

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

January 31, 2018  
Start: 2:02 p.m.  
Recess: 2:40 p.m.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: LETITIA JAMES  
Public Advocate  
  
COREY D. JOHNSON  
Speaker for the Council

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Adrienne Adams  
Alan N. Maisel  
Alicka Ampry-Samuel  
Andrew Cohen  
Andy King  
Antonio Reynoso  
Barry S. Grodenchik  
Ben Kallos  
Bill Perkins  
Brad S. Lander  
Carlina Rivera  
Carlos Menchaca  
Chaim M. Deutsch  
Costa G. Constantinides  
Daniel Dromm  
Deborah L. Rose

Diana Ayala  
Donovan J. Richards  
Eric A. Ulrich  
Fernando Cabrera  
Francisco P. Moya  
Helen K. Rosenthal  
I. Daneek Miller  
Inez D. Barron  
James G. Van Bramer  
Joseph C. Borelli  
Jumaane D. Williams  
Justin L. Brannan  
Kalman Yeger  
Karen Koslowitz  
Keith Powers  
Laurie A. Cumbo  
Margaret S. Chin  
Mark Gjonaj  
Mark Levine  
Mark Treyger  
Mathieu Eugene  
Paul A. Vallone  
Peter A. Koo  
Rafael Espinal, Jr.  
Rafael Salamanca. Jr.  
Ritchie Torres  
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.  
Robert F. Holden  
Roy I. Lancman  
Ruben Diaz, Jr.  
Stephen T. Levin  
Steven Matteo  
Vanessa Gibson  
Ydanis A. Rodriguez

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Rev. Brian C. Ellis-Gibbs, Pastor of Queens  
Baptist Church, located at 93-23 217th Street  
Queens Village, NY 11428

2 [sound check, pause]

3 CLERK: ...to vibrate. Quiet, please.

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, Please.

5 CLERK: Will all non-Council employers,  
6 non-Council employees at this time please leave the  
7 main floor of the chambers. There is additional  
8 seating upstairs in the balcony. Thank you. Madam  
9 Public Advocate.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: May we have quiet  
11 in the chambers. May members please tale their  
12 seats.

13 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet please.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the  
15 Chambers, please. [gavel] [background comments]  
16 Thank you. Quiet in the Chambers, please. Everyone  
17 please find a seat. Thank you. All rise for the  
18 Pledge of Allegiance. [pause]

19 CLERK: Adams.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Present.

21 CLERK: Ampry-Samuel.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Present.

23 CLERK: Ayala.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Present.

25

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

5

2 CLERK: Barron.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.

4 CLERK: Borelli.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Here.

6 CLERK: Brannan.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Here.

8 CLERK: Cabrera.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.

10 CLERK: Chin.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

12 CLERK: Cohen.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

14 CLERK: Constantinides.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.

16 CLERK: Cornegy.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Over here.

18 [laughter]

19 CLERK: Thank you. Deutsch.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Here.

21 CLERK: Diaz.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Here.

23 CLERK: Dromm.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.

25 CLERK: Espinal. Eugene.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

6

2 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Here.

3 CLERK: Gibson.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Here.

5 CLERK: Gjonaj.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Present.

7 CLERK: Grodenchik.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Here.

9 CLERK: Holden.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Here.

11 CLERK: Kallos.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

13 CLERK: King.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.

15 CLERK: Koo.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

17 CLERK: Koslowitz.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

19 CLERK: Lancman.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.

21 CLERK: Lander.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.

23 CLERK: Levin.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [off mic] Here.

25 CLERK: Levine.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

7

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

3 CLERK: Maisel.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.

5 CLERK: Menchaca. Miller.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Present.

7 CLERK: Moya.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Here.

9 CLERK: Perkins.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Here.

11 CLERK: Powers.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Here.

13 CLERK: Reynoso.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Here.

15 CLERK: Richards.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

17 CLERK: Rivera.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Present.

19 CLERK: Rodriguez.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Here.

21 CLERK: Rose.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.

23 CLERK: Rosenthal.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.

25 CLERK: Salamanca.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

8

2 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.

3 CLERK: Torres. Treyger.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.

5 CLERK: Ulrich.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Here.

7 CLERK: Vallone.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

9 CLERK: Van Bramer.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

11 CLERK: Williams.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.

13 CLERK: Yeger.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here.

15 CLERK: Matteo.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Present.

17 CLERK: Espinal.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.

19 CLERK: Cumbo.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Present.

21 CLERK: Speaker Johnson.

22 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Here.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the

24 Chambers, please.

25



2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down, please.  
3 Keep it down.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All right for the  
5 Invocation.

