

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

September 7, 2017
Start: 1:55 p.m.
Recess: 3:40 p.m.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: LETITIA JAMES
Public Advocate

MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO
Speaker for the Council

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Inez D. Barron
Joe Borelli
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret S. Chin
Andrew Cohn
Costa G. Constantinides
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Elizabeth S. Crowley
Laurie A. Cumbo
Chaim M. Deutsch
Daniel Dromm
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Mathieu Eugene
Julissa Ferreras-Copeland
Daniel R. Garodnick
Vincent J. Gentile
Vanessa L. Gibson

David G. Greenfield
Barry Grodenchik
Corey D. Johnson
Ben Kallos
Andy L. King
Peter A. Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Rory I. Lancman
Brad S. Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Alan N. Maisel
Steven Matteo
Darlene Mealy
Carlos Menchaca
Rosie Mendez
I. Daneek Miller
Annabel Palma
Bill Perkins
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Deborah L. Rose
Helen K. Rosenthal
Ritchie J. Torres
Rafael Salamanca
Mark Treyger
Eric A. Ulrich
James Vacca
Paul A. Vallone
James G. Van Bramer
Jumaane D. Williams

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Pastor Terry Lee
By-Way & Hedges Youth For Christ Ministries
23 East 53rd Street Brooklyn N.Y. 11203.

2 [sound check, pause] [background
3 comments]

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We'll start off
5 with Council Member Miller. Is he here? Council
6 Member is honoring the future problem solvers at the
7 PS 176 Queens if they can step up. [cheers/applause]
8 Come on up. So, they're being honored for their
9 extraordinary achievements in both the New York State
10 Championships and the International Future Problem
11 Solving Competition. Council Member Miller.
12 [cheers/applause]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Madam
14 Speaker. Come on team, come on team. We are proud
15 of this young group of scholars, and their parents
16 and teachers for so many reasons. This is the second
17 time that we were actually in here. Not with this
18 group, but another school from District 29, which
19 actually was the—won the International Robotics
20 Competition. So, we're really proud of that, and
21 this is really an affirmation of what public
22 education is. What I also want to say is, and I know
23 Council Member Cornegy I saw somewhere around, and
24 that the BLAC and the Council last year fought to
25 increase the Gifted and Talented program. We have

2 only one in Southeast Queens and this—these young
3 students are a product of our Gifted and Talented
4 Program, and so this is what happens when we are able
5 to increase the roll. So, I want to thank the
6 Speaker and my colleagues for joining me on this
7 occasion when we present a proclamation to the Future
8 Problem Solvers of PS 176 in Cambria Heights for
9 winning victories in New York State and International
10 Competition Future Problem Solvers in various
11 categories. Twenty-two fourth grade—fourth and fifth
12 graders not in my two engineers yet, took on the best
13 from over 30 states and 14 countries, and came away
14 champions. [cheers/applause] This is a reaffirmation
15 of their talents, the care given by their parents,
16 guardians, dedications of teachers and the staff of
17 PS 176. With the leadership of Principal Bartlett
18 and the outstanding coaches, Team AP, Mark Coccarelli
19 and Linda Sabrin. I just want to congratulate them,
20 our Future Problem Solvers and—and just say that
21 you've done a magnificent job and continue to
22 represent not just Cambria Heights and Southern
23 Queens by New York City with such dignity and pride.
24 We are so proud of you. [applause] [background
25 comments]

2 CLERK: Council City of New York
3 Proclamation.

4 The New York City Council is proud to
5 honor the Future Problem Solvers of PS 176, Queens,
6 the Cambria Heights School for its extraordinary
7 achievements at both the New York State Championships
8 and the International Future Problem Solving
9 Competition; and

10 Whereas, under the leadership of
11 Principal Arlene Bartlett, PS 176, Queens the Cambria
12 Heights School represents a flourishing community of
13 life-long learners who will be endowed with the
14 knowledge, skill, attitudes and quality of character
15 necessary to be successful contributing members of
16 our changing global society, which students and
17 alumni are truly committed to reaching their highest
18 potential, and it's future problem solvers
19 exemplified this throughout the previous school year;
20 and

21 Whereas, in 1974, Future Problem Solving
22 Program International was founded to stimulate
23 critical and creative thinking skills, encourage
24 students to develop a vision for the future and
25 prepare students for leadership roles. PS 176 Queens

2 has only participated in the Future Problem Solving
3 Program for only two years, but thanks to the
4 coaching of Assistant Principal Coccarelli and Linda
5 Sabrin that bold vision has clearly—was clearly
6 embraced by every student on the team; and

7 Whereas, with the New York State Future
8 Problem Solver State Goal, the PS 176 Queens Future
9 Problem Solvers won first place in all four
10 components, a proud accomplishment for the entire
11 Cambria Heights School Community. With that victory,
12 the students were invited to participate at the
13 International Future Problem Solving Competition in
14 June at the University of Wisconsin in June. There
15 the students represented New York State while
16 competing against teams from all 50 states as well as
17 teams from India, Australia, Japan, China, the United
18 Kingdom and South Korea and eight other countries
19 from around the world;

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
21 [shushing for quiet]

22 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet down.

24 CLERK: and, Whereas, at the

25 International Future Problem Solving Competition, the

2 PS 176 Future Problem Solvers excelled in all five
3 components of the competition: Global Issues,
4 Problem Solving, Scenario Writing, Presentation of
5 Action Plan, Multi-Affiliate Global Issues
6 Competition, and Community Problem Solving. When
7 fourth grade student Gabriella Brown competed in
8 Scenario Writing Junior Division, she won second
9 place worldwide. In the end, 15 of the PS 176
10 Problem Solvers won third place internationally in
11 community problem solvers working with New York City
12 commissioners, police officers, elected officials,
13 and engineers to solve traffic problems around their
14 school; and

15 Whereas, the Future Problem Solvers at PS
16 176 Queens is comprised of 22 dedicated fourth and
17 fifth grade students: Meir Ahmed, Cassidy Jared,
18 Christine Woods, Jamana Ardie, Claudenski Souvenance,
19 Aber Halder, Marzuk Rashid, Mushfiqur Rahman, Kaif
20 Ridwan, Hsnan Shaior, Faryal Mamun, Aleesha Besaw,
21 Jasmine Davis, Emanuel Moreno, Sniya Wilson, Angela
22 Agbi, Devon Reid, Aniya Campbell Logan Brown, Milan
23 White, Gabriella Brown and Oghosa Aigbogun; and

24 Whereas, we commend all of the PS 176
25 Queens Future Problem Solvers for working so hard for

2 being great representatives of their families, their
3 teachers, their community and our city. Their
4 victory means not only a win for the students, but
5 also a win for PS 176 Queens for District 29 and the
6 entire New York City Public School system. We wish
7 them all continued success.

8 Now, therefore, be it know that New York
9 City Council is proud to honor and congratulate the
10 Future Problem Solvers of PS 176 Queens the Cambria
11 Heights School for its extraordinary achievements at
12 the New York State Future Problem Solvers State Goal,
13 and the International Future Problem Solving
14 competition. Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker for the
15 Entire Council, I. Daneek Miller, Council Member 27th
16 District Queens.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Yes.

18 [cheers/applause]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Yes. [background
20 comments]

21 FEMALE STUDENT: Okay, I would like to
22 say thank you to Ms. Sabrin and my school for this
23 opportunity to be Future Problem Solvers.

24 [cheers/applause]

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

10

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Hi. Well, we're
3 very proud of all of you, and we hope to see you
4 again next—is this something that happens every year?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: [off mic] Yes.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Okay. So, we
7 want to see you here next year when you win again,
8 right?

9 STUDENTS: [in unison] Right.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: So good luck.
11 [cheers/applause] [pause] Alright, congratulations.
12 Enjoy being back at school. [applause] Alright,
13 we're going to prepare the next ceremonial.

14 [background comments] The next ceremonial Council
15 Members Williams and Greenfield paying tribute--

16 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
17 down, please. Keep it down.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Paying tribute to
19 the Honorable Judge Rachel Freier, who when elected
20 to the Brooklyn Civil Court in January became the
21 first female Hasidic judge in the United States. So,
22 this is again Council Member Williams and Greenfield,
23 and I will pass off the mic.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: If we could
25 have Judge Freier and here friends and family please

2 join us. Yeah, yeah, please join us absolutely.
3 Yes, come and join us, your friends, your family,
4 your mom, your aunt, please. Absolutely [background
5 comments, pause] Come, come. So, the—the story of
6 this—of this proclamation for this historic
7 achievement is actually a funny story. Councilman
8 Williams and I we each had an idea but coming from a
9 different perspective. I had the idea that we would
10 celebrate Judge Freier's achievement during a woman's
11 history celebration, and Councilman Williams he
12 decided that we should do it during Jewish Heritage
13 Month. I know ironic and then the two of us teamed
14 up and we said we'll just do it at an event here in
15 the Council, the Chamber to do a Proclamation. I'm
16 going to turn it over to Council Member Williams for
17 this formal portion of the program. I just wanted to
18 say that personally I actually had the good fortune
19 of knowing Judge Freier. Back then we called her
20 Ruchie since Touro College, and what was really
21 incredible I didn't actually figure this out until
22 later. So, we used to pass each other in the halls
23 and Ruchie was a very active member of the Political
24 Science Club back in the day, and quite frankly, she
25 was the smartest member of the club, and she got

