

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

November 8, 2018
Start: 10:11 a.m.
Recess: 12:21 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway-Committee Rm, 14th Fl.

B E F O R E: INEZ D. BARRON
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

LAURIE A. CUMBO
ROBERT F. HOLDEN
BEN KALLOS
YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Christopher Rosa
Interim Vice Chancellor for Student Affairs at
CUNY

Zina Richardson
University Director of Career Services and
Professional Development at CUNY

Katie Naylor
Director for Career and Professional Development
Institute at City College of CUNY

Angie Kamath
University Dean of Continuing Education and
Workforce Programs at CUNY

Lisanette Rosario
Co-Chair of CSAC and the Director of Career
Services at Hostos Community College

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1

[gavel]

2

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Good morning.

3

[good morning]

4

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And welcome to

5

today's oversight hearing on careers services and job

6

placement at CUNY. I'm Council Member Inez Barron,

7

the Committee... Chair of the Committee on Higher

8

Education and a proud CUNY alum... yep, but we're not

9

supposed to do that so we, we do this, it's the sign

10

language here. this is the first time the committee

11

is hearing a topic specific to the services CUNY

12

provides with student career planning and job

13

placement. The topic is timely and perhaps even

14

overdue. There is an immeasurable value to higher

15

education. Apart from the knowledge accumulated

16

through academic study, numerous studies have shown

17

that a post-secondary credential improves access to

18

desirable job opportunities and increases the

19

probability of upward social mobility, prospects that

20

build and increase incomes, supports families and

21

propel low income students into the middle class.

22

However, more often than not it takes more than just

23

a degree to connect students to career opportunities.

24

This is especially true for students like many of

25

1
2 those who attend CUNY who lack networking connections
3 to employers that are common among wealthier, whiter
4 and less diverse students from elite institutions of
5 higher education. a strong career planning office is
6 therefore essential to assisting lower income
7 students developing such connections and adequately
8 prepare for opportunities that could lead to gainful
9 and fulfilling employment. With one of the most
10 diverse student populations in the world, CUNY
11 strives to fulfill its legislatively mandated mission
12 to be an integrated system of higher education that
13 serves as quote, "a vehicle for the upward mobility
14 of the disadvantaged in the city of New York". In
15 furtherance of this mission, we know that CUNY
16 generally offers resources to aid students seeking
17 post-graduate employment and I'm looking forward to
18 learning about these resources and their outcomes,
19 but they're also appears to be inequities from campus
20 to campus in terms of services that are provided. For
21 example, Baruch College offers students a mobile
22 application described as on the go employment tool
23 that helps students search and apply for jobs, RSVP
24 for recruit... for recruiting events and among other
25 features connect with employers before, during and

1
2 after career fairs. Baruch also like most if not all
3 other CUNY schools offers resume preparation
4 services, mock interviewing and online career guides.
5 In contrast, Guttman Community College has a hard to
6 find student opportunities web page sponsored by its
7 Office of partnership and community engagement that
8 very generally describes offered services, it lacks
9 resource links, guides and even information about the
10 office's hours of operation. And while the bulk of
11 senior and community colleges offer basic career
12 resources, the disparity of these offerings and the,
13 the varying degrees of their visibility on college
14 websites seems to bely CUNY's mission as an
15 integrated institutional vehicle for upward mobility.
16 Indeed, CUNY has an obligation to help students find
17 meaningful employment through resource promotion and
18 visibility, career awareness and employer recruitment
19 for example. CUNY must also track resource outcomes
20 so that it can gauge the success of its resource
21 strategies and develop ways to improve them. This is
22 what we intend to explore today during today's
23 hearing and I'm looking forward to hearing from CUNY
24 on this important topic. I want to acknowledge my
25 colleagues in the Higher Education Committee who are

1
2 present and that's Council Member Ben Kallos. I would
3 also like to thank Joyce Simmons, my Chief of Staff;
4 Ndigo Washington, my CUNY Liaison and Director of
5 Legislation; Chloe Rivera, the Community... the
6 Committee's Policy Analyst; Paul Sinegal and Yariv
7 Shavitt the Committee's new Finance Analyst. Now I
8 will ask the Counsel to administer the oath.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: Good morning, please
10 raise your right hands. Do you affirm to tell the
11 truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in
12 your testimony before this committee and to respond
13 honestly to Council Member's questions? Please state
14 your names for the record.

15 ZINA RICHARDSON: Zina Richardson.

16 CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Christopher Rosa.

17 KATIE NAYLOR: Katie Naylor

18 ANGIE KAMATH: Angie Kamath

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you so much
20 and you may begin with your testimony.

21 CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Thank you, Chair
22 Barron, good morning Chair Barron and Council Member
23 Kallos. Thank you for the opportunity... [cross-talk]
24
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Let me just read the
3 names again because I want to give your positions...

4 [cross-talk]

5 CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Sure... [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Christopher Rosa,
7 who is the Interim Vice Chancellor for Student
8 Affairs at CUNY; Zina Richardson who is the
9 University Director of Career Services and
10 Professional Development at CUNY; Katie Naylor who is
11 the Director for Career and Professional Development
12 Institute at City College of CUNY; and Angie Kamath
13 who is the University Dean of Continuing Education
14 and Workforce Programs at CUNY, thank you.

15 CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Thank you Chair Barron
16 and again thank you for the opportunity of this
17 morning to appear before the Higher Education
18 Committee and present testimony on career services
19 and job placement at CUNY. As I mentioned, my name is
20 Chris Rosa and I'm honored to serve as CUNY's Interim
21 Vice Chancellor for Student Affairs. Our central
22 Office of Student Affairs is responsible for the
23 stewardship and development of CUNY's network of
24 campus-based career services centers. At CUNY, we
25 take great pride in the university's role in helping

1
2 generations of low income, first generation college
3 educated, underserved and immigrant students succeed.
4 CUNY's commitment to the career development of its
5 students, thank you, is an important dimension of
6 holistic commitment to their success. As you
7 mentioned I'm very proud to be joined today by my
8 colleagues; Angie Kamath, University Dean for
9 Continuing Education and Workforce Development; Zina
10 Richardson, University Director of Career Services;
11 Katie Naylor, Director of the City College Career
12 Services Office and Co-Chair of the Career Services
13 Association of CUNY, our true content experts when it
14 comes to career readiness and career success at the
15 University. To quote our University Interim
16 Chancellor, Dr. Vita Rabinowitz, with social mobility
17 increasingly used to determine which colleges are
18 contributing most to the American dream CUNY's
19 singular quality, affordability and diversity set it
20 apart as perhaps the most potent engine of economic
21 advancement in the United States. In light of our
22 abiding commitment to social mobility through higher
23 education, we were proud to learn that nine senior
24 colleges and two community colleges at CUNY again
25 dominated the chronical of higher education's

