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: And you can catch amazing shows there, and the shows are back-to-back, and they're pretty much 24/7, and it's a huge

1

3

4

6

7

8 9

10

11

12

13 14

15

16

17

18 19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

opportunity, and I think they've actually been in the Speaker's district for as long as anyone can remember. So, I'm just so glad, and we'll turn it over to the Clerk to read the proclamation.

COUNCIL CLERK: Council City of New York

Proclamation: The New York City Council is proud to honor The Tank for 15 years of profound cultural contributions to New York City and for the opportunities it has afforded thousands of original young artists, and whereas, founded in 2003, The Tank is a Manhattan-based multi-disciplinary arts presenter and producer dedicated to removing economic barriers from the creation of new work by artists launching their careers and experimenting within their art form. It is also committed to upholding its mission in an environment that is inclusive and accessible to all, and whereas, from the start, The Tank has provided a welcoming, creative, collaborative, and affordable environment for performing artists and presenters to engage in the pursuit of new ideas, delivering access to dynamic, cutting edge programming to the next generation of audiences for live performance and the work of emerging artists. Whether the artists are actors,

2	musicians, dancers, comedians, poets, film-makers, or							
3	artists of emerging media and other genres, they have							
4	all found an important home and creative hub, and							
5	whereas, The Tank has provided free performance							
6	space, as well as a suite of other resources							
7	including artist fees for tens of thousands of							
8	artists. It has also enabled thousands of artistic							
9	projects that would not have otherwise been possible,							
10	providing access to artistic resources and							
11	diversifying the voices and stories that can be heard							
12	in New York City, and whereas, The Tank is unique in							
13	its creative, collaborative approach by never							
14	charging artists to use the space, and always giving							
15	them a share of the box office. The Tank prides its							
16	participation and encourages talk-backs, trainings,							
17	and workshops around the performances. As a result,							
18	The Tank has presented an unrivaled number of new							
19	works across disciplines averaging 400 events a year,							
20	all in a setting that encourages collaboration and							
21	risk-taking over commercialism or competition. And							
22	whereas, like its presenters and producers, The							
23	Tank's audiences represent a broad cross-section of							
24	New Yorkers who are generally young, curious, and							
25	often new to the performing arts. Low-cost admission							

2	to all Tank events is a central tenant in its goal to								
3	attract the new generation of arts' patrons, and to								
4	inspire audience diversity on behalf of artists in								
5	the broader arts communities throughout the five								
6	boroughs. And whereas, The Tank has been tasked with								
7	challenges over the past 15 years, but has remained a								
8	resilient institution, never compromising the								
9	openness of its approach or the quality of its work.								
10	Today, thanks to the unwavering commitment of its co-								
11	artist directors Rosalind Grush and Meghan Finn, its								
12	staff, curators, board and advisory board, and many								
13	other supporters, The Tank remains a one-of-a-kind								
14	venue where emerging artists can find their voice,								
15	where community and risk-taking are valued over								
16	competition and exclusivity, and where the newest								
17	ideas are refined and developed into the next								
18	movement. Now, therefore be it known that the New								
19	York City Council is proud to honor The Tank in								
20	celebration of its 15 th Anniversary for its								
21	extraordinary cultural contributions to New York								
22	City. Corey Johnson, Speaker for the entire Council;								
23	Laurie Cumbo, Council Member, Majority Leader; Ben								

Kallos, Council Member Fifth District, Manhattan.

1

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: And just in case

I get in any trouble for conflicts, I have one

3

4 production credit in my life which was doing a

5

Laughing Liberally show at The Tank called Pirates of

6

the Bronx, the Curse of Pedro Espada in 2010, and

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

literally, they will take any artist with any crazy idea. And we can turn it over to them to say a few

words.

MEGHAN FINN: This is such an honor for us. We could not do the work that we do every single day without the support of the New York City Council and the Department of Cultural Affairs. The most valuable thing that we bring every day is the ability to say yes to thousands of artists every year who don't have a place to be doing their work. When we see the increasing difficulty of maintaining a performance or cultural space in New York City with the demands of real estate, we are at-- we are so pleased that every day we get to serve so many. This year we served over 2,000 artists, giving many of them their first opportunity to do their work from all of the five boroughs. I want to just allow my colleague, Rosalind Grush, to say a couple of words. There has been a quiet deterioration of press around

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

arts and culture in New York City as the focus of press -- hi guys -- has become increasingly political. There is less of an opportunity for cultural programming to rise above the fray, and that has been happening throughout the last couple of years, and so as that happens and has a profound effect on small to mid-sized arts organizations who really rely on the press to get the word out about what they do. that has been a struggle that we have seen. continue to strategize ways around it and help these young artists who have a voice like the incredible artist we just saw, that need to be heard. people that are just coming out and just getting to do their work, they really need to be seen if New York City is going to remain a cultural center. So, we applaud the work of the blueprint. We applaud the work that has been happening in New York City, and we'll just continue to do our part.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. I want to thank you all for the credible work you've been doing over 15 years as artists and as women warriors taking this opportunity to let the press know exactly how you feel about the arts and getting the word out, never missing an opportunity, and we thank you for

2 your 15 years of service, and we thank you Council Member Ben Kallos for bringing this extraordinary 3 group to the forefront. Thank you so much, and we continue to support you. Thank you. Let's take a 5 group photo. Can we have everyone from the 6 7 incredible group, Teens Take Charge? And here's our Council Member Ritchie Torres from the Bronx. 8 Everyone that's associated and presenting here with 9 Teens Take Charge. This is youth day. The youth 10 have taken over City Hall, and it's amazing and it's 11 12 fantastic, and I hope with all of the press that we 13 have here today, they will be able to showcase how 14 dynamic and amazing our young people are, and they 15 are taking over the city, and as our poet laureate 16 said, it's over two million people that do not have a 17 voice in City Hall, but they are getting a voice 18 So, we are so pleased to have you all here Teens Take Charge had its launch event on 19 today. April 28th, 2017, just a year ago, at the Bronx 20 21 Library Center with an initial group of only six 2.2 students. It has grown to more than 60 students from 23 different high schools across the City, dedicated to tackling school segregation and proposing policies 24 that promote integration by engaging audiences of 25

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

12

1314

15

16

17

1819

20

21

22

23

24

25

more than 300 people all in one year. We should be so lucky as Council Members, right? They are really doing great work, and I'm going to turn the microphone over to Council Member Ritchie Torres to say more about this fantastic group that he has brought forward and introduced to City Hall today. Council Member Ritchie Torres.

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Thank you everyone. You know, as many of you might know, May 2018 marks the 65th Anniversary of one of the greatest decisions in American history, Brown vs. Board of Education, but five years ago during the 60th Anniversary, the UCLA project at-- the Civil Rights Project at UCLA found that New York City despite our reputation for cosmopolitanism and diversity has the most segregated school system in the country. And so it's an issue that had been-that had gone unresolved for decades, but for the first time the Department of Education has adopted a policy for diversifying classrooms. We need to be bolder, but those changes would not have been possible were it not for a student-led movement known as Teens Take Charge. And so the change is being driven not by the politicians, but primarily by the

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12 13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

students in front of you, and we want to recognize them for honoring the heritage of Brown vs. Board of education not only in word, but in deed. So, thank And are we going to read the proclamation?

COUNCIL CLERK: Council City of New York

Proclamation: In recognition of the student-led movement to integrate segregated students throughout New York City, the Council of the City of New York is proud to honor Teens Take Charge for leading the way for equitable education, and whereas, Teens Take Charge had its launch event on April 28th, 2017 at the Bronx Library Center with an initial group of six students. It has grown to more than 60 students from different high schools across the City dedicated to tracking school segregation and proposing policies that promote integration by engaging audiences of more than 300 people, and whereas, Teens Take Charge's mission is to build a student-led movement for educational equity in New York City. they have led four free events between students and policymakers on topics of educational inequity, pressing issues in the New York City public school system, inequities in the high school admissions process, and the legacy of Brown V. Board of Education, and

the Bronx.

21

2.2

23

24

25

UNIDENTIFIED: First and foremost, I'd like to thank Council Member Torres, Council Member Lander, and Council Member Rosenthal, and every single elected official, Taylor Agen [sic] and every

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

adult who has helped us thus far. I think what really drives Teens Take Charge is the fact that an education is the civil and natural right of every single citizen of New York, and we have to make sure we improve the system, because we're stealing these kids' future. In the next 20 years, we're going to be the ones who are sitting in these seats and making the decisions that are going to be made. All these voting things are going to be the youth, and if we don't prepare our youth we're not going to have a strong future, and education is the way to prepare the youth. So, we have to make sure education system is equitable for all students regardless of their gender, race, socioeconomic status, or orientation so we can all thrive and make sure New York City is the greatest city in the world and will continue to be when we assume these leadership positions.

[applause]

UNIDENTIFIED: Quiet on the floor,
please. Quiet on the floor, please. At this time,
please place all electronic devices, all electronic
devises to vibrate. At this time will all noncouncil employees, non-council employees, please
leave the main floor of the chambers. If you do not

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 27								
2	have a Council ID, you cannot be on the main floor of								
3	the chambers. Thank you. Madam Majority Leader,								
4	it's all yours.								
5	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Good afternoon,								
6	I'm Majority Leader, Laurie Cumbo, and I am now								
7	calling to order the Stated Meeting for today, August								
8	$8^{ m th}$, 2018, and we are now going to begin with roll								
9	call.								
10	COUNCIL CLERK: Adams?								
11	COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Present.								
12	COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel? Ayala?								
13	Barron?								
14	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.								
15	COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli? Brannan?								
16	Cabrera?								
17	COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.								
18	COUNCIL CLERK: Chin? Cohen?								
19	COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.								
20	COUNCIL CLERK: Constantinides?								
21	COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.								
22	COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy?								
23	COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Present.								
24	COUNCIL CLERK: Deutcsh? Diaz?								
25	COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Present.								

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING					
2		COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm?				
3		COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: here.				
4		COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal? Eugene?				
5		COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Here.				
6		COUNCIL CLERK: Gibson? Gjonaj?				
7		COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Present.				
8		COUNCIL CLERK: Grodenchik? Holden	?			
9		COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Here.				
10		COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos?				
11		COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.				
12		COUNCIL CLERK: King? Koo?				
13		COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.				
14		COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz?				
15		COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.				
16		COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman?				
17		COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.				
18		COUNCIL CLERK: Lander?				
19		COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.				
20		COUNCIL CLERK: Levin?				
21		COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.				
22		COUNCIL CLERK: Levine? Maisel?				
23	Menchaca?	Miller? Moya?				
24		COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Present.				

COUNCIL CLERK: Perkins?

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING					
2		COUNCIL	MEMBER	PERKINS:	Present.	
3		COUNCIL	CLERK:	Powers?	Reynoso?	
4		COUNCIL	MEMBER	REYNOSO:	Present.	
5		COUNCIL	CLERK:	Richards	? Rivera?	
6		COUNCIL	MEMBER	RIVERA:	Present.	
7		COUNCIL	CLERK:	Rodrigue	z?	
8		COUNCIL	MEMBER	RODRIGUEZ	: Presente.	
9		COUNCIL	CLERK:	Rose?		
10		COUNCIL	MEMBER	ROSE: He	re.	
11		COUNCIL	CLERK:	Rosentha	1?	
12		COUNCIL	MEMBER	ROSENTHAL	: Present.	
13		COUNCIL	CLERK:	Salamanc	a?	
14		COUNCIL	MEMBER	SALAMANCA	: Present.	
15		COUNCIL	CLERK:	Torres?		
16		COUNCIL	MEMBER	TORRES:	Present.	
17		COUNCIL	CLERK:	Treyger?		
18		COUNCIL	MEMBER	TREYGER:	Here.	
19		COUNCIL	CLERK:	Ulrich?	Vallone? Var	า
20	Bramer?	Williams?	Yeger?			
21		COUNCIL	MEMBER	YEGER: H	ere.	
22		COUNCIL	CLERK:	Matteo?		
23		COUNCIL	MEMBER	MATTEO:	Here.	
24		COUNCIL	CLERK:	Cumbo?		

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson?

3

1

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Here.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: We have a quorum.

