

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES AND
INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

----- X

November 29, 2018
Start: 1:18 p.m.
Recess: 4:00 p.m.

HELD AT: TWA Lounge
One World Trade Center, 86th Floor
New York, NY 10007

B E F O R E: PAUL A. VALLONE
Chairperson

JAMES G. VAN BRAMER
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Adrienne E. Adams
Inez D. Barron
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Peter A. Koo
Brad S. Lander
Mark Levine
Carlos Menchaca
Keith Powers
Donovan J. Richards
Carlina Rivera
Helen K. Rosenthal
Jumaane D. Williams
Joseph C. Borelli
Laurie A. Cumbo
Karen Koslowitz
Francisco Moya

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Fred Dixon, President & CEO, NYC & Company

Donna Keren, Senior Vice President & Head of
Research, NYC & Company

Matthew Bartlett, Executive Vice President of Asset
Management, New York City Economic Development
Corporation, NYCEDC

Jonathan Boles, Executive Director, Center for an
Urban Future

Tim Thompkins, Times Square Alliance

Melissa Diaz, Urban Museum of Natural History

Tom Ferrugia, Director of Governmental Affairs, The
Broadway League Appearing for: Charlotte St.
Martin, Brooklyn, President, Broadway League

Melissa Diaz, Director of Urban Affairs, American
Museum of Natural History

Vijay Dandapani, President, Hotel Association of New
York City

Rob Mccaan, Queens Economic Development Corporation

Aileen Fuchs, President & CEO of Snug Harbor
Cultural Center & Botanical Gardens, Staten Island

Alexandra Silversmith, Executive Director, Alliance
for Coney Island

Angela Sung Pinsky, Executive Director, Association
for a Better New York

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES AND
INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

4

[background comments/pause]

CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Okay, alright.

Welcome everybody to the EDC. Welcome ladies and gentlemen to our—yes welcome and thank you TWA.

We're going to start officially our Economic Development Committee hearing. [gavel] They are saying last call for boarding on the plane today as we go to City Hall. This is an exciting venue, and—and I think all the Council Members are—are excited to—to come here today, and talk about the green topic of tourism here in New York City. So, good afternoon and welcome. My name is Paul Vallone, and I have the privilege of co-chairing this hearing along with Jimmy Van Bramer, our chair of the Committee on Cultural Affairs, Libraries and International Intergroup Relations. I would like to extend my thanks to Council Members on both committees as well as the Administration for coming together for this hearing. I'd also like to thank the TWA for attempting to generously offer its true (sic) and classic space for us to discuss many of the issues on tourism in our great city. The topic of today's hearing is a direct result of our meeting held just this past September at the Offices of the Times

1
2 Square Alliance. I'd like to thank Council Member
3 Powers for spearheading that meeting, and inviting
4 myself and Council Member Van Bramer to help lead the
5 conversation with several of the cultural
6 institutions and urban planners that are seated in
7 front of us today. I would like to specifically
8 thank the Center for an Urban Future for putting
9 together their report Destination New York. They're
10 peeling back the curtain on the city's robust tourism
11 economy.

12 MALE SPEAKER: Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: The purpose of
14 today's hearing is to discuss the economic impact
15 that tourism has on our city, its rise over the last
16 several years, and the ways in which tourists
17 navigate the city's infrastructure to visit our
18 diversity of cultural attractions. It is also my
19 hope that we can further grow the EDC and the
20 committee's role in supporting funding and continue
21 the growth of our great tourism industry. When
22 tourists come to New York, they think of the iconic
23 skyscrapers, Broadway shows, our many museums,
24 galleries, restaurants and other institutions. The
25 centers sometimes are sometimes faced with

1 perpetually delaying everyone here, someone who tries
2 to change the infrastructure in non-existent or hard
3 to find signage with directions to guide them. While
4 we on the committees recognize the importance of
5 tourism dollars to the city's economy, it seems like
6 the Administration treats tourism as a blend of
7 several other industries, and does not measure income
8 or the tourism as it is distinct from other sectors
9 of our economy. We think this is an amazing job
10 plan. New York Work is slated to create 100,000 good
11 paying jobs across five industries over the next ten
12 years, but tourism is notably excluded. While the
13 New Works plan does development with employees in the
14 hospitality and food service sectors, those jobs
15 could cater just as easily to those residents as they
16 can to tourists. The city's official tourism
17 marketing organization New York City and Company
18 encourages tourists to visit New York City through
19 global marketing initiatives, and a membership of
20 nearly 2,000 based organizations. Despite New York
21 City being the largest tourism economy in the United
22 States with a total economic impact of \$65 billion
23 2013-2017, and an increase of 2.3 million visitors
24 over the last four years on record, the city only
25

1 allocates a mere \$21.2 million to New York City and
2 Company in its budget. That number has not changed
3 since at least Fiscal Year 2016. For comparison,
4 American cities that compete with New York for
5 tourism dollars such as Las Vegas, Orlando and Los
6 Angeles, they will spend significantly more on
7 tourism marketing, and when measured per capita to
8 cities like Denver out shine New York in their
9 tourism spending, it can challenge it. (sic)
10 Nonetheless, New York is a city increased in tourists
11 over the past 15 years. Since 2002, the total visits
12 to New York has nearly doubled and New York City and
13 Company projects that we are track with a record 65
14 million tourists this year. Often, then it strives
15 to accommodate this influx of tourism such as
16 expanding the city's hotel capacity, increasing jobs
17 in hospitality, retail and food services and making
18 long-term upgrades to the city's transit
19 infrastructure, more remains to be done. JFK and La
20 Guardia Airports consistently makes the monthly ten
21 worst (sic) airports in the nation both for flight
22 delays and passenger experience. Neighborhoods where
23 tourists congregate such as Hells Kitchen complained
24 about consistent overcrowding on the sidewalks and
25

1
2 pedestrian areas. When double decker tour buses
3 cross the streets in Manhattan blocking the flow of
4 traffic and disrupting the daily lives of New
5 Yorkers. Furthermore, there' limited reporting on
6 how the tourists spend their time and money while
7 visiting the city. While we have some general ideas
8 about the attractions and eateries that tourists tend
9 to visit, we now believe that there is more
10 information available with how tourism dollars that
11 are being spent, about the types of jobs and salaries
12 that New Yorkers have in the tourism section and
13 about the overall trajectory of tourism, the economic
14 impact in our city. For these reasons, I will go to
15 Council Member Powers and my Co-Chair Council Member
16 Van Bramer who sponsored Introduction 1236 and before
17 the committee today. Once again, this is a result of
18 the recommendations contained in the report released
19 by the Center for an Urban Future. This bill would
20 require that entities designated by the Mayor to
21 create a website that publishes information about the
22 impact of tourism on the city's economy. This will
23 be our very fist tourism economy dashboard. This
24 would include information about the tourist spending
25 by fellow visitors and residents in tourism related