6 CLERK: All rise.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: The invocation  
8 will be delivered by Reverend Brian C. Ellis-Gibbs,  
9 the Pastor of Queens Baptist Church located at 93-23  
10 217<sup>th</sup> Street in the Great Borough of Queens. Quiet  
11 in the Chambers.

12 REVEREND ELLIS-GIBBS: Let us pray. God,  
13 you who are called by many names and from whom we  
14 have received second chances, you who loves us more  
15 than we know, on this day at this particular time in  
16 and the continuing of time in this moment in the life  
17 story of our city, we come before in this historical  
18 space first saying thank you. Thank you for life and  
19 breath. Thank you for grace and mercy. Thank you  
20 for love and light. God, we request your presence to  
21 enter into this space, and fill this place with your  
22 holiness. For in this room are those whom you have  
23 called into position, and have gathered as a  
24 collective force to bless your people. We pray that  
25 as you have invited them to participate in your work

2 that you pour into them wisdom and understanding. We  
3 pray oh, holy one that as they discern, dialogue,  
4 discuss and decide up legislation and policies that  
5 you would reveal your will to them, for you have  
6 called them to be light and darkness. You have  
7 called them to be conduits for compassion, and  
8 ambassadors of justice for all who are residents of  
9 our city. Show, up, oh, God, that as they  
10 deliberate, they acknowledge your presence in the  
11 faces of children, seniors, homeless persons,  
12 immigrants, all those who cry out to you. Use these  
13 women and men to work in a spirit of partnership to  
14 bless and to empower, to protect and to strengthen so  
15 that all have access to abundant life and protect  
16 them with your covering of love. Bless them in their  
17 homes, but we pray, oh, God that all things are done  
18 for your holy purpose, and we declare that evil and  
19 injustice have no place in this space. May your love  
20 be the rule of law that they follow so that building  
21 your kingdom becomes priority above all, and it is  
22 with gratitude and humility in your holy and precious  
23 name, the name that is above every name, exalted in  
24 all the universe that we pray, that all say amen.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amen. Please be  
3 seated, and no a motion to spread the invocation.  
4 Council Member Barry Grodenchik.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you,  
6 Madam Public Advocate and it's certainly a great  
7 honor for me and for all the members of the New York  
8 City Council to have Reverend Ellis-Gibbs with us  
9 today. You know, one of the great things about  
10 running for public office is that we get to meet a  
11 lot of new people, and one of the best people that  
12 I've met in my two plus years in the New York City  
13 Council is Reverend Ellis-Gibbs. He's on 217<sup>th</sup>  
14 Street in Queens Village. I like to affectionately  
15 refer to it as Church Street because we have a lot of  
16 churches on that very wide street not too far from my  
17 dear brother Daneek Miller's district, and he is  
18 known not only to myself but Councilman Miller and  
19 Councilman Richards and, of course, Councilwoman  
20 Adams as well. I could read you his resume, but, you  
21 just heard his beautiful prayer. He's all about  
22 bringing people together, and we had a beautiful  
23 service a few months back where a Congregation Benet  
24 Jeshurun, which is a very famous Jewish congregation  
25 on the Upper West Side of the great borough of

2 Manhattan in Council Member Rosenthal's district, and  
3 it was one of the most moving, um, moving events that  
4 I have been to in a house of worship, and he even  
5 lets me preach when I go there. So, if you want a  
6 real treat, you can come and hear me come and bring  
7 the world. But today, it's my pleasure to welcome  
8 him on behalf of my 50 brother and sister Council  
9 members and the great public advocate of the city of  
10 New York, and I move right now to spread the  
11 invocation on the record. Thank you, Madam Public  
12 Advocate.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you Rabbi-  
14 Reverend Grodenchik. Thank you so much. [laughter]  
15 Adoption of Minutes. Council Member Rivera.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I move that the  
17 minutes of the Stated Meeting of December 19, 2017 be  
18 adopted as printed.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
20 Messages and papers from the Mayor.

21 CLERK: None.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication  
23 from City, County and Borough Offices.

24 CLERK: None.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and  
3 Communications.

4 CLERK: None.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use Call-  
6 Ups.

7 CLERK: M-12, Zoning Amending.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: May we have a  
9 roll call vote on that.

