

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS,  
PUBLIC SITINGS, RESILIENCY  
AND DISPOSITIONS

----- X

March 3, 2026  
Start: 11:01 a.m.  
Recess: 12:26 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway - 8th Floor - Hearing  
Room 3

B E F O R E: Christopher Marte,  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Alexa Avilés  
Oswald J. Feliz  
Kamillah Hanks  
Sandy Nurse  
Chi A. Ossé  
Lincoln Restler  
Shanel Thomas-Henry  
Phil Wong

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Tara Deighan  
DEP (In favor)

Kate Edden  
Bureau of Engineering, Design, and  
Construction(In favor)

Terrell Estes  
Bureau of Sustainability(In favor)

Tanya Oberoi  
ROM Realty(In favor)

Maggie Macdonald  
Sive, Paget and Riesel Law Firm (In Opposition)

Melanie Rodrigo  
HPD's Division of Planning and Predevelopment (In  
favor)

Kyle Jeremiah  
Director of External Affairs for BRC (In favor)

Nicole Clare  
BRC's Chief Real Estate Development Officer (In  
favor)

Deborah Morris  
New York City Health and Hospitals Corporation  
(In favor)

Joy Resor  
Director of Manhattan Planning at HPD (In favor)

Ernesto Vigoreaux  
Apex Building Group (In favor)

Isaac Alderstein  
Executive Director of Broadway Community (In  
favor)

Lawrence Fowler  
Emma L. Bowen Community Service Center (In favor)

Joelle Ballam-Schwan  
Supportive Housing Network of New York (In favor)

Marsha Jean-Charles  
Brotherhood Sister Soul (In favor)

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
RESILIENCY, AND DISPOSITIONS 4

SERGEANT AT ARMS: This is a microphone check for the Committee on Landmarks, Public Sitings, Resiliency, and Dispositions, located in Hearing Room 3, on March 3rd, 2026, by Pat Kuzyna (SP?).

SERGEANT AT ARMS: This is a microphone check for the Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public Sitings, Resiliency, and Dispositions located in Hearing Room 3 on March 3rd, 2026, by Pat Kuzyna.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good morning, good morning. Welcome to the New York City Council hearing on the Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public Sitings, Resiliency and Dispositions. At this time, please silence all electronics and do not approach the dais.

Chair, you may begin.

CHAIRPERSON MARTE: [GAVEL] Good morning. Welcome to the meet- the meeting of the Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public Siting, Resiliency and Disposition. I'm Council Member Christopher Marte. I'm the Chair of the Subcommittee. I am joined today by my colleague, uh, Council Member Thomas-Henry. Before we b- begin today's agenda, I'll remind everyone that this meeting is being held in a hybrid format.







1           SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
2                           RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS

8

an email request to land use

3           testimony@council.nyc.gov.

4                   Now the applicant team may begin.

5           TARA DEIGHAN: Hi, my name is Tara Deighan. I am  
6 a Senior Advisor for Government Relations and  
7 Community Affairs for DEP, and I just wanted to kick  
8 it off before I turn it over to my colleagues but  
9 thank you to the Subcommittee for having us speak  
10 with you today on this important project.

11           Um, I'm, I'm joined today by Terrell Estes, who  
12 is with our Bureau of Sustainability, and Kate Edden,  
13 who is with our Bureau of Engineering, Design, and  
14 Construction and we are happy to be here today. This  
15 is a pretty monumental project. It's \$3 billion of  
16 investment, um, and the amount of pollution we will  
17 be preventing from getting into Newtown Creek is  
18 actually, um, enormous and significant.

19           So thank you for having us. I do wanna give a  
20 quick shout out to Council Member Restler. He worked  
21 so hard, um, with us on this project to refine it and  
enhance it, and I think we're getting a better  
product out of it. Um, so I just wanted to say a  
quick thank you to him as well. I know he's not  
here. Um, but I'm gonna kick it over to, uh, my team







1           SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
            RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS 12

2 ground being constructed utilizing a tunnel boring  
3 machine or TBM.

4           Go to the next slide. So on this slide and the  
5 next, you'll be able to see the land use surrounding  
6 each project construction sites. Uh, these are  
7 primarily manufacturing with some commercial use.  
8 All of these sites fall within an IBZ or industrial  
9 business zone. Um, here we can see 3 of the  
10 diversion facility sites and if you go to the next  
11 slide, you can see the fourth diversion facility site  
12 and the site of the tunnel dewatering pump station,  
13 uh, which will also serve as the base for tunneling  
14 operations.

15           I'm now gonna pass over the presentation to  
16 Terrell, who will walk us through the proposed land  
17 use actions.

18           TERRELL ESTESEN: Thank you very much. Next  
19 slide. So we have 2 land use actions to support the  
20 project. Uh, site selection and acquisition, as well  
21 as site selection. These are needed to allow DEP to  
site infrastructure and acquire property interests as  
needed for the project.

          Next slide. Being more than 3 miles long, the  
project would cross many properties. There are 99



2 notified effective property owners of community  
3 board, borough board, and city planning commissions  
4 as required for ULURP. Next slide.

5 This slide shows the tunnel easement  
6 configuration. The easement would basically be in  
7 the shape of a rectangle below ground with two zones.  
8 In the lower zone or exclusive subterranean easement  
9 zone, no work would be allowed. In the upper zone or  
10 non-exclusive subterranean easement zone, work would  
11 be allowed subject to DEP review and approval.

12 So, for properties with a tunnel easement,  
13 there'd be no restrictions for work at the surface or  
14 above grade or to subgrade work for varying depth up  
15 to 75 feet. Next slide.

16 Now we'll talk through the sites where there  
17 would be surface work. The first and largest site is  
18 where we would do the tunnel dewatering pump station,  
19 um, shown on the right. This is currently city-owned  
20 land, is- and it is the former Green Point Marine  
21 Transfer Station site. We would launch the tunnel  
boring machine from here, and when tunneling is done,  
build the pump station to dewater the tunnel after a  
rain event.



2 shown in green, Lot 170, would be acquired. It's  
3 currently a warehouse leased to FedEx for trucking.  
4 There is an existing outfall on Lot 162, which is and  
5 would remain part of the MTA Master lease with the  
6 city. Next slide.

7 This shows where we are in the ULURP process.  
8 The applications were certified on September 15th,  
9 and we've received favorable or conditional favorable  
10 recommendations from Community Boards Brooklyn 1,  
11 Queens 2, and Queens 5, and Brooklyn and Queens  
12 Borough Presidents, the Queens Borough Board, and we  
13 received approval from the City Planning Commission.  
14 Next slide.

15 This slide shows the overall project schedule.  
16 We would begin acquisition following ULURP. The  
17 construction would be done in 3 contracts: the first  
18 for site prep at the tunnel launch site; the second  
19 for the construction of the tunnel and diversion  
20 facilities; and the third to build the tunnel  
21 dewatering pump station.

Overall construction would begin in 2028 and  
would be finished by the end of 2040. Next slide.  
With that, we'd be glad to answer any questions you  
have.

1           SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
              RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS

17

2           CHAIRPERSON MARTE: Thank you for your  
3 presentation. I want to recognize Council Member  
4 Ossé and Council Member Feliz online.

5           I have a few questions, um, in regards to the  
6 easement restriction being placed on some of the  
7 properties, uh, for the properties requiring  
8 permanent subterranean easement, what long-term  
9 restrictions will property owners face with those  
10 easements in place?

11           TERRELL ESTESEN: Do you wanna answer that?

12           KATE EDDEN: I can answer it. Yeah. Mhm. So, uh,  
13 the easement, as Terrell mentioned, um, is  
14 approximately 25 to 75 feet below ground. That's  
15 where that easement will begin. Um, above that and  
16 around that, there are no restrictions. The upper  
17 portion of the easement, um, what we're calling the  
18 non-exclusive zone, Development would be allowed, but  
19 DEP would like to review any plans for development  
20 within that area.