2 perfect grades, and she looks very young, and I never
3 realized that she was actually going to college while
4 she older and she had a whole bunch of kids and how
5 much she was taken care of, which is astounding for
6 those of you who are parents to know how difficult
7 that is to actually go to school when you have young
8 kids at home, and she was a perfect student. She was
9 always very involved, very inact—very active, and she
10 did extraordinarily well, and then later on she
11 worked for the community in a whole variety of
12 capacities and then she went to law school, and she
13 did some great work after that as well, and she
14 really pursued her dream, and today she's the first
15 female Hasidic judge I believe actually in the world.
16 So, congratulations. [cheers/applause] It's—it's—it's
17 really—it's really an incredible achievement and a
18 testament to what you can do when you believe in
19 something, and you want to get it done. I think the—
20 the most impressive part of all of this is that she's
21 done it without giving up any of her personal or
22 religious values, and she's really someone that a lot
23 of the young women in the community look up to, and
24 it's a fabulous achievement for her, and for her
25 family who I know has always been supportive and her

2 mom as well. And do, I wanted to wish you Mazel Tov
3 along with Council Member Williams, and I will turn
4 it over to Council Member Williams, my Jewish brother
5 from another mother to take it over.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [Speaking
7 Yiddish]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Pretty good.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you so
10 much to my colleague. When I heard about the judge's
11 story I thought it was just simply amazing. I have
12 a—a large although no Hasidic, an Orthodox Jewish
13 Community so I know just how amazing it is to hear
14 her story, and when I heard that, I said in
15 consultation with Councilman Greenfield this someone
16 we should honor. Her story should be raised and she
17 should be celebrated not just in the Jewish
18 community, but across all communities for what she's
19 been able to do. SO, I'm proud here to present this
20 proclamation to the Honorable Rachel Freier, who
21 embodies the passion for both the law and advocating
22 for the Hasidic community. S he was the Director of
23 the Woman's Pre-Law Society while at Touro College.
24 She graduated from Brooklyn Law in 2005. She passed
25 the New York State Bar Exam as well as New Jersey and

2 the District of Columbia. That's fantastic. In 2008
3 she started B'Drech. Did I say that right? B'Derech
4 an organization to help at-risk Hasidic youth. In
5 2016, she was elected Civil Court Judge for the Kings
6 County Fifth Judicial District and, as was mentioned,
7 she is the first Jewish-Hasidic Jewish woman to be
8 elected a civil court judge in the country, in the
9 United States and simultaneously the first Hasidic
10 woman to serve in public office in the United States'
11 history. That is a fantastic thing. My council-my
12 colleague says the entire world, and she deserves
13 another round of applause for that. [applause] And we
14 have--of course, behind every fantastic amazing
15 wonderful woman there is a husband. So, we have
16 David Freier who is here as well, as well as her sons
17 Moesha and Myer. I said that right hopefully. Sarah
18 Black her mom; Debbie Hiller, he aunt; Aviva Love a
19 court attorney and Moesha Tuttlebaum her campaign
20 manager. I think he is there. There we go. Give
21 him a round of applauses. Give a round of applause
22 to all of them. [applause] So, now we're going to
23 hand it over to the Judge who is going to say a
24 couple of words. [background comments] I'm sorry.
25 My fault. Can we first read the proc-proclamation?

2 CLERK: Council City of New York
3 Proclamation.

4 Whereas, in celebration of Jewish-
5 American Heritage month, the Council of the City of
6 New York is proud to pay tribute to the Honorable
7 Judge Rachel Freier for her outstanding achievements;
8 and

9 Whereas, judges across America perform a
10 critical role in maintaining a just and civil
11 society. There are woman and men of exemplary
12 character, wisdom and temperament who work tirelessly
13 to uphold the public office which—with which they are
14 entrusted. Judge Rachel Freier is such an individual
15 and a true trailblazer. When she was elected to the
16 Brooklyn Civil Court in January, she became the first
17 female Hasidic Judge in the United States; and

18 Whereas, ling before the campaign, Judge
19 Freier had shattered the stereotype that many hold
20 for religious women in her culture. After high
21 school she began working as a legal secretary. When
22 her husband David earned his college degree she
23 aspired to earn her own. At that time, college was
24 not customary for Hasidic women. Instead of turning
25 away from her community, however, she found a way to

2 work within its structure. After graduating from a
3 women only program and Touro College, she blazed the
4 trail farther from the traditional path by attending
5 Brooklyn Law School part-time and passing the Bar
6 Exam all while raising her six children at home; and

7 Whereas, Judge Freier spent many years
8 helping Hasidic youth in her community graduate from
9 high school and earn professional degrees of their
10 own. Dozens of youth were impacted by her outreach
11 programming and advocacy. Those youth now hold her
12 as a successful role model from the Hasidic
13 community; and

14 Whereas, now with more than ten years of
15 experience in law, Judge Freier hopes to blend the
16 Hasidic world and its customs, beauty and traditions
17 with the professional world. She is committed to her
18 faith and to her practice and has earned the esteem
19 of all New Yorkers.

20 Now, therefore, be it known that the New
21 York City Council is proud to pay tribute to the
22 Honorable Rachel Freier for her outstanding
23 achievements and wishes and her continued success at
24 the Brooklyn Civil Court. Melissa Mark-Viverito,
25 Speaker for the Entire Council; Jumaane D. Williams,

2 Council Member 45th District Brooklyn; David G.
3 Greenfield, Council Member 44th District Brooklyn;
4 Mark D. Levine, Chair Jewish Caucus and many other
5 Council Members.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you and
7 we do want to thank the Jewish Caucus and Council
8 Member Mark Levine [applause]the Chair as well.
9 [background comments]

10 HONORABLE RACHEL FREIER: Alright. Thank
11 you Councilman Jumaane Williams, David Greenfield. I
12 am humbled and honored to be here, but this honor
13 really is not bestowed just on me alone. It's really
14 bestowed upon my Hasidic community because they
15 supported me and they voted for me, and that was
16 truly historic, and if not for that, I wouldn't be
17 where I am today, and Council Members you picked a
18 very auspicious time to present me with this
19 proclamation. It is two weeks away from Rosh
20 Hashanah, the Day of Judgment, a time for reflecting
21 on the past year, and contemplation and prayer for
22 the new year, and a time to thank and bless all those
23 who helped us in the past year, and I have many
24 people to thank. So, while many of you think it's a
25 real big deal that I'm the first Hasidic woman to be

2 in public office here and in the world, the real big
3 deal everybody is my husband, David Freier.
4 [applause] because—because honestly he is the first
5 Hasidic man who supported his wife to run for public
6 office [cheers/applause] the—the first day of the
7 petitioning process he had the green petition form in
8 his jacket pocket. He didn't go to a synagogue
9 prayer or wedding, a lecture without that petition
10 form. He ran around and enlisted the rabbis to
11 support me and without his help financing my campaign
12 and supporting every single move I took, this
13 couldn't have happened, and I hope many men will
14 learn from him. [applause] So, my dream of becoming
15 a judge while remaining committed to the values of my
16 community could have only happened with divine
17 providence and only in this great city of New York,
18 and as Frank Sinatra used to sing: If I can make it
19 there, I can make it anywhere. I love my job. I've
20 been doing this since January, and I tell everybody I
21 have the best seat in the house because wherever I
22 sit, above me are emblazed the words *In God We Trust*,
23 and everyday that reminds me of all the naysayers who
24 would approach me everyday of my campaign: Ruchie
25 Freier, you don't have a chance. Why are you doing

2 this, and I would tell them, If God wants me to win,
3 I'm going to win, and I just kept on going, and while
4 I ran for Civil Court, to my surprise I was assigned
5 to Brooklyn Criminal Court. I don't know how many of
6 you here understand Yiddish, but there's a famous
7 Yiddish expression, which I'm going to quote and I'm
8 going to translate. [Speaking Foreign Language] What
9 we do for others [speaking Foreign Language] you
10 really do for yourself. So, my volunteer work with
11 youth at-risk and in emergency medicine is what
12 really helps me in criminal court. I encourage
13 everyone: Get involved in community events. Get
14 involved in helping others because ultimately you'll
15 be helping yourself. So, many cases in Criminal
16 Court involve people at risk or emergency medical
17 information, which I couldn't have had the insight or
18 understanding if not for my volunteer work. As the
19 grandchild of Holly Cluster Viberse (sp?) and my
20 mother's daughter, I was raised to appreciate this
21 great country and the freedoms that we enjoy. I
22 sincerely thank my colleagues on the bench for
23 accepting me, and respecting my logist observances.
24 In conclusion, I wish to take this opportunity to
25 wish everyone here a [Speaking Yiddish] a sweet new

2 year, a speedy and complete recovery to the
3 hurricanes victims. Our hearts and prayers are with
4 you. May we all be inscribed in the [speaking
5 Foreign Language] in the Book of Life for a year of
6 health, peace, prosperity, and the word [Speaking
7 Foreign Language] comes to my mind, which truly is a
8 very hard word to translate from Hebrew. It's a
9 mixture of pride and contentment. May we all
10 accomplish great things together. This is my fervent
11 hope as I accept this proclamation that I make my
12 family proud, my community proud, make God proud.
13 May God bless us all, and may God bless America.
14 Than you all. [cheers/applause]

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Congratulations
16 Judge on your victory and the path that you forged
17 for other women serving as an inspiration. Thank you
18 so much for that, and for all of those that supported
19 your candidacy. It's really great to have you here
20 in this chamber where we do so much celebrating all
21 the beautiful diversity of the city, and all the
22 accomplishments that the—that people have made to the
23 city. So, thank you and congratulations and thank
24 you to Jumaane and Council Member Greenfield.
25 [applause] [background comments, pause] Alright, so

2 again congratulations to Judge Freier and we have one
3 more ceremonial.

