

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

Jointly with

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

And

COMMITTEE ON FIRE AND
EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT

----- X

June 1, 2026

Start: 10:06 a.m.

Recess: 5:21 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Linda Lee
Chairperson

Oswald J. Feliz
Chairperson

Joann Ariola
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Shaun Abreu
Shirley Aldebol
Alexa Avilés
Selvena N. Brooks-Powers

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

James F. Gennaro
Crystal Hudson
Virginia Maloney
Christopher Marte
Darlene Mealy
Frank Morano
Mercedes Narcisse
Lincoln Restler
Justin E. Sanchez
Nantasha M. Williams
Phil Wong
Chris Banks
Elsie Encarnacion
Jennifer Gutiérrez
Ty Hankerson
Kamillah Hanks
Sandy Nurse
Carmen N. De La Rosa
Simcha Felder
Vickie Paladino
Pierina Ana Sanchez
Lynn C. Schulman

Jessica Tisch
NYPD Police Commissioner

Tania Kinsella
NYPD First Deputy Commissioner

Michael Gerber
NYPD Deputy Commissioner of Legal Matters

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Kristine Ryan
NYPD Deputy Commissioner of Management and Budget

Alex Crohn
NYPD Deputy Commissioner of Strategic Initiatives

Michael LiPetri
NYPD Chief of Department

Rachael Kosak
NYPD Inspector at Domestic Violence Unit

Olufunmilola Obe
NYPD Chief

Lillian Bonsignore
FDNY Commissioner

Daniel Flynn
FDNY First Deputy Commissioner

John Esposito
FDNY Chief of Department

Paul Miano
EMS Chief

Lizette Christoff
FDNY Deputy Commissioner of Management and Budget

Kevin Woods
FDNY Chief of Fire Operations

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Thomas Currao

FDNY Chief of Fire Prevention

Nafeesah Noonan

FDNY Assistant Commissioner of Workforce
Development

Paul DeRocchis

FDNY Assistant Commissioner for Facilities

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 6

3 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good morning and
4 welcome to the New York City Council Committee on
5 Finance with the Committee on Public Safety and Fire
6 and Emergency. Please place your phone on silent mode
7 or vibrate. Do not approach the dais at any time
8 during this hearing. Chair, we are ready to begin.

9 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Great. Happy Monday
10 morning, everyone. Good morning and welcome to the
11 5th day of our FY 27 executive budget hearings. I'm
12 Council Member Linda Lee, and today we will begin
13 with the New York Police Department, followed by New
14 York City Fire Department. I'm pleased to be joined
15 by Speaker Julie Menin and my colleague, Chair of the
16 Committee on Public Safety, Councilmember Oswald
17 Feliz. Today we have been joined by Council Member
18 Wong, Council Member Marte, Council Member Cabán,
19 Council Member Morano, and I think that's it for now.
20 So welcome, Commissioner Jessica Tisch and your team.
21 Thank you to all for joining us today to answer our
questions. Before I go any further, I'm going to
invite Speaker Mennin to share her opening remarks.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 7

3 SPEAKER MENIN: Thank you so much. First
4 of all, I want to thank you, Chair Lee, for
5 conducting all of these budget hearings, and I want
6 to thank our Public Safety Chair, Chair Feliz, for
7 your oversight of the Committee on Public Safety. And
8 welcome, Commissioner Tisch, and everyone who is on
9 your team who's here. So to keep New Yorkers safe,
10 the NYPD has a planned budget of \$6.6 billion that
11 supports 35,379 uniform and 13,386 civilian personnel
12 in fiscal year 2027. Today, we want to hear much more
13 detail about whether and how the executive budget
14 gives the Police Department the resources it needs to
15 continue its efforts under your leadership. The
16 Department has overseen a recent period of
17 significant decline in both murders and shootings in
18 the city, which we are very pleased to see, but there
19 are still some troubling increases in other major
20 felony crime categories, like felony assaults hitting
21 a 25-year high, as well as increases in reported
rapes. Reported hate crimes have also been
increasing. The proposed executive budget included
new funding for the Department as well as transfers
of funding from existing departments to create the

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 8

3 Office of Community Safety. I'm interested in hearing
4 what, if any, programs are being shifted from NYPD's
5 purview to the new OCS, and if there are any changes
6 to NYPD's community affairs work in anticipation of
7 the new office's creation. The council is also
8 interested to hear how decisions about resources and
9 staffing impact crime levels, particularly with
10 recent NYPD announcements about the summer surge, the
11 division of the Bronx into two patrol boroughs, and
12 the introduction of 12-hour shifts for a majority of
13 officers starting July 1st. As always, recruitment
14 and retention of police officers is also a prime
15 concern. These issues are important to drill down on
16 because, of course, the ability to proactively
17 respond to the city's public safety needs is
18 determined in large part by the department's budget
19 and the decisions on how to allocate resources. So we
20 look forward to a very productive hearing, and we
21 want to thank you once again, for being here and for
your commitment to our city. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON LEE: Great. Thank you,
Speaker. On May 12th, 2026, the administration
released the executive financial plan for FY26 to

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 9
3 FY30 with a proposed FY27 budget of \$124.7 billion.
4 The New York Police Department's proposed FY27
5 budget, as the Speaker mentioned, of \$6.59 billion
6 represents 5.3 percent of the administration's
7 proposed FY '27 budget in the executive plan, and
8 this is a decrease of \$110.9 million, or 1.7 percent,
9 from the \$6.7 billion originally budgeted in the FY27
10 preliminary plan. This decrease results from several
11 actions, mostly from uniform and civilian PS
12 accruals, vacancy reductions, and vehicle
13 capitalization. As of April 26th, the NYPD's
14 headcount was approximately 1,500 less than their
15 FY26 budgeted headcount. In the council's preliminary
16 budget response, we called on the admin to add units
17 of appropriation for greater transparency into NYPD
18 spending. In addition, we call on the administration
19 and NYPD to utilize asset forfeiture dollars for
20 eligible costs that expand your investigative
21 resources before calling on city tax levy dollars.
Although additional units of appropriation were not
added to the executive plan, we hope the adopted
budget will include them, and we look forward to
exploring how asset forfeiture can be used in the

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 10

3 future. And I now want to turn it over to my Co-chair
4 for this hearing, Council Member Chair Feliz, for his
5 opening statement.

6 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: Thank you, Chair Lee.

7 Good morning, everyone. I'm Councilmember Oswald
8 Feliz, Chair of the Committee on Public Safety. I
9 would like to welcome everyone to the fiscal year
10 2027 executive budget hearing. And I want to thank
11 Speaker Menin and Chair Lee for joining us today.

12 Today we'll discuss the fiscal 2027 executive budget
13 for the New York City Police Department to admit— to
14 understand the administration's budget proposals for
15 a department that plays a crucial role in public
16 safety. I'm interested in learning about the changes
17 in the NYPD's \$6.59 billion budget and discussing
18 issues related to headcount, overtime, state subway
19 funding, school safety agents and crossing guards,
20 technology to deter crime such as the use of drones,
21 and much more. I would also like to explore the
Department's plans to ensure fan safety for big
upcoming events like the World Cup and the NBA
Finals. On the NYPD, we are thankful for the work and
the sacrifices that police officers make every day to

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 11

3 keep New Yorkers safe. Public safety, as we know, is
4 a shared responsibility. We achieve it with good
5 schools, good jobs, and opportunity. Police officers
6 play an important role in this issue. They help
7 ensure that residents can engage in these activities—
8 work, school, and opportunity— without having to
9 worry about their safety. We're thankful for that.
10 Their dedication to this city does not go unnoticed.
11 Yesterday, for example, I saw a video of police
12 officers in the Bronx in the 48th Precinct running
13 towards two individuals who had just engaged in gun
14 violence. Police officers who ran towards danger and
15 used technology such as drones to quickly apprehend
16 them. That incident serves as an example of how a
17 strong police presence and technology, such as
18 drones, can ensure that there's fast accountability,
19 accountability that helps deter crime. We also saw
20 that same courage earlier this year when police
21 officers ran towards an ignited homemade explosive
that was thrown to harm others at a protest. They
risked their own lives without hesitation to keep
others safe. Our communities are thankful for these
police officers, and we're also better off because of

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 12

3 their hard work and sacrifices. There are many
4 important budget actions in this plan, and we hope to
5 better understand them and the impact that they'll
6 have on public safety. I look forward to productive
7 conversations on what's going well, for example,
8 shootings and murders being at record lows. We also
9 look forward to discussing the areas that need
10 attention, including the skyrocketing cost related to
11 overtime, skyrocketing costs that are still going as
12 high as almost \$1 billion, or specifically \$955
13 million projected this fiscal year, according to a
14 recent article by Politico. But of course, we'll hear
15 the official numbers from the NYPD soon. I also want
16 to thank our Public Safety Committee staff for their
17 hard work, our financial analysts Owen Kotowski
18 [sp?] and Casey Lajszky [sp?], Policy Analyst Chad
19 Benjamin, Committee Counsel Jeremy Whiteman and Josh
20 Kingsley. I also want to thank my staff, my Chief of
21 Staff Esperanza Diaz [sp?], and my Legislative
Director, and many others who have joined today. And
I would also like to welcome the NYPD leadership
team. Welcome, Commissioner and team. We look forward

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 13
3 to conversations today. I'm going to pass it back to
4 Chair Lee now.

5 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. Before we
6 get started, wanted to take a moment to thank the
7 entire Council Finance Division, especially Jack
8 Storey [sp?] and Owen Kotowski for today's hearing,
9 and of course our amazing Committee Counsel Brian
10 Sarfo [sp?] and senior advisor, Athena Tse [sp?].
11 And as a reminder, for this year's budget hearing,
12 we will take public testimony for all the agencies
13 on Wednesday, June 10th, beginning at 9:30. So
14 Wednesday, June 10th, 9:30 AM, please sign up for
15 public testimony. It's going to be a long, fun day.
16 So, please join us. And now I will turn it over to
17 Committee Counsel to swear in the witnesses.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Good morning. Do you
19 affirm to tell the truth and nothing but the truth
20 before the council members? Commissioner Tish?

21 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I do.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: First Deputy
23 Commissioner Kinsella?

24 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA: I do.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 14

3 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Deputy Commissioner
4 Gerber?

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: I do.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Deputy Commissioner
7 Ryan?

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: I do.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Commissioner Crohn.

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CROHN: I do.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And Chief LiPetri?
12 You may begin.

13 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Good morning, Speaker
14 Menin, Chair Feliz, Chair Lee, and members of the
15 City Council Committees on Public Safety and Finance.
16 I am Jessica Tisch, Commissioner of the New York City
17 Police Department. I am joined at the table today by
18 First Deputy Commissioner Tania Kinsella, Chief of
19 Department Mike LiPetri, Deputy Commissioner of
20 Management and Budget Kristine Ryan, Deputy
21 Commissioner of Legal Matters Michael Gerber, and
Deputy Commissioner for Strategic Initiatives Alex
Crohn, as well as all other members of my executive
staff seated here behind us. Thank you for the
opportunity to testify today on the NYPD's Fiscal

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 15

3 Year 2027 Executive Budget. When I appeared before
4 this council earlier this year, I said very clearly
5 that the NYPD was focused on delivering results,
6 driving down crime, restoring public confidence,
7 strengthening accountability, and making this
8 department more effective in every part of its work.
9 Today, we can show real progress. The seeds that we
10 planted in 2025 have taken root. I feel like the
11 proud mother of 35,000 members of the New York City
12 Police Department. So allow me a moment to brag about
13 their fine work. For the first five months of the
14 year, shooting incidents, shooting victims, and
15 homicides are all at record lows. The same is true
16 for the month of May for both shooting incidents and
17 shooting victims. And burglaries in New York City are
18 at their second lowest levels ever. Now, I am a
19 data-driven person, so here is some more of it.
20 Through the end of our last CompStat report on May
21 25th, major crime is down six percent citywide.
Murders are down 25 percent. Shooting incidents are
down eight percent and shooting victims are down 10
percent. So far this year, NYPD officers have taken
nearly 2,000 guns off of our streets. Robbery is down

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 16

3 11 percent. Burglaries are down 19 percent. Grand
4 larceny is down nearly five percent. Auto theft is
5 down 11 percent, and retail theft is down more than
6 19 percent. And that progress is evident across the
7 city. Retail theft is down nearly 30 percent in
8 Brooklyn South, 26 percent in Queens North, 14
9 percent in Manhattan South, 14 percent in Brooklyn
10 North, three percent in the Bronx, and 10 percent in
11 Queens South. In public housing, New York City is
12 experiencing its safest start to the year on record,
13 with major crime down there 10 percent. Murders in
14 public housing are down 43 percent. Shooting
15 incidents are down 24 percent. Shooting victims are
16 down 30 percent. Robberies are down 24 percent. And
17 burglaries are down 19 percent. In the transit
18 system, major crime is slightly below last year's
19 level, and last year was already the safest year in
20 the subway outside of the pandemic era since 2009.
21 And unprovoked misdemeanor assaults in transit,
importantly, are down 26 percent this year. In our
school zones, school crime complaints have dropped 15
percent compared to last year. And school arrests
have decreased 4.8 percent compared to last year. And

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 17

3 in our parks, major crime is down 20 percent, with 95
4 percent of parks recording no major crime. Hate
5 crimes in the city are down 5.4 percent, while
6 arrests are up eight percent. And nowhere is our
7 precision strategy having a clearer impact than in
8 the borough of the Bronx, which is leading the city
9 in crime reductions. In the Bronx, major crime is
10 down 11 percent. Murders are down 10 percent.

11 Shooting incidents are down seven percent, and
12 shooting victims are down eight percent. Gun arrests
13 in the Bronx increased 23 percent since last year.

14 Auto theft in the Bronx is down nearly 28 percent.

15 And the progress is not limited to crime reductions.

16 After experiencing a hiring crisis, we are also

17 seeing a resurgence in policing as a profession in

18 New York City. The Department outpaced uniform

19 attrition in calendar year 2025 with 4,115 hires

20 compared to 3,357 separations. And we are continuing

21 to outpace attrition year to date in 2026 with 1,084

hires compared to 896 separations. Actual attrition

is down 4.7 percent this year compared to last year.

We're also putting more officers where New Yorkers

need them most. As of April 30th, patrol strength,

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 18

3 including precincts and field training units, is up
4 5.9 percent compared to the same point last year. And
5 year-to-date in fiscal year 2026, answering delays at
6 the 911 call center are down 84 percent compared to
7 the same period last year. Our overtime management
8 discipline is also producing measurable results. In
9 calendar year 2025, overtime spending decreased 12.4
10 percent, or \$143.6 million lower than in calendar
11 year 2024. And in the current fiscal year, overtime
12 spending decreased 10 percent, \$83.8 million lower
13 than the previous fiscal year. That is the progress
14 that we are seeing. Lower crime, stronger operations,
15 tighter management, and a department that is
16 increasingly aligned around performance,
17 accountability, and public trust. That is the overall
18 picture. But numbers alone do not tell the full story
19 of what it takes to manage the NYPD. In March, When I
20 appeared before you, I addressed several issues in
21 detail, including hate crimes, our newly formed
units, record hiring numbers, the Bronx Borough
split, our new in-service training model, immigration
enforcement, and federal funding. I will not rehash
each of those topics today in my testimony in the

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 19

3 interest of time, but my team and I are prepared to
4 answer any questions that you may have on those
5 important topics. However, before we do so, I want to
6 address two areas that warrant specific attention.

7 First is our review of narcotics operations, and then
8 the extraordinary operational demands facing the NYPD
9 this summer. So first, our narcotics review. Our cops
10 are asked to do an impossible and dangerous job. They
11 are called into situations that are messy and

12 complicated and fraught with emotion regularly
13 outside of their control. As Police Commissioner, I
14 am proud of the work that our cops are doing. The
15 vast majority of the men and women of the NYPD carry
16 out this work professionally, lawfully, and under
17 extraordinarily difficult circumstances. Officers are
18 asked to make fast decisions in unpredictable
19 situations while following detailed legal standards
20 and department procedures. Sometimes those situations
21 require the use of force. When they do,- there will
be scrutiny, there will be criticism, and there
should be serious review of those incidents. And my
position has been consistent. When officers act
within the law and consistent with department policy,

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 20

3 they will have my full support. When they don't, like
4 what happened during a recent incident involving our
5 Brooklyn narcotics team, there will be consequences.
6 In that case, the officers involved were immediately
7 placed on modified duty and they were stripped of
8 their guns and their shields. At the same time,
9 maintaining public trust requires us to confront
10 problems directly when we fall short of our
11 standards. That incident raised serious concerns
12 about supervision, about compliance and adherence to
13 department procedures. As a result, we made sweeping
14 personnel changes within Narcotics. More broadly, we
15 launched a full review of Narcotics operations across
16 this department. That 90-day review includes
17 policies, procedures, equipment, compliance systems,
18 and supervisory oversight, because accountability
19 cannot be situational. It has to be built into the
20 structure of the department itself. There will be
21 critique, there will be accountability, and there
will be changes. Next, I want to turn to the summer
ahead, because the next few months will place
extraordinary demands on this department. And with
this year marking the 25th anniversary of September

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 21

3 11th, we are all reminded of reality that the NYPD
4 knows better than most, that New York City is not
5 only a global hub, it is a global target. What begins
6 overseas often finds its way here, and that truth
7 shapes how we staff, how we train, how we deploy, and
8 how we build partnerships well beyond city limits. I
9 began my career building out the NYPD's
10 counterterrorism capabilities. And in my 18 years in
11 government, I have not seen a threat environment
12 quite like this one, where multiple vectors are all
13 active at the same time and where developments abroad
14 can have immediate consequences here at home. Last
15 year alone, NYPD investigations led to more than 100
16 arrests connected to foreign terrorist organizations,
17 domestic extremists, lone actors, and other serious
18 threats. Those cases spanned eight foreign countries
19 and nine U.S. states. And we saw that global threat
20 strike close to home just weeks ago when the NYPD and
21 our federal partners helped disrupt an alleged terror
plot targeting a Manhattan synagogue. The defendant,
a commander for Kata'ib Hezbollah based and
apprehended abroad, was allegedly connected to
approximately 18 attacks and attempted attacks across

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 22

3 Europe and Canada since hostilities began in Iran on
4 February 28th. This includes explosives detonated
5 outside synagogues and Jewish Jewish schools, arson
6 attacks targeting Jewish institutions, and the
7 stabbing of Jewish victims in London, one of them an
8 American citizen. He allegedly tried to bring that
9 campaign here to New York City, sending identifying
10 information about a Manhattan synagogue to someone
11 that he believed would help carry out an attack
12 involving arson or explosives, but he was actually
13 communicating with an undercover law enforcement
14 officer. The attack never happened, because the
15 threat was identified, monitored, and controlled
16 through the extraordinary work of the FBI's Joint
17 Terrorism Task Force and the men and women of the New
18 York City Police Department. We saw it again in March
19 when two men came to Manhattan with improvised
20 explosive devices at a protest on the Upper East Side
21 of Gracie Mansion. They lit and threw those devices
near a crowd with the apparent intent to harm
innocent people. NYPD officers ran toward that
threat, arrested them at the scene, and helped
prevent a far more serious attack. Those cases are

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 23

3 part of a broader threat environment. As conflict
4 involving Iran continues to reverberate across the
5 region, and as the world continues to deal with the
6 aftermath of October 7th, tensions remain high. We
7 have already seen those tensions translate into
8 violence, including here in the United States,
9 carried out by individuals acting quickly and with
10 limited coordination. And as rhetoric from state
11 actors, proxy groups, and online networks escalates,
12 it has the potential to drive action. That reality
13 matters here in New York City, and it matters
14 especially as we prepare for an unprecedented series
15 of major and overlapping events this summer: the
16 World Cup, Sail 250, the NBA Finals, and the 250th
17 anniversary of our country. Any one of those events
18 on its own would be a major operation in New City.
19 Taken together, they place extraordinary demands on
20 the New York City Police Department. That's why we
21 have been preparing aggressively. The NYPD will
deploy thousands of officers each day across the city
to secure these events. That demand will be
especially intense from July 1st through July 7th,
when several of these events will overlap and the

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 24

3 operational footprint will be at its highest. During
4 this time, our officers will be working 12-hour tours
5 to accommodate operational needs, and we are
6 temporarily reassigning hundreds of officers from
7 administrative roles back into the field to support
8 summer deployments. This uniquely busy period will
9 lead to an increase in overtime spend. However, the
10 increase does not change our overtime management plan
11 or our priority to ensure the safety of all New
12 Yorkers while being a responsible fiscal steward. And
13 all of that comes on top of the daily-- the full daily
14 workload of the NYPD. We do not stop answering 911
15 calls because there is a major event. We do not stop
16 investigating shootings and robberies and burglaries
17 or other cases. We do not stop patrolling
18 neighborhoods, subways, or public housing. That is
19 the reality of policing in New York City in a summer
20 like this. The extraordinary and the everyday have to
21 be handled at the same time, and this department is
preparing to do both. Now, turning to the mayor's
Executive Budget and its impact on the NYPD in the
coming fiscal year. In totality, the NYPD's fiscal
year 2027 expense budget is \$6.59 billion, the vast

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 25

3 majority of which, or 91 percent, is allocated for
4 personnel costs. The remaining nine percent is
5 dedicated to non-personnel costs, which include costs
6 for technology that provides officers with immediate
7 access to critical safety equipment, tools, and
8 applications. As part of the executive budget, \$38
9 million was added to fiscal year 27 and annually in
10 the baseline to support the Department's new enhanced
11 in-service training program to ensure critical
12 training is provided regularly and consistently
13 across key areas. Funding of \$2.8 million was added
14 in FY 27 and \$17.2 million added in the baseline to
15 enable the Department to upgrade to taser 10. This
16 upgrade will allow for more precision and improved
17 effectiveness when deploying this less-than-lethal
18 device. In addition to the operating budget, the
19 department's 10-year capital budget is \$1.86 billion
20 for fiscal years 26 through 35. For the first time,
21 the capital budget now includes funding for police
emergency response vehicles. Thank God. This is the
result of a critical change to state local finance
law, including in the state budget— included in the
state budget to allow for the capitalization of

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 26

3 emergency response vehicles, both marked and
4 unmarked. Capitalization allows police emergency
5 response vehicle fleet costs to be spread over their
6 full useful life, a five-year period, avoiding a
7 single-year budget impact. Furthermore,
8 capitalization shields the purchase of police
9 emergency response vehicles, which are critical for
10 public safety, from the impacts of expense budget
11 cuts, freeing up limited expense funds to be used for
12 other needs. NYPD, like all agencies, was asked to
13 identify savings as part of the executive budget. The
14 savings plan for the department for the executive
15 budget included \$65 million in savings in FY 26, \$184
16 million in savings for FY 27, and approximately \$80
17 million in savings annually in the baseline. These
18 savings were achieved as a result of city-funded
19 overtime reductions, uniform and civilian accruals,
20 vehicle capitalization, IT license capitalization,
21 and telecommunications savings. The savings included
civilian vacancy reductions as a result of vacancy
reduction targets that were issued by OMB. As a
result of these targets, the Department's civilian
budgeted headcount was cut by 517 positions. The

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 27

3 civilian budgeted headcount reduction is comprised of
4 a cut of 67 police communication technician
5 vacancies, 264 school safety agent vacancies, and 186
6 non-safety civilian vacancies across numerous other
7 civilian titles. Annually, the department receives on
8 average just over \$192 million in federal funding,
9 the majority of which is from the Department of
10 Homeland Security. This year's federal Homeland
11 Security grant funding has been cut by 40 percent
12 from federal fiscal year 2024 levels, with the NYPD
13 anticipated to receive only \$53 million. In addition,
14 as a result of new terms and conditions placed on
15 several uncertain federal grants, particularly
16 related to civil immigration enforcement, there are
17 numerous grants for which the department either
18 didn't receive funding or was advised by the law
19 department that we would be unable to comply, and
20 therefore no applications were submitted.

21 Specifically, the NYPD did not receive any FY25 port
security funds despite the department receiving funds
in prior years and submitting an application for
\$6.56 million. There were 15 additional federal
grants that the NYPD had to forego based on the

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 28

3 required certification language. The maximum
4 potential award amounts ranged from \$200,000 to \$6.25
5 million. We cannot overstate the gravity of this. It
6 is not bureaucratic inconvenience. It is a direct
7 threat to the NYPD's ability to maintain and enhance
8 critical counterterrorism intelligence operations in
9 New York City, the most visible terror target in the
10 United States. People are alive today because of
11 these grants. We must never lose sight of that. The
12 time to act is now, and I will not stop pressing this
13 issue until the federal government restores the
14 funding and the resources that we need to keep New
15 Yorkers safe. The through line of this testimony is
16 simple: the NYPD is delivering results and we are
17 building the capacity to sustain them. Crime is down
18 across the city. Violence is falling. Public housing,
19 transit, schools in the Bronx are all seeing enormous
20 progress. At the same time, we are strengthening
21 training and improving accountability, managing
overtime more effectively, hiring more officers,
modernizing our tools, and preparing for a threat
environment unlike anything the city has faced in
years. That work requires a budget that reflects the

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 29

3 full weight of what this department is being asked to
4 do. The men and women of the NYPD carry that
5 responsibility every day on patrol, in our subways,
6 in our schools, at protests, at major events, and
7 counterterrorism operations, and in every
8 neighborhood. We are proud of the progress that we've
9 made, but progress has to be protected and sustained.
10 So thank you for the opportunity to testify today. My
11 staff and I look forward to answering any questions
12 you may have.

13 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Great, thank you,
14 Commissioner. I'm going to pass on to Speaker Menin.

15 SPEAKER MENIN: Great, thank you so much,
16 Commissioner, for your testimony. And I know we've
17 got a number of different questions, so I look
18 forward to the dialogue on this. So first of all,
19 NYPD's current actual uniform headcount of 34,497 is
20 1.5 percent less than the budgeted headcount of
21 35,025. Since the last time you appeared before us
for the budget hearing, it's clear that the
Department has made progress in filling vacancies and
hiring new officers, and we commend you for that. How
do you think about the connection between the

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 30
3 department staffing level and the progress NYPD has
4 made to drive down murders and shootings?

5 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So first, just some-
6 the background on the headcount of the Department.
7 Actually, in this budget, the NYPD has received 580
8 new police officer positions, bringing our budgeted
9 headcount up to 35,555. And so that is something to
10 be celebrated, and that is something that we
11 appreciate deeply, especially in a time of general
12 need to- need to cut. And I will also say we have a
13 hiring plan this year that should get us to our
14 budgeted headcount of 35,555 by the end of last- by
15 the end of this year. So last year was our most
16 aggressive year in hiring on record, and we are
17 keeping our foot on the gas this year, and we plan to
18 do a significant amount of hiring. Last year we
19 actually ended the year with 800 more police officers
20 than we had over the previous three years. So, point
21 is, the size of the department has been growing over
the past year and will continue to grow this year
meaningfully. And that is a very good thing for all
New Yorkers because, to answer your specific
question, I- the number of police officers we have is

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 31

3 directly related to our progress driving down
4 shooting incidents and shooting victims in this city.
5 Shootings are one crime that you can really deploy
6 for. We know where the vast majority of shootings in
7 New York City occur. We know what times of day they
8 occur at. And so our plan, the reason we have been
9 able to drive down shootings so far, is we deploy
10 officers in those neighborhoods, on those streets, at
11 those times. And that plan has worked to, you know,
12 with tremendous historic success. So most of the
13 officers who are working on those streets in our
14 zones, we call them, are actually the new officers
15 that we hired last year. They spend their first 18
16 months, in the Department learning those
17 neighborhoods, learning those streets, learning
18 police work, and they have done an extraordinary job
19 driving shootings down.

20 SPEAKER MENIN: Okay, so we've seen the
21 work on that note that the department is doing to
decrease shootings in the city, including getting
guns off the street and the corresponding drop in
murders. However, there's also been a troubling
increase in other major felony crime categories like

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 32

3 felony assaults hitting a 25-year high. As mentioned
4 before, other major felony crimes are also above
5 pre-pandemic levels. Last October, when you created
6 the Domestic Violence Unit, the department stated
7 domestic violence has remained a consistent driver of
8 overall felony assaults accounting for nearly 40
9 percent of these crimes citywide. So with the
10 increased funding and creation of the new Domestic
11 Violence Unit, have you seen progress in driving down
12 the concerning rates of felony assaults that are
13 domestic incidents? And to that end, what has worked
14 and what hasn't worked?

15 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So just, uh, just to
16 level set here, as I mentioned in my testimony, we
17 have seen extraordinary crime declines declines
18 against- in most crime categories in New York City,
19 over the past two years, but particularly this year.
20 You are correct that rape is one area where we have
21 seen that continue to go up, and we can discuss the
reasons for that. Felony assault, as of the last
CompStat report, is basically flat compared to last
year, but you are correct that that is an area where
we have not seen the same types of crime declines as

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 33

3 we have seen, for example, with shootings and
4 burglaries and robberies and grand larceny. So the
5 increase in felony assaults, if you go back, let's
6 say, the last six years, because that's when it's
7 really- that's the period where it's really exploded,
8 has been driven by three main things. The first, as
9 you mentioned, is domestic violence. The second is
10 assaults on police officers, and the third is
11 assaults on other public employees, for example, MTA
12 workers. Attacks on other public employees are up 200
13 percent in that time. Attacks on police officers are
14 up 100 percent in that time. And attacks on- I'm
15 sorry, and DV is up- Chief, is it 100 percent in that
16 time? Sorry, attacks- DV is up 50 percent in that
17 time. So those are the three main categories we're
18 seeing huge increases in felony assaults over the
19 past six years. For DV specifically, to address what
20 we were seeing, last year, at the end of the last
21 year, the NYPD did a major reorganization of our
domestic violence operations, basically to streamline
things. We know that domestic violence is a
recidivist crime, and it's horrifying to be the
victim of crime in your home, in your personal space.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 34

3 And so by streamlining things, we hoped— we had a
4 number of goals, but among them, to create a
5 victim-centered approach where we weren't having
6 multiple different officers asking victims the same
7 questions, streamlining the experience for victims
8 and hoping that we can do a better job working with
9 victims to actually deliver consequences for
10 offenders. I am confident that that reorganization
11 was the right thing to do. The other big change that
12 occurred in the department as part of this DV
13 reorganization is we created a special dedicated DV
14 warrants squad for DV misdemeanors, where we have
15 teams of people whose only job it is every day to go
16 out and find offenders wanted for DV misdemeanors.
17 So, the hope is through all of this to drive
18 consequences for DV crimes and in that way bring the
19 level of DV down.

20 SPEAKER MENIN: Okay. Moving on to hate
21 crimes. One concern I have is that hate crimes have
jumped this quarter from 128 from the first quarter
of 2025 to 148 over the first quarter of 2026. And
CompStat shows the increase as well. So what do you
account for the increase in hate crimes?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 35

3 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Let me give you the
4 numbers, more recent numbers for hate crimes. This is
5 as of the end of last month, so it doesn't include
6 May. We'll report on May tomorrow. So as of April
7 30th, all hate crimes citywide are down 5.4 percent
8 this this year. Hate crimes against Jews or
9 antisemitic hate crimes, represent 56 percent of the
10 total. Antisemitic hate crimes are down this year 8.4
11 percent, again, as of the end of April. In addition
12 to that, and I think importantly, enforcement of hate
13 crimes is up in New York City. So arrests for hate
14 crimes in New York City this year are up 7.9 percent,
15 and arrests for anti-Semitic hate crimes are up 10.3
16 percent this year.

17 SPEAKER MENIN: And which metric are you
18 using for the reporting of the anti-Semitic hate
19 crimes? Because I know that was something we talked
20 about.

21 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah, we have always
used for that type of reporting confirmed hate
crimes. So we have two types of reports that we
issue, confirmed hate crimes and also reported hate
crimes, which we started putting out publicly in

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 36

3 March. And it has always been— when we talk about
4 increases or decreases, we have always talked in New
5 York City about confirmed hate crimes.

6 SPEAKER MENIN: Okay. Moving to the Office
7 of Community Safety, the executive plan included
8 transfers of funding from existing departments and
9 new funding to create the Office of Community Safety.
10 Have any programs shifted from the NYPD's purview to
11 OCS?

12 COMMISSIONER TISCH: No.

13 SPEAKER MENIN: To what extent is NYPD
14 engaged with the administration, and what specific
15 roles and coordination will occur between NYPD and
16 OCS?

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Those conversations
18 have not yet commenced.

19 SPEAKER MENIN: So, the administration's
20 announcement of approximately \$260 million for the
21 creation of OCS, there have been no conversations
with NYPD about the agency and who will be doing
what?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Not at this time. I
believe— I mean, I expect that those conversations

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 37

3 will begin to occur, but as I mentioned before in
4 response to the last question, no programmatic
5 responsibility is being shifted from the NYPD to OCS
6 at this time, and none that I know of going forward.

7 SPEAKER MENIN: So in your view, so then
8 what will the purview of OCS be?

9 COMMISSIONER TISCH: The OCS has many
10 different offices, some of which have existed in this
11 city for a while in other agencies that have all been
12 consolidated. And I want to be clear, our work with
13 those offices continues. And so that work certainly
14 has not stopped to the extent that the NYPD has
15 worked with those offices in the past. That continues
16 to this day, but we haven't had strategic
17 conversations about what's going to shift from the
18 NYPD to OCS because nothing is planned at this time
19 to be shifted.

20 SPEAKER MENIN: So what about mental
21 health calls?

22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So on mental health
23 calls, as you know, the city has long had, I believe
24 since the de Blasio administration, a program by the
25 name of B-HEARD, where you have mental health

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 38

3 professionals working with EMTs to respond to 911
4 calls for service where you have, one, an emotionally
5 disturbed person who is both nonviolent and does not
6 have any weapons. That program has existed for at
least five years, and that work continues.

7 SPEAKER MENIN: Okay, so I know my other
8 colleagues are probably going to have questions on
9 this. I assume Chair Lee will as well. But it is--
10 still remains unclear then what the relationship
11 between NYPD and OCS is around mental health calls
and some of the other programming.

12 COMMISSIONER TISCH: And as I mentioned,
13 this-- the city has long had a program by the name of
14 B-HEARD, where 911 calls for service are diverted
15 away from police officers to EMTs and mental health
16 professionals for them to respond. That program
17 continues. I am not aware at this time of any changes
18 to that program, but to the extent that there are,
19 we'll certainly let you know.

20 SPEAKER MENIN: Okay, got it. Thank you.
21 Okay, overtime. I know you mentioned overtime in your
testimony. So overtime at the Department has been a
concern obviously for a significant number of years.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 39

3 In fiscal year 25, uniform overtime was budgeted at
4 \$477.5 million, but the NYPD spent \$959.7 million. In
5 fiscal year 2026, NYPD expects to spend \$955 million
6 on overtime pay for officers according to recent
7 reporting. The budgeted amount for fiscal year 2026
8 was initially \$511.6 million, meaning the department
9 is on pace to exceed its allotted amount by nearly
10 100 percent. The council for many years has
11 continuously pushed the Department and the
12 administration to adjust the overtime budget to more
13 accurately reflect spending, and the mayor's prelim
14 plan included a baseline increase in overtime for the
15 coming fiscal year, but nowhere near the average \$1
16 billion spend per year. So could you provide us with
17 year-to-date spending on uniform overtime and how
18 this compares to last year's?

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Sure. I have a few
20 points on overtime, and then our Deputy Commissioner
21 of Management and Budget, who really knows this
inside and out-

SPEAKER MENIN: [interposing] Okay, great.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: will add anything I
missed. First, I want to- first, NYPD overtime has

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 40

3 never been realistically or appropriately accounted
4 for in a preliminary budget. Meaning the numbers that
5 we get or that you see reflected in the first budget
6 of the year, we know when that budget comes out that
7 they are wildly unrealistic. This administration took
8 steps in their first budget to correct that by adding
9 a significant amount of funding in the last budget
10 for NYPD overtime. That was a meaningful chunk of the
11 problem. It did not address the entire problem, but
12 is the first time we saw a meaningful attempt to
13 reflect realistic— more realistic NYPD overtime
14 numbers in the past four years. Second, if we take
15 out the transit overtime program, which is net new
16 and which the governor pays for, and we put overtime
17 over the past nine or 10 years in today's contract
18 dollars, meaning cops are paid more, so overtime
19 costs go up. In FY26, we are projected to be below
20 average for the past 10 years. And so I just want to
21 make sure that that's clear. Other information on
overtime in calendar year 2025, as I specified,
overtime spend was down 12.4 percent. It was \$143.6
million less than calendar year 2024. In FY26, the
first three quarters, overtime spend is down 10

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 41

3 percent compared to the same period in FY25. In FY26,
4 our full year projection is \$1.013 billion, which is
5 \$91 million less than FY— wait, than FY25, correct,
6 Kristine? And the FY26 overtime spend is projected
7 to be six percent— I said that, six percent less than
8 the historical average.

9 SPEAKER MENIN: Okay. Couple extra
10 questions on that. So with increased initiatives for
11 recruitment, can you explain how hiring to your
12 full-time headcount would offset some of the overtime
13 costs?

14 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Well, look at what's
15 going to happen this summer as an example, where
16 we're going to have to move to 12-hour tours for at
17 least one week. We expect it to be from July 1st to
18 July 7th. And we may need to add additional days in-
19 closer to the World Cup finals. We are doing that
20 because we will take everyone— we have three
21 different tours each day. We're going to take the
first platoon— the first tour and the third tour will
cover all patrol operations, everything in the-
meaning responding to 911 calls as an example.
Everyone who works in that middle tour will have to

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 42

3 be deployed for, you know, the Sail 250 and the World
4 Cup, etcetera. So that— those 12-hour tours that we
5 are forced to work July 1st to July 7th have a
6 significant overtime impact on this department. So an
7 example is an increased headcount would, I guess,
8 offset that type of thing.

9 SPEAKER MENIN: Okay, thank you. I have
10 more questions, but I'm going to pass it over to
11 Chair Lee, and I'll come back on second round. Thank
12 you.

13 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, great. Sorry,
14 just a clarification question. So, the 35,555
15 officers that you were referring to, was that for FY
16 27 or 28?

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: It's in the budget
18 for FY 28.

19 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay.

20 COMMISSIONER TISCH: But we expect to
21 achieve that hiring at the end of this year, this
calendar year.

CHAIRPERSON LEE: Got it. Okay. So in the
middle of FY27. Okay. The— you sort of went into this
a little bit just now, but the plan for— this is

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 43

3 about overtime funding with the state subway funding.
4 The plan includes some funding from the state for
5 subway deployments, but not the full amount. Is that
6 correct?

7 COMMISSIONER TISCH: We do 5,000 hours a
8 day of transit overtime, and we have been doing that-
9 this is our second year of doing that, and my
10 understanding is that the governor- the funds that
11 the governor has provided pays for it, but Kristine
12 can, can add to that.

13 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, and if you could
14 just note how much was received or how much is
15 expected to receive.

16 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah, Kristine will
17 let you know.

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Yes, so we
19 expect in total to receive \$154 million from the
20 state. Half of that is already reflected in the
21 budget, and we're working very closely with the state
for the other half. But as the Commissioner said,
it's currently covering an additional 5,000 hours per
day in the transit system.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 44

3 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, so that portion
4 for the 5,000 hours will be covered by this funding
5 for overtime?

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Correct.

7 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, um, and the
8 Department has implemented overtime reduction plans
9 in the last fiscal year, which kept FY25 uniform
10 overtime spending relatively flat compared to FY24.
11 So how do you utilize- so how do you utilize the
12 state and city federal funding to offset the city
13 funding for overtime, and how are reduction targets
14 changed by changes the state and federal funding have
15 made?

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So it actually
17 depends. We can't- you know, if we're funded for the
18 overtime, we can't supplant with federal or state
19 funding.

20 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Got it.

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: But generally,
for example, with the subway overtime, it's a great
example of the fact that we worked in concert with
the state to determine this funding is going to be
available to us, what are key things we can do with

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 45
3 it. So the funding was sort of in concert with the
4 increased deployments.

