

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

STATED MEETING

----- X

December 8, 2014
Start: 1:25 p.m.
Recess: 3:03 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: LETITIA JAMES
Public Advocate

MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO
Speaker for the Council

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Maria Del Carmen Arroyo
Inez D. Barron
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret S. Chin
Andrew Cohen
Costa G. Constantinides
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Elizabeth S. Crowley
Laurie A. Cumbo
Chaim M. Deutsch
Inez E. Dickens
Daniel Dromm
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.

Mathieu Eugene
Julissa Ferreras
Daniel R. Garodnick
Vincent J. Gentile
Vanessa L. Gibson
Daniel G. Greenfield
Vincent Ignizio
Corey D. Johnson
Ben Kallos
Andy L. King
Peter A. Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Rory I. Lancman
Brad S. Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Alan N. Maisel
Steven Matteo
Darlene Mealy
Carlos Menchaca
Rosie Mendez
I. Daneek Miller
Annabel Palma
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Deborah L. Rose
Helen K. Rosenthal
Ritchie J. Torres
Mark Treyger
Eric A. Ulrich
James Vacca
Paul A. Vallone
James G. Van Bramer
Mark S. Weprin
Jumaane D. Williams
Ruben Wills

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

3

[pause, background noise and sound check]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Okay, we're going to get started. We have one ceremonial before we start our stated meeting. So if we could ask Council Member Van Bramer, we have a ceremonial to the Healing Arts Initiative, which is a non-profit organization dedicated to removing barriers to arts and culture. And, very appropriate as he is the chair of our Cultural Committee. So with that, I'll hand it over to our Majority Leader Jimmy Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker, and on this very powerful day, we would like to ask all of the folks from the Healing Arts Initiative to join us at the front of the room. Healing Arts Initiative is a non-profit arts organization that uses art to remove barriers, particularly for those isolated and marginalized New Yorkers facing--there he goes--some very trying circumstances. And we are thrilled to honor a number of folks from the organization. John and Monty, why don't you stand here. It's very, very exciting to have folks here, and I wanted to thank everyone from the organization for being here. John and Monty here are constituents of mine in Sunnyside, and I saw some

1
2 of Monty's artwork, which was on display at a
3 beautiful show recently. And this organization is
4 doing great work in Queens and throughout the city to
5 make sure that every single person has the ability to
6 express themselves, and to really have their lives
7 enhanced through the power of art. And Monty and his
8 father showed me their artwork. There was a show
9 displaying Monty's artwork, and lots of his friends
10 and colleagues. And we wanted to honor this
11 organization on their 45th anniversary. They were
12 born the same year I was, and they're doing great,
13 treat work throughout the City of New York. And I
14 was very, very touched by seeing Monty's artwork, and
15 the brochure that accompanied the artwork and his
16 wonderful, wonderful skill. And it was beautiful,
17 and we are just so happy that this program is
18 available to Monty and his classmates. And their
19 lives are changed and enhanced because of the work
20 that this organization is doing in such a very, very
21 special way. So thank you to all the staff, and all
22 the folks who are here. Thank you to Monty
23 especially for representing all the students. He's a
24 fixture in Sunnyside, and we all love him very
25 dearly. Monty, your artwork touched me, your

1
2 brochure touched me, and that's why we have to honor
3 you all here today. So thank you, John, his very,
4 very dear father, and all the folks. So with that,
5 we read the Proclamation. We will read the
6 Proclamation.

7 CLERK: Council City of New York
8 Proclamation. Whereas, the Council of the City of
9 New York is proud to honor Healing Arts Initiative
10 for 45 years of inspiring, healing, growth, and
11 learning to engagement in the arts for our city's
12 most underserved populations, and

13 Whereas, since Healing Arts Initiative,
14 formerly known as Hospital Audiences, Inc. was
15 established in 1969 this not-for-profit organization
16 based in Long Island City, Queens has remained
17 committed to make the arts accessible to all New
18 Yorkers especially individuals who are isolated and
19 marginalized due to institutionalization,
20 hospitalization, disability, and illness, as well as
21 at-risk youth in low-income neighborhoods. Each year
22 it serves more than 198,000 underserved individuals
23 with an array of arts, education, and wellness
24 programs, and
25

1
2 Whereas, today Healing Arts Initiative is
3 nationally recognized for its work in areas of arts
4 and healthcare in addition to coordinating live
5 performances at senior centers, nursing homes,
6 hospitals, rehabilitation centers, schools and other
7 social and healthcare facilities. It offers free and
8 low-cost tickets to cultural events, participatory
9 arts workshops to foster creative express and audio
10 description services for blind and visually impaired
11 theater patrons, and

12 Whereas Healing Arts Initiative also
13 presents original music and dance performances to mid
14 to large-scale venues. It recently re-launched its
15 wheelchair accessible program, which facilitates
16 group travel and specially designated buses that can
17 transport ten wheelchairs and an additional 12 non-
18 wheelchair riders. This is the only transport option
19 in New York City for large numbers of wheelchair
20 users, and

21 Whereas, Healing Arts Initiative's art
22 studio program serves as a hub for artists living
23 with mental and emotional challenges. With dedicated
24 studio instructors, participants engage in a wide
25 range of creative endeavors and have unparalleled

1
2 opportunities for community inclusion and personal
3 development. This year studio artists presented at
4 the Outsider Art Fairs in New York and Paris, the
5 NADA Fair in Miami, and the White Columns Gallery and
6 Frieze Art Fair in Manhattan, and

7 Whereas, in April 2014, Healing Arts
8 Initiative arts partnered with the New York Mets to
9 present its first Developmental Disability Awareness
10 Day at City Field, an event that offered artist with
11 mental and developmental disabilities the chance to
12 show their works in front of a large crowd. More
13 than 100 works were exhibited behind the bullpen.
14 Rewards were presented on the field before the game,
15 and the Mets defeated the Cardinals--

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: [interposing]
17 Fair enough, that's---

18 CLERK: --[interposing] And whereas, the
19 arts have long been recognized for their power to
20 bridge differences connecting individuals of
21 different backgrounds and experiences through the
22 shared experience of art, literature, and dance.
23 Thus, healing communities as well as individuals.
24 Healing Arts Initiative has proven this again and
25

1
2 again, and has earned the gratitude of all New
3 Yorkers with its excellent work.

4 Now, therefore, be it known that the
5 Council of the City of New York proudly honors
6 Healing Arts Initiative in celebration of its 45th
7 Anniversary. Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker for the
8 entire Council; Jimmy Van Bramer, the Majority
9 Leader, Council Member 26th District Queens.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you
11 very much, Mr. City Clerk, and I think Joshua Kelly
12 is going to speak on behalf of the organization.

13 JOSHUA KELLY: Thank you, Council Member.
14 It's sort of strange to accept an award with a somber
15 tone, and we appreciate the gravity of the situation.
16 We don't diminish that at all. We do want to thank
17 the Council for everything you're doing to recognize
18 us here today. We love being in Long Island City.
19 It allows us to serve all five boroughs in the city,
20 and HAI goes into nursing homes. We go into group
21 homes, rehabilitation centers. We work with the
22 Veterans Administration. Wherever there is a barrier
23 to access in the arts, we are there to knock that
24 barrier down. We know we've been very like-minded in
25 that mission. So it's great to be here today. Thank

1
2 you to the Speaker and to the Administration, the New
3 York City Department of Cultural Affairs, and the New
4 York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene for
5 allowing us to do what we do. Thank you very much.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Than you very
7 much, and while the-- [applause] While the day is
8 very full of emotion for all of us, we still want to
9 recognize your work, and the difference you're making
10 in Monty's life, and the lives so many other
11 individuals with wellness disabilities and other
12 challenges. So you are changing the world for the
13 better every single day, just as we in the Council
14 have taken a stand today to try and make the world
15 better. So thank you all very, very much, and now I
16 think we'll get closer and take a picture, and thank
17 you all so very much.