5

allegiance to the flag of the United States of

6 7

America, and to the Republic for which it stands, one

Please rise for the Pledge of Allegiance. I pledge

8

nation, under God, indivisible, with liberty and

9

justice for all. Roll call. We will now go into the

10

invocation that will be delivered by Reverend Shaun

11

J. Lee of Mount Lebanon Baptist Church located at 228

12

Decatur Street, Brooklyn New York, 11233, and please

13

rise.

UNIDENTIFIED: All rise.

14

15 REVEREND LEE: Let us join in heart, mind

16

and spirit as we go in prayer together. We thank you

17

for this day, oh God, and are grateful for another

18

opportunity to serve the people of this great city.

19

We ask now that you endow this council with the

20

attributes they need in making decisions that will

21

2.2

affect the lives of so many. Give them wisdom so

that their legislation will have long-term positive

23

effects, helping them to choose what is right instead

24

of what is expedient. Give them compassion, so the

25

Council will have the disenfranchised and

2	marginalized in mind, especially our children,
3	seniors, and those who are disabled. Give them out-
4	of-the-box thinking so they can develop creative ways
5	to help those who need it the most. Give them
6	integrity so that they will always work toward the
7	greater good for all and not the selfish ambition and
8	goals of the few. Give them courage so that they
9	will not back down from doing what is right in your
10	eyes, but to stand tall and firm. Give them strength
11	so that they can manage the difficult burden that
12	comes with such a great responsibility. Give them
13	humility to help them remember their job is not one
14	of overbearing power, but of service. Give them
15	leadership so that they will know how to navigate the
16	various road blocks they will encounter in creating a
17	better city for all New Yorkers. And in a world
18	where those in power seek to divide us, give this
19	council a sense of unity and comradery. Remind them
20	of the African proverb: When two elephants fight, it
21	is the grass that gets trampled. Show not only this
22	council, but the people of this city that our
23	differences should not be used to make us combative
24	toward one another, but our unity in the midst of our

diversity is what makes this city so great. So bind

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

2.2

2	us together now, God, no matter what our
3	socioeconomic background may be. Bind us together
4	now, God, no matter what our sexual orientation or
5	gender identity may be. Bind us together now, God,
6	no matter what our religion, age, or color may be.
7	Bind us together now, God, with cords that cannot be
8	broken. This is our hope and this is our prayer.
9	Amen.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: We will now have a motion to spread the invocation in full upon the record by Speaker-- by Council Member Cornegy.

 $\label{eq:council_member_cornegy:} \mbox{I don't even}$ know how to respond to that.

[laughter]

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I'm stuck,

Laurie. Thank you, Madam Majority Leader, for this
opportunity to spread this above the entire Council.

I would like to say that Reverend Shaun Lee is the
epitome of all that is good of Bedford Stuyvesant.

As a former resident and childhood prodigy from

Brevoort Projects, he's a Moore [sp?] House man, went
on to get a Master's Degree from Brooklyn College, a

Master's from Princeton Theological Seminary, and
most importantly a member of the most— the greatest

2	fraternity known to man, Omega Psi Fraternity
3	Incorporated, Alpha Upsilon Chapter, better known as
4	Brooklyn Omega. Reverend Lee has broken out of the
5	traditional role that relegates clergy to its
6	respective pulpits. As a member and leader in Metro
7	IAF and EBC, he's led the way for affordable housing
8	and not only Bedford Stuyvesant and Crowne Heights,
9	but the entire City of New York. I'm proud to call
10	him a friend, a leader, and like I said, a shining
11	example of all that is good about Bedford Stuyvesant
12	Mount Lebanon Baptist Church is a beacon. It has
13	remained that way for several decades. It's a
14	pleasure to call him my friend and to spread this
15	invocation I mean, to spread the invocation I'm
16	still stuck on Laurie over today's Stated Meeting.
17	Thank you, Reverend Lee.
18	SPEAKER JOHNSON: Madam Majority Leader,

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Madam Majority Leader, before you move on I want to second what Council Member Cornegy said about the pastor who has joined us here today, Reverend Shaun Lee. I'm really glad he's here. It's a nice, pleasant surprise, and I have had the opportunity to get to know him through his advocacy for New Yorkers who are in need of habitable and affordable housing across our entire city. So I

am grateful for his work in the clergy community, but also his work beyond the clergy community and lifting up the most vulnerable in New York City. Thank you very much.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, and I too want to thank you for being here and for your very timely and powerful prayer, and for the work and advocacy in the fight that you have organized and launched all throughout the City so that our seniors would have truly affordable housing, and I thank you, and all of the pastors who have joined together to recognize our most vulnerable in our housing population. So, I thank you for your work and your advocacy, and you have changed the lives of thousands of people already. Thank you so much. We will now have the adoption of minutes, and we will have that completed by Council Member Salamanca.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you,

Majority Leader. I make a motion that the minutes of
the Stated Meeting of June 7th, 2018 and June 28th,

2018 be adopted as printed.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much, Council Member Salamanca, and now we will go on to messages and papers from the Mayor.

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 35
2	COUNCIL CLERK: Excuse me. M83
3	submitting Carl Weisbrod for appointment to the New
4	York City Charter Revision Commission.
5	SPEAKER JOHNSON: Received, ordered,
6	printed, and filed.
7	COUNCIL CLERK: M84 through M88,
8	submitting the names Jose Francisco, Janhavi
9	Pakrashi, Susan Stetzer, Luisa Torres, and Curtis
10	Walker to the Nightlife Advisory Board.
11	SPEAKER JOHNSON: Received, ordered,
12	printed and filed.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Communication from
14	City, County and Borough Offices.
15	COUNCIL CLERK: Pre-considered M89,
16	Nathan N. Joseph, candidate for the Civilian
17	Complaint Review Board.
18	SPEAKER JOHNSON: Rules, Privileges and
19	Elections.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Petitions and
21	communications?
22	COUNCIL CLERK: None.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Land Use Call-ups?
24	COUNCIL CLERK: M90 through M92, various
25	applications.

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 36
2	SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on a call-up
3	vote, and at this time I would ask for a roll call
4	vote on all items on today's Land Use Call-up
5	Calendar.
6	COUNCIL CLERK: Adams?
7	COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: I vote aye.
8	COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel.
9	COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: I vote aye.
10	COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala?
11	COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I vote aye.
12	COUNCIL CLERK: Barron?
13	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye.
14	COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli?
15	COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye.
16	COUNCIL CLERK: Brannan?
17	COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye.
18	COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera?
19	COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye.
20	COUNCIL CLERK: Chin? Cohen?
21	Constantinides?
22	COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye.
23	COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy?
24	COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY? I vote aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Deutsch?

1		CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 37
2		COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: I'll do the
3	same.	
4		COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen?
5		COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: [off mic] Aye.
6		COUNCIL CLERK: Diaz?
7		COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: [off mic] Yes, I do
8	[sic].	
9		COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm?
10		COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.
11		COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal?
12		COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.
13		COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene?
14		COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.
15		COUNCIL CLERK: Gibson?
16		COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I vote aye.
17		COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj?
18		COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Aye.
19		COUNCIL CLERK: Holden?
20		COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye.
21		COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos?
22		COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.
23		COUNCIL CLERK: King? Koo.
24		COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I vote aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz?

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING	38
2	COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I vote aye.	
3	COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman?	
4	COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.	
5	COUNCIL CLERK: Lander?	
6	COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye.	
7	COUNCIL CLERK: Levin?	
8	COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.	
9	COUNCIL CLERK: Levine?	
10	COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.	
11	COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel?	
12	COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.	
13	COUNCIL CLERK: Menchaca?	
14	COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye.	
15	COUNCIL CLERK: Miller? Moya?	
16	COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Aye.	
17	COUNCIL CLERK: Perkins?	
18	COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye.	
19	COUNCIL CLERK: Powers?	
20	COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS? Aye.	
21	COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso?	
22	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.	
23	COUNCIL CLERK: Richards?	
24	COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.	

COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera?

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING	39
2	COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Aye.	
3	COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez?	
4	COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.	
5	COUNCIL CLERK: Rose?	
6	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.	
7	COUNCIL CLERK: Rosenthal?	
8	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye.	
9	COUNCIL CLERK: Salamanca?	
10	COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye.	
11	COUNCIL CLERK: Torres?	
12	COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye.	
13	COUNCIL CLERK: Treyger?	
14	COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.	
15	COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich?	
16	COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Aye.	
17	COUNCIL CLERK: Williams? Yeger?	
18	COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Aye.	
19	COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo?	
2,0	COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Aye.	
21	COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo?	
22	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Vote aye.	
23	COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson?	
24	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Today's Land Use)

Call-ups are adopted by a vote of 44 in the

1

3

4

5

6

./

8

9

10

1112

1314

15

16

17

1819

20

21

22

23

24

25

affirmative and 0 negative. And now we will have communication from Speaker Corey Johnson.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you, Madam

Majority Leader. Good afternoon. First, I would

like if we could have some quiet in the chambers. I'd

like to--

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [interposing] Quiet in the chambers.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: remember few New Yorkers who have passed away since our last meeting. First, Robert Martinez who worked with the NYPD at Police Headquarters and was tragically killed in an accident on the Gowanus Expressway. I want to extend my thoughts and prayers to Robert's family. I also would like to remember a 9/11 First Responder who passed away in recent weeks, Paul Johnson, who was with the NYPD Emergency Services Unit died from an illness related to his work at Ground Zero. For his tremendous sacrifice, I'd like to extend my thoughts and prayers to Paul's wife, his nine children and his 19 grandchildren. Last, let us remember Wanda Rios, a security guard who was murdered while on duty in the Bronx last month. Ms. Rios was only 45 years old, and leaves behind a loving family, including her

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9 10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

spouse and her daughter. I offer them my thoughts and prayers, and if people could please rise so we could have a moment of silence for those we've lost.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you very much.

[moment of silence]

So, jumping into our docket for the day, the Council will vote on the following Finance items. First, we'll vote on Resolution 469, which I sponsored, that would support an additional borrowing by the Hudson Yards Infrastructure Corporation in an amount not to exceed 500 million dollars to complete the infrastructure projects in the Hudson Yards Financing District, including phase two of the project which includes the expansion of Hudson Boulevard and Park. The Resolution would also support an undertaking by the City to pay current interest subject to appropriation to the extent not paid from revenues of Hudson Yards Infrastructure Corporation on such Hudson Yards Infrastructure Corporation indebtedness. I want to thank the staff who was involved in this, Doctor Ray Majeski [sp?], Raju Mann [sp?], our Land Use Director, Rebecca Chaisson [sp?], our Chief Counsel for the Finance Committee, and Davis Winslow from the Finance Division. The Council will also

2	vote on two Article XI property tax exemptions, 526
3	West 158 th Street, in Council Member Mark Levine's
4	District. It's going to support the preservation of
5	29 affordable housing units. 941 Rogers Place in
6	Council Member Rafael Salamanca's district will
7	support the preservation of 20 affordable housing
8	units. Next, the Council will vote on the following
9	Land Use items: East 14 th Street in Irving Plaza in
10	Manhattan. The Council will vote on an application
11	by the New York City Economic Development Corporation
12	and 14 th at Irving, LLC to redevelop a city-owned
13	cite with a 21-story technology-focused office and
14	retail commercial building. The building will be
15	home to a unique cluster of workforce development
16	organizations which will help connect thousands of
17	people each year with the skills and training they
18	need to connect with jobs in the new economy. I want
19	to congratulate Council Member Carlina Rivera for her
20	work on this project, which has the opportunity to
21	transform how we train New Yorkers for jobs of the
22	future. Next, we're going to be voting on the Inwood
23	rezoning in Upper Manhattan. The Council will vote
24	on the Inwood rezoning and a neighborhood plan. The
25	plan for Inwood will result in the investment of

