CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

------------------------ X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

           Of the

COMMITTEE ON TECHNOLOGY

------------------------ X

                     April 18, 2018
                     Start: 1:10 p.m.
                     Recess: 3:03 p.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room – 16th Floor

B E F O R E: PETER A. KOO
                  Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:
                  Robert F. Holden
                  Brad S. Lander
                  Eric A. Ulrich
                  Kalman Yeger

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Michael Pastor
General Counsel
Department of Information Technology and
Telecommunications

Anne Koenig
Senior Director of Public Communications
Structures
Department of Information Technology and
Telecommunications

Jennifer Hensley
President
LinkNYC for Intersection

Ruth Fastil
LinkNYC

Julian Baha
LinkNYC

Taline Santisere
Policy Director
TechNYC

Angela Pinsky
Executive Director
Association for a Better New York

Noel Hidalgo
Executive Director
BetaNYC

Alex Glazebrook

Director of Training and Technology
Older Adults Technology Services and
Senior Planet

Christopher Mendoza
Head of Government Affairs
C4Q

Greg Mays
Executive Director
A Better Jamaica

Andy Penny
ZenFi

2   DANE HOPE: Mike test, 1, 2, 1, 2.

3 Today's date is April 18, 2018. Today's hearing is

4 on Technology and it's being recorded by Dane Hope.

5   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Good morning, uh, good

6 afternoon, yeah. My name is Peter Koo and I am the

7 chair of the Committee on Technology. We're here

8 today to discuss the progress, challenges and future

9 of Link NYC. LinkNYC is a communications network

10 owned and operated by CityBridge, a consortium of

11 companies that receive a franchise for our City, with

12 New York City, to replace all of the City's public

13 pay phones with 55 kiosks. These kiosks also known

14 as the Links, don't just provide free telephone, I'm

15 sorry, provide free wireless internet. These have

16 numerous features including USB charging hubs, the

17 ability to make free local calls, digital ad space to

18 showcase community events and in past [Inaudible]

19 location information for nearby MTA buses. These

20 Links come at low cost to the City. The franchise

21 agreement also establishes a fee schedule by which

22 the City is expected to receive revenues from LinkNYC

23 that would total over $500 million for the initial

24 term of franchise. This Committee acknowledges the

25 potential of the LinkNYC program but we must also

2 address its challenges. LinkNYC has faced

3 installation delays and limited installation in

4 Bronx, Brooklyn and Queens and Staten Island. News

5 reports state that some delays have been caused by

6 lawsuits and citing issues and in communities like

7 mine in Flushing, Queens, there are no Links

8 available. This is in stark contrast to Manhattan

9 with way over 900 Links are installed. In response

10 to the limited distribution throughout the five

11 boroughs, the City proposed an amendment to the

12 franchise on April 16, 2018, that adjusts the

13 schedule of Link installation. The proposed

14 agreement specifies an annual number of Links

15 required in each borough. Further, it will require

16 CityBridge to replace 5,000 public pay phones by

17 2028. This extends the initial terms for two years

18 and will call for 2,500 fewer Links. In addition to

19 installation charges, advocates have been concerned

20 about privacy issues related to the Links important

21 to their collection of data and facing video cameras.

22 The New York City civil liberties union called for

23 changes to the LinkNYC privacy policy to address

24 these issues. In response LinkNYC updated their

25 privacy policy and added limitations on how Links

2   used the cameras. We look forward to hearing from

3   the administration and CityBridge on the current

4   state of the LinkNYC program and how the updated

5   franchise agreement can improve the rollout of the

6   program moving forward. We also look forward to

7   hearing from advocates on their experiences with

8   LinkNYC. With that, I call on the administration to

9   testify but before that I want to acknowledge the

10   persons of Council Member Bob Holden on our Committee

11   so Erin[phonetic], I'd like to ask our counsel to

12   swear the administration in here.

13   COUNSEL: Please raise your right hand.

14   Do you swear or affirm to tell the truth and to

15   answer truthfully to Council Member questions.

16   MICHAEL PASTORE: I do.

17   COUNSEL: You may proceed.

18   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you.

19   MICHAEL PASTORE: Good afternoon, Chair

20   Koo and members of the Committee on Technology. My

21   name is Michael Pastor and I'm the General Counsel to

22   the Department of Information Technology and

23   Telecommunications known to all as DoIIT. Seated with

24   me today is Anne Koenig, Senior Director of Public

25   Communications Structures. We are pleased to update

2   the Committee today about LinkNYC the City's

3   pioneering effort to build a network of free Wi-Fi

4   kiosks across the five boroughs at zero cost to

5   taxpayers. As of today, over 3.7 million subscribers

6   have taken advantage of the super-fast Wi-Fi at over

7   1,500 live kiosks Citywide. When fully built out,

8   LinkNYC will be comprised of at least 7,500 kiosks

9   making it the largest, fastest, free municipal Wi-Fi

10   network in the world. The program is already a

11   cornerstone of Mayor de Blasio's goal to provide

12   affordable, reliable, high speed broadband to New

13   York City's residents and businesses by 2025. Our

14   collaboration with our franchisee, CityBridge, in

15   addition to feedback and support from stakeholders

16   across the City, including the City Council, continue

17   to make this project successful. DoITT oversees

18   LinkNYC which is made through a franchise to replace

19   New York City's outdated pay phone infrastructure

20   with gigabit speed Wi-Fi kiosks. Link's offer

21   several other free services beyond Wi-Fi including

22   free nationwide calling, direct access to 911, mobile

23   device charging and a tablet interface that allows

24   users to connect with 311, social services, transit

25   information, way finding and more. These services

2 are completely free because the advertising on the

3 LinkNYC kiosks sustains and funds the entire project

4 ensuring that taxpayers aren't paying a dime for any

5 of these benefits. In fact, this program is revenue

6 positive guaranteeing a minimum of more than $500

7 million in revenue to the City over the course of the

8 franchise. Currently LinkNYC is in year three of

9 construction. Citywide there are 17,047 LinkNYC

10 kiosks installed, 1,508 of which are active. We have

11 made it a priority to ensure that the public can

12 track deployment which is why we made locations of

13 kiosks both active and in the pipeline via datasets

14 and maps on the City's open data portal. I'm also

15 happy to announce that DoITT and CityBridge with the

16 support of Council Member Kallos and Chair Koo will

17 be making more information available on NYC Open

18 Data. Very shortly after Commissioner Saini's

19 arrival to DoITT in February, he prioritized his work

20 conveying how important it is that New Yorkers are

21 able to track in near real time the location and

22 status of every LinkNYC kiosk. We are grateful to

23 Council Member Kallos for his advocacy in this space

24 and we look forward to getting this information in

25 the hands of New Yorkers. The Open Data portal is

2 only one of many outreach tools we have been using to

3 communicate with New Yorkers about the program. Per

4 an agreement with the five borough presidents, DoITT

5 and CityBridge have been proactively seeking comments

6 from local stakeholders on proposed new LinkNYC kiosk

7 locations. These are locations that are not

8 replacing pay phones. This process includes a notice

9 of proposed kiosk to Community Boards, Council

10 Members, Borough Presidents and BIDs for a 60 day

11 comment period. In many cases this extra step has

12 been tremendously useful for both DoITT and

13 CityBridge to gain local insight as Links are being

14 deployed. This is especially true outside of

15 Manhattan where there has historically always been a

16 smaller pay phone footprint. Our community outreach

17 has also been helpful to get the word out because

18 LinkNYC will only be successful if the public fully

19 makes use of it. We've already seen widespread

20 adoption of all the services available on the kiosks

21 and the usage will only increase as more are

22 installed and activated. As of today, 3.7 million

23 subscribers has initiated 722 million Wi-Fi sessions,

24 consuming a total of 4,728 terabytes of data

25 cumulatively. For perspective, this amounts to

2   approximately 2.3 million New Yorker's typical

3   monthly 2 gigabyte per month data plan and I'd like

4   to mention that all of this use will soon become an

5   even more secure experience thanks to the commitment

6   we recently got from CityBridge to use a domain name

7   server platform recommended by the New York City

8   cyber command. It is not just a Wi-Fi that residents

9   and users are using. In the first quarter of this

10 year alone, users placed over 9,100 911 calls and

11 more than one million non-911 calls. They are also

12 taking advantage of relevant content on the tablet,

13 interacting with the 311 function over 17,000 times

14 and using the Aunt Bertha app which connects users

15 with local social services approximately 15,700

16 times. Just last week we were proud to have

17 supported the New York City Council's participatory

18 budgeting efforts by allowing constituents to vote

19 for projects in their districts directly on the

20 tablet. Voters took advantage of this function over

21 5,000 times in just seven days. We're proud that

22 LinkNYC is built upon technology that allows the City

23 to consistently find new and innovative ways to make

24 Links true digital public service assistance, ready

25 and able to deliver New Yorkers information they

2 need. Citywide New Yorkers are seeing city wide's

3 effort for weather efforts, breaking news alerts and

4 emergency messaging via Links. We've expanded

5 interactive services, offering residents the

6 opportunity to enroll in health care, find their

7 polling place and more and on a hyper local level

8 over the past years Links have featured Community

9 Board websites on the tablet promoting full Community

10 Board meetings and local small businesses on the ad

11 screens and introduced more useful real time

12 information such as transit status. In fact, we were

13 extremely pleased to work with Council Member Lander

14 and Chair Koo earlier this month to announce the

15 addition of real time bus information on all Links

16 within .3 miles of a bus stop into the suite of

17 useful content that the ad screens have to offer. I

18 should note that this is all in addition to the 5% of

19 advertising reserved for mayoral agencies. Just a

20 few examples of some those public service

21 announcements that have run on Links recently include

22 DOT's Vision Zero Created, FDNY's Recruitment

23 Campaign and DoITT's own Open Data week fun facts.

24 We welcome any other ideas from the Council and would

25 be more than happy to work with you to get more

2   interesting and useful information to New Yorkers via

3   LinkNYC. As I discussed throughout my testimony

4   today, the services LinkNYC offers and the revenue

5   the program generates are extremely to DoITT and the

6   administration and to New Yorkers at large. It has

7   become a ubiquitous component of our great City's

8   streetscape and its continued success is our

9   priority. That's why in partnership with CityBridge,

10 we are proposing amendments, the franchise agreement,

11 to the Franchise and Concession Review Committee. As

12 of April 16, these amendments are public record and

13 we plan to submit the amendments to the FCRC on

14 May 7. These amendments do not affect the two most

15 important pillars of the program, the number of

16 kiosks built both Citywide and per borough and the

17 guaranteed revenue it generates for the City which

18 remains by contract to be in excess of half a billion

19 dollars over the life of the franchise. Under the

20 proposed amendments, kiosk rollouts would adjust

21 somewhat allowing ten, rather than eight years with

22 amended yearly targets. Additionally, the amendments

23 would allow the franchise more flexibility to site

24 kiosks replacing pay phones which could help the City

25 further its goal of equitable distribution in all

2 five boroughs. These adjusted citing requirements

3 would continue to be subject to DoITT's oversight and

4 approval. The amendments will also allow CityBridge

5 to delay some revenue payments above the annual

6 guarantee in the next few years with repayment to the

7 City above the guarantee plus 10% interest. With

8 these modest concessions in return, DoITT would

9 require CityBridge to provide a more detailed, long-

10 term plan for rollout over the course of the entire

11 franchise as opposed to year to year plans currently

12 required. Most importantly, we fought for as much

13 equity as possible within the boroughs insuring that

14 each community district will have at least as many

15 Links as there were pay phones. As franchise

16 administrators, the decision to propose amendments

17 was not taken lightly. The proposal takes into

18 account lessons learned and unforeseen circumstances

19 confronted over the first two years of this first of

20 its kind initiative. I anticipate that CityBridge

21 will explain in more detail during their portion of

22 the testimony. Thank you all for giving us the

23 opportunity to testify before the Committee today.

24 We look forward to continuing our work with this

25 Committee and Chair Koo to bring LinkNYC to even more

2 New Yorkers and visitors. We welcome your feedback

3 and we are happy to answer your questions.

