

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

Jointly with

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

----- X

May 29, 2025
Start: 10:17 a.m.
Recess: 3:27 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Justin L. Brannan
Chairperson

Yusef Salaam
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Diana I. Ayala
Gale Brewer
Selvena N. Brooks-Powers
David M. Carr
Amdanda Farías
Kamillah Hanks
Crystal Hudson
Farah N. Louis
Francisco P. Moya
Chi A. Ossé
Keith Powers
Pierina Ana Sanchez

Althea V. Stevens
Nantasha N. Williams
Julie Won
Tiffany Cabán
Carmen N. De La Rosa
Robert F. Holden
Rita C. Joseph
Christopher Marte
Carlina Rivera

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Jessica Tisch
New York City Police Department Commissioner

Tania Kinsella
NYPD First Deputy Commissioner

Kristine Ryan
NYPD Deputy Commissioner of Management and Budget

Michael Gerber
NYPD Deputy Commissioner of Legal Matters

Gregory Clifford
NYPD Deputy Chief Commanding Officer to Office of
Management Analysis and Planning

Joseph Gulotta
NYPD Chief of Transit

Michael Lipetri
NYPD Chief of Crime Control Strategies

Olufunmilola F. Obe
NYPD Chief of Transportation

Martine Materasso
NYPD Chief of Training

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Richard Napolitano
NYPD Deputy Chief

Charles McEvoy
NYPD Chief of Housing

Phillip Rivera
NYPD Chief of Patrol

Bruce Ceparano
NYPD Chief of Department

Tracy Mulet
NYPD Inspector

Joseph Kenny
NYPD Chief of Detectives

Deanna Logan
Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice Director

Nora Daniel
Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice Chief of Staff

Robert Fiato
Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice Chief
Financial Officer

Candice Julien
Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice Chief
Operating Officer

Jane Fox
UAW Local 2325

Arisleyda Estrella-Skinner
Local 5911 DC37

Jesse Stephen
Station 31

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Lisa Schreibersdorf
Executive Director of Brooklyn Defender Services

Juval Scott
Bronx Defenders

Piyali Basak
Neighborhood Defender Services

Michael Greco
Vice President of Local 2507

Hailey Nolasco
Center for Justice Innovation

Yarelis Leonardo
Getting Out, Staying Out

Ruth Lowenkron
NYLPI

Megan French-Marcelin
Legal Action Center on behalf of the NYC ATI and
Reentry Coalition

William Medina
Workers Justice Project

Carolyn Lewis
National Child ID Program

Daphne Thammasila
Asian American Federation

Maryam Khaldi
Arab-American Association of New York

Reem Ramadan
NYC Anti-Violence Project

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Hana Jang
Korean American Family Service Center

Y Jennings

Constance Lesold

Ligia Guallpa
Workers Justice Project

Christopher Leon Johnson

Adrianna Rivera

David Cook

Jonnie Gillam

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 7

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good morning and
3 welcome to today's New York City Council Executive
4 Budget hearing for the Committee on Finance joint
5 with the Committee on Public Safety. At this time, we
6 ask that you please silence all electronic devices
7 and at no time are you to approach the dais. If
8 you'd like to sign up for in-person testimony or have
9 any other questions throughout the hearing, please
10 see one of the Sergeant at Arms. Chairs, we're ready
11 to begin.

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you,
13 Sergeant. [gavel] Okay, good morning and welcome to
14 day 12 of FY26 Executive Budget hearings. I'm
15 Council Member Justin Brannan. I chair the Committee
16 on Finance. Today's hearing is on the New York City
17 Police Department and I'm proud to be joined by my
18 friend and colleague, Council Member Yusef Salaam who
19 chairs the Committee on Public Safety. We've been
20 joined this morning by Council Members Cabán, Louis,
21 Williams, Moya and Carr, and Holden, as well.
22 Welcome, Commissioner Tisch and your team. Thank you
23 all for joining us today to answer our questions.
24 Just as a reminder, this is a government proceeding
25 and decorum shall be observed at all times. As such,

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 8

2 members of the public shall remain silent. We'll be
3 taking public testimony on the NYPD and the Mayor's
4 Office of Criminal Justice Executive Budgets later
5 today after testimony from the agencies. So if you
6 wish to speak on either of those items, just make
7 sure you fill out one of those witness slips located
8 at the back table with the Sergeant at Arms and we'll
9 call you up later on today. Just to set the table,
10 on May 1st, 2025, the administration released their
11 Executive Financial Plan for FY26 to 29 with a
12 proposed FY26 budget of \$115.1 billion. NYPD's
13 proposed FY26 budget of \$6.1 billion represents 5.3
14 percent of the administration's proposed FY26 budget
15 in the Executive Plan. The \$6.1 billion remains
16 unchanged from the amount originally allocated in the
17 Preliminary Plan back in January. As of March 2025,
18 the NYPD had 1,637 vacancies relative to their FY25
19 budgeted headcount. In the Council's Preliminary
20 Budget response, we continue to push the
21 administration to fill vacant or absent 911 system
22 operator and police officer positions, as well as
23 continue to push to reduce overtime spending. My
24 questions today will largely focus on unspent funds,
25 overtime, the Quality of Life Division, police radio

2 encryption, School Safety Agents, and pension
3 increases. But now I want to turn to my co-chair for
4 this hearing, Council Member Yusef Salaam so he can
5 give his opening statement. Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you, Chair.
7 Good morning. Welcome to the Fiscal 2026 Executive
8 Budget hearing for the Committee on Public Safety. I
9 am Council Member Yusef Salaam, Chair of the
10 Committee on Public Safety. Today, we will discuss
11 the fiscal 2026 Executive Budget for the Police
12 Department and the Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice
13 to understand the administration's budget proposal
14 for two agencies that play a central role for public
15 safety. I'd like to welcome the leadership fo these
16 two agencies. Today, I'm interested in learning
17 about changes in NYPD's budget, specifically for
18 recruitment, overtime, budgeted structure, equipment
19 funding, subway and street safety. Additionally, the
20 Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice recently released
21 an update to the 2019 Points of Agreement which is a
22 list of commitments that must be met in order to be
23 able to properly and safely close Rikers Island. I
24 intend to ask about the methodology and publication
25 of this document and clarify many of the updates that

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 10

2 are directly impacted by the policies and actions of
3 the Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice. The
4 committee would also like to discuss these and other
5 budgetary changes and their impact on public safety.

6 I also want to thank our Public Safety staff for
7 their hard work, our Financial Analyst, Owen
8 Kotowski [sp?], and Casey Lajszky , Policy Analyst,
9 Benjamin-- Chad Benjamin, Counsel Jeremy Whiteman
10 [sp?], and Senior Counsel Josh Kingsley [sp?]. I
11 also want to thank my staff, Wilma Brown [sp?],
12 Mufazzal Hossain [sp?], Lermond Mayes [sp?]. I
13 would also like to welcome Commissioner Tisch and
14 her team who we will hear from first, and I'm going
15 to now pass it back to my co-chair Justin Brannan.

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Chair
17 Salaam. Before we get started, I also want to thank
18 Jack Storey [sp?], Casey Lajszky [sp?], and Owen
19 Kotowski and all the Council Finance Staff. This is
20 day 12. Tomorrow will be our last hearing of three
21 weeks of Executive Budget hearings, and I really
22 want to thank our staff and everyone that works so
23 hard behind the scenes to help make these hearings
24 possible. I'm now going to turn it over to my

25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 11
2 Committee Counsel Brian Sarfo [sp?] to swear everyone
3 in, and we can get started.
4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Good morning. Do you
5 affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing
6 but the truth before this committee and to respond
7 honestly to Council Member questions? Commissioner
8 Tisch?
9 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I do.
10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: First Deputy
11 Kinsella?
12 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA: I
13 do.
14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Deputy Commissioner
15 Ryan?
16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: I do.
17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Deputy Commissioner
18 Gerber? Deputy Chief Clifford?
19 DEPUTY CHIEF CLIFFORD: I do.
20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And I have Chief
21 Kenny? Thanks. You may begin.
22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Good morning, Chair
23 Salaam, Chair Brannan, and members of the City
24 Council Committees on Public Safety and Finance. I
25 am Jessica Tisch, Commissioner of the New York City

2 Police Department. I am joined at the table today by
3 First Deputy Commissioner Tania Kinsella, Deputy
4 Commissioner of Management and Budget, Kristine Ryan,
5 Deputy Commissioner of Legal Matters, Michael Gerber,
6 and Deputy Chief Gregory Clifford, Commanding Officer
7 of the Office of Management Analysis and Planning, as
8 well as other members of my executive staff. Thank
9 you for the opportunity to testify today on the
10 NYPD's Fiscal Year 2026 Executive Budget. In March,
11 we provided comprehensive testimony on many topics,
12 ranging from crime reduction strategies, to an
13 internal NYPD reforms, to public safety legislation.
14 Today, we are here to provide updates on some of
15 those issues and to discuss more ways that we can
16 work together on behalf of all the people that we
17 serve. Major crime in New York City continues to go
18 down in our precincts and our subways and in our
19 housing developments. NYPD officers have taken more
20 than 2,200 illegal guns off our streets in 2025 and
21 nearly 22,000 since the Adams administration began.
22 This has helped drive down citywide shooting
23 incidents by 20 percent from this point last year,
24 and the NYPD's work in May has been exceptional. We
25 just had the safest Memorial Day weekend in terms of

2 gun violence that New York City has ever seen with
3 the fewest shootings in recorded history and zero
4 shootings on that Sunday. The first time that has
5 happened in the 32 years that we have been keeping
6 records. And with two full days remaining in the
7 month, we are on track to have the fewest murders and
8 the fewest shootings for any May on record. This is
9 the result of smart strategy, thoughtful execution,
10 precise analysis, and 49,000 people all focused on
11 one thing, public safety. And that focus on crime
12 fighting is at the heart of our Summer Violence
13 Reduction Plan. This plan continues the work that
14 has made our neighborhoods, subways and housing
15 developments safer through the expansion of our
16 citywide zones. As we have seen over the past
17 several months, this data-driven scalpel approach
18 works. Throughout our zone deployments in some of our
19 city's' most violent areas, major crime is down
20 nearly 20 percent year-to-date. Now, we have
21 expanded and repositioned our deployments based on
22 current data, crime trends and community concerns.
23 The result is 70 summer zones covering 57 different
24 commands across all five boroughs. This is the
25 largest deployment of its kind in Department history;

2 1,500 uniformed officers on foot posts, in precincts,
3 public housing and in our subways, and all them
4 focused on high-priority index crimes and shootings.
5 The summer is just getting underway, but the early
6 results of this plan are quite promising. Since May
7 5th, major crime in our summer zones during
8 deployment is down nearly 30 percent with double-
9 digit decreases in robbery, felony assault, burglary,
10 grand larceny, and auto theft. Shootings are down
11 more than 57 percent, and major subway crime within
12 these zones is down 29 percent. Just as I laud the
13 NYPD's successes fighting crime, I'm equally candid
14 about the challenges that we still face. Whether it
15 is surging recidivism, faults in the discovery law,
16 or the proliferation of illegal firearms, we must
17 deal with every issue directly and honestly, and that
18 includes juvenile gun violence. Two weeks ago a 16-
19 year-old girl was killed by a stray bullet fired into
20 a group of children by a 14-year-old boy who was
21 handed the gun by a 13-year-old boy. It was a
22 tragedy, but it was not an aberration. From 2018 to
23 2024, the number of children under the age of 18
24 arrested with a gun increased by 136 percent in New
25 York City. Over the same time, shooters under the

2 age of 18 went up by 92 percent, and young shooting
3 victims increased 81 percent. Why? What happened?

4 Among the factors, the first part of New York State's
5 Raise the Age Law took effect in 2018. The

6 legislation changed both the age of criminal

7 responsibility and the way teenage offenders are

8 processed in the courts. The idea behind this was

9 one that we can all agree with. Children should not

10 be treated like adults in our criminal justice

11 system, but as the law took effect, here's what we

12 saw: when the age of criminal responsibility went

13 up, the age of criminal suspects went down. Gangs

14 and crews began recruiting younger and younger

15 members and had them carry the guns and commit the

16 shootings, the robberies, the assaults. Before Raise

17 the Age, about 30 percent of our arrests of

18 individuals under age 18 were for a major felony.

19 Now, it's 60 percent. And we cannot forget, when

20 more shooters are kids, more shooting victims are

21 kids, too. This is serious and seriously bad things

22 come from a consequence-free environment. Over the

23 next year we need to have honest conversations about

24 how the criminal justice system deals with youth

25 offenders because the current trajectory is

2 unsustainable and unsafe. I do not come here with all
3 the answers, but I do look forward to working with
4 the Council on effective youth strategies. In the
5 first quarter of this year, shootings in New York
6 City fell to their lowest level ever. We had the
7 second fewest homicides in recorded history. There
8 were double-digit crime declines across patrol,
9 transit and housing. The public safety gains made by
10 the men and women of the NYPD were truly historic.
11 But even as crime and violence fell, New Yorkers were
12 telling us they still did not feel safe. Chronic
13 conditions in their neighborhoods like abandoned
14 vehicles, homeless encampments, illegal parking,
15 unreasonable noise, public drinking and urination,
16 and open-air drug markets give the impression of
17 chaos and disorder. They make people feel unsafe,
18 and calls to 311 concerning quality of life issues
19 nearly doubled in the past six years. So, in direct
20 response to these increased 311 complaints, the NYPD
21 launched the Quality of Life Division in mid-April,
22 recentering our approach to public safety. Since
23 inception, our Q Teams have resolved thousands of 311
24 calls across six commands, helping to clear blocked
25 driveways and bike lanes, settle noise complaints and

2 keep our public space safe and orderly, and they have
3 ensured that these issues are addressed promptly and
4 do not languish for days. This work is having a real
5 impact. In less than six weeks, the Quality of Life
6 Division has seized more than 200 illegal mopeds and
7 recklessly operated e-bikes, remove more than 2,000
8 abandoned derelict or unregistered vehicles, cleared
9 around 440 encampments, and inspected more than 400
10 smoke shops, padlocking around 50 of them. In 2025,
11 Quality of Life enforcement is not about preventing
12 more serious crime. In fact, is not about crime at
13 all. It is about improving quality of life, being
14 responsive to community complaints, and fixing the
15 very real issues people are dealing with every day,
16 including out of control e-bikes. Every person is
17 obligated to follow the very basic rules of the road.
18 When it comes to traffic safety, compliance is not
19 optional. We will not tolerate e-bikes driving
20 recklessly, running red lights, ignoring stop signs,
21 driving on the sidewalk, and riding against traffic.
22 Residents have consistently raised fears about
23 serious injury or worse, and this enforcement
24 initiative is in direct response to those clear
25 concerns, and the enforcement looks different now for

2 one simple reason: our previous approach wasn't
3 working. B summonses returnable to traffic court are
4 part of a regulatory framework designed for licensed
5 car drivers. If you ignore a B summonses, you have
6 your license suspended. If you are a menace on the
7 roads have accumulate enough points on your license,
8 it will be suspended. None of this makes any sense
9 for e-bikes because a license is not required to
10 operate one. So, instead for certain hazardous
11 offenses, we are issuing C summonses returnable to
12 criminal court. This is the option available to the
13 NYPD are under the current law, and we are eager to
14 work with the Council and the state legislature on a
15 new meaningful paradigm for biking enforcement. But
16 I want to be clear, far from being a war on e-bikes,
17 this enforcement initiative is designed to keep these
18 vehicles as a viable and sustainable transportation
19 option in New York City. There is a desperate need
20 for legislative reform to keep pace with the reality
21 on the streets, and to the extent that had not
22 happened yet, it has created dangerous conditions.
23 The NYPD is responsible for keeping people safe
24 consistent with the law, and we will continue to do
25 so. In 2025, the NYPD has issued nearly 251,000

2 summonses to cars versus about 5,100 summonses to e-
3 bikes. So clearly, this initiative is only one part
4 of our larger effort to ensure safe streets for all
5 New Yorkers, work that is saving lives. This year,
6 traffic fatalities are down 24 percent and collision
7 injuries are down 12 percent, and every vehicle-type
8 collision category is down year-to-date with one
9 exception, and that is e-bikes. The NYPD depends on
10 the public trust. That trust is built by
11 unimpeachable integrity and it is maintained by
12 strong ethical leadership. Over the past five months
13 we have reshaped our executive leadership, amended
14 our vehicle pursuit policy, reduced waste and
15 redundancy in our vehicle fleet, and returned more
16 than a thousand cops from administrative roles back
17 to patrol. We continue to enhance efficiency,
18 improve policy and reinforce accountability. When I
19 was last here, I said that we were focused on our
20 disciplinary process and ensuring that it is fair and
21 effective. That means having an Internal Affairs
22 Bureau that identifies and roots out cases of
23 misconduct and having a Department Advocates Office
24 that prosecutes those cases rigorously. It also
25 means that we must have a thorough and consistent

2 process when the CCRB substantiates allegations of
3 misconduct. When I started in this position, I
4 became concerned that some of our procedures for CCRB
5 cases had come unmoored from the principles that
6 guide our disciplinary system. We needed to make
7 changes and we did. For example, paragraph two of
8 our 2012 MOU with the CCRB states that when the CCRB
9 is seeking charges and specifications against and
10 officer, there are certain circumstances in which the
11 Police Commissioner can retain the case rather than
12 it being prosecuted by the CCRB. In particular, I
13 can take this step when there are ongoing parallel or
14 related criminal investigations, or in the interest
15 of justice when an officer has no disciplinary
16 history or prior substantiated CCRB complaints, but
17 just because I can do something does not always mean
18 that I should. I am committed to being thoughtful
19 about when I exercise this authority, and I have
20 been. Last year, the Department took 93 cases away
21 from the CCRB pursuant to this provision to
22 authority. In the first four months of this year,
23 that number is 13. And until a few months ago, we
24 were imposing a short SOL rule that administratively
25 closed hundreds of CCRB cases that came to us shortly

before the statute of limitations expired. I ordered the Department Advocates Office to reverse that policy decision and eliminate that rule. My directive is clear. Cases should not be closed on technicalities, and we must make substantial efforts to review every case brought to us by the CCRB. In 2024, 848 CCRB cases were closed because of short SOL. Since we made this change on March 1st, there have only been three. Going forward, that number can be zero, and it should be, but I want to be clear, the CCRB needs to do its part here. Our Department Advocates Office is making herculean efforts to process cases quickly. In some instances, we only have days, and this is not fair to the officers or to the complainants. We urge the CCRB to review its own procedures and to take steps to process cases expeditiously. Discipline is important. Even more important is to improve our practices so that we get it right and that there is no need for discipline. My team is working closely and collaboratively with the Federal Monitor to achieve the goals of the monitorship and to ensure that our stop, question and frisk practices are constitutionally sound. That is why at ComplianceStat we are laser-focused on the

2 constitutionality of stops, frisks and searches
3 conducted by our officers. We are putting time and
4 resources into ComplianceStat, and it is working. In
5 the third quarter of 2024, the Monitor found that 91
6 percent of our stops were lawful, compared to 82
7 percent in the first quarter. We also improved over
8 that time when it comes to frisks, 79 percent
9 compliance versus 62 percent, and searches 78 percent
10 compliance versus 67 percent. Through
11 ComplianceStat, we can and will push those
12 ComplianceStat rates even higher. When we talk about
13 stops, we also must acknowledge longstanding racial
14 disparities. The Monitor has found that controlling
15 for various factors such as the crimes being
16 investigated when it comes to a variety of post-stop
17 outcomes such as frisks, searches, arrests,
18 summonses, use of force, and the recovery of
19 contraband or weapons. Racial disparities over time
20 have been substantially reduced or been eliminated
21 entirely. For the stops themselves, racial
22 disparities over time have been substantially reduced
23 or been eliminated entirely. For the stops
24 themselves, racial disparities remain and we are
25 working with the Monitor to formulate a 14th

2 Amendment compliance plan that will tackle that issue
3 head-on. When it comes to constitutional policing,
4 we are proud of our successes and clear-eyed about
5 the challenges that remain. We will continue to
6 identify where we fall short and implement ways to be
7 better. New Yorkers deserve nothing less. As you
8 know, I am committed to the efficient and appropriate
9 use of overtime at the NYPD, and our Overtime
10 Management Plan is achieving that goal. In the first
11 half of Fiscal Year 2025, the NYPD's overtime
12 spending was about 11 percent above the previous
13 year. Now, we have not only slowed that trend, we
14 have reversed it. Since the plan was implemented,
15 each month has seen significant reductions in
16 overtime spending year over year. when compared to
17 the same month in 2024, January overtime spending was
18 down 9.7 percent. February was down 10.1 percent.
19 March was down 14 percent, and April was down 15
20 percent. You can clearly see the improving trend as
21 a plan has been honed and refined over time, and
22 these reductions resulted in combined savings of
23 \$40.4 million over the first four months of 2025
24 compared to last year. Overall, with this renewed
25 focus and enhanced compliance measures, we anticipate

2 that our overtime spending will be lower than the
3 target established with the Office of Management and
4 Budget for Fiscal Year 2025 and significantly lower
5 than it would have been if no measures were taken in
6 January. To be clear, none of this has come at the
7 expense of public safety. We continue to do all the
8 necessary work to reduce crime and improve quality of
9 life. No one does it better than the women and men
10 at the NYPD, but it is no secret that we need more of
11 them. And as I have said before, this is not a budget
12 problem. We have the will and we have the means, but
13 lately we don't have the applicants. The result is
14 an 11 percent drop in NYPD uniformed headcount over
15 the past seven years. It's simple, more cops on
16 patrol make our city safer. Hiring a thousand
17 recruits in January of this year was a good start,
18 but it was not nearly enough. So, we expanded our
19 eligibility requirements, reducing the number of
20 college credits needed to apply from 60 down to 24.
21 This brought the NYPD more in line with modern
22 standards, since most of our peer agencies do not
23 require any college credits at all. Those changes
24 took effect in February and the impact was immediate.
25 In the past few months more than 12,600 new filers

2 have registered to take the police officer exam, and
3 more than 4,000 previously ineligible applicants
4 moved to reopen their cases. Daily applications are
5 up 75 percent, going from an average of 56 per day up
6 to 98, and about 4,100 people have registered for the
7 next police exam. This gives us a fighting chance to
8 reach Mayor Adams' goal of 35,000 uniformed officers
9 by the fall of next year, a headcount that we haven't
10 seen since 2022. Our Department's goal is to hire
11 about 35 new officers in 2025, continuing the year
12 over year increases from the 2,041 hires in 2022,
13 2,356 in 2023, and 2,631 in 2024. This is good news
14 for our city, but we need the news to be even better.
15 Increased headcount means less overtime, less stress
16 in our workforce and better service for New Yorkers.
17 I am confident that we can get there and we
18 appreciate the Mayor's and the Council's support in
19 this effort. There are many other areas as well
20 where the NYPD and the City Council can work together
21 to increase public safety and dramatically improve
22 the quality of life in our city. First, we propose a
23 change to the Administrative Code to make it a
24 misdemeanor to possess an ATV within the confines of
25 New York City. Though ATVs cannot be legally

operated on New York City roadways they can be legally possessed, making enforcement of the law challenging. Second, we need to revisit the law regarding groups wearing masks in public. What was a public health necessity five years ago has now become an easy way for criminals to hide their identities and we cannot allow this to continue. The members of the NYPD and the New York City Council want the same thing, a safe city for all. Whenever possible, we should be working together toward that shared goal and I am eager to partner with you on any policies and legislation that gets us closer to achieving it. And finally, the Council has before it a bill that would ban the Department's criminal group database. We spoke about this in our hearing in March, and since then the database has continued to play a critical role in keeping our city safe. This intelligence tool helps us to understand crew-related violence and identify potential retaliation targets after a shooting. Simply put, this investigative tool helps the NYPD save lives. We saw this in late April when we announced a major gang takedown with the southern district where a long-term investigation led to the indictment of 27 TDA members on charges

2 including racketeering and sex trafficking. Every
3 single person indicted was listed in the database.
4 Similar gang cases were recently closed in Queens and
5 Manhattan this year with help from the database,
6 including the early May assault in Times Square
7 against our cops by Los Diablos, a splinter set of
8 TDA. Several of those suspects were listed in the
9 database which aided in their swift apprehension. I
10 have been clear and consistent on this. If you want
11 to work with us to improve the database, we are eager
12 to sit down and discuss this together, but don't
13 eliminate it. Doing so will make our city and its
14 people less safe. Now, I will speak briefly about a
15 topic on the minds of many New Yorkers and that is
16 immigration enforcement. Under City law we are not
17 allowed to participate in or assist in civil
18 immigration enforcement, and we do not. We have been
19 very clear and consistent on this, and our officers
20 understand that this is a red line that we cannot
21 cross. At the same time, we will continue to target
22 criminals regardless of their immigration status. As
23 permitted by law, we work daily on criminal
24 investigations with federal law enforcement through
25 various taskforces and that partnership requires that

2 we share information. That is what it means to
3 conduct a joint investigation and to work
4 collaboratively with our federal partners. Some have
5 asked whether we should reconsider our cooperation
6 with federal agencies on criminal investigations in
7 light of their work with ICE. The short straight
8 answer to this is no. Working with our federal
9 partners on criminal matters is crucial to the safety
10 of our city. We are talking about cases to protect
11 our city from terrorism, saving children from
12 exploitation and sex trafficking and combatting
13 transnational criminal organizations. The only way
14 these investigations are successful is by NYPD
15 detectives working seamlessly with federal agents on
16 a daily basis. Interfering with that work would be
17 disastrous for the people of New York City. Now, let
18 me be clear, I am nobody's fool. If we were to find
19 that a federal agency had not been honest with us, if
20 we were told that a records request was for a
21 criminal investigation, but in fact that was not
22 true, then that would be a tremendous breach of our
23 trust and we would need to reconsider how we do
24 business with that federal agency. I have been very
25 upfront about that with all of our federal partners.

2 But my experience has been just the opposite. We
3 have an incredibly good relationship with our federal
4 partners, a relationship built on mutual respect and
5 trust. I know that I value that relationship and I
6 know that my federal counterparts feel the same way.
7 Now turning the Mayor's Executive Budget and its
8 impact on the NYPD in the coming fiscal year. In
9 totality, the NYPD's Fiscal Year 2026 expense budget
10 is \$6.14 billion, the vast majority of which or 92
11 percent is allocated for personnel costs. The
12 remaining eight percent is dedicated to non-personnel
13 costs which include costs for technology that
14 provides officers with immediate access to critical
15 data and applications, safety equipment, our response
16 vehicles, and facilities. We are grateful for the
17 additional new funding of \$322.9 million included as
18 part of the Executive Budget which is for the
19 following in the current fiscal year only: \$301.8
20 million to address our structural overtime shortfall
21 in the current fiscal year, and \$21.1 million towards
22 the Department's structural technology funding
23 shortfall. Mayor Adams has proven his commitment to
24 public safety again, and again, and again, and the
25 NYPD is thankful for his continued support. In

2 addition to the Department's operating budget, our
3 10-year capital strategy includes \$1.55 billion for
4 fiscal years 2025 through 2035. This funding is
5 critical for facility construction projects. Over
6 \$698 million or 45 percent of the capital budget
7 including a renovated firearms training facility,
8 communications, and other infrastructure technology
9 infrastructure, over \$428 million or 28 percent. And
10 large vehicle life-cycle replacements including ESU
11 trucks, tow trucks, boats, and helicopters, \$385
12 million or 25 percent. While we have not yet
13 experienced any direct impact on our federal funding
14 levels under the new administration. We are closely
15 monitoring any directives and new grant guidance.
16 Federal funding while only making up 3.7 percent of
17 our overall budget covers critical functions within
18 the Department. On average, the NYPD receives just
19 under \$200 million each year in new federal grant
20 funding, and the majority of that support
21 historically comes from the U.S. Department of
22 Homeland Security. The DHS grants enhance the
23 Department's counterterrorism capabilities,
24 especially in the transit system and at our ports.
25 Thee grant funds have supported counterterrorism

2 efforts by funding the Department's efforts to among
3 other priorities deploy officers within the transit
4 system and train officers to respond to chemical
5 ordinance, biological and radiological threats or
6 incidents. On March 27th, 2025, the Department of
7 Homeland Security issued the Federal Fiscal Year 2025
8 Standard Terms and Conditions that will accompany new
9 grant agreements. Among other provisions, the grant
10 template includes a requirement that grant recipients
11 certify certain forms of cooperation with federal
12 civil immigration enforcement with the Department of
13 Homeland Security and immigration officials. In
14 addition to future funding awards being at risk,
15 because most federal grants spend multiple fiscal
16 years, potential constraints on new funds could also
17 affect dollars already awarded. At present, the
18 Department has approximately \$246 million in
19 authorized but unbilled spending across all open
20 grants. Federal fiscal year 2020 through the most
21 recent federal fiscal year 2024 which could be at
22 risk, of this \$212.1 million is DHS, \$18.4 million is
23 DOJ, and \$15.5 million is from other federal sources.
24 On May 13th, 2025, New York State Attorney General
25 Letitia James joined 19 other State Attorney General

2 in the lawsuit challenging the new DHS conditions.