2	hundreds of millions of dollars in housing, parks,
3	waterfront, education, small business, job training,
4	community services and culture, and infrastructure
5	funding. I believe we have the responsibility to
6	turn over every stone to ensure that people in this
7	city have access to affordable housing, and I know
8	that Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez has fought as
9	hard as anyone could have to secure thousands of new
10	affordable units and a commitment to preserve
11	thousands of existing affordable units. As a result
12	of this rezoning and the inclusion of city-owned
13	sites, which Council Member Rodriguez negotiated,
14	this plan will facilitate the development of 2,600
15	new units of affordable housing, as well as
16	preserving and protecting another 25 existing
17	affordable units. The modified plan reduces the
18	scale of rezoning and removes the commercial U from
19	Dyckman to Broadway to 207 th Street. It commits
20	resources for small business development and includes
21	a new policy to promote longer term commercial leases
22	with limited rent increases, all of which we hope
23	will preserve the existing small business character
24	in Inwood. The plan will include significant
	i de la companya de

investments in our public school facilities and

2	funding for a new Immigrant Research and Performing
3	Arts Center which will celebrate the immigrant
4	history of the community and of our city while also
5	providing much-needed performing arts venues for
6	local community groups starved of such space in the
7	neighborhood. Finally, the plan includes millions of
8	dollars for new and improved public parks, waterfront
9	open space, in addition to transportation, pedestrian
10	safety, and infrastructure improvements. This
11	application, of course, is in Council Member Ydanis
12	Rodriguez's district. The East 33 rd Street rezoning
13	in Manhattan: The Council's approving with
14	modifications an application submitted by 33 rd Street
15	Acquisition LLC, for a zoning map amendment and a
16	zoning text amendment to facilitate a development of
17	a 23-story mixed-use building, and this project is
18	located in Council Member Carlina Rivera's district.
19	1019 to 1029 Fulton Street: The Council will be
20	voting on an application submitted by the New York
21	City Department of Housing, Preservation and
22	Development, and Fulton Star LLC to seek designation
23	of an Urban Development Action Area Project, a UDAAP
24	project, for project approval and disposition of a
25	city-owned property at 1027 and 1029 Fulton Street in

2	Brooklyn. These actions will facilitate the
3	development of an eight-story building with
4	approximately 50 residential units and 6,100 square
5	feet of ground floor commercial retail space to be
6	constructed on the disposition area and six adjacent
7	privately-owned lots. This project is located in
8	Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo's district. North
9	Conduit de-mapping in Queens: This is in Council
10	Member Donovan Richards's district where the proposed
11	de-mapping would allow the applicant to purchase a
12	portion of the project area from the City to use on a
13	permanent basis for permitted off-street accessory
14	parking for the uses on the applicant's property
15	adjacent to the de-mapping area. Balton Commons in
16	Manhattan: The Council will vote on an application
17	for the proposed Urban Development Action Area
18	Designation, again a UDAAP project, for project
19	approval and disposition approval for the property
20	located at 263 to 267 West 126 th Street. This action
21	will facilitate the development of a new seven-story
22	mixed-use building that includes 36 affordable rental
23	units, community facility space and retail space.
24	This project is located in Council Member Bill
25	Perkins's district. 40-31 82 nd Street: This

2	application has been withdrawn by the applicant, and
3	we will be voting on a motion to file. The Council
4	is also voting on six sidewalk cafés today. I want
5	to thank the Land Use staff who worked on all of
6	these projects, Amy Levetan [sp?], Julie Luben [sp?],
7	Jeff Yun [sp?], Liz Lee, George Sarkisian [sp?], and
8	Brian Paul, as well as Raju Mann, our great Director
9	of Land Use. Next on the agenda, the Council will
10	vote on the following pieces of legislation. We'll
11	vote on Introduction Number 1087 sponsored by Council
12	Member Jumaane Williams, which will co-name Rogers
13	Avenue between Farragut Road and Eastern Parkway as
14	Jean Jacque Dessalines Boulevard. I want to thank the
15	staff who worked on this, Chris Artori [sp?], Patrick
16	Mulvahill [sp?], Kenneth Grace [sp?], Chima Obeceri
17	[sp?], Teresa Nassir [sp?], and Megan Chan [sp?].
18	The Council's also going to vote on Introduction
19	965A, sponsored by Council Member Rafael Espinal,
20	which will allow businesses selling tobacco products
21	additional time to register for Tobacco Retail Dealer
22	License and come into compliance with the law that
23	the City Council passed last session that strengthens
24	regulations on the sale of tobacco products and
25	limits the number of stores selling these products.

2	I want to thank the staff who worked on this, Rachel
3	Cordero and Balkis Mirig [sp?]. Finally, the Council
4	will vote on legislation to regulate the for-hire
5	vehicle industry in New York City. This legislation
6	has received a lot of attention over the past few
7	weeks, and before we vote on these bills, I want to
8	clarify a few things. Number one, we are not taking
9	away any service that is currently being offered to
10	New Yorkers who use at-based for-hire vehicle
11	services. We are pausing the issuance of new
12	licenses in an industry that has been allowed to
13	proliferate without any appropriate check or any real
14	regulatory framework. If anyone wants to put a new
15	wheelchair-accessible vehicle on the road, they can
16	do that. In fact, we encourage them to, because less
17	than one percent of for-hire vehicle on the road are
18	accessible to folks who are in wheelchairs. This is
19	about careful deliberation. The Taxi and Limousine
20	Commission is going to study this issue over the next
21	12 months with quarterly data reports that are going
22	to be given by the for-hire vehicle companies. This
23	is about supporting and uplifting drivers in New York
24	City, all drivers, yellow drivers, green drivers,
25	livery drivers, Uber drivers, Lyft drivers, Juno

2	drivers, Via drivers, and making sure that they are
3	paid enough to support themselves and their families.
4	We believe that these tragic suicides that we've seer
5	in the city are because there has not been a real
6	look in this industry to figure out how we regulate
7	it in an appropriate way to make sure we're creating
8	sound public policy. This is a plan that we came up
9	with, and in my heart I believe this is the best path
10	forward. Our goal has always been to protect
11	drivers, bring fairness to the industry, and reduce
12	congestion. Those have been the three guiding
13	principles: protect all drivers, bring fairness and
14	parody in regulation across the industry, and to do
15	our best to reduce congestion. Two thousand new
16	vehicles having been added to the road every single
17	month. That's what this legislation does, this
18	package of legislation does, and it represents the
19	broad outlines of what we think our next steps should
20	be as a city to help the industry. This package of
21	bills is not punitive. This package of bills is
22	thoughtful. It's careful. It's deliberative, and we
23	have spent months working with all stakeholders
24	involved to ensure that what we're doing is
25	responsible and takes into consideration concerns

2	from everyone in the entire industry. Introduction
3	838C would add a new license for high-volume for-hire
4	vehicle transportation services serving 10,000 trips
5	a day, and Introduction 958A would remove the
6	enhanced financial penalties for unauthorized street
7	hails in the Hail Exclusionary Zone to bring them in
8	line with penalties citywide. Both of these bills
9	were sponsored by Council Member Ruben Diaz, Senior,
10	who is the Chair of the For-Hire Committee in the
11	City Council. Introduction 634B sponsored by Council
12	Members Ruben Diaz, Senior and Council Member Ydanis
13	Rodriguez would waive the licensing fees for
14	accessible taxi cabs and for-hire vehicles in order
15	to promote their use, getting more accessible
16	vehicles on the road. Introduction 144B, sponsored
17	by Council Member Stephen Levin, would require the
18	Taxi and Limousine Commission to study and decide
19	whether to adopt vehicle utilization standards or
20	regulations on the number of for-hire vehicle
21	licenses in the City. During this 12-month study
22	period there would be a pause in the issuance of new
23	for-hire vehicle licenses with an exemption, again,
24	for wheelchair accessible vehicles. Furthermore, the

TLC would be able to issue licenses during this 12-

1 2 month period if they determine that there is 3 geographic need for neighborhoods that need these vehicles to meet the demand and there would not be a 4 substantial impact on congestion if those licenses 5 were issued. And lastly, Introduction 890B, 6 7 sponsored by Council Member Brad Lander, would require the Taxi and Limousine Commission to set 8 minimum payments for for-hire vehicle drivers for 9 trips dispatched by high-volume for-hire vehicle 10 11 services. The TLC would also be required to study 12 payments for other for-hire vehicle trips and to 13 study whether or not they should set minimum rates of 14 fare. I am really proud of this package of bills. 15 believe we're going to uplift many, many workers in 16 New York City who have not been able to make ends 17 meet, who have fallen behind, who have had to deal 18 with predatory leasing companies who have been exploited in just trying to make ends meet to support 19 20 themselves and their families, and that's what Council Member Lander's bill does today. I'm very, 2.1 2.2 very proud of his leadership on this. I'm proud of 23 Council Member Levin, of Chair Diaz, of Council Member Rodriguez, and of all the folks who worked on 24

The staff worked tremendously on this.

2	to thank them: Malik Nassir Adeen [sp?], James
3	DiGiovani [sp?], Emily Rooney [sp?], Johnathan
4	Masserano [sp?], Rick Arbello [sp?], Nell Beakman
5	[sp?], and Teresa Nassir [sp?], as well as Laura Popa
6	[sp?] who has spent months and months
7	working on this package of legislation. We have
8	talked to every stakeholder involved multiple times.
9	We have been thoughtful, careful, deliberative, and
LO	we know what we're doing today is going to hopefully
L1	create the groundwork for a sound, fair regulatory
L2	framework that doesn't exist right now and we think
L3	will hopefully figure out some of the upheaval in the
L 4	industry and move our city forward in a dynamic
L5	industry that is changing all the time. That
L 6	concludes our very slow agenda for today's Stated
L7	Meeting, and I look forward to proceeding with
L8	today's votes. Thank you very much, Madam Majority
L 9	Leader, and I see our Public Advocate has joined us.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you,
21	Speaker, and we will now have discussion of General
22	Orders. Seeing none, we will now have report of

COUNCIL CLERK: None.

Special Committees.

23

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 52
2	SPEAKER JOHNSON: Madam Majority Leader,
3	I believe that Council Member Rodriguez wants to
4	speak on the Inwood rezoning as part of the time that
5	we just passed. So, if we could move back to that so
6	the Council Member could speak on the rezoning in his
7	district.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: And Council Member
9	Rodriguez, before you do that, I want to thank you
10	all for the opportunity to preside over today's
11	Stated Meeting. Following Council Member Ydanis
12	Rodriguez's statement, we will be rejoined by Public
13	Advocate Letitia James, and she has eclipsed me in

15 back to her. Thank you, and we'll now turn it over

this process, and I'm proud to turn over her seat

to Council Member Rodriguez. 16

> COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. First of all, I would like to say that the lifethreatening images that I received similar to the one used by ICE doesn't reflect the majority of the great members of my community that I have here, showing their point of view--

> > UNIDENTIFIED: [interposing][off mic] COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: on this

proposal.

14

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

UNIDENTIFIED: [interposing][shouting]

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Folks, folks--

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

4 Quiet.

2.2

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Folks, folks, either we can let the Council Member finish with you all sitting up there, or to be able to proceed with today's votes and have a full hearing, we will have to clear the balcony if you do not allow him to speak the rest of his time. So, that choice is up to you. If you continue to speak out, I'm going to ask the Sergeants to clear the balcony so that we can have votes today. So that is up to you. So, Council Member, if you want to continue to proceed.

year process of the rezoning, having been attended
Town Hall and have met with community leader about
the false and legitimate concerns about the rezoning,
I heard loud and clear that the rezoning was too
broad and could threaten the character of our
neighborhood. For that reason we decide to take the
U out of the rezoning. Our districts and hardworking families have drived [sic] for decades
despite the neglected and lack of investment by the
various Administration. Fewer than a thousand

2	affordable units have been built in the last 10
3	years. With this plan, we will create, preserve and
4	protect over 5,000 affordable units, including the
5	development of 2,600 units on public and private
6	sites. Among other investments, we will bring over
7	50 million in STEM [sic] and robotic programming and
8	capital to George Washington High School and Luperor
9	High School and a new P-Tech [sic] school with
LO	partnership with CUNY. We are building 100 percent
L1	affordable housing, development of critical public
L2	sites including DOT bridges, repair facilities, and
L3	[inaudible] with a plan to do the same thing to
L 4	similar site in our community. We are bringing to
L5	our district the first in the nation Immigrant
L 6	Research Center of Performance Arts space to be run
L7	by new public library and leading community. Again,
L8	I believe that anyone that has the opportunity, the
L 9	right to express themselves, but when anyone posts
20	any messages similar to the ICE's is unacceptable.
21	Gracias.

22 UNIDENTIFIED: [protesting]

23

24

25

SPEAKER JOHNSON: So, --

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

Quiet. Quiet in the balcony, please.