21           And then directly around the easement in the  
22 lower portion, we're saying no development directly  
23 adjacent to the tunnel to protect the structural  
24 integrity of the tunnel.

2 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: Okay. Um, how does DEP ensure  
3 fair compensation for the owners whose properties  
4 will be encumbered by permanent easement?

5 KATE EDDEN: Sure. Um, so DCAS is managing our  
6 property acquisition for this. Um, to start, we've  
7 reached out to each owner and requested a donation of  
8 these easements. Um, if each owner feels that there  
9 is a justification for value of this area, which is  
10 well below most structural piles for any type of  
11 structure that they would wanna construct, um, they  
12 can negotiate that with DCAS and fair compensation  
13 will be provided.

14 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: To, to DEP's knowledge, how  
15 has those conversations have gone?

16 KATE EDDEN: Um, so we can't negotiate in earnest  
17 until ULURP is complete. Okay. So all we can do up  
18 in this point is let owners know that we're seeking  
19 this easement.

20 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: Okay.

21 KATE EDDEN: Um, let them know we're interested  
in this, let them know when ULURP will be done, and  
then we plan to do another set of outreach once we  
receive approval.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS 19

2 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: Sounds good and I guess along  
3 those lines, what's the ongoing communication with  
4 affected owners during construction and long-term  
5 operation?

6 KATE EDDEN: Sure. So we will have a community  
7 construction liaison. Um, they're actually being  
8 brought on board soon, um, well ahead of  
9 construction, um, as part of a construction  
10 management team. Um, DEP has a lot of experience  
11 doing work directly within even residential  
12 communities.

13 So, um, we'll follow a similar approach, uh,  
14 outreaching to community ahead of any work that may  
15 impact them.

16 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: Um, that's all the questions  
17 I have. Are, uh, any other council members have any  
18 questions for the panel? I know, like, I know  
19 Council Member Restler does. I'll give him a minute  
20 to get ready.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Is somebody sending me  
the presentation? Brian is? Okay, thank you. Um,  
okay, great. Okay, well, thank you to the DEP team  
for joining us today and for this presentation. I do  
wanna just take a moment to say that I think DEP took

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS 20

2 impressive initiative here to update the long-term  
3 control plan. Nobody told you you had to do this.  
4 And, uh, and it was the right thing to do, and I  
5 think yields significant improvements to the previous  
6 long-term control plan. So I just wanna commend our  
7 former Commissioner Rit, um, Deputy Commissioner  
8 Licata, and of course the team here today, and wanna-  
9 thank them for their work, and we can hear the  
10 overflow room of whatever's happening in  
11 transportation right now.

12 If anyone has opinions on the streets, on the  
13 master streets plan, you can go down the hall. Um,  
14 so I, you know, this project is an important step  
15 toward cleaning up Newtown Creek, and, you know, it  
16 doesn't happen overnight, but this, you know, the  
17 DEP's commitment to expanding the tunnel capacity and  
18 decreasing decreasing the amount of untreated sewage  
19 entering this waterway is a major, uh, environmental  
20 priority for the Newtown Creek community, including  
21 my neighborhoods, Council Member Gutiérrez's  
neighborhoods, and even for the folks in Queens.

Um, our community- I make that- that was a joke.  
Uh, our communities in District 33 are especially  
prone to flooding, and, you know, we need ongoing

2 significant commitments from DEP uh, to expand green  
3 infrastructure, improve stormwater management  
4 investment, enhance stormwater management  
5 investments, and, and just reduce flooding risk, uh,  
6 and reduce sewer overflow, uh, into our combined  
7 sewage overflow into our waterway.

8 Uh, I just want to get a few things on the  
9 record. Some of these things we've had in- we've  
10 discussed in conversation previously, but I just  
11 think it's important that per- you know, for the  
12 purposes of the hearing.

13 Um, and I apologize, Chair Marte, for my  
14 tardiness, but we've heard from local businesses in  
15 our community in the industrial area who have  
16 concerns about how this tunnel could impact their  
17 businesses, uh, in the area in, in northern  
18 Greenpoint.

19 Um, what precautions will you be taking to ensure  
20 that tunnel construction does not adversely impact  
21 the foundations of existing buildings or the ability  
for future construction on these lots?

22 KATE EDDEN: Sure. Um, I'll start by saying that  
23 this is a significant construction project, and I  
24 think, uh, in our community board interactions, um,





2 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: When do you expect that  
3 person to be in place?

4 KATE EDDEN: Later this summer.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: This summer?

6 KATE EDDEN: Yeah.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: And I'd just like to  
8 have a commitment that there's gonna be proactive  
9 communication to the, um, uh, er, industrial  
10 businesses in the adjacent area, working with my  
11 office, working with Evergreen to make sure that  
12 local stakeholders are fully aware of what's going on  
13 and that we're thinking collaboratively and  
14 creatively for how to mitigate issues.

15 KATE EDDEN: Yes, absolutely and we've heard from  
16 a lot of those folks and we've had one-on-one  
17 interactions with them. We've provided opportunities  
18 to discuss how this may impact them, um, and we  
19 continue to maintain com- conversations with them.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: And just going back to  
21 my earlier question on the impacts of tunnel  
construction on local businesses and ensuring that  
this tunnel construction does not adversely impact  
the foundations of existing buildings or the ability  
to build in the future on these lots?

2 KATE EDDEN: Yes, absolutely. So, uh, we were  
3 talking about the location of the easements. These  
4 easements are below ground. They're below what most,  
5 uh, structural, uh, structural structures would be  
6 below a facility. Um, they wouldn't prevent further  
7 development on that lot other than just within that  
8 corridor below ground. Um, this project has a team  
9 that's constructed similar facilities in similar  
10 cities of similar density. I mean, New York is its  
11 own animal in some ways, but, um, they understand the  
12 risks and the implications of doing work like this.  
13 Uh, we are doing our due diligence, uh, to collect  
14 all available information on all of these properties,  
15 and then they'll be monitoring during construction to  
16 absolutely ensure there'd be no negative impact to  
17 any structures new or, or older.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: And my understanding is  
19 that no anticipated impacts for the current zoning.  
20 This could impact our ability for future upzonings in  
21 areas where tunnels have been constructed. Is that  
true?

KATE EDDEN: I don't know that it would. Um, I  
think it would sort of need to be on a case-by-case  
basis to look at something like that, but we're

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS

26

2 talking about a swath of land, uh, below ground where  
3 we're asking you to not develop. Um, and that would  
4 start approximately, you know, 55 feet below ground  
5 at its shallowest, where there's absolutely no  
6 development within that zone. Um, and about 60 feet  
7 across. So you could still construct, um, a  
8 high-rise structure, um, any other kind of facility  
9 around that easement zone.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Great. And you know, we  
9 continue to be, just as I noted in my kind of opening  
10 remarks, profoundly concerned about flooding risks in  
11 our community, and just would love to hear a  
12 commitment that DEP is going to partner with my  
13 office to try to identify more green infrastructure  
14 opportunities, more, uh, uh, projects that can help  
15 reduce flooding in our area.

15 KATE EDDEN: Yeah, absolutely, so that might be  
16 Tara.

16 TARA DEIGHAN: Yeah. Hmm. I, I can speak to  
17 that. Um, of course we're happy to do that. We're  
18 already looking at several sites in your district  
19 that you had mentioned. Um, and I think there's some  
20 opportunity for sure there.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Great.