4   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you. We are also

5 joined by Council Member Lander and Council Member

6 Yeger. Thank you for coming.

7   MICHAEL PASTOR: Glad to be here.

8   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So I will ask a few

9 questions. You also have a testimony?

10   ANNE KOENIG: Oh, no, no. Thank you.

11   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So what is the overall

12 timeline for when the Link kiosk will be installed

13 throughout the City?

14   MICHAEL PASTOR: The overall timeline

15 pursuant to the amendments we propose would be a ten

16 year rollout for 75 kiosks throughout the City so

17 that will be full completion in all five boroughs,

18 7,500 kiosks Citywide by 2025.

19   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Okay, and how many

20 Links will be installed by the end of 2000, fiscal

21 year 2018 and how many of these Links will be

22 operational by the end of fiscal 2018?

23   ANNE KOENIG: By the end of, actually we

24 go by calendar year, I'm sorry, franchise term year

25

2 which ends July 21 rather than July 1 and at the end

3 of that time there will be 653 active Link kiosks.

4   MICHAEL PASTOR: For just this year but

5 the total, the total by this July?

6   ANNE KOENIG: 1,653 active.

7   MICHAEL PASTOR: That's 1,653, there you

8 go.

9   ANNE KOENIG: We're at a little over

10 1,500 now, 1,653 by July 21.

11   CHAIRPERSON KOO: My understanding is

12 that one of the reasons for the amendment was to

13 provide timelines for the Links at division pauses.

14 I also learned that it takes a lot longer for Links

15 to be installed and activated in Queens, Brooklyn and

16 Staten Island, sometimes double the amount of the

17 time than those installed in Manhattan and Bronx so

18 is there a reason why the timeline is so different?

19   MICHAEL PASTOR: So if I could start by

20 saying Council Member Koo, it's our top priority that

21 these Links are active and that they're everywhere.

22 That's what we've been focusing on to date and that's

23 what we focus as part of the amendment. I think, to

24 answer your question, what really this comes down to

25 is lesson learned about a first of its kind program

2 and what we're proposing with CityBridge is an

3 amendment that reflects sort of more of a reality as

4 to how long it takes to get this done but I think

5 that one of the thing that is included in the

6 amendment that we at DoITT are really excited about

7 is a firmer requirement to have a full build-out

8 schedule for the ten year period so if the amendment

9 is approved by the FCRC, CityBridge will prepare a

10 build-out schedule which will show street corridors

11 throughout the City, not just in Manhattan,

12 everywhere and it will give us a picture of where

13 they're gonna go over the remaining seven years and

14 in addition the amendment has a requirement that each

15 year CityBridge actually propose the specific sites

16 so what we're gonna have is a lot more daylight into,

17 for each year and where the kiosks are gonna actually

18 go and then daylight into sort of where they'll be

19 when all is said and done.

20   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Okay, so what is the

21 minimum revenue that the City will receive?

22   MICHAEL PASTOR: It's over $500 million.

23   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So are there any

24 reasoning why this number may change over time, no?

25

2   MICHAEL PASTOR: No, none whatsoever and

3 I should just point out Council Member Koo that in

4 addition to it being a program that is of no cost to

5 the taxpayers, it's a revenue generating program but

6 it's also a program where CityBridge is obligated to

7 bear all costs so I think it's worth noting that it's

8 not only revenue to the City but you have a

9 franchisee that is bearing the cost throughout the

10 program and City taxpayers don't pay anything.

11   ANNE KOENIG: Also worth noting that's

12 upwards of $500 million minimum but it could be more.

13   MICHAEL PASTOR: Correct.

14   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Okay, but except I have

15 a strong belief that nothing is free, you know.

16 There's a cost.

17   MICHAEL PASTOR: [Laughter] This is as

18 close as you can get, believe it or not but.

19   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Because uh, in the

20 future, all these advertisements will modify our

21 behavior, you know, and we'll buy more stuff, buy

22 less stuff or do this or do that, you know, so those

23 are the costs for our constituents.

24   MICHAEL PASTOR: Fair enough.

25

2   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So what are your most

3   significant challenges to installing and activating

4   the Links according to the City targets and how are

5   you addressing them?

6   MICHAEL PASTOR: So I'll speak to that

7   briefly and I think that CityBridge will certainly

8   speak to this as part of their testimony. I think

9   one of the challenges has been that sites where pay

10   phones are now turn out not to be viable, either

11   because they don't meet a siting requirement. To

12   give one example, the structures weigh a great deal

13   more than phones so if they're located over a vault,

14   you could have a phone on there but you can't have a

15   kiosk so there was a site you would have had a

16   replacement. I think one of the other challenges has

17   been conduit in terms of, you know, CityBridge is

18   actually via a contract, laying new fiber for much of

19   what it does and in order to lay the fiber you need

20   viable conduit. I'm gonna add a few further.

21   ANNE KOENIG: There, there, there're a

22   number of challenges. There's utility coordination

23   is another issue that may not stand in the way of

24   Link being ultimately installed but it does take

25   time. Every Link has to be connected to power and it

2 has to be connected to information via high speed

3 telecommunication's fiber and that means that

4 CityBridge can't do this alone. They need to depend

5 on their fiber provider and the power provider which

6 in most cases is ConEd all working together.

7 CHAIRPERSON KOO: Okay, so, so can you

8 tell us what is the average amount of time it takes

9 to activate kiosks after they are installed and what

10 is the process for activation?

11 ANNE KOENIG: So actually the timeframe

12 between installation and activation is something that

13 we are not entirely happy with and something that we

14 are working with CityBridge to change. In fact, it's

15 one of the items that's addressed in the proposed

16 amendment to the Franchise and Concession Review

17 Committee. There is quite a bit of work that has to

18 be done between installation and activation because

19 of these two connections in the manhole and that

20 requires ConEd actually coming to the site and the

21 fiber provider coming to the site and doing this

22 connection in the manhole followed by smoke testing

23 which is the final test of the unit and then turning

24 on the unit. Under the proposed amendment, that

25 timeframe would be limited to 45 days.

2   MICHAEL PASTOR: If I could just add to

3   that, you know, a lot of the time spent to now, Chair

4   Koo, has been on the rollout, sort of getting Links

5   out as much as we can. I think with the arrival of a

6   new DoITT Commissioner just a few months ago and

7   there's a new Assistant Commissioner for Franchise

8   who wasn't able to join us today, I think we're

9   turning, we're not losing focus on going everywhere

10   but we're turning our focus to sort of the health of

11   the program and your question there goes to that. I

12   mean if you have a Link in the ground but it's not

13   activated, well that's a disappointment to a person

14   on the street. They don't understand. I just passed

15   one actually last night so that's something we're

16   focusing on and I think that as I mentioned, I think

17   we're thinking more, it's not just about getting

18   everywhere but sort of making sure that they're

19   activated quickly and worthwhile.

20   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you, yeah. As I

21   mentioned, in my opening statement there is a

22   proportionate number of LinkNYC kiosks in Manhattan

23   compared to the other boroughs. Even after the full

24   rollout of the agreement, Manhattan will have over

25   three times the number of kiosks as Queens so how

2 does DoITT envision the Links between, the Links

3 being distributed geographically over the division of

4 the franchise?

5   MICHAEL PASTOR: So two answers, Chairman

6 Koo, and actually both answers relate to the proposed

7 amendment. Number 1, the build-out schedule plan

8 which we are requiring from CityBridge is gonna give

9 us a real good sense to go to that very point.

10 Number 2, we've added a proposed change that will

11 require that the number of structures at the end of

12 the day in every community district be the same or

13 more, if you have pay phone in the community district

14 now, you'll have the same number of structures or

15 more so that's kind of like an equity enforcement

16 mechanism that is new and I think represents our

17 interest which we share with the Council with these

18 Links being ubiquitous and being everywhere. I think

19 with that said, the constraint in part is that the

20 pay phone footprint is heavily in Manhattan and so in

21 part some of the number disparity you're seeing there

22 relates to the fact that it is a pay phone

23 replacement program but we really are focused on

24 equity. We have been and as part of this proposal

25 are focused on it as well.

2   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So can we have a

3 breakdown of the number of kiosks by borough and by

4 City Council districts?

5   ANNE KOENIG: The number of kiosks under

6 the proposed amendment will be exactly the same per

7 borough as in the original agreement. As Michael

8 said, in addition to those borough targets, there

9 will now be community district targets and after the

10 hearing we can share Council district by Council

11 district breakdown of what's been installed so far

12 and activated. We have that.

13   CHAIRPERSON KOO: And when will the other

14 boroughs get their fair share of the Links, no,

15 because by population, Manhattan has the least

16 population. I mean, they may have more tourists but

17 borough of Brooklyn and Queens has more population

18 but we have the least LinkNYC's, you know.

19   ANNE KOENIG: As Michael said, this was

20 conceived as a pay phone replacement program and also

21 it was conceived as something that would serve

22 heavily commercial districts as well as districts

23 with a lot of foot traffic. Of course, most of the

24 commercial districts in New York City are

25 concentrated in Manhattan so by design there are more

2   structures slated for Manhattan. However, in

3   commercial district in other parts of the City, such

4   as downtown Brooklyn, Long Island City and Downtown

5   Flushing as well, there will be significant numbers

6   of LinkNYC kiosks. Downtown Flushing I can say right

7   now has 30 replacements of public pay telephones in

8   progress and 8 new sights under review. We recently,

9   at a Community Board 7 meeting, presented that so the

10   other boroughs will not be left out. Commercial

11   districts primarily are being served and every

12   community district will be served in some way.

13   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So when will downtown

14   Flushing have its first kiosk? Can you give me an

15   estimate? I haven't seen that yet.

16   ANNE KOENIG: I am going to leave that

17   question to CityBridge because the installation is

18   directly in their hands but definitely you can raise

19   that with them. I know they're in progress which

20   means that they're in the pipeline, they're coming.

21   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So give me a

22   [Inaudible], downtown Flushing is the second most

23   busy pedestrian district in the whole City, no, and

24   I'm surprised that we don't have any LinkNYC's

25   kiosks.

2   ANNE KOENIG: So in an ideal world, we

3   would make all the Links appear all at once. They

4   would spring up but there are certain installation

5   challenges that are connected with this. As I

6   mentioned before, every kiosk needs to be connected

7   to both electric power and more significantly high

8   speed fiber optic cable. The high speed fiber optic

9   cable is being installed from scratch by CityBridge

10 and its affiliates and it needs to all connect to a

11 hub so when you look at the map of deployment, what's

12 actually happening is things are starting from a

13 central point and radiating outward and that's what

14 drives the deployment timeline and the pattern of

15 deployment. Flushing as I said is, is in the works

16 but it will take a while for these branches to

17 radiate out to every location. As Michael said, one

18 of the things, one of the most important things for

19 us in this amendment is a full build-out plan where

20 we will be able to say at any given time, well, that

21 street is slated for this year, particular year so

22 there will be more predictability but it is a 10 year

23 build out. That's just how long it's gonna take.

24   MICHAEL PASTOR: If I can, just may add,

25 Chair Koo, the picture you just, this is something

2 that sort of we think about on a daily basis sort of

3 where, where would a Link be most valuable and I

4 think one other thing I wanted to point out about the

5 amendment that we think will be good is that again,

6 the total number unchanged but under the proposal we

7 have, there are gonna more new locations and what

8 that means is we'll be less tethered to the pay phone

9 footprint and more able to look at maps and say okay,

10 no pay phone here but look at the map, tons of foot

11 traffic. It'd be a good place for a Link and that

12 will be a chance for Council Members and Community

13 Board Members to say hey, why don't we do a Link

14 there. I think we're really both open to feedback

15 about, I mean, you all know your communities better

16 than we do and so hearing from you saying this makes

17 sense. It's something we're, Anne's always open to

18 that as am I, and so but I think we just completely

19 share that and I think that that's why we're all so

20 proud of the community district minimum requirement

21 that would be in the amendment so we know that we're

22 gonna be in every community district the way we would

23 have been had we followed the phone footprint.

24   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Also, when you, every

25 borough where you have a site plan or every kind of

2   district, you have a site plan to where you are going

3   to install all the kiosks, will you be sharing the

4   data with each Council Member before they installed

5   or because this is the reason why? I mean your site

6   plan maybe a few years old, right, no? Demographics

7   change, like Flushing downtown has been being more,

8   much more busy now than a few years ago.

