

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES
Of the
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

----- X

April 19, 2024
Start: 10:15 a.m.
Recess: 3:34 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Chris Banks
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:
Alexa Avilés
Erik D. Bottcher
Justin L. Brannan
Darlene Mealy
Chi A. Ossé
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Pierina Ana Sanchez
Julie Won

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Amelia Walden

Eddie Rodriguez

Sheryl Boyce

Ms. Yves

Jonathan Gouveia
Executive Vice President for Real Estate
Development at NYCHA

Lakesha Miller
Executive Vice President for Leased Housing at
NYCHA

Brian Honan
Executive Vice President of Intergovernmental
Affairs at NYCHA

Brad Greenburg
Chief Compliance Officer at NYCHA

Leroy Williams
Vice President of Resident Services at NYCHA

Michael Parkinson
Director of Community and Portfolio Planning,
NYCHA Real Estate

Alix Cruz

Celines Miranda

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Ann Valdez

Crystal Glover

Zulay Velazquez

Louise Velez

Shirley Belton

Lucy Newman

Alex McDougal

August Leinbach

Cecilia MacArthur

Ramona Ferreya

Metin Sarci

Aixa Torres

Kesha Crawford
Stuyvesant Gardens

Caesar Godwall

Manuel Martinez
Chair President South Jamaica Houses, Queens
South District Chair

Renee Keitt

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Tanesha Grant

Princella Jamerson

Residents being forced to sign NDAs with
developers without lawyer present.

Annette Tomlin

Christopher Leon Johnson

Christina Chaise

Dana G Elden

Doreen Goggans

Judy Smith

Lisa Hall

Teresa L Scott

Sarah E. Morgridge

Lesley Halliday

Jeanine Lopez

Ilana Dunner

Danette Chavis

Iziah Thompson

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Yolanda Hall

Alex Stein

1
2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good morning. Good
3 morning and welcome to the New York City hybrid
4 hearing on the Committee on Public Housing. Please,
5 at this time silent all electronic devices. At no
6 time, please do not approach the dais. If you have
7 any questions, please raise your hand and one of us
8 Sergeant at Arms will kindly assist you. Thank you
9 very much for your kind cooperation. Chair Banks,
10 we're ready to begin.

11 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. [gavel]
12 This meeting is called to order. Good morning
13 everyone and welcome to this hearing, this Committee
14 on Public Housing for New York City Council. I am
15 Council Member Banks and the Chair of the Committee
16 and I'm joined by my colleagues, Council Member
17 Avilés and also-- nobody else. Hopefully the other
18 members will come. But today we are talking about
19 the Permanent Affordability Commitment Together
20 program, also known as PACT, and specifically we're
21 talking about when developments undergo the
22 conversion from traditionally public housing to PACT.
23 We're also going to be hearing Introduction 110,
24 which is sponsored by Council Member Alexa Avilés
25 which would require the Mayor-- as agency designated

1
2 by the Mayor to give us a report on the impact of the
3 PACT program. While this is my first council hearing
4 about PACT, this is far from the first time the
5 Council and this committee have examined the PACT and
6 NYCHA's public private partnership models. These
7 hearings and this oversight is important, because we
8 want residents to have the space and time to voice
9 their concerns about how also to share their stories
10 about when the PACT and how the PACT is successful--
11 or successful. Compared to a nearly 90-year history
12 of public housing, the PACT program is still new to
13 NYCHA. The Council and the residents must all work
14 together to make sure it provides to its residents
15 what it was intended to, namely safe and secure homes
16 free from hazardous conditions. Today, we are
17 looking specifically at what happens during the
18 conversion process from traditional Section 9 housing
19 which is managed by NYCHA to privately manage PACT
20 programming. My focus is on three main areas, first--
21 - what residents know, what they must do during that
22 process. Second, what NYCHA and the developers are
23 required to do and what they are actually doing. And
24 finally, how this committee and the council can
25 conduct the necessary oversight to make sure that

1
2 these residents of the quasi-public and private PACT
3 housing are not being overlooked or left to fend for
4 themselves. With the last point in mind, I'm
5 interested to know NYCHA's and the public's thoughts
6 on Intro 110. This bill would be an important
7 oversight tool for the Council, and we want it to be
8 as strong as we can make it. I would like to thank
9 my staff, Michael Lambert [sp?], along with Public
10 Housing Committee Staff, Jose, Charles, Dan,
11 Nicholas, Christopher, and Connor for all the work
12 they put into this hearing. With that, I will turn
13 it over to Council Member Avilés, my predecessor as
14 Chair, to speak about her bill. Council Member
15 Avilés?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Thank you, Chair
17 Banks. Thank you to everyone for being here today.
18 So, during my time as Chair of Public Housing, a
19 theme that would emerge over and over again in our
20 hearings was the lack of clarity top to bottom around
21 the Permanent Affordability for Commitment Together
22 program, or PACT. The PACT program allows NYCHA to
23 offload property management to private entities,
24 which theoretically should improve NYCHA's bottom
25 line, which we haven't seen materialize, and also

1
2 theoretically allows tenants to receive repairs that
3 they may have been requesting for years. Despite the
4 PACT's program being in place for years, more and
5 more developments slated for private management, we
6 still do not have answers to some of the very
7 fundamental questions. Now, I recognize that the
8 program has evolved, and certainly there are
9 successes, but there are still many gaps, and among
10 those questions, for example, is how is NYCHA
11 ensuring private managers are responsible to the
12 needs of tenants? What are the tenants' rights after
13 conversion takes place? What sorts of repairs have
14 been conducted by private management since
15 conversion? How many evictions have taken place
16 since conversion? These are a small example, and are
17 tenants actually satisfied with the conversions.
18 These are just a few of the many questions that I
19 continue to hear residents talk about after. And
20 these are just some of the questions that Intro. 110
21 aims to answer. If we are to continue to invest
22 public dollars into privatization, at minimum, we
23 should be aware of the effectiveness of the program,
24 and whether the program is carrying through on the
25 promises made to public housing residents. I look

1 forward to hearing feedback from the Administration
2 today from advocates, from residents themselves as we
3 advance this piece of legislation which will bring
4 greater transparency to NYCHA residents and to all
5 residents of New York City. Thank you, Chair and I
6 look forward to the hearing.
7

8 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you, Council
9 Member. In keeping with tradition of this committee,
10 before we hear from NYCHA, we'll hear first from a
11 panel of residents and those residents are-- we're
12 actually going to call two up at a time. We're going
13 to start with Amelia Walden and Eddie Rodriguez. And
14 you know what, Ms. Boyce, you can come on up, too.
15 And also we'll have Ms. Yves come on up. And we'll
16 start from my left, so that would be Mr. Rodriguez,
17 and then we'll--

18 EDDIE RODRIGUEZ: Thank you Committee for
19 listening to a couple points I want to make. My name
20 is Eddie Rodriguez, and I just recently moved from
21 Arizona back to New York where I grew up. I may be
22 one of the only people that's moving back in, but I'm
23 here. My mother lives in the Riis Housing projects
24 on Avenue D, and she's lived there for 40 years.
25 They're currently in the process of trying to convert

1 that over to the PACT system that's working in New
2 York. So, a couple things on that. I represent--
3 so, myself and Riis residents who are in the struggle
4 to find out more about this, what has it impacted,
5 and as an independent sort of journalist, I go around
6 the City and I actually visit these places that are
7 in the process of being converted. Eden Wald [sic] I
8 know that it's happening. Langston Hughes, been
9 there just checking the conditions out. One of the
10 issues I have is that we with NYCHA, we still have a
11 situation where we're trying to entrust NYCHA who has
12 let these building sort of get run down over the last
13 50, 60 years to be part of the process the now fix
14 them with the privatization movement. And that's a
15 trust issue that residents that I've spoken to just
16 don't have. To answer a couple of the question that
17 you said your committee has three main points, and--
18 what do residents know? Well, myself, having gone to
19 these meetings, I can see that a lot of the
20 information that's put out is very jumbled together
21 and not put in a process where the residents really
22 know what the implications once they sign on to this
23 thing are, and we're kind of seeing them around the
24 City that some of these places are either using
25

1
2 shoddy materials and so on. We see it live. And
3 what NYCHA and developers can do, there's got to be a
4 trust issue there, because we know once it becomes
5 privatized, the projections that maybe NYCHA did
6 provide no longer will exist, and that sets fear to
7 these people that are in-- a lot of them more elderly
8 than not, and so on. And then on the oversight bill,
9 I-- there absolutely has to be oversight, because
10 part of the-- part of our argument from the resident
11 standpoint is that they're openly lied to. Let's
12 just call it that. So to your three points--

13 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You could have 30
14 more seconds to finish up.

15 EDDIE RODRIGUEZ: So, the three main
16 points that you guys put out there today, it's really
17 great. Just, we need to make sure that the residents
18 really know what will occur once they sign on to
19 this. Is it for the benefit of them, or as Avenue D,
20 because it is such a coveted last spot on the River
21 that's very expensive land, let's be honest-- once
22 they fix it up. So that's a concern. We need the
23 residents who live there to stay there and be happy
24 there. Thank you.

25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. Before we
3 move on to the next person that's going to give
4 testimony, I want to remind members of the public
5 that this is a formal government proceeding, and that
6 decorum shall be observed at all times. As such,
7 members of the public shall remain silent at all
8 times. The witnesses table is reserved for people
9 who wish to testify. No video recording or
10 photography is allowed from the witness table.
11 Further, members of the public may not present audio
12 or video recordings as testimony, but may submit
13 transcripts of such recordings to the Sergeant of
14 Arms for inclusion in the hearing record. If you wish
15 to speak at today's hearing, please fill out the
16 appearance card with the Sergeant of Arms and wait to
17 be recognized. When recognized, you will have two
18 minutes to speak on today's hearing topics. Thank
19 you. Just have to get that on the record. Now, we
20 will move forward with Ms. Walden.

21 AMELIA WALDEN: My question is, first of
22 all, [inaudible] [off mic].

23 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Press the-- thank
24 you.

25

1
2 AMELIA WALDEN: Sorry. My first question
3 is, NYCHA-- under NYCHA development we did see shoddy
4 materials and work and we are still seeing that with
5 this renovation. Okay. My next one, I was served
6 papers with inaccurate service. Example, they state
7 that they left papers at my door or they came to my
8 apartment and I was not there, and I was home every
9 day. So that needs to be looked into, because I
10 figure that this is a scare tactic. The next thing
11 is we feel we are getting inferior materials, because
12 with the new stove, people have had oven fires.
13 People have had breakdown of refrigerators. One
14 person is blind and something with their stove, and
15 they wanted the daughter to go out and look for a
16 stove, which they knew this person was blind from the
17 beginning. Another one is-- I'm just finding out
18 that because I'm not refusing the risers they want to
19 put in the building-- they want to-- on my line they
20 want to put a riser to the roof. They had the
21 building since 21. They didn't notify us until late
22 May of 23. So this is like something that's pushed
23 on us, and we're not really ready for it or aware.
24 They're downsizing your apartment space, and they
25 don't want to account for it. Example, one thing, my

1
2 apartment door, it has a gap straight down the side,
3 and they put a little sweeper under the door. You can
4 see the light. You can feel the air coming in. When
5 you put in work requests, the assistant manager said
6 they don't make-- schedule appointments. The
7 appointments is very lagging. I've had appointments
8 where they first took over, HPD had to come in and
9 hire a contractor to change my door--

10 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Thirty
11 more seconds.

12 AMELIA WALDEN: to make it slam lock. Not
13 slam lock-- to make the door slam in case of a fire.
14 Okay, now our quality of life is still being affected
15 because they have automatic slam locks. People are
16 being locked out of their apartments, having to pay
17 a-- what do you call it, hardware or electrician or
18 someone to come out and let them in. Their so-called
19 security is only up to maybe 11:00 p.m. If things
20 happen before 11:00 p.m., sometimes you still don't
21 get back in in a timely manner. It happen after
22 11:00 p.m., you're stuck with a bill. So we need to
23 find out more clarity on that. I think that should
24 be it. Okay, and I wanted to know does NYCHA or HUD
25 ever visit these buildings during the renovation

1
2 process, to visit apartments to see what type of work
3 is being done? And when they hold up
4 tenants/residents rent, they don't make them aware.
5 Because I'm in the process now because we are back
6 and forth. I'm not refusing the work, but if he want
7 to break my wall or my floor for asbestos, and then
8 you still downsizing my living space, that's
9 affecting my physical and mental quality of life
10 without be compensated for anything. So now they're
11 not-- I find out they're not accepting my rent, and I
12 didn't know that until I went to the office. First,
13 they told me that it was a backlog of the rents
14 being, you know, processed. When I went there the
15 other day, day before, now the assistant manager
16 tells me that it's because the riser is not-- I won't
17 let them in to do the risers, and that's not true.

18 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. Thank
19 you, Ms. Walden, for your testimony. Now we're going
20 to move on to Ms. Boyce.

21 SHERYL BOYCE: Good morning. I didn't
22 prepare anything to speak about because at this
23 particular time we just now-- in December we selected
24 our development team that is to come into Bayview
25 [sic] Houses, and we've had a series of meetings

1 already with the residents and our development team.
2 The reason why we chose PACT was because in September
3 of 2022, I met with my Executive Board and we
4 discussed Bayview past, present, and future. The
5 past Bayview was like the country club. It was
6 considered the country club of Brooklyn housing NYCHA
7 developments. In the present due to aging and
8 there's a lot infrastructural damage due to wear and
9 tear, weather beating, and aging. Bayview first
10 opened up in 1955 which I lived there ever since it
11 opened up, and I am still there. And then we decided
12 that if it kept going the way it was going there
13 wasn't going to be a future. The development was
14 going to continue to have a steady downfall. So, we
15 decided that we could not stay Section 9 anymore. We
16 had to make a change, and we selected to go the PACT
17 conversion.
18

19 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Alright. That
20 concludes your testimony?

21 SHERYL BOYCE: For now, yes.

22 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay, thank you, Ms.
23 Boyce. Now we're going to move on to Eve. Good
24 morning.
25

1
2 MS. YVES: Thank you. I just want to say
3 first and foremost, as far as for Penn Wortman Houses
4 in East New York, they included four other
5 developments, there was a lot of things that was
6 promised that sound good, but there was a lot of
7 misinformation, false information, ad things that
8 they know that people at the time that they pressured
9 us to be able to get along or to accept this
10 PACT/RAD. We didn't have a choice, because the
11 reason why we didn't have a choice is because they
12 rushed us through the time that we were having a
13 pandemic. So everybody was afraid of being homeless.
14 That's the reason why they were forced to sign,
15 because they state that if they do not sign, you will
16 be evicted, and I feel it's very wrong and when I
17 kept bringing up that the preservation trust and
18 other things was coming about, they saying no. Not
19 six months later in June of 2022, now moving forward
20 that everybody has now the choice to vote. We didn't
21 have a choice to vote. It was only 10 percent or 20
22 percent and they use Penn-Wortman Houses to be able
23 to get the contract because they needed more Section
24 9 to be able to get the contract for the Section 8.
25 Things that was promised, not. I still have not

1
2 gotten apartment done because even though we were
3 forced to do something that we didn't want to do, we
4 was promised a lot of things. As such, as my aunt
5 said, they do not care about the residents, and the
6 reason why I'm saying you can put anything on paper
7 as stats. Stats mean nothing if nobody is checking
8 into it.

9 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You have another
10 minute.

11 MS. YVES: I fell several times. Here's a
12 picture of hospitality suites that they had
13 individuals with oxygen tank. Only 155, the A and the
14 B line, they changed the pipes. They didn't change
15 the pipes. They have obscured boxes for the fuses
16 where the juice is coming in from inside the cabinet.
17 So if there's an electrical fire, the Fire Department
18 will not know that it's inside the cabinet.
19 Department of Buildings was called nothing was done.
20 There's also a case that was stemming from the PACT
21 and the RAD that was filed on 06-02-2021, case number
22 121CV04372 where a judge stated that the PACT and the
23 RAD is inhumane and that one-- let's be clear, the
24 PACT and RAD is not law. The PACT and RAD is a
25 program. Okay? So we were forced to do like-- as

1
2 currently, I am going to be evicted because I refuse
3 to sign the lease, okay? So, I have an email also
4 from HUD stating that leases should have been signed
5 prior to the contract of conversion. That did not
6 happen. They, meaning C&C Management, and the
7 language that they use, they always want to be able
8 not to say who's the landlord, but NYCHA is the one
9 calling the shots, but it's like something like Ponzi
10 scheme going on and it's wrong. Okay? I am being
11 victimized. My car was set on fire. I fell down the
12 stairs at least 22 times from the time that C&C under
13 this conversion. The things that's happening makes
14 no sense. The Tenant Association, everybody that's
15 supposed to do what they're supposed to do is not
16 doing it. It's nothing but lies, and it's true.
17 Who's checking behind them? C&C checks behind the
18 contractor. The contractor check behind C&C. It's
19 HUD. Radiator covers, they didn't change the coils.
20 They didn't do a lot of things that going to say.
21 They sound like used car salesman. Until-- and then
22 you get-- what they doing is wrong, and I'm being
23 victimized, okay? Every time I try to reach out some
24 ways, nobody is doing anything about it. Because,
25 you know why, they say I gossip. I am being

1
2 tormented because they say that I'm the one who in
3 fact, okay, called the Department of Justice and the
4 DOI in regards to all this fraud that's going on and
5 so forth and so on. They don't know that. And if
6 so, that is my given right, okay? So, resident--

7 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Thank
8 you.

9 MS. YVES: engagement does not help at
10 all.

11 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you.

12 MS. YVES: with the process that's going
13 on.

14 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. Thank
15 you. We have a couple of questions for the panel.
16 I'm going to let-- yes. Council Member Brannan has
17 joined us, so we want to recognize him. Also, again,
18 guys we're going to allow for questions to the panel.
19 I'm going to turn it over to Council Member Avilés
20 and then I'm going to come back and ask some
21 questions myself.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Thank you so much
23 for your testimony. I wanted to follow up with you.
24 Ms. Walden, is that correct? Okay, thank you. Could
25 you-- you mentioned the key situation which has been

1 an ongoing issue across NYCHA, and it seems like
2 particularly in conversion has not been addressed.

3 Can you state it again for the record, what is
4 happening with the keys, and why would you have to--
5 or any resident, would have to pay more money to the
6 management company?
7

8 AMELIA WALDEN: Okay, what happened, like
9 I said, they had it since 21. They only notified us
10 limited information May of 23. So, when you buy a
11 house or whatever, whatever, don't you check the
12 heating, electricity, and so and so, the major
13 things? We feel that wasn't done. So when they
14 thrust this onto us a the last minute, they wanted to
15 come in and break my floor, say asbestos. I refuse,
16 because you're supposed to have certain precautions
17 in place before you do that. They wanted to move you
18 out of the apartment for 30 days to another
19 apartment. I'm not refusing, but I need to find out
20 what's right and what's wrong. Okay. On the C line,
21 I'm on the top floor. They want to go into the wall,
22 put what they call a riser, put pipes in the wall,
23 taking away some of my closet space which is right in
24 my living room. So I told them no. First of all,
25 when you put that electric panel-- when you move it

1 from one side of the kitchen to the other concealing
2 the wall-- there was cabinets. There was pipes with
3 cabinets. They put a fake or false wall from the top
4 of the ceiling down to the bottom of the floor. Now
5 where that electric panel stop, there's nothing under
6 that space, but still my dining, look, is small.
7 When you do that, you taking up part of my space. So
8 I told them I don't know longer have four rooms.
9 Now, they want to do the closet, downsize. They told
10 me they'd build a closet and put it in my living
11 room. I said do you know how unsightly that would
12 look. So, they don't even want to reduce my rent or
13 anything, so they took me to court. They made an
14 agreement with the judge. The judge told them come
15 to conclusion. So far, management is still trying to
16 get out of me, do I still plan on pursuing. S o I
17 told them speak with my lawyer. I don't let him know
18 that I know you're trying to get information from me,
19 but now I found out that from February on my rent
20 receipts, it's like I'm behind in my rent. So, two
21 times I went to the office, the person available for
22 leasing wasn't available. I went down to NYCHA on
23 Atlantic Avenue. They say I'm not converted. My
24 voucher's not [inaudible]. So now the manager's
25

1
2 telling me the other day that they're not accepting
3 my rent. So the person was trying to give me my
4 money order for that. So I told her no, you keep it.
5 Give me something-- she's telling me that this is why
6 my rent is stating that I owe this and I owe that.
7 So whatever paper they gave me it wasn't sufficient
8 for me, but what-- I didn't know that they were on--
9 waiting for me, not waiting for me. That they didn't
10 call me into the office. They interviewed me in the
11 waiting area. That they were on the phone with their
12 lawyer, so their lawyer is telling them what to do.
13 So I told them-- the assistant manager, he's telling
14 me call your lawyer, maybe you all should come to a
15 conclusion. I said no, tell your lawyer to call my
16 lawyer and then they can settle it with that. So now
17 I'm receiving-- they' not accepting my rent. So
18 that's February, March and April. So I guess I'll be
19 getting another receipt. They didn't let me know
20 that they was holding the rent. And they are doing
21 it to other tenants, but other tenants are not
22 speaking up and speaking out.

23 UNIDENTIFIED: They're afraid.

24 AMELIA WALDEN: We have the right to ask
25 questions and get legit answers. And I'm going to

1
2 give you another example. I don't know what they're
3 doing with the smoke alarms, because the people with
4 disabilities they should have those smoke alarms,
5 especially the hard of hearing or blind also, that
6 speaks-- vibrates and, you know, whatever and
7 whatever. I call the Fire Department myself and got
8 them to go to a person's apartment who doesn't hear
9 or speak, and they set up the whole thing and showed
10 the son how to use and the mother. They're not doing
11 that with us. So we feel we are getting inferior
12 materials because for someone's refrigerator to break
13 down and oven to catch fire, and these supposed to be
14 new materials. What are we getting, refurbished or
15 what? They don't even give you any information.
16 They gave us information with the stove. No
17 information with the refrigerator. If you wanted to
18 know what model, they have no in-- it's just that we
19 feel we are being treated unfairly, and it's no
20 different than from when NYCHA had it, because we're
21 still having major problems. Now, if you break my
22 wall in my living room and if I become ill with
23 asbestos poisoning, who's going to compensate me when
24 I'm dead. I would know nothing about it.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Just have one.

3 Ms. Walden, if there is a-- I guess you mentioned a
4 number of repairs, but have you ever received a price
5 list that you would have to pay for obtaining any
6 repairs in your apartment?

7 AMELIA WALDEN: They do the repairs, but
8 not in a timely manner. When HPD discovered that my
9 original apartment door did not close completely,
10 they put that as a violation from January. Not until
11 March did management look into. HPD had to-- when he
12 said hire outside contractor to come and make sure
13 that door is safe for me and my apartment. Now, the
14 new door they put up, it's still not fitting it.
15 Draft is coming in from the hallway. You can see the
16 light form the hallway clearly through that whole
17 side door where the lock is, and air is coming in and
18 under the bottom.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Got it, and in
20 terms of the complaint system, you mentioned that
21 they're not scheduling appointments. What is the
22 complaint system and scheduling appointments look
23 like under a conversion?

24 AMELIA WALDEN: Okay, I've been putting
25 in complaints since 2023, 01-23.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Like, is it like
3 the NYCHA calls? Do they have a system where you get
4 a ticket number? What is that-- is there a system?

5 AMELIA WALDEN: First [inaudible] that
6 they had, the manager. I had to go to the office and
7 ask to give me a confirmation or some sort of
8 tracking. And what did she say that-- okay, she'll
9 look into it. So now they do give you a work order,
10 you know, with the number on it and the date, but as
11 far as the repairs being addressed in a timely
12 manner, no. just like that door. Maybe if a fire
13 occurred, maybe I would be done by now. But they had
14 to call an outside contractor, and the same thing
15 with the door now, I've been putting it int. And
16 here this was from January, then I put it in again.,
17 but they're telling me as long as the ticket is open
18 and the repairs is not done, the secretary they have
19 to say that they can't create another ticket. The
20 manager said they don't make scheduled appointments.
21 So how are you supposed to know when they are coming
22 out?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: That is a very
24 interesting and disturbing fact.

1
2 AMELIA WALDEN: Well, at a construction
3 meeting-- they use to have a construction meeting--
4 well, they still have it every Monday and I mentioned
5 that. And the assistant manager blatantly said, we
6 don't schedule appointments. So, people at the
7 table, their heads turned. They couldn't believe
8 that he was saying something like that.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Thank you so
10 much, and thank you for looking at for your
11 neighbors, particularly your disabled neighbors who
12 are actually not being looked out after. They're
13 lucky to have you as a neighbor. Thank you, Chair.

14 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you, Council
15 Member. I have a question for Yves pertaining to the
16 initial stages of when the conversion, the tenants
17 were notified that RAD/PACT or that Penn-Wortman
18 Houses was going to be converted.

19 MS. YVES: Correct.

20 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: What was the level of
21 engagement by NYCHA as far as explaining or setting
22 up meetings with the tenants, and in your opinion,
23 would you say that the tenants were satisfied with
24 the information that they got from NYCHA--

25 MS. YVES: [interposing] No.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: pertaining to this
3 conversion and how it was going to look?

4 MS. YVES: No. From the very beginning
5 they tried to discretely have a meeting back in 2020,
6 quietly, and I got wind of it through the bearings
7 [sic]. I was on that call where they asked me to
8 gather a certain amount of tenants. My aunt was on
9 there. And at first they was saying no, no, no, no,
10 but it was yes, but they were saying that they were
11 talking to us regarding this two years prior from the
12 time that they was in talk of that. Now, form
13 November of 2020 up until now, I have been to every
14 meeting, not meeting been-- but in-person, meaning
15 over the phone. Ever since December 21 when they
16 received the contract for this PACT/RAD, everything
17 ceased. I have an email from HUD, okay, where it
18 states that certain things that should have been
19 done, X, Y, it's not being done. Every month, C&C
20 Management is supposed to have a construction meeting
21 with the residents. it's meaning that they're
22 supposed to have the meeting, but what they do is
23 they monopolize the Tenant Association Board meeting
24 to come 10, 15 minutes, walk around, talk, and they
25 want the tenants from the Board to be able to explain

1 the process, and the Board is not even correct right
2 now. From-- when the Board became established in
3 2021 to now it's still dysfunctional. What they do
4 is they focus on whoever. I'm not saying-- I can be
5 opposed to it. She can be with it. Everybody is
6 entitled to their own opinion, but when you take a
7 position and you're supposed to be there for the
8 tenants, you're supposed to advocate for them,
9 because that's the reason why you act on it. What
10 they do is they only choose and they like for people
11 to-- in other words, everything I say, even when I
12 was on the Zoom calls, Brian Honan, I had to contact
13 an attorney, okay, because everybody-- I think you
14 did a walk-through with me one time when you just
15 happened to be passing by and when I was-- they were
16 doing a walk-through with the Bronx. Everybody that
17 came to do a walk-through-- they didn't do a walk-
18 through with us. They just- like I said, just
19 breezed through everything with us. They did a walk-
20 through with the TA Presidents in the Bronx. They
21 made a makeshift apartment to show everything was
22 nice, and they tried to keep you at bay. Since under
23 the PACT and the RAD, for east New York under the
24 five development that went under the PACT and the
25

1
2 RAD, everything is going awry. And even when I went
3 to a meeting at the Pink Houses, and I believe Nikki
4 Lucas [sp?] was there, where they had a panel of
5 NYCHA workers that was there. I allow everybody to
6 speak, because when I speak I like to listen to
7 everybody, because if they don't know, they don't
8 know what they walking into. I was able--

9 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Ms.
10 Yves--

11 MS. YVES: to find out-- I was able to
12 have them say that the PACT and the RAD in Penn-
13 Wortman and Linden--

14 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Okay.

15 MS. YVES: is not working.

16 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: In your honest
17 opinion--

18 MS. YVES: Yes.

19 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: when it comes to that
20 early stages of engagement, how would you rate NYCHA
21 on that early stage--

22 MS. YVES: Well, you mean--

23 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] How
24 would you-- I mean, if you--

25 MS. YVES: Meaning as far as--

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] If you
3 had to rate them, was it--

4 MS. YVES: [interposing] as far as for
5 them promoting it?

6 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Promoting it, giving
7 you accurate information?

8 MS. YVES: No, no, misinformation.

9 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: But I-- right. Would
10 you say that--

11 MS. YVES: [interposing] So, they were
12 honored to get the contract--

13 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] the
14 information--

15 MS. YVES: [interposing] That's what I'm
16 saying.

17 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay.

18 MS. YVES: You can always give stats.
19 And you can always give-- we don't know what they're
20 submitting. They were supposed to have meeting with
21 us. How do we know what they submitting to HUD--

22 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Right.

23 MS. YVES: to be able to get the
24 approval? We don't know. So we would have to go
25 through the Freedom of Information Act, and then

1
2 there's also one for when you're dealing with the
3 Federal Government. I forgot the name of it, the
4 acronym, but you can also get that. How do we know
5 what's being submitted? We don't know what's being
6 submitted.

7 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you.

8 MS. YVES: We don't know what's being
9 submitted.

10 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Alright, thank you.
11 Yes, another question by Council Member Avilés.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: I'm sorry. Thank
13 you. Thank you. I'd like to follow up with Mr.
14 Rodriguez. Mr. Rodriguez, you're talking-- you
15 mentioned how the information that is being offered
16 is just-- it seems not accessible and that the
17 implications of what is being presented is unclear.
18 Can you just tell us like what you've seen the
19 interaction be about what is being presented, where
20 are the gaps? Is it-- are-- is information also
21 being provided in multiple languages so that
22 residents can understand what's happening?

23 EDDIE RODRIGUEZ: So, from the documents
24 I saw, you know, they were putting up pamphlets on
25 people's doors and saying, okay, these are the days

1 when the meeting are going to be held. I don't know
2 that that was as much of an issue as the thickness of
3 the packet that needed to be reviewed in a short
4 period of time. Just looking at it as a former
5 educator, it was almost-- it's like if a kid misses
6 class for a couple weeks and he comes back and you
7 give him a packet, right? He could do the packet,
8 but he's going to miss that interaction in between,
9 that kind of sense of-- and then when the meetings
10 occurred, and I went to every one of the meetings
11 representing my mom, they couldn't answer the most
12 basic questions when we were telling them that-- you
13 know, we were telling the residents in essence, make
14 sure that you understand that once this RAD/PACT
15 thing takes into play, you don't have the negotiation
16 skills that you do have with let's say, NYCHA, if you
17 fall behind on rent, kind of that stuff. What we're
18 seeing from door-to-door knocking and talking to
19 folks like this young lady said, is that the work is
20 not quality and the evictions are being-- notices are
21 being put out. And we're seeing it at Riis Housing,
22 and that hasn't even converted over. So that's why
23 we are, you know, steadfast in-- I know your
24 oversight may look at some of these things, but what
25

1
2 we're seeing is that the information is willfully not
3 put forth in a respectful manner of the residents.
4 And I'll tell you-- and I can equal that to say that
5 they openly lie at these meetings, and when we
6 confront them with information about say who is
7 paying you, like those sort of things that people
8 should have the right to know, they can't answer
9 them. And with the tenants association we have the
10 same issues. They-- and I don't blame them fully,
11 because like this lady said, when they go and we go
12 to these meetings, they're not prepared with the
13 questions that the residents want answered. If they
14 going to sign onto this thing-- I can see it from say
15 the ground level where it hasn't kicked in yet, but
16 now with the testimony that they're giving, once it's
17 kicked in what we've been saying is what will happen,
18 that the residents will be left behind, the residents
19 that they say that they're going to help is not who
20 they're going to help. And that's our stance on
21 that, that it's all rigged in their direction.

