

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

----- X

December 11, 2024
Start: 10:22 a.m.
Recess: 7:39 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Selvena N. Brooks-Powers
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Joann Ariola
Chris Banks
Carmen N. De La Rosa
Amanda Farías
Farah N. Louis
Mercedes Narcisse
Carlina Rivera
Julie Won

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Jumaane Williams
Public Advocate

Ydanis Rodriguez
DOT Commissioner

Eric Beaton
DOT Deputy Commissioner of Transportation
Planning and Management

Will Carry
DOT Assistant Commissioner of Policy

Rick Rodriguez
DOT Assistant Commissioner of Intergovernmental
and Community Affairs

Senator Brad Hoylman-Sigal

Sindhu Bharadwaj
NYC Comptroller's Office

Robert Acevedo
Disabled in Action Metro New York

Phillip Miatkowski
Transportation Alternatives

Janet Schroeder
NYC E-Vehicle Safety Alliance

Andrew Fine
NYC E-Vehicle Safety Alliance

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Pamela Manasse
Co-founder of EVSA

Sook Ling Lai
Chinatown Head Start

Peggy Ng
Chinatown Head Start

Arthur Miller

Brian Van Nieuwenhoven

Jackson Chabot
Director of Advocacy at Open Plans

Elizabeth Denys
Flatbush resident

Shannon Phipps

Jim Burke [sp?]

Marisa Redante [sp?]

Cassandra Martinez

Paul Mondesire

Daniel Solow
Central Queens Micromobility

Christopher Leon Johnson

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Esther Blount [sp?]

Eric McClure
Streets PAC

Ron Wisniski

Lizo Young [sp?]
EVSA

Peter Beadle

Peter Brown

Jeffrey Thomas

Renee

Seth Jacobson

Kathleen Brady
EVSA

Carl Tait

Raul Rivera
TLC Driver Advocate

Alia Soomro
New York League of Conservation Voters

Angela DeWood

Patricia McGovern

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Karen Shegrew [sp?]

Ann McDermott

Ernest Augustus [sp?]

Judy Posen

Michael Gervino

Scott Pohl

Mary Evancho

Sanja Pohl

Carol Wilson

Karen Phillips

Mary Vakris

Michael Phillips

Sandy Rayburn

Ricardo Pacheco

David Tobias
Legal Aid Society

Lynne Glasner

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Gail Benjamin
East 72nd Neighborhood Association

Virginia Ryan

Ali Ryan

Kathleen Conry
EVSA

Martin Hannan [sp?]

Elizabeth Baylen [sp?]
Behalf of Marilyn Levin

Jacqueline Savage [sp?]

Donald Reed

Michael Sutherland
Open Plans

Austin Pferd
Director of Safety and Zero Emissions Fleet

Patty Meyers

Leslie Clark

Eric Odeski [sp?]

Eleanor

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Roxanne Delgado
Friends of Pelham Park

Robert Colangelo

Elizabeth Williams

Maxine DeSeta

Jason Froimowitz

Santes Cardillo

Patricia Hannem [sp?]

Meryl LaBorde

Stephen Bauman

Alex Duncan

Insung Choe

EVSA

Florence Friedman [sp?]

Bonnie Gerard

Maria Danzilo
One City Rising

Peggy Yannis [sp?]

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Bernadette Ferrara
Van Nest Neighborhood Alliance

Joan-Marie Zimmerman

Kathy Park Price

Brian Howald

Michelle Campo

Laura Shepard

Samir Lavingia

Kevin Siegel

Adrian Morquecho

Alida Camp

Brian Holbrook

Carl Wojciechowski

Chris Ryan

Ellen Shale [sp?]

Ellen Sandles
EVSA

Emily Jacobi

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Jeanine Panchek Berry [sp?]

John Noble

Ken Coughlin

Kenneth Lay

Laura Beth Sachs

Elaine Karas

Purple Circle Early Childhood

Mai Schotz

Matt Moore

People for Bikes

Matthew Dennis

McLean Cozine

Miriam Fisher

Nathaniel Bachelis

Nora McCauley

Nabil Ahmed Katri [sp?]

Patrick DiRoma

Richard Robbins

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Ryan Barthel

Robert Price

Ulrika Anderson

Valerie Mason

Vishnu Reddy

Hayden Brockett

Andre Braga

Scott Weinstein

Michele Birnbaum

Andrew Stern

Kevin Lachera

Ryan Chrisman

1
2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Welcome to the New
3 York City Council hybrid hearing on the Committee on
4 Transportation. Please silent all electronic
5 devices. If you have any question, please raise your
6 hand and one of us Sergeant at Arms will kindly
7 assist you. At no time-- please do not approach the
8 dais. Please do not approach the dais. Also,
9 there'll be no food or drinks allowed in the
10 Chambers. Thank you very much for your kind
11 cooperation. Chair, we are ready to begin.

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you and
13 good morning. Welcome to this morning's Committee on
14 Transportation and Infrastructure. My name is
15 Selvena Brooks-Powers, and I am the Chair of this
16 committee. Today's hearing will focus on integrating
17 and regulating micromobility options in New York
18 City. IN addition to this oversight topic, we will
19 be hearing two introductions and one resolution.
20 Intro 606, co-sponsored by Council Member Robert
21 Holden, a Local Law in relation to requiring that
22 every bicycle with electric assist, electric scooter
23 and other legal motorized vehicle be licensed and
24 registered. Intro 1131, sponsored by myself, a Local
25 Law in relation to the establishment of a taskforce

1 to study options for making street design and
2 infrastructure safer in consideration of increased
3 use of electric bicycles and related collisions. And
4 Reso 224 by Council Member Gale Brewer calling on the
5 New York State Legislature to pass and the New York
6 State Governor to sign Senate Bill 7587, Assembly
7 Bill 7833 known as Commercial E-bike Licensing Act
8 which requires the registration of bicycles with
9 electric assist used for commercial purposes and
10 create liability for employers for certain
11 violations. Micromobility devices cover a wide
12 variety of small low-speed, human or electric-powered
13 transportation devices like bicycles, scooters,
14 electric assist bicycles, also known as e-bikes, and
15 electric scooters. Over time, as battery and
16 transportation technology has improved, e-bikes, e-
17 scooters and other motorized micromobility devices
18 have increasingly appeared on our streets. The
19 Department of Transportation is tasked with
20 regulating these devices and ensuring that our shared
21 streets are safe. The City has invested considerably
22 in infrastructure to improve the safe use of
23 micromobility devices. Today, over 1,500 miles of
24 bike lanes have been implemented in the City,
25

1 including 650 miles of protected lanes, and in July
2 2020, pursuant to Local Law 74 enacted by this City
3 Council, the Department of Transportation implemented
4 a pilot program for shared e-scooters in the City.
5 Since then, DOT has continued to build on the
6 program, expanding in the Bronx and recently in
7 eastern Queens. Over time, however, problems with
8 these pilots have begun to emerge. On October 11,
9 2024, Speaker Adams with other elected officials and
10 community leaders called for an operational pause of
11 the expansion into Queens to improve on the pilot
12 through better regulation, enforcement, and safety
13 measures. As we have seen some concerns, we must
14 work to balance the use of any micromobility device
15 with public safety and street safety. Although I am
16 supportive of alternative modes of transportation, we
17 must ensure that our streets function properly and
18 safely in places where different types of transit
19 intersect. According to the Department of
20 Transportation data, since 2020 there have been 54 e-
21 bike rider deaths, 22 stand-up scooter rider deaths,
22 and 145 moped rider deaths. Injuries caused by
23 improper use of micromobility devices also continue
24 to climb. E-scooters and e-bikes operating on the
25

1
2 sidewalks or on the street without following traffic
3 signals create a dangerous environment for all and
4 should not be acceptable. Micromobility is a trend
5 that will continue to grow. It's the city's job to
6 design our streets and enforce our laws in a way to
7 ensure that our sidewalks and streets remain open and
8 safe to everyone. In terms of legislation today, I
9 will allow the sponsors of Intro 606 and Reso 224 to
10 speak on their legislation. However, I'd like to
11 discuss my legislation, Intro 1131. Intro 1131 would
12 establish a taskforce to study options for making
13 street design and infrastructure safer for
14 pedestrians, motorists, cyclists, and operators of
15 electric bicycles. The taskforce would then submit a
16 report to the Mayor and the Speaker with
17 recommendations for legislation and policy. My goal
18 with this legislation is to address street safety
19 through street design and infrastructure improvements
20 so we can officially target the physical issues at
21 the street level and address them, as well as better
22 regulate this growing form of transportation. Before
23 we begin, I would like to thank my staff and
24 committee staff for their hard work, Kevin Kotowski
25 [sp?], Senior Policy Analyst, John Basile [sp?],

1
2 Senior Policy Analyst, Mark Chen [sp?], Senior
3 Counsel to the Committee, Connor Mealey [sp?],
4 Counsel to the Committee, Adrian De Paul [sp?],
5 Senior Financial Analyst, Julian Martin [sp?], my
6 Policy and Budget Director, and Renee Taylor [sp?],
7 my Chief of Staff. I will now ask that Council
8 Member Holden provide his opening statement.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Good morning,
10 Chair Selvena Brooks-Powers and members of the
11 Council and the Public. Today, we gather to hear a
12 bill that represents a straight-forward, common sense
13 approach to one of the most pressing safety issues on
14 our streets and sidewalks. Intro 606, also known as
15 Priscilla's Law, is not about politics or fear-
16 mongering. It's about accountability. It's about
17 safety, and most importantly it's about honoring the
18 memory of Priscilla Loke and protecting New Yorkers
19 from further tragedies. Priscilla Loke was a devoted
20 advocate and cherished member of her Chinatown
21 community senselessly struck down by a Citi e-bike
22 who fled the scene. Her story is heartbreaking, but
23 tragically not unique. Between 2020 and 2023, e-
24 bikes were involved in 2,254 collision, 2,172
25 injuries and 22 deaths, and that's only the ones we

1 know about, because many of the reports are not taken
2 by police, especially if somebody fled the scene.
3 These numbers tell a grim story. The lack of
4 oversight on e-mobility devices has made our streets
5 less safe for everyone, pedestrians, cyclists, and
6 even the riders themselves, or the drivers
7 themselves. The American College of Surgeons has
8 called e-bikes an emerging public health hazard and
9 recommended that we license and register them
10 immediately. Opponents of this bill have tried to
11 make this about everything but traffic safety. They
12 deflected, exaggerated, and even stirred racial
13 unrest claiming this bill will lead to unwarranted
14 police stops, as if it breaks-- as if breaking
15 traffic laws and endangering lives should somehow be
16 excused or ignored. This defense of reckless
17 behavior is not only irresponsible, but also a slap
18 in the face to every New Yorker who demands safer
19 street. This is a fear tactic, a deliberate effort
20 to distract from the simple undeniable fact our
21 streets are dangerous, and this bill is a step
22 forward in making them safer. Priscilla's Law is
23 about holding rides accountable. Just as cars and
24 mopeds are required to display license plates, so too
25

1 should e-bikes and other e-mobility devices, because
2 they do hit people and they leave, and they don't
3 adhere to-- most of them don't adhere to traffic
4 laws, as we know. Denmark, one of the most bike-
5 friendly countries in the world has regulated e-
6 bikes, and saw deaths drop by 29 percent, serious
7 injuries by 39 percent, and single-vehicle crashes by
8 64 percent. What did they do? They licensed them.
9 That's what we're trying to do. Similarly, Holland,
10 a bike-friendly-- and other bike-friendly cities like
11 Toronto and Paris have imposed strict regulations,
12 and in some cases bans on e-bikes and e-mobility
13 after significant backlash from cyclists and
14 pedestrians alike. A visible license plate is not an
15 attack on anyone's rights. The template for this
16 kind of regulation already exists in New York City.
17 The Business Integrity Commission issues orange
18 license plates for private carters and construction
19 and debris waste companies, and the Department of
20 Consumer and Worker Protection has plates for food
21 carts and trucks. So it's being done. So I don't
22 want to hear that this can't be done by the DOT.
23 Requiring plates for e-bikes and scooters would not
24 be a novel idea. It would simply build on existing
25

1
2 practices. It's a proven tool for ensuring that
3 those who share the road also share the consequences
4 of their actions. You should receive a summons if
5 you run a red light or speed through an intersection.
6 Who would argue that? Who would argue? If you're
7 involved in an accessible, your license plate will
8 ensure you don't flee the scene, and if you do, you
9 can and will be identified. This is not about
10 punishment. It's about responsibility. The data is
11 clear, e-bikes are 19 times deadlier than traditional
12 bicycles and collisions resulting in death. And
13 since 2019, over 730 fires have been caused by
14 uncertified lithium-ion batteries, killing 30 New
15 Yorkers and injuring nearly 500. I don't know what
16 we need to really regulate these things. Those
17 numbers alone, somebody should step in here. But
18 again, the city has not done anything, and this bill
19 is two years old, by the way. Thirty-one Council
20 Members have co-sponsored. These devices when
21 unregulated pose risks far beyond collisions.
22 They're literally a matter of life and death. This
23 bill also holds companies accountable. Platforms
24 like Uber Eats and Door Dash profit from the rise of
25 e-mobility devices. They have a responsibility to

1
2 educate riders, enforce traffic laws among their
3 users and remove repeat offenders from their
4 platforms. Let me be clear, this bill is not a ban
5 on e-bikes or scooters. It is a regulation designed
6 to protect all New Yorkers whether they walk, drive
7 or ride. It ensures that we can continue to embrace
8 new technologies while keeping our streets safe and
9 holding those who use them accountable. Priscilla's
10 Law 606 is about fairness and responsibility. It's
11 about ensuring that when people share the road, they
12 also share the responsibility of making it safe for
13 everyone. Let's honor Priscilla Loke's memory and the
14 lives of all those affected by preventable tragedies.
15 Let's take a critical step towards safer streets for
16 all New Yorkers. Thank you, Chair.

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Next we will
18 hear from Public Advocate Jumaane Williams.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you,
20 Madam Chair. As mentioned, my name is Jumaane
21 Williams, Public Advocate City of New York. Thank
22 you Chair Brooks-Powers and Committee on
23 Transportation and Infrastructure for holding this
24 hearing. The increased use of micromobility vehicles
25 has resulted in a preferred nonpolluting mode of

1 transportation and faster delivery of products, and
2 our goal must be to use the technology as safely as
3 possible. Committee members will be considering two
4 bills: Council Member Holden Intro 606 and
5 Chairperson Brooks-Powers Intro 1131. I'm in strong
6 support of Chair Brooks-Powers bill Intro 1131
7 establishing a taskforce to study making street
8 design and infrastructure safer. Considering the
9 increased use of e-bikes and related collisions, this
10 bill enable legislators and government agencies to
11 determine what measures should be implemented to
12 ensure the safety and health of New Yorkers. I'm
13 reserving decisions on Intro 606 until after this
14 hearing and really understand what the proposal is.
15 I do want to thank Council Member Holden, although we
16 disagree on many of the descriptions. I do know he
17 is deeply concerned about the health of all New
18 Yorkers. I would like to know the description for
19 this bill is something as simple as the way PD has
20 now been etching bikes right now or something more
21 complex like it is the DMV. I also have some other
22 concerns I'd like to discuss now. There have been
23 over 200 fatalities and 40,500 injuries by car
24 violence this year, 10 percent of both include bike
25

1
2 riders or delivery workers. Bikes seem to face blame
3 for the reckless actions sometimes of cars and
4 trucks. Research has shown that bike laws have also
5 reduced the number of people who ride bikes which is
6 not the desired effect. I also worry that requiring
7 the registration and licensing of every bicycle with
8 electric assist, electric scooter and other legal
9 motorized vehicles, that broad definition could
10 inadvertently capture motorized wheelchairs. I hope
11 if there was a final bill language, we must--

12 [audience disruption]

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Please be
14 clear, we have over 400 people signed up to testify
15 today, and we'd like to get through them respectfully
16 regardless of their position. You will be removed
17 from this room if you are unable to govern yourselves
18 accordingly. Thank you.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: If there is
20 final language for this bill, it must ensure that
21 motorized wheelchairs are excluded. We have to be
22 clear, that if passed the legislation would have a
23 disparate impact on low-income individuals, people of
24 more color, and undocumented migrants. I know for
25 some, that doesn't cause concern, but the impact

1
2 should. Undocumented immigrants might be reluctant
3 to fill out applications to register their bicycles,
4 but they might not be more reluctant to ride the
5 bicycles. If we are also working towards reducing
6 lithium-ion battery fires, registering and licensing
7 micromobility devices might result in people hiding
8 their bicycles in their homes, not participating in
9 battery swapping programs and charging batteries at
10 home instead of utilizing outdoor charging stations.
11 Ultimately, if that were to occur, it would be
12 counterproductive to NYC's efforts to minimize the
13 fires in residential buildings. It is well-
14 documented, whether we want to admit it, that many of
15 these bills impact Black and Brown communities much
16 more than others. right now-- and people can do
17 their own research-- there is exponentially more
18 citations and tickets for people riding bikes on
19 sidewalks in Black and Brown communities than in
20 white ones. That is what occurs right now, and we
21 have to discuss that. Today, adults and youth of
22 more color riding bicycles are stopped and their
23 bicycles often confiscated. Also, interesting when
24 we're doing our research was seen that other
25 municipalities including Houston and Los Angeles and

1 San Jose repeated bike licensing attempts, finding
2 they were costly and ineffective. Some jurisdictions
3 such as Oakland and Washington, D.C. did their own
4 studies and did find that use of bike laws were an
5 excuse to harass youth and communities of more color
6 who are riding. It's also important to note that the
7 250 miles of protected bike lanes required to be
8 installed in New York City by 2026, only about 75
9 miles have been created. The fund to create a
10 licensing program would cost a lot of money and
11 require a lot of infrastructure. The DOT could also
12 widen and expand current bike lanes to ensure the
13 variance of micromobility devices such as cargo [sic]
14 bikes and delivery bikes have room to share with
15 regular bikes. While deploying traffic engineering
16 controls, the bike lanes similar to the ones on the
17 west side Harry [sic] and Forth Avenue Brooklyn that
18 are proven to be safer. Meaning a lot of the money
19 that will be spent implementing this, a lot of the
20 infrastructure could also be used to do some of the
21 things that we were supposed to do and would actually
22 have the effect that we want. And so I want to
23 discuss-- hopefully there's a response of whether or
24 not it makes sense to spend the money on the
25

1
2 licensing or the money to get the infrastructure in
3 place. We also should focus on businesses that are
4 encouraging speed like apps that are trying to get
5 people to deliver food much quicker. I say that to
6 say, there is a lot of pain in this room. There's a
7 lot of anger. There's a lot of rage. I want to make
8 sure that we honor all of that, but we don't aim it
9 at each other, because I think everybody just wants
10 people to be safer and use the streets in a safe way.
11 I would be remiss to point out that who is impacted
12 and where our rage is directed also influences the
13 policies we put forward. I say that to say just last
14 week three New Yorkers were killed on the same day in
15 different places by vehicular traffic, and many of
16 the people who are supporting this bill pushed back
17 very hard when we tried to adjust the car culture,
18 even though people are killed by it and they're
19 killed randomly. So I just wanted to-- on ourselves,
20 just unpack what we're feeling and make sure the
21 policy that we're putting forward will have the
22 desired effect and won't have an undue impact on
23 other parts of the community. So, I'd like to see
24 what the final result and the final language of the
25 bill would be, because I do understand why we're

1
2 trying to put it forward, but we want to also
3 understand what the impacts are going to be, if
4 there's another way to reach it, and is it going to
5 have the desired result. So I look forward to the
6 final language to make my decision on that bill.
7 Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
9 Next, we'll hear from Council Member Gale Brewer on
10 her bill.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you very
12 much, Madam Chair. I'm talking about a resolution.
13 It's number 224, and I want to say that I am 100
14 percent supportive of registration, insurance,
15 etcetera for those on e-bikes. The issue for me is--
16 and I understand the Holden bill completely. I just
17 don't think that New York City can do licenses. I
18 want licenses. And so I have a resolution that says
19 that the state laws that are pending that would
20 provide licenses should go into effect. Just
21 recently with the help of Senator Brad Hoylman-Sigel
22 who I think is going to be testifying recently at the
23 Midtown Community Justice Center which is a place
24 where people who have infractions that are not
25 felonies go to get their issue adjudicated. The head

1 of it, Judge Wang [sp?], pulled together many, many
2 individuals from people who are concerned about this
3 issue who've been hurt to delivery workers, to people
4 who are legally interested in the topic. A report
5 just came out today about ways that delivery workers,
6 pedestrians, and cyclists can all be protected. So,
7 I was the co-sponsor of this forum. I can't tell you
8 how many calls I get-- and just the other day I was
9 with somebody who is a member of Community Board
10 Seven, a young man who was on his bicycle. He was
11 hit by a moped and he ended up in the hospital with
12 surgery. There is no end to the discussion about how
13 dangerous this community is in our streets. We've
14 got to cut the speed. We've got to tell people
15 they're not going to get their food as quickly. Stop
16 wishing that you're going to get it so quickly, and
17 we've got to find a way for people to be licensed so
18 that we know who it is, who is on that bicycle.
19 However, I feel strongly enough so I have this
20 particular Resolution, but it has to be done, at
21 least the licensing, on the state level. We also
22 have to find a way to make sure that the apps are
23 held much more accountable. They're getting away
24 with, not murder, but hurting people. By not having-

1
2 - we don't know how many of them have information
3 about who's out on the street and where. Yet, the
4 companies and Citi bike know exactly who's on the
5 streets. We need that data also. So, I'm here to
6 say thank you for this hearing. My resolution is
7 more state-oriented, but I think it has the same
8 goal. Thank you very much.

9 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you,
10 Council Member Brewer. We're going to just pivot
11 back to Council Member Holden to read a statement.
12 Alright, I'll now ask the Committee Counsel to swear
13 in the Administration, but first I'd like to
14 acknowledge my colleagues that we are joined by
15 today. Here today we have Council Members Louis,
16 Holden, Paladino, Ariola, Marmorato, Marte, Brewer,
17 Ossé, Majority Leader Fariás, and Public Advocate
18 Williams. Council Member Restler, welcome.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. I'm Mark
20 Chen, Counsel to the Committee on Transportation and
21 Infrastructure for the New York City Council. Our
22 next panel will be from the Department of
23 Transportation, Commissioner of the New York City
24 Department of Transportation, Ydanis Rodriguez,
25 Deputy Commissioner of Transportation Planning and

1
2 Management, Eric Beaton, Assistant Commissioner for
3 Policy, Will Carry, and Assistant Commissioner for
4 Intergovernmental and Community Affairs, Rick
5 Rodriguez. I will now administer the oath. Please
6 raise your right hands. Do you affirm to tell the
7 truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth
8 before this committee and to respond honestly to
9 Council Member questions? Thank you. You may begin
10 when ready.

11 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Good morning,
12 Chair Brooks-Powers and members of the Committee on
13 Transportation and Infrastructure. I'm Ydanis
14 Rodriguez, the Commissioner for New York City
15 Department of Transportation. With me today are
16 Deputy Commissioner of Transportation Planning and
17 Management Eric Beaton, Assistant Commissioner for
18 Policy Will Carry, and Assistant Commissioner for
19 Intergovernmental and Community Affairs Rick
20 Rodriguez. Thank you for the opportunity to testify
21 on behalf of Mayor Eric Adams on the City's work to
22 enhance safety for e-bike riders, pedestrians, and
23 all road users. Before getting into the details of my
24 testimony, I hope everyone will have a great holiday,
25 and second for me, it's always great to be back home

1
2 after serving for years in this great body together
3 with many of you here. And since starting my first
4 hearing three years ago on equity, which was an issue
5 that many people feel that, you know, we will have
6 strong opinions for me on equity, but for me was--
7 this is the type of topic that we want to come to the
8 table. now ending my [inaudible] years on this
9 important topic about enhanced safety for e-bike
10 riders and pedestrians and all road-users, it's
11 another great opportunity also to come together to
12 have this great dialogue. I don't think that we are
13 so far apart. The intent of this bill is something
14 that this Administration supports, and we will get
15 into the details about, you know, this bill per say,
16 but before we would like to get into more details.
17 When I served this body for 12 years, Chaired this
18 Committee for eight years, and even now as the
19 Transportation Commissioner, I often said that our
20 work is focused on reimagining the use of public
21 space. This includes reimagining how our streets can
22 be safer, how they can better support our economy,
23 and how they can make our communities vibrant and
24 more livable. To do this, we have to be forward-
25 looking. As our streets and city evolve, we have to

1
2 meet the moment and address new challenges and seize
3 new opportunities. I want for everyone to always
4 look at the role that the New York City Charter gave
5 to DOT which is to manage more than 26 percent of the
6 land, to guarantee the safe and efficient movement of
7 people and vehicles, and that's a job that our almost
8 6,000 men and women at DOT do every day. We are in
9 an exciting time in transportation. For far too long,
10 New York City and cities across the country designed
11 streets to suit only the needs of cars, endangering
12 the safety of pedestrians and cyclists, increasing
13 air pollution, and threatening the climate. By
14 reimagining our streets to prioritize pedestrians,
15 mass transit, and cycling, we are making our streets
16 safer and the planet greener. These efforts are
17 paying off, as we are in the midst of a cycling
18 renaissance, with ridership hitting record highs year
19 after year. And always it's good to remember how New
20 York City today we have 200 million bike trips [sic]
21 last year. So there's a community of individual that
22 are using bike, including e-bike to move around our
23 great five boroughs. We have also seen that emerging
24 technology is changing how New Yorkers get around our
25 city. New modes of transportation like e-bikes, e-

1 scooters, and shared micromobility services are now
2 widely used on the city's streets. Last year, the
3 city, as I said before, had 200 million bike trips,
4 with many of those trips on e-bikes, 34.5 million on
5 Citi Bike, and over 1.8 million trips on shared e-
6 scooters. And this year, we had an all-time high of
7 cyclists cross the East River Bridges for the fourth
8 year in a row, up over eight percent from the
9 previous year, and an over 12 percent increase in
10 cycling crossing 50th Street. Some of the trips on
11 these devices replace trips in cars or for-hire
12 vehicles, helping to reduce congestion and improve
13 our environment. These new modes also increase
14 access across the city and make travel easier for
15 many people, including those who live in the
16 neighborhood with limited or no subway service. This
17 include commuters, parents taking their kids to
18 school, older adults for whom a bike uphill is now
19 more manageable, New Yorkers and visitors exploring
20 this great city, and, of course, the thousands of
21 delivery workers delivering our food and packages to
22 many of us who are sitting here today. These riders
23 are from all parts of the city, including all of your
24 districts. While the adoption of e-bikes and other
25

1 micromobility has provided additional options for
2 travel around the city, this progress also comes with
3 a range of challenges. Like many of you, we have been
4 hearing about these issues and are hard at work
5 implementing and developing solutions to address
6 them. We understand that there is much more work to
7 do, and we look forward to continuing to partner with
8 the Council to make streets safer for all road users.
9 As Mayor Adams said, everyone have to look for the
10 other group of New Yorkers to keep them safe. As
11 drivers have to look for pedestrians, cyclists also--
12 and especially those using e-bike and e-scooter--
13 they also are responsible to look for pedestrians.
14 Just as we have seen a troubling increase in
15 aggressive drivers speeding, running red lights,
16 impeding crosswalks, and blocking bike lanes and bus
17 lanes, we have also seen a significant number of e-
18 bike riders and micromobility users disobeying
19 traffic laws. Disobeying traffic laws can have deadly
20 consequences and for Mayor Adams and for all of us at
21 DOT is unacceptable. However, they are not the
22 majority. They're the small percentage as also we
23 have the small percentage of reckless drivers, and
24 that's why I say that we have a lot in common
25

1 interest when it comes to addressing how we can
2 improve safety in our city. While we have come a
3 long way from the days when there were a thousand or
4 more traffic fatalities in a year, this year there
5 have still been 242 traffic fatalities in New York
6 City, far too many. One death is too many for this
7 Administration. Reckless driving by motor vehicle
8 drivers remains by far the biggest threat to
9 pedestrian safety. So far this year, 105 pedestrians
10 were killed by cars or larger vehicles compared to
11 six killed in crashes with e-bikes, mopeds, and stand
12 up e-scooters combined.

13 [audience disturbance]

14 [gavel]

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Sergeants, I
16 ask that you just in position, because the next
17 outburst, we will have people removed. Thank you.

18 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Again, the
19 biggest threat to pedestrian safety so far this year,
20 105 pedestrian were killed by car or large vehicles
21 compared to only six killed in crashes with e-bike,
22 mopeds, and stand-up e-scooters combined. And again,
23 one death is too many for the City and especially for
24 this administration. And of the over 8,700
25

1
2 pedestrian injuries this year, nearly 90 percent were
3 injured in crashes with cars or large vehicles. I say
4 this not to diminish the very real concerns about
5 pedestrian safety from these smaller devices, but to
6 put these concerns in perspective. As we strive
7 towards Vision Zero's goal to zero traffic
8 fatalities, there's more for all of us to do to
9 enhance safety for all road users, particularly for
10 our most vulnerable road users: pedestrians,
11 especially senior citizens and children. Every road
12 user has a role to play in keeping others safe. To
13 enhance safety for the growing number of e-mobility
14 device riders, the Administration launched the Charge
15 Safe, Ride Safe action plan in the spring of 2023.
16 The plan seeks to promote the use of legal and
17 certified e-bikes, sustainable mobility option, while
18 addressing fire and street safety. The plan focuses
19 on four areas: promoting and incentivizing safe
20 battery use, increasing education and outreach to
21 electric micromobility users, advocating for
22 additional federal regulations of these devices, and
23 expanding enforcement against dangerous riding. This
24 includes steps DOT is taking to expand bike
25 infrastructure and to encourage safe operation of e-

1
2 bikes. On street design, DOT is redesigning our
3 streets to meet the moment. The agency is the first
4 one in the nation that is installing wider bike lanes
5 which creates more predictable paths and provide more
6 passing separation between bike lane users.

7 Additionally, faster users will be drawn to ride
8 further away from the curb, thus improving the
9 visibility and distance between higher-speed bike
10 lane users and pedestrians. This summer, DOT began
11 construction for a redesign of Manhattan's Second
12 Avenue, with dramatically improved bike and bus lanes
13 and pedestrian features. The new design is bringing
14 a wider bike lane to nearly 6,000 southbound cyclists
15 and micromobility users each day. This work follows
16 the installation of wider bike lanes on Third, Sixth,
17 Seventh, Ninth, and Tenth avenues in Manhattan as
18 well as on Queens Boulevard and 31st Avenue in Queens
19 and Willis Avenue and Mosholu Parkway in the Bronx.

20 The agency is also exploring installing wider bike
21 lanes in additional parts of the city, as well as
22 other treatments to enhance street safety through
23 design, including signal timing modifications,
24 enhanced delivery bike corrals, and bike boulevards
25 or other new facility types to accommodate these

1
2 modes. These redesigns follow best practices from
3 around the world, and I can say other cities are
4 looking at us on what we are doing, and they bring
5 safety benefits for everyone on our streets, not just
6 bike riders. The installation of protected bike lanes
7 reduces pedestrian deaths and serious injuries by 29
8 percent. These safety gains from protected bike
9 lanes are even more pronounced for seniors walking on
10 our streets, with these designs reducing deaths and
11 serious injuries by 39 percent. This is because
12 protected bike lanes typically reduce the crossing
13 distance and provide pedestrian refuge islands,
14 reducing the timing it takes pedestrians to cross and
15 slowing turns while improving visibility of
16 pedestrians in the crosswalks. DOT is also directly
17 providing additional mode of transportation to
18 improve travel around the city. Through the Citi
19 Bike program, more than half of New Yorkers live
20 within a five-minute walk of a Citi Bike station.
21 And for some areas outside of the Citi Bike services
22 area, the agency is offering a shared scooter
23 service, and now nearly 70 percent of the city's
24 residents have access to bike or a scooter share in
25 their neighborhood. In June, DOT expanded e-scooter

1 share program to eastern Queens, providing critical
2 connections to major transportation and commercial
3 hubs for roughly 600,000 residents. The program now
4 serves 1.2 million New Yorkers across the East Bronx
5 and Eastern Queens. Since the program launched in
6 2021, 258,000 riders have taken over 6.1 million
7 trips in those modes of transportation. The average
8 shared e-scooter trip is just over one mile, and the
9 vast majority of the trips start and end in the same
10 neighborhood, showing that the program is primarily
11 serving local residents. DOT is committed to
12 improving the service based on feedback we receive
13 from elected officials like yourselves and other
14 community stakeholders, and we have already been
15 taking steps to improve the program based on your
16 feedback, including installing scooter corrals. Our
17 goal is that those places where the scooters are
18 picked up and dropped off should be similar to Citi
19 Bike in particular location. That's our goal. They
20 should not be around sidewalk or in front of any
21 houses or in the street. On enforcement, to address
22 the culture of reckless riding behavior around the
23 use of motorized two-wheeled devices, DOT is
24 partnering with NYPD on an educational and
25

1 enforcement campaign targeted directly at riders
2 engaging in illegal behaviors in bike lanes. NYPD
3 has enforcement authority when road users violate
4 traffic laws, including e-bike riders. Enforcement
5 does not require that e-bikes be registered.
6 Enforcement focuses on the most dangerous behaviors
7 such as red light running, and early results of these
8 efforts are promising. NYPD has also conducted
9 illegal device enforcement and has removed nearly
10 20,000 illegal devices from the streets. Turning to
11 reducing battery fires from powered mobility devices.
12 In partnerships with the City Council, the
13 Administration has advanced meaningful policies to
14 promote the use of safer certified e-bikes and
15 batteries and encourage users to charge and store
16 their batteries outside of their homes. The agency
17 is creating the first-in-the-nation municipal trade-
18 in pilot program to enhance unsafe e-bikes and
19 batteries for new UL certified devices, in response
20 of Local 131 passed in this council in 2023 by a
21 great partner, Council Member Powers. We are also
22 taking steps to expand access to e-bike charging. We
23 are updating our rules to allow building owners to
24 install battery charging cabinets on the sidewalk in
25

1 front of their properties and are partnering with
2 NYCHA to install public e-bike chargers at roughly
3 170 locations thanks to a \$25 million RAISE grant
4 that DOT was able to get. We are also working with
5 the Fire Department to develop and distribute battery
6 safety materials to promote safe battery charging
7 practices and to reduce fire risks. Despite the
8 progress we are making with these efforts, more needs
9 to be done, and we all agree with that. Too many e-
10 bike riders are dying on our streets, too many
11 pedestrians fear being hit by e-bikes and mopeds that
12 are breaking the law, and too many fires continue to
13 be caused by uncertified e-bike and moped batteries.
14 The rapid growth of third-party delivery services
15 since 2010 has played a major role in driving these
16 problems. According to Department of Consumer and
17 Worker Protection, there are currently 75,000 app-
18 based restaurant delivery workers in New York City in
19 any given week. And a 2022 study shows that 46
20 percent of delivery workers use e-bikes. But let us
21 be clear, the number of delivery workers responds to
22 the demand that each of us here sometimes put on them
23 to get food fast in our homes. The third-party
24 delivery apps should be responsible for mitigating
25

1 the negative consequences created by their business
2 model, including the increase in battery fires,
3 delivery worker deaths in crashes, and unsafe riding
4 behavior on city streets. Sometimes, those delivery
5 workers only get a few minutes for them to pick up
6 the food and bring it to us, and if they don't
7 deliver during those times, sometimes they are
8 disconnected from the app. So, definitely, the
9 business model must be changed. These companies
10 currently make little effort to ensure that the
11 contractors are using safe and legal equipment or
12 receive proper safety training. Their business model
13 forces delivery workers to do whatever it takes,
14 including running red lights or going the wrong way,
15 to shave a minute or two off the delivery time, or on
16 the contrary, they can be penalized if they don't do
17 that. We are encouraged by the City's ongoing
18 partnership with the City Council on comprehensive
19 legislation to keep all road users safe by curbing
20 unsafe speeding and risky riding behavior by delivery
21 workers, enhancing delivery worker safety,
22 reestablishing order on our streets, and decreasing
23 the risk of deadly battery fires. Such legislation
24 would cover all entities making on-demand deliveries,
25

1 including apps and brick-and-mortar businesses,
2 creating a level playing field. First, the
3 legislation would require app-based delivery
4 companies to reduce a license-- to secure a license
5 from the City and to take meaningful steps to create
6 safe conditions for their workers and for all New
7 Yorkers. Licensees would be required to ensure
8 workers are using legal, UL-certified devices and to
9 provide workers with access to these safe devices
10 through trade-in or other programs. Licensees would
11 also be required to provide safety equipment, ensure
12 delivery workers complete a regular safety training
13 course, and give workers sufficient time for each
14 delivery. The license would also require the apps to
15 submit robust data on trips and crashes and to ensure
16 compliance with this requirements and to inform
17 street infrastructure planning. Second, the
18 legislation would also update the requirements for
19 brick-and-mortar businesses, requiring them to ensure
20 that their delivery workers use legal devices, as
21 well as provide safety equipment and regular safety
22 training. Companies who fail to comply would be
23 subject to increasing penalties, including fines and
24 ultimately the loss of ability to deliver in New York
25

1
2 City. With this updated regulatory approach, more
3 delivery workers would use certified batteries and
4 legal devices, wear proper safety equipment such as
5 helmets and reflective vests, have sufficient time to
6 fulfill deliveries, and follow the rules of the road.
7 This would lead to safer riding and fewer deadly
8 battery fires, saving lives and making the city's
9 streets safer for all New Yorkers. We look forward to
10 working with the Council on this proposal, especially
11 the Chair and the Speaker and the rest of this body.
12 Now, turning to legislation. First, Intro. 606,
13 sponsored by Council Member Holden which would
14 require the registration of e-bikes, e-scooters, and
15 other legal motorized vehicles. DOT understands that
16 as new modes emerge, there are both new challenges
17 and opportunities. We are currently in that moment
18 with increased micromobility use. As the Mayor has
19 said, e-bikes are a low-cost, zero-emission
20 transportation option, but they can also cause safety
21 threats to bikers, pedestrians, and New Yorkers at
22 large. People who misuse them should be accountable
23 for their actions, including the delivery app
24 companies that force faster speeds and reckless
25 behavior to increase their profits. We appreciate

1
2 and share the Council's concerns and interest in
3 promoting street safety and accountability in this
4 space. While DOT supports the intent of the bill and
5 agrees that regulation and enforcement are important
6 pieces of the puzzle, we are concerned with
7 duplicating the State's Department of Motor Vehicles
8 within DOT. The Administration already has the tools
9 to enforce against illegal behaviors; a license plate
10 is not necessary for enforcement. In addition, this
11 bill would require significant resources, as
12 discussed in the City's fiscal impact statement.
13 Registration would also lead to a focus on
14 enforcement against delivery workers, many of whom
15 are just trying to make ends meet and provide for
16 their families. These workers, who have one of the
17 most dangerous jobs in our city, can lose access to
18 shifts unless they meet strict time windows mandated
19 by the apps. It is that incentive structure that we
20 must work together to change. And as more New
21 Yorkers from all walks of life are choosing to travel
22 by e-bike and e-scooter, we are concerned about
23 increasing barriers for adoption. These sustainable
24 modes of transportation provide users with an
25 affordable and convenient transportation option, and

1
2 we should be promoting their safe and responsible
3 use. We share the concerns that lead to this
4 legislation and look forward to future discussions
5 with the Council on a comprehensive legislative
6 solution. On Intro. 1131 sponsored by Chair Brooks-
7 Powers, this bill--

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
9 I'm sorry, Commissioner, if we could just pause. We
10 have to just get the technology back up and running.
11 One moment.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good morning, folks,
13 may I have everybody's attention, please. Keep it
14 down please. I apologize for the inconvenience. We
15 are experiencing some technical difficulties. Our IT
16 staff is on it, our technical folks. It should be
17 solved in a few short minutes, and then we'll get
18 right back to the meeting. Thank you so very much
19 for your cooperation. In the meantime, please make
20 sure that you do not approach the dais. Again, do
21 not approach the dais.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Thank you. Quiet
23 please. Keep it down. Please folks, kindly have a
24 seat at this time. Please kindly have a seat at this

1
2 time. Keep it down in the chambers. Thank you.

3 Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you
5 all for your patience due to the technology end.

6 Commissioner, if you could finish your testimony.

7 Thank you.

8
9 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
10 Chair. As I said, we share the concern that lead to
11 this legislation and look forward to future
12 discussion with the Council on a comprehensive
13 legislative solution. Finally, on Intro 1131
14 sponsored by Chair Brooks-Powers. This bill would
15 create a taskforce to study and propose
16 recommendations for street design and infrastructure
17 to enhance safety. We appreciate the Council's
18 shared commitment to a comprehensive vision for e-
19 bikes and new micromobility modes. To be even more
20 effective, we encourage the Council to broaden the
21 scope of the task force to include plans for
22 regulation of these modes of transportation, rather
23 than just street design and infrastructure. We
24 support this legislation and would like to continue
25 working with the Council and other stakeholders on

1
2 legislative solutions. [speaking Spanish] In
3 conclusion, I would like to thank the Council for the
4 opportunity to testify before you today. Thank you
5 for your continued partnership as we work to make
6 this city safer for all road users. We will now be
7 happy to answer any questions.

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you,
9 Commissioner. I'm going to start off with the e-
10 scooters since that's a hot topic in particular--
11 especially in the southeast Queens community. And I
12 know we've had a number of conversations around it as
13 well. In July 2020, the City Council enacted Local
14 Law 74 requiring DOT to create a pilot program for
15 shared e-scooters in the City. On August 17, 2021,
16 the agency launched the first days of its e-bike
17 pilot program in the east Bronx. The second phase of
18 the pilot was launched on June 22, 2022, doubling the
19 size of the fleet to 6,000 vehicles. what has DOT
20 learned from the first two phases of the e-scooter
21 share pilot programs, and how have these lessons been
22 implemented in the current phase three in eastern
23 Queens?

24 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: I will start
25 answering and then Assistant Commissioner Will Carry

1
2 can also add information. As you said, 2020, Council
3 Member Fernando Cabrera, Council Member Rafael
4 Espinal carried those bills, and I worked with them
5 when I use to the Chair the Committee of
6 Transportation. We heard from them that they wanted
7 to bring e-scooters in area that Citi Bike was not
8 going. We saw a safe expansion of e-scooter, and
9 that's why as I shared before, when you look at what
10 we learned in the Bronx and now how we expanding to
11 your district and other parts in Queens, what we know
12 is that there's more than five million users of e-
13 scooter. Will can--

14 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: Thank you,
15 Commissioner. Thank you, Chair for the question.
16 After we did the first phase of the program in the
17 Bronx, we did an evaluation report, and we looked at
18 a number of different factors. We looked at how
19 often the scooters were used. They were quite
20 heavily used, and we had tens of thousands of users
21 and hundreds of thousands of trips, and we looked at
22 safety and our conclusions were that the operation of
23 the program was quite safe. And then we looked at
24 issues in terms of organization in the street,
25 including our use of corrals which we found often

1
2 helped to sort of better organize the street and make
3 sure that scooters were-- e-scooters were properly
4 parked. As the Commissioner mentioned in his
5 testimony, the combined service area now covers 1.2
6 million New Yorkers. We have about 260,000 active
7 users who've take 6.1 million trips. Since the
8 program was launched in Queens this year, we've had
9 650,000 trips and over 40,000 new accounts created
10 from residents of the new expansion area.

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: What has been
12 the reception of phase three of the e-scooter share
13 program that was implemented in eastern Queens and
14 how is DOT factoring in the community concerns?

15 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: As I said
16 in the-- thank you for the question, Chair. As I
17 said in my response to the last question, we've seen
18 a robust response. We've seen a lot of people using
19 the service and we're heartened by that. we have, you
20 know, participated in a lot of community outreach to
21 get feedback from the community including 35
22 briefings with elected officials, Community Boards
23 and other community stakeholders, and that was just
24 prior to the launch. We've done on-street and online
25 public education and feedback prior to launch, and

1 then we did six weeks of on-street education and
2 outreach following the launch. You know, we are
3 hearing, you know, from you, from your constituents,
4 from others in the community about concerns that, you
5 know, e-scooters are often not parked correctly. And
6 we remain committed to working with the community and
7 with the companies to make improvements, and we're in
8 the process of planning and installing new bike
9 corrals to help organize scooters and reduce the
10 number of improperly parked scooters. The three
11 scooter share operators, Bird, Lime, and Veo, are
12 working to quickly address these concerns by hiring
13 additional staff locally to improve the parking of
14 scooters. And operators are currently temporarily
15 reducing their fleets in the winter months which help
16 reduce improperly parked scooters. And as the
17 Commissioner mentioned, we're also looking to move
18 towards a corral. We have corrals in the scooter
19 zone now, but to create additional corrals to help
20 better organize the street.

22 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

23 Commissioner, you mentioned during your testimony
24 that between Citi Bike and scooter share, nearly 70
25 percent of the city's residents have access to bike

1 or scooter share in their neighborhoods. How is this
2 measured? Is that 70 percent of neighborhood
3 tabulation areas weighted by population have access
4 to one of these micromobility options, or is it a
5 more granular approach? For example, 70 percent of
6 people live within a certain number of yards of these
7 options?
8

9 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: DOT and Eric
10 Beaton, also he can explain a little bit more, but
11 DOT determined this figure by overlaying the Citi
12 Bike and scooter share services areas with recent
13 census data.

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: And it's a
15 fairly straightforward overlay. Just take the census
16 data around where people live and which of those
17 tracks are covered by one of the two service areas.

18 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you for
19 that. I'm just going to jump a little bit around. In
20 October of this year, City Council Speaker Adams, New
21 York State Senator Leroy Comrie and community and
22 civic leaders called for an operational pause of the
23 e-scooter program to build in improvements for
24 resuming the program. How does DOT incorporate
25 community feedback when implementing the program?

1
2 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: The community
3 feedback and the feedback especially coming from you
4 as elected officials are voices that we definitely
5 heard. You know, as a former Council Member, that I
6 hold a seat that now is served by Council Member
7 here, Carmen De La Rosa, we know that, you know, the
8 Council Members have the ear of the community. The
9 community come and speak about it. And we, as I said
10 before, we are not denying that there's a percentage
11 of reckless users of the e-bike or scooter, but what
12 I-- but we understand is explaining that most of
13 them, most of the people who use e-bike, most of the
14 people who use scooter, they use it to work or they
15 use to work, you know, where they have to go far
16 distance from where they started. We all have to
17 think about it. How we used to order food-- you
18 know, I live in Inwood, and the restaurant only used
19 to deliver like 10 blocks from where I used to live
20 20 years ago. Now, if you place an order from Inwood,
21 whoever has the restaurant on 165 in Riverdale, they
22 will deliver to us. so it's about, you know, the
23 electric e-bike and scooter also allow us, the
24 consumers also, to be able to have food further from
25 where we live. So, I think that we have learned a

1 lot. That's what I said, that we are not far apart.
2 We all care for the safety. Mayor Adams care for the
3 safety. We are committed to work especially on your
4 bill. We should have a taskforce that we look on
5 everything that we've been doing, what we have
6 learned. And we-- we have to realize 200 million bike
7 trips in the city last year, those individuals
8 leaving H-- 51 [sic] Council District. Those
9 individuals work in those council. They're here.
10 They are not going to be going. So we need to learn
11 this is just a part of improvement and then focusing
12 about some area that we can improve.
13

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
15 The Speaker and other elected officials call for
16 [inaudible] out of concern about safety hazards that
17 are created when e-scooters are left on streets--
18 bless you-- which can obscure pedestrians and other
19 road users. How is DOT and the scooter vendors
20 responding to these important concerns?

21 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Yeah. What I--
22 and Eric in his role as the Assistant Commissioner on
23 Planning, he also can add and will too, but what I
24 can say that we heard the Speaker. We heard the
25 Council Members. We heard the community. What we

1
2 are saying is about the work that we are doing right
3 now is installing as many corrals as possible.

4 [inaudible] thinking about what program that it's
5 going to be basic about-- I can-- I or whoever can go
6 and get this scooter and dropping any place that I
7 want. The model must be that the scooter will be
8 pick up, will be drop-off in those corrals that we
9 are installing.

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: And just to
11 provide some numbers there, Chair. To date, we've
12 installed over a 100 of these parking corrals in
13 Queens and 150 in the Bronx, and in 2025 we were
14 aiming to install another 500 across the two service
15 areas. Happy to provide further information on
16 specific locations.

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Our
18 communities have also called for DOT to take greater
19 responsibility in holding the e-scooter program
20 vendors accountable for safety issues resulting from
21 their operation. How has DOT been working with these
22 companies to address this issue?

23 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: The Department
24 of Consumer and Worker Protection, you know, been
25 doing great work, but also we-- at DOT, you heard our

1 testimony. What we say have been clear. It's not
2 only he delivery workers. We have to go through
3 those companies that only give them sometimes five,
4 15 minutes for them to pick up the food and bring it
5 to us. So, definitely, we will continue working with
6 them. Everyone have to do their part. You know, we
7 from this administration role had to-- we are
8 committed to continue doing our part. You are doing
9 your part, too, but also those are companies who are
10 making millions of dollars, they also have to think,
11 because as Mayor said, whoever's doing business with
12 the City, we have to rethink about the safety of the
13 city, and if not, then they need to relocate in other
14 places.
15

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: As you can
17 imagine, I have a lot of questions on the bills, on
18 this topic, but because we have a lot of members that
19 have questions, I'm going to pause on my questions,
20 allow them to ask theirs, and then I'll come back to
21 mine. I am going to start with Council Member Holden
22 followed by Council Member Ossé followed by Council
23 Member Brewer. I just ask everybody to please adhere
24 to the two-minute rule. I'm not sure why that clock
25 says five, but it's two.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Hold on one moment, Council Member. I'm sorry. And before you start your questions, do you have your statement yet that you want to read?