9   MICHAEL PASTOR: Yeah, to answer your

10   question, Chair.

11   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Original sites may not

12   be ideal because of the traffic, the pedestrian

13   traffic so it's not good if you want to install at a

14   corner here. You'll block the traffic of the

15   pedestrian traffic, not the vehicular traffic so we

16   need to communicate, yeah, so how does CityBridge do

17   it and CityBridge evaluate these sites to address the

18   rapid population change since site, yeah?

19   ANNE KOENIG: It's actually a very good

20   point. What the amendment requires is that

21   CityBridge would put together as I said, a year by

22   year full build-out plan but every year, well first

23   of all that plan would call for corridors, not

24   particular points because as you said, conditions

25   change. Every year we would take a fresh look at

2 that and make any adjustments that are necessary and

3 as time progresses, kind of you move from the big

4 picture down to the detailed picture so before any

5 individual site is installed, CityBridge presents a

6 detailed plan of that particular location and DoITT

7 reviews it to make sure that it complies with very

8 detailed siting criteria that are designed to ensure

9 the smooth flow of pedestrian traffic to prevent

10 obstruction of vehicular site lines and make sure

11 that there are proper clearances from other types of

12 street furniture and sidewalk installation so we do a

13 very careful review site by site. Every site must be

14 approved by DoITT and we make sure that the

15 information that we have is up to date.

16 CHAIRPERSON KOO: So, so, so you will

17 data with all kinds of members and kinds of members

18 can object to some sites, right? Their input, say

19 this site is no good because of it was near the

20 school because we don't want the school kids to hang

21 around there too long or because of too much

22 pedestrian traffic so you would take input from our

23 local Council Members.

24 MICHAEL PASTOR: Definitely.

25 ANNE KOENIG: We love to get input.

2   MICHAEL PASTOR: Yes.

3   ANNE KOENIG: In relation to existing pay

4 phone sites, in order to keep this program moving,

5 where there's an existing pay phone, CityBridge can

6 install it. Where there's a new site, we reach out

7 and get input from Council Member and the Community

8 Board and local business in approving district if

9 there is one.

10   MICHAEL PASTOR: The benefit of the

11 build-out program as well is that's some thinking we

12 can be doing about timing too so for example, if we

13 have a seven year plan but you all know, this is the

14 most urgent spot, that feedback would be vital for us

15 to know. It's good to have a seven year plan but

16 this year this is where you should go and we would

17 want to know that.

18   ANNE KOENIG: And if you see a pay phone

19 and you think oh, that's a terrible location for a

20 Link, let us know now.

21   MICHAEL PASTOR: Definitely.

22   ANNE KOENIG: Because every pay phone is

23 a potential Link site.

24   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you, yeah, so

25 Council Member Holden wants to ask you a question.

2   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you,

3 Mr. Pastor for your testimony. It's a great, sounds

4 like a great program. I think I have five in my

5 district, 30 in Queens. We have two, I think on the

6 northern end of Queens Boulevard, and I think three

7 on Jamaica Avenue. I don't know if they're all

8 working though but it's a start but it's a large

9 district and I wouldn't have, you know, they're on

10 the southern most and the northern most part of my

11 district which I'd rather have also in many of the,

12 and I'm sure that we're gonna get them eventually.

13 Can you, can you talk about, obviously the Council

14 Members can actually suggest areas and now we're

15 leaving the footprint of the telephones now. We're

16 not tethered to that you said?

17   MICHAEL PASTOR: No, not entirely

18 tethered. Yeah, we're gonna be less tethered to it.

19   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Not entirely but,

20 okay so could they be put in parks or a green streets

21 area. Is that possible?

22   MICHAEL PASTOR: So there are some, there

23 are some restrictions as to where they can go and

24 they're, right now I believe only permitted in

25 commercial districts or overlays so I think, I don't

2   have a ready answer for you on parks but I think

3   right now the way the program is structured is

4   commercial district or overlays and not, not actually

5   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Why is that? Is

6   that just the original plan and the commercial? It's

7   not, because certainly at bus stops where people are,

8   have some waiting time, that would be nice rather

9   than just in a commercial district that's busy and

10   then, you know, people just gonna hook up.

11   MICHAEL PASTOR: Yeah.

12   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: So I would think

13   a waiting area.

14   MICHAEL PASTOR: Yeah, so totally share

15   that, share that view and I veered off into your

16   question about parks but bringing it back to bus

17   shelters, I think we totally share the belief that

18   bus shelters are a great place to have Links nearby.

19   They're waiting and why use your own cell data if you

20   can use the free Wi-Fi to connect.

21   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: And just to get

22   information on a bus coming or not, yeah.

23   ANNE KOENIG: Just to, under the existing

24   siting criteria, bus stops are off limits and under

25   this amendment, Links would be allowed towards the

2   back of a bus stop but there still would be

3   sufficient clearance from a bus stop shelter to

4   ensure that there wouldn't be conflict in the

5   advertising and also that there's free flow of

6   pedestrian traffic.

7   MICHAEL PASTOR: And close enough that

8   you could step over, charge your phone and still see

9   if the bus was coming in, close enough that you can

10   see when the bus is coming in and certainly close

11   enough to use the Wi-Fi.

12   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Oh, that's good,

13   okay. How are you addressing the privacy concerns

14   that some people have in using the system?

15   MICHAEL PASTOR: So we addressed the

16   privacy concerns via an amended privacy policy that

17   we adopted over a year ago. We're extremely proud of

18   this policy. It has the imprimatur of the NYCLU and

19   we have a rigorous privacy policy in place and that

20   will be completely unchanged by the amendment that

21   we're taking to the FCRC.

22   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Okay, so I'd like

23   to make some suggestions at some point so if I can

24   call your office because we do have some area that

25   we'd like to get on the radar.

2   MICHAEL PASTOR: Yes.

3   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Not wait till

4 2025, you know.

5   MICHAEL PASTOR: We, we more than welcome

6 that. As I said, you know better than we do to the

7 corner level, right. We just don't know that and you

8 would. You say, this place happens to be very

9 crowded. This place no one walks by, you know, and

10 yes and that includes as Anne pointed out, pay phones

11 because pay phones are a potential.

12   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Yes, because we

13 do have fiber optics in Queens. We are, I think

14 we're catching up to the 21st century in Queens and

15 we do need services and we're usually the last ones

16 actually to get anything in the City and so we feel

17 like stepchildren sometimes in Queens, you know,

18 Erik's not here.

19   ANNE KOENIG: We're working on priorities

20   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: We do, we do and

21 it's proven over and over again. Thank so much.

22   ANNE KOENIG: Yeah, and we welcome input

23 on priorities, as long as they're not stand alone.

24 We can't do spot by spot because it has to all

25 connect.

2   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you, yeah. Due

3 to a lot of people want to testify, all questions by

4 our members may be limited of 5 minutes at the most

5 okay so next, Council Member Lander.

6   COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you

7 Mr. Chair. Great to have you here and I want to

8 thank DoITT and Link for partnership both on getting

9 the bus countdown information there. It was really,

10 it's a great benefit and I think other people will be

11 excited as it rolls out across the City and your,

12 both Link and DoITT's willingness to work with us on

13 that really reflected a very good spirit of

14 partnership and I'm really grateful for it and also

15 in participatory budgeting it was great to see

16 Commissioner Saini out at the launch and I voted on a

17 Link this year and found that, it was wonderful to

18 see it advertised so I've become more of an

19 enthusiast of the Links over the recent months which

20 I guess is the idea. Well, I was gonna ask about bus

21 stop shelter siting so I'm glad to hear that the

22 franchise agreement adjustments include changes that

23 will allow siting nearer to bus stops because I

24 really think that is something that makes a lot of

25 sense. I know you've got obligations under both

2 franchises but still this makes good sense so I guess

3 two questions for you and then hopefully can stick

4 around for the questions for Link. One, in my mind,

5 this is part of our broader effort to achieve

6 broadband for all in New York City. I know City Hall

7 is thinking about that. You guys are thinking about

8 that. I wonder what we are learning from the

9 challenges that have been faced in sighting. You

10 know, a lot of us really beat up hard on FiOS for

11 their inability to meet the obligations they had

12 under their franchise agreement. You know, clearly,

13 there's somethings that are harder than we think.

14 What are we learning from this change that will help

15 us do better at achieving broadband for all? How do

16 the Links fit in and what are we learning about like

17 what's underground and what we need to do to drive

18 forward to that, you know, to get closer?

19   MICHAEL PASTOR: Yes, I'm glad you

20 brought it up, Council Member Lander. I mean the

21 broadband for all is a top level priority of the

22 Mayor, of DoITT, of the Commissioner and Link is

23 definitely a part of that. It's only one part but

24 it's definitely a part of that and I think the idea

25 there is that we want everyone to have equal access

2 to high speed affordable broadband. Link embodies

3 that in some respects already so before I skip to the

4 sort of what is learned, I mean, what you have now is

5 1,500 hot spots that weren't there before and people

6 that can use it and that number's gonna keep going up

7 so I think that from our vantage point, the broadband

8 for all thing has been kind of in place since Link

9 started because that's, that's what it does. I think

10 to the question of what's been learned. I mean, it's

11 a big City and we have lots of old infrastructure all

12 right and so I think that we are thinking about that

13 both from a Link perspective but from the broadband

14 question more broadly. What are we doing to ensure

15 that once we decide places that are underserved, for

16 example, that we can get fiber there and I think we

17 at DoITT are thinking a lot about the map, kind of

18 what does the City look like, where's their broadband

19 now, where is there not and that's true for the

20 Office of the CTO as well and City Hall.

21   COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: And have we

22 learned something about that, you know, so far, more

23 than we need the two extra years? Have we started to

24 learn where it is we should be focusing? If there

25 are places where public investment is needed and

2 appropriate in addition to the private investment

3 funded, you know, through the Link agreement?

4   MICHAEL PASTOR: In part, I don't know, I

5 don't know that the Link program is what's teaching

6 us that. It's just more thinking about sort of all

7 the time obsessively and I do think what the Link

8 program taught us is that when you go out and you

9 want to lay fiber, you may think you have conduit

10 that, that works and it doesn't. I think that one of

11 the premises was that, you know, a pay phone site

12 would be an easy thing and that turned out to be not

13 always, always the case so I think, I think I should

14 say to what we've learned. I mean, it's a feedback

15 mechanism, right, so when we're hearing from people

16 like we really want a Link, you can maybe presume

17 that that means well they feel like they have a

18 broadband need. You know, I mean, it's obviously

19 only one thing but I think hearing from Council

20 Members, hearing from Borough Presidents about these

21 are the places that are under served and, you know,

22 we are also working on the gigabyte centers as well

23 and that's kind of a focus of ours. You know, it's

24 not just kiosks but places where you can go to get

25 that so I think there are a lot of lessons learned

2 but I think it's a good question to be thinking

3 about.

4   COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: All right, now I

5 might ask Link some of this as well. You know, in,

6 in this battle around these USIC that contractor for

7 identifying what's underground and some challenges

8 that they had in how they were treating their

9 workers, I think we've realized, we know a lot less

10 about what's underground that we probably should and

11 obviously that got built out over a long history when

12 there was a lot less open data but I think that'd be

13 useful to kind of report to us as you can but my

14 other question for you guys is about you're thinking

15 about the time that the City has on the kiosks and

16 using those in innovative and creative ways to engage

17 people more and I just, I want to, I'm curious, you

18 know, how you're tracking what works and what doesn't

19 work. Like on the one hand, I love to go to

20 Community Board meetings so seeing the Community

21 Board meetings up is good but I'm not 100% sure

22 that's what the vast majority of my constituents

23 think is the most civically engaging, not that it,

24 you know, so how are you thinking about and tracking

25 and paying attention to, what's really innovative use

2 of the time the City has in the public realm like

3 this. What kind of campaigns get people to engage?

4 What kind of engagement is meaningful and how to

5 attract that over time?

