

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
CONCESSIONS

----- X

January 12, 2016
Start: 1:46 p.m.
Recess: 2:26 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway - Committee Rm,
16th Fl.

B E F O R E:
INEZ E. DICKENS
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:
Darlene Mealy
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Andrew Cohen
Mark Treyger

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Artie Pearson
Director of Land use
Office of Governmental Affairs
New York City Housing Preservation and
Development

Ron Schulman
Developer Sponsor
Van Sinderen Plaza

Joseph Apicella
Managing Partner
The MacQuesten Group

Lin Zeng
Director
Brooklyn Planning
New York City Housing Preservation and
Development

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
2 CONCESSIONS

3

[gavel]

3 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Good afternoon. I
4 first want to apologize to the staff and to the
5 members of the public who have been here, since we're
6 starting 50 minutes late. I want to welcome everyone
7 to today's hearing. I am Council Member Inez E.
8 Dickens, Chair of the Subcommittee on Planning,
9 Dispositions and Concessions.

10 It is great to be back with this
11 committee and I want to thank Council Member Andy
12 Cohen, although he is not here, for graciously taking
13 the role of Acting Chair while I was on medical
14 leave. I sincerely appreciate him taking the reigns
15 of the subcommittee and navigating if through
16 difficult projects, such as the Brooklyn Library. I
17 understand that this was a very stressful and
18 contentious issue and I applaud him for handling this
19 difficult hearing.

20 I would also like to thank my committee
21 members and colleagues for being so understanding
22 during my absence.

23 I cannot forget to thank my incredible
24 Land Use team -- Land Use Director Raju Mann, Deputy
25 Director Amy Levitan and of course my attorney, Dylan

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
2 CONCESSIONS

4

3 Casey. Thank you for seamlessly running this
4 subcommittee and continuing the important work while
5 I was away.

6 Finally, I want to thank and acknowledge
7 my Sergeant of Arms, Allen Shue [sp?] and we are
8 joined today by Council Member Mark Treyger and
9 Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez.

10 We are holding a public hearing -- and
11 we've also been joined by Council Member Inez Barron,
12 who we will hear from later, since this item is in
13 her council district. We are holding a public
14 hearing and voting on two items which are related,
15 Land Use 0325 and Land Use 0326, 669-679 Van Sinderen
16 -- is that the correct pronunciation -- [background
17 comment] Sinderen Avenue and 169-182, New Lots
18 Avenue, which is an application submitted by the
19 Department of Housing, Preservation and Development
20 for a UDAAP designation for the various City-owned
21 lots and disposition and project approval and
22 proposed rezoning from a M1-1 to an R7A with a
23 commercial overlay of C2-4. This application will
24 facilitate the development, Van Sinderen Plaza, which
25 are two seven-story mixed-use buildings with 130
units of affordable housing, ground floor commercial

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
2 CONCESSIONS

5

3 space and accessory below grade parking. This
4 property is located in Council Member Inez Barron's
5 district in Brooklyn.

6 I am now gonna open the public hearing
7 for items Land Use 0325 and 0326. I wanna call up
8 members of the public and also I'm gonna call up
9 Artie Pearson, Director of Land Use at HPD, Lin Zeng,
10 Director of Brooklyn Planning at HPD and also the
11 developers are here, Joe Apicella; is that correct?
12 [background comment] Come on up at the same time,
13 please, and Ron Schulman.

14 Please identify yourself once you turn on
15 the mic and your affiliation. Thank you.

16 ARTIE PEARSON: Afternoon, Chair Dickens
17 and members of the subcommittee. I'm Artie Pearson,
18 Director of Land Use from HPD's Office of
19 Governmental Relations and I'm joined by my
20 colleague, Lin Zeng, the Director of Brooklyn
21 Planning.

22 Land Use Nos. 0325 and 0326 are related
23 ULURP items for a project known as Van Sinderen Plaza
24 in Council District 42 to be developed under HPD's
25 Extremely Low and Low-Income Affordability Program,
known as ELLA.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
2 CONCESSIONS

6

3 Land Use 0326 seeks the designation as an
4 Urban Development Action Area, disposition and
5 project approval for seven vacant City-owned lots
6 located at 679, 669 Van Sinderen Avenue and 169-182
7 New Lots Avenue, also known as Block 3850, Lots 1 and
8 3865, Lots 24, 25, 26, 27, 128 and 129.