22 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Alright. We conclude
23 this panel, let me just recognize Council-- we've
24 been joined by Council Member Sanchez. And also too,
25 we have in the balcony, we have some students,

1 college students from Guttman College. They're here
2 with their Urban Planning class. So we want to
3 welcome you and thank you for being a part of our
4 hearing today. Now, we're going to bring up NYCHA,
5 and thank you. Thank you for your testimony. Thank
6 you for your testimony. We've been also joined by
7 Council Member Darlene Mealy. Okay, thank you.
8 We're going to swear you in.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Please raise your
11 right hands. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the
12 whole truth and nothing but the truth in your
13 testimony before this committee and to respond
14 honestly to Council Member questions? You can begin.

15 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You can begin. Thank
16 you. You can identify yourself before you begin.
17 Thank you.

18 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Good
19 morning, Chair Chris Banks, members of the Committee
20 on Public Housing, other distinguished members of the
21 City Council, NYCHA residents, community advocates,
22 and members of the public. Good morning. I am
23 Jonathan Gouveia, NYCHA's Executive Vice President
24 for Real Estate Development. I am pleased to be
25 joined by Lakesha Miller, Executive Vice President

1
2 for Leased Housing, Brian Honan, Executive Vice
3 President of Intergovernmental Affairs, and other
4 members of NYCHA's team. Thank you for this
5 opportunity to discuss PACT, an incredibly impactful
6 initiative that is investing billions of dollars to
7 completely renovate or rebuild the homes of thousands
8 of NYCHA residents, dramatically improving their
9 quality of life. PACT also provides residents with
10 professional property management and valuable social
11 services, all while maintaining their rights and
12 protections and keeping their rent permanently
13 affordable. I would like to thank the residents who
14 spoke about the program earlier today. Collaboration
15 with residents is a fundamental feature of the PACT
16 initiative as it transforms their developments into a
17 safer, healthier, and more beautiful place to live
18 and for the generations to come. Please-- thank you.
19 As you know, the capital needs across NYCHA's
20 portfolio have risen to an astonishing nearly \$80
21 billion, an unacceptable reality that residents know
22 all too well, as manifested every day by elevator and
23 heating outages-- you can go to the next slide--
24 leaking roofs and facades, bursting pipes, and mold
25 and lead unabated. At the same time, for decades the

1 federal government has failed to provide public
2 housing authorities across the nation with sufficient
3 funding to keep their properties in a state of good
4 repair. To address this critical and existential
5 issue head-on, NYCHA is using the PACT program to
6 bring billions of dollars in desperately needed
7 investment to our developments. PACT is NYCHA's
8 implementation of HUD's Rental Assistance
9 Demonstration program, and it is enabling us to
10 radically transform many of our properties through
11 top-to-bottom apartment, building, and grounds
12 renovations. Next slide, please. To date, over
13 20,000 apartments have been converted to Project-
14 Based Section 8 through the PACT program, and a
15 record \$1.8 billion in financing for capital repairs
16 was closed in 2023 across four PACT deals. One
17 hundred and thirty-eight developments comprising over
18 37,000 apartments are in either the engagement or
19 pre-development process, under construction, or have
20 received comprehensive repairs through PACT.
21 Essentially, the PACT program facilitates billions in
22 repairs and investment for our NYCHA community. Right
23 now, 57 developments are under active construction,
24 representing over \$3.9 billion in construction work
25

1
2 happening across the city, work that we would not be
3 able to accomplish without PACT considering the lack
4 of federal capital funding available. Next slide,
5 please. To bring comprehensive repairs and
6 renovations to residents' homes, and address a
7 development's entire range of capital needs, PACT
8 leverages the more dependable and valuable Section 8
9 funding stream. As shown in the slideshow, key
10 improvements include brand-new kitchens, bathrooms,
11 windows, and apartment floors-- next slide-- updated
12 common areas like laundry rooms, mail rooms, and
13 building entrances-- next slide please-- critically
14 important upgrades to building systems, such as
15 elevators, boilers, roofs, windows, and facades, and
16 improved grounds, including landscaping, lighting,
17 security, and playgrounds. Next slide, please.
18 Environmental hazards such as lead, asbestos, and
19 mold are abated, and our PACT partners offer
20 professional property management and enhanced on-site
21 social services and community programming. After
22 conversion, all PACT developments remain under public
23 control. NYCHA remains the permanent owner of the
24 land and buildings, administers the Section 8
25 subsidy, and continues to monitor conditions at a

1 development following its conversion to Section 8.
2 NYCHA's Leased Housing Department is the largest
3 Section 8 administrator in the country. As the
4 subsidy administrator for the program, NYCHA
5 continues to set each household's rent based on their
6 annual income and oversees the creation of the
7 Section 8 waitlist. Next slide, please. NYCHA also
8 has a specific team called Resident Outreach for
9 Conversion and Modernization Services who continue to
10 conduct outreach to residents and support resident
11 leaders at PACT sites after conversion. This is just
12 one of the many teams supporting residents, and the
13 PACT process itself, to make the engagement and
14 transition as seamless as possible. Fundamental to
15 our PACT program is centering resident priorities and
16 expertise. Residents are not only involved at every
17 step of the PACT planning process but also help lead
18 the selection of partner teams, prioritize
19 investments, and work in partnership with our PACT
20 partners after conversion. During the planning
21 process, we partner with resident leaders to share
22 information and to keep residents informed and answer
23 any questions. In partnership with these leaders, we
24 host regular meetings and conduct tabling, office
25

1 hours, open houses, info sessions, and workshops. A
2 PACT Resource Team is also supporting our resident
3 leaders by connecting them with trusted, third-party
4 advisors and consultants. Free legal assistance is
5 available to residents via a PACT hotline operated by
6 the Legal Aid Society. Resident committees have now
7 selected 19 partner teams. This includes developers,
8 general contractors, property managers, and social
9 services providers who will elevate their quality of
10 life and address priorities for their community. In
11 2023 alone, resident leaders across 30 developments,
12 representing over 14,000 residents, have selected
13 PACT partner teams to provide their communities with
14 tailored investments through the program. Together,
15 our partners and residents are creating detailed
16 community plans to capture their planning and
17 decision-making during the pre-development process.
18 An example of how fundamental resident participation
19 is to the PACT process: After about five years of
20 extensive resident engagement and planning, residents
21 of Fulton and Elliott-Chelsea Houses expressed their
22 preference to entirely rebuild their campuses as part
23 of PACT. Next slide, please. In 2022, NYCHA partnered
24 with BFJ Planning, an independent planning and
25

1 consulting firm, to conduct a comprehensive survey at
2 our converted PACT sites. We are distributing surveys
3 to all converted developments on a rolling basis, and
4 have collected results from Ocean Bay, Baychester,
5 Murphy, and Betances. The majority of residents who
6 responded to the survey have expressed strong
7 satisfaction with the PACT program. As you'll see on
8 this slide, 70 percent of respondents recommend the
9 PACT program for other NYCHA developments and nearly
10 the same amount say they feel more stable in their
11 living situation. This is because residents are very
12 satisfied with the new management teams and the
13 renovations. As you can see on this slide, 77 percent
14 of residents who responded are very satisfied with
15 the renovations to the buildings and even more are
16 satisfied with the renovations to the grounds. Two
17 out of three respondents say that their new
18 management is better than NYCHA, and 78 percent of
19 residents say that the buildings and grounds are
20 cleaner. We will continue to survey residents and
21 collect their direct feedback on the program. Survey
22 responses have helped us understand what is working;
23 they also help us determine how we can improve the
24 program so NYCHA and our partners can better serve
25

1 residents. Next slide, please. Transparency and
2 accountability are also fundamental features of PACT.
3 In line with those values, we recently launched the
4 new PACT Dashboard, which provides an unprecedented
5 level of insight into the PACT program. Available to
6 anyone online, it tracks and displays performance
7 metrics on maintenance and repairs, tenancy, and
8 construction, including resident hiring, across the
9 PACT program and at individual PACT sites. For
10 instance, the Dashboard shows that all PACT partners
11 are addressing work orders within 30 days. It also
12 shows that PACT partners are making significant
13 progress with rehabilitation work, with five projects
14 reaching over 50 percent completion in 2023. We
15 believe the PACT Dashboard supports the intent of
16 Introduction 110-2024, in reference to reports on the
17 PACT program. We also wanted to take some time this
18 morning to provide clarity about the PACT program.
19 First, we'd like to discuss the differences and
20 similarities of the Section 9 and Section 8 programs.
21 Both programs are funded by the federal government
22 and are HUD programs. Section 9 is funded annually
23 by Congress, with funding fluctuating year to year.
24 Funding by the federal government is insufficient to
25

1 cover the costs of long-term maintenance and capital
2 needs of public housing. As shared earlier, this is
3 evident by the fact that NYCHA's recent Physical
4 Needs Assessment reflects nearly \$80 billion in major
5 repair needs across the city. The Section 8 program,
6 however, comes with a 20-year contract guaranteeing a
7 set amount of funding each year, and by law that
8 contract must be renewed in perpetuity. Section 8
9 also provides a larger subsidy amount per household
10 than the traditional Section 9 program. Given this
11 guaranteed funding stream, our partners are able to
12 raise debt to fund all capital repairs and save for
13 capital repairs that will be needed in the future.
14 In both programs, NYCHA owns the land and the
15 buildings. Through the PACT program, NYCHA enters
16 into a ground lease with each partner team,
17 maintaining our ownership of the building. In both
18 programs, rent continues to be 30 percent of a
19 household's adjusted gross income. I'd also like to
20 confirm that all resident protections under Section 9
21 program will continue to apply after a household
22 converts to Project-Based Section 8 through the PACT
23 program. These protections are codified in NYCHA's
24 agreements with all PACT partners and between the
25

1 PACT partner and each tenant. It is rumored that the
2 PACT program will displace residents from their
3 homes. This is not true. Under the federal RAD
4 program, all current public housing residents have
5 the right to return to an apartment in their
6 development if they need to move temporarily for
7 construction, hazard mitigation, or any redevelopment
8 activities. The federal RAD program was designed to
9 keep residents in their homes. We bolster this
10 federal requirement by requiring all partners to sign
11 temporary move agreements with each household. And
12 lastly, I'd like to clarify any misconceptions around
13 evictions at PACT sites. The PACT program, in
14 accordance with federal rules and regulations,
15 provides strong anti-displacement protections for
16 residents. At the time of conversion to Project-
17 Based Section 8, all authorized residents will be
18 offered a new lease, regardless of whether they owe
19 back rent. In addition to providing all current NYCHA
20 tenants a lease, NYCHA requires our PACT partners to
21 work with on-site social service coordinators to
22 conduct proactive outreach to help connect families
23 with resources, such as accessing public benefits or
24 setting up payment installment plans. PACT partners
25

1
2 must make every effort to avoid bringing a lease
3 issue to Housing Court, and NYCHA closely monitors
4 these outreach efforts. Lease agreements
5 automatically renew every year and cannot be
6 terminated except for good cause, which includes
7 criminal activity and nonpayment. Residents can
8 continue to add people to their household, and
9 permanent members will continue to have succession
10 rights. In sum, residents at PACT sites benefit from
11 the multiple layers of oversight, the comprehensive
12 repairs and renovations, and the numerous
13 opportunities provided to their community through
14 enhanced social services and connections to jobs. We
15 all know how critical NYCHA is to New York City in
16 providing safe, decent, and permanently affordable
17 homes for families across the city. With nearly \$80
18 billion in capital needs across the portfolio, we
19 also know how critical programs like PACT are in
20 ensuring that NYCHA can continue to carry out its
21 vital mission. Our goal is not only to breathe new
22 life into our developments, we are also striving to
23 transform NYCHA as an organization, so it is better
24 adapted to the funding realities of the day and can
25 serve residents in a strong and sustainable way.

1
2 Together, residents, community advocates, elected
3 officials, and NYCHA staff, we can ensure the
4 Authority remains a vital bastion of affordable
5 housing, for today and for the decades to come.
6 Thank you. We are happy to answer any questions you
7 may have.

8 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Before we go forth
9 with questions for the panel, let me just recognize
10 the 6th, and 7th, and 8th grade from Eagle Academy.
11 [applause] From the Bronx, y'all could do better than
12 that. Thank you. And they're also from, I believe,
13 Council Member Steven's district. Now, thank you
14 again for the testimony, and I guess we-- some of the
15 questions were answered through the presentation on
16 overall numbers. I want to know what is, in general,
17 what's the general time frame for when under
18 construction development is completed? What's the
19 general timeline?

20 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So,
21 from the date when we do the conversion or the
22 closing, it typically takes two to three years to
23 complete a renovation. The timing will vary depending
24 on the size of the development as well as, you know,
25 the level of work that has to be done. So, if it

1 needs to be extensive, like in the case of
2 Williamsburg Houses where there needs to be extensive
3 lead abatement then it could take more time than, you
4 know, the two-year time frame that we generally aim
5 for.
6

7 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Is a timeframe
8 stipulated in the initial contract with NYCHA?

9 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Yes.

10 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And for the 54 in
11 planning and engagement, when should we expect those
12 developments to be fully converted?

13 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So,
14 all of those projects are currently going through the
15 pre-development process which means the PACT partners
16 are on-site developing their scopes at work,
17 conducting resident engagement, and all of those
18 projects will be closing or converting through 2024
19 and 2025.

20 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. Also, just
21 to get clarity, how many developments and units are
22 expected to transition into the PACT program by 2030?

23 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: The
24 commitment that was made in December of 2018 was to
25 convert 62,000 units through PACT.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And how will future
3 developments be chosen by the PACT program?

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: We
5 look at a number of metrics, but there are three
6 areas that we focus on. Number one is the level of
7 deterioration as primarily determined by the physical
8 needs assessment. We also look at sites where NYCHA
9 struggles to provide sufficient management and, you
10 know, day-to-day property management, I guess. So
11 those are the two areas that we look at primarily,
12 and then we also of course work with residents to
13 make sure that there's buy-in.

14 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Specifically, will
15 developments ever be entered into the PACT program
16 without a resident vote?

17 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Sorry,
18 say that again?

19 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Will developments be
20 entered into the PACT program without a resident
21 vote?

22 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So, we
23 work with residents and follow their lead, and you
24 know, right now we have not had a vote on a PACT
25 site. We work with resident leadership and the wider

1
2 resident body, and if we collectively feel that
3 there's support to move forward with PACT, we will do
4 so.

5 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, residents don't
6 have a say as to if they want to be entered into the
7 PACT program. It's-- they're compelled based off of
8 the points you pointed out?

9 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: No, we
10 will have-- again, we will work with the resident
11 leaders at first, and if they are interested in the
12 PACT, we will then host a number of meetings with the
13 larger resident body and gauge interest, and if there
14 is interest, we will proceed. And, you know, if not,
15 then that's a different-- and I think Brian might
16 want to add something.

17 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, let me just ask
18 you this, specifically. What amount of support will
19 be required to move a development into the PACT
20 program?

21 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So,
22 far we've been able to gauge it just based on the
23 meetings that we've been having with residents, you
24 know.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, there's no
3 numerical number? There's no threshold? There's no-
4 - obviously you said there's no voting.

5 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: That
6 is correct.

7 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Once the--

8 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
9 [interposing] So far that is correct.

10 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, am I correct that
11 once the tenant association makes that decision, they
12 speak for the entire development?

13 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: No.
14 As I said, we will have-- we go from the tenant
15 association meetings. Then we have larger meetings
16 with the larger resident body, and if collectively
17 between the leadership and the-- you know, the
18 resident body and ourselves, we feel like there's a
19 good project here, we will move forward.

20 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Brian, you had
21 something to add?

22 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Sure.
23 Thank you so much, Council Member, and thank you for
24 giving us the opportunity to-- and the federal law
25 does not require a percentage of residents to support

1
2 a PACT project for conversion. However, we have
3 engaged residents in certain sites, and they have
4 told us no, we're not interested in this program.
5 And Jonathan's team have plenty of work to do
6 throughout the City. We have no interest in forcing
7 this on residents. The thing is, our conditions
8 right now have, as you all know, we have \$78 billion
9 dollars in capital needs. We have developments in
10 your district, for instance. You know, Boulevard
11 Houses and Linden Houses were both built by the City
12 of New York and had no operating or capital funding.
13 We needed to find a source of funding for that
14 development. We engaged the residents there for
15 almost two years before we were able to convert that
16 property. Fiorentino Plaza, as you know, again in
17 your district, conditions were there so bad that the
18 residents had to be relocated. What we're seeing at
19 properties right now is that residents are eager to
20 get the renovations that they deserve, renovations
21 that they wanted for years, and so we are really
22 interested in engaging with residents who want either
23 of those programs.

24 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: I mean, one thing I
25 could agree with you is that there are residents and

1
2 I think majority of the residents-- I think all the
3 residents want better living conditions within NYCHA.
4 It's just how they go about getting there. And you
5 know, from my opinion and from speaking to residents
6 in my district, RAD/PACT hasn't been the best program
7 that has been forced upon the tenants or that has
8 been given to the tenants. Particularly, what
9 information about the amount of public support will
10 be shared with the residents, the Council and the
11 public for the-- sorry-- and the public for
12 developments entering into a PACT pro-- without a
13 PACT program?

14 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Once
15 again, in order to do conversion, we are not required
16 to take, you know, surveys and to hold votes. So it
17 would be -- we wouldn't have that information.
18 However, we do go through extensive votes. Now,
19 votes-- excuse me. Meetings that we have regularly,
20 you know, with residents. The attendance is very
21 good. We have residents who participate from very,
22 very early onto the process all the way up to
23 selecting development teams and social service teams.
24 So residents, you know,-- the goal here is to make
25 sure that we have very engaged residents throughout

1
2 the process from before conversion to after
3 conversion and moving forward.

4 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. With the
5 introduction of the Trust, has the implementation of
6 the Trust resulted in any reorganization or
7 management changes at NYCHA in relation to the PACT
8 program?

9 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: I would
10 say no, not in relation to the PACT program. We do
11 have a team, though, in place, a very small team that
12 now look-- you know, at two sites we've had elections
13 which is Nostrand Houses, and Bronx River addition.
14 We have a small team that engages tenants around
15 there around the elections, and we also have two
16 other elections that are in process at Coney Island
17 Houses and Coney Island site 1B, otherwise known as
18 Unity, but in terms of the way the real estate team,
19 you know, functions it really has-- they've been
20 engaged with that team to make sure that residents
21 have information on, you know, all the choices, but
22 in the way they do business, I wouldn't say so.
23 Jonathan can speak more to the Department.

24

25

1
2 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: I
3 would just reiterate what Brian said. It has not at
4 this point changed the way real estate does its work.

5 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: When a property shifts
6 from public housing to RAD, we've been told that Real
7 Estate Department along with the Community
8 Development and Lease Housing Department all have a
9 role in overseeing the RAD properties. How is
10 responsibility divided amongst these offices?

11 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
12 again, I've got Lakesha Miller here from our Leased
13 Housing. So there is certainly a Section 8
14 administration oversight in terms of, you know, the
15 wait list, recertifications, and subsidy
16 administration, and Lakesha can chime in with a
17 little bit more if necessary. Within the real estate
18 group we have a Design and Construction team. The
19 construction team goes out and does random
20 inspections to make sure that the construction is
21 progressing as expected, and our Asset Management
22 team collects monthly data from all of the PACT
23 partners on a range of issues, you know, from work
24 orders and resolution of those work orders, to
25 tenancy proceedings, legal proceedings, Section 3

1
2 hiring, and financial performance. And then NYCHA
3 also has a Compliance team, and they also go out and
4 do spots or inspections to make sure that the
5 projects are complying with all relevant rules and
6 regulations.

7 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, is there a
8 designated person who's responsible for all the
9 issues at any particular development?

10 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Within
11 NYCHA?

12 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Yeah.

13 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: I
14 mean, it depends on the issue, right? So, if it is a
15 Section 8 related issue--

16 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Right.

17 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: it
18 would be Lakesha and her team. If it's related to the
19 monthly reporting or construction that I mentioned,
20 it would be within my team, and each-- the Design and
21 Construction team and the Asset Management team have
22 leadership there, so they would be primarily
23 accountable.

24

25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, there's no single
3 point-person that will resolve an issue or mediate an
4 issue that may arise?

5 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: it's
6 all dependent upon what the issue would be so that we
7 can make sure that we're, you know, bringing the
8 right expertise to whatever the issue happens to be.

9 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. Well, how
10 often do regular meetings and communications take
11 place around any particular development?

12 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: There
13 are numerous meetings happening all the time. Again,
14 depending on what the issues may be and where the
15 projects are in the lifecycle. So, when we're in the
16 pre-development stage, we are out there-- you know,
17 we have scheduled meetings, and we're also willing to
18 go out at any time to resolve issues. So there's--
19 you know, there's not necessarily-- you know, we're
20 only-- we're not only committing to a thick schedule.
21 We will go out and make sure we're addressing
22 resident concerns in real-time. You know, during the
23 construction phase we are typically having monthly
24 meetings, and post-construction we're also out at the
25 sites very regular, as well.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Does anyone who
3 worked at the development before pre-conversion still
4 work at the development after the conversion?

5 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
6 Existing property management staff certainly have the
7 opportunity and option to take up employment with the
8 new managers. To my knowledge, none have accepted
9 the opportunities at this point, and have instead
10 been transferred to other NYCHA developments.

11 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, I mean, when that
12 transition takes place, you just-- you hand the keys
13 over the developer and disappear?

14 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: No.

15 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, I mean, it'll
16 take your "oversight" position?

17 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: No,
18 no. So, in the lead up to the closing, there are
19 regular meetings between the existing property
20 management staff and the incoming property managers
21 so that they can understand how the buildings and the
22 systems operate so that there is a seamless
23 transition. It doesn't just, you know, happen one in
24 one day.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. It seems that
3 way. Has there been any thought of having a
4 designated transition team with the members of the
5 offices who have dealt with the development pre-
6 conversion and members of the offices who will deal
7 with it-- deal with the development post-conversion
8 to all the information to be shared and for residents
9 to have some similar faces to deal with? Is that
10 taken into consideration, and--

11 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
12 [interposing] Again, we work to make sure that there
13 is overlap of pre and post-conversion, but certainly
14 always willing to explore other opportunities to
15 continue to improve the program. So it's something
16 that we can certainly consider.

17 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: I'd like
18 to, you know, add to it. We don't just hand over the
19 keys and say, you know, good luck. We continue to
20 own the property. We continue to own the buildings.
21 We have an interest to make sure that the conversion
22 goes smoothly. There has been many cases, especially
23 early in conversion processes where there have been,
24 you know, emergency situations where NYCHA staff who
25 knows the property better has been-- you know, worked

1
2 alongside with the partners, you know, to make sure
3 that they understand the systems, that they make sure
4 that they've been able to get things like heat back
5 on quickly or other outages. But once-- after a
6 while, once they get used to the systems, once they
7 put in their new systems, those things aren't
8 required as much. But early on in the process we
9 have seen that.

10 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Particularly when it
11 comes to document sharing, how are documents
12 transferred over to the new management?

13 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: In the
14 months leading up to the conversion, we are certainly
15 providing all forms of documentation whether it's
16 related to the building and their conditions and
17 their systems, but also, you know, the resident files
18 so that the new team can start to build out their
19 rent rules and alike, and they can understand who all
20 of their incoming residents are going to be. I don't
21 know if Lakesha can speak to some of that as well.
22 But it is very comprehensive and we try to make sure
23 that they have a full package well before the
24 conversion so that they can hit the ground running at
25 conversion.

1
2 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER: To add
3 in, we're also scanning in information related to
4 like the last recertification, vital documents so
5 that the landlord has access to that most recent--

6 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] So, it's
7 a system that the-- electronic system that where the
8 documents are scanned on and transferred over to the
9 management in the form of a-- is it a disc, or how is
10 it actually handed over to them?

11 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER: They
12 are physically scanning. They maintain their own
13 database, as well as NYCHA has a database of
14 documents.

15 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Got you. What
16 resources are currently available for tenants to find
17 their documents are being properly handled by the new
18 management?

19 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER:
20 [inaudible]

21 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, I mean, you do
22 the oversight. That's what I'm asking.

23 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Sorry,
24 can you repeat?

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: What resources is
3 currently available for tenants who find their
4 documents-- who find their documents were not being
5 properly handled during the transition? What process
6 is put in place?

7 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: I
8 don't know that that happens often, but you know,
9 when we have heard of issues of incomplete
10 information, we work with the existing team at NYCHA
11 as well as the incoming property managers to make
12 sure the files are complete. It's not-- wouldn't say
13 a systemic issue, but sometimes for whatever reason
14 there are documents that might be missing. We want
15 to make sure that we have a complete file.

16 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: There have been many
17 instances where tenants have put in documents with
18 the prior management, whether it was to change the
19 composition in the household or add folks to the
20 composition in the household, and that information
21 wasn't transferred over, and has resulted in being
22 dragged into court or possibly be-- you know, lead in
23 towards an eviction. So that's the reason why we're
24 asking this question as to what process is put in
25 place to make sure that documents are being

1 transferred over properly and that this aggressive
2 attack on the tenants to drag them to the court, it
3 does-- it stops. So, we need to get some clarity as
4 to how those documents are being transferred over,
5 because we're not-- it's not happening on the ground,
6 and then management, when those controversies do
7 arise, management is saying well, you got to go to
8 NYCHA. It's like a back and forth. So, if we can
9 get some more clarity on that, I greatly appreciate
10 it.
11

12 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Okay.

13 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Are new management
14 companies required to maintain a 24/7 hotline or any
15 equivalent services to receive tenant feedback?

16 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: I
17 wouldn't say it's required to be 24 hours, but they
18 all have various methods of communication, whether
19 it's email, telephone and alike. So we expect our
20 PACT partners to provide a high level of customer
21 service to make sure that they're hearing from
22 residents.

23 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, does that high
24 level of, I guess, response in a sense-- does it
25 require them to actually maintain-- are they

1
2 obligated to respond to tenants within a certain
3 timeframe?

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: We
5 have not stipulated a specific timeframe, but you
6 know, we expect that they will be addressing resident
7 concerns timely and if residents do not feel
8 satisfied, there's a number of venues that residents
9 can come to us, and then we will step in and you
10 know, ask questions and make sure that the PACT
11 partner is responding quickly.

12 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, does NYCHA
13 conduct audits to check the proper transition of
14 documents to the new management?

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
16 again, we have the files that we have when we try to
17 send over a complete set of files and when we become
18 aware of potential issues, we try to rectify that as
19 quickly as possible.

20 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. And does NYCHA
21 require new management to order their own records to
22 check for proper transition documents?

23 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: I
24 mean, we have checklists of all the documents that
25 should be provided in any file. So whether it is a

1
2 resident noting that something might be missing or
3 the PACT partner noting that something's missing,
4 that's how we will triangulate and figure out how to
5 identify what's missing if anything, and then either
6 find the document or recreate a document if
7 necessary.

8 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, when it comes to
9 shelter allowance information, we've received
10 concerns that NYCHA and HRA do not automatically
11 updated the shelter allowance information when a
12 property transition from public housing to PACT.
13 This administrator fix could prevent a PACT developer
14 from filing an eviction for nonpayment. Can we get a
15 commitment or timeline from NYCHA on when this issue
16 will be fixed?

17 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: so,
18 Council Member, I'm happy to say that it has already
19 been fixed. We do work with HRA pre-conversion to
20 make sure that they know that they have clients who
21 live in the development that is about to be
22 converted, so this way shelter allowance payments are
23 transferred to the new development team. Early on
24 this was an issue in our early conversions. It was
25 something that we learned. It was something that,

1
2 yes, unfortunately wasn't thought of before and
3 payments were going to NYCHA, but that was corrected,
4 and so now on day one payments should be going, you
5 know, straight to the new development team.

6 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: What-- when it comes
7 to tenant outreach pre and during the post-
8 conversion, the RAD lease was drafted with input and
9 assistance from tenants and housing advocates. Has
10 there been any changes to the lease or any regulatory
11 documents since their creation?

12 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Yes,
13 the lease has been updated periodically. In fact,
14 right now it is going through a review and updating.

15 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. And how often
16 does NYCHA solicit recommendations from residents and
17 leaders and housing advocates on what can be improved
18 and modified on these lease agreements?

19 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
20 Anytime.

21 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Alright. Has
22 anything been recently recommended or modified?

23 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Most
24 of what we do is on points of clarification. The
25 original lease was developed, as you mentioned, with

1
2 housing advocates, legal aid, and residents, and so I
3 think the base document largely addresses the issues.
4 So, some-- a lot of what we do is largely for
5 clarification.

6 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And who is presently
7 responsible for outreach to tenants before and during
8 and after RAD/PACT conversion?

9 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So,
10 Leroy Williams who is my colleague to my right runs a
11 team that does some of the outreach and we also
12 within Real Estate partner with him to do some
13 outreach. But I'll let Leroy start and we can fill
14 in some gaps if necessary.

15 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Yes, sir.

16 VICE PRESIDENT WILLIAMS: Hello, Council
17 Member, how are you?

18 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Hey.

19 VICE PRESIDENT WILLIAMS: So, we have a
20 dedicated team that works with residents overall on
21 engagement. Specifically, we do-- as some of the
22 residents already talked about, door-to-door sharing
23 of information. We work with our partners in real
24 estate and the development partners making sure that
25 we are planning those monthly meetings accordingly,

1 making sure the proper languages are distributed to
2 residents often. We have a PACT hotline that either
3 can call or email to make sure that if you have
4 questions we can make sure within a 48-hour notice
5 return your phone call and answer any questions that
6 a resident may have. We send out robo-call and email
7 reminders for all meetings that we have to make sure
8 people are reminded besides jut putting up notices
9 door-by-door. We make sure that the resident
10 association is a part of everything that we do, all
11 of the planning for meetings and any type of
12 engagement, because of course, we do want to make
13 sure that we have foundational engagement, but every
14 development is different. So we want to make sure
15 that we set a plan that sets the engagement for that
16 specific development. In the last few years we've
17 learned that, you know, residents want to see someone
18 and make sure that ongoingly [sic] that they know
19 that particular person would like to be at the
20 development. So we instituted a PACT office hours
21 for all PACT developments where staff of mine are at
22 a specific site. It could be at a management office
23 or a TA office, and they know that staff person will
24 be there very Tuesday and Thursday from 1:00 to 5:00
25

1
2 and to make sure that they can come down and talk to
3 an actual staff person to answer questions.

4 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: How do you determine
5 the outreach efforts you conducted is sufficient?

6 VICE PRESIDENT WILLIAMS: So, again, we
7 sit down with the resident association and any
8 resident that would like to take part in it to make
9 sure that besides the monthly meetings, besides just
10 the ongoing distribution of information, we try to
11 form an engagement plan that fits the needs of that
12 residence. Again, there's larger developments and
13 there's very small developments, so we want to make
14 sure that it fits the needs of the residents.

15 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Alright. What
16 recourse exists with tenants who find that the PACT
17 developers are not maintaining sufficient levels of
18 outreach or communication during the process?