18 [pause]

19 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Ladies and gentlemen,
20 can I have your attention, please? At this time,
21 please place all electronic devices to vibrate. All
22 electronic devices to vibrate. Will all non-Council
23 employees with the exception of the Clergy on the
24 floor, please leave the main floor of the chambers.
25 Thank you.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please rise for
the Pledge of Allegiance.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: All rise.

[Pledge of Allegiance]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Roll call.
Please be seated.

CLERK: Arroyo.

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Here.

CLERK: Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER [off mic]

CLERK: Cabrera.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.

CLERK: Chin.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

CLERK: Cohen.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: [off mic] Here.

CLERK: Constantinides.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.

CLERK: Cornegy.

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Present.

CLERK: Crowley.

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Here.

CLERK: Cumbo.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [off mic]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

11

CLERK: Deutsch.
COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Here.
CLERK: Dickens.
COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: [off mic] Here.
CLERK: Dromm.
COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.
CLERK: Espinal.
COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: [off mic]
CLERK: Eugene.
COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Here.
CLERK: Ferreras.
COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: [off mic] Here.
CLERK: Garodnick.
COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: [off mic]
CLERK: Gentile.
COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: [off mic]
CLERK: Gibson.
COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Here.
CLERK: Greenfield.
COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: [off mic]
CLERK: Johnson.
COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Here.
CLERK: Kallos.
COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

STATED MEETING

12

1
2 CLERK: King.
3 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [off mic] Present.
4 CLERK: Koo.
5 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.
6 CLERK: Koslowitz.
7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.
8 CLERK: Lancman.
9 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: [off mic]
10 CLERK: Lander.
11 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.
12 CLERK: Levin.
13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [off mic]
14 CLERK: Levine.
15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.
16 CLERK: Maisel.
17 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: [off mic] Here.
18 CLERK: Matteo.
19 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: [off mic]
20 CLERK: Mealy.
21 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [off mic]
22 CLERK: Menchaca.
23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.
24 CLERK: Mendez.
25 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

CLERK: Miller.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Here.

CLERK: Palma.

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: [off mic] Here.

CLERK: Reynoso.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: [off mic] Here.

CLERK: Richards.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

CLERK: Rodriguez.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [off mic]

Here.

CLERK: Rose.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.

CLERK: Rosenthal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.

CLERK: Torres.

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Here.

CLERK: Treyger.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: [off mic]

CLERK: Garodnick.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.

CLERK: Ulrich.

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: [off mic]

CLERK: Vacca.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

14

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: [off mic]

CLERK: Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.

CLERK: Vallone.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

CLERK: Weprin.

COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Here.

CLERK: Williams.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [off mic]

Here.

CLERK: Wills.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Present.

CLERK: Ignizio.

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: [off mic]

CLERK: Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: [off mic]

Here.

CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I'm here.

[pause]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please rise for
the Invocation delivered by Reverend Peter Heltzel,
Associate Pastor of Theology, New York Theological
Seminary, 475 Riverside Drive in New York.

1
2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Rise, please.

3 REVEREND HELTZEL: Let us pray. God, oh,
4 merciful one, whose glory is in all the world. We
5 commend New York City to your merciful care. While
6 being guided by your providence may we dwell secure
7 in your peace. Grant to Mayor de Blasio wisdom and
8 strength as he governs New York City in ways of
9 wisdom and light. Energize Public Advocate James, as
10 she advocates for the homeless and hurting,
11 especially our children of color. This day we pray
12 that your Holy Spirit would fall upon Speaker Mark-
13 Viverito, and each member of the City Council of New
14 York and their staffers blessing them with the spirit
15 of wisdom, charity, and justice. That with steadfast
16 purpose they may faithfully serve in their offices
17 and promote the wellbeing of all New Yorkers. We
18 thank you, Oh, Lord, for their public service, hard
19 work and long days and sleepless nights. Fill them
20 with a love of truth and righteousness and make them
21 ever mindful of their calling to serve this city with
22 a deep reverence of you, our Creator and our
23 Redeemer. We commend to your compassionate care all
24 those who are in any way afflicted or distressed in
25 mind, body, or estate. Particularly the family and

1
2 friends of Eric Garner. I can't breathe. We can't
3 breathe. God can't breathe. Saint Paul says when
4 one member suffers all suffer together. If one
5 member is honored, all rejoice together. Oh, God,
6 make and mold our broken hearts into a citywide
7 movement for real police reform working for the
8 restoration of a broken Criminal Justice System.
9 Gracious God, look with compassion on the whole human
10 family in New York City. Take away the arrogance and
11 hatred, which infects our hearts. Break down the
12 walls that separate us. Unite us, elected officials,
13 labor unions, community groups, and faith leaders in
14 the bonds of love. That through our work of
15 collective action to build a more beloved city, that
16 New York City could shine as a beacon of hope to New
17 York State, to the nation, and to the world. We pray
18 this, oh, God in your holy name. Amen.

19 COUNCIL MEMBERS: [chorus of amen]

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be
21 seated. A motion to spread the Invocation? Council
22 Member Levine.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you, Madam
24 Public Advocate, I would indeed like to make a motion
25 to spread the Invocation in full upon the record.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Messages and papers from the Mayor.

[pause]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Adoption of Minutes, Council Member Treyger. Motion that the Minutes of the Stated Meeting of November 13th be adopted as printed. Messages and papers from the Mayor.

CLERK: None.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication from City, County, and Borough Offices.

CLERK: M-202 Proposed Maritime Lease.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Landmarks, Public Siting, and Maritime Uses.

CLERK: M-203 through M-210 on page 2, Bay Station Licenses.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Transportation.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and Communications.

CLERK: None.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use Call Ups.

CLERK: None.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
Chambers.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We will now hear
from Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Good afternoon,
and buenas tardes, Madam Public Advocate, and to all
my colleagues, I want to thank Reverend Heltzel, and
all the clergy that have joined us here today in
spreading your love and prayers to this body. I'd
like to ask my colleagues and everyone that is here
to please rise.

[pause]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: So 11 times, 11
times Eric Garner cried for help, and 11 times his
cries went unheard. I can't breathe. I can't
breathe.

COUNCIL MEMBERS/AUDIENCE: [Echoes] I
can't breathe.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I can't breathe.

COUNCIL MEMBERS/AUDIENCE: [Echoes] I
can't breathe.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I can't breathe

COUNCIL MEMBERS/AUDIENCE: [Echoes] I
can't breathe.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I can't breathe

COUNCIL MEMBERS/AUDIENCE: [Echoes] I

can't breathe.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I can't breathe

COUNCIL MEMBERS/AUDIENCE: [Echoes] I

can't breathe.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I can't breathe

COUNCIL MEMBERS/AUDIENCE: [Echoes] I

can't breathe.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I can't breathe

COUNCIL MEMBERS/AUDIENCE: [Echoes] I

can't breathe.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I can't breathe

COUNCIL MEMBERS/AUDIENCE: [Echoes] I

can't breathe.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I can't breathe

COUNCIL MEMBERS/AUDIENCE: [Echoes] I

can't breathe.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I can't breathe

COUNCIL MEMBERS/AUDIENCE: [Echoes] I

can't breathe.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We needed to
start today and begin this session by making note of
the ongoing debate related to Eric Garner's death.

1
2 We are clearly at a crossroads in this city, and in
3 this nation. And the spontaneous and not so
4 spontaneous actions that we have seen erupt reflect
5 that. We have seen this past month and throughout
6 history the effects of the justice system that
7 predictably buckles when a shield is involved, and
8 unarmed Black, Latino, or Asian is left dead. What
9 happened to Eric Garner was not justice. The law
10 enforcement fears the communities they are sworn to
11 protect. That is not justice. When communities of
12 color cannot always trust the police to work with
13 them when the color of your skin or where you lives
14 makes you a target. When it becomes clear that it's
15 becoming a crime in this city to simply be who you
16 are, that is not justice. A system that produces
17 this much pain is clearly broken. We understand as
18 representatives that are on the ground everyday that
19 the overwhelming majority of police officers serve
20 our city with great honor and distinction and
21 demonstrate respect for members of our community.
22 But still, we must be clear that those officers who
23 violate that sense of respect and trust must be held
24 accountable for their actions.