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: No, nothing.

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay.
Alright, you can go ahead, begin.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Commissioner, I'm a little puzzled by your testimony, because you know it's such a big problem in this city. If you look at the e-vehicles, especially, 90-- I would say-- I've stood on some corners. 95 percent of the delivery guys or 95 percent of the e-bike riders do not adhere to any traffic laws. What's your studies indicate?

COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Deputy Commissioner Will would like to answer that question.

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: So, it's-- Council Member, thank you for the question. This is an important issue. We are in the process of collecting more data on--

[audience disruption]

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Sergeant, if
3 you see someone making any sounds, please have them
4 removed.

5 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: Anybody
6 who walks around the streets of New York can see this
7 issue, and I'm sure when you stand on street corners
8 in your district or when other members stand on
9 street corners in their district, they will see that
10 there's too much dangerous riding by e-bike riders,
11 and by other users of these devices.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Right. We know
13 that. We know that, and I stated that. All you need
14 to do is look around any block in New York City, you
15 will see it. So, that's why I'm puzzled that DOT
16 doesn't have numbers right away. You should-- you
17 have the technology. You have the data. You have
18 the personnel. You can figure this out, except you
19 chose not to, because of some regulations that you
20 feel it's going to be imposing-- it's going to, you
21 know, impact one group or another. I don't care
22 about-- a red light does not-- is not racist. A red
23 light is for safety. I drive an e-vehicle, by the
24 way. Why shouldn't I ride without a license plate?
25 I mean, because I-- it's a car, but it's an e-

1
2 vehicle. And that's what these, you know, moped or
3 whatever, you know, and these other things, these e-
4 bike are. So, you don't have the numbers. That says
5 a lot about your agency. You should be able to fire
6 off, yeah, on this corner or that corner, you know,
7 85 percent, 95 percent. When something's an
8 epidemic, and that's what this is, and it's a health
9 hazard, a safety hazard, that should be priority
10 number one with DOT. Thank you, Chair.

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

12 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: I got say
13 something. Because in life we never know-- for 12
14 years I was on that side passing numbers of bill,
15 more than 40 bills that made the agency accountable.
16 Now I'm in this side. I got to tell you one thing,
17 we all should be proud. Under previous
18 commissioners, under leadership that we are right
19 now, that we run the best and the largest Department
20 of Transportation in the United States. We only--
21 and this is the important conversation that we're
22 having right now. But when we walk out from this
23 building, everything from sidewalk to signal to
24 roadway to pavement is this agency. This agency, you
25 heard in my testimony, one of the area that we want

1
2 to look at is to bring the app company, you know, and
3 work with some bill with you guys, elected officials,
4 so that also we get more report from the data that
5 they use. But as someone that only need to stand in
6 the corner in the street, most delivery workers they
7 do a great job and dangerous job. They bringing the
8 food to our apartments. There's a percentage that
9 they are--

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing]

11 Commissioner, it's--

12 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: [inaudible]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Commissioner, if
14 you're going to focus only on delivery guys, I get
15 that, but a Citi Bike, e-bike, hit Priscilla Loke.
16 Killed her September 5th. Again, it's a year. We met
17 with the Mayor, by the way with advocates and also
18 transportation alternatives, alright? The Mayor said
19 he supports my bill 606. The fact that it didn't
20 trickle down to your agency is puzzling.

21 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you,
22 Council Member. Council Member Ossé?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Thank you, Chair.
24 Under this bill, would active riders of e-bikes be
25 liable to be pulled over by the police for issues or

1
2 suspected issues relating to the licensing and/or
3 registration on the e-bikes? Can I get more time
4 then if I have to repeat the question? Under this
5 bill, would active riders of e-bikes be liable to be
6 pulled over by the police for issues or suspected
7 issues relating to the licensing and/or registration
8 on the e-bikes?

9 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, Council
10 Member, you heard what we said. We don't-- we
11 support the intent of this bill, the intent of this
12 bill. We don't support this bill as the Council
13 Member is introducing it today. We are more than
14 happy to work with the Council Members, to work with
15 the Chair and the Speaker and all of you in a
16 comprehensive taskforce.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Okay. And which
18 agency would be responsible for issuing tickets if
19 this bill was implemented?

20 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: This bill is
21 something that we don't support. We support the
22 intent, and what we support here today is the
23 taskforce, the bill presented by the Chair that is
24 calling to create a taskforce.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Do you predict that
3 this legislation could lead to a reduction in the
4 total number of e-bikes used in the city or a number
5 of e-bikes trips taken in the city?

6 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: We are-- yes,
7 supporting the intent of the bill.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: I mean, I just
9 would-- like, I would like some answers to the
10 questions. I hear that you're not supportive of the
11 bill. But like, if I ask a question on if this bill
12 was implemented, you know, with conversations between
13 the Council and DOT, like you got to tell me answers
14 on if it was implemented. Like, do you predict that
15 the legislation could lead to a reduction of the
16 total number of e-bikes?

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And just to
18 echo Council Member Ossé, it is important to
19 understand in the event that this bill were to be
20 implemented, what that outcome could be, because that
21 helps to inform whether or not this bill should/can
22 go forward.

23 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: So, again, the
24 answer is yes, it definitely would reduce.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Okay.

1
2 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: And again this
3 is-- this bill is for everyone, for everyone--

4 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: [interposing] Yes,
5 I just needed the yes. Which agency or agencies
6 would be responsible for issuing tickets? This is
7 the question I asked before.

8 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Well, enforcement
9 is the NYPD.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Okay. When
11 obtaining a license plate for a car or other motor
12 vehicle that currently requires one, an individual
13 must go through a multi-step process including
14 presenting identification and proof of address to a
15 government body. Would a similar process be required
16 for e-bikes in this case if this bill was
17 implemented?

18 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: I think
19 the answer is we don't know yet.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Okay.

21 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: It will
22 depend on the details of the legislation. I think
23 it's not very specific on that at this time.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Okay, thank you.
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Council
3 Member Brewer?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you. A
5 couple questions. First of all, just-- you mentioned
6 licensees and your suggestion should be required to
7 have safety equipment, regular safety training,
8 etcetera. Just so you know, we have a bill that had
9 a hearing in Consumer, Intro 20 of 2024, that does
10 exactly. So we'd love your support of that bill, just
11 so you know, in the Consumer Committee. Number two,
12 I have-- we have an Intro that says licensing, but on
13 the State level. Would you support something like
14 that? Because I don't think that on the city level,
15 we do licensing. So I'm just wondering would you
16 support it on the state level.

17 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: We will-- more
18 than happy to sit down with you--

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing]
20 Because the Intro, it's being discussed today.

21 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: to talk about--
22 yeah.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Number three is
24 the issue of apps and what they should do to be
25 responsible. Apps, I think, should use their

1
2 technology to play a big role in street safety. Data
3 shows that when people are riding the wrong way on
4 one-way streets, data can show that. It shows how
5 fast they can go. The one question I have is, do you
6 support a speed limit? I believe Citi Bike is now
7 18. I think it should be 15, and same thing for
8 delivery people. Do you support a speed limit for
9 these bikes?

10 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: We support and
11 we're working to take any step that is needed to
12 improve safety for everyone. And probably-- if
13 there's an idea of looking at reducing the speed
14 limit, probably the best way to go is to think about
15 a pilot program that we can think about any
16 particular area. And again, more than happy to
17 follow that conversation with you, Council Member.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay. Because
19 also with the apps, I know that data is always
20 available, but the apps have the data. I don't
21 believe-- and you can tell me if the city agencies
22 have the data. Apps know when you're on the
23 sidewalk. Apps know when you're going too fast.
24 Would you suggest that the apps share that data,
25 mandatory, with the City so that we would know? Now,

1
2 I am not interested in people getting arrested,
3 particularly the delivery people, but I do think--
4 with all due respect, I'm a big supporter of the
5 Police Department. There's no way in hell they can
6 arrest or stop all of these bikes, particularly if
7 they don't have licenses. So my question is, what
8 else can we do to slow them down, pay attention to
9 the rules of the road? Having this data might help.
10 Are you asking for it? Do you think you would
11 mandate that it be given to the city agencies?

12 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Yes, Council
13 Member, and as you know, when we were serving
14 together we passed a bill that mandated Citi Bike to
15 share the data to us, something that they were not
16 mandated to do by law, and we passed the bill
17 actually. I believe that all those app companies, and
18 that's what I say in the testimony, definitely, they
19 should share all the data, because you know, everyone
20 has to do their part, and sharing the data is very
21 important to me.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, because we
23 have a bill to do that, that I've-- will be
24 introducing that we're drafting now. Finally, just
25 in terms of the batteries, not directly, but I'm

1
2 really concerned and I have passed laws, and you are
3 also, about the fire. Groups like Pop Wheels or
4 companies like Pop Wheels, are they allowed now off
5 the pilot to be able to be installed in different
6 neighborhoods so that batteries do not get charged at
7 home?

8 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: I want to say
9 just a little bit of what we are doing, and then Will
10 will follow that one. As you know, we work together
11 with the Council when we came to this swapping e-bike
12 and some Council Members including Council Member
13 Rivera, we were there at Union Square, and what we
14 know is that a number of delivery workers, they took
15 advantage of being able to be part of the pilot
16 program, that they brought in old dead battery and
17 they were able to charge it. Right now, we are also
18 working to-- with a couple million dollars, \$2
19 million dollars, that we will be able to work with
20 hundreds of delivery workers, and we're going to be
21 exchanging the old e-bike and battery for new one and
22 certified one. So we are not waiting for any bill.
23 Working together, we've taken some necessary steps
24 for the safety of pedestrian, but also for the safety
25 of their own delivery workers and even in those

1
2 residents who live in buildings that many fire have
3 happened because of old batteries.

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
5 Thank you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Next, we will
8 hear from Council Member Marmorato followed by
9 Council Member Paladino, followed by Council Member
10 Narcisse.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Thank you so
12 much, Chair. So I'm going to try to be as quick as
13 possible. So just to give you a heads up, I'm in the
14 northeast Bronx, and we have an e-scooter program
15 that is an absolute disaster. Dropping my child off
16 at school, within less than five minutes I saw three
17 violations. One scooter parked on the property of
18 the private school where a parent probably took their
19 child to the school. Two, one blocking the middle of
20 the sidewalk, and another one where it was just
21 thrown in the street. My community is not set up or
22 designed to have corrals in the lower density portion
23 of the district. A lot of those complaints from my
24 district are coming from those portions of the
25 district. I have reached out to the Commissioner,

1
2 the Bronx Commissioner to create corrals by the train
3 stations, because they are scattered all over the
4 place and thrown on the street, oversaturated. I
5 feel like I'm not getting any help, and I have
6 reached out to Lime myself, and no response, no
7 accountability until we started documenting
8 everything, how the crosswalks are blocked, people's
9 front of their gates, the Limes are just thrown.
10 This is about the sharing scooter program, because I
11 feel like when you own your own bike and you own your
12 own scooter you have a little more respect for the
13 road and everything around you. I feel like these
14 people have absolutely no respect. And I want to
15 know, since the pilot program, when did-- alright,
16 here we go. 152-- this is from you guys, DOT. 152
17 reported crashes in the first 12 months of the
18 program. Nearly half of the riders who responded to
19 DOT's e-scooter survey, 44 percent report riding on
20 sidewalk, and 30 percent reported feeling safer
21 riding on the sidewalks than in the street. How do
22 you make that a permanent program if they're breaking
23 the law? They're telling you. You did a survey and
24 they're telling you we're riding on sidewalks. I've
25 seen it. My police have told us that there's

1
2 robberies now taking place and they're using these e-
3 scooters to ride away. It's a very-- in the last 28
4 days there were five incidents in the 49th Street--

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
6 Council Member, if you could ask your question,
7 please.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Okay. My
9 question, sorry. How can you renew this program and
10 when is this program-- where's the contract? How do
11 I get a copy of the contract? I FOIA request. I'm
12 not going to get it until June. When can I get it?
13 How can I get it? And when will the contract be up?

14 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, more than
15 happy to share a copy of that contract, you know,
16 you, the Chair, the Council and that's the first
17 thing, sharing the contract language. More than
18 happy to work with you. Second, more than happy to
19 walk through your district.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: You have to
21 see it.

22 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: I will. I will.
23 And the third thing is that I feel that we need to
24 focus on those reckless one. My point is that it's
25 thinking about sometimes that people say, oh, those

1 who use e-bike, scooter, they should not be here.
2 They're here already, and when someone use a scooter
3 instead of a vehicle, they contribute to the
4 environment. It's good for their health and it's
5 good for the economy. However, those percentages
6 that you describing, that they're the reckless one,
7 we as an agency who work with a company are committed
8 to work to make those company also accountable and
9 also continue doing the educational, and they--

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: [interposing]
12 They don't do the education. We've asked lime to
13 come to the district. They refuse. Not until
14 recently they mentioned in an email that they want to
15 come to the district. I've been in office for 11
16 months. I've asked in the past. They won't do it.
17 They're supposed to do it regularly. The
18 Commissioner told me, Bronx Commissioner told me they
19 should be doing it regularly. They have not once did
20 it. I've never seen them in my district doing
21 education. Enough is enough. We've tried. We don't
22 want them in our community. They're dangerous.
23 They're a hazard to people. We can't have any more
24 people getting hurt.

25 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Next we'll
hear from Council Member Paladino.

COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Good afternoon.

COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: good afternoon.

COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: I want to
credit my two colleagues here who just spoke, of
course Bob Holden and Christy Marmorato. I don't
want to waste any time because the clock is ticking
and as soon as that bell rings, I get cut off. So
let's make this real quick and real easy. This is
probably the most simplistic, common sense, simple
bill that we need passed. I do not understand why we
have to complicate the mere fact that these motorized
vehicles have taken over our streets, every borough.
I do not understand, excuse me Bob, how that bottom
poster right there, two lanes with a corral of
bicycles helps our buses to make their Y turns, help
our truck drivers who have to deliver and make
deliveries in our city-- how does this work? How
does that help a pedestrian who's trying to cross the
street? These scooters are running rampant all over,
unlicensed, unregistered, uninsured. The City, the
people of this city have spoken. They do not like

1
2 it. We don't like what has happened to every single
3 street. Now, I need to know when you mentioned about
4 taking Bob's bill here and making some alterations to
5 it, what alterations do you want to make to a simple
6 bill that only requires that people are held
7 responsible? Christy brought up a good point. I
8 have it in my district, too. They're riding on the
9 sidewalks. They have taken full advantage. And as
10 far as our delivery people go, well you know what,
11 our pizza places used to hire delivery boys or girls
12 to deliver food. I don't want to hear about this
13 other stuff, that we are being racially-- this has
14 become a black and white issue. This is baloney.
15 You're taking transit and making it a racial issue?
16 Absolutely not. This is a safety issue. We don't
17 like it. We don't want it, and we want it changed.
18 If we're stuck with it, big changes has got to
19 happen. Thank you very much everybody.

20 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: So, New York
21 City is the most density city in the whole nation.
22 New York City is a place only composed by 350 square
23 mile.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Yeah, we know
25 that.

1
2 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Let me answer
3 the-- let me answer--

4 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: [interposing]
5 That's the whole point, that we don't--

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
7 Sergeant if you've observed someone that has had an
8 outburst just now, please have them removed. We will
9 have order in this chamber today. Thank you.
10 Council Member, if you could wrap up with your
11 question.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: As soon as--
13 because I will have further once the Commissioner
14 speaks.

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: You can come
16 back to the second round. We have other members that
17 need to ask questions, and we have over 400 people
18 who have signed up to testify today, and I hope you
19 going to stay with me.

20 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: So, Chair, as I
21 was saying, those bicycles that you see there parking
22 near the bike lane, those are the same workers that
23 they getting ready to deliver the food for someone
24 that got to their apartment and placed an order
25 through on one of those apps. As I was saying, and

1
2 it is important that we all have context in this
3 conversation. As I say, New York City's a place of
4 only 350 square mile of 8.6 million people, 62
5 million visitors coming last year, construction going
6 on all over the places, and we also have 80 percent
7 of New Yorkers are placing an order once a week, and
8 24 percent of New Yorkers are placing an order four
9 times a week. So delivery from Amazon, UPS, Fed-Ex,
10 and also to get our food. So, the street doesn't
11 belong only for people that own buildings. The
12 street is a public access, and it is our
13 responsibility under the charter of New York City to
14 manage our 26 percent of the land to give you space
15 for the safe and efficient movement of people in
16 vehicles, and e-bike, regular bike and scooter, they
17 are in the city. Our job is to make those, a small
18 percentage reckless, accountable and to work with
19 those company for them also to do their job.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
21 Next, we'll hear from Council Member Narcisse
22 followed by Council Member Restler followed by
23 Ariola.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Good morning or
25 good afternoon at this time. Thank you, Chair.

1
2 Thank you, Commissioner, for being here. I have a
3 few question which I'm trying to debunk the whole
4 thing here. The definition-- can you give me by your
5 thinking the definition of legal motorized vehicle?
6 It is very broad, and one of my concern is about
7 wheelchair. Will wheelchair be a part of it because
8 it's motorized?

9 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: Council
10 Member, thank you for the question. Just to clarify,
11 you're asking what categories of vehicles would be--

12 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: [interposing]
13 The definition of legal motorized vehicle, it's very
14 broad. Would that include electrical chair like the
15 wheelchairs.

16 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: I don't
17 believe so, but we can follow up with you on that.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Will there be a
19 different--

20 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]
21 Council Member--

22 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: course for
23 commercial license if we have to license and a
24 personal license? What do you think? What's your
25 thought?

1
2 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Any [inaudible]
3 that we have, and I want also to follow up to
4 distinguish. There's vehicle that they must have
5 their registration. They will be registered by the
6 Department of Motor Vehicle. If they have a number,
7 a big number, and those mopeds are in that category.
8 We are speaking here-- it's about, especially about
9 electrical bike. That's what we are, you know, having
10 this conversation, the bill that is calling to
11 mandate to have registration and license for
12 individual who use e-bike. We said before, we agree
13 with the intent, but we believe that mandating
14 registration with licenses is not a solution. We can
15 work-- we've been doing work on education,
16 enforcement, redesigning. We will continue doing
17 more, and we believe by using those three E [sic] of
18 Vision Zero, we can improve safety big time.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Okay. What is
20 the target fee for the registration, if any? And
21 many devices are continued to be in New York City
22 that would be subject to the proposed ordinance that
23 we have right now. What is-- let me finish my
24 question, because my time is due. Think about it.
25 What will it cost the Department to set up and

1
2 operate the registration program annually? Do we
3 have a ballpark number? If do, share. We
4 anticipating a need to train law enforcement to how
5 to tell the difference between a bicycle and electric
6 and motorized vehicle.

7 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Thank
8 you. I think the fee would be actually up for further
9 regulation and further analysis on the cost of
10 implementing the bill. I believe in our fiscal
11 impact statement we said the total would be in the
12 neighborhood of about \$19 million.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Are we
14 anticipating a need to train law enforcement on how
15 to tell the difference between a bicycle and
16 electrical-- I mean, electrical bike or motorized?

17 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: PD can enforce,
18 and as I said before, almost 20,000 of those e-bike
19 being removed the street by Chief Rivera and his team
20 at NYPD Traffic Division [inaudible].

21 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: And by the way,
22 thank you, Chair, but sometimes the speed limit that
23 those motorized scooters are going on our streets are
24 dangerous. Thank you.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you,
3 Council Member. I'm going to ask you just to respond
4 and then we're going to move on.

5 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: We agree.
6 Council Member, we agree that everyone as Mayor Adams
7 has said has to look for others for everyone to be
8 safe, and as we have-- always focusing on, you know,
9 making the case that ultimately larger numbers of
10 fatalities and people ending in critical condition
11 are those who drive vehicles, cars, and trucks and
12 other things. There's a percentage involved those
13 who use e-bike and scooter, and we working to address
14 because everyone has to do their part. In my
15 campaign on the Vision Zero, it was only before about
16 drivers look for pedestrians. Now we're also
17 focusing on the Get Smart Before You Start, educating
18 those who use e-bike and also telling those who use
19 e-bike also look for pedestrian, because it is a
20 responsibility. Yes, we should not have anyone riding
21 e-bike in our sidewalk. Yes, we should not have e-
22 bike that doesn't look for pedestrians, especially
23 the senior citizen. And that's what I say, we agree
24 in most of the approach that we have with this, and
25 we are committed to work with the Council on how we

1
2 can put a comprehensive plan to improve safety for
3 everyone.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: thank you.

5 Safety is very important. I'm scared for--

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]

7 Thank you, Council Member.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: older, for the
9 seniors, for the children around the school building.

10 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you,
11 Council Member.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Council
14 Member Restler.

15 CHAIRPERSON RESTLER: Chair Brooks-
16 Powers, thank you for your leadership. It's great to
17 be back at the Transportation Committee. I used to
18 be on it. I don't get to be anymore, but I show up
19 anyway sometimes. I miss you, too. So, thank you,
20 Commissioner and DOT team. You know, I've had close
21 encounters with e-bikes on the streets of the 33rd
22 Council District. It's one of the concerns that we
23 hear most frequently in our office is that people are
24 concerned about safety, and you know, I want to work
25 together with your team to improve safety in our

1 community for everybody. I know that's a priority of
2 yours. It's certainly a priority of mine, for
3 pedestrians, for cyclist, for drivers, for all of us.
4 I just want us to take evidence-based approaches that
5 are going to make the most consequential difference.
6 You know, when I look at the data so far for 2024 of
7 the 103 people who have been killed on the streets of
8 New York City, far too much traffic violence. One
9 was caused by an e-scooter. Two were caused by
10 bikes. Five were caused by mopeds or motorcycles
11 which are already required to be registered by the
12 DMV. Too many of them are not. That is a problem.
13 95 were caused by cars, 92 percent. so when we look
14 at what's an ev-- you know, where we need to focus
15 the most of our attention, it's the cars that are
16 killing people on the streets of New York City,
17 overwhelmingly. 90-something percent of the deaths
18 this year have been caused by cars. So, 22 cyclists,
19 though, have been killed on the streets of New York
20 City and we need to do more to protect their lives as
21 well. Is there any evidence when you look at other
22 municipalities, look at the research that your team
23 has done, that would suggest that registration of e-
24 bikes would lead to fewer pedestrian deaths in New
25

1
2 York City? And Commissioner or Eric whoever would
3 like to answer?

4 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: We do agree with
5 you, and I said-- and when I did my opening testimony
6 that the larger numbers of fatalities involve, yes,
7 drivers. There's a percentage who involve-- small
8 percentage that involve scooters and we do agree that
9 the main targets to be addressed in those negative
10 behavior are those who drive a vehicle. However,
11 when Mayor Adams went to the Upper West Side--

12 CHAIRPERSON RESTLER: [interposing]
13 Commissioner, just because I'm tight on time, could
14 you answer the question?

15 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Yeah. When we
16 went to the Upper West Side, y'all were there, and
17 when I hear in any district where the Mayor hold a
18 community meeting, they ask about what can you do
19 with those reckless riders of scooter, it's something
20 that is happening in our city. So we focusing--
21 Vision Zero focusing on drivers, but we also know
22 that there's a percentage of reckless individual who
23 use e-bike and scooter.

24 CHAIRPERSON RESTLER: Right, but would--
25 sorry, my question, again, was would registration of

1
2 e-bikes lead to fewer pedestrian fatalities? Mr.
3 Beaton, would you please respond? Or somebody. I
4 just need-- I'm looking for an answer to the
5 question.

6 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: ON behalf of the
7 agency as the Commissioner--

8 CHAIRPERSON RESTLER: [interposing]
9 Please.

10 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: I gave you the
11 answer, and I--

12 CHAIRPERSON RESTLER: [interposing] But
13 you didn't answer the question.

14 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: I can add my
15 answer, is that we don't-- we believe on the intent
16 of this bill, but we don't support the bill as it
17 say. We do believe that--

18 CHAIRPERSON RESTLER: [interposing] Is
19 there any evidence that would indicate that
20 registration of e-bikes would lead to fewer serious
21 crashes or deaths on the streets of New York City?

22 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: We don't
23 necessarily have-- agree with that. What we agree is
24 that--

1
2 CHAIRPERSON RESTLER: [interposing] You
3 don't agree that there is any evidence--

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
5 Sergeant, if you've observed someone with an
6 outburst, please remove them now.

7 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: What we agree is
8 that we need to look into the comprehensive plan of
9 this program and that's why we support Chairman bill
10 to create a taskforce to address this issue.

11 CHAIRPERSON RESTLER: Okay. I just-- I
12 think where we need greater accountability--

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
14 Council Member, if you could just wrap.

15 CHAIRPERSON RESTLER: I'll just wrap in
16 10 seconds. Where we need greater accountability is
17 on these app companies, and we need to make sure that
18 they are prioritizing safety, that they are providing
19 legal vehicles to their workers. Right now it is
20 incentivized for them to get from point A to point Z
21 as quickly as possible. Speed is the only thing that
22 is prioritized. They get paid more when they deliver
23 faster. What we need is for-- to be giving more work
24 out to the delivery workers who follow the rules of
25 the road, who keep our streets safe. That's what we

1
2 should be incentivizing with these app companies. We
3 should be paying more compensation for the workers
4 who follow the rules, and we need to make sure that
5 they have legal vehicles. Those are the things that
6 I think will help us the most. I don't understand
7 how registration improves safety in our communities.
8 Thank you very much.

9 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. And
10 Council Member, you didn't hear when I read my
11 testimony, because-- okay, okay. So, if you read it,
12 there's a paragraph-- there's two paragraph dedicated
13 on how-- what we need to focus about those app
14 companies the hardest.

15 CHAIRPERSON RESTLER: Thank you, Chair.

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
17 Next we'll hear from Council Member Ariola followed
18 by Council Member Rivera followed by Council Member
19 De La Rosa.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Thank you for
21 coming, Commissioner. Thank you, Chair, for the
22 time. Commissioner, I have to say that your
23 opinions, the agency's opinions, your testimony here
24 today seems to be widely unpopular with the entire
25 panel. It's also according to my colleague, Bob

1
2 Holden, the author and prime sponsor of this bill, it
3 is unpopular with the Administration, because the
4 Mayor supports it. It's also popular with the
5 people. What I see being heard here today are bills
6 that complement each other. They're bills that are
7 built for safety, safety for the people you're
8 talking about, the deliveristas, and we'll use them
9 as an example. According to NYPD stat which does
10 have the numbers for pedestrians, motorcycle,
11 scooter, and vehicles fatalities, it shows that year
12 to date there are more fatalities for those people
13 who are driving scooters, motorized vehicles that are
14 on two wheels and pedestrians than there are for
15 people who are driving a truck or a car. The trucks
16 and the cars are registered. The mobility devices
17 we're talking about that are riding on our sidewalks,
18 going northbound on a southbound roadway, which I
19 encountered the other day, and just riding in every
20 lane except any lane they're supposed to be in, those
21 are the ones that are at risk. So we as a body, it's
22 our job to make sure they're safe, and it has been
23 proven in other countries who have been using these
24 type of mobility devices way longer than we have,
25 that when they were registered, licensed, and

1
2 insured, the fatalities went down. It just makes
3 sense. We don't have to have anybody tell us that.
4 It just makes sense, and people are more accountable.
5 So, you talk about enforcement on the one bill. What
6 is the DOT's capabilities of enforcement beyond
7 telling people to call 311 and report it?

8 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Well, last year
9 we had the lowest numbers of pedestrian fatality in
10 New York City since we had started collecting the
11 data for the last 113 years. We working hard to
12 every year continue doing everything, using all the
13 tools that we have in our box to reduce those numbers
14 of fatality. We work very close with the-- our
15 Vision Zero Taskforce led by City Hall, DOT, NYPD,
16 Department of Health and other agency, and every week
17 our teams are planning new initiative. Yes, we do
18 educational, but also we do enforcements. We are
19 here because we recognize that the use of e-bike,
20 bike, scooter will not leave New York City. This is
21 part of our city of our time. That we need to focus
22 on those cases where there's challenges that we have
23 to address it, and we will continue the education.
24 We have-- DOT has so many area that, you know, and as
25 you know, that you go over testimony. We have a

1
2 great educational team at DOT. Those individuals led
3 by team who go to the school, through senior center,
4 who go and work with the deliveristas educating, but
5 [inaudible] as we educate, we work with the NYPD for
6 enforcement.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: And I appreciate
8 that, but if people are still losing their lives, and
9 as my colleague Council Member Brewer said, the NYPD
10 doesn't have the workforce to really get out there
11 and maintain and enforce. What we're seeing-- we're
12 seeing absolutely chaos. We're seeing illegal
13 vendors, illegal motorbikes and scooters, uncertified
14 lithium-ion batteries, they're exploding. We're
15 seeing chaos on the streets, and all we're asking for
16 is registration, licensing and insurance and addition
17 to the other bills that are being heard today, they
18 complement each other. And if you agree with one,
19 you can't disagree with another. It saves lives.
20 It's been proven in other countries that are doing
21 this much longer than us. Thank you for the time.

22 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you,
23 Council Member. Council Member Rivera?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you so
25 much, Chair, for your leadership. I want to thank

1
2 Department of Transportation for coming in and
3 answering our questions. This is what we needed from
4 you. We have to hold each other accountable, because
5 we're desperately trying to create safer streets. I
6 want thanks the Manhattan Borough Commissioner. He's
7 very responsive and we've tried to do so much in
8 terms of the redesign on Second Avenue, Broadway,
9 Vision, Cooper Square battery charging. These are
10 all important initiatives, and I certainly agree that
11 we need to demand data from the app companies. I did
12 a bill demanding data from Airbnb, and we can
13 certainly hold these large billion-dollar
14 corporations accountable. I will also just add that
15 I have many precincts that overlap my district, and
16 this is the number one issue in every precinct.
17 People are concerned. So, I guess my questions are,
18 are there any examples of similar registration
19 efforts anywhere improving safety? Are there any
20 examples of similar registration efforts anywhere
21 actually reducing bike ridership? Do you have that
22 info?

23 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Commissioner
24 Will Carry, he can share with you other cities that

25

1
2 they had tried to implement a licenses and it had not
3 work.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Okay.

5 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: And I think that
6 this is, you know, one-- of course, New York City,
7 one of the things that we all should know, that
8 whatever we do in the city, together as we make each
9 of us accountable, we do it largest and the best when
10 we compare to any other city. So even many of the
11 cities they are looking at us. They're looking about
12 how-- we are the first one that is widening a bike
13 lane. we are the one that did 32 protected bike
14 lanes last year, and yes, as someone that carried the
15 bill, the Street Master Plan [sic]-- I know your job
16 is to make me accountable, but 32 protected bike lane
17 last year was larger than the number of protected
18 bike lane that all largest city in this nation build
19 together.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: No, and I just--
21 can I just add because I'm about to run out of time
22 that the Second Avenue redesign was absolutely
23 necessary to move our buses as well. So I do believe
24 that we are doing good work, and every neighborhood
25 is different. I represent Manhattan. It's not the

1 same as outer boroughs. I realize that. so I'd love
2 to hear about similar efforts, and I just think that
3 one of my concerns is the ability to even implement
4 this, to manage this program to sort of start in the
5 middle and just suddenly start registering vehicles.
6 I think we have to start at a certain point. We need
7 the state's support. I think the behaviors that are
8 of the greatest concern, the riding-- and I'm sorry,
9 Chair, I just need 30 more seconds. The riding on
10 sidewalks, the not giving the right-of-way to
11 pedestrians, riding the wrong way on one-way streets,
12 those are all virtually unenforced. And so does DOT
13 have any reason to believe that not only that a
14 license plate would change that, but that you have
15 the tools to expand those enforcement efforts? And
16 what can we do to ensure that we get you to that
17 place?

19 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, we don't
20 need a license for the NYPD to enforce those area
21 that you have described. We can-- we're working with
22 the NYPD to even expand the level of enforcement.
23 But let's get Deputy Commissioner Will to share with
24 you all the cities that they have tried and they have
25 not moved forward creating that license.

1
2 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: Sure,
3 thank you, Commissioner. Thank you, Council Member.
4 As the Commissioner was saying, the NYPD does not
5 require a license and registration to summons someone
6 for running a red light or, you know, going the wrong
7 way down a one-way street on an e-bike. We are
8 currently working with our partners, Chief Rivera and
9 the Transportation Division on enforcement actions on
10 major e-bike corridors in the City. Starting with
11 education or ramping up to summonses. We handle the
12 education part and obviously they handle the
13 enforcement component. In North America, you know,
14 cities like Toronto have looked at these registration
15 systems as a way to potentially solve this and have
16 decided against doing it, because as the Commissioner
17 mentioned, it's a lot of resources and it's not
18 required for the NYPD to go out and to enforce
19 against dangerous behavior. You know, the theme
20 today is really accountability. The NYPD can keep
21 people accountable now, but as others on this panel
22 recently mentioned, you know, they don't have
23 infinite resources. There's a lot things that
24 they're focusing on. So, one of the things that the
25 Commissioner talked about in his testimony was are

1
2 there other regulatory means that we can use that we
3 can work with you on the Council to hold the app
4 companies accountable, who are placing tremendous
5 pressure on their workers to deliver as quickly as
6 possible and to yes, cut corners, to run red lights,
7 to ride on sidewalks and how can that be used as
8 another lever for accountability.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Well, thank you.
10 I'm looking forward to working with you all on that.
11 Thank you, Chair.

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
13 Council Member De La Rosa.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Thank you so
15 much, and thank you, Commissioner and DOT for being
16 here. I think a few things. First of all, I commend
17 the efforts you are doing with the battery situation.
18 You know, my district is the second-highest
19 propensity for fires, because of e-battery
20 explosions, and we're putting at risk those same
21 workers that I think we both are seeking to support.
22 I'm the Chair of the Labor Committee here in the
23 Council and the deliveristas know that I support
24 them, because they're a necessary part of our
25 workforce. Everybody in this room has ordered

1 something or another, and a deliverista has been
2 there to deliver it. However, it is also important
3 that we keep in mind that as we keep that workforce
4 safe, we also need to keep our community safe, and
5 that is the balance that we are trying to strike.
6 You know, I had a situation in my district where a
7 90-year-old person in our district-- where you live
8 too, Commissioner. A 90-year-old person was hit by
9 bike and the person was basically in a coma for
10 months. You know, for our seniors these crashes can
11 be deadly. And so I think that one of the things
12 that we really need to strike a balance on is how we
13 insert the conversation around accountability here.
14 Council Member Holden has a bill, and I think that
15 the bill has good bones. We can work from the bill
16 to extract the things that could work in our
17 communities and take away the things that could be
18 detrimental. I for one am not trying to add more
19 burden to a workforce like the deliveristas that are
20 trying to do their job, but I also know that when we
21 observe bad behavior, it's monkey see, monkey do,
22 right? If people observe that people are riding on
23 the sidewalks, then everyone thinks it's okay to ride
24 on the sidewalk, and it's going to take all of us
25

1
2 working together to make sure that that
3 accountability and enforcement is there. One
4 question that I do have specifically, I see that the
5 categories for the e-bikes are done by speed. One of
6 the ideas that I tried to introduce into the
7 conversation was about the weight of the bikes. Is
8 there any data? Is there anything that speaks to the
9 mortality when someone is hit depending on the weight
10 of the vehicle?

11 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: And Will can
12 also add complement, but when we look at the data,
13 one death is too many--

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: [interposing]
15 Of course.

16 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: for all of us,
17 but most death that we have in crashes is involved
18 with vehicles, not just the e-bike. But Will, would
19 you like to--

20 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: Thank you,
21 Council Member, for the question. It's very-- you're
22 dead right. Weight is critical. Under state law, e-
23 bikes cannot be more than 100 pounds. Some of the
24 mopeds, both legal and illegal that we see on the
25 streets, are well in excess of that, so 200 and 250

1
2 pounds. Obviously, a car can be-- or a truck can be
3 many, many tons. And what we know from years of
4 Vision Zero research is what we all learned in
5 physics as a high school student, you know, the
6 bigger the mass, the higher the speed, the more
7 force. So, you know, the bigger the vehicles is,
8 obviously with the motor vehicle posing the most risk
9 to a pedestrian. But I think that's also why we have
10 a lot of concerns about mopeds, and why e-bikes can
11 be a safer alternative to a moped is because they
12 don't travel as fast and they don't weigh as much.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: So, one thing
14 that I will say, and just asking for you all at DOT
15 to use your expertise towards this conversation is
16 that, you know, often times we've heard when we stand
17 together to ask for red light cameras, when we stand
18 together to ask for speed cameras to be installed in
19 our communities, it's because the accountability
20 factor, and those ideas are not always popular, but
21 the accountability factor is-- and you all have
22 stated here in testimony that when someone is issued
23 a ticket, the recidivism, right, for it to happen
24 again is greatly reduced. And like, the disconnect in
25 my head is that why is that not good enough then in

1
2 this conversation when we're talking about inserting
3 an accountability measure for a vehicles that has
4 caused harm? You know, whether it's five, whether
5 it's 500. As you say, one is too many. And so,
6 like, I think we need to explore that and unpack that
7 a little bit as we have this conversation, but I
8 thank you for your efforts.

9 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: I think
10 that's a really good point. I think one of the things
11 that we've been thinking about is actually going
12 upstream into what makes people do that behavior. We
13 don't disagree that when people violate the law that
14 there needs to be accountability to that. But we've
15 also been thinking, why is it that people go about
16 and do those actions, and a lot of it has to do with
17 the forces, economic forces, that apps are putting
18 delivery workers under. And so, you know, right now
19 the emphasis is on speed, the incentive is on speed.
20 We'd like the emphasis to be inverted and be about
21 safety, and that's what a lot of our idea that we are
22 sending around later today and in the conversation
23 we've had with the Council already are centering
24 safety.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: I think it's
3 because the stakes are low and they can get away with
4 it, and so I think we disagree on why it happens. I
5 mean, you know, if you know you're not going to get a
6 ticket or you're not going to get caught for going
7 really fast on sidewalk, then you're going to
8 continue to do that behavior. And so you know, I
9 think that it's a conversation to have. Granted, I
10 represent a working class community. I'm not here
11 advocating for more tickets for our community, but I
12 think that, you know, we have education and when that
13 fails, then we need to have the conversation around
14 accountability and enforcement, but I thank you for
15 your efforts.

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. I
17 just want to also acknowledge that we have been
18 joined by, as you've heard, Council Member Rivera, De
19 La Rosa, and now Banks. I want to talk a little bit
20 about cycling. Cycling has increased significantly
21 in the city since 1980 when we started collecting
22 this data. Overall, what do you attribute to the
23 growing popularity of cycling in New York City?

24

25

1
2 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: We have the
3 group of delivery workers, which is around-- we can
4 share again, as I said before, the exact number--

5 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY:
6 [interposing] 75,000.

7 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: We have 75,000
8 registered delivery workers that they're using e-
9 bike. But in 2009, New York City only had 98 million
10 bike trips. Today in 2023 data, we have 200 million
11 bike trips. I think that people learn from Sandy,
12 Maria, Katrina, Ida that everyone have to do their
13 part of sustainability, and people realize that if
14 they use a e-bike or a regular bike, it's good for
15 their health, it's good for the environment, and it's
16 good for the economy. One of the thing that I've
17 bene pushing ourselves as an agency is even to
18 promote more biking in the working class community,
19 because if you look at biking from the perspective of
20 social class, it's more in [inaudible] with higher
21 level of education, more middle and upper class, the
22 one who are using the bike in New York City. And as
23 someone that in 1965 my father had a bike, I'm trying
24 to go back in my community and encourage more
25 working-class New Yorkers to also use bike to move

1
2 around. If you had a bike, you don't have to pay any
3 fare. If you had a bike, it's like you going to a
4 gym to do exercise. If you on a bike, you don't have
5 to be in those traffic. So, we believe that the
6 reason why more New Yorkers been getting into biking
7 is because they learn that it's good for the
8 environment. It's good for the economy and it's good
9 for the health.

10 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Is the
11 ridership highest on weekends or during the week days
12 based on your data?

13 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: We can get back
14 to you with the difference if we don't have it right
15 now, the weekday [inaudible].

16 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: So,
17 ridership is higher on weekdays. It's not just a
18 leisure activity. People are commuting or actively
19 working on bikes. You know, there--

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
21 What are the numbers?

22 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: We have
23 day by day numbers that we can share with you.
24 They're also on Open Data. So, we have all of that
25 and wherever we collect it.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Can someone
3 get it to us before we done here? That'd be great. I
4 just want to have an idea of what those numbers look
5 like. Because I'd like to also know how DOT monitors
6 the cycling trends. Like, is it through surveys
7 only? Is it through direct counting? Like, how are
8 you tracking the trends?

9 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Well, now--
10 again, I ought to say that we all interact with
11 anything that DOT is doing every day, and one of the
12 things that we are doing is also now using different
13 technology and software to count in real time the
14 movement of people walking and biking every
15 [inaudible].

16 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: Sure. And
17 the answer, we use a combination of all of those
18 things. We have places that have, as the
19 Commissioner said, automatic sensors so we know how
20 many people are going over key routes at any time,
21 but those sensors also don't give us a good sense of
22 was it regular bike or an e-bike. So we supplement
23 that with actually going out and looking and counting
24 and making sure that we have a sense of the mix.
25 We're now also collecting speeds so that we know not

1
2 just does it feel too fast, but how fast are these
3 bikes and e-bikes going out on the street. And then
4 we put that all together. We also do surveys.
5 Department of Health also does a biannual survey
6 where they talk to New Yorkers about how often they
7 bike. And putting these pieces together, that really
8 gives the full picture of what's going on. So, no
9 one of those gets the full picture, but that's why we
10 collect all of it. It's also why we share all of it
11 through Open Data and on our website.

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And how do
13 the other investments that you mentioned,
14 Commissioner, signal, timing, modifications, enhanced
15 delivery bike corrals, bike boulevards, and other
16 innovations work to improve cycling safety?

17 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: you want me to
18 elaborate a little bit more on what those--

19 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
20 On like how do you-- how do you feel like these type
21 of infrastructure investments support or improve
22 safety?

23 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Yeah. Being--
24
25

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]

and not just safety for the cyclist, but like pedestrians and motorists as well.

COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Yeah. Being-- I

always tell people that where we are right now is like thinking about the Industrial Revolution.

People talk about there's old machine there. They're taking the [inaudible] destroy [sic]. At the end of the day, that's the progress that we made in society.

Today, more people are using bike. More people are using e-bike, more people are using scooter. Think about that those individuals will be behind a wheel

in their car instead of having a scooter or the bike.

You know, 25 percent of the pollution that we have in this city come from a vehicles. So we do understand

that if you live in some places in the south Bronx,

in south Queens, or the place that you live in a

transportation dessert area. We had to connect with

public transportation 76 percent of people who live

in the borough of Manhattan, they don't have car. We

had a great train in both system, and that's why we

have four million people using the train every day, a

million people using the bus every day, but also that

\$200 million bike trips is part of our life, and

1
2 that's why we want to continue conversation to look
3 on how can we make improve with those reckless one,
4 but recognizing that the vast majority of those
5 individual who are using their bike, their e-bike,
6 they respectful to pedestrian and they can be role
7 model for those small percentage that are reckless
8 one.

9 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

10 Moving to the bills that we're hearing today, I had a
11 couple of questions around that. Starting with my
12 own bill, which thank you for expressing support for
13 the bill. And just to reiterate, the intent on that
14 bill is look at this growing new mode of tra--
15 relatively new mode of transportation, and viewing it
16 more holistically in terms of how we make it safer
17 for all in terms of the street and how we better
18 regulate this new transportation means. And so how
19 does DOT currently receive and respond to community
20 input on street design and infrastructure
21 specifically related to e-bike safety?

22 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: I will start and
23 then Eric, you also may add to this. What we know is
24 that we all are increasingly improving safety. We
25 know that your bill calls us to come together in a

1 taskforce and work in a comprehensive plan where we
2 can come together, brainstorm, thinking about
3 different idea on how can we improve safety, but
4 safety involves different aspects. Infrastructure is
5 important one, and as I say, we are the first city in
6 the United States that is widening the bike lane. We
7 are the first city in the United States that was able
8 to build 32 mile protected bike lane last year. But
9 besides infrastructure, we also are doing our
10 education and work. Yes, we lost 23 cyclist last
11 year, but seven of those cyclists that we lost, they
12 were using e-bike that they were not hit by no one,
13 and that's why we did a social media campaign
14 educating around Get Smart Before You Start,
15 educating those who use e-bike about how to maneuver
16 a e-bike, how to accelerate, how to stop, because
17 while we know that been growing more New Yorkers and
18 visitors using the e-bike, but also we know that
19 education is key. So, more than happy, Chair, to
20 work with you with this bill creating this taskforce
21 that will be looking at infrastructure. But as I
22 say, also would like to add to make it broader to
23 also look at other aspect on how we can improve
24

1
2 safety for everyone, for those who use e-bike, for
3 those that walk in our city.

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

5 And what has DOT examined or considered implementing
6 specifically aimed at better regulating the e-bikes
7 and the e-scooters as it pertains to safety and
8 behaviors on the road?

9 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: We work 24/7.

10 We had a great education, I think. As I said, City
11 Hall since the time when I was a Council Member, we
12 passed a bill. We created the Vision Zero taskforce
13 that is led by City Hall where DOT making important
14 part of that. We had many members of DOT, and we had
15 a great educational division at DOT that we were with
16 NYPD. So we usually work in a way that we go out and
17 educate as we also go and redesign our street to make
18 it safer for everyone, but also we work with Chief
19 Rivera and the NYPD on the enforcement part of those
20 reckless ones.

21 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And just
22 total between that bill and street safety and
23 enforcement, Vision Zero-- would Vision Zero, DOT and
24 NYPD compile data as it pertains to, for example,
25 moving summonses? And so considering that e-

1
2 scooters, e-bikes are regulatory new. It's not so new
3 as someone told me the other day, but relatively new.
4 Does Vision Zero capture currently these type of
5 violations or movements with e-scooters and e-bikes?

6 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Yes, and as you
7 know, this Administration was the first one that was-
8 - is also now being incorporated in the data related
9 to traffic violence. As the NYPD every week, they
10 go through their own stacks of data. so, the fact
11 that Mayor Adams include those data on traffic,
12 traffic violence in the NYPD when they go every week,
13 talk about how critical, how important it is for this
14 Administration to look at any traffic violence at the
15 same level.

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And when
17 they're looking at it, is in terms of when they are
18 the victim or when they're the ones that have
19 committed [inaudible].

20 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: Thank you,
21 Council Member. It's an important question. So, we
22 do a lot of data collection on the crash side. So
23 numbers of cashes, the types of vehicles involved,
24 was there an injury, was the injury severe, and was
25 there a fatality, and what is the exact circumstances

1
2 of that crash. So we work closely with our partners
3 at NYPD to compile all those numbers. And then the
4 NYPD on their own, of course, is doing their
5 enforcement actions, and as the Commissioner
6 mentioned in the testimony, they've year to date
7 seized almost 20,000 illegal vehicles. These are the
8 larger, heavier mopeds often without plates, often
9 without vehicle identification numbers, and they've
10 issued over 3,300 summonses for unsafe riding by e-
11 bikers and moped operators.

12 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: And Chair, one
13 thing that I want to highlight how we've been able to
14 have-- assembling a great team at DOT. We have a lot
15 of expertise. You know, the good thing about this
16 agency is that Commissioner can come and go, but the
17 level of retention that this agency has, the level of
18 this agency to attract great talented individual--
19 like right now we have Erin LaFarge who used to work
20 at the DA who decide to move from been working at the
21 DA to now be leading our Vision Zero-- working with
22 Ann Marie that been working at DOT for more than 20
23 years, and the whole team. So when we come to data,
24 we don't play around. We work very hard every day to
25 be sure that everything that we do is a data-driven

1
2 decision, and that's why we believe that licenses,
3 the idea for licenses can be-- we support the intent,
4 but we prefer to focus on the taskforce that we are
5 introducing today.

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: In terms of
7 the trends that DOT has seen, can you talk to us
8 about what that looks like as it pertains to offenses
9 or crashes as it results to a scooter or e-bike
10 operator? So, are you seeing it trending up? Are
11 you seeing like it on par? Is it a decline? What's
12 happening there?

13 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Let's hear from
14 our Deputy Commissioner.

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Sure. So
16 I'll--

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
18 And give me numbers. Don't just give me like what
19 your thoughts are. I want to know, like, year to date
20 we had five crashes as a result of an e-bike, and
21 this year it's six. Like, I want to know numbers.

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Sure. So,
23 we-- so far, year to date, we've had just under
24 78,000, 77,965 crashes that were caused by cars and
25 larger vehicles like trucks and buses. We have--

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
3 What this-- this hearing is not about cars. I'm
4 asking you about e-scooters and mopeds.

5 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: We give you the
6 scooter number [inaudible].

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: So, for
8 mopeds it's 2,991. For e-bikes it 782.

9 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Can you say
10 that one again? I'm sorry, I'm just writing it.

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: For e-bikes
12 it's 782, and for e-scooters it's 1,329. These are
13 what are collected by NYPD. I think we want to
14 acknowledge there are incidents that happen that are
15 very real and don't always-- you know, if someone
16 doesn't report it to NYPD, we don't know about it.
17 But we do find that these help us know where the most
18 incidents are happening so that we can work with NYPD
19 to make sure that we're focusing enforcement on those
20 corridors where we're seeing the most incidents.