2 UNIDENTIFIED: [protesting]

2.2

SPEAKER JOHNSON: So, Sergeant, if you could please— Sergeant, Director, could you please clear the balcony. Okay, if we could please have quiet in the chambers.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the chambers, please. Everyone have their seats. Quiet in the chambers. Now,--

SPEAKER JOHNSON: [interposing] Madam

Public Advocate, I believe that the sponsors of the

for-hire vehicle piece of legislation want to speak.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Now continuing with General Order Discussion beginning with Council Member Diaz. Quiet in the chambers. Council Member Diaz, your microphone.

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Thank you, Madam
Chair Lady. Ladies and gentleman, today I'm honored
to be the Chair of a newly-formed committee. The
drivers in the City of New York, taxi drivers, have
suffered too much. They have been used by everyone.
They have been used by the insurance company, by the
union, by the bases, by the leasing company, by
everyone. So, it is about time that we do something.
But the Bible said that where is no vision, that

2 people would perish. This City Council, this new 3 City Council hired a man with a vision, a vision for the future, a vision for the City of New York, that's 4 5 our Speaker Corey Johnson. He created a new committee and empowered me to be the Chair of that 6 7 committee with the intention to report to him our finding of our solution or proposal. This committee 8 have been working since January for the last seven 9 My counsel, my brother, my friend, my 10 counsel Christopher Lee [sp?] have been working day 11 12 and night, a part time worker that works more than a 13 full-time worker, and I would like to thank the Speaker Council Corey Johnson for allowing me to be 14 15 the Chair of this committee, the Speaker's Chief of 16 Staff, Jason Goldman-- he's been very helpful-- the 17 members of the For-Hire Vehicle Committee. We have to thank Counsel [inaudible] and Louis Cholea [sp?] 18 They were always there. I would like to 19 20 thank Mr. Ed [sic] Figueroa [sp?] and the 32BJ union member for their support, the Metropolitan Taxi Cab 21 2.2 Board of Trade, [inaudible] on the New York Taxi 23 Workers' Alliance. And ladies and Gentleman, this is-- today, we can make history. One of my bills, 24 25 838B, is a bill to regulate Uber. You have to make a

2 [inaudible] regulating Uber and copying Uber. 3 Copying Uber for one year, regulating Uber is [inaudible] have no time. So, one of my bills, 4 again, 838B is to regulate Uber, and if that bill is 5 approved by you, my colleagues, New York City, New 6 7 York City will make history being the first city in the nation to regulate Uber. So, and the bills that 8 Lander's submitting -- Council Member Lander, thank 9 you very much for your support. Council Member 10 Levine for their support of the, you know, the desire 11 12 to work together to help the drivers and all those 13 that been helping, that been helping us. Again, I'm 14 saying that these five bills that we are submitting 15 today for your consideration, Council Members, and 16 Madam Chair Lady, are all in favor of the drivers. 17 We have nothing to fear. We have nothing to worry. 18 There have been scary tactics saying that our committee will suffer. Ladies and Gentleman, let me 19 20 tell you something, there's not -- there's no suffering. Our community of drivers, the livery, and 21 2.2 those livery drivers are being fined. They are 23 being-- they are fined when they pick up in our community. So, they are prohibited to pick up in our 24

community, the liberty [sic] drive by immigrant,

Speaker Johnson for his commitment to this

2	legislation in ensuring that this legislation is
3	was crafted in a fair manner, a manner that took in
4	a manner that took all sides and all perspectives
5	into account, and so I greatly appreciate his
6	leadership here. I want to thank our Chair, Chair
7	Ruben Diaz, Senior, for taking on this issue with
8	such passion since its arrival here at the Council,
9	and I think his support for this legislation, but
LO	also for the entire package is totally instrumental.
L1	So, thank you, Chair Diaz. Today, the Council has a
L2	historic opportunity to pass a legislative package
L3	that will bring much-needed oversight and
L 4	accountability to the ride share vehicle industry.
L 5	The fact of the matter is that the taxi industry has
L 6	capped the number of licensed vehicles allowed on the
L7	road for over 70 years when it comes to yellow cabs,
L8	yet, we have not done the same for other for-hire
L 9	vehicles, and as a result since the app hail
20	revolution, we have seen companies grow exponentially
21	without any long-term citywide plan in place to
22	address it. And as a result, the number of licensed
23	vehicles in New York City has almost doubled since

2014, even 2015. So, when we think about the last

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

time we were discussing legislation on this matter

back in 2015, there were roughly--

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

Excuse me, Council Member. Sergeant at Arms, there's someone apparently on the steps that's talking loudly. Would you please refrain or take your conversation outside? We are still in session.

Thank you. Apologize, Council Member.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Even when we were last discussing this issue in 2015, the number of for-hire vehicles on our streets has almost doubled since that time. The market is, in fact, oversaturated, and as a result drivers are struggling to make ends meet. So, Intro. 144 accomplishes several goals. First, it addresses the need to make pay more equitable for all drivers by pressing the pause button on the number of licensed for-hire vehicles, otherwise known as FHVs, on our streets. The one-year cap maintains our current level and prevents greater saturation of the market. I hear from drivers all across the industries who say that they're driving around for longer, having a harder time getting rides and earning less income. I just want to actually read from an op-ed in the daily news

support a family here in New York City on that type

of salary. Secondly, the bill helps us accomplish

24

25

2 our public policy goals around transportation 3 accessibility and congestion. Over 2,000 vehicles are added to the road every month while the rate of 4 traffic in Manhattan slowed by more than 17 percent 5 in 2016 alone. This is just not sustainable. 6 7 bill does, however, include an exemption for accessible vehicles incentivizing companies to speed 8 up their commitment to making vehicle transportation 9 more accessible to disabled riders across New York 10 City. Lastly, the bill starts us on a path to a 11 12 reasonable, responsible, and sustainable long-term solution for both drivers and riders alike. During 13 14 the one-year pause, the TLC will work with the 15 Department of Transportation to study vehicle 16 utilization rates, access to service in different 17 geographic areas around the city, driver income, and 18 traffic congestion so that we can enact adaptive, forward-thinking regulatory system that balances the 19 20 need for rider access with our goals of maintaining a living wage through fair transit system. We are long 21 2.2 overdue for regulation of the for-hire vehicle 23 industry, and I'm proud of the steps we're taking here today. With the passage of today's bills, New 24

York will be the first major city in the US to set a

2	limit on ride sharing vehicles. You know, I do want
3	to also acknowledge that I've heard from a lot of New
4	Yorkers and colleagues across the board on the
5	longstanding discrimination that people of color have
6	felt across New York City from taxi drivers and the
7	fact that at-base hail services have really filled a
8	void in making sure that people are not discriminated
9	against, that that has had a significant impact, and
10	we do not take that issue lightly. We take it very
11	seriously. We need to redouble our efforts,
12	consistently commit ourselves to root out
13	discrimination every single time we see it. We can
14	in no way countenance it or allow it to continue, and
15	the commitment here from this Council to address that
16	issue is ongoing and very serious, and I just want to
17	acknowledge that issue is legitimate. It is real,
18	and as Council Member Lander has said, you know, as a
19	white man myself, I don't have to suffer the
20	indignity of having cars pass me by as I put out my
21	hand for a hail, but it is very serious issue, and we
22	do not and we take it very seriously, and I want to
23	acknowledge that. With that said, I want to thank
24	the many drivers, advocates, and community leaders
25	who have generously contributed their time and

2	expertise to make sure that this bill brings real
3	solutions to New York transportation system. I want
4	to thank the Speaker for his incredible leadership on
5	this issue along with Laura Popa and council staff,
6	James Giovanni [sp?], Johnathan Messerano [sp?],
7	Emily Rooney [sp?], Rick Arbella [sp?], Chima Obeceri
8	[sp?], and John Basill [sp?], as well as Malik
9	Nasiradeen [sp?], and Nell Beakman [sp?] from the
10	Legislative Drafting Unit. I want to acknowledge TLC
11	Chair Meera Joshi, Jeff Lynch from City Legislation
12	on the Mayor's side as well as the Taxi Worker
13	Alliance, Bhairavi Desai, her entire organization,
14	the IDG which has brought a needed voice to this
15	conversation as well, and all of the stakeholders,
16	Josh Gold from Uber who has been readily available at
17	each and every incidence where we've reached out to
18	him for input, as well as other companies and
19	individuals that have been affected by this. SO, I
20	want to thank everybody for their time. I want to
21	thank my colleagues for the support. Even and my
22	colleagues that are not supportive of this measure,
23	thank you so much for your consideration and for your
24	very important feedback. And with that, I encourage

2 my colleagues to vote aye. Thank you very much for 3 the courtesy. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 | Council Member Rivera?

1

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you so I want to thank-- thank you for letting me speak today about some very important Land Use decisions for my decisions for my district that we're going to be voting on today. So, after seven months of intense negotiations with City Hall, I'm voting yes today for a tech hub at Union Square that achieves the two most important goals our community needed from this rezoning. This tech hub will bring true community benefits, tech education, and workforce development services that will finally give women, people of color, and low income New Yorkers access to an industry that has unfairly kept them out for far too long. And of course, we have also achieved crucial protections for the neighborhood that I have lived in my entire life and seen change so much over the last 15 years. These protections include key land markings, a commencement of establishing a protective zoning measure in neighborhoods south of 14th Street that will regulate

2	commercial development and further resources and
3	commitments from HPD, LPC and the Mayor's Office tha
4	will have a lasting positive impact on the
5	preservation of affordable housing and historical
6	housing alike. I believe these protections for the
7	neighborhood are the first in a string of victories
8	that allow us to develop sensible zoning for livable
9	streets, establish land marking of precious
10	historical sites, and ensure the small businesses we
11	cherish prosper, and not just for my district, but I
12	hope we as a council can have a better process for
13	community-based planning that really does look at
14	things holistically going forward. I'm also proud t
15	be delivering more affordable housing we desperately
16	need so, the Kips Bay Neighborhood of District Two
17	The project we are approving today on East 33 rd
18	Street has a potential to bring up to 40 affordable
19	units with protections in place for the tenants from
20	the previous buildings on site. These Land Use
21	decisions are the most important I've made in my
22	eight months as an elected official. I, of course,
23	have to thank all of the advocates that kept pushing
24	me to make this project better. To my neighborhood

partners who helped me drive home the fact that the

2	history and character of our community is a priority,
3	thank you, this is your win. I could not have gotten
4	here without my staff, and I have to thank my interns
5	who have been an indispensable part of my team and
6	are going back to school soon, that's Chelsea,
7	Sierra, Elizabeth, Izzy, Joseph, Ryan, Bennie, and
8	Maranisa [sp?]. Yes, they all fit in about 1,500
9	square feet in the lower east side. And then I also
10	have to thank the amazing Council Land Use team,
11	especially Raju Mann, Julie Luben, and Liz Lee.
12	Thank you, of course, for the leadership of the
13	Speaker on projects like this, always standing by his
14	members, and Jason Goldman for his unending patience,
15	and to the Mayor's team, especially Jeff Lynch and
16	Ama Tegani [sp?]. And last, but certainly not least,
17	a very special thank you to my Chief of Staff, Pedro
18	Carillo [sp?], who has been working with me on this
19	project since day one. Thanks again to everyone who
20	supports the work that went into these results, and I
21	ask all of my colleagues to stand with me today.
22	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: That concludes
23	discussion of Canaral Orders Panort of Spacial

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Madam--

24 Committees?

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 69
2	COUNCIL CLERK: None.
3	COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Madam Public
4	Advocate?
5	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports of
6	Standing Committees?
7	SPEAKER JOHNSON: I believe Council
8	Member Lander wanted to speak on his bill as part of
9	the for-hire vehicle package.
10	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
11	Lander?
12	COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you, Madam
13	Public Advocate. I apologize. I was just letting
14	Council Member Levin go first. Thank you. I'll be
15	brief, hopefully. I want to just add my voice. I'm
16	proud to be part of this package of for-hire vehicle
17	legislation that the Speaker and Chair Diaz and
18	Council Member Levin have crafted together. It has
19	really been a thoughtful and data-driven process with
20	a great deal of listening to stakeholders with a goal
21	of getting the balance right between plummeting
22	driver pay, growing congestion, the need for
23	dramatically expanded access for people with
24	disabilities while continuing to provide high-quality

service to New Yorkers who need it, and we don't take

families while they work hard to provide

transportation services to folks in New York City.