10 CLERK: Adams.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Aye.

12 CLERK: Ampry-Samuel.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Aye.

14 CLERK: Ayala.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye.

16 CLERK: Barron.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye.

18 CLERK: Borelli.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye.

20 CLERK: Brannan.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye.

22 CLERK: Cabrera.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye.

24 CLERK: Chin.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

14

2 CLERK: Cohen.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

4 CLERK: Constantinides.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye.

6 CLERK: Cornegy.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye

8 CLERK: Deutsch.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Aye.

10 CLERK: Diaz.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Si.

12 CLERK: Dromm.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye

14 CLERK: Espinal.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.

16 CLERK: Eugene.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.

18 CLERK: Gibson.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Aye.

20 CLERK: Gjonaj.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Aye.

22 CLERK: Grodenchik.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.

24 CLERK: Holden.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

15

2 CLERK: Kallos.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.

4 CLERK: King.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye.

6 CLERK: Koo.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.

8 CLERK: Koslowitz.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.

10 CLERK: Lancman.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

12 CLERK: Lander.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Lander. Levin.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [off mic] Here.

15 Levine.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.

17 CLERK: Maisel.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

19 CLERK: Menchaca.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Yes.

21 CLERK: Miller.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye.

23 CLERK: Moya.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Aye.

25 CLERK: Perkins.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye.

3 CLERK: Lancman

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye

5 CLERK: Powers.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Aye.

7 CLERK: Reynoso.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.

9 CLERK: Richards.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.

11 CLERK: Rivera.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Aye.

13 CLERK: Rodriguez.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

15 CLERK: Rose.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

17 CLERK: Rosenthal.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I vote aye and

19 with permission I vote aye on all items coupled on

20 the General Order Calendar.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

22 CLERK: Salamanca.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye.

24 CLERK: Torres. Treyger.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.



2 CLERK: Ulrich. Vallone.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye.

4 CLERK: Van Bramer.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye.

6 CLERK: Williams.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye.

8 CLERK: Yeger.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Aye.

10 CLERK: Ulrich.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Yes.

12 CLERK: Matteo.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: I vote aye.

14 CLERK: Espinal.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.

16 CLERK: Cumbo.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Aye.

18 CLERK: Speaker Johnson.

19 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Aye.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Today's Land Use

21 Call-Ups are adopted by a vote of 47 in the

22 affirmative, 0 in the negative. All quiet in the

23 Chambers as we--

24 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it

25 down, please.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: --as we now hear  
3 from the Speaker, Speaker Corey Johnson.

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you, Public  
5 Advocate James. Good afternoon everyone. We begin  
6 today on a tragic note. An Amtrak train carrying  
7 some of our Republican colleagues in Congress crashed  
8 into a truck this morning, and as of now, there has  
9 been one fatality, and though we may disagree on a  
10 lot with folks from the other side of the aisle, we  
11 are all friends and colleagues who are working to  
12 improve the lives of everyday Americans. Everyone in  
13 Washington is in our hearts, and I hope and pray for  
14 the safety of everyone involved in this tragic  
15 accident this morning, which took place in West  
16 Virginia. I would like to take a moment to  
17 acknowledge the passing of retired firefighter Ray  
18 Phillips, affectionately known and Gonzo, the first  
19 responder we lost over the weekend to a 9/11 related  
20 illness. Ray brought joy to everyone around him,  
21 playing the official Santa Claus at the FDNY Widows  
22 and Children's Holiday Party, and sharing stories of  
23 his favorite team, the New York Rangers. We will all  
24 remember Ray for his heroism, and my thoughts and  
25 prayers are with his family during this very

2 difficult time. I also want to recognize the loss of  
3 a civil rights trailblazer, a key player in  
4 establishing racial justice, the Reverend Dr. Wyatt  
5 T. Walker. Dr. Walker served as Chief of Staff to  
6 Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. and served as the first  
7 board chairman of the National Action Network whose  
8 founder, my friend Dr. Al Sharpton announced his  
9 passing. We all have just celebrated the life and  
10 legacy of Dr. Martin King and thus the work of Dr.  
11 Walker and the importance of his participation and  
12 leadership in the Civil Rights Movement. And as we  
13 approach Black History Month, we especially recognize  
14 the impact African-American have had on our nation's  
15 history especially Dr. Walker and, of course, Dr.  
16 King. My thoughts and prayers go out to the family  
17 and friends of Dr. Walker, and let us please take a  
18 moment of silence in honor of the victims of this  
19 morning's train crash, firefighter Phillips, and Dr.  
20 Walker. If everyone could please rise.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please rise.

