

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

----- X

September 20, 2018
Start: 1:31 p.m.
Recess: 6:31 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway Committee Room 16th
Floor

B E F O R E: DONOVAN J. RICHARDS, CHAIR

COUNCIL MEMBERS: JUSTIN L. BRANNAN
FERNANDO CABRERA
ANDREW COHEN
CHAIM M. DEUTSCH
VANESSA L. GIBSON
RORY I. LANCMAN
CARLOS MENCHACA
I. DANEEK MILLER
KEITH POWERS
YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ
PAUL A. VALLONE
JUMAANE D. WILLIAMS
INEZ BARRON
DEBORAH ROSE
DANIEL DROMM
ROBERT CORNEGY, JR.
ANDY KING
MARK TREYGER, CHAIR
JOSEPH C. BORELLI

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

COUNCIL MEMBERS CONTINUED

BEN KALLOS
STEVEN MATTEO
COSTA CONSTANTINIDES
ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL
ERIC ULRICH
YDANIS RODRIGUEZ
BARRY GRODENCHIK
COREY JOHNSON, SPEAKER
ANTONIO REYNOSO
RAFAEL SALAMANCA, JR.
BRAD LANDER
ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL
DIANA AYALA

RAMON GARCIA, ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NEW
YORK POLICE DEPARTMENT (NYPD)

RUBEN BELTRAN, NEW YORK POLICE DEPARTMENT
(NYPD) ASSISTANT CHIEF

LASHAWN ROBINSON, DEPUTY CHANCELLOR FROM
DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION (DOE)

MARK RAMPERSANT, SENIOR EXECUIVE
DIRECTOR, NEW YORK DEPARTMENT OF
EDUCATION OFFICE OF SAFETY AND YOUTH
DEVELOPMENT

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

KENYATTA REED, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR NEW
YORK DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION OFFICE OF
SAFETY AND YOUTH DEVELOPMENT (OSYD)

OLAG CHARNOVSKY, DIRECTOR OF (INAUDIBLE)

GALE BREWER, MANHATTAN BOROUGH PRESIDENT

NANCY GINSBURG, ADOLESCENT PRACTICE OF T
LEGAL AID SOCIETY AND THE CRIMINAL TRIAL
PRACTICE

MELINDA ONSTRA, LEGAL AID SOCIETY

STEFANIE COYLE, EDUCATION COUNCIL FOR NEW
YORK CITY CIVILE LIBERTIES UNION

EUNICE MERCEDES, 32 BJ

SCOTT KESSLER, CITY OF SCHOOL, STUDENT IN
HIGH SCHOOL

ADAM EISENMAN, RAVE MOBILE SAFETY

RAHINI SINGH, STAFF ATTORNEY AT THE
SCHOOL OF JUSTICE FOR ADVOCATES FOR
CHILDREN IN NEW YORK

CHARLOTTE POPE, CHILDREN'S DEFENSE FUND

KATRINA FELDCAMP, BRONX LEGAL SERVICES,
EQUAL JUSTICE WORK FELLOW SPONSORED BY
ARNOLD AND PORTER FOUNDATION

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

ASHLEY SAWYER, LAWYER, DIRECTOR OF POLICY
FOR GIRLS FOR GENDER EQUITY

MATTHEW BISTON, URBAN YOUTH
COLLABORATIVE, STUDENT, FUTURES OF
TOMORROW REPRESENTATIVE

ANDREA COLOGNE, ROCKAWAY PARK GRADUATE,
COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT COORDINATOR FOR
ROCKAWAY TASK FORCE, URBAN YOUTH
COLLABORATIVE

JESSICA GARCIA, YOUTH LEADER FOR MAKE THE
ROAD AND AN URBAN YOUTH COLLABORATIVE

SARA GONZALEZ, ORGANICER WITH ROCKAWAY
YOUTH TASK FORCE, MEMBER URBAN YOUTH
COLLABORATIVE, STUDENT

MAYBELLINE NAVARRO, MEMBER OF MAKE THE
ROAD NEW YORK, URBAN YOUTH COLLABORATIVE,
FRESHMAN CITY COLLEGE, RECENT GRADUATE OF
BUSHWICK

BRIAN AGU, STUDENT ENERGY AND TECHNOLOGY
IN THE BRONX, MEMBER OF SISTERS AND
BROTHERS UNITED AND URBAN YOUTH
COLLABORATIVE

KATHERINE TRENZY, CENTER FOR POPULAR
DEMOCRACY

3 SARGEANT-AT-ARMS: Test, test, this
4 hearing is on the public safety and education. Being
5 recorded by McKinzie, Joseph. Today's date is
6 September 20th, 2018.

7 CHAIRPERSON DONOVAN RICHARDS: Alright we
8 are going to ask everybody to begin to settle down.
9 Yeah. (background noise). (long pause of silence).
10 (gavel pounding). Alright good morning, oh good
11 afternoon, I'm sorry, really good evening. I'm
12 Council Member Donovan Richards of the 31st District
13 in Queens and the Chair of the Committee on Public
14 Safety. Thank you for joining us today. I want to
15 thank the members of the Public Safety Committee who
16 are here. Am I going to go through all of these
17 names here? What am I doing? Okay, alrighty. Uhm
18 hard to separate everyone but okay I will acknowledge
19 everyone who is present. Council Member Lancman, uhm
20 Council Member Inez Barron, Council Member Debbie
21 Rose, Council Member Brannan, Council Member Dromm,
22 Council Member Cornegy, Council Member Keith Powers,
23 Council Member King, Chair Treyger obviously will
24 give remarks. Uhm Council Members Vallone, Council
25 Member Borelli, Council Member Kallos and Council

3 Member Deutsch. Alright did I get everyone. And
4 also I see Andy Cohen walking in as well. I want to
5 thank the members of the New York City Police
6 Department and the Department of Education especially
7 for joining us during what I am sure is a busy time
8 at the beginning of the school year. The Public
9 Safety Committee feels the new school year is a
10 perfect time to discuss what we are doing to keep our
11 kids safe and reassuring our communities that we are
12 prepared for anything that can happen. The mass
13 shooting in Parkland, Florida earlier this year was
14 yet another reminder of the senseless violence that
15 it endangers us all in a particular, our most
16 vulnerable and our most vulnerable young citizens.
17 As many of you may know, I believe my political
18 career because of a friend I lost to violence when he
19 was far too young and so any senseless issue is very
20 personal to me. We have to do everything we can to
21 make sure that the attacks on schools that we have
22 seen across the country are not repeated here in New
23 York City and that we are prepared for any kind of
24 emergency that could arise in our schools. At the
25 same time, our approach must be balanced. In New
York City under an MOU between a DOE and NYPD, the

3 protectors of our school children are also those
4 responsible for making arrests and enforcing criminal
5 laws. We cannot let our need for security overshadow
6 the equally important value that children feel that a
7 school is a place for them to learn and grow, figure
8 out who they are and sometimes make mistakes along
9 the way. They need to be able to do all of that
10 without a fear that a single wrong step will sweep
11 them into the criminal justice system or worse,
12 become the next victim of a police shooting. We need
13 to make sure that the good men and women of the
14 police department are seen as guardians not
15 punishers. Let me be clear about a few things, first
16 under no circumstances should we consider having
17 armed guards in our schools, second we need to take
18 significant steps to eliminate the school to prison
19 pipeline. We need to make sure that teachers and
20 principals are the ones teaching student's life
21 lessons not judges, juries and jails. I'm looking
22 forward to hearing what the police department is
23 doing to keep us safe while reducing the number of
24 children arrested and summons in schools and with
25 that understanding that a new MOU is forthcoming with
the DOE and NYPD view as a path forward. We are

3 hearing a package of bills today that would create

4 the school emergency and preparedness task force and

5 I would like to thank Council Member Paul Vallone for

6 leading that effort. I will go through all of these,

7 uhm, Proposed Introduction 921-A, sponsored by

8 Council Member Vallone creates the task force.

9 Proposed Introduction 893-A, sponsored by Council

10 Member Steven Matteo would require the task force to

11 make recommendations relating to security personnel.

12 Proposed Introductions 876-A, sponsored by Council

13 Member Costa Constantinides would require the task

14 force to review school evacuation routes, building

15 safety plans and other emergent response protocols.

16 Proposed Introduction 922-A, sponsored by Council

17 Member Paul Vallone would require the task force to

18 review communication technologies for notifying the

19 NYPD in the event of an emergency. Proposed

20 Introduction 894-A sponsored by Council Member Carlos

21 Menchaca would require the task force to review the

22 training DOE personnel receive on school emergency

23 protocols and procedures. Proposed Introduction 866-

24 A sponsored by the speaker would require the task

25 force to review and make recommendations relating to

the level of the collaboration between NYPD, DOE and

3 community members in relation to emergency
4 preparedness at schools. Proposed Introduction 923-A
5 sponsored by Council Member Paul Vallone would
6 require the task force to review and make
7 recommendations relating to the resources available
8 to non-public schools in regards to emergency
9 preparedness. Proposed Introduction 872-A sponsored
10 by Council Member Justin Brannan would require the
11 task force to review and make recommendations
12 relating to notification of the public in the event
13 of a school emergency. Proposed Introduction 869-A
14 sponsored by Council Member Alicka Ampry-Samuel would
15 require the task force to review and make
16 recommendations relating to protocols for responding
17 to a student experiencing a mental health crisis and
18 finally Proposed Introduction 912-A sponsored by
19 Council Member Debbie Rose would require the task
20 force to review and make recommendations relating to
21 security, technologies at schools, including best
22 practices for Ingress and Egress. I would now turn
23 it over to our Co-Chair for today, Council Member
24 Mark Treyger. Followed by him, he will hear remarks
25 for Council Members Vallone and Deutsch. Once again
I thank the representatives of the police department

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY WITH THE
2 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

10

3 and the Department of Education Advocacy Groups and
4 the public for being here today as well to testify.

5 Take it away, Chair... uhm.

6 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Thank you Chair
7 Richards. I just want to note that we have also been
8 joined by Council Member (INAUDIBLE). Good
9 afternoon, I am Council Member Mark Treyger, Chair of
10 the Education Committee. I would like to thank
11 everyone for coming to today's joint hearing on
12 School Emergency Preparedness and Safety. I want to
13 again thank Chair Richards for co-chairing this
14 hearing and for the great work that he does to help
15 keep New Yorkers safe. Like millions of people
16 across the country I was outraged and heartbroken by
17 the school shooting in Parkland, Florida just as I am
18 filled with sadness and frustration when any tragedy
19 occurs in our schools. As Chair of the Education
20 Committee and a former educator I of course want to
21 ensure that New York City takes every possible
22 measure to prevent such a tragedy from occurring
23 here. Emergency preparedness and safety in our
24 school buildings are issues we in education community
25 are grappling with every day and these are issues
that arise in many different forms. With the

3 reactionary, inflammatory and irresponsible rhetoric
4 we hear all too often from this Presidential
5 Administration we must not lose sight of our goals
6 and experiences here at home when a high profile
7 incidence occurs. Ensuring that our students are
8 truly safe and free to learn inside our school
9 buildings of utmost important. New York City has
10 implemented numerous emergency preparedness and
11 school safety initiatives over the years with varying
12 degrees of success. For example, some New York City
13 Schools have permanent or temporary metal detectors.
14 Many effective principals and teachers do not believe
15 metal detectors decrease violence in school and
16 instead believe they perpetuate a penile climate that
17 interferes with teaching and learning. My
18 experiences as a teacher clearly support this claim.
19 When I was a teacher I taught a first period Regions
20 course. During random scanning days, many of my
21 students arrived to class late because of the long
22 lines for metal detectors that held them up. During
23 random scanning days, many of my students entered
24 class angry and upset due to unpleasant conflicts
25 with those agents that monitored or worked at the
metal detector stations. During random scanning

3 days, far too many of my students missed learning
4 opportunities for a Regions class due to the
5 significant over-policing of their school during
6 those days. Since becoming Chair of the Education
7 Committee I have spoken to many advocates, especially
8 students and many of them stated that the presence of
9 police and metal detectors do not fundamentally make
10 them feel safe. They at times make them feel
11 criminalized. Research also shows that police
12 officers in schools disproportionate affect black and
13 Latino students. During the 2016-2017 school year,
14 NYPD personnel issued more than 2,000 summons or
15 arrests in schools and students were handcuffed in
16 more than 1,800 incidents; approximately 90% of all
17 students who were issued summons, arrested and
18 handcuffed were black and Latino students; although
19 black and Latino student represent 2/3 of New York
20 City students. With this knowledge, I was
21 disappointed to learn about the New School
22 Coordination Agent Program through the media not
23 through consultation by the Administration which is
24 being piloted this school year in the Bronx. As part
25 of this program, these Enhanced School Safety Agents
will walk school hallways to patrol wandering

3 students. While the role of School Safety Agent
4 certainly needs to be reexamined and redefined I am
5 anxiously awaiting the Administration's Revised
6 Memorandum of understanding that it is suppose to be
7 doing just that. If we are going to expand safety
8 resources in our schools there are other pressing
9 needs that must be addressed. As students have said
10 many times before and so have I, students need and
11 are asking for more social workers and guidance
12 counselors. Guidance counselors and social workers
13 are essential for school safety as they address the
14 root cause of violent behavior and it is alarming
15 that New York City Schools have more School Safety
16 Agents than Guidance Counselors and Social Workers
17 combined. In fact, DOE Schools have more than 5,000
18 School Safety Agents and yet last school year DOE
19 Schools only had a total of 4,173 Guidance Counselors
20 and Social Workers. Let me be very clear, we are
21 failing to meet the social and emotional needs of our
22 students. I am disappointed that this Administration
23 is expanding the presence of police in our schools
24 while this disparity exists. Recent data showed us
25 that there are approximately 16 schools that have no
Guidance Counselors, no Social Workers, no dedicated

3 social, emotional staff whatsoever and there are
4 numerous schools that only have a part-time Guidance
5 Counselor or Social Worker that might work one or two
6 days a week; meanwhile the School Safety Agents work
7 the entire school week. This distribution of
8 resources is not how you promote safety and security
9 in your schools. Fortunately the Fiscal Year 2019
10 Budget included \$4 million provided by this New York
11 City Council to help fund Social Workers and Guidance
12 Counselors in DOE Schools. Unfortunately this is not
13 nearly enough. The Administration needs to start
14 investing more funding into Guidance Counselors and
15 Social Workers instead of police officer and School
16 Safety Agents in schools. This is why I am proud to
17 sponsor Resolution 514, which calls upon the DOE to
18 provide one full-time Guidance Counselor and Social
19 Worker for every 250 students and to ensure that all
20 schools have at least one full-time Guidance
21 Counselor and Social Worker. Currently there is no
22 requirement that elementary schools have a Guidance
23 Counselor. Today the Education Committee will also
24 hear Proposed Introduction 381-A sponsored by Council
25 Member Eric Ulrich and Introduction 880 sponsored by
Council Member Chaim Deutsch which would require and

3 assessment of school door alarms and school security
4 cameras respectively as well as Proposed Introduction
5 639-B sponsored by Council Member Matthew Eugene
6 which would require the School Emergency Task Force
7 to review contributing School Emergency Preparedness
8 Materials to students and parents. Today's hearing
9 will provide an opportunity for the DOE and NYPD to
10 speak more about the current School Emergency
11 Preparedness and Safety Protocols as well as for
12 unions, unionized employees, advocates and other
13 stakeholders to share their concerns and
14 recommendations related to School Emergency
15 Preparedness and Safety. I would like to thank the
16 Education Committee Staff, Beth Golib, Jan Atwell,
17 Kalima Johnson, Katelyn O'Hagan, Elizabeth Hoffman.
18 I would like to thank my Chief of Staff Anna Scaife,
19 Policy Director Vanessa Ogle and Eric Fanberg (SP?).
20 I would like to turn it over back to the co-Chair to
21 acknowledge my colleagues who have legislation today.

22 CHAIRPERSON DONOVAN RICHARDS: Alright
23 we've been joined by Council Members Rodriguez and
24 Grodenchik and oh I spoke about her bill Ampry-
25 Samuels as well. Uhm alright I will go to Council
Member Vallone now.

3 PAUL VALLONE: Thank you to my co-chairs
4 Mark Treyger and Donovan Richards for your leadership
5 here on this very, very critical issue. Uhm today I
6 would like to thank everyone for being here as a goal
7 upon the Department of Education and the NYPD to
8 create a comprehensive task force to discuss the
9 citywide plan for overall school emergency
10 preparedness as well as the inclusive package of
11 School Safety Legislation that been submitted by my
12 fellow Council Members at today's hearing. I want to
13 personally thank our speaker, Corey Johnson for
14 support and leadership to bring these issues to
15 today's hearing. In light of the ongoing and recent
16 school tragedies around the country and the
17 indisputable fact that New York City will forever be
18 in the crosshairs of those who want to do us harm.
19 Now is the time to take a top to bottom look at our
20 School Emergency Preparedness. There can be no
21 debate. The safety of our children must always be
22 our top priority. We have to be able to look at
23 every parent and tell them yes we have done
24 everything that we can to make your child's school as
25 safe as possible. I was asked this very same
question at a past CEC meeting lying in incident in

3 one of our schools in White Stone. It has stayed
4 with me and haunted me to this day. There was fear,
5 anger and demand for answers at how our schools will
6 handle a situation that we pray will never come.
7 These are the questions that have been asked over and
8 over again. What is the school's plan to handle and
9 emergency or an active shooter situation? Why does
10 our school still not have a surveillance system? Why
11 do we have one Safety Agent or Crossing Guard for
12 over 1000 students? Why can't we lock our own doors?
13 Why didn't the parents have the right notice and
14 information? And what is the difference between a
15 soft and hard lockdown at my school? And when do we
16 ever get notified when this happens? The list goes
17 on and on. There are so many layers to these
18 conversations, especially when we look at the
19 existing federal and state regulations and whether
20 they are actually being followed, implemented and
21 enforced. It is clear to me that there are two
22 separate areas that must be addressed. The first
23 requires an infrastructural capability look at every
24 school. Are they the same? I still can't move the
25 fact that over 1/3 of our schools still do not have a
basic surveillance system and how can everyone else

3 look past that fact. That means of the 1,700 schools
4 in our system, 500 are still waiting for the very
5 basic essentials. The numbers are even more
6 staggering in my District in Northeast Queens. Over
7 60% of my schools do not have any type of
8 surveillance system. How can we have a conversation
9 about school safety when we haven't provided the very
10 first step necessary? Beyond surveillance we must
11 ask if there is a working intercom communication
12 system to every classroom so the teacher is aware of
13 what is happening with the school safety agent and
14 the principal. Is there a working panic button for
15 the principal and safety agent? Is there a buzzer
16 and income system to the main doors, does every
17 school have at least one safety agent? Can the
18 principal even lock her doors? And probably most
19 important, has an updated Safety Event planned and
20 filed with the NYPD. Has the local police department
21 gone to my school to make sure that they are aware of
22 the unique makeup of the school? Do they know the
23 principal? The teacher? The entry and exit points?
24 Do the students and the parents know what the plan
25 is? These bills do not only require a task force but
provide essential resources and procedures for our

3 schools to tackle these fundamental concerns. The
4 second area of focus beyond infrastructure is the
5 need for parity in every school and to create a
6 Comprehensive Emergency Preparedness Policy and
7 Procedure and what it should be. Again this will be
8 the charge of the Task Force and this hearing. A
9 forward view of our citywide, borough-wide, district
10 wide and even down to every individual school must be
11 made. This will create the chain of communication
12 that must be had, a solid plan to be followed and
13 providing the information that every parent is
14 entitled to know about the safety of their children.
15 This is why I have introduced 921-A and 922 and I
16 have co-sponsored with my fellow Council Members all
17 of these critical bills introduced at today's
18 hearing. The time is now to be proactive and not
19 reactive. We can never hesitate when parents ask the
20 question that must be answered, Is my child safe? If
21 we do not act now then we will have an answer to
22 much difficult question, one we never want to hear,
23 What else could we have done? Thank you chairs.

24 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Thank you
25 Council Member Vallone. We will now hear from
Council Member Deutsch.

3 CHAIM DEUTSCH: Thank you Chair and first
4 I want to thank uhm Speaker Corey Johnson for his
5 leadership as well as Chair Treyger and Chair
6 Richards. Uhm firstly you know we have a package of
7 bills today and when we introduce bills it is to
8 legislate and unfortunately I mean we shouldn't be
9 here today with these bills. I mean all of this
10 should have already been in place, uhm our children
11 uhm are in danger you know with what's going on
12 around the world and what could be here in New York
13 City is really uhm something that is kind of scary
14 when our parents or parents send children to school.
15 But nevertheless we are here today discussing what we
16 can do to keep our children safe and I want to thank
17 all of my colleagues for introducing legislation to
18 aim to take decisive action to tackle potential
19 safety concerns that face New York City children when
20 they enter one of our school buildings. My bill
21 today Intro 880 requires the DOE and the NYPD to work
22 together to install security cameras in common areas
23 including entrances and exits at public schools.
24 Cameras in schools have several benefits, firstly
25 many of our schools have extremely minimum security.
Cameras will help school safety to easily keep a

3 large campus secure from essential location. Cameras
4 also protect students from internal and external
5 threats and help authorities to identify gaps in
6 security. Furthermore, cameras serve as a deterrent
7 against crimes and unfortunately school violence is a
8 problem that doesn't look like it is going to go away
9 anytime soon but cameras will be an extra layer of
10 security to help the NYPD and Administrators to have
11 a handle on issues as they arise. I hope that the
12 Administration will support the Intro 880 and
13 demonstrate a genuine interest in taking steps to
14 keep our kids safe, so thank you, thank you all.

14 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Thank you and
15 now we will hear from the first panel. Uhm, we are
16 joined this morning by Assistant Commissioner, Ramon
17 Garcia from the NYPD, Assistant Chief Ruben Beltran,
18 NYPD, welcome. Uhm good afternoon, LaShawn
19 Robinson, Deputy Chancellor from DOE and Mark
20 Rampersant, Senior Executive Director NYC DOE Office
21 of Safety and Youth Development, Kenyatta Reed,
22 Executive Director NYC DOE Office of Safety and Youth
23 Development. Welcome, alrighty I'm going to ask
24 Daniel to swear you in.

3 DANIEL, COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell
4 the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth
5 in your testimony before this committee and to
6 respond honestly to Council Member questions?

7 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Are you sure?
8 I'm playing, okay, alrighty you may begin. (brief
9 period of silence). Just press your button and it
10 will light up red. Welcome this is your first
11 hearing.

12 RUBEN BELTRAN: First misstep already.
13 Yes it's my first hearing. Uhm good morning Chairs
14 Richards and Treyger and Members of the Council. I
15 am Assistant Chief Ruben Beltran, Commanding Office
16 of the New York City Police Department, School Safety
17 Division. On behalf of Police Commissioner, James P.
18 O'Neill I would like to thank you for this
19 opportunity to discuss School Emergency Preparedness
20 and Safety. At the outset of my testimony, I believe
21 it is important to state that all students need a
22 safe learning environment in order to succeed in the
23 classroom and thrive in their community. The NYPD is
24 committed to ensuring such an environment in every
25 New York City Public School. Ensuring the safety of
our school community including students, staff and

3 families each day is at the core of our mission. I
4 am pleased to be here today to talk with you about
5 the hard work the School Safety Division has done and
6 continues to do to improve the safety of the school
7 environment by reducing crime within our schools. Of
8 course, improving school climate is not something
9 that School Safety Division does on its own. The
10 police department and the Department of Education
11 have established a true partnership through working
12 through all issues related to school climate, school
13 safety and training. I do not believe that we would
14 be experience the success we have seen without the
15 strong relationships that we have developed, the
16 school principals, school administration, teachers,
17 parents, and most importantly the students. Last
18 school year was the safety year on record with a
19 23.98% decrease in major crime from the 2014-2015
20 school year under this Administration. Additionally
21 there was a 4.6% decrease in school related arrests
22 and a 6.8% increase in the number of summons issued
23 by the School Safety Division compared to 2016 and
24 2017 school year. In working in close collaboration
25 with the Department of Education we are focusing on
referring minor incidents where appropriate to School

3 Administrators rather than utilizing the criminal
4 justice system. We have sought to balance holding
5 youth accountable while also utilizing school based
6 interventions in order to provide opportunities for
7 young people to stay on the path towards the college
8 and careers. Part of our strategy to ensure safety
9 for our students is to work for prevent weapons from
10 entering our schools; in this regard, weapon
11 direction equipment plays an important role while
12 all intermediate schools and high schools are subject
13 to unannounced scanning, historically there have been
14 a number of intermediate and high school buildings
15 that have been subject to full time or random part
16 time scanning. It is important to note that the
17 decision to install or remove weapon detection
18 equipment in school buildings is not a unilateral
19 decision by the NYPD. Based on recommendation from
20 the Mayor's Leadership Team on School Climate, clear
21 protocols were established for school principals to
22 request the addition or removal of weapon detection
23 equipment. Last school year, weapon recoveries
24 increased by 28.3% when compared to the previous
25 school year. While weapon detection equipment is an
important tool for recovering dangerous weapons, our

3 school community partners are an even more valuable
4 partner in this regard. Through cooperative work and
5 relationships with student, school administrators,
6 parents and others we are identifying and recovering
7 more weapons and counting those in the school
8 community among our strongest partners and fostering
9 trust and making our schools safer. And a continuing
10 effort to enhance and extend relationships and to
11 develop even greater trust with students, teachers
12 and staff, the NYPD expanded its neighborhood
13 policing initiative to the city schools this month
14 with a pilot program in the Bronx. The goal of the
15 Department School Safety Division's Neighborhood
16 Coordination Model is to further decrease crime and
17 violence in our schools by approaching each one as a
18 neighborhood and involving students as community
19 members. We attribute much of our crime reduction
20 success to our enhanced training program for the
21 5,251 School Safety Agents and 113 police officers
22 and detectives assigned to the School Safety Division
23 Uniform Task Force. Six uniform members assigned to
24 the Counter Terrorism Unit and eight assigned to the
25 Community Outreach Unit. It is not a coincidence
that school climate and school safety improved as our

3 training has been enhanced. Our new School Safety
4 Agent recruits participate in a 17-week training
5 program at the Police Academy. This comprehensive
6 program includes training in areas of law, police
7 science, behavioral science, physical examination and
8 tactics and focuses on topics such as bullying, the
9 LGBTQ Community, tactical communication and diffusing
10 hostility. In order to assist in preparing School
11 Safety Agents for this special role in the school
12 community, Department of Education Personnel
13 participate in our training sessions as instructors
14 and address specific areas such as special education,
15 school administration, school governance, adolescent
16 suicide, conflict resolution, bullying, child abuse
17 and substance abuse prevention. Training also
18 focuses on how to better work with school
19 administration and students in areas of collaborative
20 problem solving, restorative practices, conflict
21 resolution, de-escalation techniques and working with
22 special need students. Moreover, training does not
23 end at the recruit level for the School Safety
24 Division Personnel. These members of the service
25 also receive training throughout the year in such
important areas as problem solving, mediating

3 conflicts and responses to emergency or dangerous
4 conditions such as an active shooter incident.

5 Equally important to the successful work of the
6 School Safety Division are our partnerships and
7 strong working relationships with elected officials
8 and advocates outside of city government. As you

9 probably know, the School Safety Division is an
10 integretable part of the Mayor's Leadership Team on

11 School Climate and Leadership of the School Safety
12 Division works with representatives from other city
13 agencies, DOE, advocates and neighbor organizations

14 to develop new ideas and make recommendations that
15 will help further the school environment and enhance
16 the positive role that our police officers and School

17 Safety Agents have in ensuring safety. Many of the
18 recent changes in the School Safety Division has made
19 with respect to training, utilizing school based

20 intervention and the sharing data are a result of the
21 work in this interagency, interdisciplinary team.

22 Our work with the Mayor's Leadership Team is ongoing
23 and will play an important role in our efforts to
24 continue to improve school climate. In addition to

25 the security that School Safety Agents provide each
day we also have a School Safety Uniform Task Force,

3 a group of 113 uniformed officers who supplement the
4 security needs of our school system and are deployed
5 daily where needed. These officers have been trained
6 in responding to most emergency incidents including
7 Active Shooter Events, their duties include
8 responding to Active Shooter Report and Assisting and
9 Establishing Emergency Preparedness Protocols
10 proactively addressing conditions affecting the
11 safety of students, school staff and safe operations
12 of schools, providing presentations to students on
13 gun violence, gang crew activity and the dangers of
14 drug use and responding to lock downs and shelter in
15 to assist School Safety Agents in securing school
16 buildings and ensuring the safety of students and
17 staff. The School Safety Division collaborates with
18 DOE on 12 required Emergency Drills each school year,
19 this includes eight evacuation drills and four lock
20 down drills. In addition, there was a multiagency
21 joint exercise Active Shooter Drill completed this
22 past summer at PS1 in Queens which included NYPD,
23 FDNY and CUNY. I would be remiss if I did not take a
24 moment to highlight the School Safety Divisions
25 Counter Terrorism Unit. While I am sure we all
regret that there is a need for such a unit it

3 nevertheless addresses a stark reality of our modern
4 times. This unit works collaboratively with the
5 Intelligence Division, Precincts and Detective Squads
6 to investigate threats to our students and school
7 buildings. In addition, it supports and enhances the
8 department's anti-terrorism initiatives and augments
9 levels of security in New York City Schools by
10 providing comprehensive risks and threat assessments,
11 training for the school community and terrorism
12 awareness with an emphasis on School Safety Plan
13 Protocols, conducts the Active Shooter, Advanced Law
14 Enforcement in Rapid Response Training Program for
15 all uniformed, civilian and Department of Education
16 Personnel that ensures all school safety plans are
17 reviewed, approved and certified annually and are in
18 compliance with requirements prescribed in the Save
19 Legislature which is to Save Schools Against Violence
20 and Education Act. The Safety Plan that each
21 Principal Safety Committee submits, sets down on
22 paper the everyday functions and procedures used by
23 the school to permit the school to run in an
24 efficient and safe manner. All schools are required
25 to submit a plan to ensure that each and every
student and staff member can be safely evacuated from

3 their school in the event of an emergency and to
4 establish procedures for other emergencies that may
5 arise. Our objective is to have 100% of School
6 Safety Plans approved. In closing, the Department
7 takes the responsibility of providing a safe climate
8 in every New York City Public School very seriously.
9 The police department and School Safety Division will
10 continue to work in partnership with DOE, parents,
11 students, advocates, elected officials and the
12 community in furtherance of this responsibility.
13 Thank you for the opportunity to speak with you today
14 and I am pleased to answer your questions.

15 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Please identify
16 yourself when you begin. Thank you.

