

COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION

1

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES
OF THE

COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND
WORKER PROTECTION

----- X

Thursday, October 30, 2025

Start: 10:17 A.M.

Recess: 12:06 P.M.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Hon. Julie Menin, Chair

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Shaun Abreu
Gale A. Brewer
Amanda Farias
Shekar Krishnan
Chi A. Ossé
Julie Won

Other Council Members Attending: Ayala

COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION
A P P E A R A N C E S

Manny Pastreich,
President, SEIU 32BJ, Speaking in favor of the
Aland Etienne Safety and Security Act
(Introduction Number 1391)

Rachelle Paoli,
Partner of Aland Etienne, speaking in favor of
the Aland Etienne Safety and Security Act
(Introduction Number 1391)

Ibrahim Sene,
New York City Security Guard, speaking in favor
of the Aland Etienne Safety and Security Act
(Introduction Number 1391)

Clarissa Baynes,
New York City Security Officer, speaking in favor
of the Aland Etienne Safety and Security Act
(Introduction Number 1391)

Dennis Fan,
Associate Clinical Professor of Law at Columbia
Law School

Cassandra Gomez,
Senior Staff Attorney at National Employment Law
Project (NELP)

LiJia Gong,
Managing Director of Legal and Policy at Local
Progress Impact Lab

Stephen Amitay,
Executive Director of the National Association of
Security Companies (NASCO)

Felix Malave,
New York City Security Officer, speaking in favor
of the Aland Etienne Safety and Security Act
(Introduction Number 1391)

COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION
A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Niki Franzitta,
Vice President of Member Relations and
Development of the Hotel Association of New York
City

Trevina Garrel,
Adjunct Professor of Criminal and Social Justice
at Monroe University; Training Instructor at the
32BJ Thomas Shortman Training Center

Ken Prashad,
Senior Director of Compliance and Operations at
A&H Security Services

Shane Mitchell,
Deputy Political Director for the Hotel and
Gaming Trades Council (HDC)

Raven Skinner,
New York City Security Officer speaking in favor
of the Aland Etienne Safety and Security Act
(Introduction Number 1391)

Matilda Radinson,
New York City Security Officer speaking in favor
of the Aland Etienne Safety and Security Act
(Introduction Number 1391)

Percy Guity,
New York City Security Officer speaking in favor
of the Aland Etienne Safety and Security Act
(Introduction Number 1391)

Badrun Nahar, New York City Security Officer,
speaking in favor of the Aland Etienne Safety and
Security Act (Introduction Number 1391)

Lauren Melodia,
Economist at New School Center for New York City
Affairs

COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION
A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Enrique Lopezlira,
Director of the Low-Wage Work Program at the
University of California, Berkeley Labor Center

Karla Walter,
Senior Fellow at the Center for American Progress

Theodore Moore,
Executive Director at ALIGN: The Alliance for a
Greater New York and Raise Up New York Coalition

Mohamed Attia,
Managing Director of Street Vendor Project

Deacon Calvin Baker,
Street Vendor Advocate

Guadalupe Sosa,
Street Vendor Advocate

Cleotilde (phonetic), (via Translator)
Street Vendor Advocate

Xochitl Campos (via Translator)
Street Vendor Advocate

Along Yen (via Translator)
Street Vendor Advocate

Christopher Leon Johnson,
Self

Dayton Nesbit,
New York City Security Officer speaking in favor
of the Aland Etienne Safety and Security Act
(Introduction Number 1391)

Mahmoud Zaed,
Street Vendor Advocate

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 5

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: (UN-MIC'D) (INAUDIBLE)

3 Also, folks, just a quick reminder, once again, do
4 not approach the dais at any point, and if you have
5 any electronic devices or cell phones, please take
6 the time to silence them at this time. Thank you.

7 (PAUSE)

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good morning, good
9 morning. Welcome to the New York City Council hearing
10 on the Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection.
11 At this time, please turn off the electronics and
12 approach your dais. I repeat, please do not approach
13 the dais. If you are signing up to testify or have
14 any other questions or concerns, please contact the
15 Sergeant at Arms. Thank you for your cooperation,
16 Chair Menin, and you may begin.

17 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: [GAVEL] Good morning,
18 my name is Julie Menin, and I'm Chair of the
19 Committee on Consumer and Worker Protection, and I
20 really want to welcome everyone today to this very
21 important hearing on Introduction Number 1391 in
22 relation to the establishment of compensation and
23 training standards for security guards—sponsored by
24 Speaker Adams and Council Member Hudson.

25

2 New York City has a unique threat
3 landscape due to its population density, its high
4 traffic, and its global profile. Security guards play
5 an absolutely critical role as a first line of
6 defense against these threats in many of our public
7 spaces. As active shooter incidents become,
8 unfortunately, increasingly frequent, the job of
9 security officers is both more important and more
10 dangerous than ever.

11 On July 28th, unarmed security guard
12 Aland Etienne was killed in a shooting at a Midtown
13 office building while he was working. I know that we
14 have some of his family members here, and I want to
15 ask that we observe a moment of silence for him and
16 the other victims of the shooting.

17 ALL: [MOMENT OF SILENCE OBSERVED]

18 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you.

19 In this context of heightened risk, it is
20 so important that security guards be consistent and
21 reliable. However, employee turnover in the New York
22 City security industry has risen over time and is
23 much higher than in the private sector generally.

24 In addition to retaining experienced
25 security personnel, it is vital that security guards

in New York City are properly trained to respond to evolving threats and the evolving landscape that exists vis-à-vis security. Without adequate training, security guards may lack the judgment needed to make critical decisions.

Introduction Number 1391 would direct the Department of Consumer and Worker Protection to establish and enforce a minimum wage, paid sick leave, paid vacation leave, benefits, and training requirements for security guards and security guard employers. It would establish a Department of Security and a Security guard advocate, right within DCWP, to educate security guard employers and workers about their obligations and their rights. It would develop a system to assist covered security guards in submitting complaints regarding potential violations. It would track the status and outcome of such complaints and coordinate with appropriate stakeholders regarding issues affecting the security workforce.

This is simply the right thing to do. And what's so exciting about this legislation is that it would be a game changer to make sure that security guards are getting the benefits, the pay, and the

2 protection that they deserve, being on the front
3 lines throughout New York City.

4 So I can't tell you how personally
5 excited I am about this bill and how committed I am
6 to it. I want to thank Speaker Adams for championing
7 this vital legislation. We are going to be joined
8 shortly by the Deputy Speaker, and she'll make
9 comments on behalf of the Speaker.

10 I want to now read a statement from my
11 colleague, Council Member Nurse, who couldn't be here
12 today. She wanted to say that she's a proud supporter
13 of this bill, and she said that it carries deep
14 meaning for her. She mentions that Aland Etienne was
15 her constituent, a dedicated security officer who
16 lost his life protecting others at 345 Park Avenue.
17 "He was a kind and devoted man who took great pride
18 in his work and was deeply respected by everyone who
19 knew him. I want to thank Aland's family, who have
20 shown extraordinary courage in turning tragedy into
21 advocacy. Their efforts are helping to ensure that
22 his legacy leads to real change. Security officers
23 are an essential part of New York City's Public
24 Safety Network, guarding schools, hospitals, offices,
25 and transit hubs." And so that is a statement from

2 Council Member Narcisse (sic) (***Transcriptionist**

3 **Note: Council Member Nurse?**)

4 I also want to say that I find it
5 shocking and appalling that no one from the
6 Administration is here. We have five empty chairs
7 right here. We are here to honor Aland's life, and
8 there can be no better testament to honor his life
9 than to pass this vital piece of legislation to
10 protect our security guards. And the fact that the
11 Administration does not have the decency and the
12 compassion to even show up is absolutely
13 unconscionable.

14 ALL: (APPLAUSE)

15 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: So, since we have the
16 five empty chairs and no one from the Administration,
17 I'm now going to turn to the very important public
18 testimony. We can't wait to hear from all of you. I'm
19 really excited about the turnout that happened on
20 this rainy day. And so we're very excited to have
21 this dialogue with you. So I'm now going to commence
22 the public hearing. [GAVEL]

23 I want to remind members of the public
24 that this is a formal government proceeding and that
25 decorum shall be observed at all times. As such,

members of the public need to remain silent at all times.

The witness table is reserved for people who wish to testify. No video recording or photography is allowed from the witness table.

Further, members of the public may not present audio or video recordings as testimony, but they may submit transcripts of such recordings to the Sergeant at Arms for inclusion in the hearing record.

If you wish to speak at today's hearing, please fill out an appearance card with the Sergeant of Arms and wait to be recognized. When recognized, you will have two minutes to speak on today's hearing topic. If you require translation services, you'll have a total of four minutes for you to speak on today's hearing topic and for the interpreter to interpret your testimony. We ask that you pause frequently to give the interpreter enough time to interpret your testimony as you go.

And if you have a written statement or an additional written testimony that you want to submit, please submit it for the record. I promise you we read all of these statements. They really do matter

to us. So please provide a copy of that to the Sergeant at Arms.

