

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

----- X

April 24, 2018
Start: 1:18 p.m.
Recess: 5:34 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

DIANA AYALA
LAURIE A. CUMBO
RUBEN DIAZ, SR.
MARK GJONAJ
CARLOS MENCHACA
DONOVAN J. RICHARDS
RAFAEL SALAMANCA, JR.
RITCHIE J. TORRES
MARK TREYGER
JAMES G. VAN BRAMER

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Vito Mustuciuolo
General Manager of NYCHA

Cathy Pennington
Executive Vice President of Operations for NYCHA

Carolyn Jasper
Vice President for Public Housing Operations for
NYCHA

Kerri Jew
Executive Vice President and Chief Administrative
Officer for the New York City Housing Authority,
NYCHA

Danny Barber
President of the Citywide Council of Presidents

Lisa Kenner
President of Van Dyke Resident Association

Victor Bach
Senior Housing Policy Analyst at the Community
Service Society

Audrey Clemmons
Elderly Resident of PS139 Conversion in Harlem

Claudia Coger
Resident Association President for Astoria Houses
Astoria, Queens

Willie Mae Lewis
Resident of St. Nicholas Houses

Bernadette McNear
President of Ralph J. Rangel Resident
Association, Rangel Houses

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Diana Blackwell
President of PSA 6, Fred Samuel Resident
Association

Nathanial Green
Dyckman Resident Association President and the
Vice Chair for Manhattan North Council of
Presidents

Jacqueline Frazier
Property Manager of Dyckman Houses

Aixa Torres
President of Alfred E. Smith Resident Association

Carmen Quinones
Resident of NYCHA Development

Kelly MacNeal
Acting Executive Vice President of Legal Affairs
And General Counsel at NYCHA

Sideya Sherman
Executive Vice President for Community Engagement
And Partnerships at NYCHA

Tita Concepcion
Member of Our Lady of Mercy Catholic Church in
Brownsville, Resident of Breukelen Houses in
Canarsie, Leader in East Brooklyn Churches

David Brawley
Lead Pastor of St. Pauls Community Baptist Church

Santiago Sanchez
Resident of NYCHA Development in New York City

Mr. Drungo
Resident of NYCHA Development in New York City

A P P E A R A N C E (CONTINUED)

Ronald Chaulo
Property Manager of Carey Haber Site 1B

Getulio Cruz
Pastor of the Monte Sion Christian and Leader in
Metro IAF

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: The hearing is coming to order. Good morning everyone. I am Council Member Alicka Ampry-Samuel and Chair of the Committee on Public Housing. I just want to let everyone know that there are a few other hearings that are taking place right now, the Health Committee is meeting, and the Sanitation Committee is meeting and so I will have Council Members join throughout this proceeding. We are here today to conduct an oversight hearing on property management in NYCHA specifically I am referring to matters related to property management and managers delegated to each housing development who are charged by NYCHA with the responsibility to oversee development cleanliness, staffing, property budgets, maintenance repairs, resident complaints, rent collection and independent contractors. NYCHA is home to some 400,000 residents, 1,000... 176,066 apartment units, 2,462 buildings and 326 developments throughout the five boroughs and is the largest public housing authority in North America. In my district alone the 41st council district, I represent 26 developments and have the high... have the largest concentration of public housing in the New York City

1
2 Council. That said NYCHA has a huge responsibility in
3 making sure that management systems optimize
4 efficiencies currently set in place, continue to
5 research, develop and implement best practices to
6 increase effectiveness and to ensure the health,
7 wellbeing and safety of all of its residents. Three
8 years ago, the Mayor and outgoing NYCHA Chair, Shola
9 Olatoye unveiled the newest strategy to deliver long
10 needed improvements to the residents; quality of
11 life, called Next Generation NYCHA, a comprehensive
12 ten-year plan to change the way NYCHA is funded and
13 managed. Since the introduction of NextGen NYCHA
14 numerous pilot programs have been introduced to
15 revamp the way NYCHA runs its developments. Let NYCHA
16 tell it these changes have been resounding and
17 successful but to many residents they tell a
18 different story. They've told us that even with the
19 changes NYCHA's management systems may have failed to
20 keep mold out of their homes, some management have
21 failed to keep lead paint off their walls and in the
22 dead of winter management failed to keep the heat on
23 but to its credit NYCHA recognizes that it must
24 provide better customer service and property
25 management for its residents. Reorganizing its

1
2 management model is both necessary and NYCHA seen as
3 an urgent matter but in order to make positive and
4 lasting change we need to know what works and what
5 does not work. There are great property managers and
6 this hearing is not about them, in fact I applaud
7 them. I am here today gathering information on behalf
8 of all of our constituents and residents living in
9 NYCHA who deserve answers, improvement on
10 efficiencies, greater accountability, effective
11 project management, and decent homes to live in and
12 raise their family. Today's hearing will allow the
13 council and the public to learn more about the
14 problems that may plague NYCHA and the programs that
15 have been implemented to combat them. Notably through
16 its next generation operations model previously known
17 as OPMOM or the optimal property management operating
18 model, this program allowed project managers...
19 property managers to make decisions regarding
20 maintenance and repair issues. More specifically the
21 program gave property managers a budget and the very
22 unique and crucial authority to contract out for
23 work. Today we will also discuss NYCHA's implemented
24 flexOps pilot program which gave maintenance workers
25 greater elasticity in addressing maintenance issues

1
2 so that residents could expect attention to needed
3 repairs outside of the hours of eight a.m. to four
4 p.m. FlexOps allow properties to operate from six
5 a.m. to eight p.m. on weekdays thereby extending
6 hours of operation to complete routine repairs. Due
7 to the positive feedback NYCHA has extended services
8 in this program through September of 2019. NYCHA has
9 decentralized decision making at some of its
10 developments and this hearing will allow Council
11 Members and the public to learn about the benefits
12 and the challenges of these models. With that said I
13 thank NYCHA for joining us today and look forward to
14 working collaboratively with NYCHA to apply the
15 lessons learned today across the developments and
16 ensure that management is effective and accountable
17 to the residents. At this time, I will administer the
18 affirmation, please raise your right hand. Do you
19 affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing
20 but the truth in your testimony before the committee
21 and respond honestly to Council Member's questions?
22 Okay, thank you. And General Manager, Vito
23 Mustaciuolo you can begin.

24 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Thank you very much
25 and good morning. Chair Ampry-Samuel, members of the

1
2 Committee on Public Housing, good morning. My name is
3 Vito Mustaciuolo and I am NYCHA's new General
4 Manager. I am pleased to be joined this morning by
5 Cathy Pennington, Executive Vice President of
6 Operations and, and Carolyn Jasper who is a newly
7 named Vice President for Public Housing Operations
8 and I, I want to just point out for a second Carolyn
9 who has a, a distinguished career with NYCHA starting
10 in 1987 when she was only five years old and, and
11 Carolyn has worked in almost all five boroughs with
12 the exception of one but Carolyn comes to us with a...
13 an incredible amount of experience and expertise and,
14 and I just thank her very much for accepting her new
15 role and we look forward to moving forward with
16 Carolyn and, and Cathy in operations. So, thank you
17 Carolyn for being here. Thank you again for this
18 opportunity to discuss this very important issue
19 regarding the maintenance and repair of the homes of
20 hundreds of thousands of New Yorkers who live in
21 public housing and, and how we provide that vital
22 service and, and offer our residents many pathways
23 for opportunities. Before I turn it over to, to
24 Cathy, you know I would also like to point out and,
25 and to mention a few other folks that are here today

1
2 and my apologies if I fail to recognize anyone, but
3 we have resident... we have RA presidents and we have
4 property managers from developments and I'm going to
5 name just a few, from Rangel, from Highland, from
6 Dyckman, from Grant, from Astoria, from Frederick
7 Samuels. I want to thank them all for being here
8 today, I think it's extremely important and it shows
9 the... how much importance this hearing is for all of
10 us in that they're all here today. I see a number of
11 the resident... the presidents, I've been out to about
12 30 or so developments, I've met a number of them and
13 there really is an incredible collegial support that
14 we're receiving but I also want to recognize the
15 President of CCOP, Danny Barber who's here as well,
16 Danny's sitting off to the side somewhere but I
17 wanted to thank him for being here as well and I
18 can't thank you enough for your support, this is a
19 new role for both of us but we've had some, some
20 great conversations. The questions that you have
21 asked of us are important questions and it's, it's
22 helpful, it's helpful to hear a different
23 perspective. So, again I thank you for your support,
24 I thank you for holding this hearing today. Through
25 Next Generation NYCHA our long term strategic plan we

1
2 are strengthening our organization and striving to
3 become more efficient and effective delivering
4 quality property management and repair services to
5 all of our residents. With that that really concludes
6 my opening statement, I'd like to turn over the rest
7 of the testimony to Cathy Pennington.

8 CATHY PENNINGTON: Thank you General
9 Manager Mustaciuolo. Before I go into details about
10 property management and NYCHA it's helpful to discuss
11 the authority, size and scope and how it's organized.
12 As mentioned NYCHA operates 175,000 apartments in
13 more than 2,400 buildings in 325 developments in
14 every borough that are home to about 400,000 New
15 Yorkers. NYCHA's workforce totals more than 10,800
16 full time employees, nearly a quarter of whom are
17 residents of NYCHA and about two thirds of whom work
18 in operations providing services for our residents.
19 We currently have more than 250 property managers and
20 assistant managers responsible for the overall
21 operation of developments, more than 300 property
22 maintenance superintendents and assistant
23 superintendents who strive to keep our developments
24 clean and in good condition, over 400 housing
25 assistants who help residents with administrative

1
2 matters, about 3,000 caretakers who clean floors,
3 take out trash and maintain grounds, nearly 800
4 maintenance workers who perform basic repair and more
5 than 1,000 staff who work in 25 different skilled
6 trades which include carpenters, painters,
7 plasterers, plumbers, glazers, electricians,
8 exterminators, roofers, and more. Several members of
9 the operations property management team are here
10 today, all of our portfolio directors have joined us
11 today, I'd like to acknowledge them, Directors stand,
12 quick... stand up.

13 [applause]

14 CATHY PENNINGTON: These are... these are
15 the men and women who run our day to day operations
16 throughout our six portfolios within the city, thank
17 you. Right now, there are 7,000 plus colleagues that
18 are working to ensure safe, clean, and connected
19 homes for our residents. The operations team is truly
20 the backbone of this agency and I'd like to thank
21 them for their dedication to the NYCHA community. I
22 would also like to thank our residents in attendance
23 today to speak about how they work with our property
24 management staff. Property management at NYCHA does
25 not take a one size fits all approach, our

1
2 developments range in size from nearly 2,200 units at
3 Baruch Houses in Manhattan to 13 units at College
4 Point Rehab in Queens. We have buildings that
5 exclusively house seniors and others that serve
6 working families. More than two thirds of NYCHA's
7 residents are seniors and children under the age of
8 18. We also provide housing to veterans and formerly
9 homeless households. We have developments at the
10 Eastern most edge of Queens along Coney Island
11 Channel and Brooklyn and in the Northern Bronx near
12 the border of Westchester County. Our developments
13 are divided into six portfolios and those were the
14 directors that, that we acknowledged, each with a
15 director and several regional asset managers or RAMS.
16 This management team leads our property management
17 staff in addressing challenges, improving operations
18 and providing quality customer service to our
19 residents. Our developments are led by a property
20 manager along with property maintenance
21 superintendents, supervisors of grounds and
22 caretakers, maintenance staff, and housing
23 assistants. The staffing structure varies depending
24 on the size of each development. The amount of staff
25 varies as well and is based on the number of units at

1
2 each development and our available budget. For
3 instance, the budget allows one caretaker for every
4 57 units and one maintenance worker for every 224
5 units. This property management team is responsible
6 for many different functions at our developments,
7 including: routine maintenance of grounds and
8 buildings and trash management; routine apartment
9 inspections and basic repairs in units; coordination
10 of move-outs and new rentals, including preparing
11 vacant units for residents and conducting rental
12 interviews; administration and enforcement of leases,
13 including working with residents delinquent on rent,
14 appearing in court, and assisting residents with
15 annual reviews; communication with resident
16 association leaders, local NYPD precincts, elected
17 officials, and other members of the community; and
18 making resident referrals to programs that bolster
19 self-sufficiency and other vital resources. In
20 addition to staff based at the developments, NYCHA's
21 skilled trades staff; plumbers, plasterers, roofers,
22 and others serve all developments in a portfolio. Our
23 planning units with development... our planning units
24 work with developments to schedule skilled trade
25 work. This is a complex job because one repair, such

1
2 as a leaky pipe, involves multiple skilled trades.
3 Additionally, our support services team maintains
4 building systems, such as heating plants and
5 elevators, and responds to after-hours emergencies.
6 Here are some examples of what our property
7 management, skilled trades, and support services
8 teams accomplished last year: responded to 2.7
9 million maintenance and repair requests, including
10 386,000 after-hours or emergency repairs; conducted
11 nearly 2,000 boiler inspections and completed 4,800
12 boiler repairs; maintained over 3,200 elevators,
13 which make over 3 million trips a day and a billion
14 trips a year; conducted more than 48,000 routine
15 apartment inspections, completing nearly 70,000 work
16 orders generated by those inspections; signed leases
17 with 4,000 new households; completed nearly 142,000
18 annual reviews; and liaised with more than 250
19 resident associations. NextGen Operations or NGO is a
20 new, localized property management model that puts
21 more control over decision-making in the hands of
22 property managers, those who know the needs of their
23 developments best. Launched in 2015 as the Optimal
24 Property Management Operating Model, or OPMOM, the
25 NGO model is now in place at 129 developments, and we

1
2 plan to roll it out to all developments by mid-2019.
3 Through NGO, property managers are empowered to
4 independently make decisions that affect their
5 developments. They have more control over their
6 budgets and can make decisions about purchasing
7 without going to central office, resulting in faster
8 and better service for residents. NGO sites can use
9 their budgets to create "model" buildings, upgrading
10 and renovating common area spaces to make them more
11 welcoming to residents. Before a development moves to
12 the NGO model of property management, staff are
13 required to take courses on subjects such as budget
14 management, property maintenance, and customer
15 service. More than 800 property management staff have
16 been trained, and remaining staff are scheduled to
17 complete training over the next year. Before we
18 launched Next Generation NYCHA, basic repairs took an
19 average of 13 days to complete. We've brought that
20 number down to four days across the portfolio. At our
21 NGO developments, basic repairs are completed even
22 faster, in 3.6 days. NGO sites complete emergency
23 repairs and apartment turnovers about 20 percent
24 faster than non-NGO sites, and they have
25 approximately 15 percent fewer open work orders. NGO

1
2 is just one way that we are making progress. We have
3 launched a number of other initiatives to improve
4 customer service and quality of life for residents.
5 We're, we're stretching our limited dollars to get
6 more work done by increasing staff's ability to use
7 contracts for specific services, such as painting,
8 compactor chute cleaning, and exterior lighting
9 repairs. The goal is to reduce work order backlog,
10 increase timely responses to repairs, and provide
11 greater flexibility to focus on what is most urgent.
12 As part of our commitment to enhanced routine
13 cleaning, staff at our developments are covering more
14 ground, literally using new, efficient floor-cleaning
15 machines. We've equipped employees with smartphones,
16 enabling them to open and close work orders while
17 getting residents to sign-off on the work, those are
18 all depicted in the... in the pictures here. Through
19 our development-based skilled trades initiative, we
20 are testing a model that assigns skilled trades;
21 carpenters, plasterers, and painters to specific
22 developments. This allows developments to do their
23 own scheduling for these trades, rather than working
24 with the central borough office. The goal is to make
25 scheduling and assignment of the trades more

1
2 efficient, ultimately cutting down on repair times.
3 We've streamlined the process for creating work
4 orders for court-ordered repairs so that this
5 important work can be completed faster. We installed
6 digital kiosks at every property management office,
7 enabling residents to take advantage of NYCHA's
8 online services, such as paying rent, requesting
9 repairs, and recertifying income. Through new
10 interactive tools on our website, residents and the
11 public can track NYCHA's progress on repairs and
12 construction. The Flexible Operations program or
13 FlexOps, is another way we are improving quality of
14 life for residents. NYCHA is a 24/7 operation, but it
15 is run from 8 a.m. to 4:30 p.m., Monday through
16 Friday, unlike most private landlords. As a departure
17 from that model, FlexOps enhances service delivery
18 through expanded, staggered work shifts. Launched in
19 2016, FlexOps is now at 11 consolidations. The
20 initiative provides more flexibility for employees;
21 for residents, it provides cleaner buildings and
22 after-hour meetings with property management. In
23 surveys conducted last fall, 18 percent more
24 residents rated their building conditions as
25 "excellent, very good, or good" since FlexOps was

1
2 implemented at their development. Property management
3 staff are our ambassadors, and they play a critical
4 role in making sure residents are aware of and
5 connected to programs and services available through
6 NYCHA and our partners. For example, staff use our
7 web-based referral system to connect residents to
8 financial counseling when they need help with
9 budgeting in order to pay their rent; they work with
10 our community and senior center sponsors on health
11 and recreational resources for residents; and they
12 participate in resident-led development projects that
13 improve the quality of life for all residents. Our
14 three Digital Vans travel the city, providing
15 residents internet access and technology to search
16 and apply for jobs, complete schoolwork, and access
17 government resources. We acknowledge that there is
18 more work to be done to provide residents the quality
19 of life they deserve. But it must be noted that we
20 are operating under significant constraints. Our
21 buildings are old and deteriorating, the majority of
22 them are more than a half century old. At the same
23 time, we have been shortchanged three billion dollars
24 in federal operating and capital funding since 2001
25 to address our aging properties' vast maintenance and

1
2 repair needs. However, our Mayor and Council
3 recognize the importance of preserving and
4 strengthening public housing, and we thank you for
5 your unprecedented and continued support. As I step
6 into this new role, I'm looking at NYCHA's
7 operational challenges with a fresh lens, trying to
8 get to the bottom of our most persistent problems so
9 that we can identify effective and practical ways to
10 improve. Our goal is to provide quality customer
11 service to residents. While many staff at NYCHA excel
12 at customer service, going the extra mile for
13 residents every day, we acknowledge that maintaining
14 consistently high levels of customer service across
15 the Authority is an area we must improve. While we
16 have a system in place for tracking the requests and
17 status of maintenance and repairs, we recognize that
18 there are gaps in our process that lead to complaints
19 of work not being completed or repairs taking too
20 long to complete. Our data show that sometimes
21 repairs are not made because a resident is not home
22 when staff arrive to make repairs. We can improve
23 this through better communication with residents
24 about scheduling and by holding staff accountable to
25 demonstrate that they went to the apartment at the

1
2 scheduled time. A related challenge is improving
3 communication with residents about the status of
4 repairs. When a maintenance worker schedules a
5 skilled trade, such as a plumber, to complete a
6 repair, the resident may not be informed that the
7 next repair job has been scheduled. Compounding this
8 problem is the fact that it often takes a number of
9 weeks before a skilled trades repair can be
10 scheduled, due to a shortage of staffing and an
11 extensive backlog of work orders. We are all dismayed
12 by the reports of unacceptable apartment conditions,
13 residents living with holes in their walls that
14 haven't been repaired, or repair jobs that are half-
15 finished. Often these situations occur because of the
16 shortage of skilled trade staff available to finish
17 the repairs and the challenge of scheduling multiple
18 trades for one repair. For example, repair of a leak
19 in the wall requires coordination with a number of
20 different staff: a maintenance worker to confirm the
21 leak and identify the source; a plumber to fix the
22 leak; a plasterer to repair the wall; and a painter
23 to paint the newly plastered wall. To put this
24 problem in perspective, right now we have a backlog
25 of 32,000 paint jobs, 24,000 carpentry jobs. Put

1
2 another way, each month on average an average of
3 16,200 work orders requiring plumbers, plasterers,
4 and carpenters are created, but due to our staffing
5 levels, we are only able to complete approximately
6 five... 15,600 of those. One of our goals is to reduce
7 this backlog and improve the timeliness of complex
8 repairs. However, when repairs are made, our quality
9 assurance inspections show that about 95 percent are
10 done satisfactorily. And last year, we responded to
11 nearly 2.7 million work orders, including about
12 169,000 paint and 66,000 plaster work orders. Decades
13 of underfunding has meant decades of deferred
14 maintenance and investment in our buildings,
15 resulting in enormous capital needs. That makes
16 repairs more complex, costly, and time-consuming. We
17 also face challenges stemming from repeat vandalism
18 of doors and elevators. Trash management is another
19 major issue at many of our developments, and we are
20 working to find effective solutions that will keep
21 our developments clean and cut down on the amount of
22 time staff spend dealing with trash-related problems.
23 We appreciate the support from the City that is
24 enabling us to address some of these issues. These
25 are just a, a, a few of the areas we plan to focus

1
2 on, though we recognize we have many other challenges
3 affecting our residents' quality of life. We must
4 strive to be a more efficient landlord and focus on
5 providing quality customer service to our residents.
6 To that end, we are rolling out NGO to all of our
7 developments, piloting FlexOps at select
8 developments, using contract services to get more
9 work done, and evaluating our development-based
10 skilled trades pilot. We are reviewing our policy and
11 procedures related to work orders and communications
12 with residents, with a goal of reducing the number of
13 work orders closed without work being done. After
14 this winter's heating crisis, we are undertaking a
15 comprehensive assessment of our heating operations,
16 our procedures related to maintenance and outages,
17 our staffing, and our use of data to inform planning,
18 planning and preventive maintenance.

19 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Thank you Cathy..
20 sorry, thank you Cathy, Cathy. Property management
21 is our core business. Under NextGen NYCHA and with
22 NextGen Operations, we are working to improve
23 residents' quality of life with more efficient
24 repairs and connections to invaluable services.
25 However, the steady, decades-long decline in federal

1
2 funding imperils our work and the progress we're
3 making. Please stand with us as we continue
4 advocating for the increased operating funding NYCHA
5 desperately needs from Washington. Again, thank you
6 for your support as we create safe, clean, and
7 connected communities; we want to continue the
8 dialogue on how we can work together to best serve
9 our residents. And we are now happy to answer any
10 questions that you and the committee may have.