3 The complaint argues that tying emergency management

4 and disaster relief funding to state immigration

5 enforcement actions unlawfully exceeds the

6 Department's statutory authority. Federal grant

7 funds are essential and critical to safeguarding New

8 York City residents and visitors, as well as our

9 critical transportation and port infrastructure. The

10 NYPD will be closely following any news and updates

11 regarding this lawsuit, and we will continue to work

12 with OMB to assess any potential impacts to this

13 critical funding stream. In my 17 years working in

14 city government, I have never accepted the status

15 quo, and the status quo no longer serves New Yorkers.

16 With that philosophy in mind, over the past six

17 months, the NYPD has reduced crime, launched a series

18 of new strategies and plans to improve safety and

19 quality of life, and instituted a number of reforms

20 to improve our efficiency, effectiveness and

21 performance. We are proud of this progress, but we

22 also know that there is more work to do. I am driven

23 by that work and committed to a strong partnership

24 with the Council. We may not always agree, but there

25 will always be clear communication and mutual respect

2 and a shared focus on the safety and the wellbeing of
3 all the people we serve. Thank you for the
4 opportunity to testify today about the extraordinary
5 work of the men and women of the New York City Police
6 Department. My staff and I look forward to answering
7 your questions.

8 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you very
9 much, Commissioner, for your testimony. We've been
10 joined by Council Members Marte, Ariola, Powers,
11 Brewer, Restler, Brooks-Powers, and Sanchez and
12 Stevens. I want to jump right into the unspent
13 salary funding. So, over the course of the fiscal
14 year NYPD hasn't been staffed to its budgeted amount.
15 We see that there are approximately 1,300 uniformed
16 vacancies and 1,600 civilian vacancies. We
17 understand the Department is trying to hire up to its
18 budgeted amount, and the Council is supportive of the
19 Department doing so. We believe hiring to your full
20 headcount could also offset some of our overtime
21 costs, which is always a topic of interest at the
22 Council. So, at this time, how much was budgeted for
23 salaries that hasn't been spent due to vacancies?

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So, actually
25 at this time, we don't have significant personnel

2 accruals because the funding that had been taken tied
3 to restricting our headcount was restored and tied to
4 restoring the classes that we had this year. So,
5 we're actually not anticipating significant accruals
6 in the current year. The budget was adjusted frankly
7 without the headcount being taken down. So, it had
8 been adjusted previously, so it's pretty in line with
9 what our staffing levels--

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: [interposing] So,
11 there won't-- there isn't unspent funding in the
12 budget due to vacancies?

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: No.

14 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Are you planning to
15 self-fund any new needs with any extra money you
16 might have?

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: We do that on
18 the margins if there's small amounts of money. For
19 example, for OTPS or PS we will mod it around, but
20 nothing significant is anticipated at this time.

21 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: And when do you
22 project that you'll be able to fill all the vacant
23 positions?

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: OMB has
25 indicated that we should be able to get to headcount

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 35

2 based on the funding perspective for fiscal year 27.

3 We are trying to do as much as we can, as the

4 Commissioner said. In the current calendar year

5 we're looking to hire 3,500 officers. We had a class

6 of over 1,000 in January, 769 in April, and--

7 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: [interposing] Are
8 you planning more Academy classes that are over a
9 thousand?

10 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yes. We are. We
11 are-- the Mayor's been very clear with us that we are
12 able to hire as many applicants as we can find.

13 Right now, the goal is 35,000 by fall of next year.

14 We had our first class in January of 1,000. That was
15 the largest class we've had in 10 years. Our next
16 class in April was about 800. We're going for
17 another 1,000 in July and another 1,000 thereafter.

18 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: The Preliminary
19 Budget hearing earlier this year, NYPD testified that
20 the projected overtime spending for FY25 is going to
21 be approximately \$1.23 billion. In this plan, \$301
22 million was added to FY25 bringing the current OT
23 budget to around a billion dollars. So, can you
24 update us on the end of year projection for overtime
25 spending?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Yeah, so
3 actually based on the overtime management plan that
4 we put in place and the savings we are seeing year
5 over year, we're now projecting \$1.1 billion for this
6 year, and a portion of that will be grant funding.

7 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: And how have some
8 of the initiatives that you've implemented affected
9 overtime spending? And how does it-- how does
10 overtime spending currently compare to last year?

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So, last year--
12 - so, essentially the first half of Fiscal Year 25,
13 as mentioned before, was almost 11 percent higher
14 than-- in 2025 was 11 percent higher than in 2024.
15 What we've seen this year since the implementation of
16 the overtime management plan is the consistent month-
17 over-month reductions. January year over year was
18 down 9.7 percent. February was down 10 percent.
19 March was down 13.7 percent year over year, and April
20 was down 15 percent.

21 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So, the FY26 OT
22 budget is \$578 million. Is PD in talks with OMB to
23 right-size the FY26 budget to more accurately reflect
24 the actual spending?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Yes. We've
3 been having those conversations. They've been
4 ongoing. We're working with OMB on our Fiscal Year
5 26 projection, and we do anticipate there will be
6 adjustments both to reflect the need that we have on
7 the city-funded side and also grants as they're
8 awarded throughout the year.

9 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. The state
10 budget included \$77 million to New York City for
11 overtime and enhanced patrol in the subways and mass
12 transit systems. What is the plan? Has it been
13 published for the public?

14 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yes. So, the NYPD
15 working with the Governor's office, that plan funds
16 mostly putting two officers on every overnight train.
17 That has been running for several months now, and we
18 are seeing very good results. In terms of our subway
19 safety numbers, as we sit here right now, I believe
20 transit crime is down six percent year to date.

21 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Could you give us
22 an idea of how many officers are dedicated just to
23 daily subway patrols?

24 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Well, for the subway
25 safety plan-- for the overnight subway safety stuff,

2 it's upwards of 300 officers that we have doing the
3 shifts on the trains.

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Is it usually the
5 same cops, or do you rotate?

6 COMMISSIONER TISCH: It is largely the
7 same officers doing it.

8 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. And how does
9 overtime spending come into play with the enhanced
10 patrol of the subways?

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Some of that is done
12 on overtime and-- which actually makes the reductions
13 that we've seen since January, since the overtime
14 management plan, all the more incredible, because
15 that is an area where we've had to use extra
16 overtime, and nonetheless, month after month we're
17 seeing double-digit declines department-wide in
18 overtime spent.

19 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. We heard
20 that approximately half of NYPD's Bomb Squad is
21 eligible for retirement. Is that true?

22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I don't have those
23 numbers in front of me.

24 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. Do--
25

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] It is
3 certainly quite possible. As I've said a number of
4 times, 20 years ago the city hired huge classes of
5 police officers, and so there is an unprecedented
6 number of people this year eligible for retirement,
7 among the reasons that we are so focused on our
8 hiring and getting as many people as possible into
9 and through our academy. But I can look at and get
10 back to you on the exact numbers of people in the
11 Bomb Squad eligible for retirement. But if you're
12 getting at are we going to train more people to join
13 the Bomb Squad, we generally look at where people are
14 eligible for retirement and try to plan accordingly
15 in terms of staffing different units in the
16 Department.

17 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. As of March,
18 around \$30 million has been spent on terminal leave.
19 It's approximately 154 percent more than what was
20 budgeted in FY25. Could you tell us what the reason
21 is for that increased spending?

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So, we have
23 seen, as the Commissioner said, there were large
24 classes 20 years ago. There were large classes in
25 January. I think there were some last year as well.

2 So, when you have more people retire, there's more
3 terminal leave payouts.

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Are more senior
5 officers with more time saved and a higher salary
6 leaving?

7 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I don't have the
8 specific distribution, but we can get back to you on
9 that.

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. Within the
11 traffic enforcement unit of appropriation there's
12 \$7.7 million budgeted which supports 160 full-time
13 positions for tow violations. As of March, we see
14 that about \$130,000 has been spent for three
15 positions. Could you walk us through that? Is this
16 actual underspending in this area, or have people
17 been reassigned?

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: I'll have to
19 get back to you on the details on that specific
20 object code and budget code.

21 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, because it
22 looks like there's like 157 vacant positions
23 according to the U of A.

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: We'll look at
25 that. There may just be a misalignment there.

2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. One more
3 from me, and then I have a lot of questions from
4 colleagues. The Executive Capital Plan includes
5 about \$80 million in FY25 and about \$12 million in
6 FY26 for the radio upgrades and encryption. This
7 represents an increase of almost \$10 million in FY26.
8 Could you tell us what the status is of the radio
9 encryption? Have all precincts and boroughs been
10 encrypted?

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: No, they have not
12 all been encrypted yet. Out of our 36 zones, 63.9
13 percent-- 23 or 63.9 percent are already encrypted,
14 and we believe that the full migration is projected
15 to complete within one year.

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: One last question,
17 just something local for me. The Capital Plan
18 includes \$9.5 million for the reconstruction of a
19 firing range in my district in Coney Island. Can you
20 tell us when construction will begin and end?

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So, we
22 actually anticipate construction beginning this
23 summer. With that, the contract is almost finalized
24 and in place. I will be before the end of the hearing
25

2 get you the exact date of when we anticipate it will
3 be complete.

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. We've also
5 been joined by Deputy Speaker Ayala. I'm now going
6 to turn it over to Chair Salaam. Thank you very
7 much.

8 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you. I want to
9 start with the 911 operators hiring. At the
10 Preliminary Budget, at that hearing we heard that
11 there was a shortage of 911 operators and that 911
12 calls were being directed to an audio recording. We
13 heard testimony that a significant amount of 911
14 operators were on leave due to mental and physical
15 stress. This is why the Council on the
16 administration to provide adequate staff to answer
17 all 911 calls in a timely manner. What is the
18 current budget and actual headcount of 911 operators?

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: The budgeted FY26
20 budgeted headcount for PCTs is 1,412. Currently, we
21 sit at 1,210 which we means we have 202 vacancies. I
22 am pleased to report that we have a plan to get to
23 our budgeted headcount within a year, and this is
24 absolutely essential. The members of our
25 Communications Division, our 911 call-takers, are a

2 lifeline for New Yorkers, and every call needs to be
3 answered without delay. But that's not all the
4 changes that we've made to our 911 call center
5 operations. Recently we changed management there.
6 We have been working directly with the union, with
7 DC37 on ways to improve the quality of the experience
8 of being a PCT. For example, we're looking at
9 providing shuttles for our 911 call-takers to the
10 trains when they're done with a busy shift, and we
11 have also changed who the 911 call-takers and the
12 Communications Division is reporting to. Our First
13 Deputy Commissioner and her office are now overseeing
14 very closely all of these changes at 911, and it has
15 quite serious focus from this Department on
16 addressing the issues that you raised at the last
17 hearing.

18 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: You said that the
19 number that you were hoping to reach or going to
20 reach was how much?

21 COMMISSIONER TISCH: The budgeted
22 headcount is 1,412.

23 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: And you're currently
24 at 1,210.

25 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yes, 202 vacancies.

2 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: 202, got it. Would
3 this be an appropriate number to answer the nearly
4 eight million 911 calls that come in each year?

5 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, I am never shy
6 about asking our Office of Management and Budget in
7 New York City or the Council for new needs, but I
8 can't-- I don't believe that I'm in a place now to
9 come to you or to come to OMB asking for new needs in
10 terms of greater authorized headcount until I get to
11 or closer to the authorized headcount. But when we
12 do a year from now, hopefully that will be a very
13 different conversation. Well, we will be having that
14 conversation. When I-- the budgeted number for
15 police communications is down in real numbers from
16 when I oversaw the Communications Division back when
17 I was Deputy Commissioner of IT, and I think we have
18 to get back towards the 2017 numbers which was a few
19 hundred PCTs higher than what the current budget is.

20 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Do you know how many
21 operators are currently on leave?

22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I do not have that
23 information in front of me, but we can get back to
24 you right after this hearing.

2 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Are 911 calls being
3 directed to an audio message?

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: When there are
5 delays, meaning when all of the 911 call-takers are
6 busy answering other calls, you will hear an audio
7 recording that basically says, just hold the phone.
8 So yes, there are some calls that do not-- that where
9 the call-- the caller will hear that audio message,
10 generally at very busy times. We are quite focused
11 on reducing the percentages of calls that go to that
12 audio recording. We need to get that back down to
13 zero. Among the reasons why we are so focused on
14 this hiring. I am proud to report that in the past
15 month, as we have been doing this real focus on
16 addressing issues at the 911 call center, the
17 percentage of calls going to that recording is
18 reduced.

19 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Do we know what the
20 average time someone who was in need of help is
21 sitting on hold when it goes to the audio message?

22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I don't have that
23 time in front of me, but I believe that that time is
24 going to be-- the average time is going to be
25

2 incredibly low because the vast majority of calls to
3 911 are answered immediately.

4 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: And on recruitment,
5 we heard in your opening statement about some of the
6 initiatives that you have taken to increase NYPD's
7 recruitment. Can you talk more about those
8 initiatives and any new ones since our hearing in
9 March?

10 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yes. A few things.
11 The first thing that we did is we looked at the
12 eligibility requirements, what requirements we put on
13 candidates looking to become police officers, and the
14 place where we had a real glaring opportunity to
15 improve was on the college credits. So, historically
16 at the Department we have required 60 college credits
17 to enter into the Academy. After a lot of thought,
18 we reduced that number down to 24 college credits.
19 At the same time, our academy has been accredited for
20 more credits than previously. So, people completing
21 the academy, they won't-- if they have less than 60
22 college credits, they won't end up with the same
23 amount of credits they otherwise would have had, but
24 they will end up with a significant amount of credits
25 at the end of their time at the Academy. We have

2 also been working with our fraternal organizations,
3 our NYPD associations. We have many, many, many of
4 them, and they know their communities the best. They
5 have been working in partnership with our Personnel
6 Bureau on a massive recruitment effort, meeting
7 people where they are in their communities, in their
8 schools, in their houses of worship, and that has
9 been quite successful in terms of driving up the
10 number of filers or applicants we have to the
11 Department over the past several months.

12 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: I've heard from
13 captains in my district, as I'm sure many of our
14 colleagues have, that they need additional officers
15 for their precincts. Can you talk about the staffing
16 levels of the precincts and how officers are assigned
17 and deployed throughout the City?

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yes. I am very-- I
19 agree with them. We need more cops in our precincts.
20 I'm also proud to tell you that as we sit right now,
21 we have more cops on patrol today than we did a year
22 ago, and that is because we've reassigned over a
23 thousand officers previously working desk jobs into
24 precincts, and as we've discussed at this hearing, we
25 are also looking to hire more and more-- as many

2 officers as possible because we need cops in our
3 patrol commands. You know, my approach to staffing
4 at the NYPD is patrol, transit, housing, operational
5 commands first. Everything else is a luxury, but
6 unless and until those commands and those positions
7 are fully staffed, we can't see bloat in other parts
8 of the Department. And so the way we've gotten more
9 cops onto patrol is one, by upping our hiring, but
10 two, reprioritizing those numbered commands, as we
11 call them.

12 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: I want to ask about
13 overtime. Recently, there was a scandal involving
14 NYPD's former Chief of Department. We would like to
15 hear about the NYPD's process for approving overtime
16 going forward.

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, in January of
18 this year we instituted an overtime management plan
19 in the Department where we set very clear thresholds
20 for uniform and civilian members of service on the
21 civilian side based on title, and on the uniform side
22 based on type of assignment. Is it operational? Is
23 it investigative, or is it administrative? We also
24 have our First Deputy Commissioner and our Deputy
25 Commissioner of Management and Budget pouring over

2 all of the overtime records to ensure that each
3 officer is not-- no officer is exceeding those
4 overtime thresholds. We have created a new position
5 in each command which is someone assigned-- an
6 executive among their duties assigned to ensuring
7 compliance with the overtime rules, and when our
8 First Deputy Commissioner or our Deputy Commissioner
9 of Management and Budget see anomalies, that's who
10 they will reach out to. But their work-- their work
11 has been extraordinary. It takes an incredible amount
12 of doggedness and effort, not just to set the
13 standards, but to make sure that the entire
14 department is conforming to them, and I believe that
15 we now have the processes and procedures that are
16 required to effectively and responsibly manage
17 overtime at the New York City Police Department. And
18 I'm sorry, I found the answer to one of your previous
19 questions. The average 911 call is answered in less
20 than six seconds.

21 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Definitely thank you
22 for that answer. Why is 98 percent of the NYPD's
23 uniformed overtime budget still held in the Chief of
24 Department's Unit of Appropriation? Wouldn't
25

2 budgeting overtime in other areas be an additional
3 check on overtime spending and approvals?

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So, the reason
5 for that is because officers are often working
6 overtime outside of their home command if it's a
7 parade, if it's a protest, if it's certain event.
8 So, we budget it centrally because we honestly don't
9 know in the beginning exactly which officers is going
10 to be doing which overtime. So, the distribution
11 would just not be realistic across each of the
12 individual structures for the commands.

13 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Would NYPD work with
14 OMB to budget overtime costs at the precincts at the
15 unit level instead of holding most of the overtime
16 funding in one budget code?

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So, because of
18 the challenges I just indicated, that would not
19 enable us to manage overtime. It would not be
20 reflective of how the overtime actually gets
21 utilized.

22 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: I want to move
23 questions about subway surfing. In recent times,
24 some of the youth in our city have been partaking in
25 a dangerous trend of subway surfing. I would like to

2 hear more from the Commissioner on the Department's
3 resources dedicated to educating and stopping our
4 youth from partaking in this dangerous activity. I
5 would also like to make sure that we aren't arresting
6 for this, but rather we are trying to make them
7 understand that this is an activity that they cannot
8 and should not do because of the inherent dangers
9 therein.

10 COMMISSIONER TISCH: If it's okay, Chair,
11 I'll have our Chief of Transit who oversees these
12 efforts answer that question.

13 CHIEF GULOTTA: Yeah, so subway surfing
14 is one of the main things we look at. The average
15 age of a subway surfer is 14 years old which is very
16 concerning for all of us. We had a meeting in this
17 room where we discussed that previously, and we take
18 it very seriously. We take a couple different
19 approaches to this. One would be we have drones up
20 looking for subway surfers, and when we do get a
21 subway surfer, and do stop them, it's not just an
22 arrest. It's not arresting. What we'll do with this
23 is we will meet with the parents. We will sit down.
24 We will talk to the kids. We will identify the
25 school. We'll get our outreach to that school and

2 speak to the students at the school, because a lot of
3 times what we see, it's repeat offenders at repeat
4 schools. So, it's about outreach at the center of
5 everything we do with subway surfing, using
6 technology to help us do that as well, and there's
7 some harrowing videos out there where you see very
8 young individuals up on top of the trains and it's
9 very concerning to us. But our core purpose is to
10 identify them, identify the repeat offenders, get
11 with their parents, get with the schools, and try to
12 prevent it in the future.

13 COMMISSIONER TISCH: And often times, the
14 parents-- the Chief has reported to me, the parents
15 are shocked when they see the videos of their kids
16 subway surfing, but the parents definitely have to be
17 a part of this equation here.

18 CHIEF GULOTTA: Yeah, and to the
19 Commissioner's point, we've had parents collapse
20 thinking that we're there to tell them a tragedy had
21 happened to their child who's subway surfing. So, we
22 see the effect. It's deep-rooted, and like I said, a
23 lot of times we see repeat offenders.

24 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Definitely. Thank
25 you for the effort to stem this dangerous-- I don't

2 even know what to call it. It shouldn't happen,
3 right? I'm going to come back to my questioning, but
4 I'm going to yield to allow for Tiffany, Council
5 Member Tiffany Cabán, to ask her questions.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Thank you. Good
7 morning, all. I want to start with the policy that
8 you referenced in your testimony about issuing
9 criminal summonses to cyclists for minor traffic
10 infractions. So, I just-- I'm-- what I would like to
11 get on the record is exactly what the policy states,
12 and more detail than what we're seeing here. And
13 specifically, does the policy to issue criminal
14 summons apply to all traffic infractions or specific
15 ones? Like, if there is a-- I'm going to go through
16 a couple of questions, because my time is very
17 limited. Or are there specific ones? And then, in
18 relation to that, is there a similar policy for non-
19 cyclists, so pedestrians, motor-- etcetera? And then
20 the second part of this question has to do with how
21 the officer approaches that policy. Does the policy
22 mandate that the officer is to issue a criminal
23 summons or is the decision discretionary? And if it
24 is discretionary, I want to know what the factors are

2 that officers are taking into account whether to
3 issue a criminal summons or a civil summons.

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Okay. So, no, it
5 does not apply to all traffic infractions. There are
6 six specific violations. They are reckless driving,
7 operating an e-bike while under the influence of
8 alcohol or drugs, wrong-way riding, disobeying red
9 light signals, disobeying traffic control devices,
10 and failure to stop at a stop sign. What was your
11 second question?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: The policy where
13 you can issue that criminal summons, is it a mandate
14 or is the decision discretionary by the officer?

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Officers in
16 any situation involving enforcement, I mean,
17 obviously, they're going to have discretion.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Okay, so--

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: [interposing]
20 Wait, hold up. But to answer your question, right,
21 we are giving them direction in terms of how we are
22 looking to approach certain types of infractions.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: What are the
24 factors? Because I'm running out of time, so I just
25 want to know list out the factors.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 55

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: No, no, but
3 that's not-- as you all know, that is not how
4 discretion works.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: It absolutely is,
6 because--

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER:
8 [interposing] No, it is not. It is not some rigid
9 list. That's not what discretion is at all, that's
10 the opposite--

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: [interposing]
12 Factors are not-- okay, hold on for a second.
13 Factors are not a rigid list, right? When policy is
14 discretionary there is usually some sort of
15 information around-- hey, officers, these are the
16 things that you should look out for or consider when
17 you are making the decision whether to do anything.
18 I'm not asking for black and white hard and fast
19 rules. I'm asking you to list out what some of the
20 factors that officers are encouraged to take into
21 account when they're deciding to use their
22 discretion.

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: And my point
24 to you is that discretion is not-- the exercise of
25 discretion by our officers, which is critical of

2 course, is not particular to C summonses for certain
3 types of e-bike infractions, right? When we're
4 talking traffic infractions generally, when we're
5 talking about violations, officers exercise
6 discretion.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: And what are they
8 thinking about when they exercise that discretion?
9 What are the factors that they are thinking about
10 when deciding how to use their discretion?

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: It is not
12 reduced to some list.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Okay.

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: It is a
15 holistic--

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: [interposing] So--

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: [interposing]
18 It is a holistic assessment that our--

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: [interposing] Thank
20 you. I only have a couple seconds left,--

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: officers
22 engage in every day.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: so I want to
24 finish asking questions, but I think it's important
25 to note on the record for everybody here that there's

2 not guide-- like, it is not-- it does not increase
3 public trust in how this is being enforced if you
4 cannot even articulate or name the things that
5 officers are considering when using that discretion
6 or not. And if I could just have a couple extra
7 seconds to wrap up my thoughts--

8 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: [interposing] Go
9 ahead.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: on this, Chairs?
11 So, I think that fundamentally that's an enforcement
12 problem that is unacceptable. I will say that the
13 consequences of the stops versus-- I understand that
14 there's a real challenge in creating safe habits, but
15 the enforcement mechanisms and their impacts are
16 really, really disparate where a person might get
17 their license suspended, a person who is more likely
18 to be a person of color who works a low-wage job, who
19 might be an immigrant that gets a criminal summons,
20 may end up in deportation proceedings, may have to go
21 to Criminal Court for months, sometimes up to a year
22 or more, and so it's not just. It's not right, and
23 it's actually dangerous, and the data shows that e-
24 bike collisions and injuries through April 30th, 2025
25 are down 26 percent prior-- compared to the year

2 before. Rider injuries are down 17 percent in that
3 same period, and pedestrian injuries are down 47
4 percent. So, I think that there are other ways to
5 accomplish these goals that don't involve
6 criminalization of already vulnerable communities,
7 and out-sized criminalization at that. And then I
8 just want-- I will end with a comment. It's not a
9 question. But I appreciated, Commissioner, the
10 testimony around acknowledging the longstanding
11 racial disparities, because they do exist and we
12 can't deny them, and unfortunately you had colleagues
13 here at the last hearing who just denied them. So,
14 I'm glad that we can at least agree on those facts.
15 It doesn't do you guys any favors to deny that. But
16 I will say that I was surprised by it kind of being
17 viewed a little bit under rose colored glasses here,
18 because they haven't been substantially reduced or
19 eliminated. I will say it's not just the stops where
20 the racial disparities remain, but I laid out these
21 numbers exactly in the last hearing, but it's after
22 the stop, motor vehicle stops in particular, where
23 we're seeing large racial disparities for searches
24 after stops, for arrests after stops, and for use of
25 force after stops with Black and Brown people versus

2 white folks. And so I just think that, like, we can
3 acknowledge them, but also we should [inaudible] the
4 scale [sic] that they exist so that we're actually
5 doing something about it. Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Now we have
7 questions from Majority Whip Brooks-Powers.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you,
9 Chairs, and hi, Commissioner.

10 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Hello.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: It's good
12 to see you. Thank you for your testimony. I'm going
13 to start in district issues and then span out in
14 terms of citywide. So, the Council and community
15 fought hard to secure the creation of the 116th
16 Precinct to improve public safety and reduce response
17 times in southeast Queens. Can NYPD provide an
18 update on the staffing timeline and resource
19 allocation for the 116th precinct? Will the
20 Executive Budget ensure full operation capacity for
21 fiscal-- or by Fiscal 26? Also, wanted to know what
22 investments are being made in violence prevention and
23 intervention programs, particularly for youth. How
24 is the NYPD partnering with the Cure Violence groups
25 and community organizations to address gun violence

2 in a holistic and preventative way rather than
3 relying solely on enforcement? And then the last
4 question is around the cycling enforcement. I know
5 that Council Member Cabán spoke on it, but I just
6 wanted to underscore the concern about cyclist being
7 given criminal violations for infractions which is
8 not what motorists get. I do recognize that there is
9 a need, a substantiated need to have greater
10 enforcement because there is a degree of what the
11 public feels has felt like lawlessness in terms of
12 cycling behavior, but I don't know that given
13 criminals citations is the way to go, and so I wanted
14 to understand better the Police Department's
15 rationale for issuing criminal summonses to cyclists
16 for minor infractions like running a red light when
17 the same infraction is treated as a civil penalty for
18 pedestrians and drivers.