You may also email written testimony to testimony@council.nyc.gov within 72 hours of this hearing. Audio and video recordings will not be accepted.

So now it is my great pleasure to call the first panel. And first, we have Manny Pastreich, President of 32BJ, Rachelle Paoli, Ibrahim Sene, and Clarissa Baynes. If you could all please come down, thank you so much.

Okay, thank you.

MANNY PASTREICH: Good morning, Chair Menin, and thank you for your leadership on this issue. Your opening comments were appreciated. I'm Manny Pastreich, the President of SEIU 32BJ, the largest property service union in the country, representing 185,000 essential workers up and down the East Coast and 90,000 here in New York City.

Our ranks include 20,000 security officers here in New York City who stand on the front lines of our city each and every day and carry out the difficult and dangerous work of keeping New Yorkers safe. Despite their essential role, security

officers are the unsung heroes in a city that has long stood by first responders. Poor wages and benefits, hazardous job conditions, and inadequate training have together produced a crisis of turnover in the workforce. A recent report finds that the New York City security industry suffers from a 77% annual turnover rate. This constant churn saps the workforce experience and risks undermining public safety in our city. The Aland Etienne Safety and Security Act, sponsored by Speaker Adams, aims to reverse the turnover crisis and further professionalize the workforce.

In the highly outsourced, intensive security sector, tough competition to win contracts drives employers to depress labor costs by keeping wages and benefits low. Security officers have countered this race to the bottom by organizing unions like 32BJ and negotiating strong contracts. But thousands of workers in New York City continue to make less than \$18.00 an hour and lack any meaningful benefits, adequate training, job protections, or union representation.

Poor job standards are unacceptable for officers who risk their lives every day protecting

our city. The recent death of security officer and 32
BJ brother Aland Etienne—and again, thank you for
your moment of silence in his honor, who was fatally
shot by a heavily armed gunman at 345 Park Avenue,
the building he had guarded for years. We continue to
honor him and his family and send our love and
support to you. It is an unimaginable loss, but a
risk that we know all of our officers live with.

A New York City-specific training will
supplement state requirements and raise training
standards to levels necessary for a city of this size
and status. Experienced, well-trained workers can
effectively identify risk, can better handle mental
health crises, and have the necessary background in
first aid, CPR, and how to use defibrillators.
Workers will feel more supported, and we will all
benefit from having a better prepared security
workforce.

This bill would also set a citywide wage
benefit, paid leave floor, and levels necessary to
attract and retain a qualified and experienced
workforce. This would ensure an even playing field
for contractors and guarantee a basic standard of
living that can lift the low-wage, predominantly

Black and Latino workforce out of poverty. It would also raise citywide training requirements to ensure the skills, stability, and experience in the security workforce that all New Yorkers can count on. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you so much. I have a number of questions, but I'll wait until everyone speaks, if that's okay.

RACHELLE PAOLI: Good morning, everyone. My name is Rachelle Paoli, and I wish I were not standing before you today.

On July 28th, a shooter entered 349 Park Avenue and took the life of my Aland Etienne, my friend, my classmate, my love, who was serving as the security officer. Aland made the ultimate sacrifice, choosing bravery and selflessness over fear. In his final moment, he had to protect others by shutting down the elevator to save his coworker. Aland was not only (INAUDIBLE) moment. He had to protect others like he'd always done. In his final act of bravery, he was the fabric of everyday life, serving others and being there for everybody. He did not seek praise and attention; he simply showed up for his family, for his colleagues, for everyone who depended on him.

His courage on July 28th was simply the reflection of the man he has always been.

Aland is survived by his three daughters: Christina (phonetic) Etienne, Jennifer (phonetic) Etienne, Naika, and his only son, Ralandy Lucien Etienne; his family, four brothers, Goji (phonetic) Etienne, Stanley Etienne, Gathmand Etienne, and Smith Etienne; his only sister, Mabline Etienne; and also by his parents, the first love was his mom, Mary (INAUDIBLE) Etienne and his dad, Joudin Etienne; and me; and his extended family cousin Edwin Joseph and (INAUDIBLE) Augustine.

Every day is a struggle with my son. He's only seven, and he realizes now he won't have a father anymore. His biggest fear is when I drop him off at school in the morning, he doesn't want me to leave or stop crying, and tells me every morning, "Mommy, I don't want you to vanish like Daddy. I want you to stay with me". When we spend the weekend together, if I have to go shopping, he refuses to let me go because he says, "Mommy, I don't want the same thing to happen to you. I have only you."

Aland also leaves behind a much bigger family at 32BJ. He might not have known all of them,

brothers and sisters in security, but all who knew him keep his memory and messages alive. Aland was a man for everybody on earth. He was an unbelievable person in serving people. Thanks to them, his name graces this bill, which would protect them and thousands of security officers, like Aland. Excuse me.

(PAUSE)

RACHELLE PAOLI: All of them know him and keep his memory alive. Thanks to them, his name graces this bill, which would protect thousands of security officers like Aland and ensure that they have the kind of benefits-- more training, more pay, more equipment for their work, decent life insurance when something happens, so that nobody has to suffer what I'm going through every day in life. Since I became the mom and the dad, it's not easy.

As someone who always looked after others, this bill is finding a way to honor Aland's Legacy. He will continue to change lives to the highest. He'll always be with us. I ask you, please, to pass the Aland Etienne Safety and Security Act, so that the security officers across the city who put

their lives on the line every day are ensured the quality of life (INAUDIBLE).

I would like to say thank you as well to all of the people who reached out to my family and helped our GoFundMe fund. Thank you from the bottom of my heart, thank you to the Union, thank you to the City Council, and thank you to everybody. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: First of all, I want to just extend our deepest condolences to you and your entire family. I want to thank you for your courage for being here. I know how difficult it must be to be able to talk about him, but I want to assure you that he died as a hero. The story you told about what he did, protecting people, trying to turn off the elevator bank, he saved lives, and through this legislation, which will honor his memory, he is going to save hundreds of lives. There is no better way that we can honor him than through this legislation. And so you have our deep commitment, and I can't thank you enough for being here today.

IBRAHIM SENE: My name is Ibrahim Sene. Good morning, everybody. Good morning, Your Honor. Thank you for having me here at City Council. My name is Ibrahim Sene. I work as a security officer at

several store locations. At my job, I am not just guarding against theft, but I also protect the employees and the customers. I care a lot about keeping them safe. A lot of the time, I work late at night. It can be scary. Anything can happen. If someone comes into our store with the intent of breaking the law or becoming violent, I'm the first line of defense. But I don't feel like I always have the protections, wages, and benefits that I need and deserve. Every time I clock in at my job, I feel like I might be taking a risk to provide for my family. I am from Senegal and fighting to achieve my American dream. It gets difficult to do that with the cost of living always going up. I work very, very hard. And I am here today because I know the Aland Etienne Safety and Security Act will give me more stability and support. I would have healthcare so I could take better care of my life. Better training would help me with things that happen on my job. And I would have enough PTO to visit my family in Senegal. Aland's Act would help me to be a better security officer. I could finally build my life and career here. I know many other security officers are in the same position. I am standing here to fight not just for me

but for all the security officers. We work hard to protect this city. Now we are asking you to protect us. It's time to protect the protectors. It's time to pass the Aland Etienne Safety and Security Act. Thank you, Your Honor. Thank you, everybody

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you.

CLARISSA BAYNES: Good morning, my name is Clarissa Baynes, and I've been working as a security officer for 18 years. I just want to thank you for having me here today to speak on behalf of security officers.

I've been working at ULM Holdings, 1776 Broadway, a major commercial building, for the past seven years. I care a lot about my job, and I think I'm pretty good at it. I know all the people and all the businesses. I work the overnight shift so that I can say goodbye to people on their way out for the day. Then I keep their offices and stores safe overnight. With my hard work, I protect their hard work and their livelihoods. And if things do happen in the first line of defense, I am here to respond and to protect.

But even though I have an important full-time job, I'm struggling to keep up with the bills.

I'm a lifelong New Yorker, and every year it gets harder to keep up with the cost of living: rent, electricity, groceries, et cetera. The cost of everything is going up. I also don't have good health coverage. I've had a few health problems pop up over the years, and each time I had to pay out of pocket for medical care. And as I get older, which is terrifying, what if I get really sick? I could wind up thousands of dollars in debt. And I know that I'm not alone. I know there are many of my fellow security officers who are struggling. We're risking our lives, but are living paycheck to paycheck. For too many of us, our lives feel unstable. That is also contributing to high turnover, and I've seen a lot of great security officers—they come and then they go. We're losing good security officers because we're not getting the pay, health care, and support we need to make ends meet. The Aland Etienne Safety and Security Act would change my life. I would have stable pay so I could keep up with the bills. I could take better care of my health and not live in fear about what could happen if I get sick. And I could focus on advancing in my career.