17 LASHAWN ROBINSON: Absolutely, good
18 afternoon, Chairs Treyger and Richards and all
19 members of the Education and Public Safety Committees
20 here today. My name is LaShawn Robinson and I am the
21 Deputy Chancellor for School Climate and Wellness at
22 the New York City Department of Education. Joining
23 me are Mark Rampersant, Senior Executive Director of
24 DOE's Office of Safety and Youth Development and
25 Kenyatta Reed, Executive Director of the Office of
Safety and Youth Development or OSYD. Thank you for

3 the opportunity to discuss our work to ensure that
4 all schools are providing a safe and supportive
5 learning environment and the proposed legislation
6 before the committees. The Division of School
7 Climate and Wellness which I oversee is responsible
8 for the social and emotional well-being of our
9 students, including critically their safety and
10 security. The City Council has had an important
11 long-standing commitment to school safety and
12 positive school climates and I would like to thank
13 the Council for your leadership and very generous
14 funding over the years. Providing students with safe
15 nurturing learning environments is at the heart of
16 our Equity and Excellence for All agenda. As part of
17 this work, this Administration has implemented
18 important school climate reforms across the city and
19 is investing \$47 million annually in school climate
20 initiatives and mental health supports to ensure that
21 schools are equipped with the critical resources
22 needed to effectively manage incidents and address
23 underlying issues. It has also launched initiatives
24 such as community schools to help students succeed
25 academically, socially and emotionally. As part of
the \$47 million commitment we have launched and

3 expanded a number of school climate initiatives over
4 the past year. These include the expansion of
5 district wide restorative practices to three new
6 districts providing training, curriculum and support
7 for social, emotional learning through which we are
8 teaching students in 300 schools the skills that will
9 help them be respectful, reflective and regulate
10 their own behaviors and emotions. We are also
11 expanding the ways that students and parents can
12 report bullying. This year, we increased ways for
13 students and parents to report school related
14 bullying complaints by completing a new online form
15 or calling P311. Next year, we will be launching a
16 Parent Reporting Portal. Beginning this year,
17 funding is being allocated to support student led
18 clubs that promote diversity. These initiatives are
19 all intended to foster welcoming, inclusive and safe
20 school communities that keep students engaged in
21 schools, building trusting and respectful
22 relationships and strengthens school communities. As
23 a result of our continued investments suspensions
24 have decreased by 34% over the last five years. We
25 have also decreased the number of schools identified
by the state by persistently dangerous from 27 in the

3 2015-2016 school year to one in the 2018-2019 school
4 year. We are very encouraged by these results and
5 hope for continued improvement as we continue to
6 expand this work. Many of the initiatives I have
7 discussed were informed by recommendations from the
8 Mayor's Leadership Team on School Climate and
9 Discipline. Launched in 2015, the Task Force aims to
10 reduce the number of students who are subject to
11 arrests, summons, and suspensions in school in a way
12 that both leads to safer schools and protects
13 student's dignity and future prospects. The task
14 force is co-chaired by the DOE and the Mayor's Office
15 of criminal justice with representatives from NYPD
16 and other city agencies, students, parents, community
17 organizations, unions, universities, service
18 providers and the city council. We also understand
19 the impact that mental health challenges can have on
20 a students' social, emotional and academic well-being
21 and partnership with THRIVE NYC we have made
22 unprecedented investments in mental health resources
23 and services which for the first time are available
24 to every city school. We have expanded our offerings
25 and have 285 school based mental health clinics, 272
school based health clinics, nearly 100 mental health

3 consultants and 120 more social workers in high needs
4 districts. We have also expanded therapeutic crisis
5 intervention for schools, a four-day evidence based
6 training on how to deescalate situations and prevent
7 incidents from developing. In addition to the
8 investments end, an expansion of a wide range of
9 social, emotional programs and supports we continue
10 to work with the NYPD to ensure all school buildings
11 are secure and all Safety and Emergency Preparedness
12 Protocols are in place and up to date. Within my
13 division, the Office of Safety and Youth Development
14 is laser focused on school safety. Hereto we work
15 closely with the New York Police Department and
16 together OSYD and NYPD School Safety Division take
17 every necessary step to ensure the Safety and
18 Preparedness of our school communities including
19 developing and implementing individualized building
20 safety plans and training staff on general response
21 protocols and mandatory lock down and evacuation
22 drills with students. Each member of the school
23 community has an important role to play in this
24 effort. At the school level, since 2000, all schools
25 have been required to create a School Safety
Committee mandated to meet once a month and develop a

3 School Safety Plan. Members of this important
4 committee including but are not limited to the school
5 principal, PTA President, Parent Coordinator, the
6 Building Response Team Leader, the School Safety
7 Agent, First Responders that serve the local
8 community and where appropriate Students. The
9 committee plays an important role in establishing and
10 reviewing safety procedures and recommending
11 additional security measures in response to emerging
12 needs. The Safety Committee is also responsible for
13 community the responsibilities and expectations for
14 students and staff to the school community. All
15 schools are required to hold an Annual School Safety
16 Town Hall. School Safety Plans are updated each year
17 and are approved by the DOE and the NYPD. Each
18 school building uses a standard template to record
19 school and building specific information that is used
20 to prepare for and respond to a safety emergency such
21 as facility designs and evacuation and relocation
22 procedures. The School Safety Plan also calls for
23 the creation of a building response team which plays
24 an essential role in coordinating the actions of
25 students and staff until first responders arrive.
Citywide the DOE's General Response Protocol provides

3 all schools with the direction they must take when an
4 emergency incident occurs. These protocols outline
5 the immediate actions to take when an emergency
6 requires staff and students to evacuate, shelter in
7 or lock down. All school staff and students are
8 required to participate in four lock down drills and
9 eight evacuation drills throughout the year. As of
10 2016, New York State revised a law to require annual
11 emergency procedure training for every school
12 district. All staff including school based and non
13 school based staff must receive training that has to
14 be completed annually by September 15th or within 30
15 days of an individual being hired. An addition to
16 the required lock down and evacuation drills all
17 schools are required to conduct three bus drills and
18 participate in two code blue, AED, CPR drills
19 annually. Our comprehensive emergency planning
20 addresses awareness and preparedness for active
21 shooter incidents, natural disasters and incidents
22 within communities and threat assessments in
23 collaboration with the first response community.
24 Local partners in this work include the NYPD the FDNY
25 and New York City Emergency Management. These
Emergency Protocols are incorporated in Chancellors

3 regulations, the School Safety Plan Template,
4 training materials and our Guides to Emergency
5 Preparedness and the General Response Protocol. We
6 distribute our safety protocols including visitor
7 controls, missing students and reunification
8 procedures to school administrators annually. We
9 also work to share this information with families.
10 At the start of the year, schools provide families
11 copies of the Emergency Response Procedures that
12 highlight the General Response Protocol, citywide
13 scanning policy and reminders to update emergency
14 contact information on file with the school. We also
15 post this information on our website. Families also
16 receive the parent version of their school's School
17 Safety Plan outlining important immediate information
18 each family will need if an emergency were to occur
19 at their child's school. A key focus of our work is
20 training for school based and other staff members.
21 The DOE in collaboration with our First Response
22 Agency Partners, most often the NYPD develops and
23 delivers training for principals and key staff
24 including a two-hour Emergency Readiness Training
25 session every two hours provided by OSYD, Table Top
Exercises assessing emergency drills and active

3 shooter protocols. Throughout the school Borough
4 Safety Directors hold on site assessments to identify
5 additional needs at schools for Targeted Training.
6 All training is aligned with and often exceeds
7 Federal and State Standards. We review and update
8 Our Best Practices, Guidance to School and
9 Professional Development based on feedback from
10 stakeholders including regular meetings on safety
11 with the unions and by consulting with local, state
12 and federal experts. For example, this spring we
13 increased our engagement with citywide and community
14 education councils and parent communities including
15 speaking at meetings and fielding questions from
16 parents, revised our visitor control procedures,
17 implemented BRT leader training and enhance the
18 parent and staff versions of the School Safety Plan.
19 We also have increased the number of opportunities
20 for principals and BRT leaders to attend Joint Active
21 Shooter Training with the NYPD School Safety
22 Division. OSYD has been at the forefront of
23 Emergency Preparedness nationally. We have made
24 presentations to the US Department of Education, US
25 Department of Justice and at the briefings, a
National School Safety Symposium. I would now like

3 to turn to the proposed Legislation. We support the
4 goals of the proposed Legislation to create an
5 Emergency Preparedness Task Force. We believe that
6 the work envisioned by Legislation should be
7 performed by an existing task force which focuses on
8 safety and security matters and we would like to work
9 with Council to ensure that we maximize the expertise
10 of our existing Task Force members and that the
11 proposed Legislation does not duplicate efforts
12 already underway. Proposed Intro 880-A requires DOE
13 to install security cameras where the Chancellor in
14 consultation with the NYPD deems appropriate for
15 security purposes and to annually provide the City
16 Council a summary of the use of cameras in school
17 buildings and an assessment of best practices related
18 to their installation and use of cameras. Intro 381-
19 A requires DOE to install door alarms where the
20 Chancellor in consultation with the NYPD deems
21 appropriate for security purposes. It also requires
22 DOE to provide the Council with the report on door
23 security measures including a summary of current
24 practices for managing Ingress and Egress at school
25 buildings. A list of school buildings where door
alarms have been installed and an assessment of best

3 practices related to the locking of exterior doors of
4 school buildings and the use of technology. DOE uses
5 both cameras and door alarms in school buildings as
6 part of a comprehensive school safety strategy that
7 has developed an ongoing consultation with NYPD. As
8 of July 2018, we have installed Internet Protocol,
9 Digital, Video Surveillance in over 700 buildings
10 serving approximately 1135 schools with over 29000
11 cameras online. These cameras are funded in the
12 Current Capital Plan. The internet protocol digital,
13 video surveillance application allows authorized
14 school officials to view live and archived camera
15 images at their computer stations and provides remote
16 viewing capability to authorized personnel from
17 borough and central offices. In addition, we work
18 closely with the City Council on Avonte's Law in
19 2014. Currently over 97% of school buildings have
20 door alarms. We look forward to discussing the scope
21 of the reporting requirements of both Intro 381-A and
22 880-A with the Council. We share the Council's
23 Commitment to ensure that our children are safe at
24 school and we commend the Council for its leadership
25 on this issue. We will continue to review our Safety
Protocols and Procedures as well as the installation

3 of other security technologies. We look forward to
4 working with the Council on this very important issue
5 and with that we would be happy to answer any
6 questions you may have.

7 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Uhm we've also
8 been joined by Council Members Menchaca and Reynoso
9 as well. Alright well thank you for your testimony
10 and enlightening us a little bit more and I want to
11 start off first by asking what is the
12 Administration's official position on arming
13 teachers?

14 LASHAWN ROBINSON: We are absolutely
15 against arming teachers in our school communities we
16 believe that guns have no place in our schools and we
17 support, we stand by what Commissioner said
18 previously, the New York State Education Department
19 Commissioner that guns have no place in our school
20 communities.

21 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Great, just
22 wanted to get you on the record on that one. Uhm
23 let's start off by talking about the MOU between NYPD
24 and DOE so last year we spoke of revising that
25 particular MOU and we are not moving into October

3 2018. I think you said it was going to be ready this
4 fall. Uhm where are we out with that MOU?

5 LASHAWN ROBINSON: We are in the process
6 of finalizing the MOU and it will be released this
7 fall.

8 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Uhm can you, do
9 you have a concrete? The fall can go, so when in the
10 fall?

11 LASHAWN ROBINSON: I don't, I do not have
12 a date for you uhm certainly this fall we will
13 release the MOU.

14 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Okay so the fall
15 is I believe the 21st? Right?

16 LASHAWN ROBINSON: It begins this
17 weekend, I believe, yes.

18 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Alright, okay,
19 alrighty.

20 LASHAWN ROBINSON: This fall yes.

21 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Uhm can you
22 speak to any significant changes that you perceive
23 will take place in this MOU?

24 LASHAWN ROBINSON: One uhm first of all,
25 thank you so much for mentioning the MOU and uhm I
would like to thank everyone that participated as

3 part of the team to develop the MOU, the Memorandum
4 of Understanding. It is important to note that we
5 have an existing MOU and that the team convened with
6 various stakeholders including DOE stakeholders, City
7 Hall, community based organizations, students,
8 parents, Council Members to really take a look at the
9 existing Memorandum of Understanding and to ensure
10 that we have something that is current and up to
11 date. As we well know the MOU has taken some time to
12 be released and we are committed to releasing the MOU
13 in the fall and are currently finalizing the details
14 of the MOU so I would like to honor the process of
15 that team, I don't have uhm.

16 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So the
17 leadership team's recommendation.

18 LASHAWN RICHARDSON: Correct.

19 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: We believe will
20 also be a part of the MOU?

21 LASHAWN RICHARDSON: Yes it was a
22 collaborative process and some of the recommendations
23 from the leadership team will be included as part of
24 the MOU.

25 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Okay.

LASHAWN RICHARDSON: That is correct.

3 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: And let me ask
4 you about public process, will there be public
5 hearings around this? You know, public officials
6 such as ourselves be briefed on this and given an
7 opportunity to have input as well.

8 LASHAWN RICHARSON: Council will
9 absolutely be briefed and as soon as we have the full
10 plan for rollout we will certainly be able to share
11 that plan with Council.

12 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Now one of the
13 things that we would love to do is to come in before
14 then to ensure that if there is some input that
15 myself or some of our colleagues certainly have you
16 know that it could also you know be part of
17 incorporating it as well so is there an openness to
18 that as well?

19 LASHAWN ROBINSON: Not at this time but I
20 can certainly take feedback back for discussion.

21 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Really, so I
22 would hope that once again the briefing is good but
23 also ensuring that you get some input from members of
24 the Committees as well.

25 LASHAWN ROBINSON: Yes and I absolutely
share your commitment to release the MOU this fall.

3 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: This fall?

4 LASHAWN RICHARDSON: Yes you have it on
5 record this fall, and uhm we look forward to sharing
6 the plan and also hearing back from Council once it's
7 available.

8 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Let's go through
9 School Safety Plan, so, so speak on that, so the
10 School Safety Plan is drafted by particular school
11 communities; uhm I'm interested in hearing a little
12 bit more about that uhm and uhm one of the areas that
13 I want you to focus on is how do we know that this is
14 actually happening? Uhm is there a reporting
15 mechanism? Uhm and then I'm interested in hearing a
16 little bit more about that.

17 MARK RAMPERSANT: Thank you very much,
18 the School Safety Plan is in fact developed at the
19 school level by the School Safety Committee. Safety
20 Committee members that include: Parents,
21 representatives from the uhm, UFT, the chapter
22 leader, the School Custodian, NYPD, FDNY and student
23 representatives. The Safety Plan is developed every
24 year, it is the responsibility of the uhm, the Safety
25 Committee to develop that plan. Once developed at
the school level, the plan is submitted to the

3 Borough Safety Director for the first review uhm any
4 added or any areas that the school is missing, the
5 plan is sent back to the school for those add-ons
6 before we do a final submission to the NYPD and they
7 make the, the, they do the final approval of the
8 overall plan. So before that plan is actually
9 submitted to the state it has to go through a number
10 of reviews.

11 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: The NYPD is at
12 the table as well at these meetings? Or?

13 MARK RAMPERSANT: Absolutely. So the
14 School Safety.

15 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Alright so are
16 we? So are we positive every school has a School
17 Safety Plan and that these meetings are happening?

18 MARK RAMPERSANT: Absolutely. Every
19 school has a School Safety Plan developed every year,
20 reviewed. We do a comprehensive check of the Safety
21 Plans to ensure that they are.

22 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Who does the
23 checks?

24 MARK RAMPERSANT: The Borough Safety
25 Directors, as well our partners in NYPD. Every

3 school is required to have an up-to-date School
4 Safety Plan.

5 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So in the
6 testimony, someone testimony said is your objective
7 to have 100%, so objective doesn't say that it's,
8 actually 100%.

9 MARK RAMPERSANT: Every year?

10 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Objective is
11 great but are we meeting that objective?

12 MARK RAMPERSANT: Every year, 100%.

13 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So if we went to
14 every school and I asked my principals and requested
15 the to, to share that information with us, we are
16 positive that every school in New York City has a
17 School Safety Plan comprised of a committee and when
18 do these meetings happen?

19 MARK RAMPERSANT: So the Safety Committee
20 Meetings happen once a month.

21 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Once a month?

22 MARK RAMPERSANT: Once a month, once a
23 month.

24 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Okay.

25 MARK RAMPERSANT: With, with all the
stakeholders. Uhm.

3 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: At every school
4 in New York City?

5 MARK RAMPERSANT: Every school in New
6 York City School Building is required to have a
7 School Safety Committee Meeting. If you went into a
8 New York City Public School and said principal let me
9 see your Safety Plan, I hope my principal would say
10 we have a plan, I can't give it to you, right, you
11 are not a first responder and why, why would you need
12 to see my Safety Plan respectfully but I can tell you
13 that every school principal if you walked into the
14 school and said "Do you have a Safety Plan?" would
15 absolutely say yes.

16 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: And what
17 reporting mechanisms are in place to ensure that
18 there is transparency around these plans actually
19 happening? How do parents know? And what public
20 outreach is done? So you said parents also sit on
21 this?

22 MARK RAMPERSANT: Yes sir, the parent,
23 there is a parent representative, the PTA President
24 sits on the Safety Committee. There is a parent
25 version of the School Safety Plan, School Safety

3 Agent Version of the plan and a plan that's kept at
4 the school level.

5 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Okay. Uhm.

6 RUBEN BELTRAN: If I could just add
7 something to the School Safety Plan, for the first
8 time in, for the first time in history in terms of
9 the School Safety Plans we have also made these plans
10 accessible to Police Officers on patrol on the NYPDs
11 intranet and also available as a reference document
12 through the portal on NYPD Smart Phones that every
13 NYPD officer has and we've also added Smart Phones,
14 distributed Smart Phones to all of our level III and
15 above School Safety Agents so they would also have
16 real time access to those, to those uhm Safety Plans.

17 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: And are they, so
18 once this plan is drafted so does the public. So if
19 I'm a parent who has a child in the school how do I
20 know about this Safety Plan? Is there a public
21 process that or some sort of hearing or something
22 that takes place to ensure the entire school
23 community actually knows that there is a School
24 Safety Plan?

25 MARK RAMPERSANT: So as stated, the
Safety Committee has representatives for all of,

3 representatives outside of the stakeholders, the
4 parent representative is responsible for turn-keying
5 that information to the parent body. The UFT Chapter
6 Leader is responsible for turn-keying that
7 information to teachers. We don't provide the
8 students with a copy of the Safety Plan and as you
9 may guess but we do not do a public meeting on the
10 safety plan, what we do is, one of, one of the
11 monthly Safety Committee Meetings is in fact a Town
12 Hall where the principal gets to allow the public in
13 to talk about where they are with safety, security as
14 well as brag about the amazing things that are
15 happening at their campus and then share some of
16 their community concerns. So I want to believe you.
17 But I have not seen much of these Town Halls. I have
18 at least 40 schools in my District and the principals
19 are normally very good at sharing information so I
20 would urge that more of that happens, and that if it
21 is happening that uhm and you, and you are pretty
22 positive that 100% of your schools are in compliance.
23 What happens if they are not in compliance? Have we
24 had any cases of schools that have not been in
25 compliance?

3 MARK RAMPERSANT: So the Borough Safety
4 Directors who are responsible for a certain number of
5 schools in their respective districts, it's also a
6 competition to see whose plans are ready first. We
7 are close, uhm, we closely monitor the completion of
8 the Safety Plans. The NYPD has a group of readers
9 and reviewers and they certify the plan and as a plan
10 is certified it is removed from the list or the
11 school representing the school on whether or not
12 submitted, completed or still in the process.

13 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Is there due
14 date as well? Sorry to cut you off...

15 MARK RAMPERSANT: Absolutely. There is
16 a.

17 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: What is the due
18 date for the Safety Plan?

19 MARK RAMPERSANT: November 21st is final
20 for Safety Plan.

21 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: No November 21st
22 of this year every school would have submitted their
23 Safety Plans?

24 MARK RAMPERSANT: Yes.

25 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: I mean if they
are not.

3 MARK RAMPERSANT: Or had their plans
4 certified.

5 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Certified.

6 MARK RAMPERSANT: By the 21st.

7 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Does it have to
8 be certified and it's, it is approved as well?

9 MARK RAMPERSANT: Approved and certified.

10 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So what if it is
11 not approved on November 21st?

12 MARK RAMPERSANT: Then that means that
13 there is something drastically wrong in that school
14 right? So the Safety Plans outline egress routes,
15 uhm outlines the number of students with
16 disabilities, uhm limited mobility, the number of
17 employees in the building just to name a few, who is
18 certified in the building to Administer AED First Aid
19 so if the person in the building is not certified,
20 the plan will not get approved. So one of the things
21 that may hold up as an example, hold up a plan is
22 whether or not the person's certification is expired.
23 Right, so we will in fact reach out and hold the
24 class to make sure that we meet the deadline on the
25 21st, we've met that deadline for as far as I can
remember.

3 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Yes I would also
4 like to add.

5 LASHAWN ROBINSON: And I just want to add
6 to that.

7 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Sorry. Uhm you
8 know we are going to look at some reporting
9 mechanisms on this because I you know, not that I
10 don't want to believe you but seeing is believing.

11 LASHAWN ROBINSON: Uh-huh.

12 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: And uhm and I
13 think you know you should do a better job at
14 transparency, I think parents deserve that when they
15 send their kids to school to know that every school
16 that they sending their kids in... their children
17 into a building with an actual plan so.

18 LASHAWN ROBINSON: Council Member
19 Richards, we, we absolutely uhm invite you to take a
20 look at the processes for the School Safety Plan as a
21 former New York City High School Principal. This is
22 an area where I receive extensive support.

23 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Uh-huh.

24 LASHAWN ROBINSON: I was held accountable
25 by my superintendant to ensure that the Safety Plan
was completed and submitted. There was a lot of

3 follow up regarding the approval. If we had to
4 update anything, we were out of compliance in any
5 areas, we were supported in doing so, so there is
6 tremendous support in this area as safety is our top
7 priority. It was for me as a high school principal
8 and it remains in my current capacity as well.

9 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Okay I look
10 forward. Okay I'm going to hop because I know my
11 colleagues have questions as well. I want to hop
12 into arrests in schools, so can you give me how many
13 individuals are arrested and summons last year in New
14 York City Schools so you, you provided data that said
15 that, I believe in your testimony you spoke of a
16 decrease in arrests but then we saw an increase in
17 summons big time. So can you speak to why we saw
18 more of an increase in summons opposed to decreases
19 in arrests?

20 RUBEN BELTRAN: Well the increase in
21 summons uhm from my review of the data is that we
22 also had a co-responding increase in recovery of
23 weapons and dangerous instruments. And the dangerous
24 instruments are when they are not by themselves,
25 possession is not criminal, those are not, those are
summonsable offenses and because of that, that

3 increase in in dangerous instruments lead to an
4 increase. That really drove the increase in terms
5 of.

6 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Can you give me
7 exact numbers on how many arrests?

8 RUBEN BELTRAN: Well in terms of arrests,
9 the arrests for the last school year.

10 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Uh-huh.

11 RUBEN BELTRAN: Was 1171.

12 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Okay.

13 RUBEN BELTRAN: The prior year was 1240,
14 that was a 6% reduction in arrests and in terms of
15 summons, the summons were 885 last year versus 833
16 for the, for the previous year for an increase of 6%.

17 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So we didn't
18 make much of a dent in the summons. And and can you
19 break down so, so you said there were more weapons
20 that were brought into school buildings. Uhm do you
21 have an analysis of what all the breakdown of what
22 summons were issued? So I hear the weapons, what
23 other areas did we see an uptake in?

24 RUBEN BELTRAN: The uhm the average just
25 from my review the majority was in, in weapons. In

3 fact it was almost 40% to 50% increase in dangerous
4 instrument summons.

5 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Okay who makes
6 the decision to arrest? Or when arrests happen in a
7 building?

8 RUBEN BELTRAN: I guess it depends on the
9 circumstances under which, which a student's behavior
10 could get to my attention and so, so if it's
11 something that is observed criminal in nature,
12 that's, that's in progress by our school safety
13 agents then depending on the offense. If it is
14 something that they have discretion in then we would
15 be able to defer that, work with the principal, the
16 staff in the school to see if administrative
17 discipline is more appropriate. If it's something
18 that we don't have discretion on that's more serious
19 then we would have to, we would have to make an
20 arrest at that time.

21 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So you said.

22 RUBEN BELTRAN: And we would have the
23 authority to make that arrest.

24 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So you just
25 mentioned that you may work with a principal or
something believe the DOEs regulations say that a

3 principal should be present in the event before an
4 arrest. So is that happening at all instances? And
5 also uhm you know who keeps record of those
6 complaints and who filed them?

7 RUBEN BELTRAN: Right, the, the,
8 depending on the circumstances if it's something
9 that, that's, either minor, discretion based or it,
10 or it's just unclear of whether or not it is
11 something that is serious enough for an arrest, that
12 would generally be brought to the principal's office
13 and even an arrest for the most part the
14 circumstances would be brought to the principal and
15 but in the case of something more serious we would
16 have to affect the arrest but the principal would
17 definitely be involved.

18 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Now do you keep
19 records is the question I had of who placed the
20 particular complaint that resulted in an arrest?

21 RUBEN BELTRAN: Sure, sure we do. All, we
22 know the, we know the justification for the arrest,
23 was it on a complaint that just occurred, was it for
24 a complaint that was previously reported, we would
25 have all of that information. That would all be part
of the probably cause for the arrest.

3 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: And where's that
4 data at?

5 RUBEN BELTRAN: Well the data would be in
6 terms of, in terms of the arrest. The, the arrest
7 reports themselves.

8 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Okay.

9 RUBEN BELTRAN: And the incident reports
10 themselves would contain that information.

11 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: And you would be
12 willing to share that information with the Council?
13 So I am also interested in knowing, you know if you
14 can give us an estimate of percentage of calls that
15 come from school officials, opposed safety agents,
16 opposed to parents? And do you have that breakdown
17 of that?

18 RUBEN BELTRAN: In terms of the, in terms
19 of the details of specific arrests and the probable
20 cause and, I am going to defer to our legal in terms
21 of whether or not that is...

22 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: And I say that
23 because this is an astounding number, 1171 students
24 arrested in the New York City Schools Department is.
25 That's a lot.

3 RUBEN BELTRAN: Throughout the school
4 year so. I mean its.

5 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So we are
6 sending people...

7 RUBEN BELTRAN: We want that number to be
8 less and we are working on ways to reduce that
9 number.

10 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Right.

11 RUBEN BELTRAN: But in terms of the
12 information we continue to arrest.

13 OLAG CHARNOVSKY (SP?): Sure and Council
14 Member I think the specific information about a
15 specific case I mean you would understand that these
16 are case specific, open investigations, records that
17 may ultimately wind up being sealed given the ages of
18 the individuals involved so.

19 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: But I'm not
20 asking for individual. I don't want to know.

21 OLAG CHARNOVSKY: But aggregate data.

22 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Okay I'll let
23 you, you should identify yourself.

24 OLAG CHARNOVSKY: Oh I'm sorry, Olag
25 Charnovsky. I'm the director of (INAUDIBLE).

3 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: And he's going
4 to swear you in.

5 OLAG CHARNOVSKY: Sure.

6 COUNSEL: Do you swear to tell the truth,
7 the whole truth and nothing but the truth to this
8 committee and answer questions honestly?

9 OLAG CHARNOVSKY: I do. So yeah the
10 aggregate data we've provided today and we report
11 that publicly so we certainly don't have an issue
12 with reporting.

13 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So a breakdown
14 of who's calling Safety, opposed to parent, opposed
15 to school administrator or perhaps or official within
16 the school? That's what we are looking for.

17 OLAG CHARNOVSKY: I mean we can, we can
18 certainly talk about that.

19 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Okay and is it
20 common for administrators in a school to call to have
21 students arrested?

22 RUBEN BELTRAN: In terms of the total
23 numbers, I'm going to go and change the kind of the
24 scope a little bit so those are the total number of
25 arrests by NYPD. Only about 240 of those arrests

3 last year were by School Safety Personnel that are
4 actually, that are actually in the schools. So.

5 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So only 240 out
6 of those.

7 RUBEN BELTRAN: Out of those 1100 were,
8 were a School Safety Division Personnel either,
9 either the, the civilian uniformed agents or the
10 Uniformed Task Force.

11 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: And who arrested
12 the other? I just want to get on the record, who
13 arrested the other?

14 RUBEN BELTRAN: It, it varies, because,
15 we could definitely get you the information there.

16 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: I mean there are
17 only a few people who can make arrests in New York
18 City.

19 RUBEN BELTRAN: Mostly patrol and mostly
20 Patrol Services Bureau, Patrol.

21 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So legal
22 precincts.

23 RUBEN BELTRAN: And local precinct
24 Detective Squads.

25 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: And who was
calling them to come on site to make these arrests?

3 RUBEN BELTRAN: I don't have the stats
4 for that but my experience is that usually they are
5 from reports taken in the past on someone has made
6 complaints in the past and it could be, it could be
7 to an incident where they responded to, you know
8 maybe a teacher called 9-1-1 from inside the school.

9 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Right. So this
10 is, this is astounding that we have NYPD officers who
11 are making majority of these arrests when we have
12 school, so what is the purpose of School Safety being
13 in the schools if the police department is running
14 rogue, well let's not use the word rogue but coming
15 in and making the majority of these arrests.

16 RUBEN BELTRAN: Well the School Safety
17 Agents have special training in terms of learning how
18 to deal with incidents that are occurring inside the
19 school and how to and how to work with the school and
20 the DOE staff in terms of how to deal with that, with
21 that behavior but once incidents get reported and
22 many of those, many of these uhm, these incidents are
23 serious in nature, they response of the local police.

24 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: 800 out of these
25 cases you would deme serious weapons, correct?

RUBEN BELTRAN: What was that, I'm sorry.

3 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: You would deem,
4 a serious offense bringing a weapon into the school,
5 correct?

6 RUBEN BELTRAN: Yes.

7 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Right, so you
8 mentioned so, how does, how do you differentiate
9 between School Safety making an arrest and the NYPD.
10 What protocols are there? I'm trying to figure out
11 why there is this big discrepancy between 200
12 arrests, by 240 as you said by School Safety and
13 nearly over 800 odd by NYPD?

14 RUBEN BELTRAN: So I don't have the total
15 analysis for that but I could give you some examples.
16 So for, so for, for reports that are made but
17 referred to detective squads not every incident or
18 reports taken by School Safety Agents there is an
19 arrest or perpetrator identified right away so that
20 gets referred to the Detective Squad so they would
21 follow up and they would be the unit eventually
22 making the arrest.

23 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Over 800 of
24 these incidents. There's, the.

25 RUBEN BELTRAN: I said I don't have the
breakdown but that is an example but we can we can

3 look into that and get an analysis on that and see
4 what the breakdown is but my, my experience tells me
5 that's definitely going to contribute to that number.

6 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: And how many of
7 these were actually marijuana related?