6   MICHAEL PASTOR: So if, if the

7 Commissioner was here, he would be sort of bounding

8 out of his seat with excitement to answer those

9 questions. I'll do my best to sort of channel him

10 but, so he is very recently and repeatedly charged

11 the DoITT team to be thinking about just this

12 question, you know, that it's about much more than

13 Wi-Fi. It's about information and so he's asking us

14 to think, for example, I talked already about the

15 kind of, time done, am I,

16   COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: That's the end of

17 my question time but not necessarily the end of your

18 answer.

19   MICHAEL PASTOR: But I, yeah, and so

20 basically I think that we are gonna take a deep dive

21 on the question of, of the use in a very local way,

22 yes so Community Board information. That can be very

23 useful but there are lots of other things that can be

24 useful as well. I mean, the Aunt Bertha app is

25 another example where people are going and they're

2   finding out where local social services are so it's

3   something that will be high on our radar to think

4   about. Are we getting the most from the app from the

5   panel perspective?

6   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Council Member Yeger.

7   COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you

8   Mr. Chairman. I'm gonna, I'm gonna come to this from

9   a, from a different point of view. My colleagues

10   have asked what they can do to bring more and faster

11   kiosks into the district. I'm gonna come to this

12   from a different way. If a community wants to opt

13   out or to say that a particular location is not in

14   the community's mind the best use of your great

15   resource of these kiosks, can they do that and

16   specifically, I know you testified that you do notice

17   Community Boards and Council Members, Borough

18   Presidents and BIDs with a 60 day comment period for

19   kiosks that do not replace pay phones but I believe

20   you notice the communities if you're replacing a pay

21   phone, is that correct?

22   MICHAEL PASTOR: That's right, so to

23   answer your question, Council Member. The question

24   was, I think, you know, can the community and the

25   Council Members give feedback to say no and the

2   answer is yes and there are different means of doing

3   that. We like to think that everyone loves Link no

4   matter what but it's true. There are different

5   equities in play and some people don't want the Link

6   so the ways the community could do that or the

7   Council could do that is twofold. One, if it's a new

8   location, there's this formal process and so you'd

9   utilize that process. You've notice of a particular

10   location but with respect to pay phones, I think and

11   mentioned this already. If a Council Member were to

12   come and say this particular pay phone, we want to

13   raise an objection, right. I don't think we need a

14   formal process to hear that objection and to think

15   about it and to consider it and I think we would. I

16   know we would, not I think, we would so yes if a

17   community knows right now there's a pay phone on the

18   corner of this street in their district and they come

19   to you and they say, now, of course, it still is

20   interesting with this because what's the community.

21   Some might love it and some might hate it, you sort

22   of weigh, weight that through but there's definitely

23   an opportunity for you all to come to us and say you

24   don't want one. I should just going back to the

25   change I described to the amendment so there were

2 gonna be 6,200+ replacements of phones. That was

3 kind of part of the agreement and that number is

4 going down so there is actually an increased

5 opportunity now for the formal comment period as part

6 of the new sense.

7   COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: When I was on a

8 Community Board before I came to the Council earlier

9 this year, we actually voted formally to ask DoITT

10 not to do a kiosk in a particular location and I

11 believe that that was not a pay phone. That was a

12 standalone kiosk that was being contemplated so we

13 did do that so there is a, you know, a question of

14 whether it has a community opine with the community

15 opines through its Community Board which are duly

16 appointed members, through its elected officials,

17 Council Members, other legislators, the **B**orough

18 President obviously could opine but do you have an

19 indicator that it's in any way binding that if you

20 get a letter from the Community Board saying don't do

21 this here, DoITT will say sure enough we won't do it

22 here.

23   MICHAEL PASTOR: Right, that is true but

24 I, I just have to stress that we are really open and

25 would take very seriously if a Council Member or a

2 Community Board member came to us and said that this

3 site is bad, we would listen to that closely.

4   COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Okay and with

5 respect to the replacement kiosk, the kiosks that are

6 to replace existing phones, so you indicated that if

7 the community or an elected official were to request

8 DoITT not to do it at a particular pay phone that

9 would be something that you would take very seriously

10 but that's the kind, because there's no formal

11 process of notification, that kind of leaves it up to

12 the community or to the Council Members to kind of

13 drive around their districts looking for pay phones

14 and saying yes here, no there, yes here, no there.

15 Do you have a list of pay phones by Council district

16 that you can share with the members?

17   ANNE KOENIG: I just want to add that,

18 exactly what you're talking about was built into the

19 process and at the very beginning of the franchise

20 term we did, in fact, send lists to every single

21 Community Board of pay phones in those districts and

22 ask for feedback on, you know, whether there were

23 comments on whether they should or shouldn't be

24 converted to Links so we actually, there actually was

25 a formal process for that. Because all that

2 information was known back in the beginning, you

3 know, we went through it once but yes, we certainly

4 can produce lists of existing pay phone locations.

5   COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: How long ago was

6 that done? When you say at the beginning of the

7 process, we're talking about two or three years now,

8 right?

9   ANNE KOENIG: Yes, I believe it was in

10 early 2016 so a couple of years ago.

11   COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Okay, so

12   ANNE KOENIG: Before Link started going

13 in the ground.

14   COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: So if, at this

15 point, to the extent that it hasn't been done in

16 particular places and as Council Member Holden

17 indicated, you know, some of the outer boroughs, we

18 wait last for everything anyway so, we know that. We

19 wait last and Manhattan gets everything first. It's

20 okay, we've gotten use to it but in the places where

21 you haven't hit yet, can you share that information

22 so that we can take a second look particularly to

23 those of us like Council Member Holden and myself who

24 are new, some of us may want to opine a new and, you

25 know, in terms of Council Member Holden, he may want

COMMITTEE ON TECHNOLOGY   44

to say well, move a little quicker. These are the

places where I really want them so we come to this in

different places but we can help DoITT because we can

target your resources and say, you know, this really

needs it versus this really doesn't and we can be

helpful to you.

ANNE KOENIG: I should also point out

that that we have, we're doing extensive community

outreach. DoITT and CityBridge together have been

to, I think, in the 80's of community meetings in,

just in the last year and a half or so, and some of

this, I think you're right. There are locations or

parts of the City where this program hasn't been yet.

We'd love to come out and present to the Community

Board or meet with the Council Member and just make

sure the information is out there so people

understand the program better and we can hear the

concerns and have a dialogue so we really welcome

that.

COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: One last question,

Mr. Chairman. I know my time is up.

CHAIRPERSON KOO: [Inaudible]

COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: One last question,

very short. I recognize and I do trust DoITT that

2 the open to suggestions is taken very seriously, our

3 suggestions, recommendations but at the end the

4 suggestions, the recommendations, what would it take

5 for us to, you know, whether it's from a Council

6 Member, from a Community Board to give you

7 recommendations that are binding. I mean would you

8 need legislation to do that, a formalized process?

9 How could we make sure that if a Community Board says

10 don't do it here even though you're gonna take it

11 very seriously but that you have to take it very

12 seriously, you have to stop?

13   ANNE KOENIG: Well, I think, you know,

14 and I've worked with Community Boards for my entire

15 career in City government, and Community Board

16 recommendations are advisory. We take that advice

17 seriously because this is a program that serves

18 community but that's part of the nature of Community

19 Boards so we do take that advice seriously and we

20 really would be very happy to meet with, with, we've

21 met with Community Boards, Community Board

22 Committees. We've met with Council Members, Council

23 Member staff, Borough Presidents and their staff and

24 we'd love to have a dialogue with anybody who is

25 willing to sit down and talk to us.

2   COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you. Thank

3 you, Mr. Chairman.

4   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you, so let's

5 talk something about advertisement. Five percent of

6 the advertising reserved for mayoral agencies. Is

7 that right?

8   MICHAEL PASTOR: That's right.

9   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Yeah, so what does that

10 translate in terms of time on the screen and these

11 specific times that this advertisements on, every so

12 minutes or what?

13   ANNE KOENIG: I'm sorry, can you repeat

14 the question?

15   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Yeah, I said, what,

16 since 5% of the advertising revenue reserved for

17 mayoral agencies, so can you tell us something about

18 how often does advertisements run on the big screen?

19   ANNE KOENIG: Okay, the advertising

20 that's reserved for City use is managed by NYC and

21 Company and it goes into the general rotation.

22 CityBridge can explain to you better how that works.

23 When we say 5%, what that means is 5% of the time on

24 all the Links

25   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Of the time.

2   ANNE KOENIG: All the Links Citywide so

3 NYC and Company can actually work with the agencies

4 requesting it and pick particular neighborhoods or

5 particular Links. Some things are of Citywide

6 interest. Some things are of more local interest so

7 one of actually the really great things about this

8 program and the advertising is that it can be

9 targeted easily and can change on a dime, unlike old

10 fashioned poster where somebody would have to go out

11 and actually physically remove the thing and put it

12 back in. This can be programmed from a central

13 location so that 5% of the time and how that

14 translates to an individual message, it really

15 depends on what, what the arrangement is with NYC and

16 Co., between NYC and Co. and CityBridge and where

17 they want it targeted.

18   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So does that mean 5% of

19 the 24 hours every day that will be reserved for

20 Mayor's the agency's message?

21   ANNE KOENIG: If you added together all

22 of the 24 hours on both sides of every Link kiosk and

23 took 25% of that total, I'm sorry 5%, 5% of that

24 total time, then yes, in 5% of that total time. Now

25 it might be concentrated in one location one month or

2 in a different location the next month or week

3 because this is, you know, it's constantly dynamic.

4   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So it's 5% of the total

5 time.

6   ANNE KOENIG: 5% of the total time in

7 every

8   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Not in every kiosk?

9   ANNE KOENIG: No, so it's not exactly 5%

10 of the kiosks and it's not 5% of the time on one

11 kiosk. It's 5% of all the time available on all the

12 kiosks put together. A lot of the public service

13 kinds of things you see out there, for instances,

14 Participatory Voting and bus time. Those are

15 actually not part of those 5%. Those are CityBridge

16 voluntarily posting those messages because then they

17 can talk to this more. They want people looking at

18 the Links. They want to have useful messaging out

19 there that is not only a public service but it also

20 is good for their advertising because you don't tune

21 out. You're looking there for something interesting

22 so Participatory Budgeting, bus time, weather, news

23 updates, those are not part of the 5%.

24   CHAIRPERSON KOO: All right, yeah, so can

25 you tell us now, what type of data is collected from

2 the Link kiosk? Only one type is on the tablet and

3 what about the sensory and the visual data and so who

4 has access to all these data collected by the kiosk?

5   MICHAEL PASTOR: Okay, so I'll try to

6 break that down a little bit, Chair Koo. I mean all

7 of this is expressly laid out in the privacy policy

8 which is available on the LinkNYC website. It spells

9 out the very limited amount of personal information

10 that is required, certain technical information from

11 devices is collected and kept for a certain period

12 before it is left. With respect to cameras, the

13 privacy policy is clear that the use of that is only

14 for security of the kiosks. It is kept for seven

15 days and then all of it is destroyed. The

16 environmental sensory data as well, none of it is

17 personalized collection whatsoever. I don't even

18 really think I need the environmental sensor data is

19 on at the moment. Did I miss any of your litany, I

20 think?

21   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So do other agencies

22 have access to the data or can they collect the data,

23 their own data from the kiosk?

24   MICHAEL PASTOR: No.

25

2   CHAIRPERSON KOO: No, who's collecting

3 data?

4   MICHAEL PASTOR: The, all the data that

5 is required to be collected pursuant to the very

6 strict privacy policy is the franchisee and the

7 franchisee's partner, Intersection.

8   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So now, we want to

9 avoid something like the Facebook's scandal, no?

10   MICHAEL PASTOR: Yes.

11   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So do we in the future,

12 we have something similar that will happen?

13   MICHAEL PASTOR: Yes, we, we, I

14 completely agree and I think that that's why we, we

15 beefed up the privacy policy so much for that very

16 reason. The privacy policy speaks to the limits on

17 collections, speaks to the limits on sharing and so I

18 think that we, we're proud of the privacy policy

19 because it's so stringent.