11 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you,
12 thank you everyone for your testimony. We have been
13 joined by the Council's Majority Leader, Council
14 Woman Laurie Cumbo and we were just joined by Council
15 Member Reverend Ruben Diaz Senior from the Bronx. So,
16 again I just want to reiterate that the focus of this
17 hearing is predominately not just about property
18 management but the NGO program in particular because
19 it's within 129 developments with the goal to be
20 rolled out by mid-2019 across the entire portfolio
21 for all developments so the focus will be on really
22 diving into the NGO program and what's happening, is
23 it working, is it not working so the series of
24 questions will be just focused on NGO. So, with that
25 you have over 250 property managers and 129

1

2 developments are within the NGO program, how many
3 property managers are managing properties within NGO?

4

CATHY PENNINGTON: It would be the 120...

5

[cross-talk]

6

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Nine... [cross-talk]

7

CATHY PENNINGTON: ...nine... 129... [cross-

8

talk]

9

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: ...129.

10

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, that means

11

that... so, it's not like it's some like scatter sites

12

or developments that may have more, more developments

13

where there's one property manager for maybe three

14

different developments, is it 129 property managers

15

for all 129 developments?

16

CATHY PENNINGTON: Well some of those

17

developments are consolidation so they... may be more

18

than one property within it but it would... it would be

19

the 129 that are in the program.

20

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay. So, what

21

are the training requirements for property managers

22

within the NGO program?

23

CATHY PENNINGTON: So, the training

24

includes budget management, property maintenance,

25

customer service are three core areas and the length

1
2 of the training is that the regional asset managers
3 go to 12 days of training. The development and super,
4 supervisory staff go to about 20 days of training and
5 the supervisors of grounds and caretakers receive ten
6 days of training and housing assistants receive five
7 days of training. So, the training is very extensive
8 and really is kind of an A to Z training on the
9 foundation of property management. While many of our,
10 our staff are experienced we took this as an
11 opportunity to reset our standards on property
12 management, you know incorporating industry standards
13 in affordable housing into our training. So, we think
14 it's a very robust and comprehensive training.

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, can you
16 explain the difference again between the RAMS and the
17 actual property managers in how their role plays out
18 in how they manage the... like the actual property
19 managers, can you explain that dynamic and then
20 explain the differences in the trainings between the
21 two, the RAMS overall and the property managers or
22 the folks that are actually on the ground in the
23 individual developments?

24 CATHY PENNINGTON: Okay, so the
25 portfolios some of them are, are designed by a

1
2 borough. So, for instance in Manhattan we have a
3 borough director and then the borough director has
4 anywhere from three to four regional asset managers
5 and each regional asset manager is responsible for a
6 select number of properties. That regional asset
7 manager's role is to work closely with the property
8 manager to provide strategic planning and support.
9 So, in other... in other words it's like being a super
10 coach, that regional asset manager is trying to work
11 with that property manager on specific goals for each
12 of their properties.

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Uh-huh...

14 CATHY PENNINGTON: In areas that require
15 improvement whether it be on service delivery,
16 whether it be on customer service, completion of
17 annual recertifications, there's a number of
18 indicators that we measure each property on, the
19 length of time it takes to prepare a unit for
20 turnover. So, we have a number of metrics that each
21 property has to achieve, and the RAMS role is to work
22 with the properties to address any obstacles that are
23 in the way to coach their performance for their
24 properties.

25

1

2

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay. Who

3

conducts the training?

4

CATHY PENNINGTON: The training is, is

5

conducted by a number of external training

6

organizations, NAHRO is one organization, Nan McKay

7

is another, we've contracted for that professional

8

training services. I think there's a third, I can't

9

remember who it is.

10

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay and is

11

there an average salary for the property managers?

12

CATHY PENNINGTON: There is an average

13

salary, I don't have that before me, but I can

14

certainly get that for you.

15

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And is this a

16

union position?

17

CATHY PENNINGTON: Yes, it is... [cross-

18

talk]

19

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Or managerial?

20

CATHY PENNINGTON: Yes... [cross-talk]

21

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: A union

22

position, which union?

23

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Yeah, we're getting

24

that information.

25

[off-mic dialogue]

1

2

CAROLYN JASPER: The managers fall under
3 Teamsters Local 237.

4

5

6

7

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay. And on
average how long does a property manager stay within
NYCHA and on average how long do they stay within the
development where they actually are assigned?

8

9

CATHY PENNINGTON: We'll have to... unless,
unless do you have it... [cross-talk]

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

CAROLYN JASPER: Well to give an exact
amount of years that our property managers stays
within NYCHA that can vary because what happens is
that, you know through, through a housing managers
career they come up the ranks so they may start out
as, as a housing assistant, an assistant manager then
rise through the ranks to become a property manager
so, you know many of our housing managers have been
around for many years, you may have had managers who
have been managers say perhaps for 10, 15 years or
longer so at this point I don't have the average
number of years for the managers but that's something
that we can get back to you on.

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay and what
about within the development that they are assigned?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CAROLYN JASPER: Well within a development that can also vary as well, we've had managers that may have been at property say for maybe two years to five years to seven years but again it varies, sometimes, you know you need to change managers because of different dynamics, you know... you know many times, you know I was a director myself and in looking at the different skills that a manager possesses they may be stronger... you know we may need a, a manager who has stronger say skills to manage a larger property so, you know that's an assessment that the borough director, you know will have to make to see well, you know is... you know is it the time to transfer a property manager but again, you know it varies based on different reasons.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay and I just want to announce we've been joined by Council Members Donovan Richards as well as Council Member Salamanca.

CATHY PENNINGTON: Council Member I have the answer on the salary.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Oh, okay.

CATHY PENNINGTON: The base or entry level salary is 52,289.

1

2

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Right and we can get
back to you with the average salary.

4

5

6

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, you
mentioned the property managers and if there may be
some dynamics... [cross-talk]

7

CAROLYN JASPER: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

8

9

10

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...within the
development where they may have to move to a
different... [cross-talk]

11

CAROLYN JASPER: Yes... [cross-talk]

12

13

14

15

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...development,
if there's an instance where there's ongoing
complaints against a particular property manager...
[cross-talk]

16

CAROLYN JASPER: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

17

18

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...what happens
to them like ongoing complaints from constituents?

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CAROLYN JASPER: Okay. Okay, if there are
ongoing complaints against a manager again, you know
as the borough director, the regional asset manager
we have to, you know make an assessment as to what
the complaints are, look into the nature of the
complaints, you know sometimes if you have... if we
receive multiple complaints it may not be of our best

1
2 interest to just transfer the manager, we need to
3 deal with the situation or with the issue at hand
4 because, you know if we transfer a manager from one
5 property we're just transferring say an issue from
6 one property to the next property so again based on
7 the nature of the complaints if we do find that there
8 are issues where say the property manager or staff,
9 you know they're not performing up to par then it's
10 up to us, to property management or to the, the
11 responsibility of the regional asset manager to start
12 progressive disciplinary action and disciplinary
13 action is not to say terminate, you know an
14 employee's employment but it's corrective action so
15 we're looking to correct the action.

16 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, we have
17 also... [cross-talk]

18 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Council Member I'm
19 sorry I would just like to add though that the
20 property manager is just one piece of the component,
21 alright, it's one person, there's an entire team that
22 supports each of the developments, so we really do...
23 when we receive complaints, when we receive
24 information we have to look at the, the totality and
25 it might not just be the property manager, it could

1
2 mean that we need to put additional resources into
3 that particular development, right, so there's a much
4 larger team, the property manager is the person that
5 represents the development and they are charged with
6 a lot of responsibilities but I just want to be clear
7 that, that there are other factors that we do need to
8 take into consideration.

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, so when
10 you walk into an average development property
11 management office who will you see besides the
12 property manager since there are other people who
13 actually work there, so who else is in the building?

14 CAROLYN JASPER: Well... [cross-talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Within the
16 management staff, the administrative staff in the
17 office?

18 CAROLYN JASPER: When an individual first
19 comes into the property management office they will
20 be greeted by a receptionist, right, thereafter each
21 resident is assigned to a housing assistant so the
22 next line of command after seeing the receptionist
23 would be their housing assistant so thereafter some
24 management offices have assistant property managers
25 and of course you have a housing manager so again

1
2 based on the nature of the complaint if the resident
3 has made say an appointment to see the manager or if
4 there is say a critical issue that needs to be
5 addressed by the manager they will speak with the
6 receptionist regarding their issue.

7 CATHY PENNINGTON: I might add that one
8 piece that is somewhat challenging, there's a lot of
9 inner dependencies as the GM was mentioning so the
10 property manager is ultimately responsible but the,
11 the, the team has to deliver it. So, for instance the
12 skilled trades that we talked about, all those
13 trades, those 23 different trades those services are
14 all scheduled and coordinated outside of the site-
15 based property management so the property managers
16 dependent on their borough or their portfolio skilled
17 trade unit, so we have individual units that do all
18 the work around planning for getting... making sure the
19 staff have the right materials to do the jobs and
20 then all the scheduling. So, so sometimes there could
21 be dissatisfaction on the service side that, you know
22 may be dependent on, on another unit so it's just to,
23 to kind of make that point about some of our
24 interdependencies.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, we've been also joined by Council Member Gjonaj. Just along them same lines you mentioned and then I'll... this will be my last question and then I'll open it up to my colleagues. So, under NextGen operations the property manager has a budget and the authority to contract work, what criteria does NYCHA use to determine the budget for each development and can you provide us with a breakdown of how that money is allocated to each development within the program?

CATHY PENNINGTON: So, there's a budget season we go through which is in the fourth quarter of each year and this is just my first round with it, but each property manager is doing an assessment along with their RAM, their Regional Asset Manager to look at what that property needs so they may be looking at their history of work orders, what types of services were in demand in the past year, where they might see some backlogs and they might need additional services, they also are going to be anticipating our annual HUD inspections which we refer to as PHAs inspections and they need to prepare. There's certain standards we must meet at our properties each year for the HUD inspections so

1
2 those are the kind of data they would pull, what's
3 happened in the past year with the property, where
4 the backlogs are and then they would build their,
5 what we refer to as their services and supplies
6 budget and each property has an individual budget.

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay. Okay, so
8 I, I have a series of other questions but right now I
9 will open it up to my colleagues and the first will
10 be Majority Leader Cumbo.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much
12 Chair, thank you all for being here today. I wanted
13 to jump right in into the issue around staffing. So,
14 in the testimony it states that there are 10,800 full
15 time employees, nearly a quarter of whom are
16 residents, why is that number so low that there's
17 only a quarter of whom are residents and in addition
18 to that how many of those staff members are
19 administrative versus those that work in the other
20 categories such as property managers, maintenance
21 superintendents, basically people that are in the
22 field, how many are administrative and how many are
23 actually working within the NYCHA grounds?

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Sure, so I, I can start with that. So, of the 10,200 full time employees... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: ...operations there are about 7,200 of those 10,200 that work in operations.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Okay... [cross-talk]

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: The, the balance are other support services, other programs.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Because in, in addition to that I understand that you're going to be downsizing your staffing dramatically, so it says NYCHA's 2018 five-year operating plan shows that NYCHA plans to reduce the administrative head count by 444 employees... [cross-talk]

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: So, there has been a concerted effort on the part of NYCHA to reduce the number of administrative and support staff and to focus our, our staffing levels on the front line, on the maintenance staff and operations...

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Is it thought that the 444 employees that would be administrative but is

1

2 it thought that there is perhaps right now a lot of
3 employees who are not being effectively utilized or...

4

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: So, I'm going to
5 actually ask Kerri Jew, Executive Vice President for
6 Administration to come up and.. [cross-talk]

7

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I'd appreciate
8 that.

9

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Thank you.

10

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Uh-huh.

11

KERRI JEW: Good morning. So, the, the
12 four.. [cross-talk]

13

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: And could you tell
14 me your name again, I'm sorry.

15

KERRI JEW: Kerri Jew.

16

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Okay..

17

KERRI JEW: Okay, so the, the proposed
18 downsizing is in.. [cross-talk]

19

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Oh, we have to do
20 a swear in? Okay, we're going to just do a swear in..
21 [cross-talk]

22

KERRI JEW: Okay.. [cross-talk]

23

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: ...very quickly.

24

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Raise your
25 hand. I don't even know what I did with it.. thank

1

2 you... please raise your right hand, do you affirm to
3 tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the
4 truth in your testimony before this committee and to
5 respond honestly to Council Member's questions?

6

KERRI JEW: I do.

7

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you.

8

KERRI JEW: So, the proposed reduction in
9 head count is of our central office head count so,
10 when you're speaking of administrative staff in the
11 property we count them as our front-line staff so
12 we're not talking about reducing the office staff in,
13 in the properties.

14

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: You're not talking
15 about reducing the office staff?

16

KERRI JEW: That are in the properties,
17 when you go into a property there's, there's an
18 office and so those staff are still considered part
19 of our front-line, they provide a direct service to
20 our residents.

21

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: So, where will the
22 reduction happen?

23

KERRI JEW: Those are in our central
24 office, so those are, are people who work in

25

1
2 departments like mine, administration, some of my
3 colleagues here, IT, you know finance... [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: What is the
5 thought process behind that, is that, that... those...
6 that, that staff is no longer necessary, or you have
7 other ways to compensate for it or was that a large
8 part of the challenges with NYCHA's budget is that
9 they were too administrative or top heavy and they
10 want to reduce those salaries to reduce the budget?

11 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: So, if I can start and
12 then I'll turn it back over to Kerri. So, we, we've
13 made a number of, of investments in new technology,
14 right, looking at business practices, streamlining
15 procedures and, and a lot of the investments that
16 we've made especially on the IT side have resulted in
17 our dependency on staff so for instance in Kerri's
18 area we're automating a lot of, of our administrative
19 personnel work which means that we don't need as many
20 staff to actually process our personnel... the, the
21 paperwork that's involved in, in maintaining 10,200
22 staff.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Because what we
24 want to make sure is with the challenges we want to
25 make sure that the reduction in, in staffing is not

1
2 going to further challenge issues that residents have
3 but at the same time we also don't want a budget
4 where there are people that have inefficiencies in
5 terms of how the actual organization is operating.

6 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: No, we, we agree 100
7 percent and, and any reductions in staff don't happen
8 until we actually have a, a more efficient process
9 to, to replace those staff.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Okay. We're
11 definitely going to be watching that as well. NYCHA's
12 facing additional outside oversight from the state,
13 how will NYCHA share responsibilities with new
14 independent monitors and analysts? So, we're hearing
15 a lot in terms of state control, city control, where
16 is NYCHA in its understanding and how will they
17 respond to both entities?

18 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: So, I'm not sure about
19 the city oversight but with respect to the executive
20 order signed by the Governor... [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Uh-huh... [cross-
22 talk]

23 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: ...and the appointment
24 of an emergency manager, we're still evaluating
25 exactly what that means, the language was a bit of a

1
2 surprise to us, this is unique, we've never seen
3 language like this before so it's a precedence
4 insentient, so we're still trying to evaluate exactly
5 what that means for us operationally... [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Uh-huh... [cross-
7 talk]

8 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: ...so unfortunately, I
9 don't have an exact answer as to how that will affect
10 us on the day to day basis.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Uh-huh. And want...
12 and wanted to Segway into that, so many of my
13 constituents speak to me, I also have employees that
14 live in NYCHA and as best as I can see it many of the
15 NYCHA residents are paying very good rent so they're
16 paying quite a bit to live in NYCHA and somewhat of
17 the understanding from the outside would make it
18 appear as if NYCHA residents aren't actually paying
19 in some instances top dollar as far as living in that
20 particular development, right, so my question is how
21 much rent is a part of the percentage of the
22 operation of NYCHA and what is the average rent of a
23 resident in NYCHA currently?

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CATHY PENNINGTON: So, the rent billed to residents is over a billion dollars and so it is a, a significant part of our operating budget.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: What, what percentage is that?

CATHY PENNINGTON: Of the total budget? I'd have to get back to you on that, I don't know right off hand.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I would like to know that because it's important because when we're talking so much about subsidy and the federal government and why residents can't get the repairs that they need, with any other type of development you would understand that if you're paying your rent on a regular basis that those would be funds that would be somewhat sufficient in order to manage a lot of the repairs that are needed. So, for I believe one of my staffers they may be paying upwards of 15 to 1,700 dollars a month in rent so when you're paying that type of rent you're expecting that you're going to get premium services in terms of how your repairs are going to be made.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CATHY PENNINGTON: Well my comment would be that the rent that is charged is based on the household's income... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

CATHY PENNINGTON: ...at 30 percent of their income so, you know the higher the, the person's income because we don't have a cap on how much a family can, can earn who lives in public housing that's proportionate to what they would be paying.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: But at this time, you don't know what percentage of the... of NYCHA's operating budget comes from rent?

CATHY PENNINGTON: I, I, I can get that information for you.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I would appreciate that information, but I would appreciate that information before the hearing ends.

CATHY PENNINGTON: Okay, right...

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: So, I'm sorry Council Member so the average rent that a NYCHA resident pays is 525 dollars a month... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: 525 dollars?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Right and we'll get back to you with the additional answers to your questions. I, I did read a report and the data was from a few years back, but it was kind of telling that, that 74 percent of all New York City residents that pay less than 500 dollars a month live in public housing.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Uh-huh.

10

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Right...

11

12

13

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Do you know what that is on the high end in terms of what residents could be... like what is the high end of that?

14

15

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Again, we'll get back to you with the specifics... [cross-talk]

16

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Okay... [cross-talk]

17

18

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: ...of the, the rent and, and the collections.

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I appreciate that because its, it just seems like a lot is not adding up in terms of what the residents are paying, the repairs that they need to have made and residents still expected to pay their rent without the repairs being made. One of the major issues that's happening in my district of course is the issue around mold and

1
2 moisture, are you at this time committing to the
3 provisions and the bias versus NYCHA's settlement
4 agreement which mandates that mold and moisture be
5 treated at its source within 15 days of being
6 notified by a tenant?

7 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Do you want to come
8 up... yes, we are, and I just want to introduce Kelly
9 MacNeal, our... [cross-talk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: So, when... that
11 means that you're committed to it that means that
12 it's happening or its going to happen?

13 KELLY MACNEAL: We, we are committed, we
14 are committed to it.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: And what is the
16 commitment... [cross-talk]

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Swear her in.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Okay, yes. Go
19 ahead.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Please raise your right
21 hand, do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole
22 truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony
23 before this committee and to respond honestly to
24 Council Member questions?

25 KELLY MACNEAL: Yes, I do.

1

2

COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: So, the question is more specifically around commitments, so wanting to understand what does commitment mean to you and what does mean as far as a timeline because there are issues around mold that have been pervasive throughout my tenure as a Council Member and wanting to know where do we stand in terms of mold removal? I'm, I'm reading what's here in NextGen and I'm not sure of what NextGen is, is an ideal or it's something that's implemented currently or is it something that you would like to strive for so, I want to be able to tell my residents if you have a mold issue in your apartment, yes it's going to be addressed and dealt with within 15 days and to be able to, you know take that commitment to the bank for my constituents or is it that I cannot give them that commitment that it's going to be addressed within 15 days?

21

22

KELLY MACNEAL: Thank you for the question...

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Uh-huh...

KELLY MACNEAL: So, presently we are proceeding with revised procedures, enhanced training

1
2 and new instruments as well as inspection and repair
3 of all roof fans. When you speak to the 15 days
4 there's... there are two and, and I can... I will need
5 the operation staff to assist me but there are two
6 approaches to eradicating mold. There is simple and a
7 more complex and so we strive to meet the, the, the
8 two deadlines and if there are outstanding capital
9 work that is associated with a particular unit then
10 that is taken into consideration, but those
11 provisions of the simple and more complex repairs is
12 an approach to eradicating mold.

13 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Right, so the... [cross-
14 talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Well let me... let
16 me just to get further clarity, I get with issues
17 around mold that sometimes it can be a larger issue
18 that's impacting the entire building but is there
19 something that happens immediately in an apartment
20 that's possible to address almost in a band aid
21 attempt to address the issue of mold in that
22 immediate household while at the same time addressing
23 the larger issue and the two meeting in the middle,
24 how do you approach that?

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: So, again we are... we are extremely committed to addressing mold conditions and, and yes, we need to improve on, on the level of service and in response to a condition of mold. So, there are some remedial actions that, that can be taken some of those would be more short term and as you said putting kind of a, a quick fix on a problem while we address the underlying condition but until you actually identify the source of the moisture and that can be complicated at times especially in a large building or a large development so what we don't want is to go in there and to perform what the resident believes to be is a correction of the mold condition until we've actually addressed the underlying problem.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: It's to my understanding that a judge has found you in non-compliance of this particular court case, can you understand why?

KELLY MACNEAL: Although we are disappointed in Judge Pauley recent rejecting... rejection of the proposed consent decree we will continue to work with plaintiffs and a special master to address the court's concerns, but we are going

1
2 forward with the inspection and repair of the roof
3 fans as well as enhanced training for the maintenance
4 staff that address mold as, as well as working with
5 our revised procedures in approaching eradicating
6 mold.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I just have two
8 other questions, so as a new mom, I have a son that's
9 eight months old and to have issues such as lead and
10 mold to be so pervasive throughout NYCHA and to found
11 in noncompliance for many families in particular
12 especially families with young children it's, it's
13 frightening and it's disturbing that we are not in
14 compliance and how we as leaders can go back to our
15 communities knowing that the NYCHA, NYCHAs not in
16 compliance with these particular regulations and that
17 we have children that these sorts of issues can cause
18 irreparable damage and we have to make sure that
19 we're not just committed to something but that we are
20 actually in compliance with something and we need to
21 make sure that there are repercussions for not being
22 in compliance moving forward. I just wanted to bring
23 your issue to one final issue because I know that
24 many of my colleagues would have questions that they
25 want to ask. So, the NYCHA NextGen plan as it was

1
2 originally laid out to me how many developments are
3 currently part of NYCHA NextGen in terms of building
4 and construction of utilizing vacant lots on NYCHA
5 property for housing and development because I know I
6 have one in my district and Ingersoll Houses but how
7 many are either... have either been identified or in
8 the pipeline or have completed a project as it
9 pertains to NYCHA NextGen as far as construction?

