|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Committee on Women and Gender Equity: | Brenda McKinney, *Counsel*Chloë Rivera, *Senior Policy Analyst*Eisha Wright, *Finance Unit Head* |
| Committee on General Welfare: | Aminta Kilawan, *Senior Counsel*Crystal Pond, *Senior Policy Analyst*Natalie Omary, *Policy Analyst*Julia Haramis, *Financial Analyst* |



The Council of the City of New York

**Committee report of the Human Services Divisions**

Jeffrey Baker, *Legislative Director*

Andrea Vazquez, *Deputy Director, Human Services Division*

**Committee on Women and Gender Equity**

Hon. Darma V. Diaz, *Chair*

**Committee on General Welfare**

Hon. Stephen Levin, *Chair*

November 29, 2021

**Oversight: Update on HRA’s System of Domestic Violence Shelters**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Int. No. 2372:** | By Council Members Rivera, Brooks-Powers, Yeger, Brannan, Dinowitz, Van Bramer, Koo, Kallos, Cumbo, Menchaca, Rosenthal, Ampry-Samuel, Adams, Ayala, Louis, Grodenchik, Gibson, Levine, D. Diaz, Cornegy, Rose, Lander, Chin, Koslowitz, Feliz, Powers, Salamanca and Reynoso |
| **Title:** | A Local Law to amend the administrative code of the city of New York, in relation to creating a two year look-back window to the gender-motivated violence act, and extending its statute of limitations |
| **Proposed Int. No. 2424-A:** | By Council Member Rosenthal, the Public Advocate (Mr. Williams) and Council Members Van Bramer, Kallos and Brooks-Powers |
| **Title:** | A Local Law to amend the administrative code of the city of New York, in relation to establishing a street harassment advisory board |

1. **Introduction**

On November 29, 2021, the Committee on Women and Gender Equity, chaired by Council Member Darma V. Diaz, and the Committee on General Welfare, chaired by Council Member Stephen Levin, will hold a joint oversight hearing on the New York City (“NYC” or “City”) Human Resource Administration’s (“HRA” or “Administration”) System of Domestic Violence Shelters. The Committees last held a joint hearing on this topic in September of 2019. The Committees will also hear Introduction Number 2372 (Int. 2372), sponsored by Council Member Carlina Rivera, in relation to creating a two year look-back window to the gender-motivated violence act, and extending its statute of limitations, and Introduction Number 2424-A, sponsored by Council Member Helen Rosenthal, a proposed local law in relation to to establishing a street harassment advisory board. Witnesses invited to testify include representatives from HRA and the Mayor’s Office to End Domestic and Gender-Based Violence (ENDGBV), as well as survivors of domestic violence, local legal service providers, advocates and experts in the field of domestic violence, gender-based violence and gender equity, and other interested stakeholders.

1. **Background**

Domestic violence (DV), which is a crime in the state of New York,[[1]](#footnote-1) is a pattern of economic, emotional, physical and sexual abuse and other behaviors intended to exert power and control, committed against members of the same family or household or individuals who are or have been in an intimate relationship.[[2]](#footnote-2) Intimate partner violence (IPV), a subset of DV, refers to a pattern of abusive behavior involving victims and offenders who are married, formerly married, have a child in common, or are involved in an intimate relationship to gain or maintain power and control.[[3]](#footnote-3) DV and IPV occur in all settings and among all cultural, religious and socioeconomic groups, but disproportionately affect those who are vulnerable and marginalized, including women, members of the LGBTQI+[[4]](#footnote-4) community, and racial and ethnic minorities.[[5]](#footnote-5) Victims[[6]](#footnote-6) of DV often feel stuck in abusive relationships, as any action they take may have immediate and disruptive consequences, such as removal from the home, for them and their family.[[7]](#footnote-7) For this reason, many DV victims tend to minimize or hide their abuse.[[8]](#footnote-8)