21 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: So, these
22 numbers are for this year or last year?

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: These are
24 this year, year to date.

25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Year to date,
3 okay. Now, in the trend are you seeing increase,
4 decrease based on the numbers? Have they gone up?
5 Have they--

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: So, we will
7 get back to you with last year's numbers but over the
8 past several years the number of injuries has
9 generally been going down. But obviously if you--

10 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
11 Not injuries going down, but the instances--

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON:
13 [interposing] Yeah, the crashes are going down.

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Can someone
15 just like look that up? Because we still have some
16 more time here, so.

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: We'll get
18 you what we can now.

19 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay.

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Anything
21 else we'll get you later.

22 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
23 I'm going to pause because I have a lot more
24 questions. Council Member Holden has round two as
25 well as Council Member Marmorato.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Commissioner,
3 does red light cameras work?

4 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: It work a lot,
5 and thank you--

6 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing]
7 Alright, alright. Yes or no. Yes or no.

8 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you to the
9 state that now allow us to install red light camera--

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing]
11 Alright, Commissioner-- Commissioner--

12 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: [interposing] in
13 600 locations, instead of 150.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I got the floor.
15 I got the floor. You said red light cameras work.
16 Speed cameras, do they work? Yes or no.

17 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Yes.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: How do we-- so
19 you're against the license for an e-bike, right?
20 Wouldn't that-- wouldn't they be caught on cameras,
21 technology? Wouldn't that then-- if red light
22 cameras work, like you just said, they would work on
23 e-bikes. The fact that you don't even know this is a
24 disgrace.

1
2 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: What is it I
3 don't know?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Because you don't
5 know that a licensing for an e-bike would cut down on
6 the crashes, cut down on pedestrians being struck.
7 You don't even-- I mean, that's common sense. Most
8 of the people here know this. You don't for some
9 reason.

10 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: I do. I do.
11 Licenses--

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing] If
13 we have licenses-- Commissioner, if we had licenses,
14 on my bill 606, on an e-bike, stands to reason it
15 would reduce crashes like it did in Denmark.
16 Denmark, when they had a license plate, 29 percent
17 fewer deaths. Serious injuries, 39 percent fewer
18 serious injuries, 64 percent reduction in crashes.
19 They understand that. They have the data. You
20 don't. And that's the problem here. DOT is asleep
21 at the wheel. They have been for a couple of years
22 now, and they let this happen, and the only answer
23 you have today is let's do some media ads showing a
24 grandma with no helmet on riding an e-bike. That's a
25 wonderful ad that you're putting out there. Just

1
2 promoting e-bike riders without a helmet. I mean,
3 this is insane. The fact that you don't get-- you're
4 saying a license would not make a difference is
5 absurd, and the fact that you don't understand that
6 is a disgrace. Now, the fact that we talked about
7 safe operation. You have no answers how to stop
8 people at these lights. And again, the fact that you
9 don't have the data-- you mentioned, by the way, how
10 many corners-- and you answered to the Chair's
11 remarks. You know where, the areas where there-- the
12 most abuse is occurring. Where? Where in this city
13 are people just flying through lights on e-bikes and
14 e-scooters?

15 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: So, Chairman,
16 first of all, Denmark--

17 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing] No,
18 you're speaking to me.

19 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, to you and
20 Council Member. Denmark already ended the license
21 requirements and this look to-- it's important to
22 look at why they ended. By the way, when I rode the
23 bike with the Ministry of Transportation from
24 Denmark, what they told me is about is they ride a
25 bike half an hour every day, people live six more

1
2 years in their life. When it comes to location, yes,
3 we are a data-driven agency.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: So where is it?

5 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: We can get back
6 to you to share--

7 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing] See
8 again, you don't even-- this is unbelievable. You
9 do-- you have all the data. You don't bring it to
10 this hearing. So we should know where this
11 occurring. You should know it like the back of your
12 hand, where the most dangerous locations are, which I
13 would say Manhattan has to be probably-- some place
14 in Manhattan has to be the most dangerous place on
15 earth.

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you,
17 Council Member. Commissioner, I'm just going to ask
18 if while we're sitting here, if you guys can try and
19 obtain that information. I think that would be
20 helpful for this hearing. Council Member--

21 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]
22 Yeah, but Chair, if you don't mind, what I can say as
23 I said before to this body, what we understand is we
24 need don't need license to enforce. We don't need
25 license for the NYPD and those working together,

1
2 going in those intersection that are dangerous. Gale
3 Brewer, Council Member Brewer asked a question about
4 will we be, you know, open to something reducing the
5 speed.

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Yeah, but
7 inaction is not the solution either. We have to do
8 something to be able to regulate a new mode of
9 transportation. We can't just have it just
10 recklessly. There are times where I'm driving and
11 I'm observing them run through red lights, stop
12 signs. I've almost been knocked over by a moped
13 walking out of my office on the sidewalk. This is
14 something that we cannot not do something. What that
15 path is, I think the taskforce will help to look at
16 it more holistically to take all sides into account,
17 but I don't think approaching it with just saying--
18 because it sounds to me like it's saying like not to
19 do anything. That's why I need to understand the
20 data. What is the data saying? What are the numbers
21 saying? Because I think there's a lot of emotion
22 around this topic on both sides, but we have to look
23 at this objectively in terms of what's in the best
24 interest for public safety as it pertains to our
25 transportation means. So, I just want to say that,

1 but if we could get the answers to the Council
2 Member's questions, I would greatly appreciate that.
3 And Council Member Marmorato, if you can continue.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Thank you.

5 And I promise this time I actually will be short.

6 So, the five crimes that I mentioned in my community
7 in the last 28 days that involved scooters, in order
8 for the NYPD to work with the scooter companies in
9 order to help find out who the rider is and try to
10 figure it out, they need a subpoena. If we were to
11 have these e-vehicles registered, wouldn't that take
12 that whole process away? Wouldn't they be able to go
13 into their own database and shorten the time to find
14 out who these, you know, vigilantes are? Could you
15 agree to that?

16 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Well, as you
17 heard, what we say about-- and you heard my
18 testimony, we do believe that we need to work-- those
19 company, that they also providing good services.
20 They are the one who come out creating those
21 applications. So at the end, they making a lot of
22 money. So what we say it's about definitely we do
23 believe on how it's not only going after those who
24 use the-- buy e-bikes to deliver the food, but it's
25

1 about for those company also to report those data.

2 So they have the data. We do believe that we need to
3 work together be sure that those company report those
4 data.
5

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: But I think it
7 shouldn't take more than-- they should have like
8 direct access. If somebody gets very hurt because of
9 a scooter, the NYPD should have direct access to that
10 information. It shouldn't just go on and have a
11 subpoena and have to wait for the companies to get
12 back to them. Now, I just want to ask you one
13 question as far as-- is riding on the sidewalk legal?

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Sergeants, if
15 you observed someone with outburst, please remove
16 them now.

17 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: It's not legal,
18 and I--

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: [interposing]
20 It's not legal.

21 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: It's not legal,
22 and I can tell you that when I get out from my
23 building with my two daughters, I always take the
24 lead for me to be the first one that walk from my
25 building to the sidewalk, because we also share that

1
2 concern of a percent that is reckless. However, it
3 is legal only for children to ride their bike in the
4 sidewalk, but for the adults in those cases it's not
5 legal.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Okay. Okay.
7 That's it.

8 [audience disruption]

9 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: Council
10 Member, just a--

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Pause the
12 hearing, please.

13 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: Council
14 Member, just a quick note. The NYPD normally makes
15 us aware of crimes committed on shared e-scooters.
16 We haven't heard from them.

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Excuse me.
18 We've paused the hearing, sir.

19 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: Oh,
20 apologies, Chair.

21 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Again, I ask
22 that everyone please do not have outbursts. Everyone
23 will get a turn to be heard today. You may proceed.

24 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: Thank you,
25 Chair. Thank you, Council Member. In any case, the

1
2 NYPD normally informs us when they're doing
3 investigations that relate to our shared mobility
4 services, and we are not currently aware of any in
5 the Bronx. If you have information, please share it
6 with us, and we'd be happy to coordinate.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Because it's
8 just a hassle for them to do it, and they try to
9 figure it out on their own, but if they ever really
10 need any of that information, they have to go through
11 a long, lengthy process. These companies are not
12 quick to share any information. They will not
13 release it to the NYPD. Alright, thank you so much,
14 Chair. I appreciate the time.

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
16 Going back to legislation, just want to spend a
17 little bit of time on Council Member Holden's bill,
18 Intro 606. If it were to be enacted, how does DOT
19 envision implementing this bill?

20 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: Thank you,
21 Council Member. In order to implement this bill, the
22 agency would need to set up a new unit responsible
23 for licensing and registration. That would start
24 with the creation of a new IT system mirroring the
25 kind of expansive IT systems that the New York State

1
2 DMV currently has, as well as hiring of significant
3 staff to set up the procedures and processes for
4 processing applications and renewals, as well as
5 doing a tremendous amount of outreach to e-bike
6 owners across the city to make them aware of these
7 new requirements. So, it would be a significant
8 undertaking. As my colleague mentioned earlier, I
9 believe over the first four years we would expect
10 this would cost \$19 million in expense and additional
11 \$6 million in capital.

12 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: And Chair, the
13 requirement is for any e-bike. So it mean that Citi
14 Bike, any other entity that provide service with e-
15 bike would also be mandated to whoever rents one of
16 those bikes also be licensed.

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: To that
18 point, Commissioner, is there a world where you
19 envision that there's a group of riders that should
20 not necessarily be registered versus another group?

21 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: I believe that
22 there's a discriminatory part. If we are thinking
23 about-- we are looking for creating a license for
24 anyone who use e-bike, then just thinking about this
25 case, the delivery workers, and then not thinking

1
2 about anybody else who use e-bike, then it's
3 targeting that particular group. And as-- but as I
4 said before, we don't support-- we support the
5 intent. We don't support the bill.

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Would
7 licensing micromobility vehicles enable the city to
8 adequately enforce street safety issues surrounding
9 the e-bikes, e-scooters and mopeds?

10 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: So, we
11 think that we can enforce the types of behavior that
12 we're talking about now, right? We can enforce red
13 light running. We can enforce riding on the
14 sidewalk. We don't need the license plate to be able
15 to do that. I mean, we're working with NYPD to be
16 able to do more. We're not anti-regulation, right?
17 And that's why we're interested in having this
18 conversation through the taskforce, because we think
19 that the missing piece is our ability to enforce
20 against the companies that are causing the behavior
21 in the first place.

22 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: But what
23 happens to the ones that are not riding for a
24 company?

1
2 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: so, we can
3 enforce the traffic laws against them today, and
4 that's always part of it.

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: So you're
6 saying that it's not being enforced today.

7 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: We are
8 enforcing. The NYPD issues a lot of summonses.
9 They've seized almost 20,000 of these devices, but we
10 also know that just going after the individuals isn't
11 enough to stop the problem. It's part of the
12 solution, right, that we have to do enforcement
13 against the behavior, but that to really solve it, we
14 have to get at why the behavior is happening in the
15 first place and go at it from both of those angles.

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Have any new
17 issues cropped up during implementation-- oh, no,
18 sorry. Wrong page. Would this legislation align
19 with the City Vision Zero goals and reduce injuries
20 and deaths caused by micromobility devices?

21 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: As the
22 Commissioner said, you know, I think we agree with
23 the intent to create more accountability.
24 Accountability and enforcement is absolute part of
25 how we get to Vision Zero. I think we have concerns

1
2 about the details of this bill and the new things it
3 can add versus what we can already do. But overall,
4 we do think accountability and enforcement is part of
5 how we get to Vision Zero.

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Moving to
7 Reso 224. Does DOT believe that the task of
8 registering these vehicles better fits with our own
9 agencies on a city level or at the state level?

10 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Are you
11 referring to your bill, the--

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
13 No, this is to Council Member brewer's bill. Reso 224
14 really is envisioning it being regulated on the state
15 level. So I just wanted from your perspective to
16 understand do you feel like the task of registering
17 these type of vehicles better fits with our agencies
18 on the city level or on the state level?

19 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Thank
20 you, Chair, for the question. I think it really
21 depends on what that legislation looks like. But
22 again, the thing that we're trying to say today is we
23 don't want to wait to get state law passed. We have
24 a solution today that we have ideas on that we want
25 to have further discussion with the Council on. We

1
2 were thinking about things like a commercial mobility
3 license. The license actually goes to the companies
4 that are the apps that--

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]

6 But again, that's only to an industry. They're also
7 individuals that are riding these. So we have to not
8 just be laser-focused on the deliveristas, because
9 the conversation is a global one. This is a new mode
10 of transportation. Just like we have automobiles on
11 the road, but then you have UPS that's driving a
12 truck, but we all have rules of the road.

13 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: I

14 don't know that we've been able to say that
15 registration programs have been a sole determinant
16 for any decreases in safety-- I'm sorry, increases in
17 safety. That's not something we've been able to
18 show.

19 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay. And

20 does DOT believe registration of e-bikes or
21 commercial use would be sufficient to address the
22 problems caused by reckless or improper operation of
23 e-bikes, or does the problem lie more squarely with
24 non-commercial? So, in the data that you're seeing,
25 because I know-- it seems like the agency has more of

1
2 a focus on the delivery side of this, but based on
3 the data, do you see a lot more offenses happening
4 with those who are working in industry or the non-
5 commercial users of the bikes? Like, what does the
6 number show you?

7 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: I
8 think it's really important to distinguish across
9 some of the flavors of commercial, right? We have
10 Amazon and UPS that make use of micromobility today.
11 There's a very different business model than what we
12 have with food delivery or goods deliveries, or the
13 companies like Getir, for example. There's a real
14 different incentive when you're an independent
15 contractor, and we see the incentives driving unsafe
16 behavior.

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Chair, we've
19 been pulling some of the stats if you'd like to read
20 through them, or we can-- or send them after,
21 whichever.

22 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Sure. Do you
23 have Council Member Holden's information?
24
25

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: So, we have
3 the 2023 year to date crashes by mode, and then we
4 have weekdays and weekends at different places.

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay.
6 Alrighty [sic].

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: So, first,
8 just looking at 2023 year to date, so we-- this year,
9 year to date as mentioned, we had 2,991 moped
10 crashes. Last year the equivalent number 3,594. For
11 stand-up scooters, again, this year was 1,329. Last
12 year was 1,437. For e-bike this year is 782. Last
13 year, the equivalent time was 933.

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Was how much?

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: 933.

16 CHAIRPERSON HOLDEN: So, 782 was 2023--

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: 782 was
18 2024.

19 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: 2024.

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: 933 was
21 2023.

22 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Last year.

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yes.

24 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay.

1
2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: And then in
3 terms of weekday versus weekend, we have a much, much
4 longer list that we could send, but just to give you
5 a few examples: The Brooklyn Bridge, the average
6 weekday was 4,991 with the busiest day of the week
7 being a Tuesday. On the weekend, the average was
8 3,470. There's obviously a lot of variation in that.
9 A nice summer weekend does very well. A cold winter
10 weekend does not, but that's the average across the
11 full year. At the Manhattan Bridge, the weekday was
12 4,957, weekday. Weekend is 4,017. Again, the
13 busiest day was a Tuesday. This does vary somewhat
14 around the City. For example, on Prospect Park West
15 next to the park it is busier on weekends. So the
16 weekday is 2,395. The weekend is 2,574 with the
17 busiest day being Saturday. And we have these for a
18 number of locations around the City. I'm happy to
19 read more. We can send you the list.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: If you could
21 send the full list, that'd be great. Thank you.
22 Now, I know you-- and I appreciate that you were able
23 to share the dollar figures for Intro 606, but just
24 wanted to get a little more granular to understand
25 what that looks like. So, what start-up cost does

1
2 DOT anticipate Intro 606 would require, versus what
3 ongoing expense and capital costs are?

4 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: Thank you
5 for the question, Council Member. The start-up cost
6 would include, as I mentioned, the creation of a
7 custom IT system to manage all the registrations and
8 renewals. It would require outfitting of a call
9 center to take customer inquiries, the creation of a
10 retail storefront or storefronts, places where people
11 could come as the DMV has offices. This would
12 require offices that people can come or apply or work
13 through issues that they're having with their
14 registration, and outfitting of office space for the
15 several dozen employees who'd be required to operate
16 this new unit.

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Would DOT
18 require new or separate location to conduct this
19 work?

20 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: We're
21 anticipating that we would need a new office space to
22 conduct this work.

23 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And would be
24 the anticipated lease cost and operational cost?

1
2 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: I can
3 follow up with you on that specific number, Chair.

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Does DOT have
5 an existing resource for license plates?

6 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: We do not.
7 We'd have to-- we would expect to issue a contract
8 with the manufacturer of the plates.

9 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay, thank
10 you. That was the next question, like how would you
11 be able to implement it.

12 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: We'd hire
13 somebody to do it.

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: What fees
15 does DOT project it would institute for licenses and
16 registration, and-- well, I'll ask that first, and
17 then we can go from there.

18 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: So,
19 pursuant to OMB guidelines, what we would do is
20 administrative cost analysis. So, how much would it
21 cost us, and this would require further work, and
22 then those costs would be passed on to the
23 registrants, either for new licenses or renewals.

24 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Does DOT or
25 OMB have an idea of how much they anticipate

1
2 receiving annually from registrations in terms of
3 revenue?

4 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: We need to
5 do the analysis of the administrative cost first, and
6 then once we determine that number-- if this proposal
7 were to move forward, once we determined that number,
8 we would then determine, you know, what the price
9 would be and how much revenue there would be.

10 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And does DOT
11 anticipate administrative education-- adjudication,
12 excuse me, costs related to the enactment of this
13 legislation, and if so, how much and how is this
14 determined?

15 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: The answer
16 is yes, we would need to hire additional legal
17 personnel to help process those issues and deal with
18 the administrative law courts.

19 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay. In
20 term-- going back to my bill, Intro 1131, wanting to
21 understand the cost for that, too. Does DOT
22 anticipate Intro 1131 would require additional
23 resources to implement the taskforce?

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: We don't.
25 We understand we would have to commit staff, time and

1
2 effort, but our anticipation would be that we would
3 use existing personnel to support that.

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay. And I
5 was going to get into additional staffing. Do you
6 think additional staffing would be needed or would
7 DOT be able to-- as you're I guess saying, it would
8 just use who you have.

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yeah, I
10 think, you know, realistically we would use the
11 existing staff. We won't say we need to wait and
12 hire to be able to engage on this issue.

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Just a point of
15 clarification. You mentioned about Toronto rolling
16 back. They didn't roll back on their regulations.
17 They banned e-scooter-- December 3rd of just last
18 week they banned e-scooters. You want to check?
19 Google it. Okay, they banned e-scooters in the whole
20 city. They also banned taking e-bikes on subways, on
21 buses, on other things, and they actually said it's
22 going to-- we're banning this for the winter months
23 because they have fires and a fraction of what we
24 have. So, do your homework. E-scooters are banned
25 in Toronto. E-scooter are banned in-- it's the first

1
2 thing that came up. So, this is again-- this again
3 about accountability. I mentioned Denmark. I
4 mentioned-- there's other countries that ban by
5 wattage. That means if it's 250, over 250 which most
6 of our e-bikes are-- they're 500. They banned the
7 wattage, like the certain ones that go very, very
8 fast and can injure or kill people. So, again, we
9 need-- if you guys are going to come to a hearing,
10 you need the data. You also need the correct data,
11 and you can't put out information that's false, and
12 you can't put out information that license plates
13 will not save lives or prevent crashes. It's done
14 that in other cities and state-- you know, and
15 countries. So, this is data that's common sense.
16 The fact that you guys are not even like on the same
17 page as that is-- I'm appalled. Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. I
19 just want to circle back to my question about the
20 staffing on my bill, Intro 1131. I know you said that
21 you would just use internal staff, but I was just
22 updated that OMB has indicated that DOT would need to
23 hire a staff person, so that kind of contradicts what
24 I just heard.

25

1
2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yeah, I
3 think we would hope to sort of backfill. You know,
4 we'll have to take someone off of other work to be
5 able to support the bill. We would want to hire
6 someone to fill the role that that person was doing.
7 What I really mean is that we-- you know, can take a
8 long time to hire someone. We don't think we need to
9 wait for that person to start to be able to work on
10 the taskforce.

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay.
12 Because it's important as you know, especially with
13 the new, I guess, rules after the last election. We
14 need to like understand what the financial impact
15 will be with these legislation items that we
16 consider. So, if I could get an update.

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yeah, so in
18 the fiscal impact statement, we estimated that we
19 would hire one person at \$67,000 per year, and then
20 there would be we think potentially some data--
21 additional data collection or consultant work. So
22 the first year cost would be \$317,000 that was all in
23 expense for a four-year total of \$518,000.

24 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Majority
25 Leader Farías?

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIÁS: Thank you,
3 Majority Whip and Chair. I just have a couple of
4 questions, and if they've been answered in the time
5 that I stepped away, you can let me know. I can
6 always watch back our hearing. Intro 606 calls for
7 e-bike registration on the city level. Currently,
8 the state DMV is the only entity responsible for the
9 registration and licensing of vehicles, and the City
10 does not have an administrative infrastructure to do
11 so currently. Can you guys speak a little bit about
12 what were the cost staffing requirements,
13 administrative needs involved? It was already
14 requested? Okay. And then-- sorry, the Chair just
15 let me know you folks already answered that. And
16 then the-- just asking around the rise of mobility
17 app users in the delivery industry-- I think for a
18 lot of us has fueled reliance on e-bikes and mopeds,
19 and among that there's a large population of low-wage
20 workers that are using that-- this mode of
21 transportation to do their work. Do we believe that
22 a requirement to license and register individual e-
23 bikes would further burden or disproportionately
24 impact delivery workers, and it is fair or effective
25 to target individual workers while failing to hold

1
2 companies responsible for street safety impacts on
3 the micromobility issue?

4 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY: Thank you,
5 Council Member, for the question. As we talk about
6 accountability today, I think one of our guiding
7 values is that we need to hold everyone accessible,
8 and that includes not only folks who own their own e-
9 bikes or e-scooters, but also folks who work, and
10 also the entities that employ or contract with those
11 delivery workers, the main app companies, and
12 recognizing the role that they play and incentivizing
13 unsafe riding behavior. So, yeah, I think it's
14 something in our proposals in the Commissioner's
15 testimony that as we advance the accountability we
16 need to do so fairly.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIÁS: Okay. I mean, I
18 think we should-- I'm hoping that we can get to a
19 place where we're talking about accountability but
20 also ensuring that there are factors that folks are
21 needing to use micromobility efforts to use for work.
22 I mean, there's a large priority from this council to
23 make sure people are being treated fairly in their
24 workplace on top of-- that's out of your
25 responsibility, but on top of making sure our streets

1
2 are safe and people can-- pedestrians and cyclists
3 and everyone in between can utilize the roadways
4 effectively. So I'm hoping after today's hearing
5 there's room for discussion around what we can do to
6 use interagency or interdepartmental efforts to lean
7 towards safety for everyone in the City.

8 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CARRY:

9 Absolutely.

10 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,

11 Majority Leader, because we can say that you have
12 bring fresh air when it came to looking at improving
13 transportation in your district. You know, since you
14 took office, like, you've been a great partner. It
15 doesn't mean that we cannot look at area where we can
16 do better. But it is so critical also have voices and
17 members in the Council who understand it that the
18 future of the city is about creating different option
19 as people move around. So thank you for your
20 leadership.

21 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

22 Thank you to this panel. You're now relieved.

23 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: thank you. And

24 we will leave members of our team to be here in case
25 that-- I know as a former chairman, I used to ask--

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
3 Please do.

4 COMMISSIONER RODRIGUEZ: would the agency
5 be here. The answer is yes. There's going to be
6 someone for DOT listening to all testimony and
7 following up. Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you,
9 Commissioner. I now open the hearing for public
10 testimony. I remind members of the public this is a
11 government proceeding and that decorum shall be
12 observed at all times. As such, members of the public
13 shall remain silent at all times. The witness table
14 is reserved for people who wish to testify. No video
15 recording or photography is allowed from the witness
16 table. Further, members of the public may not
17 present audio or video recordings as testimony, but
18 may submit transcripts of such proceedings to the
19 Sergeant at Arms for inclusion in the hearing record.
20 If you wish to speak at today's hearing, please fill
21 out an appearance card with the Sergeant at Arms and
22 wait to be recognized. When recognized, you will
23 have two minutes to speak on today's hearing topics,
24 oversight, planning our shared streets in New York
25 City, integrating micromobility options; Intro 606, A

1
2 Local Law to amend to the Administrative Code of the
3 City of New York in relation to requiring that every
4 bicycle with electric assist, electric scooter, and
5 other legal motorized vehicle be licensed and
6 registered; Intro 1131, a Local Law in relation to
7 the establishment of a taskforce to study options for
8 making street design and infrastructure safer in
9 consideration of increased use of electric bicycles
10 in related collisions; Intro-- excuse me, Resolution
11 224, a resolution calling on the New York State
12 Legislature to pass and the New York State Governor
13 to sign Senate Bill 7587 and the accompanying
14 Assembly bill 783 known as the Commercial E-bike
15 Licensing Act which requires the registration of
16 bicycles with electric assist used for commercial
17 purposes and crates liability for employers for
18 certain violations. If you have a written statement
19 or additional written testimony you wish to submit
20 for the record, please provide a copy of that
21 testimony to the Sergeant at Arms. You will-- you may
22 also email written testimony to
23 testimony@council.nyc.gov within 72 hours of this
24 hearing. Audio and video recordings will not be
25 accepted. We will now call our first panel, and

1
2 again, I remind everyone to please keep decorum in
3 the room. The first panel will be State Senator
4 Hoylman-Sigal. Yes, welcome. Have a seat. Make
5 yourself comfortable.

6 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Good afternoon,
7 Chair Brooks-Powers and Council Members. Thank you
8 for having this very important hearing, and thank you
9 to the members of the public and advocates for their
10 consistent engagement on this issue. I'm State
11 Senator Brad Hoylman-Sigal. I represent the west
12 side of Manhattan from Christopher Street in the
13 Village up to West 103rd on the Upper West Side. It
14 goes without saying that from what you've heard from
15 your colleagues that street safety is one of the most
16 common issues raised by our constituents and for good
17 reason. In the past five years the number of e-
18 bikes, mopeds and e-scooters on our streets have
19 increased exponentially. In addition to the over
20 65,000 delivery workers, most of whom use
21 micromobility, more than 50,000 New Yorkers ride an
22 electric Citi Bike daily. Last March, in
23 collaboration with the Midtown Community Justice
24 Center in my senate district, Council Member Brewer,
25 Council Member Bottcher, the Borough President,

1
2 Assembly Members including Assembly Members Rosenthal
3 and Simone, and other elected officials helped lead a
4 symposium to reimagine micromobility safety in New
5 York City. With input from city and state agencies,
6 deliveristas and other issue area experts, we studied
7 the causes of our changing streetscape and analyzed
8 solutions. This week we released a report that
9 included 18 policy suggestion, some of which I and my
10 colleagues have introduced as legislation at the
11 state level. Thanks to the ideas the group
12 generated, I was proud to pass a bill, S7703A
13 requiring mopeds to be registered at the point of
14 sale in collaboration with Assembly Member Alex
15 Bores, and I want to thank Council Member Holden for
16 acknowledging its effectiveness in your op-ed today
17 in the New York Post. I've also introduced
18 legislation, s7587 and A73833 alongside Assembly
19 Member Tony Simone which would requiring licensing
20 and registration for e-bikes used for commercial
21 purposes statewide. We believe commercial e-bikes are
22 the proper target for licensing. Delivery workers are
23 subject to draconian performance criteria with
24 consequences such--

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
3 Senator, I'm so sorry--

4 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: deactivation.

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I'm just
6 going to ask that you could just wrap it and the--

7 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: [interposing] And
8 I'll sum up.

9 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Yep, thank
10 you.

11 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: These policies
12 uniquely incentivize them to break traffic laws.
13 It's no coincidence that the food delivery industries
14 suffer a fatality rate of 36 per 100,000 workers,
15 making it the most dangerous profession in New York
16 City. We believe that e-bikes licensing should occur
17 at the state level. New York State has a Department
18 of Motor Vehicles that has registered vehicles for
19 the past 64 years. The DMV already--

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
21 Thank you.

22 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: has the digital
23 infrastructure and capacity for processing
24 registrations, issuing plates and punishing
25 violators.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you so
3 much.

4 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Thank you very
5 much. It's an honor to be here today.

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: It's great to
7 see you. Thank you so much. Next we will have
8 Sindhu Bharadwaj from the New York City Comptroller's
9 Office, and I'm so sorry if I botched your name.
10 Just turn on your mic.

11 SINDHU BHARADWAJ: Ready?

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Whenever you
13 are.

14 SINDHU BHARADWAJ: Hello and thank you to
15 the Chair for convening this hearing. My name is
16 Sindhu Bharadwaj and I am here representing New York
17 City Comptroller Brad Lander. In light of the City's
18 changing transportation landscape, our office
19 recently issued a report titled Street Safety in the
20 Era of Micromobility, offering a strategic set of
21 recommendations to improve safety and quality of life
22 while preserving the benefits e-bikes and scooters
23 offer New Yorkers. We are pleased to support Intro
24 1131 which advances one of our recommendations to
25 generate better e-micromobility data to inform safer

1 street design and infrastructure for all. Our report
2 is grounded in data about micromobility safety. Data
3 on crashes, fatalities and injuries involving these
4 vehicles revealed that riding them is much more
5 dangerous than sharing the road with them. 76 e-
6 bikes and scooter riders died in crashes between 2020
7 and 2023, and despite the perception that
8 micromobility is uniquely dangerous to pedestrians,
9 e-bikes and e-scooters account for just 1.3 percent
10 of pedestrian death and 2.6 percent of injuries since
11 their statewide legalization. And for context, cars,
12 SUVs and trucks cause 96.6 percent of pedestrian
13 fatalities over the same period. However fatalities
14 and injuries involving e-bikes and stand-up scooters
15 were virtually non-existent prior to 2020 and the
16 current numbers represent a significant increase
17 since their legalization, and this trend combined
18 with the void of proactive management around
19 micromobility contributes to a sense of chaos,
20 disorder, and lawlessness on city streets. As
21 micromobility becomes a permanent fixture of our
22 transportation system, it demands a proactive
23 regulatory approach and we urge the City Council to
24 advance a package of bills to enact the following
25

1 changes. One, cut off the supply of unsafe, illegal
2 vehicles in New York City through strategic supply-
3 side enforcement. Two, hold the app-based delivery
4 industry accountable, and three, invest in high-
5 quality infrastructure. Beyond these
6 recommendations, our office remains concerned that
7 requiring registration of e-bikes--

8
9 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
10 I'm just going to ask if you could wrap up, please.

11 SINDHU BHARADWAJ: Yep, wrapping up--
12 would fail to address the root causes of reckless
13 driving and burden individuals and public agencies
14 with unenforceable and ineffective administrative
15 requirement. We instead urge the council to take a
16 comprehensive approach. Thank you again to Chair
17 Brooks-Powers for your work on this issue and we
18 appreciate your consideration of our testimony.

19 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
20 We'll call up the next panel. I just ask everyone,
21 please, please, please adhere to the two-minute rule.
22 I will invite up now Robert Acevedo, Mary Mcgukin
23 [sp?], Rabbi Michael Miller, Andrew Fine, Janet
24 Schroeder, and Phillip Miatkowski. Again, apologies

1
2 if I'm not doing a good job on your names. Mr.
3 Acevedo, you can start whenever you're ready.

4 ROBERT ACEVEDO: Yes, I just want to
5 mention that this morning I was almost hit by an e-
6 scooter. He was speeding, and he-- I didn't hear any
7 ringer. Also, let's see-- right here. I find it
8 frustrating that many put the e-scooter in front of
9 me after using these e-scooters. So, the parking
10 practices leave a lot to be desired. As a wheelchair
11 user, I have a hard enough time getting around
12 without dealing with these scooters left blocking me.
13 I remember going to an inaccessible cemetery, Saint
14 Remmins [sp?] in the Bronx, and getting around these
15 scooters that are parked right in front of me. Also,
16 I'm shocked that many e-scooters do not have a ringer
17 or some kind of sound to alert some of the
18 pedestrians who are visually impaired. I don't
19 remember hearing too much about the visually
20 impaired. And yeah, they could-- it's very unsafe.
21 And lastly, I agree that e-scooters need to be
22 licensed, and I'm shocked that they're still not
23 licensed. They should be. Thanks a lot.

24 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
25

1
2 UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you, Chairperson and
3 members. I appreciate your time. I hope you truly
4 hear all of us today. I'm here today because I
5 strongly support Priscilla's Law for e-bike
6 registration. I'm an aging person with disability
7 and a victim of e-vehicle, though the only casualty
8 was my grocery cart with the groceries. But I
9 remember that year of impact, and I can only imagine
10 the impact to those who have-- living with injuries
11 and those who lost their life. Life is too precious.
12 It must be protected. Our EV goals are out of
13 control. I rode bikes all my life. I rode them as an
14 adult with my children. I'm not anti-bike, but I am
15 anti-regard to those who do not safely share the road,
16 and Priscilla Law is the first step to bringing back
17 order to this chaotic situation. When I had my
18 police report, it was written as a motor vehicle.
19 There was no specification that it was an e-bike that
20 hit me. But when you get hit by an e-bike, and as I
21 have neighbors who have been, and you fall to the
22 floor, your injuries are just as serious as if you're
23 hit by a car. There's brain bleeds, concussions,
24 fractures skulls, broken bones, and hip displacement.
25 That's damage and hospitalization. You don't get

1
2 over that so easily. And the Citi Bikes that have
3 been put throughout the neighborhood, they've been
4 put there. They're heavy. They go at large-- fast
5 speeds. There's no education and there's no
6 accountability. So I'm asking that you sign this
7 law, because it does have accountability. And
8 there's nothing that should prevent people from
9 getting injured and saving their lives. Thank you.

10 UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you Chair Brooks-
11 Powers and the Committee and Council Members. As I
12 laid out in my December Daily News op-ed, seniors and
13 other vulnerable pedestrians are confronted with an
14 ever-present danger opposed by speed limit-breaking,
15 traffic light and stop light abusing, one-way
16 ignoring, two-wheeled electric vehicles. Chaos
17 prevails, and on-foot sidewalk and street navigation
18 has become perilous. Unfortunately, I experienced
19 this street havoc firsthand. On Tuesday, May 21st,
20 when returning by subway to my Manhattan apartment, I
21 exited the 77th Street subway station and walked
22 east, having the light across Third Avenue, a
23 northbound thoroughfare. I checked that oncoming
24 traffic was stopped at the intersection. When I
25 stepped from the sidewalk into the street, an

1 electric bike traveling southbound against traffic at
2 high speeds smashed into me. I crumpled to the
3 asphalt, saw what appeared to be a delivery biker for
4 a few seconds before sped off-- a hit and run-- and
5 peered at my right leg which was clearly and
6 grotesquely broken. An ambulance took me to the
7 hospital for surgery to repair the tibia bone broken
8 in three places with a permanent insertion of a
9 titanium rod. I spent a week in the hospital and six
10 weeks in rehab learning how to walk again. I also
11 discovered that I lost some sight in my right eye.
12 But I was a lucky e-bike victim. I'm alive without a
13 severe brain or head injury. We can readily get into
14 the blame game and target delivery workers who are
15 speeding around town to scratch out a living, but we
16 as consumers are the ones insatiably-- who have the
17 insatiable demand of a near instant gratification
18 with everything at our doorstep in an unreasonable
19 amount of time. Feeding this demand, rewarding speed
20 above all else are the delivery app companies.
21 There's no panacea here, but ultimately there needs
22 to be accountability of what's happening on our
23 streets, and I suggest the City Council explore and
24 act on a comprehensive approach. That approach

1 should include the licensing of app companies like
2 what the Taxi Limousine Commission did with for-hire
3 vehicles, regulating the industry to create
4 standards, data tracking and accountability for
5 companies that want to do business here. Why not
6 create and implement a similarly accountable
7 framework with delivery companies as they dispatch
8 all these trips and rides on city streets? Over-
9 archingly [sic] local enforcement is key to ensuring
10 the accountability of all e-bike riders and the
11 altering of law-breaking behavior patterns. I urge
12 the committee and the council to act expeditiously on
13 this compelling issue, establishing accountability
14 standards restoring public safety to our city streets
15 and eliminating the fear factor form our pedestrian
16 population. Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

19 PHILLIP MIATKOWSKI: Thank you, Chair
20 Brooks-Powers and members of the Transportation
21 Committee for holding today's hearing. I'm Phillip
22 Miatkowski, Interim Deputy Executive Director of
23 Transportation Alternatives. We fight for safe and
24 equitable streets for all New Yorkers. Thank you
25 Chair for sponsoring Intro 1131. TA supports this

1
2 infrastructure-first approach which aims to identify
3 proven, long-lasting solutions that address the
4 safety needs of everyone. In addition to the study,
5 the City should require app-based delivery companies
6 to collect and release trip data to help inform where
7 infrastructure is needed. TA strongly opposes Intro
8 606 for three reasons. One, bike licensing doesn't
9 work. Bike licensing laws have been passed and then
10 repealed as ineffective in every major city that has
11 attempted it, including LA, Houston, and Toronto.
12 Two, it would be an expensive bureaucratic nightmare,
13 costing millions of tax payer dollars to construct
14 DMV-style inspection locations and licensing offices.
15 The law would only function reactively, not
16 preventing crashes, injuries and deaths in the first
17 place, and does nothing to hold delivery apps
18 accountable. Three, Intro 606 would significantly
19 increase civilian interactions with armed police.
20 Because e-bikes and regular bikes are visually
21 indistinguishable, this bill would allow officers to
22 pull over anyone on any type of bike just to see if
23 it's electric and unlicensed. This would be a
24 revival of stop and frisk. People choose e-bikes
25 because they are affordable and efficient in a city

1
2 where transportation choices are limited by where you
3 can afford to live. We must ensure our roads are
4 ready for change instead of turning to legislation
5 that doesn't work and will ultimately make our
6 streets more dangerous. We need to actually prevent
7 these crashes, injuries and fatalities from happening
8 in the first place. This looks like better
9 infrastructure, wider bike lanes, and safe areas for
10 pedestrians, not an overreliance on punishment.
11 While Intro 606 is counter--

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
13 I'm sorry, I'm just going to ask you if you could
14 wrap up.

15 PHILLIP MIATKOWSKI: Yep. The data is
16 clear, giving everyone safe and protected space on
17 the streets prevents crashes, injuries and cycling on
18 the sidewalk.

19 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

20 PHILLIP MIATKOWSKI: Thank you for your
21 time.

22 JANET SCHROEDER: Apologize. Can you
23 hear me? Hi. I'm thanking you for holding a hearing
24 on Priscilla's Law. I'm Janet Schroeder, Director and
25 Co-founder of the E-vehicle Safety Alliance. We're a

1
2 group of unpaid, unfunded New Yorkers who represent
3 the majority voice in New York City on the solutions
4 to e-vehicle violence. We're not anti-bike or e-
5 bike. We're pro-safety for all who share our
6 streets. We have over 200 cyclists in group,
7 including cyclist victims. Older adults and disabled
8 are the most vulnerable to this public health crisis.
9 It is entirely ageist and ableist to not recognize and
10 consider this fact. In our group alone, we have 98
11 victims, a mere sample of the tens of thousands of
12 seriously injured pedestrian, cyclists and e-bikers.
13 90 percent of their crashes have no police report,
14 and in 90 percent of these crashes, over 90 percent,
15 the rider flees the scene. It is so much worse than
16 the DOT stats show. They do have correct stats on
17 those killed, but completely skewed stats on those
18 injured. The wealthy special-interest bike lobby
19 says that this bill unfairly targets people of color.
20 This is a false diversion tactic and it's complete
21 fear-mongering. Stop. We care about e-bike riders
22 dying and getting injured. Changing their behavior
23 by holding them accountable to safer riding will save
24 their lives. Of the 30 bikers who died last year, 23
25 were on e-bikes. E-bikes are not bicycles. They

1
2 weight 60 to 70 pounds, have motors, brake more
3 slowly, should not be in the same class and should
4 require plates. We care about these e-bikers dying
5 and getting injured. We must change their behavior.
6 Police don't chase e-bikers, and never should.
7 Having identifiable plates doesn't involve police.
8 It's about the cameras. Cameras don't choose who to
9 ticket based on anything but behavior and this bill
10 includes all e-bikes. E-Citi Bikes are some of the
11 absolute worst offenders. They infrastructure is the
12 answer, stop. We're not anti-bike lanes, but they
13 aren't the solution. How does a bike lane or a wider
14 bike lane stop a rider from speeding through a red
15 light? Consequence is what shapes behavior and the
16 dangerous riding hasn't changed because there's been
17 no consequence. The last thing, DA says, but the
18 cars. Cars are already regulated. More women die of
19 heart disease than cancer, but we still try to find a
20 cure for cancer. Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

22 ANDREW FINE: You ready for me?

23 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I'm ready
24 whenever you are.

1
2 ANDREW FINE: Okay, good. I just wanted
3 to thank the Chair for holding this hearing and all
4 the Council Members who have joined on. I'd like to
5 note for the record that the DOT commissioner and his
6 staff after three hours with a lack of information
7 have decided that they have interest apparently in
8 listening to any of the 400 people signed up for this
9 hearing. My name is Andrew Fine.

10 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Sergeants, if
11 you've observed any disruption, please remove them
12 from the chamber.

13 ANDREW FINE: Can I reclaim my time
14 there? Andrew Fine, Vice President of the East 86th
15 Street Association, founding member and Legislative
16 Director for the New York City E-vehicle Alliance.
17 Please ask everyone speaking today who they are
18 affiliated with and if they are a paid employee of
19 that organization. New York City E-Vehicle Safety
20 Alliance has over 1,200 members. Everyone is a
21 volunteer. Nobody is paid. You may notice after
22 three hours a couple had to go back to work. Why
23 would an organization like Transportation
24 Alternatives, the lead organizer in opposition to
25 Priscilla's Law, be so opposed to basic

1
2 accountability measure that will change wanton [sic]
3 lawless rider behavior and in turn reduce injuries
4 and fatalities to pedestrians and cyclists alike? I
5 suggest that they lack credibility on this issue.
6 All you have to do is follow the money. How can
7 Trans Alt pass themselves off as an honest broker
8 when they've take supersized donations from the like
9 of Uber, Lyft, Citi Bike, Door Dash, and Lime? These
10 are the very interests looking to profit from our
11 streets and us every day. Of course the oppose
12 accountability, because to them accountability means
13 liability. So, they come out with ridiculous
14 fearmongering arguments that the idea that requiring
15 a plate for an e-bike is akin to stop and frisk 2.0,
16 really? You have to be kidding. If police wanted to
17 engage in systemic racist conspiracy against delivery
18 workers, all they would have to do is go to the
19 corner of Broadway and Murray right here and it's
20 shooting fish in a barrel. I'll wrap up. I won't go
21 into the-- what we're looking for here is basic
22 accountability. We demand justice for our victims.
23 How is it fair that our victims are left with life-
24 altering injuries, trauma and a pile of hospital
25 bills? How is it fair that the City Council views

1
2 these victims as acceptable collateral damage in the
3 race for a seven-minute chicken sandwich? These
4 people deserve justice.

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
6 With that, the Committee is going to pause for 15
7 minutes. Stretch your legs. We will be resuming in
8 15 minutes. Thank you.

9 [break]

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Keep it down, please.
11 Keep it down. Quiet on the floor, please. Keep it
12 down. Thank you. Keep it down, please. We're about
13 to start momentarily, and we appreciate your silence.
14 Thank you very much.

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
16 Hope everyone got to stretch a little bit. We'll
17 call up the next panel which will be Pamela Manasse,
18 Ms. Sook Ling Lai, Peggy Ng, Arthur Miller, and Brian
19 Van Nieuwenhoven. I ask that you please respect the
20 two-minute rule. You can always submit a longer
21 testimony in writing, and just make sure your
22 microphone is turned on when testifying. We can
23 begin whenever you're ready.

24 PAMELA MANASSE: Thank you, Council
25 Member Powers for staying. Unfortunately, this is

1
2 one of the happiest and saddest days of my existence
3 dealing with this. I'm coming off script completely.
4 We have a Yiddish expression, it's called a Shanda,
5 and it's a Shanda that no one is left here to hear to
6 our stories, which are the most important stories to
7 hear, including Ydanis Rodriguez who my husband I had
8 the displeasure of speaking to on air two years ago,
9 and he said, "oh, yeah, yeah, accountability, sure,
10 sure, sure." Okay, so moving right along. I want to
11 thank bob Holden and the 31 Council Members who
12 signed onto this very important e-vehicle safety bill
13 requiring the registering of all e-vehicles,
14 Priscilla's Law. My name is Pamela Manasse. I'm co-
15 founder of EVSA. In 2022, I was crossing the street
16 legally when I was hit head-on by a speeding e-
17 vehicle. My assailant came off the sidewalk and into
18 the pedestrian crosswalk. He tried to flee. My
19 husband was able to detain him. I lay on the hot
20 burning pavement unconscious, my husband not knowing
21 if I was dead or alive. The police came and we were
22 taken away in an ambulance. We later found out that
23 the perpetrator was simply allowed to walk away, seen
24 by witnesses getting a coffee and croissant. I
25 suffered a traumatic brain injury leaving me

1 permanently paralyzed on my right side. There would
2 be no walking away that day for me. I spent months in
3 rehab and continue in a lifetime of physical therapy.
4 Not a day goes by where I don't have to deal with my
5 injuries, every single day. My assailant on the
6 other hand no consequences and no accountability.
7 Even the police report was in accurately written up.
8 The 20th precinct said there was nothing more they
9 could do while my assailant walked away unharmed and
10 free from injury or consequence. I struggle living
11 every day as a disabled, newly disabled person of two
12 years. I'm unable to walk normally. My right arm is
13 barely functional. I struggle to do everyday tasks
14 and I have lost my livelihood as a cellist. I have
15 lost my career. I'm scared of being hit again,
16 scared for my family and all New Yorkers as we all
17 have near-misses every day stepping out our front
18 doors.
19

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

21 PAMELA MANASSE: You're welcome and thank
22 you for listening.

23 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Absolutely.

24 Whoever is next can go ahead. Ms. Sook?

25

1
2 SOOK LING LAI: Good afternoon. My name
3 is Sook Ling Lai. I just retired from Manhattan's
4 Chinatown Head Start where I was the Executive
5 Director for nearly four decades. Sitting next to me
6 is Peggy Ng, the Educational Director for three
7 decades. Chinatown Head Start helps children ages
8 three to five learn and develop self-help skills, to
9 speak English, socialization, cognitive and physical
10 development. In addition, we also provide services
11 to the parents to adjust to the American life of
12 living. Priscilla was one of my long-time dedicated
13 staff. She was there for 41 years before her sudden
14 death. Today, I speak on behalf of Priscilla Loke's
15 family, friend, Chinatown Head Start Sponsoring
16 Board, and staff members. We support Priscilla's Law
17 that requires license plates for all e-bikes and
18 registration. Priscilla must not be forgotten. She
19 was a naturalized U.S. citizen with a college degree.
20 Her immediate family live in Malaysia. Her elder
21 sister, Winnie [sic], from Malaysia has asked that I
22 read this statement today. "Ying-- which is
23 Priscilla's Chinese first name-- you have made such a
24 big sacrifice to have this bill passed so that future
25 e-bikes will take extra precautions on the road to

1
2 prevent similar accidents from happening. We all
3 miss you, and you always remain so deeply in our
4 heart. We cherish all the happy moments we had with
5 you. We are sure you are now happy with all the
6 angels guarding you above." Winne.

7 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

8 PEGGY NG: Hi, my name's Peggy Ng. I'm
9 the-- I was the Education Director of Chinatown Head
10 Start located on Moss [sic] Street. On September
11 5th, 2023, Priscilla was walking in broad daylight in
12 Manhattan in Chinatown when she was hit [inaudible]
13 bike that ran a red light. The impact caused her to
14 fall on her head. The bike left the scene without
15 giving a name and address. Meanwhile, Priscilla was
16 clinging to her life in Bellevue Hospital,
17 unconscious for three days. China [sic] Head Start
18 Staff were there by her bedside. During this time
19 [inaudible] Priscilla was laying on the bed without
20 saying a word or goodbye. She [inaudible] with her
21 mouth, but she said goodbye with her tears in her
22 eyes in the bedside. She didn't leave any words.
23 She had a dream. She wanted to be retired this year
24 2024 and go help her niece and nephew to babysit the
25 kids, but where's she now? The biker-- we didn't

1
2 find the biker. We don't know who did it for many
3 weeks. She had no-- I thank you all the victims here
4 to voice out their opinion and voice out their
5 thoughts. Where is Priscilla now? She cannot say a
6 word to express her-- her feeling. I had a dream
7 yesterday. She was with me in the school watching the
8 little kids come to school. Is it coincidence? No.
9 You know what else is not coincidence? Priscilla Law
10 is 606, right? Her cellphone number had a lot of six
11 in there. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

13 CARRIE MICHAELS: Hi, my name is Carrie
14 Michaels. I'm with the NY--

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
16 I'm sorry. Please hold.

17 CARRIE MICHAELS: He told me to go with
18 this group, so, because I have to go to work. I was
19 supposed to be with the first group, so.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I'm sorry, we
21 did not call you, but we will get to your name.
22 We'll find your name. I'm the Chair, I decide the
23 order. Thank you. If we can have Arthur Miller.