9 The disposition area is a designated
10 urban renewal site within the East New York (1) Urban
11 Renewal Area and is being developed according to the
12 urban renewal plan which was originally adopted in
13 1986.

14 Under the proposed project, HPD will
15 dispose the City-owned sites to the sponsor who plans
16 to include two privately-owned lots located at Block
17 3850, Lots 5 and 10 and construct two seven-story
18 mixed-use residential buildings. In total there will
19 be 129 units plus a superintendent's apartment,
20 approximately 19,908 sq. ft. of commercial space,
21 3,910 sq. ft. of passive recreational open space and
22 underground parking for 21 vehicles.

23 Site 1, which is on the northern portion
24 of the project area, will be developed on Block 3850,
25 Lots 1, which is a City-owned lot, and Lots 5 and 10,
which are the privately-owned lots, and will consist

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
CONCESSIONS

7

2 of approximately 102 residential units, with a
3 mixture of one-, two- and three-bedroom units. The
4 ground floor of the site will consist of
5 approximately 17,341 sq. ft. of commercial space and
6 2,060 sq. ft. of recreational space.

7 Site 2, which is on the southern portion
8 of the project site, consists of Block 3865, Lots 24,
9 25, 26, 27, 128 and 129 and will contain 28
10 residential units, with a mixture of one-, two- and
11 three-bedroom apartments and the superintendent's
12 unit will be located within this location. There
13 will be 3,931 sq. ft. of ground floor commercial
14 space within the building on Site 2 and 1,820 sq. ft.
15 of outdoor space. The targeted income for the
16 project will not exceed 60% of AMI and rents will
17 average between \$396 for a one-bedroom apartment to
18 \$1,224 for a three-bedroom apartment. Tenants with a
19 commercial/retail space have yet to be determined at
20 this time; however, it is anticipated that the
21 project sponsor will target a food store or a
22 supermarket to occupy the proposed commercial space
23 and the cost per square foot is anticipated to be \$18
24 per sq. ft.

25

3 In order to facilitate the development of
4 the project, Land Use No. 0325 consists of an
5 amendment to the zoning map which will change the
6 project area from an existing manufacturing district
7 to a residential district with a commercial overlay
8 along two blocks fronting New Lots Avenue. The
9 zoning map amendment, along with the related UDAAP
10 disposition project approval will facilitate the
11 development of this much-needed affordable housing
12 for low-income households. And we are prepared to
13 answer any answers that you may have.

14 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Thank you so much,
15 Artie. The developers -- Who is Ron; who is Joe?
16 [background comments] Alright. Do you have anything
17 you wanna add?

18 [background comments]

19 ARTIE PEARSON: Press the button.

20 RON SCHULMAN: Okay.

21 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Press the button;
22 please identify yourself and your affiliation.

23 RON SCHULMAN: Okay. My name is Ron
24 Schulman; I'm from the Van Sinderen Plaza from the
25 Van Sinderen Plaza developer sponsor and we've been
working on this project for a few years with HPD and

3 City Planning to basically make a very dynamic
4 transit-oriented affordable housing project at the
5 corner of New Lots Avenue and Van Sinderen where the
6 subway, the L Train has a subway stop right at New
7 Lots and we're right across the street. So we wanna
8 activate this street, bring back these lots; they've
9 been vacant for about 30 years, to have affordable
10 housing and ground floor retail and we can only do it
11 with HPD and HDC's cooperation, because it's these
12 two housing agencies that make the financing work and
13 City Planning and, you know, City Council and the
14 Bronx Borough President's office help us get through
15 this process. So we wanna thank all the public
16 agencies for helping us in the last couple of years;
17 Council Member Barron has been supportive of this
18 affordable housing project, and we're in the business
19 of affordable housing, our companies do affordable
20 housing and this is what our focus is all over New
21 York City and in the metropolitan area.

22 So with that said, you have all the facts
23 and figures; if you have any questions, we'll be
24 happy to answer them, but Madame Chair and Council
25 Member Barron and committee members, we thank you for
your support.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
2 CONCESSIONS

10

3 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Thank you. Is
4 there anymore testimony?