24

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 71
2	the Commission looked at what the impact would be as
3	a result of this regulation, an additional 12 to 15
4	seconds that you might have to wait to get that Uber
5	or Lyft, and I would just submit to you, boy, 12
6	seconds is long enough to wait to lift tens of
7	thousands of hard-working New Yorkers out of poverty
8	I won't repeat all the thank yous that Council Member
9	Levin and others said. I would like to add a thank
10	you to my Policy Director Annie Levers [sp?] who
11	worked very hard on this package. It's an honor to
12	be part of it. It really does get the balance right,
13	and I hope my colleagues will join us in voting yes.
14	Thank you.
15	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: That concludes
16	Discussion of General Orders. Report of Special
17	Committees?
18	COUNCIL CLERK: None.
19	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports on
20	Standing Committees?
21	COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
22	on Consumer Affairs and Business Licensing, Intro.
23	965A, licenses for the sale of cigarettes.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on

General Orders.

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 72
2	COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee on
3	Finance Pre-considered Reso. 469 Hudson Yards.
4	SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
5	Orders.
6	COMMITTEE CLERK: Pre-considered Reso.
7	472 Transparency Resolution.
8	SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
9	Orders.
10	COUNCIL CLERK: Pre-considered LUs 173
11	and Reso. 481 and LU 174 and Reso. 482, various
12	applications.
13	SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
14	Orders.
15	COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee on
16	For-hire Vehicles Intro. 144B, 634B, 838C, 890B, and
17	958A for-hire vehicle drivers.
18	SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
19	General Orders.
20	COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
21	on Land Use LUs 135 and 136.
22	SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved with
23	modifications and referred to the City Planning
24	Commission pursuant to Rule 11.70B of the Rules of

zoning amendments.

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 74
2	SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
3	Orders.
4	COUNCIL CLERK: LU 148.
5	SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved with
6	modifications and referred to the City Planning
7	Commission pursuant to rule 11.70B of the rules of
8	the Council and Section 197D of the New York City
9	Charter.
10	COUNCIL CLERK: LU 149 and Reso. 492
11	through LU 156 and Reso. 495, various applications.
12	SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
13	Orders.
14	COUNCIL CLERK: LU 166 and Reso. 496 and
15	LU 167 and Reso. 497, zoning amendments.
16	SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled to be filed
17	pursuant of letter withdrawal.
18	COUNCIL CLERK: LU 169 and Reso. 498,
19	sidewalk café.
20	SPEAKER JOHNSON: Motion to disapprove.
21	COUNCIL CLERK: LU 170 and Reso. 499,
22	sidewalk café.
23	SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
24	Orders.

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 75
2	COUNCIL CLERK: LU 171 and Reso. 500 and
3	LU 172 and Reso. 501, sidewalk café.
4	SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
5	Orders.
6	COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
7	on Parks and Recreation, Pre-considered Intro. 1087,
8	Jean Jacque Dessalines Boulevard.
9	SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled to General
10	Orders.
11	COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
12	on Rules, Privileges and Elections, M77 and Reso. 502
13	approving the appointment of Doctor Mitchell Katz,
14	New York City Board of Health.
15	SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled to General
16	Orders.
17	COUNCIL CLERK: Pre-considered M89 and
18	Reso. 503, approving the designation of Nathan N.
19	Joseph, Civilian Complaint Review Board.
20	SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled to General
21	Orders.
22	COUNCIL CLERK: General Order Calendar,
23	Intro. 720.
24	SPEAKER JOHNSON: Laid over.

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

2			COU	NCIL	CLERK	:	LU	135	and	Reso.	504
3	through	LU	148	and	Reso.	50	7.				

2.2

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled to General Orders.

COUNCIL CLERK: Resolution appointing various persons, Commission of Deeds.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General Orders, and at this time I will ask for a roll call vote on all of the items on today's General Order Calendar.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the Chambers, please, as we take a roll call vote.

COUNCIL CLERK: Adams?

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Permission to explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you, Madam

Public Advocate. Intro. 144B moved me greatly as I

have a large percentage of for-hire vehicles and

drivers in my district of Southeast Queens. I'd like

to thank my colleagues who took the lead on this

package of legislation, and I would like to share an

excerpt from my August 1st, New York Times Op-ed:

Professional Drivers, more than 90 percent of whom

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

are immigrants of color once earned a middle class living but now face eviction, bankruptcy, and even In the last year, six of them have committed There is no doubt that New Yorkers benefit from for-hire vehicles, especially those in parts of the City like my district in Southeast Queens where regular taxis are few. The cap will allow the City time to study how many cars we really need to meet consumer demand while maintaining full-time driver incomes. App drivers and those working in the traditional yellow cab industry are largely one in the same. Drivers go back and forth between the sectors as they struggle to earn a living, and our solutions must address the crisis for all drivers. While the Council works toward economic fairness in the industry, it will continue to organize to stop discrimination by drivers. Last week, under the leadership of Council Member Donovan Richards, it created the Office of Inclusion at the Taxi and Limousine Commission which will examine accusations of bias by drivers to combat bias against black passengers, in particular. I hope the City Council will take up legislation to require all licensed forhire and yellow cab drivers to participate in civil

time that I was little many years ago, we did not see

yellow cabs unless we were coming from the airport

24

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

and you got a yellow taxi to bring you home. So from that need, the ingenuity and the resourcefulness of people led to the cabs that you could call. You put in a call, they would come and pick you up. And now it has expanded to where we have the app hails and people get service in that way. This industry that has expanded has provided a great service, and I think that perhaps if a study had been done prior to the legislation, we would see what it is in fact we needed to do to bring some equity to the situation. I think that my community will be hindered, suffer, and not have services that they need with this, so I'm voting against 144B. And also I'm voting against 135 through 140 Land Use and 149 and 150 Land Use. Here too, I think that as we talk about affordable housing and where we have 50 percent or more of the housing that will be coming in at market rate, we are not addressing the issue of homelessness and people who need housing, which is a larger majority of the city than those who can afford to pay the market rate. So for those reasons, I'm voting no on those bills. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:

all.

23

24

25

COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy?

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye on

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 82
2	COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye on all
3	except 144.
4	COUNCIL CLERK: Deutsch?
5	COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye on all.
6	COUNCIL CLERK: Diaz?
7	COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Aye on all [sic].
8	COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm.
9	COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.
10	COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal?
11	COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.
12	COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene?
13	COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye on all.
14	COUNCIL CLERK: Gibson?
15	COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to
16	briefly explain my vote?
17	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you, Madam
19	Public Advocate, and good afternoon to all my
20	colleagues. I certainly want to extend my
21	congratulations to our colleagues who have introduced
22	very important bills on this day, Council Member
23	Rivera on the tech hub project in her district, and
24	certainly the for-hire vehicle legislation, and the
25	package that's been led by our Chair, Council Member
	1

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 83
2	Diaz, Council Member Lander, Council Member Levin. I
3	want to acknowledge the hard work of the staff that
4	really made today happen, recognizing that every bill
5	is not perfect. We do have to find a way to find
6	common ground and achieve a real balance knowing that
7	these issues are very sensitive and very delicate and
8	we certainly want to approach it form the right way.
9	And certainly, as a Council Member in the West Bronx
10	representing hundreds of residents and constituents
11	that are Uber drivers that also work for bases and
12	other options, it's heartbreaking to know that many
13	of them are receiving less than minimum wage and
14	they're struggling to survive. It's unacceptable in
15	the greatest city, and I do know that these bills, a
16	lot of work has really been done to get us to this
17	place, and once the bills are passed and codified,
18	that doesn't mean our work stops. It means that
19	every stakeholder remains in the conversation and we
20	still have a voice, but we truly believe at the end
21	of the day that this package is the best package put
22	forth with a lot of input, a lot of detail. We know
23	everyone will not be happy, but truly we are

25

izing that every bill ind a way to find balance knowing that and very delicate and form the right way. er in the West Bronx ts and constituents work for bases and g to know that many minimum wage and It's unacceptable in that these bills, a to get us to this ssed and codified, . It means that conversation and we believe at the end the best package put of detail. We know truly we are protecting workers and giving them options and making sure that they can actually live and take care of

8 rezoning that you could archive for your district.

And with that I will be voting age on all. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj?

2.2

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Permission to explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

and privilege of serving on the TLC for a number of years before I ran for office. On 144B, we've already experienced the lack of service in the outer boroughs. It was during TLC's regulation that allowed it to happen, and I'm not sure when we decided to put a freeze or a cap or a pause on something to do a study. Typically, we perform studies, and that'll determine the course of action that we should take. Based on those reasons and my

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

experience as well as the experience that I had last night as I returned with family from vacation, I don't have Uber, I don't have the app, but my son said, "I'll take care of this Dad," and he summoned an Uber from the airport that would take us home. enjoyed my conversation with a young man from India who is in his senior year of a university who was an Uber driver part-time because of his internship, his paid internship had ended, and this was the only means that he can find the money necessary to meet We're not realizing those that are relying on Uber as a part-time job or as an additional source of A freeze or a pause or a cap without a study that would determine clearly what we should focus on and what corrective measures are needed has been sidelined. We're also not taking into consideration of families that rely on the earned income from those part-timers just so they can pay their car payments and their insurance payments, because without that extra income they wouldn't have the luxury and the privilege of owning a car in New York City. those reasons and many more and the comments that I received from my constituents, I vote no on 144B and aye on the rest. Thank you.

as many of you know, I was initially opposed to

placing moratorium for new for-hire vehicles. I want
to say I really appreciate our Speaker, Corey
Johnson, who really took the time to meet with me on
this issue, and talk about the broad exemption for
new accessible vehicles, which we were just not
seeing in the for-hire vehicle industry, and I think
he made an excellent point that the Council giveth
and can taketh away, and we are commissioning a
study. We are closely reviewing the Taxi and
Limousine Commission's quarterly reports to ensure we
remain on track without harming existing services.
trust the study will be informative, and I honestly
believe that utilization standard may be the best
approach. I'm also a little concerned because it's
four years later, and in 2014 I introduced
Introduction 574 which said why do we need a middle
man? Why do need a medallion owner? Why do we need
Ubers or other folks when we could just let anyone
use a universal e-hail app to just put out their app
just like you raise your hand for a cab, and have
everyone compete for your ride? Everybody wins. The
drivers win. The passengers win, and I think that
would be a great way to move forward. For all of
those reasons I vote aye on all.

exploited. And with over 75,000 Uber vehicles, simply

COUNCIL CLERK: Levin?

explain my vote. So, first I just want to say thank you, Karen, for your vote and for your words today, and in 2015, you know, never to mess with Karen Koslowitz, that's clear. I just want to also thank my colleague Adrienne Adams for her very good words as well on this legislation and for a very thoughtful op-ed in the New York Times last week. And then just speak very quickly about the point brought up by Council Member Brannan, that that's true that there's language in this legislation that allows for the TLC if they see in a geographic area that there's a drop in service or a need for service and it won't add to congestion in that geographic area, they have the authority under this legislation to add new licenses for those geographic areas. So, I just wanted to make sure that that is clear that that's written into the legislation, and the TLC has the ability to respond to that. So, again, I want to thank all of my colleagues on their support, and with that, I vote ave on all. Thank you.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Levine?