1
2 I'm proud that this City Council has a
3 history of taking the lead on police community
4 relations, and on the demand for reform, and
5 accountability. And we're going to take the steps
6 needed to uproot the systematic bias so engrained in
7 our society to make sure that tragedies like these do
8 not happen again. That families like Garner and all
9 others that have borne this pain don't have to go
10 through that again. This Chamber has led on the
11 issue, and will continue to do so moving forward, and
12 with that I ask my colleagues for a moment of
13 silence.

14 [pause for a moment of silence]

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, my
16 Colleagues.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated.

18 [background noise]

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And I know that
20 after a statement like that I want to be clear that
21 we have a commitment to do the work that we need to
22 do in terms of oversight, and making solid and
23 substantive recommendations, policy recommendations
24 that we do expect this Administration to embrace.
25 But at the same time, there is other of business that

1
2 I would like to proceed on, and hopefully in the
3 sense of the spirit that we're in, we could try to
4 get through this as quickly as possible. There are
5 some other important, very important matters that we
6 wanted to at least bring up. And I don't want that--
7 So today, the Council is going to voting on
8 legislation to change the City's Energy Code. State
9 Law has empowered New York City to create our own
10 energy Code, and Introduction 550-A sponsored by
11 Council Member Jumaane Williams by request of the
12 Mayor will do just that. This bill increases energy
13 efficiency standards and updates all policies to
14 create a more efficient and sustainable New York
15 City. [coughs] I would like to thank Jeff Baker, Ed
16 Atkins, Jim Wilcox, Raju Qadri [sp?], Jose Conde, and
17 Regina Aguilar [sic] for their work on this
18 legislation. And not sure if Council Member Jumaane
19 Williams would like to say a few words.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I would like to
21 thank the Mayor and the Speaker and my colleagues for
22 quickly passing Intro 550-A, a bill that will update
23 the City's Energy Conservation Construction Code.
24 When enacted, the code revisions will yield and
25 energy savings of almost 18.2% to building owners

1
2 across the city. It will bring us one step closer to
3 achieving the Mayor's One City Built to Last,
4 transforming New York City's building for a low
5 carbon future. It makes our code more stringent than
6 the State's. Again, I want to thank the Mayor and
7 the speaker. And I want to thank the Speaker and
8 this body for doing so much to recognize that Black
9 lives matter, and making sure that was a part of the
10 Stated Meeting today. So thank you for your
11 leadership on the Energy Conservation Code.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
13 Council Member. Today, we are also voting on a major
14 piece of legislation that will help affirm the basic
15 human rights of transgender New Yorkers, and will go
16 a long way in addressing disparities faced by
17 transgender individuals. Introduction 491-A
18 sponsored by Council Member Johnson will allow
19 individuals to change the gender marker on their
20 birth certificate by having a medical or mental
21 health professional file an affidavit or affirmation
22 stating that the changed designation more accurately
23 reflects the applicant's identity. This new policy
24 removes the outdated requirement to undergo
25 convertive surgery prior to changing the gender

1
2 designation on one's birth certificate. This undue
3 burden, which has been faced for far too long, has
4 been a roadblock to transgender New Yorkers seeking
5 employment, health care, or public services.

6 Additionally, Council Member Johnson has
7 sponsored a companion bill, Introduction 492-A, which
8 will create an advisory board made up of transgender
9 advocates and other experts who will ensure this new
10 policy is implemented appropriately, and gauge the
11 need for any further policy changes on this matter.

12 I'm extremely proud that this Council is taking
13 action on legislation such as this, and leading the
14 way to creating a more inclusive and equal New York
15 City for all. I would like to thank Dan Hafetz,
16 Crystal Pond, Lyle Frank, and Terzah Nasser for their
17 work on this bill, and Council Member Johnson would
18 like to say a few words on it.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Madam
20 Speaker. Today is a difficult day for all of us in
21 this body, and I want to start before I talk about
22 these three important pieces of work in this
23 legislation by saying that I stand in solidarity with
24 my colleagues and that Black lives matter.

1
2 Today, we're taking up two pieces of
3 legislation that will make a tremendous difference in
4 the lives of transgender New Yorkers. Transgender
5 people comprise one of the most disenfranchised
6 communities. And the statistics reflecting this
7 reality is astounding. According to the National
8 Transgender Discrimination Survey, 40% of transgender
9 people have faced harassment when presenting identity
10 documents that did not match their gender identity or
11 expression. The current process for amending the
12 gender marker on birth certificates is antiquated
13 from 1971, and does not recognize the reality of a
14 large majority of transgender individuals who were
15 born in New York. Having such a critical document
16 that correctly reflects your gender identity is a
17 basic human right that too many transgender people
18 have been denied for far too long.

19 This policy is an incredibly important
20 improvement over the 1971 policy. It would bring New
21 York City in line with New York State, the federal
22 government, and a handful of other states. But it
23 would also go farther than others by providing an
24 expansive pool of medical and mental health
25 professionals who can attest to an individual's

1
2 gender. Moreover, it moves beyond the idea that
3 transgender people need treatment in order to have
4 basic rights. Birth certificates are living
5 documents that are used in many contexts to prove
6 identify, age, and citizenship. They are often the
7 only form of identification that low-income New
8 Yorkers have when applying jobs or public benefits.
9 Currently, individuals must present proof of sex
10 reassignment surgery to change the birth certificate,
11 presenting an insurmountable barrier for the vast
12 majority of transgender native New Yorkers who do not
13 undergo surgery and are, therefore, prevented from
14 having accurate birth certificates.

15 Many transgender people face
16 discrimination, harassment, and in some cases
17 violence just for expressing who they are. The
18 Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender Community Center
19 has noted that transgender people are at risk for
20 substantial social stigma, and development
21 disruptions. Creating a cascade of life-long
22 difficulties with health, educational attainment, and
23 economic productivity. Birth certificates can be a
24 foundational trigger for this negative cascade.
25 Without a birth certificate that accurately reflects

1
2 their gender identity, transgender people are
3 routinely forced to disclose their transgender
4 status, resulting in increased difficulty accessing
5 critical services, and opportunities for employment,
6 educational opportunities, and financial services
7 like lines of credit, medical and life insurance
8 policies, marriage licenses, driver's licenses,
9 Social Security benefits and other benefits. They
10 are denied healthcare. They are denied jobs and they
11 are denied other services, and face daily situations
12 that are uncomfortable, embarrassing, and even
13 threatening. It is appalling what these individuals
14 go through just because of who they are. We have a
15 chance to help start to reverse that situation, which
16 is why I urge this Council to adopt these two pieces
17 of legislation.

18 The kinds of stories and experiences that
19 I've heard over the years and the stories that we
20 heard two weeks ago at the Health Committee hearing
21 on Introduction 491 reflect these harsh realities.
22 One young transgender man, who I believe is here with
23 us today, shared at the hearing transitioning as one
24 of the most private things that a person can go
25 through. But being a transgender person often feels

1
2 like having to disclose this private information to
3 everyone around you. I have heard from people whose
4 lives have been impacted in so many ways beyond just
5 access to services and benefits. People are taunted,
6 abused, stigmatized, outed, and have their privacy
7 invaded in countless ways.

8 I want to thank the Speaker for her
9 unconditional support from the beginning of this
10 process. I want to thank the staff, Dan Hafetz,
11 Crystal Pond, Crilhien Francisco, Terzah Nasser, Lyle
12 Frank, Laura Popa, Matt Gewolb, and my Legislative
13 Director, Louis Cholden-Brown. I want to thank Mayor
14 de Blasio for having Dr. Mary Bassett prioritize this
15 and get it done within the first new of the new
16 Council and the new Administration. And I want to
17 say that today in light of everything we're seeing,
18 we have the opportunity to correct an injustice that
19 has stood for far too long. And start to help some
20 of those disenfranchised New Yorkers that exist in
21 our city. I look forward to seeing this passing. I
22 ask all my colleagues for their full support on both
23 bills. Thank you very much, Madam Speaker.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you very
25 much Council Member. And before I concluded, I want

1
2 to take a minute to acknowledge the passing of two
3 great leaders in this city. So I ask my colleagues
4 to rise again. So yesterday, former Bronx Council
5 Member Madeline Provenzano passed away. For 19
6 years, Madeline was Chief of Staff to her predecessor
7 Michael De Marco, and succeeded him when he was elected
8 to the State Supreme Court. Madeline served from
9 1998 also becoming term limited in December 2005.
10 Her successor in the 13th District is our own Jimmy
11 Vacca. Council Member Provenzano was most proud of
12 the funding she was able to bring to her district for
13 many after-school programs, computer labs, and the
14 opening of the first library in Morris Park. And so
15 our thoughts and prayers go out to her and her
16 family.