10 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Yeah, my apologies we
11 don't have that information, that's on the real
12 estate side, we were focused on operations, but we
13 can certainly get back to you with that.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Uh-huh. That's a
15 difficult answer because there could have only been
16 but so many of the NYCHA developments at this time
17 and I'm sure it's a... I'm sure while this is... you're
18 talking more about capital improvements and that sort
19 of thing and the developments internally the entire
20 organization should have an understanding of where
21 NYCHA NextGen stands, what we're interested in at
22 this particular time is how do we utilize vacant lots
23 and property not so much for a private developer that
24 come from outside of our community but development
25 that comes from internally within our community. For

1
2 example, throughout Brooklyn's history and I'm
3 speaking about Brooklyn because I understand that
4 history but I'm sure it's part of other boroughs, our
5 local churches have been instrumental in local
6 development throughout our borough particularly
7 developing senior housing as far as it pertains to
8 our community but in addition with the downsizing
9 that NYCHA has been looking to do it's imperative
10 that we create a pathway for our residents to have
11 secure housing within their communities where they've
12 grown up and lived all of their lives.

13 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Okay, so again my
14 apologies that we are not prepared to answer that
15 question directly, but we certainly will follow up
16 with you and schedule a meeting to discuss that more
17 in detail.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I'd like a meeting
19 but I'd also like a hearing on it because if we have
20 a hearing on it then we can hold one another
21 accountable so I'll defer to our Chair on that and we
22 look forward to having you come back with members of
23 your team that are more prepared to discuss NYCHA
24 NextGen. Thank you.

25 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Thank you.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: That may be helpful to discuss during the upcoming budget hearing where we will talk about the manage... I mean we will talk about development on all of the properties, in particular 50/50, 100 percent as well as senior housing on development so I think we have a date, so we'll share that with you in a moment. We also been joined by Council Member Van Bramer as well as Council Member Mark Treyger and next up we'll have questions from Council Member Reverend Ruben Diaz Senior from the Bronx.

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Thank you my land chairwoman and ladies and gentlemen, good morning, you know Mr. Vito Mustuciuolo and Cathy Pennington. The biggest problem that I... the biggest complaint that I have as an elected official is about people reporting broken things in their apartment or reporting damages and having no response from NYCHA and they feel ignored, they feel neglected, they feel abandoned because they complain and complain and there's no response like there's nobody... no one listening and I could understand that, I could understand that because last time you people came here was on March 14th about a month ago and I

1
2 brought to your attention the problem, I told you
3 that there was a woman that was working, a Cuban lady
4 working for 20 years in housing in NYCHA and I told
5 you that she's been providing all the paper and she's
6 legal... a legal resident but now because in Washington
7 they hold the paper and NYCHA fire her and I said
8 that's discrimination, she's been working there... has
9 been working there 15 years and then the Chairman in
10 that location that was sitting there told me give me
11 the papers and I gave the paper to Miss Kerri Jew,
12 she's the Executive Vice President and Chief
13 Administrative... Chief Administrative Officer, she has
14 a big title like the two of you here today, big
15 titles so if we come here to a public hearing and we
16 are Council Members, I mean in front of us to a
17 Council Member, in front of the audience in record
18 you say give me those papers I'm going to get back to
19 you, I'm get into this as of... as, as of today nothing
20 happened, not even... not even a courtesy call to tell
21 me what happened, if you ignore... ladies and gentlemen
22 if you ignore a city council member I could imagine
23 what you do to them because if you cannot respond to
24 a city council member when you... when you promise
25 yourself to do it in a public hearing and, and I... and

1
2 you said give me the paper and the paper I handed to
3 you in front of everyone and you don't care about it,
4 you don't even do anything about it then I say no
5 wonder, no wonder that, that's... people in housing
6 leave the way leave, nobody cares, nobody responds,
7 nobody, nobody... you know it's like later for you. I'm
8 going to get my sign on the record, I'm going to get
9 my big title Vice President Chief Administrative
10 Officer and I'm going to get my big title and that's
11 it so I'm saying to you today facing you, the Chair..
12 the Chairwoman resigned they send you person maybe,
13 maybe we could start something like let's, let's do
14 something, let's... you say no it's too much already..

15 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: So... [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Thank you... [cross-
17 talk]

18 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Sir with all due
19 respect I don't... I don't think it's appropriate in,
20 in this particular forum in this type of public
21 hearing to discuss a confidential matter regarding an
22 employee what their status... [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Wait, wait... [cross-
24 talk]

25

1

2

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Sir, please let me...

3

[cross-talk]

4

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Wait, wait, wait...

5

[cross-talk]

6

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: ...finish, sir... [cross-

7

talk]

8

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Wait... no, no, no

9

you don't want to get away with that one... [cross-

10

talk]

11

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: No, no sir let... allow

12

me to finish... [cross-talk]

13

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: No, no... wait... hold,

14

hold... you're telling me... [cross-talk]

15

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Sir with all due

16

respect... [cross-talk]

17

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: ...you have a problem

18

for me to tell you... [cross-talk]

19

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: ...allow me... [cross-

20

talk]

21

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: ...it... this is... it's

22

not right for me to tell you in a public hearing that

23

you in public hearing committing yourself to answer

24

back to a city council member that asked you a

25

1
2 question and you... and you ignore that and you're
3 telling me that's not proper for me to bring it in?

4 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Sir, if you'll allow
5 me to finish my answer, right, it's not a matter that
6 I would like to discuss publicly. As soon as this
7 hearing concludes myself and Kerri will sit down with
8 you and we will discuss the specifics of the issue
9 that you raised at the last hearing. Sir, sir I... sir
10 I think every member can tell you that, that I am
11 reachable... [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Sir, I'm sorry this
13 is not a way to treat this resident with NYCHA that's
14 what they are happening because... [cross-talk]

15 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Sir, the issue...
16 [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Okay, get back to
18 you... [cross-talk]

19 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: ...that you're talking
20 about... [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: ...let's do it
22 privately... [cross-talk]

23 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: ...has to do with an
24 employee not with a NYCHA resident there's a big
25 difference sir.

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Why, if you don't respond to me you don't respond to them.

4

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Okay.

5

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, we've also been joined by Councilwoman Diana Ayala, but I just want to say that Council Member Ruben Diaz Senior, you know deserves a response because it was something that was stated during a previous hearing and I understand that there may be some dynamics to it, but we really appreciate a response to his...

12

[cross-talk]

13

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Yeah, we will be glad...

14

[cross-talk]

15

16

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...the, the question... [cross-talk]

17

18

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: ...to meet with the Council Member as soon as the hearing is over.

19

20

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, next Council Member Richards.

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you Chair and thank you for doing this hearing. I guess... I don't have many questions, but I wanted to know and if you can just walk us through how, how does property managers... who do they report to, how often

1
2 do they meet with central staff in NYCHA and I say
3 that because one of the things we often hear from
4 residents and I know Vito in particular walked a few
5 Rockaway developments with me, I'm just astonished
6 most of the time at how little they know of what's
7 going on in the actual development, as managers I
8 would assume that they would be required to walk the
9 grounds or at least walk the entrances to know, you
10 know if locks are broken on doors and I'm, I'm always
11 astonished when I go to a development and they know...
12 they don't... they... there's very little knowledge of
13 what's going on, on the ground so I wanted to just
14 hear a little bit of how you look at metrics on
15 effectiveness in doing their job, I mean it's one
16 thing if you said they can't make it to every
17 individual apartment to see every issue but it's
18 another thing when there's garbage thrown outside on
19 the grass, I mean... so, what I'm trying to get to is
20 what many residents want to know is if some of these
21 property managers actually care because it would be
22 hard for me at least... at least as a Council Member
23 when I drive by or walk by a development and I see
24 garbage and things will report it but I, I'm assuming
25 they are there every day and would have to walk by

1
2 these conditions and should respond appropriately so
3 I just wanted to hear a little bit more about the
4 metrics and who do they report to and how often is
5 that happening?

6 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Thank you very much
7 sir and, and again thank you for your continued
8 support. So, I, I just want to start and then I will
9 hand off to Cathy to, to elaborate more but the one
10 thing that I have been looking at are the duties and
11 responsibilities of the property manager and, and,
12 and I believe that, that currently property managers
13 have some responsibilities that we should take away
14 from them and that their focus should be on the
15 maintenance and the upkeep of the buildings and, and
16 responding to, to the resident's conditions and
17 complaints. So, there are some administrative
18 functions that we're looking to, to centralize and to
19 take away from the property manager freeing up their
20 time. Some of... [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Can you go
22 through some of those things... [cross-talk]

23 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Sure and you know for...
24 so, one in particular has to do with the rent
25 collection and following up on rent arrears, it's an

1
2 extremely time consuming process, it's something that
3 I, I believe that we... and we're taking a close look
4 at how we can centralize that process, you know for
5 instance if we need to go to court the property
6 manager and or their staff go to court that takes up
7 a, a lot of their time and resources... [cross-talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Uh-huh... [cross-
9 talk]

10 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: ...time that should be
11 spent at the development and, and I agree with you
12 that we need to spend more time walking the
13 development, understanding what the conditions are,
14 talking to residents so, you know there are some
15 functions that again I think when we start to take
16 that off of their plate it will allow for an
17 opportunity for them to really serve the, the
18 development in a much better way. So, Cathy will talk
19 about some of the metrics and..

20 CATHY PENNINGTON: So, just one comment
21 is that you're absolutely right that it is the staff
22 who work at the... our developments who are the eyes,
23 everything is not... cannot be stored in a database
24 system, we can run all our fancy reports at
25 headquarters but we rely heavily on eyes on the

1
2 property that is a core responsibility of our
3 superintendents and our property managers and I will
4 ask Carolyn Jasper our VP of Operations to kind of
5 describe those responsibilities in more detail.

6 CAROLYN JASPER: Well responding to your
7 question regarding who the property manager reports
8 to, each property manager reports to a regional asset
9 manager. I know the area that you're talking about in
10 particular, I know out in Far Rockaway for some time
11 we've had a vacancy there for a Regional Asset
12 Manager so actually we have presently just most
13 recently a new Asset Manager was recently appointed
14 so for the past several months we've only had one
15 Regional Asset Manager and the Deputy Director
16 overseeing actually all of Far Rockaway and all of
17 Queens. The Regional Asset Manager who was formerly
18 there was responsible for overseeing ten developments
19 so what we've also done is that we've realigned that
20 area to make it a smaller size and more manageable,
21 so the new Regional Asset Manager will only see about
22 five or six properties and you know be responsible
23 for five or six properties and then there will be
24 another Regional Asset Manager assigned to the
25 developments in Staten Island to oversee those

1
2 properties. The responsibility of both the manager
3 and the superintendent as well as other development
4 supervisors they're responsible for monitoring the
5 conditions of the property. As far as janitorial
6 conditions actually daily there is a caretaker of
7 supervisor's daily checklist where the supervisor of
8 caretakers is responsible for ensuring that, you know
9 they are completing that checklist daily and any type
10 of say repairs, say open door, any lights that may be
11 out in public spaces, any unsightly janitorial
12 conditions or hazardous conditions, those issues
13 should be addressed daily. You're absolutely right,
14 as a part of NGO the property manager and super they
15 are the individuals who are frontline at the
16 property, so they should not have to wait for a
17 Regional Asset Manager to come out to the property
18 and have them or instruct them on issues that are not
19 satisfactory. I know that there have been some
20 challenges in a few of the locations at this time I
21 don't want to discuss because there are certain
22 actions that we are taking that, you know I do not
23 want to discuss here publicly but again that goes
24 back to again with us holding individuals
25 accountable, you know not only at the property

1
2 management at... not only at the, the property manager
3 level but again the property manager, the property
4 maintenance supervisor, supervisors on down have to
5 be held accountable. So, when we talk about
6 janitorial conditions you also have a supervisor of
7 caretaker who is responsible for being out there
8 every day and ensuring that caretakers are properly
9 cleaning, if those caretakers are not properly
10 cleaning then again do they need additional training
11 or again is it just the lack of them taking an
12 interest in doing their tasks properly. So, with that
13 said again the accountability is at the development
14 level and the Regional Asset Manager is responsible
15 for monitoring performance metrics actually they
16 should be looking at those performance metrics daily
17 to not only monitor the janitorial but also monitor
18 operational issues regarding the turnover time,
19 apartment prep and maintenance, addressing work
20 orders so there are a variety of responsibilities at
21 that the Regional Asset Manager's responsible for as
22 well however being that they oversee anywhere, I
23 would say from perhaps maybe five to... five to either
24 seven or eight properties they cannot be at a
25 property every single day so for the most part that

1

2 Regional Asset Manager is perhaps focusing on
3 developments that have more complex challenges.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay and who do
5 they report to?

6 CAROLYN JASPER: The Regional Asset
7 Managers report to the Director.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And the
9 Director is... [cross-talk]

10 CAROLYN JASPER: And the Director...
11 [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...at central or...
13 [cross-talk]

14 CAROLYN JASPER: The Director works out
15 of the borough office, right, so you know you have a
16 Queensboro office, Queens and Staten Island borough
17 office, a Brooklyn borough office, a Bronx borough
18 office, so there are different... [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay... [cross-
20 talk]

21 CAROLYN JASPER: ...offices that they work
22 out of and they have support staff that work out of
23 those offices but the property... but the Directors
24 also go out and they also inspect properties at

25

1
2 times. They receive complaints at their level and
3 they also go out and they inspect conditions as well.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay, okay so
5 I, I don't want to take up too much more time but I,
6 I just, just... I just have a critique on all of this
7 because it's not happening and, and I would really
8 suggest that central take more ownership in this area
9 than leaving it at the local level because I've just
10 seen... I've just seen too much over the... over the past
11 of the course up to the last decade to believe that
12 we're actually... this particular system is actually
13 working so I'm hoping that you're going to really
14 readjust your strategy and, and, and look at it
15 differently because they need to... we need to take it
16 out of the local hands it's not working... [cross-talk]

17 CATHY PENNINGTON: I'm sorry... [cross-
18 talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And then I'll...
20 [cross-talk]

21 CATHY PENNINGTON: ...can I... [cross-talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...just lastly
23 add just on a comment you made General Manager
24 Mustuciuolo on the centralizing the rent so I, I
25 would just implore you to ensure that residents... now

1

2 will residents have to now come to 250 Broadway to
3 address this issue of rent or arrears eventually...

4 [cross-talk]

5 CATHY PENNINGTON: Well what... [cross-
6 talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...so and it...
8 [cross-talk]

9 CATHY PENNINGTON: ...what we would love is
10 that they just do everything online.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Well everybody...
12 [cross-talk]

13 CATHY PENNINGTON: So, we have... [cross-
14 talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...doesn't... yeah...
16 [cross-talk]

17 CATHY PENNINGTON: ...we have something
18 like eight ways they can pay... [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Right... [cross-
20 talk]

21 CATHY PENNINGTON: ...the rent so... [cross-
22 talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Right... [cross-
24 talk]

25

1

2

CATHY PENNINGTON: ...you know the, the,

3

the highest... [cross-talk]

4

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...but if you're...

5

[cross-talk]

6

CATHY PENNINGTON: ...quarter is... [cross-

7

talk]

8

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...in the case of

9

arrears or... [cross-talk]

10

CATHY PENNINGTON: Yes... [cross-talk]

11

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...something

12

complex we don't... [cross-talk]

13

CATHY PENNINGTON: Yes... [cross-talk]

14

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...want our

15

residents to now have difficulty in figuring a way...

16

[cross-talk]

17

CATHY PENNINGTON: Of course, not...

18

[cross-talk]

19

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...to get to an

20

office or something of that nature... [cross-talk]

21

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: No, no absolutely...

22

[cross-talk]

23

CATHY PENNINGTON: No, no... [cross-talk]

24

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Alright, so...

25

[cross-talk]

1

2

3

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: ...not, it's not our intention... [cross-talk]

4

5

6

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...I just wanted to put that out there as well. So, that's my comment... [cross-talk]

7

8

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Thank you... [cross-talk]

9

10

11

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...I hope we'll continue to look at this but there's a lot of work to be done around this, thank you.

12

13

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Council Member Salamanca followed by Council Member Gjonaj.

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you. Thank you, Madame Chair. good morning. I just want to start off this hearing just to express... I've, I've known Vito for some time now when he was the Deputy Commissioner for HPD for the, the Division of Enforcement and Neighborhood Services and Vito I have full confidence in you as the new General Manager of NYCHA that you will do the best of your abilities to try to address a lot of these issues that are occurring; the mismanagement that has happened for years at NYCHA but in order for you to be effective there... the property managers need to get the job done

1
2 and get the job done the right way that's the only
3 way this is going to work for you. So, my, my first
4 question is how often are property managers
5 evaluated, how does the evaluation process work?

6 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: So, sir first of all
7 thank you, I'm going to ask either Cathy or, or
8 Carolyn to ask... answer that question but again I just
9 want to reiterate that this is a team effort, right
10 and, and that we need to do better at supporting the
11 property managers both from above as well as from
12 below. It's not about one individual, right and yes,
13 they are charged with the responsibility of the day
14 to day operations at the development level but I, I
15 charge all of us with, with making sure that they
16 have the proper tools, the proper training to
17 actually accomplish that. So, I, I, I would never say
18 that it's, it's one person's responsibility, its all
19 of ours and I... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: No, I... [cross-
21 talk]

22 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: ...accept that
23 responsibility...

24 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: And I
25 understand that so, you know I have about 20

1
2 developments in my district alone and I have NYCHA
3 developments that you can just tell by walking in
4 there that they've been mismanaged for years and the
5 same property manager has been there for years, so my
6 question is how often do property managers get
7 evaluated, is there an evaluation for them?

8 CAROLYN JASPER: Property managers...

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I'm sorry, I
10 can't hear you.

11 CAROLYN JASPER: Sorry, property managers
12 are evaluated initially when they are hired, they
13 are... [cross-talk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Okay... [cross-
15 talk]

16 CAROLYN JASPER: ...on probation... [cross-
17 talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: ...so there's no
19 job evaluation, you know like an annual evaluation to
20 see how they're doing in that past year?

21 CAROLYN JASPER: Okay, so there is an
22 evaluation for one year and that is a contractual
23 agreement, okay, thereafter there's no other formal
24 evaluation however property managers and
25 superintendents they have to be held accountable for

1
2 performing their work so although they are no longer
3 under a formal evaluation their work is still to be
4 evaluated again based on metrics, based on, you know
5 conditions of the property... [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I, I don't
7 know how you're managing a property manager if you're
8 not doing an annual evaluation that makes absolutely
9 no sense to... [cross-talk]

10 CAROLYN JASPER: Okay, so... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: There needs to
12 be a written evaluation so that you can have
13 something in writing and keep a paper trail if
14 they're actually doing what they need to do and
15 you're telling me that you don't have a paper trail,
16 you don't have an annual evaluation on your managers
17 you just do it one time... [cross-talk]

18 CAROLYN JASPER: Well... [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: ...and that's
20 it.

21 CAROLYN JASPER: Well let me... I'm, I'm
22 going to finish, so although there is no formal
23 evaluation after that initial evaluation there is
24 still a disciplinary process in place so if the
25 supervisors and this is at every level, find that an

1
2 employee whether it is a property manager or property
3 maintenance supervisor if they are not performing up
4 to standards or up to par their supervisor is
5 responsible for progressive... taking progressive
6 disciplinary action and that can be the form of
7 initially starting with an instructional memorandum
8 leading up to a counseling memorandum, a local
9 hearing and thereafter a general trial hearing so
10 that is the formal process.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: How... but how
12 do you discipline someone without, without evaluating
13 them on paper, I, I just... it just doesn't make any
14 sense to me, it doesn't make any sense... [cross-talk]

15 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: I'm sorry, Council
16 Member so with, with respect to the property managers
17 and as we stated earlier in the hearing property
18 managers are, are members of the Teamsters Local 237
19 so they are and the evaluations that we're talking
20 about that is subject of, of mandatory collective
21 bargaining so we need... that's an area that we need to
22 improve on... [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Okay... [cross-
24 talk]

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: ...and we, we need to be able to have the tools that, that, that we need to better evaluate all, all of our staff and, and again I just... to go back to the... your point and, and this is something that I hope to bring some of the experience that I had from HPD to NYCHA we're data rich, how we use that information, how we make informed decisions, the staffing levels that are assigned to each of the developments, I mean these are all important factors and it, it does reflect on the performance of the property manager so, I, I hear exactly what you're saying, I agree with you, I agree that we need to have better metrics, better performance indicators and we need to do a better job of understanding what that all means and to get the resources to the developments where they're needed.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: How do you evaluate the performance of your ground caretakers; do they have an annual... an annual evaluation as well?

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: I'm sorry?

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Your ground takers... your ground caretakers, the caretakers, how do you evaluate their performance, do you have an annual evaluation for them?

1

2

3

4

5

6

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: That is actually the same, it's subject to collective bargaining. With respect... again with respect to a formal process, right look... we, we need to, to set performance standards and metrics for all of our staff.

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, just to follow up on that if you are unable to like to do an evaluation on the individuals because of union and collective bargaining this, this that and the other how are you then measuring success within the developments, if we're not talking about measuring or doing evaluations on the individuals how do you measure success on the development level?