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
5 down, please. Keep it down, please. Keep it down.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: This one is by
7 Council Member Crowley who is honoring the New York
8 Feile GAA Team for becoming the first New York team
9 in 27 years to win the Irish National Competition's
10 Division 1 Feile. Okay, I'm not even going to try to
11 say it. I don't know if it's a title. Is this a
12 title? Okay. [background comments] Yeah in Ireland.
13 They won a division in Ireland. [laughs] So, I'll
14 pass it off to the Council Member.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Thank you, Madam
16 Speaker.

17 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet
18 down, please.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Good afternoon.
20 Good afternoon. I'm going to ask the New York Feile
21 team to please come up, the managers and all those
22 associated with this great win. [applause] Let's
23 give a round of applause to the New York Feile.
24 There are 24 players all from different parts of our
25 city. It's a great honor today-

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
3 down, please. Keep it down.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: --to have with
5 us for the very first time in the Council Chambers as
6 Consul General of Ireland Ciaran Madden, who has
7 joined us and we'll hear from Administrative Code of
8 the City of New York [cheers/applause] and we'll hear
9 from him momentarily. We have the Manager of New
10 York Feile, Sean Price, who will also [applause] be
11 sharing the story, this historic moment in time where
12 we have a New York team that competed in Ireland and
13 now for 27 years there are teams throughout the world
14 that come to this competition to compete, and from 16
15 different countries and New York has been going for
16 27 years and they have not until this moment been
17 able to bring back a trophy, and the team from New
18 York who practices in Queens at Frank Golden Park in
19 Council Member Vallone's district, and also practices
20 in the Bronx at Gaelic Park in Council Member Cohen's
21 district pulled it together and you defied all odds
22 and we're so, so proud of you today, and now, I'd
23 like to ask for the Proclamation to be read.

24 CLERK: Council City of New York
25 Proclamation.

2 The New York City Council is proud to
3 honor the New York Feile GAA Team for their
4 outstanding performance and for becoming the first
5 New York team in 27 years to win Division 1 Feile
6 Peile Minog in Ireland; and

7 Whereas, in 1990, the New York Minor
8 Board resolved to enter their first Feile
9 competition. Over the years, they've won all the
10 titles along the way and in 2012, won the Division 2
11 title to progress to Division 1. In the last two
12 years they fought their way into the semi-finals. On
13 June 25, 2017, the New York Feile GAA Team made
14 history by scoring a comprehensive 3 to 7 and 0 to 2
15 Division 1 Cup final victory. Their Feile success
16 reaffirms the incredible progress being made in
17 Gaelic games across the Atlantic; and

18 Whereas, the New York Feile Team has been
19 guided to greater heights.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
21 [shushing for quiet]

22 Thanks to the leadership of an equally
23 dedicated backroom team Patrick Mulvihill, Paul
24 Moore, Patrick Curtis and Michael Coleman as well as
25 tour manager Collette McGelligan (sp?) and Team

2 Manager Sean Price. Working together they helped
3 these young players develop the skills they needed to
4 put their dreams within reach while also inspiring
5 them to dream even bigger. As a result, they
6 overcame very challenging opponents to win the
7 coveted Division one Feile Peile Manog Cup; and

8 Whereas, the 2017 New York Feile team is
9 comprised of 24 excellent players: Patrick Burk,
10 Colin Gargin, Nile McKenna, Finchin Corbett, Joseph
11 Grace, Killian Moore, Luke Corridan, Julian Jimshahi
12 (SP?), Evan Mulgrew, Brian Cogwin, Christopher
13 Kennedy, Christopher Mulvihill, Kieran Dolphin, James
14 Kirk, Keran O'Connor, Michael Doyle, Osheen Mathers,
15 Senon Price, Rory Duggan, Ronan McAllister, Colin
16 Shalby, Collin Fleming, Shayne McGilligan and Dennis
17 Ashton Walsh. We commend all of these players for
18 excelling in both their individual and collective
19 efforts throughout the season.

20 Now, therefore, be it known that the
21 Council of the City of New York gratefully honors
22 everyone on the New York Feile GAA Team for their
23 outstanding teamwork and congratulates them on—upon
24 winning the Irish National Competition's Division 1
25 Feile Peile Manog, and we wish them continued success

2 in all their future endeavors. Melissa Mark-
3 Viverito, Speaker for the Entire Council, Elizabeth
4 Crowley, Council Member 30th District Queens, Daniel
5 Dromm, Chair, Irish Caucus, Andrew Cohen, Council
6 Member 11th District the Bronx, Jimmy Van Bramer
7 Majority Leader 26th District Queens, Corey Johnson
8 Council Member 3rd District Manhattan and Paul A.
9 Vallone, Council Member 19th District Queens.
10 [cheers/applause]

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright, so,
12 first of all, congratulations to all of you. It's
13 really a pleasure to have you here in the Chamber
14 along with the Irish Caucus, and I know that we do
15 provide support for some of the programming, and so
16 we really want to thank you for the service that you
17 provide, those of you that lead the organizations,
18 and we have the Irish, the Consul General here with
19 us from Ireland. So, we would like him—he's
20 replacing Fran Barbara, but we believe we're going to
21 have Ace Esther (sic) in a partnership with you,
22 Consul General. So welcome to this Chamber, and we
23 would love you to say a few words, and then we'll ask
24 obviously the manager of the team to say a few words.

2 CIARAN MADDEN: Thank you, Madam Speaker
3 and thank you members of the Council and particularly
4 the members of the Irish Caucus. We feel that you've
5 made all this possible today. [cheers/applause] I
6 know that the team here in partnership with the
7 Council—the Council Members and the various
8 governments are putting in place infrastructure—

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
10 [shushing for quiet]

11 CIARAN MADDEN: --infrastructure all over
12 the city to make these sports possible as part of a
13 greater cooperation between various governments—
14 various communities and members of the Council
15 touching on culture, touching on immigration issues,
16 touching on heritage, which is so important, and
17 which we all value and value your support at all
18 times. Turning to the matter of the day, there are 2-
19 1/2 thousand football clubs in Ireland. There's 400
20 outside of the—of Ireland, and the team here is
21 effectively the under 14 were champions at Gaelic
22 football. So there is at everything they worked so
23 hard and every congratulation, and honor they have
24 earned with their parents and their managers.
25 [applause]

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Now, we're going
3 to hear from the Team Manager Sean Price.

4 [cheers/applause]

5 SEAN PRICE: Thank you. To be able to
6 come in here today and to be vetted by the City
7 Council it's absolutely great to get this far. All
8 these kids and their training staff Ms. Debra, their
9 parents they're up here and their siblings they
10 brought into training and it has all happened. So, I
11 think the--the whole day as far as recognition of
12 these kids. It's not about us as managers or
13 selectors or helpers. It's the kids and their
14 parents. That's what's keeping the Irish culture
15 alive, and to be recognized by the City Council
16 members and Irish Caucus and the Speaker, that's
17 really what it is about, and to have the Consulate
18 General it's probably his--one of his first official
19 engagements, and to be able to come here today it
20 puts it into perspective and it shows that it really
21 is a real worthwhile achievement. But there's a lot
22 of people that need to be thanked. So, I'm going to
23 ask Dennis Toomey who is the Chairman of the Minor
24 Board. He's the man that sets up the games and sets

2 up the schedule and has been working at it for years
3 and years. He had kids involved himself.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
5 [shushing for quiet]

6 SEAN PRICE: So, I'm going to ask Dennis
7 to come up and say a few words, and he's going to
8 give a presentation, to others. (sic) [applause]

9 DENNIS ASHTON WALSH: Thank you. Thank
10 you. On behalf of the New York Minor Board, I would
11 first of all like to thank the City Council for
12 hosting us here today. Thank you very much. To the
13 Irish Cousul General, thank you for your support.
14 It's very much needed--

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
16 [shushing for quiet]

17 DENNIS ASHTON WALSH: --and very much
18 appreciated. To be on the 14 Feile team guys, you did
19 us proud back there in Ireland to win and compete in
20 the Feile and to win Division 1, you-you made us all
21 proud. A job well done. Also, to the managers and
22 the management team, what a terrific job they did,
23 and also the parents keeping our Irish game and our
24 Irish culture alive and well. Thank you very
25 much.[cheers/applause, background comments, pause]

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright, again
3 congratulations and [applause] that ends ceremonials.
4 [background comments, pause] Who—I am putting him on
5 the spot. Who's the Captain? [background comments]
6 Alright, so come on. One of you step up. [background
7 comments] No? Where's the Captain? Alright, so I
8 guess they won't speak. Okay. You worked on behalf
9 of your team mates. Alright.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
11 [shushing for quiet] Where's the Captain? The
12 Captain has to speak. [background comments]

13 SEAN PRICE: The Captain doesn't want to
14 speak, but before we do that, I'd like give a
15 presentation for Liz Crowley and make a presentation
16 for the Speaker. It's probably, of course—it's an
17 Irish Book of Crowleys (sic)of the Crowleys of
18 Farrigan, Ireland and on it has the Minor Board Crest
19 and it has the crest of the City of New York.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Oh, wow.

21 SEAN PRICE: So, it's probably the first
22 time ever it's being put on an Irish book block.
23 [applause] So, and there's [cheers/applause]. So,
24 hopefully, you can keep that in your office, and
25 we're hoping that we can get all our elected

2 officials re-elected on Tuesday. I know there's the
3 prime result there. So, hopefully, we can get that
4 moving alright. Thank you. [background comments,
5 pause]

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We have to clear
7 the floor. Can we please clear the floor?

8 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet please. Quiet
9 place.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: May we clear the
11 floor? Thank you, guys. Congratulations.

