

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON RULES, PRIVILEGES AND ELECTIONS

----- X

August 9, 2017  
Start: 11:02 a.m.  
Recess: 11:25 a.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: BRAD S. LANDER  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Daniel R. Garodnick  
Ydanis A. Rodriguez  
Margaret S. Chin  
Deborah L. Rose  
Helen K. Rosenthal  
Jumaane D. Williams  
Robert L. Espinal, Jr.  
Mark Levine  
Melissa Mark-Viverito  
Steven Matteo

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

2 [sound check, pause]

3 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: This is a quorum.

4 Just step back in right that far. Alright, then we

5 got a quorum as soon as you're right there. Just let

6 me bang this gavel. We're good. Alright, good

7 morning, and welcome as we reopen the meeting of the

8 New York City Council, the Committee on Rules,

9 Privileges and Elections. I'm Brad Lander, honored

10 to chair the committee. We're joined this morning by

11 Council Members Margaret Chin, Debbie Rose, Mark

12 Levine, Dan Garodnick and Jumaane Williams. I'm

13 sitting down to not mess with the camera angles

14 currently because everyone is excited about this

15 meeting resumed from recess. With the New York City

16 Council Rules Committee it's going to go viral on the

17 web and I don't want to, you know, have only midriff

18 in it. [laughter] We are joined also by the Korean-

19 American Civic Empowerment Association. Thank you

20 guys for coming. Some young people engaging in civic

21 education for the summer. Thank you and I will note

22 that I spent the morning at the recognition ceremony

23 of the Summer Youth Employment Program at Manatee

24 Hospital where hundreds of kids got to work this

25 summer, and let's remember that half of them are

2 there because we've doubled that program in the time  
3 that we have been in this City Council, not the Rules  
4 Committee by ourselves, of course, but the--

5 FEMALE SPEAKER: That also.

6 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Alright. We are  
7 also joined by Council Member Bill Perkins from  
8 Manhattan, and thank you. Is who? [background  
9 comments] Is from Harlem. Excuse me. Alright,  
10 let's note that for the record. We, um, thank you to  
11 our Committee Counsel Elizabeth Guzman and thanks as  
12 always to Chuck Davis, Director of Investigations and  
13 Andre Johnson Brown and Joseph Anderson. They did a  
14 lot of investigative work on this week's  
15 appointments. Today, the Council will vote on two  
16 candidates Nasr O. Sheta for appointment to the New  
17 York City Board of Standards and Appeal as the  
18 engineer member to fill the vacancy and serve the  
19 remainder of six-year term that expires on January 1,  
20 2023, and second Michael Rivadeneyra for appointment  
21 as the Bronx representative to Civilian Complaint  
22 Review Board just to succeed Yungat Yune (sp?) and  
23 serve the remainder of a three-year term that expires  
24 on July 4, 2019. We had a good hearing with both of  
25 them last week, and the committee members felt that

2 they were both highly qualified for these positions  
3 and that that Nara Sheta know a lot about  
4 geotechnical engineering, and the things that are  
5 needed in that, which is essentially a staff  
6 position. It's a board appointment, but it's a full-  
7 time paid staff position as the engineer member on  
8 the BSA, a really important thing for the public to  
9 have because developers seeking variances often hire  
10 highly skilled and technical consultants to make  
11 claims about their need for more bulk or higher  
12 density and having a skilled engineer who can really  
13 review the drawings and the program and see whether  
14 that's actually needed or not is critical, and so we  
15 want to get him on there quickly. The one issue that  
16 was outstanding from that hearing is the question of  
17 Mr. Sheta's residency. Pursuant to Public Officer's  
18 Law Section 3, Mr. Sheta is required to be a resident  
19 of the city of New York upon appointment to the BSA.  
20 At the time of our meeting on August 2<sup>nd</sup>, Mr. Sheta  
21 had executed a lease to move from his—where he's  
22 lived in New Jersey to a residence in Astoria,  
23 Queens, and he informed us at that time he would  
24 provide an additional indices of residence by  
25 changing his driver's lice and voter registration to

2 the Astoria residents by today's confirmation  
3 hearing. Members, you'll be pleased to see that that  
4 evidence is provided in your packet. He's changed  
5 his voter registration. He's got a new driver's  
6 license, and in addition, Council investigators  
7 performed a field residence check at the Astoria  
8 residence and Mr. Sheta was home in his Astoria  
9 apartment. So, we take the rules of the Charter and  
10 residency requirement seriously. I think a lot of  
11 this work is behind the scenes work that's always in  
12 these red binders, but I want to say that we always  
13 really value the work that Chuck Davis and his team  
14 do. [background comments] There was a question.  
15 Apparently he had also been looking at a home on  
16 Staten Island, but ultimately he chose to move to  
17 Astoria. There are some boards where you have to  
18 have one person from each borough or there's a  
19 borough residency requirement, but it's not a  
20 requirement of the charter that the engineer member  
21 of the Board of Standards and Appeals live in Staten  
22 Island. And I understand that there's plenty of  
23 demand for housing on Staten Island. So, you don't  
24 necessarily need him to live there. So, with that  
25 information, with all the additional evidence and

2 field residence check, the residency check, Council  
3 investigators are satisfied and I'm satisfied that  
4 Mr. Sheta meets the residency requirements to be  
5 appointed as a member of the Board of Standards and  
6 Appeals at this time. Are there any-? We've also  
7 been joined by Council Members Helen Rosenthal of the  
8 Upper Westside and Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez of  
9 Washington Heights and Inwood. Council Member  
10 Perkins wants us to be more specific than just  
11 Manhattan. So, are at least to say Harlem. So, in  
12 any case, are there any members who have questions or  
13 comments or would like to say anything before we  
14 proceed to vote on these two members? Seeing none,  
15 we will ask that the Committee Clerk call the role on  
16 the vote. Thank you.

17 CLERK: William Martin Committee Clerk,  
18 roll call vote Committee on Rules. The items are  
19 coupled. Chair Lander.

20 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: I vote aye.

21 CLERK: Garodnick.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

23 CLERK: Rodriguez.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

25 CLERK: Chin.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.

3 CLERK: Rose.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

5 CLERK: Levine.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.

7 CLERK: Rosenthal.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye.

9 CLERK: By a vote of 7 in the  
10 affirmative, 0 in the negative and no abstentions,  
11 both items have been adopted by the committee.

12 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you very much  
13 Billy. We will leave the roll open for ten minutes  
14 or so to allow other members the opportunity to come  
15 and vote, and we'll close the meeting with that vote.  
16 Thank you. [pause]

17 CLERK: Continuation roll call Committee  
18 on Rules. Council Member Williams.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I vote aye.

20 [background comments]

21 CLERK: Continuation roll call, the  
22 Committee on Rules. Speaker Mark-Viverito.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I vote aye.

24 CLERK: Final vote the Committee on  
25 Rules, both items have been adopted by the committee



1 COMMITTEE ON RULES, PRIVILEGES AND ELECTIONS 9

2 of 9 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative and no  
3 abstentions.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date August 17, 2017