I vote ave. COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE:

24

18

19

20

21

2.2

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 91
2	COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel?
3	COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.
4	COUNCIL CLERK: Menchaca?
5	COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I vote aye on
6	all.
7	COUNCIL CLERK: Moya?
8	COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Aye on all.
9	COUNCIL CLERK: Perkins?
10	COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye on all.
11	COUNCIL CLERK: Powers?
12	COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Permission to
13	explain my vote?
14	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you. I
16	represent Midtown Manhattan which has been for years,
17	but certainly now, crippled by congestion, and I
18	think many of us know there are a lot of contributing
19	factors to congestion, whether it is street closures
20	and events or other things, buildings going up, but
21	certainly the explosion of for-hire vehicles in the
22	last years is a contributing factor. I think that is
23	undeniable. And what measure we can talk about, we
24	can debate how much, but certainly when you walk
	1

through my district every single day you see T plates

2 everywhere, and I acknowledge I have a lot of people who take advantage of the service and enjoy it and 3 use it, but even their commutes are getting slower 4 and slower. As-- I remember this debate in 2015, although I wasn't here, and I remember the debate 6 7 back and forth, but since 2015 the rate of vehicles and the explosion of vehicles has only I think ma-- I 8 think, made his problem worse, and I think this is a 9 time to take a pause and look at the contributing 10 factors including the rampant and explosion of growth 11 12 in the for-hire vehicle industry. To me, some of the 13 things we're looking at like wages and utilization of 14 the vehicles are really key to getting to this 15 problem, making sure that certainly drivers are 16 making enough money and are making a living wage here 17 in the city, but certainly also making sure that 18 those vehicles are being used efficiently every single day and that they're not -- that they're 19 20 occupied and they are being efficient in the road. think this is a step in the right direction. 21 2.2 wasn't a victim of the mailers in 2015, but I do 23 remember this debate well, and I think this is a right time to take a moment and take a breather and 24 to think about it. And certainly, as others said, it 25

2	doesn't take vehicles off the road. It doesn't say
3	that you can't still have vehicles and services, but
4	certainly in my conversations with the Speaker and
5	all the staff here, they're very sensitive to the
6	smaller businesses that might get hurt or impacted by
7	it to any reflection in consumer behavior that might
8	impact the consumers, and certainly any other things
9	that might be stresses in this, and in all the
10	conversations I had with them, I felt confident that
11	they were very attentive to those needs, and that we
12	would continue to look at them as we move forward.
13	will say that I know and I have the confidence here
14	in this body and in the TLC that as we look at the
15	impact, as we look at utilization, wages, the amount
16	of vehicles, certainly if there's an impact that we
17	believe is positive, we will continue to have a
18	discussion, revisit it. We will look at the pause,
19	the utilization, everything else to make sure that we
20	get this right, and I ask this body to commit to
21	that, to make sure that we continue to evaluate and
22	make sure we get this right in the future. I have
23	confidence we will. I do have confidence that the
24	TLC will get this right. I have confidence that our

Speaker and the Chairs of the Committee's will

25

2 continue to look at this and get this right, but 3 certainly I believe we have to do something now to make sure that we don't keep contributing to a 4 problem and we actually have a way forward, and we take time to do that. I'll just end by saying I want 6 7 to say thank you to the Speaker for being thoughtful when he talked to me and he talked to other members 8 about what the impacts might be in our districts and 9 explained and also listened to what the impact might 10 I want to thank and congratulate Council Member 11 12 Levin and Lander and Diaz and all the others and 13 certainly the staff of all those respective staffs--14 staff of those respective members who worked very 15 hard on this and put a lot of effort into this. 16 will say, it may not be perfect. We have a lot of 17 work to do around congestion. I think we should pass 18 congestion pricing in Albany. [applause] You can applaud to that. I think we need congestion pricing. 19 20 I think we need to look at the streets that are occupied by new construction and many other factors, 21 2.2 but we certainly shouldn't abdicate our 23 responsibility to do something here today because of those factors. So I am voting age on all, and I 24

thank the staff. I thank Laura Popa. I think Chris

3

1

4

5

6

7

8

9

11

1213

14

15

1617

18

1920

21

22

23

24

25

Lin [sp?]. I thank all the staff of all the different members. Thank you to the Speaker for being thoughtful, and I do know that he's committed and all of us commit to keep looking at this in the future and to do something if we feel like it's headed in the wrong direction. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Madam Public Advocate, I just want to interject and say one thing. I know that when we had to clear the balcony there were folks who were not involved in the protest and the disruption who had to leave today, and some of those folks who are not able to be in the chambers right now are our loved ones and family members of drivers who took their own lives over the last seven months. They were here. They showed up today. They came here to watch this vote which is, I'm sure, a very emotional day for these family members. And so I know that they are watching this on TV now, so I want to thank them for their courage for being here, and apologize that they're not able to be in the chambers with us right now as the vote happens, and you know, our heart really goes out to all of them and the enormous amount of pain they've experienced since

losing a loved one suddenly and tragically, and I

wanted to note that, that they came here and they

were in the balcony, but they're no longer able to be

5 in the room with us, but I want to thank them for

6 being here today. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, Mr.

8 Speaker.

1

7

9

10

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso?

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Permission to

11 explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: First, I want to say that I also ride Uber and Lyft and unlike Karen in 2015, I did get a mailer, Karen. My mailer said, "Thank you, Antonio Reynoso," and it had a really nice picture of me, actually. So, obviously, I'm a big fan of app-based hails, but what we hear and what we see today is truly what I consider a balance and a fair push for legislation and regulation. It is a one-year pause. It is not a pause forever. There are places in the legislation that speak to allowing TLC to make changes should they see negative things happen. I think that we are a city that actually needs these hails and these app-based hails and cabs.

2	I want to make sure we can take advantage of that. I
3	do think the the reason I was opposed to it last
4	time ws because we need to make sure that we can
5	provide services to black and brown people in the
6	outer boroughs, but I don't think that putting a cab
7	on over 80,000 licenses is going to stop that from
8	happening in my district. I feel very confident
9	we're going to figure this out. I'll be very
10	vigilant to make sure the TLC follows through on any
11	errors that we might have caused here today, and I'm
12	looking forward to seeing in one year the study be
13	completed and us finally getting to regulate an
14	industry that truly needed to be regulated. So,
15	again, I want to thank everyone including the
16	sponsors, but especially Council Member Corey Johnson
17	who I really believe thought was very thoughtful
18	about this process, and as a previous supporter and
19	still a supporter, I'm still going to vote aye on
20	all. Thank you.
21	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
22	COUNCIL CLERK: Richards?
23	COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Permission to
24	explain my vote?

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

25

2	COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Today's vote
3	marks a critical step in reigning in an industry that
4	for far too long has dictated the rules of the game
5	to legislative bodies across the country. Today, I'n
6	proud to be part of a body led by Speaker Johnson
7	that is sending a message to billion dollar companies
8	that have aggressively waged a public campaign
9	against raising standards for their own drivers and
10	regulations that would reign in the oversaturation of
11	their cars on our city streets that have added to an
12	ever-growing congestion problem. In New York City,
13	there should be one set of rules for everyone, and no
14	corporation should feel that they are entitled to a
15	monopoly at the expense of people's lives.
16	Furthermore, let's be clear that the Council is not
17	taking away service today, as my constituents have
18	emailed me. We are we look forward to ensuring
19	that the TLC address the service gaps and underserved
20	areas if this issue arises while also adding to the
21	severe lack of accessible taxis for people with
22	disabilities, and as the sponsor said, there are
23	certainly there's certainly flexibility in these
24	bills. With that being said, I'm going to vote yes

on all the bills before us today, including the

2	moratorium. However, as we move to provide a
3	lifeline to the taxi industry, we must also recognize
4	the pain they have caused communities of color with
5	ride refusals. Yes, bias indeed is what fueled
6	communities of color to download apps like Lyft and
7	Uber, because they don't leave us with our hands
8	flapping out in the wind stranded on street corners
9	across our city. I look forward to further
10	conversations with the TLC and hopefully swift
11	passage of Intro 1079, which we're introducing today
12	to codify an Office of Inclusion within the TLC.
13	This bill is a step in the right direction in my
14	opinion, but let's be clear, there's no legislation
15	that will serve as a cure-all for decades of denied
16	rides and bias. At the end of the day, we're all
17	just trying to get to work and get home to our
18	families and friends, and everyone deserves to be
19	treated with the same respect no matter who they are
20	or where they are going. I want to thank Speaker
21	Johnson and certainly the Mayor for their commitment
22	to this, and with that again, I vote aye on all
23	bills.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

Spanish] What we are doing today is leveling the

playing field to the taxi industry so that those

24

2	15,000 yellow taxi medallion owners, including the
3	6,000 individual medallion owners, are able to know
4	that they can that they get support from the
5	Council. Those livery taxi company that they should
6	be able to know that we are here to support them, and
7	for the rest of the industry to know that there's
8	opportunity for everyone to do well here. In the
9	other hand, when it come to the Inwood rezoning, I
LO	want to thank Chairman Salamanca and Moya for all
L1	their support. Everyone here that has been working
L2	with all the Land Use team, George, Raju, and James,
L3	the great advisory team that I have, Professor Peña-
L 4	Mora, Barbara, Yvonne [sic], Charlie, and all the
L5	members of the Northern Manhattan Agenda, especially
L 6	also I have to thank my family for being there in
L7	this difficult manner that someone that handled
L8	rezoning in nine years, I believe that this rezoning
L 9	was necessary in order to preserve our community as a
20	working class community. Finally, big thanks to
21	Speaker Johnson and the Chief of Staff Jason Goldman,
22	without their support and their trust, I could tell
23	you that I would not be voting for this rezoning. It
24	is taking their word that I'm using to be able to

know that with the support of Mayor de Blasio and

actually addressed the serious problems of transit

deserts, then we would not be in this situation, and
further I would add, I believe we could do so within
the amount of spending that they spend today. Their
problem is one of mismanagement and spending of
resource they don't have to spend and could be
directed to fixing the MTA today. But with that in
mind, I want to make two points about the moratorium.
The first is that the moratorium exempts wheelchair
accessible vehicles, this is a smart safety valve,
and more importantly it is such a powerful incentive
to finally start adding accessible vehicles to the
road. I implore Uber and others to take advantage of
this opportunity. I also want to make clear that we
will be watching the TLC very closely to make sure
they are focused on the needs of all New Yorkers in
all boroughs. Racism has meant that communities of
color have been denied access to taxis for far too
often and for far too long. For all its faults of
the business model on these app-based companies,
blowing that open has been incredibly a positive
factor. This legislation requires the TLC to suspend
the moratorium in specific communities if they see it
negatively affecting availability and we will hold
them to it. With permission, just another half a

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: First, I want to congratulate my colleagues, Council Member Rodriguez and Rivera-- I'm not the talker-- on their Land Use projects that we're voting on today. The Inwood rezoning is not perfect. No rezoning is, but

2	there's a lot of big wins that should not be
3	overlooked or lost in the conversation. This
4	rezoning will create and preserve thousands of deeply
5	affordable units, grant more equitable access to the
6	waterfront and green spaces, and inject millions into
7	STEM programs, schools, and cultural institutions.
8	The reality is that we need to get more apartments
9	online so that the thousands of New Yorkers
10	struggling to live in a city where wages aren't
11	increasing nearly as fast as rents are rising can
12	have a place to live without fear of displacement,
13	and this rezoning takes a step in that direction. As
14	I said at the Land Use Committee last week, I am
15	disappointed that the Administration was not able to
16	deliver on including specific labor language and
17	worker protections through the sponsor review
18	process. For future rezonings and Land Use
19	application, responsible contractor language and
2,0	worker safety protection must be an integral
21	component. On the tech hub vote today, I
22	congratulate Council Member Rivera for her leadership
23	and vision on the project. We as a city need to
24	prepare our workforce and create qualified pipeline
25	of talent prepared to take on these new tech jobs

3

4

7

5

6

7

8

9

10

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2122

23

24

25

while encouraging innovation. And finally, I would like to thank the Land Use staff for their tireless work, and I vote age on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Torres?

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Permission to explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Thank you, Madam Public Advocate. No longer will the City of New York stand by idly while unfettered growth in the for-hire sector causes ever-worsening traffic congestion, ever-rising environmental degradation, and everdeepening human suffering, including a string of suicides, as well as improving accessibility, equity and mobility, labor standards and environmental standards. The law will modernize the City's outdated framework for regulating for-hire vehicles, a framework that had been rendered obsolete by the disruptive growth of high-volume for-hire services, especially Uber. Even though the legislative package includes a freeze on new for-hire vehicle licenses contained within it are two broad exceptions. first is an exemption for wheelchair accessible vehicles. What critics call a "cap" could just as

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 2 easily be seen as a requirement for accessibility. The second is an exemption for vehicles in 3 underserved neighborhoods to be determined by TLC. 4 As Council Member Reynoso noted earlier, those of us who are committed to geographically and racially 6 7 equitable access to services must be vigilant to hold TLC accountable for ensuring sufficient service in 8 the outer boroughs and keeping with the Council's 9 Setting a vehicle utilization standard will 10 create for the first time an incentive for companies 11 12 like Uber to be efficient in their use of road space 13 to relocate their vehicles from congested areas like 14 the Central Business District to the outer boroughs 15 where the need is far more pronounced. 16 confident that a vehicle utilization standard is a 17 game-changer. If set correctly and carefully, it 18 will lead to a balanced fleet of for-hire vehicles and a balanced distribution of those for-hire 19 20 vehicles throughout the City, and I am equally 2.1 confident that a standard for minimum pay will end 2.2 once and for all a savage race to the bottom in the 23 livelihood of drivers struggling mightily to survive.

