

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

OF THE

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

----- X

Monday, December 16, 2024
Start: 10:06 a.m.
Recess: 12:59 p.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E: Hon. Chris Banks, Chair

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Alexa Avilés
 Erik D. Bottcher
 Justin L. Brannan
 Darlene Mealy
 Chi A. Ossé
 Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
 Pierina Ana Sanchez
 Julie Won

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

2

A P P E A R A N C E S

Tonya Timmons,
NYCHA Resident

Amelia Walden,
NYCHA Resident

Keith Grossman,
Executive Vice President for Operations Support
Services for New York City Housing Authority
(NYCHA)

Dylan Baker-Rice,
Deputy Chief Asset and Capital Management Officer
for New York City Housing Authority (NYCHA)

Siobhan Watson,
Senior Director for Sustainability at New York
City Housing Authority (NYCHA)

Gillian Connell,
Managing Director of Strategic Operations for
Real Estate Development at New York City Housing
Authority (NYCHA)

Renee Keitt,
Resident: Representing Tenants Opposing the
Demolition of Fulton and Elliot Chelsea Houses

Joel Kupferman,
Environmental Justice Initiative, Tenant
Association Smith Houses, Residents to Preserve
Public Housing, and Concerned Residents and Riis

Karen Blondel,
Member of the Sustainability Council, President
of Red Oak West, Member of the Preservation Trust
Board

Beverly MacFarlane,
Resident Council President of Taft Houses;
Vice Chair for Residents to Preserve Public
Housing

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

3

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Celines Miranda,
Tenant from Elliott Houses, on NYCHA Demolition
and RAD/PACT Conversions

Rachel Castro,
NYCHA Resident

Christopher Leon Johnson,
Representing himself

Francine Cutler,
Resident of Boulevard Houses

SERGEANT LEVY: This is a sound test for the Committee on Public Housing Hearing, December 16, 2024, recorded by Sergeant Levy in the Committee Room.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good morning, and welcome to today's New York City Council for the Committee on Public Housing. To minimize disruptions, please place all electronic devices to vibrate or silent mode.

At no time is anyone to approach the dais. If you would like to sign up for an in-person testimony, or have any questions throughout the hearing, please see one of the Sergeant at Arms in the back of the room.

Chair, we are ready to begin.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: (GAVEL SOUND) (GAVELING IN)
I'm calling this meeting to order.

Good morning, everyone, I am Councilman Chris Banks, the chair of the Committee on Public Housing, and I'm glad to be joined by my colleagues, now that they'll be here in a few.

The extreme weather is now a fact of life, and we must plan to prepare to keep us all safe. For New Yorkers, and especially NYCHA residents, this was particularly evidenced during the Super Storm... during Superstorm Sandy, which caused untold

devastation in our city and laid bare the clear need for securing our infrastructure against the effects of extreme weather.

Hundreds of NYCHA developments across the city were impacted by Sandy, causing terrible damage to the homes and livelihoods of NYCHA residents.

NYCHA received \$3 billion in recovery funds after Superstorm Sandy. But more recent extreme weather events such as Hurricane Ida and Tropical Storm Isaiiah have highlighted, the need to take proactive measures to ensure the weather resiliency of NYCHA buildings.

As such, this committee is interested in hearing about NYCHA's work in the upgrading, repairing its buildings to better prepare for future weather events, as well as the work that has been done to recover from the efforts of Superstorm Sandy.

We are also interested in learning about the steps being taken to ready NYCHA's residents and buildings for future weather events that are likely to be more frequent, unpredictable, and greater in magnitude due to climate change. This includes NYCHA's residents in traditional public housing as

well as developments that have been converted to the RAD/PACT program.

I'm also intent on hearing about NYCHA's responsiveness in the event of weather related damages, especially as I have heard many complaints from my constituents on incidents like flood damage, heating outages, going unaddressed for far too long before NYCHA is able to successfully remediate this situation.

The hearing will be an important opportunity to take stock of what NYCHA has accomplished thus far in weatherizing its buildings as well as what more they could be doing now into the future.

I look forward to hearing from everyone gathered here today on the various aspects making up this precedent and pressing issue.

I would like to thank my staff, Michael, along with, Public Housing staff, Jose, Connor, Sierra, Dan, Nicholas, Reese, and Charles for all the work they've put into this hearing.

We will, first hear from the pre panel made up of NYCHA residents, and we'll have them come on up. We have Tonya Timmons, and we have Amelia Walden.

Before you start, let me just read a few protocols for public testimony.

I now open the hearing for public testimony. I remind members of the public that this is a formal government proceeding and that decorum shall be observed at all times. As such, members of the public shall remain silent at all times.

The witness table is reserved for people who wish to testify. No video recording or photography is allowed from the witness table. Further, members of the public may not present audio or video recordings as testimony, but may submit transcripts of such recordings to the Sergeant at Arms for inclusion in the hearing record.

If you wish to speak at today's hearing, please fill out an appearance card with the Sergeant at Arms and wait to be recognized. When recognized, you will have two minutes to speak on today's hearing topic: *Oversight - Weather-Proofing at NYCHA Buildings and Campuses.*

If you have a written statement or additional testimony you wish to submit for the record, please provide a copy of that testimony to the Sergeant at Arms.

You may also email written testimony to Testimony@council.nyc.gov within 72 hours after the close of this hearing. Audio and video recordings will not be accepted.

Alright, so we are going to begin with Tonya Timmons. You may begin.

TONYA TIMMONS: Yes. Good morning, I'm a tenant of, it used to be, Linden Houses now they turned it over to RAD/PACT. I'm having issues with them. They did the renovations in our bathrooms, where now they came back in because they never changed the pipes when they renovated. My pipes was cracked up where the... my tenant... my neighbor down on the fourth floor was getting everybody's water going into her home.

Now I'm having an issue, because my wall had been open since November 12th. The neighbor upstairs is not granting them access to change their pipes, because they're saying the pipes in all the apartments has to be changed. Everyone else agreed except for them on the sixth floor.

I've been talking with the people, asking them, like, what's going on. They... one day, they called me when I was down at NYCHA telling me, "Oh, we have

1 to get into your apartment. There's a leak." I said,
2 "Okay, well, I'm done at NYCHA now. When I finish,
3 I'm coming right home." "Oh, no, we're gonna call
4 the fire department and break down your door because
5 this is important." I said, "Miss, I already know
6 what's going on. My wall been open for two weeks
7 already with this leak."

8
9 So now my thing is, with these people, if you
10 told me this, what are y'all doing with this tenant
11 upstairs that is clearly refusing to let y'all in
12 that apartment so they can fix the leaks?

13 I'm still didn't hear anything from them. They
14 keep telling me, oh, we're gonna go and get a court
15 order. This has been going on for almost two weeks.
16 My wall still been open since November 12th.

17 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Does that conclude your
18 testimony?

19 TONYA TIMMONS: Yes.

20 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Alright, just a quick couple
21 of questions.

22 This is in Linden Houses or...

23 TONYA TIMMONS: Well, Stanley and (INAUDIBLE)...
24 (CROSS-TALK)

25 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Stanley Avenue preservation?

TONYA TIMMONS: Stanley Avenue Preservation...

(CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay.

TONYA TIMMONS: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And have you put in a ticket number? Is there a ticket number put in there?

TONYA TIMMONS: Well, they've been... this has been going... this has been an ongoing thing. So I don't even know if it's still a ticket number there because, like I said, this has been happening since November when they went in because my neighbor, like I said, her apartment kept getting flooded with all the water coming down from the leaks.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay.

TONYA TIMMONS: You know? So they know that this is still open, because I've been dealing with one of the workers there where she been dealing with me far as she said, listen, I don't wanna come in during the holidays. So that's why they came the day after Thanksgiving and did this work again. Had to come back. They had to come back and put in change another pipe.

So when that plumber came, he said all the pipes in the whole line gotta be changed. They should have

changed them when they did their innovations, which they didn't.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. Well, I think the NYCHA reps are here. Hopefully, we can get some clarification as to why she's been having a hole in her wall for the last two weeks. And, I guess this is under a RAD/PACT development, and they've been doing nothing.

So hopefully, we can get some... we can make this tenant happy and address this concern.

Any issues with heating?

TONYA TIMMONS: No, not in my apartment. But...

(CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay...

TONYA TIMMONS: in other people's apartments over there, they've been having issues with the heat and the hot water.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. Thank you so much, Ms. Timmons.

TONYA TIMMONS: Thank you

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Ms. Walden?

AMEILIA WALDEN: Hi, I'm a tenant Penn-Wortman Stanley Avenue Preservation.

1 I have been dealing with them since November or
2 December of 2023. First, my front door, apartment
3 door, had a gap and it wasn't closing; 311, HPD came
4 out, management tried to remedy the door, they
5 couldn't do anything. Now, they put the new doors
6 in... Well, HPD had to hire a contractor because
7 Stanley Avenue didn't do anything.
8

9 Okay. Now, my door still has a gap. You can see
10 the hallway light, breeze comes in. They want to come
11 and... they put a new door up, but the gap is still
12 there, and they want to put weather stripping, so I'm
13 not comfortable with weather stripping. I asked for a
14 new door with the correct measurements. They still
15 refusing.

16 Okay, I've been putting work orders in since
17 2023, and a lot of my work orders still have not been
18 completed. To piggyback, I'm told once you put a work
19 order in, as long as that work order is not
20 completed, you can't submit another ticket.

21 So, I think the 3rd of December, I went to the
22 office, and what they did was give me a printout of
23 my work orders, but at the bottom, they put the date
24 that I came in.
25

So my work orders, first of all, we would like to know about the slam locks, because people are still getting locked out of their apartments. Management said, walk with your keys at all times. We explained people have different disabilities, different things. Why should you have to walk with your keys? So they refused to change the slam locks.

Last Thursday, all the, uhm, it's 16 floors, the electricity went out completely. We were not aware. News 12 came out, of course, management said that they did notify, but people were not aware, because when I left home about 9 o'clock, (TIMER CHIMES) when I opened my door to leave, I had to use a flashlight to walk out into ... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You may... You get another minute. You may continue.

AMEILIA WALDEN: Okay.

This renovation has been a nightmare. They're downsizing their apartments; in my kitchen, they put a false wall, which took up my kitchen space. But, I finally got on them, and they finally removed part of it, but it's still a downsize. The riser... They took me to court, and they wanted to break my floor the for asbestos, and I refused because they did not

1 have the proper equipment. So they took me to court.
2 Finally, they have to break the floor... They have to
3 have the correct equipment, but they made me sign a
4 waiver or something that if I became ill, if it's
5 asbestos, I cannot hold them responsible. So that's
6 something that need to be addressed.
7

8 Okay, my closet, they put these pipes in, and I'm
9 afraid if they are doing shoddy work, I hope these
10 pipes don't burst in my living room, because these
11 are huge pipes, and I will be in trouble. I'm on the
12 top floor.

13 My living room closet, they gave me a little hole
14 in the wall. The agreement with the (INAUDIBLE)
15 attorneys was that they would give me a stipend to
16 get a closet, but the court was... the case was
17 dismissed last week, and I haven't heard from them,
18 so that's another downsizing of the apartment.

19 And I would like to also stipulate, for any other
20 building, if anyone is hearing impaired, could you
21 please notify HUD that they should put the smoke
22 alarms, the fire alarms up, the detectors up for the
23 hearing impaired? Because like I spoke before, I had
24 to call the fire department and American Red Cross,
25 and it's another development. The person says she

have the regular smoke detectors. So that's something that needs to be addressed.

And I would also like to note that in my building, people are complaining about their pipes bursting. Management is not doing the repairs like they should. Management said they don't make appointments, but if you don't have an appointment, how are you supposed to know someone is coming out?

I have another issue, because I didn't refuse the riser, I wanted them to have the correct equipment for this asbestos testing. Okay, now, with the riser, could you find out what the reason for this riser is, and who does HUD check... spot check the construction work? Since they are furnishing the payments, who from HUD or who comes out and inspects these apartments... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: I... I believe (INAUDIBLE)...

AMEILIA WALDEN: besides the construction people?

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: I will let NYCHA answer that.

AMEILIA WALDEN: Okay, now, in July, because they were supposed to relocate me to an apartment, and at the last minute they told me, no. I was in my apartment sleeping, and they rang my bell, and since I know they weren't supposed to be coming in, they

opened my apartment door just as I got up. They used their key to come into my apartment without my permission. So, that's another issue I have with them. I was not refusing, but I wanted cover myself and my family, do the right thing, and we can get good results.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Let me just, uh, ask you a question. This is a RAD/PACT, uhm...

AMEILIA WALDEN: RAD/PACT, mm-hmm.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: development right? PENN-WORTMAN Houses?

AMEILIA WALDEN: Penn-Wortman...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Where has NYCHA been in this whole conversation you've been having with management over these particularly controversies?

AMEILIA WALDEN: Well, they took my voucher away, and I did not know it - in February, but they were taking my rent. And at one point, when I found out in April, they wanted to give me my rec... My money order receipts back, but I told them, no, I already paid my rent. But, I didn't even know they were holding it. Management cut off my ticket order at one time, and it's nothing... It's just a nightmare.

I went down to NYCHA, and they are saying they are still waiting for management, because they can't do anything until management is approved with the voucher.

So just because of this court order, I should be getting my voucher back.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay, thank you for your testimony.

Any questions from any of the council members?

Okay, we have been joined by Council Member Avilas and Council Member Mealy.

AMEILIA WALDEN: Avilas and who?

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Council Member Mealy and Council Member Avilas.

AMEILIA WALDEN: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you.

AMEILIA WALDEN: Mm-hmm.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your testimony.

AMEILIA WALDEN: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You have a question, Council Member? Yes?

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: What is... What do you know of their procedure, if you're, uhm, not at home, what

is the interpretation of what you think how they should come into your apartment?

AMELIA WALDEN: If it's an emergency, I could see.

But what happened - when they took me to court, the judge said for the attorneys to come to an agreement, but they must have the proper equipment before they break the floors, because they don't know whether asbestos is there or not.

I wasn't refusing, but I wanted to be mindful that I have to protect myself. I could see if it were an emergency, but they had promised me with agreement that I could move to the building 155.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So, did they give you a reason why they denied - or they changed their mind moving you to a next building?

AMELIA WALDEN: They're saying it's not really... They rented the apartment out.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Wait a minute, excuse me?

AMELIA WALDEN: The relocation apartment, that it was rented out. But, no one got back to me until they brought a whole entourage up one day telling me they wanted to relocate... But, I said the agreement was that I would like... prefer that other apartment. No one notified me, and I had to call to find out what

was happening. Then they relocated me to apartment, the vents in our building are not working at all. Management refused to address that.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So when did.. You said April they had taken away your Section 8? No one notified you?

AMELIA WALDEN: No one notified me.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: (INAUDIBLE)

AMELIA WALDEN: I just... my rent receipt kept reflecting...

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: (INAUDIBLE) excuse me?

AMELIA WALDEN: I just... my rent receipt started reflecting back payments. And when I went to the office, and then I was told... At first they didn't know. Then I (INAUDIBLE) call NYCHA and find out. But, no one notified me that they were withholding my rent.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So, did they help you, uhm, with... to apply again for Section 8? Or you have to... (CROSS-TALK)

AMELIA WALDEN: (INAUDIBLE)

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: apply yourself to get back on Section 8?

AMELIA WALDEN: After the court order, yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Thank you.

AMELIA WALDEN: That court order was a nightmare, anxiety and everything. And like I told them, I'm only trying to find out what's correct.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. Thank you for your testimony, guys, appreciate it.

Okay, now we will move forward with NYCHA.

(PAUSE)

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: So, if you could all raise your right hand?

Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your testimony before this committee, and to respond honestly to council member questions?

(PANEL AFFIRMS)

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And if you could all, for the record, identify yourself and your title, that'd be great.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: I am going to do that in testimony if that's...

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Perfect, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You may begin with your testimonies.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Good morning.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Good morning.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Chair Banks, members of the Committee on Public Housing, other distinguished members of the City Council, NYCHA residents, community advocates, and members of the public, good morning.

I am Keith Grossman, NYCHA's Executive Vice President for Operation Support Services. I am pleased to be joined by Dylan Baker-Rice, Deputy Chief Asset and Capital Management Officer; Siobhan Watson, Senior Director for Sustainability; and to my left, Gillian Connell, Managing Director of Strategic Operations in the Real Estate Development Department, and other members of NYCHA's team.

