

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS
JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND
SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT

----- X

January 29, 2020
Start: 1:45 PM
Recess: 4:12 PM

HELD AT: COMMITTEE ROOM - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: FERNANDO CABRERA
Chairperson

ANTONIO REYNOSO
Co-Chairperson

COUNCILMEMBERS:

ALAN N. MAISEL
BEN KALLOS
BILL PERKINS
KALMAN YEGER
KEITH POWERS
YDANIS RODRIGUEZ
ANDREW COHEN
CHAIM M. DEUTSCH
COSTA G. CONSTANTINIDES
JUSTIN L. BRANNAN
MARGARET S. CHIN

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Keith Kerman
Deputy Commissioner
Department of Citywide Administrative Services

Greg Anderson
Assistant Commissioner
Department of Sanitation

Joseph Colangelo
President
New York City SEIU Local 246

Harry Greenberg
Co-Counsel
Municipal Labor Committee

George Farinacci
Vice President
Uniformed Fire Officers Association

Michael Schreiber
Health and Safety Officer
Uniformed Firefighters Association

Marlena Giga
Treasurer
Local 983

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

4

2 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Good afternoon. I'm
3 the chair of the Committee and Governmental
4 Operations, Council Member from the Fernando Cabrera.
5 I'm pleased to be joined today by my colleague
6 Council Member Antonio Reynoso, Chair of the
7 Committee on Sanitation, along with my colleagues
8 Vallone, Chin and... Today we will be conducting
9 oversight on the city's fleet managed by the
10 Department of Citywide Administrative Services,
11 otherwise known as DCAS our committee are interested
12 in the maintenance of the unified fleet, with a
13 particular interest in the sanitation fleet. New York
14 City operates the largest municipal fleet in the
15 United States, with more than 30,000 vehicles. Before
16 2020 city agencies managed their own fleet,
17 independent of each other, with separate maintenance
18 and procurement contracts. Executive Order 161 of
19 2012 issue by former Mayor Bloomberg consolidated
20 fleet operations and maintenance on the DCAS at the
21 time DCAS was tasked with ensuring that all fleet
22 repairs; maintenance, garages, and fueling were
23 consolidated across the city. This consolidation was
24 intended to meet the general needs of the city's
25 entire fleet and be responsive to the specific needs

2 of each agency. Eight years later, the city has
3 downsized, the number of city garages. Overall, save
4 money through streamlined process, processes, and
5 resource sharing, while still maintaining a massive
6 fleet. Today the Governmental Operations Committee
7 has an opportunity to examine the ways in which the
8 unified fleet has had a positive impact on the city's
9 functioning. We also look at areas for improvement.
10 In particular, we are concerned with the question; is
11 the city's unified fleet truly responsive to the
12 specific needs of agencies. This particularly
13 important, this is particularly important when it
14 comes to fleet maintenance. In order for the city's
15 fleet to run smoothly, each vehicle must be saved and
16 in fully functional condition, condition. Some
17 agencies operate highly specialized fleets critical
18 to the public health and safety of all New Yorkers.
19 As a result, the city's fleet maintenance must be
20 equally specialized and able to make a priority of
21 repairs. I look forward to a fruitful discussion with
22 administration as we explore how a consolidated
23 maintenance system can be both efficient and maintain
24 a high level of quality across the city's diverse
25 fleet. I want to thank our committee staff Daniel

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

6

2 Collins, Emily Forjon, Elizabeth Krong, Sebastian
3 Bochi, and as well as my legislative director Claire
4 Michael Beam for making this hearing possible. And
5 with that, I would like to hand it over, over the
6 mind to my co-chair Council Member Reynoso.

7 REYNOSO: Thank you Council Member
8 Cabrera. I am Council Member Antonio Reynoso and I am
9 the chair of the Committee on Sanitation and Solid
10 Waste. Welcome to this oversight hearing about the
11 maintenance of the New York City unified fleet. I
12 want to thank of course Council Member Cabrera, the
13 chair of the Committee on Government Operations for
14 holding this hearing.. to with us today. We are here
15 to learn about the maintenance of the entire New York
16 City fleet. But I am particularly interested in
17 Department of Sanitation's vehicles. It is not a
18 secret that sanitation trucks can be very dangerous.
19 I have worked hard to pass legislation to regulate
20 sanitation companies to keep our streets, as safe as
21 possible. It is incredibly important that our city
22 trucks are maintained regularly and operated
23 property. We're currently in the middle of snow
24 season. Each October we hold the hearing about the
25 department snow plans and learn all about the

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

7

2 extensive preparation and training that the SNY
3 conducts in advance of snow events. For the SNY to be
4 successful in their snow operations though, they need
5 to have functional equipment. I look forward to
6 learning about the proactive maintenance of these
7 vehicles and how they are serviced and repaired when
8 there is an issue. I want to be confident that all
9 agencies have enough mechanics to keep our fleet and
10 our city safe. I'm looking forward to hearing from
11 DCAS about their management practices including how
12 all fleet repairs and maintenance are scheduled, and
13 if there is any particular attention paid to
14 emergency vehicles like plows during snow season. I
15 look forward to hearing from DCAS and DSNY and the
16 mechanics who are doing the work on these vehicles,
17 about how to best keep our fleet operating safely. I
18 also want to recognize Council Member Kohen and
19 Brennan. Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: And with that will
21 be swearing in the administration.

22 COUNSEL: ...your hands. Do you swear that
23 the testimony you'll provide to this committee is
24 truthful to the best of your knowledge, information,

25

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

8

2 and belief and that you'll respond honestly the
3 Council Member questions?

4 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Thank you so much
5 and you may begin.

6 KEITH KERMAN: Okay. Good afternoon. Thank
7 you for having us here today to talk about the fleet
8 program. A program we're very proud of. Good
9 afternoon Chairs Cabrera and Reynosa, and members of
10 the Government Operations and Sanitation and Solid
11 Waste Committees. I am Keith Kerman the Chief Lead
12 Officer for the city of New York, and a Deputy
13 Commissioner of the Department of Citywide
14 Administrative Services. I'm joined today by
15 Assistant Commissioner Greg Anderson of the
16 Department of Sanitation, as well as Rocky DiRico the
17 Department of Sanitation who's here Eric Richardson
18 and Brent Taylor, who are senior members of our DCAS
19 team, and other representatives of the
20 administration, and of course, our very important
21 local that takes care of the repair representing the
22 mechanics is here today. Thank you for the
23 opportunity to discuss the citywide fleet program,
24 which plays an essential role in supporting the
25 delivery of public services and emergency response

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

9

2 24/7 in the city. New York City operates the largest
3 municipal fleet in the United States. As of the
4 preliminary fiscal year '20 Mayor's management report
5 there were 30,717 total fleet units with 25,104 on-
6 road vehicles and 5,613 off-road equipment pieces.
7 The fleet has operated across 50 agencies as well as
8 additional offices, including elected officials. The
9 city operates light, medium, and heavy duty vehicles,
10 off-road equipment pieces, police, and emergency
11 response units. Historically seat... city fleet
12 operations were very decentralized. Beginning 2008 an
13 effort began to establish a common management
14 approach led through DCAS. Two mayoral executive
15 orders of further this effort. Mayor de Blasio's
16 executive order 41 of 2019 on fleet sustainability,
17 right sizing, and efficiency, and executive order 161
18 of 2012 regarding shared services and consolidation
19 of fleet operations and maintenance. In the last
20 decade the city wide fleet program NYC Fleet has
21 implemented a wide ranging set of initiatives,
22 impacting almost all areas of Fleet. Fleet has been
23 an extraordinarily dynamic place. These changes are
24 not easy but it's been a location we've really made
25 incredible positive change. And we've established New

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

10

2 York City as a leader in many aspects of Fleet
3 operations nationally. These initiatives include; we
4 are reducing emissions and greenhouse gases through
5 the NYC clean fleet initiative, New York City
6 operates on the nation's largest electric vehicle
7 fleets with over 2,600 plugin units, and is also one
8 of the nation's largest adopters of cleaner biofuels.
9 In fiscal year '19, our fleet did 2.3 million miles
10 on all electric vehicles tripling the usage from just
11 fiscal year '17. In total nearly 20,000 vehicles
12 operate on some type of fuel alternative. The average
13 fuel economy for our new light duty vehicles in
14 fiscal year '19, as reported and mandated through
15 local law 38 of 2005 was 107 miles per gallon. We
16 recently announced the transition to hybrid police
17 cars with our first orders of 700 units, and most of
18 our ambulances now have hybrid and plugin capacity.
19 We have electric sedans, SUVs, crossovers, and
20 minivans on contract now, as well as solar carports,
21 light towers, electric forklifts, electric carts, and
22 more. We are also taking our first steps in
23 partnership with sanitation and parks, electric
24 garbage trucks, buses, and vans New York City is one,
25 is also one of the nation's largest public adopters

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

11

2 of car and fleet share. DCAS Fleet offers 70 all
3 electric vehicles as city wide shared units. In
4 fiscal 19, we used our first 1 million gallons of
5 renewable diesel fuel, and we are working currently
6 on a citywide contract to replace all diesel fossil
7 fuel use with biofuels including renewable diesel,
8 and bio diesel. Fleet is committed to reducing 50% of
9 greenhouse gases by 2025. Our plan is to replace all
10 vehicle models with electric and plug in options
11 where available, and to use biofuels where the market
12 for electric is not yet in place. New York City must
13 set the example of making this critical transition
14 away from fossil fuels, and to electric vehicles and
15 sustainable fuel options. DCAS has also implemented a
16 safe fleet transition plan as part of visit... Vision
17 Zero and we talked a little bit earlier today with
18 you about that. DCAS and partner agencies including
19 sanitation have trained over 60,000 fleet operators
20 in defensive driving since Vision Zero was announced.
21 We've implemented the nation's largest truck side
22 guard program, with over 3,000 units installed and
23 counting and have placed real-time tracking devices
24 on 23,000 fleet units to date. Among many benefits
25 this real-time tracking can provide alerts to

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

12

2 speeding, harsh cornering, failure to use seatbelts,
3 and improper use of city vehicles. The system also
4 produces instant and automatic crash alerts when a
5 city vehicle is in a collision. Real-time tracking
6 offers enormous potential benefits to make our fleet
7 safer for our own drivers and for pedestrians and
8 bicyclists and New Yorkers. This is a big change for
9 fleet and for city operations, but one we must take
10 as we pursue a safer, more sustainable and efficient
11 future. The city is also procuring automatic braking
12 driver alert systems, high vision trucks, dashcams,
13 and making other design changes to safeguard our city
14 drivers, pedestrians, and bicyclists since fiscal
15 year '17 we've implemented 50,000 safety improvements
16 to our fleet, and will have installed at least
17 100,000 safety improvements by fiscal year '22.

18 Working with city DOT and other agencies, we
19 published a truck safety video titled ICU. In
20 November, 2019. We have made some progress, but we
21 know it is not enough. We are all committed to
22 redoubling these efforts, especially as focused on
23 truck safety, as we pursue Vision Zero. These efforts
24 include pushing the fleet industry to offer high
25 vision trucks, intelligent speed assist, automatic

2 braking in trucks and improving driver alert systems.

3 We welcome the council's continued support in this

4 effort. Consistent with executive order 161, and in

5 partnership with OMB, DCAS has implemented a citywide

6 acquisition and vehicle replacement program. Since

7 fiscal year '14 the city has spent over \$2 billion to

8 upgrade and improve its fleet of vehicles and trucks,

9 including the city's three largest historic

10 investments in fleet units in fiscal year '16, '17,

11 and '18 City fleet age has improved from 6.2 years on

12 average in fiscal year '14 to 5.4 years in fiscal

13 year '19. It's getting younger. DSNY fleet age went

14 from 5.9 years to 5.4 years during that period. These

15 investments ensure city employees have updated

16 vehicles perform their critical roles and enable us

17 to transition to cleaner, safer, and more efficient

18 fleet units. In partnership with New York Emergency

19 Management DCAS has also implemented a post Sandy

20 resiliency program to increase resources in critical

21 emergency equipment areas, including; light towers,

22 generators, fuel trucks, message boards, forklifts,

23 tow trucks, and water pumps. DCAS implemented a \$20

24 million program to expand resources in these areas,

25 most of which gets tracked in the offroad component

2 of the fleet. In 2016, a separate investment was made
3 for 140 additional sanitation snow removal units
4 after the Jonas storm. Executive Order 161
5 established shared servicing for the city fleet. To
6 enable shared servicing DCAS upgraded the city's
7 fleet management system, now called NYC Fleet focus,
8 which is our tool for tracking fleet assets, work
9 orders, repairs, state and preventive inspections,
10 and auto parts. DCAS had put in place a fleet system
11 for use of most agencies for decades, and it had been
12 standard practice and is standard practice for
13 skilled mechanics and tradesmen to record their
14 direct and indirect work, time, and complete vehicle
15 specific work orders. However, shared servicing
16 require this tracking to be universal standardized
17 and for repair agencies to be able to look up and
18 record work on fleet units from other non... of their
19 client agencies, of other agencies. Our new fleet
20 system has been full operation since 2013. In 2013
21 DCAS also completed and published the first city wide
22 fleet management manual to set the guidelines for
23 common fleet management approach. Vehicles require
24 parts and fuel daily. New York City fleet procures
25 nearly \$80 million in auto parts per year. We operate

2 one of the largest fueling programs in New York State
3 with over 400 liquid fueling locations, as well as
4 the largest TV charging network with nearly 700
5 chargers and growing. We auction up to 3000 end of
6 life, vehicles, each year to support these aspects of
7 Fleet services DCAS has also implemented new and
8 improved systems for managing parts inventory and
9 delivery, online auctions, and fuel management. These
10 systems both improve support services in these areas,
11 and also increase transparency in the use of Fleet
12 resources. DCAS works closely with the Department of
13 Investigation and fleet agencies to monitor the use
14 of Fleet resources, including cars, fuel, and parts.
15 Fleet reports extensively on performance and
16 resources through a dedicated section of the mayor's
17 management report. As mentioned, NYC Fleet has
18 implemented shared servicing across agencies, since
19 2012. Each day city employees from the police
20 department, the Department of Sanitation, Department
21 of Parks, DOT and DCAS work to service their own
22 agency vehicles and also units from other agencies.
23 There are nearly 7,000 fleet units maintained through
24 shared servicing arrangements. Shared servicing was
25 part of a broader consolidation and efficiency effort

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

16

2 that saved or avoided \$367 million from fiscal year
3 '12 to fiscal year '16. New York City was able to
4 reduce its fleet facility portfolio by 10 and share
5 two other garages. In fiscal year '19 over 30,000
6 work orders or 12% of total work orders were shared
7 service jobs with agencies servicing other agencies.
8 In 2011 the FDNY was looking to spend over \$200
9 million to build a new ambulance shop. This project
10 would have taken years to complete. Instead through
11 shared services the city transferred the main DEP
12 repair shop at Review Avenue in Queens to the FDNY
13 that year, with NYPD sanitation, Parks, DOT and DCAS
14 all assuming roles in DEP fleet servicing. DCAS then
15 sold the aging FDNY ambulance shop. This project
16 saved and avoided over 210 million dollars and
17 launched a new era of interagency servicing. Working
18 with the mayor's office, OMB, and fleet agencies DCAS
19 has also implemented a new series of efficiency and
20 savings initiatives, starting fiscal year '17 and
21 going through fiscal year 22. Through executive order
22 41 of 2019 we will reduce at least 1,000 vehicles by
23 June 30th of 2021, focusing on low use units and
24 commuting units. We are increasing fleet revenue from
25 the auction of used fleet cars, and from the

2 aggressive pursuit of crash claims. We are also
3 working to reduce fuel use, with nearly 1 million
4 fewer gallons used in fiscal year '19 than a fiscal
5 '18. We know that fuel efficient vehicles reduce
6 maintenance, as well as fuel costs. We're also
7 working to have a consistent mix of mechanical
8 staffing across fleet servicing agencies. And one of
9 our most important programs; New York City Fleet has
10 partnered with the city's automotive high schools. In
11 2019 we provided 79 paid summer and year around
12 internships in our shops and fleet offices for
13 students working to become mechanics and fleet
14 professionals. We more than doubled this program from
15 2014. We provide the schools with over 20 fleet units
16 for hands-on repair and laboratory work. We provide
17 seven all-electric fleet units so students at public
18 high schools, who learn to drive through the public
19 schools, learn to do so in all electric vehicles.
20 We've also provided a direct pipeline, so students
21 can graduate and have opportunities to join city
22 employment as Auto Service Workers, our entry level
23 mechanics title. We want to build a diverse workforce
24 for the future of fleet, and the Department of
25 Education, as well as our fleet partners at the