1
2 rankings of public U.S. campuses with the greatest
3 success in lifting low income students into the
4 middle class. Indeed, our network of campus-based
5 career services centers is among the key factors that
6 give CUNY the capacity to serve as an unprecedented
7 engine of social mobility. CUNY's 2016 to 2020 master
8 plan, the connected university emphasizes that as the
9 21st century labor market has become increasingly
10 complex and technological advances have speeded up
11 the pace of change in specific occupations, CUNY has
12 expanded its services and support to students,
13 graduates and employers around career preparation and
14 success with the goals of improving job career
15 outcomes for students and better meeting employer
16 needs. Towards these ends, CUNY's career services
17 centers are dedicated to educating, advising, and
18 connecting students to career and post graduate
19 opportunities. Our goal is to provide comprehensive
20 services that help students apply their academic
21 knowledge and personal values to the world of work or
22 post graduate study. These centers assist students as
23 well as CUNY alumni with all phases of their career
24 development. CUNY has 27 career centers across 24
25 campuses, the career services centers are staffed by

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 professionals with expertise in the areas of career
3 advising, employer relations and information
4 technology. At many colleges there are advisors who
5 specialize and work with students majoring in
6 different disciplines including business, humanities
7 and STEM. Several campuses offer evening and weekend
8 hours, all career centers assist students with
9 getting internships as well as post graduate
10 employment. Career centers offer early career
11 expiration, career coaching, resume and cover letter
12 reviews, mock interviews, career events, career
13 resource libraries, mentorship, professional
14 development, job and internship searches, career
15 action plans and personal branding. In addition,
16 CUNY's career services offices link students to co-
17 curricular experiential opportunities and thereby
18 helps students to transform academic knowledge into
19 human capital that readies them for competitive
20 employment. Another core responsibility for CUNY's
21 career centers is connecting with and providing
22 services to employers. Campus career centers create
23 many different kinds of opportunities for employers
24 to interact with students. Career centers offer
25 employ... resume referrals, organize job fairs,

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 information sessions, company visits and interviewing
3 on campus and offer access to free online job and
4 internship databases. In addition, approved employers
5 are able to search databases created by the colleges
6 that contain student resumes so that employers can
7 identify students who possess the qualifications and
8 skills they're seeking. CUNY's master plan also
9 emphasizes the importance of digital resources.
10 Career support is an essential element of student
11 services, CUNY's college career centers will expand
12 the use of digital resources to improve the flow of
13 information about job growth areas, internships and
14 employment opportunities. Our career services
15 leverage technology in order to scale their services
16 to serve more of CUNYs more than 270,000 students.
17 All centers use online job posting systems, many
18 leverage e-portfolios with digital badging to
19 validate skills acquisition, digital tutorials, web-
20 based career counseling, career webinars, and virtual
21 interview preparation. Career centers throughout CUNY
22 rely on technologies that provide an avenue to market
23 job and internship opportunities. All centers use job
24 posting systems online including simplicity, a career
25 services management tool and online job database.

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 Most campuses also use Vault, an industry exploration
3 platform that helps students check out thousands of
4 resumes, ratings and job and internship posts.

5 Furthermore, CUNY is in the process of procuring a
6 digital enterprise solution career services platform
7 that will empower CUNY to better leverage all career
8 services assets across our system to connect our
9 talented students to career opportunities. This
10 system will also be forward facing to employers
11 allowing them to post job openings directly so that
12 they can be accessed directly by student candidates
13 across our university. In closing, CUNY's career
14 services centers play an essential role in career
15 development empowering students to develop those
16 aspects of their identities that are related to work,
17 helping them to link what they're learning in the
18 classroom to a range of possible career pathways and
19 raising their career aspirations through this
20 process. Our career services prepare CUNY's
21 extraordinarily talented and diverse candidates to
22 take their rightful place in the workforce of our
23 city, state, country and indeed around the world.

24 Thank you again very much for this opportunity to
25 speak as well as your ongoing commitment to the city

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 University of New York, it's now my pleasure to
3 introduce my colleague Zina Richardson who will
4 highlight in richer detail CUNY's commitment to
5 career services. Zina thank you.

6 ZINA RICHARDSON: Thank you Chris. Good
7 morning Chairperson Barron, members of the Higher
8 Education Committee, staff and guests. Thank you for
9 convening this oversight hearing on CUNY career
10 services and job placement. My name is Zina
11 Richardson and I am the University Director for
12 Career Services at the Central Office of Student
13 Affairs at the City University of New York. CUNY has
14 27 career centers across 24 community and senior
15 colleges and serves as an educational partner within
16 the CUNY system. One of the most important principles
17 in which... on which our services are based is our
18 commitment to preparing students to make informed
19 decisions about majors and careers all while
20 empowering them to develop and achieve their
21 professional aspirations. Students are taught how to
22 effectively market themselves and gain the
23 confidence, skills and knowledge needed to be career
24 ready in today's global workforce. No career center
25 is successful without the benefits of key

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 partnerships and collaborations. We are working to
3 assure that each center is developing sustainable
4 partnerships with alumni relations, fundraising and
5 development, admissions, academic advising, selected
6 facility, researchers, workforce developments,
7 student clubs and organizations and institutional
8 research and assessment. Our career centers offer a
9 suite of services that include individualized career
10 coaching and assessment as well as strategic
11 workshops and training that assist students and
12 alumni in building career skills through personal
13 branding, mock interviewing and effective
14 communication and networking. We place emphasis on
15 the career preparation work we do with students and
16 alumni as much as on employment outcomes. We follow
17 the principles for employment professionals of the
18 National Association of Colleges... of College and
19 Employers, NACE, the organization that governs the
20 profession of career services professionals. These
21 guidelines work to help both students and employers
22 get the most of... most of the recruitment process.
23 Practices must be fair to the students eager to be
24 considered for an opportunity within an organization.
25 Each of our 27 career centers coordinate with

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

1
2 employers and industry professionals to come to
3 campus for on campus recruiting event... activities,
4 conduct corporate site visits, organize speaker
5 panels, executive mentoring and networking events as
6 well as posting thousands of jobs and internships on...
7 each month on the campus career management system. In
8 general, the career centers strive to expand the
9 targeted focus of employers to include more students
10 rather than fewer. Keep in mind, career services are
11 optional for students and alumni. Services are
12 advertised through social media outlets, individual
13 campus websites, in class presentations, freshman
14 orientation, weekly emails, and student clubs and
15 organizations. Career centers have increasingly been
16 called upon to do more in helping produce the
17 successful career outcomes of our graduates. We
18 respond to numerous requests for assistance such as
19 providing candidates for the 3-1-1 and NYCHA call
20 centers, interviewing and selecting students to
21 participate in the America Needs You Fellows Program,
22 an intensive two year program for high achieving, low
23 income first generation college students, the Clinton
24 Global Initiative Internship Program, the SEEK CD
25 Internship Program and work closely with DCAS and the