2 Wherever you go in New York, security
3 officers like me are working hard to make sure that
4 you are safe. We protect your homes, offices, and
5 businesses. We put our lives on the line to protect
6 you and your livelihoods. We need to be able to keep
7 ourselves safe, too. That's why we need the Aland
8 Etienne Safety and Security Act. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you so much. I
10 have a number of questions for the panel. I'm first,
11 though, going to recognize we've been joined by
12 Deputy Speaker Ayala, who's going to read a
13 statement, Majority Leader Fariás, and Council Member
14 Ossé. So let me turn it over to the Deputy Speaker.
15 Thank you.

16 DEPUTY SPEAKER AYALA: Thank you, and good
17 morning, Council Member Julie Menin, Chair of the
18 Consumer and Worker Protection, for leading today's
19 important hearing on Introduction Number 1391,
20 Speaker Adrienne Adams' important bill to establish
21 safety and workplace standards for security guards in
22 our city. As Deputy Speaker, I am here to provide
23 remarks on behalf of the Speaker:

24 Security guards are an integral part of
25 New York City's public safety infrastructure. They

make sure that New Yorkers are safe when we go to our offices, cheer on our favorite sports teams, dance the night away at a club, and pursue higher education.

The risks that security guards take are underscored by the tragic death of Aland Etienne, a security guard who was killed while guarding the lobby of 345 Park Avenue in July of 2025 in a Midtown shooting. However, too often, security guards are not adequately compensated, sufficiently trained, or treated with the dignity and respect that they deserve. That is why Intro 1391, also known as the Aland Etienne Safety and Security Act, which would establish a new dedicated Division of Security and a Security Guard Advocate within the Department of Consumer and Worker Protection, is so important. It would establish and enforce minimum pay standards, paid sick leave, paid vacation, benefits, and training requirements for security guards and their employers.

The new division would be tasked with informing workers and employers about their rights and obligations, developing a system to track complaints on potential violations, and coordinate

with stakeholders to address issues affecting the workplace.

This historic legislation is part of the legacy of Aland Etienne, whose fierce love and commitment to New York City will be remembered forever. We look forward to a robust discussion on this legislation, and thank you all for being here.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you so much.

So, a number of questions: So, Manny, you mentioned the 77% attrition rate. You represent so many workers in many different industries. Is that one of the highest attrition rates that you've seen?

MANNY PASTREICH: For our members here in New York City, it is. I will say that we've seen generally a pretty direct correlation between pay, benefits, and turnover. So as you know, we organize many industries, including airport workers, cleaners, and security. And what we've seen in all of those cases is that as you raise pay, as you raise benefits, as employers invest more in the employees, they care more about them—the employees care more about the jobs and retaining them. And turnover is reduced, and the training gets better, the

relationships get better, and overall, people are more invested in their jobs.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: And what type of training exists now?

MANNY PASTREICH: Right now, there is an 8-hour pre-hire training that workers need to have, often on their own, and then there's a 16-hour requirement on the job once you're hired, and an 8-hour annual refresher.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: I'm very concerned about the mental health repercussions that happen from this tragedy. What is being done to address the mental health of security guards?

MANNY PASTREICH: I would say that most-- really, if particularly if they're non-union and they don't have the healthcare services that our members have, generally not much is done. You know, I can't make overall generalizations around the 80,000 security officers and the many non-union market, which is the majority of those. But honestly, security officers, to your point, are faced with intense situations every day. We're talking about some of the most tragic ones. And you know, we also, you know, remember Camara Idrissa (sic) (*TRANSCRIBER

NOTE: Idrissa Camara), who was a security officer about 13 years ago under very similar circumstances, lost his life. Those are the extremes, but they're on a continuum of what security officers have to deal with every single day in terms of situations that can start out very mild and escalate because of mental health, because of drug issues, because of all the things that plague the city. And as we're saying, security officers really are that frontline in so many of the institutions, as you and Council Member Ayala said, they are the front lines in every kind of building and situation where we want to keep the public safe.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: And lastly, can you just talk a little bit more about the impact that this bill will have on security workers—security guards.

MANNY PASTREICH: I mean, I think Officer Baynes said it incredibly well—if we can create more stability in people's lives, it will allow them to focus on their jobs and focus on advancement. As people stay in their jobs, these annual trainings will become that much more important. So we'll have a level of-- we'll create a level of fairness, and,

1 honestly speaking, as a labor union person, people
2 will be paid and respected and be able to live in the
3 city. But that stability that flows from that will
4 allow people to stay in the jobs longer, understand
5 more deeply how to deal with difficult situations,
6 and, at the end of the day, make us all safer.

8 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Do any of
9 my colleagues have any questions?

10 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: I don't have any
11 questions, but I do just want to thank you for coming
12 here and giving us testimony and really putting--
13 it's extremely brave to put your entire story back on
14 the line here in this way in Chambers. And we're
15 grateful for you showing up. And as the Chair had
16 said, we are going to do everything possible to make
17 sure that this bill passes. So thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Anyone else? Okay,
19 great, thank you so much to this panel, thank you for
20 being here.

21 I am going to call the next panel: LiJia
22 Gong, Dennis Fan, and Cassandra Gomez.

23 DENNIS FAN: Thank you for the opportunity
24 to testify. My name is Dennis Fan, and I'm an
25 Associate Clinical Professor at Columbia Law School.

I'm here to address one of the main legal concerns about raising the minimum wage. From time to time, we hear the view that cities can't raise their minimum wage. That comes from a 1960s decision called Wholesale Laundry, where the New York Court of Appeals had blocked New York City from doing that. Wholesale Laundry, and I want this on the record, is somewhat of a boogeyman. It's a one-line, sharply divided 4-3 Court of Appeals order. The Appellate Division decision that it had affirmed said two things. One, it said that a City's minimum wage was field preempted so that the state had blocked the entire field. And the second was that the City's minimum wage conflicted with state law. Even in 1963, though, it was impossible to tell whether a majority of the court even agreed with either rationale or if they were themselves split further. It's been really apparent since then that the court never agreed with either rationale. A year after Wholesale Laundry, the court held that cities could raise the wages for public works employees, so no field preemption there. In a decade, the court said that the conflict rationale was, quote, "much too broad". A few years ago, the Appellate Division here in New York realized

that Wholesale Laundry is a relic of a bygone era when it upheld supplemental pay in the City Council's Fair Work Week Law.

So I just wanted to say that the vast shift in local wage regulation and in urbanization, as my colleagues will address, as well as the crumbling foundations of Wholesale Laundry, are established reasons for this Council to pass a law that would let the city-- the Court of Appeals, at least clarify its view on it. (TIMER)

CASSANDRA GOMEZ: Thank you, Chair Menin and Members of the Committee, for the opportunity to testify today in support of Introduction Number 1391.

My name is Cassandra Gomez, and I'm a senior staff attorney at the National Employment Law Project, a nonprofit organization that seeks to strengthen protections and build power for workers in the US.

There has been an explosion in local wage activity from just a handful at the beginning of the 21st century to today. Nearly 70 cities and counties have passed a higher local minimum wage. High-cost cities that have passed their own higher local minimum wage include Los Angeles, Seattle, San

Francisco, Minneapolis, Denver, Chicago, Santa Fe, and Albuquerque.

In a state with a diverse geography like New York, it is critical that workers in New York City, which is consistently cited as the most expensive city to live in in the US, have wage standards that work for them. Further, local wage standards allow communities to fulfill the needs of their workers without waiting on state legislatures, which may be slower to keep up.

The state minimum wage simply does not go far enough to reflect the reality of the cost of living for New Yorkers. Under state law, New York City's minimum wage is set to reach an insufficient \$17 by 2026 and is expected to adjust with inflation beginning in 2027. Our City Council should act to increase local wages sooner, and Intro 1391 is a great first step toward that.

A number of jurisdictions that have adopted their own wage standards have done so even though their state laws, as is the case in New York, are silent on wage preemption. Minneapolis and large counties in Maryland are among such localities. And in both Minnesota and Maryland, state courts have

upheld local wage ordinances, ruling that they are not preempted by state law.

We applaud the City Council for the steps it has already taken to adopt strong standards for workers, such as the city's food delivery, worker protections, fair scheduling law, and paid sick days, to name a few. But we are an outlier amongst our peers for not yet enacting a higher local minimum wage. Intro 1391 is a natural next step that builds upon the City Council's record (TIMER), and we strongly urge its passage.

LIJIA GONG: Thank you, Chair Menin and the Committee, for the opportunity to testify.

I am Lijia Gong, the Managing Director For Legal And Policy at Local Progress Impact Lab. I work with cities across the country and have studied, supported, and written about how, in recent years, localities have emerged as key players in advancing workers' rights. And in many cases, this local legislation addresses urgent industry-specific concerns and conditions.

In the hospitality industry, cities have addressed safety issues like sexual harassment and assault, as well as low wages, through local

legislation. Chicago, for example, requires hotel employers to provide portable emergency contact devices, so-called "panic buttons", and at least four California cities mandate a higher minimum wage specifically for their hotel workers. In 2019, Philadelphia enacted legislation requiring parking operators to demonstrate just cause to fire an employee and mandating sufficient staffing to ensure the safety of employees and customers. And frankly, it is no coincidence that many of these policies address issues of public safety along with low wages and other working conditions. Ensuring public safety has long been a traditional local function, and cities are appropriately utilizing their authority to respond to the public safety challenges that affect the public and workers alike. To that end, this bill will bring New York City in line with its peers, leading the way across the country.

