

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON RULES, PRIVILEGES AND ELECTIONS

----- X

August 21, 2014
Start: 10:47 a.m.
Recess: 11:01 a.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: BRAD S. LANDER
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Inez E. Dickens
Daniel R. Garodnick
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Margaret S. Chin
Jumaane D. Williams
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Mark Levine
Vincent M. Ignizio
Melissa Mark-Viverito

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

2 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: We're ready or...
3 we're gonna go ahead and start.

4 [background comments]

5 MALE VOICE: We'll sit over here.

6 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Great. Outstanding.
7 Alright, good morning.

8 [gavel]

9 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: We rollin'? Thank
10 you. This meeting of the Committee on Rules,
11 Privileges and Elections is now resuming from recess;
12 I am New York City Council Member Brad Lander, Chair
13 of the Committee. Before we begin I would like to
14 introduce the other members of the Committee who are
15 here -- Inez Dickens of Manhattan, Dan Garodnick of
16 Manhattan, Vinny Ignizio, the Minority Leader from
17 Staten Island, other members of the Committee --
18 Ydanis Rodriguez and Margaret Chin from Manhattan and
19 we'll also joined this morning by Council Members
20 David Greenfield and Ben Kallos, and some other
21 members will be coming in along the way. And I also
22 want to acknowledge Counsel to the Committee, Jason
23 Otano [sp?], thank you, and the good work of the
24 Council's investigative staff team -- Chuck Davis,
25 the Director of Investigations and Diandra [sp?]

2 Johnson and Diana Arriaga [sp?], who've done a great
3 work preparing these extensive briefing materials for
4 us.

5 In a letter dated July 18, 2014, Mayor
6 Bill de Blasio formerly submitted four names to the
7 Council for the Council's advice and consent, which
8 consists of individuals the Mayor nominated for
9 appointment to various boards and commissions. The
10 Mayor submitted Margery Perlmutter's name for the
11 Council's advice and consent concerning her
12 nomination for appointment to New York City Board of
13 Standards and Appeals or BSA, the Mayor submitted
14 John Gustafsson and Adi Shamir Baron's names for the
15 Council's advice and consent concerning their
16 nomination for appointment to the New York City
17 Landmarks Preservation Commission, the LPC. And
18 finally, the Mayor submitted Jacques Jiha's name for
19 the Council's advice and consent concerning his
20 nomination for appointment to the New York City Taxi
21 and Limousine Commission, the TLC.

22 On Tuesday, August 12th, 2014, Margery
23 Perlmutter, John Gustafsson, Adi Shamir Baron and
24 Jacques Jiha appeared before the Committee on Rules,
25 Privileges and Elections and provided testimony and

2 fielded extensive questioning from the Committee; we
3 had a very good dialogue on some of the big issues
4 especially facing New York City around landmarks and
5 landmarking, but also had good dialogue with Mr. Jiha
6 and Miss Perlmutter in the Board of Standards and
7 Appeals as well.

8 Today this Committee will vote on whether
9 Council should give its advice and consent for the
10 appointment of these candidates and I'll just clarify
11 a couple of things about their terms and which seats
12 they're filling so that we have it in the record.
13 Margery Perlmutter, a New York County resident, is
14 appointed to the BSA; she would fill the remainder of
15 the six-year term that was held by Christopher
16 Collins and will subsequently be designated as BSA
17 Chair for the remainder of that six-year term,
18 expiring on September 1, 2015. If John Gustafsson
19 and Adi Shamir Baron are appointed to the LPC, they
20 would each serve the remainder of a three-year term.
21 John Gustafsson, a resident of Staten Island, would
22 succeed Pablo Vengoechea and serve the remainder of
23 the three-term expiring June 28th, 2015. Adi Shamir
24 Baron, a resident of Manhattan, would succeed Joan
25 Gerner and serve the remainder of a three-year term

2 expiring on June 28th, 2016. If Jacques Jiha, a
3 resident of Queens is appointed to the New York City
4 Taxi and Limousine Commission, he would succeed Iris
5 Weinshall and serve the remainder of a seven-year
6 term expiring January 31st, 2017.

