

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING
JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON AGING

----- X

November 30, 2023
Start: 1:15 P.M.
Recess: 4:20 P.M.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Alexa Avilés,
Chairperson of Committee on Public
Housing

Crystal Hudson,
Chairperson of Committee on Aging

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

- Carmen N. De La Rosa
- Charles Barron
- Chi A. Ossè
- Christopher Marte
- Darlene Mealy
- Diana Ayala
- Eric Dinowitz
- Julie Won
- Lincoln Restler
- Linda Lee
- Lynn Schulman

COUNCIL MEMBERS: (CONTINUED)

Pierina Ana Sanchez
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.

A P P E A R A N C E S

Areiner Garcia
Resident

Jean Serviola

Rohan Lalla
University Settlement Society

Julie Sharpton
Resident

Eva Trimble
NYCHA

Shaan Mavani
NYCHA

Lauren Gray
NYCHA

James Secreto
NYCHA

Iziah Thompson
Community Service Society

Joceyln Groden
DFTA

Maryanne Mullany
Representing the New York City Comptroller

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
THE COMMITTEE ON AGING 4

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Check one, two, check one,
3 two. This is a prerecorded sound test for the
4 Committee on Public Housing jointly with Aging.
5 Today's date is November 30, 2023. It's being
6 recorded by Michael Leonardo in the City Council
7 Chambers.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good afternoon and welcome to
9 today's New York City Council Public Hearing on the
10 Committees on Public Housing and Aging. At this
11 time, we ask you to silence all cellphones and
12 electronic devices to minimize disruptions throughout
13 the hearing. If you have testimony you wish to
14 submit for the record, you may do so via email at
15 testimony@council.nyc.gov. Once again, that is
16 testimony@council.nyc.gov.

17 At any time throughout the hearing, do not
18 approach the dais. We thank you for your
19 cooperation. Chairs, we are ready to begin.

20 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: [GAVEL] This meeting is
21 coming to order. Good afternoon everyone and welcome
22 to this hearing of the Committee on Public Housing,
23 which is being held jointly today with the Committee
24 on Aging. I am Council Member Alexa Avilés, the
25 Chair of the New York City Council Committee on

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

5

2 Public Housing. I'd like to thank you all for
3 attending this oversight hearing examining the
4 Infrastructure of Resident Safety at NYCHA.

5 We are joined by my colleagues from the Public
6 Housing Committee Carmen De La Rosa, Council Member
7 Carmen De La Rosa, Council Member Gale Brewer. Thank
8 you for being here.

9 Every tenant in New York City has the right to a
10 safe and secure home. Safe communities are
11 communities where people have what they need. This
12 does mean a community that resembles a prison or is
13 over policed. Safety for tenants includes knowing
14 that doors will lock. That they can count on their
15 fire alarms to go off in an emergency, that the
16 grounds are maintained and when they have them that
17 cameras in their buildings are functional and being
18 monitored.

19 Unfortunately, NYCHA residents have become
20 accustomed to just the opposite with broken doors,
21 inoperative fire safety systems and non-working or
22 non-exiting cameras. Today, we are looking at all
23 aspects of safety and security systems that NYCHA has
24 direct control and responsibility over. These
25 systems, like any physical systems on NYCHA campuses,

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING 6

3 have faced disinvestment and need billions of dollars
4 in repair. While we at the Council will continue to
5 push all levels of government to fully fund NYCHA and
6 fund it properly, much of this disinvestment is
7 compounded by poor policies, poor oversight, lack of
8 training, plans or lack thereof, and sometimes poor
9 or incoherent implementation.

10 Even in light of the disinvestment, NYCHA must
11 make focus and strategic investments, communicate
12 those plans and outcomes and have effective policies
13 to ensure residents safety. Over the last 18 months,
14 NYCHA has received reports from the New York City
15 Comptroller from the New York Department of
16 Investigations and the Federal Monitor all detailing,
17 not just that NYCHA needs more money to keep
18 residents safe but also pointing to management
19 changes and recommendations that NYCHA should take to
20 address many of these issues.

21 Today, I'm looking to hear from NYCHA which
22 specific recommendations they have adopted and what
23 changes they are making with specificity, timeframes
24 and locations to keep residents safe in their homes.
25 I would like to thank my staff Christina Bottego and
Edward Cerna. Along with the Public Housing

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING 7

3 Committee Staff Jose Conde, Charles Kim, Dan Kroop,
4 Nicholas Montalbano, Christopher Zawora and Connor
5 Mealy for all the work they've put into this hearing.

6 As you heard at the top of this – as you heard at
7 the top, this is a joint hearing that will look
8 specifically at the impact on NYCHA seniors, seasoned
9 or sexiest part of New York City's communities. The
10 seniors who built this city are our greatest
11 treasures and we must do right by them and with that,
12 I now turn it over to the Chair, Chair Hudson to make
13 her opening statement.

14 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Thank you so much Chair
15 Avilés and good afternoon and welcome to today's
16 joint hearing on the infrastructure of residents
17 safety at NYCHA with a special emphasis on the safety
18 of older NYCHA residents. I'm Council Member Crystal
19 Hudson, Chair of the Committee on Aging. My pronouns
20 are she, her. Thank you to Chair Avilés and the
21 Committee on Public Housing for holding this vitally
22 important hearing today along side the Committee on
23 Aging.

24 NYCHA serves a large number of older adult
25 residents living in both regular developments as well
as in seniors only developments in buildings that

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH 8
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

3 only allow residents age 62 years and older. As of
4 March 2022, 23.6 percent of NYCHA's entire resident
5 population, or almost 78,000 residents are age 62 or
6 older. Major safety concerns exist across NYCHA's
7 portfolio of senior buildings. There are frequent
8 reports of delayed repairs and outdated equipment
9 including persistent mold as well as broken
10 elevators, doors and locks, smoke detectors and fire
11 safety components. Safety issues pose an outsized
12 risk to NYCHA's older residents who are more likely
13 to be mobility impaired and to have health issues
14 that impact their ability to respond to emergency
15 situations.

16 NYCHA is charged with a proper administration of
17 seniors only buildings and developments where older
18 adults make up the majority of residents. However,
19 when it comes to keeping our older adults safe, I'm
20 concerned NYCHA is failing in its duties. 2021 data
21 revealed that approximately 20 percent of violent
22 crime in New York City occurred inside or within 100
23 feet of public housing developments. NYCHA's senior
24 buildings have been directly affected by violent
25 crime, with a notable example being woods and houses
in Brooklyn, which saw three older adults murdered

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

9

3 over a five-year period between 2015 and 2020. This
4 loss of life should have been a wake-up call to the
5 city. It is high time that the city makes major
6 investments in safety infrastructure yet issues
7 persist and I fear it may only be a matter of time
8 before something like this happens again.

9 More recently, reports have emerged on how broken
10 doors and locks make older NYCHA residents feel
11 unsafe. Last year, New York One reported that Corsi
12 houses, a NYCHA senior building in East Harlem, had a
13 broken front door lock that allowed unauthorized
14 individuals to occupy the buildings staircase and
15 hallways. Other reports detail senior only buildings
16 with front doors that are broken for over three
17 months at a time and frequently in need of repairs,
18 littered with needles and drug paraphernalia as well
19 as stairwells smelling of human waste.

20 These conditions are unacceptable and I hope that
21 NYCHA is doing everything it can to quickly and
22 thoroughly address these glaring safety and quality
23 of life concerns. All New Yorkers deserve to feel
24 safe in their homes, including our older NYCHA
25 residents. Decades of neglect and under investment
in NYCHA developments have left older residents

1
2 vulnerable to crime and fire emergencies. We owe it
3 to our older adults and their families to prioritize
4 investments in safety infrastructure and to quickly
5 address needed repairs. I look forward to discussing
6 how the city plans to address these issues moving
7 forward, as well as how the Council can work with
8 older NYCHA residents to help meet their urgent
9 needs. NYCHA residents have waited for action for
10 far too long. Older NYCHA residents should not have
11 to worry for their safety every time they leave their
12 apartment. We need bold and comprehensive action at
13 every level of government now.

14 Thank you again to Chair Avilés and thank you to
15 the representatives from NYCHA and the Administration
16 for joining us today. I'd also like to thank my
17 staff, Casey Addison and Andrew Write and Aging
18 Committee Staff Christopher Pepe, Chloe Rivera and
19 Saiyemul Hamid. I'll now turn it back to Chair
20 Avilés. Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Thank you. And in keeping
22 with the tradition of this Committee, before we hear
23 from NYCHA, we will first hear from a panel of
24 residents. So, I will turn it over to Committee
25 Counsel to call up the first witness.

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING 11

3 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Good morning. We will have a
4 resident pre-panel. We will call a witness on Zoom.
5 As soon as we call your name, you'll be asked to
6 unmute. You can begin as soon as you're unmuted.
7 For those wishing to testify in person, please see
8 the Sergeant at Arms in the back of the room and fill
9 out a testimony slip. For those wishing to testify
10 and are on Zoom, we will move to virtual testimony
11 after the Administration testimony. Julie Sharpton,
12 we'll hear from Julie Sharpton. You should be
13 getting a notification to unmute yourself shortly.

14 JULIE SHARPTON: Good afternoon.

15 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: We can hear you Julie, good
16 afternoon.

17 JULIE SHARPTON: Good afternoon Council Member
18 Hudson and everyone, the City Council, Department of
19 Aging. Thank you for having us and allowing us to
20 voice our concerns. My name is Julie Sharpton. I am
21 the President of Whitman Houses Resident Association.
22 We share the concerns as our Council Member and many
23 of you do in regard to the lack of safety mechanisms
24 in place to keep our senior residents and resident at
25 large safe. We have various doors in our
developments that are broken. The locks don't work.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

12

1
2 They are constantly in need of repair and which it
3 causes unfortunate people that don't live here to
4 come in and utilize drugs in our stairwells,
5 vandalize our mailboxes, which makes our residents
6 especially our senior residents feel very unsafe.
7 They have voiced their concerns to us in our monthly
8 meetings repeatedly about this. They are afraid to
9 go and empty their garbage and the compactors on
10 their floors because of homeless people that have
11 inhabited our stairwells, our rooftops. They are
12 afraid to come again and just go to their
13 appointments because they have to step over or
14 encounter you know people that don't live in our
15 buildings and they get that access through broken
16 doors, poor lighting is another issue that causes our
17 residents, especially seniors not to feel safe going
18 to and from the store. We know that it's getting
19 dark now earlier in the evenings. At 4:30 p.m. it's
20 dark outside. That's the early town of the evening
21 but with it being dark out, our residents don't feel
22 safe and comfortable, especially again seniors, with
23 just going to the store or even just going downstairs
24 in the lobby to check their mailboxes. These have

25

1
2 been constant concerns that we have addressed to
3 NYCHA.

4 I won't say that NYCHA hasn't been responsive but
5 there needs to be some system put in place, better
6 mechanisms if you will for lack of a better term put
7 in place, so that we are not constantly dealing with
8 the same issues repetitively when it comes to doors
9 not locking. Perhaps key fob situations instead of
10 the key. I don't know what - we need to just put
11 something in place.

12 As we speak of the roof access, I was walking
13 with an elected official about two weeks ago to show
14 them the conditions of the roof and we were met by
15 two gentlemen that didn't live in the development,
16 didn't belong there, that created an encampment at
17 the rooftop where construction workers had heavy
18 equipment. Equipment that could be dangerous to
19 anyone that doesn't know how to utilize it properly
20 and we couldn't continue that walk through and had to
21 have them removed.

22 So, it's things like that that make our residents
23 that live here not feel safe. So, we also need our
24 access to our roofs to be safer to not allow people,
25 whether they live here or not to access those roof

1
2 landings and be able to inhabit them for whatever
3 reason they – or whatever they're doing up there.

4 Unfortunately, we had a woman that committed
5 suicide about two months ago. We were told that she,
6 I put my jacket over her body and waited for the
7 ambulance to come and because she accessed the roof
8 and jumped from one of our roof tops that had railing
9 over it.

10 So, maybe we need to consider alarms in our roofs
11 that directly alert the police department or
12 management or the fire department that somebody has
13 access the roof because we've seen way too many
14 bodies coming off of roofs since I've been a resident
15 since 1973. We've seen way too many bodies, at least
16 five, come off the roof. Whether it be murder or it
17 be suicide.

18 So, I support the City Council's effort in this
19 meeting and an agenda to work with NYCHA and move
20 forward so that we can foster better safety
21 conditions for our residents. And again, especially
22 our seniors and children who are the most vulnerable
23 to our communities.

24 And thank you for giving me the opportunity to
25 share that.

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH 15
THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

2 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Thank you so much Julie. We
3 appreciate you being here and for your testimony.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Having no other residents to
5 speak at this time, we'll move on to the
6 Administration testimony.

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: I'd like to recognize
8 Council Member Dinowitz, Council Member Lee, and
9 Council Member Marte.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Again, if anyone is on Zoom
11 and is interested in testifying, please go on to
12 council.nyc.gov and email and sign up to testify at
13 council.nyc.gov/testify or email to
14 testimony@council.nyc.gov. After the Administration
15 testimony, we'll move to public testimony.

16 Would you all please raise your right hand? Do
17 you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and
18 nothing but the truth in your testimony before this
19 Committee and to respond honestly to Council Member
20 questions?

21 PANEL: Yes.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: If you could just identify
23 yourself and your title for the record before you
24 start.

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

16

3 EVA TRIMBLE: Eva Trimble, Chief Operating
4 Officer.

5 SHAAN MAVANI: Shaan Mavani, Chief Asset and
6 Capital Management Officer.

7 LAUREN GRAY: Lauren Gray, Senior Vice President
8 Quality Assurance Safety and Technical Programs.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: You can begin.

10 EVA TRIMBLE: Thank you. Good afternoon Chairs
11 Alexa Avilés and Crystal Hudson, members of the
12 Committees on Public Housing and Aging, other
13 distinguished members of the City Council, NYCHA
14 residents, community advocates and members of the
15 public.

16 I am Eva Trimble, NYCHAs Chief Operating Officer.
17 Today, I am pleased to be joined by Shaan Mavani,
18 Chief Asset and Capital Management Officer; Lauren
19 Gray, Senior Vice President of Quality Assurance,
20 Safety and Technical Programs; and Chief James
21 Secreto, Vice President for Public Safety and
22 Security; as well as our partner from the Department
23 of Aging, Jocelyn Groden, Associate Commissioner.

24 The safety of residents is a fundamental part of
25 our mission, so thank you for this opportunity to

1
2 discuss our efforts to enhance safety and security at
3 NYCHA developments.

4 We recognize the important role of security
5 cameras and other security enhancements, like layered
6 access controls and exterior lighting, so we are
7 always seeking funding to increase the scale of these
8 measures across our portfolio. Since 2014, NYCHA has
9 expended about \$600 million on cameras and other
10 security infrastructure. Funding that's generously
11 provided by the City Council members and other
12 elected officials including the Manhattan District
13 Attorney, as well as through initiatives like the
14 Mayor's Action Plan for Neighborhood Safety.

15 More than 18,500 CCTV cameras are currently
16 installed at NYCHA developments across the city.
17 They are placed strategically at building entrances,
18 roof landings, stairwells, and other exterior and
19 interior areas where illegal activity could occur or
20 unauthorized entrants could gain access. When
21 installing sidewalk sheds for public protection and
22 other structures, we always try to have them designed
23 to minimize blocking security cameras or creating
24 dark, unsafe spaces. If we learn about a camera or
25 lighting that is inadvertently becomes blocked due to

1 sidewalk shedding or other obstruction, we
2 immediately work to reposition the camera, lighting
3 or obstruction to a new location.
4

5 In the past decade, NYCHA has installed nearly
6 10,000 exterior lights at 87 developments. We've
7 also installed layered access controls, new entrance
8 intercoms, key fobs and doors, at more than 400
9 buildings across 80 developments.

10 Considering the massive needs across the
11 Authority, currently totaling more than \$78 billion,
12 we appreciate the funding from the City Council and
13 other partners which enables us to install these
14 vital quality of life and security enhancements. To
15 help maintain our investments in layered access
16 controls and ensure their functionality, we issued
17 protocols for staff on monitoring and repairing
18 damaged doors promptly, work that is both costly and
19 time consuming. Our protocols is also to alert the
20 NYPD in the event of a nonfunctioning door.

21 NYCHA's Office of Safety and Security is
22 dedicated to the safety of residents, through its
23 monitoring of safety systems and policies as well as
24 partnerships with experts like the NYPD. We work
25 closely with the NYPD on many aspects of crime

3 prevention and security enhancement, including the
4 placement of CCTV cameras and exterior lighting. The
5 Office of Safety and Security is also working with
6 property management and resident leadership to access
7 potential safety hazards at our properties through
8 inspections, as well as the analysis of data and
9 reports and resident input to develop solutions for
10 any issues.

11 As we strive to address the growing challenge of
12 aging buildings that have not received the invest
13 they've needed for decades, the safety and quality of
14 life of our residents remain at the heart of our
15 mission. We appreciate the support of our partners,
16 including the NYPD and the City Council as we work
17 with residents to foster safe communities at NYCHA.
18 We are especially thankful for funding from City
19 Council Members for security enhancements such as
20 cameras, exterior lights, and layered access
21 controls. We hope that you will continue to partner
22 with us on these efforts, as we need funding not only
23 to install the infrastructure but also to maintain it.

24 Although we commit all available resources and
25 work with our partners to promote the safety of NYCHA
communities, there is always more that can and must

1
2 be done. Thank you for your support as we continue
3 to make progress for residents. We're happy to
4 answer any questions you may have.

5 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Thank you and I'd like to
6 recognize we've been joined by Council Member Won and
7 Council Member Schulman.

8 Thank you. So, to jump into the questions. Who
9 within the NYCHA management structure is in charge of
10 the physical aspects of resident safety and security
11 policy for NYCHA buildings?

12 EVA TRIMBLE: So, most of that accountability lays
13 with our property management structure, as those -
14 the infrastructure elements that I assume you're
15 referring to are the basics of our buildings, the
16 doors, the lighting, and so forth. And so, that is
17 at its main function a property management function
18 to ensure that the doors are working. Our caretakers
19 every morning do their rounds across the buildings
20 and the grounds and they're required to report any
21 deficiencies in doors or any broken doors, both front
22 entrance and rear entrance, as well as interior stair
23 hall doors. They're supposed to report all of that
24 to their property management supervisors by 10:00

1
2 a.m. and those supervisors would take appropriate
3 action from there.