And I also want to take a quick moment to provide some short context about Home Rule in New York State. In 1894, New York was part of a wave of states that adopted constitutional Home Rule after the Civil War, when rapid urbanization and growing populations in cities across the country led to

movements to vindicate local authority. The basic theory of this wave of Home Rule was that state constitutions would empower cities to act with respect to what were considered "local affairs". It is this legal landscape, and the subsequent development of that law, as Dennis has discussed, that has enabled New York City to grow to what it is today—accounting for more than 57% of the state's GDP, and for a large and diverse state like New York, (TIMER) all of the state, cities, counties, villages and towns have relied on Home Rule to govern effectively and accountably.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Wonderful, thank you. I just want to say, on a personal note, I love hearing about these legal case laws. I used to teach preemptions, so I really appreciated your analysis of field preemptions. And I agree with your analysis of the case law. And clearly, what is happening here is that this law is aimed at a public safety risk, which really sets it apart. So, thank you so much to this panel. Questions? Okay, thank you.

All right, I am going to call the next panel: Stephen Amitay, Felix Malave, and also, our third panelist is on Zoom, Nikki Franzitta.

2 STEVE AMITAY: Chair Menin, Members of the
3 Council, my name is Steve Amaitay. I'm the Executive
4 Director of the National Association of Security
5 Companies (NASCO). In New York City, NASCO member
6 companies employ thousands of trained security
7 officers who provide security services at a vast
8 array of client sites. These officers receive
9 comprehensive training required by state law, client
10 contracts, CBAs, NYFD regulations, and training is
11 also tailored to their specific job sites.

12 Introducing a response to the active
13 shooter incident at 345 Park Avenue in July, which
14 tragically claimed the lives of on-duty Security
15 Officer Aland Etienne and NYPD Officer Didarul Islam,
16 Introduction 1391 has been described as a measure to
17 address the fact that security officers are, quote,
18 "Too often denied the training that could save their
19 lives and ours." The inference that Officer Etienne,
20 who died a hero, was denied training that could have
21 saved his life or others in an incident where an
22 armed, highly trained NYPD officer was killed is way
23 off base, to put it mildly.

24 And please tell me how training, as the
25 bill requires, in community health and wellness,

including drug and alcohol addiction, homelessness, and mental illness, as well as in workplace rights, and anti-discrimination and wage and hour laws, will make security officers safer?

In reality, the overwhelming focus and effect of this Safety and Security Act is to establish and enforce minimum wage, paid sick leave, paid vacation leave, and benefits for security officers in the city, as well as require additional training. And as for the training required in the bill, much of it is duplicative of existing required state and other training currently being provided to security officers in the city, or is intended for activities that are outside the duty scope of security officers that could lead to potential harm and/or criminal or civil liability for officers. Record keeping and other obligations put on security officers are also duplicative of existing requirements under state law. And overall, the bill (TIMER) seems to intrude into regulatory fields, such as wage setting, employment standards, and occupational licensing that are already occupied by comprehensive state statutes, including New York Labor Law and the Security Guard Act. Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: I have a lot of
3 comments on that. I am going to let you go first, and
4 then I am going to respond to what you said.

5 FELIX MALAVE: Thank you. First of all,
6 thank you so much for giving me the privilege and the
7 opportunity to make a comment here.

8 First of all, I am very sad about what
9 happened with Officer Aland Etienne; that's why I am
10 here. I have this opportunity, I was supposed to
11 finish my shift at midnight, but I regret telling my
12 other fellow security officers could not make it for
13 personal reasons, and to get off at eight o'clock,
14 barely even sleeping, and here I am having this
15 opportunity, thank you.

16 Okay, about us, the security officers, we
17 have many experiences, we have many backgrounds, some
18 of us we have educational backgrounds and we
19 definitely bring a lot to the table. Our training is
20 what they call OJT, on-the-job training, in other
21 words, our work as a security officer, plus the other
22 work that we have to learn, based on the sites that
23 we have to work, we have to learn the ropes, and we
24 have to understand the nooks and crannies about
25 everything that is going on (INAUDIBLE) in buildings,

governmental facilities, institutions, like, health and universities, and all of that, definitely. We bring a lot to the table. However, respectfully, I would like to say, sometimes I have to say, based on my almost 30 years of doing this job, that sometimes we definitely don't have the recognition and respect, for example, (INAUDIBLE) that we have with the police. And the NYPD sometimes they treat us like underlings. They sometimes don't give us the respect. Some of them act professionally, but sometimes, I'm sorry to say, don't give us the respect. (TIMER)

So, again, we do very critical work, and I appreciate the opportunity to make my statement. Thank you so much.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, and our next speaker is Niki Franzitta on Zoom.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

NIKI FRANZITTA: Thank you, Chair and Members of the Committee, for the opportunity to testify today. I am Nikki Franzitta, Vice President of Member Relations and Development of the Hotel Association of New York City, representing more than 300 of the city's hotels and 40,000 employees.

2 Our industry shares the Council's
3 commitment to maintaining safe, fair, and
4 professional workplaces. Security guards play a vital
5 role in protecting guests, employees, and property,
6 and hotels already invest heavily in safety and
7 training through collective bargaining agreements and
8 state licensing requirements.

9 We have several concerns about how Intro
10 1391 would function in practice:

11 First, we would welcome consideration of
12 a collective bargaining agreement carve-out. Many
13 hotels already operate under strong union contracts
14 that provide robust wages, benefits, and training
15 provisions. Allowing those agreements to satisfy the
16 bill's requirements would help avoid duplication,
17 while maintaining the high standards those contracts
18 already ensure.

19 We would also encourage clarification
20 that a violation of this law would not also
21 constitute a violation of the Safe Hotels Act. We are
22 happy to work with you on language that demonstrates
23 this, if amenable to the Council. Keeping the two
24 frameworks distinct would help maintain focus on
25 their respective purposes and avoid confusion in

enforcement, especially as it relates to maintaining a hotel license.

Finally, we believe the Council could consider adjustments to implementation timelines and enforcement methods to ensure compliance remains practical, particularly given that the 120-day training requirement may overlap with the industry-wide agreement's 60-day probationary period for new hotel employees. While the law does not technically require training to be completed before probation ends, the timelines could overlap in a way that makes it possible that the required training will need to be completed (TIMER) (INAUDIBLE)... (CROSS-TALK)

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time has expired... (CROSS-TALK)

NIKI FRANZITTA: probationary period in order to comply. This would entail extensive scheduling and cost challenges for hotels across the city... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I am just going to ask you to wrap up and just submit the testimony, please.

2 NIKI FRANZITTA: Yes. Thank you for your
3 time. That's all I had to say, and for the
4 opportunity.

5 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you very
6 much.

7 Okay, I want to get back to your
8 comments, Stephen Amitay. I think they were
9 insensitive, callous, and wrong in the law. First of
10 all, you're saying that training would not help. How
11 on earth can you say, and particularly in light of
12 this tragedy, where someone died, that training is
13 not going to make a difference?

14 STEVE AMITAY: The NYPD police officer was
15 highly trained and armed, and that training did not
16 make a difference. That's what I am saying.

17 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: I mean, that argument,
18 I can't believe you're coming here with a straight
19 face and saying that. It's so disrespectful to the
20 security guards, it's so disrespectful, also, by the
21 way, to the NYPD officers, to just say that training
22 does not make a difference. And you're saying this on
23 the backs of this tragedy.

24 Furthermore, you've got a 77% attrition
25 rate in your industry. So how on earth can you say

that better pay, paid sick leave, and the benefits that are being talked about in this bill would not make a difference on that issue?

STEVE AMITAY: It's a private marketplace. These are private employees with private employers, private employees making contracts with private businesses. That's the way the market is. We try to point out that, you know, better paid-- I agree better paid, better trained security officers, you know, will result in better security... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: But now you just said that better pay and better training will--so, you've just now contradicted your prior testimony.

STEVE AMITAY: Yes, but...

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Yes, exactly, yes.

STEVE AMITAY: Okay, fine, yeah.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Exactly. I mean-- and the last thing, and I have to point this out for the record, you made an assertion that we do not have the legal authority to do so.

STEVE AMITAY: Mm-hmm.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: We do have the legal authority to do so. I was a Commissioner of Consumer Affairs when that agency morphed into Consumer and

Worker Protection, and we absolutely have the legal authority to do this. And the case law, whether it be the McMillian (phonetic) case, completely eviscerates prior case law on field preemption.

STEVE AMITAY: Right. So, I mean, why then is the City not setting the wages for everyone who works in the city?

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: First of all, this is not a dual questioning thing.

STEVE AMITAY: Right.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: This is—we are questioning you at this point.

STEVE AMITAY: Right.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, have any questions?

MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: No.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, all right, we are going to move on to the next panel.

Our next panel is: Trevana Garel, Ken Prashad, and Shane Mitchell.

(PAUSE)

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, please begin, thank you.