5 JOSEPH APICELLA: Yes, please. Joseph
6 Apicella, Managing Partner with the MacQuesten Group;
7 we've been in the affordable housing business for
8 almost 30 years and the City of New York,
9 specifically the Bronx, Westchester and now Brooklyn.

10 I wanted to mention a number of other
11 facts about this project and one of which is job
12 creation. During the construction phase of the
13 project we will be creating approximately 150 to 200
14 full-time-equivalent construction jobs; we will be
15 hiring locally; we intend, as we indicated yesterday
16 in a meeting with Council Member Barron, we will work
17 very closely with the community on job training and
18 the like; we plan on having job fares, we plan on
19 recruiting locally, because that's what we do on all
20 projects we've worked on.

21 In addition to that, once the project is
22 completed and open, the 4,000 sq. ft. of retail and
23 the management operation of the building will
24 necessitate approximately another 30 full-time jobs,
25 permanent jobs.

3 In addition to that, we are going to do
4 what we typically do and we're gonna seek a green
5 building, meaning Silver LEED or Enterprise Green
6 building at this location. This is transit-oriented
7 development, so this makes complete sense for this
8 area in terms of the economic development. We are
9 working closely with a co-sponsor, which is the Local
10 Development Corp. of East New York, which is a co-
11 sponsor with us. The site as it is today and during
12 the summer months afforded the opportunity to bring
13 ARTs East New York in and we did that, working again
14 with the council member and the local community,
15 because that's who we are and there was a festival
16 marketplace present.

17 I will preface all of what I have had to
18 say, because I've been in the development business
19 for more than 30 years throughout the New York
20 metropolitan area, that there's only one thing that
21 delays and forestalls, kills projects more than
22 anything else and that's time, so timing is very
23 important to us; we'd like to consider that as we
24 move forward, no one's promised the economies of
25 tomorrow; things could be volatile, so we'd like this
to be expedited. Thank you.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
2 CONCESSIONS

12

3 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Thank you so much.

4 Before I ask the questions from my committee members,
5 I'm going to ask Council Member Inez Barron to please
6 make a statement.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you Madame
8 Chair; to the committee members and to the panel,
9 thank you for coming and presenting your testimony
10 about this project. I'm very excited about this
11 project because this is the first project that's
12 coming in since I've been elected to the Council; all
13 of the other projects that have been completed were
14 under my predecessor, Council Member Charles Barron,
15 so this is my first project and I'm very concerned
16 about making sure that it's done well and that it
17 comes to a great conclusion. I'm pleased that this
18 is not just residential; we've got to I think move
19 away from just building residences; we've got to have
20 the capacity to have some usage on these ground
21 floors that will allow for local businesses to have
22 an opportunity to come in; this is a very reasonable
23 footage rent that's being imposed or being requested
24 and we think that this will be an opportunity for
25 some mom and pop businesses to be able to locate in
this facility as well. I'm also very pleased with

1 the fact that there is residential space for the
2 residents; there is dedicated space on the rooftops
3 or the top floors of these buildings that is
4 dedicated for the residents, there's also underground
5 parking, which we know is an issue with some of the
6 other housing that's coming around in the city that's
7 cutting back on parking and there's also space for
8 bicycles, so we're looking at all of that. It is
9 located literally at the corner of an L Train stop
10 and we're looking to make sure that the other City
11 agencies will do their part to reduce the blight in
12 that area and lighten it up and do some painting and
13 some general maintenance in that area as well. We
14 know that the community board has approved the
15 project, as well as the borough president and we know
16 that there's a set-aside for the community, and I
17 don't know where you'll be able to find a suitable,
18 not micro one-bedroom apartment, but in fact a
19 livable size one-bedroom apartment for less than
20 \$400. My community, the median income is about
21 \$34,000 and all of these apartments are set below 60%
22 of the AMI, there are apartments at 27%, 37%, 47% and
23 57%, as well as apartments set aside for Section 8
24 and formerly homeless, so that's looking to address
25

2 the situation that we know is critical here in New
3 York City. So I'm very much in favor of this
4 project; I did see something yesterday which was news
5 to me which I had wished had been brought to my
6 attention before, which is that both buildings will
7 be seven stories, rather than initially one seven-
8 story and one five-story, so I would ask that in the
9 future when these changes are made, that I be
10 notified beforetime, but I do lend my support to this
11 project. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Thank you so much,
13 Council Member Barron.