8 RUBEN BELTRAN: Okay hold on let me see
9 if I have that.

10 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: And as you dig
11 that information out I am also interested in showing
12 if arrests aren't be made the day that particular
13 incidents are taking place why do detectives
14 necessarily have to show up at school to arrest young
15 people on campus?

16 RUBEN BELTRAN: The, the reason for them
17 showing up vary depending on the circumstances but
18 uhm in terms of our goal and objective is to reduce
19 that as much as possible, so, so but there are
20 occasions where, uhm where upon their investigation
21 and maybe the student does not know, is known by a
22 nickname, get another example, is known by a nickname
23 and it, it requires uhm a visit to the school. He
24 knows the classroom that he is in and the victim
25 having to be in the classroom with the perpetrator

3 provides a safety issue for the job so that's another
4 example.

5 OLAG CHARNOVSKY (SP?): Other examples
6 would be sex crimes where the victim could
7 potentially be the same school as the perpetrator so
8 these by in large the vast majority of these cases,
9 they are serious cases, they are not lower level
10 cases and a lot of the times, the majority of the
11 times what is called for is an immediate response.

12 RUBEN BELTRAN: Okay marijuana possession
13 for the last school year, there was a 23% increase
14 with 311 marijuana summons issued compared to 258 in
15 the prior year, a difference of 58 additional
16 summons.

17 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So that was last
18 year, and in the light of the recent changes
19 obviously and the NYPD's policy around marijuana what
20 do you project is going to happen this school year?

21 RUBEN BELTRAN: Well the new, the new
22 policy is going to translate but I'm going to start
23 talking about the...

24 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: I'm not
25 advocating for people to bring marijuana.

RUBEN BELTRAN: Okay, no, no you already.

3 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: But we know that
4 this issue has largely affected black and Latino, 86%
5 of all arrests.

6 RUBEN BELTRAN: Right.

7 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: And we are going
8 to keep beating this drum uhm but now we are talking
9 about students coming to school getting found with a
10 minute amount of marijuana and being entered in a
11 system based on summons and arrests over low level
12 marijuana offenses. I think we should all you know
13 be able to say to each other that this is a problem
14 and it is something that we need to address.

15 RUBEN BELTRAN: We knew this was a
16 problem and in terms of the...

17 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Well we didn't
18 know because you increased last year.

19 RUBEN BELTRAN: Well the school, we
20 implemented a new program, the One in Car program,
21 the One in Car Program now that it's, uhm it's more
22 system wide now we expect that to reduce, drastically
23 reduce those numbers for people that qualify for the
24 warning cards. So, I mean that is one of the
25 diversionary steps that we are taking in terms of
trying to stop the School to Prison Pipeline that was

3 mentioned before. This is, this is a good way to
4 start. It has been well received in terms of by the
5 students who are given the break for making that
6 mistake and we expect that now that it's citywide we
7 expect that number to decrease yet.

8 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Yeah I want to
9 thank my colleagues for being patient, I just have
10 two more in... so New York One, so let's stay on that
11 warning card system for a second. So New York One
12 I'm sure you say the reports, reported that out of
13 the 71 school using that new school warning card that
14 only 82 were issued the entire academic school year
15 uhm last year. So can you speak to why so little of
16 these warning cards were issued uhm last year if in
17 fact we are moving toward a warning card system?

18 RUBEN BELTRAN: It was, it was actually
19 like a late in the school year whenever it became
20 more widespread.

21 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: When did it come
22 available?

23 RUBEN BELTRAN: I believe in May.

24 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: In May.

25 RUBEN BELTRAN: So it's kinda of where
there was only a few weeks left in the school for

3 that to kind of take, to take affect. And also, also
4 adjust in terms of the summons that were issued like
5 I said before, the summons increase was impacted by
6 the...

7 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: And we don't
8 think it's May by the way, I think it was a little
9 earlier.

10 RUBEN BELTRAN: Dangerous instruments.
11 Okay but that's what I recollect. It could have
12 been, it could have been sooner. I wasn't here but
13 it's just from what I read so.

14 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: And just give me
15 the process of what this? Who sends the letter home
16 to parents? Is it the NYPD who is sending the letter
17 home?

18 RUBEN BELTRAN: We will see that they
19 qualify. We would work with the principal.

20 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: What's the
21 proc... can you go through the process of the warning
22 card so?

23 RUBEN BELTRAN: So, so once the violation
24 is observed.

25 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: And what type of
violations?

3 RUBEN BELTRAN: And this is for, uh for
4 marijuana possession. They would be taken to the
5 principal and, and if they had already qualified and
6 they haven't received a warning card already for that
7 offense during that school year, uhm and and of
8 course it has a got to be a small quantity of
9 marijuana.

10 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Would you say
11 that again. If they haven't what?

12 RUBEN BELTRAN: If they haven't received
13 another warning card in that school during that
14 school year and uhm and if it is a small quantity of
15 marijuana and if the, the only reason that is a right
16 alternative in terms of that there are resources and
17 it can handle this administratively the decision is
18 made to issue a warning card. So he, he gets a copy
19 of that.

20 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: How many
21 warnings do you get a year? I'm sorry.

22 RUBEN BELTRAN: You get one.

23 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: You get one?

24 RUBEN BELTRAN: It's not three strikes
25 you are out, it's, it's after one offense you are not
eligible anymore.

3 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: But that doesn't
4 equal restorative justice in my opinion in the work
5 that DOE says that it is doing. So one strike and
6 you are out.

7 RUBEN BELTRAN: Well that's the policy
8 the way it is now but you know we can discuss it, we
9 can see what the results are.

10 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Yeah if we are
11 serious about reducing arrests and summons in school,
12 one shot is not, as a matter of fact I would argue
13 when we look at police discipline that police
14 officers get more than just one warning.

15 RUBEN BELTRAN: Right, right.

16 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So this is
17 really unacceptable to say a guy, a kid like me,
18 Donovan Richards who certainly would have been issued
19 a warning card in high school, would have one shot.

20 RUBEN BELTRAN: Well you would have one
21 shot.

22 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: One shot a year.

23 RUBEN BELTRAN: One academic year.

24 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: One academic
25 year, one shot.

RUBEN BELTRAN: Yeah so.

3 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: That doesn't
4 sound like a warning to me.

5 RUBEN BELTRAN: Well it's an improvement
6 to what was being done before and we will look at the
7 results. We will look to see what type of incentives
8 we are getting and we will see if that should be
9 evaluated and changed.

10 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: I am a little
11 bit disheartened by hearing that it is one shot an
12 academic year, especially if we are talking about
13 investing \$47 million into restorative work. No one
14 person is going to change overnight, so if we are
15 serious about ensuring counseling and services are
16 available. You know we are talking about young folks
17 who need help in transitioning and the mere fact that
18 they are getting one shot an academic year does not
19 say that this city or administration or.

20 RUBEN BELTRAN: Council Member if you
21 could.

22 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Hold on one
23 second. Is not serious about restorative justice
24 because I am almost failed out of high school. I
25 could speak on my personal experience but imaging I
got one shot, I wouldn't sit here today and there are

3 a lot of students like me in the middle. So if we
4 are serious about restorative justice and getting it
5 right, we need to ensure that kids are getting more
6 than one chance on a low level marijuana offense.

7 RUBEN BELTRAN: If I could just make a
8 correction, if I could make a correction sir.

9 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Go ahead.

10 RUBEN BELTRAN: The amount of times is a
11 consideration of whether or not he gets another
12 warning cards amongst other, his behavior in the
13 school and and other.

14 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Yeah but we
15 noted that they are going to have that issue, you
16 know, you are talking about restorative justice.

17 RUBEN BELTRAN: By saying that it was one
18 strike and you are out was a mistake.

19 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Okay.

20 RUBEN BELTRAN: In terms of, in terms of
21 my review and bad recollection. Of what.

22 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Who knew you
23 were going to get a pass for your first hearing. But
24 uhm.

25 RUBEN BELTRAN: So uhm.

3 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: I would hope our
4 students are going to get passes as well.

5 RUBEN BELTRAN: But I, I, I still think
6 that it would be good for us to, to look at it and
7 sort of revisit and see if the policy is working or
8 see if the referrals that we are making when we are
9 giving the warning cards if they.

10 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: We are certainly
11 more interested in having more conversation. My last
12 question because I got to get to my colleagues, Chair
13 Treyger and others. So obviously.

14 RUBEN BELTRAN: Council Member, I'm sorry
15 to interrupt. Commissioner Garcia here can, can more
16 clearly articulate the uhm policy with respect to
17 warning cards if you could give us a few seconds.

18 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: And who issues
19 those warning cards and (INAUDIBLE).

20 RAMON GARCIA: We had a program with the
21 NYPD under Commissioner Bratton and then Chief of
22 Department O'Neal where we were looking at the NYPD
23 uhm with the lens of a CT scan. One of the things
24 that we were looking at was enforcement activity in
25 and around schools. We saw that far too many
students were being arrested for things like

3 disorderly conduct which happen to be on the top of
4 the list for summons in that area. We convened a
5 group and included advocates, Department of Education
6 and many other partners that decided hey there are a
7 lot of studies out there that said kids were being
8 criminalized so as part of like the chief mentioned,
9 stopping the School to Prison Pipeline we came up
10 with the idea of a warning card. Now the warning
11 card, we wanted to make sure that it was, and I am
12 going to make that clearly that it was not a
13 progression for them to see anyone in the court
14 system. Right, it was merely a hard copy log that
15 was kept inside of the school with the school
16 principal and deans and other partners to discuss
17 what got that child involved in that either
18 disorderly conduct incident or a low level unlawful
19 possession of marijuana. Unfortunately, we did not
20 come up with, I'm going to say fortunately we did not
21 come up with a strict number on how many warning
22 cards any child could get. There are so many things
23 that can go into that decision making and that should
24 be done at the school based level. So if Ramon
25 Garcia that gets into a fight with Donovan Richards
over Maria. We both took a liking to Maria in the

3 past may have escalated to something very serious and
4 unfortunately there was a police presence and Ramon
5 got arrested, right? Although I thought it was
6 unfair he lost the fight.

7 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: I wasn't in that
8 fight by the way. (laughing).

9 RAMON GARCIA: In this case, in this
10 case, everyone that is involved in that School Safety
11 Committee that is school based again will make a
12 decision on whether or not that child gets arrested
13 or summons or it is referred back to the school for
14 school disciplinary measures or a warning card. The
15 reason why the numbers were so low when we started
16 the program is it started on five campuses, 38
17 schools in the Bronx. Why the Bronx? Because we saw
18 a high number of disorderly conduct incidents in the
19 Bronx. We later expanded it to a couple of schools
20 in different boroughs and last year we actually
21 decided to take the citywide. So I am pretty sure
22 that there is going to be a greater impact down the
23 road when the warning card program.

24 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So every school
25 is going to have the Warning Card Program?

3 RAMON GARCIA: Every single school in the
4 city.

5 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: And you are
6 going to?

7 RAMON GARCIA: Wherever a summons could
8 be issued, this is in lieu of a summons for kids over
9 16 and Raise the Age is going to change the
10 parameters on that as well.

11 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: And so now I'm
12 very grateful I think it's, so I have mixed feelings
13 on the School Safety Agent, Neighborhood Coordinating
14 sort of program that you have rolled out because I
15 think the idea is to ensure that we are not putting
16 children in a lot of these neighborhoods are not
17 necessarily having too many interactions with law
18 enforcement we want them to go into an environment
19 conducive of learning and growing and going to
20 college or a trade school or whatever they are going
21 to do whatever path they choose. Uhm can you speak
22 to, this is my last question then I will come back
23 for a second round. On so, so what is the role, what
24 are these Agents doing, can you speak to exactly with
25 what they are tasked with doing every day. Uhm and
when you talk about information sharing, you know

3 where is the information that the School Safety
4 Agents will not acquire, where is that information
5 going? In, in for instance, a good example, I know
6 Olag is not going to like hearing this, more
7 information, will these children's names, young
8 people's names be entered into the gang database?
9 Now he's upright? Uhm you know what, where is this
10 information going that you, that you receive?

11 RAMON GARCIA: In terms of what the
12 School Safety Agents are doing, obviously we talked
13 about the great working relationship we had with the
14 DOE and with OSYD in terms of kind of defining kind
15 of what the needs are in all the schools? So.

16 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: School
17 Coordination Agents I'm talking about?

18 RAMON GARCIA: On the School Coordination
19 Agents?

20 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Uh-huh yeah.

21 RAMON GARCIA: The School Coordination
22 Agents are similar to the Neighborhood Coordination
23 Officers they, their main task really is to develop
24 relationship and to develop relationships with the
25 purposes of dealing with issues before they become a
condition upon a condition before a more preventive

3 type approach to policing like we are doing in other
4 parts of the city for NCOs and similar to the NCO
5 program where focusing their efforts and, in, in
6 their particular school, they are assigned to a
7 school, they are assigned to a response sector. They
8 are going to cover the same geographic area and, and,
9 and work with staff in the same school to develop
10 those relationships and, and, and for the, for the
11 objective of preventing trying to prevent arrests,
12 trying to develop relationships when the kids get
13 more of a trusting relationship with the kids and
14 with the staff which we know will eventually lead to
15 reducing crime and improving their climate in the
16 schools.

16 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Now how are they
17 building relationships? Are they sitting and eating
18 lunch with these kids? Are they hanging out in the
19 classroom? I just find it hard to believe that the
20 you know teenagers to a great degree are just going
21 to be sharing all of this information with these
22 coordinating officers. So what is the strategy
23 around you know, are you trying to get information
24 about fights? Are you running up to Ramon saying
25

3 give me information? I heard you are going to fight
4 Donovan today? What does that strategy look like?

5 RAMON GARCIA: We did a special five day
6 training for the School Safety Agents and I am trying
7 to remember the curriculum. I don't think any of it
8 had to do with enforcement and intelligence
9 gathering. This was about what they were the first
10 civilian employees within the department to get the
11 implicit biased training. You know conflict
12 resolution. It's about, it's about having that trust
13 with people that they are interacting with in the
14 school, where they are going to give them information
15 to stop robbers. Not to get people arrested but ways
16 to prevent violence within the school and for them to
17 feel more comfortable at the services provided being
18 provided but all School Safety Agents. Whether or
19 not their School Coordination is or not.

20 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So is this a
21 private office space they would go and meet at. I'm
22 just finding it hard to figure out how they are going
23 to work because you know one of the things, some
24 young people may be reluctant to doing is having that
25 conversation in a public setting to share information

3 on Donovan and Ramon having a problem so I'm just
4 trying to understand how this is all going to work.

5 RAMON GARCIA: Working with the DOE and
6 our partners there we will get them exposed and
7 create an awareness about who they are and, and get
8 them involved in more activities within the school
9 but a lot of these people were selected really
10 because they had those inherent skills and were
11 performing that part of their job very well. We want
12 them to be ambassadors for the NYPD but for the
13 School Safety Division in those, in those schools and
14 to be a resource of them and they can also access
15 those resources from NCOs in the pretext. So they
16 are going to develop special relationships with the
17 NCOs and the precinct to be able to bring more
18 resources to bear to be able to provide stuff not
19 just from happening in the school but prevent stuff
20 that's happening in the school but prevent stuff that
21 is happening when they are going to and from school
22 in those communities.

23 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: And I'm
24 interested in hearing from DOE why wasn't the
25 strategy more so and I'm assuming you all worked this
out and spoke collectively together on this. I would

3 hope so. Uhm why wasn't the strategy around ensuring
4 more social workers and where in the schools to
5 really do what these officers will be tasked with
6 doing? Would that have been better? A better use of
7 resources to a great degree, rather than having law
8 enforcement have to have these interactions with our
9 young people. Not to say that we don't want them to
10 interact with law enforcement but better use of
11 resources. And I'm to Chair Treyger.

12 KENYATTA REED: Again my name is Kenyatta
13 Reed we share your commitment to the social,
14 emotional development of our young people. That is
15 our priority. I like you would have definitely
16 needed multiple opportunities and chances to your
17 point. Uhm we've invested millions of dollars in
18 increasing the number of social workers in schools
19 with our single shepherd programs, with our Bridging
20 the Gap Programs. The number of social workers have
21 increase by approximately I think about 10% or
22 greater. We also want to thank you for your
23 leadership when it comes to restorative justice in
24 schools starting in 2015. It was under the City
25 Council's Leadership that we started our first
Restorative Justice Pilot. At that point in fall

3 2015, we were supporting 29 schools, 25 of which
4 funded by City Council, now this fall, 217 schools
5 are getting RJ support. All of that to say that the
6 DOE has continued to prioritize making every school
7 safe and supportive. We also emphasize social
8 emotional learning which we believe is a critical
9 factor in not only prevention and intervention
10 through social emotional learning, we are teaching
11 young people skills such as self-awareness, self-
12 management and responsible decision making. In
13 addition to our 217 schools that we are working with,
14 with restorative justice that also teaches SLC. We
15 have an additional 300 schools that are being
16 supported in that. So our stance mirrors your stance
17 as well is that we must be prevention focused and
18 intervention focused and we have made significant
19 investments in that focus and we want to just again
20 thank you for your leadership in that because like I
21 said that first group really launched the way to show
22 that RJ and SCL works in schools.

23 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Alright I have
24 more questions but I don't want to pull Vallone to
25 draft legislation on a task force on me so I am going
to pass this over to the next Chair but I, but I do

3 want to say that uhm you know I, I commend you for
4 some work that has been done. I think we have a long
5 ways to go. You know I'm not necessarily happy with
6 over 1000 young people, primarily people of color
7 going into the system when there is clearly a whole
8 lot more that this city can be doing to in... ensure
9 restorative justice initiatives and curriculums and
10 other things that are happening. So I will pass it
11 over to Chair Treyger who is going to have a lot to
12 say about this I'm sure.

13 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Thank you Chair
14 Richards. I think I met my match.

15 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: That is a
16 compliment.

17 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: That is a
18 compliment.

19 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Moving in the
20 right direction.

21 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Uhm I will try to
22 get right to the questions uhm so this question can
23 go both to NYPD and DOE uhm we have data here that
24 says in the 2016-2017 school year NYPD officers
25 issued more than 2000 summons or arrests. Students

3 were handcuffed in more than 1800 incidents. Is
4 there data on how many of these students have IEPs?

5 MARK RAMPERSANT: So for the DOE we would
6 have to have all the information related to the
7 arrest in order to do the side by side comparison to
8 how many of those students in fact have IEPs. So to
9 answer your question, for every reported arrest taken
10 from the school, we are required to do an AWS report.
11 We know the name and OSYS of every student so we
12 would know whether or not the student has an IEP.

13 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: So do you have that
14 data?

15 MARK RAMPERSANT: We would have to do the
16 comparison to the arrest.

17 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Have you done the
18 comparisons?

19 MARK RAMPERSANT: We have not, not for
20 the purposes of IEPs.

21 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Uhm because if a
22 student is experiencing a mental health crisis you
23 cannot suspend, summons or arrest your way out of
24 this issue. It doesn't work in society and sure will
25 not work in schools. And as a matter of fact it adds
a certain amount of trauma to the student and as I

3 mentioned in my opening statement I believe that we
4 are falling short in meeting the social emotional
5 needs of kids as it is. So I would like to get that
6 information. To NYPD how many total NYPD total
7 personnel, School Safety and additional NYPD are
8 assigned to our school system?

9 RUBEN BELTRAN: School Safety Division I
10 think it mentioned that in the testimony, I believe
11 is 5,100, 5,000, 5,251.

12 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: That's just the
13 School Safety?

14 RUBEN BELTRAN: Right that's the School
15 Safety Officers and then we have 113 uniformed task
16 force. I can give you some other numbers now if you
17 will give me a second.

18 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: It is fair to say
19 it's about close to 5,500 total NYPD.

20 RUBEN BELTRAN: Yeah 5,500 is a total
21 between uniform and civilian.

22 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Out of the 52, out
23 of the 5,251 School Safety Agents assigned to schools
24 how many of them are bilingual?
25

3 RUBEN BELTRAN: And I don't have, I don't
4 have that information but I can, I can uhm, uhm,
5 let's see if Ray Garcia can answer that.

6 RAMON GARCIA: The agents are
7 predominantly 58% female, uhm other difference are
8 male. Uhm are black and Hispanic descent. Uhm many
9 are bilingual.

10 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: I just I don't know
11 what many means and I would like to have that
12 information because I want to share with you an
13 experience that I witnessed when I visited renewal
14 schools, community schools during my, right before my
15 first hearing where I witnessed a School Safety Agent
16 as a student for ID. The student did not speak, the
17 Agent did not speak the language of the student and
18 therefore the Agent stopped another student who did
19 speak the language to translate an almost 5-6 minute
20 conversation taking two students away from
21 instruction and I do believe that this is, this is a
22 problem especially when we keep hearing about
23 building and establishing better community relations.
24 How is that happening if we are not speaking the
25 language commonly spoken in these communities?

3 RAMON GARCIA: Council Member I think you
4 are right, we are going to get you the numbers to the
5 extent that we can about how many of our Agents are
6 bilingual however you are also right in the sense
7 that two students should not be taken out of class
8 for the purpose of one translating to the other.
9 That's why the department uses Language Line and has
10 a significant number of certified bilingual
11 personnel. Now Language Line is available to the
12 officers through their department issued cellphones.
13 Why it wasn't used on this particular incident, we
14 will speak to you about and get to the bottom of.
15 But we have taken steps towards giving our officers
16 the ability to be able to interact with individuals
17 that are non-English speaking.

18 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Isn't the NYPD
19 facing a law suit over Language Line?

20 RAMON GARCIA: I'm not sure, I'd have to
21 look.

22 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: I'm pretty sure I
23 read reports that in many cases immigrant communities
24 are having a difficult time making police reports and
25 the Language Line Program is not effectively being
put to use where folks called 9-1-1 and they could

3 not file a report because the language was not spoken
4 and so I have my own issues with the language access
5 issue with NYPD in general but I want to continue
6 with my line of questioning. But I would like to
7 know the data about how many of the School Safety
8 Agents are bilingual because I think it is critical,
9 especially because it leads to my next question, we
10 are hearing about the expansion of the community
11 policing program and a pilot in the Bronx and again
12 I, I do credit many of the NCOs throughout our
13 communities who I think are working hard and put
14 together meetings but in many immigrant communities
15 they are not speaking the language of the predominant
16 community and I think that that's, so that's an issue
17 that I am very interested in making sure that we are
18 actually estab... that we are actually establishing
19 these effective relationships. Uhm, how much money
20 did the NYPD spend on this School Coordination Agent
21 program. I know that I've been told before that they
22 used existing resources but how much money was spent?

23 RUBEN BELTRAN: Yeah we, we didn't, we
24 didn't request or attain additional budget to
25 implement the pilot.

3 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: But is there a
4 number, a figure?

5 RUBEN BELTRAN: There's no, there's no
6 figure because there was no additional funding that
7 was needed. We used existing resources.

8 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: So this did not cost
9 a dime to train these officers, the School Safety
10 Agents, the training was free, conducted by
11 volunteers?

12 RAMON GARCIA: The, I mean we would have
13 to take a look into seeing uhm when the training
14 actually took place to ensure that there was no
15 overtime incurred in the context of that training,
16 that training that was done.

17 RUBEN BELTRAN: Not by the Agents.

18 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: How many total
19 agents are in this program?

20 RUBEN BELTRAN: Right now there is a total
21 of 51. School Coordination Agents.

22 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: And how many
23 schools?

24 RUBEN BELTRAN: Uhm they are on 119
25 campuses. There are approximately 215 schools within
those campuses and programs.

3 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: And you are saying
4 that there was no additional costs for the NYPD.
5 This did not cost anything, everything was within
6 your budget. Uhm what that tells me is this. I sat
7 through and I mentioned this to you during our phone
8 conversation. Uhm I sat through the conversation
9 that the Mayor and the Police Commissioner had with
10 the City Council when they rolled out the Community
11 Policing Program and not once did I hear anything
12 about the program expanding to the school system and
13 I stayed from beginning to end and so the first that
14 I learned about this was through the New York Times
15 Article that many folks in the Administration seem
16 very proud to share but uhm the City Council
17 Education Committee, the City Council is an equal
18 part of City Government and we have certainly our own
19 set of priorities and our own set of concerns, uhm
20 particularly in the social emotional front uhm and so
21 I which leads to my next question. Did anyone
22 consider the level of social emotional support staff
23 at these schools that are being piloted before
24 enhancing the role of NYPD staff.

25 RUBEN BELTRAN: I'm sorry sir, what was
that question again?

3 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Uhm did anyone
4 consider the level of social emotional support staff
5 at the schools before enhancing the role of NYPD
6 staff?

7 RUBEN BELTRAN: Yeah NYPD didn't have that
8 information so it was not a consideration and it.

9 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: So it was not a
10 consideration. I just want NYPD to know that there
11 are a number of schools in New York City, some of
12 which in the Bronx that have 0 guidance counselors, 0
13 social workers, uhm and there are many public schools
14 in the New York City School System that have part-
15 time guidance counselors, part-time social workers,
16 uhm but the School Safety Agents I believe work the
17 full week is that correct?

18 RUBEN BELTRAN: Correct.

19 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: So it's, it's
20 interesting to learn what happens if the encounter a
21 conflict during the day when there is no support
22 staff in the building.

23 RUBEN BELTRAN: I think terms of I
24 described the training before. A lot of the training
25 they received is dealing with, with students under
emotional duress.

3 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Mr. Beltran
4 respectfully are these Schools Safety Agents licensed
5 Social Workers?

6 RUBEN BELTRAN: No they are not.

7 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Not they are not.

8 RUBEN BELTRAN: And I know there are also
9 other supports available from the DOE so I'll, I'll,
10 I'll let them talk about that.

11 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: It's hard to provide
12 support when there is no support staff in the
13 building and this, this is just not acceptable. For
14 everyone to kind of just cheer this proposal on
15 knowing that we are failing our kids is outrageous.
16 There is nothing to cheer here and that's why I have
17 requested to know the number of guidance counselors
18 and social workers and school psychologists in the
19 schools that you have piloted. Because if a conflict
20 occurs and mind you in the New York Times article
21 that folks were sharing I, I turn, I encourage folks
22 to turn to the quote from one of the School Safety
23 Agents, you know who had many years of service and
24 said hey even though I get cursed out many times, hey
25 I still work with the kids. There is, there is
something wrong here. Uhm now NYPD Local Law 93 of

3 2015, the police department is not complying with the
4 reporting law on metal detectors and School Safety
5 Agents, uhm what is the reason why the NYPD is not
6 complying with the law that was passed? This was not
7 a recommendation. This was not a suggestion. This
8 was a law that was passed in 2015 about reporting on
9 metal detectors in schools. I would like to hear
10 your testimony.

11 RAMON GARCIA: Yes Council Member do we
12 believe that we are in compliance with the law. We
13 report a significant amount of data sets in response
14 to Section 14-152 and Section 14-150 of the Ad Code.
15 What both sections have built in to those sections of
16 law is a safety exemption that if any data that is
17 required to be released, pursuant to those sections
18 of law would endanger safety the Police Department
19 can withhold reporting on that. We are happy to say
20 that by enlarge we do not rely on that exemption when
21 it comes to the data sets required under 14-150 and
22 14-152. However, disclosing on the exact locations
23 of weapons detection equipment is something that we
24 do believe would compromise safety and our Safety
25 Plan so that is something that we withhold pursuant
to law.

3 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Why wasn't that
4 concern expressed before the Law was signed?

5 RAMON GARCIA: Well the, I wouldn't, the
6 law predates me but I would venture to say that there
7 is a section in both 14-150 and 14-152 that takes
8 into account that a data set required by those two
9 statutes may very well compromise security and if
10 that determination is made that is why those
11 provisions were inserted in both laws.

12 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: You know my
13 colleague, uhm my co-chair drove home the point I
14 mentioned in my opening statement as well, the
15 majority, overwhelming majority of students uhm that
16 have been issued summons, arrested in our public
17 school system are children of color. This is one of
18 the reasons we need to get this information as well.
19 Because are the same children that are being
20 subjected to over policing tactics, the same students
21 being subjected on a daily basis to instruction
22 disrupting techniques and structures. And let me get
23 share with you again my personal experience. I
24 taught in a school that had random scanning days. I
25 hated those days. My students hated them more. I
taught a 7:30 in the morning regions class, 48 minute

3 periods. The majority of my students showed up to my
4 class over 35 minutes late and missed a day of
5 instruction. And when they got to class all they
6 could talk about was being harassed, questioned,
7 interrogated, they felt like prisoners over an
8 iphone, over a cellphone, over a piece of technology,
9 over some other item and for the DOE you know these
10 are our kids. These are our kids and I was trained
11 and taught to, to, to be a teacher that believes in
12 our kids, to, to teach them, to prepare them for
13 success and their entire day was ruined. Their
14 entire school day that's all they could talk about
15 and they lost focused and they lost critical
16 instruction particularly in a regions class. So I
17 just want the NYPD to kind of hear that. I
18 understand that there is a balance that we have to
19 strike but what I am telling you based on the figures
20 that we have there is an imbalance. There is a
21 significant imbalance in our school system right now
22 and I'm going to get to that soon with the DOE. Uhm
23 let me know actually turn to the, to the DOE. Uhm
24 Deputy Chancellor Robinson, congratulations and
25 welcome here to our hearing.

LASHAWN ROBINSON: Thank you.

3 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: I have just some
4 series of questions, just would like to hear a yes or
5 no answer. In a school system of 1.1 million
6 students, do you believe 2,880 guidance counselors
7 are sufficient?

8 LASHAWN ROBINSON: I believe in the
9 social emotional supports of young people and believe
10 that they should have access to guidance counselors,
11 social workers, psychologist, to support their needs.
12 Uhm I review the data on our schools without a
13 guidance counselor or a social worker and since the
14 report in February of 2018 where we had 41 schools
15 without a guidance counselor or social worker, that
16 number has been reduced to 20 schools that's
17 currently without a guidance counselor or social
18 worker. So while we have made progress as a system
19 we cannot rest until we have support of the nature of
20 a guidance counselor and/or a social worker at all
21 school communities. I also uhm spoke to our teams to
22 ensure that if we have guidance staff and social work
23 staff members in our excess pools to have those staff
24 members assigned to the 20 schools without a staff
25 member of a guidance counselor or a social worker
background in nature.

3 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: And how many schools
4 have part-time guidance counselors?

5 LASHAWN ROBINSON: I do have that
6 information.

7 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Yes because there
8 are a number of schools in our system that have
9 counselors that only work one or two days a week but
10 as pointed out before the NYPD personnel work the
11 entire school week. Uhm I'm going to keep going. In
12 a school system of 1.1 million students do you
13 believe that only 1293 social workers are sufficient?

14 LASHAWN ROBINSON: I do believe that
15 students need appropriate supports to be successful
16 in schools. I believe in supporting the whole child
17 including social emotional learning, including
18 ensuring that we are welcoming culture responsiveness
19 into our school communities. Uhm I do believe that
20 we should have social workers available to support
21 more clinical needs, uhm I believe we should have
22 guidance staff available to support academic
23 advisement so yes I believe that students needs to
24 have the appropriate supports to be successful. I
25 believe that is part of an equity and excellence for
all agenda ensuring that students have targeted

3 supports to ensure academic outcomes so I do believe
4 that and I commit to working to ensure that our young
5 people have the resources necessary to be successful
6 in our school communities.

