

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON GENERAL
WELFARE

Jointly with the

COMMITTEE ON HEALTH

----- X

Wednesday, February 12, 2025

Start: 10:20 a.m.

Recess: 12:10 a.m.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Diana I Ayala, Chairperson
Lynn C. Schulman, Chairperson

COUNCILMEMBERS:

- Joann Ariola
- Alexa Avilés
- Chris Banks
- Tiffany Cabán
- Carmen N. De La Rosa
- Oswald Feliz
- Kristy Marmorato
- Julie Menin
- Mercedes Narcisse
- Chi A. Ossé
- Kevin C. Riley
- Althea V. Stevens
- Sandra Ung
- Susan Zhuang

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

John Rojas
Chief Special Services Officer
Human Resources Administration

Jacqueline Dudley
Deputy Commissioner
HIV/AIDS Services Administration

Dr. Sarah Braunstein
Assistant Commissioner
Bureau of Hepatitis, HIV, & STIs

John Boyle
Staff Attorney
Neighborhood Defender Services of Harlem

Daniel Leyva
Latino Commission on AIDS

Armen Merjian
Senior Staff Attorney
Housing Works

Joshua Elmore
Supervising Attorney
Legal Aid Society

Tierra Labrada
Policy Director
Supportive Housing Network of New York

Alex Clavering
Bronx Legal Services

Sarah Telson
Director of the LGBTQ HIV Advocacy Unit
Brooklyn Legal Services

Teri Wilder
HIV and Aging Policy Advocate
Sage

Jason Cianciotto
Vice President
Public Policy and External Affairs
Gay Men's Health Crisis

John Hofs
Hof Law LLC

1
2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good morning and welcome to
3 the New York City Council hearing of the Committee on
4 General Welfare, jointly with Health. At this time,
5 can everybody please silence your cellphones. If you
6 wish to testify, please go to the back of the room to
7 fill out a slip with the sergeant at arms.

8 At this time and going forward, no one is to
9 approach the dais. I repeat, no one is to approach
10 the dais. Chairs, we are ready to begin.

11 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Thank you and good morning,
12 everyone. My name is Diana Ayala and I am the Deputy
13 Speaker of the New York City Council and the Chair of
14 the General Welfare Committee. We are here today to
15 hold an important oversight hearing on the
16 administration of the city's HASA program.

17 HASA, the city's HIV-AIDS Services
18 Administration, was established in 1985 by HRA. And
19 now, 40 years later, it still provides critical case
20 management and assistance to low-income New Yorkers
21 who have been diagnosed with HIV.

22 HASA served more than 50,000 New Yorkers in 2024.
23 HASA clients come from every borough in the city, are
24 referred from hospitals and CBOs, and receive much-
25 needed rental assistance, access to emergency

1 housing, and support to apply for benefits. HASA
2 does important work, and the communities are troubled
3 by reports of its shortcomings. According to HRA's
4 own data, HASA has been unable to meet its legally
5 required case ratios since the Adams administration
6 took office.
7

8 A hallmark of the HASA program is the low case
9 ratios that ensure clients can receive intensive case
10 management. The population of New Yorkers with an
11 HIV diagnosis is aging, and it remains to be seen
12 whether HASA is fully prepared to meet their needs.

13 In our deeply uncertain political climate, and
14 under a presidential administration that rejects
15 science and ignores our most vulnerable communities,
16 New Yorkers will be relying even more on New York
17 City to support and protect them. We look forward to
18 hearing from the representatives of the
19 administration about the operations of the HASA
20 program, and how they plan to meet the evolving needs
21 of HASA clients. We will be hearing a pre-considered
22 intro, sponsored by Chair Schulman, who will discuss
23 her bill further, and a resolution, Resolution 175,
24 sponsored by Councilmember Ossé, in support of
25 S183/A.2418, which would amend the social services

1
2 law to mandate each local department of social
3 services link persons living with HIV with benefits
4 and services, and provide that persons living with
5 HIV who are receiving housing assistance shall not be
6 required to pay more than 30% of household income
7 towards shelter costs. We thank the administration
8 for joining us today, and also thank advocates and
9 individuals who are here today that can speak to
10 their direct experience with HASA.

11 I would like to thank the General Welfare
12 Committee, staff who worked hard to prepare this
13 hearing, including Sahar Mouzami, Assistant Deputy
14 Director, Nina Rosenberg, Policy Analyst, Julia
15 Jaramus, Unit Head, Faria Rahman, Finance Analyst,
16 Elizabeth Childers-Garcia, Finance Analyst, Ann
17 Driscoll, Data Analyst, and finally my staff, Elsie
18 Encarnacion, Chief of Staff.

19 I would now like to turn it over to my co-chair
20 for her opening remarks.

21 CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: Thank you, Chair Ayala.
22 Good morning, everyone. I am Councilmember Lynn
23 Schulman, Chair of the New York City Council's
24 Committee on Health. Thank you for joining us at
25 today's hearing on HASA and on my pre-considered

1 introduction which would update the eligibility
2 language for HASA services to include any person with
3 HIV, and Resolution 175 sponsored by Councilmember
4 Chi Ossé, relating to the provision of housing
5 assistance and supportive services for individuals
6 living with HIV across New York State.
7

8 It's important to recognize the immense progress
9 that has been made over the years in addressing the
10 HIV-AIDS epidemic. It is equally essential to
11 acknowledge that this progress is fragile and
12 requires sustained commitment.

13 According to DOHMH, in 2023, over 1,500 people in
14 New York City were newly diagnosed with HIV. This is
15 an almost 8% increase from 2022 in contrast with the
16 year-to-year decline in new diagnoses since 2001. It
17 cannot go unmentioned that the federal government
18 plays a central role in funding HIV-AIDS services
19 through programs like the Ryan White HIV-AIDS
20 Program, and it is unclear how reliable those funding
21 sources will be in the near future. Potential cuts
22 to Medicaid and changes to healthcare policies like
23 the Affordable Care Act could lead to fewer people
24 receiving insurance coverage for HIV-related
25 services, medications, and testing.

1
2 These are all very real possibilities, and
3 simultaneously, we are seeing rollbacks of
4 protections for the LGBTQ-plus community that could
5 lead to increased discrimination in healthcare
6 settings. In light of all this uncertainty, New York
7 City must step up to ensure that our most vulnerable
8 residents have access to the care, resources, and
9 support that they need and deserve.

10 As Chair Ayala mentioned, HASA has been a
11 lifeline for thousands of New Yorkers living with HIV
12 and AIDS. It provides critical services from housing
13 assistance to medical care and case management,
14 ensuring that individuals can live with dignity,
15 respect, and access to the treatment they deserve.
16 This Council understands that we are not just
17 protecting the health of our residents. We are
18 protecting the values that make New York City
19 compassionate and inclusive.

20 The HIV-AIDS crisis is far from over, and as long
21 as New Yorkers continue to live with HIV and grow
22 older, we must continue to support them with a robust
23 and reliable response. We must ensure that New York
24 City remains a model of hope, progress, and
25

1 leadership in the fight against HIV-AIDS in these
2 uncertain times.

3
4 I want to conclude by thanking the committee
5 staff for their work on this hearing, Committee
6 Council Sarah Sucher, Chris Pepe, Policy Analyst
7 Joshua Newman, and the Finance Staff Danielle Heifetz
8 and Florentine Cabour, as well as my team, Jonathan
9 Boucher, Kevin MacLear, and Abigail Zucker.

10 I now turn the mic back to Chair Ayala.

11 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Thank you. I want to
12 acknowledge that we've been joined by Councilmembers
13 Avilés, Cabán online, Ossé, Ung, Narcisse, Ariola,
14 Marmorato is also online, and so is Councilmember
15 Feliz.

16 I will now turn it over to the Policy Analysts
17 who swear in members of the administration.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Panelists, please raise your
19 right hand. I will read the affirmation once, and
20 then each of you will respond.

21 Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth,
22 and nothing but the truth before this committee and
23 to respond honestly to Councilmember questions?

24 MR. ROJAS: Yes.

25 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER DUDLEY: Yes.

2 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER BRAUNSTEIN: Yes.

3 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: All right, you may begin.

4 MR. ROJAS: Good morning, Deputy Speaker Ayala,
5 Chair Schulman, and members of the Committee on
6 General Welfare and the Committee on Health. My name
7 is John Rojas, and I serve as Chief Special Services
8 Officer at the Human Resources Administration within
9 the Department of Social Services.

10 My portfolio, among other things, includes
11 oversight of the city's HIV-AIDS Services
12 Administration. I would like to thank the committees
13 for the opportunity to testify today on our work to
14 support New Yorkers living with HIV and AIDS to live
15 with a better quality of life and more independently.
16 I am joined by my colleagues, Jacqueline Dudley,
17 Deputy Commissioner of HASA, and by Dr. Sarah
18 Braunstein, Assistant Commissioner of the Bureau of
19 Hepatitis, HIV, and STIs from the New York City
20 Department of Health and Mental Hygiene.

21 HASA began as the Division of AIDS Services 40
22 years ago. In 1985, dedicated New York City policy
23 makers, advocates, clinicians, and public servants
24 saw the prejudice and ignorance this vulnerable
25 population faced. In the face of that prejudice and

1 ignorance, they joined together to stand up a city-
2 dedicated program serving individuals living with HIV
3 and AIDS.
4

5 Much has changed since 1985, when the epidemic
6 began to rapidly spread across our city and the
7 nation, and the city was the epicenter of HIV-AIDS
8 epidemic. At that time, there were no effective
9 treatments and people did not live long after they
10 became ill.

11 New York City was among the first municipalities
12 to stand up a range of critical services and support
13 for those affected by HIV and AIDS. Today's epidemic
14 is vastly different from decades past. Medical
15 advances, along with critical services provided by
16 HASA, have allowed low-income New Yorkers with HIV to
17 live long, higher-quality lives.

18 But much remains to be done, and HASA continues
19 to play a crucial role in stabilizing this vulnerable
20 population, combating stigma, and tackling the
21 inequities that persist.

22 HASA provides those living with HIV vital
23 assistance with housing, comprehensive case
24 management, and connection to numerous public
25 benefits and services, including Medicaid,

1 Supplemental Nutritional Assistance Program benefits,
2 cash assistance, temporary housing, supportive
3 housing, rental assistance, home care and homemaking
4 services, mental health and substance abuse screening
5 and treatment referrals, employment and vocational
6 services, transportation assistance, and SSI or SSD
7 application and appeal support.
8

9 New York City residents living with HIV are
10 eligible for case management from HASA regardless of
11 income. Eligibility for other benefits requires
12 meeting New York State mandated eligibility criteria.
13 Currently, HASA serves over 33,000 households,
14 totaling over 42,000 people. For individuals
15 requiring housing assistance, HASA offers a wide
16 array of housing options, including temporary
17 housing, supportive housing, and rental assistance.

18 Over 21,000 households receive rental assistance,
19 allowing them to reside in private market apartments.
20 Additionally, there are 5,500 units of HASA
21 supportive housing.

22 With regard to temporary housing, HASA offers
23 same-day placements into emergency or transitional
24 housing. Transitional housing provides, transitional
25 housing providers conduct comprehensive assessments

1 upon enrollment and link clients to support services
2 depending on client needs.
3

4 For permanent housing, there are a number of
5 criteria that guide eligibility. For HASA-specific
6 supportive housing, priority is given to clients
7 experiencing homelessness and those who require
8 assistance with activities of daily living, ADL, due
9 to mental illness or substance use. And ADLs are
10 defined as fundamental skills required to
11 independently care for oneself, such as eating,
12 bathing, and mobility.

13 HASA also works to connect clients with alternate
14 pathways to supportive housing depending on the
15 circumstances of the individual case, including New
16 York, New York, the New York City 1515 Supportive
17 Housing Initiative, the Empire State Supported
18 Housing Initiative, otherwise known as ESHI, and the
19 U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development's
20 Veterans Affairs Supportive Housing Program,
21 otherwise known as VASH. These programs have their
22 own eligibility requirements.