12 [background comments, pause]

13 CLERK: Ladies and gentlemen, can I have
14 your attention, please. Can I have your attention,
15 please. Quiet on the floor, please. Quite on the
16 floor,

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
18 [shushing for quiet] May we have quite.

19 CLERK: At this time please place all
20 electronic devices to vibrate. All electronic
21 devices to vibrate. Will all non-Council employees,
22 non-Council employees please leave the main floor of
23 the Chambers. There is additional seating upstairs
24 in the balcony. Thank you.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
3 Chambers, please.

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quite please.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Will everybody
6 please take their seats. Quiet in the Chambers.
7 Please close the doors. Everyone please find seats
8 in the back. All rise for the Pledge of Allegiance.

9 CLERK: All rise.

10 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: All rise.

11 [Pledge of Allegiance]

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated.

13 Roll call.

14 CLERK: Barron.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present

16 CLERK: Borelli.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Here.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing] May
19 we have quiet in the Chambers, please for the roll
20 call. Please find your seats and please remove your
21 caps. Continue with roll call. Thank you.

22 CLERK: Thank you. Cabrera.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.

24 CLERK: Chin.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

2 CLERK: Cohen.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

4 CLERK: Constantinides.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.

6 CLERK: Cornegy.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Here.

8 CLERK: Crowley. Cumbo. Deutsch.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Here.

10 CLERK: Dromm.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.

12 CLERK: Espinal.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.

14 CLERK: Eugene. Ferreras-Copeland.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: Here.

16 CLERK: Garodnick.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.

18 CLERK: Gentile.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Here.

20 CLERK: Gibson.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Here.

22 CLERK: Greenfield.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Here.

24 CLERK: Grodenchik.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Here.

2 CLERK: Johnson.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Here.

4 CLERK: Kallos.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

6 CLERK: King.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.

8 CLERK: Koo.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

10 CLERK: Koslowitz. Lancman.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.

12 CLERK: Lander.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.

14 CLERK: Levin.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.

16 CLERK: Levine.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

18 CLERK: Maisel.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.

20 CLERK: Mealy. Menchaca.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.

22 CLERK: Mendez.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.

24 CLERK: Miller

25 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Present.

2 CLERK: Palma.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Here.

4 CLERK: Perkins.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: What's that? I
6 mean here.

7 CLERK: Reynoso.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Here.

9 CLERK: Richards.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

11 CLERK: Rodriguez. Rose.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.

13 CLERK: Rosenthal. Salamanca.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.

15 CLERK: Torres.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Here.

17 CLERK: Treyger.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.

19 CLERK: Ulrich. Vacca.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.

21 CLERK: Vallone.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

23 CLERK: Williams.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.

25 CLERK: Matteo.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Here.

3 CLERK: Van Bramer

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Here.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All rise for the
7 invocation. The invo--

8 CLERK: All rise.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: The invocation
10 will be delivered by Pastor Terry Lee of By-Way &
11 Hedges Youth For Christ Ministries in the great
12 borough of Brooklyn. Quiet in the Chambers.

13 PASTOR TERRY LEE: Lets us first have a
14 moment of silent for all the families of 9/11 and
15 those who were lost in the hurricane at this time.
16 [moment of silence observed] Let us pray. Eternal
17 Father and our God, you are our help of ages past.
18 You are the God of Israel, the God of Isaac, the God
19 of Abraham, the God of Moses. We come to you today
20 just to say thank you for one more day. Let as we
21 come together in this time, oh, God, I pray as we
22 remember those who have lost their life, oh, God, to
23 the 9/11 attack and as we reflect, oh, God, I pray
24 that you will give us the strength knowing, Lord,
25 that we will overcome. Lord, those families who are

2 facing, oh, God, deep challenges, oh, God, during the
3 hurricane, oh, God all over the country and all over
4 the world today. I pray that you will grant mercies.
5 Lord, remember those that are less fortunate and
6 today. Lord, remember our immigrants, brothers and
7 sisters who travel from all over the world to be
8 here, those who serve as responders. Oh, God those
9 who help in the time of crisis. I pray your mercies.
10 Lord, strengthen, oh, God, our Council today. I pray
11 for our leaders. I pray that you will grant, oh,
12 God, wisdom, knowledge and understanding. Lord, I
13 pray that you will give us strength. Lord, remember
14 our city. Protect, Oh, God, those who war serving
15 law enforcement. Keep us, oh, God, from all acts of
16 terrorism, and I pray that you will guide us and that
17 you will protect us. Lord, bind us together as Jews
18 and Gentiles, Greeks, Barbarians, rich and poor,
19 young and old and let us stay together as Churchill
20 said, oh, God speak and said that the enemy is about
21 us, and if we come together, the enemy would have a
22 harder task with all of us together, but if not, the
23 enemy would have us separately. Bind us together in
24 the spirit of oneness and, Lord, we give you praise,

2 we give you honor, and we give you glory. In your
3 name we pray amen and amen. Thank you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

5 Please be-- Amen. Please be seated. A motion to--

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [interposing]

7 Before we--before we get started, Madam Public
8 Advocate, I'm going to have to ask if we could all--
9 we've been asked to file out of the Chamber and into
10 the Rotunda area temporarily. For the first floor in
11 the Rotunda. We're able to that orderly and quietly.
12 If we could just go downstairs to the Rotunda until--

13 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Would
14 you go please--

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --until we're
16 asked to come back.

17 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: I'm advising all the--

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

19 Everyone please use both exits and file out orderly.

20 [background comments]

21 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Use both hands,
22 please.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: I guess we got a
24 crank call. [background comments, pause]

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please. Quiet
3 on the floor. Quiet down.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
5 [shushing for quiet] And now, let's resume the Stated
6 Council. We are not at the motion to spread the
7 invocation in full upon the record by Council Member
8 Jumaane Williams.

9 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
10 down, please. Quiet down.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
12 Jumaane Williams will spread the invocation that was
13 delivered by Reverend Pastor Terry Lee of the Byway
14 and Hedges Youth for Christ Ministries in the Borough
15 of Brooklyn. Council Member Williams.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I'd like—I'd
17 like to have a motion to spread the invocation in
18 full upon the record, and I want to say thank you to
19 Pastor Terry Lee who was shared by myself and Council
20 Member Darlene Mealy. He can be frequently found in
21 and around Flatbush with his huge truck blasting
22 Reggae music and if you didn't listen clearly you'd
23 think it's popular Reggae music. If you listen
24 closely, you will hear Jesus evoked many times in his
25 gospel Reggae as it blast down his truck. Whenever

2 there's a situation in Flatbush, a shooting the
3 police issue, Pastor Terry is front and center. Many
4 years ago, he began his unity walk in the effort to
5 continue police community relations. He is
6 ubiquitous in the Flatbush community. Everybody
7 knows his voice, his prayer and his truck, and he is
8 Godsend in our community and I thank him very much.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [off mic] Thank
10 you, pastor. [on mic] Thank you, Council Member and
11 thank you Pastor. Adoption of Minutes. Council
12 Member Deutsch.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Motion of the
14 Minutes of the Stated Meeting on July 28, 2017 be
15 adopted as printed.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Messages and
17 Papers from the Mayor.

18 CLERK: M 542 Recall of Introduction
19 1648-A.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Consumer Affairs.

21 CLERK: M 543 Withdrawing Mario Gooden
22 for appointment to the Landmarks Preservation
23 Commission.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Received order,
25 printed and filed.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 40

2 CLERK: M 544 Withdrawing Anne Holford-
3 Smith for appointment to the Landmarks Preservation
4 Commission.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Received order,
6 printed and filed.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication
8 from city, county and borough offices.

9 CLERK: None.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and
11 Communications.

12 CLERK: None.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use Call-
14 Ups.

15 CLERK: M 545 and 546 City Planning
16 Commission Applications.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on call-
18 up vote and I ask for a roll call for Land Use Call-
19 Ups.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
21 Chambers for a roll call vote on Land Use Call-Ups.

22 CLERK: Barron.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye.

24 CLERK: Borelli.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

41

2 CLERK: Cabrera.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye.

4 CLERK: Chin.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.

6 CLERK: Cohen.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

8 CLERK: Constantinides.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye.

10 CLERK: Cornegy.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye.

13 CLERK: Dromm.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

15 CLERK: Espinal.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.

17 CLERK: Eugene.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.

19 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: Aye.

21 CLERK: Garodnick. Gentile.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye.

23 CLERK: Gibson. Greenfield.

24

25

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

42

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Can I get
3 permission to vote on all the General Order items as
4 well-

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Not at-

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: [interposing]
7 Due to lateness of the hour.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member,
9 at this point in time I cannot grant that motion.
10 Sorry.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Okay.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: How do you vote
13 on Land Use Call-Ups?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Aye.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank-thank you.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I vote aye I
17 guess. Thank you.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughing]

19 CLERK: Grodenchik.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.

21 CLERK: Johnson.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Aye.

23 CLERK: Kallos.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.

25

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
3 [shushing for quiet]

4 CLERK: King.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye on all.

6 CLERK: Koo.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.

8 CLERK: Lancman.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

10 CLERK: Lander.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye.

12 CLERK: Levin.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.

14 CLERK: Levine.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.

16 CLERK: Maisel.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Aye.

18 CLERK: Mealy. Menchaca. Mendez.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.

20 CLERK: Miller

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Affirmative.