Thank you for this opportunity to discuss our progress in ensuring that NYCHA developments are adequately prepared for the challenges of the winter season. The health and safety of our residents is our top priority, and we have been working hard over the past several years to provide NYCHA families with comfortable and consistent heat.

We are also proud to... proud of our efforts to help prepare some of our developments for the future through the latest innovations in sustainability.

Heating outages are down and restored quickly. We continue to make progress in reducing the number of heat outages as well as the time it takes to resolve them.

As of December 12th, so far this heating season, we are resolving heat outages in an average of eight and a half hours, well below the HUD agreement target of 12 hours. We have also decreased the number of outages by 40%, and no outages have lasted more than 24 hours. This progress is a result of targeted operational investments and improvements to process and management.

Our work is guided by our federal monitor approved action plan, which outlines the procedures and protocols we follow to prevent and respond to outages. The action plan also details how we communicate with residents about outages and repairs, provide warming centers in certain scenarios, and investigate outages that cannot be restored within 12 hours.

We aim to restore heat within an average of 12 hours overall, within 24 hours for 85% of heat outages, and always within 48 hours. As I noted so far this heat... heating season, we are exceeding these targets.

Please keep in mind that an outage pertains to a total disruption of service on an entire apartment line, hallway, building, section of a development, or an entire development. And outages may be planned for scheduled maintenance or unplanned due to unforeseen emergencies.

When there are planned outages, NYCHA notifies residents in advance via robocalls and notices posted throughout the development.

I would now like to discuss some of the ways we are enhancing heating services, while investing in a sustainable future for our properties.

FOCUSING ON PREPARING FOR THE WINTER SEASON:

Our buildings and infrastructure are aging. The majority of our buildings are more than half a century old, and our boilers are 27 years old on average, past the 20 to 25 year expected life span for a boiler. For this reason, preventative

1 maintenance is a vital part of our work to ensure
2 consistent heat for residents.

3 Every year, our Heating Management Services
4 Department, HMSD, performs preventative maintenance
5 and inspections to preserve and restore the
6 reliability of nearly 5,000 pieces of heating
7 equipment, including 897 boilers, 1,733 hot water
8 systems, and 1,619 heat distribution systems.

9 This involves inspecting, cleaning, lubricating,
10 adjusting, repairing, and replacing worn components,
11 and ensuring that equipment and mechanical areas are
12 in a satisfactory operating condition.

13 Before this year's heating season began, HMSD and
14 our vendors performed preventative maintenance and
15 made repairs when necessary on 100% of our heating
16 equipment.

17 Due to the large number of assets, NYCHA procured
18 a vendor to conduct preventative maintenance on some
19 of our boilers, allowing NYCHA staff to focus on the
20 hot water and heat distribution systems, which
21 includes circulating pumps, vacuum tanks and pipes
22 that deliver heat to residents' homes.

23 Every year, we develop and maintain a list of
24 critical heat and hot water equipment and systems
25

that need replacement or extensive repairs. And we procure extra parts, so we are prepared when key items fail.

NYCHA invested over \$43 million in heating infrastructure upgrades at two developments since last winter and an additional \$24 million of investment at eight developments will be completed by the end of the heating season.

We also maintain a reserve of staged and non-staged boilers that can be activated in the event of a large scale heating service disruption. Thirteen mobile boilers are currently connected to developments and eight more can be deployed if needed.

And we increased after hours... and we increased after-hours staffing coverage ahead of the heating season, adding evening plumbing and electrical teams that can be deployed in response to outages. And additionally, an overnight midnight to eight plumbing team is added when temperatures drop below freezing.

TRANSFORMING THE WAY WE OPERATE:

We hired 70 additional frontline heating staff to support the reorganization of HMSD into the

neighborhood model as part of our transformation plan's organizational reforms.

This involved reorganizing our coverage of developments from 13 clusters into 28 neighborhoods. Smaller portfolios enable staff to better understand the unique needs and challenges of each heat and hot water system in their neighborhood. It better distributes work orders and resources, fosters greater collaboration among stakeholders, and brings a crucial decision making which occurs during an outage closer to the root of the issue.

We also established a data analytics unit that uses key performance indicators to identify and track where we need to improve.

A planning and skilled trades unit addresses patterns of heat complaints and service disruptions before and during the heating season.

HMSD's special teams, composed of highly experienced heating staff, address the more complex issues that arise and perform preventative maintenance and repairs.

And we assigned additional managerial employees to the Evening Heat Desk Operations, streamlining decision making for issues that arise after

traditional business hours and during weekends and holidays.

The Heat Desk is a 24/7 operation, which monitors potential service disruptions from various data and dispatches staff accordingly.

Our repair teams also operate on a 24/7 basis, and to support these roving repair teams, we established an afterhours field supervision schedule and skilled trades coverage.

Enhanced staff training is another way that we are improving the way we operate. NYCHA revamped its Heating Plant Technician, or HPT curriculum, to include new heating assets installed with an enhanced focus on preventative maintenance.

Additionally, we created a Direct to Training Model with mentorship where new HPTs go directly into training to learn in a low-stress environment prior to working on heating equipment at a development. Once assigned to a property, they are paired with veteran heating staff who provide real life hands on training. These changes are increasing accountability and oversight and efficiency. And the NYCHA community is benefiting from faster resolution of issues,

1 thanks to the more hands on management of our heating
2 assets.

3
4 We also enhance the way we communicate with
5 residents. We make sure residents know about outages
6 through flyers, robocalls, our websites, social
7 media, and my NYCHA alerts. Residents can... so that
8 we can address any lingering issues, residents can
9 automatically let us know if there is... if they're
10 still experiencing a service disruption, when they
11 receive a service restoration call.

12 When residents submit heat complaints via MyNYCHA
13 or the Customer Service Contact Center, or CCC, we
14 ask additional triage questions that enable us to
15 deploy repair staff most efficiently.

16 I do want to note that we can most effectively
17 identify and respond to issues (TIMER CHIMES) when
18 residents report concerns via MyNYCHA or the CCC.

19 MAJOR INVESTMENTS IN HEATING:

20 NYCHA modernized heating controls at 51
21 developments, which involves installing a building
22 management system and apartment temperature sensors.

23 Apartments that were typically too hot are now at
24 a more comfortable range of 72 to 74 degrees during
25 the day and 69 to 71 degrees at night, with the heat

coming on in cycles to prevent overheating and under heating and to reduce energy costs.

We can also monitor building temperatures and heating and hot water systems in real times at these developments, enabling us to respond to issues faster. Although our heating infrastructure is extensive and our capital needs are enormous -nearly \$13 billion for heating systems portfolio wide - we are working to execute on the funding we have to address some of the major investment needs.

Through 2026, we are replacing 500 boilers through a capital, through capital work and packed conversions; 297 boilers will be replaced through capital project across 76 developments thanks to \$3.4 billion in City, State and Federal funding.

Since 2019, we've replaced 134 boilers through capital projects and addressed 237 boilers through our PACT partnerships. Another 278 boilers have been converted through PACT and are under construction.

Thanks to Hurricane Sandy recovery funding, 20 developments are receiving new heating and hot water systems, housed in elevated and flood proof structures.

We're not just replacing in kind, but are putting in place more effective systems. For example, to improve hot water service, we are incorporating modern designs in our new heating plants, decoupling hot water from space heating equipment, so that issues with one do not impact the other, and upgrading buildings based equipment.

In accordance with our Sustainability Agenda, we are moving away from steam generating heat and hot water systems when possible by deploying geothermal energy and electric heat pumps, and improving envelopes through window replacements, advancements that help reduce outages, enhance system performance, benefit the environment, and keep residents safe and comfortable.

Through the Clean Heat for All Challenge, a collaboration between NYCHA, the New York Power Authority, and the New York State Energy Research and Development Authority an initial \$70 million investment will lead to the development and production of 30,000 new heat pumps for NYCHA residents. The families who are already benefiting from them at Woodside Houses report that they are working well and it's environmentally friendly,

easily installable technology will provide reliable heating and cooling for thousands of residents ultimately.

We invested about \$341 million in energy performance contracts, replacing boilers and modernizing heating systems at 70 developments. And nearly \$26 million of weatherization upgrades are completed or in construction.

We are also taking advantage of a direct install program where local vendors funded by local utilities repair and replace apartment radiator valves and traps at no cost to NYCHA. This improves steam distribution and residents comfort.

While we're pursuing all possible funding sources and investing that limited funding as wisely as possible, the reality is that there is simply not enough funding to address all the needs across the portfolio. That is why we are implementing bold and innovative strategies such as PACT and the Trust that will provide residents with dramatically improved quality of life through comprehensive building renovations, including fully upgraded heating systems.

IMPROVING RESIDENTS QUALITY OF LIFE:

By improving the way we operate and investing strategically in the future with the limited funding available, we are strengthening the authority while delivering better services for residents.

The challenges at NYCHA are significant, but they are not insurmountable. In fact, we are demonstrating that through partnership, we can achieve great change. While there is still much work to be done, we appreciate the support of our stakeholders, including members of the Council, which is enabling us to be a better landlord for the NYCHA families we serve and improve their quality of life.

Thank you, we are happy to answer any questions you may have.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your statement.

I guess we'll just dive right in.

You know, boiler repairs and replacement of at the NYCHA developments, obviously, is a hot topic. And, obviously, with the, uh, with the temperatures, dropping over the last couple of weeks, we know that, the last two years we obviously haven't had traditional winter cycles, and we know now that the systems are being tested.

As we are now in this heating system, I would like to start with some of the updates on the heating improvements that have been made across NYCHA.

Can you tell me what progress has been made when it comes to boiler replacements as of today?

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: I'll start, Thank you, Chair.

To date, we have completed a 134 boilers through our capital construction cycle, which is on track to exceed our goal for this year of 133.

There's another three that we're working on to finish out where the construction has been completed and we're testing. We project that we'll complete another 103 by the end of 2025 and another 60 by the end of 2026, so that we hit our target of 297 boilers by the end of 2026 which is the overall HUD target.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Traditionally how many boilers are at a particular development? Like, say, for instance, the Pink Houses, how many boilers operate to provide heat to the residents?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: What, uh, you said Pink?

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Pink, like Pink Houses, I know that they (INAUDIBLE)... (CROSS-TALK)

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: So it varies, right, at every development. I'll get back to you on the exact number of boilers at Pink. But it varies development by development. Right? There's a formula that we use when we're designing and installing the boilers that says, you know, we're going to... we need this many boilers to provide this amount of steam pressure to this many apartments, and it's geographically diverse and based.

So we may have a development that has six, we may have one that has... only requires two to provide heat.

Additionally, you know, we'll have decoupled hot water resources. So, maybe each building has its own hot water supply or a separate boiler that does hot water for the property.

So, it really does vary. But it's, you know, three to four is probably a reasonable number to see as an average, uh, there are some with eight, there are some with one.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, when the replacements are taking place, are they just removing all of the old boilers, or are they piecemealing it?

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: So as my colleague Keith said, there there's sort of two approaches. One is where we wholesale replace the boiler.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay.

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: And that's if we're keeping most, if we're keeping the steam system in place.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Right.

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: Another avenue is that we decouple, which means that we move the capacity of the domestic water, so a boiler is not providing space heating and domestic hot water. In that case, we can reduce the size of the boiler, and, uhm, deploy domestic hot water solutions at different buildings. And so that'll allow us, redundancy between the two systems and less strain on the overall boiler.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: What is NYCHA's preparedness plan for the heat season, and have you completed a preventative maintenance for the heat... for this heat season?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Yeah, so, thank you Chair.

So, our preparedness plan uh, really, our preparedness for the heating season starts while the

previous heating season is ongoing. Right? As I said, we have almost 5,000 assets.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Right.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Which is a significant amount to cover in between that May 31st to October 1st timeline.

So what we do is, we, starting in February, we will take down... we will start doing hot water systems where possible to take them down. Obviously, if it's excessively cold in February, we'll start at March.

Additionally, throughout the heating season, boilers will come down for maintenance. As I said, most... a significant number of our properties have multiple boilers. So, when one is down for maintenance, we're able to do not only the repair, but also the preventative maintenance. That's before the heating season even ends.

As we get days where we're not providing heat towards the end, we'll start to tape boilers down and do the maintenance cycle there. We also bring on a vendor to help us at trouble... at developments with troubled distribution systems, so that they can focus on the boiler maintenance, and our staff can work on

the distribution systems, from the apartment all the way back to the boiler. From the boiler to the apartment, and the apartment back to the boiler.

Those, uh, those maintenance and repair cycles lead to some repairs, and our goal is to repeat... to complete those and have enough boilers online to provide heat at 32 degrees on October 1st.

We have accomplished that goal in at least the last two years. And as I said, at this point, all of our repairs required to have proper functioning heat as a result of that preventative maintenance process have been completed.

Obviously, throughout the heating season, we...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Right...

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: we have some issues. But...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, to date, how many heating outages have taken place?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Yeah. So this year, as of December 12, 2024, NYCHA has resolved 93 heat outages. Comparing that to the same time frame last year, we were at a 156. So that's a 40% reduction.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: With the 93 heating outages, the Preparedness Plan that you just spoke about, was that preparedness plan, uh, were these developments part of that plan?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: A 100% of assets. All developments were. As I said, you know... oh, go ahead... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, what... what caused the, heating to be interrupted?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: So there's any number of, uh, issues. As I said, our infrastructure is past, in many cases, past its useful life. So just because we perform maintenance, when we put the system under pressure, a leak may happen or there may be some external cause. For example, if there's a power loss or there's a loss of steam from a utility, we that may cause an outage as well.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, can you give me a more in-depth look of how this plan, uh, how does it look step by step, when you're testing the system?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Yeah, absolutely.

So, when we... each boiler, uhm, is... the doors are open, we check the heat... the hot water side of

1 the boiler, right, the part that produces steam where
2 there's water. And the heat side, the part that heats
3 up the water. Right?

4 So, essentially, the majority of boilers are, you
5 know, producing steam. There are some boilers that
6 are hydronic systems that heat, uh, water, that water
7 travels through the property at about a 180 degrees
8 and radiates the room through steaming.

9 So regardless of that, we open up the boiler, we
10 check all of the components, all of the mechanical
11 pieces throughout the property, and we'll replace
12 anything that's broken, repair anything that's
13 leaking, lubricate anything that needs to be
14 lubricated, make sure all the gauges work, and then
15 we will close-up the system, like, close-up the
16 actual boilers, those large doors on the front, uh,
17 make sure that it's... there's a proper seal, the
18 gaskets are all replaced, uhm, start filling the
19 boiler to make sure that there's enough water to
20 produce steam. And we will then do what's called the
21 hydro test. Right? We test the water to make sure
22 that there's no leaks. Once that's completed, the
23 boiler is ready to go back in service.

Prior to that hydro test, which is a, which is a pressure test of the vessel, there's a supervisory inspection. So our supervisors go out and inspect the work that was done to make sure it was satisfactory. If it's not, or there's another repair needed, we will do that. We will work on that asset until it is 100% ready to go.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: But when it gets to the apartment, what role does the apartment play in the... in the actual testing that's taking place? The valves in the, uhm, in the, with the...

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Radiator valve...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS The radiators. Is that also tested, too? Are residents made aware of the... this testing that is taking place when it takes place?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: So in certain... in certain systems like hydronic systems that I mentioned, where there is water flowing throughout the building, we will notify residents ahead of time, and we will apply... we will put some pressure on the system leading up to the heating season to do leak checks. Hydronic systems are older, uh, they're typically running on the exterior wall,

1 and they're exposed to cold. Like, you know, just
2 going back to the aging infrastructure question, if
3 they're not well insulated or, uh, maybe it's a
4 vacant unit, there may be some cold air exposing, you
5 know, hitting that heating pipe.

6 So in those instances, we do, uhm, at our problem
7 developments, our problem systems, we do that as
8 well. And we'll apply pressure to the system and
9 leave, you know, maybe, like, two or three pounds
10 just to start looking for leaks.

11 You know, I'll also say that, as far as resident
12 apartments, right, we view all of our data very
13 specifically. Right? So, we look at the entire
14 development outages, uh, as it affects the... as it
15 affects the... the boiler plant and the heating
16 system. And we also look at resident complaint data
17 annually. So we'll take that resident complaint data,
18 and we'll look at the property or the development
19 that has the most number of complaints.

20 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Right.