1
2 industries as well as information about employment in
3 the tourism sector. It's also about we want this to
4 become the site that everything tourists visited or
5 used, current information on all of our great city's
6 attractions, show, events, and cultural institutions.
7 We hope today's discussion will provide an
8 opportunity to hear the Administration plans to
9 address these ongoing structural and transparency
10 concerns regarding the tourism industry, and what, if
11 anything, we as the Council could do to assist the
12 administration and making the city more accessible
13 and enjoy all places first. (sic) Before we begin,
14 I'd like to take a moment to acknowledge the City
15 Council Members who are here today. We have our Co-
16 Chair Council Member Van Bramer, Council Members
17 Menchaca, Adams, Borelli, Powers, Rosenthal, Moya,
18 Richards and Cumbo. I'd also like to thank the
19 Economic Development Committee staff, the Legislative
20 Counsel Alex Paulenoff; our Policy Analyst Henry
21 Forgione; our Finance Analyst Aliya Alli for their
22 hard work putting this hearing together. I'd also
23 like thank bill drafter Ghana Zilkha for turning
24 around this critical piece of legislation very
25 quickly, and finally, I'd like to reiterate my

1 sincere appreciation of Chris Beck's we've had today,
2 and Eric Karma (sic) and Gerard and the rest of the
3 team, the hotel team for giving us this chance to
4 hold this hearing and accepted by the accounting
5 study. I wanted to thank you for that. I think all
6 of the Council Members here are excited with being
7 here today. With that said, I'd like to turn it over
8 the floor to my Co-Chair Jimmy Van Bramer.

10 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Thank you.

11 Thank you very much, Council Member and Co-Chair
12 Vallone. It's been great this partnership with
13 Council Member Powers and yourself and myself. Thank
14 you, Council Member Powers for being such a—a leader
15 on this issue, and Council Member Vallone spoke
16 briefly about it. Let's all just take a moment to
17 take in the setting. [laughter] How different it is
18 from any other hearing that I've ever been a part of,
19 and Fred and you look like you should be having a
20 cocktail [laughter] bench, and it's not exactly the
21 typical witness stand that we're all associated with,
22 but this is great. So, thank you to the TWA Hotel
23 for giving us this opportunity, and obviously with
24 the partners on the legislation with Council Member
25 Vallone and Council Member Powers, but also on this

1 hearing and the meeting that we had a couple of
2 months ago indeed was important to all of use. I
3 want to just talk a little bit, of course, because
4 the call system and distribution about the
5 legislation I think is really critical, but as the
6 Chair of Cultural Affairs, it is incredibly important
7 that we recognize the indispensable role that culture
8 and the arts play in our tourism industry and, of
9 course, the greater economy of the city, and just
10 some thoughts on that. Having gone onto see a
11 Broadway play just this past Saturday The Lifespan of
12 a Fact written by Sunnysider Jeremy Kareken. If you
13 haven't already seen the Lifespan of a Fact, I would
14 encourage you to see that written by a Queens guy,
15 but we know that during the last 10 years on the
16 cultural institutions we saw an increase from 17.5
17 million in 2006 to 23.2 million visitors in 2016, and
18 we know it continues to grow, Broadway, the great
19 Broadway contributed more than \$12.6 billion to the
20 economy, and six million tickets or 6-2.5 Center fall
21 tickets, and the 2017-2018 Broadway season were
22 purchased by tourists showing that industry is one of
23 the greatest tourist attractions in New York City and
24 as I said because I think the last time we all met, I
25

1 had just gone to see Head Over Heels on Broadway, and
2 the number--

4 MALE SPEAKER: [interposing] And we do.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: --you do, you
6 know the gain by Broadway call. (sic) [laughter]
7 saying musical theater. At least some people know
8 you get that here. So, my husband and I sit there
9 and we listened to all of the assets of all of those
10 who are around you whether they're Italian or Dutch
11 or from the staff moving it west showing that just so
12 many people are coming to see Broadway shows and, of
13 course, our cultural institutions are from other
14 talents. Meanwhile, the cultural institutions
15 themselves including the Metropolitan Museum of Art,
16 the Whitney Museum of American Art, and MOMA reports
17 that 73% of their annual visitors are from tourists.
18 As a result of the increased tourism in Brooklyn and
19 Manhattan alone, employment at museums has increased
20 over 81% within the past 15 years, and the city's
21 arts and cultural institutions now attract visitors
22 in all five boroughs and, of course, Queens. Council
23 Member Vallone and I would agree is essentially the
24 center of the world or art. [background
25 comments/laughter]

1
2 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Too bad we had to
3 wait. (sic)

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Yeah,
5 Brooklyn was yesterday. [background comments/
6 laughter]

7 FEMALE SPEAKER: Hope you got support on
8 that. [laughter] So, I—I know so many members would
9 agree so ticket sales from institutions and, of
10 course, Broadway are not the only way that we support
11 the economy. The Museum and peer related jobs are
12 incredibly important, but so, too, is the food of the
13 local restaurants that host before and after dining
14 as well as the transportation industry, sightseeing
15 and tour with those buses, public transportation and,
16 of course, hotels. So, we know how important culture
17 and the arts are to this. We want to amplify that,
18 and I think our work on our legislation can only
19 help. The dashboard can only help us, but I want to
20 thank Jonathan Knowles and Senator Schumer (sic) for
21 all their groundbreaking work not just here, but of
22 course, District 74, and the reports on culture and
23 the arts and the libraries. It's just always our
24 right, and always talking about things that matter to
25 New Yorkers and the lives of New Yorkers like Tim

1
2 Tynes (sic) and Fred Dixon, and so many folks who
3 have done so much work over the years in these areas,
4 we thank them for their partnership, and lastly I
5 want to thank Matt Wallace, my Chief of Staff and
6 Jack Bernatovicz my Legislative Director; our
7 Committee Counsel Brenda McKinney; our Legislative
8 Policy Analyst, Christy Dwyer and our principal
9 Financial Analyst Aliya Ali for her amazing work on
10 our committee over the years, and with that, I will
11 hand it back over to my Co-Chair and I look forward
12 to Tim's and others very last testimony on [laughter]
13 I am very comfortable with the match.