4 And so, at its base, it is a property management
5 function. However, Property Management works closely
6 with the Office of Safety and Security and other
7 partners both within and outside of NYCHA. So, if
8 there is an incident where a caretaker comes upon a
9 door that's severely broken, clearly vandalized, we
10 will also flag it to the Office of Safety and
11 Security. We will reach out to NYPD and file a
12 police report and if there are cameras, we will pull
13 the cameras in order to see if there's footage of
14 what happened to the door.

15 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Got it. So, how are Safety
16 and Security policy changes filtered down through the
17 neighborhood model?

18 EVA TRIMBLE: So, NYCHA works off of a series of
19 standard protocols and standard procedures, and any
20 types of policy. So, as I mentioned, our caretakers
21 are required to you know do their grounds work and by
22 10:00 a.m. report buildings.

23 I issued guidance reaffirming that practice back
24 in August after we saw you know over the course of
25 the summer many broken doors. The Office of Safety

1
2 and Security also works closely with Property
3 Management doing safety assessments and that is
4 communicated and partnered with Property Management.
5 So, we work you know collaboratively both within
6 NYCHA and as I said with our partners at NYPD.

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: So, I recognize that excuse
8 me one second. Pardon me, excuse me. Uhm, in terms
9 of the you mentioned the safety assessments. Are
10 these – what do you mean by that exactly, if you
11 could explain what that is?

12 AVA TRIMBLE: Sure, I'll ask Lauren Gray to talk
13 more about our safety and security assessments.

14 LAUREN GRAY: Thanks. So, before we even set
15 foot on the grounds of our developments, the Office
16 of Safety and Security is looking at a whole host of
17 information that's provided to us. So, for example,
18 we will look at equal reports from NYPD to see if
19 there's been recent crimes at the developments. We
20 look at our joint homeless initiative with both DHS
21 and NYPD to see if there's been any issues at the
22 development related to homeless folks at the
23 development. We also look at security guard reports
24 and fire safety reports and of course, we take an
25 overall holistic look at the development itself.

1
2 That all happens before we even set foot on the
3 ground.

4 When we go to do an actual assessment, we invite
5 the TA President and property management staff to
6 come along with us. We do a full assessment of the
7 development from roof to basement, looking at seven
8 critical indicators. The first one being doors of
9 course, roof landings, any access points into our
10 buildings, layered access doors versus traditional to
11 make sure that they're functioning properly. We also
12 look at lights both internally and on the external
13 grounds of the properties as well as the roofs,
14 cameras to make sure they haven't been vandalized and
15 are facing appropriately and not being blocked by
16 scaffolding or shedding.

17 We do radio checks with our staff from roof to
18 basement to make sure that the radios are working
19 properly and that everyone could be heard across the
20 development. We look for environmental issues,
21 anything that could pose a safety hazard to both
22 staff, residents, and our guests. We check to see if
23 there are security guards or fire guards, that
24 they're at that post at the right time. And then of
25 course, we look for quality of life issues, such as

1
2 any trespassers or homes people in our stairwells or
3 our roof tops, if there are e-bikes or motorcycles
4 blocking a means of egress. All of this occurs when
5 we do our assessment of the entire development.

6 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: And when does that happen?

7 LAUREN GRAY: Weekly. We go to – we're trying to
8 hit every single development within a yearly
9 timeframe and to date, we've done 114 assessments
10 throughout the portfolio.

11 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: So, to date in terms of this
12 calendar year you've done 114?

13 LAUREN GRAY: Correct.

14 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: And how many do you do on an
15 annual basis?

16 LAUREN GRAY: Well, again, we're trying to do
17 274. That's our portfolio. We get anywhere from 50
18 to 70 percent of the assessments done. We also work
19 with the union, I forgot to mention that. Our union
20 partners come on to do the assessments as well, so we
21 kind of have to wait for them to be able to join us
22 on these walk throughs.

23 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: So, with 335 developments
24 this year, you've conducted 114 assessments?

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

25

3 LAUREN GRAY: Well, we don't do the RAD PACT
4 developments. We're doing the developments that are
5 in the NYCHA portfolio.

6 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: And so, how many
7 developments remain? I forget the moving target. On
8 RAD PACT and what is not.

9 LAUREN GRAY: Oh, about 130 to 140 left.

10 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: That sounds right. Uhm,
11 could you provide the Council with a copy of those
12 assessments?

13 LAUREN GRAY: Sure, absolutely.

14 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: And in particular I'd love
15 to see the assessment done for Red Hook, east and
16 west.

17 LAUREN GRAY: Okay. If we got there, I have to
18 check if we've been to that development yet.

19 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Well, there should be one
20 from last year, right? You're doing them on an
21 annual basis.

22 LAUREN GRAY: Yes.

23 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: We have Council Member
24 Salamanca who has joined us virtually. So, in terms
25 of neighborhood level safety and securities, safety
and security issues, this is really held at the

1 property management level, I just want to make sure.

2 And in terms of who is overseeing property managers
3 in terms of safety and security? Who do property
4 managers check into? Is it the office?

5
6 EVA TRIMBLE: So, for all items, property
7 managers report to a neighborhood administrator who
8 reports to a borough vice president. So, that would
9 be the same for Safety and Security as it pertains to
10 the physical infrastructure. A broken door or
11 something like that but as I said, there is an Office
12 of Safety and Security that is underneath Ms. Gray
13 and coordinates with us centrally.

14 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: My ever challenge with the
15 NYCHA organizational structure ongoing. At a Council
16 Hearing on Public Safety, Mr. Ramon Rodriguez,
17 Director of the Office of Safety and Security at the
18 time at NYCHA, described annual security assessments,
19 which what we talked about. Oh excuse me, we just
20 talked about these assessments. I guess the
21 question, I'm sorry about the assessments, are they
22 made public for the residents to review?

23 EVA TRIMBLE: No, because they do contain
24 sensitive information that we wouldn't want to make
25 public about, for example, the positioning of all of

1
2 our cameras. We don't want to give all that
3 information out because it does jeopardize the safety
4 of the residents. But I will say, I did want to add
5 to that the safety and security assessment that we've
6 just been discussing, we started this year in its
7 current form. Previous years, there were other types
8 of assessments but we greatly expanded the role of
9 safety and security and the safety assessment this
10 year. And so, I just wanted to clarify that the ones
11 that the ones we've done this year, in relation to
12 the ones that had been done previously are much more
13 expanded and comprehensive.

14 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: So, I could understand not
15 publicly reporting on the solutions, locations of the
16 cameras but in terms of what the assessments are
17 finding, why would that not be made available to the
18 residents? The assessment themselves, like what is
19 going on?

20 EVA TRIMBLE: So, the resident leader does join
21 us for these assessments, so that we are seeing
22 safety and security through the eyes of the residents
23 at the development every day and we do work to
24 address that. So, if they say for example, this area
25 is too dark or there needs to be pruning of bushes

1 here or you know, whatever it may be, so that we can
2 work to address those conditions but again, we don't
3 want to share the full report because it would be -
4 it contains sensitive information as to the safety of
5 the development.
6

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: So, okay, I mean it means
8 that I do think there are ways to do reports without
9 including sensitive information that residents can
10 have access to and add information to. I think it's
11 unfortunate because you know there's no public record
12 of tagging the issues and/or addressing them if there
13 is no way to find them. And I appreciate that you
14 have residents with you during this process. It
15 wouldn't be a good one without them but there should
16 be a way for them to access this report. I look
17 forward to receiving them and reviewing them.

18 So, how do you plan to allocate resources for the
19 implementation and recommendations that come out of
20 these assessments. How is that part?

21 EVA TRIMBLE: So, our ability to implement all of
22 the recommendations of those reports is restricted by
23 our budget limitations, so it really depends on the
24 extent of the recommendations. If it's you know
25 reposition a camera here so it gets better viewing,

1 change the position of a lighting, that's fairly easy
2 to do but if it's something like replace an entire
3 door system, that's much harder. Our most recent PNA
4 identified 137 million for the total cost of just our
5 doors. That doesn't include cameras or lighting.
6 So, we do face a significant capital hurdle to
7 completely replacing our doors. And the issue with
8 you know not for a full capital replacement we're
9 faced with repairing a broken door over and over
10 again and that repair becomes less effective at each
11 time.
12

13 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Yeah, so how is NYCHA
14 prioritizing and how does it communicate what it will
15 be doing to residents in terms of improvements? I
16 imagine you have 100 improvements, you can only 25.
17 How do you communicate how you're prioritizing those
18 25?

19 EVA TRIMBLE: It would depend on a case-by-case
20 basis as we again review the report and work with
21 property management to see what we can fix within our
22 resources.

23 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Does every development get
24 an allocation to address safety and security
25 concerns?

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

30

3 EVA TRIMBLE: No, it's just within our general
4 repair budget.

5 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: So, while these risk
6 assessments are intended to be performed each year at
7 the campuses, the information available to us is the
8 Authority-wide Safety plan for the AWSP. The AWSP,
9 however, is not very useful and understanding the
10 safety risks at NYCHA. For example, while reporting
11 on a rise in crime, it does not specify what type of
12 crime. Who develops the AWSPs?

13 LAUREN GRAY: So the Office of Safety and
14 Security developed the Authority-wide Safety plan and
15 a lot of the work that we're doing in the Authority-
16 wide Safety plan is going into actually the Community
17 Development Risk and Safety assessment or the CDRS.

18 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Okay and how are the
19 assessment categories chosen?

20 LAUREN GRAY: Uhm, things that we're seeing in
21 terms of an uptick in you know e-bikes at our
22 developments that are blocking passage way. We never
23 had those in our assessments before. Now, we have a
24 protocol to work with NYPD to have them come and take
25 them off the campus. We never had joint operations
with the Department of Homeless Services and NYPD

1 before. We vetted that as part of our safety
2 assessment as well and the day-to-day operations
3 where we see broken doors, lights, cameras, all of
4 that has been in compass as part of the Authority-
5 wide Safety plan but we're doing newer things as
6 things become a problem at the developments.
7

8 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: And how does the AWSP allow
9 for NYCHA to make better use of the resources?

10 LAUREN GRAY: It's giving us insight as to where
11 we might have higher concentrations of issues at the
12 developments where we never really did before. We
13 essentially relied on eco-reports, just to tell us
14 where there might be an issue, just based on the
15 seven crime indices. Now we're doing this from a
16 more holistic and 360-degree view. We never had
17 residents involved or participated in these before.
18 We are really trying to get buy in and work with our
19 staff and our partners at a much lower level to
20 really understand the needs of the developments.

21 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Can you tell me a little bit
22 more about the Office of Safety and Security? How
23 many people are in that office? What is its budget?

24 LAUREN GRAY: Uhm, right now, we're between 57
25 and 62 staff members and we have a budget of I

1
2 believe \$40 million. I will double check that for
3 you.

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Is that an increase from
5 prior years?

6 LAUREN GRAY: As far as I know, it's been an
7 increase of maybe about five to ten staff members.

8 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Uhm, I'd like to recognize
9 Council Member Lincoln Restler has joined us. So,
10 the Office of the Federal Monitor released a report
11 in May of 2023 describing their findings about safety
12 and security at NYCHA complexes. They proposed the
13 creation of a safety and security technician position
14 to act as a point person for safety and security
15 issue within NYCHA neighborhoods. Is NYCHA planning
16 on creating such a position?

17 LAUREN GRAY: Unfortunately, we don't have the
18 funding to support the positions at this time.

19 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Can you - can you - so we
20 mentioned, you mentioned a team of about 57 to 62
21 staff members. Can you explain a little bit more on
22 what that looks like?

23 LAUREN GRAY: Certainly, so we have a group
24 that's our admin group. We have a team that focuses
25 on uhm, installing, reinstalling CCTVs. That's our

1
2 CCTV Group and that group also helps to manage
3 security guard and fire guard contracts. We have our
4 resident watch group and we have a team that does the
5 workplace violence and the community, the
6 comprehensive development and risk and safety
7 assessments.

8 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Can you give me a general
9 breakdown of at least percentage? I'm trying to
10 understand how you're allocating resources within the
11 office.

12 LAUREN GRAY: I can get back to you on the
13 percentages of each of the groups.

14 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: So, what changes have been
15 made to address safety and security concerns raised
16 by the Monitor? Particularly in the realm of the
17 lack of communication and collaboration between NYCHA
18 and outside agencies.

19 EVA TRIMBLE: We understand the Monitor's
20 feedback in that report and we work closely with
21 them. We speak with them on a weekly basis, if not
22 more often. We believe that we have strong
23 communication with our external partners. Always
24 ways to improve and the monitor team has been helpful
25 in connecting us with the District Attorney's Offices

1
2 and initiatives there that can help improve public
3 safety response and crime prevention but as we've
4 stated, some of the recommendation in their report,
5 while we would agree with, we are not able to
6 implement because of funding restrictions.

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Can you tell me which ones
8 you're not able to implement because of funding?

9 EVA TRIMBLE: Any that cost money, staffing.

10 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: All?

11 EVA TRIMBLE: Yes.

12 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Got it, the entire report.
13 Uhm, no new money. Uh, such an interesting
14 contradiction from all the press releases. During a
15 housing – during a Public Housing Committee Hearing
16 on February 2021, NYCHA reported that they were
17 spending \$50 million on providing security
18 improvements across 35 developments. The security
19 enhancements were set to involve the installation of
20 25 CCTV unit projects. Ten layered access control
21 projects and nine lighting enhancements. Were these
22 projects completed?

23 SHAAN MAVANI: Sure, thank you Chair. The
24 majority of those projects have completed or are
25 close to completion. We can provide a full list and

1
2 the current status as a follow-up to the hearing if
3 that's helpful.

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Was that the yesterday's
5 press release announcement?

6 SHAAN MAVANI: Yeah, a number of those projects
7 are the ones that are highlighted in the press
8 release. The press release from earlier in the week
9 only focused on those projects that we've completed
10 in the last 12 months. So, since November 2022 but
11 the majority of them, vast majority, were projects
12 that completed in 2023.

13 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Great, I'd love to get the
14 complete inventory of what is complete and what is
15 outstanding. Uhm and in particular uhm, let's see,
16 related to that announcement, uhm, could you tell us
17 about the funding mix and the funding sources that
18 were able to facilitate those projects?

19 SHAAN MAVANI: Definitely, so the announcement
20 focused on projects at 23 NYCHA developments, uhm,
21 \$24 million of funding in total. The majority of
22 that was you know generously provided by City Council
23 members. There were a small number of projects that
24 included mayoral funding or state elected funding.
25 And there were a number of projects where you know we

1
2 put in federal funding to close the funding gap or
3 for another reason but the majority of that funding
4 was Council funding.

5 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: And how far back does this
6 Council funding go?

7 SHAAN MAVANI: So, the majority of those projects
8 start at construction in 2022. A number of the
9 lighting projects are much quicker and started
10 construction in 2023 and completed in 2023. There
11 are a couple projects that date back to the entrances
12 in particular where the construction is more
13 complicated back to 2021. Uhm, if helpful, we can
14 provide kind of the specific history of funding that
15 supported those projects.

16 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Right, so if the
17 construction is happening in 2022, it's probably fair
18 to say we're talking about funding that was allocated
19 in 2019, 2018, 2017?

20 SHAAN MAVANI: So, typically, CCTV and lighting
21 projects are one's that we can often do in a very
22 abbreviated timeline, both the design and procurement
23 phases that in other projects could easily take us
24 two years between those items, you know we can often
25 complete in less than six months. So, you know in

1 fact a lot of these projects are able to move
2 quicker. So, you know if they're in construction in
3 2022, uhm where typically you know could have been
4 funded in Fiscal Year 2022 city or Fiscal Year 2021
5 city funding.
6

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: And these, none of these
8 projects are the projects that NYCHA put on hold
9 because they did not have capital money for project
10 managing?

11 SHAAN MAVANI: That's right, so when we put a
12 number of projects on hold earlier this year, we did
13 not include safety and security related projects in
14 general. We do have a number of a small number of
15 projects that are on hold in this space, but that's
16 typically not because of our capacity constraints.
17 That's where the budget does not meet the scope of
18 work that resident leaders would prefer and
19 therefore, are advocating for additional funding to
20 close the gap before we move ahead.

21 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: When you report the
22 breakdown of the sources for the funding of the
23 projects, can you also tell us specifically which
24 developments received entryways, entry way
25 enhancements and how much that cost and uhm and if

1
2 you could also include the breakdown across the
3 developments. I know you gave us kind of the
4 aggregate and that's fine for the press release but
5 I'd like to see that itemized of what the investment
6 was per development. It's kind of hard to discern.
7 Uhm, I think I have to take a pause and turn it over
8 to Chair Hudson.

9 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Thank you much Chair Avilés
10 and I'd like to acknowledge we've been joined by
11 Council Members Mealy and Ossè. I wanted to go back
12 to your testimony briefly and the assessment that the
13 Chair was mentioning. Can you guarantee that the
14 remaining developments that have not yet been
15 assessed will be assessed by December 31st of this
16 year, the annual assessments?

17 EVA TRIMBLE: The goal is to try to get them
18 completed by June 30th of 2024, yeah.

19 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay, so when you talk about
20 annual, you're talking about fiscal, annually
21 fiscally, not calendar?

22 EVA TRIMBLE: No, our goal would be to get them
23 all done within a calendar year, which also happens
24 to be our fiscal year but due to the limited
25 resources and the scheduling constraints that are

1
2 required for these inspections, again they have
3 multiple, external partners. We're not able to get
4 them all done within a year but that's something
5 we're continuing to strive for.

6 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay uhm, you also mentioned
7 that your protocol is to alert the NYPD in the event
8 of a nonfunctioning door. Does the NYPD have the
9 ability to immediately fix broken doors?

10 EVA TRIMBLE: No, they would not fix broken doors
11 for us. What we hope to do is alert them in case it
12 is a possible criminal or vandalism incident. We
13 want to have their help in that process as well as
14 for them to know that there is an unsecured door at
15 that location.

16 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Uhm, and how quickly do you
17 notify contractors?

18 EVA TRIMBLE: Well, it depends. We are - I've
19 asked the staff to try to have maintenance workers
20 repair doors as a first, as a first resort and see
21 how far maintenance workers can get. They're not
22 always possible to repair the doors and then we would
23 reach out to a vendor if necessary.

24 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: So, who do you contact first
25 maintenance or NYPD?

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

40

3 EVA TRIMBLE: Maintenance.

4 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Uhm, what is NYCHA's
5 involved in the cabinet for older New Yorkers?