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, let me start
20 with the new 116 Precinct. Current personnel
21 assigned there, 199 people, two captains, seven
22 lieutenants, 20 sergeants, 147 police officers and
23 detectives, and 23 civilians. We have seen great
24 results I would say in terms of the decrease in
25 response times since that command opened up. So, if

2 we look at precinct average response times for all
3 calls pre and post. The 105 precinct pre the 116
4 opening, the average time was 21 minutes and three
5 seconds. Post, the average response time was eight
6 minutes and 38 seconds. We look at the 113, same
7 idea. Pre, 20 minutes and 48 seconds. Post, 16
8 minutes and 19 seconds. So, we are pleased with the-
9 - what we are seeing in terms of the trends in
10 response times. I'll do e-bikes quickly and then
11 I'll call someone up to talk about Cure Violence and
12 the work we do partnering there. I said in my
13 testimony that I am eager to work with this council
14 on a legal framework, new enforcement paradigm for e-
15 bikes in New York City. In fact, I call on this
16 council to change the laws as they relate to e-bikes
17 in this city, but under the current law we had two
18 options. One was issuing these summonses and the
19 other was issuing C summonses. As it relates to e-
20 bike enforcement, the B summonses were virtually
21 meaningless. B summonses work for cars, for vehicles
22 where licenses are required, because if you have
23 multiple infractions or you don't show up, you know,
24 to court or you don't pay your summons, there are
25 real consequences. You either get points on your

license, or your license is suspended. So, the B summons paradigm exists for licensed drivers. Because e-bikes aren't licensed, B summonses don't work. They're meaningless. So, the only option that we had under the current law as it exists was to issue C summonses. I look forward to working with this council to address this issue head-on. I do believe that the enforcement framework has to change. We can look at licensing. We can look at other things, but the current state of affairs doesn't work for anyone. I doesn't work for the cyclist and it certainly doesn't work for pedestrians. I want to be extremely clear, this is not a war on e-bikes or bikers. This is in response to very real concerns that are widely held across virtually every borough and every neighborhood in this city where we're hearing people tell us that they are afraid to cross the street, or we see a terrible vide in Williamsburg from this weekend of a young child being blasted by an e-bike barreling down the street. The old paradigm of issuing these summonses and having virtually no enforcement didn't work. I believe that the C summons is the best option that we have now and we are seeing people on e-bikes pay more attention to

2 the rules of the road as we have begun this
3 enforcement push. I was also want to put in context
4 that of-- something-- we have given out 250,000+ B
5 summonses or tickets to drivers this year, so far
6 this year. The number to bikers is several thousand.
7 So it is definitely-- we need to keep the scale of
8 the different types of enforcement in mind as we talk
9 about this.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: And I
11 appreciate the perspective and as you may know, we
12 have a bill right now in my committee that looks to
13 create a taskforce to address the need for greater
14 regulation and to take into account this relatively
15 new mode of transportation, and I welcome any
16 feedback and suggestions that the Department may have
17 to contribute to that. But thank you for that. And
18 Chairs, if I could just ask one final question if
19 that's okay?

20 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: So, our
22 district particularly in southeast Queens, and I'm
23 sure this is happening citywide quite honestly, are
24 being inundated with commercial vehicles parking--
25 being parked illegally overnight with many repeat

2 offenders. Law enforcement has the ability to issue
3 the maximum penalty when issuing tickets to stop the
4 behavior. Can we understand how come that's not
5 happening?

6 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Do we have
7 Transportation here? Or do you want to take that,
8 Chief?

9 CHIEF LIPETRI: I was going to take Cure.

10 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Oh, let him do Cure
11 Violence. Sorry, we skipped that.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Sure.

13 COMMISSIONER TISCH: And then we'll answer
14 your transportation question.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: And thank
16 you for remembering.

17 CHIEF LIPETRI: Yes. Chief Michael
18 Lipetri, the Chief of Crime Patrol Strategies. So,
19 approximately a year ago, the Ceasefire Program, the
20 NYPD Cease Fire Program was moved into Crime Control
21 Strategies, and as you know, Ceasefire and Cure work
22 hand-in-hand. So, my office working with the Mayor's
23 Office of Criminal Justice share data with Cure. You
24 know, we give them data as far as shots fired
25 incidents, shooting incidents. We also provide them

2 with intelligence. So, when we get intelligence of a
3 possible retaliatory shooting involving crews in New
4 York City, we reach out to Cure. We give them this
5 information. So, it is a very good relationship.
6 I've worked personally and my office has worked
7 personally with Cure from the inception, and we will
8 continue to do that.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

10 CHIEF LIPETRI: You're welcome.

11 CHIEF OBE: Good morning, CM.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Good
13 morning.

14 CHIEF OBE: Could you just repeat the
15 question about--

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Sure.
17 Thank you for that. So, I was focusing on the
18 inundation of commercial vehicles parking illegally
19 overnight, and often times there's a lot of repeat
20 offenders. And so law enforcement has the ability to
21 issue the maximum penalty when issuing tickets, but
22 we haven't seen that happening. So, we wanted to
23 understand why that doesn't happen.

24 CHIEF OBE: Okay. So, one of the things
25 we started to do is work very closely in some of the

2 districts of some of the Council Members here. So,
3 we'll reach out and we'll certainly visit you and
4 your staff just to see what the problem is, and we'll
5 be able to tow. I think that's actually better than
6 even issuing summonses. So, we'll do that with you.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: That'll be
8 great.

9 CHIEF OBE: Excellent.

10 COMMISSIONER TISCH: And I would just add
11 that year-to-date as of April 30th, truck and trailer
12 overnight parking summonses increased by over 42
13 percent. This is an area that we are definitely
14 focused on. It also overlaps with the work that
15 we're doing with our new Quality of Life Division. So
16 maybe we can all sit down and discuss how we can
17 directly address the issues that you're seeing in
18 your district. I know you're always very clear about
19 what they are.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. We've also
22 been joined by Council Members Joseph and Hudson, and
23 now I'm going to give it back to Chair Salaam.

24 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you. I just
25 want to maybe add to the last part of the challenge

2 with e-bikes, because I'm not-- I mean, the reality
3 is that there's a problem that needs to be fixed. I
4 myself was hit by an e-bike, you know, walking across
5 the 72nd Street area and pushed my children out of
6 the way so that they weren't injured. Wasn't a
7 delivery e-bike, it was just a person on a Citi-bike
8 that might have just been enjoying the day, but
9 completely oblivious that the light now was red and
10 they kept going. So, I'm worried about the policy,
11 specifically the policy of criminalizing people for
12 something that really should be a civil matter,
13 especially as it relates to delivery workers, because
14 that education piece has to be translated into their
15 understanding of why we need more safety, you know.
16 I want to go into the Quality of Life, their teams
17 and the criminal summonses for the e-bikes a little
18 bit more, and want to discuss the Quality of Life
19 Divisions and teams that you recently announced. I
20 know they are only being placed in certain precincts.
21 How will you evaluate the effectiveness of these
22 teams for expansion?

23 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, we are doing a
24 pilot now in six precincts, and we tried to pick
25 precincts where we saw different crime levels,

2 different types of quality of life issues with the
3 intent of learning from that pilot in those six
4 precincts, and then expeditiously rolling the program
5 out citywide. So, the intent of this program is to
6 go citywide, and a few months into the pilot now, as
7 I sit here, I believe that we will be able to take
8 this citywide expeditiously and I look forward to
9 announcing soon a schedule for that.

10 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: And what's the
11 biggest quality of life issue you'll be targeting
12 with these teams. I mean, we've seen the new policy
13 that criminal summonses will now be issued for
14 traffic offenses and so forth and so on, e-bikes. Is
15 there an issue these teams will be specifically
16 focusing on?

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, it will change.
18 It will vary precinct to precinct depending on what
19 the big quality of life concerns are, but I will tell
20 you just citywide illegal parking is certainly the
21 largest 311 complaint we get now, over half a million
22 311 complaints about illegal parking. The second
23 highest is residential noise at over 300,000, blocked
24 driveways 170,000, noise on the street or sidewalk
25 161,000, abandoned vehicles 70,000. Those types of

2 things -- like some categories are up or down
3 depending on what precinct you're at, but the very
4 basic things that people complain to 311 about.
5 Since 2016 a number of calls to 311 that the NYPD is
6 responsible to respond to have doubled or nearly
7 doubled, and so people are clearly like literally
8 calling out for help, and the Quality of Life teams
9 are designed to address that, or be responsive to
10 that.

11 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Got you. I'm going
12 to move to stun guns. So, I want to talk about the
13 NYPD's use of non-lethal equipment. What non-lethal
14 equipment does an officer have at their disposal when
15 engaging with an individual currently?

16 COMMISSIONER TISCH: For that, I'm going
17 to ask our Chief of Training to come up to respond to
18 the question.

19 CHIEF MATERASSO: Swear me in?

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Do you swear to tell
21 the truth and nothing but the truth before the
22 Council Members of this committee?

23 CHIEF MATERASSO: I do.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: You may begin.
25

2 CHIEF MATERASSO: Hi, sir. Martine
3 Materasso, Chief of Training. So, we both equipped
4 with the OC spray, otherwise known as mace, as well
5 as the TASER. We don't call it the stun gun.
6 There's two models right now. We have the TASER 7
7 that we're transitioning to, coming off from the X26.

8 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Do we know what the
9 lifecycles for this equipment is, and is there
10 funding to replace the equipment. I know that you
11 said that they're moving from the X26 to the TASER 7.

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Yeah. So, the
13 lifecycle is five years for the TASERs, and we
14 actually lease the TASERs, and we pay about \$11
15 million a year for that.

16 COMMISSIONER TISCH: And so that means
17 when it comes past five years, you get just a new one
18 at the same price.

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Yeah, we're
20 able to-- exactly. We're able to replace it.

21 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Is there-- in terms
22 of the lifecycle, and this is just me, maybe part of
23 my ignorance-- if say for instance a TASER is-- was
24 manufactured say this year, and I know we're moving
25 to the X-- to the-- from the X26 to the TASER 7. If

2 in that five-year cycle that particular TASER was not
3 used, would that TASER be like kind of trashed, for
4 lack of a better word?

5 CHIEF MATERASSO: I don't-- I could get
6 back to you on that, but I don't believe that we have
7 them in a way that we're not using that they would,
8 you know, expunge on their lifecycle.

9 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I'll just try to
10 make this clear. When you lease equipment rather than
11 buy it at city agencies, often that is done to
12 flatten the cost and also to ensure that you don't
13 run into problems with equipment being past end of
14 life. So, presumably as part of that contract, once
15 a TASER goes beyond year five, then the company is
16 required to provide a new TASER to the Department, so
17 you don't have end-of-life equipment. Is that
18 correct?

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Yes.

20 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Okay.

21 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: What can diminish
22 the effectiveness of non-lethal equipment?

23 COMMISSIONER TISCH: What could increase
24 the effectiveness of them?

2 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Diminish, diminish
3 the effectiveness of non-lethal equipment?

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, one thing that
5 we're taking a good hard look at in this department
6 right now under the leadership of the First Deputy
7 Commissioner and the Chief of Training is the
8 effectiveness of our TASERS. I have seen too many
9 videos, body camera clips, that end in use of lethal
10 force where the officer's first attempted non-lethal
11 force. So, we are pouring through our data looking
12 how we track it, and preparing to have some
13 conversations with Axon, the company that provides
14 the TASERS to us to look at. Perhaps we should go to
15 beyond the X7 to the newest model if we're seeing--
16 if we're having concerns about having to use lethal
17 force when we first tried non-lethal.

18 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: I want to end with
19 regards to the Argus cameras. The Executive Capital
20 Plan includes approximately \$3 million in Fiscal Year
21 25 for Argus cameras. What is the cost per box? And
22 just as a follow-up, where are you prioritizing
23 placement of the Argus cameras and the use of this--
24 and Argus cameras and the use of this funding and
25 what precincts are you looking at?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So, the cost
3 per box is about \$45,000 per box, and each box has
4 two cameras. So, you're getting two cameras for
5 \$45,000. Essentially, in terms of where the cameras
6 go, our Crime Prevention Division recommends
7 appropriate locations based on data and information
8 they have and crime statistical data, and then our
9 Strategic Technology Division works with DOT to
10 conduct surveys of those locations to ensure the
11 exact appropriate location for the boxes and the
12 cameras.

13 COMMISSIONER TISCH: And one thing I am
14 very pleased about is I understand that some of this
15 work putting up Argus boxes had been delayed for
16 quite some time. Among the reasons was an expired
17 contract or lack of an active contract. I'm very
18 pleased to report we now have an active long-term
19 contract to continue or to resume our efforts to put
20 up Argus cameras in New York City, and I am looking
21 forward to getting many more boxes up on the streets
22 this year than we did last year. I have the list of
23 precincts where they are going up that I could either
24 provide you or I could read to you now. It's going
25 the 45, the 62, Central Park, 61, 47, 50, Manhattan

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 74

2 North, 103, 107, 68, 122nd, 72, 76, 106, 40, 41, 42,
3 109, 111, 49. And those precincts are generally done
4 by which Council Member gave us funding to put up
5 boxes. Where in those districts they go, we usually
6 have our crime team look at where we're seeing the
7 most violence in those commands.

8 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you. Thank
9 you. Thank you, Chair.

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Now we have
11 questions from Council Member Williams.

12 COUNCIL MEMBERS WILLIAMS: Hello. I have
13 so many questions so I'll just-- and they're like all
14 over the place. I have prepared questions, and now I
15 have more questions, though. I'll try to get through
16 them. Apologies in advance, Chair. So I guess I'll
17 start with traffic enforcement. It is projected to
18 have \$10.5 million in OTPS. I have a lot of questions
19 about costs of trucks and other equipment that allow
20 the officers in the precincts to properly tow trucks.
21 So, can you share, like, how much of that goes to,
22 like, the lots, the trucks and how much a truck
23 costs?

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So, the trucks
25 are actually in our capital budget.

2 COUNCIL MEMBERS WILLIAMS: Oh.

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: that wouldn't
4 be part of the OTPS that you're seeing there.

5 COUNCIL MEMBERS WILLIAMS: So what is
6 that money for then?

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: That money is
8 for equipment, IT, anything--

9 COUNCIL MEMBERS WILLIAMS: [interposing]
10 Is it for the window things that you guys are using
11 now?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: The-- like,
13 the boots?

14 COUNCIL MEMBERS WILLIAMS: Yeah.

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Yes, that would
16 be part of it.

17 COUNCIL MEMBERS WILLIAMS: Barnacles.

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Barnacles,
19 right. Yes, that would be covered with OTPS funding.

20 COUNCIL MEMBERS WILLIAMS: And how do you
21 determine, like, how to disperse those assets?

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: When it comes
23 to anything tied to the budget, and particularly non-
24 personnel costs, the Division-- or the Deputy
25 Commissioner of Management and Budget, my team and I

2 work with the individual bureaus and commands on what
3 their operational needs are, what equipment do they
4 need, what additional staffing enhancements,
5 overtime, and we have that ongoing dialogue. If
6 there's a new initiative, for example for the
7 barnacle, hey we want a better way to do this, or a
8 different way to do it, we would sit down with the
9 commands, look at it. My Contracts team would look
10 and say okay, what is this estimated cost for this
11 sort of thing? And then we would go through, if we
12 determine to move forward, a contracting process.

13 COUNCIL MEMBERS WILLIAMS: And are you
14 able to just send my office scopes for the barnacles,
15 the boots, and tow trucks? Because we had tried to
16 get quotes from the Police Department about how much
17 it costs.

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Yeah, we can
19 give you information on what those pieces--

20 COUNCIL MEMBERS WILLIAMS: [interposing]
21 Okay.

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: cost, yeah.

23 COUNCIL MEMBERS WILLIAMS: And I want to
24 just give a quick shout out to, I believe he's a
25 sergeant, Sergeant DeJesus [sp?] at the 113th. He

2 works very hard in that division and often times with
3 very limited resources. So, my thing is always
4 trying to get them more resources so they can do
5 more.

6 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thak you for that.

7 COUNCIL MEMBERS WILLIAMS: You're
8 welcome. Okay, so the other question I have is about
9 the crime lab. The crime lab is in my district, and
10 I know you just visited, Commissioner.

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I did.

12 COUNCIL MEMBERS WILLIAMS: And they have
13 a lot of opinions, because we're also doing a
14 neighborhood plan there. So, they're part of my
15 Advisory Committee. Roof leaks, heating, ventilation
16 issues-- I actually have a friend who was out of work
17 because she got exposure to heroin and she used all
18 the proper materials, but the ventilation within the
19 crime lab is just not good at all. They don't have
20 enough space to work. I have heard reports of
21 evidence being lost, and so the police officers are
22 going out and doing all this good police work, and
23 then if you're not able to like properly assess what
24 they're bringing in to then-- for these cases to be
25 prosecuted, it kind of defeats the purpose. So just

2 wondering if there are any plans to get a new crime
3 lab, renovate the existing crime lab?

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah. I was--
5 actually, as you mentioned, I was there last week to
6 discuss with them or to start the discussion with
7 them on just that topic. I think it's very clear to
8 me and to others in the Department that the current
9 crime lab is not a crime lab that is built for the
10 future, and I believe we need to start the capital
11 process of assessing or figuring out what the go-
12 forward plan is for a new crime lab. I don't believe
13 that anyone thinks that it would make sense to
14 renovate the existing building, but we are getting
15 that together now. I know that in the Detective
16 Bureau they've done a huge amount of work over the
17 past several years to begin some of this analysis,
18 and I am looking forward to hopefully moving this
19 from an idea to a budgeted--

20 COUNCIL MEMBERS WILLIAMS: [interposing]
21 Yeah.

22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: program.

23 COUNCIL MEMBERS WILLIAMS: Because I hear
24 reports of like not able to have upgraded computer
25

2 systems that allow them to do their work efficiently.

3 I also--

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Well, the computers--
5 the upgrades to computers systems that should be
6 happening, and I will talk to the IT teams if that is
7 not happened. Certainly, it's required for their
8 accreditation which is coming up, but I am looking
9 forward to working with the Mayor's Office and the
10 Office of Management and Budget to making-- and
11 making it one of my capital priorities to push ahead
12 on a crime lab of the future for New York City.

13 COUNCIL MEMBERS WILLIAMS: Okay, and one
14 more thing still on the crime lab is also that hey
15 don't have money in their budget for the contracts
16 that maintain the equipment. So, apparently there's
17 a ton of equipment not being used because they don't
18 have money to contract someone to service the
19 equipment.

20 COMMISSIONER TISCH: That's odd because
21 that didn't come up when I spent a few hours there
22 last week, but it is certainly something that our
23 Deputy Commissioner of Management and Budget will
24 follow up with our Chief of Detectives on. Thank
25 you.

2 COUNCIL MEMBERS WILLIAMS: Okay, Chair,
3 can I just ask a few more questions? Thank you so
4 much. Can I-- this is just-- you can give me this
5 later, but if I can get a racial and gender breakdown
6 of the recent discretionary promotions and upcoming
7 ones--

8 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] Yes,
9 absolutely.

10 COUNCIL MEMBERS WILLIAMS: that would be
11 great. One of the Chiefs testified about sharing
12 intel with Cure. Are you talking about the CMS
13 groups--

14 UNIDENTIFIED: [interposing] Yes.

15 COUNCIL MEMBERS WILLIAMS: themselves?
16 Okay. DYCD testified last week. They didn't mention
17 that because we asked about the relationship with CMS
18 and NYPD. They did share-- the only thing they said
19 was about the roll call. And so, I just wanted to
20 know if you have data on the frequency of how many
21 times the CMS group attends roll call? I don't
22 really think that's an effective way to really
23 develop a relationship, even though I've attended
24 roll calls, I feel like the relationship needs to be
25

2 a little bit more than saying hello to the officers
3 that are about to go in the streets.

4 CHIEF LIPETRI: I can't answer the roll
5 call question, but I could tell you that my office
6 usually has a call with Cure Violence CMS on a weekly
7 basis.

8 COUNCIL MEMBERS WILLIAMS: Okay.

9 CHIEF LIPETRI: We share data on a weekly
10 basis, also.

11 COUNCIL MEMBERS WILLIAMS: Okay. I'll
12 just hurry up with my last questions. I'm excited
13 about the Q Teams. I would love to know when they
14 will be rolled out in the 103rd, 105th, 113th, and
15 116th precinct, because quality of life is probably
16 number one in southeast Queens, and I know the
17 commanding officers that we have had, a lot of them
18 have grown up in the community and they take great
19 pride in reallocating resources to address quality of
20 life. We're really excited about the Q Teams, and so
21 just wanted to know when you plan to roll it out in
22 southeast Queens?

23 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I will have those
24 dates soon.

2 COUNCIL MEMBERS WILLIAMS: Okay. And
3 last-ish for right now is-- I know you testified that
4 you look forward to working with us on youth
5 strategies, and in a previous hearing there was some
6 testimony on like the youth officers, and I love
7 Community Affairs. I will say that all the time. I
8 don't think their budget is enough, and I think
9 between the Community Affairs officers and the youth
10 officers, like, these are the officers that we want
11 to see do this proactive and not reactive police
12 work, and I just don't think that their budgets align
13 with the Department's priority of, like, trying to
14 help our young people do better.

15 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I understand the
16 feedback, and I will say we can get you the exact
17 numbers, but I will say that the Community Affairs
18 Bureau is perhaps the only bureau in the Department
19 whose staffing numbers are significantly higher today
20 than they were in 2018 when we had 11 percent more
21 officers. So, I am also sensitive to staffing in
22 Community Affairs. Understand the feedback, but I
23 wanted to make sure that it was put in that context
24 and that perspective.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 83

2 COUNCIL MEMBERS WILLIAMS: Yeah. I'm
3 more so looking for more resources in their OTPS
4 budget.

5 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Understood.

6 COUNCIL MEMBERS WILLIAMS: Yeah. Like, we
7 have them great, but then often times they're not
8 able to actually do the things that would be
9 wonderful in the community, because they don't have
10 any money to do it.

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Understood. Thank
12 you.

13 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. We have
14 questions from Ayala followed by Holden.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Thank you. I had a
16 question regarding the 911 response time. I just
17 needed some clarity. So you mentioned that the
18 response times are usually around six minutes, I
19 believe.

20 COMMISSIONER TISCH: No, I'm so sorry.
21 The question was how-- what's the average time in
22 which a 911 caller's call is first answered, and it
23 is under six seconds.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Under six seconds,
25 okay.

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yes.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Is that all of the
4 time? Because it's kind of contrary to what we've
5 been--

6 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] That is
7 the--

8 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: hearing.

9 COMMISSIONER TISCH: The average. Excuse
10 me. That is the average, and I said that because the
11 vast majority of 911 calls are answered immediately,
12 but over the past year-- and this was raised at the
13 last hearing-- we've seen an unacceptable rise in the
14 number of 911 calls that first get-- that go to a
15 recording. Under the leadership of the First Deputy
16 Commissioner, we are taking a real good hard look and
17 turning over lots of stones at the Communications
18 Division, and that plan-- with the purpose of driving
19 down the number of calls that first go to that
20 recording. We are looking at our staffing levels,
21 making an aggressive plan to hire to budgeted
22 headcount over the next year in the PCT title. We've
23 done management changes there. We're looking at
24 changes in procedures, and we are also working very
25 closely on all of this with DC37 who's really rolled

2 up their sleeves under Henry's leadership and been
3 very good partnership in helping us begin to address
4 the issues this council so ably called out.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Yeah. No, I
6 really appreciate that, because I-- it's kind of, you
7 know, new territory for us. I hadn't ever heard of a
8 situation where, you know, the wait times had been as
9 long as they were. So, I really appreciate it.

10 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Me neither. And I,
11 in my previous role at the NYPD, I oversaw the
12 Communications Division which includes the 911 call-
13 takers. And so, when this issue was first brought to
14 my attention, I too was shocked.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Yeah, yeah. No,
16 it was pretty bad. Regarding the change in policies
17 from C to B bike violations for e-bike riders, you
18 mentioned that you would welcome a change in the law
19 and better, I guess, interactions with the Council.
20 But I-- I'm curious has there been any conversations
21 prior to the change in policy?

22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I'm so sorry. I
23 didn't mean better interactions with the Council.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Yeah.
25

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I have always worked
3 very well with the Council. My point was that the
4 current framework for regulating the use, the safe
5 use, of e-bikes doesn't make sense. It doesn't work,
6 and we've had the proliferation of e-bikes in New
7 York City without an accompanying change in the
8 regulatory framework for it.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Yeah.

10 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, I believe that
11 something has to change in the law, and I am
12 interested in working directly with the Council, with
13 the Department of Transportation to chart the future
14 for creating the new-- should chart the--

15 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: [interposing] Yes.

16 COMMISSIONER TISCH: future for e-bikes
17 in New York City.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Yes. I mean, I
19 think, you know, I myself have almost been run down
20 by an e-bike, you know, by biker. I would say it's a
21 biker, because it wasn't a e-bike, but you know, on a
22 bike lane ironically enough. So, I get it. I believe
23 that there needs to be some level of accountability.
24 I think, you know, the concern that you're hearing
25 from the body today and have been hearing probably,

2 you know, via social media and every other form of
3 communication that we have is that we have a very
4 different administration that is spending a lot of
5 resources deporting individuals that, you know, are
6 not even on the list of, you know, dangerous
7 individuals, and we don't want to further complicate
8 matters by criminalizing folks that would be more
9 susceptible to that type of behavior, if that's
10 understood. However, I am open to having a
11 conversation with the NYPD about exploring ways that
12 make sense to clarify what those consequences should
13 be. I just-- I'm not aware of any conversations
14 happening before the change in the policy. Have
15 there been? Just, I'm just looking for clarity on
16 that?

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, I think that,
18 you know, I'm new to the Department, but my sense is
19 that the Department and frankly New Yorkers have felt
20 for a long time that the current-- that the
21 enforcement use-- the use of B summonses as the
22 enforcement paradigm was virtually futile, that our
23 officers were out there writing tickets and that it
24 wasn't causing or creating any changes of behavior.
25 To the contrary, because people on e-bikes generally

2 felt like they lived in a consequence-free
3 environment, we were all seeing widespread mass
4 flouting of the very basic rules that we have in New
5 York City around transportation safety. And so,
6 under the current law, the only other option was to
7 write C summonses which we are doing now in greater
8 numbers than we had previously. But just, again, to
9 put this in context, it is several thousand summonses
10 for e-bikes this year compared to over 250,000
11 summonses for cars, and that doesn't include the red
12 light cameras and all that other stuff, just that the
13 NYPD has given out. But yes, I think we agree. I
14 look forward to working with the Council to come up
15 with a framework for safe e-bike or bicycle use in
16 New York City that meets the current magnitude of the
17 problem.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Okay, and we
19 welcome that. I think we all agree, right, we want
20 safer streets and we want, you know, even bikers,
21 right, to feel free and safe on the road. And so--

22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing]
23 Absolutely.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: we welcome that.
25 I just wanted to clarify because I wasn't aware of

2 any conversations that had occurred prior to today
3 regarding any legislative fixes to this problem. And
4 finally, I have two more questions. Regarding the
5 purchasing of vehicles, is there-- how much money is
6 set aside in the budget to purchase new vehicles for
7 the local precincts? Sorry if I missed it. I was--

8 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] So, in
9 the current budget we have-- is it \$21 million? I'm
10 doing this off the top of my head.

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Yeah. So, in
12 the current fiscal year we had \$21 million and then
13 next year what we need is close to \$70 million, and
14 OMB has graciously indicating they're allowing us to
15 go forward with orders so that we can acquire a
16 thousand new vehicles in 26.

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, that's great. I
18 mean, that is huge for this department. A thousand
19 new vehicles injected into our fleet will allow us to
20 replace a large number of vehicles that are either at
21 or nearing end of life, and they will be very welcome
22 in the commands.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Yes, they will. I
24 know they bring it up all the time. and regarding
25 the Argus cameras, I did-- I know that I specifically

2 put in some funding for east Harlem and the south
3 Bronx. I heard you mention the 40. I didn't hear you
4 mention the 25, and at funding was earmarked
5 specifically for those two.

6 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I'm sorry, I have the
7 25, I just skipped it.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: You do? Okay. Do
9 you know how many cameras will be installed in each--
10 for each?

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I can get you the--
12 I can get it. I can get it back to you. I will get
13 it to you, the breakdown by precinct in your
14 district.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I really
16 appreciate that. Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, we have
18 questions from Council Member Holden followed by
19 Louis.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: so, thank you,
21 Commissioner, for mentioning e-bikes, because we're
22 at a, you know, a crossroads in this city because
23 it's become a public health crisis. Talk to emergency
24 room doctors which we did, and they say they can't
25 believe the amount of injuries from these e-bikes or

2 e-mobility vehicles. And it's interesting-- I have
3 28 co-sponsors on my bill to license e-bikes which I
4 introduced a while ago-- 28, that's the majority of
5 the City Council. The people that the-- the Council
6 Members that brought up your C summonses issue are
7 not on the bill, and maybe they should get on if they
8 want to really address this. But-- and even a few
9 have been hit by e-bikes. They got on the original
10 bill, and they dropped off for unknown reasons. So,
11 if we're in a public health crisis and the B summons
12 doesn't make any sense, as you said, then what's the
13 solution? If licensing e-bikes brings accountability
14 and a change in behavior, it makes a lot of sense.
15 But yet, we're hearing the opposite today. But let me
16 just get into important issues, and I want to bring
17 up response time, because it's been a big issue, and
18 we had to-- I hear this almost every week of
19 nightmare stories. Two weeks ago, two men were
20 riding the wrong way. They were in a vehicle, in a
21 car, riding the wrong way and hit some vehicles.
22 Residents came out. Cars were hit. They-- of course,
23 these guys were intoxicated, both of them. The
24 driver was definitely intoxicated. 911 was called.
25 One, over one hour the residents held these two

2 individuals, over one hour. We couldn't get a squad
3 car there. And so, I want to bring up the critical
4 response times. What's the critical response?
5 What's the procedure, Commissioner, on backlog,
6 because I don't hear that anymore. I don't hear
7 going to in alert where we can get help from a
8 neighboring precinct. I don't hear central getting
9 on and saying and calling the people and saying, you
10 know, we're coming or this will work-- you know,
11 we'll work it out. Go ahead. I'm sorry.