14 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Alright, and I will
15 turn it over to—well, we've been joined Council
16 Member Carlina Rivera, and I'll just turn it over to
17 Council Member Keith Powers because I'm learning
18 about Intro 1276. Keith.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Yeah, it's about
20 time you they had me on the record. Thank you.
21 Yeah, they have it now. [background comments] There
22 we are. Thank you. It's good to see everybody
23 that's here. I want to thank Chair Vallone and Chair
24 Van Bramer for hosting this. We a few months ago and
25 many of you were there. Hosted a round table and we

1
2 all--this is Times Square Alliance and tours by the
3 different leaders from the tourism industry
4 throughout the city, but that was that those who work
5 in the city government around tour zones, cultural
6 institutions, hotels, BIDs. Some of you more that
7 are represented at that event, and that was an
8 opportunity to have a conversation about the way
9 forward, and we want you here, and we want to hear
10 from voices first in the ways of a report that was
11 mentioned earlier that talked about how tourism is
12 really essential to our economy here in New York
13 City. At that, we talked about the need for create a
14 comprehensive citywide tourism platform, and a plan
15 forward because while we have so many implicit Things
16 as part of the city's budget and--and our holds here
17 to--towards tourism, we think that something more
18 explicit would also be helpful and how it
19 demonstrated the value and the need for a--encouraged
20 and in courage investigate tourism. So, with that a
21 few months when I know I add to that Chair Vallone
22 and Chair Van Bramer's a mission to a hearing.
23 Little did we know we'd be sitting on the 86th Floor
24 having such a wonderful venue as--as that. I believe,
25 and this is the reason we have a bill here today,

1
2 that refers a real focus and to drive our economy, we
3 need to expand it beyond some of that kind of
4 destinations and reside in that beautiful Manhattan
5 Island and, of course, bring each other in part of
6 Manhattan where it is in today, and to the other
7 districts that are represented here today. To help
8 steer the city in that direction we have Bill Intro
9 1276 today that would create a sort of dashboard and
10 a report of tourism status around the city. That is
11 the recommendation that came right out of the
12 roundtable that we had. This is the vision on
13 tourism, jobs, trends and salaries in addition to
14 being shown metrics on the neighborhood and borough
15 bases that you need easier to identify potential
16 areas of job growth. We look forward to hearing the
17 testimony today on both the bill and also on the
18 measures and ways that we can make that bill work for
19 the city to be able to demonstrate the value around
20 tourism, and to create a broader tourism plan from
21 that data. We all I think believe is right and
22 growing part of New York City's economy. I'm glad
23 we're giving it the attention it deserves today. I
24 think Chair Vallone, I think it was that chose the
25 86th floor [laughter] but it is wonderful, but I

1 really want to say thank you to the stakeholders and
2 I do think this represents a good process. We bring
3 people in. We listen to them and we talk about it,
4 and then we try to forward with some plans on it.
5 So, I really thank the Chairs for putting that
6 process into place, and I want to thank everybody
7 here for being here. Thanks.

9 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank you,
10 Councilman, and I'm sure we would have it. I'm sure
11 we would have it. We got together and we listened.
12 You know, I always say listen and lead from there,
13 and that's what we did, and what's what today is all
14 about. So, I think we're giving—raise your right
15 hand. So, we're going to swear in our Executive Vice
16 President Matthew Bartlett. Please raise your right
17 hand. Do you swear or affirm to tell the truth, the
18 whole truth and nothing but the truth in your
19 testimony today and to respond honestly—honestly to
20 Council Members' questions?

21 MATTHEW BARTLETT: I do.

22 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Okay, you may
23 begin.

24 MATTHEW BARTLETT: Good afternoon, Chairs
25 Vallone and Van Bramer, and Members of the Economic

1
2 Development and Cultural Affairs Committees. My name
3 is Matthew Bartlett and I'm the Executive Vice
4 President of Asset Management at the New York City
5 Economic Development Corporation known as EDC. I'm
6 pleased to be here today to talk about the many ways
7 in which EDC's coffers contribute to New York City's
8 rich cultural experience for residents and for
9 tourists alike. After my testimony, I'll be glad to
10 take any questions that you may have. Every year New
11 York City welcomes more than six million visitors
12 from every corner of the globe. They come for our
13 premier cultural and historical attractions, from
14 Harry Potter on Broadway to Ellis Island, our
15 phenomenal food scene, which can be found in all five
16 boroughs, and iconic New York City sites such as the
17 Empire State Building and the Brooklyn Bridge, but
18 without question New York City continues to attract a
19 record number of tourists in part because of our
20 transportation systems, our infrastructure and our
21 iconic development process. As a steward of the
22 city's economy, EDC supports tourism in several
23 different ways. For example, Port NYC (sic) advances
24 the development of the city's passenger and freight
25 transportation terminals, which sustain the region's

1 economic growth. Through Port NYC, EDC manages
2 transportation infrastructure, which includes both
3 JFK and La Guardia's leases, the city's two cruise
4 terminals in Brooklyn and Manhattan and the Downtown
5 and East 34th Street Heliports. These pieces of
6 infrastructure are critical to ensuring that tourists
7 have multiple access points to New York City. What
8 we're seeing in the city's leases at JFK and
9 LaGuardia Airports is a tremendous undertaking. The
10 Port Authority is our tenant in those leases, and
11 they are responsible for the airports' day-to-day
12 operations. In 2012, we provided \$7 million in
13 financial incentives that made Jet Blue's expansion
14 at Terminal 5 possible. In 2016, we worked with the
15 Port Authority and MCR Development to secure
16 necessary approvals to allow the TWA Terminal to be
17 redeveloped into JFK's first airport hotel. We have
18 also consistently advocated for the full funding of
19 Next Gen Air, which is the Cap AA Land Proposal to
20 modernize the nation's air transportation system.
21 Once implemented, it will increase the safety,
22 efficiency, capacity, predictability and resiliency
23 of American aviation overall, and it would help ease
24 air congestion, and reduce flight delays at city
25

1
2 airports. EDC also oversees the Brooklyn and
3 Manhattan Cruise Terminals, which welcome over one
4 million visitors. This makes New York City one of
5 the largest cruise ports in the country. Port NYC
6 selected Ports America as the new operator for the
7 Cruise Terminals, which is slated to bring in over
8 \$58 million of private capital improvements allowing
9 our facilities to reach their full capacity. This
10 momentum also helped us secure a major commitment in
11 Norwegian Cruise Line, which guarantees that more
12 than six million of the line's passengers will visit
13 NYC Cruise Terminals over just the next decade. This
14 will cement New York's position as one of the
15 country's premier cruise ports. EDC estimates their
16 cruise industry accounts for hundreds of millions of
17 dollars in annual economic impact, and more than
18 1,000 full-time jobs. We are also contributing to the
19 visitor experience through NYC Ferry, which provides
20 an efficient, reliable and scenic public
21 transportation option all for the price of a subway
22 ride. Our ferry system also supports doc creation as
23 well as the neighborhood growth. Why NYC Ferry is
24 primarily used by New Yorkers, we did estimate that
25 nearly 20% of riders are tourists who seek to explore