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

18

2 agencies have been terrific partners in this effort.
3 Currently there are nearly 1,900 staff who work full
4 time in fleet administration, servicing, dispatch
5 citywide. Of these 1,436 are in repair related
6 titles. From 2014 through today Fleet with the
7 support of OMB has increased the total number of
8 repair staff by 179, or 14%. This responds to an
9 increase in Fleet size of 13% during the same period
10 as reported in the MMR. The main fleet agencies,
11 which we refer to as the Fleet Federation are NYPD,
12 Sanitation, DCAS the Fire Department, the Department
13 of Transportation, the Department of Parks, DEP,
14 Department of Correction in NYCHA, which consolidated
15 fleet services with DCAS in 2018. DCAS manages fleet
16 services directly for agencies with smaller fleets
17 including taxi, education, health, the sheriff's
18 office, OEM, medical examiner, and others, and
19 supports DOE's office of pupil transportation in
20 various areas with school buses. The city operates 36
21 dedicated repair facilities, and also has fleet
22 repair capacity at 62 sanitation collection garages
23 and through 17 FDNY mobile servicing trucks. Over
24 260,000 service work orders were completed in fiscal
25 year '19. As part of this work Fleet completed over

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

19

2 29,000 New York State motor vehicle inspections and
3 72,000 preventive maintenance inspections. The vast
4 majority of Fleet servicing is performed in-house
5 with more than 93% of Fleet resources dedicated to
6 in-house repair, as opposed to commercial service
7 vendors. The Fleet out-of-service for all agencies is
8 reported each workday, to the main fleet agencies,
9 and also publicly at the Mayor's Office of Operations
10 and DCAS websites, as a public daily performance
11 indicator. The out-of-service was 10.3 for calendar
12 year 2014 at the beginning of the administration and
13 improved to 9.3% for calendar year 2019, of course,
14 lower is better on out-of-surface. DSNY is it 17.4
15 and calendar year '14 and 17.9 and calendar year '19.
16 In December, 2019. The most recent complete most the
17 citywide Fleet out-of-service was much lower at 8.8%
18 citywide and sanitation at 15.3, showing continued
19 improving trends. We use the daily reporting to help
20 us quickly identify concern areas in fleet servicing
21 and focus efforts to improve these areas. Citywide
22 fleet operations are a backbone for the provision of
23 emergency and critical services citywide. The city's
24 trained and skilled mechanics, service workers, tow
25 truck operators, specification writers, claim staff,

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

20

2 administrators, supervisor mechanics, managers,
3 procurement staff, quality assurance specialists,
4 dispatchers, and trainers provide... provide vital, if
5 often behind the scenes, work to keep New York City
6 running every day. Fleet equipment is one of our
7 primary support resources. For many of our 80,000
8 qualified fleet operators the vehicle is their
9 office, and their primary workstation. We are proud
10 of the work that our fleet service professionals and
11 our fleet operators do to take care of New York City,
12 every day. Today Fleet agencies also work together in
13 ways never before imagine much less achieved the bi-
14 weekly Fleet Federation meetings are models of
15 collaborative government, breaking down silos, and
16 pursuing positive change. None of this is easy and
17 none of it is given. Fleet faces resource and other
18 challenges along with the agencies we serve. We
19 continue to work together to make New York City's
20 fleet the most sustainable, safe, and efficient fleet
21 in the country, and we look forward to talking more
22 with you about that. Thank you very much.

23 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Thank you so much
24 and let me recognize we've been joined by Council
25 Members, Yeger Levine, and Powers. Let me just start

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

21

2 with a couple of question and then pass it along to
3 my co-chair so we could get to our colleagues that I
4 know they have questions and then we'll come back as
5 chairs to... to finalize the other questions. So let me
6 begin by asking you what is their ratio... what is the
7 mechanic to vehicle ratio... ratios for each of the
8 city agencies participating in the unified Fleet?

9 KEITH KERMAN: Okay.

10 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: And with that, let
11 me just couple I... are some agencies have more fleet
12 resources than others? And if so, which ones?

13 KEITH KERMAN: Well sure. So, in a lot of...
14 And I'm going to go through the ratios with you, but
15 also remember our... our agencies have different mixes
16 of vehicles. So, the Department of Sanitation, the
17 Fire Department, and the Department of Transportation
18 are much more heavily focused on trucks. The
19 Department of Parks, the Department of Correction and
20 The Department of Police, which of course have
21 trucking fleet, have a larger mix of light duty or
22 off-road. So, for the big agencies, I'll just go
23 through... And... and when we look at this we look at all
24 vehicle repair staff, including the supervisor
25 mechanics against the fleet size so there are lots of

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

22

2 indicators, but I'm going to go through... So,
3 Department of Sanitation has 10 vehicles per repair
4 staff person. That is the most heavily resourced, the
5 Department of Transportation has 22, the fire
6 department has 12, so that's more consistent with
7 Sanitation. The police... the Department of Parks has
8 36, the NYPD has also 36, and the Department of
9 Correction has 25. So, you really have a heavy duty
10 trucking program on one side, and then you have a
11 kind of mixed fleet program with a different set of
12 ratios on the other side.

13 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: And how does that
14 compare to other major cities?

15 KEITH KERMAN: Well you know our fleet is...
16 is unique. And so, you know, we monitor the
17 resourcing for our fleet and we monitor the daily
18 needs. You know, we... you have to be careful about
19 benchmarking against other fleets that are very
20 different right? They're... If you look at the
21 Department of Sanitation the Fire Department,
22 Department of Transportation and Parks, each of
23 those... and DOT, is the largest and most complex of
24 its version in the United States, if not the world.
25 So... [cross-talk]

2 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: ...that wouldn't
3 affect the ratio. I mean...

4 KEITH KERMAN: I... Sure... So give you an
5 example right off the bat right. The Department of
6 sanitation is fairly unique in that it plows with
7 garbage trucks. Most other municipalities, if not all
8 other municipalities do not do that. So right off the
9 bat, if you take a ratio for garbage truck
10 maintenance from the private sector or from another
11 municipality, that does... isn't charged with plowing
12 with their garbage trucks, you're going to get a
13 basis that is not necessarily...

14 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: But you will compare
15 apples with apples obviously we'll compare with
16 Chicago or other municipalities that are... that do
17 have the challenge of removing snow. So that's,
18 that's what I'm looking for. Have we done an analysis
19 to be able to compare? Such as... Let's... for example
20 Chicago, I think it would be great example, or any
21 larger cities that are in the northern part United
22 States.

23 KEITH KERMAN: Yeah. We've not looked at
24 the ratios of mechanics for those organizations. I'm
25 very familiar with the Chicago maintenance program.

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

24

2 When we were developing some of the consolidation
3 program, Chicago was a model that we looked at
4 Chicago created a central fleet agency, and it was
5 something, and did a lot of consolidation and shared
6 servicing, very similar to what we do. In terms of
7 resourcing, though, look you know there are lots of
8 standards out there that you can find a private
9 company that'll tell you we should have half as many
10 mechanics, you can have another one that'll tell you
11 we should have double. We look at it... you know we
12 track resourcing very closely with OMB we're tracking
13 this every day service, every single day. And so we
14 kind of focus on what we're doing, what agencies need
15 to get serviced, what is the status of our fleet
16 every single day. We're happy to talk to you about if
17 there are benchmarks that are helpful and that we can
18 look at. And the most important benchmark we're
19 looking at is what's happening every morning.

20 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: In terms of being
21 able to determine when a repair is require... when...
22 whenever you need an outside contractor rather, what
23 is the criteria that you use?

24 KEITH KERMAN: So, right off the bat, most
25 of our repair is in house. 93%, it's really more than

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

25

2 93%, because some of the facility costs don't get
3 tracked but 93% of our costs are in house. So, of a
4 300 plus million dollar program, we do \$26 million in
5 commercial services. That was the number last year.
6 And that's 7% of the total maintenance budget,
7 excluding the fleet facility repairs which are very
8 expensive, but separately tracked. What we got... what
9 is maintained... Right off the bat, certain types of
10 upfits are contracted, so lights and sirens, radios
11 will be contracted, not in all cases but most, body
12 and glass has historically been contracted. The city
13 has a minimal amount of in house capacity for body
14 and glass, but most agencies are not in a position to
15 do all their own collision crash work. Specialized
16 repairs are contracted. Every agency has a contract.
17 The main contract uses the state ARI contract. So the
18 New York State Procurement offers an ARI contract,
19 every agency has access to it, it's been in place for
20 decades. And that'll be used for specialized repairs.
21 Repairs, where we may not have the capacity to do
22 that work, the skills to do that work at any
23 particular time or, you know, we may need... So, other
24 times we do... certainly, like after major events,
25 Hurricane Sandy, we had every mechanic working every

2 minute overtime, but obviously we had to access
3 private resources. We had 600 vehicles destroyed
4 during Hurricane Sandy. We had a lot going on. We
5 have a facility issue right now with the central
6 repair shop at sanitation, which is the biggest
7 repair shop we have, biggest repair shop anybody has.
8 And so we have a capital project, working to repair
9 that facility. That's probably the biggest issue in
10 fleet right now, and certainly if we need to use
11 additional contracting capacity to get us through
12 this period, we do. DCAS also manages the client
13 fleet program, mostly focused on light duty vehicles
14 out of downtown Brooklyn and lower Manhattan. And
15 that's also maintained through the ARI program. It's
16 inspected by four city mechanics who work for us at
17 DCAS, and that's a program that's been in place for,
18 I think, 30 or so years.

19 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: My last, my last
20 question because I want to get to hearing moving
21 here. And it's related to lawsuits involving city
22 related vehicles, and the having to know how many
23 claims were filed against the city arising from an
24 alleged collision between a city vehicle or an,
25 and/or a pedestrian or another vehicle. And would

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

27

2 dashboard cameras provide useful information in the
3 course of this lawsuits?

4

5 KEITH KERMAN: So sure. So claims is a big
6 issue for us. I'm going see if I, my colleague will
7 give me the numbers, but it's 100... in fiscal year '19
8 the city spent 120 million dollars on claims related
9 to the city fleet. That does not include workers
10 compensation and certain types of body repairs so the
11 full number is higher. The three major agencies are
12 our three biggest agencies, the department
13 sanitation, the police department and the fire
14 department. We are focused through our vision zero
15 efforts in reducing those claims. We've talked a
16 little bit in the hearing this morning about some of
17 the technology investments. So, on dashcams
18 specifically, we have implemented 400 camera systems
19 as part of the safe fleet transition plan, so far,
20 and we are evaluating them along with 3,000 driver
21 alert systems in 2,000 automatic braking systems. We
22 want to get drivers the best possible visual and
23 audio cues to guide them. We... assess this technology
24 though, so as I talked about earlier today and then
25 Greg can talk more about, you know, in the light duty

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

28

2 side driver alert is more heavily established, on the
3 trucking side, it's more in development. We
4 absolutely want to get this type of assistance for
5 our drivers. We also need to do so in a way that does
6 not distract drivers that does not take their
7 attention away from the road, because they're looking
8 at a camera system. And so that's what we're in the
9 testing process for. Every single major fleet agency
10 is doing different testing right now whether of
11 surround cameras or other types of camera systems.
12 We're also working with the sheriff's department. The
13 medical examiner, on dashcam implementation in taxi.
14 So we are committed to moving this forward in getting
15 the best alert possible. We think this is critical.
16 We also need to do it right and I'm not sure of great
17 wants to...

18 GREG ANDERSON: Yeah, I think specifically
19 to the department of sanitation, we don't have
20 dashcams in any of our heavy duty equipment at this
21 time, we're always working with DCAS, DOT, the vision
22 zero task force to evaluate new safety equipment.
23 We've tried a few different models of the driver
24 alert technology it's, it's, I think a little bit
25 less far along for heavy duty vehicles, because

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

29

2 they're more complicated, they're operating right
3 along the curve line. We're trying to find the right
4 balance of giving drivers information without as, as
5 Keith said distracting them. So we continue to test
6 new technologies and, and we're committed to making
7 our fleet as safe as possible.

8 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: But the thought that
9 I had in mind was if we have a camera that just like
10 body cams and police officers. I think that it will
11 help us with in terms of clarity and also raises the
12 level of awareness for the drivers or any vehicle so
13 I think it's a win-win. I think we will be able to
14 reduce the hundred... what did you mention hundred \$140
15 million?

16 KEITH KERMAN: 120 in the, in the law
17 manager reporting.

18 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: That's a substantial
19 amount of...

20 KEITH KERMAN: ...money

21 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: ...that we could be
22 literally using for the services in the city of New
23 York. And, and to be honest with you whatever the
24 cost would be it will be minimal compare to all of
25 these lawsuits. Anything that we could help the

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

30

2 department of sanitation and others, where the
3 technology is already there, to have cameras... the
4 blind side... it's very difficult, especially those who
5 have never driven a truck to, to understand how
6 difficult it is to see everything that's happening at
7 the same time, and those blind spots that are very
8 very very difficult. And I know that driving with the
9 best intention, but if we could get them the best
10 possible tools... that, that would be amazing. Without,
11 let me pass it... to the co-chair. I know we started
12 late and I want to be conscientious of my colleagues
13 and also for those who are going to be testifying
14 afterwards.

15 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you. Thank
16 you chair I wanted to ask a couple of clarifying
17 questions, because you painted a pretty rosy picture
18 of the maintenance of operation of the fleet here in
19 the city of New York. And I just want to see if I get
20 a clear understanding of its rosiness. 179 repair
21 staff. Can you break that down? So who that 179 is or
22 what jobs they do?

23 KEITH KERMAN: You're talking about the
24 increase in repairing that's the increase..
25 [crosstalk] We have 1,400 mechanics in total.

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

31

2 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: And but you...

3 KEITH KERMAN: Mechanics and mechanical
4 servicing...

5 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So just to be
6 clear in his statement you specifically stated that
7 the number of repair staff has increased at 14% in
8 response to the increase of fleet size of 13% during
9 the same period, as reported in the MMR.

10 KEITH KERMAN: That is correct.

11 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So my, my take
12 from that or the intention I think that you have is
13 to show that you've been keeping up with the, the
14 fleet versus maintenance here. And if anything, the
15 maintenance has been keeping up, has been surpassing
16 the, the fleet size in the city of New York. So, what
17 part of my intention is is that this is a new
18 administration that has purchased the most vehicles
19 in its time in six years right? And you're saying
20 that all we needed was 179 increase maintenance
21 workers to operate that increase in vehicles that we
22 have. So I want to know these 179 staff members. What
23 do they do?

24 KEITH KERMAN: Okay, so the these 179 are
25 part of our 1,436. They are across all our different

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

32

2 titles. I can try and you know so there are 13
3 additional supervisor of mechanics. There are 18
4 additional metalwork mechanics. There are about 106
5 additional auto mechanics. There are, in the program
6 I talked about earlier, 42 additional auto service
7 workers, but these 170 do not and I can provide you
8 I'm looking at I can provide you exactly if you need
9 to these 170 of course you're not working isolation
10 from the team of 1,436 technical repair staff who
11 maintain the city fleet, everyone works together, out
12 of the 36 garages, that are dedicated for fleet
13 repair, and then the Department of Sanitation has
14 some aspect of Fleet servicing in all their
15 collection garage so they work together. we work with
16 OMB to try and get additional resources for fleet in
17 terms of rosiness, I'm now in my 26th year and a lot
18 of people behind me, have been doing it a lot longer.
19 There's nothing rosy about vehicle maintenance. It's
20 all breakdowns, all the time it's all servicing, no
21 one thinks you if your vehicle is working on any
22 given day, they only criticize you when your vehicle
23 is not. So, you know, when I say we are, I, rosy was
24 not my word. I think we work to make progress I think
25 we have made progress, but you know it's like a

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

33

2 hospital right, everyone who comes in has a problem,
3 and it's a tough grindy complicated business that all
4 of us in our colleagues, share so I will never tell
5 you that all is rosy in the fleet repair business.
6 I'll tell you that all is tough in the fleet repair
7 business. That said, we've worked together to make
8 progress each year, and that's what we're trying to
9 do.

