

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT

----- X

September 17, 2018

Start: 1:23 p.m.

Recess: 2:21 p.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E: JOSEPH C. BORELLI
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Alicka Ampry-Samuel
Justin L. Brannan
Fernando Cabrera
Alan N. Maisel

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Elizabeth Cascio, FDNY Chief of Staff

Glenn Asaeda, Chief Medical Director Office of
Medical Affairs

James Booth, Chief of EMS Operations

Thomas McKavanagh, Chief of Fire Prevention

Oren Barzilay, President, Local 2507
Represents, Emergency Medical Technicians,
Paramedics and Fire Inspectors

2 [sound check] [pause]

3 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: Good afternoon, and
4 welcome to the packed house that is the Fire and
5 Emergency Management Committee hearing. I'm Council
6 Member Joe Borelli. I'm Chair of the Committee on
7 Fire and Emergency Management, and I'm joined today
8 by my colleagues. [background comments] The
9 Committee on Fire and Emergency Management primarily
10 oversees the New York City Fire Department and the
11 city's Emergency Medical Services, which are
12 principally responsible for firefighting as well as
13 First Responder Medical Services. Regarding the
14 subject of today's oversight hearing, we are here to
15 discuss the city's Emergency Medical Services
16 response to the opioid epidemic. As EMTs and
17 Paramedics are often the first responders they
18 encounter individuals experiencing drug overdoses and
19 adverse substance reactions. It is important for the
20 Council to examine EMS practices in this very
21 important area. Specifically, the committee hopes to
22 learn more about the Fire Department's efforts to
23 ensure EMS workers are sufficiently equipped to
24 respond to the growing number of drug overdoses that
25 have been occurring in recent years. In addition to

2 providing life saving treatment following a drug
3 overdose, what other ways can EMS better serve
4 individuals with substance abuse disorder to ensure
5 healthier living and helping people be referred to
6 treatment when appropriate? Additionally, we are
7 also hearing an unrelated piece of legislation in
8 today's hearing, Proposed Introduction 1054 sponsored
9 by myself and Council Members Cornegy and Yeger to
10 require the Fire Department to establish a system
11 whereby individuals can submit fire alarm plan
12 examinations through an online portal. This would be
13 an important step in streamlining—streamlining a
14 currently inefficient process of submitting such
15 plans in person. I would like to now ask those
16 members of the Administration who plan on testifying
17 to please state your name for the record, raise your
18 right hands as the Committee Counsel administers the
19 oath.

20 LEGAL COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell the
21 truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in
22 your testimony before this committee and to respond
23 honestly to Council Member questions? Proceed. Than
24 you.

2 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: Thank you and would
3 you all mind introducing yourself for the record?

4 ELIZABETH CASCIO: Elizabeth Cascio, FDNY
5 Chief of Staff.

6 GLENN ASAEDA: Glenn Asaeda: Chief
7 Medical Director, the Office of Medical Affairs.

8 JAMES BOOTH: James Booth, Chief of EMS
9 Operations.

10 Thomas McKavanagh, Chief of Fire
11 Prevention.

12 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: Thank you and I
13 believe Ms. Cascio, you'll—you'll start. Thank you.

14 CHIEF CASCIO: Yes. Good morning, Chair
15 Borelli and all Council Members present. My name is
16 Elizabeth Cascio, and I am Chief of Staff for
17 Commissioner Nigro of the New York City Fire
18 Department. Thank you for the opportunity to speak
19 to you—with you today about Fire Department's
20 response to the opioid crisis. I am joined by Chief
21 Booth, Chief of EMS, Thomas McKavanagh, Chief of Fire
22 Prevention and Dr. Glenn Asaeda, the Medical Director
23 of Office of Medical Affairs. Nationally, we are in
24 the midst of a drug overdose epidemic driven by both
25 prescription and illicit opioids primarily heroin and

1 Fentanyl. In New York City drug overdose is the
2 leading cause of unintentional injury death for all
3 New Yorkers, and the leading cause of death among New
4 Yorkers age 25 to 34. In March, 2017, the Mayor
5 launched Healing New York City, a comprehensive
6 response to the opioid overdose epidemic, which aims
7 to save as many as 400 lives by 2022. One of the key
8 goal of Healing New York City is prevent opioid
9 overdose deaths by distributing Naloxone, a life
10 saving drug that can reverse opioid overdose to
11 communities and social networks where risk of drug
12 overdose is the highest. The city has pledged to
13 distribute 100,000 Naloxone kits per year free of
14 charge, and to ensure that people at highest risk of
15 overdose and their friends, families and social
16 networks are equipped to prevent an overdose death.
17 The Fire Department's role in that plan is the
18 Naloxone Leave Behind Program. My testimony will
19 focus on FDNY's approach to and the methods of
20 dealing with suspected opioid overdoses. As far back
21 as the 1970s, EMS Paramedics carried and administered
22 Naloxone to patients with suspected overdoses. At
23 that time, it was not easy to administer. However,
24 as the technology evolved and Naloxone became easier
25

2 to administer the department sought and received
3 approval from New York State to allow Emergency
4 Medical Technicians, EMTs and Certified First
5 Responders, CFRs to use Naloxone to revive patients.
6 As a result, all the EMS personnel and CFR Certified
7 Firefighters are able to administer the medication.
8 FDNY EMTs and CFRs began administering Naloxone in
9 2014. Our most recent advancement announced in June
10 of this year has been Leave Behind Naloxone kits,
11 which I will discuss in detail later in my testimony.
12 When EMTs, Paramedics or CFRs encounter a patient
13 whom they believe may have overdosed, they use their
14 training and experience to make a decision about
15 whether to administer Naloxone. It's not practical
16 or possible for them to conduct a blood test in the
17 field. So they treat a patient for a suspected
18 overdose based on several factors including physical
19 symptoms such as pinpoint pupils, credible
20 information from a friend or witness, and the
21 presence of drug paraphernalia. Upon determining
22 that a patient may be overdosing on an opioid,
23 Naloxone will be administered like a nasal spray to
24 revive and improve the patient's breathing.
25 Subsequently, the patient will be transported to a