7 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: And I'll, I'll
8 repeat the last, the last point here in a school
9 system of 1.1 million students do you believe 583
10 school psychologists are sufficient?

11 LASHAWN ROBINSON: Council I absolutely
12 agree with your point and your emphasis on holding us
13 accountable for ensuring that our young people have
14 appropriate support and I share in that concern as
15 well and will commit again to you to ensure and to
16 Council in general and to all of our students, our
17 1.1 million students across 1800 schools that they
18 have appropriate support to meet their needs. Uhm
19 Kenyatta spoke earlier about uhm how we made
20 investments in restorative practices and how we've
21 made investments in social emotional learning. We've
22 also made investments since the time that I've been
23 in this position since July at increasing the number
24 of staff members assigned to support our vulnerable
25 students on temporary housing. We have also
increased the number of schools that are uhm

3 receiving additional self-support, social emotional
4 learning funding so I look forward to being able to
5 come back to share uhm a lot of the progress that we
6 have made and ensuring that we have coverage of
7 social emotional support in the 20 schools that
8 currently do not have them.

9 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Right I mean I want
10 to just emphasize the point because sometimes this
11 kind of gets lost in this whole conversation. We
12 have a housing, an affordable housing crisis in New
13 York City. We have a homelessness crisis, we have a
14 food and security crisis. There are some communities
15 that have been plagued by gun violence way before
16 Parkland every happened. And a whole host of other
17 complicated issues. That trauma travels with our
18 students to schools. You can't divorce that from the
19 school reality.

20 LASHAWN ROBINSON: Right.

21 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: And so there is a
22 critical need in order to I believe effectively
23 produce high grade academic outcomes we need to meet
24 social, emotional needs. Students should be spending
25 more time with their teachers, with support staff, on
or going on school trips, more than with deans,

3 School Safety Agents or the Criminal Justice System.
4 They should be spending more time with college
5 advisors and college counselors than with the
6 Criminal Justice System. That's the imbalance that
7 we are seeing here in our system today. Uhm I would
8 like to ask about the MOU. My co-chair noted that
9 it's, and, and the panel mentioned that it will be
10 released sometime this fall. Uhm who served on the
11 MOU team?

12 MARK RAMPERSANT: So on the MOU is the
13 Dep... representatives for the Department of Education,
14 the NYPD, uhm local unions as well as advocates and
15 other stakeholders.

16 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Can you repeat that
17 one more time you said?

18 MARK RAMPERSANT: NYPD.

19 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: NYPD.

20 MARK RAMPERSANT: Department of
21 Education, the unions, the re, the unions, advocates,
22 and am I missing anybody, no, and the may.. well
23 that's and the Mayor's office, MACJ.

24 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: And who from the
25 DOE?

3 MARK RAMPERSANT: I served on as well as
4 school representatives.

5 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: When you say school
6 representatives, who represented the schools?

7 MARK RAMPERSANT: I'm not sure of their
8 titles but I could come back to you with that.

9 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Right, uhm were CEC
10 or local communities consulted?

11 MARK RAMPERSANT: Not a part of the MOU,
12 no.

13 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: No, why is it being
14 revisted or revised?

15 MARK RAMPERSANT: The last MOU is we
16 believe doesn't reflect some of the great workers
17 that are happening now in terms of the collaboration
18 between the Department of Education. There is some
19 things outlined in the old MOU that is sort of
20 outdated, doesn't really, doesn't really share the
21 collaborative relationships, some of the enhanced
22 training for School Safety Agents, the collaboration
23 between schools. Uhm it outlines, uhm we wanted to
24 make sure that we outlined some of the
25 recommendations from the leadership team as well.
There are some other areas that we believe the old

3 MOU just didn't really speak to what is happening now
4 between the Department of Education and uhm the NYPD.

5 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Does it speak to the
6 protocol of the issue of sometimes historic Turf
7 Issues between NYPD and DOE and NYPD personnel?
8 Coming from a school system that has historically
9 been an issue where if an Assistant Principal of
10 Security asks for assistance sometimes from the
11 Safety Agents they will point out that they work for
12 the NYPD they don't work for the DOE. How does this
13 address any potential Turf Issues between the two
14 departments?

15 MARK RAMPERSANT: Great question.

16 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: I'm a former
17 educator, I know this very well.

18 MARK RAMPERSANT: So uhm I am not right
19 off hand, I am not too versed in the particular
20 language in the MOU and as stated by the Deputy
21 Chancellor, the MOU, the MOU while just about
22 finalized uhm will be released in the fall. As it
23 relates to that particular question I know that there
24 was lots of conversations between the two agencies to
25 ensure that there is in fact a balance when it comes

3 to supporting educators and supporting young people
4 in schools.

5 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: But you are not
6 clear on what that language is.

7 MARK RAMPERSANT: I'm not clear on the
8 specific language but there was, there was great
9 though uhm, uhm put in to ensuring that there is in
10 fact a balance. Uhm it's not a one sided
11 conversation and it supports the principals position
12 as well as ensures the safety and well-being of the
13 young person.

14 LASHAWN ROBINSON: Yes it also ensures
15 that uhm school staff members at the forefront of
16 issues such as classroom management, student
17 engagement, ensuring that our students are inten...
18 attending school in a safe supportive school
19 environment and School Safety Agents are at the
20 forefront of any criminal activity that may occur and
21 our safety protocols as well in partnership with the
22 DOE. So school staff members, New York City
23 Department of Educations are primarily there to
24 support young people so that they can thrive in our
25 school communities and excel academically and in
regards to the MOU that's what it speaks to if you

3 are referencing letter of referral. Uhm if you are,
4 I'm not clear on the Turf War that you are
5 describing, I do apologize. Uhm for that.

6 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: I can give you an
7 example.

8 LASHAWN ROBINSON: Okay.

9 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Example, I, I have a
10 few.

11 LASHAWN ROBINSON: Thank you.

12 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: There have been times
13 in the past in some high schools that dismissals are
14 an issue in the community. The person in ch... the AP
15 of Security would ask the School Safety Agents if
16 they can go outside and assist with dismissal,
17 particularly by train stations and make sure students
18 you know get home safety.

19 LASHAWN ROBINSON: Yeah.

20 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: And sometimes there
21 would be disagreements or arguments about who do
22 they, who do they answer to. If they were not asked
23 by the NYPD supervisor to do that then they might not
24 do that. The AP of Security would then feel
25 powerless. How is this, how is this being addressed?

3 RUBEN BELTRAN: So in terms of, of uhm,
4 you gave a specific example so I'll just respond to
5 that. Any type of, the NYPD does a lot of work not
6 just with School Safety but with Transit Division and
7 with the local precincts to ensure that we know where
8 the, where the risks are for our students going to
9 and from, to and from school and to provide the
10 appropriate coverage uhm, uhm along those paths, uhm
11 safe corridors we call them and and in many of the
12 schools the School Safety Agents are a part of that
13 and they are part of that Safe Corridor Plan and we
14 will go off the school grounds to those transit hubs
15 to ensure that that they arrive there safety so under
16 that particular example, I don't know if that is one
17 of our Safe Corridors. I don't know, it may have
18 been at the School Safety Agent had a different
19 assignment and was, was working on something else but
20 any issues like that are raised up right now to
21 Borough Safety Directors uhm brought up to OSYD and
22 also they come to the chain to me so that's something
23 that we can resolve.

24 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Right.

25 RUBEN BELTRAN: So that's something that
we resolve, I think we can resolve at the school

3 level and if not resolve at the school level we have
4 other opportunities to resolve those issues.

5 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Chief, my over
6 arching concern here.

7 RUBEN BELTRAN: Uh-huh.

8 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Is that if we don't
9 have healthy functioning relationships at the school
10 based level between School Safety Agents and school
11 staff how are we going to expect healthy
12 relationships school wide and that has been an issue.
13 And if there is a conflict that School Safety Agents
14 encounter I think that there is an obligation on
15 their part to first and foremost make sure that the
16 students are provided critical social support
17 immediately. The instinct should not be to summons
18 or arrest or to, to find punitive measures. The
19 instinct, how can I help? How can I get diffuse
20 this? How can I make sure this doesn't happen again?
21 And yes, I'm well aware of some of the anti-bullying
22 measures, some of it, some bills were mine.

23 LASHAWN ROBINSON: Thank you.

24 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: I appreciate that.
25 But we need to increase our supportive staff to
effectively follow up on these cases. Yes we want

3 them reported. We also need to follow up on them.

4 Just so you know it's the same thing my, the chair of

5 the housing committee. Yes when folks register a

6 complaint my Chair yes that's good but we want the

7 repairs to be made. Same thing in our school system,

8 we need these cases to be followed up on effectively

9 and not punitively. Uhm with regards to the, uhm in

10 the Transit Regulations there is a School Safety

11 Committee. Uhm Deputy Chancellor can you again

12 repeat for us who, who are the members of the School

13 Safety Committee?

14 LASHAWN ROBINSON: You have the principal

15 that's a member, the PTA President that's a member.

16 You have representatives from uhm CSA that also

17 participates uhm and UFT that participates as part of

18 the team. You also have students where

19 appropriately, mostly in high schools, you have

20 students participating as part of the School Safety

21 Team uhm School Safety NYPD and FDNY are also members

22 of School Safety Teams.

23 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Right and so you,

24 you don't know if a licensed social worker guidance

25 counselor is a member of these committees?

3 LASHAWN ROBINSON: You can have so this
4 is not uhm exhaustive in terms of these are the only
5 members, uhm as a principal, my school social worker
6 was a member of the School Safety Team along with my
7 School Counselor, also a member of the School Safety
8 Team of which I committed to having both a counselor
9 and a social worker in a school of 250 students in
10 Brownsville, Brooklyn.

11 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: And I applaud you.
12 That's the type of leadership that I, I really praise
13 and I thank you for that. Uhm because I just want,
14 some of my colleagues have a lot of questions about
15 making sure the schools have up-to-date or effective
16 evacuation plans on this. I just want to know for my
17 colleagues, many of our schools are still not fully
18 accessible and I am still concerned about how to make
19 sure that all kids are safe, all kids are having
20 their needs addressed and accommodated so that's
21 still a concern. The last question I will turn it
22 over now to my colleagues and I actually do mean this
23 is not the last question because I know my co-chair
24 had additional questions, uhm it is my understanding,
25 I just want to just have this clarified for the
record, it is my understanding that the current MOU

3 between NYPD and DOE has the DOE paying the NYPD \$380
4 million for School Safety Agents, is that correct?

5 RUBEN BELTRAN: I don't know the number,
6 I know that there is reimbursement for the School
7 Safety Agents cost but I don't know what that number
8 is, does anyone have that number?

9 RAMON GARCIA: So we will get the exact
10 number for you but the Department of Education does
11 not pay for school safety, it is a pass through to
12 the police department so yeah, it's not a DOE
13 budgeted.

14 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: So I just wanted to
15 have that to be clarified, so the DOE from it's
16 budget does not pay for NYPD agents in your schools,
17 is that correct?

18 LASHAWN ROBINSON: No it's a pass
19 through.

20 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: It's a pass through.
21 Can you just quickly explain what a pass through
22 means?

23 LASHAWN ROBINSON: The funding is
24 transferred over to NYPD and NYPD pays School Safety
25 Agents.

3 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: But is \$380... but is
4 this number accounted for in the DOE Budget?

5 LASHAWN ROBINSON: I would have to get
6 the exact number for you and the details uhm more so
7 so I can get that back to you.

8 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Cause I just want to
9 point out that many of our, the majority of our
10 schools are still not at 100% receiving their Fair
11 Student Funding, still have critical needs that have
12 to be addressed. I know that the Mayor of New York
13 stopped a practice where NYCHA had to pay for
14 officers, I believe that this was initially where
15 education dollars should be spent for education and
16 learning and supporting kids and the NYPD certainly
17 has a sizeable budget as well and so I just want to
18 get crystal clear clarity on that but in the interest
19 of time I will turn it over now to my colleagues.

20 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: You can be after
21 that. I'm going to uhm, we are joined by (INAUDIBLE)
22 Salamanca and Lander, as well. I will go to Council
23 Member Vallone and if you could gather the answer to
24 that question in the meantime.

25 RAMON GARCIA: Oh okay, sure.

3 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Council Member

4 Barron followed by Vallone.

5 INEZ BARRON: Thank you to the chairs and
6 thank you to my colleague Council Member Vallone.

7 Thank you to the panel for coming. We are glad that
8 you are here. This is a critical topic. I do want to
9 for full disclosure say that Deputy Chancellor

10 Robinson is a family member and I am very pleased and
11 proud of the work that she is doing, yes. No, no,

12 listen we still have to do our job. You just put it
13 on the record and you can go ahead and do your job.

14 LASHAWN ROBINSON: Absolutely and I
15 appreciate being held accountable.

16 INEZ BARRON: That's right, that's right.

17 Uhm in terms of the School Safety Plan, when I was a
18 principal that was tentative, it was critical, every

19 principal in the District knew you better have your

20 School Safety Plan done so I would be shocked if

21 there were even one school that did not have their

22 School Safety Plan submitted and the district at that

23 time gave lots of support to make sure that all of

24 the issues and all of the check points were addressed

25 and included in that School Safety Plan. I was a

principal of a school that had about 700 children

3 from kindergarten through grade 6. We did not have a
4 guidance counselor. At that point your allocations
5 came through the district so it wasn't a matter of
6 the principal of the school doing that, it came
7 through the district and even though I had 700
8 children, even though we were a school in need of
9 improvement, even though we served the population of
10 children that have many of the critical needs that we
11 talk about I was not allocated a guidance counselor
12 and I think that when we talk about guidance
13 counselors, it's not just one per building, based on
14 the needs of the population you may need more than
15 one guidance counselor in a building. In terms of
16 the MOU, I just wanted to say that I hope that it,
17 there are provisions in that MOU with a police
18 department that allow the principal to be able to say
19 to an officer in those issues that are with the
20 officer has discretion. I would hope that the
21 principal would be able to say to the officer I can
22 handle this. I can take care of this and that the
23 officer would recognize okay this is something that I
24 don't need to address and I'm not even talking about
25 a warning card, because I know that there are
instances where principals in the past have

3 intervened in a situation and where I think the
4 principal wound up getting arrested because they were
5 interfering with an arrest that an officer was trying
6 to make. I think that officers should respect the
7 fact that as educators looking at the whole child, a
8 principal may know if there is a particular situation
9 or there is a particular circumstance or this is a
10 particular day when I know I can intervene and help
11 this child and not put the child in the system. Will
12 that be something that the MOU will address?

13 LASHAWN ROBINSON: The MOU prioritizes, I
14 don't want to get into the details of the MOU, uhm I
15 do want to say that currently if there is a situation
16 within the school community and there is discretion
17 and my experience being a principal and a
18 superintendent oftentimes the principal is able to
19 say we will take care of this matter at the school
20 level and that's honored and respected. I also have
21 been on the side as a principal where I was
22 preventing or working to prevent the arrest of a
23 student and was told principal you will be arrested
24 if you do not allow this arrest to take place.

25 INEZ BARRON: Right. Right.

3 LASHAWN ROBINSON: So I do see the
4 balance but I have uhm been successful in working
5 collaborative with my School Safety Agents in a
6 School community and as a Superintendant of citywide
7 transfer schools where we see a lot of these
8 incidents occur when there is discretions, NYPD and
9 school safety have allowed principal decision making
10 and school supports to prevail in those situations.

11 INEZ BARRON: And just uhm two more
12 points. What's the youngest age of a child who's
13 been arrested in school?

14 RUBEN BELTRAN: I don't have that
15 information but I will check and I haven't seen
16 anything really out either since I've been there in
17 the past month. I review every arrest and
18 apprehension.

19 INEZ BARRON: So what would a 7-year-old
20 have to do that would cause a 7-year-old.

21 RUBEN BELTRAN: I have not seen a 7-year-
22 old uhm uhm arrested.

23 INEZ BARRON: 8-year-old.

24 RUBEN BELTRAN: Or anything but I have
25 not seen that but.

INEZ BARRON: 9-year-old.

3 RUBEN BELTRAN: I'm going to get back to
4 you on that. Yeah I mean that.

5 INEZ BARRON: My point is that these are
6 children.

7 RUBEN BELTRAN: Uh-huh.

8 INEZ BARRON: And I think that there
9 needs to be some further kinds of steps that can take
10 place before a child, 6, 7, 8, 9. I think I have a
11 bill that's talking about not under the age of 10 at
12 least.

13 RUBEN BELTRAN: Understood and they are
14 not treated as criminals. Those are usually like
15 they are called JD, juvenile reports so that usually
16 it's, very, very, mild.

17 INEZ BARRON: But they are arrested
18 right?

19 RUBEN BELTRAN: No.

20 INEZ BARRON: Okay then when I was a
21 principal back I think it was 2004, a parent came in
22 made a complaint to me that a 5th grader, a 10-year-
23 old had taken her child's candy money the day before
24 at the store and she wanted that child arrested. I
25 said mom we will call the other mom, we will talk
about it. She took out her phone and called 9-1-1

3 and insisted that a police officer come to the
4 school, he came, and he arrested that 10-year-old
5 child for taking a child's candy money the day before
6 at a local candy store.

7 RUBEN BELTRAN: Uhm, like I said I can
8 tell you from what I've seen and the reports that
9 I've reviewed and I haven't seen anything like that
10 so but, but I will take a look at it.

11 MARK RAMPERSANT: Council, you know DOE
12 shares your extreme concern and we must say that we
13 have committed to the mental health supports of our
14 young people. We have trained over 5,000 DOE
15 employees in de-escalation techniques and also
16 partnered with New York City Thrive in three training
17 different mechanisms for DOE employees to address a
18 5-step youth mental health plan to have a, we have a
19 Making Partners in Education Mental Health Plan and
20 additional at risk training that is on line in which
21 we've trained over 2,000 DOE employees in that as
22 well. So your concern falls in line with our
23 concerns and our priorities in which the mental
24 health services of our children are first and
25 foremost and we provide our DOE employees with the

3 skills to meet those needs rather than handing them
4 over to your point to the NYPD.

5 INEZ BARRON: Fine and I think that
6 that's great that the training takes place but I
7 think we need the trained professional, the guidance
8 counselor, the social worker assigned to the school
9 to make sure that it's done professionally and the
10 full training.

11 MARK RAMPERSANT: Absolutely.

12 INEZ BARRON: Thank you.

13 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Thank you and
14 now I'm going to go to Paul Vallone.

15 PAUL VALLONE: Thank you chairs, thank
16 you to the panel, thank you everyone to staying, it's
17 almost 20 til 4 because there are other panels that
18 want to speak. Clearly the passion for our children
19 is evident today and we are all bringing different
20 aspects to that and you can see Chair Treyger and
21 Chair Richards and their focuses and each Council
22 Member brings their lifelong experiences, you're a
23 principal, your experiences as a principal, the NYPD
24 and the DOE. The purpose of the hearing and the
25 legislation was to look at it in total and it's
impossible to do that. We could have a whole

3 separate hearing on what Chair Richards is talking
4 about, a whole separate hearing which we basically
5 have, what everyone was speaking about, especially
6 with Chair Treyger. It is very important to talk
7 about the social impact and the, the support to the
8 students. My view is provide all our kids. When I
9 look at our budget and I look at our plan, is there
10 is anything we got to cut it's never going to be
11 here. If Chair Treyger wants the social workers and
12 the guidance counselors and the network to be there
13 for the students they should be there. If Chair
14 Richards is looking at a better network of how the
15 NYPD and the DOE should police and protect within the
16 school and the policy that should happen. This part
17 of the hearing of what we were talking about in the
18 beginning and in my opening was getting parody to
19 every school, to make sure as a principal, as a
20 teacher, as an officer that each school has what they
21 need so there can be a learning environment for our
22 students. So Deputy Chancellor I congratulate you on
23 your appointment, uhm Deputy Robinson and I was so
24 relieved when I heard your past background because
25 it's through the principals and the teachers and the
parents that we learn. You know, I, that's where I

3 spend all of my time and I've been in every one of my
4 schools and I probably get criticized because I'm in
5 my schools too much private and public. But it's
6 through their conversations that lead to today's
7 hearing and part of the danger of the conversations
8 is no one really wants to talk about what's missing
9 they don't want to alert parents and kids that maybe
10 they need something in the school but they don't want
11 to alert folks that something is missing. So we have
12 to take a larger approach as to be the support
13 provider for the schools to make sure they have that,
14 so I didn't hear today from the NYPD that we are
15 going to do more. I heard from the NYPD today that
16 it seems like you are quite content on what we are
17 doing. I have an issue with that. Because I am in
18 every school in my neighborhood, they need help. We
19 had an incident in a local school where clearly
20 defined the lack of communication from the local
21 precinct to the borough to the larger NYPD in charge.
22 The parents had idea. The teachers had no working
23 intercom system. The principals wasn't allow to lock
24 the doors. There was no surveillance system in the
25 school. All of that contradicts everything that we
just talked about so what am I suppose to do as the

3 Council Member, what are we supposed to do as the
4 Council Members for the district. I have a district
5 where 60% of the schools have no surveillance
6 systems. We have a city that has 1/3 of the schools
7 that have no surveillance systems. If the Deputy
8 Chancellor says, which is wonderful, we have over
9 1100 schools now with brand new protocol digital
10 video surveillance systems but we are still not at
11 100%. We have 90% with door alarms but if you talk
12 to the principals they can't even hear the door
13 alarms. Bayside high school in mind has 4,000 kids,
14 it's a city. The door alarm is nowhere near where
15 the principal is so I just as examples as we can
16 relook what we have in place and how do we make it
17 better. Should the door alarm be connected to the
18 surveillance system? Should there be a surveillance
19 system? Should there be additional Safety Agents?
20 Should they have another crossing guard. All of that
21 is what the task force is about and that's why I
22 think today is just the tip of the iceberg and I
23 think we are just going to have each one of us is going
24 to speak about our passion, what we think should be
25 done. The task force, and I'm proud the DOE said
that they support it is really to look at that but I

3 didn't hear NYPD say if they support going forward of
4 the task force. I just want to hear what your
5 thoughts are on some of the legislation that's here
6 for today.

7 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: All, all 13
8 bills that, that was the question that you were going
9 to get to.

10 RAMON GARCIA: So yeah Council Member I
11 mean I'm going to call out the police commissioner
12 here and I hope I do it right, otherwise I'm going to
13 lose my job.

14 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: He's watching.

15 RAMON GARCIA: So yeah I mean he said a
16 number of times on the whole host of areas that in,
17 in some areas we are very good, in other areas we are
18 the best but in all areas we can do better so I.

19 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: I think that's
20 across the board, we can all do better in everything
21 that we do.

22 RAMON GARCIA: Right, exactly and that's
23 why I don't want you to have a takeaway after this
24 hearing that we are somehow content, we are content
25 with the status quo. Of course we could always do

3 better and that's why we work with our partners at
4 DOE doing better. That's why ...

5 PAUL VALLONE: That's not going to
6 happen. That's why we have annual reviews of School
7 Safety Plans. That's why when they do reviews for
8 better surveillance for alarms for, for panic
9 buttons. All of those things of course need to be
10 looked at and of course we could do better and look
11 for opportunities where we could even improve on the
12 status quo and leverage technologies that we may not
13 even know about to, to better secure our kids.
14 That's always the.

15 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So is that a
16 yes.

17 PAUL VALLONE: Yeah you are good. Thank
18 you we support the le.. we start with that point and
19 then we can move forward. In the NYPDs view, a
20 school, should every school have a surveillance
21 system? Just right off the top.

22 RUBEN BELTRAN: We, we support uhm having
23 surveillance systems and cameras in schools. We
24 believe that it makes those schools safer and it
25 makes people in those schools safer. And for the
DOE, I every principal I have ever met and every

3 teacher will advocate 100% for their school and I
4 think that's what our job is to make sure that each
5 principal has those resources. Some principals don't
6 have that, right so can, can we agree that
7 prioritizing schools that don't have some of the very
8 basics like the door locks or surveillance system can
9 be made a prior or the SCA upcoming budget and going
10 forward. I think until we get to the point where we
11 have 100% surveillance systems we can't even have a
12 conversation on whether anything else is happening
13 because we still haven't got to point one yet. I
14 can't even put in a surveillance system in some of
15 the schools because I don't have an electrical system
16 that can support it. So there is a whole slew of
17 things that have to happen before we get there but we
18 try our best but for the DOE, the DOE's view we are
19 trying to get to 100% surveillance systems, are we
20 not?

21 LASHAWN ROBINSON: I, we certainly, we
22 want safety uhm to always be our first priority and I
23 agree with your opening when you spoke about safety
24 being comprehensive and ensuring that we have you
25 know the technology in place to support safety but

3 also our strong protocols in place because we
4 recognize, excuse me, sorry.

5 PAUL VALLONE: And I agree with you but I
6 think there, I think they are separate in their
7 approach. I think first we have to get the schools
8 the basics and that would be the surveillance and
9 then the protocols and the plans that follow would be
10 first at a School Safety Agent and a principal
11 actually have eyes in their schools, they can see the
12 doors, they can see that we have a working intercom
13 system. I have schools that do not have working
14 intercom systems. The teachers have no idea what the
15 soft lock down, the hard lock down, if there is any
16 kind of lock down going on. The kids are texting
17 faster to the parents than the teachers get the
18 information. So that's the level of even though it
19 sounds good when we roll out the facts on the NYPD
20 side, we have 100%, we want to go there but the
21 reality is, we're not, we are not there so it's what
22 we do next is what's going to define us as a city on
23 how we prepare for that cause I don't even want to be
24 on someone's 6 o'clock news saying geez we should
25 have done that. And I and I think, think that, other
than that that's was where my heart was where today.

3 Everything else that we talk about is, is, is
4 wonderful and needs to be done but I think I honestly
5 and I think it's not. I have not been able to sleep
6 since that mom came up to me and said is my child
7 safe? And I couldn't give her an answer because I
8 have kids in the system. I, I,...

9 LASHAWN ROBINSON: I absolutely agree we
10 take safety seriously.

11 PAUL VALLONE: It was just such a
12 traumatic moment and I think that's why the rallying
13 call and here is.

14 LASHAWN ROBINSON: Uh-huh.

15 PAUL VALLONE: And here is for the NYPD
16 here is a perfect example. I will give you something
17 that could work that one of the precincts look, as we
18 roll out the new NCO program wouldn't it be a great
19 idea to get the NCO officers in to every school to
20 review the School Safety Plan, to meet the principal,
21 see who the PTA President is, see who the CEC
22 President is, see where the INGRESS and EGRESS is and
23 start fresh and they love, the precincts going out to
24 every school and it started this whole new, which is
25 dynamic of policing but not policing, community
approach in to the schools, being aware of who is

3 there. That's, that's what I want the task force and
4 for us to kind of explore is to those two, those type
5 of approaches where kids see that wonderful
6 relationship between DOE, NYPD and teachers to go
7 forward. I, I would use that type and you had
8 mentioned that the, the Alert Program is the school
9 safety arm that actually does the review of the
10 School Safety Plans.

11 RUBEN BELTRAN: We have uhm, we have a
12 subunit within our School Safety Division uhm that's
13 overseen by our Thread Assessment Groups so.

14 PAUL VALLONE: So who actually reviews
15 the School Safety Plan?

16 RUBEN BELTRAN: I review them. My, my, my
17 people.

18 PAUL VALLONE: How many is it their job?

19 RUBEN BELTRAN: Uhm doing that particular
20 task? Uhm uhm I think I do have, I think it's, I
21 think it might be too. I've, I'll get back with
22 another one, I'm not sure.

23 PAUL VALLONE: I heard a scary number,
24 because I heard you say six.

25 RUBEN BELTRAN: Yeah.

3 PAUL VALLONE: And I heard six and we've
4 got, a hell of a lot more schools than six. So if we
5 are supposed to get them all reviewed and approved by
6 November how does six staff handle the City of New
7 York is never going to happen.

8 RUBEN BELTRAN: We have an Operations
9 Unit that's more expansive than those six and when
10 those, when it comes time for School Safety Plans
11 it's got a more hands on deck, we have the operations
12 group itself involved with the Review Process for
13 those plans but I'll get back with the exact numbers
14 are in terms of who is working on those plans.

15 PAUL VALLONE: And just so we can
16 understand, we are talking about our schools, are we
17 talking for the DOE. Are we talking about a plan
18 that is inclusive of our private and religious
19 schools?

20 RUBEN BELTRAN: Correct, we don't, we
21 don't review or approve School Safety Plans for
22 private and uhm religious schools?

23 PAUL VALLONE: Uhm I have a problem with
24 that. I think every child deserves a basic help and
25 every child, a parent's choice of where they go to
school if there, if something happens in that school,

3 are we going to say as a city, "sorry we don't really
4 have an eye on what's happening in the DNE, Greek
5 Orthodox Church or in Rabbi's Kabad or My St. Andrew
6 Evelino", how could we just not provide those basic
7 assistance, what about our Shooter Preparation? Are
8 they not invited?

9 RUBEN BELTRAN: Absolutely we do, I had,
10 we had to, the Council had to ask for that to happen
11 and you immediately did it which is wonderful but it
12 wasn't provided.

13 LASHAWN ROBINSON: But we also provide
14 planning.

15 PAUL VALLONE: So there is, there is so
16 many levels of new things we need to look at. So
17 there are, there's so many levels of new things we
18 need to look at. There's so many kids that are in
19 these schools that, what do we tell those parents?

20 MARK RAMPERSANT: So we absolutely do
21 share our Emergency Protocols with private, parochial
22 as well as non-public schools as well as colleges uh
23 as it relates to their overall Safety Plan. We don't
24 have the jurisdiction to force them to put uhm to put
25 uhm measures in place. We, we are stripped as it
relates to the areas that are covered in the Safety

3 Plan and to an earlier point uhm that you made in
4 regards to their being a minimum number on the police
5 departments end that does the final review of the
6 Safety Plans, one of the things that I would like to
7 clarify about the plan is unless something about the
8 school change the next year they are prepopulated
9 areas that don't change, right, so we know that the
10 enrollment number has changed. The number of
11 stairwells, the number of elevates, EGRESS points
12 those areas are all still the same from the following
13 year. So those, that report will be populated and
14 blocked out for that school. The school will only
15 need to.

16 PAUL VALLONE: Whose respon...

17 MARK RAMPERSANT: I'm sorry?

18 PAUL VALLONE: Whose responsible for
19 making sure that that has been done?

20 MARK RAMPERSANT: Through my office, our
21 data unit does, ensures that right so when we
22 release, when we open the plan.

23 PAUL VALLONE: And that's based on the
24 quarterly meetings of the community, the community in
25 place at that school, the parents, the teachers to

3 have their quarterly meetings to prepare something
4 for you to review?