5 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. And at the
6 preliminary budget hearing, you mentioned the city
7 may not receive some of the federal funding this
8 fiscal year, and can you update us on some of those
9 numbers, and what areas have been affected by the
10 loss of funding?

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So I'll just say
12 today, no operation— no areas have been affected, as
13 I testified in the preliminary budget this will be a
14 problem two years from now, because we are still
15 today spending grant dollars from previous fiscal
16 year— previous fiscal years. So I want to be clear
17 with the council and with New Yorkers that this
18 funding cut doesn't create an immediate threat,
19 certainly not for the World Cup or this summer, but
20 it does pose a sort of an existential threat two
21 years from now, and it does need to be corrected. But
as to the rest of that question, Kristine?

CHAIRPERSON LEE: Yeah.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So the cut for
the Homeland Security grant funding is 40 percent. So

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 46

3 we had expected we would get about 89 and we're
4 getting only 53 of that. As the Commissioner
5 mentioned, the port security grant, which we've
6 traditionally received, we did apply for that. We did
7 not receive it. That's usually about \$6.5 million.
8 And then there were over a dozen smaller grants that
9 we didn't apply for. We wouldn't have necessarily
10 received funding for all of them, but they range from
11 \$200,000 to over \$6 million. Cumulatively, had we
12 gotten the maximum for all of them, it would have
13 been about \$19 million. And because of the existing
14 terms and conditions and guidance from our legal and
15 the Law Department, a determination was made that we
16 could not make those certifications, therefore we
17 could not apply. So as the Commissioner said, you
18 know, we're able to work within our existing
19 resources now to make sure there's no impact on
20 security and safety. But if this continues, and we
21 hope that it doesn't, there will be an impact further
down the line.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: And I'll add our
bread and butter, where we get like the biggest
amount of dollars from federal Homeland Security

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 47
3 grants is called the Homeland Security Grant Program.
4 That was slashed to what we expect to be about \$53
5 million. That is a 40 percent cut on that bread and
6 butter grant for Homeland Security grant programs,
7 things that fund our intelligence analysts, our
8 counterterrorism deployments, our heavy weapons
9 teams, our technology, our Domain Awareness System.
10 That is the grant that we are most focused on.
11 Earlier in the year, when then-Secretary Noem
12 announced these cuts, we were hopeful based on some
13 of the things that the president had said that, that
14 funding would be restored. Unfortunately, now that
15 it's time to get the funding, we have not seen, mhm,
16 that restoration. And our hope is that either, um,
17 somehow that money will find its way to New York
18 City.

19 CHAIRPERSON LEE: And what is Plan B if it
20 doesn't? And what are contingency—

21 COMMISSIONER TISCH: My opinion, I mean,
again, I said this is a problem not for this fiscal
year—

CHAIRPERSON LEE: [interposing] Right.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 48

3 COMMISSIONER TISCH: but for like one or
4 two fiscal years out. I don't see how the— how New
5 York City does without the capabilities that these
6 grants fund. So either we get this corrected with the
7 federal government, which we should— it, I think,
8 needs to happen, or the city is gonna have to pick up
9 the tab. But from my perspective, cutting the
10 intelligence analysts, cutting the domain awareness
11 system, cutting the responsados that do shows of
12 force in front of for example, houses of worship.
Cutting those things are non-starters. So either the
federal government pays up or the city's gonna have
to pick up the tab.

13 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Right. Okay. The
14 executive plan includes savings of \$9.3 million in
15 FY26. And how does the savings work with overtime
16 additions that were included in the preliminary plan?

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So part of that
18 savings actually did include uniform overtime savings
19 of \$19 million on the city side. The overall budget
20 did include some additional federal funding. So, you
21 know, we are still, as the Commissioner indicated
earlier, achieving savings year over year in overtime

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 49

3 through our overtime management plan. The additional
4 other savings were just PS accruals, as well as
5 capitalization of the vehicles, as the Commissioner
6 mentioned, and we had the civilian savings that were
taken that resulted in headcount reductions as well.

7 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. Thank you. For
8 vehicle capitalization, exec plan includes savings of
9 \$103.7 million across FY27 to FY30 from utilizing
10 capital funds instead of expense funds for vehicle
11 costs. And could you explain what changes that
allowed these vehicles to be capital eligible?

12 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yes, we are ecstatic
13 about this, because the NYPD's fleet over the past
14 few years, the state of it has been disgraceful, with
15 an unacceptable portion of the fleet being either out
16 of service or beyond its useful life or close to
17 beyond its useful life. These vehicles are crucial
18 parts of our operation, and in my opinion, it is
19 incumbent on the city and on this department to keep
20 them refreshed. When previously they had not been
21 capitally eligible, so we could only buy new vehicles
with expense funding. And over the past four years, I
think with the exception of last year, the city

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 50
3 continually cut expense funding as part of expense
4 reductions for NYPD fleet. So the NYPD bought, like,
5 shockingly few vehicles several years in a row, which
6 really takes its toll. We needed a change in state
7 law to allow our fleet to be capitally eligible both
8 on the marked and unmarked side. We saw it as a
9 no-brainer. We believed that our fleet met all of the
10 requirements for capital eligibility in terms of, for
11 example, the five-year useful life. And we were
12 thrilled to see in the governor's budget the change
13 to that state law that allows our fleet to be
14 capitally eligible. I just want to be clear, this is
15 not just a good thing for this year, this is a good
16 thing forever.

14 CHAIRPERSON LEE: For future years,
15 right. And then, how does that change the procurement
16 process, if at all, with the \$82.6 million now for
17 the purchase of the vehicles?

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: The procurement
18 process will remain unchanged.

19 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Still the same?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 51

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: It's the same.
4 We just obviously have to go through the certificate
5 to proceed with OMB.

6 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Right, with OMB.

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Right. We've
8 already commenced that process for next year. So we
9 can get the orders in as quickly as possible to
10 continue to replenish the fleet.

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: And I'll say, when I,
12 when I speak to our officers about things that
13 management can improve for them, the fleet could-
14 comes up almost every time.

15 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Yeah. Perfect. The plan
16 included a similar change for IT license costs. Can
17 you explain the change there?

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Capital eligibility
19 versus expense. Go ahead.

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Yeah, so there
21 are just certain licenses. Licenses for IT tend to be
an area where, depending on how long the license is
going to last and actually what we're getting. There
have been at certain times questions on whether or
not certain licenses were capitally eligible or had

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 52

3 to be- used operating funds. So working with our
4 Information Technology Bureau, we took a closer look
5 at the licenses and determined that there were more
6 that could actually be part of the capitalization
process, and we- that resulted in expense savings.

7 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Perfect. And are there
8 any other areas of cost that similar changes can be
9 made to swap expense funding for capital, or you've
all-

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: We always look
11 at it. I mean, sometimes unfortunately because of
12 inflation, things- the silver lining is they become
13 more expensive, so they may have met all the other
14 criteria but not met the minimum dollar value. So
15 we're always looking, uh, to see if we can
16 capitalize. Obviously we want to be, you know,
17 efficient and responsible with the capital funds as
18 well, but you don't want- you know, there's a reason
why there's capital funding to cover things that have
a long useful life-

19 CHAIRPERSON LEE: [interposing] Right.
20
21

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 53

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: to pay them
4 over time. So, we do maximize capitalization as much
5 as possible.

6 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, perfect. And have
7 you also looked at- I guess this is generally for
8 overtime and other areas within NYPD, because, um, I
9 think I brought this up in the preliminary hearing,
10 but looking at technology, IT, those types of
11 platforms to figure out timesheet updates, for
12 example, that could help lower overtime or sort of
13 improving the systems within NYPD.

14 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, you know, I spent
15 a lot of my career building IT systems at the
16 Department, and we are always interested in
17 modernizing both our operational and administrative
18 systems. I will say that we have been doing a lot of
19 operational work on in terms of IT development. We
20 have a new 311 system for the department that's gonna
21 come out. That's coming out now-ish. We're digitizing
the command log. We will look seriously at where we
can put IT resources to update administrative systems
as well. That's not a guarantee that it will be done,

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 54

3 but I take the feedback and we will look for
4 opportunities to do that.

5 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Perfect. And in terms of
6 the uniform civilian PS accruals, executive plan
7 includes savings, uh, of \$110.8 million in FY27. Our
8 understanding is that these savings are usually taken
9 from vacant salaries. And are you planning on not
10 hiring additional? I know that you said the classes--
11 the number of hires has increased. So wanted to know
12 when you expect the next NYPD class and will it be a
13 similar size as recent classes?

14 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Oh, yeah. As I
15 mentioned earlier, we are trying to end the year at
16 our new authorized headcount. So we're going to be
17 hiring approximately, I think, just shy of 4,000
18 officers this year to get to that number based on our
19 expected attrition. So yeah, I mean--

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: [interposing]
21 I can, speak to-- and, and those accruals, those are
not reflecting any delay in hiring. Essentially, as
you can imagine, when you have a workforce of over
35,000 people, we make assumptions about looking at
attrition, who's gonna leave what salary, but over

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 55
3 time, if more people with higher salaries leave for a
4 certain period of time, or whatever the mix is, in
5 addition to differentials and things like that, it
6 can add up quickly in terms of just adjustments to
7 this is what we assumed we were gonna need to cover
8 all the salaries for X number of people. Those same
9 number of people can remain employed in terms of the
10 assumption of who's coming on, but you have people at
11 maybe higher levels leaving. It's a mix.

12 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Right.

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: And, you know,
14 you're off a little bit and it allows for adjustment.
15 Sometimes it unfortunately goes the other way, right?
16 So this is just reflecting where we are right now.

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah. And so I'll add
18 that if our assumptions are correct about how many
19 resignations we'll see and how many retirements we
20 will see this year, then we should end the year at
21 the authorized headcount based on the hiring plan.

CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: And of course with
your- the council's help raising the maximum age for

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 56

3 which someone can take on the noble job of becoming a
4 New York City police officer. So appreciate that.

5 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Yeah. Oh, the Speaker
6 had alluded to this question earlier, but I just kind
7 of wanted to go a little bit further and to say,
8 because as we know, the NGBV and a lot of the
9 domestic violence work is now under OCS. And so I
10 know that you had said that previously, you know, the
11 work that you have done with those departments will
12 continue. So, I just wanted to know-

13 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] Yeah,
14 like, I just had a meeting with the Commissioner of-
15 Gender-Based Violence last week or the week before.
16 So I want to be clear that all of that work with all
17 of those officers include- with all of those offices,
18 including on the executive level, commissioner to
19 commissioner, that, that continues.

20 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. And also, because
21 I know that in order to report that they have to go
through- a lot of it is underreported because
especially in communities of color, immigrant
communities where there's different languages,
cultural barriers, those types of things. Are there

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 57

3 folks within the precincts that would be able to
4 appropriately help a lot of those folks that are more
5 language-specific? Aside language line, because I've
6 thought about that.

7 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Alex, do you want to
8 answer that?

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CROHN: So part of
10 creating the domestic violence investigators is
11 really to have investigators whose sole job is
12 investigating domestic violence. So that wasn't the
13 case before. When you got a detective investigating a
14 domestic violence crime, they could be investigating
15 lots and lots of different crimes. So there was no
16 specialization there. We do our best we can to put
17 people in communities who are able to speak the
18 languages.

19 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Right.

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CROHN: And if we need
21 to, of course, we can borrow from one precinct to
another, or if there is a real need there, it does
come up from time to time.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 58

3 COMMISSIONER TISCH: And the inspector
4 who is doing a brilliant job running our new Domestic
5 Violence Unit can add to that answer.

6 INSPECTOR KOSAK: Yeah, so in addition to
7 just the officers there, we have the language line,
8 but we also have crime victim advocates that work
9 inside of the individual precincts. And we work
10 closely with Family Justice Center who has, you know,
11 gender-based— sorry, not gender-based, but culturally
12 specific organizations that we can always link our
13 survivors to.

14 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, perfect. I just
15 want to make sure that you guys are all in
16 communication. I know some— the precincts I overlap
17 with are very great about working with the community
18 groups.

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: One of the offices
20 that we have the closest coordination to is the
21 Office to End Gender-Based Violence.

CHAIRPERSON LEE: Yeah.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: They are involved in
the development of our training and the selection of—
and oversight of some of our closest partners, even

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 59

3 people who work within our precincts. And so the
4 coordination there has been and continues to be
5 seamless.

6 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Great. And my last
7 question, and I'll pause. I have more, but I want to
8 pass it off to the Chair and other members. But in
9 terms of the B-HEARD, and it's more of a comment, but
10 do you have— I have lots of thoughts on B-HEARD, as I
11 know Commissioner— Council Member Cabán has. But in
12 terms of the coordination, I think that's always been
13 the frustration, as well as the fact that it is hard
14 to hire up, staff up for that. And it's more of FDNY
15 EMS, which we'll go into later this afternoon. But
16 just wanted to know, in general, for folks that are
17 experiencing mental health crisis, I know that we
18 have 988 now, which hopefully more people are
19 utilizing.

20 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yes, people are
21 using it.

22 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. And just wanted to
23 know what the numbers look like there in terms of if
24 a call comes in to you all in 911, and then how does

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 60

3 that get transferred, referred? How successful are
4 those transfers?

5 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So between-- you're
6 talking specifically for 988, or you're talking about
7 for B-HEARD?

8 CHAIRPERSON LEE: For both. Yeah.

9 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Okay, so let's start
10 with 988, because I'm there on that page. Between
11 program inception on April 14th of this year through
12 April 30th-- so all of my data here ends April 30th--
13 so I guess for the first 16 days, 204 911 calls
14 qualified for referral to 988 mental health
15 resources. And then on B-HEARD, let's see. All right,
16 so, at 911 we get about 4.3 million calls for service
17 each year. Of those, the emotionally disturbed
18 persons, nonviolent, no weapons, 85,793. So, of the
19 overall calls for service, approximately two percent
20 are divertible to B-HEARD. Okay, now I'll give you
21 the numbers for this year. So, there were 17-- so
between January and April, January-- first four months
of the year, there were 17,961 calls where B-HEARD
was requested. Is that right? Was requested? Where
B-HEARD was requested. They responded to 1,411 of

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 61
3 them. So that is 7.9 percent of the calls that they
4 were requested to respond to.

5 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Is that a lack of the
6 teams that they have?

7 COMMISSIONER TISCH: You have to ask FDNY.

8 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, I'll definitely
9 ask them, but I-

10 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] Point
11 is, we- the 911 call- NYPD's role in this is the 911
12 call taker, who is an NYPD employee determines that
13 the call is eligible to be transferred to B-HEARD,
14 and then it goes outside of the NYPD's universe.

15 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, and then just let
16 me ask it a different way. Have you seen that with
17 the addition of B-HEARD as well as 988 that there are
18 more successful incidences that are being deferred
19 out that have been successfully-

20 COMMISSIONER TISCH: We don't see the
21 outcomes of those calls right now. The diversion
numbers are tiny compared to the overall volume and
the overall need. So there are lots of opportunities
to improve even with the- without changing the
criteria, meaning if the criteria remains emotionally

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 62

3 disturbed person, nonviolent, no weapons, there is
4 still a huge amount of room for B-HEARD to respond to
5 more calls.

6 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Yeah. Okay, I will pause
7 there and pass it over to Chair Feliz. Oh, sorry,
8 before I do that, I just want to say we've been
9 joined by Council Members Ariola, Hanks,
10 Brooks-Powers, Deputy Speaker Williams, Council
11 Members Dinowitz, Felder, Avilés, Majority Leader
12 Abreu, Council Members Brewer, Ressler, Joseph, J.
13 Sanchez, and Council Member Mealy.

14 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: Thank you. Thank you
15 so much, Chair Lee. Wow, we have a full house today.
16 We have almost enough members to hold a Stated
17 Meeting and have quorum. So a few questions. I'll
18 start my question—

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: We attract a crowd.

20 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: I'll start my
21 questions on the topic of large-scale events. As we
22 know, we're one month away from the World Cup in
23 July. With increased tourism coming to New York City
24 for the FIFA World Cup, you issued a memo stating
25 that officer shifts will be 12 hours from July 1st to

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 63

3 July 7th. How exactly will this work? Are they
4 expected to work three days per week for a total of
5 36 hours and then a half of a shift for 40 or 42
6 hours?

7 COMMISSIONER TISCH: No. They will either
8 work pre-tour or post-tour overtime. So importantly
9 for our officers, during that week, we are not
10 throwing out their chart. They will continue to work
11 their standard five days a week, just with four hours
12 added either to the beginning or to the end of their
13 tour. And the Chief of Department is going to soon
14 issue guidance to each bureau about how their 12-hour
15 tours are going to work, meaning are they doing
16 pre-tour or post-tour. Chief, do you have anything to
17 add to that? Okay.

18 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: All right, so five
19 days a week, 12-hour tours.

20 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Five days a week,
21 12-hour tours, but in that time we are doing things
like canceling training. We are canceling all things
that could otherwise be a drain on NYPD resources. We
do not expect to be canceling their RDOs, their

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 64

3 regular days off, as a practice. It may have to
4 happen from time to time.

5 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: Is this going to apply
6 to every police officer?

7 COMMISSIONER TISCH: We're not going to
8 cancel, for example, like, if they have holiday
9 picks, they're not going to have to work, you know,
10 when they were planning to be away. But it is going
11 to apply to the vast majority of-- well, I'd say the
12 majority of police officers in the New York City
13 Police Department for that week, and perhaps for a
14 few days closer to the finals, will be asked to work
15 12-hour tours. And that is from the rank of police
16 officer on up to, to chief. So it really affects
17 everyone. It is not a decision that we took lightly,
18 or that I took lightly, but it is an absolute
19 necessity for that week given the number of things
20 going on in that-- in the city.

21 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: Approximately how many
22 police officers would this apply to? You said a vast
23 majority. Would you say more than 80 percent? 80, 90,
24 ballpark?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 65

3 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I don't want to give
4 an actual percentage. What I can say is that the
5 Chief of Department is going to issue guidance to
6 each bureau and once we have that guidance, we will
7 let your office know what percentage it applied to.

8 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: How much overtime is
9 projected for that week of the World Cup? Can you
10 give the numbers? Well, for the World Cup or the July
11 1st to July 7th? Because, like, remember, we've got
12 July 4th, Sail 250, which is like, the President's
13 military parade in New York City, NBA Finals, World
14 Cup, all as potentially Taylor Swift's wedding. I'm
15 kidding. But all as overlapping events in New York
16 City between June 11th and July 19th. Any one of
17 those on their own would be a big deal in New York
18 City. All of them taken together are unprecedented
19 and are going to place unusual and I would say
20 historic demands on the New York City Police
21 Department. So Kristine, can you go through the July
22 1st to July 7th, what that dollar value projection
23 is, and then also for the World Cup specifically?

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So these
25 projections are preliminary, but for the July 1st

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 66

3 July 7th, our projection order of magnitude is that
4 will cost between \$35 to \$42 million for that period
5 overall for FIFA and Sail 250. So this entire time of
6 all of these overlapping events, we believe overtime
is projected about \$73 million on top of that.

7 Obviously there's equipment that the department needs
8 to make sure that we're able to keep everything safe,
9 secure, and also also manage the crowds. That's \$12.4
10 million. And then there's \$6.5 million for drone
11 equipment. So in total, the estimate right now is \$92
12 million. The good news is that the budget that you've
13 all looked at already really accounts for on the city
14 side about \$50 million, and then there's another \$21
15 million in federal funding. So there's \$71 million
16 that we're accounting for. All the federal funding is
not quite reflected yet, but that does leave a
17 shortfall of about \$20 to \$21 million based on
18 projections.

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I will just add that
20 the federal government/FIFA did not give us nearly
21 enough money to cover the overtime bill on the New
York City Police Department. Kristine, how much did
FIFA give us, \$14 million?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 67

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So they gave us
4 \$14.6 for the overtime, toward overtime, and \$6.5 for
5 counter-drone equipment. We are having conversations
6 about potentially getting more, but that's not
determined yet.

7 COMMISSIONER TISCH: It's gonna be a rough
8 start to the fiscal year for our overtime. Just
9 remember that for next year's overtime hearings.

10 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: We'll keep that in
11 mind. Talk to us about the plan for fan safety at
transit hubs and also watch parties?

12 COMMISSIONER TISCH: The plans— okay. So
13 with all of these major events that are going on in
14 New York City, there will be other joyful events
15 going on around them in New York City. All of those
16 events will require a police presence. For example,
17 NBA Finals watch parties, FIFA watch parties, people
18 taking the subway, using mass transit, going to and
19 from those watch parties, people going to the events
20 themselves, meaning getting people to the— from New
21 York City to the World Cup is a whole to-do in and of
itself that requires security. They're going mostly
by bus or by rail, and there's a big screening

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 68

3 component and security component there. So, it would
4 be an understatement to say that we have been
5 planning. We have been, like, aggressively planning
6 for so many different things that are occurring this
7 summer, not just the main events themselves, but all
8 of the festivities surrounding those events. And
9 remember, FIFA is an international name and therefore
10 a target. And so we do not look at FIFA as just a
11 normal event in New York City. Both the FIFA
12 tournament and the events surrounding FIFA in New
13 York City, the fan zones, the watch parties, those we
14 all have to look at seriously through the
15 counterterrorism lens.

16 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: Speaking about events,
17 how will the NYPD work with federal and state
18 authorities to ensure participants are safe getting
19 to and from the events?

20 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Hand in hand. The
21 Chief can-- do you want to talk through the buses and
the trains and how you're coordinating with partners
on that?

CHIEF LIPETRI: Sure. So on the eight game
days at MetLife, there-- we have identified four

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 69

3 separate locations that over 200 buses will be
4 starting in New Jersey, swept in New Jersey with an
5 NYPD presence to make sure that they are swept
6 properly. Those buses then come into New York City.
7 Obviously, we're not able to park 200 buses in and
8 around the four identified areas, so we will start
9 with 45 buses at a time. That footprint at those
10 locations start 12 hours prior to those buses being
11 parked there. Obviously, those locations have to be
12 swept by our counterterrorism team. They then have to
13 be- the footprint has to stay there until the buses
14 actually arrive. Those buses, each one of those
15 buses, I've assigned two uniformed officers to,
16 again, to continue to observe those buses to make
17 sure that, you know, they're safe to go back into New
18 Jersey. Again, very dynamic. The 42nd Street will be
19 the street that we will be using that will be closed
20 to just bus and emergency vehicles going through the
21 tunnel into New Jersey. As far as the rails, we have
identified approximately, we think, upwards of 15,000
people to go through Penn Station and then ultimately
have to get screened by the NYPD to go again into New
Jersey. So it's a huge- it's a huge undertaking. On

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 70

3 top of doing all that, on the eight game days, there
4 will be numerous watch parties throughout New York
5 City. And, you know, again, we've gone from 32 teams
6 to 48 teams. We've gone from approximately 150 games
7 to 200 games. Every game that is being played will be
8 front and center in New York City. As far as the
9 rails, working with our federal partners and Amtrak.
10 So actually, next week I will be chairing a meeting
11 with the northeast corridor from— from Washington,
12 D.C. up to and through New York City with Amtrak,
13 MTA, and all our rail partners to make sure that,
14 again, it's seamless, it's safe, and the federal
15 government, the state government, and obviously the
16 NYPD are working very, very close.

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you, Chief.

18 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: Speaking about the
19 World Cup and also watch parties, there's been
20 numerous articles which stated that public events,
21 including World Cup watch parties on open streets and
plazas and parks will be scaled back due to NYPD
concerns. Is it true? And if yes, can you talk to us
about some of the concerns? And also, is the plan or

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 71

3 the hope to have police presence at every single
4 watch party?

5 COMMISSIONER TISCH: My understanding is
6 that the Mayor is going to announce a very robust set
7 of watch parties for FIFA around all five boroughs,
8 which will run the length of the tournament. We do
9 have, that we know of, already announced the five
10 FIFA fan zones that will be- five FIFA fan zones, one
11 in each borough. So my hope and my expectation is
12 that we are going to have a lot of festivities in New
13 York City around the World Cup. Obviously, we need-
14 we want to celebrate. We need to celebrate safely. I
15 already told you about the need to look at all things
16 FIFA through a counterterrorism lens. That's what
17 this department is doing. We don't have unlimited
18 resources, and we also have a lot of other things
19 that are occurring in New York City. You know, when a
20 country hosts the World Cup or the Olympics, usually
21 they cancel everything else going on in that city at
that time. We didn't in New York City. We're still
having- we're having the Puerto Rican Day Parade.
We're having lots of- the Pride Parade. We are having
many or nearly all of the standard large-scale events

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 72

3 in New York City this summer that we would have in a
4 summer with, like, none of these events going on. And
5 so I would appreciate it if you could think about the
6 demands on this department in that context. We would
7 like to facilitate a lot. Perhaps we won't be able to
8 facilitate everything, but there will be a lot of
celebrating in New York City.

9 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: So, absolutely, yes.
10 And of course, we're going to-- we're expecting there
11 to be a lot of requests for permits for watch parties
in communities and etcetera. And on that issue--

12 COMMISSIONER TISCH: And just know that
13 for each one, the-- for each city-sponsored one, the
14 Chief and Commissioner Weiner have to put together a
15 full counterterrorism package because again, that
name FIFA comes with elevated threat.

16 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: Right. Yes. And of
17 course, there's a lot of agencies that play a role
18 when it comes to issuing permits. NYPD plays a big
19 role in reviewing and issuing them. What are factors
20 that the NYPD will consider when determining whether
21 to issue let's say, a watch party on Fordham Road?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 73

3 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Whether we— so
4 whether we can do it safely, which means does the
5 footprint make sense? Can we secure it appropriately
6 with blocker cars? Like, we don't want cars driving
7 into these watch parties either on purpose or by
8 accident. We don't wanna be— we've seen vehicle
9 ramming attacks across the city. Do we have the
10 resources available to it? Like, for example, are
11 there several other watch parties going on in the
12 same precinct at the same time? So, I mean, the main
13 thing is, are we able to ensure a responsible amount
14 of security at the event?

15 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: What are areas that
16 are more likely to receive an approval for a watch
17 party? I'm sure doing a watch party at a park would
18 be much easier to secure, you know, it's more
19 difficult to—

20 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Usually it is. That
21 is true. Each permit application we review based on
the specific details. So, how big is it? Where is it?
Is it in a heavily trafficked area? Is it right near
a subway station? Does it run right alongside of busy
corridor where a vehicle can just come right up into

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 74

3 it? Like, there are so many different factors that we
4 look at. What else is going on in the city at the
5 same time? I mean, everyone needs to remember we have
6 a day in New York City where we both have a--
7 hopefully or potentially an NBA Finals game in New
8 York City and a World Cup game in the New York/New
9 Jersey area. So we also have to look at what's going--
10 what else is going on in the city that day.

11 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: All right, thank you
12 for the information. So I'll ask some questions about
13 the overtime issue, and then I know my colleagues
14 have a lot of questions, so then I'll pause there. So
15 can you repeat the numbers related to overtime, let's
16 say, for the last seven years, the last seven fiscal
17 years? And for these questions, let's just focus on
18 the fiscal years because, of course, calendar years
19 are very different from fiscal years.

20 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah, okay, sure.
21 This- the fiscal- okay, at fiscal year 26, the first
three quarters, we are projected to be down 10
percent in overtime spend.

CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: What about total? Not
just the first three quarters, total fiscal-

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 75

3 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] Well,
4 we're not-- we do the-- we're in the last quarter now.

5 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: Right? But projected
6 for the last quarter included.

7 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Oh, the projection
8 is \$1.013 billion, which is \$91 million less than
9 fiscal year 25, the same first three quarters. But
10 for the first three-- sorry, which is \$91 million less
11 than fiscal year 25. So the full year projection is
12 \$1.013 billion, \$91 million less than fiscal year 25.
13 For the first three quarters that have been completed
14 in fiscal year 26, we are down 10 percent in overtime
15 compared to the first three quarters of fiscal year
16 25. And if you take out the transit overtime, which
17 the Governor pays for, and you put overtime spend in
18 today's dollars, meaning in today's contract dollars,
19 how much the cops are paid, the FY26 overtime spend
20 is projected to be six percent lower than that
21 historical average going back to 2016.

22 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: And what has been the
23 total overtime budget since, let's say, 2020, all of
24 the fiscal years since 2020?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 76

3 COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: Yeah, I can get-
4 I can get you that.

5 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I have it here. It's
6 this chart here, Kristine, right?

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Yep, those are
8 the adjusted values. Yep.

9 COMMISSIONER TISCH: You go ahead.

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Yeah, so going
11 back to 2020, so if you look at, again, excluding the
12 transit, it was a billion in fiscal year 2020.

13 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: Well, including the
14 entire thing, transit, the entire-

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Well, with
16 transit, there wasn't really much transit that year.

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: There wasn't transit-

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So that was a
19 billion for, like, billion- it was basically a
20 billion in fiscal year '20. Fiscal year '22 was \$576,
21 but that was basically because of the pandemic, so
that's really an outlier. Fiscal year 22 was \$918,
fiscal year 23 was \$1,047,000,000, fiscal year 24 was
\$1,155,000,000, and fiscal year 25 was
\$1,128,000,000.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 77

3 COMMISSIONER TISCH: But fiscal year 25 is
4 when transit started.

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Correct?

6 COMMISSIONER TISCH: And so if you take
7 transit out, which the governor pays for, then fiscal
8 year 25 is \$954, and the projection for FY '26
9 without transit is \$862.

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Correct.

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So I know it's a big
12 spend for overtime, but I just want to make sure that
13 the members of this council understand that his-
14 like, if you look at historical spending totals, the
15 numbers here seem more reasonable than they otherwise
16 would.

17 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: Yeah, and that is my
18 next question. Why are we still spending \$1 billion
19 in overtime? I mean, you know, I know all of you
20 continue to mention that the previous administration,
21 there was an anything-goes system. There were-

COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] There
was, and that's why-

CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: [interposing]
Significant changes, and that-

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 78

3 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] Yeah,
4 there was.

5 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: If I could just
6 finish-- and there were also about 4,000 new police
7 officers added last year, which exceeded attrition
8 rates. So I'm just curious, why are we still in the
9 ballpark of \$1 billion? This is something that we
10 don't see with any other agency.

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah. So the
12 officers that were added last year, the reason we
13 hired 4,000 of them is because 20 years ago we had
14 hired huge number of officers. So we hired four-- over
15 4,000 officers last year to make sure that we kept up
16 with attrition. In fact, we beat attrition by a few
17 hundred officers, which was a minor miracle. But I
18 don't want to give the impression that we ended the
19 year up 4,000 officers. We ended the year up several
20 hundred officers, which is the first time we'd ended
21 the year up for many years. At the same time, it is
the case that before I got here, the Department did
not manage overtime in any meaningful way. And it, to
me, looked like when I showed up an anything-goes
system. And the executive team here under the First

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 79

3 Dep and the Deputy Commissioner of Management and
4 Budget's leadership have put in, I think a very
5 responsible overtime plan that has delivered
6 meaningful results- a 10 percent decline in overtime
7 in fiscal year 26 and a 12.4 percent decline in
8 overtime in calendar year 25. And we will continue to
9 do that. As to the question about why overtime is
10 required, I think we need not look farther than
11 what's going on this summer and the previous
12 questions you just asked. Are we going to be able to
13 have all of these watch parties? Are New Yorkers
14 going to be able to celebrate? And the answer is,
15 like, yeah, we're going to do a lot of celebrating.
16 But that celebrating needs to be safe. And in order
17 for it to be safe, we need to make sure that we have
18 officers there and that we have thought through all
19 of the security requirements. So for things, for
20 example, like special events, that requires overtime.
21 For protests, things that are, like, unexpected, that
requires overtime. Sometimes, for example, like, if
we're seeing a gang war in the 44, and we say, the
officers on Saturday night, they usually end at- I'm
making this up- at one in the morning or midnight and

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 80

3 we want them to stay on post till two in the morning
4 because we want to make sure that we curb the gun
5 violence. Those are examples of things that we would
6 use overtime for.

7 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: Right, absolutely.
8 And, yes, this is as we know, this is- is and will
9 always be a very busy city. New York City will always
10 have large-scale events, also sports events, parades,
11 and etcetera. But I think the big- and of course we
12 need and appreciate the police presence at these
13 events to make sure that people are safe. But the big
14 question, or the big point here, is whether there's
15 any measures that we can take so that we could have
16 that police presence, let's say, for example, by
17 increasing headcount and not have to continuously
18 rely on \$1 billion of overtime.

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I do not believe-
20 having more officers this summer would definitely
21 decrease the overtime, the need for overtime this
summer for all of these special events, and in my
opinion, could have an overall general effect on
overtime. But those are budget decisions that the
council needs to make in coordination with the mayor

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 81

3 and his team. I am doing the best I can with the
4 officers that we have, and I am very pleased that so
5 far this year, in his first month, the mayor has
6 given us over 500 additional officers budgeted for
the New York City Police Department, 580.

7 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: Brief question on
8 headcount. So the headcount is approximately 35,000.
9 What percent of this 35,000 is patrol officers versus
community affairs and any other units?

10
11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Oh, I have that. Hold
12 on one second. Oh, here it is. Our patrol staffing,
13 I'm very pleased to tell you, is 888 officers. As of
14 April 30th this year, 888 officers over what it was
15 the same time in 2025. So we have nearly 1,000
16 additional officers on patrol now. If you compare
17 April 30th of this year to April 30th of last year,
18 and that our number right now, I believe, is 15,749.
19 I wanna be clear, those numbers include our evidence
20 collection teams, and our domestic violence units. So
21 I'll just explain why. Historically, so last year and
the year before and the year before that, forever,
those two teams were part of our Patrol Services

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 82

3 Bureau. So they were included as part of the patrol
4 headcount. They have been moved now to be under the
5 Detective Bureau, but they perform the same functions
6 that they performed when they were under Patrol
7 Services. So I'm giving you an apples-to-apples
8 comparison.

9 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: All right. A few-

10 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] And the
11 Bronx is up 250 officers. I know you care about that
12 since last year.

13 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: Thank you for that.
14 We'll take- thank you so much for that. We'll take
15 more of those.

16 COMMISSIONER TISCH: You're about to get
17 more. That's the great thing about all the hiring we
18 did last year. Now, we do 18 months of training for
19 these officers on the street. And as they hit that 18
20 months, they go into precincts where they're
21 responding to 911 jobs. So every few months now,
precincts across the city are going to see an influx
of new police officers on patrol, and it is something
now that we can enjoy for the next year, and so long
as our great hiring continues.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 83

3 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: Thank you. Thank you
4 so much for that. And we're absolutely seeing the
5 results. I've been around a few incidents and the
6 police response has been at the speed of light. So
7 that's something that we appreciate and we welcome. A
8 few more questions about the issue of overtime. What
9 are the top three things that lead to overtime? I'm
10 sure large-scale events is going to be something big
11 this year. Protests-

12 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Large-scale events.
13 Do you have that, Kristine?

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Yeah, so, it's
15 events, it's investigations, and then basically we
16 have the other categories are roughly even with
17 arrests, operational, crime reduction, and then of
18 course we have our transit safety as well. But the
19 two largest areas are investigations and the events.

20 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: All right. And just
21 two more questions. I know we have a lot of
22 colleagues who have signed up for questions. A few- a
23 question about officer deployment. Approximately how
24 many officers do we have for a large protest versus a

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 84

3 smaller protest, also large-scale events, and also
4 for parades, a smaller parade versus a larger parade?
5 What's the ballpark of a lot of officers?

6 COMMISSIONER TISCH: It really runs the
7 gamut. It just- it varies so much that it is hard to
8 answer that question. Do you wanna-

9 CHIEF LIPETRI: Sure, I can answer it.
10 Let's just just look at yesterday's parade. So
11 yesterday's parade- and this is total uniform
12 members, so I'm not separating our CT teams, I'm not
13 separating our emergency service- we had over 3,000
14 officers that were assigned to that detail. And
15 again, we look at security risks, we looked at- we
16 look at past incidents, not just in New York City but
17 across the world. And we also look at, you know, how
18 many participants we expect at those events. So a lot
19 of times it could be hundreds of officers, but many
20 times it could be thousands of officers.

21 COMMISSIONER TISCH: And the same is true
22 for protests. It just really depends on how many
23 people are expected to go to the protest, where is
24 the protest, what time of day, what else is going on,
25 all of those factors.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 85

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: If I may
4 also just-- the tiered system that we have in the
5 protest element speaks to this as well, right? So,
6 it's everything that the Chief of Department was just
7 saying, the Police Commissioner was saying, and then
8 one thing that has been a product of the protest
9 settlement is thinking through, okay, how many
10 officers do we actually need to do this responsibly,
11 appropriately, consistent with the settlement? And I
12 think that's actually been a real benefit of the
13 protest settlement.

14 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: All right, thank you
15 for the information. Final question before I pass it
16 on to colleagues. And on the issue of overtime, I'm
17 sure there's a lot of things that-- a lot of ways that
18 we could get to overtime. Let's say a police officer
19 has to work a few additional hours after their shift.
20 They can also do overtime during their, as they say,
21 RDOs, during their regular day off. They're off and
they're called to work. What percentage of overtime
hours are worked by officers already working versus
those that are during their RDOs they're supposed to
be on.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 86

3 COMMISSIONER TISCH: We're going to have
4 to get that to you. We don't have that data right
5 here, but I think that we can figure that-- get that
6 number for you.

7 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: Okay, thank you. So
8 I'm going to pause here. We could get that. I know
9 you have your team here. We could get that through my
10 next round. That would be--

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] I don't
12 think we're gonna be able to get that in the next
13 round. The Deputy Commissioner of Management and
14 Budget will get it over to your office, but she's got
15 to do a little work to get that number out.

16 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: Okay. Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, perfect. So we
18 have Deputy Speaker followed by Councilmember Cabán.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Hello,
20 Commissioner. Just a quick question about something
21 you said in your testimony around hate crimes. You
had mentioned that it was down 5.4 percent, but we
saw some reports that show a jump to 11.8 percent,
and that rapes are also up. So just wanted to know if
you can explain, like, the differences between, like,

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 87

3 your testimony and some reports that we saw that
4 says-

5 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] Yes,
6 the reports that you saw reference the first quarter
7 of- the numbers at the end of the first quarter of
8 the year. So January, February, March. The numbers
9 that I gave account for April as well. And so it
10 changed. You know, these are- hate crime is a
11 terrible thing, but these are small-ish numbers
12 compared to overall crime. So a few crimes can make a
13 big difference in terms of up or down.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.
15 Just turning questions to the racial equity plans
16 that you put forward. I've been asking all city
17 agencies about their racial equity plans, especially
18 during budget hearings, because we hope that budget
19 allocations are being appropriated to fulfill some of
20 the goals. So one of the goals of the NYPD is to
21 enhance the hiring process by removing unnecessary
barriers, bringing greater transparency to decisions,
and ensuring qualified candidates are not excluded by
the system. This is listed as a short-term goal to be
completed by 2026. Has the department done a review

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 88

3 in the past of the hiring process? What was the
4 outcome of this review? And is any funding in this
5 budget going towards recruitment and hiring?

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CROHN: So there have
7 been many reviews of the hiring process, but I'm not
8 one that particularly looks at equity. So the hiring
9 panel is convening over a period of about 100 days.
10 It met earlier last month in the initial meeting.
11 It's a collection of experts, academic experts,
12 community members really across the board to give us
13 their best thoughts on how to improve that process.
14 So we had our initial kickoff. We should have our
15 next meeting I think in just a couple of weeks, and
16 then we'll have a final meeting at the end and those
17 are where the recommendations will come out of.
18 There's no funding allocated just for the study,
19 that's just being done with in-house staff.

20 COMMISSIONER TISCH: And just to answer
21 the last part of the question, a lot of the success
22 that we have had in hiring over the past year and a
23 half has been driven by our fraternal organizations.
24 So those fraternal organizations going out into their
25 communities, educating people about the work of

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 89

3 police officers. We- a year ago at this time, we're-
4 we couldn't find enough candidates to take the job.

5 You know, we had an actual- our actual headcount was
6 well below the budgeted headcount. And I give the
7 work of those- those fraternal organizations, a lot
8 of credit for the work that they have done getting
9 people interested in the job.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.