6 EVA TRIMBLE: Sure, NYCHA participates in the
7 cabinet for older New Yorkers along with our partners
8 at aging and NYPD. We work closely with aging and
9 their existing domestic violence programs. We have
10 our family partnership program that works closely
11 with them. There are liaisons between NYCHA and
12 Aging and I'm happy to refer to Aging if you want
13 more information on how that older adults cabinet is
14 working.

15 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Thank you. How many NYCHA
16 campuses have cameras?

17 LAUREN GRAY: There are a total of 214
18 developments that have cameras and 52 developments
19 that do not.

20 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Thank you. And what type of
21 camera systems does NYCHA have?

22 LAUREN GRAY: NYCHA has three type of camera
23 systems. We have the NYPD Viper. We have Argus and
24 we have General camera installation.
25

3 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Can you provide us with a
4 breakdown on how many cameras are monitored by the
5 NYPD and how many cameras are monitored by NYCHA?

6 LAUREN GRAY: Sure. We can follow up with you on
7 that.

8 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay, so you don't have it
9 now?

10 LAUREN GRAY: Okay, uhm, so 3,114 are NYPD Viper
11 cameras and 80 are NYPD Argus cameras.

12 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Sorry, can you repeat that?
13 3,114 are?

14 LAUREN GRAY: The NYPD Viper cameras and 80 are
15 the NYPD Argus cameras and the remaining are the
16 NYCHA CCTV cameras.

17 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: What does that mean? What
18 are those distinctions?

19 EVA TRIMBLE: We will call up Secreto to help
20 explain that distinction.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Good afternoon, please raise
22 your right hand. Do you affirm to tell the truth,
23 the whole truth and nothing but the truth and to
24 respond honestly to Council Member questions?

25 JAMES SECRETO: I do.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: You may proceed.

1
2 JAMES SECRETO: Okay, Viper, the 3,000 Viper
3 cameras, those are located in the precinct or the
4 PSAs, the monitors. And those are accessible to the
5 police department. The 15,000 some odd cameras are
6 the NYCHA cameras where we either have they call it a
7 sock or I'm drawing a blank here, I'm sorry but the
8 15,000 cameras that we have that we can monitor and
9 there are also some of them that PD is able to
10 monitor aside from Viper, there's 15 Viper cameras
11 and there's also, there's about 40 cameras in total.
12 So, 25 others that PD can monitor from the desk.
13 Sergeant can monitor. They can monitor it from an
14 iPad or a cellphone. There's about 40 of those, 15
15 of which are Viper and the 3,000 that was mentioned,
16 those Viper cameras as well, 15 separate developments
17 throughout the city that are NYPD.

18 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: And when you say they can
19 monitor, do you know how frequently they do monitor
20 those cameras?

21 JAMES SECRETO: I do not. I don't know that but
22 I would imagine you know every day that they're
23 watching. There used to be separate rooms when I was
24 with the police department, there was separate Viper
25 rooms that they had. At some point they did away

1
2 with that and now those monitors are behind the desk
3 at the various PSA's.

4 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: So, would it be a safe
5 assumption to make that NYCHA campuses with the NYPD
6 cameras are under constant surveillance?

7 EVA TRIMBLE: I think we'd have to defer to NYPD
8 to answer that question.

9 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay. And then can you just
10 give me the total numbers of the cameras because you
11 mentioned - I asked about campuses specifically. You
12 said 214 have and 52 don't but do you know the actual
13 breakdown in cameras? Because now we have different
14 numbers 3,114 and then 1,500 NYCHA cameras.

15 LAUREN GRAY: No, I'll clarify.

16 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Yeah, thank you.

17 LAUREN GRAY: There are 18,590 cameras across -

18 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: 18,590 cameras.

19 LAUREN GRAY: 18,597 cameras across 214
20 developments. 52 developments do not have cameras.
21 Of the 18,597, 15,403 are the NYCHA CCTV cameras,
22 3,114 are then NYPD Viper cameras and 80 are the NYPD
23 Argus cameras.

24 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Perfect, thank you so much.
25 Uhm, how do you determine which cameras go where?

1
2 Like, NYPD Viper cameras versus the NYCHA CCTV
3 cameras. How do you determine which developments get
4 which type of cameras?

5 JAMES SECRETO: That's pretty much determined by
6 the management of the development but it's pretty
7 standard. It's going to be lobbies, roof landing,
8 elevators -

9 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Sorry, I mean the camera
10 types. So, how do you determine which developments
11 get the CCTV?

12 EVA TRIMBLE: So, NYPD supports the Viper and
13 Argus cameras and so they determine and we have an
14 MOU with them where we work closely if they're
15 willing to support additional cameras. NYCHA has the
16 CCTV cameras that we allocate based on funding from
17 mostly elected officials. So, they are determining
18 which developments they are going to.

19 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: And then how long is the
20 footage kept?

21 EVA TRIMBLE: Several weeks.

22 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Can you give me a more
23 specific answer?

24 EVA TRIMBLE: I'd rather not. Again -
25

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

45

3 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Several of like four to
4 seven.

5 EVA TRIMBLE: I'd rather not give a specific
6 answer because again, we believe that's a sensitive
7 piece of information.

8 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay. Uhm and which cameras
9 are better monitored would you say between the CCTV
10 cameras and the NYPD cameras? Or I should say
11 perhaps, more consistently monitored?

12 EVA TRIMBLE: I can't speak to NYPD monitoring of
13 their cameras but for NYCHA's cameras, we have our
14 CCTV team that does scans and sampling of camera
15 footage throughout the day and property management
16 will also look at camera footage depending on if
17 there's an incident at the site.

18 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: So, all 15,403 NYCHA CCTV
19 cameras are monitored throughout the day, daily?

20 EVA TRIMBLE: Not all of them. We'll do a
21 sampling or a scanning of cameras.

22 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Uhm, okay.

23 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: I have a follow up question.

24 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Yeah sure.
25

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

46

3 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Are the cameras, the
4 monitors actually, are they – are any of them located
5 on NYCHA campuses or are they off campus?

6 EVA TRIMBLE: Some are at the property management
7 offices and some are centrally.

8 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Oh okay, so a combination.

9 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Has the city considered
10 training volunteers who might be interested in
11 monitoring the cameras? Like resident volunteers or
12 any one else?

13 EVA TRIMBLE: We can certainly talk more about
14 that possibility.

15 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay. Thank you. I'll come
16 back.

17 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Yeah, we're going to uhm, I
18 would like to recognize Council Member Chi Ossè and
19 we'd like to pass the mic to some of our colleagues.
20 Council Member Restler.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Great. Thank you so
22 much to Chair Avilès and Chair Hudson for leadership
23 on this hearing and it's good to see the NYCHA team.
24 Thank you for joining us today. And I apologize if I
25 missed this at the beginning but just to come back on
the data relative to the Comptroller's report from

1
2 last year on open – on broken locks and doors not
3 secured. Do you have updated data for where we are
4 currently relative to where we were about a year ago?

5 EVA TRIMBLE: Sure and good to see you again. I
6 feel like we're doing this once a month lately.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Not enough. Not
8 frequently enough. Although I guess the good news
9 for you is that all seven of my NYCHA developments
10 have been moved out of our district, so you won't
11 have to bother me – I won't be bothering you as much
12 anymore.

13 EVA TRIMBLE: Always happy to work together. At
14 the time when the Comptroller issued his report, that
15 was a point and time assessment that they had
16 conducted of doors. I think it's important to
17 recognize that the state of doors really does change
18 every day. We fix them, they can be broken again.
19 The caretaker could do their daily rounds and not
20 notice anything and move on to their afternoon work
21 and the door can be broken after the caretaker leaves
22 that building.

23 And so, the point and time nature is really
24 important. After the Comptroller issued their report
25 and sent us those findings, we corrected all of the

1 deficiencies that were noted. And so, since then,
2 you know we're not tracking specifically to that
3 Comptrollers report but like I said, we are tracking
4 every day the deficiencies that we're finding on our
5 doors and grounds.
6

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I mean, the Comptrollers
8 report found 58 percent of NYCHA doors were not
9 secure, 40 percent of broken locks. Those are super
10 widespread issues and for all of us who spend time in
11 our NYCHA developments every day, every week, it's
12 consistent with what we experience on the ground. I
13 mean, I called one of my tenant association
14 presidents in advance of this hearing. You know she
15 said a significant number of the doors at Gowanus are
16 broken right now. That you know the electronic locks
17 are on the lobby doors are broken as we speak. Is
18 there - just to understand the tracking and you know
19 because it's with the tracking that we can inform a
20 greater accountability, do you have a point and time
21 sense for right now or the most recent point and time
22 data that you have available for what percent of
23 doors were broken, lobby doors?

24 EVA TRIMBLE: Right now at this time, we have
25 none that - we have just over 9,500 work orders for

1 doors. That includes both lobby doors, rear exit
2 doors, stairwell doors and any kind of public space
3 door. That 9,500 work orders can be anything from
4 fully broken and not functioning to you know a broken
5 handle or a broken window but they still lock. So,
6 we know that maintenance of building entrances is an
7 ongoing process. I know that every time I go out to
8 a property, there is an issue with the door.

9
10 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Totally

11 EVA TRIMBLE: It is definitely one of our biggest
12 challenges as I said because it changes day to day.
13 It's also, as I mentioned earlier from our last PNA,
14 \$137 million need just for doors, not any other type
15 of security enhancement. And because we're not able
16 to do that kind of capital work when we continue to
17 repair and repair a broken door, it kind of becomes
18 like a frankly for lack of a better word, a
19 Frankenstein door. Where we've pieced together
20 multiple parts and it's just working as well as it
21 should anymore. But that we continue to monitor and
22 we continue to repair as best as we can.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Great and I'll just wrap
24 with a brief comment and question. You know we all
25 know how important this issue is because we you know

1 we have squatters. We have unsafe conditions. We
2 have people who are perpetrating violence and dealing
3 drugs and doing other problematic things in those
4 buildings that don't have locked doors and so, if
5 we're able to secure the lobby, everybody in the
6 building is safer. And you know we do our best to
7 bring you the issues of the individual units that are
8 causing challenges for neighbors but if we can get to
9 the heart of the matter and keep the building secure,
10 it makes it safer for everybody. I know you know
11 that and I know you get it but 9,500 to me it seems
12 like a big number. I don't have a perspective though
13 over time. Are you able to give us any context of
14 how does that number compare over time? Is that a
15 high-water mark for NYCHA? What was the high-water
16 mark in the last couple years or can you give us any
17 perspective on how that compares? And thank you
18 Chairs.

20 EVA TRIMBLE: I can certainly follow-up on a year
21 over year analysis. I do believe that we are
22 starting to lower the backlog. So far this year
23 we've closed more work orders than have been opened
24 for the first time in a long time, so I think we're
25 slowly starting to -

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: On doors specifically?

3 EVA TRIMBLE: On doors specifically but I'm happy
4 to follow up on a more historical analysis for you.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Or is there a place that
6 we should be tracking that data that's publicly
7 available?

8 EVA TRIMBLE: I don't believe it's publicly
9 available. We're happy to follow up with you on it.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Okay, thank you Eva and
11 thank you to the NYCHA team.

12 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Thank you Council Member.
13 Ossè.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSE: Thank you so much Chairs
15 and good afternoon everyone. I want to bring it to
16 just a very hyperlocal issue in my district. Last
17 week a constituent at Albany Houses told us that the
18 locks on his building at 193 Albany Avenue were
19 broken and because of this there has been an unhoused
20 person who frequently comes into the building and
21 makes a mess in the hallways and the basement.

22 My first question is, has NYCHA come to Albany
23 Houses to look into their lock situation when it
24 comes to these doors?

25

1
2 EVA TRIMBLE: I'm not familiar with that exact
3 incident or location but I will say NYCHA is in the
4 houses every day. Our caretaker staff is there every
5 day. The property management staff is there. So,
6 I'd have to follow up with property management to see
7 what they've been doing to address that situation and
8 I'm happy to follow up with you on that.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÈ: Sure and secondly, does
10 NYCHA partner with DHS on issues like this when it
11 comes to unhoused folks who make their way into -

12 EVA TRIMBLE: Yes, I defer to Lauren to talk more
13 about our program with DHS.

14 LAUREN GRAY: Hi, so we go to developments.
15 NYCHA partners with NYPD and DHS when DHS is
16 available when it's made known to NYCHA that there is
17 either a pervasive homeless issue or an encampment.
18 They go out two to three times a week with NYPD and
19 DHS to try to offer services to the folks that are in
20 our stairwells and on our rooftops and if the person
21 refuses services from DHS, the police help escort
22 them off the campus.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÈ: Great, if you could look
24 into that specific issue you know I think some folks
25 over there have been calling 311 about it and you

1
2 know obviously those have been closed out with how
3 any -

4 EVA TRIMBLE: And please make sure they're
5 calling the CCC about it and not 311. The CCC will
6 route that complaint directly to property management
7 so we can make sure it's addressed.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSE: Okay, wonderful. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: I have a quick follow up
10 question. What's the current level of funding for
11 that program?

12 EVA TRIMBLE: We don't have funding for DHS's
13 support of that program.

14 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: So, NYCHA doesn't provide
15 any funding specifically for that?

16 EVA TRIMBLE: No, it's just a coordination and
17 partnership. So, it's existing staff that we've
18 committed to twice a week going to different sites
19 and doing walk down roof to basement and if we find
20 any unhoused individuals, you know DHS is there to
21 hopefully offer them services and try to get them
22 into shelter.

23 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: How many units are made
24 available to do those searches?

25 EVA TRIMBLE: You mean teams?

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

54

3 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Yeah.

4 JAMES SECRETO: We do it two to three times a
5 week. Pick a different, well not pick, there's a
6 different development. I think last night we were at
7 Saint Nicolas. Tuesday night we were at Brownsville.

8 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: So, it's just one team that
9 does -

10 JAMES SECRETO: Yeah, I think uhm two teams
11 actually from DHS and that's an improvement as well
12 because there was a time when DHS would not go inside
13 the development. So, there was an MOU entered into
14 early last year between NYPD, NYCHA and DHS. Whereas
15 now, they come inside the buildings and try and
16 encounter you know homeless people and offer
17 services. Either drug treatment, mental health or
18 shelter and so, it's basically a team of two.
19 Depending on how many people we have.

20 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: A team of two or two teams?

21 JAMES SECRETO: A team or two.

22 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Oh, a team or two.

23 JAMES SECRETO: A team or two and we do you know
24 all the buildings in the development or several
25 buildings in the development.

CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Thank you.

3 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Are you pursuing complaints
4 that are coming in or how are you choosing where to
5 deploy the teams?

6 JAMES SECRETO: Yeah, definitely complaints.
7 There was an issue in more houses over the week. I
8 think a homeless person overdosed in a staircase, so
9 we're going to concentrate on more houses you know
10 because we're getting complaints of homelessness you
11 know in that development but yeah, that's how we you
12 know we decide where to go based on complaints,
13 tenant leaders, complaints others police department
14 complaints.

15 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: And does NYCHA have on hand
16 the number of complaints they've received in terms of
17 unhoused individuals in the hallways or on the roofs
18 or?

19 EVA TRIMBLE: No, we don't have that. I can see
20 if we can - if that's something we can pull for
21 follow up for you.

22 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Yeah, I'd love to understand
23 what the scale. It is obviously even from our tenant
24 that testified earlier, an issue and we hear
25 anecdotally it's proliferating particularly when the

1 doors don't close. So, would love to understand
2 fully what that looks like.

3
4 On average, I know this is challenging because
5 you know you talked about in terms of you could
6 repair the door and it could be broken several hours
7 later or relatively quickly but on average, with work
8 order reform, how quickly are these door lock work
9 orders being addressed?

10 EVA TRIMBLE: So, this is and I love that you
11 bring up work order reform since you know it's so
12 near and dear to me. But this is actually something
13 that's outside of the work order reform process since
14 it's not a skilled trade response. As I mentioned,
15 we are working with our maintenance workers to try to
16 have them review the situation with the door, see if
17 it's something that we can fix in house before we
18 reach out to a vendor. However, as we've done more
19 door rehabs and switched over to layered access
20 controls and improved our doors from the capital
21 program side is something that we are looking at and
22 we are having to retrain our maintenance workers to
23 be able to handle the maintenance of and therefore
24 are more often than not having to reach out to
25 vendors to have the doors repaired.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Does that require
3 developments to have materials on site?

4 EVA TRIMBLE: Sometimes and sometimes we rely on
5 the vendors to bring the materials.

6 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: To bring them. Uhm, in
7 terms of the layers access, how much does it cost to
8 install layered access controls in a NYCHA building?

9 SHAAN MAVANI: So, layered access controls is
10 kind of a broad concept uhm that typically or
11 basically means that there are multiple ways that you
12 are securing the entry. So, in addition to the
13 physical door, typically layered access control will
14 include electric uh, the ability to change access
15 controls through key fobs that can be managed
16 centrally or digitally. It can include intercoms; it
17 can include video intercoms. It could include
18 additional CCT cameras and a range of other
19 components, right? And so, we look at what is the
20 priority for the given site and based on the budget
21 and try to maximize what resident leaders and our
22 property staff are prioritizing.

23 So, the cost can range quite a bit depending on
24 which components we're talking about. So, if we are
25 kind of saying let's do everything, including you

1
2 know increasing disability and a lobby and things
3 like that, you could see an entry way project costing
4 one and half million dollars for one building. But
5 if we're just doing a door replacement and maybe the
6 store front around the door, then we can do that for
7 \$300,000. So, there's a range of prices based on you
8 know what we're trying to achieve.

9 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Is there evidence that the
10 implementation of layered access controls reduces
11 crime in NYCHA?

12 SHAAN MAVANI: So, I think that uhm, that is a
13 very good question and something that we think about
14 a lot and try to test when we put in a layered x
15 control in terms of monitoring that surveying
16 residents. There are a lot of confounding factors as
17 you would imagine that drives security at a specific
18 building or a site that may or may not be related to
19 layered access control or other components. I think
20 that's the kind of thing we partner with NYPD and
21 others to look at systemically and who are better
22 placed to understand the crime data and work with us
23 on that.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: So, does NYCHA keep track of
3 certain dimensions or criteria's over a long period
4 of time?

5 EVA TRIMBLE: We're not currently tracking that.
6 Although we could certainly talk about working with
7 NYPD if they're you know on a specific research into
8 that question but as Shaan said, we really have to
9 defer to NYPD as the criminologists to determine
10 cause and correlation of the crime that is happening
11 at our developments.

