

**City Council Consumer Affairs Committee  
Public Hearing - March 12, 2010**

**Elizabeth Forel**  
New York, NY 10025  
coalition@banhdc.org

My name is Elizabeth Forel and I am president of the **Coalition to Ban Horse-Drawn Carriages**. Our organization represents thousands of New Yorkers and tourists and more than 50,000 people from New York City and over 55 countries who have signed our petition to close down the horse-drawn carriage industry in NYC because of humane and public safety issues. Carriage horses do not belong in a congested city like New York and there is nothing that can be done to make this industry more humane or safe.

We support Intro 92, the bill to ban the industry in its entirety because it meticulously and humanely addresses what will happen to the horses. We would only support Intro 86 if it did the same. As it stands this bill – and Intro 35 - continue to put horses at risk to be sold at auction. We also have questions about the length of phase out and exactly where the cars will work .

The real reason for Intro 35 is to provide the drivers a raise (not to help the horses) – all while they over charge on the street and charge exorbitant amounts on their web site with impunity. They continue to get away with fraud. And the authorities do not care. Everything else is window dressing.

The new recommendation for stall size is too small by half according to the NYS Horse Health Assurance Program part of AG and Markets, is designed to promote equine health, care, and welfare through the use of certain “best management practices” or standards.

They recommend stalls to be 12 x 12 feet for mid sized horses and 14 x 14 feet for the larger draft breeds. Yet Intro 35 only asks for 64 s.f..

Horses must be allowed to lie down comfortably and stretch out with their legs fully extended.

Horses need daily turnout or pasture time. A five week vacation yearly just does not cut it. This is a critical need recommended by experts.

Intro 35 both calls out for furloughs or vacation for the horses 5 weeks a year – but daily turnout or pasture time – a critical need - is recommended by experts. There is no way that NYC’s stables can provide this for the horses to both relax physically and interact with one another, as social herd animals need to do. Horses are not machines. They need time to run, buck, roll and play, to scratch themselves, stretch and engage in mutual grooming, which is a great stress reducer.

Bottom line is that there is no way a horse-drawn carriage industry can exist humanely in NYC. These horses live an existence that is survivable, but not certainly not humane. It is time to end it.