23 Those eligibility criteria are in keeping with
24 supportive housing's aims of providing permanent,
25 affordable housing for individuals and families who

1
2 experience long-term homelessness and who have varied
3 needs, including complex behavioral and medical
4 needs.

5 HASA works closely with partners within HRA and
6 sister city and state agencies and with the advocate
7 community as we collectively continue to strive
8 towards ending the HIV epidemic in New York by
9 promoting access to care, education, and support
10 services. We understand the evidence proving housing
11 is a key social determinant of health, that housing
12 as a healthcare approach informs our work and
13 contributes to the important progress that we've
14 made.

15 The Community Health Advisory and Information
16 Network, CHAIN, is an initiative of Columbia
17 University and the Mailman School of Public Health
18 that has been interviewing people living with HIV-
19 AIDS since 1994.

20 In a briefing report focused on HASA published in
21 September 2024, focusing on the years 2015 to 2021,
22 researchers found rates of problem resolution and
23 satisfaction with food and grocery assistance are
24 higher amongst respondents who sought assistance from
25 HASA compared to non-HASA service providers. Three-

1 fourths of HASA clients reported being very satisfied
2 with the housing assistance they received.
3

4 Those who reported HASA helped them find stable
5 housing were more likely to have access to stable
6 housing within 18 months, 63%, compared with
7 respondents who reported help by a non-HASA agency,
8 51%, and respondents who found housing with no agency
9 assistance, 57%.

10 Respondents who were HASA clients had higher odds
11 of engaging in HIV care that met clinical practice
12 standards with regard to recommended visits, tests,
13 and treatments, as well as higher odds of being
14 adherent to their HIV antiretroviral medication ARV
15 regimen, controlling for a range of client
16 characteristics and service needs.

17 The New York City Department of Health and Mental
18 Hygiene reported in the 2023 HIV-AIDS, 2023 HIV
19 Surveillance Annual Report published in December
20 2024, when comparing key 2014 and 2023 metrics on
21 HIV-AIDS, we have made important progress.

22 In 2014, 85% of people with HIV in New York City
23 were receiving HIV medical care, 81% of whom were
24 virally suppressed, meaning they had undetectable
25 viral load on the last viral load measurement of the

1 year. People who have HIV who are on treatment and
2 maintain undetectable viral load cannot transmit HIV
3 through sex. In 2023, 88% of people with HIV in New
4 York City were receiving HIV medical care, and 89% of
5 whom were virally suppressed.
6

7 The CHAIN briefing report and the New York City
8 Department of Health HIV Surveillance Annual Report
9 underscore the importance of stable housing and
10 social services in delivering positive public health
11 outcomes, working in partnership across DSS to
12 connect clients with benefits and services they need,
13 and our ongoing focus on holistic approach to
14 assisting our clients.

15 Now, I would like to briefly discuss a recent
16 introduction by Councilmember Schulman, the pre-
17 considered Introduction T-2025-3096, also known as
18 HASA for All.

19 In 2026, the New York City Department of Health
20 confirmed that clinical symptomatic HIV illness
21 criteria is no longer utilized. As a result, in
22 August 2016, HASA expanded its eligibility to include
23 all persons with HIV, not just those who are
24 symptomatic or diagnosed with AIDS. The pre-
25 considered introduction will ensure that HASA

1 eligibility expansion is codified in local law. That
2 codification of HASA for All will send a strong
3 message that while the epidemic is changing, so many
4 localities are rolling back on their support with
5 this vulnerable population.
6

7 In New York City, we believe that our work is not
8 done. In 2023, 1,686 people were diagnosed with HIV
9 in New York City, with Black and Latino New Yorkers
10 accounting for 83% of new diagnoses. The striking
11 disparity in diagnoses among Black and Latino New
12 Yorkers demands our attention, and these vulnerable
13 New Yorkers are deserving of HASA's lifesaving
14 benefits, as well as continue to work toward an end
15 to the epidemic.

16 To that end, HASA has pursued recruitment and
17 staff retention efforts vigorously. We have attended
18 job fairs and recruitment events. We have hired more
19 than 146 caseworkers in the last 18 months.

20 In addition, we have worked with DC37 to
21 implement a retention bonus for our caseworkers. In
22 a constrained fiscal environment, DSS received a
23 hiring freeze exemption for HASA caseworkers. That
24 exemption allowed us to continue our recruitment
25

1 efforts and bring on board staff to support our
2 clients.

3
4 We acknowledge the ongoing challenge caseworker
5 ratios represent. Hiring in this area represents
6 obstacles given the tight market for people with the
7 skills and expertise who can serve our clients best.
8 We want to take a moment now to show a recruitment
9 video that DSS created that helped us hire the many
10 staff that we have in the last 18 months.

11 So, as we wait for the video, I'll continue with
12 the testimony, and then we can skip back to it.
13 While we continue to mobilize to recruit and retain
14 HASA staff that delivers for our clients, we have
15 focused on fostering team-oriented case management
16 approach that works. This is an approach that
17 supports our clients and delivers services,
18 resources, and referrals they need.

19 As our HASA quarterly performance reports
20 demonstrate, case managers and supervisors working in
21 collaborative fashion means decisions on cases and
22 benefits delivered to clients in a line with our
23 goals of timeliness.

24 Before I close, I would like to take a moment to
25 recognize the resilience, the partnership, and the

1 leadership of people living with HIV. I would also
2 like to recognize the work of advocates, our staff,
3 fellow public servants, and countless families,
4 friends, and neighbors throughout our communities
5 open whose shoulders we all stand.
6

7 HASA today is a product of our city's four-decade
8 commitment. We appreciate the council's ongoing
9 partnership in this work and the opportunity to
10 testify today. We welcome your questions.

11 Thank you.

12 VIDEO:

13 Do you want a job with a purpose? Are you
14 looking to have a job that has an impact on
15 others? Join the New York City Department of
16 Social Services. Work for HASA as a case worker.

17 Hello, my name is Alvaro Zapata. I'm from
18 Colombia. I work for HRA as a case manager.

19 Right now, what we do is to prevent
20 homelessness for people who doesn't have the
21 opportunity to try to get everything that they
22 need. And it's, for us, very important to work
23 for them every single day.

24 I used to be a psychologist in my native
25 country.

1
2 Right now, I'm doing part of my job right
3 here. Not as a psychologist, but I'm doing
4 social work.

5 Really good things about our job is-- that
6 it's something that we do with the soul because
7 you know that you're helping others.

8 And it's one of the most important things
9 that you got to have if you want to be part of
10 this kind of job. To work for the community, to
11 try to make everybody happy. It's a big work,
12 but if you do it good, everything is going to be
13 good.

14 When you have the passion for your work and
15 to try to help others doing your job, it's going
16 to be easier. And for all these people, as I say
17 this, when they don't speak the language, it's
18 like a friendly hand that is giving support to
19 them for everything they need.

20 One of the nicest thing that one of my
21 clients told me once was he was waiting for
22 someone like me.

23 That's mean that I'm doing a good job right
24 now.

25

1 If you want to be part of this job, it
2
3 doesn't matter your age. If you have your degree
4 or if you have experience, and if you like to
5 work for the community, it's your opportunity
6 because this job is for everybody who wants to be
7 part of this great team in Human Resources
8 Administration.

9 [END VIDEO]

10 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Okay. Thank you. I want to
11 recognize that we've also been joined by
12 Councilmembers Zhuang, Banks, and De La Rosa.

13 Thank you. Can you tell us what the process is
14 from referral to application to benefits receipt for
15 HASA clients?

16 MR. ROJAS: Sure. So, in order to be enrolled in
17 a HASA program, you need to demonstrate proof of HIV
18 status and that requires you showing medical
19 documentation, either a signed letter from a
20 physician or a referral form that HASA uses.

21 Once that's submitted to us, we verify the HIV
22 status with the clinician that signed the form. And
23 then you're enrolled in the program. And once you're
24 HASA, you're always HASA.

1
2 So, that means if you leave the program, you move
3 out of state, you move out of the New York City area,
4 or just leave the program, you could come back in and
5 there's no need to again demonstrate your eligibility
6 because you've already established eligibility. If
7 you-- Once enrolled, you will be assigned a
8 caseworker and that caseworker will assist you with
9 determining and assessing the needs that you need.
10 If you are eligible and qualify for benefits, we will
11 assist you in processing cash assistance, SNAP and
12 Medicaid.

13 And then also assess what other needs you may
14 have. You may need mental health services, you may
15 need substance use referral services, homemaking,
16 home care, and that assessment will assist you in
17 deciding how we triage and refer you for other
18 services.

19 We also assess your housing situation. If you're
20 homeless, we do a housing assessment and a housing
21 application and refer you to appropriate housing
22 options. And if you're permanently housed and need
23 rental assistance, we assist you with getting shelter
24 allowance to pay your ongoing rent.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: What is the average caseload
3 per worker?

4 MR. ROJAS: Currently, the average caseload is
5 about 48 to one.

6 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Wow, that's a lot. Is that
7 because of the decrease in staffing ratios?

8 MR. ROJAS: So yeah, so as I stated in my
9 testimony, we've hired over 140 caseworkers in the
10 last 18 months. We have about an additional 60 plus
11 workers to hire and we're currently in the process of
12 recruiting those vacancies as well.

13 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Okay, yeah, that's-- I did
14 case assistance in them. It's a lot of cases, and
15 they require a lot of very detailed, you know, a
16 specific type of service. What outreach does HRA
17 undertake to ensure that people are aware of the HASA
18 program and their eligibility?

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER DUDLEY: Yes, good morning.
20 The HASA program has listings on the public-facing
21 internet that explains what the HASA program is
22 about. It also has an FAQ that lists all the
23 benefits that you may be entitled to and explains how
24 you go about applying. And we also have an advisory
25 board that has members, some appointed by city

1 council, and that we also use to talk about the
2 program and what we offer and changes and updates in
3 the program.
4

5 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Are you doing any outreach to
6 social service programs in, you know, different
7 communities to ensure that people that may not have
8 access to the internet are able to still have access
9 to this information?

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER DUDLEY: Yes, our service
11 line, which is our word for intake, it's like our
12 public-facing part of the program. They're located
13 at 408th Avenue and our service line staff,
14 particularly our director of service line, has an
15 ongoing linkage to many of our community-based
16 organizations, our hospitals. We also have linkages,
17 quite frankly, to corrections at the state and local
18 level so that people who are being discharged or
19 released from corrections can be, we can make
20 arrangements to have them made eligible for HASA even
21 prior to release so if they're being discharged from
22 a hospital or a nursing home, we try to make sure
23 that they're linked with HASA prior to discharge and
24 if they need housing, if they need home care, we try

1 to make those arrangements prior to discharge from
2 those type of facilities.
3

4 So, we do try to keep linkages to our community-
5 based organizations we meet with on a regular basis
6 and also to hospitals, nursing homes, and other
7 agencies that might want to have clients who they
8 want to link with HASA prior to the person entering
9 the community.

10 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Do you know which is your
11 biggest referral source?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER DUDLEY: I would say at this
13 time, it's probably community-based organizations but
14 also we get a lot from hospitals, from people who
15 are, you know, have been diagnosed and about to be
16 discharged, and maybe they may need housing or home
17 care and so they connect with us as part of their
18 discharge planning. To say, you know, we get social
19 workers contacting us directly at service line.

20 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: I mean, we've mentioned this
21 a couple of times during my testimony and
22 Councilmember-- Chair, Schulman's testimony that
23 there is an aging population. How does HASA support
24 the specific needs of the older adult community, you
25 know, including accessibility, mobility, and so on?

1
2 MR. ROJAS: That's a great question and thank you
3 for that. I think one of the ways we best do that is
4 ensuring our clients are accessing medical care.

5 So, when they're seeing their HIV specialist,
6 they're not only treating their HIV, they're also
7 addressing any other comorbid conditions that they
8 may have, any other clinical conditions that they may
9 have. So, we routinely ask during home visits or
10 during telephone contacts, are you seeing your
11 medical provider, specifically for HIV but at the
12 same time, are you addressing your other health
13 needs?