2 hospital or medical center emergency room. Overdoses
3 caused by stronger narcotics may require additional
4 doses of Naloxone. One trend that we have seen in
5 recent years overdoses caused by heroine contaminated
6 with Fentanyl. Fentanyl is a pain reliever that is
7 50 to 100 times more potent than Morphine. We are
8 aware of instances in other parts of the country of
9 narcotics being mixed with Carfentanil, which is
10 intended as an anesthetic for large animals, and is
11 10,000 times more potent than Morphine. We check in
12 on a regular basis with the Office of the Chief
13 Medical Examiner and the Department of Health and
14 Mental Hygiene's Poison Control Center to see if
15 there have been any reports of Carfentanil in New
16 York City. Fortunately, to date we have not seen any
17 instances of Carfentanil in the city. The Naloxone
18 Leave Behind program allows EMS personnel to leave a
19 Naloxone kit with a patient or a patient's friend or
20 family so that it may be used to revive the patient
21 if he or she overdoses again in the future. Research
22 indicates that people who have experienced a non-
23 fatal overdose are at increased risk for experiencing
24 another overdose in the future. Working with the de
25 Blasio Administration and DOHMH, the Leave Behind

2 Program enables our members to provide life saving
3 tools as well as education and instructions that will
4 prevent loss of life. Naloxone is being funded and
5 supplied by DOHMH, and is provided free of charge to
6 patients and their friends and family. The process
7 of preparing to go live with Leave Behind Program is
8 itself a success story. FDNY registered with the New
9 York State Department of Health Opioid Overdose
10 Prevention Program in April 2018. Between April and
11 August working closely with DOHM, we designed and
12 implemented a training protocol using Diamond Plate,
13 an online training platform that is located at every
14 EMS station and firehouse, we successfully trained
15 more than 4,000 EMS members in time to roll out the
16 program on September 1st and we did it without
17 incurring extra training costs or using overtime.
18 The kit itself is fairly simple. It contains
19 Naloxone nasal spray, rubber gloves, a face shield,
20 alcohol wipes, a handout containing information on
21 the risks of overdose, and an instruction sheet.
22 Each basic life support and advanced life support
23 unit is stocked with four kits for the Leave Behind
24 Program and are not used by the EMTs and Paramedics
25 for treatment. The kits are only distributed in

2 instances where EMS personnel have already
3 administered Naloxone to the patient. When
4 responding to a suspected opioid overdose, once the
5 patient has been revived and is awake enough to
6 receive a kit, the patient is offered a kit. If a
7 patient declines to receive additional medical
8 assistance after being revived, the patient may be
9 offered a kit if approval is given by our online
10 medical control doctors. A patient has a right to
11 refuse the kit and a patient who elopes from the
12 scene is not given a kit. In addition, if a family
13 member or friend of the patient requests a kit, a kit
14 may be left behind with that person. Once the call
15 is completed, the members update online medical
16 control in order to track the distribution of Leave
17 Behind kits. So far, we have distributed more than
18 30 kits to patients in the first few weeks of the
19 program.

20 Introduction 1054: Introduction 1054
21 sponsored by Chair Borelli would require the Fire
22 Department to create a method to accept online
23 applications for fire alarm plan examinations. The
24 Fire Department puts a premium on customer service
25 and, in fact, we have been working on a program that

2 would accomplish exactly what this bill would
3 require. We know that providing online applications
4 for fire alarm examinations would make the process
5 more convenient for members of the public, and it is
6 always our goal to improve the manner in which we
7 serve the people of New York. We expect to be able
8 to offer online applications for fire alarm
9 examination soon, and thus, we support Introduction
10 1054. We would be happy to take your questions at
11 this time.

12 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: Thank you very
13 much, and I guess let's just stay on 1054 at first so
14 we can get that out of the way. Just a quick
15 question. What is the ETA on rolling out the
16 online application process?

17 CHIEF MCKAVANAGH: Well, we're currently
18 working on the Fires Program, which is expand—we're
19 expecting it to roll out on October 1st. We've just—
20 it was part of the first released. There is a couple
21 of units and the fire alarm plan examination is the
22 second piece of that, and the first release we are
23 hoping by November 1st. We may need a little more
24 time as we're working out some of the details

2 relative to the final configuration and the reviews
3 of security, the software security clearance.

4 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: And—and you don't
5 see any decrease in the quality of review that the
6 plan examiners will be able to give an online
7 application versus a paper application?

8 CHIEF MCKAVANAGH: No, we don't—we don't
9 expect any drop in the quality of the reviews.

10 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: Okay. Alright, so
11 then just turning then to opioids, I—I just want to
12 start out by asking about Diamond Plate. It's
13 something I never heard of.

14 CHIEF CASCIO: Sure.

15 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: Can you explain
16 what that is?

17 CHIEF CASCIO: Sure.

18 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: Can you explain
19 what that is?

20 CHIEF CASCIO: It's a method that we use
21 to provide electronic remote training out of the
22 classroom, out of the proper classroom setting.
23 Usually it's video based. Sometimes it's journal
24 based with questions, and the members access it from
25

2 the station. In the ideal world we would have a
3 mobile platform, but we don't have that at this time.

4 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: Like something out
5 of Star Trek it sounds like.

6 CHIEF CASCIO: It's—we're dragging it
7 into this century.

8 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: That's good. Does
9 the department track the number of EMS runs stemming
10 from drug overdoses?

11 CHIEF CASCIO: Yes.

12 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: Is—is there an
13 increase versus the 2017 numbers or 2016? Do we have
14 any trends to say whether we're responding to more or
15 less?

16 CHIEF CASCIO: [pause] Actually, we
17 talked specific to opiate overdoses because there are
18 a wider range of overdoses. So, if we talk specific
19 to opiate overdoses between July 2016 and June, the
20 end of June 2017, we had 4,608 citywide. In the same
21 period from July 2017 to June of 2018, the end of
22 June so we're talking fiscal year. Citywide was
23 4,194.

24 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: Okay. So, it's
25 fairly steady then you would say?