19 VICE PRESIDENT WILLIAMS: So, I'll just
20 talk about what my staff do, and Jonathan can surely
21 jump in. But I have a post-conversion unit that
22 works with the resident associations, the management
23 companies, and the social services offices where we
24 go and inspect and meet with them quarterly to make
25 sure that we're hearing in real-time, you know,

1
2 issues and concerns. We make sure to partner with
3 our asset management team at real estate to transfer
4 that information to them to make sure that we're
5 addressing all of the issues and concerns and getting
6 back to the resident in a timely basis. The
7 residents are-- besides just the quarterly meetings,
8 they can also call us at any time and we can set up
9 special meetings as needed.

10 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. Now, we're
11 going to move forward to-- oh, we have been joined by
12 Councilman Salamanca. We're not going to move
13 forward with a round of questions from my committee
14 members, and we're going to begin with Council Member
15 Avilés.

16 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you, Chair.
17 Good to see you all. I guess I'd like to-- so many
18 questions. So many questions. Let me start very
19 quickly, because I know I'm on a clock this time, so
20 I don't have the liberty of yapping. But in the
21 response-- in the response to the survey that you
22 mentioned in your presentation, you mentioned four
23 developments participated in the survey. Can you
24 tell me how many respondents that included?

1 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: It was
2 about a thousand.
3

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: A thousand responded
5 out of how many tenants in those four developments?

6 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
7 Twenty-one percent.

8 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: It was 20 percent
9 response rate for each development?

10 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
11 Overall.

12 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Overall. So some
13 could be five percent, some could be seven, some
14 could be 30. I would love for you to provide to the
15 Council a breakdown of what that actually looks like.

16 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Sure.

17 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Anyway, back to my
18 questions. Can you tell me how much the City has
19 invested into the PACT program since the program
20 start?

21 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: We can
22 get you the total among of city subsidy that has gone
23 into a couple of the deals. The majority of the
24 deals have not received city subsidy. But Edenwald
25 and Reid Park Rock are the first two to receive city

1
2 subsidy, and we expect as we go forward there were be
3 additional projects that will require some city
4 capital.

5 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: There was a huge
6 investment of staff and NYCHA time, I'm sure, in
7 putting together these deals and units and potential
8 oversight, creating the dashboard. So I would
9 imagine it's significantly higher than just direct
10 subsidy, is that correct?

11 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
12 Certainly, yes. There's NYCHA staff time.

13 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Could you provide
14 some estimation of what that actual direct investment
15 in developing, maintaining and expanding this program
16 is looking like?

17 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: We
18 would-- I would have to look into that. I don't know
19 what that would be.

20 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you. We look
21 forward to receiving the information. You mentioned
22 the number of conversions over the next two years, I
23 guess that would complete the full amount that is in
24 the pipeline and the end amount. Of course, I'm not
25 doing the math, but do you expect to continue to

1
2 aggressively fill PACT sites over the next five
3 years?

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
5 the commitment was to convert 62,000 over 10 years
6 starting in December of 2018. So it is our intention
7 to get to that 62,000 by the end of-- by the deadline
8 of 2028.

9 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Okay, and in terms
10 of-- how is NYCHA monitoring response time to tenant
11 requests at the PACT development currently, and how
12 would you respond to a resident who said that in her
13 development that's been converted, you're only
14 allowed to submit one request at a time, and that
15 management told her she could not submit another
16 request.

17 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So, we
18 track work orders and resolution on work orders on a
19 monthly basis, and overall the performance is very
20 strong, well over 90 percent on time. However, as
21 we've heard sometimes that doesn't seem to be the
22 case. So I would -- you know, I would invite the
23 residents to obviously work with their property
24 managers, but also if they're not getting
25 satisfactory answers, they can reach out to us

1 through the PACT hotline, through CCC, through 311,
2 but primarily through us, and we will-- we'll look
3 into the issue.
4

5 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: How many resident
6 complaints are you getting through the PACT hotline?

7 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: I
8 don't have an exact number. It's not a huge number,
9 though, I can tell you that.

10 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Okay. In terms of--
11 how is NYCHA-- Sorry, Chair, if I may? I'm almost
12 done.

13 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You may. You have
14 another minute if you want.

15 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Okay, thank you.
16 How is NYCHA able to understand the tenant repair
17 needs that are being met in the NYCHA developments?
18 Tell me what is that actual monitoring look like?
19 And verifying that quality repair, is in fact, being
20 done and tenants are, in fact, satisfied with the
21 service that they're being provided?

22 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
23 again, we go out-- you know, we have the Design and
24 Construction team that is going out making sure that
25 the construction is progressing as expected and

1
2 consistent with the scope that we agreed to with our
3 PACT partners, and that happens that throughout the
4 construction process. Post-construction there is
5 also going to be annual HQS inspections to make sure
6 that the apartments were, you know, repaired
7 correctly and are continuing to be maintained
8 appropriate. We've also as mentioned in my testimony
9 we've developed this survey that we are administering
10 on a rolling basis. So as developments are completed
11 in terms of their construction, there will be surveys
12 and we will gauge resident satisfaction with those in
13 the construction and the property Ma.

14 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: And obviously, I
15 mean, I feel like I remember talking to you about it
16 when it was developed, so I'm glad to see that it has
17 been implemented. I guess could you provide the
18 Council with an accounting of how many inspections
19 have been done to-date? What is-- is there a metric
20 by which I guess oversight feels robust enough for
21 you to feel like these numbers that are on the
22 benchmark are in fact verifiable?

23 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: We
24 could put that information together for you.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Do you have
3 benchmarks for the quality-- I think they're called
4 quality assistance or quality monitoring team?

5 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: You
6 mean the HQS?

7 CHAIRPERSON AVILES: Yes.

8 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER: Hi, as
9 it relates to-- so it' housing quality standards. It
10 is an inspection required by HUD no less than
11 annually. We are required to do 100 percent
12 basically annually. We have set with HUD discretion
13 permission. If the inspection passes, we do it
14 biannually. Residents can also, if they feel the
15 need, they can contact us and request a special
16 inspection. If they feel like in between their
17 regular HUD-required inspections that something is in
18 disrepair, they can contact us. We'll come back out.

19 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Council
20 Member, may I had, and Lakesha could probably even
21 add to what I'm going to say, too, is that the
22 Federal Government recently put in even more
23 stringent standards in place in terms of not only
24 inspecting the units, but also inspecting the common
25 areas, and safety, and inspections standards. So

1
2 that is not only true for the PACT properties, but
3 also true for public housing.

4 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Yeah, and I'm glad
5 for that certainly. But biannual, I think-- what we
6 see in the pre-panel is there are still some real
7 gaps here, and these are the same complaints we've
8 heard over the years that there continues to be this
9 disconnection between residents are experiencing
10 shoddy repairs, real challenges with the private
11 management firms, and not a lot of remedy to that
12 effect. And we're continuing full steam ahead with
13 the program. Can we-- and obviously we have to
14 acknowledge where flowers are due, that some of these
15 developments, you know, have been successful. There
16 are real-- there is real resident satisfaction.
17 Nevertheless, in terms of the legislation that is
18 being proposed today, you referenced the benchmarks
19 that is on the website, and I was looking at them,
20 and it think they're moderately helpful for someone
21 like me, but certainly even when I was looking for
22 Penn-Wortman house in these benchmarks, they're
23 classified by bundle. That's relatively useless if
24 you don't know what the bundles actually are. So I
25 would say a resident-- that would not be helpful for

1
2 them. It wasn't helpful for me, so you may want to
3 reconsider, but if-- and none of this data is
4 disaggregated, and certainly I think the legislation
5 put forward relatively minimal standards of impact,
6 and I think we're going to hear that we need to
7 increase those-- we need to make the measures more
8 robust that we would like to hear from NYCHA and the
9 Mayor's Office around. This does not meet the
10 intention of the legislation. I think there's some
11 still some space in between. I would like to know
12 very clearly if the Administration is interested in
13 working together to get a robust impact statement on
14 PACT?

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Yes.
16 We are--

17 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN:
18 [interposing] so Council Member, I think we've heard
19 you and this is something that you've called for for
20 a long time. I think the dashboard is very new, but
21 we would be happy to work with you and the Council
22 and the Chairman and Council staff making it even
23 more robust and making sure that it is user-friendly
24 and also has the data that is the most useful, but
25 this is just a start. The one thing about this

1
2 program, it has evolved over the years, and it has
3 taken a lot of input, and to us transparency, you
4 know, and the more data that's out there can only,
5 you know, help the program.

6 CHAIRPERSON AVILÉS: Thank you. And I
7 would just like to say in closing, I think residents
8 need to be given an option to choose the future of
9 their developments and to be given full, accurate
10 information. And written information is one thing.
11 Accessible information is another, which often
12 requires conversations and detangling and using
13 language that is accessible, and much of these
14 documents are incomprehensible. So I would say we
15 need to do better, because we're still having the
16 same conversation around these, you know, highly
17 technical documents that are not helpful to residents
18 who are given the tasks of reviewing them and coming
19 to some sort of conclusion in very short time frames.
20 It is an unfair engagement. But also the name for
21 what is on the website. Thank you for stating that.
22 nevertheless, if the data that is here is
23 incomprehensible and not usable, it's because the
24 benchmark says right now that PACT pretty much--
25 there are no outstanding work orders, and yet we see

1 here that that is not in fact the case. There is
2 something wrong. So please continue to do the work
3 of making things truly accessible to the residents
4 and having them truly engage in a process of dignity
5 and autonomy where they decide with full information,
6 not after the fact, like demolition-- full
7 information before they make choices. With that, I
8 thank you and I yield, and thank you so much for the
9 courtesy, Chair.
10

11 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you, Council
12 Member. Now we're going to move-- we're going to
13 allow Council Member Sanchez to have a round of
14 questions.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you,
16 Chair, and good morning, friends. It's good to see
17 you all. I have a lot of questions. So we could-- I
18 have a lot of questions. I have a lot of questions,
19 so if we could just try to be very direct. So, first
20 of all, jut by way of framing, and we heard-- we
21 heard from tenants in the pre-panel. Thank you so
22 much for testifying. It's a very big impact, 35
23 percent of the public housing portfolio in the City
24 of New York transferring over to private management
25 through the PACT program, 62,000 units, that's really

1
2 big. So I just want to-- I'm going to ask this
3 question. Is there a goal for the Trust, how many
4 units are going to be converted via the Trust?

5 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Thank
6 you, Council Member. The legislation gives us the
7 ability to transfer 25,000 units.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: 25, okay, thank
9 you so much. Second, picking up where Council Member
10 Avilés left off and directly in relation to so many
11 of the concerns we heard this morning from our tenant
12 panel-- I was listening online. Thanks, technology.
13 What oversight or inspections is there on PACT
14 conversion construction sites? Is DOB inspecting
15 these sites? Does NYCHA have a dedicated team?

16 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So,
17 certainly all regulatory agencies can inspect at any
18 time, but as it relates to our direct involvement,
19 there's the Design and Construction Team within real
20 estate that conduct inspection. Some of that is
21 staff based. We also have a couple of firms that help
22 augment that work for us and go out and do inspection
23 so that we can ensure that the work is progressing as
24 expected.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: And so if NYCHA
3 tenants observe what they deem to be unsafe work
4 practices like asbestos incorrectly-- asbestos
5 remediation work being incorrectly covered or unsafe
6 lead practices, etcetera, who do they call? Do they
7 call 311?

8 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: They
9 can certainly reach out to us, and we will respond
10 quickly. We have always responded to every complaint
11 that we've gotten in-- basically immediately.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you.

13 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: And
14 yes, they can--

15 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: [interposing]
16 Also call 311? You can also call 311 and let your
17 local Council Member know. Thank you. Okay, third,
18 with respect to the PACT hotline you mentioned, you
19 said Legal Aid Society is receiving funding to do
20 this work. How much funding is legal aid society
21 receiving? what is the source of these funds, and
22 are they receiving enough funds to represent tenants
23 in court or is this simply the operation of the
24 hotline, and if so, what is-- what sources or
25

1
2 resources do tenants have for representation in
3 court?

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: We can
5 get you this data as a follow-up, but generally the
6 funding comes out of each transaction to ensure that
7 there's sufficient funding.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Okay. Thank
9 you. I look forward to that. Chair, if I may?

10 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You may.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: A couple more.
12 I'm going to talk fast. I have been told I'm good at
13 that. Right-sizing, sizing up, sizing down, how many
14 families in the completed PACT conversions have been
15 right-sized up? How many have been right-sized down?
16 And have there been eviction proceedings because--
17 eviction proceedings or completions due to refusals
18 to right size?

19 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER: thank
20 you for your question. We can get you the exact
21 number on how many are required to right-size up and
22 down following this session.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: So you do not
24 have that number today, okay. Thank you. How many
25 over-income families remain in PACT converted

1
2 buildings? By how much have their rents increased,
3 and how are rents determined for these over-income
4 families? Yeah, I think, Gouveia, you know where I'm
5 coming from.

6 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER: The
7 same-- I am sorry, but the same answer. We will get
8 you that information following this session.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Okay, and for
10 context, the Center for Court Innovation has raised
11 concerns about rent increases at PACT sites. RAD
12 regulations require PACT managers to charge flat rent
13 based on Section 8 flat rent schedule instead of the
14 NYCHA flat rent schedule, and there is concern that
15 this change can push higher and moderate income
16 families out of PACT buildings, helping to
17 concentrate poverty and depleting shared resources
18 among neighbors. So really look forward to that
19 information. Okay, thank you. Regarding transfers--
20 actually, I'm going to skip this one due to time.
21 regarding transparency-- so in the process of
22 conversion, various documents are produced by NYCHA
23 to ensure that protection of the NYCHA property
24 tenant rights, which of these are shared, which are
25 not, and why not? And specifically I'm referring to

1
2 the control agreement, regulatory agreement,
3 declaration of restrictive covenant and use
4 agreements, ground lease and management agreement--
5 yep, leave it at that. Which are shared, which are
6 not, and why not?

7 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: we
8 have template documents on our website. So,
9 basically any of the documents that govern our
10 transactions are available for folks to see. But the
11 one document that, obviously, residents are most
12 attached to, of course, is their personal lease.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: And so what-- so
14 actual documents are not shared, is that what you're
15 saying? You can see templates, but you can't see the
16 actual documents exchanged between the PACT partner
17 and NYCHA?

18 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: We
19 have not released deal-specific documents at this
20 time.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Why is that?

22 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
23 Largely, because we want to be able to negotiate with
24 each of our PACT partners and make sure we're getting
25 the best deal for the City and for NYCHA.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. I
3 will have a lot more questions about that, but I'll
4 leave it at that. I guess my last two questions, one
5 is regarding PACT partners that go back, right,
6 relationships that sour-- how many times has RAD--
7 has NYCHA changed PACT partners, and what has that
8 process been? And the last set of questions that I--
9 if the Chair will allow me-- I'm sorry, Chair. Thank
10 you, for--

11 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Yeah, go
12 right ahead.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. Is
14 regarding NYCHA employment, but bad PACT partners.

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: WE have
16 not yet initiated the removal of a PACT partner. We
17 recently had an instance at Hope Gardens where the
18 property manager was replaced, and that was a
19 business decision that the development team Penrose
20 [sic] made as it relates to Pinnacle City Living.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Got it. Okay,
22 so it wasn't the entire team. It was just--

23 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
24 [interposing] No, it was just one--

25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: the property
3 manager.

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: party
5 to the joint venture.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Understood. And
7 if there were something broader than that, there--
8 are there claw back provisions--

9 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
10 [interposing] Yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: that NYCHA has?
12 And what do those look like?

13 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: I mean
14 it's very clearly stipulated in the number of our
15 documents that if we are unsatisfied we could
16 initiate a process to remove our partners.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: And documents
18 that are not shared by the public, with the public?
19 Okay. Okay, last question. I'm a champion for
20 sharing what we can with the public so that there's
21 more transparency and sunlight is the best
22 disinfectant. Last question, and this is sort of
23 looking back to the original mission at the founding
24 of NYCHA, right, stabilizing families in their homes,
25 but also providing good paying union jobs for the

1 building trades. I know we can't say that in those
2 terms nowadays, but it was concerning your answer to
3 the Chair's question that no NYCHA union employees
4 have stayed within their worksites. They have all
5 have transferred to other developments. So question
6 one is has there been attrition of these union
7 employees that were on NYCHA sites? Have they all
8 transferred to other sites? And second, are there
9 either local hire or union requirements for PACT-
10 converted sites? And that is the conclusion of my
11 questions.
12

13 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Council
14 Member, as so just to clarify, I think the-- so all
15 the employees at the site are offered the opportunity
16 to stay onsite. However, most of them choose not to
17 CHIEF BELTRAN: they're city employees. They have
18 municipal pensions. They have a lot of benefits and
19 they have a lot time, and so the option to stay in
20 their union which is the Teamsters which is a
21 municipal union, most of them choose to do that
22 because they'd be giving up a lot of benefits there.
23 We have at Betances Houses, the super retired from
24 NYCHA and then stayed on with the property there,
25 lent their expertise, but in that situation

1 [inaudible]. The employees who work at the PACT
2 sites are union employees. They are, you know,
3 usually with private sector unions. Like, for
4 instance, some of-- they're DBJ. Some are other
5 different unions, but these are all union jobs.
6 There are also Section 3 requirements at PACT sites
7 just like there are Section 3 requirements, you know,
8 at NYCHA. In many cases, the local hiring, they've
9 been able to beat the numbers, you know, at the PACT
10 sites than we have-- you know, in the NYCHA
11 traditional portfolio.

12
13 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: So, Section 3
14 requirements, transfer directly over to PACT sites?

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: That's
16 correct.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: As existing,
18 okay. Thank you so much for the permission, Chair,
19 and thank you NYCHA, good to see you all.

20 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you Council
21 Member. Now we're going to move to Council Member
22 Mealy.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Thank you, Chair.
24 Just to follow back on the question. Section 8

25

1 requirements, how many people from all the NYCHA
2 developments have Section 3 jobs?

3 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: So, all
4 the NYCHA or the PACT, the PACT development?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: NYCHA.

6 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Oh. I'm
7 sorry, because we prepared for the PACT, but Council
8 Member, I can get you that.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay, but it's
10 about the jobs. It seemed like all of a sudden now,
11 Section 3, no one is getting those jobs, and it's
12 supposed to be employees or constituents who live in
13 NYCHA get these jobs.

14 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Right.
15 We--

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing]
17 [inaudible] like it's no documentation, or it seemed
18 like it just stopped. So I go back on that, you
19 don't have to answer that question. Could I get a
20 yes or no answer in regards to if development do not
21 want to do RAD and PACT, yes or no y'all would do it
22 anyway, or no, you won't?

23 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: No, we
24 would not do it.
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: You would not do
3 it? You sure?

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: We
5 have-- there have been instances where in the process
6 that I described where, you know, we spoke with
7 resident leadership, we spoke with resident body and
8 there was no interest, and so we-- as Brian said
9 earlier, you know, we have a lot of other interest
10 across the City and so we will do those projects.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: But could I ask
12 you, so if it's only a certain group that is for it,
13 and the majority of the tenants do not want it, so
14 you go by the section of tenants who want it?

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: No, we
16 work, again, with residents--

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] Or
18 whoever you have communication with?

19 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: No, we
20 work with resident leadership, and we have a open
21 discussion with the--

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] If
23 the tenant leadership--

24 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
25 resident body.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: is going rogue on
3 their own and they want RAD and PACT because maybe
4 you promised them something, or-- and the majority of
5 the tenants don't want it, let me know.

6 [applause]

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Order.

8 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Again,
9 this is why we have meetings with the full resident
10 body to gauge their interest. We don't rely just on
11 the tenant association presidents.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So, now, any
13 development who do not want to get in RAD and PACT,
14 you will not make them?

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: If we
16 felt like there was a significant number of people
17 who are not interested, we would not, and we have
18 done-- we've made those decisions--

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] So, I
20 have a few that's been calling me, so I will make
21 sure we're going to stay on that route, that they do
22 not want it. Okay. I just want to ask you another
23 question. You said-- how many times has NYCHA
24 changed a PACT partner? You said you never did.

1
2 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: We
3 have not initiated a change.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: so, given the
5 difficulties that Pinnacle City Planning had, is
6 NYCHA confident enough that their abilities to
7 continue to use them as a partner, as in West
8 Brighton One and Two?

9 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: You still feel
11 they're on the job, but you just got rid of a
12 manager.

13 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
14 we didn't-- as I mentioned, that was a decision that
15 Penrose [sic] the developer at Hope Gardens made
16 about Pinnacle City Living. Pinnacle has worked
17 extensively with BFC who's the developer for West
18 Brighton. They have a long-standing relationship.
19 They manage-- Pinnacle manages many of BFC's-- or a
20 number of BFC's buildings, so it appears that there
21 is a good working relationship there, and we're
22 confident we can move forward.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: If the tenants
24 would like them to cut ties with them, is it
25 feasible?

1 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: It
2 would be feasible. My understand though,--

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] You
4 here for the tenants, right?

5 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So, if they come
7 together and say they do not want that developer
8 management, they can cut ties with them?

9 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: We
10 would certainly--

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] Yes,
12 or--

13 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
14 [interposing] We would certainly be willing to hear
15 from the residents, but I would say as it relates to
16 West Brighton, my understanding is that Pinnacle has
17 a very good relationship with the residents of West
18 Brighton.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay, we could go
20 back on that. Okay. Just post-conversion oversight-
21 - what information is captured in the monthly reports
22 by PACT developers that details high-risk repairs
23 such as mold, lead, elevators, heat, and hot water
24 complaints?
25

1
2 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: It's
3 the work orders. So whatever work orders have been
4 submitted, we track the number of work orders and
5 then the time to resolution for those work orders and
6 that's now on our dashboard on our website.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay, so, I'm
8 going to go back a little further. How was the
9 implementation of picking these developers, or these
10 management-- private management companies? Like
11 Pinnacle, and what's the next one, Fairfield?

12 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
13 Fairstead.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Fairstead. How
15 did you choose Fairstead to get 18 developments in
16 which they never did this before? Can you explain
17 that?

18 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: so,
19 the process has evolved since we started PACT. In the
20 beginning NYCHA used to put out RFPs and we would
21 jointly select--

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] So,
23 they won 16 RFPs.

24 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
25 I'm just-- no. I'm just describing--

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] I
3 don't have that much time.

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Okay.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Yes, or no, how
6 did-- or just give me a brief synopsis. How did 16
7 development go to one private management?

8 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So,
9 what we do today is we--

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing]
11 Because you didn't have a portfolio because they
12 never did this before.

13 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: so, how did you
15 choose?

16 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
17 we pre-qualify developers, property managers, general
18 contractors, and then we put out requests for
19 expressions of interest, and we also put together
20 resident review committees, and so since we're
21 referring to Fairstead, I assume you're talking about
22 Reid Park Rock. And so in that case, the residents
23 co-selected the joint venture team that we picked--

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] I'm
25 just speaking about in general, not Park Rock. I got

1
2 other questions. I'll go a second round for Park
3 Rock. But how did-- you as an agency, chose just one
4 private company to do all these developments. They
5 never had any experience on doing this. And I have a
6 issue with, how many of them are doing the
7 development or reconstruction of buildings and having
8 its constituents stay in the building while they do
9 the repairs? How many buildings you have it like
10 that?

11 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: SO,
12 with the team that you're asking about--

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] I'm
14 not asking about the team. I'm just in regards to any
15 private management company that is doing the
16 redevelopment of any NYCHA developments. How many of
17 them are having the constituents live there while
18 they remodel.

19 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: They
20 all have--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] Do
22 all these beautiful new kitchens and they have to be
23 in there with all that dust. How many? That's all I
24 want to know.

1
2 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: I
3 mean, they all have experience doing tenant-in-place
4 rehab, even if they haven't done NYCHA.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Tenant place rehab
6 is what? Are you moving them out of the building?

7 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: No,
8 they're in the apartment.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So, don't you
10 think it's best to do checker [sic] board, if so?
11 Because I done numerous of them. Instead of having
12 constituents inside the building with all this mass--
13 they have asthma, different health issues. They
14 going to be in the building in an apartment that you
15 are remodeling with all this dust. So is there--
16 could you give me a-- how many that moved into a
17 hotel, could you give me that?

18 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: We
19 would have to provide that information.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So, it is some
21 that need to go into a hotel--

22 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
23 [interposing] Yes.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: because the
25 reconstruction is really dusty and--

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:

[interposing] Yes. And there--

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So--

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN:

[interposing] Council Member, sometimes it's hotels.

Sometimes is an available unit with inside the development, and if residents do come to us and they say--

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So, they have to come to you. You as a city agencies not thinking about the health of the constituents.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: No, we have--

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] You don't think-- would you want to live in somewhere that's being remodeled?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: So, Council Member, residents--

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] I tried it myself. It didn't work.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: No, I hear you. I hear you. Residents volunteer their health relation-- we cannot ask-- we cannot demand that they give it to us. So,--

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] Is it
3 a budget for you to move them?

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: No, it's
5 not a budget issue, you know.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: No, I'm asking--

7 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN:
8 [interposing] Yeah, yeah, it's not a budget issue
9 whatsoever.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing]
11 Management company do not have a budget that if it
12 egregious you would move the tenant into a hotel or
13 if it's not enough vacant apartments, you would move
14 them out.

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: It's not
16 a budget issue whatsoever.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So you do have a
18 budget for that.

19 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: We do
20 have a budget for that, correct.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Can you tell me
22 how much? Because I believe-- I know a lot of--

23 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN:
24 [interposing] Yeah, with it--
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: constituents want
3 to move out while you're doing the development.

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: That
5 really-- honestly, in our experience that has not
6 been the case. A lot of people, you know, they want
7 to stay in the development. They want to stay in
8 their apartments. The reason being, a lot of people
9 have, you know-- if they children, you know, they
10 don't want to-- they want to make sure that they move
11 too far away from the development.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So you can move
13 them to a-- a nice hotel close.

14 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: We
15 could. Yeah, we definitely could, and you know,
16 especially when people have health issues, we want to
17 make sure that the work is done safe.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I have one more
19 question.

20 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Go ahead, Council
21 Member.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Just one more
23 question. With RAD and PACT conversions, why are the
24 apartments being smaller, the elevators are being
25 smaller? Could you explain that?

1
2 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: I
3 don't know-- I'm not aware of apartments becoming
4 smaller.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I'm going to give
6 you a list.

7 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Okay.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: It's sad. You
9 supposed to be enhancing and not taking away, and
10 that's what's going on right now with the RAD and
11 PACT conversion. So I'll wait for the next round.
12 Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you, Council
14 Member. We will have another round. Council Member
15 Salamanca?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you, Mr.
17 Chair. Good afternoon. I want to start off-- I-- so
18 I have the third largest NYCHA portfolio in the City
19 of New York. I think Council Member Darlene Mealy
20 and Ayala have the two biggest before mine. I know
21 that in my district I'm going through a PACT on the
22 Stebbins Hewitt, and look, I just want to say that
23 it's not a one-size-fits-all. The PACT may not be
24 appropriate for other buildings in my district, but
25 the PACT that is currently occurring on Stebbins and

1
2 Hewitt, my constituents are extremely happy with the
3 work that's being done. I can tell you that. For
4 years they went out with, you know, the winter, no
5 heat, no hot water, leaks in their roof whenever it
6 rained. It rained inside of their apartments. Their
7 windows not insulated appropriately, air coming in
8 and out. This was the first winter where they
9 thanked me for getting this work done, and I'm just--
10 I just want to say thank you for that. But, as I
11 said, that doesn't mean that the PACT will be
12 appropriate for Melrose Houses or Jackson Houses,
13 right? So just-- I just want to put that out there.
14 Going back to what the Council Member Darlene Mealy
15 said, some of the frustrations while going through
16 these renovations are-- they came in at times
17 unannounced, had to move their furniture around, kind
18 of inconvenienced them, the dust-- that did affect
19 them. So there are, I can say, certain situations--
20 or maybe what I think NYCHA should do is look at what
21 occurred so we can fix these issues as you move
22 forward in other PACTs. So with that, I'm going to
23 leave it at that. I want to talk about sidewalks. A
24 homeowner, when you have a sidewalk and the sidewalk
25 is cracked, the Department of Transportation gives

1
2 you time to fix it. If they don't fix it-- if you
3 don't fix it, you get a violation, and the Department
4 of Transportation comes and fixes it for you and they
5 send you a bill. Your sidewalk, if you don't clean
6 it, the Department of Sanitation comes in and gives
7 you a violation, and they'll come back again. If it's
8 not clean, they double your violation or your
9 summons. I made a call the other day because Forest
10 Houses, there are-- their sidewalks are completely
11 damaged, and the President of Forest Houses, you
12 know, he's disabled and he uses a wheelchair to get
13 around. I made a call and I asked hey, we need to
14 fix this sidewalk and I sent pictures. There were
15 holes on the sidewalks. How soon can we get this
16 sidewalk fixed? And I was told that NYCHA's not
17 responsible for the sidewalk, that is the Department
18 of Transportation. I want to know why is it that a
19 homeowner is responsible to fix their sidewalk. If
20 they don't fix it, you get a violation by the
21 Department of Transportation, but NYCHA is not
22 responsible to fix their sidewalk. I need an answer
23 to that, because it just doesn't not make sense.

24 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Council
25 Member, thank you for the question. So NYCHA is

1
2 responsible for the roadways and the-- within the
3 campus, and you know, this predates me. You know,
4 this goes back decades. And the sidewalks itself is
5 the Department of Transportation. I cannot tell you
6 why. We probably have to do some research, but you
7 know, I've been with NYCHA now for 18 years. It's
8 been as long as--

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: [interposing]
10 Brian, you and I have a great relationship. I talk
11 to you often, but it just does not make any sense.
12 Why is a property owner, a building, or a home wonder
13 responsible for their sidewalk, and NYCHA is not
14 responsible for their sidewalk? It's called common
15 sense. Like, that does not make sense. So, can we
16 get the sidewalk fixed at Forest Houses?

17 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: I'll
18 call you later, and then we can look into that, yeah.
19 You know, I don't want to make-- I can't make a
20 commitment here, but we could look into it.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Alright. Mr.
22 Chair, I think we should have a hearing on sidewalks,
23 you know?

24 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: We'll have a hearing
25 on sidewalks.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: See how we can
3 fix our sidewalks at NYCHA.

4 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Hopefully we get a
5 better answer than a side bar.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Alright, thank
7 you.

8 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Alright, we're going
9 to go back to changing during conversion, and we want
10 to get to right-sizing. What is the process for
11 NYCHA using right-sizing during the PACT conversion?

12 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER: For
13 right-sizing we honor the public housing standards,
14 because there is a slight difference between public
15 housing and Section 8.

16 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Right.

17 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER: So
18 anyone who was in place at the time of conversion, we
19 honor the public housing occupancy standards. We
20 only require right-sizing for those who do not meet
21 that standard.

22 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: and what happens to
23 families who are under-occupied units when there are
24 no other units available in their development?
25

1
2 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER: They
3 are notified of the need to right-size, and they're
4 put on a list so that the next time that a unit is
5 available that that meets size of their need, they
6 are notified that they need to transfer.

7 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, there's no
8 displacement.

9 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER: No.

10 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. And are there
11 reasonable accommodations given to elderly folks?
12 Because I know we have a lot of seniors who are
13 living in two or three-bedroom apartments. Are
14 reasonable accommodations being given by the
15 developers, or the new management company that's--

16 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER:
17 [interposing] To remain in their current unit?

18 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: To remain in the
19 current unit in a three-bedroom apartment, are
20 reasonable accommodations being given?

21 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER: We are
22 allowed to give reasonable accommodations, but not
23 to-- like, it can't be more than two bedrooms greater
24 than what they need. So, the most that we could
25 really do is offer one additional bedroom based on

1
2 the accommodation. We are not allowed to go larger
3 than that.