22 CLERK: Palma.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.

24 CLERK: Perkins.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye.

2 CLERK: Reynoso. Richards.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.

4 CLERK: Rodriguez.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [off mic]

6 CLERK: Rose.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

8 CLERK: Salamanca.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye.

10 CLERK: Torres. Tryeger.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

12 CLERK: Vacca.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Aye.

14 CLERK: Vallone.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye.

16 CLERK: Williams.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye.

18 CLERK: Matteo.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Aye.

20 CLERK: VAN BRAMER.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye.

22 CLERK: Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Aye. [pause]

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Today's Land Use

25 Call-Ups are adopted by a vote of 38 in the

2 affirmative 0 in the negative. Quite in the Chambers
3 as we now hear from the Speaker Melissa Mark-
4 Viverito.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Good afternoon,
6 buenos tardes. Thank you Madam Public Advocate.
7 Before we begin today's agenda, there are a few
8 things I wanted to address as a Chamber. Since our
9 last meeting our country has been or anticipated
10 being severely impacted by the effects of multiple
11 outsized weather systems. In regions of Texas and
12 Louisiana recovery from Hurricane Harvey is till too
13 perilous to begin. While rebuilding can be done, it
14 will take years and hundreds of billions of dollars
15 to complete, and thousands of people have been left
16 without homes or sufficient resources in the interim.
17 Today, parts of the Caribbean and Florida coasts
18 brace for the landfall of Hurricane Irma. Already
19 the Island of Barbuda has been decimated by this
20 storm. We were very lucky that Puerto Rico suffered
21 minimal damage, and it seems like Hispanola will be
22 safe as well. We know the State of New York has
23 deployed aid personnel to affected areas of the
24 American coast, and that's still, you know, our
25 communities that have relatives in Puerto Rico, the

2 Dominican Republic and other impacted regions of the
3 Caribbean are still anticipating information. So we
4 want to reassure them that we will help to the best
5 of our ability in connecting with their families.
6 Many of us in this room are among those with families
7 affected over the last two weeks, and while our
8 concerns are valid, we must remember not to only pay
9 attention when it affects us most closely. Climate
10 change is real. It is happening and it has become
11 undeniable. I am proud of the work that this council
12 has done on green issues over the years, and
13 encourage that work to continue as we look forward to
14 a new session. I would also like to remind everyone
15 here that all of those employed by the Council and
16 the City of New York are able to enroll in the NYC
17 Gives Program enabling them to automatically direct a
18 portion of their paycheck toward qualifying non-
19 profit organizations. Several participating
20 organizations are doing great work in Texas and
21 across the coasts, and by enrolling through the NYCAP
22 Employee Self-Service Portal, you can lend a hand in
23 those efforts as well. And on the subject of uniting
24 in the face of adversity, I would like to give a
25 moment to something we've covered a lot this week.

2 In my capacity as Speaker, it has once again become
3 necessary to publicly reaffirm this Council's
4 commitment to the support and defense of the
5 immigrant communities of New York City. Documented
6 or undocumented they're a major part of what makes
7 our city great, and in spite of the racist,
8 xenophobic and frankly nonsensical behavior of this
9 presidential administration and this president in
10 particular, we will not be bullied to standing down
11 on supporting those who come to this country in
12 search of a better life for themselves and their
13 families. Our work on this issues has been
14 relentless, and we will continue to support the
15 mission of DACA and stand behind the Dreamers who
16 call this city home. And before closing out, I want
17 to recognize the recent death of Assembly Member and
18 Queens representative Michael Simanowitz who passed
19 away on Saturday at the age of 46. I know some
20 people that served with him here, and a lot of people
21 that were deeply touched by him, and touched by his
22 death. I know that Council Member Barry Grodenchik
23 was particularly close to him, and I would ask him to
24 say a few words as we pay recognition to the Assembly

2 Member and his contributions to our city. Council
3 Member Grodenchik.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you,
5 Madam Speaker and Madam Public Advocate. I'm going
6 to keep this brief because those of you who knew Mike
7 he distained long speeches to the maximum. I may be
8 an oxymoron, but he was always sitting in the back of
9 the room wherever we were, and he cared greatly about
10 people. I first met Mike over two-two decades ago
11 when he came into our club and he was the youngest
12 person I had seen there in quite a while carrying 37
13 signatures all Democratic, of course, and those of us
14 who have carried petitions, which is every one of us
15 in this room understand what it means to find a young
16 person who is interested in-in politics. I was lucky
17 enough to introduce him to a woman who was both of
18 our mentor, Assemblywoman Betty Mayersohn, and he
19 served for about 15 years as her Chief of Staff
20 before taking her place in the New York State
21 Assembly almost six years ago to this day. This
22 Saturday we lost a giant. He was a gentle giant. He
23 was just one of the sweetest people I ever knew in my
24 life. I want to wish you-issue condolences to his
25 wife Jennifer, their children Ellen Shabba (sic)

2 Yulaton, Max and their little one Ricky. His parents
3 Sheila and Sherman Simanowitz of Forest Hills; his
4 father-in-law Jack Bayliss of Hillcrest; his mother-
5 in-law a blessed memory Pearl Bayliss; his brothers
6 Allen, Barry and his entire extended family. One of
7 the Rabbis who spoke on Sunday at Michael's funeral
8 reminded us that all we take to the HaOlam HaBa,
9 which is the world to come are our good deeds. I
10 have no doubt that Michael Simanowitz arrived in
11 heaven several large steamer trunks overflowing with
12 the thousands and thousands people he helped and the
13 good deeds that he-he committed in their names. I
14 want to say it was never about him. In all the years
15 that I knew Michael he never once asked me for a
16 favor for himself, which in our business, to be
17 frank, is extraordinary. I just want to end by
18 saying that may his good deeds live on forever. May
19 the thousands and thousands of people he helped in
20 his all too short life remember his acts of kindness
21 and may be multiplied many fold. May the life he led
22 inspire all who knew him to live lives consecrated to
23 good deeds and helping others. May his memory be
24 fore a blessing and may his memory live on forever in
25 our hearts. I will leave you with a few words from

2 Skakespeare from Hamlet: He was a man. Take him for
3 all in all. I shall not look upon his like again.
4 Thank you Madam Public Advocate and Madam Speaker for
5 this opportunity.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Barry
7 for those words. So, I would ask everyone to join me
8 in a moment of silence for Assembly Member Steve
9 Simanowitz.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All rise.

11 (Moment of Silence Observed)

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Than you, my
13 colleagues.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Moving onto the
16 agenda for today, the Council will begin by voting on
17 three appointments to city boards and commissions.
18 First the reappointment of John Plateau as
19 Commissioner of Elections for the Brooklyn Board of
20 Elections and Mario Gooden and Anne Holford-Smith
21 both to the Landmarks Preservation Commission. The
22 Council will also vote on multiple land use items
23 related to the rezoning of public siting of locations
24 throughout Queens, Manhattan, Brooklyn, and Staten
25 Island. In Council Member Levin's District BS2 for

2 Community Living in Brooklyn will receive a vote on
3 facilitating the renovation and expansion of the
4 existing building to allow for an increase in
5 available supportive and affordable housing options.
6 In my own district we will voting on an amendment to
7 the Harlem—East Harlem Urban Renewal Plan that will
8 redraw site boundaries and change allow able site
9 usage of the Department of Sanitation’s District 11
10 garage in Manhattan. This vote would enable the
11 relocation of the garage and lot cleaning unit and
12 allow for the development of a proposed site
13 including 24,282 square feet of adjacent land on
14 which a new building will be constructed. And the
15 District 11 Sanitation Garage near the end of its
16 useful life, relocation from its current location
17 adjacent to the Metropolitan Hospital, the public
18 school and existing residential buildings stands as
19 an important goal for the Department of Sanitation
20 and for my community. Having identified a temporary
21 site and an existing manufacturing zone for the
22 Sanitation Garage to relocate to will provide the
23 Department of Sanitation with time to develop a more
24 permanent solution. I commend the Department of
25 Sanitation for agreeing to work with the community to

2 identify a permanent site and build a new state-of-
3 the-art facility for the District 11 garage within
4 the next ten years while at the same time minimizing
5 the impact of the temporary site by ensuring that
6 Sanitation vehicles are no longer parked along our
7 streets. As we look toward the future, we will also
8 be voting on the creation of the East Shore Special
9 Coastal Risk District in Council Member Matteo's
10 district, and a series of land use actions to
11 redevelop and revitalize approximately 22 blocks of
12 the downtown Far Rockaway community in Council Member
13 Richards' district. The Council will also be
14 considering a resolution today, Resolution 1636-2017,
15 which I sponsored and which urges Congress to reject
16 proposed reforms to cut funding to the Supplemental
17 Nutrition Assistance Program also known as SNAP. The
18 Trump Administration's 2018 Budget Proposal would
19 make \$193 billion in cuts to SNAP over a 10-year
20 period. Restricting eligibility requirements and
21 limiting the total amount of benefits available to
22 those who do qualify. Under this proposal New York
23 State will be charged with finding an additional \$1.2
24 billion with which to fund the program by 2023
25 resulting in further cuts to SNAP in our state or an

2 increase in taxes as the cost burden is shifted to
3 citizens. With 1.7 million food insecure New Yorkers
4 making use of SNAP each year, not to mention the
5 millions more around the country both children and
6 adults who rely on the program to meet their
7 nutritional needs, it cannot be emphasized enough how
8 important maintaining current funding levels is to
9 the health and wellbeing of our country. So I look
10 forward to voting on this resolution today. I also
11 encourage all of us to reach out to Congress and
12 speak out against the proposed funding cuts to this
13 vital program. On staff I want to thank Tonya Cyrus,
14 Andrea Vazquez, Terzah Nasser, and Ayesha Schaumburg.
15 Next, the Council will be voting on Intro 401-A
16 sponsored by Council Member Carlos Menchaca, which
17 will require the Department of Transportation and the
18 Department of Parks and Recreation to issue a report
19 on or before June 30, 2018 regarding the potential
20 installation of Bike Share near certain parks. I
21 want to thank Faizah Malik, Jonathan Masserano, Emily
22 Rooney, Gafar Zaalof, Terzah Nasser and Ayesha
23 Schaumburg for working on this bill. Also, we said
24 good-bye to this summer this past weekend, but soon
25 that won't mean saying good-bye to the city's beaches