22 [moment of silence]

23 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you all very  
24 much. Before we begin on today's agenda, I want to  
25 recognize—where is she? I hope she's up here. Oh,

2 there she is. I want to recognize Anna Garcia,  
3 member of the central staff whose last day is today.  
4 Anna has been part of our Council family starting out  
5 as a sergeant-at-arms before joining the scheduling  
6 team for Melissa Mark-Viverito, our previous Speaker  
7 and then for me. We thank Anna for her service, and  
8 we wish her the best of luck in following her  
9 passion, which is what she's doing now. Anna, if you  
10 would please stand so we can recognize you, and give  
11 you a round of applause. [cheers/applause] Thank  
12 you very much. Don't be a stranger. Come back and  
13 visit. I want to jump into our docket today. We are  
14 only voting on two Finance items and a few Land Use  
15 items this afternoon beginning with the Finance  
16 items, we'll be voting on two Article XI Property Tax  
17 Exemptions. The first exemption for a property  
18 located at 211 West 28<sup>th</sup> Street is in my district.  
19 It's going to create 37 units of supportive housing,  
20 which I am really happy about. 37 units of  
21 supportive housing, and I think it's going to be for  
22 people living with HIV and AIDS and formerly homeless  
23 individuals. We need more housing like this in New  
24 York City. The second exemption is for the Two  
25 Bridges property in Council Member Margaret Chin's

2 district, which would preserve 198 units of  
3 affordable rental housing. Moving on, the Council is  
4 going to be voting on three Land Use projects this  
5 afternoon. First, well vote on a rezoning in  
6 Williamsburg to allow commercial retail on a block  
7 front along Bedford Avenue in Council Member Steve  
8 Levin's district. Next, we're going to vote on a  
9 small rezoning in Prospects Heights to allow housing  
10 in Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo's district, and  
11 finally, we'll vote on a disposition of a city  
12 property and a tax exemption for affordable housing  
13 Hamilton Heights. That completed in Council Member  
14 Mark Levine's district I believe. Right, Mark? Yes.  
15 That completes the highlights of today's agenda.

16 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down, please.

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: And that wasn't even  
18 Grodenchik talking. [laughter] That completes the  
19 highlights of today's docket, and I look forward to  
20 proceeding with today's vote. Thank you very much.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Discussion of  
22 General Orders. [background comments]

23 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Oh, hold on one second.  
24 Okay. Was Robbie here? So, I...I want to...we had a  
25 press conference just about an hour ago on the steps

2 of City Hall, and Robbie Rabier (sp?) is with us  
3 today after enduring a very brutal, difficult,  
4 unjust, in my opinion, proceeding and detention and  
5 attempted deportation a few weeks ago. He's here  
6 with his wife, and I know a lot of members talked  
7 earlier about what their feelings were, but I thought  
8 it was important to have him on the floor here today,  
9 and I want to recognize him. So, Robbie, thank you  
10 for being here. [applause] And with that, I turn it  
11 back over to the Public Advocate.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
13 Discussion of General Orders. Seeing none, Report of  
14 Special Committees.

15 CLERK: None.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports of  
17 Standing Committees.

18 CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
19 Finance, Preconsidered LU 12 and Reso 129 and LU 13  
20 and Reso 130, Tax Exemptions.

21 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
22 Orders.

23 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Land  
24 Use, LU 1 and Reso 131, Sidewalk Café.

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled to be filed  
3 pursuant to a letter of withdrawal.

4 CLERK: LU 2 and Reso 132 and LU 3 and  
5 Reso 133, Sidewalk Café and Zoning Amendment.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
7 Orders.

8 CLERK: LUs 4 and 5, Bergen Street  
9 Rezoning.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved with  
11 modifications and referred to the City Planning  
12 Commission pursuant to Rule 11.7(b) of the Rules of  
13 the Council and Section 197-D of the New York City  
14 Charter.

15 CLERK: (coughs) Excuse me. LU 11 and  
16 Reso 134, Tax Exemption.

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
18 Orders.

19 CLERK: On the General Order Calendar LU  
20 4 and Reso 135 and LU 5 and Reso 136, Bergen Street  
21 Rezoning.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
23 Orders.