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CATHY PENNINGTON: So, in the NGO model we have a number of what we call performance metrics that we measure the properties on and we can do these measures and, and collect information on performance based on an entire borough, based on an individual development, as far as our work order system we can drill down on... into our skilled trades and into all of our maintenance work orders to look at productivity measures by individual employees. So, we do have a lot of information that we can use to improve performance or address performance deficiency

1
2 so, so there's a variety of indicators we measure, we
3 call service levels, we're able to measure the length
4 of time it takes to complete work in every trade and
5 for every maintenance work order and we can do that
6 by each unique property and that's some of the
7 information that we use as Miss Jasper was describing
8 while we're prohibited at this time from doing
9 professional annual evaluations we are able to
10 provide, you know feedback and accountability to our
11 staff through the data tracking systems that we have
12 so that does move forward. We also measure our
13 performance on how quickly we prepare vacant units,
14 how our rent collections are conducted so these are
15 the measures that we can compare and contrast between
16 our portfolios.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Alright, thank
18 you. When is your collective, collective bargaining,
19 your union contract up for renewal?

20 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: This May.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Okay, so I
22 really hope that you advocate for adding evaluations
23 of your employees in this contract, I have no idea
24 how you're holding your employees accountable if
25 you're not, you know evaluation them on an annual

1
2 basis. Tell me about the... so, here in your
3 presentation on page nine you mentioned that your
4 employees responding to 2.7 million maintenance and
5 repair requests. One of the main complaints and
6 concerns I have in my community, in my developments
7 is that they put in a service request and it is
8 closed within some time and it never gets addressed,
9 so please can you tell me the process on how service
10 requests are supposed to properly be addressed?

11 CATHY PENNINGTON: Sure, thank you for
12 the question. The majority, over 60 percent of the
13 work orders that we receive are work orders that the
14 residents call into us or submit to us online through
15 our... through our My NYCHA app so the majority of the
16 requests come from tenants and the, the balance of
17 work orders that are open are via... primarily
18 inspections that we do with the properties. We
19 acknowledge that there is a problem in our scheduling
20 process and our notifications so one of the things
21 I've recently learned, again I'm kind of fresh eyes
22 on how we do what we do in operations and we have
23 noted a very high what we call rate of tenant not at
24 home so what that means is we have an open work
25 order, a request for service and this... the, the

1
2 request is closed with the code that says tenant not
3 at home. We think that rate is too high, and it
4 contributes to a lot of work orders being closed and
5 work not getting done. Now the tenant... the resident
6 is notified when we make the attempt to come to the
7 apartment that we came twice you weren't home please
8 call us to reschedule but we think that it... we
9 acknowledge that there are flaws in that process.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Major flaws
11 and I, I think that tenant not at home is just an
12 excuse for I didn't go to that apartment and so my
13 question is... my question is how are you auditing each
14 development or monitoring each development to see how
15 these service requests or service complaints are
16 being addressed or do you have a system to monitor
17 them?

18 CATHY PENNINGTON: We do have the ability
19 to monitor how many work orders are closed with work
20 completed, those are the ones we do the quality
21 assurance on and we also do have record keeping on
22 those that are closed with no work completed. Right
23 now we are testing, I call it an ad hock at about 15
24 developments maybe a little more, we have pulled our
25 information to identify all instances where we have

1
2 what we call high rates of tenant not at home, we
3 have met with those individual employees, their
4 supervisors have met with them to set goals and to
5 increase supervision on the closure of those work
6 orders in other words we think that by increasing our
7 supervision on the tenant not at home cases that we
8 can get that reduced, get into more units and make
9 more repairs.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Do you do that
11 in writing to these individual caretakers or is this
12 something just verbal?

13 CATHY PENNINGTON: At this stage it is
14 verbal because we're testing out what is going to
15 work so, so increased supervision will that help us
16 attend to better performance. We're also looking at
17 how can we empower our maintenance workers to do a
18 call ahead so if they got on one work order in the
19 morning they're supposed to be at their next
20 appointment let's say by one o'clock but the
21 particular job they're on takes longer what happens
22 is there's no communication to the resident saying
23 I'm late or... and so the resident and this is not
24 okay, is sitting waiting all day so we're trying to
25 implement ways that they can quickly pull up the

1

2 phone number and do a call ahead to say I'm on the
3 way or I'm two hours late.

4

5

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Alright,
thank... [cross-talk]

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: And Council Member,
I'm sorry, to add to this conversation too the
resident not at home to me it's a perfectly
legitimate problem that we're dealing with. When I
first came to NYCHA I was surprised that our staff,
our maintenance staff, the skilled trades don't work
beyond 4:30, right and so the rely... the dependence
then is on the emergency services division that work
the afterhours to perform after hour repairs, right
and then when we service 175,000 apartments and a
vast majority of our residents work, go to school
they're not home Monday through Friday from eight to
four and so where we need to improve and to work
collaboratively with, with the unions is to expand
the hours that we work where repairs are made, right...

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Vito, the
internal system is flawed that is why you're having
the mismanagement that's happening in NYCHA and I
really hope you can help address that. In your... on
page nine you also mentioned that NYCHA conducts

1
2 48,000 routine apartment inspections, my question is
3 how often do you inspect every apartment?

4 CATHY PENNINGTON: So, we are inspecting...
5 we're... our goal is to inspect each property every
6 other year, we would like to inspect every property
7 every year but frankly the people who do the repairs
8 are the same people who do the inspections, so we
9 have to balance the inspections against getting the
10 work done. So, we are going to be schedule... or we've
11 already scheduled for this year 82,000 units will go
12 through a routine inspection which is our opportunity
13 to get in a unit, assess the condition of the unit,
14 actually make repairs at the time we're in the unit
15 and then create additional work orders that will be
16 scheduled at a later point. In 2017 we completed
17 48,231 apartment inspections and... which generated
18 89,740 work orders of which we have already completed
19 69,000 so we do believe that inspections will give us
20 a better assessment of unit conditions and we are
21 planning to move forward with getting into as many
22 units as we can this year.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I've been in
24 office for two years, I've been walking through my
25 NYCHA developments, there are units that look... that

1
2 obviously have not been inspected in decades and you
3 know it's, again once again a flawed system that the
4 same individuals who are doing repairs who have a
5 high tendency or a high rate of tenant not home,
6 closing tickets of tenant not homes are the same
7 individuals that you're depending on to do
8 inspections, flawed system again. My last question
9 would have to be in terms of your rat infestation, I
10 have certain NYCHA developments that have a high
11 concentration of rat infestations, is there.. is this
12 a skill trade, how are you addressing this, how can
13 we work together to address this in some of my NYCHA
14 developments?

15 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: So, so we do have
16 exterminators on staff that are part of the skilled
17 trades and as you may know we announced that NYCHA is
18 a big part of the Mayor's rat reduction program and
19 in fact the Mayor allocated 25 million dollars of
20 capital money to us to invest in, in... and I believe
21 it's nine or ten developments throughout the
22 boroughs. If you have a, a specific development where
23 you believe that the rat infestation is problematic
24 please let's talk after and, and we'll see what we
25 can do to.. [cross-talk]

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I have... I have one that comes to mind and I see the President from Adam Houses, he calls me once a week, issues, you know rat infestation and yeah, of course you have Jackson Houses, Mr. Danny Barber had the same thing at Melrose but I'm constantly getting calls once a week from Adam Houses. In terms of it... the racoons that are coming out of these holes in the ground... [cross-talk]

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Raccoons as well?

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Yeah, you know what I mean... [cross-talk]

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Yeah... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: ...I'm just exaggerating in terms of the rats. Thank you very much, thank you Madame Chair... [cross-talk]

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Council Member Gjonaj followed by Council Member Treyger.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you Madame Chair and I'm very pleased that we're going to be holding separate hearings on Next Generation Rad because these are very complicated issues and we're looking forward to hearing more about those programs.

1
2 First of all, I think you've received praises from
3 everyone here Vito, we all have a working
4 relationship with you and we're really pleased that
5 you are now at this capacity and hopefully you'll be
6 able to address some of the issues that have been
7 impacting NYCHA residents for decades. At one-point
8 NYCHA properties complexes had full live in
9 superintendents, they no longer have full time live
10 in superintendents, please explain to me why they
11 were removed from the beginning and why we haven't
12 replaced those positions with full time live in
13 superintendents similar to what private landlords are
14 required to have?

15 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Sure, so it's a great
16 question and something that, that Kerri who's going
17 to help respond to your question, something that
18 we've been talking about. I, I don't know of a... of a
19 time when NYCHA required a live in superintendent or
20 had one in every development or building, I do know
21 that there are restrictions with respect to and again
22 this goes back to collective bargaining agreements
23 specific with... to certain titles so what we're
24 starting to do is to explore if there are any other
25 titles that we use so that we have employees in that

1
2 we can expand that program, right, you know the law
3 requires that an owner either live in the building,
4 have a superintendent or provide for services so we
5 do fulfil the obligation under the law because we do
6 provide for 24 hour access and services but I, I
7 agree with you and I think that having someone who
8 lives on... in the development who can respond to
9 emergency conditions after hours, who has a real
10 ownership interest in, in the property I think that
11 that's a, a way that we should be moving towards but
12 again there are some challenges with respect to
13 collective bargaining issues. Kerri, I don't know if
14 you want to add anymore to that...

15 KERRI JEW: Sure, so we do have a title
16 that's a Chief Caretaker which is somebody who is
17 able to live in a property as well as perform some
18 maintenance work, it's akin to a live-in
19 superintendent but it's not a superintendent as we
20 use the civil service title. There is a civil service
21 restriction on the title where its used in scattered
22 sites and senior developments, senior housing. We
23 will be looking to... we are looking into the
24 possibility of expanding that and, and trying to

25

1

2 design a title where we can have more live in... live
3 in employees.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: I don't think
5 we're... we much care much for titles and that's not
6 the objective, I don't care what he's called, or
7 she's called, the idea of having someone that's
8 living on site that is experiencing the same issues
9 as all other residents is the real concern here. When
10 that live in resident doesn't have heat, this
11 caretaker or superintendent doesn't have heat, knows
12 enough to restart a boiler, hands on, more visual
13 responsibilities in reporting and addressing, this is
14 what the concern is not so much in titles, not so
15 much in provisions of law, there's no reason why we
16 couldn't move immediately to have live in resident
17 employees with these responsibilities which would be
18 the same responsibilities that we put on private
19 landlords... [cross-talk]

20

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Right, so... and we in
21 fact have two live in supers in two of the
22 developments in your district so... but again it's a...
23 it's a great idea and it's something that we're
24 looking to expand on.

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: We need to expand and I, I, I hope that we do it quickly. What... and I'm hearing the back and forth and I'm just trying to evaluate, the responsibilities of these property managers doesn't sound much different than the responsibilities of property managers for private landlords and I'm just trying to understand why we're coming up with so many excuses for them when private landlords have property managers that do rent collections, go to court, meet with tenants, evaluate employees, address issues, hire contractors, the same responsibilities, why are we coming up with excuses for our resident... our property managers when they're clearly... property managers are doing this work for the entire city?

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Right and sir I'm, I'm not making excuses for anyone what I'm saying is that I think that the challenges that we're faced with go beyond one particular group of individuals, it's not just the property manager but you... it's hard for, for us to compare ourselves to any other private owner in the city, if you look at NYCHA and if you look at the vast... the vastness of NYCHA if we were a city we would be the second largest city in the state of New

1
2 York, right, there's no other property owner in New
3 York City that comes close to managing or maintaining
4 175,000 units, these are some real challenges. We
5 have other challenges that we have to live with in
6 constraints of civil servant titles and, and union
7 issues, some of those issues are not the same that
8 private owners necessarily share and then there's
9 also the pay scale and a, a private manager in a
10 building with 4,000 units I'm sure makes a little bit
11 more than what our property managers make so there
12 aren't direct correlations between the two and again
13 I'm not making excuses, what... I think what I'm
14 accepting is the responsibility that, that when we
15 talk about property managers we should be talking
16 about property management, right, not about the
17 individual, not about the 270 or so people that are
18 dealing with this on a day to day basis, it's about
19 how we manage the properties, right and I think that
20 that's the issue that, that we need to address.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Okay Vito, I, I,
22 I agree that NYCHA is a huge undertaking, but this
23 city has more than 175,000 units that are under
24 private management...

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Not under a single private management...

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: For... they... but we have that... I think we're trying to split hairs here, New York City has many more units, housing units that are in a private sector, is this a fact?

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: And they're managing their properties and they're providing services for the most part, in your previous capacity and I wonder under your previous capacity hearing... from what... I'm sitting on this side of the table where you are many times with private landlords, would you have accepted the, the responses that you are currently giving me or us today; we're trying, we understand, we're seeking, we're acknowledging, you would have sat there and listened and then you would have did one of two things, you would have took out a pair of scissors or a hammer and you would have hit that property owner one way or another, we're government, we're supposed to be able to do things better than the private industry, we're supposed to hold ourselves at a higher standard not at a lesser standard. When it comes to the reporting that was

1
2 done in March of 2017 where it was stated that 83
3 percent of apartments, units that were inspected by
4 Department of Health showed severe hazardous
5 conditions in these apartments, what would have been
6 the approach for a private landlord? Wouldn't there
7 be a violation issued? Wouldn't there be emergency
8 repairs that would be coming into those units? Why
9 are we not holding NYCHA to the same standard and
10 providing the same protections to our NYCHA residents
11 that we would to all other New York City residents?

12 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: So, sir I think what
13 I'm saying is that I hold myself responsible and, and
14 every, everyone who's sitting here with us today,
15 the, the entire NYCHA team, right, the... NYCHA is not
16 a private owner, right and, and we have been
17 suffering from decades of disinvestment and, and
18 deferred maintenance, most private owners are not
19 reliant on the federal government or the state or
20 even the city for that matter to provide them with
21 money to make necessary repairs, private owners as
22 you well know when they make major investments in new
23 roofs or boilers pass along major capital improvement
24 increases to recoup their investments from the
25 residents, we don't do that, right, private owners do

1
2 not cap the rent that they can charge to their
3 residents at no more 30 percent of their annual
4 income, right, we're faced with a number of
5 challenges that private owners are not faced with.
6 With respect to my previous role, right, I in my 30
7 plus years in enforcement never held one person
8 responsible especially a property manager, I held the
9 owners responsible, right and I am now the owner,
10 right, by virtue of the fact that I'm the General
11 Manager and the Chief Operating Officer for NYCHA, I
12 hold myself responsible, right, I don't hold an
13 individual responsible at a development level and,
14 and let... if, if I'm giving them the resources that
15 they need, if we're providing for the major capital
16 improvements that we need to provide, if we're
17 providing for the resources to do the day to day
18 maintenance and respond to two and a half million
19 complaints a year, right, then I would hold that
20 person responsible, right, but we have not provided
21 them with those resources as of yet, right. And with
22 respect to the state Department of Health report I'm
23 still waiting for the state to provide me with the
24 specifics of their report, I read the report, it's a
25 great reading report, right, you know after the

1
2 Governor announced the fact that the state was
3 conducting this investigation within that first... that
4 same week I was up in Albany and I met with the state
5 Department of Health, I actually called them up and
6 asked them to have a face to face with me and, and I,
7 I asked them the one thing that I wanted from, from
8 this exercise, this investigation is that if they
9 came across serious conditions, right, life and
10 safety issues that they reach out to me directly,
11 right, I give them my cell phone number, I give them
12 my email address and because we should be responding
13 to those timely, we shouldn't wait for a report to
14 come out, right and I received maybe three emails
15 with six or seven addresses of conditions, right. So,
16 the 280 or so conditions that they site in the report
17 I haven't seen the details of it yet, right, I've
18 reached out to the state and I patiently wait for
19 their response.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Mold and lead is
21 a serious issue..

22 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Yes, it is.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Okay. What is the
24 current requirement on private landlords with mold
25 and lead issues?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: If... you're talking about if a violation is issued?

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Uh-huh.

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: For lead paint hazards, they have 21 days to correct.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: And if they don't correct in 21 days what happens then?

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Well either HPD can bring enforcement actions in housing court... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: ...or emergency repairs.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Right, why aren't we doing the same for NYCHA housing?

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Sir I don't believe that we're not... we're, we're holding ourselves to the same standards.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Well we clearly have lead violations that have been going on forever that haven't been removed and we have current mold conditions that are ongoing and repetitive due to the failure of addressing the underlying issue and the repetitiveness of mold, this is not... [cross-talk]

1
2 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Well, if we can
3 separate the two issues for lead based paint hazards
4 when the state Department of Health... I'm sorry, the
5 City Department of Health issues a commissioner's
6 order to abate we respond to those in, in the time
7 prescribed by law, right, we work closely with our
8 colleagues at the City Department of Health and in
9 fact we to the best of my knowledge in each of the
10 cases that they've referred to us we've responded and
11 corrected in a timely fashion, right. If you're
12 talking... I think you're talking about the visual
13 assessments and, and we just recently completed over
14 9,000 visual assessments as required by Local Law 1,
15 right and in response to those visual assessments
16 we've performed over 7,000 remediations, right so...
17 and I'm not suggesting that there isn't room for us
18 to do better, right and that we still need to focus
19 on full compliance, we're doing great work, right and
20 I think that a lot of that is getting lost, right.
21 The public doesn't hear about all of the, the good
22 work, the public doesn't see the pictures of the
23 apartments that I've visited in, in our developments
24 where residents have beautiful homes, right and, and
25 they're well maintained and, and that's in part

1

2 because of the relationship between the resident and
3 the property management staff, right. And so, it's
4 unfortunate that we only focus on, on, on the
5 unsightly conditions and the bad conditions, right
6 but out of the 175,000 units they don't all look that
7 way.

8

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Vito I, I
9 appreciate what you're saying but we're not here to
10 praise we're here to address issues that have gone
11 too far without being... [cross-talk]

12

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: And so, I'm not...
13 [cross-talk]

14

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: ...addressed...
15 [cross-talk]

16

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: ...praising I'm just...
17 [cross-talk]

18

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Right... [cross-
19 talk]

20

VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: ...trying to be
21 constructive...

22

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: And right and
23 there will be time for patting people on the back, as
24 you know I come from this world and if I would have
25 responded to any agency or department with how come

1
2 you're not focusing on all the good work I'm doing
3 but you're focused on this one problem, you would
4 have responded or the agency or the appropriate
5 department would have responded with this is a
6 problem, legally you're required to correct this
7 condition to make sure it doesn't reoccur and it
8 doesn't exist, that would have been the response not
9 of all the great work that I've accomplished.. [cross-
10 talk]

11 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Right, so sir let me
12 take that back then, I... [cross-talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Yeah... [cross-
14 talk]

15 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: ...acknowledge the fact
16 that we need to do better, right and, and we will do
17 better.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Well I... well I
19 would.. I strive that we all should always look to do
20 better but why aren't we issuing actually violations,
21 HPD violations on these units so they'll become a
22 matter of record and work orders seem to appear and
23 disappear and reappear and re-disappear?

24 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: So, so first with,
25 with respect to HPD violations the issuance of a

1
2 violation without the enforcement actions that follow
3 are meaningless... [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: But we have
5 enforcement.

6 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: No sir the... [cross-
7 talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Emergency
9 repairs.

10 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: But HPD cannot perform
11 emergency repairs in NYCHA owned buildings and
12 honestly it makes no sense to, to take away the
13 valuable resources that HPD has in protecting the
14 residents in private housing in New York City to
15 focus on, on NYCHA buildings, that's our
16 responsibility... [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Because NYCHA
18 needs the attention.

19 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Sir, we can do this
20 internally, right and we will do this internally and,
21 and we need to do better and, and there has been a
22 lot... I've, I've said this repeatedly for good, bad or
23 indifferent the attention that's being paid to NYCHA
24 has resulted in, in new funding streams, new
25 resources coming to us, right and, and we need, need

1
2 to do better in, in how we spend that money, we need
3 to be more proactive in, in how we address the
4 conditions, we need to start to in... to protect our
5 capital investments and when we replace a roof on a
6 building my feeling is that then we should go into
7 the apartments and correct the conditions in the
8 apartments that resulted from the years of, of
9 neglect and water leaks.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: And I have one
11 more question for you, since we brought up rent
12 collections I believe it's one billion dollars a year
13 which is collected in rents from our residents?

14 CATHY PENNINGTON: Its, it's over one
15 billion dollars and to the earlier question about
16 what percent of our budget it's 32 percent of our
17 budget is reliant on tenant rent.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: So, I, I have a
19 question on rent collections, what percentage of the
20 collectable rent are... is NYCHA collecting?

21 CATHY PENNINGTON: Our current collection
22 rate is 92 percent.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Very good and who
24 collects that money?

25 CATHY PENNINGTON: NYCHA.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Okay. So, I would hope with a collection rate of 92 percent which is pretty good in New York City that you would start... we would start focusing on maintaining our properties, so we can get that same 92 percent of rental... similar to rent collections, we're focused more on rent collection than addressing the issues, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you and I just want to just pinpoint that in your response to today's hearing it would be helpful to just have some lessons learned or best practices from the sites or the developments that have a site caretaker or chief caretaker to see how things are working out in those developments and I know that Miss Ford was here and Clairmont Consolidate is one of those developments and it would be also helpful to know how many of the property managers are actual NYCHA residents as well. Treyger followed by Councilwoman Ayala.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you very much for this very important and timely hearing and good to see you again Vito and I want to again thank you for coming down to Coney Island recently to meet with our resident leaders. Every three months I put together a, a meeting of my NYCHA residents, my NYCHA

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 100
2 leaders to discuss ongoing Sandy recovery efforts and
3 I do want to acknowledge that you came and along with
4 a lot of NYCHA staff as well. You know I, I read
5 through the packet that NYCHA prepared for this
6 hearing with regards to the services that property
7 management is expected to deliver and I think we
8 heard from some of my colleagues but I think it's
9 worth emphasizing that the one service area that
10 seems to not be a problem for NYCHA in terms of
11 capacity and in terms of delivering is rent
12 collection, if you ask folks to clean a hallway
13 you'll wait awhile but those envelopes waiting to
14 pick up the checks are there. I have a question about
15 the amount of buildings, units, residents versus the
16 amount of caretakers, maintenance workers, managers,
17 is there any official ratio that NYCHA uses to
18 determine how many maintenance workers, how many
19 caretakers should be assigned to particular buildings
20 and properties, can you share that with us?