21 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: And we'll
22 address those in-unit complaints. So we will have a
23 team, We have a team called the Steam Optimization
24 Squad or SOS, uh, they will go around and do a lot of
25

1 that maintenance. We'll coordinate with the residents
2 - we actually schedule it, you know, when they're
3 when the resident's home, if they work during the
4 day, we'll come a little bit in the evening. If they
5 work at night, we'll try to come a little bit later
6 in the afternoon, so we don't wake them too much. But
7 they're really in and out, it's about 15 minutes.
8 They check the property, assuming... they check the
9 apartment and all the radiators and the elements,
10 assuming nothing's wrong.
11

12 So we look at the entirety of the heating system
13 from the boiler to the apartment, and honestly, back.

14 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay.

15 Residents have raised concerns about the
16 temporary boilers, including that they're not being
17 removed in time and that they cause air quality
18 problems.

19 How does NYCHA track and remediate these issues
20 related to the temporary boilers?

21 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Thank you,
22 Chair.

23 So those mobile boilers or temporary boilers can
24 be installed for any number of reasons, any number
25 of... any number of reasons. So there's... some are

1 installed as part of a capital project or
2 improvement. Right? So if we're doing a full plant
3 replacement, as Dylan said, I mentioned earlier, we
4 will attach a mobile boiler to that property. It's
5 typically supplied by the gas utility that will
6 provide heat while we're dismantling, removing, and
7 rebuilding a new boiler.
8

9 The other... the other piece is, if we have a
10 boiler room that is aging and waiting for a
11 replacement, or in need of a major capital repair,
12 and it's not able to produce the proper amount of
13 pressure, we'll add a mobile boiler to increase the
14 horsepower of that steam pressure going on to the
15 property. So that that's the other reason to do it.

16 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Right. How many, developments
17 now are operating off of a temporary boiler system?

18 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: So from in the
19 operations portfolio, we have 13 deployed.

20 Do you have the number on the capital side?

21 DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: Yeah, on the capital side we
22 have 52.

23 And to your question before, Chair, for all the
24 52 that we have on the capital side, they are natural
25

gas, so we switched over to natural gas, for the concerns with oil.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And how many of those particular, uhm, developments that, uh, have temporary boilers, was the... was there also... are they... were they also part of the preparedness plan, or were... they were... or there tests that were done?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Yeah...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay...

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Yes. Short answer is yes. Every year, every... every asset goes through some sort of preventative maintenance. It's like a, you know, a car tune up. Right? You take it in every three months.

So, it's the same thing. All the assets, they get pressure tested. There's, uh, they do... they do a flame analyzation on it to make sure that we're not producing excess soot into the atmosphere.

And, obviously, prior to installation, we have to install a stack, uh, to ensure that, uh, it blows away from the building in accordance with the DOB (Department of Buildings) standards.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You mentioned that, the oh, let me go back up. How many of the new boilers are gas fired? And... And...

(PAUSE)

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: Chair, we'll have to get back to you with the number on the exact number for gas fired. Generally, when we're decoupling, uh, we're switching to gas. And any replacements, uh, we're either looking at dual fuel, so, gas is preferred...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Right.

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: with an oil backup. And that's for redundancy sake in case there is an outage.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And, what are the renewable, sources of heating that you're looking at... or energy that you're... heating that you're looking at?

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: Yeah, I'll pass it to my colleague, Siobhan, to talk about electrification.

DIRECTOR WATSON: Sure. Yeah.

So, we have been looking at pathways to remove fossil fuel use from NYCHA's buildings in accordance with our Local Law 97 obligations, as well as state and broader goals to meet greenhouse gas emissions reduction targets.

So existing technology to electrify buildings actually, uhm, involves a lot of retrofit work that turns it into a very expensive project.

The Clean Heat For All Challenge in collaboration with NYPA-NYSERDA encouraged manufacturers to develop a unit that could more easily be installed at NYCHA.

So we have been piloting those units over the past year at Woodside Houses. We have 24 apartments that have been running solely on heat pumps, and the results have been great from the pilot. Residents are really satisfied with them. And one of the benefits of using a heat pump unit is actually providing individual control over the temperature to residents.

So, that is one of the major benefits of electrification is that residents are able to control the temperature and maintain what is comfortable to them in their apartment.

In addition to that unit, we have a couple of other buildings that we've electrified using existing products or, you know, prior existing products. One

1 is at, 830 Amsterdam where the whole building is
2 operating on a VRF system. And then the other is at
3 Hoe Avenue in the Bronx where we're using, APCOA
4 units that made use of pre-existing AC sleeves to be
5 able to install those before the clean heat for all
6 units were ready.
7

8 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you.

9 DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: Yeah, just as a follow-up.

10 So together, we have eight developments where
11 we're electrifying the space heating, and then
12 another 13 developments where we're electrifying
13 domestic hot water.

14 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Before we, uh, proceed with
15 questions, let me just recognize, Council Member
16 Bottcher, and Council Member Salamanca, who's virtual
17 and, now joined when I said Council Member Chi Ossé.

18 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You have mentioned that, uh,
19 there are new building management systems that are
20 being implemented at NYCHA developments.

21 Can you go into more detail on the progress of
22 these building management systems and how they work,
23 and how, uh, the new system affects residents?

24 DIRECTOR WATSON: Sure. So building management
25 systems exist in order to fine tune the amount of

1 steam being provided to apartments. They operate
2 using indoor apartment sensors that are, uhm, our
3 Operations Department is able to actually see
4 remotely the temperatures in particular lines of
5 apartments, and then the building management system
6 adjusts the amount of steam being provided based on
7 the feedback of the apartments. So... (CROSS-TALK)

9 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: One moment, so the sensors are
10 in different parts of the building? Are they in every
11 apartment, or are they strategically placed
12 throughout the development?

13 DIRECTOR WATSON: They're not in every apartment.
14 They're placed in about 30% of apartments...

15 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay.

16 DIRECTOR WATSON: Uhm, in order to give a view of
17 each line of apartments and how the temperature is
18 being maintained from in the different floors.

19 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So are they... Mm-hmm... Are
20 they higher up? Are they placed on lower levels?

21 DIRECTOR WATSON: Generally, they're distributed
22 where they're sort of high, medium, and low within
23 the apartment line. So we'll have you know, if
24 there's 10 floors, there may be one on 10, five, and,
25 first floor, something like that.

1
2 It depends on the exact building, but it'll be a
3 distribution of apartments to give our operations
4 team a view of the line as a whole.

5 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: How is NYCHA working to
6 improve the time it takes to perform general repairs
7 at its buildings? And how are current repair requests
8 handled?

9 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Yeah, so,
10 obviously, our goal is to... as we talked extensively
11 about the preventative maintenance program, our goal
12 is to limit those repairs as much as humanly
13 possible.

14 That being said, again, we... I'll go back to the
15 old infrastructure adage, right, where our
16 infrastructure is very old, and takes time to repair.

17 So I think we're addressing it in two ways. I'll
18 just take the general, you know, the day to day
19 operational response, and then I'll pass it to Dylan,
20 and we can talk about some of our capital... our
21 capital focus on those major repairs and how we look
22 at that.

23 You know, on a day to day basis, right, if we...
24 we got a ticket, we are doing our best to get to the
25 those individual heat complaints within 24 hours,

1 right, per law. We are... We will go to the
2 apartment. We will inspect the heating equipment. We
3 will ensure that the element is working. We'll go all
4 the way down to the basement. You know... I'm sorry,
5 the convector is functioning and providing steam -
6 we'll go down to the basement. We'll check the
7 equipment. Go to the boiler room, come back, and
8 we're taking multiple temperature checks throughout
9 that time to make sure we're not dropping below that.
10 And that's just on a day to day repair.

11
12 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: What's the actual time frame
13 that it takes when a repair comes in a tenant
14 complains about...

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Sure.

16 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: not having heat, what is the
17 response time?

18 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Sure.

19 So there's two different... again, I just wanna
20 clarify. You're talking about in unit complaints as
21 compared to an outage, which is a multiple
22 complaints... (CROSS-TALK)

23 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, obviously, it will be
24 multiple complaints if it's...

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: It's an outage, right...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: an outage, right?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: So our outage time frame is where we're storing in 8.5 hours currently. And for a general in-unit complaint, we we're trying to... we're about 24 hours on average, a little below 24 hours on an in-unit complaint on average. That's not including a unit a complaint associated with an outage.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, in in the meantime, if there's an outage on a particular line, what's put in place to provide heat to those tenants while the heating is out? Is there any, uh, what's put in place?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: No, sure, that's a great question, though. So... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Or do they just suffer without heat?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: I'll take you through that process for sure, thank you, Chair. So, thank you for clarifying the question as well.

So what will happen is we will get there on arrival. Right? We'll see that ticket count. You've

been to our Heat Desk in Long Island City, right?

We'll see that ticket count start to rise. We'll send a team to investigate. We'll find out what the prob... We'll troubleshoot, find out what the problem is, and simultaneously, that administrative unit is creating an outage, which does a couple of things, right? It notifies our residents via robocall. It posts it on our website and, allows folks to be able to see that there is an outage and understand that there is an outage.

On arrival, we'll check the equipment. We'll also respond to a couple of the apartments, at least three of the apartments in that building, or throughout the property, to see what the temperatures are. Right?

Our buildings; although, they're old and have some infrastructure issues, they do hold heat fairly well. So we very rarely have an instance, even on a prolonged outage, that we're dropping into an uncomfortable territory or an unsafe territory or an illegal territory of below 68 degrees.

That's... I think, in the past three years, I can only think of one instance and that was prolonged. If that... the outage starts to approach the six hour mark, we will have administrators, managers, and

So I wanted to know in those situations, is emergency services, uh, are they proactive in trying to get the heat back on for these residents?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Yes, thank you, absolute... that is... that is the name of our game, proactivity, on the after hours.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, we just need to see it on the on the ground level, because (INAUDIBLE) (CROSS-TALK)

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Yeah. Absolutely.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Yeah. it... It... You eloquently state the you know what the response is, but it's not... it's not being seen by the residents on the ground level...

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Yeah, (INAUDIBLE)... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So hopefully it can trickle down.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Yeah. Absolutely. I'm... I'm sorry to hear that. If you have any specific instances, we can absolutely follow-up.

As I said, there's a 24/7 Heat Desk Emergency Services and Emergency Services Unit there to take calls.

Obviously, if a resident can... just because the management office is closed doesn't mean a resident can't put in a ticket. The CCC...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Right...

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: also takes calls, as does the MyNYCHA app, 24/7.

So we're... we are open for business. We are always looking at those things, especially for heating and especially during heating season.

So like I said, if there's any instances, please, we can speak offline. I'm happy to follow-up on those specific instances.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Alright, okay, I'll definitely get you those specifics.

And I have... I'll do two more questions, and then I'm gonna open the floor for my colleagues to ask questions.

What is NYCHA's process for collecting and maintaining data on these problems at, uh, at the unit level, such as tracking the frequency individual apartments?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Yeah, absolutely. So we do track, uh, again, just, in unit... in unit heating failures or complaints.

Right? We do track those, separately from outages, which are a building line, building section of development, or the entire development.

We... so, as we do look at those separately, if a resident calls more than two or three times and we have repetitious calls from that resident, we have a... we established a resident outreach team in heating that actually takes a... proactively reaches out to the resident rather than waiting for the resident to call. And we start to try to understand why those tickets are being put in. Maybe it's the convector is working, but maybe there's a draft issue that's not necessarily related to the heating system.

So we will work with that resident to ensure that the apartment has a good envelope and the heating system is working. Right? Maybe it was just an element or something that needed to be changed.

So whatever it may be, we will work through with that resident. So if they call more than two or three times in a period of time, I believe it's a week or two, we will... we will proactively reach out to them, schedule an appointment for an apartment visit, and work through their issue with them.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay.

And, last question before I open the floor up.

What special attention is paid to the 55, uh, NYCHA buildings? Because we constantly get calls about the lack of heat in the senior buildings. What special attention is paid? Because, you know, obviously, seniors require much more heat.

So what's... what special attention is paid, and is there a special plan for those 55 developments?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Thank you, Council Member.

So our goal is always to not have a heat outage, of course. But when we do, it's to restore heat and to maintain heat at proper levels.

We understand that, you know, we have... we have limited resources and limited number of staff, especially on the off hours. So when there is a major outage at a property, we will respond to that property. It's regardless of age, all of our residents get the same special attention and care.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Again, what special attention is paid to the 55 Senior Developments? I get it that, the, you know, I heard your comment, but I wanna know exactly, is there a special attention paid to those particular senior developments?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: We respond to all residents' heating complaints. If a resident is...if a senior resident is cold or we're seeing, you know, an insufficient heating issue in a senior building, we may open valves a little bit to provide additional heat.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Right.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: But all residents are treated equally, and we try to reduce outages and maintain heat across the authority.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you.

Now I'll open the floor up to my colleagues, Council Member Mealy?

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Yes, thank you, Chair.

I was just wondering, you say all the repairs that you have done, that's about \$27 million?

How much longer or how much more money you have from Superstorm Sandy left?

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: How much money is left?

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Mm-hmm?

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: Uhm, we've committed...

(CROSS-TALK)

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: (INAUDIBLE) uhm, finish these projects?

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: Yeah. We have eight projects left to complete.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Eight?

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: Yeah, from Superstorm Sandy, uhm, from the original funding. We received \$3.3 billion, and we've committed, the majority of that funding. So we're working with vendors. And most of the construction will close out by next year, uhm, with one project projected to go into 2026.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay. Then, with the young lady had just said that she was taken off Section 8, do you all have any data that can tell us how many people accidentally get off Section 8 and are not informed? I just wanted to see if one of you all was...

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Yeah, absolutely, so, I think that was a question that came up at on one of our PACT and NYCHA is the administrator. I am interested in following up with that resident for additional details to hear more about her Section 8 voucher specifically, and so that we can connect her with someone in our leased housing team to get the support that she needs.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay. Because, that's the easy way to get our tenants out, when... and especially if they're older adults. And, please follow-up with that.

And you said that 93 of the heating outages were taken care of?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Yeah. So, year to date from October 1st to December 12th, actually, we had 93 heating outages.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Do you still have any outages?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Do we have any outages currently?

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Right now.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: I can follow-up with you in two seconds.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Because you all say you all have a list and I know Van Dyke II has been almost out a year. One whole line. And I was just there Saturday, and they said it's still out. So what is your... where's your... Where is your first respond... (CROSS-TALK)

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: I'm sorry. What property is it?

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Van Dyke II...

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Van Dyke II?

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: In Brownsville, Brooklyn.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Yeah.

And again, Van Dyke II is not a current outage for us, so we're... we may or may not be seeing issues. If you have a... if you have... if you have a...

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: There's a whole line... It's still out almost a whole year.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Oh, absolutely. So, again, residents... (CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I was just there Friday.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: I understand that. Yeah. Resident complaints and in-apartment issues versus outages, I just wanna clarify again that it's in... within an apartment, those are handled differently than the entire building... (CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Outages, that means, they get the heater... (CROSS-TALK)

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: line...

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: They don't have heat.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Okay.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So I would love to follow-up with that.

And you... and I'm loving you saying eight and a half hours or 48 hours an outage would be taken care of.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Oh, if we haven't...

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So, how has Van Dyke II been out for months?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Yeah, and absolutely... (CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: But, the problem... (CROSS-TALK)

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: we're gonna... we're gonna follow-up with you after that hearing... after the hearing again and get the... (CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So, when you all get the new boilers... I got to hurry up - when you all get the new boilers, are you all putting anything in place for Legionnaires' disease? Since we did have an outbreak in Brownsville...

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Yeah, uhm, absolutely... (CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Are we testing the pipes for that, or the... running the water in regards to that? Any testing whatsoever?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: So, we... We have, uh, an office of Water Quality, and we will... we will work with them to ensure that are providing the correct temperature... (CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Are you in... (CROSS-TALK)

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: (INAUDIBLE) heating... (CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: collaboration with the Health Department?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Yeah, absolutely, of course. Yeah, so, our Office of Water Quality is the liaison between those two, between the Health Department, and we work to ensure that we are providing the appropriate temperature in our hot water infrastructure to reduce the occurrence of Legionnaires'. So, we will ensure that new equipment is heating the water to the appropriate temperature to limit that.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay, if... So, I can follow-up with the Health Department to make sure that you all in collaboration?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: (NO MIC)

(INAUDIBLE)

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay, thank you.

And, I just have two more questions, Chair.