5 MARK RAMPERSANT: Yes. That is the.

6 PAUL VALLONE: Are you confident that
7 those meetings are happening on a quarterly basis.

8 MARK RAMPERSANT: That's the Safety
9 Committee Meeting, at the beginning of the year.
10 That's monthly.

11 PAUL VALLONE: You believe the Committee
12 Hearing happening quarterly?

13 MARK RAMPERSANT: That's mon...

14 LASHAWN ROBINSON: I, I have Safety uhm
15 Meetings monthly.

16 PAUL VALLONE: I have no doubt that you.
17 I have. You were the first one to tell us.

18 LASHAWN ROBINSON: And I, I, trust my
19 colleague that they prioritize safety in our schools
20 as well. So there are reporting mechanisms in place
21 also where school leaders must.

22 PAUL VALLONE: And I think that what we
23 should do is take a look at that and make sure the
24 parents, the parents are aware because what happens,
25 is the parents never even get to, their busy
schedules they are both working so there has to be

3 some type of coordination of that information so we
4 do have some type of incident, even if it is minor.

5 LASHAWN ROBINSON: And minutes are
6 uploaded also from the Safety Meetings.

7 PAUL VALLONE: And so I think the.

8 LASHAWN ROBINSON: Uhm an accountability
9 check in place as well.

10 MARK RAMPERSANT: And to your previous
11 question regarding private and parochial schools uhm
12 they work directly with the state but they use our
13 shell for the, for their Safety Plan.

14 PAUL VALLONE: And I think that's,
15 perfect, at least some way at least to get a basic
16 guideline which is important. But I think we do
17 remiss in saying in saying that they have the same
18 level so uhm I know the Council even afford to put a
19 School Safety Agent in some of the schools and I
20 believe the NYPD said if somebody asks they will
21 produce it and that has always been helpful but.

22 RUBEN BETRAN: Right Council Members,
23 that's what I wanted to add, I'm sorry to interrupt
24 you but on Counter Terrorism Unit does do threat
25 assessments upon request, also by my, my, my non-
public schools and we have also helped him with the

3 the development of Safety Plans also when they are
4 requested. So.

5 PAUL VALLONE: And I'll, I'll kind of
6 wrap up by saying I don't believe we should pull any
7 resource from one area to another to fix. It's like
8 fixing a sinking ship and say okay we are going to
9 put this here and put that there. I think we should
10 take what works, support the areas that don't work so
11 as Chair Treyger said if we are missing critical
12 resources in our schools that need to be put there,
13 we should put there them but what I'm saying is just
14 don't take them away from anything that we also need
15 at the same point, what works? What's made to work
16 better? This Task Force is not, certainly not the
17 first, there is already an existing Task Force but
18 because there is so many avenues in this great city
19 of where we get prioritized on any given day
20 sometimes we forget about School Safety in the
21 channel in a basic form so to look at it, to be
22 proactive, to hope that never have to deal with
23 anything that is happening in the country but that is
24 not unrealistic so I want to be able to say we did do
25 all of that and was at least trying to get to all of
that and we do have 100% so then also we have

3 reviewed and we are working with the private schools
4 and we are working to upgrade so if the communication
5 system is not working in a school, we can't go back
6 to a parent afterward and say why wasn't that
7 intercom system working, can't, you can't, and until
8 we get to that point, that's what their focus is, so
9 I thank the chairs for that and I look forward to the
10 other panels that are coming up. Thank you.

11 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Thank you we are
12 going to go to Council Member Dromm followed by
13 Council Member Alicka Ampry-Samuel.

14 DANIEL DROMM: Thank you, thank you very
15 much, I do want to say I agree with Council Member
16 Barron that in my school uhm we always had the School
17 Safety Committee Meetings. It was done, religiously
18 once a month and I was the chapter leader so I am
19 very aware of that. I just want to point out before
20 I get to the question that uhm you know I think that
21 uhm one of the questions that I have a Council Member
22 and other Council Members have as well is the ratio
23 between School Safety Agents and guidance counselors
24 and if you are talking about having 5,000 School
25 Safety Agents versus 3,000 guidance counselors, one
has to wonder where the priority is within the

3 Department of Education and of course I would like to
4 ask Deputy Chancellor Robinson to look at that and
5 reevaluate that as well. Uhm I think another issue
6 that has come up as I have sat through the hearing is
7 the workload of the guidance counselors as well which
8 I think uhm stands at this point at about 500 to 1 in
9 the best circumstances and perhaps 1000 to 1 in other
10 circumstances. And one area that I always found
11 which was lacking in the schools was uhm the number
12 of bilingual guidance counselors that we needed to
13 have and I think that that still remains a shortage
14 area in the schools but what I really wanted to talk
15 uhm was that I don't think that we've had a student
16 killed in the New York City School System in the last
17 20 years except for the incident that happened in the
18 school the Wildlife Conservation School up in the
19 Bronx and that incident was based on, allegedly based
20 on anti-LGBT, anti-gay, biased bullying that happened
21 in that school so one of my biggest concerns when I
22 was chair of the Education Committee was how are we
23 making our schools safer for our LGBT students and
24 uhm I think I heard in Chief Beltran's testimony, the
25 LGBT word but we haven't heard it at all throughout
the rest of the hearing. I hate to always be the one

3 to be the gay guy and bring it up again you know and
4 there he goes but it's so important and I think so
5 much of the bullying that does go in the schools is
6 based on anti-LGBT discrimination. I see Jarrod is
7 here. Right. Strides have been made. Uhm I guess
8 and I know \$1 million has been put into the budget so
9 but has that money gotten out, can you tell me what's
10 going on, uhm and then also I have another question.
11 The last two weeks of August I believe, training was
12 done in Culture Responsive Education and uhm I think
13 it, when the first, when the Chancellor first visited
14 on the first day I think there was mention briefly of
15 the LGBT words but after that I heard from teachers
16 that it was not included in the Culture Responsive
17 Education stuff. So I would really ask you to look
18 at that because it really needs to be mentioned in
19 every instance of, of training and I think they are
20 overlooking that again and it causes me concern. So
21 can you address those issues that I brought up?

22 KENYATTA REED: Uhm so thank you Council
23 Member Dromm. Uhm I thank you for your passion and
24 commitment to the young people of, of New York City
25 and also you putting the funding behind that
continuously. Uhm the points that you raise about

3 bullying are true and it's a horrible part of growing
4 up. One of the solutions to addressing bullying in
5 our schools, in our communities, and in our nation at
6 large is community building. We have to really get
7 to know each other and I say that because that's at
8 the core of our social, emotional, learning programs
9 in which we are teaching our young people self-
10 awareness, self-management, uhm social awareness,
11 relationship skills and responsible decision making.
12 Those are the five key components of our SCO
13 programs. In addition to that, prevention and
14 intervention which is a part of our restorative
15 programs again is about community building, if I know
16 you and I connect with you, then that is what reduces
17 bullying in our schools and our communities. When
18 you hear about the bullying that takes place, it's
19 because of refusal to get to know one another as
20 human beings. DOE is committed to that. I know
21 Council has been committed to that as well as we've
22 expanded that work. As far as work with GSAs, again
23 thank you for your leadership in that, uhm we have
24 over 228 clubs that are being funded and we are
25 starting phase two of that process and uhm opening up
to more schools so with that, with that funding, uhm

3 we are providing opportunities one to start new clubs
4 or support existing clubs that go beyond uhm not only
5 our gender and sexuality alliances but also for
6 immigrations, for students to establish clubs of our
7 immigration, race, LGBTQ, gender, uhm all of those in
8 which provide a safe haven for our young people, so
9 again I thank you and the Department of Ed, on, on
10 the part of the Department of Ed but more importantly
11 for our young people because each one of those things
12 that I've named provide the nurturing and Safe
13 Communities that our young people deserve and which
14 is what eliminates and addresses bullying. Lastly,
15 what we are doing, we've established a, a clear
16 access for community members to report bullying, one
17 as mentioned by the Deputy Chancellor is the phone
18 system, 718-935-2288 any parent can call, any child
19 can call, any community member can call and file a
20 bullying complaint. Every, 100% of all complaints
21 are logged in our system and investigated properly.
22 That also includes our online reporting mechanism as
23 well so we are encouraging our young people to come
24 out of the shadows and let us know so we can support
25 them.

3 DANIEL DROMM: Just as a follow up Deputy
4 Chancellor if you could just address the CRE
5 question, the Culture Responsive Education question?

6 LASHAWN ROBINSON: Yeah uhm, through our
7 work with the uhm, investment of \$23 million for the
8 anti-biased and biased work we look at address all
9 forms of bias in our system including bias against
10 LBGT communities as well uhm racial bias, gender
11 bias, so we are addressing all forms of bias and we
12 are also promoting culturally responsive practices
13 which builds upon the assets of young people in
14 communities as a way to address their concerns to
15 teach them, in our schools and making sure that our
16 teachers and school leaders bring a degree of
17 awareness in terms of who they are when they enter
18 the schools and acknowledging and celebrating our
19 young people for who they are in our school community
20 as well.

21 DANIEL DROMM: Deputy Chancellor I did
22 hear these complaints that in those two, in those
23 days of training in the end of August that the LGBT
24 word was only mentioned by the Chancellor once in
25 that training and the problem with LGBT bias and
bullying is that unless it is directly addressed and

3 the word lesbian/gay by sexual transgender, etc are
4 used it's not a clear message to those who are
5 receiving the training that LGBT folks are included
6 in that overall anti-biased, implicit biased training
7 and so it was disappointing for me to hear that
8 believe deeply in what the administration is doing
9 but since I have gotten that report back from some of
10 your own people was uhm very disappointing to me.

11 KENYATTA REED: Uhm I also want to add
12 that started in February we started our anti-
13 bullying, anti-biased online training which is very
14 specifically focused on our LGBTQ population. There's
15 a...

16 DANIEL DROMM: But Kenyatta what I'm
17 saying is that it shouldn't have to be separate, when
18 you are doing implicit biased it needs to be included
19 with the implicit bias and that's what didn't happen
20 at that training and I'm just saying if you could
21 look at as you move forward that would be very, very,
22 make me a very happen man.

23 LASHAWN ROBINSON: I absolutely well, and
24 through the work, the implicit biased work,
25 inequities are address through Student Identity
Development including gender and sexual orientation.

3 Upon initial view of the curriculum that is certainly
4 included and I will take a second look to find out
5 you know what happened in those last days of August.

6 DANIEL DROMM: I'll, I'll get you some of
7 the information that I was given as well as...

8 LASHAWN ROBINSON: I would appreciate
9 that.

10 RUBEN BELTRAN: And Councilman if I can
11 just, add on what I said on my opening remarks and
12 the testimony uhm in terms of LGBTQ and uhm and
13 bullying and uhm School Safety Division and DOE have
14 a joint response to work collaboratively to address
15 any of those complaints, I have a Community Outreach
16 Unit that specifically was out there and investigates
17 these complaints and, and we have uhm solutions,
18 presentations and uhm uhm, things that we can do
19 within that school to address those specific uhm, uhm
20 bullying type of events that are going on.

21 DANIEL DROMM: And I'm familiar with some
22 of the trainings that you did even when I was chair
23 of the committee in terms of the work that you are
24 doing of some pilot programs up in the Bronx uhm
25 which was very good which Commissioner Garcia have
been talking about. And actually in some ways the

3 NYPD and I don't mean this as a putdown has done a
4 better job on this than the DOE and that's why I
5 always put the DOE because unless it is spoken about,
6 teachers don't feel that they can deal with it and
7 they need that, they need to know that you have their
8 backs. Teachers and, and principals. Thank you.

9 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: She's been
10 patient.

11 ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: Good afternoon
12 everyone and I first want to say to Deputy Chancellor
13 Robinson I look forward to working with you in this
14 new capacity, congratulations.

15 LASHAWN ROBINSON: Thank you.

16 ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: Uhm especially in
17 our beloved Brownsville, Brooklyn, so I introduced
18 bill number 869A that speaks directly to a protocol
19 when a child is going through a mental health crisis.
20 And since we sat here I've heard a number of
21 initiatives that are in place, partnerships with
22 thrive, I've heard of the mental health, well the
23 school based mental health clinics, I've heard about
24 the crisis intervention and I've heard like just
25 countless programs but the reason why I introduced
this bill was because of a specific instance in my

3 district. In the spring, we had a young man in
4 middle school, in Brownsville who attempted suicide
5 in the bathroom and the principal came to my office,
6 the staff, the teachers came to the office. This
7 young man was sent to the hospital, subsequent to
8 being hospitalized, he was removed from his
9 biological family home through ACS, placed in a group
10 home and social services picked him up from the group
11 home every single day and dropped him in front of the
12 school every single day and when the young man
13 entered the building he was extremely depressed every
14 single day, they watched him decline. The teachers
15 were not able to be able to connect with him but at
16 the same time they were not able to connect to ACS,
17 they were not able to connect with DOHMH. They
18 weren't able to have a direct contact with thrive.
19 There was no direct contact with H&H and so the
20 principal of the school was so frustrated and we were
21 all frustrated because we couldn't figure out what
22 can we do to support this child. And support the
23 school staff and the other children who knew this
24 young man and saw that there was something wrong and
25 so I, again I sat here and I heard of all of these
amazing programs and initiatives but how does that

3 relate to this incident which is not just the only
4 incident, I spoke to my colleague Diana Ayala who had
5 the same situation happen in East Harlem uhm at the
6 same time, of 11-year-old girl and so all of the
7 programs and resources that you claim to have in
8 place, what is the direct impact on the community and
9 just use those examples that we have that we know of
10 and, and please explain to us how is it working on
11 the ground, how is it working in the schools, how is
12 it working for these children? And that's the reason
13 why I introduced 869A.

14 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So thank you for
15 sharing. I mean to be quite honest with you my heart
16 breaks when I hear that uhm, our young people are the
17 reason why we do what we do. We were educators. I
18 was a principal for a long time not only in Bedfast-
19 Iverson but also in Southeast Queens. Uhm we believe
20 that we understand that the children are why we do
21 this every day. The ways in which uhm some of the
22 programs that we have talked about as far as our
23 mental health services and the trainings, it's all
24 about training our teachers, our social workers, our
25 guidance counselors. One how to identify to your
point, identify when a child is in distress or in need

3 every day? Myself I'm sure Deputy Chancellor
4 Robinson and all the other principals out there, we
5 are at the door every day, we are at the door every
6 day looking every child in the face so the training
7 allows us uhm not only as administrators but teachers
8 on how to identify a child in need. Then from there,
9 and then how do we support that child. What is the
10 appropriate way that you support a child in need and
11 how do we refer them to the appropriate mental health
12 services so that's how partnership with Thrive and
13 making sure that we can connect them to community
14 organizations that provide the services that many
15 times that the schools cannot, can we do more.

16 ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: Is there any follow
17 up, because the school reached out to THRIVE and is
18 there some type of correlational follow up, the, uhm
19 the issue here was because it was a school they are
20 not being provided with information related to the
21 actual mental health care of this child and because
22 there is no, the child is no longer in the home, and
23 is now an ACS case there is no collaboration between
24 the parent being able to be consistent with whatever
25 care is needed for this child. So, what, what,
what's been happening is the city agencies are not

3 working together to really be a support and there,
4 there is some level of breakdown in the communication
5 so I just wanted you to speak to that level of
6 coordination.

7 LASHAWN ROBINSON: So uhm.

8 ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL: Because everyone is
9 doing amazing things separately.

10 LASHAWN ROBINSON: Yeah I I uhm I
11 absolutely hear your concern and uhm as Kenyatta
12 shared this is a very difficult uhm scenario for that
13 young person, the trauma that the young person faced,
14 for the family and for the school community and what
15 we've done uhm in the DOE was we reorganized and
16 restructured so that we can have all of the offices
17 together under one division that is responsible for
18 meeting the needs of the whole child so uhm within
19 our division we now have the office of safety and
20 youth development, we have the office of equity and
21 access, we have health and wellness. We have
22 counseling support programs, we have community
23 schools and we have touch points with our partners
24 and other agencies across the city including ACS so
25 that we can streamline our services and provide
better support to school communities. In addition to

3 reorganizing at our level across our division, we
4 also have more robust supports for schools through
5 the new Executive superintendent that lead the way at
6 the field support center level, directing supports
7 from youth development supports to teaching and
8 learning supports and ensuring that community
9 superintendants and principals have the resources
10 that they need to meet the needs of a school
11 community and students so some of the restructuring
12 can certainly support that principal and that school
13 community uhm in addition a priority for us this year
14 is to really develop our people. So while we know
15 that we have made some gains in this various
16 initiatives that we have, we know that we have to
17 continue to develop our people so that we can partner
18 with families in a way that is empowering and
19 supportive of our families and students so that is
20 some priorities that we have that will really ensure
21 robust supports at the school level in order to
22 address situations that you just raised uhm in this
23 meeting. Thank you.

24 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Thank you uhm
25 just thank you for your patience and just a segway
out of that for, for, for a minute, uhm can you speak

3 to how many referrals you had issued last year uhm to
4 EMS for students psychological and emotional
5 conditions?

6 KENYATTA REED: We don't have that here
7 but we can provide that.

8 LASHAWN ROBINSON: We do have that
9 information and we will provide that.

10 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Okay would you
11 say it's in the hundreds or where are we at?
12 Thousands?

13 LASHAWN ROBINSON: We will get it.

14 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Okay so if you
15 can provide us with that because that's also why we
16 push for more social workers and uhm just a few more
17 questions before we wrap out, wrap up. You spoke of
18 Counterterrorism Unit, how many people are in that
19 unit?

20 RUBEN BELTRAN: Uhm units. One captain,
21 one Sargeant, two detectives and two police officers.

22 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So about five
23 individuals are in that unit and they are tasked with
24 handling larger threats. Have there been any
25 imminent threats or?

3 RUBEN BELTRAN: Well they had all threats
4 really that are made are.

5 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So they handle
6 all threats?

7 RUBEN BELTRAN: That's correct.

8 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Okay uhm let's
9 speak about scanners for a second. So you spoke of
10 uhm of uhm is there a correlation between School
11 Safety and obviously the scanners, are you seeing
12 that, we scanners are placed at schools that the
13 school was safer? What's the, what would you say are
14 we really, is it really serving as a deterrent? And
15 especially if individuals are still being scanned as
16 you said when they came through a school building, a
17 School Safety tasked with some sort of scanning
18 measures, so what purpose is the scanner actually
19 playing? Is there a correlation between safety of
20 that campus and uhm and in the scanners?

21 RUBEN BELTRAN: The scanning, is, is, is
22 part of our program in terms of trying to reduce,
23 trying to reduce violence and keep the, the school
24 environment safe. So, so many of the schools that
25 had scanning now were selected because they were hit
incident sites, sites that had violent crimes uhm

3 reported or people arrested uhm for violent crimes so
4 what we do is uhm uhm on a regular basis.

5 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So even with the
6 scanners there there still is a high level of
7 incidents so.

8 RUBEN BELTRAN: It's, it's part of the,
9 there are some incidents and part of our review is to
10 look at what those incidents are. We just don't want
11 to look at, at weapons and dangerous instruments that
12 are recovered. Uhm because those are only going to be
13 reco... and to tell you the truth we have no weapons
14 or dangerous instruments recovered uhm uhm from
15 nonscanning schools than for scanning schools.

16 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Interesting.

17 RUBEN BELTRAN: Yeah, yeah, so the, so
18 the scanning really is just it's part of the program,
19 we reassess it and we are in the process of
20 reassessing it now to determine should existing
21 scanning schools uhm continue to remain full-time
22 scanning schools, should they be, should they be
23 changed, we are in the process of evaluating that and
24 we do that along with the DOE.

25 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So you said
there are more weapons can you just say that, repeat

3 that again, being confiscated from nonscanning
4 schools?

5 RUBEN BELTRAN: Right it's like 55% of our
6 total weapons are dangerous instruments, uhm, uhm
7 more than half, come from more or less being
8 reported. Someone tells a teacher that someone has a
9 knife or.

10 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So it's half and
11 half you are saying?

12 RUBEN BELTRAN: Right, right, but a
13 little bit more, a little bit more to the nonscanning
14 school side but there is more, there is more
15 nonscanning uhm schools than we have scanning
16 schools.

17 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Let me ask you
18 so, are there newer technologies that you are looking
19 at so I remember my experience going through scanning
20 at Jamaica High School, very dark and gloomy, I felt
21 like some days I was walking into a prison. Uhm so
22 are you looking at other technologies that are less
23 intrusive, uhm for instance even at Springfield High
24 School which is in my district when you walk in, I
25 mean and I just did a visit to Ricker's Island last
month and I could see why we are hearing from some

3 administrators and students certainly about how
4 perception of these entrances walking in to school
5 and going through scanning why, why it does feel like
6 it is leading to a school to prison pipeline. So
7 have we given much more thought to you know newer
8 technologies, I'm sure that out there and also
9 brightening entrances to schools as well and I don't
10 think that metal detectors are necessary the answer
11 because anything could happen outside of school walls
12 as well even though we are fighting to prevent you
13 know things from happening you know in, inside so I
14 understand that it has to be multiple strategies
15 around this.

16 RUBEN BELTRAN: So in terms of terms of
17 the department, NYPD, I've been with the department
18 32 years, they've always strived to always improve
19 what we are doing so likewise in school safety, uhm,
20 uhm one of the things that I have already looked at
21 in my short time there is looking at what
22 technologies we are currently using and what's
23 available so that's what, we are always evaluating
24 that uhm but that's going to be a special focus of
25 mine. I've worked for 12 years as a, as a commanding
officer and an executive officer of information

3 technology for NYPD so I have a lot of ideas but I
4 want to get some ideas from my team and see what they
5 are working on and uhm and investigate other new
6 opportunities for technology and of course we will do
7 that working with DOE in terms of, of doing new
8 things and evaluating them and also if it's, if it's
9 going to be something that's going to be different
10 from the experiments in the school, we will share
11 that with the school community.

12 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: And what
13 percentage and I'm sorry, just go through how many
14 schools have metal detectors, how many don't and how
15 many are?

16 RUBEN BELTRAN: Right now there's 86
17 total schools with metal detection equipment and then
18 we have mobile uhm mobile weapon detection equipment
19 that's deployed for two unannounced scanning uh at
20 different schools every day.

21 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So only 86
22 schools out of.

23 RUBEN BELTRAN: Correct.

24 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Out of, how many
25 have scanning.

3 RUBEN BELTRAN: It's around, I think it's
4 around 6% of the sites. Uh-huh out of 1800 schools,
5 1400 sites. Correct.

6 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Out of 1400, so
7 86 sites have permanent scanning.

8 RUBEN BELTRAN: Right.

9 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Out of 1400
10 schools.

11 RUBEN BELTRAN: About 80 full time, six
12 are random or parttime.

13 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So I think it
14 also and I know there has to be this delicate balance
15 but it also shows that there is no direct correlation
16 almost, right because if you don't have scanning,
17 permanent scanning at close to over 1300 schools then
18 uhm you now I'm not saying what the correlation
19 really is, how are we making schools safer? Uhm is
20 it really serving a purpose?

21 RUBEN BELTRAN: But the biggest
22 consideration is.

23 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: How did you
24 select the schools that?
25

3 RUBEN BELTRAN: They are selected by
4 violent incidents that are occurring at the school so
5 that is part of the continuing assessment.

6 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So Springfield
7 High School how many violent incidents have they had?
8 And, and and how do you base that? Is that per
9 school year, is it a decade, is it. I could
10 understand maybe 15 years ago there were a lot of
11 incidents at that school.

12 RUBEN BELTRAN: We evaluate that monthly
13 uhm or daily or, we are looking at that.

14 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Are you
15 positive?

16 RUBEN BELTRAN: We are looking at that
17 and we are doing it monthly and I know that I've been
18 doing it since I've been there in the last month.

19 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So have you gone
20 back, so those 86 schools you've gone back and
21 reevaluated the amount of incidents at those schools
22 currently.

23 RUBEN BELTRAN: Correct.

24 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So you are
25 telling me Springfield High School has a high amount
of violent incidents right now?

3 RUBEN BELTRAN: Well, if you will give me
4 a second to check.

5 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Okay I probably
6 know the answer to that question. I do know the
7 answer to that question. And you also spoke of
8 principals being able to request scanners or and is
9 there is a process for them if they want to remove
10 them as well?

11 RUBEN BELTRAN: We have scanning
12 guidelines that were implemented in 2016.

13 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Uh-huh.

14 RUBEN BELTRAN: And the process again
15 it's collaborative. The request comes from the
16 principal evaluated by OSYD and upon their approval
17 then we review it and then we come up with the.

18 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So principals
19 are aware that they have this option?

20 RUBEN BELTRAN: Yes they are but uhm...

21 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: How many have
22 requested to remove scanners opposed to at.

23 RUBEN BELTRAN: I do, well, if ...

24 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: If you don't
25 have the answer that I would rather you give it to me

3 but I, I'm more interested in what that process looks
4 like.

5 RUBEN BELTRAN: Right now we are
6 assessing it so I don't have that information with me
7 here. But we can get that information.

8 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: And how long
9 does that process take if I want, if I'm a principal
10 and I want to remove scanners would how long would
11 that process that?

12 MARK RAMPERSANT: Yeah so we have very
13 few, very few requests for a change in designation
14 for scanning and what's helpful is, is if we explain
15 the process of change in designation. So a full time
16 scanning school at the request of a principal wants
17 approved would not remove scanning from the building
18 totally. It would go to what's called a random
19 scanning.

20 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Okay.

21 MARK RAMPERSANT: Where they would scan
22 you know on certain days of the week and after and
23 after a six month period there is another review at
24 which time a determination would be made to make them
25 what's called an unannounced scanning school.
Unannounced scanning is where the machines arrive at

3 the school upon 24 hour notice. Uhm as it relates to
4 the timeframe to which a determination is made to
5 remove scanners from the school. Uhm under this
6 administration we released new scanning protocols for
7 principals. Uhm we post it every year as well as its
8 on our overall principals portal the principals have
9 access and it out-lies the ways by which a principal
10 can request to become a scanning school as well have
11 scanners removed from and some of the ways by which
12 they do this is it is imperative that principals have
13 internal dialog, student representatives and other
14 stakeholders from the school community and approval
15 from the superintendant before making the overall
16 request. Upon doing so, the principals would reach
17 out to the Office of Safety and Youth Development and
18 make the overall request to have a review that is
19 conducted by the NYPD and the Department of
20 Education. In that review, on three years worth of
21 data is brought to the school to show the downward
22 trend before the overall decision would be made.

23 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So it's great
24 that things go on websites, is there a physical call
25 placed. So I'm assuming principals are very busy and
they may be used to a certain process and showing up

3 the first day of school and scanners being there. Is
4 there a personal touch there as well?

5 MARK RAMPERSANT: So scanners arrive in
6 schools without principals having been informed.

7 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: You know I get
8 that but I'm saying for the process of removal.

9 MARK RAMPERSANT: Okay for the process of
10 removal, one of the things we did when implementing
11 this new protocol is we held meetings borough based,
12 invited all schools that had scanners in those
13 schools to come and hear about ways in which they can
14 request to remove or, or add.

15 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So if I ask my
16 principals cause I speak to them often they are going
17 to give me that answer?

18 MARK RAMPERSANT: I should hope so.

19 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Hope so is not
20 a.

21 MARK RAMPERSANT: I could, I could share
22 with you the way by which we delivered using
23 principals, principals portal, right we also put uhm
24 the information out in a P weekly just making the
25 announcement that this uhm that uhm new protocol was
being released. We did information sessions for

3 principals and other key staff so I am hoping that
4 the answer would be yes and the, the uhm the
5 principals have no, no uhm no concerns about being
6 able to access our respective office when they
7 request scanning for a, the following day. For
8 instance, if they hear about a social media threat
9 they know the process by which the request was called
10 unannounced scan.

11 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: And that's the
12 role, the role thing.

13 MARK RAMPERSANT: Correct, correct.

14 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: And how many of
15 those do you get on average or did you get last year?

16 MARK RAMPERSANT: Uhm I'm not sure of
17 that uhm that number of, of requests but did pretty
18 extensive.

19 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: How do you chose
20 uhm, a temporary scanning, so how do you choose the
21 schools?

22 MARK RAMPERSANT: So the choice of
23 temporary or what's called random scanning schools
24 are done in conjunction with the NYPD and that's
25 obviously, unfortunately it is if an unfortunate
incident that occurs the school, right, and if there

3 are a number of incidents or should I say a number of
4 weapons uhm confiscated during their unannounced
5 scanning visits after they return and they see that
6 there is a continuation of weapons being confiscated
7 then there is a conversation about making school a
8 random scanning and in some cases even on a temporary
9 basis.

10 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Yeah she stepped
11 out but I had oh just one last question on the, the
12 MOU? What is the objective? So I understand you
13 can't get in to specifics, what is the objective you
14 are trying to reach uhm with the understanding of the
15 new MOU? I don't know if we...

16 MARK RAMPERSANT: Without getting into
17 specifics, and, and uhm I think the overall objective
18 is to clarify rules. Clarifying the rules of the
19 School Safety Agent as well as the NYPD, talk about
20 the existing collaborations and making every effort
21 to ensure that principals have a voice when it comes
22 to school safety in the building.

23 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: And no pieces of
24 restorative justice in that or is that part of the
25 conversation?

3 MARK RAMPERSANT: I'm just going to leave
4 it.

5 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: And uhm and I
6 know that the School Climate Leadership Team I think
7 and I know you have the current task force had made
8 several recommendations. How many of those
9 recommendations have been implemented and one are of
10 interest for us is certainly around mental health and
11 I heard from advocates that that portion of the
12 recommendations have not necessarily been followed up
13 and implemented, that's why I'm asking the question
14 around, also around how many referrals were issued
15 last year for emergency medical services as well
16 because I think there is certainly a correlation
17 between the two so when do we anticipate all of the
18 recommendations to in fact go into effect?

19 MARK RAMPERSANT: So that concern about
20 uhm the referrals to EMS, we should concern which is
21 what lead to the enhanced training with Therapeutic
22 Crisis Intervention is training DOE staff in de-
23 escalation techniques so that there is no need to
24 call EMS. We can support a child in the school uhm I
25 can also say School Safety Officers are also trained
in that as well, all the School Safety Officers. As

3 far as the specifics of the School Climate Leadership
4 Team, each one of the bulleted proposals and the
5 compliance with that, honestly I would have to look
6 at those so I can give you a specific answer and
7 because I don't have that in front of me I don't want
8 to say that which ones were and were not.

9 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So we look
10 forward to hearing answers on these things in
11 writing. Uhm.

12 MARK RAMPERSANT: Absolutely.

13 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: This hearing and
14 we still have a lot more work to do. Uhm I am going
15 to go to my colleague, now he has some wrap up
16 questions and I see we are joined by, whose been
17 patient our Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer.
18 Thank you for your patience.

19 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Thank you one of my
20 questions is to the DOE but I, I will I just had a
21 follow up question to the NYPD. So just for clarity
22 chief are you saying that even with schools that have
23 scanners, there are weapons or dangerous items that
24 still get past through them?