In the United States (U.S.), DV and IPV are major health problems affecting more than 10 million adults annually.[[9]](#footnote-9) According to the U.S. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC), approximately one-in-four women (25.1 percent or 30 million) and nearly one-in-ten men (10.9 percent or 12.1 million) in the U.S. experienced sexual violence, physical violence, and/or staking by an intimate partner and reported an IPV-related impact, such as being concerned for their safety, posttraumatic stress disorder (PTSD) symptoms, injury, or needing victim services during their lifetime.[[10]](#footnote-10)

Moreover, data collected during the COVID-19 pandemic suggests that DV rates increased significantly while movement restrictions aimed to stop the spread of the coronavirus were in effect.[[11]](#footnote-11) An analysis by the National Commission on COVID-19 and Criminal Justice found that DV incidents rose in the U.S. by about 8.1 percent after the imposition of pandemic-related lockdowns.[[12]](#footnote-12) However, DV experts caution that this figure is likely much higher as many victims do not report the crimes to police or their complaints are not taken seriously, and stay-at-home orders kept victims from engaging with outsiders who may report signs of abuse or violence.[[13]](#footnote-13)

In NYC, which was an epicenter of the pandemic during spring 2020, stay-at-home orders intensified inequalities and risk factors for survivors who were sheltering in place with an abusive partner or family member, further isolating them from support systems and access to services.[[14]](#footnote-14) Following declines in certain metrics related to domestic disputes during the first week of during stay-at-home orders in New York state[[15]](#footnote-15), once the City’s domestic and gender-based violence (DGBV) providers shifted to working remotely, the numbers of survivors reaching out for assistance significantly increased.[[16]](#footnote-16) Compared to 2019, call volume to the City’s DV hotline increased by 17 percent (14,079 more calls); the number of survivors accessing services for the first time at the NYC Family Justice Centers (FJCs)[[17]](#footnote-17) increased by 35.8 percent (3,231 more first-time clients); and visits to the NYC HOPE[[18]](#footnote-18) website increased 267 percent (87,175 more calls).[[19]](#footnote-19)

While the pandemic had a clear impact on survivors seeking assistance, it does not appear to have had an immediate, obvious impact on DV homicides.[[20]](#footnote-20) In fact, DV homicides decreased from 64 in 2019 to 58 in 2020; other family[[21]](#footnote-21) homicides decreased from 38 in 2019 to 29 in 2020; and though there was an increase of IPV homicides from 26 in 2019 to 29 in 2020, it is consistent with the previous five-year average (29.8) of annual IPV homicides in NYC.[[22]](#footnote-22) However, the neighborhoods that suffered the highest number of IPV homicides were also the ones most impacted by the pandemic, and long-term impacts of the pandemic on DV homicides are not yet known.[[23]](#footnote-23)

From 2010 to 2020, there were 365 IPV homicides and 356 other family homicides, of which the majority (59.6 percent) of victims identified as female.[[24]](#footnote-24) While the majority (76.2 percent) of IPV homicide victims also identified as female, the majority (57.3 percent) of other family homicide victims identified as male.[[25]](#footnote-25) Compared to other race/ethnic groups, a higher proportion of homicide victims were Black; accounting for 49.1 percent of DV homicides, while Hispanic individuals accounted for 28.8 percent of DV homicides.[[26]](#footnote-26) Moreover, Black females were disproportionately affected by IPV homicides. They accounted for 29.6 percent of IPV homicides while making up 13 percent of the City’s population, and Hispanic females accounted for 26.5 percent of IPV homicides while accounting for 14.6 percent of the City’s population.[[27]](#footnote-27)

Additionally, one out of every five (20.1 percent) DV homicides, and two out of every five other family homicides, involved a child age 10 and under.[[28]](#footnote-28) Among the five boroughs, the Bronx had the highest number (211) and highest rate (1.38 per 100,000 residents) of DV homicides.[[29]](#footnote-29) Moreover, the Bronx also had the highest rate (0.94 per 100,000 residents) of IPV homicides, which is almost twice that of the borough with the second-highest rate, Staten Island (0.48 per 100,000 residents).[[30]](#footnote-30)