How is the rent... How do you notify NYCHA tenants when carrying out projects at NYCHA developments? Do tenants have the same.... And do the tenants have a say in how upgrades or renovations get implemented in their buildings or in their apartment?

Like, the young lady just said, she wanted to make sure they had the right asbestos equipment, but you still came into her apartment.

So how are you communicating with the tenants in regards to coming into the apartments? (TIMER CHIMES)

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: Well, I can speak to the... if we're replacing a boiler, if we have a larger heating planned, uh, planned project...

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: But, this is PACT, right?

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: Yeah, I can't speak to that. My colleague can...

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Sure.

So, in general, residents are notified of work being done in a couple of different ways depending on the work that's occurring, whether it's in the unit

or if it's happening to something like... (CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: In-unit. We just had a testimony, in-unit, they wanted to come in and change the system. And she wasn't ready...

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Mm-hmm?

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: But, you all still came in.

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Yeah, so the typical process is they should be scheduling an appointment and informing the residents (INAUDIBLE)... (CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Who should be scheduling it?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: So..

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: She said that she didn't want the scheduled appointment, because she wanted to make sure that they had the right equipment, that it shouldn't have to be double or triple times coming to her apartment. But, then, somebody dropped the ball. You all still came, and without her even knowing, and using your own key. How often does that happen?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Yeah. So, we can follow-up with the PACT partner to get more information about the... (CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Please just answer that question, how often does that happen? You still come into the apartment?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: I'm not sure I fully understand the question, I'm sorry. Can you repeat it?

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: You were here when the young lady said that...

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Yeah...

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: uhm, she was sleeping, and she thought that she told them that she wanted to make sure the equipment was appropriate with regarding asbestos, and I guess somebody didn't get the call or get the memo, and they still came to the apartment. And then when she didn't respond, the system... Well, your staff just came in with their key.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Yeah. So, no... Understandable. I... we would have to look into (INAUDIBLE)... (CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: (INAUDIBLE) were you not?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: I was sitting in the audience. So I... and I appreciate you holding us accountable.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Mm-hmm...

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: But I don't know. I don't have the answer for that in front of me. We're happy to look into it. We will definitely look into this specific case. And...

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Is anyone tracking these incidents?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Is anyone tracking when we enter... We use our right to enter?

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Yes, that's for safety also...

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Yeah, absolutely, I mean, we have a protocol in place, and we can follow up with you after to go through that protocol. We are happy to do that... (CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Everyone hear the protocol?
(TIMER CHIMES)

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: I don't... As I said, I don't have it in front of me. I just want to make sure that it's right.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay...

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: When we get it...

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: How do you verify whether tenants receive your messages? Do you... The same

and replace apartment radiator valves and traps at no cost to NYCHA. This improves system distribution and residents' comfort."

What vendor? Just name one and I'm done.

DIRECTOR WATSON: Go ahead...

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: Go ahead...

DIRECTOR WATSON: So those would be direct programs with the utilities, so Con Ed, National Grid, working directly with them...

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: And they do it for free?

DIRECTOR WATSON: Those are... There are certain programs that Keith referred to where they are doing direct installation of some of the improvements.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Excuse me?

DIRECTOR WATSON: There are certain programs with the utilities where they are providing direct service to the developments in order to make those upgrades.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Are you using any local vendors... (CROSS-TALK)

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: So I... I would...

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: also?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Yeah, that's the... I... I... I get... I understand the question.

Yeah, so I think, Uh, Con Ed or the utility provider in the which... whoever the utility provider is in this case... (CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: (INAUDIBLE) be already in the mix...

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: They should absolutely have a local vendor in the mix. But, you would have to... We would refer to them.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay, thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you, Council Member Mealy.

Council Member Chi Ossé?

COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Thank you so much, Chair, and good morning.

I definitely wanted to ask a question around, climate change and how that takes a toll on some of our NYCHA developments. You know, as we see that it gets worse, we are seeing more extreme weather in New York City. Like, I would always like to reference that storm that we saw, not this past September, but two Septembers ago. And it really shined a light on how our infrastructure is not well equipped to

1
2 respond to these changes. And, of course, NYCHA is no
3 exception.

4 In my office, I represent Bed-Stuy and Crown
5 Heights, I get a number of calls every week from
6 constituents concerned about decrepit and shoddy
7 conditions in their apartments, as well as our NYCHA
8 developments, including mold, broken elevators, lack
9 of heat.

10 And every time I come to these hearings, I do
11 hear the same thing from NYCHA, in terms of, you
12 know, we are working on it, but we don't have the
13 funding. You know, as weather gets worse in New York,
14 my constituents and other public housing residents
15 can't wait. You know, some of these repairs are
16 needed in the immediacy.

17 Can we get a specific time frame of when NYCHA
18 will make these repairs to fortify the developments
19 for extreme weather? Is there, a climate change or
20 upgraded infrastructure timeline that NYCHA has that
21 the council can reference when coming to some of
22 these future hearings?

23 DIRECTOR WATSON: Thank you for the question.
24
25

And definitely agree with you that climate change makes the need to upgrade our systems much more pressing.

So we do have a number of programs that are active that are working to fortify our developments. The biggest, of course, is our Sandy Recovery and Resilience Program that has made over \$3 billion of investments in those developments impacted by Sandy.

But as you referenced, we've also been experiencing impacts of extreme rain, particularly as a result of tropical storm Ida and then the extreme rains after Ophelia that came over a year ago.

So our program to manage the impacts of tropical storm Ida is a disaster recovery program that we are still in active negotiation with FEMA to finalize the awards to do that repair and mitigation.

We're hopeful that those awards will be finalized in the first half of 2025 for the 13 developments that had significant damage due to Ida.

In addition to FEMA funding that we are actively applying for, the City's Office of Management and Budget is managing HUD's CDBGDR funding related to Ida. And, a number of... a number of programs have been funded through that allocation as well.

1
2 So among those include a local match that's
3 required for FEMA funds. Some additional dollars to
4 deal with unmet mitigation needs as part of the
5 heavily affected developments.

6 And then we also secured \$51 million to manage
7 extreme rain at Hope and Bushwick Gardens, which were
8 two developments that were already in the PACT
9 program that began experiencing extreme rain. And so
10 there's active construction at Hope and Bushwick
11 Gardens to elevate boilers and protect them from
12 extreme rain.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: I think that's definitely
14 helpful. I think, uh, and obviously, this is on
15 record. And I really do appreciate how there's, uhm,
16 at least somewhat of an idea of a time frame of when
17 some of that money will be secured from FEMA.

18 I think what would be helpful for us as members
19 of the Council, just in terms of communication with
20 our constituents is, it's great to hear that now.
21 But, if we can get, like, updates from NYCHA
22 regularly on when this funding is coming down the
23 pipeline.

24 DIRECTOR WATSON: Sure.
25

COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: You know, consistent communication just allows us to do a better job, both of us to do a better job, just so that when we come into these hearings, we're not saying NYCHA is not doing anything.

DIRECTOR WATSON: Mm-hmm

COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: You know, we can go back to our constituents and give them a better timeframe of when this money is being brought down from the federal government.

And in addition to that, I think it's always helpful for us to have a tool of receiving maybe like a specific chart of funding that's being used to fund these specific projects. Right? So, not only a timeline of when this funding is secured, but where that money is exactly going towards.

And I'm hearing that from you, of course, in terms of, you know, Hope Gardens and whatnot. But I think just having a proper idea of which developments are getting this funding, where that funding's coming from, as well as when that funding will be secured would just be a helpful tool for me as a member. It won't speak for everyone else.

DIRECTOR WATSON: Sure, yeah, absolutely. We'd be happy to provide updates and kind of create a table that shows the various resiliency funding streams and the developments that are recipients of it. So, we can absolutely follow-up with that.

COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Terrific.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: So, we can... We can follow up on specifics on the resiliency work.

Also just (TIMER CHIMES)... we in in the name of transparency, we do have a capital... public capital track... capital projects tracker. And we'll send you the link to that separately after the hearing...

COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Awesome...

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Yeah...

COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: And I'm gonna just put one more assignment on your table, and if any other member wants this on this committee - But in any way that you can curtail it to the developments that I have within my community, you know, whether it's you just following up with my office on, you know, where some of those projects maybe line up, would be something that I would really appreciate.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Yeah. Marcy and Tompkins?

COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Marcy, Tompkins...

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Lafayette?

COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Yeah.

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: Yeah, we'll follow up with your office on them. And, then, as my colleague, Keith, said, in the interest of transparency, you know, we maintain a tracker online. So, that has...

COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Oh, really?

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: all the capital projects...

COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: I didn't know that...

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: Yeah, so we'll send that to you so you can look and see current updates...

COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Okay.

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: And, so, that's the best port of call to see what projects... and what the status is.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: And we can... You can filter it by council district...

COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Oh, that's terrific, okay...

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: Yeah...

COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: that would be great. You can just remind me of that tool... (CROSS-TALK)

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Yeah...

COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: it's helpful...

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Yeah, absolutely. We're going to share a link with you all after this absolutely...

COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Thank you very much.

DIRECTOR WATSON: I will say, the ones where we haven't secured the funding may not be on there yet. So if there's anything you have a question about, we'll fill you in on that.

COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Sure, of course. Thank you, thank you, Chair.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you, we look forward to that information, thank you. I wanna move on to regularization and resiliency at the RAD/PACT developments.

How does NYCHA ensure that the PACT developments are brought into line with NYCHA's overarching, climate and weatherization goals?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: So at RAD/PACT developments, they are held to the same Local Law standards, like Local Law 84, Local Law 33, and are focused on, improving overall buildings, energy performance.

And so the capital improvements that go into these buildings, when each of them start involve things like overhaul to the heating systems and

1 replacement of heating systems, but it also includes
2 things like facade replacements or upgrades, things
3 like the EIFS panels to help make the buildings more
4 airtight. It includes things like window
5 replacements, again, to help prevent cold air from
6 getting in and hot air from getting out, and things
7 like roof replacements.
8

9 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: When you say facade
10 improvements, there was a facade improvement that
11 was, uh, or a complete change done in Linden houses.

12 That facade improvement actually, I believe,
13 that's probably... but that was the act... one of
14 the only developments, uh, RAD/PACT developments that
15 received a facade improvement or a complete change.

16 DIRECTOR CONNELL: No, no, we have, uhm, multiple
17 other PACT projects across the city that are
18 receiving the... (CROSS-TALK)

19 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Where they..

20 DIRECTOR CONNELL: EIFS panels...

21 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: EFIS? Okay.

22 DIRECTOR CONNELL: And are being installed to...
23 they specifically help improve the building envelope,
24 and, uhm, improve the buildings' energy performance.
25

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay, got you, got you. How does NYCHA handle cases where NYCHA developments transition to private management during your ongoing regularization upgrades or other resiliency work?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Right. So I was just speaking to some of the capital improvements that the PACT partner commences immediately after closing, which you're well aware of, but there are other resiliency, initiatives that can occur.

Siobhan was also talking about at Hope Gardens/ Bushwick Gardens, which was after the construction was complete, additional CDBGDR funds were, deployed to the tune of \$50 million to elevate the boilers, which had been in the basements to above ground structures.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: The responsibilities, uh, how's that divided from, uh, between NYCHA and the private management?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: So after the closing, the responsibility is the... is the property manager and the PACT partners.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Oh, so... You said that it's completely the PACT managers?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: PACT partners responsible, yes.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So what role does NYCHA play?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: So we continue to maintain oversight over a number of different areas that our PACT...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: The...

DIRECTOR CONNELL: partners...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay, I'm just (LAUGHS)...

DIRECTOR CONNELL: (INAUDIBLE)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You've seen my face on the oversight piece. You said that you... you continue to provide what?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Maintain some... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: I just want to make sure I get that on the record... (CROSS-TALK)

DIRECTOR CONNELL: some oversight. For example, uhm, we (INAUDIBLE)... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: What type of oversight do you provide over the RAD/PACTs?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: So, we, uhm...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And give me specific scenarios where controversies have arisen and NYCHA has interceded.

DIRECTOR CONNELL: So if I'm understanding the question correctly, we, for example, collect

information about work orders from our PACT partners on a regular basis, and we monitor them, look for trends, and have conversations with them on a near daily basis about those. Uhm...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, let me ask you this question. Are you familiar with Linden Houses?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: I am familiar with Linden Houses.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. C&C Management?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Familiar with C&C Management...

(CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Are you aware that they just recently put in a system where the residents, once they put in a repair, that they get a confirmation number?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: I believe that that they should be getting confirmation numbers at Linden, yes.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: No, I said, are you aware that they recently put in place - they've, uh, the manager of the development, for maybe the last four years, uh, they've taken over the development for the last four years. Residents have been complaining that they have not had a... they were not getting a

confirmation number or some type of work order number when they put in work order complaints or repairs.

It was brought to my attention recently, a month ago at a TA meeting, that there was no confirmation number being given to the residents when repairs were put in - or complaints were put in - and management admitted that there was no number of confirmation number being given.

Where you aware of that? And what type of oversight were you providing that led to that two year or three year gap where this level of incompetence existed?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: So if they're not providing a work order specifically to the resident, they're absolutely tracking it by unit number and address (BACKGROUND NOISE) (LOST AUDIO) follow-up with (NO MIC) (INAUDIBLE)... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, let me say this, when it was under Section 9, every repair got a confirmation number or some type of number, a reference number that that they can reference to.

So I want to know, uh, it worked under NYCHA. Again, this just goes back to this, uh, it seems like

the RAD/PACTs are being left to do what they want to do, when they want to do it.

And that's why I question NYCHA's role in providing oversight over these developments. It seems as though you just handed the keys to these new developers, and have left them alone.

And I've seen that on multiple occasions, and the 12 developments, or the four developments that have been converted over to the RAD/PACT program.

So I wanna drill down on what type of oversight you are really providing.

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Sure. So in in addition to monitoring the work orders that we do receive from them on a regular basis, we also have a team of construction monitors who visit each site regularly that's during the construction progress.

We also have, on the Section 8 side, we have leased housing, continues to be involved as it relates to the administration of the voucher.

Residents can continue to call the CCC if they have a repair related complaint and request a special inspection... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: How is that... How is that advertised to the tenants? How is that communicated

to the tenants that there is a third party that is there who can mediate when these situations arise?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Sure. So at the... around the time of closing, they're, uhm, these resources are explained to residents. Uh... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You said around the time of closing? (CROSS-TALK)

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Around the time of closing, when the projects convert (INAUDIBLE)..

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Yeah, but, uh, when the... Are you talking about the... initially when it's... Okay.

So after the rehab is done, and then, we're moving into the management, uh, what type of oversight is done when their contract... Just like in Penn-Wortman Houses, there was a major issues with the slam locks - and also in Linden Houses - where the residents did not want slam locks. Management went ahead and disregarded the wishes and the desires of the tenants and said they were gonna go forth with the slam locks. NYCHA was made aware. We got... We didn't hear a peep from NYCHA.

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Mm-hmm? So we... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So what type of oversight are you providing?

1
2 DIRECTOR CONNELL: Sure. So we're... we also heard
3 about that issue and had several discussions with the
4 partner. And I know that there was some feedback that
5 the partner heard from members of the resident body
6 as well. And I believe the partner made some
7 adjustments to this land locks, but we can reconfirm.

8 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, and in Penn-Wortman have
9 adjustments been made? We just spoke to a tenant that
10 just said that it's still the same, nothing has been
11 done. The slam locks are there, the management
12 totally disregarded, or this new PACT, the RAD
13 manager or development, uh, managers totally
14 disregarded the desires of the tenants.

15 But I am trying to point out that this is just a
16 pattern. And I hear a lot of folks that want to
17 embrace RAD/PACT, but the aftermath in a lot of these
18 developments have not had the greatest outcome.
19 Whether it is the inferior materials that are being
20 used by these developers, you name it. What oversight
21 is NYCHA really providing?

22 DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: So, Chair, to that point, in
23 addition to the points that were just shared, we also
24 have unified design standards where we provide those
25 to PACT partner, prior to the closing. Those are

shared and are available on the website. Those are requirements. So baselines are set for them.

They obviously have some latitude, because they're funding the projects in terms of determining, the final hardware for installation, but that's part of the requirements that NYCHA sets out.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: How does NYCHA communicate with the private developers and management to ensure that the tenants can receive building improvements, upgrades, repairs, in line with sustainability work being done at other developments?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: So, NYCHA is in communication with the PACT partners in a few different topic areas. As I had mentioned, we're in touch with them, uh, the property management team on a regular basis regarding the status of their work orders.