2 as Introduction 629-A sponsored by Council Member
3 Mark Levine would require the Department of Parks and
4 Recreation to extend the length of the beach and pool
5 season to one week past Labor Day to accommodate for
6 warmer temperatures in September. I want to thank
7 Kris Sartori, Patrick Mulvihill, Chima Obichere,
8 Kenneth Grace and Jim Wilcox for the work on that
9 bill. And next, the Council is going to vote on a
10 package of two bills dealing with reporting on
11 certain city provided programs and services for the
12 disabled. Introduction 1236-A sponsored by Council
13 Member Joe Borelli would require the Department of
14 Health and Mental Hygiene to submit a report to the
15 Mayor and Speaker on the number of individuals
16 receiving services for Autism Spectrum Disorders from
17 the Department of Health or from programs
18 administered by the Department of Health. And Intros
19 14 24-A sponsored by Council Member Andy Cohen will
20 require the Department of Education to include in
21 their Special Education Report the total number of
22 students within each individualized education program
23 disability classification. The report would be
24 disaggregated by district, eligibility for free and
25 reduced price lunch program, race, ethnicity, gender,

2 English Language Learner status, recommended language
3 of instruction and grade level. This additional
4 information would enable the Council to notice trends
5 in IEP classifications in different communities, and
6 if necessary, address inequities in service and/or
7 diagnosis. I want to thank Nicole Abene, Sylvester
8 Yavana, Michael Benjamin, Crilhien Francisco, Janette
9 Merrill, Terzah Nasser, and Ayesha Schaumburg for the
10 work on those two bills. Additionally, tenants in
11 private one and two-family dwellings are not covered
12 by the City's existing Harassment Law. This means
13 that tenants in these buildings have little to no
14 protection against harassment. Intro 1550-A,
15 sponsored by Council Member Helen Rosenthal will
16 expand the city's Harassment Law to protect tenants
17 of one and two-family private dwellings. I want to
18 thank Megan Chin, Guillermo Patino, Jose Conde, and
19 Sarah Gastelum for their work on that bill. Then
20 finally, the Council will vote on a package of
21 legislation aimed at enhancing and streamlining the
22 resources of Social Services and support that the
23 city strives to offer our immigrant communities each
24 day.

2 As first announced in my February State
3 of the City Address, Intro 1566-A sponsored by
4 myself, Council Member Dromm and Council Member
5 Rodriguez would expand the role and mission of the
6 Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs, and position it
7 to more effectively lead the city's efforts to
8 promote the welfare of immigrants regardless of their
9 status. Among the many specifications laid out, MOIA
10 would be charged with working with the Civil Justice
11 Coordinator to assess the legal services needs of
12 immigrants; establishing a State and Federal Affairs
13 Unit to follow changing federal laws and policies;
14 consulting with city agencies on the implementation
15 of laws and policies designed to protect immigrants;
16 consulting with agencies on best practices for
17 serving victims of crime and human trafficking; and
18 reporting annually to the Council on its activities
19 and the unique needs of the immigrant community in
20 our city.

21 Also, Intro 1578 is also being considered
22 sponsored by myself and Immigration Committee Chair
23 Carlos Menchaca would create a MOIA led interagency
24 task force to bring together the heads of city
25 agencies and mayoral offices to assess the needs of

2 New York City's immigrant communities and to provide
3 agencies with recommendations and best practices.
4 Additionally, agencies will look for ways to
5 coordinate city services for immigrants especially
6 particularly vulnerable immigrants such as victims of
7 crime and human trafficking. Individuals who are
8 LGBTQI, individuals with Criminal Justice System
9 involvement and minors. It goes without saying that
10 immigrant rights are facing relentless attacks under
11 the current political climate. With over three
12 million immigrants calling New York City home,
13 standing up for our residents, representing our
14 communities, serving those who elected us, and
15 showing and speaking out in defense of those who
16 chose to make their lives in our great city all mean
17 the same thing, letting immigrant New Yorkers know
18 you are welcome here. So, I'm proud to lead the
19 Council that has done more for the protection of
20 immigrants than any other municipal legislative body
21 in the nation, and I look forward to a vote on these
22 issues and obviously everything else that's on the
23 agency today. So, with that, thank you Madam Public
24 Advocate. That ends Communication from the Speaker.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

3 Discussion of General Orders. Seeing none, Report of
4 Special Committees.

5 CLERK: None.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports of
7 Standing Committees.

8 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
9 Housing and Buildings, Intro 1550-A, Harassment in
10 Private dwellings.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
12 coupled on General Orders.

13 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
14 Immigration, Intro 1566-A Office of Immigrant
15 Affairs.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
17 coupled on General Orders.

18 CLERK: Intro 1578-A, Immigrant Affairs
19 Task Force.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
21 coupled on General Orders.

22 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Land
23 Use, LU 730 and Reso 1641 through LU 732 and Reso
24 1643, Zoning Amendments.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

59

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
3 General Orders.

4 CLERK: LU 733 through LU 736 on page 4
5 Various Applications.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Approved and mod-
7 approved with modifications and referred to the City
8 Planning Commission pursuant to Rule 11.70(b)(b) of
9 the Rules of the Council and Section 197-(d) of the
10 New York City Charter

11 CLERK: Excuse me. LU 743 and Reso 1657.
12 Still on page 4.

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Yes, approved
14 with modifications and coupled on General Orders.

15 CLERK: LU 744 and Reso 1644 and LU 745
16 and Reso 1645, Special Coastal Risk District.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
18 General Orders.

19 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Mental
20 Health, Developmental Disability, Alcoholism,
21 Substance Abuse and Disability Services. Intro 1236-
22 A, Autism Disorder Reporting.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
24 coupled on General Orders.

25

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

60

2 CLERK: Intro 1424-A, Disability
3 Classification Reporting.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
5 coupled on General Orders.

6 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Parks
7 and Recreation, Intro 629-A, Length of Season for
8 City Beaches.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
10 coupled on General Orders.

11 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
12 Transportation Intro 401-A Bike Share Near Parks.

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I'm sorry, 629-A.

14 CLERK: Strike that. Intro 401-A.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: 401-A. Okay,
16 Amended and coupled on General Orders.

17 CLERK: On the General Order Calendar LU
18 716 and Reso 1646 through LU 720 and Reso 1649 on
19 page 6 Zoning Resolution.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
21 General Orders.

22 CLERK: LU 721 and Reso 1650 through 726
23 and Reso 1655, Far Rockaway Urban Renewal.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
25 General Orders.

2 CLERK: LU 727 and Reso 1656 Property
3 Acquisition.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
5 General Orders.

6 CLERK: Resolution appointing various
7 persons Commissioners of Deeds.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
9 General Orders. Just going back to page 4 on LU 743
10 because there is a change on our agenda. I guess
11 it's just approved with modification and Coupled on
12 General Orders. Okay, you know that. Okay. So now
13 I ask for a roll call vote on all General Order
14 items.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Can we begin the
16 roll call with-by call Council Member Greenfield?

17 CLERK: Council Member Greenfield.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: You're very
19 kind. Thank you. I wish all my colleagues a happy
20 and healthy Jewish New York and I vote aye.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

22 CLERK: Barron.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Pass.

24 CLERK: Borelli.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all
3 except 1539, 1540, 1550, 1565 and 1578.

4 CLERK: Cabrera.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye on all.

6 CLERK: Chin.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Permission to
8 explain my vote?

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Today, we going to
11 vote on the second of two special permit applications
12 at 462 Broadway LU 716 and Reso 1646. The first for
13 a large scale retail was denied earlier this month.
14 However, the applicant has agreed to critical
15 quality-

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
17 [shushing for quiet]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: --quality of life
19 restrictions that address many of the concerns that I
20 and members of this community are having regarding
21 large and ongoing retail operations in a mixed use
22 community. This agreement approved retail use below
23 the second floor, but only for stores with less than
24 10,000 square feet of selling space including the
25 cellar. Most importantly, it creates a desperately

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 63

2 needed new paradigm in this iconic neighborhood. We
3 are sending a strong message that oversized retail
4 has no place in SoHo. Thanks to the dedication of
5 Community Board 2, residents of SoHo and the staff of
6 the Land Use Division, Raju Mann, Julie Lubin, Dylan
7 Casey and Leslie (sic) for the hard work on this
8 project and also thank you to my Land Use Director
9 Roxanne Early. I vote aye on all.

10 CLERK: Cohen.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I am abstaining on
12 LU 718 and 719, and I am voting aye on all other
13 items on the General Orders Calendar.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

15 CLERK: Constantinides.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: I vote
17 aye.

18 CLERK: Cornegy.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye on all.

20 CLERK: Crowley. Deutsch.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: I abstain on
22 1550-A, 1566-A and 1578-A and aye on the rest.

23 CLERK: Dromm.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye on all.

25 CLERK: Espinal. Eugene.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I want to request
3 your permission to vote on all Land Use Call-Ups.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: And all items on
6 today's agenda.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very
9 much and I vote aye.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Uh-hm.

11 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: I vote
13 aye.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

15 CLERK: Garodnick.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

18 CLERK: Gentile.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye on all.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

21 CLERK: Gibson.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

23 [shushing for quiet]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I vote aye on
25 all.