For IPV homicides between 2010 and 2020, HRA had contact with 21 victims (5.8 percent) who had accessed DV services in the 12 months prior to the homicide.[[31]](#footnote-31) Between 2015 and 2020, HRA had contact with 97 victims (55.4 percent) for services including cash assistance, Supplemental Nutrition Assistance, and Medicaid in the 12 months prior to the homicide.[[32]](#footnote-32) Between 2018 and 2020, HRA had contact with seven victims (8.2 percent) for services related to child support in the 12 months prior to the homicide.[[33]](#footnote-33)

1. **NYC Human Resources Administration**

DV is one of the leading causes of homelessness in NYC, ahead of evictions and overcrowding in shelters.[[34]](#footnote-34) For survivors of domestic violence that require shelter, the Human Resources Administration (HRA) oversees the City’s system of emergency domestic violence shelters. HRA’s domestic violence shelter system is the largest in the nation.[[35]](#footnote-35) HRA’s Office of Domestic Violence (ODV) provides emergency shelter, transitional housing programs and supportive services for survivors of domestic violence and their children.[[36]](#footnote-36) To protect survivors, HRA’s domestic violence shelter locations are kept confidential.[[37]](#footnote-37) Under State law, local social services districts, such as NYC, must provide temporary emergency shelter to survivors of domestic violence. However, State law limits the length of stay at these shelters to 180 consecutive days.[[38]](#footnote-38) During the intake process at the Prevention Assistance and Temporary Housing (PATH) Office, the City’s single intake point for families with children seeking shelter, individuals are asked whether they are applying for shelter in order to seek refuge from domestic violence.[[39]](#footnote-39) Those who report household violence are referred to NoVA staff at PATH, who specifically assist victims of domestic violence.[[40]](#footnote-40) NoVA staff use a set of criteria to determine eligibility based on the following:

* Whether the individual is a domestic violence survivor in accordance with New York Social Services Law § 459 and the definitions and procedures specified in 98-ADM-3;
* Whether there is a relationship between the need for emergency shelter for current safety and the incident of domestic violence; and
* Whether the perpetrator meets the definition of “family or household member” in accordance with NoVA procedures.

If space is available, families will be referred to an HRA domestic violence shelter; if the HRA domestic violence shelters are at capacity, the family will be placed in a DHS family shelter.[[41]](#footnote-41) Domestic violence victims are also referred to PATH for shelter after they time out of a HRA domestic violence shelter and have not found permanent housing. For individuals timing out of a DV shelter and requiring a DHS shelter unit, Local Law 62 of 2014 requires DHS to deem those individuals “presumptively eligible.”[[42]](#footnote-42) While those individuals must still show up at PATH for a shelter placement, they are not required to undergo the full intake process.[[43]](#footnote-43) NoVA workers at PATH additionally make connections for the client to domestic violence providers and Family Justice Centers, and ensure that there is a safety plan in place.[[44]](#footnote-44)

The emergency domestic violence shelter system consists of 46 confidential facilities throughout all five boroughs of New York City with a total bed capacity of 2,514 emergency beds.[[45]](#footnote-45) In 2019, HRA opened two new shelter locations, an emergency shelter and a Tier II shelter which added additional capacity to the network of beds in the system.[[46]](#footnote-46) Additionally, there are 9 DV Tier II/transitional shelter facilities totaling 362 Tier II units, and in 2019 the domestic violence system served 11,123 individuals, which included 418 single adults and 3,919 families, which is defined as both adults and children.[[47]](#footnote-47) In 2019, 4 single adult and 384 families timed out of the DV shelter system in accordance with the State set 90 day limit.

|  |
| --- |
| **HRA’s DV Shelters by Borough**  |
| **Borough**  | **DV Emergency Shelters**  | **DV Tier II Shelters**  |
| Bronx  | 9  | 5  |
| Brooklyn  | 18  | 3  |
| Manhattan  | 11  | 1  |
| Queens  | 5  | 1  |
| Staten Island  | 2  | 0  |
| Total  | 45  | 10  |
| *Source: HRA*  |