14 So, by ensuring an individual is accessing
15 medical care, they're, and particularly HIV medical
16 care, they're also getting a holistic screening of
17 all their other needs. We work closely with our
18 colleagues at the Department of Health, and
19 particularly Dr. Braunstein's team to-- on a routine,
20 semi-annual basis, see how many of our clients are
21 being engaged in care and how many are virally
22 suppressed.

23 And then there's a specific focus on those
24 individuals if they're not accessing care or virally
25 suppressed, which allows us to really target it and

1
2 say, hey, you haven't seen a medical provider. Why
3 is that? What is the barrier? Or what's going on?
4 Or if you're not virally suppressed, are you having
5 challenges taking your ART medication? So, that
6 collaboration with Dr. Braunstein and her team really
7 affords us the opportunity to do hyper micro
8 targeting of our clients who are not engaged in care
9 and make sure that they do get engaged in care or at
10 least support them. It ultimates their decision.

11 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Yeah. Do we know what the
12 percentage of older adults or people that would be
13 considered over the age?

14 MR. ROJAS: Sure. I'm going to be careful on
15 this because I'm a man of a certain age, but I would
16 say, and if I remember correctly, Jackie, I would say
17 at least 50% of our clients are over the age of 50.

18 And I would, if I remember correctly, I think at
19 least, I would say at least 30 to 40% of our clients
20 have been with HASA for more than 20 years.

21 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Wow.

22 MR. ROJAS: So, we do have a lot of long-term
23 survival, which is great, which really demonstrate
24 the longevity of our clients on ART medication and

25

1
2 accessing medical care and medical treatment and
3 medication.

4 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: We've been joined by
5 Councilmember Menin.

6 In the supportive housing, the HASA supportive
7 housing programs, are there social workers that are
8 trained specifically to work with the elderly
9 population? I mean, because they do have specific
10 needs, right? And I mean, I worked in a senior
11 center and there was a lot of mental health issues,
12 right?, that were going unaddressed. There were not
13 only food insecurity, but maybe dementia, right, that
14 was undiagnosed. Difficulty with mobility, opening a
15 window, changing a light bulb. Like these are things
16 that we take for granted, but that impact the older
17 adult community. Like are those programs--

18 MR. ROJAS: Absolutely, Councilmember. I think
19 one of the important aspects of our supportive
20 housing programs, and not just the HIV specific ones,
21 but particularly the ones that HASA targets and
22 funds. We have a low case worker-- case manager to
23 client ratio. It's 20 to one. So, therefore, in
24 addition to the HASA case worker that's engaging with
25 the person with HIV-AIDS, they have someone on site,

1 if it's a congregate facility, who will meet with
2 them either weekly or monthly and assess their needs.

3 And that includes assessing what medical needs
4 just beyond HIV as well, what are their general
5 needs. And then the good part about that is they
6 coordinate with the HASA case worker. If an
7 individual who is older needs, for example, home care
8 or homemaking, that service can be coordinated
9 through HASA directly, it doesn't have to go to
10 another area.

11 One of the divisions I also oversee is Medicaid
12 and home care. So, we have a coordination directly
13 at HASA to coordinate for the provision of home care
14 and homemaking services directly. So, we could
15 bypass a lot of that red tape to really enable
16 someone to access additional assistance if they need
17 it in their home.

18 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: I appreciate that. Can you
19 tell us what the current transportation and
20 nutritional allowance is? And when was the last time
21 that it was increased?

22 MR. ROJAS: Sure, the current nutrition and
23 transportation allowance is \$158 a month. And this
24 allowance has not changed since its inception.
25

1 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Which was when, 40 years ago?

2 MR. ROJAS: 40 years ago or so, so yes.

3 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Well, that's disappointing.

4 I mean, especially because the rate of everything has
5 gone up significantly.

6 Okay. According to, well-- but before I move
7 on, is that an ask on, you know, now that we're going
8 to be negotiating the budget, would you normally
9 submit a request to increase that amount?
10

11 MR. ROJAS: So, that would have to be a
12 conversation with our state oversight agency, the
13 Office of Temporary Disability Assistance, since that
14 is part of a cash assistance allowance. So, that
15 would be a conversation we would need to have with
16 OTDA, and we've had that conversation.

17 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: You've had that conversation.
18 Okay.

19 MR. ROJAS: So, something we'll follow up with
20 our team to make sure what the status is and give an
21 update.

22 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Yeah, no, I always ask
23 because I find that a lot of agencies have, you know,
24 a need for, you know, more funding in a specific
25 area, but then, you know, are not necessarily out

1 there, right, fighting for that funding. And so it's
2 important that the advocacy comes not only from the
3 council, but from the organization that has, you
4 know, the firsthand experience of, you know, these
5 programs.
6

7 According to the DSS quarterly report on HASA,
8 the administration has failed to meet the required
9 case ratios every quarter since 21. DSS shared in a
10 letter to the New York City Council compliance team
11 that a failure to meet the case ratios was due in
12 part to the hiring difficulties.

13 I know you said that you've hired 140 social
14 workers so far. So, how long, how, when have you
15 started, when were these 140 workers hired?

16 MR. ROJAS: The 146 case workers?

17 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Yes.

18 MR. ROJAS: So, the 146 were hired between July
19 1, 2023, through December 31, 2024. During COVID,
20 we-- a lot of folks retired. It was time and also
21 not coincidentally, and rightfully so, when the last
22 COLAs, staff COLAs were issued, a lot of staff took
23 that opportunity also to retire. One of the, I
24 think, and Ms. Dudley could attest this, one of the
25 successes of HASA is that many of our staff, once

1 they start working at HASA, stay at HASA. They're
2 long-term workers, they're dedicated to their field,
3 they're dedicated to their clients.
4

5 And many of them have worked in HASA since its
6 inception, since the 90s. So, we have a lot of
7 workers who have been on HASA for 30-plus years. So,
8 you know, we are seeing a lot of attrition because of
9 that, and then COVID happened, and I think that
10 accelerated a little more than usual retirements.

11 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: So, we hired 146 social
12 workers. How many social workers would you need to
13 be, you know?

14 MR. ROJAS: We are recruiting for an additional
15 64 case workers.

16 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: 64?

17 MR. ROJAS: Correct.

18 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Are you recruiting in some of
19 the schools, maybe, as well?

20 MR. ROJAS: We are, and we have tons of outreach
21 that we're doing provisionally. I think one of the
22 real tools that we've utilized is the fact that we
23 received an exemption to the hiring freeze for case
24 workers, which really gave us the opportunity to hire
25 freely. And during this time, DCATS didn't have an

1 established list, so we were able to hire
2 provisionally.
3

4 So, those 146 case workers are hired. Now, we
5 recently had a civil service exam, and I'm happy to
6 report that I think it was between 98% to 99% of all
7 our provisional staff took the exam and passed it.

8 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Oh, that's wonderful.

9 MR. ROJAS: Yeah, so we'll be able to retain them
10 when later this year, the DCATS list. So, we're
11 working closely with DCATS on-- Because that's
12 important, because if they were provisional and they
13 can't stay, it would be problematic for us.

14 So, that, coupled with our collaboration with
15 DCATS for the retention bonus, I think has really
16 worked to really hire staff and be able to retain
17 staff, because if they stay X number of months to get
18 that retention bonus, and we also highlight upcoming
19 COLAs, such as in May, there'll be an additional COLA
20 for staff as well, under DC37.

21 So, I think we have a good plan, and we'll be
22 able to recruit, and we anticipate a DCATS civil
23 service list coming out probably in the spring. I
24 don't want to quote for DCATS, but I think sometime
25 in the early spring.

1 So, we'll be able to call civil service lists to
2
3 fill those remaining lines that we have vacant.

4 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: And will filling those
5 remaining lines reduce the caseload ratio?

6 MR. ROJAS: Absolutely, absolutely.

7 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: What would ideally be the
8 average?

9 MR. ROJA: Well, so the local law is 34-to-one.
10 One thing I would add is that in addition to the
11 caseworkers that we have, anyone who's in supportive
12 housing also has a caseworker.

13 So, we have about 5,500 units of contracted
14 supportive housing, both congregate and scattered
15 site. In addition to HASA caseworkers, individuals
16 living in supportive housing have an additional
17 caseworker. And those caseworkers that we just spoke
18 about have a 20-to-one caseload ratio.

19 So, that affords our HASA clients living in
20 supportive housing to access a HASA caseworker in
21 addition to the supportive housing caseworker. And
22 then, you know, we're not even including a lot of the
23 case management services that are available in the
24 community. Through Dr. Braunstein's area in DOHMH,
25 under Ryan White Part A, there is medical care

1 coordination, medical case management, which is a
2 form of case management for individuals who really
3 need services to help them engage in medical care.

4 And that's affiliated with hospitals and Dr.
5 Braunstein could talk about that if necessary. So,
6 those are services that are out there and available
7 and there is substantial funding for that and spread
8 across the city. So, there's a lot of services
9 available to our clients, both community-based
10 through HASA and through supportive housing if
11 they're enrolled in a supportive housing program.

12 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Okay. While talking about
13 supportive housing. Can you tell us what the current
14 number of homeless HASA clients actively seeking
15 housing is?

16 MR. ROJAS: Sure. Currently, we have 2,186
17 individuals residing in temporary housing. And
18 there's two types of temporary housing that HASA
19 provides. One is emergency housing, also known as
20 congregate housing, and transitional housing. And I
21 believe, Ms. Dudley, we have about 1,000 or so
22 individuals who have active housing applications.

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER DUDLEY: Yes. We work with
24 all of our clients who are living in emergency
25

1 housing to assist them in getting permanently placed.
2 So, all 2,000 plus, but currently, right now, we have
3 approximately 1,100 who have an active supportive
4 housing application pending.
5

6 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Okay. And how temporary is
7 temporary in temporary housing?

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER DUDLEY: About 150 days on
9 average.

10 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Okay.

11 MR. ROJAS: So, that's a great point, Ms.
12 Dudley. I would just clarify, the average stay is,
13 but no one gets moved out if they don't reach the 150
14 days. That means, on average, it takes them about
15 150 days for them to find permanent housing.

16 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Okay. And how many of HASA's
17 contracted supportive housing units are currently
18 vacant?

19 MR. ROJAS: Sure. So, of our supportive housing
20 portfolio, we have-- Sorry, I have that information
21 right here. We have about 8% or 400 that are
22 currently vacant. And we have another 8% that are
23 currently offline.

24 Offline units are units that are usually-- if
25 it's a scattered site apartment, meaning an apartment

1
2 in a community-based, a regular apartment building in
3 a community, may not be leased, they lost a lease or
4 they're transitioning a lease. It may be that the
5 unit is sealed. If someone passed away or there was
6 a NYPD or a fire incident, the apartment will be
7 sealed, and then it has to be opened by a court
8 order.

9 And then finally, apartments that require repairs
10 or renovations. So, for offline units, we have about
11 8%, and then we have 8% that are vacant, which is, we
12 range usually between to 5% to 10% because people
13 turn over, people come in, people come out. And
14 that's not always a bad thing because we want some
15 turnover.

16 So, for new people to come in and other people
17 successfully transition out of supportive housing
18 into independent living, which is a nice cycle for
19 them to move out if necessary.

20 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: For the units that need
21 repairs, who's responsible for that? The landlord,
22 the sponsoring organization, is that you?

23 MR. ROJAS: So, it's a mixed bag between the
24 landlord and the sponsoring organization. If it's a
25 congregate facility, it's usually the owner of the

1 building, it's usually the property management
2 company that's working with the nonprofit for the
3 congregate facility.
4

5 If it's in a community-based apartment or what we
6 call scattered site, it would be the landlord of the
7 apartment. So, the nonprofit would have to
8 collaborate and liaise with the landlord to have the
9 repairs made.

10 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: And that usually takes how
11 long?

12 MR. ROJAS: That could range. I would say
13 usually 30 days. If it's more extensive repairs, it
14 may be a little longer. Sometimes it takes a little
15 longer.