7 I wanna add one note; we had a couple of
8 the chairs, we had Chair Kallos with us because a lot
9 of the issues around Board of Standards and Appeals
10 come before... are overseen by, excuse me, the
11 Committee on Government Operations. We had tried to
12 make it so that Chair Greenfield of the Land Use
13 Committee would be able to be there, but the hearing
14 was moved and as a result, Chair Greenfield was in
15 Israel at the time and not able to join us; he had
16 conversations individually with all four of these
17 members; out of those conversations he added some
18 additional questioning of Adi Shamir Baron, who in
19 her prehearing disclosure to the Council had not
20 identified a specific individual who had nominated or
21 sort of suggested her. When we followed up with her,
22 she indicated that while she doesn't know who
23 specifically nominated her or moved her nomination
24 forward, she had a lot of... she was excited to be
25 serving in some way in the administration and spoke

2 to quite a number of people, including David Bur...
3 people that she's known from her work at the Van Alen
4 Institute and working on preservation and
5 architectural and design issues in New York City,
6 David Burney, former Commissioner of DDC, Carl
7 Weisbrod, Leslie Koch from Governors Island Trust,
8 Alan Fishman, Sherida Paulsen, another former LPC
9 member and the chair actually before Bob Tierney, and
10 Laurie Price, the Battery Park City Authority member
11 or chair at some point, and so she wanted to make
12 sure that we identified that for the record and she
13 wasn't looking to have -- in the interest of full
14 disclosure.

15 So that is my opening statement; if there
16 are members who have statements to make before we
17 proceed to a vote, the floor is open. Alright, very
18 good, seeing none, we will now move the vote; we're
19 coupling the vote on all four messages concerning
20 M 0085 regarding Margery Perlmutter, M 0086 regarding
21 Adi Shamir Baron, M 0087 regarding John Gustafsson,
22 along with message M 0088 regarding Jacques Jiha and
23 with that I think can ask the Committee Counsel or
24 Clerk to call the roll. Great, thank you.

1 COMMITTEE ON RULES, PRIVILEGES AND ELECTIONS 8

2 KEVIN PENN: Kevin Penn [sp?], Committee
3 Clerk, roll call on the Committee on Rules,
4 Privileges and Elections, M 0085, 0086, 0087; 0088.
5 Council Member Lander.

6 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: I vote aye on all.

7 KEVIN PENN: Dickens.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye on all.

9 KEVIN PENN: Garodnick.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

11 KEVIN PENN: Rodriguez.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

13 KEVIN PENN: Chin.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye on all.

15 KEVIN PENN: Levine.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye on all.

17 KEVIN PENN: Ignizio.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Yes.

19 KEVIN PENN: By a vote of 7 in the
20 affirmative, 0 in the negative, no abstentions the
21 items have been adopted, members please sign the
22 committee report.

23 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: We'll hold the vote
24 open for 15 or 20 minutes to let other Rules
25 Committee members come and I'll stick around until

2 they do and we can close the meeting out then. So
3 thank you to all the members.

4 [background comments]

5 [pause]

6 KEVIN PENN: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I vote aye.

8 KEVIN PENN: Vote stands at 8 in the
9 affirmative. Williams.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: May I be
11 excused to explain my vote?

12 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Of course.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: So I'm gonna
14 vote aye on all with the exception of Jacques Jiha.
15 I'm still torn between... I know he can really do the
16 job and actually has really experience that is shown
17 to be independent, but I'm still a little concerned
18 about some of the issues I brought up before, so
19 right now I'm gonna abstain on that one and vote aye
20 on all the rest.

21 [pause]

22 KEVIN PENN: Espinal.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.

24 KEVIN PENN: Final vote in the Committee
25 on Rules, Privileges and Elections, 10 in the

2 affirmative, 0 in the negative, no abstentions with
3 the except of M 0088, which is adopted by a vote of 9
4 in the affirmative, 1 in the negative and no
5 abstentions.

6 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you very much,
7 this meeting of the Committee on Rules, Privileges
8 and Elections is adjourned.

9 [gavel]

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date August 22, 2014