12 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, which is exactly
13 why we have made a number of changes over the past
14 month in how the 911 call center is managed,
15 including but not limited to having the
16 Communications Division report up to the First Deputy
17 Commissioner's office where her commanding officer
18 who's sitting in that seat right there, used to work
19 for me when the 911 call center was at its very best
20 running communications, and he is now overseeing the
21 work to address many of the issues that you raised
22 around 911 and communications. But just before I let
23 him speak, to give you some numbers that you
24 requested. Critical crimes in progress, the average
25 response time now citywide is seven minutes-- for

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 93

2 FY25-- seven minutes and 10 seconds. That is down
3 eight seconds from FY24. Chief Napolitano, do you
4 have anything to add?

5 DEPUTY CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Yes, good
6 afternoon, Councilman. Response time for the NYPD is
7 actually down 9.5 percent this year for crimes in
8 progress, nine minutes and 34 seconds last year to
9 8:40 this year. So we're actually doing very well on
10 that. As far as backlogs, backlogs are down 15
11 percent this year.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Fifteen?

13 DEPUTY CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Fifteen
14 percent, that's correct. It's 2,695 last year to
15 3,000-- I'm sorry-- 3,167 last year to 2,695 this
16 year. So, we're down substantially in that as well.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Do you go into
18 alert?

19 DEPUTY CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Yeah.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Like, how do I
21 get-- how do I get us a neighboring precinct to chip
22 in and help out when guys are sitting there for an
23 hour holding these two individuals? And this-- I can
24 tell you nightmare story after nightmare story this
25 is going on and we're not solving it.

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I think we need to
3 look at that job and see how-- and see how it was
4 coded. Perhaps there was an error in the coding of
5 it, which the Chief will address. Do you have
6 anything else to add there?

7 DEPUTY CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Yes. At the
8 break, if you'd like to share that with me, we'll do
9 a detailed analysis.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Oh, I have a lot.
11 Not only that story, but I have a lot of them, and
12 it's reoccurring, Commissioner. This is not going
13 away, and we need some better failsafe, because
14 central's deciding priorities, aren't they? They're-
15 - who decides priority?

16 DEPUTY CHIEF NAPOLITANO: It's actually
17 decided what the priorities are. It's calculated and
18 it's decided, and it's trained to the dispatchers.
19 And just to explain the question you asked earlier,
20 if there's a problem in another command, the
21 dispatchers are trained to pull from another command
22 when necessary. So, if you're in the 104 and there's
23 nobody available, but there's a male shot, they will
24 pull from an adjoining precinct.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah, but I asked
3 that question, Chief, and I asked the question,
4 Commissioner. I'll talk to the precinct. Why didn't
5 you go-- why didn't we get the 112? Why didn't get
6 the 108 to come in? Why just leave it for over an
7 hour of two people being held by civilians?

8 COMMISSIONER TISCH: And I want to just
9 be very clear that we agree with you that is not
10 acceptable which is why we want to do a deep dive to
11 see how it was coded. My guess is that it was coded
12 as a vehicle collision, property damage only, which
13 is of a lower priority and would get a longer
14 response time.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Alright, thank
16 you.

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: But we will look at
18 it. And I think--

19 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing]
20 Thank you.

21 COMMISSIONER TISCH: the First Deputy
22 Commissioner has something to add.

23 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA:
24 Sorry. Also, we want to add that we added
25 supervisor, response time supervisors, to each

2 platoon in communications. So, over the last month
3 we're seeing that once we are in alert that those
4 supervisors will make sure that they're talking to
5 the PCTs, the boroughs if need be. But we'll look
6 into the matter of the job that you brought up.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you all.
8 Thanks.

9 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you. Now we
10 have questions from Council Member Louis followed by
11 Ariola.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Thank you, Chairs,
13 and good morning, Commissioner, to you and your team.
14 I have four quick questions, so I'll try to barrel
15 them out, and if I'm granted more time I'll reiterate
16 them. With the increase in School Safety Division
17 reflected in FY26 Executive Budget, can NYPD clarify
18 whether this funding will address long-standing
19 shortages of crossing guards in high-traffic school
20 zones, and whether new metrics or prioritization
21 tools will be used to guide deployment in underserved
22 schools, school areas, and safety-- with high levels
23 of safety incidents? My next one is on DV. In
24 FY26, there will be an expansion of-- will there be
25 expansion of teams such as--

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] can we
3 do one at time? I promise I'll answer all of them.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Okay.

5 COMMISSIONER TISCH: But I'm going to
6 forget them.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: I'm limited on
8 time, but the school safety, if you want to start
9 with that.

10 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Okay. Do you want to
11 give her the numbers, school crossing guards?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Yes, so
13 actually, I'm going to just need a second for that.
14 For the full-time school crossing guards, we are--
15 we're basically at headcount. Let me get you the
16 part-time if you want to move on to the next
17 question.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: it'll be good to
19 know FY26 what that would look like. For FY26, will
20 there be an expansion of teams such as victim
21 advocates or domestic violence officers within the
22 individual NYPD precincts? What's the plan for how
23 these resources will be equitably allocated across
24 the city? And with the reduction of the borough
25 squads within the Detective Division in the FY26

2 plan, to what extent will this impact detectives and
3 teams working on outstanding missing person cases,
4 and what are those mitigations looking like? So
5 that's regarding that, and I could just do the last
6 one really quick. Officers in multiple precincts
7 have raised concerns about being reassigned to
8 transit district command often abruptly. What is the
9 justification for these reassignments, and are they
10 primarily due to budgetary constraints or staffing
11 gaps in transit, and how are these reassignments
12 impacting local precinct level operations and morale,
13 particularly in neighborhoods already experiencing
14 shortages?

15 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, for many of
16 these issues, all touch on the same thing which is
17 the overall uniformed staffing at the NYPD which we
18 know is down over 10 percent over the past four
19 years-- no, four or five years. For the transit
20 deployments, yes, we have told cops from other
21 commands to work in transit. The most recent surge
22 in resources to transit we aimed to correct some
23 mistakes of the past where we are now pulling largely
24 from our field training teams, meaning officers newly
25 out of the academy, as well as officers previously

2 working administrative assignments in non-operational
3 commands. And the idea there was to put less strain,
4 less pull on the resources of numbered commands. The
5 same priority that we placed on numbered commands, be
6 they in transit, housing, patrol in terms of
7 staffing, we are also doing that without our numbered
8 squads for detectives. So that has meant from time
9 to time pulling detectives out of niche or specialty
10 units and putting them instead into numbered squad.
11 It's a numbered command first approach to uniform
12 staffing at the Police Department which is exactly
13 what the Police Department and the City of New York
14 need now, especially given the uniform staffing
15 numbers that we're seeing.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Will they return
17 back to their commands where they were before? I
18 think that's some of the questions a lot of them
19 have.

20 COMMISSIONER TISCH: It depends. In some
21 circumstances, yes. In some circumstances these are
22 temporary assignments. Many of the transit
23 deployments that we have done recently are temporary
24 assignments, and the officers should know that, but
25

2 we will be very happy to clarify that to them, if you
3 are suggesting that it is not known.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Yes, some of feel
5 like that's not communicated.

6 COMMISSIONER TISCH: But in terms of the-
7 - so we will for sure take that feedback and make
8 sure that that is extremely clear. But for the
9 transfers of officers from more specialized or niche
10 or centralized detective bureau units into squads,
11 those transfers are not temporary. Those transfers
12 are permanent transfers because we need to address
13 those cases first.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Got it.

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: And on the
16 school crossing guards, just as of last week we had
17 2,251 school crossing guards. That includes 2,174
18 level ones-- those are the part-time school crossing
19 guards-- and 77 level twos. that's a vacancy rate--
20 a vacancies, 45 vacancies on the part-time and 12 on
21 the fulltime, and before the new school year the
22 Personnel Bureau looks at school crossing guards and
23 their schedule hiring in August with the goal of
24 filling those vacancies--
25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: [interposing] This
3 is August for FY26? You have a schedule--

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] This
5 August.

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: For this
7 August for the school-- the upcoming school year.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Got it. Thank
9 you, Commissioner. Thank you, Chairs.

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Questions from
11 Council Member Ariola followed by Brewer.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Thank you,
13 Chairs, and thank you, Commissioner and your entire
14 team, for coming out today. I want to just touch on a
15 couple of points that you made that were causing an
16 increase in crime in certain areas and where you ask
17 for collaborative help from this council. With
18 respect to criminals who are wearing masks and
19 committing crimes, I've introduced Intro 1015 which
20 would amend the Administrative Code of the City of
21 New York to prohibiting ski masks to be worn in
22 public spaces and other sensitive areas with the
23 exclusion but not limited to health and religious
24 regions. I also have a bill that is pending to make
25 ATVs banned from our streets. ATVs are off-street

2 vehicles. We do not have off-road areas in the five
3 boroughs where they could be utilized. We spoke
4 about e-bikes. Many of the members are concerned.

5 I'm happy to be a cosponsor on Council Member
6 Holden's e-bike registration bill. Our purview with
7 the City Council, we could only ask DOT to register
8 the e-bikes, but I'm also very supportive of Assembly
9 Member Rajkumar's bill to have the DMV register,
10 license and-- e-bikes so this way they can be given a
11 lesser summons when stopped and not-- and would be
12 reduced from a criminal summons. Additionally, we
13 talked about staffing, so I have a bill that's being
14 worked on right now, it's pending, to do a \$10,000
15 sign-on and stay-on bonus for our officers. We have
16 to incentivize them to come to us, and we have to
17 incentivize because they've been so disincentivized
18 to become police officers. And finally, the crimes of
19 urination and public drug abuse, I have a bill that's
20 pending, being written, that would make them more
21 punishable, the fines would be more punishable. So
22 that is the way I wanted you to know that we are
23 working in collaboration with you, especially my
24 colleagues and myself, and many of those bills I have
25 bipartisan support. But my question is, our

2 precincts right now are severely lacking vehicles in
3 their fleet. So, I just wondered if there was a plan
4 that you have that you want to set forth that would
5 enhance the fleets in our local precincts?

6 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, first, Council
7 Member, thank you so much for your efforts and your
8 partnership on those and so many other issues of
9 concern to New Yorkers. As for the vehicles, it is a
10 piece of feedback that we are getting from our cops
11 all the time, basically citywide that their vehicles
12 are beaten up, and in fact many of them are either at
13 end-of-life or past end-of-life which is why I'm
14 thrilled to report that the Office of Management and
15 Budget has greenlighted our purchase of a thousand
16 new vehicles. We are placing or have placed many of
17 the orders already, and we expect those vehicles to
18 trickle in over the next six months, and that will
19 definitely be very well received at commands across
20 the five boroughs.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Thank you so
22 much. That's incredible news. And I just want to
23 close with thanking you for your collaborative
24 approach, the changes that you've made in policies,
25 in staffing, the ComplianceStat, the fact that your

2 Quality of Life Division is really making a
3 difference, and it has already had a positive effect
4 on crime, you know, statistics and also within the
5 NYPD. Really, you are a steady hand in leadership
6 for the NYPD.

7 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Thank you for
9 what you're doing.

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Questions from
11 Council Member Brewer followed by Restler.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I've always like
13 Kelly and Bratton, but you have kicked their ass in
14 terms of your information today, and I will tell
15 them. My question, starting with paperwork-- I think
16 that you are working on some kind of a project that
17 would hopefully have a more streamlined paperwork.
18 Now don't blame the City Council, because it's not
19 all our fault. But sometimes half of the tour is
20 filling out paperwork, so what are we going to do
21 about that? Michael Gerber knows all about this.

22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Go ahead, Michael.

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Yeah, sure.
24 So, we are working on that and it's a discussion
25 we've had before, obviously. I'll give one example.

2 It's a small piece, but it's in the vein of what
3 you're talking about. So, for example we now have,
4 as you know, Level I and Level II reporting that we
5 do. We had-- you know, we realized the cops were
6 doing-- for Level II there's a consent to search
7 form. There are two separate forms, right? One the
8 Level II form, one the consent to search form, which
9 kicks in at Level II. So we did what I'm sure you
10 would say is painfully obvious which is we combined
11 the forms. And so now instead of doing-- having to
12 do forms in that situation, they're doing one. So,
13 we're looking for opportunities to do exactly that.
14 We want fewer forms. In a perfect world-- in a
15 perfect world, there would just be one form that--

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing] Yes.

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: and officer
18 would fill out.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Yes.

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: And it would
21 auto populate to lots of other things.

22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I just want to-- I
23 just add here, because this is all a lot of detail.
24 Like, big picture, our officers are required to fill
25 out way too much paperwork and--

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing] I
3 agree.

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: way too many forms,
5 and I would welcome the opportunity to work with this
6 council--

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing]
8 Okay.

9 COMMISSIONER TISCH: on a massive bill to
10 modernize what types of forms and what types of
11 reporting the New York City Police Department and
12 specifically our police officers are required to do.
13 Because some of this stuff came about like 10, 20
14 years ago, and in my opinion is no longer relevant or
15 necessary or something that we want our officers like
16 burning their time on. It's truly wasteful.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: We agree since
18 they spend half their time-- when I go out and I see
19 that. So, let's work on that. Number two, where is
20 Manhattan tow pound?

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So, I--

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing] I've
23 been working on it.

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: No, I would
25 love to be--

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing] I've
3 been out looking

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: sitting here
5 saying something other than that. Unfortunately, the
6 circumstances are still the same.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I know.

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: it is very,
9 very challenging to find affordable real estate in
10 Manhattan.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Who's looking?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So, we are
13 working in conjunction with DCAS, with CBRE, which is
14 the real estate firm that contracts with DCAS. What
15 we're also focusing on--

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing]
17 They're not the best firm if we remember.

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: What we're
19 focusing on now is really looking at space that other
20 agencies may have that they are not fully utilizing
21 or maybe have a hold on and something they're not
22 going to use for a decade.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Any timeframe on
24 that?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So, I'm hoping
3 within the next few months will have it solidified if
4 not sooner.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay. The issue
6 of the ghost plates. So you-- I want to know how you
7 are updating our resources dedicated to the program,
8 and then is there any enforcement that you can see
9 that's making a difference on ghost plates?

10 COMMISSIONER TISCH: We do a tremendous
11 amount of enforcement on our ghost cars. I'm just
12 going to pull up the numbers. Okay.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Some
14 neighborhoods there's a lot of ghost plates, and
15 there's some lady--

16 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] Okay.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: selling Virginia
18 plates out of the back of her car, too, and you can
19 order them from Amazon.

20 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Ghost plates year-
21 to-date over 34-- wait. Oh, okay. Year-to-date over
22 11,000 B summonses, over 1,000 seizures.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay. Alright, I
24 mean, I assume that makes a difference. Who knows?
25 I mean, there's many more, but it's a start, right?

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Point is we have
3 real resources dedicated to enforcing rules around
4 ghost plates and license plates, and we run
5 operations all the time.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Another about
7 cars, I don't know what Crelo [sic] cars, but I think
8 they're the rental unmarked cars--

9 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] Yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: that were being
11 tracked. So, you're doing new tracking procedures
12 and I think they're expensive, and so I was just
13 wanting to get an update on that.

14 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, when I started at
15 the Department, one of the things that we looked at
16 was how we were using and allocating a class of
17 vehicles called CRALO vehicles which are supposed to
18 be-- they're unmarked cars, and they're generally
19 supposed to be used for investigative and undercover
20 work. And so, we've done based on that analysis a
21 reallocation of CRALO vehicles to make sure that they
22 are being assigned to commands where they are doing
23 undercover and investigative work.

24

25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 110

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: And so, it's not
3 a million dollars a month or something? It's less
4 now?

5 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Oh, the cost for
6 CRALO--

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So, it's not a
8 million. We are projecting about \$9-\$10 million this
9 year in expenses. So, it is a significant
10 expenditure and that's part of why we're looking at
11 making sure these are used when and how they should
12 be.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay.

14 COMMISSIONER TISCH: But they are a
15 meaningful and important--

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing] You
17 need them.

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: part of our overall
19 fleet.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay. In terms of
21 NYCHA, I'm a big believer of PSAs, but the NYCHA
22 residents, as you know, desperately need vertical,
23 vertical, verticals, and I just want to know what--
24 is there going to be an increased focus on the NYCHA
25 residents. They love NYPD. The doors are never

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 111

2 going to close. I don't care what you do at NYCHA,
3 those doors are never going to close, and so people
4 go in and out. You know the issues, but there's just
5 not enough PSA folks there.

6 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, Chief McEvoy is
7 our new Chief of Housing, and he will answer that
8 question.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you.

10 CHIEF MCEVOY: Hi, good afternoon. So,
11 we still do verticals, or as we also call them
12 interiors roughly in all the housing developments,
13 and roughly we average-- not just from the Housing
14 Bureau, but all the other partners, Patrol Services
15 Bureau-- roughly 70,000 a year.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay. I mean, I
17 got that. I just-- I have complaints all day long. I
18 probably know as much as anybody about NYCHA. So it
19 has to be increased. I don't know how to do it. The
20 homeless are sleeping there. Your friends come.
21 They smoke weed in the hallways. They scare the
22 living daylights, particularly out of the seniors.

23 CHIEF MCEVOY: Yeah, these are part of the
24 housing--

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing]
3 You've got to have more verticals or interiors.

4 CHIEF MCEVOY: It's part of our strategy
5 to reduce crime and improve the quality of life for
6 all the residents.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: So, you're going
8 to have more verticals or interiors this year?

9 CHIEF MCEVOY: Definitely.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: How many more?

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Council Member, we--
12 I have every confidence that the Chief is going to
13 ensure that we have more verticals this year, but the
14 real answer to this is addressing the uniformed
15 staffing shortfalls that we have.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I agree. I agree.

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Even though I have
18 prioritized in terms of officer allocation the
19 numbered commands and the numbered squads, many of
20 them, most of them, are still down real numbers--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing] I
22 know.

23 COMMISSIONER TISCH: compared to five,
24 six years ago, and so hopefully the Mayor's plan to
25 get us back up to a staffing of 35,000 officers--

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 113

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing] I'm
3 with you.

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: That will make the
5 big difference--

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing] I
7 agree.

8 COMMISSIONER TISCH: of how many verticals
9 we're doing.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: No, I agree. I
11 just want you to focus on NYCHA. That's all I'm
12 saying.

13 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Understood.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Because when I go
15 to Rikers, I know all the inmates, detainees. Hi,
16 Gale. Hi, Gale. Hi, Gale, because I know NYCHA, and
17 so they need help. NYCHA needs help that's what I'm
18 trying to say. In terms of CRT, how is the
19 effectiveness of overtime judged for units like CRT
20 and the new Q Teams? How do you decide this is
21 effective?

22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, for CRT, that is
23 an operational command, and the way we've managed
24 overtime in the department on the uniformed side is
25 we have set thresholds for uniforms based on the type

2 of work they do, operational, administrative, or
3 investigative. CRT would be operational which means
4 they may do 40 hours of overtime each month, and the
5 First Deputy Commissioner and the Deputy Commissioner
6 of Management and Budget oversee the whole thing and
7 make sure no one exceeds it. In terms of how it--
8 whether-- how we're assessing whether they're using
9 their overtime effectively or not-- do we have
10 someone from the Chief of Department's Office?
11 Bruce, can you come up? Thanks. Oh, maybe Chief of
12 Patrol, sorry. Whatever.

13 CHIEF CEPARANO: Sorry, could you just
14 repeat that question?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Sure. The
16 question is with CRT or Quality of Life, how do you
17 determine the effectiveness based on overtime?

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Chief Rivera, I
19 apologize.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: That's okay.
21 That's alright. Thank you both very much.

22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: You did a great job,
23 Bruce.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: They all do a
25 great job. We just got a lot of problems.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 115

2 CHIEF RIVERA: So, with respect to CRT,
3 you know, their mission is primarily focused on
4 vehicles interdiction, mopeds are-- car meets. That
5 sort of stuff. What we're looking at, they stick to
6 their 40 hours. If there's special assignments
7 beyond that, then you know, we'll allocate them
8 specifically, but they're capped at 64.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: And the same idea
10 with Quality of Life, a new division?

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah, Quality of
12 life--

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing] Same
14 idea?

15 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Most of those cops
16 work actually in commands, numbered commands and
17 precincts as part of Q Teams, and so they would be
18 subject to the same overtime thresholds.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay. I don't
20 want to-- I know the issue of e-bikes has been
21 discussed a lot. My issue is the folks of the 5,100,
22 I assume you can't ask or don't know how many are
23 undocumented. But--

24 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] We
25 can't ask and we don't know.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I know that. I
3 know that. So, what I'm saying, that's what we're
4 nervous about. ICE is horrific. So that's what the
5 concern is. We don't even know if any ICE folks have
6 been to the courts when somebody from the
7 deliveristas has been arrested, right? We don't know
8 that, is that correct?

9 COMMISSIONER TISCH: That is correct.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay. I mean,
11 that's what we're concerned about. If it-- to me, if
12 it wasn't that situation, I would not be so nervous,
13 but that's a concern. Is that something that--
14 everybody's aware of and is nervous about?

15 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I understand the
16 concern. At the Police Department, we need to
17 enforce the laws whether it be for felonies,
18 misdemeanors, violations to ensure public safety, and
19 in this case traffic safety.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay.

21 COMMISSIONER TISCH: And so that's what
22 we are doing here, and I think we have been-- I have
23 certainly been very clear in the fact that the New
24 York City Police Department is going to follow the
25

2 Sanctuary City laws. We are not going to engage in
3 civil immigration enforcement.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Right. Thank you
5 very much. I know that thanks to Deputy Mayor Meera
6 Joshi when she was here, she did send over some good
7 testimony, good legislation which we would love to
8 work with you on on this topic, and that could be
9 perhaps some answers to the deliveristas and e-bike
10 problem. Thank you very much.

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. Questions
13 from Council Member Stevens followed by Restler.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: I will be quick.
15 Good afternoon.

16 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Good afternoon.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: I know in your
18 testimony it was laid out around, like, since Raise
19 the Age and gave some statistics around like the
20 increase, and everyone knows I'm really concerned
21 about young people and the rise of violence. Been
22 working with folks around really having a de-
23 carceration plan, because the numbers have tripled,
24 but I also want to make sure that in the same route
25 we look at some of the other things and other factors

2 other than Raise the Age, because that's not the only
3 factor. In New York State right now, unemployment
4 rate for 16- to 24-year-olds as of April is 14.2
5 percent. In January and March of 2025 there were
6 over 620,000 young people in that age group were
7 unemployed, 59,000 more from the previous year. This
8 was a 13.2 percent increase, and so I think when
9 we're talking about the Raise the Age and the
10 factors, we're also not factoring in how we have left
11 young people out of the conversation around jobs and
12 opportunities and all the things, and not have not
13 given them a lot of opportunities. And so, I always
14 want to make sure that we're having a balanced
15 conversation about young people, because if the crime
16 rates around young people are raising, that is a
17 failure on every adult that's sitting in this room,
18 and so that has to be said. And so, for me, I know
19 your job as Commissioner and the Police Department is
20 to enforce the law and to watch the crime, but I have
21 real concern just even going into the summer. And I
22 know we had a conversation, I am scared for what the
23 summer's going to look like. I think that we need to
24 be having a real conversation about where these young
25 people are getting guns from and how they're getting

2 access to them so frequently and so freely. But also
3 just thinking about what is the real coordination in
4 the sense of-- I 100 percent agree that we should be
5 deploying more cops in these areas, but I also want
6 to make sure that we're also deploying the same
7 amount of resources so that young people can have
8 opportunities, and I know it was shared that their
9 stat-- that stats are being shared between CMS
10 groups, and I know you stated that you meet with them
11 once a week. I would love to just know what are those
12 conversations look like, and when you're talking,
13 because I've been at a couple of shootings where
14 there are hundreds of young people out there grieving
15 and I see cops and I don't see anything else. So I
16 would love to hear more about what those
17 conversations are, because if you're talking and
18 you're sharing stats, then I would hope that at the
19 same time they're being deployed-- and don't you
20 worry, I'm holding DYCD and the CMS groups just as
21 accountable, because I know lot of people love to say
22 that we're in yelling at y'all. That's not true. I'm
23 holding them just as accountable in this situation.
24 But I would like to know what does those

2 conversations look like, and how are we coordinating
3 these efforts for the summer?

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, Chief Lipetri,
5 our Chief of Crime Control Strategies is going to
6 respond.

7 CHIEF LIPETRI: As always, the
8 conversations start with prevention. So, we-- those
9 conversations mostly stem from an analysis of a
10 shooting incident or shots fired in areas of the City
11 where we know where the retaliatory violence is going
12 to go.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: When you're
14 having those conversations around prevention, and I
15 know that, you know, the Commissioner has been very
16 clear, like if there are shots-- she's going to
17 deploy those officers there. Are you guys also
18 coordinating with the CMS groups also to deploy CMS
19 groups out there at the same time to support, and
20 what does that look like?

21 CHIEF LIPETRI: Yeah, so how it works--
22 look, I'm going to give you a great example. This
23 past weekend, Memorial Day weekend in the Bronx in
24 the 40, the 44, the 46, the 47, and the 48 we did not
25 have one shooting incident and one confirmed shots

2 fired. And how we do that is put 300 extra officers
3 on those streets for that weekend and for the whole
4 summer. So just how we surge to specific areas, we
5 like CMS to surge to specific--

6 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: [interposing]

7 Yeah, and that's why I'm asking, because I want it to
8 be clear, because we cannot just deploy cops out
9 there, because my fear is that we're going to have
10 kids shooting kids, and then cops shooting kids, and
11 then that's going to be [inaudible] for disaster.

12 And so for me, there needs to be a much more
13 coordinated effort between all of these groups to
14 ensure the safety of everyone, because I'm not saying
15 that, you know, you guys shouldn't be there, but what
16 I am saying is other resources need to be deployed.
17 And so I want to see a greater effort from everyone
18 to ensure everyone's safety. And so yes, I know that
19 there was a lot of cops out there, but that doesn't
20 prevent-- that's prevention.

21 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I understand. We
22 understand.

23 CHIEF LIPETRI: We understand. Agreed.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: And so again, I
25 needed to be on the record. That's it. You know, I

2 got to say it and I need to say it in every space.

3 So, again, I said the same thing to NYPD. My last
4 question is also just even around the Quality of Life
5 Division. Excited to hear about this, because this
6 has been one of the issues that I feel like often is
7 overlooked in my district because I have the 44, 42,
8 and 46. We are often fighting crime and have more
9 serious things, and so quality of life is always the
10 last thing. So, I need to know when those will be
11 rolled out in the 44, 46, 42, because it is essential
12 for us. And will they be getting additional cops for
13 those divisions as well?

14 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, we're going to--
15 we are working on the rollout schedule now, and I
16 expect to have it for everyone this summer to be able
17 to tell everyone which command is going to be rolled
18 out when. But we are going for a citywide rollout of
19 it based on the success that we've seen in the first
20 month or two, two months, of the pilot that we have
21 been doing. And in some commands it will be
22 additional officers, but in many of them it will be a
23 reassignment or a refocusing of existing officers in
24 the commands.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: I would like to
3 go on record that none of my precincts should have
4 reassignments. We need additional officers, so I
5 need that to be on record. So, the 44, 42, 46 we
6 need additional officers to pull out the division
7 because we have so much going on.

8 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I just want to be
9 very clear. Understood, but I want to be very clear
10 that this summer you have gotten in those commands
11 specifically a lot of cops.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: No, I hear you.
13 I know. You told me.

