

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS,  
PUBLIC SITINGS, AND DISPOSITIONS

----- X

OCTOBER 19, 2022  
Start: 10:12 AM  
Recess: 10:44 AM

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBER - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: FARAH N. LOUIS, CHAIRPERSON

COUNCIL MEMBERS: CARMEN N. DE LA ROSA  
OSWALD FELIZ  
CHRISTOPHER MARTE  
SANDY NURSE  
SANDRA UNG  
INA VERNIKOV

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

ROSA KELLEY, HPD

JACLYN SCARINCI, Land Use Council

BRIAN LOUGHLIN, Lead Architect

AMY PIVAK, HPD

HALLA SALAT [phonetic], HPD

DAVID DOWNS, Catholic Church

KASSA BELAY, Development Team,  
Brownsville Partnership

JONATHAN BEUTTLER, Development Team,  
Radson Development

NOELLE MEYER-POWELL, Brownsville  
Partnership

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS,  
PUBLIC SITINGS AND DISPOSITIONS

3

2 SARGENT AT ARMS: Good morning. This is  
3 a microphone check for the Committee on Landmarks,  
4 Public Sitings and Dispositions. Today's date is  
5 October 19th, 2022. Located in the Chambers.  
6 Recording done by Pedro Lugo.

7 SGT. LUGO: Good morning. Good morning.  
8 At this time can the host security start the live --  
9 the webinar. Good morning everyone. Welcome to  
10 today's New York City Council Hearing of the  
11 Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public Sitings and  
12 Dispositions. At this time can everyone please  
13 silence your electronic devices? If you would like  
14 to submit written testimony you may send it to  
15 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. Again, that's  
16 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. Thank you for your  
17 cooperation. Chair, we are ready to begin.

18 CHAIRPERSON FARAH LOUIS: (Gavel  
19 pounding). Good morning. I'm Council Member Farah  
20 Louis Chair of the Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public  
21 Sitings and Dispositions. I am joined today by  
22 Council Members De La Rosa, Nurse, and Marte. Today  
23 I will conduct votes and hold public hearings on a  
24 number of items but before we begin I will recognize  
25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS,  
2 PUBLIC SITINGS AND DISPOSITIONS

4

3 the Subcommittee Counsel to explain today's hearing  
4 procedures.

5 ARTHUR HUH, COUNSEL: Thank you Chair

6 Louis. I am Arthur Huh, Counsel to the Subcommittee.

7 This meeting is being held in a hybrid format.

8 Members of the public who wish to testify may do so

9 in person or via Zoom. Those wishing to testify by

10 Zoom for today's hearings were asked to register on

11 line. If you registered to testify and are not yet

12 signed in, please do so now and remain signed in

13 until you have completed your testimony. If you wish

14 to testify remotely and have not yet registered

15 please do so now by visiting

16 [www.counsel.nyc.gov/landuse](http://www.counsel.nyc.gov/landuse) to sign up now. If you

17 have written testimony that you would like the

18 Subcommittee to consider in addition to or instead of

19 appearing before the Subcommittee or if you require

20 an accessible version of a presentation given at

21 today's meeting, please send an email to

22 [landusetestimony@council.NYC.gov](mailto:landusetestimony@council.NYC.gov).

23 [Landusetestimony@council.NYC.gov](mailto:Landusetestimony@council.NYC.gov). Please indicate

24 the LU number or project name in the subject line of

25 the email. We ask that everyone please be patient as

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS,  
2 PUBLIC SITINGS AND DISPOSITIONS

5

3 we work through any technical issues today. Travel  
4 this one out and continue with today's agenda.