25 RUBEN BELTRAN: What I'm saying is that
we uhm we track all dangerous instruments and weapons

3 that are recovered within schools. And that's one of
4 the considerations that we use in making the
5 determination if, if a school should be a scanning
6 school and that even within a scanning, not within a
7 scanning school but in schools that are not scanning
8 schools is what I meant, is uhm there's, there's
9 significant weapon recoveries that come about just
10 from students who are concerned and tell teachers
11 that someone has a knife, someone has.

12 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Can you yeah can you
13 describe for us the committee, how do you define
14 dangerous instruments?

15 RUBEN BELTRAN: Well a, a weapon uhm in
16 terms of possession of a weapon would be defined as
17 specific items that are outlawed and for you to carry
18 them in the penile law and mere possession of those
19 items even without using it or intent to use would be
20 a misdemeanor and dangerous instruments are items
21 that would generally not be illegal to solely possess
22 but can be used to cause harm or to injure people.

23 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Such as?

24 RUBEN BELTRAN: Such as a uhm a box
25 cutter. It's not necessary illegal to carry a box
cutter but in school it is, it's not a committed, you

3 are not permitted to possess box cutters in school so
4 that would be a dangerous instrument. An example of
5 a uhm or even a small kitchen knife. Those are,
6 those are some of the examples.

7 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Uh-huh. And and you
8 are saying that even in schools with these scanning
9 devices, has there been any reports or have you heard
10 of cases that even with the scanners dangerous
11 instruments still get through?

12 RUBEN BELTRAN: Yeah I mean I haven't
13 seen any reports since I've been here but I will see
14 if we have that information and I will get that to
15 you.

16 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Does anyone here
17 know? Are these? Are you saying that this is 100%.

18 RAMON GARCIA: Council are you talking a
19 breech in the scanning site?

20 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: I'm talking about a
21 school that has a scanning machine but a student
22 still has some dangerous item that you define as
23 dangerous still within the school?

24 RAMON GARCIA: It's far and few but it
25 has happened.

CHAIR MARK TREYGER: A breech?

3 RAMON GARCIA: We have had breeches and
4 we do have an investigation unit that it is
5 immediately deployed to that school to investigate
6 why the breach occurred. Metal detection is a
7 deterrent. Uhm if you go to a large high school and
8 most presidential high schools uhm have 20, 30, 40
9 exits on one floor. Uhm smaller elementary,
10 elementary schools, 14, 15 exits. If someone leaves
11 a door uhm jammed with paper or you know open
12 obviously someone can get in there, if there isn't
13 someone posted near that area. Uhm but it's a
14 deterrent. Metal detection is a deterrent. Uhm have
15 we had breeches? Very few but yes.

16 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Right, and that's
17 what I just wanted just to find out if still they
18 could somehow go through and do School Safety Agents
19 because I remember when I was a teacher during these
20 random scanning days students would want to hide
21 their cellphones. Is that still the case today?

22 RAMON GARCIA: The cellphone policy is
23 individual by school and the DOE can answer that
24 question.

25 MARK RAMPERSANT: So as you know the
Cellphone Policy has changed and principals along

3 with their SLT make the overall determination as it
4 relates to which, which policy they serve and dot.
5 So it's sort of three-fold. The principal still has
6 uhm the decision making authority once agreed by the
7 SLT to collect cellphones and return cellphones at
8 the end of the day or utilize cellphones for academic
9 instruction in classrooms and they have to submit
10 lesson plans and then the third is to allow students
11 to use cellphones in what's called common areas.

12 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Didn't the Mayor of
13 New York reverse the old Bloomberg Policy with
14 regards to cellphones in schools?

15 MARK RAMPERSANT: Correct. To and from
16 schools.

17 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: So you are saying
18 that now it's decided by each school with regards to
19 whether or not students can bring cellphones is that
20 correct?

21 MARK RAMPERSANT: To each school's
22 responsibility to develop a plan, make notification
23 to parents and apprise students of that, that
24 school's plan for cellphones.
25

3 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: So if a student goes
4 through a scanning device in a school that does not
5 permit cellphone use, what happens to that student?

6 MARK RAMPERSANT: If the school doesn't,
7 if they don't prov... if they don't allow usage of
8 the cellphone and the school has a collection policy,
9 the school will collect and return the phone back to
10 the student.

11 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Is there any
12 discipline that the student faces if they bring their
13 cellphone into the school? In a scanning school?

14 MARK RAMPERSANT: No.

15 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: See I am not clear
16 on this. It's either, it's, there is it's almost as
17 if there is an unequal practice or unequal
18 application of these things and I don't want students
19 to be punished for bringing phones that the Mayor
20 says that you know we live in the 21st Century in a
21 new world and so I remember that students where I
22 used to teach got so creative that bef... during the
23 random scanning days they would go to the corner deli
24 and pay a buck to have them hold the phone to avoid
25 being harassed and interrogated over a cellphone and
then at the conclusion of the day go back and get the

3 phone. Uhm it just seems that this is kind of uneven
4 and I still feel that you know, do we have a
5 percentage of how many schools permit cellphones and
6 how many don't?

7 MARK RAMPERSANT: Not on hand but uhm
8 most schools allow, allow the cellphones in but we
9 can get the numbers.

10 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: And does NYPD ever
11 have cellphones that are not returned to students.
12 Like who, who confiscates them?

13 RUBEN BELTRAN: We don't, we don't
14 confiscate cellphones. I'll let DOE answer that
15 question.

16 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Because I just want
17 folks to know that many of my when I was a teacher, a
18 lot of the holdup was over a cellphone so they would
19 miss 20, 30, 40 minutes of class over a phone or
20 their, their headphones not over a dangerous
21 instrument. But I, I want to move on because I know
22 many folks here have been very patient. The last
23 question I have is for the DOE. Uhm Deputy
24 Chancellor we heard before from the NYPD that there
25 are 86 schools that have permanent scanning metal
detector stations. 86 schools. Uhm does the DOE

3 know which uhm you know in which 86 schools? Do you
4 have that information?

5 LASHAWN ROBINSON: Yes we do have that
6 information.

7 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Are you, can you
8 share that information with the committee?

9 LASHAWN ROBINSON: Uhm that information
10 is not shared uhm publicly due to safety uhm related
11 matters so we would not want this information out
12 publicly in the event of an incident where someone
13 may opt to identify a scanning school versus a
14 nonscanning school. So because of safety related
15 matters, the list of schools is not shared publicly.

16 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Right I just remind
17 that again we passed a law to get that information.
18 And so I'm asking something that we already should
19 have but we have not received it yet and the
20 administration is out of compliance and violating a
21 law that it signed. Uhm but final question, can you
22 tell me this, are these 86 schools all community
23 schools?

24 LASHAWN ROBINSON: We will get that
25 information for you. We can tell you whether or not
they are all community schools or not, I think that

3 would be unlikely that they would all be community
4 schools but we will certainly get that information.

5 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: I, I don't know how
6 they're not. If this is, if the NYPD is saying or if
7 we are hearing reports of systemic issues within the
8 school community and the whole purpose of community
9 school, the initiative, the strategy, the approach is
10 to kind of flood the school with support in every way
11 possible which I support, every school should be a
12 community school. Every public school. But why not
13 start there? To make sure that they have critical
14 wraparound services. That they have counseling in
15 schools, that they have additional support staff that
16 rather than have them equipped with scanners 24/7 to
17 have them equipped with adequate support 24/7.

18 That's the perfect place to start and then expand.

19 And so I would like to know of these 86 schools how

20 many are community schools. I think that is very

21 telling of it because I don't know how the DOE

22 determined which schools to start with? Uhm but

23 again just in conclusion I agree with my, I heard my

24 colleague before talk about certainly we have to make

25 sure that our public announcement systems are

working. No question about it and also I also take

3 issue with how the school construction authority and
4 the division of school facilities determine
5 functioning PA systems. If a PA system works in a
6 couple of classrooms they might think the whole
7 school is in good condition but they haven't checked
8 all the classrooms. There have been schools that
9 have a couple of classrooms that don't have
10 functioning and, and those repairs take too long.
11 Uhm but I have to I just have to say this, we could
12 harden and find ways all we want but if we do not
13 address the underlying root issues then we are not
14 really solving a problem, we are just treating
15 symptoms and we are here to solve these problems and
16 to make sure that our children are receiving all the
17 support which they rightfully need and deserve and I
18 think that whenever you have a conversation about
19 school safety you need to have a conversation about
20 making sure that kids are adequately supported
21 because they should feel safe in their school, they
22 should feel supported in their school, they should
23 feel that they are prime for success and not primed
24 for the criminal justice systems. So with that I
25 think my co-chair and I thank my colleagues on this
committee.

3 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Before you go,
4 uhm I know I've said that a million times. So who
5 are you concerned about getting this information
6 regarding the scanners because I would assume that if
7 this was such an issue it's not hard for anyone to
8 talk up to a school and find out if there are
9 scanners there in the first place. So uhm so I'm
10 just interested in knowing why you won't comply with
11 the law when I'm sure anyone can go on a DOE website
12 and pull up every school you do it by borough I know
13 I've reviewed the website before. We can see every
14 school system. One was really interested in finding
15 out this information you are aware that you can just
16 visit the school and find out and stand at the
17 entrance to know if it is actually scanning. Cancel
18 that.

19 MARK RAMPERSANT: So I think, I think the
20 answer is pretty obvious right? So we have
21 unfortunately we have real threats against our
22 schools.

23 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: How many real
24 threats have we had against our school in the last
25 year?

MARK RAMPERSANT: If I can finish.

3 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Okay.

4 MARK RAMPERSANT: So in order to combat
5 these threats, we put in the safety measures, right.
6 So the idea to, that we should give some sort of a
7 roadmap to a bad actor that they don't have to
8 actually do their, do their due diligence and visit a
9 school and during those dry run visits if the bad
10 actor's truly trying to commit a bad act that we may
11 be, may be just get a heads up and actually catch
12 that bad actor before the bad actor act, right.

13 These sort of blanket reporting, blanket roadmaps,
14 right, would prevent us from being able to have that
15 opportunity. The opportunity to catch somebody doing
16 the dry run right? So if we are going to post every
17 bit of this type of information, now mind you, uhm
18 14-150 and 14-152 calls for quite a bit of data and
19 we provide quite a bit of data. We exercise the
20 exemption that you all voted for that you voted into
21 those laws, very sparingly and this is one of those
22 rare occurrences where we actually employ that
23 exemption that you gave us because we think that
24 would actually outline what our security apparatus
25 looks like.

3 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So I hear you
4 but on the record today you spoke of out of 1400
5 schools I think that only 86 have scanners, so
6 anybody who wanted a roadmap clearly knows that over
7 1000 schools have no scanning so they would, I am
8 assuming that this is a public hearing, right? So
9 people would have that knowledge anyway knowing that
10 more than 80-90% of schools are not covered by any
11 scanning.

12 MARK RAMPERSANT: Correct.

13 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So, so, random
14 scanning.

15 MARK RAMPERSANT: There are different.

16 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: And how much
17 random scanning happens on an average day. So are
18 covering upwards of 1000 schools with this random
19 scanning?

20 MARK RAMPERSANT: So I mean during the
21 course of the year, we, we, cover a large numb...

22 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: I didn't say
23 year, I said day, on an average day.

24 MARK RAMPERSANT: Well I mean to, to your
25 point Council Member if you feel that asking the
question and and us giving you the number that there

3 is X amount of permanent scanning, what is the point
4 of the follow up scanning, to create the back door to
5 the roadmap that we are trying to safe guard?

6 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: I didn't say
7 anything about the random I just want to know why
8 there is such a reluctance to give a number, the 86
9 number when there is more than.

10 MARK RAMPERSANT: We are not outlining
11 which schools much like the permanent scanning is in
12 a certain number of schools that we have indicated
13 and there is random scanning that we have a certain
14 number of deployment boost, both with our Civilian
15 School Safety Agents, we supplement that with our
16 Uniformed School Safety Task Force and we don't give
17 out those type of deployment numbers because for the
18 reason that it would go.

19 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: But I would also
20 suggest that you don't have to be the most
21 sophisticated person to visit 86 schools in New York
22 City to find out which ones actually have scanning
23 and which don't.

24 MARK RAMPERSANT: Right. And, and we
25 are, hoping that.

3 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So the road, if
4 a person truly wanted to find out they would just
5 pull your list of schools off and go stand outside.
6 I mean if you are, if we are making the assumption
7 that they are that committed to lining up with
8 schools.

9 MARK RAMPERSANT: I think that's my point
10 that if you have somebody that's that committed we
11 would prefer that they do their dry run and visit a
12 school so we could actually see something out of
13 sorts, possibly catch this individual before they do
14 a dry run.

15 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: What if this
16 person...

17 MARK RAMPERSANT: What we don't want to
18 do is enable individuals to be able to sit at home on
19 their computer and identify where our possible
20 vulnerabilities and go directly there. So that's,
21 that's the point.

22 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: And I would just
23 say that it's not that hard, you could just drive up
24 to a school and ask the student do you guys have
25 scanning? And what sophisticated protocols would you
have in place to find that, to know if they ask a

3 student? I could go to McDonalds on Springfield
4 Boulevard right now and ask a student, do you guys,
5 do you guys have scanning? I'm going to get the
6 answer yes or no either way. So uhm so I so that I'm
7 we could go back and forth on this but it's really
8 not that difficult if an individual wanted to. If,
9 if you are using that rationale to find out if a
10 school has scanning or not so I just would caution us
11 being more thoughtful on our answer on that one. Uhm
12 alright I'm going to begin to close out but I want
13 thank you all and listen, we are all on the same
14 here. I think what we all share the same objective
15 of ensuring that our schools are uhm safe and uhm our
16 children can go to school and do what they are tasked
17 with doing which is learning and getting a quality
18 education. At the same time I think there does need
19 to be a lot more focus on education and compassion
20 and not necessarily incarceration and confrontation
21 and that's the key I believe in ensuring our schools
22 environments are much better uhm we should really be
23 focusing on ensuring that schools are a place of
24 education and not a place for militarization and that
25 there is adequate amount of counselors and social
workers, that is how we prevent these incidents a

3 police commissioner always says public safety is a
4 shared responsibility so if we are unevenly putting
5 resources in one place without really treating the
6 symptoms as my co-chair said then we are defeating
7 the purpose of really creating a great school
8 environment where our children can receive a quality
9 education and, and good services. So I think we all
10 share it. I think we have some ways to go and I will
11 just add once again this is a revolving cycle, we are
12 putting these kids through. One, you know we are
13 dealing with a homelessness crisis as it is and we
14 know majority of these kids live in black and brown
15 communities where there have been very little
16 resources historically so now to add 1000 or more and
17 listen if you bring a gun to school that's on you and
18 you should be dealt with, you know, uhm in a way, you
19 know that, that you should be dealt with but at the
20 end of the day I think a lot of our children are
21 interacting with law enforcement on minute low level
22 offenses and being issued summons and handcuffed and
23 given you know, we argued about the warning card
24 giving one warning uhm and discretion being left up
25 to the buildings, it, I think it defeats the purpose
of what we are all trying to accomplish. Not saying

3 the warning card is not a step in the right direction
4 but it's really not the answer. The answer is making
5 sure that the resources are in these schools so. I
6 want to thank you, to be continued, look forward to
7 working with you on these bills and passing these
8 bills, the Council does. Look forward to doing and
9 trying to find a good medium. Once again, we
10 understand the delicate balance between ensuring that
11 our schools are safe and I know principals who
12 request cameras as well as they want their intercom
13 systems to work as they should in 2018. Uhm but at
14 the same time making sure that restorative justice
15 piece is also not lost in the conversation so I want
16 to thank my colleagues, especially Paul Vallone and
17 my co-chair Council Member Treyger and all the
18 sponsors of the bills today for taking school safety
19 seriously and to the next level so thank you. We are
20 now going to call the next panel.

21 LASHAWNA ROBINSON: Thank you.

22 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Thank you.

23 RUBEN BELTRAN: Alright thank you.

24 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: So now I'm going
25 to call up the Manhattan Borough President Gale
Brewer and also Nancy Ginsberg, Melinda Onstra from

3 Legal Aid Society and Stefanie Coyle from the New
4 York Civil Liberties Union. I want to thank you all
5 for your patience uhm with us today. (prolonged
6 silence).

7 GALE BREWER: Should we start?

8 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Alright are you
9 ready?

10 GALE BREWER: Yes I'm ready. Thank you
11 very much.

12 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Alrighty. Thank
13 you for your patience.

14 GALE BREWER: Thank you for having us
15 here. I'm Gale Brewer, Manhattan Borough President
16 and I'm here to testify in support of Resolution 514
17 and mention some other topics but this resolution
18 calls upon DOE as you know to provide one full time
19 guidance counselor and social worker for every 250
20 students with a minimum of at least one full time
21 guidance counselor and social worker in each school
22 in the city. We have been talking about this issue
23 for a very long time. I was on the Mental Health
24 Committee in the City Council and so since 2002 I
25 have been advocating for this. I really appreciate
this hearing, really appreciate this hearing. Uhm in

3 2016, as Borough President I released a report on the
4 state of Mental Health Services in our schools. The
5 ratio then of social workers to students was
6 appallingly low. We found that there was just one
7 school based social worker for every 800 students and
8 those few social workers were not spread across the
9 borough schools equitably. Now I just want to
10 mention, I know I listened to a lot of this
11 discussion and I appreciate it but I will tell you a
12 couple of things, when we talk about social workers,
13 Thrive is great but it is producing some not full
14 time social workers at the school so when they give
15 these numbers I don't know if they mean so, part time
16 one day a week and I don't know how culturally
17 appropriate they are. 2) We have been trying because
18 of budget concerns, which I am aware of to get the
19 social work schools who are willing to do this to
20 supervise while we have student social work, graduate
21 students in the schools, so that will be another
22 example, we have not gotten the green light from DOE
23 to do that. There's not a person who is going to be
24 full time for many years but it's at least of
25 hopefully culturally appropriate and often students
who are relatively young who can relate to the young

3 people in the schools. Hasn't happened, needs to
4 happen and finally I want to make sure when we are
5 talking about social workers, I too have had a child
6 who has an IEP. It is not a social worker who is
7 working with a child with an IEP. Sometimes people
8 count that as a social worker in the school. That is
9 not a social worker dealing with all of the young
10 people. So uhm I believe that if DOE is able to
11 fulfill demands of Resolution 514, the schools will
12 make great strides in supporting our families and the
13 young people by increasing the ratio of guidance
14 counselors and social workers, we can expect as you
15 know suspension rates to go down, arrests to go down,
16 summons in schools to go down. Conversely we can
17 also expect increases in students morale and academic
18 performance as school climate improves and mental
19 health needs are met, only with social workers in my
20 opinion. And what is interesting to me is somebody
21 who has a Youth Council in our office just like the
22 City Council does and the Mayor does, I didn't tell
23 the young people to talk about social, emotional
24 issues and mental health in the schools, I thought
25 they might talk about sports, they might talk about
the school food. No, no, no they brought this topic

3 up. 1) Not my idea, didn't push it. 2) When I go
4 as you do to all the Legislative breakfast in all of
5 the school districts in Manhattan. I don't bring up
6 this topic first. I don't suggest this as a number
7 topic. I don't make the first comment in the room.
8 Guess what the number one topic is, exactly what you
9 are talking about today. So it is now, in my opinion
10 there are many issues at DOE. 1) I will also
11 mention something interesting about bullying which I
12 know that to the credit of Council Member Dromm
13 brought up. In Br... in Newark, recently, you may have
14 read about this. They applied for an anti-bullying
15 grant and guess what they applied for, washer/dryers.
16 There was a school that needed washer/dryers. I am
17 going to get as many washer/dryers for my schools as
18 possible because if you are not clean and you will
19 get bullied and so without getting into any of the
20 specifics, my principals, what they do, what they
21 have a washer/dryer, they clean the clothes. The
22 young child brings it in, in his or her backpack and
23 the clothes are cleaned. Less bullying. Now that is
24 not what you would think of as the school's
25 responsibility but it is part of what we are dealing
with and it comes under the social worker and the

3 support services that we needed. So back to even if
4 the recommended ratio is achieved, successful, depend
5 upon the alignment of policies across all agencies,
6 indirect with young people, I strongly recommend that
7 the Council make sure that the proposed School
8 Emergency Preparedness Task Force is designed to
9 conform to the current research on mental health
10 issues and the appropriate response to students in
11 need. The proposed composition on the Task Force is
12 problematic because it excludes the people who are
13 most impacted. The proposed membership includes the
14 NYPD Commissioner, the DOE Chancellor and several
15 mayoral appointments as we heard but I don't think it
16 had as many advocates, teachers, parents and more
17 importantly students, that's unacceptable. The
18 proposal also calls for the Task Force to examine the
19 need for "infrastructure security technologist
20 including best practices for INGRESS and REGRESS and
21 you heard a lot about this." Language is vague. The
22 intent is clear. Given the composition of the Task
23 Force, I fear that the examination of security
24 technology will only lead to more metal detectors and
25 more scanning in more schools as you discussed. This
is not what we need. After 30 years of research on

3 school discipline and safety, there is no conclusive
4 evidence that metal detectors and scanning are making
5 our schools any safer. There is evidence that school
6 policing and metal detector policies
7 disproportionately impact Black students, Latino
8 students, LGBTQ students and students with
9 disabilities and I would just add the issue of who
10 decides about a scanner. They are not just community
11 schools, I have many, many schools. I have a list of
12 schools with scanners with Manhattan I would be glad
13 to share it. The issue, the issue is they are not
14 all community schools and there is another problem
15 which wasn't brought up, many schools, the high
16 schools in particular have four or three principals.
17 So you have to have a majority of principals. I have
18 been trying to get rid of the scanners, so I lobby
19 the principals. I don't win. Because a majority the
20 principals in that school by some law from above has
21 to decide that that is the way in which the
22 principals are going to go and some young people want
23 the scanners for whatever reason. Another reason to
24 get rid of them in my opinion, not only is it better
25 for the young people I just mentioned but some middle
class parents won't go to that school when there are

3 scanners. So you will have a more diverse group
4 sometimes when you have no scanners. I would take
5 the money that the scanners have and put them into
6 social workers. The most worrisome aspect of the
7 proposed intros is that which is unsaid. There is no
8 mention of restorative justice as you talked about
9 earlier. There is no recognition of the need for
10 anti-bias training. There is no recognition of the
11 first responders to mental health crisis should be
12 mental health experts. So how can we be sure that
13 this proposed Task Force would align itself with the
14 recommendations of advocates that experts have been
15 fighting for improved mental health services for
16 decades. So finally I urge you to take another look
17 at the proposed Legislation and rethink the
18 composition of the Task Force as I am sure you will
19 because it needs to meet the mental health needs of
20 young people and I urge you to support Resolution 514
21 and help make the 1:250 ratio a reality in all
22 schools. Thank you to both chairs and thank you to
23 the Young Advocates like the Member of Urban Youth
24 Collaborative for making sure student voices are
25 heard on this issue. Thank you for this wonderful,
wonderful hearing today.

3 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Thank you and I
4 just friendly amendment, I just want to say that I
5 believe on the Task Force Bill that it is even, so
6 it's 3 Admin appointments, 3 Advocacy groups.

7 GALE BREWER: Right.

8 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Uhm and then I
9 think NYPD 3, is uhm. NYPD is part of the Admin so
10 it is 3, 3, 3.

11 GALE BREWER: Yeah and young people?

12 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Yeah they will
13 consult. Okay so we will follow up on that.

14 GALE BREWER: Okay thank you very much.

15 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: But okay, thank
16 you. Alrighty we will go to whomever and just state
17 your name for the record. Thank you Madam Borough
18 President.

19 GALE BREWER: Thank you.

20 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Always good to
21 see you.

22 STEFANIE COYLE: Good afternoon, uhm my
23 name is Stefanie Coyle, I am the Education Council at
24 the New York Civil Liberties Union which is the New
25 York Affiliate for the ACLU. The NYCLU serves on the
Mayor's School Climate Leadership Team. In the

3 aftermath of the Parkland tragedy, districts across
4 the country have added security features such as
5 armed guards, metal detectors and surveillance
6 cameras to schools but it is unclear whether any of
7 those measures are actually effective in preventing
8 violent incidents and the conversation on preventing
9 school violence has almost been exclusively focused
10 on hardening without an equivalent focus on School
11 Climate including proven techniques that we know can
12 nurture a safe and healthy environment. So we are
13 concerned that the proposed packet of introductions
14 is short cited in that it focuses on School Hardening
15 rather than supportive and restorative measures for
16 students. It's critical that the City Council
17 consider the impact of these proposals on School
18 Climate including the threat that criminal justice
19 measures pose to students of color who are
20 disproportionately funneled into the school to prison
21 pipeline. We appreciate the Council's efforts to
22 continue the discussion on how to keep kids safe and
23 very much appreciate both Council Member Treyger and
24 Council Member Richards comments and questions today
25 uhm but we question the necessity of creating the
School Emergency Task Force because we are concerned

3 that there could be potential duplication or even
4 undermining of the work of the Mayor's School Climate
5 Leadership Team uhm that has been meeting for several
6 years to tackle School Climate and Discipline. But
7 should this Task Force be created, we have proposed
8 recommendations to guide it's work and my remarks
9 with a brief summary of them but we have further
10 comments in our written testimony. So first, we
11 recommend that the Council add a student
12 representative as the Borough President talked about
13 uhm to the Task Force so that uhm it ensures that
14 impact to student perspectives are considered when
15 discussing school emergencies. Second, the Task
16 Force if created should work together with the
17 Mayor's School Climate Leadership Team to push the
18 DOE and the NYPD to put out a revised MOU that
19 protects the students of New York and that
20 incorporates the recommendations that the School
21 Climate Leadership Team has already put together.
22 Third, we urge the Task Force to review the use of
23 metal detectors, surveillance cameras and other
24 infrastructure security technologies to assess the
25 impact that those things have on School Climate and
create transparent criteria for the introduction and

3 removal of metal detectors rather than something
4 called a Data Review and no one knows what it is.
5 Uhm and rather than an approach that focuses solely
6 on adding or bolstering them. Uhm fourth, as the
7 proposed Task Force considers Security Technologies
8 we ask the City Council to impose a Moratorium on
9 Facial Recognition Technology in New York City
10 Schools. Facial Recognition Technology is biased,
11 inaccurate and violates the privacy rights of
12 students, teachers, and parents and there are other
13 districts in New York State that are currently using
14 this technology. Fifth, we ask the Council reject
15 Introduction 923A that would consider the use of our
16 limited public school resources on non-public
17 schools. Uhm and finally we enthusiastically support
18 Council Member Treyger's Resolution 514 which calls
19 on the DOE to provide one full-time guidance
20 counselor and social worker for every 250 students
21 and to ensure that all schools have at least one full
22 time guidance counselor or social worker. We ask
23 that we pass this resolution and provide additional
24 funding as you have already done through the City
25 Council to supplement the number of guidance
counselors and social workers. We thank the

3 Committees on Education and Public Safety for
4 considering this testimony. Uhm you know in
5 determining how to help students feel safe and
6 supported it's critical to consider the students
7 voices and ensure that school hardening measures do
8 not funnel more kids into the school to prison
9 pipeline. Thank you.

10 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Thank you.
11 Please next one.

12 NANCY GINSBURG: Good afternoon my name
13 is Nancy Ginsburg, I oversee the Adolescent Practice
14 of the Legal Aid Society and the Criminal Trial
15 Practice. We have watched students in the five
16 counties be pushed into the school to prison
17 pipeline. We've done hundreds maybe more school
18 suspension hearings uhm stemming from arrests. Uhm
19 we enthusiastically join our partners at the NYCLU
20 and their recommendations and uhm Manhattan Borough
21 President Brewer except that we would actually
22 encourage the Council not to pursue a Task Force for
23 the following reasons: We certainly recognize a need
24 to keep our schools safe. We support the City
25 Council's efforts to provide oversight and demand
accountability from city agencies. However, we have

3 serious concerns about the scope and composition of
4 the proposed School Emergency Preparedness Task
5 Force. We urge the Council to build upon the
6 extensive work done by the Mayor's School Climate
7 Leadership Team. We encourage the City Council to
8 ask the Leadership team to take on additional tasks
9 related to school safety and to hold city agencies
10 responsible for implementing the carefully considered
11 recommendations that have already been issued, many
12 of which have not been followed by the City. As a
13 critical member of the leadership team, the Legal Aid
14 Society has for the past four years, joined other
15 advocates and representatives from every city agency
16 that touches our schools to address issues of School
17 Climate and Safety. The proposed Task Force looks to
18 a narrow subgroup of the leadership team and asks
19 them to tackle some of the very issues that have been
20 discussed and could be discussed in more detail
21 alongside the Council by the larger leadership team.
22 We strongly urge the Council to look to the
23 Leadership Team to address the majority of issues
24 this set of bills seeks to address. Some of the
25 proposed bills contain worthy goals that do not
require a separate task force. The city agencies of

3 concern are already engaged in much of the work that
4 this proposed Task Force would be charged with
5 reviewing. The Council has over-site of the DOE, the
6 FDNY and the NYPD and can simply direct those
7 agencies to examine and report on the following:
8 Distribution of School Emergency Preparedness
9 Materials to parents and students Intro 639B,
10 creating a public notification system for school
11 emergencies Intro 872A, evacuation plans and
12 emergency response protocols at schools Intro 876A,
13 the security presence at schools Intro 893A, the
14 emergency preparedness training for school personnel
15 Intro 894A, infrastructure security technologies at school
16 Intro 912A, and emergency community technologies at
17 schools Intro 922A. Intro 9 number, there are so
18 many numbers, too many numbers. Could you just do
19 like.

19 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Were you at the
20 beginning of the hearing when I had to read all 13 of
21 them.

22 NANCY GINSBURG: I was here, I have
23 actually been here since 9 a.m. so. Intro 921A
24 defines a school emergency as a situation involving a
25 threat of harm of students, personnel, and/or

3 facilities including but not limited to natural,
4 technological and human caused incidents which
5 require a response from law enforcement. This
6 definition is so broad as to include every incident
7 that could colourably require a law enforcement
8 response. The leadership team has recognized that
9 while serious school incidents may require, may
10 require a law enforcement response, most events can
11 be addressed with alternative means. One of the
12 Leadership Team's primary goals has been to reduce
13 the disproportionate impact that traditional law
14 enforcement responses have had on minority students
15 and students with disabilities. Because the proposed
16 Task Force is charged with assessing law enforcement
17 responses as a primary goal, there is an unacceptable
18 risk that the issues faced by students, particularly
19 students of color and color with identified
20 disabilities will take second place to law
21 enforcement mandates. Unfortunately even with the
22 best intentions, racial disproportionately and school
23 based arrests and suspensions persist really
24 seriously persist. On the risk that this Task Force
25 would make it worse even inadvertently must be
resisted. We strongly object to Intro 869A which

3 mandates that the proposed Task Force develop
4 protocols for students experiencing a mental health
5 crisis. And I say this with all due respect to
6 Council Member Ampry-Samuel and the incident that she
7 was discussing and it is an incident that we have
8 dealt with year after year, month after month with
9 many unfortunately, with many of our clients. I
10 would ask for some more time.