21 CATHY PENNINGTON: So, we have one
22 caretaker for every 57 units and we have one
23 maintenance worker for every 224 units so that's an
24 example of some of our ratios.

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 101

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: So, let me just
3 get this straight, it says here that you have about
4 3,000 caretakers, is that correct?

5 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Yes.

6 CATHY PENNINGTON: Yes.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Now is that
8 caretaker positions or is that a... are, are there
9 3,000 existing caretakers or are there 3,000
10 caretaker positions?

11 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: That's existing head
12 count... [cross-talk]

13 CATHY PENNINGTON: Existing.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Do you have any
15 vacancies in caretakers?

16 CATHY PENNINGTON: We usually do, yes.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: You say you...
18 [cross-talk]

19 CATHY PENNINGTON: I mean there's
20 turnover...

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: How many... well
22 you see now we're... now we're getting somewhere but
23 how many vacancies do you have in caretakers?

24 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: It's, it's not a big
25 number, do we... I... well I'll have... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 102

2 CATHY PENNINGTON: I don't have it...

3 [cross-talk]

4 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: ...to get back to you,
5 we don't have that exact number with us, but we'll
6 get back to you but it's not a significant number.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Do you have data
8 on the caretaker, maintenance worker retention rates?

9 CATHY PENNINGTON: We can get it for you,
10 we don't have it with us today.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Respectively
12 this is a hearing about property management and we
13 need to know about who's doing the work and if we
14 don't know who's going and who's staying that's a
15 problem. We need that data.

16 CATHY PENNINGTON: We do know that the
17 retention rate for a property manager is
18 approximately seven years, but we can gather that
19 other.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Right... [cross-
21 talk]

22 CATHY PENNINGTON: Information.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: So, I don't... I,
24 I don't think... I think this ratio is out of whack
25 because I'm seeing here that you have over 2,400

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 103

2 buildings that you have about, which means under
3 3,000 caretakers which to me right away that just is
4 not working and you're saying that there's existing
5 vacancies in the amount of caretakers, is that
6 correct?

7 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: That's correct sir.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: And it says you
9 have nearly 800 maintenance workers for 2,400
10 buildings, do you feel that that is a sufficient
11 ratio?

12 CATHY PENNINGTON: Well if you're to ask
13 one of our directors or a property manager they will
14 always say that they can use more staff. Based on our
15 current service levels for maintenance workers which
16 is about four days from when we receive a request for
17 service to when we complete the service that would
18 indicate we have enough maintenance workers. I think
19 where we don't have enough staff is in our skilled
20 trades and those are the types of services that we
21 hear the highest number of complaints rightly so from
22 tenants because the skilled trades have backlogs and
23 it takes much longer to schedule that work so there
24 are staffing challenges in other areas of the
25 organization.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 104

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Out of 400,000
3 NYCHA residents how many folks are members of skilled
4 trades or on the process or in the roadmap... or on, on
5 the path to get credentials to be members of, of the
6 skilled trades, do you have that data?

7 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: We can tell you how
8 many of our skilled trade employees are NYCHA
9 residents.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Well... but do you
11 have data on how many NYCHA residents are members of
12 the trades because if you need to hire folks there
13 are over 400,000 people I think that would be more
14 than happy to be helpful in their own developments..
15 [cross-talk]

16 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Sure, sir I'm sorry
17 we're going to... Executive Vice President, Sideya
18 Sherman.

19 SIDEYA SHERMAN: Hi, Sideya Sherman, EVP
20 for Community Engagement and Partnership... [cross-
21 talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: One second..
23 [cross-talk]

24 SIDEYA SHERMAN: I'm sorry... [cross-talk]

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 105

2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Please raise your right
3 hand, do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole
4 truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony
5 before this committee and to respond honestly to
6 Council Member questions?

7 SIDEYA SHERMAN: I do.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

9 SIDEYA SHERMAN: So, we're, we're getting
10 the number of NYCHA resident employees who are also
11 part of the skilled trades but in terms of residents
12 who are in the pipeline who are apprentices over the
13 past three years we've been able to connect around
14 190 residents to apprentices that's across a variety
15 of trades, some of those are residents who, who are
16 recently employed with NYCHA, they may be residents
17 who are employed with private contractors as well.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: So, about 190
19 people or so who are in the pipeline you said..

20 SIDEYA SHERMAN: Who we know have entered
21 the pipeline as apprentices over these past three
22 years that does not account for residents who are
23 already union members, NYCHA would know... have
24 knowledge of those who are NYCHA employees, but we

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 106

2 don't have necessarily data from every respective
3 trade of who they're members... [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: So, the unions
5 have never disclosed that to you or shared that
6 information how many of, of their members are NYCHA
7 residents?

8 SIDEYA SHERMAN: So, we've not received
9 reporting from the building trainees of, of who
10 amongst their residents... their membership is NYCHA
11 residents, we have knowledge of those that we've
12 connected or those that we've directly employed.

13 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Right, sir that is
14 something that we have actively sought out.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Right because
16 this is... this is a hiring pipeline right there and
17 then and if you're telling me that there's existing
18 vacancies you have a lot of talent in, in, in our
19 buildings here. I'm, I'm also curious, NYCHA ever...
20 overall in terms of its maintenance budget, how many
21 existing vacancies are in its overall maintenance
22 budget?

23 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Okay, sir so while
24 Kerri Jew is looking that up I do want to go back to
25 a point that I, I made earlier and you've talked

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 107

2 about caretakers, it's important to, to remember,
3 right... realize that aside from the developments that
4 are in FlexOps our caretakers work Monday through
5 Friday from eight to 4:30, right and we need to do
6 better, right and, and I've had some, some really
7 productive conversations with the unions and I hope
8 that we can be in a better place after the upcoming
9 collective bargaining negotiations but at, at FlexOps
10 our caretakers work from, from six a.m. to seven
11 p.m., right, that makes a huge difference, right and,
12 and so when a resident leaves their home in the
13 morning and the, the developments who are FlexOps is
14 in place there's someone who's there cleaning the
15 floors, when they come home at night there's someone
16 who's there.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Alright but,
18 but... [cross-talk]

19 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: And it's unfortunate
20 but that's not throughout the entire... [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: But, but
22 respectfully we just heard that NYCHA has heard
23 requests from property managers and from folks on the
24 ground that they need more staff so who are they
25 asking for more, you're saying... we, we heard about

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 108

2 the, the construction trades which is an issue that
3 you're still dealing with, with the unions have they
4 asked for more caretakers?

5 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: So, there is always a
6 request for more staff and we are looking at that..

7 [cross-talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: How many total
9 requests have you received in the past year from
10 property managers about the number of staff that they
11 need?

12 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Yeah, sir I, I.. and
13 Cathy may have that answer but I, I do want to point
14 out that it's, it's... there are two issues, I think
15 one is about the current staffing levels and it's
16 something that we're focused on but it's also about,
17 about how we utilize the current staff that we have
18 and again if all 3,000 caretakers work Monday through
19 Friday from eight to four like you can only do so
20 much Monday through Friday from eight to 4:30, right,
21 so it's how you utilize those racehorses.. [cross-
22 talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Oh I understand
24 but I, I don't think you have enough and I think... so,
25 so the issue is, is that if property managers or if

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 109
2 folks on the... folks on the ground are telling you we
3 need more additional staff in these areas how does
4 that information get transferred to those who are in,
5 in a position to make a difference and hire people
6 that's the question because respectfully yes, NYCHA
7 has over a 20 billion dollar significant capital
8 unmet need, there's no question about that and we're
9 talking about also operations and respectfully our
10 city budget has grown from over... when the Mayor
11 started over 70 billion dollars to over 85 billion
12 dollars so you can't tell me that we don't have the
13 capacity to hire additional maintenance workers,
14 caretakers to take care of what we can take care of
15 in our developments, yes we know the, the rooves
16 that's big work, boilers trust me I know that's big
17 work, I get that but sweeping a hallway, making sure
18 that urine is cleaned out of the elevator that does
19 not require a union member, that requires someone
20 with a heart and with a nose and two eyes and says
21 this is not acceptable here, that's what I'm trying
22 to talk about. So, does NYCHA encourage a culture to
23 tell their staff on the ground, yes tell us what you
24 need, we will do what we can and you're speaking to
25 the right folks here who are in a position to

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 110

2 advocate for you to increase your budget that's what
3 this is about.

4 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Sir, sir with... before,
5 before I turn it over to Cathy and to Kerri with
6 respect to the budget, so the Mayor and, and the city
7 have been tremendous partners and, and have
8 contributed, you know over two billion... two billion
9 dollars towards NYCHA investments but that money
10 comes in the form of capital investments, right,
11 we're not a city agency so we're not subject to
12 making requests of the city for expense dollars for,
13 for staffing, right, that's subject to the dollars
14 that we receive from the federal government, right,
15 so, so our ask and the Mayor's commitment to NYCHA
16 has been on the capital side, right, but we don't...
17 we, we don't sit at the table when it comes time for
18 budget negotiations to talk about expense dollars and
19 head count, right, that's not an issue that we have a
20 conversation with the city about.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: This hearing is...
22 [cross-talk]

23 CATHY PENNINGTON: So... [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: ...about exactly
25 that and so we're trying to figure out how can we

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 111
2 support our residents on the ground who tell us that
3 even day to day basic things are not being addressed.
4 We, we get the big... the big items we, we understand
5 and that's going to require money from Washington and
6 money from the state and money from the city, I, I, I
7 get that, but I think we're trying to have just basic
8 communication, basic... you know just workers to
9 resident apartment unit ratios... last question because
10 I, I want to be... I want to be very mindful of time
11 and I appreciate the Chair for being, you know very
12 generous with time, are there any resident surveys
13 that NYCHA undertakes to get a feel from our
14 residents directly, can, can, can you share, share
15 that data with us.

16 CATHY PENNINGTON: So, yes, we do surveys
17 on customer service and so through our customer
18 contact center we survey... [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: The center that
20 they complain that they complain that no one calls
21 them back about?

22 CATHY PENNINGTON: Well we call them
23 back... we call them back on... in... on... in this case to
24 ask them about their satisfaction with work orders
25 completed, right, so we do survey that, we also do

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 112

2 quality assurance inspections on completed work
3 orders, so we select a number of completed work
4 orders and we reinspect to see if the work was
5 satisfactorily done.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Is any of that
7 data publicly available?

8 CATHY PENNINGTON: I do not know if any
9 of the resident survey data is on our website, but we
10 can find out.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Because we've
12 heard this now for a number of years why 3-1-1 calls
13 there's no public record that we can kind of see and
14 view of NYCHA residents... they're not encouraged to
15 call 3-1-1, right, is that correct that they have to
16 call internally, is that right?

17 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: They call the, the
18 CCC, the NYCHA complaint line.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Right and, and
20 is, is the data about the number of calls and
21 complaints and satisfaction from follow, follow up
22 from these complaints is that publicly available
23 somewhere?

24

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 113

2 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: So, sir as of right
3 now that data is not but we do believe that, that
4 indicators such as that data should.. [cross-talk]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Why is it..
6 [cross-talk]

7 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: ...be... [cross-talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: ...not publicly
9 available?

10 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: It, it... that's a... sir
11 we are looking into making all of our indicators much
12 more transparent, right and I do agree with you that
13 we need to put more information on our website and to
14 share our, our... the information more publicly.

15 CATHY PENNINGTON: I, I would like to
16 make one distinction, it's a customer contact center
17 so it's not a complaint center, it is the place where
18 the resident calls us to, to request a repair or a
19 service so we don't consider it complaints because,
20 you know last year we had 1.5 million calls that we
21 generated work orders for now certainly residents do
22 call us because there's problems with scheduling or,
23 you know the work wasn't satisfactorily done but just
24 to distinguish that this is where residents call to
25 request services.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 114

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Yeah, I, I... just
3 a couple of things just to kind of summarize, I think
4 that there is a... there is a serious shortage of basic
5 workers to, to deal with day to day items, I'm not
6 talking about the, the ruse but just basic day to day
7 items, I believe that NYCHA needs to tap into the
8 talent pool that exists in NYCHA right now and NYCHA
9 should be helping to build capacity within its
10 residents to hire, hire these folks and there should
11 be I think greater transparency about the extent of
12 the issues that we're dealing with because everything
13 so far we've heard is about 20 billion dollars in
14 unmet need... capital need which, which we agree is a
15 serious issue but we also need to rely more on just
16 anecdotal case stories from our residents, we need to
17 actually see some data and to see if investments are
18 actually working making a difference and lastly there
19 should be a culture of encouraging NYCHA employees to
20 say that if they need help we respond by giving them
21 help and not giving them some sort of discipline if
22 they speak out because the... there are folks who
23 actually care about residents and, and their
24 properties who I work with but they should be
25 encouraged and celebrated that they say Councilman

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 115

2 Treyger I need more help here, they should not be
3 afraid to make a... make a phone call to say I, I, I
4 don't want to get in trouble that's a part of this
5 problem as well and I thank the Chair for her time...
6 [cross-talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Just... one
8 quick follow up, how much did NYCHA spend in the last
9 fiscal year on overtime with your caretakers or
10 maintenance workers?

11 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: So, I, I believe and,
12 and if some... if someone could confirm I believe that
13 we spent... so last, last year we spent 29 million
14 dollars in overtime.

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: 29... [cross-
16 talk]

17 CATHY PENNINGTON: No, I'm sorry, year to
18 date this year we've spent 29 million and last year
19 we spent 94 million in overtime... [cross-talk]

20 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: No, I don't know if
21 that's... if that's just for caretaker...

22 CATHY PENNINGTON: No, that's, that's for
23 all, that's for all... [cross-talk]

24

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 116

2 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Right, no, no I'm
3 sorry but the Council Member's question was, was...
4 [cross-talk]

5 CATHY PENNINGTON: ...the caretaker...
6 [cross-talk]

7 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: ...for caretakers...
8 [cross-talk]

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: For
10 caretakers... [cross-talk]

11 CATHY PENNINGTON: Oh, yes... [cross-talk]

12 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Yeah, I believe it was
13 either 28 or 29 million dollars, but we'll get you
14 the exact... [cross-talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Around 28
16 million dollars... [cross-talk]

17 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: In overtime... [cross-
18 talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...in overtime?

20 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Correct.

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Do you know
22 how much that would equate to as far as if you were
23 to hire people for those positions like an
24 individual... [cross-talk]

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 117

2 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: So, so, so we have
3 been doing an analysis on that and I'll be more than
4 glad to share it with you when we're done.

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, that
6 would be helpful to know, thank you. Councilwoman
7 Ayala is the last questions for the council.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Thank you and
9 thank you Madame Chair. I... my question is really... I
10 want to kind of go back a little bit to the mold
11 remediation work, so I appreciate all of the work
12 that's being done to repair all of the aging roofs
13 that we have in the NYCHA portfolio, I know that many
14 of them happen to be in my district but I, I need to
15 understand what the process is after the work has
16 been completed for getting back into those apartments
17 and what the timeline is for making remediations, you
18 know to the bathrooms that are infested with mold?
19 What I'm hearing from my constituents is that often
20 times the roof was... the roof work was done six months
21 ago, and they still haven't seen anyone from NYCHA
22 come in to do the repair work. I think and I wanted
23 to just as a suggestion Vito because I know that
24 you're kind of rethinking how you... you know how, how
25 you do things in terms of getting these work orders

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 118

2 completed on a timely basis is that one of the
3 problems is that NYCHA will come in and look at the
4 mold and then they'll leave and then they'll send
5 someone in to come in and do some work and then
6 they'll leave and there was supposed to be someone
7 else coming in to do the third part of that process
8 but the onus is on the resident to put in the ticket
9 and I think that there's no communication between the
10 workers and the residents so there's not a basic
11 understanding from the residents that that
12 responsibility now falls on them and they're... the
13 process should be that once a maintenance worker
14 comes in and completes part one of that process that
15 they put into a system that you should have that
16 maybe a plasterer needs to come or maybe a plumber
17 needs to come so that the residents are not waiting
18 for months and months and months before the work is
19 done. So, I still want to know, you know how long it
20 takes before... after the work... the work on the roof is
21 done for NYCHA to get into the individual apartment?

22 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Sure, so thank you
23 very much and I, I kind of touched on this earlier,
24 you know something that, that Cathy and I've been
25 talking about recently is, is, is us really in

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 119

2 protecting our investments, right and when I say that
3 I... what I mean is going into the buildings where we
4 have invested capital dollars in roof replacements..
5 [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Uh-huh... [cross-
7 talk]

8 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: ...and, and as opposed
9 to waiting for a resident to call in a condition to
10 CCC for us to proactively go into that building and
11 to look at the conditions in the units and to make
12 the necessary repairs within the units. Once we've
13 addressed the, the source of the moisture, the water
14 penetration then it really is incumbent on us to go
15 in and make the repairs in the units and so that's
16 something that we're, we're working on as a plan of
17 action, it's going to take some time, it's not going
18 to be overnight but I, I agree with you 100 percent
19 that we need to, to do the next step, to take the
20 next step and to follow up. With respect to the, the
21 coordination with the skilled trades as Cathy
22 mentioned earlier it's a challenge, right and it
23 should not be in, in, in the responsibility of the
24 resident that's our responsibility and that's an area
25 that, that we will improve on because I agree with

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 120

2 you 100 percent, once a resident calls in a condition
3 they should not have to worry about bringing in
4 additional work orders or work tickets or calls in to
5 CCC, it's our responsibility to make sure that the
6 repairs are followed through at every step until it..
7 the job is done.

8 CATHY PENNINGTON: And just to add to..
9 [cross-talk]

10 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Yeah... [cross-talk]

11 CATHY PENNINGTON: ...that getting to the
12 root cause to your point is part of the challenge so
13 the cleaning of the mold and the repainting is
14 relatively simple steps but getting to the root cause
15 so that we don't have a recurrence is the challenge
16 so we are actively now inspecting all of our rooftop
17 ventilation systems to make sure that they are
18 operating properly, that there is air circulation
19 going through our, our buildings so that that will
20 help to reduce the recurrence of mold. So, the... you
21 know there's several levels, there's, you know work
22 we have to do in the units and be responsive to that,
23 we need to improve the, we call it sequencing the
24 work to the next trade and that's what I think you
25 were referring to... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 121

2 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Yes... [cross-talk]

3 CATHY PENNINGTON: ...that should not be a,
4 a tenant responsibility, we have the ability to
5 create those next work orders within our system, so
6 we need to improve in that area and we acknowledge
7 that.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I appreciate that
9 because again, you know families shouldn't have to
10 wait months and months and months to get the work
11 done and they shouldn't be waiting unnecessarily
12 because they didn't realize that they were, you know
13 responsible for calling... [cross-talk]

14 CAROLYN JASPER: Excuse me, I'm sorry...
15 [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Yes... [cross-talk]

17 CAROLYN JASPER: I would also like to
18 comment that within our agency we do have a procedure
19 that has been distributed to all of the developments
20 regarding mold and mildew and not to say that we have
21 met every single deadline however there is a
22 requirement that staff once they're notified or they
23 receive a work order regarding mold and mildew that
24 we are required to send staff to that apartment and
25 we are required to remedy within 15 days. I would

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 122

2 also like to make mention is that the borough
3 directors are here, and they can speak to it, you
4 know we meet monthly with our managers and
5 superintendents and the regional asset managers may
6 also meet with them and we emphasize the importance
7 of that when staff go into an apartment that they're
8 required also to identify the root cause of the
9 problem and then also on the work order they are
10 supposed to, you know notate on that work order, you
11 know what the root cause is because again we don't
12 want to go in, send the plasterer in to find out that
13 there is still an issue there where the mold and
14 mildew will come back. So, I would just like to let
15 you know that also we do monitor what we call service
16 level agreements and each of our... each of the
17 departments, the five boroughs they also monitor the
18 service level, the performance level of every single
19 development regarding if they are adhering to that
20 15-day requirement so I... [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Is the 15-day
22 requirement a new requirement?

23 CAROLYN JASPER: No, it's not a new
24 requirement.

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 123

2 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Okay, then I, I
3 would beg to differ that and in the case of
4 developments that are in my district... [cross-talk]

5 CAROLYN JASPER: Yes... [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: ...families are
7 living with mold for years...

8 CAROLYN JASPER: Right... [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I personally, you
10 know have been to many, many, many apartments where
11 it has been evident that no one has come and, and I
12 get it, I understand that we need to fix the root
13 cause of the issue in order to avoid mold from
14 continuing to come back but in the interim there has
15 to be a process by which NYCHA is coming in and
16 cleaning it because that's, that's a... that's a
17 serious public health crisis when children and, and
18 elderly residents are inhaling that... [cross-talk]

19 CAROLYN JASPER: Right... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: ...and so I, I
21 appreciate that there's a 15-day rule but it's not
22 being implemented in my district and I, I want that
23 to be on the record because it isn't... [cross-talk]

24 CAROLYN JASPER: And I would also like...
25 [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 124

2 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Right... [cross-talk]

3 CAROLYN JASPER: ...to make clear because
4 they did talk about capital projects so again, you
5 know let me clarify... [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Yes... [cross-talk]

7 CAROLYN JASPER: ...that again if the root
8 cause is due to a say roof leak and they may need a
9 capital repair then that may take a little longer but
10 in the interim staff should still work with the
11 resident to try to mitigate those issues in the
12 interim.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: No and, and I
14 think we agree on that... [cross-talk]

15 CAROLYN JASPER: Yes... [cross-talk]

16 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Yeah... [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: ...I think that the,
18 the, the issue is, is that they are not and so how do
19 we ensure that they are... [cross-talk]

20 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Right and then... I'm
21 sorry, just a last... [cross-talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Yes... [cross-talk]

23 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: ...point on mold so,
24 yes, we, we are taking remedial action and then with
25 respect to the, the fix so to speak, so we're in the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 125

2 process of training, I believe it's going to be over
3 2,000 of our staff in proper procedures and practices
4 with respect to mold, we've been equipping them with
5 state of the art equipment that can help better
6 identify where the moisture is, the source of... source
7 of the moisture so this is a... I believe it's referred
8 to as mold busters... [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Yeah... [cross-talk]

10 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: ...which is a term that
11 the special master kind of coined but it's a, a
12 process that we're rolling out and we'll be rolling
13 out... [cross-talk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: It's, it's a
15 serious issue, we have 80 percent... yesterday there
16 was a report I believe it was in the Daily News that
17 80 percent of, of residents that... living in NYCHA are
18 at risk for asthma producing elements, right and so
19 we have... I, I live in one of the districts with the
20 highest asthma rates and so that seriously concerns
21 me as a mother, as a human being, it concerns me but
22 I, I, I have... I trust in you Vito, I know of your
23 work in HPD and I'm really excited to see you here
24 and I'm hoping that this is a, a new opportunity to
25 make things right and I know that you're out there,

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 126

2 I've been with you to several of my developments to
3 assess and so I just... I really... you know I, I hope
4 that, you know the, the 15-day rule is a... is, is a
5 policy that is strictly adhered to. I think another...
6 one of... just as the last comment I think that I would
7 make is in regards to work orders, a lot of my
8 residents are senior citizens, a lot of them are non-
9 English speaking, some of them speak primarily
10 Spanish, some of them speak Cantonese, Mandarin and
11 there is usually no one at management that speaks
12 their language that can communicate with them and
13 there is supposed to be a system by which there is
14 some sort of translation equipment that is provided,
15 I guess you use... the, the phone process... [cross-talk]

16 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: So, so... [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: And it, it's...