21

TARA DEIGHAN: Yeah.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I think we would love to  
4 get some consequential updates on those fronts as  
5 this project moves forward, just to understand where  
6 things are at. And I just, I wanna say in closing,  
7 I, you know, reached out to DEC to push for approval  
8 on this long-term control plan on their side because  
9 I think what you all have done is the right thing to  
10 do. And, um, you know, we should be looking for our-  
11 for leadership in our agencies to be creative, to, to  
12 push for more ambitious solutions. You know, this  
13 plan will significantly reduce the anticipated  
14 combined sewage overflow that's going into Newtown  
15 Creek, and I think reduce negative impacts that would  
16 have happened in our communities under the previous  
17 plan. Uh, so on both fronts, this feels like a very  
18 positive development. Um, we'll always try to  
19 identify ways to do things even better and be more  
20 ambitious and make sure that the coordination and  
21 consultation with our community is, is done the right  
way.

Uh, but I'm, I'm broadly pleased with, uh, the  
work the DEP has done here and grateful for your



1           SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
            RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS

29

2           Um, but we'll also have monitoring to just  
3 measure any settlement that may occur during the  
4 boring of the tunnel. Uh, the tunnel will be bored  
5 24 hours a day but in cycles. So the work will be  
6 going on all the time, but during some times the  
7 tunnel will be boring and sometimes it'll be  
8 removing, um, the soil that's coming out.

9           COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: On a related question, uh,  
10 the TBM will be lower somewhere, right? Where will  
11 it get lower and get assembled?

12           TARA DEIGHAN: Sure. So at the, uh, tunnel  
13 dewatering pump station site, as we're referring to  
14 it, it's the former DSNY Marine Transfer Station  
15 adjacent to the Newtown Creek Wastewater Resource  
16 Recovery Facility. That will be the base for  
17 tunneling operations. Uh, the TBM will be brought  
18 down in a shaft and constructed below ground, um, and  
19 all, uh, tunnel- we call it tunnel muck, but any, uh,  
20 rock soil that's removed, will be removed out through  
21 that site.

            COUNCIL MEMBER WONG: At the end of the project,  
the TBM will be, like, left there, right? Uh, um,  
you're not going to recover it?



2 Newtown Creek is home to multiple Superfund sites  
3 designated by the EPA and is undergoing multiple  
4 cleanups. But in addition to that, much of District  
5 34 is served by a combined sewer system where  
6 stormwater and wastewater share the same pipes.  
7 During the periods of heavy rainfall, these systems  
8 can exceed capacity, and the SS flow is released into  
9 waterways like Newtown Creek through what is known as  
10 combined sewer overflow, er, uh, CSOs.

11 While these are intended to prevent, uh, backups  
12 within the sewer system, they result in untreated  
13 wastewater entering the creek, affecting the water  
14 quality, ecological health, and ongoing efforts to  
15 restore this historically overburdened waterway. The  
16 Newtown Creek, uh, er, ah, CSO tunnel proposal  
17 represents a significant and long overdue investment  
18 aimed at capturing and storing excess stormwater and  
19 wastewater during heavy rainfall, reducing the  
20 frequency of this discharge and improving  
21 environmental conditions along the creek.

Following conversations with the Department of  
Environmental Protection and the feedback from  
Community Board 1 in Brooklyn, and Queens Community  
Board 5, it is my understanding that, that impacted



1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS

33

2 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: Counsel, are there any  
3 members of the public who wish to testify on this  
4 item?

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Um, we have one that I have,  
6 so if you, um, don't hear your name, please let a  
7 Sergeant know.

8 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: We have Tanya Oberoi. Yes,  
9 okay. You may begin. Uh, I think you have to press  
10 the button. There you go.

11 TANYA OBEROI: Hi, my name is Tanya Oberoi. I  
12 represent ROM Realty, uh, one of the companies on the  
13 corridor for, uh, Newtown Creek. We actually have  
14 interests on both sides of the creek, and we are a  
15 private company and have been working there for a  
16 very long time. We support this project. Um, we  
17 just wanted to bring up some of our concerns, um,  
18 some of which we— and I have spoken several times in,  
19 in the meetings.

20 Um, we would like to, um, bring to, like,  
21 everyone's attention that we're looking for some  
22 assurances. While this project is a long-term  
23 project, um, and they're going under our, our  
24 property on two different sides, we wanna make sure  
25 that the, uh, the DP is— they're not as transparent

1           SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
2                           RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS

34

2 as we would like, er, someone from, you know, the  
3 local community. Um, I'm, I'm very happy to hear-  
4 this is my first time hearing that there is a  
5 community construction liaison. So at least we have  
6 a go-to person that can answer questions. DEP can't  
7 answer our emails, uh, without legal, so I, I was  
8 happy when the, you know, we got the email with the  
9 FEIS. But we wanna make sure that, um, they're able  
10 to give us assurances that when they're digging under  
11 the, the properties, that they're able to, um, ah,  
12 with the, the, the planning that they've made and  
13 the, the map and the direction that they've done,  
14 that it's gonna be safe. And, and that they're not  
15 gonna have any derailments on, uh, building  
16 structures and having to stop or pause any parts of  
17 the project that's gonna further delay it because  
18 this is a long, 11-year project, and our property is  
19 located right next to the, um, John Byrne Bridge. So  
20 we're right at the heart of where it is, where all  
21 the servicemen and women are gonna be, and any kind  
of delay is just gonna add more congestion and more,  
um, time to the project.

20           So we, we are looking to make sure that, um,  
21 they're able to collect that data and, and even share

1           it so we have assurances that the project is safe and  
2           that it's gonna go positively in the timeline that  
3           they are- they've, they've submitted.

4           We also wanna make sure that they're able to give  
5           us better notifications. There are many meetings  
6           that we missed because we got the letter after. Uh,  
7           I know that they have timelines that, oh, we did it,  
8           we have 10 days to send that letter out and we sent  
9           it, um, on time. But we, as someone in the  
10           community, we did not receive it. There was no  
11           centralized place to go to get that information.

12           Um, the boring logs, we also wanna make sure that  
13           the sound vibration is correct. We also have an  
14           issue with, uh, the insurances that we got today  
15           saying that we are able to build Um, under our  
16           buildings because we didn't get the boring logs that  
17           we, uh, requested.

18           We don't know if it's soil or what the quality is  
19           that's under the building. They can also, um, you  
20           know, you can build one floor. What if you wanna  
21           build 10 floors?

          So we have a lot of questions that haven't been  
          answered yet because we don't know where, who would  
          get us those answers. So it's very unclear as

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS

36

2 someone part of the community where to get, uh, some  
3 of this information from. But we do believe that  
4 this is an overall a good project and it is needed.  
5 There's just a lot of questions that we, that a lot  
6 of uncertainty that we have regarding some of the  
7 details on this project.

8 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: Great, thank you for that.

9 TANYA OBEROI: Thank you and just a few  
10 questions. Uh, which council district are your  
11 properties located in?

12 TANYA OBEROI: Uh, CB2, uh, Long Island City.

13 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: Long Island— so Julie Won's  
14 district?

15 TANYA OBEROI: Yes.

16 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: Have you reached out to the  
17 Council Member?

18 TANYA OBEROI: Oh, we did.

19 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: Okay, great. Yeah, because I  
20 think a lot of the questions that you brought up are  
21 extremely valid, and they should be responsive to  
those questions.

TANYA OBEROI: But they're the ones that would  
answer these questions?

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS 37

2 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: Uh, no, just to make sure  
3 that we know who the point person is if DEP is not  
4 answering your questions in an appropriate time.

5 TANYA OBEROI: Oh, got it. Okay, thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: Um, do other Council Members  
7 have any questions?

8 Yeah, you may be dismissed. Thank you.

9 TANYA OBEROI: Thank you so much.

10 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: So we have Maggie Macdonald.

11 MAGGIE MACDONALD: Thank you. Sorry.

12 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: You may begin.

13 MAGGIE MACDONALD: Thanks so much. Um, my name  
14 is Maggie Macdonald. I represent multiple property  
15 owners impacted by the proposed CSO tunnel. I'm a  
16 partner at Sive, Paget and Riesel, which is an  
17 environmental law firm in New York.