1
2 New York City neighborhoods such as Sunset Park, Long
3 Island City, and Rockaway. Many of New York's
4 millions of tourists spend time shopping. EDC
5 recognizes that retail is an important source of jobs
6 for New Yorkers, and supports the growth of this
7 sector in several ways. Our recently completed City
8 Point Profits in Downtown Brooklyn brought over
9 650,000 square feet of retail space online, which
10 provide countless New Yorkers with job opportunities.
11 When completed, the Empire Outlets on Staten Island
12 will encourage tourists to take the Staten Island
13 Ferry to explore the North Shore of Staten Island.
14 Empire Outlets will have at least 50 retail shops,
15 and employ 1,200 New Yorkers many through HireNYC and
16 will certainly become one of the city's most
17 trafficked shopping destinations. EDC also supports
18 New York's greatest cultural legacy. Some of our
19 attractive cultural profits including facilitating
20 the Whitney's relocation from the Upper East Side,
21 the restoration of the Kings Theater in Brooklyn, and
22 helping the Chocolate Factory Theater find permanent
23 space. In 2015, the Whitney Museum opened as a
24 result of an extensive partnership between the city
25 and the Museum. The City provided a \$51.9 million

1
2 capital investment in the profits, and EDC derived
3 the technical assistance throughout the property's
4 (sic) section and its implementation. EDC also works
5 to create new cultural areas throughout the five
6 boroughs. For example, our investments in the
7 Brooklyn Cultural districts have solidified Fort
8 Green as a cultural area, anchored by the Brooklyn
9 and Manhattan Museums. In 2015, we completed a \$95
10 million restoration of the Kings Theater in Flatbush,
11 Brooklyn. The theater serves as a cultural open
12 pathways for economic growth in Brooklyn, and has
13 created over 100 full-time jobs. We also recently
14 helped the Chocolate Factory Theater on the
15 acquisition of their space in Long Island City. We
16 also provide support to what may be the most famous
17 New York attraction: Broadway. EDC leases ten
18 theaters in Times Square under a master lease
19 extending to 42nd Street. The non-profit established
20 and oversee their management and their
21 rehabilitation. The new 42nd Street was recently
22 able to leverage this lease into a sublease, and
23 secure \$100 million in investments to create an
24 immersive retail center at the Times Square Theater.
25 EDC also provides direct support to the new 42nd

1 Street with \$10 million in funding for theater
2 repairs just since 2009. More recently, we assisted
3 the Lear Theater and the Ambassador Theater Group in
4 the rapid transformation to bring Harry Potter and
5 the Cursed Child to New York City. EDC and the City
6 holds seats on the 42nd Street Historic Preservation
7 Committee, and that will be reviewed by our
8 surrounding Lear Theater, and create a more intimate
9 setting for Harry Potter, essentially building that
10 theater within a theater. We did our review and
11 collaborated with the Ambassador Theater Group to
12 make this happen on expedited basis. I said most of
13 today's testimony is speaking about our work and how
14 it contributes to tourist experience in New York
15 City. We are proud to support many of the city's
16 tourist related industries, recognizing the impact
17 tourism has on the city's economy, one could wonder
18 why we did not include tourism in our New York World
19 Jobs Line. The Jobs Line released last year
20 identifies industries that needed additional support
21 with aggressive interventions to grow and expand in
22 the city. The tourism industry in New York City is
23 thriving as a result of our rich cultural history, a
24 plethora of sightseeing attractions, and our unique
25

1
2 Urban Pathway. We are proud of our investments to
3 make our transit options more reliable, create more
4 retail experiences and improve our already
5 outstanding cultural attractions, all of which leads
6 to tourism. EDC recognizes the incredible law
7 enforcement to the city in addition to adding to the
8 vibrancy and dynamism of the city, they also spend
9 money at our restaurants, shop at our stores, sleep
10 in our hotels and travel our airports. We will
11 continue to make investments that enhance the tourist
12 experience as well as help New Yorkers who call the
13 city home. Thank you for your attention today, and I
14 will now answer any questions you might have.

15 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: I think we're going
16 to continue on with the panel.

17 FRED DIXON: So, that's a little bit.

18 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: So, next Dr. Donna
19 Keren, I think you're next, and kind of we will
20 consult with everybody at one time so you don't have
21 to worry about that. [background comments/pause]

22 LEGAL COUNSEL: Do you swear or affirm to
23 tell the truth, the whole truth?

24 FRED DIXON: Yes. We were out.

25 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Your testimony?

1
2 FRED DIXON: Prior to—prior to this, you
3 know, we provided it.

4 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: That's why we
5 always are handed it at the same time, and this way
6 you don't have to worry about giving it, and we won't
7 have to search for that. So, do you swear or affirm
8 to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but
9 the truth in your testimonies today, and to respond
10 honestly to the Council Members' questions?

11 FRED DIXON: Yes.

12 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Perfect

13 FRED DIXON: Thank you very much. Good
14 afternoon, everyone, Chairman Vallone, Chairman Van
15 Bramer, and to the members of the Committee on
16 Economic Development and the Committee on Cultural
17 Affairs, Libraries, and international Intergroup
18 Relations. My name is Fred Dixon, and I'm the
19 President and CEO of NYC and Company, and I'm joined
20 today by my colleague Donna Keren, Senior Vice
21 President and head of Research. Thank you for this
22 opportunity to share with you who we are and what we
23 do, and driving opportunities and the importance of
24 tourism. NYC & Company is the official destination
25 marking organization for the five boroughs of New

1
2 York City. Our mission is to maximize travel and
3 tourism opportunities with the city and our partners
4 and helping their way down in prosperity and
5 spreading the dynamite image of New York City around
6 the world. As a 501 (c) (6) private trade
7 association, we represent the interests of nearly
8 2,000 member organizations, and together, they fund
9 about half of our operations. We also hold the
10 procurement contract with the Department of Small
11 Business Services providing the city of New York a
12 certain tourism marketing services as well. As a
13 designation marketing organization and we use our in-
14 house resources and our global network of
15 representatives to drive both major and business
16 travelers in the five boroughs. Driven by its very
17 definition, it is an export business as we want to
18 bring new dollars into the market from outside, which
19 are exchanged locally for business services. We
20 complete-compete regionally, domestically and
21 internationally for visitors and their spending. To
22 generate inspiration and visit NYC, we create—curate
23 and promote constant on dozens businesses across the
24 five boroughs, and we recruit meetings, conferences,
25 conventions in churches as well as big events, which