18 [cross-talk]

19 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Our... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: ...not usually... so
21 what I'm hearing from my constituents is that often
22 times they're discouraged from using that system and
23 they stand there for an hour and they get tired of
24 waiting around and they go back home so, you know
25 they're not... there's no... language is an issue as well

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 127

2 in, in public housing so we're trying to communicate
3 with residents and they don't speak the dialect
4 that's a problem so I don't... I don't know what system
5 it is they use, I have the same issue in my office, I
6 represent a district with a growing Asian population
7 and we don't have, you know a person... a staffer on
8 site that speaks Mandarin or Cantonese but we do use
9 a system, my constituents, services staff is... you
10 know is, is, you know is, is advised that they should
11 always be using the language access network to
12 communicate with the residents so that we know what
13 the needs are.

14 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: So, with respect to
15 that Council Member so both at intake at CCC as well
16 as in, in the management offices our staff have
17 access to language line services that provides for
18 translation in I believe approximately 200 different
19 languages... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Uh-huh... [cross-
21 talk]

22 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: ...I think one of the
23 challenges that... and, and one of the observations
24 that I made in going out to, to the... to the
25 developments is that there's' some difficulty because

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 128

2 we, we have a single handset phone, right and so what
3 we did at HPD and what we're doing... going to be doing
4 at NYCHA is to provide each of the management offices
5 with dual handset phones, right and it makes it so
6 much easier for the communication, it's not as if
7 then... so, right now our employee has to speak to the
8 translator, hand the phone over to the resident, have
9 the resident speak to the translator, hand the phone
10 back, the dual handset phone allows for an... a clearer
11 path of communication between the employee, the
12 resident and the translator.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I appreciate it
14 because I mean I've, I've been at management offices
15 where I'm standing there with a non-English speaking
16 resident and we've been waiting, you know forever,
17 and I'll just stand there just to see how long it
18 takes before someone actually addresses them and
19 sometimes it's a significant amount of time, so it
20 would discourage anyone, so I appreciate it Vito,
21 thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you and
23 I know I've said that Council Member Ayala would be
24 the last, but we've been joined just now by Council
25 Member Ritchie Torres who the Chair of the Oversight

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 129

2 and Investigations Committee is, so I will allow my
3 colleague to ask a question as well.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Thank you Madame
5 Chair, when I saw there was a Public Housing
6 Committee, so I couldn't resist coming, Vito it's
7 good to see you. My understanding is that HUD has
8 imposed a new policy at zero thresholds on the
9 Housing Authority, it's, it's not clear to me what
10 implications that will have for the capital program
11 so can you clarify for me what exactly is zero
12 threshold and what's the practical effect on NYCHA's
13 ability to get capital improvements done?

14 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Sure, so we were
15 actually disappointed when we received a letter from
16 HUD rejecting our plan that we thought was, was a
17 sufficient response to their request so we're, we're
18 working closely with the HUD regional office to
19 address that. The impact to our capital program, we
20 hope that the impact will be minimal if nonexistent,
21 it doesn't mean that we're stopping our work, really
22 what that equates to is that there's an additional
23 layer of... now for... after we pay our contractors in
24 order to get reimbursed by HUD we have to submit
25 additional documentation, there is a review process

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 130

2 at the regional office where they are looking through
3 all of the invoices so there is a delay in actually
4 getting money back to NYCHA that we've laid out. As
5 long as that process works and works smoothly there
6 should be no impact to our capital projects going
7 forward.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And what plan was
9 rejected?

10 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: It was a, a corrective
11 action plan that they had requested.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I'm sorry, what...

13 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: A corrective action
14 plan.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And what was the
16 content of the corrective action plan that you
17 submitted?

18 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Thank you, sorry, so
19 you wanted to be clear, so, it was with respect to
20 lead paint hazards, so they had asked for a
21 corrective action plan, we submitted a corrective
22 action plan, they accepted it in part but not in all.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: So, the rejection
24 of the... of the lead safety... the... of the lead safety

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 131

2 correction action, action plan led to the, the new
3 policy of zero threshold?

4 KELLY MACNEAL: No. So, let me clarify..
5 good afternoon.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Yeah.

7 KELLY MACNEAL: My name is Kelly MacNeal.
8 Just to clarify they accepted the corrective action
9 plan focused on lead paint hazards, they've asked for
10 a wholesale remediation plan on all outstanding
11 compliance issues with HUD, the regulatory framework
12 and we await a resolution of the Southern district to
13 address that, that... the scope of that and so... [cross-
14 talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: But forgive me,
16 what does that have to do with the zero-threshold
17 policy?

18 KELLY MACNEAL: So, in response to the..
19 excuse me, let me start over. So, the zero threshold
20 is a response to the resolution not being arrived at
21 yet.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: A resolution
23 around?

24 KELLY MACNEAL: Around the, the scope of
25 the compliance issues at NYCHA.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 132

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: So, so NYCHA's
3 failure to come to a resolution with HUD around all
4 these compliance issues has led to a new policy... a
5 new layer of bureaucratic review over your capital
6 program, is that what you're telling me?

7 KELLY MACNEAL: That is what I'm telling
8 you, but I am also telling you... [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: So, why was...
10 [cross-talk]

11 KELLY MACNEAL: ...that we, we are... [cross-
12 talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: ...I guess... [cross-
14 talk]

15 KELLY MACNEAL: ...we are in... we are in
16 negotiations... [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Well the next
18 logical question is you've been in conversations with
19 the US attorney for years so what exactly is
20 preventing a resolution?

21 KELLY MACNEAL: We continue those
22 negotiations, we look forward to a resolution shortly
23 and I understand that we, we've been speaking with
24 them for a while, but part of the time has been
25 reviewing the documents that we've submitted and

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 133

2 having a dialogue back and forth around what the
3 issues are and so at this time we are negotiating..
4 [cross-talk]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I mean you're,
6 you're... [cross-talk]

7 KELLY MACNEAL: ...a settlement... [cross-
8 talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: ...you're speaking
10 in generality so are there stumbling blocks to a
11 resolution between you and HUD or you and, and the US
12 attorney's office like what are the, the flashpoints,
13 what are the, the issues of disagreement between you
14 and the US attorney?

15 KELLY MACNEAL: At this time..

16 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: So, sir with all due
17 respect I think like the conversations that, that we
18 are having with the US attorney's office are not
19 something that we're prepared to discuss publicly.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And I understand
21 that Mr. General Manager but if, if NYCHA's inability
22 to arrive at a resolution is creating a new level, a
23 bureaucratic review that is slowing down the capital
24 program can you tell us something... [cross-talk]

25 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: So... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 134

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: ...so that we know
3 what's creating these new sets of challenges to
4 NYCHA?

5 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: I, I would not say
6 that it's NYCHA's inability again there have been
7 conversations between the housing authority and the
8 US attorney's office, those conversations are
9 ongoing, we have not come to a final resolution,
10 right and, and I wouldn't say that it was... it's
11 because of NYCHA's inability... [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Do you have a, a
13 timeline for when you will come to a resolution?

14 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: We have not been
15 provided with a timeline, but we are hopeful that it
16 will happen shortly.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And I don't know
18 if my original question was answered but what exactly
19 does zero threshold mean?

20 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Again, it just means a
21 delay in HUDs reimbursement to NYCHA for monies that
22 we're spending on capital projects.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And do we know
24 what effect... [cross-talk]

25 KELLY MACNEAL: And... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 135

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: ...that's going to
3 have on the expenditure of capital dollars?

4 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: As, as long as we're
5 getting reimbursement in a timely fashion it should
6 have no effect at all.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And have you been
8 receiving reimbursement in a timely fashion?

9 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: So, the process is
10 relatively new, this is something that we've never
11 experienced before there are usually other actions
12 that are taken before HUD issues this, this mandate,
13 this directive so we're working out some of the, the
14 challenges but we're working closely with the HUD
15 regional office as they have additional requests
16 we're meeting those requests so again we were kind of
17 surprised when we received a letter just yesterday
18 that we thought that we had responded to their
19 request, we thought that this would be concluded
20 unfortunately it's not so we're still working on the...

21 KELLY MACNEAL: And in response to your
22 question, have we... our first manual submission we
23 have received the reimbursement, that you're your
24 question right, have we... [cross-talk]

25 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Yes... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 136

2 KELLY MACNEAL: Yes.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: But the... but the
4 ultimate impact of zero threshold remains the
5 question mark?

6 KELLY MACNEAL: The ultimate... [cross-
7 talk]

8 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: There's potential for
9 it to impact us.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Okay... [cross-
11 talk]

12 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: ...but we hope that
13 that's not the case.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Every five years
15 NYCHA is supposed to conduct a needs assessment,
16 right, in 2011 it was found that you had 17 billion
17 dollars' worth of capital needs, five years later,
18 2016 there was supposed to be a needs assessment, I'm
19 constantly told that it's coming but it never seems
20 to arrive so what's the... have you finalized the needs
21 assessment for NYCHA and if so what's the timeline
22 for making it known publicly?

23 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: So, it has not been
24 finalized and we hope to have that done shortly.

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 137

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Do we have a
3 sense of what the numbers are going to be?

4 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: I... we do not but I can
5 get back to you with that.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Okay. They... the...
7 obviously a few months ago we held a hearing on the
8 heating crisis in public housing and I expressed
9 concern about the housing authority's practice of
10 closing complaints without actually solving the
11 problem and I pointed out two examples; one is if
12 NYCHA repairs a boiler the housing authority has a
13 practice of closing all the work orders in that
14 building even though we know there could be causes of
15 leading... of heating loss beyond a boiler failure, it
16 could be related to insulation, to piping systems so
17 have you... have you revisited those practices, have
18 you changed your approach to closing compliant in
19 light of the hearing that we held two months ago?

20 CATHY PENNINGTON: Thank you for your
21 question and we have been very busy at NYCHA working
22 on kind of an end to end review with, with a big
23 focus on the customer service response so we are
24 trying to determine best, best practices that will
25 improve instances where as you described where we

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 138

2 have a whole development that has had an outage that
3 when we close those work orders and again we're,
4 we're talking with our IT folks and our planning
5 folks on how can we assure that every unit had
6 restored services. So, prior practice was we would
7 randomly visit some units, we did... we didn't have the
8 resources to visit every single unit so we're now
9 going to try to create a method by which the customer
10 can simply respond to our call back to let us know,
11 yes service restored, no I still have a problem and
12 that way we can isolate the smaller number of units
13 that may have some specific issue within their
14 building versus the entire development... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: But does it
16 continue to be the case that the repair of a boiler
17 will result in the closing of all the work orders in
18 a building?

19 CATHY PENNINGTON: The repair... at this...
20 [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: That if... that if...
22 my understanding is... [cross-talk]

23 CATHY PENNINGTON: So, once we restore
24 the heat... once the, the boiler is resumed to
25 services... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 139

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Right... [cross-
3 talk]

4 CATHY PENNINGTON: At this stage that is
5 still what the practice is but what we... [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And so, you're...
7 [cross-talk]

8 CATHY PENNINGTON: ...want... [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: ...not going to
10 reexamine that practice?

11 CATHY PENNINGTON: No, that... no, that's
12 what we're reexamining the way... the way we
13 communicate service restored is what we're going to
14 change, yes that's what we're revisiting.

15 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: So, and I would also...
16 [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Yes... [cross-talk]

18 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: ...like... so, on the
19 intake process we, we... I think we also need to do
20 better at collecting the information up front so if
21 the resident is calling about a building wide
22 condition, I think it's fair to close that condition,
23 that complaint after resolution, if its specific to
24 an apartment and, and we, we, we need to do better in
25 to try to get more information... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 140

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: But I guess...

3 [cross-talk]

4 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: ...from the residents...

5 [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: ...what I... what I
7 disagree with is we cannot equate necessarily equate
8 the repair of a boiler with a resolution of the
9 problem or a restoration of heat like what, what
10 NYCHA should do is once you repair the boiler you
11 should send out a, a call, a robocall asking
12 residents do you have heat and hot water and if those
13 residents say yes then you can close the work order..

14 [cross-talk]

15 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: No, but we, we... and in
16 fact do that.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: So, is that a...

18 [cross-talk]

19 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: You know... does it work
20 in every situation, it's something that we're looking
21 in, into because again we've heard complaints from
22 residents that the, the work ticket was closed..

23 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Okay... [cross-
24 talk]

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 141

2 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Right and that they
3 did not receive a robocall so we're looking into
4 that, but they should receive a robocall. I also just
5 want to point out too that and, and again maybe...
6 perhaps this is the use of the term but an outage to
7 me is a little bit different, my... call these service
8 disruptions and in fact when you look at the total
9 number that we responded to this past heat season 41
10 percent of the responses they were closed within 24
11 hours which means that we identified the source of...
12 [cross-talk]

13 CATHY PENNINGTON: 91 percent were closed
14 within... [cross-talk]

15 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: With... no, no, of all
16 the heat complaints that came in 41 percent of the,
17 the, the development wide outages were restored
18 within, within 24 hours meaning that we identified
19 the problem very quickly and we corrected it within
20 24 hours.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: So, if I
22 understand correctly NYCHA will repair the boiler
23 then send a robocall and if the resident confirms
24 there is a restoration of heat and hot water it's

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 142

2 only at that point that you will close the work
3 order, is that the new practice?

4 CATHY PENNINGTON: We, we haven't
5 designed it yet, that's what we're... [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: You haven't...
7 [cross-talk]

8 CATHY PENNINGTON: ...in... that... [cross-
9 talk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Okay... [cross-
11 talk]

12 CATHY PENNINGTON: ...what we're in the
13 planning stage on.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Okay...

15 CATHY PENNINGTON: So, that the... that the
16 resident will have an opportunity to confirm to your...
17 [cross-talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I will just say
19 it's been nearly three months since the last hearing,
20 it seemed straightforward, I'm not clear why it's
21 taking so long. One, one other issue that I pointed
22 out at the hearing was that NYCHA had a practice of
23 closing work orders without reviewing your own
24 sensors, so you might have sensors that will tell you
25 that an apartment has an adequate heat and hot water,

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 143

2 but you will nevertheless close those work orders, is
3 that a practice that you have reexamined?

4 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: So, if, if I can
5 first... so, with... again with respect to how... what we
6 refer to as an outage the housing authority provides
7 heat above what's required by law, right and in fact
8 given the, the type of construction of most of our
9 buildings these buildings do retain the residual heat
10 for quite some time even after there is a disruption
11 in service, you know how I am so I've been out to a
12 number of our developments where we had reported heat
13 outages and I went out there with my HPD issued
14 thermometer and took temperature readings and still
15 found temperatures above what the law requires so
16 when we report a, a disruption or a... an outage it
17 doesn't mean that the buildings are totally without
18 heat or that the inside temperatures have dropped
19 below the required heat temperatures and I think
20 that's important distinction to make, right and the
21 fact that again we're resolving 41 percent of these
22 within 24 hours, the building is not going to lose
23 its residual heat that quickly not within 24 hours,
24 that's the... first... with, with respect to the sensors,
25 they're helpful, right, but sensors also can provide

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 144

2 misleading or false information. If a resident is
3 using some type of auxiliary heat, right, in their
4 unit, if they have a, a space heater or if they turn
5 their ovens on which is not recommended the sensor
6 will give a false reading and it will indicate that
7 that apartment is warmer than... and, and so we need to
8 be cognizant of the fact... [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: But I'm talking
10 about the opposite case in which the sensor indicates
11 that the apartment has insufficient heat and hot
12 water... [cross-talk]

13 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: And... [cross-talk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: ...do you continue
15 to close work orders even though your sensors might
16 tell you that the apartment has inadequate heat and
17 hot water?

18 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: And I'm not quite sure
19 how many sensors we actually have and when they were
20 installed... [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Well it's only a
22 sub... a small subset of the public housing units,
23 right?

24 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Right.

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 145

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: But even for
3 those units are we closing work orders without
4 reviewing the sensors, it's a... it's a yes or no
5 question, I don't...

6 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Yeah, I don't believe
7 that we are, yeah, we'll have to get back to you.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Okay and I'll,
9 I'll end with these questions on, on lead safety,
10 what are the number of units that you've inspected,
11 where you've done inspections, remediation and
12 abatement thus far this year?

13 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: So, we have performed
14 approximately 9,000 visual assessments and of those
15 9,000 visual assessments... [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: This year alone?

17 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Within... [cross-talk]

18 CATHY PENNINGTON: Started... [cross-talk]

19 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: With... we started...
20 [cross-talk]

21 CATHY PENNINGTON: In the fall...

22 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: We started in the
23 fall, right, so we performed approximately 9,000
24 apartment visual inspections and of those visual

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 146

2 inspections it resulted in approximately 7,000
3 remediations.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And abatements as
5 well, I don't know if...

6 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: No, these are visual
7 assessments so there's no testing involved, right,
8 abatement would be upon testing.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Have you done any
10 abatements in those units or...

11 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: Within those units?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Yeah.

13 VITO MUSTUCIUOLO: These were... again the
14 visual assessments resulted in, in remediation. I'm,
15 I'm sure that, that we have done some abatements, but
16 I'll have to get back to you but again it wouldn't be
17 in connection with the 9,000 visual assessments.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I appreciate
19 your, your answers so... thank you Vito.

20 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you so
21 much, that actually concludes the questions from the
22 council and I just want to thank you so much for your
23 testimony and clearly we have a lot of follow up
24 subsequent to this hearing and I really hope that we
25 can work together collaboratively on a constant basis

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 147
2 before you roll out NGO throughout all the, the, the
3 developments and so with that thank you so much for
4 your testimony and I ask that the executives remain
5 to hear the testimony from the NYCHA residents as
6 well and we have to transition quickly because there
7 is an immigration hearing that's supposed to be held
8 in the chamber and we were trying to be conscious of
9 that as well as a one o'clock press conference on the
10 steps with EBC and Metro IAF related to senior
11 development so I would ask that Danny Barber, the
12 Chair of the Council of Presidents to proceed forward
13 as well as Reverend David Brawley from the East
14 Brooklyn Congregations and Metro IAF as well as Miss
15 Concepcion from East Brooklyn Congregations, Metro
16 IAF and Reverend Cruz Junior and Santiago Sanchez who
17 will... who will be translating for Reverend Cruz.
18 Thank you. Okay and just to identify NYCHA executives
19 who are remaining can you please just... thank you.
20 Thank you. First, we will hear from Danny Barber, the
21 Chair of the Council of Presidents and then we'll
22 hear from Reverend Brawley and then the rest of the
23 panel. We have two minutes on the clock but... because
24 I know that you're trying to get outside by eleven
25 o'clock. You can proceed.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 148

2 DANNY BARBER: Good morning, thank you
3 Madame Chair, to the fellow Council Members. I
4 submitted a testimony, I was going to read my
5 testimony, but the Council have it they can look it
6 over. I just wanted to respond to a, a couple of the
7 statements that were made. The General Manager spoke
8 of rent collections and not answering personal
9 questions when it regards to employees, this is
10 something frequent that we hear when we come to these
11 council hearings how NYCHA doesn't want to release
12 anything when it comes to their employees. This was a
13 hearing on property management, what we find out as
14 residents some of the tactics of property management
15 is the caretakers, the people who clean the buildings
16 are the ones who tend to put the notices of what you
17 owe in rent on your door. So, if this is public and
18 private information as it relates to my household why
19 is a caretaker, a low-level employee of the NYCHA
20 Housing Authority being trusted with personal
21 information about residents, that's one. Two, they
22 spoke about how NGO is working and how tickets are
23 supposed to be answered in 15 days. When this program
24 was rolled out under the old general manager, Mr.
25 Cecil House, Mr. Torres, Council Member Torres there

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 149

2 was... and to Councilwoman Ayala's question there was a
3 monitoring system where Mr. House had in place with
4 NGO at the time it was OPMOM where there was a report
5 card, where the resident association leader would
6 rate the service of the manager and the
7 superintendent with a report card. These are tactics
8 that we have gotten away from. Thank you for the
9 time.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Danny I have a, a
11 quick question... [cross-talk]

12 DANNY BARBER: Sure... [cross-talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: ...for you. So,
14 under, under the Governor's Executive Order, the
15 Mayor, the Speaker and the CCOP President yourself
16 are required to convene and select an emergency
17 manager over the next 60 days, I think we're near the
18 30 day point so can you brief us on what progress has
19 been made so far under that executive order?

20 DANNY BARBER: Now do you want the honest
21 answer sir?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I want you to lie
23 to me.