17 I also want to recognize the passing of
18 Herman Badillo, a real trailblazer of New York City
19 politics. Edmond served as a member of Congress, as
20 the Bronx Borough President, and as Deputy Mayor.
21 Known for so many historic firsts, he was obviously
22 known for fighting for better access to education
23 opportunities. But also fought about increasing and
24 expanding voting rights for many whose barriers have
25 been put up against. So he has many historic first

1
2 historic firsts as Puerto Rican civic leader in New
3 York City. Herman Badillo is placed in history as a
4 leader who dared to hold doors open, and run for
5 elected citywide office is a undeniable, and a credit
6 to him and the community who he championed. So our
7 thoughts go out to the families of these two
8 individuals.

9 [Pause]

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And with that, I
11 conclude communication from the speaker.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Before we begin
13 discussion of General Orders, on behalf of Council
14 Member Koo, I would like welcome Flushing High
15 School. They are in the podium. Their
16 participation-- They are participating today in
17 Government Class, and they are led by their teachers,
18 Mrs. Martha Cruz and Ms. Carolyn Constantinino. We
19 welcome you to City Hall and today you are certainly
20 getting a class in civics, and we thank you for
21 coming to City Hall.

22 For the General Orders, discussion of
23 General Orders I'm calling up Council Member Weprin
24 to vote.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Thank you Madam Public Advocate. I would like unanimous consent via the Council to vote now on the General Orders Calendar, please.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Thank you. I'd like to vote aye on all. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Any others on General Orders, discussion of General Orders? Seeing none, Report of Special Committees.

CLERK: None.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Report of Standing Committees.

CLERK: Report of the Committee on Finance Intro 530, Business Improvement Districts.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on General Orders.

CLERK: Pre-Considered LU 153 and Reso 508 through LU 157 and Reso 512, Various Tax Abatements, Council District 17 and 2.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on General Orders.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

CLERK: Report of the Committee on Health, Intro 491-A, Sex Designation on Birth Records.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and Coupled on General Orders.

CLERK: Intro 492-A, Advisory Board on Gender Marker Change.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and Coupled on General Orders.

CLERK: Report of the Committee on Housing and Buildings, Intro 550-A, Energy Code.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and Coupled on General Orders.

CLERK: Report of the Committee on Land Use, LU 135 and Reso 513, Community Justice Center.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled. To be filed pursuant to letter of withdrawal.

CLERK: LU 138 and Reso 514, Metropolitan Hospital Center.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on General Orders.

CLERK: LU 152 and Reso 515, UDAAP Brooklyn.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

33

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
General Orders.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: General Order
Calendar.

CLERK: Resolution appointing various
persons Commissioner of Deeds.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Coupled on
General Orders, and at this time I ask for a roll
call on all items on the Coupled General Order
Calendar.

CLERK: Arroyo.

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: [off mic]

CLERK: Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [off mic]

CLERK: Cabrera.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Yes, on 550-A.
No on 491 and 492-A.

CLERK: Chin.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.

CLERK: Cohen.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: [off mic]

CLERK: Contantinides.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye on
all.

1
2 CLERK: Cornegy.
3 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye on all.
4 CLERK: Crowley.
5 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye on all.
6 CLERK: Cumbo.
7 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [off mic]
8 CLERK: Deutsch.
9 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Yes, on 550-A.
10 No on 491-A and 492-A.
11 CLERK: Dickens.
12 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye.
13 CLERK: Dromm.
14 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I vote aye on all.
15 CLERK: Espinal.
16 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye on all.
17 CLERK: Eugene.
18 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.
19 CLERK: Ferreras.
20 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: Aye on all.
21 CLERK: Garodnick.
22 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.
23 CLERK: Gentile.
24 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye.
25 CLERK: Gibson.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to explain my vote.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you, Madam Public Advocate. I want to congratulate Council Member Johnson on passage of his bills today. And I also want to congratulate the 161st Business Improvement District in the Bronx, and congratulate Dr. Cary Goodman and all of the board members for their assessment increase. And all of the work that they do to strengthen the Bronx, the vitality of businesses, and the growth and opportunity that 161st Street brings to the Bronx. I'm looking forward to continuing to work with them, and I congratulate them on passage today. And with that, I vote aye on all. Thanks.

CLERK: Greenfield.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: [off mic]

CLERK: Johnson.

COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Aye on all.

CLERK: Kallos.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye on all.

CLERK: King.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: King. Pass.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Pass.

CLERK: Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye on all.

CLERK: Koslowitz.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye on all.

CLERK: Lancman.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye on all.

CLERK: Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Congratulations,

Council Member Johnson for this important civil rights step for members of the transgender community. I vote aye on all.

CLERK: Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to explain my vote.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you. I want to congratulate Council Member Corey Johnson on Intros 291-A and 292-A. These pieces of legislation are going to have a measurable impact on people's lives, which is something we strive to do in this body, and on our better days we do. So I want to congratulate Council member Johnson on taking this

1
2 momentous step in the lives of the transgender
3 community. And with that, I vote aye on all.

4 CLERK: Levine.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Permission to
6 explain my vote.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: I also want to
9 congratulate Council Member Johnson. It's rare these
10 days that we get to say that New York City is at the
11 forefront of progressive policymaking, but you've put
12 us there squarely with this issue. And countless New
13 Yorkers, transgender and others will benefit from
14 this. Thank you all. I proudly vote aye.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
16 Chambers, please.

17 CLERK: Maisel.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: [off mic] I vote
19 aye on all.

20 CLERK: Matteo.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: I vote no on
22 Intro 491-A and aye on the rest.

23 CLERK: Mealy.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [off mic]

25 CLERK: Menchaca.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to explain my vote.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I also want to thank Council Member Johnson for his work on his bills. These bills represent what we are going to continue to do in this body. And as a member of the LGBT Caucus, I couldn't be prouder. I dedicate my vote to Mr. Bryan Ellicott, and vote is aye on all. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

CLERK: Mendez.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I vote aye.

CLERK: Miller.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: [off mic]

CLERK: Palma.

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: [off mic]

CLERK: Reynoso.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.

CLERK: Richards.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.

CLERK: Rodriguez.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [off mic]

Aye.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

CLERK: Rose.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye and
congratulations, Council Member Johnson.

CLERK: Rosenthal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Permission to
explain my vote.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Council Member
Johnson, thank you so much for taking the lead on
this issue, for bringing it to our public attention,
our city's attention, and for getting this bill
passed. I, too, want to dedicate my vote to Bryan
Ellicott. Thank you very much.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet please.

CLERK: Cohen.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
chambers.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: [off mic]

CLERK: Torres.

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Permission to
explain my vote.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I want to
congratulate my colleague, Council Member Johnson for

1
2 making history, and for setting the gold standard of
3 advocacy for transgender New Yorkers. And the beauty
4 of governing here is that as goes New York, so goes
5 the rest of the country. So congratulations. I'm
6 taking my cues from my colleague Carlos. I too, will
7 dedicate my vote to Bryan Ellicott. So there. I
8 vote aye.