16 On occasion, we have client incidents. It might
17 be client-induced incidents or it might be a fire or
18 it might be a flood, what have you. So, those take a
19 little longer.

20 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Fair enough. Moving on to
21 the funding. So, HASA's budget for fiscal year 2025
22 is currently almost \$300 million and has been
23 baselined at about \$282 million for fiscal year 26
24 and the out years.
25

1
2 The funding for the program varies with about 50%
3 coming from the city, 26% from the federal
4 government, and 22% from the state.

5 In light of the Trump administration's recent
6 efforts to cut federal funding, there is a very real
7 chance that the federal funding source will go away.
8 What plans does the city have to ensure that
9 individuals receiving care through HASA will have
10 continued access to services and housing, and to fill
11 the funding gap that will be left if the federal
12 government stops the spending?

13 MR. ROJAS: So, as you stated, Councilmember, 26%
14 of our funding is federal-based. I would say a large
15 part of that is through a collaborative grant with
16 the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene under Dr.
17 Braunstein's team.

18 We're monitoring our federal funding closely to
19 see if there are any changes. We don't anticipate
20 any changes to our shelter allowance.

21 We continue to provide rental assistance to over
22 21,000 individuals. That hasn't changed, and we
23 don't anticipate that will change. We continue to do
24 so.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: And-- oh, sorry. I want to
3 recognize that we've been joined by Councilmember
4 Riley.

5 In the HASA quarterly performance report for July
6 through September of 24, there are 44 cases listed as
7 ineligible due to not meeting medical criteria.

8 Can you share if these applications were from
9 individuals who did not have an HIV diagnosis, or
10 were there different medical criteria that they did
11 not meet?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER DUDLEY: Yes, these are
13 individuals who, the only medical criteria you need
14 to meet to become a HASA client is to be HIV
15 positive. But these are people who, unfortunately,
16 were not able to submit sufficient documentation to
17 establish the fact that they were diagnosed with HIV.

18 We offer assistance where necessary and with the
19 proper authorization from the client, we will help
20 them in contacting their doctor and getting the lab
21 reports if necessary.

22 But, unfortunately, for those individuals, they
23 weren't able to do so, but they're always welcome to
24 come back at a later time and submit the proper

1 documentation, and we will definitely reconsider
2 those applications.
3

4 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Okay. And there were 1,198
5 cases that were closed during that same reporting
6 period. Of these, 405, or 33%, were closed due to
7 failure to recertify. What is the recertification
8 process for HASA cases, and what outreach is done to
9 ensure that clients are aware of the need to
10 recertify and can do so in a timely manner?

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER DUDLEY: Well, in HASA, one
12 of the good things that in our program, we don't have
13 automatic case closings for failure to recertify. If
14 a client does not recertify in a timely fashion, and
15 they're sent out mail notifications by mail to notify
16 them of their recertification date, we also-- because
17 we have case management staff, we also make phone
18 calls to the client to remind them that, "Hey, your
19 case is going to close, you need to come in and
20 recertify." But sometimes clients, unbeknownst to us,
21 they may have relocated to another jurisdiction or
22 something else may be going on that doesn't allow
23 them to complete their recertification, but it's not
24 automatically closed by a computer at a certain date.
25 We conduct outreach.

1
2 But certainly at a certain point, if we continue
3 to be unsuccessful, by state law, we have to close
4 those cases, but if they reappear and show up at any
5 time, we can certainly work with them to reopen those
6 cases.

7 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Well, 333 cases were closed
8 due to excessive income, of which 84 were for excess
9 income with Social Security.

10 Do you know how many of these cases had excess
11 income of less than \$5 or less, or above the income
12 requirement?

13 MR. ROJAS: We have, our team is crunching those
14 numbers. I can say that in recent years, and in
15 particular, I believe two years ago, all individuals
16 receiving Social Security were fortunate to have
17 larger than usual increases. Actually, I believe in
18 one year, it was over 8%.

19 Unfortunately, that does-- when income does
20 increase, it may make you ineligible for cash
21 assistance based on your income, but we are crunching
22 those numbers for those 84, and we'll formally
23 respond with a breakdown at the levels you pushed by,
24 the five, the ten.

1 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Okay, is DSS able to request
2 a waiver for clients with minimal excess income?
3

4 MR. ROJAS: No, DSS is not able to request
5 waivers for cash assistance clients, including HASA
6 clients.

7 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Okay, I'm going to stop
8 asking questions now, because I have a lot of
9 colleagues here, and I want to make sure that they
10 have an opportunity to ask.

11 I'll turn it over to the Chair, Schulman.

12 CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: Thank you very much, Chair
13 Ayala.

14 So, I just wanted to go back quickly to, when we
15 spoke about outreach for HRA, for the HASA program,
16 do you also work with the city's public engagement
17 unit?

18 MR. ROJAS: Yes, we work with PEU. I would also
19 say that in addition to the outreach efforts that Ms.
20 Dudley described, we have a-- in addition to the
21 advisory board, we have a HASA working group, which
22 includes consumers, advocates, we have a lot of
23 attorneys on as well, representatives, where we talk
24 about HASA services, and we have over 100 contracted
25 providers that provide primarily housing services,

1 but those housing providers are also providers of
2 community-based services, not housing. So, we have a
3 wide array of housing and non-housing providers that
4 we connect with regularly.
5

6 So, yeah, and it includes our public engagement
7 unit, PEU, as we know it.

8 CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: Because my understanding
9 of, when I was doing some work with them, they go
10 door-to-door, which is great. So, you know, which is
11 very helpful. Okay, I'm going to ask now some DOHMH
12 questions.

13 So, one question that I had-- So one of my
14 colleagues, Councilmember Narcisse, asked me, and I
15 have the same question: what is attributable to the
16 increase in HIV-AIDS cases, if you can respond to
17 that?

18 DR. BRAUNSTEIN: Sure, thank you for that
19 question, Councilmember. So, we did, yes, as noted
20 earlier in your comments, we did note a 7.6% increase
21 in the number of new diagnoses we saw in the city
22 between 2022 and 2023.

23 We do-- You know, surveillance data are
24 incredibly powerful, but don't tell us lots of the
25 why.

1
2 But, you know, our speculation and what we've
3 observed in other recent years is that there's likely
4 a contribution to this increase of people returning
5 to engage in medical care and sexual health care,
6 specifically HIV testing, you know, either because of
7 an absence from healthcare during and post the height
8 of the COVID-19 public health emergency, and then
9 returning to sexual health care since.

10 CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: Great, no, I appreciate
11 that, and not necessarily a question for you here,
12 because I have another hearing next week about public
13 health emergencies, which will include HIV and AIDS,
14 but I think we need to take a look at how we collect
15 the data, considering what's going on with the
16 federal government right now, and how we're going to
17 move forward with that. So, I'm just putting it out
18 there, I'm not...

19 So, to conduct the report, DOHMH states that they
20 rely on electronically reported HIV-related
21 laboratory tests, and DOHMH-led investigations that
22 confirm the date and fact of an HIV diagnosis. How
23 does DOHMH conduct these investigations?

24 DR. BRAUNSTEIN: Sure, so we are fortunate to
25 have a very robust case investigation team and

1
2 program within the Department of Health and Mental
3 Hygiene, wherein we, as you noted, we receive
4 electronically reported laboratory tests indicating
5 HIV positivity, and then actually, while someone is
6 living with HIV, we also receive all tests related to
7 their HIV, so CD4 counts, viral load tests, that
8 enable us to measure and track outcomes for people
9 living with HIV. So, we receive those laboratory
10 tests, house them in a very secure, very
11 sophisticated data system, our surveillance system,
12 and then we have a team of community-based staff who
13 use that information on someone's first positive test
14 reported to the health department to approach that
15 person for interview, and that interview has multiple
16 purposes, two primary ones being to ask that person
17 about sex or needle-sharing partners that may have
18 been exposed to HIV and could benefit from HIV
19 testing, linkage to care if positive, or HIV
20 prevention, such as pre-exposure prophylaxis, and
21 also then to link the newly diagnosed individual with
22 HIV medical care.

23 So, we-- And we do reach nearly all people
24 diagnosed with HIV in a given year.

25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: I was going to ask you
3 also, what is DOHMH's process of searching for
4 unreported cases? And by the way, with everything
5 going on with the federal government, there may be
6 more of those, so...

7 DR. BRAUNSTEIN: Sure, we, you know, we have a
8 very close relationship with, you know, the providers
9 throughout New York City, so there's a sort of
10 duplicative-but-complementary system wherein not only
11 are we receiving laboratory tests related to HIV
12 automatically, electronically to our surveillance
13 system, but also providers report new HIV diagnoses
14 that they've made and also are required by law to
15 report people who are diagnosed with HIV who are new
16 to their care.

17 So, we have multiple sort of checks and balances.
18 So, that's-- You know, provider reporting is a
19 critical way that we learn about perhaps not as yet
20 reported HIV positive people through our surveillance
21 system.

22 CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: In your 2023 annual
23 report, you noted a 7.6% increase in the number of
24 HIV diagnoses in New York City from 2022 to 2023, but
25 a 17% decrease in new HIV infections. One is how did

1 you determine there had been a 17% decrease in new
2 HIV infections despite the increase in diagnoses, and
3 can you explain the divergence in the two statistics?
4

5 DR. BRAUNSTEIN: Sure, thank you for that
6 question. So, yes, so HIV diagnoses are actual first
7 positive tests reported to our surveillance system as
8 I just noted. HIV incidents, which is actually the
9 number of newly acquired infections during a period
10 of time. These are not necessarily diagnosed and so
11 are not, you know, known through a positive test.

12 So, instead we and other health department
13 jurisdictions across the country estimate HIV
14 incidents using a methodology, an analytic
15 methodology developed by the Centers for Disease
16 Control and Prevention. And that methodology uses
17 CD4 count or a marker of immune status data that we
18 do get in surveillance to essentially estimate among
19 people reported to the surveillance system when they
20 may have acquired their HIV infection. And that
21 number is really powerful because it gives us a
22 better sense even than the number of new diagnoses of
23 the sort of leading edge, the current, you know, even
24 more complete status of HIV acquisition in the city
25 in a given year.

1 So, you're right to point out that we did see
2
3 this divergence in a single year between the number
4 of new diagnoses and the estimated number of HIV
5 infections. And what we, you know-- No one year, no
6 one data point makes a trend. So, this is something
7 we'll certainly monitor over time to see what
8 direction this takes.

9 But what we, you know, hypothesize around these
10 two numbers together is that that new diagnosis
11 number reflects that we did in fact importantly
12 detect more people who had been living with an HIV
13 infection for a longer period but were not yet
14 diagnosed. And that it looks like so far that the
15 actual number, estimated number of people acquiring
16 HIV is going down.

17 CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: Okay, thank you. So, the
18 annual report also states that the highest number of
19 deaths associated with HIV-AIDS occurred among black
20 and Latino, Hispanic New Yorkers who are based, who
21 are based poverty levels were classified as medium
22 poverty or very high poverty. How is DOHMH ensuring
23 valuable information and resources regarding HIV and
24 AIDS are getting to those communities who most need
25 it?

1
2 DR. BRAUNSTEIN: Yeah, absolutely. Our, the
3 entire suite of our programming, both on the
4 prevention side and on the care and treatment side is
5 all driven by what we know to be the epidemiology of
6 HIV and the disproportionate distribution of HIV in
7 this city.

8 So, we specifically work with clinical
9 institutions, community-based organizations based in
10 high-poverty or high-prevalence neighborhoods and
11 areas or who serve clients living in those areas to
12 ensure that our resources, both prevention and care
13 and treatment, are targeted to the people who need
14 them most.

15 CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: Okay, according to DOHMH,
16 the Ryan White HIV-AIDS Program, Part A Grant Awards
17 Program, provides an expanded form of HIV case
18 management along with temporary housing support. How
19 many units of supportive housing are available under
20 that program?