12 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Yeah, and at least
13 associating, checking in outcomes right. If you're
14 actually having systems that work, do you see a
15 reduction? I'd like to turn it over to Council
16 Member Mealy. Council Member.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Thank you. I just have a
18 few questions. Has there been any review comparing
19 the time that property management and staff takes to
20 repair compared to the outside contractors?

21 EVA TRIMBLE: We have not done that analysis
22 primarily because if we're having to go to a vendor
23 to get the repair, it's usually because we're not
24 able to do the repair in house due to either
25 materials or labor skills. Again, as the doors

1
2 become more complicated, it's not just a simple
3 repair, it becomes you know more electrical or other
4 in nature. And so, it wouldn't necessarily be a one-
5 to-one analysis.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So, how do you select the
7 contractors? How many WMBE's?

8 EVA TRIMBLE: The vendors are - go through our
9 typical procurement process for the doors for
10 repairing these types of doors.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: BIDs?

12 EVA TRIMBLE: Yes. It's our regular procurement
13 process.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Because I just heard you
15 tell my colleague that the managers go check the
16 doors. So, how often do the management go check to
17 make sure the doors are secure?

18 EVA TRIMBLE: So, our caretakers as part of their
19 daily walk throughs of the building -

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: But how are they able not
21 to know that Albany projects or Marcus Garvy Projects
22 doors are open? Shouldn't you say they all on staff
23 right then? So, is it daily do they check them or
24 after they check them, if they find out because
25

1
2 they're on site every day, do they go back and put in
3 a report?

4 EVA TRIMBLE: Yeah, so the caretakers uh, do
5 their work -

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: How did they not know
7 about Albany door that was closed? The door was
8 broken?

9 EVA TRIMBLE: They usually know that the door is
10 broken and if the maintenance worker is not able to
11 fix it, then we have to reach out to vendor. That
12 repair doesn't usually happen in the same day.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: How's the repair
14 turnaround time to fix it?

15 EVA TRIMBLE: It varies depending on the problem
16 with the door. I can certainly take a look at our
17 data and follow up with you on repair times.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay then, uhm, one thing
19 I want is your take or has the Administration
20 considered having a different weight, size of doors
21 for seniors? We have - NYCHA have a lot of senior
22 housing and when I go to the building, the door is
23 really heavy and these are seniors. I went to visit
24 a 96-year-old and she said, "that door downstairs is
25 really heavy."

1
2 So, have you all ever concerned changing that?
3 Or a video com for senior buildings by itself?

4 SHAAN MAVANI: Yeah, thank you for the question
5 Council Member Mealy. Something that we do hear a
6 lot about and think about a lot. We have been
7 piloting a new type of door for the last couple of
8 years at a number of sites.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Where?

10 SHAAN MAVANI: I can give you the list of
11 specific developments in a moment but this is a more
12 standard residential door than we have at many
13 natural properties. It's an aluminum door but with
14 steel reinforcements, so the benefits are that it's
15 as strong as the doors that we've had traditionally
16 but it's lighter. It's almost much more available on
17 the market, easier to replace and repair. So, we've
18 been running this, what we call our entryway pilot
19 that combines those new doors with more visibility
20 and the lobby with video intercoms and other
21 components and so far that's been successful at the
22 sites where we've done that and we're doing that
23 based on a lot of resident feedback the last few
24 years and engagement where we designed this pilot to
25 implement at five developments and then we're hoping

1
2 that based – if it's you know as successful as we're
3 hoping, to be able to mobilize funding to expand that
4 more broadly but that's the one main effort that we
5 have that gets at your issue around the weight of the
6 doors themself.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I will get it after the
8 hearing. Out of the five pilot sites, how many are
9 senior developments?

10 SHAAN MAVANI: That's something I can also come
11 back to you on as a follow up if that's possible.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: There's only five.
13 Shouldn't one of them be seniors? At least one?

14 SHAAN MAVANI: Yeah, because we have some
15 exclusive senior developments and we have
16 developments that have exclusive senior buildings. I
17 just want to make sure that the five buildings we're
18 doing it at, uhm we can give you an accurate answer
19 on that.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I think to have due
21 diligence, one of them should have been a senior
22 building straight away. I mean first thing because
23 those doors are really, really, really heavy. So,
24 thank you.

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

64

3 SHAAN MAVANI: Yeah, so I think with the sites
4 that we're doing it at are 45 Allen Street, Carver
5 Houses, Cassidy Lafayette, Seth Low Houses and Conlon
6 Lihfe Tower.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Seth Low is mine.

8 SHAAN MAVANI: Yes and so, I was going to say
9 Seth Low is where we have a senior-

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: But it's not a senior
11 development. Like Marcus Garvey and just for your
12 knowledge, you should check that door is kind of
13 secure but they do have homeless living on the 6th
14 floor and whenever they call the police or PSA, they
15 leave and come right back and the people on that
16 floor is very scared. I mean, it's becoming people
17 where they live, exactly right by the roof.

18 So, could we please our eye on that? And that's
19 the senior, all seniors. Thank you. Thank you
20 Chair.

21 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Mr. Mavani, could you repeat
22 the five developments? You said 45 Allen Carver Seth
23 Low and I missed the last two.

24 SHAAN MAVANI: Sure, Cassidy Lafayette -

25 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Lafayette.

SHAAN MAVANI: And uh Conlon Lihfe Tower.

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

65

3 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: What?

4 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Conlon Lihfe.

5 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: And can you tell us a little
6 bit more what will make the pilot successful? What
7 is that you will be tracking and over what period of
8 time?

9 SHAAN MAVANI: Yeah, so after we finish
10 construction at each site. We are both monitoring
11 you know performance in terms of what was asked
12 earlier, are the doors being broken again? Are there
13 security incidents? But we're also serving residents
14 at each of the sites about how they feel about the
15 renovation. Do they feel that's improved safety and
16 security? And then concretely, where do they see
17 those benefits coming. You know we're also in that
18 pilot trying video intercom systems, new type of
19 intercoms and fobs and other aspects, also surveying
20 them on if that's working well for them. If they're
21 seeing challenges and things like that. So, given we
22 have now finished construction at four of the five
23 sites, we have started to get that feedback.

24 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: And how long will you track
25 it for?

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

66

3 SHAAN MAVANI: I believe that our plan is to
4 track it for one year at each of the sites after
5 completing construction. Uhm, to be able to
6 understand what other refinements could be made? And
7 then to think about how we might be able to fund this
8 at a broader set of sites.

9 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: And how much did the pilot
10 cost?

11 SHAAN MAVANI: The cost at each of the buildings
12 ranges between I think \$1 million and \$1.75 million.
13 I have the exact numbers, I can either find them or
14 provide them as a follow-up if helpful but that's the
15 general range. One of the objectives of the pilot
16 was to try to optimize cost by both cost and the
17 ability to repair quickly if there is issues, given
18 that's one of our challenges in the past. And so, we
19 continue to think about how do we provide these
20 improvements at the best possible cost.

21 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: And uhm in terms of the I
22 mean; you don't have the repair piece yet because you
23 haven't been to that part of the pilot but like how
24 do you anticipate will you have maintenance staff
25 particularly trained in how to repair the doors? Or

1
2 like how are you anticipating addressing that
3 differently?

4 SHAAN MAVANI: Sure, uhm, so some of – one of the
5 design elements of the pilot was to make sure that
6 the different components of the doorways and other
7 aspects are easily available on the market. And
8 therefore, it's easier for our developments to order
9 them, but also that there is wide knowledge about
10 their installation and usage, right?

11 So, I think we'll look at this question of is
12 there further training required? But generally, the
13 door technology itself is not something very unique.
14 The intercom systems are usually where there's quite
15 you know, there can be specific technical skills or
16 capabilities required because of the electronics and
17 other components and so, we you know if we introduce
18 a new technology like this at a number of
19 developments, we'll typically keep vendor contracts
20 on to ensure in the initial period there is support
21 and then over time, you know if we can bring that
22 into our staff training to provide that.

23 I just want to correct now that I have the
24 financial data. The cost did range in a couple
25 developments around \$1 million but in a number of the

1
2 developments, it was significantly more at \$2.8
3 million or \$3 million.

4 That really depends on you know the size of the
5 lobby and other features that we're doing at that
6 building.

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Got it and in terms of uhm,
8 has there been a review or a study of when work can
9 be done in house and the comparisons between the cost
10 of in-house repair work and outside contracting for
11 the doors in particular?

12 EVA TRIMBLE: For the repairs?

13 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Yeah.

14 EVA TRIMBLE: Yes, we I mean, on each individual
15 case, we're making that analysis and so, again as I
16 mentioned, if it's something simple like a hinge or
17 doorknob or something that we think our maintenance
18 workers can repair, we do try to make those repairs
19 in house because that's both the quickest and
20 cheapest way for us to get the door back in service.
21 However, we do often have to call in a vendor to have
22 the doors repaired.

23 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: And can you tell us how much
24 I guess in total is allocated for outside contracting
25 to repair doors?

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

69

3 EVA TRIMBLE: I don't have that total value with
4 me but I can certainly follow up.

5 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: And I'd also like to know in
6 the event that the contractors who are awarded repair
7 contracts, if they've failed to complete their work,
8 what are their claw backs or other remedies and what
9 that looks like and has NYCHA actually done that with
10 any of its contractors?

11 EVA TRIMBLE: So, the door contracts, the door
12 vendors are uhm, you know similar to any of our
13 contracts where we have accountability measures in
14 the contract. There are you know a lot of work with
15 our doors going around and we actually did have one
16 vendor who we didn't feel was performing, where we
17 were hearing long delays in getting their response.
18 They were also I think facing a large volume of
19 workload themselves from our needs and we called them
20 in and we sat them down and we went through the doors
21 that are pending with them. What they were facing
22 from their supply and labor market issues and we've
23 seen some improvement in their performance since then
24 but we've also been working on issuing new contracts
25 to expand our capacity of vendors in this field.

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

70

3 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: How many contractors do you
4 use for exterior doors and locks?

5 EVA TRIMBLE: We can follow up but I think right
6 now we have about three or four vendors on contract
7 for doors specifically.

8 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: And do you know on average
9 how long each of those vendors have been contracting
10 with the city?

11 EVA TRIMBLE: I don't but we can follow up on
12 that.

13 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay, thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Yeah, we'd like to recognize
15 Deputy Speaker Ayala.

16 DEPUTY SPEAKER AYALA: Thank you and I'm sorry
17 I'm late. I was watching in the car, so on the way
18 here and I just want to say congratulations on
19 securing Secreto, he's great. Uhm, he's been very
20 helpful to my community and he's always available
21 when we reach out.

22 I have three questions. One is regarding the
23 layered access. So, my concern is that I know that
24 the original vendor went out of business and so, when
25 you are - when you say that you're still seeking

1 public dollars for vendors, for the layered access,
2 uhm what vendor are you using? Is it somebody new?
3

4 EVA TRIMBLE: I'm not sure what vendor you're
5 referring to that went out of business but we have
6 two vendors that are specific for layered access
7 right now and then two other vendors for our other
8 types of doors.

9 DEPUTY SPEAKER AYALA: So, when they first
10 started installing the layered access systems, we
11 gave money for the like Corsi Houses for instance to
12 install layered access and they were maintaining them
13 and then they were not and then when I reached out, I
14 was told that the reason was that that specific
15 contractor was out of business and they didn't have
16 the parts. So, is that not accurate?

17 EVA TRIMBLE: We can certainly follow up. I'm
18 just not familiar with that specific case but I'm
19 happy to follow up on what happened there.

20 DEPUTY SPEAKER AYALA: Yeah, and it wasn't just
21 specific to Corsi. Like, uhm, during that time,
22 other buildings that had the same system installed
23 had similar issues. So, I'm curious to find out if
24 that contractor went out of business. As I was told,
25 uhm how does the - so, does the new contractor then -

1
2 are they able to maintain that system if it's not
3 their system? Because it has been problematic for
4 us.

5 EVA TRIMBLE: Yes, we - I do believe other
6 vendors are able to maintain those systems but like I
7 said, we have about three or four vendors that work
8 on different types of doors. So, layered access is
9 the most complicated and complex because as Shaan
10 mentioned it involves both the intercom system,
11 sometimes connections with cameras. So, you need
12 electrical and sometimes technological - like inter
13 IT type work, connections to the phone system and
14 things like that. Other vendors are - so some
15 vendors aren't able to do that level and just do the
16 basic door repair work. But we can follow up on the
17 specifics.

18 DEPUTY SPEAKER AYALA: That would be great. I
19 think one of the other concerns that I had is that
20 because that system was so expensive, I you know, we
21 weren't able as an office to replicate it through all
22 of our developments, so we specifically focus on the
23 senior buildings. But one of the selling points for
24 it was that if you had a side door that was left
25 open, there would be some sort of alarm that would

1 ring to some security office and then somebody would
2 immediately come and close it and we found that that
3 actually does not happen at all.
4

5 So, there have been many times when I've gone
6 into and I'll keep using Corsi as an example, to
7 Corsi and the side door by the parking lot is
8 continuously left open by transients that are you
9 know living in the building. They usually use a rock
10 or something but you know I just assumed that it was
11 because we were still trying to figure out who the
12 partner would be. So, if there is a partner now,
13 then I'm curious to know why that's still the case,
14 right? Because that was really the selling point for
15 me. You know I mean, when I'm considering funding
16 projects and I felt that that was a little bit
17 expensive for you know that system, I said well, the
18 added benefit is that there are other protections
19 that are very unique to the system but if there's no
20 oversight over it and it's not working it doesn't
21 really make me want to continue to fund them you
22 know. And I want to be helpful but I -

23 EVA TRIMBLE: Thank you. We appreciate your
24 support and generous funding throughout the years and
25

1 we definitely will follow up to see what happened
2 with those security features that you're mentioning.

3
4 DEPUTY SPEAKER AYALA: Yeah.

5 EVA TRIMBLE: They do sound very helpful.

6 DEPUTY SPEAKER AYALA: Yeah, yeah, no, it was
7 awesome. Uhm and regarding security, so typically at
8 some of my senior buildings have security. Some of
9 my buildings don't have security. I don't know how
10 NYCHA makes the determination on who gets it and who
11 doesn't and how NYCHA determines what the amount of
12 time the security should be allowed in these
13 buildings is, but I find that usually it is like
14 eight hours, so the seniors can decide whether they
15 want 8-4 or 4-12 right? And so it becomes
16 problematic because you're just moving people around
17 and then you know the folks that we don't want to be
18 coming into the building are like, oh, well, there's
19 no one there during the day so let me go in the day.
20 And then at night we have a problem.

21 So, I've always requested 20 you know 24-hour
22 security for these buildings because of the
23 sensitivity right regarding the age of the folks that
24 live there. They're a little bit more vulnerable.
25 Is this something that NYCHA has considered?

3 EVA TRIMBLE: So, we provide right now we're
4 providing security at 56 senior developments, which
5 are all the senior only buildings in the portfolio
6 and it is just a single eight-hour shift and that
7 eight-hour shift is determined by the Resident
8 Association President about as you said, whether they
9 want it during the day or night. And unfortunately
10 we are severely limited with our funding in order to
11 do anything further.

12 DEPUTY SPEAKER AYALA: You have \$40 million for
13 security.

14 EVA TRIMBLE: And \$7 million -

15 DEPUTY SPEAKER AYALA: I heard it on the drive
16 down.

17 EVA TRIMBLE: \$7 million of it goes to these
18 security guards at senior and the other part of that
19 \$40 million is for our fire guard watches. So, it
20 does not go as far as it sounds as it goes.

21 DEPUTY SPEAKER AYALA: So, I know that some of my
22 senior buildings are transitioning now to RAD and
23 PACT. Are all senior buildings transitioning or is
24 it just a select few?

25 EVA TRIMBLE: No, just if the PACT, if the
development already has a senior building or is part

3 or is part of the PACT pipeline, it will go out but
4 it's not a senior program.

5 DEPUTY SPEAKER AYALA: Okay, because one of
6 things that I do like that they offer is that it
7 feels more like a Section 202 proposal, where you
8 have the social services component and you also have
9 the security features. I never understood why NYCHA
10 was in the business of having senior build - senior
11 focused buildings because they didn't have - back
12 many, many years ago, they used to have like a social
13 worker on site that knew if Apartment 2C hadn't been
14 seen you know in a while. If the mail was backing up
15 in the you know in the mailbox. That doesn't exist
16 anymore and you know I'm concerned because these
17 buildings again, you know what we did was that we
18 populated them with a vulnerable population and then
19 left them there to really fend for themselves. And
20 many of them as you've heard through testimony of the
21 opening remarks from the Council Members and the
22 Chairs this afternoon, uhm, have encountered pretty
23 serious criminal activity you know within the scope
24 of the buildings.

25 I know for sure that in my buildings, the first
and the third of the month, I mean the rate of break-

1 ins into apartments, the prostitution that's
2 happening in the hallways, things you know, serious
3 things are happening in those facilities and you know
4 and I think that it merits a conversation about
5 really rethinking the way that we oversee these
6 vulnerable buildings or not have them, right? But we
7 can't just continue to leave them there because
8 seniors come with very unique needs.

10 I had a senior Gable White; she was 104 years old
11 and she would call me every few months so that we can
12 go to her house and change her lightbulb because she
13 couldn't change her lightbulb and the maintenance you
14 know unit would say that that wasn't their job. You
15 know we have seniors that have severe arthritis that
16 can't open windows and they need somebody to help you
17 know with that as well. But security definitely is
18 always at the top of everybody's list.

19 EVA TRIMBLE: I appreciate your raising those
20 issues. We - I do want to say too that we you know,
21 I do think one of the great benefits of the PACT
22 program is that they do have the funding to provide
23 more substantial security than we're able to provide
24 through our funding and that is definitely a benefit
25 of going through that conversion and that program.

1
2 And NYCHA you know would love to provide more
3 security if we had more funding to do it. I also
4 want to add you know earlier when we were talking
5 about the Monitors Report and not having the funding
6 to staff it. That's NYCHA's internal funding. None
7 of that is provided through the city's OMB. It's not
8 a headcount or city issue, like you hear from other
9 agencies, it's just within NYCHA's federal budget but
10 what we do get and from the city and is a really
11 important resource from us is CDBG funding in order
12 to support the Elderly Safe at Home program that we
13 have right now across 20 sites in our portfolio. We
14 have sites in every borough except Staten Island.
15 And every senior in those developments is
16 automatically part of the Elderly Safe at Home
17 program and involves check-ins with the staff that go
18 out to the development, check on the seniors, make
19 sure they're connected to services and whatever they
20 need. So, that is a really important program that
21 we're very thankful to get city support for.