24 DANNY BARBER: Okay, so since you know
25 I'm not a liar I'm going to give you the honest

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 150

2 answer, the Mayor nor the City Council Speaker has
3 reached out to us as of yet, we've been reaching out
4 to them and we're waiting, we're waiting because with
5 the executive order it was to make things better
6 immediately for the residents of public housing. It
7 did away with the bureaucracy, it did away with the
8 procurement, the long procurement processes, it would
9 do away with the family, friends and favors stuff
10 like that but no one wants to answer the residents,
11 no one wants to sit down and hear what we have to say
12 so my last statement to your question... [cross-talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And that's it..
14 [cross-talk]

15 DANNY BARBER: ...the residents of public
16 housing are here to serve the city notice that we no
17 longer will accept crumbs, we are the largest voting
18 block and we will unite, we will gather, and we will
19 create our own party to put who we feel into office
20 that will work for the residents of public housing.
21 Thank you very much.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Thank you Danny.

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Reverend
24 Brawley.

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 151

2 DAVID BRAWLEY: Thank you so much Chair
3 Ampry-Samuel, to the council. I'm going to cede most
4 of my time to our leaders who live in public housing,
5 for so often their voices are muted and not heard but
6 before I do that I want to invite everyone to our
7 press conference which will take place in seven
8 minutes, 300 strong. The last time we were here we
9 were here with 6,000 people, we decided three to 400
10 would be enough for today. So, at this time I'm going
11 to ask members of our team if you would address this
12 committee.

13 SANTIAGO SANCHEZ: Good afternoon,
14 [Spanish dialogue]

15 GETULIO CRUZ: And for those... my name is
16 Reverend Getulio Cruz Junior... [cross-talk]
17 [off-mic dialogue]

18 GETULIO CRUZ: Sure, I'm sorry. I'm
19 Reverend Getulio Cruz Junior, I'm the Pastor of Monte
20 Sion Christian and leader in Metro IAF and we need to
21 go but I'm... brief translation, Miss Sanchez said that
22 in the last five years her bathroom has been infested
23 with leaks and mold three times what's more despite
24 the fact that it has been reported mold is still
25 covering her bathroom today and as you can see from

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 152

2 the pictures she showed this neglect creates very
3 serious problems and helps exacerbate, exacerbate...
4 makes asthma worse, thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And just state
6 your name really quick.

7 TITA CONCEPCION: I'm sorry?

8 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And you can
9 just state your name.

10 TITA CONCEPCION: Tita Concepcion.

11 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay.

12 TITA CONCEPCION: I'm a member of our
13 Lady of Presentation... Our Lady of... Our Lady of Mercy
14 Catholic Church in Brownsville and a longtime
15 resident of Breukelen Houses in Canarsie, I'm a
16 leader in East Brooklyn Churches. I'm here today
17 because I need Mayor De Blasio and our city council
18 to fix the entrance doors to my building, we need
19 stronger doors that will not open with a swift kick
20 or a pull, I don't want to fear for my safety anymore
21 or the safety, safety of my family or friends. Fear
22 takes over me every time I enter or exit my building
23 because I know there are strangers hanging out in the
24 building smoking, drinking and using the stairwells
25 as their elevators... I'm sorry, and their elevators as

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 153
2 the bathrooms. I need my doors fixed because I don't...
3 I don't want someone lurking in the halls waiting for
4 an opportunity to sexually assault my daughter again,
5 yes, again. A few months ago, my daughter was
6 sexually assaulted as she was returning to the
7 building with packages in her hand, she noticed a
8 strange man in the lobby, she adjusted her packages,
9 grabbed her keys in her hands and went to the door.
10 The man stepped out of the lobby, held the door open
11 for her, while entering the building she dropped a
12 package, as she bent down to pick it up the man stuck
13 his hand down her pants... I'm sorry, the man stuck his
14 hand down her pants, she fought him off and thank god
15 she wasn't... I'm sorry, she wasn't hurt further, okay.
16 She should not have had to have gone through this, if
17 we had stronger doors, locks and intercoms that
18 worked it would never have happened to her. He should
19 not have been in that lobby, okay. My daughter was
20 assaulted because Mayor De Blasio is too busy talking
21 about fixing housing, okay, talk is cheap Mr. Mayor
22 it's time for some action, okay. Last week my living
23 room was packed with neighbors who were equally angry
24 about the broken front doors, the lack of heat and
25 hot water for weeks, the power outages and the floods

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 154

2 and the rats. The rats have taken over my neighbor's
3 buildings, okay. Mr. Mayor, members of the city
4 council we're human beings not trash, we need your
5 leadership to fight for the 2.45 million... billion,
6 I'm sorry to start fixing public housing from top to
7 bottom. Thank you.

8 DANNY BARBER: And that's our testimony
9 Metro IAF, thank you so much for your time.

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you,
11 thank you Reverend Brawley and everyone. And we just
12 have to move quickly, we've just been joined by
13 Council Member Menchaca who's also a member of the
14 Committee but he's also the Chair of the Immigration
15 and, and they're in the chamber right after us and
16 they're hearing starts at one o'clock so we're just
17 going to transition quickly and Council Member
18 Menchaca did you want to say something?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I... all, all I
20 want to say is I want to just lift the leadership up
21 of our Chair for Public Housing Alicka Ampry-Samuel.
22 The testimony that we're hearing today is not only
23 important for us as New Yorkers but it's important,
24 important for us as, as, as we think about the future
25 of our city that future was in the words of the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 155
2 testimony of that young girl that experienced what
3 she experienced that is our future, that is what
4 we're talking about, that's why we're here and just
5 know that not only is members of the... of the
6 committee and the council but through the leadership
7 of, of Council Member and Chair Alicka Ampry-Samuel,
8 we're going to... we're going to move this forward in
9 some way and I'm here... I'm here to support her, thank
10 you.

11 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you. We
12 have with us Pia Horton from East Brooklyn
13 Congregations as well as Miss Ramirez, Ramirez from
14 Metro IAF, do you still want to testify or are you
15 going to go outside, Miss Horton and Miss Ramirez?
16 Alright, so next we'll hear from Lisa Kenner,
17 President of the Van Dyke Resident Association as
18 well as Mr. Victor Bach from Community Service
19 Society; Claudia Coger, Coger from Astoria Resident
20 Association; Willie Mae Lewis from Saint Nicholas
21 Houses; Audrey Clemmons, PS 139 Conversion.

22 [off-mic dialogue]

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, we'll
24 start with Miss Kenner and then Victor Bach and go
25 down the line and then we'll... we're asking for about

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 156

2 a... no more than one-and-a-half-minute clock, is that
3 okay? Thank you.

4 LISA KENNER: Good afternoon, my name is
5 Lisa Kenner, I am the President of Van Dyke Resident
6 Association and I've been a resident at Van Dyke for...
7 it'd be... Monday, it'd be 59 years, so I've seen the
8 good, the bad and the ugly. One thing I want to say
9 is I've been the President for 16 years and I have
10 seen six managers and this manager we have now and
11 that... and they know it, she's the worst, that lady
12 has made my life like hell but I refuse to give up
13 because nobody runs me, you know that's an old saying
14 in Brownsville, never ran and never will, no but when
15 you're trying to make sure people have a decent place
16 to live and you walk around and see things is not
17 working and you try to explain it too. See one thing
18 I know we're not... we don't live on the plantation and
19 we don't need overseers, we need people that
20 communicate as human beings and for the past three
21 years that this manager been here my life has been
22 hell. When you try to divide the residents and you
23 got more drama than the people that live there you
24 can't teach anybody anything. One thing about going...
25 having me going down to court twice for nonsense,

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 157
2 I've never been a bully, I never threatened anybody,
3 never harassed anybody but when... because I want to
4 see people live a decent life I got to go through the
5 wind and you know Miss Haywood I have come to you, I
6 wish Miss Pennington was here because I have wrote
7 you several e-mails... oh, you are here but you never
8 wrote me back, you never came to see me, I'm a human
9 being, I know I'm over my time but this has been
10 going on since January the 3rd and that... she came
11 January the 3rd, 2015 in the middle, you know,
12 February, February of 2015 sending people letters to
13 come down and pay rent some people only owe 50 cent,
14 you sending people... it cost more to put the stamp on
15 there to send that and then we never know the fine,
16 we are the... body, we never know the fine, she has her
17 own advisory board that meets at night, I'm still
18 trying to find out what happened to the 1.8 million
19 dollars that we sat at the table to get, what is the
20 breakdown, you know still haven't got that but I got
21 harassed, I've been the harassed, I have... I have
22 people calling my house at night, I have come to
23 your... I had called you and you still didn't do
24 nothing, you know I don't do that, I have called,
25 email, especially email because you know you got to

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 158
2 keep a paper... a paper trail with you all and Miss
3 Pennington never, never sat down and say Miss Kenner
4 how can I be of some service, I'm doing... this is
5 free, you all get paid, I don't get paid to be
6 aggravated but that's my home, I'm not going nowhere,
7 I'm going to die... I'm going to die in Van Dyke, so
8 they got to look decent. Look how long it took us to
9 get the benches, it took the Councilwoman to come
10 over and the Speaker of the House to come over to see
11 that the benches have been gone since November of
12 2017 after they did the concrete, she didn't care
13 about people standing up, the seniors having to wait
14 for Access-A-Ride or people coming home from work and
15 they got to climb up the three flights of stairs
16 because to me you show compassion if you only had put
17 one bench, don't tell me it's cold, if it was so cold
18 why you put concrete down anyway, the benches just
19 got down two Saturdays ago and I appreciate that. I
20 appreciate it so much people call me at nine o'clock
21 in the morning have me put my clothes on go over
22 there I had to sit on the bench with them because
23 nobody was sitting on the benches, you can't... and the
24 garbage can, the benches and the garbage can been in
25 the basement since 2016.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 159

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you Miss
3 Kenner, thank you. Thank you and we have an
4 announcement.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Again, thank
6 you to the Chair and this panel. We originally have a
7 hearing on immigration here at one o'clock, we are
8 moving the immigration hearing across the street to
9 250 Broadway to the 14th floor, we will begin our
10 hearing over there in ten minutes so if you want to
11 gather, gather your things we'll meet you over there.
12 The second thing I want to say is what's happening
13 right now is the power of the people, you have signed
14 up to speak today and I hope you can stay so that the
15 Chair can continue to listen to your voices, that is
16 what our work here in the council is all about so I'm
17 really happy to be working with the Chair to make
18 sure that all voices are heard. The topic at hand for
19 the one o'clock immigration hearing is asking
20 immigrant parents across the city to tell us what the
21 needs are for their kids who are zero to five, that's
22 also an important conversation, balancing these is
23 our work, responding to both of these things is our
24 work. So, I want to thank you for being here, be
25 patient, I know there's a long list and I applaud all

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 160

2 the work that you're doing here in this... before this
3 committee today as constituents of the city. For the
4 one o'clock, 250 Broadway, 14th floor we'll begin in
5 ten minutes, thank you so much Chair and let... and
6 let, let's... the speaking to power continue, thank
7 you.

8 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you
9 Member... Council Member Menchaca for your flexibility
10 and your support and for being able to do this, thank
11 you so much for your partnership... [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, Mr.
14 Victor Bach.

15 VICTOR BACH: Thank you, I'll be brief
16 and just summarize our written testimony. First, we
17 support the citywide expansion of the NGO and FlexOps
18 demonstrations. We think they've started to prove
19 themselves and with adequate training and changes in
20 labor practices that it would benefit all residents,
21 but we do think that certain critical technical
22 operations need to be centralized and those would
23 include elevator maintenance, it would include lead
24 paint inspections, it would include boiler inspection
25 and repair and any other functions that where you

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 161
2 have ensured compliance across the board uniformly
3 from development to development. We, we strongly
4 believe that... assertively that NYCHA residents should
5 be included in the city's 3-1-1 code enforcement
6 system. Any tenant... any tenant in a multiple dwelling
7 can call 3-1-1 in a private multiple dwelling and
8 have their complaint recorded, get assured a follow
9 up by HPD if necessary, an inspection and if a
10 violation is found that violation is recorded in the
11 HPD database. We think that NYCHA's conditions need
12 to be externally known and that resident access to 3-
13 1-1 like any other tenant in the city is an important
14 part of recording conditions in NYCHA developments.
15 Secondly to make NYCHA conditions more transparent we
16 believe that it... we... it's exemption from public
17 databases should be removed, NYCHA should have to
18 have its violations, it's conditions recorded, and
19 the databases held by HPD and the Department of
20 Buildings. Finally, we think that... since there will
21 be... it looks like there will be a resident oversight
22 body I think Danny Barber can talk more about that
23 but we, we think it deserves ongoing support. The
24 nine resident leaders on CCOP have only so much time
25 and energy and they bring different skills. We

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 162
2 recommend that the resident oversight entity be
3 provided with ongoing staff support, independent of
4 NYCHA to enable it to carry out its information
5 gathering and monitoring functions effectively and
6 maintain communications with external advocates and
7 stakeholders. Some portion of TPA funds might be set
8 aside for that purpose. Finally, we think that city
9 council should call for a detailed NYCHA plan for
10 reform of its property and housing management
11 function. Thank you very much.

12 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you.

13 AUDREY CLEMMONS: Hello everybody. My
14 name is Audrey Clemmons, I am the President of PS
15 139. I'm here to testify about my relationship with
16 my manager. I always had a good working relationship
17 with all the managers since I have taken over as
18 President but there are still many of the same
19 problems that plague us from the manager to manager.
20 Number one, none of them seemed to be able to resolve
21 the problem established in office, office with a
22 housing assistant in our building to take care of us
23 seniors. All managers have agreed that this is needed
24 and promise to set it up, but it hasn't happened yet.
25 We are part of Hamilton management and we as seniors

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 163
2 must go over to them and wait in their office for
3 help when many of us have difficulty. Two, adults and
4 small children are living in our apartments, we can
5 identify them but none of the managers seem to be
6 able to move them out, some of us seniors are
7 troubled with the families that are living there when
8 this is a senior only building. Three, all the
9 managers continue bringing in difficult cultures but
10 there is no interpretation, who are we... what are we
11 supposed to let... excuse me... how are we supposed to
12 let them know what is happening if we can't speak... if
13 they can't speak English? No one can interpret China,
14 Russia, India or any... is there anyone that can put it
15 in their language. We have lots of problems and no
16 managers seem to be able to help. Four, safety and
17 security are a big concern and we are working closely
18 with our councilman, Bill Perkin's office; Gale
19 Brewer, our Borough President's office. There are so
20 many people coming in and out of the basement that,
21 that don't belong here including homeless people. We
22 need better doors as someone can see who is coming in
23 and out, all the managers say that NYCHA doesn't have
24 money for cameras, but I understand that they have a
25 system that they can watch who comes in through

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 164

2 certain doors and we need all managers to install
3 this system for our safety. In conclusion, again my
4 relationship with my manager including my current
5 managers, Miss Row is very good, but she needs help
6 in getting things for our senior building. She right...
7 she right now is doing a very good job, but we are
8 going to remind her that we have a very cold winter
9 and we want to be prepared for the next winter, so we
10 need help now, she needs help now.

11 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you,
12 next.

13 CLAUDIA COGER: Good afternoon, my name
14 is Claudia Coger, I'm the Resident Association
15 President for Astoria Houses; Astoria, Queens. I'm
16 here to speak on our manager today but I also would
17 like to say yah and amen to most of the things that
18 I've heard this evening of neglect that's come to
19 public housing and it wasn't generated. I've been in
20 public housing for 62 years and it wasn't generated
21 over the past few months or the past few years,
22 alright, I've seen the, the changes from the time
23 that I came in to raise my family and those children
24 now or most of them are senior citizens but the whole
25 thing about it is I'm on a mission and some people

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 165
2 ask me sometimes why are you still here but I'm here
3 because I love people and because I love people my
4 mission is to bring quality of life to those as long
5 as I have breath but I wanted to let you know that
6 the manager at Astoria Houses right now, Miss Debra
7 Von Henan is one of the best people that I've met in
8 public housing in management. She has an open door
9 for everybody, she even gives up her personal time to
10 listen and to work things out. The, the thing that I
11 see that she needs more of is the actual
12 capabilities, the, the monies and the things that is
13 needed in order to supply what we need and that's
14 what's missing in public housing today, money is in
15 the wrong hands and the wrong pockets and that needs
16 to be worked on, that system needs to be worked on to
17 make sure that every dollar is given, accounted for
18 because we pay our rent for safety, for cleanliness
19 and for quality of life.

20 WILLIE MAE LEWIS: Good afternoon, my
21 name is Willie Mae Lewis, I'm a resident of St.
22 Nicholas Houses, I'm a former NYCHA board member, I'm
23 also.. I've also been a president at St. Nicholas
24 Houses for 27 years, I'm not that now. I'm here today
25 because we are part of the MAP program, the doors

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 166
2 they're not locked, the intercoms haven't worked
3 since they supposedly placed the new doors which I
4 was told that we were getting seven refurbished doors
5 and seven doors that was new, all of them looked like
6 they were refurbished to me. Because we have... still
7 have seniors although our development furnish... we
8 have 14 buildings, 1,526 units because we still have
9 a lot of seniors there, you know they're not being
10 properly monitored as far as repairs is concerned. I
11 just visited a senior the other day, I'm senior
12 myself she can't even raise her kitchen window
13 because of the garbage that has been thrown out and I
14 don't understand it because we have incinerators on
15 every floor, you know but it needs to be clean. I
16 went over to the office yesterday with another
17 resident to let them know there are certain areas
18 that needs to be cleaned, one is hers it definitely
19 needs to be cleaned because she may want to raise her
20 window this summer, we are going to be getting warm
21 weather soon. The next thing is the lobbies, see our
22 project is 67 years old, we need new lobbies. I
23 looked here on the NYCHA's thing about the property
24 management and all of that and I see three
25 developments have new lobbies, how long do we have to

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 167
2 wait, we have cracked floors in the lobbies, you
3 know, and I want to get... I wanted to say the manager
4 at last, the manager, we need a new one. We need a
5 new manager, I'm not here to, to power down or to
6 throw accusations but it is what it is. I get
7 complaints and I'm not even the president anymore,
8 but people know that I have a mouth and that I will
9 speak, they go over to the office, they make
10 complaints, they're talked to, they're talked down
11 like they're not even human beings, that's not
12 acceptable. Another thing that was brought up here
13 today was about having a maintenance worker or a
14 caretaker that lived in your... we used to have that,
15 we used to have caretakers that lived in the
16 building, that lived on the premises, that worked on
17 the premises, that they did their jobs and we didn't
18 have a problem now we don't have people that live
19 there, we don't have enough caretakers, we don't have
20 enough housing assistants, we only have two, we did
21 have a full amount. A lot of people said they left or
22 they were leaving because of managers now, you know I
23 know... I work for the board of education and you know
24 we all have disagreements from time to time but when
25 it comes to certain things like cleaning and what

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 168
2 have you that should not be a problem and it is...
3 seems to be a problem with the cleaning of the
4 buildings. We have residents that are mopping their
5 own floors, that's also unacceptable. We... I have a
6 lot of stuff here and I know I don't have but a, a
7 limited amount of time but there's a great deal
8 that's going on, we need more workers both in the
9 management office as well as on the ground, you
10 shouldn't have a caretaker taking care of two
11 buildings. We have 14 buildings in every development
12 there so you mean to tell me they got to take care
13 of... one person has to take care of 28 floors, I mean
14 like Miss Kenner say, we're not on a plantation these
15 days, they do have unions and there should be enough
16 people that they can hire before they hire them to
17 train them because we had one young lady and I said I
18 don't want to make you not lose to... have your job but
19 she came in my building she wet the floor and then
20 mop it, how you going to wet the floor in the middle
21 of the... in the lobby and then mop it, that's not
22 cleaning, we're supposed to be living in a safe,
23 clean environment. And one other thing I wanted to go
24 on, the cameras, they're just there for decoration
25 because management is not watching them because if

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 169
2 they were they would see a lot of stuff that's going
3 on in the... in the residents... in the buildings. The
4 last thing is we just had a, a... an election last
5 month, they... there were many violations, the 24CFR
6 was just ignored, we're waiting still for housing now
7 to give us because we want to recall on the election,
8 it's not that it... you be beaten by one vote or half a
9 vote, it's that you go by the rules and the
10 regulations of the CFR or 24 964 regulations, okay
11 and that's what they're not doing, okay. Now we have
12 TPA money and they, they claim that we could have
13 paid a third independent person to monitor the
14 election, what did they do they got two resident
15 association presidents that lived in Manhattan North
16 to monitor the election, we're not accepting that.
17 So, even if they don't want to recall we're going to
18 take this even further. I want to thank you all for,
19 for indulging me in this time because I could go on
20 and on and on but thank you so much and there are
21 some things that need to be addressed in St. Nicholas
22 Houses, okay?

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you Miss
24 Lewis and thank you so much for your testimony today
25 everyone and so next we'll have the panel with Audrey

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 170

2 Frazier; Nathaniel Green of Dyckman; Jacquelin
3 Frazier of Dyckman and Diana Blackwell of Fred
4 Samuel. Hello Miss Blackwell. Thank you so much and
5 we'll start with you.