21 DR. BRAUNSTEIN: Sure, so we measure the reach of
22 the Ryan White Housing Program more so in number of
23 active clients enrolled in a given year. And so in
24 grant year 2023, which is the most recent complete
25 year of data available, we served a total of 416

1 clients for short term housing programs. We served a
2 total number of 415 unique clients for housing
3 placement assistant programs, and 221 clients
4 received short term rental assistance through the
5 program.
6

7 CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: So, DOHMH receives the
8 Ryan White Part A Grant from the federal government
9 to provide services to individuals living with HIV in
10 New York City.

11 In 2024, New York City received a \$92 million
12 grant for the program. In 2024, New York City also
13 received a \$45 million formula grant from HUD for the
14 HOPWA program. In light of the Trump
15 administration's recent efforts to cut federal
16 spending, there's a very real chance that this
17 funding stream will go away.

18 What plans does DOHMH have, if any, to ensure
19 that individuals under these programs will have
20 continued access to services and housing if federal
21 funding disappears?

22 DR. BRAUNSTEIN: It is true that this critical
23 work to support people with HIV in the city is
24 largely reliant on federal funding. And these are
25 large grants that DOHMH has received over many, many

1 years. And we are very closely monitoring the
2 situation, working with national partnerships and
3 health department colleagues across the United States
4 to really monitor the situation very closely in terms
5 of future funding levels.
6

7 Are there any DOHMH-- We heard from the folks at
8 DSS-- Are there any DOHMH HIV-AIDS programs or
9 services geared towards older New Yorkers on your
10 end?

11 DR. BRAUNSTEIN: Yes, absolutely. Including as
12 part of our Ryan White Part A program, we have a
13 number of partnerships that we support, that we fund
14 through that program with clinical institutions to
15 provide ambulatory and other wraparound care services
16 to people aging with HIV. So, typically people ages
17 50 and older. We have-- Yeah, we have a number of
18 programs dedicated to serving people with HIV who are
19 aging.

20 CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: So, now I'm going to ask
21 you to describe how you guys work together so that
22 you don't have overlap and that you are working
23 efficiently in this space because that's going to be
24 important moving forward, obviously.
25

1
2 DR. BRAUNSTEIN: Yeah, my colleague mentioned a
3 really robust collaboration that in fact has been
4 such in existence since 2007.

5 So, the team that I mentioned that's under my
6 bureau that goes out and does partner services
7 interviews and links people newly diagnosed with care
8 also has a component to its work to use our
9 surveillance data to identify people ...who may be
10 disengaged from HIV care and to proactively do
11 outreach to those people to facilitate their
12 relinkage to care. We twice a year, as John
13 mentioned, we twice a year do matches with the data
14 matches with the HASA client list to very pointedly
15 assess the care status and viral suppression status
16 of HASA clients and then those who appear to not be
17 engaged in care, my team will go out and facilitate
18 relinkage to care.

19 I will also note that because not only is HIV
20 under my purview in the Bureau of Hepatitis HIV and
21 STIs but also STIs and viral hepatitis are. We not
22 only match the HASA client list to our HIV registry
23 to identify those clients' HIV care status but also
24 look at our STI and viral hepatitis surveillance
25 systems to see if those clients additionally need

1 support for linkage to viral hepatitis, B or C, care
2 and treatment or screening and STI treatment as well.

3
4 So, it's a really robust collaboration.

5 I will also note just in terms of the
6 conversation earlier that because of that
7 collaboration, my team also and we are often,
8 especially from the health department perspective,
9 the first people interfacing with someone newly
10 diagnosed with HIV. And so we do a very broad
11 assessment of need for supportive services broadly
12 beyond just HIV itself for those people including
13 promoting the HASA program.

14 So, it's really a really important sort of touch
15 point for people being newly diagnosed with HIV to
16 make them aware of the HASA program and direct them
17 to these colleagues.

18 CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: Do you-- So do you have a--
19 - Because I know we heard testimony earlier about my
20 pre-considered intro. Do you have a position on that
21 or...?

22 DR. BRAUNSTEIN: We don't.

23 CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: To expand the HIV
24 definition for HASA?

1
2 DR. BRAUNSTEIN: I think we would support our
3 colleagues' position. Now I want to thank you and I
4 also want to say that especially in light of
5 everything that's going on, one, we want to make sure
6 that HIV, people living with HIV and AIDS are taken
7 care of but also to the extent that you can promote
8 that and let people know that we're here for them and
9 with everything that's going on, that would be much
10 appreciated. So, thank you.

11 Chair Ayala, I'll give it back to you.

12 MR. ROJAS: Councilmember, I would also add one,
13 I think critical collaboration that I think really
14 saved lives in the last couple of years was our
15 collaboration on COVID. The Department of Health,
16 through Dr. Braunstein's team and other areas, other
17 divisions, the Bureau of Communicable Diseases,
18 Bureau of Immunization and their emergency response
19 teams really collaborated with us in our congregate
20 facilities, in our temporary housing, SRO, emergency
21 housing transitional facilities and our permanent
22 supportive housing.

23 We were able to scale up testing onsite at all
24 our HIV housing facilities, both emergency and
25 permanent and congregate settings. And when

1 necessary, we were able to place folks in isolation
2 and quarantine, provide them access to resources if
3 they needed treatment in addition to what they were
4 receiving from the general medical care.
5

6 The guidance that the providers really, really,
7 really saved lives.

8 And similarly, during that same time as we were
9 tackling COVID, we had an overlay of monkeypox that
10 Dr. Braunstein's team and others and the Department
11 of Health really helped us with. So, we were
12 literally in a collaboration where we had HASA case
13 workers, nights and weekends, calling up staff. We
14 were working with their teams to schedule
15 appointments at their sexual health clinics to do a
16 monkeypox vaccination for this target population
17 since they're more susceptible to-- I'm sorry, mpox,
18 I know it, I apologize. Mpox, not monkeypox. We
19 changed the name.

20 So, we did that collaboration. I just want to
21 thank my colleagues at Department of Health because
22 it really saved lives and it really gave the most
23 vulnerable or the vulnerable due to clinical needs
24 the access to vaccines for mpox, as well as COVID
25 vaccinations that we were providing. We provided it

1 onsite, but we coordinated any ancillary care that we
2 needed with our partners at the Department of Health.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: I just have one quick
5 question. If somebody has HIV and is in need of
6 help, can they call 311 and get referred to you guys?
7 Is that what--

8 MR. ROJAS: Absolutely, absolutely, yes.

9 CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: Okay. Thank you very
10 much, Chair.

11 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Thank you. Councilmember,
12 I'm sorry, Ariola has a question. Thank you, Chairs.

13 COUNCILMEMBER ARIOLA: So, we've talked a lot
14 about your programming and it really is very robust
15 and I'm impressed with all the work that you're
16 doing, the good work that you're doing. But also
17 we're really focusing a lot on the potential of a
18 lack of federal funding for this type of programming.
19 I know that you said, DOHMH, that you've been in
20 touch with your counterparts on a federal level.

21 Has there been any indication that funding for
22 DOHMH or for HASA will be done, any defunding of your
23 programming? Do you have any indication from the
24 federal government, the new administration, that that
25 should happen?

1
2 MR. ROJAS: At the Department of Social Services,
3 at least to my knowledge, haven't received any formal
4 funding. A large part of the 26% of our federal
5 funding that comes to DSS is actually through a
6 shared grant with the Department of Health. So, it's
7 the same housing grant that we share through HUD.

8 At least on our end, we haven't received any
9 formal funding of any cuts. But again, both of our
10 agencies sit on national boards and are monitoring
11 closely that. But I haven't received any formal
12 funding, formal notification of any cuts to funding
13 as of yet.

14 COUNCILMEMBER ARIOLA: All right, thank you so
15 much. And we haven't either. Perfect, thank you so
16 much.

17 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: I'm going to move to the PMMR
18 indicators for HASA. According to the latest city
19 performance report, in the first four months of
20 fiscal year 25, the average number of days to issue
21 enhanced housing benefits from submission of
22 completed application increased by 39% to 20.9 days.
23 What is the cause of the increase in average days
24 that HASA clients must wait after submission to
25 receive housing benefits?

1
2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER DUDLEY: Thank you for that
3 question. Certainly we strive at the HASA program to
4 process all applications as quickly as possible. By
5 law, we have 30 days after an application is
6 completed to issue the benefits if the application is
7 approved. However, during this past summer, the
8 summer of 2024, and early fall, we did have a larger
9 than normal amount of recertifications.

10 And why did that happen? It was because during
11 the COVID pandemic and shortly thereafter, we had
12 gotten a stay delayed and granted a waiver of
13 recertifications for a lot of clients, so clients
14 could shelter at home. And so recertification dates
15 were pushed out. But what happened was last summer
16 and early fall, the recertification dates and new
17 ones came due.

18 At the same time, we had our normal
19 recertifications due every month during that time
20 period. So, we had a larger than normal amount of
21 recerts. And the same staff were handling those
22 numbers, were handling the benefit issuances.

23 So, we just had a larger volume during those
24 months, July, August, September, October. The good
25 news is we're starting to see it level out. And so

1 we're hoping that our performance will return back to
2 its normal rates.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: That makes sense. Yeah. The
5 budget for HASA SRO hotels went up substantially
6 between the November fiscal 2025 budget and the
7 preliminary 2026 budget, from \$28.6 million to \$46.6
8 million, an \$18 million increase.

9 Can HRA detail what the increases in budgeted
10 funding is for?

11 MR. ROJAS: Sure. Our budget is, since our SRO
12 emergency housing portfolio is per diem and it's
13 based on need, it's funded at one amount. And as
14 needed, we increased the budget to accommodate
15 additional resources they may need.

16 So, basically, we don't overfund it because we
17 may not need as many units at that time. But as we
18 monitor it on a daily basis, how many folks are being
19 placed, how many require emergency housing in SROs,
20 and as that number increases or decreases, we adjust
21 the budget. So, as the year goes by, usually we'll
22 see on an annual basis an increase to cover the cost.

23 Unlike our transitional housing contracts or
24 supportive housing where you have a set contract, you
25 enter into a contract with a person and that contract

1 is locked in place. For SROs, it's like a hotel.
2
3 You pay as you reside.

4 And if nobody's in there, we don't pay you for
5 it. So, as that number fluctuates, we adjust our
6 budget accordingly.

7 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: How many SRO hotels are you
8 guys using or contracting?

9 MR. ROJAS: Currently, we have 2,117 units of
10 emergency housing, SRO housing.

11 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Okay. Can you tell us what
12 is the budgeted funding for HOSA contracts in fiscal
13 year 26 and in the out years?

14 MR. ROJAS: Sure. So, I can tell you currently
15 what our, for FY25, currently for supportive housing,
16 we have an annual, the contract value of our
17 supportive housing contracts is \$179 million.

18 We have 98 contracts for roughly about 5,500
19 units of supportive housing. For transitional
20 housing, we have annual budget of \$26 million with
21 774 contracted units. Okay.

22 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Are all 78 contracts for
23 direct HOSA services for HRA clients?

24 MR. ROJAS: For our housing, it is solely for
25 HOSA clients.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Okay. Okay. I have no
3 further questions. Seeing that there are no other
4 questions from the panel, from the members, then that
5 concludes this part of the hearing. Thank you so
6 much for coming.

7 MR. ROJAS: Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: I want to recognize that
9 we've been joined by Councilmember Stevens.

10 I now open the hearing for public testimony.

11 I remind members of the public that this is a
12 government proceeding and that the quorum shall be
13 observed at all times. As such, members of the
14 public shall remain silent at all times. The witness
15 table is reserved for people who wish to testify.

16 No video recording or photography is allowed from
17 the witness table.

18 Further, members of the public may not present
19 audio or video recordings as testimony, but may
20 submit transcripts of such recordings to the Sergeant
21 at Arms for inclusion in the hearing record. If you
22 wish to speak at today's hearing, please fill out an
23 appearance card with the Sergeant at Arms and wait to
24 be recognized.