22 DEPUTY SPEAKER AYALA: Is it possible that you
23 could share some information about that with the
24 Council?

25 EVA TRIMBLE: Absolutely.

1
2 DEPUTY SPEAKER AYALA: Because I think it would
3 be helpful for our constituent services staff to
4 understand that that program does exist. And I think
5 lastly, uhm, my last question is regarding the CCTV
6 cameras. So, I had an incident a couple of years ago
7 at Carver Houses where a young man was shot and
8 killed and ironically enough, the police – we had
9 installed, you know we funded the installation of
10 CCTV cameras at the development and that camera that
11 could have captured what happened was not operational
12 that day and on top of that, the lighting within the
13 proximity of where that camera was situated was also
14 out. So, DH's cameras caught some shadows but they
15 couldn't necessarily – they couldn't see because it
16 was dark.

17 And so, my question is who is responsible for the
18 daily check-in to ensure that all of the cameras,
19 like does this happen daily? Does it happen weekly?
20 Does it happen monthly? So, who is responsible for
21 making sure that the lights and the cameras are
22 working? That there's no obstruction that's
23 preventing you know access to footage? And what is
24 the process for getting those repaired?

3 LAUREN GRAY: So, it's a combination of both
4 Property Management and the Office of Safety and
5 Security. When Property Management does its walk
6 through from roof down to the basement, they're
7 supposed to be looking to see if there's any impacts
8 to the camera, where they've been vandalized or
9 they've been moved. And they should be reported
10 immediately to the Office of Safety and Security so
11 we can go out and repair it.

12 Additionally, the Office of Safety and Security
13 does spot checks on the 18,000 cameras that we have
14 throughout the week to make sure that they're
15 functioning and operational.

16 And as far as the lighting, that's also Property
17 Management as they walk the ground throughout the
18 day. They are supposed to make sure that the
19 lighting is working correctly.

20 DEPUTY SPEAKER AYALA: So, you use the word
21 should, is there some sort of requisite that mandates
22 that every day as part of their you know, I'm coming
23 in, this is my checklist. I have to make sure that
24 all the lights are up. I have to make sure that all
25 the cameras are operational.

1
2 LAUREN GRAY: I will change my vocabulary from
3 should to shall.

4 DEPUTY SPEAKER AYALA: Okay, alright and so now
5 the property manager notices that there's a
6 maintenance issue with one of the cameras, how long
7 does it take before from the time that it is reported
8 to the time that the repair?

9 LAUREN GRAHY: If it's something that we can do
10 in house, it usually takes less than 72 hours to fix.
11 If it's more complicated, we might have to go out to
12 vendor to get it repaired.

13 DEPUTY SPEAKER AYALA: And that could take as
14 long as?

15 LAUREN GRAY: It varies. We try to get it done
16 hopefully with under two weeks. Under two weeks.

17 DEPUTY SPEAKER AYALA: Okay, alright, thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Yeah and I'd just like to
19 follow up to make sure I'm understanding. So
20 property management staff is walking, doing visual
21 checks. Let's say visual checks is - the camera
22 looks like it's working. Uhm, and then I guess
23 within the office, they're doing the spot checks once
24 a week. What are they spot checking? Like -
25

3 LAUREN GRAY: They're doing checks daily at
4 various developments. They're checking to see if you
5 know they turn on the angles if anything is blocking
6 or obstructing the view of the camera. Making sure
7 that they work properly.

8 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: So, they can tell visually
9 just look at the camera that it's actually
10 functional.

11 LAUREN GRAY: Correct.

12 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Okay. Uhm, I'd like to just
13 quickly follow-up before I call on you Council Member
14 regarding the senior program that you talked about.
15 Elderly Safe at Home Program, yes, if you could I
16 know you mentioned I think one in every borough but
17 could you tell us what the program is specifically?
18 What developments have this program and if there are
19 any plans to expand the program to all NYCHA
20 developments?

21 EVA TRIMBLE: Sure, so there's 20 developments
22 across every borough but Staten Island and we'll send
23 you the list of the 20. The Elderly Safe at Home
24 Program is funded by the city through CDBG funds, so
25 we're not able to propose an expansion of it on our
own but it's a program that we take advantage of and

3 we're very happy to have that support. It involves
4 having a social service worker providing daily check-
5 ins on residents at those sites. Giving them support
6 of whatever they need, whether it's living support,
7 crime prevention, crime intervention, other types of
8 education and workshops. The assigned social workers
9 who will meet with residents. They go door to door
10 doing wellness checks and so it's an important just
11 kind of quality of life, not just safety and security
12 but quality of life for our seniors program.

13 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: And what's the - how much
14 CBDG funding?

15 EVA TRIMBLE: I don't have the dollar amount in
16 front of me unfortunately but we'll definitely follow
17 up with you on that.

18 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: And can you tell us what
19 developments the program is currently in?

20 EVA TRIMBLE: It's in 20, I would just rather
21 send you the list.

22 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Yeah send us the list
23 please. Uhm, okay and with that, I'd like to turn it
24 over to Council Member Brewer.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you. Uhm, I hate
those fab keys, so Wise Towers has them. The seniors

1 hate them. 139 has them, the seniors hate them.
2
3 This is all about seniors and security, so are they
4 in regular NYCHA or are they just in the PACT
5 program? And what are you doing about it? I have
6 written letters, so I assume you know that and I talk
7 about it endlessly because people won't even go out
8 at night. They're scared to go out at night because
9 their key won't work for their apartment. Now,
10 that's not - that's fixable.

11 EVA TRIMBLE: It is fixable and thank you for
12 bringing it up because we -

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I bring it up all the
14 time.

15 EVA TRIMBLE: I know you do. We believe we've
16 resolved all the key fob issues that were happening
17 at Wise Towers for a large majority of it was a
18 battery replacement issue that needed to happen, but
19 key fobs is a technology that we use across the city
20 in many of our portfolios. It's not just for those
21 developments that you mentioned or just for senior
22 developments. It is a technology that we're using
23 across our program.

24

25

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Do you do any surveys to
4 see if the seniors like them or not? Because if the
5 battery is out at midnight, there's nobody to call.

6 EVA TRIMBLE: We have not done surveys but you
7 can call the CCC and we would have someone come out
8 there and help you into the development at any time.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: At midnight?

10 EVA TRIMBLE: At midnight.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Has that happened?

12 EVA TRIMBLE: I don't know off the top of my head
13 but you can call the CCC and we would send an
14 emergency services staff out there.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I would like to see that.
16 I will check but I don't believe it's as perfect as
17 you think. Number two, how much does a camera cost?
18 The Hostos many years ago was \$75,000 for one camera.
19 I thought that was excessive.

20 SHAAN MAVANI: Thank you Council Member Brewer.
21 So, uhm I don't have the off hand just a single
22 camera replacement cost with me. We can follow up.
23 When we're doing CCTV installations for the first
24 time, obviously it will be the cameras plus you know

25 -

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: It's a system.

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

86

3 SHAAN MAVANI: Yes, fiber optic. The monitors
4 and all of that. So, it can be more expensive.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Can you give us a
6 breakdown so that we have some sense of it?

7 SHAAN MAVANI: Yes, we'll provide you our
8 standard cost estimate for camera projects and you'll
9 be able to see the different components there.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, the other question
11 I have is and maybe I was doing a Zoom next door.
12 So, the issue is, how information about what's
13 repairable, not repairable is done in real time? In
14 other words, if the door is out, this is out, that's
15 out. You probably know it I assume. I just want to
16 know how do you know it? And then is there some way
17 that the public, meaning the residents, could also
18 know that? Without compromising security, which I
19 know is of concern. We just want to know; how do you
20 know when the door is out? The CCTV, the layered,
21 etc., and is there some way that the residents could
22 know that in a real time function?

23 EVA TRIMBLE: So, we know it on a property
24 management by property management basis.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: And that's done on a
technology basis or is that on paper?

1
2 EVA TRIMBLE: No, it should be through a
3 technology basis in that when a caretaker or other
4 worker reports a damaged door, we would create a
5 maximum work order for that door repair, whether it's
6 done by a maintenance worker or a vendor, we would
7 have note of that repair. And that's why I was able
8 to say today that I know we have just over 9,500 door
9 work orders right now in our system that are open.

10 So, we do track that information. As far as CCTV
11 cameras and lights, it would be the same. We would
12 be able to track that work order, those work orders.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, is there any way
14 that the public can know this or the residents in
15 terms of their - because they call all day long, as
16 you can imagine. The door is out, the door is out,
17 the door is out and we certainly management and
18 contact you. We write you a lot of letters as you
19 know but there is no real time.

20 EVA TRIMBLE: What we would do is we would post
21 flyers in the lobby and in the buildings if there is
22 a certain situation. We've had an intercom situation
23 where we've posted flyers explaining the timing of
24 the repair for an intercom which can sometimes take a
25 long time to get repaired. And so, we do try to post

3 information in the lobbies for those residents so
4 that they're informed.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, but there's no real
6 - I keep trying to ask, there's no real time on a
7 computer to know for the residents who are computer
8 literate, to know that their door is out. It will be
9 fixed in ten days or whatever?

10 EVA TRIMBLE: No, partially again because of the
11 security issue. I don't want anyone to be able to
12 look up and see that this store will be remaining to
13 be unlocked for another ten days.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: But even the tenant
15 leaders don't know?

16 EVA TRIMBLE: We try to keep our tenant leaders
17 informed but we're happy to answer any specific
18 questions if someone comes to us with you know asking
19 for a status update on a situation, we will provide
20 them that information.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, final question is
22 the monitor. You have a new monitor. I understand
23 Mr. Schwartz is moving on. So, my question is the
24 monitor will continue to just do the mold and lead
25 and not have anything to do with these topics. Is
that correct?

1
2 EVA TRIMBLE: I can't speak to the new scope of
3 the new monitor.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Thank you. I'd like to
6 recognize Council Member Barron online and Council
7 Member Sanchez and I'd like to ask a follow up
8 question before I turn it over to Council Member
9 Sanchez. Does NYCHA conduct audits or reinspection's
10 of the CCTV cameras or layered access doors to ensure
11 they are properly functioning? And how often does
12 that get done?

13 EVA TRIMBLE: I wouldn't say we conduct audits of
14 those because we are checking for deficiencies every
15 single day when the caretakers are going through the
16 buildings and as we've said, we've do sampling of the
17 camera footage to see what's working and what's not
18 working.

19 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: And is anyone monitoring
20 that unit to make sure that those things are working
21 and not working? So, this is what I'm getting at.
22 This, maybe it sounds a little obtuse but uhm, it
23 sounds like we're checking in the cameras but until
24 there is an issue that happens, right and then it's
25 clear that cameras have been out or the lighting was

1 out and not capturing any of the images that are
2 needed for – then we realize that there was a
3 problem. I’m assuming throughout this whole time,
4 there were spot checks, there were daily checks,
5 there were whatever weekend checks. Clearly, there’s
6 still a breakdown in the process. So, is there any
7 additional checking in or auditing to make sure that
8 the cameras that are identified that are offline are
9 not functioning properly are brought properly online?
10 What’s the next layer of oversight that happens to
11 make sure that these things don’t happen and are
12 captured?
13

14 EVA TRIMBLE: So, I just want to clarify that I
15 don’t believe a broken camera is necessarily a
16 reflection of a broken process. As I said, we could
17 check everything in the morning and they could be
18 broken again in the afternoon and then, you know we
19 would identify it again and the next time we check.

20 So, there is a constant review of all of these
21 pieces of infrastructure as you call them that create
22 the safety and security for the residents but we also
23 have a quality assurance department that’s out at our
24 sites all the time. They would you know be following
25 up if they see a deficiency as well.

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

91

3 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Got it. Council Member
4 Sanchez.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you so much Chairs
6 and good afternoon. Good to see you.

7 EVA TRIMBLE: Good afternoon.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Uhm, so I have a general
9 question and then a question that came from one of my
10 tenant resident association leaders. So, the general
11 question is you know in comparison to HPD, HPD
12 inspectors go into a building. They are mandated to
13 look for certain conditions in the lobby and units.
14 Are there any uhm, is there any comparable lists that
15 NYCHA maintenance workers need to consider when they
16 enter an apartment?

17 EVA TRIMBLE: So when maintenance workers enter
18 an apartment to respond to a work order. They also
19 have to do what we call a five alive check and that's
20 not just actually maintenance workers. That's any
21 worker that comes into an apartment. They do a five-
22 alive check. That five alive is GFCI outlets, smoke
23 detector, carbon monoxide detector, fire signage, and
24 window guards. And so, that's a standard check that
25 we do every time that we enter an apartment.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Got it. Thank you and
3 so can you share how they record that information and
4 does NYCHA audit these records?

5 EVA TRIMBLE: Sure, so all of that information is
6 recorded in our work order and I also want to add
7 that in addition to the daily work of our team, we
8 also have annual inspections that NYCHA performs on
9 apartments as well as inspections through HUD that
10 are performed, formally known as SPAs and now the
11 INSPIRE program that are performed that do quality
12 checks within our units and our grounds.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you so much and
14 then in particular, does NYCHA inspect fire
15 suppression systems on a regular basis?

16 EVA TRIMBLE: Yeah, do you want to talk about
17 fire?

18 LAUREN GRAY: Sure. Uhm we have a new fire
19 safety department that was just recently formed at
20 NYCHA. It was originally a unit. We just brought on
21 someone who has over 30 years of experience in fire
22 safety and is looking to transform how we do business
23 in fire safety. We currently have an independent
24 vendor that goes out and does inspections of our fire
25 safety suppression system and if any repairs are

1
2 necessary, we use another vendor to actually make the
3 repairs, so it's separate and apart from one another.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you and then last
5 and then if the Chair would permit me my complex
6 question but the last general question is concerning
7 electric micro mobility vehicle and devices. We
8 understand that there were new rules that went into
9 effect. When does NYCHA implement those proposed
10 changes and what is it looking like?

11 EVA TRIMBLE: So, right now, we have a proposed
12 rule that's out for comment. It is not in effect
13 yet. They went out on November 1st, and the comment
14 period closes December 31st. All of the information
15 on that micro mobility policy is on our website. I
16 encourage you to share that with your constituents
17 and our residents. We're looking for all of our
18 comments to be submitted by December 31st on that
19 policy.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you and that's for
21 mopeds, e-bikes, all that right?

22 EVA TRIMBLE: Absolutely.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: And then my – if the
24 Chairs would allow me. Thank you. My complex
25 specific question is regarding NYCHA's practices

1
2 around tenants that feel unsafe because other tenants
3 are not following rules. So, at Sedgewick houses in
4 particular, I have residents who you know say that
5 their lobbies have been taken over. That there's
6 activity that makes them feel unsafe. That they've
7 been you know yelled at by folks that live in the
8 building, don't live in the building, are guests.
9 So, the question is about you know how does, does
10 NYCHA use the security camera footage to learn about
11 these kinds of situations and how is NYCHA enforcing
12 the safety rules, the quality-of-life rules that you
13 have in the leases?

14 EVA TRIMBLE: Yes, that is a very complex
15 question. It is a very complex issue that really
16 requires us to both respect resident rights and
17 determine how best to enforce the lease and the
18 quality of life for the residents. So, we do, if
19 there are people hanging out in the lobby that
20 shouldn't be hanging out in the lobby, we are able to
21 bring in NYPD and we work with our partners there to
22 comment if we think it's an unsafe condition that's
23 happening. If we have cameras in that lobby, we will
24 certainly use it to see if there's any illegal
25 activity going on other than just loitering, which is

1
2 unpleasant but not necessarily something that is
3 enforceable from a lease perspective but if there's -
4 we work closely with residents as much as possible to
5 enforce our lease on residents that are causing
6 problems I buildings. It's not a fast process, as
7 you can imagine but we have to go through us you know
8 a step-by-step process to work with the residents,
9 call them in, go through the termination process. We
10 have been working closely actually with Council
11 Member Restler on an issue in Gowanus where we were
12 luckily recently able to achieve the eviction of
13 squatters in a development, the development that was
14 causing problems for the rest of the residents but it
15 does take a long time for us to achieve that.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. Thank you so
17 much and I look forward to working on the Sedgewick
18 Houses with the office.

19 EVA TRIMBLE: Absolutely.

20 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Does NYCHA conduct proactive
21 inspections to see if self-closing doors or trash
22 shoots are operating?

23 EVA TRIMBLE: Yes, the trash shoots are part of
24 our daily walkdowns that the caretakers are supposed
25 to be checking that all the trap shoots are closing

3 properly and we also have a waste management
4 department that does checks on trash shoots as well
5 and will help do repairs to trash shoots if it's
6 something that goes above and beyond a maintenance
7 worker.

8 LAUREN GRAY: Sorry, self-closing doors.

9 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Self closing doors, yeah.

10 LAUREN GRAY: That is also something that is just
11 part of the caretakers in lockdown, yeah.

12 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: The daily checks. And we
13 have them, right? We have self closing doors?

14 EVA TRIMBLE: Yes, all the doors and the stair
15 halls must be self closing. I can just say
16 personally, if you've ever done a lock down with me,
17 I check every single door, every single hopper every
18 time I'm in a building.

19 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Uhm, in terms of emergency
20 evacuations and emergency plans, do the residents
21 receive an emergency plan? Are they ever convened to
22 say in the event of a fire or emergency, this is what
23 you need to do.

24 EVA TRIMBLE: So for emergency evacuation plans,
25 we defer to NYCEM and whatever emergency evacuation
plans are in place for that area. For fire?

1
2 LAUREN GRAY: For fire, we have the stickers on
3 the door, which tell you the proper location and
4 every year we're mandated to send out through an
5 annual notice, fire safety information about the
6 property.

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: And does FDNY ever do
8 resident engagement around that because I'm almost
9 sure nobody has never read that fire safety sticker
10 on those.