4 CHAIRPERSON FARAH LOUIS: Thank you. I  
5 now open up public hearing on LU 125 for the gateway  
6 site 26A and phase 5 developmental proposal which  
7 relates to a property in Council Member Barron's  
8 District in Brooklyn. I will note that the  
9 Subcommittee previously heard comprehensive testimony  
10 regarding this project which also includes LUs 113  
11 and 114 on September 20th. To summarize the set of  
12 action requested for this project includes UDAP  
13 approval and an amendment to the Fresh Creek Urban  
14 Renewal Plan and amendment of a previously approved  
15 UDAP all to facilitate the development of a new  
16 eight-story mixed use building and nine four story  
17 residential buildings with the combined total of  
18 approximately 751 affordable units. I just also want  
19 to mention that we've been joined by Council Member  
20 Ung. Counsel would you please call on and swear in  
21 the applicant for this item?

22 ARTHUR HUH, COUNSEL: The applicant for  
23 this item is Rosa Kelley on behalf of HPD. Ms.  
24 Kelley would you please raise your right hand and do  
25 you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and

2 nothing but the truth in your testimony before the  
3 Subcommittee and an answer to all Council Member  
4 questions?

5 ROSA KELLEY: Yes.

6 ARTHUR HUH, COUNSEL: Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON FARAH LOUIS: Thank you. Ms.  
8 Kelley, you may begin.

9 ROSA KELLEY: Referencing our previous  
10 comprehensive testimony from the 9/20 Subcommittee.  
11 I just want to reiterate that this is an amendment to  
12 a previously approved UPDAP to modify the number of  
13 units, the number of buildings and in particular the  
14 design of the buildings from an octite to a more  
15 sustainable building design.

16 CHAIRPERSON FARAH LOUIS: Thank you and  
17 now I invite my colleagues to ask questions if you  
18 have any. So kind. Thank you. If there are no  
19 questions the applicant panel is now excused.  
20 Counsel, are there any members of the public who wish  
21 to testify on LU125 relating to the Gateway  
22 Development Program?

23 ARTHUR HUH, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: If there  
24 are any members of the public who wish to testify on  
25 LU 125 relating to the Gateway site 26A and Phase 5

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS,  
2 PUBLIC SITINGS AND DISPOSITIONS

7

3 Development Proposal. Please use the raise hand  
4 button now. If you are participating remotely. If  
5 you are here with us in person, please see one of the  
6 Sergeants to first fill out a speaker card.

7 CHAIRPERSON FARAH LOUIS: Members of the  
8 public -- oh, okay. Since we don't have that.

9 Excuse me. So there's no questions for this panel?

10 There's no members of the public. We are going to

11 move forward to, will stay at ease. One second. All

12 right. Being no members of the public wish to

13 testify on LU 125 relating to Gateway Site 26A and

14 Phase 5 Development Proposal and Public Hearing is

15 now closed. We will now vote on -- to approve LU 125

16 which we just heard in addition to LUS 115 and 114

17 which once again the subcommittee previously heard on

18 September 20th. Together these related actions

19 comprise the Gateway Site 26A and Phase 5

20 Redevelopment Proposal in Council Member Barron's

21 District in Brooklyn. The proposal would facilitate

22 the development of one new 8-story mixed used

23 development with approximately 191 affordable

24 dwelling units including 134 heirs unit and nine 4-

25 story buildings containing approximately 560

affordable dwelling units. Council Member Barron is

3 in support of this proposal. We will also vote to  
4 approve LUs 119 through 124 covering the three  
5 projects proposed by HPD in coordination with a  
6 dedicated development team. These three projects  
7 known as Morris Height NPC is this correct? NCP,  
8 sorry, LUs 119 and 120 Morrisania Open Door under LUs  
9 121 and 122 and Morrisania Claremont Village Open  
10 Door under LU 123 and 124 each include requested UDAP  
11 designation and project approval as well as approval  
12 for the disposition of city-owned property as well as  
13 an Article XI Tax Exemption Request. The Morrisania  
14 Claremont Village Open Door Project also includes a  
15 request for approval of UDAP Tax Exemptions. The  
16 projects together will facilitate the development of  
17 up to 75 units and a mix of affordable home ownership  
18 and rental units across various project sites.  
19 Council Member Stevens whose District includes many  
20 of the project sites along with Council Member  
21 Sanchez and Chair Riley are all in support of these  
22 proposals. And now I'd like to take a moment to  
23 recognize any of my colleagues with questions or  
24 remarks regarding these items. See none. I now call  
25 for a vote to approve LUs 113 and 114 and 125 for the  
Gateway Site 26A and Phase 5 Redevelopment Proposal