2 CLERK: Grodenchik.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye on all.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 CLERK: Johnson.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Aye.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

8 CLERK: Kallos.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye on all.

10 CLERK: King.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Permission to call-
12 vote on all Land Use Call-Ups and general Orders on
13 the calendar.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: I vote aye.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. We're
17 still in Chambers. Please quiet in the Chambers,
18 please.

19 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet.

20 CLERK: Koo.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: (coughs) Aye on all.

22 CLERK: Lancman.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: [off mic] Aye on
24 all.

25 CLERK: Lander.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: At a moment when
3 we are called to stand up for immigrants against
4 these just truly cruel and un-American attacks, I
5 just want to express my gratitude to the Speaker and
6 to Chair Menchaca for leading this body in that
7 effort as always. Thank you. I vote aye on all.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

9 CLERK: Levin.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye on all.

11 CLERK: Levine.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye on all.

13 CLERK: Maisel. Mealy. Menchaca.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to
15 explain my vote?

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: When this
18 President or anyone stands up and speaks hate and
19 xenophobia and racism against our communities, what
20 does this Council do? We stand up and we fight back
21 and we fight back with legislation with resolutions,
22 with budget, and the power of love that New Yorkers
23 feel in every fiber of their person, and today we
24 affirm that commitment to protect our immigrant
25 families.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
3 [shushing for quiet] Excuse me, Council Member.
4 Quiet in the Chambers, please. We are still in
5 session.

6 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Folks, keep it down,
7 please if you can.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: I apologize.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you.
10 That affirmation and commitment to our immigrant
11 families is addressed by the package you are seeing
12 here today. 1578 allows us to do what I have done so
13 much in my time as the Chair of the Immigration
14 Committee to bring agencies together so that they all
15 from education to parks to the economy to health that
16 all agencies work with the Mayor's Office of
17 Immigrant Affairs so that they can create synergy to
18 improve the lives of all our immigrants. In a time
19 of fear they are going back into the shadows and it
20 is time now that in a moment of historic increases in
21 funding for legal representation, for education and
22 for healthcare that they have access to every single
23 dollar because it is true that while we serve every
24 single New Yorker, every single New Yorker must get
25 access to the things that we support. Intro 4041-A

2 also does that to bring Parks and the Department of
3 Transportation and Motivate to think about Citi Bike
4 in a way that creates synergy so that when we expand
5 to every corner of this city, everyone can use Citi
6 Bike, and the analysis that comes back allows us to
7 really expand it in a way that thinks about our parks
8 as place to recreate, exercise, and commute. I want
9 to thank the Speaker and this Council for continuing
10 to stand up and fight back against all the hate that
11 is coming down from Washington. This city is a
12 sanctuary city and I'm proud to be serving in it.
13 Thank you.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

15 [background comments]

16 CLERK: Mendez.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I vote aye

18 CLERK: Miller.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye on all except
20 for 1550.

21 CLERK: Crowley.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I vote aye.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

24 CLERK: Palma.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.

2 CLERK: Perkins.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye on all.

4 CLERK: Reynoso.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Congratulations
6 to Council Member Carlos Menchaca. I vote aye on
7 all.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

9 CLERK: Richards.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Permission to
11 explain my vote.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you,
14 Madam Public Advocate. Today I'm proud to stand here
15 as we usher in a new era for the Rockaway community,
16 but more importantly I'm most proud that this plan
17 will benefit both the existing community and
18 newcomers to the Rockaway Peninsula. The infusion of
19 \$288 million—

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
21 [shushing for quiet]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: of investment
23 we have secured from the de Blasio Administration
24 will ensure that we strengthen our infrastructure,
25 create quality jobs, improve our streetscape and

2 provide both new open space and community facility
3 uses for our community. After two years of robust
4 community planning and releasing the Roadmap to
5 Action with the Far Rockaway Working Group, I can
6 truly say we not only heard the community, but are
7 implementing tools to this rezoning that will ensure
8 the amenities our community has requested for the
9 past 40 years will finally come to fruition. With
10 the support of this plan, the Far Rockaway community
11 has overwhelmingly stated that it is time for change,
12 and while I know there are a lot of concerns around
13 gentrification in the city, this plan aims to show
14 that we can achieve economic growth without
15 displacing communities' residents. The city is
16 making a significant investment to provide housing
17 that is affordable to Rockaway residents. This plan--
18 --this--the--this planning process has ensure that 100%
19 of new housing bit on public land will be affordable,
20 and the city intends to create 1,700 new units in the
21 Urban Renewal Area better known as Thriftway Mall
22 that will be 100% affordable for families earning 30%
23 of AMI or below. We've also secured some other
24 significant investments: \$77 million for streetscape
25 and infrastructure improvements, nearly \$78 million

2 for parks and some—also some additional money to
3 upgrade existing parks included Bays Water Park and
4 Redfern Playground. We also have a commitment by the
5 city to reserve a portion of the URA for the FDA to
6 provide a new school and add an additional \$10
7 million in new funding [bell] that will be used to
8 investment in existing schools, and also a pilot to
9 expand the ferry shuttle service of Downtown Far
10 Rockaway. With that being said, my time is up. It
11 is a new day in Far Rockaway. I want to just say
12 thank you to a few individuals who rally helped this
13 plan move forward. First off, I want to thank the
14 Mayor--

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
16 Council Member, can you bring your comments to a
17 close?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --all the Land
19 Use staff Raju Mann, Amy, John, Dylan and my staff
20 Mercedes Buchanan, Devany Brown, Jordan Gibbons,
21 David Greenfield and all of the commissioners who are
22 part of this including Deputy--

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
24 Thank you.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --Mayor Alicia
3 Glen, EDC President--

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
5 Council Member. Thank you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --James
7 Patchett, HPD Commissioner--

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
9 Thank you. We thank all of them.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --Maria Torres-
11 Springer, and City Planning--

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [interposing] I
13 mean I don't want--

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Now, I'm going
16 to vote, but I am over it.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: But I wanted to
19 just say thank you to these people.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Et al. [laughs]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So, thank you.
22 I will send a Tweet. Thank you, Madam Public
23 Advocate.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughs]

25 Continuing roll call.

2 CLERK: Rodriguez.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Permission to
4 explain my vote.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, who do you
6 want to thank? [laughter]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: I want to
8 thank the Public Advocate. Thank you, Speaker and
9 also I would like to thank the Immigrant-Immigration
10 Chair Carlos Menchaca, my colleague the sponsors of
11 Intro 1566 the great Chairman of Education Danny
12 Dromm. This week we raised our voice for New York
13 City to Chicago to Boston to Los Angeles and cities
14 throughout the nation in a collective rejection to
15 move our-well, to move our president to end DACA and
16 today we will legislate-we will legislate in response
17 as well. Throughout Intro 1566 we reaffirm that New
18 York City has always been and always will be a home
19 of immigrants. We will expand the role of the
20 Office of Immigration-Immigrant Affairs so all
21 immigrants are protected not only from ICE but also
22 to get all the services that they deserve and they
23 need. I want to acknowledge Amanda Morales who came
24 from Guatemala (sic), the mother of three now facing
25 deportation who is standing strong in a sanctuary

2 church in my district. I want to acknowledge Edward
3 Garcia-Vazquez a member of the Teamsters Union for
4 over 25 years who we just learned today was deported
5 yesterday despite having a family here where he has
6 contributed so much. I want to acknowledge that many
7 immigrant-immigrants documented and undocumented
8 served in the United States armed forces while
9 literally putting their lives on the line to defend
10 a country that often rejects their place in it. I
11 also want to acknowledge our Alfonso Bien, a
12 gentleman who gave his life in Texas last week while
13 saving the lives of others cleaning up after
14 Hurricane Harvey. We wasn't ask to do—we didn't ask
15 him to do this. He was a first responder, and wanted
16 add-to thank many individuals who also even though
17 they are undocumented, they contribute. I was
18 arrested on Tuesday because I believe so strongly
19 that this city and this country they are for
20 everyone. It is why I immigrate here as a young 18-
21 years old who washed dishes. That was opportunity
22 and support I got later from colleges. It is why I
23 serve our public services. Now, together with the
24 Speaker and Council Member Menchaca and all my
25 colleagues, I fight for all immigrants, those are the

2 new ones like myself that even with my accent
3 contributes so much to this city. As the second,
4 third or any generation who makes this city so great.
5 Thank you and with that I vote aye.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

7 Continue with roll call.

8 CLERK: Barron.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to
10 explain my vote.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I want to call my
13 colleague's attention to Land Use 718 [bell] and 718.
14 My time is up already?