11 LAUREN GRAY: So, I'm glad you brought that up.
12 We just had really two great events with FDNY. We're
13 really trying to form a phenomenal partnership with
14 them. We recently just had a fire safety symposium
15 where we invited over 100 TA Presidents to come to
16 the Fire Safety Museum during fire safety month in
17 October to talk about fire safety at NYCHA
18 developments and what they could do to prevent. We
19 provided like a whole Q&A panel with people from both
20 FDNY and NYCHA along with documents that they can
21 bring back to the development. And the last thing
22 that we recently did at the end of October, we
23 brought an actual fire truck to Farragut Houses and
24 simulated an actual smoke condition to teach children
25 how to get out of fires from their apartments. And

1
2 we invited both parents and kids to participate in
3 it. And we intend to continue this partnership at
4 our family dates in the upcoming season in 2024.

5 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: That's great. I guess you
6 know given the number of natural instances,
7 particularly Hurricane Sandy, the fires that we had,
8 it becomes very evident that if you have no practice
9 of the muscle of emergency evacuation, nor do you
10 have a plan identifying your most vulnerable
11 residents whose homebound, it can be a really chaotic
12 and awful situation. I know the residents will know
13 everybody in the building but certainly engaging and
14 a periodic person to person review around what will
15 we do if there is an emergency situation and who can
16 be a captain of a building to make sure that our
17 seniors are being evacuated properly. Where is there
18 oxygen right that could potentially be another
19 significant fire hazard and stuff in the building.

20 LAUREN GRAY: And we agree with you Council
21 Member, in fact as we expand our Fire Safety
22 Department, we plan on getting trainers to the
23 program to go out to the developments to like work
24 with our TA presidents and their board to try to
25 identify building captains and explain to them their

1
2 role and responsibility in the case of a fire as
3 well. So, again, we want more activity and
4 involvement with the residents at large once we build
5 up the program.

6 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: That's great. I'm pleased
7 to hear.

8 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: I have a few questions as a
9 follow up from some of my colleagues, so bear with me
10 because I've gotten notes scribbled everywhere here
11 but, uhm, regarding the testimony from Julie Sharpton
12 who is at Whitman Houses, which is in my district,
13 I'm just curious to know, you know she listed a lot
14 of issues and concerns pertaining to the safety and
15 security in her building. How do you collect
16 feedback from residents?

17 EVA TRIMBLE: So, we're in constant contact with
18 our residents, particularly our resident leaders
19 through our resident services participation in the
20 initiatives department. So, we are getting
21 complaints, issues, anything that they want to bring
22 to us. Some of them come directly to my office and
23 to me personally and we work through all of our
24 proper channels to address it whether it's a
25 complaint, whether it's a repair need. Whether it's

1 something that we need to flag to Office of Safety
2 and Security and bring NYPD in and we've had cases
3 with you know resident leaders bringing like we heard
4 today and I took notes to follow up with Whitman
5 about again homeless individuals living in the
6 buildings. You know maybe this is something that
7 needs to get on the rotation for one of those
8 assessments that we're doing. So, everything is
9 feedback. Every conversation is feedback and we use
10 it you know every single day.

12 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Thank you and that's a
13 perfect segway to one of my next questions. We've
14 actually, I've worked with Mr. Secreto at Whitman
15 Houses specifically with that same program and I
16 guess my question is, you know I think it's a good
17 program, although personally I don't think the NYPD
18 should be dealing with the issue of homelessness but
19 that's a separate issue for a separate hearing I
20 supposed. But I think it's a good program and DHS
21 being involved, uhm you know and being able to
22 provide specific resources to people in need, but it
23 seems like the way the program is structured and with
24 only having one or two teams available for the whole
25 city. Number one, that there aren't enough resources

1
2 you know allocated to the program and then number
3 two, uhm, that the program is really addressed as if
4 it's an acute program, an acute problem but it's
5 really a chronic problem that we see all across the
6 city and I think we've heard from you know my
7 colleagues who have all experienced similar issues in
8 their districts as well.

9 Uhm, so and I know you mentioned more houses
10 earlier but is there any plan to expand that program
11 or any consideration to expand the partnership that
12 you have with DHS and the way that MOU currently
13 works?

14 EVA TRIMBLE: It has been a really productive
15 partnership and collaboration with DHS and NYPD and
16 we agree that having that DHS component there is
17 critical because it is a resource to talk to the
18 individuals that we're finding, understand the
19 resources that they need, whether or not they're
20 willing to come into shelter or accept services and
21 that's something that no one else but DHS can really
22 have that conversation with. And it also provides us
23 a feeling of safety and security for our employees as
24 well as our residents and our employees are often
25 very hesitant to approach an individual that they see

1
2 because they fear for their safety. We have had
3 caretakers that have been attacked by these
4 individuals if they were seen removing their
5 belongings or so forth.

6 So, it is a really important partnership for us
7 and we welcome any future conversations about
8 expanding the program.

9 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay, great. You also
10 mentioned earlier that NYCHA doesn't maintain all of
11 the camera systems particularly at PACT RAD sites.
12 Who does maintain the camera systems at those sites?

13 EVA TRIMBLE: The developer, the PACT RAD
14 developer, who is the property manager.

15 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay, thank you. Uhm, going
16 back to the contractors for doors. How do you
17 measure the quality of work and yeah, how do you
18 measure the quality of their work? I know you
19 mentioned there's accountability measures and that
20 you brought in one of the contractors but do you have
21 like a formal system or KPIs that you use to
22 determine whether a contractor is you know meeting
23 the needs of the residents?

24 EVA TRIMBLE: We have a contract review process
25 but I think it, I will admit it, it's probably not

1
2 specific to the individual repair. I think the best
3 way is if the repair holds and isn't broken again by
4 unless it's broken again by vandalism or something
5 beyond our control, which does happen quite a lot.
6 So, if the repair holds, that's our measure of
7 success.

8 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay and then when you
9 remove a vendor or consider removing a vendor, how is
10 that decision made? Is it based on an objective
11 basis or subjective basis?

12 EVA TRIMBLE: So, we haven't removed any vendors
13 yet and we hold them accountable through
14 conversations and follow ups and ensuring that
15 they're doing the work that their scheduled to do.
16 However, we know that you know we work through the
17 city system, so if we have an issue with a vendor, we
18 can put that into passport, so that any other city
19 agency can see that.

20 We haven't had to do that on any of these door
21 vendors and we've been working with them to make sure
22 they're doing what they're supposed to do.

23 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay thank you. You also
24 mentioned I believe it was in response to Council
25 Member Ossè's question that residents shouldn't call

1
2 311. Why is 311 not an option to report issues and
3 have you ever considered integrating your system into
4 311?

5 EVA TRIMBLE: Because our system at the Customer
6 Contact Center routes directly to NYCHA staff that
7 can respond. It would be an extra step to have
8 someone call 311, only then to have it routed to
9 NYCHA to respond. We are the landlord and so, just
10 if you you know, if you have a problem in your
11 apartment, you don't call 311, you call your landlord
12 and it's only when your landlord doesn't respond that
13 you call 311. But for us, the best way to get us to
14 respond is to have that information go through the
15 CCC. We can directly route our staff to that issue
16 and we use that information as data. Like I said,
17 everything is feedback. This is particularly
18 important as we're heading into heat season right
19 now, to be able to see every single apartment that's
20 complaining about heat, to be able to identify. Does
21 it mean a line is out? A whole building is out? Is
22 it just this one apartment that may be cold? So,
23 it's really important that all that information comes
24 through our CCC so we can use the data to best target
25 our response.

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

105

3 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Thank you and then uhm
4 sorry, back to doors. I mentioned I have notes
5 scribbled everywhere, so just bear with me. Uhm, how
6 many intercom systems require a mobile device?

7 SHAAN MAVANI: Just to clarify by mobile device
8 do you mean a key fob or do you mean a phone?

9 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Like a phone to let somebody
10 into the building or something like that.

11 SHAAN MAVANI: We have – we'll have to comes back
12 to you with an exact answer on that but we have
13 different types of intercom systems that have that
14 option of being on the phone and providing that
15 flexibility to residents to be able to buzz somebody
16 in. The majority of them have that functionality.

17 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: If you can in your follow
18 up, also include is there any opportunity for older
19 adults to be provided with a mobile device, if they
20 don't have one? I've heard from constituents who are
21 unable to use the intercom system or to let guests in
22 because they don't have a mobile device and so, I'm
23 just wondering if NYCHA has a program that would make
24 mobile devices or some things that they can actually
25 use the system that's in their building available to
them.

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

106

3 EVA TRIMBLE: I'll also double check. I believe
4 they can still be routed to a landline but we will
5 double check that information and back to you.

6 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay, thank you. Uhm, can
7 you describe how NYCHA tracks elevator outages?

8 EVA TRIMBLE: Sure, all elevator outages are
9 tracked through our maxima workorder system. So, we
10 are able to track all of that. We also have the
11 service interruption page on our website where you
12 can see any outages both elevator, heat, gas,
13 electric.

14 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: What's the current status of
15 elevator outages across NYCHA developments?

16 EVA TRIMBLE: I don't have that off the top of my
17 head, though I could pull up our service interruption
18 page but that information changes hourly.

19 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay and then when you
20 provide the follow up, can you please include
21 disaggregated data by borough and Council District
22 and also seniors only NYCHA developments?

23 EVA TRIMBLE: We will follow up with you on your
24 specific elevator request to make sure we have the
25 right data included.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay thanks. I don't know
3 if you'll have this but do you know which
4 developments suffer from chronic elevator outages?

5 EVA TRIMBLE: No, I don't have that information
6 off the top of my head.

7 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay and how are NYCHA
8 residents made aware of elevator outages?

9 EVA TRIMBLE: So, when there is an elevator
10 outage condition we start with doing a robocall to
11 all residents to inform them of the outage and then
12 we will also flyer the building and we will make note
13 if there are stair climber services available to
14 assist residents in getting back to their apartment.

15 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: How quickly does that happen
16 once you've been notified of the outage or that
17 you're aware of the outage?

18 EVA TRIMBLE: Once the elevator mechanics have
19 identified this is an outage and they open the
20 workorder, the robocalls automatically trigger it
21 from there and then staff will go out and flyer the
22 buildings.

23 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: And who provides the stair
24 climber services?

25 EVA TRIMBLE: It's provided by NYCHA staff.

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

108

3 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: NYCHA staff is responsible
4 for potentially caring residents who might be
5 wheelchair bound up the stairs or several flights of
6 stairs?

7 EVA TRIMBLE: Yes, it's something that we offer.
8 NYCHA staff actually volunteer for stair climber
9 service. It's not part of their job description but
10 it's something that we understand is an important
11 service so we encourage volunteers and we train the
12 volunteers to use the stair climbers in order to
13 provide the service to our residents.

14 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay, uhm, what's the status
15 of the Senior Resident Advisor program?

16 EVA TRIMBLE: Senior Resident Advisor program, I
17 may have to get back to you on that one.

18 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay, when you do, I have a
19 couple more follow up questions for that. So, when
20 you do, can you also let us know if SRA staff are
21 solely and seniors only NYCHA developments and then
22 how many live on site? And how does an older NYCHA
23 resident contact an SRA staffer?

24 Do you know the status of the Senior Companion
25 program?

EVA TRIMBLE: Sorry, say that again.

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

109

3 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Do you know the status of
4 the Senior Companion program?

5 EVA TRIMBLE: No, again I don't believe that
6 that's a NYCHA program. I don't know if that's
7 something our partners at Department of Aging want to
8 respond to.

9 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay, we can bring up the
10 Associate Commissioner and I'll have Council swear
11 you in.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Good afternoon Associate
13 Commissioner. Please raise your right hand. Do you
14 affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and
15 nothing but the truth, before this Committee and to
16 respond honestly to Council Member questions?

17 JOCELYN GRODEN: Yes, I do.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: You can proceed.

19 JOCELYN GRODEN: The Senior Companion program is
20 not a program of New York City Aging. Can you
21 clarify?

22 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Well, I'm trying to find out
23 from you all, so I suppose we'll find the appropriate
24 agency but I was just asking the status of the Senior
25 Companion program and how many older NYCHA residents
receive visits and how often?

1
2 JOCELYN GRODEN: I see, so I'm going to interpret
3 the question to mean perhaps that you're talking
4 about our friendly visiting program, which is
5 attached to our case management and para's and older
6 adults would somebody with like interest to provide
7 companionship and intellectual engagement.

8 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: I do - sorry to interrupt.
9 I do think it's different. This one is the Senior
10 Resident Companion program funded by the Corporation
11 for National Service, assigns companions through the
12 Henry Street Settlement to conduct friendly home
13 visits to frail and socially isolated residents in
14 Manhattan, Queens and Staten Island. It's a program
15 under NYCHA specially.

16 JOCELYN GRODEN: Okay, thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: But you all can get back to
18 us on that. Uhm, and I'm sorry, did you want to
19 finish? Okay. Uhm, who oversees - well, actually
20 since you're here, let me just jump to you for a
21 moment. Can you describe the ways in which NYC Aging
22 works with NYCHA to best serve older NYCHA residents,
23 including with regards to language access?

24 JOCELYN GRODEN: Sure, we work very closely with
25 NYCHA as we have for a long time in many facets of

1
2 our various programs. Notably, more recently, NYCHA
3 is a member of the cabinet for older New Yorkers and
4 we work closely with them on different programs and
5 services. For example, through the cabinet and the
6 cabinet member agencies, which include NYPD, NYCHA
7 and New York City Aging, we're collaborating on
8 connecting NYPD older adult liaison's with NYCHA's
9 Safe at Home program, which I know you talked about
10 earlier, around their caseworker personnel and
11 communities in order to best enhance, better enhance
12 public safety for older adults who live in NYCHA
13 residents.

14 This includes crime prevention and social service
15 assistance to older adults and residents with
16 disabilities across the 20 NYCHA developments that
17 you've been speaking about. This is a robust program
18 to further develop our crime prevention and social
19 service to these communities. Additionally, NYPD has
20 designated older adult liaison's for each of the 77
21 NYPD precincts and 9 police service areas. The older
22 adult liaison's are a contact person for helping to
23 support NYCHA residents.

24 In terms of language access -
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Sorry, just really quickly,
3 how many developments did you say the older adult
4 liaison's were in?

5 JOCELYN GRODEN: They are currently in 77 NYPD
6 precincts and 9 police service areas, which include
7 the NYCHA service areas.

8 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay, thank you.

9 JOCELYN GRODEN: And you had asked about language
10 access. Certainly, on our side, whether it's our
11 community-based providers or direct services, we
12 prioritize hiring bilingual, bicultural staff, that
13 speak and reflect the needs of the population we
14 serve. Of course, there are so many spoken languages
15 in New York City. Wherever there is a gap, we access
16 the language line.

17 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: And is there active data
18 sharing between the two agencies?

19 EVA TRIMBLE: For what data?

20 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: All data regarding older
21 adults.

22 EVA TRIMBLE: We have privacy issues, so we are
23 federally mandated to protect residents privacy, so
24 unless there's a specific need to share any resident
25 data, we do not share it.

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

113

3 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Thank you.

4 JOCELYN GRODEN: On a case specific issue, we
5 would work around that but nothing disaggregated
6 data.

7 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay. In 2011, NYC Aging
8 together with NYCHA, the Department of Health and
9 Mental Hygiene and the CUNY School of Public Health
10 at Hunter College published health of older adults in
11 New York City public housing, which contain findings
12 from the NYCHA Senior Survey. Do you know the
13 current status of the NYCHA Senior Survey?

14 EVA TRIMBLE: We are not currently conducting any
15 survey of our seniors.

16 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: So, this is not like a
17 regular - uhm, sorry, can the Sergeant at Arms just
18 give them a few copies of these for me? Oh, it's
19 just the one copy, okay. It's just one copy but you
20 can have it, share it.

21 EVA TRIMBLE: And I will just follow up from
22 earlier, I learned that the Resident Senior Advisors
23 you were asking about have been folded into the
24 Elderly Safe at Home program. So, I think some of
25 the programs you're mentioning which maybe date back

1
2 a few years have evolved into the newer program
3 forms. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay. Okay, I think many of
5 these programs are listed on the website, so it would
6 just be good to know what's active versus inactive.

7 EVA TRIMBLE: Sure, we'll take a look at that.

8 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Do you know how many New
9 Yorkers age 62 and older live in NYCHA developments?

10 EVA TRIMBLE: Yes. I think you even quoted in
11 your testimony. We have about 25 percent of NYCHA's
12 population are seniors age 62 and over. We have it
13 as of 11/1 over 77,000. 77,047.

14 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: 047, thanks. We always like
15 to have you say it on the record so I appreciate
16 that. Do you know how many or what percentage of
17 these older NYCHA residents live in seniors only
18 developments?

19 EVA TRIMBLE: Yes, in the - we have 8,130 senior
20 only units. Of which, there are 7,259 households in
21 senior only buildings. But I'd like to go back and
22 double check those numbers because I just read them.

23 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Yeah, more units than
24 households.

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

115

3 EVA TRIMBLE: Yeah. I mean there should be some
4 vacancies but I want to go back and double check.

5 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay, that would be great.
6 Can you describe the amenities that seniors only
7 NYCHA developments provide to older adult residents?

8 EVA TRIMBLE: Uhm, there are no amenities that
9 come with a senior only building other than the
10 Elderly Safe at Home, which is not in every
11 development but in 20 developments and as I
12 mentioned, we are – we have security. One eight-hour
13 security shift at our senior buildings.

14 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: So, is it in every single
15 building has one eight-hour shift?

16 EVA TRIMBLE: Yes.

17 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Okay.

18 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Uhm, it's kind of wild that
19 there are no amenities for older adults living in
20 seniors only buildings or developments. Like, they
21 don't get anything special.

22 EVA TRIMBLE: That's unfortunately just not
23 within the NYCHA budget to provide that.

24 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay. Uhm, does NYCHA track
25 population data in terms of I mean specific to my
committee. I'm wondering, you know we're going to

1
2 have a huge increase in the older adult population
3 over the next like 15, 20 years and I'm wondering how
4 closely you track that type of data to determine the
5 needs that NYCHA might have for – well, that New
6 Yorkers will have and how NYCHA might be able to meet
7 those needs?

8 EVA TRIMBLE: We have all of our demographic data
9 from our residents as part of our annual
10 recertification process. However, we're not focused
11 in a social services way as far as analyzing that
12 data for social service needs. We are focused in our
13 role as a landlord.

14 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Yeah, I'm not talking about
15 social services. I'm speaking about the general
16 population. We're going to have like a 40 percent
17 increase in older adults in New York City
18 specifically in the next 15 years. And so, I'm
19 wondering if you are looking at your – as a landlord,
20 if you're looking at your portfolio of senior only
21 buildings and you know developments that would and
22 you're taking into consideration the increase in the
23 older adult population and therefore, a presumed
24 increased demand for senior only housing. Are you
25

1
2 you know following any of those trends in the
3 population? I guess is my question.