2 TREVANA GAREL: Thank you for the
3 opportunity to testify today on Intro #1391, the
4 Aland Etienne Safety and Security Act. My name is
5 Trevina Garrel, and I'm an Adjunct Professor of
6 Criminal and Social Justice at Monroe University and
7 a training instructor at the 32BJ Thomas Shortman
8 Training Center. I have also taught at St. John's
9 University and John Jay College of Criminal Justice.
10 Prior to teaching, I served for over two decades with
11 the NYPD, retiring as a Sergeant Supervisor,
12 Detective Squad.

13 As a former law enforcement officer, I
14 can testify firsthand to the essential role that
15 security officers play in New York City's public
16 safety. Throughout my career with the NYPD, I have
17 consistently observed security officers supporting
18 the work of police officers, perhaps most notably
19 during the 9/11 terrorist attacks and its aftermath.

20 Despite their key role in New York City's
21 public safety infrastructure, security officers lack
22 the training, pay, and benefits commensurate with
23 their importance. Building owners expect employees to
24 not only secure their properties but also mediate
25 disputes and de-escalate dangerous situations.

1 However, the skills required to do so do not come
2 naturally to most people. They must be learned. This
3 is why it is so important for the City to supplement
4 the existing state training standards with training
5 designed to meet the unique challenges that New York
6 City security officers face.

7
8 Additionally, many security officers I
9 have trained are living very precariously. I have
10 literally taught officers who work all day patrolling
11 a homeless shelter and then go to sleep at night at a
12 homeless shelter. Low pay contributes to high
13 turnover, and when turnover is high, you lose the
14 benefits conferred by training in the first place.

15 In order to ensure that well-trained
16 security (TIMER) officers can support New York's
17 public safety, it is crucial that they receive wages
18 and benefits that allow them to live in our
19 increasingly expensive city. Thank you again for your
20 work on this issue.

21 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you.

22 KEN PRASHAD: Good morning, everyone. Good
23 morning to everyone in this room. My name is Ken
24 Prashad; I'm the Senior Director of Compliance and
25 Operations for A&H Security Services. We are a

locally based MBE security provider here in New York City.

Raising the minimum wage with security guards across all sectors would make a big difference. It would help improve conditions for our employees. It would let us standardize billing rates for our clients and create a more level playing field when bidding on new contracts.

From my experience and from anyone else's experience in the security industry, whenever we are able to pay our guards more, we see better retention and overall performance. The challenge is that we can only go so high before getting underbid by the low-road contractors. Unfortunately, there are a lot of them in the industry, and that leads to high turnover, forcing us to constantly back-fill roles with low expectations or low experience.

Providing security in New York City isn't-- two weeks ago, one of our security officers escorted housekeeping into a room, where a guest was, and she refused to leave. That guest became extremely irate and assaulted our security officer, who was just trying to do his job.

2 For more examples of the situations, all
3 you need to do is just turn on the news, and plenty
4 of stories that you see are of men and women who are
5 dealing with this daily, and they deserve fair and
6 reasonable pay for the work that they do in keeping
7 the city safe.

8 SHANE MITCHELL: Good morning. Thank you,
9 Chair Menin and Members of the Committee, for the
10 opportunity to speak in favor of Intro 1391, the
11 Aland Etienne Safety and Security Act.

12 My name is Shane Mitchell. I'm the Deputy
13 Political Director for the Hotel and Gaming Trades
14 Council. HDC represents over 40,000 hotel, club,
15 racetrack, and casino workers, a majority of them
16 here in New York City. We represent hospitality
17 workers wall to wall, meaning we represent not only
18 housekeepers, front desk and food and beverage
19 workers, but maintenance and security workers, too.

20 The security guards in our union work to
21 protect guests visiting our city, as well as our
22 members who are entering guest rooms and interacting
23 with strangers as part of their job. As you may be
24 aware, our contract requires housekeepers to be
25 equipped with panic buttons that call the attention

of security in the case of an assault or other emergency.

In addition, just to be frank, criminals sometimes try to use hotel rooms for various illegal purposes, from human trafficking to storing stolen goods. But beyond that, even well-meaning guests, some who might just be enjoying our city a little too much, can pose safety risks to themselves and those around them. Security guards in hotels are a key piece of the puzzle in reducing crime and making improvements to public safety in our city.

It is important that the industry standards, both in terms of training and compensation, are commensurate with the work we're asking these people to do. Our union contract ensures a high standard for wages, benefits, PTO, and training. But the pipeline for security guard employment doesn't always start with a great union job.

We are especially excited about the training requirements in the bill. We all benefit from a rise in the competency of security guards, no matter where they are working. Additional training

will help ensure better outcomes when an incident occurs.

We also believe that the wage and benefit standards in the bill will help to ensure that security guards stick with their profession long term. Candidly, there's not much turnover in the security guard positions represented by our union. That is because our contract provides high wages, free family healthcare, generous leave allowances, and a strong pension.

While this bill does not have all the bells and whistles of our contract, it should help to ensure that more security guards stay in their jobs for longer.

We'd like to commend Speaker Adams (TIMER) and every sponsor of this legislation for their diligent work on this issue. We appreciate the attention given to the concerns of working New Yorkers. We urge you to vote yes on Intro 1391. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you—a couple of questions for this panel, for the record.

Do you feel that the additional training that is provided by this bill will make a difference

in the safety of the security guards and the safety of the general public?

TREVANA GAREL: Absolutely, I do. Training prepares you for the what-ifs, and the way you practice, the way you train is the way that you're going to likely handle the situations that you are confronting. So training, in my opinion, is an absolute must. I can't believe the other speaker who did not-- Well, he eventually agreed, but absolutely, training is essential to this workforce. There's no doubt about it.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. And any additional comments from you?

KEN PRASHAD: Yeah, I couldn't agree more. You're retired as well from the Police Department. So am I. You need that training to do your job. Without training, you cannot do it. So I totally agree with that.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: And in a similar vein, will additional pay, paid sick leave, and the benefits offered under this legislation and this new plan that DCWP would be implementing, will that address the issue of the 77% attrition rate that we are seeing within this industry?

2 TREVANA GAREL: It certainly won't hurt
3 it. And about two weeks ago, Channel 7 Eyewitness
4 News reported that to live comfortably in New York
5 City, you have to earn \$174,000 a year. We have to
6 raise the benefits and wages for this workforce. And
7 as I testified and just yesterday-- I conducted an 8-
8 hour training at the Thomas Shortman Training Fund at
9 32 BJ, and one of the members stated before our group
10 that one of the new security officers hired goes home
11 to a homeless shelter. That is unconscionable. And so
12 if these wages can help them, absolutely. And it's a
13 mere pittance; they're not asking for thousands of
14 dollars an hour. It's unconscionable for anyone to
15 think otherwise that it wouldn't help.

16 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Okay, thank
17 you very much to this panel.

18 I am now going to call the next panel:
19 Matilda Radinson, Percy... Sorry, I cannot read it, I
20 believe it's Guity, Raven Skinner, and Badrun Nahar.

21 (PAUSE)

22 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, please begin.

23 RAVEN SKINNER: Before I start, I just
24 want to give my deepest condolences to Aland and his
25 family. I am Aland's coworker-- I am one of his

coworkers, and that is why I am here. I dedicated myself to being here for him and everyone else that we're here for.

Also, I do want to say that I was there that day. My shift is a little earlier, so I left at 3:00 p.m., but that could have been me. So, this is also why I am here. I send my deepest condolences to everyone.

Okay, I am going to start. My name is Raven Skinner, I am New York born and raised from Manhattan, and I work as a security officer at 345. When I started working as a security officer a few years ago, I looked to my coworkers as examples. I found a role model in Aland Etienne.

Each and every day, Aland showed up with real drive and dedication. I saw how much care and effort he put into our work—into keeping everyone coming in and out of the skyscraper at 345 Park Avenue safe. And pretty soon, I found out where his motivation came from. I was usually the one to cover his post at the lobby while he went on break. I always looked forward to it because I knew that during those 30 minutes of that break time he had, he'd be calling his family or his children. I'm also

a parent, I have two kids: my son is nine and my daughter is seven.

Aland cherished that time to speak with his kids. And we all knew that Aland's drive, the energy he brought to work every day, and his commitment to protecting the people in our building, were rooted in his motivation to provide for his kids—to support them and to show up for them. He was someone who uplifted others (TIMER), my hero. Every day, Aland inspired me to be a better security officer and a better parent.

What happened on that July day is a tragedy. I was at home when I learned there was a mass shooting at the building. Later, I found that Aland passed. I made phone calls, and I was given information all day. I was absolutely devastated.

Aland showed up that day with the same dedication he brought every day. He gave his life trying to protect the people he worked with. What I hope for now is that more people can recognize Aland's example and recognize the thousands of officers just like him. As security officers, we put our lives on the line every day to provide for our

families and keep our clients safe. It's a job that requires dedication and deserves recognition.

The Aland Etienne Safety and Security Act offers us one opportunity to honor Aland's legacy. With the support of Aland's family, this legislation would, in Aland's name, uplift all security officers across New York City. Aland's Act would strengthen public safety and help keep well-trained and experienced officers around.