Speaker Corey Johnson, Council Members Diaz, Lander, and Levin deserve immense credit for spearheading a

24

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

2.2

comprehensive reform that will achieve a better

balance between supply and demand, between the

incomes of workers and the profits of corporations

between the public good and private interests. With

that said, I proudly vote aye on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Treyger?

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

Public Advocate. I first want to thank Speaker

Johnson and his Chief of Staff Jason Goldman, also

Laura Popa, for being very accessible, responsive to
a number of my questions in regards to this package
of bills. There— some of my colleagues mentioned

before about studies. There have been previous

studies on the impact for-hire vehicles have had on

New York City. What makes, I believe, this approach
unique is that at the conclusion of this study/pause
period, there will be a set of recommendations and
regulations made, and I believe that this City

Council reserves the right to use its oversight power
if the regulations go too far or don't go far enough.

2	That's a part of our job and responsibility, and TLC
3	has a job and a responsibility. So I believe that
4	the Speaker and the bill sponsors found the right
5	balance to make sure that there is no sacred cow that
6	industries need to understand that there is need for
7	sensible regulations in place. The numbers of for-
8	hire vehicles have skyrocketed. We understand there
9	are transportation needs, but there are also other
LO	issues baked into these bills with regards to labor
L1	standards. So, I think that the Speaker and the
L2	bills have found the right balance. And with regards
L3	to the taxi industry, we also need more from them as
L 4	well. As my colleagues noted, there have been
L5	documented cases of denial of service to people of
L6	color, and denial of services to people in the outer
L7	boroughs. That's got to change. That must change.
L8	We expect better from all stakeholders in this
L 9	conversation. So, with that, I vote aye on all with
20	the exception of Intro. 958A. Thank you.
21	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
22	COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich?
23	COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Madam Public
2.4	Advocate, may I be briefly excused to explain my

vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: 2 Yes.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Alright, thank 4 you very much. My colleagues, I represent the great 5 borough of Queens, and I represent many neighborhoods 6 which have been called by many "transportation 7 deserts." We don't have the luxury that some of my other colleagues have of having multiple subway lines 8 beneath our feet and adequate bus service. 9 In fact, we don't have adequate public transportation in so 10 many parts of my district and in so many other 11 12 neighborhoods throughout the outer boroughs. That is why I am voting against Intro. 144B, because I think 13 14 that by putting the one-year moratorium on new for-15 hire vehicle licenses, we're going to be leaving 16 thousands of New Yorkers stranded who rely on Uber, 17 who rely on Lyft, who rely on it to get to school, to 18 get to work, to get from point A to point B, because our public transportation system and the MTA has 19 20 failed them. unfortunately, the yellow cabs in New York City, it's a very nostalgic thing, but it is a 21 2.2 declining industry with an outdated business model, 23 and by placing the cap on new licenses for for-hire vehicles, that would be the equivalent of the City 24 Council deciding that we're going to put a cap on

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 111 2 Netflix subscription because we're worried about 3 Blockbusters that are closing. Technology changes. 4 Society changes. The economy changes. This is a free market and we have to be able to move with the market. The fact that we're now capping for one year 6 instead of waiting for this study to come back, we're also going to be limiting thousands of New Yorkers 8 from bringing in extra income that they work hard for 9 that they need to sustain themselves and to support 10 11 their families. And so I am voting against 144B. 12 I'm voting in favor of the other pieces of 13 legislation that are included in this package, 14 because I think they have -- they strike the right 15 balance, but 144B, I think does a disservice to the 16 thousands of New Yorkers in the outer boroughs who 17 rely on these app-based transportation alternatives, 18 and also is going to hurt financially a lot of New Yorkers who are simply struggling to make ends meet. 19 20 Thank you very much. 21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. 2.2 COUNCIL CLERK: Williams? 23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: May I be

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes

excused to explain my vote?

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you,

Madam Public Advocate. I am a user of the platforms,

Lyft in particular. My brother has driven for, albeit not in this state. I also have got a yellow cab suspended for not picking me up, primarily because I was black, for about six months. So, I do want to always just admonish the yellow cab service for not providing the service needed in all five boroughs, and also not picking people up because of their race. Yet, and still, I believe the City Government has failed the drivers and their industry, and this year-long cap while we figure it out, for it [sic] is very valuable. I have not seen any evidence to suggest that prices would go up for users or that this will hurt certain areas. It seems to me if there's 80 to 100,000 people on the streets now and we have a cap for a year, and only 40 percent of the cars are full at any time, there won't be dereliction of service. People might just get more money if they're a driver because they'd be able to pick up more folks. I am glad that the Council is not intending to take away service from the outer boroughs. We've given TLC the power to address the cap if New Yorkers do begin to lose their service.

1 2 And if I am here, hopefully I won't be, but if I am, 3 I plan to hold them accountable so that all communities have access. I do want to thank all the 4 civil rights group who raised issues such as NAN and 5 NAACP about the concerns I have raised, and I'm glad 6 7 that it has led to Office of Inclusion. But just for the Netflix and Blockbuster comparison, it's rather 8 if the government had specifically told Blockbuster 9 you have to do all of these hoops to survive, and 10 then allowed Netflix in without any of those hoops. 11 12 And so right now, I believe we are just balancing it. 13 I think everyone agreed there should be something 14 The best way to do that is this pause. 15 think one year will not harm anyone. Lastly, I do 16 want to say thank you to Council Member Rodriguez, 17 because I know this is very hard, and he did do a lot 18 of work. Unfortunately, I came in expecting to vote I still can't support it, because I 19 no on this. 20 think we are not doing as much as we should be for affordable housing. That has been my mantra. 2.1 2.2 have failed when it comes to MIH. I hope like this 23 Uber cap, this body will reopen MIH, because it's not producing what it should be. However, I am--24

everyone knows I encourage protests, so I have no

2.2

problem with that, but I did see a picture that disturbed me, which was a death threat sent to my colleague of someone cutting someone's throat. I believe that is too far. If someone has received unsavory mail, I know how uncomfortable that is. So, I want to change what I was going to vote to no to an abstention, and hopefully just to send a notice that we need to have better ways of communicating. That way is off limits as far as I'm concerned. So, with that I'll be voting aye on all the rest.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Yeger?

COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Madam President, may I be excused to explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you. The e-hail industry, it's what they call it now, for-hire vehicle as what we've called it here, I think most members here in the Council, most New Yorkers recognize that they've provided a valuable service.

They still provide a valuable service. The district I represent I can get from my home to the City by subway in 45 minutes. I do that often. If I want to go from my house to my district office, I can take an

25

2 hour city bus ride, or I can drive there and be there 3 in about 10-12 minutes. So, to the notion that 4 perhaps we don't need these or we want to cap them or we want to drive them out of existence, I think that's a falsehood. It's just not true. What we're 6 7 doing here is a moratorium, as some of my colleagues have called it. I think it's a valid term. In every 8 civilized society we have to have regulation. 9 what we do here, and every industry needs regulation. 10 If you open up a restaurant, it needs to be 11 12 regulated. This is an industry that currently 13 doesn't have regulation. It doesn't mean they're 14 bad. It just means that they have to be regulated. 15 So that's what we're doing. Now, I would have 16 preferred that the language in 144, instead of an 17 optional "may" with respect to section E where the 18 Taxi and Limousine Commission "may" issue additional licenses upon a determination that outer borough 19 20 services being hurt, I would prefer that it be "shall." But I also know that as Mr. Speaker 21 2.2 indicated when we spoke earlier today, and as many of 23 my colleagues did and as the Administration has indicated that the TLC is aware of the concerns of 24

this Council, and I think the purpose and the intent

25

2 of this bill is obviously, as Mr. Speaker indicated, 3 not to diminish service to New Yorkers. It's not. It's to simply set up a regulatory system which we're 4 5 asking all participants to abide by. The-- with respect to 890-- just another couple seconds, Madam 6 7 President. With respect to 890B, the intent I agree Unfortunately, it is my position, and I'm 8 think I'm right, and if I'm wrong, I'm wrong, but I 9 do not believe that this august body has the legal 10 authority to institute a minimum wage. It doesn't. 11 12 Otherwise, we'd have done it for other industries. We'd have done it for dishwashers and car washers and 13 14 everything else that we could have done it for but we 15 didn't, and as some of my colleagues, including the 16 sponsor, indicated, we're talking about people who 17 are essentially on the IRS Internal Revenue code 18 self-employed. Under New York State Labor Law they're self-employed. To set a scheme of a minimum 19 20 wage for people who are self-employed I do not 21 believe is in the purview of the Council. That is 2.2 something that is reserved for the state on the pre-23 emption. And on 890B, I must vote no. So, Madam Ad-- Madam President, I vote aye on all with the 24

exception of 890B. With respect to my colleagues who

transportation alternatives throughout the City of

25

2 New York. I think as a body we have a responsibility and a huge responsibility to communicate information 3 accurately to our constituents, and from what I'm 4 5 hearing and from what I'm hearing from my colleagues, but also constituents, is that somehow we think that 6 7 after today Uber is no longer going to be available in our communities or that our constituents are now 8 going to be stranded in some way or that they're not 9 going to get service. Well, the reality is, Uber as 10 you know it is going to be Uber as you know it. 11 12 same services that you have always had are going to be the same services that you're going to have during 13 this time that we're looking to review, many of these 14 15 app-based services. So, for everyone at home, for 16 everyone that's looking and listening, you are not going to be stranded. Uber is not going away. App-17 18 based opportunities are not going to be taken away from us as a community. So, I just want people to be 19 20 clear on that, because we may have all types of reasons why we may take the positions that we take, 21 2.2 but Uber and many of these other app-based programs 23 are not going to be taken away. We are simply going to look at how to better regulate it, how to better 24

make sure that it's appropriate, and this protects

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

ers and their families, because if we allow it to grow in the way that it is, they're going to continue not to be paid in a way that they can support their families and to continue to grow in the City of New York. I also want to commend Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez. It takes a commendable amount of courage to come forward and to bring forward resources to your community, and to be faced with the level of apprehension, of disrespect, of people coming forward and calling you all types of inappropriate names has got to be very difficult when you're looking to do nothing more than to bring incredible resources to a community that has gone underserved for decades. So, I commend you. appreciate you. I know that this took a tremendous amount of courage, because you come from the communities, you come from the barios [sic], you come from neighborhoods that understand what it means not to have, and you've done a tremendous amount of work that will be appreciated in decades to come.

23

24

you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson?

proudly support you, and I vote age on all.