4 EVA TRIMBLE: We're not doing any current
5 population trending analysis.

6 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay, thank you. Uhm, can
7 you describe the process including the typical
8 timeline by which an older New York may secure an
9 apartment in a seniors only NYCHA development?

10 EVA TRIMBLE: Our senior only development, just
11 like any development at NYCHA is subject to our
12 waitlist and waitlist requirements from HUD including
13 our transfer requirements. As you're probably aware,
14 we have a tremendous waitlist for apartments, so I
15 can't give you the timeframe right now of what the
16 waitlist or timeframe is for our senior buildings.

17 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Do you have a sense of how
18 this process compares between a current NYCHA
19 resident and non-NYCHA residents?

20 EVA TRIMBLE: No, I do not have a for a transfer
21 verse an incoming applicant. I don't have that
22 information today but we can send that to you.

23 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: How does the waitlist
24 compare for seniors only versus non-seniors.

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

118

3 EVA TRIMBLE: I'm sorry, I was not prepared with
4 any waitlist data but we can get back to you.

5 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay. Uhm, what would
6 qualify an older New Yorker to be fast tracked for an
7 apartment in a seniors only NYCHA development?

8 EVA TRIMBLE: Can you define fast tracked?

9 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Uhm, for example, with
10 domestic violence you know folks experiencing
11 domestic violence issues at home. There is a
12 separate you know waitlist or their usually fast
13 tracked to get housing. So, is there any
14 qualifications?

15 EVA TRIMBLE: So, we have transfer preference
16 categories. I would caution against using any term
17 like fast tracked. As our transfer priorities are
18 heavily regulated and our transfer process is subject
19 to a court degree. So, the emergency transfer is a
20 separate priority within our transfer priorities but
21 as is well documented through this hearing and
22 others, we do have a very long waitlist and a long
23 turnover time for our units. So, they are -
24 unfortunately the domestic violence cases are a part
25 of that transfer list priority process.

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

119

3 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Understood. Uhm, how are
4 older New Yorkers made aware of the existence of
5 seniors only NYCHA developments? And I guess giving
6 the waitlist, are you doing any active outreach?

7 EVA TRIMBLE: We are not doing any active
8 outreach.

9 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: How does the older NYCHA
10 resident population compared to New York City's older
11 adult population at large? I don't know if either of
12 you may be able to answer that.

13 JOCELYN GRODEN: I'm sorry, can you repeat the
14 question?

15 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: How does the older NYCHA
16 resident population compared to New York City's older
17 adult population at large? Are they, you know are
18 older adults in NYCHA developments for example, do
19 they tend to be lower income? Do they tend to have
20 more chronic illnesses? I don't know you know. I
21 know you probably don't track -

22 JOCELYN GRODEN: Right, I don't have the specific
23 data in front of me. I can certainly get back to
24 you. You know obviously they need to meet the
25 thresholds and criteria for NYCHA eligibility, which

1
2 would really to some income and security and we could
3 get back with the NYCHA clients that are known to us.

4 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay. Do you have and this
5 is probably more so for NYCHA but do you have a
6 demographic breakdown for older New Yorkers living in
7 NYCHA developments by age, gender, race, or
8 ethnicity, disability status. Do you know how many
9 NYCHA residents live alone and how many are
10 homebound?

11 EVA TRIMBLE: We have some of that data and we're
12 happy to provide that with you on an aggregate level.

13 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay. Thank you. Uhm, can
14 you describe any challenges and concerns that older
15 New Yorkers have while living in NYCHA developments?
16 Maybe from your perspective if you're hearing from
17 anybody that lives in NYCHA developments and anything
18 that you all maybe may have been made aware of?

19 JOCELYN GRODEN: So, you know clearly we all know
20 about health disparities that are related to income
21 and certainly we've worked broadly to support NYCHA
22 residents around some of the safety and security
23 issues that have been discussed here. Of course we
24 deal with all older adult issues on a case-by-case
25 basis so we're not you know bifurcating our service

2 like around NYCHA versus not. Recognizing that the
3 large number of older adults we serve are diverse and
4 have diverse complex needs. So we would be
5 responsive based on that and I think it's important
6 to mention again our collaboration in the New York
7 City in the cabinet for older New Yorkers. And
8 opportunities that we have there to level set around
9 community needs and align to have a synchronized
10 supportive approach to addressing the needs of those
11 residents.

12 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Do you have anything to add?

13 EVA TRIMBLE: No, I think that's a helpful
14 summary.

15 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay. In what ways does NYC
16 Aging or NYCHA work to address the challenges and
17 concerns of older adults?

18 JOCELYN GRODEN: Again, you know I'm really sorry
19 to be repetitive but I'm going to come back to the
20 cabinet. As mentioned earlier, our collaboration
21 around Safe at Home, our collaborative focus on
22 safety and security both together and in concert with
23 NYPD, including the creation of the older liaison
24 role to best support and address the needs. Also,
25 we're focused on the projects that we have in flight

1
2 today but the cabinet is always iterating and there
3 are different phases. So, while today we're focused
4 on community safety and some of the things I briefly
5 mentioned earlier will continue to evolve our work
6 together based on the needs that we're seeing in the
7 community.

8 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Thank you and how are older
9 NYCHA residents advised to request repairs or make
10 complaints related to their apartment and
11 development? Anything outside of the usual -

12 EVA TRIMBLE: There is no specific instructions
13 for older adults. We do our typical outreach on our
14 repair order process and you know older adults are no
15 different in some ways and so, we you know they're
16 just part of our regular outreach efforts.

17 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Uhm, I can probably
18 anticipate your answers for this next question but
19 I'm going to ask it anyway. How will PEGs exacerbate
20 older NYCHA resident challenges or impact their
21 concerns?

22 EVA TRIMBLE: I defer to Aging. NYCHA's not part
23 of the city expense budget PEG in that way.

24 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Thank you.
25

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

123

3 JOCELYN GRODEN: While we still work out the
4 details of the budget, our priority is to maintain
5 continuity of services for older adults and under
6 this Administration, we've made historic changes and
7 investments in older adults, which I'm sure you're
8 aware of. And as we've discussed today despite the
9 very real fiscal and financial challenges, we're
10 working with our partners to continue to evolve our
11 work and commitment to public safety.

12 And I also want to say as I'm sure you are
13 familiar, we've learned for many months that New York
14 City is facing a fiscal crisis and that federal
15 COVID-19 stimulus funding is drawing up, revenue
16 growth is flowing, the cost of humanitarian and
17 asylum seeker crisis continues to skyrocket.

18 While we've made clear that without timely and
19 significant action from our federal and state
20 partners, we will be forced to make some tough
21 choices. To balance the budget as required by law,
22 every agency found savings with minimal disruptions
23 to services and no tax increases. As we have made
24 these choices, the wellbeing of older New Yorkers is
25 always our top priority.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Thank you. That was a good
3 statement. I uh you know beg to differ on the
4 specific point about minimal disruption to services
5 but that's for another hearing on another day. Who
6 oversees public safety for NYCHAs senior only
7 buildings and developments?

8 EVA TRIMBLE: Our Office of Safety and Security
9 and property management both partner to oversee
10 public safety and security in the senior buildings.

11 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay.

12 EVA TRIMBLE: And in all buildings.

13 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Thank you. Alright, I have
14 only three questions left but one is extremely long.
15 So, over the summer it was reported in Politico that
16 NYCHA threatened to evict tenants who received free
17 air conditioners through the Get Cool NYC program,
18 which provided thousands of NYCHA residents with free
19 AC units and financial assistance on utility bills.
20 Unless tenants agree to start paying monthly utility
21 costs or asked to have the units removed. NYCHA
22 installed about 16,000 air conditioners under this
23 program. According to the Journal of Urban Health,
24 older adults who participated in the Get Cool NYC
25 Program were less likely to report feeling sick from

1
2 the heat compared to those who didn't participate and
3 were more likely than their peers to be able to stay
4 home on hot days.

5 More than 60 percent of air conditioner
6 recipients said the cost of the unit itself was
7 prohibitive and why they had not previously obtained
8 an AC unit. How many NYCHA residents received air
9 conditioners through the Get Cool NYC program?

10 EVA TRIMBLE: Thank you for that question. I
11 want to clarify. NYCHA's mission is to keep people
12 housed. We did not send out eviction notices to
13 residents. We sent out a notice to residents
14 informing them of the process to enter into an
15 appliance agreement and failure to enter into
16 appliance agreement is something that is a lease
17 enforcement action. However, we did not attempt to
18 evict any residents over the summer and we did extend
19 the timeline for the Get Cool program to the end of
20 October.

21 I'll have to get back to you on the exact number
22 of residents. I know you said 16,000. I think it
23 was closer 14,000 but we'll get that number for you
24 as well as the number of residents who chose to start
25

1
2 paying the \$8 a month appliance fee verse ask to have
3 the air conditioner removed and given back.

4 That is - all residents that do not pay utility
5 bills do have to enter into an appliance agreement
6 for air conditioners so we were just seeking to have
7 party between the Get Cool residents and all of our
8 residents that have air conditioners in their home.

9 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Respectfully I would say
10 that there's an indirect you know implication of
11 eviction or penalty. If you're requiring people to
12 enter into an appliance agreement, that then they
13 would you know, the appliance agreement could then
14 you know cause eviction or cause them to be evicted
15 even though you're not directly evicting them. So, I
16 just want to sort of make that clarification. That
17 indirect eviction is still eviction.

18 Uhm, okay hold on, you answered a couple of my
19 questions so give me a second here. In June, NYCHA's
20 spokes person Michael Horgan said that coverage of
21 tenants utility costs would end on October 1st. Did
22 this coverage in fact end on October 1st?

23 EVA TRIMBLE: Yes, it did. I will double check.
24 I believe it was November 1st but it did end.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay and how much would it
3 have cost for NYCHA to absorb the energy costs of AC
4 units provided through Get Cool NYC?

5 EVA TRIMBLE: I will get back to you with that
6 number.

7 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Hmm, hmm and sorry, did you
8 say how many NYCHA residents forfeited their AC units
9 as a result of the subsidy ending?

10 EVA TRIMBLE: No, I don't have that number with
11 me today but we will get you the full breakdown for
12 the Get Cool program.

13 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay. What steps is NYCHA
14 taking to ensure that its residents are safe from
15 heatwaves and the temperature effects of climate
16 change?

17 SHAAN MAVANI: So, I think the major effort we
18 have in that area is our kind of what's called Clean
19 Heat for All challenge, as it's known publicly.
20 Where we are working to push the private industry to
21 develop products that are energy efficient and
22 provide heating and cooling technology. We currently
23 have an ongoing effort to do that and have committed
24 to buy 30,000 of those units once we work through a
25 pilot process where different manufacturers

1 demonstrate that they can meet our specifications.

2 And you know that's successful and we're able to roll
3 out those units you know across a number of
4 developments. That's a model whereby we can provide
5 more reliable heating as well as cooling to be able
6 to address some of those challenges that are coming
7 with climate change.
8

9 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Thank you. Okay, that was
10 my one very long question, so now I have two others.
11 Please describe plans for the construction of new
12 seniors only NYCHA developments.

13 EVA TRIMBLE: We have no plans for new
14 construction at this time.

15 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Uhm, okay despite that, can
16 you describe what is taken into consideration for the
17 siting of such construction when you are doing the
18 construction?

19 EVA TRIMBLE: NYCHA is not doing any new
20 construction at this time.

21 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: But you have in the past,
22 right?

23 EVA TRIMBLE: No, NYCHA does not do any
24 construction. We do partner with HPD to facilitate
25

3 affordable housing development on our sites and
4 that's through you know our partnership with HPD.

5 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: So, do you know what's taken
6 into consideration for the siting of that
7 construction because it's on your property?

8 SHAAN MAVANI: I think we can follow up and
9 provide that information. There is a process to look
10 at the communities needs around affordable housing
11 and any other specific purpose of those projects that
12 we work through and we can follow up with information
13 on that.

14 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay, thank you. And then
15 can you describe how older NYCHA residents especially
16 those who are homebound are accounted for during an
17 emergency? Following Hurricane Sandy for example,
18 flooding electrical outages stranded a number of
19 older NYCHA residents in their apartments, which is
20 what Chair Avilés was referring to earlier. Which
21 created dire conditions for those who required
22 prescription refills or that their prescriptions be
23 refrigerated as well a need for fresh food.

24 EVA TRIMBLE: Yeah, so our Family Partnerships
25 Division conducts wellness checks with elderly
individuals as well as any individuals that may have

1 life saving equipment, as long as it's reported to
2 us. So, as part of our annual review process, we do
3 ask for that information so that we have it available
4 in the event of an emergency and so that we can
5 follow up with residents in need to make sure they're
6 getting whatever help they need during an emergency.
7

8 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Great, thank you all so
9 much.

10 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Do you have a sense of how
11 many disabled or mobility impaired residents you
12 have?

13 EVA TRIMBLE: We do have all that information and
14 we can provide that to you and again, it's all self-
15 reported, so we can provide what we have at this
16 time.

17 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Great. So, we're in the
18 home stretch here. Just the last straggler is that I
19 was like, I didn't ask but I will. Let's go back to
20 fire. We understand that some security guard staff
21 also act as fire watchers. Uhm, is that correct and
22 how many, I guess how many developments have security
23 staff?

24 EVA TRIMBLE: So, uhm, the companies that we work
25 with, most the people regard to both fire and

1 security guards. Most of them are required as a
2 prerequisite and they have to get special
3 certifications from the city and the state because it
4 can be interchangeable. Uhm, we have 56 developments
5 where we have the security guards.
6

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Oh, okay just those senior
8 developments we talked about.

9 EVA TRIMBLE: Yes.

10 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Okay great. Uhm, and can
11 you describe what the Fire Watcher program is?

12 EVA TRIMBLE: So, the Fire Guard is supposed to
13 be put on site if one of the fire safety apparatus
14 has been out for four hours or more, like a steam
15 pipe or sprinkler system or a fire panel. And
16 essentially the buildings that it impacts, they're
17 supposed to be doing patrols to make sure that a fire
18 does occur that they immediately notify residents and
19 call FDNY.

20 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Got it, so in the event of
21 failure of some kind of a mechanics -

22 EVA TRIMBLE: Correct.

23 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: They'll take on that role.

24 EVA TRIMBLE: Yes.
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Got it. Uhm and I think you
3 mentioned this. How does one qualify as a fire
4 watcher?

5 EVA TRIMBLE: Uhm, they have to take a test from
6 FDNY.

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Got it. And is it fair to
8 say that all the security guards all have the fire
9 watcher?

10 EVA TRIMBLE: That I don't know.

11 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Okay. Uhm, and how is the
12 Fire Watcher program different from the NYCHA Fire
13 Safety unit?

14 EVA TRIMBLE: The Fire Safety Department
15 essentially gets the Fire Guards to — we contract
16 that out. We have Fire Guards once we are made aware
17 that a fire safety component has been compromised and
18 is not functioning properly, we try to send the guard
19 as quickly as possible, usually within a couple of
20 hours to the site to make sure that they stand guard
21 24 hours a day, 7 days a week until the repair has
22 been corrected.

23 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: So, the — I'm so sorry. So,
24 the Fire Watcher is just on standby till the repair
25 comes or till a guard comes?

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

133

3 EVA TRIMBLE: So, the fire guard -

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Yes.

5 EVA TRIMBLE: Uhm, is sent to the site once NYCHA
6 is notified that a fire safety apparatus has been
7 compromised.

8 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Right.

9 EVA TRIMBLE: So, they stay on guard it's usually
10 in shifts of eight hours. If it's at a community or
11 a senior center, it's when the senior center or
12 community center is open. But if it impacts a
13 building at NYCHA, we have usually three shifts of
14 eight hours. So, there's someone constantly there 24
15 hours a day, seven days a week until we're able to
16 correct the issue.

17 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Got it and are there
18 additional supports needed from the city to improve
19 any of the work of the work of the Fire Safety unit?
20 What could the city do to support that?

21 EVA TRIMBLE: If above additional funding that
22 would be great if we can get more staff.

23 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Do you hear that Mr. Mayor?
24 Additional funding. Thank you. In terms of - now
25 switching over to contracting. We understand that
sentinel security is an entity that NYCHA contracted

3 with to perform door repairs. What is NYCHA's
4 current relationship with sentinel security now?

5 EVA TRIMBLE: Sentinel is not a vendor that rings
6 a bell. I will have to go and check on that for you.

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Okay. Uhm, we have here if
8 you could explain why in some instances what should
9 be a minor door repair that might cost \$1,500. If
10 performed in-house, it would cost \$45,000 with a
11 contractor as was in the case of Riis Houses.

12 EVA TRIMBLE: I'd have to look into that specific
13 example at Riis. I'm not sure the specifics of that
14 or the condition of the door.

15 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: I can't imagine any
16 condition that would cost \$45,000 but we'll talk
17 more.

18 EVA TRIMBLE: Yes.

19 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Okay. Uhm, I think in terms
20 of the Mayor's November plan, uhm we understand that
21 from OMB that a PEG removed \$5.8 million in funding
22 from capitally ineligible projects generally funding
23 that supports training of staff on how to make
24 repairs on new capital. Will this reduction mean any
25 loss of training for NYCHA in-house staff on how to
repave things like doors?

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

135

3 EVA TRIMBLE: I'd have to follow up with our
4 Finance Department on that specific budget item. I'm
5 not familiar with that.

6 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Okay, alright thank you. I
7 think with that, I appreciate - oh no, I always do
8 this. I'm notorious for it. My Red Hook residents
9 would kill me if I did not bring this up. Actually,
10 there was a survey of NYCHA residents, I don't know
11 how long ago that said what was the element that made
12 them feel most unsafe in their homes and the number
13 one thing was lighting. And we know that there are
14 sheds everywhere that have been up some for months,
15 some for years in various states and they can't come
16 down because of repair issues on the building.
17 Nevertheless, lighting continues to be a persistent
18 issue. How is NYCHA tracking and responding to that
19 lighting and I will tell you, I have sent several
20 emails about incredibly dark places in NYCHA, not in
21 Red Hook in particular, given all the fencing that is
22 there that remains an issue. How is NYCHA addressing
23 the persistent lighting issues?