1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS,  
PUBLIC SITINGS AND DISPOSITIONS

9

2 and LUs 119 and 120 for the Morrisania Open Door  
3 Proposal and LUs 121 and 122 for the Morris Heights  
4 NCP Proposal, and LUs 123 and 124 for the Morrisania  
5 Claremont Village Open Door Proposal. Counsel,  
6 please call roll?

7 ARTHUR HUH, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair

8 Louis?

9 CHAIRPERSON FARAH LOUIS: I vote aye.

10 ARTHUR HUH, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council

11 Member De La Rosa?

12 CARMEN DE LA ROSA: Aye.

13 ARTHUR HUH, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council

14 Member Marte?

15 CHRISTOPHER MARTE: Aye.

16 ARTHUR HUH, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council

17 Member Nurse?

18 SANDY NURSE: I vote aye.

19 ARTHUR HUH, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council

20 Member Ung?

21 SANDRA UNG: Aye.

22 ARTHUR HUH, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Okay.

23 Chair, the items are approved by a vote of five in  
24 the affirmative, zero in the negative and no  
25 abstentions. Oh, pardon me.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS,  
PUBLIC SITINGS AND DISPOSITIONS

10

2 CHAIRPERSON FARAH LOUIS: Council Member  
3 Feliz has joined us.

4 ARTHUR HUH, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council  
5 Member Feliz, I'm sorry.

6 OSWALD FELIZ: Oh I vote aye.

7 ARTHUR HUH, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Uh --  
8 with that Chair, the vote stands at six in the  
9 affirmative, zero in the negative and no abstentions.  
10 We can keep the vote open.

11 CHAIRPERSON FARAH LOUIS: All right. We  
12 will keep the vote open but can proceed. I now open  
13 a public hearing on the Pre-Considered LUs related to  
14 ULURP Application numbers C-220427 HAK, C-220428 HUK,  
15 C-220429 ZMK and N-220430 ZRK for the Livonia4  
16 Development proposal which relates to properties in  
17 Council Member Barron's District in Brooklyn. He got  
18 a whole lot going on. If approved these applications  
19 will facilitate the development of four new 100  
20 percent affordable 11 and 12 story mixed used  
21 buildings. The proposal includes approximately 499  
22 dwelling units, ground floor commercial space and  
23 community facility space at four sites along Livonia  
24 Avenue in Brooklyn. I will remind anyone wishing to  
25 testify remotely on these items if you have not

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS,  
PUBLIC SITINGS AND DISPOSITIONS

11

2 already done so you must register online and you may  
3 do that by now visiting council's website.  
4 Council.NYC.Gov/landuse. Counsel, please call the  
5 first panel for this item?

6 ARTHUR HUH, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The  
7 applicant panel will include Jaclyn Scarinci, Land  
8 Use Counsel, Brian Loughlin, Lead Architect and Amy  
9 Pivak on behalf of HPD. Also available for Q and A  
10 are Rosa Kelley and Halla Salat [phonetic] for HPD,  
11 David Downs for Catholic Charities. I believe we  
12 have a couple of online panelists. We also have  
13 Kassa Belay and Jonathan Beuttler also the  
14 development team and they are joining us remotely.

15 CHAIRPERSON FARAH LOUIS: Counsel please  
16 administer the affirmation.

17 ARTHUR HUH, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Panelists  
18 please. I will ask all panelists to please raise  
19 your right hand I will call on you each individually  
20 to answer the following. Do you affirm to tell the  
21 truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in  
22 your testimony before the subcommittee and in answer  
23 to all Council Member questions?