18 The comments we've submitted to DEP and the City  
19 Planning Commission to date highlight some serious  
20 concerns that the construction of the project will  
21 create new problems in its current form. Um, we have  
3 chief concerns, some that Council Member Restler,  
um, discussed, and we had submitted copies of our  
correspondence to his office as well.

2           Um, first, um, DEP has failed to provide public  
3 notice. That's something that Tanya just mentioned  
4 as well. Um, basically at every step of the process,  
5 every public hearing I've attended has been filled  
6 with people who found out about the hearing by  
7 chance, not through the legally required notice  
8 provisions in Title 62, Section 203 C4. In multiple  
9 letters to DEP and City Planning, we flagged specific  
10 property owners who did not receive notice at the  
11 correct address, and multiple property owners who  
12 received notices of hearings after the hearing had  
13 concluded, like Tanya.

14           Um, indeed, we are not aware of any property  
15 owners who received notice of this hearing, um, which  
16 is a little concerning and I'm here only because of  
17 my own diligence and the diligence of other concerned  
18 parties that knew I was interested in tracking this  
19 project. Um, we just find that unacceptable for a  
20 monumental project of this nature.

21           Um, second, we're concerned that, um, as  
described in the FEIS, only a preliminary assessment  
of subsurface structures in the path of the tunnel  
has been completed to date. Um, the successful  
construction of the project requires that easements

1           SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
2   RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS

39

2       are acquired in areas that are free of obstructions  
3       to ensure the safety of existing buildings and  
4       construction workers for that matter. Um, we  
5       provided, uh, multiple examples of properties where  
6       90 to 100-foot pilings are required for building  
7       construction. Um, and noted that for one of the  
8       properties, um, that our client owns, the publicly  
9       available documents that were rever- reviewed as part  
10      of this preliminary assessment don't date back to the  
11      time the building was constructed.

10           So the geotechnical information about the needed  
11      depth of pilings going down deeper is the sort of  
12      circumstantial evidence that you would rely on to  
13      know that the tunnel will, in that location, impact  
14      the building structures. And then my last point,  
15      I'll be very quick, is just that because of that  
16      failure, that it's likely the project will have to be  
17      realigned if the DEP, which they've committed to us  
18      over the phone, is not going to impact existing  
19      buildings. And then that means that the scope of the  
20      project and the sites that are required for selection  
21      have not been identified yet.

20           So we think there's a little bit more preliminary  
21      work that needs to be done, more than just a



2 with 200 dwelling units consistent- consisting of  
3 both supportive and affordable housing units together  
4 with a community facility space.

4 Before we begin, I would like to read a statement  
5 by Majority Leader Abreu, who couldn't be here  
6 because he is Chairing his own Committee. uh,  
7 Committee on Transportation on the Street Master Plan  
8 and so I'm gonna share his statement on his behalf.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: 1727 Amsterdam Avenue sits  
9 in a neighborhood under intense pressure. Rents have  
10 climbed, families have been pushed out, seniors are  
11 holding on month to month. How we treat public land  
12 here will determine who has a place in this community  
13 going forward.

13 The proposal under consideration would create  
14 permanently affordable housing including supportive  
15 housing and senior units, and a new facility for a  
16 mental health services organization that was  
17 previously operating on site. The broader context  
18 matters. West Harlem is facing a housing  
19 affordability crisis.

19 Furthermore, thousands of New Yorkers remain in  
20 shelters or cycled through hospitals and unstable  
21 housing because of the lack of permanent homes.

1           These circumstances require Action Neighborhood wide,  
2 well beyond the scope of this project.

3           We welcome and appreciate everyone who has  
4 weighed in with ideas to shape this project as part  
5 of the many, many conversations about this proposal  
6 over the last few years. We also acknowledge that  
7 there has been a coordinated effort among some to  
8 portray supportive and low-income housing as a danger  
9 to this neighborhood. That narrative is false. It  
10 trades in fear and ignores evidence. Supportive  
11 housing, when properly resourced and operated,  
12 stabilizes people who would otherwise remain in  
13 shelters or on the street.

14           Affordable housing keeps working families from  
15 being displaced. The people who have lived here are  
16 not outsiders, and they do not deserve to be labeled  
17 with a- with vile names they have been called since  
18 the project was first proposed. They are New Yorkers  
19 in need of stability, afraid of being pushed out of  
20 their neighborhood they call home.

21           As we move towards a vote, we will evaluate  
whether affordable housing meaningfully addresses  
neighborhood needs, whether the supportive services  
are strong and fully funded, whether operations are

1           SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
2   RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS

43

3 transparent and accountable, and whether this project  
4 strengthens West Harlem for the long term. This is  
5 about the future of the neighborhood. It is about  
6 who gets to stay, who gets a second chance, and how  
7 we use public land in the middle of a housing crisis.

8           I look forward to reviewing the testimony given  
9 today combined with the hundreds of conversations  
10 that I have had with our neighbors who are unable to  
11 speak up for themselves at City Hall on a rainy  
12 Tuesday morning.

13           Again, that was a statement from Majority Leader  
14 Abreu who couldn't be at today's Committee hearing  
15 because he is Chairing his own Committee.

16           Appearing today on this proposal is Melanie  
17 Rodrigo, Manhattan Borough Planner, HPD, Kyle  
18 Jeremiah, Director of External Affairs, Bowery  
19 Residents Committee, Nicole Clare, Chief Real Estate  
20 Development Officer of Bowery Residents Committee.

Those wishing to testify remotely must register  
online by visiting Council website at

[council.nyc.gov/landuse](http://council.nyc.gov/landuse). Panelists, please ensure  
that your microphones are on when you speak.

Counsel, would you please administer the affirmation?

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS 44

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Panelists, would you please  
3 raise your right hand and state your name for the  
4 record?

4 MELANIE RODRIGO: Melanie, oh, Melanie Rodrigo.

5 NICOLE CLARE: Nicole Clare.

6 KYLE JEREMIAH: Kyle Jeremiah.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And do you affirm to tell the  
8 truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in  
9 your testimony before this Subcommittee and in answer  
10 to all Council Member questions?

10 PANEL: Yes, I do. Yes.

11 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: Thank you, applicant  
12 panelists. Oh, wait, so, uh, yeah, thank you,  
13 applicant panelists.

13 For viewing- for the viewing public, if you need  
14 an accessible version of this presentation, please  
15 send an email request to  
16 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. and now the  
17 applicant team may begin.

17 MELANIE RODRIGO: Great. Good morning, Council  
18 Members and Chair Marte. Um, thank you for having us  
19 here today. Um, my name is Melanie Rodrigo. I'm  
20 from the Manhattan Planning Team, um, here at HPD's  
21 Division of Planning and Predevelopment. I'm also

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS 45

2 joined by my director, Joy Resor, and, uh, Justin  
3 Donlon, who is the Deputy Director of HPD's Division  
4 of Government Affairs, as well as development team of  
5 representatives working with us on the project.

6 The Bowery Residents Committee, or BRC, and New  
7 York City Health and Hospitals, or H&H, who will  
8 introduce themselves throughout the presentation and  
9 Q&A.

10 So we're excited to be here today, uh, for this  
11 milestone in ULURP to present 1727 Amsterdam Avenue  
12 Hilltop Apartments project.

13 Next slide, please. Uh, so starting with the  
14 project overview, uh, the proposed Development will  
15 be constructed on a city-owned lot in Hamilton  
16 Heights, Community District 9, which is utilized as a  
17 community facility space. The applicant for the  
18 ULURP application is HPD, and BRC is the developer.  
19 The new 9-story mixed-use building proposed under the  
20 Hilltop Apartments project will include approximately  
21 200 dwelling units for senior, Senior supportive,  
supportive, and low-income households, plus one  
additional superintendent's unit developed under  
HPD's Supportive Housing Loan Program, known as SHLP.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
2 RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS

46

2 And the proposed project will also include  
3 replacement community space for the Emma L. Bowen  
4 Community Service Center. And to facilitate the  
5 proposed project, HPD is proposing the following land  
6 use actions. Designation of the project area as an  
7 Urban Development Action Area and approval of an  
8 Urban Development Action Area project on the project  
9 area and disposition of the development site.