We have a construction oversight team that is on the ground having engagement with their general contractors on a regular basis.

We also have a resident outreach team that meets with TA leadership on a regular basis as well.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Do you attend TA meetings?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Periodically. And members of the team does as well.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Can you give me some TA meetings you have attended within the last three or four months?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Uhm...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: RAD/PACT TA meetings?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: We can follow up with a list of meetings... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: I would like that number, yeah.

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Sure...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Because I have yet to see you at any RAD/PACT developments in my district. That's poor. And I attend personally, I attend probably have attended every... at least every TA meeting for the last six or seven months... (CROSS-TALK)

DIRECTOR CONNELL: We can follow up with information... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Since I have taken office. So, I would like to see that.

Uhm... (CROSS-TALK)

DIRECTOR CONNELL: (INAUDIBLE)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: What is NYCHA's heating outage response protocol when it comes to PACT developments?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Sure. So, the standard that we set for our PACT partners when we, uhm, ask them to report on heat related outages is, in-unit outages, 24 hours, and building wide outages, the standard is eight hours.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay, uhm, recently there with the... again with the temperatures dipping, at Linden Houses there was a major heating outage that had taken place where residents were without heat for quite a couple of days.

I wanted to know, were you aware of that? And what type of oversight did you provide in that situation?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Sure, so... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: In those situations?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Sure. So aware of a number of in unit outages that had occurred in, at the Linden/ Penn-Wortman houses. And when the heating system was replaced, the thermostat valves were also replaced. And... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Correct...

DIRECTOR CONNELL: As residents raised issues to C&C they identified that certain valves had issues.

And when that... issues were raised, they were able to replace them under warranty and fix the issue.

They're also going through and inspecting units where those valves had been replaced even if an issue hasn't been raised yet to re inspect them and proactively replace them if needed.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: On the preparedness side, what oversight is being provided by NYCHA when it comes to preparedness and testing needs? Even and... and let me just say this, we're happy that Linden House has got, you know, brand new boiler systems. Obviously, long overdue and needed.

But on the preparedness side, what is NYCHA doing to make sure that, you know, that they're on the ground with some of these new, RAD/PACT developments, these conversions?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Yeah. So similar to some of the seasonal preparedness that was being described by my colleagues, the PACT partners also prepare for the heating season by opening up the boilers. They do cleaning. They inspect them, make sure that all of the parts are in the status that they need to be, and make repairs as needed.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: They're turning over reports to you? Are there reports that they're returning over to you? Or is this stuff that is written?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: We don't collect reports on seasonal preparedness, no.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, are there any reports that are being given by these RAD/PACT development companies to NYCHA?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: So we collect monthly reporting regarding the... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: There's monthly reporting?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And the reporting covers a whole... or what are the areas that the reporting covers? And...

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Sure. It covers six different areas. It includes, heat, pests, leaks, mold, lead, and elevators.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. And how are these reports being scrutinized by NYCHA?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: So we receive them every month, and we review them systematically, look for trends, discuss what we see in the reports, if we have questions about any of the information in there for

1 clarity or for completeness, and then we publish them
2 quarterly on our public dashboard.

3 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. So then how does NYCHA
4 handle heating complaints that come in from tenants
5 living in the PACT developments?

6 DIRECTOR CONNELL: Sure. So, up first, the
7 residents should always contact their property
8 manager first because they're in the best position to
9 respond.

10 But I understand that in some instances,
11 complaints may come in through a council member to
12 our intergov team.

13 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Correct.

14 DIRECTOR CONNELL: And when that happens, they
15 quickly get routed to the real estate team or
16 directly to the partner, and we send them to the
17 partner directly.

18 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: How do you maintain the data?

19 DIRECTOR CONNELL: How do we maintain?

20 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: The... How do you, uh, how
21 does NYCHA collect and maintain the data on heating
22 complaints from the tenants in the PACT developments?

23 DIRECTOR CONNELL: Yeah, we have a reporting
24 system that was... that's built out.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay.

DIRECTOR CONNELL: That partners use, yeah,
with...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: How, how did you notify
tenants living in the PAC developments of service
outages or interruptions?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Sure. So each of our partners
should be providing advance notice to residents in
instances of service outage.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: How does NYCHA... let me
repeat this question again. How do you notify the
tenants living in the PACT developments of service
outages or interruptions?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: So NYCHA wouldn't be doing
those notifications. The PACT partners would be
responsible for notifying the residents.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So do you require them to
notify tenants of any outage or interruptions?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: They should be... they should
be notifying residents of planned service outages.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And in a NYCHA building, what
is the protocol? How's that done? How do you notify
tenants of an interruption in... in service or
outage?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: So, we have, again, I think... think we may have addressed this earlier. I'll just reiterate that we use a varying number of... I may have addressed this in testimony as well. But we, we... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Now my question, how do you communicate to them? Very simple... (CROSS-TALK)

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: What I'm wondering is...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: It's a simple question... (CROSS-TALK)

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Yeah, what I... What I wanted to clarify is, are you speaking about specific media we use, or?

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: When there's an outage...

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: How do we do it... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: or there's service interruption, very straightforward...

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: I got you, okay...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: sort of question... What are the... (CROSS-TALK)

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: So, we...

(CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: How do you communicate to the tenants?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Right. Absolutely. So an outage is created... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: How do you do it on the NYCHA side, on a Section 9, how do you do it?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Yeah, I'm giving... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: In comparison to a Section 8?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: No, we're here.

So there's two... there's two types of outages, planned and unplanned. A planned outage requires 48 hours' notice that... in advance. So a resident will receive robocall 48 hours in advance, 24 hours, and then the morning of, uh, for a service outage. That will allow the resident to prepare.

An unplanned outage an emergent outage, right, where we have no choice but to take it down in real time, residents will see a robocall and the buildings will be... post... in both instances, the buildings

will be posted and we use flyers as well. They also receive MyNYCHA alerts for folks who use the app.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So when there's a planned outage, right, on the, Section 9 side, does the management company... or sorry, does the management office, housing assistance manager, superintendent, whoever, do they door knock? Do they take individual assessments of, you know, if they're elderly folks or folks with disabilities in a planned outage?

Like, what's the time frame between the assessments being done, the door knocking being done, a thorough, thorough assessment, when there's a planned outage?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: There's a number of ways we do outreach. Our resident services partnerships and initiative, RSPI Department who, uh, will do outreach. We maintain a list of... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Do you pick it... (CROSS-TALK)

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: (INAUDIBLE)
outreach, yeah...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: It sounds like you pick and choose. I am asking you, is there a protocol or something established?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: When we know that there's going to be... Yeah, so, when we know that there's going to be a prolonged service disruption, we do reach out to vulnerable residents prior to. That list is maintained in the property office. And our Resident Services team will reach in advance. And that goes for unplanned as well. We will make sure that our residents who perhaps are on life sustaining equipment, for example, are still able to use that equipment... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So...

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Right? For electrical outages... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, I just want to make sure we get this on the record. So, there are assessments that are done for individual tenants by management. So, if there is a planned outage, the... whatever the affects, it won't be adverse to the tenants?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: If there is a planned outage, yes, we will be... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: If there... If there is a planned outage...

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Yeah,
(INAUDIBLE)... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: (INAUDIBLE) individual assessment's done to make sure you're meeting the needs of those tenants who may have disabilities or... or...

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: I don't... so, yeah, I think we follow-up during... we do follow-up during the outage. But prior to the outage, we wanna make sure that those residents, especially, for example, an elevator I mean, this is off topic, but an elevator outage. Right? We would let residents who have ambulatory difficulties... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Correct...

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: understand that the elevator is gonna be out.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Have there been any issues with...such as the boiler problem that you're aware of in the PACT developments? Any boiler issues that have taken place that you're aware of, particularly in the PACT developments?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: So some of our more recently converted sites haven't undergone the full boiler repair and replacement, and so some of those systems do struggle immediately upon conversion. And they... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: What developments, uh, where there have been a boiler replacement, where there have been issues that you... that that have been brought to your attention?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Sure. I mean, I can refer back to what had happened at Hope Gardens where there were issues immediately after the boilers had been replaced, where there was flooding and they were, uh, damaged again.

And as we had described before, there's additional funds that were made available to... for the long term solution for addressing that issue, which was elevating the boilers.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. I think you may have answered this question, but I'm gonna ask it anyway.

What PACT sites are being... The sites are being renovated, what work is done to improve the heat retention of the building?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Sure. So there's a few different things separate and apart from the heating system upgrades and replacements. It's things like facade improvements. So that could be things like the EIFS panels that we were discussing before, the

1 window replacement to make sure that there's a really
2 tight seal, roof replacements.

3 And, additionally, this would be a seasonal
4 activity, but partners also work with residents as
5 heating season's approaching to take out their AC
6 units or put covers on their AC units.

7 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. Are there tests done to
8 ensure that the building keeps in its heat in the
9 winter and and cold in the summer?

10 DIRECTOR CONNELL: I'm sorry, could you repeat
11 that?

12 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: I said, are there tests done
13 to ensure that the building keeps in heat in the
14 winter and cold in the summer?

15 DIRECTOR CONNELL: They do all the required
16 testing, and they're also held to the Local Law
17 standards, which also monitor energy efficiency and
18 performance.

19 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Alright.

20 Let me now go on to Superstorm Sandy recovery.

21 What improvement upgrades and repairs have been
22 made at NYCHA developments since the impact of
23 Superstorm Sandy? And can you share with us the
24

1 numbers of improvements, like boiler replacements,
2 window repairs, and roof replacements, and etcetera?

3 DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: Yeah. I can share updates,
4 thank you, Chair.

5 So, funding was allocated to cover 35 different
6 developments, which is for a total of 256 buildings.
7 With the money, as my colleague Siobhan shared, a
8 number of the boilers were elevated above the ground,
9 in what we call annex buildings.

10 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Mm-hmm.

11 DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: There's a 141 annex buildings
12 that were installed as part of the program. And the
13 aim is for 72 boilers to be finalized when we close
14 out the program. To date, we've finished construction
15 of 56 boilers, and installed 183 domestic hot water
16 systems as upgrades. We've also completed a 187 roofs
17 to date as part of that work.

18 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Reporting revealed significant
19 delays and course overruns for the construction
20 projects related to Superstorm Sandy, do you have an
21 estimate... do you have an estimate on when the
22 remaining NYCHA development work attributed to
23 Superstorm Sandy will be completed?

24 DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: Yes, Council Chair.
25

1
2 Year to date, we closed out 10 projects. We have
3 a further eight projects remaining, and construction
4 of those eight projects will by and large be finished
5 by 2025 with one more project extending into 2026.

6 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. And what changes to the
7 policies or protocols has NYCHA implemented to
8 prevent similar delays in course overruns in the
9 future, especially in the event that disaster
10 remediation work is needed?

11 DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: Yeah. That's a great question,
12 Chair.

13 So we've certainly learned from it, and one of
14 the big changes that we've implemented is
15 integrating, so that whenever we're carrying out
16 capital projects, instead of waiting for funding, we
17 seek to add resiliency measures.

18 We're also looking to incorporate, resiliency
19 measures into full building retrofits. So a number of
20 our comprehensive modernization projects focus on
21 full building retrofits. One of the challenges we had
22 with the funding for Superstorm Sandy was that it was
23 limited in scope and not able to cover plumbing
24 upgrades and interior work.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay, thank you.

Can you update us on any work that NYCHA has been doing to meet its commitments as laid out in its Sustainability Agenda and its climate Adaptation Plan?

DIRECTOR WATSON: Sure, thank you for the question, Chair.

So as we discussed a little bit earlier, one of our biggest commitments is to develop a path forward

1 to electrify our space, uh, space heating systems and
2 domestic hot water systems, because that is sort of
3 our primary user of fossil fuels and; therefore,
4 producer of greenhouse gas emissions.
5

6 So we are working on implementing our
7 electrification program both in the space heating and
8 domestic hot water systems, as we move forward.

9 We are also deploying 30 megawatts of solar on
10 NYCHA rooftops. We are aiming to get 30 megawatts
11 deployed by 2026, and we are well on our way to
12 meeting that target.

13 We are pursuing energy... (CROSS-TALK)

14 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: How many NYCHA developments
15 have...

16 DIRECTOR WATSON: How many NYCHA developments have
17 solar? I'm gonna have to get back to you with the
18 exact number, but we have... (CROSS-TALK)

19 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You don't...

20 DIRECTOR WATSON: about 25 megawatts either in
21 active, already installed, in active construction, or
22 in signed leases for rooftop solar.

23 So, I'll get back to you with the list of
24 developments and a number of them... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay, how does NYCHA track its progress in meeting its sustainability and resiliency goals?

DIRECTOR WATSON: Sure. So we actually publish updates to our sustainability agenda every year. We typically publish them... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You said if you publish it every year?

DIRECTOR WATSON: Every year. Mm-hmm.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay.

DIRECTOR WATSON: On our Sustainability Agenda Website, you'll find annual reporting (INAUDIBLE)... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And that plan, would it state how many developments have actually... are solar?

DIRECTOR WATSON: So we have a summary level, sort of how far we are towards our solar progress.

I am not sure whether the website currently has the full list of developments, but we can look at that... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, it's not are updated?

DIRECTOR WATSON: Excuse me?

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: The website's not updated you said, or you're just not sure?

DIRECTOR WATSON: I just... off the top of my head, I'm not sure if we have the list of sites with solar on that Sustainability Agenda Webpage that we update each year. Do you know?

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: Yeah. So, Chair, we have the... we can provide the list for projects that are completed and under construction.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay.

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: What we don't share publicly, is obviously the ones that are in process where we're working on new leases.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: But you do have knowledge of the ones that are completed?

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: Say again?

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Do you have knowledge of the

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: Yes, of course we have knowledge... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay.

DIRECTOR WATSON: Yes, yes, we definitely track that and we have that information. I was just saying I'm not sure if it's on that website that... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay.

DIRECTOR WATSON: I referred to, but we will provide you with the full list, mm-hmm.

CHAIRPERSON POWERS: Thank you.

Is NYCHA confident that it can meet... that it can meet its sustainability commitments with the resources and funding currently available to it?

DIRECTOR WATSON: So, specifically with regard to our Local Law 97 commitment, our obligation is to make best efforts to achieve a 40% reduction in our greenhouse gas emissions by 2040... or 2030 and an 80% reduction by 2050.

So, we are making every effort to meet those goals and we have identified a feasible path forward to do so.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay...

DIRECTOR WATSON: We will be continuing to work as hard as we can to implement those goals, including the kind of industry moving challenge that we have completed in order to develop solutions to do so.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Alright.

From a budgetary outlook, how is NYCHA accounting for present and future budget concerns as they pertain to sustainability and weatherization goals?

And how much money is being spent and budgeted for the resilience work?

DIRECTOR WATSON: Sure.

So, you know, as we mentioned, the Sandy program, of course, has over \$3 billion that's been spent on the resiliency work there.

In addition, we are working to secure our FEMA grants for the effects of tropical storm Ida.

The CDBGDR funding that is also related to Ida, for NYCHA totals about a \$169 million. That is split between a green infrastructure program, local match, and additional mitigation funds related to the FEMA award as well as the Hope Gardens program that's being implemented at Hope and Bushwick Gardens.

In addition, we have about a \$100 million worth of cloud burst work going on. So that is work where we are modifying landscapes to both provide an improved experience of grounds on a day to day basis, but also incorporate grounds on a day to day basis, but also incorporate stormwater management into the open spaces on NYCHA properties.

And so we have actually our first cloudburst project that was developed in cooperation with DEP in construction now at South Jamaica Houses.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay.

DIRECTOR WATSON: We have one at Clinton Houses where design is wrapping up and we will be moving forward into the construction procurement phase this year.

At Jefferson Houses, we have a grounds project that should be going into construction shortly, that incorporates that cloudburst level of stormwater management.

And then, we have four additional sites that are in the early stages of design in our cloudburst program.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay.

DIRECTOR WATSON: We also have a number of studies where we are continuing to look at which properties are going to be vulnerable in the future to increased incidence of coastal storms and storm water.

And we are working to kind of keep a pipeline of projects that can be funded through hazard mitigation programs so that we have consistent, uhm, a consistent source of kind of applications for new work in that area.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: How is NYCHA specifically accounting for future changing weather patterns and potential weather events at its developments?