24 ARTHUR MILLER: Good afternoon everybody.
25 Thank you for this opportunity. I ride a bicycle as

1
2 a course of life. I go to the bank. I do my shopping
3 and I do anything else I have to do, and a result of
4 the amount of the e-bikes in the past five years is
5 absolutely horrendous. You take your life in your
6 hands, particularly in our area of Council District
7 30. 69th Street is a terror. Grand Avenue is a
8 terror. They even cut off the school children
9 crossing the streets. Second Avenue in Manhattan,
10 for God's sakes, that may have been improved, but all
11 it's done is make a speedway for these e-bikes. And
12 I say very simply what should be done if a vehicle--
13 and a bicycle is a vehicle-- if it is powered by
14 other than the human body, it should be registered,
15 licensed, insured, made to comply with all motor
16 vehicles standards, and the operators should be
17 trained and made to perform and comply with all
18 regulations. The whole thing is just out of this
19 world, and it's impossible to go across the street
20 without looking two ways twice. And I do thank an
21 MTA bus driver for stopping me from crossing Grand
22 Avenue when an e-bike went through a red light and
23 would have plowed me down and made mincemeat out of
24 me. Thank you.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
3 Brian?

4 BRIAN VAN NIEUWENHOVEN: In November
5 2023, I was a member of Manhattan Community Board Six
6 and the Chair of the Transportation Committee of that
7 board. At that time, our board resolved at the
8 predecessor of Intro 606, Intro 0758 was, "harmful
9 and should not be passed in its current form." This
10 resolution reiterated suggestions from a prior
11 resolution that our board passed including design
12 changes to moderate traffic speeds, passing on
13 bicycle lanes and greenways, education campaigns,
14 improved signage, and improvements in the legislation
15 covering delivery app platforms and their workers.
16 This resolution along with a link to the prior
17 resolution was forwarded to Council Member Holden.
18 Council Member Holden responded by dragging the
19 Community Board in the press. Today, we are
20 discussing an introduction that has little changed
21 since then. It intends harm through unnecessary
22 police stops, muddled definitions of vehicle types,
23 unclear availability of registration, and impractical
24 declaration of how a license plate would be affixed
25 to a bicycle, a complete absence of equipment

1 dimensions or cost information, and no provided logic
2 as to how a registration system would reduce the
3 incidents of collisions or limit the injuries and
4 deaths caused by such collisions. The mission of
5 preventing roadway injuries is critical. My
6 statements today are intended to enlighten about
7 effective measures as alternatives to in effect
8 measures that create harm. Plate tags do nothing to
9 improve functioning of streets, and by my observation
10 of driver behavior on existing tag vehicles such as
11 SUVs and mopeds, they have almost zero effect on
12 inspiring shared accountability. There is no common
13 sense in voting for legislation that is missing key
14 details to ensure its constitutional viability that
15 enacts a scheme that has largely failed elsewhere
16 despite Council Member Holden's refutable claims, and
17 isn't needed in an environment where laws and
18 policies assuring accurate tracking of hit-and-run
19 cyclists. Conversely, there is common sense in
20 redesigning streets for modern traffic flows,
21 improving the functioning of streets. We must
22 support eh management of DOT to resist anti-change
23 forces for safety redesigns. We must implement
24 proven safety designs in a more widespread fashion,
25

1 including adding bikes lanes to more streets,
2 widening existing lanes, and measures to calm the
3 street speed of traffic in those lanes. I invite any
4 Council Member to reach out to me to suggest safety
5 recommendations as driver, pedestrian, and cyclists
6 in New York City for the past 20 years--
7 Brianvan@gmail.com. Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
9 We're going to call the next panel. I just want to
10 reiterate that you are to wait until your name is
11 called before approaching the table. I will call
12 your name when it is time for you to come to the
13 table, so if your name has not been called, I ask
14 that you take your seat and you will be called at
15 that appointed time. Going to the next panel.
16 Jackson Chabot, Dario Salamena [sp?]- I'm not sure
17 if I'm saying it right-- Riddit [sp?], Elizabeth
18 Denys, Shannon Phipps, Pamela Smith, Keva Michaels
19 [sp?].

20 JACKSON CHABOT: Good afternoon. My name
21 is Jackson Chabot and I'm testifying today as the
22 Director of Advocacy and Organizing of Open Plans.
23 We're here to unequivocally oppose Introduction 606
24 while we support 1131 from the Chair. Research shows
25

1 from records professors Dr. Charles Brown that
2 licensing bikes disproportionately impacts
3 marginalized communities, particularly people of
4 color. Doctor Brown argues that bike licensing
5 policies often carry racial and socioeconomic biases,
6 making them an inherently discriminatory practice.
7 These policies may disproportionately criminalize
8 Black, indigenous and people of color, especially in
9 urban areas where cycling is a common, low-cost
10 transportation option for low-income individuals.
11 Inherent to the proposed bill and another layer
12 racial disparity is the policing and enforcement of
13 bike laws. In many cities bike licensing are linked
14 to fines and/or penalties for cycling without proper
15 documentation. Doctor Brown's research shows and
16 studies have shown that enforcement of minor
17 infractions disproportionate directed at Black and
18 Brown individuals, even in situations where the
19 infraction may be relatively harmless. This reflects
20 broader patterns of racial profiling and over-
21 policing in communities of color. When these
22 individuals are stopped for not having a bike
23 license, it often leads to fines they cannot afford,
24 or in some case bikes having been impounded further
25

1
2 disrupting their ability to access essential services
3 and jobs. Doctor Brown points out that many BIPOC
4 individuals rely on bikes for daily commuting due to
5 economic necessity. For these communities, the added
6 burden of licensing fees along with the potential for
7 fines or confiscations of bikes being unregistered
8 can result in the cycle of poverty and
9 criminalization being perpetuated. In cities with
10 high rates of policing in low-income neighborhoods
11 and bike licensing laws have been disproportionately
12 enforced against BIPOC individuals, further
13 entrenching racial inequities. I'll submit longer
14 testimony, but to reiterate we support the Chair's
15 bill 1131 while opposing Intro 606.

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

17 ELIZABETH DENYS: hello, my name is
18 Elizabeth Denys. I'm a Flatbush resident and I'm here
19 to speak in opposition to Intro 606 and any other
20 legislation that would license, restrict, ban or
21 outlaw e-bikes in New York City. E-bikes have been
22 essential for ensuring I can bike around safely
23 around the city including between a lot of locations
24 in Brooklyn and Queens where public transportation is
25 sparse. An e-bike is a more climate-friendly option

1
2 than taking out a car and is critical for me to
3 access essential medical appointments reliably.
4 Intro 606 does nothing to directly reduce any of the
5 dangers on our streets. Heavier, faster or dangerous
6 mopeds are already licensed or illegal vehicles.
7 Similar laws haven't improved street safety, but they
8 have diverted resources from building proven
9 technologies like protected bike lanes and
10 daylighting intersections and from enforcement that
11 could make our streets safer. These misguided laws
12 have issues with uneven xenophobic and racist
13 enforcement and result in significant bicycle
14 ridership drops. Every city with a similar law has
15 since repealed it. This bill would make it very
16 difficult and costly for me to access my essential
17 medical care, but above all else it feels ridiculous
18 to me that Council is hearing this bill which would
19 require our city to build ineffective and expensive
20 new agencies and programs when the Department of
21 Transportation is so fully behind on implementing
22 the proven safety solutions mandated in the Streets
23 Plan. We need to focus instead on making sure
24 lifesaving protected bike lanes connect every
25 neighborhood throughout the City. DOT's own data has

1
2 shown lifesaving protective bike lanes make our
3 streets safer for all road users, whether they're
4 walking, bicycling on either a traditional bike or an
5 e-bike, taking the bus or driving, and they
6 dramatically reduce riding on sidewalks. Rather than
7 licensing e-bikes, the city needs to catch up on the
8 Streets Plan requirement for protected bikes lanes,
9 pass Intro 1131 to make sure these bike lanes meet
10 the current and future bicycling needs in our city,
11 and hear and pass Intro 1138 so everyday intersection
12 has lifesaving daylighting. We can't afford to go
13 backwards. E-bikes are here and provide riders like
14 me who can't always ride a traditional bike safe,
15 climate-friendly ways to get around. Let's build for
16 a future where New Yorkers have more sustainable
17 transportation options instead of a future where
18 they're more expensive and dangerous.

19 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

20 SHANNON PHIPPS: So I'm going off-script
21 a little bit. My name is Shannon Phipps. I'm a
22 first-generation Iranian American, and I find the two
23 white people appropriating racism extremely
24 offensive. I--

25

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]

Please measure your comments in here.

SHANNON PHIPPS: I would be proud to register an e-bike and get a license. I also have a license plate on my car, and I has literally nothing to do with my race or ethnicity. Unlike other people who have testified, my family has actually experienced racism and discrimination, and I speak from that personal point of view. I also speak from the view as a mother and I represent the child who wears these shoes. I live in District 33 and 44, AD50. It should be a utopia for infrastructure. It's not. It's chaos. It's hell. I've even seen Lincoln violating the rules of the road. So perhaps he doesn't support this bill, because he would be held accountable. I was hit by a cyclist years before the pandemic, years before we saw e-bikes on the road like we do now, and I'm lucky that I'm alive. I'm lucky that I didn't hit my head, that I wasn't pregnant or that I was elderly. Many years later, I'm a mother to a toddler and we have obviously more e-bikes on the road. We've encountered, my son and I, so many heart-stopping and fatal-- near fatal collisions with people operating e-vehicles

1 negligently and recklessly that I have lost count.
2 They fly through red lights, go wrong the way, speed
3 on and off curb cuts, come up from behind you, come
4 right at you within a couple of inches. I've seen a
5 white adult male with a child in a Citi Bike e-bike
6 basket at night driving the wrong way on his e-bike.
7 Tell me, is that racist? I'm going to blow your
8 mind, people. In my district, it's one of the
9 wealthiest district in the City and it's full of
10 white people that can't obey traffic laws. We have
11 Barry [sic] open street where my son's pediatrician
12 office was, two days after giving birth I was--

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
15 I'm sorry, I'm just going to ask that you wrap it up.

16 SHANNON PHIPPS: nearly hit. Thank you. I
17 was nearly hit by an e-bike using the sidewalk, not
18 using the bike boulevard that the DOT invested
19 millions of dollars to create for cut-through traffic
20 for speeding of e-vehicles.

21 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

22 SHANNON PHIPPS: All we're asking is for
23 license plates and accountability. Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

25 And if you have more testimony you can just submit it

1
2 in writing, okay? Thank you. Thank you everyone.
3 I'm going to call up the next panel. I want to also
4 reiterate the two-minute rule. We have a lot to get
5 through. Jim Burke [sp?], Marissa Redante [sp?],
6 Cassandra Martinez, Paul Mondesire-- I'm sorry, sir.
7 Daniel Solow, and feel free to correct me on your
8 names. People mess mine up, too.

9 JIM BURKE: My name is Jim Burke. Thank
10 you for having this hearing. I'm completely against
11 606. I had a major heart attack right during the
12 pandemic, and the way I get around the city when I
13 have to cross a bridge is actually using a city e-
14 bike. I'm a Safe Street advocate, not paid. I'm a
15 volunteer, and I am 100 percent for anything that
16 would make this city safer. I spend my time in
17 Jackson Heights and in Rockaway, and that's super
18 important to me. If I thought this would do that, I
19 would be for it. I really like your introduction,
20 your law to find out what's going to make it safe.
21 We already know things that are proven, and that's
22 wide bike lanes make it safe for everyone. When I
23 come here on the bridge, I share an 11-foot wide lane
24 with two lanes of traffic, two-- across the
25 Queensboro Bridge, two lanes of people walking,

1 jogging, and bicycling, and also unlicensed mopeds
2 and motorcycles. We share 11 feet in this city to
3 get-- and so that money that's-- they said \$20
4 million just to-- they think-- just to get started on
5 this. If you could put that into bike infrastructure
6 we'd all be safer. It's a fact. Riders, pedestrians
7 and people in their cars all become safer when we
8 have this wide infrastructure. So, I'm begging you
9 guys not to get distracted by this legislation.
10 Let's do the correct thing, make people safer and
11 that's investing in the city and infrastructure which
12 ironically Ariola, Holden, and the other one always
13 block in their neighborhoods. So we want safe
14 infrastructure for all of us, and I appreciate
15 finding what that is. Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

18 MARISA REDANTE: Good afternoon. My name
19 is Marisa Redante [sp?]. Thank you for having this
20 hearing and thank you for staying. I wish more of the
21 Council Members were as courteous. Priscilla Loke's
22 death, death by e-bike, lit a flame in us. New
23 Yorkers shouted enough and flew into action.
24 Priscilla's Law was born. Thank you Council Member
25 Holden. The issue is very simple as has been said.

1
2 The number of accidents and injuries and deaths
3 resulting from this free-for-all reckless e-bike
4 yahoos would reverse course should accountability be
5 established. Given the recent moped requirements of
6 registration and license plates have proven
7 effective, it's obvious, so obvious. The same should
8 be required for e-bikes. E-bikes and motorized
9 scooters with riders who have nothing to fear make
10 our very sidewalks unsafe. They're on the sidewalk
11 when the bike lane is empty. So it's not about a
12 wide bike path. It's about them feeling like they
13 want to be on the sidewalk. It's unsafe for
14 children, elderly, disabled, and those who carefully
15 are recovering from limb surgery. And we're talking
16 about a license plate, a small but readable license
17 plate, a useful tool giving us a fighting chance.
18 When there's an automobile hit-and-run, what's the
19 first thing people say, did the camera catch the
20 license plate? Well, it doesn't do you any good if
21 there's no license plate on the scooter. It's the
22 cameras that will do the work. When I was driving I
23 got a ticket in the mail with a photo. No cop came
24 to my door. So the NYPD would be less burdened with
25 this legislation. Now, we come to you, those of you

1
2 elected officials and the Commissioner's staff who
3 stayed, we come to you to act in our behalf. We come
4 to you to watch you and witness you to take care of
5 us and to do your jobs as our elected officials.
6 We're here to witness it. I will soon be 70 years
7 old. I don't want to fall on the sidewalk. That may
8 be nothing to some of you younger Council Members.
9 It's a lot to me. And you know, sometimes in life we
10 ignore something we can't see with our own eyes.
11 Well, look at the victims who are here. There is
12 your evidence, Council Members, and there is your
13 evidence, Commissioner Staff. There's only one
14 missing, though, Madam. Her name's Priscilla. She
15 can't be with us today.

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
17 Cassandra is next.

18 CASSANDRA MARTINEZ: Hello. Thank you
19 for allowing me to speak. I am against Intro 606 and
20 I support Intro 1131. This is about an opportunity
21 to stop and frisk. I personally ride an e-bike. I
22 have a car. I have an e-bike that's made by 360 which
23 is a bike company that specializes in bikes for
24 seniors and people that are partially mobility
25 impaired. But I'm against Intro 606. The point of

1
2 this bill is number one, to intimate people to not
3 use micromobility, and number two, to provide
4 opportunity for stop and frisk. The creators of this
5 bill are trying to hide the fact that this is about
6 racism, cultural, ethnicity, and class. The word
7 safety is being used as a wrapper for an opportunity
8 to stop people. Create a real solution that gives
9 space to each user safely, cars, the bikes, and the
10 pedestrians. Where does an annual license
11 registration get sent when you don't have a
12 traditional apartment lease? Are you at risk of
13 being guilty of being poor? The most vulnerable
14 people impacted aren't here because they're working.
15 I can tell you myself when I was in my 20s, I lived
16 in neighborhoods that were part of stop and frisk,
17 and I actually did get stopped and frisked with my
18 car, at least once a week. This is a time when these
19 tickets were \$100 and I made about \$750 a week. So,
20 about \$400 was going a week to tickets that I was
21 getting stopped. Why? Because I was poor and I
22 lived in a poor neighborhood by the airport. Thank
23 you.

24

25

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

You can submit the rest of your testimony in writing, as well. Paul?

PAUL MONDESIRE: Thank you, Madam Chair and to the elected officials that are here. My name is Paul Mondesire and I am a Bronx boy living in downtown Brooklyn. I'm something of a unicorn because I'm a bike rider with 10,000 miles on Citi Bike alone, double that on my own bike, but I'm also a car guy that grew up reading Road & Track and Car & Driver. I was the first local hire and served as Community Relations Lead for Lime during their original pilot program in New York City and was part of the team that lobbied to get local and state legislation passed legalizing e-bikes and e-scooters in New York State. The intent of Intro 606 is laudable and the concept is worthy of consideration. Yet, the DOT already has classified a broad range of micromobility devices and many of them are illegal to operate in New York City right now. Intro 1131 is better in my opinion. The real problem is rider behavior and proper enforcement, and that is why we are here today. The argument is often presented that micromobility is bad and needs greater regulation.

1
2 Macromobility, meaning cars, vans, SUVs and trucks
3 are just fine, but that math is not matching, as the
4 young people say. The number of deaths and injuries
5 caused by the latter is exponentially higher. We've
6 just gotten use to accommodating cars and accepting
7 tragedies as a cost of doing business. We talk about
8 these e-bikes and e-scooters as if they operate
9 autonomously without people riding them, and this is
10 a major problem. What we really have is a human
11 behavior problem. We order everything online, so
12 Amazon, Grub Hub, Door Dash and all of these folks
13 delivery goods and services on our shared streets.
14 Deliveristas risk our lives trying to meet the
15 demands of these companies and who incentivize speed
16 over all else, because time is money. Self-
17 preservation is real. Deliveristas often ride in
18 bike lanes and on sidewalks because cars and trucks
19 are far more dangerous to them than pedestrians. In
20 closing, we need some common language and common
21 sense to guide legislation related to the common
22 ground of our shared streets.

23 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: thank you.

24 PAUL MONDESIRE: I will submit my--

25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
3 Perfect, thank you so much.

4 PAUL MONDESIRE: Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Daniel?

6 DANIEL SOLOW: Good afternoon. My name
7 is Daniel Solow. I'm here today to speak on behalf
8 of my friends and family in Queens and also Central
9 Queens Micromobility which is supporting these modes
10 of transportation. I'm here today to speak against
11 or reject Intro 606, and actually now support 1131.
12 Against them because they seek to implement a license
13 and registration program on all e-bikes and e-
14 scooters. Micromobility creates economic
15 opportunity, expands access to our cultural
16 institutions, and is a greener mode of transport in
17 private cars and trucks. Like many other communities
18 in this city, Forest Hills and Community District in
19 Queens, directly benefit from the recent growth of
20 micromobility. Many of us are commuting to work,
21 running errands and enjoying the shops and cultural
22 institutions. The de facto mode of food delivery in
23 New York City is by micromobility and powered by an
24 immigrant workforce. I'm confident many of us here
25 today at some point this week use one of these

1
2 delivery services, Uber, Door Dash, to enjoy hot meal
3 at home or at work, especially when the weather
4 wasn't so good. Food delivery today mirrors the
5 story of so many of our ancestors who work hard and
6 dangerous jobs to be able to provide for their
7 families. We all benefit from their hard work, so
8 let's send a clear message that we don't want to
9 create additional barriers to them entering the
10 workforce. While the authors of 606 claim to be
11 proponents of street safety, the reality is that it
12 will be a catalyst for increased negative police
13 interactions with Brown and Black New Yorkers,
14 leading to more stress and anxiety in these
15 communities. Our immigrant neighbors are already
16 stressed about the incoming Trump Administration
17 promising mass deportations. I ask the Council to
18 please find street safety solutions that are data-
19 driven. At a time when global temperatures-- I'll
20 just wrap up. At a time when global temperatures
21 across the planet are reaching dangerous levels and
22 flooding is a reality for New Yorkers, especially in
23 Council Member Holden's district, we should expand
24 micromobility, not the other way around. E-bikes
25 reduce fossil fuel emissions and free up our roads

1
2 for more diverse uses. I ask you again, please have
3 compassion and reject Intro 606.

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. I
5 think Council Member Holden has a question for the
6 panel, so if you could just wait.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah, mine's
8 directed at Marisa, and I'm not-- you know, I heard
9 people opposing the bill, but nobody has a solution
10 other than let's widen bike lanes.

11 MARISA REDANTE: it's going to cost a lot
12 more.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah, but widen
14 bike lanes. What happens when you get to the corner,
15 Marisa?

16 MARISA REDANTE: Right.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: which is where we
18 see-- that's where the pedestrian crossing it. And
19 you know, it's strange that I'm hearing people who
20 say, well, it's racist. Well, obviously, they didn't
21 listen to the previous panels with the victims whose
22 lives have been changed. You're just saying bike
23 lanes are going to solve everything. Well, they
24 don't. So, what have you noticed in your
25 neighborhood?

1
2 MARISA REDANTE: I can tell you right
3 now, we have a double-wide lane on 10th Avenue. It's
4 ridiculous. It's mostly empty, and they still go the
5 wrong way. And the other thing is, it's on the
6 sidewalk. Let me tell you something, when you're an
7 older person-- I'm going to be 70. I know I don't
8 look it. If I fell, I could break a hip. That would
9 be a life-changer for me. You're young, it's not
10 going to really-- you're not going to think about it
11 every day.

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Not that
13 much, but thank you.

14 MARISA REDANTE: No, you are. The fear
15 of that. You know, we're asking Council Member, to
16 take the fear out of our lives. In Hell's Kitchen--
17 okay, we have a lot of deliveristas. We have a huge
18 cluster on Ninth Avenue, okay. I'm not blaming the
19 deliveristas. This is all becoming about
20 deliveristas. It's not about that. The people on
21 the e-bikes, many of them young, many of them white,
22 I have to say, go any which way and on the sidewalk
23 which scares the hell out of everybody. The bike
24 lanes are not so crowded. On those pictures there,
25 that's not what I'm seeing in my neighborhood.

1 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you.

2 MARISA REDANTE: And to do the bike lanes
3 over, you tell me that's going to be \$19 million.
4 I've got a bridge to sell you.

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
6 We're going to go to the next panel. Thank you to
7 this panel. The next panel will be Chris Leon
8 Johnson, Essa Blunt [sp?], Peter Shay [sp?], Eric
9 McClure, Elizabeth Chow. Ron Wisniski.

10 CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Thank you,
11 Chair Powers for putting me up in like the first
12 three panels. You usually put me in the back. Thank
13 you for that. I owe you one. I owe you one, Selvena.
14 I think I'm going to love you as an elected official
15 going forward. My hatred stops today. I know it
16 stops-- I know it's two minutes, okay? Alright, so
17 I'm opposed to-- I'm supporting Intro 606. I'm
18 supporting Intro 606. And I'll make this [inaudible]
19 Open Plans that I'm Black. Black man here. This
20 bill is not racist at all. This bill will not bring
21 back stop and frisk. But keep it real, we need to
22 bring back stop and frisk because there's high crime
23 in this city. That's to keep it real. This bill
24 being opposed by these nonprofits like Workers
25

1
2 Justice Project, Trans Alt, Open Plans, this is
3 nothing but fear mongering, and what they do is they
4 weaponized-- they using old, like, situations like
5 stop and frisk to scare elected officials to not
6 supporting this bill. Now, Trans Alt has been handing
7 out this crap here to the people that support this
8 bill, and I want to make this clear today. We say no
9 to Trans Alt. We so no to Open Plans. I want to rip
10 this up right here. This is a BS initiative.
11 They're trying to say that e-bikes are needed. The
12 truth is that e-bikes regulation is needed. That's
13 the truth. This is crap here. This is really crap.
14 I support this organization right here, NYC EVSA,
15 because they're doing the right thing and making sure
16 that the e-bikes be regulated in the City of New
17 York. Shout out to Bob Holden. Thank you for
18 hosting this, putting this bill up, brother. And I
19 appreciate the last Council Member that was here from
20 the 13th District, Marjorie Velázquez, for being part
21 of that bill when it first introduced in City
22 Council. So, I hope that people-- Marjorie Velázquez
23 gets this-- when this goes through that Marjorie
24 Velázquez gets thanked for it, too. Like I said,
25 this bill is far from racist. The real racist here

1
2 are the people that run Trans Alt and Open Plans and
3 Workers Justice Project that really discriminates
4 against Black people, and I've seen this first
5 beforehand that they discriminate against Black
6 people, especially the Workers Justice Project that
7 discriminate against Africans. So, when they talk
8 about how this bill is racist, this is far from
9 racist bill. So, we need this bill to go through.
10 And thank you so much.

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

12 CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Thank you,
13 Powers, for giving me the [inaudible].

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
15 Esther?

16 ESTHER BLOUNT: Hello. Hello, my name is
17 Esther Blount [sp?] and I support Priscilla's Law
18 606. I find it very funny that when it comes to e-
19 bikes, safety goes out the window. Bike lane have
20 been constructed for the purpose of safety. Open
21 streets are created and are called safe streets, but
22 somehow victims who are killed or injured on e-bikes
23 do not fall in this safety category. I pray that
24 this City Council doesn't feel that the body count is
25 not high enough for it to fall into this safety

1
2 category. E-bikes aren't bicycles, and because of
3 their weight and speed, they cause much more damage
4 and are much more dangerous than a regular bike. E-
5 bikes need to be regulated and licensed because of
6 several factors. The enormous amount of seniors in
7 this city who are afraid to cross the street include
8 people with disabilities, individuals who are blind
9 or deaf, and children playing on open streets. I
10 don't want e-bikes banned, but we demand safety for
11 all. As for the idea that this would be hurting
12 minorities who will be subject to additional police
13 stops, or who can't afford the price of licensing and
14 registration, there's no need to worry, because
15 frankly the number of minorities leaving New York
16 City is very high and continues to grow. As all of
17 us know, gentrification has taken over this city. The
18 falsehood that the City of Yes will provide
19 affordable housing will only help with this exodus.
20 One last sentence. E-bikes can help if riders are
21 held accountable. License and registration will help
22 to that end. We will then have safety and
23 micromobility.

24 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
25 Peter? Eric?

1
2 ERIC MCCLURE: Madam Chair, thanks nice,
3 to see you. Thank you for holding this hearing,
4 leader Fariás, Council Member Holden. My name's Eric
5 McClure. I'm the Executive Director of StreetsPAC.
6 It's not hard to understand the motivation behind
7 Intro 606. The rapid adoption of powered
8 micromobility devices has altered the landscape of
9 many city streets, and government's ability to manage
10 that growth hasn't kept up with the technology. Such
11 vehicles have been involved in crashes resulting in
12 injuries and in some cases deaths. Both operators
13 and pedestrians, and any injury or death is
14 unacceptable and demands a policy solution. However,
15 we believe that Intro 606 is a misguided approach
16 that would lead to many more problems than it would
17 solve. E-bikes increase mobility for many people,
18 including commuters, workers, cyclists, the elderly,
19 and people with physical limitations. Mandated
20 registration would have a deeply negative effect on
21 the widespread adoption of e-bikes at a time when the
22 shifting of trips from cars to bikes is in most
23 [inaudible] seen as something that's beneficial.
24 Creating the infrastructure within NYC DOT to manage
25 registration would be extremely costly and

1
2 cumbersome, diverting funding resources form other
3 proven safety efforts. Also, I want to note that
4 nearly every other jurisdiction that's tried or
5 contemplated similar licensing efforts have quickly
6 abandoned it as we've heard earlier today from
7 several people. We also believe a registration
8 requirement would be an invitation for police
9 officers to conduct pretextual [sic] stops of anyone
10 riding a bicycle or scooter of any types, especially
11 if those persons are Black and Brown. And I say this
12 as a white people, and we've heard about white people
13 shouldn't talk about racism, but the facts are that
14 90 percent of the people stopped for jaywalking and
15 for riding on the sidewalk in New York City are
16 people of color, and it's a reason that the Council
17 passed legislation just two months ago to make
18 jaywalking-- which is a name that was coined to make
19 it sound bad-- legal. So the facts are pretty clear
20 on this. Also, I want to note the behaviors I
21 understand would lead to people feeling unsafe, the
22 riding on the sidewalk, the failing to surrender
23 right-of-way to pedestrians at lights and stop signs
24 and riding on one-way streets, they're already
25 illegal but almost universally unenforced. NYPD

1
2 wrote fewer than two tickets per precinct per day for
3 red light running last year, and that's for all
4 vehicles, cars and trucks included. In the tragic
5 case of Priscilla Loke who-- the rider who struck her
6 stayed on the scene and was interviewed by police.
7 He was a on Citi Bike that had an identification
8 number on it. They let him go. It was only later
9 that he was issued a summons for stopping--

10 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]

11 Thank you.

12 ERIC MCCLURE: at a red light. And I just
13 want to really quickly say, we are very supportive of
14 Intro 1131. We think a taskforce, especially on an
15 accelerated time frame makes sense. We should get
16 experts in a room to talk about the best solutions of
17 which we unfortunately don't think 606 is one.

18 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

19 ERIC MCCLURE: Thank you, Chair.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Ron?

21 RON WISNISKI: My name is Ron Wisniski.

22 I've lived in Hell's Kitchen for 45 years. The chaos
23 and danger on our streets caused by bike riders doing
24 whatever they please with no accountability is self-
25 evident. If you live in Manhattan, you have had

1
2 close calls with bike riders traveling against
3 traffic through red lights and on sidewalks. The
4 victims of this free-for-all come from all walks of
5 life and age groups, and include bike riders
6 themselves. The intensity and violence of e-bike
7 versus pedestrian crashes often result in life-
8 changing disability and even death. These senseless
9 sometimes gruesome injuries are not caused by evil
10 automobiles as some would have you believe, nor are
11 they due to a lack of more poorly designed ugly bike
12 lane infrastructure. They're caused by selfish,
13 entitled bike riders breaking the law. Over the past
14 three years precious little has been done to address
15 this crisis and the living hell that our streets have
16 become just keeps getting worse. The victims of this
17 carnage have nothing to gain if this bill or a
18 hundred other bills on this subject pass. The damage
19 to their lives is done. They tell their heroine
20 stories reliving their trauma only because they don't
21 want us to suffer their fate. That's a very noble
22 thing to do. For that, we owe them a deep debt of
23 gratitude, but most of all, we owe them an end to
24 this nightmare. Pass Priscilla's Law. By the way, I
25 was not paid to appear here today. My words are my

1
2 own, and Madam Chairman, please tell your colleagues
3 it's a disgrace they did not stay to listen to this
4 testimony. I salute you for staying. You probably
5 had to, but I hope there's a little something extra
6 in your pay envelope. And Bob Holden, you're a
7 gentleman and a scholar. Thank you very much.

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you,
9 sir. No, there isn't anything extra in the pay. I do
10 need to be here because I'm the Chair, but my
11 colleagues I'm sure are tuning in, but thank you for
12 your testimony. Thank you all for your testimony.
13 But I will say the Majority Leader and Council Member
14 Holden, they're here and they're not the Chair, so
15 thank them also. The next panel we're going to call
16 up, Elizabeth Young, Carl Mahaney, Peter Brown, David
17 Jones, Peter Beadle, Allison Keating. I think I did
18 it. We're going to call Jeffrey Thomas [sp?], and
19 Renee Baruch [sp?]. Elizabeth, you can start
20 whenever you're ready. Just turn your mic on.

21 LIZO YOUNG: Good afternoon. My name is
22 Lizo Young [sp?], and I'm a civil rights attorney,
23 teacher and advocate. I am here today as a beloved
24 friend of the late Priscilla Loke and a proud member
25 of the E-vehicle Safety Alliance. There is no

1
2 greater legitimacy than the grassroots organization,
3 one that was created by the people. This coalition
4 is multivast [sic], young and old, of all different
5 races of all different ages of all different economic
6 ability. Why? Because of safety. This is and
7 always has been an issue of safety. I ask that you
8 not let racism, politics, paid lobbyists or
9 businesses trump safety. When we talk about
10 Priscilla Loke, she died literally just blocks from
11 this City Hall in one of the poorest neighborhoods of
12 this county. And to the person that just testified,
13 yes, you're right. The biker who hit her stayed on
14 the scene, and guess what? The police let him go.
15 And for three weeks we couldn't find an answer. It
16 is the community who held a press conference to get
17 answers and that's exactly why 606 needs to be
18 passed, because the community needs to know who hit
19 them, who killed their loved one. We cannot rely on
20 a system that doesn't deliver safety in order to get
21 answers. There has to be an independent way.
22 Secondly, that not only did New York City, but the
23 Chinese American community lost a treasured jewel.
24 She was a selfless leader, committed to making
25 adolescent children independent, responsible and

1
2 accountable to society. She was robbed of her golden
3 retirement years. I ask, and I ask on behalf of our
4 community, that you don't rob her of her principles,
5 of accountability.

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
7 Thank you.

8 LIZO YOUNG: Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Peter?

10 PETER BEADLE: thank you. Good
11 afternoon, Chair Brooks-Powers and Council Members.
12 Thank you for the opportunity to testify here in
13 opposition to 606 and in favor of 1131. 606 will not
14 make our streets safer, will dissuade people from
15 taking up bike ridership, will result in
16 discriminatory enforcement, and will take time and
17 attention from the true causes of over 200 deaths a
18 year in our busy city streets. I'm Peter Beadle, a
19 25-year resident of Regal Park, Queens, first Vice
20 Chair of Queens Community Board Six where I also
21 serve as the Co-Chair of its Transportation
22 Committee, though I am here in my personal capacity
23 only, and my statements do not reflect the views of
24 the board. I'm also a personal injury attorney
25 representing hundreds of pedestrians and people

1 riding bikes who've been seriously injured or even
2 killed by drivers, and I'm very familiar with the
3 causes of these crashes and the contributing factors
4 of the crashes that cause these devastating injuries,
5 and I believe this bill violates New York State Law.
6 First, despite the constant conflation I have seen
7 from many, electric bicycles are bicycles. VTL102-C
8 defines electric bicycles as bicycles which meets
9 certain criteria, motorized, top assisted speeds,
10 etcetera. The legislature had the option of defining
11 them as a subset of motorcycles like mopeds, but
12 chose not to, correctly so. So, there's really no
13 debate. They are not motor vehicles or mopeds or in
14 any way equivalent to 3,000 pound+ vehicles that kill
15 the vast, vast majority of our fellow New Yorkers,
16 well over 92 percent. And as bicycles, while the City
17 can certainly regulate and should regulate their use--
18 - no riding on the sidewalk, for instance-- it cannot
19 prevent people from the free use of these bicycles or
20 impose a fee for their use. Doing so would violate
21 General Municipal Law 180. Anyone who for whatever
22 reason cannot register their e-bike lacks their
23 required ability to pay the fee would be prohibited
24 under this bill from free use of their bicycle.
25

1
2 That's not legal. And I urge the adoption of 1131 to
3 actually get at the true causes of over 92 percent of
4 the deaths on our streets, instead of diverting our
5 time and energy and to consideration of something
6 that will not solve the problem.

7 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

8 Thank you.

9 PETER BEADLE: Thank you very much.

10 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Peter?

11 PETER BROWN: Hi, my name is Peter Brown.

12 In May of 2020 I was exiting the front door of my
13 residence on East 22nd Street and as I stepped onto
14 the sidewalk I was struck by a speeding e-bike on the
15 sidewalk, less than two feet from my building. The
16 impact was so intense that my body was airborne and
17 was propelled horizontally, landing head first. My
18 face was impaled on the metal sidewalk grating. In
19 the security video, my unconscious, bloody body
20 appears lifeless. I was taken semi-conscious to
21 Bellevue with many wounds across my forehead, my lips
22 here, under my eyes, my nose was broken. Among the
23 forehead wounds, there was one that was so large that
24 the flesh was ripped almost to the skull, so large it
25 couldn't be closed with stitches. There was nerve

1
2 damage from my mouth-- I still have difficulty
3 speaking at times-- all the way down to my feet
4 because of the spinal cord nerves. I've had numerous
5 reconstructive surgeries and scar revision procedures
6 since then which I'm very grateful for. The e-bike
7 delivery person did not run away, and his information
8 was given to police. However, weeks after he
9 disappeared and the authorities could no longer find
10 him. Attempts to find him or locate him or have him
11 face any consequences were unsuccessful. Both
12 Postmates and Grub Hub denied employing him even
13 though his delivery bag looked very much like a
14 Postmates logo. The following week I went to local
15 precinct. I was told my accident was not serious,
16 meaning a limb was not lost, they told me. Since the
17 incidents I've attempted to stop many e-bikers on the
18 sidewalk, explain it's illegal to use unless they're
19 under 13 years old. They usually shout obscenities
20 at me. If I ask the police that are nearby when I see
21 a bike going on the sidewalk, they say there's
22 nothing they could do. The bikes on the sidewalk
23 often have an adjacent bike lane. I assist in caring
24 for three elderly seniors in my building. If one of
25 them had been hit on the sidewalk like I was, they

1
2 would likely not have survived. The illegal behavior
3 must be stopped. There's no consequence for the
4 dangerous behavior so it continues. I understand that
5 many bike messengers are from places where the
6 situations and laws are different. There needs to be
7 an education of the laws here with a test before
8 granting access to e-bikes.

9 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

10 PETER BROWN: Can I-- just one sentence
11 more. And there have to be real consequences for
12 breaking law. This is [inaudible] safety of all New
13 Yorkers. Priscilla's Law needs to be passed. Thank
14 you very much.

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

16 Next we'll hear from Jeffrey.

17 JEFFREY THOMAS: Hi, good afternoon. My
18 name is Jeffrey Thomas. I live in Brooklyn. I'd like
19 to tell you about the bicycle I ride to get to work.
20 I have an electric version of a model that has been
21 made for 50 years. It doesn't way 60 to 70 pounds.
22 It weighs maybe half of that. Up to 18 miles an hour
23 it provides a little boost when I pedal. Any faster,
24 the motor turns off. I have asthma, and the assist
25 helps me stay active without getting out of breath.

1
2 A friend of mine has the same model because she was
3 hit by a car and with her knee she can't ride an
4 unpowered bike. If you look very closely at our
5 bikes, you can see a small motor in the middle of the
6 front wheel. Other than that, our bikes look
7 identical to the non-electric version. Intro 606
8 says that we need a license, and thousands of other
9 bikes in the city that look just like it do not. How
10 is that going to be enforced? Maybe the honor
11 system? Now, I will get a license if this passes,
12 but if, God forbid, I get in a crash, I will stick
13 around. I will provide my information. I will make
14 myself accessible as long as needed. If you're
15 relying on my honor, you don't need my license plate.
16 Or maybe, every bicycle in the City without a license
17 is going to get pulled over just in case it has a
18 tiny motor. This is the concern people are raising
19 with policing. It's not the tickets for illegal
20 behavior. It is pulling over every cyclist, everyone
21 in this room who cycles, for legal behavior. It's a
22 massive waste. Either way, a massive waste of time
23 and resources. Now, you might say, we're not worried
24 about your bike. We're worried about thing that look
25 nothing like regular bikes that go 30, 40 miles an

1
2 hour. Those are already regulated and not just in
3 Denmark. New York State Law, as the lawyer said,
4 calls those electric motorcycles, mopeds, not
5 bicycles. You already need a license plate and
6 registration, and the state DMV will already register
7 those. They're already not allowed in bike lanes.
8 These laws exist. If people don't know that law, if
9 stores are selling motorcycles and calling them e-
10 bikes, which is a real problem, how will another law
11 make things less confusing? How will charging local
12 DOT to come up with a brand new licensing program
13 help? And speaking of the DOT, they presented to my
14 neighborhood recently about plans to add protection.
15 The data says that the work they're doing will make
16 things safer for everyone, including pedestrians.
17 This is an overworked, underfunded agency with plenty
18 of important work to do already. This bill has
19 important goals. I agree with the goals. We know
20 how to achieve them. They are best achieved by
21 letting the DOT do the things we know will work. So
22 I urge you--

23 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
24 Thank you. Renee?
25

1
2 RENE: Hi, I'm 76 years old and that
3 picture was taken after I was hit by an e-bike. I
4 had already had many plastic surgeries in the
5 emergency room where they took me when I was
6 unconscious, and the e-bike rider who hit me fled. I
7 stayed in the hospital for four days. I've had many,
8 many surgeries. My spine had to be fixed. That was
9 another four-day surgery. I would like to point out--
10 I'm not sticking to my script. I would like to point
11 out, you all paid for my surgeries. Congratulations.
12 You all paid for my hospitalizations, because I'm
13 old. I'm on Medicare, but I guess that money doesn't
14 count. The money that you might spend to keep me
15 safe, that seems to be a burden. It is a disgrace.
16 It is a disgrace that you don't believe your lying
17 eyes when you go out in the street and you see those
18 e-bikes going in all directions. You see them going
19 through red lights. You see them running people over.
20 And what do you do? Give them wider lanes so that
21 people have to scurry even faster to get across the
22 street when the light is green and look in both
23 directions. We have our heads on swivels. I'm
24 terrorized, and nobody, nobody seems to be doing
25 anything about it except Bob, and I thank you.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Please,
3 please keep decorum, because we will have you
4 removed. Before I pass it to Council Member Holden
5 for questions, I do want to just take a moment to
6 acknowledge the testimony by the loved ones of
7 Priscilla as well as those who have been directly
8 impacted themselves. This Council understands and
9 recognizes the need to do something, and that is why
10 we are hearing-- we're hearing these bills today.
11 That is why you see that there are three bills today
12 that are being heard, to look at it from every lens
13 to see how we move forward to better regulate this
14 new mode of transportation. When cars came around,
15 they had to create laws for that. When planes
16 started going in the air they had to start regulating
17 that. So, we understand and we are looking for a
18 solution that one, is implementable, and that takes
19 into account and can really ensure safety. And so I
20 want people to understand, and I think one of my
21 colleagues said this earlier, these bill complement
22 each other. Whichever bill, you know, moves forward
23 or what have you, because I know one resolution is
24 dealing with the state, and that means that they're
25 looking at it too. So it's not to say that

1
2 government is not recognizing it. We're just trying
3 to chart the course forward in terms of what that
4 appropriate path may be. But I do want to
5 acknowledge what I have heard, and just know that are
6 taking this serious. This committee is prioritizing
7 this issue, and so I wanted to just state that. And
8 then I'm going to yield to Council Member Holden for
9 his questions.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thanks, Renee,
11 and all the people that have been hurt. I've listened
12 over a period of two, three years now, all the
13 victims, and I think the opponents of this bill, by
14 the way, have no solutions to what happens when you
15 get to a corner. They-- that-- nobody comes up with
16 an answer for that-- of enforcement. So, let's say
17 the license costs \$10 fee. I don't care what the fee
18 would be. We just want accountability. The fact,
19 Renee, that the person that hit you with an e-bike--
20 you were knocked unconscious. You were-- and the
21 rider fled the scene. There was no police report.
22 I'm hearing that from so many victims that there was
23 no police report. They don't have a category. Well,
24 if you don't know who it is, we can't catch them. If
25 they had a plate, Renee, they would have gotten this

1
2 guy. They would have-- we would have looked at
3 cameras. They would have caught that person. If
4 anybody is opposing this bill and doesn't care about
5 the victims, you have no heart. You only care about
6 your e-bikes, and most of them are e-bike riders, but
7 they're not worrying about the consequences, nor are
8 they considering if there is no bill-- if my bill
9 fails, then again, we're back to lawlessness in our
10 streets, and we can't even walk without worrying
11 about what happened to Renee and Paul and everybody
12 else-- Peter, I'm sorry. Peter, I know you had a
13 picture, and please get us a blow-up of that, because
14 we need to show opponents of this bill the
15 consequences. Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you to
17 this panel. The next panel we are calling, Seth
18 Jacobson, Sharon Flannigan [sp?], Kathleen Brady,
19 Carl Tait, Alia Soomro, Peggy Yannis [sp?]. Angela
20 DeWood? Sean Sweeney? John Manasse [sp?], John
21 Manasse? Wayne Kabah [sp?]? Raul Rivera. Seth, you
22 can begin. Turn your microphone, please.

23 SETH JACOBSON: Thank you City Council
24 Members who are here. I'm Seth Jacobson. I'm a 40-
25 year resident of New York City. What am I doing? I'm

1 crossing the street safely, alright? I'm walking.
2 I'm looking out for blind spots. I'm looking out for
3 e-bikes, alright? I'm looking out for e-bikes
4 barreling towards me, maybe from the sidewalk, maybe
5 gunning through red lights. I'm looking at the edge
6 of peripheral vision, and I've got good peripheral
7 vision. I've been playing basketball. I'm 65. I
8 still play. I'm looking at my peripheral vision like
9 for stealth ninjas coming at me, right? This has got
10 to stop. We don't have to look for cars. We're used
11 to looking for cars. We know what cars look like
12 because they're big, right? And we know what they
13 look like. We can't see these things. Even when
14 we're looking at them we can't see them because they
15 don't even have lights half the time. in the many
16 years I've been in the city, and I've been riding my
17 bike-- I've got six bikes, 40 years, so I'm a biker
18 as well as a basketball player as well as a
19 pedestrian. Thank you very much. In the 40 years
20 I've bene in the city, I've witnessed so many
21 infractions, and over the last five years with e-
22 bikers, I've probably seen a thousands of them. And
23 I've never, ever, ever, ever seen an e-biker pulled
24 over, ever. And believe me, I've seen cops do this,
25

1 shrug their shoulders. And of course, I get it.
2 What is he going to turn into the flash and run down
3 the guy? I mean, you can't do it. There's no
4 license plates. There's nothing, right? How is it
5 going to be enforced? We need license plates. It's
6 clear. We need registration. We need license
7 plates. We do it for cars, and cars for the most
8 part obey the rules, obey the rules for the most
9 part. Imagine what it'd be like if we didn't license
10 cars and register them.
11

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

13 SETH JACOBSON: Priscilla's Law.

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Sharon? Are
15 you Sharon? No, okay. Are you Kathleen?

16 KATHLEEN BRADY: Yes.

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay, go
18 ahead.

19 KATHLEEN BRADY: Yes, thank you. Good
20 afternoon and thank you for the opportunity to speak
21 supporting Intro 606. I am an unpaid member of New
22 York City EVSA. I could be doing other work, but I
23 want to say-- right now, but I want to help my city.
24 Various friends of mine from suburbs in Westchester,
25 Putnam and Morris Counties, people who would come

1 here by train, people who are prosperous, healthy, in
2 the prime of life, and willing to spend money say
3 they are done with New York. The hassles are not
4 worth it, notably, their fear of e-bikes bearing down
5 on them on sidewalks and coming at them in
6 crosswalks, and running lights in Central Park. They
7 say they are sideswiped and worse every time they
8 come here. That's what happens to me every day. The
9 bikes are not their only complaint, of course, but it
10 is the top one. Unlicensed, predatory electric
11 assist vehicles are costing our restaurants, hotels
12 and cultural institutions money and support. I care
13 more about the people, but this is killing our city.
14 Besides, you know, what these bikes have caused these
15 institutions, they've cost us-- some of us-- our
16 lives and our mobility as you've heard today. Intro
17 606 holds the promise of bringing law and improving
18 safety in New York City. Please pass this. Thank
19 you.

21 CARL TAIT: Am I next? Carl Tait, yes, I
22 am. My name is Carl Tait and I've lived in Midtown
23 Manhattan since 1997. I'm speaking today in support
24 of Intro 606, Priscilla's Laws. I'm not a fan of cars
25 and haven't owned one in over 20 years. I walk or

1
2 take public transportation everywhere I go in this
3 city. E-bikes are in theory a welcome alternative,
4 but in practice they're a constant nightmare. They
5 routinely speed through solid red lights, go the
6 wrong way on one-way streets, and ride on the
7 sidewalk. Compounding the danger, they are fast.
8 They are heavy, and they're nearly silent. Far too
9 many e-bikers view traffic laws as entirely optional
10 and get angry if you challenge their dangerous law-
11 breaking. One nearly mowed down my daughter and me
12 while we were crossing with the light, and they
13 didn't even slow down. In another case, I yelled at
14 an e-biker who was barreling through a red light. He
15 responded by punching me as he drove by. The absence
16 of a license plate made it effectively impossible to
17 report the assault. Intro 606 is a common sense
18 measure that will require license plates on e-
19 vehicles. This is fundamental to accountability.
20 The counter argument that e-bikes would suddenly stop
21 breaking the law if cycling infrastructure were
22 improved is sheer fantasy. This is contradicted on a
23 daily basis by e-bikes constantly and aggressively
24 ignoring traffic laws even in protected bike lanes.
25 The argument that it's racist to enforce traffic laws

1
2 is nonsensical on its face. But opposition to this
3 license law smacks of ageism and ableism. Those of
4 us who are over 60 have slower reaction times. My
5 downstairs neighbor is in a wheelchair. We cannot
6 nimbly dodge entitled scofflaws who refuse to be held
7 accountable for their actions. Reject the inane non-
8 arguments of the opposition. Stand up for
9 accountability and safety and vote in favor of Intro
10 606. Thank you.