10 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay I just want
11 to say a couple of things. I do appreciate the work
12 that you do. I think that the maintenance work that's
13 done in the city is exceptional. I want to help you.
14 The problem is when you come in with a testimony that
15 doesn't speak to urgency and paints a picture of
16 being able to do... you're doing everything right, all
17 the numbers are low, everything is getting lowered
18 then I can't help you. You're saying you're perfectly
19 fine. If you need more doctors in a hospital we want
20 to be able to get more doctors in the hospital so
21 they can handle that. And that's the point that I
22 guess I'm trying to make for you that when you do
23 this type of testimony, you leave us with the wrong
24 impression of the needs that you have. So I just want
25 to be more clear about what those needs are. So 106...

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

34

2 So I'm thinking about the SNY, I'm the sanitation
3 chair in your ratios you include 13 supervisors,
4 which I'm assuming they're not doing the physical
5 work on the vehicle they're managing the work that's
6 being done by the rest of the mechanics.

7 KEITH KERMAN: Yeah, these are the
8 supervisor... This is a trades title.

9 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Right.

10 KEITH KERMAN: This is the supervisor
11 mechanical equipment title.

12 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Alright.

13 KEITH KERMAN: This is the promotional
14 line for auto mechanics, but of course they are in
15 the supervisory side that's not...

16 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: They're holding...
17 they're not holding... but they don't have a wrench in
18 their hand repairing a truck?

19 KEITH KERMAN: In most cases no.

20 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay. The 42
21 service workers What does a service worker do? Is a
22 service worker working on an engine working on
23 brakes? I just want to understand because service
24 workers, what is that? Is that somebody putting like
25 windshield wiper fluid on a truck? Like are they, you

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

35

2 know, making sure that, you know, things are clean,
3 or are they mechanics? Are they operating the
4 vehicle, so that it could move?

5 KEITH KERMAN: Alright so the fleet
6 industry, traditionally has three titles. In outside
7 maybe talked about benchmarking so we can talk a
8 little bit about how in the city mirror said, you
9 have the level A mechanic; the top and highly
10 qualified fully qualified mechanic, you have the
11 level B mechanic; sometimes referred to a journey
12 person, who does a lot of production work, and then
13 you have the level C mechanic; who was a helper, who
14 would be doing assistant work that could be
15 preventive maintenance inspections, fluids, tire
16 changes, checking for the body, assisting mechanics,
17 but the work orders in parts work. So the city has
18 essentially the same, obviously we have very specific
19 civil service specs, but essentially the same
20 structure you have the full A mechanic and the city
21 has gasoline or they're all... the straight A mechanic,
22 the diesel mechanic, as well as specialty mechanics,
23 electrical mechanic, metal work mechanic, machinists
24 all are generally paid at the same level and all of a
25 high qualified fully capable mechanics. We then have

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

36

2 the Auto Service Worker title. Historically, that was
3 senior Auto Service Worker Auto Service Worker, it
4 was broadbanded by DCAS as one of our initiatives in
5 2012. And so now it's Auto Service Worker 1, which is
6 the entry level title, the equivalent of that C
7 helper and auto service worker 2, a little bit more
8 capable and empowered employed. So what we... and
9 that's the fleet industry. What we want to do is have
10 a good mix of those titles. One because that's
11 efficient fleet operation. The Auto Service Worker
12 title, which does the things we talked about general
13 preventive maintenance, fluids, vehicle checks, the
14 tires, that's a lot of work that has to be done, and
15 assisting auto mechanics is an important part of any
16 mechanical garage and not new to the city. So,
17 police, correction, parks today, and I've spent 17
18 years at parks so my whole time, have about 30% auto
19 service workers. Other... the trucking agencies which
20 we expect to have a lower percentage, we don't
21 disagree, but that is about 10 or 12%. So it's always
22 been a part of our mix. But we, you know, have been
23 charged by OMB to look at what that mix should be so
24 that's kind of how it works. So, it's also a very
25 important entry level title, we want to open up this

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

37

2 tremendous industry of skilled and really great jobs
3 to our high school students and to other people want
4 to break in, you're not going to break into one of
5 these jobs at an \$80,000 full A level, We need to
6 have a pattern here.

7 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay so... Yeah I
8 hear you. I don't think, I think... when you answer the
9 question I think you're missing the intention that...
10 So out of all the fleet's DSNY and FDNY which is also
11 emergency service vehicles, ambulances, right, fire
12 trucks and DSNY which is emergency vehicles for its
13 own intents and purposes, have the highest rate of
14 need for repair, we're talking 18-19% respectively.
15 Alright so that's very high. So, what I'm assuming
16 there is that the bigger trucks, which are
17 ambulances, fire trucks, and garbage trucks, which I
18 think would be probably the largest trucks in our
19 entire fleet are the ones that need the most help.

20 KEITH KERMAN: Absolutely.

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So when I see
22 service worker... a lot... I don't think, I want to
23 dismiss any job, I think all jobs are important, but
24 what I'm looking for is how do we close the gap on
25 this 20% out of rate, out of work rate for these

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

38

2 other two. And I'm assuming that's auto mechanic, or
3 that's the Level A mechanics. So now I would ask how
4 many level a mechanics do you have because it doesn't
5 seem like we're closing the gap there and 2, in the
6 work that you're sending out, the 7% that is being
7 contracted out, how many of those have a level A type
8 work is I guess is what I'm asking right? Because if
9 now you're saying up to 7%, it's mostly going to be
10 to do heavy work. And I just want to again speak to
11 this issue that it seems like the gap we have here
12 are actual like full blown auto mechanics and that
13 we're short. And then two, I just want to keep going
14 here, 20% to me seems like a lot. I don't know if to
15 you it seems like a lot, especially on our emergency
16 vehicles, 20 percent is a problem. If 20 of us or we
17 didn't show up to 20% of our work will be in the
18 front of the New York Post. If you know 20% of the
19 stuff that anyone does is missing you know, it would
20 be concern people. So, these are tax dollars that are
21 being invested by the City of New York and 20% of it
22 is sitting out of work, out of, out of life. So just
23 want you to explain to me this 20%. Why is it there?
24 And why is this gap so large in these emergency
25 vehicle agencies?

2 GREG ANDERSON: So, first thank you Chair
3 Reynoso, Chair Cabrera for holding this meeting. I
4 think it's not often enough that the council looks
5 behind the curtain and looks at some of the support
6 activities that help us deliver our services so thank
7 you for doing that, just speaking for sanitation in
8 particular Last year, for example fiscal year 2019,
9 we had an average out of service rate for our
10 collection trucks of 22%. I think that's really the
11 number that we're that we're talking about here is
12 collection truck down rate. It's important to keep in
13 mind that our target is not 100%. Our target is in
14 the 18 to 20% range, because every day we have, we
15 have vehicles down for warranty repairs we have
16 vehicles down for preventative maintenance, we take a
17 truck down every 40 days to do a preventative
18 maintenance appointment. So that's a significant
19 amount of trucks that are down not because there's
20 anything wrong, but because we're taking a look at
21 them and making sure that they're, they're ready to
22 go. The important metric that we look at is are we
23 able to get out the door every morning, are we able
24 to get a truck in the hands of every sanitation
25 worker crew, and that's really what our mechanics are

2 working toward. With the staffing we have today we
3 are able to do that. When you... to go back to some of
4 the earlier questions about outsourcing and about the
5 challenges we're facing. I just want to reiterate a
6 point that Keith made which is the biggest challenge
7 that we're facing in fleet maintenance and sanitation
8 is not people, its facilities, we have a total of 400
9 or so repair bays where you can actually fix a trunk
10 or a car in sanitation, 62 of those are currently
11 unavailable to us, 25 at the central repair shop,
12 about 40% of the total, at that central repair shop
13 are out because of a long term capital project to
14 replace the floor slab. It's a very important
15 project. The building is over 60 years old, it has to
16 happen eventually. But, you know, it's something
17 that's a challenge for us. And because of that, we
18 have had to move more work out of the agency, out of
19 our are very skilled mechanics, especially things
20 like the spreader upgrades that we did over the
21 summer, things like that that take up a lot of space,
22 we unfortunately had to move out as soon as that
23 project's complete we'll move that back in house in
24 two years or so. So there, that's, that's the biggest

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

41

2 obstacle that we face, obviously looking at
3 resources...

4 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I just want to
5 just repeat...

6 GREG ANDERSON: Yes?

7 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: You're saying to
8 7% is, has to do more with facility space than it
9 does with...

10 GREG ANDERSON: I can't speak to the
11 whole...

12 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: ...being able to do
13 it in the house.

14 GREG ANDERSON: I can't speak to the
15 whole city government spending... I would imagine that
16 our spending is probably far less than 7% in terms of
17 overall fleet maintenance spending on outsourcing
18 it's probably I would say less than five maybe closer
19 to three. I don't have that number on me but within
20 sanitation in particular facility space is the
21 primary obstacle that we're facing.

22 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Can I can ask you
23 what the expected life of a sanitation truck is and
24 what the actual life of sanitation truck is in the
25 City of New York?

2 GREG ANDERSON: Sure, our target for
3 average... or our target for life cycle is eight years
4 for collection trucks both rear loader and dual bin
5 collection trucks. Right now we're a little bit over
6 that. I think we're at 3.6 is the average age so life
7 span of 7.2 for dual bins and 5.1 for collection
8 trucks so I think...

9 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: 10.2 years?

10 GREG ANDERSON: Yeah so overall I would
11 say the life cycle is closer to nine, but we are
12 working with OMB to, to make sure that our capital
13 plan can support that eight year lifecycle.

14 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Yeah so my issue
15 with the eight year lifecycle, I would love it, but
16 it doesn't seem like we're purchasing vehicles at the
17 rate that we should, which puts more pressure on
18 these mechanics to do this work. So they were...
19 they're pretty much adding a year to two of life on
20 these trucks. That makes it more, more dangerous or
21 destructive or dangerous or the work that they're
22 doing is more. It's a harder work right I six year
23 old truck looks a lot different than an eight year
24 old truck right? So it means that the type of work
25 they're doing is more, more, just more laborous is

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

43

2 what I'm saying. And then there was this conversation
3 about the average age of the fleet being lowered. And
4 I want to be very clear that has more to do with the
5 fact that we purchase, so many new vehicles and it
6 does about the work that the mechanics are doing. So
7 I don't think that there is an intention to mislead
8 here but I want to be perfectly, like I just want to
9 make sure that we're clear, that has more to do with
10 the fact that we just bought so many new vehicles,
11 especially in the small like lightweight, or smaller
12 vehicles that I guess what would we call them? Light
13 duty vehicles as opposed to heavy duty vehicles...

14 KEITH KERMAN: Well, a few things I'm
15 gonna go back to... One, we've made in... we bought \$2
16 billion worth of vehicles. Most of that expenditure
17 is heavy equipment. Most of that is garbage... and we
18 just made a major purchase of 600 garbage trucks, we
19 have up the replacement schedule to about five and a
20 half years...

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: ...by money... I just
22 want to... by money. So, one, you know, Chevy Volt will
23 cost you, 30/40 grand, one garbage will call you...
24 cost you 250 grand so by money, money wise I got it,

25

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

44

2 but I'm saying, physical vehicles, the amount of
3 vehicles that we have.

4 KEITH KERMAN: Okay, but we are reducing
5 the age in all our categories. In all our eight, all
6 our agencies we have reduced the average age we have
7 newer vehicles. We certainly still have older trucks
8 department of transportation still has some older
9 trucks. We're trying to move forward. We are always
10 receptive to increasing the replacement cycle for
11 sanitation trucks, for fire ambulances. We've made a
12 lot of progress on ambulances to have a much more
13 aggressive replacement age. So we are investing money
14 and we, we have... We do have a newer fleet. I do also
15 want to double down just to go into your issue about
16 20% and it can seem in a non-intuitive number. I
17 mentioned in my testimony, we do 70,000 preventive
18 maintenance inspections, and that is good fleet
19 practice. Sanitation has been a great leader in that,
20 on average for the city fleet, we try and do about
21 two per vehicle, but we're doing much more for
22 ambulances, much more for garbage trucks. So a lot of
23 times when we're saying something is out of service.
24 It's not... most, frankly, the out of service is not oh
25 it broke down and it's... you know, it's just stranded

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

45

2 in the street. Most of that is, as Greg mentioned,
3 our warranty program, our mandated motor vehicle
4 inspection program, and the preventive maintenance
5 inspection program in many cases, most cases, if you
6 really needed to use that vehicle you could, you know
7 it's like your annual physical at a doctor if, if you
8 have to leave you leave and come back so, so you know
9 it's not that these are you know unusable wrecks all
10 over the place. A lot of this is preventive
11 maintenance, the city has had decades commitment to
12 preventive maintenance. It's really the right way to
13 go. And so some of what we're doing in servicing is
14 really a good fleet practice of preventive
15 maintenance.

16 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I have more
17 questions but I want to allow for my colleagues ask
18 them so while I'm in the second round I'll come back
19 and ask more questions. And I just want to say, I
20 appreciate the work you do. I think you're, are doing
21 a good job, but I think you need more help. And
22 that's what I'm here...

23 KEITH KERMAN: And I want to answer
24 something because I didn't answer it before, so you
25 know look I'm the manager I get I know I can come and

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

46

2 tell you I need x, y, z because I get in trouble. But
3 here's what you... certainly, if we were going to focus
4 resource it is absolutely in two areas, heavy trucks,
5 number one, right. So if you're asking where we have
6 issues DEP specialized truck, sanitation trucks, and
7 ambulances are absolutely in the area of those areas
8 the ones that we sweat out, right. So if we can get
9 more resourcing, you know, it's our job to make do
10 with what we have every day and we'll do that. And,
11 you know, but certainly those specialized you're
12 absolutely right, the specialized trucks, and if I
13 were going to point out three areas. It's DEP
14 specialized tracks, a lot of these water and sewer
15 trucks are very complicated to maintain, its
16 ambulances, which are incredibly complicated, the
17 hardest operation in the fleet. It's our 24/7
18 operation. Ambulances don't turn off. They are always
19 running so what... if we salvage an ambulance at
20 120,000 miles with engine wear that's probably like
21 300,000 miles. And then the third, of course, is
22 sanitation and plow trucks. The other area that we're
23 working with OMB on and that is, you know, as part of
24 the pedestrian ramp program that the city council and
25 the administration are working on with the DOT, we

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

47

2 will have to increase trucking resources at the DOT
3 to fulfill the requirements of the pedestrian ramp
4 upgrades. And so that's something we're working with
5 DOT and OMB to resource, and that may also involve a
6 facility. And that again will be focused on heavy
7 trucks but that's a new area that's, that's coming in
8 that we want to make sure we do right.

9 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Thank you so much to
11 the Co-chairs. Very good questions. And the fact is
12 we do want to be helpful, we basically saying we want
13 to give you more, want to give you more but...

14 KEITH KERMAN: OMB normally does not have
15 that perspective...

16 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Yeah I know, that's
17 why we're here. That's why we have the council. Let
18 me recognize that we've been joined by... we had... OMB,
19 it was said in jest, we took it that way, okay. We
20 didn't... it's not an official statement. It was said
21 in... it was said jokingly... We heard it. But we were
22 joined by Council Member Ben Kallos and Council
23 Member Maisel, so let me turn it over now to Council
24 Member Vallone followed by Council Member Salamanca.

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you to our
3 co-chairs. Critical hearing, talking about the men
4 and women and the reason why we chose this city to
5 live in is because of the agencies that are sitting
6 behind you and the men and women that work in them.
7 So it is our duty to make sure they have the best
8 vehicles, they can possibly have. And not stretch
9 them out over 8/10 years and keep adding the years
10 back, what... it seems clear on a lot of these topics
11 that we're in agreement, that the transition of the
12 fleet needs to occur from diesel into newer vehicles,
13 that we do not have enough mechanics, that we do not
14 have enough repair space, and we have no answers as
15 to why parts take forever to get to where they need
16 to be. So if I'm running the agency, and I'm putting
17 my hat on I need answers to those questions if I'm
18 going to run an agency. Who is handling the RFP
19 process for parts, what companies are handling those
20 parts, and why do we not have fines liabilities or a
21 paybacks on these contracts, if they're holding up
22 every agency because we're waiting for friggin [sic]
23 part.