4 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, would it be--

5 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN:

6 [interposing] However, I think just saying that
7 you're a senior would not be grounds for reasonable
8 accommodation. I think you would have to show a true
9 health reason in order to remain in your apartment.
10 The thing is, yes, we understand that a lot of
11 residents, you know, see their apartment as their
12 home because they've been in there for many decades,
13 you know, their history is there, and we're totally
14 sympathetic of that, but at the same time we also
15 have many families who are living in apartments where
16 there's five or six of them in one-bedrooms who
17 really need the bigger space. So, it is, you know,
18 some-- we have to make sure that we get the proper-
19 sized families into the proper-sized apartment.

20 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, but reasonable
21 accommodations are given?

22 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN:

23 Reasonable accommodation is a thing, but it has to
24 be, you know, something from a medical professional
25 that shows a true medical need.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. And if there's
3 a situation where-- say for instance it's not a
4 senior, you-- particular situation where a person who
5 was married and the wife walked away, took the
6 children. The father has remained in the apartment.
7 What is done in a situation like that? Are they
8 dragged into court?

9 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER: No,
10 first when it's time for the household change to be
11 reviewed, that person who remains will be notified
12 that they need to right-size. There's no court
13 action at that point.

14 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, you would
15 basically negotiate with them, or?

16 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER: it's
17 not a negotiation, it's really just an implementation
18 of the HUD regulations concerning household sizes.

19 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, they wouldn't be
20 dragged into court.

21 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER: Not
22 immediately, no.

23 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: But they will be
24 dragged into court if they decide not to leave the
25 unit.

1
2 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER: Then it
3 can become a court issue if they refuse to leave the
4 unit.

5 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay, so you--
6 possibly could possibly become homeless if there's no
7 place for them to go?

8 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER: I will
9 say hopefully everyone will comply, but if someone
10 refused to abide by the regulations that they've
11 signed onto, then--

12 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Well, I
13 mean, but this is a situation where you have a person
14 who was not part of the composition, but has been
15 living in the apartment for the last 20 years, the--
16 whatever the situation is with the wife, wife left,
17 took the children. Now this particular individual is
18 in the apartment. What is done to make sure that
19 person doesn't become homeless and maintains the
20 place where they're living at? And they've been
21 also-- they've been also continued to pay the rent.

22 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER: So, I
23 just want to clarify, that the answers given before
24 was based on someone legally being part of the
25 household.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Right.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER: And your last part of your statement you're saying the person was there, but not--

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Not part of the composition.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER: So, we do have a program where we will review--

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] right.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER: the circumstances, and we do it on a case-by-case basis to try to preserve that tenancy.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, they-- okay. So, in a situation like that, would there be a negotiation with the tenant? Would there be any conversations that will make sure that that tenant doesn't become homeless?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER: It's a case-by-case basis, and our intent it always to preserve the tenancy. So, if we are able to, we will.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, when it comes to oversight and NYCHA's role when it comes to a

1
2 controversy like that, who's the lead person or who
3 is there-- who steps in in a situation like that.

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER: The
5 Lease Housing Department--

6 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Right.

7 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER: will
8 review. We will work with the family. We will work
9 with on-site management to gather as much information
10 as possible to come to a final determination on that
11 tenancy.

12 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay, what
13 information about under-occupied units is given to
14 the PACT developer during the conversion?

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER: During
16 the conversion process everything is given regarding
17 legal logs like court actions, who the last-- who the
18 occupants are, the known occupants are. Anything
19 else? The rent roll, sorry.

20 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And what happens to
21 families who are in an under-occupied unit when there
22 are no other units available in the development?

23 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER: I'm
24 sorry, can you say that again?

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: What happens to
3 families who are in under-occupied units when there
4 are no other units available in the development?

5 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER: They
6 would go onto a list, and would consider according to
7 that list whenever vacancies occur.

8 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, they would have
9 to go on a list?

10 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER: Yes,
11 because at the-- in the entire development we're
12 looking at everyone who is either under or over-
13 occupied. So as units become available, then
14 management is notified here's the next people on the
15 list who need to right-size.

16 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. And when it
17 comes to right-sizing, we know that there are some
18 development where there are only X amount of one-
19 bedrooms. And I think-- I just want to get that on
20 the record again, it is the policy of NYCHA that a--
21 until an appropriate apartment becomes available,
22 then the person would be moved. When it comes to
23 ticket tracking and repairs, working during the PACT
24 process, what is the current system in place for
25

1
2 ticketing tracking repair work and service tickets
3 during the PACT process?

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Do you
5 mean post-construction-- or post-conversion when the
6 PACT partner has taken over?

7 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Yes.

8 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So,
9 the different pact partners, you know, they use their
10 own property tracking software, and we require them
11 to provide us with a summary of their data. So we
12 take in all the data and put it into a form that then
13 ends up on our website, but they all have their own
14 systems that they use.

15 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Is it at their
16 discretion on when they implement a ticketing system
17 or a tracking system?

18 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: I
19 mean, a lot of them have established systems that
20 they've been using separate from NYCHA. So it is
21 simpler for them to just continue to use different
22 ticketing systems that they use in their other
23 portfolios to bring over to the NYCHA system.

24 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, I know there's
25 been instances where some management companies have

1 not instituted a ticketed system, and-- well, let me
2 say this. they've taken two years or so to introduce
3 a ticketing system, and it's been very chaotic, and
4 even after they've introduced the ticketed system,
5 they're still, you know-- repairs are still not being
6 met, and there's still major issue that are not-- not
7 basically being addressed by the new management.

9 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Okay,
10 I'd be interested to follow up on specifics on that
11 with you.

12 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Also, tenants have
13 described that once a development begins the PACT
14 process, repairs at the development tend to slow down
15 or stop at altogether, and are left for when the
16 conversion process commences. What work is still
17 being done by NYCHA, and what work is left to be
18 undone by the PACT partner?

19 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So,
20 NYCHA remains responsible for all the properties and
21 all the repairs right up until the date of
22 conversion, and if so, it is our expectation that
23 work would not slow down, and so to the extent that
24 we are made aware of any issues, we will sort through
25 that and make sure that work happens.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: What happens to
3 ongoing work already underway?

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: It
5 would have to be completed.

6 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, does NYCHA
7 complete it, or does the new management? Was there
8 a-- because we're talking about transitioning. Is
9 there a smooth transition? Because I've seen
10 situations and heard of situations where basically
11 NYCHA just, you know, disappeared, and that has
12 happened in a couple of different developments that
13 are in my district where even the developer said that
14 they just-- they just gave us the key and
15 disappeared.

16 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
17 again, that is not what is supposed to happen, and
18 I'm not sure if you're asking about, you know, work
19 orders that residents have been filing in their
20 specific apartments or other types of projects, but
21 certainly--

22 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Well,
23 it's a combination of the two, work orders and also
24 projects that are being undertaken by NYCHA at the
25 time of the conversion.

1
2 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So,
3 work orders, you know, they should be addressed in
4 real time as they're being filed by residents right
5 up until the closing and NYCHA should complete those.
6 As it relates to larger potential capital projects,
7 you know, one of the things that we try to do is make
8 sure that, you know, if we think a project can be
9 done NYCHA before the conversion happens and it makes
10 sense for the longevity of the project, then that
11 project would go forward. if we think it makes more
12 sense for the PACT partner to take over a piece of
13 work, like say replacing boilers or what have you, we
14 would then ask the PACT partner to do that work if it
15 makes more sense for them to do it than us.

16 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. Let me move on
17 to the employment at PACT development which is to me
18 very important. At Linden and Boulevard Houses which
19 are in my particular district, two development that
20 recently transitioned from public housing to PACT--
21 not most recently, but a couple of years back. How
22 many NYCHA employees did these developments have
23 before the conversion?

24

25

1
2 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: We
3 could get that information. We could give you a
4 before and after.

5 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And how many PACT
6 employees are now at these sites?

7 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Again,
8 we could get you the before and after.

9 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay, I just want to
10 get these questions out. Do PACT employees have
11 similar job benefits to public housing employees, and
12 if not, what are the key differences?

13 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: I
14 think there's a lot of similarities. As Brian
15 mentioned, these are unionized jobs, so I think
16 there's certainly some similarities. I would not know
17 all the differences between the roles or in terms of
18 the benefits, but I think they're fairly comparable.

19 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Yeah, I
20 think it's different unions, different companies, so
21 it's not exactly the same, but I think it is
22 certainly very--

23 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Well,
24 basically a housing assistant would be the same as a
25 housing assistant under the new management, right?

1
2 What would be the difference? That's a simple
3 question.

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: I think
5 we can get you-- also-- I think we can get you the
6 starting, you know, at each-- you know, starting
7 salary at each, but you know, NYCHA employees tend to
8 stay for quite some time. You know, a housing
9 assistant could make, you know, the salary would be
10 quite different, you know, but we could look for
11 starting in both.

12 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, I guess this
13 question hits on what Council Member Sanchez had
14 brought up. Does NYCHA track the union membership or
15 local hiring of the PACT developers against what they
16 propose or promise to the developer's selection
17 process?

18 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: We do.
19 We do track the local hiring. We do track the
20 Section 3 hiring, and also too, can I just clarify
21 something I had said earlier, too. I just want to
22 make sure, too, the Section 3 rules apply, you know,
23 to the construction under, you know, PACT sites. You
24 know, just as they do in NYCHA, but not moving-- not
25 on all hiring.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Do they apply-- so
3 they don't apply to the management?

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Post-
5 conversion, correct.

6 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Post.

7 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Yes,
8 post-conversion, but that is not to say that many of
9 the partners haven't found local hiring to be
10 beneficial, and even though it's not a requirement.
11 It's not something that they don't do.

12 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: What is NYCHA doing
13 as far as oversight, say particularly in a
14 development where there have been no local hiring or
15 the developer chooses not to do the local hiring?
16 What-- I mean, how do you bring them into compliance?

17 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: I
18 mean, there's not an option to not participate. They
19 have to make every effort to--

20 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Well, I
21 can give you a list of developments where there has
22 been no local hiring at all, and it has been an
23 abysmal approach taken by the management company.
24 Say that they put out a couple of flyers, but no true
25 real engagement even with the tenant association to

1
2 have local hiring. And keep in mind in my district
3 we've had close to a little over a billion dollars
4 that has passed through four developments to rehab
5 and all the construction fees, and there was no local
6 hiring done within the last four years, or
7 subcontracting. So, we've asked the developer, you
8 know, to provide us with information or numbers. To
9 this day, nothing. So maybe you can finally do some
10 oversight over that--

11 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:

12 [interposing] Yes.

13 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: and see if you can get
14 those numbers for us.

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Okay.

16 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Because we need to
17 know. Unemployment is high in my district, especially
18 in NYCHA, and there's no reason why residents
19 shouldn't have been working or have had some type of
20 business opportunities with all this money that has
21 passed through these particular developments, and
22 possibly throughout this city.

23 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:

24 Absolutely.

25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Regarding-- and also,
3 too, can we get a breakdown of the unions that are
4 being used-- that are being used by these particular
5 development companies?

6 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Yes.

7 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And also the numbers
8 on union positions that are on these particular
9 sites. Now, I'll move onto post-conversion
10 oversight. What information is captured in monthly
11 reports by PACT developers that details high-risk
12 repairs such as mold, lead, elevator, heat, and hot
13 water complaints?

14 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: so,
15 it's the same as the period during construction. So
16 all of the work orders that are filed, you know, we
17 get that monthly reporting so we know how many have
18 been create-- how many work orders have been created
19 and we track both the number, the quantity but also
20 the time to resolution.

21 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, how do you-- how
22 does NYCHA verify that these reports are accurate?
23 What system is in place?

24 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
25 you know, we also make sure that our residents are

1
2 satisfied, right? Like, if our re-- we rely in part
3 on residents confirming--

4 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] What's
5 the system that's in place?

6 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
7 right now, it's really based on the information that
8 comes from the development--

9 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] How do
10 you engage the residents to get that information?

11 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
12 we often hear from them if they feel like it hasn't
13 been resolved in time.

14 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, there's no
15 outreach?

16 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Brad--

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Just one second,
18 yeah. Could you raise your right hand? Do you
19 affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing
20 but truth in your testimony before this committee and
21 to respond honestly to Council Member questions?

22 CHIEF COMPLIANCE OFFICER GREENBURG: I do.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And if you could just
24 identify yourself and your title for the record?

CHIEF COMPLIANCE OFFICER GREENBURG: I'm

Brad Greenburg, the Chief Compliance Officer at

NYCHA. Just to-- our systems that we have in place

in really key areas to confirm that the work is being

done, including with field inspections and talking to

residents, I want to talk about a couple of them for

you, Chair. One is the reports that come in from the

PACT developers on mold and leaks. If the work order

exceeds a 30-day period, it comes directly to my

Department, to the Compliance Department from the

Real Estate Department, and then we have a process in

place where we take each work order and we chase down

information about it. We both call the residents

themselves and ask them about the status of the work

in their apartment, and we also ask for an update

from the developer. If we're not satisfied either

with generally how the developer is responding or the

residents detailed reporting to us about the work

order in their unit that's exceeded 30 days, we go

and do a visit ourselves. We've gone to a lot of

properties throughout the portfolio just to see the

quality of the work, see whether or not the work

should be getting done. If we find that it's not

getting done, we have a protocol in place to issue a

1 notice of noncompliance, which would trigger a
2 housing quality standards inspection by the Leased
3 Housing Department to suspend subsidies. That's what
4 we do on the mold and leak front. We also have a
5 third-party environmental firm that goes out related
6 to lead-based paint, and if we are told that there is
7 an issue responding to a complaint around that, we
8 send that inspector out, you know, to go do a full
9 evaluation. We also might ask for clearance reports
10 or other things that we need from the developer. So
11 there are systems that we've put in place in the last
12 few years to try to understand whether or not they
13 work's being done properly.

14
15 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: How many times has
16 NYCHA identified issues with a PACT partner for being
17 non-compliant?

18 CHIEF COMPLIANCE OFFICER GREENBURG: You
19 know, so we are working with them every day. Like,
20 before this committee hearing I was on the phone--

21 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Can you
22 give me a number?

23 CHIEF COMPLIANCE OFFICER GREENBURG: It's
24 hard to say exactly because it vary--

25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Well,
3 can you get that-- can you get that to us?

4 CHIEF COMPLIANCE OFFICER GREENBURG: The
5 number is how many times we found--

6 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] You
7 found a PACT partner in non-compliance.

8 CHIEF COMPLIANCE OFFICER GREENBURG:
9 yeah, we've done multiple instances of that. It's
10 really not so simple of like whether you're
11 noncompliant or not. Our goal is to get the
12 residents satisfied with the work in their apartment,
13 so we get to that point, and that's what we're trying
14 to chase.

15 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, I mean, the
16 reason why I ask that, because if there's a multitude
17 of situations when the PACT partner is found non-
18 compliant, then we know-- you know, they're obligated
19 to provide these services to the tenants.

20 CHIEF COMPLIANCE OFFICER GREENBURG: We
21 just--

22 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] So, we
23 need to track to see, you know, if this is really
24 working, and that's the reason why we need to know
25

1
2 exactly how many have been found or have not been
3 found non-compliant.

4 CHIEF COMPLIANCE OFFICER GREENBURG:

5 Absolutely.

6 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: NYCHA has now put out
7 some information on the NYCHA website about PACT
8 partner performance. Is there any data or
9 information being collected that is not on the
10 Dashboard?

11 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: I

12 mean, I think that's a very-- what's on the website
13 is obviously aggregated, as was mentioned before, but
14 it basically encapsulates the bulk of what we collect
15 from our PACT partners.

16 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, what steps does
17 NYCHA take when data shows poor performance of the
18 PACT partner?

19 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
20 you know, Brad just explained part of it as it
21 relates to his work and we follow a similar
22 procedure. If it's a set of issues that are within
23 the real estate's realm, you know, what we want to do
24 is get to resident satisfaction. So we will be
25 working with the PACT partner and the residents to

1
2 make sure that whatever the issue is, it is being
3 resolved.

4 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: On the PACT
5 Dashboard, NYCHA describes tenancy proceeding status
6 with pre-eviction outreach, cases initiated, and
7 evictions. Do PACT partners provide any other data
8 about outcomes of outreach or initiations such as the
9 number of households entering payment plans or the
10 number of households who are self-etic [sic] or leave
11 prior to pre-eviction or to a pre-eviction?

12 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Yes,
13 we require our PACT partners to share with us, you
14 know, the names and numbers of all of the households
15 that are in pre-eviction outreach, and as well, they
16 have to provide us with detailed notes on, you know,
17 the nature of the issue and the steps that they have
18 been taking to communicate with residents and put
19 those residents into-- to connect residents with the
20 relevant resources to try to rectify the issue.

21 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay, and the
22 services. Any services the developer or nonprofit
23 provides for a development connected to household,
24 what are the services that are being provided?
25

1
2 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: well,
3 something that comes up a lot is if a resident is
4 having trouble paying rent and it's due to a change
5 in income, often times folks don't-- perhaps don't
6 realize that they can recertify, so just taking the
7 step of making sure that the resident re-certifies
8 their income and then they can have their rent
9 recalculated. So it's things like that, really
10 understanding what the nature of the issue is, and
11 then figuring out what is the best strategy for
12 helping them out.

13 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Who provides the
14 oversight over the not-for-profit or the community-
15 based organization that's providing the social
16 services?

17 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: It is
18 the-- they are governed by the joint venture team
19 primarily, and you know, we have some oversight over
20 them as well.

21 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: The-- particularly the
22 work scope, some of the nonprofits or CBOs who are
23 providing services or say they're providing services
24 for some reason they have-- like I know one
25 particular not-for-profit or CBO that is providing

1
2 services at Linden Houses. They basically-- their
3 work scope is dedicated to benefits and I guess
4 assisting folks with rent arrears, but when I question
5 them on workforce development, they said that wasn't
6 part of their scope. So-- and I think that that goes
7 back to the oversight and making sure that these
8 developers or management companies fall into
9 compliance with the Section 3. Why are they not
10 hiring nonprofits or CBOs that are also providing or
11 assisting with workforce development?

12 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
13 the social service programs vary by development to
14 development, and what we've tried to do is allow
15 those plans to be developed and tailored to the needs
16 of each community. So that is what-- that is the
17 approach. That's why you'll see some variations from
18 development to development, but you know, if there is
19 a need that's not being met at any particular sites,
20 we can certainly discuss revisiting what social
21 services are being provided.

22 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Do you have a list of
23 all of the CBOs or social service providers that are
24 in--

25

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:

[interposing] Yes, we can provide that.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. And

actually, when it comes to their contracts, is the tenant association involved in that process in helping to make sure a situation that's going on like in Linden Houses doesn't take place where they're providing work to the tenants-- well, basically they're providing services to tenants that-- not saying they're not needing, but where they should be providing other services.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Yes,

we do rely on, you know, the insight and the expertise of the tenant association president and leadership to tell us what they think their needs are. So again, if there are-- as the projects evolve and as things change on the campuses over time, if there are new needs that come up, we can certainly talk about what those social service program would look like.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, resident

engagement is key and important. One of the things that we constantly see is that what you said is not what's actually being done. So, if we can get

1
2 clarity or just a straight answer more as to why we
3 have developments or CBOs coming into New York
4 development under RAD/PACT that have not been any
5 engagement-- it's been no engagement with the tenant
6 association in the beginning stages to make sure that
7 the CBO that is coming in is meeting the needs and
8 desires of the development.

9 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Yes.

10 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Yes, we're going to
11 forward with another round. I'm just hogging the mic
12 for a little. We're going back to our-- we're going
13 to go to our second round of questioning-- questions
14 by our committee members, and we're going to begin--
15 we're going to go to Council Member Sanchez.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you.

17 Thank you so much, Chair. That is the Chair's
18 privilege, so that's just what you do, okay? Thank
19 you. So, my first question is a local one, and I'm
20 looking at you, Leroy, because you know, just in case
21 this is happening in other conversions. So I have
22 the northwest Bronx bundle. It's not 100 percent in
23 my district, but it's pretty much, very close to 100
24 percent of my district. Almost all of my NYCHA
25 buildings with the exception of Marble Hill are

1
2 undergoing conversions, and in one of my sites we
3 have a tenant association that we were told by the
4 tenants was dissolved. They're having internal
5 issues, and NYCHA appears to make that choice. You
6 can confirm that for me. But in these cases, and I
7 know this has been an ongoing conversation between my
8 office and NYCHA where tenant leadership is not, you
9 know-- there is not the formal board. It's been a
10 question for me what is NYCHA's approach rather-- you
11 know, other than just blanketing the whole building
12 and inviting everyone to information sessions. What
13 is the participation in the leadership, the steering
14 of the conversion process by the tenants? Right?
15 I'm concerned about how residents' concerns and their
16 voices are reflected when they don't have a formal TA
17 or where they have a dysfunctional TA, or where you
18 know, for whatever reason the average tenant is not
19 really privy to what's going on. So, can you just
20 share about what is NYCHA's approach in these kind of
21 situations? How do you ensure that NYCHA and the
22 development team, the PACT partner are hearing from
23 all of the voices and all of the concerns?

24 VICE PRESIDENT WILLIAMS: so, our
25 approach again is like you said, is to make sure all

1 residents know the same thing. NYCHA's job is to
2 make sure we have the withdraw [sic] recognition from
3 that particular association. We'll be meeting with
4 the residents to see if we can start a new
5 association at that particular development, but
6 again, we want to make sure from top/bottom that all
7 residents receive the same information and we're
8 there to assist in any way if possible.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Okay. All
11 tenants receive the same information, but there's a
12 steering committee that is sort of, you know, their--
13 they sign NDAs, they're not able to disclose what is
14 happening in those meetings. So in the case of my
15 building there are buildings that are not
16 represented.

17 VICE PRESIDENT WILLIAMS: So, if there
18 ever is a development where there's no resident
19 associations, we select residents that seem like they
20 want to be a part of the process. So it will never a
21 point where we don't have residents as part of the
22 committee to select a developer.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: And what are the
24 responsibilities of those residents to inform the
25 rest of the NYCHA residents within that building?

1
2 VICE PRESIDENT WILLIAMS: Do you want to
3 take this? Responsibilities?

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
5 residents review the proposals that we get from PACT
6 partners. They also interview PACT partners. We
7 take residents on tours of PACT-- existing PACT
8 sites, and they co-select with us.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: But do they have
10 any responsibilities to keep their neighbors informed
11 about what's going on in the process?

12 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: No, we
13 don't expect that specifically of them. Obviously,
14 that would be helpful, but we know that that is our
15 responsibility.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: so, the
17 responsibility of NYCHA?

18 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Yes.

19 VICE PRESIDENT WILLIAMS: Yes.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: And the PACT
21 partner. I'm sorry, Chair, if I may?

22 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: No, you may.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you.
24 Thank you, Chair. Okay, so thank you for those
25 responses, and I'll continue to follow up with my

1 tenants in particular, because it is concerning. I
2 have questions about who's at the table representing
3 hundreds of apartments that are, you know, don't have
4 a TA leadership and don't have anyone right now. So,
5 regarding transfers, Legal Services of New York City
6 has reported that following a building conversion
7 under RAD/PACT, tenants lose their ability to
8 transfer unless their desired building is a part of
9 the same bundle owned and managed by the same private
10 landlord and company which is in turn limiting their
11 ability to transfer outside of say with northwest
12 Bronx bundle, to transfer outside that bundle, and is
13 limiting their, you know, privileges, if you will, as
14 compared to NYCHA residents. So that is one way that
15 the, you know, privileges of a NYCHA residency are
16 different under PACT. So, given these concerns,
17 we've heard of tenants who, you know, were on the
18 wait list for a very long time, you know, wanted to
19 have an accessible unit and they were waiting and
20 their building was converted. Is NYCHA considering
21 allowance of families that are staying-- that have
22 been on wait lists before the transfer? Is NYCHA
23 considering allowing them to stay on the wait list or
24

1
2 is there any policy that is being considered to
3 accommodate such families?

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER: As it
5 relates to their Section 8 tenancy, after a year all
6 residents in place can request a housing choice
7 voucher to relocate anywhere in the United States
8 where there's another public housing agency. So
9 there is a broader accessibility to house affordable
10 housing throughout the country. We are also
11 discussing a plan to consider transferring to other
12 PACT developments. Right now, there is now
13 mechanism. HUD does not permit anyone to transfer
14 from a Section 8 unit over to Section 9. We can't do
15 that under HUD regulations.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Got it. Thank
17 you. And I, you know, understood that you can
18 transfer with a voucher. Has NYCHA made any requests
19 to have an exception to this rule, at least during,
20 you know, the first year, the first two years,
21 whatever time frame?

22 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER:
23 Exception to what rule, I'm sorry?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: That you cannot
25 transfer from Section 8 to Section 9.

1
2 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT MILLER: Not
3 that I'm aware of, but we can get back to you on
4 that.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: If you have not
6 made that request, is that something that NYCHA would
7 consider?

8 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: It is--
9 we are looking at ways-- we have heard this, and
10 we've heard this from the group that you had
11 mentioned and also from residents. It is something
12 that we acknowledge is an issue, but not an easy
13 issue to solve, but we would definitely consider and
14 listen to ways to try to solve for it.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Okay. Thank you.
16 I know you have a great relationship with your
17 regional secretary, right? Former Chair of the
18 Public Housing Committee here, Alicka Ampry-Samuels.

19 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Talk to
20 her a few times. We talk to--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: [interposing]
22 Last question, this might be a TBD, but does NYCHA
23 have anything to share regarding how the Mayor's City
24 of Yes proposals will impact either PACT campuses or
25 NYCHA campuses?

2 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: I
3 think that's TBA.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. Look
5 forward to the discussion.

6 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you, Council
7 Member Sanchez. Now we're going to go-- allow
8 Council Member Darlene Mealy.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay, I just want
10 to go back to the beginning. Maybe I missed
11 something. Why did NYCHA go to Section 9 when you
12 say Section 8 is the same thing?

13 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: So,
14 they're not the same. So, Section 9 is what we, you
15 know, referred to as traditional public housing,
16 right? So, that was the original program that was
17 created in the 1930s.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Don't give me the
19 history now. Let's--

20 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN:
21 [interposing] Sure, no, okay. You're right. And you
22 know--

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] How's
24 it different?

1
2 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: How's it
3 different, okay. So the Section 8 program was a
4 program that was created, again, by the-- it is a
5 federal subsidy, and it comes into two different
6 ways, either a voucher-based program where the tenant
7 is given a voucher. They're meant to go out and find
8 an apartment or--

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] So
10 why they keep Section 8?

11 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: There is
12 more funding in Section 8.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: It's more funding-
14 -

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN:
16 [interposing] Correct.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: in Section 8?

18 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: That is
19 correct.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So, why not keep
21 that?

22 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: So,
23 that's what we-- basically, what we're doing is we're
24 going to where the funding is, right? So the funding
25 is in Section 8.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So, you are
3 thinking about discontinuing Section 9?

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: No, I
5 think the goal is to preserve the housing stock. The
6 funding right now is within Section 8.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: But I got to
8 understand. Section 8 you said has more money.

9 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: That's
10 correct.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Why did-- who
12 bright idea was to go into Section 9? If this was
13 already sustainable to NYCHA and to the tenant?

14 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: So,
15 Section 9 was the original program, the program that
16 was created, you know, the public housing program.
17 Section 8 was created in the 1970s as a--

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] Yes.

19 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: program-

20 -

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] It
22 was working.

23 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: It does,
24 but NYCHA has to-- number one, we had to convert our
25 properties in order to become a Section 8. In your--

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] Was
3 that a requirement?

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: district
5 we did this 10 years ago. It was one of the first--
6 even predates RAD at Saratoga. And it's held up
7 really well. I mean, Saratoga is-- you know,
8 Saratoga is--

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] So
10 far.

11 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: a senior
12 development, yeah. 10 years later, we're seeing
13 that, you know, the seniors still are really happy
14 there, and the reason we were able to do that is we
15 converted from Section 9 to Section 8. We received
16 more subsidy. We were able to bring back more
17 improvements, and you know, I remember working with
18 the tenants there at the time, and I've gone back
19 recently and still proud to say that it looks really
20 nice.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Yes, yes, yes.
22 Okay. Park Rock, I got to say I just was over there,
23 and it's a big tree that fell the last storm and it's
24 still there, and I called numerous time, and now I
25 concur with my colleague Salamanca-- I get tickets in

1 front of my house. Why NYCHA is not taking that up?
2 And guess what, why was there-- it was a impaired
3 man, he was trying to get into his cab. The
4 construction workers and everyone is trying to help
5 him maneuver over that tree. So, if he would have
6 fell in front of a NYCHA building, who would that
7 would have been responsible, NYCHA, Parks Department-
8 - who else I called? City? But you-- it's right in
9 front of your building. Who would have been
10 responsible?
11

12 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
13 you mentioned--

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] It's
15 a big tree trunk. I got the picture.

16 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
17 you mentioned that it was Reid Park Rock, so--

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] Reid
19 Park Rock, yeah.

20 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: if you
21 can give us the address, we will reach out to the
22 development team.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: It's Reid Park
24 Rock, Rochester and Park Place.

25

1 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Okay.

2 I mean, the development--

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] And
4 it-- now it's been a week and a half I've been
5 calling trying to get rid of that tree.

6 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Okay.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: but if someone get
8 hurt, it's on record that we have to do something,
9 and I pray that-- I'm going to start brainstorming
10 with my colleagues, that we get a bill in place that
11 maybe y'all should, because if someone trip, are you
12 responsible in front of nay NYCHA development?

13 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
14 again, this is a site that's converted, so--

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] But
16 in general, any NYCHA building? Hi Brian.

17 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: How are
18 you, Council Member? So, yeah, the responsibility
19 for the sidewalks that-- you know, just the general
20 sidewalk is our--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] If
22 someone fall in front of NYCHA?

23 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: I don't
24 know the tort responsibility there. I'm not an
25

1 attorney, but you know, but I'm [inaudible] the
2 responsibility of, you know, fixing it on the
3 Department of Transportation.
4

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Oh, right, DOT.

6 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: For
7 instance, like, your larger developments like Van
8 Dyke Houses where you have the pathways that are on
9 the property, that is our responsibility, but the
10 street itself is Department of Transportation. But I
11 don't know--

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] I
13 called them.

14 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: You
15 know, I don't know when it comes to court, you know,
16 who-- you know, that person would be able to sue.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I got one more
18 question.

19 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Yes, Council Member,
20 go ahead.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Thank you. How
22 many PACT partners do you have for the five boroughs?
23 Could you give me four names?

24 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Just
25 the names or the numbers?

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Give me the
3 numbers first. Thank you. I'm sorry.

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Well,
5 we can get you a list of--

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing]
7 Right, but I just want to know how many?

8 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: I don't
9 know the number off the top of my head, because it
10 depends on if you're counting the developers, general
11 contractors, but we have a--

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] Just
13 the PACT partners who you-- well, the City have given
14 NYCHA development--

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
16 [interposing] Yeah.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: to the partners. I
18 know I have-- one management company have 13, I
19 think. So that must be going on around the whole
20 city. So I just want to know about how many do you
21 have that City turn over to.

22 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: We
23 have a complete list on our website, and we can send
24 it to you directly, that has every single project and
25 all of the different partners that make up each team

1
2 at each project, so you can see total number of
3 developers, the total number of property managers,
4 the total number of general contractors at each of
5 the sites, and you can see, you know, all the
6 different projects.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: How many is
8 minority?