At the beginning of the COVID-19 pandemic in the spring of 2020, calls to domestic violence support lines and reports by local police departments responding to domestic incidents dramatically increased across the United States.[[48]](#footnote-48) In New York, DV reports increased 30 percent in April 2020, compared to the previous year, and the Governor assembled a taskforce to submit recommendations in response to these increases in May of 2020.[[49]](#footnote-49) According to the report released by the taskforce in June 2020, data reported by law enforcement and domestic violence service providers reflected an increase in domestic violence cases in the first few months of the pandemic, with the New York State Domestic & Sexual Violence Hotline recording a 33 percent increase in calls for April 2020 compared to April 2019, and shelter occupancy rates upstate rising to 78 percent in April 2020, versus 59 percent in April 2019.[[50]](#footnote-50) As reported by the State Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance, DV residential program data showed that between December 2020 and June 2021, there were 48 self-reported cases, within the statewide system of 3,325 beds across the 93 licensed programs.[[51]](#footnote-51) Due to privacy laws in place for the protection of survivors, much of the state data compiled on this population relies on self-reporting.[[52]](#footnote-52) The taskforce recommended that the Governor make investments to state agencies to support mobile advocacy through technology, including that chat and text be added as permanent fixtures to the state hotline for DV support. Further, the report recommended that funding to programs that support survivors be flexible to include, but not be limited to, safety, transportation and housing stability.[[53]](#footnote-53)

1. **Mayor’s Office to End Domestic and Gender-Based Violence**

ENDGBV develops policies and programs, provides training and prevention education, conducts research and evaluations and performs community outreach around domestic and gender-based violence.[[54]](#footnote-54) ENDGBV also operates the FJCs, which are multi-disciplinary service centers in each borough, providing social services, civil, legal and criminal justice assistance for victims and survivors of domestic and gender-based violence and their children. This assistance includes, but is not limited to, safety planning, counseling, practical assistance, economic empowerment, housing/shelter advocacy and health and mental health services.[[55]](#footnote-55) Through collaboration with City agencies and community stakeholders, ENDGBV works to ensure access to inclusive services for victims and survivors of domestic and gender-based violence.[[56]](#footnote-56) In May of 2020, the Mayor’s Office announced a microgrant pilot program between ENDGBV and provider Sanctuary for Families to support survivors during the pandemic.[[57]](#footnote-57)

1. **Budget**

As of the Fiscal 2022 Adopted Plan, HRA’s DV services program area has a budget of $153 million for Fiscal 2022, $161 million for Fiscal 2023, $161.6 million for Fiscal 2024, and $161 million for Fiscal 2025. The Fiscal 2022 budget is supported by 58.1 percent federal funding, 27 percent City tax-levy, and 14.9 percent in State funding. Of the $153 million budgeted for Fiscal 2022, $75 million is budgeted for 45 DV Emergency Shelters, $29 million for 10 DV Tier II Shelters, $13 million for non-residential DV support services, $7.1 million is budgeted for ENDGBV staffing costs for approximately 91 positions, and $12.3 million is budgeted for ENDGBV’s operational costs. For Fiscal 2022, the total budgeted headcount for HRA’s DV Services program area is 247 positions. For the past few fiscal years, actual spending has been in line with the budgeted amount for HRA’s DV services program area.

1. **Conclusion**

At today’s hearing, the Committees will explore the latest updates within HRA’s DV Shelter system, including whether there is sufficient capacity to meet the need and explore what happens when survivors must enter the general homeless shelter system. The Committees will also examine what the City is currently doing to enhance domestic violence services, especially in accommodating new or shifting needs for families during the pandemic and re-openings of in person services and programs.

1. **Bill Analysis**

Int. 2424

Int. 2424 would establish a street harassment advisory board (Board) to make recommendations for the prevention of street harassment in the city to the Mayor and the Speaker of the Council. The Board would not be permitted to recommend criminalization of any act, omission or status. The Executive Director of the Commission on Gender Equity or the Executive Director’s designee would serve as chair of the Board. The Mayor and the Speaker would appoint additional board members with relevant expertise. Each year, the Board would be required to publish a report of its recommendations for legislation and policy. If passed, the bill would take effect immediately.

