

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNTY STATED MEETING

----- X

DECEMBER 16, 2015
Start: 1:37 P.M.
Recess: 3:45 P.M.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: LATISHA JAMES
PUBLIC ADVOCATE

MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO
SPEAKER FOR THE COUNCIL

COUNCIL MEMBERS: MARIA DEL CARMEN ARROYO
JOSEPH BORELLI
FERNANDO CABRERA
MARGARET CHIN
ANDREW COHEN
COSTA CONSTANTINIDES
ROBERT CORNEGY JR.
ELIZABETH CROWLEY
LAURIE CUMBO
CHAIM DEUTSCH
DANIEL DROMM
RAFAEL ESPINAL
MATHIEU EUGENE
JULISSA FERRERAS-COPELAND
DANIEL GARODNICK
VINCENT GENTILE
VANESSA GIBSON

DAVID GREENFIELD
BARRY GRODENCHIK
COREY JOHNSON
BEN KALLOS
ANDY KING
PETER KOO
KAREN KOSLOWITZ
RORY LANCMAN
BRAD LANDER
STEPHEN LEVIN
MARK LEVINE
ALAN MAISEL
STEVEN MATTEO
DARLENE MEALY
CARLOS MENCHACA
ROSIE MENDEZ
I. DANEEK MILLER
ANNABEL PALMA
ANTONIO REYNOSO
DONOVAN RICHARDS
YDANIS RODRIGUEZ
DEBORAH ROSE
HELEN ROSENTHAL
RITCHIE TORRES
MARK TREYGER
ERIC ULRICH
JAMES VACCA
PAUL VALLONE
JAMES VAN BRAMER
RUBEN WILLS

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

2 SERGEANT OF ARMS: Ok can I have your
3 attention please, quiet on the floor please, quiet on
4 the floor. Can we have the cooperation of all the
5 Council Members please, can you please go to your
6 seats, nope were going to be taking the picture at
7 your seat from up front. Please take you seat so we
8 can get stared please. Ladies and gentlemen up in
9 the balcony put those signs down for now please.
10 Please put all those signs down, put those signs
11 down, thank you. Please have a seat in the balcony.
12 Take a seat in the balcony please.

13 [pause]

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Can't remember
15 the last time we did a class picture, so thank you
16 all.

17 SERGEANT OF ARMS: Ok ladies and
18 gentlemen can I have your attention again please at
19 this time please place all cell phones, all cell
20 phones and electronic devices to vibrate, please
21 place all cell phones and electronic devices to
22 vibrate. Will all non-council employees, non-council
23 employees at this time please leave the main floor of
24 the Chambers, thank you.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

5

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
3 Chambers please, all rise for the pledge of
4 allegiance.

5 [pledge of allegiance]

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated
7 roll call. Quiet in the Chambers.

8 CLERK: Arroyo

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Here.

10 CLERK: Barron. Borelli

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Here.

12 CLERK: Cabrera.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.

14 CLERK: Chin.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

16 CLERK: Cohen.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

18 CLERK: Constantinides.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.

20 CLERK: Cornegy.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Here.

22 CLERK: Crowley. Cumbo.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Present.

24 CLERK: Deutsch.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Here.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

6

2 CLERK: Dickens. Dromm.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.

4 CLERK: Espinal.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.

6 CLERK: Eugene.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Present.

8 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND:

10 Present.

11 CLERK: Garodnick.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.

13 CLERK: Gentile. Gibson.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Present.

15 CLERK: Greenfield.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Here.

17 CLERK: Grodenchik.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Here.

19 CLERK: Johnson.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Present.

21 CLERK: Kallos.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

23 CLERK: King.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.

25 CLERK: Koo.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

7

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

3 CLERK: Koslowitz.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

5 CLERK: Lancman.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.

7 CLERK: Lander.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.

9 CLERK: Levin.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.

11 CLERK: Levine.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

13 CLERK: Maisel.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.

15 CLERK: Mealy.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Present.

17 CLERK: Menchaca.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Present.

19 CLERK: Mendez.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.

21 CLERK: Miller.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Here.

23 CLERK: Palma.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Here.

25 CLERK: Reynoso.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

8

2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Here.

3 CLERK: Richards.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

5 CLERK: Rodriguez.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Here.

7 CLERK: Rose.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.

9 CLERK: Rosenthal.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.

11 CLERK: Torres.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Here.

13 CLERK: Treyger.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.

15 CLERK: Ulrich.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Here.

17 CLERK: Vacca.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.

19 CLERK: Vallone.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

21 CLERK: Williams.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.

23 CLERK: Wills.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Present.

25 CLERK: Matteo.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Here.

3 CLERK: Van Brammer.

4 MAJORITY LEADER VAN BRAMMER: Here.

5 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO:

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
8 Chambers please, all rise. Please remove your caps.
9 We're going to have invocation delivered by Reverend
10 Deborah Jenkins, the Pastor of Faith at Work
11 Christian Church, 177 Dreiser Loop in the Bronx.

12 REVEREND JENKINS: To the Speaker, to our
13 Public Advocate, to the entire City Council. I bring
14 greeting from District 12 where our Council Member is
15 Andy King and I also bring blessings. Let us pray.
16 Heavenly father we thank you for this opportunity to
17 end out another full years work on behalf of the
18 residents of New York City. From Staten Island,
19 Queens, Brooklyn, Manhattan, The Bronx, we have
20 unified around one central truth and that is that all
21 New Yorkers deserve the very best and we are
22 confident that we have elected those who will work
23 hard for our on our behalf. We are thankful that in
24 a time of great division our Council stands united
25 around all people, seeing no one as another but

2 seeing all as one. We thank you for the spirit that
3 we find ourselves in and this 4th week of advent as
4 we march to a celebration the celebration of the baby
5 Jesus's birth, we know that you brought love Jesus
6 and that love extends beyond those who call
7 themselves by your name but to all those that God
8 created. We are all your created God and we say to
9 our City, to our Nations that we stand with all our
10 brothers and sisters who would otherwise be called
11 others and we say that we know that in the spirit of
12 the love of Jesus Christ there is hope for unity even
13 now. We ask that the work that they are ending today
14 will continue and be even greater in the year 2016.
15 We ask that as constitutes we will come together to
16 continue to share with them what we need to have them
17 do on our behalves to make our community stronger, to
18 make our City greater that we might continue to be a
19 leader throughout this Nation and even the World.
20 These are the things that we pray in the precious
21 name of the one whose birth we celebrate soon, Jesus,
22 amen.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amen, please be
24 seated. A motion to spread the invocation. Quiet in
25 the Chambers please. Quiet may we have order in the

2 Chambers, order in the balcony please, quiet in the
3 balcony. A motion to spread the invocation in full
4 upon the record Council Member Andy King.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: All rise a motion
6 to spread the invocation in full upon the record.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Excuse me Council
8 Member King, may we have quiet in the Chambers
9 please. Quiet, I apologize.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: All rise to Stated
11 Meeting to bring motion to spread the invocation in
12 full upon the record from Pastor Deborah Jenkins,
13 Faith at Work Christian Works in the Bronx. She has
14 been a (inaudible) in our community. From the many
15 years of her service as a ASC worker to the Lord
16 called her to serve all of the Bronx and as well as
17 New York. I want to say thank her for coming down.
18 I want to thank each every one of us for receiving
19 her and her message that's been filtered through her
20 through Christ and I ask you all to receive this
21 message and this invocation from Pastor Jenkins this
22 day's Stated Meeting, Amen.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
24 Adoption of minutes Council Member Palma. Motion that
25 the minutes of the Stated Meeting of November 24th be

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 12

2 approved. Thank you. Messages and papers from the
3 Mayor.

4 CLERK: Pre-considered M354 submitting
5 Hope Knight for appointment to the City's Planning
6 Commission.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Rules, Privileges
8 and Elections.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication
10 from City, County and Borough Offices.

11 CLERK: Pre-considered M355, expense
12 budget.

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Finance.

14 CLERK: Pre-considered M356, revenue
15 budget.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Finance.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and
18 communications.

19 CLERK: None.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use call
21 ups.

22 CLERK: M357 to M359.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Roll call.

24 CLERK: Arroyo

25 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Aye.

2 CLERK: Barron. Borelli

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye.

4 CLERK: Cabrera.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye.

6 CLERK: Chin.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.

8 CLERK: Cohen.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

10 CLERK: Constantinides.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye.

12 CLERK: Cornegy.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.

14 CLERK: Crowley. Cumbo.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I vote Aye.

16 CLERK: Deutsch.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye.

18 CLERK: Dromm.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

20 CLERK: Espinal.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.

22 CLERK: Eugene.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.

24 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

25

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 14
2 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: I vote
3 Aye.
4 CLERK: Garodnick.
5 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.
6 CLERK: Gentile.
7 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye.
8 CLERK: Gibson.
9 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Aye.
10 CLERK: Greenfield. Grodenchik.
11 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.
12 CLERK: Johnson.
13 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Aye.
14 CLERK: Kallos.
15 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.
16 CLERK: King.
17 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye.
18 CLERK: Koo.
19 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.
20 CLERK: Koslowitz.
21 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.
22 CLERK: Lancman.
23 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.
24 CLERK: Lander. Levin. Levine.
25 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.

2 CLERK: Maisel.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Aye.

4 CLERK: Mealy.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye.

6 CLERK: Menchaca.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye.

8 CLERK: Mendez.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.

10 CLERK: Miller.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I vote Aye.

12 CLERK: Palma.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.

14 CLERK: Reynoso.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.

16 CLERK: Richards.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.

18 CLERK: Rodriguez.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

20 CLERK: Rose.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

22 CLERK: Rosenthal.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye.

24 CLERK: Torres. Treyger.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

2 CLERK: Ulrich.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I vote Aye and ask
4 for unanimous consent to vote on all Land Use items
5 and general order calendar.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you I vote
8 aye.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

10 CLERK: Vacca.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Aye.

12 CLERK: Vallone.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye.

14 CLERK: Williams. Wills.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Aye.

16 CLERK: Matteo. Van Brammer.

17 MAJORITY LEADER VAN BRAMMER: Aye.

18 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Aye.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

21 Today's Land Use call ups are adopted by a vote of 42
22 in the affirmative, and 0 in the negative. Quiet in
23 the Chambers please and now will hear communication
24 from Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito.

25

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Madam
3 Public Advocate and I want to say good afternoon to
4 all my colleagues. I want to ask everyone to please
5 stand for a moment.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All rise.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Were here today
8 obviously in friendship and kinship and were going to
9 be going on later on to have our holiday celebration
10 but it is with a very heavy heart that we are here
11 also to recognize that last week the Council lost a
12 member of our staff. I know a lot of her colleagues
13 are here with us today. I want to recognize that
14 they've joined us in this Chamber. Savina Derinzo
15 (sp) of the Administrative Service Division passed
16 away on Friday. Savina joined the Council in 2001
17 where she administered and coordinated with the
18 Mayor's office and our Commission to set up tours of
19 City Hall. She oversaw the day to day facility
20 management for this City Council. She is survived by
21 her children; Anthony, Samantha and Vincent. Our
22 thoughts and prayers are with the family. This
23 definitely always is hard the death of a loved one in
24 particular times like this, so we definitely extend
25 our thoughts and prayers to her family, to the loved

2 ones, to her colleagues, all of us here in the
3 Council mourn her loss, I want to ask everyone to
4 please join me in a moment of silence for Savina.