9 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: A
10 significant portion.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Of the
12 subcontractors?

13 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: We
14 require that every team has an MWBE or a nonprofit
15 and that they have a meaningful role in each project.
16 So, virtually all--

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] So,
18 I'm going to go back and do that research, because it
19 seems like no one locally is working in our
20 communities. When I went there that day, it was no
21 African-American, no Latino-- or it was Latino, but
22 where are the minorities getting some of these jobs?

23 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Again,
24 we'll send you the list, and every team is required
25 to have MWBE participation, and as I mentioned, we

1
2 have to-- they have to provide meaningful roles for
3 each of the MWBEs.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: And for these
5 Section 3 jobs, how are you informing the residents
6 of the NYCHA developments about-- do they have to
7 have OSHA training certificate, or they could just
8 come in and see a flyer and then apply? Because I
9 haven't seen any, and one person--

10 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN:

11 [interposing] So, I think--

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: you know that is--
13 unless he's in your district, the TA President Arthur
14 Warren. He's been harassing every Council Member in
15 regards to these Section 3 jobs, and no one is
16 getting. They used to get these jobs. TA President
17 has the latitude to give these jobs to people who
18 live in NYCHA, and all of a sudden now not one person
19 getting the job. That has to be addressed, Chair.

20 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Yep, and
21 I think this is one of the areas where the social
22 service provider really helps in terms of getting
23 residents either ready to do the work, because each
24 job requires different--

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] So
3 they have to have OSHA training.

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: It
5 depends on the job. It depends on, you know-- so some
6 jobs do have state law that require OSHA, you know,
7 OSHA requirements. Some don't. And so I think, you
8 know, working with the social service provider it is
9 important for--

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] So
11 you don't work with the TA Presidents anymore?

12 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Oh, no.
13 Yeah, of course, but get together.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So, is there
15 anything in place that they least get 10 people from
16 their NYCHA development that should get that on that-
17 the site, if billions of dollars is coming through
18 their neighborhood?

19 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: I think,
20 you know, we have-- you know, in many cases--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing]
22 Something is wrong with this.

23 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: And we
24 can give you a list of, you know, by development the
25 number of residents that have been hired. I think

1
2 what we want to do is we want to make sure we hire as
3 many people as possible.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Yes.

5 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Many
6 people that are qualified as possible, but we don't
7 one or two or even three people controlling the
8 process.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: No. Wait--

10 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN:
11 [interposing] We want to make sure that we have a
12 fair process along the way.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Do you know how
14 much money is coming through Brownsville and every
15 part of this city. We are just asking if the TA
16 President could have-- they did it before-- have a
17 list of people in the community or in their
18 development that is qualified. You said some of
19 those jobs, you know, have to have a college degree.
20 I feel-- you did it before, because I know. The TA
21 Presidents has the latitude to at least hire five or
22 six or ten people. It's not that you're giving them
23 jobs automatically. They are making sure the people
24 are in compliance. Why can't that be done? If you
25 want to partner with the TA Presidents-- because it's

1
2 not fair to them that all this money is coming
3 through, all this development is coming through the
4 neighborhood, and no one they know are working, not
5 one person.

6 VICE PRESIDENT WILLIAMS: So, Leroy
7 Williams, Vice President of Resident Services. So,
8 we do work with the resident associations.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So what is the
10 breakdown that not one person can get a job?

11 VICE PRESIDENT WILLIAMS: So, as Jonathan
12 said, we will get you that information, but I just
13 want to be clear, that we do make sure that the
14 resident association along as also the residents
15 overall knows what, you know, jobs are available
16 through the Section 3 and overall.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: How do you post?

18 VICE PRESIDENT WILLIAMS: Excuse me? I'm
19 sorry.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: How do you post a
21 job event? I know we got to go.

22 VICE PRESIDENT WILLIAMS: So, really--

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] How
24 do you post a job?

1
2 VICE PRESIDENT WILLIAMS: So, it really
3 depends on the site. We work with our social
4 services providers and also our developers at NYCHA.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Do you send an
6 email to all the tenants, presidents, or [inaudible].

7 VICE PRESIDENT WILLIAMS: Again, it
8 depends on the outreach for that specific
9 development. So we try to make sure in different
10 ways. So sometimes, yes, we do send emails. We do
11 posts. We put door-to-door flyering [sic]. So it
12 does vary.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: What was the last
14 building you did that? And that's my last question.
15 Because I go-- I would like to go over to that
16 building and see where it was posted.

17 VICE PRESIDENT WILLIAMS: No problem. My
18 colleague, Michael, will respond.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Hi.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Just one second.
21 Could you raise your right hand? Do you affirm to
22 tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the
23 truth in your testimony before this committee and to
24 respond honestly to Council Member questions?
25

1
2 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: I do. And my name
3 is Michael Parkinson. I'm the Director of Community
4 Planning in NYCHA Real Estate. Thank you for the
5 question, Council Member. It is a fair one. Just
6 really quickly, I do want to just for the record
7 state the number of hires that we have made through
8 the Section 3 requirement at our projects where
9 construction is completed. At Ocean Bay we've hired
10 102 Section 3 residents, Baychester Murphy is 50,
11 Betances 52, Brooklyn Bundle 144, Hope Gardens
12 Bushwick Bundle 38, Twin Parks West and Hybridge
13 Franklin 28, and the Manhattan Bundle 140. So in
14 total, just on those projects alone we've hired well
15 over 500 Section 3 hires.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Do you have the
17 breakdown of the dem--

18 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: We do have those
19 broken down by project. I believe those are even in
20 the tracker that is posted online. But I just want
21 to share, too because your question was about
22 engagement and how residents come to find out about
23 these opportunities. At each of our projects, our
24 team and Leroy's team and others, we work with our
25 development partners and the tenant association to

1
2 craft detailed resident engagement guidelines and
3 roadmaps. And part of that, a large part of that is
4 on notifying residents of hiring opportunities and
5 training opportunities.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Alright. Trick
7 question, Park Rock is under development right now.
8 How many people from the community received jobs?

9 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: Well, I think we can
10 get back to you with the numbers so far, but it's
11 also under construction.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: It's in play right
13 now.

14 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: Yep.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: These you said are
16 already done. We could go back. But this, you
17 should have accurate information now, because it's in
18 play right now. I went there, I didn't see anyone
19 look like me.

20 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: Understood. Well, I
21 can say as of now we have--

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] It
23 wasn't--

24 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: over 47,000 labor
25 hours, Section 3 labor hours at Reid Park Rock. If

1
2 we can break that down, we will. I'm not sure how to
3 do that.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay. What's your
5 first name again?

6 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: Michael.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Michael, sorry. I
8 speak to you offline.

9 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: Sure. And--

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] Thank
11 you. Thank you and you've been very helpful, Mr.
12 [inaudible]. Thank you.

13 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: Yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: But I'm looking
15 forward to having a pow-wow offline. Thank you.
16 Thank you, chair, for the leverage.

17 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you, Darlene,
18 Council Member Mealy. Sorry about that. John, we
19 know you have to leave. You're excused. Thank you.
20 Oh, no, we're not done with the panel, just John. We
21 have a couple more questions. Brian, we're going to
22 make you work today. I need to know how many options
23 are residents given in reviewing PACT partners, how
24 many options?

1
2 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Sorry,
3 I was starting to pack up. Can you repeat that
4 question?

5 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: How many options are
6 residents given to review PACT partners?

7 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So,
8 typically about three to four, maybe three to five
9 teams will respond to a request for expressions of
10 interest, and then those proposals will be--
11 proposals from those teams will be presented to
12 residents for their review and consideration.

13 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Who makes the final
14 decision?

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: It's a
16 joint decision between the residents and NYCHA.

17 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: How is that process
18 done?

19 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
20 Actually, I'll turn it over to Michael who works with
21 residents during that particular stage.

22 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: Thank you.
23 Appreciate the question. Well, the process has
24 evolved over time. So it looks a lot different now
25 than it did two year ago, and even I think before

1 that we weren't seen doing the same process. And
2 really, we defer to the needs of the residents. We
3 make a lot of options available to them with respects
4 to various meetings to go over the proposals that
5 have been submitted. We can break down the
6 components of those proposals meeting by meeting,
7 whether it's the scope of work that's being proposed,
8 the type of management plan that's in place,
9 potential social service partners. We work with
10 resident-- we call them resident advisors. These are
11 technical support consultants that we provide to the
12 residents to support them through this process, and
13 we get residents comfortable with the proposals to a
14 point where they even interview all of the
15 perspective development teams, and the residents lead
16 these interviews. They work with their technical
17 assistance providers to prep for questions, prod them
18 on certain things. They definitely ask the hard
19 questions with respect to some of the history and
20 experience that these partners provide. Following
21 those interviews, often times residents will suggest
22 going on tours of sites that these partners have
23 completed, work that they've done, so they can see
24 for their own eyes the quality of craftsmanship and
25

1
2 work that the partners are able to bring to the
3 table. Following that step, there are often times
4 the need for more questions, and we'll go back to the
5 partners with questions developed from the residents
6 in writing to--

7 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Okay.

8 Thank you. Back to my original question. Who makes
9 the final decision? Is this decision-- because it
10 seems like, you know, what you said is all good and
11 dandy, but it still didn't answer my question. Are
12 the tenants truly involved in the process of picking
13 these developers?

14 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: Yes.

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Yes,
16 they are.

17 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: Absolutely.

18 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. So, if the
19 tenants are involved, why is it that after-- and we
20 have multiple situations or conversions that have
21 taken place where residents said they didn't even
22 know that they were even being privatized, or this
23 particular program was coming to their development?

24 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: So,
25 this, you know, Michael had referred to the fact that

1 the program has evolved over the years, and I was
2 starting to describe this earlier. When we started
3 the program in 2019, NYCHA would put out requests for
4 proposals and solicit proposals from the development
5 community, and we would review and make the
6 selections. Over time, you know, we recognized that
7 resident engagement was of critical importance. So
8 with every round that we've been doing since 2019,
9 we've been expanding the role of the residents. So,
10 yes, there's certainly a disconnect in some ways,
11 because some of the earlier projects did not have the
12 same kind of resident engagement that we do today.

14 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, now, at Bayview
15 Houses, they're pretty new-- they're going to
16 actually be-- they're going to be converted. They're
17 in the early stages.

18 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Yes.

19 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Will the tenants have
20 a vote or a say in the new developers?

21 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: They
22 have selected a developer there, and in fact, I
23 attended the meeting with Ms. Boyce, the new
24 development team and all the elected officials
25 including Council Member Narcisse's Chief of Staff at

1 the Community Center. I will tell you, it was a very
2 emotional meeting because the tenants and the
3 development team, you know, had been working together
4 for so many months, and they were so happy to be, you
5 know, really partners in this process, and they were
6 very proud to like stand there and tell the elected
7 officials that they all believe that they made the
8 right choice.
9

10 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Let me ask you this,
11 how many developers were in the process?

12 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: For that
13 development, Michael, I know you were more--

14 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Was it
15 one? Was it two? Was it three?

16 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: I believe there were
17 four total.

18 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: there were four
19 developers. How were the four developers selected?

20 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: Going through that
21 process I described previously. You mean, the four--

22 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] How were
23 the four developers selected to be placed before the
24 tenant association or the tenants? Who selected
25 them?

1
2 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: Well, we-- Jonathan,
3 I don't know if you want to-- we issued a request for
4 expression of interest describing the project and the
5 requirements, and of the pre-qualified development
6 partners, general contractors, property managers who
7 get prequalified annually, teams were formed at their
8 own discretion, and they chose-- those partners chose
9 to submit proposals for the Bayview project.

10 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. I'm going to
11 ask does the implementation of the Department of
12 Investigations, the 14 recommendations that were
13 given, have-- are they being-- are they bearing
14 anything as far as the NYCHA selection process for
15 the PACT partners? Is there any-- You want me ask
16 that question again?

17 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Yeah, no.
18 No, I think it's a different issue, and so the answer
19 is no. It's not-- that was on a micro-purchasing,
20 and this on development selection.

21 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, I'm saying that
22 as far as the selection process, is there anything--
23 any of the recommendations that were recommended?
24 Are they being used in this particular selection
25 process to avoid--

1
2 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: So, the 14
3 recommendations from DOI were about the micro-
4 purchase program--

5 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Correct.

6 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: At NYCHA managed
7 properties which are \$10,000 or less purchases for
8 services. This is obviously a very different
9 program. It's a program that Jonathan, like he said,
10 he has a prequalified list. It's a procurement
11 process that has request for expression of interest,
12 totally different procurement model. So, DOI's
13 recommendations really have no relationship at all.

14 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, I think the
15 point we're getting to on this is more the
16 contractors or selection of contractors.

17 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: Yeah, it's a
18 completely different type of contract.

19 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: What's that process
20 look like, and what oversight is NYCHA doing on the
21 selection of contractors so-- because you know,
22 basically as we speak right now, we-- there's no type
23 of financial accountability to this council as to how
24 much money is being spent, who's being hired, who's
25 getting the contracts. So, to avoid a situation

1
2 where we have bunch of developers being dragged out
3 in handcuffs, what's being put in place by NYCHA so
4 we know where the money's going, what's the process
5 of folks being brought in as far as contractors, and
6 there's no quid pro quo, everything's being done
7 above?

8 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: So, like Jonathan
9 mentioned, the way that the PACT process works is you
10 have a lead developer, but you also have general
11 contractors who have some of their own subcontractors
12 as well who do the construction. It's a totally
13 different pool of vendors than the pool of vendors
14 that do \$10,000 or less type of micro-purchase at a
15 NYCHA-managed property. So I don't think the risks
16 are quite the same, just as a baseline foundational
17 thing. What I'll say--

18 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Well,
19 are the tenants-- are the tenants engaged in the
20 process helping--

21 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: [interposing] So, the
22 general contract--

23 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: select--

24 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: [interposing] Yeah,
25 the general contractor is a part of the development

1
2 team from the outset. So that general contractor
3 gets put through the same selection process with the
4 rest of the team.

5 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Are the tenants
6 involved in the process of selecting contractors?

7 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: And that's the
8 process that Michael was talking about where they had
9 a selection process and the general contractors--

10 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Well, I
11 mean, no, we get the actual-- the developers, but we
12 get the actual, the developers, but when we get to
13 the nitty gritty of now hiring-- for a simple
14 example, someone who's going to put the doors on, the
15 company-- the company where they purchased the doors,
16 where they get the toilet bowls, the supplies, is
17 there a process put in place by NYCHA where the
18 tenants can weigh in on it and give their input so
19 we're not getting in a situation where we're seeing
20 in Linden Houses where the current management company
21 or the current developers or construction company is
22 going ahead, they're putting on doors, they're
23 putting slam locks on doors where the tenant
24 association in this situation has told them
25 repeatedly slam locks won't work in Linden Houses,

1 but the management goes ahead and-- well, the
2 developers go ahead and they purchase all the doors
3 with slam locks, and there's being massive lock-outs,
4 and I think that was mentioned earlier by one of the
5 tenants. What process is put in place, because this
6 goes back to my general point, if the tenants are
7 engaged early, and I guess this is the reason why I
8 kind of fundamentally disagree with the RAD/PACT
9 program-- if the tenants are not engaged and they're
10 not at the table, we're going to have situations
11 where purchases are being made that are not in line
12 with what the tenants want, and these are the folks
13 that live there. So these are-- this-- you know, the
14 demand for company and the developers that are coming
15 in to develop the property need to make sure that
16 they're listening and not just listening, but that
17 they're following the instructions of the tenants
18 when it comes to what they want in their apartments.

19
20 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: I--

21 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] And
22 we're not seeing that.

23 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: I agree with you,
24 Chair. I've personally attended construction meetings
25 with TA Presidents and the contractor and heard the

1
2 back and forth myself, and including at Linden. I
3 hear you that it needs to be more, and I think
4 Jonathan can certainly take that--

5 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Well,
6 the reason why I bring this up is because, you know,
7 you have another 37,000 units that you're going to
8 put into a RAD, and we need to make sure that these
9 safety nets are put in. So that's the reason why--
10 hence, this hearing. Because for the last units that
11 have gone on the RAD, we haven't seen that. And
12 particularly, we can point out-- as was pointed out
13 by my colleague, there are some successful RADs. I
14 know in Florentino Houses, the gut rehab was done
15 pretty well, but when it come to the in-place rehabs,
16 they've been an abysmal failure in my district.

17 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: Council Member, or
18 Chair, just to-- I want to reiterate a couple of the
19 points were made earlier and respond to the-- I think
20 the question around the scope of work and how
21 residents are made aware of what is going to be
22 happening, because this is something that in our work
23 we care a lot-- of concern about, right? You know,
24 our development partners in NYCHA, we share a lot of
25 information. We gain valuable feedback throughout

1
2 the predevelopment process and put together the scope
3 of work, but residents still want to feel assured
4 that at the end of the day when the construction work
5 is actually being done, and rehabilitation is
6 complete, it matches what was said in predevelopment
7 in those meetings, right? So one of the things that
8 our team has been working on lately in the later
9 iterations of the project is putting together a
10 robust community plan that gets distributed to every
11 resident across the project, and within that plan, we
12 detail all of the scope items that residents should
13 come to expect when the rehabilitation is complete.
14 And part of the reason--

15 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Will the
16 residents be a part of creating that plan?

17 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: Absolutely, yes.

18 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay.

19 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: The residents are
20 part of creating that plan through a variety of
21 meetings and--

22 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] No, no,
23 I'm saying will they be part of that plan? Because
24 currently--

25 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: Yes.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: they're not.

DIRECTOR PARKINSON: Yes, they are and they will be.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Alright. So, we are now-- Darlene, did you-- Council Member Mealy, did you have any more questions?

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Just one. You said Saratino [sic] is doing well. I was wondering why-- because it used to be in my district, now it's not. But I remember when it was in my district no-- well, some people were still in there, and 'til this day people are still in there and t's not finished, so I'm-- I just need a little clarity.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Farantino [sic] was always one of our more challenging properties, as you know, especially when it came to plumbing and mold issues and also the roof. We had to-- as you know, we had to relocate residents who lived in the upper floors--

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] And some residents chose to stay.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Correct, yes. So, the issue--

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] Is
3 that holding the whole project?

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: The
5 issue that-- and again, I'll give it Jonathan and
6 Michael, but conditions at Farantino was so bad, and
7 thank goodness, though, for this program that we were
8 able to find the funding to reinvest in Farantino to
9 where it was--

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] How
11 many years it's been so far?

12 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: well,
13 it's been bad for a very, very long time. But it's
14 a--

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing]
16 Excuse me. No, how many years?

17 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Oh, the
18 conversion. Oh, pretty-- fairly--

19 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA:
20 [interposing] Yeah, the renno--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] Has
22 it been over four years?

23 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: No,
24 the renovation has not been--

25 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] Sure?

1
2 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Yes,
3 it has not been four years. It's been about three at
4 this point, almost three.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So, with RAD/PACT
6 developments, how long will it-- the scope of
7 remodeling these buildings, the longevity of it?
8 Will it be no more than six years, eight, or 10?

9 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: For
10 the renovation to happen?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Yes.

12 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT GOUVEIA: Typic-
13 -

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] And
15 especially if some people chose not to move, and
16 maybe they wanted checkerboard that maybe you move
17 all the tenants to one side and remodel, and then
18 when that side is done-- because some people don't
19 trust. They feel if you move them out, they're not
20 getting back in their apartments, and I understand
21 that. But have y'all ever thought about that's the
22 reason why it's not finalized already?

23 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: [inaudible]
24 Farantino Plaza which is-- a lot of us have been
25 there, including-- it closed it December 2021.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: It's closing?

DIRECTOR PARKINSON: It closed in December 2021, so it's been--

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: 21.

DIRECTOR PARKINSON: December 20, 2021. That property had severe issues--

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] We know.

DIRECTOR PARKINSON: with the roof and the para [sic] pit, and so there was a massive amount of water intrusion that came into the property. They had mold throughout the wood joists.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: But people are still there?

DIRECTOR PARKINSON: Yeah, it was a physically very damaged because when we converted it. They have vacated the buildings in order to do the construction, and it's a really important project. There were people like Brian said, they were living there without a subsidy for a very long time. It was un-subsidized, and the property was in terrible condition because of all the water intrusion.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: You know what you
3 just said, you said it was subsidized and now it's
4 unsubsidized.

5 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: No, I said in the
6 past it was not-- there was no proper subsidy--

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing]
8 Subsidy now in PACT.

9 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: They built proper
10 subsidy for it, now it does have a path forward. So
11 I just want to-- in fact, share a success story for
12 the program. This was a building like I said that
13 had tons of water intrusion--

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] Could
15 we talk further more about that offline? Because--

16 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN:
17 [interposing] I think we can. In fact, and Council
18 Member--

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing]
20 people are still in there.

21 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: if you
22 would like, we can even set up a tour with Council
23 Member Banks, and you could see the property now,
24 because I think you'd be very surprised at the
25 progress they've made there, and as somebody who

1
2 knows the history like you do and remember the days
3 when the property was in distress, to see the way
4 it's turned around now, we'd be proud to show it to
5 you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So, some people
7 are still living there with you remodeling?

8 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: No, the
9 building had to--

10 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: [interposing] No,
11 because of the condition--

12 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN:
13 [interposing] The conditions were so bad that we
14 could not do in-place rehab.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay, so it's
16 totally vacant.

17 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: And just to clarify,
18 because this is something you asked earlier, too. We
19 do a lot of environmental testing before we decide if
20 we're going to do an in-place rehab or not. So every
21 developer at this point has to test every unit at 0.5
22 which is the new standard for lead-based paint. If
23 you're abating lead-based paint as part of the rehab,
24 you have to relocate the person out of the unit. You
25 can't keep the person in the unit. So there's no risk

1 of lead dust hazards, and we have to clear the unit
2 before that person can come back in dust wipes. And
3 the same thing applies in the Farantino example where
4 we had pervasive mold behind the sheetrock and around
5 the wood joists. We didn't feel comfortable letting
6 people stay in place during the rehab.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Thank you.

9 DIRECTOR PARKINSON: So, it was vacated
10 and we worked with the developer to do that. So we
11 take that very seriously.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Yes and I'm
13 putting legislation, any meeting go after one, we
14 should be provided lunch.

15 [laughter]

16 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: If I
17 could cosponsor that bill, I'd be glad.

18 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. I bet you
19 will, Brian. Now we're going to move forward, guys.
20 Thank you so much. And again, to NYCHA, thank you
21 for the opportunity to, you know, to hear some of the
22 responses that we heard, but I think overriding is
23 important; tenant engagement is key, and that's
24 what's been lacking with these RAD-- with these
25 conversions. There's been no real tenant engagement,

1
2 and it seems more like a occupying force coming in
3 and taking over the community and that's what we've
4 been seeing my particular district, and we've
5 constantly said to a lot of developers, have the
6 conversation and listen to the tenants. Just don't
7 take it as an advisory, but listen to the tenants and
8 hear what they have to say and then implement it.
9 They're the folks that live there. They live there
10 every day. They have to deal with the decisions that
11 are being made by some of these RAD/PACT developers
12 who have shown complete disregard for a lot of the
13 tenants, and particularly some of the tenant
14 association. I get text messages all the time about
15 just basic things. Just got a text message yesterday
16 from the tenant association at Linden Houses where
17 the maintenance folks that are keeping the grounds,
18 mopping the buildings basically told them on the
19 side, pulled them to the side after a construction
20 meeting and told them that there's no budget for mops
21 or supplies to mop the buildings. This is basic,
22 basic maintenance, basic maintenance. And we're
23 talking about the groundkeepers, the folks that are
24 supposed to maintain the buildings are telling the
25 tenant association there's no budget to mop the

1 floors, to purchase mops, to purchase supplies.

2 That's definitely disheartening to hear that, and

3 once again, we have to get a wrap on where the

4 money's going. We-- you know, listen, this get rich

5 scheme has to stop. So again, thank you, and

6 hopefully we'll get responses back to some of the

7 questions you were unable to answer today. Thank you

8 so much for your testimony. Thank you.

9 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Thank

10 you.

11 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. Now I'm going

12 to open up the hearing on public testimony. I remind

13 members of the public that this is a formal

14 government proceeding and that decorum shall be

15 observed at all times. As such, members of the

16 public shall remain silent at all times. The witness

17 table is reserved for people who wish to testify. No

18 video recording, photography is allowed from the

19 witness table. Further, members of the public may

20 not present audio or video recordings as testimony,

21 but may submit transmits of such recordings to the

22 Sergeant of Arms for inclusion into the hearing

23 record. If you wish to speak-- well, we already did

24 that already. Most of the folks have already signed

25

1
2 up already. Again, guys, let's obey the decorum, and
3 now we're going to move forward with bringing up our
4 folks who are giving testimony today. We're going to
5 start with the first name is Alixa Cruz, Alixa Cruz
6 and-- thank you. Celines Miranda? Ann Valdez? We
7 have a C.G., C.G. Yeah, it's two initials, C.G.
8 Velazquez, Zulay Velazquez? Louise Velez? Okay, no
9 not a problem. I didn't see her. Sorry about that.
10 We're going to start from my left. So that would be--
11 -

12 ALIXA CRUZ: Alixa Cruz.

13 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Ms. Cruz. Thank you,
14 Ms. Cruz.

15 ALIXA CRUZ: Hi. Good afternoon
16 everyone. I'm a NYCHA resident for many years, since
17 1969, and I've been under Section 9, and I'm very
18 happy with-- I was very happy with NYCHA before, but
19 excuse the language, but now they're full of it,
20 NYCHA people, because they're selling us and they're
21 trying to get RAD/PACT-- whether it's RAD/PACT,
22 Preservation Trust, or whatever they might call it,
23 it's still essence [sic] related, and it's privatized
24 and will hurt every person that has low income. We
25 don't need that. We need security. We need to be

1
2 subsidized, and we need to have Section 9 stay as is,
3 and you know, I don't trust NYCHA, because of what
4 came to the light about the 70 employees, and I'm
5 pretty sure they're pretty good count of people that
6 are dishonest at NYCHA. I'm not saying all, but I'm
7 not happy with them. See that they make a six figure
8 salary on our account, on low income. There were
9 billions of dollar distributed for years, and years,
10 and years, and years, and look where we stand now.
11 We don't have-- we have a bad stove. We have
12 plumbing, whatever. My building is pretty good, but
13 we're complaining about this because they were
14 pocketing the money. This is a money grab, and
15 essence [sic] related is a landscape grab because
16 they want to take everything. They want to make
17 money on us, and we don't-- we're the victims here.
18 Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
20 testimony, Ms. Cruz.

21 ALIXA CRUZ: Thank you.

22 CELINES MIRANDA: I'm Celines Miranda. I
23 am a lifelong resident of Elliott Houses. As many of
24 you know, my public housing development along with
25 Fulton Houses may be demolished, and if the Council

1
2 does not act fast to support the majority of the
3 residents, 84 percent who are firmly against
4 demolition of our home, Fulton and Elliott Chelsea
5 residents were forced into a RAD conversion based on
6 a working group where only six tenants from my
7 campus, the Elliott Chelsea development
8 participating. This is how Related Essence got their
9 foot in the door. Renovation was initially offered,
10 but out of nowhere they sprung up a demolition
11 proposal on us. So now, in addition to being forced
12 into a RAD conversion, NYCHA and Related companies
13 want to force us into a demolition. If NYCHA's
14 Section 18 application gets approved, resident rights
15 and protections are not guaranteed. Related has a
16 history of not following through on their promises.
17 Some tenants are believing their word, but there is
18 not a contract that guarantees a secure transfer. The
19 survey that Related developer circulated was a biased
20 survey. For starters, it was designed and
21 administered for the developers themselves. Also,
22 the word demolition does not appear on the survey.
23 Instead the term new construction was used to
24 misinform residents by not describing that the option
25 requires decades of demolition, 16 to 20 years or

1
2 more living in a construction site. Another flaw in
3 the survey, we were not given the option to stay in
4 public housing which explains why 73 did not
5 participate in this survey.

6 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] 30
7 seconds to wrap, please.

8 CELINES MIRANDA: 73 percent of the FEC
9 [sic] tenants chose to stay in public housing when
10 they did not participate in this PACT survey. The
11 tenants consciously chose not to participate in the
12 survey with the purpose of keeping private developers
13 away. This survey is not a fair representation of
14 what the residents actually want. Unfortunately,
15 several public officials, including our own Council
16 Member, are choosing to support this proposed
17 demotion by Essence, Related, and NYCHA. I am urging
18 all Council Members to reject to this flawed and
19 biased survey and to stand with the majority of FEC
20 tenants who are against the demotion of our homes.
21 We made a decision, no privatization, no demolition.

22 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
23 testimony. Next.

24 ANN VALDEZ: Hello. Hi, my name is Ann
25 Valdez. I am a resident of Gravesend Houses in Coney

1
2 Island, first domestic violence built in 1954. I'm
3 the third generation. I've also lived in Park Rock
4 Consolidated. I lived at 1598 Sterling Place,
5 between Buffalo and Rochester, and when I lived there
6 I was-- I had been transferred originally from
7 Richmond Terrace Houses in Staten Island. I moved
8 there on an emergency transfer for domestic violence,
9 and when I moved into Park Rock, about a year into
10 it, or almost a year into it my ceiling in my
11 bathroom fell-- almost fell-- literally fell in my
12 arms. Had my four-year-old son been in the bathroom
13 in the bathtub, I don't know what would have
14 happened. But we're not here for that. Alright, my
15 point is-- I'm just telling you I've been around.
16 Like I said, I live in Gravesend Houses. As it is, we
17 have a lot of things being thrown at us that we don't
18 want in Coney Island, and we're busy fighting. So,
19 we're fighting one. There's somebody coming up
20 behind our back forcing us into something else. Now,
21 there's two developments in Grave-- in Coney Island
22 that are being considered for the PACTs. I don't
23 believe that these tenant association presidents
24 fully know the scope of what's going on, and I wish
25 that I could have been called before the NYCHA folks

1 left, because I don't have problem speaking out.
2
3 Recently, Brian Honan came to Gravesend Houses for
4 like a second time telling us the story of what they
5 plan to do, how beautiful it's going to be, but I
6 don't know if anybody else noticed that when NYCHA
7 speaks, they constantly change words and names of
8 programs.

9 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thirty seconds.

10 ANN VALDEZ: Remember this was-- I'm
11 sorry. Yes, this was originally rolled out during
12 COVID, at the beginning of COVID and it was called
13 the Blueprint. Now it's called Preservation Trust.
14 RAD started nationwide and now in New York it's
15 called PACT. Either way, they keep changing names,
16 terms, who qualifies, who's behind it, who's going to
17 do the work, what's going to be the same. They're
18 literally trying to tell folks most of the time that
19 as Section 9-- oh, when they turn into a Section 8
20 program, everything's going to be the same. That is
21 not true. That is a total lie. I appreciate the
22 City Council speaking up on it, and I know that we
23 don't have very much time, but I have no problem to
24 speak to each and every one of you individually,
25 together, or whatever, alright? And you're welcome

1
2 to come to Coney Island to see exactly what's going
3 on in Gravesend Houses and everywhere else, and I'll
4 walk with you no matter what development. Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. Thank you
6 for your testimony. Thank you for your voice.