24

25

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

49

2 KEITH KERMAN: Okay, so we've done a lot
3 of work on auto parts. Auto parts, historically, is a
4 been... has been a vexing topic in fleet. I...

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: What does fixing
6 topic mean?

7 KEITH KERMAN: It's getting parts
8 delivered has been a challenge for, for certainly my
9 25 years, but we've made a lot of progress on that.
10 So, as well as addressing the inventory issues, and
11 having, holding all kinds of inventory. So DCAS led
12 in the mayor's office of operations led, starting
13 2012, what we call the strategic parts partnership in
14 a new contracting model, which has been implemented
15 now at 16 locations where a company, the current
16 contract holder is genuine parts company, supplies
17 the auto parts and manages the inventory.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: So how long is
19 that contract in place for?

20 KEITH KERMAN: It's now in its sixth or
21 seventh year. It's a 10 year full contract. It's in
22 its sixth or seventh year. Where we use the GPC
23 program on any given day, and that's about 35% of the
24 auto parts right now, on any given day, you would
25 have no more than 100 to 200 waiting parts. We have

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

50

2 10s of thousands of waiting parts in the previous
3 model. So where we've used GPC we've done two things,
4 we get parts daily, in very quickly...

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Is 100 parts that
6 are missing in an entire fleet...

7 KEITH KERMAN: No they'll just be...

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: That's what you
9 just said...

10 KEITH KERMAN: 100 parts in the whole
11 system that might be waiting on any given day. Let me
12 give you a reference point. In the pre... in the in-
13 house model, that number is over 100,000. So, we have
14 made a lot of... Now the in-house model is mostly
15 focused on heavy trunk parts which are more
16 complicated issues. But... and we are working on
17 extending that contract program to the heavy duty
18 side. So, wherever we're using the genuine parts
19 company model, we're doing two things one we're
20 getting almost all the parts, immediately. And so we
21 have solved, a lot of the issue you described.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: They have solved
23 some of the problems and have better numbers from the
24 past and that's why we're congratulating because we
25 want to work with you on that but clearly even in

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

51

2 your own testimony it's stated by yourself that that
3 is an issue. So if that's an issue and if everyone
4 sitting behind you says it's an issue and we up here
5 say it's an issue then we have regulatory power,
6 contractual power. We have ways to bring any contract
7 or vendor in, I don't care what agency it is, to have
8 them accountable to the contract that they signed,
9 because we in the city should not be held accountable
10 for a part for a very similar type of Fleet that may
11 be changing, they need to get those parts to our
12 shops and get them to our mechanics. Now, if, if a
13 truck is out of service how does it clear to get back
14 into service? How does a truck get cleared to be
15 properly safely put back into the fleet?

16 KEITH KERMAN: Okay, so each vehicle that
17 comes in would be diagnosed by a city mechanic. It
18 would be a work...

19 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Mechanic?

20 KEITH KERMAN: Sure. Absolutely.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Does a safety
22 worker or mechanic worker have the ability to do
23 that?

24

25

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

52

2 KEITH KERMAN: The service worker? Service
3 workers are not... the... they're doing this... again the
4 same kind of preventive work, and support work...

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: But they're not
6 contractually allowed to... [crosstalk]

7 KEITH KERMAN: They're not signing off on
8 the final work orders...

9 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: So if we don't
10 have a mechanic in the repair shop a fleet vehicle
11 cannot go back on the street?

12 KEITH KERMAN: That is correct.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: So it goes back
14 to the question that the co-chairs were asking. We
15 need more mechanics on numerous levels in order to
16 get this fleet moving. Have you determined the number
17 of mechanics that we are still short?

18 KEITH KERMAN: We... well first... most of our
19 city mechanical staff are full mechanics, 88% of our
20 mechanical staff are full mechanics, the service
21 workers that you mentioned are a small percentage of
22 the city, mechanical workforce. The second issue is...

23 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: No, the first
24 issue was my question. How many mechanics do we need
25 to meet the need of our fleet? That's my question.

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

53

2 KEITH KERMAN: Look we, we, you know, to
3 say the answer's some... you know hypothetically what,
4 what do we need? We work based in the baseline
5 budgeting with the resources that we have. We've
6 expanded the number of mechanics by 170. And we work
7 with OMB in each specific area I mentioned a few of
8 those areas where we think there are critical
9 resource issues. So, you know, the question is, are
10 we solving problems that we have, and are we arguing
11 for resources in areas where we're seeing issues that
12 we are doing. If, if you're asking me to just give
13 you kind of what... [crosstalk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: No I think it's
15 pretty... clear what I'm asking you...

16 KEITH KERMAN: I don't have kind of a book
17 number, you know, to give you on mechanics in a fleet
18 operation... [crosstalk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: So is there a
20 mechanic ratio per unit that we can use that's safety
21 related? To say there's X amount of mechanics per the
22 amount of fleet that should be working on? That would
23 seem to be a good place to start. So if I have 1000
24 vehicles and I need 10 mechanics I've gotta [sic]

25

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

54

2 have 10 for the 1000 that's in there so what...

3 [crosstalk] what mechanic ratio are we using?

4 KEITH KERMAN: Again we... Well I went
5 through the mechanic ratios earlier in my testimony...

6 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: So if we use
7 those ratios how many mechanics are we short?

8 KEITH KERMAN: We're not saying we're
9 short on mechanics, we're, you know, in a broader
10 ratio sense. That's not something that I'm coming to
11 you with. We argue for resourcing tied to...

12 [crosstalk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: So why are we
14 outsourcing vehicles to be repaired if we have the
15 proper amount of staff to handle it.

16 KEITH KERMAN: Again, we don't outsource
17 much. We outsource...

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: But we're
19 outsourcing.

20 KEITH KERMAN: We are but some of that's
21 very specialized areas. So we're outsourcing
22 autobody, we have for decades. You know, that is a
23 very specific specialty, we outsource certain types
24 of one sharp projects, the side guard initiative
25 which is so important to us is one that we are doing

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

55

2 with vendors. Part of the benefit of that is we are
3 creating a vendor industry to do side guards, not
4 just for us but for the private sector, certain types
5 of what we call...

6 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: So I'm, I'm...
7 we're not getting really answers and comparing to
8 what the co-chairs are asking I want to fight with
9 OMB, fight in a budget that's supposed to be very
10 scarce this year in order to give the agencies they
11 need what they need. And safety requirements are not
12 just saying, well, some shorts can go back out
13 because it's just a warranty issue and it's okay. You
14 know that's, that's not the guarantee I want to give
15 the workers of the people that are behind you. I want
16 to make sure that they have what they need and in
17 order to service them, city like this, it's demanding
18 and that's why we commend you for what you've taken
19 it to be. But we've got work to do so. My last
20 question I'll turn it over to the Co-chairs is... You
21 haven't answered what resources are there you need,
22 what, what resources this year are we fighting for?
23 Whether I'm sitting in aging or I'm sitting in
24 veterans or I'm sitting in any committee... as we're
25 coming up to budget season... what resources do you

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

56

2 need to meet the goals of the many agencies that you
3 represent?

4 KEITH KERMAN: Okay so again I outlined a
5 little bit earlier, the resourcing where we have been
6 making requests involve DOT on the Patreon [sp?]
7 program. The fire department has put in requests,
8 tied to specialized equipment. And then the
9 Department of Sanitation is also always arguing and
10 pushing for resourcing tied to specialized emergency
11 equipment. So those are all new need requests that
12 are in place. Those go from agencies and how we
13 operate those go from agencies to OMB, and then DCAS
14 is part of that conversation. Those resources are
15 within agencies so specific new need requests come in
16 from agencies from fire, police, and sanitation to
17 OMB. They don't come from DCAS to OMB, that's just
18 kind of how we're structured.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Well that's part
20 of a... Once you unify the fleet, this becomes part of
21 the conversation if we're going to take over the
22 entire fleet and see agencies are not going to fight
23 for their own when it comes to you we can't say that.
24 We have to be able to fight for all of that now
25 because it's under your purview.

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

57

2 KEITH KERMAN: Yeah we are involved in all
3 of those conversations.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Well, I would
5 think that based on the numbers and the ratios that
6 you put in front of me, we are short hundreds of
7 mechanics and until we get the proper amount of
8 mechanics, the garage space to service to vehicles,
9 the leasing space in order to give those garages, the
10 ability to expand, not contract, and get this
11 vehicle transition that's huge budgetary priorities,
12 and that's goes beyond this one hearing so that's
13 where I want to fight for you to have those resources
14 to do that. Thank you to the co-chairs, thank you so
15 much. Let me turn it over now to Council Member
16 Salamanca.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you,
18 chair. Good afternoon. Just have a few questions
19 about fleets that are sponsored by the Council during
20 the budget. So, I, in this fiscal year '20 for
21 example, I gave three precincts 204,000 dollars for
22 'paddy wagons'. What is the timeframe from when it's
23 passed in the council to when that specific precinct
24 actually gets that van.

25

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

58

2 KEITH KERMAN: Okay so depending on
3 whether it's an expensive vehicle or a capital
4 vehicle for an expensive vehicle, if the money is in
5 a particular fiscal year budget and the agency's
6 going forward with procurement We have to get the
7 vehicles by June 30th and that almost always happens.
8 If it's a capital vehicle, if it's a more specialized
9 truck, then that would go through the CP process.
10 There is a longer lead time on the build out for, for
11 trucks and equipment that can be nine months to a
12 year depending on the contract.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Alright so,
14 worst case scenario... and it's capital dollars..
15 [crosstalk]

16 KEITH KERMAN: I'm not familiar with...

17 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: ...would be... No,
18 I know that. So if it's capital you would say it
19 would take about a year?

20 KEITH KERMAN: It could, sure.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: It could take
22 about a year. Okay. Now, I have also allocated
23 funding for other agencies. And so, agencies... for
24 example precincts or for or, or let's say
25 enforcement's for parks enforcement's in the borough

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

59

2 of the Bronx, for Crotona Park have allocated
3 vehicles there as well. Does every borough has a
4 certain amount of fleets of cars that are assigned to
5 that to that specific agency for that borough?

6 KEITH KERMAN: Are you referring to the
7 parks... I mean I can speak to the parks department if
8 that's where...

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Yes, yes... about
10 parks.

11 KEITH KERMAN: I, I've spent much of my
12 adult life there so I can talk about... So, certain...
13 we're aware of actually an increase in parks
14 enforcement patrol staffing, that has taken place,
15 and we are working with parks to facilitate, you
16 know, vehicle resourcing for that. The parks
17 department is big, is broken down into borough
18 operations, borough operations, borough park
19 enforcement, borough forestry, and then there is a
20 city wide operation in each area at the parks
21 department. So it's really both. You have borrow
22 based offer our base resources in every kind of core
23 function in parks, then you will also have a city
24 wide division or unit in the same so there's city
25 wide forestry, there's borough forestry in the same...

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

60

2 in park enforcement. So we work with agencies to
3 fulfill needs. We are under an executive order
4 mandate, an environmental mandate to reduce the size
5 of the city fleet. So we do also work with agencies
6 when they get new need staffing, to see if there are
7 other vehicles within the fleet that we can reassign
8 and better utilize to fulfill that mandate so we're
9 always trying to balance expansion in city research...
10 government expansion and city hiring with the
11 environmental and resource side to keep the fleet as
12 small as we possibly can. But by... but I am familiar...
13 we are working with the parks department actually I
14 believe there's a meeting tomorrow relating to that,
15 to facilitate some of the parks permit issues
16 including the park enforcement...

17 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: And going back...
18 jumping to NYPD let's say the four, 4-1 precinct in
19 my district, are they assigned a certain amount of
20 police cars? How does every precinct get their number
21 of fleets or their cars, or their vehicles?

22 KEITH KERMAN: We should really direct
23 that so that's an operational question for NYPD
24 right. So DCAS does not assign vehicles...

25

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

61

2 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: But they're,
3 they're responsible for that?

4 KEITH KERMAN: Yes

5 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Okay.

6 KEITH KERMAN: DCAS is not... we service, we
7 acquire, we of course work with agencies on
8 resourcing, we do not assign vehicles to units or
9 districts or drivers. That's an operational function
10 we don't tell any...

11 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: And that, that
12 also applies to sanitation and parks depart...

13 KEITH KERMAN: Every agency right.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: So you...

15 KEITH KERMAN: We do not tell an agency
16 how to use vehicles. The vehicles are there for them
17 to perform their, their operational missions. We
18 don't assign vehicles at agencies.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: That's clear.

20 My, my concern to be honest is if I assign... If the 4-
21 1 precinct for example has 50 vehicles assigned to
22 them, and I give them funding for two new 'paddy
23 wagons'. I want to ensure that the agency is not
24 cheating them of those two. In other words, the
25 deducting two from wha they're already assigned and

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

62

2 say okay we're going to take this council funding
3 with these two new vehicles and you know, keeping
4 that number there. If I'm giving them funding for two
5 new vehicles, I would like to see an increase of
6 vehicles, opposed to that number staying same I don't
7 know if that's...

8 KEITH KERMAN: I understand.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Yeah. All
10 right, and then what's the turnaround time for
11 maintenance of vehicles, especially for enforcement
12 agencies?

13 KEITH KERMAN: You know, we have a
14 complicated fleet. There are 160 types of vehicles in
15 our fleet from on-road to emergency to, to off-road.
16 And so that's... you know that's... we track... and let me
17 give you a better answer. There's no one fixed
18 answer. It depends on what a vehicle has come in for,
19 what type of vehicle it is. Alright so if you're
20 coming in for you know your brakes to be checked.
21 That's obviously going to turn it around fairly
22 quickly. If you're coming in because your engine is
23 shot, and you need to get it replaced that could be
24 weeks. You know, so, and it's a very complicated
25 fleet. So what I can tell you is, we track every work

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

63

2 order through the fleet management system for the,
3 for all our fleet assets for all 160 types of
4 vehicles, and we're always looking to see, are we
5 turning around quickly enough, is it consistent
6 across agencies does a Prius, take the same amount of
7 time to fix at one agency, as it does to another. And
8 if you have very specific questions about a set of
9 vehicles that you were interested in, we could kind
10 of go back and get that for you but you know it's... in
11 that sense it's, it's a pretty complicated set, and
12 we are doing 160 types of vehicles and literally
13 hundreds and hundreds of different types of tasks and
14 functions, being that is why this industry is so
15 complicated. They're just so many different types of
16 functions that you could be fulfilling and to fix a
17 vehicle at any time.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: And then my
19 final question when vehicles are taking out for
20 maintenance, are they provide with loners so that
21 they can continue that work and you know that work
22 does not get delayed?

23 KEITH KERMAN: In sanitation... can talk...
24 So, some agencies have more excess capacity and this
25 is an issue within fleet, some agencies have more

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

64

2 excess capacity, where you will have additional
3 vehicles or surplus vehicles than others. We do have
4 part of the commercial charges that we talked about,
5 is the Zipcar program right. We do offer the Zipcar
6 program to all city agencies for the light duty non-
7 emergency side, so that if your vehicle is out of
8 service, you can in the interim go and get a Zipcar
9 and use that for a week or two, if that's a problem.
10 For the heavy duty side, we try and build in as much
11 extra resource as we can... I'm not sure if Greg wants
12 to talk about...

13 GREG ANDERSON: Yeah so, so for example,
14 you know, we have a daily target that we know we have
15 to hit, as far as the number of routes and crews that
16 are going out the door every morning. So we plan to
17 that number. And our goal of course is to is to have
18 enough trucks out in order to cover that. If we have
19 to we'll, we'll move a truck from one borough to
20 another or one district to another, but generally we
21 plan to have enough spare and outage. In each of the
22 districts to be able to accommodate the planned
23 maintenance and repair need.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: All right,
25 thank you. Just, just on a final note so fiscal year

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

65

2 '20 I allocated 205,000 dollars to the 4-0, the 4-1,
3 and the 4-2. And I guess you got a couple of more
4 months before that one year period expires. So, if
5 they don't have their vehicles in July, I'll be
6 knocking on your door.