DIRECTOR WATSON: So, a lot of it does relate to that work that I was just mentioning where we are incorporating resiliency measures into... implementing resiliency measures through disaster recovery work, as well as doing scoping studies to identify where we may have additional challenges in the future and where we need to incorporate protection against storms and other weather events into the work that we are doing.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you.

I'm gonna move on to now elevator outages.

Elevator outages were cited as a big problem for NYCHA residents in the wake of Superstorm Sandy.

How has NYCHA prepared for future potential elevator outages during extreme weather events? And how can NYCHA residents expect to be supported during an elevator outage caused by an extreme weather event?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Thank you, Chair.

So if we have a known known flood area, you know, we'll... we may assign an extra support to that... to that neighborhood or that region to ensure that we have enough teams to respond, both during normal business hours and on off hours.

So where we have known flood areas, we replace the existing door operator, right, that keeps the hatch door and the cab door together and opens the car, we'll replace those with that equipment, to reduce outages, as a result of that operator. Right? So that's just an example of one thing.

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: Chair, in relation to that,

for the sites that are affected by coastal flooding through Superstorm Sandy, we have 197 generators that we're installing, and that's backup power in the event of electrical outage.

DIRECTOR WATSON: And can I just add, just I got some information from my colleague about the number of solar sites? So, we actually have 49 developments where solar is either installed or currently in the planning stages. So 12 are complete in operation; seven of those are on PACT developments; 14 have signed leases and are in designer construction; five of those are packed developments; and then we have 23 more with pending leases that we're working on now.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: The solar paneling that was put up in the PACT developments, were they done prior to the conversion, or this was during the part of the conversion?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Part of the...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Part of the rehab or construction?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Generally part of the conversion.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So these are not done by NYCHA?

DIRECTOR WATSON: That's correct.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Yeah, we can follow-up on the on the specific answer in that area...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Absolutely.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you.

How many weatherization or climate related pilot programs is NYCHA currently operating?

DIRECTOR WATSON: So, our major pilot programs include the Clean Heat for All Challenge that I mentioned previously, as well as electrification of some other buildings, including Hoe Avenue in the Bronx and 830 Amsterdam, where we're looking at those as kind of early pilots of electrification technology.

Our Cloudburst program, we do consider that to be a pilot program where we're doing these more kind of major modifications of landscapes in order to manage storm water while upgrading the outdoor experience on the campuses.

And then our, uhm, we also have another innovation challenge related to climate that we're in the early stages of. That relates to induction stoves in NYCHA buildings, where we - similar to the Clean Heat for All Challenge, have worked with NYPA-NYSERDA to request the development of an induction stove that can be installed easily in NYCHA to kitchens, as an

alternative to gas, uh, without having to do major electric upgrades.

So, we have a number of programs, and are kind of developing further ones. We have a couple of scoping studies, one involves resilience hubs that we may be moving forward on.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay.

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: As part of our general electrification program, we also have, sites with geothermal. So I wouldn't call it a pilot program, but...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay...

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: that's another...

DIRECTOR WATSON: Right.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: With the with the RADS, how was... is NYCHA also requiring the RADS also follow the same direction that NYCHA is going?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Yes.

So they similarly are prioritizing sustainability efforts when they're developing their scope.

So some of the tactics that Siobhan was talking about, such as electrification or partial electrification, is also being rolled out at PACTS sites as well.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay.

DIRECTOR WATSON: And we work closely with the Real Estate Development Team...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Right...

DIRECTOR WATSON: to ensure that those requirements are built into the RFIs that go out for PACT developers. So, the two divisions work very closely together on aligning those standards.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: That's good to know.

Can you share the status of the NYCHA Resilience Hubs pilot program?

DIRECTOR WATSON: Sure. So we had a study that was funded by FEMA, that is ongoing and nearing completion looking at the feasibility of retrofitting community centers as community resilience hubs.

So that would include adding features like backup power, additional electrical outlets, and things so that those community centers can really be prepared to serve as hubs in times of climate related emergencies.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: How many community centers, system wide, are able to be a hub or have that apparatus in place of an emergency?

DIRECTOR WATSON: So some of our community centers in the Sandy program are part of the you know, do have backup power, so have that feature.

I can get back to you on the number of community centers that are outfitted with backup power already. But that is... part of our Sandy program, provided full building backup power to many of those buildings.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And this is... This is throughout the entire NYCHA portfolio? Right, it... where this is being proposed to the centers or being implemented in the system... (CROSS-TALK)

DIRECTOR WATSON: Yeah, so... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: To the community centers... (CROSS-TALK)

DIRECTOR WATSON: Right, but this is separate from Sandy. So, I am just saying, like, some of those community centers already do have backup power... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Backups? Okay.

DIRECTOR WATSON: However, the Resiliency Hub Study specifically looks at, okay, how could we look at key centers throughout the rest of the NYCHA

portfolio to retrofit with backup power and other facility... and other, amenities?

So we have five community centers that are part of that study. And the study will result in schematic designs and cost estimates that allow us to then go forward and apply for funding through additional sources. So those are not funded to go into construction...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay.

DIRECTOR WATSON: But it is part of a study that helps to set us up and try to secure hazard mitigation funding to do that work in the future.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: The community centers and the RAD conversion developments, are they also obligated to put in a backup generator system in their community in... the community centers?

DIRECTOR WATSON: No, so there's no requirement...

(CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Just in case...

DIRECTOR WATSON: There's no requirement to do this. What we're doing in the Resilience Hub Study is really looking at the feasibility and looking to secure funding for it.

But, Gillian could speak to this further, but my understanding is that there is no... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: (INAUDIBLE)

DIRECTOR WATSON: that there's no requirement currently to do that... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: I would think that would be proactive... (CROSS-TALK)

DIRECTOR CONNELL: We can look into that and follow-up. We can look into that and follow-up.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay.

I think it would be proactive if NYCHA, you know, made it where all community centers had a backup generator system. I know it's a capital investment, but; nevertheless, knowing, uh, the emergencies that have come up, and tenants are... whether it's a heating outage or, uhm, planned outages that have been complete failures, uhm, at least, there are locations or places where the tenants can go to be safe.

And is NYCHA planning to expand... expand any of its pilot programs to additional developments? And is NYCHA considering implementing any new pilot programs at any of its developments?

1
2 DIRECTOR WATSON: So we're always looking I mean,
3 sustainability is really set up to evaluate new
4 technologies, pilot them if needed, and prepare them
5 to scale up.

6 So, once we move beyond a kind of initial
7 demonstration phase at that point, it's really no
8 longer a pilot. It's really an integration of that
9 technology into NYCHA's typical ways of doing
10 business.

11 So, for electrification, you know, we are... we
12 have really good results from our early projects
13 where we've installed heat pumps and we are moving to
14 plan for scaling up that technology as a part of our
15 typical capital program.

16 And then, you know, as new needs become apparent
17 and new technologies may be available to address
18 those needs at NYCHA, using a pilot program to
19 evaluate and determine whether it's an appropriate
20 technology for NYCHA is something we'll continue to
21 do.

22 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. Well, how can the public
23 stay informed on the status of a pilot program or ask
24 to participate in a pilot program?
25

DIRECTOR WATSON: Sorry, how can a development, ask to participate in a program... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: How can the public stay informed? How can the residents stay informed? (CROSS-TALK)

DIRECTOR WATSON: Can residents stay involved?

So we do try to communicate what we're doing with regard to our pilot programs broadly. When we are doing a pilot program, often we're using technical factors in order to determine where we can pilot a technology or potentially funding factors.

But to the extent we can, we are working with residents to determine if they're supportive and kind of move forward with pilots that residents are enthusiastic to see come to their developments.

So we try to take resident input into account as much as possible given other technical and feasibility considerations.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. Now we will go into tenant outreach.

How do you notify NYCHA tenants when carrying out projects at NYCHA developments? And do have a say in how the upgrades or renovations get implemented at their buildings?

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: So critical to our capital projects is tenant engagement, or stakeholder engagement. So throughout our planning and design process, we have multiple touch points depending on the scope of work. But an average heating project, we would have roughly five touch points during the design phase where we're working with resident leadership to communicate both the intent of the project and take feedback.

As much as possible, we want to incorporate in tenant direction in terms of infrastructure upgrades, but obviously there are limitations, both funding and commitments that we have to meet, particularly for heating plants.

But as my colleague shared, we certainly actively engage with residents, in the planning process. In the construction process, we meet with them on a biweekly basis, so they're free to attend all those meetings.

And we have, quarterly meetings on-site, and that's... those are the points where we share future projects, and we have more substantive engagement about whether or not electrification or an

alternative energy solution is suitable for the development.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. Is this, process different for tenants, living in a PACT developments?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: So similarly, uhm, informing residents of the status of construction projects is very important on the PACT side as well.

And immediately after closing, we asked that the PACT partner share their plan for engaging with residents after closing.

The menu of options that that could include will vary based on this exact work that's being done. It may change over the course of the construction period, but it would include things like meetings with TAs. It could include meetings with individual (UNINTELLIGIBLE) if there's temporary relocations happening. It could include notices or newsletters that are being distributed, or other methods depending on the specific construction work that's happening at a given period.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Will you get input? Would you get input, uh, take input back from tenants?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: We're always open to feedback. And, in fact, there's residents that participate in

the selection and have an opportunity to speak with the PACT partner before there's... the project even closes and the partner is even selected... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: (INAUDIBLE)

DIRECTOR CONNELL: so the feedback is heard.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Is that so?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So tenants at RAD/PACTs will be engaged, uhm, their input will matter? And at these particular RAD/PACT developments, uh, what oversight is actually... what role is NYCHA playing in that whole process?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: Sorry, can you repeat that quickly?

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: I said, what role is NYCHA playing in this whole process as far as on the oversight side to make sure that, uh, when residents give input to these RAD/PACTs development companies or to the management company, the new private management companies, that is being taken, uhm, just not into consideration, but it's being lived out?

DIRECTOR CONNELL: So some of the oversight I was describing earlier, again, is, we have a resident

1
2 outreach team that meets with TA bodies on a regular
3 basis. We have a team of construction (INAUDIBLE)...
4 (CROSS-TALK)

5 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And NYCHA is at those resident
6 meetings?

7 DIRECTOR CONNELL: So NYCHA does have a resident
8 outreach team that meets with TAs regularly. Yes.

9 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: At RAD/PACTs?

10 DIRECTOR CONNELL: Yes.

11 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. And that's done
12 biweekly, weekly? When does it start? Does it start
13 during construction phase? Is this after the
14 construction phase?

15 DIRECTOR CONNELL: It starts upon closing, and it
16 follows a periodic schedule. And if there is a
17 particular project where you want to know more about
18 those meetings, we can follow up.

19 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, I'm aware of the
20 construction meetings that take place, the biweekly
21 construction meetings that take place with the,
22 RAD/PACTs. But I'm not too sure that I remember NYCHA
23 ever being on any of those calls. So maybe if you
24 can... I'll ask to pull those logs to see if we... if
25 NYCHA was in attendance.

And, yes, uhm, NYCHA is in need of at least some of these developments were in need, or are in need of major capital improvements. But we can't just allow these... the developers and these management companies to just have their own way and act as, you know, that there's no type of, uhm, there's no type of oversight that exists.

But I'm hoping, you know, over the next year or so, as I'm chair this committee, we can get to a better point when NYCHA is providing oversight, real oversight, over these RAD/PACTs before it gets out of control. And in some situations, it's already out of control.

And NYCHA's been sleeping on a will, so I'm hoping that you wake up and, and seriously take

control of... as we are continuing to convert more, developments - I believe there's another 60,000 developments that are in the pipeline to be converted RAD, and I'm just hoping that the pattern that has been set thus far, by the Authority, changes.

Thank you so much.

PANEL: Thank you

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you, guys, thank you for your testimony.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Okay, that was the goodbye? Thank you...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you (LAUGHS). Have a good day, guys.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Thank you, appreciate it. Happy Holidays.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Happy Holidays, likewise.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Avilas...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Oh, sorry about that, we... Please... Please be seated. (LAUGHS) I rescind that. Council Member Avilas?

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILAS: Thank you, Chair. Thank you all. Sorry, right on time, though.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: We're here.

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILAS: I have a few questions for you.

Could you, uh, excuse me... Can you tell me a little bit about some of the differences that you've seen between the NYCHA, uh, NYCHA managed properties and PACT managed properties around the differences of heat outages?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Like, compatibility?

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILAS: Do you track...

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Mm-hmm...

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILAS: Do you also keep track of the PACT managed properties and their heat outages?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Yeah, so both are tracked.

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILAS: Okay. Are there... Are you using... (CROSS-TALK)

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Are you asking us (INAUDIBLE)... (CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILAS: Are there.. Are... Have you seen differences between the two, in terms of performance or cons... or more problems?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: So we'd have to... we probably have to look into that a little bit

more. But I do... I mean, we'll get back to you on how that looks. We don't... I haven't done a comparison as of today (INAUDIBLE)... (CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILAS: Okay. We can...

I guess what we'd like to understand is, what is happening across the two? Also, how are workers deployed? What if, uh, for PACT developments, if they are performing better, what are they doing? Who are they using, uhm, that maybe can help NYCHA perform better? Also, how they... how they respond during weekends?

And, then, also, we'd like to know in terms of what heat neighborhood the Red Hook houses falls under, because we understand they're organized in clusters.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Which? Red Hook?

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILAS: Yes.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: I will get you the exact neighborhood. Uhm, obviously it's a Brooklyn neighborhood that's escaping me at the moment. But...

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILAS: Okay.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Uh, yeah, we'll follow up with exactly who you are... Who you're concerned with... (CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILAS: Well, we'll follow up with the line of questioning for all of these elements. So, thank you.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Do you have... Do you have a specific question about Red Hook?

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILAS: I'll get back to you specifically. I just wanted to lay those on the record for you, uhm, particularly around the distinctions and then...

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Of course...

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILAS: how we're... how we're learning from those, uh, in order to make sure we can maximize and improve, uh, conditions.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Absolutely. I think we're, you know, we're learning from each other right? At the beginning of the transition, you know, NYCHA's infrastructure is very old, and we're doing a lot of work with the PACT partner to ensure that transition's happened smoothly, and even offering guidance after the closing to, you know, if our... if the heating system is from 1976, and their folks

haven't seen it. Right? We're still kinda providing that guidance to help the transition go smoothly.

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILAS: Of the boilers that you mentioned early on in the beginning, that I have no longer any recollection of, are any of those boilers in Red Hook that were transitioned? And does Red Hook come on the list for upcoming transitions?

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: Yeah. Red Hook comes on the list for upcoming transitions. So part of the upgrades there was a completely new high pressure steam plant. And so the intention is to test out, because we have finished construction over the next couple months, uhm, to make sure everything's fully functional and operational. But, yes...

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILAS: So we'll follow-up.

And the other one was about the coverage area, so where Red Hook fits...

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Brooklyn neighborhood 2..

DEPUTY CHIEF RICE: Yep.

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILAS: Say again?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Brooklyn heating neighborhood 2...

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILAS: And what does that mean?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Uh, that it...

(CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILAS: What neighborhoods does that cover? Is that a giant geography... (CROSS-TALK)

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Like, what... What are you... What are they covering... What are the...

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILAS: for the heating that you...

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: I understand. Yeah, what is that supervisor responsible for? Is that what you are asking?

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILAS: What is the geographic area that that covers?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Get you that in a second. We'll follow up with you on that one.

(INAUDIBLE)... (CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILAS: Oh, okay, so you have half an answer to (INAUDIBLE)...

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Oh, yeah, that's...

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILAS: Brooklyn coverage, too...

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: I thought you would asking me the actual neighborhood. It's Brooklyn, yeah... (CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILAS: A little bit to understand the scale and scope, and... (CROSS-TALK)

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Right...

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILAS: how it potentially impacts service.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Understood, yeah. So, every... Every supervisor, uh, has its own... So, Red Hook is an interesting... it's an interesting plant. So, every supervisor has between ,you know, an average of five properties. Right? One day a week. They can visit every single one. And Red Hook is an interesting property in that, because it's a high pressure steam plant that has different regulations, we have actually hired an additional number of staff. So, there is a supervisor assigned just to Red Hook in the stationary plant.

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILAS: Uh-huh...