24 JACLYN SCARINCI: I do.

25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS,  
PUBLIC SITINGS AND DISPOSITIONS

12

2 ARTHUR HUH, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Sorry.

3 Chair Scarinci?

4 JACLYN SCARINCI: I do.

5 ARTHUR HUH, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Brian

6 Loughlin?

7 BRIAN LOUGHLIN: I do.

8 ARTHUR HUH, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Amy

9 Pivak?

10 AMY PIVAK: I do.

11 ARTHUR HUH, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Rosa

12 Kelley?

13 ROSA KELLEY: I do.

14 ARTHUR HUH, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Kassa

15 Belay?

16 KASSA BELAY: I do.

17 ARTHUR HUH, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Do you

18 approve? And Jonathan Beuttler.

19 JONATHAN BEUTTLER: I do.

20 ARTHUR HUH, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank

21 you.

22 CHAIRPERSON FARAH LOUIS: Thank you. For

23 the public if you need an accessible version of

24 today's presentation please send an email request to

25 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. Panelists please

3 restate your name and organization for the record  
4 because you came with a whole team today. So if you  
5 could do so and also if you would like to please let  
6 us know when you would like to begin showing your  
7 presentation so that our staff can display it on the  
8 screen. Thank you. And you may begin.

9 AMY PIVAK: Thank you. And can we pull  
10 up the presentation. Thank you. Great. Good  
11 morning Council Members and Subcommittee Chair. My  
12 name is Amy Pivak and I am here representing HPD. I  
13 am joined by Jackie Scarinci Ackerman and Brian  
14 Loughlin of Magnusson Architecture and Planning as  
15 well as Rosa Kelley also from HPD. Next slide  
16 please. Thank you for having us here to present this  
17 proposal for this truly transformative project on  
18 four sites along Livonia Avenue in Brownsville.  
19 Overall the proposed project will provide  
20 approximately 498 affordable units affordable to  
21 folks at a range of incomes including supportive and  
22 senior housing as well as commercial and community  
23 facility space. Since the proposed development  
24 project is comprised of four separate sites we have a  
25 large team assembled. In addition to Brian, Jackie  
and Rosa we are also joined by three developers

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS,  
2 PUBLIC SITINGS AND DISPOSITIONS

14

3 including Catholic Charities of Brooklyn and Queens  
4 represented by David Downs, the Brownsville  
5 Partnership represented by Kassa Belay and Noelle  
6 Meyers-Powell and Radson Development represented by  
7 Jonathan Beuttler. Next slide please. This proposed  
8 project is a result of a collaborative community  
9 process that started in 2016 with residents in  
10 Community Partners and led to the development of the  
11 Brownville Plan. The planned detail strategies to  
12 bring investment to the Brownville Community as well  
13 as to put land that has long been vacant to better  
14 use. In furtherance of the goals of this plan, HPD  
15 released the series of RFPs to make the community's  
16 priorities including this group of sites RFPs to meet  
17 the community's priorities including this group of  
18 sites known as Site C which has a theme of Healthy  
19 Living and Food Systems. Next slide please. The  
20 development team partners have committed with the  
21 City to continued outreach in Brownsville after they  
22 were awarded this RFP. This slide highlights the  
23 continuous outreach in community engagement as it  
24 included a series of public forums, the Hope Summits,  
25 Driveway meetings and door to door outreach. Next

3 I'll hand it over to Jackie to talk through area  
4 context and existing conditions.

5 JACLYN SCARINCI: Good morning. Next  
6 slide please. The Livonia4 project is comprised of  
7 two specific project areas with four different  
8 development sites. This is project area 1 which is  
9 located along Livonia Avenue between Powell Street  
10 and Mother Gaston Boulevard. And Livonia Avenue in  
11 this area is major commercial corridor. It is the  
12 elevated 3 line runs along it so it is a transit  
13 oriented area and just to the north of these  
14 developments are the NYCHA Van Dyke Houses, the  
15 Tolden [phonetic] Houses and Brownsville Houses so  
16 they are town in the park buildings that we in turn  
17 fixed to 25 stories and then immediately south of the  
18 project area is the Nehemiah Homes which are two-  
19 story home ownership buildings. All right. Moving  
20 to the next slide. Five blocks west of Project Area  
21 1 is Project Area 2 where Site C-4 is located. And  
22 this is between Amboy Street and Thomas Boyland  
23 Street. And it is right across the street from the  
24 10 and a half acre Betsy Head Park to give you  
25 context. Next slide please. You can see from the  
existing condition these are long vacant city-owned

lots in need of revitalization and redevelopment.