2 CHIEF CASCIO: Fairly steady.

3 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: Okay. Is there a
4 difference in the response to opioid calls whether
5 it's a ALS or a BLS ambulance service?

6 CHIEF CASCIO: When you say difference--

7 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: [interposing] Are
8 they all different?

9 CHIEF CASCIO: --do you mean the type of
10 treatment that they would receive?

11 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: Correct.

12 CHIEF CASCIO: So, because of the
13 Naloxone--Naloxone program and being able to
14 administer the Naloxone with a nasal spray rather
15 than a needle, which is how the Paramedics just
16 administer Naloxone, we've been able to bring the
17 Naloxone to the patient more frequently because all
18 of our providers are able to administer it.

19 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: So, the technology
20 changed, and now there's really no front end
21 difference between ALS versus BLS?

22 CHIEF CASCIO: In--In respect to
23 delivering Naloxone to the patient.

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: And how many hours
3 or training do EMTs and Paramedics receive
4 specifically on treating overdoses?

5 CHIEF CASCIO: They each receive a
6 different amount of training. [background comments]

7 CHIEF BOOTH: Yeah, I'm James Booth. I'm
8 the Chief of EMS Operations. The—the training that
9 they receive is—is in their basic training and in
10 their refresher training. It has to do—it's covered
11 under medical emergencies, and overdoses are—are a
12 subtopic of medical emergencies and opiates are a
13 subtopic of—of the—of that topic. So, and they do
14 continuing medical education. The Paramedics do
15 continue medical education so many number of hours
16 per year in order to maintain their certifications,
17 and you will see journal articles that they have to
18 read and take questions and—and pass those questions
19 in order to stay current on how to manage somebody
20 who has not only overdosed from an opioid, but there
21 are other medications also. So, the—I can't give you
22 the actual number of hours. I know that we do train
23 on it. It's buried in the original certifications
24 and refresher.

2 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: Is there a—is there
3 a difference in—in response time whether it's ALS or
4 BLS service?

5 CHIEF BOOTH: A drug overdose can come in
6 as a number of things.

7 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: Right.

8 CHIEF BOOTH: It could come in as a sick
9 call. It could come in as an unconscious. It could
10 come in as somebody behaving irrationally. So, each
11 one of those types of assignments are a different
12 segment. There are nine segments, response segments
13 form cardiac arrest all the way up to standby being
14 the last segment, and depending upon how that person
15 is reported to the 911 system as—you know, we
16 interview the caller. That will dictate whether or
17 not it's an ALS response or a BLS response. If
18 they're unconscious, obviously we're going to try to
19 get the paramedics there as rapidly as possible,
20 which is the ALS Unit. If it's somebody who is not
21 feeling well, and it can come in as a sick or it come
22 as drug or alcohol abuse type assignment, which will
23 be a lower segment, non-life threatening at that
24 point, and it would be a BLS assignment.

2 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: In any of these
3 cases is the—~~is~~ the corresponding engine company
4 responding as well?

5 CHIEF BOOTH: On the higher level
6 assignments, the unconscious you'll see the engine
7 company turn out. On the lower acuity patients where
8 you'll see a sick call or you're see somebody who's
9 acting irrational, you will not see the engine
10 company turn out.

11 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: Do—do engine
12 companies receive Naloxone training as part of CFR?

13 CHIEF BOOTH: Yes, the engine companies
14 are trained. They carry Naloxone the same as the
15 ambulance carries, and it's delivered in the same
16 method.

17 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: So, congratulations
18 on rolling out the—~~the~~ Leave Behind Program. I think
19 it's something that is overdue, and—~~and~~ very well
20 intentioned and—~~and~~—~~and~~ will probably lead to some
21 unfortunately positive results. Is there follow-up?
22 Is there—do you take any data from the person that
23 you leave the kit with or is it sort of a no
24 questions asked drop-off?

2 CHIEF MCKAVANAGH: Yes, as part of the
3 New York State Opiate Overdose Prevention Program, we
4 actually come under the—the City Department of Health
5 and Mental Hygiene, and part of the requirements are
6 that we collect data, not personal information
7 because patient information is private, and we can't
8 divulge that, but essentially just for the purposes
9 of where we seem to have friends of where we leave
10 these kids behind and such. So, very limited
11 datasets we do provide.

12 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: So, with—with 43
13 given away so far I think it's tough to—to pinpoint a
14 trend. You know, maybe in next year's hearing you'll
15 have more data, but have you noticed borough based
16 discrepancies in the frequency of calls, and if so,
17 are there ways to address that? Of opioid calls?

18 CHIEF CASCIO: We mitigate the life
19 threatening aspect of opioid overdoses. So there's
20 not much that changes on that front whether the call
21 volume increases or decreases. We do notice the
22 spikes of these types of calls to be in the Bronx,
23 Queens and Staten Island.

24 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: So, the Richmond
25 County District Attorney has started a—a pretty

2 robust program where they follow up with overdose
3 victims to-to basically establish a lead on any type
4 of criminal prosecutions that can come from it. Has
5 there been any discussions in the department of
6 participating or giving over any data or overdose
7 patients or would that--would that breach HIPAA Rules
8 or--

9 CHIEF BOOTH: Most of the time these
10 types of questions do breach HIPAA Rules and unless
11 we got a piece of that law changed, I don't see how
12 we're going to be able to provide most of the data
13 that people are looking for.

14 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: As I understand it,
15 if-if-if the police respond to the incident that it
16 can easily be given, the information to the DA. So,
17 you're saying basically based on HIPAA if it's just a
18 medical situation, you probably know where to refer
19 the patient to the DA's Office.

20 CHIEF BOOTH: Yes, it's very difficult.
21 It's not part of the mandated reporting that we're
22 required. For example, if there's a shooting or a
23 stabbing at the hospital and that's mandated and
24 child abuse, things of that nature. Right now, since
25 opioid addiction is considered a medical condition,

1 it's not something we can divulge. So, I mention
2 we're joined by Council Member Ampry-Samuel, Council
3 Member Cabrera, and Council Member Maisel. Should it
4 be mandated reporting overdose treatment?
5

6 CHIEF BOOTH: Again, I think as a medical
7 condition usually, there's no real criminal-criminal
8 intent that someone is harmed besides the patient
9 himself or herself. Technically, it would be against
10 the law, but until legislation changes and such,
11 right now it's not considered to be a mandated
12 reporting piece.