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 Administration for Children's Services to streamline
3 the application process for CUNY students. The
4 central office of Student Affairs supports the career
5 centers by providing value ad resources, information
6 and services. We recognize the ongoing need to
7 prepare students for lifelong learning as well as the
8 need to increase the number of internship
9 coordinators, career coaches and industry liaisons
10 that assist and mentor our students daily. Over the
11 past ten years, our office has funded the Vault dot
12 com platform, an influential rankings, ratings and
13 review of thousands of top employers and internship
14 programs across the country. This past spring, we
15 funded three borough wide industry career fairs, an
16 opportunity for students across the CUNY system to
17 come together and gauge... and engage with employers.
18 These events yielded over 700 student participants.
19 In addition, we partnered with the National
20 Association of Colleges and Employers to fund ongoing
21 professional development training for our diverse
22 career services staff that lead to credentialing and
23 certification. In partnership with University
24 Workforce Development, we are now in the process of
25 securing a university wide RFP for a unified.. a

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 uniform career management system that will manage,
3 collect and report on internship and employment data,
4 industry engagement and outreach efforts. The Career
5 Services Association of CUNY is the professional
6 association of career services professionals from the
7 senior, community, graduate schools and the CUNY
8 central office. We share information about best
9 practices and collaborate with each other on various
10 career related presentations and projects. Katie
11 Naylor is the Director for the Career and
12 Professional Development Institute at the City
13 College of New York and Co-Chair of CSAC. Katie will
14 provide more information on the role of CSAC and
15 detailed points on the services and resources
16 available at our career centers. Katie.

17 KATIE NAYLOR: Good morning Chairperson
18 Barron and the members... and the members of the Higher
19 Education Committee. I am Katie Naylor, Co-President
20 of the Career Services Association of CUNY also known
21 as CSAC and Director of the Career and Professional
22 Development Institute at City College of New York.
23 Thank you for the opportunity to provide an overview
24 of the services offered at the career centers across
25 CUNY. CSAC is comprised of 27 career services offices

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 across CUNY where the directors meet monthly to
3 coordinate career service efforts on the campuses as
4 well as plan professional development opportunities
5 for their staff. Every three years, the Career
6 Services Association of CUNY conducts a survey of the
7 27 career centers within CUNY to report on the
8 different activities, budget, and staffing that are
9 present at the different campuses. This is not a
10 required survey for a campus to complete. The most
11 recent survey was conducted during the summer of 2018
12 where 21 of the 27 career centers completed the
13 survey. This is... it is important to note that
14 activities and services do vary between campuses due
15 to... due to the needs of the students of a particular
16 campus or staffing and financial resources available
17 to a particular campus. My testimony will reflect
18 information gathered in the survey regarding the
19 services provided. All of the career centers offer
20 career counseling appointments, career workshops and
21 internship assistance; 80 percent offer career
22 assessment tools and host general career fairs while
23 over 70 percent offer drop-in career counseling,
24 career resource library and work with academic
25 departments and 62 percent of the career centers host

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

1
2 specialized career fairs. Other additional services
3 some campuses offer include virtual career
4 counseling, for credit career classes, coordinated
5 work study programs, credential filing, leadership
6 and professional development programs. Last, 67
7 percent of the career centers manage an internship
8 program. All career centers assist students with
9 getting internships, all of the campuses assist
10 students with getting internships through resume
11 critiques, cover letter reviews, and interview prep.
12 These same activities are also offered to those
13 students seeking full time employment. Additional
14 assistance provided by a majority of the campuses
15 includes employer recruitment events and an online
16 internship database. Other assistant... other assistant
17 campuses indicated includes mentorship programs,
18 linked in profile assistance, employer referrals,
19 employer site visits and workshops. The campus career
20 centers are also involved in other career services
21 related programming outside of the student and
22 employer activities and services. All of the career...
23 all of the campus career centers indicated that they
24 are involved in new student orientation, 95 percent
25 of the career centers serve alumni, 62 percent of the

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 career centers are involved in the collection of post
3 graduate outcomes for their college, 35 percent of
4 the career centers are also involved in fundraising,
5 internship grants, CUNY EDGE, curriculum design, and
6 graduate school planning/advising, 24 percent are
7 involved in faculty development and transfer
8 advising. In addition to the services offered to
9 students, all CUNY career centers offer services to
10 employers to recruit students to their job and
11 internship opportunities. At a minimum the career
12 center has an online job database for employers to
13 post opportunities. Based on their indicated numbers,
14 the senior colleges serving more than 10,000 students
15 had an average of 4,658 jobs posted in the 2017/2018
16 academic year, while junior colleges serving more
17 than 10,000 students had an average of 1,315 jobs
18 posted in the 2017/2018 academic year. Based on their
19 indicated numbers, senior colleges serving more than
20 10,000 students had an average of 2,083 internships
21 posted in the 2017/2018 academic year, while junior
22 colleges serving more than 10,000 students had an
23 average of 312 internships posted in the 2017/2018
24 academic year. In addition to posting opportunities,
25 over 90 percent of the 21 career centers offer

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

1
2 information sessions and contributing to mock
3 interviews as an employer service, 80 percent further
4 offer participation in networking events and over 70
5 percent each, each also offer interview days,
6 participation and career panels and tabling, 95
7 percent of the colleges offer career fairs to their
8 students. In the academic year 2017/2018 the mean
9 total number of students attending the career fairs
10 hosted by a career center is 1,166 students. All of
11 these events, services and activities do get marketed
12 to students, when marketing services and events to
13 students all of the career centers utilize email,
14 emails to students and enlisting the assistance of
15 faculty to notify students. More than 90 percent use
16 fliers and posters posted around campus in addition
17 to social media platforms, 85 percent of the campuses
18 partner with other departments, enlist the assistance
19 of academic advisors to notify students and notify
20 student clubs and organizations at the colleges, 50
21 percent make short classroom presentations to market
22 services and events to students. Other options
23 utilized by specific career centers include using
24 texting, information posted on T.V. monitors in the
25 office and on campus taking their office out into the

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 hallways or weekly newsletters, videos and blogs.

3 These marketing strategies do vary among campuses due

4 to the evaluation of their effectiveness, given the

5 student population and staff, staffing resources. In

6 the academic year of 2017/2018, the mean total of

7 students attending all events hosted by a career

8 center except for career fairs at each campus is

9 2,587. The number of student attendee ranges from 158

10 to 9,100 per campus. I hope my testimony has provided

11 you with a strong understanding of the services

12 offered by the CUNY career centers, I will now

13 introduce Angie Kamath, the University Dean of

14 Continuing Education and Workforce Development.

15 ANGIE KAMATH: Thank you Katie. Good

16 morning Chair Barron. I'm really pleased to be here

17 today with my colleagues and.. to talk to you a little

18 bit more about our work. We want to just share this

19 morning the work that our team is involved in and

20 what we call... that we call CUNY Career Success

21 Initiatives. CUNY as you had noted has long been an

22 engine of career mobility for its students. We also

23 know from inside smart industry partners that our

24 students really can benefit from a more intentional

25 approach to creating strong career foundations for

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 their work. The CUNY Career Success Initiatives
3 provide funding, resources that can bring together
4 faculty, career services, staff and student affairs
5 professionals, academic advisors and other university
6 staff to create a comprehensive model that supports
7 CUNY students throughout their academic journey and
8 that connects their academic pursuits with
9 opportunities to build and explore their career
10 interests. Our objective is to make it possible for
11 every CUNY campus to take advantage of shared
12 technologies that we've hear a little bit about form
13 my colleagues, innovations, resources and best
14 practices to support the career needs of CUNY
15 students no matter their academic focus or status. In
16 2017, Interim Vice Chancellor Rosa and I began
17 working together to plan and implement a set of
18 initiatives from CUNY's strategic framework that
19 aimed to improve college access and readiness,
20 increase graduation rates and give graduates better
21 tools for achieving career success. Members of the
22 planning team involve faculty and staff from a
23 variety of colleges as well as the central office. We
24 also help focus groups with students to gain feedback
25 directly about their experiences. The team has been