3 Next slide please. I'll turn it over to Brian now to  
4 walk through the project benefit.

5 BRIAN LOUGHLIN: Thank you. The  
6 community benefits that are being provided by all  
7 four buildings directly reflect the needs of the  
8 community stated in the RFP that was released by HPD  
9 sometime ago. Those four community benefits which  
10 appear on all four of the buildings include housing  
11 affordability, economic opportunity, community  
12 empowerment and health and wellness programs. Next  
13 slide please. In addition to that all four buildings  
14 and the project in general provides a number of  
15 economic opportunities and they are spelled out here  
16 on the slide before you but I'll run through some of  
17 the highlights including the recruitment and training  
18 center which will and a hiring campaign which will be  
19 part of the project. Will be working with local  
20 hiring partners, Brownsville Partnership is  
21 partnering with the Brownsville work force  
22 development alliance as well as the central Brooklyn  
23 EDC. The total direct employment impact is going to  
24 approximately be 475 construction jobs, 83 permanent  
25 retail and social service jobs and 11 permanent



3 building operating jobs. The project overall will  
4 meet the minority in women business enterprise  
5 contracting requirements exceeding the 25 percent of  
6 project costs to be spent on contracts with M and WBE  
7 contractors. There will also be a Youth Career  
8 Readiness Program featured as one of the programs  
9 offered in one of the four buildings and then they  
10 will also be a green job opportunities including  
11 entrepreneurship and apprenticeship with Project Eats  
12 which will be features in one of the buildings as  
13 well. Next slide please. So as was previously  
14 stated there are three -- sorry there are two project  
15 areas. The first project area in the image on the  
16 screen in front of you is closest to us and that is  
17 comprised of three different buildings. The first of  
18 which is C1 which will be developed by Radson  
19 Development. And that's between Powell and Sackman  
20 Street. C1 will feature approximately 226 units of  
21 multifamily housing. There will also be a grocery  
22 store at the ground floor and a rooftop farm on the  
23 top of the building that will be developed in  
24 partnership with Isabahlia Ladies of Elegance and  
25 Project Eats which are two local organizations very  
active in the urban agriculture space in this

3 neighborhood. C-2 which is just across the street  
4 moving down Lavonia between Sackman and Christopher  
5 Avenue. And C-2 will be developed by a Brownsville  
6 Partnership along with SCO of family services. This  
7 building will feature approximately 81 units of  
8 supportive housing and will also have the Family  
9 Support Center at the ground floor. C-3 which is  
10 directly adjacent to that and between Christopher  
11 Avenue and Mother Gaston Boulevard. Will be  
12 developed by Catholic Charities. This will feature  
13 approximately 140 units of senior housing and will  
14 feature a large Senior Center at the ground floor  
15 servicing the community as well as the residents of  
16 this building. The second project area is down -- is  
17 moving further down Lavonia Avenue and is across the  
18 street from Betsy Head Park. C-4 which will also be  
19 developed by Radson Development in conjunction with  
20 Brownsville Partnership will feature approximately 55  
21 units of affordable multifamily housing and a  
22 substantial youth recreation center. Next slide  
23 please. In an attempt to meeting the housing  
24 affordability goals as stated in the RFP the  
25 development team worked very hard to match as closely  
as they could the AMIs and the unit distribution by

3 AMI within the needs of the community so on the slide  
4 that you see in front of you, the orange bands are  
5 the AMI chairs as met by percentage for the four  
6 buildings in total. The white bars are the AMI  
7 levels of community district 16 and the black bars  
8 are the AMI levels of Brooklyn as a whole. And so  
9 you can see how working within the limitations of the  
10 term sheets we did our best to meet the needs of  
11 community based on the AMI levels. Next slide  
12 please. So with that I turn it back over to Jackie.