9 CLERK: Treyger.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

11 CLERK: Ulrich.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Yes.

13 CLERK: Vacca.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: [off mic]

15 CLERK: Vallone.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Permission to
17 explain my vote.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Once again,
20 congratulations Corey on another amazing piece of
21 legislation. And I want to give a special shout out
22 also to Flushing High School and Peter Koo for
23 bringing them. We get the honors of sharing that
24 high school. And I also want to thank you for having
25 volunteers help me organize the City's great

1
2 Children's Holiday Parade. And a special thank you
3 to our Madam Public Advocate for reading at our
4 Holiday yesterday. Thank you.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on all.

7 CLERK: Williams.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: My I please
9 explain my vote?

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you. I
12 am abstaining on Intro 491-A, but I do want to make
13 sure that you understand that I am doing so as a
14 sixth gender male who has to understand the privilege
15 that he has, and that many are not able to. And I
16 wanted to apologize to Corey Johnson, members of the
17 LGBT community, and Bryan Ellicott and others who
18 will benefit from this for not doing due diligence on
19 questions that I had before this bill was passed.
20 That was my fault and no one else's. So I do want to
21 apologize to them for that. I will be voting aye on
22 all, and I want to congratulate Corey Johnson on his
23 legislation.

24 CLERK: Wills.
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Abstain on 491 and
aye on all the rest.

CLERK: King.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Abstain on all.

[background comment, pause]

CLERK: Ignizio.

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: I vote no on
491-A, and aye on all others.[Pause]

CLERK: Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Permission to
explain--

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: --my vote. I
just wanted to congratulate and thank Council Member
Johnson as well, and say that I think making sure
that every New Yorker including our transgender
family members have all the dignity, all the respect,
and all of the power that they deserve in their life
just as any other New Yorker. It's so important and
the work that Council Member Johnson has done today.
And with the passage of this that unfinished business
of the Civil Rights Movement more broadly speaking is
one step closer to being completed. We have got to

1
2 do everything we can for the transgender community in
3 New York City who are still victims of so much
4 violence and oppression and discrimination. And I
5 think Corey for that, and Bryan has gotten three
6 shout outs already. I'm happy to be a fourth, but I
7 want to dedicate my vote to Rocky Sanabria, who we
8 were--

9 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet
10 please.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: --who we were
12 proud to honor in this Council. Rocky is a now 16-
13 year-old young man who at the age of about four
14 realized that he was transgender. And has done such
15 amazing things, and we honored Rocky when he was 13
16 or 14 in this Council. And a Woodside resident in
17 high school now in New York City, out, proud and
18 transgender. Rocky is an inspiration to me, as he is
19 to so many others, and I dedicate this vote to Rocky
20 Sanabria.

21 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

22 [Pause]

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: So Flushing High
24 School in the balcony, you've seen government in
25 action as we take a vote. We welcome you on behalf

1
2 of Council Member Vallone and Council Member Koo.
3 You certainly have gotten a lesson today on the First
4 Amendment, the Fourth Amendment, and a number of
5 issues. And so, thank you again for coming. And
6 now, we will announce the results.

7 [Pause]

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All items on
9 today's General Order Calendar were adopted by a vote
10 of 45 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative, and one
11 abstention with the exception of Intro 491-A, which
12 was adopted by a vote of 39 in the affirmative, 4 in
13 the negative, and 3 abstentions. And Intro 492-A,
14 which was adopted by a vote of 42 in the affirmative,
15 2 in the negative, and 1 abstention. Introduction
16 and Reading of Bills.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All bills are
18 referred to committees as indicated on the Agenda.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: There are no
20 resolutions today. We will immediately go to General
21 Discussion leading with Council Member Andy King.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: This afternoon I
23 rise with my colleagues first in solidarity to say
24 thank you to each and everyone of us who made a
25 commitment to stand up and fight for justice. The

1
2 inequities that have occurred to so many New Yorkers
3 and so many young me of color throughout the history
4 of this great country was deplorable. But today we
5 all took a stand, and had our voices heard loud not
6 only throughout New York but across this great state
7 to say that we are coming together as City and State
8 legislators to make a change. To make a change in
9 policy, to use the job that we've been hired to do
10 making sure that all New Yorkers are safe. So I'm
11 asking everyone please to be on board with the
12 Attorney General Eric Schneiderman's request to help
13 us fill the gap of saying that he will be the special
14 prosecutor.

15 And to legislation that is passed in
16 Albany, and however long that takes, but at least we
17 know we plugged in that gap. We understand the
18 relationships that DA's have with police departments,
19 and it finds it difficult to prosecute police
20 officers. I'm not mad at you, but communities cannot
21 suffer because of that relationship. So I'm asking
22 us all to continue to fight. To continue to stay
23 strong, and let's move legislation that changes the
24 culture. And help our Mayor on his end to deliver,
25 to hold the Police Department accountable. If we

1
2 violate the public trust, we are held accountable as
3 elected officials. So if NYPD officers violate the
4 public trust, they must be held accountable. If that
5 means termination, then so be it. With termination
6 in the Eric Garner case, we ask that that officer be
7 terminated. As well that the policies define that
8 any other agents that are on the scene who do not
9 help. Who do not stop such aggressive action, that
10 they be held accountable, so that they be held
11 accountable, too.

12 Madam Speaker, thank you again for
13 leading today's conversation, and I want us to be
14 free to express this conversation to the BLAC members
15 and everybody. Thank you for today's one unity, one
16 united Council. Thank you.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
18 Please, quite in the chambers. We are still in
19 session. Council Member Richards.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I just want to
21 add and thank the Speaker for her leadership on this
22 particular issue, and all the members obviously of
23 the BLAC. And just to add my two cents here that
24 until we get back to community policing, we will
25

1
2 continue-- Unfortunately, continue to deal with
3 these issues that we see in our particular--

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --communities.

6 I just want to bring your attention to a bill today
7 that I'm going to introduce, Intro 578. Yesterday,
8 the New York Times ran a story on how energy
9 efficiency may be the key to saving trillions of
10 dollars a year in the U.S. Did you know that
11 everyday New Yorkers and businesses can do something
12 very simple to be energy efficient, which won't cost
13 them a dime. And it's simple: Turn their lights
14 off. In 2013, the City of Lights, Paris passed an
15 illumination ban that has yielded them close to \$260
16 million annually, and cut the equivalent of 250,000
17 tons of carbon a year.

18 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
20 Chambers, please. We are still in session. If you
21 are exiting, please be quiet. Refrain from
22 conversation. We apologize. Council Member
23 Richards.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: If Intro 578 is
25 enacted in New York City, nearly 40,000 buildings in

1
2 New York turning their lights off can be equivalent
3 to closing down one power plant. The savings we
4 incur can be reinvested into renewable energy, which
5 would enable us to create good green jobs for low-
6 income residents across the city. Intro 578 will set
7 us on a path of being more energy efficient.

8 Buildings classified under BMM pursuant to the New
9 York Building Code will be prohibited from keeping
10 their lights on in the interior and exterior of their
11 buildings after midnight. An owner of a landmark
12 building 20 stories or higher would be able to apply
13 for a waiver from the Landmarks Commission and the
14 Environmental Protection Committee or Council-- The
15 Department of Environmental Protection.

16 Lastly, building owners for security
17 circumstances would be able to apply for a waiver as
18 well from the Commission and the Department of
19 Environmental Protection as well. Temporary seasonal
20 displays will be able to remain illuminated until
21 midnight or until the last person exist the building
22 as well. We are not looking to kill the Christmas
23 here, as you can see. I also want to note that small
24 stores are exempted from this bill as well. This
25 commonsense measure will enable the city to produce

1
2 savings that will create green jobs and not waste
3 energy unnecessarily. I just would like to thank my
4 Committee Council Samara Swanston, Bill Murray, Laura
5 Popa, Jeff Baker for all their hard work and urge the
6 Council to sign, my colleagues to sign onto this
7 bill. Thank you, Madam Public Advocate.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
9 Council Member Koo.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you, Madam
11 Public Advocate and Madam Speaker. It has been a
12 very painful last few days for many years,
13 particularly for the family and friends of Eric
14 Garner. My thoughts and prayers are with them during
15 this very trying time. I am a person of faith. So
16 in a word it can be truth or an injustice. I lean
17 heavily on my faith or seek refuge in it so to get
18 through on some days. While this doesn't bring Mr.
19 Garner back nor it changes the grand jury's decision,
20 I pray that his family is able to find peace one day.
21 As a member of the Black Latino and Asian Caucus, I
22 am committed to working with my colleagues in this
23 administration to repair relationships between the
24 Police Department and the communities they serve,
25 particularly those of color. We must take thoughtful

1
2 approaches to this matter, and focus on instituting
3 reforms that will produce tangible results, and be
4 careful not to over-regulate a department that has
5 help reduce crime through unprecedented levels.