14 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Not everyone here
15 can say that.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Everyone also
17 cannot say the amount of shootings that they have
18 either, so--

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] 100
20 percent, and that is exactly what I respond to them
21 when they complain. We're-- we have to put the cops
22 where they are needed.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: And just the
24 last thing. This isn't a question. This is a
25 comment. I know the police's feeling on the gang

2 database and how, you know, they feel that it could
3 be improved. I just-- again, I'm just always going
4 to stand on the side of things cannot be fixed when
5 it already comes with a broken system. A broken
6 clock could be right twice a day, and it-- things
7 like that just have to go, because it stems from
8 racism, and I know that you have-- you feel very
9 differently, but I'm-- that's not going to change it,
10 and I know it's in your testimony. I was not going
11 to bring it up, but because you brought it up, I'm
12 going to bring it up, and so we are-- I know we have
13 conversations coming up to talk about how you feel
14 about, how I feel about it, but I just have to say it
15 because you brought it up, and so I just brought it
16 up. So that's it. Thank you guys so much.

17 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Questions from
18 Council Member Restler followed by Joseph.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Thank you,
20 Chairs. Greatly appreciate your thoughtful
21 leadership. Good to see you, Commissioner.

22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Good to see you.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I-- you know, I
24 like you, and I think that-- I don't say that about
25 everybody, I don't. Bob agrees. I think you're

2 smart. I think you're a strong manager, and I think
3 you've brought real integrity to the Department.

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Since you've
6 returned to the NYPD, I felt it in my community, in
7 my commands. I felt it in the leadership. We've had
8 Chief Obe and Chief Gulotta out in the district
9 recently. There is responsiveness and I think
10 cooperation and partnership, and you know, we've seen
11 how you, I think, brought meaningful oversight and
12 integrity to the Department and it's appreciated, and
13 I think we're seeing it in terms of safety across our
14 communities as well is improving, and I think it
15 starts with leadership, and I don't want to-- that's
16 the most important thing I'm going to say today.
17 It's not to say I agree with all of your policy
18 choices, and there are some that I'm concerned about.
19 You know, I thought that at the end of the Melissa
20 Mark-Viverito speakership, the Criminal Justice
21 Reform Act was a really positive development for the
22 City where we gave the NYPD more discretion to shift
23 towards civil enforcement rather than criminal
24 enforcement on a range of different issues, and
25 unfortunately what we've seen in the Adams

administration is a major shift away from civil enforcement toward criminal enforcement in a variety of different areas. You know, I can cite them. drinking in public, you know, from the beginning of the administration to the present, 91 percent increase in criminal summons for drinking in public. 1,360 percent increase for biking on sidewalks. 1,458 percent increase for bike infractions that are commercial. Nonpayment of a fare is a 233 percent increase. So, we're seeing these significant increases towards criminal enforcement, criminal summons instead of civil. And I just-- broadly, is this a trend that you're concerned about? Do you think that's the right orientation for the Department?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: The policy decision that was made under my tenure so far, the Police Department to go towards criminal summonses, is specific to bike safety and more specifically e-bike safety, and as I have both testified-- as I've testified here today, my thought is that the B summons paradigm was not working in New York City for very obvious reasons. That these e-bikes in New York City are not licensed, and therefore there is no

2 bite, there is no-- nothing behind the B summons,
3 because when you get a B summons when you're driving
4 a vehicle the concern is you'll either get points on
5 your license or if you don't respond, you will lose
6 your license or have it suspended. When you talk
7 about a mode of transportation that is not licensed,
8 the B summons is meaningless, certainly virtually
9 meaningless. And so, if we were going to kick up
10 enforcement around e-bikes in New York City which
11 many of you on the Council have asked us to do, it
12 would literally be burning resources to have more
13 cops out there issuing B summonses. The only other
14 option that we have available to us under the law as
15 it currently exists is C summonses, and so for that
16 reason and to address what I have heard from so many
17 people in so many different parts of the city to
18 address their concerns around safety as it relates to
19 e-bikes hitting people, pulling their kids out of the
20 way of a e-bike careening down the street, we needed
21 to do meaningful enforcement, and so this is that
22 meaningful enforcement. I want to tell you that
23 anecdotally I think it's working. I'm seeing e-bikes
24 stopping at red lights, not 100 percent of the time,
25 but certainly more than they used to do which was

2 like virtually never, and I look forward to working
3 with this council to create a more tailored,
4 meaningful, viable approach to e-bike enforcement and
5 to working on what laws will govern it. But as the
6 law stands now, the C summons is the only meaningful
7 enforcement that we can do, and we have to address
8 the public safety concerns that people are raising.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Broad strokes
10 before the specifics on e-bikes-- you know, I've
11 appreciated that as issues have come up at these
12 hearings such NYPD response times to most serious
13 crimes in progress to call times for 911-- for call
14 responsiveness on 911 operators and calls going to
15 recordings, you've come back with saying--
16 recognizing these issues and coming up with
17 operational solutions and giving us timeframes for
18 when things will get better which I've appreciated.
19 I hope you'll similarly take a look at a shift away
20 from civil toward criminal enforcement in quality-of-
21 life issues that do require your attention. And I'm
22 not saying should not face civil enforcement, but I'm
23 concerned about more people getting swept up in our
24 criminal justice system that don't need it, and
25 that's I think why so many of us are concerned

2 particularly about the criminal enforcement on the e-
3 bike issues and these other issues where we have a
4 Trump administration that is trying to sweep everyone
5 up into their deportation machine they can. Are you
6 concerned that this increased criminal enforcement of
7 e-bike riders where we have a high concentration of
8 undocumented people is going to lead to more people
9 getting really wrongly deported?

10 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I will address that
11 question first and then your larger point after. At
12 the New York City Police Department, we have to
13 address public safety concerns. We have to-- we have
14 to hold our laws and enforce our laws, and so some of
15 those could be felonies, misdemeanors, violations. It
16 is what we have to do, and as it relates to e-bikes,
17 the only option that we have at this time that is
18 viable and meaningful is issuing C summonses. I do
19 hope and expect that the Council is going to work to
20 create a new framework to govern e-bikes so that the
21 C summons won't be our only viable option, but right
22 now it is. And as we uphold all of these laws, like,
23 are there potential downstream consequences,
24 certainly, but the NYPD does not engage in civil
25 immigration enforcement, period.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I'm not totally
3 satisfied with the answer, but I do agree that it
4 would be helpful for us to collaborate together on a
5 regulatory framework to have better and more
6 appropriate enforcement. I don't think the status quo
7 is working either in terms of-- we have dangerous
8 situations with e-bikes that need to be addressed,
9 and I don't think the enforcement approach is the
10 best case scenario.

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: And that's the
12 thing, the status quo doesn't work for pedestrians.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Agreed.

14 COMMISSIONER TISCH: it also doesn't work
15 for people who believe and who are desperate to see
16 more bikes on the road, because what we've seen over
17 the past let's say 10 years is, like, the explosion
18 of biking in New York City without any meaningful
19 legal framework to keep everyone safe. And when
20 things grow like that without a regulatory framework,
21 they get out of control, and right now, my opinion,
22 the-- an opinion that I know is shared by lots of New
23 Yorkers, things are out of control. And so we need
24 to work with this council to bring it back under
25 control and put in place a sensible framework to

2 address it. As to your question about the move to
3 criminalize, I will look at those numbers, and I will
4 be prepared soon to have a meaningful conversation
5 with you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Great.

7 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I believe in the
8 spirit of those reforms that you mentioned, but I
9 just want to have more specific numbers in my head
10 before we engage.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I appreciate you
12 saying that very much. I'll just say this in
13 closing, I don't-- I don't-- you know, I've not
14 signed on to Council Member Holden's bill. I don't--
15 I think that we need a broader conversation about how
16 to hold the app companies accountable in this, that
17 we can't just be focused on enforcement of the bike
18 riders. It has to be a broader approach, and if the
19 Police Department is interested in engaging the
20 diverse cross-section of Council Members on this
21 topic for how we can solve for this, I would welcome--
22 - I would be happy to be a part of those
23 conversations.

24 COMMISSIONER TISCH: My opinion-- my
25 opinion generally is that we cannot live in a

2 consequence-free environment. Bad things come from
3 that, and right now the way the B summonses worked,
4 e-bikes were generally living and working in a
5 consequence-free environment, and my hope is that
6 this council whenever they pass whatever reforms are
7 going to be made around e-bikes and biking generally
8 in New York City is we will not repeat that mistake
9 of creating a consequence-free environment.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I would welcome
11 further conversations with your team on that to try
12 and craft a regulatory environment that is
13 enforceable and effective. So, I appreciate the
14 time, and I just want to thank-- your team is going
15 to meet with us about some of the crime data in the
16 84 next week, and I appreciate that. I hope we can
17 get some attention on that soon. Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Questions from
19 Council Member Joseph followed by Hudson.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Thank you,
21 Chairs. Commissioner, how are you? I have a couple
22 of questions. One, what is the rule around fare
23 evasion? There was an incident in my district with a
24 gentleman who got on the bus who didn't pay his fare,
25 but the way he was treated, it took seven officers to

2 subdue someone for \$2.90. And if I recall correctly,
3 I know the Council had passed a bill that there
4 should be education and then enforcement, that if you
5 do take someone for fare evasion, you should notify
6 them that there's Fair Fares. I didn't see that
7 happen in that video. We can have an offline
8 conversation and show you what transpired in my
9 community, and it's unacceptable, right? For \$2.90
10 took seven officers to put one gentleman in the car.

11 CHIEF GULOTTA: Yeah, I would have to
12 take a look. So, MTA works with us with Eagle teams
13 with [inaudible] officers as well with bus
14 enforcement. So, I'd be happy to look at that and
15 see what happens and work closely with you.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Yeah, I would
17 love to do that, because I don't want that to happen,
18 because I'm sure that could have happened to one of
19 my older adults who got on the bus and didn't pay
20 their fares, but you know, we want to make sure that-
21 - it was a lot to watch and it was very aggressive
22 for \$2.90.

23 CHIEF GULOTTA: Understood. I'm happy to
24 work with you on that.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 134

2 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Thank you. Has
3 OMB and the Office of Labor Relations made progress
4 in the salary for Assistant School Safety Agents?

5 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yes.

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Yes. So, for
7 the Assistant School Safety Agent title, that has
8 been established. It's \$37,000, and we are looking
9 to hire our first group of Assistant School Safety
10 Agents in July.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: And that's the
12 official title?

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: If yes-- the
15 salary is, can you repeat that again?

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Yeah, I'm
17 going to get you the exact-- it's \$37,000, but--

18 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: [interposing] And
19 how many have you hired?

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: We haven't
21 hired any yet because we're waiting for the
22 certification from the state and then the
23 establishment of the official salary. So, the first
24 class will be in July.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 135

2 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: And what type of
3 training? [inaudible] modified training for
4 Assistant School Safety Agents, what type of training
5 will they receive?

6 INSPECTOR MULET: Hi, good afternoon.
7 Inspector Tracy Mulet.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Good afternoon,
9 Inspector.

10 INSPECTOR MULET: Thank you, ma'am. They
11 will receive eight weeks of training that will
12 encounter physical fitness as well as NYPD, New York
13 City Public Schools rules and regulations, visitor
14 protocol. Also, they'll learn about Restorative
15 Justice as well as dealing with child in crisis.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: And de-escalation
17 will be part of that training as well, as these are--
18 what was the age group for hiring School Safety
19 Assistants?

20 INSPECTOR MULET: 18, 17, depending on
21 how advanced they are, I guess, if they finish high
22 school, but definitely high school. No older than
23 21, everyone under than 21.

24

25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 136

2 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: And de-escalation
3 is part of the training. And what type of uniform
4 will they have?

5 INSPECTOR MULET: They'll have the light
6 blue uniform with the patch on the side that'll say
7 Assistant School Safety Agent.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: How will you be
9 able to differentiate them?

10 INSPECTOR MULET: The patch, and then
11 also they won't have a shield on them.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: They won't have a
13 shield. And how many of these positions will be
14 funded?

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: We got
16 approval for 400.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: And how do you--
18 how you decide where you place them in the schools?

19 INSPECTOR MULET: they'll be placed in
20 the elementary schools and that'll be determined with
21 communication, definitely collaboration with New York
22 City Public School system, as well as the incidents
23 that there as well as the population.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: And the funding
25 will be-- is it a interagency funding between New

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 137

2 York City Public Schools and NYPD just like School
3 Safety Agents?

4 INSPECTOR MULET: Yes, it is, ma'am.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: And when-- go
6 ahead.

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Sorry. Just
8 the exact salary for the Assistant School Safety
9 Agent is \$37,339.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: And why
11 elementary schools?

12 INSPECTOR MULET: Just because they're
13 just still coming out of high school. High school
14 they're just graduating. We figured elementary, a
15 smaller environment, younger kids, it'll be a easy
16 assimilation for them.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Okay. Thank you.
18 Thank you, Chairs.

19 INSPECTOR MULET: Just a note, it just
20 came out last night. It is out, the link for the job
21 so all can apply in that age group, and we sent you
22 the link, ma'am.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Questions from
25 Council Member Hudson.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Thank you,
3 Chairs. Hello, Commissioner. I have several
4 questions so bear with me here. In 2023, individuals
5 age 60 and older across the country lost a staggering
6 3.--

7 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] Did you
8 say 60 or 16?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: 60, six zero.
10 Lost a staggering \$3.4 billion to fraud. Here in New
11 York City, our older adult population has grown by
12 more than 30 percent in the past decade, and it's
13 projected to grow another 40 percent by 2040. As
14 financial crimes become more sophisticated with
15 advancing technology, how's the NYPD using it's
16 budget to protect one of our largest and most
17 vulnerable populations?

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I'm going to ask
19 Chief Kenny, our Chief of Detectives--

20 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: [interposing]
21 Sure.

22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: who oversees
23 financial crimes in those--

24 CHIEF KENNY: So, in a normal instance
25 like this where the crime takes place, the numbered

2 squad or the local squad would take that case, but
3 then the Financial Crimes Taskforce will be brought
4 in to enhance that, and then in some instances, even
5 the Major Case Unit would be brought in to follow up,
6 because a lot of these crimes, as we know, lead to
7 interstate crime-- criminals. So, we also use our
8 federal partners as well. So, we do work very closely
9 with the FBI and HIS in regards to financial crimes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Do you think
11 given the increase in population that's going to be
12 expected over the next 15 years that perhaps
13 resources should be directed toward that division?

14 CHIEF KENNY: We do fill in as need be,
15 but you know, as we've been speaking about, you know,
16 for the majority of this hearing, we are short-
17 staffing. That's why we do have numbered squads
18 pitch in to help out when need be.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay. Thank you.
20 The statistic you shared in your testimony about gun
21 arrests and shooters for children under the age of 16
22 are staggering.

23 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yes.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: in 2022, I
25 introduced legislation that would require the NYPD

2 Commissioner to provide guidance to its uniformed
3 officers on determining whether to use criminal
4 enforcement or divert young people to a community-
5 based organizations to receive essential services in
6 lieu of arrest, and this has been demonstrated as
7 successful in precincts in Brooklyn. Our goal was to
8 provide young people with the services and resources
9 they need that are pushing them to resort to crime.
10 Has the NYPD explored such a program and if not, would
11 you support such a program? And does the NYPD have
12 existing programs that divert young people to
13 programs or services in lieu of arrest when criminal
14 activity is identified.

15 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, I have not
16 looked at that piece of legislation from 2022, but if
17 you'll give me just a few days, I will take a look at
18 it. I'm happy to follow up with you on it. As for
19 the diversion programs, Chief Lipetri is going to
20 speak to that.

21 CHIEF LIPETRI: Good morning.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Good morning.

23 CHIEF LIPETRI: So, one of the--

24 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: [interposing]

25 Afternoon.

2 CHIEF LIPETRI: Good afternoon.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: You've been here
4 that long.

5 CHIEF LIPETRI: When the Police
6 Commissioner came in, she asked me to look at youth
7 crime, youth violence but also how to deal with at-
8 risk youth prior to them committing a serious crime
9 or a gun-related crime. So, one of the things that
10 the NYPD instituted was the Juvenile Crime Desk now
11 falls under Crime Control Strategies, my bureau. We
12 are an extremely data-driven bureau that looks at not
13 just crime, but looks at indicators that somebody
14 might be either a victim or a perpetrator in a crime.
15 This is specifically looking at juveniles. So, one
16 thing that we are-- that we will be instituting is
17 the ceasefire program with juveniles. We've never
18 done that before. Though some get mixed in, but we're
19 primarily focused on adults. So, I think the
20 Ceasefire program including-- you know, just with
21 juveniles is something that we can really, really do
22 well, and when we start I can reach out to you, and
23 you can maybe come to one of the meetings.

24

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: That'd be great.
3 Thank you. And just so you know, Commissioner, it's
4 Intro 254.

5 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: The bill. A
7 couple of district-specific questions and then I have
8 a broader question. Are you familiar with a program
9 called to Protect, Serve and Understand that's put on
10 by a performing arts group called Irondale?

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I am not.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay. For nearly
13 a decade they've used theater to help police and
14 community members build trust and understanding. I
15 went to the, you know, 10-year anniversary
16 celebration. We had former, you know, folks from the
17 Police Department. I don't remember all their
18 titles. But officers were permitted to attend the
19 sessions and participate in the 10-week-long program.
20 However, we've been informed that the NYPD earlier
21 this month was canceling this program in order to put
22 more uniforms on the street. The program only
23 requires seven officers for a total commitment of 56
24 hours over 10 weeks, and less than \$20,000 annually
25 to fund the program which builds trust in the

2 community. If you're not familiar with the program
3 then I won't ask if you can explain why it was
4 cancelled.

5 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I'm not familiar
6 with the program, but each Deputy Commissioner and
7 each Borough Chief has to make some really difficult
8 decisions in a tough environment in terms of
9 staffing, and so the program that you're talking
10 about would fall under Community Affairs Bureau run
11 by Deputy Commissioner Mark Stewart, and so I
12 recommend that you follow up with him on why he made
13 the assessment to cut participation in that program.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Great. Will do.
15 Thank you. And then while Council Member Brewer
16 continues to look for the Manhattan tow pound, I want
17 to ask if you have a plan to get both official and
18 personal police vehicles off of pedestrian sidewalks.
19 At every precinct in my district, parked cars come
20 right up to the tree pits which leaves space that's
21 too narrow for me to pass with my kid's stroller, let
22 alone if somebody has a wheelchair or a cane or some
23 other type of mobility impairment. And I'm wondering
24 if there's a plan to return pedestrian space to
25

2 pedestrians and put police cars in proper parking
3 spots and even garages.

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, in my mind, I
5 look at this in two different pieces. The first is
6 the parking around precincts. The second is very
7 basic citywide parking plaque enforcement, not in the
8 specific area dealing with precinct parking. But
9 like, for example, using a plaque to leave a car like
10 in a bike lane or--

11 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: [interposing]
12 Yeah, and I'm not even trying to address that. I'm
13 addressing specifically on the block of the
14 precincts.

15 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Oh, so you're doing--
16 - you're talking about category number one.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Police-- yeah,
18 category number one. Police cars, it's their
19 personal vehicles that when they come, you know, for
20 their shift--

21 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing]
22 Understood.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: they're parking
24 and it's perpendicular to the sidewalks and half the
25 car is on the--

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] Our
3 Deputy Commissioner of Legal Matter is overseeing the
4 work of this Department in this area.

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Yeah, so
6 there are number of different pieces to this, and you
7 know, there is a piece, right, a structural piece
8 long-term in terms of just the parking set up around
9 certain command, there are just real challenges,
10 right. We do need to have parking for the officers,
11 but from a compliance perspective, I want you to know
12 that one of the priorities we have at ComplianceStat
13 is this very issue. So, obviously, at compliance--
14 we select-- what are the compliance issues we're
15 really focused on, and one of them is parking around
16 precincts in which we will devote time to-- you know,
17 we have folks from professional standards going out,
18 analyzing what's happening around precincts, taking
19 photos, calling COs to account, right? Having them
20 at the podium, right, and saying hold on, you're the
21 CO of this command, look at this photo. This is
22 totally unacceptable for the reasons, Council Member,
23 that you articulated, and I think we are affecting a
24 lot of change. Obviously, we're happy to follow up in
25

2 terms of the particular commands you're referring to-

3 -

4 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: [interposing]

5 Yeah, I don't think anybody come and taken any photos
6 of the precincts in my district.

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Okay.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: I'm happy to
9 provide the photos. I'm happy to come out with the
10 inspector or whoever does the investigations, but
11 it's real issue, and it's a multifaceted issue.
12 Obviously, each precinct is unique and the areas that
13 they serve and, you know, lack of parking and all
14 that, but in some cases like in the 88 the cars are
15 in the bike lane, and also, you know, the bus lane at
16 times could be.

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, we need to know
18 about that.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay.

20 COMMISSIONER TISCH: We will definitely
21 focus on that, both at ComplianceStat and with our
22 newly centralized inspections teams whose job it is
23 to go out into the field and look for just that type
24 of condition.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay, and one
3 other thing I do want to mention about that
4 specifically is that in the 78, when some of the
5 newer buildings went up as part of Atlantic Yards,
6 there were parking spots allocated for the Police
7 Department that are not used. So,--

8 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] Our
9 Deputy Commissioner of Management and Budget--

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: [interposing]
11 Good.

12 COMMISSIONER TISCH: is definitely going
13 to be following up with you on that.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: You got somebody
15 for everything. I love it.

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Yeah, well we
17 had already reached out about that issue, and so we
18 will follow up to make sure that they got the
19 message.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay, and then
21 just one friendly recommendation.

22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Please.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: As we look to
24 build new housing, when the City is building city-
25 subsidized buildings, one thing that I fought for

2 that I wasn't able to get was if you're already
3 building parking spots or parking will be included in
4 a building and it's near a police precinct, why not
5 allow police cars to be parked--

6 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] Amen.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: in that? So, glad
8 we agree on that one. Yeah, but that's like an
9 internal agency to agency thing.

10 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Oh, I know. I still
11 say amen.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Yeah, yeah, I
13 know. Because the other agencies, they don't want to
14 give you all the parking. Okay, question about
15 overtime. In your testimony you mentioned reductions
16 in overtime, including a combined savings of \$40.4
17 million over just the first four months of 2025
18 compared to last year, and you've also stated that
19 none of this has come at the expense of public
20 safety. Do you have a goal in terms of the amount
21 you're trying to reduce overtime or the cost of
22 overtime by? Or is there a specific number by which
23 you're aiming to reduce overtime?

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So,
25 essentially, if we had continued on the trajectory we

2 were going, we estimate that we would have spent over
3 \$1.2 billion, about \$1.23 billion in Fiscal Year 25,
4 and our projection right now-- obviously, there's
5 still a month left in the fiscal year-- is that we
6 will be about \$1.1 billion. So--

7 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: [interposing] That
8 you will be \$1.1 billion over?

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: No.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Oh, under.

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: No, no. that
12 the total spend would be \$1.1 billion--

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: [interposing]
14 \$1.1, okay.

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: versus \$1.23,
16 and that first--

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] We were
18 on a trajectory for--

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: [interposing]
20 For the \$1.23 billion, and that did not include in
21 the first half of the year the additional transit
22 initiatives that we took on the second half of the
23 year. So, that's incorporating with this additional
24 allocation of resources, which is partially on
25 overtime, still being able to bring that number down

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 150

2 by about \$130 million from what we projected would
3 have been had we not put these efforts in place to
4 manage the overtime more efficiently.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: So, is that the
6 goal, reduction by 130?

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: From what we
8 were projecting, yes.

9 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay. And that's
11 the goal for this fiscal?

12 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Correct.

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: And what will the
15 goal be for next fiscal?

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So, we are
17 working right now with the Office of Management and
18 Budget internally to look at what we think that'll
19 be. I mean, our objective is obviously to continue
20 what we've been doing, and to continue to see those
21 reductions and to continue to see the most effective
22 use of our resources. So, I don't have that number
23 yet, but I anticipate that we'll be working to keep
24 it as tight as possible.

25

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: If we continue to do
3 what we are do-- what we've been doing since January
4 in terms of management of overtime, it is somewhat
5 inconceivable that overtime next fiscal year will be
6 higher--

7 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: [interposing]
8 Right.

9 COMMISSIONER TISCH: than this fiscal
10 year, just because the first six months of the year
11 there was so much spending.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Great. That's
13 good news. If the Chairs will allow, I'd like one
14 more question. Thank you. What is the NYPD's
15 current clearance rate for major crimes, and how do
16 these rates shift when broken down demographically by
17 race, ethnicity or neighborhood? Given persistent
18 disparities and public concern, what concrete steps
19 are being taken to improve transparency, boost
20 investigative performance and rebuild trust in the
21 communities that are most affected by serious crime?

22 CHIEF LIPETRI: That's a lot.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: It is. And I'm
24 happy to repeat whatever you need me to.

2 CHIEF LIPETRI: No, what I'm trying to
3 say is that certain-- you know, every crime has a
4 different clearance rate, basically.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: For sure.

6 CHIEF LIPETRI: I'll just give you some
7 highlights and some things that I am very proud of,
8 because of the collaboration with all the bureaus.
9 Shoplifting is one of them. We right now in some
10 commands are seeing well over a 50 percent clearance
11 rate in shoplifting, and that's because of a very
12 precise plan to look at recidivists, but also look at
13 locations that repeatedly get hit. So, our
14 clearance--

15 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: [interposing] But
16 is that-- sorry. Is shoplifting considered a major
17 crime?

18 CHIEF LIPETRI: It could be. It could be
19 grand larceny.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay.

21 CHIEF LIPETRI: It could be petty
22 larceny, or it could be also a robbery, because
23 people go in to steal merchandise and then use force
24 upon leaving. It becomes a robbery. If you look at
25 the murders, you know, historically we're at a

2 approximately a 70 percent clearance rate, and when
3 you look--

4 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: [interposing] 70?

5 CHIEF LIPETRI: 70. And when you look
6 at-- you look at the borough that has the best
7 clearance rates, it's the Bronx. You know, again,
8 because we put more detectives in the Bronx. We put
9 more resources in the Bronx unfortunately, because
10 it's 37 percent of the shootings in New York City.
11 When you look at our robberies, you know, we're
12 usually at a 40 to 45 percent clearance rates on
13 robberies. So, throughout the years, I've seen--
14 throughout the five years that I've really been
15 honing in on the data when it comes to clearance
16 rate, they've only increased in all of our majors and
17 also our shootings and our shot spotter.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Great. If you can
19 maybe follow up with the demographics by race,
20 ethnicity and neighborhood, that would be helpful.

21 CHIEF LIPETRI: I will give homework to
22 my analysts.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Thank you. Thank
24 you.

2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. Just
3 acknowledging we've been joined by Council Member
4 Rivera, and with that, we're going to close this out.
5 Thank you all very much for your testimony. We look
6 forward to working with you. Sorry, and also Majority
7 Leader Fariás here. Thank you all very much. We'll
8 take a 10-minute break, and then we're going to hear
9 from MOCJ.

10 [break]

11 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. Welcome back
12 everyone. Welcome to the second portion of-- what is
13 this, day 12-- day 12 of Executive Budget hearings.
14 Who's counting? Councilman Justin Brannan, I am the
15 Chair of the Finance Committee. I'm pleased to once
16 again be joined by my friend and colleague, Council
17 Member Salaam who chairs the Committee on Public
18 Safety, and we're joined for this portion by the
19 Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice. We've been
20 joined by Council Member Sanchez and Rivera.
21 Welcome, Director Logan and your team. Thank you for
22 joining us today to answer our questions. On May
23 1st, the administration released the Executive
24 Financial Plan for FY26 to 29 with a proposed FY26
25 budget of \$115.1 billion. MOCJ's proposed FY26

budget of \$844.9 million represents less than one percent of the administration's proposed FY26 budget in the Executive Plan. This is an increase of \$60.6 million from the originally allocated \$784.3 million in the Preliminary Plan back in January. This net increase is mostly due to increase in personnel services spending. As of March 2025, MOCJ had 51 vacancies relative to their FY25 budgeted headcount. My questions will largely focus on MOCJ's work with public defenders, work with nonprofits that provide reentry services, and overall funding issues and challenges. City contracting delays have long been a problem with our nonprofits, but these delays directly affect a person's ability to have a defense in court when they cannot afford representation. Further questions will involve how MOCJ is upholding its agreement in the efforts to close Rikers Island. Before we get started, I again want to thank Jack Story and Casely Lysky [sp?], Owen Katowsky [sp?], everyone from the Finance team back across the street at mission control and over here today for making these hearings possible. I'm now going to turn it over to Committee Counsel, Brian Sarfo [sp?], who will swear everyone in and we can get started.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 156

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Good afternoon. Do
3 you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and
4 nothing but the truth before this committee and to
5 respond honestly to Council Member questions?
6 Director Logan?