11 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Please.

12 NANCY GINSBURG: Given that the proposed,
13 the scope of the proposed Task Force is to address
14 school emergencies and I say that in quotes which are
15 defined as a threat of harm requiring law enforcement
16 response, the inclusion of mental health crisis
17 appears to go far beyond the scope of such a task
18 force. Most mental health crisis in schools do not
19 and should not merit a law enforcement response ever.
20 The proposed Task Force has representation of the
21 NYPD, the DOE and the Mayor's Office of Criminal
22 Justice. It does not include any agency with a
23 mental health focus, experts in the mental health and
24 child development field, providers of mental health
25 services are consumers of such services. Assessing
mental health crisis through a law enforcement lens

3 will result in criminalizing behavior that instead
4 requires a therapeutic response. The Council has
5 held multiple hearings over the years about the
6 excessive response of law enforcement to students
7 experiencing mental health crisis and the proposed
8 Task Force would likely exacerbate that outcome. The
9 Leadership Team can be in the group of more than 40
10 individuals and agencies, many of whom have expertise
11 in child development and mental health and has
12 published a detailed recommendation, almost none of
13 which have been implemented as yet. We urge the
14 council to review those recommendations and consider
15 meeting with the Leadership Team in an effort to
16 address the mental health needs of New York City
17 students and remove this issue from the preview of
18 the proposed Task Force. I would just like to
19 address the specific incident that was raised earlier
20 about, about that child, who unfortunately has a lot
21 of company. There are many, many children in crisis
22 all the time in our schools and they are, almost all
23 of those children and many of the children who do not
24 appear to be in crisis have long histories of trauma
25 and the schools are not equipped to meet their needs
and one of the primary reasons why we on the

3 Leadership Team put together a very detailed set of
4 recommendations and quite honestly that was just the
5 tip of the iceberg of what we actually believe is
6 necessary is because there is no coordination among
7 agencies. Exactly what the Council Member was
8 talking about. That there are children at our
9 schools who are being served by various agencies
10 around the city that do not talk to each other and
11 the schools do not know how to communicate with those
12 agencies, those agencies do not know how to
13 communicate with the schools and everyone stands
14 behind privacy and the only people that suffer
15 because of that are the children. If we really want
16 to serve the needs of children, then we should figure
17 out how to get the adults who are responsible for
18 those children to talk to each other and to meet the
19 needs of those children and to spend the money that
20 it takes to get those children the services that they
21 need and that is not by funding NYPD and terrorism
22 and all of those things are important. We all have
23 to be safe, we want our children to be safe but if
24 our children are too traumatized, and too sad to
25 function in school they can't learn and all of the
rest of this doesn't matter because they are not safe

3 ever, many of these children and so when we talk
4 about safety it is more than having a police officer
5 at the door, it's having healthy, happy children.
6 Children are entitled to be happy. And being happy
7 is actually part of being safe. And so we need to
8 get that issue of seeing a child in crisis is
9 critical but we need to learn as a city how to
10 identify those children before they go into crisis
11 because that child, that 11-year-old child had
12 identifiable issues long before that crisis and when
13 the police department talks about having a higher
14 rate of recovery in schools without scanners that's
15 because there are actually schools where children
16 trust adults and then they report things because they
17 know that the adults will keep them safe and it is an
18 indication that scanners don't make children feel
19 safe. Because you can't talk to a scanner, a scanner
20 is not going to address your issues and if we are
21 seeing that, it is good that there are more weapons
22 because they are not going into the schools and
23 schools shouldn't be punished because there are these
24 higher reports. Kids carry weapons because they have
25 to get from their home to the school and that is
scary for a lot of kids. They are not, they are not

3 using those weapons in schools. There are very few
4 incidents, I mean it's not never. Sometimes there
5 are incidents and that has to be dealt with but
6 almost never are those weapons used in the schools
7 and so we need to really look at and the Leadership
8 did spend a lot of time thinking about why are those
9 kids bringing those weapons to school, why do they
10 feel unsafe walking to and from school? Or however
11 they are getting to and from school and when you ask
12 about the MOU, the MOU, what we hoped to get from the
13 MOU, what the advocates wanted from the MOU is to
14 clearly delineate and clarify the roles of law
15 enforcement and educators and there has been a
16 tremendous resistance to do that and we expect when
17 that document is produced in the fall after 09/21
18 after you pointed out, we are not going to see a true
19 clarification of the roles because everytime that we
20 propose something we, it was rejected so we expect
21 that this currently extremely vague MOU is going to
22 be replaced by a less vague MOU but it's not going to
23 be clear enough and the issue about who is
24 responsible for what is an on the ground issue that
25 needs to be addressed and it cannot be supervised and
trained on if the rules don't exist and so I

3 encourage you to keep pushing the agencies for this
4 true clarification because if there are no rules,
5 there is no way to hold the agencies to their burdens
6 of what they need to do.

7 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Thank you so
8 much for your testimony. I think you gave a lot of
9 useful information and certainly would love for you
10 to follow back up with us on some of the
11 recommendations that were made uhm especially around
12 mental health which was something that I know some
13 advocates that I met with uhm it's in your testimony,
14 perfect, so we look forward to following up with you
15 on those things. Thank you. Alright, we are going to
16 call the next panel now. Okay uhm, okay. Okay I am
17 going to Eunice Mercedes 32BJ, Scott Kessler, City of
18 School and Adam Eisenman of Rave Mobility. (long
19 pause). Cut the testimony down to about 3 minutes
20 because it is, I got to get these folks home, so
21 actually be very concise if you can. Alrighty you
22 may begin. Your mic is going to light up right.

23 SCOTT KESSLER: Uhm I'm a high school
24 senior and since I think 2008 I attended the Shefa
25 School and two public schools, in the Shefa's I was,
I saw an extreme amount of bullying and I have not

3 seen any in public school. I was taught at Shefa
4 that segregation was good for black people, that uhm
5 genocide is right in many scenarios, mass murder of
6 children, and things like that. I was taught that I
7 deserve to die for many reasons. I had to pretend to
8 be religious out of fear for my life because I had
9 been threatened by the staff, by the principal, uhm I
10 did not receive an adequate education there. If I
11 did not read on my own I would not have learned very
12 much or I was lied to in history class. It was in
13 history class that they said that segregation was
14 good for black people that they said that the world
15 was 6,000 years old. That they said that slavery was
16 the first form of social security. I, there was I
17 was taught many terrible things in, in history class
18 and religious class. They taught that the people who
19 died in the Tsunami in the Indian Ocean that they
20 deserved it because they did not believe in the
21 Jewish religion. They taught that JFK deserved to be
22 assassinated. This was in one lecture and that
23 native americans who were ex... were exposed to small
24 pox deserved to die because they did not believe in
25 the Jewish religion. They taught of genocide in the
Bible in the Torah and they taught that it was, I

3 questioned why, why was it right to God to do this
4 and they said that it was right for God to murder
5 enormous amounts of children and even kill the
6 animals, the cattle of the people and take more men
7 as slaves and I, if I did not pretend that it was
8 religious. If I did not hold my tongue at things
9 like this I might have been expelled or beaten and
10 there was a constant fear that I might be killed
11 because I had been threatened and told that I deserve
12 to die and when you are told by many people that you
13 deserve to die to expect them to act on it and I was
14 told this by the teachers, the principal.

15 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Thank you for
16 sharing your testimony.

17 Uhm good afternoon uhm Chairs Richards
18 and Treyger and members of the Council, my name is
19 Adam Eisenman and I am with Rave Mobile Safety. Uhm
20 thank you for the opportunity to testify and for your
21 work addressing the critical topic of school safety.
22 Rave Mobile Safety shares your goal of providing safe
23 and secure classrooms for our children to learn and
24 grow. For 14 years, Rave has worked with more than
25 3,000 communities nationwide to improve safety and it
is our connection to public safety that has helped us

3 become a leader in community paired ness and school
4 safety. Today Rave's Technology is deployed
5 statewide in Arkansas, Michigan and Delaware and
6 covers major metrop, uhm metropolis' like Washington
7 DC, Atlanta, Denver, Seattle, Nashville, Chicago and
8 other major cities and counties in states across the
9 nation. Locally Nassau and Suffolk Counties have
10 deployed Rave across approximately 900 schools. The
11 School Emergency Preparedness Task Force in this
12 slate of bills that you are proposing are thorough
13 and cover a spectrum of strategies including
14 Emergency Preparedness, Technology, Effective
15 Communication and interagency collaboration. All of
16 these strategies can best be deployed by Rave, Rave
17 Mobile Safety's panic button application. As you
18 know, school personnel must prepare to confront a
19 myriad of emergency on campus for medical
20 emergencies, and assailants to fires and other
21 crimes. It is important implement a system that can
22 effectively respond to incidents of all kinds
23 including active shooter scenarios. There are two
24 keys to improving school safety and response for all
25 emergencies that we have learned through our
conversations with communities that entrust their

3 children's safety to us and through our industry
4 experience. The first and most important is that any
5 emergency response process starts with 9-1-1. 9-1-1
6 acts at the incident manager, gathers information and
7 dispatches authorized emergency personnel to the
8 scene. Their involvement is key to a rapid response
9 and faster reunification. Rave acts as the starting
10 point for any event that takes place in our schools,
11 as teachers have become the first first responders
12 and the entirety of the emergency response process
13 can be run through our solution. The second is
14 providing notifications to teachers, faculty and
15 staff at the school about the type of incident
16 underway. The proper response can mean the
17 difference between a life and death situation.
18 School personnel need to know instantly if there is
19 an emergency situation and if it is a routine medical
20 emergency or if they need to take proper procedures
21 such as run, hide, fight. After Action Reports from
22 Sandy hook and San Bernadino and further reporting
23 from the Department of Justice, NENA which is the
24 National Emergency Number Association have all
25 crystallized these policy reports that 9-1-1 enhanced
communication are key to improving the response for

3 incidents within our schools. With that in mind,
4 school personnel armed with Rave Mobile Phone
5 Application with a touch of a button can communicate
6 directly with 9-1-1 and with those on site and NYPD
7 School Safety officers. Pressing the button
8 instantly makes a voice call to 9-1-1. This allows
9 the professionals who are trained to handle these
10 type of incidents properly diagnose, can I have maybe
11 just another minute, thank. Diagnose the situation
12 and send the proper personnel to the scene. At the
13 same time that 9-1-1 call was made, messages are sent
14 to all staff members through SMS text, email and an
15 app based notification. These messages contain
16 critical information including the identity of the
17 person reporting the emergency, the time and location
18 of the event and most importantly type of emergency
19 underway. While all of that is occurring 9-1-1
20 receives the same information, while also being
21 presented with school floor plans, emergency response
22 plans, class rosters, points of contact in the
23 building and other critical data that can be
24 instantly disseminated into the field so that first
25 responders have immediate access to it. Rave offers
a multi-hazard approach to school safety, not just

3 active shooter incidents, you will notice that the
4 Rave Panic Button is not a single button but rather
5 has five distinct applications. All activations will
6 place a voice call to 9-1-1 but depending on uhm what
7 button you push determines who will receive
8 notifications. As an example, uhm of this might be
9 for a medical emergency. Not every staff members
10 needs to receive a notification but rather those
11 trained in CPR, a school nurse, principal or the
12 coaching would benefit from early incident
13 notification and therefore aiding in the response.
14 In regards to school uhm information, while some of
15 the response or floor plan information is already
16 collected by the city as required by the Save Act it
17 is the automatic presentation of this data as soon as
18 emergencies are reported that makes it actionable for
19 those in the field. The Rave Accesses a Repository to
20 store these plans. Additionally, as the situation
21 unfolds, the Rave Panic Button System, direct
22 connection to 9-1-1 allow for follow up customizable
23 messaging including all clear, medical emergencies,
24 details on the active shooter or the broadcast of a
25 reunification point following an evacuation to be
sent to all staff members that receive the initial

3 notification. On occasion, incidents spill over by
4 nearby schools, Rave Panic Button would all 9-1-1 and
5 NYPD to initiate lockdown notifications as an example
6 to keep students sheltered in place rather than
7 boarding busses during an active assault and the
8 communication provides greater clarity to those on
9 scene and reduces the confusion that takes place
10 during these high stressed events. Rave is also able
11 to interface with existing systems such as video
12 cameras, signage, door locks and access controls
13 among other things. Our system would enhance current
14 capabilities while providing a robust security
15 solution to all schools in an uniform and scalable
16 manner. Rave is a tool that ties all of these
17 proposed bills together. We have examples across the
18 country of the Rave Panic Button being used
19 effectively, preventing a school shooter before it
20 happened in Arkansas. Rallying staff with medical
21 training to provide aid to a young girl who suffered
22 a severe seizure and head trauma in Alabama.
23 Assisting with a search of a child that went missing
24 from a school campus in Stahomish County. I believe
25 she actually had autism and in each of these cases,
communication and the immediate involvement of 9-1-1

3 have had a tangible effect on the response and
4 approved outcome on each event. And just wrapping up
5 here, these are difficult but unfortunately necessary
6 conversations to have and I would like to extend my
7 gratitude to each of you for allowing me to testify
8 today. I look forward to continuing to engage with
9 folks like yourselves who are committed to protecting
10 our children and ask that you leverage Rave's unique
11 expertise experience in this area of school safety
12 that we have cultivated over many years of working
13 with communities that have been touched by the
14 horrors of confronting violence at the schools'
15 doorsteps. I will conclude by asking the Committee
16 Members if they have any questions that I can answer
17 about my testimony or the technology.

18 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: I want to thank
19 you for your testimony and the work that you are
20 doing in the other counties and around the city. Uhm
21 just one question, so how often is the panic button
22 used in whatever cities that you are in or whatever
23 you are seeing in Suffolk County and are they being
24 utilized for minute issues like someone has marijuana
25 or a mental health episode? I am just interested in

3 seeing how, hearing a little bit how those
4 jurisdictions have used the panic button.

5 ADAM EISENMAN: Yeah the data might
6 actually surprise you. Uhm it's being used on a
7 daily basis within our schools. The App itself is
8 really intended to speed up the emergency response
9 process so it's not really being used for a student
10 that has marijuana but maybe a medical trauma or
11 something like that. Uhm Arkansas as an example, has
12 had this statewide in 1,100 schools or so uhm for
13 about three years and over the last three years they
14 have had 4,000 activations.

15 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Alrighty any
16 questions. Alright great, thank you for your
17 testimony. Thank you. Alright we are going to go
18 to the next panel, Rahani Singh, Advocates for
19 Children in New York, Charlotte Pope, Children's
20 Defense Fund, Katrina Feldcamp, Bronx Legal Services
21 and Ashley Semoire, I think I'm saying Esquire from.
22 Sawyer, oh I'm sorry I'm just blind, Girls for Gender
23 Equity. (long pause).

24 RAHINI SINGH: Good afternoon, uhm my
25 name is Rahani Singh and I am a staff attorney at the
School of Justice Project at Advocates for Children

3 of New York. Uhm I focus on helping students with
4 uhm emotional and behavioral challenges get the
5 support that they need to stay and succeed in school.
6 Uhm ASC is a member of the Davidian Schools New York
7 Coalition which is dedicated to shifting the culture
8 of schools away from punishment and exclusion and
9 towards positive approaches to discipline and safety.
10 ASC is also a member of the Mayor's Leadership Team
11 on School Climate and Discipline. While ASC believes
12 in the importance of the establishing protocols in
13 the event of a school emergency, we have two main
14 concerns for the proposed bills. First the
15 definition of school emergency in these proposed
16 bills is overly broad and encompasses a myriad of
17 school safety situations outside the scope of a true
18 school emergency that requires a law enforcement
19 response and topics that already within a scope of
20 the Mayor's Leadership Team on School Climate and
21 Discipline. Since 2015, the Leadership Team has
22 worked to develop policies and practices that enhance
23 the wellbeing and safety of students and staff while
24 minimizing the use of suspensions, arrests and
25 summons. After a years long collaborative process,
with diverse stakeholders, the Leadership Team

3 produced two reports with detailed recommendations to
4 address student safety in schools. Many of the
5 recommendations specific address issues that fall
6 into the definition of school emergency in these
7 proposed bills. To date, many of the recommendations
8 have not been implemented. We are concerned that the
9 composition and scope of this new proposed task force
10 will lead to an increase in law enforcement to
11 student behavior, undoing the purpose and the work of
12 the leadership team. Second, while AFCC is in an
13 urgent need to focus on meeting the mental health
14 needs of students and we would like to work with the
15 Council on this critical issue. We have concerns
16 about Intro 869 requiring the proposed Task Force to
17 review and make recommendations for responding to
18 students experiencing a mental health crisis. Uhm
19 again this preview is overly broad and we worry that
20 it will result in an increased law enforcement
21 instead of a medical and mental health response to
22 students with mental health needs. Last year, ASC
23 released a data brief outlining the significant
24 consequences of a police response to students in
25 emotional distress. Uhm we found that NYPD
interventions in schools between July 2016 and June

3 2017 included 2,702 incidents involving students in
4 emotional distress sent to the hospital for
5 psychiatric evaluation, sometimes using handcuffs on
6 children as young as 5 years old. This reliance on
7 law enforcement to address students in emotional
8 crisis in schools has far reaching consequences for
9 students, particularly students of disability and
10 students of color were often disproportionately
11 policed in schools. Instead of a policing approach,
12 mental health professionals with appropriate training
13 and skills are fast positioned to assess and address
14 the needs of these students. We are deeply concerned
15 with the inclusion of these protocols in the current
16 proposed Task Force and that they will
17 unintentionally lead to further police response to
18 students in emotional distress. Uhm finally we just
19 want to say that we support Resolution 514 calling
20 for more guidance counselor and social workers in
21 school. Uhm this resolution is a crucial first step
22 in adding more clinically trained staff members to
23 support students and prevent school emergencies and
24 moving toward a more restorative positive approach to
25 school safety. Thank you.

3 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Thank you for
4 your testimony.

5 ASHLEY SAWYER: Good, good afternoon, my
6 name is Ashley Sawyer, I am an attorney and I am the
7 Director of Policy for Girls for Gender Equity.

8 Girls for Gender Equity has been around for 17 years
9 and we are committed to uplifting the voices of trans

10 girls and gender nonconforming young people of color
11 in New York City and growing nationally and over the

12 past few years we have done uhm extensive work with

13 young people directly including a report that uhm we

14 have collected with over 100 young people who are

15 students at New York City Public Schools and those

16 students shared with us their experiences, what they

17 want to see happen, the changes that they would like

18 to see made and I want to first emphasize that

19 overwhelmingly the students, the young people who are

20 attending the schools that we are talking about today

21 have said again and again they want more counselors,

22 they want more trained social workers and at GGE we

23 want to also emphasize that those counselors and

24 cul.. and social workers should be culturally

25 competent. They should have anti-racist analysis,

they should be gender responsive, they should be able

3 to interact with queer and trans young people and do
4 so in a way that is affirming and supportive. Those
5 are the people who deserve to be in front of our
6 children, not law enforcement. Earlier today we
7 heard some testimony from the school safety where
8 they explained that there were 1,100 some odd arrests
9 of young people in New York City Schools. As an
10 attorney, I represented some of those young people in
11 Summons Court and my focus has historically been
12 representing young people. I have stood next to a
13 young person who was in court, out of school because
14 of marijuana and I also watched a video from a school
15 suspension hearing of a young queer black young
16 person being held by five school safety agents and
17 I've shared that story with this body before because
18 it's so horrifying and it's interesting to know that
19 if this young person had been getting the support
20 that she deserves would this have happened and we
21 also understand that I heard a Council Member earlier
22 ask question about how many of these were for
23 marijuana. This young person was arrested because of
24 a small amount of marijuana and playing basketball
25 and partly because she was queer and black and people
did not like to see the way that she looked and five

3 school safety agents, I watched the video of them
4 assaulting her. This isn't something that happened
5 years ago, this happened very recently and so as I am
6 shifting to the systemic policy work I share that
7 antidote to just remind you that these are real human
8 lives, real young people who are affected when we
9 bring law enforcement into their schools. The
10 arrests that were shared, we learned that over 1,000
11 of them were done by patrol officers, 200 something
12 were done by School Safety Agents but 1,000 some odd
13 patrol officers came into our schools and took
14 students out in handcuffs. I have also been on the
15 phone with schools and principals as they beg me to
16 explain to them how they could protect a student who
17 is being hunted by the Warrant Squad in their school
18 in Brooklyn. So we have to ask ourselves where are
19 our values? And the resources indicate that our
20 values are not with educators, our values are with
21 law enforcement. The millions that we are spending
22 for School Safety Agents are enormous in comparison
23 to the paltry amounts that we are spending on
24 guidance counselors. We came here to testify in
25 support of Resolution 0514 because we know that this
is one young people have asked us for. Young people

3 did not ask for School Safety Agents to be further
4 integrated in their schools. I haven't heard one
5 young person testify to that and I just want to make
6 sure that this body is centering the voices of young
7 people and offering their expertise in your decision
8 making. GGE is eager to continue this conversation
9 with you all and think about the ways that we can be
10 supporting girls and gender nonconforming young
11 people in the ways that we can be centering their
12 voices and be the support that they have been
13 desperately asking for. Thank you.

14 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Thank you for
15 your testimony.

16 CHARLOTTE POPE: Uhm good evening, my
17 name is Charlotte Pope, I'm with the Children's
18 Defense Fund of New York. We are also members of the
19 Dignity in Schools Campaign and we agree with not
20 pursuing the Task Force for the reasons already
21 explained by others. Uhm we support Resolution 514
22 and efforts to make full time counselors more
23 accessible and promote a conversation with students
24 in school communities about what they actually want
25 and need. We ask that the city use this movement
forward to foster a pathway to employment for New

3 York Public School students who are trained and
4 prepared to work at guidance counselor in their home
5 communities and schools. With this resolution in
6 mind, we want to raise that the NYPD School Safety
7 Division Budget was adjusted and grew to over \$306
8 million for the last fiscal year, the largest it has
9 ever been and over \$19 million more expenses than
10 what was initially adopted in 2017 and still the
11 scope of police interventions in schools goes far
12 beyond this divisions funding which was mentioned.
13 We are also concerned about the potential resurgence
14 of zero tolerance responses to student threats of
15 violence from January 1 to July 31 of 2017. There
16 were three school based arrests of students charged
17 with terrorism while during the same period in 2018
18 there were 23 arrests. This is a massive increase in
19 arrests for this charge while overall there was a 6-
20 1/2% decrease in the use of arrests year to year.
21 This raises significant concerns about the process of
22 assessing threats and the ways in which exclusionary
23 discipline and policing practices are being relied
24 upon are also raising other questions about
25 surveillance and monitoring of young people in and
out of school. We oppose expanding the neighborhood

3 policing model to schools. This approach will not
4 remedy the conditions that lead to conflict or
5 violence but rather will bury the more systemic
6 problems and push young people out of school,
7 community policing will extend police presence and
8 surveillance deeper into everyday student life and
9 further treat what are interpersonal and community
10 concerns as police matters to be responded to with
11 the tools of policing like what we see reported
12 through the Council of Student Safety Act and use of
13 forced handcuffs and restraints arrests and criminal
14 court summons. It is our hope that the Council will
15 continue to emphasize the value of sustainable
16 investment and restorative justice in schools and end
17 the persistent disparity facing New York students. I
18 also wanted to touch on the Student Safety Act that
19 while it does not report every school and their use
20 of metal detectors for every police intervention in
21 school it lists the school site and a description of
22 whether they have full time unannounced and
23 nonscanning so that list does in fact exist while
24 it's a bit flappy, it is there and it is public so
25 thank you.

CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Thank you.

3 KATRINA FELDCAMP: Good evening, my name
4 is Katrina Feldcamp, I am here from Bronx Legal
5 Services where I am an Equal Justice Works Fellow
6 sponsored by Arnold and Porter Foundation. Our
7 education attorneys represent hundreds of New York
8 City students with disabilities and that includes
9 hundreds of students with behavioral and emotional
10 disorders that are rooted in trauma and those are
11 disproportionately students from communities of
12 color. So I am here to speak to you about a school
13 staffed with social workers, how that type of school
14 makes uhm school safer for all of our students. So
15 many of our clients disabilities are rooted in
16 trauma, also known as Adverse Childhood Experiences
17 like exposure to death, violence, poverty, systemic
18 racism and discrimination, uncertainty about access
19 to basic necessities like food and housing and family
20 disruptions related to deportation, incarceration and
21 the foster care system. And trauma related
22 disabilities are especially prevalent in the
23 neighborhoods that we serve which are neighborhoods
24 with high rates of poverty and crime. Now recent
25 studies from just last year shows that we can reverse
the effects of adverse childhood experiences if we

3 provide proper support to our students. Our schools
4 can and should help with that because students with
5 disabilities are entitled to appropriate support
6 under state, local and federal law. Social workers
7 are best equipped to provide that support. Trauma
8 related disabilities can manifest as aggressive,
9 defiant, withdrawn, perfectionist, hyperactive and
10 even impulsive in a classroom environment. But
11 social workers receive intensive training and can
12 respond to those challenges with trauma informed
13 crisis intervention. When social workers respond to
14 our client's behavioral crises they get the care that
15 they need. Our schools employ 5,000 School Safety
16 Agents and less than 1,300 social workers. So
17 unfortunately this means that when our clients have
18 behavioral incidents, officers are much more likely
19 than social workers to respond to those incidents.
20 We applaud the de-escalation training that officers
21 have received and we participated in that but that
22 training falls short and when it does our clients are
23 cuffed, arrested, suspended, EMSed and re-traumatized
24 in the process instead of getting the support that
25 they need and they are entitled to under the law. So
we urge you as you are considering how to make

3 schools safer to consider how to make them safer for
4 all of our students including and especially those
5 who have been exposed to trauma. Now separately I
6 believe the committee asked for numbers, about the
7 number of EMS removals that happened last year, as
8 you may know our office was involved in a settlement
9 with the Department of Education through which we
10 received those numbers and I am happy to share them
11 with you now. So the DOE reported that in the fall
12 of 2017, that semester there were a total of 688
13 calls, uhm and 540 transports and then in the spring
14 of 2018 there were 1021 calls and 841 transports and
15 if I may continue. We are concerned that those
16 numbers are unreported because the numbers that we
17 received from the fire department along the same
18 statistic were more than double uhm so FDNY reported
19 that in the fall of 2017 school sites had 1495 calls
20 and 1225 transports. During the spring semester 2654
21 calls and 2136 transports so we are concerned about
22 that transparency and we would seek the City
23 Council's help in achieving that transparency. We
24 would also be happy to share that data with you in
25 written form later on. Thank you for your time.

3 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Thank you for
4 that information. We certainly will look at the
5 Legislative, using our Legislative powers to
6 certainly make sure that that is transparent.

7 CHAIR MARK TREYGER: Yeah I just want to
8 thank all the advocates here for your powerful
9 testimony, for your outstanding advocacy on behalf of
10 our children and first and foremost everything that
11 you have talked about is how students will get re-
12 traumatized all over again, something that they might
13 be experiencing outside of school is just all
14 happening all over again and their needs are not
15 being address inside the school. But I want to add
16 something in addition. First and foremost the well-
17 being of our students and their safety is front and
18 center and that is most important precious thing.

19 But I one thing that I want to add as a former
20 teacher is that it also has a reverberating effect on
21 retaining educators in these schools as well. There
22 is a, there is an impact on retaining teachers,
23 particularly seasoned experienced teachers if they
24 see this happening over and over again and the needs
25 of their students not being met and if they are
referring them to get their needs addressed and no

3 one is doing anything most likely they are going to
4 go to the open market and transfer and leave and
5 these are the students that needs seasoned
6 experienced educators. I know for a fact that there
7 were schools that are in high need areas that have
8 very, very much a high teacher turn over. So even
9 though first and foremost the needs of our kids are
10 front and center but seasoned educators also help
11 address some of those needs as well. I just wanted
12 to kind of add that to the conversation and thank you
13 so much all for your excellent work on behalf of
14 children.

15 CHAIR DONOVAN RICHARDS: Thank you. I
16 will call the next panel, uhm Matthew Biston from
17 Urban Youth Collaborative, Andrea Cologne, Jessica
18 Garcia, Sara Gonzalez and Maybelline Navarro. (long
19 pause). If your name was called, please come up, if
20 you have copies of your statement just give it to us,
21 give it to us and we will. So whoever would like to
22 go first.

23 ANDREA COLOGNE: Good afternoon my name
24 is Andrea Cologne, I recently graduated Rockaway Park
25 High School and I am now attending Brew College. I
am the community engagement organizer for the

3 Rockaway Task Force and I am also here representing
4 the Urban Youth Collaborative. Uhm there is an
5 institution in this city that profits off of locking
6 up young who look just like me, black and latinx, and
7 students with disabilities are criminalized for
8 normal adaptive young behavior or incidents that
9 white students are able to sit down with school
10 administrators, guidance counselors and principals,
11 black and latinx youth are sent to the criminal legal
12 system. NYPD officers issued a total of 900 summons
13 sending children 92% of whom were latinx into the
14 criminal legal system. Black and latinx students are
15 nearly 90% of all students arrested, 90% of juvenile
16 reports, 94% of mitigated incidents where handcuffs
17 were used and 95% of child in crisis incidents where
18 handcuffs were used. Uhm the system is one that
19 invests in putting metal detectors, School Safety
20 Agents, precinct officers and I even saw State
21 Troopers once in my school. They roam our halls like
22 they belong to them, in the morning you hand in your
23 phone to the Dean, swipe your ID, put your bag
24 through the x-ray scanner, walk through the metal
25 detector and pick up your bag and if the metal
detector went off you would be wanded and patted

3 down. Being wanded and patted down for the bobby
4 pins securing my ponytail and having lip gloss in my
5 pocket and this is not what safety looks like. I
6 left school early for an internship program last year
7 so I didn't have to hand my phone in. At least once
8 a week I got to class 10 minutes late trying to
9 remind the School Safety Agents that I am allowed to
10 bring in my phone. One day leaving school, I was
11 stopped by precinct officers asking me where I am
12 going? I offered to show them my schedule which
13 shows that I leave early but instead they asked for
14 my mother's information and ID. Last year, I was
15 putting up flyers for a meeting that was coming up.
16 I asked my Assistant Principal for permission and
17 then for tape and scissors. While putting them up, a
18 School Safety Agent pushed the door that I was
19 putting the flyer on, startling me and making me drop
20 my things. He proceeds to yell at me asking me where
21 I got the scissors from, why did I have them and that
22 I needed to hand them into him. After three minutes
23 of back and forth, he let me continue and I was doing
24 absolutely nothing wrong. A few weeks later, a group
25 of boys were fighting in the hallway I went out to
see what was going on. The School Safety Agents were

3 trying to hold them back one teacher choke slammed
4 one of the students to the floor, seconds later the
5 Dean ordered that they be handcuffed and then the
6 assistant principal, assistant principal called the
7 police saying that another, that anyone who was still
8 outside in the hallway when the police arrived would
9 be arrested and minutes later police officers came
10 down the hall holding their guns on their waist and
11 all the boys were arrested, a few of them never
12 returned to school. Every student deserves to attend
13 school feeling safe and supported and that's not
14 something that I received. I cannot begin to explain
15 the effects of being policed every day on a young
16 person of color. It is traumatizing it takes away
17 from class time and puts you in a bad mood, not
18 allowing you to focus in class. As students, we come
19 to learn, police in schools does not make many
20 students of color feel safe, in fact, it is quite the
21 opposite. We deserve to feel supported, not arrested
22 and given summons. Last spring when Mayor de Blasio
23 held a town hall to hear from students about how we
24 could feel safe and supported in schools, he seemed
25 shocked that so many students of color expressed not
feeling safe because of the presence of NYPD School

3 Safety Agents, patrol officers, metal detectors and
4 scanners. He shouldn't be shocked. For decades,
5 black and latinx students have been protesting the
6 presence of police in our schools and being police in
7 and around our schools. The data in New York City is
8 clear. What's not clear is when our, when our
9 elected officials are going to be willing to listen
10 to us. On the morning of my graduation I walked in
11 cheerfully ready to close up this chapter of my life,
12 no longer being police in criminalized in my school
13 only to be told by an SSA Agent that I had to go
14 through scanning. Uhm so here I was on my very last
15 day standing in my cap and gown baffled as to why
16 they were making me do this. Thankfully the Sargent
17 uhm came in and said that I didn't have to go through
18 scanning uhm but there are so many amazing
19 alternatives that are effective in getting to the
20 root cause of incidents, like you said restorative
21 justice and all you have to do is stop allowing the
22 young students of color in what is suppose to be this
23 diverse sanctuary city to have our lives in the hands
24 of a judge in a court before we go to the bathroom
25 without asking. So now is the time to show leadership
and end, and end the use of arrests and summons in

3 our schools, as young people of color we are telling
4 you how detrimental this is to our lives. School
5 should be a safe and supportive space, not a pipeline
6 to the criminal justice system. Thank you.