1
2 draw higher spending leading an even that will last
3 year round. As part of global outreach, we work with
4 journalist and media outlets on five lines and tell
5 stories of New York City as an unparalleled multi-
6 cultural vibrant world class destination, and how do
7 we market you must see the world? Just one example
8 we recently launched the latest version of our global
9 tourism campaign: The Original New York City where
10 there is a farming tag line: New York City loves you
11 always. This campaign is designed reinforce New York
12 City's fundamental values of diversity and inclusion
13 along with its world class welcoming spirit and
14 marketing NYC is our job, and literally weeks of it.
15 Travel and tourism in New York City is performing at
16 varied levels. With 62.8 million visitors last year,
17 volume grew 3.8%, and has averaged 3.7% annual growth
18 over the last decade, which equals about 1.75 million
19 more visitors per year on average. Our visitors is
20 the key to this growth, and last year we saw \$44.2
21 billion spent across the five boroughs. Our Economic
22 Impact Study showed that it has been growing by
23 almost \$100 million a month or nearly \$1.2 billion a
24 year. The full angle impact of this industry is a
25 \$66 billion account engine we consider both direct

1
2 and indirect spending. Supporting the jobs of
3 392,000 people who collective earn almost \$26.4
4 billion a year. That's an average wage of \$67,300
5 across all sectors, and over the past 10 years this
6 industry has been one of the fastest growing across
7 the city's labor force adding 8,200 new positions in
8 2017 alone, and making it the city's proudest
9 employment sector of the city, and we're on track to
10 exceed these numbers in 2018. Jobs in the travel and
11 tourism sector cut across lodging, food and beverage,
12 transportation, shopping, and services, but jobs in
13 culture and entertainment are especially important
14 where activity and spending supported six out of ten
15 jobs in this sector. These were among some of the
16 higher paying positions across the city, but more
17 than 5,000-58,300 people earning an average wage of
18 \$71,000. However, this requires our still tourism
19 and hospitality workforce, and we have heard this
20 loud and clear from our industry through the years.
21 Therefore, we support the Department of Youth and
22 Community Development's Ladders to Leaders Program,
23 and work closely with the Department of Education's
24 Career and Technical Education Program. The
25 initiatives fill the town with a hotline of New

1
2 Yorkers from all walks of life for a successful—a
3 successful career in the tourism sector. New York
4 City is the most popular big city destination in the
5 U.S. and the top international destination by a large
6 market as well. With more than 50 million domestic
7 visitors and 13.5 million international travelers,
8 the city's cultural and arts organizations are
9 provided an interesting place, and the reasons people
10 visit here. After lodging and food, the daily
11 necessities whether you're visiting or living here,
12 help to entertain and pull the largest share of
13 spending by visitors to New York City. Last year's
14 spending by visitors on culture and entertainment
15 rose almost \$6 billion. Cultural spending by
16 visitors is money spent on theaters, museums, all
17 forms—all forms of live performance, zoos and
18 gardens, museums, and many historical and cultural
19 heritage sites around the city. While many are free
20 or a low and complimentary gift shops and dining
21 options benefit from the millions of visitors as
22 well. Let me share some data on cultural tourism
23 specifically. New York City logged over 30 million
24 cultural visitors in 2017, nearly half of the total
25 number of visitors, and that's up 17% from 2012.

1
2 International visitors in particular are more likely
3 to include cultural activities in their itinerary
4 than their American counterparts, and we'll see this
5 for a lot of emphasis on the international market
6 because of that. With the input of all the cultural
7 organizations and activities across the city, it's
8 often a primary reason for people visiting. Art and
9 culture in all of its forms as well as any of the
10 itineraries of connoisseurs and travelers alike, they
11 are part of the city's Cultural DNA as well, and also
12 the cultural activities constituted a vital part of
13 New York City's tourism sector, but they're meeting
14 in the neighborhoods and a festival or concert or
15 show or people visiting museum galleries to work site
16 or visiting the Botanic Gardens, they all fuel the
17 economy in general of New York City Tourism. From the
18 Bronx to Queens to State Island, it's a rich
19 environment of arts organizations, and it's at the
20 core of those popular tourist sections. This is in
21 addition to the battle that all these organizations
22 fight in the lives of residents, students and even
23 commuters to the city. As many recent economy
24 studies have shown, the cultural organizations in
25 many neighborhoods support the energy and prosperity

1
2 of small business around them. With this in mind, we
3 found that many neighborhood cultural organizations
4 and small businesses across the five boroughs were
5 not prepared to take advantage of the growing tourism
6 opportunities, and needed additional training and
7 support, and I am proud to say we met that need by
8 launching our very own Tourism Ready program. This
9 free program gives local businesses a better
10 understanding of how the tourist industry works, and
11 gives them the tools and know-how to increase free-
12 fall worker visiting groups, secure advance bookings
13 and build peak visiting-business and increase their
14 bottom line. We will be in our fourth year in this
15 programming in 2019 and approximately 550 small
16 businesses and arts organizations have taken
17 advantage of this free training. Let me share this
18 testimonial from Sandy Abushmae's (sp?) of Flushing
19 Town Hall: NYC and Company tours already this year
20 has done a really great job of beginning the process
21 that we fully expect that we got more attention to
22 the amazing tourism opportunities we offer in Queens.
23 We're especially appreciative of easy the process has
24 been. Any one who wants to participate and who is
25 willing to put in the time and effort because it does

1
2 take a lot of energy and focus, and helping us to see
3 that we can be much more effective through
4 collaboration rather than competition in this area.
5 Participating in the committees and meetings such as
6 Flushing Town Hall to our stronger connections to our
7 colleagues in other businesses, and ensure that our
8 network will be strengthened further. Finally, the
9 hands-on personal attention that our team delivers
10 has really helped us understand the tourist trade
11 more deeply, made us more comfortable with the
12 process of tourism and poised us to give our best to
13 the project in a way we believe will be tremendously
14 beneficial to Flushing and Queens overall. This is
15 just a taste of what we do at NYC & Company.
16 Additionally, now we are the city's big venture, but
17 we working closely with EDC in bidding for large
18 event like the Super Bowl and all these All-Star
19 games at La Vie, the WW USA and the target of
20 activity. People do come from around the world to
21 watch our slate, and to beat the World Cup in 2026,
22 which is going to be incredibly exciting, and I'm
23 fully expecting New York to be front and center for
24 2026. It's going to be an amazing time. For the
25 first time we—we will host World Pride in conjunction