6 DIANA BLACKWELL: Good afternoon, I have
7 two testimonies, I'm always doing something for
8 somebody. Okay, the first one is from Miss Bernadette
9 McNear, she's the President of Rangel Houses. She
10 says good afternoon, my name is Bernadette McNear,
11 I'm President of the Rangel Houses in Harlem. When I
12 was asked to speak I didn't know what to say but I'm...
13 but I said to myself just tell the truth. As
14 President of Rangel Houses I proud, proudly represent
15 our tenants and I had the opportunity to work with
16 three managers. I, I must say that all were
17 forthcoming, they were consistently delivered, direct
18 dialogue and I must respect that, many times my
19 inquiries may not get the answer I want but there was
20 an open, honest discussion. Do not misinterpret my
21 comments, Rangel Houses has issues with a lot of
22 common problems that many of the other developments
23 are faced with such as broken doors, heat and hot
24 water, dog poop, leaks but with the downsizing of
25 staff it is not helping our repairs and upkeep of

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 171
2 property. I believe that due to the resident
3 association and manager working together as co-
4 partners NYCHA can improve. Due to the manager and I
5 collaborating she and I or the super are invited to
6 attend our general meetings every other month, this
7 gives the opportunity to meet and hear directly from
8 the residents which they serve. Thank you. That's
9 resident... President of Rangel Houses. Okay. Okay,
10 good afternoon, my name is Diana Blackwell, I'm
11 President of Fred Samuel City. Before I say something
12 I would like to say my manager is here and I'm very
13 proud to have him sit here and I've already told him
14 I'm going to tell the truth but I... you know 15 years
15 of a marriage with him so... and like a marriage there
16 will be ups and downs but like my parent's marriage
17 that lasted 63 years until his death they learned to
18 work through everything and you end up finding out
19 it's not as bad as you thought. Now in 2009 I became
20 President of Fred Samuel City, Resident Association
21 which was a city development and in one of my first
22 conversations with my manager even before I started
23 the... my tenure as president Mr. Charles actually said
24 he didn't believe in the associations but in three
25 years from that conversation he not only believed but

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 172
2 has become our and my biggest supporter and friend,
3 this begins the story of my relationship with my
4 manager. As President I have an open-door policy and
5 many of the residents come in who aren't association
6 members just to vent. Some of the venting is about
7 the manager so I listen intently to hear what they're
8 expressing and from there I decide whether to speak
9 or write to him to make change or get understanding
10 of that particular situation. He always responds by
11 phone or in person. On issues regarding the upkeep of
12 our failing infrastructure he has been tentative to
13 complaints but without a superintendent and assistant
14 manager and other needed staff he basically works
15 alone, he is knowledgeable and has come.. has good
16 connections and usually gets the needed resources in
17 a timely manner. Still much is lacking which always
18 leads me to writing to ask for assistance from his
19 superiors, I'm almost finished. I hear criticism of
20 him... of him almost daily and I know that there's a
21 lot of room for improvement but if the residents will
22 work with the association no matter who is leading,
23 if they can approach him and present their argument
24 or problem and learn how to arrive to a workable
25 solution. Now having said this Mr. Charles knows that

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 173

2 I have no problem going outside of NYCHA to our local
3 legislators to get help when the solution is above
4 his pay grade, but my goal is to do whatever it takes
5 to raise our quality of life. To conclude I'll leave
6 this evaluation of the strength and weaknesses of
7 Fred Samuel's manager, Mr. Charles which is based on
8 the complaints that constantly come into my office
9 and are addressed to me personally yet keeps us with
10 a working relationship. His strength, his knowledge
11 is his knowledge of housing system and its
12 appendages. His weakness, his attitude and many of
13 the interactions with the residents but understand
14 this, sometimes he goes by the letter of the law
15 instead of the compassion of the situation. Thank
16 you.

17 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you.

18 Okay, thank you.

19 NATHANIEL GREEN: My name's Nathaniel
20 Green, I am the Dyckman Resident Association
21 President and the Vice Chair for Manhattan North
22 Council of Presidents. What can I say about Dyckman,
23 we are a FlexOp operation now, I will say that I have
24 one of the best managers going, I'm not saying that
25 because he's sitting right next to me, I'm saying

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 174
2 that from the bottom of my heart. She has worked with
3 us, we have formed committees within our
4 developments, I have more residents participating in
5 our general meetings that it's come to the point
6 where our residents cannot even get into the
7 building. The last meeting, we had we only had two
8 complaints in the whole development, most of our
9 repairs are taken care of right away. We've formed
10 committees that we meet with the manager once a
11 month, I meet with the residents at least once every
12 other month. We take the meetings to the residents in
13 the building. When they have complaints, or they have
14 repairs we have a committee that takes care of
15 repairs. We have committees on every level so when we
16 meet with the manager once a month all those things
17 are addressed to her, she takes care of it before we
18 meet the next... the following month. We work as a
19 complete family, the caretakers know everyone, if
20 there's a repair that has to be done in the building
21 that resident on that floor or that captain will
22 notify that resident or knock on the door and say the
23 caretaker is at your apartment, they will notify the
24 resident association, we will notify the management
25 that that resident's home now, you can go back and

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 175

2 get the repairs done. So, the majority of our repairs
3 are always taken care of. Really, we can say with the
4 heat problem, we don't have a heat problem, most of
5 our residents are saying it's too much heat in our
6 development. So, we work together like a family,
7 we're trying to get one more caretaker back Willy
8 that left us, I need him back, my residents are very
9 upset about it. So, we need to keep our family
10 together and that's all I can say.

11 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you.

12 JACQUELINE FRAZIER: Good afternoon...

13 [cross-talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Can you turn
15 your mic on, thanks.

16 JACQUELINE FRAZIER: Okay, good afternoon
17 everyone. My name is Jacqueline Frazier and I'm the
18 Property Manager of Dyckman Houses. I've been with
19 the Housing Authority for 35 years and I can truly
20 say that working with NYCHA is not only a career to
21 me it's a huge part of my life. From the moment that
22 I walk onto the grounds in the morning I'm looking
23 up, down, sideways making sure that the lawns are,
24 are being cleaned, I'm making sure the buildings are
25 being cleaned, the doors are locking, the elevators

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 176
2 are working, I mean there's a whole long list that
3 there's heat and hot water, I'm speaking to my staff
4 daily, all day, what's going on and that's... to me
5 that's key to providing the services that the
6 residents of NYCHA deserve, you have to communicate
7 with your staff, we're all a team here. As Mr. Green
8 said we work very closely together in collaboration
9 with each other and I have an open-door policy as
10 well but like I said the, the, the main important
11 thing is that you have that communication and that
12 honest dialogue with each other about what needs to
13 be done, what needs to be improved. Every day I'm
14 walking the grounds, I'm trying to identify something
15 that I didn't see yesterday or something I can
16 improve on for the residents because my motto is if
17 it's not good enough for me it's not good enough for
18 my residents. So, I hope that we can continue our
19 relationship and just provide what the residents
20 deserve; clean, quality, safe housing. Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you for
22 your testimony, is Dyck... I know Dyckman is part of
23 the FlexOp program but are... [cross-talk]

24 JACQUELINE FRAZIER: Yes, it is... [cross-
25 talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 177

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...you also NGO?

3 JACQUELINE FRAZIER: Not yet.

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay...

5 JACQUELINE FRAZIER: Not yet but we're
6 getting there.

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, thank
8 you for your testimony...

9 JACQUELINE FRAZIER: You're welcome.

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: I'm calling
11 Audrey Frazier again; Debra White; Patricia Tate and
12 Ronald Topping. Ronald Topping; Patricia Tate; Debra
13 White and Audrey Frazier. Oh, Mr. Drungo, Mr. Drungo,
14 Miss... is Miss Carmen still here? Oh, okay, Miss
15 Torres; Ronald Chaulo, okay.

16 [off-mic dialogue]

17 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, thank
18 you and we'll start with Miss Torres.

19 AIXA TORRES: Good afternoon, my name is
20 Aixa Torres and I'm the President of Alfred E. Smith
21 Resident Association and we are now incorporated and
22 I'm here to talk about management. I can sincerely
23 talk about good management and I can talk about bad
24 management. I know have a good manager, I have a good
25 superintendent, I jokingly tell their supervisors all

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 178
2 the time you can give them a raise or a promotion,
3 but they have to stay here. One of the things that
4 needs to happen I think to have a good working
5 relationship is that there has to be respect but also
6 the resident association, we have committees. Last
7 weekend, I have a grievance committee, so residents
8 came down, manager and the assistant super came, and
9 we did a walk through the development and we actually
10 had a visitor from... our Council Woman who walked with
11 us to check the apartments, to check the stairwells,
12 to check what needed to get done. It's about not a
13 got you but how can we improve and so the
14 relationship has been a working one, definitely a
15 work in progress. We have constantly, you know
16 challenges, we send emails and we do have issues in
17 Smith with the heating, with the water and things
18 would have probably been worse but we... at least we
19 have a superintendent and a manager who listen to our
20 concerns. They also come to our resident association
21 meetings, they also come to our committee meetings
22 where it's a more close group versus an agenda where
23 they can detail like when there are real issues and I
24 know my time is up but just very quick I'll give you
25 an example. We have... our pipes in Smith all of them

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 179
2 need to be changed but we have some lines that are
3 worse than others so by having these committees and
4 having these conversations they can at least address
5 those issues but until... like our gas pipes that were
6 totally changed in, in the entire development until
7 all the pipes, the water pipes and sewage pipes are
8 changed in Smith we will continue to have mildew
9 where... leaks because, you know Alfred E. Smith is 65
10 years old like me, I had to have a valve replacement
11 so old Smith needs all the pipes changed, you know
12 but I am really happy with this management that we
13 have. I wasn't happy with the previous one but I am
14 happy and don't get me wrong it's not always roses
15 and kisses, we have our moments but at least there's
16 a working relationship in terms of how our residents
17 are dealt because the one thing I do not tolerate
18 especially from my seniors is them being disrespected
19 or not treated properly or them not being listened to
20 that I will not tolerate from anybody and so we work
21 through whatever needs to be done and I think
22 dialogue and yes we're part of the Gen program, the,
23 the... and that seems to work. Footnote and then I...
24 I'll end with this, a lot of the stuff that's being
25 done now is decentralizing NYCHA, the worst thing

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 180

2 that ever happened to NYCHA was all the
3 centralization and the 7-1-8 number because it's too
4 global. At least when you have it at the management
5 level then you have a face and there's a
6 communication so that you can resolve the issues and
7 the problems. Thank you.

8 MR. DRUNGO: Hello, I'm going to make
9 this really short. I want to first say that Mr.
10 Scotland is one of the best workers in NYCHA, this
11 man is phenomenal, he's, he's unbelievable. Any time
12 of the night and also if I'm going say that then
13 I'll... I, I should also give respect to Mr. Phil
14 Colodrillo as well because I be calling him on the
15 weekend sometimes bothering him and his family too
16 so... and I want to say that... his name is Rene, he's
17 one of the phenomenal workers in Brooklyn Houses. So,
18 with that being said Mr. Phil and Mr. Hormon to my
19 understanding I found out today, which I've kind of
20 figured out that there's, now listen to me clearly
21 because I don't know if you guys noticed, I have
22 several texts there's one maintenance worker that has
23 eight buildings, those are low rises, there's another
24 caretaker that has four seven story buildings and 35
25 people in each building, there's no way on god's

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 181
2 green earth that they're going to be able to
3 facilitate us to not having that much of garbage
4 being left over, those are one of the main reasons
5 why the garbage and I continuously have to do these
6 new persons. I really want to go away, I want to get
7 on the news and start talking about the good things
8 that NYCHAs doing which I'm talking about right now
9 and of course you all... I... you guys don't know, I, I
10 fell in one of the buildings, you know I could have
11 hurt myself pretty bad, thank god I'm alright, the
12 speedy recovery of Mr. Scotland the next day every
13 single staircase was done so I'm asking NYCHA
14 seriously, seriously speaking, okay, get rid of these
15 two associations that you've been supporting since
16 2014, okay, let's get back to the original official
17 Brooklyn Tenants Association, okay, not the Brooklyn
18 Resident Association and let's get us some 15 more
19 workers, Mr. Sub, I had a meeting with him and Mr.
20 Scotland they told me Mr. Drungo [sp?], believe me,
21 you will not... you will not have 35 to, to 40 calls a
22 day, these people call me 24 hours a day, you know
23 they tell me come fix the window, what do we mean
24 come fix your window, I got 20 texts right here just
25 today setting up in here, yes, I don't mind helping

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 182
2 these people out, I don't get paid for it but it's
3 not about... it's, it's just in my heart, I just... I'm
4 just asking you all do me the greatest favor, do the
5 people the greatest favor get us 15 more workers,
6 give me ten, I know you gave me workers before Brian,
7 what's his name... the, the one... the one that retired,
8 Clark, Clark who came out to Brooklyn Houses, yeah...
9 no, so I'm asking you all please give us the 15
10 workers, one caretaker cannot do eight buildings in a
11 quick enough of time, okay. Every single day there's
12 garbage being left over, this has absolutely zero to
13 do with the leadership of Mr. Scotland, it has to... it
14 has something to do with we do not have enough
15 workers to facilitate 30 buildings and what not so
16 please give us what we need. I'm asking you all very
17 nicely, I'm being very nice about it, I'm being very
18 passionate, please can you give us 15 workers and
19 I'm... I hate to say this, and I'll go away because
20 that's what we need right now. I've gotten out there
21 myself and helped, Mr. Scotland will tell you, I've
22 gotten out there myself, you know, and I'm disabled
23 and when I... so please give us the 15 workers and give
24 Mr. Scotland a recommendation... I mean... I mean a
25 certificate and the... and the other young man Rene

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 183

2 because they do fine work in Brooklyn Houses and no
3 disrespect to Miss Halls [sp?] and Miss Brown just as
4 well. I want to... and I thank you very much.

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you Mr.
6 Drungo.

7 RONALD CHAULO: Good afternoon members,
8 thank you very much for inviting me. My name is
9 Ronald Chaulo [sp?], a property manager of Carey
10 Haber in site 1B, 1256 units. I think... I'm very, very
11 pleased with the, the job we're doing into
12 development. Recently I, I can honestly say during
13 the past year we've made some, some... two very big
14 improvements, one is with work ticket reduction
15 especially in carpentry, painting and, and
16 plastering. We've, we've reduced the workloads
17 greatly, we reduced plastering jobs from... I think it
18 was... plastering... [clears throat] excuse me... carpentry
19 jobs from 154 and 90 painting jobs, 160 to 63 and
20 plastering jobs 146 to 38 so I'm very, very pleased
21 with that. I'm also pleased with, with meeting some
22 indicators, our annual reviews are consistently over
23 95 percent last year during every quarter in 2017 and
24 our rent collection I was... is about 94 and this past
25 month it was over 100, 100 percent so I'm, I'm, I'm

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 184
2 kind of pleased... I have a very, very good
3 relationship with my... with my tenants and my tenant
4 association presidents and I work very, very closely
5 with the supervisory staff. We, we frequently meet,
6 we, we discuss the, the, the indicators, we discuss
7 the tenant needs because, you know one of my goals is
8 to, you know to meet the tenants needs to make
9 repairs in a timely fashion and at the same time meet
10 the authority's goals and you know and to do that,
11 you know it's not easy but I think we've succeeded
12 pretty well, I think our indicators are pretty good
13 and I think that... you know I get along pretty well
14 with the tenant leaders, I have very... I have monthly
15 meetings, we are a Sandy related development which,
16 which does create some problems, but we are working
17 with the... with the tenants to meet with the
18 contractors on a monthly basis.

19 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you, are
20 you an NGO?

21 RONALD CHAULO: No.

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay. Alright,
23 thank you.

24 CARMEN QUINONES: Good afternoon. First
25 of all, I want to say to Miss Samuels thank you for

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 185
2 taking the time to not only hear the residents but
3 you're on the ground and I'm very proud of you,
4 you've been there for the tenants. I come here to say
5 that there are still a lot of problems, we have
6 rallied, we have done everything that we can, we have
7 brought all this to the forefront, but nothing still
8 is being done. All this hooray, hooray is all good
9 and I'm sorry about that but there's still... there's
10 still a lot to be done, nothing is being done. Just
11 this weekend... I have a two-month-old, this is my
12 number 19th grandchild and we had no hot water for
13 heat on the weekend and I must say this guy, his name
14 is Dennis Abalio [sp?] but he works for NYCHA, I call
15 him and let me tell you he gets on the case, so I
16 want to give him a kudos, also Theresa give her
17 kudos. I'm very excited about Vito, I think Vito is
18 going to do great things and I just want to you know
19 be partners in what we're... what we're about to do. I
20 think he has his finger on the pulse, I'm watching
21 him, I love the way he expressed himself today even
22 though NYCHA never has answers for us, you know and
23 that has to get better, the transparency. In my
24 development which is Douglass Houses my main thing is
25 the lighting, I come... last night I came home from a

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 186
2 convention and the lighting is so bad, it's so dark
3 that anyone could hit, hit over the head, the
4 lighting in Douglass is very bad, needs to be looked
5 at, please attend to that before somebody gets hurt.
6 I've talked to management, my manager, I love him
7 Mulcock he's, he's on target, my supervisor is on
8 target, but my caretakers are being beaten up. I have
9 one caretaker which is a woman and my building alone
10 is 20 floors, this woman cleans and cleans and cleans
11 but 20 floors are just too much for one person. I
12 have a lot of women caretakers; a lot of our men
13 caretakers are very lazy. We have to really look at
14 the supervisors that supervise the caretakers, most
15 of them have been on this job maybe too long, 20, 25
16 years so they're set on their ways and they're lazy,
17 need to look at that. There are broken windows, there
18 are... in my lobbies that need to be addressed, 868
19 Amsterdam Avenue I have a flood in that building
20 every day, every day, this building is driving me
21 crazy. I get 20 to 25 calls. I am a hands-on person,
22 I go to these developments, I go to these apartments
23 and I see what's happening, that building needs to
24 really be looked at, the... it's just too much. The
25 management spends more time in 868 than the rest of

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 187
2 the 18 buildings that I have. People are literally,
3 literally suffering in 868, I don't know what else to
4 do, I need management, I need 250, I need all of you
5 all to look at this building, it's an only... this
6 building is like my worst, it's my nightmare, every
7 day. I could be sitting here... I'm sitting here right
8 now, I know there's a flood and, and this is just
9 unacceptable. We... like I said we've rallied, we've
10 done all that we can, we've even brought money to you
11 guys with our rallies, but nothing is being addressed
12 at this moment. To tell a resident to call the 7-0-7
13 number is, is just a slap in the face, that does not
14 work and I'm going to say again we need an oversight
15 committee of residents to oversee what is going on
16 with NYCHA, we really need an oversight committee of
17 residents and I'm telling you now I want to be on
18 that committee. So, if NYCHA's going to make a
19 committee you better look at Carmen Quinones because
20 I want to sit on that committee because it is very
21 important that we know exactly what's going on, where
22 you're spending your money and how you're spending
23 your money. Right now, I have a... in, in, in Douglass
24 alone we had... we had a budget of 254,000 dollars,
25 they gave me a new budget that budget came out to

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 188
2 89,000 dollars, where is that money? We need to
3 investigate, I know I'm not the only development that
4 they took money from so if you look at three... 300 and
5 maybe 300 residents Associations look at how much
6 funding out their money, TPA monies that they took.
7 Where is that money, I need to know because if I had
8 a, a budget of 254 that means that money came out of
9 every apartment from my development so if you're
10 taking the money from my development I need to know
11 where that money went because it's supposed to stay
12 in Douglass Houses. Right now, I have no way and I've
13 asked, where is that money now add that 320 300 times
14 in developments if they took that money now add that
15 up, that's billions of dollars we're talking about
16 that they took in TPA funds and nobody has an answer,
17 that needs to be looked at Miss Samuels please, look
18 at the TPA funding, they took that money, and nobody
19 knows where that money is. I was sitting on CCOP as a
20 treasurer never got a treasurer's report, where's
21 that money. Those... and, and CCOP when you say that
22 that... when you are on CCOP they get money from every
23 development, where is that money, where is it going.
24 If you're taking my money I want to know where it's
25 going right now, I don't do TPA funds, I've never

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 189

2 signed that contract, I don't like that contract and
3 I haven't signed it so therefore I don't use my TPA
4 funds, but they still take 20 percent, why are you
5 taking 20 percent when you ain't doing nothing for me
6 or for my residents. So, I really, really need
7 someone to look into the TPA funding that they have
8 taken away from these NYCHA developments. I want to
9 know where that money went because that money belongs
10 to my residents, so I want to know where is the
11 money?

12 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you so
13 much... [cross-talk]

14 CARMEN QUINONES: Thank you... [cross-talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...for your
16 testimony and we do have as part of the series of
17 hearings that are coming up TPA funds and elections
18 will be one of those hearings to have a conversation...
19 a deeper conversation about the use of TPA funds as
20 well as how to assist in conducting the elections.

21 CARMEN QUINONES: Just find out where
22 that money went because that's a lot of money...
23 [cross-talk]

24 MR. DRUNGO: And we... and I, I definitely
25 want to know about that because then maybe we can get

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 190

2 our card changed out of the wrong association name,
3 you know because it's a totally different EIN number.

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, so while
5 I'll, I'll make sure that we... [cross-talk]

6 MR. DRUNGO: Yes... [cross-talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...follow up
8 and... [cross-talk]

9 MR. DRUNGO: Yeah... [cross-talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...include you
11 in those... [cross-talk]

12 MR. DRUNGO: This is not our card...
13 [cross-talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...conversations
15 but... [cross-talk]

16 MR. DRUNGO: ...yeah, it was never... [cross-
17 talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...thank you...
19 [cross-talk]

20 MR. DRUNGO: ...thank... though thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you so
22 much... [cross-talk]

23 CARMEN QUINONES: I appreciate your time
24 and your... oh my god and your work.

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 191

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you...

3 [cross-talk]

4 CARMEN QUINONES: You have a fan... [cross-
5 talk]

6 MR. DRUNGO: You're highly appreciated,
7 this is family.

8 CARMEN QUINONES: Thank you so much.

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: I'm a fan of
10 your glasses.

11 AIXA TORRES: Please look into my
12 lighting in Douglass please, my lighting is very
13 important, it's too dark...

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: That's,
15 that's... I think we have two more, I don't see Mr.
16 Bowman here, Mr. Reggie Bowman and Zaqual.

17 CARMEN QUINONES: This is Dennis you all...
18 this is Dennis.

19 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Hello Dennis.

20 CARMEN QUINONES: He... every time I call
21 even on the weekends, you've got yourself a winner
22 right here... thank you...

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Dually noted,
24 everyone loves Dennis. So, that concludes our hearing
25 on the oversight of NYCHA's property management and I

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1 192

2 look forward to the follow up and the ongoing
3 conversation and partnership between the council and
4 the New York City Housing Authority. Thank you so
5 much everyone.

6 CARMEN QUINONES: Thank you.

7 [gavel]

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date

May 24, 2018