Int. 2372

 Int. 2372 would give survivors of gender-motivated acts of violence more time to pursue civil actions by extending the statute of limitations and clarify that the law applies to such acts committed by parties who direct, enable, participate in, or conspire in a gender-motivated act of violence. If passed, the bill would take effect immediately.

Int. No. 2372

By Council Members Rivera, Brooks-Powers, Yeger, Brannan, Dinowitz, Van Bramer, Koo, Kallos, Cumbo, Menchaca, Rosenthal, Ampry-Samuel, Adams, Ayala, Louis, Grodenchik, Gibson, Levine, D. Diaz, Cornegy, Rose, Lander, Chin, Koslowitz, Feliz, Powers, Salamanca and Reynoso

A Local Law to amend the administrative code of the city of New York, in relation to creating a two year look-back window to the gender-motivated violence act, and extending its statute of limitations

Be it enacted by the Council as follows:

Section 1. Paragraph a of section 8-905 of the administrative code of the city of New York, as added by local law number 73 for the year 2000, is amended to read as follows:

2. A civil action under this chapter must be commenced within seven years after the alleged crime of violence motivated by gender as defined in section 8-903 of this chapter occurred. If, however, due to injury or disability resulting from an act or acts giving rise to a cause of action under this chapter, or due to infancy as defined in the civil procedure law and rules, a person entitled to commence an action under this chapter is unable to do so at the time such cause of action accrues, then the time within which the action must be commenced shall be extended to [seven] nine years after the inability to commence the action ceases. Notwithstanding any provision of law which imposes a period of limitation to the contrary, any civil claim or cause of action brought under this chapter which is barred because the applicable period of limitation has expired or the plaintiff previously failed to file a notice of claim or a notice of intention to file a claim or action thereon may be commenced not earlier than six months after, and not later than two years and six months after, January 1, 2022.

§ 2. This local law takes effect immediately.

LS 17,189

3/11/21

MKW

Proposed Int. No. 2424-A

By Council Member Rosenthal, the Public Advocate (Mr. Williams) and Council Members Van Bramer, Kallos and Brooks-Powers

..Title

A Local Law to amend the administrative code of the city of New York, in relation to establishing a street harassment advisory board

..Body

Be it enacted by the Council as follows:

Section 1. Chapter 1 of title 10 of the administrative code of the city of New York is amended by adding a new section 10-182 to read as follows:

§ 10-182 Street harassment advisory board. a. Definitions. For purposes of this section, the following terms have the following meanings:

Advisory board. The term “advisory board” means the street harassment advisory board established pursuant to this section.

Street harassment. The term “street harassment” means unwanted or unwelcome disrespectful, offensive or threatening statements, gestures or other conduct directed at a natural person in public based on the person’s actual or perceived age, race, creed, color, national origin, gender, disability, sexual orientation or any other trait, status or condition.

b. Advisory board established. There shall be an advisory board to advise the mayor and the council on the issue of street harassment in the city.

c. Duties. The advisory board shall have the following duties, subject to subdivision h of this section:

1. To study the occurrence of street harassment;

2. To identify persons most at risk of street harassment;

3. To develop and recommend policies and training materials for appropriate agencies to prevent and respond to street harassment;

4. To develop and recommend policies and education materials to promote public awareness and prevention of street harassment;

5. To develop and recommend forms of redress for victims of street harassment;

6. No later than 1 year after the effective date of the local law that added this section, and as frequently thereafter as the advisory board determines is necessary to fulfill the duties assigned in subdivision c of this section, to conduct a survey regarding the occurrence of street harassment. The advisory board shall determine the specific data elements to be collected in such survey, and shall collaborate with the commission on gender equity to conduct such survey;

7. No later than December 31 of each year, to submit a report to the mayor and the speaker of the council that contains a summary of the advisory board’s activities for the prior year, the advisory board’s recommendations for legislation and policy, a list of materials the advisory board considered to make its recommendations, including a summary of findings of any survey conducted pursuant to paragraph 6 of this subdivision in the prior year, and the projected costs of implementing any recommendations; and to post the advisory board’s report on the website of the commission on gender equity no later than 10 days after its submission to the mayor and the speaker of the council; and