14 Now I have a couple of questions before I
15 throw it open to the committee. It's 130 units; is
16 that correct, all at 60% or below AMI?

17 ARTIE PEARSON: That's correct.

18 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: And the commercial
19 overlays; will they be an affordable component to
20 that?

21 [background comments]

22 RON SCHULMAN: I'll answer that. The
23 retail space is gonna be offered on an average of \$18
24 per sq. ft.; if we find that there's a suitable
25 tenant in the neighborhood that can't make that

2 payment, a mom and pop, we'll make accommodations,
3 because chances are we might get, you know balance it
4 out with a bigger... [crosstalk]

5 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: And how many square
6 feet would you... if you got a commercial tenant that
7 could not pay \$18; how much square footage would you
8 offer that person and the second part of it is; how
9 much negotiation would you do?

10 RON SCHULMAN: We think it's probably
11 gonna be a smaller store, 2,500 or 3,000 sq. ft.
12 store and we would, you know, probably go down to \$15
13 if we had to to make a deal work. We wanna have all
14 the retail space occupied and we don't want any... we
15 have no vacant space in any of our buildings at all.

16 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Thank you so much.
17 Are there any questions from my committee members?
18 Council Member Treyger, please.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you.
20 First of all I wanna welcome back the Chair...
21 [interpose]

22 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Thank you.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: we dearly,
24 dearly missed you and we're so glad that you made a
25 full recovery and I also wanna credit my colleague

2 from the Brooklyn delegation, Council Member Barron,
3 who's been very, very steadfast and persistent on
4 making sure that the needs of our residents are being
5 met with regards to housing that's affordable to them
6 and to small businesses and to retail space.

7 The question I have, just for clarity, so
8 right now these are vacant lots; is that correct?

9 RON SCHULMAN: Yeah, every single lot is
10 vacant. We own half of the site..

11 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Right.

12 RON SCHULMAN: the City of New York owns
13 the other half and we're putting it together as a
14 puzzle, it's all vacant, there are no structures on
15 the site.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Great. And I
17 heard there will be efforts to have job fares regards
18 to local hiring; is that correct?

19 JOSEPH APICELLA: That is correct; in
20 fact we have a community relations officer
21 [background comment], Charlene Blackwood, that would
22 spearhead that, as she has in other communities that
23 have been quite successful in recruiting local,
24 qualified, both trained and untrained potential
25 workers.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
2 CONCESSIONS

17

3 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Yeah, I would
4 just add that in addition to... and I think that's a
5 good step; I think that certainly some folks might
6 need help building capacity and help building up
7 credentials to get onto these job sites, I think
8 that's very critical as well and I like what I'm
9 seeing is that -- what is the breakdown of the units
10 as far as how many three-bedroom, two-bedroom, one-
11 bedrooms; do we have that...? [crosstalk]

12 RON SCHULMAN: Okay, so there's a... Yeah,
13 I'll go through that now.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Yeah.

15 RON SCHULMAN: There's a fact sheet that
16 you might've received from your... [crosstalk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Okay.

18 RON SCHULMAN: sergeant at arms. So we
19 have 61% two- and three-bedrooms in the building and
20 we have 38% one-bedrooms. So there's a total of 51
21 one-bedrooms, 56 twos and 24 three-bedrooms; we meet
22 the HPD guidelines of all their design. The size of
23 these apartments -- somebody said micro apartments --
24 these are macro apartments. We have one-bedrooms at
25 661 average and two-bedrooms between 770 and 900 and
three-bedrooms at over 1,085, average size

2 apartments; [background comment] the three-bedrooms
3 have two baths and I think some of the two-bedrooms
4 have a bath-and-a-half too.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: And I see that
6 there'll be a unit for the super as well; is that
7 correct...? [crosstalk]

8 RON SCHULMAN: Yeah, there's a two-
9 bedroom unit for the superintendent.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: And that super
11 will be assigned to this building?

12 RON SCHULMAN: Living in the building,
13 living in the Van Sinderen building.. [crosstalk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: And that's
15 another big issue?