13 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: Do-do you think any
14 sort of data collection from the Leave Behind Program
15 would result in patients of family members being less
16 interested in taking the kits? In other words, if
17 they had to give their names and information over to-
18 -?

19 CHIEF BOOTH: We would be speculating on
20 experience and, you know, many substance abusers are
21 free to give their personal information. They're
22 afraid to tell us their names sometimes. They don't
23 believe us when we say they're not in trouble. We do
24 have those types of instances, if that's what you're
25 getting at.

2 CHIEF BOOTH: And we do quite a few
3 patients that once they wake up, they just kind of
4 leave us because they're afraid of the potential
5 wall, the legal implications.

6 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: But as a matter of
7 policy you believe it's better to make sure or
8 encourage the patient as best as possible to leave
9 with a kit rather than to--

10 CHIEF CASCIO: Yes.

11 CHIEF BOOTH: We do try to encourage that
12 issue not only, you know, to take the kit, but let us
13 take it to the hospital--

14 CHIEF CASCIO: [interposing] Let's take
15 you here.

16 CHIEF BOOTH: --where we can, they can
17 provide even a higher level of care and to monitor
18 you.

19 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: I just have one
20 more question back on Intro 1054. Our Finance person
21 just gave a great question. The--the policy that
22 you're implementing that--that corresponds with Intro
23 1054, are you able to implement that with existing
24 resources or are there more resources financially
25 needed to implement it?

2 CHIEF MCKAVANAGH: We're expecting that
3 we're going to need a small group of additional
4 resources to meet some of the demands. Not just for
5 this bill, but for some of the others that are coming
6 with Ultimate Agent and the Fire Protection Plan,
7 but-but not-not a large number. We're-we're pretty
8 much handling all the fire alarm examinations with
9 the folks that we have now, but the workload has
10 increases such with the construction in New York City
11 that we may need to ask for a few more resources just
12 to keep up with it.

13 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: Sure.

14 CHAIRPERSON KING: Formally, it would be
15 ten days for-when we would get the plan 'til we got
16 to examine it. Now, we're-we're somewhere in the
17 area of two weeks, two to three weeks. So, the-the
18 plans are-are coming at a high rate due to the
19 construction there so--

20 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: But by-by the
21 Buildings Department of Standards that's like the
22 flash, you know, like that that's-that's incredible.
23 I-I have no questions. Do-do any of you fine folks
24 have questions? Yes. Council Member.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ALICKA-SAMUEL: Good
3 afternoon. Just a quick follow-up to just the back-
4 end exchange related to when someone may refuse to be
5 transported to the hospital, what does that look like
6 when you actually decline? I have an all-men's
7 shelter in my district, and any-like every other
8 weekend I see about four ambulances in front of this
9 particular facility on Eastern Parkway and Ralph
10 Avenue, the Renaissance, and I stood there and
11 watched some of the men like kind of come out of
12 what-what they're going through, and they say, no,
13 no, no, no, no and kind of like stagger off, and EMS
14 workers are just kind of-are standing there talking
15 to the other guys, and it's-it- So, what does that
16 look like? Like the process or political? How long
17 do they stay there to observe the individual and with
18 the level of encourage to try to get them to-to be
19 transported? What does that look like?

20 JAMES BOOTH: Yes, once we receive a call
21 through the 911 system for-for any patient, we
22 definitely try to get them to the hospital.
23 Fortunately or unfortunately, public health law as
24 long as you have what we call decisional capacity so
25 you understand the risks and benefits of going or not

2 going, we cannot force you to go to the hospital
3 short of being detained by the police and things of
4 that nature or being a threat to the public.

5 Sometimes they're taken in to custody by PD because
6 they're just not making sense. They're a threat to
7 others, but short of that, even someone having a
8 massive heart attack can actually refuse to be
9 transported to the hospital. So, we try to explain
10 to them that hey if you in that case if you go to the
11 hospital there are these cath labs. They might be
12 able to prevent this--this damage to the heart. We
13 really encourage that you go. So, any time there's a
14 high risk issue, we--we--our protocol is that the EMTs
15 or paramedics must contact our online medical
16 facility, which has a physician during any given 24-
17 hour period where a discussion we had with the
18 physician and the patient on a taped line recorded to
19 say listen, I'm not there with you, but from what's
20 being described and the EKG that they just sent me,
21 you're having a massive heart attack, and we--you--your
22 really need to go to the hospital. If you decide not
23 to go, there's a great risk that you may actually
24 become disabled or maybe even die. We try to let them
25 know that is a very life threatening condition. At

2 the end of it, if they still with decisional capacity
3 and they understand that. Often times they'll say
4 well, if I'm going to die then I'd rather die at
5 home, which is a difficult conversation to have, but
6 we just cannot force them to go, and in those cases
7 after trying to encourage them, we will let them know
8 on the taped line that this is a high risk case, high
9 in suspicion. You really should go. If you do not
10 go there may be consequences, and often times we'll
11 tell them what they are, and if they still understand
12 that and refuse then we'll have them sign a form
13 essentially that says that they understand and they
14 refuse the medical transportation and assistance.
15 And then we try to encourage them, listen, if you
16 have pain again later, give us a call right back.
17 We're happy to come back, and—and we definitely do
18 try to encourage them to go.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ALICKA-SAMUEL: I'm not
20 sure if you asked this question already, but do you
21 leave any like pamphlets or like any information? Do
22 they carry that with them in the—in the ambulance?