11 Another goal is to increase representation in
12 leadership positions and specialized units by 2028.
13 Which units currently have the lowest levels of
14 diversity?

15 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I have to get back
16 to you. We can get back to you with the diversity by
17 unit.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay, just
19 turning over to some district-specific questions. So
20 I appreciate the Q teams. I visited each Q team in my
21 district. We love them. But some of the things that-
I see Chief Obe here- specifically around truck
parking and making sure that these precincts have the
resources to remove trucks and address a lot of the
overnight commercial vehicle parking in residential

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 90

3 neighborhoods. So just wanted to know specifically
4 about her division and the budget there and how you--

5 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Which division?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: The Chief Obe.

7 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Oh, Chief Obe. So
8 what I want to say on that is I think the paradigm
9 that this department has used forever on towing makes
10 no sense. And the precincts that have heavy towing
11 needs should probably have tow trucks assigned to
12 them and people trained in how to use them assigned
13 there as well. That is what makes sense for me. You
14 know, Council Members always wanna give us funding
15 for strategic things, and I think that if we can
16 reorganize appropriately, that might be a great new
17 way to address some of the acute towing problems that
18 we are seeing in specific precincts, including in
19 yours--

20 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Yes, I love that
21 idea. And I know, like, all of us in Southeast Queens
would definitely allocate-- I hear sound effects--

COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] So
we'll have to--

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 91

3 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: to our
4 precincts, because we do try to support them. Like, I
5 know--

6 COMMISSIONER TISCH: let's have
7 conversations--

8 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [interposing]
9 Okay.

10 COMMISSIONER TISCH: about we can make
11 that a reality. I think that that will be more
12 meaningful than talking about how much money is
13 assigned to the Transportation Bureau. But, Kristine
14 has that for you.

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: It's \$212
16 million.

17 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.

19 CHIEF OBE: So just on a final note, just
20 to add, in your district, since we met with you, the
21 work still continues. On 10 dates we had-- we wrote
22 259 summonses 51 tows so far, and 51 boots also. So
23 the work will continue.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay, thank
25 you. Just one more question about my favorite

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 92

3 division in the police department, which is the
4 Community Affairs Division. I would love to see--
5 every year I ask for an increase because there are,
6 like, amazing community affairs officers. One
7 precinct, they're doing a whole dance recital, you
8 know, and they do the best that they can. They raise
9 money inside of the police department. They
10 externally ask for resources, but I feel like when I
11 think of, like, community policing and what we all
12 want to see from the police department, I feel like
13 this is, like, the unit that does that work.

14 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yep.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: And I feel like
16 they just don't-- I would love to see them have more
17 money. You know, the game truck breaks down, the rock
18 wall, there's only, like, one rock wall. Would love
19 to see a rock wall in each bureau. I mean-- This is
20 just my yearly, please give more money to the
21 Community Affairs Division.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Noted. I hear you on
that. I will say that one thing that we have done,
and this was at the request and advice-- on the advice
of virtually every precinct CO that I have spoken to.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 93

3 For four years, the Community Affairs Officers were
4 not assigned to their precincts. They were reassigned
5 to a centralized Community Affairs Bureau, which
6 basically meant that the precinct CO lost his or her
7 basically right-hand person, but particularly,
8 definitely the right-hand person for dealing directly
9 with the community, because that person no longer
10 reported to him and her. As of January this year, I
11 was very pleased to reassign Community Affairs
12 officers back to their specific precincts, and I
13 think that that has and will continue to go a long
14 way. There are still many Community Affairs officers
15 that are centrally assigned under the Community
16 Affairs Bureau, but I think restoring that function
17 under patrol has led to some very positive outcomes.
18 And I am getting positive feedback on that, both from
19 many of your colleagues, but just as importantly,
20 many precinct COs that I speak to.

17 CHAIRPERSON LEE: We've also been joined
18 by Council Member Banks, and we'll go with Council
19 Member Cabán, followed by Wong.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Thank you. As
21 always, I have lots of questions, so I'm going to ask

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 94

3 that y'all be as succinct as possible. I'm going to
4 start with just some money numbers. Can you tell me
5 FY 26 to date the money spent on the Quality of Life
6 Division, and if you could break that down to like
7 money spent on the the Q teams, QStat, and then just
8 the projected budget for FY 27 for those?

9 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Kristine has that
10 for you.

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So I'm
12 actually have to get back to you because I don't have
13 a broken back by each bureau by spend-to-date. So I
14 will get back to you on that.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Okay. That would
16 be really helpful. Are you tracking complaints and
17 civil suits based on the- that particular division's
18 enforcement?

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Like CCRB complaints?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: And civil suits.

21 COMMISSIONER TISCH: And what?

COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: And civil suits,
yeah.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Civil suits.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 95

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: So, if the
4 question is, do we sort of have like a separate
5 tracking system by division? I mean, we certainly can
6 pull that data. That's not-- there's data that we can
7 get.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Okay.

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: But I don't
10 think that we're tracking it sort of day-to-day sort
11 of by division.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Okay. So I want to
13 move on to different questions. I think the request
14 is, can you pull the data on that and provide it to
15 the Council in terms of the complaints and civil
16 suits coming out of Quality-of-Life enforcement?

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yes. For sure.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Great. Thank you.

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Out of the Quality of
20 Life Division.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: The quality of life
division. Yes.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yep.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: What--
Commissioner, what evidence does the NYPD have that

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 96

3 increased arrests for low-level offenses improve
4 public safety outcomes?

5 COMMISSIONER TISCH: To be clear, we are
6 not looking to make increase arrests for low-level
7 offenses. We give our officers a huge amount of
8 discretion. Discretion starts with engagement. The
9 Quality of Life Division was certainly not created to
10 gin the number of low-level arrests.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Well,
12 Commissioner, that's not my question. I don't— no,
13 but that's not my question, so I just want to
14 redirect for a second. The— what evidence does the
15 NYPD— because we have it in prior hearings where you
16 have testified and others?

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I don't have
18 evidence. I don't have evidence of it, because that
19 is not a stated goal, so I wouldn't look at that.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: No—

21 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] The
stated goal of the Quality of Life Division—

COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: [interposing] Okay.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 97

3 COMMISSIONER TISCH: is to address the
4 explosion of quality of life complaints that we have
5 seen across-

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: [interposing] Okay.

7 COMMISSIONER TISCH: every precinct in
8 every district in this city.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: And as a partner
10 in public safety-

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] And
12 your colleagues-

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: what evidence do
14 you have that Broken Windows- addressing broken
15 windows offenses, low-level offenses improves public
16 safety outcomes.

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I told you I am not
18 interested in going back to broken windows policing
19 where you-

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: [interposing] Okay.

21 COMMISSIONER TISCH: look to make a low-
you look for a low-level thing to find a higher-level
thing.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Thank you. Okay,
so I will say that the theory-

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 98

3 COMMISSIONER TISCH: What I'm looking to
4 do is address-- can I just finish? You can have more
5 time. What I'm looking to do--

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: [interposing] Can I
7 chair? Is that cool? The commissioner is offering me
8 more time.

9 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Maybe like another
10 minute, and then we'll go to round--

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: [interposing]
12 Thank you.

13 COMMISSIONER TISCH: What I am looking to
14 do--

15 CHAIRPERSON LEE: [interposing] We'll
16 definitely put you for round two.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Okay.

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: What I am looking to
19 do is address the explosion of 311 complaints that we
20 have seen across every community in the city. And
21 those complaints differ community to community.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Thank you. So what
I want to say about this here is that either our goal
has to be improved, public safety outcomes or answer
311 com-- be the one to answer certain 311 complaints

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 99

3 simply because you get them. And what I think is
4 important for us to analyze here is that there has
5 been a 20-year meta-study analysis that debunks the
6 relationship between disorder crime and using
7 resources for broken windows policing, generally. It
8 was disproved. And even though you're saying it's not
9 a stated goal, we have seen the Data Collaborative
10 for Justice over a four-year span from 21 to 24. So a
11 sharp upsurge in arrests for low-level charges. A
12 Gothamist article talked about a 3,000 percent
13 increase in arrests for lying down or taking up more
14 than one seat on the subway, and that at this point
15 in the year, court cases for that offense in
16 particular are already exceeding the pace of last
17 year. So I just— those things don't make sense to me
18 in terms of either you're improving public safety or
19 doing the things, if you're data-driven, to improve
20 public safety, or just going to answer 311 calls
21 simply to answer them and not improve public safety.
But I want to ask this, and then I'll go to a second
round, with my questions. What is the total annual
cost to taxpayers of processing low-level arrests
through the criminal legal system compared to issuing

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 100

3 summonses or utilizing, diversion programs, while
4 pointing out that maybe one way to reduce over time
5 is to stop dragging people through the system for
6 taking up two seats on the subway.

7 COMMISSIONER TISCH: We can get you
8 information about the budget for our Criminal Justice
9 Bureau, which is where we would spend money on
10 processing arrests. Is that fair? Kris, can you do
11 that?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Yeah.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Yeah. So
14 specifically, the ask would be the cost to taxpayers
15 of processing low-level arrests compared to the cost
16 if those were through issuing summonses or utilizing
17 some other diversion program. So, thank you.

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Councilmember, I
19 would- I would say if you are- if we're talking about
20 low-level offenses, the vast majority of the time, if
21 we make an arrest for something that is otherwise
summonsable, it will be for one of two reasons.
Either we cannot properly identify the person making
them ineligible for summons because then the summons
means nothing, or there is another warrant that is

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 101
3 outstanding that they haven't responded to for some
4 other crime. I will say that, um, the, the
5 unidentifiable is about 6.6 percent of those, so the
6 vast majority of the time it is- that person is
7 wanted on an open warrant for some other crime.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: So vast majority,
9 can you give a percentage to that? How many of those
10 are- if we're talking- vast majority is well over 50
11 percent, which I don't know that that's accurate.

12 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Alex can tell you.

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CROHN: So in
14 transit, when we do have to make an arrest, again, it
15 is- as the Commissioner stated it's 6.6 percent of
16 the time- that's because we were not able to properly
17 identify. The remainder of all the arrests are either
18 because the person has a warrant and we have a legal
19 obligation to bring them back to court, or they're
20 being arrested for a higher-level offense in addition
21 to that low-level.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: You're saying that
those are the only two other reasons?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CROHN: Correct.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Okay. Can I-

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 102

3 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing]

4 Unidentifiable-

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Can I follow up
6 on this?

7 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Unidentifiable,
8 wanted on a warrant, and third, being wanted, or-

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CROHN: [interposing]
10 If you are being arrested for a higher-level crime.

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: In addition to the
12 lower-level crime.

13 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, one more follow-up
14 and then we gotta move on.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Well, it's not one-
16 I have a line of questions, but just responding to
17 that because I have-

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Councilmember, we can
19 sit together and- as long as you want and go through
20 any questions that you have on this.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Sure, I know we
have- but I actually think that there's a lot of
value in not just doing it sitting in a meeting, but
doing it in an open hearing with the public so that
they know how their money is being spent and what

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 103

3 outcomes they're getting or not getting and what we
4 should be able to expect. I have- I- I'm I will pass
5 it off to you, but I have a second round just
6 specifically on that. Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. Council Member
8 Wong, followed by Councilmember Ariola.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: Okay. Thank you,
10 Chair. And thank you to the Commissioner and the men
11 and women of the NYPD for testifying today. Before my
12 questions, I want to recognize some excellent work by
13 the NYPD. Last week my office with Council Member
14 Ariola's office and community members became aware of
15 social media posts promoting a planned takeover at
16 the Atlas Mall. We immediately shared that
17 information with the NYPD. Queens Borough Chief
18 Russell Greene and Captain Rios took the intelligence
19 seriously and acted quickly, deploying a significant
20 police presence around the mall. For a few hours, the
21 Atlas Mall looked very well secure. That deterrence
worked, and the takeover never materialized. When
organizers began directing participants towards
Middle Village Playground in my district, my office
again alerted the NYPD. Officers responded quickly

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 104

3 and prevented any disruption before it could occur.

4 And because of proactive policing, nothing happened.

5 That's exactly what residents expect and deserve. I

6 also want to thank Inspector Wong at the 110th

7 Precinct for his work addressing quality of life

8 concerns, including issues surrounding the Amadeus

9 Nightclub, illegal car meetups, loud music, and other

10 persistent neighborhood complaints. I also want to

11 thank Captain Fennessey of the 112th Precinct for

12 addressing recent antisemitic vandalism affecting the

13 communities in my district and Council Member

14 Schulman's district. I appreciate the work these

15 commanders are doing to keep our neighborhoods safe,

16 address quality of life concerns before they become

17 larger problems, and maintain confidence in public

18 safety. With that, I have a quick— a few questions.

19 Is there a Department policy against publicly

20 disclosing precinct-by-precinct staffing levels? And

21 if so, what is the rationale? Because my constituents

regularly ask about these figures, and they were—

they were— they look and look, and there's nowhere to
be published.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 105

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: So, the way
4 the way the City Council set up the law, you know, we
5 have various disclosure obligations, various- wide
6 range of staffing data that we are required to
7 disclose, except to the extent that it will endanger
8 public safety or endanger our officers. And so we, as
9 you know, we provide a very wide range of data
10 regarding staffing and deployment. However, as it
11 gets more and more granular, more and more specific,
12 we do get more and more concerned about the safety
13 aspect of this. If bad actors know precisely how we
14 have staffed at a very granular level, that allows
15 them to exploit it, to make strategic or tactical
16 decisions that can be incredibly dangerous for the
17 public or for our officers. So that's the balance
18 that we're constantly striking. I do want to
19 emphasize that the City Council set up the law in
20 this way, that is maximum transparency consistent
21 with public safety and the safety of the officers.

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Which is why we tend
19 when we talk about publicly about staffing numbers or
20 report publicly on staffing numbers to do it on the
21 borough level. But when you have asked in the past

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 106
3 and other of your colleagues have asked in the past
4 about your staffing numbers, about concerns about
5 staffing, we are very transparent with you in those
6 discussions, take the feedback, and then assign
officers accordingly.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: Okay, thank you.
8 Recently as the temperature gets warmer, we have a
9 big problem about dirt bikes and ATVs driven on the
10 streets and in parks in my district. Question: is it
11 legal to operate a dirt bike or ATV on a public
street or in a park? Even if it's for minors or
adults.

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: An ATV? No,
13 it is not.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: What about for dirt
15 bikes? Okay, thank you.

16 CHIEF LIPETRI: If it's an unregistered
17 dirt bike, no, it cannot. It cannot be on a New York
City street.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: I see. Oh, thank
19 you. Chair, I would like to have more questions for
20 round two.

21 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Perfect.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 107

3 COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: Thank you. Thank
4 you.

5 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. Uh, Council
6 Member Ariola, followed by Council Member Joseph.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Thank you, Chair.
8 Thank you, Commissioner. Thank you for always coming
9 fully prepared and for testifying with full
10 transparency and clarity. We really do appreciate
11 that. Many of us here want to see the NYPD get more
12 resources than I'm hearing you saying we're getting.
13 So that's what we're here for. As far as numbers, you
14 had them categorized by borough and how crime has
15 decreased by borough, especially retail crimes in
16 specific boroughs. Do you have that drilled down as
17 far as council districts? Because oftentimes we get
18 calls in our council offices that says, oh, it's- we
19 can't even live here anymore, you know, we're ready
20 to go. But we want to be able to tell them, like, you
21 know, I-

22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Your staffing
23 numbers by council district-

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Right? How major-

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 108

3 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] That's
4 a good idea. I don't think we have that available
5 now, but that would be, I think, high enough level
6 that it wouldn't be at the precinct level. That's
7 actually a really good idea about how to get more
8 granular than just borough.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Right.

10 COMMISSIONER TISCH: And we can try to
11 provide that.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Yeah. So this,
13 this way we can fight back any narrative that says,
14 you know, crime is out of control because I do— I
15 love the Q teams. I love our Community Affairs
16 officers. I agree that we need more heavy toes. I'm
17 so happy that you're open to that, you know, in some
18 of our areas. The other thing is, you said that a lot
19 of your funding comes from federal grants and you're
20 going to continue to fight to get those federal
21 grants, but there is some language that precludes you
from being able to apply for those federal grants.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yes.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 109

3 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: And I can only
4 imagine that that includes working fully with federal
5 law enforcement agencies. How-

6 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] A lot
7 of it is that- a lot of the problematic language for
8 us conflicts with the sanctuary city law.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Correct. So how,
10 how will you manage that, or navigate that when there
11 is a conflict there? Because you certainly need that
12 funding.

13 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, there's two
14 separate things going on. The first are the grants,
15 which tend to be the much smaller grants. They do not
16 represent a majority of the counterterrorism grant
17 funding we get, where we have that conflict with
18 sanctuary city law, and we are not eligible to apply.
19 The more meaningful chunk of money is not about
20 eligibility- a conflict between sanctuary city law
21 and eligibility requirements. It's the Department of
Homeland Security's allocation levels to New York
State, which were dramatically cut under Secretary
Noem. And we were hopeful that the president would

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 110
3 overrule. Unfortunately, we have not seen those
4 dollars yet for federal fiscal year '25.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Thank you. Thank
6 you, Chair.

7 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Great. Council Member
8 Joseph, followed by Council Member Hanks.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Thank you. Hi,
10 Commissioner. Always good to see you. I'm right here.

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Hello.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Hello. Correct me
13 if I'm wrong. Youth arrests for major felonies have
14 increased in each of the last fiscal years, at the
15 same time major felony crimes in schools relatively
16 flat over the period. How can we improve those stats?
17 You know how I feel about that. And what other
18 agencies and programs can NYPD reach, I believe,
19 would be great partners?

20 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Hold on, I have two
21 people— he's explaining to me the first part of your
question. Okay, sorry, what's the second part of the
question?

COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: How are you
working with other agencies to make sure we're

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 111
3 bringing down the numbers among young people that
4 we're seeing in these cases?

5 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Alex is gonna answer
6 the first part of the question since-

7 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: After he explained
8 the question, all right.

9 COMMISSIONER TISCH: he was just
10 [inaudible].

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CROHN: So I can
12 answer the first part. Sorry, there's lots of
13 different things going on at once. All right. So,
14 arrests in schools are actually down. So this year
15 they're down 4.8 percent. So we're seeing both less
16 crime and less less arrests in schools at the same
17 time.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: But how are- are
19 you also working in collaboration with schools? For
20 example, I knew before there was a division working
21 on school- there was a drone for subway surfing. We
lost a young person at 14 years old to subway
surfing. The last hearing that I had here with
Transportation, NYPD, and New York City Public
Schools as interagency- these are conversations that

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 112

3 all agencies should be having. So where are we on
4 that in terms of collaboration and working on all of
5 things?

6 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Collaboration with
7 DOE, I hope if you ask them, they will say the same
8 thing. But from our perspective, the collaboration
9 with DOE specifically has never been better. I'll let
10 Tania speak about the work that we're doing with DOE,
11 and then I want to speak a little bit about the work
12 that we're doing with them with subway surfing. Go
13 ahead.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Okay.

15 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA: How
16 you doing?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: I'm good.

18 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA: So we
19 take arrests- we work with our DOE partners really
20 well.

21 COMMISSIONER TISCH: You facilitated that
whole thing?

FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA: Yes.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: You had the first
meeting?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 113

3 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA: Yes.
4 65% of incidents that occur in schools now are
5 mitigated by DOE. We meet with our DOE partners on a
6 monthly basis. We also meet with the advocates on a
7 quarterly basis to try to work with the advocates in
8 DOE too, so we don't have to arrest and have DOE take
9 on more of the incidents.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: So you're working
11 interagency, so you're working with Project Pivot,
12 who's on the ground-

13 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA: Yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: which is the cure
15 violence groups they have in schools.

16 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA: Yes,
17 351 schools Project Pivot is in. We provide support
18 in those schools during the times that Project Pivot
19 is going on.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Okay, in your
21 crisis intervention team training, the numbers that
was for uniform members in communication skills,
de-escalation, and behavior and restorative justice,
of course.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 114

3 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA: So we
4 have approximately 3,384 personnel trained.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: In de-escalation-

6 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA:
[interposing] Yes.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: restorative
8 justice. We received a couple of calls around your
9 metal detectors are not working at schools and
students are being late. How are you addressing that?

10 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA: So we
11 know of three incidents that occurred this year thus
12 far, but the school safety executive leadership
13 responded and spoke to all three principals. We have
14 now have an in-house training of our agents to help
15 mitigate if a scanner breaks. Within 30 minutes, we
16 have agents rectifying the issue. And as well as now
17 there's a direct notification and investigation done
once we are aware that a school is late because of
scanning issues or personnel issues.

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Based on the feedback
19 that you've given me about this specific thing in the
20 past, I am pleased to tell you that we have ordered
21 40 new scanners to replace some of the old equipment

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 115
3 that we have, because it is not acceptable to be late
4 for school because of scanning.

5 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA: And
6 we received 10 of those scanners on Friday, last
7 Friday.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Okay, good. And
9 they will- what's the timeline to put them in place
10 for them, or are they already in place?

11 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA: We're
12 working on that now with DOE. We're working with Mark
13 and our executives in school safety to procure where
14 exactly they're going to go or replace.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: This council had
16 passed the bill for 988 to be in New York City public
17 schools. How many calls do you get from young people?
18 Can- do you track that?

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: We would not have
20 that data. That data, you need to ask 988, the people
21 who run that, because all we do is transfer the call,
so we don't collect the demographic information.

COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: And how many
mental health-related calls where this training would

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 116
3 be applicable if you were to do it? You can get back
4 to me on that.

5 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Mental health-related
6 911 calls?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Yes.

8 COMMISSIONER TISCH: We can get you the
9 number of mental health 911 calls. I know that in the
10 first 15 days, 204 calls were transferred to 988, but
11 that is nowhere near the total number. You're asking
12 for the total number of any EDP call we get.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: And as my
14 colleague had mentioned earlier, it'd be great to
15 look at the breakdowns per council district in order
16 for us to work better with you, probably provide more
17 resources and provide more support.

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: We will get that to
19 you.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Thank you. Chair,
21 I'll come around my second round.

CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: Thank you. Thank you
so much, Council Member Joseph. So it is 12:10. We're
gonna take a brief five-minute recess. 12:10, so
we'll see everybody at 12:15. Thank you so much. And

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 117

3 please, just five minutes. It is 12:10. I'll see
4 everybody at 12:15. Thank you.

5 [break]

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Everyone please find
7 your seats. We're getting ready to resume the
8 hearing. Thank you. Please find your seats.

9 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, great. Okay. So
10 we're going to resume with Council Member Hanks and
11 then Council Member Brooks-Powers.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Thank you, Chair.
13 It's good to see you, everyone, Commissioner Tish. So
14 I'd just like to circle back to the Office of
15 Community Safety. And just for the record, can we
16 kind of- whatever, you know, give a list of existing
17 programs under OCS if they're- if there is-

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I do not have that
19 list.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Oh, you don't have
21 the list? Okay. So, as a holistic structure, it's
still, you know, quite vague what this is. Does NYPD
have any idea of what they would want to partner with
or need support with or any gaps that would help
define this OCS committee group?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 118

3 COMMISSIONER TISCH: As I mentioned, we
4 do a tremendous amount of work with a lot of the
5 offices that have been moved under OCS. The Office to
6 End Gender-Based Violence is a shining example of
7 that partnership, and that work continues. Look, I
8 think the mental health crisis in New York City is
9 definitely an issue that affects the New York City
10 Police Department profoundly. And so I would look
11 forward to walking— working with the Office of
12 Community Safety to understand ideas that they have
13 for addressing it.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Thank you so much.
15 I'll have a line of questioning that's a bit more
16 local. So, the Borough Patrol Staten Island is funded
17 at \$103.2 million in the FY 27 Executive Plan, down
18 by \$7.9 million from the \$111 million FY 26 adopted
19 level. Primarily in the 20th precinct headquarters at
20 78 Richmond Terrace in St. George, with parts in the
21 121st. Why does the Borough Patrol Staten Island fall
\$7.9 million below FY 26 adopted level in the
Executive Plan, and what does it mean for authorized
officer counts at the 120 and the 121 precincts?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 119

3 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, as I mentioned,
4 we did reorganization of department resources last
5 year to better-- to streamline, for example, our
6 response to domestic violence, and also to make our
7 evidence collection teams work more closely with our
8 Crime Scene Unit. And so in doing that, we moved
9 those two units from under the Patrol Services Bureau
10 to the Detective Bureau. Those movements happened
11 across the entire Department, and they certainly did
12 not take resources away from community members. It
13 just looks on paper like we've taken resources out of
14 patrol, but those functions still remain just
15 assigned under a different command code.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Thank you so much.
17 Thank you, Chair.

18 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. Council
19 Member Brooks-Powers?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you,
21 and thank you, Commissioner. I first want to thank
you Patrick Gordon, Ryan, for bringing the team back
out when we unfortunately lost 18-year-old Brandon
Figueroa at sea in Rockaway. It was meaningful. The
mother was definitely appreciative. I'm hopeful that

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 120

3 the body that came ashore yesterday is Brandon's
4 body, but we know that PD is still maintaining
5 regular communication with us. So thank you for that.

6 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Absolutely.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: I also want
8 to thank Chief Obe and her division for the work that
9 they've been doing, including Officer Marian Manick
10 [sp?], who has been amazing since your visit to
11 Southeast Queens regarding the illegal truck parking
12 in Southeast Queens. It has been tremendous. So thank
13 you for that.

14 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Great. That makes me
15 so happy to hear.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: And then
17 I'm going to just ask you three questions. If I need
18 to repeat anything, let me know. So first, Southeast
19 Queens has seen a surge in gun violence in the last
20 few months, including the tragic shooting of
21 15-year-old Jaden Pierre in the Deputy Speaker's
District, which is a neighboring district to mine. As
summer approaches and our youth are out of school,
how is NYPD prepared to prevent these types of tragic
shootings from happening in the first place? Often

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 121

3 these violent outbursts are the result of organized
4 takeovers that spread on social media. I'm curious to
5 know how the NYPD is detecting these social media
6 trends and getting ahead of potentially violent
7 incidents and how NYPD is communicating to the local
8 precincts when viral social media trends pop up in
9 specific geographies. Then—

10 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] Sorry,
11 I'm not smart enough to remember all of these. Can we
12 do them one at a time?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Well,
14 because of the interest of time—

15 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Okay, okay. Say
16 that—

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS:
18 [interposing] I'll repeat whatever I need to.

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: So from
21 the end of December 24 to October 25, NYC admitted on
average 49 more people to jail each month than at
discharge, increasing the jail population by around
500 people. As we approach the transition to
borough-based jails, our city must work to reduce the

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 122

3 incarcerated population. I wanted to know how NYPD

4 specifically is working with Department of

5 Corrections, MOCJ, the DAs, and other agencies to

6 work towards a common ground and ensure we can

7 successfully close Rikers. So, just wanting to know

8 that coordination is happening there. And lastly, we

9 have consistently heard from community members and

10 local precincts that police officers are not aware of

11 local laws regarding the truck routes, truck idling,

12 and other park-related- trucking-related matters. The

13 result is that there are no- there is no consistent

14 enforcement against trucks breaking the laws. What

15 steps has NYPD taken to ensure that all police

16 officers are trained on this issue and able to

17 enforce traffic laws against trucks that are not

18 compliant? And I'll give you an example. We did a

19 walkthrough with DOT, and there was a truck that was

20 idling on Springfield Boulevard, and we had a local

21 officer there as well. But it was clear that it was

not clear in terms of how long that truck was able to

legally idle in that location?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 123

3 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Okay, I'll start
4 with that one first, and then you have to remind me
5 about the other one.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Sorry.

7 COMMISSIONER TISCH: The— if there is a
8 precinct where we have to do specific refresher
9 training on specific laws like truck idling laws, we
10 are very happy to do that and to do that quickly. So
11 my team can connect with you to understand, like,
12 what the very specific issue is. And you have my
13 commitment that those officers in that command will
14 be refreshed in those issues. You asked, I think,
15 your second to last question— I'm working backwards
16 here— was about Rikers. And I'll just be— be blunt.
17 The NYPD does not think in terms of the size of the
18 correction population or the Rikers population. That
19 is a matter specifically for the Department of
20 Correction. We don't enjoy arresting people, but we
21 need— we will take action when there is a crime
committed. And so my hope and my expectation is that
the city will account for that in their planning for
correction capacity.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 124

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: And just to
4 clarify, because I think we're in alignment and not
5 necessarily wanting people who should be in custody
6 to be in custody, it's more in terms of looking at
7 that-- the low-level offenses that I think you
8 mentioned earlier that could be a summons, for
9 example, but understanding that coordination because
10 we are seeing an increase in the arrests that are
11 happening and we're not seeing that revolving door
12 for those that may be instances where there could be
13 summonses or low-level in a sense.

14 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So we, we allow our
15 officers to use discretion. Where you are seeing
16 increased increases in arrests-- like, where you're
17 seeing arrests for something that would otherwise be
18 some summonsable, is generally in three areas. One,
19 the person cannot be properly identified, which is
20 out of the officer's control. If the person cannot
21 provide ID or the Department cannot properly identify
them, they are not eligible for a summons. Doesn't
matter how low the offense is. And if they are able
to provide it, oftentimes they are. Second is if they
are wanted on an open warrant that they themselves

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 125

3 have not responded to and are required by law to
4 respond to and we are- we come across them for a
5 low-level thing, we will arrest them and return them
6 to- they need to be returned to court to deal with
7 that open warrant. So I just don't want there- I
8 reject the narrative that the NYPD is on a spree of
9 arresting people for low-level offenses when the
10 actual data shows otherwise.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
12 And just going back to the first one, it was more
13 centered around the takeover overs in the social
14 media efforts that I know PD has technology and they
15 are viewing different social medias to try to stay up
16 to speed with what's happening with the young people,
17 but wanting to know what that coordination with the
18 local precinct looks like so that we can be more
19 proactive in responding to it.

20 COMMISSIONER TISCH: The Chief is going
21 to take this one, but I just want to say social media
is driving right now two big things that I know are
of particular concern to many of you here, car meets
and teen takeovers, which are exploding and I- across
the country, and I expect only to get more intense as

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 126

3 school lets out. We have— we monitor social media for
4 both of those things, but your question is
5 specifically about teen takeovers, and the Chief
6 will—

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS:

8 [interposing] Yes.

9 COMMISSIONER TISCH: let you know how we
10 approach those and how we coordinate with the local
11 precincts on them.

12 CHIEF LIPETRI: Good afternoon. So
13 actually, the local precinct is the first line of
14 defense when it comes to monitoring social media. We
15 have field intelligence officers assigned to all 78
16 precincts across New York City, our housing PSAs, and
17 also our transit, our transit PAs. We do have a
18 centralized social media team out of our Detective
19 Bureau, but also out of our Intelligence Bureau. But
20 it starts with the local precinct. So if a field
21 intelligence officer is monitoring social media in
the 101 in Far Rockaway, he or she, through our ECMS
system will share that intelligence, not just
locally, but citywide. And we, you know, again, we're
very good at knowing the platforms that we need to

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 127

3 look at, but that's real time. Like, that's real
4 time. We don't wait. That gets sent out immediately
5 and everybody is always working together. And we've
6 gotten very, very good with the car meets and also
7 the teen takeovers with sharing that intelligence,
8 right? One of the four principles of- actually two
9 out of the four principles of CompStat is timely and
10 accurate intelligence and rapid deployment. And
11 that's a staple of the New York City Police
12 Department.

13 COMMISSIONER TISCH: And I just want to
14 add on your last question- I'm sorry, I lost the
15 forest through the trees, threw me off for a second.
16 Low-level arrests don't end up in Rikers. You end up
17 in Rikers for a felony. So I- low-level arrests are
18 not driving the Rikers population.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: So not
20 everyone at Rikers are there for a felony. I know
21 Council Member Cabán is going to probably dig more
into this later, so I'm not going to take up more of
the committee's time on it. I do want to thank you
for your responses and just make a plug for the 101
Precinct in terms of capital needs, because that

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 128

precinct right now is highly dilapidated and
3 under-resourced as well. But thank you, Chairs.

4 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. Okay, we
5 have Council Member Felder. Council Member Felder
6 versus Council Member— and next we have Council
7 Member Brewer followed by Rustler. Okay, Council
Member Felder, go ahead.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: I apologize
9 because I'm going to be leaving for implant, not in
10 the brain, in the tooth— teeth. So, I'm sorry, but I
11 don't want you to answer my questions first, but if
12 somebody could call or let me know afterwards, I'd be
13 very happy. So, first of all, I want to thank your
14 colleague here who spent hours at the hearings on
15 antisemitism, listening to questions and answering
16 them. I've never ever been at a hearing when someone
17 didn't say once, in my— at least when I was awake,
18 didn't say once, I'll get back to you. He answered—

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] He's
18 fabulous.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: He answered every
20 single question.
21

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 129

3 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Fabulous. I never saw
4 that in my life.

5 COMMISSIONER TISCH: That's what we try
6 to do. We try to answer your questions.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: I never saw that
8 in my life. I think there's something wrong with him.
9 I think you should check it out. Yeah, okay. In terms
10 of my questions, if you could just-- if somebody could
11 let me know. Number one, I'd like to know in terms of
12 the community policing, if somebody could let me know
13 if there's a particular person that's assigned to the
14 district. I don't know how exactly it works. I'd like
15 to know who that person is so that I could call.

16 COMMISSIONER TISCH: We'll get you in
17 touch with the community affairs officers in your
18 precincts.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: Yeah, if somebody
20 could-- yeah, that would-- yeah. But I asked you not to
21 answer my question.

COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: Oh, sorry, I missed
that.

COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: Yeah, so if you
could please listen-- yeah, please. The other thing is

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 130

3 that for years ago, they used to have a program where
4 they had officers, for example, that looked- not
5 great, but looked like me, for example, policing, you
6 know, were- are actually cops walking around that
7 looked like Orthodox Jews. And, you know, the- I
8 think that the concept, when they publicized it, that
9 alone was helpful. I'm curious why that has not been
10 used in terms of fighting antisemitism. That's two.
11 Three, there- years ago, I don't know how many, I
12 think it's about 15 years ago, they installed certain
13 cameras on top of the lights to fight crime. I don't
14 know if those cameras are operational or not. And
15 finally, when I was in the Senate about four years-
16 five years ago, I sponsored a bill to actually have
17 insurance and licenses and other things, you know, on
18 bicycles, certain bicycles, even regular bicycles.
19 And I've seen some talk about it, and I'd like to
20 know what the- you know, whether the Police
21 Department, you know, has any opinions on it. And I
thank you very, very much for everything that you're
doing, period.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 131

3 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you so much,
4 Council Member. At your request, we will get back to
5 you in writing on all of those things.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: I thank you.

7 COMMISSIONER TISCH: But I don't want
8 that held against us in terms of our live response
9 rate for this hearing. 'Cause I could have answered
10 all of them right here and now.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: I'm not listening
12 to you because I make the jokes. You are not- it's my
13 show, you know.

14 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Fair enough.

15 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Great, thank you,
16 Council Member Felder. Uh, Council Member Brewer
17 followed by Council Member Ressler.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I wish I had
19 Simcha Felder's sense of humor. I do wanna thank
20 Central Park Precinct 24 and 20- Simcha. Those three
21 I want to thank. Retail theft is an issue. In one
situation, the Duane Reade put in full-time security
and they have zero theft. But the nearby Duane Reade
is now- still overwhelmed with security problems
because they don't have one and then thefts. I didn't

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 132

3 know how much time or effort or money you put into
4 the idea of retail theft, and if you think the
5 numbers are going down or up.

6 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Retail theft numbers
7 in New York City are going down, like, way down, and
8 it is wonderful to see. It's been happening over the
9 past two years, and Chief LiPetri will tell you all
10 about it.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you.

12 COMMISSIONER TISCH: But specifically
13 Manhattan North.

14 CHIEF LIPETRI: So as far as retail theft,
15 as the Commissioner said, this year we've seen a 19
16 percent reduction in retail theft in New York City
17 across all five boroughs. When you look at the five
18 boroughs, geographic boroughs, it's led by Staten
19 Island at 41 percent, followed by Queens at about 21
20 percent, and Manhattan at about 20 percent. What I'm
21 really proud of is the men and women both on the
patrol side and the investigative side when it comes
to clearance rate, which means you commit a shoplift
and you get arrested. So just four years ago,
actually three years ago, that clearance rate was

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 133

3 about 41 percent of the time we made an arrest with a
4 shoplifting complaint. This year it's over 51
5 percent, and that includes low-level shoplifting
6 crimes. So again, I thank the detectives that have a
7 very high caseload to take on those petty larceny
8 cases. They've done a phenomenal job. We've used the,
9 the tweak in the state law as our friend, meaning,
10 you know, the aggregate amount of merchandise that
11 somebody steals from a particular store, whether it
12 be a CVS on 51st Street or CVS on 55th Street, we're
13 able to aggregate that. And again, it's built off of
14 recidivism. Right.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay. I hear you.

16 CHIEF LIPETRI: And we've done very, very
17 well with that. We still have a lot of work to do,
18 but we're doing well.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Yeah. Okay.

20 Warehouses- so I went to the DCAS warehouse in
21 Queens. It's large. It has lots of extra space. So my
question is, how many warehouses does NYPD have? I've
been in the cannabis warehouse. There's a lot of
cannabis in there. And I just was wondering how many

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 134

warehouses you have, what the cost is, can you
3 reduce?

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So we're
5 actually actively working right now on, uh, ideally
6 consolidating some of our warehouses, including the
warehouse you're referencing.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: The cannabis one.

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: There are other
9 things there as well, but yes, there is-

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing]
I've been through it.

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: cannabis at
12 that facility. Unfortunately, we did have funding, in
13 20- before 2020 to do a full consolidated property
14 clerk, which would have taken care of this. That
15 funding doesn't exist, so we're trying to be creative
16 now and look at properties in some of the outer
17 boroughs where we think we may be able to get out of
some of the leases that are problematic.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Can you update us
19 on that? I knew you had a fire in one too in
Brooklyn.

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Yes.
21

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 135

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: So can you update
4 us on warehouses? I do believe that around the city
5 all agencies can be consolidating, not just PD, and I
6 think it would save some money.

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: I think that's
8 a great idea, and we are working closely with DCAS.
9 So I think the best thing would be for us to put
10 together for you an update on what we're doing with
11 DCAS to address the warehouse needs with exactly the
12 goal you're saying, to have it be more
13 state-of-the-art so we don't have issues, and then
14 also to consolidate so that we reduce the footprint.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you. Tow
16 pound, always my question. None in Manhattan. Is that
17 a problem? Are you ever going to find a tow pound in
18 the borough of Manhattan?

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: It continues to
20 be, unfortunately, the same challenge that we had in-

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: The same- since
past-

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: It's just
since- it's unfortunately just the cost of real
estate in Manhattan is really challenging. We've had

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 136

3 a few sites where we thought we might be able to have
4 a somewhat smaller footprint but still have something
5 so that people didn't have to travel quite as far if
6 they were booted or other things like that with their
7 car. Unfortunately, those have fallen through, but we
8 do continue to look with DCAS to see if we can
9 restore a footprint to Manhattan. Okay, just because
10 I had the same question since Cuomo closed Pier 76.
11 That was quite a few years ago. Okay. And then what--
12 NYCHA, the bureau in getting any more money, less
13 money in terms of PSA? That is a really important
14 division of NYPD. The reason I ask is I believe-- I
15 love NYCHA, I love the residents. I strongly believe
16 that if we were to focus on NYCHA, not just you, but
17 in a holistic way, you'd have far fewer issues.

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So I am very proud to
19 tell you that in NYCHA specifically, New York City is
20 having its safest start to the year on record, with
21 major crime there down 10 percent, murders down 43
percent, shooting incidents down 24 percent, shooting
victims down 30 percent, robberies down 24 percent,
and burglaries down 19 percent. The crime story in
NYCHA this year-- or the crime picture in NYCHA this

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 137

3 year is vastly improved from last year. NYCHA and the
4 Bronx are the two places where we are seeing the
5 largest crime reductions, and I give a tremendous--

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing] It
7 was the highest to start with though.