7 CRYSTAL GLOVER: Good afternoon, Mr.
8 Banks. My name's Crystal Glover and I'm from a
9 development in Manhattan. I'm afraid to even say
10 which one, because that's the fact that I speak up is
11 scary. Maybe I'll tell you in private which one it
12 is. First of all, City Council, NYCHA, these people-
13 - everybody stays in their lane. I remember coming
14 and testifying a while ago, and I forget the brother
15 with the cowboy hat, he was falling asleep. He was
16 on the committee, this committee. They don't do
17 their homework to even know what's going on these
18 development, so they're just here. So if you're in a
19 lane and you don't even know what's happening, you
20 got a problem. These NYCHA people, for instance,
21 Curtis Williams, he was with resident engagement-- I
22 could tell you all the names of them because I used
23 to be a president of a tenant association. And under
24 my leadership infill [sic] was cancelled because we
25 found out about TPA money, how to spend it, etcetera,

1
2 etcetera, etcetera. Most of the questions asked, I
3 could probably answer, because to me, like the sister
4 said, these people, resident engagement, today they
5 got somebody new. Like, when I was in there you had
6 Curtis Williams and you had Dejesus and all these
7 kinds of people. Then 20 minutes later they change
8 and get some-- Curtis went from a Leroy Williams to a
9 Curtis Williams. Now you got this other chick. At
10 every minute they changing shifts so they can never
11 get to know who TAs are. Tenant associations are
12 operated by bylaws. Residents, district council, the
13 presidents and all them folks, they only deal with
14 leadership, the boards. They don't come out and
15 speak to all residents, come on, let's gab and sit in
16 the front, in the backyard or whatever to have a
17 conversation. So they don't' really get to hear what
18 we're talking about. This-- I could go on and on and
19 on. This thing here today, public housing, RAD/PACT
20 and what have you, hasn't hit in my development yet.
21 But I'm here today--

22 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Thirty
23 seconds to wrap up.

24 CRYSTAL GLOVER: I'm here today to say a
25 prayer. Our father who art in heaven, hallowed be

1 thy name. Thy kingdom come, they will be done on
2 earth as it is in heaven. Give us this day our daily
3 bread and forgive us our debt as we forgive our
4 debtors, and lead us not into temptation, but deliver
5 us from evil, for thine is the kingdom, the power and
6 the glory forever. Amen. I want to dedicate that
7 prayer to two women in my development, both jumped
8 off the roof to their deaths. One was funeralized
9 [sic] yesterday. And I also want to say one more
10 prayer, the 23rd Psalm. I'm sorry. How does it
11 start out? The Lord is my shepherd. I shall not
12 want. He maketh me to lie down in green pastures. He
13 leadeth me beside still water. He restores my soul.
14 He leads us in the path of righteousness for his
15 namesake, and ye though we walk through the valleys
16 of the shallows of death, we will fear no evil, for
17 thou art with us. Thy rod and they staff comfort us.
18 thou prepareth a table before us and the table in the
19 presence of our enemy. Thou anointeth our heads with
20 oil. Our cups runneth over. Surely goodness and
21 mercy shall follow me all the days of my life, and I
22 will dwell in the house of the Lord forever. Amen.

24 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you so much for
25 your testimony.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNIDENTIFIED: Excuse me--

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] We're going to keep--

UNIDENTIFIED: before she starts, can I just say one more thing?

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: We're going to keep the testimonies to two minutes, alright guys? I want to be respectful of everybody and give everybody a chance to be able to, you know, hear their voice. So please, two minutes. Two minutes. Thank you.

ZULAY VELAZQUEZ: Hi, good afternoon. My name is Zulay Velazquez and I'm from Jacob Riis Houses, born and raised in the Lower East Side. I just want to say as in general, like, the Lower East Side has suffered so many tragedies, right, 9/11, multiple resilience projects. So now, we're like in a second resilience project. Our infrastructure is damaged-- not damaged because of them, but I'm sure that the banging and the digging hasn't helped our infrastructure, right? But I want to say that the Lower East Side as whole may be affected this way which sets us a little bit apart. Jacob Riis is an animal in itself because we basically were built on top of an old manufactured gas plant, and the

1 residents we didn't even know that when we got our
2 leases, right? We just got into the properties and
3 we didn't even know that. Then came the asbestos
4 notification about maybe like about a year and a half
5 ago, two years, but prior to that Con-Ed already knew
6 that Jacob Riis needed to be cleaned up, but it
7 wasn't, because at the request of their resilience
8 project. so we've been further, like, put into
9 danger, our healths because of this resilience
10 project, not just because of the Sandy resilience
11 project, but because of the-- also the east coastal
12 resilience project. So, as they dig the toxins get
13 into our water system, our air, you know, and it's a
14 hazard. Not only is it a hazard, but people have
15 actually died, and I think my mother has actually
16 died because of it as well. Had multiple medical
17 problems, and we couldn't even figure out some of the
18 reasons why, but they treated her, but she's dead
19 now. I have marks on my body that may be cancerous
20 that I haven't even checked out, and it's a shame
21 because the people who are actually voting for this
22 project are the people going to be most affected by
23 it. Because you know what, those people are the
24 people who work-- working class people who had their
25

1 social security and their pension. They don't
2 qualify or Section 8. They're not going to qualify
3 for Section 8, and they're going to be the first ones
4 to get kicked out because they want change. They
5 want a new building, but guess what, they're not
6 going to be here when this conversion takes place.
7 And the only thing that sets us aside and makes us
8 unique-- and I'm so sorry, Mr. Banks-- is the fact
9 that Jacob Riis is going to be given the option to
10 vote, and our vote is going to be un November, and
11 not enough tenants know, so I've been trying to get
12 the tenants aware of this. But is that what sets us
13 different, what's aside, is that you're basically
14 killing us little by little, slowly. Like, it's sad.
15 You can look online and see all the way from 20, but
16 I'm sure there's more proof where-- there's proof
17 that they need to fix the site and they haven't.
18 Con-Ed also-- asbestos came on the news. They
19 retracted their statement, but we have a list of over
20 40 tenants that suddenly-- not only tested for
21 arsenic, okay, but that actually have like rapid
22 cases of cancer. We have a two-year-old that just
23 died in back of my building because she was so frail,
24 and her parents haven't even connected the dots.
25

1
2 This is serious for us, but the fact that people
3 don't even know that this is taking place, the
4 project in itself--

5 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
6 voice, ma'am. Thank you for your testimony.

7 LOUISE VELEZ: Hi, my name is Louise
8 Velez, and I also live in Jacob Riis. I've been there
9 for 41 years, and where I live now, I've been there
10 for 11 years. It's sad that when I moved from 1115
11 into 1017, they never said to me-- housing never
12 tells you that the apartment has an issue. I have a
13 room that is disgusting. It rains, I mean, through
14 the ceiling, through the walls because the bricks are
15 not to part [sic] anymore, since those buildings were
16 made in the 40s. my concern is that my
17 granddaughter, she's 11 years old, they had to take
18 her recently to the emergency for oxygen, low blood
19 pressure and heart low beat because of the fact that
20 there's a stink and smell in that room, horrifying.
21 They've known this since the day I moved in when it
22 started raining, and they haven't done nothing. I
23 put numerous tickets. They haven't done it. I myself
24 have health problems about-- since I've been into
25 that apartment also. But my concern is that all this

1 that is going on with PACT and RAD and Section 8,
2 knowing that certain income s are high, and that
3 we're not going to be able to afford to live in the
4 Section 8 apartments because of our income. So that
5 concerns me. The second thing is that I'm very
6 affected by the TAs because for nine months they were
7 with a consultant without telling us anything. We
8 didn't know anything that was going on for the last
9 nine months. I think the last two or three months is
10 when they-- we finally found out what's going on in
11 New York City Housing Authority projects. They never
12 said to us that-- all of a sudden they said they were
13 training, but there's developers. The consultant
14 promises that there's going to be permanency in
15 Section 8, don't worry about it, everything's going
16 to be fine. All lies. So, at this point, they're
17 saying that our vote, we need X amount to vote. What
18 is that 20 percent or 15 percent, I think it is, for
19 votes? That's unfair. We have the right to vote.
20 We're the tenants. We live there. I pay my rent.
21 They don't pay my rent. I pay high rent. I pay over
22 \$1,000 rent. It's unfair that they should have the
23 right to vote and the right to decide for us. That is
24 unfair. We have the right. We are the tenants.
25

1
2 They should consult us. They should tell us. They
3 should bring us-- every time we go to a meeting, a
4 consultant or developer was there to pressure us into
5 taking this plan that they have. I believe that we
6 should have Section 9, keep it the way it is, and
7 have it fixed. Housing had billions of billions of
8 dollars for years. When John Weir [sic] was there
9 and Margarita Lopez [sp?], where's all that money
10 went to? Billions of dollars. They never said
11 anything about it. That was for us, for them to fix
12 our apartments. They didn't even touch our
13 apartments. Nothing has been done to our apartments
14 in all these years. Where's all this money? And now
15 they want to put Section 8 because they need the
16 money? That's unfair for the tenants. That's unfair
17 for the people that there, the seniors. Another
18 thing is, that if I wanted to go into a senior
19 housing, my daughter has to leave the apartment in
20 order for me to move into a senior apartment when
21 she's a single mother with two kids. You kidding?
22 That's not fair. The rules and regulations of
23 housing-- the three panelist people that were here,
24 they're all liars. All lies. All likes. That the
25 tenants are all engaging in all this process, lies.

1
2 Lies. Thank you so much for your time and for having
3 me here.

4 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
5 testimony. Council Member Mealy wants to ask a
6 question.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I just want to
8 know, you said your inf-- and my condolences in your
9 family. You said the infrastructure of your Jacob--
10 how do you think-- did NYCHA come around and test
11 after the earthquake?

12 ZULAY VELAZQUEZ: Honestly, I don't know,
13 because-- I don't know if the TA would even address
14 that in the next TA meeting, but the TA hasn't put
15 out a notice and said, you know, has anybody or
16 anything happened to your apartment that I've seen,
17 nor has NYCHA. And the only reason why I know, not
18 just because it's common sense, but because one of
19 the Council persons, right, actually told us the
20 infrastructure because of like what's happened with
21 the construcion, like it's weakened our
22 infrastructure, and he knows this.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: And that's why I
24 was just asking if it's already so-- and with this
25 earthquake we just had, I think it needs to be

1
2 addressed to make sure that you're safe. That's what
3 I'm saying.

4 ZULAY VELAZQUEZ: I think that, you know,
5 it's going to all boil down to the fact that we
6 don't-- instead of having like basically Section 9
7 residents, NYCHA could have told Section 9 residents,
8 hey listen, we need to press our local, state, and
9 federal agencies for more money to fund public
10 housing and please help us do this. Instead of
11 asking us for help to help them get the money that
12 they needed to repair our apartments, they didn't
13 reach out to us and ask us to do that, and some
14 people are not politically conscious, and don't-- and
15 some of these people because of all these programs
16 have been defunded for so many years, don't even know
17 that they have the power to make these changes on
18 their own and don't have a voice, but then PACT and
19 RAD comes with the-- we have social service programs,
20 but we would have had-- we already had social service
21 programs, but they would defund it. and this was--
22 almost seems like it was a process, a strategic one,
23 to put us in apposition where we're so desperate and
24 our teenagers are getting into trouble-- when we can

1
2 just guide them and offer them-- kept the services
3 that we had. It's just too much.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I just want to ask
5 one more-- you said you were-- if you wanted to move
6 into senior housing, your family members are not
7 grandfathered in?

8 LOUISE VELEZ: No. No.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: We should address
10 that. Thank you.

11 LOUISE VELEZ: You're welcome.

12 CRYSTAL GLOVER: Can I say-- the first
13 panel that testified before NYCHA testified, they
14 spoke for about a hour. So can I give one more
15 second and can she give one more second as well?

16 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: I'll give--

17 CRYSTAL GLOVER: they poke for almost an
18 hour.

19 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Let me say this, if I
20 give you 30 seconds, you going to keep to the 30
21 seconds?

22 CRYSTAL GLOVER: Absolutely.

23 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Excellent, 30
24 seconds, 30 seconds.

1
2 CRYSTAL GLOVER: NYCHA, these tenant
3 associations are supposed to be the voice. When I
4 was president, they would drop-- I would go to
5 management, they'd drop everything they was doing.
6 Yes, Ms. Glover. That's where the power's at. What
7 we need to be doing-- I don't know how many
8 development in total in New York City Housing
9 Authority, 500 and something-- we need to get a major
10 lawsuit. That's what we going to have to get. We
11 going to have to kick they butts and get a major-- we
12 got to come together. Every NYCHA development has to
13 come together and get a major lawsuit going on. They
14 tried to rock Shayola Latoya [sic], dog her out, but
15 she was just whatever. We as tenants, we're going to
16 have to get this lawsuit and what it will do, it'll
17 give us everything we need. That's what we going to
18 have to do. Thank you. Thanks.

19 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. Thank
20 you. 30 seconds.

21 ANN VALDEZ: The reason why I wanted to
22 speak again, I forgot to mention that I'm also a
23 member of Community Voices Heard for over 20 years.
24 So all through these processes, I have been a part of
25 it. We fought to make sure to try to keep section 8

1 out of public housing, because we knew that when we
2 put them together, they were going to water down
3 Section 9 even more than they already have. Not
4 everyone knows that originally New York City Housing
5 Authority was under three entities, separately paid.
6 Only a few are fully federal. Now they're all federal
7 because of my organization, as well as a couple
8 others. Alright, so point is that, and I'm also a
9 resident off of Super Storm Sandy as well. So the
10 two developments that they're trying to convert now
11 should have been sandy recovery, so why would they
12 need to be part of RAD/PACT.

14 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you, ma'am.
15 Thank you for your advocacy. Thank you everybody on
16 the panel. Now we're going to go to the next panel
17 to be respectful of time.

18 ZULAY VELAZQUEZ: [off mic] [inaudible]

19 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Just 30 seconds.
20 Just wait for them to get up and then we'll just--

21 ZULAY VELAZQUEZ: Okay. So, I just want
22 to say that RAD-- when they were up here talking, the
23 panel before us. They said they needed to get back
24 to us about what they would do if there was no tenant
25 association either functioning or none available.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Right.

ZULAY VELAZQUEZ: However, they have--
RAD/PACT has something called principles.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Principles, correct.

ZULAY VELAZQUEZ: and in those
principles, it says that if there is no tenant
association, that they would -- that it would be the
management's office discretion to make the decisions.
This is what their principles say. So that's just
for the record what I've seen, you know, and it
signs, and it was a series of organizations that was
a part of this principle planning. And there was one
more thing.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Alright. Thank you
for your advocacy again. Alright. We're going to
call up the next panel, Ramona Ferreyra, August
Leinbach, Cecilia MacArthur. We have Mr. Newman and
Alex McDougal. Shirley Belton? Ms. Belton? Thank
you. Thank you we're going to begin to my right, Ms.
Belton?

SHIRLEY BELTON: Okay, I wasn't ready to
be the first one, but here you go. Being old-school.
Yes, I am from the forgotten borough of-- well, it's
call Staten Island, but I call it Satan Island, okay.

1
2 And unfortunately, people on Staten Island are most
3 definitely forgotten, okay, and don't know a lot, but
4 I'll just give you what I have. The grounds are kept
5 immaculate in Mariner's Harbor Housing Development,
6 but they let the apartments dilapidate 'til the point
7 where it's horrendous. There are mice in there,
8 right, that you end up renting from being kicked to
9 the curb, even to the point where I've-- I've even
10 gotten bitten. And they purposely-- and I can prove
11 it. they purposely let that happen, because one
12 person will have a problem with mice, and I have told
13 them many times to do the basements and they didn't
14 do it, and then they did it and then all of a sudden
15 it would come to a point where there'd be at least--
16 and I'm not exaggerating, I'm literally saying that I
17 could catch at least three mice a day, okay? So,
18 they finally did that, and they allow people to do
19 things in the development that they shouldn't be able
20 to do. Like above me, they allow people to run water
21 to the point where my cabinets came off of my
22 bathroom wall and even my cabinets came off of my
23 kitchen wall, and they knew about it, and they didn't
24 remove the cabinets for about a week. And it's been
25 five years since this happened, and I still don't'

1
2 have kitchen cabinets. Okay. They-- the what you
3 call it? The new management came in and I was in
4 there one day putting in a complaint against the
5 worker and the maintenance-- like, he would come in
6 and knock on the door lightly and then put something
7 on there saying that he was there, and he didn't. So
8 I caught him going out one day, and I called him
9 back. I said, listen, when you knock, you need to
10 knock hard enough for me to hear, and also say who
11 you are, and he says, no, I don't have to do it like
12 that. And so he came in there. I showed him
13 different things, what's happened. And he says,
14 well, you know what, you should really move. Said--
15 no. I'm like, oh, really? So I went to management
16 to explain to them about him, and I was speaking to
17 the receptionist-- beautiful child. I pray for her
18 every day working there, okay? So I was paying
19 attention to her and the assistant management came in
20 and was talking to me, and I didn't pay attention to
21 her because I was still talking to the assistant,
22 right? Then this guy, I don't know who he was, came
23 out and started talking to me. I'm like, listen, I'm
24 still talking, putting in my complaint. Will you
25 please wait, just like we tell our children, you

1
2 know, when two people are talking you wait and you
3 say excuse me. And he says, well, I'm the new
4 manager, and if you can't hear what I have to say,
5 then you can't put your complaint in, and he says,
6 no, we're not going to hear you. That's it, right?
7 A few couple-- a few weeks later I get a call from
8 him. I go in. He says I'm not paying my rent. And
9 no-- he says your rent is habitually late. I said no
10 it's not habitually late, it's not being paid at all,
11 because I'm on a rent strike.

12 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Excuse me. Excuse
13 me, mother. We got to go onto the next testimony. I
14 want to thank you.

15 SHIRLEY BELTON: Oh, okay.

16 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Appreciate you.
17 Thank you for your testimony.

18 SHIRLEY BELTON: Yes.

19 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Next.

20 LUCY NEWMAN: Good afternoon. My name is
21 Lucy Newman, as an attorney at the legal Aid society.
22 To my left is my colleague Alex McDougal. She'll
23 introduce herself in an minute. I just wanted to
24 thank the Committee Chair and the members of this
25 committee for having this important hearing and your

1 continued commitment to public housing. I just want
2 to give you a little brief kind of overview of Legal
3 Aids work over the many years to help NYCHA's
4 residents. We really have for decades been at the
5 forefront of representing NYCHA's residents. Many of
6 the rights and protections that NYCHA residents have
7 result from lawsuits that Legal Aid brought against
8 the authority, and in that vein, when the Bloomberg
9 Administration filed for approval for a RAD
10 application at Ocean Bay Bayside, we demanded a seat
11 at the table to ensure that we could be there to
12 protect residents through that process. We
13 subsequently were part of the RAD roundtable that
14 developed the guiding principles that governed
15 NYCHA's RAD and now PACT program. And Legal Aid
16 Society together with Community Service Society
17 drafted and published a RAD handbook that is given
18 out to many residents facing PACT conversions, and
19 it's online and widely distributed. In addition to
20 that, we have most recently set up a helpline that
21 was mentioned earlier. The number is 212-298-3450
22 for any resident who is undergoing or has undergone a
23 PACT conversion on that helpline. We can give people
24 advice. We answer their questions they may have
25

1
2 around PACT and we also advocate for them with either
3 their administrator in regard to the agency or the
4 new property management. I'm here because I want to
5 talk about three of the most common issues that we
6 see in pre-conversion of PACT properties. I would say
7 the first one that we see and hear of a lot is the
8 lack of repairs that are made in the run-up to a
9 conversion. Routinely, we hear not just from our
10 clients but from their own mouths, from property
11 management, you'll have to wait until the conversion
12 for repairs to be made. Until the point of
13 conversion--

14 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] 30
15 seconds.

16 LUCY NEWMAN: Until the point of
17 conversion, NYCHA remains the landlord, and as such
18 is obligated under law to make those repairs, and
19 tenants are entitled to have those repairs made, so I
20 really want the Council to continue oversight over
21 the issue of repairs, and I urge the agency itself to
22 ensure that they have adequate funding to cover the
23 cost of repairs up until the point of conversion.
24 The other thing we see and we're concerned about is
25 the number of vacancies that are held pending the

1
2 temporary relocation that they expect to have after
3 conversion. Holding those vacant for a long time
4 means that people are not coming off of NYCHA's
5 waiting list, and we know that every person who sits
6 on that wait list is in need of housing, and we also
7 know that that means that people who are seeking
8 transfer within NYCHA or within those developments
9 are not able to get into those units. Thirdly, goes
10 to the other thing around morale in the build-up to
11 conversions. I think it's fair to say that the
12 property management staff become very checked-out
13 because they know that they're going to be moved to
14 another development after conversion. This means that
15 we see routine things that they're required to do
16 like interim recertification's, helping people add
17 household members. It's just not getting done. So I
18 urge the agency to create basically a specialized
19 group of kind of roving managers who can come in
20 prior to conversion and start working with the
21 property management to start taking care of like
22 housekeeping matters so that people do not suffer
23 after conversion because of things that should have
24 been done weren't done. Thank you. I'll pass it

1
2 over to Alex who's going to talk about post-
3 conversion.

4 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
5 testimony.

6 ALEX MCDUGAL: Hi, just before I start,
7 I just want to address something that Mr. Gouveia
8 said. He said that, you know, through PACT there's
9 no displacement, and his basis for making that
10 statement was that under the RAD statute there's a
11 right to return, but you know, history has just not
12 borne that out. We know that demolition does lead to
13 displacement. So I would just strongly caution
14 against taking that statement at face value. And for
15 the sake of brevity I just would like to share some
16 additional issues that folks are dealing with, that
17 tenants are dealing with post-conversion. You know,
18 we've mentioned repairs pre-conversion. Post-
19 conversion repairs are a huge issue. You know, NYCHA
20 has-- at least NYCHA has, albeit flawed system, but a
21 system for making requests for repairs. A lot of
22 tenants tell us that, you know, post-conversion
23 there's just not really a clear way or an effective
24 way to make requests for repairs and to track those
25 requests which is a huge problem, especially prior to

1
2 any work being done at the development. Some people
3 feel like they're in a greater state of limbo than
4 they were before, and sometimes the team doesn't
5 really know what to tell people about how to get
6 repairs done, especially after hours like in the
7 evenings and on the weekends when there are serious
8 issues like boilers going out. And then quickly, I
9 will just say prioritizing things here-- that on the
10 issue of transfers. At the time of the conversion
11 from Section 9 to Section 8, transfers-- the transfer
12 extinguishes, so people have to-- if they need a
13 transfer have to make a new transfer request. You
14 know, NYCHA tells us that these transfers, you know,
15 if there's no transfer back between Section 8 and
16 Section 9, but also that people cannot transfer
17 within the Section 8 portfolio, and there's simply no
18 reason for that. There's no reason why the only--
19 you know, the alternative to transferring within the
20 development is getting a portable voucher. So we
21 really think that is a priority issue based on what
22 we're hearing from tenants.

23 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Excuse me one minute.
24 We want to remind the public-- the public shall
25 remain silent.

1
2 ALEX MCDUGAL: Oh, no, I think that's
3 fine, because we're tight for time, so I get it.

4 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. Next.

5 AUGUST LEINBACH: Good afternoon. My
6 name is August Leinbach. I'm a Staff Attorney along
7 with my colleague Cecilia MacArthur in the Manhattan
8 Housing Unit Legal Services NYC. Our organization
9 represents thousands of low income tenants across the
10 City. Today, we'd like to focus our testimony on two
11 specific issues with the RAD/PACT program we've
12 identified from recent casework and organizing.
13 First, the program's failure to live up to its
14 promise of affording better living conditions for
15 tenants, and second, the failure to protect tenants'
16 due process guarantees throughout the conversion.
17 While the central promise of the RAD/PACT program is
18 has leveraged Section 8 funding and private capital
19 to fund repairs and rehabilitations. This promise
20 often comes slowly, if at all, and tenants are forced
21 to live in toxic conditions long after buildings have
22 converted. Our work with Mr. and Ms. D, and elderly
23 man, his adult daughter, and her two young children
24 illustrates this problem. Their building was
25 converted in 2020 and since then it's been managed by

1
2 PACT Renaissance Collaborative. When we first met
3 the family during the process of moving back to their
4 long-time home after one year temporary relocation.
5 Despite this long absence, upon their return, they
6 found that most the hazardous conditions in the
7 apartment had been remediated. Over the following
8 year, Ms. D's son landed in the emergency room with
9 asthma attacks on at least four occasions. His
10 asthma is exacerbated by the exact conditions for
11 which the family was relocated, including
12 infestations of mice and cockroaches, broken
13 radiators that do not provide adequate or consistent
14 heat, and a build-up of dust from construction work
15 throughout the building. The D's story highlights
16 how NYCHA's oversight or lack thereof has failed to
17 provide the quality of housing that was promised the
18 RAD/PACT conversion. Yet, the D's story does not end
19 with them staying in an apartment in disrepair. In
20 both 2022 and 23, the apartment failed NYCHA's
21 housing quality standard inspections, and earlier
22 this year, the agency shut off their Section 8
23 subsidy and required the family to look for alternate
24 housing in a private market with a portable Section 8
25 voucher. Now the D's are under a deadline to

1
2 alternate housing at a private rental market or lose
3 their subsidy altogether. This is the mirror opposite
4 what RAD/PACT was supposed to offer. A direct result
5 of this conversion, the D's were first displaced for
6 a year on the promise they would come back to a safe
7 and healthy living environment. And not only did
8 that not happen, but ultimately PACT Renaissance and
9 NYCHA's failures led this family to require to
10 abandon their home entirely. Two things went utterly
11 wrong here. First--

12 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] 30
13 seconds.

14 AUGUST LEINBACH: [inaudible] failed its
15 obligation to repair the D's apartment to livable
16 condition. Second, NYCHA failed to oversee PACT
17 Renaissance along the way, and instead of intervening
18 the agency let conditions to deteriorate to the point
19 requiring the family to move out.

20 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: thank you for your
21 testimony.

22 CECILIA MACARTHUR: Good morning. My
23 name is Cecilia MacArthur. I along with my colleague
24 here work at Legal Services New York City. I will
25 speak to the other central promise of PACT which is

1 that tenants will maintain the same rights they had
2 as public housing tenants. Our RAD/PACT casework had
3 demonstrated in practice rights are often not
4 maintained after conversion and tenants have few
5 loads of recourse when violations occur. Her
6 experience of my client Sonja Torres [sp?] is
7 illustrative. I represent Ms. Torres in Housing
8 Court. She's the mother of two adult children and
9 six minor adopted children. She's a single mother.
10 She lives in what was formerly NYCHA's Wise Towers
11 and she's lived there since 1972. In April 2020, her
12 mother who is the head of household died, and so Ms.
13 Torres began requesting that she succeed. She
14 directed those requests to NYCHA, but NYCHA contrary
15 to its own rules, failed to commence the succession
16 grievance process, the RFM process. Later that year,
17 Wise Towers converted to RAD/PACT with PACT
18 Renaissance Collaborative as the new landlord, and so
19 Ms. Torres began directing her succession request to
20 PACT Renaissance, and they told her they would handle
21 it. PACT Renaissance, in fact, is not in charge.
22 NYCHA's Section 8 evaluates these succession
23 requests. So, Ms. Torres' requests were never
24 provided a Section 8. Then without notice or
25

1
2 opportunity to be heard, Ms. Torres was removed from
3 the household composition and stripped of the
4 opportunity to succeed altogether. Now, Ms. Torres
5 is facing eviction in Housing Court from her home of
6 50 years. For Ms. Torres, PACT conversion has meant
7 losing access to procedures that were available to
8 her as a boucle housing tenant, and she's not alone.
9 In recent years, our office testified to City Council
10 about the many issues, the specific issues Ms. Torres
11 is facing in a widespread-- in a variety of
12 situations, including NYCHA repeatedly losing
13 applications in the lead of the conversion. Both
14 NYCHA and private landlords providing incorrect or
15 confusing information about succession grievance
16 processes, and no communication whatsoever between
17 NYCHA and NYCHA-leased housing, both pre and post-
18 conversion. Ms. Torres and tenants like her have a
19 right to succeed, but PACT conversion has made a
20 process that was once straightforward, so fraught and
21 confusing it becomes impossible to navigate,
22 effectively denying these tenants their rights.

23 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: 30 seconds to wrap.

24 CECILIA MACARTHUR: Further, Ms. Torres'
25 experience points to a critical gap in the RAD

1
2 accountability structure. After conversion, private
3 landlords commence eviction cases, so here NYCHA is
4 not a party to the case at all. But NYCHA's
5 participation is necessary as they along with PACT
6 Renaissance denied Ms. Torre's rights, and as NYCHA
7 Section 8 processes the succession requests only they
8 can remedy the situation. This structure completely
9 insulates NYCHA from accountability and leaves Ms.
10 Torres without clear process to vindicate their
11 rights. So while we're now trying to bring NYCHA
12 into the housing court case, this is a very difficult
13 procedural mechanism that no tenant could accomplish
14 alone, and in fact we haven't had success with it
15 yet. And so in our practice we've seen these two
16 central promises of repairs and maintenance of rights
17 broken with next to no recourse for long-term
18 tenants. We ask that you look into these violations
19 and we thank you for the opportunity to testify.

20 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
21 testimony. Ma'am?

22 RAMONA FERREYRA: Hi. So my name is
23 actually Guatu Ke Ini Inaru, and my colonial name is
24 Ramona. I am the founder of Save Section 9. We're a
25 national coalition that works to educate and empower

1 tenants so that they can fight against the
2 privatization of public housing. I think this
3 morning we've heard a lot about what's wrong with the
4 program, and that's been well-documented by legal
5 services here in New York and by Human Rights Watch
6 which issued a scathing report about the impact that
7 PACT has on public housing tenants in New York City.
8 So I actually want to focus a little bit on some of
9 the solutions that our members have created, and that
10 we hope the City Council will join us in. First, we
11 ask that you place an immediate moratorium on all
12 project-based conversions or privatizations, and that
13 this is put in place until a comprehensive third
14 party impact study is conducted. We encourage you to
15 look at the mechanism used by Human Rights Watch to
16 ensure that it actually takes into consideration the
17 true impact on the tenants. As HUD and NYCHA defines
18 success for project-based Section 8 by how much money
19 is actually brought into a property to address
20 outstanding repairs. So it does not take into
21 consideration the impact that it has on tenants which
22 you've been hearing this morning. So, according to
23 them, the success of the program is also always going
24 to be based on the money coming in, not on the tenant

1
2 experience. Then we want to ask that you call on
3 Congress to uphold the RAD sunset which is scheduled
4 to happen in September 30th this year. That is
5 something that is going to allow us to nationally
6 stop investing money that should be going to Section
7 9 public housing in project-based Section 8, and
8 there are multiple organizations calling on Biden to
9 actually change the funding that he's allocating for
10 project-based Section 8. And I have some other
11 points--

12 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Thirty
13 seconds to wrap up.