23 CHIEF BOOTH: So, I have an example of
24 what we leave behind for you. I can show you what's

2 in the kit. It has a pamphlet on the use of the drug,
3 and the drugs that it works on and how to use it.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ALICKA-SAMUEL: But
5 outside of the kit like just other like-like places
6 they can go for treatment in the area or just the
7 catchment area of where the-the ambulance is
8 dispatched out of or-I don't know clean syringe
9 information and--

10 JAMES BOOTH: interposing] Well, that's
11 one of the reasons we encourage people to go to the
12 hospital with us. The ambulance crew may not be from
13 the local neighborhood. The ambulance crew may be
14 relocated for the day. It may not be familiar with
15 the area. So, what we like to do is we like to
16 encourage people to go to the hospital for two
17 reasons. The first reason they can receive services
18 at the hospital that we can't offer them, social
19 services, referral, rehabilitation, and-and other
20 medical services that they need for general health.
21 The other issue is that if we've just given them
22 Narcan and Naloxone, the half life of the drug may be
23 shorter than the half life of the elicited substance or
24 the prescription substance that they've accidentally
25 abused. So, the Naloxone wears off and the other

2 drug kicks in again. That's one of the reasons why
3 we want to get somebody to the hospital because they
4 can be observed and medically monitored so we don't
5 have let's say relax, you know, down the road an hour
6 or two later when the half life of a drug is shorter
7 than the drug that you've taken.

8 CHIEF ASAEDA: And I know you're asking
9 in general, but for this hit that the Chief has
10 mentioned in the instruction sheet, there is some
11 information about rehabilitation resources and such
12 because we are going to provide that. So, in our
13 discussion with the DOHMH, we were able to get that
14 onto the sheet. I know you're asking specifically
15 broadly, but at least for this part we have that.

16 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: And how many
17 languages is the flyer translated into?

18 CHIEF BOOTH: I'd have to look at it and
19 tell you. I see this one is in English, sir the one
20 that I have.

21 CHIEF ASAEDA: Yes, but we are—with DOHMH
22 we—they've translated it into Spanish. So, we're
23 hoping to get that out, and I believe they said
24 Russian at the moment.

2 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: So, there's
3 definitely a plan. Sometimes in this building if you
4 blink there's a new language flyer or legislation
5 that will appear. So, I'll just take your word that
6 you're going to work towards translating into in more
7 languages?

8 CHIEF BOOTH: We—we are—through DOHMH we
9 are working on having it in different languages.

10 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: Okay, and—and I
11 guess I should just ask this question on the record,
12 is there any harm reduction advice given in the kit
13 or by the EMS responders? Needle exchange sites or
14 things like that?

15 JAMES BOOTH: I mean when we—interact
16 with somebody who—who we've given Naloxone to and—and
17 we—we try to do some education, you know, obviously
18 we try to tell them that the behavior that they're
19 engaging is—is not something that's you know,
20 conducive with, you know, a good lifestyle and that's
21 why we want to get them off to the hospitals so
22 there's a higher level of care where there's social
23 workers who are trained and certified to help manage
24 these individuals at a greater level than the
25 ambulance personnel can do.

2 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: Okay, I—I have
3 nothing else to ask. I just want to say thanks for
4 bringing these. I actually—in my neighborhood, I
5 carry these in my car, which is pretty—it's pretty
6 sad to say. I haven't had to use it yet, thankfully,
7 but there's always one in my car. So thank you very
8 much for coming.

9 CHIEF MCKAVANAGH: Appreciate it. Thank
10 you.

11 CHIEF CASCIO: Okay. [pause]

12 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: So, the next panel
13 will be Van Asher and Carl Gindolfo. If anyone else
14 would like to testify on the bill, you could see the
15 sergeant-at-arms. [pause] So, I guess we'll start
16 from the gentleman to my right, your left.

17 VAN ASHER: [off mic/difficult to hear]
18 Good afternoon. My name Van Asher, and I'm the
19 Syringe Access Manager as seen on car this after,
20 that Syringe Exchange Program in the South Bronx, and
21 I'm also the new team at this stage I think what is
22 my refresher [on mic] my refresher, which I recently
23 received my refresher EMS course training. We
24 discussed overdose and Naloxone was a half hour. To
25 answer your previous question. That's the extent of

2 the training. One of the things David Tarantino a
3 Senior Medical Advisor to the U.S. Customs Border
4 Protection just dispelled the myth touching any
5 amount of Fentanyl is likely to cause severe illness,
6 injury or death, which I just wanted to address
7 because there's been a lot of fear about possible
8 death from accidental exposure from touching, and
9 just have worked in syringe exchange for 26 years
10 I've probably been exposed to Fentanyl several times
11 unbeknownst to myself over the last several years,
12 and have no special immunity and I've reversed
13 several overdoses myself with no adverse effects. I
14 think we really need to take a moment and acknowledge
15 that the spike in overdose death rate, but it's also
16 a scary time to be a first responder, and it reminds
17 me of early on in the HIV epidemic when people were
18 afraid to provide CPR, and these were myths that we
19 were both able to dispel. People weren't becoming
20 infected with HIV from performing mouth-to-mouth and
21 people aren't overdosing treating people who are
22 experiencing opioid overdose, but hysteria is an
23 epidemic as well, and that's one that also needs to
24 be quelled so much in the same way. Often times,
25 and—and correct me if I was wrong. It seemed that

1 they said with the Leave Behind Program, which is so
2 needed and something I've been vying for years that
3 if someone refuses to go to the hospital that they
4 are not given kit, and that is the person that most
5 needs the kit because they're most likely to
6 experience a fatal overdose, and was—was that what
7 was said? Okay, we'll—we'll check, and I know—I know
8 that once someone gets to the hospital, they're met
9 by one of the Department of Health wellness
10 advocates, and it is there that they're given
11 information on harm reduction programs and centers,
12 but there is no reason that that information cannot
13 be given, and put in a kit and I think it is most
14 important that the person that chooses not to go to
15 the hospital, and people don't got to hospitals for
16 several reasons. Historically, if you identify as a
17 drug user, you're treated poorly, and the amount of
18 stigma and shame that we attach to drug users only
19 often increases drug use, and we're seeing new people
20 overdose fatally that we haven't before from the
21 introduction of illicitly manufactured Fentanyl being
22 mixed in with the street drug supply. If we just
23 look statistically in 2015, 10% of Cocaine related
24 fatal overdoses that did not involve Heroin, involved
25