11 RAUL RIVERA: Good afternoon. My name is
12 Raul Rivera. I'm a TLC driver and a TLC driver
13 advocate. We want say thank you to Council Member
14 Bob Holden for Intro 606. We support it strongly. It
15 needs to pass. We ask the Council Member to step up
16 and pass this bill. We know that-- I mean,
17 personally I've seen bills pass in six months, so I
18 don't know why it's taking so long. I want to
19 mention that as a driver working in Park Slope going
20 down Sixth Street, an e-biker ran the light, smashed
21 my car. I thought it was another car that hit me,
22 the explosion was so loud. So, I pulled over to see
23 what was going on. It turns out it was like a ghost.
24 I never saw him. It wasn't for the dash cam, you
25 would not see it. I had damages over \$1,000. I had

1
2 to pay out of pocket, and I did the right thing, and
3 I called the police and I found my police report. I
4 have no points on my licenses. We have a petition to
5 reform the Taxi and Limousine Commission that the
6 Commissioner himself signed. This commissioner and
7 his family vehicle-- I don't know if you know, he's
8 got 66 camera tickets, you know that? He has 66
9 camera tickets, and this guy's opposing a bill to put
10 plates on e-bikes. It's ridiculous, you know? You
11 know, personally I think he's a filthy person. He's a
12 filthy rat. We don't have nothing personal against
13 him, but that's how we feel, you know? And one thing
14 that's not being mentioned here in this city, which
15 is very important-- and remember, you guys took an
16 oath, Council Member, Chair, you took an oath. Our
17 city is being sold out. It's being monetized by
18 Uber, Lyft, Door Dash. They don't have the right to
19 monetize our city the way it's happening. You know,
20 when it comes to the City of Yes, they want to remove
21 parking to build housing. How about removing Citi
22 Bike? Remove them. They're just sitting there
23 taking up space. We urge that you pass this bill,
24 and we thank you, again, Mr. Holden.

25 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Aliyah?

1
2 ALI SOOMRO: Good afternoon. My name is
3 Alia Soomro and I'm the Deputy Director for New York
4 City Policy at the New York League of Conservation
5 Voters. Thank you, Chairs Brooks-Powers and members
6 of the Committee on Transportation for the
7 opportunity to speak. I have submitted longer
8 written comments. NYLCV is a steadfast support of e-
9 mobility devices to reduce the amount of fossil fuel
10 based cars on our streets which helps to decrease
11 greenhouse gas emissions, air pollution, and vehicle
12 congestion. E-mobility devices are increasingly
13 becoming more affordable and accessible in how the
14 large portion of city residents who don't have cars
15 make non-car transportation more accessible over
16 longer distances, especially in transit deserts. We
17 fully acknowledge that there are many safety concerns
18 that come with the increase in e-mobility devices
19 throughout our city. Frankly, our city has made--
20 while our city has made many street improvements, it
21 has not kept pace with the rapid use of these
22 devices. As outlined below, we must prioritize
23 street safety improvements, education, public
24 awareness campaigns to name a few and not unintended
25 consequences, especially for people who use these

1 devices to make a living. NYLCV strongly opposes
2 Intro 606 by requiring e-mobility devices to be
3 licensed and registered. It will burden e-mobility
4 riders without actually improvising street safety,
5 ultimately setting us back on our climate efforts.
6 Every major city that has instituted bike licensing
7 has subsequently repealed it as ineffective. This
8 bill is not only a bureaucratic nightmare for DOT,
9 but it also leaves open major questions on how this
10 bill will be enforced. I want to emphasize the
11 enforcement aspect, and not necessarily how the bill
12 is written, because data shows that Black and Latinx
13 people are disproportionately stopped and searched
14 and arrested in traffic stops. NYLCV strongly
15 supports Intro 1131, sponsored by Council Member
16 Brooks-Powers, which would establish a taskforce. In
17 addition to Intro 1131, we join our partners calling
18 for comprehensive solutions. We must continue to
19 invest in bike infrastructure and we need to work
20 with app companies.
21

22 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

23 ALI SOOMRO: Thank you for the
24 opportunity to comment.
25

1
2 ANGELA DEWOOD: Good afternoon. Thank
3 you for holding this hearing. My name is Angela
4 DeWood, and I'm the Deputy Executive Director of
5 Carnegie East House, an assisted living community on
6 the upper east side of Manhattan. We're the only
7 nonprofit of our kind. Our community means a lot to
8 many New York families. It matters that we stick
9 around, but we have a grave problem at our doorstep.
10 Our community sits on Second Avenue adjacent to a
11 bike lane that has become a major thoroughfare for e-
12 vehicle traffic, and the mere thought of widening
13 this bike lane before any accountability measures
14 actually terrifies me. Every day, our elderly
15 residents, visitors, family members, and care
16 partners face real danger simply stepping outside of
17 our front door. The unregulated nature of e-vehicles
18 often traveling at high speeds, going the wrong way,
19 listening to air pods, checking their phone,
20 deliveristas, Citi bikers, anyone who's commuting on
21 e-vehicle, this danger-- this is a danger that poses
22 a significant threat to the safety of our community
23 and older adults. We are unable to simply navigate
24 our own sidewalks, and I can tell you as an
25 experienced clinician, a fall from the impact of a e-

1
2 vehicle would more often than not kill and older
3 adult. As a cyclist and someone who commutes to work
4 myself on an e-vehicle, I fully support 606. I would
5 gladly register and identify myself as an e-vehicle
6 commuter in New York City and be held accountable.
7 Trust me, it's scary out there. I believe
8 accountability is essential for ensuring a safe
9 coexistence. Accountability matters. Accountability
10 changes behavior. For the safety and wellbeing of
11 our city and each other, I urge you to pass 606.
12 Please, something has to be done. Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
14 Thank you to this panel. Any questions? Okay.
15 Thank you. The next panel we'll hear from Patricia
16 McGovern, Michael Gervino-- Gervino-- Mary Alford--
17 Mary Alford? Ann McDermott, Ernest Augustus [sp?],
18 Judith Polsten [sp?]? Karen Sigel [sp?]. We can
19 start from left and go--

20 UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you. I'm here as a
21 longtime resident of New York City to testify in
22 support of Intro 606, because it is a common sense
23 step to help protect New Yorkers from the risk posed
24 by e-bikes and other e-vehicles. I've lived in New
25 York since the 1970s, including through the high

1
2 crime era of the 1980s. I have never felt as
3 threatened walking in New York as I do today because
4 of e-vehicles. I've almost been hit more times than I
5 can count in my neighborhood and elsewhere, including
6 Central Park. Close calls include e-bikes on
7 sidewalks, in pedestrian zones and e-bikes running
8 lights at crosswalks including on bike lanes. The
9 bike lane on Columbus Avenue was particularly risky
10 when the dining sheds were up, because e-bikes,
11 they're sped through lights from behind the sheds
12 where they were very hard to spot. The growth of e-
13 bikes as a form of transportation requires acceptance
14 of responsibility by those who use them. They should
15 follow traffic rules, but that is not true today.
16 Instead, while cars and trucks are required to be
17 registered, insured, operated by qualified drivers to
18 follow traffic rules and stay on the scene after an
19 accessible, e-bike-- e-vehicles are not required to
20 do any of those things, although they are motorized,
21 heavy, fast and potentially deadly. Priscilla's Law
22 would help. Registration would encourage compliance
23 with traffic laws and allow for objective non-
24 discriminatory camera enforcement. Please take
25 action. I also support further study and

1
2 infrastructure changes may be useful, but we need
3 action now. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

5 KAREN SHEGREW: Good afternoon. My Karen
6 Shegrew, a New Yorker of 30 years and a District
7 Seven voter. The onslaught of unregulated,
8 unregistered, often illegal and unaccountable e-bikes
9 and other devices has turned our city into a Mad Max
10 world where the people with the most powerful
11 machines are the alphas. The rest of us are the
12 losers. Every day on our streets and sidewalks it a
13 test of nerves, a game of chicken. Personally, I was
14 mowed down while crossing Broadway by an e-vehicle,
15 not a delivery person, who felt that he had the right
16 to run a red light. I broke my wrist, fractured my
17 pelvis, and my assailant fled. I recovered, but
18 frankly I'm tired of bending the knee altering my
19 life to accommodate the money interest of
20 corporations who exploit their bike-riding workers
21 and encourage a culture of lawlessness that has been
22 allowed to grow unchecked because city officials have
23 taken so long to understand we have a crisis. None
24 of us would be here today asking for licensing if DOT
25 and NYPD and DMV were actually doing an enforcement

1
2 or actually collecting any real data. We would not
3 be here asking for licensing if e-bike riders stopped
4 at red lights, if delivery drivers didn't ride on
5 sidewalks or go down one-way streets the wrong way.
6 If anyone in opposition to this bill actually had the
7 solution to curb these illegal behaviors, that would
8 be one thing, but I've been here all day standing in
9 the back, because I can't sit down a very long time.
10 I've been here listening all day and I've yet to hear
11 a solution from the other side, except for the same
12 which is build more bike lanes so they can be filled
13 with more bikes doing illegal things. I'm a cyclist.
14 To my fellow cyclists, you're lying to yourselves if
15 you think e-bikers will obey rules if you're given
16 bigger lanes where fast and slow should be separated
17 when they don't do it now. Thank you so much.

18 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

19 ANN MCDERMOTT: Hello, my name is Ann
20 McDermott. I was born and raised in this town and
21 I've been a cyclist all my life. I'm also a licensed
22 New York City tour guide. Somebody said you can't
23 license in New York City earlier. They're wrong,
24 because this is a license and it comes from one of
25 your agencies. Any case, I do-- I currently

1 live/reside on the upper east side at 82nd Street and
2 Second Avenue. Every night when I come home and get
3 off the Q train at 83rd Street and Second Avenue, I'm
4 literally afraid to cross Second Avenue fearing the
5 parade of delivery bikes that never stop for a light
6 and often don't have any headlights themselves. I
7 have had many near-misses with bikes going 25 miles
8 an hour down Second Avenue. I also use that bike
9 lane myself, but most of the vehicles are not actual
10 bicycles. They're motorized e-bikes, scooters or
11 motorcycles. As a New York City tour guide, I
12 actually do tours that begin right behind this
13 building on Broadway and Warren Street, and I often
14 see motorized e-bikes and vehicles going directly
15 through City Hall Park here with impunity. They are--
16 they never stop. They're never questioned. Just
17 mixing with tourists and pedestrians while going 20
18 miles an hour towards the Brooklyn Bridge. I
19 recently broke my left arm. Coming home from the
20 doctor with my left arm in a sling, minding my own
21 business, walking up the east side of Third Avenue
22 between 81st and 80th Street, a very narrow street due
23 to the-- taking over the sidewalk by Eli's Grocery
24 Store. A young man came careening down, passed me on
25

1
2 an electric scooter going about 15 miles an hour, and
3 I just said very loudly, "Not on the sidewalk." I
4 feared for my life after having just had surgery,
5 orthopedic surgery. He then threatened me and said,
6 "I'll break your other arm." Often there are
7 delivery people going in any direction they want on
8 my block, East 82nd Street. The City is devolving
9 into a total free-for-all with e-bikes and motorized
10 vehicles running the show and the rest of us cowering
11 in our corners--

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
13 Thank you.

14 ANN MCDERMOTT: waiting for a time to
15 cross. Please do something.

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
17 Thank you.

18 ERNEST AUGUSTUS: Thank you, Chair
19 Brooks-Powers and the Committee on Transportation and
20 Infrastructure. My name is Ernest Augustus [sp?] and
21 I am a resident of Clinton Hill, Fort Greene and
22 Brooklyn. I also served on CB2 on its Land Use
23 Committee and its Transportation Committee for a
24 number of years. I'm testifying today in strong
25 support of Intro 606, Priscilla's Law, which would

1
2 require license plates for all e-bikes, e-
3 micromobility vehicles. EVSA, the NYC E-Vehicle
4 Safety Alliance, has spearheaded this proposed bill
5 as a vital public safety initiative to protect our
6 most vulnerable, the elderly, disabled, and kids and
7 all pedestrians, cyclists and e-bikers from death and
8 serious injuries. Their support for this bill is all
9 about public safety as we go about our business on
10 the sidewalk and the streets of New York. I can
11 attest to the fact that this issues of e-bike safety
12 resonates in the Clinton Hill, Fort Greene community,
13 especially among Black women who are angry about the
14 safety issue and my wife is one among them. Members
15 of this committee have also walked out of this City
16 Council campus and City Council office building and
17 seen these bikes. So surely you know what I'm
18 talking about. The question that I pose to this
19 committee in support of this bill is, is this a
20 legitimate public safety issue? I'm convinced that
21 it is. It's not that complex. There has been
22 asserted efforts to delegitimize this issue by gas
23 lighting the public and policy makers to not believe
24 their own eyes and to demonize the supporters of this
25 bill.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you,
3 sir. I have the full testimony.

4 ERNEST AUGUSTUS: Okay, thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

6 JUDY POSEN: Hello. I'm Judy Posen
7 [sp?]. I have lived in New York since Christmas Day
8 of 1990. As an unpaid volunteer, I thank you for
9 holding this hearing. I urge the 606 be passed and
10 here is why. Without licensing and registration of
11 e-vehicles including e-Citi Bikes, their drivers are
12 almost completely unaccountable for hitting
13 pedestrians, because the drivers cannot be
14 identified. Even before COVID I was frequently
15 menaced on my work commute by bike drivers. Now,
16 every time I leave my front door I see bike drivers
17 running red lights, riding against the flow of
18 traffic, and riding on the sidewalks, all illegal but
19 current unaccountable behaviors. In June 2021, Bryan
20 Boyd [sp?], a man in his 20s driving a motorized
21 scooter blew through a red light at Amsterdam Avenue
22 and West 64th steps from my apartment and fatally hit
23 Lisa Baines [sp?]. He then fled the scene leaving
24 her lying in a crosswalk to die. He then drove to a
25 shop that repaired his electric scooter while he

1
2 drank a Heineken. Yes, he was caught, but only
3 because his face was seen on security cameras on the
4 NYCHA building at the intersection where he committed
5 his heartless murder. There are many people in this
6 room, as you've heard, whose assailants were never
7 identified, let alone caught. You've heard much about
8 the loss of Priscilla Loke, a woman of color in whose
9 memory this bill is named. There are so many more
10 examples. Caring about the fact that e-bikers are
11 dying on these bikes too is the opposite of racist.
12 If e-bike riders ride with more accountability due to
13 plates, they are safer, too. We need an actual
14 identifiable license plate on every e-bike and e-
15 scooter. We need Priscilla's Law to be passed. Some
16 of us would just like to be able to go to the grocery
17 store without being menaced by bullies on bikes.
18 This would be a start. Thank you.

19 MICHAEL GERVINO: Thank you for holding
20 this hearing. My name is Michael Gervino [sp?]. I'm
21 a lifelong New Yorker. I'm a husband, a father, and
22 a grandfather. I'm here today to advocate for
23 Priscilla's Law and to tell you that I no longer feel
24 safe walking around the City because of the current
25 proliferation of e-bikes that have taken over our

1 streets and sidewalks. When I leave my apartment
2 building now, I literally look both ways on the
3 sidewalk, because e-bikes are flying down my
4 sidewalk. This is something that the Commissioner
5 even mentioned that when leaves his house-- the DOT
6 Commissioner-- that he steps out first before his two
7 daughters. I don't know how he cannot support this
8 bill. It's preposterous. In short, I'm in constant
9 fear of being hit by a bike. This is what I
10 encounter daily: e-bikes running red lights and stop
11 signs; e-bikes riding on the sidewalk; e-bikes
12 creeping up and idling behind me on the sidewalk; e-
13 bikes riding in the opposite direction of traffic; e-
14 bikes driving diagonally across avenues; e-bikes
15 knifing through crosswalks; e-bikes riding at full
16 speed at pedestrians. That's very common. You're
17 crossing the street and they ride full speed and they
18 stop. It's disconcerting. This is not to mention
19 the enumerable fires that lithium batteries have
20 caused throughout the city, something that I have
21 firsthand experience with. I've bene clipped, run
22 into, injured, intimidated, cursed at, threatened by
23 e-bike riders. On two separate occasions last week,
24 an e-bike drove into my infant granddaughter in a
25

1
2 stroller, 11-month-old granddaughter. I had to yell
3 at them, and what did they do? They yelled back at
4 me. It's completely preposterous. I literally am in
5 fear of taking my granddaughter out on the street. I
6 know my time is up. So--

7 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
8 You can submit the full testimony to us.

9 MICHAEL GERVINO: Yes, thank you. Thank
10 you for your time.

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you,
12 sir. Council Member-- one moment.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you. Just--
14 - I want to ask Karen how she feels about the
15 Commissioner's testimony today, because, you know, I
16 experienced what you experienced kind of when I was
17 nine year's old. I was hit by a car and my pelvis
18 broke. Your pelvis broke. I know what that feels
19 like. It's debilitating, and I don't know-- I was
20 nine years old and I still feel the effects of
21 getting hit by car. But your wrist was broken. Your
22 pelvis was broken. Your elbow dislocated. You have
23 post-traumatic stress. I mean, everything that was
24 done to you, and then when you hear a commissioner
25

1
2 who had no answers. I mean, I would-- I don't know
3 how you could remain quiet, because I would be--

4 KAREN SHEGREW: [interposing] Well, they
5 were going to throw me out, I think.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I mean-- I know.
7 Maybe-- again, but it's really-- it makes my blood
8 boil sitting up here.

9 KAREN SHEGREW: I must--

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing] But
11 not experiencing what you experienced.

12 KAREN SHEGREW: I don't want to whine
13 about this. I have recovered, but the fact of the
14 matter is, I can't get back on my bicycle because of
15 this, and to hear the Commissioner of the Department
16 of Transportation say-- minimize this problem, to try
17 to say that cars are a bigger issue, no one is
18 disputing that. But can't we have a solution to this
19 problem as well. And I must say, the biggest
20 disappointment for me is in my fellow cyclist who
21 don't acknowledge that this is a real issue, and
22 don't acknowledge that this is an accountability
23 problem and won't sign onto this as well. I was
24 shocked by the Commissioner's testimony.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you.

1
2 KAREN SHEGREW: Thank you.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you, panel.

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you to
5 this panel. We'll now hear from the next panel.

6 Mary Bakris [sp?], Mary Evancho, Carol Wilson, Melody
7 Carnit [sp?], Sanja Pohl, Scott Pohl, Karen Phillips.

8 SCOTT POHL: Hello. Thank you to the
9 Council. Thank you for having this meeting and
10 allowing us to speak. My name's Scott Pohl and I'm
11 here to support Priscilla's Law. In June this year,
12 an e-scooter hit my wife and me while we were
13 walking. It caused us many injuries, including
14 traumatic brain injury, bleeding on the brain. I was
15 unconscious and hospitalized for two weeks. Since
16 then I've been in therapy and I can't work. That e-
17 scooter hit us, turned our lives upside down, but
18 then went back to his own life with no consequences.
19 Pedestrians in New York need to be safer, and e-bikes
20 and e-scooters need to be held accountable. Please
21 do something to help us. Please support Priscilla's
22 Law. Thank you.

23 MARY EVANCHO: Thank you, Chair, and to
24 the Council Members who have stayed here with us to
25 hear the people. My name is Mary Evancho. I've

1
2 lived in New York City for 47 years. Like the
3 majority of New Yorkers here, I don't feel safe. E-
4 bikes are moving at great speeds in all directions,
5 and those on the sidewalk coming from behind are
6 frightening. After several near misses I constantly
7 look behind to see if the coast is clear. This is
8 the state of our city today and not a standard for
9 the greatest city in the world. Priscilla's law is
10 the first step towards accountability. Those in
11 opposition refer to Priscilla's Law as red tape, an
12 inconvenience, an unnecessary expense, and go further
13 to call it discriminatory. Let's be clear,
14 Priscilla's Law is the for the protection of all
15 drivers and all pedestrians and all people of color.
16 Priscilla's Law, Council Members, is the foundation
17 from which we will draw accountability. It is what
18 the majority of New Yorkers want to see enacted, and
19 we are standing by. Thank you.

20 SANJA POHL: This is not about me,
21 because nobody can give me back what I have lost.
22 It's about safety of pedestrians. My name is Sanja
23 Pohl. My husband and I were hit by an e-scooter
24 while walking this summer. My husband got traumatic
25 brain injury. He was unconscious for days and spent

1 days-- spent 10 days in intensive care in a hospital.
2 I didn't know if he would survive. Later, I didn't
3 know if he would recover. He's still not working. I
4 had a broken nose and shoulder and foot injuries.
5 Imagine how fast they can go to cause such injuries.
6 We both have trauma and we are terrified to be
7 outside in New York City. It's too stressful even to
8 go to a grocery store. We have to have rules for e-
9 vehicles. They are not the same thing as regular
10 bikes. Even if they are not in the legal category of
11 motor vehicles, there must be responsibility and
12 consequences if they hurt someone. They took over
13 our sidewalks and our parks. It's so complicated for
14 walkers to get across the street. If we don't do
15 anything soon, the number of victims is going to
16 increase, and that's obvious. Let's work on this
17 together. Thank you.

19 CAROL WILSON: My name's Carol Wilson and
20 I've been hit by a bike not once, but twice. Both
21 times I was crossing a street in a pedestrian walkway
22 with the walk signal. The first time I was hit, I
23 saw the walk signal, but before leaving the curb, I
24 looked in all direction for bikes. I saw none. I
25 took two steps into the street, and there was a bike

1
2 coming straight at me. I put up my hand and yelled
3 stopped. The next thing I remember is looking up at
4 the cyclist who was straddling her Citi Bike yelling
5 at me "Get up out of the street." I dragged myself
6 to the curb where I already felt a huge lump on my
7 head. I asked her to call 911. She did not. She
8 left. I called. At the ER I was diagnosed with a
9 skull fracture and had to wait there 10 more hours to
10 make sure that my brain wasn't bleeding. This was
11 especially dangerous as I'm on a blood-thinner.
12 Thankfully, my brain was not bleeding. During my
13 long wait, I called the police to make a report, and
14 just as I was leaving the ER a police detective came.
15 I asked if he thought they could find the cyclist.
16 He said, "Probably not. Citi Bike does not cooperate
17 with the police." Due to the skull fracture, I could
18 not read for two years. This was devastating as I
19 was working on a research project. The second time I
20 was hit, I fell down, passed out and hit my head
21 again. Now, I'm terrified to cross the street in New
22 York City. Every time I go out I know I'm putting my
23 life in danger. Priscilla Loke did lose her life.
24 Please make New York safer for all New Yorkers by
25 passing Priscilla's Law. Thank you.

1
2 KAREN PHILLIPS: Good afternoon. My name
3 is Karen Phillips and I wanted to thank you all for
4 holding this hearing. I'm very lucky. I'm into my 80s
5 and I have not been hit by a bicycle, but I am
6 terrified. I look both ways, I swivel my head both
7 ways every single time I cross a street. I have been
8 pretty close to being hit practically every single
9 time that I get out of the house. There-- bicycles
10 come not only down the street, but they do not stop
11 when you clearly have the walkway. They will come up
12 and they will-- I remember even seeing this guy
13 sneering at me as he was coming up, and then at the
14 very last minute he swerved behind me. there is not
15 only impunity, but they really feel that they own the
16 universe, and I think that the only way is to-- I
17 don't expect the police to be chasing down somebody
18 who passed a red light. I think that that's not
19 going to happen, but I do want when somebody gets hit
20 that there is some way to catch them, and I think
21 that we can only do that if we have visible licenses,
22 and I thank you so much for holding this bill and I
23 do hope it passes. Thank you.

24 MARY VAKRIS: Good afternoon. My name is
25 Mary Vakris and I'm pleased to address you on this

1
2 important legislation today, Priscilla's Law, Intro
3 606. As a life-long New Yorker, I was born in Queens
4 and I've lived upon the upper east side since 1976.
5 I've always felt that New York City was a wonderful
6 city for pedestrians. No longer. The reckless e-
7 vehicle riding has made crossing the street and even
8 walking on the sidewalk a dangerous activity. E-
9 vehicles are not stopping at red lights. They're
10 riding on the sidewalk and they're going the wrong
11 way on one-way streets. This careless disregard for
12 traffic laws has made this city especially dangerous
13 for the elderly, the disabled, and young children. I
14 have made numerous calls to 311 about this problem,
15 and have had police respond that there is nothing
16 they can do about this crisis. With Priscilla's Law
17 the police and the public will have a way to report
18 and track down egregious e-vehicle infractions. If
19 these vehicles are registered and have an identifying
20 license number, then all of us will be safer. The
21 riders will know that there is a way to locate them
22 so they will be more contentious about following
23 traffic laws. Without this legislation, the quality
24 of life for all New Yorkers is diminished. We do not
25 need another taskforce to study this issue. This is

1
2 a time for common sense legislation and common sense
3 action. Please pass this important legislation so
4 all of us can safely walk in this wonderful city. In
5 conclusion, I'd like to address the concerns of some
6 people and advocate Williams mentioned this as well.
7 I represent not only myself, but also my
8 multicultural family which includes Brown, Black,
9 White, and Asian people, many of whom work in the
10 restaurant industry. None of them feel that Intro
11 606 would be prejudicial to them. Please pass
12 Priscilla's Law.

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you,
14 and just to clarify on my bill, the taskforce, the
15 taskforce is not just solely resting on studying.
16 It's about putting in place implemental regulations
17 to do exactly what Priscilla's Law sets out to do.
18 So just to understand that it has the same spirit of
19 that bill, but it's looking at it more
20 comprehensively so that it's something that can be
21 implemented. Because there is concerns about Intro
22 606, while the spirit of it I think a lot of members
23 including myself agree with-- the question that
24 continues to come up in terms of the legality of it,
25 is whether or not the city is authorized to register

1
2 or the state, which is why Council Member Brewer has
3 her Reso supporting the state legislation. So just
4 being transparent, it's not to take away. None of
5 these bills are to take away from this important
6 conversation, but we want to make sure we're looking
7 at it comprehensively and that it's something that is
8 in fact implementable. Thank you. Council Member
9 Holden?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Just on that
11 subject, our legislative team said it is legal.
12 They're the ones who came up with the idea. So I
13 just proposed what can we do about it. Our
14 legislative team said sure, you can do this, because
15 we do this in other areas in the city and DOT does
16 it. So this could be done. It's perfectly legal.
17 However, I just want to ask the panel, especially the
18 panelists that were struck by e-vehicles, was a
19 police report issued? Did you get any responsible
20 party? Did you know who hit you? And did you get
21 any satisfaction at all other than your injuries
22 that-- and suffering that you experienced?

23 CAROL WILSON: Since I was hit twice,
24 they found neither one of the riders.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: So, nobody-- they
3 didn't find anybody.

4 CAROL WILSON: No.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I'd like Ydanis
6 Rodriguez, the Commissioner, to hear that, because he
7 has no solutions. Anybody else, did you get any--
8 yes?

9 SANJA POHL: They know who the guy is
10 because he badly crashed, too.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Okay.

12 SANJA POHL: But the helmet saved him,
13 and I spent whole night in the emergency room
14 watching at him, whole night. They didn't separate
15 us.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Unbelievable.
17 Anybody else?

18 SCOTT POHL: Just to-- just to build on
19 that. He was identified, and there was a police
20 report. Nothing has happened since--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing] No
22 penalties.

23 SCOTT POHL: Well, nothing that we've
24 heard.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: But you would
3 think that the police would have told you if this
4 person was charged with a crime.

5 SCOTT POHL: No, they actually-- we
6 complained more formally about two weeks ago, and
7 they just informed us-- they just called us to ask
8 how we feel. That was--

9 SANJA POHL: That was yesterday after I
10 talked in one of the Community Boards, and they
11 called the Inspector. So after six months he called
12 me to tell me that he's going to close the case.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah, see this--

14 SANJA POHL: [interposing] And that he's
15 not-- he's not a vehicle, he's a scooter.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Right. And so
17 this is what my bill will do, it'll add
18 accountability, and again, the victims would have
19 some recourse. Right now, the victims have no
20 recourse and that's the heart-breaking issue here.
21 Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

22 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
23 Just to clarify, Counsel for this committee also
24 looked into this bill, and that is where my
25 information and knowledge of it comes from. But just

1
2 to ask a follow-up question, because where Council
3 Member Holden is correct is we want to see what
4 solutions exist, right? And so I'm hearing
5 accountability also, and what this bill from what I
6 understands presents is to be able to identify. But
7 I think that it fails to go further in terms of once
8 you've identified, what then happens, and that's a
9 missing component that I'm seeing and I'm hearing.
10 Because I hear the lack of accountability. There
11 have been people who stayed at the site and then been
12 released, which in certain automobile accidents quite
13 honestly happens, too. I think about Dathena [sp?]
14 who was a 10-year-old who was hit by a car in my
15 district. They had apprehended the person who hit
16 her with the vehicle, and that person unfortunately
17 was released. I mean, there was a process that went
18 through more so than what we see with the scooters
19 and the e-bikes. But I think we have to think about
20 the full picture of this, as well. But thank you for
21 your testimony. The next panel we will call up--
22 thank you-- Michael Phillips, Sandy Rayburn, Artemeo
23 Cardona [sp?], Maria Ferrara, Susan Simon [sp?], Py
24 Mahome [sp?]. Ricardo Pachelo [sp?]. Sir, we'll
25 start with you. Go ahead.

1
2 MICHAEL PHILLIPS: Hi, my name is Michael
3 Phillips. I want to thank you very much for having
4 me testify. I see the clock is much later than I
5 thought it would be, so I'll make this very fast.
6 It's just my sort of summation of what it's all
7 about. And I say licensing is required for
8 compliance, because compliance begins with
9 accountability, and the e-bike rider has to know that
10 breaking the law results in identification and
11 serious consequences. CCTVs at every intersection
12 are worthless if all they capture is the back of an
13 e-biker's head as he's breaking the law. Every e-
14 bikers knows this. Also, required licensing provides
15 the police with the ability to enforce compliance
16 with one-way street wrong-way e-bikers where the
17 police can't give chase. A police car can't drive
18 against traffic, but simply recording the license
19 number will do the job. Compliance will be pretty
20 much immediate as soon as e-bikers are required to
21 have registered licenses that include meaningful
22 penalties for law breaking. Thank you very much.

23 UNIDENTIFIED: Chair Brooks-Powers,
24 sponsor Council Member Bob Holden, Council Members,
25 thank you for the opportunity to speak in favor of

1
2 Intro 606, Priscilla's Law for registration of
3 licensing of e-vehicles. Whether it is learning to
4 ride a bike or drive a car, we are taught to be
5 careful, be aware of others on the roads, especially
6 pedestrians. Be responsible. What happens when we
7 learn to ride an e-bike or an e-scooter? We are
8 reminded that an e-bike is not a pedal bike. It is
9 motorized, and it's battery weights 45 to 60 pounds
10 more and it travels 20 to 40 miles per hour faster.
11 Micromobility is a quaint term for fast, heavy,
12 motorized vehicle that is causing more pedestrian
13 harm, loss of livelihoods and lives, and is now
14 unfortunately the preferred escape mode of criminals.
15 Priscilla's Law is about leveling the playing field
16 and respecting the rights of all members of our
17 community. Note well, New York City EVSA is strictly
18 unpaid volunteers. Transportation Alternatives is
19 well-funded and most members are on Trans Alt's
20 substantial payroll. The caveat for all of us is
21 beware of those bad actors who approach government
22 officials with ready solutions and funding for
23 infrastructure and transportation problems. Council
24 Members, Commissioners, advocates, get off the
25 slippery slope of the Trans Alt conglomerate and

1
2 listen to your constituents who represent the
3 majority of your communities. Thank you.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: I'm born and raised in the
5 Bronx. I've lived in Hell's Kitchen and the upper
6 west side. I now have been living in Brooklyn for 40
7 years. In my 71 years I have almost been hit by a
8 car exactly one time. In the past three years I have
9 almost been hit by a two-wheel vehicles four times,
10 and I mean really close calls. I've been lucky that
11 at my age, 71, I've been able to jump out of the way.
12 However, my lucky changed this past Monday night
13 December 9th. I was in Manhattan crossing 58th Street
14 at Eighth Avenue rushing to get across before the
15 light changed. There was a row of-- a line of cars
16 stopped at the red light. Before I knew it I felt
17 myself flung up in the air, and I saw a blur, a bike
18 with a rider pass by. I landed on the back of my
19 head and my elbow. I looked up to my right and I saw
20 two headlights staring back at me. Again, I was
21 lucky. I didn't break any bones. I didn't pass out.
22 The car did not proceed when the light changed. I
23 was able to get up and walk to the sidewalk. I don't
24 know if it was hit by a standard bike or an e-bike,
25 but if it had been an e-bike with a license plate, a

1 speed camera or a red light camera could have picked
2 up the plate. It could have read the plate, not what
3 race the rider was, but it would have read the
4 license plate. As it is, the bike sped away, another
5 unreported hit-and-run driver facing no consequences.
6 Again, I was lucky. Despite the large swollen knob
7 on my head which is still quite painful and some
8 bruises and scrapes, the ER doctor-- here's my band--
9 determined that I was neurologically fine and that
10 there's no evidence of internal bleeding. But as
11 you've heard today, many are not as lucky as I. Many
12 victims have suffered serious injuries, become
13 disabled, or even like Priscilla Loke and others,
14 have been killed. E-bike riders who commit crimes
15 must be held accountable for the injuries they incur.
16

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

18 UNIDENTIFIED: Please pass Bill 606.

19 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

20 Just want to remind everyone, we really have to
21 adhere to the two-minute rule. We have a lot of
22 people still signed up to testify here and online.
23 You may begin.

24 SANDY RAYBURN: My name is Sandy Rayburn.
25 Thanks for having me. I'm 80 years old, born in New

1
2 York City, lived here all my life, and I ask you to
3 support Priscilla's Law on behalf of your loved ones.
4 I'm not here to ask you to ban e-bikes. I'm here in
5 the rain to tell you that when an e-bike hits me, I
6 have no recourse. The City Council's mandate is to
7 protect New Yorkers. Let's require common-sense
8 accountability for any and all motorized vehicles,
9 whether two wheels or four or one. It's frankly
10 puzzling, however, that some of your colleagues, City
11 Council, Chairs, Members, are ignoring the obvious,
12 namely that we are not safe on sidewalks. We are not
13 safe crossing streets, and we are no longer safe in
14 the city we love. A question to you as a pedestrian-
15 - why is it that we have to take our life in our
16 hands? Another question, why is it that Lincoln
17 Restler, mega proponent of safety, feels free to
18 break laws riding the wrong way on streets and no
19 helmet? Another-- why is it that Crystal Hudson, the
20 Chair of the Aging Committee no less, is
21 unembarrassed to ride on the sidewalk, also breaking
22 the law? Want pictures? Ask me, I have the
23 receipts. The ableism, ageism and hypocrisy-- yes,
24 hypocrisy, are unacceptable. Pass 606, Priscilla's
25 Law. Your father, mother, grandparents will thank

1
2 you for it, and so will we. And I'm struck by what's
3 up there, "a government of the people, by the people,
4 for the people." Well, wait a minute. It looks like
5 it's a government of the people, by the people for
6 Transportation Alternatives, a lobby. Let's get
7 real, folks. You've recognized any number of these
8 TA people here. Hi, how you doing? We only get our
9 lousy two minutes here to tell you that we need to
10 safe. So, please, pay attention.

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

12 UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you for the
13 opportunity to speak and thank you to the Chair and
14 for the Council Members who've remained here today to
15 listen to the people. I have to go off script. After
16 listening to Commissioner Rodriguez, I didn't realize
17 before today that e-bike riders are a protected class
18 whose interest supersede those of the rest of the
19 citizens of New York. I cannot comprehend how a DOT
20 Chair has become a champion of law-breaking, ablest
21 riders who endanger our communities showing very
22 little concern about the pedestrians who've been
23 terrorized. Well, Ydanis Rodriguez may not support
24 Priscilla's Law, but my community does. I'm a 40-
25 year resident of the Upper West Side and the founder

1
2 of an active community organization who support bill
3 606. I've lived through the fiscal crisis,
4 blackouts, the crack epidemic, and 9/11, yet in all
5 the years I've lived here, I've never experienced the
6 fear and danger to my personal safety as I have in
7 the last three years. There's rarely a day I leave
8 my apartment when I'm not weaving and dodging chaotic
9 e-bike traffic on the sidewalks and in the streets.
10 The quality of life for our communities has dropped
11 dramatically. There's no topic garnering more
12 disdain than what's happened to the safety of our
13 streets since the advent of lawless and unaccountable
14 e-bikes violating existing laws. I travel all over
15 Europe for my work, but there is no city where I feel
16 less safe than New York. I ask the City Council to
17 stop the madness, protect our citizens, and pass
18 Priscilla's Law. And I'd like to note, Chair Brooks-
19 Powers, if being as there are two similar laws up for
20 review, if you will support bill 606?

21 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you for
22 your question. I support the spirit of 606, and as
23 I've shared before, the only concern I have really is
24 in terms of the implementation of it, hence the
25 introduction of 1131 which is not necessarily saying

1
2 that it would not lead to the same outcome, but it's
3 to be able to look at it more globally. I think there
4 are other components that still need to be addressed
5 as well in terms of the accountability piece that's
6 included there. I'm committed to working with each of
7 you. I've met with Janet, Andrew. We've had
8 conversations as well to talk about those concerns,
9 and so again, the issue in itself is an important and
10 is being prioritized by the Council. I think
11 everyone wants safety. I think it looks a little
12 different in terms of how we achieve that, and that's
13 what I want to explore in a comprehensive way. so,
14 understand, like I said earlier and I'm serious, I
15 walked out of my office door-- and I may not be a
16 senior-- but I've almost been run over by a moped,
17 too. It's not something that we don't see and that I
18 don't hear also being the Chair of Transportation and
19 Infrastructure. People call, text, email, inbox
20 everything, and I see that too. So, we do know
21 inaction is not an option. So this is a start of the
22 conversation and I look forward to continuing it.
23 Thank you.

24 UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you.

25

1
2 RICARDO PACHECO: Thank you. Good
3 afternoon. My name is Ricardo Pacheco. I'm a
4 resident at Jackson Heights in Queens. I am here in
5 full support of Intro 606, Priscilla's Law. I'm also
6 here speaking in support of the hundreds and hundreds
7 of victims of e-vehicle violence, and also I'm
8 speaking here in support of the thousands and
9 thousands of neighbors who are afraid of becoming the
10 next victim. I'd like to talk about Jackson Heights,
11 my neighborhood, and specifically 34th Avenue which
12 has become-- with 26 blocks of closed streets have
13 become the speedway for this reckless e-vehicle
14 riders and have injured children and seniors alike,
15 and it is so serious. The crisis is so serious that
16 our City Councilman Shekar Krishnan called for a town
17 hall meeting, and he called it moped crisis, although
18 there was nothing spoken about solving anything about
19 the crisis. It did one important thing. It enforced
20 the Councilman to acknowledge that there is a
21 problem, that there is a crisis. So, today, I call
22 upon this council to reject the special interest
23 nonsense that was spoken here today. I just call upon
24 this Council to apply common sense and pass
25 Priscilla's Law. Thank you.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you to
3 this panel. Next panel, Lynne Glasner, Gail
4 Benjamin, David Tobias, Ali Ryan [sp?], Virginia
5 Ryan, Karen Subru [sp?]. Kathleen Conry? Kathleen
6 Conry?

7 DAVID TOBIAS: Good evening my name is
8 David Tobias. I'm a Criminal Defense Attorney at the
9 Legal Aid Society and I'm a resident of Woodside. I'm
10 here today on behalf of myself and the Legal Aid
11 Society to urge you to vote no on Intro 606. Our
12 hearts go out to all the community members who have
13 suffered from e-bikes, scooters, and mopeds. However,
14 Intro 606 would not stop those harms. Infrastructure
15 changes will. This bill is an overreach that would
16 have a disparately negative impact on New Yorkers of
17 color as it expands the power of the New York Police
18 Department to stop, frisk, and question New York City
19 cyclists, the majority of whom, according to
20 reporting by DOT, are people of color. In my work at
21 the Legal Aid Society, my colleagues and I see the
22 continued disgraceful racial disparity in who the
23 police stop on our streets and who prosecutors send
24 into our courtrooms charged with crimes. WE also
25 know from the September NYPD Monitor Report, the

1
2 Yates Report, that the officers who stop New Yorkers
3 without legal cause are rarely disciplined,
4 demonstrating the culture of impunity that continues
5 to exist unchecked within NYPD and would contribute
6 to this legislation's invitation for police to harass
7 New Yorkers with no consequences. The same Council
8 that ended the policing of jaywalking must not now
9 embrace this legislation that if enacted will give
10 NYPD yet one more reason to stop people on bikes,
11 many of whom are working people from immigrant
12 backgrounds who may be more vulnerable to the
13 collateral consequences of criminal charges. Intro
14 606 would bring devastating collateral consequences
15 to everyday life in New York by essentially
16 legalizing and encouraging NYPD to stop, frisk and
17 question people on bikes, massively expanding police
18 power.

19 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
20 Thank you.

21 DAVID TOBIAS: Yes.

22 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: If you could
23 submit the rest in written form. Thank you.

24 DAVID TOBIAS: Absolutely. Thank you
25 everyone.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I just ask-- I
3 mean, please adhere to the two minutes. We still
4 have a lot of people left.

5 LYNNE GLASNER: Hi, my name is Lynne
6 Glasner. I'm an Upper West Side resident. I've been
7 here most of my life, and never have I ever seen
8 anything like what's going on now with bicycles. One
9 of the many bogus complaints of the bike lobby who
10 oppose 606 is that the bill doesn't specify, and this
11 is a quote, "whether accessibility devices like
12 motorized wheel chairs would be included." That's
13 from yesterday's streets blog [sic]. Have you ever
14 seen a motorized wheel chair in a bike lane? It's
15 such an outrageous image that it'd be funny if it
16 weren't part of an argument that's supposed to be
17 serious. The lobbyist argument in defending
18 minorities is a red herring. It's a preemptive claim
19 that reminds people of police behaving badly, which
20 is a police problem not a bike problem, not a problem
21 that's going to deal with safety which they are
22 responsible for and doing safety and arrests and
23 stopping within the context of the law. It's a
24 presumption that they would target bike riders.
25 While claiming to want to protect minorities from the

1
2 big bad police tactics, they promote the stereotype
3 that all deliveristas are minorities or immigrants
4 and it's they who are causing the problem. This is
5 simply not true, and as you've heard today, there are
6 many of the people who were injured and died even
7 from bike riders who were not on e-bikes and not
8 deliveristas. They were on Citi Bikes or even their
9 own bikes. The fact is that it's very rare to see
10 any biker stopped at a red light regardless of their
11 color or ethnicity. In reality, they're giving
12 deliveristas a bad rap. More importantly, what about
13 pedestrian safety? We are the majority. The bikers
14 are creating havoc on the streets and sidewalks is a
15 known--

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
17 Thank you. We just ask that you submit the rest of
18 that in writing. Thank you.

19 LYNNE GLASNER: Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Next.

21 GAIL BENJAMIN: My name is Gail Benjamin.
22 Thank you for the opportunity-- thank you. My name
23 is Gail Benjamin. Thank you for the opportunity to
24 speak today. I'm here for many reasons. First and
25 foremost I'm here to support 606. Secondly, I'm here

1
2 to support my friend Judea [sp?] who was hit by a
3 bike two weeks after having a procedure on her knee.
4 She was standing in the crosswalk, the crossing zone,
5 on 71st and Second when she was struck by a bike and
6 fell to her knees. The rider looked at her and said,
7 "oh, sorry," and sped off. Luckily, several
8 bystanders helped her get up and brought her to
9 safety. Excuse me. I'm here for the 3,500+ members
10 of the East 72nd Street Neighborhood Association.
11 I'm on the Steering Committee. The most frequent
12 complaints we get are about e-bikes and e-scooters
13 that ride on the sidewalks, don't obey the lights, go
14 fast, just go any which way. People say they fear
15 for their safety. They're afraid to go walk on the
16 streets. Our group includes many seniors, and they
17 are especially concerned as an accident for one of
18 them could change their life dramatically. I'm also a
19 community liaison with the 19th precinct, and I
20 regularly go to their police community council
21 meetings. Here too, the same complaint from people.
22 it's not about crime all the time or safety, it's
23 about e-bikes and what can the New York police and
24 New York City do about reigning them in. I'm here for
25 all the members of the New York City E-bike Safety

1
2 Alliance who have been hit by an e-bikes or e-vehicle
3 and as lives have been altered since, several of whom
4 have lost their occupations as a result. I'm here
5 for me. The other day, had a stranger not pushed me
6 out of the way, I would have been victim number 99.
7 I'm here because we need to make our streets again.
8 I'm here because we need Priscilla's Law 606. It's
9 like the Wild West out there, and unlike the
10 gentleman on the left who things infrastructure will
11 help, it's not infrastructure. We need to change
12 people's behavior.

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

14 GAIL BENJAMIN: And the only way we're
15 going to do that is when we hold people accountable.

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

17 GAIL BENJAMIN: Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

19 Virginia?

20 VIRGINIA RYAN: Hi, I'm Virginia Ryan, a
21 12-year-old bicyclist in 7th grade. This year I was
22 allowed to walk to school by myself with my little
23 sister. Over the course of the school year I've been
24 almost run over by multiple e-bikes several times.
25 Children are in more dangers than others, because we

1
2 have disadvantages which adults generally do not
3 have. First off, we are shorter. E-bikes don't
4 really bother to look at who's in their path, and
5 when they do, people don't really look down at the
6 little kids in their path. Additionally, kids like
7 myself generally have very heavy backpacks, which
8 means that we can't dodge the bikes very easily. So
9 we can be hit. As well as being a kid, I'm a
10 bicyclist as I said. Whenever an e-bike passes by me
11 I feel scared. This is because I know as a cyclist
12 that with one twist of our handlebars we could easily
13 slam right into me. On a regular bike it is dangerous
14 enough, but with an e-bike, the force of their engine
15 could literally kill me whether I'm off my bike or on
16 it. Another problem with e-bikes is that they run
17 red lights. Once, when I was walking home from
18 school with my mom and sister, we were going to walk
19 across the street when suddenly a pack of e-bikes ran
20 the red light and almost killed us. Another time, we
21 had just gone off of the bus when an e-bike whizzed
22 past us on the sidewalk and actually brushed past my
23 sister. Another step and she would be dead instead
24 of bruised. Whenever I am walking to school without
25 adults, I feel afraid for my life, not just because

1
2 of the fear that they might run me over, but also
3 from the knowledge I have as being raised on a
4 bicyclist on the streets of New York. I wish that
5 they would obey the rules of traffic just like how I
6 have to do to make New York a safer place for
7 everyone. Please pass Priscilla's Law Intro 606.
8 Thank you for listening to me.

9 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you so
10 much for your advocacy.

11 : Hello. My name is Ali Ryan. I'm
12 Virginia's mom, and I have been advocating for this
13 legislation as well as state legislation to register
14 and to insure e-bikes for several years. And I
15 constantly talk about how I'm a mom, and so I asked
16 my daughter to come today to experience what it's
17 like engaging with government. And so but I want to
18 talk about-- I actually have been a bicyclist from
19 the mid-2000s. I do-- because I've run for City
20 Council before, I actually do follow the rules of the
21 road. I grew up participating in critical mass [sic]
22 and saying we are traffic. In the Bloomberg
23 Administration I had friends who were-- got tickets
24 for going through red lights. It's a mayoral issue.
25 Under de Blasio and under Adams, no one's been--

1
2 gotten a ticket for going through a red light. So
3 when Jumaane Williams and Commissioner Rodriguez
4 advocate that it's okay for delivery workers and
5 migrants to break the law-- e-bikes accidents are law
6 because there's no category in the NYPD and the DMV
7 software system. So, legalizing e-bikes back in
8 2020, it's been four years. They've created
9 unforeseen consequences that need to be corrected.
10 One, you need to pass Priscilla's Law. Number two,
11 don't pass Intro 1131. We don't need another
12 taskforce. Hold an oversight hearing and require the
13 DOT to answer questions. They have four years of
14 data, and number three, amend Gale Brewer's
15 resolution. Instead of Brad Hoylman's law, use
16 Senator Addabbo's Law S9208 with the companion bill
17 by Assembly Member Jennifer Rajkumar A9114. Thank
18 you.

19 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

20 KATHLEEN CONRY: Thank you for allowing
21 me to speak. My name is Kathy Conry. I am 77 years
22 old. I've lived in New York City since 1966 in
23 Midtown, the Village, the Upper West Side, and now
24 for the last 47 years at Manhattan Plaza in aptly
25 named Hell's Kitchen. I and my neighbors live in

1 constant fear every day we leave our apartments. My
2 most recent brush with death was last Saturday
3 evening while waiting for the number 11 bus. I was
4 nearly run over by a speeding delivery bike from the
5 sidewalk coming from 42nd Street and over to 9th
6 Avenue in the street heading north on the southbound
7 traffic and missing me by inches. I could have been
8 one of the victims speaking today had I even
9 survived. New York City pedestrians of all ages
10 deserve to be able to cross the streets or wait for
11 public transportation safely without fear of being
12 hit, dismembered or killed. I think we'd all prefer
13 to die from natural causes. The testimonies of
14 victims here today is heart wrenching and it's time
15 to pass Priscilla's Law now to meliorate this
16 catastrophic failure due to the lack of concern by
17 our lawmakers. You were elected to serve and protect
18 the people of New York, and it's time to do it,
19 please. I rest my case.

21 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
22 Thank you to this panel. We're going to call up the
23 next panel. Richert Easley. Donald Reed [sp?], Martin
24 Hang [sp?], Martin, Jacqueline Savage [sp?], Justin
25 Levine, Elizabeth Baylen [sp?].