1
2 with the 50th Anniversary of the Stonewall Uprising
3 here in New York City. We're going have 3 million
4 people in June of 2019 alone, and that is a big deal
5 for all of us. We preserve the New York City brand
6 and manage lessons, and bring lessons and agreements
7 for the city agencies like FDNY, NYPD and also police
8 those brands with them around the world. Another
9 important area of our organization is research where
10 we track bureau presentation and develop industry
11 liaisons. Particularly where it's angling our
12 visitor volume and spending. So, it's travel
13 behavior, tracks and how it may impact the industry
14 to the customer search and key remarks because of
15 their sublets. We sat before this leader of
16 proprietary forecasting and statistical tracking
17 models to inform RFP as choosing planning decisions,
18 and these tools held positions in local travel and
19 tourism industry in terms of market size and grown
20 and sustainability, challenges and opportunities and,
21 of course, travel our affinity for New York City.
22 Ultimately, the way the modeling is done is report to
23 typical zone on an annual basis, and it would take a
24 number of inputs to make their name go high. We also
25 report to the members who benefit as well to our

1
2 members that invest in our organization, and as an
3 example of we recall, we would like to show you our
4 latest tourism update and examples of our economic
5 impact and cultural tourism fact sheets, and going
6 forward we would have these report with you on an
7 annual basis. We're very excited about this
8 legislation, and I look forward to working with the
9 two committee Chairmen and Council Member Powers on
10 the—and the respective today's staff as well as our
11 partners at EDC, ECLA assessing research methodology
12 and feasibility of the bill. In our reading reports
13 the majority of that requested at the moment does not
14 exist or is not really available. So there is a lot
15 of work that we will have to do ahead of us, and
16 furthermore there are other issues with the privates
17 and non-profit we cannot qualify with corporations to
18 amend(sic) certain data, and along with that it's
19 going to come out of the private sector. Again,
20 though we do look forward to assessing this with—with
21 you all and data. Now, the tourism industry, as—as
22 you've heard, and I hope you will leave today
23 comfortable knowing it is a win. I'm proud of the
24 role NYC & Company play in these successes and we
25 value your support in the tourism industry and I

1
2 thank you for allowing me this time to share all of
3 our successes in calling New York City as the most
4 popular city destination in the United States and I'm
5 happy to answer any questions you have for me.

6 BRIE BARAKA: Greetings Chair Van Bramer,
7 Chair Vallone and members of the Committee. My name
8 is Brie Baraka (sic) and I'm the General Counsel at
9 the Department of Cultural Affairs. Thank you very
10 much for the opportunity to testify before you. Can
11 you hear me?

12 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Yes.

13 BRIE BARAKA: Yes. Okay. The City of New
14 York has a long history of supporting cultural
15 institutions starting with the Yankee Century
16 Partnership that has profoundly shaped our cultural
17 landscape. The deals that the city is provided land
18 and additional financial support. In exchange
19 private groups would rush in covering both art and
20 science with attorneys over this publicly accessible
21 cultural institution. The organization, the pioneers
22 model in the 1970s was Metropolitan Municipal Art and
23 the Museum of Natural History. Nearly 150 years
24 later, these two organizations decentral and knowing
25 the business annually. Clearly, the relationship

1
2 between the city and institutions has become a pillar
3 of viability to attract people from the environment.
4 (sic) This early partnership has grown to include
5 the 33 members of the Cultural Institutions Group or
6 CIG. They represent the Weingarten Centers, the
7 zoos, museums and multi-disciplinary speakers in all
8 five boroughs. Together, they were two organizations
9 that attracted over 23 million visitors last year.
10 They continue to invest in this remarkable
11 partnership with both expense and capital support
12 were available. Under the Administration the city
13 allocated \$78.4 million in capital funding to the
14 American Museum of natural History near Gilder Center
15 for Science, Education and Innovation. We've also
16 invested \$54 million in the Studio Museums New Owner
17 Harlem by the new chapter and it's according to its
18 history, and the city has best support, which was
19 operating and energy costs is at a record high.
20 Today, the general support for culture goes far
21 beyond the CIG as around 1,000 non-profit
22 organizations received program funding each year.
23 Earlier this year so far, I have a partnership with a
24 local Arts Council that reach thousands more. A
25 longstanding collaborative of City Council and

1
2 providing this funding fostered unprecedented levels
3 in the city's work for art and culture. To an
4 itinerary of damaged booths to major museums, these
5 organizations form the background in the cultural
6 factor and makes New York special powerful job for
7 everyone. (sic) As New York City and Company
8 indicated in their testimony, over 30 million people
9 visited our city specifically for culture. This is a
10 direct result of the amazing work being done by the
11 non-profit cultural organizations to see how they
12 work. Under Mayor de Blasio, we made major
13 investment in our city's cultural infrastructure
14 equaling \$200 million in this fiscal year alone. In
15 addition, the America-to A.N. Lineage (sic) and
16 Studio Commute Project in Manhattan, that I mentioned
17 earlier, the projects supported by this funding
18 include Staten Island, and they need \$3.1 million to
19 upgrade the Staten Island Children's Museum 40-year-
20 old heating, ventilation and air conditioning for
21 some increasing operating efficiency and improving
22 visitor experience. In both ways populated on Ocean
23 Wonders Chart at the New York Aquarium in Coney
24 Island in June, this extraordinary universe (sic) is
25 an example of \$100 million in city funding. Well,

1
2 with that, I don't have any, but New Yorkers have the
3 major new advance that will allows visitors
4 especially young visitors to get their hands dirty
5 and learn more about their culture. (sic) Mayor de
6 Blasio is planning openly of the Academy early this
7 year, and just that month he announced \$1.9 million
8 in new capital funding for the Louis Armstrong House
9 Museum in Queens to support the renovation of Selma's
10 House the, the back doors of the jazz based former
11 home alongside the new education center and jazz
12 clubs on the street also being supported by city
13 funding. This is part of growing cultural candidates
14 that will bring visitors and revenue to our
15 communities. Even that is under her argument to make
16 sure that the many benefits of culturocity is
17 economic, social, educational and more. Our
18 experience like all New Yorkers to create Adam D.
19 Caldwell fans so we can drive 117, get a new focus of
20 energy spewed out of this. Since early Google fans,
21 we've had these signed by individual artists who did
22 grants for cultural organizations and underserved,
23 small organizations back to the large organizations
24 that draw visitors and provide thousands of good jobs
25 rather than from adoptive. Ibarra Holly Iraki from