1 Fentanyl. In 2016, that number was 37%, which is a
2 61% increase. So there are people that use Cocaine
3 so infrequently they don't even consider themselves
4 drug users that are at high risk for a massive opioid
5 overdose, and that's staggering. We're a drug using
6 society. There are coffee cups all around us.
7 Coffee used to be illegal. That's how we're taught
8 to think about drugs. It's more about the lack of
9 quality control and 40% of the fatal overdoses that
10 were related to opioids last year were from
11 prescription medication. We also have an over-
12 medicating problem that we're not talking about. So,
13 if someone is refusing to go to the hospital, there's
14 a slew of reasons, their partner and families may not
15 know about their drug use history. So, if let's say
16 I had an overdose and didn't want to go to the
17 hospital, and I was with this gentleman, if you said,
18 Hey, we're going to give you guy a kit because the
19 Naloxone we gave you to reverse your overdose is only
20 going to last 30 to 90 minutes, but the drugs you did
21 are going to last longer, and you may continue to
22 overdose when the Naloxone wears off. So, if you see
23 your friend continue to overdose, you can save the
24 life—their life if you don't call 911 again, and what
25

1 that will do is also relieve some of the pressure
2 from EMS returning back to a scene, which I know.
3 I've spoken to many EMS in certain states like Ohio
4 they've been talking about not administering Naloxone
5 to people more than a few times, which is deciding
6 who lives and dies, and that's kind of like saying
7 we're not going to give people insulin more than a
8 couple of times if we see the same people, which I
9 can tell you as an EMT would see people with insulin
10 related situations several times because of their
11 diet, and not eating after taking insulin regularly.
12 I just wanted to say if EMS would leave Naloxone with
13 people that refused to go to the hospital, and in
14 there, there are inserts on harm reduction programs,
15 and they take a moment to say this is how to use the
16 kit. Aside from just having the answer in there, and
17 it only takes about five minutes to do a really quick
18 training especially with someone that is a drug user
19 that knows how to identify an overdose. This will
20 do a couple of things. It's going to cut down on
21 accidental fatal overdose. It's going to change how
22 people who use drugs see EMS. It's going to change
23 how EMS treat people who use drugs because they're
24 going to realize that drug use is ubiquitous in New
25

2 York and we're going to see how more of the patient--
3 we're going to see more of the patient rather than
4 the stigma behind drug use, and the long term outcome
5 will be that people will be more likely to access EMS
6 and have less fear. Because people are still afraid
7 that if let's say I overdose and my overdose is fatal
8 and he placed the call, he may be treated as a-- I
9 mean even though the little blue card in there is
10 supposed to exonerate you from prosecution. It's not
11 in other states, and people are still scared to call
12 and report. So, if EMS is working more in kind with
13 people who use drugs, we can shift how people who use
14 drugs see EMS, and if police would also do Leave
15 Behind as well because they see people everyday on
16 their beat they have relationships with that use
17 drugs, that aren't necessarily overdosing, and they
18 could go up to them and say hey I see you everyday.
19 I just am not here to harass you. I just want to
20 make sure. Do you guys have Naloxone kits? Because
21 even though we don't know each other, I don't--I see
22 you everyday, I don't want to see you die, and that
23 will change the conversation, and how people who use
24 drugs see police and how they see other people in
25 uniforms. And the last thing I want to say

2 additionally, if you want to prevent fatal overdose
3 with opioids, we need to open a more—we need to open
4 opioid prevention sites. There are over 100
5 worldwide. There has not been one single overdose
6 fatality in any one of them. The Mayor has approved
7 for--last year in the five boroughs we had 1,441
8 fatal opioid related overdoses, which is up from
9 1,374 the year before. This isn't going away, and if
10 we want to save our fellow New Yorkers it's just time
11 for change. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: Thank you, sir.
13 Just to point out that the FDOI does leave the kits
14 with people who refused to go to the hospital

15 VAN ASHER: Okay.

16 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: So, just to—we
17 found that out when you asked.

18 VAN ASHER: Thanks.

19 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: We—we—we had
20 somebody dig. Next Carl or Oren to you want to speak?

21 OREN BARZILAY: I was running a little
22 behind so Carl is going to cover for me. So, I'll
23 go. Good afternoon. My name is Oren Barzilay, and I
24 serve as President of Local 2507, which represents
25 4,200 uniformed Emergency Medical Technicians,

1 Paramedics and Fire Inspectors. Thank you for the
2 opportunity to testify today. As you all are no
3 doubt—as you are well aware, EMS is on the front line
4 of the ever-growing opioid crisis. Every seven hours
5 someone dies of a drug overdose in our city. More
6 New Yorkers die of drug overdose than homicides,
7 suicides and motor vehicle crashes combined.
8 Overdose deaths in New York City have increased for
9 six consecutive years. The desired long-term, long-
10 term goal for opioid addicted patients should be
11 providing them with an opportunity to engage with
12 Mental Health and substance abuse professionals who
13 may be able to use addiction interaction techniques
14 to help the patient agree to a drug treatment
15 program. Stroke, heart attack and trauma patient
16 benefits—benefit from designated facilities and
17 specialized treatment teams. Yet our only option for
18 overdose treatment in traditional EMS model is to
19 transport the patient to an emergency department that
20 is unlikely to offer the type of recovery services
21 the patient needs. The reality in EMS of treating an
22 overdose is to provide initial resuscitation to a
23 non-breathing victim. Narcan is a resuscitation
24 drug, not a treatment modality. Undoubtedly, Narcan
25

2 administration is critical intervention to a non-
3 breathing patient. However, Narcan-Narcan has a
4 life-has a half life of 60 to 90 minutes. So,
5 therefore, Narcan is in reality a very short-term
6 solution to a long-term epidemic problem. Patients
7 who are-arrived or revived via Narcan, often refuse
8 transportation or further intervention. A patient
9 can often-can often become violent as they experience
10 withdrawal symptoms. That combined with the never-
11 ending volume of other requests for EMS response
12 mitigates the ability of pre-hospital care providers
13 to meaningful engage the patient. If the goal of the
14 Council is to affect long-term solutions, not by a
15 pocket full of posies on a modern plague, I strongly
16 suggest establishing opioid response teams. After
17 compiling and analyzing firmographic and geographic
18 data, these things could be deployed to neighborhoods
19 with the highest incidents of reported overdoses.
20 They team could consist of a police officer, an EMT
21 who is trained in addiction counseling. This would
22 allow a healthcare professional under the protection
23 of a police officer to not only mitigate the medical-
24 the immediate medical emergency that allow an
25 adequate time to interact with the patient, relieving

2 the time consistent to allow for an attempt to
3 navigate patients with treatment programs in
4 designated emergency departments, discuss harm
5 reduction strategies and at least referrals for
6 medical assistant treatment programs. This thing
7 could also engage in longer of follow-up
8 interventions on a community based level. In
9 closing, I look forward to--with working with the
10 Council in combat--in combatting this crisis.