24 CLERK: Resolution appointing various  
25 persons commissioner of deeds.

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
3 Orders, and I would ask for a roll call vote on all  
4 items on today's General Order Calendar.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the  
6 Chambers.

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Sit down, please.

8 CLERK: Adams.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Aye on all.

10 CLERK: Ampry-Samuel.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Aye on all.

12 CLERK: Ayala.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye on all.

14 CLERK: Barron.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to  
16 explain my vote.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. I  
19 vote aye on all with the exception of LU 4, which as  
20 we know is a result of the whole MIH legislation that  
21 we passed several years ago. I think that until we  
22 have a much more significant number of apartments  
23 dedicated to people who are at the 80 and even the  
24 100 and below, we're going to continue to have areas  
25 of gentrification where poo people, low-income people



1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 25

2 will not be able to afford to live in the city. So,  
3 with that I vote aye on all with the exception of LU  
4 4.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

6 CLERK: Borelli.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all.

8 CLERK: Brannan.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye on all.

10 CLERK: Cabrera.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye.

12 CLERK: Chin.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye on all.

14 CLERK: Cohen.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

16 CLERK: Constantinides.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye on

18 all.

19 CLERK: Cornegy.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye on all.

21 CLERK: Deutsch.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Permission to

23 explain my Intros today.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, or your

25 Introductions?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Oh, yeah, I  
3 guess no. No, I'm fine today.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughs] You  
5 could...you can come back.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye on all.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: I'll put you on  
8 the general discussion calendar. Thank you

9 CLERK: Diaz.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Don't do that. Don't  
11 put him on the General Discussion Calendar.

12 [laughter]

13 CLERK: Diaz.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Yes.

15 CLERK: Dromm.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye

17 CLERK: Espinal.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.

19 CLERK: Eugene.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.

21 CLERK: Gibson.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Aye on all.

23 CLERK: Gjonaj.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Aye on all.

25 CLERK: Grodenchik.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.

3 CLERK: Holden.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye.

5 CLERK: Kallos.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.

7 CLERK: King.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye on all.

9 CLERK: Koo.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye on all. (coughs)

11 CLERK: Koslowitz.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye on all.

13 CLERK: Lancman.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

15 CLERK: Lander.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye.

17 CLERK: Levin.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye on all.

19 CLERK: Levine.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.

21 CLERK: Maisel.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Maisel.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes. [laughter]

24 CLERK: Menchaca.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye.

2 CLERK: Miller.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Affirmative.

4 CLERK: Moya.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Aye on all.

6 CLERK: Perkins.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye on all

8 except for LU 4. I vote no on that.

9 CLERK: Powers.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Aye on all.

11 CLERK: Reynoso.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.

13 CLERK: Richards.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye on all.

15 CLERK: Rivera.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Aye.

17 CLERK: Rodriguez.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Maisel.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER: He's present. No, he's

20 not present.

21 CLERK: Rodriguez.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye on all.

23 CLERK: Rose.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye on all.

25 CLERK: Salamanca.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

3 CLERK: Treyger.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

5 CLERK: Ulrich.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Pass.

7 CLERK: Vallone.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on all.

9 CLERK: Van Bramer.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye on all.

11 CLERK: Williams.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye on all.

13 CLERK: Yeger.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Aye.

15 CLERK: Ulrich.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Yes.

17 CLERK: Matteo. Cumbo.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Aye.

19 CLERK: Speaker Johnson.

20 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: I vote aye.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. All

22 items on today's General Order Calendar were adopted

23 by a vote of 50 in the affirmative, 0 negative and 0

24 abstentions with the exception of Land Use 4 and

25 Resolution 135, which was adopted by a vote of 48 in

2 the affirmative, 2 negative, and 0 abstentions, and  
3 there was revived...revised Land Use Call-Ups 50 in the  
4 affirmative, 0 negative. Introduction and Reading of  
5 Bills.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: All bills have been  
7 referred to the committees as indicated on the  
8 Agenda.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: There are no  
10 resolutions. We will begin with General Discussions.  
11 We only have one individual who seeks to talk, two.  
12 Council Member Kallos.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I have good news  
14 and bad news. The good news is that last term we  
15 passed the Right to Council. The bad news is that  
16 with more people in Housing Court, more people will  
17 find themselves on a list of tenants who face  
18 discrimination in renting new apartments. Two bills  
19 hope to curb this problem. The first would require  
20 tenant screening companies who make these so-called  
21 "tenant blacklist" to provide fair and complete  
22 information including when tenants were in the right.  
23 Landlords would no longer be allowed to discriminate  
24 against tenants who won or paid their rent. Pleas  
25 sign onto Introductions 85 and 86 along with our