7 DIRECTOR LOGA: I do.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chief Daniel?

9 CHIEF OF STAFF DANIEL: I do.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Officer Fiato?

11 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER FIATO: I do.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And Officer Julien
13 [sp?].

14 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER JULIEN: I do.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: You may begin.

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Go ahead. Thank
17 you.

18 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Good afternoon. Good
19 afternoon, Chair Salaam, Chair Brannan, esteemed
20 Council Members who are here in spirit. Thank you
21 for the opportunity to present our FY26 Executive
22 Budget and priorities. I'm Deanna Logan and I have
23 the privilege of leading the Mayor's Office of
24 Criminal Justice. Joining me here today is our Chief
25 of Staff, Nora Daniel, our Chief Financial Officer,

2 Robert Fiato, and our Chief Operating Officer Candice
3 Julien. I imagine with all of the moving parts that
4 are happening right now in New York City, the
5 evolution of our agency in recent years may not be
6 what's front of mind for the Council, and that's
7 fine, if I at least get you all to remember that MOCJ
8 is an essential service in the Public Safety
9 continuum that is designed to make a difference; not
10 headlines. The Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice is
11 an agency, and that's a big thing to say. We are an
12 agency on the rise, doing invaluable work to help
13 reduce our jail population; address hate crimes; stop
14 those that seek to reduce our housing stock and make
15 our neighborhoods safer by breaking cycles of
16 criminal behavior that plague New Yorkers. We work
17 with the Office of Court Administration with defense
18 attorneys, with the District Attorneys to improve our
19 justice system using data to innovate pilot programs
20 you won't find anywhere else in the United States. We
21 empower justice-impacted New Yorkers to make safer
22 transitions back into the community. We don't want
23 anyone spending one day more or one day less in jail
24 than necessary. At the Mayor's Office of Criminal
25 Justice, we bring stakeholders together to create

2 solutions. Now, we're doing it under our own,
3 standalone agency code as well, having completed a
4 two-year transition that improved our information
5 technology, human resources, and oversight
6 capabilities. For the upcoming fiscal year, our
7 executive budget proposes-- yes, you stated it--
8 hundreds of millions of dollars to sustain our vital
9 programs. Today, I'll explain why that's not an
10 expense, but rather an investment for New York City
11 and the people of New York City. Our core programs
12 that start off with re-entry programs, providing
13 meaningful pathways for New Yorkers to successfully
14 return home from incarceration is essential for the
15 benefit of both the individual and the neighborhoods
16 that they call home. Individuals with criminal
17 records often face immense challenges: finding
18 housing, stable job, access to medical care,
19 continuing their education, and just being supported
20 in their humanity as people and citizens. Our
21 programs help bridge those gaps. We allocate \$26
22 million a year to re-entry initiatives that include:
23 discharge planning while still on Rikers and in
24 prison, employment support, and comprehensive
25 services after release, to help stabilize life for

2 the justice-involved persons and their families. Our
3 office also directs \$32 million annually to
4 Alternatives to Incarceration efforts, known as ATIs.
5 This program helps reduce incarceration by offering
6 structured alternatives to jail for more than 5,000
7 New Yorkers each year. We address root issues, like
8 mental health, substance misuse, while holding
9 participants accountable. Connecting individuals to
10 important services, while keeping them in their
11 communities, often with their families, helps lower
12 incarceration rates, recidivism rates, and cost to
13 taxpayers. The Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice
14 leads pretrial innovation, including our successful
15 Supervised Release Program that was introduced in
16 2016. Supervised Release gives judges the option to
17 release individuals with supervision into stable
18 situations that maintains them closer to their
19 families. Similar to our Alternatives to
20 Incarceration, we provide assistance in attending
21 court, accessing employment services, getting
22 referrals for treatment when necessary. Thousands
23 benefit from supportive supervision each year,
24 instead of sitting in jail. When I was here last
25 month, I told you about our pilot providing intensive

support for high-needs individuals operating in Queens and in Manhattan. This pilot is the epitome of how we use data to innovate solutions.

Individuals with higher needs must be supported by people with more experienced clinical supports and expertise. Infusing highly specific person-centered care in our services means that more experienced clinical staff support fewer individuals, and thus increase the amount of time they spend with each client addressing the client's specific needs. In this pilot our ability to review the research data and real time testing of the service models is yielding some promising early results, including significantly lowering rearrest and noncompliance rates. We are looking forward to share more as the pilot continues. A foundational building block of stability is housing. Without reliable place to leave your things and come back to, individuals leaving jail or prison are far more likely to spiral and find themselves once again navigating the criminal legal system. Providing someone the stability of a home, they will be less likely to fall back into the cycles of crime. Participants in our program are about 30 percent less likely to be

rearrested in the year after transitional housing, compared to where they were the year prior to entering that transitional housing. This program evolved from a pandemic-era emergency program into a remarkable, sustainable system that helps thousands of individuals every year with hundreds of people leveraging that support to find stability, but more importantly to get safe, permanent housing. These programs work, and a significant part of this work that must not be forgotten is that the providers of all the services that we contract for are caring professionals who ensure that they offer solutions centered on the people that they are serving. Given the essential foundation housing provides, we also fight to keep the housing market affordable for all New Yorkers, through the work of our Office of Special Enforcement. Their efforts to combat illegal short-term rentals preserves housing for local renters and stability for New York neighborhoods. In the two years since Council passed Local Law 18 and it took effect, we've seen the world's largest online booking sites remove illegal short-term rentals and return housing stock to New York from their New York listings. In partnership with the Department of

2 Buildings and the Fire Department, they're ensuring
3 residential spaces remain safe, livable, and most
4 importantly, available to New Yorkers. Our Office
5 for the Prevention of Hate Crimes is a small, but
6 mighty, team innovating new ways to tackle bias and
7 hate, and they're setting examples for the rest of
8 the country. We work with the New York City Police
9 Department, community organizations, other
10 stakeholders to educate, de-escalate, and support
11 affected communities. We fund grassroots initiatives
12 under the Partners Against the Hate program, and we
13 support the Breaking Bread, Building Bonds initiative
14 launched by Mayor Adams. MOCJ works hard to preserve
15 a cornerstone of justice for tens of thousands of New
16 Yorkers: equal access to legal defense. We coordinate
17 the City's provision of criminal Indigent legal
18 services including conflict counsel cases that are
19 handled by the Assigned Counsel Plan. Working
20 collaboratively with the state we ensure that the
21 City affords quality representation for all,
22 especially those who cannot afford private counsel.
23 To better-manage this work, we created a dedicated
24 legal team focused on contracts and fiscal matters
25 which helps our finance staff register all, not one,

2 but all contracts on time for Fiscal 25 for our
3 Indigent legal work, and we're on track to repeat
4 that success in FY26. With dozens of MOCJ programs
5 and hundreds of MOCJ partners, it would take me
6 hours-- and I know that you're in lunch break, so you
7 don't want me to take hours-- to detail all the
8 impact work-- impact our work is having across New
9 York. But please indulge me with a few highlights
10 that you should know about. One is Project Reset.
11 It's a fantastic second-chance program helping low-
12 level, nonviolent offenders avoid criminal records
13 through a pre-arraignment diversion programs.
14 Restorative Justice is a program that uses the time-
15 tested strategy of bringing parties together to
16 promote healing, as well as public safety. Project
17 Restore Bed-Stuy is a deterrence pilot that was a
18 collaboration with the Office of the Kings County
19 District Attorney and Columbia University Social
20 Relations Lab that afforded 30 young men the agency
21 to exit cycles of gun and gang violence and offered a
22 new de-escalation model for cities everywhere. Flip
23 the Script, featured on Fox News earlier this week,
24 is a program for justice-involved youth in
25 Brownsville, who are now working apprenticeships in

2 the film industry, and we are very much looking
3 forward to them producing their own movie that is
4 going to receive a red-carpet premier later this
5 year. Our CDL training and employment program which
6 was last week was also featured nationally on the CBS
7 News for its stunning success in helping justice-
8 involved New Yorkers get six-figure jobs in the
9 trucking industry. Change is hard work, and we're up
10 for it. We're doing that work. While we don't
11 expect to fix every challenge in our criminal justice
12 system, we are making it fairer for the individuals
13 in the system. We're improving safety and the health
14 of communities across New York City. With a front-
15 row seat to how our investments are improving lives,
16 I can confidently say your investment in the Mayor's
17 Office of Criminal Justice, now its own stand-alone
18 agency, will help advance your constituents'
19 priorities, as well. Thank you for the opportunity
20 to discuss our solutions, and I look forward to our
21 continued partnership in advancing justice and
22 safety.

23 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you very much
24 for your testimony. I want to jump right in here.
25 Talking about contracts. So, a significant portion

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 165

2 of MOCJ's FY26 Executive Budget is allocated for
3 contracts. I just wanted to go over some general
4 info about MOCJ's contracting budget. In the
5 Preliminary Plan back in January, MOCJ was allocated
6 \$135,000 in addition to baseline funding for
7 additional contract staff. So, could you tell us how
8 many staff budgeted and actual do you have working to
9 process payments and contracts?

10 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Thank you. I'll have our
11 Chief Operating Officer who has been diligently
12 working on staffing us up-- I'm very proud to say
13 that we are very different place of vacancies sitting
14 before you today.

15 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER JULIEN: Thank
16 you for the question. Dedicated to contracts we have
17 11 staffers.

18 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: And what are the
19 titles of those positions?

20 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER JULIEN: They
21 range from our Agency Chief Contracting Officer,
22 Deputy Agency Chief Contracting Officer, Contract
23 Manager, Senior Contract Manager, Contract Analyst,
24 and we do have a DCAS Pathways fellows who is on the
25 procurements and finance track.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 166

2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Do you-- would you
3 like more staffers, or is 11 enough to handle the
4 capacity?

5 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER JULIEN: We do
6 have 11 staffers. We have a staffer in the on-
7 boarding process and one vacancy that we are in the
8 process of interviewing for.

9 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So, you're budgeted
10 for 13?

11 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER JULIEN: Correct.

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. And what's
13 the average number of contracts being handled by each
14 of those folks?

15 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER JULIEN: It
16 varies by their seniority, by their title. Our
17 Contract Managers can handle more complex contracts
18 where they can manage upwards of 14 contracts, and
19 also it depends on the task at hand.

20 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Have you designated
21 a Chief Nonprofit Officer?

22 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER JULIEN: Yes, we
23 have.

24 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. Is that
25 included in those 13?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 167

2 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER JULIEN: No.

3 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: And who is the
4 Chief Nonprofit Officer?

5 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER JULIEN: The
6 Chief Nonprofit Officer is the Deputy Agency Chief
7 Contracting Officer for Operations.

8 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: And what's the
9 person's name?

10 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER JULIEN: Emonica
11 Moye.

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. And is that a
13 standalone position, or was it a responsibility added
14 to their existing role?

15 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER JULIEN:
16 Responsibility added to an existing role.

17 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: How much of City
18 Council discretionary award value is available to an
19 organization immediately?

20 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER JULIEN: Can you
21 repeat the question?

22 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: How much of a City
23 Council discretionary award is available to an
24 organization immediately?

25

2 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER JULIEN: I'm
3 going to defer to our Chief Financial Officer.

4 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER FIATO: Yes,
5 Chair. It depends on when the contract is
6 registered. We have approximately \$24 million in
7 City Council discretionary contracts within the
8 agency. So, it all depends on contract registration
9 process. For Fiscal 26, as Director Logan mentioned,
10 we're on track for [inaudible] registration to begin
11 the fiscal year on a good foot with all of our
12 providers.

13 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. Now that the
14 cuts to Alternatives to Incarceration and reentry
15 have been restored to the FY25 levels, and the Points
16 of Agreement lists ATI has a priority to close
17 Rikers, is there any plan to expand funding for these
18 programs in the coming years?

19 CHIEF OF STAFF DANIEL: So, through the
20 restoration to the FY25 levels, we are able to keep
21 all of our providers whole and maintain the current
22 services within ATI. We continue to conduct research
23 and work with our research and development teams to
24 make sure that we understand the needs of ATI. So,
25 as we continue to understand the data better and to

2 get a better understanding of what's needed across
3 the system, we-- that is something that we will
4 continue to discuss with OMB.

5 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: What's the current
6 funding amounts for ATI and reentry services?

7 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER FIATO: ATI is
8 budgeted at \$54 million in Fiscal 26, and reentry is
9 budgeted at \$31.7 million in Fiscal 26 as well.

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So, in light of
11 potential federal cuts to Medicaid and other federal
12 mental health funding, which we know would directly
13 impact the nonprofit providers who offer reentry and
14 discharge planning and mental health-related
15 treatment, has MOCJ considered enhancing funds for
16 reentry and ATI providers?

17 CHIEF OF STAFF DANIEL: So, we know that
18 we'll likely-- I mean, we are monitoring the
19 situation. We likely would not have enough funding
20 to be able to cover everything, but we're continuing
21 to monitor.

22 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Have you asked OMB
23 for more money?

24 CHIEF OF STAFF DANIEL: So, we're
25 continuing to monitor with our providers, and our

2 providers-- we're continuing to work with them to
3 make sure that they're able to maintain the levels of
4 services that we have now.

5 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. Staying on
6 the federal uncertainty. As we know, legal services
7 are essential service to the City, especially in
8 facing attacks from the Federal Government on due
9 process and immigration and family separation. We
10 also know that since the pandemic, nonprofit legal
11 service providers have suffered massive rates of
12 attrition, particularly among their most experienced
13 attorneys. Nonprofits can't retain these workers and
14 New Yorkers and New Yorkers go without experienced
15 lawyers who remain-- and the lawyers who remain have
16 unsustainable caseloads. So, I know right now many
17 of these nonprofits are actively bargaining with
18 their unions to reach fair contracts with wages that
19 will stay-- hopefully stave off attrition. Some of
20 these negotiations are heading towards contract
21 expiration dates at the end of this month, or next
22 month, June. What is MOCJ doing to ensure that
23 funding is in place to meet the contract demands of
24 these unions?

2 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Thank you very much for
3 the question, Chair. We have been working with our
4 indigent defense portfolio to understand what their
5 needs are and we've also been talking to our
6 portfolio team at OMB. Currently, as of this week,
7 the Office of Management and Budget used-- gave each
8 one of our partners the flexibility to use some of
9 the funding that they are receiving for FY26 to
10 address some funding for additional salary increases
11 for staff in order for retention, and we continue to
12 work with the indigent defense portfolio teams to
13 understand where and how funding may or may not be
14 needed so that we can have those discussions with OMB
15 and afford additional flexibility.

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. So, is OMB
17 aware of this concern? I mean, obviously, we want to
18 stave off a possible court shutdown in July which
19 would be chaotic. Is OMB aware?

20 DIRECTOR LOGAN: OMB is aware of the
21 status.

22 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. This is last
23 for me. So, in the FY26 budget the City allocated an
24 additional \$20 million for public defenders
25 performing criminal trials and appeals work. The

2 intent of the initiative is to support staffing in
3 the criminal practice. While this funding is sorely
4 needed, MOCJ has limited how it may be used. Is
5 there a reason why we're sort of trying public
6 defender's hands by restricting the use of their
7 funding? Particularly because we're capping salary
8 increases to three percent.

9 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Much of the-- much of
10 the way that we as a city manage the attorney pool
11 that we have across the City is in giving everyone
12 the ability to give raises at a certain-- in a
13 certain range, and to make sure that we continue to
14 have parity across providers. And as we look at each
15 of the providers, as we look at the market as a
16 whole, we will continue to review and see what makes
17 the most sense in how those-- that flexibility is
18 given. Again, we continue to talk to OMB. We look
19 across where everyone is, and we will continue to
20 work to what would be a fair and equitable resolution
21 of this--

22 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: [interposing] Okay.
23 Am I correct in that the City is limiting-- the City
24 is basically-- the City is explicitly stating that
25

2 the funding cannot be used to support salary
3 increases above the City's pattern of three percent?

4 DIRECTOR LOGAN: The City has been very
5 clear that whatever the providers use their funding
6 for, their overall funding is going to stay the same,
7 because that's where we are within the portfolio, but
8 there has been flexibility in the ability to give
9 raises.

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. I'm going to
11 turn it over to Chair Salaam. Thank you very much.

12 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you, Chair.
13 Good afternoon. I'm going to start with changes to
14 the plan. In Fiscal Year 26 Executive Plan, 14
15 positions are being transferred from various agencies
16 into MOCJ, one from Administration of Children's
17 Services, six from the Department of Corrections,
18 four from the Department of Finance, and three from
19 the Department of Probation, along with \$559,369 in
20 Fiscal Year 25 and \$19 million baselined beginning in
21 Fiscal Year 26. Can you tell us what the purpose of-
22 - what was the purpose of this transfer and which
23 programs or services will MOCJ be taking over from
24 these agencies?

2 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER JULIEN: Thank
3 you for the question. As mentioned earlier, and as
4 you're well aware of, we are a new agency. So, the
5 transfer of headcount was a technical adjustment,
6 moving active staffers into the newly formed agency.
7 So, there's no changes to services. It was simply a
8 technical budget adjustment.

9 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: And I'm not sure if
10 this was already stated, but can you please list the
11 titles of each position that has been transferred?

12 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER JULIEN: I will
13 be able to send that to you after the hearing if
14 that's possible.

15 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you,
16 definitely. This plan reflects an additional \$20
17 million baselined for the City's public defenders
18 which includes \$375,000 baselined for three
19 additional personnel. What three positions are being
20 added?

21 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER FIATO: The
22 \$375,000 is for agency operations, and the three
23 positions funded are for our IT functionality, human
24 resources, and legal.

2 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: And how is the full
3 \$20 million increase being utilized to benefit public
4 defenders?

5 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER FIATO: The Mayor
6 stated intention with funding the \$20 million
7 increase is for the legal service providers to hire
8 new attorneys to assist with caseload and intake
9 assignment increases, but as Director Logn mentioned,
10 there is flexibility for the providers to utilize
11 that funding in accordance with their own internally
12 identified needs working with ourselves and OMB to
13 ensure that that money is spent in line with MOCJ's
14 and the City's objectives with promoting and fair and
15 equitable indigent defense system.

16 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: The plan includes \$4
17 million in baseline funding for Project Reset. What
18 specific services will these funds support?

19 CHIEF OF STAFF DANIEL: So, Project Reset
20 is early-- it's pre-arraignment diversion. So, it
21 provides services for low-level misdemeanors for
22 people who are entering the system that way.

23 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Moreover, I just want to
24 make sure that you're aware, Chair, that not only
25 does it invest in people by providing them services.

2 It also is part of case processing as the number of
3 cases that are arraigned each year is reduced by the
4 individuals that never actually get brought into the
5 court system, and so it is a vital part of not only
6 serving New Yorkers, but also ensuring that the
7 criminal justice system is addressing the cases that
8 they most need to look at and keep us within our 24-
9 hour timeframe for arraignment.

10 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: \$5.9 million is
11 reflected in this plan for human services cost of
12 living new need in Fiscal Year 2026 and-- 25 and
13 2026. Can you please clarify which providers will
14 receive these increases and why is this funding only
15 included for two years?

16 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER FIATO: This is
17 technically a technical adjustment for MOCJ. So the
18 human service COLA funding was announced last March
19 by Mayor Adams, and we were funded an initial
20 allocation last fiscal year. The new need that
21 you're referencing for \$5.9 million is to essentially
22 make us whole for that funding, and it affects most
23 of our providers. We have 159 contracts with 64
24 vendors. So, the vast majority of those vendors will
25 be eligible and are funded for the three percent

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 177

2 increase in Fiscal 2025, three percent in 26, and
3 then another three percent in 27.

4 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: You said three
5 percent through 27?

6 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER FIATO: Three
7 percent annually beginning in 25, and then 26 and 27.

8 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Okay, I want to move
9 to the Points of Agreement update. This past April
10 and then again this past Friday, we received updates
11 from MOCJ regarding the Points of Agreement which was
12 originally created in 2019. Upon reviewing the
13 document, I have questions concerning the methodology
14 as well as regarding the points themselves. So, the
15 most recent update does not include any financial or
16 dollar amounts for the points listed, but you have
17 assured the Council that you're working on it. So
18 can we-- when can we expect to see funding amounts in
19 these updates?

20 CHIEF OF STAFF DANIEL: We can get that
21 to you at the next update. We usually update them
22 annually, and so we can add that to the next update.
23 And if there's anything you'd like to see sooner or
24 anything we can provide to you, we're happy to do.

25

2 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: And what was the
3 methodology when creating this document? Are these
4 updates a collection of responses from each
5 individual agency, or did MOCJ compile these updates
6 on your own? And did the individual agencies report
7 their status: status complete, status ongoing, status
8 done with ongoing work, or was that determined by
9 MOCJ itself?

10 CHIEF OF STAFF DANIEL: Just update an
11 answer. We're committing to updating them monthly
12 now, the POAs. And we worked with each agency to
13 determine what the status of the specific POA was,
14 and then assigned a-- and then we work with them to
15 make sure that it was accurate in terms of how it's
16 described.

17 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: One of the points
18 listed under MOCJ is this document is-- in this
19 document, rather, is to publicly track progress on
20 commitments. The 2025 update states that MOCJ is
21 committed to providing regular updates, both in-
22 person and online. Considering that the April 25
23 update was the first update posted since 2002, and
24 then we received the following update within a month,
25 how often should we expect updates in the future, and

2 if this was a priority for MOCJ, why is it three
3 years before we received our first update?

4 CHIEF OF STAFF DANIEL: So, we did have
5 some staffing challenges in terms of some continuity
6 issues, but we are now committed to updating them on
7 a monthly basis.

8 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: As recent-- at a
9 recent criminal justice hearing, you said that you
10 were working on additional-- on adding these update,
11 rather, to your online tracker. How has this process
12 been moving?

13 CHIEF OF STAFF DANIEL: So, for now we're
14 updating it manually with a PDF, but we are still
15 working through the IT challenges to be able to
16 update the overall website. And we are continuing to
17 post them on our website.

18 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: So, will we receive
19 funding amounts in next month's update?

20 CHIEF OF STAFF DANIEL: Yes, we can-- we
21 can work on that.

22 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Regarding the
23 Community Justice and Innovation Fund, the Points of
24 Agreement states that the City funding match is
25

2 dependent on private dollars. What work is MOCJ
3 doing to find appropriate funding sources?

4 CHIEF OF STAFF DANIEL: So, we are
5 continuing to try to find appropriate private funding
6 sources. We currently have a unit within MOCJ that
7 works directly on innovative pilots, and so that is
8 one way we are continuing to work toward innovation.
9 But we are committed to continuing to work with
10 private funders to seek that funding.

11 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: I'm going to move to
12 the Council budget response. The Council included
13 several proposals in our budget response that
14 emphasized recommendations made by the Lippman
15 Commission in their budget Blueprint to Close Rikers.
16 So, my question is how were the Lippman Commission's
17 funding recommendations considered when finalizing
18 the Executive Plan, and did you discuss these
19 commitments with the Lippman Commission since the
20 plan was released?

21 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Thank you. We were the
22 benefit of actually having Lippman Commission folks
23 kind of preview for us where they were in terms of
24 the recommendations. Many of the suggestions and the
25 recommendations in the report matched a lot of work

2 that is being done now, and so as we look at working
3 with our weekly updates with DOC with Correctional
4 Health, we are incorporating a lot of that work in
5 that weekly meeting. The projects that have been
6 prioritized and funded for Department of Correction
7 meet some of the areas that the Lippman Commission
8 highlighted, very specifically case processing is one
9 of the areas that they highlighted and we are working
10 to ensure that people who are detained are getting
11 access to the materials that they need in order to
12 meaningfully help in their own defense, like having
13 opportunity to review evidence and to annotate it,
14 and to talk to their counsel about it in a more
15 timely fashion, which then supports all of the work
16 that Lippman has been working with Office of Court
17 Administration and we too have been talking with the
18 Office of Court Administration about how to timely
19 move cases through the system and reduce the time
20 that people are spending on Rikers.

21 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: The Council called
22 on the administration in our budget response to
23 expand the Supervised Release Intensive Case
24 Management pilot by providing an additional \$46
25 million per the Lippman Commission's recommendation.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 182

2 The Executive Plan included an increase of \$9.1
3 million in Fiscal Year 26. How was it decided that
4 this amount would be adequate to expand this program,
5 and what does this expansion entail? And lastly,
6 what is the rationale to fund this expansion for only
7 one year?

8 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER FIATO: The \$9.1
9 million you're referencing, Chair, is a specific new
10 need submitted by MOCJ for our Intensive Case
11 Management program which is a component of the
12 Supervised Release program, providing intense
13 services for those who are in need of further
14 outreach from the agency and from our providers. So,
15 the \$9.1 million is a specific MOCJ program related
16 to our \$109 million Supervised Release program. The
17 pilot began last fiscal year and continued into
18 Fiscal 25, and the \$9.1 continues to pilot in Fiscal
19 26.

20 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you, Chair.
21 That's all for me.

22 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. Thank you
23 all very much. Appreciate your testimony.

24 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Thank you.
25

2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, we'll take a
3 little break and then we're going to start public
4 testimony.

5 [break]

6 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: [gavel] Okay.
7 We're going to open up now for public testimony. I
8 just have to read a disclaimer here before we begin.
9 I also want to mention that we've been joined again
10 by Council Member Brewer. Before we begin, I want to
11 remind members of the public that this is a formal
12 government proceeding and therefore, decorum shall be
13 observed at all times. As such, members of the
14 public must remain silent unless, of course, you're
15 at the dais testifying. The witness table is
16 reserved for people who are testifying. No video or-
17 - no video recording or photography is allowed from
18 the witness table. Furthermore, members of the
19 public may not present audio or video recordings as
20 testimony. However, they could submit transcripts of
21 such recordings to the Sergeant at Arms for inclusion
22 in the official final hearing record. If you wish to
23 speak at today's hearing, make sure you fill out one
24 of those slips in the back so we know that you're
25 here, and we will call you up. Once you've been

2 recognized, you'll have two minutes to speak on
3 today's hearing topics which are the NYPD budget and
4 the MOCJ budget, Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice
5 budget. If you have a written statement or
6 additional written testimony that you want to submit
7 for the record, just hand it to one of the Sergeant
8 at Arms and they'll bring it up to us here on the
9 dais, and you can also submit email-- you can submit
10 written testimony via email within 72 hours of this
11 hearing. The email address is
12 testimony@council.nyc.gov. Again, audio and video
13 recordings or attachments will not be accepted,
14 strictly text, please. Okay. First panel we have
15 Piyali Basak, Arisleyda Skinner, Jane Fox, Jesse
16 Stephen, and Juval Scott. Jane, you want to start?

17 JANE FOX: That working? Okay. Thank
18 you. Good afternoon. My name is Jane Fox. I'm the
19 Chair of the Legal Aid Society Attorney's Union. I
20 represent 1,100 attorneys out of the 3,400 legal
21 service workers at the Association of Legal Advocates
22 and Attorneys. We are UAW Local 2325, and I'm here
23 to talk about the contract campaign that is happening
24 right now at the Legal Aid Society. We've been
25 bargaining with the Legal Aid Society's management

2 since March and have yet to receive any economic
3 offers from them. In fact, we found out this morning
4 that earlier this week they told our sister
5 investigators unit that they will not have an
6 economic offer until June 24th. Our contract expires
7 in 32 days on June 30th. Today, our members are
8 walking on practice pickets across four boroughs, and
9 this afternoon we return to the bargaining table for
10 more negotiations. And while we are committed to
11 bargaining in good faith with our employers, and
12 while we do not want to strike, we are prepared to
13 withhold our labor to win better wages for the long-
14 term, and we do not intend to work on an expired
15 contract. In March, I testified about the attrition
16 crisis that is decimating our ranks. Our wages have
17 not kept pace. In fact, the salaries of New York City
18 public defenders rank dead last among defenders in 14
19 major cities when adjusted for cost of living. We
20 make a sliver of what our union siblings at the
21 Federal Defenders make. We do not have a defined
22 benefit pension, and we are not in the state
23 retirement system. And we are now also facing an
24 attack on federal student loan relief programs that
25 threaten to burn up our salary gains and destroy

hiring and retention and legal services for decades to come. Budgets are value statements. Our clients, working-class New Yorkers, deserve the absolute best legal representation. They do not deserve less than any rich person in this city. And if you'll permit me, just to finish. When you devalue us, you devalue the people we serve, and if you continue underfunding us, we will see the attrition crisis speed up. Your constituents will be increasingly represented by less and less experienced attorneys with higher caseloads. They will not get justice and that is not an acceptable outcome to us, and it shouldn't be acceptable to you. By our employer's estimate this council needs to increase funding to the Legal Aid Society by at least \$74 million to make sure our demands at the bargaining table are met. And specifically, at Legal Aid we are one union and our members are in the same salary scale regardless of which court they practice in or which contract they are paid on. Public safety is more than just public defense, and that's why it's essential the City allocate commensurate increases in the Adopted Budget to housing and immigration contracts so our employer can meet our core economic demands to retain

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 187

2 experienced staff with increased salaries and provide
3 a dignified path to retirement. The money our
4 communities need for experienced attorneys and robust
5 public defense is a fraction compared to what this
6 council and this city spends on law enforcement, \$250
7 million-- \$205 million in 2024 for NYPD settlements,
8 and as you heard earlier, an estimated \$1.1 billion
9 in NYPD overtime. The funding we need is well within
10 your reach. You have the power to value your own
11 communities by investing in us. If negotiations do
12 not improve in the next month, we are prepared to
13 withhold our labor and interrupt essential city
14 services to win a fair contract. We are fighting for
15 us and for the working-class New Yorkers who deserve
16 nothing less than the best. Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you very
18 much.