11 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: And just--just
12 explain the--the idea for--for opioid response teams.
13 Do any other municipalities do anything similar for
14 that?

15 OREN BARZILAY: There are other
16 municipalities across the country that have opioid
17 response teams.

18 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: Is there--is there
19 like one that would come to mind as like the--the
20 example?

21 OREN BARZILAY: San Francisco would come
22 to mind.

23 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: And it's the same
24 thing where the police or healthcare professionals--

25 OREN BARZILAY: Yes.

2 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: Same thing. Is
3 there any way you can forward us some information on
4 it--

5 OREN BARZILAY: Okay.

6 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: --just on San
7 Francisco?

8 OREN BARZILAY: Yeah, we'll--we'll do some
9 research and get it to you.

10 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: But I--I think
11 that's something the committee would be interested
12 in--in--in looking into in the future especially where--
13 where you have on Staten Island you have the Richmond
14 County District Attorney's Office already trying to
15 bring the law enforcement aspect into the--into the
16 overdose response and--and they--they've built some
17 cases, and they just took down some--some suppliers
18 which is a good things.

19 OREN BARZILAY: Yeah.

20 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: Thank, thank you
21 guys. Appreciate it.

22 OREN BARZILAY: Okay. That's it? Okay.
23 My colleague is pointing to me. (sic)

24 FEMALE SPEAKER: I apologize. I
25 apologize.

2 MALE SPEAKER: Sorry, that, yeah, just to
3 thank you for your time to day. I just want to rebut
4 some of the things that the city actually got up here
5 and testified about or spoke about. I mean there is
6 a great difference between the ALS and BLS care that
7 is given for overdose and I know Chief Booth spoke a
8 little bit about the training that goes into it, and-
9 and being, you know, paramedics being trained a
10 little bit more, but the difference in New York City
11 Protocols and you can reference it via the New York
12 City RAMSCA website that [coughs] excuse me, at the
13 CFR BLS level, you're instructed to administer one
14 milligram either of or via inter day's route, which
15 is a little bit more than what the medics administer
16 whether it's giving IV and it's giving IN or-or I-or
17 intermuscular, which brings upon a host of problems,
18 an I know that Oren had referenced it in his
19 testimony as well about the violence and the-the
20 patient actually coming out of a withdrawal and
21 becoming violent, which is a problem for us. So, you
22 know, I-I think going forward with this we're also
23 just to speak about the ALSK, you're-we're also able
24 to intubate patients, which is we put a breathing
25 tube basically down their throat into their lungs.

2 We're able to monitor their oxygen saturation level,
3 which is—isn't available for all the BLS crews that
4 are out there. So, there's definitely things that
5 the department or steps that the department can take.
6 You know, we look forward to working with them, and—
7 and—and, of course, with your committee as well in—in
8 getting some of us the technology that might be
9 necessary for it, but the education is the most
10 important thing that I think we need to do going
11 forward. Being an instructor myself, you see the
12 very limited amount of time that we're given even to
13 do the—the—the CME or the Continuing Medical
14 Education on the Leave Behind kits, which is
15 important and it's a vital thing to—to have out there
16 obviously. And just to touch on that very quickly
17 anybody that overdoses get in Our Camp Kit, (sic)
18 whether they are left on scene and they refuse to go
19 to the hospital or if they're transported to the
20 hospital. The thing that we're not giving them are
21 the services that they need, which would be in the
22 Exchange Program information, counseling, short-term
23 rehab. Even as Oren testified that there are very
24 few hospitals that offer outpatient or rehab
25 facilities or even a detox facility. I know most of

2 the city hospitals, and I don't want to speak out of
3 turn here for HHC, but they offer them, but what we
4 need to do is we need to educate our EMTs and our
5 paramedics on the aftercare that we don't really get
6 to do. I just stopped the—the Councilwoman out in
7 the hall because the facility she was referring to is
8 very well know to me and, you know, my colleagues
9 from, you know, my career days when I was on the
10 street working Brooklyn. It's 599 Ralph. It's a
11 men's shelter, and very often we're not given the
12 opportunity because we don't have the proper
13 education. I think the department can go—go forward
14 a little bit more in training us, and giving us the
15 information that we need to give to the patients that
16 are on the street. You know, I can tell you all the
17 stroke centers in New York. I can tell you all the
18 trauma centers, the replant, the burn centers, the
19 cardiac catheterization centers, but I can't tell you
20 where all the rehabs are and—and that's a problem. I
21 mean treatment obviously is something that needs to
22 be done. The aftercare when they get out of the
23 hospital I understand that they connect them with
24 social workers, but it's the aftercare when they get
25 out of the hospital, and from my studies with

2 addiction, it's when the—the addict quote/unquote if
3 you want to call them that, when they're ready to get
4 treated, they're going to get treated. So, we have to
5 continue to plant that seed and give them the
6 information that they need, and give them all the
7 resources that are available, you know, that the city
8 has to provide for them. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: Thank you. Thank
10 you very much.

11 OREN BARZILAY: [interposing] and just
12 one other thing. I'm sorry, and it's now one person
13 every six hours instead of every seven.

14 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: Okay. So, it's one
15 person every six hours?

16 OREN BARZILAY: Yeah, one fatality every
17 six hours now.

18 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: I see.