8 Next slide, please. And so here's a street view  
9 of the development site looking north along Amsterdam  
10 Avenue at the intersection of West 145th Street. The  
11 development site is adjacent to multiple historic  
12 districts and is also accessible by 145th subway  
13 station and multiple bus routes.

13 Next slide. So moving to the project history.  
14 So this project is a result of H&H's Housing for  
15 Health initiative, uh, to connect healthcare and  
16 stable housing for patients experiencing homelessness  
17 to improve their health and well-being, which this  
18 development site has been managed by H&H since its  
19 construction.

19 Alongside H&H's initiative, in 2019, HPD  
20 designated BRC to develop 1727 Amsterdam Avenue  
21

1           SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
2                         RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS

2 through HPD's supportive housing request for  
3 qualifications.

3           Uh, recognizing BRC's strong, uh, track record  
4 delivering high-quality supportive housing in  
5 Manhattan and citywide. And since BRC's designation,  
6 BRC has worked closely with Emma L. Bowen Community  
7 Service Center and HPD, uh, conducting outreach and  
8 refining the project to ensure it meets both  
9 neighborhood and service needs. And as of spring of  
10 2024, H&H, um, began amending their 1969 operating  
11 agreement to include 9, um, previously excluded  
12 healthcare properties, and Council later in 2025, uh,  
13 approved 8 of the 9. And so since 1727 Amsterdam,  
14 um, site was not included, uh, ULURP is required to  
15 facilitate the site's disposition under HPD's  
16 authority. Um, the ULURP process began when the  
17 project certified on September 15th.

16           And now, I'll turn it over to Nicole and Kyle  
17 from BRC who are part of the development team to  
18 speak in more detail about the project. Uh, next  
19 slide.

19           NICOLE CLARE: Good morning, Council Members. My  
20 name is Nicole Clare. I'm BRC's Chief Real Estate  
21 Development Officer. Uh, BRC is a not-for-profit



2 the demolition of the existing, uh, 50-year-old  
3 structure. Um, as Melanie mentioned, it's currently  
4 used as community facility, uh, managed by Health and  
5 Hospitals to construct a new 9-story mixed-use  
6 affordable housing building.

7 All of the residential units, 100% of those units  
8 will be affordable to households earning up to 60% of  
9 area median income. Uh, we'll provide on-site social  
10 services for all housing tenants, which my colleague  
11 Kyle will talk a little more about. Uh, we'll have  
12 24/7 staffing at the front desk, a well-lit exterior.  
13 In addition, uh, we'll be providing 21,000 square  
14 feet of a new community facility space dedicated for  
15 the Emma L. Bowen Community Service Center, uh, the  
16 mental health, uh, provider that, uh, Council Member  
17 Abreu referenced.

18 Building amenities will include, uh, both in our  
19 indoor and outdoor, including flexible community  
20 rooms, landscape courtyards, um, terraces, um, in  
21 order to connect, uh, our tenants to nature and also  
opportunities for socialization, especially for  
seniors. Uh, the building will also have, um,  
dedicated laundry facilities.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS 50

2 The building itself will be energy efficient.

3 Uh, all electric, um, including, um, sustainability  
4 and resiliency measures such as solar panels, a  
5 generator, uh, with an abundance of, uh, natural  
6 light.

7 Next slide, please. Uh, in terms of  
8 affordability of those, uh, 200 residential  
9 apartments, uh, to be clear, 199 will be rental  
10 units. Another one will be provided for the  
11 superintendent. Um, uh, 60% of those units will be  
12 set aside for formerly homeless households, um,  
13 referred, uh, through H&H, so mutually- mutual  
14 clients of Health and Hospitals and also, uh,  
15 Department of Homeless Services.

16 Uh, another 17% will be set aside for households  
17 earning up to 40% of area median income. That  
18 translates to approximately or roughly, uh, \$900 to  
19 \$1,600 a month depending on, um, unit size. Um, 23%  
20 of the units will be set aside for households earning  
21 up to 60% of area median income, which translates to  
roughly \$1,400 to \$2,400 a month.

Uh, in addition, we'll be providing 48 units  
dedicated to seniors, 25 of which will be, uh,  
supportive units, uh, the formerly homeless

1           SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
                  RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS                                 51  
2 households, and, um, another 23, um, in the 40% AMI  
3 tier.

4           Next slide, please. Um, to give you a little bit  
5 more detail of the community facility space provided  
6 for the Emma L. Bowen Community Service Center, uh,  
7 this will require them relocating from the existing  
8 site, um, a process which, uh, just began, uh, to a  
9 dedicated space purpose-built at, um, West 135th  
10 Street, uh, which the community board has toured.

11          Uh, but more importantly, when we talk about  
12 their return to the building at 1727 Amsterdam, BRC's  
13 worked very closely with them for, uh, nearly 2 years  
14 to design a purpose-built new space with them, for  
15 them, to facilitate their program and meet their  
16 programming needs.

17          Uh, so that will be spread across 3 stories of  
18 the building, the cellar, 1st and 2nd floors, um, to  
19 allow them to continue to offer their current  
20 services in a more efficiently designed space at a  
21 comparable rental rate. So they will continue to  
provide those mental health services that they  
provide to both adults and children.

        Next, I'll turn it over to my slide— my colleague  
Kyle. Next slide, please.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS 52

2 KYLE JEREMIAH: Good morning, uh, Chair Marte,  
3 members of the Committee. My name is Kyle Jeremiah,  
4 Director of External Affairs for BRC. It's good to  
5 be here with you all this morning. I'll be  
6 discussing, um, this project's impacts on the  
community.

7 Uh, so Hilltop Apartments, uh, will go beyond  
8 just housing units. It will be a well-managed  
9 residential environment that will be governed by  
10 clear good neighbor standards, including defined  
11 quiet hours, managed outdoor spaces, on-site  
12 staffing, and rapid response protocols for quality of  
13 life concerns. Residents will be referred through  
14 New York City's coordinated entry system, as my  
colleague mentioned, with a focus on individuals  
coming from DHS and NYC Health and Hospitals.

15 Supportive services are funded through the city's  
16 1515 program and include case management, wraparound  
17 supports, and 24/7 staffing. So this model  
18 prioritizes stability, early intervention, and  
19 long-term housing success, benefiting residents while  
20 supporting a well-managed, predictable building  
environment for, for the surrounding community. Uh,  
21 the project will stimulate the local economy by

1           generating approximately 250 construction jobs with a  
2           commitment to local hiring. Once operational, it  
3           will support up to 25 permanent full-time jobs  
4           on-site, including roles in case management,  
5           operations, and maintenance.

6           Uh, our standard practice includes hosting local  
7           job fairs targeting Community Board 9 residents and  
8           offering workforce development opportunities. Uh, we  
9           will also provide housing lottery workshops and  
10          application support so residents in the district can  
11          access affordable units directly.

12          Now, we have the entire multi-agency team with us  
13          here today, and we're happy to address any questions  
14          that you have about the project.

15          CHAIRPERSON MARTE: Thank you. I have a few  
16          questions. Uh, the local community board had  
17          expressed concerns that the outreach of this  
18          application was insufficient. Could you describe the  
19          outreach conducted before the application was filed,  
20          as well as any communications with the community  
21          board during the ULURP process, and how many meetings  
22          have you had with the community?

23          MELANIE RODRIGO: Sure, uh, we can pull up, um,  
24          back on the PowerPoint, um, slide 12. Um, it gives

2 out, um, to-date, um, community outreach. This is,  
3 uh, before, um, it's pre-ULURP and also ULURP, um,  
4 pre- meetings with the community board.