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 engaged in developing a new career success strategy
3 at the University that addresses experiential
4 learning, instructional design and employment. CUNY
5 has identified 12 key New York City industry sectors
6 to focus on for this career success work. These
7 factors include the art and creative sector,
8 education, energy, finance, health care, hospitality,
9 the industrial and construction sector, life
10 sciences, nonprofit and community organizations, the
11 public sector and government agencies, technology and
12 transportation sectors. The key goals of this new
13 strategy include an intentional employer engagement
14 strategy with a, a sectoral focus, within this we're
15 going to build university wide capacity to organize
16 students, employers and faculty and professional
17 development, activities that are really specific to
18 these key sectors. We are working to create a clear
19 entry point to CUNY for employers that makes it
20 easier for employers to connect with relevant
21 academic programs and well-prepared students wherever
22 they are enrolled across our campuses. The second
23 goal of the strategy is to increase hands on learning
24 for students. We want to ensure that CUNY students
25 have developed and practiced foundational,

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 transferable and career readiness skills. We want to
3 ensure that we have an increasing number of paid
4 internship placements and full-time employment
5 placements for students. We want to make it easier
6 for all students across the university to find career
7 coaching and preparation opportunities and to access
8 opportunities that are relevant to their chosen
9 career path. The third goal of this new strategy is
10 to have industry informed academic programs and
11 course work. We are cultivating ongoing partnerships
12 between employers and CUNY faculty and academic
13 programs to enhance curriculum, expand student's
14 skill sets to meet job market demand and ultimately
15 to place more students into internships and jobs. And
16 finally, the fourth goal of this new strategy is to
17 create systemwide infrastructure and assessment
18 tools. We've heard from my colleagues about creating
19 a centralized data and evaluation system that can
20 really track learning, employment and wage outcomes
21 and then secondly, we really want to focus on
22 building up the infrastructure for sustainable
23 funding for this work. Over the past year we have
24 awarded 21 schools grants to improve job outcomes for
25 students, ensure that curriculum reflects the job

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 market and help... and to help to prepare students for
3 the world of work. Projects that we've funded include
4 opportunities to improve the transfer student career
5 preparation, to infuse advising with more career
6 focused content, and to work directly with the
7 faculty to enhance their course work and to assess
8 all students on their career readiness. These are
9 great ideas and we want to support them and scale up
10 the great work that's happening at CUNY campuses,
11 hopefully CUNY wide. This work is important, and we
12 have a clear body of research that really informs our
13 approach. As you stated Chair Barron, we know from
14 the data that young people with bachelor's degrees
15 are paid higher wages, have lower rates of
16 unemployment and are less likely to live in poverty
17 compared with those who only have a high school
18 diploma. Over the past 50 years we know that a
19 greater share of jobs in the U.S. have demanded a
20 post-secondary credential and this trend is projected
21 to continue. And we know that by 2020, 65 percent of
22 all jobs will require post-secondary education up
23 from a mere 28 percent, you know just a few decades
24 ago. We know this, but we also know that substantial
25 disparities as you noted in economic returns to

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

1
2 higher ed persists by gender and by race and so on
3 average women still earn an estimated 25 percent less
4 than men over the course of their lifetimes and
5 across all levels of educational attainment. The
6 earnings of African Americans and Latinos are
7 considerably less than those of their white and Asian
8 counterparts. Additional recent research highlights
9 the importance of first quality... of high quality
10 first jobs and the pitfalls of underemployment among
11 recent college graduates. The Burning Glass report
12 from earlier this year shared that a sample of
13 workers found that a considerable number, 43 percent,
14 of recent graduates were underemployed in their first
15 job and for those who were underemployed in their
16 first jobs they were five times more likely to remain
17 underemployed five years later than workers who were
18 not. The initial rates and long-term effects of
19 underemployment were really more pronounced among
20 women and men so again this speaks to why our work is
21 so important and why we really have to build
22 opportunities and access to our students. The City
23 University of New York is well positioned to address
24 these challenges into not only provide our students
25 with high quality education but to also prepare to...

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 prepare them to succeed in the labor market. We know
3 as Chris... as Vice... excuse me, Interim Vice Chancellor
4 Rosa noted that we have a really important
5 contribution to make to economic mobility of low-
6 income New Yorkers. We have also worked on large at
7 scale internship programs like the CUNY Service Core,
8 the Cultural Core, the STEM internships with the call
9 centers that my colleague Zina Richardson noted, and
10 these programs serve over 1,500 students each year in
11 paid work experiences. We have over 6,000 students
12 participating in career exploration activities in
13 this past year in the areas of technology, finance,
14 digital marketing and social justice and government
15 sector related areas. We've hired a team of business
16 outreach staff who work with employers to market our
17 talented, motivated and diverse student body. And
18 this is incredibly important so that we can make our
19 talent more accessible by making it easier for
20 employers to access our students. We know that we
21 need to invest in new and improved data sources and
22 practices so that students can be informed and make
23 informed choices. We know that and, and we plan to
24 update, and share labor market trends and demands
25 with the students as well. And then finally, we'll...

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 we will continue to structure career readiness
3 activities in collaboration with career services
4 centers into the pathways towards a CUNY degree so
5 again making sure that career related activities
6 aren't kind of a side activity but really are
7 embedded in the academic experience and so expanding
8 experiential learning and focusing on transferable
9 skills and courses are important, increasing
10 opportunities for internships, supporting the
11 construction and use of student networks and career
12 exploration and finally helping students to build
13 their social networks which will play a positive role
14 in employment and career attainment. There's a lot of
15 work happening and a lot of coordination across
16 campuses and within CUNY central. We have seen a new
17 energy and interest in sure... in ensuring that our
18 students and graduates are, are well prepared to have
19 access to strong economic mobility. We appreciate
20 your interest Chair Barron and the Council's interest
21 in our work and we hope that we may find ways to work
22 together to help more and more New Yorkers. Thank
23 you.