2 Public Advocate Tish James, and, um, Gale Brewer our  
3 Manhattan Borough President, who are co-prime  
4 sponsors. No one should face homelessness simply  
5 because they've been to housing court. You may also  
6 know that scaffolding is my pet peeve.

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
8 down, please.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Scaffolding goes  
10 up, but doesn't go down for months, years, even  
11 decades while no work is happening. Please sign  
12 onto... Sorry. Some scaffolding is almost old enough  
13 to vote. Pleas sign onto Introduction 87 requiring  
14 work to continue without interruption for more than a  
15 week, and to be completed within six months or the  
16 city steps to do the work and make bad landlords pay.  
17 Lastly, I am 43 hours, 27 minutes and about 10  
18 seconds away from being a father.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Whooo.  
20 [cheers/applause]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: My wife and I are  
22 more than a little nervous. Helping to settle our  
23 nerves is knowing that we will be there for each  
24 other--

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
3 [shushing for quiet]

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down, please.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I mean this  
6 literally as we are both lucky enough to have the  
7 option of paid parental leave, an option extended to  
8 far too few Americans. I was proud to support  
9 Governor Cuomo for the Paid Family Leave, which  
10 started in this new year to provide private sector  
11 employees with eight weeks of pay at—Sorry. Eight  
12 weeks 50% pay. While Mayor de Blasio has announced  
13 paid parental leave for city employees, I was  
14 disappointed to learn that it leaves out our police  
15 officers, our teachers, our principals, transit  
16 workers [bell] and civil servants, and I firmly  
17 believe we must provide all of our public employees  
18 with the same benefits we are now demanding of the  
19 private sector. I'll just skip to the end, which is  
20 just to say I hope that we have Paid Family Leave for  
21 all New Yorkers and, um, that our society begins to  
22 expect from its fathers that they'll take full paid  
23 paternity leave, and I can only lead by example  
24 joining my colleague Antonio Reynoso, who's currently  
25 on paternity leave. I'm taking paternity leave



2 myself, and staring in a matter of hours. Thank you  
3 to my colleagues for the well wishes, and I'll see  
4 you again in March.

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Congratulations, Ben.  
6 [applause] Congratulations.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Congratulations,  
8 daddy. Council Member Chin.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Good afternoon. I  
10 want to draw my colleagues' attention to Intro 30,  
11 legislation that will hold unscrupulous landlords--

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
13 [shushing for quiet]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: --accountable when  
15 they vacate a building due to neglect and disrepair.  
16 Just last week a judge ordered the Department of  
17 Buildings to inspect 85 Bowery in my district after  
18 an elongated legal battle between the tenants and the  
19 landlord. When the inspector went in there, the main  
20 staircase was in such disrepair that he had no choice  
21 but to vacate the building putting nearly 100  
22 individuals from infants to their elderly into  
23 shelters. Even though Joseph Batesh (sp?) and other  
24 landlords like him is required to pay the fines and  
25 cure the problem, he has still reason to do quickly.

2 Furthermore, every day those tenants are without a  
3 home. The city foots the bill to provide the  
4 shelter. Intro 30 will require that the landlord pay  
5 his share by requiring the landlord to create an  
6 escrow account with HPD and pay at least 10% if the  
7 rent roll into the account for the duration of the  
8 vacate. We need to continue holding bad landlords  
9 like Patesh accountable for their action or in this  
10 case, inaction. We can no longer allow them to  
11 displace their tenants on the taxpayers' dime. I  
12 urge my colleagues to sign onto Intro 30, and I thank  
13 Council Member Cornegy, the Chair of our Housing and  
14 Buildings for co-sponsoring. Thank you.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
16 Council Member Barron.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Madam  
18 Public Advocate. I just wanted to add my remarks on  
19 the passing of the great Dr. Wyatt T. Walker. He was  
20 a great person, and I just wanted to add my comments.  
21 Dr. Wyatt T. Walker was an ordained minister. He was  
22 a pastor of Canaan Baptist Church of Christ in  
23 Harlem. He was an advocate for human rights, and he  
24 was very much involved in the—in the boycotts, in  
25 fighting for affordable housing and improved