5 [moment of silence]

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you my
7 colleagues. Today we're going to voting on two bills
8 to improve compliance with our City's open data laws.
9 Agencies are required to post much of their data on
10 the open data portal but too often data is so left
11 out. For example, until recently data on millions of
12 yellow taxi trips were available to individuals
13 through a freedom of information law request but not
14 to the wider public on the open data portal. Thanks
15 to the efforts of Council Member Vacca and diligent
16 staff, that data and other missing data are now
17 available to the public. But with these two bills
18 were helping agencies better identify their own
19 public data sets. This Council remains committed to
20 making government as assessable and transparent to
21 New Yorkers as possible. On the staff end I want to
22 thank Brad Reed, Ken Grace, Nathaniel Toth, Jeffery
23 Baker and Ed Adkins and I'd like to ask Council
24 Member Vacca to say a few words followed by Council
25 Member Palma.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Thank you Madame
3 Speaker and with the passage of these 2 bills today
4 and the 5 bills we passed 3 weeks ago concerning open
5 data. We in this Council have made a significant
6 contribution to increase transparency and today to
7 further assure accountability. The legislation I
8 have introduced concerns accountability, making sure
9 that City Agencies are not only posting information
10 as they should but that there's also an aspect where
11 there can be enforcement and compliance with open
12 data regulations so that the public is assured that
13 they are getting online as much information as they
14 should be getting under the law concerning City's
15 policies, complaints and programs and anything in the
16 open data portal that concerns statistics,
17 information and transparency. So this represents the
18 7th bill in pass 3 weeks that the Technology
19 Committee has put together concerning open data, I
20 want to thank the Speaker, I want to thank the
21 Speaker, I want to thank Brad Reid our Committee
22 Counsel and Stacy Gardner, my Deputy Chief of Staff
23 especially. I do want to acknowledge very honestly
24 that these open data bills are not really sexy but I
25 will say that these bills today are a little more

2 exciting then what we passed 3 weeks ago. They don't
3 reach the top 10 hippary threshold but I think that
4 we're doing governments works and governments work is
5 often not excitable and it's often not really
6 controversial but I think that were doing what should
7 be done and I think that were setting a... a... a... pace
8 that perhaps other governments throughout the State
9 and throughout the Country will look to replicate in
10 the years ahead. Thank you Madame Public Advocate.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Council
12 Member, Council Member Palma. Well congratulations on
13 the bill. Next the Council will be voting on the Land
14 Use proposal to develop the Brooklyn Heights Public
15 Library. This is a proposal that will strengthen
16 Brooklyn public library system as a whole while
17 providing much needed updates to branch in a growing
18 neighborhood. This project will deliver a much
19 needed \$40 million infusion into the library system
20 to address needs across the Borough while also
21 building a new state of the art branch library in
22 Brooklyn Heights and a new library for the Dumbo
23 Vinegar Hill Farrigot houses neighborhood.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet, quiet in
25 the balcony please, quiet in the balcony.

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I want to
3 congratulate Council Member Levin on all of his hard
4 work. I know he's really, really took this seriously
5 and drove a hard bargain on behalf of his
6 constituents. On the staff side before I allow
7 Council Member Levin to speak is Brian Paul, Dylan
8 Casey and Amy Levightan, thank you for your hard work
9 and Council Member Levin if you want to say a few
10 words.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very
12 much Madame Speaker. I want to thank you as well as
13 our Land Use Chair, David Greenfield, our
14 Subcommittee Chair, temporary Subcommittee Chair Andy
15 Cohen and Subcommittee Chair Inez Dickens as well as
16 our Land Use staff Roger Mann, Brian Paul, Amy
17 Levightan, Dylan Casey. My staff Glomani Bravo-Lopez
18 and especially Rami Metal, my Chief of Staff and
19 Deputy Chief of Staff, Casey Adams. I want to also
20 acknowledge our partners in the de Blasio
21 administration for helping in negotiating this
22 project as well as the Brooklyn Public Library
23 leadership, Ms. Johnson, David Wallace and all of
24 their staff as well as the library board and David
25 Cramer and Hudson Companies for working with us.

2 Ladies and gentlemen this has been a very difficult
3 process. It has been a very controversial project
4 and... and it has a lot of people have taken a lot of
5 time and effort to... to put in their opinion on the
6 matter and to work hard, including those that are
7 here today to oppose this vote. I want to thank
8 everybody who has put in all their time including
9 citizens for the defending libraries, including the
10 Brooklyn Heights Association and... and everybody that
11 has taken the time to work on this. This project as
12 presented today is a significantly better project
13 then was initially proposed. I'm not going to go
14 through all of the details but I will hit the main
15 points. The project when proposed was roughly 21,500
16 square feet for a library space through the Councils
17 negotiations we have expanded that to 26,500 square
18 feet and in addition for the very first time since
19 1983 we will be having a new library branch in the
20 Borough of Brooklyn in the neighborhood of Dumbo
21 Vinegar Hill and Farrigat, that is very first new
22 neighborhood branch, roughly about 5,00 square feet
23 but the first neighborhood branch since 1983 and that
24 is significate. In addition, the... the new library in
25 Brooklyn Heights will have 3,000 square feet

2 dedicated to extensive business and career services,
3 significate business career services. That will be a
4 significate upgrade for what is there currently.
5 Business and career services that are geared towards
6 a new economy in the 21st century and will be
7 available as part of and hopefully link into the
8 Brooklyn Tech Triangle which include Dumbo, the
9 Brooklyn Navy Yard and Downtown Brooklyn. In
10 addition, the developer the City Department of
11 Education have also agreed to a new 9,00 square foot
12 STEM lab that will available to students primarily in
13 district 13 but maybe available to students
14 throughout the City and this is a first in New York
15 City, the first time that we have dedicated state of
16 the art STEM lab and were going to be working with
17 the Department of Education to find best practices
18 throughout the County to have this be an innovative
19 and State of the art and cutting edge facility.
20 We're very excited about that opportunity as well.
21 In addition, we have negotiated so that the maximum
22 area medium income... income limit for this development
23 for the affordable units in this development will
24 maximize at 125% of AMI. Prior to this they were at
25 165% of AMI and we have negotiated that would not

2 exceed 125% of AMI in addition to the 80% AMI and 60%
3 of AMI affordable units and two other points I want
4 to mention, one is that the programming here at
5 Brooklyn Public Library in Brooklyn Heights will now
6 be 7 days a week so long as there is 7 day week
7 service at any of the neighborhood branches in
8 Brooklyn. This branch will have 7 day a week service
9 with as robust programming as exist throughout the
10 entire system and lastly as a matter of public policy
11 in... in... in looking toward what is right value for
12 this property, we have introduced a participation
13 clause so that if the developer exceeds a profit
14 equal to or more than 19% of an internal rate of
15 return that 25% of that profit above that 19% IRR
16 will be recaptured by the Brooklyn Public Library
17 system. There's a small (inaudible) and that will be
18 less \$1.5 million to help lower the AMI's but beyond
19 that what that is saying is that if the developer
20 does very well on this project and it makes a
21 significant profit, then the City will realize a
22 portion of that profit. And lastly ladies and
23 gentlemen I just want to acknowledge two people that
24 are here today in the audience that did have big
25 influence on me and how I approached this project and

2 that Rachel and Oldest who are the two librarians of
3 Brooklyn Public Library in the Brooklyn Heights
4 branch and unsolicited and... and not in any way as a
5 political endeavor, they encouraged me to vote in
6 favor of this based strictly on a library from a
7 library perspective. They as librarians know the
8 work that they do, they know it better than anybody
9 else and they both see this as an opportunity to
10 better the services for the people that they work
11 with every single day and so you know I couldn't ask
12 for a more informed group of people to advise me on
13 this and I want to just thank them for their input
14 and thank you all very much and I encourage my
15 colleagues to vote aye.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Council
17 Member and congratulations. Today we're also voting
18 on two bills, the bills on our efforts to make City
19 streets safer for pedestrians, cyclist and motorist.
20 This session we've passed 20 bills aimed at
21 increasing safety through our vision 0 initiatives
22 and today were building on that with two bills
23 focused on hit and run crashes. Eliminating hit and
24 run crashes is one of the biggest and most important
25 challenges we face as part of vision zero. This year

2 there were over 38,000 hit in runs in New York City.
3 More than 4,000 times a driver fled the scene after
4 injuring another person and 29 times this year the
5 driver fatally struck another person a left the scene
6 without contacting the police or getting their victim
7 help. These numbers are staggering and simply
8 unacceptable, so the Council is doing everything in
9 its power to put an end to those avoidable tragedies.
10 One of these bills will significantly increase the
11 civil penalties for leaving the scene of a traffic
12 collision. The other bill will require the New York
13 Police Department to provide a quarterly report on
14 the number of hit and run incidents so we can track
15 the progress that were making in reducing the number
16 of hit in runs in our city. Our goal under vision
17 zero has been to reduce the number or traffic
18 fatalities in New York to zero. As I said when we
19 passed our first package of vision zero bills last
20 year, this won't be something we can achieve
21 overnight. In achieving our goal will require
22 ongoing diligence. With these two bills were taking
23 the next step towards making our streets safer for
24 everyone and in the year to come, will continue to
25 look for ways to improve street safety across the 5

2 Boroughs. I want to thank Kelly Taylor, Gufar Zaylof
3 (sp), Jonathan Masorino (sp), (inaudible) and Lyle
4 Frank for all of their work on this and now I will
5 ask our Majority Leader Jimmy Van Brammer, the lead
6 sponsor to say a few words and then followed by our
7 Transportation Chair Ydanis Rodriguez.

8 MAJORITY LEADER VAN BRAMMER: Thank you
9 very much Madame Speaker indeed we are passing two
10 very important pieces of legislations that I'm
11 extremely proud to sponsor along with our
12 Transportation Committee Chair, Ydanis Rodriguez. I
13 want to direct all of our colleagues attention to the
14 front of the room where Ms. Martha Puntacahas (sp) is
15 here once again to honor the life of her son, Louis
16 Bravo a 19 year old young man full of life who was
17 killed when a car struck him in Woodside Queens, the
18 person who hit Louis Bravo left the scene of that
19 crash and Martha has been an inspiration to me and to
20 so many of us continuing to press for justice for her
21 son and for all of the victims of crashes in New York
22 City. At our Committee hearing last week the number
23 was revealed for the first time, nearly 40,000 hit
24 and runs this year alone so far. 4,000 hit and run
25 crashes that involve another human being which means

2 that over 4,000 this year alone someone hit another
3 human being with their car, knew they hit someone and
4 left the scene of that crash. That is unforgivable
5 and unacceptable. So today we pass two pieces of
6 legislation; Intro. 603 which will establish the most
7 severe civil penalties, the most severe that we can
8 as a City Council install, \$20,000 when the life is
9 taken by a repeat hit and run driver and were going
10 to pass Intro. 604 which is going to increase
11 significantly the reporting requirement from the NYPD
12 so now that the quarterly reports on serious hit and
13 runs investigated by the Collision Investigation
14 Squad will now include information on how often the
15 NYPD issues a notice of violation for civil
16 penalties. The public will also receive annual
17 reports on a number of property damage hit and run
18 complaints, the number of hit and run crashes
19 resulting in injury and how many of those cases
20 resulted in arrest. And just in case there are some
21 folks who wonder if they are repeat hit and run
22 drivers and how many could there be, I offer the case
23 of Jack Montobono (sp) a driver who hit and killed a
24 pedestrian in 2013 at an intersection in Manhattan
25 only to know that, that driver hit and killed a

2 pedestrian at the exact same intersection in 2008,
3 that driver killed two people at the same
4 intersection 5 years apart, left the scene of the
5 crash in both cases, that driver was subsequently
6 arrested a 3rd time after leaving the scene of a
7 crash while driving while intoxicated. So this is a
8 very serious... serious issue, I'm proud that we passed
9 two bills last year and that we come back again to
10 strengthen the hit and run victims act and I want to
11 recognize all of the staff, Matt Wallace my Chief of
12 Staff, Steven Miller, my Legislative and Budget
13 Director, Jason (inaudible) my Deputy Chief of Staff,
14 Kelly Taylor and Jonothan Masorino from the
15 Transportation Committee. This is not meant to put a
16 value on a life, we could never do that, but we can
17 make a statement that we will not tolerate this in
18 those who committee these heinous acts will be
19 punished to the fullest extent of the law. Now
20 Martha whose become a friend of ours, her primary
21 language is Spanish so allow me to say a few words
22 about Martha in espaniol.