Aland will always inspire me. I hope he can inspire you, too. Let's honor this Act.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you.

MATILDA RADINSON: Hello, good morning. My name is Matilda Radisson. I'm a proud Puerto Rican, New Yorker, a 32BJ union member, and a security officer.

I've been working in security at the World Trade Center Oculus for more than 10 years. I am standing here today because having good, affordable healthcare literally saved my life. I went through spinal surgery and cancer. And all of my treatments were covered. I'm on my feet all day. It's hard on your body. Without spinal surgery, I wouldn't be able to walk. And without that amazing cancer

treatment and care I received, I don't know if I would be here today. I never had to choose between paying rent and getting the life-saving treatment and care that I needed. That's why I'm fighting for the Aland Etienne Safety and Security Act, because there are thousands of security officers who are having to make those kinds of tough choices, many of whom are having to work two and even three jobs just to get by. That's not right, and it's burning people out.

Our job is stressful. We're on the frontline. We're dealing with all kinds of incoming crises and emergencies—that takes a toll on your mind and your body. The combination of high stress and low pay means we're burning people out. We're losing good, experienced (TIMER) security officers every day. And with the kinds of threats we're facing, security officers need the training to do our jobs as best we can.

Every day, I work hard to protect a major transportation hub and New York landmark. In my 10 years, I have responded to all kinds of emergencies, fights, medical emergencies, and terrorist threats. If something does happen, it's my job to stand post,

and to make sure every single person in the building gets to safety.

Nowadays, I worry more and more about active shooters. I want to make sure that I have the tools to respond to New Yorkers' safety in every kind of crisis. And I want to make sure that while making their lives [safer], my fellow officers are not having to make the impossible choice between rent and food and medical care.

We need to stand by security officers, stand with security, so that we can stand for *you* every day in every crisis. Stand with us by passing Aland's Act. Thank you.

PERCY GUILTY: Good morning, hello, my name is Percy Guity, that's the way you pronounce my last name Guity (Gi-ddy).

I'm a security officer at a building near Bryant Park, which is not too far from where the incident happened. And pretty much I worked as a security officer for over 20 years, doing pretty much office buildings and hotel buildings. I work multiple jobs as well.

2 Security officers are pretty much on the
3 front line every day, every single day. And not
4 getting compensated properly.

5 Passing this bill can help workers like
6 me with my children's medical expenses, because
7 outside coverage is way too overpriced for us low-
8 paid workers with high rent to pay and other
9 obligations.

10 My children and I deal with health issues
11 as well, which makes it impossible to keep up with
12 medical expenses, as well as other expenses and
13 obligations, especially being a single father. The
14 health insurance my company provides is expensive and
15 doesn't do much. And so I have to seek outside health
16 insurance. It's way too expensive, but at least more
17 things are covered that way.

18 So every day I'm struggling to keep up
19 with my bills. And every year, it seems like the cost
20 of living is going up. I am a hard-working single
21 father in need of affordable healthcare. I want to be
22 able to take care of my daughters, my sons, and
23 myself without worrying (TIMER) about the cost of the
24 doctor's visits or medication.

2 The Aland Etienne Safety and Security Act
3 would definitely help people like myself who are
4 fighting every day to protect you and the City and to
5 provide for our families. And training will
6 definitely help—I'd say three times a year.

7 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you.

8 PERCY GUILTY: You're welcome.

9 BADRUN NAHAR: Hi, good morning, everyone,
10 and thank you for giving me the opportunity to
11 testify. I am security officer, Badrun Nahar and
12 thanks again for having me here today.

13 Eleven years ago, I came here from my
14 home country of Bangladesh in hopes of building a
15 better future for myself and my family. I had two
16 very intelligent daughters who have bright futures,
17 but because of our financial situation, I don't know
18 if I will be able to support their higher education.

19 I have been working as a security officer
20 for more than a year. I work in a building where
21 there are offices and a school. I bring a lot of care
22 to the job. I want New Yorkers to feel safe and be
23 protected when they are coming and going from work or
24 school. I work hard to protect this city and its
25 people.

2 Every day, I work hard to protect this
3 city and its people. I bring a lot of care to the
4 job, but I'm earning poverty wages, and with the
5 company-provided health insurance, I have to pay \$200
6 a week out of my own pocket, and that's only to cover
7 myself. I have rent and phone bills to pay. We've had
8 a few family emergencies lately, and with the
9 company-provided health insurance, I have to pay \$200
10 a week out of my own pocket. (TIMER)... I have rent
11 and phone bills to pay. We've had a few family
12 emergencies lately.

13 The Aland Etienne Safety and Security Act
14 will help me achieve the American dream so that,
15 with my hard work, I can build a better life for my
16 daughters. Together, we can help thousands of other
17 workers do the same. Let's pass Aland's Act. Thank
18 you.

19 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you very much to
20 this panel. I really appreciate you taking the time
21 to testify today. Thank you.

22 PANEL: Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Our next panel, I
24 believe it's on Zoom, is Lauren Melodia, not on Zoom,
25

sorry, in person, Lauren Melodia, Enrique Lopezlira, Karla Walter, and Theodore Moore.

(PAUSE)

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, yes, please go, thank you.

LAUREN MELODIA: Good morning or good afternoon, and thank you, Chair Menin and the Committee, for the opportunity to speak today. My name is Lauren Melodia, and I'm an economist at the New School Center for New York City Affairs.

There are approximately 82,000 private security officers in New York, and at least 85% of them are working full-time year-round. But despite the hard work they're doing every day to protect us, one-third of those earning less than the median hourly wage in the sector can be defined as "working poor". This means that despite having a job, they live in a family earning less than 200% of the federal poverty line. Now, keep in mind, the federal poverty line is a national threshold. It doesn't take into account the cost of living in New York. So it's underestimating the affordability crisis these workers are facing. But it's a really useful concept when thinking about wage standards in the city

because those who can be defined as working poor have employers who are shirking the responsibility to cover their employees' basic cost of living, and instead putting this responsibility on the government and taxpayers.

The federal poverty line is used as a threshold for most public assistance programs in New York City, and it's intended to provide a social safety net for those facing unemployment and other hardships. But in 2023, nearly half of security officers living in the city received public health insurance, and a third relied on SNAP. This is far greater than public assistance rates amongst workers in general in the city. For example, only 18% of working New Yorkers are on Medicaid, and it's a sign that the City Council needs to put some guardrails on the private security industry.

Because of numerous actions taken by the federal government this year, the City is facing federal funding cuts, new public assistance requirements, and slower economic growth. (TIMER)

Eight hundred sixty thousand New Yorkers are expected to lose Medicaid in the coming years, and the City will have to make some tough

choices. And one of those choices should be requiring industries with a record of low wages to increase compensation and benefits so that taxpayer dollars can be used to support the most vulnerable, not to subsidize companies that are not paying workers enough to survive. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you.

ENRIQUE LOPEZLIRA: Good morning, Chair Menin and Members of the Committee. My name is Enrique Lopezlira, and I'm the Director of the Low-Wage Work Program at the University of California, Berkeley Labor Center. Thank you for the opportunity to present key findings from our recent research on the private security guard workforce in New York City.

Security guards in New York City are essential workers protecting our buildings, hospitals, and transit hubs, yet their compensation and working conditions do not reflect their significant role. The responsibilities have evolved to include de-escalating conflicts and managing crises while facing higher rates of assaults and fatal injuries on the job. They take on this risk

without the benefits and training offered to workers in similar protective service occupations.

According to our analysis of census data, the median hourly wage for New York City security guards is only \$20.29. This is not a living wage. A staggering eight out of 10 private security guards earn less than \$32.95 an hour a single adult in (INAUDIBLE) county would need to make to be self-sufficient, according to the MIT Living Wage.

Their median annual income of \$40,311.00 is less than 40% of the New York City area median income. This is a workforce primarily composed of workers of color, with Black workers accounting for over half of the workforce. We see significant racial and gender wage gaps in the data. Black security guards earn a median hourly wage of \$19.06, and female security guards earn even less at \$17.59. These poor conditions drive high turnover. The Security Service sector in New York City has an annual employee turnover rate of 74% in 2024, which is significantly higher than the overall private sector rate in New York City of 58%.

This high turnover directly impacts security effectiveness; job quality is thus a

critical issue of both economic justice and public safety.

New York City has a unique opportunity to lead the nation in setting higher labor standards for this growing and overlooked industry. Setting robust leverage standards with his workforce is necessary to ensure a safe and equitable New York City.

Thank you for your time and attention. I welcome any questions you may have. (TIMER)

KARLA WALTER: Thank you. My name is Karla Walter, and I'm a Senior Fellow at the Center for American Progress. I'm here today to support the adoption of wage benefit and training standards for security guards in New York City.

Security officers perform essential services that keep people safe. Yet my team released a national report that largely echoes Dr. Lopezlira's findings. Nationally, we see security officers' wages have stayed flat over the last 15 years, while rent costs grew by 14%. About 40% of security officers do not receive employer-provided health insurance, and nearly one in five rely on Medicaid. And Black and Hispanic guards account for most workers in the

occupation, but earn 10% less than white security officers.