24 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Wow, that's a lot of
25 information, thank you so much to the panel for

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 bringing all of this information to us and we do have
3 some questions that we want to ask of you to help us
4 to further expand our understanding of the services
5 that are provided. So, in your testimony reference
6 was made to the fact that there are 27 career centers
7 across 24 campuses so who doesn't have and why?

8 ZINA RICHARDSON: Well we, we all have,
9 the... [cross-talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So... [cross-talk]

11 ZINA RICHARDSON: ...discrepancy... well
12 actually... [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay... [cross-talk]

14 ZINA RICHARDSON: ...we have Baruch College
15 that has four... [cross-talk]

16 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Right... [cross-talk]

17 ZINA RICHARDSON: ...distinct centers so
18 we, we each have a, a center or a service at, at
19 every location.

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, so there are
21 24 campuses, I keep getting 24 or 25... there are 25
22 campuses...

23 ANGIE KAMATH: The new medical school is
24 the 25th...

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Oh, okay... [cross-talk]

ANGIE KAMATH: So, the medical school I think is... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

ANGIE KAMATH: ...the one that doesn't have a career services given the... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay... [cross-talk]

ANGIE KAMATH: ...the straight-line trajectory to... [cross-talk]

KATIE NAYLOR: We, we actually serve... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, thank you...

[cross-talk]

KATIE NAYLOR: ...the medical students at City College... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Oh, okay... [cross-talk]

KATIE NAYLOR: ...they use our... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...so, they use... [cross-talk]

KATIE NAYLOR: ...services... [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...City College
3 services?

4 KATIE NAYLOR: Yes... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: That's fine, okay
6 and you talk about the services that you provide and
7 mock interviewing, effective communication... effective
8 communication, networking and talk also about, about
9 mentoring, professional mentoring, how does that
10 work, how do you get... I guess its faculty to mentor
11 students, I think that that's really an important
12 part?

13 KATIE NAYLOR: Some of the campuses do
14 have a mentoring program at various levels and I
15 think that number was 60 percent so it's not at every
16 CUNY campus... [cross-talk]

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

18 KATIE NAYLOR: ...because there is a lot of
19 work that goes into a mentoring program from
20 preparing the mentors and preparing the mentees. I
21 can speak to City College, we do have... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

23 KATIE NAYLOR: ...a mentoring program for
24 our, our participants in our explorer program where
25 they communicate with alumni and the alumni assist

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 the students and that is generally how it is done
3 within the career centers that have mentoring
4 programs. It is normally an alumnus that is mentoring
5 the student, or it may be an employer partner that is
6 mentoring the student.

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. How many... I
8 know... I understand this is not required, students
9 don't have to avail themselves of the services so how
10 do you determine the number of staff that's needed at
11 a particular center and what's the range of staff
12 that is at each of your centers?

13 KATIE NAYLOR: That number varies per,
14 per campus, I can provide you with those exact
15 numbers, that is a number that we collect from our
16 survey, so I can provide you with that detailed
17 information after. As far as deciding on the number
18 of staffs that is once again a per college decision.

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Who's the person in
20 charge of a particular center, what's that title,
21 who's that person?

22 KATIE NAYLOR: It's, its normally the...
23 normally the titles range from director to executive
24 director, we are provided with a budget from a
25 particular... you know however the budget is determined

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 but the, the title is normally director or executive
3 director. I believe on average just... and, and this is
4 just from going over the report data on average every
5 center has four full time staff members, the average.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Four on average,
7 okay... [cross-talk]

8 KATIE NAYLOR: On average, yes that's an...
9 that's on average.

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And how's the
11 funding determined, how do... how does each center get
12 their allocation, who makes that funding allocation,
13 who makes that determination as to how much money
14 each center is going to get, does every center get
15 the same amount or are there other factors that go
16 into determining how much a center would receive?

17 CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Okay, Chair Barron
18 that... those decisions are made by the individual
19 campuses.

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, the president?

21 CHRISTOPHER ROSA: By, by the college
22 president... [cross-talk]

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: The college
24 president which shouldn't... [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 CHRISTOPHER ROSA: ...and, and the Vice
3 President, typically the... either the vice president
4 of student affairs, academic affairs or the Dean of
5 adult and continuing education depending on where
6 career services is situated on the campus.

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. And how can we
8 determine the utilization rate, I heard in someone's
9 testimony that you were looking to use a new system
10 that would help you gather the data and report it,
11 how are we presently doing it, how do we now know the
12 number of students that any given center provides
13 services to?

14 KATIE NAYLOR: That's done at each center
15 and because we push the survey through the career
16 services association, through CSAC each center
17 collects its own data on student usage and that's how
18 we have the numbers that we were able to provide you
19 with today.

20 ZINA RICHARDSON: If, if, if I can also
21 add... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

23 ZINA RICHARDSON: ...each center is using a
24 career management system... [cross-talk]

25 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 ZINA RICHARDSON: ...its... simplicity is
3 what we're using right now and that system holds all
4 of the data per campus so we know how many students
5 are coming in, how many students are utilizing the
6 workshops, how many students are interviewing, how
7 many students have come back several times to
8 interview and how many employers are actually in, in
9 the system at each college so we do have a system in
10 place, we're looking to expand on that and have a, a...
11 more of a broader system that everyone could use but
12 right now 95 percent of the campuses are using the
13 career management system.

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

15 [off mic dialogue]

16 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Alright and so can
17 we get that information we'd like to be able to see
18 how those services are being utilized. Are students
19 throughout the system, throughout CUNY campuses
20 allowed to use services at any other campus, are they
21 restricted to use it only at their own school?

22 KATIE NAYLOR: They can use services at
23 other campuses, we do not turn away a student from
24 another campus because there are different majors...
25 so, for example, New York City Tech they may want to

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 take advantage of our STEM career fair, they would be
3 able to come to that event. So, it depends also by
4 major, it may be appropriate for a student to visit
5 another campus as opposed to their home campus, they
6 might have a stronger employer relations connection,
7 so we don't turn away a student from another CUNY
8 campus.

9 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And are the services
10 generally the same with community college campuses as
11 with senior colleges or would you find that there's a
12 distinction or difference or...

13 KATIE NAYLOR: There... the basic services
14 are the same. In regard to the career coaching, the
15 interview prep there would be different services
16 because the community college student is a little bit
17 different. Lisanette do you want to speak to services
18 at, at community college?

19 CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Yep, this... Chair
20 Barron this is Lisanette Rosario, she is the, the Co-
21 Chair of CSAC and the Director of Career Services at
22 Hostos Community College.

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, the counsel is
24 just going to administer the oath.

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Okay, raise your right
3 hand please. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the
4 whole truth and nothing but the truth in your
5 testimony before this Committee and to respond
6 honestly to Council Members questions?

7 LISANETTE ROSARIO: Yes.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Please state your name
9 and title for the record.