23 [speaking Spanish]

24 MAJORITY LEADER VAN BRAMMER: Thank you.

25

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you
3 Majority Leader. I'm going to ask the Chair of the
4 Transportation Committee, Ydanis Rodriguez to say a
5 few words.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: First I would
7 like to say that a driver who hits someone and leave
8 the scene knowing that, that person is bleeding
9 because he or she doesn't have medical attention is
10 not indifferent from act of terrorist and I think
11 that we need to ask the State to provide more tools
12 so that the DA will be able to prosecute every
13 irresponsible driver that every week take the life
14 away of a family who will never see that person
15 coming back home. It's one person per week that is
16 dying in the street of New York because of hit and
17 run. Hit and run is epidemic that a Council lead by
18 Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito, my colleagues, Mayor
19 de Blasio and his administration our determine to
20 eradicate. Members of the Transportation Committee
21 were shocked two weeks ago to hear that there have
22 been nearly 40,000 hit and run crashes on our
23 streets. 4,000 of which injured a pedestrian,
24 cyclist or other driver. With Intro. 603 and 604
25 passing today, we expect the NYD to be more diligent

2 in pursuing open cases and holding accountable those
3 who commit the awful crime of leaving others to die
4 as they speed away. We also want to let hit and run
5 drivers know when the NYPD find you, you will be
6 paying more now than ever before. This penalty can
7 reach up to \$20,000 so we urge you to think twice
8 before fleeing the scene by increasing this penalty
9 we also know that there's no money that can bring
10 back the life of the loved one. I also want to
11 express to our partners and government at the State
12 level we take action today because there continue to
13 persist loophole that make no sense in our criminal
14 law. I ask that you focus on increasing criminal
15 penalties to hit and run violations so that drunk
16 drivers do not have an incentive to flee the scene of
17 a crash as they now do. I want to dedicate this bill
18 to many families of victims who have suffered
19 preventable tragedies and pray that Ms. Orvanya
20 Nelson(sp) a victim of a hit and run crash this pass
21 Sunday where she saved the life of her 5 year old
22 niece by sacrificing also fully recover from her
23 injuries and that the person who hit her suffered the
24 full force of the law and also we are with you
25 Martha, thank you Speaker.

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Ydanis
3 and I apologize going back to the issue of the, of
4 the rezoning I want to ask the Chair of the Land Use
5 Committee David Greendfield to say a few words.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you
7 Madame Speaker and I ask the Speaker to give me some
8 time from her time to weigh in today. I don't always
9 weigh in on these projects in a public way but I
10 thought it was important as the Chair of the Land Use
11 Committee to clarify some issue especially
12 considering the reaction that we've had here today.
13 I think it's important to put in context what's
14 happening today with the Brooklyn Library. The first
15 think to understand is that the reality is that our
16 public library are underfunded and have been for
17 decades and so the Brooklyn Public Library have a
18 very practical problem which is that libraries across
19 Brooklyn are crumbling and they need the resources to
20 pay for it and they simply cannot hope and pray those
21 resources are going to fall from the sky and as a
22 result there engaging in a process which is an
23 innovative process that will provide them with a
24 least \$40 million in new funding to improve and to
25 quite frankly to build new library in other members

2 districts throughout Brooklyn. We have tradition
3 here of allowing Council Members to speak and we're
4 certainly happy to hear you afterwards but we'd
5 respect that you hope that you'd respect us as well,
6 thank you. And so the reality is that the Brooklyn
7 Public Library has to engage in this process in order
8 to help libraries throughout Brooklyn. So once you
9 start from that prospective you then have to look at
10 the question of what's happening, it's important to
11 note and I think this is a miss (inaudible) because
12 I've gotten tweets and emails about this as well as,
13 there's a missed impression being put out there as if
14 thought the library is selling the library and
15 closing it down and not replacing it and now of that
16 is true, the reality is that under the deal that
17 Council Member Steve Levin has negotiated and I have
18 to tell you that I've been involved in dozens of
19 deals in the two years that I've been Chair of the
20 Land Use Committee and this may be one of the best
21 deals that we've ever had thanks to the intervention
22 and the insistence of Council Member Levin. There is
23 going to be a brand new library in that location. It
24 will be a newer better library. There will also be
25 another library in Council Member Levin's district,

2 there will be more money for the library assistant.
3 There will be more programming at those libraries.
4 There will be more service at those libraries. There
5 will also be an addition STEM funding, more
6 affordability and more affordable housing. I respect
7 opposition and I want those who oppose the deal to
8 know that as a result of your insistence this has
9 become a better deal. It is not always a zero sum
10 game about win or lose and you shouldn't look at it
11 that way. You had complaints, you had concern, your
12 Council Member took those into consideration and
13 worked 18 hours a day for the last few weeks to try
14 to address as many of those as possible and because
15 of Council Member Steve Levin we have a much better
16 deal. It's a good deal for the community, it's a
17 good deal for Brooklyn, it's a good deal for the City
18 of New York and I want to thank Council Member Levin
19 for his leadership and for working hard to make sure
20 that this is the best deal that New York City and
21 get, thank you very much.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Yes and...

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet, quiet in
24 the balcony we will not tolerate out bust.

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Yeah no out bust
3 and again thank you Council Member Greenfield and
4 congratulations to Council Member Levin. We also
5 know that ULURP processes can get a little
6 contentious in our district but we do the best that
7 we can and in the interest of our constitutes and
8 Council Member Levin has done an exemplary job of
9 really striking a very good balance here and bringing
10 a lot of resources back to his constitutes into his
11 community so he is to be commended, thank you. And
12 finally today were going to be strengthening our City
13 Human Rights law with a bill that make caregivers a
14 protected class, protecting them from workplace
15 discrimination. Caregiver status would apply to
16 anyone who primarily responsible for caring for a
17 child or a disabled adults. This is a bill I
18 committed to passing in February during my State of
19 the City Address because we can never stop working
20 toward our goal of creating more equality and justice
21 for everyone in New York City. Caregivers make
22 personal sacrifices to improve the lives of their
23 loved ones and they shouldn't have to face
24 discrimination from employers or prospective
25 employers because of this. New York City is a place

2 where no one should be denied their rights. With
3 today's bill were taking another step toward that and
4 letting those who care for others know that we have
5 their backs. I want to thank Council Member Rose who
6 has been consistent and very diligent on this issue
7 for her leadership. She is the sponsor of this bill
8 and I would ask Council Member Rose to say a few
9 words.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you Speaker
11 Mark-Viverito. I am really excited to address you
12 today as the Council votes on Intro. 108-A, the
13 Caregivers Discrimination Bill which will prohibit
14 employment discrimination based on an individual's
15 actual or perceived status as a caregiver. Thank you
16 to Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito for highlighting
17 this bill in her State of the City Address earlier
18 this year and working to ensure it's passage. Thank
19 you to Chair Mealy for her support and moving this
20 bill along and to the legislative Council Alesha
21 Brown, Policy Analyst, Rachel Cordero and Finance
22 Staff, Eisha Wright for their hard and diligent work
23 on this legislation. Further thanks to my tireless
24 Council and Legislative and Budget Director, Edwina
25 Martin for all of her help in bringing this vital

2 legislation to the floor. I also wish to thank A
3 Better Balance, AARP and the New York City
4 Progressive Caucus, Co-Chaired by Council Members
5 Reynoso and Richards and all of the advocates who
6 worked so hard to bring us to this point. Last but
7 not least I want to thank Borough, Manhattan Borough
8 President Gail Brewer. We have been working together
9 for many years to get this bill to this point.
10 Thanks as well to her Director of Policy and Special
11 Projects, Shulamet Warren, for her dedication to this
12 cause. Truly it takes a village to create and pass a
13 bill so many worked on this legislation because it
14 will have a dramatic impact on many, many New
15 Yorkers. I've pushed for this because I believe that
16 no worker should face negative consequences at work
17 because of their familiar responsibilities. The
18 reality is that many workers juggle responsibilities
19 of work and of caring for children or other family
20 members. Many workers are afraid of losing their
21 jobs because of their family responsibilities. In
22 our City the majority of parents including mothers of
23 young children are in the workforce. The population
24 of disabled elderly adults is projected to grow
25 significantly in the next 20 years. And the

2 responsibility for their care will fall predominately
3 on people who are in the workforce. I have
4 personally experienced the difficulty of balancing
5 work and caregiving and it is especially true for
6 those of us who find us to be a part of the sandwich
7 generation, taking care of children and elderly
8 parents at the same time. Intro. 108-A will protect
9 caregivers from being treated differently than their
10 colleagues who are not caregivers. It would prevent
11 employers from discriminating against caregivers in
12 hiring, termination and providing compensation or
13 terms, conditions or privileges of employment. When
14 enacted, Intro. 108-A will be landmark legislation.
15 Highlighting once again why New York City remains to
16 be the best place to both work and live in the United
17 States and possibly in the World, thank you.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Council
19 Member. I want to focus on two things right now. You
20 know today for me personally it is a bitter sweet
21 day, it's a bitter sweet day, I'm really happy and
22 it's sweet because the Congress has finally included
23 Zadroga 911 Health and Compensation Programs in the
24 Congressional Omnibus Bill. This bill should give
25 right we should clap for that.

2 [clapping]

3 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: This bill will
4 give or 72,000 first responders and survivors in New
5 York City and around the Country long overdue piece
6 of mind knowing that they will have access to the
7 vital healthcare and support they need. So I want to
8 thank the New York Congressional Delegation, our
9 first responders, those who responded to the horrific
10 tragedy of 911 and terror attack, deserve to be
11 treated well and that is what that this bill has been
12 asking for and I'm glad to see if finally there. So
13 I want to thank the Congressional Delegation of New
14 York for championing this effort and for really being
15 strong, strong voice on behalf of our City. On the
16 bitter end today I'm extremely heartbroken. It is to
17 me unconscionable that Congressional Republicans
18 refused to include in the year-end spending bill
19 meaningful provisions to allow Puerto Rico to
20 restructure its debt. This is something that is very
21 personal to me. My mother continues to live on the
22 Island. There are many of us that have direct links
23 but this should be of concern to every single person.
24 This bill or including this provision in the Omnibus
25 but would not have cost taxpayers dime but could have

2 help solved what is rapidly decenter grading into
3 humanitarian crisis. Basic services are being
4 denied. Healthcare system is about to collapse,
5 doctors are fleeing the Island. That impacts every
6 Puerto Rican, every US citizen, the 3.5 million that
7 live on the Island. And I want to be clear about
8 something that some may consider controversial. The
9 reality is that the current territorial status of the
10 Island was not of our doing, yet 3.5 million US
11 citizens are being denied equal treatment, are being
12 penalized for territorial status that they had
13 nothing to do with, it's unconscionable. So I want
14 to thank this Council, I want thank you.