1
2 UNIDENTIFIED: Good afternoon. I am an
3 80-year-old retired actor who has lived and worked in
4 New York City since 1968, now living gratefully in
5 subsidized housing in Hell's Kitchen. I survived the
6 70s, two plagues, and numerous mayoral regimes, and
7 I'm still pretty mobile on my feet. Yet, my biggest
8 fear is that I might not survive a trip to the
9 grocery store, the barber shop or a restaurant in my
10 neighborhood because of being mowed down by a
11 unlicensed and unidentifiable vehicle running a red
12 light or going the wrong way through the bike lane,
13 or speeding toward me or behind me on the sidewalk.
14 That very real fear is why I'm here today to plead
15 for the passage of Priscilla's Law. Bring safety and
16 accountability to the lawlessness and recklessness we
17 as pedestrians and especially seniors face every day
18 in our chaotic streets. The people you've heard
19 today who have experienced firsthand the tragedy of
20 this lawlessness, I am here also in support of them.
21 I'd just like to add that after two years of writing
22 emails and calling offices, even though some of the
23 committee decided not to stay for all of the
24 testimony, I feel like this is the first time my
25 voice has been heard. Thank you.

1
2 MARTIN HANNAN: Hi, my name is Martin
3 Hannan. Thank you for having me. After hearing the
4 other victim's stories, I see that I'm a lucky one.
5 Back in February 2021 I was riding my bicycle on the
6 bicycle path of the FDR Drive, enjoying an unusually
7 warm winter day. On about 20th Street on the bicycle
8 path I got sideswiped by a motorized bike. I was
9 knocked to the ground, and when I looked up, the guy
10 that hit me stopped, looked down at me, and then rode
11 away. I looked at my hand and I saw my bone was
12 bulging out. I didn't know what to do, so I got back
13 on to my now mangled bicycle and rode straight to my
14 doctor's office. The doctor told me that my hand was
15 not broken, but I was sure that it was, and she
16 suggested just icing it for the next 24 hours. The
17 following day I went to the 7th precinct and I told
18 them what happened. And they asked me why didn't you
19 stay at the scene of the accident. They couldn't
20 help me because I left the scene. My hand
21 continuously got worse. One month later it was still
22 swollen and discolored, so I finally went to HSS to
23 be told that my hand was actually broken. I emailed
24 numerous politicians and DOT telling them what
25 happened to me, but none of them responded to me. I

1
2 wondered at the time, what if this actually happened
3 to them or a family member, but I am happy to see
4 today that some politicians are concerned. Since
5 that day I avoid riding my bicycle 90 percent of the
6 time out of fear, and when I do I'm always looking
7 over my shoulder making sure that there's no e-bikes
8 or scooters around. I bought myself an indoor
9 stationary bike to do my exercise, but I much rather
10 be outside riding. My hand has never been the same
11 since the accessible. Opening up jars is impossible.
12 Three years of doing hand therapy. I can't even make
13 a fist, and I think it's very unfair that we have to
14 live like this. We need safer streets, and I'm all
15 for Priscilla's Law.

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
17 And we have the written testimony.

18 ELIZABETH BAYLEN: I'm Elizabeth Baylen.
19 I'm reading this testimony on behalf of Marilyn Levin
20 [sp?] who is physically unable to attend this
21 hearing. The following is Marilyn's statement. "On
22 04-16-24 I was walking on West 67th Street in Central
23 Park when I was hit by an e-biker who left the scene.
24 Since that date my life has completely changed. I was
25 thrown off my feet, unconscious and had a concussion.

1
2 Thank goodness a good Samaritan called 911, because I
3 was unconscious and unaware of what had happened to
4 me. I had the fibula and tibia bones in my left leg
5 severed from my knee, requiring them to be surgically
6 reattached. I was transported by FDNY ambulance to
7 Weill Cornell where I was treated for one week. I was
8 then transferred to a horrific in-patient rehab which
9 was like being in hell. While there, I got a severe
10 infection in the wounds of my left leg which were
11 caused by poor, ineffective care at the rehab. Due
12 to the severe infection I had to be admitted to the
13 Hospital of Special Surgery for another three weeks.
14 In July 2024 I left HSS and came home to recuperate.
15 I'm still recuperating at home with intensive PT and
16 require additional surgery in January. When I spoke
17 to the FDNY ambulance employee who was putting me in
18 the ambulance, I was told I was hit by an e-biker who
19 was going 10 miles an hour. The name of the biker
20 was never reported as it should have been. Why
21 aren't e-bike accidents reported in the same way as
22 automobile and other motorized vehicle accidents with
23 the police being contacted and the names of the
24 individuals involved reported to the proper
25 authorities? No police or FDNY report was made"--

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
3 Thank you. We just ask you send the rest in writing,
4 please. Next.

5 JACQUELINE SAVAGE: Good afternoon. My
6 name is Jacqueline Savage. I am 75 years old. Since
7 the advent of electric vehicles I have never been as
8 frightened to cross the street as I am now. I've come
9 close to being hit countless times, often two or
10 three times in a day. Never before have I had to have
11 this degree of hyper-vigilance due to the fear that
12 an e-vehicle will come speeding down the street, from
13 my left, from my right or behind me. Just as cars
14 need to adhere to the rules of the road to maintain
15 safety for all pedestrians and drivers, so too do e-
16 vehicles need to adhere to the same rules of the
17 road. Registration is essential to maintain safety
18 and accountability. I implore you to pass this
19 common sense bill, Priscilla's Law 0606, into law so
20 that lives will be saved and injuries averted. Thank
21 you.

22 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

23 DONALD REED: Can you hear me? Yeah,
24 okay. Yeah, my name is Don Reed. I live in Midtown
25 on the east side, and I want to thank Chairperson and

1
2 committee person Fariás for staying. I'm going to be
3 pretty quick. Yeah, I'm on Safety Committee of a
4 Neighborhood Association. I belong to a senior
5 center, and I attend meetings at the 17th Precinct
6 for the community. I concur with everything that's
7 been said here, and that's, you know,-- the fear
8 level has gone up far more in this city than we can
9 tolerate, and now is the time to do something. I'm
10 not going to repeat the horror stories that are
11 referred to or what's in my testimony. I'm just
12 going to go down here to the root cause, and the root
13 cause is simple. If you can't-- if you're not a--
14 you can do anything you want if nobody knows who you
15 are, right? I can-- nobody can identify me. I can be
16 that guy, that assassin. But Chairman, I will say
17 that-- and I agree with the police report. You've
18 got to be able to identify somebody or else the
19 report doesn't get made. They don't do anything.
20 So, what's the solution? Very quickly, on these e-
21 bikes you've got to have a license plate, poof,
22 they're gone. And every story I heard here that
23 nobody, no e-bike stopped and tried to help. They
24 just boop, poof. Nobody knew who they are. So, I
25 would ask instead of kicking the can down the road

1
2 and doing a taskforce-- and I'm sorry, I don't mean
3 to impugn that--

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]

5 Thank you.

6 DONALD REED: kicking the can down the
7 road is a taskforce. We need to get something--

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]

9 thank you.

10 And this is the best thing on the table
11 now, Chairman.

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

13 DONALD REED: I've heard nothing--

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]

15 Sir--

16 DONALD REED: I've heard nothing--

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]

18 I'm sorry, you're going to have to put the rest in
19 writing, because we-- I would like to get to
20 everyone, because--

21 DONALD REED: [interposing] Yeah.

22 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: otherwise we
23 may have to recess this hearing to another day.

24 DONALD REED: Yeah.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Please allow
3 other people to speak.

4 DONALD REED: I will, I just want to say,
5 please--

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
7 A lot of people--

8 DONALD REED: [interposing] do the right
9 thing.

10 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Sir, thank
11 you. Next?

12 UNIDENTIFIED: This is now on, okay. Good
13 evening. It's now evening, I think. I'd just like to
14 charge anyone in this room or anyone that was in this
15 room that e-bikes are a menace. They are obviously a
16 problem. There obviously needs something to happen.
17 Obviously, the paramount issue is safety. Everyone
18 wants safety. Everyone's in agreement that safety is
19 the issue. However, there are two ways to respond.
20 There is either prevention or there is
21 accountability. And you can have both. You can have
22 one or you can have the other, and so the question is
23 how do you proceed. And so the way that usually you
24 proceed, when you come with a problem is you look to
25 the past, you look to history, you look for

1
2 statistic, you look for other solutions rather than
3 just knee-jerking and responding assuming that you
4 know the best. There have been five cities in North
5 America who have actually implemented e-bike
6 licensing, and they've all cancelled them including
7 Toronto, which I don't know where you got that stat.
8 I got the stat from Toronto.ca, which they still
9 have-- you do not require a license in order to have
10 a e-bike in Toronto, along with five other cities,
11 including LA and Seattle. So we should look to those
12 people, the people that have actually implemented
13 that. And then it failed. We should have someone to
14 go there and talk to them and say what has gone
15 wrong. Is there a better way to do licensing? Is
16 there a better way to do something in accordance with
17 licensing? That's what we need to do. We don't want
18 to just knee-jerk and say, oh, licensing, that's
19 definitely the issue. That's not-- that's been
20 proven to be not the issue in six other different
21 cases. So, I'd like to have a committee that
22 actually figures out what the solution is, whether it
23 be licensing which is definitively a possibility that
24 is not off the table, and I think the Chairman has
25 tried to make that very clear, and just come up with

1
2 a better solution for everybody to have better safety
3 and to have better accountability and to have
4 everyone not be menaced by bikes. It's terrifying.
5 If you took all of the talk about the fact that
6 people are injured--

7 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]

8 Thank you.

9 UNIDENTIFIED: [inaudible] Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you to
11 the panel. We've been joined by Council Member
12 Bottcher. I just want to call a couple of names again
13 just to make sure they're still in the room.

14 Jacqueline Savage? Okay. Leslie Clark? Thomas Lowy
15 [sp?]. Thomas Lowy? Beth Goldstein? Beth Goldstein?
16 Patty Meyers? Patty Meyers? Yep, okay, come on. No,
17 Meyers. Are you Ryan, Patty Ryan? Oh. Doctor Eric
18 R, because I cannot understand the last name. Susan
19 Lee? Susan Lee? Okay. Lee. Joe Cianci [sp?]? Talya
20 Schwartz? Talya? No, okay. Austin Farrow [sp?].
21 Michael Sutherland? Thank you for your penmanship,
22 Michael. Talya Schwartz? For this panel? Oh, we
23 have a lot left. We have a couple hours left, yep.
24 Talya Schwartz? Okay, she's not here. Jules Heck
25 [sp?]? Jules Heck? Paul Crickler [sp?]?

1
2 UNIDENTIFIED: Hi, Kim Kozeck [sp?]. You
3 have something to say, or?

4 UNIDENTIFIED: Yes, this is one of the
5 interpreters, Chairwoman.

6 UNIDENTIFIED: Hello.

7 UNIDENTIFIED: You were calling a Thomas
8 Lowy [sp?], but I see him virtually. Lowy, I think is
9 the spelling. I'm assuming as the interpreter. I
10 apologizes, but he's virtual.

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay, we'll
12 call him later.

13 UNIDENTIFIED: Okay, yeah, we'll call him
14 later then.

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

16 UNIDENTIFIED: He's over there. Yeah, I
17 see him. He's like smiling at me right now. So, he
18 was trying to talk but he couldn't off mute himself.

19 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay, yeah,
20 we'll put him to the end, not the end, but to the
21 virtual portion. Thank you. Chris Sanders? Chris
22 Sanders? Eleanor Wano [sp?]?

23 MICHAEL SUTHERLAND: Thank you to the
24 Chair for holding this hearing. My name is Michael
25 Sutherland. I'm a born and raised Brooklynite, and

1 I'm also the Policy Analyst at Open Plans, an
2 organization that fights for a more livable city.

3 The rise of e-micromobility has presented a number of
4 challenges for our streetscape. It's important to
5 recognize that. Introducing a new type of mobility
6 at this scale requires new infrastructure, education,
7 and enforcement on the rules and laws associated with
8 e-biking and adjustments for all road users.

9 However, Intro 606 does not really solve for any of
10 these issues. It doesn't create new infrastructure.

11 It doesn't educate e-bike users or the general
12 public, and the behavior of bad actors is already
13 illegal. Importantly, a program of this size and
14 scale described in Intro 606 would be a monetary and
15 staff burden on DOT as we heard from the Commissioner
16 and other members of DOT earlier. And we've also
17 seen that to be true in other cities as others have
18 mentioned during testimony. Funding that would
19 theoretically be given to DOT to administer this
20 program could be better used in virtually any way by
21 continuing to build out the infrastructure or
22 educating users, for example. DOT simply does not
23 have the capacity or expertise to run this program.

24 Not only will this program be expensive and difficult
25

1 to administer, but unrealistic to enforce. The
2 difference between a regular bicycle and an e-bike
3 isn't always apparent which could create confusion in
4 enforcement. Aside from that, the current bad
5 behavior which again is already illegal isn't
6 enforced-- really enforced to begin with, though it
7 should be. And the mere presence of a license plate
8 doesn't inherently change that. It doesn't
9 inherently change driver behavior, and more
10 importantly it doesn't inherently change police
11 enforcement patterns. I also heard a couple of folks
12 talk about how automated enforcement could catch
13 these license plates. We believe that that would
14 require another state law, because currently they're
15 designed to and authorized to capture DMV license
16 plates. Instead of Intro 606, we believe that Intro
17 1131 provides a better path for all route users,
18 provides real-- could provide real actionable
19 systemic solutions, which is really what we need,
20 identifying new creative solutions to these
21 challenges and better understanding how to implement
22 safety solutions that we know are good scale like
23 daylighting bike lanes, for example. We can work to
24 find a more equitable solution for all road users.
25

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

Next?

MICHAEL SUTHERLAND: Thank you.

AUSTEN PFERD: Thank you. Hello, my name is Austin Pferd. I'm the Director of Safety and Zero Emission Fleet at a New York City logistics company operating electric cargo bikes and light electric vehicles for last mile delivery. This year, our company employees delivered over 4 million packages by cargo bike in New York City. We are proud of our commitments to safety, sustainability and serving New Yorkers. Intro 606 is a largely redundant bill that will be extremely costly for the city government to implement successfully. As a commercial bike operation, we comply with DOT requirements to install on our equipment a metal or plastic sign at least three inches by five inches with the business name and a unique bicycle ID number for each bicycle. Given that many of the complaints here today involve commercial cyclists, what does Intro 606 provide that this DOT requirement does not? This bill is further misfocused. Many of the incidents that have injured the public have involved illegal mopeds and other illegal micromobility devices. This bill would

1
2 neither legalize these devices nor register them, and
3 their users would have the same status. Furthermore,
4 all Citi Bikes, another devices cited by the bill's
5 proponents already have a standardized ID number on
6 them. This bill is redundant. Similar registration
7 efforts have been tried in other cities and have
8 failed. I grew up in Houston, Texas and lived and
9 rode there while bike registration was on the books.
10 I never had to do this, because long ago the Police
11 Department said not to enforce it anymore. We don't
12 have to look far afield for failure either. Pedicabs
13 have required registration and license plates for
14 over a decade. The burdens of proper procedure have
15 effectively snuffed out the more legitimate
16 operators, and as a post-recent coverage illustrates,
17 the landscape today is more lawless than it was
18 before pedicab licensing. A flurry of news coverage
19 has galvanized the NYPD into partially applying
20 existing laws to police these vehicles. The negative
21 externalities of Intro 606 continue. This bill would
22 invite selective enforcement in profiling and
23 discourage cycling amongst the general public. Higher
24 rates of bike riders correlate to a safer road system
25 for our employees and generates the support to

1
2 construct the bike infrastructure that makes our
3 bikers safer. Workers' comp rates for working
4 cyclist are among the highest rates for non-specialty
5 industries, and that is entirely due to the unsafe
6 built environment in which they work. We want to
7 deliver New York City the stuff they need sustainably
8 on bike and do so safely. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

10 PATTY MEYERS: I want to thank the
11 Council for holding this hearing today. My name is
12 Patty Meyers and I'm here to advocate for Intro 606
13 Priscilla's Law. Honor her beautiful life,
14 Priscilla's Loke, and speak on behalf of all the
15 victims. I have lived in New York City for 20 years
16 and I work for the Department of Education as a
17 teacher advisor for 30 years. Of those 30 years, 22 I
18 spent in a drug, alcohol rehabilitation center for
19 adolescents, and to say or imply that the 606 law is
20 racist really insults me. All my students were the
21 same and I gave them the same love and help as I
22 would anybody. After I retired, I volunteered at
23 Langone Medical Center in Pediatric Cancer Care, and
24 I'm still a docent at Museum at L [sic] Street on the
25 Lower East Side. I've always loved the City and felt

1 very safe. I would walk for mile and miles. To me,
2 there was nothing better seeing all the sites and
3 feeling the energy and spirit of fellow New Yorkers.
4 All that changed on September 9, 2024. I was hit by
5 an e-biker. He did not stop. I had to be
6 transported by an ambulance. I had fractured the hip.
7 I have a titanium rod and two screws now. Three
8 months later I'm hobbling around with a cane. I'm
9 trying my best to get around, but it's so difficult.
10 The bike-- the e-bikers are everywhere. They're on
11 the sidewalk. Just yesterday, I saw an e-biker get
12 out of the left lane just so he wouldn't have to wait
13 to make a left at the red light. Alright, I'm
14 running out of time. I'm just pleading with you,
15 please, to pass Priscilla's Law. Have all the e-
16 bikers registered and licensed. I can't understand
17 why this has happened sooner. Just--

18
19 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
20 Thank you.

21 PATTY MEYERS: Can I say one more thing?

22 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Actually, no-

23 -

24 PATTY MEYERS: [interposing] Okay, I
25 will.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: You can
3 submit it in writing. Sorry, thank you.

4 PATTY MEYERS: Thank you.

5 LESLIE CLARK: Here. There you go. Hi.
6 My name is Leslie Clark. I live in Greenwich Village.
7 I'm kind of amazed and mystified by the apparently
8 magical powers that have been attributed here to
9 education and infrastructure. My neighborhood has
10 about as much bike infrastructure as you could
11 possibly want. There are bike lanes just about
12 everywhere. There are even those red-- those red and
13 green, you know, biker, you know, traffic signals.
14 Bikers just go straight through them. They go-- it's
15 the same thing as happens everywhere else. They go
16 right through red lights. They go the wrong way.
17 They go on the sidewalk and the presence of the bike
18 lane makes no difference. The other day I said to a
19 guy next to me on the bike on the sidewalk, will you
20 get off the sidewalk. The bike lane's over there,
21 and he says, "I don't want to use the bike lane. I
22 want to be here." On another occasion I hear that
23 for the first time, but I hadn't heard the term a
24 refuge, which is what the Commissioner Rodriguez
25 referred to as that spot on a protected bike lane. I

1
2 was standing there when a bike delivery guy came
3 straight at me laughing and swerved off. That has
4 nothing to do with infrastructure. I was on a
5 sidewalk when four young men on Citi Bikes came
6 straight at me, drunk and swerved around me. That
7 has nothing to do with infrastructure. When your
8 behavior is not observable, when you are not
9 identifiable, when it is okay to menace people on the
10 road and the sidewalk that way, you will just do
11 whatever you want to do. I would just say what
12 everybody else has said here, the scariest part of my
13 day is when I go to the gym in the morning, because I
14 got to walk five blocks--

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]

16 Thank you.

17 LESLIE CLARK: through infrastructure.

18 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

19 LESLIE CLARK: Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Next.

21 ERIC ODESKI: Thank you, Chair. My name
22 is Doctor Eric Odeski [sp?]. I'm a lifelong New
23 Yorker, a cyclist who usually does 700, 800 miles a
24 year on my bike, and I have been a victim of a
25 violent crash involving a motorized e-bike, and

1 that's why I support Intro 606. In May of 2022, I
2 was hit by a motorized bicycle while I was riding my
3 bike, a regular foot-powered bicycle. This was in
4 Greenpoint, Brooklyn on Collier Street at Leonard
5 Street. I had just picked up my bike from a local
6 repair shop. Over \$300 worth of work was done in
7 preparation for our ride from Brooklyn to Albany. As
8 I rode on Collier Street with the flow of traffic, I
9 saw a man on a bike heading towards me in the
10 opposite direction. I could tell right away that he
11 was on a motorized bike by his speed, and because he
12 was not pedaling. As we both approached the
13 intersection from opposite directions, this man
14 briefly turned onto Leonard Street, the side street,
15 and seemingly out of the way. Then just seconds
16 later, for a reason I'll never understand, he turned
17 back onto Collier Street and hit me head on. I had no
18 time to maneuver out of the way. On impact, I flew
19 off of my bike and into the street. I hit the
20 pavement hard and sustained cuts and road burn on my
21 arms and legs, but luckily I did not suffer any
22 broken bones or other serious injuries, but that was
23 dumb luck. I could have been killed. As I lay on the
24 ground, I heard a woman screaming. She turned out to
25

1
2 be a pedestrian who witnessed the collision and could
3 not help but scream from the violence of the impact.
4 She and another witness came to my aid. They made
5 sure I was not seriously injured and asked if I needed
6 an ambulance. Meanwhile, the man who hit me, also
7 thrown from his bike, quickly got back on it and
8 motored away as fast as he could. He was not
9 interested in helping me or apologizing and claiming
10 responsibility for his actions or in facing any
11 possible repercussions from the law. Before I could
12 even get up, he was gone. I'm going to go off-script
13 just for the last few seconds here, because several
14 things have been said today about the delivery system
15 and how that incentivizes people to speed. It's not
16 the app. I was a delivery boy, a pizza delivery boy
17 in the city for five years.

18 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

19 ERIC ODESKI: More you deliver,--

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]

21 Thank you, Doctor.

22 ERIC ODESKI: the more you make.

23 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

24 Ms? Just turn on the mic. Just press the button on
25 the mic.

1
2 ELEANOR: Hi, my name is Eleanor. I live
3 between Little Italy and Chinatown. I'm here to
4 support-- I'm here to support the Intro 606. Before
5 the pandemic I was once hit on Greenwich Street while
6 I was standing at the right way. This e-bike person
7 with a huge package on the back of his bike was going
8 the wrong way, and he struck my face and my cheeks
9 with such pain that I was unable to identify him or
10 chase after him. He probably disappeared without
11 knowing he has hurt me. Luckily there was this nice
12 couple who went to the seafood market to get me a
13 pack of ice to lessen my pain. Also, I used to work
14 for the bank, and I have a bank customer whose
15 daughter was also knocked down by the bike, and she
16 ended up seeing the dentist, okay? In Chinatown,
17 it's a neighborhood with a lot of elders, especially
18 like on Bowery Street. I saw e-bikes speeding
19 between the cars during red lights. The cars was
20 topped at the red light, but the e-bike still speed
21 through. Imagine the older folks who won't see that.
22 they might be hurt, and also lately, the DOT also put
23 in a bike lane on Pack [sic] Road next to the bike--
24 next to the bus stop and make the people cross the
25 bike-- the two-way bike lane to get on the bus island

1
2 against our community opposition, okay. This is very
3 dangerous. I hope DOT heard that and remove that
4 island, okay. I understand the e-bike people need to
5 make a living, but they still have to be responsible,
6 okay? Everybody like to drive whatever-- they speed
7 up, but freedom needs responsibility.

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
9 Thank you to this panel. We'll next call up Roxanne
10 Delgado [sp?], Roxanne Delgado? Rosemond Geinitos
11 [sp?]. I know I messed that up. Rosemond [sp?]?
12 Maxine Degeta-- Dejeta-- DeSeta. Ms. Maxine. Linda
13 Lopez? Linda Lopez? Elizabeth Williams? Elizabeth
14 Williams? Joanne Brent [sp?]? Joanne Breit [sp?]?
15 Joanne Breit? Joanne Breit? Ronald-- let's go, come
16 on, Mr. Ronald. Julia Passa [sp?], Julia Passa?
17 Jason Froimowitz? Jason? Okay. Calvin Michaels?
18 Calvin Michaels? Austin Selestén [sp?]? Austin
19 Selestén? Kenneth Winter? Kenneth Winter? Fawn
20 Sullivan [sp?]? Fawn Sullivan? Santes Cardillo?
21 Thank you for your patience. You've been right there
22 the whole time.

23 ROXANNE DELGADO: Evening, Chair. My
24 names Roxanne Delgado. I'm a founder of Friends of
25 Pelham Parkway. It's an environmental social justice

1
2 group in the Bronx of Pelham Parkway. Now, I wrote
3 two op-eds to the Bronx Times dated on November 21st,
4 2022 and June 19th, 2023 because this issue has been
5 plaguing our community for years now ever since it
6 was a pilot in the lower east side Bronx, phase one
7 of phase two. Now, regarding what I've been hearing
8 for the past, I guess, eight hours, car versus e-
9 scooters. The difference is that cars are not being
10 driven on sidewalks. That's the main issue, because
11 the issue we have in Pelham Park is sidewalks.
12 Mostly the shared e-scooters are being driven or
13 ridden by under-age kids not only endangering
14 themselves, but endangering others because they're
15 being ridden on sidewalks. On sidewalks we don't
16 have traffic lights. On sidewalks we don't have
17 signage to say to yield to pedestrians. This is
18 basically a wild, Wild West in the Pelham Parkway.
19 And secondly, I'd like to ask the Chair, please, even
20 though you support the spirit and the-- Ydanis
21 Rodriguez, the Commissioner, supports intent-- we
22 have been here for eight hours. I lost a day of wages
23 to be here. I work, and I am poverty-stricken as most
24 the people in my community are. And I ask, even if
25 you don't support Priscilla's Law, at least give it a

1
2 vote. Don't allow it to languish in committee for
3 another three years, because I can tell you this is
4 the majority. The community-- actually, one of the
5 founders of EVSA came to Pelham Parkway to present
6 this proposed bill to our community which is majority
7 Black and Brown people, and the majority said that
8 they want safety, because they want safety, as well
9 as immigrants. I don't know why they're bringing
10 immigration to this, but immigrants also deserve
11 safety, because they're mostly uninsured. This
12 doesn't only impact the person that is injured. It
13 impacts the family that relies on the bread provider
14 that loves them, their colleagues, neighbors who cry
15 in tears about Priscilla because they lost someone.
16 It's not just the person that died, but the person
17 they leave behind, or the community that they leave
18 behind. And I ask you please to provide just a vote
19 on it.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

21 ROXANNE DELGADO: Do the right thing for
22 the community. Thank you for your time.

23 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

24 Thank you. Sir?

25

1
2 ROBERT COLANGELO: Hello, my name is
3 Ronald Colangelo and Roxy invited me to a meeting by
4 the NYC EVSA, and you go there [inaudible]
5 complaining about the bikes as she mentioned flying
6 around, and then you sit there and you listen to the
7 horror stories they're telling you, and you just
8 shake your head like you don't believe this is really
9 happening in New York City. Then they had the local
10 Police Department there, and they pretty much go, meh
11 [sic], there's nothing we can do. There's no laws.
12 There's nothing we can help you with. And then to
13 have our-- what is he, the-- oh, it's a racist thing.
14 These things with these bikes, you know, they-- you
15 know, they don't see any color, you know? People
16 getting hurt. You don't see people's color. You see
17 people just getting hurt. It could be anybody, and
18 then when you hear that you just boil, because you
19 know, it doesn't-- people getting hurt. It doesn't
20 matter what color they are. And then oh, they don't
21 want to have license plates and they don't want to do
22 this, and you know, it's all these people in upper
23 Manhattan, but you want safety for people in every
24 borough. You want them in Manhattan, Brooklyn,
25 Queens, Staten Island, and in the Bronx where lately

1
2 we had a three-year-old child run over by a guy on a
3 scooter, knocked her over, lumped her up, and took
4 off, dumped the bike, changed his clothes, and ran
5 down the street. They eventually caught the guy, and
6 the child is going to be fine, but you know, it could
7 have went the other way. You know, instead of having
8 a pine Christmas tree, she could have had a pine box.
9 So now, you get everybody, oh, license plates,
10 license plates. So I'm going to go home, take my
11 license plate off my car, and everybody on my block,
12 and we're just going to go up and down one-way
13 streets, do 80 miles an hour. Whatever we hit, we
14 hit, and do it and we get out of the car, we leave it
15 there and go hey, I'll see you later. It's just a sad
16 state of affair. My City Councilman Kristy, I guess
17 she didn't want to stay this long.

18 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

19 RONALD COLANGELO: And you still haven't
20 fixed the clock.

21 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you,
22 sir. Miss?

23 ELIZABETH WILLIAMS: Can you hear me now?
24 Yeah, my name's Elizabeth Williams. Thank you very
25 much for having us. I actually amended my statement a

1 bit, because you asked about different data and
2 different states and what they're doing, and I
3 actually did some research on this. There was a study
4 done by UC Berkley on evaluating the linkage to
5 under-reporting pedestrian bicycle injuries, and I
6 have it, and I will submit it with my testimony. And
7 they are severely under-reported. So this is the
8 problem you're going to have. You're not going to
9 have correct reporting. Also, the NTSB has-- or the
10 NTSB has done a recent study showing the prevalence
11 of accidents with e-scooters and e-bikes, okay? So,
12 they are on top of this. They see this as a serious
13 issue, the NTSB, okay. This is a serious health
14 issue for all of us in New York and across the
15 country, and indeed in other states-- and I did do
16 some research on this. New Jersey has pending
17 legislation as of February 2024. New Jersey
18 legislators introduced bill S2292 proposing mandatory
19 registration and insurance for all e-bike classes.
20 The bill has passed the State Senate's Transportation
21 Committee and is waiting to be ratified by the entire
22 Senate. In Huntington Beach, California where I used
23 to live near LA, the City Council approved an
24 ordinance granting law enforcement the discretion to
25

1
2 issue civil and criminal citations for unsafe bike
3 operations. It's so bad out there. This includes
4 their authority to impound bikes. And it goes on--

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
6 Thank you.

7 ELIZABETH WILLIAMS: Santa Monica and
8 Paris have done the same.

9 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
10 Ms? Real quick, did you send up your testimony? I
11 felt like you waved to me that you had it.

12 ELIZABETH WILLIAMS: Oh, I have--

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Sarg [sic],
14 if you could just get that for me, please.

15 ELIZABETH WILLIAMS: I studied.

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

17 ELIZABETH WILLIAMS: Don't you want my
18 other study? I did my homework. I'm sorry.

19 MAXINE DESETA: Hi. Thank you for having
20 me. My name is Maxine DeSeta. I'm 85. I'm a retired
21 New York City public school teacher, artist and
22 activist. My grandchildren are fifth generation
23 residents of Manhattan. Our family has ridden bikes
24 for work and pleasure for generations. Using poor
25 deliveristas and Black and Brown folks against

1
2 pedestrians who just want to safely cross streets is
3 one of the more disgusting, self-serving agendas of
4 those who want to profit from the new e-mobility
5 surge in our city since the pandemic. I am perplexed
6 why class one, two, three e-bikes that can accelerate
7 to 25 miles per hour the same as class C mopeds are
8 not required to have license plates. The investors
9 promoting e-bikes do not care about the poor
10 immigrants who plow through our streets using the
11 for-profit Door Dash and other apps to deliver food.
12 They are worried they will not be able to profit from
13 the exploitation of deliveristas. Although we have
14 crash statistics for cars, we have little for e-
15 bikes. What happened, New York? Any tourist or
16 resident can rent an electric Citi Bike or motorized
17 bike without a license. When they cause injury or
18 death to pedestrians, there is no accountability.
19 There is no identification for witness to report,
20 this in the middle of Manhattan with public
21 transportation and walkability score of 100.
22 Priscilla's Law only mandates responsibility for
23 motorized bicycles. Licensing and registration seems
24 a small price to pay for safety in one of the most
25 densely populated cities in the United States. Thank

1
2 you. Oh, by the way, Indonesia has these laws for e-
3 bikes.

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
5 Thank you.

6 MAXINE DESETA: Indonesia.

7 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And the rule
8 still goes, please do not be disruptive or you will
9 be asked to leave. Next.

10 JASON FROIMOWITZ: My name is Jason
11 Froimowitz. I'm a member of Manhattan Community
12 Board Six and the Chair of its Transportation
13 Committee. Today, however, I'm speaking as an
14 individual and not on behalf of the board. I
15 recognize the urgent need to improve safety for all
16 vulnerable road users, including pedestrians and
17 cyclists. However, I am here to strongly oppose the
18 proposed bill to require e-bikes to be registered, as
19 it is not the right solution to address these
20 challenges. E-bikes are used extensively by delivery
21 workers, many of whom are immigrants performing
22 grueling, low-paid work in different and often
23 dangerous conditions. I am the grandson of four
24 immigrants to this country and city, and I deeply
25 emphasize with the challenges that these workers

1
2 face. During the COVID-19 pandemic, delivery workers
3 were celebrated as heroes, risking their health to
4 deliver food and groceries to New Yorkers. Even
5 today, they brave the snow, rain and freezing
6 temperatures enabling many others to focus on their
7 families, business or avoid the harsh conditions
8 themselves. The topic of e-bike safety have been
9 discussed extensively at Manhattan Community Board
10 Six over the past several years, and I've observed a
11 disturbing theme in those conversations. During
12 these discussions, individuals have consistently
13 described delivery workers in coded or explicitly
14 racist terms. Just last week during a meeting of the
15 Board, someone called delivery cyclists a pandemic,
16 and in the hearing today, Council Member Holden
17 referred to as an epidemic. This kind of language
18 is-- underscores the bias that is often underlying
19 these debates. To be clear, calling for safety
20 measures is not inherently racist, but we must ensure
21 that our solutions do not perpetuate systematic
22 inequalities. A registration and licensing system
23 for e-bike workers would disproportionately burden
24 immigrant workers and deepen existing inequalities
25 under the guise of safety. Instead of measures that

1
2 stigmatize and penalize this workforce, we need
3 policies that respect their contributions and
4 prioritize safety for all vulnerable road users. I
5 urge you to oppose this bill and pursue thoughtful
6 equitable solutions that truly reflect the values of
7 New York City. Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

9 SANTES CARDILLO: Madam Chair, members of
10 the Council who are still here, members of the
11 public, my name is Santes Cardillo. I have been
12 using a bicycle as transportation on the streets of
13 New York since 1981 when I emigrated here, and I
14 speak today in support of Priscilla's Law. I am a
15 community activist also and advocating amongst other
16 issues that bikes with motors of any kind be
17 matriculated, insured, and licensed, as should their
18 drivers. I believe these provisions are already in
19 the law, but they're not applied. Those of you who
20 interact administratively with the NYPD maybe
21 familiar with the institution as they call it of
22 "police discretion." I learned of it at the
23 Citizen's Police Academy which I attended at the
24 request of my local precinct in order to improve
25 community relations. It means that the Police

1 Department at detriment of large can choose if and
2 which laws to apply at any given moment. Political,
3 social and cultural pressure must be brought on the
4 NYPD to sensitize them to the importance of the
5 enforcement of Priscilla and all traffic laws
6 regarding public safety. Like Priscilla,
7 unexpectedly I became the victim of a hit-and-run e-
8 bike criminal some weeks ago. The Sixth Precinct has
9 a photograph of the perpetrator-- here he is-- who
10 operates in the area. If the NYPD had dedicated a
11 billionth of the resources they produced to catch
12 Luigi Mangione, the offender would be in custody.
13 Instead I am left to nurse a broken hip without any
14 compensation. If economic development is a factor in
15 the attitude the institutions adopt towards e-bike,
16 so must be the economic damage they cause to citizens
17 left destitute and without recourses by the
18 institutions. The police department, I must add,
19 that reacts with statistics and [inaudible] service
20 as the Commissioner this morning to community
21 concerns, trumpeting how many summonses they have
22 issued to "bikes" without distinction between the
23 easy marks that mostly obnoxious [sic] cyclist
24 without motor make and the madness [sic]--
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
3 thank you.

4 SANTES CARDILLO: Motorbikes are--

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: thank you,
6 sir. I'm sorry.

7 SANTES CARDILLO: Thank you. Please ask
8 me questions. I have lots more to say.

9 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: No, you can
10 submit that. Thank you. Council Member Holden, you
11 have a question? Can you make it quick, please?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Jason, you're a
13 member of Community Board--

14 SANTES CARDILLO: [interposing] You mean
15 Sante. Oh, no, sorry. Me or him?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Him.

17 SANTES CARDILLO: Sorry, sorry.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: You're a member
19 of Community Board Six. I was a member for 30 years.
20 You're saying, but you're not offering any solutions
21 in here at all. You know, and I called it an
22 epidemic, and I think some of the victims might even
23 use stronger language. But somehow you've connected
24 to racism a red light or a speed camera or a red
25 light camera. You don't mind that for cars, do you?

1
2 JASON FROIMOWITZ: I don't believe that
3 the bill in itself is racist or the suggestion for
4 improvements--

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing] So
6 what's your solution?

7 JASON FROIMOWITZ: so, Manhattan
8 Community Board Six has passed a resolution--

9 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing] No,
10 but what's your solution, Jason?

11 JASON FROIMOWITZ: I also support the
12 resolution that Manhattan Community Board Six--

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing]
14 Which is?

15 JASON FROIMOWITZ: We believe that there
16 are measures of education, design improvements to
17 slow down bicyclist, better regulations to--

18 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing] And
19 you know, you're saying this, but you heard all the
20 victims, and you're just telling them we need
21 education. We don't need something for
22 accountability which you're not willing to back, nor
23 your board is willing to back, which is I think very
24 short-sided, and you're just covering up the problem
25 and kicking it down the road. How about something

1
2 real from the Community Board or you that we could
3 get a handle on this and put an end to it, because
4 seniors-- and I'm a senior-- we feel unsafe, but
5 you're saying well, we're racist if we propose a bill
6 that would add accountability. That's ridiculous.
7 Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

8 JASON FROIMOWITZ: If I can respond?

9 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Very briefly.

10 JASON FROIMOWITZ: Obviously, the bill in
11 itself is not racist. What is racist is the
12 underlying tone of the nature of the need for
13 enforcement, and the people--

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing] So,
15 how is calling-- how is calling it an epidemic
16 racist, which you alluded to? You said look at the
17 language that Councilman Holden used. It's racist to
18 say it's an epidemic.

19 JASON FROIMOWITZ: I believe it's
20 dehumanizing to prefer--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing] You
22 sat here and--

23 JASON FROIMOWITZ: people as an epidemic--

24 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing] Have
25 you listened--

1
2 JASON FROIMOWITZ: hardworking people as
3 epidemic?

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: thank you.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I'm talking-- by
6 the way, Priscilla Loke was killed by somebody on
7 City E-bike.

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: What do you got
10 to say about that?

11 JASON FROIMOWITZ: Obviously it's a
12 tragic loss of life.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Okay, great.

14 JASON FROIMOWITZ: Nobody should suffer
15 at the hands of any sort of--

16 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing]
17 Yeah.

18 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
19 Thank you.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you to
22 the panel. We'll call up the next panel. Elizabeth
23 Fine [sp?]. Emily Freidenberg [sp?], Meryl LaBorde,
24 Insung Choe, Hayden Brocket [sp?], Hayden Brocket,
25 Jess Joseph, Jess Joseph, James Darcy [sp?], James

1
2 Darcy, Jason Glasdone [sp?], Thomas Raingold [sp?],
3 Thomas Raingold, Susan Lun [sp?], Susan Lun, Patricia
4 Hannan [sp?], Stephanie Bowman [sp?]. Oh, sorry,
5 Steven. It's late, sorry. Steven Bowman. Alex
6 Duncan. You can get started on the end right here.
7 Go ahead.

8 UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you. Hello and
9 thank you to the Chair for hearing my testimony. We
10 just received notice while in this room today that
11 another pedestrian was killed on our streets in
12 Staten Island, killed by an SUV. We know that cars
13 are what are killing people, and this hearing is a
14 bit of a distraction from the bulk of the problem.
15 There is a continued pedestrian safety crisis in New
16 York City which is crucial to address. Intro 606 is
17 misguided. Any death or injury by e-scooter or e-
18 bike is too many, but to fully address this crisis,
19 our attention and resourced need to focus on the most
20 grievous need. 98 percent of New Yorkers killed in
21 traffic crashes this year were hit by cars, trucks,
22 mopeds, or motorcycles, all vehicles that would not
23 be addressed by Intro 606. For anyone concerned
24 about pedestrian safety, let's focus on the vehicles
25 that have killed more than 100 pedestrians this year

1
2 alone in our city, including 14 children and 36
3 seniors. In addition, 606 would be ineffective. NYPD
4 already has the ability to enforce all the rules that
5 insist e-bikers are breaking, including riding on the
6 sidewalk. This bill would not change that. It will
7 make enforcement less likely by giving an additional
8 non-safety related concern to enforce. As an
9 example, mopeds are already required to be licensed
10 and registers and are clearly not any safer for it.
11 For instance the moped that hit a three-year-old in
12 the Bronx, was not a scooter. It was moped, and it
13 would not be covered by this law. Mopeds have killed
14 five pedestrians so far this year. By discouraging
15 people from riding e-bikes, you're pushing them into
16 more dangerous modes like car and mopeds. As my
17 Council Member Chi Ossé has agreed today, Intro 606
18 would also disproportionately harm Black and Brown
19 New Yorkers by giving the NYPD reason to stop them,
20 while writing any form of micromobility, including
21 non-electric bikes which are difficult to visually
22 distinguish. As a white woman, I will not be stopped
23 on my bike. Others will. Existing enforcement
24 targets people of color already. 90 percent of
25 people ticketed for biking on the sidewalk, which is

1
2 already illegal, are people of color, and the vast
3 majority are on streets without protected bike lanes
4 where there's nowhere safer to ride. If passed,
5 Intro 606--

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
7 Thank you.

8 UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you.

9 PATRICIA HANNEM: My name is Patricia
10 Hannem [sp?]. I was born on May 17th, 1943. I'm a
11 retired woman living in Brooklyn. On August 12th
12 while crossing an intersection with a light, I was
13 hit head-on by two kids racing on Citi e-bikes and
14 was thrown 10 feet onto the pavement face first. I
15 ended up at Weill Cornell. They had to rebuild and
16 reconstruct my face. My teeth are still in severe
17 disarray. I have to wait another few months before
18 they can even rebuild my jaw. My medical bills were
19 paid for the trauma, but as an octogenarian on
20 Medicare, there's no way I can get any reimbursement
21 for my-- rebuilding my jaw and my teeth. But mostly
22 I'm grateful. I'm grateful that I live in New York.
23 I'm grateful that I got good medical care and that
24 also in the trauma rooms that people were very
25 concerned about their e-bike, that they're seeing

1
2 more and more people in the emergency rooms. And my
3 daughter-in-law was able to advocate for me. But
4 what was most surprising to me was when I went to the
5 police to file a report, I was amazed to hear that
6 almost no victims in e-bike accidents feel that they
7 can report, file a police report, because they have
8 no proof, because they're hit-and-run accidents. I
9 was very lucky. I got a detective who was very
10 sympathetic and he found videos. However, he said
11 these videos don't do anything other than to prove
12 that you were telling the truth. There's no way I can
13 identify that bike, because there is no number system
14 on it. There's no licensing. Therefore, there's no
15 accountability. And the policeman also spoke to me
16 about the fact that they're discouraged from--
17 anyway.

18 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
19 But you can submit the rest in writing.

20 PATRICIA HANNEM: Yeah, I'll send it.

21 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
22 You can start.

23 MERYL LABORDE: Hello. My name is Meryl
24 LaBorde. I live in Greenpoint, Brooklyn, and I'm here
25 to testify in opposition to Intro 606 and in support

1
2 of Intro 1131. Living in an area that's underserved
3 by public transit, I rely on bikes as my primary mode
4 of transportation. E-bikes allow me to balance
5 multiple jobs as well as volunteer advocacy, both of
6 which take me all over the city. Through my own
7 experiences I have suffered the consequences of our
8 unsafe streets, including but not limited to being
9 struck by a car and suffering a traumatic brain
10 injury. My own experiences are why I'm here to ask
11 the City Council to reject Intro 606 and instead
12 support proven and workable solutions, safer street
13 design, enforcement of existing legislation and app
14 regulations. The Department of Transportation is
15 already overburdened and failing to meet the legal
16 requirements for protected bike lane miles in the
17 Streets Plan. Forcing them to develop, implement and
18 manage a licensing program means further strain on a
19 department that lacks the resources and capacity to
20 do their job. While the licensing would be on DOT,
21 Intro 606 would put the onus of safety on enforcement
22 by the NYPD. The NYPD has proven it cannot be the
23 agency to keep New Yorkers safe from traffic
24 violence. With enforcement dropping significantly
25 over the years, as fatalities and serious injuries

1
2 continue to rise. Instead of creating safer streets,
3 this legislation will give NYPD the power to pull
4 over anyone just for riding a bike, regardless of if
5 they've broken the law. This will undoubtedly
6 discourage bike use, lead to over-policing of
7 working-class New Yorkers and disproportionate affect
8 people of color and deliveristas. Instead of voting
9 for this legislation which will discourage biking
10 while burdening the under-resourced DOT, I encourage
11 you sport proven safe street solutions, enforce
12 existing regulations requiring delivery companies to
13 provide commercial cyclists with the necessary
14 equipment and training to do their job safely,
15 support stronger protections for delivery workers to
16 make their job safer and dis incentivize dangerous
17 riding behavior. Make it easier for DOT to meet the
18 goals of the Streets Plan and redesign streets to
19 allocate space for safe travel modes.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

21 MERYL LABORDE: Thank you.

22 STEPHEN BAUMAN: I'm Stephen Bauman, and
23 I'm an 82-year-old retired research and development
24 scientist. I wanted to look at the numbers, because
25 I've seen so many things around, and essentially

1 [inaudible] the last 12 years' worth of data that's
2 public available on the Open Database from the MV104
3 reports. Now, to figure out what is and broken it
4 down by City Council district. Essentially there
5 have been about 600K citywide, numbers in terms of
6 injured, and 3K killed. It breaks down as follows:
7 70 percent of the injured were motorists, only 40
8 percent were killed, eight percent cyclist, nine
9 percent cyclists were killed, 19 percent of the
10 injuries were pedestrians, but 51 percent were those
11 killed. The point is despite what has been said, the
12 license on a car is not what is reduced the death
13 toll. It's shoulder harnesses and a lot of other
14 things. The point is with regard to examining singly
15 incidents with regard to cause of pedestrian crashes
16 from the public data, essentially 96 percent of the
17 crashes were due to motor vehicles, 98 percent were
18 due to-- of deaths were due to-- pedestrian deaths
19 were due to motor vehicles. What this means is the
20 following. Suppose the proposed legislation were 100
21 percent successful. It would only include two
22 percent of the accidents. So 100 percent success
23 rate means a two percent gain or reduction in
24 fatalities. Whereas if what was proposed for
25

1
2 education and so forth were 10 percent effective, it
3 would mean a nine percent gain.

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

5 ALEX DUNCAN: I'm Alex Duncan, also
6 sometimes known as Miser. I want to start by saying
7 that people don't need e-bikes. They don't need cars
8 and they don't need mass transit. What they need is
9 transportation. The bike, the car, the mass transit
10 those are all tools that help them achieve the thing
11 that they need. So the question is, how do we as a
12 society provide that, and how do we do it best and
13 safest. Several times today, notably when
14 Commissioner Rodriguez and Comptroller Lander's rep
15 were speaking, they gave stats about the relative
16 dangers of cars and bikes, and were roundly booed by
17 the supporters of this bill. That kind of gives up
18 the game that this is about safety. When you're
19 booing objective reality in service of vilifying
20 bikes and the people that ride them, you aren't
21 interested in safety. You're fighting a dumb culture
22 war, because objective reality is very clear here.
23 Cars are the killers on the streets. Cars are the
24 number one killer of children under 13, number one,
25 and that's by far. That's a fact. Not just compared

1 to e-bikes, compared to everything. It's not e-bikes
2 killing children on the streets of New York. Cars
3 kill. Cars maim and cars crash 300 times a day in
4 this city in the five boroughs, and that's just the
5 reported crashes. The likely ones are much higher.
6 The only way to get people out of their cars is to
7 provide alternatives like e-bikes. E-bikes
8 objectively save lives when people choose them
9 instead of cars. Again, people need transportation
10 and they need to choose a mode. Every single person
11 on an e-bikes massively reduces the danger to the
12 public, and anecdotal stories do not change that.
13 These are statistics. We're dealing with a large
14 number of people. Are there harms from any of these
15 modes? Yes, of course.

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

18 ALEX DUNCAN: it's about relative--
19 relative harms.

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

21 Next.

22 UNIDENTIFIED: Hello, Council Members.

23 I'm here as a Park Slope resident of Council District
24 39, a dense and heavily-biked area and neighborhood,
25 to testify against Intro 606. E-bike registration

1
2 has been shown to be ineffective as a means of
3 reducing pedestrian violence. It is extremely
4 expensive to enforce, to the tune of costing \$19
5 million, and this is a conservative estimate. Cities
6 across the country have repealed their e-bike
7 registration programs due to how vastly useless they
8 are with low registration, high levels of bureaucracy
9 required, and no real reduction in harm. Council
10 Member Holden has repeatedly cited cities that have
11 repealed these laws due to how ineffective and
12 expensive they are to administer. This proposal
13 gives the NYPD allowance to pull over any bike rider
14 for any reason, regardless of an infraction that was
15 witnessed. That is by definition stop and frisk. We
16 already have a litany of statistics that stop and
17 frisk laws disproportionately target brown bodies. I
18 am filled with dread at the prospect of giving the
19 NYPD more power to do more of the same. There
20 actually exists effective ways of getting e-bikes off
21 of the sidewalks and reducing pedestrian violence.
22 Protected bike lanes and daylighting which is
23 increasing visibility at crosswalks and intersections
24 by removing obstacles, increasing lighting, they have
25 been shown by DOT and other transportation

1
2 organizations to be very effective. This proposal is
3 not that. Recklessly passing a law that has been
4 repealed or ineffective in every city it's been
5 passed in to just do something what is unclear how
6 606 actually will lead to enforcement is dangerous.
7 Many of the cases talked about today where
8 identification was successful, the NYPD declined to
9 seek further legal action. But let's pass
10 legislation that actually fixes this. I want to thank
11 the council for their time and patience today and I
12 want to urge you to decline this proposal.