20   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So what about these

21 cameras and other equipment inside the kiosk. Are

22 they use for public good? They monitoring pedestrian

23 traffic or other seeming [Inaudible]? They counting

24 how many pedestrians pass each one? Are we using

25 those for public good?

2   MICHAEL PASTOR: Not, not at this point.

3   At this point right now the cameras, there are two

4   cameras on either side of the structure and they are

5   used solely for the purpose of security of the kiosk

6   as well. At the moment, they are not used for other

7   things. There is no collection of foot traffic via

8   what we see on those cameras or anything like that.

9   It's very limited purpose right now.

10   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So it's nothing used

11 for, for the agency to monitor, for public safety

12 that's it, no?

13   MICHAEL PASTOR: Well, it could

14 conceivably be of use to public safety but right now

15 it is a sort of very limited, limited use. That's

16 the decision we made with the privacy policy.

17   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So if a, if a user or

18 perhaps pedestrian, they're mugged at the corner of

19 the kiosk, can these cameras, can the NYPD use the

20 data from the camera to locate or find out who's the

21 mugger?

22   MICHAEL PASTOR: Yes, so the privacy

23 policy provides that if a law enforcement agency is

24 authorized by law to get that data, they can request

25 it. They can get it and indeed I think that would, I

2 mean that would make a lot of sense honestly, yes, so

3 if there is a camera footage and a crime had been

4 committed and the policy department is investigating

5 and go through lawful process to get that data to see

6 what happened to the victim at that place, the data

7 could be used for that.

8   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So that data is saved

9 only for seven days you said, right?

10   MICHAEL PASTOR: Correct.

11   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So after seven days,

12 there's no more left? Can you retrieve it, still

13 retrieve it?

14   MICHAEL PASTOR: Unless, no, after seven

15 days it's completely eliminated but if there is a

16 request to hold on to it longer because of an

17 incident, there is a way for the police department to

18 be able to do it to do that. The general rule is

19 seven but if there's been an incident and request to

20 hold on to data longer, they can do that.

21   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So these kiosks and

22 advertised they have Wi-Fi access, right? What

23 about, does it say anything about Bluetooth beacons

24 being installed?

25

2   MICHAEL PASTOR: Yes, so the privacy

3 policy doesn't speak to beacons because the beacons

4 that are on the Links do not collect any information

5 whatsoever from any device. What the beacon

6 technology is is that the beacons just emit one way

7 to devices and do not collect anything whatsoever

8 unless a person has an app and has expressly

9 consented to want to receive notifications via the

10 beacon, only in that instance, but that's the reason

11 that the privacy policy doesn't speak to the beacons

12 because the beacons do not collect. They're just

13 ping, ping, ping.

14   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So, so what, what, how

15 does this privacy policy work? I mean people when

16 you use the machine, you ask the user to say okay or

17 I agree to all these terms or what?

18   MICHAEL PASTOR: Yeah, the way the

19 privacy policy works is that the franchise agreement

20 gives DoITT the authority to require privacy

21 protections as part of it so stepping back from the

22 user experience, DoITT has the power to say privacy

23 is important to us and to require the things and

24 that's what we did and then yes, the user sees that

25 privacy policy or can see it when they link up.

2   CHAIRPERSON KOO: And this privacy

3 policy, you have to ask the user every time or they

4 just ask one time and the next time you use the

5 kiosk, they don't ask you again?

6   ANNE KOENIG: I'm sorry, if

7   CHAIRPERSON KOO: For the permission to

8 use this data, right, so they only ask you one time?

9   ANNE KOENIG: You talking about beacons

10 or you talking about

11   CHAIRPERSON KOO: The beacon and the Wi-

12 Fi and all these data collections.

13   ANNE KOENIG: So it's separate. The

14 beacons are used, my understanding is beacons are

15 used by particular apps and so you give permission to

16 the app to get whatever kind of data. You know,

17 those little pop-up screens come up and they say can

18 we access your location data and your camera data and

19 whatever and I say no but if you say yes, then the

20 beacon can communicate out to you but you can't

21 communicate back to the app via the beacon. Wi-Fi is

22 different. It's just a different technology and the

23 Wi-Fi data, yes, you put in, well, you sign in by

24 putting in an email address once and that is subject

25 to the privacy policy.

2   MICHAEL PASTOR: I think to answer

3   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Wi-Fi is a one-time

4 thing. You type in your email and you say okay and

5 then every time you don't have to repeat this

6 process.

7   ANNE KOENIG: You don't have to keep

8 signing in again. You sign in one time and you're a

9 subscriber and every time you're within range of a

10 Link and the Wi-Fi, you're automatically connected.

11 All of that, because it's automatic, will not be

12 caused but it's automatic and all of that is covered

13 by the privacy policy. The beacons as Michael said

14 are not part of the privacy policy because the

15 beacons don't collect anything.

16   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So for beacons, the

17 same iPhone I have Bluetooth right. If I walk past a

18 Link kiosk, a advertisement will come up here?

19   ANNE KOENIG: No.

20   MICHAEL PASTOR: No, only if you've

21 downloaded a particular app that as part of that app

22 you have consented to beacon information hitting you

23 but just your phone, if you've not done that and you

24 just have your phone on Bluetooth, then the beacons

25 will just ping off your phone and they'd be no

2   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Suppose my Bluetooth is

3 on all the time?

4   MICHAEL PASTOR: Right, but there are no

5 Bluetooth connectivity between a phone and a Link.

6 It's only if you've expressly consented to have the

7 beacon transmittal at your phone but yeah, if you

8 have Bluetooth on right now but you have not

9 consented to have beacon data transmitted to you,

10 then it wouldn't.

11   ANNE KOENIG: I should also add that,

12 that CityBridge, CityBridge's representatives who are

13 here are really experts in the technology and what

14 does what and so you can pick this up again with them

15 but as far as the privacy policy goes, it applies to

16 the Wi-Fi but it does not apply, and the cameras, but

17 it does not apply to the beacons because the beacons

18 are not collecting anything.

19   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Okay, so let me go to

20 this, can you like provide a {Inaudible] how the

21 local business or a local [Inaudible] can will be

22 able to advertise on these kiosks. Is there a fee or

23 charge for say a Community Board want to do an

24 advertisement, they have a vacancy or a BID or a want

25

2 to run some special promotions for their local

3 merchants? So how does this work?

4   ANNE KOENIG: It's a great question. Our

5 franchisee, CityBridge, initiated a program called

6 Link Local and that allows a business that's close to

7 a Link to get free advertising space on that Link and

8 you can talk to CityBridge more about that but it's

9 very popular. We've had a lot of local merchants

10 using it. Also another benefit for local businesses

11 is that if you are in range, there's free Wi-Fi in

12 your place of business, in your store or in your

13 restaurant. We've seen incidents of businesses

14 actually advertising this. Personally, I used this

15 even before I worked at DoITT. I wanted to work on

16 Wi-Fi with a colleague and I called a restaurant and

17 I said do you have Wi-Fi? They said no but we have a

18 Link right outside so really is something that that

19 benefits local businesses.

20   CHAIRPERSON KOO: No, I'm talking about

21 like new advertisements   Say a local bakery wants to

22 do an advertisement and how much time is allowed?

23 Like the mayoral agency, they are 5% of the time so

24 how much time is delegated to local merchants or for

25 pro bono use for the public? How much time is that?

2   ANNE KOENIG: It's it's on request and

3 it's via this program called Link Local. I don't

4 know what the percentage is. We can get back to you

5 on how much time has been used for Link Local.

6   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Is it 5% or

7   ANNE KOENIG: It's not, it's not set

8 aside like that. It's on request but we can find out

9 how much has actually been used for that purpose.

10   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Okay, let me go to

11 another say, now the proposed amendment will allow

12 kiosks to be situated within 50' of a bus zone so can

13 you define a bus zone? How wide is this bus zone?

14   ANNE KOENIG: So under the existing

15 agreement, anything that's in a bus stop cannot have,

16 a bus stop can't have a Link so a bus stop starts

17 where you see the sign.

18   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Yeah.

19   ANNE KOENIG: And it ends either at the

20 crosswalk or at the next parking regulation sign and

21 under the existing siting criteria in the existing

22 franchise agreement, there are no Links in that zone.

23 We call it a zone, called a bus stop. One of the

24 proposed amendments would allow a Link to be in that

25 zone but not in the first 50' so bus stops usually

2 are maybe around 80' to 100' long. Some of them are

3 even longer. They could be up to 120, 150. The

4 first 50' are reserved because there needs to be free

5 passage of people getting on and off the bus,

6 particularly wheelchair passengers and the wheelchair

7 accessible entrance to the bus is generally in the

8 front so you really want to keep that area clear but

9 starting at 50' back under the amendment, you could

10 have a Link because we've heard a lot from people

11 that they want to be able to use Links in bus stops.

12 It's kind of compatible. You're waiting for the bus,

13 gives you something to do, check 311, enter a

14 complaint, check the weather, check a map.

15   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Yeah, so does this

16 include the bus stops that already have

17 advertisements on there. Some bus stops they have

18 nice advertisements. They're blinking, it just

19 almost looks like a LinkNYC advertisement so it would

20 be a duplication of too many advertisements in the

21 same place.

22   ANNE KOENIG: So yeah, two things. First

23 of all the Links will be only starting 50' away from

24 the

25   CHAIRPERSON KOO: 50' away.

2   ANNE KOENIG: 50' away from the bus stop

3 sign and second even if the bus stop shelter is

4 further back in the stop, there's still a 15'

5 clearance requirement between the bus stop shelter

6 and the Link which is the same as the clearance

7 requirement between a newsstand and a Link so as far

8 as the original don't allow them in a bus stop had

9 more to do with passengers loading and unloading, the

10 distance between a Link and another advertising

11 structure is unchanged under the amendment. It was

12 15' before and it's 15' going forward. We're not

13 changing it. Same for newsstands, same for bus stop

14 shelter.

15   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So, so what progress

16 has the City and CityBridge made in fulfilling the

17 terms of its January 2017 settlement agreement with

18 the National Federation of the Blind because we have

19 too many things there, the people with impaired

20 seeing, they have a difficulty navigating around the

21 bus stop because now SBS they have special kiosks for

22 selling the tickets so the whole bus stop really is

23 very cluttered so people have a difficult to see or

24 walk.

25

2   ANNE KOENIG: We work very closely with

3   DOT on coordination. I worked for DOT for many years

4   and we are in constant contact with our sister agency

5   about sighting and placement. We certainly have no

6   desire to interfere with SBS or with the SBS

7   Wayfinders and the ticketing machines and we will

8   make sure that those clearances are factored into

9   every siting decision. Again, DoITT reviews every

10   single site and we make sure and we have very

11   detailed siting criteria. We make sure that those

12   are met.

13   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So have you made any

14   agreement with or settlement with the National

15   Federation of the Blind?

16   ANNE KOENIG: Yes, that lawsuit was

17   resolved. It was a little bit before my time. My

18   understanding is that the kiosks themselves were

19   modified to accommodate blind people. I believe it

20   had to do with a 911 call button and when you push

21   the 911 call button there is now an audio message

22   that tells you what to do so that lawsuit is

23   completely resolved.

24   CHAIRPERSON KOO: All right, so who

25   chooses the advertising contents on the kiosks and

2   what is the process? I mean anyone can advertise or

3   is there some restrictions that like you cannot

4   advertise a political related items or what or is

5   this

6   ANNE KOENIG: The advertising is in

7   CityBridge's hands. Their goal is to take in enough

8   revenue to fully fund this program, again at no cost

9   to the users or the taxpayers and generating

10 significant revenue for the City. There are certain

11 restrictions on tobacco advertising and alcohol

12 advertising in relation to tobacco and even e-

13 cigarettes, that's not permitted on Links. Alcohol

14 advertising has to be at least 200' from certain

15 other, certain other things like schools and houses

16 of worship and obscene or offensive advertising in

17 violation of state penal law is also not permitted.

18   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Okay, so another

19 question I have is like are the kiosks all ready, are

20 they all capable to take bus information in the

21 machines because this is a very good feature.

22   ANNE KOENIG: It's coming very soon. It

23 started

24   CHAIRPERSON KOO: It only in Park Slope

25 that they have it now?