1
2 When recognized, you will have two minutes to
3 speak on today's hearing topics. Actually, that's
4 three minutes to speak on today's hearing topic, the
5 administration of HASA. If you have a written
6 statement or additional written testimony that you
7 wish to submit for the record, please provide a copy
8 of that testimony to the Sergeant at Arms.

9 You may also email testimony to
10 testimony@council.nyc.gov within 72 hours of this
11 hearing. Audio and video recordings will not be
12 accepted. I'm going to be calling the first panel.

13 Armen Merjian, John Boyle, Daniel Leyva, and
14 Joshua Elmore.

15 You may begin.

16 MR. BOYLE: My name is Jack Boyle. I'm a staff
17 attorney with the Neighborhood Defender Service of
18 Harlem. I want to focus specifically on the rental
19 assistance payments administered by HASA. Our office
20 has recently seen numerous HASA recipients who've
21 been brought to housing courts solely due to
22 bureaucratic failures that have significantly reduced
23 or entirely cut off their voucher payments.

24 We often find that caseworkers are not able to
25 correct these errors in a timely manner. Our clients

1 frequently report that their assigned caseworkers
2 have expressed personal hostility to them and their
3 status. Yet every time a HASA client interacts with
4 HRA, they're expected to do so only through that
5 assigned caseworker, who's often overworked, creating
6 an unnecessary hurdle to accessing or making
7 necessary changes to benefits.
8

9 These challenges mean that HASA clients are often
10 in a more difficult position in housing court than
11 recipients of other HRA voucher programs such as
12 CityFHEPS and StateFHEPS. NDS urges the council and
13 HRA to consider changes to this important program to
14 protect these extremely vulnerable clients.

15 First, the council should consider changing the
16 administrative code to require reporting on the
17 timeline from when a HASA client first requests that
18 a caseworker begin an application for a benefit to
19 when that application is actually completed.

20 Currently, reporting is only required from the
21 timeline from when a benefit application is marked
22 complete to when-- or submitted, to when a
23 determination is actually made.
24
25

1
2 This is concerning as numerous clients report
3 that caseworkers fail to or refuse to actually start
4 those benefits applications or requests entirely.

5 For example, Mr. Y accrued significant rental
6 arrears as HASA miscalculated his rental assistance
7 payments.

8 Mr. Y notified his caseworker of the issue over a
9 year ago and repeatedly begged for assistance. No
10 action was taken.

11 Even when an attorney got involved, it took half
12 a year for HASA to complete a request for the
13 arrears, and even then it did so for an incorrect
14 amount.

15 Today, Mr. Y remains at serious risk of eviction.

16 Another client, Mr. Z's partner, was a HASA
17 recipient and a co-tenant in the apartment. When our
18 office applied for a one-shot deal on behalf of the
19 household, HRA refused to process the application and
20 demanded that it go through HASA.

21 The HASA caseworker then also refused to assist,
22 and the caseworker informed NDS that he did not care
23 about preventing the eviction because HASA preferred
24 to force the tenant to get evicted and enter shelter.

1 These are just a few examples among many. The
2
3 extensive advocacy and litigation that is often
4 required to obtain basic assistance from HASA places
5 an unfair burden on clients and advocates alike.

6 The council and HRA should also consider steps to
7 permit HASA clients to submit their own applications
8 so that access to benefits are not entirely held up
9 by an uncooperative or often overwhelmed caseworker.

10 Second, HRA must do more to protect HASA clients
11 from discrimination. HASA is the only HRA program
12 where individuals managing a tenant's rental
13 assistance are aware of sensitive medical information
14 like their HIV status.

15 Indeed, in prior testimony to this council,
16 Commissioner Park explained that HRA does not track
17 the APS status of CityFHEPS recipients precisely for
18 this reason. And if HRA is unwilling to consider
19 disentangling a HASA client's HIV status from their
20 rental assistance case, it must do more to ensure
21 that caseworkers are fully trained to interact with
22 this extremely vulnerable client population.

23 Lastly, the council and HRA should consider
24 normalizing and simplifying HASA rental assistance.
25 There is no reason why HASA clients should not be

1 able to provide information externally that explains
2 their housing benefits in the language and format of
3 more well-known programs that do not require
4 recipients to be HIV positive.

5 We welcome your questions.

6 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Thank you.

7 Tiara? Yes, can you come? Thank you. Sorry,
8 you may begin. You, yeah.

9 Puedo empezar?

10 MR. LEYVA: Yeah. Hello. Good morning,
11 everyone. My name is Daniel Leyva. I'm a person
12 living with HIV since 1998. And also, I work, I'm
13 employed by the Latino Commission on Aids, working in
14 prevention, HIV prevention, with the Latino Hispanic
15 community specifically, but with all persons of
16 color.

17 I'm here in support of the legislation introduced
18 by Councilmember Lynn Schulman because both as a
19 person living with HIV and as a service provider, I
20 have seen how housing can help not only people to
21 stay healthy, but also access other services such as
22 mental health that is very much needed in our city.
23 And also, with the amount of people over 50, that are
24 recently diagnosed with HIV and who are unfortunately
25

1
2 seen in our societies considered unemployable because
3 of age, these services are extremely, extremely
4 important. I did not prepare any remarks because
5 speaking as a person living with HIV, for me, is much
6 more than providing data, but also providing the life
7 experience.

8 I've seen, in following the priority of needs of
9 Maslow, we have seen how housing remains one of the
10 most important, one of the basic services that will
11 help people achieve not only a healthier life, but we
12 have seen how the decrease of HIV happened in part
13 because of U=U. People living with HIV who are on
14 treatment and become undetectable have a lesser
15 possibility, almost no possibility to transmit HIV.
16 This is possible through offering people the basics
17 of life, so I'm fully in support, again, as a person
18 with HIV and a service provider, to this legislation
19 because it also will impact severely, positively, HIV
20 prevention in our city. Thank you very much.

21 MR. MERJIAN: Hello everyone, Armen Merjian,
22 Senior Staff Attorney at Housing Works. I and we
23 represent the entire class of HASA clients in a major
24 lawsuit, Henrietta D. versus first Giuliani, then
25 Bloomberg, it went all the way to the Supreme Court.

1 I want to challenge this body and say that this
2 body has been asleep at the wheel.

3 I don't say that lightly, but oversight and
4 enforcement have been wholly lacking with regard to
5 HASA.
6

7 The question was asked, what is the ideal
8 caseload ratio? There's not an ideal caseload ratio,
9 there is a legally mandated caseload ratio that
10 they're woefully failing to observe, and that is the
11 font of so many of these problems.

12 We began in 1994 suing over these caseload
13 ratios. They are a ramp-- We call them a ramp for
14 the disabled to gain access to benefits and services.
15 We had to take the Henrietta D. case all the way to
16 the Supreme Court of the United States in which the
17 judge after a long trial declared that HASA was
18 chronically and systematically failing to provide
19 access to critical subsistence benefits with
20 devastating consequences. The judge's word, a
21 Republican Bush-appointed judge nonetheless found
22 that it was woefully inadequate.

23 We then won a decision which echoed what this
24 chamber had passed. In 1997, this chamber passed
25 Local Law 49. Local Law 49 mandates an overall ratio

1 of 34-to-1 at HASA and in important family cases, 25-
2 to-1.
3

4 After we won the Henrietta D lawsuit,
5 independently, the federal court mandated as its
6 federal order that they maintain a 30-to-1 and 25-to-
7 1 ratio. And that was also extended to every HASA
8 office, not just HASA-wide because otherwise you
9 would have incredible problems where some are
10 observing and some are out of whack. So, there's not
11 an ideal average.

12 There's literally a doubly legally compounded
13 average that they are failing to observe every single
14 day and they have for years and they've never been
15 called on the mat. They talk about how many folks
16 that they have hired. They didn't tell you how many
17 folks have left through attrition and other things.

18 The number hired is irrelevant. The only
19 relevant figure is what is the caseload ratio at
20 HASA? Is it 34-to-1 overall, and is it 25-to-1?

21 Well, as they told you, it's about 48 or 49. And
22 I've been saber rattling to bring a contempt motion.

23 Just so you know, I twice had to go to court
24 after Henrietta D. after suing Giuliani to back down
25 Mayor Bloomberg who proposed cuts in the budget to

1
2 HASA which would have blown up the ratios. Those are
3 illegal. The federal court ordered them not to do
4 it.

5 When HASA disingenuously tells you that they seek
6 a hiring freeze exemption, it's a lie. It's not
7 something that they have to seek as an exemption.
8 They are legally required by this body and by the
9 federal court, both independently, to meet 34-to-1
10 and 25-to-1. They're not allowed to put a hiring
11 freeze, especially when they're woefully behind.

12 And so everything flows from it. They've been
13 asking HASA workers to work overtime, nights,
14 weekends. Can you imagine an already difficult job
15 and harried workers and clients being contacted after
16 hours or at night? It's not a solution. And so many
17 of the problems you're going to hear about and you've
18 heard about flow from the fact that these are
19 horribly overworked folks.

20 It's a workers' rights issue as well. If we can
21 get it down to 34-to-1 and 25-to-1, the workers will
22 not be harried. They will take calls. They will get
23 people their benefits.

24 And it's a matter of life and death.

25

1
2 So, really, this council needs to engage in
3 oversight and enforcement.

4 I should also tell you quickly that the question
5 of how long it takes folks to go from the homeless
6 system into permanent housing is an important one for
7 this council as well because HASA has very little
8 housing actually.

9 The overwhelming majority, tens of thousands of
10 HASA clients go to the private market, like folks do
11 with the CitiFHEPS or Section 8 vouchers. The
12 problem is we have a conflagration of rights in that
13 area because the number one source of housing
14 discrimination in New York is a source of income
15 discrimination, voucher discrimination.

16 In 2008, this body passed, wonderfully, a source
17 of income protection but with no enforcement and no
18 oversight. And so once again, it's a tree falling in
19 the forest. We at Housing Works have brought
20 probably more of those cases than anyone in the
21 country. We received zero funding for it.

22 And so what happens is folks are trapped finally
23 in the HASA homeless system because they can't get
24 attorneys to help them and landlords are routinely
25 failing, telling them we don't take vouchers or

1 imposing illegal minimum income requirements
2 irrelevant for people who don't have any share, for
3 example, of the rent, or doing something called
4 ghosting where they simply find out you have a
5 voucher or subsidy and don't call you back. And the
6 only way to attack that is through testing, paired
7 testing and enforcement through lawsuits.
8

9 So, I challenge this body really to get involved
10 in oversight and enforcement, otherwise the rights of
11 the most disadvantaged New Yorkers, multiple
12 disadvantages, right? Overwhelmingly black and brown
13 and poor and unhoused and living with chronic
14 substance use issues with comorbidities galore,
15 everything under the sun. And I've often described
16 just one client and these are the folks that are not
17 getting their benefits and services from HASA because
18 of this wholly, wildly out of whack caseload ratio.

19 I welcome all your questions.

20 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Make sure your mic is on,
21 Mike.

22 MR. ELMORE: Good morning, Joshua Elmore, he,
23 him. I'm the supervising attorney for Legal Aid
24 Society's HIV-AIDS Representation Project.
25

1 We're a citywide civil practice and the bulk of
2 our practice is advocating on clients for clients to
3 receive their legally-entitled-to HASA benefits.
4 What we've seen is really for many of us who've been
5 working with HASA is a deterioration over the years
6 in the quality of services, particularly as many
7 people have noted, clients' abilities to access their
8 caseworkers. Often they don't have assigned
9 caseworkers. Those who do, we're unable to reach
10 them. They're unable to reach them either at their
11 centers. To the extent home visits are happening,
12 they're often unannounced. They don't have a working
13 cell phone. Clients can't leave voice messages.

14 This is a serious issue and so while much of what
15 HASA said is how in their testimony is how things are
16 supposed to work, in actuality, that's often not the
17 case for our clients.

18 I do want to specifically respond to a few things
19 that were noticed: The service line. That used to be
20 a public-facing telephone number that clients could
21 reach to enroll, access benefits. That has been
22 rolled into HRA's one number.