1
2 the NDC in order to encourage the order to explore
3 their city and support global institutions. Cultural
4 activity has to be in every corner of the city. In
5 addition to providing hearts for activity that would
6 go to your local economy, there are special to the
7 vibrancy that makes New York so prominent in world
8 imaginations. As our partners at NYC & Company
9 demonstrated, there in-depth research is by probably
10 translated into huddle numbers of business. These
11 business special tickets to the house that will
12 supply them, and he draws businesses that are back in
13 the turning (sic) zones. We believe that art and
14 culture are important to the community and to New
15 York these identities are cause it to be a problem.
16 Tea board (sic) economies continue across our state
17 and our kids are unparalleled—are unparalleled our
18 cities themselves. Also initiatives and seekers
19 often don't spend other measures and the impact they
20 have on the local economy. EFAM shows just literally
21 organizations are on New York's economy. For
22 instance, 2017-2018 saw the hair season and highly
23 attended and highly stressing dangerously points of
24 outdoors. (sic) This is actually 13.8 million
25 attendees and \$1.7 billion into deals. I try to say

1 clean of art down at Lincoln Center a member of the
2
3 CIG, who contributed \$2.4 billion to the city's
4 economy over the course of the 2014-2015 season.
5 There is \$670 million spending by a lot of report
6 terms, Lincoln Center, of course. I was told all
7 these numbers indicated by Lincoln Center was a very
8 important reason for their gift to New York City.
9 Finally, business to the Met Museum in the summer of
10 2015 generated \$946 million in spending. A single
11 exhibition by Randal Rochelle earlier this year
12 attracted over 700,000 visitors. It's clear that
13 these cultural institutions are cornerstones, the
14 latter speaking cords in the fire, and all that, I
15 came back to him and made sure I voted. Commissioner
16 Finkelpearl was thrilled join Chair Van Bramer just
17 five months at Flushing Town Hall to announce our
18 largest every city allocation for Culture to a very
19 \$200 million in the current budget. This provides
20 staples to workers at CIG and the Cultural
21 Development Fund and then to create New York City, it
22 also can but it is substantial increases for
23 organizations and under-served communities both one
24 came back to our table, ongoing partnership with
25 major institutions and the increased support from

1
2 small and mid-size organizations, better help for
3 community activity. We're also committed to
4 supporting the individual artist who are special to
5 New York's creative economy. Art plans for artists
6 who are both are assembled artists that have three
7 times what they were at the start of the de Blasio
8 Administration. We also remain committed to building
9 affordable work space for artists in partnership with
10 our R. Harvey (sic) and New York City EDC. Thank you
11 for the opportunity to highlight these budget matches
12 between the city's cultural needs for them and you
13 all. If you have any concerns, Susan will answer
14 them. (sic)

15 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Is there anyone
16 else testifying? Alright, I think we reached our
17 cruising answer then. [background comments/laughter]
18 about Pennsylvania. I think you can see just by your
19 testimony already how important this is to us as a
20 Council, a city in going forward and we thank you for
21 the testimony and the insight, the industry has—maybe
22 hasn't had the chance to literally share that insight
23 for it, and that's why we thank the advocates coming
24 and different reports that are done, and there are
25 ways that different terminals are participating now

1
2 because of because they and how we've grown their
3 city and company and how EDC's role is a partner and
4 leader in this and there's so many of us. There are
5 so many Council Members on this committee, and it's
6 always my custom to ensure the Council Members have a
7 chance to speak first. I always make sure that we
8 acknowledge the Council Members of Lander and Barron
9 have joined us. I think that a good way to start is
10 just repeating this tourism in the New York. How do
11 you see tourism as an economic generator in New York
12 City?

13 MATTHEW BARTLETT: Thank you for
14 investing. We definitely agree that that tourism is
15 an important economic generator for the city. What
16 we think about tourism is an extremely strong for the
17 city right now, and we work with third or fourth on
18 the list for if I believe correctly. I'd to defer to
19 the President.

20 FRED DIXON: Yes, it is by—depending how
21 it's measured, it's the sixth largest in the city. Is
22 that right?

23 DONNA KEREN: And jobs.

24 FRED DIXON: And jobs.

25

1
2 DONNA KEREN: In the way we measure the
3 economic impact, as we mentioned \$66 Billion. We are
4 a city in which many industries including the
5 financial services and real estate sector operated in
6 a much higher level per item and per project cost
7 than what an individual visitor or a collection of
8 visitors might send. We have focused much of our
9 monitoring in terms of size and relative growth, in
10 terms of the size of the employment sector, and that
11 growth and that wage structure, the majority of the
12 work is present. It's been mentioned the average
13 wage is earned in the industry is actually above the
14 median household income for the city of New York.
15 So, these are overall very good jobs, and need them
16 and unionized and they are located in all five
17 boroughs. So, in terms of direct employment and what
18 we call indirect employment, the provision of
19 additional services, wholesale input as well as jobs
20 ta restaurants, museums, transportation services and
21 so on that are in all our boroughs.

22 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Well, since you
23 mentioned the jobs, are we up to speed with those
24 jobs, Ladders to Leaders and the other programs that
25 the city is trying to generate so that we can have a

multiple of students coming into this field and this
great opportunity is right in front of my hand.

FRED DIXON: We agree with you, and we
want to see all of those great jobs go to our best
workers right here at home. We said in that we would
were recruiting from outside New York City and that's
an area that we have invested in and we will continue
to do more, and—but as the marketing organization, we
really defer to our colleagues at EDC and—and other
agencies with our workforce development specifically,
but we have empowered internships, externships and
partnerships amongst our 2,000 members companies to
take on a series for my four in the CITE Program as
well, and we'll need to expand that even more. We
just had our fundraiser last night for our
foundation, which is a separate 501(c)(3) that we run
and raising money, and one of the things that we want
to do in the future is that we want to invest more in
scholarships and in workforce development
opportunities. So, that is something that we look
forward to—to talking more about.

CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Well, that
relationship is only I mean the universal running

1
2 year. So, how does the relationship work between
3 your company and EDC?