7 KEITH KERMAN: Okay. That was expense
8 funding?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: No, it's
10 capital, it's capital funding.

11 KEITH KERMAN: Okay, capital is not on
12 the...

13 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: You said it
14 takes a year for capital.

15 KEITH KERMAN: It will take a year,
16 correct. So I will check in on, on those particular...

17 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Alright.
18 Alright thank you very much. Thank you Mr. Chair.

19 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: And thank you for
20 that question. I actually gave funding to parks for
21 one of those... they're a very sophisticated kind of a
22 lawn mower. You know your drive... What do you call
23 those...

24 KEITH KERMAN: An interstater?

25

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

66

2 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Yeah, they're like
3 a... they're like a bobcat but they also do snow
4 removal and I'm still waiting, it's been a couple of
5 years to be honest with you.

6 KEITH KERMAN: I can, I can absolutely... If
7 you reach out... we can reach out to you to find out
8 what the order is...

9 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: We'll, we'll call
10 you tomorrow.

11 KEITH KERMAN: Right, the big the big
12 flailed, the big mowers are called interstaters, I'm
13 not sure if that's... or then the kind of multi-purpose
14 off-road unit is kind of like the bobcat loader,
15 which is kind of like you know your person gets in it
16 and you can add the implements to the unit. So I'm
17 trying to let us know what the order is and we will
18 absolutely look into it.

19 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Yeah. I mean to be
20 honest with you... alright... If I wanted to buy that
21 personally. I get Amazon or I get on whatever website
22 I mean, it's just to me sometimes things... a small, a
23 smaller add on like that shouldn't take so long to
24 purchase. I think the city... One of my frustrated
25 pieces for the city is everything so slow and

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

67

2 everything costs so much more. And it this is not
3 just reflective of, you know, when we buy vehicles
4 and so forth but it's just general pet peeve. But I
5 don't want to take time from here but we'll follow up
6 with tomorrow. I do... if you can give me the concise
7 answer to these questions, just so we could do a
8 clean up here. The ten garages that you mentioned the
9 fleet facility portfolio was reduced by 10, were
10 these 10 sold or do we still have those, those 10
11 garages or are we leasing them?

12 KEITH KERMAN: One was a leased facility
13 of the Department of Health, so we canceled that
14 lease. Three were parks department facilities where
15 the facilities still exist. It's just used for core
16 parks department purposes for the district operations
17 as opposed to the repair operations. DOT also... one of
18 the DOT facilities no longer... I think it was some
19 kind of lease. Another one was the mass... was
20 repurposed and still has actually a small repair
21 component in it. Two department of education
22 facilities again were repurpose their education
23 department still has the facilities, but they're not
24 used for repair anymore. One of the facilities is
25 actually not repair shop. It was the DCAS auction

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

68

2 yard you know DCAS had six acres at the Brooklyn Navy
3 Yard for used cars for decades. We agreed with the
4 Brooklyn Navy Yard corporation that there are a lot
5 more important development opportunities for six
6 acres of prime real estate, and we went to online
7 auctions, and that really had two benefits one we
8 make decent amount more money on online auctions, but
9 even more important that six acres is now available
10 for development in Brooklyn, and not used cars for
11 the city.

12 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: And so, so where... in
13 the meantime where are all those vehicles if you
14 don't have on my at the location you just mentioned?

15 KEITH KERMAN: Those are the repair
16 garages. The vehicles are parked... we have over 800
17 parking locations. So that's not the parking for the
18 vehicles. The vehicles are parked at parking
19 locations all over the city. Those were the service
20 garages. And those vehicles are now serviced at the
21 police department, at Department of Sanitation, at
22 parks. So that's the consolidation so...

23 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: I'm happy, happy to
24 hear. Credit where credit's due... so I'm always
25 frustrated, where we selling all of our asset. And

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

69

2 then we come back around and we pay double to try to
3 recapture, you know, for the same purpose. And so,
4 and that was a commitment that I heard the
5 commissioner mentioned when I first became Chair of
6 this committee so I'm glad that that was followed
7 through. Really quickly here. This... at the present
8 moment are you using a reporting software when it
9 comes to the 40 days for maintenance or is that just
10 for a certain agency? You mentioned every 40 days the
11 vehicles come in, most of them are, they don't need
12 repair but they, they're going to some kind of
13 service. Is there software that you're using for
14 that?

15 KEITH KERMAN: Yeah, so all agencies use
16 the fleet management system. It's through DCAS, it's
17 an asset works product. It was... the upgrade of the
18 fleet management system was done in 2013, so it's
19 been in place for about seven years now, and that's
20 across all the city fleet programs without exception.

21 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: And how... and just to
22 be correct with the time, it's every 40 days that
23 vehicles are required to be serviced? How often?

24

25

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

70

2 GREG ANDERSON: So the 40 days is specific
3 to Department of Sanitation and specific to
4 sanitation collection trucks.

5 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: And what about the
6 other agencies?

7 GREG ANDERSON: For other agencies, I
8 think Keith can speak to it but it but it varies by
9 the type of vehicle for...

10 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Does DCAS know for
11 the other agencies?

12 KEITH KERMAN: Yeah so...

13 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: For like example
14 Police Department...

15 KEITH KERMAN: For general, well for
16 general vehicles. We try and do two preventive
17 maintenance at minimum, a year. Then for specialized
18 equipment pieces for police and say ambulances and
19 fire equipment, it's more extensive in specific to
20 how those agencies function so the fire department
21 really deals with the maintenance schedule for its
22 ambulances and fire engines, but it's much more
23 extensive than you would have for a general use sedan
24 or van.

25

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

71

2 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Real quick with the
3 auctions. Are there vehicles that you donate like
4 save to other countries, or other municipalities that
5 might be in need or does every vehicle gets auction?

6 KEITH KERMAN: You know by charter we are
7 required to publicly auction every vehicle, except
8 in... there is a process called a special sale process.
9 It's a long process. But we can, in specialized
10 cases, we need the controller, the city controller
11 must approve it. We must prepare a package. So I'll
12 tell you some examples. We have had, you know, police
13 officers who have been injured in the line of duty,
14 who were, had specialized vehicles, who then when
15 they retired that vehicle was designed only for them.
16 And we've gone through the special sale process. We
17 support some volunteer ambulance organizations out in
18 the Rockaways and elsewhere with that kind of
19 processes.

20 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: That's good.

21 KEITH KERMAN: We've looked at some of the
22 international support issues and we did do that after
23 the tsunami many, you know, a long time ago. We
24 looked at it for Puerto Rico. One of the challenges
25 is there's so much work and effort to both transport

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

72

2 it, and then the destination location has to have
3 capacity to maintain, get autoparts as we talked
4 about, and repair. So sometimes that isn't the best
5 tactic to be helpful. We constantly look at it and
6 are open to working that our... makes sense but we, we
7 just, we, we looked at this a number of times in
8 terms of Puerto Rican, the Puerto Rico relief. And a
9 lot of times, it just wasn't the best use of
10 resources to try and transport these older vehicles
11 there and figure out, there were just better ways to
12 be helpful than that.

13 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: So, let me just say
14 because I deal with other countries and
15 municipalities, other countries, faith base. For
16 example, Dominican Republic, they will be like more
17 than glad to have a ship over there. I mean, all year
18 long. I mean there's just, it will be never ending.
19 I'm curious, what my co chair had just whisper into
20 my ears, what happens to the vehicles that don't get
21 bought online, do you guys junk it? What, what
22 happens?

23 KEITH KERMAN: Yeah, almost everything
24 does. But if we go through multiple rounds of
25 auction, and there's simply no buyer. We will usually

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

73

2 do a steel auction or a salvage auction. So then
3 we're, we will literally put it to auction but not as
4 a vehicle, just for the recycled steel. And that
5 doesn't get a lot of money but you'll get 35-50
6 dollars. That usually means nobody really wants this
7 but there's a little bit of residual steel value and
8 we get a nominal fee. I'll tell you that doesn't
9 happen that often, we do crush some vehicles
10 deliberately on behalf of the police department, so
11 not, sometimes the police will ask us to simply crush
12 your vehicle so it's not reused or repurposed because
13 it's not appropriate to do so. And that also would be
14 a steel auction but, but I will tell you most of our
15 assets get at least some value.

16 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Okay real quick here
17 do any agency stand out for needing private repairs
18 more often and if so, which agencies and why?

19 KEITH KERMAN: I'm sorry, could you, could
20 you...

21 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Do any agency stand
22 out for needing private repairs more often? And if
23 yes, which agency and why.

24 KEITH KERMAN: Well, I mean you know in
25 terms of the private repair... certainly the client

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

74

2 fleet of the DCAS is a, is privately serviced. So
3 that is how we've done...

4 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Which one's that?

5 KEITH KERMAN: The client fleet of DCAS.
6 The, the downtown Manhattan and Brooklyn vehicles are
7 privately serviced. Certainly wherever you have
8 collisions in auto body work and glass. You know and
9 so there is a tie in between safety and in
10 maintenance. And then it's the other factors that you
11 know we talked about. Agencies have some service
12 contracts that are specialized in specific. The main
13 contract through DCAS is the ARI state contract. We
14 also offer the auto body contract. Agencies however
15 do have their own contracts that do not run through
16 DCAS, that would be for specialized repairs in
17 certain areas.

18 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: That includes the
19 police department that have a bulletproof,
20 bulletproof glass, who manages that? Who...

21 KEITH KERMAN: They did... So that whole
22 program was done with in house mechanics at the
23 police department, we actually use that genuine parts
24 company contract on the auto parts side. So that was
25 a mere, a marriage between our new parts arrangement

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

75

2 provided all the, all the materials, the shields, but
3 then the install was done all at the police
4 department.

5 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: That's tremendous,
6 great job. With that what steps has DCAS taken to
7 reduce the need for private repairs?

8 KEITH KERMAN: Well, look, we're always...
9 again we talked about the...

10 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: So for example are
11 you thinking of having your own glass? I mean there's
12 quite a bit of glass right that we talking about
13 here. And it's 100 and something million dollars is...
14 wouldn't it be cheaper if we do it in house?

15 KEITH KERMAN: Well it's... and again the
16 whole commercial services side, so I mean just do the
17 numbers again. We spend \$362 million on the service
18 program. The entire end of... these are the FMS numbers
19 the entire commercial charges piece is 26 million. A
20 lot of that is what we call outfits when vehicles are
21 ready for lights and sirens. It's the ARI servicing
22 program I mentioned, it's glass and body, it's the
23 side guard initiative, I mean we've...

24 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: But what... the
25 question is, why can't we do that in house. I mean,

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

76

2 you already have it for... Why don't you have your own
3 body shop, right? Wouldn't it be more inexpensive if
4 you do it. As a matter of fact, probably quicker.

5 KEITH KERMAN: We certainly, you know,
6 again, most of our program is in house. I will tell
7 you that you know do we have... by you there's body
8 shop capacity for the city. As Greg mentioned we have
9 facility challenges.

10 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: We expand that then.
11 I mean... that we have the capacity to do body shop,
12 can't we expand that? So we could cut on the outside.
13 Rely on private companies which again they're going
14 to cost us an arm and a leg because anybody who
15 charges the city they always charge like way more
16 than they do to the private citizen. So, wouldn't
17 that make more sense to just expand it?

18 KEITH KERMAN: We can, look we can
19 definitely look at what our opportunities are to do
20 that. Going back to the previous question though I, I
21 do think it's the heavy truck work that we talked
22 about that, that really is, you know... If we were
23 going to invest, and obviously we have to fight for
24 resourcing, to, to invest, I think, again, to the
25 extent we can do better for DEP trucks, better for

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

77

2 ambulances, and, and resourcing and sanitation
3 specialized equipment, as well as the DOT project
4 we'd have to take on programs, certainly those will
5 be as I mentioned my, my priorities. We certainly can
6 look at, at other aspects, but we do have facility
7 challenges which take a long time to, to address. The
8 CRS program will take up to two to three years.

9 [crosstalk]

10 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: So we'll be..

11 [crosstalk]

12 KEITH KERMAN: ...make the best investments.

13 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: So we'd be more than
14 willing, both chairs, to help you in that goal. And
15 I'm sure the unions will be more than happy as well
16 to hear that. That, we could, you know, because it's
17 very specialized kind of service. And so we could
18 have that in house. And from what I hear, that's what
19 the vast amount of the special contract funding is
20 going to a specialized mechanics that we need to
21 expand it in house. Quickly here last, last two
22 questions. What is DCAS, and then I'll pass it to my
23 chair, what is DCAS quality assurance protocol for
24 repairs conducted by private entities, talk briefly.
25 How do you verify the work that they had done was

2 done correctly? And what kind of warranties do we
3 have?

4 KEITH KERMAN: Yeah so that's done by city
5 mechanic so for the DCAS client fleet we have four
6 city mechanics, local 246 members who have worked at
7 DCAS going back decades, who work for us, and for
8 Brent Taylor and Harris Kaplan who are sitting behind
9 us, and they do the quality assurance on that
10 program. They inspect for the repairs, they go to the
11 garages, their full time job is to inspect and
12 quality control for those commercial charges. For the
13 agencies, and those agencies mechanics report
14 directly to the agencies, it's the same process. Its
15 supervisor mechanics and mechanics in each agency
16 that are doing whatever contract level work, they're
17 the ones doing the oversight on that.

18 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Regarding... and last
19 question, regarding the student mechanics program how
20 many former students have been higher at what
21 agencies in what capacity and have program
22 participants hired by the city advance to other
23 service titles such as machinist, electrician, and
24 auto mechanic?

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

79

2 KEITH KERMAN: Absolutely. So, the Auto
3 Service Worker Program which we have with the
4 different automotive high schools like Brooklyn
5 Automotive and Tom-Ed is, is a huge priority for us.
6 It's a great program. We are operating and partnering
7 in so many levels with them, including 79 paid
8 internships, giving them vehicles, they come to a lot
9 of our programs we do a lot of training there. And
10 then, a lot of them come in as auto service workers
11 and working at the different agencies. The police
12 department has been a leader in this but every
13 agency, it has brought in high school students. And
14 then that begins that progressive career path. And
15 so, the most likely and in our human capital at DCAS
16 has done a report on this, the most likely path to a
17 full auto mechanic in the city is an auto service
18 worker. And so many of our... from our deputy
19 commissioners down to our mechanics started as auto
20 service workers, and moved up. That is the
21 promotional line. So we are absolutely...

22 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Do you have numbers?
23 Because really that's what I, I wanted. How many, or
24 numbers or percentage end up moving forward.

25

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

80

2 KEITH KERMAN: So... Let me... I'm actually
3 looking at that report now but so as not to misquote
4 it let me get you that answer.

5 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Okay, you have your
6 staff give it to our staff.

7 KEITH KERMAN: Absolutely.

8 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: We appreciate it.
9 Okay, let me pass it on to my co-chair.

10 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I'm just want to
11 close it out. I'm happy with the testimony that I've
12 heard today or I have enough information about what I
13 need, just don't want to get to a place where we
14 don't do maintenance and then we have to pay for it
15 in the future. We want to prevent an MTA style issue
16 here when it comes to our fleet. And the way to do
17 that is to be proactive. And I think we're falling a
18 little short of that, and I think we could recover
19 from it. If we pay attention to it today. So again I
20 want to thank you for your testimony and your time
21 and would actually appreciate if you could stay at
22 least to hear the testimony of the people on the
23 ground, doing this work. It'll be, it'll be one, it's
24 one panel. That one panel is going to make some

25

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

81

2 testimony of you can stay for the testimony, I would
3 appreciate it.

4 KEITH KERMAN: Um, I actually, I have,
5 I've been, I've appreciated this hearing. I've
6 actually been testifying since 10 o'clock this
7 morning, but our assistant commissioner and chief are
8 going to say, for the rest of the hearing. I'm going
9 to kind of get back to see what's happened today. But
10 we absolutely, our senior leadership, be right here,
11 and we appreciate this opportunity. It's not often as
12 Greg mentioned that we get to talk about the fleet
13 program. It's a great part of what city government
14 does, it's, it's often behind the scenes that it's
15 complicated. And the city does not function without
16 it, and we appreciate your help and we appreciate
17 your advocacy for, for it, you know sometimes we're
18 in certain positions where we can, we have to kind
19 of, you know, proceed one way but we appreciate your
20 role in having us here and thank you.