8. No later than December 31, 2022, to post on the website of the commission on gender equity a resource guide for victims of street harassment, and to update the resource guide as appropriate.

d. Members. The advisory board shall be composed of the following members:

1. The executive director of the commission on gender equity or such director’s designee, who shall serve as chair of the advisory board; and

2. Four members appointed by the mayor, one member appointed by the speaker of the council and one member appointed by the public advocate, each of whom shall have demonstrated expertise on the topic of street harassment prevention.

e. Other participants. The chair may invite officers and representatives of relevant federal, state and local agencies and authorities to participate in the work of the advisory board.

f. Appointments. All appointments required by this section shall be made no later than April 1, 2022. Each member of the advisory board shall serve at the pleasure of the officer who appointed the member for a term of two years. In the event of a vacancy on the advisory board, a successor shall be appointed in the same manner as the original appointment for the remainder of the unexpired term. All members of the advisory board shall serve without compensation.

g. Meetings. 1. The chair shall convene the first meeting of the advisory board no later than May 1, 2022, except that where not all members of the advisory board have been appointed within the time specified in subdivision f, the chair shall convene the first meeting of the advisory board within 10 days of the appointment of a quorum.

2. The advisory board shall meet no less than once each quarter to carry out the duties described in subdivision c.

3. The advisory board may invite, or accept requests from, experts and stakeholders to attend its meetings and to provide testimony and information relevant to its duties.

h. Recommendations not to include criminalization. The advisory board shall not recommend criminalization of any act, omission or status in fulfilling any of the duties assigned in subdivision c of this section.