2   ANNE KOENIG: It started as a pilot in

3 Brooklyn just to make sure everything was working

4 properly. To date, as far as I know, there haven't

5 been any technical problems and so it will be rolled

6 out. It will be primarily on Links that are near bus

7 routes so if, and I don't know if there are any such

8 Links. If there are Links in locations where there

9 are no buses nearby, then bus time isn't gonna run

10 there but, generally speaking, anything that is close

11 to a bus stop will have bus time.

12   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So only on bus routes?

13   ANNE KOENIG: Close to bus routes.

14   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Yeah, close to the bus

15 routes you have the bus information.

16   ANNE KOENIG: Right, it's not there yet

17 but it will be quite soon.

18   CHAIRPERSON KOO: But you will be there,

19 right, soon but right now it's only in Park Slope you

20 have it?

21   ANNE KOENIG: Right, but it's a matter of

22 weeks not months before this is rolled out.

23   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So what about, you, can

24 we incorporate the Wayfinder in the kiosk too? The

25 way, [Inaudible] has a lot of Wayfinder and a lot of

2 people, I think it's become obsolete, you know,

3 because it's just a map. Nobody's [Inaudible] and if

4 it were in the kiosk, it's much better. You save

5 public space.

6   ANNE KOENIG: It's an interesting idea,

7 something you might want to bring up with DOT.

8   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So I have to bring up

9 to the DOT for them to incorporate into the kiosk,

10 right?

11   ANNE KOENIG: Yeah, the Wayfinders are

12 their program so I can't really speak to that.

13   MICHAEL PASTOR: Chair Koo, if I could

14 just give a quick update on your prior questions. I

15 think the information we have is that as of this

16 morning, the bus route information is now Citywide

17 live.

18   ANNE KOENIG: I'm happy cause I use it

19 all the time.

20   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So we can wrap up the,

21 so my last question will be in 2016, Telebeam

22 Communications sued the City over its franchise with

23 CityBridge arguing that awarding LinkNYC with a sole

24 contract would replace the public pay phone while

25

2   aiding further law so what is the status of this

3   lawsuit?

4   MICHAEL PASTOR: That case was settled

5   prior to my time and prior to Anne's time as well but

6   that was resolved. Okay, sorry.

7   ANNE KOENIG: Yeah, it's resolved.

8   CityBridge now owns all the public pay telephones.

9   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you. Thank you

10   for spending time with us.

11   MICHAEL PASTOR: Thank you.

12   ANNE KOENIG: Thank you. Thank you to

13   your colleagues.

14   CHAIRPERSON KOO: We have Julian Baha

15   from LinkNYC and Jen Hensley from LinkNYC and Ruth

16   Fastil from LinkNYC. Sorry about that.

17   RUTH FASTIL: It's all good.

18   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So you may start after

19   identifying yourselves, yeah.

20   JENNIFER HENSLEY: Great, thank you. I'm

21   Jennifer Hensley, the President of LinkNYC for

22   Intersection the managing member of CityBridge, the

23   company responsible for delivering the LinkNYC under

24   a franchise agreement with DoITT and I'm delighted

25   for the opportunity to update you on the progress of

2 our program. When I appeared before this Council

3 approximately 18 months ago Link was still something

4 of a newcomer on the City's streets. In my previous

5 testimony, I explained how we were replacing the

6 City's obsolete pay phones with beautiful state of

7 the art kiosks that would provide free phone calls

8 and the fastest public Wi-Fi available as well as

9 other valuable public amenities all at no cost to

10 taxpayers. I described some of the challenges that

11 we faced while implementing this first of its kind

12 program in New York City's notoriously complicated

13 roadbeds and sidewalks. Notwithstanding those

14 challenges, at that time we had 500 kiosks installed

15 with 800,000 unique users signed up for Wi-Fi, 40,000

16 phone calls for week and a demonstrated annual

17 positive economic impact of $72 million. Today a

18 short year and a half later, we have over 1,500

19 kiosks activated across the five boroughs with more

20 than $3.7 million unique users signed up for Wi-Fi.

21 We are now providing over 250,000 free phone calls

22 per month and in 2017, we made $26 million in

23 payments to the City of New York and saw an annual

24 economic output from our program of $161 million.

25 LinkNYC has become a beloved part of the New York

2   City streetscape providing fast reliable free Wi-Fi

3   to millions of New Yorkers and visitors. We

4   regularly meet with Community Boards, civic groups,

5   BIDs and the likes to ensure our services are

6   understood and accessed by New Yorkers and visitors

7   alike. Our tablets have become bona fide community

8   resource centers providing one touch access to

9   important services and information such as local

10   Community Board's website, MTA information and 311.

11   The City's 311 app alone sees over 1,300 opens per

12   week and we recently started offering Community

13   Boards the opportunity to advertise their full board

14   meetings for free on our 55" screens in each

15   district. We've done this for 87 Community Board

16   meetings and counting. Since we were last here, we

17   partnered with a group called Aunt Bertha to add a

18   tablet app that makes it easier for New Yorkers to

19   connect to social service organizations whether they

20   are in need of assistance or seeking a place to

21   donate or volunteer. Since we started this

22   partnership over a year ago, 115,000 users have taken

23   over 300,000 actions to search and reach out for much

24   needed resources. As part of our advertising program

25   we created Link Local, a unique offering that allows

2 small businesses to advertise on our kiosks at no

3 cost and have worked with over 200 small businesses

4 in all five boroughs on the program thus far. We've

5 created window stickers for businesses whose

6 customers can easily access the Wi-Fi from adjacent

7 kiosks and partnered with community organizations to

8 provide free training on how to use Link. We've also

9 had some fun facilitating over 12,000 free phone

10 calls to Santa around Christmas time and inviting New

11 Yorkers to share their marriage proposals on Link at

12 Valentine's Day. We saw five successful proposals

13 this year and no unsuccessful ones. We haven't

14 stopped either. Just last week we came together with

15 you and with Councilman Lander and the rest of the

16 City Council to offer voting for Participatory

17 Budgeting on our Link tablets in an effort to truly

18 bring democracy to the streets of New York. The

19 Participatory Budgeting app was opened over 5,000

20 times that week and we've also started displaying

21 real time emergency messages with the Office of

22 Emergency Management alerting New Yorkers to severe

23 weather alerts and school closings. With you we

24 launched subway transit updates which have been

25 greatly appreciated by everyone who are now informed

2 about the train delays before going down into the

3 subway system. Our real time bus updates when live

4 across the five boroughs this morning as you just

5 heard and now New Yorkers waiting for a bus can save

6 money, enjoy super-fast Wi-Fi for free and know how

7 long they have to wait for their next bus to arrive.

8 All of these initiatives have come from valuable

9 feedback from our users and stakeholders who've taken

10 to social media and the press to commend LinkNYC for

11 our responsiveness and partnership. In fact, we have

12 dedicated staff that cultivates this partnership and

13 responds with editorial content and user experience

14 improvements that help solidify our connections to

15 the diverse communities we serve. In a recent third-

16 party survey, 93% of New Yorkers said they believe

17 that LinkNYC is a positive initiative for New York

18 City, an astounding and impressive rating nearly

19 three years into our program and consistent with our

20 findings from each of the surveys we conducted

21 regularly since we launched our service. We look

22 forward to continuing our partnership with the City

23 to expand Link's reach and impact in all five

24 boroughs. There's more work to be done for sure and

25 there are still challenges facing our great program

2 including some of the same implementation challenges

3 we discussed at length before this committee in 2016.

4 The City's sidewalks are crowded and competition for

5 space is fierce as you pointed out. A large

6 percentage of the old pay phone sites have failed the

7 LinkNYC siting criteria forcing us to search for new

8 sites and engineer new connections, adding time and

9 cost to our deployment plans. In addition, much of

10 the City's underground infrastructure suffers from

11 deferred maintenance and coordinating with the major

12 utilities and public agencies requires times and

13 substantial investment. We've been working with

14 DoITT to propose limited franchise contract

15 amendments to address some of the specific siting and

16 commercial issues that we've encountered and ensure

17 the continued success of LinkNYC. We'll be appearing

18 before the Franchise Concession Review Committee next

19 month seeking approval of those adjustments to siting

20 and infrastructure support leaving the key elements

21 of the LinkNYC program intact. The total number of

22 7,500 units to be deployed and the minimum revenue

23 guaranteed to the City under the contract will stay

24 exactly the same. The requirement for distribution

25 of kiosks throughout the boroughs will be

2 strengthened with additional requirements to deliver

3 Links equitably among community districts throughout

4 the City. We're also excited that the amendment will

5 give us the confidence in our root planning to be

6 able to create a full build plan in addition to the

7 yearly roll-out plans we provide. This will help the

8 City and our users better know when to except Links

9 and where. CityBridge is also making significant

10 investments in ensuring our system remains state of

11 the art. We are constantly working on improvements

12 to the security and reliability of the connection to

13 the Link network and are working closely in close

14 partnership with DoITT and the New York City Cyber

15 Command and we're excited to implement Cyber Command

16 approved DNS protection for Link users on our

17 network. We expect to announce more details on these

18 service upgrades in the coming weeks and will

19 continue to ensure that Link remains state of the art

20 and our users have access to the very best

21 technology. We are very proud of the tremendous

22 success of our project and the significant positive

23 impact we are having on our City. Transformational

24 new technology is definitely not easy but we continue

25 to make significant investments in the program and

2   work closely with DoITT, Community Boards, the

3   Council, our users and other stakeholder to ensure

4   that Link remains a valuable and beloved public

5   service. I welcome any questions.

6   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you, so my

7   question is what is the average time it takes to

8   activate the kiosk after the install? What is the

9   process of activation?

10   JENNIFER HENSLEY: Sure, on average

11   across our network, it takes approximately 45 days to

12   activate a kiosk. Once we install it with our civil

13   contractors, we need Con Edison to come out and power

14   the unit on. We also need our fiber partners to make

15   the connection to the backbone of fiber and we our

16   internal staff to go out and test the unit and ensure

17   it's fit for public use. It takes about 45 days on

18   average approximately to address these issues. In

19   some cases due to infrastructure challenges either

20   with the power connection or the fiber, it can take

21   much longer so we work in close coordination with our

22   partners to ensure we can do it as expeditiously as

23   possible and as DoITT mentioned as part of the

24   amendment we have before the FCRC we will be beholden

25   to a 45 day turnaround in that process.

2   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Okay, so when do you

3 expect the Flushing to have its first kiosk?

4   JENNIFER HENSLEY: In Flushing?

5   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Yes.

6   JENNIFER HENSLEY: As was previously

7 mentioned, we're in discussions with your community

8 on Greenfield siting locations now. We're working

9 with fiber providers to understand how quickly we can

10 get the fiber connections that we need out to your

11 neighborhood so we don't have a definitive time line

12 today but are working aggressively to be able to

13 provide that to you.

14   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So a month, or six

15 months or a year?

16   JENNIFER HENSLEY: Several months at

17 minimum.

18   CHAIRPERSON KOO: [Inaudible]

19   JENNIFER HENSLEY: Yeah.

20   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Because we want this to

21 be installed as soon as possible.

22   JENNIFER HENSLEY: Understood, we heard

23 that feedback from you and your office and definitely

24 take it extremely seriously. We are working with our

25 fiber providers to assess how quickly we can get the

COMMITTEE ON TECHNOLOGY   74

1

2   fiber connection out there as well as moving through

3   the Greenfield siting process with your community so

4   we're happy to figure out how we can expedite that

5   for sure.

6   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So like what languages

7   are on the kiosks now? I ask because if you walk in

8   downtown Flushing, 80% of the pedestrians are Asian

9   or more, you know, so it would be nice if you have a

10 machine that is language sensitive because a lot of

11 the pedestrian, a lot of the tourists, they don't

12 speak English, they don't read English so if like you

13 put it in Chinese or Korean or other languages?

14   RUTH FASTIL: Thank you Council Member.

15 Yeah, we have multiple languages on the 55" screens

16 to teach people that they can join this Wi-Fi for

17 free. We have this in English, Spanish, French,

18 Creole, Chinese and Bengali currently. As we roll

19 out to other neighborhoods that have high density of

20 certain populations, we're happy to expand on that.