13 JACLYN SCARINCI: Okay. And there are a  
14 number of land use actions we are requesting but to  
15 summarize the first is a rezoning from the existing  
16 R6 and R6 and C2-4 to an R7-2 C2-4. And that allows  
17 for the building program to include almost 50,000  
18 square feet of community facility as well as  
19 commercial space and affordable housing residential  
20 development across the four different programs that  
21 Brian just described as well as a zoning text  
22 amendment to designate the re-zoning area of  
23 mandatory inclusionary housing areas and then the  
24 next three actions are pursuant to each PDs authority  
25 to dispose of the property to designate the area and  
urban development action area and also to obtain an

3 urban development action area approval for each of  
4 the sites. And finally, an amendment to the  
5 Brownsville II plan or C1, C2, and C3 which only  
6 permitted commercial use and this amendment will  
7 allow the mixed used development that the applicants  
8 are proposing. And with that I thank you for your  
9 time and we're happy to answer any questions that the  
10 committee may have. Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON FARAH LOUIS: Thank you. I  
12 have a few questions before turning it over to my  
13 colleagues. First question is these sites have been  
14 developed for decades. Can you describe HPDs process  
15 for deciding how and when to move forward on  
16 development of city owned sites like these?

17 JACLYN SCARINCI: Hi. So HPD has a  
18 robust RFP process by which we move forward with the  
19 designation of public sites for affordable housing.  
20 So as part of that process our planning teams and our  
21 borough planning teams and our neighborhood strategy  
22 teams actually work together to craft a series of  
23 outreach and engagement events. We solicit feedback  
24 from the local community on the type of programming  
25 that they want to see. This particular project is a  
result of the Brownsville Plan which was a really

3 robust community engagement process which I think Amy  
4 reference earlier cultivated in the selection of  
5 multiple development teams for multiple public sites  
6 and this particular group was designated with the  
7 idea of health living and so that's what we strive  
8 for for the programming for all of this. We are  
9 absolutely happy to share the Brownsville Plan and  
10 also the engagement materials and we are very proud  
11 of the engagement work that we did on these public  
12 sites.

13 CHAIRPERSON FARAH LOUIS: Thank you for  
14 that. And does HPD plan on replicating the community  
15 planning model of the Brownsville Plan in other  
16 neighborhoods under this Administration?

17 JACLYN SCARINCI: That's something that  
18 we are absolutely interested in discussing more.

19 CHAIRPERSON FARAH LOUIS: Great. And the  
20 community board voted to disapprove this project due  
21 to issues with encroachment and questions about the  
22 property lines between these properties and  
23 neighboring homeowners so have those issues been  
24 addressed?

25 JACLYN SCARINCI: That's exactly right.  
And I will say we have successfully resolved all but

3 one of the encroachment issues and actually just this  
4 morning we got an email confirmation that on that  
5 last site we do have a path forward so I'm happy to  
6 say that we have successfully resolved or are on our  
7 way to resolving all of the encroachment issues. We  
8 do plan on confirming next steps. Confirming with  
9 the community board, the homeowner's association, the  
10 Council Member what those next steps will be but  
11 happy to report that we are well on our way to  
12 resolving all of those encroachment issues.

13 CHAIRPERSON FARAH LOUIS: And that often  
14 happens whenever there is development there is  
15 encroachment issues so it would be good to have in  
16 writing for those homeowners and folks that have  
17 concerns with what those will look like so that they  
18 don't enter you know any kind of contact that they  
19 don't want. I know invite my colleagues to ask  
20 Council Member Nurse if she has a quick question.