5 KYLE JEREMIAH: So, and just to add to that, so  
6 we've also secured, uh, 10 letters of support from  
7 local organizations and groups in the community. Um,  
8 uh, beyond that, we have hosted, uh, tours of, of  
9 our- of BRC supportive housing programs to CB9  
10 residents throughout the ULURP process. We extended  
11 invitations to continue giving tours to CB9  
12 residents. Um, uh, throughout the project, uh,  
13 construction, uh, we will continue our ongoing  
14 engagement in keeping with our good neighbor policy.  
15 Um, we, uh, I think on slide number, uh, 14, we, um,  
16 outlined the number of times we've met with the  
17 community board. We've met with them 11 times, uh,  
18 before and during the, the ULURP process.

19 Um, we've responded to some of their specific  
20 concerns. You know, they wanted, uh, to deepen  
21 affordability. We've been able to do that. We've  
22 added more 40% AMI units overall by decreasing the  
23 number of 60% AMI units. We've even worked with the  
24 community board to really, um, create a bit of an FAQ

2 to dispel some of the misconceptions about supportive  
3 housing and what that exactly means.

4 As I mentioned, uh, we've given tours to, um, CB9  
5 members, and HPD has also issued a tech memo with an  
6 updated environmental analysis.

7 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: A quick question, um, and  
8 thank you for keeping it on this chart. Um, you  
9 know, I see the, the breakdowns between studios, 1  
10 bedroom, 2 bedrooms, 3 bedrooms. Are they gonna be  
11 dispersed around the, the building or is it gonna be  
12 sectioned off where some of the studios are gonna be  
13 on certain floors and the bigger apartment's gonna be  
14 in another floor with other facilities?

15 NICOLE CLARE: No, no, that's correct that  
16 they're interspersed on every floor. So there'll be,  
17 um, every floor will have, er, ah, studios, 1s and  
18 2s, um, typically, and, and 3 bedroom apartments.  
19 Typically, um, the studios are, are in the middle,  
20 just on, on a typical floor plate with the 1s, 2s,  
21 and 3s, uh, sort of at the edge. But, uh, every  
22 floor will have it and, you know, sort of lines.  
23 It's how, is how affordable housing is developed.

24 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: Yeah and because, um, this  
25 development has part, part of it as a supportive

1 housing program, would all residents be have access  
2 to that supportive program or only the ones that are  
3 designated?

4 NICOLE CLARE: Yeah, that means, um, so when we  
5 talk about supportive services, that means we have  
6 onsite staff who, uh, as Kyle mentioned, are funded  
7 by the city's 1515 program. We also have a state  
8 operating grant, uh, through ESHI.

9 So we have onsite staff who, uh, meet with  
10 tenants. Um, they do, they obviously have a caseload  
11 associated with the supportive clients, but they  
12 provide services to all of the tenants in the  
13 building. Uh, so that can be tenants who might be in  
14 the other units who may have children if they wanna  
15 provide, um, you know, access to, uh, connecting them  
16 to services in the neighborhood.

17 You know, if they need afterschool help, you  
18 know, um, connection with the schools, those kinds of  
19 things. So to answer your question, they do provide  
20 services to all the tenants in the building.

21 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: Okay. Um, thank you for that.

NICOLE CLARE: Sure. The community board also  
raised questions about why, uh, BRC was chosen. Can

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS

57

2 you explain the process and the criteria that led to  
3 that selection?

4 MELANIE RODRIGO: Sure, so the HPD, uh,  
5 designated BRC through what we call the supportive,  
6 um, sorry, give me one second. It's the request, uh,  
7 for qualifications. Um, um, yes, sorry.

8 So it's the supportive- sorry, it's the  
9 supportive housing request for qualifications and  
10 that again is a proposal, um, just, um, calls out,  
11 um, developers with expertise in supportive housing.  
12 And so BRC was chosen off that list, uh, based on  
13 their strong, uh, track record in delivering  
14 high-quality, uh, supportive housing.

15 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: Okay. Um, Health and  
16 Hospital Corporation has been creating more housing  
17 on its properties in recent years. Can you explain  
18 the reasoning behind this initiative and the benefits  
19 or challenges that poses to these new residents?  
20 Yeah. Okay.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Um, would you please raise  
your right hand and state your name for the record?

DEBORAH MORRIS: Deborah Morris.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And do you affirm to tell the  
truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
2 RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS

58

2 your testimony before this Subcommittee and in answer  
3 to all Council Member questions?

3 DEBORAH MORRIS: Yes. Good afternoon, thank you  
4 for having me here. I'm Deborah Morris, Senior  
5 Director for Land Use and Plan- sorry, Real Estate  
6 and Planning at New York City Health and Hospitals  
7 Corporation.

7 Uh, New York City Health and Hospitals has as one  
8 of our system pillars a Housing for Health initiative  
9 to connect homeless patients to permanent housing.

10 We accomplish this in several ways. Um, this  
11 includes case management and placement services,  
12 working with HRA on supportive housing applications  
13 and approvals, prioritizing vulnerable patients, um,  
14 for DHS- with DHS for housing, um, and with client  
15 referrals.

15 Um, we also develop housing on our land. Um,  
16 over the last decade, we have developed, um, over 10  
17 projects, um, and we have several underway. Um, just  
18 as a, a point of fact, in 2025, um, Health and  
19 Hospitals had over 71,000 patients who, who were  
20 experiencing homelessness, of which more than half  
21 were mutual clients with Department of Homeless  
Services.

2 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: Thank you for that response.

3 Um, I have a few questions from Majority Leader  
4 Council Member Abreu. As I said previously, he can't  
5 be with us today because he's Chairing his own  
6 hearing.

7 The first question he has is, is this project a  
8 shelter?

9 MELANIE RODRIGO: No. Uh, so yeah, to clarify,  
10 this is, uh, per- sorry, supportive housing, which is  
11 permanent, uh, affordable housing and so it's not a  
12 shelter, it's not a transitional um, housing as well,  
13 so.

14 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: How does this project address  
15 health-related needs?

16 NICOLE CLARE: I'm sorry, say that again.

17 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: I, I think you mentioned this  
18 a little bit, but, um, how does this project address  
19 health-related needs?

20 NICOLE CLARE: Absolutely, so there's no greater  
21 determinant of health than access to housing. Um,  
patients experiencing homelessness are, um, some of  
our highest users of the system.

Patients who have then been permanently housed,  
um, have significant reductions in use of the



1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS 61

2 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: All right, thank you. Um,  
3 now I'll recognize any other Council Members that  
4 have a question for this panel?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER THOMAS-HENRY: I have a couple,  
6 Chair.

7 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: Okay.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER THOMAS-HENRY: Thank you. Um, and  
9 did you just say that the community space will have a  
10 temporary space during construction?

11 DEBORAH MORRIS: That's right. So they've,  
12 they've begun, begun that move already temporarily  
13 because they'll need to leave the building in order  
14 for us to tear it down and build a new one.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER THOMAS-HENRY: Okay and is there a  
16 reason why the spaces for the formerly homeless are  
17 all studios?

18 DEBORAH MORRIS: Uh, yeah, that's- it's typical.  
19 Um, the, the nature of the supportive housing we're  
20 providing is for single adults. And so, um, those  
21 requirements, uh, government requirements, obviously  
from the city and state, are to provide studio  
apartments for those single adults to live  
independently, um, in supportive housing. So, yeah.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER THOMAS-HENRY: And what's the  
3 breakdown or number of units specifically designated  
4 for specific supportive purpose?

5 DEBORAH MORRIS: So that's 120 units.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER THOMAS-HENRY: For the homeless-

7 DEBORAH MORRIS: Formerly homeless, that's  
8 correct.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER THOMAS-HENRY: Formerly homeless  
10 but then you have some for seniors, and then it says  
11 supportive for seniors. So like, what's-

12 DEBORAH MORRIS: Yeah, so of the, um, 120 units  
13 that are supportive units, 95 will be, uh, 15/15  
14 through the City of New York, and then it's another  
15 25.

