COMMITTEE ON FINANCE CITY COUNCIL CITY OF NEW YORK -----Х TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES Of the COMMITTEE ON FINANCE ----- X November 21, 2024 Start: 10:40 a.m. Recess: 10:57 a.m. HELD AT: COMMITTEE ROOM - CITY HALL B E F O R E: Justin L. Brannan, Chairperson COUNCIL MEMBERS: Diana Ayala Gale A. Brewer Selvena N. Brooks-Powers David M. Carr Amanda Farías Kamillah M. Hanks Crystal Hudson Farrah N. Louis Francisco P. Moya Keith Powers Yusef Salaam Pierina Ana Sanchez Althea V. Stevens World Wide Dictation 545 Saw Mill River Road - Suite 2C, Ardsley, NY 10502

1

World Wide Dictation 545 Saw Mill River Road – Suite 2C, Ardsley, NY 10502 Phone: 914-964-8500 * 800-442-5993 * Fax: 914-964-8470 www.WorldWideDictation.com

| 2 | SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Mic check, mic check. |
|----|---|
| 3 | This is the mic check on the vote on Finance. Today's |
| 4 | date is November 21, 2024, in the Committee Room, |
| 5 | recorded by Walter Lewis. |
| 6 | SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Good morning. Welcome |
| 7 | to the New York City Council hearing vote on the |
| 8 | Committee on Finance. |
| 9 | At this time, please do not approach the |
| 10 | dais and silence all electronics. |
| 11 | Chair, you may begin. |
| 12 | CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Sergeant. |
| 13 | [GAVEL] Okay, good morning, and welcome to today's |
| 14 | Finance Committee meeting. I'm Council Member |
| 15 | Brannon. I have the privilege of Chairing the |
| 16 | Committee on Finance. We've been joined this morning |
| 17 | by Council Members Hudson, Salaam, Farías, Brewer, |
| 18 | Sanchez, Carr, Hanks, Stevens, Louis, and Ayala, and |
| 19 | on Zoom, we've been joined by Council Member Brooks- |
| 20 | Powers. |
| 21 | Today, our Committee will be voting on |
| 22 | eight items, six property tax exemption resolutions, |
| 23 | as well as Intros 557-B and 981-A. |
| 24 | The first two exemption resolutions are |
| 25 | for new partial 40-year Article XI exemptions for |
| | |

preservation of one building each in Council Member 2 3 Avilés' District. Both buildings are affordable housing developments for very low-income elderly and 4 disabled people, undergoing conversions to HUD's 5 Rental Assistance Demonstration, or the RAD program. 6 7 As part of the exemption, each building will enter into a regulatory agreement with HPD, which caps 8 9 household incomes at 50 percent AMI, set aside 30 percent of units for homeless tenants, and provide 10 11 light-touch retention and stabilization services, as well as complete identified immediate and short-term 12 13 capital repairs.

14 The next exemption is for a new full 40-15 year Article XI for preservation of one affordable senior housing rental building in Council Member 16 17 Brewer's District. As a condition of the exemption, 18 the building will enter into an HPD regulatory 19 agreement, capping unit incomes at 50 percent AMI, 20 will set aside 25 units for homeless tenants, and 21 reserve the remaining units for seniors. On-site 2.2 social services and aging-in-place programming will 23 also be offered.

24 The fourth exemption is a new full 40-25 year Article XI for preservation of 114 rental

| 2 | buildings in Council Member Riley's District. As a |
|----|---|
| 3 | condition of receiving the exemption, the project |
| 4 | will enter into an HPD regulatory agreement that will |
| 5 | require a minimum 15 percent set-aside for homeless |
| 6 | tenants and restrict rents. Identified short-term and |
| 7 | critical need repairs will also be completed. |
| 8 | The fifth exemption is a new partial 40- |
| 9 | year Article XI for preservation of one rental |
| 10 | building in Council Member Abreu's District. As a |
| 11 | condition of receiving the exemption, the building |
| 12 | will complete identified short-term and critical need |
| 13 | repairs, as well as enter into a 40-year HPD |
| 14 | regulatory agreement which would set aside 15 percent |
| 15 | of units for homeless tenants and participate in |
| 16 | HPD's Aging-In-Place Initiatives imposing rent |
| 17 | restrictions. |
| 18 | The final exemption today is a new |

19 partial 40-year Article XI for preservation of one 20 rental building in Council Member Salaam's District. 21 As a condition of receiving the exemption, the 22 building will complete identified short-term and 23 critical need repairs and enter into a 40-year HPD 24 regulatory agreement which sets aside 15 percent of 25 units for homeless tenants, participating in the

2 HPD's Aging-In-Place Initiative, and imposing rent 3 restrictions.

Finally, the two bills, 557-B, sponsored 4 5 by Council Member Brewer, would require the New York City Office of Technology and Innovation to create a 6 7 specific 3-1-1 category for the public to file complaints related to unlicensed cannabis retailers. 8 9 Intro. 981-A, also sponsored by Council Member Brewer, would update existing reporting on the 10 11 City's inspection and enforcement of unlicensed sellers of cigarettes, e-cigarettes, tobacco 12 13 products, and illicit cannabis. This update will

14 involve reporting related to the new enforcement 15 actions local authorities may make under state 16 cannabis law and provide increased details on the 17 outcomes of each inspection that's been conducted by 18 City agencies.