15 [speaking Spanish]

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We voted on 3
17 resolutions calling on Congress to face head on this
18 crisis. There were thousands of calls made. There
19 were people that lobbied in Washington. This is so
20 dyer that that it cannot continue to be ignored. I
21 want to thank the leadership of Speaker Pelosi, the
22 New York Congressional Delegation especial Senator
23 Shurmar and Gellibrand as well as Congress Members
24 (inaudible) Velasquez and Jose Serrano. Let me say
25 you know the Governor of Puerto Rico clearly has said

2 there's a \$900 million bill that is due January 1st
3 that the Island cannot pay unless (inaudible)
4 sacrifices, more austerity which has already been
5 implemented. That service is being denied to these US
6 citizens. No more austerity can be incurred; he
7 cannot pay \$900 million in debt as of January 1st.
8 This is very and I hope that the Governor has the
9 courage not to make that debt payment, not to make
10 that debt payment because the hedge funds are asking
11 for too much. So this is not the end of the fight,
12 were organized and ultimately we will prevail what we
13 are asking for is fairness and a chance to
14 restructure the debt so that the Island can get back
15 on its feet. I will not abandon Puerto Rico. I thank
16 you all for your support. Many of us will abandon
17 our brothers and sisters, our parents, our mothers,
18 our fathers in the time of their need, this is not
19 acceptable. And it is not an abstract concept, it is
20 very real, people are suffering and people will
21 continue to suffer, it's not going to get better,
22 it's going to get worse and many we needed to get to
23 that point to really understand how dyer this
24 situation will be, so I want to thank you all again
25 for your support but it is something that really

2 breaks my heart today. The last thing also I just
3 want to say that turning to kind of another issue,
4 this is the last Stated Meeting of the year and I
5 know that we are going to be saying goodbye to a
6 couple of people. Lyle Frank from our legislative
7 division is leaving the Counsel to take office as a
8 Civil Court Judge and that is something that he has
9 been inspiring do for some time. So definitely we
10 send him a congratulation. Lyle has been serving
11 this Council for many years and was our Committee
12 Counsel back when I chaired the Parks Committee,
13 worked personally with him, I know this is something
14 he's been really wanting to do so he'll be serving in
15 another capacity of this great City of ours, so thank
16 you for that. His work has always been excellent, he
17 is committed, he's been a hard worker and I know he's
18 going to do a wonderful job as Judge and as I had
19 mention at a previous Stated Meeting, Council Member
20 Maria Del Carmen Arroyo will be leaving office at the
21 end of the year. I know we've been had lunch with
22 her today, she getting flowers, getting a lot of
23 support and congratulations for her commitment and
24 for her years of service. We're going to miss her as
25 well. 10 years or about almost 11 cause she came in

2 a special election, so we've served around the same
3 amount of time, so I know that she's has very
4 important matters, personal matters to take care of,
5 thank Maria for all of your service to this wonderful
6 City and to your district.

7 [clapping]

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: You said fellow...
9 fellow, alright fellow, not (inaudible) alright, oh
10 Maria you want to say a few words, yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Yes, thank you.
12 Yes she is a jolly good fellow. Thank you Madame
13 Speaker for that Melissa, gracias and I join you in
14 the pen that you described about Puerto Rico and I
15 said to Vanessa I would not cry, so I'm going to try
16 a little hard. I have had the privilege of
17 representing 17th district in the Bronx for almost 11
18 years. During these years I have met some of the most
19 outstanding public servants any City can ever have.
20 Whether in elected office, employs the City or State
21 Federal agencies or our community advocates who holds
22 us accountable and hold our feet to the fire and you
23 know what I mean. You all work so hard and give of
24 yourselves and I thank that most of our City
25 residents do not understand or could not appreciate

2 how dedicated and hardworking you all are. I
3 developed great relationships with many of you, some
4 who are not serving in this Council anymore and for
5 those of you who have my number, don't lose it and
6 please don't hesitate to use it if you need to. For
7 those of you who I have not had an opportunity to
8 develop a deeper relationship I recognize that it's
9 at my loss because you are all wonderful human beings
10 and I've served my community for many years and
11 you'll know and I've told you the stories privately,
12 I now have to focus on my family and I promised my
13 son Ricardo that I would quote Kenny Rodgers. You
14 got to know when the hold, you got to know when to
15 fold them and you got to know when to walk away,
16 thank you.

17 [cheers, clapping]

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: So thank you for
19 that Maria, I know the decision wasn't an easy one,
20 it's clearly it's the right one and so thank you
21 again for your service, so I want to wish a great
22 holiday season and happy new year to everyone. This
23 is again as we said our last Stated Meeting of the
24 year. I really look forward ahead to the next year

2 and have a great one everyone and that ends
3 communication from the speaker.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Will miss you
5 Council Member Arroyo. Now discussion of general
6 orders, Council Member Darlene Mealy.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Thank you I just
8 want to say I'm pleased to announce that on Monday
9 every member of the Committee on Civil Right voted to
10 support passing of Intro. 108-A, which will add
11 caregivers status as a protected class under the
12 City's Human Rights Law. This is a very landmark
13 legislation that will make sure that people are not
14 being treated differently just because they are
15 caregivers. It is even more important to protect
16 caregivers because studies have shown that
17 caregiver's responsibilities have a greater impact on
18 women, single mothers and families living in poverty.
19 The care recipient is a caregiver would mean anyone
20 who has a disability and relies on the caregiver for
21 medical care or to meet the needs of daily living and
22 is in a relationship with the caregiver as following:
23 caregivers child, including; children over the age
24 18, caregivers spouse, caregivers domestic partner,
25 caregivers parents; including a biological, foster,

2 stepchild, or adopted parent, a legal guardian of a
3 caregiver or a person who act as a caregivers parent
4 when the caregiver was a child, caregivers sibling;
5 including a brother, sister, half sibling, step-
6 sibling and sibling related through adoption,
7 caregiver grandchild or grandparent, the caregiver a
8 child or parent of the caregivers spouse or domestic
9 partner and individual who resides in the caregivers
10 household or any caregiver or any individual in a
11 familiar relationship with the caregiver as
12 designated by the New York City Commission on Human
13 Rights. It is our hope that all protected class
14 employees should.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
16 can you bring your comments to a close.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Caregivers
18 responsibility and I hope that this Council will
19 understand and appreciate the importance of this bill
20 and vote in favor of passing it today, thank you.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
22 Report of special Committees.

23 CLERK: None.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports of
25 standing Committees.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 47

2 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Civil
3 Rights Intro. 108-A, prohibiting employment
4 discrimination.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
6 coupled on general orders.

7 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
8 Finance, pre-considered Reso. 9304, organization
9 funding.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
11 general orders.

12 CLERK: Pre-considered M355 and Reso.
13 941, transfer of City funds.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on general
15 orders.

16 CLERK: Pre-considered M356 and Reso.
17 942, revenue budget.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
19 general orders.

20 CLERK: Pre-considered LU310 and Reso 943
21 through pre-considered LU 314 and Reso. 947.

22 SPEAKER MARK VIVERITO: Coupled on
23 general orders.

24 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Land
25 Use, LU301 and 302, One Clinton Street.

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Approved with
3 modifications and referred to the City Planning
4 Commission pursuant to rule 11.70B of the rules of
5 the Council in section 197D of the New York City
6 Charter.

7 CLERK: LU, excuse me LU 303 and Reso.
8 948 and LU 306 and Reso. 949, property tax
9 exemptions.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
11 general orders.

12 CLERK: LU3807 and Reso. 950, property
13 disposition.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled to be
15 filed pursuant to letter of withdrawal.

16 CLERK: Pre-considered LU319 and Reso.
17 951, new school facility Council district 38.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
19 general orders.

20 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Rules,
21 Privileges and Elections, pre-considered M354 and
22 Reso. 952 approving the appointment of Hope Knight,
23 Planning Commission.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
25 general orders.

2 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
3 Technology, Intro. 908-A, foil on the open data
4 portal.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
6 coupled on general orders.

7 CLERK: Intro. 916-A, open data law
8 agency compliance.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
10 coupled on general orders.

11 CLERK: Report of the Committee
12 Transportation, Intro. 603-A, penalties for leaving
13 the scene of an incident.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
15 coupled on general orders.

16 CLERK: Intro. 604-A, NYPD reporting
17 requirements.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
19 coupled on general orders.

20 CLERK: On the general order calendar, LU
21 301 and Reso. 953 and LU 302 and Reso. 954, One
22 Clinton Street.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
24 general orders.

2 CLERK: Resolution appointing varies
3 person commissioner of deeds.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
5 general orders and at this time I ask for roll call
6 on all items on the coupled general order calendar.

7 CLERK: Rodriguez.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye and I would
9 like, I would like to ask permission to vote Aye on
10 all general order.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

14 CLERK: Arroyo

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: For the last time
16 Aye on all.

17 CLERK: Borelli

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all.

19 CLERK: Cabrera.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye on all.

21 CLERK: Chin.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Permission to
23 explain my vote. I just wanted to congratulate all
24 my colleagues, Council Member Rose, Van Brammer,
25 Rodriguez and Vacca on the important legislation and

2 also congratulation to Council Member Levin. I know
3 it's been a tough time for you but congratulation and
4 a job well done and on Council Member Arroyo, thank
5 you so much for service and support and for your
6 leadership on the Black, Latino and Asian Caucus. For
7 all those meeting, we going to miss you but were
8 going to call and I vote Aye on all, thank you.

9 CLERK: Cohen.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

11 CLERK: Constantinides.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye on
13 all.

14 CLERK: Cornegy.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Permission to
16 explain my vote.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I just want to
19 thank Maria for her mentorship and even headed keel
20 during the LAC exec. I vote aye on all expect I'm
21 abstaining from 301 and 302.

22 CLERK: Crowley.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: If I can have
24 permission to vote on all Land Use items and I vote
25 aye on all calendar items and I'd like to thank

2 Council Member Arroyo for her many years of service
3 to this body and we will be missing you for sure,
4 thank you.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: And happy
7 holidays to all.

8 CLERK: Cumbo.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission to
10 explain my vote

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I want to first
13 start off by thanking Council Member Arroyo for being
14 unapologetically you. You are so inspirational and
15 you give all of us the confidence to be our authentic
16 selves so you will be missed and we certainly thank
17 you for your service to the Council and I know that
18 the Women's Caucus will also miss you because we are
19 15 strong and without the presence of you we are
20 certainly going to miss a strong team player but we
21 know you're not far. I also want to thank all of my
22 colleagues on the important legislation they've
23 passed. I want to thank Council Member Jimmy Van
24 Brammer, this legislation is so important where we to
25 have had these serious of incidents in our

2 communities and I know families will feel that much
3 more confident walking in the streets of New York
4 City. I also want thank Council Member Vacca,
5 Rodriguez and I also want to thank Council Member
6 Rose as Chair of the Women's Issues Committee, it's
7 so important that we give our caretakers our
8 caregivers all of the support and service that they
9 need to do their jobs as best they can. I also want
10 to take this time to congratulate Council Member
11 Steve Levin. I want to say to you over the last few
12 months I have watched as you have stood in the face
13 of adversity, you have been ridiculed, insulted,
14 threatened and even bashed in public hearings and
15 meetings and that is not the Brooklyn that I know and
16 that is not the Brooklyn that I love. You have stood
17 strong and have made this deal a better one. We
18 enter this with over \$300 billion capital deficit.
19 Under the leadership of Council Member Jimmy Van
20 Brammer we were able to start to turn that by putting
21 hundreds of million dollars to start the process of
22 turning that tide. No one ever wants to set a
23 precedent of selling or removing public assets but we
24 were spaced with a very serious issue in our
25 community. As a result of this deal and as a result

2 of this, my district will benefit with a 114 units of
3 affordable housing and hundreds of families will
4 benefit from that and I want to thank you Steve
5 because we have an affordable housing crisis in our
6 community with so many families not having an
7 opportunity to have a safe place to live.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
9 can you bring your comments to a close.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Yes ma'am and
11 you also deepen the affordable housing units so that
12 more people would have greater levels of
13 affordability. I also want to thank you and
14 conclusion with providing the opportunity for over \$4
15 million to get to the Walt Whittman Library which is
16 nestled in our public housing development a community
17 that has been underserved for so many years. So I
18 thank you for your courage, I thank you for your
19 bravery and I thank you for standing strong because
20 you had a difficult decision to make, thank you, I
21 vote aye.

22 CLERK: Deutsch.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Yeah Laurie took
24 all my time. I will be no on LU 301, 302 and aye on
25 the rest.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

3 CLERK: Dromm.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

5 CLERK: Espinal.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: With a big
7 congratulation to Steven Levin I vote aye.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

9 CLERK: Eugene.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Happy holidays to
11 everyone especially to the Speaker and Council Member
12 Arroyo. I vote aye.