16 So 25 of the 120 are designated as senior  
17 supportive.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER THOMAS-HENRY: Got it, so it's the  
19 other remaining units that are for low income, not  
20 necessarily-

21 DEBORAH MORRIS: No, the breakdown is 120 are all  
the supportive units. There are a total of 199  
rental units in the building, so the other 79 are  
designated for the community and it's typical with

2 HPD projects, those will go through the housing  
3 lottery.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER THOMAS-HENRY: Got it. Um, and I  
5 know Chair had expressed some of Community Board 9's  
6 concerns. Were there any other concerns specifically  
7 that, um, led them to vote against this project? And  
8 I know you mentioned some have been addressed, um,  
9 but what were those concerns?

10 KYLE JEREMIAH: So I, I don't want to speak for  
11 CB9 as to why they may have voted against this  
12 project, but, uh, the concerns that we have  
13 documented was that they felt that, uh, there was  
14 lack of transparency in the initial outreach process.  
15 Um, they felt that they, uh, the project needed to  
16 have more family-sized units, um, need for more  
17 deeply affordable units, which we have addressed, as  
18 I mentioned.

19 Um, they've asked for a rezoned denser develop-  
20 uh, development with more units. Um, more details on  
21 supportive services, which we have provided to them.  
Uh, a preference for local hiring, and BRC is  
committed to, um, local hiring, and that's our, our  
standard practice to go in and have job fairs.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS 64

2 Um, and questions, uh, about the seeker analysis,  
3 uh, which HPD has also addressed.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER THOMAS-HENRY: Okay, thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: I have a follow-up question  
6 to that. Um, you mentioned that Community Board 9  
7 wanted a denser building. What led to the 9-story  
8 building and not going higher than that?

9 MELANIE RODRIGO: So, um, since this site is not,  
10 uh, rezoning and we're using, AIRES, which is a tool  
11 to, um, kind of allow, um, higher density. So with  
12 that, um, it's already— this project or this site is  
13 already maxing out that FAR under that, um, AIRES  
14 program, so.

15 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: yeah, I think you have to—

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Would you state— please state  
17 your name for the— raise your right hand and state  
18 your name for the record.

19 JOY RESOR: Hi, Joy Resor, Director of Manhattan  
20 Planning at HPD.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Um, do you affirm  
to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but  
the truth in your testimony before this Subcommittee?

JOY RESOR: I do.

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And in answer to all Council  
3 Member questions?

4 JOY RESOR: Yes.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you.

6 JOY RESOR: Hi. Um, so what Melanie is saying is  
7 correct. I just wanted to add a little bit more  
8 color.

9 So, um, this project is not seeking a rezoning  
10 because we've also worked- in addition to what  
11 Melanie was saying, we're maxing out FAR under the  
12 existing zoning on this site. Um, we worked with BRC  
13 and alongside their expertise, um, they've said that  
14 200 units is about what they're comfortable providing  
15 at the site.

16 Um, this is also a typical size for an SHLP  
17 project. And so, um, that's part of the decision to  
18 keep it under the same zoning. Um, in addition to  
19 that, the site is near historic districts right  
20 across the street, and we feel that the existing  
21 zoning is in context to those as well.

CHAIRPERSON MARTE: Thank you for that  
explanation. Um, no further questions from Council  
Members. Um, this panel may now be excused. Thank  
you.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
2 RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS

66

PANEL: Thank you.

3 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: Uh, Counsel, are there any  
4 members of the public who wish to testify on this  
5 item?

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Uh, yes, I have one member,  
7 so if you don't hear your name and you're here, just  
8 let, let us know.

9 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: We have— and, oh, Ernesto,  
10 I'm sorry, I can't, I can't read your last name.

11 ERNESTO VIGORO: Vigoro.

12 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: Huh? Vigoro. Ernesto Vigoro  
13 from Apex.

14 ERNESTO VIGORO: I'll wait for you to swear me  
15 in, I guess.

16 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: Oh, no, you may begin.

17 ERNESTO VIGORO: Oh, okay. Good afternoon, Chair  
18 and Council Member. Um, my name is Ernesto Vigoro.  
19 I'm Chief of Community Development at Apex Building  
20 Group. Uh, we are an MBE-certified general  
21 contractor, affordable housing developer. We've been  
around for about 30 years.

Um, our work has definitely been rooted in some  
of the communities where we come from. I myself, uh,  
was born in East Harlem and grew up in the South

1           SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
2                                   RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS

67

2       Bronx, right across the 145th Street Bridge. Um,  
3       145th Street in Amsterdam is a hub, uh, it's a center  
4       point in the neighborhood, and we are delighted to be  
5       in support here- to speak in support of the project  
6       at 1727 Amsterdam Avenue.

6           It is a neighborhood that we've done a lot of  
7       work at. Uh, we worked at Audubon Bethune Marshall.  
8       We have a beautiful new building that was just  
9       rehabbed, um, uh, with financing from NYCHA. We've  
10       also done community work. The Brotherhood Sister  
11       Soul organization, um, we built their new  
12       headquarters.

12           We're very much- which is now a youth- I'm sorry,  
13       Can you hear me? Okay, um, so as I was saying, the  
14       Brotherhood/Sisters/Soul organization, Brosis as we  
15       call it locally in the community, uh, it is now a  
16       beacon community center, um, in the neighborhood for  
17       youth recreation activities, 5 stories with a rooftop  
18       basketball court.

17           Um, we are also- have done work at, um, right now  
18       renovate- renovating 5 buildings as part of the West  
19       Harlem Renaissance um, also at 141st Street near, uh,  
20       the project site. We support this project, uh, BRC

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
2 RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS

68

3 is a long-standing organization that's well  
4 respected.

5 I come from 25 years in affordable housing  
6 development working at OGAD, Communalife, and Asian  
7 Americans for Equality where I've held positions in  
8 housing development, so I can tell when an  
9 organization is truly committed to the work and BRC  
10 represents that as a, uh, bona fide developer.

11 So in absolute support of the project.

12 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: Thank you so much for your  
13 testimony. We do have a few folks online, um, Isaac  
14 Alderstein, Lawrence Fowler, uh, Joelle Ballam-Schwan  
15 and Marsha Jean-Charles.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

17 ISAAC ALDERSTEIN: Hi, am, am I to start?

18 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: Yeah, and I just want to  
19 remind members of the public that you'll be given 2  
20 minutes to speak.

21 ISAAC ALDERSTEIN: Terrific, thank you. Uh, good  
morning, my name is Isaac Adlerstein and I serve as  
the Executive Director of Broadway Community, a  
44-year-old homeless service agency in Morningside  
Heights, which serves hundreds of our most vulnerable  
neighbors every day.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
2 RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS 69

3 Today, I'm speaking in, in strong support of the  
4 redevelopment of 1727 Amsterdam. New York City, as  
5 we all know, is in the midst of a historic  
6 homelessness crisis. In November of 2025, over  
7 101,000 people slept in shelters. Thousands more  
8 slept on the streets and in unsheltered public  
9 spaces. More than 200,000 slept doubled up or were  
10 couch surfing.

11 Over 80,000 of these neighbors were receiving  
12 care from the Health and Hospital system in 2024,  
13 with Harlem Hospital, which is in the district,  
14 providing care to over 5,000 people experiencing  
15 homelessness each year.

16 Currently, 1747 is on the brink of being  
17 completely vacant. The Emma L. Bowen Community  
18 Center has begun its relocation, and the Heritage  
19 Health Center are in the process of relocating. Under  
20 the current development plan, 120 of our unhoused  
21 neighbors who frequent the Health and Hospital system  
will finally have a place to to call home with  
extensive wraparound services to ensure that they  
remain housed and stable.