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you. I vote aye, 3 of course, on all, but I want to just read one thing before we finish the voting today. This comes from 4 the Committee Report on the bills that we're voting 5 on in the for-hire vehicle package. And in the 6 7 Committee Report it says, and this is again to the families who are here today, some of whom traveled 8 great distances: The effect of app-based service has 9 been felt by the traditional for-hire vehicle 10 sector." If folks could be quiet for a second. 11 February 5th, 2018, Doug Shifter [sp?] A livery 12 driver committed suicide outside of City Hall. Hours 13 14 before the incident Mr. Shifter wrote about his 15 experience as a driver indicating that he had to work 16 more than 100 hours a week to make ends meet. 17 Shifter blamed Mayors for allowing a proliferation of 18 vehicles on the street and blamed the TLC for fines that it imposed. This incident uncovered the 19 20 previous death of another TLC worker-- TLC driver, Danello Corpron [sp?] Castillo who took his life on 21 December 20th, 2017, two months earlier after a TLC 2.2 23 hearing where he was facing the possibility of having his licensed revoked. After the death of Mr. 24

Shifter, there were several deaths of other TLC

drivers, suicides. On March 16 th , 2018 Nikinair
[sp?] Ochesor [sp?], a medallion owner and driver,
took his life reportedly because of the debt that he
was facing. Subsequently, Afredo Perez, a livery
driver, took his own life, though little is known
why. We think it is because of the debt that he was
facing. In May of 2018, just a few months ago, Hu
Meng Chau [sp?], Kenny Chau [sp?], a medallion owner,
committed suicide while also facing financial
trouble, and in June of 2018, Abdul Solei [sp?], a
taxi driver also committed suicide. There has been a
real human impact, a real human impact for us not
figuring out how to deal with a regulatory framework
that would allow the for-hire vehicle industry to
exist and grow to meet demand while at the exact same
time ensuring that all workers, all drivers in New
York City are able to make ends meet, and that we are
not abdicating our responsibility by figuring out
ways to protect them. We're doing this for many,
many reasons here today because it is the right thing
to do, but also we do it remembering these
individuals whose lives were tragically cut short.
And with that, I vote aye on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All items on

2.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

11

12

14

13

1516

17

1819

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

today's General Order Calendar were adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative, 0 negative, and 0 abstentions with the exception of Intro. 144B, which was adopted by a vote of 39 in the affirmative, 6 in the negative, and 0 abstentions, and Land Use 135 through 140 and accompanying resolutions, which was adopted by a vote of 43 in the affirmative, 1 negative and 1 abstention, and Land Use 149 and Resolution 492 which was adopted by a vote of 43 in the affirmative, 1 negative, and 1 abstention, and LU 150 and Resolution 493 which was adopted by a vote of 43 in the affirmative, 1 negative, and 1 abstention, and M89 and Resolution 503 which was adopted by a vote of 43 in the affirmative, 2 negative, and 0 abstentions, and Intro. 958A which was adopted by a vote of 42 in the affirmative, 3 negative, and 0

abstentions, and Intro. 1087 which was adopted by a

abstentions, and Intro. 890B which was adopted by a

abstentions, and Resolution 472 which was adopted by

a vote of 44 in the affirmative, 1 negative, and 0

abstentions. Introduction and reading of bills?

vote of 41 in the affirmative, 4 negative, and 0

vote of 42 in the affirmative, 3 negative, and 0

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

1112

13

14

15

16

17 18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

SPEAKER JOHNSON: All bills are referred to committee as indicated on the agenda.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: There are no resolutions. We'll immediately go into General Discussion. There is a revised Land Use Call-up vote, 45 in the affirmative, 0 negative. The first General Discussion will begin with Council Member Kallos.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Good afternoon. It's nice to back from taking a full paternity leave, and I hope we can get this for all of our City employees and that folks who have access to it will take it. Introduction 1,064 will help New York City's effort to end childhood obesity by replacing soda and other unhealthy drinks as the default beverage when ordering children's meals at fast food establishments in New York City. According to Health Department data, roughly half of children in New York City are not at a healthy weight, and 20 to 25 percent are obese. We know that consumption habit are formed early and we can make a big reduction in obesity if children grew up with healthier options. Instead of soda, this legislation calls for default beverage to be either water, low-fat milk, or 100

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 124
2	percent juice. Recently polling showed that 87
3	percent of New Yorkers support making healthy drinks
4	the default for children with 81 percent saying they
5	would be more likely to take their children to a
6	place that has healthier beverages as a default. I
7	want to thank the American Heart Association for
8	their work on this legislation, their partnership to
9	help our kids learn better eating habits, and I
10	encourage my colleagues to sign on. Thank you.
11	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
12	Chambers. We're still in session. Council Member
13	Dromm?
14	COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you very
15	much. I'd just like to give a big shout-out to my
16	intern Karen Nowokoski [sp?]. She's from the Cardozo
17	Law School. She's been working with me in my office
18	since June, and I just want to publicly say thank you
19	to her for all that's she's done for my office.
20	Thank you very much.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

22 Council Member Koo?

21

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you. Today, ${\tt I'm}$ introducing legislation that would develop a cigarette butt receptacle and recycling program for

2 the City of New York. This bill would develop a pilot program of five locations in the City. 3 litter from smoking is a problem, and use of recycling receptacles and the appropriate signage 5 that would provide for the collection and recycling 6 7 of cigarette butts. Cigarette butts litter our streets. They are harmful to wildlife. They pollute 8 our water ways, and they're a detriments to our 9 quality of life. Establishing a recycling program 10 will only improve the cleanliness of our streets, but 11 12 you will create a culture of consciousness in our 13 city. The days of just flicking your cigarette butt 14 in the streets are long gone. New Yorkers care about 15 their environments, and this is another way we can 16 make the impact on an age-old public nuisance. 17 would like to thank Council Members Lander, 18 Koslowitz, and Salamanca for co-sponsoring this effort, and I ask my colleagues to join us today in 19 20 supporting the legislation. I also like to welcome a great youth advocacy organization from my district to 21 2.2 the chambers today, the Korean American Civics 23 Empowerment. Welcome to Angel Kim, Diana Kim who are doing great work to motivate our area's young people 24 to get involved in their communities and to teach 25

them about civic engagement. Finally, I'd like to welcome three of my office summer interns, Grace Ren [sp?], Wesley Chau [sp?], and Cathy Shaw [sp?]. they have done tremendous work in my office these last months working with our local senior centers, helping with constituent services, and learning the inner workings of local government. Thank you for all your great work. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

| Council Member Barron?

2.2

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Madam Public Advocate. First, I want to make an announcement. This Sunday we'll be celebrating my mom's 96th birthday, and--

[applause]

everybody an announcement. If you're available,
you're welcome to come. It'll be at her church.
Secondly, I want to acknowledge the passing of
Elizabeth Ramos who was an advocate for those persons
with disabilities. She was a resident at Starveck
[sic] City. There was a power outage and during that
time, although perhaps not related, she did pass. We
wanted to make acknowledgement of that. She was well-

2	known to those in the disability or special needs
3	community as an advocate in that regard. And
4	finally, in July 2016, off-duty officer Wayne Isaacs
5	shot and killed unarmed Delron Small. He said he had
6	been threatened and punched. However, the video
7	showed another story. Last week, off-duty sergeant
8	Richard Blake shot unarmed Tayvonn Santana [sp?]
9	twice in the head. Sergeant Blake said that he was
10	being robbed. However, the video showed different
11	story. Sergeant Blake and Tayvonn who were known to
12	each other had an encounter and exchanged words, and
13	Sergeant Blake fired twice hitting him in the head,
14	and while Tayvonn laid on the ground, Sergeant
15	Richard Blake dropped an object, supposedly a box
16	cutter, next to the body while it was laying on the
17	ground. Fortunately, Tayvonn survived. He has a
18	shattered jaw and he does have a bullet lodged in him
19	that cannot be removed. We're calling for Sergeant
20	Blake to be fired. We're calling for an indictment.
21	We're calling for a trial, and based on the findings
22	of that trial, we're calling for him to be sent to
23	jail, no other kinds of shenanigans taking place.
24	And we're told that present at the time of this
25	 incident. Sergeant Blake was on disciplinary action.

As a result of disciplinary action he was on probation, even though he was a sergeant. The conditions that the findings had placed him on probation, and we believe if that's the case he doesn't have the entitlements of anything other than a rookie, and he can be fired, and the family and the community are calling for him to be fired and other actions to be taken. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member Levin?

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you, Madam
Public Advocate. I just want to acknowledge, I was
remiss earlier in not acknowledging my staff on my
Council staff who worked very hard on this
legislation, Elizabeth Adams, Johnathan Bouche [sp?],
and Edward Paulino [sp?], and Rami Medal [sp?], my
former Chief of Staff who worked on this legislation
back in 2015. I also want to acknowledge my four
incredible interns this summer, Iqueen [sp?] Smart,
Laura Ann Simpson [sp?], Shamus Hubbard [sp?], and
Shannon Ong [sp?]. I wish them all well in their
endeavors this coming school year. And with that,
have a great rest of the summer everybody.

2.2

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

3 | Council Member Williams?

1

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.

First, I do want to just call up the name of Bill

Howard who passed away today-- I'm sorry, this week.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Sunday.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: He was a staff member to Shirley Chisolm and [inaudible] member and President the WEATICA [sic], the Western Native American Carnival Association [sic]. He will be sorely missed. He was a wealth of knowledge and a great advocate for black and Caribbean history. I also just want to thank everyone who was supportive of me during the trial with Ravi Ragbir [sp?] and me standing in front of [inaudible] to protect him. called me and said I'm sorry that you got found quilty of one of those counts, and I said, I am not because you are still here. Unlike one of the articles I saw, this was not to try to start or encourage any kind of revolution, so to speak. was to show that we have to get out of our comfort zone. I think I achieved that, and also of course achieved Ravi still being here. I do want to say thank you to my interns, Olo Oladentin [sp?],

3

1

4 5

6

8 9

10

11

13

Treyger.

12

14

15

16

17 18

19

20

21

2.2 23

24

25

Keeshawn George [sp?], Zinay Willoughby [sp?], Jalil Rush [sp?], Jaday Glasgow [sp?], and Hung Jung Chao [sp?]. I think Zinay is still here. So thank you so And lastly, I'd like to say to anyone who can hear me and who has debt with a foreclosure with a student loan or their failed business, you are quite eligible and appropriate for you to run for office. As a matter of fact, I think you should run, because you know what normal New Yorkers are going through. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you, Public Advocate. I'm very proud today to introduce Intro. 1085, which would require the Office of the Civil Justice Coordinator to establish programs to provide victims of domestic violence with free full legal representation, which includes the payment of all filing fees in divorce proceedings. Your safety shouldn't be determined by your income. No one should ever have to stay in an abusive marriage just because they can't afford a lawyer. All victims of domestic violence should have free full legal representation during divorce proceedings. We know

1	CITY	COUNCIL	STATED	MEETIN

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

the cost of a divorce can be prohibitive, especially if someone has an abusive partner who is controlling the finances or if someone has an uncertain immigration status. It's time for our city to step up and make sure we're doing everything possible to help victims of domestic violence. And I also note that I was inspired to act after reading a powerful article in the New York Times, and I want to thank our hard-working excellent journalists who really do have the power to shape good, effective, public policy. Thank you very much.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member Yeger?

COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you, Madam President. I'll be brief in recognition of the clock and the empty room. Today I'm introducing Introduction 1088. I think this is the sort of common sense legislation that our council has become known for. It's to protect our streets, our neighborhoods from the unruly construction of utilities, subcontractors, of just anybody who feels they're going to take a shovel and start hammering away at our streets. This bill will require that anybody working at a job site that digs in the street

2	must have on their person a permit, not it's at the
3	office, not it's in a trailer down the block, not my
4	guy's going to get to me, you just stick around, and
5	that they have to product it for a police officers or
6	any authorized employee of the City of New York upon
7	request, upon demand. Common sense, right? Right
8	now, that's not the way it works. I have seen this
9	in my own community. I see a job site. I know they
10	don't have the right to close the street. They have
11	their cones their unmanned, and I go up, I ask for
12	the foreman. Well, he's not here. Well, who's next
13	in charge? Well, that other guys is. Do you have a
14	permit? Yeah, somebody else has a permit. In the
15	meantime, I've already checked, there's no permit to
16	close the street. This will make it a crime to not
17	have that permit on you. If you do not have a
18	permit, you're digging in the street. If not in your
19	pocket, you get handcuffs on you. You get dragged
20	down to the precinct. That's going to make our
21	streets open up again, and it's also going to make
22	utilities pay attention to the law. right now, they
23	can simply jackhammer away whenever they feel like,
24	and if they decide that they, you know, maybe perhaps
25	keeping one lane open is too much work; they throw

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 133
2	down a couple of cones at the corner; call it a day,
3	and shut down a street. And congestion in
4	congested neighborhoods this could literally become
5	the end of traffic or the beginning of traffic, the
6	end of moving around. So, this bill will require
7	construction companies, utility companies,
8	contractors, everybody who's going to take a
9	jackhammer to our streets to be a little more
LO	respectful of our communities, and I urge you all.
L1	Thank you very much, colleagues, for remaining to
L2	sign on to Introduction 1088.
L3	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Mr. Speaker to
L 4	close.
L5	SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you all for being
L6	here today. Have a nice rest of the summer. This
L7	Stated Meeting is now adjourned.
L8	[gavel]
L9	
20	
21	
22	
23	

${\tt C} \ {\tt E} \ {\tt R} \ {\tt T} \ {\tt I} \ {\tt F} \ {\tt I} \ {\tt C} \ {\tt A} \ {\tt T} \ {\tt E}$

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date ____ August 19, 2018