2 education. He was the Executive Director of the  
3 Southern Christian Leadership Conference-Conference.  
4 He was the confidante and right hand man of the Dr.  
5 Martin Luther King, Jr. He was a brilliant  
6 strategist. He was an excellent preacher. If you  
7 ever heard him, you would always recall that, and  
8 finally, one of his comments that he offered in terms  
9 of celebration of Dr. Martin Luther King's birthday  
10 was, It is insufficient for us to come together on  
11 his birthday. Sometimes in an artificial way, white  
12 and black together and saying "We shall overcome" and  
13 hold hands and get a warm feeling, and then go back  
14 to business as usual in a white racist America.  
15 Thank you.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member  
17 Treyger.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you Public  
19 Advocate. I'd like to take a moment to congratulate  
20 my colleague Antonio Reynoso, Brooklyn Delegation's  
21 new co-chair. I'm honored to be able to continue to  
22 serve as co-chair with him. I'd like to thank all of  
23 my colleagues as well for their support. I'd like to  
24 also mention some...some bills that we're introducing  
25 today. I'm very excited to re-introduce my bill that

2 would provide free diapers at childcare centers and  
3 domestic violence shelters. It's more expensive than  
4 ever to raise a family in our city and diapers are a  
5 costly necessity. Having clean diapers for your  
6 children is not a luxury, but it is a need. I'd like  
7 to—first, I'm very proud to have many colleagues on  
8 board as prime co-sponsors many of whom know first  
9 hand the high cost of diapers. Thanks to Council  
10 Members Ampry-Samuel, Rosenthal, Majority Leader  
11 Cumbo, Council Members Levin and Reynoso. I'll also  
12 turn your attention to Intro 377 where we will give  
13 New Yorkers a right to know about the sale of public  
14 sidewalks and streets before they turn over to  
15 private interest. I was shocked to learn that  
16 there's sales of public streets and sidewalks to  
17 public interest without the public knowing. We have  
18 a right to know before a sale is made, and why a sale  
19 is being made. Also, Intro 378. When we resurface  
20 our streets, it should be curb to curb. From some  
21 reason, the city of New York does not fix or repair  
22 curbs, which is a major safety hazard and risk  
23 particularly for our senior, and Intro 379, which  
24 would require communication between the Department of  
25 Transportation and utility companies. We have all

2 worked hard to get streets resurfaced only to see  
3 them ripped up by a utility company a day or a week  
4 afterwards, and we learn that there is no  
5 communication or a lack thereof between these  
6 entities. This bill would require greater  
7 communication between these partners. So we have the  
8 clean and safe streets that we deserve and there's  
9 better communication. [bell] With that, than you  
10 for your time.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
12 Council Member Koo.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you, Mr.—Madam  
14 Public Advocate and also the Speaker. I want to say  
15 this is indeed a progressive City Council. After  
16 eight years in the City Council, I progressed from  
17 second row to first row. [laughter] Thank you.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: That's it?  
19 [laughter]

20 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Give him an extra  
21 minute.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughter]  
23 Council Member Constantinides.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: I can't  
25 be as brief as Peter, and I don't have anything that

2 funny to say. I apologize. No, I don't know what to  
3 say, Peter, but I wan to--

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
5 [shushing for quiet]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: --call my  
7 colleagues' attention to two bills that I'm  
8 reintroducing today that will help expand--expand wind  
9 energy in New York City. We have a great solar map  
10 thanks to CUNY--to our friends at CUNY and others, but  
11 we don't have a good wind energy map. This would  
12 direct the city to create a map so we can map where  
13 good wind potential is so homeowners can look and see  
14 if wind energy is an opportunity for them to look for  
15 renewal sources. Our second bill Intro 50 would  
16 create basic standards for installation of wind  
17 turbines. Right now, if you want a wind turbine on  
18 your home, you have to go through the Department of  
19 Buildings and get a special permit, which is  
20 reinventing the wheel every single time. It  
21 shouldn't be that way. So, this bill will create  
22 basic standards of--of color, of noise, how to install  
23 it, or how to uninstall it. How to make sure that  
24 during a hurricane it is secured and not being able  
25 to be blown away. But in setting these basic