21 We work with the Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs

22 to create that and then on the actual tablet we try

23 to use minimal languages and a lot of icons to

24 explain what you can do at each tile so it will say

25 phone calls with an image of a phone so that you know

2 that that does phone calling. When you open the

3 maps, Google maps offers dozens of languages that all

4 are available on the tablet so does Aunt Bertha and

5 311 offers dozens of languages as well so we have a

6 multi-language kiosk for sure.

7   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Yeah, because it's

8 important because a lot of the [Inaudible] they, what

9 do you say they, most certain title population living

10 like in Queens, in Flushing, we have Asian Americans.

11 In Brooklyn, we have a lot of Russians, right, so in

12 Sunset Park are Chinese so everywhere the population

13 is different, demographic is different so you will be

14 nice if you adjust the language. Say hey, this area

15 is 90%, 80% Asian. If you put the [Inaudible], just

16 not that much use.

17   RUTH FASTIL: We do, we do that. We work

18 with data that's available on line from the Census

19 data to other data that the City has as well as

20 working with the Office of Immigrant Affairs to

21 confirm that we're playing the language that might be

22 needed most in certain areas at a higher percentage.

23   CHAIRPERSON KOO: And then this message

24 has to be real clear on the first page. I mean, I

25 don't want it to be on the corner, say touch this to

2 have Chinese because most people, they don't. It

3 should be on the main screen and people can see right

4 away if you don't speak English, just touch this for

5 Chinese, touch this for Korean or

6   JENNIFER HENSLEY: Absolutely, no, that's

7 great feedback

8   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So one of the ideas we

9 talked about was using the kiosk as to do

10 Participating Budgeting. So what is done with the

11 data that is collected and how is this shared, shared

12 with who?

13   RUTH FASTIL: Sure, so we worked with

14 DoITT and the City Council as well as the company

15 that was building the Participatory Budgeting website

16 to get this on our Links. We had voting on the Links

17 for all the whole week of Participatory Budgeting and

18 5,000 chose to open that tile on the Link kiosks.

19 All of the data collection happens from the

20 Participatory Budgeting website so we didn't collect

21 any data. We were just providing a portal for people

22 to have another way to vote.

23   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So do you have a

24 feature that prevents people from voting multiple

25 times because some people it's such a project and the

2 same people go and they vote oh let's just do it ten

3 times?

4   RUTH FASTIL: Yeah, so that was all

5 Participatory Budgeting. As you know, they've done

6 this many years and they've worked hard to do that so

7 again we just provided a platform for them to be but

8 I voted on a Link kiosk and I know that you had to

9 give your phone number and get sent a code to confirm

10 you haven't voted before so that's how they chose to

11 do that.

12   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So they, you had to put

13 in a code and your phone number

14   RUTH FASTIL: Yeah, and that would be the

15 same on a website or on our kiosk, it was all like

16 that process.

17   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So what, what happened

18 if they put in a fake number, telephone number?

19   JENNIFER HENSLEY: So this is all

20 actually the Participatory Budgeting's technology so

21 it was available on the Link tablets, but it was

22 managed by the Participatory Budgeting website and

23 vendor.

24   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So they would take care

25 of the duplication?

2   JENNIFER HENSLEY: Exactly.

3   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Yeah, so, so what

4 equipment is installing a LinkNYC kiosk? So other

5 than, we know the cameras, the Bluetooth beacons and

6 you have a microphone in there, right?

7   JENNIFER HENSLEY: Well, there's speaker

8 and a microphone that operates the phone calling

9 feature on the tablet. The tablet is an Android

10 tablet similarly to what's publicly available to any

11 consumer. We have four computers that are running.

12 There's two ad screen computers as well as a tablet

13 computer and a maintenance computer and in 40 units,

14 we have environmental sensors collecting air quality

15 information in a partnership with Argon National

16 Labs.

17   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So, so is there any

18 difference between the kiosks in different areas?

19 They all have the same equipment?

20   JENNIFER HENSLEY: Correct.

21   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So I would suggest like

22 you said before, you can use them to collect manual

23 data, right, air quality, what about for like public

24 safety? Since you have the camera up there already,

25 you may as well do a 24 hour recording of the whole

2 street. Something happen, NYPD can come to you and

3 say look, there's a crime at this area. Has this

4 happened? NYPD come to you for data to look to you

5 for the perpetrators?

6   JENNIFER HENSLEY: Yeah, sure. We are,

7 you know, we receive subpoenas or other law

8 enforcement requests. If they are deemed to be valid

9 and we have available information, we're able to

10 respond and make that available. We've published a

11 transparency report every year. I believe we had

12 eight inquiries for our information and provided it

13 twice.

14   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So that, is there an

15 incident that NYPD actually used the data and solved

16 the crime or something like that?

17   JENNIFER HENSLEY: We don't know if they

18 solved the crime but our information was made

19 available to their investigators or to their agency.

20   CHAIRPERSON KOO: I think this would be

21 great help to our public safety system, you know. I

22 believe in other cities, they have like cameras that

23 can monitor all the streets and they can like catch a

24 perpetrator while, very soon after they happening

25

2   because they know where they are so since you have

3   cameras everywhere soon, right?

4   JENNIFER HENSLEY: Yes, there are cameras

5   in every single Link, only a handful of them are

6   currently activated again because they're used for

7   monitoring of the Link itself for vandalism.

8   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Are they on the top of

9   the kiosk?

10   JENNIFER HENSLEY: Above the 55" display,

11 yes.

12   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So do you also take a

13 picture of the users too?

14   JENNIFER HENSLEY: No.

15   CHAIRPERSON KOO: No.

16   JENNIFER HENSLEY: We don't take any

17 pictures. We don't monitor the camera footage. It's

18 stored for seven days in the event that there's an

19 incident with one of our kiosks or that we get a

20 request from law enforcement for it, we're able to

21 retrieve that information.

22   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So can you like provide

23 clarifications on how local businesses can advertise

24 on these kiosks? Is there a fee and who qualify for

25 this no charge advertising?

2   RUTH FASTIL: Sure, so there is no fee.

3 The program is called Link Local. It is very easy.

4 We have a simple Google form that any small business

5 can fill out and then we will create creative using

6 our marketing team, send it to them for review. If

7 they like it then will get it up on the two Links,

8 four screens closest to this business and it will

9 play for one month and then if they want another one,

10 they can do another one and it's all for free.

11   CHAIRPERSON KOO: So it plays on the two

12 screens, the big screens?

13   RUTH FASTIL: Yes, on two different

14 Links, four screens.

15   CHAIRPERSON KOO: And also on the tablet

16 too, no?

17   RUTH FASTIL: The tablet is different,

18 yeah. The tablet just has social services and other

19 things but

20   JENNIFER HENSLEY: And also in addition

21 to the Lin Local program that Ruth described which is

22 really something we offer to small businesses as we

23 roll out into communities, we also have a small and

24 medium size business selling team as part of our

25 overall ad sales platform and so businesses that do

2   have advertising budgets that want to put ads on

3   Links and maybe want to be in a more broad

4   distribution beyond the two Links in front of their

5   store, they can reach out to our sales team and

6   purchase an advertising package through our normal

7   sales channel.

8   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Sure, but is it really

9   expensive if they?

10   JENNIFER HENSLEY: It's not. We sell,

11   you know, all kinds of packages for all kinds of

12   businesses and because it's digital advertising,

13   because we're able to, you know, target individual

14   screens or locations that are most valuable to that

15   business, we're able to put together packages that

16   are actually very reasonably priced.

17   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Okay, thank you, yeah,

18   thank you and thank you for coming so and we have

19   more people to come.

20   JENNIFER HENSLEY: Thank you.

21   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Next, we have Taline

22   Santisere from TechNYC and Angela Pinsky from ABNY

23   and Noel Hidalgo from BetaNYC. Thank you for coming.

24   Please identify yourself and you can begin.

25

2   TALINE SANTISERE: Thank you very much.

3 My name is Taline Santisere [phonetic] and I'm the

4 policy director for TechNYC. TechNYC is honored to

5 have this opportunity to support the LinkNYC program.

6 We are a non-profit trade group with the mission of

7 supporting the technology industry in New York

8 through increased engagement between our more than

9 600 members, New York government, and the community

10 at large. Our ultimate goal in engaging in this

11 dialogue is to demonstrate that New York is the best

12 place for technology companies to grow and develop.

13 We believe that New York's unique business ego system

14 as a global center for so many industries such as

15 finance, media, fashion, art and real estate will

16 serve to strengthen the technology businesses that

17 call New York home and that, in turn, technology will

18 further strengthen those incumbent industries. With

19 that in mind, we are happy to support LinkNYC, a

20 first of its kind program that gives New Yorkers

21 access to ultrafast public Wi-Fi while also

22 connecting users to a host of other services

23 including calling anywhere in the U. S., accessing

24 maps and City services or charging their cell phones.

25 From the perspective of our organization, addressing

2 the digital divide is of paramount importance. As a

3 greater part of our lives revolve around internet

4 access, the value of available Wi-Fi grows. This is

5 especially true for children as more tools for

6 learning and growth are found to a digital means.

7 For this reason, our organization and several of our

8 members have been front line supporters of the City's

9 CS for All initiative, a program that aims to bring

10 computer science education to every school in New

11 York City in the next decade. We believe technology

12 education will only grow in importance in the future

13 economy and it is, therefore, essential to provide

14 this type of education for the children of New York

15 City. Also, beyond the fast free Wi-Fi, LinkNYC

16 provides useful services such as free phone calls,

17 maps and access to New York City services with the

18 purpose of establishing a more equitable and

19 connected City offering New Yorkers the opportunity

20 to tap into the Aunt Bertha database or the 311 app

21 to find food pantries, emergency housing, health care

22 and other City services ensures New Yorkers connect

23 with resources they need when and where they need

24 them. In addition to these very worthwhile local

25 benefits, LinkNYC also increases New York's profile

2 as the City that embraces technology and solidifies

3 its place as one of the primary tech hubs in the

4 United States. From the perspective of TechNYC, this

5 is no small feat. Jobs in technology are vitally

6 important for New York's continued economic health.

7 Recent statistics show that the average annual salary

8 for New York City based workers in the technology

9 industry was $147,300 compared to the citywide

10 average of $89,100 for all private sector positions.

11 In New York City, employment in the technology

12 industry after the great recession grew at four times

13 the rate of the rest of the economy and overall

14 employment in New York technology industry jobs

15 increased 71% between 2004 and 2014. Since 2010,

16 salaries in the tech sector increased by 29%, more

17 than three times faster than in the rest of the

18 private sector. We cannot emphasize the point

19 enough. When technology companies decide where to

20 set up shop, programs like LinkNYC matter because

21 they demonstrate that New York City takes technology

22 seriously and will be a partner to the industry.

23 Thank you to the City and LinkNYC for bringing this

24 first of its kind project to New York City. We are

25

2   excited to see what's next for this unique digital

3   platform.

4   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you, next.

5   ANGELA PINSKY: Hi, I'm Angela Pinsky,

6   Executive Director of the Association for a Better

7   New York. Thank you, Chair Koo, for the opportunity

8   to testify today. The Association for a Better New

9   York is a 46 year old civic organization that

10 promotes effective cooperation of public and private

11 sectors to improve the quality of life for all New

12 Yorkers. We are pleased at the opportunity to

13 express our support for the LinkNYC kiosks and to

14 encourage the Council and the administration to

15 continue to work with Intersection on the successful

16 implementation of this technology and Citywide

17 infrastructure that broadens free internet access to

18 New Yorkers, narrows the digital divide, provides

19 critical connections to emergency services and

20 modernizes our streets and rationalizes our street

21 furniture to better match the needs of today's New

22 York. Since 2016, we have seen the replacement of

23 underutilized and under pay phones with the LinkNYC

24 kiosks which have shown a dramatic increase in

25 usability and value. The dynamic display has allowed

2 for increased advertising, public service

3 announcements, informative displays and items of

4 interest which contribute to a more interesting New

5 York streetscape. Initiatives such as showing the

6 content from the winter Olympics was creative and

7 innovative were not possible prior to the

8 installations. Additionally, we're now at the point

9 where an individual's reliance on the personal phone

10 is so critical that the provision of the power source

11 to someone who's about to have a phone battery die,

12 this happened to me, feels like the provision of an

13 emergency service so much so that it has become

14 practically a necessity for anybody, for any new

15 indoor public space and apprised amenity to outdoor

16 spaces. The free high speed public Wi-Fi as well as

17 the useful services on the accessible tablet

18 including free phone calls, maps, and access to City

19 services makes New York a more inviting City to

20 residents, employees and visitors. From the early

21 days of implementation, Intersection has been

22 responsive to concerns and reports raised by

23 businesses and we are pleased at the partnership the

24 installation of LinkNYC kiosks have created with

25 employers. Thank you again for the opportunity to

2 support this beneficial infrastructure and we'd be

3 happy to answer any questions.