23 So, the only way that clients can, practically
24 speaking, from both client reporting as well as
25

1 testing our practice is done, you can no longer
2 access the service line by phone because it's part of
3 HRA's one number. It simply does not work. Clients
4 have to go in person either to their center or to 400
5 8th Avenue to meet with service line staff.
6

7 This obviously puts an additional burden on
8 disabled people who might have difficulties visiting
9 in person, and this used to be a service available to
10 public-facing to HASA recipients.

11 The 30-day figure was noted as a legally-mandated
12 requirement, often this process is delayed because
13 they will not consider the applications until all
14 documentation is provided by the client. The
15 caseworkers often do not help clients obtain this
16 documentation.

17 Additionally, clients repeatedly are asked to
18 sign documents that are undated and then the
19 caseworker will date them to indicate 30 days so that
20 they can show that the decision made was in 30 days
21 but those are made-up dates effectively. We've seen
22 this happen consistently, it has happened to
23 advocates at other organizations.

24 The case-by-case financial assistance is what
25 effectively is a one-shot deal as we refer to it more

1
2 in sort of the regular HRA context, and one thing
3 that's challenging we see with HASA recipients is the
4 rental assistance unit as a part of HRA has vastly
5 improved and so you can work directly as an advocate
6 with RAU to get a quick answer for clients who are
7 days away from eviction or are in fact already been
8 evicted.

9 This is a process that HASA does not take
10 advantage, it regularly takes months whereas the RAU
11 process will take only days. This seriously puts
12 HASA clients at a disadvantage and doesn't allow an
13 advocate-informed process to take place. HASA
14 caseworkers are not aware or often informed around
15 the legal proceedings in housing court so the process
16 is completely disconnected from the legal realities
17 we as advocates face.

18 And I realize it's time but I do just want to
19 point out one other thing and that is the COLA
20 adjustments.

21 One real issue that the HASA budgeting has, the
22 way clients are determined to be budgeted is based on
23 their actual rent so a client who has a \$1,050 in SSI
24 income and lives in a \$1,000 apartment, has been
25 there for decades, will get cut off whereas a client

1 with \$1,050 in income and a \$2,500 apartment, HASA
2 will continue to pay so long-term elderly clients are
3 being kicked off due to COLA increases and the only
4 solution for them, the only way they could get re-
5 enrolled as HASA is to move to a more expensive
6 apartment so they lose that benefit due to how HASA
7 budgets, so-- and I'm happy to provide additional
8 information and written testimony. This is a really
9 perverse incentive and troubling as it's not
10 something that happens with CityFHEPS or other
11 programs and it really displaces in most burdens
12 long-term low-rent apartments for elderly long-term
13 HASA recipients.

14 Thank you.

15 MS. LABRADA: Hi, my name is Tierra Labrada, I'm
16 the Policy Director for the Supportive Housing
17 Network of New York. I agree with everything that
18 everyone up here just said. You know, the HASA has
19 been a close collaborator with the network for a long
20 time, however, oversight is wholly inadequate and
21 it's made it very difficult to make systemic change
22 and I'm going to get to my testimony.

23 I want to talk today about the vacancies in
24 supportive housing units. HASA mentioned that they
25

1 have about 400 vacancies in their supportive housing
2 units. And I apologize, I wasn't here to hear how
3 long they said that these vacancies have been
4 persistent but from our providers, they have been
5 vacant for a very long time. HASA is supposed to
6 send three referrals per vacant unit, and that is
7 just simply not happening.
8

9 One of our providers reported that in December of
10 2024, they only received 45% of the referrals that
11 they were supposed to receive. They had 22 vacancies
12 and were only able to move two people in. Part of
13 this is due to the way that we have set up our system
14 for their emergency housing.

15 So, as you probably heard here, HASA transitional
16 housing program does not require clients to pay rent
17 and does not impose any time limits. This is very
18 admirable, right? But what happens is that then we
19 have a system that disincentivizes people from moving
20 from emergency and transitional housing into
21 permanent supportive housing. So, the city is paying
22 for this double.

23 I'm going a little bit off script here. Let me
24 go to my script.
25

1
2 It's not a housing issue, it's fiscal and moral
3 failure.

4 Hundreds of units are sitting vacant while
5 providers are losing revenue. So, this one provider
6 that I just mentioned, 45% of referrals, they were
7 expecting 22 vacancies, only moving two people in.
8 They actually lost a federal grant most recently in
9 this year's NOFO because of their occupancy rate,
10 which is about 80% compared to 95% occupancy with
11 their DOHMH contracts.

12 This means that folks who could gain access to
13 these units are not actually gaining access to these
14 units.

15 I do have a couple of proposed solutions here,
16 which is to allow HASA-contracted providers to
17 transfer their units to DOHMH units. HASA has
18 consistently told us and providers that they do not
19 have eligible clients in their emergency housing
20 programs that want to move.

21 That's why they're not sending referrals and
22 folks are not moving into these supportive housing
23 units. We can transfer these units to DOHMH units so
24 that they can serve a broader population while also
25 continuing to prioritize HASA clients. Some of these

1 units are in SRO units, which we've beat the drum for
2 a very long time about the challenges with filling
3 SRO units, especially for people who are exiting the
4 homeless service system, DHS shelters, HASA
5 transitional housing, moving from one SRO where you
6 don't have to pay rent or you've been stable there
7 for a long time into another SRO where you're
8 required to pay 30% of your limited income on rent.
9

10 We would really appreciate the opportunity to
11 consider investing in capital investments to convert
12 these SROs into studio apartments.

13 Another consideration that we've talked to HASA
14 about is incentivizing folks to move from HASA SROs
15 to permanent supportive housing SROs by capping their
16 tenant contribution at \$50, which is something that
17 DHS has done with CityFHEPS. If you're moving into
18 an SRO unit from a DHS shelter, because folks don't
19 want to pay 30% of their limited income to move into
20 an SRO unit.

21 I also do just want to acknowledge the data
22 transparency issue with HASA. 5,500 units, 1,400 of
23 which are in CAPS, the Coordinated Assessment and
24 Placement System. This system has a report, the
25 Local Law 3 report, which this body actually passed a

1
2 couple years ago. It's submitted every year. But
3 1,400 of those units are actually in CAPS, so they
4 get reported on.

5 So, we can see the vacancy and referrals that
6 happen for these units, but for 4,500 or so units
7 that are in HASA Web, it's like a black box. We have
8 no data, we have no access to know how many of those
9 units are actually vacant, how many of those
10 referrals are being made, the length of time those
11 units are vacant. We talked a little bit about
12 sealed units. There's no data transparency for HASA
13 and it's really difficult to get them to submit data.

14 So, I know I'm out of time. I have longer
15 written testimony that outlines all of this here and
16 I'm happy to answer any questions.

17 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Yeah, I don't have a question
18 per se, but I would say, first of all, thank you all
19 for coming to testify because I think it lends a
20 little bit more clarity into what the deficiencies
21 are in the system.

22 I encourage you to please submit your testimony
23 because we can follow up with further questions to
24 DSS. And thank you. Thank you for being here.

25

1
2 MR. MERJIAN: Just one final point, please. In
3 the budget that's going forward, please ensure that
4 the budget for HASA includes sufficient funding to
5 meet the 34 to one and 25-to-1. Without that,
6 they'll never meet it. We've got to make sure it's
7 there.

8 That's not something that's a request. It's
9 legally required both by local law 49 of 1997 and the
10 Henrietta D. lawsuit.

11 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Yeah.

12 MR. MERJIAN: So, if you want to do something,
13 please make sure that it's sufficient funding because
14 a fully funded and staffed HASA will go a long way to
15 getting folks desperately needed subsistence.

16 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Absolutely. We've seen this
17 in a lot of agencies, unfortunately, in the last
18 couple of years. Thank you so much.

19 Okay, we will now be moving on to our Zoom panel.
20 Alex Claverling.

21 MR. CLAVERLING: Good morning. My name is Alex
22 Claverling. I'm a staff attorney with the LGBTQ Plus
23 Advocacy Project at Legal Services NYC in the Bronx.

24 I provide legal representation to low-income
25 LGBTQ Plus New Yorkers, many of whom are living with

1 HIV and struggling to access the services they need
2 to survive. Annually, our dedicated advocates help
3 over 100,000 low-income NYC residents.
4

5 People living with HIV need access to HASA's
6 life-sustaining and saving benefits. Our current
7 local law, specifically New York City Administrative
8 Code Section 21-126 is a vestige of outdated language
9 and notions. Ensuring eligibility to all individuals
10 with HIV is not just the right thing to do, it is a
11 necessary public health measure that will prevent
12 suffering and save lives. This issue is especially
13 urgent in light of the rising wave of discrimination
14 against LGBTQ Plus individuals and people living with
15 HIV.

16 In this climate, this bill would lay the
17 groundwork for ensuring that every person living with
18 HIV has access to the services they need without
19 unnecessary restrictions or stigma.

20 While expanding eligibility as the amendment to
21 New York City Administrative Code Section 21-126 does
22 is a critical step, it is not enough on its own.
23 HASA, particularly in the Bronx, all too often has
24 been failing the people it is supposed to serve.
25

1
2 My colleagues and I regularly work with clients
3 who have waited months, sometimes over a year, for
4 services that should have been provided in days.
5 Clients are denied emergency housing when they are
6 clearly eligible. They are met with bureaucratic
7 roadblocks that delay or prevent access to food and
8 transportation assistance.

9 We have been working with Mr. Crane since fall of
10 2024 to obtain an emergency grant for rental arrears
11 and to prevent eviction. Despite repeated advocacy,
12 HASA has failed him at every step. Mr. Crane fell
13 into arrears through no fault of his own.

14 This client's landlord refused to provide him
15 with lease renewals, so rental increases were not
16 budgeted into his HASA benefits. We were able to
17 reopen the client's HASA case, which had been
18 erroneously closed, and correct the ongoing shelter
19 benefits. Nevertheless, HASA still refused to
20 approve an emergency grant that would satisfy the
21 rental arrears accrued.

22 Our client is especially vulnerable. He
23 identifies as trans, is chronically ill, and has a
24 history of homelessness. We have provided HASA with
25 medical records showing that the client has been

1 hospitalized well over 20 times since the eviction
2 case was filed.

3 He is also acutely immunocompromised, having
4 suffered multiple cases of COVID, pneumonia, and
5 other infections.

6 On top of this, he is dealing with clinical
7 depression and anxiety and is extremely afraid of
8 having to enter the shelter system, both as a
9 chronically and acutely ill individual and as a trans
10 man. We reapplied and submitted several requests for
11 reconsideration of the emergency grant, which have
12 all been denied to this date.

13 There has been no attempt on the part of HASA to
14 have a social worker reach out to personally assist
15 with this client with the emergency grant, or to
16 explain these denials to him. Despite multiple
17 requests, HASA has yet to provide written denials,
18 ignoring its own assurances. HASA claims it denied
19 the grantee to, quote "lack of proof" that he paid
20 rent in the past three months.

21 We explained that our client was hospitalized and
22 unable physically to go cash his social security
23 checks to pay his share.

24 [BELL RINGS]
25

1
2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time has expired, thank
3 you.

4 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Go ahead, you can wrap it up.

5 MR. CLAVERLING: Upon being discharged from a
6 month-long hospital stay, he escrowed his share of
7 the rent with our office in December of 2024. HASA
8 has ceased communication with our office, ignoring
9 multiple update requests, even as he faces a new
10 eviction notice.

11 The amendment represents a necessary step toward
12 a more just and humane system, one that recognizes
13 that no one should have to wait until they are
14 gravely ill to get help.

15 It acknowledges that housing and healthcare are
16 intertwined, and that access to services should be
17 based on medical facts and not arbitrary legal
18 distinctions. It also asserts that in this moment of
19 growing hostility towards LGBTQ plus and HIV positive
20 individuals, New York City must lead the way in
21 protecting and supporting its most vulnerable
22 residents. Our clients would benefit greatly from
23 the passage of this bill, and are in need of
24 meaningful reforms to ensure that HASA delivers on
25 its promise.