7 CHAIRMAN DONOVAN RICHARDS: Thank you my
8 constituent. Thank you for being here.

9 MATTHEW BISTON: I'm not used to mics by
10 the way.

11 CHAIRMAN DONOVAN RICHARDS: Get used to
12 them.

13 MATTHEW BISTON: Alright uhm good
14 afternoon everyone. It's working, yes. Uhm good
15 afternoon everyone my name is Matthew J. Biston a
16 student residing in Brooklyn, New York representing
17 Futures of Tomorrow and Urban Youth Collaborative.
18 Everyone understands school safety is being defined
19 through policing and punitive measures toward
20 students. As a student of color currently attending
21 a school in low income community the first face that
22 I am met with is the SSA, as my backpack is going
23 through scanning while I am to avoid my person of
24 anything that can set off the metal detectors. Uhm
25 the constant routine of enforcement is not what makes
youth feel safe. I believe the aven.. an avenue of

3 support in the form of education through guidance
4 counselors and in conjunction with social workers and
5 college access programs will provide students with a
6 sure feeling of safety. My guidance counselor has a
7 workload of 300+ students and 100 of which are
8 currently seniors. The large workload for, that's a
9 large workload for any one person to handle.

10 Unfortunately my first real interaction with my
11 guidance counselor was after I had a car accident
12 where I was unable to attend school for two months.

13 Uhm through that interaction I was able to receive
14 real academic support in the terms of my education
15 and connecting within my school community and
16 learning environment. I know that students across

17 the city unfortunately do not have the same
18 opportunity to recover when it comes to their

19 personal struggles interfering with the academic
20 career and then it's still a challenge for guidance

21 counselors to assess every single student's situation
22 accordingly. As it stands now the students to

23 counselor ratio is 407:1. The numbers is

24 unfortunately unhealthily low and doesn't allow the
25 guidance counselors to efficiently assess and address

students individually and academic needs. After

3 receiving the support after my accident, that was the
4 first time I truly felt welcomed into my school
5 environment. The funding, the funding allocated for
6 these practices are not enough to foster safe
7 environments for me or any other students within my
8 school that look like me. We need to change the
9 ratio to students to guidance counselors from 407 to
10 possibly 100 to 1 or smaller than that and to
11 prioritize our social and emotional well-being and
12 not the criminalization of black and brown youth. Oh
13 I guess.

14 CHAIRMAN DONOVAN RICHARDS: Keep going.

15 MATTHEW BISTON: I don't know with that
16 being the end of my stand I would like to take a
17 moment in time to thank Council Member Mark Treyger
18 for introducing the guidance counselor resolution and
19 you can see from my testimony my guidance counselor
20 what makes all the difference during my accident I
21 really wish that every single student who
22 unfortunately has something to separate them from
23 education can have a similar opportunity. Thank you.

24 CHAIRMAN DONOVAN RICHARDS: Thank you.

25 MAYBELLINE NAVARRO: Good afternoon, my
name is Maybelline. I am a member of Make the Road

3 New York Urban Youth Collaborative, a freshman at
4 City College and a recent graduate from Bushwick
5 Campus. During my earlier years of high school I saw
6 that as students many of us lack strong support
7 systems and harm was addressed harshly whether it was
8 in conflicts or fights in our friendships or
9 relationships with staff. It wasn't until my senior
10 year when Make the Road was able to hire a
11 restorative justice coordinator for my campus that I
12 began to see the practice of restorative justice
13 being implemented. Our RJ coordinators role was to
14 create a culture of respect and accountability, the
15 community anchored and shared values, assist in
16 student re-integration to act as a legal liaison for
17 students who were suspended and was the person that
18 many students grew to rely on. Along with this I was
19 one of the eight students hired to assist our RJ
20 coordinator as a restorative justice youth
21 ambassador. Our role was to create community
22 building circles to create spaces where our peers can
23 talk about conflict that has affected us in our
24 schools, promote healthy relationships and
25 communication, communications, sorry. Through many
conversations I have witnessed shifts in student

3 interactions. I would hear stories and conversations
4 or see in person youth using what they use in RJ
5 circles spreading the lessons, building healthier
6 relationships within one another and de-escalating
7 and/or stopping fights before they happen. It was
8 clear to me that restorative justice works. Just last
9 year, the four schools in my campus saw a decrease in
10 suspensions of over 50%. The practice connects
11 youth, addresses our needs, it provides us with the
12 tools to build healthier relationship with each
13 other. It is a support system that teaches us to be
14 better support systems for each other. The
15 implementation of restorative justice in all New York
16 City Schools is imperative. When we talk about
17 safety, RJ should be part of the conversation. And
18 let me be clear, when talking about safety I should
19 also highlight that not once did I mention School
20 Safety Agents as a means to supports students. In no
21 way do I see SSAs as individuals who can simply be
22 trained in restorative justice where an effectively
23 implement its practices. I know I am one of many
24 youth who don't see them as a support system and we
25 don't intend to because we know the intention of
policing in schools is to police us. Divestments

3 need to be made from School Safety Agents and should
4 be allocated to the hiring of social workers, RJ
5 coordinators, guidance counselors, educators, school
6 staff and trained professionals who can be build
7 supportive relationships with. In fact, Councilman
8 Treyger is proposing a Resolution that aims to
9 provide one guidance counselor and one social worker
10 to every 250 students. This is something that youth
11 from UIC have been saying that we need for years.
12 There is currently more than 5,000 SSAs in our
13 schools and less than 3,000 guidance counselors. We
14 thank Councilman Treyger for introducing an important
15 resolution that will be a step forward. The city
16 needs to support our schools and hire people who
17 contributing to building community, not in people who
18 issue arrests and summons that take students out of
19 school. Thank you.

20 CHAIRMAN DONOVAN RICHARDS: Thank you.

21 JESSICA GARCIA: Uhm hi. My name is
22 Jessica Garcia, I am a Youth Leader for Make the Road
23 and an Urban Youth Collaborative. Mental Health
24 Service workers play a very important role to support
25 students in school. Almost two years ago, my mom and
me were separated like many immigrant families but we

3 were ripped apart by our hateful immigration system.

4 This not only affected me but it affected my whole

5 family and over time I began to show the school

6 because to this day it isn't an easy thing to cope

7 with. My guidance counselor was overwhelmed and I

8 didn't receive the support that I needed to continue.

9 Students of color of the city go through trauma in

10 our homes, in our streets and in our schools. New

11 York City must design a network of mental health

12 services to support students a spectrum of mental

13 health needs. This city calls itself a sanctuary

14 city but students like me are being ripped apart from

15 their parents and have no one to talk to. It is not

16 acceptable that School Safety Agents are the ones

17 that respond to young folk having mental health

18 crisis and putting them in handcuffs because of it.

19 In just one year, the NYPD reported intervening

20 during a child in crisis incident or emotional crisis

21 3,574 times and more than 1,300 students were sent to

22 an emergency room for an emotional or psychological

23 need. 95% of the young people in crisis were

24 students of color and 97% of the students who NYPD

25 reported handcuffing during these incidents were

students of color. This was one of the most frequent

3 types of police activity in schools. Instead of
4 focusing on responding to mental health needs with
5 police, mental health needs should be addressed with
6 mental health workers. As part of our young people's
7 school justice agenda, we have proposed a mental
8 health plan. It requires the city to establish
9 school relationships and hospital based clinics. In
10 addition, call in center staffs have experienced
11 mental health clinicians, wait, I'm sorry, in
12 addition college center staffs have experienced
13 mental health clinicians should be established to
14 field calls from schools. They can help schools
15 understand a student during mental health crisis and
16 reduce the overuse of emergency rooms. School
17 response teams, each working with four schools should
18 work with students and also help the school's
19 officials learn how to respond better to mental
20 health needs. Over a three year time frame, the
21 whole school involved in this continuum should be
22 trained in collaborative problem solving. Full time
23 school based behavioral health consultants should be
24 hired to work with five schools. Finally the
25 Department of Education to work with community
organizers to ensure that there is a reboast, robust

3 data collection and program collection for this
4 continuum. Investing in a mental health plan is a
5 real safety. We know our experiences and research
6 those, investing more money in increasing security
7 plans and are about metal detectors and police
8 officers is not effective. Addressing the mental
9 health needs of young people through comprehensive
10 mental health supports has been proven to increase
11 school safety. We must assess the mental health
12 service needs in our school rather than continue the
13 police and the mental health in NYPD. We don't need.
14 Okay, we don't need a new Task Force to tell us what
15 will make school safe, we need, we need to listen to
16 the young people. I would also want to thank
17 Councilman Treyger for introducing the Guidance
18 Counselor's Resolution. Thank you for listening to us
19 and taking action. Thank you.

20 CHAIRMAN DONOVAN RICHARDS: Thank you all
21 for your testimony. Thank you for coming out and
22 being civically engaged, this is impressive. I would
23 have never imagined coming to a public hearing when I
24 was in high school. So congratulations on taking a
25 big step in ... there is more, next, I'm sorry. I

3 didn't mean to end it, but I want to thank you all
4 for your testimony.

5 BRIAN AGU: Uhm good afternoon my name
6 is, that's fine, my name is Brian Agu. I'm a member
7 at Sisters and Brothers United and the Urban Youth
8 Collaborative. I go to the high school for Energy
9 and Technology in the Bronx. I am here today because
10 when it comes to school safety, the Neighborhood
11 Policing and School's Initiative in the Bronx is not
12 what us students have been asking for. Research has
13 found that presence, presence in police criminalizes
14 typical youthful behavior such as disorderly conduct
15 and other incidents that should be handled by school
16 staff not the police. As someone who has personally
17 fell victim to the criminalization of normal behavior
18 as simply as walking into school late, I can very, I
19 can say very confidently that increasing police
20 presence in our schools is just another excuse to
21 keep us young people of color in chains and cages and
22 it is no effective to create a safe and supportive
23 schools. Our coalition has been fighting for more
24 guidance counselors, social workers and restorative
25 justice for years and at every conversation that we
have held with elected officials we've heard that

3 we'd love to but it cost a lot of money and time but
4 instead of more but instead money is found for more
5 cops in schools easily. That is why, this is why we
6 are supporting Council Member Treyger's Resolution on
7 guidance counselors. We have to change our
8 priorities. \$400 million is already being spent
9 yearly on surveillance, policing and harsh
10 criminalization practices that do not support young
11 people. That is funding that could go a long way
12 toward increasing the number of guidance counselors.
13 We need to redirect that funding and increase our
14 investments in programs and supports that students
15 truly need to succeed such as guidance counselors,
16 social workers, college access programs including
17 summer rich programs and students success centers,
18 restorative justice, mental health support and
19 culturally responsive education. Aren't you tired of
20 not supporting those as well as, I'm sorry, I'm
21 really tired. Are you, aren't you tired of not
22 supporting us well enough because I am? In two
23 years, I would like to walk down my graduation aisle
24 feeling ready to embark on a journey towards my
25 career and not feel like I've just been released from
prison. The city has been promising to change the

3 MOU between Police and the Department of Education
4 for over three years. We were told that it would
5 limit interactions between police and schools and it
6 would take, it would make sure police were not
7 involved in the discipline issues. We can't be
8 talking about increasing police interactions when
9 black and brown students are still being pushed into
10 the criminal justice system from our schools. This
11 initiative is not only a cheap way to address the
12 real issues in our schools. It is just another form
13 of oppressive and punitive practices we students have
14 to deal with. Lastly, I want to take this
15 opportunity to thank the Councilman Treyger for
16 introducing the Guidance Counselor Resolution. These
17 are the kinds of solutions that truly make our
18 schools safer. We appreciate you take the time to
19 meet us and listening to the priorities we value.
20 Thank you.

21 CHAIRMAN DONOVAN RICHARDS: Okay.

22 SARA GONZALEZ: That's it, hello. Uhm my
23 name is Sara Gonzalez. And I am an organizer with
24 the Rockaway Youth Task Force and I am a member of
25 the Urban Youth Collaborative. I am also a junior at
Townson Harris High School. Increasing the number of

3 school counselors has been directly linked to a
4 reduction in fights, bullying and school infractions.
5 The presence of school counselors has been proven to
6 force our sense of belonging for young people and a
7 better relationship between schools, students and
8 staff. This is also actually a proven approach to
9 school safety. One study uhm revealed that the
10 additional funding for counselors reduces the
11 likelihood of disciplinary incidents such as weapon
12 related incidents and students suspensions. In
13 addition, students attending middle schools with
14 comprehensive counselor programs reported A) feeling
15 safer in their schools; B) better relationships
16 between students and teachers which was also
17 correlated with the feeling safer in their schools;
18 C) a greater satisfaction of students with the
19 education they were receiving; D) perception that one
20 indication was more relevant and important to one's
21 future and E) earning higher grades. A lower student
22 to counselor ratio decreases both the recurrence of
23 student disciplinary problems and the share of
24 students involving a disciplinary incident. These
25 findings were even more pronounced for students of
colors and students in poverty. If the ratio were

3 lowered, whenever there is a need for schedule change
4 there wouldn't be long lines and there would also be
5 a stronger and closer relationships between students
6 and guidance counselors which will make their jobs
7 more effective. I have personally benefited from my
8 schools amount of guidance counselor. In the last
9 year I was struggling with classes and failing some
10 of them and I was feeling really discouraged and
11 miserable at school and I was able to go get back on
12 track and every student deserves to attend a school
13 feeling safe and supported but my case is not the
14 case with a lot of students and another difference
15 between where you go to school and what experience
16 you have at school because I have gone from going to
17 middle school with in my community, uhm mostly
18 students of color to have metal detectors and only
19 one guidance counselor to now going to a school in a
20 different community with a vastly different
21 demographic where I am, my needs are being met and it
22 feels like I am one of the lucky ones but it
23 shouldn't be a matter of luck and you know for
24 decades black and latinx students have been
25 protesting the presence of police in their, in their
schools and you know that experience are really

3 traumatizing. And you know it is very clear, the
4 data, what is not clear is whether or like our
5 elected officials are listening to us. The
6 implementation of a minimum school to student ratio
7 uhm, will subsidize in schools reduced a fraction of
8 teachers reporting that the instruments for student's
9 misbehavior and reduce the infractions, the reporting
10 of students physically fighting each other or cutting
11 class, stealing and using drugs. In conclusion, it
12 is important to remember the unique and special role
13 that guidance counselors fill in our schools. You
14 know they are not college advisors, they are not
15 health service workers and they need the, they need
16 the extra resources to properly fill in the gaps that
17 currently exist in this service. We support
18 Councilman Treyger's resolution and we think it's a
19 great step in the right direction and I want to thank
20 you.

21 CHAIRMAN DONOVAN RICHARDS: Thank you,
22 you all for your testimony, thank you.

23 UNKNOWN: There's one more.

24 CHAIRMAN DONOVAN RICHARDS: Oh okay who
25 are you now? Okay I just want to make sure that we
are not duplicating.

3 KATHERINE TRENZY: Good afternoon
4 Chairperson Richards, Chairperson Treyger and members
5 of the Public Safety and Education Committee. Uhm my
6 name is Katherine Trenzy and I work with the Center
7 for Popular Democracy.

8 CHAIRMAN DONOVAN RICHARDS: You were on
9 the next panel by the way but okay got you early.
10 Okay.

11 KATHERINE TRENZY: Uhm the Center for
12 Popular Democracy and the Education curriculum
13 therein works in collaboration and solidarity with
14 our partners and allies across the country to
15 dismantle the School to Prison Pipeline and ensure
16 that all young people have access to safe and high
17 quality public schools. Last fall, the Urban Youth
18 Collaborative and the Center for Popular Democracy
19 released a policy brief, the young people's vision
20 for safe, support and inclusive schools. Uhm as you
21 heard the report recommendations were developed by
22 Youth Leaders who have spent years organizing to
23 transform their schools and their communities. In
24 response to calls to return to discriminative and
25 ineffective School Climate strategies young people
are advancing solutions that re-imagine safety and

3 reduce discrimination by prioritizing funding for
4 meeting their social, emotional and mental health
5 needs. The recommendations provided there in
6 dramatically increasing the number of guidance
7 counselors, providing comprehensive mental health
8 supports and infusing all schools with restorative
9 practices. Absent from this list are police,
10 security cameras, metal detectors and locked doors.
11 Each of these solutions supported by the experiences
12 of young people and also aca... extensive academic
13 students. For example, study after study shows that
14 lower student to counselor ratios reduced
15 disciplinary incidents in schools including ones
16 involving weapons and students and teachers report
17 feeling safer. As one of the young people mentioned,
18 the ratio of full time guidance counselors to
19 students last year was 1 to 407. As a point of
20 comparison the ratio of NYPD School Safety Division
21 personnel to students is 1 to 207. Our schools would
22 be safer in New York City drastically increases the
23 number of guidance counselors and social workers in
24 schools. For this reason, we support resolution 514
25 introduced by Council Member Treyger. The resolution
calls on the Department of Education to provide one

3 uhm one guidance counselor and social worker for
4 every 250 students and ensure that all schools have
5 at least one. The appr... this approach exemplified in
6 this resolution prioritizes supports rather than
7 punitive measures as a means to creating safe and
8 nurturing schools and the approach also called for by
9 young people. Another recommendation is infusing
10 restorative practices and you can see my written
11 testimony for more details there and finally young
12 people want mental health care. New York City must
13 implement a comprehensive mental health service
14 continuum to connect school based services with
15 community and hospital based care. Again please see
16 my written testimony for more details. Police, metal
17 detectors, security cameras and locked doors are not
18 on the list of programs to make safer and more
19 thriving schools. Proponents of school policing and
20 punitive disciplinary action often state student
21 safety as their primary justification for
22 implementing these new measures. Yet research has
23 found that there is no evidentiary support or the
24 proposition that police presence in schools create
25 safe learning communities. To the contrary, several
studies show that young people are no safer after

3 years of police punitive practices. I am just going
4 to wrap up really quickly and in addition to be
5 ineffective, policing in New York City Schools create
6 extreme racial disparities. Black girls are more
7 than 10 times more likely to be arrested in New York
8 City Schools for the same behavior as white peers.
9 Despite evidence that young people from different
10 races do not misbehave at significantly different
11 rates. As you have already heard, these racial
12 disparities persist through each type of policing
13 interactions. Finally these practices are incredibly
14 expensive. New York City spends over \$380 million a
15 year just on the NYPD force. This figure does not
16 even account for the millions of dollars spent on
17 metal detectors, security cameras and other forms of
18 security infrastructure or the court cost and law suits
19 for police abuse among other direct costs. It also
20 doesn't include the social costs of pushing young
21 people out of schools. Last year, UIC and CPD
22 released a report showing that each year New York
23 City School to Prison Pipeline incurs at least an
24 additional \$349 million in social costs which
25 includes \$108 in lost tax revenue. Imagine all of
the beneficial programs the city could implement in

3 our schools, if it was redirected all of that money
4 toward positive interventions. Why does the city
5 fail to have money for comprehensive mental health
6 care, fully staffing schools with guidance counselors
7 and social workers and thoroughly implementing
8 restorative practices yet it has hundreds of millions
9 of dollars every year for NYPD personnel in schools,
10 a criminal legal system to hear all the needless
11 cases brought against black and brown young people
12 and infuse our schools with surveillance equipment.
13 Our schools can and must move toward policies and
14 practices that help young people thrive. The Task
15 Force promotes today takes the exact opposite
16 approach to the demands of young people of color.
17 Uhm instead if increasing policing the city should
18 decrease it by ending the use of arrests and summons
19 and juvenile reports in schools and misdemeanors and
20 violations. In addition to increasing the policing
21 the bills today will only serve to further entrance
22 the prison like conditions in schools. Our school
23 community should not rely on ineffective practices,
24 policy and practices that create pervasive and
25 persistent racial disparities in schools. Please
listen to the young people here today.

3 CHAIRMAN DONOVAN RICHARDS: Thank you, we
4 are going to go to Chair Treyger for comments.

5 CHAIRMAN MARK TREYGER: Yes thank you co-
6 chair. I must say I, IE is one of the classes that I
7 used to teach was government and you all get an A+
8 and an A+ on presentation as well. Really, really
9 excellent work. Uhm I just want to quickly share,
10 I've shared this story before but some folks might
11 not have heard it and I want to share it with my co-
12 chair. One of the things that pushed me, uhm in
13 addition to being a former educator uhm to call for
14 more social workers and guidance counselors was in
15 preparation for my first hearing as Chair of
16 Education Committee, the first topic was renewal
17 schools and what better way to learn about renewals
18 but by visiting them and I went to go across the five
19 boroughs to visit many of them and this was
20 completely unscripted. I didn't, uhm Deputy
21 Chancellor I didn't tell the DOE which schools I was
22 visiting, they followed my social media afterwards
23 but I visited a school, I visited a school in Queens
24 that uhm really struck me. As part of being a
25 renewal school, you become a community school and
they add additional resources to your school to

3 provide wraparound services and better social
4 supports. I asked the principal, tell me what's
5 working, tell me what's not working, what's been a
6 big different maker and at that moment the
7 conversation shifted to the social worker who was
8 hired with the additional resources that came with
9 the community school program and this is a school of
10 about 500 students 80% Spanish speaking, many recent
11 immigrants. I wanted to not just meet with the
12 principal I wanted to meet with students, educators,
13 guidance counselors as well and the students began
14 speaking, again no script, just from the heart and
15 began saying that in their community they feel
16 traumatized by the hostility coming out of the
17 Federal Administration. They are afraid of seeing
18 authority figures in the street. They are afraid to
19 go buy ice cream, they are afraid to go to the store,
20 they are afraid to play soccer because if they
21 encounter a law enforcement official they are worried
22 what would happen to their families and to themselves
23 and so that had an impact on their attendance in the
24 school. Some of them were afraid to even go to
25 school and one of the measurements that the DOE uses
to see if schools are improving from their renewal

3 school status is attendance. And that is one of the
4 reasons why the school fell into the renewal school
5 status. But the school wisely hired a bilingual
6 social worker that spoke Spanish and English and one
7 of the first things she realized she had to do was to
8 become an advocate to inform them, first of all to
9 tell them that they are welcome in a climate where
10 many kids feel unwelcome and they feel traumatized,
11 she created a, a sanctuary in the school. So the, so
12 the first part of their day was to check in with her.
13 And she informed them of their rights. She became an
14 advocate and she helped navigate the bureaucracy of
15 many government agencies to fight for them and their
16 families and the conversation then shifted to the
17 Chapter Leader, the UFT Leader who is an English
18 teacher who said when we hire the social worker,
19 sooner afterwards attendance in my class picked up,
20 academic performance picked up and now the school
21 became a Rise school, which is the new DOE term that
22 it's improving. So that, that's what moved me. You
23 are absolutely correct that there are significant
24 needs that we have to address in our school system.
25 The school didn't need additional School Safety
Agents, they needed social workers, guidance

3 counselors, music programs, art programs, functioning
4 internet, that's what the school needed so I applaud
5 all of you for your courage and your powerful
6 testimony today. Thank you so much.

7 CHAIRMAN DONOVAN RICHARDS: Thank you,
8 Eunice Harris here, 32BJ. Okay no, okay. Alrighty
9 so I'm going to begin to wrap up and I will begin my
10 closing statements now and say thank you for coming
11 out. We certainly heard you loud and clear and I as
12 a Legislature you know I know I look nice, at least I
13 think I look nice with the tie but I am also reminded
14 of my experience as a high school student in New York
15 at Jamaica High School where we had to go through a
16 very similar experience walking into a dark
17 auditorium and being scanned and sometimes being held
18 up for class I think Andrea alluded to and uhm and
19 having that wand scanned over you so that, you, its,
20 your experience today I want you to know that it does
21 not go unheard but also it is my experience coming up
22 in a New York City School System which I
23 unfortunately had to leave because I almost failed
24 out of high school actually. I want to shout out my
25 guidance counselor at Jamaica High School, Sylvia
Harris, yes I still remember her name uhm because she

3 was instrumental and squeezing my head. No I'm
4 playing. She did squeeze a head, that's a joke that
5 we had every once in a while probably can't do that
6 nowadays uhm but you know she really took uhm a real
7 interest in seeing me succeed and I was one of those
8 students who had truancy issues. Yes I had to get a
9 piece of paper and walk around to the classroom and
10 get it signed by the teacher but she also helped me
11 to sort of navigate and, and move forward so I want
12 to shout her out. So I certainly understand the
13 importance of having guidance counselors and certain
14 understand that even in my journeys to school that it
15 wasn't necessarily the scanners that made it safe
16 because guess what, there were some big bad wolfs
17 waiting outside those doors uhm as you walked down
18 Jamaica Avenue and were escorted by the police
19 department to the bus, quite frankly. So I think
20 everything that you, you all said today is certainly
21 on point that yes school safety is a very delicate
22 balance because it is our job, your parents entrust
23 the City of New York when they drop you off at the
24 door, as a new father, I certainly understand that,
25 that you know when you drop your child off you don't
want to get that call, so we certainly have strides

3 to make to ensure that parents continue to feel safe
4 but also that balance of ensuring that the services
5 that many school such as Far Rockaway High School and
6 community schools, QYRT I want to shout out my
7 community school out in Far Rockaway because they are
8 doing some phenomenal work uhm when the principal
9 started graduation rates were somewhere around
10 hovering 52%, last year over 80% so it shows when a
11 wraparound services are happening that we can really
12 improve the school climate for young people such as
13 yourselves to then enable you to go on and be
14 productive. I have seen the graduation classes grow
15 each year, I am normally the guest speaker, I put a
16 lot of money there, so I guess that's why I get
17 invited sometimes but, but each year I certainly can
18 see the, the growth in each school and that's
19 indicative of counselors being available, services
20 being wrapped around the students but not only the
21 students, the families as well, being able to come
22 into the school and be provided services. Uhm so I
23 want to thank my colleagues certainly, (INAUDIBLE)
24 uhm for sponsoring the Bills because they are, they,
25 everybody has the same shared vision. We all want
safe schools, we all want you to go to school and get

3 the services uhm that you deserve as well. So we
4 have a lot of work to do. I am certainly in
5 agreement that young people should have a place at
6 the table so that is certainly that we will certainly
7 be talking to the sponsors of the Bills about as we
8 move forward and I want to thank in particular the
9 individuals who helped make this day happen, starting
10 to Daniel my Legislative Council, Casey Addison, our
11 Legislative Policy Analyst, uhm Zack Harris,
12 Financial Analysis with the Public Safety Community
13 and my Legislative Director Jordan Gibbons and I
14 especially want to thank everyone who came out to
15 testify today. I know my colleague is going to want
16 to close out but this is my closing statements. But
17 I want to thank you all for coming out today to voice
18 your, your opinion. It matters and it is not going
19 unnoticed and it will not be taken lightly and we
20 want to thank you for coming out and exercising your
21 democratic right to testify before us and share your
22 vision for the city, so we hope to make you proud and
23 we hope to follow up on a lot of the things that were
24 mentioned today but one thing is clear, that
25 restorative justice has to be the path that we have
to follow to make schools safe, truly safe around the

3 city and there is no Band-Aid that we could put on
4 that to fix it. So thank you for coming out. I'm
5 not going to close out, close, pass the mic over my
6 co-chair Mark Treyger.

7 CHAIRMAN MARK TREYGER: I will be very
8 brief, I said before, I've met my match in Chair
9 Richards. I, I, I ...

10 CHAIRMAN DONOVAN RICHARDS: That is an
11 honor by the way by this body.

12 CHAIRMAN MARK TREYGER: Uhm in addition
13 to the great public safety committee and staff I want
14 to thank the entire education committee and the
15 outstanding education committee staff that does
16 phenomenal work and thank all the advocates, the
17 students who come. I also want to note for the
18 record that yes from beginning to end Deputy
19 Chancellor Robinson stayed at this hearing.

20 CHAIRMAN DONOVAN RICHARDS: And that is
21 very unusual so you won me over halfway.

22 CHAIRMAN MARK TREYGER: That, that's,
23 that's, (laughter). I, I would say she has won me
24 over more than halfway. She's the ... he's the
25 Education Chair so I, I really thank you Deputy
Chancellor. It speaks volumes it means a lot to this

3 committee. It means a lot to our young people, to
4 the Council, uhm thank you very much for your
5 leadership I know we have more work to do and I look
6 forward for using to working together. Now I will
7 just close by saying this. When I was a teacher I
8 heard this closer, now as the chair of the committee
9 I continue to hear this, it's always about the kids,
10 it's about the kids, well we need to listen to the
11 kids. This is all about you. We need to hear from
12 you. We are hearing from you. We need to act upon
13 what we are hearing from you as well. Thank you very
14 much.

15 CHAIRMAN DONOVAN RICHARDS: Thank you so
16 much and I will just friendly call them young adults
17 because none of them probably think they are kids but
18 they are kids in our eyes, I want you to remember
19 that, in your parents eyes. But uhm thank you all
20 for coming out. Anyone else want to testify.
21 Alright, seeing none this hearing is now concluded.

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date October 14, 2018