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
14 Thank you to the panel. We'll next call up Joshua
15 Wood, Gustavo Ajche, Joshua Wood? Peggy Yannis
16 [sp?]? Peggy Yannis? Peggy? Louis Cortez [sp?]?
17 Fortunato Labrado [sp?]. Fortunato Labrado? Corey
18 Hannigan? Corey Hannigan? Joel Maxman [sp?], Carrie
19 Michaels? Kevin Guzman? Louis Anderson [sp?]?
20 Louis Anderson? Bonnie Gerard? Bonnie? Carina
21 Kaufman-Gutierrez? Carina Kaufman-Gutierrez? Alita
22 Camp [sp?]? Florence Freidman [sp?]? Shara Nusbaum
23 [sp?]? Are you Shara? Okay, thank you. Noted,
24 thank you. And thank you. Maria Danzilo? Maria?
25 Joshua Wood? Bernadette Ferrara? Come on down.

1
2 FLORENCE FRIEDMAN: Hi, my name is
3 Florence Freidman. A year ago at 7:30 p.m. I was
4 knocked down by a motorized bicycle riding on the
5 sidewalk on West 14th Street and Sixth Avenue on the
6 sidewalk. A rider who appeared to be a delivery man
7 did not stop. I was in a state of shock, but
8 fortunately there was a good Samaritan who called the
9 police and an ambulance. The police took all my
10 information, but of course, I had no information
11 about the assailant. The bike had no license plate.
12 He sped away. I spent hours in the emergency room
13 and left with a cast on my broken wrist. The
14 sidewalks and the streets of Manhattan are the Wild
15 West. Everybody seems to agree on that, but why is
16 that? Why is it that the streets of Manhattan are
17 the Wild West? Cars stop at pedestrian crosswalks.
18 Why do they stop? Cars stop at red lights. Why do
19 cars stop? They stop because they know if they don't
20 stop they're going to have to pay a hefty fine or
21 maybe go to jail. You don't get cooperation by
22 education. I'm all for education. You don't get
23 cooperation, adherence to the law by education. You
24 get it by accountability. Wider roads for e-bikes
25 don't get you accountability. This panel knows that.

1
2 I know that. Everybody knows that, and I don't know
3 why we talk about it so much and don't do something
4 about it. I don't know why it's so hard to pass
5 Priscilla's Law when we all know that a license plate
6 works on cars and it will work on bicycles.

7 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

8 BONNIE GERARD: Good afternoon. My name
9 is Bonnie Gerard. Thank you for permitting me to
10 tell my victim story regarding an e-bike that crashed
11 into me. I live on the Upper East Side. Last
12 October I was standing on the corner of 80th Street
13 and Second Avenue around 6:00 p.m. I was standing on
14 the sidewalk waiting for the light to change. A car
15 wanted to make a legal left turn. The e-bike would
16 not wait, but wanted to get ahead of the car. He
17 went smack into me on the sidewalk. I had a patella
18 fracture on my right knee, stitches on my left knee,
19 the entire left side of my body was bruised with a
20 mild concussion. I'm happy to be alive and here. I
21 required medical attention and physical therapy for
22 months. Additionally, thousands of dollars of
23 expenses. I fell back on my head, hit the garbage
24 can, and I was in pain all over. I was rushed to the
25 ER. After numerous tests and six hours later I was

1
2 released to start therapy and a difficult healing
3 process for more than a year. All our alliance is
4 asking is to have e-bikes licensed, insured and be
5 safe by following traffic rules. Bikers now behave
6 as they did during COVID as though no one is on the
7 street. Of course, we want the public to enjoy
8 biking, but at this present time, cars and
9 pedestrians are not safe. We need to turn our heads
10 360 degrees to cross the street now. For correct
11 data, the community has to know where to report
12 accidents. I was told to make out a motor vehicle
13 report. We cannot even call 311. They do not know
14 where to report these accidents. Other cities such
15 as Manasquan in Hoboken, New Jersey are requiring
16 helmets, registration and insurance, which I hope New
17 York City will also require. That is why I am in
18 favor of Priscilla's 0606-2024. Thank you and thank
19 you and especially thank Councilman Holden--

20 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
21 Thank you.

22 BONNIE GERARD: for all your attention to
23 this matter.

24 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

25 UNIDENTIFIED: Good evening--

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]

And I just want to make sure you're not recording because it's not allowed at the table.

UNIDENTIFIED: Oh, I was going to record myself, okay, my testimony.

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you. I had to go to work. Thanks for understanding. And I was here--

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]

We chased you down after, but--

UNIDENTIFIED: I was helping Pam with her testimony, and then I-- whatever, anyway. It was a misunderstanding. Thank you. I am a member-- Steering Committee Member of NYC EVSA. I'm an avid cyclist. I'm a fund raiser on my bike. It's very important to me that I continue to do this, and I'm a victim of two e-vehicle-- experiences of e-vehicle violence. I was hit twice by two different e-bikes, one in the park and one in front of my house. The one in the park, I was cycling, and it was pretty severe. I was in the emergency room for seven hours. I suffered a lot like many people have here today. I don't need to expand on my victim story other than to

1
2 say that I, of course, am in support of Priscilla's
3 Law 0606. What I want to mention beyond this is that
4 it is-- for me, and he's no longer here. It's
5 unconscionable to me that Ydanis Rodriguez left the
6 meeting, and we as a group met with him over a year
7 and a half ago, DOT. We met with him over a year and
8 a half ago expressing many of these concerns with
9 suggestions as we have to improve safety. None of
10 this has to do with any sort of discrimination, and
11 the reason I say that is because as a cyclist, I want
12 to continue cycling. It's extremely difficult to
13 cycle now, even in the park. It's hazardous. It's
14 dangerous, especially on the Hudson River Parkway.
15 To the point of discrimination, Lyft Citi Bike, the
16 majority of Lyft Citi Bike users and riders are
17 white. I know this because I see it. I'm almost hit
18 by these people every day. Has nothing to do with
19 race or profiling. We've contacted Lyft many times,
20 including Gale Brewer's office. We've reached out to
21 her, including Eric Bottcher's office trying to get a
22 meeting with them to talk about safety and
23 enforcement and regulation for their egregious
24 riders, headphones, going the wrong way, through the
25

1 crosswalks, injuring people, killing Priscilla Loke.
2 They are unresponsive. So if I can just finish on--

3 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]

4 Thank you. Actually no, because we have well over 50
5 people Zoom.

6 UNIDENTIFIED: Please, please get in
7 touch with Lyft--

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]

9 Thank you.

10 UNIDENTIFIED: for your committee,
11 please.

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

13 UNIDENTIFIED: They're unresponsive.

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

15 MARIA DANZILO: Okay, thank you. Thank
16 you, Chair Brooks-Powers for the opportunity to speak
17 and thank you Council Member Holden for sponsoring
18 this bill. My name is Maria Danzilo. I'm Executive
19 Director of One City Rising, a non-partisan
20 government watchdog and taxpayer advocacy group.
21 With great empathy for all the victims of e-vehicle
22 violence, I do want to focus on another aspect of
23 this effort to regulate these vehicles. How did Door
24 Dash become a \$48 billion company in just 10 years,
25

1 and how did its founder build a \$4 billion net worth?
2 By focusing "relentlessly on unit economics and
3 operational efficiency" and a "maniacal focus on
4 improving delivery times" to drive profitability.
5 These are not my words. These are the words of Tony
6 Xu, founder of Door Dash as amplified by Sequoia
7 Capital, a massive multi-billion-dollar West Coast
8 based venture capital firm whose principals have also
9 reaped billions from the massive growth of delivery
10 apps and the lack of e-bike regulation. This
11 language was on their website. When e-bikes were
12 regulated in 2022-- in 2020, excuse me-- normal
13 regulatory safeguards should have been included, but
14 they were not. Big tech hailed the legalization
15 without regulation as a major victory and their stock
16 jumped enormously. This is because regulation gets
17 in the way of profits by holding operators
18 accountable for reckless and dangerous behavior. As
19 a result of this lack of regulation, we have had all
20 the negative consequences of an unregulated approach
21 that you have heard today. Dense and affluent
22 Manhattan should not be a gold mine for profiteers
23 who want to own our streets for their profit. It is
24 now time for this body to correct this reckless
25

1
2 oversight by passing Priscilla's Law, Intro 606,
3 without any further delay. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

5 PEGGY YANNIS: My name is Peggy Yannis
6 [sp?]. I'm a lifelong New Yorker. I've lived through
7 the bad ol' days of New York, and I'm beside myself
8 by what's going on in the city right now. I'm going
9 to go a bit off-script because I've been here since
10 nine o'clock this morning, and I am outraged and very
11 upset by the arguments that have been put forth by
12 Trans Alt and similar organizations. They are giving
13 no solutions. To say that protected bike lanes are a
14 solution is wrong. Those are death traps for
15 pedestrians. I have been dodging e-vehicles for the
16 last four years, sometimes 10 a day. I've got
17 hundreds of photographs of them going the wrong way,
18 everything. I've been lucky. Twice I got grazed on
19 the hand by two cyclists not doing what they were
20 supposed to be doing, and then recently I was down in
21 Chinatown and I was going to try to cross a protected
22 bike lane to get to a parked car. I looked both ways,
23 didn't see anybody coming, and as I was getting ready
24 to cross, out of nowhere an e-bike going very, very
25 fast came straight at me and screamed watch out. At

1
2 which point, I tried to turn to get back on the
3 sidewalk, lost my balance, hit my head on a bike
4 rail. Fortunately for me that kind of cushioned the
5 fall when I landed on my knee or it would have been
6 broken. I just got very badly cut up. But to say
7 protected bike lanes are a solution-- maybe for the
8 bicyclists, but not for the pedestrians. And the
9 statistics they were giving how few of us have been
10 injured-- my husband who's an average regular cyclist
11 was on the west side bike lane and he got rear-ended
12 by a motorbike that shouldn't have been there, went
13 flying off his bike. Somehow made it home. I told--
14 took to emergency. Told him you got to file a police
15 report. It came back.

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

17 PEGGY YANNIS: Thank you.

18 BERNADETTE FERRARA: Good evening Chair
19 and Committee Members. My name is Bernadette
20 Ferrara. I'm the President of the Van Nest
21 Neighborhood Alliance, a member of CEBCA, the
22 Coalition of East Bronx Community Associations,
23 former Chair and 17-year board member of Bronx
24 Community Board 11, and a lifelong Northeast Bronx
25 resident, still living in one of the oldest

1
2 neighborhoods of Van Nest, established in 1853, and I
3 am in support of Intro 606, Priscilla's Law. Back in
4 August 1st, 2021, the e-bike, scooter pilot program
5 was set in our northeast community. It was evident
6 within a few weeks that with no regulation set in
7 place along with lax registrations upon use of both
8 scooters and e-bikes that our community's public
9 safety was at risk. Both scooters and e-bikes were
10 riding on sidewalks, driving against the flow of
11 traffic, running red lights and stop signs, major and
12 minor injuries in abundance, and then fatalities.
13 Transportation Committees at the Community Board
14 level have community outcry that was ignored by DOT.
15 Even with minor tweaks they were not working and
16 public safety was still at risk. It seemed that the
17 contracts made with Lime, Bird, and Veo were more
18 important to the DOT than public safety of the
19 community and its residents. How does a city agency
20 implement a pilot program with no safety regulations
21 such as license plates with registration when it
22 comes to moving vehicles along with the knowledge
23 that law enforcement had complications with
24 enforcement of many of these violations. I-- excuse
25 me. I hold DOT and the City Council Members who

1 supported this pilot program without the foresight of
2 public safety for residents accountable to their
3 irresponsibility that cause--

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
5 Thank you.

6 BERNADETTE FERRARA: major injuries and
7 fatalities. Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
9 Thank you so much. Thank you to this panel. We'll
10 next-- we'll call up the next panel. Michelle Campo?
11 Lauren Health [sp?], Lauren Health, Kathy Park Price,
12 Kathy? Okay. James Shameel [sp?], James Shameel,
13 James Shameel, Autumn Bosco, Autumn Bosco, Yvonne
14 Colevy [sp?], Cloevy-- Yvonne, that's you? Okay.
15 Thank you. Joan-Marie Zimmerman? Brian Howald?

16 JOAN-MARIE ZIMMERMAN: Hi. My name is
17 Joan-Marie Zimmerman. I'm an opera singer and a voice
18 teacher. I've been driving a bike, human-powered, for
19 about 35 years. It's my main mode of transportation
20 in Hamburg, Germany, in Vienna, Austria, and in New
21 York City. I taught at LaGuardia High School for
22 about 17 years, and now I teach singing at Kaufman
23 Cultural Center. On my way to Carnegie Hall I was
24 waiting for the light on my bike to turn green. I
25

1
2 proceeded and an e-bike sped and t-boned me trying to
3 get through all the pedestrians and me. I had a
4 broken tibia plateau, a ruptured Baker's cyst, a torn
5 meniscus, and ultimately a blot clot. I had to take
6 Eliquis which created brain fog and vertigo. I've
7 been dealing with this for about a year. It happened
8 on December 7th, 2023. My feeling is there's a
9 fundamental disregard for the law in New York and a
10 fundamental disregard for human life in New York.
11 When these-- and these people that ride the e-bikes
12 need to obey the law the same as everybody. In
13 Austria, for example, if one runs a light, one is
14 accountable and they wait for the lights. Here, we
15 run through them, and we need to do something, and I
16 am in support of Priscilla's Law.

17 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

18 UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you for this
19 opportunity to speak in support of Priscilla's Law.
20 I do not hold a grudge against bikes. Since four
21 decades ago, way before the implementation of bike
22 lanes, I rode my bicycle very frequently around this
23 city. These days, like every other pedestrian, I am
24 constantly frazzled by e-bikes. Some riders show
25 consideration, but many more do not. Pedestrians do

1 not know which is the one who will end up hurting us.
2 My friend got knocked over. I've had many close
3 calls, and I'm on constant alert. With my brittle
4 bones I fear a debilitating injury. To the people
5 who say cars are the problem, I say it's the e-bikes,
6 not the cars that have destroyed my quality of life.
7 My pleasure in walking my own neighborhood, the East
8 Village, and everywhere in the city has been ruined.
9 I think it's outrageous that this Wild West has been
10 allowed to prevail. Pedestrians getting knocked down
11 and culprits riding off Scott-free, incredible. I
12 now tell my friends and relatives from elsewhere it
13 is dangerous to set foot in New York. It would be
14 great if the city could accommodate all means of
15 locomotion, but traffic safety rules have to be
16 enforced. You, the City Council, have the
17 responsibility to make e-vehicle riders and
18 additionally the commercial delivery employers
19 accountable to traffic laws. This is an emergency.
20 Please pass Intro 0606.

22 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

23 UNIDENTIFIED: Hi. Ms. Zimmerman, I've
24 ridden my bicycle in European countries, and it is
25 true, in a city like Amsterdam, you have half of the

1 big-- like the equivalent of Third Avenue, half of it
2 is cyclists. And if you even go out past the line,
3 someone will come over and there's tickets given.
4 There's tickets given if someone doesn't have a bell
5 and there's an onus on the society that they agree to
6 abide by the law, because A, that's just what they're
7 used to, and they wouldn't think otherwise. And I
8 have been a proponent of human-powered
9 transportation. I've been a city cyclist, a city
10 rollerblader, an urban kayaker. I've been on a lot of
11 boards, you know, about human-power transportation.
12 Fast-forward to two years ago, I was hit by an e-bike
13 going the wrong direction while he was reading his
14 phone. It was a delivery driver. I was thrown about
15 six feet, and thankfully I landed like a table, so it
16 didn't hurt my head like some of the other people,
17 but I was unable to walk, you know, stand up. I
18 needed to be supported. I broke my ankle and I had
19 to be taken by FDNY ambulance to Northwell. I was in
20 the hospital for three days getting surgery-- you
21 know, one surgery, and then I actually had to have a
22 second surgery to take out the hardware. Yeah, I
23 probably had six months of PT, and I'm very, very
24 lucky as compared to somebody like--
25

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]

Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Priscilla Loke.

KATHY PARK PRICE: Thank you, Chair

Brooks-Powers for allowing me the opportunity to speak. My name is Kathy Park Price. I'm the Brooklyn organizer at Transportation Alternatives, but I'm testifying in my personal capacity. I'm here as a mother whose kids recently began walking on the streets on their own and as someone whose number one concern as a New Yorker is street safety. Instead of adding another car to the street, I ride a pedal assist electric bike to get to work, get one of my kids to school, to run errands, and generally enjoy New York City, and I strongly oppose Intro 606 and support Intro 1131. If licensing and registering e-bikes and investing \$19 million of taxpayer money to set up a new system would have prevented the death of the one person killed by an e-bike rider this year, I would support it. As a city we must focus our limited resources on reducing and ultimately eliminating the number of crashes that cause death and serious injuries on our streets. The best way to do that is by enforcing existing laws and designing

1
2 our streets to prioritize safety and implementing
3 policy changes that address the source of 99.5
4 percent of pedestrian fatalities since 2014, and that
5 is cars and other large vehicles. The fact that
6 supporters of Intro 606 do not support actions that
7 address cars and other large vehicles shows how
8 disingenuous the bill is. we know what works and
9 have the tools to prevent death and serious injuries
10 today: reducing speed limits, expanding automated
11 enforcement of speed and red light violations, adding
12 more school streets, reducing vehicle size,
13 daylighting every intersection, installing speed
14 governors in vehicles, building raised crosswalks,
15 and installing protected bikes lanes are some
16 examples of proven ways that we could improve safety
17 on our streets today. I encourage City Council to
18 nick Intro 606.

19 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
20 Next.

21 MICHELLE CAMPO: Like that? Okay. Hi,
22 I've been waiting a while. I'm a third generation
23 New Yorker, since everybody seems to be identifying
24 themselves. My name is Michelle Campo. I thank you
25 for holding this hearing. I'm here in support of

1
2 Priscilla's Law 0606. I've waited. I've been to the
3 end of the-- everybody else, and I seem to be between
4 two TA people, so I'm really happy. I want to say
5 that my husband who is-- excuse me? My husband is a
6 professional cyclist. He was-- he was track director
7 of the Velodrome. He knows how to ride a bike. He
8 coached the West Point cadets. He was on the bike
9 path coming downtown on the west side. He was hit
10 from behind by somebody who cursed him out at the
11 time. He was in an e-vehicle. This guy hit him,
12 sent him flying. He couldn't identify the guy. The
13 guy cursed at him, because oh, he was in his way, so
14 he had to hit him. And then-- and there two people--
15 this is by Chelsea Piers. There were two women there
16 with little flags to tell people what to do. They
17 said, oh, you did the wrong thing. Did they call it
18 in? No, nobody called it in. So that's not on the
19 record either. I don't know about this data that DOT
20 has, but it's a little skewed. And I had to urge
21 him, because he's a little, you know strong guy, to
22 go and finally check out that-- yes, he had three
23 fractured ribs. Nothing was done about this. But if
24 I ever find this guy. I have a cane, and when I walk
25 down the sidewalk and somebody's coming at me on an

1
2 e-bike, I say what you going to do now? So that's my
3 defense. I haven't been hit, but if you have, you
4 might see me on the news, because-- I don't know.
5 They might be hurt.

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

7 BRIAN HOWALD: Good evening Chair Brooks-
8 Powers and other Council Members. My name is Brian
9 Howald. I live in Brooklyn Heights, and I'm a seventh
10 generation New Yorker. I'm a member of Brooklyn
11 Community Board Two and it's Transportation
12 Committee, though I only speak personally today.
13 Everyone in this room has had a close call with an e-
14 bike, whether it's someone biking on the sidewalk,
15 going the wrong way in the bike lane, turning around
16 a blind corner too fast, etcetera. We've heard
17 dozens of stories from people who were hurt in
18 crashes and this pain and suffering is very real. E-
19 bikes, mopeds, other bikes, scooters, cars, there are
20 people on every form of transportation in New York
21 breaking the rules and putting other people in harm's
22 way all the time. If you care about getting bikes
23 off the sidewalks, if you care about people crossing
24 with the walk sign not getting hit, if you care about
25 getting people to not run red lights, if you care

1
2 about seniors, if you care about safety, then this
3 bill is not for you. I speak in opposition today to
4 Intro 606. This bill at 416 words is surprisingly
5 scant about how it will solve these problems. This
6 bill would make it mandatory for every e-bike to have
7 a license plate, but it doesn't say what the penalty
8 would be for breaking that law. This bill would make
9 plates mandatory for e-bikes, but the language isn't
10 restricted to riding on public streets. So if you
11 drove a U-Haul from Pennsylvania to Connecticut with
12 an e-bike in the back, you'd be breaking the law if
13 you didn't make a pit stop in Washington Heights to
14 register it. This bill would prohibit e-bikes from
15 displaying any plates other than New York City
16 plates. So if the scheme being proposed here were
17 adopted by say New Jersey, people would have to stop
18 biking halfway across the GW Bridge to swap their
19 license plates. The people pushing this law say it's
20 need to stop behavior that's already illegal. The
21 lack of license plates hasn't stopped the NYPD from
22 writing tickets to people on bikes or e-bikes, or
23 from confiscating mopeds. As pointed out today, this
24 bill wouldn't even apply to mopeds. I report drivers
25 to the police for throwing bottles at me only to be

1
2 told that if they didn't witness it, there's nothing
3 they would do even with a photo and a license plate.
4 How will registering e-bikes make our streets safer?
5 No one pushing this bill has an answer beyond hand
6 waving. To the Council Members who have signed onto
7 this bill in response to constituent concerns, this
8 bill won't make your constituents safer, nor will it
9 get the people pushing this bill off your back. It
10 won't solve the many real problems discussed here,
11 and it's only a matter of time before we'll be back
12 with another bad idea. Please oppose this bill.
13 Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
15 Laura Shepard? Laura Shepard? Paul Mondesire. Paul
16 Mondesire? Samir Lavingia. Samir Lavingia? Solomon-
17 - thank you. Kevin Siegel? Kevin Siegel? If there's
18 anyone else in the room that wishes to testify or
19 that we may have inadvertently missed, please connect
20 with one of the Sergeant at Arms.

21 LAURA SHEPARD: Alright. I'm Laura
22 Shepard, a lifelong Queens resident and now proud
23 Queens organizer at Transportation Alternatives. I
24 also Chair the Environment Parks and Recreation
25 Committee on Queens Community Board Two, but right

1
2 now I'm only speaking for myself. I'm here to oppose
3 Intro 606 and support Intro 1131. My fellow
4 activists, colleagues and I have organized too many
5 vigils for vulnerable road users, pedestrians, and
6 cyclists, including e-bike riders, some of whom were
7 working cyclists. These are painful and difficult so
8 we work tirelessly every day to build a city where
9 this doesn't happen to anyone. We empathize and
10 support all victims of traffic violence and have a
11 proven track record of advocating for proven
12 solutions. We oppose Intro 606 because it's laughably
13 vague, broad, and wouldn't work as written and would
14 harm all cyclists and pedestrians, especially
15 vulnerable populations. NYPD fails to solve most
16 hit-and-run cases and a minuscule percentage of those
17 even involve e-bikes. We know what works,
18 infrastructure. So thank you, Chair, for introducing
19 1131. No one likes getting close passed at any
20 speed. Our city is disturbingly behind on building
21 the legally-required bike lane miles laid out in the
22 NYC Streets Plan and it's taking a pathetically long
23 time to open the Queensboro Bridge South Outer
24 Walkway where commuters are routinely injured as a
25 result of substandard facilities. When protected

1
2 bike infrastructure is installed, all crashes,
3 injuries and fatalities decrease, especially amongst
4 pedestrians and especially amongst senior
5 pedestrians. We have the data. Throughout the city
6 we are all squeezed by the amount of space allocated
7 to cars and trucks, the primary drivers of traffic
8 violence in New York City. Vulnerable road users
9 trying to get around safely are still sometimes
10 forced onto sidewalks by unsafe street designs and
11 reckless vehicle drivers. At corners, we need
12 universal daylighting to improve visibility, curb
13 extensions and raised crosswalks to help people cross
14 safely and protect all road users. I'll submit the
15 rest in writing.

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

17 LAURA SHEPARD: Thank you.

18 UNIDENTIFIED: Dear Transportation
19 Committee Chair Brooks-Powers and members of the
20 Transportation Committee. I'm speaking in opposition
21 to Intro 606. I'm a teenager who rides bikes around
22 New York, and during the COVID-19 pandemic I started
23 riding a lot around New York City, specifically
24 around the protected bike lanes around the East
25 River, Hudson River. I also was appointed to

1
2 Manhattan Community Board Three a year and a half
3 ago, although I do not speak on behalf of them. I
4 agree that streets need to be safer. Unsafe streets
5 will kill people. However, requiring e-bike
6 licensing does not create safer streets. It instead
7 leads to a way that the NYPD will stop and arrest
8 riders. It doesn't actually lead to behavioral
9 changes, as even though e-bikers can behave in
10 dangerous ways. This is not-- so does everybody and
11 cars are far more dangerous than e-bikes. They weigh
12 far more and they are responsible for far more
13 crashes. And discouraging e-bikes which replace cars
14 on streets can also be bad in that way of making
15 streets more unsafe. As other people have said
16 before, e-bikes that replace cars create more safety
17 because cars are more unsafe than e-bikes, and
18 protecting people from e-bikes can be done with
19 daylighting, expanded bike lanes, and other
20 infrastructure. Thank you.

21 KEVIN SIEGEL: Good evening, Council
22 Member Brooks-Powers. I'm a Civil Rights Attorney. I
23 took off work today. I guess that was necessary.
24 I'm here to speak on opposition to Intro 606. I am an
25 e-bike rider as are many of my friends, especially

1 those with children. We are kind to people. I think
2 we're also socially-responsible people which may not
3 be the impression that you can get of our community
4 of cyclists from this hearing. Intro 606 is
5 unworkable. It will-- through the confusion that it
6 will create among consumers and among the industry,
7 it will decrease e-bike usage, and it will push
8 people into cars who would otherwise be getting
9 around by e-bikes, and that is a public policy
10 outcome that New York City and the Council and this
11 committee should militate against. In addition,
12 there will be disparate impact because NYPD will
13 likely not be enforcing against affluent riders on
14 fancy e-bikes. They'll be enforcing against delivery
15 workers on bikes that they can easily identify and on
16 riders whom they can easily identify. There's been a
17 lot said today about how license plates create
18 accountability. I do want to share my own little
19 anecdote about license plates and accountability and
20 the cops. Earlier this year, a car veered into a
21 bike lane. I yelled. The driver got out of the car,
22 called me a homophobic slur and put his arms around
23 my neck. I was able to take a picture of his license
24 plate as he left. Several officers pulled up. They
25

1
2 were sort of a few blocks behind. I tried to get them
3 to help me. I told them I had a picture of the
4 license plate, and they said, "Are you okay? Are you
5 okay?" and nothing happened. So, if the issue is
6 NYPD not enforcing and issues with NYPD in general,
7 we know that those issues run across crimes and run
8 across offenses and issues in the City, and this
9 licensing program is not going to prevent that harm,
10 and it certainly didn't prevent the trauma that I
11 experienced that day. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
13 And we are going to take a five-minute break, and
14 then we're going to move to virtual testimony.

15 [break]

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Alright, we
17 will resume. You ready? Okay. We will hear next
18 from Adrian Morquecho followed by Alida Camp.

19 ADRIAN MORQUECHO: Hello and good evening
20 to everyone, and thank you, Chair, for the
21 opportunity to present. I wanted to start out by
22 saying that I empathize with Priscilla and any other
23 victims of e-bikes, as I myself have suffered from a
24 fractured sternum while on a bike lane. However, I do
25 realize that licenses as proposed by Intro-- the

1
2 introduction by Council Member Holden is not the
3 solution. There are other options that I have
4 conceived like enforcing that Uber and Lyft show
5 speeds on their apps and control the speeds of
6 deliveristas on their apps. Citi Bike could limit
7 speeds to 15 miles an hour similar to what Veo and
8 Lime do in the Bronx pilot. And also, in my case as
9 a person who uses Citi E-bikes, the screen on the
10 actual bike should show the speed that you're going,
11 because especially when you're going downhill on an
12 e-bike. It is because of the way that the gravity is
13 working for you, it increases your speed a lot, and
14 in that case it can be very hard to tell how fast
15 you're going. And also, just thinking about other
16 countries that have bikes and bike laws, I feel like
17 the Dutch have done a very good job of creating
18 protected bike lanes and separating bikes from
19 pedestrians to the point where the instances of
20 crashes between bikes, electric or not, and
21 pedestrians have been severely reduced. And just in
22 general, I completely understand wanting justice for
23 victims and I do believe that we should hold bikers
24 accountable. I just don't think that--

1
2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Thank
3 you. Your time's expired.

4 ADRIAN MORQUECHO: Okay, thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
6 Next we'll hear from Alida Camp followed by Andre
7 Braga [sp?].

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

9 ALIDA CAMP: Thank you. My name is Alida
10 Camp. Thank you for hearing my testimony. I'm a
11 member of CB8, but I'm speaking individually in
12 Manhattan. When I say e-bikes I mean all e-vehicles.
13 Why shouldn't e-bikes be registered? We register to
14 vote, the most basic right. We register to have a
15 dog. We register at hospitals and schools. Why
16 shouldn't the safety of pedestrians be paramount?
17 Many e-bike riders wear helmets, but what protection
18 do pedestrians have? Why shouldn't the safety of e-
19 bike riders be important? Registration links to
20 accountability which links to more safety-conscious
21 riding. Slower riding leads to less serious injuries
22 if there is an accessible. Why shouldn't the council
23 protect the interest of our seniors and children
24 crossing the street and using our sidewalks without
25 being afraid that they will be injured or killed by

1
2 an e-bike? Why shouldn't the Council protect the
3 ability of pedestrians injured by e-bikes to seek
4 accountability for their injuries? IDs of bikes will
5 lead to accountability as a lack of IDs lead to
6 riding off even when there are oblivious injuries.
7 Why shouldn't e-bike riders be accountable when they
8 don't follow the traffic laws? Victims of reckless
9 e-bike riding re forced to cover medical and healing
10 costs themselves. Why is this viewed as reasonable?
11 Lawsuits by those injured are a disincentive to
12 recklessness. Why shouldn't e-bikes be regulated
13 just because more accidents may be caused by cars?
14 We eat vegetables because they're necessary, even
15 though we also need protein. We have heard too many
16 times, including in this hearing, that residents are
17 afraid for their safety. We encourage public transit
18 use, yet riders have regulations. It doesn't
19 diminish their interest in using public transit. You
20 have the power and the obligation to provide safer
21 streets. Please use your power and pass this
22 legislation. Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
24 Next we will hear from Andre Braga [sp?], followed by
25 Alex Morano [sp?].

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

UNIDENTIFIED: Andre, you've been muted.

You've been unmuted. Andre Braga?

SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

UNIDENTIFIED: I guess we can go to the next person. Alex Morano?

ALEX MORANO: Thanks. Before I start, I just want to give a hat tip to Chair Brooks-Powers and the staff of the committee that have been incredibly patient and shown great endurance listening to everyone's testimony since 10:00 a.m. this morning. So really appreciate that. In that vein, I'll try and keep it short and sweet. I'm a lifelong New Yorker. I live in Brooklyn, just a resident of the city, and I'm here to speak against Intro 606. As many have said, and as Public Advocate Williams very aptly said this morning, right, all the folks coming in to testify about their experience with e-bikes and feeling unsafe, that's really valid. I think we all want safe streets, right? No one is going to stand against safety. The problem here is that this bill for the multitude of reasons that have been repeated throughout the day won't really make our streets safer, right? Mopeds already require a

1 license plate and the biggest cause of violence on
2 our streets, cars, are already licensed, right? And
3 this doesn't do anything to diminish the harm--
4 diminish the harm that is inflicted upon New Yorkers,
5 right? What does do that is building out safe
6 systems and safe infrastructure, right? And it's
7 been a refrain of Council Member Holden that oh, if
8 we just make the bike lanes wider, what are we going
9 to do when we get to the corner? There's lots of
10 infrastructure solutions to that as well. Intro 1138
11 which would add daylighting to intersections in New
12 York City is a great way to, you know, increase
13 visibility and it makes pedestrians, people riding
14 bikes and drives safer. But regulating this and
15 creating another pathway for policing New Yorkers of
16 color is not going to make the streets safer for
17 anyone. Thank you.

18
19 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: thank you.
20 Next we'll hear from Brian Holbrook followed by Carl
21 Wojciechowski.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

23 BRIAN HOLBROOK: Hello. Thank you for
24 the opportunity to testify. My name is Brian
25 Holbrook. I'm here to testify in opposition to Intro

1
2 606. I think the testimony of many others has gone
3 over why upgrading our traffic infrastructure,
4 creating more space for pedestrians and bikers
5 instead of cars is the most important thing that this
6 council can do to increase safety for everybody on
7 the roads, including pedestrians. And we've heard
8 several people say that cars, you know, follow the
9 law, they stop at red lights, they don't speed. I
10 think anybody who spends five minutes on the streets
11 of New York City knows that just is not true. Cars
12 with license plates with, you know, presumably
13 licensed drivers break the law all the time. So, the
14 idea that Intro 606 is somehow going to magically
15 stop all traffic violations, you know, assuming
16 perfect compliance is just a fantasy. I also want to
17 speak specifically to the problems of including class
18 one e-bikes, also known as pedal assist e-bikes, in
19 this legislation. These are bikes that are of the
20 same weight class regular bikes. They do not go
21 faster. They have governors in them that require them
22 to turn off the motor if they're going over 18 miles
23 an hour. So these are bikes that are not in any way
24 more dangerous to people, pedestrians in the city,
25 than regular bikes. I know that there are Council

1
2 Members including Council Member Holden,
3 unfortunately, who don't like bikes at all and prefer
4 to see a lot fewer of them on the streets of our
5 city, but for those Council Members who do want to
6 encourage biking, the idea of including class one e-
7 bikes in this like the one that I use to commute to
8 work every day as a public defender in this bill is a
9 terrible idea, and I hope the Council will reject the
10 bill entirely. Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

12 Carl Wojciechowski followed by Chris Roberti.

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

14 CARL WOJCIECHOWSKI: Hi, my name is Carl
15 Wojciechowski. I lived in northwest Bronx. I live
16 in Riverdale. My wife and I have two young
17 daughters. We don't own a car. We take transit. We
18 walk and we have two e-bikes. We also use e-bikes.
19 We do everything from buying groceries to visiting
20 friends, taking the kids to school, and without the
21 e-bikes-- you know, it's really hilly up here in
22 northwest Bronx. I don't think we'd be able to bike.
23 So e-bikes are really essential for us, and I oppose
24 Intro 606 because I don't see how this makes anybody
25 safer. As many other people have said, when I walk

1
2 my daughter to school in the morning, I'm not worried
3 about e-bikes. I'm not looking out for e-bikes. I'm
4 looking out for cars and trucks, because they are
5 constant. And they're fully licensed. The drivers
6 are supposed to be fully licensed, but they drive
7 recklessly all the time anyways, and there don't seem
8 to be any consequences for them. So, I don't think
9 this is a workable solution at all. We need holistic
10 engineered street design solutions and can't be
11 dependent on disparate and highly-selective law
12 enforcement. You know, I think Intro 606 is backwards
13 and wrong. It's a knee-jerk approach. It'll make
14 everyone less safe and does nothing to address the
15 many motorists who drive recklessly. 1131 seems like
16 the common sense rational approach to establishing
17 rules for micromobility devices and engineering our
18 streets and to make it safe for everybody whether
19 they're in a car, on bike, walking, whatever. So I
20 oppose Intro 606. Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
22 Chris Roberti followed by Chris Ryan.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

24 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Chris Roberti?
25

1
2 UNIDENTIFIED: Chris Roberti, you are
3 unmuted.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Chris, you may begin.

5 UNIDENTIFIED: We will go to the next
6 person. Chris Ryan?

7 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Chris Ryan is
8 next.

9 CHRIS RYAN: Hello. My name is Chris
10 Ryan. I'm a cyclist, a dad. I'm also a vehicle owner
11 and a commercial driver, so I'm empathize with all
12 positions being stated here. I'd say the basic
13 problem is-- we've heard all these horrific stories--
14 is that when the accidents occur, people don't stop,
15 whether it's delivery guys, professionals, young
16 privileged youth on Citi Bikes, they don't stop. If
17 we-- if they did, if they acted like responsible
18 people and had any accountability or morals or
19 conscience, we wouldn't all be here. So, we are here
20 because we need accountability. What works with cars
21 is license plates, and you can identify them and
22 track them down. This whole anonymity is just not
23 working. I do not want-- I would like to get an e-
24 bike someday. I do not want to have to go get a
25 license plate, but if need be, we all need to do our

1
2 part to just make sure that when the old lady is hit
3 and cracked and doesn't have the money that there's
4 someone that she can take to court or someone can
5 have some accountability, where the accident is
6 prevented, because they know accountability will
7 occur, so you don't act reckless. You don't act like
8 a crazy person out there. I have a commercial
9 driver's license. These guys riding the delivery
10 bikes, they're commercially working out there. They
11 need something they could lose. They need to have
12 numbers on their backs. They need to have the
13 license plates. They're just cheap labor. We don't
14 need everything delivered. This is another COVID
15 leftover like the restaurant sheds which we should
16 try to get rid of as much as possible. But that
17 said, we're going to have e-bikes and delivery in the
18 future, so we need to just use some common sense and
19 just get back to sanity. And these paid lobbyist keep
20 trying to turn this into cars and racism, and just
21 it's tired. Get over it. City Council, please do
22 not listen to these people. They're well-funded,
23 narcissist, fool, morons. Listen to your seniors,
24 you elders--

1
2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Thank
3 you. Your time's expired.

4 CHRIS RYAN: and voters. Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
6 Next we'll have Ellen Shale [sp?], followed by Ellen
7 Sandles.

8 ELLEN SHALE: I'm not doing it.

9 UNIDENTIFIED: Ellen, you're unmuted.

10 ELLEN SHALE: I sent in my testimony.
11 I'm not going to testify here, but thank you very
12 much for your time and I appreciate the effort that's
13 going into this. I really hope you pass Intro 606.
14 Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
16 Ellen Sandles followed by Emily Jacobi.

17 ELLEN SANDLES: Yes, hi. I'm Ellen
18 Sandles and I've lived in New York City since 1978.
19 We've already discussed the three-year-old girl who
20 was hit by the moped and the gentleman was not
21 identifiable so he walked off. If this story
22 happened more than five years ago, I probably would
23 have bene surprised, but as the quality of life in
24 our city has deteriorated with the increase of e-
25 vehicles, these vehicles with motors, these kinds of

1 stories are no longer surprising. What is surprising
2 is that the majority of New Yorkers who were against
3 the increase of these e-vehicles are having to fight
4 so hard to be heard by our elected representatives.
5 Hopefully, this hearing will make a difference and
6 things will change. I do want to repeat what the
7 gentleman, the last gentleman said about
8 Transportation Alternatives. It is a funded lobbying
9 group that does not represent the majority of New
10 Yorkers. I am not going to repeat all their talking
11 points. They have not made a good argument as to how
12 a street design is going to deal with this problem. I
13 also don't understand why people who use e-vehicles
14 who like them are against having a license. We have
15 plenty of people who have cars and they're licensed
16 and registered, so why shouldn't somebody with an e-
17 vehicle have a license and be registered. They could
18 still use it. So, I think those are just really red
19 herrings. Lastly, I am certainly for Intro 606,
20 Priscilla's Law. I think identifiable plates and
21 cameras can do the job rather than the NYPD. We
22 don't need more bike lanes or different bike lanes.
23 We just need common sense regulation of e-vehicles
24 and their riders. Thank you.
25

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

Next, we'll hear from Emily Jacobi followed by Jeanine Panchek Berry [sp?].

SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

EMILY JACOBI: hi, my name is Emily Jacobi. I am a Safe Streets Advocate and I am the current Manhattan organizer with Transportation Alternatives. We're not really the nefarious lobby group everyone has claimed us to be, and tonight I actually do not speak in my professional capacity. I speak as a New Yorkers and I speak as a Brooklyn resident, and I want us to speak out in strong opposition to Intro 606 for the following reasons. As a pedestrian, cyclist, and Citi Bike e-bike rider, I want to say that every injury big or small is a massive issue on our city streets. It does not matter how bad of an injury it is. It doesn't matter if it's a death or a cut on your face, it should not happen. So we need to look holistically at why our streets are like this, and this bill Intro 606 does not take up that cause. Wanting steadfast, swift issues fixed-- I understanding wanting change to happen quickly. I understand and agree with, but enforcement when we already see enforcement for

1
2 mopeds that isn't changing behavior and isn't
3 reincentivizing good behavior shows that e-bike
4 licensing similarly will not work. And I just want
5 to say that the conflation of an e-bike which can go
6 a little bit faster than a regular bike, which is a
7 useful tool for people with disabilities, is very,
8 very different than a hundreds of pound vehicles like
9 a moped. So, distinct-- being distinct about these
10 terms is extremely important. I want to state that in
11 terms of pedestrian safety tactics, we know that
12 tactics like daylighting, opening up the street to
13 redesign for visibility for all makes everyone feel
14 safer and move more safely on the street. But what
15 doesn't are app companies incentivizing quick
16 delivery times, forcing delivery drivers to get to
17 their next delivery as fast as humanly possible.
18 They are not incentivized to do this with the minds
19 and hearts and safety of our city in mind. They are
20 incentivized to do this because of an economic
21 incentive as was said earlier pretty cruelly about
22 them.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Thank you. Your
24 time's expired.

25 EMILY JACOBI: Thank you.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Next, Jeanine
3 Panchek Berry [sp?] followed by Jeffrey.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

5 JEANINE PANCHEK BERRY: Hi, I'm Jeanine
6 Panchek Berry and I support Intro 606, Priscilla's
7 Law and e-vehicle registration and licensing. I'm a
8 biker. I biked all over the city with Citi Bike and
9 with my pedal bike. In 2022 I was biking with my
10 pedal bike on the Riverside bike path when I was hit
11 by an upright e-scooters. The rider was going about
12 30 miles per hour downhill. My jaw broke and my
13 mouth wouldn't open. My nose broke. There was blood
14 everywhere. And then another e-biker came down the
15 same hill, also going about 30 miles per hour, and
16 yelled at me to get out of the way. The woman who
17 hit me fled after she realized she was at fault. I
18 had five titanium plates implanted into my head.
19 After the hospital, with my eye still in stitches, I
20 wanted to report the incident to the police because
21 the woman who hit me fled the scene of the accident.
22 I called two precincts, the 24th where I live and the
23 20th where the accident occurred. Both precincts
24 told me it was the sixth day after the accident so it
25 was too late to write a report. I told them I was in

1
2 the hospital, but it didn't matter. They also said
3 that I left the scene of the accident, too, but I
4 left by ambulance. I had double vision for four
5 months, and then I had to have surgery again in March
6 2023. I was out of work for over six months. One
7 titanium plate was screwed into the nerves of two of
8 my teeth. Every time I brushed my teeth or ate
9 crackers it hurts and reagravates the nerve. When I
10 hum to six-month-old baby my mouth hurts because the
11 plate vibrates. The nerves are forever damaged and I
12 couldn't fully feel this side of my face again. My
13 quality of life is also diminished because I'm afraid
14 to bike again. E-vehicles ride the wrong direction
15 down bike paths and run red lights, and when I walk,
16 e-vehicle also whiz past me on the sidewalk, run red
17 lights, or ride the wrong direction down the street.
18 I've almost been hit again several times. I also
19 watch out for cars, but we have no accountability for
20 e-bikes, in contrast to the many layers of laws we
21 have to protect pedestrians and bikers from cars. We
22 need accountability to end the chaos. E-vehicles are
23 heavy and go faster than the 25 mile per hour speed
24 limit for cars in the city. I own an upright e-

1
2 scooters and ride e-bikes. They go 30 miles per
3 hour. I support licensing--

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Thank
5 you. Your time's expired.

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
7 Next, we'll hear from Jeffrey followed by John Noble.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

9 UNIDENTIFIED: Jeffrey, you're unmuted.
10 Jeffrey? Guess we can go to the next person. John?

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

12 JOHN NOBLE: Okay. Hi, everyone. I'm
13 John Noble. I live in Manhattan. I choose to use an
14 e-bike in the city when I wish to commute a
15 significant distance or to get my destination quickly
16 and efficiently. I also prefer an e-bike for these
17 trips because I want to commute-- I want my commute
18 to be climate-friendly and I like being outdoors
19 riding a bike. As a bike rider or pedestrian in New
20 York City I am concerned about street safety and feel
21 that the best way to make streets safer is through
22 proper street design and implementation of safer
23 structure. Intro 1131 is the legislation that will
24 accomplish this. Through the study and
25 recommendations of street design it will make them

1 safe for usage of cars, micromobility devices, e-
2 bikes and pedestrians. Intro 606 will not accomplish
3 this. It creates an unnecessary burden on those
4 wishing to use an e-bike for commuting through its
5 registration and licensing requirements, and offers
6 nothing to make streets safer. Registration and
7 licensing is simply a tracking mechanism for those
8 that own and operate a vehicle. It does not address
9 the safe operation of a vehicles, nor does it create
10 a street design that is safe for all road users,
11 pedestrians and vehicles alike. It also creates a
12 costly bureaucracy within the DOT which should be
13 tasked with creating safer streets, not processing
14 registrations and dispensing licenses. I'm also very
15 concerned about climate change, and e-bikes are a way
16 to travel without contributing to this crisis. City
17 leaders should be encouraging greener modes of
18 transportation to combat climate change. Intro 606
19 with burdensome registration serves to discourage
20 this green alternative, while safer street design
21 serves to encourage it. I implore the City Council
22 to focus on a solution that concentrates efforts on
23 safer streets through design and to make it easier to
24 travel in the city in a greener way. Toward this
25

1
2 end, I ask that you oppose Intro 606 and support
3 Intro 1131. Thank you for giving me the opportunity
4 to speak on this issue and for your time in
5 considering my testimony.

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
7 Next is Ken Coughlin followed by Kenneth Lay.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

9 KEN COUGHLIN: right, thank you. Thanks
10 for hanging in there. My name is Ken Coughlin. I'm a
11 15-year member of Manhattan Community Board Seven,
12 although my views here are my own, not those of CB7.
13 I'm speaking in strong opposition to Intro 606.
14 Increasing safety on our streets is a complex issue
15 that is not susceptible to simplistic solutions like
16 this one. The bill supporters believe that licensing
17 will translate into accountability even though it
18 hasn't worked for drivers or in any city where bike
19 licensing has been tried. Requiring all e-bikes to
20 be licensed will simply mean there will be fewer e-
21 bikes. But perhaps the bill's most frightening
22 aspect is that it will roll out the red carpet for
23 Donald Trump's intended immigrant roundup. His ICE
24 agents would love to get their hands on a list of all
25 bike riders in New York City, most of whom are

1
2 immigrant workers. It's very easy to punch down and
3 blame delivery workers for a system that forces them
4 to break traffic laws just to eek [sic] out a living.
5 Instead, the Council could be punching up reining in
6 the app companies whose business model is to exploit
7 workers without regard to safety. So, in conclusion,
8 if you want to put the brakes on the shift to
9 alternative modes in our city, then you'll pass this
10 bill. If you want to increase police stops for all
11 cyclists, then you'll pass this bill. But if you
12 truly care about safety on our streets, then you will
13 reject this bill and pass Intro 1131. Thanks for
14 your time.

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
16 Next we'll hear from Kenneth Lay followed by Laura
17 Beth Sachs.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

19 KENNETH LAY: Hi, good evening. Thanks
20 for hanging in. Thanks for the opportunity to speak.
21 I'm Kenneth Lay. I'm a Brooklyn resident. I bike
22 nearly every day and it's transformed my ability to
23 move efficiently and sustainably through New York for
24 work and for leisure. It's greatly improved my
25 ability to get around especially in areas with less

1 bus public transit. It's also better for my health.
2 It's better for the environment, and it's way faster
3 than driving. I know everybody has recognized
4 throughout the day that we have a problem, and I
5 think people getting hit by e-bikes is a huge
6 concern. But and currently the status quo is not
7 safe. So I think we should be trying to maximize
8 safety as much as quickly as possible, and I think
9 it's very clear that re-designing road for safety for
10 all users is the best way to do this. I know the
11 council recognized this five years ago and passed the
12 Streets Plan and that other cities have taken that
13 approach. Street safety is hugely improved for
14 everyone, much more so than trying other measures
15 like the licensing. I think we can increase education
16 for bike riders. I think an increase in fair
17 enforcement by the NYPD would be good. I do see cops
18 ignoring reckless behavior all the time by bikers and
19 also by drivers. I don't really understand why we
20 would license. They already have the ability to
21 enforce without a license, and I'd also actually be
22 interested in seeing NYPD officers on bikes. I don't
23 see how an officer sitting in an SUV is going to be
24 able to enforce someone on an e-bike. But in any
25

1
2 event, it sounds like this approach would be very
3 expensive to set up and manage. We don't need to
4 spend any more public money on approaches that others
5 have tried and sounds like didn't work out and didn't
6 really improve safety. and so I think that-- I think
7 we should focus more on accommodating these modes of
8 transportation like biking, e-biking that are cleaner
9 and that with proven measures that have improve
10 safety rather than approaches that are expensive and
11 only minimally effective for safety. And finally, I
12 think Mayor Adams need to stop violating the
13 [inaudible] Streets Plan and get those streets
14 [inaudible] implemented now instead of this. Thank
15 you.