13 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: Can I
15 have permission to explain my vote.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: I'd
18 like to congratulate Council Members Vacca, Rodriguez
19 and Rose but also acknowledge Majority Leader Van
20 Brammer for his legislation today. This past Monday
21 we buried in my district Avivo Hadimio (sp) who was a
22 17 year old that was crossing Junction Boulevard and
23 Northern Boulevard who was killed by a hit and run
24 and the person has still not been caught very much
25 like many families that don't find justice and 20

2 years prior to that on that very corner I lost my two
3 best friend and they were both 15 years old, so
4 clearly what we're doing here today is hoping that no
5 other 15 year old like I did or like the 15 year olds
6 that were at the funeral this past Monday should have
7 to relive that, so today we stand with those families
8 that have loss and we stand with the families that
9 will never see loss because of this legislation so I
10 thank you for your leadership. Council Member Levin
11 I know Land Use ULURP processes are not easy so I
12 want to congratulate you on that and Maria Arroyo
13 thank you so much for always showing us tenacity,
14 class and being able to say no with smile and keep it
15 moving, so I thank you so very much for that. To the
16 women of this Council you have given us a wonderful
17 kind of plan for us to be able to be even more
18 effective and efficient women leaders so gracias. I
19 vote aye.

20 CLERK: Garodnick.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Were going to
22 miss you around here Maria and I vote aye.

23 CLERK: Gentile.

24

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: With
3 congratulations to Council Member Levin and my best
4 wishes to Council Arroyo, I vote aye.

5 CLERK: Gibson.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to
7 explain my vote.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you, I want
10 to also congratulate Council Members Vacca,
11 Rodriguez, Majority Leader Van Brammer, Rose and
12 Mealy for the great work and passing legislation
13 today of critical importance. I also want to
14 recognize Council Member Steve Levin for always
15 pushing forward and being consistent and remaining
16 committed to a vision for his district and I too want
17 to join with all of us and just our heartfelt thanks
18 and gratitude to Council Member Arroyo, my
19 neighboring district in the Bronx, certainly a phone
20 call and a text away. Thank you for everything you
21 have done to make a difference in not only in your
22 district but the City of New York, we are truly
23 grateful for everything you've done and I know that
24 God is not done with you yet and you will still
25 continue to have a powerful voice in the Council

2 district that you have served for so long, I'm with
3 that I vote aye on all.

4 CLERK: Greenfield.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: May I explain
6 my vote.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you,
9 first I want to recognize the leadership and
10 outstanding work of our colleague, Council Member
11 Maria Del Carmen Arroyo, I have to say that you know
12 for those of you who watching at home but don't know
13 her, I think the best description is that she.. she is
14 the real thing, she's authentic, she tells you what's
15 on her mind and she really for me has earned my
16 everlasting respect by putting her family first and
17 that is something that is really I think we should
18 all learn from and I want to thank you for the work
19 that you've done and the leadership your showing by
20 making this decision and wish you the best of luck.
21 I also want to congratulate my colleagues on their
22 outstanding legislation in Council member Rose and
23 Van Brammer and Vacca and Rodriguez. I want to give
24 my enthusiastic endorsement to a nominee Hope Knight
25 for City Planning Commission. I've met with her and

2 spoke to her and she uniquely qualified for the
3 position and I hope that you all vote aye on that as
4 well. I also wanted to wish well to my scheduler
5 Alexandra Larkin who is leaving at the end of the
6 year to become Chief of Staff to Assembly Member Pam
7 Harris and I wish her a lot of luck and I want to
8 thank Alex for really outstanding work for several
9 years in my office and I want to wish everybody a
10 happy holidays, Merry Christmas, Happy New Year, I
11 vote aye on all call ups and aye on all items, thank
12 you.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

14 CLERK: Grodenchik.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.

16 CLERK: Johnson.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I want to say
18 that I'm really going to miss Maria, as she was my
19 predecessor in chairing the Health Committee and was
20 extraordinarily generous and kind in when I first
21 joined the Council and has just been a great
22 colleague and folks have said it but you can't really
23 say it enough. What you see is what you get with
24 Maria Arroyo. She is real and honest and authentic,
25 does not pull any punches and is completely down to

2 earth and deeply committed to public service so I'm
3 going reach her and I want to congratulate Steve
4 Levin, I... I know how hard he worked in negotiating
5 this application until the very, very last minute and
6 I think that he should be proud and his community
7 should be proud and I proudly vote aye on all.

8 CLERK: Kallos.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Permission to
10 explain my vote.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I just want to
13 thank Council Member Debbie Rose on behalf of all
14 caretakers. It's really hard to be a caretaker
15 working full time, you get home and you work full
16 time as caretaker and all of us need a little bit of
17 room to be a caretaker without having to face
18 discrimination by employers who would rather have
19 perfect employees with perfect lives and on behalf of
20 everyone who has somebody they need to take care of,
21 thank you Debbie Rose and to this Council for your
22 votes in favor of this it means so very much and
23 thank you to Maria Del Carmen Arroyo for your
24 service. You've been instrumental and showing those
25 who wish to come to the table how to play the game

2 right and I hope that you're able to find an ace that
3 you can keep. I vote aye on all.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 CLERK: King.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Permission to
7 explain my vote.

8 PUBLIC ADOVACTE JAMES: Yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: First I want to say
10 to my sister Maria in the Bronx it will never another
11 Maria Carmen Arroyo down here at the City Council.
12 You are truly a testament and individual who is
13 steadfast and strong and a Cornegy said Council
14 Member Cornegy said you are an inspiration to keeping
15 the light on for us at our executive meetings so
16 thank you for your service and I'm looking forward to
17 seeing you at [speaking Spanish] somewhere in the
18 Bronx and we go and have a meal and you know and
19 break it down but on another note I want to say to
20 Council Member Levin and to all of us in regards to
21 Land Use items 301 and 302, I've had a number of
22 conversations as the Chair of Library, Sub-Chair
23 Library's from calls to letter to emails fighting
24 this plan and I would say to you and I say to all of
25 us as we represent one area were responsible to

2 making sure any deals we negotiate doesn't set a
3 precedent that ties the hands of the rest us but I
4 think you did fabulous job in making sure that you
5 made sure that everyone was happy and all our
6 constitutes those of us who were fighting against
7 need to understand that we all have been elected here
8 to make decisions, some good, some not so good but we
9 do it in the best interest of all of New York and
10 while I was tore off two minds of how to move to make
11 it sure that there never becomes a fire cell in the
12 library system, I say to us in a Council moving
13 forward we need to make sure knowing that libraries
14 is an intracule part of our systems that we make sure
15 we they have the funding so they don't every find
16 them self in a situation... situation where they need
17 to continue to start selling off property to make
18 sure that they sustain themselves, with that all
19 being said I say wonderful job, you got my support
20 and I vote aye on all.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

22 CLERK: Koo.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
24 balcony.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Permission to
3 explain my vote.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes sir.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you, first I
6 want to congratulate Council Members Vacca, Van
7 Brammer, Jimmy Van Brammer, Rodriguez, Council Member
8 Rose and also Steve Levin for passing very important
9 bills today and especially my next door neighbor
10 Steven for passing this library bill. He has done
11 his very best to make sure the district has a nice
12 brand new library and all the other things, so I want
13 to congratulate him and second I want to say we going
14 to miss Council Member Maria Arroyo. I want to say
15 mucho gracias to her. Yeah she has been a very good,
16 mucho gracias, she has been a very good Council
17 Member and a good friend of ours and not only that
18 she a very good grandmother and mother and that only
19 a very few of us can do you know. Third I want say
20 happy birthday, not happy birthday happy holidays to
21 everyone and finally I want to say I want to urge all
22 my colleagues to support resolution 927 the realist
23 point development, this is really important for New
24 York City because right now the piece of land is
25 being wasted an eyesore for over 50 years. 30 years

2 ago I moved here and I said hey home come we have a
3 (inaudible) out here in such a nice geographic
4 location.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And Council
6 Members will be voting on the resolution shortly if
7 you want to speak on that.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Ok. So I want to
9 urge everyone to vote yes on that.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Ok and how do you
11 vote sir?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: And finally I want
13 to vote aye on all items.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Excellent, thank
15 you.

16 CLERK: Koslowitz.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: May I be
18 excused to explain my vote.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I can't follow
21 that. I just want to say that I'm really going to
22 miss Maria down here at the Council but as the song
23 goes, I'll be seeing you. So Maria the best of luck,
24 I love you, you are great and I look forward to our
25

2 friendship continuing for many, many years and with
3 that I vote aye.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 CLERK: Lancman.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: May I explain my
7 vote.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: I'm going to
10 vote aye but I do want to wish my colleague well and
11 my seatmate well. I had the opportunity to serve in
12 the assembly with her mom and let me just say that
13 the apple did not fall to far from the tree. Your
14 both outspoken, independent, confident and in both
15 bodies that you serve over our respected leaders, I
16 wish you the best.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: How do you vote?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: I said aye.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Ok.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: I lead with it.

21 CLERK: Lander.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Request permission
23 to explain my vote.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes sir.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I voting in
3 strong support today of the Brooklyn Heights Library
4 project while this item is in Council Member Levin's
5 district and he did a great job negotiating it, it
6 has benefits for the entire Brooklyn Public Library
7 system. BPL has \$300 million in capital repair
8 needs, more than \$80 million of that for emergency
9 repair items like air conditioning in branches that
10 are the cooling centers for seniors in the
11 summertime, disability access, leaking roofs. We
12 have worked hard in this Council and the Brooklyn
13 Delegation to increase our funding but we remain far,
14 far short of meeting that critical need and we are
15 not going to get there in the near terms honestly and
16 this decade if we stick to the amounts that we've
17 been able to put in each year and this project in
18 addition to all the benefits that... that Council
19 Member Levin mentioned and that he won, generates \$40
20 million to address the needs around the Borough
21 including 3 Cornegy Branches, Pacific Street, Walt
22 Whittman and Washington Irving a great project at
23 Sunset Park and many more. We have a long way to go
24 to provide the resources that the system needs and
25 were going to continue working together to do it but

2 I believe that as a result of this deal the branches
3 throughout the Borough will be more able to be places
4 for reading, accessing technology, ESL classes,
5 finding jobs and much more for generations to come
6 and I'm proud and enthusiastic of it about it and
7 give a big congratulations to Steve. I also want to
8 say I'm really enthusiastic about Intro. 108,
9 caregiver discrimination, I give a shot out to the
10 National Domestic Worker Alliance as well as Better
11 Balance, we will keep working with you to move
12 forward on issues of caregiver discrimination and add
13 my voice in support of Hope Knight, I think she may
14 have been the best nominee from the de Blasio
15 administration that we've seen yet this term and she
16 really going bring a prospective on neighborhood
17 development, info-structure, jobs and a lot of the
18 issues members of this Council care about to the
19 Planning Commission where we surely want those things
20 heard. Finally Maria I'm amongst the people you've
21 schooled on how to negotiate, made laugh more times
22 than I can count when I was not supposed to be
23 laughing and I were going to miss you so, so, so
24 much, thank you, I vote aye on all.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

2 CLERK: Levin.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to
4 explain my vote.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you,
7 colleagues I just want to point out a couple of
8 people that I forgot to thank as part of the Brooklyn
9 Public Library project. Umay Kidisay (sp) of the
10 administration who is very instrumental in the home
11 stretch there, Richard Barack from the Brooklyn
12 Borough President's office who worked very diligently
13 in a lot of the suggestions, recommendations that
14 came out the Brooklyn Borough President office we... we
15 took up and worked our best to implement. Build Up
16 NYC who Hector Figueroa and Gary LaBarbara who were
17 very diligent in ensuring that there were good
18 quality jobs a part of this project and just for the
19 record the two librarian that I mentioned before
20 Oldest is his full name is Oldest Screwdellis (sp)
21 and Rachel's full name is Rachel Timeman (sp). I
22 also want to congratulate Council Member Van Brammer,
23 Rose, Vacca, Rodriguez and Mealy on legislation today
24 and lastly I want to just thank and acknowledge Maria
25 Del Carmen Arroyo who is a fierce advocate, she is a

2 steadfast Council Member, a true Council Member
3 representing her district in representing this
4 institution. She has been a good friend to me and
5 the Arroyo family has a sterling record of public
6 service and she has contributed greatly to that and
7 we all owe her a great debt of gratitude and we're
8 going to miss her, thank you Maria. I vote aye on
9 all.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: With
12 congratulations to all our sponsors today especially
13 Council Member Steve Levin [speaking Spanish] for
14 Council Member Arroyo, I'm pleased to vote aye on
15 all.