10 LISANETTE ROSARIO: Lisanette Rosario,
11 Director of Career Services at Hostos Community
12 College. Yes, so the diversity among the community
13 colleges and the work we do there may be some
14 differences in terms of the workforce development
15 activities. We are a lot more hands on in terms of
16 our students who are graduating into careers,
17 vocational programs. We also work with students in
18 certificate programs, so we do a lot of employer
19 recruitment and direct referral. We host a lot of on
20 campus events that are open to other community
21 colleges and senior colleges so although the basic
22 services; resume development, interviewing, career
23 fairs you will find are the same across campuses,
24 some individual community colleges are more hands on

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 in terms of the referral to employers and direct work
3 in building capacity for employers.

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: In the testimony it
5 said that at the four-year schools that had 10,000 or
6 more there were 4,658 job postings and at the two-
7 year schools it was 1,315 job postings so if the same
8 number of students or 10,000 was your base number
9 what accounts for the differences in the number of
10 postings, almost three times as much?

11 KATIE NAYLOR: I think that that reflects
12 national data in regard to the demand.. employer
13 demand for the four-year degree.

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, requires..
15 [cross-talk]

16 CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Chair Barron I think
17 it also.. [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

19 CHRISTOPHER ROSA: ...speaks to our
20 acknowledgement that we could benefit from a singular
21 unified enterprise management tool that we.. that
22 we're in the process of procuring... [cross-talk]

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And what's the name
24 of that tool that you're talking about?

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Its yet to be... we're,
3 we're, we're compete... we're... they're competing for it
4 now...

5 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Oh, so you've put
6 out an RFP?

7 CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Yes.

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay... [cross-talk]

9 CHRISTOPHER ROSA: And, and we're hope...
10 we hope to procure a single unified platform so that
11 all students could benefit from all postings across
12 the system.

13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And so, where are
14 you in that timetable of having that done?

15 ANGIE KAMATH: It's within our
16 procurement team right now so it's not released, the
17 RFP is not yet released but I think by the end of..
18 [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: You have to speak
20 into the microphone... [cross-talk]]

21 ANGIE KAMATH: Oh, I'm sorry... [cross-
22 talk]

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...so it's got to be
24 able to be recorded.

25 ANGIE KAMATH: Got it... [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...it's official,
3 yeah.

4 ANGIE KAMATH: Sorry Chair Barron...
5 [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: That's okay.

7 ANGIE KAMATH: We have written the RFP
8 and its in the midst of our procurement process and
9 kind of getting all of the internal approvals before
10 it'll be released but we do hope within the next
11 quarter to have that released and out in the street.

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: How do we know... how
13 do we measure the effectiveness of the careers job
14 center... of the career centers, how are we measuring
15 our effectiveness?

16 KATIE NAYLOR: That is also campus based,
17 there... of course there are employment outcomes that
18 we're getting data now through partnerships with the
19 New York State Department of Labor but each career
20 center does assessments on their services and their
21 effectiveness, I do not have that data with me today,
22 we could contact the, the career centers to try and
23 get additional data with that.

24 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, if I go to a job
25 center and I see a job posting... if I go to a career

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 center and I see a job posting and I get the job how
3 do you know that I got the job?

4 KATIE NAYLOR: Oh, I, I'm... that is one of
5 the difficult data points that we spend a lot of time
6 trying to get because we have to work with our
7 employers for them to report back that information or
8 it... we have to work with the students to try and get
9 that information. These... both parties are very busy
10 and it's a challenging number to get that feedback
11 from the employers and this is... this is a number that
12 challenges universities across the United States, its
13 consistently talked about within our professional
14 association, the National College... National
15 Association for Colleges and Employers. Some of us
16 that have the time we may data mine linked in to see
17 what our students are doing, we... because we can't
18 through our, our career service management systems we
19 do have information on who may have applied to, to
20 the job so we can follow up with the employer that
21 way. So, there's different data mining techniques
22 that we can use if they're not responding to a survey
23 or an email. I think everybody can appreciate that
24 we're over surveyed in many cases so getting the
25

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 response rate can be difficult, but we are definitely
3 working diligently to try and get that information.

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, there were
5 surveys that were administered to certificate and
6 associate graduates from 2005/06 through 2014/15 and
7 it included a question asking how helpful certain
8 services such as job postings and career counseling
9 are... at their campus career centers was in assisting
10 them to respond and obtain the job but that question
11 was removed so can you explain why that question was
12 not included in the survey for 2015/16 and 2016/17
13 and without that question in your data how do you
14 plan to capture that kind of information?

15 CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Chair Barron is, is
16 that the CUNY student experience survey?

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes...

18 CHRISTOPHER ROSA: It's not, no... [cross-
19 talk]

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: No, which one?

21 [off mic dialogue]

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: One second.

23 CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Sure.
24
25

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, it's the CUNY
3 survey of certificate and associate graduates
4 2016/17...

5 [off mic dialogue]

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, so it was not
7 included for the, the 16/17 but it's a CUNY survey of
8 certificate and associate grad... associate, list of
9 tables... it's a part of your tables.

10 CHRISTOPHER ROSA: I see.

11 ANGIE KAMATH: I think we'll have to get
12 back to you, I, I think what Vice Chancellor Rosa was
13 talking about is that every two years there's a
14 student experience survey... [cross-talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

16 ANGIE KAMATH: ...that's administered with
17 many, many questions across the kind of entire
18 academic experience including for the services and I
19 believe that those, those still have a number of
20 questions around career services, around the
21 engagement, around the experience... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

23 ANGIE KAMATH: ...I think you're looking at
24 something different so... [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, so we'll...

3 [cross-talk]

4 ANGIE KAMATH: ...we can provide you...

5 [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...we'll send it to
7 you, so we can... [cross-talk]

8 ANGIE KAMATH: ...with, with... [cross-talk]

9 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...we can be... [cross-
10 talk]

11 ANGIE KAMATH: ...what we know to exist...

12 [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...we can be more
14 informed about that. So, do you see the attempt... the
15 RFP that has yet to be released but... which is in the
16 stages of being developed do you think that that's
17 going to help address any discrepancies that exist
18 between the different campuses?

19 CHRISTOPHER ROSA: We, we... [cross-talk]

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So that students can
21 be able to... all students regardless of the campus
22 that they're at will have access to comprehensive
23 services?

24

25

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 CHRISTOPHER ROSA: We do Chair Barron,
3 I'm going to yield to my colleague Dean Kamath...
4 [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay... [cross-talk]

6 CHRISTOPHER ROSA: ...on it but that's... the
7 idea is... cuts to the heart of the very challenge that
8 you... that you pointed out in your remarks about the
9 need to leverage the university in its totality...
10 [cross-talk]

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

12 CHRISTOPHER ROSA: ...to better connect
13 students with a full range of available employment
14 opportunities.

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh...