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you. And
22 thank you Greg.

23 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Thank you so much.
24 With that, we go to our next panel. We'll call upon
25 Joseph Colangelo, Marlana Giga, George Farinacci,

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

82

2 Michael Schreiber, and Harry Greenburg. Okay you may
3 start as soon as you're ready.

4 HARRY GREENBERG: Good afternoon, my name
5 is Harry Greenberg. I'm counsel, co-counsel to the
6 Municipal Labor Committee, and I'll be speaking on
7 behalf of the chairman Harry Nespoli who is also the
8 president of the Sanitation Workers Union. First, he
9 wanted to express his appreciation to the city
10 council for addressing this issue, and in particular
11 to chairpersons Reynoso and Cabrera for holding this
12 hearing. So thank you. As you know, the Municipal
13 Labor Committee represents approximately 400,000
14 employees, of which, you're going to hear
15 representatives from some of those groups that
16 provide very critical services to the city of New
17 York, their residents, and visitors. Fleet
18 maintenance and repair is not a flashy subject,
19 however it's vital. It's vital when it snows. It's
20 vital when there's a snowstorm. It's vital when
21 there's Sandy, and things like that. About a year ago
22 Mr. Nespoli sent a letter to the city, saying there's
23 a problem. And the testimony you've heard this
24 morning or early this afternoon is going to be in
25 contradiction to what we're about to tell you. Let me

2 begin by saying you can't fight fires, bring people
3 to the hospital, pick up refuse, patrol the streets,
4 etc., unless you have the proper equipment. I think
5 you've hit on that already. Three questions that must
6 be answered is; are there enough working vehicles,
7 two, are they properly maintained, and three, are we
8 provided with honest and accurate data. The present
9 union presidents and offices will, will tell you that
10 the... through their testimony the answers to those
11 questions, and that there is an unacceptable downtime
12 of vehicles. And we have insufficient staff to meet
13 the needs, and we need full disclosure of current
14 conditions for Mr. Nespoli it's particularly
15 troubling for the down, the high down rates, when,
16 during the snow season and the winter comes, and when
17 there's blizzards. And that could be a catastrophe.
18 And we saw, under when Bloomberg was the Mayor in
19 December, a few years ago. This issue has been going
20 on for a while. And at that time, the out of service
21 rate was 24% for sanitation vehicles, and we believe
22 it's been growing. It is a major operational problem,
23 and its residents depend on the vehicles to collect
24 garbage, clear snow, fight fires, medical
25 emergencies, and other services. We need a properly

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

84

2 maintained fleet service. What our mechanics do is
3 they repair and preventive maintenance. And as you
4 know you have your own cars, you don't change the
5 oil, there's problems, you don't have the right
6 tires, there's problems, things like that. The only
7 way to maintain the fleet services, is to have the
8 right amount of mechanics, which you've touched on
9 already, and get the services needed, and you've
10 heard about them. And you will hear about the
11 inappropriate or not sufficient days that they've
12 talked about in the CRS in Queens management. Rather
13 than hire qualified mechanics, the city has had band
14 aids put on and it's not working. And you've touched
15 on parts, you will hear about the parts. A
16 significant percent, percentage of the work being
17 done by private sector is not being done properly or
18 at all. And further delays and causing additional
19 expense. And now it's Mr. Nespoli's pleasure to tell
20 you, turn it over to the union leaders who are
21 intimately involved. And before I do, this was an
22 issue for sanitation, a little over a year ago, we
23 have meetings with the Municipal Labor Committee.
24 That was brought up, and now it's a citywide issue.

25

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

85

2 It's not just sanitation, and you'll hear about that.
3 Thank you. Mr. Colangelo will be next.

4 JOSEPH COLANGELO: Okay. Good afternoon.

5 My name is Joseph Colangelo, I am the president of
6 local 246 SEIU. I represent 1,377 auto trades workers
7 employed by the City of New York. I want to thank
8 this committee especially chairs Reynoso and Cabrera.
9 We're holding this meeting on such an important
10 matter. I'm here to voice my genuine concern of the
11 deterioration of the city's ability to maintain
12 repair to central motorized fleet. I am here to shed
13 the light on the city's wasteful and potentially
14 dangerous new efforts to utilize private vendors to
15 repair sophisticated and complicated equipment, and
16 to replace experienced auto mechanics with my union's
17 auto service worker title, a title which is not
18 trained and qualified to perform auto repair work.
19 Before I detail my concerns I want to provide you
20 with a brief outline of my background. I began like,
21 I began my career with New York City Department of
22 sanitation in 1981 as a senior Auto Service Worker,
23 and a member of SEIU New York City Local 246. Three
24 years later in 1984 I was promoted to auto mechanic.
25 I worked auto mechanic for 43 years. In 20 years in

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

86

2 the garages in sanitation I've worked on every piece
3 of sanitation equipment. During this period of time
4 I've worked my way up the ranks of the Union until I
5 became president in 2004. In addition, I am currently
6 the vice chair of the New York City Municipal Labor
7 Committee. I'm also the chairman of the Municipal
8 Labor Committee, Subcommittee on Civil Service. I'm
9 the chairman of the Civil Service Coalition of
10 Building Trades and Municipal Unions, and I'm a
11 member of the New York City central Labor Council
12 executive board. I grew up in Queens, New York. I
13 attended Aviation High School, and Teterboro [sp?]
14 school of aeronautics receiving an aircraft airframe
15 and powerplant licenses. I also obtained my private
16 pilot's license in 1999. Testimonial reports I will
17 submit to this committee today will only begin to
18 show the problems with fleet services. What is going
19 to be presented today is only the tip of the iceberg.
20 I provided a handout to you which you may wish to
21 look at during my testimony. It should help you
22 understand the seriousness of the problem that's
23 Exhibit A. My members repair maintain all Department
24 of Sanitation vehicles such as salt spreaders, dual
25 bin collection trucks, Street Sweepers, and snow

2 equipment. And the fire department, repair all the
3 vehicles including pumpers, ladder trucks,
4 ambulances, utility trucks. In the police department,
5 we repair patrol cars, emergency service trucks, bomb
6 protection vehicles, and more. For the Department of
7 Environmental Protection we repair sewage vacuum
8 trucks, environmental safety trucks, and an array of
9 other sophisticated vehicles. In fact, we repair all
10 the vehicles every city agency. These vehicles serve
11 on the front lines and protecting our citizens in
12 snowstorms, fires, medical emergencies, civil unrest,
13 law enforcement, public health, and sanitation. I
14 fear that the city's fleet is not being properly
15 maintained to meet these critical public functions.
16 A... for all vehicles is proper maintenance. It goes
17 without saying that the older vehicle, the more work
18 is required to keep them running. And the city wide
19 variety of vehicles, many of which require
20 specialized expertise to maintain and repair, demands
21 an experienced specialized workforce of which outside
22 vendors cannot provide. As you are aware over the
23 recent years the city's fleet has been consolidated
24 into DCAS. DCAS reports that the city owns and
25 operates over 30,000 vehicles many of which require

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

88

2 specialized skills and expertise to repair maintain.

3 What you may not be aware of is the fact that the

4 size and complexity of the city's fleet has expanded

5 dramatically. For an example, the total number of

6 vehicles of the Department of Sanitation went from

7 5,984 in 2011 to over 7,050. I'll just add the city

8 of Chicago's entire fleet is only 35,000 vehicles.

9 That's the entire city of Chicago. Alarminglly however

10 the number of auto mechanics employed by the

11 sanitation has not increased commensurately. Prior to

12 the consolidation of Fleet services, sanitation had

13 529 auto trades. After the consolidation sanitation

14 picked up an additional 1,066 vehicles, but only got

15 31 auto trades workers. Of the 31, 13 retired. And

16 the parks department was to transfer 11 personnel,

17 none were ever transferred. Currently there's only

18 575 auto trades personnel in sanitation, based on the

19 widely accepted industry standard for stamping auto

20 repair maintenance operations, published in

21 government fleet, most notably known as the

22 maintenance and repair unit, MRU factors, that's

23 Exhibit B, fleet services is short 208 auto trades

24 workers. Common sense tells us deficiency in stamping

25 can only lead to failure. The same type of

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

89

2 understaffing also plays out in FDNY and NYPD
3 understaffing in NYPD... The two... The MRU number, the
4 one they just spoke about should require 260
5 mechanics. The actual number in PD is 198. There are
6 62 positions in police department on the staff, based
7 on the fleet, exhibit B, as I point out. The out of
8 service rate of city vehicles proves beyond measure
9 that fleet services is a disaster waiting to happen.
10 The handout I'm providing to you today contains a
11 DCAS report from 2019. Work order, length of time, by
12 work agency, work order agency, which indicates a
13 number of vehicles and days out of service the city
14 agency slash department. I refer to the report as
15 work order report that's exhibit C. Oddly, the DCAS
16 fleet services report indicates that the Department
17 of Sanitation has a fleet of vehicles at 1585.
18 However, a separate DCAS report titled New York City
19 Fleet Daily Service Report, Critical Fleet Summary
20 indicates over 2,000 that's Exhibit D. 2,000 vehicles
21 not including streets sweepers. The inconsistency
22 fleet size numbers should raise suspicion. The
23 significance of these deficiencies, differences
24 impacts the vehicle out of service rates. I suspect
25 that DCAS is trying to paint the rosy picture in

2 reality. What's important to understand is the
3 Sanitation Department reports, a vehicle is out of
4 service as soon as a vehicle breaks down and cannot
5 be operated, which makes sense that as vehicle is not
6 able to be used. However, DCAS reports out of service
7 date not when the vehicle breaks down and cannot be
8 operated, but the date that it is placed in a work
9 bay of the city garage or private vendor, which gives
10 the perception of a low out of service rate. This is
11 obviously wrong, deceiving, and needs to be
12 corrected. It seems clear to me that my members that
13 the out of service rate must be the entire time the
14 vehicle cannot be operated. Now the out of service
15 rate is important because for example, sanitation,
16 there are approximately 450 collection trucks out of
17 service daily, which is approximately 20% of the
18 collection fleet. You can look at slide D for that.
19 Further DCAS has reported that 165 vehicles are out
20 of service for over 60 days. I submit to you the
21 reason for the long delay is that the parts that are
22 needed to repair not available. And the agency does
23 not have enough auto mechanics to keep up with the
24 work. I will test about the hiring later. DCAS fleet
25 services has attempted to address this poor out of

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

91

2 service rate by ordering agencies to send vehicles to
3 outside vendors for repair. My members have informed
4 me that oftentimes the equipment is returned to fleet
5 service without being repaired properly. As a result,
6 my members have to do the repair work the city has
7 already paid an outside vendor to do. For example,
8 prior to the last significant snowstorm sanitation
9 took the unprecedented step of sending salt spreaders
10 to outside vendors despite warnings by my union that
11 private sector mechanics are not qualified to perform
12 this work. Sadly all warnings proved true during the
13 storm a significant number of salt spreaders which
14 were sent to outside vendors for repair work broke
15 down because we're not service properly. Needless to
16 say this compromised public safety. It was a waste of
17 taxpayer dollars as my mechanic, auto mechanics had
18 to repair the work city had already done, paid for
19 done. And it impacts the out of service rates of
20 critical equipment DCAS fleet services has all taking
21 an ill advised, also taken an ill advised approach of
22 implementing a plan to replace auto mechanics with
23 auto service workers. While I also represent the Auto
24 Service worker title, and it is in fact a title that
25 does not provide the skills, training, and expertise

2 necessary to repair and maintain the city's vastly
3 diverse fleet. Auto service workers basically service
4 as a helper to the auto mechanic. While this is a
5 critical and important role there is no mistaking the
6 fact that the two titles are not interchangeable.
7 Auto service workers cannot work as an auto mechanic
8 and cannot be expected to do so with any success.
9 DCAS' fleet service decision to backfill auto
10 mechanics with auto service workers will further
11 increase the out of service rates to dangerous
12 levels. It will not save any money. And as the title
13 is not able to perform the work of an auto mechanic.
14 As the saying goes, penny wise pound foolish. Make no
15 mistake about it. I want my own service workers to
16 have a career path becoming an auto mechanic, not to
17 be thrown into a job that they are not properly
18 trained to perform at half the pay of an auto
19 mechanic, provide my auto service workers with the
20 training to become auto mechanics and promote them to
21 the title. This is a solid way to create a true
22 career path and a successful model for building a
23 professional repair workforce. It would also help to
24 further diversify the city's workforce. Further
25 impacting the out of service rates is the lack of

2 adequate facilities to service the fleet. For
3 example, the Department of Sanitation said repair
4 shop is being overhauled, and there is a need for the
5 additional space to work on vehicles. I'm informed
6 the DCAS is in charge of leasing space and that DCAS
7 has not signed off on leasing additional facilities.
8 The lack of adequate facilities also increases the
9 out of service time as a number of service bays is
10 being reduced to unacceptable levels. I'll add NYPD
11 shops currently now are at 160% capacity with these
12 facilities have not been updated in decades. That's
13 the police department. Another reason for the high
14 out of service rates is the lack of supplies to make
15 necessary repairs. The city's contracted with general
16 parts/Napa to supply parts for all city vehicles. I
17 urge this committee to review the genuine parts/Napa
18 contract. I am informed by some of my members that
19 the parts are not arriving on time and frequently the
20 wrong parts are delivered causing a further delay in
21 getting vehicles back in the service. It is important
22 to note that I'm also informed by the members that
23 this vendor is complying with the contractual time
24 periods in which to deliver a requested part. There
25 is no oversight to ensure that the vendor is in

2 compliance with its city contract or that the city
3 demand and/or receive the agreed upon penalties if
4 the contractors breach for late delivery of supplies.

5 I also want to highlight highlight that I believe
6 Napa has instituted quotas and sales goals to
7 employee serving the city facilities. I believe this
8 for profit sale program will result in wasteful and
9 unnecessary city scores for parts. I ask the city
10 council to further investigate the sales practice.

11 I'm further and informed by the director in that a
12 Director and Chief of Department of Transportation
13 visited to New York City DOT, that's Department of
14 the Transportation fleet services repair facilities.

15 One in Webster Avenue in the Bronx and one in
16 Masspeth Queens. Deficiencies were found in the Bronx
17 facilities demonstrated gross mismanagement of the
18 tire room that led to an unusual tire supply chain,
19 unavailable truck parts and uncontrolled access to
20 bolts and nuts. I'm further informed that the DOT
21 officials reported that in Maspeth there was a lack
22 of established oversight for documentation of parts
23 charges. Even when the city does not decide to hire
24 an auto mechanic. The process is so cumbersome and
25 slow, the ability to maintain staffing levels is

2 compromised. For example, if there's a civil service
3 list those on the list are hired in accordance with
4 civil service law. If that list is expired, then the
5 person can be provisionally hired. After 30 days if
6 any position is not filled the process will start
7 over again. This process takes a long time and the
8 requisite number of auto trade workers is not being
9 replaced in a timely manner. Proof of this failure to
10 hire timely is in fact that the Department of
11 Sanitation 75, approximately 75 auto trade titles
12 retire each year. The current process does not result
13 in the timely replacement of those members that
14 retired. Further the police department hiring process
15 can take up to six months. I would like to point out
16 that the stamping currently in effect in the
17 Department of Sanitation is unsafe. On the night
18 tours in 39 districts there was only one auto trades
19 worker on duty for the entire shift in these garages.
20 It is clearly unproductive and unsafe to have one
21 auto trades worker to be alone doing maintenance
22 work. In some cases the maintenance work requires two
23 workers. Being alone results in he or she cannot do
24 their job. If the auto trades worker is underneath
25 the vehicle changing oil or working on brakes and the

2 vehicle falls on him or her there will be no one
3 around to help or hear them cry for help. We should
4 be concerned that the public is at risk if the fire
5 department ladder pump or ambulance or police vehicle
6 cannot get to the emergency in a timely manner
7 because of uncleared roads during a snowstorm.