8 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I give a tremendous
9 amount of-- yes, absolutely. And I give a tremendous
10 amount of credit to the chief of Department and the
11 Chief of Crime Control Strategies on their precision
12 policing, which is focusing additional resources
13 where the violent crime occurs. And sometimes you can
14 set a strategy, put a strategy in place and don't see
15 results. And this one, they put the strategy in place
16 and they are driving real results.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: What else is
18 needed for NYCHA?

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Oh, we could have a
20 very long conversation about that, but I think in
21 terms of policing resources, you are seeing very good
outcomes. There's obviously a lot more work that can
be done. I think a lot of it is on the social
services side, but from policing at this time, we

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 138

3 feel like we have the right strategy in place and the
4 right resources to deliver results.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: All right. Thank
6 you.

7 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. Council
8 Member Ressler, followed by Councilmember Banks.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Thank you so
10 much, Chair Lee and Chair Feliz. Appreciate both of
11 your leadership. And Commissioner, it's always good
12 to see you.

13 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Good to see you.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I disagree with
15 you on a number of issues, but I appreciate your
16 competence and the integrity that you've returned to
17 the department. And think that a number of things are
18 moving in a positive direction, and I want to credit
19 you for that. I also just wanna take a moment to
20 shout out Chief Obe and her XO Chief O'Sullivan, who
21 have been really responsive to some of the issues
that we face in the 84, and I'm really grateful for
that. They've made a real effort, and it's been very
much appreciated, so I just want to take a moment to
say something nice before I give you a hard time.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 139

3 Troubled by your response to Chair- Council Member
4 Brooks-Powers' comments- questions around
5 incarceration. You know, just to put a finer point on
6 it, we're about three years away from the opening of
7 the Brooklyn jail. We have twice as many people
8 incarcerated in Rikers right now from Brooklyn as
9 what that jail can accommodate. We need an all-hands
10 approach from the Police Department, from the
11 Department of Correction, from the courts, and from a
12 whole lot of other stakeholders including the
13 council, to work together to drive down incarceration
14 in New York City. And I'd hope that you'd be a
15 partner in that effort so that we can reduce
16 unnecessary incarceration, reduce the amount of time
17 that people are incarcerated, all working together as
18 much as possible to achieve the smaller and safer
19 vision of what Close Rikers is about.

20 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Understood.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I was also deeply
troubled by the data you shared around BHEARD. So
I'll just walk through the data that I think I heard,
and you can correct me if I said something-

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 140

3 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Hold on. I got to
4 get it out.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: You get it out,
6 I'll talk while you get it out. Okay, so 4.3 million
7 calls to 911 annually. You said that in the first 4
8 months of this year, only 17,961 of the calls you
9 received were appropriate for B-HEARD. Is that right?

10 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Hold on. Yeah, Alex
11 says yes, that is correct. So that's about 54,000
12 calls annually. So 54,000 calls out of 4.3 million is
13 that 1.2 percent of calls into 911 are appropriate
14 for B-HEARD according to the Police Department's
15 view.

16 COMMISSIONER TISCH: The total number of
17 each- of nonviolent-

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: [interposing]
19 Totally.

20 COMMISSIONER TISCH: non-weapons calls
21 for emotionally disturbed 2024 was 85,793. So we
believe that up- if you say that that's going to be
constant every year, or, you know, the percentage is
about two percent of 911 calls for service under the
current criteria.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 141

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I had you at 1.2
4 based on the first four months of this year. You're
5 saying in 24 it was a little higher, but in that
6 range. So firstly, I just think for this
7 administration that's taking a different approach,
8 that we want to invest in alternative responses for
9 nonviolent situations, saying that one percent to two
10 percent of our calls is appropriate for B-HEARD, I
11 think is unfortunate. But even more troubling, which
12 is not on your plate, is that for 97 percent of the
13 calls year to date, just 1,411 out of the 17,961
14 calls that were appropriate for Be Heard according to
15 you, just 2.6 percent of those calls were actually
16 responded to by Be Heard. So what—

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] I have
18 1,411 out of 17,961.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Oh, so that's
20 seven percent—

21 COMMISSIONER TISCH: 7.9% from January
22 1st to April 30th.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: That's right. So
24 to put a finer point on all of that, that is 0.01
25 percent of calls that B-HEARD is responding to. 0.01

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 142

3 percent of calls. That is so small, it's a rounding

4 error, it's negligible. Does the program even exist?

5 We're spending gosh knows how many tens, hundreds of

6 millions of dollars on this program. It was

7 functioning at some point. It doesn't seem like it's

8 even functioning today. So we have some questions for

9 the fire department and health and hospitals for why

10 Be Heard is essentially irrelevant. I think that of

11 the lowest of low-hanging fruit in the vision of what

12 the Office of Community Safety can be and eventually

13 the Department of Community Safety to my colleagues-

14 was that nicely done? Thank you, ma'am. The- there's-

15 we got a co-sponsor in the room. This is the lowest

16 of low-hanging fruit, and it's an embarrassment. Can-

17 well, I'll do round two because I talk too much.

18 Brooklyn Central Booking has been a serious problem.

19 I'm grateful that your team has finally confirmed for

20 us this morning that we'll get a tour. We've seen too

21 many fatalities and serious issues there. And in

round two, I'd like to dig in more on response times.

So thank you, Chairs.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 143

3 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. We'll add
4 you to round two. And we— oh no, not yet. And then
5 now we have Council Member Banks. Go ahead.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: Thank you, Chair,
7 and good to see you, Commissioner, to your team. Penn
8 Track, the Penn Track, we still have concerns and
9 frustrations around the Penn Track. If we can get an
10 update for the 42nd Council District as to what's
11 going on. And obviously with the warmer weather that
12 is approaching— well, it's here already, Residents
13 constantly complain about the Penn Track. And I know
14 there's been ongoing stuff, operations back there,
15 but it would be a great idea if you kept the
16 community updated as to what was being done.

17 Obviously not the sensitive stuff, but at least let
18 the community know, the progress that is being made,
19 or if any progress is being made, as opposed to
20 continually see the visual we always see, and that's
21 sex workers walking the streets back there. And also,
if I— let me finish. The issue, you know, there's
been multiple social media videos that have been made
about the Penn Track ongoing— and, you know, this has
continued to put a blight, or it attempts to put a

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 144
3 blight on the 42nd Council District. But if residents
4 are hearing and, and seeing, PD is working on their
5 behest as far as to try to solve this issue. I think
6 that would go a long way with helping out as far as
7 on the PR side or communicating to the community. So
8 if we can get an update, I greatly appreciate that.

9 COMMISSIONER TISCH: The Chief of
10 Department will answer the question.

11 CHIEF LIPETRI: Sure. So obviously,
12 Chris, you know, many, many years in East [sic] New
13 York-

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: [interposing] Yes.
15 Good to see you.

16 CHIEF LIPETRI: Good to see you. You know,
17 dealing with the the Pennsylvania track, you know, in
18 and around that Linden Boulevard area. You're right,
19 it is stubborn and it is somewhat frustrating in
20 that, you know, with the change in the law and a
21 class action lawsuit that happened years ago, it has
hurt our local enforcement, our local enforcement
meaning, you know, the precincts aren't really able
to deal with the actual prostitution/John situation.
But our Vice Enforcement Unit, consistently,

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 145
3 consistently hits the Penn Track, as does our human
4 trafficking team in and around some of those stubborn
hotels, motels, 100 Jersey, things of that nature.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: Right.

6 CHIEF LIPETRI: I've also tasked the
7 precinct commander to put a plan in place to deal
8 with low-level crime in and around those hotels along
9 the Penn Track, meaning the quality of life issues
that we do see-

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: [interposing]
11 Right.

12 CHIEF LIPETRI: that facilitates some of
13 the violence when it comes to, you know, the
14 prostitution. But I will tell you, it is the number
15 one location in the city of New York when it comes to
16 enforcement by our specialty units, namely VICE and
the human trafficking side on VICE.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: I know there was
18 efforts up in Roosevelt also, so if we can get the
19 same type of attention that would definitely- I know
20 it made an impact in that particular district, I
21 believe, from what I've heard. So if we can get that
same type of attention, I'll greatly appreciate it.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 146

3 And the last thing pertaining to the 75th Precinct-
4 You know, I represent close to four commands and
5 therefore the city council, but particularly for the
6 75th Precinct, it's been a long-held complaint or
7 frustration knowing that the 75th Precinct is
8 probably one of the largest commands throughout the
9 entire city. When will we be able to get an
10 opportunity to split that command? You know, on the
11 southern part of the district, we had a major, major
12 increase in population with the housing that's being
13 built on that side. And I believe it's long time
14 needed for the 75th to be split. I mean, it goes all
15 the way from Starrett [sic] City all the way into
16 Jamaica, up in Sandy's district. The residents want
17 that.

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: You don't need to
19 tell the Chief of Department that. He is a former CO
20 of the 75.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: I know he's a-
22 well, I had a great relationship with him when he was
23 the former- so he understands that. We just need to
24 see action. We need to see something done pertaining
25 to that particular issue, because this goes back over

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 147

3 20, 30 years, the need to have the command split,
4 even if it's some type of satellite that was put on
5 the southern side, like in the Gateway area, it would
6 go a long way.

7 CHIEF LIPETRI: I'll just answer very,
8 very quickly. Just like the Police Commissioner talks
9 about the Bronx getting the most resources as far as
10 now two patrol boroughs, by far the 75 gets the most
11 resources in all of Brooklyn North, other than some
12 precincts in the Bronx. And again, you know, I had
13 the most, the most RMPs, I had the most cops, I had
14 the most cameras, I had the most Argus cameras. So,
15 pointed, it is a large command with a lot going on.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: Right.

17 CHIEF LIPETRI: But that's why we put, you
18 know- DI Hines there, has a lot of experience being

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: [interposing] DI
20 Hines is doing a pretty good job.

21 CHIEF LIPETRI: in East New York, and
he's going to do a phenomenal job.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: And I will just ask
Christine to speak about the process to build a new-
to create a new precinct. Go ahead.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 148

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Yeah. So,
4 when we look at, you know, we take into account
5 obviously all the factors in the precinct, the crime,
6 the population, everything you mentioned.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: Yes.

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: But there's
9 also obviously the real estate element of it. The
10 most recent newly built precinct, the 116, was \$108
11 million. So right now we don't have funding for a new
12 precinct, but if that were to move forward, we would
13 need those resources and, you know, work.

14 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I'm also happy to
15 continue conversation with you-

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: [interposing] We
17 look forward to having a sidebar conversation. Thank
18 you.

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. Actually,
21 talking about capital and going into that theme- so
looking at the capital plan, it appears to be heavily
front-loaded with \$432.9 million planned in the
current fiscal year, and then it drops to about \$16.4
million in FY 29. And we know that capital plans are

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 149

3 generally front-loaded, and there are some large
4 capital projects wrapping up in the next few years.
5 Could you generally explain some of the big projects
6 happening in the next few years that drives some of
7 these changes and also give some context on the
8 planning of projects?

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Yes. So part
10 of the reason that it's so front-loaded is, as you
11 mentioned, large projects. So one is, as we mentioned
12 earlier, the infusion of capital funding now for
13 vehicles. So there's a significant amount of funding
14 early in the plan so that we can jumpstart continuing
15 to replace those vehicles. And also our largest
16 single project is also in the early years of the
17 plan, which is Rodman's Neck. So we're working on
18 that, which should be done by the summer of 28. So
19 those are the two biggest things, and then the others
20 are spread out more throughout the plan. What we do
21 when we plan our capital budget, it changes with each
financial plan because we take a look at where we are
in the construction process-

CHAIRPERSON LEE: [interposing] right.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 150

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: and whether or
4 not we have CPs yet. And obviously with the
5 procurement--

6 CHAIRPERSON LEE: [interposing] The
7 drawings been done, and--

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Exactly. So
9 things tend to shift. Certain things we will push
10 out, but then at the same time, OMB works very well
11 with us and they're very flexible. If something's
12 moving more quickly or we have a need earlier than
13 it's reflected in the capital plan, we will look to
14 accelerate those funds.

15 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, perfect. And then
16 for asset forfeiture funding, which I mentioned
17 earlier in the statement-- Preliminary Budget
18 response, council called upon NYPD to utilize the
19 asset forfeiture dollars for eligible costs that
20 expand the investigative resources before calling on
21 city tax levy dollars. So how much asset forfeiture
has NYPD used over the course of this fiscal year,
and what are the costs associated with it?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So right now
we have a balance of about \$52 million in asset

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 151

3 forfeiture. Of that-- and sometimes it's just the
4 timing of how it's drawn down-- of that \$28 million--
5 apologies, \$38 million has already been accounted
6 for, so there's \$14 million balance. So I completely
7 understand the perspective of utilize this first
8 instead of using city funds. We work very closely to
9 establish what is eligible for asset forfeiture.
10 There are very strict guidelines on the uses of asset
11 forfeiture. And the things we utilize it for are
12 things that are really critical to the department--
13 use it for lab supplies and equipment. We use it for
14 critical training for our officers and travel to and
15 from that training as well as supplies and equipment
16 and initiatives tied to investigations. So those are
17 the types of things where if we weren't using this
18 money, we would then have to use city funds.

19 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Right.

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So most of it
21 is actually already accounted for, and then we'll go
forward and replenish those items I just listed. So
if not for using it there, we are in fact not just
trying to hold it to do something. It's just

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 152
3 supplementing the normal things that we would utilize
4 our city funds for as well.

5 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Right.Okay, perfect.
6 And then, the Deputy Speaker had to leave, but she
7 wanted me to ask this question. Another goal of-
8 going back to the, I think, the racial equity plan.
9 Another goal of NYPD's in the preliminary racial
10 equity plan is to quantify, track, and analyze racial
11 disparities in stops, frisks, and searches in an
12 effort to reduce those disparities. This is listed as
13 a medium-term goal to be completed by 2028. Uh, do
14 you have any data on stop and frisk from data
15 collected from the How Many Stops Act that the
16 council passed?

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: So with
18 regard to the How Many Stops Act, as part of that
19 law, we put out data with regard to level 1, level 2,
20 and level 3, and level 3 encounters. So that data is
21 put out, I believe it's quarterly.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: I have the data. So
investigative encounters, 2025 full year, Level 1, \$2
million plus. Level 2, \$31,159. Level 3, \$26,405. For

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 153
context perspective, that number was \$680,000 in
3 2011.

4 CHAIRPERSON LEE:: Which one? Level 3?

5 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yes.

6 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, 680.

7 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So we went from
680,000 Level 3 stops in 2011 to 26,405 Level 3 stops
8 in 2025.

9 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Got it.

10 COMMISSIONER TISCH: And this year, so
far, we have about 16 percent less or fewer stops,
11 Level 3 stops.

12 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, across— okay,
13 Level 3. Okay. Okay, and how will the training
14 initiative goals affect this aspect of the
department's work, and how will this review inform
15 you of the relevant units and commands for
16 retraining?

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Yeah, so
18 we've created something called the Racial Disparities
Review Committee. That's something— it's part of the
19 plan. It's also something we're doing with the
20 Monitor, right? So there's actually— it's the
21

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 154

3 Monitor's— the Monitor team are quite involved and
4 obviously don't want to speak for the Monitor. But
5 what we're doing is we are looking at data, doing
6 that in a very, you know, deliberate way and
7 thoughtful way, working off of a model that the
8 monitors team used and sort of further developing
9 that out ourselves. And in looking at that, you know,
10 to the extent you have outlier commands, we want to
11 understand what's happening. What's driving
12 disparities, and just really in part to understand
13 it, but then, you know, if there are— if there are
14 disparities that we can't account for, making sure we
15 can address them. So we're looking at
16 department-level data, like the department as a whole
17 and trends over time. But then also we want to
18 understand what's happening in any outlier commands.

19 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, great. And then
20 how do you track that data? Is it by borough? Is it
21 by precinct?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: So, again,
we're sort of developing kind of an internal model,
building off of the monitors team's work, and we have
both sort of in-house talent, people we've hired to

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 155

3 work on this. We also have some external help as
4 well. And then again, in sort of- that model is still
5 being built out. We're not there yet. This is a very
6 complicated process, right? It's going to play out
7 over time. But in doing that, we're looking at
8 department-level data. We can look- ultimately, we'll
9 be able to look at borough-level, command-level data,
10 as well. We're not- again, but this is very much a
11 process that's going to play out over many months.

12 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Great. Okay. Thank you
13 so much. And I'll pass it to Chair Feliz.

14 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: Thank you so much,
15 Chair Lee. A few more questions on overtime, and then
16 we'll move on to other issues. And trust me, I wish I
17 did not have to spend this much time talking about
18 overtime, but obviously a big part of the budget,
19 overtime. To what extent do you think increasing
20 headcount can potentially decrease overtime?

21 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Again, there are
trade-offs. So I can't answer that question
specifically. It certainly- if we had a larger
headcount, it certainly would have- would bring down
the overtime budget this summer, for the special

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 156

3 events, meaning we wouldn't have to go to the 12-hour
4 tours. But in other cases, like, it wouldn't make a
5 dent. So for example, if we needed an officer to work
6 2 extra hours for, you know, in a zone, it— larger
7 headcount wouldn't get rid of it. And oftentimes it
8 said that more headcount, more overtime. I don't
9 necessarily believe that to be true, because I
10 believe if you responsibly manage overtime, you can
11 avoid that.

12 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: What would you say are
13 the top three things that need— would have to happen
14 in an ideal world for us to be able to make the dent
15 on the issue of overtime that I think we all want to
16 make?

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I think we have made
18 a dent on the issue of overtime. I think the data
19 that I provided earlier, calendar year 2025 overtime
20 down 12.4 percent, fiscal year 2026 the first three
21 quarters overtime down 10 percent, and the fact that
the fiscal year '26 overtime spend is projected to be
six percent lower than the historical average going
back to 2016, if you put it in today's dollars and if
you exclude the transit program that the the governor

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 157

3 is funding. When we think about overtime, yes, the
4 numbers go up, and that's because the cops rightfully
5 get paid more. And so that increases overtime spend.

6 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: All right, moving on
7 to school safety agents and school crossing guards.
8 Can you give us the new budgeted headcount for school
9 safety agents and crossing guards?

10 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yes, I can. Okay.
11 School safety agents were cut by 264 positions to
12 3,651. Does someone have school crossing guards in
13 front of them? If not, I can get it here. Yes. Hold
14 on, I have it. I have it. Do you have it? School- I
15 don't see it here.

16 UNIDENTIFIED: So we just recently hired
17 94 in May, so that leaves us with 31 vacancies. The
18 allocated budget is \$2,309.

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Kristine, do you
20 have the specific numbers for school safety agents?
21 Sorry, sorry, for school crossing guards.

UNIDENTIFIED: So I have 2,309 for the
allocation. We just hired a class of 94 in May, so
that leaves us with 31 vacancies.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you, Chief.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 158

3 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: All right. Can you
4 tell us how the current headcount compares to the
5 headcount for the last five years for school safety
6 agents and school crossing guards?

7 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Down, but we will
8 get you those specific numbers. Do you— I don't have
9 it by year here. I just have this year.

10 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: And I know we're
11 reducing the school safety agents by 264. Do you
12 think what we have right now is enough?

13 COMMISSIONER TISCH: No.

14 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: If not, why the cut?

15 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I was disappointed
16 about that cut, although I understood it because
17 those were vacant positions. My hope had been to hire
18 up to our previous authorized headcount, and we were
19 looking at a number of different ways to gin interest
20 in taking that test and to have basically more people
21 interested in becoming school safety agents. And the
reason we didn't— we weren't up to headcount is
because we didn't have enough, "qualified"
candidates. So we were looking at a number of
factors, including looking at some of the physical

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 159

3 requirements to become school safety agents, which
4 seemed to be, to my mind, out of line with what the
5 job requires. So I was hoping to make progress
6 increasing the number of school safety agents before
7 this cut occurred. But I do understand that it
8 occurred because those positions were vacant at the
9 time.

10 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: All right. Moving on
11 to ghost cars. So as we know, there's a lot of
12 different agencies that are involved when it comes to
13 enforcing rules related to ghost cars, fake paper
14 plates, and etcetera. And I know there's been some
15 changes. The sanitation department is playing a
16 bigger role. Can you talk to us about the different
17 agencies and the different processes and roles that
18 each play, including the NYPD?

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Sure. The Sanitation
20 Department addresses vehicles that are derelict. So
21 they are below some certain dollar value, some dollar
value, and the sanitation depa- and they're just
sitting on the streets, and the Sanitation Department
has the authority to get rid of them themselves. The
Police Department has a lot going on with ghost cars

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 160
3 and non-derelect vehicles, and Chief Obe can talk to
4 you about some of our enforcement there.

5 CHIEF OBE: Okay. So, with ghost car-
6 ghost plate operations, it's an interagency ghost-
7 interagency initiative. So it's not just done in a,
8 you know, silo, just NYPD. We work very closely with
9 our law enforcement partners, typically along bridges
10 and tunnels. So New York State Police, MTA, the NYPD,
11 PAPD. Year to date, we've had about 19 joint
12 operations, and resulting in 291 arrests, 12,000+
13 summons issued, and 1,278 vehicles seized. In your
14 district, I know that there were some concerns. You
15 know, that work continues along Fordham Road and some
16 of the locations that you gave us. I don't have that
17 specifically. I'll get back to you on that. But the
18 work we do is totally separate from what Sanitation
19 does. We work along bridges and tunnels, and it's a
20 multiagency effort.

21 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: Right. Yeah. So about
two years ago, a while back, had a hearing on the
issue of ghost cars. And we were told that the NYPD
didn't have enough space to tow or to be able to
properly enforce the rule on the issue of ghost cars.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 161

3 Is that still the case? I know you've been working on
4 getting new towing space.

5 CHIEF OBE: So it's totally separate. I
6 know that's what a council member always talks about,
7 but this is totally separate. So as a result of the
8 multi-agency efforts that we have with the other law
9 enforcement agencies, the storage is not an issue for
10 us at all because we tap into the MTA and the TBTA.
11 They have ample space when it comes to storage, so we
12 don't suffer from that problem, separate from that
13 other type of work.

14 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: Okay, good. All right,
15 drones. So, as I mentioned in my opening statement,
16 saw a fascinating video yesterday. Individuals in the
17 Bronx had engaged in gun violence. The local precinct
18 used the drone to basically make sure that they were
19 able to- to make sure they were apprehended quickly.
20 And we're thankful for those officers who were
21 running towards two individuals who had just engaged
in gun violence and also still had loaded weapons.
So, curious, and I know if you can't share this
information for public safety-related reasons, all
fine, understood. But can you talk to us about the

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 162

3 use of drones? Does every precinct have one, or is it
4 some of the cars?

5 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So the Chief of
6 Department is going to answer a lot of the specifics
7 to your question, and our use of drones is amazing. I
8 would just like to say upfront that I would like to
9 expand the Department's use of drones. We do not have
10 drones at every precinct, and I believe we should
11 have drones at every precinct. As the drone
12 management in the city is currently set up, the
13 funding and the overall, like, management of drone
14 expansion is currently at the Department of
15 Information Technology and Telecommunications. And I
16 believe, given that the NYPD is the biggest user of
17 drones and there are such incredible opportunities to
18 use this to- that technology to drive public safety,
19 that we should be in control of our own destiny in
20 terms of expanding our drone program. But the chief
21 will tell you about how great it is.

18 CHIEF LIPETRI: Sure. So obviously I'm
19 not going to get into specific precincts on where our
20 drones are being launched. So we have three areas in
21 Brooklyn, one area in the Bronx, and one area in

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 163

3 northern Manhattan. Each contains two docks which can
4 obviously fly two drones. So the drone can only go
5 out for a specific amount of time, comes back, and we
6 put up the second drone. We've done approximately
7 5,000 flights this year alone, about 4,000 of those
8 5,000 are drones as first responders. Our response
9 time when we put up a drone to the actual 911 call is
10 less than three minutes. It's about 2.5 minutes. The
11 success stories that you're talking about, I can
12 specifically talk about the one you're talking about
13 on May 24th, when yes, there was a response to a
14 shots fired, and yes, we did grab two different
15 individuals with pistols. So it's highly successful.
16 I agree with the Police Commissioner. We're looking
17 to obviously explore and expand our drones. In
18 addition to the 4,000 first responder flights that
19 we've done this year, there's another 1,000 that we
20 used for either missing, you know, beach drone
21 activity, parades, things of that nature. So we are
up and running, and it has been a great tool for us
so far.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Chair, I apologize.
I just found the information you were looking for on

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 164

3 school crossing guards. I just want to make sure that
4 it's in line with what the Chief had previously said.

5 So as of May 13th, we employ 2,290 school crossing
6 guards, including 2,211 level one's and 79 level
7 two's. The budgeted headcount for school crossing
8 guards is 2,309, which breaks out to 2,219 level
9 one's and 90 level two's.

10 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: All right, thank you
11 for that data. Just curious on the issue of
12 technology and drones, in what cases do we use
13 drones? They're more effective for many reasons.
14 They're cheaper, which means you could purchase more.
15 They're faster. If you have more, you could have them
16 in different locations. In what cases do we use
17 drones versus helicopters? I'm sure every New Yorker
18 has heard those helicopters when there's a serious
19 incident?

20 CHIEF LIPETRI: So, look, you know, we
21 obviously know the price difference, right, between
the fuel and things of that nature. I will say this,
when we can put up a drone, that drone's going up.
You know, there are restrictions, and also the
infrastructure sometimes— or I should say, you know,

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 165

3 tight locations, things of that nature. Yeah, we're
4 able to use that drone in between buildings. You
5 know, our emergency service unit uses it tactically
6 for barricaded perpetrators. And, you know, we have
7 approximately 80 drones, and I'm telling you, we use
8 it as much as we can.

9 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: Good. The Executive
10 Plan included \$6.5 million for drone-based grant. How
11 do you plan on utilizing this funding? And also, can
12 you talk to us about the new developments? I know
13 you've been working with the federal government to
14 have more authority to be able to take down drones,
15 which is—

16 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yes, we got \$6.5
17 million from the federal government to use to buy
18 drone mitigation equipment. We have spent that money
19 and purchased the equipment. We also have members of
20 our counterterrorism team trained on using that
21 equipment and trained with the FBI specifically on
22 drone mitigation. So, for the first time at the World
23 Cup this year and events in New York City surrounding
24 the World Cup, the NYPD will be working directly with
25 our federal partners, with our own equipment and our

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 166

3 own personnel on drone mitigation. And I will say
4 that is a very important first step. As for doing it
5 beyond the World Cup, beyond that special event, it
6 is still hazy, and I am not at this time certain how
7 it will work. We are looking forward to the
8 Department of Justice putting out guidelines to— for
9 state and local agents agencies about how they will
10 be setting up our authority to mitigate drones
11 generally.

12 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: All right. So the
13 Taser 10 upgrade. So the plan includes increased
14 funding to move to the newer Taser 10. It's an
15 upgraded and safer Taser with— to my understanding,
16 it has more range, reduced volt capacity, and much
17 more. When will all officers have this new taser? And
18 actually, will all officers have the new taser?

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So ESU has already
20 been completely trained, which is wonderful. And we
21 anticipate completing the training for all other
officers by the end of 2027, although those plans are
preliminary at this time.

CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: A few questions about
recent incidents. So recently, I think it was the

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 167

3 Gothamist reported a woman who was in NYPD custody,
4 and you tell me if the reporting is incorrect in any
5 way- a woman in NYPD custody gave birth while in
6 handcuffs. And according to the Gothamist article,
7 she was arrested on a low-level charge, something
8 that could have potentially been a desk appearance
9 ticket. She was nine months pregnant and yeah, gave
10 birth while in custody. Can you comment and provide
11 any details on this?

12 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA: That
13 young woman, she was arrested for trespass, and we
14 were unable to give her a desk appearance ticket
15 because she was wanted. She had a warrant, an open
16 warrant, and she did not give birth in cuffs. Her
17 cuffs- she was uncuffed by the time she gave birth.
18 Right, yeah, and I know there was a dispute on that
19 on the article, but she gave birth in the courthouse.

20 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA: Yes.

21 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Hold on, I will say
we had- if I recall correctly, and I wish that you-
that I knew that this was going to come up, I would
have brought the specifics of that incident, but my
recollection is that she was brought to the hospital

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 168
3 and was released from the hospital and put back in
4 our custody.

5 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER KINSELLA: Yes.

6 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Okay.

7 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: And what was the open
8 warrant for? And also, what's the policy when it
9 comes to people or individuals who might be pregnant
10 or have medical--

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Yeah, so,
12 Chair, you know, what we will do is we will follow up
13 with you in writing about both the particulars of
14 what occurred, and we can also provide you with any
15 applicable policies. We didn't-- we did not come
16 prepared today to talk about those specifics of this,
17 and I--

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] Hold
19 on. The Chief of Department can speak about policy,
20 the policies, but what I don't want to do is talk in
21 an open forum about a specific individual and a
specific case. So go ahead with the policy.

CHIEF LIPETRI: So the policy is to bring
that individual to the hospital, which the policy was

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 169
3 followed. The hospital then released that individual
4 back to our custody.

5 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: Okay, and what was the
6 open warrant for?

7 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Again, I don't wanna
8 discuss a specific individual's case in an open
9 setting like this.

10 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: Okay. So, a few
11 questions— a few final questions. I know earlier you
12 mentioned there's a new precinct in the Borough of
13 Queens. What are factors that you take into
14 consideration when determining whether to build a new
15 precinct? I'm only asking because I know that some— a
16 few precincts in the Bronx are—

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] Lots
18 of things. The geographical size of the precinct,
19 response times, 911 calls, 311 calls, crime
20 conditions. There is a lot that goes into it.

21 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: Okay. All right. And
last but not least, you know, we've obviously made a
lot of progress on the issue of safety. As we know,
crime has gone down for the most part, shootings
murders, and etcetera. What would you say are the

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 170

top three things that have helped us get there?

3 Police presence, technology, I'm sure also- in your
4 opinion what would be three things that stand out on
5 that?

6 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Could have listed
7 one more and you would have answered the question
8 yourself. You were doing great. I give a lot of
9 credit to the Chief of Department and the Chief of
10 Crime Control's precision policing strategies, not
11 just the zones. What happens is when we see a crime
12 problem, we look at the data and we come up with a
13 very specific data-driven response to it. We have,
14 for example, one response based on the data that we
15 saw to retail theft. Retail theft is down. Another
16 data-driven strategy to burglaries. Burglaries we
17 then came- we saw come down. Same thing for shooting
18 incidents and shooting victims. So I would say
19 largely it has been precision policing, which to my
20 mind is data-driven strategies to address specific
21 types of crime that we see. Second, I agree with you,
the technology has been extremely helpful in our
efforts. And third, and I think most importantly, our
cops are doing incredible work. They are out there

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 171

3 every day. They are engaged. They are carrying out
4 the strategies that we have given them with a lot of
5 nobility and a lot of professionalism. And without
6 their work, we would not see any of the reductions
7 that we are enjoying today. Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: Thank you. And the
9 final question is on the unsafe use of mobility
10 devices. As we know, mobility devices such as
11 e-bikes, scooters, mopeds, they're good. You could
12 easily move around. They reduce traffic. They also
13 reduce air pollution versus, for example, using cars.
14 But we have seen people use them in an unsafe way.
15 And of course, very complex issue. It could be super
16 difficult to enforce the rules. You stop them, they
17 could easily take off, and it's difficult to, you
18 know, engage in a high vehicle pursuit. And also they
19 could obviously move much faster than other cars and
20 enter areas that cars can't enter. Do you think the
21 reckless use of these items are a problem? And if
yes, what's the policy on this?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: So yes, I think it's
a problem, and I think that the data bears it out. I
want to be clear that for reckless driving of these,

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 172

3 you know, smaller mobility devices, we still today
4 can issue criminal summonses for that, and we
5 continue to issue criminal summonses for reckless use
6 of e-bikes and scooters. But for other offenses,
7 like, for example, speeding or running a red light,
8 things that come just short of recklessness, we— or
9 the legal definition of recklessness— we have
10 reverted from issuing C summonses to issuing B
11 summonses based on conversations with City Hall.

12 CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: All right, thank you
13 for the information. I know my colleagues have a
14 second round of questions, so I'll pause here. Thank
15 you.

16 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, Council Member
18 Cabán followed by Wong.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Thank you. For my
20 questions, I just want to address a couple things.
21 The woman who gave birth in cuffs in the courthouse
in Brooklyn, and I'm going to say that because the
cuffs were taken off when the baby was crowning. And
any mother will tell you that labor and birth is much
more and much longer than those final few moments of

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 173

3 when your baby crowns and is actually born. So I
4 would suggest that whoever's giving y'all that line,
5 whoever's working on the PR spin, rethink that one,
6 because that is a terrible answer. I'm emotional just
7 like even- I can't believe that that was the answer
8 that was given. I did wanna correct the record. I
9 know that there was a- it was testified to that the
10 jail population on Rikers consisted of everybody
11 being there on felonies. I just want to say that as
12 of yesterday, the population was 6,652 people, 5,652
13 of which are pretrial, meaning that they are not
14 proven guilty of anything and they are simply there
15 because they cannot afford their bail. 397 of them
16 are there on misdemeanors. 154 of them are there on
17 technical holds. Seven are there on violations, not
18 crimes. Those are not felonies. So I think that's
19 important to have on the record.

20 UNIDENTIFIED: Just if I can just say-

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: And- well, no,
that's not a question. I'm stating that for the
record. I'm going to ask my question now. So I also
wanted to follow up on my first round of questioning
around on sort of the summonses and the arrests. It

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 174

3 was stated that there were three categories, right?

4 The no ID, which was six percent of those processed

5 arrests, and then the other two categories were if

6 they were want- if they had open warrants, and then

7 the third category was if they were potentially going

8 to be charged with a higher offense. So I wanted to

9 hone in on those second and third categories. That

10 second one, for the- if they had open warrants, how

11 many- how much of the time were those open warrants

12 for other summonses or low-level offenses?

13 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I don't have that

14 data with me, but if someone is wanted on an open

15 warrant, it is our responsibility to return them on

16 it.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Well, okay. So I'm

18 going to say that under the law, under CPL 15020,

19 actually, it says that a DAT is discretionary where

20 there is an open warrant. It's actually the Patrol

21 Guide, not the law, that suggests it's mandatory to

take people through a custodial arrest. In fact,

under the law, it would be- it would have to be a

felony open warrant to make custodial appearance

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 175

3 mandatory. So that's why I want to know how— what the
4 percentage of non-ID arrests include felony charges.

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GERBER: Council
6 Member, just one point on that. It's important. Of
7 course, you're right about 150/20. But here's the
8 thing. If we have someone who we encounter, we know
9 the person has an open warrant, and we just let that
10 person go, we do not return them on that warrant, and
11 that person then goes and commits another crime,
12 hurts somebody after we let the person go on an open
13 warrant, right? We are responsible for what happened.
14 It's a massive liability for the Department and for
15 the city. We cannot do that.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: I will tell you
17 that in my experience as a public defender
18 representing people in court, oftentimes when
19 somebody came through, when they got a summons for
20 sleeping on the subway, for an open container, their
21 open warrant was overwhelmingly usually for another
sleeping on the subway or an open container. Not that
they were some crazy threat to our safety. So I just—
I think that context is important when people are
trying to understand actually what it means when

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 176

3 somebody has a warrant, actually what it means when
4 we're spending millions of dollars of resources to
5 police people over these issues while not increasing
6 safety but exacerbating existing problems. So I want
7 to go into that third area of the higher offenses
8 that may be charged. So let's say, somebody is under
9 CPL 15020, eligible for that- an appearance ticket or
10 a desk appearance ticket, and of those higher
11 offenses that you're using the discretion to process,
12 how many of those are for- still under the category
13 of low-level offense? Like, for example, a theft of
14 service. So, like, how many, or the percentage of
15 those that are- you're tracking in that third
16 category are actually other low-level offenses.

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: We will get you that
18 information.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Okay. Can I ask a
20 few more questions?

21 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Can we go to round
three?

COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: What's up?

CHAIRPERSON LEE: I promise, Tiffany, I'm
sorry. I'll come back to you.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 177

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: What's up?

4 CHAIRPERSON LEE: I'm gonna come back to
5 you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: I can't hear you.

7 CHAIRPERSON LEE: I'm gonna come back.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Okay, great. Thank
9 you. As long as you promise to come back.

10 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, Council Member
13 Wong followed by Council-

14 COMMISSIONER TISCH: You guys can go.
15 You guys can go. This is going on a long time. I'm
16 going to excuse the executive staff and the people
17 testifying will stay, but we have a lot going on this
18 summer, and I just can't have them staying here all
19 afternoon.

20 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Sure.

21 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Go ahead.

CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, Council Member
Wong followed by Joseph.

COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: Okay, thank you,
Chairs. Commissioner, auxiliary police officers were

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 178
3 previously promised bullet-resistant vests after the
4 2007 murders of auxiliary officers Pacquiao and
5 Marshallik [sp?], with the city committing \$3.3
6 million for vest purchases and recurring support for
7 new members. My question is, is this— is there a
8 recurring baseline budget item in FY 27 for auxiliary
9 police equipment? Because I looked and looked. I just
10 don't see it. So my question is, is there such an
11 item, and that includes vests, radios, and other
12 safety gear?

13 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Deputy Commissioner
14 Ryan will answer that question.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: Thank you.

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So we did
17 include the request for the equipment for the
18 auxiliary officers as part of our Executive Budget
19 new needs. It was not funded. We will continue to
20 make that request of the Office of Management and
21 Budget.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: I see. Thank you.
23 My next question is, Commissioner, I marched in the
24 Israel— excuse me, Israel Day Parade yesterday, and I
25 want to commend the NYPD for the strong security

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 179

3 presence along the route. The police were visible,
4 proactive, and engaged, and the event proceeded
5 without any significant issues. I saw a substantial
6 deployment that included patrol officers, the
7 Strategic Response Group, counterterrorism personnel,
8 and other specialized resources work together to
9 maintain order and ensure public safety. Given some
10 of the large demonstrations we have seen in recent
11 years that have resulted in disorder, property
12 damage, blocked roadways, or arrests, does the
13 success of Sunday's deployment demonstrate the value
14 of a stronger preventive posture, and should the
15 department be utilizing that model more frequently at
16 large-scale protests and demonstrations?

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Well, our response
18 to protests and First Amendment activity is governed
19 generally by a settlement agreement entered into a
20 few years ago in the Adams administration. But we
21 look at each event based on the unique circumstances
of it, and we design appropriate security packages
accordingly.

COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: I see. Okay. Thank
you. Thank you. Thank you, Chairs.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 180

3 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. Council Member
4 Joseph, then Brewer.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Thank you,
6 Chairs. I have a question around YCO. How many youth
7 coordinators are— do you have within the NYPD?

8 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Hold on. Here we go,
9 I got it. What is it? Can you just answer?

10 CHIEF LIPETRI: It's approximately 200.

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: No, we have the exact
12 number.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: 200?

14 CHIEF LIPETRI: 177.

15 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yep.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: 177, thank you.
17 How many officers that are now YCO have pending
18 investigation of abuse and use of force?

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: We will get you that
20 number.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Thank you. How
many young people have YCO arrested or given summons
to in the current and last year? And what are the
majority charges filed or summons types given to
these young people?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 181

3 COMMISSIONER TISCH: We will- we will have
4 to get that- that specific enforcement data to you,
5 because I don't have enforcement broken out by type
6 of officer?

7 CHIEF LIPETRI: If I could just give a
8 general statement.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Go ahead, give me
10 general, and then I would love to see a breakdown.

11 CHIEF LIPETRI: Yes, ma'am. The arrests
12 of juveniles is at its highest level for serious
13 crime-

14 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: [interposing] Oh,
15 I know.

16 CHIEF LIPETRI: and we are at our lowest
17 level for low-level crime.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Okay, and you'll-

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: [interposing] We will
20 get you the specifics.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: send me a
breakdown of what that looks like?

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yes.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 182

3 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: And what are we
4 doing as NYPD and other agencies to combat young
5 people?