16 CLERK: Maisel.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

18 CLERK: Mealy.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Just want to say I
20 will miss you Arroyo but I know will be seeing you
21 again and I just want to wish everyone a happy
22 holiday and kudos to Steve and Debbie Rose for her
23 legislation on the caregiver and I vote aye on all.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

25 CLERK: Menchaca.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to
3 explain my vote.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you, I
6 also want to extend my thank for her leadership in
7 the BLAC, Council Member Arroyo you will continue to
8 be a voice of good reason with us, we will continue
9 to call upon your leadership and thank you for your
10 choice and decision to be with your family. I think
11 you heard a lot of passion today express not only to
12 Council Member Arroyo but to all the work we're doing
13 and not just for the work were voting on today but
14 the entire year and I just am reflecting a little bit
15 about what we've done in this year and I can't wait
16 for the new year. I want to raise one item that you
17 are all voting in favor of, thank you and the pride
18 that I'm feeling right now in voting yes to site a
19 much needed school in Sunset Park. For years parent
20 advocates (inaudible) in Sunset Park have been
21 demanding that an elementary school be built in the
22 district. This is to address the extreme
23 overcrowding crisis that we are facing in both
24 district 15 and district 20. This school will be
25 sited in district 20. Today's vote will bring us

2 much closer to that long, long need of... of schools.
3 The school that we are siting today will be bringing
4 676 new seats in school district 20. One of the most
5 overcrowded in the City like I said. We are clear
6 that this one school is not enough so I will continue
7 to come back to you Council Members and the school
8 construction authority and the Mayor to bring more
9 schools to our community. We just today met with
10 parents and walked through multiple sites of the
11 school construction authority and I want to demand
12 that we continue to get that attention as we move
13 through our advocacy. [speaking Spanish] and I vote
14 aye.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: On... on all.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

18 CLERK: Mendez.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Permission to
20 explain my vote.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I vote aye on all
23 and I abstain from LU 301 and 302 and my abstention
24 is based on the fact that I find it troubling that
25 there's a signing bonus on top of the R72 district. I

2 also want to say goodbye to Savina Derinzo, you
3 always worked so hard, you always were so efficient,
4 got everything done so quickly, you will be missed by
5 many people including me. Lyle good luck something
6 we've worked on for many years, you'll be doing great
7 service to the City in another capacity and to my
8 dear friend Maria Carmen Arroyo just for everyone she
9 was the past Chair of the Aging Committee in her
10 first full term, she than became the Chair of Health
11 and in this last term she served as the Chair of
12 Community Development. She was the past Co-Chair of
13 the Black, Latino, Asian Caucus for 4 years and she's
14 taught me so much, she sat on the Exec. Committee,
15 she kept us all focused or as my predecessor use to
16 say fuckes anyway that's an ode to Margareta Lopez.
17 Seriously I just want to say one thing my mother
18 taught me one thing, she always use to say [speaking
19 Spanish] you repay or you give love with love. Maria
20 I hope you're feeling the love today, you've given it
21 to us and I hope you get that back. I know there are
22 two little boys and girl who are very happy who their
23 going to seeing you every night so I wish you well,
24 thank you.

25 CLERK: Miller.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Permission to
3 explain my vote.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you Madame
6 Public Advocate, first of all I'd like to thank my
7 colleagues on the successful passing of a really
8 common sense bills this afternoon with a special
9 shout out to Steve Levin who stood fast in the face
10 of adversity and showed real leadership where
11 necessary. I'd also like to add my voice in
12 overwhelming support for Hope Knight and her
13 conformation, I've had the pleasure of working with
14 her briefly and she's uniquely qualified to lead the
15 commission in a way that is so critical in this time
16 where the Land Use and Zoning is going to be such an
17 issue. I'd also like to add my voice and commend our
18 Speaker in her steadfast commitment to the Island of
19 Puerto Rico, she has not wavered, this is certainly
20 something issue that's been ongoing she been a voice
21 out front and I want to add my voice and my
22 commitment to as one who has much family on the
23 Island which remains on the Island that I will be
24 standing with you as we move forward in this struggle
25 and finally to my sister and mentor Maria Carmen

2 Arroyo, thank you so much for your leadership and
3 most of all thank you for your friendship and I will
4 certainly use the number, thank you so much and your
5 family is so lucky and blessed to have you. I vote
6 aye.

7 CLERK: Palma.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Permission to
9 explain my vote. Madame Public Advocate, I... I want
10 to congratulate Council Member Steve Levin for all
11 the work that he did for his community on this
12 project, I know it was not an easy position he was in
13 but I admire the courage that he had in handling the
14 situation. Maria I met you 11 years ago and you've
15 taught me consistency not only within this body but
16 in friendship and so I'm going to miss seeing you
17 here but I know that you're not so far away from me
18 and our Friday meeting will continue so, no not
19 drinking, our Friday meetings will continue and I
20 wish you all the best in your new endeavor, I know
21 that you promised to go change the world so I'm going
22 to be looking at you from here until I go join to
23 change that world. Thank you so much for your
24 friendship. I vote aye.

25 CLERK: Vacca.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I thank you, I
3 vote aye on all, I want to congratulate Lyle Frank
4 especially who is the Counsel to the Transportation
5 Committee when I was Chair and he will be great Judge
6 and I wish him all the best. I thank Steve Levin for
7 his work and I also want to recognize Maria Del
8 Carmen Arroyo and wish her all the best as well and
9 thank her for her service.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

11 CLERK: Reynoso.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Permission to
13 explain my vote.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I just want to
16 say to Maria Carmen Arroyo [speaking Spanish] and
17 you've always been there as a mentor especially in
18 the BLAC and Black, Latina, Asian Caucus, you are a
19 voice of levity and reason within when we discuss
20 items, we you're going to be deeply missed and I do
21 want to vote aye and [speaking Spanish] Puerto Rico.

22 CLERK: Richards.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Congratulation
24 to Debbie, Steven and Jimmy on their legislation
25 today and also I want to wish Maria a God's blessing

2 in her new chapter in life, thank you and I vote aye
3 on all.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 CLERK: Rose.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Permission to
7 explain my vote.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I want to thank
10 Speaker Mark-Viverito again for helping us pass
11 Intro. 108-A and congratulations to Council Member
12 Vacca for your unsexy but common sense legislation.
13 (inaudible) Van Brammer and Rodriguez and I'm hopeful
14 that it will prevent additional human tragedy and to
15 Council Member Levin ULURP are always difficult but
16 you prevailed with a project that benefits that was
17 beneficial to your community, congratulations and to
18 Maria I just want to say ditto to all the
19 aforementioned adjectives and superlatives. You
20 really are class act, always willing to share your
21 sage advice with no pretense or malice and often
22 dispensing tough love which only made us better. You
23 will really be missed and I want to say happy
24 holidays to all of my Council colleagues. And I vote
25 aye on all.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

3 CLERK: Rosenthal.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Permission to
5 explain my vote.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I want to
8 start by thanking the administration for adding \$2.5
9 million to the City's budget for the Office of
10 Special Enforcement. You know Arabian Bee a couple
11 of weeks ago basically said they just don't want to
12 follow our New York State laws and it means that
13 we're going to have to ramp up enforcement, it's to
14 bad we have spend taxpayer dollars this way but
15 that's what happens when you have a \$25 billion
16 corporation that decides it's just not going to abide
17 by local law. I want to congratulate Lyle Frank we
18 were Chairs of our respective community boards at the
19 same time and I counted on his sound advice. He will
20 be missed and Council Member Arroyo I want to thank
21 you for taking me on the worker co-op ride, you were
22 the one who really saw the need and has inspired the
23 work and kept us going, that was your first Committee
24 hearing and it was great to be on your Committee and
25 it was terrific to work as a partner with you, you

2 know others have been able work with you for so long,
3 I only had you for 2 years so thank you for helping
4 me learn so much. I vote aye on all.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

6 CLERK: Torres.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Permission to
8 explain my vote.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I just want wish
11 farewell to Maria, it's been a pleasure to have you
12 as a colleague and a delegation. I will confess when
13 I first came here I was terrified of you as an 18
14 year old Council Member, not quite but... but overtime
15 I've come to know behind your tenacious and tough
16 image there is warm and big heart there and it's just
17 been an honor to have you as a colleague and I wish
18 you all the best, no oh don't tell people ok, will
19 keep that between us. Ok, what happens in Bronx,
20 stays in the Bronx.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: How do you vote?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I forgot that
23 part, I'm sorry, but less importantly I vote aye so.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

25 CLERK: Torres. Treyger.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to
3 explain my vote.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I just want to
6 congratulate my colleagues on the passage of their
7 bills, I also want to congratulate Ethan (inaudible)
8 to the promotion as my new Chief of Staff and to
9 Council Member Arroyo, we thank you greatly for your
10 service and I want to personally thank you for
11 speaking from the heart without a filter and that is
12 an approach that many elected officials can learn
13 from, so thank for your service but thank you for
14 speaking and advocating from your heart always and
15 God blessing and God speaks all the best. I vote aye
16 on all.

17 CLERK: Vallone.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Brief permission
19 Madame Advocate.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Maria God bless
22 you and your family from myself and my entire family
23 who knows you and your mom and everyone very, very
24 well. Lyle Frank to you and my brother previous
25 Council Member Peter Vallon Jr. both being sworn in

2 as Judges, God bless you and congratulations. Yes my
3 brother is very excited and I'm happy to hand him off
4 now to the Judiciary they.. they can have him and all
5 of his wisdom and shall be now in the Judiciary I
6 wish him well and I wanted to give everyone a Merry,
7 Merry Christmas, a Happy Holidays and a happy and
8 healthy New Year, God bless everyone and I vote aye
9 on all.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

11 CLERK: Williams.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: May I be excused
13 to explain my vote.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you,
16 first I just want to say congratulations on making a
17 tough choice Council Member Arroyo, it sounds simple
18 but I know it not and you get to know what a person
19 is made of actually when you have times we don't
20 agree and serving with you on the Executive Committee
21 we agreed a lot and sometimes we didn't but we always
22 agreed on what was fair to move forward and what the
23 rules should be irrespective of what the outcome
24 would be and that's the type of person you want to
25 serve with and so I think people should know that is

2 who you are and there was amazing and I'm going to
3 miss that and even as a regular member your wisdom on
4 how to move forward was always appreciated so thank
5 you and God bless. In terms of voting for all of the
6 items, congratulate to all my colleagues, I think
7 Council Member Steve Levin was has had some undo
8 arrows thrown at him. It is not his fault that
9 libraries have been under funded, in fact it's our
10 fault as government for not properly funding
11 libraries for many, many years. I voted no on those
12 items in Committee to try to help support him just
13 going to abstain from 301 and 302 simply because I
14 think there just undo attacks on you. It was a very
15 difficult position to be in. The reason I can't
16 fully support is because I think the housing should
17 have gone a little bit deeper. We need to have a
18 least 40% or even 30% of the AMI and if we're going
19 to sell asset from the City, I think we have even
20 more burden to get housing deeper in that if that's
21 what we're going to get. So I would just abstain
22 form 301, 302 and vote aye on all the rest and all
23 Land Use call ups as well.