24 EVA TRIMBLE: So, NYCHA has limited resources as
25 you are aware to do major lighting projects similar
to as we've talked about with doors and cameras. We

1
2 rely on elected official funding of major lighting
3 enhancements at our developments. If it's something
4 that's small scale, an extra light here on a corner,
5 something that we think we can incorporate into our
6 property management work, we will add in a light or
7 two. So it really varies on what the scope of the
8 need is to crack the issue that you're talking about.

9 As much as possible, we will try to incorporate
10 it through our property management work but otherwise
11 we usually rely on capital funding to support major
12 lighting enhancements on our campuses.

13 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Alright thank you and do you
14 have any agreements with NYPD or DOT to obtain maybe
15 additional equipment that would be needed like those
16 like -

17 EVA TRIMBLE: We have had in certain instances
18 where we've been working with NYPD and we know
19 there's certain criminal activity going on. NYPD has
20 put in light towers for us and stationed them you
21 know to try to deter that criminal activity. So, we
22 do work closely with NYPD as needed but I know that
23 those light towers are very bright and very
24 disruptive to residents as well.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Yeah, for sure. And what's
3 the threshold? Like, how many calls does it take to
4 get an additional light or two? What's the threshold
5 do you use? Because I'm thinking in particular, in
6 many corridors in Red Hook, it is a safety issue 100
7 percent. It is not a perception of how many calls
8 will it take to get -

9 EVA TRIMBLE: No, I know it's not a matter of
10 number of calls that we're finally like, fine we'll
11 do it and I've walked -

12 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Or television, or television
13 spot lights.

14 EVA TRIMBLE: I've walked Red Hook with Ms.
15 Glendale(SP?) and I see all those dark spots as well
16 but we really do need funding in order to support
17 major lighting.

18 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Okay, well, I'll certainly
19 follow up around how the uhm, the safety, around how
20 the safety assessment stands and guides the actual
21 spending and the decisions that are made around what
22 gets prioritized in terms of you know this competing
23 need queue of needs that are greater than
24 expenditures. Council Member.

3 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Sorry, I have one follow-up
4 question. Uhm on July 24th of this year, Mayor Adams
5 and DOB Commissioner Oddo unveiled a plan to remove
6 unsightly sheds and scaffolding. Do you know if
7 NYCHA is part of that plan? I believe it's called
8 Get Sheds Down?

9 SHAAN MAVANI: Broadly, yes we are you know
10 involved in those efforts and have had a lot of
11 discussions with City Hall on what aspects of the
12 plan and the different measures could be applicable
13 in our context.

14 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay, thanks. Sorry, I have
15 one other question. Uhm, you all just provide such
16 great information that we have all this follow up.
17 Uhm, it's our understanding that the NYPD cameras use
18 facial recognition technology. Can you confirm
19 whether that is the case?

20 JAMES SECRETO: No, not at all. No.

21 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: They do not use facial
22 recognition?

23 JAMES SECRETO: Yeah, I don't like to speak for
24 the NYPD anymore but -

25 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: But we'll allow you.

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

139

3 JAMES SECRETO: There's no facial recognition
4 cameras certainly in NYCHA.

5 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Okay.

6 EVA TRIMBLE: Yes, not on NYCHA properties, no.

7 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: I think with that, we will
9 follow up on certainly all the elements that require
10 additional follow up but thank you for your time and
11 testimony and your ongoing work. And we will
12 continue to ensure that our residents are safe and
13 that we prioritize you know their health and
14 wellbeing as safety is – ensuring they have their
15 resources that they need.

16 EVA TRIMBLE: Thank you for your partnership.

17 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Thank you all for your
18 testimony today.

19 EVA TRIMBLE: Thank you.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We'll now move on to public
21 testimony. We'll start with testimony from Maryanne
22 Mullany who is representing the Comptroller, the New
23 York City Comptroller. You may begin.

24 MARYANNE MULLANY: Okay, thank you. Okay, thank
25 you Chair Avilés and Chair Hudson and members of the
New York City Council Committee on Public Housing and

1
2 Aging for the opportunity to testify on NYCHA's
3 safety infrastructure.

4 A year and a half ago, my office kicked off an
5 engagement effort to hear directly from NYCHA
6 residents about the most pressing issues in their
7 developments by attending family days, hosting
8 roundtables across the five boroughs, and collecting
9 hundreds of surveys. Many residents flagged
10 significant security concerns including chronic
11 issues with broken doors and locks. In response,
12 over 100 auditors took to the field and visited every
13 NYCHA development and checked the physical condition
14 of doors and locks in August and September of 2022.

15 Auditors visited 262 developments and were
16 alarmed to find the following: 36.8 percent of
17 residential building entrance doors were propped open
18 or unlocked, 40.1 percent of entrance door locks were
19 broken, 37.5 percent of rear side doors were propped
20 open or unlocked, 28.5 percent of rear or side door
21 locks were broken.

22 The results of this review in 2022 found
23 conditions much worse than in 2018, when the
24 Comptroller's auditors undertook a similar review.
25 Between 2018 and 2022, the number of entrance doors

1
2 propped open and/or had broken locks increased
3 dramatically from 23.5 percent in 2018 to 57.9
4 percent in 2022.

5 Our 2018 report recommended that NYCHA implement
6 the following recommendations: One, repair or replace
7 damaged exterior doors. Two, regularly inspect all
8 exterior doors and maintain all doors and locks in
9 good working order. And three, ensure that when
10 exterior doors are obstructed or unsecured,
11 maintenance staff are immediately made aware.

12 The 2022 review resulted in our auditors
13 reissuing many of these recommendations to NYCHA. In
14 March 2023 when NYCHA was asked by the Comptroller's
15 Office for the status of recommendations, they
16 reported that they implemented all of the
17 recommendations. However, our office and other
18 elected officials continue to hear from residents of
19 ongoing and long-standing issues. Our 2022 field
20 review made clear that NYCHA did not fully implement
21 the recommendations made in 2018, and continuing
22 complaints since the 2022 review raise concerns that
23 the problems remain.

24 For example, as recently as this week, we heard
25 from a resident that most of the doors at Jefferson

1 Houses were opened, not secured, and the intercom did
2 not work. We stress that NYCHA must urgently and
3 consistently follow through in implementing these
4 recommendations. While we understand NYCHA's dire
5 financial straits, our office voices our concerns
6 that repairs are not adequately done even when
7 funding is allocated. We also understand the issues
8 extend beyond the doors themselves. Residents inform
9 us that doors are often propped open because
10 replacement keys are too expensive, and we urge NYCHA
11 to make replacements more accessible. However, these
12 worsening results overall do not represent one-off
13 challenges, but a deeper culture of improper
14 maintenance without quality assurance mechanisms.

15 We urge NYCHA to listen to the voices of many
16 residents who shared the impacts these security
17 issues have on their daily lives, and what it means
18 to live without a sense of security in their own
19 homes. Thank you for your consideration, and our
20 office welcomes any questions or elaboration on our
21 recent field review.

22 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Yes, thank you so much for
24 your patience and sitting through the hearing. I was
25

1
2 curious around if you were able to look at any of the
3 - if there were any distinctions between contracting
4 and in-house capacity and any financial implications.

5 MARYANNE MULLANY: We did not cover that. This
6 was really point and time observations of the
7 conditions. So, really just site observations and
8 not a full audit of the security.

9 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: No, that's fair and I will
10 say that we heard in testimony today and in response
11 to the Comptrollers Report that those items were
12 cured and we know for a fact that they are not. So,
13 there is a clear discrepancy and experience around
14 what is happening and how that is getting monitored.

15 So, I thank the Comptroller's Office for this
16 work and we'll continue to push to get these repairs
17 and improved management and thank you in particular
18 around the replacement, the accessibility of
19 replacement keys and even so far as even mailbox keys
20 in some developments have been difficult for
21 residents to obtain. So, thank you so much for your
22 partnership.

23 MARYANNE MULLANY: Thank you very much.

24 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Thank you.
25

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

144

3 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The next in person witness
4 will be Izhiah Thompson. With that we'll move on to
5 Zoom testimony. For those wishing to testify on
6 Zoom, you'll again be prompted to unmute yourself and
7 once you're unmuted, you'll be able to - you should
8 be able to just begin.

9 At this time, we're going to call Areiner Garcia.
10 Please wait for the Sergeant at Arms to call time
11 before you begin your testimony. We can hear you.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has begun.

13 AREINER GARCIA: Alright, uhm, I'm a little
14 nervous but my concern is about seven years ago, I
15 put in several tickets with housing. Then they had
16 informed me that they couldn't take care of the
17 tickets because of the COVID and that was quite
18 understandable but once everything was established
19 and things opened up, I contacted them and it was
20 done. I'm referring to tickets like for child's
21 painting. Now I'm in the you know in the projects
22 already like 15 years and never once have I ever
23 bothered anybody regarding anything.

24 Uhm, finally after several attempts for my child,
25 they came to the home and the guy says to us after he
did a test, "oh, you got asbestos. You have to move

1 out of this apartment immediately." "You cannot stay
2 here. It's no good."

3
4 Now, I had my leg amputated so I'm in a
5 wheelchair. I have a daughter that is mildly
6 retarded but she's bed down. She don't do walk or
7 talk or nothing. So, we don't have no men in our
8 lives that can help us, so you know we were at
9 housing, put in your tickets. Put in your tickets.

10 When I informed the housing office that I had
11 asbestos and the guy that checked it said we have to
12 leave the apartment. My worker, Ms. Cabel, he says,
13 "Oh yes, we're going to send you to a hotel. Are you
14 ready to leave?" I told her yes. This was seven
15 months ago. Nobody did nothing. I reached out
16 again. He said, "no, we're going to get you the
17 hotel." Still nothing.

18 Then she says that a hotel, a hotel can not a
19 time or date me and my family. Uhm, so I said well
20 put us in an apartment.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired.

22 AREINER GARCIA: I'm still waiting. Thank you
23 for your time.

24 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Can you state your name for
25 the record?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

146

AREINER GARCIA: Areiner Garcia.

CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: And what development are you
in Areiner?

AREINER GARCIA: Breukelen in Canarsie.

CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Is there a way to get a
contact information from Ms. Garcia. Okay. Ms.
Garcia, we will follow up with you. We thank you for
your testimony and I am so sorry that you have had
this experience and you're still going through it.
Thank you for your courage and your testimony and
your patience and being here. We will follow up with
you Ms. Garcia.

AREINER GARCIA: Thank you. Okay.

CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Thank you.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. We'll be moving
on to Jean Serviola. Please wait for the Sergeant at
Arms to call time before you begin your testimony.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has begun.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Okay Jean is no longer
available. Moving on to Rohan Lalla. Please wait
for the Sergeant at Arms to call time before you
begin your testimony.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has begun.

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

147

3 ROHAN LALLA: Hi, uhm hello. My name is Rohan
4 Lalla and I am a case manager with University
5 Settlement Project Home, a non-profit organization
6 that offers anti-eviction, and homelessness
7 prevention services, and housing counseling to low-

8 income residents.
9 Our organization works with countless NYCHA
10 residents living in Manhattan and Brooklyn who are
11 struggling with housing issues, such as rental
12 disputes and arrears; lack of safety; lack of repairs
13 and safety and infrastructure problems. I'm
14 addressing this body today to request that NYCHA take
15 urgent action to improve its physical conditions
16 which threaten its residents' safety daily.

17 We primarily work in the Lower East Side, Fort
18 Greene, and East New York. NYCHA residents across
19 these neighborhoods are concerned with the state and
20 upkeep of their buildings: the lights in the hallways
21 flicker, the elevators are often broken down,
22 entrance doors don't lock to keep trespassers out.
23 These conditions gravely imperil tenants, especially
24 those who are elderly and disabled. NYCHA,
25 unfortunately, has proven to be unresponsive and
understaffed with regard to repairs and tenant

1
2 complaints, a situation that should be blamed both on
3 underfunding and mismanagement.

4 Not only do the state of public and shared spaces
5 in NYCHA make tenants unsafe, so do the conditions in
6 NYCHA's individual units. My colleagues and I have
7 seen NYCHA drag its feet on repairs that threaten
8 health and safety. I have personally interacted with
9 NYCHA residents who live with severe health hazards
10 in their apartments daily. One of my clients who
11 testified today Ms. Garcia, a disabled amputee
12 residing with her two daughters who are both disabled
13 as well, lives in Breukelen Houses in East New York.
14 She has been living in a unit that tested positive
15 for toxic levels of asbestos in September. NYCHA has
16 continually delayed the scheduled repairs and
17 apartment transfers for this family.

18 Another family in Vladeck Houses in Lower East
19 Side, two elderly retirees, have had severe mold
20 issues in their apartment since September. Again, no
21 action besides inspections have been taken. Photos
22 show the entire ceiling covered in mold, garbage
23 piles right outside of the couple's window, and a
24 severe leak with rancid water leaking through the
25 door.

1
2 NYCHA has failed to do root cause repairs,
3 forcing the couple to move out of the unit and live
4 with their daughter while still paying rent to the
5 Housing Authority. These are anecdotal cases that I
6 have witnessed and advocated for. Aggregated data
7 details a larger, systemic problem. The Ombudsperson
8 person Call Center, OCC, a court-appointed group
9 formed to assist residents for leak and mold
10 complaints that were not being adequately addressed
11 or resolved by NYCHA, has participated in 67,000
12 calls with NYCHA residents since 2019.

13 Between 2022 and 2023, the OCC averaged 234 new
14 mold and leak complaints per month -

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired.

16 ROHAN LALLA: Can I finish my sentence? 50
17 percent of which were classified as severe
18 conditions.

19 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Do you have remaining
20 testimony?

21 ROHAN LALLA: Yes.

22 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Would you like to complete
23 it?

24 ROHAN LALLA: Yes.

25 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Feel free.

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

150

3 ROHAN LALLA: The average days to resolve a
4 resident-reported complaints to the OCC, again, 50
5 percent of which were severe conditions, ranged from
6 168 days to 224 days. This was caused by recurrence
7 failures, or inability to meet scheduled
8 appointments, and craftsmanship, where NYCHA
9 contractors and vendors failed to conduct root cause
10 repairs, making it so that tickets had to be re-

11 opened.
12 NYCHA residents are among the most vulnerable
13 populations in New York City. The majority of our
14 clients are from low-income, minority tenants who
15 receive public benefits. They form the constituency
16 of many of the electeds sitting on this Committee,
17 and they deserve better than what they are being
18 given right now.

19 Thank you for your time, and I am happy to answer
20 any questions.

21 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Thank you so much Mr. Lalla.
22 And I hope you will be submitting your testimony
23 electronically. Thank you for your advocacy on
24 behalf of tenants. We continue to see this
25 persistence, combination of funding and mismanagement
and we hope to follow up with Mr. Garcia and

1
2 potentially with your other client, so thank you so
3 much.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: So, we'll now go to Izhiah
5 Thompson.

6 IZIAH THOMPSON: Good afternoon, okay. Uhm,
7 thank you for the opportunity to testify. My name is
8 Izhiah Thompson. I am a Senior Policy Analyst at the
9 Community Service Society for New York. So every
10 year we do a survey of New Yorkers with a sort of
11 emphasis on the issues that affect low-income New
12 Yorkers. Last year, we carried out the survey and we
13 found that in 2022, more than half of NYCHA residents
14 said that properly working exterior door locks,
15 intercoms and buzzers were a concern.

16 We compared this across various housing types and
17 found that access to a safe and secure dwelling is a
18 strictly public housing issue in New York. Public
19 housing residents were 2.5 times more likely than
20 rent regulated households to have issues with
21 exterior doors. More than four times more likely
22 than market rate households and 12 times more likely
23 than homeowners.

24 So, this data matches with the on the ground
25 reality that we've seen. In the past year I have

1 visited public housing developments in the Bronx,
2 Queens, Manhattan, and Brooklyn, and have
3 consistently found doors ajar, broken, and in
4 disrepair. I've attended multiple resident
5 association meetings where residents describe a
6 situation where NYCHA spends money on new doors, only
7 to have outsiders break them so they no longer close.
8 This occurs again and again across the city and in
9 none of these cases were more modern resilient doors
10 installed, despite the fact that residents have
11 complained about the poor quality and deficiencies
12 with contractors used in the past.

14 While it is disconcerting to see, we can
15 understand that the modernization of heating and
16 replacing old pipes and roofs are really capital-
17 intensive fixes that we continue to call for more
18 funding for but it's beyond our understanding why the
19 basic provision of a protected entry and exit way
20 can't be maintained for public housing residents.

21 Thank you again for the opportunity for us to
22 share what we've learned and we will do the survey
23 again this year and hopefully this attention will
24 show different results. So, thank you.

25 CHAIRPERSON HUDSON: Thank you.

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH
2 THE COMMITTEE ON AGING

153

3 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Thank you so much Iziah.
4 Thank you for your work and I think like with the
5 Comptroller, it kind of defies logic and
6 understanding to hear that all these issues were
7 addressed that were pointed out and yet the reality
8 as you probably can step onto any NYCHA campus and
9 find broken doors and doors ajar. So there is an
10 enormous amount of work to be done and thank you for
11 your partnership.

12 IZIAH THOMPSON: Thank you.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We'll ask one more time if
14 there's anyone on Zoom that wishes to testify.
15 Please indicate by raising, using the raise hand
16 function. If there's anyone in person that would
17 like to testify, please indicate by coming up to the
18 dais or coming up to the table upfront or approaching
19 the Sergeants. Otherwise, seeing there are no, we'll
20 end public testimony.

21 CHAIRPERSON AVILÈS: Great. So, in closing,
22 throughout this hearing, we once again have heard how
23 budget shortfalls have led to poor conditions for
24 public housing residents in NYCHA despite the trend
25 of disinvestment has also made some short strides in
improvement. And while I applaud these measures, it

1
2 is clear that NYCHA still has a long way to go to
3 improving the management structure that continues to
4 put residents in harms way.

5 Safety and security is a basic human right and
6 our NYCHA residents are left to suffer the
7 indignities of multiple systemic failures and we as
8 leaders and agency employees must step up for them.

9 I encourage NYCHA to take a hard look at the
10 recommendations made by the Federal Monitor and other
11 agencies. The reality is pointed out by countless
12 number of residents and advocates and consider what
13 was said in this room today and take a second look at
14 how it might begin to improve the safety conditions
15 for our residents in Ernest and in particular our
16 most treasured assets are seniors.

17 We thank you. And with that, would you like to
18 say something? Okay, and with that, I will close
19 today's hearing. [GAVEL]

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date DECEMBER 15, 2023