6 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yes.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. Council
9 Member Brewer, followed by Restler.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you. Also on
11 the youth officers, it's more for me coordination,
12 because the young people leave the high school.
13 Unfortunately, there's a lot of morning smoking,
14 lunch smoking, after-school smoking, etc., in the
15 neighborhood. And the youth officers get stuck with
16 this responsibility, although I think it's more the
17 Department of Education that should be out there
18 talking to the young people. So I've actually tried
19 to get some officers, some people from DOE to go out,
20 et cetera. So my question to you is, because people
21 in the neighborhood complain understandably on their
stoop, in the community gardens, and so on. So I
guess my question is, what is the coordination
between— even though we work at it at the precinct
level, I think DOE should be doing more. So I'm just

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 183

3 wondering, at what point do you say to DOE, enough? I
4 mean, this is more of a policy issue than a numbers
5 issue, but it is creating a lot of havoc
6 unnecessarily. I'm just wondering what you think
7 should be the policy there.

8 COMMISSIONER TISCH: You have a thought
9 on this?

10 CHIEF LIPETRI: Yeah, so I'll just give
11 you general terms again.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Well, I hear- I
13 appreciate it. It's pretty constant.

14 CHIEF LIPETRI: So we had revamped our
15 Juvenile Crime Strategies Desk to take that- what
16 you're talking about, and make it front and center.
17 And we just had a meeting chaired by the director
18 that oversees the Juvenile Crime Strategies Desk, who
19 is- who's an ex-prosecutor with all the stakeholders
20 when it comes to juvenile crime- DOE, ACS, obviously
21 the prosecutors not only on the family court side,
22 Corp Counsel side, but on the DA's side, on the youth
23 part side. Juvenile probation- it was an outstanding
24 meeting. It was an all-day meeting. I actually went
25 and spoke. So we are really, really trying to focus

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 184

3 on the two sides. The at-risk side, where that is not
4 what we're looking to do as far as arrests. We're
5 looking to-- we're looking to visit that family. We
6 call them youths at risk. And then, unfortunately, on
7 the other side, when it comes to violent crime, you
8 know, there has to be consequences. There has to be
9 consequences.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I just want to be
11 kept up to date for how we can work on it together
12 because it's constant.

13 CHIEF LIPETRI: Yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you.

15 CHIEF LIPETRI: Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. Restler
17 followed by Banks.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I timed that
19 well. Thank you very much to the Chairs. Thank you
20 again, Commissioner. So the last time I raised this
21 with you, I appreciated that unlike your
predecessors, you acknowledge that response times is
not-- are not where you'd like them to be and are a
serious issue, and you're working to improve them.
And, you know, we've continued to see-- I think in the

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 185

3 most recent MMR, end-to-end response times were 14
4 minutes and six seconds, up from 10 minutes prior to
5 the pandemic. And most importantly to me, the
6 critical crimes in progress end-to-end, we're looking
7 at nine minutes and 10 seconds, prior to the
8 pandemic, six minutes and 44 seconds. And the times
9 prior to the pandemic had been very consistently in
10 that six-minute-plus range. We're now looking at
11 something that's much higher. There has been some
12 improvement, but we still have a ways to go.

13 Commissioner, what's the plan to address this?

14 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I think it's hiring
15 up to headcount. We need to get the number of people—
16 we— for too many years, the department had authorized
17 headcount and then did nothing with it, meaning
18 didn't hire people to fill those vacancies. And
19 those same people say that it's terrible that we
20 haven't hired 5,000 additional officers. Okay.

21 Separately, I think we are— I am confident that we
are going to see the fruits of our hiring of these
4,000 additional officers come to bear starting next
fiscal year when they will be in precincts responding
to 911 calls for service. Right now, all of these new

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 186

3 rookie officers are doing their first year, 18 months
4 of training on footposts, but they are not in
5 precincts responding to 911 calls for service. And
6 starting in June, we are going to be moving the first
7 tranche of them into those assignments. So, I hope to
8 start to see 911 response time come down as a result.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I appreciate
10 that. And I- you know, you've expressed this to me
11 before, that you think that will make a difference.
12 We saw the end-to-end response times increased by
13 40-plus percent from pre-pandemic to now. They're
14 slightly down from the worst points in the Adams
15 administration, but still not in a good place. We
16 didn't see a 40 percent modification in headcount. We
17 saw a single-digit percentage modification in
18 headcount. So, could you just help me understand why
19 have things changed so dramatically? Chief, you want
20 to jump in here?

21 CHIEF LIPETRI: Yes. So unfortunately,
22 you know, the Commissioner hit it when she said
23 lowest level of shootings, murders. But
24 unfortunately, crime is still up 25 percent from
25 pre-pandemic, which means we're responding to a lot

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 187

3 more violent crime than we had in the past. Meaning
4 those complainants, you know, the reports that the
5 officers take, they take a lot of time. They take a,
6 you know- it all starts with a field investigation,
7 and we want good customer service. I want the best of
8 the best customer service. That's what I demand.
9 That's what the Police Commissioner demands. So a 25
10 percent increase in crime from pre-pandemic means
11 that we are responding to a lot more serious crime,
12 which takes more time to deal with that complaint.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I would love to
14 dig in with this with you further to better
15 understand those trends and what you're seeing and
16 how that is impacting response times.

17 CHIEF LIPETRI: If I could just make one,
18 one, one real example.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Please.

20 CHIEF LIPETRI: Let's take-

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: [interposing] I
have 25 seconds. [inaudible]

CHIEF LIPETRI: Let's take [inaudible] up
175 percent from pre-pandemic. That takes a lot of
time. Alarm on a car, you know, a lot of paperwork-

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 188

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: [interposing]

4 No, no, I understand. I understand what you're
5 saying. I get it. I would love to dig in with you
6 though and understand where those trends are
7 happening, what types of issues, and what we can do
8 to mitigate them. The last thing I just want to ask,
9 and this is a pet peeve of mine- we have a, I think,
10 global international retailer. I won't shout them out
11 here, but they're from Canada. They're based in our
12 district. They kind of famously have policies that
13 are around no chase, no intervention policy when
14 people steal from them. And so in one of my
15 precincts, three or four commanding officers in a row
16 have made the same staffing decision where they
17 station two cops outside of this business all day,
18 every day. And I- as I understand it, it's for
19 CompStat purposes, that it's to try to reduce the
20 crime that's coming from that business to drive down.
21 And it's just like, for me, I would much rather have
those two cops in the heart of downtown Brooklyn
rather than standing outside of this business,
keeping the whole neighborhood safe rather than doing
the bidding, you know, basically working for free.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 189

3 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Well, officers
4 should not be doing- if you're implying that they're
5 doing like private detail-

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I'm not. I mean,
7 I think they're functioning as a private detail, but
8 I think that the reason that they're- that three or
9 four commanding officers in a row- so I'm not
10 showing, throwing any specific commanding officer
11 under the bus, that they've stationed them outside of
12 this business is because the business has a no-chase,
13 no-intervention policy on thefts. And so to reduce
14 the number of thefts so their crime stat numbers
15 aren't bad, they just keep two of the officers in
16 front of this freaking store every day.

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Chief of Department
18 will talk to you about that.

19 CHIEF LIPETRI: So, they should not be
20 stationary in front of a store. They momentarily,
21 for, you know, an amount of time-

COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: All day, every
day.

CHIEF LIPETRI: I understand.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 190

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: And you know the
4 business?

5 CHIEF LIPETRI: I know exactly.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: You know who I'm
7 talking about?

8 CHIEF LIPETRI: I know exactly who you're
9 talking about.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Some people here
11 might [inaudible].

12 CHIEF LIPETRI: It should be at least a
13 block, a block foot post where those officers walk up
14 and down the block. There are times that they're
15 going to--

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: [interposing]
17 Inside a mall.

18 CHIEF LIPETRI: I understand. I'll be
19 [inaudible]. I'm very well versed on it. With, you
20 know, the CompStat, message that you said, I will
21 tell you this. The message from myself, the Chief of
Department and all the executives is you did not run
your command for CompStat. If you run your command
for CompStat, you will no longer be a commander. It's

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 191

3 a process, and the process is at the right place. But
4 I understand your concerns.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I love CompStat.
6 I'm not here to criticize CompStat. I just think that
7 when we're managing toward it, we have problems. I
8 appreciate your comments, and I hope you look into
9 this issue involving this corporation that you know
10 well across the city, because I can't imagine I'm the
11 only one who sees it.

12 CHIEF LIPETRI: I understand.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. Okay, so I
15 know we're past, the Commissioner's hard stop time,
16 so, we look forward to hearing— we'll get the rest of
17 members' questions to you and look forward to getting
18 those responses back.

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON LEE: And I just want to say
21 thank you to all of you for being here.

COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON FELIZ: Yeah. Thank you.
Thank you so much for being here. Thank you for all
the data.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 192

[break]

3 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, are you guys
4 ready? Good? On your end, Commissioner? You're good
5 on your end? Okay. Do I just go? All right. Okay. I
6 don't think I need it. Okay, I'll do this just in
7 case. Okay, so good afternoon and welcome to the
8 second FY27 Executive Budget hearing for the day
9 focusing on the Fire Department of New York. I'm
10 Council Member Linda Lee, and I am pleased to be
11 joined by my colleague, Council Member and Chair of
12 the Committee on Fire and Emergency Management, uh,
13 Joann Ariola. Today we have been joined by Council
14 Member Brewer, Council Member Wong, Council Member
15 Paladino, Council Member Banks, and I believe that's
16 it. Okay, so welcome to our amazing FDNY Commissioner
17 and you and your team. And thank you all for joining
18 us today to answer any questions. On May 12th, 2026,
19 the administration released the executive financial
20 plan for FY27 to FY30, with a proposed FY27 budget of
21 \$124.7 billion. The FDNY's proposed FY27 budget of
\$2.67 billion represents 2.1 percent of the
administration's proposed FY27 budget in the
executive plan, and this is an increase of \$23.8

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 193
3 million or 9.9 percent from the \$2.65 billion
4 originally budgeted in the FY27 preliminary plan.
5 This increase results from several actions: increased
6 fire prevention staffing funding, 14 new fire
7 inspectors, 84 additional civilian staffing, and an
8 increase of approximately \$92 million in EMS
9 projected revenue. As of April 26th, FDNY's headcount
10 was 562 positions less than their fiscal 26 budgeted
11 headcount. In the council's preliminary budget
12 response, we called on the mayor to add \$28 million
13 to FDNY in revenue re-estimates in two areas: the
14 foreign fire insurance tax and fire prevention liens.
15 In addition, we called on the administration to
16 address the chronic pay disparity for emergency
17 medical service workers, chronic overtime spending
18 and the ongoing EMS staffing crisis impairing the
19 city's response time. We were pleased to see that our
20 request for the revenue re-estimates were included in
21 the plan, but the issue surrounding pay parity
remains to be solved. EMS workers respond to the same
life-threatening emergencies as their firefighting
colleagues, yet continue to earn significantly less,
not just compared to FDNY firefighters, but compared

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 194

3 compared to EMS personnel in virtually every other
4 major city in the country. The result is an attrition
5 crisis averaging nearly 8.3 percent annually, leaving
6 the department perpetually understaffed. The council
7 proposed \$50 million in baseline funding to begin
8 closing this gap, and the Executive Budget does not
9 include this investment. I look forward to hearing
10 from the Commissioner on when New York City's EMS
11 workforce can expect to be compensated in a manner
12 that reflects the value of the work that they do.
13 And now I want to turn it over to my co-chair for
14 this hearing, Joann Ariola, for her opening
15 statement.

16 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Thank you, Chair.

17 Good afternoon and welcome to the fiscal year 2027
18 Executive Budget hearing for the New York City Fire
19 Department. I am Council Member Joann Ariola, and I
20 am Chair of the Committee on Fire and Emergency
21 Management. Today this committee is holding a hearing
for one reason, and that is to get answers. We are
here to understand whether this budget truly reflects
the needs of the brave men and women of the FDNY and
whether the promises that have been made to

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 195

3 firefighters, EMS personnel, and the people of the
4 City of New York are being fulfilled. Among the
5 issues we'll examine today are EMS pay increases, the
6 long-overdue implementation of the fifth firefighter,
7 and the status of critical infrastructure
8 improvements throughout the department. For years,
9 our EMS members have been asked to do more with less.
10 They answer hundreds of thousands of calls annually,
11 provide life-saving medical care under extraordinary
12 circumstances, and serve in an indispensable part of
13 our emergency response system, yet they continue to
14 be compensated at levels that fail to reflect the
15 value of their work. We need answers about what steps
16 are being taken to achieve fair pay for these workers
17 and how this administration intends to recruit and
18 retain the next generation of EMS professionals. We
19 will also once again discuss the need for the fifth
20 firefighter on engine companies, which, as we all
21 know, is not a luxury. It is a safety issue. Every
second matters in a fire, and every firefighter
deserves the staffing levels necessary to perform
their duties safely and effectively. The question
before us is simple: what concrete steps are being

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 196

3 taken to move this initiative forward? And finally,
4 we must address the condition of the department's
5 facilities. In 2025, the FDNY publicly stated that
6 approximately \$940 million had been allocated for
7 capital improvement to firehouses and related
8 infrastructure. Yet, as we review the city's
9 financial plans, many of these projects appear to
10 have been pushed further and further into the out
11 years, in some cases extending through 2035. New
12 Yorkers deserve to know why. Our firefighters are
13 willingly putting their lives on the line every day.
14 They run into burning buildings while others are
15 running out. They work through natural disasters,
16 emergencies, and tragedies without hesitation. They
17 never ask for anything and rarely complain about the
18 conditions they are left with at the firehouse. At
19 the very least the city can do is ensure they return
20 to firehouses that are safe, modern, and fit for the
21 men and women who serve there. No firefighter should
be forced to eat, sleep, work in facilities plagued
by leaking roofs, apparatus floors ready to collapse,
and deteriorating conditions because of long-delayed
repairs. Deferred maintenance is not merely a budget

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 197

3 issue. It is a quality of life issue, a moral issue,
4 and ultimately a public safety issue. Today, this
5 committee expects clear answers, clear timelines, and
6 clear commitments. The FDNY is the most respected
7 department in the world. The Fire Department, EMTs,
8 paramedics, and civilian personnel who serve this
9 city deserve an administration that keeps their
10 promises. I would like to thank our committee staff
11 for their hard work: Financial Analyst Tanvir Singh
12 [sp?], Assistant Director Jack Storey, Committee
13 Counsel Josh Kingsley, Policy Analyst Will Hongash
14 [sp?], and my amazing Chief of Staff Phyllis
15 Incirillo [sp?]. I would like to welcome and thank
16 Commissioner Bonsignore and our firefighters, EMTs,
17 paramedics, and the department's civilian staff for
18 the work that you do. I look forward to a candid and
19 productive discussion, and I thank the Commissioner
20 and the Department for the leadership and for
21 appearing here before us today. I would now turn back
to Committee Counsel for swearing in.

CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, just really
quickly before we get started, just wanted to remind
folks that, we have the executive— all of the

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 198

3 hearings for public testimony on Wednesday, June
4 10th, beginning at 9:30. So Wednesday, beginning June
5 10th at 9:30, we are going to have an all-day-long
6 festival for public testimony. So, if you have folks
7 that, you know, want to sign up, please make sure
8 that they do. And with that, I will send it over to
9 our Committee Counsel for swearing in.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Good afternoon. Do
11 you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and
12 nothing but the truth before this committee and to
13 respond honestly to council member questions?
14 Commissioner Bonsignore?

15 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: I do.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Deputy— First Deputy
17 Commissioner Flynn?

18 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FLYNN: I do.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chief Esposito?

20 CHIEF ESPOSITO: I do.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chief Miano?

CHIEF MIANO: I do.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Deputy Commissioner
Christoff?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: I do.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 199

3 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chief Woods?

4 CHIEF WOODS: I do.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chief Currao?

6 CHIEF CURRAO: I do.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And Assistant
Commissioner Dukakis [SP?]?
8

9 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: I do.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And Assistant
Commissioner Noonan?
11

12 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NOONAN: I do.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: You may begin.

14 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: Good afternoon.

15 Good afternoon, Chair Ariola and members, and Chair
16 Lee and members of the Fire and Emergency Management
17 Committee. My name is Lillian Bonsignore, and I'm
18 pleased to appear before you today to discuss the
19 Executive Budget for the Fire Department. I am joined
20 by First Deputy Commissioner Daniel Flynn, Chief of
21 Department John Esposito, Chief of EMS Paul Miano,
Deputy Commissioner of Management and Budget Lizette
Christoff, Chief of Fire Operations Kevin Woods,
Chief of Fire Prevention Thomas Currao, Associate
Commissioner of Workforce Development Nafeessah

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 200

3 Noonan, and Assistant Commissioner for Facilities
4 Paul DeRocchis. This coming Wednesday, is FDNY Medal
5 Day, which is an event that we hold each year on the
6 steps of City Hall to recognize the life-saving
7 efforts of the FDNY members. Before we get into the
8 dollars and cents of the fiscal year 2027 budget, I'd
9 like to briefly highlight the Fire Department— the
10 way the Fire Department funding translates into a
11 tangible, real-world services. Among this year's
12 medal recipients will be Firefighter John Palmer from
13 Ladder 144. In the early mornings of September 12,
14 2025, Ladder 144 responded second due to a reported
15 fire in a two-story flat roof private dwelling in
16 College Point. When they arrived at the fire, a woman
17 said her father was trapped inside. Firefighter
18 Palmer and the inside team masked up and made their
19 way into the second floor where they were met with
20 high heat and zero visibility. At the top of the
21 stairs, they encountered a locked apartment door
which was difficult to force given the fire
conditions and the size of the landing. Working with
a fellow member of Ladder 144, Firefighter Palmer was
able to force the door open and began a search inside

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 201

3 the apartment. He located an inward-opening door and
4 found an unconscious 65-year-old man laying on his
5 back on the floor of what Firefighter Palmer
6 determined was a bathroom. Working with Firefighter
7 Rafael Hernandez, they were able to remove the
8 unresponsive man to the exterior landing where he was
9 passed off to others and received emergency medical
10 care outside that building. For saving a life under
11 extraordinarily challenging circumstances,

12 Firefighter Palmer will be receiving the Probationary
13 Firefighter Thomas A. Wiley Medal. A second medal
14 recipient this year is EMS Deputy Chief Joseph
15 Nocerino [sp?]. Chief Nocerino was on his way to work
16 one early morning last December when he spotted smoke
17 and diverted his route to investigate. In the Coney
18 Island section of Brooklyn, he discovered a home
19 engulfed in flames. After calling in the incident,
20 requesting resources to the scene, he entered the
21 building, braving the smoke and the flames to alert
building occupants. After clearing the first and
second floor, he closed the interior door to slow the
spread of fire. Upon arrival of fire units, Chief
Nocerino provided information to the members to

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 202
3 assist in attacking the fire and then coordinated an
4 18-unit EMS response, organizing a variety of
5 specialized personnel and ensuring the civilians he
6 had evacuated received appropriate care. For risking
7 his own safety to rescue members of the public, he
8 will be receiving the Chief Ulysses Grant Leadership
9 Medal. In addition to Firefighter Palmer and Chief
10 Nocerino, 50 of their firefighting and EMS colleagues
11 will be receiving medals for their heroic acts of
12 bravery. As to the numbers themselves, I'm pleased to
13 report that Mayor Mamadani's Executive Budget
14 provides the Fire Department with an expansion of
15 resources in several areas. It calls for a
16 significant civilian headcount restoration, providing
17 748,000 in fiscal year 26 and approximately \$9
18 million in fiscal year 27. This funding amounts to 84
19 individuals, and we anticipate that it will go
20 towards bolstering several units, including
21 facilities maintenance, information technology, and
procurement. The Fire Department will also receive an
increase in headcount within the Bureau of Fire
Prevention. As part of the Streamlining Procedures to
Expedite Equitable Development, SPEED Task Force, the

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 203
3 department will receive \$1.3 million in fiscal year
4 26 and out years to hire 11 staff members for the
5 Fire Alarm Plan Review and Inspection Unit, and three
6 staff members for the Emergency Planning and
7 Preparedness Group. These additions will help the
8 units process plan applications, speed up
9 inspections, and help the bureau more efficiently
10 process requests from members of the public who are
11 looking to open a new business, renovate an existing
12 business, or build new facilities. The budget also
13 includes a restoration to the Fire Department and the
14 expansion of the Behavioral Health Emergency
15 Assistance Response Division, known as B-HEARD. This
16 program is part of New York City's commitment to use
17 a health-centered approach to individuals
18 experiencing mental health crisis. The budget
19 reverses the previous administration's decision to
20 transfer funding away from the Fire Department, and
21 provides funding of nearly \$2 million in Fiscal Year
26, and approximately \$4.8 million in Fiscal Year 27,
\$6 million in Fiscal Year 28, and \$6.7 million in
Fiscal Year 29 and out. The Mayor's Executive Budget
also includes numerous smaller adjustments to

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 204

3 technical initiatives. This includes additional
4 funding for motor fuel, heating fuel, utilities, and
5 lease adjustments. On the capital side, we also
6 received a new need of \$24.3 million to support six
7 roofs and waterproofing projects, and \$6.75 million
8 in fiscal year 27 to support the purchase of 15
9 emergency response vehicles. In addition to new
10 capital funding, we also received accelerations of
11 out-year capital in the upcoming two years of the
12 capital plan to enable the department to move forward
13 on critical projects and purchases, including \$16
14 million across fiscal year 27 and fiscal year 28 to
15 replace emergency support vehicles, \$11.7 million in
16 fiscal year 27 to expand fleet maintenance capacity,
17 \$1.7 million in fiscal year 27, and \$10.1 million in
18 fiscal year 28 for multi-component renovations at EMS
19 Station Four, \$10.5 million in fiscal year '27 to
20 replace the apparatus floor at Engine Company 163,
21 \$6.8 million in fiscal year 27 to replace our air
compressor at the Mass Services Unit. When I was here
for the Department's Preliminary Budget hearing, we
spoke about the Department's savings plan and
determined to save— and our determination to save

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 205

3 taxpayer money without negatively affecting fire or

4 EMS operations. I am gratified that the mayor's

5 Executive Budget accomplishes this by creating three

6 areas of savings that do not affect operations or

7 negatively impact Fire Department members. The first

8 initiative increases EMS revenue by enabling the

9 Department to collect payment for treatment in place.

10 Under existing practice, if an ambulance responded to

11 a medical call, provided treatment, stabilized the

12 patient, but the patient ultimately decided to refuse

13 transportation to the hospital, the Department was

14 entirely unable to bill for that care. However,

15 Medicaid will soon begin reimbursing emergency

16 medical service providers for the provision of care

17 without transport, and the Fire Department will begin

18 collecting payment for treatment in place and seeing

19 the benefits of this practice. The second component

20 of the department savings plan is a periodic increase

21 in EMS ambulance fees. Ambulance rates are adjusted

every few years based on the actual cost of operating

EMS. These rates were last adjusted about three years

ago. The current rate proposal reflects cost updates

experienced since that time. This includes a variety

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 206

3 of increases in costs borne by the department,
4 including but not limited to spending on auto parts,
5 maintenance staff, IT support staff, and maintenance
6 agreements, costs association with- associated with
7 purchase of vehicles, and EMS labor costs. We
8 understand that these costs may present a challenge
9 for some patients, and we have programs for self-pay
10 patients who are unable to pay their bill. This
11 includes a charity care program as well as a
12 settlement program. Finally, the third savings
13 initiative identified achieved savings of
14 approximately \$800,000 in fiscal year 26 and \$2.2
15 million in fiscal year 27, and out through
16 renegotiation of our telecommunication contracts. We
17 achieved this savings by finding efficiencies and
18 reducing costs. As a mayoral agency, we strive to be
19 good stewards of municipal funding, providing the
20 best possible service to the public and not spending
21 unnecessarily. With this savings plan, we believe
that we've achieved the appropriate balance. I want
to thank Chair Ariola for your ongoing assistance and
support. I've now met with many of the members of the
Fire and Emergency Management Committee, and I've had

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 207

3 a chance to see many of you in your own districts and
4 learn about the different needs and priorities of the
5 neighborhoods you represent. Our efforts to protect
6 New Yorkers are strengthened when we coordinate with
7 our government partners, and we have the recent
8 upward trend- as we have the recent upward trends of
9 fatal fires in the Bronx. I'm encouraged by the
10 passion and enthusiasm of this committee, and I have
11 confidence that we will achieve great gains by
12 working together. I am pleased that this Executive
13 Budget provides funding that expands our operations,
14 restores critical personnel who support and carry out
15 those operations. This budget will enhance the Fire
16 Department service of the public, both from a
17 regulatory and preventative standpoint, as well as
18 from a critical life-saving emergency standpoint. We
19 have achieved savings without harming our ability to
20 carry out our mission of protecting life and
21 property, and we strive to provide the best possible
service to the people of New York. I would have- I
would be happy to answer any questions you have at
this time.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 208

3 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Great, thank you. We've
4 also been joined by Council Member- did I say Banks
5 already? I'll say you again just in case. De La Rosa,
6 Council Member Avilés, J. Sanchez, Restler, and
7 Maloney. Did I miss anyone? Oh, I already mentioned
8 Council Member Paladino. Okay, all right, so I'm
9 going to focus mostly on three areas. First one being
10 B-HEARD. As former Chair of the Mental Health
11 Committee, and as a social worker myself, this is a
12 very, very important program. And I know that there
13 seemed to be some back and forth, obviously, with it
14 being with you all and then with DOHMH and now back
15 to FDNY. And so, just wondering, a few questions
16 around the budget with this. I remember when the
17 program first came out, they had budgeted about \$50
18 million, and then in the first year, I think it was
19 about \$22 million or so that they had actually
20 utilized. And so, wanting to get a sense of where
21 things are at with the Executive Budget and B-HEARD.
So I believe they transferred the funding, which grew
from \$1.98 million in FY26 to \$6.7 million in the out
years, with headcount expanding from 44 to 84
positions. What specifically prompted the transfer?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 209

3 Was it driven by performance issues, management? Was
4 it just better put under FDNY? Did it make more sense
5 to have it with EMS? And how are those being
6 addressed?

7 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: Thank you for
8 your question. So B-HEARD is a very important
9 program. Obviously, it's one of these programs that
10 really take a combination of people and they do a
11 very difficult job for a community that needs
12 specific help. And we were happy to get it back. So,
13 in the previous administration, the idea was to have
14 this unit transferred to H&H, Health and Hospitals.
15 And when I came back, we were able to have these
16 conversations around the best fit for it, and we were
17 able to have it back-- sent back to the FDNY. And
18 we're excited about that. We think it's a tremendous
19 program and it's got huge potential. So as far as the
20 budget, pertaining to B-HEARD, I'm going to pass this
21 over to Commissioner Christoff to talk about the
numbers for you.

CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: Yeah, you
had the numbers right in terms of what was added back

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 210
3 into our budget. I think earlier you referenced these
4 larger numbers that had been in the budget before.
5 Part of that has to do with a differential that EMS
6 members get for taking mental health training. And so
7 the numbers that you just stated in Exec don't
8 include that differential, because that differential
9 stayed in our budget even when that transfer had
10 happened to H&H. So currently all EMS members, once
11 they've completed the training, are eligible for the
12 differential.

13 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. Which I've
14 actually attended the training before, and it's very,
15 very comprehensive, and it's great to see how the
16 social workers, EMS, H&H staff are all sort of
17 working together on that. Were there any service
18 gaps or disruptions to B-HEARD operations during the
19 transition period, and how were those being
20 addressed?

21 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: There were no
22 disruptions throughout. At one point the unit was
23 actually starting to disband. But when we came back
24 in, we took it back and we're building it back to
25 where it was before. So we continued to run B-HEARD

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 211
3 units throughout this conversation about where it was
4 going to land.

5 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. And I know that in
6 the beginning, especially when the program first
7 started up, and as you alluded to, this is a very
8 niche sort of program that deals with very
9 underserved communities. And so, just wanting to know
10 how has it been in terms of staffing up and getting
11 enough teams that are able to appropriately meet the
12 needs of the folks that need this help on the ground?
13 Because I know that it was tough in the beginning to
14 recruit folks to take on this work. And so just
15 wanted to hear if you had any updates on that. And in
16 terms of also from 44 to 84 positions, do you
17 anticipate any issues there in terms of staffing up?

18 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: Yeah, I'll turn
19 this over to our Chief of EMS Operations, Paul Miano,
20 to talk you through the operational portion.

21 CHIEF MIANO: How are ya? As the
Commissioner previously stated, we were preparing to
disband B-HEARD, but without any service gaps. But
that did mean we did start to send some units- some
members out into the field and to other positions.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 212

3 Since we- since Commissioner coming back and taking
4 back B-HEARD to the Fire Department, we have rehired
5 those members back into B-HEARD, and our staffing
6 remains consistent. And it- again, B-HEARD, we don't
7 just pick people to go to B-HEARD. It's an
8 application process. So whenever we put out a posting
9 for it, we get people who want to be a part of the
10 unit. It's something that the- our members feel very
11 passionate about. So they apply to be a part of the
12 unit. And as we have those postings and we're able to
13 have those trainings that you attended, we're going
14 to fill all of those spots that we had originally
15 started to put people out into the field for.

16 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. So no
17 anticipation of having issues filling that position?
18 Hopefully, like, as you mentioned, it's- I get that
19 it's a volunteer application process. So no
20 anticipation, and I mean-

21 CHIEF MIANO: [interposing] I don't
believe so. We have a lot of people who are members
of EMS who feel very passionately about that program.

CHAIRPERSON LEE: Perfect. Okay. And can
you break down the titles? How many are clinicians,

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 213
3 EMS co-responders, and how many are administrative or
4 supervisory?

5 CHIEF MIANO: So right now we have a
6 total of 62 Fire Department EMS members assigned to
7 B-HEARD. The majority of them are our EMTs, and we do
8 have sergeants and lieutenants also assigned. So
9 that's going to be 28 sergeants and- combination of
10 28 sergeants and lieutenants that we have assigned to
11 B-HEARD, and 34 EMTs that are assigned to B-HEARD.

12 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, 34 EMTs. And
13 what's the total cost now of B-HEARD program
14 inclusive of all the funding sources, not just the
15 transferred city-funded portion shown in the
16 executive budget?

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: So for
18 the current year, fiscal 26 it's about \$4 million
19 when you add the two components. That's just the Fire
20 Department piece. So the social workers, for example,
21 are actually part of the Health + Hospitals budget.

CHAIRPERSON LEE: H+H right?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: Yes. So
you don't see that part in our budget numbers.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 214

3 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Right. Okay. And do you
4 know what that total budget is overall?

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: I don't
6 know what the agency-

7 CHAIRPERSON LEE: [interposing] Between
8 the different agencies?

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: budget
10 piece is.

11 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. And the Capital
12 Plan includes \$1.1 million for 20 Type 2 ambulances
13 for B-HEARD in FY 32. Why is that vehicle acquisition
14 so far out in the plan, and are there current B-HEARD
15 units adequate in the interim?

16 CHIEF MIANO: The B-HEARD unit has
17 received- the ambulances in the B-HEARD unit, or the
18 vehicles that they use, are custom for B-HEARD, and
19 they are fairly new. So I- without knowing the exact
20 cycle of replacement, the ones that they are in are
21 not- they're not- they're not very old ambulances or
vehicles.

CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, which is, you
know, basically why you're saying it's probably that

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 215
3 far out not in FY '32, because the current vehicles
4 are adequate?

5 CHIEF MIANO: Yeah.

6 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. And then just in
7 terms of the geographic coverage, does the funding in
8 the Executive Budget bring the program to a point
9 where it can operate in all five boroughs on a 24/7
10 basis?

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: So there
12 is additional funding in the out years, as you
13 mentioned. The funding does grow. We're currently in
14 conversations with our interagency partners about
15 potential expansion plans going forward.

16 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. And how many
17 boroughs does it currently cover? Is it all five
18 right now?

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: Four

20 CHIEF MIANO: It's four right now.

21 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay.

CHIEF MIANO: Staten Island.

CHAIRPERSON LEE: Oh, okay. We got to
figure that one out too. And what percentage of
mental health-related 911 calls? We just had the NYPD

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 216

3 Commissioner right before this. And so just one of
4 the questions I'd asked was, what are some of the
5 numbers in terms of 911 that's been appropriately
6 referred to the B-HEARD program? If you could give us
some of those numbers, that'd be great.

7 CHIEF MIANO: So I have numbers for
8 fiscal year 25 and year-to-date for 26. I don't have
9 them in percentages though, I just have them as
10 numbers. So, B-HEARD response responses have been- in
11 fiscal year 25, B-HEARD responses were 9,638. B-HEARD
12 arrived on scene to 8,201 of those, and B-HEARD
13 treated on scene with no transport to the hospital
14 1,670. So before I get into fiscal year-to-date of
15 2026, I just want to- The reason why B-HEARD was
16 called for 9,638 but only arrived on scene for 8,201
17 is because as we get- there's a very strict criteria
18 that we send B-HEARD units to, and as our dispatchers
19 talk to the caller more, as they get more
20 information, they may no longer fall under that
21 criteria. So that's why those numbers are different.
Fiscal year 26 to date, B-HEARD has had responses of
7,297. They've arrived on scene to 6,233, and they
treated with no transport to 1,400.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 217

3 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, great. And I don't
4 know if this is a question that folks know the answer
5 to, because I know that the Mayor's Office of
6 Community Safety is still sort of being thought
7 through, but I know that I saw that OCMH, which
8 technically oversees B-HEARD was also in that
9 department, and so I'm just kind of curious if you
10 know how that's going to look in terms of
11 coordination of services.

12 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: I think this is
13 gonna develop out. We're very excited to work with
14 this new Community of Safety- Office of Community
15 Safety to scale up and move things around. But FDNY
16 is going to be a key component to running B-HEARD.

17 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, great. And then
18 before I pass it on to Chair Ariola, just wanted to
19 ask a couple questions on EMS pay parity, which we
20 know has been an unresolved issue for many, many
21 years. And so, EMS pay parity- how, does FDNY
currently define pay parity for EMS personnel, and
what is the benchmark being used for comparison?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 218

3 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: So, right now I
4 think what you're going to hear a lot is pay parity
5 in comparison to our firefighters.

6 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay.

7 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: So that is not
8 something that we have defined. This is something
9 that has just been a matter of conversation between
10 OLR, OMB, the fire- the EMS unions, but that's how we
11 understand it to be defined.

12 CHAIRPERSON LEE: And do you agree with
13 that assessment that it should be at the same level
14 as firefighters, or are you all internally thinking,
15 um, of a different benchmark?

16 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: Yeah, I think
17 at this point, you know, my position is this, and
18 I've been pretty verbal about supporting EMS pay
19 parity, and I do think it's one of those things that
20 need to happen sooner rather than later. And I do
21 hope that that is something that happens. But what
I'm looking for is a way to have EMS be an actual
destination, a profession, you know, someplace they
can come and stay, raise their families on the job
that they're doing, and enjoy the lifesaving work

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 219

3 that they do. And my position as the Commissioner
4 really surrounds this by, you know, being able to
5 provide EMS services to New York City for the coming
6 decades. That's what-- that's what we want. We want to
7 have a robust, sustainable, EMS system. So as far as
8 the details go of what that's going to look like,
9 that I would have to defer to OLR. I don't have a
10 seat at that table. The conversation that I'm driving
11 really is about the safety of our city and being able
12 to continue our services.

13 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, great. And how
14 does the EMS compensation in New York City compare to
15 other large municipalities across the country? Are
16 you seeing-- and where do we fall in that?

17 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: EMS across the
18 country is experiencing this problem, and they are
19 experiencing a very serious recruitment and retention
20 problem. It used to be that New York City could kind
21 of, you know, get away with it. We had-- we had a lot
of people who wanted to come to EMS, so it would-- we
weren't-- we weren't experiencing it the same way as
the rest of the country was, but we are no longer
there. So now New York City is also experiencing

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 220

3 difficulty in recruiting and retaining these
4 incredibly talented and skilled professionals who
5 save lives for a living. So, you know, this is, this
6 is a conversation that the entire country is having,
7 and I hope that New York is going to lead the way in
8 this conversation.

9 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Yeah, agree. And if
10 you were to estimate, what's the total annual cost if
11 we were to achieve full pay parity for EMS personnel?
12 Is there— what would be the total cost and is there
13 any portion that is included in the Executive Budget?

14 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: I think this is
15 something that has to be worked out through OMB and
16 OLR. I don't have a number as to what that's going to
17 cost, because it hasn't been determined what it's
18 gonna look like. So I would defer to them.

19 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. And if you do
20 have any estimates that come up, if you could let us
21 know, that'd be great. And is there a formal
commitment from the administration in terms of a
timeline for when these conversations are going to
happen, take place, and hopefully get settled?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 221

3 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: It's my
4 understanding that the unions and OLR are starting
5 their process of negotiation as far as that contract
6 goes. So, I'm expecting that those conversations
7 would be part of those conversations that should be
8 happening now.

9 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay.

10 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: Or very soon,
11 hopefully.

12 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, perfect. I'm
13 going to pause there and hand it off to Chair Ariola.
14 Oh, but quickly, we've been also joined by Deputy
15 Speaker Williams, Council Member Hudson and Pierina
16 Sanchez.

17 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Thank you, Chair. So
18 just two points, just to piggyback off your
19 questions. We were talking about a rise in headcount,
20 and there's been a rise in headcount with EMS. Is
21 there a plan to increase headcount on ambulances?

COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: I'm sorry, is
there- like-

CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: [interposing] Is
there a plan to put another-

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 222

3 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: increasing EMS?

4 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Yeah, another EMS
5 person on ambulances. They've been asking for a third
6 person.

7 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: Oh, we have not
8 had that discussion, not with me anyway. So, I'm
9 certainly happy to have those discussions, but this
10 is the first I'm hearing of it.

11 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay. And also, when
12 we-- when it was brought to our attention about that
13 there would be an increase in EMS charges when an
14 ambulance goes to a call, that a portion of that
15 additional money that would be gained would be
16 considered-- when the mayor's office was discussing
17 pay raises, if not parity, for EMS workers, that that
18 was supposed to be incorporated into what-- I think
19 you and I had that conversation-- that that would be
20 incorporated into why the ambulance fees were being
21 raised.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: So the
ambulance rate increases do reflect an increase in
EMS salaries, but based on the civilian pattern. So
we've incorporated a 16.1 percent increase in

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 223

3 salaries based on what they would have gotten, you
4 know, if they were following the civilian pattern.

5 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: So then there has
6 been some discussion regarding an increase in their
7 salaries? If you're saying 16.1 percent?

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: Yeah,
9 that's the civilian pattern that all of the civilian
10 unions had received.

11 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: And you're saying
12 that that conversation is being started with their
13 unions? Okay. So, the Executive Budget projects
14 significant new EMS revenue annually beginning in
15 FY27, yet FY26 actual revenue came in well below the
16 out-year projection against a substantial total
17 department cost. This gap raises fundamental
18 questions about whether EMS transport is a net
19 revenue generator or a net cost to the city, and
20 whether the financial plan's revenues projections are
21 realistic. The committee wants to understand the
state of the ambulance fleet and whether staffing is
adequate to meet that demand. That being said, the
Executive Budget projects \$92 million in new EMS
revenue annually beginning in FY27. Yet FY26 actually

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 224

3 came in at approximately \$254.5 million against a
4 total department cost of \$400.8 million. Does the
5 department consider EMS ambulance transport to be a
6 revenue-generating operation or a net cost to the
7 city? And you— can you walk through the full revenue
8 cost or the few revenue cost picture?