24 CLERK: Wills.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: May I have a moment
3 to explain my vote.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: So first to my
6 colleagues and bills today I congratulate you. Steve
7 the decisions that we meet now are sometimes
8 unpopular but history will judge and show that you
9 were correct on this. To Judge Frank I want to say
10 congratulations, I want to lend our support as whole
11 of the Congressional and State Members in Southeast
12 Queens to the appointment of Ms. Hope Knight. She
13 has proven herself to be a phenomenal individual. To
14 Maria you have demonstrated a commitment to fairness
15 that is void of personality politics which is
16 something that is not done in this thing that we call
17 politics today. You have fundamentally changed the
18 fabric of the Black and Latino, Asian Caucus. You
19 have proven that you can push a point without being
20 pushy. You have allowed us or helped us manage
21 Jumaane Williams so we appreciate you for that. We
22 are not losing a colleague only today but we are
23 losing a deep well of instantiable knowledge, so we
24 salute you [speaking Spanish] a true royal. Our
25 motto today Rosie Perez is, I know but I said Perez

2 it's a joke, it's ok. Rosie Mendez and the 30th
3 floor. You got ok, wait, wait you cutting into my
4 time, stop clapping. Rosie said to congratulate 30th
5 floor for putting together a beautiful card we would
6 ask every member to sign it when we go next door for
7 cake so make sure after this you go right next door
8 immediately for so we can have cake and celebrate her
9 for one last time. Thank you very much for
10 everything you have done. I vote aye.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

12 CLERK: Matteo.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Maria good luck
14 and God bless. I vote aye on all and aye on all Land
15 Use call ups.

16 CLERK: Van Brammer.

17 MAJORITY LEADER VAN BRAMMER: Permission
18 to explain my vote.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

20 MAJORITY LEADER VAN BRAMMER: With
21 congratulation to all of my colleagues, particularly
22 my seat mate Debbie Rose but I wanted to talk a
23 little bit about Steve Levin and the very important
24 work that he did. First of all I just wanted to say
25 there are few people better situated to tackle such a

2 difficult issue. Steve is incredibly thoughtful, so
3 incredibly well intentioned and fair and so I think
4 he has done a remarkable job. I also want to say
5 because it's been referenced; the fact is that
6 several Mayoral administration long neglected the
7 capital needs of our libraries but this Council has
8 lead the fight that resulted in \$300 million in
9 capital being allocated and for the first time having
10 libraries in the 10 year capital plan of the City of
11 New York. Having said that, that's not enough, we
12 need to do more but what was dropped at Steve Levin's
13 foot was a difficult task but he's done a remarkable
14 job working with all of the parties involved and know
15 you can't make everyone happy but Steve has done a
16 remarkable job for his community and I believe in the
17 power of libraries and know libraries and I also know
18 that libraries change and evolve just like every
19 other institution in thing in this world, so I want
20 to congratulate my colleague, my friend Steve Levin
21 for his amazing work and pledge to him and to
22 everyone that we will pitch in do all we can for
23 libraries and with my final 20 seconds I just want to
24 say Council Member Arroyo I will miss you at the
25 dinner caucuses. You were an amazing seatmate, I

2 will miss you in so many ways but I know we'll
3 probably still see you at (inaudible) and I know that
4 your unbelievable spirit and your fighting spirit
5 will continue so thank you for your public service
6 and with that I proudly vote aye on all.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

8 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito:

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I vote aye.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: So Maria at the
11 end of the day you did not let the busy world of
12 politics keep you from the priorities that matter
13 most, your family because we all know that today is
14 short and tomorrow is not promised. We will miss
15 you, God bless you and congratulations. All items on
16 today's general order calendar were adopted by a vote
17 of 49 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative and 0
18 abstentions with the exception of LU 301 and 302 and
19 accompanying Resos. Which are adopted by a vote of 45
20 in affirmative, 1 negative and 3 abstentions, the
21 revised Land Use call up were adopted by a vote of 49
22 in the affirmative and 0 in the negative.

23 Introduction and reading of bills.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All bills are
25 referred to the Committee as indicated on the agenda.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And now a
3 discussion of resolution, resolution pre-considered
4 927 which reads; A resolution authorizing the Speaker
5 to file or to join in an amicus brief on behalf of
6 the Council the litigation caption Avella et al vs.
7 he City of New York et al. Currently on appeal at
8 the New York Court of Appeals, No. APL 2015-00298 to
9 support the prior approval of the Willets Point
10 Development Plan by the City Council. Speaker on the
11 resolution is Council Member Lancman. Quiet in the
12 Chamber.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you Madame
14 Public Advocate and just too briefly state my
15 opposition to this resolution. You ever wish you had
16 the opportunity to go back in time and do something
17 differently? Maybe do something a little bit better,
18 given a second opportunity? That's the opportunity
19 we have on Willets Point. The Courts have handed us
20 a gift and opportunity to break from the development
21 policies of the last administration, the last
22 Council. The last administration didn't believe in
23 affordable housing like we do and that's why the
24 Council settled for affordable housing on this
25 project that wouldn't kick in until 2026, if ever.

2 The last administration didn't believe in living
3 wages, that why we had settle for vague aspirations
4 instead of concrete requirements. Many of us want to
5 get a better deal. Real affordable housing that will
6 actually happen in our lifetime. Real living wages
7 for retail workers. This resolution is like the claw
8 of the Bloomberg administration reaching up from the
9 grave, forcing us to accept its old affordable
10 housing in living wage policy. I'm going to be
11 voting no on this resolution and I urge my colleagues
12 to do likewise.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
14 Ferreras-Copeland. Please exit the balcony quietly,
15 thank you.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank
17 you Madame Public Advocate. The Willets Point
18 Development Plan was approved by the City Council in
19 2013 by a vote 42 to 3 and today we are seeing that
20 this Council stands by its process and we will defend
21 that decision in the ongoing litigation. Millions of
22 dollars of public monies have already been invested
23 in families, small businesses and workers need to see
24 the benefits of the plan that was promised for
25 Queens. My community needs a solution that is swift

2 and equitable, for this reason I vote yes today and I
3 urge my colleagues to do the same. I will continue
4 to work with all the support for this goal. I also am
5 joining my voice in this amicus brief because as we
6 go through the ULURP process and anyone of you who go
7 through ULURP process we stand unified. So I urge my
8 colleagues to stand with me so that in the future if
9 you should ever go through this process, you can know
10 that I will stand with you. I would like to thank
11 the Speaker for her attention to our communities
12 while it is the duty.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council, ok.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: I'm
15 wrapping up I know, while it's the duty of the
16 Speaker of the City to stay abreast of issues
17 affecting every district you are focused from Corona
18 to Harlem and I thank you for standing with your
19 Council Members, thank you.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
21 Council Member Lander.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you Madame
23 Public Advocate as Chair of the Rules Committee
24 through which Reso. 927 travels and also one of the
25 42 members who proudly voted in support of the

2 Willets Point action during the last term. I also
3 want to speak on behalf of today's resolution. Last
4 term this Council overwhelmingly approved the Willets
5 Point re-zoning. Council Member Ferreras at that
6 time like Council Member Levin did over the past
7 couple of weeks fought extremely hard, tirelessly to
8 win the best deal that she could for her community
9 and her constituents and we all watched it and we all
10 those of us that were here sat in this Chamber and
11 overwhelmingly ratified the deal that had been
12 struck. It includes many, many benefits for the
13 community but I think in addition as the Council
14 Member says you know we got to stand behind the
15 things that we do when we're negotiating to get deals
16 done, we're saying we're going to get them done if
17 the Council votes for them we're going to stand
18 behind them and I think that's all we're talking
19 about here is will this Council file an amicus brief
20 in an appeal in a lawsuit standing behind the re-
21 zoning that we past and I urge all members to vote
22 into support.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
24 Council Member Koslowitz.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Thank you.

3 I've lived in Queens for 53 years and although
4 Willets Point is not in my district, Willets Point
5 has always been an eye sore. I was in the Council
6 and I was Chair of Economic Development at the time
7 and I worked with Julissa on Willets Point. I want
8 to see Willets Point developed in my lifetime. Many
9 people I sat at meeting back to Claire Showman (sp)
10 when people would not go into Willets Point to do
11 anything to fix it, DOT, DEP all the agencies because
12 they were afraid to go into Willets Point. Willets
13 Points is eye sore and something has to be done and I
14 think what the Council did back then was the right
15 thing and if I had to vote on it again, I would vote
16 the same way, thank you.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
18 Greenfield.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you I
20 just wanted to add my voice and the Chair of the Land
21 Use process and to address another one of our
22 colleagues you know. I certainly agree that it would
23 be great if we had a time machine and we could go
24 back in time and we could solve problems. I for one
25 would love to have told myself, I think it was last

2 Thursday night when I had some sushi that 6 hours
3 later when I wasn't feeling well, that I probably
4 should have not eaten that sushi but unfortunately
5 the world doesn't work that way and I got mild food
6 poisoning that I'm still working through and so the
7 reality of the process is and you know this is
8 concept that I was taught as a child when I use to
9 play the game is the term that we used back when I
10 was a kid which is the same term today is called no
11 "backsies", once you have deal, you have a deal and
12 the fundamental process that we have through the
13 ULURP process, through the Council, through the
14 review, literally a process takes years is that when
15 we support a deal our word is good and that's what
16 we're saying here today in the City Council and
17 certainly as the Chair of the Land Use Committee I
18 endorse that everybody needs to know that our word is
19 our bond and I proudly support this resolution.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
21 Williams.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you I to
23 just wanted to lead my voice in support of this vote.
24 I think we had great discussions in the last
25 administration, I don't believe many of them were

2 about the legality of this so I feel that we should
3 as a Council, as a body stand behind the work that
4 comes out of it unless there's some issues of
5 legality, irrespective of that I'm very proudly
6 behind voting yes for this... this resolution and I
7 think we should continue to that if there's something
8 comes out of this body we need to have the structure
9 of the body and integrity body to maintain.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
11 Council Member Van Brammer.

12 MAJORITY LEADER VAN BRAMMER: Thank you
13 very much I to just wanted to speak as someone born
14 and raised and lived my entire life in Queens. At
15 Willets Point something really good can happen there
16 and I want to say that our colleague Julissa
17 Ferreras-Copeland has done so much work. We all saw
18 her put everything she had into this deal at a
19 difficult time for her to do it and she has done
20 something that ultimately will not only benefit
21 Willets Point but all of Queens and all of New York
22 City and I think it's incredible important for us to
23 stand behind our colleagues, to support our
24 colleagues when they have these difficult decisions
25 to make. They make them in best interest of their

2 communities, Council Member Julissa Ferreras-Copeland
3 has done an amazing job and all of us should support
4 this, I'm proud to support it and I believe that she
5 has the best intentions for her community, knows her
6 community the best and will deliver the best results
7 for the people of her community.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
9 Koo.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you Public
11 Advocate. I want to say I agree with all the
12 previous speakers that supported this Willets Point
13 development. Willets Point development will bring
14 more jobs, business opportunities and tax revenues
15 for the City. This place is an eye sore for many,
16 many years and it was a called eye in triangle so I
17 would say eye in triangle must go because we want a
18 Willets Point development to help our City to help
19 our community so I urge every Council Member to
20 support this resolution.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
22 Council Member Johnson.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I just want to
24 say that I think that the integrity of the process we
25 do here at the Council like we saw with Council

2 Member Levin today requires that we really have each
3 other's back and also that we are good on our word
4 and I was not in Council when Willets Point went
5 through, I know it was in the news and I know that
6 the Chair of our Finance Committee spent an enormous
7 amount of time in negotiating that deal. I'm not an
8 expert and what's best for Willets Point but I know
9 that we have to support deals that are struck and so
10 I vote aye.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Seeing none other
12 now for a vote on resolution 927 to support the prior
13 approval of the Willets point development plan by
14 City Council, all of those in favor please say aye.

15 [multiple aye in Unisom]

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All of those
17 oppose.