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Because it's a high pressure plant. So, uhm, that position is being filled currently. And that plant is also being placed online currently. So, we have staff there now

learning the system from the contractor who built it.
And, like I said, it's its own kind micro grid that
is overseen by not only, uh, a heating superintendent
that is responsible for a geographic area, but has
onsite supervision, because of the size and the
scope.

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILAS: Okay, so, there is a
designated person who is (TIMER CHIMES) in that role?
Great. I'll follow up with you... (CROSS-TALK)

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: For the... For
the heating plant itself... (CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILAS: For the heating plant
itself. Okay, we'll follow up, thank you so much for,
uhm, indulging me.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: My pleasure.

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILAS: Thank you, Chair, I
appreciate it.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you, Council Member.

We are now going to move on... Thank you again,
guys, happy holidays.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GROSSMAN: Thank you,
Chair, you, too.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Looking forward to the followup to the questions that were given today, thank you.

(PAUSE)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Alright, so, now I am going to open the hearing for public testimony.

I just want to remind members of the public that this is a public, sorry...

I remind members of the public that this is a formal government proceeding and that decorum shall be observed at all times. As such, members of the public shall remain silent at all times.

The witness table is reserved for people who wish to testify. No video recording or photography is allowed from the witness table.

Further, members of the public may not present audio or video recordings as testimony, but may submit transcripts of such recordings to the Sergeant at Arms for inclusion in the hearing record.

If you wish to speak at today's hearing, please fill out an appearance card with the Sergeant at Arms and wait to be recognized. When recognized, you will have two minutes to speak on today's hearing topic:

Oversight - Weather-Proofing at NYCHA Buildings and Campuses.

If you have a written statement or additional written testimony you wish to submit for the record, please provide a copy of that testimony to the Sergeant at Arms.

You may also email written testimony to Testimony@council.nyc.gov within 72 hours after the close of this hearing. Audio and video recordings will not be accepted.

I would like call up the panel - I would like call up Renee Keitt and Joel Kupferman.

(PAUSE)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You may begin, Renee.

RENEE KEITT: So this will be short and easy.

I spoke to your chief of staff, Michael Lambert. So these are the 949 signatures of the tenants opposing the demolition of Fulton and Elliot Chelsea houses - so you will have them.

Along with that, there's an article discussing the condomizing of public housing: *Commodifying Public Housing: New York City's Use Of The Rental Assistance Demonstration (Rad) Program As Neoliberal Political Project, Legal Rationality and Normative*

Officer, and continuing for 20 years thereafter at an annual rate of \$138,019.68. Tenant shall have the option to extend the term for additional 5 one-year renewal options. Total revenue for the initial 20 year term \$2,760,393.60. (TIMER CHIMES) That's very important.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Quick question, I mean, I am interested, because I heard you mention Breukelen Houses, and obviously that's one of the developments that's in my district.

So, you're alleging that they will be exporting the energy that's gathered from solar to other developments?

RENEE KEITT: Yes, they don't go to... yes. It's a goal for low and other middle income residents. Basically NYCHA is leveraging its real estate, and leaving its tenants in the cold. So, if that's a possibility, being solar is not... That's nice that it's solar...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Right...

RENEE KEITT: But who it needs to be used for.

Also, the USDA has district conversationist, and they should be working with them for sustainability. Things you can do are gardens, NYCHA has a lot of

land. And they do have a gardening community that has been there since 1962. Also, you have many people who are NYCHA residents who are urban farmers.

These are the people whose expertise should be leveraged in this. So, the USDA and the Farm Service Agency has offices, so those are the things that should be used. It wouldn't cost them money, it would... they most likely can get it from other sources and should be utilizing grants.

Those are the things that are important. You should also be looking at the Capital Tracker to see the difference between five-year and 20-years in each of the developments when you speak. So, if there is very little difference, are those totals really correct? Because I looked at Chelsea and Elliott and Fulton, and there is very little difference.

So, those are the things that should be always asked of these people. As you saw, they had a real, great amount of problem actually answering the questions. And you, as usual- you know you do that, I love when you do that, also, I can't help it, I just love getting... watching them screw over - Uh, you have to ask these questions - and repeatedly. There are other agencies that they could be working with,

and all of these questions that they didn't answer, you need to get on them to answer.

So, those questions need to go to them, and you want an answer. Or give them these questions ahead of time, and when they don't come to answer, what are the consequences? Because, that has to start happening. They can't keep doing this. That's it - sorry.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you... No, no, no, thank you. Thank you for your testimony.

Uh, Council Member Mealy, did you have any... We'll come back to you, and you do remember...

Sir, you may give your testimony.

JOEL KUPFERMAN: Joel Kupferman, Environmental Justice Initiative. I represent the Tenant Association of Smith Houses, Residents to Preserve Public Housing, and Concerned Residents and Riis.

This it's been a five- six year battle for the Environmental Justice Initiative. We've seen millions being misspent.

The first thing I wanna get out, it's not a question of money. It's a question of misspent money, unaccounted for money.

Each of the places where they're working on capital budget, especially the boilers, is an environmental health hazardous epicenter. They're placing workers, NYCHA staff and residents in harm's way, inside and outside.

At Smith, we've measured the heat above the boiler to be a 150 degrees. It's coming up. Fortunately, there's a big, good contractor there, but we've been sitting in on biweekly meetings. A lot of the construction oversight that the residents are allowed to sit in on, are not... they're not allowed to participate or they're not participating. Alright?

So there's a... that's violating, I believe, 984. Uh...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And this a NYCHA development?

JOEL KUPFERMAN: This is NYCHA development...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Just want to hear that...

JOEL KUPFERMAN: So this is Smith with the vociferous tenant association. Others we hear as stories, and we also have whistleblower coming to us all the time.

I also suggest that this committee set up a special number or whatever so that you listen to the

workers that are seeing these things that are going on.

What also alarms me is that they're coming in touch... contact with asbestos, lead, arsenic, VOCs, and SVOCs. At Riis, we have a brown field site. Brown field means superfund mini site. Okay? The trouble is that the workers are complaining of being exposed to the heat. We measure the heat in the ground. We come up with a 180 degrees. That means all those VOCs are coming up to the ground.

What's alarming, for doing this work for so long, is that those workers are not aware of even what PESH is. PESH is the Public Employee Safety and Health Plan. (TIMER CHIMES) Every city worker and NYCHA worker is entitled to know that. So we have a problem...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: We have a minute to wrap it up.

JOEL KUPFERMAN: Okay, so we have raw sewage that people are being exposed to. All right? But this sewage is coming from the construction sites with the construction sites putting in new boilers, or upsetting the existing situation. At Smith, you still

1
2 have 9/11 dust that's coming up. The pipelines that
3 they excavate is opening up lead and arsenic.

4 At Riis, we have high levels of arsenic, and we
5 assume everywhere else. The City and NYCHA have
6 refused or hasn't been measuring what's there.

7 Alright?

8 Once... and then we found that when that soil is
9 exposed, it becomes resuspended and goes into
10 people's homes. And then part of the problem is that
11 we mentioned all the environmental bits. These sites,
12 including Smith, at Baruch, whatever, is causing
13 extensive tree damage. Okay? They're doing the work
14 improperly and they're actually cutting down...
15 there's a tree loss.

16 So all this talk about resiliency is the
17 opposite. So besides losing those trees for heat,
18 we're losing all the soil and the and the retention
19 values.

20 The emergency generation generators are not being
21 maintained. There's no checkup. So when the elevators
22 go down, there's a problem that those generators that
23 everyone depends on are not working.

24

25

Those elevators, when they are working, carry all the stuff that's in the boiler rooms and like up into the people's apartments in pneumatic tubes.

We've called over and over again the Health Department to come in on some of these cases. The way this city is set up now, and I think this is the City Council's responsibility, is that when the Health Department finds something wrong at NYCHA, they just issue an warning letter. It doesn't go down as a violation.

You don't know how serious, you know, NYCHA is having infractions, and so it's not being recorded. There's definitely an understatement that's there.

But I also want to stress that the pipes that are being replaced coming into these boiler rooms are covered with asbestos. The asbestos is coming off of that, off of those pipes, into the pathways, into, into the walkways. And so this major asbestos problem that is in violation of federal, state, and local law, and it just also is definitely a live threat.

And also NYCHA depends on Building Department, supervision or oversight, the trouble is that the Building Department is not enforcing, okay? And NYCHA's telling you that there's no problems. The

Department of Buildings never got a chance to review that, but they're telling you that everything is okay.

There's major violations. I'm very concerned about, RAD/PACT is that there's going to be less oversight over those companies. All right? The City owes \$2.1 billion in uncollected fines. So now, no matter how bad NYCHA is not accountable, it's going to be worse under those new managers. The City has something called an Ethical Contracting or Bad Actor Policy. NYCHA does not apply that to their contractors or the managers.

We're also concerned that at Smith, one of the worst contractor oversight was a company called FTV. They approved their \$28 million contract even though the monitors were not being used. Okay? So we show there was tree damage. So what did NYCHA do? They're rewarded now FTV - is their main adviser on all technical stuff, telling us that it's safe in terms of asbestos and lead. So, we got all bad actors (INAUDIBLE)... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You have to wrap it up... You gotta wrap up...

JOEL KUPFERMAN: Excuse me?

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You gotta wrap up.

JOEL KUPFERMAN: I gotta wrap up?

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Yes...

JOEL KUPFERMAN: Okay. So I think you should not be fooled by model plans that they show. We should ask the worst case scenario, not that the, you know, the pilots they're doing, but there should be complete new management in terms of who the contractors are.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Right...

JOEL KUPFERMAN: And also the fact that I mentioned that the workers and communities being, being (INAUDIBLE) - You should call or NYCHA can call upon the federal government for help.

There's something that OSHA has called the Strategic Partnership Program, where they come in and look at all the sites to see where workers are being endangered, whether it's municipal workers or the contractors, and they will advise how to clean up without any fines.

OSHA recommended you know, offered this service, NYCHA first said yes. Dan Green, okay, said... eventually said, no.

So there's plenty of federal help to come in to even at least assess where the dangers are, and NYCHA does not accept it or want to hear.

So I just feel... I just want to say I'm, like, slightly behooved, this is, like, the fifth year testifying about this.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Right...

JOEL KUPFERMAN: And it's actually... things have gotten worse. The heat, we discovered the heat at those places, which is really dangerous... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Sir, your testimony...

JOEL KUPFERMAN: (INAUDIBLE) test the heat...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You got to wrap it up now.

JOEL KUPFERMAN: I'm wrapping up...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, you wrapped it up...

JOEL KUPFERMAN: At the risk of sounding (INAUDIBLE)... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your testimony, sir.

JOEL KUPFERMAN: Okay...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Definitely, we thank you for this information. And we will be looking into this, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And we have a couple of questions from Council Member Mealy.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Sorry.

Do you think NYCHA is doing any gardens on the roofs? Since they just did an overhaul on majority of NYCHA roofs, do you think they have anything like that in in place?

JOEL KUPFERMAN: No, you mentioned the roofs? The roof work?

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: For (INAUDIBLE)... (CROSS-TALK)

JOEL KUPFERMAN: Our first exposure to the roof work... (CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: (INAUDIBLE) for the environment...

JOEL KUPFERMAN: Excuse me?

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: For the environment?

JOEL KUPFERMAN: Well, I'm concerned two ways. One is they could definitely use the roof for solar. But, the trouble is... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Sir...

JOEL KUPFERMAN: only if they do it right. Okay. When they're putting all the utilities, all that FEMA money, to put all the boilers and everything else on

top, they're not securing it. And also, there's allowing the water to seep through those rooves, which have asbestos, lead, and (INAUDIBLE). I just want to say, which is actually endangering the people below.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: But, NYCHA said they have replaced the majority of the rooves on the majority of the NYCHA buildings.

JOEL KUPFERMAN: Right...

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So, you're saying they're still leaking?

JOEL KUPFERMAN: Some of them are leaking, yes. We are hearing... (CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: (INAUDIBLE)

JOEL KUPFERMAN: (INAUDIBLE) are leaking from many, many cases...

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay, but I wanted (INAUDIBLE) that... (CROSS-TALK)

JOEL KUPFERMAN: But, I want to just say that leaking is dangerous. That's hazardous water. Okay? That is going through bird excrement, and everyone is turning a blind eye to the situation.

We are actually involved with the heating case, where it was exposure to E. coli, caused cholera,

caused 18,000 deaths. So, when we bring this up the NYCHA over and over again, they're just saying there's no problem. The City Health Department should be... (CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay, that's another thing where you said, uhm, you're requesting that OSHA should do pop-ups at the sites and interview the workers?

JOEL KUPFERMAN: Right, the workers... (CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: The workers complain... well, whistleblowing with you, but not the proper authorities?

JOEL KUPFERMAN: Right.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay, thank you...

JOEL KUPFERMAN: And it's... Okay, and I just... And it's also... It's...

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: No, that's all...

JOEL KUPFERMAN: (INAUDIBLE) OSHA right. Here it's the state agency that they should go to. But, a lot of the workers aren't even aware, and that's the problem with the City, and City ends up paying more when those workers sue for non-protection.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay, thank you.

1 RENEKE KEITT: Oh, I just have question...

2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Let me just get one... So, it
3 is your testimony that, you're saying that the
4 replacement of the new boilers on the roof... on
5 those particular rooftops have caused damage where
6 there's been leaks that have been created from...
7 Okay, just wanted to... Just, alright...

8 JOEL KUPFERMAN: Yes...

9 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: just wanted to... Thank you.

10 JOEL KUPFERMAN: Hazardous health...

11 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Hazardous...

12 JOEL KUPFERMAN: (INAUDIBLE) damage.

13 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Got you, okay, thank you.

14 Yes, Ma'am?

15 RENEKE KEITT: Were you asking about agrivoltaics,
16 the combination of gardening and that... Uhm, as to
17 my knowledge now, solar paneling... As of now it has
18 not been done, at least to my knowledge on a NYCHA
19 development. Can it be done? Possibility in the
20 future. But you also have to think, who is going to
21 be used for? Because now you also have to think, are
22 you going to have people who are not NYCHA people
23 coming in to the building? So, that is also something
24 you have to think about.
25

1 Something I forgot to add is sustainability, is
2 our tree canopies. The thing that is not said, NYCHA
3 trees are not on stewardship map, because they do not
4 map private property. NYCHA is technically private
5 property. So, my development in Fulton, we have 370
6 trees, we know what's happened in Red Hook with over
7 400 trees, have been basically arboricide has
8 happened. They are going to bring them back, but
9 frankly you've lost mature tree coverage. That can't
10 be replaced, and it takes a good 50 or 60 years to
11 even bother to do so. We know in Baruch, Lower
12 Eastside, they've lost their trees, and that's at
13 least 100 of them. So, when you're talking about
14 sustainability, you need to also discuss your canopy.
15 Street trees do not replace that kind of maturity.

16 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Alright, guys, thank you so
17 much for your testimony, we'll receive that package.
18 You can actually hand it to my staff member - well,
19 give to the Sergeant at Arms, thank you.

20 Okay, now, we are going to move to our virtual
21 testimony. We have Karen Blondel. Karen Blondel?

22 KAREN BLONDEL: Good morning, well, afternoon. How
23 are you, Chair?
24
25

And, first and foremost, I'm requesting a meeting with the Chair of Public Housing, that would be you, Chris Banks. I don't have an email, but I'll send something over. I think that this conversation needs to be longer than the two or three minutes that I'll be afforded today.

I wanna start off with a personal story about heat. About five years ago or more, when our congressperson was still Nydia Velasquez, I reported a steam leak in the pedestrian walkway right behind my building. And as you know, no good deed goes unpunished. That leak was fixed, but it popped up behind my neighbor's apartment. My neighbor is a paraplegic, he has no legs, he waits for home attendants and service in the daytime. I had since went over to his house, and so I'm sitting in there pouring sweat, sitting in a wheelchair because of this steam leak. So what I see is happening this year is that his home attendants come in the daytime, they steal all his heat in the apartment. They open the

windows, and they leave around four or five o'clock in the afternoon. If the heat goes off, which it normally does on a Saturday, heat... around 5:00 p.m. this man is stuck with those windows open until the next day when a new home attendant for the weekend shows up.

We experienced this every single heating season for the last several years. I remember Jumaane Williams coming here three years ago when I first became the president, and he was like, I wanna do a press conference (TIMER CHIMES)...

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Thank you, your time has expired...

KAREN BLONDEL: about no heat in Red Hook. And I said to him... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Ma'am, 30 seconds to wrap it up...