Approximately 80%, er, 80 additional units will  
be made available for people earning substantially

2 below the area median income, many of them being  
3 senior citizens. In other words, the redevelopment  
4 will create 200 new homes that do not currently  
5 exist.

6 Opponents of the plan have said that crime and  
7 disorder in the neighborhood would increase, that the  
8 planning process was not transparent from the start,  
9 and that 1747 should be upzoned. I'll quickly  
10 address each of these.

11 First, on the idea that crime disorder will  
12 increase, BRC is committed to being a good neighbor.  
13 You would be very hard-pressed to find an  
14 organization that's better at running supportive  
15 housing than BRC. They will be working with people  
16 who have worked hard to get back on their feet and  
17 who are committed to upholding community standards.  
18 I also wanna state that people experiencing  
19 homelessness are far more often the victims of crime  
20 than they are the perpetrators. The risk of them  
21 falling victim to violent crime is about 40 times  
higher than that of the general population.

Second, on the point that the planning process  
would not—

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

2 ISAAC ALDERSTEIN: Okay.

3 CHAIRPERSON MARTE: Thank you for your testimony.  
4 Up next, we have Lawrence.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

6 LAWRENCE FOWLER: Good morning. My name is  
7 Lawrence Fowler. I, and I serve as the Chief  
8 Operating Officer at the Emma L. Bowen Community  
9 Service Center in Harlem, where I oversee daily  
10 operations, regulatory compliance, and the continuity  
11 of care for the thousands of New Yorkers who rely on  
12 our services each year.

13 On behalf of our board of directors, staff, and  
14 children, families, adults, and seniors we serve, I  
15 thank the members of the Subcommittee for the  
16 opportunity to speak about the future of our  
17 organization at 1727 Amsterdam Avenue. For nearly 4  
18 decades, while operating as a tenant at this address,  
19 1727 Amsterdam Avenue has represented far more than a  
20 building. It has been the anchor from which we have  
21 delivered healing, stability, recovery, and  
opportunity to generations of Harlem residents. Our  
presence there has been continuous, community-based,  
and deeply rooted in the evolving needs of this  
neighborhood.

3 Today, Bowen provides comprehensive mental health  
4 addiction treatment and supportive services across  
5 the lifespan to clients in Harlem and throughout New  
6 York City. Our work includes infant and early  
7 childhood services that support families during the  
8 most critical developmental years, a therapeutic  
9 preschool for children with developed- both  
10 behavioral and developmental challenges, one of the  
11 few programs in New York City delivering these  
12 specialized services primarily to Black and Latino  
13 students who have historically faced barriers to  
14 accessing culturally responsive early childhood  
15 mental health care.

16 Also, we provide a dynamic school-based program,  
17 one of only two programs within our broader  
18 wraparound continuum that operates outside of our  
19 primary facility, currently partnering with 6 Upper  
20 Manhattan schools to provide onsite counseling,  
21 crisis intervention, family engagement, and early  
identification services supporting students' academic  
success and emotional well-being.

We also have outpatient child and adolescent  
mental health services that offer individual, family,  
and group therapy, psychiatric evaluation, medication

1           SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
              RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS 73  
2 management, and early intervention support to help  
3 young people manage emotional, behavioral, and  
4 developmental challenges while strengthening,  
5 strengthening family stability.

5           SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

6           CHAIRPERSON MARTE: Thank you for your testimony.  
7 Up next, we have, uh, Joelle Ballam-Schwan.

8           SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

9           JOELLE BALLAM-SCHWAN: Thank you. Good  
10 afternoon. My name is Joelle Ballam-Schwan, I'm the  
11 Director of Programs and Engagement with the  
12 Supportive Housing Network of New York. We're a  
13 statewide membership and advocacy organization  
14 representing supportive housing providers, and  
15 collectively our members operate over 64,000  
16 supportive units across the state, 42,000 in New York  
17 City.

16           Um, for those maybe unfamiliar, supportive  
17 housing is deeply affordable housing with onsite  
18 wraparound social services for individuals who have  
19 experienced homelessness and face additional barriers  
20 to achieving housing stability. Supportive housing  
21 restores and saves lives, and I'm here to express the

1 network's strong support for BRC's Hilltop

2 Apartments.

3 This project would create 199 affordable homes,  
4 including 120 supportive housing apartments, and  
5 approximately 25% of all units would be set aside for  
6 older adults, which is a population that is  
7 experiencing homelessness at unprecedented rates.

8 Supportive housing is the single most effective  
9 solution to homelessness for individuals and families  
10 with the greatest need and shows extremely high  
11 housing retention rates.

12 It also strengthens communities. Residences are  
13 well-designed, well-managed, subject to long-term  
14 oversight by multiple public and private agencies,  
15 24/7 staffing and strong security protocols, so it  
16 really enhances neighborhood safety and stability.

17 In addition, it brings significant public  
18 investment into neighborhoods, generating temporary  
19 and permanent support, um, employment opportunities.

20 Hilltop Apartments alone would create 250  
21 construction jobs, numerous permanent full-time  
positions in case management operations and  
maintenance, with a commitment to hiring locally.

Um, this project comes in a moment of urgent need.

1           SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
2                           RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS

75

2       New York City is facing dual homelessness and housing  
3       crisis.

4           Um, and BRC is a leading supportive housing  
5       provider with a strong and longstanding track record.  
6       They operate over 650 units of supportive housing  
7       across the city, and they consistently deliver  
8       high-quality housing and person-centered services,  
9       helping individuals achieve long-term stability, and  
10      greater self-sufficiency. They are a trusted and  
11      valued partner in serving New York's most vulnerable  
12      residents.

13           Hilltop Apartments represents an opportunity to  
14      provide life-changing —

15           SERGEANT AT ARMS: time expired.

16           JOELLE BALLAM-SCHWAN: Great jobs, and thank you  
17      so much for the opportunity.

18           CHAIRPERSON MARTE: Thank you. Up next, we have  
19      Marsha Jean-Charles.

20           SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

21           MARSHA JEAN-CHARLES: Good, good afternoon,  
22      everyone. Uh, my name is Marsha Jean— Dr. Marsha  
23      Jean Charles. I'm the senior organizing strategist  
24      at the Brotherhood Sister Soul. Um, and for more—  
25      for over 30 years, the Brotherhood Sister Soul, or

1           SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
2   RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS

76

3 BROSIS as we call it, as you know, has been at the  
4 forefront of social justice, educating, organizing  
5 and training to challenge inequity and champion  
6 opportunity for all.

7           We focus on Black and Latinx young people, and we  
8 believe we're where young people claim the power of  
9 their history, identity, and community to build the  
10 future that they want to see.

11           We understand that BRC will create 200 apartments  
12 in a new, attractive, energy-efficient building and  
13 provide comprehensive on-site services, and we  
14 support this endeavor. At BROSIS, we believe that  
15 supportive housing is a proven solution to  
16 homelessness. We are also in a neighborhood that is  
17 not new to supportive housing, and it has been well  
18 managed and integrated into the community, providing  
19 the supportive needs, uh, that can be great for our  
20 neighborhood and surrounding blocks.

21           Supportive housing is about people. Gives  
22 individuals facing homelessness a complex chall- and  
23 complex challenges a stable home and onsite services  
24 so they can rebuild their lives and we support that.  
25 And lastly, communities that host supportive housing  
26 are often becoming stronger, and the long track



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS 78  
Avenue Hilltop Apartments, the public hearing is now  
closed and the item is laid over. That concludes  
today's business. I would like to thank members of  
the public, my colleagues, Subcommittee Counsel, Land  
Use staff, and the Sergeant-at-Arms for your  
participation today. The meeting is hereby  
adjourned. [GAVEL] Thanks.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,  
RESILIENCY AND DISPOSITIONS  
C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date April 15, 2026