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Laura Beth
17 Sachs followed by Laurie Kalinowski.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

19 UNIDENTIFIED: Laura Beth Sachs is not
20 on. Laurie Kalinowski [inaudible]

21 ELAINE KARAS: Hi, my name is Elaine
22 Karas. I'm speaking on behalf of Purple Circle Early
23 Childhood Program that's located on the Upper West
24 Side on 103rd Street and Broadway. I'm speaking on
25 behalf of children, families and teachers. It has

1
2 become a serious public issue. I support 606, but
3 even more than that whether it's putting police
4 officers on motorcycles-- it's getting impossible to
5 take infants out, to take children out. We--
6 children need to be outdoors. They need to use the
7 parks. We're terrified. We're constantly trying to
8 navigate our way around all of these bikers, and it's
9 not only e-bikes. It's bicycles that go really fast,
10 and they don't know how to stop. We-- one of our
11 strollers got hit. Thank goodness the babies didn't
12 get hit, but it's a real serious matter here, and we
13 need to pass 606 and more than that, and we need to
14 hold these app companies accountable for doing what
15 they do to these bikers. One of our teachers got hit
16 by a bicycle, not an e-bike, a regular bicycle and
17 fractured her mandible. So, this is a serious issue
18 all around, e-bikes, all kinds of bikes. I'm for
19 biking, but they have to follow the rules. We had
20 people here from Denmark looking at our school and
21 they said how terrifying it was coming out of the
22 subway coming to the school because of bikers.

23 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Can you for
24 the record restate your name please?

25 ELAINE KARAS: Elaine Karas.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And your name
3 was Laurie Kalinowski at first on there?

4 ELAINE KARAS: Laurie is the Assistant
5 Director. I'm using her computer because of--

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
7 Oh, okay. Thank you. Okay. Thank you for that
8 clarity. Linda Rose is next, followed by Lucy Koteen.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

10 UNIDENTIFIED: Linda Rose, I've unmuted
11 you.

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Is she on
13 there, Kevin?

14 UNIDENTIFIED: She's not responding to my
15 unmute request.

16 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay, we're
17 going to move on. Mai Schotz.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

19 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Wait, wait,
20 wait. Sorry. Lucy Koteen [sp?] and then that is
21 followed by Mai Schotz.

22 UNIDENTIFIED: Lucky Koteen is not
23 [inaudible].

24 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay, so Mai
25 Schotz followed by Matt Moore.

1
2 UNIDENTIFIED: You've been unmuted Mai.

3 MAI SCHOTZ: Oh, sorry. Can I go? Okay.

4 Everyone here is in agreement that our streets are
5 not safe enough, but I vehemently disagree that Intro
6 606 is the solution. I use City e-bikes to get to
7 and from work which cuts my commute in half. The
8 problem here is the general landscape of our car-
9 centric transportation system as others have said,
10 and our reliance on police to curb dangerous behavior
11 through fines and other punishment, especially when
12 police have shown no interest in making our streets
13 safer and are often the ones most aggressively
14 flouting [sic] traffic laws. Many of the most
15 dangerous behaviors mentioned in these testimonials
16 like e-bikers running red lights, and biking on the
17 sidewalk or against one-way traffic are specifically
18 incentivized for riders at the cost of riders and
19 pedestrian safety. As for Citi Bike riders, the high
20 cost of the service incentivizes riders to run red
21 lights and bike on the sidewalk and on one-way
22 streets the wrong way in order to dock their bikes
23 more quickly especially when those docks are on the
24 sidewalk rather than in the street adjacent to a
25 proper bike lane. Plus, many Citi Bike riders are

1 not regular bikers and they get no help from our car-
2 centric city in learning how to bike legally and
3 safely. The \$19 million that Intro 606 would cost
4 would be much, much better spent fixing these
5 problems. As the Chair pointed out, Intro 606 is
6 squarely focused on identification but does nothing
7 to change the enforcement [inaudible] accountability
8 be it the red light camera system or the NYPD
9 understanding of and willingness to enforce street
10 safety laws which would continue even with licenses.
11 Not to mention that it does nothing to prevent the
12 crashes in the first place. There's widespread abuse
13 of the registration system for cars already with many
14 cars using ghost plates and obscure license plates.
15 Not to mention that license plates do not prevent
16 hit-and-runs from cars and that even car drivers who
17 remain at the scene are let go without recourse. If
18 Intro 606 passes and an unlicensed biker gets into an
19 accident, they're even more likely to flee the scene
20 if they're also facing licensing charges. We need to
21 cut speed for all vehicles on our streets and
22 sidewalks. We need to hold delivery apps accountable
23 for incentivizing unsafe biking. We need our
24 neighbors to feel safe walking the streets of our
25

1
2 city, but this costly [inaudible] is not the
3 solution. I encourage you to reject Intro 606 and to
4 pass Intro 1131--

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Thank
6 you. Time's expired.

7 MAI SCHOTZ: [inaudible] solution. Thank
8 you.

9 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
10 Next we will hear from Matt Moore followed by Matthew
11 Dennis.

12 MATT MOORE: Good evening, Chair Brooks-
13 Powers and Council Members who may still be in
14 attendance. My name is Matt Moore. I'm Policy
15 Counsel for People for Bikes, a national advocacy
16 group for cyclist and a trade association for the US
17 bicycle industry. Our mission is to make the U.S.
18 the best place to ride a bike. We do that by
19 advocating for safe infrastructure, modern safety
20 standards for our products, and reasonable laws
21 regarding their operation on public roads. People
22 for Bikes work with the Council on Local Law 39 and
23 also educated manufacturers on its requirements. We
24 supported the recent bill package that created
25 statewide safety standards for e-bikes and batteries

1
2 and additional manufacture requirements to provide
3 consumers with safety information on battery
4 operation. Safety is also a personal issue for me as
5 I am a lucky cyclist survivor of traffic violence
6 from a careless SUV driver. You should never minimize
7 the experiences of other victims of crashes who we
8 heard from today. The policies that result from
9 today's hearing must however be based upon facts,
10 data, and careful analysis, not upon fear, popular
11 opinion or so-called common sense. People for Bike
12 therefore supports Introduction 1131 which would
13 result in thorough consideration of these issues and
14 sound recommendations for action and we would be
15 happy to support the work of such a taskforce.

16 People for Bikes opposes registration and licensing
17 of e-bikes as currently required by Introduction 606
18 because there's no evidence that will improve safety,
19 and ample evidence that will have negative impacts
20 and excessive costs and reduce cycling participation.
21 I'd like to clarify a few other points that have been
22 raised here today. Registration schemes for e-bikes
23 have consistently failed elsewhere, including in New
24 Jersey. No country in Europe requires registration

1
2 or licensing of low-speed electric bicycle which they
3 call pedal-x and treat like regular bicycles. The--

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Thank
5 you. Your time is expired.

6 MATT MOORE: Thank you so much for your
7 time.

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: thank you.
9 We'll hear from Matthew Dennis next and following
10 Matthew will be McLean Cozine.

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

12 MATTHEW DENNIS: Hi, I'm Matt Dennis, and
13 I live in Flatbush. I'm strongly opposed to Intro 606
14 because it fails to make anyone safer and it creates
15 new problems. As others have mentioned, one of those
16 problems is the way it would be enforced. We've seen
17 that 77 percent of jaywalking tickets went to Black
18 and Hispanic people just looking at the first half of
19 this year, which is why the Council recently repeated
20 the jaywalking law in New York City. That was a great
21 decision. I think it's clear that intro 606 would be
22 selectively enforced in a very similar way, and that
23 alone is enough reason for the Council to reject this
24 bill. I am very glad to see the Council trying to
25 make our streets safer. There are many ways that you

1
2 could actually make a difference here, and not just
3 [inaudible] there are e-bike specific things
4 discussed today which are important to be made
5 better, but also for fixing the problem where
6 hundreds of New Yorkers are dying every year in
7 preventable car crashes, and it turns out that a lot
8 of the solutions would make both of these things
9 better. So, first I strongly urge the Council to
10 pass Intro 1138 which would require daylighting at
11 all intersections in the city which is how it already
12 is in the rest of the state. And when it easier for
13 drivers and bicyclist and pedestrians to see each
14 other at intersections it feels safer, and more
15 importantly, it's proven to save lives. Another
16 proven life-saving measure is to add more protected
17 bike lanes, because when bike riders have a safe
18 dedicated place to be, it doesn't just keep them off
19 of sidewalks, but it's been shown to reduce death and
20 serious injuries from pedestrians and drivers as
21 well. A few years ago, the Council passed the Streets
22 Plan which requires new protected bike lanes, but
23 this hasn't happened, because the Mayor thinks he's
24 above the law. So the Council should exercise its
25 oversight powers to fix this. One more thing the

1
2 Council could do is you could take action to provide
3 better protections for delivery bikers, so they can
4 choose safe routes to travel at reasonable speeds
5 without risking earning less or even losing their
6 jobs. In conclusion, I strongly urge you to reject
7 Intro 606 and instead take any of these actions--

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Thank
9 you. Your time has expired.

10 MATTHEW DENNIS: [inaudible] Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Next we'll
12 hear from McLean Cozine followed by Michael Rokum
13 [sp?].

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

15 MCLEAN COZINE: Hi, my name's McLean
16 Cozine. Thank you for sticking with us this far into
17 the evening. There have been many legitimate concerns
18 and heart-breaking stories in today's meeting and
19 testimony, but unfortunately Intro 606 will not
20 address them. It will not actually make our streets
21 safer. What it will do is introduce an enormous
22 bureaucratic hurdle for a huge number of people who
23 just want to ride a bike and a needless expense for
24 the City in trying to enforce a misguided scheme. As
25 many on here have said, the most dangerous behavior

1 that this bill purports to address, running red
2 lights, going the wrong way, riding on the sidewalk,
3 is already illegal and can be enforced without
4 licensing should NYPD actually choose to do so. The
5 most dangerous small vehicles, mopeds, already
6 require a license to operate, though they are
7 frequently operated without one. The fact that these
8 existing laws are not being enforced shows how
9 ineffective licensing will be at improving safety
10 since it will rely upon the same NYPD enforcement
11 that is not present now. Many people who have
12 testified today have said that even when they've gone
13 to the police, even suspects have been apprehended,
14 nothing has been done. Sadly, Intro 606 will not
15 change this. If the goal is to actually improve the
16 safety of our streets and bring order to them, we
17 need to prioritize infrastructure. When bike lanes go
18 in, you see a dramatic reduction in bikes on
19 sidewalks, and you see crashes come down. There have
20 been questions about what to do at corners.
21 Daylighting. When pedestrians are given more space
22 at corners, e-bikes, and even more importantly cars,
23 strike fewer people. This is why I do support Intro
24 1131. By redesigning our streets for safety, we make
25

1
2 them better for everyone. This is an effective use of
3 our money and time and a solution that actually
4 works. Please use our time and resources wisely. I
5 desperately want safer streets which is why I want
6 solutions that work. Intro 606 is an ineffective use
7 of taxpayer money and should be opposed. Intro 1131--

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Thank
9 you. Your time's expired.

10 MCLEAN COZINE: thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

12 Michael Brokum [sp?] followed by Michelle B.

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

14 UNIDENTIFIED: Michael is not on.

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Michelle B
16 followed by Miriam Fisher.

17 UNIDENTIFIED: Michelle B you are
18 unmuted. Michelle B?

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

20 UNIDENTIFIED: She's not responding.

21 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Alright, we're
22 moving on to Miriam Fisher followed by Nathaniel
23 Bachelis.

24 UNIDENTIFIED: Miriam, you are unmuted.

25 MIRIAM FISHER: Okay, can you hear me?

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Yes, we can.
3 HI.

4 MIRIAM FISHER: Okay. I thank Council
5 Member Brooks-Powers for her patience and her
6 empathy. I'm supporting 606. I'm a transportation
7 activist, a disability rights activist, especially
8 for accessibility on the subway with elevators. I was
9 hit by a yellow cab in 1984, in a coma for nine days,
10 changed my life. Multiple back surgeries, hearing
11 loss, permanent outcomes. So I applaud alternatives
12 to cars. I applaud bikes as an alternative, more and
13 better bikes lanes. But talking about safety and not
14 repeating many of the things today, most hits by
15 bikes to pedestrians are hit and run. Licensing is
16 the first step towards accountability. I reject
17 examples of unsuccessful licensing from other cities
18 which do not have New York City's 200 million trips
19 per day according to Commissioner Rodriguez earlier
20 today. Yes, there will be less bikes with licensing,
21 but millions of riders still left to maintain safety
22 for-- safety in numbers as Transportation
23 Alternatives advocates. Statistics for accidents
24 don't request real numbers. We heard that over and
25 over today with horrible, heart-breaking stories of

1
2 people who were injured. They couldn't report it
3 because they left the scene of the accident in an
4 ambulance, went to the hospital, had plates in their
5 bodies-- terrible stories. How can we make more
6 accountability and statistics that represent what
7 really happens? I have seen-- have stood on the
8 street with local police watching bikes going through
9 red lights, no action, because--

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Thank
11 you. Your time has expired.

12 MIRIAM FISHER: [inaudible].

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
14 Next we'll hear from Nathaniel Bachelis followed by
15 Nora McCauley.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

17 NATHANIEL BACHELIS: thank you to the
18 Chair and the Council. My name is Nathaniel Bachelis
19 and I'm testifying today against Intro 606 because
20 I'm appalled and frankly scared of what the Council
21 is contemplating today. My wife and I reside in
22 Greenwood Sunset Park neighborhood of Brooklyn with
23 our two kids age six to eight. We use cargo e-bikes
24 as our primary form of transportation aside from
25 subway. They're such amazing devices and I think

1
2 everyone who can should try to use them, especially
3 busy working parents like us. And in fact, the e
4 part is what allows more people to use them. It's the
5 opposite of ablest. We're able to live car-free with
6 mobility promised by car commercials but realizing
7 fact. But instead of us talking about [inaudible]
8 for e-bikes [inaudible] more e-bike and cargo e-bike
9 usage, this wastes time debunking smears that we're
10 inherently dangerous. And you hear it constantly
11 today. Well, I don't believe the data, or the DOT
12 data is wrong. We aren't inherently dangerous.
13 We're inherently vulnerable, and we're held
14 accountable by the virtue of the fact that we're
15 exposed. We're not encased in steel. I believe Bob
16 Holden called e-bikes devil devices which is
17 interesting, because I didn't know you could defeat
18 the devil with a deep pothole, a piece of metal in
19 the gutter or hitting a bumper at three miles per
20 hour, all things that could put me in the hospital.
21 There's your accountability. Just three weeks ago my
22 wife and others were struck while riding her e-bike.
23 The bike is still in need of repair. Her [inaudible]
24 was in a sling for a week. My wife had a suspected
25 concussion, and this bill does nothing for our

1
2 safety. How the heck would her having a plate have
3 helped her? [inaudible] they were struck by a plated
4 moped rider. The plate did not convey special safe
5 riding powers or ability to the rider who struck us.
6 We're just grateful that it wasn't a car, like the
7 car that killed my grandparents, or the car that
8 struck two of my kids' classmate's parents last
9 month. So it's one kid's-- our kids' classmate's
10 parents were both struck by a car last month, one of
11 whom is still hospitalized. We're just people
12 adapting to our [inaudible] streets who don't have
13 the free time to sit in traffic or search for
14 parking. We're not the other. We're your neighbors.
15 Please reject this anti-safe street bill whose goal
16 is to reduce e-bike usage altogether, when we should
17 be aggressively encouraging instead, especially with
18 congestion pricing. These just aren't for delivery
19 guys. They're for all of us. They're for parents
20 and for the elderly. I don't want my elderly mother
21 driving a SUV. I want her on a pedal-assist bicycle.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Thank you. Your time's
23 expired.

24

25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Next, we'll
3 hear from Nora McCauley followed by Nabil Ahmed Katar
4 [sp?]- Katri [sp?], excuse me.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

6 UNIDENTIFIED: There are two Nora
7 McCauley. Could you please state your name? Want to
8 unmute the other Nora. You're unmuted, Nora.

9 NORA MCCAULEY: Can you hear me?

10 UNIDENTIFIED: Yes, could you please
11 state your name just because there's two of you.

12 NORA MCCAULEY: Yes. I'm Nora McCauley.
13 Sorry, I had to leave my laptop to go do an errand in
14 the rain, so I also don't really have my notes handy,
15 but I'll just be quick. I live in Brooklyn, downtown
16 Brooklyn on a block that is a microcosm on both the
17 sidewalk and the street of every safety issue you can
18 possibly imagine. And my heart goes out to all the
19 people that we heard from today who have been
20 injured. I also work at an electric bike store. We
21 sell class one pedal-assist bikes for the most part,
22 and we are definitely very, very safety concerned.
23 The last time I testified for the City Council was in
24 support of what became Local Law 39 in terms of
25 battery safety, supporting the FDNY. So, we are

1
2 very, very concerned with safety. Most of our
3 customers are families who ride their kids to school,
4 go grocery shopping, go to the park and so on. We
5 also have a number of customers with challenging
6 commutes, say from Forest Hills, Queens to Chelsea or
7 from Portly [sic], New Jersey to midtown Manhattan,
8 and a third category which I want to mention tonight
9 in particular, is that we sell a good number of
10 electric assist bikes to seniors who like to remain
11 mobile and active and exploring their city. We have
12 seniors in every borough who spend a significant
13 portion of their time, actually, riding around,
14 staying engaged. Whether it's basketball or bird
15 watching-- and by the way, bird watching spots on the
16 edge of every borough are best reached by electric
17 bike, especially getting home again. It's all
18 uphill. So, the main point I'm making is that all of
19 our customers are law-abiding riders of e-bikes.
20 They will all go ahead and get licensed and get
21 registration and follow the law as they already do,
22 but I don't think it will make any difference to the
23 issues that people are concerned about, that we're
24 all concerned about which is safety, especially for
25 pedestrians and cyclists and children and seniors.

1
2 Anyway, a lot of behaviors that we keep hearing about
3 are already illegal as people have said. Mopeds are
4 required to be licensed at the state level. Many of
5 them are not and that's already illegal. You're not
6 allowed to ride the wrong way on a street or in a
7 bike lane. That's illegal, and the police are--

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Thank
9 you. Your time's expired.

10 NORA MCCAULEY: to support-- okay, thank
11 you.

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
13 Next we'll hear from Nabil Ahmed Katri [sp?] followed
14 by Oliver Bruckauf.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

16 NABIL KATRI: Okay. Hi, my name is Nabil
17 Katri [sp?]. You go the name right. Not too bad.
18 Thank you for staying so late. I'm also a small
19 business owner and we rent out family bikes and cargo
20 bikes, so we're very familiar with e-bikes. All the
21 bikes that we have, a majority of them are class one
22 and class two e-bikes. I think there's been a
23 conflation of e-bikes and mopeds which are very
24 different. Mopeds are heavier, they go much faster,
25 and they already have licensing requirements that as

1 previous people have said, NYPD does not enforce.
2
3 The reality is that the biggest threat to our streets
4 are cars. Just last week, three pedestrians were
5 killed over the weekend, and cars require extensive
6 training, licensing. We have apparatuses in place to
7 hold cars accountable, yet they still keep killing
8 New Yorkers. I'm not against licensing inherently,
9 but only if we have zero car deaths and zero car
10 injuries, and then bikes are the only thing left that
11 are causing injuries. Then I would advocate for
12 something like this, but the reality is that we have
13 limited resources and limited time to deal with
14 issues. We should prioritize the issues that are
15 actually killing a lot of New Yorkers and injuring
16 and maiming New Yorkers, not just pedestrians but
17 other motorists. You can ban bikes tomorrow, which I
18 know Bob Holden and people like Vickie Paladino are
19 in favor of, but that wouldn't cause the overwhelming
20 harm that cars cause in the streets. So, for this
21 reason, I urge all the Council Members to oppose this
22 bill and come up with actual common sense solutions.
23 Bob Holden, Vickie Paladino do not have a trademark
24 to the term common sense. Putting license on e-bikes
25 is not common sense. Thank you.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you,
3 Nabil, for that. We're going to hear next from
4 Oliver Bruckauf followed by Patrick DiRoma.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

6 UNIDENTIFIED: Oliver's not on.

7 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Which one is
8 not on, Kevin?

9 UNIDENTIFIED: Oliver.

10 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay, Patrick
11 DiRoma followed by Richard Robbins.

12 UNIDENTIFIED: Patrick, I just unmuted
13 you.

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay--

15 PATRICK DIROMA: [interposing] Hello?

16 UNIDENTIFIED: Yes, we can hear you.

17 PATRICK DIROMA: Okay. So, I wanted to
18 say that I oppose Intro 606 and support 1131. I just
19 wanted to note some of the hypocrisy that I heard
20 during this hearing. There are people that this
21 would not bring back stop and frisk, but also were
22 seemingly cheering on the idea of bringing back stop
23 and frisk. They were people who claimed to be anti--
24 that they were not anti-bike, but then went on to
25 call bike lanes ugly and claiming that they're always

1 empty or that cyclists are sneering at them which
2 just kind of gives the game away. I heard somebody
3 claim that e-bikes and cars do the same amount of
4 damage when crashing into a pedestrian, which is
5 psychotic. I also heard various supporters including
6 various councilmen claiming that there are no
7 solutions being provided to those who are in
8 opposition to 606 while ignoring everybody who is
9 saying that protected bike lanes will reduce e-bikes,
10 e-bike riders being on sidewalks which is true, and
11 also ignoring the solution of daylighting is what you
12 actually can use to solve issues at the corner as was
13 noted. I also noted that everybody-- that a lot of
14 people in opposition-- that were supporting 606 were
15 claiming that people in opposition to it are calling
16 them racist, which is simply not true. They're
17 claiming that the bill would enable racist
18 enforcement. That is not calling any supporter of
19 606 racist, but if you interpret it that way, that
20 sounds like you're telling on yourself. If you want
21 to register anything, I would probably start with
22 that woman who was threatening to hit people with her
23 cane. Thank you.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Richard
3 Robbins followed by Robin Ostrow.

4 RICHARD ROBBINS: Thank you so much,
5 Council Member Powers. This is a very serious
6 problem, but Intro 606 is not a real solution. While
7 license plates sound simple and logical, they aren't.
8 This is a bill that's voting to do something, even
9 when it's obvious that it won't work. Here's some
10 basic flaws. Number one, it is a logical fallacy.
11 We're saying that police can't catch e-bikes. They
12 need license plates, but how are they going to catch
13 e-bikes without license plates to ticket them if they
14 don't have plates? Number two, we already have many
15 laws, as many people have said, prohibiting riding on
16 the sidewalk, riding the wrong way, and requiring
17 commercial cyclist to have an ID number on their
18 clothes and bikes, but none of these laws are
19 enforced. This-- are the police going to stop e-
20 bikes because they don't have license plates,
21 especially when they're hard to catch. Are the
22 police can do high-speed chases to catch e-bikes
23 without plates? Number three, license plates would
24 require a creation of a database that includes
25 rider's names and home addresses. Do we really want

1
2 to create a database of deliveristas in the current
3 political environment? Would any undocumented people
4 get a license plate if it involves giving their home
5 address? Four, are we going to mail out tickets to
6 e-bike owners who run red lights? What happens if
7 they don't pay? We currently have a similar system
8 that doesn't work for cars. There are thousands of
9 cars with a long list of violations and thousands of
10 dollars in unpaid fines still driving on our streets.
11 How will the police catch e-bikes when they can't
12 even catch cars? Five, many drivers obscure their
13 plates. They can't be read or they use fake plates.
14 Why would the police be more successful at policing
15 e-bikes than they are for cars? Six, this will cost
16 \$20 million. There are 50,000 people who get
17 licenses. It would cost \$400 per person. No one's
18 going to pay that much, which means taxpayers are
19 going to get stuck paying for this. Seven, clearly
20 Priscilla's Loke's death is a tragedy. E Citi Bikes
21 are an incredible hazard. I found public reports of
22 at least eight other fatalities in the past two years
23 from people riding Citi Bike e-bikes. If the Council
24 wants to protect New Yorkers from e-bikes and honor
25 Priscilla's Loke's memory, it should address the

1 dangers of the Citi Bikes which is clearly requiring-
2 - requiring clear visible IDs on E Citi Bikes,
3 requiring a way to report E Citi Bike riders as there
4 had been with Revel [sic] and speed regulating them.
5 18 miles an hour is way--

6
7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Your time
8 is expired.

9 RICHARD ROBBINS: We also have to go after
10 the delivery companies like Door Dash and Uber--

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
12 Thank you. Thank you.

13 RICHARD ROBBINS: Thank you very much.

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Robin Ostrow
15 followed by Ryan Barthel [sp?]. Kevin, are they
16 there?

17 UNIDENTIFIED: Robin is not. Robert
18 Price is next.

19 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I'm sorry, can
20 you repeat that?

21 UNIDENTIFIED: Robert Price is next.

22 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I don't have
23 Robert Price on here.

24 UNIDENTIFIED: It's Robert Price--
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
3 Do you have Ryan Barthel?

4 UNIDENTIFIED: Yes, Ryan Barthel as
5 well.

6 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay, go to
7 Ryan Barthel and then we can go to Robert Price.

8 RYAN BARTHEL: good evening and thank you
9 for your time. This is Ryan Barthel. Contrary to
10 some members' assertions, pedal assist e-bikes and e-
11 scooters in Denmark are not require to be registered.
12 Mopeds already are in New York State. This bill will
13 add unnecessary costs and bureaucracy. NYPD is not
14 prepared to equitably enforce the new regulations and
15 it will lead to parks and greenways that are less
16 safe. This amendment adds complexity and difficulty
17 to many vulnerable New Yorkers. As worded, it
18 applies to electric wheelchairs which is clearly
19 problematic. Many of those using e-bikes and
20 scooters are doing so because it is their only
21 affordable option in our many transit deserts and
22 this adds another cost and hurdle to our already
23 marginalized communities. And of course, the fiscal
24 cost to the City of setting up, running and enforcing
25 this bureaucracy will be huge and take away from

1
2 other important projects. NYPD has a history of
3 misunderstanding laws for non-car vehicles. They've
4 been sued to protest the many tickets issued to
5 cyclists legally crossing an intersection with a
6 leading pedestrian indicator, and officers are known
7 to tell cyclists that they're not legally allowed to
8 ride on a greenway where [inaudible] with a sidewalk.
9 This bill will embolden them to stop and question any
10 cyclist to determine if their bike requires
11 registration and if the cyclist does not immediately
12 recognize their being asked to pull over, the
13 officers may give chase. Crashes as a result of NYPD
14 chases already account for an average of 10 deaths
15 per year. This takes those chases off the streets
16 and into our parks and greenways, endangering those
17 we're trying to protect. Street safety is paramount.
18 My family does not own a car, and when I'm riding
19 alone or with my family I'm keenly aware of the
20 dangers present all around us. It's already illegal
21 to hit someone with a micromobility device and leave
22 the scene, just as it's already illegal to hit a
23 cyclist or pedestrian with a car or to double-park
24 it, park it on sidewalks and bus lanes or in bike
25 lanes, which are the activities that push cyclists to

1 do some of the illegal activities that are mentioned.
2 We should focus on ensuring that everyone follows the
3 laws that already exist rather than creating new ones
4 to make life more challenging for already--

5
6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Thank
7 you. Your time's expired.

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
9 Next we'll have Robert Price followed by Samir
10 Lavingia.

11 ROBERT PRICE: Hello, thank you. My
12 name's Robert Price and I am opposed to Intro 606.
13 I'm a parent and I have an e-bike. I bike my kids
14 around New York City in the e-bike, and it is an
15 incredible way to get around the city and it is a
16 very difficult way to get around the city because of
17 cars, because of double parking, because of the chaos
18 that cars create. It is very hard to e-bike. E-
19 biking creates a better environment. E-biking
20 creates a safer way to get around for your kids, and
21 e-biking is just an incredible way to navigate this
22 city. I think Intro 606 is a waste of money, a waste
23 of time, and a waste of everyone's resources.
24 There's already many issues with traffic violence in
25 our city that needs to be reinforced and addressed by

1
2 police, and license plates and whatever this is
3 proposing doesn't really address the major issues of
4 safety that are an issue. Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

6 Next, Samir Lavingia followed by unidentified Zoom
7 panelist number one.

8 SAMIR LAVINGIA: Hello, thank you so much
9 for having us speak. My name's Samir Lavingia. I
10 live in Midtown Manhattan. I wanted to say thank you
11 for having us here. And I don't know if Council
12 Member Brewer is still there, but thank you for not
13 co-sponsoring this bill. She's my Council Member.
14 I'm opposed to Intro 606. I've been volunteering for
15 Safe Streets advocacy work for years. I want to start
16 off by saying that I'm against mopeds, super
17 scooters, and the one-wheeled unicycles where people
18 are wearing motorcycle helmets, but those are already
19 illegal, and I have seen those acting the most
20 recklessly, and we need to find a way to get some
21 more accountability for those. However, if we require
22 licenses for all e-bikes, it will simply be used by
23 the NYPD to pull out e-bikes and all bike users
24 whenever they want. With newer e-bikes you can't
25 really tell until you get really close up if it's an

1
2 e-bike or not. So the truth is that the NYPD will
3 have full discretion to pull anyone over, because any
4 bike could be an e-bike. Recently, my friend was
5 debating getting a Vespa or an e-bike, and ended up
6 picking an e-bike because it was easier, but if he
7 had to get a license, he probably would have gotten
8 the Vespa. We need to make it easier for people to
9 get on bikes, not mopeds. I want the streets to be
10 safe for me and my family to get around. My parents
11 are seniors and my dad just had surgery and is a
12 little slower than usual. His reaction time is
13 slower and I want him to be safe, but this bill will
14 not make him or anyone else safer. This bill is
15 simply reactionary and retributionary [sic]. It
16 would allow me to get revenge if someone hits him,
17 but that's not what I want. I want him to not get hi,
18 and I want us all to be safe. To do that, we need
19 better infrastructure. We need to build better
20 infrastructure so people ride where they should be.
21 My friends who ride on the sidewalk do so because
22 they don't feel safe on the street, so let's add a
23 bike lane. I see Citi Bikes ride on the sidewalk and
24 get on the docks because the docks are on the
25 sidewalk. Let's move those onto the street. Bikes

1
2 and Citi Bike-- bikes in Central Park go too fast,
3 and they're redoing the drives to make it safer for
4 everyone, and that's what we need everywhere in New
5 York. We need to make biking the best option for
6 people to go where they need to go on a bike, or an
7 e-bike instead of a gas scooter or a car. There are
8 solutions to--

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Thank
10 you. Your time is expired.

11 ROBERT PRICE: [inaudible] but this bill
12 is not it. Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
14 Unidentified Zoom panelist number one, can you please
15 state your name for the record as you're going into
16 your testimony? This testimony will be followed by
17 Ulrika Anderson. Kevin, do you see--

18 UNIDENTIFIED: [interposing] You are
19 unmuted, unidentified Zoom participant. Doesn't look
20 like they're responding.

21 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay, Ulrika
22 Anderson followed by Valerie Mason [sp?].

23 ULRIKA ANDERSON: Thank you Chair.
24 Thanks for letting me speak. I'm here to oppose Intro
25 606 and support of Intro 1131. I live on the Upper

1 West Side near the Seventh [sic] Street Train
2 Station. My partner and I get around by transit and
3 bikes. We sometimes convert our bikes into e-bikes
4 by battery kits. Since we use battery kits you can't
5 actually see from the outside if our bikes are e-
6 bikes or not. Intro 606 could allow police to stop
7 us and inspect our bikes for batteries. Regardless
8 of the nature of my bike, regardless of how I was
9 riding, it would be penalizing me for getting around
10 in a sustainable way instead of addressing real
11 safety or space issues. Intro 606 turns neighbors
12 like me into suspects. Some here seem to think that
13 we already offered options for riders. The one-way
14 street I live on has free parking on both sides, but
15 no bike lanes. Because of this when I exit my
16 building, I'm pushed into the intersection of 72nd
17 Street station known as the bowtie of death. To go
18 south legally, I have to detour two blocks over to
19 West 72nd Street. The street also has two lanes of
20 parking with no bike lanes. Across New York City
21 just three percent of streets have protected bike
22 lanes and only 25 percent have any bikes lanes at
23 all. Intro 606 is a distraction. It's not really
24 about bikes. It's about cars and about the excessive
25

1
2 amount of space devoted to them at the expense of
3 safe options for everyone else. 260 New Yorkers were
4 killed by cars last year. To distract from this,
5 Intro 606 pits cyclists and pedestrians against one
6 another. Let's address the real issue, us fighting
7 over scraps after our city was handed over to cars.
8 Reject Intro 606. The real goal of this bill is to
9 keep cars as the only form of personal transportation
10 in New York City. Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

12 Next we'll hear from Valerie Mason followed by Vishnu
13 Reddy.

14 UNIDENTIFIED: Cool, I'm done. Sure.

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Is that
16 Valerie?

17 VALERIE MASON: Hi, thank you very much.

18 Hi. Thank you very much. I'm Valerie Mason and I'm
19 the Chair of Manhattan Community Board Eight. Just
20 for geographic purposes, we are the community board
21 that borders Community Board Six, and we did pass a
22 resolution asking for the hearing of 606 and we are
23 happy that this bill has finally seen the light of
24 day. I don't want to get into the particulars of this
25 bill, but I do want to say that our Community Board

1 supported the passage of New York State Assembly bill
2 A-9092 which requires bicycles with electric assist
3 and electric scooters be registered with the DMV and
4 a license plate affixed. I have to tell you that
5 almost every Community Board meeting we have the
6 issue is e-bikes, e-bikes, e-bikes. I attended a
7 public forum when Keechan Sule [sp?] was the
8 Commissioner of the NYPD. The first seven questions
9 were about e-bikes. I take issues with the DOT's
10 Commissioner's report on bicycle accidents. In 2023,
11 Alex Borris did a report that showed e-bikes caused
12 19 times more deaths per vehicles than regular bikes,
13 and it wasn't until 2024 that a bill was passed in
14 the State Legislature that even allowed e-bikes to be
15 cited as involved or cause a crash. Prior to the
16 Governor signing this bill in the summer of 2024,
17 there was no police report that even set forth who
18 was involved in these accidents. I don't think that
19 anyone testifying here tonight is saying that
20 licensing and registration is the be-all end-all, but
21 we have to start to do something. It should not have
22 taken as long as it has for this bill to come before
23 the Council, and I don't understand why it's taken
24 this bill four years, and intro 1101 in a matter of
25

1 days. We need to start doing something.

2 Registration is not the total answer--

3
4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Your time
5 expired.

6 VALERIE MASON: But we need to start
7 somewhere. Thank you very much.

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
9 And just to be clear, Intro 1131 was not created in
10 just days. I've been waiting for that bill to be
11 drafted for well over a year and a half. Thank you.

12 VALERIE MASON: Okay, well, it's still
13 faster than this one, but I appreciate--

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
15 It's not, but thank you. I appreciate your testimony.
16 Next we'll hear from Vishnu Reddy followed by Andre
17 Braga.

18 VISHNU REDDY: Hi. My name is Vishnu
19 Reddy and I live in Sunnyside, Queens. I'm here to
20 express my strong disapproval for Intro 606. I own
21 and rely on an e-bike most days. It is an essential
22 mode of transportation for me as someone who mostly
23 travels between outer boroughs, the kind of trips
24 that our public transportation system does not handle
25 well. Without my e-bike, I would be strongly

1
2 considering getting a car which would contribute to
3 traffic, worsen pollution, and add to the vehicles
4 being stored on the streets that I share with my
5 neighbors. My e-bike makes it possible for me to
6 live my life without the burden of car ownership.
7 This bill is poorly thought up. It's impossible to
8 implement. If you look at the language of the bill,
9 the definition of "legal motorized vehicles" means
10 that electric wheelchairs need to be registered with
11 the DOT. This is unacceptable. I am not denying the
12 very real concerns that many people here express
13 today, and I strongly believe we need to take action
14 on it, but this is a reactionary bill being propped
15 up by folks who have no desired to see a workable
16 solution. There's been no thought put into what it
17 would actually take to implement this bill, because
18 there's no way that it can be implemented
19 effectively. There's no evidence that bike
20 registration would actually solve the problems that
21 people here are rightfully upset about. We need to
22 hold these delivery companies accountable to ensure
23 that their workforce is not incentivized to cut
24 corners to make a living. We need to make sure that
25 unregistered mopeds are not being allowed to operate

1
2 on our streets. We need to make sure that e-bikes
3 that we do have are certified so they're safe to
4 operate and charge. We need Intro 1138 from my
5 Council Member Julie Won for universal daylighting so
6 we all can see each other at intersections and be
7 safer on our streets. Intro 606 does none of that,
8 and I urge the Council to vote against it. Thank you
9 for your time.

10 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you,
11 Vishnu. Next we'll hear from Andre Braga who will
12 then be followed by Jeffrey.

13 ANDRE BRAGA: Hello. I'm here to voice my
14 opposition to Intro 606. My parents came to New York
15 before I was born, picking up whatever jobs they
16 could do, much like those who work delivery today.
17 What will Intro 606 do to those who rely on e-bikes
18 for work? They'll apply for registration, but
19 regardless of the outcome, they'll still be in the
20 streets trying to make a living for their family.
21 Intro 606 does not remove the intense pressure
22 delivery driver's face to drive profits for the apps.
23 All it does it make their life and mine harder. I
24 use a City Bike three times a week to get treatment
25 for my psoriasis and 606 puts my accessibility at

1 risk while keeping the streets just as dangerous. We
2 should be spending our time and money on
3 infrastructure and regulating delivery companies, not
4 more bureaucracy. That's it.

5 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
6 Jeffrey followed by Lucy Koteen [sp?].

7 UNIDENTIFIED: Jeffery is not--

8 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: [interposing]
9 Okay.

10 UNIDENTIFIED: Jeffrey is not on anymore.

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay, going
12 to Lucy Koteen followed by Hayden Brockett.

13 UNIDENTIFIED: Lucy is not either.

14 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Hayden
15 Brockett followed by Kevin Lachera [sp?].

16 UNIDENTIFIED: Hayden, you're on.

17 HAYDEN BROCKETT: Yes, thank you. Thank
18 you, Chairwoman Brooks-Powers for your stamina today
19 and for your introduction of Intro 1131. That is an
20 extremely important bill and I'm sorry it took so
21 long, but I'm so glad that you're sticking with it.
22 My name is Hayden Brockett and my wife and two
23 children live in the Upper West Side where we live,
24 walk, and we bike. I oppose Intro 606 which would be
25

1 a step backwards for public safety in our city. I
2 wish to dedicate my testimony to our Upper West Side
3 neighbor Miriam Rinehearth [sp?] who was crushed
4 under an ambulance last month while in the crosswalk
5 at 96th Street in Gale Brewer's district. Motor
6 vehicles kill 200 times more New Yorkers than do e-
7 bikes. As tragic as the stories have been from the
8 individuals who have suffered, that fact that motor
9 vehicles crushing us is 200 times more than e-bikes
10 cannot be rebutted and must be addressed. We need
11 fewer people in cars and more people riding bikes.
12 We need fewer places on our streets dedicated to car
13 storage. License plates and registration will not
14 solve the safety issues that have been raised. When
15 it comes to e-bike safety, we have the laws on the
16 books that we need. We just have infrastructure that
17 causes traffic violence and a police force that does
18 not prioritize traffic safety enough. The NYPD does
19 not prioritize enforcement of red lights running by
20 cars or by e-bikes. People have been asking for
21 solutions from bike advocates, there you have it.
22 Daylighting intersections, pedestrian islands make it
23 easier for pedestrians to know where they are and for
24 pedestrians to be seen by bikers and by drivers. The
25

1
2 Mayor and the Police Commissioner have fallen down on
3 the job protecting pedestrians from car drivers and
4 e-bike drivers. Chair Brooks-Powers, you mentioned
5 earlier an incident several times where a moped
6 almost knocked you over on the sidewalk outside your
7 office. First, that was a very dangerous situation
8 that NYPD should have addressed. Second, that
9 incident--

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Thank
11 you. Your time's expired.

12 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

13 HAYDEN BROCKETT: [inaudible] preventing
14 this legal behavior. Thank you so much.

15 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

16 Next we'll hear from Kevin Lachera [sp?] followed by
17 unidentified Zoom.

18 KEVIN LACHERA: Can you hear me?

19 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Yep, we can
20 hear you.

21 KEVIN LACHERA: Great. Thank you. My
22 name is Kevin Lachera. I'm a proud Greenpointer.
23 I'm here to speak in strong opposition to Intro 606.
24 There's lots that's been said over the course of
25 today about pain and harm and the Council's

1 responsibility to address it. When supporters of 606
2 say that they've been hurt or scared and failed by
3 our system, I believe them. We have all been failed
4 by that system. Our city has historically
5 prioritized moving as many cars as fast as possible
6 through so many of our neighborhoods, and the deep
7 and lasting harm [inaudible] people that live there.
8 I live in a neighborhood that's been cut in two by
9 the BQE and [inaudible] Boulevard. Hundreds of
10 people have been killed during the lifetime of these
11 highways, and thousands of people have been injured,
12 and that's just on two roads in one neighborhood. We
13 all deserve better. We need real investment in our
14 streets to make them safer for everyone, pedestrians,
15 cyclists of all modes, and drivers. When you've been
16 hurt like some of the speakers in support of 606
17 have, I think it's easy in that anger and frustration
18 to hurt others. But this bill will not fix what is
19 broken on our streets. We need comprehensive
20 redesign. We need universal daylighting. We need
21 enforcement of the existing laws. Thank you very
22 much.
23
24
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Next we're
3 going to hear from unidentified Zoom and please state
4 your name.

5 SCOTT WEINSTEIN: Hi, thank you committee
6 members for the opportunity to share this testimony.
7 My name is Scott Weinstein. I live in Crown Heights
8 with my family. I get around the city primarily by
9 bicycle, public transportation and e-scooter. As
10 time and age does it worst, I will surely also adopt
11 an e-bike like my father and many others have,
12 because it's an extremely time, cost and space-
13 effective way to move about the city. As a
14 vulnerable road user I understand and empathize with
15 the motivation for this bill. on any given trip we
16 must navigate multiple dangers, bike lanes blocked by
17 cars and trucks, poor lines of sight at
18 intersections, sidewalk access blocked by cars,
19 sidewalks blocked by cars parked on them, and
20 oversized trucks who mass and limited driver
21 visibility make them much more lethal to those
22 outside of them. With that said, I urge the
23 committee to modify or vote against Intro 606 as it
24 will be counterproductive to increasing road safety
25 and road through-put. This city is unwilling or

1
2 unable to enforce the laws we already have. This is
3 not only my assertion, the City of New York
4 Department of Investigations report on parking
5 placards details one such example of non-enforcement.
6 This proposal doesn't address road safety directly.
7 It only add expensive licensing requirements for
8 theoretical accountability via a likely trivial
9 mutilated or matched ID plate. If we do go with a
10 plate, let's also invest in durability, GPS tracking
11 for all vehicles, not just e-bikes but all vehicles,
12 for instantaneous speed enforcement. Increase the
13 penalties for mutilated or obscuring the ID system,
14 and perhaps move this program to the city with the
15 existing infrastructure [inaudible]. The cost and
16 effort to implement 606 could be put towards other
17 solutions which could have a positive impact on
18 safety through-put and latency. Some ideas:
19 daylighting intersections so that all users have
20 visibility to prevent collisions.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Thank you. Your
22 time's expired.

23 SCOTT WEINSTEIN: [inaudible] Thank you
24 for your time.

25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay, 7:31
3 p.m. If we have inadvertently missed anyone that has
4 registered to testify today and has yet to have been
5 called, please use the Zoom hand function if you are
6 testifying remotely and you will be called in the
7 order your hand has been raised. If you are
8 testifying in person, please come to the dais.

9 UNIDENTIFIED: There is a Michele
10 Birnbaum that has raised their hand.

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay, you can
12 take her off mute.

13 UNIDENTIFIED: You're unmuted, Michele.

14 MICHELE BIRNBAUM: Yes. Good evening and
15 thank you very much Chair Brooks-Powers and thank you
16 very much, Council Member Holden for all your work on
17 this issue. I'm a lifelong New Yorker and I am an
18 organizer. I've started many community organizations.
19 I have founded them and I preside over them. So I'm
20 very, very active in my community. I started my
21 discussions about electric bikes and vehicles many,
22 many years ago. I want to say that I am in favor of
23 Intro 606 and that bill is not mutually exclusive to
24 any of the bills that are proposed. Certainly
25 approaching this on the state level is worthwhile and

1
2 getting any additional information from 1131 would be
3 worthwhile, but that does not preclude the passing of
4 606. These are two different issues. One is creating
5 an appropriate infrastructure which most people seem
6 to support and the other is forcing the use of that
7 infrastructure. The basis of our legal system is
8 accountability, responsibility, liability. To say
9 that that's not going to make a difference in this
10 case is to completely discount the whole basis of our
11 legal system. Of course, accountability makes a
12 difference. Of course, responsibility does, and of
13 course liability does. And that's what you heard
14 when you heard the very sad stories that you heard
15 today. The same groups that push aside
16 accountability and responsibility and liability would
17 be mortified if that was to account for the behavior
18 of automobile drivers. All I heard today was what-
19 about-ism. Well, what about cars? They do that.
20 And I heard paranoia. Well, what about the police?
21 They're going to come and get us. This is ridiculous.
22 The basis of--

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Thank
24 you. Your time is expired.

25 MICHELE BIRNBAUM: Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

Next we will hear from Andrew Stern followed by Ryan Chrisman [sp?].

ANDREW STERN: Hi, Chair Brooks-Powers.

Thank you for being here with us so late today. My name's Andrew Stern and I'm here to testify in opposition to Intro 606. As a cyclist, I don't want to worry about being stopped or scrutinized by the NYPD because I'm riding a bike and they think it might be a class three e-bike. They're absolutely [inaudible] of mopeds and the incentives that deliveristas are subject to. I encourage the Council to address these problems with another bill such as Intro 1131. There's also a real problem with mopeds in the city which already require registration, but there's a lack of enforcement. Mopeds which are large, heavy, often gas-powered vehicles without pedals, are disproportionately harming pedestrians and cyclists. They have no place being parked on the sidewalk or being driven in the bike lane. But this is what we so often see, mopeds in the bike lane weaving around cyclists. These mopeds are often disingenuously called e-bikes by opponents of biking who are deliberately trying to confuse the issue.

1
2 The force of a crash is mass times acceleration and
3 that's the problem with mopeds. They're heavy, often
4 200 pounds or more, unlike e-bikes which are almost
5 all under 100 pounds. They're also able to travel
6 faster than any e-bikes. Mopeds have no place in our
7 bike lanes, and I hope the council takes this issue
8 seriously with a bill addressing that. I urge you to
9 pass Intro 1131 because bikes are essential to our
10 city's transition into a more sustainable place, and
11 we must ensure everyone is safe. I encourage this
12 council to focus on keeping this administration
13 accountable and ensuring that they're meeting the
14 goals required in the Streets Plan, 50 miles of bike
15 lanes each year. Bike lanes separate cyclists of all
16 kinds from pedestrians and cars and they keep
17 everybody safe. Intro 606 has the potential to
18 threaten hundreds of thousands of cyclists who just
19 want to safely ride to work or to school or to their
20 homes. Thank you.

21 RYAN CHRISMAN: Hi, my name is Ryan
22 Chrisman and I'm a Crown Heights resident and a
23 person who gets around mostly on my feet, a human-
24 powered bike and on the train. And I am here to
25 speak in opposition to Intro 606. On Wednesday

1
2 mornings I volunteer with Berg [sic] and Bike Bus
3 [sic] a group of caring folks who enable adults and
4 children to ride to school by riding with them
5 together. Parents and others who cannot power their
6 own pedal bikes often arrive on cargo e-bikes. These
7 bikes are usually slow and the parents have recently
8 found them to be very, very helpful in order to get
9 them and their children to school. Intro 606 would
10 really, really hamper their ability to do this, and
11 discourage the use of e-bikes used by parents. I'm
12 very, very against that obviously, because I believe
13 that this is a really, really positive way for
14 parents and their children to ride to school
15 together. Parents often have jobs to go to or they
16 often have other children who are on these bikes as
17 well with them and may not be comfortable pedaling
18 their own bike. Particularly, appalling about this
19 bill is the vagueness of the bill and the
20 demonization of class one e-bikes which are
21 relatively slow and do not pose much danger to people
22 who are walking and biking. Therefore, I encourage
23 opposition to this bill, and if the Council would
24 like to regulate e-bikes, I encourage them to go back
25

1
2 to the drawing board and get community input before
3 producing a bill.

4 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
5 Next we have Jeffrey online.

6 JEFFREY: [inaudible]

7 UNIDENTIFIED: Jeffrey, you're unmuted.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

9 UNIDENTIFIED: Jeffrey, are you there?
10 Doesn't look like he's responding.

11 CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
12 As no one remaining online, the chamber looks clear.
13 With that, I'd just like to take a moment to thank
14 every single person that came out today to testify,
15 to allow their voice to be a part of this extremely
16 important conversation. I look forward to working
17 with all of my colleagues as we chart our course
18 forward in addressing the needs to better regulate
19 this newer form of transportation to ensure safety
20 for all on our streets. And with that, this hearing
21 is adjourned.

22 [gavel]

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 31, 2024