19 OREN BARZILAY: Yeah.

20 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: Thank you, thank
21 you. The last panel is Mr. Dave Samuels.

22 DAVID SAMUELS: Thank you. Yes. [pause]

23 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: And we're switching
24 gears I believe to 1054. Good to see you again. You
25 can begin.

2 DAVID SAMUELS: Good afternoon. I'm
3 David Samuels. I'm an electrical contractor.
4 [background comments] I'm sorry?

5 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: Just speak into it
6 a bit more.

7 DAVID SAMUELS: Sure.

8 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: Thank you.

9 DAVID SAMUELS: My name is David Samuels.
10 I'm an electrical contractor. I represent the New
11 York Electrical Contractors Association, and some
12 affiliated associations. As a contractor we're
13 concerned with the installation of those plans that
14 have been approved by the Fire Department, and our
15 concerns are not in terms of design or a filing for
16 plan examination. Our business is primarily with the
17 Bureau of Fire Prevention, and what we have to do is
18 install the work that is specified on those plans
19 that are examined and approved, and then we must be
20 inspected to see that have, in fact, conformed to the
21 plans and specifications. And what I'm here today to
22 request is that this legislation be expanded so that
23 we can be part of this online process. It's—it's very
24 important to us that we conform to our contracts with
25 our buildings and—and customers, and at the same time

2 comply with FDNY's planned specs and requirements.

3 Every contract of any magnitude has clauses in it
4 that that says "time is of essence" and it's very
5 important to us to be able to complete our work on
6 time, accurately and to be able to demonstrate that
7 those fire alarm systems that we have installed are,
8 in fact, operational, and conform to the plans and
9 specifications and are done in time for the customer
10 of our contractors to utilize their space.

11 Heretofore, we have had the ability to file
12 inspections online, but unknown to us, it was-it-it-
13 it stopped. Presently, in order for an electrical-a
14 license electrical contractor to apply for an
15 inspection date requires that a person travel to
16 Metrotech in Brooklyn on-on four or five days a week
17 (coughs) and-and make application for up to three
18 inspections on one day. If there's five inspections,
19 you must come back the second day to-to-to file for
20 two more applications. This process is-is-it's old.
21 We have public safety issues here that we've
22 addressed with the Department of Buildings in-in an
23 online situation, [door bangs] which has worked very
24 smoothly and we've had the ability to meet with the
25 Bureau of Fire Prevention and discuss many issues

1 this included. The Bureau has attempted to-to do
2 this, but some reason there has never been a follow-
3 through. So, we're-we're imploring the city to
4 incorporate the inspection aspect of filing in this
5 new computerization. The-the situation for
6 contractors has been that every year the backlog of
7 uninspected work continues to increase, and that's
8 very concerning to us. My particular firm is
9 operating in New York City for 90 years. Our aspect
10 of the electrical construction industry is interior
11 alterations, and most of our work is in Manhattan and
12 our staff is in the neighborhood of 200 people, and
13 it's not uncommon for us to perform between 1,200 and
14 1,500 installations a year, and a very high
15 percentage of these require inspections. Included in
16 the hand-out today on the last page is an application
17 showing those components that must be presented to
18 Fire Department. If I could make an analogy of a
19 chain holding a heavy weight, every link in that
20 chain is necessary to sustain the-the load, and we
21 have a multi-faceted process in terms of being
22 inspected. We must submit seven different kinds of
23 documentation. We-we require assigned as-built
24 drawing from the engineer of record. Many times our
25

1 installation—our inspection takes place on overtime,
2 and it's necessary to assemble associated contractors
3 whether they're H-V-A-C, equipment manufacturers,
4 kitchen equipment and so forth, the building
5 personnel, the contractor's representative and—and,
6 in fact, if anything goes askance, any document is
7 wrong or it's missing or—or the inspector can't make
8 a visit, there's a—there's a hugely expensive
9 situation that occurs and it has to be redone so that
10 we believe that with the instant—incorporation.

12 Excuse me. Incorporation of this on-line process that
13 we can expedite errors, omissions and—and make sure
14 that the communication is—is excellent. It would be
15 very important to all of us in the electrical
16 contracting industry to have this modernization in
17 incorporated and we—we would hope in the future that
18 we can continue to have the dialogue that we've had
19 with the Bureau of Prevention and the Fire Department
20 and are thankful that we can have these—these
21 conversations. The—the handout that I will not read
22 to you because it doesn't have that much appeal,
23 frankly. It's factual. Some of the facts are a
24 little bit hyperbolic, but nonetheless they're
25 accurate, and, um, I—I would remind the Council that

2 the Inspection Department is fee-driven. It has the
3 ability to have significant income, and it can have a
4 great, great modernity from the—the use of those
5 funds to expedite the process. If there's any
6 questions, I'd be glad to address them.

7 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: No, I mean. Were
8 you encouraged at all with—with what they said today
9 about seeking to—to—were you encouraged at all by
10 what they said in terms of seeking to put as much
11 stuff online as possible?

12 DAVID SAMUELS: Well, I—I think that the
13 emphasis has been plan examination, and that's a—
14 that's a function of—of design professions whether
15 they're architects or engineers, and—and we're in a
16 different place in the Fire Department. We're in the
17 Bureau of Fire Protection. Tech—Technical Services
18 is a different group. The—the process of—of fire
19 alarm installation actually starts with the Building
20 Department, and when they provide approval of the
21 concept, then the drawings that are designed by the
22 fire professional, the engineer or architect are sent
23 to the Fire Department for review, and when those
24 plans are reviewed, they're then able to be
25 disseminated for estimation and then award and

2 installation. After the installation is completed,
3 we request an inspection so that, in fact, the—the
4 inspector comes and sees that that design has been
5 conformed with, and it functions properly.

6 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: Well, thank you,
7 Mr. Samuels and thank you for your honest assessment
8 of your prepared remarks.

9 DAVID SAMUELS: Thank you, sir.

10 CHAIRPERSON BORELLI: It's most
11 appreciated. Thank you. Is there any other
12 individuals willing to testify? Seeing none, thank
13 you. [gavel] the meeting is adjourned.

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date September 28, 2018