8 Clearly the public expects and deserves that the city
9 can clear the streets of snow by having the necessary
10 equipment available. For example, in 2016 to 2020,
11 the Department of Sanitation added 248 pieces of snow
12 equipment, which would have necessitated an
13 additional 28 mechanics to adequately service this
14 new equipment. Shockingly, sanitation was not able to
15 hire any personnel. If our first responders cannot
16 navigate the streets during the snowstorm. The public
17 is put at risk. I've been telling the city, DCAS, and
18 anyone else who would listen that the fleet
19 consolidation was built to fail. And I'm sorry to say
20 it has. I think if you were able to get the
21 commissioners at the line agencies to tell you what
22 they honestly feel, and not the party line is, they
23 would tell you that it's simply not working. While
24 you have heard my point on the problems I'm also am
25 here to offer solutions. One, revamp the reporting of

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

97

2 all areas covering fleet service to ensure accurate
3 and uniform reporting of out of service rates.

4 Properly track ordering of parts and the delivery to
5 ensure vendor is meeting its contractual obligation
6 to deliver on time. And if there are not the city
7 should be compensated for the breach of contract.

8 Three independent auditing of DCAS reports to ensure
9 they are truthful and accurate. Four, eliminate the
10 use of outside vendors for repair and maintenance.

11 Five, hire additional mechanics to meet the industry
12 wide standards for staffing levels for auto repair
13 and maintenance. Six, ensure that civil service exams
14 for auto trades are administered so that there will
15 always be a list of qualified personnel which would
16 eliminate the need for provisional eyes. Seven,

17 ensure safe stamping on all shifts. Eight, require
18 DCAS to lease additional space to meet the city's
19 needs. Nine, establish a formal training program for
20 auto service workers so that there's a true career
21 path for those who wish to advance themselves. And
22 would also address the shortage of mechanics. As

23 President of SEIU Local 246 and chair of the MLC
24 Civil Service Committee. I stand ready to assist in
25 resolving the issues, and I have brought you up, I

2 have brought to your attention today. I also have
3 included in my packet, exhibit E, which is the
4 mayor's executive board establish the fleet. I just
5 want to add some additional items. After hearing the
6 prior testimony, the age of the fleet for the
7 sanitation department now is on average about six and
8 a half years. That's the average age of fleet. We
9 should be around three and a half years. I know you
10 heard some misleading numbers I just want to be clear
11 on that. And also two, it came to my attention in
12 January 20... 2020 too at a meeting with the chief
13 fleet officer the 2019 inspections and past
14 preventive maintenance were highlighted as a problem
15 area. And also too, fleet bought a \$10 million
16 fueling system that DCAS purchased which they were
17 told before was unmanageable before they purchased
18 it, and was never fully functional. And I believe
19 that the agency now DCAS is trying to, in the process
20 suing the vendor to get that money back. I stand
21 ready to answer any and all questions. And I'm with
22 that... I'm going to turn it over because I think that
23 you should hear from some of the other unions and the
24 impact on them members with regard to the servicing
25 of vehicles, turn it over to George.

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

99

2 GEORGE FARINACCI: Hello. Chair Reynoso
3 and Councilman Cabrera thank you very much for
4 lending your time to this important issue. Regarding
5 the leader... Fire Company assigned apparatus. Hi I'm
6 George Farinacci, Vice President of the Uniformed
7 Fire Officers Association. Spare apparatus, old fire
8 trucks, serve a crucial purpose of keeping fire
9 companies in service when their rigs break down.
10 However, there is a downside. There are variety of
11 manufacturers and model years of the apparatus. Each
12 apparatus tip is in varying degrees in the way they
13 operate, and how their compartments are arranged.
14 These compartments secure the emergency equipment
15 required at fires, car accidents, drowning persons,
16 and other life saving emergencies. Regarding the
17 compartments spare apparatus have different sizes,
18 shapes, and numbers of compartments. These variations
19 will often not allow tools and equipment to be stored
20 in the same way in the same place as a company's
21 assigned apparatus. Companies take great pride in
22 creating clever solutions to how they store their
23 equipment and improve efficiency in their assigned
24 apparatus. Spare apparatus offer temporary use.
25 They're shared throughout New York City when the need

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

100

2 arises. Modifying the compartments to improve the
3 efficiency and storage of a spare for a specific
4 company is not permitted by the FDNY. For good
5 reason. The next location that those rigs go to will
6 be a completely different area with a different
7 complement of tools and a different protocol and
8 procedures by the company. This can result in reduced
9 efficiency of where the tools are placed, how they
10 are stored and how they are accessed more importantly
11 at the time when seconds count. When using spares
12 some equipment may have to be stored in such a way
13 that it's less readily accessible, safe and secure
14 storage takes priority over convenient,
15 accessibility. I can't roll down the street and have
16 equipment bouncing around in the fire truck. I can't
17 have it bouncing out of the fire truck. So we go
18 through great measures to make sure that it stays
19 put. This less than ideal storage solution will
20 result in glades. Storing equipment in the back of a
21 compartment or on the bottom of a full compartment on
22 the top of the apparatus where we have to climb up 10
23 feet to get underneath you know other equipment will
24 slow us down. The above small inefficiencies will
25 result in a loss of precious seconds when we respond.

2 Those seconds, may be, may be the difference between
3 life and death, providing the necessary number of
4 mechanics will reduce the time an assigned fire
5 apparatus is out of service, having an assigned
6 apparatus in service is good for the Fire Company,
7 and most importantly it's good for the community. And
8 this city, that they serve. Thank you very much for
9 taking the time to hear this testimony.

10 MICHAEL SCHREIBER: Thank you, George.
11 Good afternoon Council Members. My name is Michael
12 Schreiber. I'm the Health and Safety Officer for the
13 Uniformed Firefighters Association. I'm here to give
14 you insight on a firefighters perspective on the
15 issue of our out of service rigs. FDNY rigs are out
16 of service for months at a time. The department has
17 purchased ladders, engines, and specialized rigs,
18 since September 2001. That include high pressure
19 pumpers, rescue squads, satellites, phone tenders,
20 brush fire, and collapsed rigs to name a few, some of
21 which are currently sitting in yards, waiting on
22 simple repairs that could have only taken days to
23 fix. Is a travesty the city has spent 10s of millions
24 of dollars on state of the art equipment, but put no
25 apparent consideration into maintaining this fleet,

2 so that it can serve the public for which it was
3 intended. I'm not a mechanic, but I don't think it
4 should take three months to replace a radiator on a
5 ladder truck, or brakes on an engine. Truth is, it
6 doesn't, it takes one day. In this case, it took 10
7 weeks to sit in the yard before the latter got its
8 turn at the shops. In the interim the company was
9 given a spare rig that was past its prime and would
10 never have been used, except as a last resort to keep
11 the company in service. Spare rigs can be up to 20
12 years old, and made by variety of manufacturers that
13 use subtle but important differences in the rigs such
14 as turning radius, braking distance, location of
15 controls to activate hydraulics, putting the engine
16 in what we call pumps to get water to the fire. These
17 small nuances create delays that our members must
18 overcome. This scenario plays out every single day in
19 the FDNY. This is the greatest Fire Department in the
20 world, and should be supported as such. Firefighters
21 appreciate the hard work our mechanics do every day
22 we understand they need... they, we understand they
23 need help in their mission to assist firefighters,
24 keeping all New Yorkers safe. Thank you.

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

103

2 MARLENA GIGA: Good afternoon, my name is
3 Marlana Giga and I am a New York City Park Ranger
4 Sergeant and I'm also the treasurer for local 983. We
5 represent motor vehicle operators, PEP Officers, Park
6 Rangers, city seasonal aids, traffic enforcement tow
7 operators, and APSW maintenance workers for the Parks
8 Department. Most of our titles operate city vehicles
9 on a daily basis. The maintenance workers they assist
10 the Sanitation Department during critical snow
11 storms. Our PEP Officers patrol all year round,
12 during the winter months they check the lakes and the
13 ponds for people walking on the ice as is a hazard.
14 The Parks Department currently has private mechanics
15 in each borough first vehicle. Many of the vehicles
16 that are put out of service. There are put back in
17 service within a day. And they're coming back with
18 the same issues that they were put out of service
19 for, and this is the Matic... mechanics will tell us
20 it's just to keep the data low. This creates hazards
21 for all the drivers because the vehicles are not
22 being properly fixed. With our NYPD tow operators
23 they used to have mechanics in each borough. Now, the
24 garage is centrally located in Manhattan on 158th
25 Street and its first come first serve, which means

2 the vehicles are there for weeks. They also wait
3 weeks for parts for approval from DCAS. So it creates
4 an issue where city workers are not even able to do
5 their job. They're sitting in the commands. The third
6 issue I want to talk about is the service workers
7 about two weeks ago for the NYPD, they had a posting
8 for service workers. On the interview the service
9 workers were specifically asked if they knew how to
10 do mechanic work, we had, we had several individuals
11 contact the local, and stated that they did not
12 receive the job because they did not know how to do
13 mechanic work, and the city is replacing them with
14 mechanics, but at what cost. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Thank you so much.
16 Just a couple of question I really appreciate your
17 testimony because there seems to be quite of an
18 incongruency between the facts that you presented,
19 and thank you for the extensive report that you
20 brought forth, and also with all the exhibit, with
21 the testimony that we heard from the administration.
22 And I wanted to start with something you just
23 mentioned it caught my ear, my attention here of the
24 idea that vehicles are being sent back within a day

2 so they could keep their statistics, looking good.

3 Who is telling the mechanics to do that?

4 MARLENA GIGA: So these are, these
5 mechanics are working through a private contract
6 which is contracted through the city. So in order for
7 the private contractor to keep the contracts they
8 have to project that these vehicles are coming in to
9 be serviced and within a day or two, they're, you
10 know, up and running again, which is not the case.
11 We're the individuals that are operating these
12 vehicles. I put a vehicle out of service today for
13 brakes the mechanic tells me tomorrow the brakes are
14 fine. It's not the case.

15 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: That's very
16 insightful and we're definitely gonna [sic] follow up
17 with that regarding the leased space. You talked
18 about lease space Mr. Colangelo. How much lease space
19 do you foresee that we need at this moment, to be
20 able to satisfy the need?

21 JOSEPH COLANGELO: Okay. Two things I...
22 Before I answer that question I just want to add to
23 the question that was previously asked. You have to
24 understand the under the Giuliani administration, the
25 parks department privatized two auto repair shops.

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

106

2 They were privatized in, in the Bronx and Prospect
3 Park. They never expanded that program. Because I... my
4 opinion, it was always a failure. I know past
5 experience that what she just spoke about is in fact
6 what would happen. They would keep the out of service
7 rate low because what they would do was they would
8 wait till they had the parts to repair a vehicle,
9 they would not be... put the vehicle out of service
10 that day, repair it, and put it back into service,
11 because that contract had to keep them at a specific
12 out of service rate. Okay? That was never expanded. I
13 won't get into who the individual was in that
14 administration, but he spoke earlier today. Okay?
15 That being said, that being said, with regard to
16 lease space... You know, I brought up two issues.
17 Number one, in a Department of Sanitation you know
18 that central repair shop that we spoke about earlier
19 that needs to be repaired. That is one of the largest
20 repair, truck repair, facilities in the country, the
21 country. So when the agency identified that there was
22 a rehab that was going to need to take place which,
23 which we call the fifth floor, which has all the
24 heavy duty trucks, that's the excess from the bow
25 shops, I don't want to get technical so if I lose you

2 let me know. So the excess from the borough's goes to
3 the central repair shop. If they can't handle old
4 trucks in Manhattan or Staten Island or in the Bronx
5 or in Brooklyn, that's going to go to CRS. They, that
6 floor space was being lost. They were looking
7 continuously for additional lease space. I don't
8 know... heard... you know I don't... I'm not privy to
9 inside information other than the fact that I hear
10 from individuals that they kept being denied the
11 authority to lease additional space. So now we have a
12 crisis on our hands right because we lost all that
13 square footage. We talked mechanics like they talked
14 early we talk about how many, how many work days,
15 that's what you look at how many work days right.
16 That's your square footage What do you need to repair
17 a truck. The police department I could tell you they
18 have never increased the amount of repair hey I know
19 personally I was notified last night, they're at 160%
20 capacity. So I think that question is better asked of
21 the individual agencies because I think the
22 individual agencies can always provide you with
23 better information. And when, and in addition to
24 that, you know, because I'm more, you know majority
25 of my members work for the sanitation department

2 because they are the largest, right, of the, of the
3 1,300 members I represent I have over 500 just in the
4 sanitation department. We operate 62 individual
5 locations. All those locations and garages are
6 staffed with mechanics both day and at night, and to
7 a minimum which I just pointed out earlier in my
8 testimony. So I think that question should be at the...
9 probably should always be, in my opinion, there
10 should all be that plan B on, like a, like a place on
11 the hold, like a hold, like you need, you're going to
12 need... If the PD needs a spot we have a spot. You know
13 the sanitation Department needs a spot, we have a
14 spot. You know this ad hoc leasing is not working and
15 then what happens is you get behind the eight ball
16 because you know... as you, we know with city
17 government, first it's gotta go to real estate, and
18 then it's gotta go to review, and then it's gotta... So
19 by the time you even get this process rolling and
20 then a final write off has got to be by either OMB or
21 then maybe DCAS has to sign off... forget it, the space
22 is gone. You know, this happened in the Bronx I just
23 experienced it with the Commerce Avenue shop. You
24 know we have... Avenue in the Bronx, if anybody's
25 familiar with the Bronx. That repair facility, it

2 started to deteriorate to deteriorate to the point
3 where you can drive trucks up the ramp. They looked
4 around for space, and now the Bronx you would think
5 is a little more amenable to getting space, create a
6 problem because by the time they got all the
7 everything, all the ducks in a row, that space got
8 rented. Then they had to start the process all over
9 again. They eventually did get space so. I think that
10 that question is probably more answered, you know by
11 by the each individual agency but as you can see
12 that, you know, I point out especially when it comes
13 to the central repair shop is sanitation, you know,
14 you're talking about a, you know, you know, talking
15 about critical fleet. You know sanitation, you know
16 in my estimation is almost like a first responding
17 fleet. You know we tend to, we tend to take out you
18 know that sanitation you know they there to pick up
19 refuse, but you know when Hurricane Sandy hit, who
20 was called in? Department of Sanitation, you know.
21 But you know, hey you know, we're weak, you know
22 we're not you know, that department doesn't seem to
23 get the recognition that it really truly deserves.
24 You know, and in this particular case you know we you
25 know you'll have a health emergency. It's the

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

110

2 sanitation department they're the ones that come in
3 there. So you know to that question I think it's more
4 important that the agencies could probably respond
5 better.

6 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: So I appreciate your
7 response, but I want to tell you. They have our
8 respect in the Council and both the chairs here in
9 our committee, and we will sit down with DCAS,
10 looking forward to sitting down with you so we can
11 have more details.

12 JOSEPH COLANGELO: Oh yeah.

13 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: So we could be
14 better be better prepare. And I meeting, and I
15 mentioned it earlier, you know when it comes to
16 government always cost more, it takes longer, it's
17 just so inefficient, to this day, I've been, I've did
18 this 10 years. I'm just shock that everything here
19 takes so long. I have a park project that to do a
20 bathroom, just a bathroom, four million dollars in a
21 park and I'm like wait a second and I ask the
22 commissioner; Commissioner would you let me build it
23 because I could build your mansion for \$4 million,
24 and I'll have the toilets glazed with gold. I mean it
25 just, it's just crazy.

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

111

2 JOSEPH COLANGELO: Oh yeah.

3 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: The way we spend
4 money in the city it no wonder we're in \$100 billion
5 debt with a point \$8.5 billion service debt every
6 single year and it's going to get harder and harder
7 and harder. And so, we need to nip this process that
8 they have in place that I... And I know they're trying
9 to avoid corruption and so forth. So what but there's
10 a better way to do it this and, and not make it so
11 costly so. So I'm looking forward... And the last thing
12 to have in that meeting, the last thing I, you know,
13 I was really unaware that right now we have fire
14 trucks that while you're waiting they're 20 years old
15 in a road. Did I, Did I hear that right?

16 MICHAEL SCHREIBER: Yeah so the line
17 units, what we call our regularly assigned units
18 would be your line unit, they can't be more than 11
19 years old. But, if that rig were to break down for
20 whatever reason, we have a fleet of spare rigs that
21 don't have an age range. So we have rigs as old as 20
22 years old, that we ride around on.