19 I'd like now to recognize Council Member20 Brewer for remarks on her bills.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you very 22 much. As you indicated, 557 collects the details of 23 unlicensed cannabis store complaints and sends them 24 to the Sheriff's Office. Right now, you call 3-1-1. 25 You don't collect it. It just goes to the Sheriff's

2 Office and nobody knows the data. So that's what 557-3 B is all about.

6

4 981-A requires reporting relating to the expanded local authority to conduct enforcement 5 actions and increase details on the outcomes of each 6 7 inspection. We know how important Operation Padlock to Protect is, to the credit of the Sheriff, and it's 8 9 an example of building the plane while flying it. Some essentials were missed, such as public reporting 10 11 on enforcement activity and creating, as I said 12 earlier, a proper 3-1-1 complaint system, which the 13 public needs. The Sheriff has done a great job 14 sealing stores since the start of Operation Padlock 15 to Protect in May and that enforcement will continue 16 indefinitely, but we need two things, ongoing support 17 from OMB and enhancement to the enforcement process. 18 As I indicated earlier, right now, if you call 3-1-1, 19 the operator directs you to leave a voicemail for the 20 Sheriff or send an email. There's no followup and 21 there's no tracking. So, the existing reporting 2.2 requirements were created prior to Operation Padlock 23 to Protect and are no longer adequate for this 24 reason.

| 2 | I certainly want to thank all the amazing |
|----|---|
| 3 | Staff Members who participated. I'll list them later |
| 4 | when we speak, particularly Sam Goldsmith from my |
| 5 | office. |
| 6 | Also, do I talk about Land Use now, or |
| 7 | wait? |
| 8 | Okay, so the Chair mentioned a building |
| 9 | in my District for a 40-year Article XI tax |
| 10 | exemption. This is a building now owned by WSSP. It's |
| 11 | basically an organization that supports affordable |
| 12 | housing for seniors, and this particular building is |
| 13 | landmarked. This particular building had women in it |
| 14 | for many years in terms of, not affordable, but a |
| 15 | place that women could go to be safe over the years. |
| 16 | It was originally built by the Vanderbilts many, many |
| 17 | years ago, and it's very exciting that it will be |
| 18 | converted with its beautiful architecture inside and |
| 19 | outside for affordable housing, and so thank you very |
| 20 | much. |
| 21 | CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Council |
| 22 | Member. |
| 23 | Do any of my Colleagues have any remarks? |
| 24 | Okay, seeing none, I will now ask Billy |
| 25 | Martin, the Committee Clerk, to call the roll. |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 8 |
|-----|---|
| 2 | COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Good |
| 3 | morning. William Martin, Committee Clerk. Roll call |
| 4 | vote Committee on Finance. All items are coupled. |
| 5 | Chair Brannan. |
| 6 | CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: I vote aye. |
| 7 | COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Ayala. |
| 8 | COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye. |
| 9 | COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Moya. |
| 10 | COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: (INAUDIBLE) |
| 11 | COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Powers. |
| 12 | Louis. |
| 13 | COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Aye. |
| 14 | COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Brooks- |
| 15 | Powers. |
| 16 | COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: (INAUDIBLE) |
| 17 | COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Brewer. |
| 18 | COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Aye. |
| 19 | COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Farías. |
| 20 | COUNCIL MEMBER FARÍAS: I vote aye. |
| 21 | COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Hanks. |
| 22 | COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: I vote aye. |
| 23 | COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Hudson. |
| 24 | COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Aye. |
| 0 F | |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 9 |
|----|---|
| 2 | COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Ossé. |
| 3 | Sanchez. |
| 4 | COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Aye. |
| 5 | COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Stevens. |
| 6 | COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Aye. |
| 7 | COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Williams. |
| 8 | Won. Salaam. |
| 9 | COUNCIL MEMBER SALAAM: I vote aye. |
| 10 | COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Carr. |
| 11 | COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: With congratulations |
| 12 | to Council Member Brewer, I vote aye. |
| 13 | COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Powers. |
| 14 | COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: I vote aye. |
| 15 | COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: With a |
| 16 | vote of 12 in the affirmative, zero in the negative, |
| 17 | and no abstentions, all items have been adopted by |
| 18 | the Committee. |
| 19 | CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, we're going to |
| 20 | leave it open, but you guys can go. Thank you. |
| 21 | COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Council |
| 22 | Member Brooks-Powers? |
| 23 | COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Aye. |
| 24 | COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank |
| 25 | you, Council Member. Current vote in the Committee on |

| 1 | COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 10 |
|----|--|
| 2 | Finance is now 13 in the affirmative, zero in the |
| 3 | negative, and no abstentions. |
| 4 | Thank you, Finance Members. Thank you. |
| 5 | The vote is still open. |
| 6 | Continuation of the vote in the Committee |
| 7 | on Finance. Council Member Moya. |
| 8 | COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: I vote aye. |
| 9 | COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank |
| 10 | you. The vote is currently at 14 in the affirmative. |
| 11 | Council Member Brewer to close. |
| 12 | COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Hearing is |
| 13 | adjourned. [GAVEL] |
| 14 | |
| 15 | |
| 16 | |
| 17 | |
| 18 | |
| 19 | |
| 20 | |
| 21 | |
| 22 | |
| 23 | |
| 24 | |
| 25 | |
| ļ | |

CERTIFICATE

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date November 22, 2024