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: Yes, so
10 EMS services are definitely a net cost to the city.
11 They do not generate revenue beyond their costs. In
12 fact, historically, EMS revenue has covered about a
13 third of the all-in cost of operating EMS. So
14 whenever we look at setting rates, we're looking at
15 the total cost cost, that's including not just the
16 direct payroll for the EMTs and paramedics staffing
17 the ambulances. It's also including the fringe cost
18 associated with that personnel. It's including the
19 OTPS cost of the medical equipment, the supplies that
20 they use, rent on any leased EMS stations. It
21 includes debt service for the purchase of ambulances,
for the IT systems like the CAD system that are used
to support 911 operations, renovations at EMS
stations, and it includes a proportional amount of
support staff at the Fire Department that support EMS

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 225

3 services. So like the mechanics that help repair the
4 ambulances, the IT personnel that work on those 911
5 systems, the HR people that help hire the EMTs. Now
6 there are sort of three different adjustments to EMS
7 revenue being made in the Executive Budget. One of
8 which is the \$92 million that's been referenced a few
9 times. That \$92 million is actually not an increase
10 in EMS revenue. It is a decrease in EMS revenue and
11 an increase in city funds. So that was related to a
12 Medicaid supplemental payment program that the city
13 had incorporated into our EMS revenue targets. You
14 know, many of our transports are for Medicaid
15 patients. Medicaid pays according to their own fee
16 schedule, which is much, much lower than what our
17 actual costs are. There is a program that several
18 other states have been able to get in place, referred
19 to as certified public expenditures, where you can
20 essentially show Medicaid that your costs are much
21 greater than their rates, and they will make a
supplemental payment. That has to go through a state
Medicaid plan amendment process, and we actually have
two SPAs in coordination with New York State that
have been pending for over five years now in back and

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 226

3 forth with the federal Centers for Medicaid and
4 Medicare Services. That hasn't been approved yet. And
5 you've seen this in prior years, where that revenue
6 has been taken down one year at a time. This plan
7 includes a significant adjustment to take down most
8 of that revenue in the baseline. The plans are still
9 pending, so it's possible it may get approved,
10 probably at a much lower amount than we thought
11 initially, but that's why you see that adjustment,
12 and that's being replaced one for one with city tax
13 levy dollars, so there's no negative impact to EMS
14 operations from that program not going through. The
15 other two adjustments are savings initiatives. So we
16 have treatment in place which is \$10.1 million up,
17 mostly because of Medicaid revenue. Now that one, in
18 contrast to the CPE that I was just talking about,
19 that SPA, the State Medicaid Plan Amendment, has
20 already been approved by the federal government. So
21 we feel much more confident with that. That was
approved fairly recently, so it— back in February,
and that is mostly what is supporting that \$10.1.
Then we have another \$24.6 million, and that is tied
to the increase in EMS rates. But when you look at

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 227

3 all of those adjustments and you compare what the EMS
4 revenue targets were as of the preliminary budget to
5 now, overall the EMS revenue target is going down
6 because of that large \$92 million adjustment.

7 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Right. Okay. So if
8 the \$92 million number is not correct, right, or not
9 exactly correct--

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: It's the
11 other way around. So--

12 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: [interposing] But it--

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: it's not
14 revenue going up, it's revenue going down.

15 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay.

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: City
17 dollars going up.

18 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay, so then, what
19 is the department's total EMS revenue for FY27, and
20 how does that compare to the total cost of running
21 EMS? What are the actual numbers?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: So, the
FY27 EMS revenue target is \$343.7 million, and that
is still substantially short of the all-in cost of
operating EMS, which is in excess of \$900 million.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 228

3 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay. And so you're
4 also saying- all right, so the Executive Budget
5 projects \$400.5 million in total EMS revenue in the
6 out years, is that correct?

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: No, it's-
8 so that number \$400.5 was what it was as of the
9 Preliminary Budget. As of the Executive Budget, it is
10 now \$343.7 million.

11 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: So, it went down.
12 Okay. And so the FY26 came- that was actually \$254.5
13 million. So what accounts for the difference? What do
14 you think is the major reason for the difference and
15 why it decreased? Is it because the \$92 million is
16 not incremental and it was actually a negative.

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: So the
18 \$92 million was taken down. So that helps explain
19 part of the difference between the \$400 and the \$343.
20 And then the two things going up are the \$10.1 for
21 treatment in place and the \$24.6 tied to increasing
ambulance rates.

CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay, so we're still
not working with real numbers and we're still not-
we're working on what-ifs, and we don't- how are we

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 229

3 supposed to really put a budget plan together when
4 there's not any tangible numbers so far. Okay. So I'm
5 going to switch to fleet capacity. What is the
6 current size of the FDNY ambulance fleet, and how
7 many units are out of service at any given time due
8 to maintenance or age? And what is the average age of
9 the fleet?

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: So there
11 are about 600 ambulances in the field. The number is
12 a little bit higher than that if you include
13 specialty ambulances and ambulances used in training.
14 The average out of service is about 30 percent, but
15 our number of ambulances reflects the fact that we
16 need that level of spares available. The average age
17 is about two years. So we aim to replace our
18 ambulances when they're five to six years old, and so
19 they're fairly young.

20 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: And is that done
21 regularly?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: Yes, there
was a delay around the pandemic, because of
manufacturing delays, but we have since caught up.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 230

3 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay. And if the FDNY
4 increased the number of active ambulances, would
5 transport revenue increase proportionally, or are
6 there just other constraints such as staffing or call
7 volume that would limit that impact? So call volume
8 would definitely limit the impact. So, we think that
9 the, you know, the demand side of that equation is
10 fairly constant. The number of people calling 911 for
11 a medical emergency isn't likely to change if we have
12 more or fewer ambulances. How we estimate the revenue
13 impact of adding a tour depends a little bit on the
14 situation. So in instances where we're replacing a
15 tour that was operated by a voluntary hospital, which
16 has certainly happened many times over the last few
17 years, we can estimate the full revenue impact of
18 that because basically supply is staying the same.
19 We're just replacing who is operating that tour. If
20 we were adding tours to the system to improve
21 response time, say, the revenue impact would be less.
There would still be one, but it would sort of
redistribute where those patients are going. We're,
only 2/3 of the system. The other 1/3 is the
voluntary hospitals. So if we were adding additional

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 231

3 tours to increase the total number, we would
4 anticipate that we would proportionally pick up more
5 tours.

6 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay. Do you believe
7 that you have enough EMS headcount on staff available
8 now for the units? And are they fully operational at
9 capacity? And if not, what is the shortfall?

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: So we're
11 definitely not fully staffed. So we're under our
12 budgeted headcount. Right now for EMS, our budgeted
13 headcount is 4,540, and we are at 4,250. So we're 290
14 under budgeted headcount, and we expect to lose
15 another 500-plus EMS personnel over the next four
16 firefighter classes.

17 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay. All right. The
18 Executive Budget projects savings beginning in FY27,
19 through higher federal and state ambulance
20 reimbursement rates, correct? What specific rate
21 changes are driving this projection, and how have
those rates been formally adopted by the relevant
state and federal agencies, or are they still pending
as well?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 232

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: So, there
4 are the two. So treatment in place, which supports
5 \$10.1 million of the revenue increase was— has been
6 approved. So New York State had a Medicaid State Plan
7 Amendment that they had submitted to federal CMS, and
8 that was approved back in February. New York State
9 has only recently distributed guidance on how to
10 proceed with the technical details of billing for
11 that. But that is all set, and we anticipate that
12 proceeding shortly. The second one is raising our EMS
13 rates. So EMS rates are something that we can set on
14 our own that doesn't require state or federal
15 approval. It goes through the city's rulemaking
16 process. And so we have gone through that process.
17 You know, we had our initial public notice, we had
18 our public hearing, and the final rule was published
19 in the city record just last week, which is well on
20 time for the rates to be effective July 1st. Okay, so
21 a lot of it relies on a lot of, like, unpaid
transports, billing, and collections. Let's talk
about that. Approximately 20 percent of FDNY
transports go unpaid. Would that be correct?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 233

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: There are
4 about 18 percent of our transports that are
5 self-paid, folks who are uninsured. And some of those
6 folks do pay, but generally at much lower amounts
than our billed rates.

7 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: And there would be
8 roughly 10 percent where FDNY cannot submit a bill at
9 all due to incomplete patient information such as
10 unknown addresses, John and Jane Doe cases, and
11 returned mail. What steps is the Department taking to
improve billing documentation and reduce the
unbillable share?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: So there
13 is regular training that is provided to EMS staff on
14 documentation. So names and addresses are very
15 important to our follow-up options. We use an outside
16 billing vendor additionally that can use that patient
17 information to do automatic sweeps against insurance
18 information, and we share information with hospitals.
19 So we have agreements with H&H and with Greater New
20 York Hospital Association that allow for sharing of
21 patient insurance information to facilitate our
reimbursement.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 234

3 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay, so the Medicaid
4 fee-for-service transports that are not billed
5 directly but are reimbursed through the health and
6 hospital subsidy, how is that reimbursement
7 calculated and does it cover the full cost of those
8 transports, or does it leave a structural gap that
9 the city absorbs?

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: So it
11 doesn't fully cover the cost. That calculation has
12 historically been based on the Health Hospitals
13 inpatient Medicaid discharge rate. It sort of
14 hearkens back to when we were a part of Health
15 Hospitals, and so it was part of just their general
16 Medicaid reimbursement. What we were hoping would
17 replace that is CPE, the Certified Public Expenditure
18 process I was referring to. If that Medicaid State
19 Plan Amendment gets approved and we can move forward
20 with CPE, it would replace that. So instead of
21 getting that additional payment through H+H, we would
bill directly for Medicaid fee-for-service patients,
and then we would get a supplemental payment based on
our CPE analysis. That would come a lot closer to our
costs than the current model.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 235

3 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: So then if you take
4 into account the rate increase, the unbillable share
5 of transports, Medicaid reimbursement shortfalls, and
6 the cost of EMS operations, do you think that EMS
7 ambulance transport will be revenue positive with
8 this new additional cost and fee in place?

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: No. So, I
10 think ultimately ambulance services are still going
11 to be a net cost to the city. Even if we were getting
12 reimbursement on every single transport,
13 fundamentally, the vast majority of our transports
14 are for Medicaid and Medicare patients, and Medicaid
15 and Medicare pay according to their own fee schedule,
16 not our rates, and it is generally much lower.

17 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Alright, and this is
18 my last question before I'll kick it to my members of
19 the of the panel. Is there any plan to invest in
20 improved billing infrastructure, additional
21 documentation staff, or outreach to uninsured
patients? And what would the return on that
investment look like in terms of increased
collections? And has the department modeled that
scenario?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 236

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: So, I
4 think the most important piece of this is the
5 documentation that's done by the EMS crew. It's very
6 difficult for anyone, you know, after that initial
7 incident to replicate that sort of critical basic
8 patient information gathering that needs to happen at
9 that point. If we have identifying information for
10 the patient and an address, we can follow up. So, um,
11 you know, we have insurance database information we
12 can check. We have those information sharing
13 agreements that I referenced with hospitals that
14 allow us to follow up, and if we don't get insurance
15 information, we can send a bill to the patient. The
16 most common callback after receiving a bill is
17 patients calling in to give us their insurance
18 information. So really it's that first step that is
19 the most critical, which we continue to stress to
20 ambulance crews that documentation is really
21 important. The other thing that would really have an
22 impact is changes to Medicaid and Medicare rates,
23 that would come closer to covering our costs.

24 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay. All right. So,
25 we've discussed B-HEARD and EMS, and I'm sure my

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 237
3 colleagues have plenty of questions of their own. So
4 we're gonna begin with Deputy Speaker Williams, then
5 Council Member Brewer and Council Member Banks.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you. HI.
7 I've been asking questions of all city agencies
8 regarding the racial equity plans that you guys
9 submitted. So, it says that the department is using
10 internal data and a Deloitte study to identify
11 recruitment strategies for EMT and firefighter
12 candidates from underrepresented backgrounds. What
13 funding is included in the FY27 Exec Budget to
14 support that work?

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: Sorry,
16 can you repeat the last part of that question?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Yeah, I just
18 want to know if any funding for this fiscal year is
19 going towards identifying recruitment strategies for
20 EMT and firefighter candidates. You all reported that
21 you're using internal data in a Deloitte study.

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER NOONAN: Sure,
thank you. Definitely for the Deloitte study, there
will be a review of our most recent firefighter
campaign, which we will begin hiring for in October.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 238

3 So there's an after-action analysis happening with
4 that. They will review some of our attrition
5 mitigation programs that we run throughout the
6 onboarding for firefighter candidates. They'll be
7 looking at our PRB, Personal Review Board. So there's
8 quite a bit of analysis that will be going- that will
9 be included in the Deloitte research.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay. And is
11 that reflected in the FY27 budget, like, your
12 recruitment efforts?

13 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER NOONAN: Our
14 recruitment? Yeah, you go ahead.

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: So the
16 Deloitte study that we're talking about is reflected
17 in our FY26 budget. And so that was part of an OTPS
18 adjustment that we got as part of the preliminary
19 budget. I'm confirming the exact dollar amount, but-

20 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [interposing]
21 Okay, so there's no specific dollar amount for this
fiscal year for recruitment?

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER NOONAN: There is
absolutely- well, we have our budget for-

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 239

3 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: And I guess
4 while you find that answer, another question I have
5 is does FDNY- will you assess factors contributing to
6 hiring promotion and retention of EMTs and
7 firefighters across applicant demographics by the end
8 of 2026. That was something that you stated that you
9 would do. So just wanted to know if you had any
10 information on what disparities the Department has
11 already identified and what corrective actions are
12 under consideration.

13 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER NOONAN: In terms
14 of corrective actions, we did quite a bit of an
15 analysis for the 23-24 campaign, and we came up with
16 a pretty sound blueprint that we used to work through
17 the most recent campaign- I'm sorry, in a previous
18 campaign for the 23-24 campaign. It's already 26. And
19 a lot of what we found was that we needed to focus a
20 bit more not on just recruiting more people in
21 general. We wanted to focus more on our reachable
test takers, specifically for our firefighter titles.
It's a very competitive title. And just, you know,
recruiting blindly and not focusing on where are we
finding people that are actually able to pass the

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 240

3 exam at a score that's reachable was essential to us.
4 And so what we did find in some of our preliminary
5 findings is that the outcome of the exam seems to be
6 a bit more favorable than the goals that we set for
7 the blueprint. So that- we're pretty happy about
8 that. So our focus now is just making sure that we
9 are providing attrition mitigation programs to make
10 sure that the targeted audiences that we focused on
11 reaching are able to pass the physical exam, make it
12 through the hiring process, you know, pair with
13 mentors and all the programs that we offer to make
14 sure that they make it through the process
15 successfully.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay. Also in
17 your plan, you stated that the department will
18 continue assigning probationary firefighters who
19 reside in New York City to divisions where they live
20 whenever operational feasible? What is the rationale
21 behind this initiative, and how does FDNY believe it
improves community trust or service delivery?

CHIEF ESPOSITO: So that is what we
consider the home division rule, where probies that
live in the city are given the option to be assigned

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 241
3 to a fire company in their- in the division in which
4 they reside. And that was part of our settlement with
5 the court more than 10 years ago. There are times
6 when due to staffing levels that it's not
7 operationally feasible, and then they would be placed
8 in a division, one of the divisions closer, which
9 does not- does not happen commonly. Most of the time
there- if they request the home division, they are
granted the home division.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay, just
11 quickly, two more quick questions. Just- I wanna talk
12 about gender-related facility needs. So how
13 frequently are borough commanders reviewing
14 gender-related facility needs, and is there a
15 centralized tracking system for unresolved issues? I
16 know in some previous hearings that was a big
complaint. Just, you know, making sure you have
facilities for women.

17 CHIEF ESPOSITO: I'm sorry, what was the
18 second part of that?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: How frequently
20 are borough commanders reviewing gender-related
21

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 242
3 facility needs, and is there a centralized tracking
4 system for unresolved issues?

5 CHIEF ESPOSITO: So, twice a year the
6 borough commanders have the mixed gender meetings
7 where all the female firefighters are invited to come
8 in and sit down with the borough commander and bring
9 up any issues. And for any facilities-related
10 problems, there is a- this resource center, the
11 central reporting system, to track them. So yes, they
12 are tracked.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay. Last
14 question. Long-term racial equity goal included
15 analyzing EMS response times alongside neighborhood
16 demographics to identify racial disparities in
17 emergency response. Has the department already
18 identified disparities in medical emergency response
19 times across neighborhoods? So you all- you all said
20 that you were going to do that, so I'm just following
21 up on what you guys said.

UNIDENTIFIED: I would say that we
consistently, routinely monitor call volume in all
areas of the city. And as call volume is increasing
in certain areas, in those areas, I mean, we redeploy

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 243

3 units into those areas to be able to address the
4 calls that we- the call volume that we see. That
5 could include, you know, running extra units in that
6 area. It could also- as we look at the city as a
7 whole, it could include just taking in that moment
8 units from other parts of the city which are not as
9 busy and relocating them for a period of time into
10 that area until we're able to get a handle on the
11 amount of calls that are happening in that specific
12 area.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay, just to
14 clarify though, the question was like, have you
15 identified any disparities based off of geographical
16 location? But we can continue later.

17 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, great. Oh, did
18 you wanna-

19 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER NOONAN: Just to
20 answer, or give you a little bit of more clarity on
21 the budget- you asked for the recruitment budget. For
fiscal year 26, our budget was about \$7,000, and I
think we are on, on par- sorry, \$7 million. Sorry, \$7
million. Sorry. We spent \$14 million the previous
campaign and \$12 the fiscal year before that. And a

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 244

3 lot of that is tied to the campaign that we're in. So
4 for the Fire campaign, we do ramp up quite a bit
5 more. There's a lot of overtime spend, and there's
6 also a lot of money that we spend on advertising. So,
7 it does fluctuate, but \$7 million for fiscal year 26,
8 and we anticipate about around that same amount for
9 fiscal year 27.

CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thanks. Okay, great.

Council Member Brewer followed by Banks.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you very
11 much, and thanks Jason for all his— he's always 24/7,
12 seven days a week, even when he's on vacation. So I
13 just want to say thank you to Jason. Fire prevention
14 has always been something that I can see in the
15 Executive Budget you got more of. In the past, it's
16 always been underfunded, and so I just want to know,
17 with more funding, more staffing, what do you expect
18 to do? Obviously the Bronx is of concern, but in
19 general a concern. I don't quite understand why there
20 are so many more fires. Maybe you do. I know that I
21 was instrumental in the beginning of the lithium-ion
batteries, trying to work with your previous
commissioners to get the stores to stop selling them.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 245

3 Of course, Amazon continued to sell them. So I don't
4 know if they're lithium-ion or something else, but
5 how are you going to approach this prevention? You
6 have great officers out at every street fair, et
cetera, but it doesn't seem to be sinking in.

7 CHIEF ESPOSITO: So we do know that there
8 has been a significant increase in serious fires in
the Bronx this year.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: But elsewhere
10 too, I think, not just the Bronx.

11 CHIEF ESPOSITO: Yeah. In the Bronx and
12 Queens, we've seen a significant increase over last
13 year. And part- we're looking at and reviewing all of
14 the fires, especially not just the serious ones, but
15 the fatal fires, and trying to find what we- what is
16 in common with them. Aside from- that the majority of
17 them are in buildings with a single stairway, we
18 haven't found a common denominator yet. There are-
19 the causes of the fires are separate. Although the
20 predominant cause of fires in the Bronx and
21 throughout the city is related to the electrical
system, either in the building or extension cords or
power strips or an appliance cord. We continue with

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 246

3 the education outreach, the messaging where we're
4 getting out there about closing the door. We know
5 that was very effective with the lithium-ion battery
6 issues, and we thank you for your support and
7 championing that effort, and we saw great results
8 with that. So we're going to- we're going to keep,
9 you know, pushing that and getting the word out. When
10 there is a fatal fire, we do send education teams to
11 that neighborhood, to that building to get the word
12 out. We continue with the smoke detector
13 distribution. Anybody that needs it, we'll go out and
14 install it.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: It seems- all
16 right, I appreciate it. I just think that seems to be
17 the number one concern. Hydrants being blocked, is
18 that something that is improving? I notice on my
19 blocks, I can't believe that people actually leave
20 their car unattended at a hydrant.

21 CHIEF ESPOSITO: We-

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: [interposing] And
I don't know, I mean-

CHIEF ESPOSITO: [interposing] We continue
to see that. We work with the Police Department for

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 247

3 enforcement. When it does impede our operations at a
4 serious fire, we'll have our fire prevention folks
5 issue criminal court summons, which- and have the car
6 towed, which results in thousands of dollars of fine.
7 But I agree, it's an issue that we're seeing across
8 the city that we did not historically see.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, so I guess,
10 I mean, I'm just saying that should be a major, not
11 just by you, but by the mayor, an education campaign,
12 like, you know, do social media on that as you do on
13 other topics, because I see it all the time. I don't
14 think people understand that it's illegal or they're
15 just not paying any attention. The other thing I had
16 a question about was just again, I hear what you're
17 saying about the ambulance transportation fee. So
18 what you're saying is if somebody doesn't have
19 insurance, then- and they're self-pay, but they can't
20 pay, then they can get support. Is that what you're
21 trying to say?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Do people do that?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: People
do. So there's a phone number on every ambulance bill

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 248

3 for our billing vendors call center, and they can
4 call and talk through the options there. But there is
5 a charity care program that's based on the same
6 household size and income guidelines that Health and
Hospitals uses.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay. All right.
8 And then response time for ambulances. What is it
9 generally? Up, down, in between? How does— how is it
10 going? And I appreciate your support for parity
strongly.

11 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: And we should—
12 we appreciate your support as well. And just to your
13 training comment, you know, I've met with many of you
14 and we've talked about strategies on how to get
15 messaging out, because the real success is not having
16 a fire to begin with. The real success is not going
17 into cardiac arrest from the beginning. So when we
18 prevent those things, that's where the real
19 life-saving work is. So, I appreciate all of you
20 spending time with me talking about different ways to
21 get your constituency, you know, on message as to
what they can do to keep themselves safe. Response
times, as we've seen, they can fluctuate, but we have

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 249

3 seen that response times are going up. And this is
4 quite honestly why I'm coming out so loudly for EMS
5 parity. When we have an increase year after year in
6 demand for 911 services and we have staffing that is
7 going in the other direction due to recruitment and
8 retention challenges, that equation will lead to
9 increased response times. Now, there are other things
10 that cause increased response times too. That's not
11 the only thing that we can point to. There are things
12 like- I know when I started, there were 20 additional
13 hospitals within the five boroughs than there are
14 right now. So as hospitals close or, you know, our
15 EMTs, our paramedics need to go further, they need to
16 wait longer in the emergency rooms that need to
17 absorb that additional call volume. You know, there
18 are lots of different things that go into this
19 problem, things that we are taking very seriously.
20 And any possible solutions that we can come up with
21 to reduce response times, including, as Chief Miano
was talking about a minute ago, you know, moving
units into areas of higher demand, and we watch the
demand across the five boroughs all day, every day.
So we see where there are areas that are really

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 250
3 getting inundated with calls, or response times are
4 higher, and we're able to shift some, but that
5 doesn't mean that response times automatically go
6 down altogether, right? So it may go down in that
7 area, and we'll have to shift some resources around.
8 But it is something that we watch very closely.
9 Because the- you know, there are so many different
10 factors that go into it.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you. Maybe
12 second round, I want to ask about rumbler sirens
13 versus loud sirens. Thank you.

14 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: So do you have
15 a preference? I- there are some people that really
16 like the rumblers.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Yes, I like the
18 rumblers. I live in between St. Luke's and Roosevelt.

19 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: Yeah.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: And it's all day
21 and all night. And so I have complaints all day and
all night. So I'm just wondering that when I talk to
the union, they like the loud sound. But I think we
should think about sirens. I mean, I feel like
bringing them all to City Hall Park and just blasting

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 251

3 them all day long, because then somebody might do
4 something about it. I have bills to do it, but I
5 could use some help in thinking about sirens because
6 it- you know, we got a quality of life issue that is-
7 if you don't live near a hospital, you don't hear it.
8 I got two hospitals right next- in the middle.

9 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: Understood.

10 Yeah.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: So, I would love
12 siren discussion.

13 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: We would love
14 to have siren discussion.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. Thank you,
17 Council Member Banks. And then we're going to go back
18 Chair Ariola.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: Thank you, Chair,
20 and to the Commissioner, thank you for coming today.
21 One of the concerns I frequently hear from residents
in my district, particularly those living in the
southern portion of the district, is the perception
that the fire and EMS resources are located too far
away from where they live. And I want to know, how

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 252

3 does the FDNY evaluate potential coverage gaps and
4 determine whether a neighborhood is being adequately
5 served, and what role do community feedback, call
6 volume, response times, and pollution growth play in
that analysis?

7 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: There are
8 definitely some areas in the city that have stations
9 that are further away. EMS stations we're talking
about, right?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: Right.

11 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: But with the—
12 with the call volume that we're experiencing, those
13 stations aren't really having a significant impact on
14 where they are because our ambulances are out serving
15 the public 24 hours, seven days a week. So what
16 generally happens is when an ambulance has a run and
they take that person to the hospital, they become
available.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: Right.

18 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: So they
19 automatically now become available for the area that
20 they're in as the closest resource. So, uh—
21

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 253

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: And what about fire
4 trucks or firehouses?

5 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: So, firehouses
6 are more distributed across the-

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: [interposing]
8 Right.

9 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: the city. There
10 are far more firehouses than there are EMS stations.
11 EMS stations, I think we have about 40 EMS stations-

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: [interposing]
13 Right.

14 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: and over 200
15 firehouses. So, there tend to be a more equal
16 distribution of firehouses than there are EMS.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: Right.
18 Particularly- let me go to some other questions. When
19 it comes to NYCHA emergency response challenges,
20 there was a recent study done by the Elevator
21 Advocates, and this was relegated particularly- well,
particularly dealing with the 42nd Council District,
which stated that there were close to five buildings
in my district which had chronic elevator outages. So
I want to know particularly with these elevator

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 254

3 outages that have taken place, has that been a
4 barrier, or has that played in the response time,
5 particularly when it comes to NYCHA developments?

6 CHIEF ESPOSITO: So the Fire Department,
7 we have an elevator task force, and we work closely
8 with NYCHA and the NYCHA elevator team.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: Right.

10 CHIEF ESPOSITO: So, we have a pilot
11 program that we've expanded that when the Fire
12 Department receives a call for a defective elevator
13 or somebody stuck in an elevator, at the same time,
14 we will also notify the NYCHA elevator team, and at
15 times, we could have an elevator mechanic meet us at
16 the scene and resolve that problem sooner.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: What about just
18 general response times to someone who may be calling
19 for calling 911 for some type of help. What is-- what
20 is the-- has that been a barrier? Has there been
21 situations where there's been an elevator outage that
has blocked or prevented access to that particular
call?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 255

3 CHIEF ESPOSITO: So, you're asking about
4 emergency operations in a building when there's an
5 elevator out of service.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: Correct.

7 CHIEF ESPOSITO: That's entirely
8 something that can happen and does on occasion.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: Right.

10 CHIEF ESPOSITO: I don't have the specific
11 stats on that.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: So that goes to my
13 broader point on response time, particularly when it
14 comes to NYCHA residents, or residents when we- it's
15 been reported in my district that we have five
16 buildings that have chronic elevator outages. And I
17 just want to hone in on what's being done as far as
18 any- is there any coordination with NYCHA and with
19 some of these private developers that are now
20 managing these developments?

21 CHIEF ESPOSITO: So, specifically with
22 NYCHA, we do have coordination about the elevators.
23 We report when we operate there and have an elevator
24 out of service, we do report that to NYCHA, and it
25 becomes their responsibility to repair it.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 256

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: So, has the FDNY
4 observed situations where elevator outages have
5 created barrier delays of responding to emergencies
6 within NYCHA, to be more specific?

7 CHIEF ESPOSITO: Yes, that happens
8 occasionally, but I don't have the stats for how
9 many.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: And if so, what
11 coordination exists between the FDNY and NYCHA to
12 address these challenges to ensure that residents can
13 receive timely emergency assistance, particularly
14 seniors or individuals with disabilities and
15 residents living on the upper floors?

16 CHIEF ESPOSITO: We would notify NYCHA
17 when we discover an out-of-service service elevator.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: And when it's not
19 per se NYCHA, and what's the coordination when it
20 comes to a RAD/PACT converted development?

21 CHIEF ESPOSITO: We would deal with the
managing agent then.

COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: Okay. Has the FDNY
identified any developments that consistently present
operational challenges due to chronic elevator

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 257

3 outages? And if so, are there any proactive measures
4 being taken to mitigate those risks Before the
5 emergency occurs?

6 CHIEF ESPOSITO: In those— in those new
7 complexes or with the new managing agents, we have
8 not identified that at this time.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: Thank you, Madam
10 Chair.

11 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Chair Ariola?

12 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Thank you. I'd like
13 to discuss the fifth firefighter, and the deployment
14 of the fifth firefighter on engine companies has long
15 been a priority for labor and a point of ongoing
16 discussion between the council and the
17 administration. The operational case is
18 straightforward. More personnel on scene means faster
19 knockdown times, fewer injuries, and better outcomes
20 for New Yorkers. So what does the data show about the
21 fifth firefighter's effects on fire suppression
outcomes, including time to knock down a fire,
firefighter injuries and civilian casualties?

CHIEF ESPOSITO: Thank you for that
question. The— we do not have specific data that

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 258

3 shows the difference of operations with four
4 firefighter engines and five firefighter engines,
5 right? When we break down our fire reports that talk
6 about civilian injuries and firefighter injuries, we
7 don't have the ability to differentiate between the
8 two. While we certainly welcome additional resources,
9 the ability to stretch and operate hose lines is
10 increased and better and more effective with five
11 firefighters than with four.

12 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay, so would it be
13 safe to say that if a fire is- a fire happens and the
14 first due arrives and they have only four members on
15 that rig and that fire is out of control, the- they
16 have to wait for the next second due to come, which
17 would have the fifth firefighter on it before they
18 get water on a fire. Is that correct to say?

19 CHIEF ESPOSITO: The 5th firefighter
20 speeds up the the stretching of the hose lines, and
21 putting water on the fire.

22 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: But water doesn't get
23 on that fire until that second rig arrives. Is that
24 true?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 259

3 CHIEF ESPOSITO: Not necessarily, but
4 it's-

5 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Now, now, is it true?

6 CHIEF ESPOSITO: No, not- if that first
7 engine stretches the hose line and they're ready to
8 operate, they're going to operate. It happens faster
9 with the fifth firefighter.

10 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Right, so if it
11 happens faster, what does that mean? Does that mean
12 that the fire doesn't spread more quickly?

13 CHIEF ESPOSITO: We would theoretically
14 put the fire out quicker. Yes.

15 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: It would mean that
16 lives would be in less danger.

17 CHIEF ESPOSITO: Yes, we would put the
18 fire out quicker.

19 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay. All right,
20 good. So I think that's a pretty good analysis. So
21 have you conducted any internal analysis or pilot of
the fifth firefighter deployment? And if so, what
were the results internally? Have you- discussed?

CHIEF ESPOSITO: We don't have any formal
studies done with it, but anecdotally it would lead

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 260

3 to quicker hose line stretches and quicker
4 extinguishment of the fire.

5 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Thank you. And what
6 is the current average response time by borough, and
7 does the data show meaningful disparities between
8 boroughs that a targeted fifth firefighter deployment
9 could address?

10 CHIEF ESPOSITO: So we do have the
11 average response time to structural fires so far this
12 year. For Manhattan, four minutes 39 seconds. Bronx,
13 four minutes 58 seconds. Brooklyn, four minutes 10
14 seconds. Queens, five minutes two seconds. And Staten
15 Island, five minutes five seconds. And what was the
16 second part of that question?

17 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: It was, what is the
18 current average response time per borough, and does
19 the data show meaningful disparity between boroughs
20 that a targeted fifth firefighter deployment could
21 address?

CHIEF ESPOSITO: That's one of the- I will
point to the discussion about the fifth firefighter.
We don't know- we don't know what impact it would
have on response times, because it's putting another

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 261
3 firefighter on the seat of an engine that's already
4 responding. But it does put water on a fire sooner if
5 the first responding rig has a fifth firefighter,
6 correct?

7 CHIEF ESPOSITO: Correct. But that-

8 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: [interposing] Right.

9 CHIEF ESPOSITO: apparatus would
10 theoretically arrive at the same time.

11 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Correct. So the more
12 apparatuses that have a fifth firefighter on it, the
13 quicker water gets on a fire, and the ability to
14 cause that fire to not spread reduces, and lives can
15 be saved.

16 CHIEF ESPOSITO: I would agree with that.

17 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay. Geographical
18 need- is there a targeted deployment? I think you
19 just gave us kind of what they were- the percentage
20 were per borough.

21 CHIEF ESPOSITO: The discussion about the
fifth firefighter is in the Bronx, is in engine
companies in the Bronx.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 262

3 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay, and can you
4 provide a breakdown of fire incidences by borough and
5 by engine company over the past three fiscal years?

6 CHIEF ESPOSITO: Yes, I have for all
7 engine companies throughout the city, we have the
8 breakdown for fiscal years 23, 24, and 25 of the
9 number of structural and non-structural fires they've
10 responded to. And, you know, as you can imagine, it's
11 not evenly distributed. We have some very, very busy
12 companies and we have some not so busy companies.
13 Right. So this-- so right now the fifth firefighter is
14 in what areas?

15 CHIEF ESPOSITO: So we have currently-- we
16 have 20 engine companies that have five firefighters,
17 and that is distributed throughout the city in areas
18 that have the types of buildings that generally
19 require longer hose line stretches. So--

20 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: [interposing] Okay,
21 so what are the specific concentrated areas right
now?

CHIEF ESPOSITO: Well, they're not-- with
the fifth firefighter, they're spread throughout the

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 263

3 city. Every borough has some engines with five
4 firefighters.

5 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: So do you think that
6 the fifth firefighter should be in concentrated
7 areas? Do you think it works better? Does that model
8 work better than having them sporadically placed
9 unevenly throughout the boroughs?

10 CHIEF ESPOSITO: But they're placed in
11 areas where their building stock requires those
12 longer hose line stretches.

13 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay, so let's just
14 talk about it. The Bronx consistently has among the
15 highest rates of structural fires and fire-related
16 fatalities in the city. Does the FDNY's internal data
17 support a targeted fifth firefighter deployment in
18 high incident boroughs like the Bronx and, secondly,
19 Queens, as you mentioned?

20 CHIEF ESPOSITO: We would certainly
21 welcome any additional resources, and it could have
an impact on putting out those fires quicker. But,
you know, the fires that we're seeing in the Bronx,
putting them out quicker is— or the fifth firefighter
is only not necessarily a silver bullet to stop— to

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 264

3 solve all of those problems, right? Stopping and
4 preventing the fire in the first place, sharing the
5 message about closing the door so that the fire
6 doesn't spread before we get there. It's a
7 comprehensive approach to deal with this fire
8 problem. And isn't the fifth firefighter very, very
9 important, especially in vertical fires, in getting
10 the hose up and buildings and more and more into the
11 outer boroughs, not just Manhattan or in the Bronx,
12 but in the outer boroughs we're having more and more
13 vertical buildings that are being built. Doesn't that
14 help in putting fires out?

15 CHIEF ESPOSITO: The taller the building,
16 the longer the hose line stretch.

17 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Correct.

18 CHIEF ESPOSITO: The more impactful the
19 fifth firefighter.

20 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: The more we build
21 and the more we have, you know, we have larger
buildings in areas that didn't necessarily have them,
the more we need the fifth firefighter, and that's
why this council is fighting for that. Are there
specific engine companies that are statistically

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 265
3 overburdened relative to their current staffing based
4 on call volume, run frequency, or simultaneous
5 incident rates? And can you provide data to that-- to
6 the committee?

7 CHIEF ESPOSITO: And those are the engine
8 companies that historically in those 20 that we
9 provide the fifth firefighter to, the ones that have
10 heavier fire duty in those areas that have the bigger
11 buildings.

12 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Would you support a
13 pilot program in the Bronx with a fifth firefighter
14 in 20 of their busiest--

15 CHIEF ESPOSITO: [interposing] We--

16 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: 20 of their busiest
17 firehouses? Would you support that as an agency?

18 CHIEF ESPOSITO: We would welcome-- we
19 would welcome additional resources.

20 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Is that something
21 that you're willing to fight with this council for
with the Mamdani administration to fund?

CHIEF ESPOSITO: We would welcome
additional resources to deal with these-- this fire
problem that we have.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 266

3 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Rather than a binary
4 choice between full citywide development and no
5 deployment, has the FDNY evaluated a tiered or phased
6 approach that prioritizes the highest-need companies
7 first? And if you have, you know, how would you
8 prioritize that? And the deployment of the fifth
9 firefighter?

10 CHIEF ESPOSITO: So the- those fires in
11 the Bronx that we're seeing generally in six and
12 seven story buildings, that are over 100 years old,
13 old building stock, the potential for spread in those
14 buildings is high. Some of these fires, the fire
15 raced up through the stairway, so it's long hose line
16 stretches. And you can compare that to Queens, that
17 in some parts have smaller buildings, shorter hose
18 line stretches, so that fifth firefighter would be
19 much better off in areas with larger buildings,
20 longer hose line stretches.

21 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: And does the fire
department track instances where a company is
committed to an active call and a second call comes
in requiring a delayed or cross-district response?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 267

3 CHIEF ESPOSITO: That's something that we
4 don't currently track. So we know, though, that in
5 those areas, those busier areas with the companies
6 that are doing- responding to more incidents, that
7 there are times they're on one and then another
8 company has to come over and respond to an incident
9 because that original company is not available.

10 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: And when that other
11 company comes over, doesn't that leave a gap in
12 coverage for a large portion of that particular area
13 that the second apparatus would-

14 CHIEF ESPOSITO: [interposing] Our
15 dispatchers-

16 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: would be covering?

17 CHIEF ESPOSITO: in the communications
18 office are able to manage and move resources around
19 the city. So if they do see a gap in that coverage,
20 then they'll move another company over as well.

21 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: So kind of someone is
always without coverage. Like, if you keep moving
them, somebody's always without coverage. If you keep
moving-

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 268

3 CHIEF ESPOSITO: [interposing] We
4 continually assess and move resources around.

5 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Yes. All right. At
6 this point, I'd like to go over to my panel for
7 questions on fifth firefighter.

8 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Oh, your panel?

9 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Yeah, well, we have
10 anybody who's the next up.

11 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Oh, okay. Yes, uh,
12 sorry. Council Member-

13 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: [interposing] And if
14 anybody wants to talk about fifth Firefighter and you
15 already spoke, just please sign up for second round.

16 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Got it. Council Member
17 Wong followed by Council Member Palladino.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: Okay, thank you,
19 Chairs. I read the testimony here that the headcount
20 is under budgeted by 190 people. My question is, how
21 many of them are EMS positions, and what does the
FY27 budget doing to close that gap?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: So
overall, the Department is under budgeted headcount,
total agency, by 706 positions. 316 of that is on the

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 269

3 uniform side, driven by firefighters and lieutenants.

4 290 of that is EMS, and about 100 of that is

5 civilian, largely because we just got positions

6 added. So on the EMS side, unfortunately, because of

7 the ongoing promotions to firefighter, although we

8 are trying to staff up as much as possible and are

9 aiming to hire large classes and continue to recruit

10 folks to fill those vacancies, we do anticipate

11 anticipate that it will take us quite some time to

12 achieve budgeted headcount.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: Okay, thank you.

14 Regarding 600 ambulances in the field with 30 percent

15 of them out of service, that is a very high number.

16 Can you talk about what's being done? What's going

17 on? You're waiting for parts? Is it a budget problem?

18 That's 180 ambulances out of 600 that's out of

19 service.

20 CHIEF MIANO: So the maximum amount of

21 ambulances that we have in the field at any given

time, and during the two tours that we run during the

day is 340. So, that is distributed throughout the

city. Although we have a fleet of 600, that's in

case any ambulances, like the ones that are off

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 270

3 service, are off service, we can replace those
4 ambulances with spares.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: I see. Okay, thank
6 you. My final question is on lithium-ion battery
7 fires. I've never seen so many homes, five-alarm
8 fires in homes, involving lithium batteries. How much
9 funding is dedicated specifically to lithium battery
10 enforcement, inspections, public education, and
11 specialized firefighting equipment? Can you please
12 talk about it?