1 Thank you for your time and consideration.

2 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Thank you. We will now be
3 calling on Sarah Telson.

4 MS. TELSON: Good morning, my name is Sarah
5 Telson. My pronouns are she and they, and I'm the
6 Director of the LGBTQ HIV Advocacy Unit at Brooklyn
7 Legal Services. Each year, our team of seven serves
8 hundreds of people living with HIV and AIDS in their
9 legal matters.
10

11 As you know, our clients rely on HASA for
12 critical needs, including housing and other health-
13 impacting needs. HASA plays a vital role in the
14 lives of our clients. However, it is clear that
15 there are gaps in service delivery that must be
16 addressed to ensure that HASA is truly meeting the
17 needs of our most vulnerable community members.

18 One significant issue that our clients report is
19 that their HASA caseworkers are unresponsive.
20 Clients report that they do not know who the
21 caseworker is, or that they frequently change.
22 Often, our clients have to retell their stories,
23 resubmit documents, and repeat steps when they are
24 already burdened by whatever legal issue that has
25 brought them to our office.

1
2 Despite an expectation that applications be
3 decided in 30 days, clients wait much longer, often
4 several months. However, HASA's internal dating
5 conventions don't reflect the actual amount of time
6 an application has taken. As advocates, we
7 experience the same difficulty in reaching
8 caseworkers.

9 For each of our cases, a significant amount of
10 time is spent just trying to reach someone at HASA
11 and get an action taken. These delays have dire
12 consequences. When HASA fails to respond, we are
13 unable to resolve eviction cases, and our clients
14 become perilously close to losing their homes.

15 Emergency requests are meant to be addressed
16 within a specific timeline, and yet our experience is
17 that these timelines are rarely, if ever, met. In
18 Brooklyn, public benefits recipients who are not
19 receiving HASA benefits have the ability to go to an
20 office in Housing Court and seek rental assistance
21 the same day they're in Housing Court. HASA
22 recipients don't have that option.

23 With no access to an in-court process or
24 equivalent, clients receiving HASA benefits face
25 unnecessarily delays in their cases, and because we

1 do not and will not disclose our client's status and
2 cannot, we cannot explain to the court why these
3 delays happen, and the court doesn't have patience to
4 understand why.
5

6 Another gap in services we have witnessed is a
7 lack of oversight of supportive housing providers.
8 Supportive housing residents are particularly
9 vulnerable and rely on their providers for housing
10 and services.

11 Housing providers are not following the required
12 step procedures, further exacerbating our client's
13 housing instability. Our clients find themselves in
14 eviction proceedings because supportive housing
15 providers are not making rent payments and then not
16 showing up to court, putting tenants at risk of
17 eviction through no fault of their own. As noted
18 earlier by Chair Ayala, the NNC allowance has not
19 been raised in 40 years.

20 This particularly affects people who have long-
21 term tenancies in affordable apartments and
22 ultimately increases homelessness. Our clients,
23 especially those who receive Social Security benefits
24 and are impacted by COLA increases would benefit from
25 an increased allowance. Unfortunately, the current

1 amounts directly lead to a loss of affordable low-
2 rent apartments.
3

4 As a city council, you have the power to hold
5 HASA accountable for the quality of services it
6 provides. We urge the council to immediately take
7 action to ensure that HASA adheres to its own
8 policies and timelines. This includes increased
9 staffing, improved communication and oversight
10 mechanisms that hold HASA accountable to the people
11 it serves.

12 Thank you for your time and attention and we look
13 forward to working together to improve HASA services
14 and protect the housing security of folks living with
15 HIV in New York City.

16 Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Thank you.

18 Terri Wilder.

19 MS. WILDER: Sorry, I'm having a hard time
20 finding my screen. All right. Thank you. Good
21 morning, Chairs Aliah and Schulman and members of the
22 council. My name is Terri Wilder, she, her, and I
23 serve as the HIV and Aging Policy Advocate at SAGE,
24 the nation's oldest and largest nonprofit dedicated
25 to improving the lives of LGBTQ plus older people.

1 I appreciate the opportunity to share concerns
2 from LGBTQ plus elders living with HIV, many of whom
3 rely on HASA services for health, housing and
4 stability.

5
6 First, HASA must improve communication to ensure
7 continuity of care. When case managers leave,
8 clients are often left in limbo for months without
9 knowing who will take over their cases. A formal
10 transition process must be established to prevent
11 gaps in support.

12 Additionally, communication failures such as
13 unanswered calls, unassigned phone extensions and
14 long wait times are widespread. Our staff has waited
15 over two hours on the intake service unit line just
16 to pull up on an application. These delays must be
17 addressed.

18 Second, HASA must offer multiple communication
19 methods beyond email. Many older people lack access
20 to or are uncomfortable with email. HASA should
21 document a client's preferred method of
22 communication, whether phone, mail or another option
23 at intake.

24 Third, income adjustments from social security
25 should not disqualify people from HASA services. A

1
2 minor cost of living increase should not put someone
3 at risk of losing critical support.

4 Fourth, safe and affordable housing must be a
5 priority. Clients report mold issues worsening their
6 health, landlords ignoring concerns and caseworkers
7 providing inadequate responses like suggesting an air
8 purifier instead of a proper mold remediation for the
9 situation handled by the landlord.

10 Additionally, landlords receiving HASA funds must
11 be held accountable for providing heat as some
12 tenants fear eviction for reporting unsafe
13 conditions. Stronger oversight is needed.

14 And fifth, rising rents are pushing people out of
15 stable housing. We've seen cases where clients rent
16 increased by \$700 in just two years after HASA
17 starting with a new landlord. Mechanisms must be in
18 place to prevent excessive rent hikes that threaten
19 housing security.

20 Sixth, outreach to older people is inadequate.
21 Many older people living with HIV do not know HASA
22 exists. A proactive outreach strategy is necessary
23 to connect eligible individuals to these critical
24 services.

1
2 Seventh, the HASA application process is too
3 complex. One client's medical provider completed the
4 required forms but the paperwork stalled for months
5 because there was no instructions on the form about
6 where to send it. Clear guidance is essential.

7 HASA must be equipped to meet the needs of an
8 aging HIV community. As people with HIV age, they
9 require more time and support from caseworkers. HASA
10 must ensure staffing--

11 [BELL RINGS]

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time has expired. Thank
13 you.

14 MS. WILDER: I'm almost done.

15 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: You can wrap it up. Go
16 ahead, wrap it up.

17 MS. WILDER: Thank you. Finally, while we
18 support updating the language in ADCODE 21-126, 21-
19 127, and 21-128, we strongly recommend changing,
20 quote, "every person with HIV infection" to, quote,
21 "every person with HIV."

22 The term HIV infection is stigmatizing and
23 organizations around the world, as well as the NIAID
24 HIV Language Guide, have called for its removal.

1
2 In conclusion, HASA is a vital program, but
3 improvements are necessary to ensure older people
4 with HIV receive the housing, case management, and
5 support they need to age with dignity.

6 Please note that more details around these issues
7 can be found in our written submission. Thank you
8 for your time.

9 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Thank you. We will now be
10 calling Jason Cianciotto.

11 MR. CIANCIOTTO: Good afternoon. Hi, everyone.
12 I'm Jason Cianciotto. My pronouns are he, him. I'm
13 the Vice President of Public Policy and External
14 Affairs at GMHC. In 2024, GMHC served nearly 5,600
15 clients, many of whom received important support from
16 HASA.

17 Thank you, Chair Ayala and Chair Schulman, for
18 this important hearing, and to all the committee
19 members for their longstanding support of New Yorkers
20 living with HIV and AIDS.

21 I'm going to try not to repeat a lot of the
22 really important and wonderful suggestions that have
23 been shared already, so I want to start by expressing
24 JMHC's wholehearted support for Chair Schulman's Bill
25 T-2025-3096, codifying existing HASA practice into

1 law. That's a no-brainer, but important to ensure
2 that what's happening now remains happening by
3 putting it into statute.
4

5 One of the biggest challenges that our clients
6 who receive HASA support are facing are the result of
7 the intersection of social security cost of living
8 adjustment increases and their HASA housing support.

9 I recently learned about a client who received
10 notification that their HASA housing benefit on
11 December 28th was going to end effective January 8th,
12 all because the SSI COLA increase put them \$16.26
13 above the current ceiling limit. Another had their
14 housing support threatened because they were \$11.86
15 over the income ceiling limit. Another \$25.16.
16 Another \$1.00, another even 57 cents over the limit.

17 You can see where I'm going here.

18 So, JMHC has been in touch with OTADA, Senator
19 Hoylman, who led S-183, for which Councilmember
20 Ossé's Resolution 175-2024 supports, and the end
21 result is agreement that the best way to address this
22 issue for now is to increase the income ceiling from
23 200% to 250% of the federal poverty level.

24 Importantly, the HIV Housing for New York Plan
25 advocated by the Ending the Epidemic Coalition, of

1 which GMHC is a member, includes that resolution,
2 increasing to 250% of FPL. GMHC strongly supports
3 all New Yorkers living with HIV, having access to the
4 same type of housing support that those in New York
5 City do. So, we certainly hope to see that in the
6 state budget as that comes together, and we
7 appreciate the Council's advocacy for that.
8

9 Before I run out of time, I wanted to share all
10 of our deep concern over the threats the federal
11 government has made to New Yorkers living with HIV
12 and AIDS. I want to thank the Council for creating
13 the Protect NYC Families Initiative in support of
14 immigrants living with HIV who are served by many
15 organizations, including GMHC's legal department.

16 [BELL RINGS]

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired, thank you.

18 MR. CIANCIOOTTO: I'm done, thank you so much.

19 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Thank you. Okay, we will now
20 resume our in-person panel. Joe Hofs?

21 MR. HOFES: Good afternoon, Honorable City
22 Councilmembers. I'm Joe Hofs. Thank you for
23 allowing me to appear in person today. And I join my
24 colleagues in echoing their urging the Council
25 Committee for the resources to fund HASA. And from

1
2 the perspective of my firm, we believe that the folks
3 that are served by HASA should be expanded to include
4 folks with autoimmune diseases that are other than
5 HIV. Long COVID, for example, or chronic fatigue
6 syndrome are chronically plaguing our community and
7 will, I believe, more in the future.

8 So, I think we need to get ahead of this issue
9 and not only give HASA what they deserve, but think
10 about expanding what HASA does.

11 I wanted to-- Should I continue?

12 Okay, another reason I wanted to appear in person
13 today was to bring to the attention of the committee
14 my belief that the CityFHEPS program being run by DSS
15 is discriminatory to disabled veterans. And it
16 sounds so brash, but there's no way to put icing on
17 that.

18 I believe folks that are disabled veterans and
19 assigned higher evaluative ratings from the VA are
20 being told they're not eligible to apply for rental
21 assistance through CityFHEPS. And I believe that
22 because it's the case. From services for the
23 underserved and home base, in DSS, they're simply
24 being precluded from being eligible.

1
2 They're considering veterans' VA disability
3 compensation, which is just that, compensation, as
4 part of gross income, which is legally incorrect and
5 needs to be rectified with all due respect.

6 So, I urge the Council Committee to direct DSS to
7 work with us to rectify the situation. Thank you so
8 much for listening.

9 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Thank you, thank you so much.
10 We have now heard from everyone who has signed up to
11 testify. If we have inadvertently missed anyone who
12 would like to testify in person, please visit the
13 sergeant's table and complete an appearance card now.

14 If we inadvertently missed anyone who would like
15 to testify virtually, please use the hand raise
16 function in Zoom, and I will call on you in the order
17 of hands raised.

18 Okay, seeing no one else, I would like to note
19 that written testimony, which will be reviewed in
20 full by committee staff, may be submitted to the
21 record up to 72 hours after the close of this hearing
22 by emailing it to testimony@council.nyc.gov. And
23 with that, this hearing is concluded.

24 [GAVEL]

COMMITTEE ON GENERAL WELFARE
Jointly with the COMMITTEE ON HEALTH

99

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date February 15, 2024