§ 2.This local law takes effect immediately

NC

LS #7299/11810/17340

11/24/21

1. *See* New York State Unified Court System, Domestic Violence Basics, Court Help (Aug. 13, 2019), *available at* <https://nycourts.gov/courthelp//Safety/DVbasics.shtml>. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. Note: Domestic violence is one part of a larger continuum of issues related to gender-based violence, which includes intimate partner violence, family violence, sexual assault, stalking and human trafficking. *See* United Nations, *What is Domestic Abuse?* (n.d.), *available at* <https://www.un.org/en/coronavirus/what-is-domestic-abuse>; *see also* New York State Office for the Prevention of Domestic Violence, About Domestic Violence (n.d.), *available at* <https://opdv.ny.gov/about-domestic-violence>. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. *Supra* notes 1 & 2. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. Note: LGBTQI+ is an acronym for lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, queer or questioning, and intersex. Other variations of the acronym include but are not limited to other sexualities such as asexual, demisexual, genderqueer, gender fluid, graysexual, pansexual and unassigned at birth. *See* Michael Gold, “The ABCs of L.G.B.T.Q.I.A.+” New York Times (Jun. 21, 2018, updated Jun. 7, 2019), *available at* <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/06/21/style/lgbtq-gender-language.html>. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. *See* World Health Organization, “Understanding and addressing violence against women”(2012), *available at* <http://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/77432/WHO_RHR_12.36_eng.pdf?sequence=1>; M.L., Chen J., & Breiding, M.J, The National Intimate Partner and Sexual Violence: 2010 Findings on Victimization by Sexual Orientation, National Center for Injury Prevention and Control, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (2013), *available at* <https://www.cdc.gov/violenceprevention/pdf/nisvs_sofindings.pdf>; VAWnet: A project of the National Resource Center on Domestic Violence, “The Problem: DV in LGBTQ Communities & Barriers to Safety” (n.d.), *available at* <https://vawnet.org/sc/rates-and-prevalence-dv-lgbtq-communities>; *and* Ashley Abramson, *How COVID-19 may increase domestic violence and child abuse*, Amer. Psych. Society (Apr. 8, 2020), *available at* <https://www.apa.org/topics/covid-19/domestic-violence-child-abuse>. [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
6. Note: This Committee Report utilizes both the terms “victim” and “survivor” to reflect that both are used in the field and the context with which they are used by the source being cited. These terms, however, can take on similar but different meanings based on the jurisdiction or organization using them. *See e.g.,* RAINN, Key Terms or Phrases(n.d.), *available at* <https://www.rainn.org/articles/key-terms-and-phrases>. [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
7. *See* ENDGBV,Introduction to Domestic Violence & GBV(n.d.), *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/site/ocdv/services/introduction-to-domestic-violence-and-gender-based-violence.page>; *and* NYC Department of Health and Mental Hygiene, *Intimate Partner Violence (IPV)* (n.d.), *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/site/doh/providers/resources/public-health-action-kits-ipv.page> [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
8. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-8)
9. M.L., Chen J., & Breiding, M.J, The National Intimate Partner and Sexual Violence: 2010 Findings on Victimization by Sexual Orientation, National Center for Injury Prevention and U.S. Control, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (2013), *available at* <https://www.cdc.gov/violenceprevention/pdf/nisvs_sofindings.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-9)
10. Smith, S.G., Zhang, X., et al., The National Intimate Partner and Sexual Violence Survey: 2015 Data Brief – Updated Release, National Center for Injury Prevention and Control, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (2018), *available at* <https://www.cdc.gov/violenceprevention/pdf/2015data-brief508.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-10)
11. Piquero, A.R., Jennings, W.G., Jemison, et al., Domestic Violence During COVID-19: Evidence from a Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis, National Commission on COVID-19 and Criminal Justice (Feb. 2021), *available at* <https://build.neoninspire.com/counciloncj/wp-content/uploads/sites/96/2021/07/Domestic-Violence-During-COVID-19-February-2021.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-11)
12. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-12)
13. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-13)
14. ENDGBV, New York City Domestic Violence Fatality Review Committee: 2021 Annual Report, Office of NYC Mayor Bill de Blasio (Oct. 2021), *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/ocdv/downloads/pdf/2021-FRC-Annual-Report.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-14)
15. These metrics include the numbers of calls to the City’s DV hotline; a decrease in the number of unique requests for DV shelter, dip in the number of major DV felonies reported to the NYC Police Department (NYPD), and DV arrests by the NYPD, from ENDGBV, New York City Domestic Violence Fatality Review Committee: 2021 Annual Report, Office of NYC Mayor Bill de Blasio (Oct. 2021), *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/ocdv/downloads/pdf/2021-FRC-Annual-Report.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-15)
16. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-16)
17. Note: ENDGBV operates Family Justice Centers (FJCs), which are multi-disciplinary service centers in each borough, providing social services, civil legal and criminal justice assistance for victims and survivors of domestic and gender-based violence and their children, including, but not limited to, safety planning, counseling, practical assistance, economic empowerment, housing/shelter advocacy and health and mental health services. *See* <https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/ocdv/downloads/pdf/2019_Loca_Law_38_2019_Report_final.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-17)