16 RON SCHULMAN: Oh no, a resident
17 superintendent is required, absolutely. Yeah.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: And my colleague
19 mentioned that there will also be some units assigned
20 for -- did I hear supportive housing or... [interpose]

21 RON SCHULMAN: Well there's gonna be
22 eight Section 8 Vouchers for the project, so those'll
23 typically go for formerly homeless people and they'll
24 be found by HPD when we rent up the building.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Right. And so
3 when these apartments are selected for those people
4 who have Section 8 Vouchers, if they have needs
5 beyond just housing; how is that addressed, by either
6 HPD or by you?

7 RON SCHULMAN: If we need to provide
8 supportive aftercare services, then we'll retain a
9 group and we'll work with our partner, the LDC of
10 East New York to do that.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Okay, I think
12 that's a very important -- I've been very consistent
13 on that message about if we say we're trying to
14 support them; let's actually support them..

15 [interpose]

16 RON SCHULMAN: We agree, yeah, we agree,
17 absolutely.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Alright. Thank
19 you, Chair.

20 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Council Member
21 Rodriguez, please.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: First of all,
23 welcome back Inez...

24 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Thank you.
25

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: and
4 congratulations my colleague, Council Member Barron.
5 Of course for me, anytime that we are able to see a
6 building that can be 100% affordable is a way that we
7 also have to keep the message in our city that we
8 need to do the best we can to continue replicating
9 this model. So my question is; at a moment where
10 developers say 100% affordable is not possible, how
11 were you able to make magic and make this thing 100%
12 affordable?

13 RON SCHULMAN: A magic wand. No. Quite
14 honestly, we have to find suitable sites around the
15 city to build affordable housing; Joe's been doing it
16 for 30 years; I've been doing it for 30 years. It
17 takes a lot of creative financing and land has to be
18 reasonably priced; it has to be zoned according to
19 build a bulk of a building -- R6, R7 or R8 zoning;
20 the HPD and HDC programs induce this because they
21 offer low-interest subsidy loans to make it happen
22 and last but not least, you have to have a tax
23 exemption. So this building will have a 420-c tax
24 exemption, which provides for long-term tax savings
25 so you can keep these rents between \$368 and \$1224.
If you didn't have the tax exemption, it would be

2 very difficult or impossible to offer the rents at
3 that level.

4 I can't comment on everybody's district
5 in the city, but we look for sites all the time which
6 are feasible to develop for affordable housing,
7 whether it's senior housing, which we've done or
8 middle income housing or mixed-income housing or all
9 low-income housing, as in this project.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: And I know
11 that, you know, first of all, the border (sic) of
12 Council Member Inez' district or Mark's district; the
13 Broadway Housing is in your district or Mark Levine?
14 (sic) [background comments] No, in... [background
15 comments]

16 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: I'm sorry; it's in
17 Council Member Inez Barron's.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: No, no I
19 understand, but I am saying the model, the Broadway
20 Housing...

21 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Oh yes.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: is in your
23 district or Mark's?

24 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Mark.
25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
CONCESSIONS

22

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: So you know,
3 we had the Broadway Housing, 153rd and Hcorn [sic]
4 and of course, haven't been able to do affordable
5 housing to 100% affordable.

6 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Well let me correct
7 you on that; that was really negotiated by Council
8 Member Robert Jackson in whose district it was at
9 that time... [crosstalk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Before.

11 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: yes, and now it's
12 in mine... [crosstalk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: But what I
14 meant was... my thing is that... and again, you talk
15 about, you know, it takes one; to find a site;
16 second, to find the financier that can put the money,
17 the tax exempt [sic], so then for me it's all about
18 how can... and of course, like I know and this is not...
19 it is not possible to say that every site will be
20 100% affordable, so I understand that part, but in
21 this particular model, how much public dollars are we
22 investing so that we were able to make these things
23 affordable and for me it's all about how can we learn
24 from this model... [crosstalk]

25 RON SCHULMAN: Well...

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: to replicate
4 in other areas?

5 RON SCHULMAN: It's a good question.

6 This model fits right in with HPD's ELLA Program, so

7 we're using -- it's a combination of HDC, New York

8 City HDC bonds and subsidy and also HPD subsidy in

9 order to make the model work, so there's a

10 combination of sources. The other thing that we

11 don't talk about a lot is this project brings in

12 private capital through the low-income housing tax

13 credit model. So the tax credit program, which has

14 been around since 1986 and has created 2.5 million

15 units of housing in America, it's being used in this

16 project; we're bringing in private dollars in order

17 to make this low-income housing build and that can be

18 done anywhere in New York City or anywhere in New

19 York State.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: How much are

21 you requesting or expect to receive from HDC and HPD

22 incentives?