6 As Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. said,
7 Injustice anywhere is a threat to justice everywhere.
8 We are caught in an inescapable level of this
9 reality, tied to a single garment of destiny.
10 Whenever a person is threatened, it affects all
11 indirectly. Life is a precious and beautiful thing.
12 I hope this sentiment prevails in the mind of every
13 single person in this city. Thank you very much.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
15 Council Member Greenfield to vote.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you. I
17 vote aye on all with the exception of 491-A and 492-A
18 where I vote no. Thank you.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
20 Council Member Johnson.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I thank you
22 Madam Public Advocate. I rise today because I think
23 it is important that all of us regardless of our race
24 acknowledge what has gone on in our city over the
25 past five days since the decision to not have an

1
2 indictment came down from the grand jury. I rise
3 today just to simply state that I stand in solidarity
4 with my colleagues here in the Council and all New
5 Yorkers of every race in their frustration over what
6 is going on in our city and across the country. And
7 I really believe that you can be critical of the
8 ultimate decision, and you can also be respectful of
9 our men and women in uniform. Those things are not
10 mutually exclusive. The vast majority of police
11 officers put themselves in harm's way day in and day
12 out, and they deserve our respect.

13 But, when something goes wrong in our
14 city, and it is caught on video, and everyone can see
15 it, we have to acknowledge that. And I, as an
16 elected official who is not a member of color, cannot
17 imagine what it is like for my colleagues in this
18 Council, primarily young men of color. And for young
19 men of color in this city, and what they have to go
20 through everyday. And it is important to acknowledge
21 that. I was at Riker's Island last week for a tour,
22 and it is devastating what is going on. And the vast
23 majority of people there are men of color. Our
24 criminal justice system in this country and in our
25 city is broken, and we have to change it. We can

1
2 legislate, but ultimately we have to change the
3 hearts and minds of New Yorkers so that these
4 incidents stop. And I stand in solidarity with the
5 members of this body, and I rise today to say that
6 Black lives matter. Thank you very much.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

8 Please, quite in the Chambers. We are still in
9 session. All items on today's General Order Calendar
10 were adopted by an amended vote of 46 in the
11 affirmative, 0 negative, and one abstention with the
12 exception of Intro 491-A, which was adopted by a vote
13 of 39 in the affirmative, 5 in the negative, and 3
14 abstentions. And Intro 492-A, which was adopted by a
15 vote of 43 in the affirmative, 3 negative, and 1
16 abstention. Continuing the general discussions,
17 Council Member Kallos.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I would just like
19 to start by acknowledging and following suit with
20 many of my colleagues who have already spoke a lot
21 about Martin Luther King's legacy, and that injustice
22 anywhere is a threat to justice everywhere and that
23 continues. I echo my colleagues, the city, the
24 nation, and the world that Black lives matter. I
25 rise today to thank my wife for her love and support

1
2 on our one-year wedding anniversary. [cheers and
3 applause] And as a sponsor for Introduction 574, a
4 bill that would create free universal e-hail app to
5 allow New Yorkers to e-hail any of the 13,637 Yellow
6 cabs or 6,000 green cabs that may--

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
8 Quiet in the Chambers. Please quiet in the Chambers.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: --participate.
10 City taxis need an app of their own to compete, and
11 New Yorkers should be to e-hail a cab in the rain
12 without having to worry about surge pricing. Instead
13 of making new technologies illegal or regulating them
14 out of business, the city must modernize to be able
15 to compete. Washington, D.C. and Chicago have
16 already proposed e-hail city apps, and this
17 innovation will make New Yorkers' lives easier and
18 provide a new source of revenue for our taxi drivers.
19 I look forward to working across industries and
20 agencies to make it easy for anyone to e-hail a cab
21 and get where they're going in a New York minute.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Congratulations,
23 Council Member. Council Member Danny Dromm.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you, Madam
25 Public Advocate. Before I start, I want to say that

1
2 I also support my colleagues, and I want to state
3 very, very clearly that Black lives matter. May I
4 also congratulate Corey Johnson for his successful
5 legislation for our transgender community. Today, I
6 wanted to rise to speak about Intro 573. We the
7 human beings [cheers and applause] of New York are
8 guardians of our--

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
10 Excuse me.

11 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet.
12 Do not shout out. [sic] [gavel] Everyone, quiet
13 please. Quiet please.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: We, the human
15 beings of New York are the guardians of our animal
16 companions, both wild and domesticated. Whenever
17 cruelty and endangerment is so clearly documented and
18 brought to our attention, we must act. This bill is
19 simply that, government stepping in to correct a
20 great injustice. Views in society evolve on issues
21 from civil rights to environmental protection and
22 animal issues are not different. The longevity of
23 horse carriages is no defense to the overwhelming
24 evidence of animal cruelty and endangerment that has
25 been, and will continue to be presented to us. It is

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

not appropriate for any living creature outside of a motor vehicle to be in the middle of New York City traffic. It was never okay, but what has changed is the increasing compassion and caring we have animals.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet, please.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: For us to pretend that horse draw carriages are okay because it looks pretty or to certain tourists is part of a tradition is unacceptable. We need to protect good jobs that do not rely on such odious practices. This bill generously extends to these drivers options to help them transition to jobs that do not abuse animals. When confronted with the extensive and heartbreaking evidence of animal abuse, opponents of this humane proposal have no substantive response. It is our duty as a body of elected leaders to respond. I hope that you, my fellow leaders, will be on the right side of history, and support Introduction 573. Thank you very much.

[cheers and applause]

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet in the Chambers, please. [gavel]

[background comments]

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. We
3 have a practice in the City Council if you agree.
4 Thank you. Council Member Gibson.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Sorry. Thank
6 you, Madam Public Advocate. I want to call attention
7 to Reso 502, which would support State legislation
8 that would ensure there is an equal number of
9 employers and union representatives on the New York
10 City Deferred Compensation Board, which has not
11 happened for quite a while. This is an opportunity
12 to really make sure the board that oversees the
13 program is responsible for protecting the rights of
14 many who invest in the program does have an equitable
15 representation of employees and union members. And I
16 also want to join with all of my colleagues just in
17 unison in certainly expressing my condolences and
18 prayers obviously to Eric Garner's family, to Akai
19 Gurley, and so many others that we speak their names.
20 Of the continuous slap of injustice, the broken
21 Criminal Justice system that we have is continuously
22 perpetuated by every instance where an African-
23 American unfortunately is killed.