This poor compensation drives high, unsustainable turnover, and high turnover in turn increases hiring and training costs and diminishes workforce skills. Several industry consultants cite high turnover as leading to training gaps and errors and recommend raising pay. These recommendations are also echoed and are in line with research. For example, after San Francisco adopted an airport wage standard, turnover rates among security screeners fell from 95 to 19%. That saved employers thousands in re-staffing costs per employee and improved security and performance.

Intro 1391 would support a well-qualified workforce and build on the City's existing contracting standard. Increasingly, we're seeing jurisdictions extending standards to private sector occupations. So, for example, Washington, DC requires security officers working in commercial office buildings to be paid around \$25 per hour in combined wages and benefits. New York State itself requires that building service workers at major energy facilities be paid prevailing wages in order to help

secure critical infrastructure. And several cities and states have formed industry standard boards that help set and enforce workplace standards in nursing homes, home care, and fast food.

New York City (TIMER) is often a leader in promoting decent work, but it is failing security officers. Intro 1391 would help ensure decent compensation, protect the public, and re-establish the city as a national leader.

THEO MOORE: All right, good morning, my name is Theo Moore, and I'm the Executive Director of ALIGN: the Alliance for Greater New York. I'm also representing the Raise Up New York Coalition, which continues to fight for living wages and economic justice for all New Yorkers.

ALIGN and the RUNY Coalition strongly support Intro 1391. In 2023, Raise Up New York won a minimum wage increase to \$17.00 in Downstate New York and \$16.00 upstate. Unfortunately, even with the current and future wage increases, it's just simply not enough as New York City workers face some of the highest costs of living in the entire nation. The Economic Budget Institute has a family budget calculator, and they calculate that in the Bronx it

would cost \$135,000 for a family with two children.
And in Manhattan, that's \$167,000 a year.

Security officers, fortunately, through organizing unions and negotiating strong contracts, have been able to rise above the minimum wage. However, thousands of them in New York continue to make less than \$18.00 an hour.

Intro 1391 would direct the Department of Consumer and Worker Protection to establish and enforce minimum wage for security officers and security guard employers throughout the five boroughs.

Currently, nearly 82,000 security officers who live in New York City, nearly half of them, received public health insurance coverage in 2023, and nearly a third of them relied on SNAP. With looming deadlines and changes from Washington, DC to both of those programs, New York City has to ensure that all workers have adequate wages and benefits. With the Trump-induced recession being ever prevalent every day, all New Yorkers need these basic protections. By setting and enforcing a solid wage floor, DCWP and the City ensure that we start with security officers whose median income (TIMER) is a

little over \$40,000, and Intro 1391 would put their wages in line with the important role that they play in our homes, in our workplaces, and in our communities. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you very much. Thank you to this panel. I appreciate your comments and testimony today. Thank you.

I am going to call our next panel: Calvin Baker, Mohamed Attia, Guadalupe Sosa, and Mahmoud Zaed. If you could please come down.

(PAUSE)

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Hello.

MOHAMED ATTIA: Hi, good morning. I think it's a good morning. Good morning, Chair Menin, and thank you for the opportunity to testify.

My name is Mohammed Attia. I'm the Managing Director of the Street Vendor Project. I'm here to express our support and solidarity to the security guards across the city, and our support, of course, of providing all the protections that are needed for them, and of course, to support to Intro 1391.

But I'm here also to shed light on another issue that you are very familiar with. For

decades, street vendors have been dealing with an outdated system that treats them as criminals and denies them the right to exist in a lawful way. As a result of that system, street vendors have been more vulnerable to attacks by the federal government. We saw last week's ICE raid in Canal Street and what that did to the vendor community across the city.

Again yesterday, ICE raided street vendors in downtown Brooklyn and checked their IDs and their immigration status. We probably should know why ICE is going after our vendors. We shouldn't be surprised since vendors have been treated as criminals by their own local government for decades.

So what are we waiting for? How many vendors should really get detained by ICE or probably deported for the Council to realize the need and the urgency for the reforms to move forward?

It's also important to understand that a lot of Council Members would be very quick to express their support when the vendors are under attack. But they have not signed on the bills yet. They have not moved the reforms yet.

And I have a quick message for the Council Members who receive a lot of complaints from

their constituents: The message for them is, "What have you done to address the issue?"

They're calling the cops on the vendors, and that hasn't fixed anything. We have seen it over and over again, and it's nothing but a waste of time and resources. So, how about if they considered a different approach? How about if they consider providing the proper license for vendors, providing the training, and then enforce the law? (TIMER)

You should all consider that—it is the only approach that we know will work because we've seen the DOHMH data, 97% of permitted cars and trucks have a grade A on them. That's how compliance with the health code has been. But for unlicensed vendors, there is literally no enforcement that can happen, but simply shutting down the business and letting them go. And we look forward to working with you on passing the reform and decision. Thank you.

CALVIN BAKER: My name is Calvin Baker, and it is my honor to stand before you today to discuss these vital pieces of legislation: Intro 431, 408, and 24, all of which are central components of the broader street vendor reform package. These bills address the system that has long been broken, and

they deserve an immediate hearing and a swift passing by the City Council.

Intro 431 is designed to address the decade-old random choice cap on mobile food and general vendor licenses. This cap has limited opportunities and fuels the system of illegality, fines, and harassment for many workers and New Yorkers.

What it does: This bill would increase the number of new food vendors' supervisory licenses and general vendors licenses available each year for five years. And critically, it would then lift the cap entirely on both supervisory and general vendor licenses.

The problem it solves: For too long, the limited number of permits has created a black market where permits are illegally sold for an exorbitant amount of money, making it nearly impossible for inspiring entrepreneurs, many of whom are immigrants and people of color, to start a legal business.

Intro 431 provides a pathway of legislative stability and growth for thousands of vendors. Why it matters: Intro 431 is not just about license, it's about economic justice and allowing our

city's (TIMER) smallest businesses, which contribute millions of dollars to our economy, to operate with dignity and a formal recognition.

GUADALUPE SOSA: Hello, my name is Guadalupe Sosa, and I'm here talking on behalf of street vendors.

More than anything, we want to recognize and applaud the brothers who are here and the sisters who are here, who are security guards, and the hard work they do. And it's nice that they're getting heard, and soon their law is going to be passed.

But in question our street vendors, where is our protection? Where are we being heard? We are in a time where we see that everything that's going on, there are raids where a lot of our members are getting their stuff taken away, and we are falling into depression. We're falling into frustration about what's going to happen with us when there's no security for us. We don't have the permits that we need in order to vend legally or properly. We don't have the licenses we need. And what is happening is we're being targeted. We're being persecuted just because we want to make ends meet. And I feel like

the stories that are going on and on and on in any field that people work in.

So I feel like it is crucial that we pass this package of laws now. The holidays are coming, and there's going to be no happy holidays in any of our vendors' homes when we can't bring a Turkey to our table, when we can't have our lights on, when we can barely take our kids to have a little entertainment and distract them from the reality that we're living in.

All of this has been very, very difficult for us vendors, and I feel for the working class in general. So we do ask that you please take a look at our bills and have your colleagues also look at them and support them. The time is ticking, and we need it now. Let's be part (TIMER) of a positive movement. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Great, thank you very much to this panel.

We have two more panels left, and I am going to call the next one: Along Yen, who needs Mandarin translation, please, and Xochitl Campos and Cleotilde, both of whom need Spanish translation, please, thank you.

CLEOTILDE: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE)

TRANSLATOR: My name is Cleotilde
(phonetic), and I wanted to express to you the
anxiety that we are feeling as street vendors when we
are selling things outside.

CLEOTILDE: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE)

TRANSLATOR: We have been very persecuted
here in New York since we started street vendor work.
Please understand, this is the only job that we are
able to do in order to support our home and families.
Many of us are people of (INAUDIBLE) age, like older
people already, people who are selling these things.

CLEOTILDE: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE)

TRANSLATOR: So, I think it is time to
reform this law, and we are counting on you if you
can help us. Because this law, unfortunately, is
completely broken, and we need your help, Councilmen
and Councilwomen from New York.

CLEOTILDE: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE)

TRANSLATOR: We need you to help and work
on behalf of the street vendors and their families.
We are also counting on you, because we are very
vulnerable people, and we are suffering a lot over
this.

2 CLEOTILDE: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE)

3 TRANSLATOR: Thank you so much for your
4 attention to this matter.

5 XOCHITL CAMPOS: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
6 LANGUAGE)

7 TRANSLATOR: Yes, I want to ask you,
8 please try to speed up this law to help us with this
9 law, because we are street vendors who are trying to
10 survive. And it's very unfair, it's not right that
11 these people are taking our own items—they are
12 taking the things away from us.

13 XOCHITL CAMPOS: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
14 LANGUAGE)

15 TRANSLATOR: They are taking their carts,
16 with all the items, the items that we are selling,
17 that we are buying at a sacrifice. Not only are they
18 taking our items, but these people who have taken our
19 things are also giving us very expensive fines that
20 are very hard to pay.