2 parameters, we're giving people a path to walk to  
3 renewable energy to make sure they can get away from  
4 fossil fuels and help us green our city and make it  
5 more sustainable. So, I hope my colleagues will sign  
6 on to both Intro 48 and Intro 50 today. Thank you.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
8 Council Member Cumbo.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Public  
10 Advocate. Just want to acknowledge that herstory  
11 continues to be made. We recently celebrated, but  
12 most importantly led a resistance march. In New York  
13 City, the Women's March brought together over 200,000  
14 women. In Los Angeles, 600,000 women. In Chicago,  
15 estimates of 300,000 and marchers also took place in  
16 Philadelphia where an estimated 50,000 women and men  
17 came out. In San Jose, 20,000; in San Francisco, 50  
18 to 60,000; and all throughout London, Rome and other  
19 European cities. The Women's Movement and march has  
20 become stronger, more vibrant with greater  
21 participation and this resistance is going to  
22 continue to bring national attention to the  
23 challenges that we are facing as a nation. And we  
24 are moving together as one all across the world. I  
25 also want to bring attention to our World to Job Day.

2 As the leader of the free world No. 45 has supposed  
3 to exemplify American ideals and ways of life.  
4 Instead, he has utilized he has utilized his global  
5 platform to perpetuate hate and a lack of tolerance  
6 and respect for others. On World to Job Day, which  
7 is observed annually on February 1 in 140 countries  
8 we will stand in solidarity with Muslim women and  
9 men—Excuse me, Muslim women of all ages to celebrate  
10 their faith, identify, community, modest lifestyle,  
11 beauty and invaluable contributions to the culture of  
12 our community. I will be wearing a hijab tomorrow,  
13 and I hope that women on February 1<sup>st</sup> will also do  
14 the same. In my district we've an incredible loss to  
15 our community, Dr. Sam Penn. Many of you may know  
16 him. He is the founder of the Fort Greene Council  
17 that has provided incredible services for our seniors  
18 as well as our children. Many of you may know him.  
19 He has been here to advocate. He even had a partial  
20 stroke on the way here to advocate for his senior  
21 center and day care center at 966-972 Fulton Street.  
22 [bell] So, we honor him and we honor his legacy and  
23 all that he has contributed to our community.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,  
25 Majority Leader.



2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Madam Public Advocate,  
3 before we go to the last speaker, I was remiss  
4 [coughs] I didn't know until it was just flagged for  
5 me. We also have another very valuable staff member  
6 here at the Council whose last day it is today,  
7 someone who's been with us for 15 years since 2002  
8 from the Great Borough of Brooklyn, Policy Analyst on  
9 the Youth Services Committee, and he's served a  
10 variety of committees in the Legislative Division. I  
11 want to give a big round of applause and thank  
12 Michael Benjamin for his service at the Council He's  
13 standing in the back of the room. [applause] Thank  
14 you, Michael.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member  
16 Steven Levine.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very  
18 much, Madam Public Advocate. My colleagues, I have a  
19 bunch of bills that I'm reintroducing if you could  
20 take a look at them, I'd appreciate it, and I just  
21 want to also congratulate my friend Ben Kallos on  
22 becoming a father later this week. Congratulations  
23 Ben. Sleep now. Okay. [laughter] Thank you. Thank  
24 you very much, Madam Public Advocate.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And lastly--  
3 [background comments] Oh, Council Member Eugene.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very  
5 much, Madam Public Advocate. I'm going to be very  
6 brief. I just want to take the opportunity also to  
7 thank Michael Benjamin. You have done a remarkable  
8 job. I was the Chair of the Youth Services  
9 Committee. Thank you for you advice of that, you're  
10 your communication where those are making a lot of  
11 purpose and serve the young people of New York. We  
12 all know that the young people of New York they  
13 deserve the best that we can provide as a city, and  
14 we were able to do a lot of work. We were able to  
15 really improve the quality of life of the young  
16 people, offer them a lot of opportunities and  
17 resources for them to grow up and become positive  
18 citizens. All that we—we do because of the  
19 contribution of Michael. Michael, on behalf of all  
20 the members of the Youth Services Committee, on  
21 behalf of the young people, on behalf of their  
22 parents and also on behalf of the good city of New  
23 York and the City Council, thank you very much and  
24 God bless you.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

3 Seeing none other and now to close, our Speaker Corey  
4 Johnson.

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Today's stated meeting  
6 is adjourned. Good night and goo luck. [gavel]

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date February 1, 2018