16 ANGIE KAMATH: Right. Thank you and so I
17 think that the activities that I was describing I sit
18 within the office of academic affairs and so I think
19 that what we know from the National Association, from
20 the national data that Zina and Katie referenced is
21 that the idea of kind of really good preparation for
22 students so that they get to graduate with a good job
23 and good economic prospects is really not just the
24 career services kind of mandate and sole
25 responsibility, we are working very, very closely on

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

1
2 the academic side so when we think about who has
3 access to students, the facility, their faculty
4 advisors. A lot of the work that's happening in the
5 classroom, the connectivity to kind of what they're
6 learning and kind of what that set of learnings could
7 actually translate to a job and so I think that what
8 we are trying to do... there's no silver bullet to
9 answer your question directly, a system, a technology
10 tool will not, you know be the one thing that kind of
11 launches our students into academic and, and career
12 success but we think it's incredibly important to
13 have an ability to measure. The system that we will
14 be procuring will be one that can be accessed by
15 faculty so that as faculty are often connecting our
16 students internships we can have an ability to track
17 that so that the activities of career services alone
18 is not the only indicator of kind of career success
19 and I think that's the big sea change that's
20 happening both nationally and that we are trying to
21 really institute at CUNY. It feels again from where I
22 sit not quite fair to kind of level all of the
23 outcomes of students and their careers on a four
24 person career services offices, they do a whole lot
25 and incredibly important, there should have been

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 nexus of activity on the campus but we have to
3 absolutely involve the academic side as well and
4 that's kind of what we're doing and a technology tool
5 will try to marry up experiential learning, course
6 taking, credential and badging, certificates with the
7 career services activities with mentoring, with
8 leadership so that there's a whole package for
9 students whether they're at a community college or a
10 senior college. It's not uncomplicated but it is sort
11 of what we're trying to build.

12 ZINA RICHARDSON: If I could just add,
13 the other thing is we're really trying to meet the
14 students where they are... [cross-talk]

15 KATIE NAYLOR: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]]

16 ZINA RICHARDSON: ...it's, it's almost a
17 fair to come into a career center or to come to a
18 professional with technology these days, students
19 don't want to do that, they want to have access where
20 they are, they want to have access on their phones,
21 they want to have access at two o'clock in the
22 morning and, and we, we're seeing that so we really
23 are trying to make it easier for the students to
24 access the services that we all have to offer and we
25 feel that this, this technology, this, this RFP that

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 we're, we're procuring right now will allow for, for
3 more students to access the system, you know students
4 are telling us this, we know, they come to the career
5 fairs but there, they're running off to a job in, in
6 15 minutes or they're running back home because they
7 have a child so we're really trying to make the
8 services as accessible as possible for them and we
9 know that this tool that we, we, we currently have
10 but we're expanding on will allow for more of that.

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And it will allow
12 you to capture the number of students who are up at
13 three a.m. doing their papers... [cross-talk]

14 KATIE NAYLOR: Oh, yes... [cross-talk]

15 ZINA RICHARDSON: Absolutely... [cross-
16 talk]

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And, and tell that,
18 that you've... that they wanted access to the career
19 center?

20 ZINA RICHARDSON: Yes.

21 CHRISTOPHER ROSA: And that's actually
22 the beauty of it because in, in real terms its
23 helping our campuses with digital case management but
24 it's also a great way to collect data on efforts to
25 outcomes and that's our hope that it will... it will

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 reside in one place and it will give us tremendous
3 analytical capability to, to demonstrate the efficacy
4 of the various efforts that we're expending on behalf
5 of linking students to successful careers.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Is there a way that
7 you can give us the average cost per student at each
8 of these sites, what's the average cost based on the
9 number of students that are in fact now using your
10 services, what's the average cost per student?

11 KATIE NAYLOR: I, I don't have that
12 number in front of me, I... we do have that number
13 included in our survey and we can provide that to
14 you.

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, that's good.
16 Do you have a timeline as to when the RFP will be
17 released and when the response will be able... when can
18 we expect to see this more comprehensive tool
19 available to students generally or..

20 ANGIE KAMATH: I can take a stab at that
21 and I'm sure my procurement and legal folks will... are
22 listening in, intently, I mean I think similar to..
23 we're, we're a public entity, right, so I think our
24 procurement cycle is from the moment an RFP sort of
25 hits the streets so to speak one can imagine between

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 all of the kind of concreting steps and registration
3 and training its about a 12 month process so we think
4 and hope that we're a few... you know within one to
5 three months away from it hitting the street and then
6 that typical procurement cycle will be anywhere
7 between 12 months, you know if everything goes well,
8 18 months again if there's complications for whatever
9 in terms of implementation or, or procurement so you
10 know I think if we wanted to be really conservative
11 within 24 months we should have a, a full
12 implementation but again our legal and procurement
13 folks it's, it's... there are... there are a number of
14 changes along the way but I think within, you know
15 the next year or two. Again I think that this... its
16 not that nothing is happening, all of the, the
17 campuses use technology but I think we want to try
18 to, you know under... as Chris was describing have a
19 centralized mechanism for more reporting versus going
20 out to each of the colleges to collect that analytic
21 so again I think we can get the analytics today, we
22 can get it more easily with a centralized system.

23 KATIE NAYLOR: Yes, yes.

24 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: In terms of the
25 programs that you mentioned that are... that offer

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

1
2 internships and you cited several, I think you talked
3 about the Clinton Program and NYCHA and 3-1-1 and
4 others, do you have a number of the... of the students
5 who have been placed in internships based on their
6 going through CUNY, do you have that number for the
7 different programs?

8 ANGIE KAMATH: So, I certainly... I oversee
9 the CUNY service core program, the CUNY cultural Core
10 program and the CUNY internship program which is a, a
11 program that places through a partnership with DoITT
12 and HRA and about 17 city agencies, individuals into
13 IT and communications jobs so we have a number for
14 that, I thought I actually had that in front of me.
15 In terms of this... let's say calendar year 2017 we had
16 2,400 students in the variety of internship programs
17 at my office overseas, that is not going to be clear.
18 I think Katie from your work with the survey would
19 have an additional number of individuals who were
20 placed in internships in campus specific programs, my
21 2,487 students are for what we call centrally managed
22 internship programs so again it's, it's a big team
23 effort here with college specific opportunities and
24 then some opportunities that we run centrally so that
25

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 students across many campuses can access versus
3 having to be kind of situated within one campus.

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: 2,400...

5 ANGIE KAMATH: 87.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Two... 2,487 students.

7 How long is the internship and are they paid
8 internships and what's the... [cross-talk]

9 ANGIE KAMATH: So, yes, we very much
10 believe in paid internships and that's a very... that's
11 every single one of those students is in a paid
12 internship at minimum wage typically though some of
13 our internships particularly with our city agencies
14 tend to be above minimum wage and the average
15 duration varies, CUNY service Core for example is a
16 240 hour internship between essentially October and
17 May, same thing with CUNY cultural Core. The average
18 duration for our CUNY internship program which is the
19 program that staffs not only the call centers that
20 you mentioned but 17 other city agencies in IT
21 related roles, average duration is about 12 months
22 for those programs and they're all part time so they
23 average between 15 to 20 hours a week so a long way
24 to say it depends but we are very interested in these
25 particularly the centrally managed programs that

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 they're paid, that they're meaningful, that they have
3 a substantive number of hours and that they're a
4 substantive kind of not only work experience but an
5 income generator as well as a real career exploration
6 opportunity for folks to learn about a sector.