14 RAMONA FERREYRA: so, one of the thing is
15 want to highlight is the mental health impact on
16 tenants. So when this process begins, tenants feel
17 cheated, they feel anxious. They experience
18 depression and feel like their homes are in danger.
19 That is another layer of trauma that's added to
20 already living in conditions that are inhumane, but
21 what you'll note today is that the tenants here are
22 telling you that in spite of the tenant repairs that
23 we need, what we want to keep is public housing.
24 Then I also want to encourage you to read the
25 analysis conducted by Community Service Society which

1
2 undermines NYCHA's accounting. According to NYCHA,
3 they need \$79 billion dollars to bring our housing
4 stock up to date. In our individual report, and that
5 I report that I note actually find that the number is
6 closer to \$39 billion. So they're lying to you about
7 the financial need. And I'm sending this all to you
8 guys in writing, too, so you'll have the notes and
9 the resources. And then I want to talk about the TA
10 for two seconds. There is no clarity on the website
11 as to when the tenant association is actually
12 approached. What conversation's they're having are
13 not open to the tenants. The tenants are not told
14 what the timeline is for the project, and they also
15 don't understand what the special application is
16 submitted to HUD, and those are all points that when
17 we try to organize tenants or look for legal support.
18 We need to actually understand in order to fight
19 better as tenants. And then evictions, they are two
20 percent under NYCHA, but 12 percent according to the
21 latest article written by the City. And finally,
22 that rent burden that keeps coming up and you guys
23 are asking questions about, it's something that's
24 actually created by fee that the new developer
25 manager company put into place. Some of these fees

1
2 that they can put in, we saw in other cities, they
3 include the repairs of pipes, and one of the RAD
4 lease lines that's really important is that they will
5 now determine what excessive use is. So the family
6 has a grimy door because they have a three-year-old
7 that likes to color on the wall, they can consider
8 that excessive use. They'll also include things like
9 maintenance of the grounds, so grounds keeping. They
10 will start charging tenants for repairs that really
11 capital. So that's what you need to be looking at
12 when looking at the rent increases.

13 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: thank you, ma'am, and
14 thank you everybody for your testimony. I want to
15 also remind everyone that you have up to 72 hours to
16 submit written testimony to the Council's website.
17 Alright? Yes, Ms. Mealy, and then we're going--

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] I
19 just want to know, would y'all meeting that we could
20 start seeing about the succession rights for our
21 tenants. I would love to meet with you. Something
22 has to be done. That's almost life or death for
23 people to lose their housing, and if we don't stop it
24 now, it's only going to get worse, so it's up to us
25 to put something in place to help out constituents,

1
2 and I hope my colleagues be with me, and ma'am, I
3 hope you got an escrow account that you put your
4 money in--

5 SHIRLEY BELTON: [interposing] wasn't
6 ready for it.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: But do it to make
8 sure that when they do repair your building, you have
9 the money to pay them that they cannot displace you.
10 We do not need another person--

11 SHIRLEY BELTON: [interposing] I hear you,
12 but they're not getting it back.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay.

14 RAMONA FERREYRA: I wanted to mention,
15 there's actually a clause that NYCHA's not adhering
16 to that would make the succession rights easier to
17 keep. According to HUD and the Section 1.8 of the
18 notice for RAD, a tenant that currently lives in
19 Section 9 and is opposing privatization should be
20 afforded a transfer, so another section 9 unit, based
21 on availability. And like we just heard, they're
22 constantly holding the apartments. So there's no
23 reason why NYCHA is not able to provide the neighbor
24 that spoke earlier with a transfer to another Section
25

1
2 9 site, and I can put that in writing for you guys,
3 too.

4 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Please do submit--

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing]

6 Definitely to me.

7 CECILIA MACARTHUR: And if I may just add
8 in terms of the succession, I absolutely agree, and
9 we have submitted written testimony, and my contact
10 information, Cecilia MacArthur is in the testimony,
11 is would welcome you to reach out. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: thank you for your
13 testimony. Just to remind the public that this is a
14 formal government proceeding, and the public should
15 and shall remain silent. Okay, now we're going to
16 move forward with the next panel. We have Metin
17 Sarci. We have Ms. Torres, Aixa Torres. We have
18 Kesha Crawford, Caesar Goodwill-- sorry about that--
19 Godwell-- Godwall. That's you, sir? Alright.
20 Caesar Godwall. And we have Manuel Martinez. Is
21 that Manuel, Manuel Martinez. And we have Renee
22 Keitt-- Renee? Thank you. Alright, so we're going
23 to begin to my right.

24 UNIDENTIFIED: oh, okay, let me get--
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Well,
3 we'll begin to my left. You can begin, sir. Thank
4 you.

5 METIN SARCI: Hello. Thank you, Chair
6 Banks, for allowing me to speak today. My name is
7 Metin Sarci. I am a public housing specialist with 12
8 years of service in public housing. I specifically
9 specialize in NYCHA policy, residents' engagement,
10 and program implementation. The testimony before you
11 is not representative of the New York City Housing
12 Authority where I am presently employed, and all
13 opinions shared on based on the wisdom influenced by
14 my service to NYCHA residents. I wanted to, number
15 one, reach out in support of Intro 110 and provide
16 three friendly amendments for consideration. The
17 first part, to strengthen this piece of legislation,
18 I would actually recommend that this body seek an
19 independent program evaluator. The mayor
20 administration and their controlled state
21 corporation, not city agency, has a soft selection
22 bias to present favorable reporting that could
23 invalidate the purpose of this important legislation.
24 Number two, section 8 PACT should be measured in
25 comparison to existing Section 8 programming under

1
2 NYCHA to ensure that we are making apples to apples
3 comparison. In doing this, an impact study has
4 implications to not only improve Section 8 PACT
5 practices, but all NYCHA-run Section 8 programs.
6 Number three, I would actually recommend removing
7 guidelines on the impact you are seeking to measure
8 from Section 8 in relation to Section 9 by allowing
9 the independent city partner to conduct the above.
10 Variables can be identified and measured annually to
11 provide this body with factual recommendations to
12 improve practices. In consideration of the above
13 recommendations, I am not only in support of Intro
14 110, but would encourage expanding this piece of
15 legislation to expand protections across all Section
16 8 programs in NYCHA to benefit the largest amount of
17 constituents. If I could add 30 more seconds?

18 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Yes, 30 more seconds.

19 METIN SARCI: The one thing that I will
20 add, you asked the question earlier regarding the
21 difference between nonprofits that are serving under
22 Section 8 PACT and the way NYCHA does it, and the
23 difference is NYCHA's a much more sophisticated
24 program. NYCHA REES, or most people know them as the
25 REES program, Residents Economics Empowerment and

1
2 Sustainability, employs a service coordination model
3 under the opportunity zone model, originally created
4 by the Rockefeller foundation in which you have
5 Community Boards that make up each zone. There are
6 15 zones throughout the City in which zone
7 coordinators are specifically partnering with
8 nonprofit organizations within the community to
9 better connect residents to services either through
10 events or they're doing so through referrals. I
11 understand most folks want to talk about Section 3,
12 but having been a zone coordinator myself, I
13 specifically like it when I am engaging NYCHA
14 residents to share opportunities based on where their
15 journey is. That could-- surely that could be in
16 construction, but there's much more than that.
17 There's finance. There's tech. There's Americore
18 programs for our youth, HSC completions. There's so
19 much more of a sophistication that we can do, and
20 that is not something you're going to get from
21 getting one nonprofit provider who may not employ an
22 opportunity service model in the same way that NYCHA
23 does. But I just wanted to share that, and thank you
24 so very much for having me.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
3 testimony. Ma'am?

4 AIXA TORRES: Good afternoon. I've been
5 here all morning. So, my name is Aixa Torres. First
6 of all, I'm here today representing residents to
7 preserve public housing of which I am a board member,
8 but I am also president of Alfred E. Smith Houses
9 Resident Association. I sit on CCOP [sic] and I'm
10 Manhattan South District Chair, but at the end of the
11 day, the most important thing is that I am a resident
12 before I hold any other title. I also sit on the
13 board of Goles [sic], but today I am here to talk
14 about how residents preserve public housing.
15 Systematically, we have opposed RAD and PACT, because
16 our feeling and our experience has been there is no
17 real resident engagement. To the point that
18 residents when they found out, they go. And what
19 they're shown, you know, what I've told the residents
20 in Smith is we don't want new stoves, we don't new
21 refrigerators. What we want is for them to knock the
22 walls, change our pipes so that our buildings are
23 sound, and those are the things that need to be done.
24 And so I was sitting here going let me count the ways
25 of everything that they said that it's not true,

1
2 right, that it's not functioning. REES does not work
3 for my development and for a lot of the developments
4 and now, you know, we don't have those connections
5 when it comes to Section 3, but my co-chair is here
6 who is the Chairman of the Section 3 and is a much
7 better person, so I'm going to let him address that.
8 But the reality of it is that the residents who go
9 into these programs, a lot of times they know. And I
10 just found out, and I'm a Chair, that if you're a
11 senior building-- because this is important. If
12 you're a senior building,--

13 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Thirty
14 seconds.

15 AIXA TORRES: you go into PACT-- if you
16 go into PACT or RAD, they stop being senior
17 buildings, and that is a real issue. Because one of
18 the reasons that people go into these senior
19 buildings is for safety, and they're going to do
20 that, because you know what happens, right? Senior
21 buildings have a high turnover people die, you know,
22 when we get to a certain age. I'm 71 and I tell
23 NYCHA all the time, I got one foot in the cemetery.
24 Don't play with me, right? But the reality of it is
25 the turnover. So that will allow them to bring in

1
2 people outside. Now you're talking about
3 gentrification. And as somebody else said, if you
4 are a retired person like I am, we don't qualify for
5 Section 8. And the bottom line is the Trust with the
6 964, there's one line. It does not include all the
7 protections that the 964 under Section 9 applies to
8 the residents who live in public housing. And I
9 thank you for holding this hearing that's important.

10 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you, ma'am.

11 AIXA TORRES: I told you I would come.

12 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Appreciate it. Thank
13 you for coming. Thank you for your voice and your
14 advocacy. Next, Ms. Crawford? Hold on one minute.
15 Hold on one minute, before you go. You got to-- that
16 right?

17 KESHA CRAWFORD: Thank you. Thank you,
18 sir. Good afternoon everyone. My name is Doctor
19 Kesha Crawford. I am the duly elected president for
20 Stuyvesant Gardens One development. As the duly
21 elected president, I told NYCHA that we don't-- the
22 residents do not want RAD. We don't want PACT. We
23 don't, you know. PACT staff since October of 2023.
24 PACT been coming in our development and just bullying
25 us. They knocked on my neighbor's door, my senior's

1 door, you know, telling them if they open up their
2 door, they're going to break their door knobs and
3 take them to court. My senior-- I have videos. My
4 seniors are petrified, scary, depressed, and asking
5 what can we do. So I said we gonna [sic] sue. I
6 brought it to one of the staff, one of the PACT
7 managers who's CEO, who's ever-- whoever's in charge
8 of PACT and told them about the behavior of one of
9 their staff member, and he spoke-- he said he's going
10 to speak with her about it. I don't know what
11 happened, but this keep happening. I have a lot of
12 seniors in my community, and since they've been
13 around my office been violated. I had my office, my
14 tenant association office for a year and a half.
15 Nothing ever happened. Someone violated and only
16 papers was stolen, no electronics. Honestly, I feel
17 that the property managers need to be investigated as
18 well. And getting back to my neighbors, they're very
19 afraid. Just had a meeting, a tenant association
20 meeting on the 9th of April, and PACT invited
21 themselves. They was not invited. I asked them
22 politely three times to leave. They did not leave.

24 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thirty seconds to
25 wrap up.

1
2 KESHA CRAWFORD: Okay. Yes, three-- I
3 asked them to leave three times. They did not leave.
4 Very disrespectful. Something need to be done, and
5 we need your support.

6 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
7 testimony. You can begin, sir.

8 CAESAR GODWALL: Caesar Godwall. I've
9 lived at Elliot Chelsea Houses for almost a couple of
10 decades now. I moved from Brooklyn. I was living in
11 [inaudible] in Brooklyn before, working my whole
12 life. Got sick. Fortunately, I moved in here, and
13 these buildings, these NYCHA buildings are the best
14 buildings in the City. They're bomb-proof, fire-
15 proof. We got real kitchens, real bathrooms. Nobody
16 else has them. Even a \$2 million one bedroom, your
17 kitchen is in your living room. We have separate
18 kitchens. We got separate-- we-- in Brooklyn before
19 I moved to NYCHA, I had a one by one foot closed.
20 That was the average in these old buildings. Really,
21 you know? I have a bathroom where I can put in a
22 small machine. But anyway, I've been going to every
23 meeting. I've been retired, and I used to be an
24 insurance agent, so I know how to read contracts,
25 talk to people and do a lot of crazy stuff. And but

1
2 with, you know, joy, intention. Not-- you know what
3 I mean. I mean-- okay, anyway. I have-- I
4 discovered something recently. I want to say that
5 when I walked in and I saw that Executive, that NYCHA
6 Executive sitting here that you were screening, I
7 watched this in January meeting, and I watched him
8 perjure himself. Obviously, you don't care, or else
9 you don't have fact-checkers, because they should all
10 be in jail. Okay, this project was promoted as
11 tenant-directed. This is absolutely false. I used to
12 be heavily involved in the tenant association
13 [inaudible] Chelsea, like 13 to 15 years ago, until
14 they threw me out when Darlene Watters was installed
15 as our tenant association president by Gottfried's
16 office, which is a violation of our tenant
17 association bylaws. You cannot have outside
18 interference. Gottfried's office manages personally
19 and installed Darlene Watters. She speaks for him.
20 And Gottfried's retired, but that guy that's on our
21 tenant board CB4, Jeffrey LaFrance [sic], he was in
22 Gottfried's office. He personally--

23 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Thirty
24 seconds to wrap up, sir.

25

1
2 CAESAR GODWALL: He personally installed
3 Darlene, and she speaks for him, and she hasn't been
4 coming to any of our meetings, because I think she
5 saw-- I think Darlene thinks she sold her soul. And
6 anyway, at the last CB4 meeting, Jerry spilled the
7 beans-- not Jerry, but Joe Rizado [sp?], and it's
8 right here. It was what he said. Joe Rizado, "I was
9 called to a meeting with Related on the 88th floor
10 March 2023." I had never-- okay, we've been talking
11 for two years. I've been going to all the meetings.
12 I got nothing else to do. I got no family. I'm
13 retired. I got nothing else to do, so I've been going
14 to all the meetings. I got pages and-- I could write
15 a-- I could write a crime eppy [sic] award-winning
16 series. I was called to a meet-- Joe said this two
17 days ago, "I was called to a meeting with Related on
18 the 80th floor of Hudson Gill [sic]--

19 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Okay,
20 sir, you're going to have to wrap it up.

21 CAESAR GODWALL: in March 2023. I had
22 never seen any change or talk whatsoever about
23 demolition up until that time." This was last year
24 when they first announced this program. "All the
25 sudden, I had the same familiar elected officials in

1 that office when he arrived at the 88th floor. And
2 they had seen-- and he said, "They had seen all the
3 stuff." You can watch it. It's on YouTube. "The
4 tenant leaders were there." Okay, so now the tenant
5 leaders are present, Asevedo [sic] and dirty Watters
6 came up there, and he said, "They had just come from
7 a Zoom meeting with the Mayor." Okay?

9 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you, sir. We
10 going to have to--

11 CAESAR GODWALL: [interposing] It's the
12 mayor's idea. And he said I thought that was
13 bizarre.

14 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
15 testimony.

16 CAESAR GODWALL: And one-- just 20, 15
17 sec-- it was presented here as the option, and
18 Congressman Nadler said, "Show them. Show them.
19 Show them." This is Nadler who pushed this idea on
20 these presidents. This is not their idea. And the
21 presidents speak for us. They don't speak for us.
22 They're speaking for Gottfried's friends or
23 Democratic Party associates--

24 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Thank
25 you.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CAESAR GODWALL: who appointed them.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your testimony, sir. Thank you.

CAESAR GODWALL: This is real testimony.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your testimony.

CAESAR GODWALL: And there's a lot more.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your testimony. And you can--

CAESAR GODWALL: [interposing] Really, this is [inaudible] stuff.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Sir, hold on a minute, sur.

CAESAR GODWALL: This is the same Ukrainian war people.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You have 72 hours-- sir, sir.

CAESAR GODWALL: [inaudible] RAD projects, same exact people.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You have 72 hours to give written testimony. You can go to the Council website and you can-- we heard you, sir.

CAESAR GODWALL: [inaudible] Because it's real.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You're being
3 recorded. Thank you. Thank you. Next.

4 CAESAR GODWALL: It's real.

5 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Mr. Manuel? Thank
6 you.

7 CAESAR GODWALL: Oh, yeah, one more
8 question. Can I have one more 30 seconds?

9 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Sir, you are out of
10 order.

11 CAESAR GODWALL: What number [inaudible]

12 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You are out of order.

13 CAESAR GODWALL: This is what 84-- this
14 is 84 percent of the time it's [inaudible] keep their
15 homes. 84 [inaudible].

16 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Remove him. Remove
17 him.

18 CAESAR GODWALL: Isn't 84 bigger
19 [inaudible]. Is 84 bigger than 16? Look, who wins
20 the game, 84 or 16? Who wins it? Who wins it? 84
21 to 16. I got to get my stuff. I'm out of here. I'm
22 [inaudible]. 84, 84 percent chose to keep their
23 homes.

24 MANUEL MARTINEZ: Hello.
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. Let me just
3 remind everyone, guys. It's a two-minute, two-minute,
4 two-minute for testimonies. It's by discretion to
5 give a 30 seconds. So please, just keep it within
6 that timeframe. We want to be mindful of everybody's
7 time. Thank you. You may proceed, sir.

8 MANUEL MARTINEZ: Thank you, sir. My
9 name is Manny Martinez-- Manuel, Manny Martinez. I am
10 the Resident Council President for South Jamaica
11 Houses, as well as the Queens South District Chair.
12 This is an alliance of 11 resident councils from Far
13 Rockaway to south Jamaica and Queens. I would like to
14 state that RAD is an attack on the Black and Hispanic
15 middle-class families in New York City given the
16 large population that we have of public housing
17 residents in New York City. Section 9, the difference
18 between Section 9 and Section 8 goes beyond just the
19 voucher or the project base. It's also a 40 percent
20 difference when you discuss household income growth
21 stability, because you have the ability now to be
22 moderate income, to go from extremely low to moderate
23 income class. This is where programs such as Section
24 3 resident management as well as a special resident
25 business procurement process, all of which is

1
2 expected to be facilitated to the residents so that
3 they can facilitate that transition. When you move
4 to Section 8, you're eliminating 40 percent. You're
5 destabilizing 40 percent of their household income
6 growth stability because now even though when a
7 Section 9 residents gets converted into a Section 8--
8 project-based Section 8, they have in perpetuity 30
9 percent of their household income, but that is based
10 off of HUD waiver, not legislation. So at any time a
11 HUD secretary could be appointed that could remove
12 that waiver, and then removes that perpetuity or 30
13 percent of their household income. If that public
14 housing resident loses that apartment, right, that
15 once public housing resident, and a new household
16 comes in, that perpetuity does not exist anymore.
17 And so now they are-- they will only be qualified--
18 could I have 30 seconds?

19 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Yes, 30 seconds.

20 MANUEL MARTINEZ: They will only be able
21 to qualify to the 80 percent, and then after they
22 qualify for the 80 percent, the gross rent would kick
23 in which is equivalent to the flat rent for Section
24 9, and after six months of that the Section 8 unit
25 comes off the rent roll if they stay there. And so

1
2 this would drastically change the characteristic of
3 our community given that Section 9 public households
4 don't always stay in on place. Also, just the
5 Section 3, so that you all know, Section 3 does not
6 apply to PACT, RAD. It applies to the conversion of
7 PACT/RAD. So while the conversion process of going
8 from Section 9 to Section 8 of PACT/RAD happens, as
9 soon as that finalizes, Section 3 doesn't apply
10 anymore to that expenditure of funds, even though the
11 residents that are Section 8 qualify as a priority
12 for Section 3 worker, right? But it does not apply
13 in perpetuity to a PACT/RAD development. Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
15 testimony.

16 RENEE KEITT: So, Council Member Mealy, I
17 want to thank you for some of the questions you
18 asked, because it made me think of some things. So,
19 one thing we say is why were things bundled together?
20 Fulton, Elliott-Chelsea, not together. Within
21 Elliott-Chelsea, it's Elliott-Chelsea, Chelsea
22 addition. The survey as of now continues not to be
23 transparent. As was previously said, 969 of the
24 3,388 responded. That is 16 percent; 84 did not.
25 Therefore, they are the majority. Related, Essence,

1 PACT, RAD needs to leave the development immediately.
2 We continue. It is very important we have our
3 seniors, our knowledge tree. They're being left
4 alone. Upon petitioning, we found the resident who
5 has dementia and they have not repaired her wall.
6 The attitude was from HOU, Housing Opportunities
7 Unlimited, they are demolishing. Therefore, they do
8 not need to repair-- do her repairs. The people who
9 are keeping her accountable are the residents. So,
10 along with Darlene Watters-- yes, I did call her and
11 let her know what was going on, and this is what she
12 said, "I heard this. I heard there are problems in
13 the development and repairs are not being done."
14 That's nice. Can we do something about it? We keep
15 saying resident associations. We have not had a
16 meeting in six months. We had one. It was cancelled
17 in the middle of the meeting. We keep saying we do
18 not want one or two people to drive this process.
19 The resident association leaders are the one or two
20 people who are driving this process, not the
21 thousands of other residents who are in this process.
22 We can't keep saying MWBEs are in lovely [sic].
23 Quite frankly, this one is furthering our
24 destruction, our demolition. They are perpetuating
25

1
2 urban renewal. We need to acknowledge that fact. It
3 can't be about people who look like us and are us.
4 It has to be us. One thing I want to say, this is
5 the real estate transaction. We are pawns. We are
6 chess pieces. This isn't about the City of New York.
7 It is about all people, the half a million that live
8 in NYCHA housing--

9 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Thirty
10 seconds to wrap up.

11 RENEE KEITT: that has been said to be
12 its foundation, the most stable housing there is. So
13 what I'm saying is, no demolition as always.
14 RAD/PACT go home. Essence Related, stop fronting.
15 Related is not part of this process. They stand by
16 the side as Jamar Adams [sp?] of Essence Related does
17 the explaining. They say nothing. They are in
18 violation of the Western Rail Yards, and they will be
19 in violation of our civic rights and our human rights
20 as well. Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
22 testimony, and thank everybody on the panel. Thank
23 you so much. Tanesha Grant, Princella Jamerson,
24 Annette Tomlin, and Christopher Leon Johnson. She's
25 coming back, Princella. Ms. Jamerson?

1
2 TANESHA GRANT: Hello. My name is
3 Tanesha Grant, and I am the Executive Director of
4 Parents Supporting Parents and Moms United for Black
5 Lives New York City, and we are community partners of
6 Residents to Preserve Public Housing. First, I would
7 like to thank Chair Banks for having these important
8 hearing on public housing. We appreciate you. First
9 and foremost, most residents I know want to keep
10 their Section 9. There is a lot of misinformation
11 and outright lies being told by the leaders of NYCHA,
12 and I use that term loosely. These programs, the
13 RAD, PACT, and Trust are already leading to eviction
14 and displacements of many longtime residents. Our
15 NYCHA communities have either been bullied or lied to
16 to force them into these conversions. The fact is
17 NYCHA has been mismanaged and unkempt by the elected
18 managers and not the residents. Why should residents
19 give up their Section 9 for programs that offer less
20 protections and dangers of not qualifying for their
21 section 8 apartments? The whole point of Section 9
22 is to make sure everyone has access to affordable
23 rent. It should not matter if they are so-called
24 low-income or on SSI or SSD or working-poor.
25 Everyone deserves a high-quality decent home. We

1
2 hope to work with you, Chair, to support residents to
3 preserve public housing to make sure our public
4 housing is protected. We have over 400 public
5 housing residents. Our communities cannot afford to
6 those their Section 9, to lose the protections that
7 Section 9 offer. We also want to talk about Section
8 3. I know a lot of amazing residents who fight for
9 their development every day. These residents don't
10 get paid. These residents give their free labor
11 because they care about their communities and they
12 care about the NYCHA developments that not only did
13 they grow up in, but their mothers and their
14 grandmothers. This is truly a community. I look
15 forward to working with you, Chair Banks. You know
16 that I'm always on the ground, and that I'm always
17 going to bring the voice of the community, and the
18 community wants to keep their Section 9. If we lose
19 our Section 9, that is privatizing housing, and it
20 will displace Black and Brown people who deserve a
21 quality home. My name is Tanesha Grant, and thank
22 you for listening to me.

23 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
24 testimony and your voice.

25

1
2 PRINCELLA JAMERSON: Hello. I want to
3 piggy bank off of Ms. Tanesha Grant. My name is
4 Princesella Jamerson. I am a resident of public
5 housing. I'm also a member of RPPH, the Residents to
6 Preserve Public Housing. I wanted to speak today
7 about something that wasn't talked about under people
8 going-- being converted under RAD and PACT. I wanted
9 to state that resident leaders are being forced to
10 close a Nondisclosure Agreement form with the
11 developer, management companies, and NYCHA without a
12 lawyer representative. This is deliberately hiding
13 the facts that are involved with these conversions.
14 These methods are harmful to the residents, because
15 vital material and facts are being hidden from the
16 stakeholders in the public. How can resident leaders
17 protect themselves if they don't understand the legal
18 implications of the NDA that they are being forced to
19 sign. NYCHA has to stop telling residents that the
20 964 regulations apply to Section 8. I also want to
21 add that the va-- the units that are vacated take
22 away needed funding from the Housing Authority that
23 they state that they need this money, but yet there
24 are so many vacant units throughout the portfolio of
25 NYCHA. So mine's just really short. And then I also

1
2 wanted to add that the pre-conversion of RAD,
3 residents aren't getting services under these pre-
4 conversions that are going through with RAD. So once
5 the conversions are talked about, the residents stop
6 getting the services that they need in their unit
7 until the people or the management takes over the
8 development, and sometimes this can last up to two to
9 three years or more.

10 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
11 testimony. Ms. Tomlin?

12 ANNETTE TOMLIN: Good afternoon,
13 everyone. My name is Annette Tomlin, and I am glad
14 to be here to vent. I am pissed off, okay? I am
15 tired of the smoke-screen. This has to stop. Ninety
16 years of NYCHA, we understand where it failed, why it
17 failed, and now we're here again. Who is doing the
18 assessment? We need critical thinkers that's going
19 to make a difference and a change. The tenants are
20 suffering. The plotted plan has to stop now,
21 immediately. I agree with everyone that's here that
22 are residents that actually want to hold not just
23 NYCHA, HUD responsible, but also the City Council.
24 Y'all are responsible for a lot of this stuff here.
25 We are calling and asking for your accountability.

1
2 Stick up to your responsibility, and also the tenants
3 have a responsibility and accountability as well. We
4 are not lawyers. We don't understand all the
5 language, but we're good at understanding where we're
6 at now. Okay, and this is because it's being forced
7 upon us. It's just wrong. What are we going to do?
8 Where's everybody going to go? We already have an
9 influx of, you know, asylum-seekers coming,
10 homelessness crisis. You have 400,000 some-odd
11 people that are in NYCHA. Where are they going? So
12 what are y'all going to do? Nothing. The same old
13 thing? No? We have a plan. I know I do. A town
14 hall meeting needs to be called right away, okay?
15 And I don't know what sister just said so, okay, but
16 it needs to stop. Okay, a escrow, yes. A demand,
17 stop, hold-- suitcase lawsuit, yes. We're going to
18 hold you all responsible. Contractors, you know,
19 they-- the developers and everything they'll say
20 there's some jobs, hair pick-- excuse the expression,
21 but hair-- okay. And nobody did anything to go
22 behind them to make sure that anything was done
23 correctly. This is uncalled for, and it's ridiculous
24 how we have to actually live. Y'all are responsible.
25 So what are y'all going to do? Nothing. Except for

1 sit here and just listen to us while we vent. Two
2 minutes you give us, and it's been over 30, 40, 50,
3 60, years of complaints. Not anymore. Thank you for
4 your time. I'm pissed.

5
6 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: thank you for your
7 testimony, Ms. Tomlin.

8 CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Ready? Hello,
9 my name is Christopher Leon Johnson. I'm opposed to
10 this plan. Let me tell you the truth. This is all
11 part of the City of Yes. A majority of you members
12 are for the City of Yes. Like, you, Mr. Banks,
13 you're for the City of Yes, because you're with the
14 developers. You took money from developers. You
15 take money from-- you was part of Labor Strong 2023,
16 and therefore the City of Yes. So you're not going
17 to go against them. You got to run in 2025. They
18 might get an opponent to run against you, so you're
19 not going to go against the developers. They own
20 Labor Strong. They own the carpenters. So you're
21 for the City of Yes. You're going to vote yes for
22 it, sir. And the truth is the people here have to
23 organize. The people here need real new
24 organizations to fight for them and organize
25 themselves, not have this organization that's called

1
2 the Residents to Preserve Public Housing fight on
3 their behalf. Because what's going on is their
4 leader, Marquis Jenkins, is team Carlina Rivera who
5 is for the City of Yes. How do you have a leader
6 like Marquis Jenkins fighting for your guys, while
7 he's team Carlina Rivera? He's not even team
8 Christopher Marte. AT least Christopher Marte is
9 against the City of Yes. He's against this
10 unscrupulous developers. He's against this bad up-
11 zoning like we SoHo, NoHo. So shout out to
12 Christopher Marte for being against this stuff. He's
13 not team Marte. He's team Carline Rivera. You guys
14 go to look at the petitioning ballot access with
15 Marquis Jenkins. If I was you members of RPPH, you
16 need to have a meeting to expel Marquis Jenkins as
17 the Chair and the de facto leader of RPPH because he
18 is compromised. He is a fraud. He's conflicted.
19 He's a open conflict of interest. He is corrupted.
20 So I'm going to tell people right now, you people
21 have to organize and fight against this stuff. This
22 is all a big plan. This is a little part of the City
23 of Yes, and you guys will be displaced. Don't pay
24 this Chair any mind. He is for the displacement of
25

1
2 you people in NYCHA and RAD. So, that's all I got to
3 say. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
5 testimony. We're going to take a quick-- yeah. I'm
6 going to take a quick bathroom break, and after that--
7 - then we're going to go to the Zoom testimony right
8 after. Thank you.

9 [break]

10 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [gavel] This meeting
11 is called back to order. We're now going to proceed
12 to our virtual testimony, and the first person on is
13 Christina Chaise.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

15 CHRISTINA CHAISE: Oh, hello. I'm sorry.
16 I was not ready. Good afternoon. Thank you everyone
17 for making yourself available to be there in person.
18 Today, I'm sorry, I cannot be there with you. I'm
19 Christina Chaise. I'm Second Vice President at
20 [inaudible] Resident Association. I'm also a member
21 of RPPH, the Section 9 Justice for All Coalition, and
22 an advocacy coordinator at Take Root Justice where we
23 provide legal policy support for different community-
24 based organizations, and I have the honor and
25 privilege of working alongside NYCHA residents. But

1
2 today I'm here specifically speaking as a NYCHA
3 resident and things that I share, as well as some
4 information that, you know, [inaudible] by way of my
5 employment. The first thing I really wanted to
6 center was resident engagement. I am shocked to hear
7 the way in which NYCHA presented its-- what seemingly
8 amicable engagement, but to my understanding has
9 always been coercive, intimidating and un-democratic.
10 And I just wanted to center that what NYCHA's doing
11 is not necessarily anything amazing or new. It's
12 actually part of HUD's RAD notice that came out July
13 27th, 2023 regarding resident engagement, and that
14 [inaudible] is encouraged to partner with the
15 resident leaders, and they now have to provide all
16 these additional documentations substantiating
17 resident engagement that rubberstamps their
18 applications and hold additional meeting. However,
19 when we look at who actually shows up in the meeting,
20 consistently, it's not the population at-large. It's
21 a very small handful of folks, and as far as I'm
22 concerned, even as a leader, I don't think those
23 handful of folks can make decisions for the whole
24 population of residents they--

1
2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Thank you
3 for your testimony.