23 RON SCHULMAN: Okay, so it's about a \$53

24 million project in total, so the bonds will be a

25 little over \$26-27 million; those are tax exempt

revenue bonds; those are not City capital dollars.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
CONCESSIONS

24

2 And then the subsidies are the number of units, 130
3 units x \$65,000 a unit.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: How much
5 total?

6 RON SCHULMAN: \$10 million or so; I don't
7 have the facts and figures in front of me, but it's
8 all... everything that we propose is in front of.. it
9 conforms with the term sheets of the ELLA Program;
10 nothing's out of bounds, everything's right in the
11 program that is designed by HPD and HDC.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Great. Thank
13 you... [interpose]

14 LIN ZENG: And I'd like to add also --
15 Lin from HPD -- that 50% of the site is City-owned,
16 so you know, the City was able to kind of leverage
17 kind of that affordability and harness that
18 affordability because some of that property is City-
19 owned property, which is not always the case, and you
20 know, across the City, as you know, land is scarce.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Also takes a
22 Council Member such as Inez Barron to be there and
23 say 100% is doable and is possible, so thank you and
24 congratulations, Council Member.

25 [background comment]

2 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Thank you so much,
3 and before Council Member Barron has her final
4 statement to make, I wanted to add that what helps to
5 make any development affordable is when they're able
6 to get City-owned land for a dollar or less than...
7 much less than market; that's number one, because
8 when a developer pays for market, then that's gonna
9 automatically raise the cost of the development;
10 thereby the rents are gonna be higher and they
11 already owned, this developer already owned half of
12 the lots and then the other half they were able to
13 get from the City for a dollar, which severely helps
14 and the deep subsidies that are put in are not always
15 available because they're not funded every time from
16 HPD. I know you're smiling. So Council Member
17 Rodriguez, those are some of the things that help..

18 [crosstalk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: And but also
20 it takes, you know, some muscle from poli...

21 [crosstalk]

22 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Well it takes some
23 negotiating skill...

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: It takes...

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
2 CONCESSIONS

26

3 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: of the council
4 member also.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: It takes a lot
6 and it takes also a lot of political and you know, a
7 lot of... there's a lot of factors that... I can tell
8 you, we lost 14,000 units in the more regulated
9 apartments in the City [sic], in my district,
10 Community Board 12, and from 2000 to 2010, I lost
11 14,000 people and in the previous administration we
12 only received 250 affordable units, and it means,
13 that's why I congratulate this mayor, because for the
14 first time in my history in the community, not only
15 as a council member, we have a mayor that is paying
16 attention to Washington Heights, because you know,
17 it's not only about do we have the public site; do we
18 have the say HCD property in Inwood like in other
19 areas, no. But if we understand that we need to
20 build because we cannot continue just pushing people
21 out; that we need to continue doing magic because we
22 are hailing [sic] that he has shown in the Broadway
23 Housing, 135 and Riverside, 155 and Ashcon [sic] that
24 she has shown that it is possible to combine the tax
25 credit, the private, the governmental and the
goodwill of the people, say we can do affordable.

2 Again, I do support and say this mayor planned
3 discretionary, hoping that he will continue
4 increasing the affordable units, but I think this is
5 good news, because for me it's all about, as we will
6 continue building and no project would be 100%
7 affordable, when we find one of those that is 100%
8 affordable, it's a message that we need to show the
9 City saying, it is possible to balance a ball; the
10 ball that can be 50% affordable or that can be 40%
11 affordable or all that can 100% affordable. Thank
12 you... [crosstalk]

13 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Well thank... thank
14 you so much, Council Member for that political break.
15 Council Member Barron.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes, one
17 additional point. How many years are we looking at
18 for this; I didn't see it here and...

19 RON SCHULMAN: Yeah...

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I had... [crosstalk]

21 RON SCHULMAN: that's a good...

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: information and I
23 wanna make sure it's the same as what I have.