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: There
14 isn't really a separate funding pot tied to
15 lithium-ion batteries. It's just something that's
16 incorporated into everything. So when, say, our
17 public safety—our fire safety education teams go out
18 and do public education, this is one of the topics
19 they cover. Similarly, on the fire prevention side,
20 there are a number of staff that work on that. Chief
21 Currao may have more to add.

18 CHIEF CURRAO: Good afternoon, everybody.
19 So as Commissioner Christoff had said, it's really a
20 comprehensive approach. It's fire safety. It is tied
21 to Local Law 40, working with other agencies to make

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 271

3 sure that, you know, that we don't have unregulated
4 batteries that are being sold out there. It is
5 addressing it as part of after- post-fire
6 investigation. We work very, very closely with the
7 Bureau of Fire Investigation. So it's a really
8 comprehensive approach to be able to deal with that.
9 And of course, the most important is education,
10 right? And which has made a marked difference in I
11 think raising the level of awareness that folks
12 understand that they have to- it's really important
13 to make sure that they have batteries that are
14 UL-rated, that it's a complete system, the battery,
15 the battery charger, not- you know, basic safety
16 things, not charging it unattended, not charging it
17 by means of egress. So it's really a holistic
18 approach to get to the best safety outcome.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: Do you think these
20 vehicles should be stored indoors, or they- safer for
21 them to be stored outside?

CHIEF CURRAO: Are you talking- are you
talking about electric vehicles?

COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: Yes. Electric bikes
or e-scooters, yes.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 272

3 CHIEF CURRAO: So we- what we do is we
4 make sure for- in terms of electric vehicles, like
5 cars, we don't regulate that. In terms of
6 micromobility devices, what we do is make sure that
7 they- the charging devices, the bike itself, the
8 battery is up to the UL standards. We find that's the
9 safest way to approach to, you know, to make sure
10 that when that's in- those are implemented, those are
11 charged, whether they're outside or inside of the
12 battery charging cabinets, we make sure that they are
13 at a very high level of safety standard.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: Okay, thank you.
15 Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, great. Council
17 Member Paladino followed by Restler.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Thank you very
19 much. I want to go back if I could please, just for a
20 moment, and then I'll move on. The fifth firefighter-
21 I expected to see and hear a lot more enthusiasm
about the fifth firefighter, because there was such
an uproar when Bloomberg let that fifth fire- when
that fifth firefighter were let go. I thought
tonight- today I would hear a lot more enthusiasm.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 273

3 And as the Chair asked about it, I seemed a very- I
4 saw a very laid-back approach as to the importance of
5 the fifth firefighter. I was rather- I was a little
6 surprised by that.

7 CHIEF ESPOSITO: So, thank you, Council
8 Member. The fifth firefighter and the staffing is
9 currently part of the UFA contract with the city that
10 talks about the number and a medical leave level. But
11 the- what we are trying to do, the priority in the
12 Fire Department is we're trying to stabilize EMS. And
13 the fifth firefighter is an important issue, but
14 we're really focused more on stabilizing EMS, the
15 staffing levels, the ambulance availability, the
16 response times, making sure that we're able to fill
17 our EMS recruit classes so that we can have
18 ambulances arrive on scene in a timely manner.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Okay, good
20 enough. Also, I'm going to circle back to a question
21 I had asked a while back when we first started these
hearings. I'm curious- I'm just one council member,
and as for one council member, I've given close to \$1
million of our money to the Fire Department. And that
went for generators and other very important-

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 274

3 vehicles and such. I'm wondering, where is that
4 money? And when is the Fire Department and EMS going
5 to see the two vehicles that I did fund fully and the
6 generators that I'm sure just not myself- like I
7 said, I'm just one of 50. I'm sure other council
8 members have done the same.

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: We can
10 follow up on those specific projects and get back to
11 you.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Oh, that's the
13 third time I've heard that. It's okay. But please get
14 back to me because it's a lot of money. And I- like I
15 said, I'm one of 50, so I'm sure there's a lot of
16 money floating out there in the millions of dollars
17 that we need to know. Also, your budget, it says
18 that, you know, we have achieved savings without
19 harming our ability to carry out our mission of
20 protecting life and property, and we strive to
21 provide the best possible service to the people of
New York. And you certainly, most certainly, have
done that, and I thank you for all of that. I
understand that we're all working under somewhat of a
tight shoestring budget this year. I want to see- I

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 275

3 want to know how much of a shoestring budget is our
4 FDNY, who should not be working with a shoestring
5 budget at all, how much are they— how much is your
6 budget so far for this year? Overall budget. Do you
7 know?

8 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: Hi, my
9 name is Paul. I just wanna—

10 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Hi, Paul.

11 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: Hi, how
12 are you?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Good.

14 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: Oh,
15 gotta turn it on? No, sorry. I just wanna double back
16 on your generator question.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Sure, go right
18 ahead.

19 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: We have
20 that generator. That generator is for Engine Company
21 295, specifically.

COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Oh, good.

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: Yes,
yes.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 276

3 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: I heard from
4 them, yes.

5 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: Yes,
6 that project is currently- the design is currently
7 complete, and we are rolling right into construction
8 at the beginning of FY27.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Oh, good. FY27,
10 which means July 1st is FY27, so we can expect to see
11 movement. I'll be paying attention right after July
12 1st.

13 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: Yeah,
14 yeah.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: For 285.

16 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: Yeah,
17 so we've already reached out to all of our vendors
18 and obtained their proposals and everything.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Thank you for
20 that, I appreciate it. As far as the overall budget
21 goes, I mean, we are in the process of signing a
budget on June 30th of \$124.7 billion. And anybody
who knows me knows I'm in a bit of an uproar about
that, because I like to see where the money's going.
And you guys are certainly entitled to major upgrades

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 277

3 to your fire home— your firehouses, structurally,
4 your vehicles. All around, you guys are entitled to
5 pretty big— if we're going to increase the budget by
6 \$100— \$14 billion total, if we're going to be
7 increasing the budget to that kind of money, I just
8 am curious, before I vote on the 30th, where's our
9 money going?

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: So our
11 FY27, expense budget is about \$2.7 billion, and our
12 capital budget going from '26 through '35 is about
13 \$1.9 billion.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Okay, so let's
15 add up those two numbers, shall we? 9 point— nine
16 plus seven is 16, carry it over, three, four— so
17 that's \$4.6 billion for the Fire Department out of
18 \$124.7 billion. I think that's outrageous. That's all
19 I'll say about that. Thank you very much.

20 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. Restler
21 followed by J. Sanchez.

COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Not in a good
way.

COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Tough act to
follow. I'll do my best. Thank you to the chairs and

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 278

3 congratulations, Commissioner. Really excited to have
4 you in this role and somebody who brings EMS
5 expertise to the agency right now, I think is
6 urgently needed. And I also just want to take a
7 second to congratulate the promotion of my friend and
8 most importantly constituent, Jason Shelly, Deputy
9 Commissioner, very well deserved. He's been such an
10 anchor in the Fire Department now for a decade plus.
11 We're really lucky to have him there. So just a few
12 questions. I've been deeply concerned by the fires
13 that we've been seeing across our city. I know we've
14 had a concentration of them in the Bronx that have
15 been fatal, and it's terribly scary. And grateful for
16 all the work that the members of FDNY do every day to
17 keep us safe. But also wanna make sure that we're
18 smartly investing resources, that can make the
19 greatest difference to prevent fires from taking
20 lives and ruining property. So just to confirm,
21 Chief, I think- I believe that I heard in your
testimony that we've got 20 engines right now that
have a fifth firefighter that are deployed?

CHIEF ESPOSITO: Yes, there are 20
engines.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 279

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: And there's no
4 data that we have whatsoever to show that a fifth
5 firefighter improves or doesn't improve outcomes one
6 way or the other, response times? No? Just to
7 confirm, this is what you testified to earlier, I
8 just want to get this clear.

9 CHIEF ESPOSITO: Not response times, but
10 we know that they stretch and operate hose lines
11 quicker.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: They stretch and
13 operate hose lines quicker, but no impact on getting
14 fires under control faster with the fifth person or
15 not? We have no data to back this up. I mean, other
16 than your anecdotal expertise.

17 CHIEF ESPOSITO: Because we don't have
18 that many five firefighter engines to see that.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Well, we have 20,
20 but understood. If there's no data, there's no data.
21 I just-- what would the cost be, Deputy Commissioner
Christoff, to adding a fifth firefighter citywide?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: So we are
currently in conversations with OMB on that point.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 280

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: But it's an
4 estimate that you should be able to come up with
5 pretty directly. Could you give us a ballpark?

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: We would
7 defer to the budget director, who I believe is
8 testifying in the coming days.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: You can't give us
10 an estimate of what it would cost? We know how many
11 firehouses there are, we know how many engines there
12 are, there are no— I mean, right? Adding a 5th
13 firefighter, what would that cost us? Ballpark?

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: I think—

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: [interposing] You
16 know this number.

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: The
18 council has cost estimates that are not out of line.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: What are those
20 estimates that the council has said? Could you get
21 those to us just for the purpose of the conversation?
What are the council's cost estimates?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: We can
follow up.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 281

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: No, I— come on,
4 we're at a hearing. We're asking basic questions. You
5 know the answers to them, you should share them on
6 the record. What are the council's cost estimates?
7 I'm not even asking you to give the cost estimate.
8 What's the cost estimate?

9 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: A council member has
10 asked a direct question and he deserves an answer. So
11 if you don't have it now, we have plenty of time to
12 sit and wait, and then you can get that answer for
13 him. It is rude to sit there and not answer a direct
14 question from an elected official who came here today
15 to represent his constituency, whether you like the
16 question or not. So let's work on getting that
17 information for Council Member Restler. I know you've
18 signed up for a second round, Council Member Restler,
19 but if you have other questions, please proceed.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I could do a
21 third round too, if Chair— you know.

CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. Council Member J.
Sanchez.

COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I have lots of
other questions to ask. I just am waiting because I

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 282

3 really do want an answer here, but we'll come back to
4 it on the second round.

5 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Oh, sorry, wait. Go
6 ahead. Go for it.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I'm sorry. I
8 don't mean to— I'll shift gears and I'll come back
9 to my questions on the fifth firefighter later.
10 Commissioner, we've had some challenges with FDNY and
11 DOT coordination on bike lanes. Does the fire
12 department support protected bike lanes?

13 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: Yeah. So we are
14 a life-saving agency. That's our mission, our core
15 mission, save lives. And we appreciate the fact that
16 bike lanes put people in a safer place. And they save
17 lives. So, yeah, the Fire Department has no problem
18 with bike lanes.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Thank you. We—

20 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: [interposing]
21 There are going to be these situations where
maneuvering around them are an issue. And in those
circumstances, as we have already started having
conversations with the DOT to resolve those issues
together.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 283

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: And we sent you a
4 letter to this effect, and I don't think we got a
5 commitment on a time frame, but Council Member Ariola
6 passed legislation requiring coordination between DOT
7 and FDNY on bike lanes. There's been some litigation
8 around this as well. Can we get a commitment from the
9 Fire Department that barring extraordinary
circumstances, the feedback can be provided to DOT
within 30 days?

10 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: We are going to
11 try our very, very best. Having these additional
12 heads are definitely going to help speed things
13 along, but sometimes they're just-- you know, part of
14 the-- it's not only the process. It's not only the
15 Fire Department, I would say, that kind of slows
16 things down. It may be a more complex thing that
17 needs to be reviewed. It takes a little longer. But
we certainly will commit that we'll do our best to
get them a timely response.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Okay.

19 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: And we're
20 working very well together. I mean, we are talking
21 together and solving problems together. And we

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 284

3 actually have seen- I can- have Chief Currao talk to
4 you about it if you wish. But we have seen some
5 reduction in turnaround times.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I- the chair
7 asked me to be brief in this round and I've already
8 gone over, but I'll just say appreciate the improved
9 coordination. I think having a time frame commitment
10 that, barring extraordinary circumstances or really
11 complex project, that FDNY is getting back to DOT in
12 a certain time frame really matters for planning and
13 execution because there's a set time frame in the
14 year for- you know, about 6 months, the DOT can
15 install these projects, and we lose the windows and
16 lose a year of safety that we can otherwise get if
17 we're getting tight responsiveness from the Fire
18 Department. So I hope we can work together to have
19 some real accountability there.

20 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: Yeah, I can
21 assure you we're working well together.

COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON LEE: And, Council Member
Restler, I have you on for round two, so don't worry.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 285

3 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay, so just
4 quickly, we can agree that it is your job and your
5 mission to put out fires, right? And you acknowledge
6 that fires go out faster with the additional
7 staffing. Do we agree on that? Yes or no?

8 CHIEF ESPOSITO: Yes, as a general
9 statement, yes.

10 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, Council Member J.
12 Sanchez followed by P. Sanchez.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER J. SANCHEZ: Thank you.
14 First and foremost, I want to say thank you to all
15 the firefighters for all for all the work that you do
16 day in and day out. Also, happy Pride Month. I know
17 nothing has to deal with sexuality, but
18 representation matters, and there are people all over
19 the city and this country that get to see someone
20 like you and feel represented. So thank you for the
21 work that you do as well. Aside from that, back to
the fifth Firefighters. Representing the South Bronx
and a proud co-chair of the Bronx delegation, this is
truly important to us. We sent over a letter on
February 10th, in partnership with Council Member

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 286

3 Ariola and the Bronx Borough President. But I want to
4 dive deeper. You said there are already 20 fire
5 stations that have this fifth firefighter, but they
6 are dependent on the higher the buildings, the more
7 firefighters. So is it safe to say that these 20 fire
8 stations are located in downtown Brooklyn and Midtown
9 Manhattan?

10 CHIEF ESPOSITO: Some of them are, but
11 it's not necessarily high-rise buildings, right? It's
12 buildings that have longer hose line stretches. In
13 high-rise buildings, we operate off a standpipe,
14 which is generally a shorter stretch than stretching
15 off the apparatus.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER J. SANCHEZ: Is there— is
17 there any way to identify where these 20 firehouses
18 are? And—

19 CHIEF ESPOSITO: [interposing] Yes, we
20 have them, we can provide that for you.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER J. SANCHEZ: How many of
those are currently in the Bronx?

CHIEF ESPOSITO: I'm not— do we have that,
Kevin? Currently, four of the engine companies in the
Bronx have five firefighters.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 287

3 COUNCIL MEMBER J. SANCHEZ: And how many
4 engine companies are in the Bronx in total?

5 CHIEF ESPOSITO: I think we have 30.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER J. SANCHEZ: So, how many
7 fires have happened in these areas that have the
8 fifth firefighter already during the course of this
9 past year?

10 CHIEF ESPOSITO: I'll have to get that
11 for you. So you're asking the number of fires that
12 the engines where there are five firefighters, the
13 number of fires they've gone to?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER J. SANCHEZ: Yes.

15 CHIEF ESPOSITO: Okay, we'll have to get
16 that for you.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER J. SANCHEZ: Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Can we have that by
19 the second round? We need that information. We need
20 the information answered. We asked you to come
21 prepared, so saying we'll get the information is not
going to be tolerated. Find the information, answer
in the second round.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 288

3 CHIEF ESPOSITO: We have the breakdown
4 of the engines and the fires they've had the last
5 three fiscal years. Is that what you're asking for?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER J. SANCHEZ: Basically,
7 what I'm trying to get to with my line of questioning
8 is have there been enough fires in where these fifth
9 firefighters are to justify them being there? You
10 said earlier that based on gaps in coverage that you
11 would move the firefighters over to cover different
12 things, and so—

13 CHIEF ESPOSITO: We would move the fire
14 companies around.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER J. SANCHEZ: So based on
16 the data that you already have based on the fires,
17 has there been any indication that would suggest that
18 moving some of the stations that have a fifth
19 firefighter to other stations in the Bronx that are
20 experiencing higher fires? Would there be any type of
21 movement from the stations that are not experiencing
fires versus the ones that are?

CHIEF ESPOSITO: I guess we could have
that discussion, but they're all going to fires.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 289

3 COUNCIL MEMBER J. SANCHEZ: Okay. But
4 it's just- if the fifth firefighter is reducing times
5 and reducing the ability- I completely understand
6 that, you know, what's- the cause for the fire and
7 the prevention is not a fifth firefighter. That's not
8 what we're saying. The housing stock and the
9 infrastructure, but we're not going to change the
10 housing stock overnight. It's physically and
literally impossible. But what we can do is cut down
response times to what we actually do with the fires.

11 CHIEF ESPOSITO: And I understand that
12 question. But then you also have to see the reality
13 that there's other council members here that if we
14 take one of the five firefighter engines from their
area, we're going to get the same- the same issue.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER J. SANCHEZ: Well, I think
16 just showing from Staten Island to Brooklyn to the
17 Bronx, we're seeing a concerned unifying voice about
18 the fact of everyone's recognizing the number of
19 fires that the Bronx is going through. And we have
20 been on this since the very beginning. I mean, I know
21 this fight has been happening now for 15 years, but
from when we started as the Bronx delegation

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 290

3 co-chair, this has been a major fight. So
4 understanding that combating fire times in the Bronx
5 is our top priority, and making sure that if there
6 are other places that are not having a single fire or
7 minimal fires compared to what we're experiencing
8 every day- I get the all-hand- the notices every day
9 on my email, multiple times a day. If we're able to
10 move those firefighters around, that also does
11 tremendous things for the ability to take care of our
12 fellow Bronxites. So thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. P. Sanchez?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER P. SANCHEZ? Thank you.
15 Thank you, cousin. It won't get old, maybe in a
16 couple years. But thank you, Chair, for the
17 unrelenting questions on the fifth firefighter. I
18 have to- I have to join. Chief, I have to join
19 Commissioner. But before I do that, I just want to
20 echo my colleagues in thanking the FDNY, the
21 firefighters who who jump at the flames, who are
there. I feel like- I live right next to a battalion,
and I feel like the fire- the sirens are just
nonstop, nonstop. So, I thank you to our
firefighters. I thank you to our EMS. But it does

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 291

3 feel like the Bronx is burning. It feels like the
4 Bronx is burning again. And I uplift the 50 New
5 Yorkers who we've had— or almost 50 New Yorkers who
6 we've already lost this year. And highlighting,
7 Chief, and I'd love some clarity in the— here during
8 this hearing, that in a private briefing with the
9 Bronx delegation some weeks ago, you shared that the
10 fires have nearly doubled over the last three years
11 in the Bronx and Queens, for the time period that we
12 were in. So I'd love to just get updated numbers on
13 that. And then specifically just want to— and I
14 should highlight for you, I'm going to do the thing
15 where I ask ask all my questions and then hopefully
16 leave you five seconds to respond. But I just want
17 to make sure to get them all in and I'm sure you'll
18 be able to capture them. We had a fatal fire, at 2226
19 West Tremont last weekend. A one-year-old passed away
20 on Bainbridge Avenue on the block where I grew up.
21 And so it really feels in the Bronx and it feels like
in my neighborhood that this is— it's just
relentless. It's just relentless. In my view, I want
to complicate our conversation also on the fifth
firefighter. My view is that we need a three-pronged

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 292

3 approach. We need to first make sure, yes, that our
4 first responders have the resources for the fastest
5 response to put out the fires as fast as possible. We
6 have to address things like the blocked fire hydrants
7 that you keep raising with us in conversations. But
8 second, we need to also expand public education
9 immediately, right? The things that you raised during
10 the press conferences, the closing- the doors that
11 weren't closed behind, we need to, you know, make
12 sure we're highlighting that and reaching the
13 audiences in the Bronx, in Queens, in the
14 neighborhoods that are really impacted. But third,
15 and this is where I am the Chair of the Housing
16 Committee on the Council, we have to make sure we're
17 having a conversation that also puts the onus on the
18 owners of these old properties to address the failing
19 systems leading to these fires. At 226 West Tremont,
20 it's an old building, that owner is the fourth worst
21 in the City of New York. And in the last year, the
building had 13 violations for defective and missing
smoke detectors, which meant- means that the city
was- that the residents were calling it in. And in
the last two weeks, there were violations for

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 293

3 self-closing doors. So the, the second question— the
4 first question was about data. The second question is
5 about the interagency coordination. How is FDNY
6 sharing everything in real time that you're seeing
7 about fires and causes? How are you talking about
8 that with the Department of Buildings, with HPD, and
9 crafting new policies and new interventions to
10 address the root causes? And finally, you know, as we
11 talk about the infrastructure in these buildings, I
12 just want to make sure that that is also a part of
13 the conversation. And I think I mentioned this to
14 you, Commissioner and Chief, in some of the Zooms we
15 had. When FDNY has all the press in front of you,
16 because there's been a fatal fire and there's been a
17 tragedy, just making sure that the agency does not
18 then only talk about the self-closing doors and the
19 smoke detectors, the interventions that the tenants
20 are responsible for, because that feels like blaming
21 the victims. It feels like you're blaming, by only
focusing on those causes. It feels like a blame on,
on our people in the Bronx. And I want to make sure
that one, we are doing, right? We are— HPD, DOB, FDNY
are collaborating on solutions, but we're also

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 294

3 talking about what owners can do. So one, data. Two-
4 now I am forgetting what my second question was, but
5 I'm sure you captured it and I'll bring it back
6 around if you didn't.

7 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: So I, I'll just
8 take a couple and then, Chief could jump in here. So,
9 one, the collaboration, right, between DOB, HPD,
10 FDNY, we are collaborating, and there is no strategy
11 that we won't, you know, try to get this message out
12 there. We have done collaborative PSAs. I've done
13 PSAs with the Commissioner of Aging. I've done PSAs
14 with Commissioner- the DOB Commissioner. The mayor
15 himself put out PSAs for us. We had him do a PSA
16 because he has a large following. So he's done a PSA
17 for us. We have life safety pamphlets and different
18 things out there. We're working together to try to
19 solve a problem because we know that lives are
20 attached to this, right? We know that people are
21 going to die if we don't get this message out, if
they don't understand how to behave if they actually
get into a fire situation. Now, we don't want them to
get into into a fire situation, which is why we talk
about things like overloading outlets, overloading

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 295

3 power strips. We talk about not putting your space
4 heater too close to things that are combustible. And,
5 you know, I can appreciate what you're saying as far
6 as how do we talk about this when we're in the press.
7 When we're in the press, there are a couple things we
8 have to hit, right? We have to give them strategies,
9 give the people strategies so that they can share
10 that information amongst themselves if they get into
11 a place where they're in an emergency situation. And
12 it's not intended to put blame on anybody, but if we
13 have these situations where these violations exist
14 and our fire prevention, uh, folks go in there and
15 they write those violations too, right? But if those
16 places exist and those violations exist already, I
17 mean, telling the owners is not necessarily going to
18 solve the problem in the press. Telling the people
19 what they should be getting, informing them of how
20 your door should work, how your- you know, how your
21 apartment- how you're supposed to have fire smoke
alarms. That is the stuff that gets them calling 311,
gets them reporting the building, you know, reporting
their issues to the supers and the landlords. We want
them to be as educated as possible, and we will do

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 296

3 anything we can to try to keep these folks safe. Um,
4 we give smoke alarms. We install smoke alarms, we
5 want people to know that, that if you need smoke
6 alarms, we can do that for you. You can call 311 and
7 say, I need smoke alarms, and we can come and make
8 that happen. We want people to know that their doors
9 are supposed to close behind them. And a lot of
10 people rig it so it doesn't, because they don't want
11 to get locked out if they walk out into the hallway.
12 We want them to know these things, because these are
13 the things that keep them safe. So, we certainly
14 don't want to put blame on the victim, but we want to
15 educate the victim and give them as much information
16 so that they can share it with their families and
17 friends and be safe if, God forbid, they end up in a
18 position where they're trying to survive in a fire
19 situation. As far as the data, you can-- you can give
20 the data.

21 CHIEF ESPOSITO: So for multiple alarm
fires in the Bronx, at this time, as of May 13th this
year, we've had 27 multiple fires-- multiple alarm
fires. On May 13th, 2025, we were at 16, and May

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 297

13th, 2024, we were at 12. So— a significant
3 increase, as we've said before.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER P. SANCHEZ: Thank you.
5 Chair, may I just ask a quick follow-up? We're on the
6 same team here. We want, you know, the— we want New
7 Yorkers to be safe and avoid these situations. On
8 that vein, FDNY, you folks throw yourselves at the
9 hardship. You throw yourself at the emergency. So let
10 me take it to the— to a different place, which is
11 what information does FDNY share with buildings and
12 HPD? And are you actively— at the FDNY executive
13 level, are you actively talking about, hey, buildings
14 are having electrical shorts all over the place, you
15 all should really have this in your scopes of work
16 when you're putting out preservation grants or tax
17 incentives? Are you having that conversation with
18 agencies? Because from the— as the Housing Chair, it
19 does not feel like what we're getting on the Council,
20 what we're approving, the scopes of work that we're
21 approving for tax incentives are not covering these
electrical causes of fires. So, I just want to
understand what the conversation is.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 298

3 FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FLYNN: Thank
4 you for your question. We recently met with the
5 commissioner of DOB and discussed those issues.
6 Electrical fires have been consistently the leading
7 cause of fire within the city, and our buildings
8 continue to get older and older, and we continue to
9 see these electrical fires. We are working on
10 developing new technologies that may potentially
11 alert us to these fires prior to them occurring.
12 There are some, you know, hopeful items out there
13 that we're going to work on and work with some
14 national laboratories. We've already consulted with
15 Underwriters Laboratory to try to develop some of
16 these products for use within the city. Obviously, we
17 are a huge city with a complicated set of buildings
18 here. We're one of the oldest cities in the nation.
19 So, we do work with other agencies as well and make
20 sure that we address these problems prior to them
21 starting. And as to the Commissioner's point, we
never want to blame anybody for any actions that
cause these fires, but we do want to make sure we
take that risk with the idea that somebody else won't
die. And fire prevention does a tremendous job to

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 299

3 issue violations prior to the fire as well as after
4 the fire. So we do do a post-fire inspection, and all
5 those violations do go to the owner of the building.

6 And a lot of those issues that we addressed at the
7 press conference, those are directly related to the
8 fire that just occurred right before that press
9 conference occurred. So we want to strike while the
10 iron's hot, and we— some of those things we don't
11 know at the time of the press conference either.

12 Like, we have our marshals go out and they
13 investigate whether the smoke detectors were
14 installed properly. That's not information we may
15 have at the time of those press conferences, so we
16 want to make sure that we get the information out to
17 the building residents immediately so that doesn't
18 occur again.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER P. SANCHEZ: Thank you.

20 Thank you, Chairs, for the time.

21 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. Okay, we
have Council Member Maloney followed by Council
Member Gennaro.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 300

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: My question is
4 just high-rise buildings because there are a lot. I'm
5 not a big fan--

6 CHAIRPERSON LEE: [interposing] Oh wait,
7 Maloney, sorry, Council Member Maloney.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I'm sorry, go
9 ahead.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MALONEY: All right. Thank
11 you for being here. I wanted to return to the
12 question about EMS retention and the career pipeline
13 there. One of the challenges you've already alluded
14 to is significant workforce turnover and difficulties
15 with both recruitment and retention for EMS. What
16 percent of EMS are leaving each year, and what
17 percent of those leaving are heading to the FDN- or
18 to fire?

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: Yes, so
20 the attrition rate last year was about 10.9 percent,
21 and the annualized attrition rate for this year is
about 14.3 percent. That's much higher than it would
be in a year in which there weren't firefighter
promos. So in years without firefighter promos, the
attrition rate is closer to seven or eight percent.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 301

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MALONEY: Okay. So you
4 roughly- what percent would you say is converting to
5 FDNY roles? Seven?

6 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: Converting to
7 FDNY, to firefighter? During a promotion cycle, which
8 is multiple classes, they're all coming from a promo
9 list, so they go consecutively. We will shift about
10 25 percent of the EMS workforce from EMS into fire.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MALONEY: And what percent
12 of the incoming firefighter academy class then would
13 be from EMT or EMS?

14 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: It'll be a
15 promotion- it'll be a promotion class for the most
16 part. So that entire group of people who left EMS
17 will end up being the probationary class in the fire
18 academy.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MALONEY: And is the
20 training different or the same for those two roles?

21 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: Well, there are
different focuses, right? But so, you know, where the
people coming from EMS have been certified as EMTs or
paramedics, and they're required to recertify their
EMT and paramedics every four years in order to

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 302

3 maintain their positions. Once they go into the fire
4 academy, then they're taught fire-matics [sic] And
5 they're taught firefighting, you know, curriculum.
6 You could talk a little bit more about what you're
7 teaching them, but it is specific to the job that
8 they're doing. But when it comes to an operational
9 perspective, once they've moved over from EMS to
10 fire, outside of the CFR engine, they are no longer
11 doing EMT-level or paramedic-level work, they're
12 doing firefighting work, which is the stuff that they
13 learned in the fire academy.

14 CHIEF ESPOSITO: The current probie class
15 that we have in the fire academy is all EMS
16 promotions. Later in the year, we'll hire another
17 class that 60 to 70 percent will be EMS promotions.
18 And then what they learn in the fire academy, whether
19 you came from EMS or not the curriculum is the same,
20 and it's all about firefighting operations that EMS
21 does not currently have and do.

22 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: And just so
23 we're clear once those folks become firefighters,
24 they're no longer working on an ambulance in any way.
25 So they're not able to go across from fire to EMS.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 303

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MALONEY: So asking both
4 questions together. One is, have you considered if
5 it'd be more cost-effective to close that promotional
6 pathway if the training is different? And then the
7 other is, what role EMS compensation and increasing
8 that compensation plays, and if that would be more
9 cost-effective than continuously investing in
10 recruiting and trying to retrain or train new people
11 if you're cycling out 10 to 14 percent per year.

12 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: So, there has
13 been lots of discussion about the promotion pathway
14 from EMS to fire because it does take such a large
15 chunk of EMS at one date range and put them into
16 another area of the department. However, because of
17 that promotion process, people come to EMS. So in
18 order to be eligible for a promotion, you have to
19 work at EMS for four years. So what generally happens
20 is somebody who wants to be a firefighter will come
21 in through EMS, spend their four years at EMS, and
then look to promote into fire. So if I were to close
that promotion process, that segment of people that
come to EMS to become firefighters would no longer
have a reason to come to EMS to become firefighters.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 304

3 So without there being some significant compensation
4 so that if you were an EMT or a paramedic, you can
5 make the choice as to whether you want to stay in EMS
6 or become a firefighter. That's the pay parity part,
7 right? If the money was in place so that people
8 didn't have to leave EMS to go to fire to make more
9 money, then the expectation is those people would
10 stay in EMS and we would have to train far fewer
11 people, because right now we're training constantly
12 and it's pretty costly to continue to train, to move
13 people from one area that department to the other
14 area department.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MALONEY: And just to close
16 out, I know I'm out of time, but do you have an
17 estimate of what those costs are on recruiting and
18 training?

19 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: Yeah. So for
20 EMT, it costs \$41,000 to train, coming in the door, a
21 new employee EMT. For a paramedic, it costs \$130,000.
And we train our EMTs to be paramedics. So there are
people that work for us who are being upgraded to
paramedic. That's \$130,000. For refresher training,
which is what happens every four years, for an EMT

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 305

3 it's \$6,300, and for a medic it's \$9,000. So
4 essentially, we would save money if we had to— if we
5 were able to keep people longer than having to keep
6 bringing them in at the entry level.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MALONEY: Thank you.

8 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, great. So round
10 two, we have Council Member Brewer followed by
11 Council Member Wong.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Sorry for the
13 mistake earlier. My question is just tall buildings.
14 Some of your previous commissioners would bring to my
15 attention, because on the Upper West Side there are
16 developers who just wanna build to the sky. And the
17 comment was we just don't have enough capacity to
18 deal with these super tall. And I— obviously, we
19 want development or some people want a lot of
20 development. I want lower development. And yet, I
21 really have no concept whether or not what was said
in the past is true. Are you— is this something
you're thinking about? Is there something that you're
concerned about with these super tall which seem to
be proliferating? So I'm just wondering about your

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 306

3 opinion on that. And then I didn't say earlier, I
4 don't think that in participatory budgeting, we got a
5 new HVAC system on Ladder 25 on 77th Street. So,
6 Westsiders just love your members. Just want to let
7 you know.

8 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: Well, thank
9 you.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: But in terms of
11 the supertalls.

12 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: You wanna talk
13 about supertalls?

14 CHIEF ESPOSITO: So since the turn of
15 this century, the building materials and building
16 technology has allowed us to build smaller buildings
17 but much taller than historically than we've been
18 able to. And one of the issues that we face with that
19 is it could take us longer to get from the sidewalk
20 upstairs than it does to get from the EMS station or
21 the firehouse to the scene. So we, you know, we do
look at response times and- but these are newer-built
buildings. They have auxiliary fire protection
systems. They're generally more fire safe than the
older buildings that we're talking about and

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 307

3 generally have less fire instances in them. You might
4 have more emergencies and the same with EMS and their
5 response time to be able to get upstairs for- to
6 provide life-saving care. So-

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: So you're saying
8 in terms of the fire, not the emergency heart attack
9 or whatever, the fire that you're feeling that
10 they're somewhat safe is what you're saying?

11 CHIEF ESPOSITO: They're- well, they're
12 more fire safe than some of the older buildings that
13 we have.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: All right, well, I
15 appreciate that. I wish you had said the opposite,
16 because I can't stand them, but thank you very much.

17 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Council Member Wong,
18 followed by Restler.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: Thank you, Chairs.
20 I- okay, do you have figures on how many EMTs left to
21 become firefighters versus how many EMTs left to
become paramedics for the past year? And is pay gap
the reason, or what can we do to improve the
retention rate?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 308

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: Thank
4 you. So I think I have those numbers, although I
5 might have to look up some of them. So just in terms
6 of how many EMS members have left to become
7 firefighters, you know, over the last three
8 firefighter classes, we've lost 506 members.

9 CHIEF MIANO: And I just want to-- EMTs
10 don't leave the job to become paramedics, they
11 promote to paramedic after going through rigorous
12 training. So they still stay on EMS. Each paramedic
13 class, we run approximately two a year, and we
14 graduate-- we graduate about 70 from each one of those
15 classes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: Okay. And, like,
17 we've been talking about this since the last hearing,
18 how do we fix this retention rate? Is that being
19 considered in the current budget year, or is still
20 something that's not solved?

21 CHIEF MIANO: I think the Commissioner
has said it multiple times that one of the things
that, you know, that would help us with retention is
the EMS pay being increased, right? Like, we have
members who are out there dedicated every single day

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 309

3 that deserve to be compensated for the work that they
4 do. Right here in the room, we- you know, just
5 looking around, we have an incentive program every
6 single month. We have what we call a Unit of the
7 Month program. That Unit of the Month, for the first
8 time ever this month, the same unit from the Bronx
9 has won that pro- has won that title two months in a
10 row. And just two of those members happen to be
11 sitting right here. I wish your counterpart was here
12 because they actually are from his district. All
13 right, so I think we need to recognize the work that
14 our EMTs and our paramedics do, and they should be
15 compensated for it.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: But in the current
17 budget, the EMS pay levels remain the same. Is that
18 right?

19 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: Yes. So, as of
20 this point, these conversations are still happening
21 between OLR, OMB, and the FDNY unions. They're in the
contract negotiations now, and I don't have a seat at
that table. So, you know, it's a an ongoing
conversation. It's a conversation we continue to
bring light to because we do believe it's step one to

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 310

3 stabilizing the EMS system, which, you know, as the
4 Chief spoke about and Chief Miano has spoken about is
5 a real thing. Like, I think at this point we need to
6 stabilize our EMS system and the pay is gonna be one
7 of those things that set us on the right path to get
8 that done. And possibly then we can look at promotion
9 processes, right? So if there is an option to stay in
10 EMS, somebody may take that. But right now we have a
11 17,000-person department who are willing to do just
12 about anything to keep New Yorkers safe. They'll do
13 it in good weather and bad weather. They'll do it in
14 any time of year. And as you've seen over the last
15 you know, the last winter we had, which is
16 extraordinarily cold, which caused a lot of the fires
17 we're seeing now, or you see it during a pandemic,
18 which was incredibly challenging. The Fire Department
19 never turns their back on New Yorkers. So at this
20 point, we're saying we have to prepare ourselves and
21 build this department in a way that provides these
services for the next five decades for New York. And
that's what this conversation is about, trying to
make sure that we can have a robust and sustained EMS
system to provide those cares.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 311

3 COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: Yeah, but we have a
4 budget process that's due in 30 days. And what you're
5 saying is that we don't know how to fix this pay gap
6 until the budget-- until the contract negotiations
7 have, like, definite terms. And that's going to take
8 a lot longer than the 30 days that I'm putting
9 together the budget. Is that right?

10 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: Well, I will
11 say that those conversations are ongoing, and we've
12 been-- EMS has been part of the Fire Department for 30
13 years, and this has been unresolved. So, I'm guessing
14 in the next 30 days it probably will not be resolved,
15 but I do hope that we get to a point where we resolve
16 it sooner rather than later.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: Okay, thank you.
18 Thank you, Chairs.

19 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Thanks so much.
21 So let's try again. Fresh take, take two.
Approximately how much would a fifth firefighter cost
if we were to be implemented citywide?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: So the
City Council has released an estimated number of \$92

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 312
3 million for 86 companies. That's about half of the
4 companies. It would be \$173 if you were to expand it
citywide-

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: [interposing] And
6 do you think those estimates were roughly accurate
7 based on your assessment?

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: For order
of magnitude purposes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: So roughly we're
10 talking about \$180 million to go citywide, fifth
11 firefighter?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: That
would be the city council estimate.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: And no
14 independent perspective from the Fire Department? You
15 think that that's roughly broad strokes? That seems
like a reasonable estimate.

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: I think
17 order of magnitude, that's about right. I mean, we're
18 in conversation with OMB about the estimate. We have
19 some-

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: And, you know,
21 I've really appreciate it, and I don't mean to cut

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 313

3 you off- you, I- you're one of the best finance
4 directors at any agency in the city, so I know you
5 know the answers to all these questions. And I will
6 push because there are some folks that could sit up
7 on this panel and wouldn't be able to answer
8 questions. You are not one of them. So, I appreciate
9 you coming back to us. And I really appreciate,
10 Commissioner, you coming in with a very forceful
11 position on supporting EMS workers. Any orders of
12 magnitude? There have been a range of approaches on
13 pay equity. I know that it's subject to negotiations,
14 but can you speak to the range of costs that have
15 been discussed to improve compensation for EMS?

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: So this
17 is not speaking to the range, but I know that we have
18 deferred to OLR on what it would cost. Maybe just to
19 put some context around what the scale is, the
20 average EMT salary, looking at base salary and
21 additions to gross but not including overtime, is
\$57,494. The average firefighter salary, base salary,
additions to gross, no overtime, is \$109,930. So,
it's almost double. It's 91 percent higher.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 314

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: And so if we were
4 to double the salary of every EMS worker, which is-
5 if I don't think is the likely outcome, but something
6 along those- if- how much would that cost us? Do you
7 have a broad sense of- I mean, I've seen estimates
8 that have ranged- that EMS is advocating- EMTs have
9 advocating for increases in wages from \$80 million up
10 to \$200 million or even more, potentially over a
11 multi-year. Comparable number- I mean, numbers that
12 are in a similar ballpark to what we could be talking
13 about for a fifth firefighter. Considering how dire
14 the situation is with EMT worker retention, in a
15 world of limited resources, I really do hope that we
16 focus on fixing this crisis that we have at EMT. The
17 fact that after five years an EMT can't make more
18 than \$59,000 is disgraceful. And I never- I- the
19 starting salary in my office is north of that. And
20 frankly, these are kids coming out of college who are
21 great and bright and amazing, and I'm lucky to have
them. But a person who's spent five years saving
lives across the city of New York deserves more and
deserves better. So I really- and then coming back,
if we were to add a fifth firefighter at a cost of

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 315

3 approximately \$180 million citywide- I'll ask
4 Commissioner or Chief, if you were handed a bucket of
5 \$180 million in cash and were told that you could do
6 anything in your power to reduce fire fatalities in
7 the City of New York, is hiring a fifth firefighter
8 at the top of your list? Do you think that would have
9 the greatest impact?