4   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you, Noel.

5   NOEL HIDALGO: And to the sergeant at

6 arms, I have my testimony up here to distribute.

7 BetaNYC has been fully supporting Major Bloomberg and

8 Mayor de Blasio's reinvention of the municipal pay

9 phone and we're excited to see how the LinkNYC has

10 transformed the urban landscape and helped bridge the

11 digital divide and five years into this deployment,

12 we have a few observations and concerns. The

13 observations are obviously this is bridging the

14 digital divide and providing public internet access.

15 Advertising has helped fuel or fund public housing

16 connectivity which is a great thing. Links have

17 become dynamic billboards of community information.

18 Wanted to echo the fact that advertising for

19 Community Board meetings has been great to see. It's

20 also been wonderful to see advertising for

21 Participatory Budgeting and that constituents could

22 vote through the kiosks. It was awesome to see that

23 bus time has now been added on top of subway service

24 and it's been interesting over the winter to see

25 alternate side parking disclosures as well as school

2 closures go up on the LinkNYC so fundamentally as

3 devices that provide public information, they're

4 wonderful to see in the streetscape as urban

5 furniture. A little side story about how LinkNYC has

6 helped change and force Community Boards to adopt

7 21st Century tools, when Intersection and the

8 CityBridge team went out and started saying we want

9 to put Community Board websites on the Link devices,

10 a majority of the Community Board websites are not

11 mobile compliant so when they, and you can still go

12 to many of the LinkNYC devices and you'll get a, a

13 non-mobile friendly Community Board website, and it's

14 been an opportunity to work with DoITT and to work

15 with different Community Boards as well as Borough

16 Presidents to help move Community Board websites into

17 the 21st century and it's wonderful to have the

18 LinkNYC as kind of a forcing factor on that and one

19 of the things that we have heard from our community

20 is that Links are helping run fiber across the City

21 into areas that currently don't have fiber. Some of

22 our concerns that we have are one is the lack of

23 clarity on how Links watch the streets and so thank

24 you for taking in a number of our questions and

25 asking them to DoITT and to Link and having this

2 opportunity to hear how those Links are watching our

3 streets. It's been wonderful. The lack of

4 transparence or public participation around the

5 updating of the privacy policy, it was interesting to

6 heat DoITT has sole control over the privacy policy.

7 What would be great is if we can have some type of

8 public review of that process and public engagement

9 through that updating of future privacy policies and

10 then also, it's interesting to see Intersection talk

11 about the resources that are available for local

12 businesses but it's not on their website and so

13 having clear links for how to access those types of

14 resources would be great. It's, right now it does

15 take you to a web form and that's very ambiguous.

16 Some of the opportunities that we've identified are

17 the fact that Links are a critical piece of

18 infrastructure around different civic institutions.

19 We would love to see Link links surrounding NYCHA

20 developments. We would love to see Links outside of

21 every library, school, Community Board district

22 office, Council district office and senior center.

23 Essentially, any place that has the potential to host

24 a public meeting, we would love to have a LinkNYC

25 device there so that way there is an opportunity to

2 figure out to bridge that internet connectivity to

3 that public meeting. I want to go back to this point

4 about that Links are bringing more than Wi-Fi. They

5 provide the foundation for us to do our digital

6 civics classes and then on top of that, they're

7 literally stringing fiber across the City which then

8 enables for local businesses to tap into those fiber

9 connections which we've heard from our community is a

10 critical component in making sure that businesses are

11 brought into the 21st century and we would hope that

12 the Council, as you host future oversight hearings,

13 really digs into, no pun intended, the conversation

14 around how fiber is being pulled because that is a

15 fundamental component for the next 21st century New

16 York City. Thank you.

17   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you very much. I

18 agree with all of you, thank you.

19   [Laughter]

20   CHAIRPERSON KOO: We have Andy Penny,

21 ZenFi and Christopher Mendoza, C4Q and Alex

22 Glazebrook from OATS and the last one is Greg Mays

23 from a Better Jamaica.

24   ALEX GLAZEBROOK: Want me to start?

25   CHAIRPERSON KOO: Yeah, push the button.

2   ALEX GLAZEBROOK: Hi thank you for having

3   us. Thank you for holding this hearing about

4   LinkNYC. My name is Alex Glazebrook. I'm the

5   Director of Training and Technology for Older Adults

6   Technology Services and Senior Planet and I first

7   wanted to thank the Council, especially Chairman Koo

8   for their supports of OATS' work and everything the

9   City is doing to bridge the digital divide for older

10   adults and I'm here today, on, not only on behalf my

11   organization but also on behalf of all the older

12   adults that we serve in New York City and we're here

13   to express our continued support for LinkNYC because

14   we think it's a vital resource for the City. We've

15   been involved in this important work from the

16   beginning. The team that designed the kiosk was

17   conscientious about accessible design and actually

18   turned to us for support. We believe that these

19   kiosks play a key role in bridging the digital divide

20   by providing convenient free access to all New

21   Yorkers. We know from the report that was just

22   published by the Mayor's Office of the Chief

23   Technology Officer that New York City, a third of the

24   homes in New York City lack home broadband access and

25   for, there was a big piece in the report about equity

2   of broadband and New Yorkers of different ages are

3   disconnected so New Yorkers 65 and over are one and a

4   half times more likely than other age groups to lack

5   home broadband subscriptions so the LinkNYC has

6   played a very critical role for people who either

7   can't afford broadband or just don't have it in their

8   homes for whatever reason and New Yorkers over 65 are

9   also three times as likely to lack any home internet

10   subscription at all, broadband or what have you so in

11   light of these facts, the LinkNYC system serves as a

12   critical resource for older New Yorkers who may lack

13   access at home or elsewhere and LinkNYC secure

14   connection is safe enough for older adults to use for

15   these purposes and we really think it's a amazing

16   resource for the City. Just as a little side note,

17   we've been experimenting with robots. They're called

18   telepresence robots so think of it basically as Skype

19   on wheels and they are robots that you can take

20   control of remotely and actually wheel around so

21   we've taken them to museums and stuff but LinkNYC is

22   actually creating access points where we can have

23   people that are in their homes take control of our

24   robots and go down the City streets and interact with

25   people with the robots because of the Wi-Fi that's

2 being provided by the LinkNYC hotspots. I know

3 that's kind of a strange application but it's a cool

4 application and think the boundaries are kind of

5 limitless for the technology so I'll save going

6 through all of the resources that LinkNYC provides

7 and we're also going to be partnering with our allies

8 at Age Friendly to be creating a campaign that's

9 going to be displayed on the Links for older New

10 Yorkers to talk about the training. We're doing and

11 also resources in the City that apply specifically to

12 older adults so thank you for having me and I'll keep

13 it there. Thank you.

14   CHRIS MENDOZA: Hi, I'm name is Chris

15 Mendoza. I am the Head of Government Affairs for

16 C4Q, a coalition for Queens and so thank you Chair

17 Koo and members on the Committee of Technology for

18 the opportunity to testify today. We're honored to

19 have this opportunity to support LinkNYC. C4Q a

20 little bit is a non-profit that aims to create

21 opportunity through technology by teaching coding and

22 professional skills to talented adults from diverse

23 and low income backgrounds. Through this, we hope to

24 create and maintain a diverse tech community that is

25 reflective of our society today. Since LinkNYC

2 launched in February 2016, the benefits have been

3 clear. Replacing antiquated pay phones with the

4 smart City kiosks are a vast improvement in look and

5 impact while most importantly offering super-fast,

6 free Wi-Fi to New Yorkers in every community for

7 free. These innovative kiosks play a key role in

8 bridging the digital divide and leveling the digital

9 playing field for all New Yorkers. And an additional

10 note, I'd like to say that we used LinkNYC last year

11 throughout our application process as we were looking

12 for students to apply for our program and we saw an

13 uptick in applications as people were putting in

14 their applications that they saw the advertisement

15 for our program in the LinkNYC kiosks so it was an

16 invaluable tool in helping us recruit the right

17 people for our current class now. Beyond your super-

18 fast, free Wi-Fi, LinkNYC also provides useful

19 services on the accessible tablet such as free phone

20 calls, maps, access to New York City services, all

21 with the purpose of establishing a more equitable and

22 connected City. LinkNYC offers New Yorkers the

23 opportunity to tap into Aunt Bertha's database or

24 311, for example, to find food pantries, emergency

25 housing and other City services to make sure that New

2 Yorkers are getting the resource they need when they

3 need them. We as well, and me personally, we enjoy

4 all the local and useful information LinkNYC displays

5 on the digital screens from weather and transit

6 updates to community fund facts and local business

7 information. Thank you to the City and LinkNYC for

8 bringing this first of its kind project to New York

9 City. I'm excited to see what's next with this

10 unique digital platform and we're excited to continue

11 working with LinkNYC to increase the application

12 process of our program and to increase the diverse

13 students that we accept into our program. Thank you.

14   GREG MAYS: Okay, good afternoon. I'm

15 Greg Mays, Executive Director of a Better Jamaica.

16 We're a community service organization based in

17 Jamaica, Queens. We have about 16 or 17 programs so

18 let's see, since launching in February 2016 the

19 LinkNYC kiosks have replaced the eyesores that once

20 blighted our streets with smart kiosks that not only

21 display relevant advertising and information but

22 provide those without smart phones the opportunities

23 to browse the web, make phone calls and for people

24 like me who come out with a dead phone, the

25 opportunity to charge their phones as well so

2 additionally, LinkNYC has allowed us to turn the

3 kiosks into actual art exhibition space so we have

4 actually mounted two exhibitions if you will. They

5 go for a month at a time and I think in the handout

6 that the gentleman there gave you, you will see

7 actually two of the, the two exhibits that we've

8 launched. They feature the work of local, locally

9 based or focused on artists and stuff so again

10 they're month long ones. The first was an exhibition

11 from a photographer who has used St. Albans, a

12 section of Jamaica, to essentially just sort of

13 exhibit and document that neighborhood and the second

14 is from, so that photographer is twenty something

15 years old. The second exhibit is by a painter who is

16 about 84 years old and again we use the kiosk to just

17 sort of feature about ten of his works so each artist

18 got to just sort of exhibit ten pieces of art and

19 we're presently or I'm about to approach the LinkNYC

20 folks about our third exhibition which will feature

21 the work of a woman artist who is based in southeast

22 Queens so just a unique way for us. If we had to pay

23 for the bus shelter space to use as an exhibition

24 space, it would be out of the range of what we could

25 afford so thankfully we've been working with the

2   folks there to provide this space on a monthly basis

3   and finally I'd just like to give a shout out to Ruth

4   Fastil. I thought I was the only person who just

5   sort of worked at 11:30 at night, at midnight, and we

6   exchanged emails at that time quite a few times so

7   it's good to know that there are other just sort of

8   workaholics out there trying to get the job done.

9   Thank you.

10   CHAIRPERSON KOO: I'm glad all the public

11   response are positive so we hope we can continue to

12   do well good work. Thank you, thank LinkNYC and all

13   the community advocates. So are there any more

14   public participation? Seeing none, this public

15   hearing will be closed. [gavel] Thank you.

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the

foregoing transcript is a true and accurate

record of the proceedings. We further certify that

there is no relation to any of the parties to

this action by blood or marriage, and that there

is interest in the outcome of this matter.

Date ___ May 10, 2018 _____