21 SANDY NURSE: I guess I just have one  
22 question. So I'm seeing across the four sites there  
23 is only 14 three bedroom units. Is -- I'm just  
24 concerned. I mean obviously people are supportive of  
25 it I mean I'm just you know deeply concerned of the  
continuing pattern of creating affordability for like

3 one you know families with one child. And you're a  
4 lot of studios here which I get for the seniors but  
5 you know the two bedrooms are really small and I'm  
6 sure based on the square footage those bedrooms are  
7 probably very tiny. So if you have three kids you're  
8 kind of really you know SOL so I guess I'm just  
9 curious why there is only 14 three bedroom units for  
10 families that have, they are big in east New York and  
11 Brownsville.

12 JACLYN SCARINCI: So before I turn it  
13 over to Brian to discuss a little bit more about the  
14 unit mix on a site by site bases I will just say that  
15 part of what we're seeing in that mix is both the  
16 supportive housing and the senior housing and those  
17 do tend to you know skew toward single adults. And  
18 so we because we have two of the four sites for  
19 supportive and senior that is contributing to the  
20 overall mix of a greater number of studio and one  
21 bedrooms because they are --

22 SANDY NURSE: Just to clarify for the C1  
23 site which is a multi-family housing 226 units, 4  
24 percent of it is 3 bedroom and that's is that how  
25 much of that is supportive housing for C1? I might

3 be reading the information wrong. I'm just more for  
4 clarification?

5 BRIAN LOUGHLIN: Yeah. So the that's  
6 correct. There are eight units in C1 that are three  
7 bedroom units. Um the supportive units are usually  
8 evenly distributed across the 226 approximate units.

9 SANDY NURSE: All right and then for C4  
10 55 units of multi-family housing, 6 units are three  
11 bedroom and how much of that is supportive housing?

12 BRIAN LOUGHLIN: Again the -- the  
13 supportive component of it is the 15 percent formally  
14 set aside and that would again be evenly distributed  
15 across the 55 units.

16 SANDY NURSE: So eight of those units if  
17 this is correct in the breakdown. Eight of those  
18 units are?

19 BRIAN LOUGHLIN: Yes. I think that's  
20 correct.

21 SANDY NURSE: The studios. Yes. Okay.  
22 Okay.

23 CHAIRPERSON FARAH LOUIS: All right. We  
24 would love a follow up on the next steps regarding  
25 the homeowners. If we can get that in writing we  
would appreciate that. Thank you. If there are no



2 other questions from my colleagues the applicant  
3 panel is excused. Counsel, are there any members of  
4 the public who wish to testify on Pre-Considered LUs  
5 relating to Livonia4 Development Project?

6 ARTHUR HUH, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: If there  
7 are any members of the public who wish to testify in  
8 the Pre-Considered LUs relating to the Livonia4  
9 Development proposal please use the raise hand button  
10 now if you are participating remotely. And if you  
11 are here with us in person please see one of the  
12 Sergeants at Arms to fill out a speaker card.

13 CHAIRPERSON FARAH LOUIS: All right being  
14 that there are no members of the public who wish to  
15 testify on Pre-Considered LUs relating to ULURP  
16 application numbers C-220427 HAK, C-220428 HUK and C-  
17 220429 ZMK and N-220430 ZRK for the Livonia4  
18 Development Proposal. The public hearing is now  
19 closed and the items are laid over. This concludes  
20 today's sorry. Sorry and now I will hand it over to  
21 counsel.

22 ARTHUR HUH, COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair,  
23 asked to reannounce the vote the items were adopted  
24 today by a vote of six in the affirmative, zero in

3 the negative with no abstentions and they will be  
4 recommended to the full Land Use Committee.

5 CHAIRPERSON FARAH LOUIS: Thank you.

6 This concludes today's business. I remind that if  
7 you written testimony on today's items you may submit  
8 it at [landusetestimony@Council.NYC.gov](mailto:landusetestimony@Council.NYC.gov). Please  
9 indicate the LU number or the project name or project  
10 addressed in the subject heading. I would like to  
11 thank members of the public, my colleagues,  
12 subcommittee Council and Land Use Staff and Sergeant  
13 at Arms for participating in today's hearing. This  
14 meeting is hereby adjourned. [gavel pounding.]  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date October 31, 2022