23 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: And the main excuse
24 they give you for example that truck that was missing
25 a radiator, which you'll...

2 MICHAEL SCHREIBER: That was an example
3 yes that I'm...

4 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: What was the main
5 excuse that...

6 MICHAEL SCHREIBER: They didn't have, they
7 didn't have the manpower. It sat in the yard, they
8 had, there are several yards that the mechanics have
9 where they stage vehicles until they have a space, a
10 bay to put that vehicle and that's where it sat.

11 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: So this is the
12 systemic of all the agencies we just don't have the
13 manpower.

14 MICHAEL SCHREIBER: They don't have the
15 manpower. I'm there, I'm at our shops on a regular
16 basis, communicating with the mechanics and the
17 supervisors and they're all doing a great job,
18 they're doing, they're working hard, there's just,
19 there's, there's too many rigs and not enough guys to
20 put their hands on them.

21 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: They do a fantastic
22 job and, and we're gonna definitely work in that. I
23 want to turn it over to the co chair. We're
24 committed, and we're going to make sure that we get
25 it to the finish line.

2 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Thank you. So,
3 this is great. Obviously Council Cabrera was talk... We
4 need procurement reform in a real way in the city of
5 New York. I think even the administration would admit
6 to the fact that we need to reform it, but it's for
7 some reason it never gets addressed. So maybe we
8 start, we start these chants. I know the Parks
9 Department is probably the worst of them all. I have
10 a project that I put out in the beginning of my
11 tenure that still hasn't happened. And I'm probably
12 going to ribbon cut after I'm gone from being a
13 Council Member, but you know, it is what it is. My
14 main thing here is that, I heard you say something
15 about a car could be out of service. Let's say a
16 vehicle, a parks vehicle, I'm just going to say a
17 parks vehicle. You say as a break issue. And you
18 can't get into that car, an employee can't get into
19 that vehicle. The vehicle is by any technical reason,
20 out of service, but they won't bring it in, or
21 characterize it as an out of service vehicle until
22 they don't get the parts so they could have a turn
23 around of like let's say two days. It's like oh we
24 got this done in two days when it really was just
25 sitting somewhere for a month, that it couldn't be

2 used until they got those parts but technically in
3 some check book, check box they didn't put it
4 forward. Is that, is that what you're saying?

5 JOSEPH COLANGELO: That's exactly what I'm
6 saying. It's exactly what I'm saying. See, you know,
7 when, when we talk about of of service rates, and we
8 look at out of service rates, when I, when I speak
9 about sanitation it's only because I, that's my area
10 of expertise, if you will, right. And I know now, as
11 soon as a sanitation worker knocks a truck down it's
12 out of service, it's out of service. And I know from
13 past experience that in certain agencies and, and
14 again with private contractors, with private
15 contractors they add a clause in their contract where
16 they had to maintain the out of service rate below a
17 certain number 15%, I forget what the number was. So
18 in order to do that. The only way to try to avoid
19 showing a high in 15% at a service rate was that if
20 she knocked, if the individual knocked the vehicle
21 for out of service for the brakes didn't feel right.
22 They would not report that to the agency as an out of
23 service until they got the parts to fix it. So they
24 diagnose it and hold it. That's not... I mean...

2 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So yeah... so we're
3 just looking at because we're going to look into
4 legislation. So, if it's a technicality and it's not
5 written by law that they have to report that
6 something is out of service once it's reported by
7 this, the person operating it, then that that is by
8 the... I don't want to call it something, I don't want
9 to say, I don't want to use the words because I want
10 to be very careful. That's a big deal. It's a very
11 big deal. If you have out of service vehicles that
12 are not being reported as such, in order to maintain
13 healthy numbers. And it's very dangerous. That is,
14 that is a very dangerous thing for an administration
15 to do. I don't care if they've done it in the past or
16 we're going to keep doing it. That is, that is not
17 what we're, that is not the goal. Even if the numbers
18 are bad we want to know so we can solve for problems.
19 This is about numbers being bad and trying to hide it
20 instead of trying to solve for the problem. That's a
21 big deal. So we're going to look into that. And we
22 might need to have more hearings related to DCAS or,
23 or, mainly DCAS and the work that they're doing in, I
24 guess, characterizing out of, out of, out of use
25 vehicles. So that, this is a big deal I guess is what

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

116

2 I'm telling you. Hearing that is a big problem for
3 me, a huge problem. That is that is very shady. So, I
4 might want to talk to you guys again, because this is
5 I think these are two different issues, though,
6 right, I want to be clear. I think the issue we're
7 talking about is about just having a fleet that can
8 be maintained appropriately. And that we have enough
9 people on the ground making that happen. But to have
10 numbers that are not honest is a big problem that's a
11 different problem, that's a completely different
12 problem. And if they and if by law, they're allowed
13 to do that because there is nothing we've said in
14 writing that says that this is how you determine
15 whether a vehicle is out of service or not. And maybe
16 we need to do that, so we can get real numbers in
17 here, because that is very concerning.

18 MARLENA GIGA: So with the parks
19 department what frequently happens is the employee
20 will put the vehicle out of service, and the mechanic
21 will say well I didn't find anything wrong with the
22 vehicle. And it's back in service the next day. And
23 we believe it's due to the low staffing of mechanics,
24 they just don't have the manpower...

25

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

117

2 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So that's a,
3 alright...

4 MARLENA GIGA: ...to fix the vehicles.

5 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So that's a, so
6 that's another claim. So that's another thing right?
7 What we want is for the mechanic to be able to say
8 whether it's in service or not, right? Because... so
9 these are two things. You guys are adding a lot of
10 layers to this and I want to be very, you guys have
11 to be very conscious about what you're saying here.
12 What you're saying is that an auto mechanic is...

13 JOSEPH COLANGELO: Private. You got to
14 understand...

15 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay. Okay.

16 JOSEPH COLANGELO: Alright so if I...

17 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Wait one second,
18 one second, one second.

19 JOSEPH COLANGELO: I wanna be... here's the,
20 here's the, here's the...

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Wait, wait, you
22 have to wait. You have to let me finish.

23 JOSEPH COLANGELO: Right, there's two
24 private shops.

25

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

118

2 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Colangelo you got
3 to let me finish. Has to go through the auto service
4 mechanic, it has to go to your guy first before it
5 can go out?

6 JOSEPH COLANGELO: No, oh no.

7 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: They said that...

8 JOSEPH COLANGELO: Those private shops.
9 What happened was in prospect park the private
10 contractor runs the entire repair facility. He is,
11 it's his mechanics. It's his everything.. [crosstalk]

12 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: ...back into
13 service?

14 JOSEPH COLANGELO: ...no city mechanic
15 there.

16 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Who approves them
17 to go back into service?

18 JOSEPH COLANGELO: The private vendor.

19 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: So the, no one
20 from the city is checking a box to say this is good
21 to go.. [crosstalk] put it back in?

22 JOSEPH COLANGELO: Not that I'm, no, not
23 that I'm aware of. And you also have the Bronx. And
24 the Bronx, the Bronx repair shop for parks department
25 is up by, by the zoo. Right, it's right next to

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

119

2 highway. That's a private contract. I just want to be
3 clear because that's where the misconception comes in
4 right?

5 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: You got to be
6 very clear.

7 JOSEPH COLANGELO: It's a private
8 contractor who has his own mechanics, who's
9 responsible for the fleet that used to be run by the
10 city.

11 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Okay but
12 Prospect, Prospect Park is a public private like
13 partnership right? The people that do work there. So
14 I can see, in an effort to maybe save money, that
15 they go through private contracts and do like service
16 repair for their vehicles. Right, that's one thing.
17 But for the private, the private contractor to be
18 dismissing work in an effort to meet numbers is a big
19 problem.

20 JOSEPH COLANGELO: You got it.

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: ...big contractual
22 problem.

23 JOSEPH COLANGELO: You got it.

24

25

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

120

2 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Does Arega Avenue
3 [sp?] when I wanted to ask about that, is that a
4 private contract as well?

5 JOSEPH COLANGELO: No, no... I was talking
6 Sanitation.

7 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Only Prospect
8 Park though for now?

9 JOSEPH COLANGELO: Two shops for the Parks
10 Department, the two city city shops that are
11 privatized, a Parks Department shops. One is Prospect
12 Park in Brooklyn, and one is in the Bronx, I don't
13 know what they call that facility. Oh, they have a
14 name for it.

15 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Say it on the
16 mic.

17 MARLENA GIGA: Ranaqua [sic], it's right
18 next to the Highway 1. It's off the Bronx River
19 across the street from the Bronx Zoo.

20 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: Alright so we,
21 this is, this is a good thing. This is what we do
22 this for is to get as much information as possible
23 and be clear on items. I think the Prospect Park one
24 the city will easily find a reason not to be
25 responsible for it but the employees, I want to be

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

121

2 clear, the employees on those vehicles are city
3 employees? Okay. Alright. Right.

4 UNIDENTIFIED MALE 2: Mr. Colangelo's
5 testimony at the end tells you the solutions we've
6 come up with. And one of the, few of the things we
7 said would, there should be an audit process to make
8 sure the information we're getting is accurate and
9 correct. Right. And that will help everybody.

10 CO-CHAIRPERSON REYNOSO: I hear you. So
11 I'm, I'm going to be done with my questioning. I
12 appreciate your time. I'm paying attention. This is a
13 great hearing. I want to close the gap here and make
14 sure that we have a faster turnaround rate for these
15 vehicles to get back into service. I think the
16 mechanics do do a great job considering the
17 constraints they're put in. The facilities are a
18 disaster. You know the, the amount of people that are
19 working are not at a number that we think is, is
20 suitable. So we want to work to close that gap with
21 the administration and hopefully they agree. The
22 other stuff though is a different hearing that I want
23 to talk to you guys about after this. Colangelo we're
24 gonna have to meet again. And that's a different

25

2 hearing. That might be a hearing with contracts where
3 we talk about what the city is doing there.

4 JOSEPH COLANGELO: Yeah. And I just want
5 to add. When it comes to staffing ratio, let's be
6 clear. I heard in earlier testimony that what DCAS
7 had used in one of its factors is the supervisor
8 mechanics you know as a, as an added... That's
9 unacceptable number one. For the fact of the matter
10 is a supervisor mechanic is not turning a wrench,
11 does not hold a wrench. Walks around with a shirt and
12 tie like, like everybody else. So if you're going to
13 use the fact, the fact that it's in the government
14 fleet report that gives you an exact stamping level,
15 they know how to do the mix, they do the mix by the
16 amount of types of vehicles how many each agency has,
17 and they can come up with a calculated number.
18 They've already done it, I get it in my report. The
19 Department of Sanitation is at a nine to one. That
20 nine to one ratio is achieved by taking in all the
21 equipment, and then doing your, your analysis based
22 on that chart. And that's how you come up with that
23 number. That's, that's the number, that's the factor
24 number. It's a reasonable number. (2:21:51) Now, you
25 know, we want to see 100% stamping sure everybody

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

123

2 would write you know you want to see your bank
3 account full every day right that's not something
4 that's not possible. When you come to the levels that
5 we're at which is so unacceptable and you keep losing
6 it trading people out and never getting to the point
7 where you're not even above the flow, you're having a
8 problem and I've been, I've been trying to listen, I
9 updated that report from two years ago I gave it two
10 years ago it's a it's like, you know, I want to go on
11 here, you know, we're here. Today we're here. Let me
12 just ask a question for point of clarification.

13

14 2:21:47

15 The private companies, we're talking
16 about here is prospect and the West. The Bronx River,
17 right. So, what about what about other private
18 companies when it comes to glass and so forth. I
19 asked if you remember I asked the question, what
20 happens to the to the word. And as I recall right and
21 check with my counsel, who has a better memory than I
22 do, was dead, it is double check by your mechanics,
23 is that correct. I just want to add that the private
24 mechanics, actually in the parks department are in
25 all five boroughs now.

2

3 2:22:35

4 So.

5

6 2:22:36

7 So getting back to outside of those two
8 locations. Yeah, I can say those two locations to
9 work, have been verified, right so what they have is
10 diecast has for auto mechanics that they send out to
11 review a work order, that is submitted by a private
12 contract I would tell you that for mechanics can
13 absolutely not, you know, checking every single work
14 order because there was also a policy in place where,
15 if the work would auto was on the \$500 it was pre
16 approved to mechanics we go out and look at it. A lot
17 of the time those mechanics that are in diecast, and
18 then again they could testify to the fact they mostly
19 go into these body shops and these auto repair shop
20 because there's no this physically impossible to have
21 the full auto mechanics, going out chicken every
22 single invoice and every single repair, what she's
23 talking about is because the AI contract which is a
24 state contract. So the city is allowed to opt into
25 that contract. So they have shops that are already

2 pre what the rise, so they can send the Eagles to
3 those shops, their private shops. So what they access
4 flow that's what happened in Department of Sanitation
5 that access flow went to those private shops, right,
6 the pre authorized now what happens even what
7 happening all our experiences that all mechanic has
8 already checked the truck and needs a repair. When it
9 comes to the private vendor. There was no mechanism
10 for all mechanic to check the truck that it's bridge
11 repaired right, the private vendor would you say send
12 someone to pick up the truck. It's not a mechanic
13 picking up the truck. It's a, it's a person from the
14 agency, you know, whether it be the pumps apollomon
15 whether it be, you know, the sanitation workers or
16 anybody else, then I checked them over the truck one
17 day for they're going to pick up the truck from the
18 vendor. Now, my understanding is that the trying to
19 now, develop some kind of process. So now when you
20 told me is I want to know is my mechanic gotta repair
21 every see every vehicle that's currently out of
22 service. Now he's got to check the work of a private
23 vendor because they think he can do the work.

24

25

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

126

2 You know, it's like it's like a like an
3 electrician, he does a job another electrician gotta
4 call and verify that the electrician oh you're saying
5 that that doesn't happen right now. Like I'm.

6

7 2:24:56

8 Look, I'm I'm a liberal very liberal
9 Democrat.

10

11 2:25:02

12 I don't mind layers and layers and layers
13 of work to make sure we do things right. Right. But
14 you're saying right now that a mechanic has to say
15 yeah, this has to go when it comes back around father
16 was done. No.

17

18 2:25:15

19 No. I was asking before with the private
20 still be singing, our stuff. I'll give you I'll give
21 an example right sanitation truck is not bound for
22 what we call a pack of panel backup panels that big
23 battle in the back it's got to push the garbage. Got
24 worn out is I shall we not we put it out of Service
25 Sanitation work says it's banging as loose as it

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

127

2 shows, we know we need to pack up our sanitation
3 apartment only to leave he had never happened before
4 right because really short your mechanics, they have,
5 they have they have the right contract, they say, all
6 right, they call up let me say that Trump that was
7 waiting for packet battle send it to so and so. When
8 it comes to songs our sanitation worker brings it
9 there. And when a Saturday morning picks it up you
10 don't know what those therefore you just pick up a
11 truck. He brings it back put it back in the garage.
12 Who said its operational though again.

13

14 2:26:06

15 I want to know what the backend says good
16 job, check. We don't check it. But wait a second,
17 that's not mechanics and am I getting this right. You
18 are here. That's not what I heard administration say.
19 And so we're gonna have a drive to my coach here
20 we're gonna have to backtrack and staff here we're
21 going to look at the video we're going to approach
22 the cast because that's not the message, like I
23 literally read the question for my notes here it was
24 very specific to the point, there was precision in
25 that question there's just no way around that

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

128

2 question. A simple way to look at it. If you look at
3 how many invoices there are, and divided that by the
4 four individuals that are supposed to be checking the
5 work how many would they have to do a day, is it
6 possible possible and I'm sure those four people have
7 other responsibilities, it's not just this piece. So,
8 it's true you have any other questions, co chair. No,
9 I'm excited for the next hearing. But again, thank
10 you for your time. There will be fighting during the
11 budget process to make sure that you get your do. But
12 there's more problems than just manpower here. So I
13 really appreciate your time, I really do.

14

15 2:27:18

16 And we conclude today's hearing and thank
17 you everyone.

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 <INSERT TITLE OF MEETING>

129

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date February 11, 2020