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Is it one and done
8 or can students apply again for a subsequent cycle?

9 ANGIE KAMATH: So, again it depends on
10 the program, for our CUNY service Core that tends to
11 be an experience that you can take advantage of once.
12 What we do see from surveying our employers and our
13 students is that probably about 35 percent of
14 students who take part in our structured internship
15 program in the service Core example do carry on where
16 they get hired directly by the... by the entity, by the
17 employer... [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: What percentage did
19 you say?

20 ANGIE KAMATH: About... depending on the
21 year about... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Right... [cross-talk]

23 ANGIE KAMATH: ...33 to 40 percent so there
24 is continuation so again a, a really good successful
25 career exploration program would be one where a

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 student tries it out and then it works mutually on
3 both sides and they get hired on directly. For
4 students in the public sector internship programs
5 they actually can be in the program for up to three
6 years and so we see many students who kind of take
7 advantage of those internship programs for the
8 duration of their, their academic experience and then
9 finally for the cultural Core program that's really a
10 diversity pipeline program so we tend to offer those
11 to students who are in their final year so that, you
12 know if it works out and if it was kind of mutually
13 beneficial and the opportunity arose folks could be
14 hired on full time. So, again I, I don't speak for
15 every single internship program at the university
16 those are just simply the ones that we manage
17 centrally and... Katie I don't know if there's anything
18 else from the college specific level to add.

19 KATIE NAYLOR: Yes, we do have... each... I
20 believe it was 60 percent of the colleges reported
21 that they have an internship program that they
22 manage, we do have a number as to how many students
23 have been served in those programs which we can
24 provide you with.

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Do colleges have
3 programs where they have student tutors that they
4 hire as well and does that relate to this or is that
5 a separate program?

6 KATIE NAYLOR: That, that would be
7 separate from the career services area.

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, do you have
9 any relationship with them... [cross-talk]

10 KATIE NAYLOR: Are you... are you talking...
11 are you referring to our tutoring centers?

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Not necessarily
13 tutoring centers but do colleges have an opportunity
14 for... yes, let's, let's do both of them, let's start
15 with the tutoring centers since... [cross-talk]]

16 KATIE NAYLOR: Okay, so we will partner
17 with tutoring centers that are on campus because
18 sometimes a student will go to a writing center for
19 resume or cover letter help and then they get some
20 assistance there, but they're normally directed to
21 career services for further assistance.

22 ANGIE KAMATH: And I can add it's a
23 really good point and I think that, you know both at
24 CUNY and nationally peer mentoring kind of near peer
25 mentoring and counseling is incredibly important, a

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 great leadership opportunity for upper classmen to
3 kind of coach and mentor often give kind of direct
4 services and so I... the example that comes to mind
5 quickly is Guttman Community College has a really
6 strong peer mentoring program as one example and I
7 really... I, I don't have the numbers in front of me
8 but I think most campuses have some version of peer
9 mentoring those tend to be program specific so they
10 might be tutoring which would kind of be an academic
11 affairs area, it could be around student success if
12 there's a college completion or kind of graduation
13 program, it could be related to kind of affinity
14 groups or kind of mentoring around women in
15 technology for example or kind of other groups so
16 that is, you know typically driven out of an academic
17 affairs office for a particular program or
18 opportunity and again I think that those are driven
19 from kind of... in collaboration with career services
20 but probably pretty separately.

21 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And is there any
22 financial remuneration that's associated with that as
23 well, do you know... [cross-talk]

24 ANGIE KAMATH: For the programs that I
25 was speaking of those are all paid.

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And for the peer
3 mentoring programs?

4 ANGIE KAMATH: Typically I mean those
5 are... that's, that's the job, yeah it's a job
6 description where folks are, are interviewed and, and
7 hired for their, their capability and... their ability
8 and there's expectations expected of folks and again
9 some of those might tap into federal work-study
10 dollars and then some might just be program specific
11 where there's a foundation or a budget that is, you
12 know the, the funder behind the paid opportunity.

13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, so CUNY's
14 webpage... [coughs] excuse me... for its Office of
15 Institutional Research includes surveys of CUNY
16 baccalaureate and certificate association graduates,
17 we referenced it a little while ago but the latest
18 data available for baccalaureate graduates is for the
19 2009/2010 cohort, while there's data for 2016/17 for
20 the assistant... for the certificate and associate
21 graduates so what has been the delay in publishing
22 more recent data for the baccalaureate graduates
23 online?

24 ANGIE KAMATH: And that's data related to
25 job outcomes or... [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: No, office of
3 institution, I think it's the surveys that you've
4 done...

5 ANGIE KAMATH: Uh-huh, so I think we
6 would want to get more... [cross-talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay... [cross-talk]

8 ANGIE KAMATH: ...information, I, I mean I,
9 I believe there are a lot of updated kind of... [cross-
10 talk]]

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay... [cross-talk]

12 ANGIE KAMATH: ...data reports that are,
13 you know for the 2016/2017 graduate side of it...
14 [cross-talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

16 ANGIE KAMATH: ...just would want to
17 understand exactly what you're looking at to
18 understand... [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay... [cross-talk]

20 ANGIE KAMATH: ...what the delay was...
21 [cross-talk]]

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Alright... [cross-
23 talk]

24 ANGIE KAMATH: ...but I know certainly from
25 the student experience survey the performance

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 monitoring program, PMP, those are all updated I
3 think as of the 2017 cohort... [cross-talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, so we can send
5 you the report... [cross-talk]

6 ANGIE KAMATH: Uh-huh, uh-huh... [cross-
7 talk]

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...that we're looking
9 at, you can look at that, okay. I see that here...
10 okay, is there... is there a difference between what
11 you call career centers and offices of career
12 services, is there a distinction or is it just a
13 different title?

14 KATIE NAYLOR: Just a different title.

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, that's very
16 good. Well I think that's... you've given a lot of
17 information, I do appreciate it and if you could just
18 get back the counsel will be able to list those
19 questions for you, I do want to know how many
20 students are... were, were placed at 3-1-1, at NYCHA,
21 we can certainly can use more students at NYCHA to
22 record some of the complaints that come in through
23 there and help facilitate resolution of that but I'd
24 be interested in the numbers as well, you know and
25

1 COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

2 thank you, do you have any other comments that you'd
3 like to offer?

4 CHRISTOPHER ROSA: We just appreciate
5 your, your leadership to make sure that all of our
6 areas particularly career services are, are resourced
7 well enough to be able to benefit our students richly
8 so thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you, thank you
10 so much.

11 KATIE NAYLOR: Thank you...

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you.

13 [off mic dialogue]

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Is there anyone else
15 who has testimony that they'd like to offer? We don't
16 have any further slips. If not, we will adjourn this
17 hearing, thank you all for coming, thank you.

18 [gavel]

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date

November 15, 2018