24 It is a sad state of affairs. This is a
25 national conversation, and every day that we have

1
2 life, and we wake up with an opportunity to serve, we
3 must be committed to justice, and fairness and one
4 system of justice for all. We continuously say
5 accountability and what that really means, taking a
6 life and accepting responsibility for that action. I
7 am committed to working with all of my colleagues to
8 make sure that legislatively on a policy level we do
9 everything possible We are sick and tired of going
10 to funerals mourning the loss of so many young men of
11 color in this country. It must end and it must end
12 today. I thank you all for your leadership. I want
13 to thank the Speaker and everyone who collectively--
14 We are here wearing black because we are mourning the
15 loss of lives across this nation. And I, too, say
16 all lives matter, Black lives matter. Thank you.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
18 Council Member Levine.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you, Madam
20 Public Advocate. I want to call my colleague's
21 attention to a piece of legislation I'm pleased to be
22 introducing today, No. 576, which addresses the
23 increasing practice of landlord buyouts of rent
24 regulated tenants. These transactions occur in the
25 shadows. They are not reported on. The City gathers

1
2 no information on them, and often they occur under
3 exploitative circumstances in which tenants may be
4 tied up in Housing Court with no attorney facing
5 bogus charges. Or, perhaps tenants are worried about
6 their immigration status, and they wrongly feel that
7 they may be in jeopardy because of it. The result is
8 that tenants far too often take buyouts at levels
9 that are far, far, far below what we're allowing to
10 replace their housing. And this bill would require
11 that all landlords who complete such agreements
12 report on them to HPD within 45 days. Failure to do
13 so would result in a fine, and it would require that
14 HPD report back to us the City Council on this trend
15 as whole. So that we can begin to grapple with the
16 public policy implications. Thank you.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
18 Rodriguez.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.
20 First, I would like to congratulate the passing on
21 New Yorkers that have been taking the street in a
22 peaceful manner protesting the decision of the jury
23 in State Island. Especially the high school students
24 and the younger students who may be the future
25 leaders or our society. Many of them who are Black

1
2 and Latino. Many of them who are part of this
3 movement because they believe that there is something
4 wrong in this society where after many cases for
5 Leona Burn [sic] to Juan Rodriguez, Antonio Diallo
6 [sic]. Every time when this does happen, we cannot
7 promise ourselves or other people that are going to
8 see those cases weeks or months after. So we have to
9 continue working with the Governor, Mayor de Blasio,
10 Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito, the President. The
11 Justice Department has to act now. And we have do
12 reform in order to avoid similar situations from
13 happening in the City or throughout the nation.

14 I also would like to invite all my
15 colleagues on another topic to support Intro 573 in
16 which my colleague Council Member Danny Dromm and I
17 we are the primary sponsors. We want to take the
18 horses out of the street. And as we know, in 1947,
19 when this industry was regulated, we didn't have so
20 many trucks, ambulances, and cars in the street. New
21 York's population wasn't even-- it wasn't even close
22 to what New York's population is today. We believe
23 that New York City cannot be behind cities in Utah,
24 Florida, New Jersey that has already been acting
25 banning the carriage horses from the street. Thank

1
2 you to all the advocate groups. I would just like to
3 thank the Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito for allowing
4 us to move on this bill. And what we can promise is
5 that in this hearing everyone will have voice. Those
6 against or for they will be invited, and everyone
7 should be able to contribute. And at the end of the
8 day, we want to come out with a process where it
9 should be a win-win situation, good jobs for those
10 men and women that have been dependent on the
11 industry and taking the horses out of the streets.
12 Thank you.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
14 Rose.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you, Madam
16 Public Advocate. And today, I rise out of gratitude
17 to the Speaker of this body, and my very special
18 committed colleagues. I am not going to ready
19 prepared statement because I think today our actions
20 and our voices were proof enough that what we did
21 today will resonate and will serve as a catalyst for
22 reform. And ensure that will not stop until justice
23 is a reality for everyone. But I stand today to ask
24 my colleagues to support Reso 505, which will urge
25 the Public School Athletic League to provide a

1
2 medical professional and an ambulance for high school
3 football games as well as practices. Because on
4 September 1st, 2014, Mile Kirkland Thomas a Curtis
5 High School Varsity team player died after collapsing
6 at a Monday morning football practice. An ambulance
7 arrived after the incident, and Miles Kirkland Thomas
8 was pronounced dead upon his arrival at the hospital.

9 If a medical professional was present
10 during the practice, young Miles would have received
11 immediate attention, which could have possibly saved
12 his life. This was also the case for a 15-year-old,
13 Saint Joseph-by-the Sea student Nicholas
14 Dellaventura, who died after suffering from heat
15 exhaustion during practice on July 23rd, 2013. Both
16 losses could have possibly been prevented by the
17 presence of an able-bodied medical professional at
18 their practice sessions. Current PSAL Rules only
19 require EMTs or an ambulance on standby for games,
20 but not for any practices. Yet, it seems as though
21 many student athletes are sustaining many of their
22 athletic injuries during practices, and rarely during
23 the actual games. So I urge you to sign on and
24 support Reso 505, which will not only aid in the
25 reduction of other young athletes sustaining serious

1
2 injuries. But would also prevent the potential loss
3 of life from not receiving necessary immediate
4 medical attention. Thank you.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
6 Council Member Treyger.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you. I'll
8 begin by saying that any nation that claims it is a
9 democratic nation made up of laws must recognize that
10 it is only as strong as the faith that people have in
11 both its political and legal systems. And while
12 there is no question much more has to be done across
13 the nation to improve police community relations, let
14 us also understand that there are political leaders
15 who quietly condone quota systems that I believe
16 unfairly pit community against police and vice versa.
17 That only target the most petty offenses. And we
18 must understand that petty offenses do nothing to
19 advance safety, but rather feed distrust, and feed
20 government coffers. So we must understand this
21 system from all angles that there must be improved
22 community relations. But we also have to understand
23 that there is a system in place that unfairly pits
24 officers verse our communities, and that system must
25 change. But I'm also here to introduce Intro 580

1
2 that would for the first time in New York history
3 establish an infrastructure taskforce, and a report
4 card grading system that would take into account the
5 input of academia, engineers, members of labor
6 community organizations, hold hearings across the
7 five boroughs to for the first time take a hard look
8 at New York City's aging antiquated infrastructure.
9 And assign grades with policy recommendations back to
10 lawmakers here at the City Council and to the Mayor.
11 When we talk about affordable housing, resiliency,
12 sustainability, you will get nowhere if you do not
13 address the infrastructure crisis that exists in New
14 York City. Again, I urge my colleagues to please
15 support Intro 580. Thank you.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
17 Council Member Levin.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very
19 much, Chair and Madam Public Advocate and my
20 colleagues. I do want to call your attention to two
21 resolutions that I am introducing today. Resolution
22 503, which would call on the State Legislature of New
23 York to pass and the Governor to sign Assembly Intro
24 2819, introduced by Assemblyman Keith Richter [sp?]
25 of the Housing Committee. Which would establish a

1
2 hospitality gift fund for the homeless in New York
3 City. In addition, Resolution 504 calls on Governor
4 Cuomo and Mayor Bill de Blasio to approve a Fourth
5 New York/New York Agreement, a New York/New York IV,
6 which would create permanent supportive housing in
7 New York City. This is a vital resource for those
8 neediest New Yorkers that need permanent supportive
9 housing. It is a very successful program going back
10 30 years for the previous three New York/New York
11 Agreements between the State and the City. New
12 York/New York III will be running out this coming
13 year, and the New York/New York IV is absolutely
14 essential and urgent.

15 My colleagues, I also want to speak for a
16 moment on the tragedy of the death of Eric Garner,
17 and I think that it's important first to recognize
18 that Eric Garner was a father of six, and a well
19 loved member of his community. His life was cut
20 short for no reason at all, and we have system in New
21 York City-- As Council Member Treyger just said,
22 where we have the police pitted against the community
23 because of a system of policing based on a broken
24 windows philosophy that I do not believe serves the
25 interest of our communities and serves the interest

1
2 of our city. I think that it is time that we take a
3 deep look at ourselves and our system, and change our
4 system where necessary so that we can avoid any other
5 tragedy like this. And so, that no other family in
6 our city has to go through this type of tragedy ever
7 again. Thank you.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
9 Council Member Eugene.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very
11 much, Madam Public Advocate and my colleagues. Today
12 I want to draw your attention Resolution 500, which
13 asks for the State of New York to include swimming
14 lessons and water safety education for all K through
15 12 public school students. Further, this resolution
16 requires that where a school does not have a pool and
17 it is not within ten miles of the pool where such
18 lessons can take place, water safety education and
19 dry land stroke be taught the place. The number of
20 young people who suffer drowning deaths each year is
21 too high. New York City is home to a number of free
22 and low-cost places where people can go to swim
23 including public beaches, recreation centers, without
24 the pool and centers within the pool. Give that the
25 city presents so many opportunity to give the

1
2 children access to water, and that swimming is a
3 healthful activity in which we all want our children
4 to safety take part. I hope that you will join me in
5 asking that the state to create and support this bill
6 and mend it and put our young people through water
7 safety education. And I want also to ask my
8 colleagues to support Resolution 501 in which we ask
9 that New York City also recognize the one Youth Day.
10 It is very important that we take a moment of repose
11 to recognize the importance of the activities to our
12 young people. And also, the importance of our young
13 people because we have a moral obligation to provide
14 for our young people all the opportunities they need
15 to become part in our positive [sic] cities and also
16 to give back to the community.