19 ARISLEYDA ESTRELLA-SKINNER: Hi, good
20 afternoon. My name is Arisleyda Estrella-Skinner. I
21 am the 911 Operators from NYPD's Local Presidents. I
22 am here again to testify that we are in a New York
23 City crisis with the 911 operators. We are
24 currently, as stated this afternoon, at a headcount
25 of 1,210 members of vacancy of budgeted, allegedly,

2 of 1,412. Sir, we don't have enough operators to
3 answer the crisis of New York City. We don't have
4 enough operators to dispatch New York City officers,
5 EMS or FDNY into any locations of any-- of New York
6 City. The 911 operators are currently working 16-
7 hour tours five days a week. Some are working four
8 days a week, 16-hour tours. Operators handle about a
9 10 million calls a year. We don't have enough--
10 we're losing 60 to 80 operators every few months. It
11 takes us three months to hire operators and to train
12 them. We're losing operators sooner than we are
13 actually hiring them. Again, New York City's about to
14 go into a crisis. We do not have operators to answer
15 your calls, of emergency calls, and that's how simple
16 I'm going to keep this testimony. Thank you.

17 JESSE STEPHEN: This is not about the
18 NYPD, it's more the FDNY, but we were told to come
19 down here and speak today.

20 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Speaking on?

21 JESSE STEPHEN: FDNY EMS.

22 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, sure.

23 JESSE STEPHEN: Yeah? Okay.

24 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yeah.
25

2 JESSE STEPHEN: So, I just want to start
3 off by saying I represent the FDNY or Local 2507.
4 The people of New York City they're suffering because
5 EMS and-- EMS has been suffering for a long time,
6 because you know, they have a very high attrition
7 rate. We take a very long time to respond to jobs.
8 You know, New York City is failing us and the
9 residents of the City. We don't save property. We
10 don't stop crime. We save lives. It's an important
11 job, and in order to do the job effectively, we need
12 more ambulances and personnel. We are not responding
13 to jobs sometimes because of the growing population,
14 bike lanes, increased traffic, and a high turnover
15 rate of personnel. We constantly pump out new
16 academy classes with new EMTs that are gaining
17 experience. They learn the streets and perfect their
18 patient care which takes years. What typically
19 happens, once they perfect their craft, they end up
20 leaving for better jobs and opportunities will they
21 will make better wages and better work conditions. I
22 am asking City Council to place the \$50 million back
23 in the budget, as well as the \$1 million for mental
24 health for a stronger workforce that will benefit the
25 people of New York City.

2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you. I
3 agree. There should be no second-class first
4 responders in this city, and we--

5 JESSE STEPHEN: [interposing] I--

6 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: The Speaker,
7 certainly and the Council believes that the City, the
8 Mayor, should give EMS workers pay parity with other
9 first responders, so we're with you. Thank you.

10 JESSE STEPHEN: Yes, thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Can I just add that
12 I'd like my comments to be associated with the
13 Chair's comments in regards to all of the testimony
14 so far.

15 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you all very
16 much. Okay, our next panel we have Lisa
17 Schreibersdorf, Juval Scott, Piyali Basak.

18 LISA SCHREIBERSDORF: Should we start?

19 Hi. I'm Lisa Schreibersdorf. I'm the Executive
20 Director of Brooklyn Defender Services. We are
21 representing all the public defenders in New York
22 City, some of whom are here and some of who could not
23 make it. We did want to take this opportunity to
24 talk a little more about our overall budget for the
25 city for our work. I know you asked some questions

2 during the MOCJ portion. So, you're aware that after
3 our testimony at the preliminary we have done a lot
4 of advocacy to get more money from the Mayor's
5 Office, and we're really glad to hear that they did
6 allocate 20 more million dollars. So, I just wanted
7 to clarify there are some concerns with the way that
8 that money needs to be spent, but I feel like we
9 probably could work that out. But I just wanted to
10 make sure that-- excuse me-- I just walked in. I
11 just wanted to make sure that the City Council is
12 aware that our ask that we really feel we need is
13 probably another \$100 million or close to that. And
14 the reason is that we've been saying for many, many
15 years that we need to match salaries of our staff to
16 other cities that are equivalent to New York such as
17 LA and even some counties upstate where people are
18 being paid quite a bit more money, that they can live
19 in their, you know, home locations and do their work
20 in the places where they're serving people, and we're
21 unable to do that at this point. And in order to
22 meet those salaries, what is currently about an
23 \$85,000 starting salary all of our offices. You
24 know, they're all a little different, but roughly.
25 Really needs to be bumped up to about \$100,000,

2 because students are coming out of law school. They
3 have these large student debts. The housing market
4 in New York is prohibitive, and we are losing people.
5 We are losing a lot of people. It is harder and
6 harder to retain people, especially at around the
7 third year. So, we've done some computation. Again,
8 we can't be totally sure what it would cost, but we
9 really believe that somewhere between-- I would say
10 about \$100 million more than the \$20 that they gave
11 us. So, we'll make very, very good use of this, but
12 we really are asking Finance and City Council in
13 general to really try to negotiate for a little more
14 money into our budget, you know, for the coming year.
15 But one of the issues where I think it's an important
16 pieces, we're in an extension year where we've had a
17 contract for six years, and alright, it's good to
18 have this little bit of extra money, but-- and I
19 don't want to poo-poo \$20 million. It sounds like a
20 lot, but it's-- you know, it's not a huge amount for
21 us. But we're worried that when we go into the RFP
22 year, that if it's really, really underfunded, it's
23 very hard to do proposals and to expect the City to
24 properly fund that project, you know, after the RFP
25 comes in. So, it is very important in this coming

2 year for our baseline to go up a bit, and maybe even
3 in the following year. So, we appreciate your
4 attention and time and consideration. Thank you.

5 JUVAL SCOTT: Hi, good afternoon, and
6 thank you for making time for [inaudible]. Can you
7 hear me now? Thank you. Good afternoon and thank
8 you for making time for this panel. My name is Juval
9 Scott and I have the privilege of leading the Bronx
10 Defenders which, as I'm sure you know, is located in
11 the poorest congressional district in the country.
12 Our office employs holistic model and there have been
13 studies that demonstrate that the use of our model
14 has been proven to lower rates of mass incarceration
15 through shortened sentences, reduced incarceration
16 rates, and reduced pre-trial detention. As studies
17 show that our work has saved New Yorkers \$165 million
18 over 10 years and more since then. And we did that
19 without harming public safety. And that says nothing
20 of the cascading social and economic benefits of
21 keeping people out of jails, in their homes, and with
22 their families and employed. At the Bronx Defenders
23 we're fortunate to attract some of this country's top
24 talent to serve the 20,000 people per year who rely
25 on our services, and they've committed their talent

2 to public service in one of the most expensive cities
3 in the country. Being a public defender, especially
4 in this moment, it can be grueling. The caseloads
5 rarely ease up. The hours can be long. The
6 emotional weight can be heavy, and these are in
7 combination with the soaring cost of living in the
8 New York City area. For many who would love to
9 choose a path of public defense or have a long career
10 in public defense, the pay is a barrier. Our clients
11 need my people focused on the people we served, and
12 not on whether they can afford increased rents,
13 increased food costs, and transportation, because our
14 pay remains historically low and fails to keep pace
15 with the rate of inflation. Public defender talents
16 should be properly valued and compensated, and public
17 defender offices can only do that if the City
18 increases its funding for public defender personnel.
19 Doing so would demonstrate a true commitment and
20 appreciation for the constitutionally-mandated
21 services we provide on behalf of some of the most
22 vulnerable New Yorkers. In March we were here and we
23 asked the City to increase our personnel funding by
24 25 percent. We make that same request today, because

2 a commitment to public defense commands more. Thank
3 you.

4 PIYALI BASAK: So, I'm going to be
5 slightly redundant and also personal. My name is
6 Piyali Basak. I'm the Managing Director for the
7 Neighborhood Defender Services of Harlem. Again, I
8 want to echo what everyone said. Really appreciate,
9 you know, the Council had fought for funding,
10 increased funding, that has made a difference, but I
11 think I want to echo what Lisa said, that we do need
12 more. And the personal piece is I'm new to this
13 role. I became a Managing Director because I could
14 not afford to just be a public defender. I supported
15 my family on my salary. We almost lost our home,
16 because we just could not support a family on a
17 public defender salary. I'd rather be in a court
18 room than here today, I really would. It is a
19 privilege to be here before all of you, but you know,
20 our public defenders, they are working because they
21 are committed to the work, but the City needs-- we
22 need support from the City to properly fund their
23 work and honor their commitment. So, and you know,
24 I-- we have shared time and time again. You know, we
25 have staff who are single parents who are supporting

their families. It takes one crisis to completely throw off the delicate balance that public defenders maintain for any sort of stability. So, again, we know that you are our allies and friends in this fight, and we just ask that you continue to fight for more funding. I'm going to completely pivot now to policy. You know, last time we were here, Council Member Salaam, you had asked us about discovery. You know, we have-- you know, I think that we are concerned. We hope that the Council continue maintaining the fair and transparent discovery laws that we have fought for, and you know, there are concerns that there might be potential pushback to roll back discovery in the City, and we just ask for the Council's continued commitment to ensure that the process remains fair. And that is somewhat a little bit related to what else I'm going to talk about, and I know this is a budget hearing, but I think this is important issue to raise, and that is the issue of DATs. And the reason I'm raising this is because this is actually related to discovery reform, and you know, a lot of conversations about discovery reform-- DAT reform occurred at the time-- which was that the NYPD is required to issue DATs now for certain

2 offenses. They're everything from public urination
3 to just sitting, taking up space in the subway, and
4 yet what we are finding across all the boroughs-- in
5 some boroughs more than others, and I don't have
6 statistics for you today, but we are working on that--
7 - is that DATs are not being given for those
8 offenses, and instead people are being arrested and
9 being brought to arraignment. And you know, this was
10 again, something that we fought hard for, because
11 this is an issue that disproportionately affects
12 Black and Brown New Yorkers, and it is
13 disproportionately affecting the most poorest of New
14 Yorkers, given the level of offenses. And so we
15 wanted to flag this issue for the Council, more just
16 to flag this issue. It's an issue we are paying
17 attention to, and I think the Council should also be
18 paying attention to this issue. And we will continue
19 raising-- again, I apologize. I don't have the
20 statistics. We are going to be working on that, and
21 we will be coming back to you all with information
22 for that. Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you all very
24 much. Council Member Brewer?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you. I'm
3 sure you'll save-- share that with us when you get
4 the statistics, but are you also having a breakdown?
5 Nobody can ask somebody whether they are documented
6 or undocumented, at least for city agencies which is
7 a good thing. But I am very nervous about
8 individuals who don't have documentation, because I
9 worry about ICE. So, I'm just wondering if that is
10 also an issue that comes across your desk. Like, I'm
11 just-- that's my issue.

12 LISA SCHREIBERSDORF: So, we find the
13 increase in using-- not issuing DATs when they should
14 is across the board, but the impact on--

15 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: [interposing] Turn
16 your mic on.

17 LISA SCHREIBERSDORF: Oh, I'm sorry. It
18 seems to be pretty much across the board that they've
19 reduced the use of DATs beyond like what's even
20 legally required, but there does seem to be a much
21 more disproportionate impact, as you're right to
22 notice, for people who not only are undocumented, but
23 even people who just happen to be immigrants. And
24 we've been in situations where once that person is in
25 jail and they're in their process from arrest to

2 arraignment, they've contacted other counties who are
3 already cooperating with ICE and maybe finding
4 warrants or what they call ICards [sic] which is sort
5 of a wanted thing, and like, they've had them come
6 and pick people up right from arraignments. So, I do
7 believe it is a tactic in some ways to try to round
8 some people up that they couldn't otherwise. But I
9 also-- I think it's also impacting people who are not
10 in that status at all, and you know, not only is it
11 horrible for people, it slows down the system and it
12 impacts every single person who's in jail. The times
13 go up when you have too many people in that system,
14 and it also impacts our own staff. You know, I don't
15 want to be totally, you know, self-focused at the
16 moment, but it is very different to represent
17 somebody's in jail versus somebody who is not in
18 jail, and it just contributes to the kind of work
19 that our staff will always step up to do, but that,
20 you know, is difficult, you know, for us to
21 continually fund with our current resources. Thank
22 you.

23 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you very
24 much. Okay, our next panel we have Ruth Lowenkron,
25 Kevin Mestrich, Maya Kremen, Michael Greco, Megan

2 French-Marcelin, and Hailey Nalasco. Just give us
3 one second. Okay. Mike, you want to start?

4 MICHAEL GRECO: How you doing? Good
5 afternoon, everybody. Thank you for letting us
6 speak. My name is Michael Greco. I'm the Vice
7 President of Local 2507. We represent the FDNY, EMTs,
8 paramedics, and fire inspectors. The reason for me
9 coming today was, first of all, to thank you and
10 address the recommendation of the \$50 million in the
11 budget. I've been coming up. My President has been
12 coming up for the past nine years speaking of the
13 inequities that are going on in EMS, and a month
14 before COVID started back in March of 2020, I stood
15 in front of this Council and stated that if the call
16 volume hit 6,000 calls a day, that EMS would be
17 decimated. Sure enough it proved to be correct. We
18 had to call in the National Ambulance Service, and we
19 also are what COVID brought when the City gets hit
20 with so many medical calls. We're now at that level
21 now, and it seems the Mayor or somebody is not
22 listening to the screams going on. We're in contract
23 negotiations. We're getting nowhere. The fight for
24 pay parity is real, and the suggestion of the influx
25 of money that the Council has suggested would not

2 only help, but I think they're not looking at the
3 savings that it would bring. We're hiring 600 people
4 a year, and we're losing about 550. So, we're
5 probably the only agency over the past 10 years who
6 has hired 150 percent of their budgeted headcount.
7 Simple math, it's cost about \$10,000 to train one EMT
8 if you just look at the uniforms and if you just look
9 at the books. That's not including salaries. That's
10 600 a year. You're looking at millions and millions
11 of dollars that's being wasted on training. The
12 response times are shooting through the roof, and we
13 thank the City Council, but we ask for even more. We
14 need the pressure. Our service is losing members
15 left and right. Our training is atrocious when it
16 comes to-- after they get out into the field, there's
17 no secondary training that comes on. So, I once
18 again am here to make the call to you guys. I thank
19 you, Justin. I know you've been a big advocate of
20 us, but I'm re-energizing the call to help save FDNY
21 EMS. Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: I'm not sure how
23 much you're allowed to divulge, but is OLR still
24 refusing to recognize EMS as a uniformed service?

2 MICHAEL GRECO: That is correct. It was
3 one of our major demands, and they will not offer us
4 the uniform coalition pattern, and they will not move
5 above what the opening offer was day one of the
6 contract.

7 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: And when the Mayor
8 was running for office, didn't he promise to get this
9 done?

10 MICHAEL GRECO: Day one. It's now been
11 over 1,200 days.

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you.

13 MICHAEL GRECO: Thank you.

14 HAILEY NOLASCO: Hello. Good afternoon,
15 Chair Salaam, Brannan, and Council Member Brewer. My
16 name is Hailey Nolasco and I'm the Senior Director of
17 Government Relations at the Center for Justice
18 Innovation. Thank you so much for the opportunity to
19 testify today. True safety requires sustained
20 investment in community-driven solutions focused on
21 prevention and fair intervention that do not solely
22 rely on law enforcement. We thank the Council and
23 the administration for their ongoing support and for
24 the restoration of funding for Project Reset, its
25 early intervention for low-level non-violent

2 offenses. We thank you. However, recent federal
3 funding cuts have impacted us and continue to
4 threaten critical services, particularly those that
5 prevent violence and provide healing and
6 accountability in the communities we need the most--
7 that need them the most. We're already feeling the
8 impact in some programs like our Community Violence
9 Intervention and Community Neighborhood Safety
10 Initiative work. Today, I want to highlight a few
11 examples in need of continued support. In the south
12 Bronx, we are seeking funding to develop a fully-
13 operational Bronx Community Justice Center where we
14 continue to encounter unfunded opportunities to
15 address community safety needs in the Bronx. Other
16 programs such as our Arise Project, as well as the
17 Staten Island and Queens Community Justice Centers,
18 offer essential gender-based services to respond to
19 domestic violence and its intersection with gun
20 violence and also provide alternatives to
21 incarceration. We urge the Council to continue
22 investing in programs such as these to ensure that
23 service gaps do not disrupt any community-based
24 organization's vital supports to co-produce public
25 safety across our great city. Thank you so much.

2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you. Just
3 turn your mic on. Thank you.

4 YARELIS LEONARDO: Good afternoon and
5 thank you for the opportunity to testify today. My
6 name is Yarelis Leonardo, Manager of Reentry Services
7 at Getting Out, Staying Out, a reentry and anti-
8 violence program that has served more than 15,000
9 people over two decades. At GOSO we work directly
10 with 16 to 24-year-old young people who are
11 incarcerated in Rikers Island, juvenile facilities,
12 people in the community who have been directly
13 impacted by the criminal justice system, and those
14 who are at-risk. I focus on developing strategies
15 that empower them to reintegrate successfully,
16 overcome barriers, and ultimately build a future free
17 of incarceration, and that's why everyone at GOSO is
18 very grateful for the City Council and the City
19 support that allows us to do critical anti-violence
20 work for participants citywide. GOSO's Cure Violence
21 Intervention, community-based education, mental
22 health, job readiness, and paid internship programs
23 have reduced violence and led to better outcomes for
24 the people we serve. While gun violence is still a
25 serious problem in our community, we are proud to say

2 that the area in east Harlem that we serve has seen
3 gun violence drop to the lowest level since 2019. In
4 GOSO's Community Program, 93 percent of the young
5 people we serve do not return to jail. GOSO
6 responded to increased needs from court-involved and
7 formerly incarcerated youth for treatment of anxiety,
8 depression, and PTSD by opening an in-house mental
9 health clinic in partnership with the Child Center
10 that provides robust services, including psychiatric
11 care. We created new literacy and STEM programs and
12 a third of our STEM participants will start college
13 this year. We rely on city and state, federal
14 funding, as well as foundation and private grants,
15 and we-- and we're able to expand programming in part
16 because of a federal Department of Justice Community
17 Violence Intervention and Prevention Initiative
18 multi-year grant in 2022. However, this April, we
19 unfortunately received news that our ongoing grant
20 for the DOJ has been rescinded and we lost almost
21 \$250,000 that has already been budgeted for this
22 fiscal year anti-violence and core community program.
23 We are not the only organization impacted by DOJ cut.
24 Anti-violence program around our city lost millions
25 of dollars in funding. While we ensure that our

2 program continues, they will be impacted and will
3 need to rely on city funding more than ever to ensure
4 that all participants who need services can get them.
5 Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you.

7 RUTH LOWENKRON: Good afternoon. Ruth
8 Lowenkron. I'm the Director of the Disability Justice
9 Program at New York Lawyers for the Public Interest,
10 and I'm also a member of Correct Crisis Intervention
11 Today New York City which has as its sole mission
12 transforming the way New York City responds to mental
13 health crises, and that's what I'm going to talk
14 about today. I'm going to show you in a visual the
15 problem. I've also handed this out to you. It is
16 very, very stunning, bleak information. These are 21
17 individuals who've been killed at the hands of the
18 police when the police responded to a mental health
19 crisis. This is not pointing a finger at the police,
20 but there is something radically wrong when 21 people
21 end up dead. Police are not the right people to
22 respond to a mental health crisis. You wouldn't send
23 them to respond to a heart attack or not to send them
24 to respond to a mental health crisis. And we luckily
25 here in New York have-- and by the way it's not at

2 all limited to deaths. We have serious injuries. We
3 have people who are arrested and involved in the
4 criminal legal system who otherwise wouldn't be. We
5 have people who are committed to hospitals over
6 objection who otherwise wouldn't be. So we need to
7 transform this. Yes, there is an attempt to do
8 something about it by the City to remove police
9 wherever possible. But in fact, that program is
10 lacking in many, many ways. It's the B-HEARD
11 program. You may have seen the report that just came
12 out from the New York City Comptroller's Office
13 condemning the program greatly. I will just say it
14 has hope if it can be revised in the ways that I'm
15 setting forth in my written testimony that I'm
16 providing to you. I'll just say two more quick
17 things, please. What's critical is that B-HEARD be
18 available 24/7. It's only open 16 hours a day. How
19 can you respond to crises in that short amount of
20 time? And it is also-- does not include peers,
21 individuals with mental health crisis lived
22 experience, and we are saying are the best people,
23 and the literature will tell you the best people when
24 trained to do that work, and that's what we're
25 pushing right now for the City Council to add peers

2 to that. And there's a budget line of \$4.5 million
3 to in fact add peers to programs. Generally, we want
4 to make sure that that \$4.5 million is just the
5 beginning of adding peers, individuals with lived
6 mental health experience, to the B-HEARD program and
7 also following our other recommendations for
8 revitalizing the B-HEARD program which is greatly in
9 need of it, but certainly for eliminating the police
10 in all but the rarest of circumstances. Thank you.

11 MEGAN FRENCH-MARCELIN: Good afternoon.
12 Thank you so much. My name is Megan French-Marcelin.
13 I am testifying on behalf of the New York City
14 Alternatives to Incarceration and Reentry Coalition.
15 And I came here today from Fortune's Castle, which
16 hopefully many of you have visited, where we met with
17 16 of New York State's Parole Commissioners, and they
18 said that as they're making determinations about
19 parole, they look at one thing: are people connected
20 to our services. Because they know if they are, that
21 they will be successful and thriving in community.
22 We are public safety. We're effective public safety.
23 We're proven public safety, and we're evidence-based.
24 We provide housing, employment, job training,
25 substance use treatment, mental health treatment-- a

2 lot of my colleagues are on this panel. And our ask
3 is additional \$2.4 million to do this work. Now, I
4 want to put that into a bigger picture. \$2.4 million
5 is 10 percent of what the DOC allocates for overtime
6 every single month. \$2.4 million in additional
7 resources allows these programs to thrive, and I'm
8 just going to give a couple examples of our
9 statistics. 97 percent of Bronx Connect youth do not
10 have another conviction three years later. Osborne's
11 Court Mitigation program saved the City \$162 million
12 in incarceration costs last year, and CASES FACT team
13 which works with serious mental illness through an
14 ATI program has 100 percent non-recidivism rate.
15 Now, that is far more effective public safety than
16 Rikers and any other program that the City has. So,
17 we look forward to working with you to expand these
18 services. Thank you so much.

19 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you. Anyone
20 left to testify? Okay, thank you all very much.
21 Thank you. Okay, our next panel is William Metting
22 [sic], Carolyn Lewis, Reem Ramadan, Hana Jang, Maryam
23 Khaldi, and Daphne Thammasila. You can begin when
24 you're ready. Thank you.

2 WILLIAM MEDINA: Thank you. Thank you,
3 Chairs, for the opportunity to speak today. My name
4 is William Medina. I'm a proud leader of the Los
5 Deliveristas Unidos, an organizer with the Workers
6 Justice Project, but more than that, I'm a delivery
7 worker. I'm someone who rides through the City every
8 day to earn a living to provide for my family to
9 survive. I'm here today not just as advocate, but as
10 someone who is living this reality. I'm speaking to
11 you with outrage, frustration, and heartbreak.
12 During the pandemic people called us heroes. They
13 clap for us, thank us for keeping the City running,
14 but now under New York City new policy, it feels like
15 we've gone from being heroes to being treated like
16 criminals. This new New York PD policy is targeting
17 delivery worker like me. Just first two weeks, more
18 than a thousand criminal summonses were handed out to
19 cyclists, most of them delivery workers. That means
20 if I'm on my bike, I run through a red light maybe
21 because I'm rushing to meet delivery time the app is
22 pressuring me to meet, I could given a criminal court
23 summons. Think about that. A criminal summons for a
24 traffic violation that put us into the criminal
25 justice system, many of us for the first time. No

2 lawyer, no support, just fear. Some workers are
3 scared, not even show up in court because of possible
4 contact with ICE. Others show up and are told
5 because administrative errors they have to come back
6 another day, losing work, losing income, and adding
7 more strife [sic] to our already difficult lives.
8 And what's worse, these summonses can trigger
9 background checks by the apps, causing worker to be
10 deactivated just like that. Our only source of
11 income is gone. What's happening is not about
12 keeping the streets safer. If it were, car driver
13 will be treated the same way, but they're not. These
14 policy target bike riders, us, and that
15 discrimination is unjust that we make a mistake where
16 criminalized like cars who are more dangerous don't
17 face the same consequences. I'm asking the New York
18 City to stand with us with decriminalization [sic].
19 We need real solution. We urge you to. You're the
20 end of New York PD criminal summons policy targeting
21 cyclists. Invest in safe bike infrastructure and
22 strong labor protection for deliverista. Hold up
23 delivery companies accountable for the unsafe
24 conditions they create. Thank you for listening.

2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you. Go
3 ahead.

4 CAROLYN LEWIS: Can you hear me? Okay. I
5 can hear. Good afternoon. My name is Carolyn Lewis.
6 I am the Vice President of Tribal and Law Enforcement
7 Affairs for the National Child ID program. I'm
8 coming to you because we have a critical and a
9 serious case going on throughout the country. I'm
10 sorry. Thank you. The-- you know, we have a
11 thousand kids that go missing every day, every single
12 day, and we don't have-- you know, if not being
13 talked about, it's not being addressed. So, if I
14 may, I provided a Child ID kit. The National Child
15 ID program started in 1997 when Amber Hagerman went
16 missing, thus where the Amber Alert came from. With
17 the help of our NFL partners, Hall of Fame, they
18 started this program down in Texas giving out over
19 25,000 kids. These kids do not go in a database.
20 They are not given to any authorities. These are
21 solely for family members to hold onto these kits in
22 the event that their loved ones go missing. And if I
23 may just take a minute just to read a couple of
24 things. So basically, this kit is a comprehensive
25 information. It allows you to do your own

2 fingerprints, has decentralized fingerprint in there.

3 It has a three cardstock that you could fill out for

4 yourself, your families, and you could look at it on

5 your own. What we're asking that-- we're asking for

6 your help to seek to raise a million dollars for a

7 manufacturing grant which would allow us with this--

8 excuse me-- would allow us to manufacture more kits

9 to be distributed here in New York. Now, if you ma--

10 let's say for argument sake, you give us a million

11 dollars, the National Child ID will match dollar for

12 dollar which would be \$2 million, which would be

13 650,000 kids that could be distributed throughout the

14 city, preferably to our students. We are focusing on

15 bringing this nationwide. It's actually global. I

16 personally have given out over 450,000 kits

17 nationally, and we look forward to continuing this.

18 I have given a letter with my personal information as

19 well as the Executive Director's information is on

20 there, and hopefully we can get a million dollars so

21 that we can take care of our kids, because basically

22 their safety is our fut-- their future is our safety,

23 and their safety is our duty. So, thank you for the

24 time.