10 CHIEF ESPOSITO: And that's what we're
11 looking at. We're trying to figure out what would
12 have the greatest impact. It would have an impact. I
13 don't know if that would be the greatest impact in
14 every company around the city.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I'd imagine that
16 we could look a lot-

17 CHIEF ESPOSITO: [interposing] If I had
18 that bucket of money-

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Yeah.

20 CHIEF ESPOSITO: Right? Certainly, EMS
21 pay would be the top of the list.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I certainly
23 appreciate that too. I share that priority. We're on
24 the same page. In- for the- narrower purpose question
25 of how do we address what we have as a crisis of

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 316

3 fires in the Bronx and situations that need to be
4 resolved, fire prevention investments, investments to
5 address the most concerning housing stock, there are
6 a variety of different targeted ways that we could
7 probably smartly spend a whole lot less resources
8 that could have a bigger impact in reducing
9 fatalities from fire than a fifth firefighter and an
10 extraordinary cost cost of \$180 million citywide. Is
11 that fair?

12 CHIEF ESPOSITO: I think that's fair.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: So recognizing
14 that, and also recognizing that you said that the
15 fifth firefighter, the thing where they have the
16 greatest impact is getting the hose out and getting
17 water out. Firestock in the Bronx, six, seven-story
18 buildings. Is that the height of buildings that we
19 need to get that fifth firefighter in place? Are
20 those the areas that you would prioritize it having
21 the greatest impact?

CHIEF ESPOSITO: As a general statement,
yes. Right? It's a longer hose line stretch, 75 feet,
70-75 feet tall is the height of a building. Above

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 317

3 that you need a standpipe in it, which is different
4 from stretching off the apparatus.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: And then just to
6 make sure I got this right on the record, you said
7 that the response times in Queens and Staten Island
8 are slower than in the Bronx? You had five minutes
9 and 10 seconds in Queens and five minutes and two
10 seconds-- five minutes and 10 seconds in Queens, five
11 minutes in-- five minutes and five seconds in Queens,
12 five minutes and two seconds in Staten Island. Did I
13 have those right? The Bronx was ranked third in terms
14 of response time citywide.

15 CHIEF ESPOSITO: So Bronx was four minutes
16 58 seconds, Queens was five minutes two seconds,
17 Staten Island five minutes five seconds.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Okay, so all
19 about the same.

20 CHIEF ESPOSITO: And that's year-to-date
21 average response time to structural fires.

COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Okay. I really
appreciate the qu-- the responses. I'm sorry to get
frustrated earlier. I just think in a world where we
have limited resources, we want to invest them in the

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 318

3 places that are going to make the greatest difference
4 in saving lives. And we do have a crisis in the Bronx
5 that I'm very committed to advocating for with my
6 colleagues. I have seen the- I've seen Council Member
7 Pierina Sanchez in particular out on site with the
8 men and women of the FDNY, just in dire situations.
9 We do need to do more up there. I just want to make
10 sure we're spending our money smartly, and that's an
11 extraordinary expense that we don't have data to back
12 up the difference that it would make. And so I hope
13 we can be smart about how we prioritize things from
14 here. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Chair Ariola?

16 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Thank you. So, I
17 know that you said that you don't have any real data
18 about the fifth firefighter and whether or not it-
19 the fifth firefighter helps. We have opinions that
20 we've been sharing back and forth, but there have
21 been independent studies done, and I do have one here
where it notes that the fifth firefighter makes a
difference by eliminating kinks and drag, which you
guys know the lingo, enables the hose shuffle, frees
the pump operator, puts water faster on the fire, and

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 319
3 reduces firefighter fatigue. Would you agree with
4 that?

5 CHIEF EPOSITO: I think that's an
6 accurate statement.

7 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: So getting more
8 staffing in the busiest companies will put a line in
9 a place quicker, limit the spread of a fire and the
10 loss of life and the displacement of residents. At
11 the same time, reduce the strain on firefighters
12 operating on that fire. Would you agree with that?

13 CHIEF ESPOSITO: As a general statement,
14 yes.

15 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay. I'm going to
16 move on to- well, does the Fire Department have a
17 platform that tracks and prioritizes work order
18 requests, assessments, and resolution?

19 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: Yes, we
20 do. We have an asset management-

21 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: [interposing] I'm
sorry, I didn't hear you. I'm sorry.

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: Yes, we
do. We have an EAM. It's an asset management program.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 320

3 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay. And you use
4 the Niedermann systems as well, or-

5 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: Yes, we
6 have Niedermann systems.

7 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Niedermann system.
8 And how many systems are inoperable right now?

9 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: Zero.

10 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Zero. They're all
11 operable?

12 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: Yes.

13 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Oh, okay. All right.
14 Okay. Let's see. The FDNY has publicly cited a
15 substantial backlog of capital projects. Yet the
16 financial plan pushes the vast majority of the
17 facilities funding to the out years. Meanwhile, we
18 have identified a list of firehouses with severely
19 deteriorating roofs, of which only six projects have
20 been funded to date. We have serious concerns about
21 deferred maintenance, the adequacy of near-term
capital funding, and the administration's reliance on
councilmember allocations to fund what could be core
infrastructure. Do you have an amount needed to

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 321

3 repair all capital projects, and have you requested
4 that from the administration?

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: So, to
6 talk about facilities funding in general, so our
7 current capital plan includes \$994 million for
8 facilities across FY26 through FY35. The funding is
9 split pretty evenly between the first five years and
10 the last five years. It's actually slightly
11 front-loaded. So FY26 through FY30 is \$553 million,
12 whereas FY31 through FY35 is \$441 million. But even
13 with that, I mean, we have many facilities. We have
14 over 400 buildings, and they are old. So the average
15 age of our firehouses is approaching 100 years old,
16 and so the— our state of good repair needs have
17 exceeded our budget. I think we are seeing the budget
18 move in the right direction. So this plan includes an
19 additional \$24 million for roofs. And, you know, we
20 have also seen that our capital funding for
21 facilities over the last five years has nearly
doubled. We've seen significant adds to our budget
over the last five years.

CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Yet many firehouses
remain in disrepair, a few of which— and a number of

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 322

3 you, Commissioner, our Chief, and certainly Paul, we
4 were out there looking at them. So, how can you take
5 this pool of funding that is pushed into the out
6 years and encourage the administration to bring that
7 funding forward?

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: So, we do
9 have conversations with OMB about project
10 accelerations, and the Executive Budget did include
11 some funding accelerations on the facility side. It
12 included accelerating \$11.7 million into next year,
13 for renovations at one of our fleet maintenance
14 buildings, which will expand capacity. It included
15 accelerations of \$1.7 million into 27 and \$10.1
16 million into 28 for multi-component renovations at
17 EMS Station Four. It included \$10.5 million into FY27
18 to replace the apparatus floor at Engine Company 163,
19 and \$6.8 million into FY27 to replace air compressors
20 at our mask services unit. I think there are lots of
21 projects that we're looking at to see if there's a
potential for acceleration. Bandwidth is a part of
this too. So the additional civilian headcount that
was added in this plan will be incredibly beneficial
towards getting more projects done. So that will

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 323

3 allow us to hire more trade staff and facilities to
4 make repairs, it will help with our project

5 management capabilities, will help with procurement.

6 So we've lost a lot of procurement staff, and adding

7 back some of those folks will help get those design

8 and construction contracts that we need to get that

9 capital work moving done faster.

10 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay. So

11 realistically, we're not going to see any of this

12 money anytime soon, because once it goes into the

13 far-out years, like 35, it oftentimes evaporates. As

14 you know, because we have a lot of firehouses, you

15 said are nearing 100 years old, and there hasn't been

16 a nickel put into them in 100 years, and we've seen

17 the result of that, which is complete deterioration.

18 We have work orders in for 25 years that have not

19 been fulfilled, and we'll get into that later on.

20 We've identified a list of firehouses with severely

21 deteriorating roofs, totaling approximately \$80.9

million in estimated need as of 2024 with costs now

escalating further. So that's the other problem. As

we push further into the out-years, the cost of

fixing that firehouse, that issue, that EMS station

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 324

3 is much larger. So we don't have the money to cover
4 it fully. And a lot of it gets eaten up in the design
5 process. And that's what we're trying to stop. So six
6 of those projects have since been funded, right?

7 Engine 62, 96, 156, 264, 304, and 329, that's right?

8 Okay. What is the status of the remaining underfunded
9 roof projects by the list that my office gave to the
10 Fire Department, and when does the Department expect
11 to address them?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: So first,
13 we just want to express our appreciation, because one
14 of those roofs was funded by you, Council Member
15 Ariola. Actually, several of those roofs were funded
16 by council members. So there was funding provided by
17 Council Member Riley, Farias, and Carr. And you were
18 also instrumental in getting some of that roof
19 funding added for the Big House, which was another
20 one of the roofs on the list. So for the remaining
21 roofs, that's what the funding that was added for the
22 six roofs will go towards. It will help us prioritize
23 the next six roofs that are unfunded. We do have some
24 roof projects already underway, which I will defer to
25 Commissioner DeRocchis to talk about.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 325

3 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: Thank
4 you. Hi. We definitely do have some roofs that are on
5 the way. Some are already completed or nearing
6 completion. That would be Engine 325, Engine 161,
7 Engine Company 54, Engine 74, and Engine 301. And we
8 are constantly assessing the conditions of our roofs
9 with our trade staff, and we do as much of the
10 repairs as we possibly can while we are constantly
11 working with the OMB to accelerate that funding
12 forwards if possible.

13 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay. And as you
14 mentioned, a lot of those roofs that are already
15 funded came from council members that were funding in
16 their own districts. And the Big House, Council
17 Member Selvena Brooks-Powers advocated for that. I
18 advocated for that. And we saw the disrepair there,
19 but the funding is fully there. But why is it always
20 on the City Council? Why doesn't the administration
21 take care of their buildings? When we visited
buildings throughout the five boroughs, the condition
of those buildings, if visited by the Fire
Department, or the DOB, no one would be able to
inhabitate them. And that's a problem. So many of the

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 326
3 buildings on this list that I- that we provided for
4 you, which I'm looking to see here. Okay, none of
5 which made your list, but okay. You know, were
6 constructed between 1895 and 1929. That- you know,
7 the Fire Department has to advocate for these
8 projects, not just rely on the City Council. So how
9 many of these projects were sent by the Fire
10 Department to the admin asking for funding to
11 complete them? Was it just the six?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: So we
13 have had conversations with OMB and City Hall on all
14 of our capital needs. And so they are certainly aware
15 of the condition of our facilities, and the broad
16 needs that we've identified for them. But we do
17 operate under funding constraints, and so the six are
18 sort of the priority ones that have been identified
19 and funded.

20 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Right, but they won't
21 be even addressed until 2035, is that correct?

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: The
23 funding is currently in fiscal 31, and we're
24 currently assessing to see if it's possible to
25 accelerate.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 327

3 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: All right. And of the
4 list that the office provided you, how many of those
5 projects did you send to council members, when you
6 were asking for budget priority requests?

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: We can
8 double-check, but probably quite a few of them.

9 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Anybody here get a
10 request? Okay, none of us. Okay. I see that Council
11 Member Hudson has come back into the room, and I'm
12 going to defer to her right now for her to ask her
13 questions.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Thank you so
15 much, Chairs, and I appreciate it. I had to run to
16 another meeting, so my apologies. And please do tell
17 me if these questions have been asked, but I do want
18 to just jump in on the capital piece. I don't know
19 all of the questions that Chair Ariola has already
20 asked, but just want to say that in your testimony
21 you referenced some capital dollars in this fiscal
year as well as the out-years, and by my count, the
funding would go towards the renovations of about
eight buildings or so, and I was just curious to know
what percentage, that represents of your entire

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 328
3 physical infrastructure that needs repair? Stations,
4 firehouses, any other properties?

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: So I
6 think the things that were mentioned in the testimony
7 were probably the roofs that were just funded.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Yeah, six roofs.

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: Six, and
10 then there were a few projects that were accelerated,
11 but those are not the only projects funded. There are
12 many more projects actually funded. Those were just
13 the ones that—

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: [interposing] Many
15 more that are funded?

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: Yes, many
17 more.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Capital— many more
19 capital improvements that are funded already?

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: Yes. So,
21 of your total capital needs, how many of the projects
would you say are funded? Like 50 percent, 80
percent, 10 percent?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: I mean,
our capital needs are significant.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 329

3 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Are great, I
4 know, that's what I'm getting at. I'm trying to help
5 you.

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: But we do
7 have, you know, as I said, \$994 million across the
8 10-year plan for capital and \$553 million of that is
9 in the first five years of the plan.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: So almost half?

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Roughly.

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: About
14 half.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: So if that \$994
16 was a number?

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: Yes.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: \$994 million is
19 completed, then all your capital needs are taken care
20 of?

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: No. I
mean, there are— as I said before, given the number
of our facilities and their current state of repair,
our capital needs, you know, are— go beyond our
existing funding.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 330

3 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay. So I'm just
4 trying to figure out what of the existing funding
5 that's been allocated to address capital needs, what
6 percentage of that-- what percentage is that of the
7 total capital needs you have?

8 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: I would
9 have to say it's about 25 to 30 percent.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: 25 to 30 percent,
11 okay. So, I'm not going to attempt to do quick math
12 in my head. But \$100 million, roughly speaking, or
13 \$994 million, you said, is about 25 to 30 percent of
14 your total needs. Or is it the \$500 million?

15 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: I
16 believe it's the \$500 million.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: The \$500 million
18 is 25 to 30 percent of your total capital needs?
19 Okay.

20 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: I don't think
21 we have it quantified that way. I think, you know, we
have 400 or so buildings. Many of these buildings are
a century year-old.

COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Yep.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 331

3 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: Those capital
4 projects will continue to pop up as we go forward. I
5 don't think there's any place where we could say all
6 our capital needs will be secured and done if you
7 give us this amount of money, because it's a rotating
8 thing. It's, you know, as the buildings age, more and
9 more things things pop up.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Yeah.

11 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: So that's— I
12 think that's what you see in, like, why we're
13 struggling to try to give you an actual percentage.
14 The money that we have is the money that's going to
15 go towards the capital— the most needed capital
16 projects.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Good. Okay.

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: Yeah, I
19 was just gonna add for, for context, I mentioned this
20 earlier, but I don't know if it was when you were
21 out. So we have seen our capital funding for
facilities increased pretty substantially in the last
five years. If you looked five years ago, so in 2021,
our facilities funding was only about 37 percent of
our capital budget, and now it's more than half. It's

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 332

3 52 percent of our capital budget. It's grown by
4 nearly \$500 million. So-

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: [interposing]
6 Okay, that's great.

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: There's
8 still a lot of state of good repair needs-

9 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: [interposing]
10 Yeah.

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: that we
12 have to address, but we are seeing the budget move in
13 the right direction towards funding those state of
14 good repair needs. And another component of this is
15 really having the bandwidth in terms of civilian
16 staff to actually execute those projects. And so the-

17 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: [interposing]
18 Okay.

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: the 84
20 civilian positions that we got in this budget are
21 instrumental towards doing that. Both staff for
facilities and for procurement to execute on those
design and construction contracts that we need.

COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay. Thank you.
I appreciate it. And I'm- you know, not trying to be

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 333

3 difficult, just I'm trying to get down to the fact
4 that I would argue you could use far more capital
5 dollars to address the needs at all of your
6 buildings. And so I think you could probably agree
7 with that sentiment, perhaps.

8 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: More money would
9 solve more problems.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: There you go.
11 Okay. Great. And then I just want— did anyone ask
12 about cold weather events yet? Okay. If I can just
13 ask a couple questions. What percentage increase in
14 EMS calls occurs during extreme cold weather events
15 compared to normal conditions?

16 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: I don't know if
17 we have the exact number. Do you have the exact
18 number? I don't think we have the exact number of
19 what percentage, but certainly this last winter that
20 was way colder than any other winter we remember, and
21 for a longer period of time, we saw a significant
number increase in call volume. And as part of the
city's engagement with the folks that were out in the
field, we were right front center stage on that. So,
anytime that we see stretches of bad weather, whether

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 334
3 it be cold or hot, the call volume goes up for us. I-
4 and it goes, it goes up both on fire and EMS.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Right. Maybe you
6 can follow up with the specifics.

7 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: Yeah, we can
8 get back to you with that.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay, thank you.
10 And then, what additional budget allocations have
11 been designated for extreme cold weather operations?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: We
13 haven't had any specific budget adjustments tied to
14 extreme cold weather. I mean-

15 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: [interposing]
16 Okay.

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: to the
18 extent that, you know, we've incurred additional
19 overtime costs, that's been part of the adjustments
20 that were made in the last budget for our PS budget.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: I mean, I would
suggest that just given where we're going globally in
terms of climate change and all of that, and like you
mentioned, Commissioner, the winters are going to get
colder and longer, the summer's going to get hotter

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 335

3 and longer. You know, I would strongly advocate for
4 more funding or adjusted funding to accommodate, you
5 know, overtime and the needs as they grow during
6 those extreme weather conditions. And then just one
7 last question, Chairs. What's the demographic
8 breakdown of applicants versus hires as far as
9 percentages by race and gender.

10 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: Let
11 Commissioner Noonan talk to you about that.

12 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER NOONAN: Are you
13 referring to our firefighter applicants?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Both, if you have
15 it.

16 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER NOONAN: I would
17 have it for the fire applicants.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay, I'll take
19 what you have.

20 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER NOONAN: Okay. So
21 our most recent exam, we hired— we had about 20,000—
over 20,607 passers. 22 percent of those passers
were Black, 28 percent Hispanic, 40 percent white,
and six percent Asian, seven percent were women.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 336

3 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Are passers
4 hired?

5 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER NOONAN: They're
6 not hired. We haven't actually hired any of these
7 candidates yet. They're just now going through the
8 first step, which is passing the physical exam. So
9 that will continue through the end of June, and then
10 they'll start the background process.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Do you have any of
12 those statistics for previous fiscal years?

13 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER NOONAN: I probably
14 do. So for our previous firefighter exam- give me a
15 moment. Where did I put it? If you give me a second,
16 I'll-

17 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: [interposing]
18 Sure.

19 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER NOONAN: where I
20 put it. So for the last- the last exam, we had- in
21 terms of our test takers, we had 28 percent Black, 27
percent Hispanic, and 40- no, I'm sorry. I'm sorry.
25 percent Black. Our previous exam, 7001, which was
held in 2016-2017, 25 percent Black, 27 percent
Hispanic, and 44 percent white.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 337

3 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Those are— those
4 are for the applicants?

5 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER NOONAN: Those are
6 for the test takers.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: The test takers.
8 And then how many were hired? Were the— was the
9 demographic breakdown similar?

10 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER NOONAN: The
11 demographic breakdown is similar for those that were
12 reachable. 18 percent Black—

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Sorry, what do you
14 mean by reachable?

15 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER NOONAN: Reachable,
16 meaning they scored high enough on exam to be
17 reached, to be processed.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay. So does
19 that mean hired?

20 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER NOONAN: Not
21 specifically, not necessarily. The hiring would be
different.

COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Do you have the
hiring numbers?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 338

3 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER NOONAN: I don't
4 have that on me. I don't have the numbers of those
5 that were hired from the last exam. But we can very-

6 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Can you follow up
7 with that?

8 ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER NOONAN:
9 Absolutely, very easy to get that for you.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Okay, great. Thank
11 you so much. And, also just want to express my
12 gratitude for the entire department for everything
13 that you do to keep New Yorkers safe, and we greatly
14 appreciate it, and I would love to see more resources
15 and more money and pay parity for EMS division. So
16 thank you, and thank you, Chairs.

17 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: I just want to note
18 that I was just given another list that actually the
19 Fire Department gave our office in 2025 that were
20 priority engine companies and EMS stations that
21 needed- they were in terrible disrepair. And again,
the engine companies that you gave, 325, 161, 54, 74,
and 301, they're not even on your own priority list.
You didn't take anyone off your own priority list.
There's a reason for that?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 339

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: Because
4 those projects that were referred to were already
5 funded. So they would have been higher priorities,
6 but because we were able to allocate funding to them,
7 they weren't on the unfunded list. And so as projects
8 get funded, they will move off that unfunded priority
9 list.

10 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: So the list that I
11 have here, are they in priority? It's Engine 60, 91,
12 162, 236, 251, 257, 258, 259, 284, 290, 295, Engine
13 Company 318, 332, EMS Station 45, FT400S, RI number
14 7, and S228. Are they in priority order on— in this
15 chart? When the funding is available?

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: I don't
17 think that they're in priority order, but we could
18 follow up.

19 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay, we're going to
20 move on. Oh, I'm sorry. I'm so sorry. We're going—
21 Council Member Restler has one follow-up question.

COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Just one
question. I'm really sorry. Commissioner, remind me
how many years you worked as an EM— in EMS.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 340

3 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: I worked 31
4 years before I retired.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: So one of the
6 things that, you know, we hear a lot about, just like
7 Council Member Brewer, is the extreme impacts of the
8 noise from ambulances. We of course want ambulances
9 to get where they need to go as quickly as possible,
10 but I have long worried about the impact it has on
11 workers. Have you ever thought about the impact the
12 sirens has on the hearing of EMS workers? Is this
13 something that you're concerned about at all?

14 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: Yeah, that's a
15 common concern for all first responders, because we
16 spend our lives underneath the sirens. If you ask my
17 family, they will probably tell you that I've
18 suffered from that problem. But yeah, it's definitely
19 something we look at and it's something that the
20 entire EMS community looks at.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Yeah.

COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: And that's where
these conversations about rumblers versus sirens
versus wailing versus intermittent, like, all those

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 341

3 conversations come out of that concern. But that
4 would be the same for all first responders.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Yeah. I mean, I
6 think it's just worth remembering.

7 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: Yeah.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: We banned
9 smoking in restaurants because of the safety of--
10 thank you, Gale Brewer. That's good. We should just
11 premise, most statements-- thank you, Gale Brewer.
12 But-- preface most statements, excuse me. But we
13 banned smoking in restaurants because of the safety
14 of the workers in the restaurants and their-- the
15 health impacts they suffered from, from secondhand
16 smoke. I think it's worth thinking about, do we need
17 to devise a safer siren for the workers that are
18 dealing with that noise, you know, throughout all day
19 long, every single day.

20 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: Yeah, I
21 appreciate you bringing that up. I mean, we're happy
to continue those conversations. I think, you know,
these sirens need to be safer for the people who sit
under them all day long. They're exposed to so many

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 342
3 things. Siren is one aspect of that. They also need
4 to be functional in a way that people-

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: [interposing] 100
6 percent.

7 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: in a city this
8 size can hear us.

9 CHIEF MIANO: Recently we've added an EMS
10 division chief to our safety battalion, and just last
11 year during the summer, we actually did do a decibel
12 pilot in which we monitored or we tested the levels
13 of the siren inside the cab. And we expanded that to
14 our Gator and ASAP units, which some of the council
15 members have been so gracious to be able to purchase
16 for us. So, and these are the units that operate on
17 the beach during the summer, because they're in an
18 open- they're in an open compartment, rather than a
19 closed compartment. And we had them- we had those
20 decibel levels tested and we tried out different
21 types of hearing protection that also allowed them to
be able to hear the radio transmissions and
pedestrians. And, that- it was- it wasn't very
conclusive that the hearing protection changed the-
the decibel level wasn't above the OSHA amount inside

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 343

3 and the hearing protection was more of a hindrance to
4 the members than it was through their own- through
5 what they stated. It was more of a hindrance to them
6 hearing the radio, hearing pedestrians. So we are-
7 but we are looking at that.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Thank you both
9 for the response. And thank you, Chairs, for the
10 latitude.

11 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay, I'd like to
12 ask you to take a look at the screen. The chart on
13 the screen shows a list of fire apparatus. The ones
14 highlighted in yellow are restricted from relocation
15 under any circumstances until further notice. Two
16 questions: are the replacement rigs funded, and what
17 happens when one of those rigs goes out of service
18 for repair? Is the first due area left unprotected?
19 Are you able to make out the screen, or-

20 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: Maybe make it
21 bigger?

22 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: You know what, I'm
23 gonna- Yeah, we're gonna bring- we're gonna bring you
24 a copy.

25 CHIEF ESPOSITO: Thank you. Thank you.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 344

3 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: So you see the
4 highlighted in yellow shows the restrict- that these
5 rigs are restricted from relocation under any
6 circumstances.

7 CHIEF ESPOSITO: Yeah, so this is- this
8 deals with a contract provision with the fire
9 officers union about the age of first frontline
10 apparatus. And due to delays, the global supply chain
11 and delays during COVID, our manufacturer Seagrave
12 [sp?] which is in Wisconsin, is still backlogged on
13 some of these. I had visited the factory in November.
14 They had to lay off a significant number of their
15 workers during COVID. They went to hire them back,
16 and most of them did not come back. They are now up
17 and running, and they have been for a couple of
18 years. They continue to produce and deliver our
19 apparatus, but they are custom-made, and nobody else
20 in the country, no other fire department in the
21 country orders apparatus to our specifications,
because of the heavy-duty use we have, the roads that
we have, and they are all effectively custom-made. We
are continuing to receive them. They are being
delivered. On this list you have Ladder 111, which we

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 345

3 have which will be going into service- into service
4 soon. So, in accordance with the contract, when- and
5 we went through a grievance with the union on this,
6 the grievance and the arbitration. The arbitrator
7 decided that a relocation was not an emergency. The
8 department's position was opposite that, that
9 relocations are emergencies. So these apparatus are
10 not able to be used to relocate to cover other areas.
11 That does handicap the department at times, because
12 there are- there are times we would like to use these
13 to relocate.

14 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: So it's fair to say
15 that the first due area is left unprotected if one of
16 these rigs that are unable to be used are in that
17 engine company?

18 CHIEF ESPOSITO: No, it's other areas.
19 They have to stay in their area. They cannot be- they
20 cannot be sent to relocate somewhere else. So if
21 they're operating at a fire, we can send another
company to cover them. We cannot use any of these to
be sent to relocate somewhere else.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 346

3 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: And besides Ladder
4 111, how many others are funded? Are they all fully
5 funded?

6 CHIEF ESPOSITO: Oh, they're all funded-

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF:
8 [interposing] They're all funded.

9 CHIEF ESPOSITO: and they've all been
10 ordered on schedule.

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: Yeah. mhm,

12 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: All of the
13 highlighted?

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: So just
15 to, you know, add to that, this hasn't been a funding
16 issue. We've put in the orders for the replacement
17 apparatus on what would have been on time. In fact,
18 we've been putting in the orders earlier and earlier,
19 but because of the manufacturing delays, it has been
20 taking longer for us to receive the vehicles. But we
21 do track the companies that are in outdated
apparatus. And in terms of when they're going to be
resolved- so there's about 51 outdated apparatus in
the field right now. There are four pumpers we're
expecting that we'll have received those, and they'll

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 347

3 be in service later this calendar year. There are
4 seven squads, seven high-pressure pumpers, and four
5 75-foot tower ladders that we expect to be delivered
6 and in service by the end of 2026. There are two
7 95-foot tower ladders that we expect to be in service
8 by the end of summer. There are eight tractor-drawn
9 aerials that we expect to be in service by early
2027. And the most backlogged are 23 rear mounts that
we anticipate are about a year out.

10 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay. All right. Now,
11 again, on the screen, we're going to put up a series
12 of photos, many of which you have seen before and a
13 few new ones. The photos show water damage at Engine
14 59, Ladder 30 in Manhattan. The picture shows water
15 damage that has corroded the ceilings and walls of
16 the firehouse. There is a pipe that clearly shows the
17 water has been leaking out of it. The water has
18 damaged the steps inside the firehouse from the
19 constant leak, and we see steps with stains and
buildup. Were these conditions remedied? That's
Engine 59, Ladder 30.

20 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: Yes,
21 yes, yes, thank you. Yeah, so we've been working with

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 348

3 our trade staff to address all these issues and to
4 try and work on correcting them until we could get
5 funding later on.

6 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: So you're working
7 with the firefighters that are in there, is that what
8 you mean?

9 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: No,
10 no, no, with our trade staff.

11 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Oh, the trade— okay.

12 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: Yes,
13 I'm sorry.

14 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay. Next we have—
15 we're up? A roof leak at Engine 262 in Astoria,
16 Queens, that has at least five work orders reported:
17 1/25/23, 4/29/23, 11/25/25, 1/7/26, 2/15/26. In the
18 pictures, we see a dropped ceiling that is missing
19 tiles from what looks like a leak. The tiles are
20 filled with heavy water stains. There is another
21 picture of a ceiling covered with tiles that seem to
be missing. There is a picture of a blue wall
surrounding a window air conditioning unit with what
appears to be the outlet of the unit left out of it.
What is the status of these repairs?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 349

3 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: Again,
4 our trade staff has responded and repaired the roof
5 on Building 262 as well as replaced the ceiling
6 tiles. And I believe they're currently working on the
7 walls as we speak.

8 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Well, okay. The next
9 photo is of the first floor of Engine 4, Ladder 15.
10 The first picture shows the crumbled support wall of
11 the firehouse between the two apparatus doors. Was
12 that repaired?

13 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: Yes,
14 following the ledge last budget hearing, we quickly
15 went out there to assess it to determine that it's
16 not a structural wall. Our vendor was there, and we
17 completed that wall restoration, I believe, on May
18 15th.

19 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay. The picture
20 we're looking at now is the rear wall of the
21 apparatus floor, which we also see crumbling. This is
the same location. There are also many areas with
ceiling tiles missing around the light fixtures, with
either water-stained tiles surrounding the missing
tiles. So we can assume the tiles were missing due to

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 350
3 water damage from the leak. Were these conditions
4 corrected?

5 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS:
6 Correct. The same vendor who fixed the wall in
7 between the apparatus was also corrected that wall
8 there and the ceiling tiles have been repaired.

9 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay.

10 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: And/or
11 replaced.

12 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: That is not my
13 photo. That's the previous photo and he said it was
14 corrected. Should be Engine 229. Okay. This is the
15 roof of Engine 229, Ladder 146 in Brooklyn. The photo
16 shows ceiling damage and the roof has sunk from its
17 proper place. The roof should be in line with the
18 metal rail on the exterior wall. The picture shows
19 the roof about one foot below the metal rail. This
20 was reported on 10/22/25. The next picture shows
21 water damage happening inside the firehouse above a
cooling and heating unit. The last time we were here,
we also discussed the various work orders submitted
for the Niedermann system. For those who do not know,
the Niedermann is the vacuum we attach— they attach

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 351
3 to the apparatus to exhaust- to the exhaust system to
4 capture exhaust and diesel fumes. The orders were
5 submitted on 2/11/26, 2/18/26, and 2/26/26. You said
6 earlier that all Niedermann systems have been
7 repaired. Is this one repaired?

8 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: That
9 is correct.

10 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay.

11 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: I
12 would also like to talk about the roof.

13 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Yes, please.

14 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: If you
15 could show it again. So, that- the roof has also been
16 repaired. The interior damage, the ceilings has been
17 repaired, and we are working on the walls. But I
18 would like to explain a little bit about what you
19 refer to as the roof sinking and that metal rail.

20 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay, great.

21 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: That
22 detail is the proper detail. It does not show that
23 the roof is sinking. That piece of aluminum flashing
24 that you see right there- exactly. That's called
25 through-wall flashing, and right below that, you see

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 352

kind of like the roof member kind of curves up?

3 That's an entire roof parapet waterproofing detail
4 that we try to mimic— actually, we install at every
5 one of our new roofing projects. That roof never
6 sank, although the roof did need repair, and it has
7 been repaired. I believe I showed a very similar
8 situation, the roof of Engine 329 on Friday to
9 Phyllis when we were up on the roof. So that is our
10 standard condition that we try to— well, actually,
11 that we do build at all of our facilities that have
masonry parapet wall similar to that.

CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay, for the record,
12 Phyllis Inciareello is my Chief of Staff and Senior
13 Advisor. Okay, now we're going to our next photo,
14 Ladder 78. Ladder 78 has put in for an unstable front
15 parapet wall of the firehouse numerous times. In June
16 of 2023, Buildings Unit subcontracted out a company
17 to put a protective netting over the unstable parapet
18 wall. No repairs have been done since the netting has
19 been put on the parapet. Previous work orders were
20 submitted on 6/21/22, 3/11/22, 12/6/21, and
21 1/25/2020. Was this— was this repair completed?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 353

3 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: So that
4 is Engine Company 155, and yes, we did stabilize the
5 condition with that netting there. Okay.

6 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Yes.

7 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: This
8 facility was also submitted as part of the roofing
9 package that we had submitted. We do believe that six
10 of these projects have been funded. We're not sure
11 exactly which six. Is that correct?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHRISTOFF: We can
13 prioritize which six.

14 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: Okay,
15 so we could definitely prioritize which of these six
16 have funding. And while we could prioritize that, we
17 also have our- an outside vendor who's our
18 engineering team working with us on the best
19 approach.

20 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay, all right,
21 thank you. Okay. The next picture is from Squad 288
in Maspeth. The apparatus floor is buckling, patched
with concrete. The following picture shows how it is
being held up by hoists that were installed in 2001,
which are now also buckling and unsteady. The

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 354
3 apparatus floor holds rigs that weigh several tons.
4 There are some times flooding in the basement, which
5 also compromises the hoists. What is the status of
6 the repairs here?

7 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: So for
8 Squad 288, those are what we refer to as floor jacks.
9 They are supporting the apparatus floor because the
10 apparatus floor is in need of a replacement and an
11 overall multi-component project. Currently, we have
12 funding to do windows at Squad 288, which we are
13 moving forwards with once the funding is registered.
14 And the funding for the multi-component aspect of it,
15 which would be the appraised floor, that funding is
16 in the outer years, which we are working with OMB
17 while we're doing the windows to try to accelerate
18 that funding forward so we could get them as close to
19 simultaneous as possible.

20 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Good. Okay. This
21 slide is the rest area for firefighters at Engine
290, Ladder 103 in Brooklyn. We see a red wall with a
large gaping hole that exposes the brick of the
building structure. There are pipes exposed as well.
There is also water damage all along the wall, and

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 355

3 there is a bed to the side. How do you think that
4 this damage should be repaired? That's how it was
5 repaired. How do you think it should be repaired?

6 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: Well, I
7 believe that, that hole was made for us to access
8 some of the piping behind the wall to address a leak.
9 Although Engine Company 290 is definitely one of
10 those buildings that needs a complete roof
11 restoration and building envelope restoration. Again,
12 this is one of those that is on the list where we
13 received six of the funding for and we will continue
14 to prioritize this, and hopefully we could get this
15 one in there too.

16 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Right? I just, for
17 the record, have to note that the slide we're looking
18 at is the current condition of the same red wall with
19 the hole in it. But we now see a metal plate that has
20 been placed by facilities over the hole. The water is
21 now pooling to the left of the metal plates, and that
is evident in the photo. And you can see the paint
bubbling directly above the powered outlet. Okay, our
video. We'll get there. Okay, in this video, we see a
pipe along the ceiling of Engine 290, Ladder 103 in

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 356

3 Brooklyn. The pipe has water pouring from it, and
4 when the camera pans down, you can see the water is
5 leaking directly onto the oil burner. Why has this
6 gone unrepaired?

7 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: It's
8 hard to say that it's gone unrepaired. Whenever
9 something like that happens, a work order is called
10 in immediately to our resource center. And depending
11 on what the issue is on- like, on an order like that,
12 we would have our plumbers respond as well as maybe
13 our oilers, which would be the HVAC guys to make sure
14 that that boiler is operational. So I wouldn't say
15 it's going unrepaired if it's an active leak like
16 that. I'm not exactly sure what type of pipe that
17 specifically is, but the water does look pretty
18 clean, so I'm not going to say it's a sewer pipe. I
19 just don't know from that picture.

20 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay. Have you
21 received a work order for that particular engine and
22 ladder company and that particular leak?

23 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: With
24 300 work orders a week, it's pretty difficult for me
25 to answer that question specifically.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 357

3 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Well, you were asked
4 to bring a computer today so that you could look up-

5 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: Do not
6 have it. Why would you not have it when a specific
7 request was made for facilities to bring a computer
8 so that you could look up the work orders?

9 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: I just
10 do not have it with me. I could definitely let you
11 know about this work order.

12 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Commissioner, we let
13 Jason know very pointedly that we needed for
14 facilities to have a computer with them so that they
15 could look it up so that we could know what's been
16 done and if they had received a work order, and the
17 fact that that request from this committee was
18 completely disregarded is unacceptable and
19 disrespectful.

20 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: Can I
21 just add? The request was not disregarded. I just
22 didn't have the computer readily available to bring
23 today.

CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Come on now.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 358

3 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: No,
4 I'm--

5 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: [interposing] No, no,
6 no, I'm not going to accept that.

7 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER DEROCCHIS: But I
8 do have a staffer back at the office who
9 unfortunately is not there at the moment. This might
10 be her texting me right now. No, she unfortunately
11 had to leave the office for a family emergency, so I
12 do not have that specific information for you yet.

13 COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: We're happy to
14 get you the information that you need. We can't
15 change-- can't-- unfortunately, we can't change the
16 fact we don't have the computer. We did have somebody
17 at the office that could have answered it, but
18 they're gone.

19 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Well, that was the
20 reason for the computer. That's why the ask was made
21 in advance.

COMMISSIONER BONSIGNORE: I understand.

CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: And it was made to
Jason Shelly. And Jason, you know, you've been around
long enough to understand that when I ask for

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 359

3 something for this committee, I expect it to be
4 provided. And if it cannot be provided, I need to
5 know ahead of time. But in situations like this where
6 it's expected, you know, I don't have it because
7 there was not a computer available to me is not an
8 answer. On that note, we'll be checking on each of
9 the slides that we saw to make sure that the work is
10 being done. But I think anybody with eyes can see
11 that the work being done is just a Band-Aid. It's
12 just a Band-Aid, and the facilities are falling
13 apart, and our firefighters and our EMS workers are
14 working in substandard conditions. They are living
15 there. The better part of their days and nights are
16 spent at the EMS stations and at the fire stations,
17 and they are living in worse conditions than we would
18 allow anyone to live in. And as I said earlier, if
19 you as the Fire Department were called to inspect
20 those buildings, or the DOB went down to inspect
21 those buildings, they would be closed. So shame on
this administration. Commissioner, I know that you
are new and you are doing everything you can to try
and remedy this, but shame on anyone who's been here
for a long time and has let this go by year after

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 360

3 year after year without fixing the locations where
4 your firefighters- you as firefighters have let it go
5 this far, that 100-year-old buildings have not had
6 had a nickel put into it unless a council member
7 provided it. And then even then, money is held up
8 with OMB. It's totally unacceptable. And we will
9 bring that up at the OMB hearing. If no one- if you
10 have any- anything to add, Council- Chair Lee?

11 CHAIRPERSON LEE: No, I just wanted to
12 thank you all for extending your time, because I know
13 that we are past the time, and thank you for sticking
14 around and answering all of our questions. And I
15 admire Chair Ariola's passion, and I hope you
16 understand that it's- as someone who's been through
17 the capital process before with the city on the
18 nonprofit side, I understand it's a horrible process
19 that's very slow. There's a lot of regulations, tons
20 of regulations. But, you know, Chair Ariola, myself,
21 and I think all the other council members, we do want
to make sure that we understand your priorities, that
we're able to support it where we can, and that we
are partners with you because we do care, as you
obviously saw- heard- just heard from Chair Ariola,

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 361
3 about the firefighters that are serving our city and
4 keeping us safe. And so, just wanted to thank you for
5 being here today and for the hearing. And I think if
6 there's nothing else, I think that's— we are done for
the day. So thank you so much. Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Thank you, Chair
8 Lee, for your partnership.

9 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you.

10 [gavel]
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 362
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11

12 C E R T I F I C A T E
13
14

15 World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing
16 transcript is a true and accurate record of the
17 proceedings. We further certify that there is no
18 relation to any of the parties to this action by blood
19 or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome
20 of this matter.
21

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY
2 AND COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT 363



8 Date June 30, 2026

9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21