18. Note: NYC HOPE provides educational material and comprehensive information on services available to individuals experiencing dating, domestic, or gender-based violence. *See* ENDGBV, *Resources For Survivors During COVID-19* (n.d.), *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/site/ocdv/get-help/resources-for-survivors-during-covid-19.page>. [↑](#footnote-ref-18)
19. *Supra* note 14. [↑](#footnote-ref-19)
20. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-20)
21. Note: “Other family” refers to individuals who are related by marriage or blood, such as parents/children, siblings, grandparents/grandchildren, cousins, and in-laws. *See Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-21)
22. *Supra* note 14. [↑](#footnote-ref-22)
23. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-23)
24. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-24)
25. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-25)
26. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-26)
27. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-27)
28. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-28)
29. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-29)
30. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-30)
31. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-31)
32. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-32)
33. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-33)
34. Stewart, N., “New York Adding Shelter Options for Homeless Victims of Domestic Abuse,” The New York Times (June 14, 2017) *available at* <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/06/14/nyregion/new-york-domestic-violence-homeless-shelters.html> (last visited Sep. 19, 2019). [↑](#footnote-ref-34)
35. New York City Human Resources Administration, Local Law 83 of 2019 Report (March 2019). [↑](#footnote-ref-35)
36. Human Resources Administration (HRA) 2017 Policy Statement at 11, *available at* <http://www.nyc.gov/html/mancb3/downloads/budget/2019/Human%20Services/HRA/HRA%20Policy%20Statement.pdf> (last visited Sep. 17, 2019). [↑](#footnote-ref-36)
37. Department of Homeless Services, Domestic Violence, *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/site/dhs/prevention/domestic-violence.page> (last visited Sept. 17, 2019). [↑](#footnote-ref-37)
38. The City of New York, “Turning the Tide on Homelessness in New York City” (Feb. 23. 2017) at 8 *available at* <http://www1.nyc.gov/assets/dhs/downloads/pdf/turning-the-tide-on-homelessness.pdf> (hereinafter “Turning the Tide report”) [↑](#footnote-ref-38)
39. Testimony of Grace Bonilla, Commissioner, Human Resources Administration, before the Committee on General Welfare, Oversight: HRA’s System of Domestic Violence Shelters,” (Oct. 30, 2017) *available at* <https://legistar.council.nyc.gov/View.ashx?M=F&ID=5553794&GUID=2FDEC46B-2551-4D93-B250-334B00F18543> [↑](#footnote-ref-39)
40. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-40)
41. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-41)
42. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-42)
43. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-43)
44. Supra note 40. Testimony of Grace Bonilla, Commissioner, Human Resources Administration (Oct. 30, 2017) [↑](#footnote-ref-44)
45. NYC Department of Social Services, LL83 of 2018, Report, 2019 Annual Report on Exits from Domestic Violence Shelters https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/hra/downloads/pdf/local-law-83-dv-exit-report-2020.pdf [↑](#footnote-ref-45)
46. NYC Department of Social Services, LL83 of 2018, Report, 2019 Annual Report on Exits from Domestic Violence Shelters https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/hra/downloads/pdf/local-law-83-dv-exit-report-2020.pdf [↑](#footnote-ref-46)
47. NYC Department of Social Services, LL83 of 2018, Report, 2019 Annual Report on Exits from Domestic Violence Shelters https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/hra/downloads/pdf/local-law-83-dv-exit-report-2020.pdf [↑](#footnote-ref-47)
48. Kluger, Jeffrey, Domestic Violence Is a Pandemic Within the COVID-19 Pandemic, Time.com, Feb. 2021 https://time.com/5928539/domestic-violence-covid-19/ [↑](#footnote-ref-48)
49. New York State, Office of the Governor, “Following Spike in Domestic Violence During COVID-19 Pandemic…Launch Taskforce” May 20, 2020 https://www.governor.ny.gov/news/following-spike-domestic-violence-during-covid-19-pandemic-secretary-governor-melissa-derosa [↑](#footnote-ref-49)
50. New York State Office of the Governor, “Recommendations to Reimagine New York’s Approach to Services for DV Survivors” June 11, 2020 https://www.governor.ny.gov/news/secretary-governor-melissa-derosa-issues-report-governor-outlining-covid-19-domestic-violence [↑](#footnote-ref-50)
51. COVID-19 Homeless Population Pandemic Report, New York State Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance, 2021 https://otda.ny.gov/covid-19/homeless-population-report.asp [↑](#footnote-ref-51)
52. COVID-19 Homeless Population Pandemic Report, New York State Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance, 2021 https://otda.ny.gov/covid-19/homeless-population-report.asp [↑](#footnote-ref-52)
53. New York State Office of the Governor, Recommendations to Reimagine New York’s Approach to Services for DV Survivors” June 11, 2020 https://www.governor.ny.gov/news/secretary-governor-melissa-derosa-issues-report-governor-outlining-covid-19-domestic-violence [↑](#footnote-ref-53)
54. ENDGBV, About ENDGBV, Office of NYC Mayor Bill de Blasio (n.d.), *available at* <https://www1.nyc.gov/site/ocdv/about/about-endgbv.page>. [↑](#footnote-ref-54)
55. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-55)
56. *Id.* [↑](#footnote-ref-56)
57. Queram, Kate Elizabeth, “City Provides Grants to Help Domestic Violence Survivors Move” Route Fifty May, 29, 2020 <https://www.route-fifty.com/health-human-services/2020/05/new-york-city-microgrant-domestic-violence-survivors/165773/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-57)