2 DAPHNE THAMMASILA: Thank you, Chair
3 Brannan and Chair Salaam and to the Committees, for
4 holding this hearing and giving us the opportunity to
5 testify. My name is Daphne Thammasila. I'm the
6 Associate Director of Programs at the Asian American
7 Federation where we represent the collective voice of
8 more than 70 member nonprofits, serving 1.5 million
9 Asian New Yorkers. Since 2021, our organization has
10 played a critical role in keeping Asian New Yorkers
11 safe. As an anchor organization of the Partners
12 Against the Hate Forward initiative, also known as
13 the PATH program. I'm testifying today with a few of
14 the other PATH anchor organizations and one of our
15 sub anchors. In 2025, public safety for Asian New
16 Yorkers is under threat like never before.
17 Escalating anti-immigrant policies, ICE encroachment
18 on local authority, and ongoing anti-Asian hate have
19 created deep fear, especially in immigrant
20 communities. As an anchor organization we provide
21 culturally-competent language-accessible programming
22 and services that address hate violence in
23 conjunction with our sub anchors. Current services
24 are running well, as they have been for the past four
25 years, and making changes now while New Yorkers feel

2 heightened fear and anxiety about public safety would
3 get in the way of past success. Since the start of
4 the program we've trained over 2,500 community
5 members in safety techniques, provided over 990
6 community members with protective presence and
7 accompaniment services, and we've recruited over 400
8 volunteers to provide safety services in Asian-
9 majority neighborhoods. Despite its success, our
10 PATH funding was cut by \$30,000 per anchor for FY26.
11 We respectfully urge the Council to restore full
12 funding for PATH to the anchors and increase public
13 safety investment to meet community needs, and
14 increase funding for anti-violence and immigrant
15 safety programming like our Hope Against Hate
16 Campaign. At a time of continued hate, violence and
17 rising fear, this reduction in funding jeopardizes
18 vital programs and safety services, risk cutting off
19 access to healing and support for some of the City's
20 most vulnerable residents and contradicts the City
21 and the Council's stated commitments to safety,
22 equity and wellness for all New Yorkers. We've spent
23 many years building infrastructure to provide the
24 safety programming, and the challenges faced by our
25 community demand long-term investment in public

2 safety. Thank you for your support and the
3 opportunity to testify.

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you.

5 MARYAM KHALDI: Good afternoon. My name
6 Maryam Khaldi and I'm the Advocacy and Civic
7 Engagement Manager at the Arab-American Association
8 of New York. Since 2001, AAANY has fought against
9 the continued rise of hate crimes against our
10 communities, and in 2021 we joined the Partners
11 Against the Hate Forward initiative under the Office
12 of the Prevention of Hate Crimes. AAANY and our
13 grantees have led hundreds of self-defense trainings,
14 trained thousands of community members in bystander
15 intervention and de-escalation tactics, provided hate
16 crimes prevention workshops and resources to
17 thousands of New Yorkers, and advocated both on the
18 local and statewide level for legislation that
19 protects our communities from hate violence. One of
20 our grantees, Council on American Islamic Relations
21 New York, has been collecting data on hate crimes
22 against Palestinian, Arab, and Muslim New Yorkers,
23 many of which go unreported to the NYPD and city
24 offices. Since October 2023 they've received 290
25 reports of hate crimes or bias incidents against

2 community members on the basis of their identity as
3 Palestinian, Arab or Muslim, or for showing pro-
4 Palestine solidarity, including 134 from students in
5 the K to 12 and university levels. At AAANY we've
6 seen firsthand the scope and trauma of this hate
7 violence. We've worked with clients whose hijabs
8 were ripped off, mosques that were vandalized with
9 hateful words, and much more. Our organization has
10 also faced hate crimes including threats of physical
11 violence, and our staff has experienced harassment,
12 stalking and threats because of our identities and
13 the work that we do. The PATH program allowed us to
14 serve thousands of clients and provide supports to
15 hundreds of victims of hate. Despite the program's
16 success, each PATH anchor's funding was cut by
17 \$30,000 for FY26 by OPHC. At a time of hate, rising
18 fear, and with a federal administration spewing anti-
19 immigrant hate, our services are needed more than
20 ever. And so we ask the NYC Council to increase
21 investment in our safety work to meet the needs of
22 our communities that we serve and the funding be
23 restored for the PATH initiative. AAANY has been and
24 will continue to be on the front lines working to
25 combat hate violence, promote community safety, and

2 we hope that the New York City Council will continue
3 to support us in doing so. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you.

5 REEM RAMADAN: Peace all. Hello. Good
6 afternoon. My name's Reem. I'm the Director of
7 Community Organizing and Public Advocacy at the New
8 York City Anti-Violence Project, AVP. AVP is a
9 direct service and advocacy organization. We serve
10 LGBTQ survivors of violence. We have a 24/7
11 bilingual hotline where survivors can access our free
12 counseling and free legal services, and we also
13 engage members with community organizing and
14 leadership development trainings. We envision a
15 world where LGBTQ and HIV-affected people are safe
16 and live free from violence, and we are the only
17 LGBTQ-specific victim services agency in the City.
18 It was in this very city that the Stonewall uprising
19 happened in 1969 where LGBTQ people have had enough
20 and made it known that we deserve to have the same
21 level of safety as everyone else. While that sounds
22 like a distant time, it is unfortunate that the fight
23 must still go on. To this day, LGBTQ people
24 experience hate violence at a higher rate than our
25 straight and cisgender counterparts. And because

LGBTQ identity lives at the intersection, imagine the compounded violence that a person experiences if they are BIPOC, if they are immigrant, if they are houseless, and if they are formerly incarcerated.

Especially now, with the current federal administration, LGBTQ people are a target of harmful policies: the rollback of federal protection against discrimination in healthcare and education, targeting trans people and their access to gender-affirming care, and even legislation that bans LGBTQ-inclusive curricula in schools. If there's any respite in this, it's that we're in New York. That-- the very place that the Stonewall uprising started, and we must honor that legacy. We call on you, members of the City Council. Thank you for being here, for hearing us. And we call for your support. Let's make it known that New York City doesn't have a place for hate or harmful policies, and let us put those words into practice. As another anchor org of the PATH Forward initiative, we ask to increase the funding to ensure that the anchor orgs get their funding restored by the \$30K that was cut, and to increase the Hate Violence Prevention initiative to support the organizations working with the communities most

2 vulnerable to violence, and to reallocate funding
3 from law enforcement agencies to community-based
4 organizations that offer culturally-competent
5 services that speak their language and that offer
6 lifesaving services, and to invest in community
7 safety education, healthcare, and housing for all.
8 Thank you.

9 HANA JANG: Thank you to Chair Brannan
10 and Chair Salaam and the Committees on Public Safety
11 and Finance, for the opportunity to testify today.
12 My name is Hana Jang and I serve as a Community
13 Outreach Advocate for the Korean American Family
14 Service Center. For over 35 years, KAFSC has
15 supported immigrant survivors of gender-based
16 violence offering safety, healing and hope through
17 culturally and linguistically accessible services.
18 At KAFSC we see firsthand how domestic violence,
19 sexual violence, child abuse, and AAPI hate harms
20 physical and mental health in our community. Our
21 clients primarily Korean and other Asian immigrant
22 women often face violence, isolation, shame and fear
23 when seeking help. As a leader in seeking to end
24 violence of all kinds, KAFSC has joined the Partners
25 Against the Hate Forward initiative to keep New

2 Yorkers safe. I'm testifying today to both
3 acknowledge the current investment the City has made
4 in hate violence prevention and to also ask for
5 increased investment in public safety. The PATH
6 program has allowed us to create safety programming
7 responsive to community needs, respond quickly to
8 crises with wraparound case management in connections
9 to long-term mental health services, offer community
10 workshops to educate community members on how to keep
11 themselves safe during times of violence and more. We
12 provided hundreds of safety resources to community
13 members, engaged nearly 100 volunteers in trainings
14 and safety events, and conducted 15 in-person events
15 through this program. KAFSC respectfully urges the
16 City Council to invest in community-based
17 organizations that deliver culturally and
18 linguistically competent services for immigrant
19 families and to increase funding for initiatives that
20 directly support AAPI communities in broader
21 community safety. Specifically, we ask that you
22 invest in the Hate Crime Prevention initiative which
23 supports community-led efforts to address trauma and
24 biased-fueled violence and restore full funding for
25 PATH, sustain and expand funding for the Immigrant

2 Mental Health Initiative to help reduce stigma and
3 promote access to care in immigrant communities,
4 continue supporting the AAPI Community Support Fund
5 that has been critical to reaching survivors who are
6 often overlooked, strengthen the mental health
7 services for vulnerable populations initiative with a
8 focus on culturally-grounded service models. At
9 KAFSC we are committed to ensuring that every
10 survivor of violence can access mental healthcare and
11 services that speak their language, understand their
12 culture and honor their resilience. We urge you to
13 stand with us to help build a city that truly
14 includes and supports all New Yorkers. Thank you for
15 your leadership and the opportunity to testify today.

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you all very
17 much. Thanks for all you do. Thank you. Okay, our
18 next panel is Richard William Flores, Ligia Guallpa,
19 Constance Lesold, Christopher Leon Johnson, and Y
20 Jennings [sp?]. Constance, you want to go first? Or
21 actually, pass the mic-- pass the mic to your left.
22 You can go-- yeah, let's go-- let's go right to left.

23 Y JENNINGS: Hello. I spoke here in
24 February and I spoke here in April, Stalk [sic]
25 Initiative. Let's not have to call 311 because the

2 man above me has been electrocuting me. Gave me my
3 heart attack and today I'm now working on my third
4 one. 2:32 I called 311, K4207. I've been stalk
5 since May 11, 2006. I reached out to the wonder
6 Salaam, Chair Salaam, last year, reached out to many
7 wonderful people to no avail. I lost 19 years of my
8 life. If you dare to spend one day following me,
9 it's pretty scary. I don't go out anymore. The
10 wonderful Jessica Tisch that was here-- what's his
11 name, Matt Fraiser [sp?], the one here-- was it
12 Kinsella, K-i-n-s-e-l-l-a? yeah. All these
13 wonderful people get the same email. Wiles, W-i-l-e-
14 s, and Leavitt [sic] to the Whitehouse, Pam Bondi,
15 DOJ, Stacey Lynch [sp?], 15+ emails, the same email
16 about the stalking, taunting, harassing of me. Now,
17 19 years, two heart attacks, and the man above me--
18 how do you put it nicely? He's tried to kill me.
19 The vibrating electric underneath me. I have sore
20 ears now, very sore ears, and there's not a part of
21 my body that's not in pain, and I have a lump here. I
22 have a whole issue of things that went to the Mayor,
23 the Governor, but most of all that man who read 10
24 letters a day, Obama, who got a letter a day from me
25 for eight years-- to this day, 5,000+ letters have

2 gone to the Whitehouse, and every bus and train
3 camera-- I just sat here today, as you noticed did
4 not move as everyone crept around me. I had to behave
5 myself and allow it, because I can't do anything
6 about it. Ms. Jennings [sic]-- I've been asking y'all
7 for help from the days of-- what's his name, Raymond
8 Diaz, Bronx Borough President? Yeah, to now,
9 nothing. The wonderful Jessica Tisch.

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you very
11 much. Constance?

12 CONSTANCE LESOLD: My name is Constance
13 Lesold and I'm not officially representing anyone
14 today. But as you know from my prior testimony,
15 Chairman Brannan, I'm very involved with Senior
16 Citizen Centers, and I would have hoped to have with
17 me my partner at 966 Grace Haregood [sp?] Senior
18 Center of the Fort Green group, because we had begged
19 for help from the Department of Transportation in
20 regard to the e-bike and the bicycles and the
21 motorcycles and everything else issues. And we
22 didn't get any answer from the Department of
23 Transportation, but I do have to say that the
24 problems have somewhat, it would appear to this
25 pedestrian and others have improved over the last

year. So, I have to look at Jessica Tisch's testimony seriously. I am very sympathetic to the community that is faced with ICE threats and in some ways that includes all of us. I just got a request last night to help a church in Newberg, New York where ICE went into a service without notice and took out six people. That church is hoping to organize churches. I just say this because I am very involved with a lot of issues around ICE, and I am sympathetic, but I am not sympathetic to the idea that documented or undocumented workers have the right to go through a red light and endanger the lives of the pedestrians. No, everybody has to go by the laws, and if it-- and if there is no consequences when they don't, we don't get any improvement. I just have to say that the fare evasion issue, the Transit Authority is charging too much for the City, and whatever you can do on these issues within the budgetary way, do it. And with the Franklin Avenue Shuttle, please look at the issues of graffiti where the great artwork is being damaged by-- I am told by the police-- white trouble-makers, and they have faced no consequences. The Assembly person has taken the artwork down and--

2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: [interposing] Thank
3 you very much.

4 CONSTANCE LESOLD: Yeah, it's just that
5 they came right back again. So, the police are not--
6 they are not protecting our precious artwork at
7 Franklin and Fulton that we all worked so very hard
8 for. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you very
10 much. Ligia, go ahead.

11 LIGIA GUALLPA: Okay. Thank you. Thank
12 you so much, Chairs Yusef Salaam and Justin Brannan
13 for the opportunity to speak. My name is Ligia
14 Guallpa. I represent the Workers Justice Project and
15 Los Deliveristas Unidos, and today I'm here to call
16 out and condemn the NYPD recent policy that targets
17 cyclists, particularly delivery workers with criminal
18 summons for traffic violations. Let's absolutely be
19 clear. This policy is not about public safety. It's
20 about criminalizing immigrant workers, the people who
21 actually feed and keep every New Yorker safe. This
22 crackdown is not-- it's not just shameful. It's
23 outrageous and dangerous. It sends a clear message
24 that our city would rather punish working-class
25 people rather than holding accountable multi-billion-

2 dollar corporations like Uber, Door Dash, Grub Hub.

3 Companies that have created a system where workers

4 are forced to deliver faster, take more risks, and

5 put their own safety on the line in order to avoid

6 being de-activated or losing their income that they

7 have. Today, I heard NYPD Commissioner claim that

8 civil summons were not too harsh enough and that in

9 the name of public safety, criminalizing delivery

10 workers and cyclists is ultimately necessary. That's

11 outrageous and that's a lie. Let me be clear and let

12 me share with you, delivery workers have always been

13 a target of excessive traffic enforcement. This has

14 already cost thousands of dollars in civil summons to

15 delivery workers, hitting where it hurts the most,

16 their pockets, their family income. So, these

17 [inaudible]-- now turning this criminal summons--

18 this civil summons into criminal enforcement it's

19 painful. The idea that criminalizing on the name of

20 public safety, it's a complete lie, and here I am

21 asking to you for your support. We need to condemn

22 this type of policies and really address the root of

23 the core issues. What workers really need is

24 protected bike lanes, safe and accessible bike

25 parking, designated delivery zones so they don't have

2 to be blocking traffic, or being in the pedestrian
3 areas, battery swap charging stations, and a
4 community center approach that is not about
5 criminalizing, but educating, protecting workers from
6 the algorithm systems that are exploiting our own
7 people and hardworking New Yorkers. We look forward
8 to working with you, joining forces, to calling out
9 to the end of these harmful policies and building
10 real solutions that is about caring for the people
11 that care for every New Yorker during the pandemic,
12 instead of treating them as criminals.

13 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you.

14 CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: I'll go.

15 Hello, Chairs Brannan, Chair Yusef Salaam. My name
16 is Christopher Leon Johnson and I'm here to support
17 the deliveristas. I'm here to support these two
18 nonprofits here. Shout out to the Street Vendor
19 Project who gave me this pin at the Small Business
20 Fair, and the Workers Justice Project give me this
21 pin at the fair, too. Alright so, I want to make
22 this clear that look, these policies that Tisch,
23 Jessic Tisch, has done on behalf of her mother is
24 really racist and discriminatory against these
25 deliveristas. What this does is put these guys and

2 gals in danger with immigration because a lot of
3 these guys don't have papers, and all it's going to
4 do is open them up to ICE, and I'm calling on the
5 City Council to make a statement with all the members
6 that really care about these deliveristas on this
7 situation to really condemn Jessica Tisch for what
8 she's doing on behalf of her mother. She's not doing
9 this on behalf of street safety, because if it was
10 for street safety, it'd be for everybody. But she's
11 doing this on behalf because her mother complained.
12 So, I'm calling on this City Council to really
13 condemn Jessica Tisch for doing this to these
14 deliveristas. I am calling on the City Council to
15 find a way to demolish that newsstand right outside
16 City Hall and install that deliverista hub on behalf
17 of the Worker Justice Project. Why you guys not
18 doing this yet for? I don't get what's going on
19 here. At the same time, I'm calling on the City
20 Council to make sure that the Worker Justice Project
21 and the Street Vendor Project still keep their
22 funding at the FY26 cycle, because there's a lot of
23 internal stuff that's going on and I believe they
24 should still keep their funding for what they do for
25 the City of New York. And another thing is that

tomorrow at six o'clock at Union Square, there's going to be a critical mass bike ride down from Union Square to City Hall, and I hope that you, Mr. Justin Brannan show up or send one of your staff members to show up and show your solidarity to the deliveristas that are getting harassed by the NYPD. And one more thing is that we need to abolish Cop City for the FY27 cycle. We need to find a way to abolish Cop City because the deliveristas and the street vendors are being-- are going to be harassed more with the help of the NYPD. And another thing is that we have to stand with our deliveristas. We have to stand with all the deliveristas in the City. They shouldn't be discriminated because they're riding a bike down the street. They're essential workers. I know-- I know [inaudible]. They're essential workers. They deliver pills, they deliver medicine. I have family that's sick and I don't want anybody even my worst enemy to not be able to get medicine because the deliverista get arrested because they don't-- someone don't know the language barrier or the-- and some might resist, and they might be the-- oh, why I can't get my pills, because the person that

2 deliver my pills got arrested by the NYPD. So, thank
3 you so much. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you. Sir, go
5 ahead.

6 UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you for giving me
7 the opportunity to testify to the City Council,
8 especially to Council Member Justin Brannan who has
9 been present at the last three testimonials that I've
10 made here in the month of May. Commissioner Tisch
11 and the NYPD testimonials today, while explaining all
12 of the efforts to combat reductions in crime, I don't
13 feel are being assessed accurately by this Council or
14 by the NYPD or other municipal agencies, including
15 the Department of Inspection, Internal Affairs
16 Bureau, Department of Homeless Services, Department
17 of Social Services, HRA, Health + Hospitals, and even
18 the Social Security Administration and other federal
19 agencies including the DOJ, FBI, and CIA. In the
20 month of May alone, I have been targeted as a victim
21 of crime experiencing both physical and sexual
22 assaults on the streets of New York with no official
23 resolution by the NYPD or other agencies, namely the
24 DOI and the IAB, or even agencies like CCRB. These
25 assaults were particularly violent on one occasion,

2 as I mentioned just the other day. A young college-
3 aged person kicked a MTA glass partition glass
4 repeatedly with the objective of shattering it, which
5 I believe is a form of biochemical terrorism. As far
6 as the safest Memorial Day in terms of zero
7 shootings, a criminal doesn't need a gun to kill
8 someone. I was physically assaulted in broad daylight
9 at 17 State Street outside of a building where I used
10 to be employed. Again, as I mention, as a CCR agent
11 for a company called Shareholder Communications from
12 1995, 1998, and 2001 where I witnessed the attacks at
13 the World Trade Center on 9/11. I reported this
14 assault from Memorial Day to the first precinct. I
15 was told by an officer who did not-- and they did not
16 officially take the incident report. I was told and
17 asked by the officer at the first precinct whether I
18 called 911 after the incident. I believe this is
19 ridiculous and absurd. The budget hearing is on what
20 the NYPD policies are doing to combat crime in NYC,
21 and specifically, Commissioner Tisch, the NYPD and
22 their affiliates should go over and beyond this
23 meeting to have a sincere and factual account of what
24 measures are being taken to ensure safety of law
25 abiding American--

2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: [interposing] Thank
3 you.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: citizens. Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you very
6 much. Okay, our next panel. Thank you all. We have
7 Adrianna Rivera and David Cook.

8 ADRIANNA RIVERA: Thank you, City
9 Council, for having us speak today. My name is
10 Lieutenant Adrianna Rivera. I'm an EMT and Training
11 Officer. I also work for an organization called
12 Emergency Medical Service Public Advocacy Council,
13 EMS PAC, that strives for the idea of pay parity and
14 proper mental health supports for EMTs. I'm also the
15 mother of a 10-year-old EMT Junior who I'm very proud
16 of. I am the Chief of the EMS PAC's Peer Mentor
17 Support Hardship Help Division, open to all members
18 of service whether private or volunteer alike. I come
19 here today to speak on behalf of EMS workers in the
20 service. Over the last few years, emergency call
21 volume has increased tremendously. EMTs are expected
22 to perform at their very best every second of their
23 shift. These individuals are exposed to what the
24 worst of what the City has to offer, but are the best
25 people in our city. They deal with mass casualty

2 incidents, severe domestic violence situations, child
3 abuse, miscarriages, gun shots, and stab victims,
4 grandparents dead on arrival. Overdoses are
5 expected. Murder and suicides are typical. Dead
6 baby today, rape victim tomorrow, this is their norm.
7 I apologize if this sounds blunt to you, but I only
8 describe what it takes to be an emergency medical
9 service worker out in the field. They arrive to the
10 same calls that police do without proper safety
11 equipment, willing to put themselves at risk.
12 They're assaulted, spit on and degraded. This is
13 their daily grind upward 40 hours a week day-in, day-
14 out. They do this all on minimal pay. Over the last
15 20 years the starting pay has only increased by \$4.69
16 for the Fire Department EMT workers. This is
17 certainly not a living wage. These people have
18 families to support and they're trying to pay their
19 way through school. The percentage of call volume
20 has increased astronomically over the past few years,
21 while the pay has certainly lagged behind. The rate
22 of suicide among first responders has seen an uptick,
23 certainly increasing during the pandemic and hasn't
24 slowed since. There's an unfortunate stigma to
25 seeking mental health help. Members are afraid that

2 they will be put on restrictive duties or feel
3 ostracized from their cohorts. I hope that you take
4 into consideration my testimony and the testimony of
5 my peers. I pray that the City Council votes yes to
6 increase wages which will encourage neighboring EMS
7 services to fall in line and yes to funding mental
8 health resources for EMS workers. Thank you for your
9 time.

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you.

11 DAVID COOK: Great job. Great job. First
12 off, I want to say good afternoon to everybody in
13 this room. I hope everybody has a good day, and I
14 also want to just give thanks to God and thanks to
15 Jesus Christ. I want to thank you guys for hearing my
16 testimony and my comrade. My name is David Cook. I'm
17 a lieutenant with the Fire Department, New York City
18 EMS. I worked 17 years with the Fire Department, and
19 to be honest with you, I really deserve more than two
20 minutes because I put my life on the line saving
21 every person in New York City, every borough, nonstop
22 doing countless hours of overtime. See, I'm a
23 paramedic and I'm also a former paramedic instructor
24 which means I've trained a lot of young EMTs and
25 paramedics to do great field work in the streets.

2 You see, Michael Fenneran [sp?] was one of my
3 instructors and he called me in when I was young EMT,
4 21-year-old kid on the job, a superhero and I learned
5 very quickly that every superhero-- and I'm going to
6 use Superman as the analogy-- that even Superman
7 deserves to go home to a Lois Lane and can be Clark
8 Kent and live his life normal, and that goes for
9 every man and woman in the Fire Department EMS. The
10 pay is so low, everybody's doing countless overtime.
11 You have mothers struggling by themselves. They're
12 struggling by themselves taking care of one, two,
13 three, four, five kids. We need you guys to vote on
14 money. Listen, how do you want these superheroes to
15 save the fireman, the police officers when they go in
16 dangerous buildings? Who you think is going to save
17 them? The paramedics and EMTs. I'm speaking for
18 everybody. I'm also Vice President of Operations of a
19 nonprofit organization called EMS PAC. We have about
20 12,000 followers and we educate the public and all we
21 promote is pay parity. So, yeah, we need everybody
22 to stop saying you're going to do something and
23 actually do something. I testified here in 2020.
24 Right here, this says New Yorks Best. When I got
25 this jacket done it says New York Best. That's what

2 FDNY EMS is. So I want to figure out why we got to
3 sit here and negotiate and waste time on when to pay
4 us. Let's cut the nonsense. And Mayor Adams made
5 promises. He didn't live up to it. A lot of these
6 politicians been in office didn't live up to it. So
7 I'm tired of the game. And the truth is, all the
8 EMTs and paramedics are struggling. You have men
9 suffering through mental health. They're paying
10 child support. They're struggling to take care of
11 their kids. I'm going to keep going. I deserve that.
12 I earned that. I sit there and intubate patients
13 when they go into cardia arrest. I stick IVs in
14 patient's arms and give them medication. I bring the
15 dead back to live in New York City. You're going to
16 hear me when I talk. That's a fact. I speak for all
17 the EMTs and paramedics. You're going to respect me.
18 That's a fact. I got the Internal Affairs in the Fire
19 Department chasing EMTs and paramedics out of
20 bathrooms and taking their money for nonsense, and
21 FDNY EMS. FDNY EMS dictates when the privates in
22 hospital 911 are going to get their salary increase.
23 So if you don't increase the EMTs and paramedics
24 salary in the Fire Department, the rest of them got
25 to suffer. So who's going to have the cohones [sp?]

2 to do what they got to do? I got to keep coming back
3 here. My name's David Jesse Cook. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you. Thank
5 you all for-- thank you all. Thanks to all of you
6 for your testimony today and sharing your thoughts
7 and experience. If there's anyone in the chamber who
8 wishes to speak but has not yet had the opportunity
9 to do so, please raise your hand and fill out an
10 appearance card with the Sergeant at Arms at the back
11 of the room. Seeing no hands in the chamber, we will
12 now shift to online testimony via Zoom. We will now
13 call Jonnie Gillam [sp?].

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

15 JONNIE GILLAM: Hi, sorry. Can you folks
16 hear me okay?

17 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Yes.

18 JONNIE GILLAM: Good afternoon, Chair
19 Salaam and the members of the Committee on Public
20 Safety. My name is Jonnie Gillam. I am a paralegal
21 at the New York City Anti-Violence Project, AVP. You
22 heard from my colleague [inaudible] earlier, so I
23 will try to just speak from the legal perspective and
24 avoid duplication. My written testimony does go into
25 considerably more detail than I'll be able to here,

2 and I encourage all of you to read it. Now, you
3 folks don't need me to tell you that the LGBTQ
4 community that we serve which includes immigrants,
5 Black and Brown folks, sex workers, and queer New
6 Yorkers of all descriptions is under direct legal
7 attack from the Federal Government. Small community
8 organizations like ours are likewise targeted. We at
9 AVP have been defunded nearly half a million dollars
10 in federal grants and we expect to lose considerably
11 more. That's a lot of money for a small organization
12 like ours. We don't know if we're going to be able
13 to survive from the budgetary perspective. And so
14 for this reason, we ask that the Council increase
15 funding to vulnerable lead organizations like our own
16 and also encourage MOCJ to do the same. We at AVP
17 legal represent clients at all levels of the criminal
18 justice system. Our clients are often undocumented
19 or sex workers or both and they tend to move between
20 the traditional roles of victim and perpetrator
21 within the criminal justice system. We strive to
22 provide those clients with holistic and culturally-
23 competent representation that other folks would not
24 be able to. We do crime victims advocacy, criminal
25 defendant advocacy, immigration representation,

2 etcetera. To give you an example, I'm going to
3 briefly introduce Isabella who's a client of ours.
4 She's a trans woman from Guatemala, a victim of
5 trafficking. She is now subject to the racist and
6 unconstitutional Laken Riley Act. So, if she were
7 picked up by ICE today she would be summarily
8 deported without any right to representation. When
9 we first started working with her we were doing
10 defense advocacy that moved into deportation defense,
11 and we're now doing crime victim advocacy for her,
12 trying to get her out of her trafficking situation,
13 and we're working with city agencies to do that. And
14 that's just kind of a brief example of the really
15 holistic representation that we're able to provide.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Thank you for your
17 testimony. Time has expired.

18 JONNIE GILLAM: Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you. We're now
20 making a final call for any person who is Zoom who
21 has not yet spoken. If you're currently on Zoom and
22 wish to speak, but have not yet had the opportunity
23 to do so, please use the raise hand function and our
24 staff will unmute you. Seeing no hands, I would like
25 to note that everyone can submit testimony to

2 testimony@council.nyc.gov within 72 hours of this
3 hearing. We thank the administration and the public
4 for attending this hearing, to share their thoughts
5 on the oversight topic and attached legislation and
6 look forward to following up on these issues. With
7 that, this hearing is now adjourned.

8 [gavel]

9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1	COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY	242
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date June 8, 2025