KAREN BLONDEL: I said our problem is not no heat. We get too much heat. Since that time, we are now between the new system, which is the central heating plant, and these new steam pipes that are underneath the Red Hook pathways, versus the old steam, which is the mobile trailer.

And I just wanna answer one question quickly about why there's no, gardens on the roof. Soil weighs... has a lot of weight. For them to put the farms or the gardens on the roof, they would have to fortify these roofs. Now the roofs that have, like, the generators and stuff, they may have they may have added some protection to keep those generators' weight okay up there. But when it comes to soil, it's laid out across the whole surface, and the weight of water, plants, and that is one reason why NYCHA said it doesn't use its rooves for farming.

The other thing is we pushed back on solar panels on our roofs, not because we don't believe in renewable energy. We don't believe in NYCHA watching its vendors and its contractors who have to come in and service these roofs. And that is the reason why you have punctures in the roof membrane is because

people come in and out of here with no oversight, going to the roofs, doing work, "Oops, I made a mistake," and they walk away from it. No one is held accountable, and that is the reason for that.

I hope to talk to you soon, Mr. Banks. But I will keep doing the work that I'm doing for Red Hook houses no matter what. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your advocacy, your testimony, the Committee is actually going to reach out to you and send you the email address to my Chief of Staff, so we can set that meeting up ASAP. Thank you.

Okay, thank you again, Ms. Blondel.

We are going to now move on to Beverly MacFarlane.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

(PAUSE)

BEVERLY MACFARLANE: (INAUDIBLE)...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: How are you doing, Ms. MacFarlane? You may start your testimony.

BEVERLY MACFARLANE: (INAUDIBLE)

(PAUSE)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Ms. MacFarlane, can you hear us?

1 BEVERLY MACFARLANE: (INAUDIBLE)

2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Can you hear me?

3 BEVERLY MACFARLANE: I was trying to get to
4 somewhere where...

5 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay, let me know when you're
6 ready.

7 BEVERLY MACFARLANE: Yeah, I'm ready.

8 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay, you may begin your
9 testimony.

10 BEVERLY MACFARLANE: My name is Beverly
11 MacFarlane, Resident Council President for Taft
12 Houses. Chair... Vice Chair for our PPH, Residents
13 to Preserve Public Housing.

14 I'm testifying today that those (INAUDIBLE) NYCHA
15 have continuously not tell the truth about how...
16 what their processes are.

17 In my development, we have new boilers,
18 multimillion dollar boilers. (BACKGROUND NOISE) And
19 we are still having issues in Taft houses.

20 First of all, the construction of these boilers
21 did not have the (INAUDIBLE) rises part of the scope
22 of work. So how can you put a new boiler without new
23 pipes? Which is so ridiculous. So, half of my
24 residents, I have nine buildings, 1,500 units, and
25

half of my residents, in all nine buildings, have come to a Residents Association Meeting complaining that the upper apartments are not getting heat.

And this new, little Mickey Mouse, system that, whatever they call it, DMS or whatever they call it, are not working, because these little monitors they put on residents... in residents' apartments are from the .99¢ store and are not showing what the residents are experiencing in their home.

I have a couple of residents that are saying that these monitors are always saying at 72 when apartments may be at 30 in an apartment, as far as the cold. So, I think... I don't know what's going on with these new boiler systems that they have in it. Are they refurbished boilers (TIMER CHIMES) or what is going on? But...

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Thank you, your time has expired.

BEVERLY MACFARLANE: being that the scope of work is not...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Uh, 30 seconds to wrap up.

BEVERLY MACFARLANE: (INAUDIBLE) pipes not part of the scope of work. Excuse me?

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You have 30 seconds to wrap it up... (CROSS-TALK)

BEVERLY MACFARLANE: I didn't hear you? I'm sorry.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: I said you have 30 seconds to wrap it up, Ma'am.

BEVERLY MACFARLANE: Okay, (INAUDIBLE) rises are not part of the scope of work, and that's why the system is no longer working and providing the services that we need in our development.

And they're spending 50... I mean, my development, the weatherization, they have we have scaffolding up five years. They are spending \$500,000 a year to input have these vendors have the scaffolding and \$40,000 a month to have someone, a third party, clean behind the scaffolding. That's ridiculous.

Why don't they just make sure the work is done and (INAUDIBLE) the buildings so we can have better, heating in our apartment?

I yield. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your advocacy and your testimony.

Council Member Mealy has a question for you.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Could you tell me how many Title III positions your tenants receive to get the jobs from NYCHA?

BEVERLY MACFARLANE: Well, but as far as, when the Section 3 jobs I was advocating, so I did have many of my residents that I (BACKGROUND NOISE) had OSHA 30 and 40 (INAUDIBLE) license, they were able to get... we only had about maybe five altogether. They were able to get a job between STV, (BACKGROUND NOISE) (INAUDIBLE) but I found out that they did not get they (BACKGROUND NOISE) (INAUDIBLE) verified that, but a lot of these guys, 18 months, did not get the full prevailing wages until my advocacy.

But they didn't get back pay for the 18 months that they were working at \$18.20 an hour. Meanwhile, they're supposed to be getting \$45.00 and \$43.00 an hour.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay, keep advocating, and let us know - \$25.00 an hour is what they should have been paying those 18 months also. So, please keep us abreast of that.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you, Council Member Mealy.

We will now... And, thank you, Ms. MacFarlane.

We will now move onto Ms. Miranda?

SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

CELINES MIRANDA: I'm from the Elliott houses in Chelsea. As you know, we've gathered 949 signatures against the demolition of Fulton, Elliott, and Chelsea.

Now that you have your personal set... now you have your personal set of our petitions. As chairman of a public housing committee, we need you to support and be a voice for our cause.

This is this is a serious matter. Demolition of two NYCHA communities is not to be taken lightly. We need a hearing. You have jurisdiction over NYCHA and a responsibility to the tenants.

We've handed petitions to Tony Simone, Erik Bottcher, HUD, NYCHA - all elected officials know of our petitions. They receive letters, emails, and no one has responded. We are being ignored.

NYCHA is federal housing property, which exists in every single district. So a demolition is being proposed, uhm, member deference becomes null and void concerning public housing matters. You accepted your seat for a reason.

Erik Bottcher has been planted in this board. He has no concern about public housing residents and is suppressing our voice. If you get... if we get demolished, the stage is set, and demolition of our NYCHA developments will end up in your district.

Speak up now and defend our rights as public housing tenants. Please follow through on your role as chairman. Follow through on your role as public housing board members. Stand up and be a voice that we are longing for. We cannot... we must not be demolished. Thank you.

(PAUSE)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Are you are you done, Ms. Miranda? Okay, thank you so much.

CELINES MIRANDA: Uhm, no...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: I can give you 30 more seconds.

CELINES MIRANDA: And... and the truth is we, uhm, with all the complaints that you're getting in from the RAD/PACT conversions, you should put a moratorium to any conversions. You have the authority to do so.

Residents are still having the same problems, and even worse, including a higher eviction rate. It's defeating the purpose.

Public housing must remain public. We become vulnerable in the hands of private developers, such as risking a demolition. And as Renee said, we're gonna be losing our tree canopies also. Thank you.

(PAUSE)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you, Ms. Miranda, thank you for your advocacy. Thank you for your testimony. And, again, we have definitely had a host of conversations, and we will continue to do that, thank you.

Now we are going to move onto Rachel Castro.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

RACHEL CASTRO: Hi, good morning...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Good morning, Ms. Castro.

RACHEL CASTRO: My name is Rachel Castro. I'm a tenant at 357 Wortman, and my complaint issues, as well as the everyone in 357 building, has been complaining about the water, the hot water. It doesn't shut on... it shuts off when, you know, when we're trying to take a shower or anything. It doesn't go back on. It's been for a couple weeks now. And, you know, there's been tenants that go to the office or call them and let them know, and nothing is being done still.

So I'm... I didn't know I'd have to stay here for two hours to just talk about the water.

(PAUSE)

RACHEL CASTRO: Yes, I'm finished.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And what building is that again, Ms. Castro?

RACHEL CASTRO: Boulevard houses.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Boulevard houses, and the building?

RACHEL CASTRO: 357 Wortman.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: 3 5 7...

RACHEL CASTRO: W O R T M A N

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: I'm familiar with Wortman. Okay. And we will be in touch with you. If you can reach out to my office, uh, please feel free...

RACHEL CASTRO: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: and we'll address that issue.

RACHEL CASTRO: Okay, thank you so much. Because it's a lot of tenants, you know, even coming to me, knocking on my door, like, you know, do you have hot water? I'm like, no. You know, we all have kids in this building. You know? Little ones as well.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, how long has that been taking place?

RACHEL CASTRO: It's been a couple of weeks that we haven't had hot water.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You haven't had hot water for over a how many weeks?

RACHEL CASTRO: On and off a couple of weeks. Yes...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: On and off a couple of weeks. And this is a RAD/PACT converted development?

RACHEL CASTRO: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. Alright. We'll be in touch with you. Please reach out to the office. This is Councilman Banks, your councilman. Please reach out to our office, okay, so we can address this issue. Thank you.

We will now move onto our next... We have Christopher Leon Johnson. You may begin your testimony.

CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Can you hear me? Can you me, sir?

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: We can hear you loud and clear.

CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Hey. What's up, everybody? My name is Christopher Leon Johnson. I know I'm a little off topic now, but first of all, I

But, I wanted to (INAUDIBLE) this situation right now with the weatherproof I saw it on the header. And the reason the repairs are not going to happen with weather... really weatherproofing the NYCHA developments, especially in my district, I mean, Mealy's district and your district, and all over the city with NYCHA developments, is because they're pushing the people that's really running NYCHA who should have been here today, (INAUDIBLE) I think that's what her name is, she should have been here today instead of the, the B team, her representatives.

The reason they're not really going to do what they gotta do with really weather proofing and

climate controlling NYCHA developments right now is because they are push for RAD/PACT.

What they want to do is push the people who are currently in it right now, which are really undesirables. I mean, that's what they really call people that's paying the money that they don't want them to pay. They want them out those units and get those, (INAUDIBLE), the people that will push it for the CES into those units.

Once those people are out into hotels like what's going on Fulton-Chelsea, and shout out to people that's fight (INAUDIBLE) Fulton-Chelsea. They aren't going to start doing what they really want to be doing and making the NYCHA developments look like Stuytown. People got some of the Stuytown and, and Two Trees... and start... Not Two Trees, Two Bridges and start understanding that what they wanna do with the NYCHA development, especially Brooklyn Chelsea, is to make them look like, Stuytown and Two bridges. And, and let's make this clear, I think people start fighting us more that, NYCHA should be public. (TIMER CHIMES) It should only be public. It should never be private...

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time has expired.

CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Alright. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your testimony.

We will now move on to Francine Cutler.

You may begin your testimony.

FRANCINE CUTLER: Can you hear me

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: We can hear you.

FRANCINE CUTLER: (BACKGROUND NOISE) (INAUDIBLE)

Good morning, everyone, thank you for the opportunity to speak. Just please bear with me because I was driving. I have been on the call since 9:58 a.m.

So good morning, everyone. I hope all is well. I would like to thank you again for this hearing, Council Member.

I understand that we have a time limit each person, and I will respect that. I'm gonna talk a little fast, but I ask you guys for the grace to allow me an extra few minutes, as I'm not speaking just for myself, I'm speaking for the residents in Boulevard Together houses, who either cannot make it or have decided that they are not going to waste their oxygen or their breaths on this anymore because their complaints are being on deaf ears.

You guys can still hear me, correct?

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Correct.

FRANCINE CUTLER: Okay, I appreciate you.

So one thing I just wanted... I was wish I could've spoke while NYCHA was still sitting there, but I wanted to know what was the difference between NYCHA and the RAD/PACT? If we still don't have the dependable heat and hot water that we didn't have when NYCHA owned the property, well, was responsible for these repairs, right? We've been given heaters that are told are fire hazards and can't have them in our homes after being given to us. Uhm (INAUDIBLE)

Sorry about that, guys. I have to get on my son, my 16-year-old son, in the morning because he refuses to bathe in cold water before he goes to school. He refuses to boil water, due to whatever reason. I have to literally argue with my son to drag him out the house. Now he can't bathe in a neighbor's house. He cannot bathe in a family member's home. He's 16 and never spent the night out in anyone's home. So, why would I send him out there to bathe?

I had surgery on Saturday last week, and having to be without no hot water for three days after having surgery is unacceptable. I had to reach out to... I also have reached out to many, many people

1 in an email thread. I will not call out anyone's name
2 because they're not here to represent themselves.
3 Hundreds of emails I have regarding the heat and hot
4 water well, heat hot water issues, and other issues
5 that I'm not gonna address today, because I heard
6 that this was only for heat and hot water.
7

8 One of NYCHA's representatives has stated that
9 fixing the heat is... I heard one of the NYCHA
10 representative state that they are fixing the heating
11 outages less than 24 hours. Does that include the hot
12 water? Because that was three days that I was without
13 it. No one send us robocalls ever or notices. If
14 notices are being put up in our buildings, they're
15 putting being put up after the fact of the matter.

16 But, again, when it comes to heat and hot water,
17 I've never received a notice. Whether it's like the
18 gentleman said, something that is an emergency or
19 something that they know is gonna be an outage. So
20 that is false.

21 Uhm, 12 hours, this gentleman, I hope he's still
22 in the audience from NYCHA, because 12 hours is too
23 long. How would you like (TIMER CHIMES) if you're a
24 sick family member (INAUDIBLE)... (CROSS-TALK)

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time has expired.

FRANCINE CUTLER: Excuse me?

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time has expired, thank you.

FRANCINE CUTLER: I would like the opportunity to continue speaking, Council Member. I've been on here since 9:58 a.m.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Ms. Cutler, you can have another minute to wrap it up.

FRANCINE CUTLER: Uh, 12 hours is too long. How would they like if their sick family members, senior family member with illnesses affected by the cold, and child with asthma, or anyone in good health has to live with no hot water or heat for even two hours, especially those who know that our buildings have cold... have cold in the walls.

So imagine if it's cold outside, it's colder in our homes. You stated the boilers, the system is over 50 years old, and I've lived in this building for over 16 years under NYCHA, and three years under RAD/PACT, and the same flavor of the cake, different party.

Let me say, when they do put it on, it's so hot, I get condensation stains all over my apartment. But I've learned that when you complain it's too hot,

they shut it down for days. So I don't complain. I open my windows and I run the air conditioner.

By the way, they mentioned that more than once about the robocalls and notices - absolutely not true.

Do they actually go out and check when we do get notices? It's dated days before we get them and times dated December 14th, we get them on 15th, the work, the same day or next day. Management even knows this.

And when we get our hot water, and I hate the fact that it has to be rushed to do this, I think it's unfair to the people, that I'm screwing up my words right now - But let me finish up before I get cut off again.

When we get hot water, we get lukewarm water. I would move to Puerto Rico if that's what I wanted. But the water and the pipes are no good. They actually need to come in the homes and experience what we're experiencing.

Lastly, Council Member, they have re-fixed my apartment. I remodeled my entire apartment. My bathroom wall started falling down. Everyone knows about this. They came and fixed it finally two years

in August, nine days later, the cracking and the entire wall started falling down again.

Council member, they made me move all my furniture the day before... they made me remove a lot of stuff in my house the day before Thanksgiving when I was preparing for a surgery the next week, so they can do emergency HUD repairs so that we can pass inspections. I gave them the courtesy, I allowed them in my apartment to make a mess. Council Member, it's been less than 14 days, my bathroom already the ceiling is starting to fall apart.

And guess what? I failed the HUD inspection because of their slack. I have way more to say, but, unfortunately, I do not have the opportunity to defend myself or the residents of Boulevard Houses during this call.

I hope that we can have another meeting like this in the future...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Yes.

FRANCINE CUTLER: So, I can be able to actually say everything I need to say. I appreciate your time.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Just one quick question, Francine. Thank you for your advocacy again, and,

uhm, I just wanted to clarify that this is a RAD/PACT development, right?

FRANCINE CUTLER: Yes, Council Member.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you so much, thank you.

FRANCINE CUTLER: Yes, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your testimony.

(PAUSE)

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay, guys, we are going to close this meeting out. We thank everybody for their testimony today. Again, uh, this our journey to provide the proper oversight over NYCHA. And, again, thank you so much.

This meeting is adjourned.

(GAVEL SOUND) (GAVELING OUT)

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

173

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 31, 2024