18 UNKNOWN SPEAKER: No.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Any abstentions? The
20 aye's have it and now for general discussion. There
21 are 9 members on the general discussion, let me
22 remind you that you stand between the cake, if
23 there's anyone who wants to reconsider please
24 approach the desk. Beginning with Council Member Van
25

2 Brammer who I believe have left the Chamber, next
3 Council Member Gibson.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you very
5 much Madame Public Advocate and I'll be brief. I
6 just wanted to just take this opportunity as we close
7 out this year last Stated just too really thank all
8 of my colleagues for your tremendous support. It has
9 been an honor serving with you and serving in the
10 capacity as chair of the committee on Public Safety,
11 all the work we have done in this council has really
12 made a significate difference, it has not been easy
13 but we have done it with the same spirit and with the
14 same vision that we are acting on behalf of all New
15 Yorkers. I want to thank our Speaker Melissa Mark-
16 Viverito for her leadership for coming to my district
17 on more than one occasion, meeting with many various
18 stakeholders and groups. I really do appreciate it.
19 I want to thank all of the staff, my public safety
20 team for the work that they have done all the
21 hearings we have had I appreciate your work and your
22 commitment, thank you to Ramon Martinez, Talora Poppa
23 (sp), Rachel Codero, Matt Golwab (sp), Brian Crow,
24 Deepa Ambekar (sp), Beth Goulb (sp), Laurie Wen (sp),
25 Ellen Eng (sp), Eisha Wright. I want to thank my

2 Communication Director, Dana Wax, my new Budget
3 Director Kathleen O'Hagan, my District Office Staff,
4 I really want to thank the Sergeant at Arms for
5 always having my back in making sure our hearings run
6 efficiently and as smoothing as possible and last but
7 certainly not least to every colleague, thank you for
8 your support, it has been a pleasure working with all
9 of you throughout the year. We have a lot of
10 accomplishments to celebrate and I certainly look
11 forward to what 2016 holds in store for all of us.
12 Happy Holidays, Seasons Greeting, Merry Christmas,
13 Happy Kwanza and Happy New Year to each and every one
14 of you, God bless and I will see all of you very
15 soon. Thank you Madame Public Advocate.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, were
17 still in session, Council Members Wills.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Yes today I wanted
19 to just direct my colleague's attentions to Reso. 940
20 who's the Chief sponsor is Council Member Williams
21 urging Congress to pass and the President to sign
22 legislation to release into the Congressional funding
23 for gun violence research. I wanted to thank Council
24 Member Laurie Cumbo and Vanessa Gibson on their work
25 in this area with Jumaane Williams. I also want to

2 draw attention to Intro. 1040, almost half of the
3 shooting and murders in our City are gang affiliated
4 and young men and women of color often end up in the
5 crossage of these waring groups. The public safety
6 gangs that have been achieved over the last two
7 decades have not provided a lasting solution to the
8 hopelessness and despair that fuels this bloodshed.
9 The Community Violence Prevention Act would enable an
10 independent body of experts to review the City's
11 efforts to promote upward mobility in communities
12 afflicted by violence and design a comprehensive
13 strategy that would deliver more direct and immediate
14 benefits to our disadvantage. The plan itself would
15 nicely complement the community, police and
16 initiative that is already been implemented to
17 greater effects in many districts. It will also
18 incentivize an honest and peaceful way of life. I
19 thank my Co-Sponsors for their support on this bill
20 as well as Erica Ford and Life Camp which is one of
21 the Keepsfire (sp) groups for over one year with now
22 shooting in our area. I would like to thank all of
23 the rest of the advocacy groups, our children and
24 families cannot wait so I urge immediate passage of
25 Intro. 1040, thank you Madame.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
3 Council Member Cumbo.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you public
5 advocate. I really want to first start off by
6 thanking all of my colleagues that were present with
7 me today at the launch of the Council Anti-Gun
8 Violence Initiative Art as a Catalyst for Change. I
9 want to thank Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito, Council
10 Members Julissa Ferreras-Copeland, Majority Leader
11 Jimmy Van Brammer, Council Members Fernando Cabrera
12 and Jumaane Williams and many others who heeded the
13 call for more resources and communities deeply
14 impacted by gun violence. According to the daily
15 news the number of shooting reported within the City
16 of New York as of December 6th was 1,061 which
17 reflected a 3.2% decrease from 1,296 shooting within
18 the same time frame from last year. However, the
19 number of murders have risen from 5.5% from 307 to
20 326, additional 49% of gun violence is gang related
21 and predominantly in communities of color. I'm so
22 excited today because today we're allowed the
23 opportunity to utilize the arts as a tool kit in the
24 solution for ending gun violence in our communities.
25 So I'm very proud that so many of my colleagues were

2 there. This was an opportunity for us to infuse
3 \$720,000 to provide art education and art programming
4 for our young people to channel their talents and
5 resources. I would also like to draw your attention
6 to Intro. 1040 and I applaud Council Member Williams
7 and Wills for introducing a resolution calling upon
8 Congress to fund gun violence, research and a bill to
9 create a commission in the City of New York that
10 would identify the root causes of violence in the 5
11 Boroughs. We can no longer continue to do business
12 as usual when our communities particular our youth
13 are caught in the cross fire and addition to that we
14 want to urge Governor Cuomo to match our anti-gun
15 violence commitment on the State level as well. I
16 also want to draw attention to legislation that I'm
17 introducing that I would very much appreciate my
18 colleagues support on, it's an introduction of a bill
19 to create a sexual education task force. The task
20 force would be comprised of 7 members including a
21 parent, family member from a public school, student.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
23 can you bring comments to a close.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Yes Public
25 Advocate. Teacher, a non-teacher staff and

2 Department of Health and Mental Hygiene to examine
3 and make recommendations on how we can achieve a
4 sound curriculum for the sexual education and current
5 future scholars, thank you.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
7 Council Member Williams.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you I
9 just want to call my colleagues attention to 3 bills
10 first. We face an unprecedented housing crisis with
11 rents out of reach for most New Yorkers.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We are still in
13 session.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Staggering
15 increase in homeless population and we need to use
16 every tool we have. I'm proud to introduce another
17 tool, Intro. 1039, which would require HPD to conduct
18 annual surveys of all City owned properties to
19 identify vacant buildings or lots that may be
20 suitable. This bill is part of a larger vacant
21 property package with public advocate and Council
22 Member Rodriguez. Also in case you missed the
23 Speaker Paul Ryan introduced a bill last night that
24 failed to repeal, hopefully I get a couple extra
25 seconds to, that failed to repeal a band on Center

2 for Disease Control research into the cause of gun
3 violence and fails to funds to research. Leader
4 Polosi said that Democrats in the House would refuse
5 to vote that budget bill without this band being
6 lifted, I hope they are successful and I hope they
7 stick to it. Former Republican Congressman Jay
8 Dickie has reversed his band, opposition to it, so
9 I'm glad and thankful to my Council Member Wills for
10 joining me and sponsoring Reso. 940 asking for that
11 funding to got to Center for Disease Control, I also
12 thank Council Member Wills for introducing and
13 allowing me to co-prime of the Community Violence
14 Prevention Act, commission of appointees that will if
15 adopted study that root cause of violence as a public
16 health crisis and I want to say congratulation to
17 Council Member Cumbo for what she did today. Just for
18 some numbers since 911 3,380 Americans have died from
19 terrorist attacks in the Country and abroad. 406,496
20 people have died from gun violence in this Country
21 alone, that means for each American that died from
22 terrorism from here and across the world a 1,000
23 people have died from gun violence in this Country.
24 It is appalling that we continue to do nothing, not
25 say the same things about terrorism about gun

2 violence as we do with terrorism, if a life is a life
3 how can we compare those numbers and continue to deny
4 what we need to do to deal with gun violence in this
5 Country, so I call on everyone to please support
6 these pieces of legislation and I do also want to say
7 rest in peace to Savina, she was such a great person,
8 she lovely, tough you can tell she was from New York
9 City but she had a wonderful personality, I'm going
10 to miss her and congratulations to Lyle Frank as
11 well.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
13 Council Member Levine.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you Madame
15 Public Advocate. I want to propose that the 8
16 Council Member left in Chamber right now get extra
17 member writing funding this year for their fortitude
18 and endurance and I also want to call my colleagues
19 attention Intro. 1031, which would require the
20 Department of Transportation to conduct a study on
21 the congestion caused by truck traffic. There's a
22 100,000 truck deliveries a day in Manhattan that the
23 vast majority take place during the peak hours of the
24 morning and evening rush. That makes no sense and we
25 want to study to gage the impact of this traffic and

2 solutions that could shift this burden to other hours
3 where it would be less impact on congestion, thank
4 you very much.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
6 Tregyer.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you Public
8 Advocate, I ask my colleagues to support me on Intro.
9 1037. Intro. 1037 would require that the property
10 owner should not be subject to a civil or criminal
11 penalty when the violation issued is for a building
12 conditions awaiting repair by a City Disaster
13 Recovery Program and any such penalties already
14 imposed may be refunded. It is outrageous that there
15 are property owners waiting for recovery assistance 3
16 years after the storm who are being subject to City
17 agency violations. Shame on us for not helping them
18 rebuild and yet fining them during their most
19 vulnerable times and so I strongly ask my colleagues
20 to support me to wave these penalties and to
21 reimburse them for any penalties with regards to the
22 recovery program and please support me in Intro.
23 1037, thank you bye.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
25 Council Member Cabrera.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so
3 much Madame Public Advocate if somebody can do me a
4 favor and just ask Council Member Rose if she can
5 just step out for a second, I'm the last one
6 speaking, I just wanted to share something about her
7 and I would appreciate that. But I want to
8 accentuate and also echo sentiment here where Madame
9 Speaker regrading Puerto Rico, I was raised part of
10 my life in Puerto Rico in Catalina, Puerto Rico and
11 have family there who are very, extremely concerned
12 about their future. For those who don't know they
13 were actually placed in a now win situation, in a now
14 win situation and so I know there are people out
15 there that would like to blame them for their
16 situation but it's our time for us to come to their
17 help and to have a fair process of really helping
18 them to what they're going through. Maria I wanted
19 to, today I'm the last one and speaking I have a
20 minute here but I wanted to dedicate it to you, I
21 wanted to thank you. I know when I first came as an
22 elected official, no experience in politics
23 whatsoever, I've never been involved in government,
24 you sat right next to me right here in the back to my
25 left and you took me under your wings and many of us

2 here have spoken about the fact that you made us all
3 better but I want to take it a little farther and
4 deeper in the fact that you helped many of us to take
5 the next step. You believed in me when I didn't even
6 see back then to become the BLAC Co-Chair and not
7 only did you inspire me to do that but you actually
8 fought for it and there is no better person that I
9 could think of to have as a fighter to fight with
10 alongside and to have you and you have fought for
11 your community and I want to thank the staff that
12 stood with you all those years as well and with that
13 thank you, we bless you, will continue to pray for
14 you and now you get do your real job and the super
15 job and that is to be a mommy and to be a
16 grandparent. God bless you.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you and as
18 we close I'd like to invite my colleagues to sign-on
19 to Intro. 1034 a bill that requires the registration
20 of vacant buildings at a time when we face a homeless
21 crisis by identifying vacant property, the City can
22 be proactive about working with owners of vacant
23 property to put that property to good use. We can
24 also be sure of eliminating properties that often
25 represent neglect and blight to their neighborhoods.

2 I know that Council Member Williams and Rodriguez are
3 also introducing related bills and I look forward to
4 working with both of them to improve the City's
5 policies on vacant property and I'm sure that we are
6 doing everything we can to develop viable and
7 affordable housing and now to close the Speaker of
8 the City Council ladies and gentlemen Speaker Melissa
9 Mark-Viverito, thank you very much.

10 SPEAKER MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you
11 Madame Public Advocate, so I just want to as people
12 saw us moving around, I want to thank the Women's
13 Caucus there engaging in a toy drive right now which
14 is benefiting the Women's Prison Association still
15 accepting toys. Were still accepting toys so please,
16 please if you can make a donation. I'm going to make
17 this plug for the holiday party, were on low, were
18 doing our holiday party today as a City Council and
19 staff, I hope to see everyone there, very excited.
20 The next meeting is a charter meeting which is on
21 [speaking Spanish] January 6th at 12:00 noon and so I
22 really obviously wanted just to give that as a head
23 ups so I want to wish everyone Happy Holidays, wish
24 everyone a great New Year and see you at that charter
25 meeting at 12:00 noon on January 6th so we usually

2 start earlier remember, so please make sure your
3 aware of that and note that, so with that see you
4 later, Happy Holiday and I guess at about 3:40 we are
5 adjourned. Thank you.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Happy New Year,
7 we stand adjourned.

8 [gavel]

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 31, 2015