21 XOCHITL CAMPOS: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
22 LANGUAGE)

23 TRANSLATOR: But (INAUDIBLE) the president
24 says, this is a big hunting. It is very hard when
25 these people are attacking us, taking our items, our

things, because those things that we are buying are expensive. We spend a lot of money buying these items, and they come and steal our things from us. How are we going to survive? And besides taking the things from us, they want us to pay a very expensive fine for all of this.

XOCHITL CAMPOS: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE)

TRANSLATOR: I want you to put yourself in my own shoes; you would see how hard it is to lose everything you are buying to sell, and also to pay expensive fines. And we feel that we are losing this fight against this injustice that we are experiencing in New York.

XOCHITL CAMPOS: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE)

TRANSLATOR: We continue fighting. I told my own workmates, the people who are selling things with me, that we should not stop. We should continue fighting until the end because we should win this fight in the end.

XOCHITL CAMPOS: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE)

2 TRANSLATOR: My friend Cleotilde says that
3 they have to reform this labor law in order to help
4 us as street vendors, because this is the only way we
5 can continue winning this fight.

6 XOCHITL CAMPOS: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
7 LANGUAGE)

8 TRANSLATOR: As you know, nothing is free
9 in the United States. You always have to pay for
10 something, whatever you need. And we have to pay for
11 these licenses, it's hard to get, but we also have to
12 pay for those licenses, and those licenses, of
13 course, cost money, and we have to pay for them. We
14 have no other choice.

15 XOCHITL CAMPOS: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
16 LANGUAGE)

17 TRANSLATOR: We are only asking for all of
18 you to help us obtain this license and permits so
19 that we can sell our items legally.

20 XOCHITL CAMPOS: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
21 LANGUAGE) (TIMER)

22 TRANSLATOR: At the moment, I want to ask
23 you for your help, not only for me and Cleotilde, but
24 for all of the street vendors of all the counties in
25 New York City. We need your help.

2 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you very
3 much for your testimony. I will make sure that our
4 colleagues know about your request. Thank you.

5 TRANSLATOR: And she says, "Thank you very
6 much".

7 ALONG YEN: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE)

8 TRANSLATOR: Thank you, everyone, thank
9 you, friends.

10 ALONG YEN: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE)

11 TRANSLATOR: So, I am a vendor, myself,
12 and I am very glad that through the efforts of
13 legislation, Proposal 47 was passed.

14 ALONG YEN: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE)

15 TRANSLATOR: And that is the result of the
16 efforts put out by everyone.

17 ALONG YEN: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE)

18 TRANSLATOR: And it shows the help and
19 care of everyone towards the vendors, people who are
20 at the bottom of society.

21 ALONG YEN: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE)

22 TRANSLATOR: And if many years later, we
23 look back, I think we would be proud of this
24 accomplishment today.

25 ALONG YEN: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE)

2 TRANSLATOR: So, I think what we did was
3 something that we should be proud of. As a result, it
4 turned into law, memorialized forever.

5 ALONG YEN: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE)

6 TRANSLATOR: And thank you for the
7 legislation—workers, vendors, and everyone, please,
8 let's congratulate ourselves.

9 (APPLAUSE)

10 TRANSLATOR: Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Great, thank you very
12 much.

13 ALONG YEN: Thank you (SPEAKING FOREIGN
14 LANGUAGE)

15 TRANSLATOR: However...

16 ALONG YEN: (TIMER) (SPEAKING FOREIGN
17 LANGUAGE)

18 TRANSLATOR: However, vendors today still
19 face a lot of hardship, worries, and scares...

20 ALONG YEN: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE)

21 TRANSLATOR: And are picked on by the
22 sanitation and the police department.

23 ALONG YEN: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE)

24 TRANSLATOR: So, we just heard that the
25 minimum wage was \$17 or \$18 for security personnel.

To me, as a vendor, that actually sounds like a lot, because I struggle to make \$5 an hour.

ALONG YEN: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE)

TRANSLATOR: So, I am a vendor just to make a living for food, but we are treated unfairly.

ALONG YEN: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE)

TRANSLATOR: So don't look at the strong ones in the country, what they've got, but look at the weak ones, and care about the weakest members of the society.

ALONG YEN: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE)

TRANSLATOR: And vendors need protection, a fair law, and (TIMER) fair and free help.

ALONG YEN: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE)

TRANSLATOR: And thank you for your help; hopefully, it will help us with the upcoming relevant legislation. Thank you.

ALONG YEN: Okay, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you very much.

Okay, now we are going to hear from Dayton Nesbit and Christopher Leon Johnson.

Okay, Christopher, do you want to begin?

CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Yeah, I'll go. Ready?

2 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Yes.

3 CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Hello, my name
4 is Christopher Leon Johnson. On the record, I used to
5 be shop (INAUDIBLE) with 32BJ at the MTA Eastside
6 access site from 2017 to 2021. I've been a security
7 guard for 9 1/2 years until I stopped doing security,
8 and now I'm dealing with the City Council, like doing
9 what I do. I think they know what I do in the City
10 Council all over the city—the media.

11 But I want to show support for Adrienne
12 Adams' bill, Intro 1391, because the guards need a
13 real wage in the city. Why are the guards only making
14 minimum wage when they are under the union, and the
15 guards don't even get treated with the respect they
16 should get? On the job sites, the guards get treated
17 like they're the ones who get accused of everything—
18 They're the ones that are stealing. They're the ones
19 that are doing everything inside the building. The
20 guards need a lot of respect on this... on this, in
21 this city, they don't get a lot of respect. I support
22 this. I think that we do need a updated version for
23 active shooters training. I'm calling on the City
24 Council to find a way to make it where guards are
25 able to wear bulletproof vests at the job sites going

forward this. I think that if guards start wearing bulletproof vests on the sites, I mean, like a basic bulletproof vests, that this would prevent more Aland Etiennes on the job site.

One more... another thing I want to say is that I do support that the DWCP... We need like a security guard advocate in the DWCP, but I hope that the person that is the advocate is actually a security guard that has been a security guard and has an active security license and not none of the people... like no political cronies. It needs to be a real security guard advocating for security guards.

But I want to get my last 25 seconds to show I know that the Street Vendor Project was here today. I'm calling on, like ending right here, that I'm calling the City Council to pass Intro 432, and I'm calling the City Council to pass Intro 342 to protect the deliveristas.

So like I said, support this bill, Intro 1391, and I hope this bill gets passed next month. Thank you so much. Thank you. (TIMER)

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you.

DAYTON NESBIT: Good morning. My name is Dayton Nesbit; I work at Rockefeller Center. I am

also a shop steward. We come across millions of people every year on my site. This legislation is very important to all security guards, not just in New York City, but all. We put our lives on the line every day, right? If you look to your left and you look to your right, who are you seeing here? You see security, not law enforcement. You see security, right?

Our wages are not what they should be for us to live. A lot of us have to work two and three jobs, you know, or do a lot of overtime just to survive. Whereas if we're getting paid a certain wage and medical benefits, we are able to spend more time with our families. We are at work more than we are with our families, and the fact that we are not acknowledged for the jobs that we do, and all the lives and properties that we protect, is unfair.

We need better training. We need better safety equipment. Just knowledge all across the board for security. It is very, very important that the ones who protect you guys and the city and lives get protection, too. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you very much.

Our last speaker, if she is here, I will just call her name, Jessica Walker, on Zoom? Not here?

Okay, if there is anyone here who wanted to speak but didn't get... Oh, we did. Yes, yes, yes, we called you, please come down. We called you in that prior panel. Yes, yes, great, thank you.

And anyone else here who wanted to speak, who didn't speak, if so, please fill out a card. Thank you.

Just make sure to press the button until the red light goes on.

MAHMOUD ZAED: Hello, everyone. Thank you so much for giving me the chance to speak up today. My name is Mahmoud Zaed, and I have been a food vendor since 2008. And in 2009, I started my own business. Since then, I had to rent a permit through the (INAUDIBLE) market. I have never been able to obtain one under my own name.

For years, I have been forced to pay thousands of dollars every two years to people who were able to get the permit from the City, uh, directly from the City, while they only pay a small fee.

2 This system is unfair, and it needs to be
3 changed. We need the City to issue more permits and
4 to speed up the processing of getting more permits.
5 If all of the food vendors can get a permit under
6 their own name, we will be able to reduce prices and
7 costs, and also make food affordable for all New
8 Yorkers.

9 We also need more security for food
10 vendors because we are actually facing-- from the
11 government now we're actually facing a force from
12 ICE, and also people who work in the government. So
13 we also need more security for all food vendors.

14 We really need to look at Intro of 431 so
15 we can pass our bill. Thank you so much.

16 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you very much.

17 MAHMOUD ZAED: You're welcome, thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, those are all
19 the speakers for today. So I really want to thank
20 everyone for coming out for this incredibly important
21 hearing. And we are really excited to have these
22 conversations to move forward with this bill that
23 will honor Aland's life.

24 So thank you so much for all being here.
25 We really appreciate it. Thank you. [GAVEL]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date: November 3, 2025