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: No. [laughter]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I know we're
17 cutting you back. So, this is about Ebenezer Plaza,
18 and Ebenezer not of the literary work but of the
19 Bible where there was erection of a monument to give
20 acknowledgment for victory over the enemies. So,
21 this site Ebenezer Plaza was owned by a black church
22 in the community, and they partnered with a
23 developer so that they would have mixed use
24 commercial on the bottom and residential on the top.
25 It will be 531 units and--no, 351 units that will be

2 there, and the church will have condominium space in
3 that development. There were a lot of hurdles that
4 we had to overcome, but I want to thank Procida and
5 Risa for working with us as the developers, and we
6 now have a reduction in the overall height. We have
7 a reduction in the number of studios, and the studio
8 apartments will be 450 square feet, each of them on
9 an average, 450 on square—an average. There will be
10 reduction in the height. There will be equal profit
11 sharing amongst the developers. There had been an
12 issue and the black developer was getting
13 significantly less than the others, and they worked
14 that out and they are having equal shares amongst the
15 developers, and the black contractor will be
16 responsible for hiring. S he will be responsible for
17 helping them achieve their goal of 50% MWBEs for this
18 project, and she will be the CG for the development
19 of the church. So, it's significant, and then, of
20 course, to get to the rents, this project will have
21 20% set aside for the formerly homeless. We keep
22 talking about homeless, but if we don't provide units
23 for them where are they going to go. So, there will
24 be 20% set aside for the homeless in this project,
25 and the other income bands and at 37%, 37, 27, 47 and

2 57%. So, a formerly homeless person can get a studio
3 apartment [bell] for \$215 or a 3-bedroom apartment
4 for \$512 and this is what we've got to do if we want
5 to make sure that we reduce the homeless crisis in
6 our city. And for those of the upper band, a studio
7 will cost \$761 and a 3-bedroom will cost \$1,339.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I'm really proud
10 of this project. Salamanca and I are in a race, and
11 we encourage all of you to come along and join us so
12 that we can really have housing in the districts
13 where people can afford it, and not be displaced.
14 Now, I want to thank Land Use and I want to thank HPD
15 for working with me. Thank you so much.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye on
18 all.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

20 CLERK: Rose.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

22 CLERK: Salamanca.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

25 CLERK: Torres.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye on all.

3 CLERK: Treyger.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

5 CLERK: Ulrich.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Aye on all.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

8 CLERK: Vacca.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Aye on all except
10 1550-A. I vote no.

11 CLERK: Vallone.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on all.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

14 CLERK: Williams.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: With the
16 exception of LU 713 and the accompanying Reso, aye on
17 all. Sorry, I abstain on LU 732 and 1643.

18 CLERK: Matteo.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: May I be excused
20 to explain my vote?

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes. Quiet in
22 the Chambers.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Today we are
24 passing East Shore Special Coastal Risk District-
25 District in my district, and the new building

2 restrictions are necessary in order to address the
3 unique circumstances in these coastal communities,
4 which face an extremely high risk of flooding that
5 cannot be simply re-mitigated with infrastructure
6 improvements. Under these zoning changes, new
7 construction or substantial renovations on properties
8 in the East Shore District will require a public
9 review process of home rebuilding after Sandy. These
10 measures will reduce any detrimental effects of new
11 development, safeguard environmentally sensitive
12 wetlands, and help protect the residents remaining in
13 those coastal communities from further risk of harm.
14 At the same time, the zoning will encourage resilient
15 development and accommodate existing business, which
16 may not meet parking standards. As we saw during
17 Hurricane Sandy, buildings built to modern flood
18 standards sustain far less damage than those that
19 were built prior to when to those standards were
20 incorporated into the Building Code. Thus
21 encouraging investments to make buildings more
22 resilient is the best strategy to improve resiliency.
23 Sandy not only changed the geography of New York
24 City's Coastal communities, it shook our sense of
25 security and changed the way we think about living

2 and building near the water. It should have. We
3 must plan better, build smarter and do all we can to
4 protect our communities from the next storm. While
5 there is no perfect solution to meet these
6 challenges, especially in a complex development and
7 landscape of New York City, I believe the Zoning
8 Resolution we are passing today will strikes the
9 right balance between appropriate governmental
10 oversight, prudent flood risk management and
11 individual property rights. I just want to thank the
12 Speaker. I want to thank Chair Richards and
13 Greenfield and make an important note that this
14 process was open to the public and to the—the
15 advisory boards and it was something that the
16 community all came together and had input to reach
17 this. We made the East Shore of my district a little
18 bit more resilient today, and that's always a good
19 thing especially during this very difficult hurricane
20 season. So, with that, I am voting aye on all except
21 for 1550-A, 1566 and 1578.

22 CLERK: Van Bramer.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye on all.

24 CLERK: Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito.

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Aye on all.

3 [pause]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: I haven't voted.
5 Rafael Espinal.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Oh, what
7 happened?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: From Brooklyn.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Alright.

10 CLERK: Council Member Espinal.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Thank you. I
12 vote aye on all.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

14 [laughs] [background comments, pause]

15 CLERK: [off mic] That's it.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Uh-hm. All items
17 on today's General Order Calendar were adopted by a
18 vote of 46 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative and
19 0 abstentions with the exception of intro 1550-A,
20 which was adopted by a vote of 41 in the affirmative,
21 4 negative and 1 abstention, and Intro 1566-A, which
22 was adopted by a vote of 42 in the affirmative, 3
23 negative and 1 abstention, and Intro 1578-A, which
24 was adopted by a vote of 42 in the affirmative, 3
25 negative and 1 abstention, and LU 718 and Reso 1647,

2 which was adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative,
3 0 negative and 1 abstention, and LU 719 and Res 1648,
4 which was adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative,
5 0 negative and 1 abstention, and Land Use 732 and
6 Reso 1643, which was adopted by a vote of 45 in the
7 affirmative, 0 negative and 1 abstention, and the
8 Revised Land Use Call-Ups the vote is 46 in the
9 affirmative, 0 in the negative. Introduction and
10 Reading of Bills.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All bills have
12 been referred to Committees as indicated on the
13 Agenda.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Any discussion of
15 the following resolution, a resolution—Preconsidered
16 Resolution 1636, a resolution urging Congress to
17 reject proposed reforms to cut funding to SNAP and to
18 reject efforts to convert the program into a block
19 grant. Seeing no discussion on the resolution, all
20 those in favor say aye.

21 COUNCIL MEMBERS: [in unison] Aye.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All of those
23 opposed. Any abstentions? The ayes have it.
24 General Discussion beginning with Council Member

2 Vanessa Gibson who is not in the Chamber. Next, we
3 will move onto Council Member Inez Barron.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Madam
5 Public Advocate. I just wanted to extend what I had
6 said about the Ebenezer Plaza project and to say that
7 there is also a Community Benefits Agreement, which
8 will give \$10,000 annually to the garden because
9 there is a slight shadow that's cast on the garden
10 that faces this development. So, the developer has
11 agreed to give the Green Valley Gardens \$10,000
12 annually, and as a part of the Community Benefits
13 Agreement, the developer will give the community
14 \$15,000 annually for scholarships, and there was
15 community preference, 50% for Community District 16,
16 and 25% for Community District 5 because that
17 development borders on both of those. I do want to
18 call your attention to Intro I think it's 1697, which
19 talks about—no, 16—yes, 1697, and it calls for a stop
20 sign or traffic light to be placed at the
21 intersection of every school. It doesn't matter if
22 it's private school, public school, religious school,
23 every intersection of the school should have a stop
24 sign or traffic light, and that's what this bill
25 calls for. When I was in Albany, many years ago, I

2 fought to have it there and they said no, you've got
3 to do one more. Well, here I am in the City Council,
4 and I'm presenting this bill. I hope that all of you
5 will support it, and lastly I do want to say that
6 yesterday Starett City, which is located in my
7 district says that they are considering the sale of
8 the property. Starett City is the largest federally
9 funding housing development in the nation, and in
10 2009 I'm very proud to say that I authored the bill
11 that kept them in in Mitchell Lama for the next 30
12 years. So, they're obligated to stay in Mitchell
13 Lama until 2039, but, you know, that's only a stone's
14 throw away and we're very skeptical of the sale even
15 though we know they're obligated to remain in it, and
16 the Assembly Member Charles Barron and I are keeping
17 our eyes open [bell] on this, and we're very
18 concerned , and we're going to fight to get permanent
19 affordability at Starett City.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you very
22 much. We join you in those concerns. Lastly,
23 Council Member Williams.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you. I
25 also wanted to add my prayers to those affected by

2 Harvey and Irma and prayers for those who will be
3 affected in Florida this past West Indian Day Parade
4 I want to thank the Mayor, the NYPD, Council Member
5 Cumbo and Borough President Adams, the Crisis
6 Management and Cure Violence Groups and all those who
7 worked to make a great celebration. I look forward
8 to continuing that work to find a happy medium that
9 we need to make sure folks can celebrate their
10 culture and be safe. When it comes to DACA, history
11 teaches us that deportation and threats of them have
12 been used as a manner to dehumanize, ostracize and a
13 prelude to legitimize horrors that follow. I just
14 want to lend my voice to the work of this council,
15 the Speaker and Carlos Menchaca have been doing,
16 encourage my Caribbean friends and families to
17 please-please join in the immigration debate. We've
18 waited far too long and our Latino brothers and
19 sisters have been doing a wonderful job, and also put
20 it into some context. The fact is that we are not
21 going to deport millions of people much less 800,000.
22 We may deport a few, but this country has got its
23 powers and money and strength from abusing people and
24 providing a workforce very cheap, and whether it was
25 the Native Americans, whether it was slaves, whether

2 it was the Chinese who we promised they could say in
3 this country after they built the railroads. We have
4 a workforce that we ostracize, and we can then abuse,
5 and believe the same thing is going on here. We are
6 creating a workforce that we can ostracize and abuse
7 and misuse that helped make this economy great. But
8 we will give them a second class status that allows
9 them to be manipulated—manipulated, and I believe
10 that's what's going on. We should continue to fight.
11 I think my colleagues who decided that we were going
12 to resist on day one, Council Member Menchaca, State
13 Senator Marisol Alcantara and others [bell]. While
14 people said we have to wait we said no. He said what
15 he's going to do, and we should not wait. We knew it
16 was happening. We resisted on day one. Hopefully
17 we'll continue. Thank you.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Seeing no other
19 speakers, let us close now with the Speaker Melissa
20 Mark-Viverito.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Madam
22 Public Advocate. Again, thank you to all my
23 colleagues, and with that we are adjourned.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Good
25 luck on Tuesday. [gavel]

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

87

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date September 13, 2017