17 And to conclude, I want to commend the
18 Speaker for her leadership, and also my colleagues
19 for coming together to address this very, very
20 important crisis affecting not only the Garner
21 family, but also New York City and to our entire
22 country. The people are crying for justice. They
23 are trying for respect. They are crying for human
24 dignity. It is very important as the New York City
25 Council to come together and do everything that we

1
2 can do in order for people to feel safe. No one in
3 New York City regardless of the color of his skin,
4 regardless of the social or economic situation or
5 faith, should not fear to live in New York City.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: We should have
8 one justice for everyone. Thank you.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
10 Council Member Constantinides.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Than you,
12 Madam Public Advocate. I'll begin with some remarks
13 relating to the death of Eric Garner. As we hear the
14 singing in the hallways, it just makes me proud to be
15 part of this body that I know is committed to
16 building a better, fairer, and stronger New York
17 where every life and every voice is heard and
18 respected and protected. And as we build that better
19 New York, I commend our Speaker's and everyone's
20 leadership today as I pledge to be part of that
21 solution. As we hear those voices and act on those
22 voices.

23 I stand to oppose Intro 573 with great
24 respect to my colleagues Council Member Dromm and
25 Rodriguez. Just some facts about the industry.

1
2 There has never been a conviction for animal cruelty
3 relating to the horse carriages in the history of New
4 York City. This is a well regulated industry, an
5 industry that has, this Council has sought to protect
6 the horse and has done so admirably. This is an
7 iconic part of New York City. There are 350 families
8 that depend on this. They are union jobs, windows
9 into the middle class that we're seeing to set aside,
10 and they're talking about electric cars or taxi
11 medallions. That's not what this is about. This is
12 a way of life for these men and women. You know,
13 this electric car has narrowed down the streets of
14 New York City, and frankly, the Central Park
15 Conservancy doesn't want it there. So Intro 573,
16 which the intentions are good, I will say that I
17 strongly oppose this bill, and ask my colleagues to
18 continue to stand with the hard-working men and women
19 of this city against this ban. Thank you.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
21 Council Member Cornegy.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Good afternoon.
23 Thank you, Madam Public Advocate. I want to just
24 commend my colleagues for the action prior to the
25 Stated Meeting today. It was a pleasure to be

1
2 involved in that, and it makes me proud to be a
3 Council Member in this progressive administration.

4 But I want to bring your attention to a dear
5 colleague letter that I penned earlier:

6 Many changes to the operation of the NYPD
7 are being contemplated in the wake of the grand
8 jury's decision not to bring an indictment in the
9 chokehold death of Mr. Eric Garner. While we support
10 the recently announced retraining of NYPD officers
11 and other proposals, including the body camera pilot
12 proposed by Public Advocate Letitia James, facts
13 surrounding this case have made things very clear.
14 An NYPD ban alone has not stopped the use of
15 chokehold in the department. And existing local law
16 is insufficient to secure indictment even when the
17 violation of the no chokehold policy results in a
18 death.

19 Intro 574 introduced jointly by Council
20 Members Lancman, Williams and myself is part of the
21 answer. This bill would make the use of a chokehold
22 in making an arrest a misdemeanor crime bringing our
23 Local Law in line with NYPD policy. This is not a
24 radical move by any stretch of the imagination.
25 Rather, it expresses the widespread view of New

1
2 Yorkers at this moment and uses the power of law to
3 ensure that the Department's stated intent to change
4 this translation into action. Please do not be
5 persuaded by arguments that chokeholds should be
6 outlawed because the exceptions to the policy may be
7 needed to keep police officers safe.

8 The NYPD itself explicitly rejected this
9 argument in 1993. And prior to that time, Department
10 policy discouraged chokeholds with an exception for
11 situations involving risk to an officer's life. When
12 that exception proved to be problematic, and New
13 Yorkers continued to die, Departmental leadership
14 moved forward with a full scale ban without
15 exceptions. A 1993 New York Times article describing
16 the adoption of the ban, and a recent CCR Rule Report
17 detailing the high incidents of chokehold complaints
18 since the ban was attached for your reference.

19 Please I ask for your support and advocacy to pass
20 and enact Intro 540. This is being circulated right
21 now. Thank you, Madam Public Advocate.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
23 Williams.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: First, I would
25 like to bring my colleagues' attention to three

1
2 bills, Intro 583, that would require DHS to annually
3 report to the Mayor and Speaker crime statistics from
4 city run homeless shelters. Intro 584 would require
5 DOT to offer email and text message notifications
6 when major transportation projects occur, which would
7 include projects that alter four or more blocks or
8 1,000 feet of the street. And involves a major
9 realignment of the roadway. Intro 507 is a
10 resolution declaring January 15th to the 22nd of each
11 year as Peace Week in the City of New York. This is
12 in coordination with Life Camp who currently sponsors
13 this week every year by hosting a series of peace and
14 advocacy events.

15 I also want to say as we continue with
16 this conversation about black lives matter, Eric
17 Garner, Mike Brown, Akai Gurley and so many across
18 the nation, there are three points that I want to
19 point out. If we want to have this conversation, we
20 have to be honest about it, and people have to
21 understand. The first is that the mention and notion
22 of white privilege does not make any one person
23 racist even if you benefit from it. It's just an
24 acknowledgement of what is. Talking about structural
25 racism does not mean that we excuse any one person's

1
2 behavior of violence in the community. They must be
3 held responsible, but it helps describe a situation
4 that created so much. And lastly, trying to make the
5 police better and mentioning ways to do so, and also
6 holding people accountable, is not anti-police. It is
7 what we should be doing as legislators.

8 And I think those three things are being
9 heard differently by people in this conversation.
10 And my hope is that when we continue this that we'll
11 have honest acknowledgement of where we are as a
12 society. And that people will come out of their
13 corners and come to the middle where most of the
14 answers are, and understand what people are saying.
15 Thank you.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And lastly,
17 Council Member Espinal.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Thank you, Madam
19 Public Advocate. I just want to start off by saying
20 that I was very proud to join my colleagues in
21 today's demonstrations and movements. And look
22 forward to continuing working with everyone to make
23 sure that this is a safe and fair city for everyone
24 living in it. I want to point your attention to
25 Intro 573, and just want to say that the carriage

1
2 drivers do us proud. They are ambassadors for the
3 City welcoming tourists at Central Park and showing
4 them the real New York. It is our responsibility to
5 ensure, of course, that the horses are safe. That is
6 why five years ago we passed a legislation to make
7 sure that they are heavily regulated. The
8 accusations against the iconic industry just do not
9 stand up to scrutiny. We look forward to a spirited
10 debate, but I also hope we can soon move on past this
11 misguided bill, and continue working on creating good
12 paying jobs. And making sure that the police and
13 community relations continue to be worked on. Thank
14 you.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you and now
16 to close, Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Madam
18 Public Advocate, and I want to again thank all my
19 colleagues for their consistency in the work. And
20 I'm proud to lead this body to work alongside all of
21 you to make New York City a better place that
22 respects the rights of all. I think with just the
23 message today in terms of indicating that Black lives
24 matter, that transgender lives matter, that all lives
25 matter, that is what we strive to do each and every

1
2 day as a legislative body and as an oversight body.
3 Just to make sure that this City, the policies that
4 are in place, the agencies that exist are ones that
5 are respectful of all. And so we are going to
6 continue to strive to do that, and we will be strong
7 in that message. So thank you all and to all of my
8 colleagues and thank you, Madam Public Advocate as
9 well.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, and I
11 want to thank those in the balcony for respecting the
12 rules. We are now adjourned. [gavel]

13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 10, 2014