4 CHRISTINA CHAISE: [inaudible] represent.
5 I just wanted to say one last thing, that in reality
6 that it's coercive, and what we're seeing with regard
7 to FEC is that there are a large [inaudible] mass of
8 residents that are not in support and they're not
9 being listened to. And originally RAD and PACT had
10 nothing to do with infill, and so the infill plan to
11 build new "mixed-income housing" on that very land
12 that is Fulton Elliott-Chelsea was not anything the
13 tenants ever decided upon, and that's being pushed
14 into the agenda, and that has nothing-- it's a land
15 grab. It has nothing to do with the want and needs of
16 current residents. Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
18 testimony. The next person is Dana Elden.

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

20 DANA ELDEN: Hi. Alright, alright, my
21 time. Good afternoon. Good afternoon, Chairman
22 Banks. Greetings to all attendees today, as we all
23 agree that there is more to be said regarding
24 RAD/PACT and the Trust. I am Dana Elden, president of
25 St. Mary's Park Houses Resident Council, its 5013C,

1
2 as well as an executive board member of Residents to
3 Preserve Public Housing, and a member of the DCOP
4 [sic], Executive Board of the South Bronx. I live in
5 a Section 9 project-based development. I'm here once
6 again to speak before this council regarding my
7 disdain of how NYCHA has continuously misled and
8 abused the rights of the residents of NYCHA.
9 Currently, we have 73 vacancies according to the
10 manager, and of those, I have not been provided the
11 number of vacancies in Section 9 versus Section 8
12 which I am supposed to be informed according to NYCHA
13 publicly, but privately, they deter management from
14 providing me that information. Also, the budget for
15 the development is a secret, and that information is
16 not provided. Section 9 must be adequately funded,
17 not only by HUD, but also by local city and state
18 funding. Section 3 employment is said to be
19 supported by NYCHA. However, the construction
20 companies only accept union members to work on
21 Section 3 assignments. Qualified residents are not
22 allowed to work on a project in their development
23 until they become union members. Currently, I have
24 one out of 13 applicants that has an OSHA 40 and
25 experience, but because he is not union he's being

1
2 offered a flagger position at best if they deem him
3 worthy. No one looking like us or our residents is
4 working on my capital project, a group replacement in
5 the south Bronx.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Thank you. Your time
7 has expired.

8 DANA ELDEN: [inaudible] No, no, no. I've
9 been here since 10 o'clock. Let me finish my two
10 page, please.

11 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: We'll give you 30
12 more seconds, ma'am. Is that okay?

13 DANA ELDEN: Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay.

15 DANA ELDEN: Others that have had at
16 other sites would appear substantiate the Section 3
17 compliance. The Council's questions are repeatedly
18 that we'll get back to you with that, or it is listed
19 on our website. I'm here once again to stress that
20 this council needs clarity. Residents in this
21 process are not being told the whole truth. They're
22 not informed of the transition of their rights, as
23 well as the transition and responsibilities towards
24 the developments. The process of voting is also an
25 issue as they are not fair with the percentage of

1
2 voting. Fifty to 60 percent in my position-- in my
3 opinion, this percentage is fair. It has been my
4 opinion, and as I visit developments who have gone
5 through the process that the materials are cheap.
6 The workmanship is just a cosmetic effect. The main
7 problems are leaking roofs, pipes, old electrical
8 lines are not being addressed. The appliance that
9 are being installed are not completely new, and were
10 most likely not sold by the manufacturer. Also,
11 residents who have had the conversions and complain
12 about the servicing of their developments and how the
13 private managed companies are lacking in the work
14 orders and in need of fixing different issues in
15 their apartments. I live four blocks from Betances. I
16 have been approached by a number of residents who
17 voice their disappointment with these conversions as
18 they still have leaks that come through the drywall
19 and stain ceilings.

20 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay, ma'am. We're
21 going to conclude.

22 DANA ELDEN: Sir, Chairman Banks, I've
23 been here all day. Please let me finish.

24 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: I'm going--
25

1
2 DANA ELDEN: [interposing] I only got two
3 paragraphs left.

4 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay, I'm going to
5 give you 30 seconds. Just reward a little quicker.
6 Thank you.

7 DANA ELDEN: Okay, I appreciate it.

8 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Alright.

9 DANA ELDEN: It looks nice outside, but
10 truly lacking in the material quality. This
11 misinformation and the promises of residents' rights
12 are important to the human right to have a quality of
13 life that will sustain them in a healthy environment.
14 Section 9 protects our residents. Section 8
15 guarantees the legislature of 2022 that they will
16 adopt the language of the 964 rule and regulations,
17 but what guarantees that the residents will be
18 awarded the same rights as they would with Section 9.
19 Also, this practice of RAD/PACT must be abolished.
20 The damage that has been done in many cases already
21 is astounding. What is happening around the city
22 agency, passing up their responsibility to these
23 private management teams is critically affecting us.
24 I ask the Council to stand with the citizens of this
25 city who reside in public housing. We deserve better

1
2 than what is being done. We have the rights that we
3 are being denied now. We are the residents of public
4 housing, and we demand that justice be done and to
5 halt the RAD/PACT program. Thank you for this
6 opportunity. Thank you, Chairman.

7 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. Thank you
8 for your testimony. We're going to move on to
9 Danette Chavis.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

11 DANETTE CHAVIS: Hello?

12 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Yes, ma'am, you can
13 begin your testimony.

14 DANETTE CHAVIS: Hi. I'm so sorry
15 there's only a little bit amount of time, because
16 it's not enough to address years and years of
17 outrageous complaints. I do agree with Council
18 Member Avilés earlier who stated that we're going
19 round and round in circles addressing these
20 complaints, and in fact, I don't believe there can be
21 any true resolve without confronting the facts. And
22 the fact of the matter is there's zero accountability
23 for NYCHA who has totally abandoned its properties
24 [inaudible] privatization and the unrolling [sic] of
25 16 to 18 properties on one private developer who has

1
2 little to no experience in renovation is proof of
3 that abandonment. It's an abandonment that's
4 motivated by profit and profit alone. I think we're
5 all clear on that. I think we're going round and
6 round in circles trying to avoid the issue. I would
7 like for the City Council to hold these hearings and
8 give the opportunity to tenant leaders to address
9 NYCHA as they sit up here at their table and tell lie
10 after lie while you ask questions. It's clear to me
11 that you're aware of the deception being given, but
12 you could be far more effective if you let some of
13 these tenants and TA leaders confront them when they
14 tell these lies about what they're doing. And that's
15 all I have to say.

16 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
17 testimony, Ms. Chavis. Doreen Goggans?

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

19 DOREEN GOGGANS: Good afternoon everyone.
20 My name is Doreen Goggans. I'm a resident and also
21 I'm the President for the FHA Homes Resident Council
22 which is an entity of FHA repossessed homes. This
23 entity basically is for single-dwelling and multi-
24 dwelling homes which are scattered. We are a newly-
25 formed council as of December 2023. The residents--

1
2 I've heard everyone speak about NYCHA and RAD/PACT
3 which I agree that they should not be involved, and
4 the things that they're doing to the residents is no
5 transparency, they tell a bunch of lies. When you
6 ask them specific questions, they can't answer it,
7 because of the lies. So they started out telling
8 lies, so you know when you tell one lie, you got to
9 continue to tell that lie, and that's what they have
10 been doing for years now. My parents went into this
11 home in 1968. They're deceased now, but they always
12 wanted to purchase the home, but a lot of things fell
13 in the cracks. They used to come and do the repairs
14 and keep the house maintenance, but that all stopped
15 over 10, 15 years ago. No work has been done, but
16 I've been paying-- my parents faithfully paid their
17 rent, and we're in compliance. I'm in compliance, so
18 I'm just here basically being a voice for the
19 residents, because they need a voice. They need
20 someone to know their concerns, and they want to live
21 in a healthy, safe environment. For a lot of years,
22 people have been saying they're going to do this.
23 NYCHA's going to do this. NYCHA's going to do this,
24 but they don't do anything.

1
2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Thank you. Your time
3 has expired.

4 DOREEN GOGGANS: And I'm really tired.
5 Thank you for having me here.

6 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
7 testimony. Ilana Dunner?

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

9 ILANA DUNNER: [inaudible] director of
10 Riverstone Senior Life Services, community-based
11 organization at 99 Fort Washington. We're kind of
12 coming from a different angle. We are a nonprofit
13 agency in one of the NYCHA buildings. The new
14 management seems to consider us more like a
15 commercial tenant, responsible for all repairs at our
16 own expense. This was a real change since NYCHA
17 management managed the building. As renovations
18 continued, there were major leaks causing significant
19 damage to the two floors where we provide services.
20 We were informed by management that repairs in any
21 area which had already been renovated by Riverstone,
22 thanks to capital and City funds, would be our
23 responsibility. After five such events, our long-
24 standing insurer dropped us, and I could not locate
25 another insurance company that would even consider

1
2 covering us for property insurance. And of course,
3 we are required to have property insurance by DFTA
4 and just general practice. As a favor, the new
5 management company added us to their policy. This
6 meant a slight reduction in our premium, but a huge
7 increase in our deductible, from \$1,000 to \$25,000
8 per incident. Now, as luck would have it, this past
9 November there was another major leak which for the
10 first time resulted from an accident that Riverstone
11 caused. Where we were told that the cause did not
12 matter-- the cause of the leak did not matter during
13 the years 2019 and 2023, but suddenly the cause did
14 matter, and now it was our responsibility to cover
15 the loss. As you can imagine the ongoing threat of a
16 \$25,000 deductible, plus puts us a very precarious
17 financial situation all year.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Thank you for your
19 testimony. Your time has expired.

20 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
21 testimony.

22 ILANA DUNNER: Okay. We need your help.
23 Please help us.

24 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
25 testimony. It's duly recorded. Jeannie Lopez?

1
2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

3 JEANNIE LOPEZ: Yep, Boston Secor. NYCHA
4 single-handedly decides which development will get
5 RAD. The selections are not based on repair needs.
6 The latest physical needs assessments demonstrates
7 that the repair backlog do not impact the selection
8 process. Instead, they seem to be focused on the
9 sites that are desirable to their real estate
10 partners. Then they work and hand over my precious
11 ancestral land to one of the worst management
12 companies in New York. The list of real estate
13 partners allowed to manage and/or develop is limited
14 by New York State, NYCHA, and the selection of
15 partners is not truly democratic. NYCHA's approach
16 to the tenant association is private and they're
17 votes to that-- here we go. During the initial
18 conversation NYCHA informed that the TA will undergo
19 conversations on project-based Section 8. The TA's
20 given at least three choices. The management
21 development team does not have to report this to the
22 larger community of tenants. Therefore, the
23 selection process is un-democratic and also violates
24 our rights. Boston Secor, for instance, just had
25 their President dies a year ago around the same year

1
2 my mom died, and now we did not get a fair vote into
3 how to get a new president in, and it's not whoever
4 was a family member and/or just on the team before
5 got voted up. Crazy. Yeah, thank you so much.

6 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
7 testimony. Judy Smith?

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

9 JUDY SMITH: Hello everyone. I'm keeping
10 this in the frame of what you asked before, what do
11 residents know, what can NYCHA residents do, and the
12 [inaudible]. What do residents know? Not much.
13 They don't know about Section 9 and their rights.
14 99.9 percent of the tenants don't know what Section 9
15 is. They don't know what City Council Presidents
16 are, but they sit at the table. They are our voice.
17 And it's some confusion about the Resident Council.
18 Are they the same as the tenant association or are
19 they just another lawyer between residents and NYCHA.
20 What can NYCHA residents do? Educate themselves and
21 vote based on candidate's achievement,
22 qualifications, and vision, because I read a article
23 that said NYCHA residents don't get what they want,
24 because they are low-priority because they don't
25 vote. So, that's something NYCHA residents need to

1 think about. Oversight, the oversight is confusing,
2 very complex, and I think there needs to be a joint
3 session between local, state, and federal so we can
4 see who has the oversight over NYCHA, because I've
5 read that the state government washed their hands of
6 NYCHA during the time of Pataki. And then in 20--
7 now, this is when Pataki was in, and then in 2018 it
8 seems like the state senate gave the oversight to
9 City Council.
10

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Thank you. Your time
12 has expired.

13 JUDY SMITH: Okay, just one more thing.

14 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thirty seconds,
15 ma'am.

16 JUDY SMITH: Okay. And some other things
17 that I-- if you know RAD/PACT is imminent domain in
18 practice. And I want you to realize that a lot of
19 NYCHA are civil service workers, and a lot of their
20 employees are civil service workers. Another point,
21 I heard that RAD/PACT does not address the
22 infrastructure. That's another point. And as for
23 rogue TA presidents, Manhattanville, look at
24 Manhattanville. They are supposed to be taken over
25 by RAD/PACT this summer and most of the tenants don't

1
2 want it. They don't know what's going on. They're
3 being bullied. So, I'm going to have some of those
4 tenants give you a call.

5 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you, ma'am.
6 Thank you for your testimony. Lesley Halliday?

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

8 LESLEY HALLIDAY: Hello. I'm Lesley
9 Halliday. I'm the Board President of Riverstone
10 Senior Life Services located at 99 Fort Washington
11 Avenue which is a NYCHA senior housing complex. We
12 have served the community for over 39 years. Our
13 NYCHA residents appear to be content with the results
14 of the renovations and capital improvements.
15 However, our experience as an organization operating
16 from a RAD NYCHA building has not been positive.
17 What RAD has mean to Riverstone is the transferring
18 of many costs and liabilities for which we were never
19 previously responsible. We believe that these
20 problems stem from a failure at the highest level of
21 NYCHA to anticipate the RAD program would generate a
22 need for a written articulation of the relationship
23 between the nonprofit organizations which operate
24 under contract to other city agencies and the
25 management running RAD buildings. Six and a half

1 years since we learned 99 Fort Washington was
2 becoming a RAD building, we have no written
3 guidelines. Our management companies have expressed
4 the opinion and operated under the assumption that
5 Riverstone is atypical commercial tenant. The
6 consequence of being located in a RAD building have
7 been negative in many ways. As our director
8 mentioned, our deductible has gone from \$1,000 to
9 \$25,000. The absence of written guidelines means the
10 board operates without any clear understandings of
11 our legal and fiduciary responsibilities. There is
12 no clarity about the hierarchy of multiple companies
13 that seem involved with 99 Fort Washington.
14 Furthermore, representatives from these companies
15 offer conflicting and contradictory statements about
16 the chain of communication and operating procedures.
17 Our executive director now spends about 50 percent of
18 her time in building matters, undercutting her
19 ability to lead staff and provide effective
20 programming. Members of the Riverstone team will
21 further address some of these issues in oral
22 testimony. I want to say listening to this hearing,
23 I am a proud product of the Dyckman Houses. However,
24

1
2 I am saddened by everything that I am hearing from
3 the tenants today. Thank you for your time.

4 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
5 testimony. Our next testimony will come from Lisa
6 Hall.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: starting time.

8 LISA HALL: This is Lisa Hall and her
9 mother Simone Hall, NYCHA's Boston Secor residents, a
10 federally classified housing development in the
11 Bronx, right across the street from Co-op City, the
12 world's largest cooperative tenants association and
13 apartments. And I wanted to discuss how this
14 program, project-based Section 9, actually works.
15 And we are having a hybrid situation where the
16 Wavecrest management team is coming in to privatize
17 it, and we had the death as an earlier residents said
18 of our tenant's association president in December of
19 2022. So it left us with no authorized resident
20 leaders. Yet, someone is talking to the project-
21 based Section 8 and PACT program without our
22 knowledge, because we understand that NDAs were
23 signed, and we can't get any actual intel for what's
24 been going on. But Wavecrest Management has stated
25 during these various PACT meetings that the

1
2 communication director of Wavecrest Management said
3 your Section 8 voucher will remain with your
4 apartment, and you can use it to move wherever you
5 want, Rhode Island, Guam, Vietnam, or Puerto Rico,
6 territories of United States, but your voucher
7 remains with the apartment and opens up the Section 8
8 waiting list to those who will enjoy your apartment.
9 So what does that actually mean? That I'm going to
10 remain in my apartment with the promise of a Section
11 8 voucher and the people on the waiting list are
12 going to come to live with me? Well, we understand
13 there is no official Section 8, even if you use the
14 term interchangeably with affordable housing voucher.
15 It stopped being funded in 2009. So, we have been
16 threatened now by if you don't sign the new lease,
17 people will talk about you. If you don't sign, your
18 neighbors won't get their repairs. When you sign the
19 lease with your relationship--

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Thank
21 you, your time has expired.

22 LISA HALL: NYCHA ends. I need
23 additional time, please.

24 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thirty seconds to
25 wrap it up, ma'am.

1
2 LISA HALL: so, on Monday we're being
3 forced by Wavecrest Management to bring in our
4 personal information, birth certificate, social
5 security cards, photo IDs, driver's licenses,
6 passports, and permits to force us to sign for
7 Section 8, and this is not what we asked for. And
8 they also put on flyers that was left on our doors,
9 the English language version of this document is the
10 official legal controlling document. The Latin
11 translation is not an official document. So you have
12 biases going on here for a development that we did
13 not ask for. And what's actually going on is our
14 property is being commandeered by Section 8 and
15 Wavecrest Management and put into a financial
16 portfolio so that will control our apartments and
17 disappear our apartments, and that is the overall
18 agenda under the guise that you're coming in to
19 provide upgrades and repairs--

20 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Thank
21 you, ma'am.

22 LISA HALL: we've been waiting for for at
23 least 20+ years. Thank you for your time.

24

25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. Thank you
3 for your testimony. Teresa-- sorry about that.
4 Sarah Morgridge?

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

6 SARAH MORGRIDGE: Hello. I'm Sarah
7 Morgridge. I've been on the Riverstone Board of
8 directors since 2016. From 2002 through 2013 I
9 worked for Council Member Robert Jackson. Riverstone
10 was in his district. Currently, I work for Literacy
11 in Community or, LINC. LINC provides two generate
12 early literacy programming in eight NYC neighborhoods
13 including East New York and Cypress Hills. My
14 testimony is about the absence of written guidelines,
15 MOUs or any other, other kind of operating agreement.
16 For instance, we've never seen a sample or an actual
17 version of the NYCHA RAD contract that governs 99
18 Fort Washington. How can we understand our
19 parameters without that? Is it because NYCHA's an
20 authority, they're exempt from public scrutiny? Do
21 we have to FOIA this? We have an excellent
22 relationship with our RAD social services liaison,
23 but no understanding of what her contractual
24 relationship is to RAD or to us. We've been
25 stonewalled throughout this process which began in

1
2 2017 by both NYCHA, and until quite recently, by
3 DFTA. Absent an MOU between NYCHA and DFTA, we have
4 no knowledge of the operating agreement between these
5 two agencies. We saw a draft lease that was really
6 unfavorable to nonprofit providers. We understand
7 that's off the table, but it's hearsay. We've never
8 seen it in writing. We've had contradictory
9 experiences with routine maintenance, something that
10 NYCHA took care of for years. February, when a
11 urinal broke, our management company refused to fix
12 it. More recent incident was rain-driven water
13 seeping in through an air conditioner was promptly
14 handled. At a recent meeting between the Executive
15 Director and the organization's DFTA liaison positive
16 progress was reported. That's encouraging, but until
17 the liaison responds in writing to our director's
18 written recap, we are skeptical, especially --

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Thank you
20 so much. Your time has expired.

21 SARAH MORGRIDGE: [inaudible] not
22 allowed.

23 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thirty more seconds,
24 ma'am.

25

1
2 SARAH MORGRIDGE: WE look forward to
3 receiving a written report on topics covered. We
4 would welcome the opportunity to discuss ideas with
5 you about how this situation for service providers
6 could be improved. We'd like to talk to you and
7 members of the central staff. Because it's board
8 members who have the legal and the fiduciary
9 responsibility for service organizations. The
10 current RAD structure undercuts our ability to
11 provide services and threatens our solvency. We
12 understand the benefits, but please do not ignore the
13 very real consequences to nonprofits in RAD
14 buildings.

15 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you, ma'am.
16 Thank you for your testimony. Teresa Scott.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

18 TERESA SCOTT: Okay. Hi, peace and
19 blessings. My name is Teresa Lorraine Scott. I live
20 in Redfern Houses. I love public housing. Public
21 housing saved my life, and I feel like y'all are
22 allowing NYCHA to destroy and destruct our homes. RAD
23 needs to be sunset today. Sunset RAD today. Don't
24 wait until September. Stop RAD right now. Also, re-
25 enact the fair housing [inaudible] so people who are

1 put in RAD by force, by terror. This is the USA.
2 This is not-- NYCHA has become terrorists. RAD has
3 become terrorists. They have guns [sic] on us,
4 silent guns on us forcing us to be part of stuff,
5 telling people I'm going to give you new-- I need a
6 new frigerator [sic]. I need to be in a home that's
7 safe for me, that's not going to be harassing. We
8 have been harassed for the last [inaudible]. During
9 COVID we were harassed. The resident management told
10 when I was part of the board that RAD was horrible.
11 Then they changed their whole subject. Oh, take RAD.
12 So they're in cahoots of destroying public housing
13 residents who wants to stay in their homes. Save
14 Section 9 is the only home that's affordable. No
15 mixed-income. No affordable-- no low-income house
16 that's affordable. We need public housing. We need
17 to keep it-- the Section 8 that they had years ago is
18 not the same as it. So they tricking people to-- we--
19 - I feel that we need to have these leaders that was
20 today to create a new strategy. We have the
21 solutions. We can tell you what to do. We need
22 y'all to work with the Assembly, the HUD, and
23 yourself to join with us. I am so tired of NYCHA
24 coming to me, lying to y'all, and y'all say the same
25

1
2 thing. Send us a letter-- no, forget about send a
3 letter. Meet with the residents that are here today.
4 Let us be the leaders, because these TA boards are
5 rogue like that council woman said. They are rogue.
6 They don't care about us. They don't' ask us
7 questions. Why should a NDA be signed by TA
8 Presidents, and then the public-- this is a public
9 housing. That mean--

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Thank
11 you. Your time has expired.

12 TERESA SCOTT: public is [inaudible]
13 public. Okay, I'll-- and the other thing I want to
14 say is that Councilman Banks thank you for having
15 this thing, but I need you to hire us to be part of
16 this team. Make us be the new leaders of public
17 housing, because we know what we need. Y'all don't
18 know what we need. We can tell you. You listen to
19 NYCHA, and we are doomed. We need our home. I am a
20 disabled person, and if I have to put on the street,
21 where am I supposed to live? I don't want to live
22 with my parents. I want to stay in my home that's
23 safe.

24 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you, ma'am.
25

1
2 TERESA SCOTT: Respect our buildings and
3 make it livable so we-- it's a human right to have a
4 safe place, and y'all have taken our rights by
5 allowing RAD, the Trust and all the other programs
6 that are stealing our homes. This is our land, not
7 their land. They just want our land. They don't
8 want us.

9 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank--

10 TERESA SCOTT: They want our land.

11 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you.

12 TERESA SCOTT: This land belongs to us,
13 not to these other people that are trying to destroy
14 our homes.

15 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you, ma'am.

16 TERESA SCOTT: Save our home.

17 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
18 testimony. IZIAH THOMPSON?

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

20 IZIAH THOMPSON: Thank you, Chair Banks
21 and the committee staff for having this hearing. I'm
22 IZIAH THOMPSON representing Community Service
23 Society. I'll be submitting a much longer testimony,
24 but in short, last year the Community Service Society
25 carried out our annual survey, a random

1
2 representative sample of residents to capture the
3 experience and need of low-income New Yorkers. While
4 we found that the PACT respondents reported that
5 their landlords show more respect and responded to
6 repair needs much more successfully than NYCHA, PACT
7 residents were more likely to report serious concerns
8 with leaks and mold, cleaning drinking water, as well
9 as needing hot water. These respondents were mostly
10 in the areas where Park Rock Consolidated, Brooklyn
11 Bundle, High Bridge Franklin, Northwest Bronx
12 scattered sites, Twin Parks West, Reid Apartments and
13 Ocean Bay conversions occurred. We also found that
14 43 percent of PACT respondents reported that their
15 landlord tried to evict them compared to just eight
16 percent of NYCHA residents. From this, we were
17 surprised to find that many of the management
18 partners at these conversions had trails of reviews
19 and complaints on review sites and Google Maps, and
20 terrible images and videos on social media showing
21 their conditions. Our written testimony includes
22 examples of management partners losing subsidies in
23 private buildings just this year due to failing HQS,
24 a trend of residents getting no response from
25 companies regarding emergency conditions, private and

1
2 PACT units, poor maintenance of luxury buildings that
3 they own with pictures from lobbies and apartments,
4 and evidence of harassment and being heavy-handed
5 with evictions. It's a shame that these residents
6 have to resort to Google map reviews and TikTok to
7 express their dissatisfaction. Ultimately, it is one
8 thing to present a pretty plan for resident leaders
9 who without real education campaigns and technical
10 assistance for residents, folks who can point out the
11 questionable past of some of these companies, NYCHA's
12 not supporting residents with unbiased independent
13 education throughout this conversion process that
14 PACT is. FEC in its survey is one of the best
15 examples of this. We know that NYCHA can empower
16 residents with choice and information. The
17 Preservation Trust slated sites have an extensive
18 education campaign and actual vote. We don't
19 understand why some residents get this historic
20 engagement and others are--

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: [interposing] Thank
22 you. Time has expired.

23 IZIAH THOMPSON: [inaudible]

24 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
25 testimony.

1
2 IZIAH THOMPSON: One more sentence. Just
3 would recommend that--

4 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Yes, you
5 can have another 30 seconds, sir.

6 IZIAH THOMPSON: We recommend that a
7 universal vote for passage of Intro 110 with
8 additions that we will include in our written
9 testimony, and real surveil of resident satisfaction.
10 A number of other solutions will definitely be
11 needed, and we'll show them in our written testimony,
12 and we look forward to working with you to make it
13 happen.

14 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
15 testimony, sir. Yolanda Hall?

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

17 YOLANDA HALL: My councilman. Hey, Chris.
18 How are you?

19 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Good to see you,
20 Yolanda.

21 YOLANDA HALL: [inaudible] I was on this
22 meeting since earlier today, and a lot of the points,
23 especially from the sister that live in Penn-Wortman
24 were brought out which concerns Penn-Wortman, Linden,
25 and Boulevard Houses. Boulevard Houses construction

1
2 is one of the worst that I've ever seen. The
3 material that was used in our development all seems
4 to be flammable, front doors, floors, the paint jobs
5 were like done with like plaster paint instead of
6 semi-gloss paint. The apartment is already falling
7 apart. My apartment has already failed inspection
8 from after being redone completely since December.
9 NYCHA came and did an inspection. But I tell you one
10 thing is true, and I listened to everybody and the
11 questions that was going on today-- it's hard to
12 reach NYCHA. It's hard to reach anybody in this
13 RAD/PACT program that can give you any kind of
14 assistance, even on the weekends when we have
15 emergencies out here in a district between Penn-
16 Wortman, Linden and Boulevard. There is no support
17 system for us to call on the weekend, no support
18 system. I don't feel that I'm-- I feel like I'm being
19 invaded by Section 8. I was threatened to go on
20 Section 8. If I didn't go on Section 8, because I've
21 always been a Section 9 resident-- if I didn't go on
22 Section 8 when this RAD/PACT program came out, I was
23 being threatened to be evicted and my mother, too,
24 who's been out here for 52 years. We've all been out
25 here since 1972. So, I will continue to support

1
2 whatever fight that we have to fight with my
3 councilman and whatever other-- my assemblywoman and
4 whoever else, you know, within my district, but we
5 really need to have a option to go back to Section 9,
6 and we really need to have the PACT/RAD program and
7 the management team of PRC and Boulevard Houses has
8 to be removed, has to be removed.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Thank you. Your time
10 has expired.

11 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
12 testimony. Okay, thank you for your testimony. And
13 we are now going to move to Alex Stein.

14 ALEX STEIN: Hey, guys. It's me, Alex
15 Stein. I just want to talk about the latest
16 political action committee coming out in 2024 we
17 started. It's called Illegals for Trump, and we want
18 to offer illegal immigrants better social services--

19 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Sir, you
20 have to stay on topic.

21 ALEX STEIN: by the Administration. It
22 is. What I'm saying, we're going to be able to get
23 Section 8 and Section 9 housing to illegal immigrants
24 over American citizens under this new legislation
25 that Donald Trump is going to put in, because we need

1
2 to support illegal immigrants or and all of these
3 lazy people.

4 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Sir, you have to stay
5 on topic.

6 ALEX STEIN: No, but I'm talking about
7 all these people are lazy. They don't deserve a
8 house more than a person from Venezuela.

9 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Sir, you have to stay
10 on topic.

11 ALEX STEIN: [inaudible]

12 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: That's not on topic.

13 ALEX STEIN: No, but do you not
14 understand what I'm saying? Why are all these
15 [inaudible]

16 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] do you
17 understand what I'm saying. You have to stay on
18 topic, sir.

19 ALEX STEIN: I'm talking about public
20 housing and I'm talking about the Section 8,
21 different-- section 9 different that's going to
22 happen when legislation that gets in that
23 accommodates illegal immigrants over actual natural-
24 born citizens, because natural-born citizens, all
25 these people were born and there's no--

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Sir, you
3 have to stay on topic.

4 ALEX STEIN: [inaudible] I'm on topic.
5 Listen, is Jennifer Gutiérrez there, my favorite big
6 booty Latina? I'm sick of you guys always cutting me
7 down. You're doing the same-- Jennifer Gutiérrez
8 did--

9 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] You have
10 to stay on topic.

11 ALEX STEIN: Well, I can say big booty
12 Latina. I'm at a meeting. Do you not know the First
13 Amendment, pal? I'm Prime Time 99. I just--

14 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] I do,
15 and I respect your first amendment, but you have to
16 stay on topic.

17 ALEX STEIN: [inaudible] Quit interrupting
18 me, because I'm trying to help out some illegal
19 immigrants. Y'all know we need to help some of these
20 Haitians. I don't care if there's cannibals and
21 they're eating each other. They need to--

22 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [interposing] Sir, you
23 have to stay on topic.

24 ALEX STEIN: [inaudible] What do you
25 mean? We got people cooking rats. If we get the

1
2 Haitians out here, they won't have to eat humans
3 anymore. They could eat the street rats. I don't
4 know why y'all can't get along and figure this out.

5 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Sir, I'm going to
6 warn you again. You have to stay on topic, or we
7 will mute.

8 ALEX STEIN: I know, but you got some
9 major malfunction. You don't know the [inaudible].
10 I'm trying to help you out.

11 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you so much.
12 Thank you for your testimony.

13 ALEX STEIN: And y'all want to do is try
14 and shut me down.

15 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Can you please mute?

16 ALEX STEIN: Y'all don't--

17 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Alright. If there's
18 anyone left on Zoom that would like to give
19 testimony, please indicate it by raising your hand.
20 The Zoom hand, that is, the virtual hand. Okay,
21 alright. Well, thank you. That concludes our
22 virtual testimony. And again guys, thank you again
23 for participating in our hearing on RAD. Again, this
24 is our fight to hold NYCHA accountable, and-- we have

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

somebody that raised their hand. Okay, that concludes our hearing. This meeting is adjourned.

[gavel]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date May 29, 2024