24

25

2 RON SCHULMAN: It is correct. Alright,
3 so this is affordable for 60 years, because we're...
4 [interpose]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: How many?

6 RON SCHULMAN: Sixty years, 60...
7 [interpose]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: 'Kay, say that
9 again?

10 [laughter, background comment]

11 RON SCHULMAN: six zero.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Sixty. Thank
13 you.

14 [background comments]

15 RON SCHULMAN: So this will receive a
16 420-c tax exemption which can go to 60-year...

17 [interpose]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay.

19 RON SCHULMAN: duration and that's what
20 the affordability will be. The way it works is that
21 we have a 30-year mortgage and then once it comes
22 due, then we'll come back, refinance it, do a
23 rehabilitation of the building and keep it
24 affordable.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
2 CONCESSIONS

29

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Great. Thank
4 you.

5 RON SCHULMAN: Yeah.

6 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Council Member
7 Barron, well while you're patting yourself on the
8 back, I'd like to know...

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: That you're gonna
10 upstage me; go ahead, go ahead.

11 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: No. I'd just like
12 to know about the community board vote and the
13 Borough President of Brooklyn, please.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: They both voted
15 in favor of this and again, it will be a set-aside
16 for Community Board 5; that they will have preference
17 as well, yeah.

18 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: And...

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I tried to get
20 into perpetuity, I did try, but I got 60... [crosstalk]

21 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: You tried
22 perpetuity?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yeah.

24 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Didn't make it
25 though... [crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Didn't make it.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
CONCESSIONS

30

2 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: but you made it for
3 60 years; that's awfully close... [crosstalk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yeah, that's
5 good; right.

6 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: And also, about the
7 New Lots; that... I saw a photograph and it was very
8 dark and desolate; that's the train station...
9 [crosstalk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yeah, the train
11 station; we are reaching out to Department of
12 Transportation and MTA to do some studies; we know
13 that that's a very desolate, dark area and it does
14 need a lot of upgrades; there is a project that has
15 identified, I think it's called -- I've forgotten
16 what it's called -- Under the Subway or something to
17 that effect... [interpose]

18 ARTIE PEARSON: Under the Elevated.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Under the
20 Elevator [sic] and we're trying to see if we can get
21 included in that so that they will devote some
22 attention to that area. And a few stop... well one
23 stop up, actually, is the connection between the L
24 Train and the No. 3 and it is in the capital budget
25 to make that an accessible station, so and reinstate

2 the free transfer between the L and the 3, which
3 existed some 35 years ago and for whatever reason was
4 closed, so it's already existing; we're looking to
5 see that it's upgraded and be established.

6 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Very good; thank
7 you so much. Are there any other members of the
8 public wanting to testify? Seeing none, I'm closing
9 the public hearing on this land use item and I'm now
10 putting the items up for a vote. I know for the
11 record that the application we are voting on today
12 has the full support of Council Member Barron and has
13 my support. I also want to acknowledge the hard work
14 that Council Member Barron put into it and Brian
15 Paul, I wanna extend a thank you to you for the work
16 that you put into it, because I know that to get this
17 type of deep subsidy took a lot of skill in
18 negotiating and I wanna thank HPD as well.

19 I will now call on counsel to call the
20 roll, please on Land Use Items 0325 and 0326.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair Dickens.

22 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: I vote aye.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member
24 Rodriguez.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
2 CONCESSIONS

32

3 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member
4 Treyger.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: With
6 congratulations to my colleague, Council Member
7 Barron and congratulations to the Chair again, I vote
8 aye.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: By a vote of 3 votes
10 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative and 0
11 abstentions, Land Use Nos. 0325 and 0326 are approved
12 and referred to the full Land Use Committee.

13 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: I want to thank the
14 members of the public, I wanna thank my colleagues
15 and my colleagues in this committee, the counsel and
16 the Land Use staff for attending today's hearing and
17 I'm going to leave the vote open for 15 minutes. I
18 wanna thank all that were here to testify and all
19 that attended today's hearing. Thank you.

20 [gavel]

21 RON SCHULMAN: Thank you. Thank you.

22 [background comments]

23 [pause]

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Cohen.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Abstain.

[background comments]

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
2 CONCESSIONS

33

2 [pause]

3 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: This concludes the
4 hearing of Planning, Dispositions and Concessions.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date January 13, 2016