4 MATTHEW BARTLETT: EDC. So, it's
5 already—it's a workforce development. This is like
6 okay and just in general yeah. So, we cooperate on—on
7 a number of issues as they often manage the assets
8 for things like cruise tunnels for example. We work
9 very closely with and in terms of promoting the
10 cruises, and since New York has become one of the
11 fastest growing cruise ports in the country. We take
12 a lot of folks by surprise. Everyone though oh,
13 Miami, Fort Lauderdale, but it is due to their
14 investments and the attractiveness I think of the
15 destination, and you cannot discredit the enormous
16 amount of people that live in our region. There are
17 client target phone cruise lines.

18 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Even in with the
19 ferries. I mean you come here with your demand. Ever
20 passenger is trying to expand the ferry system.

21 MATTHEW BARTLETT: It's a great point.

22 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Folks around here
23 and some agencies it's such as success at this point.

24 MATTHEW BARTLETT: It is. It is a huge
25 success, and we encourage visitors to use it as well

1
2 and more often times because we know New Yorkers need
3 those ferries to get to and front work to allow a
4 person they can use that in the morning and the
5 evening, but in between when the ferries are less
6 occupied it's a great one. It's a great resource.

7 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: So, the
8 collaboration with EDC went on through the expansion
9 on something within the marketing program on using
10 the ferries and using the different destination
11 points. How is that collaboration on it?

12 MATTHEW BARTLETT: I did hear the
13 question. We definitely spent a lot of time
14 coordinating with NYC & Company. Because the tourism
15 industry is doing so well, we've really looked to
16 them as a guide for trying to figure out some of the
17 strategies or assets, and we serve to kind of support
18 what's going on in the assets especially in the
19 cruise terminals as we mentioned, and also in Pier 94
20 and Basketball City, in the Brooklyn Cruise Terminal
21 where we set Formula E and also had mayors from
22 different cities around the country come to the Smart
23 Cities Conference at Basketball City, and so we spent
24 a lot of time talking with our colleagues at NYC &
25 Company, and really look to them to help guide us

1
2 with the data piece, the strategy piece and we served
3 to support that with managing the assets.

4 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: So, you're looking
5 to grow the—the budget and timing from a regionally
6 effort with New York City and Company we feel that
7 the amounts of economic generators coming as part of
8 this hearing is that we should be excited with all of
9 the budget entities you see over with tourism, and we
10 believe it's such a viable part of everything that's
11 happening in the city. We want to see that grow.

12 Are there any plans on growing the budget you're your
13 company?

14 FRED DIXON: We definitely agree with the
15 questions, and we're trying to grow tourism. The way
16 that we do it, I think we see in general is to invest
17 in the infrastructure, in the transportation, in the
18 funding they bring to this program, that we have with
19 the Department of Cultural Affairs, and continue to
20 make it a city that has an economy that is booming.

21 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: And how do we trust
22 that? How do we know what's coming next? What's—
23 what's the line and maybe the structure upgrades that
24 are coming in a new benefit?

25 FRED DIXON: The same thing—

1
2 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Well, if we're
3 going to have—if we're going to have the princess of
4 vegan help with infrastructures and help volunteers
5 and residents to get through participating in this in
6 this entry way with EDC's plan to better the
7 infrastructure that was the entry point whether it's
8 the ferry, whether it's in the trains or it's the
9 house?

10 MATTHEW BARTLETT: So, thanks for the
11 question. We definitely have a lot of different
12 plans across the entire city for all the
13 infrastructure, and incidentally, I was very
14 supportive of things like tourism. So, as was
15 mentioned before we have leases with the Port
16 Authority on the airports, and through that we
17 advocate to them for improvements in that
18 transposition and-

19 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: [interposing] Yes,
20 is that working because I think one of the things
21 that we will learned at the hearing or meeting was
22 the first impact people get when they get off a
23 plane, when they get off a train, when they get off
24 of a cruise ship is not the best. You know, we want
25 to make it just like when we go on vacation and we go

1
2 some place, the first thing you see should not be off
3 your feet, and that's what--what's happening now is
4 this is clearly a young person who sees that and has
5 speed on it. (sic) This is a good example of the
6 future, but when you do want to know what your
7 planned budget to make that entry point, it's
8 something that a tourist in some of the city would
9 say wow, I wanted that.

10 MATTHEW BARTLETT: I-I think that's a
11 good question, and we share the goal. I think we
12 really have to deal with it on a case-by-case basis.
13 So, for example, in the cruise terminals I think as a
14 point for clarification at least in Manhattan, we're
15 finding that the surveys are a very positive in terms
16 of people coming into the cruise port, and that's new
17 thing. It's based on lots of effort that we put
18 forward there. I've been dealing with the cruise
19 lines personally. Even today I'm getting rave
20 reviews for how much improvement that has made. In
21 the airports, as we said before, it-it-we agree with
22 the Center for an Urban Future that these great
23 starts as soon as someone comes into the airport, and
24 we've been advocating as I said in my testimony for
25 Next Gen Air, which is an FAA initiative. But truly,

1
2 our goal I in advocating to the tenant who has
3 control over that, which is the Port Authority, and
4 with ferries, I think our surveys indicated that
5 there is one of the most beloved customer experiences
6 that New Yorkers and forester ally. So, we're very
7 proud of that, but I think it's—it's useful to talk
8 about each one because there's different levers, and
9 that's why we look to an entity like NYC & Company to
10 help us coordinate the often time complicated
11 experience of tourists coming in from varying and
12 different areas, and our role is to serve with them,
13 and then also with Cultural Affairs in helping their
14 real estate portion of, and the final portion, which
15 is more our areas of expertise, support the visions
16 and strategies that they have.

17 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Well, I think you
18 mentioned them as a role as tenant Port Authority at
19 the airports. I would think we had greater ability
20 to just more than that take it to our tenants, if
21 they are our tenants, actually make a request that
22 the advocates who are here today, someone could deal
23 with it. It might be something else we can explore
24 going forward as to not just being—we sit back and
25 wait and see what airports are going to do for their—

1
2 for their plan on what they're doing in La Guardia,
3 and Jay said he was putting in stakes pronto, and you
4 guys have a great say, and I think is the type of
5 forum exactly where we can fit Italian folks as are-
6 it's out of our hands because it's a the AAR (sic)
7 Estate. No, we think this is the perfect way we can
8 get into the conversations what's happening in these
9 airports, what's happening in expansions or what the
10 role is going to be, the woeful impact, and how it's
11 going to help tourism. I—we get it back to the
12 table.

13 MATTHEW BARTLETT: I—I think we agree
14 with that, and I did not mean to imply by anything
15 that I said that we were sitting back and doing
16 nothing. We are very strongly advocating, and in
17 some of that advocacy, we have been able to get
18 some changes to happen, and including support by
19 topics of the airports Next Gen. With something
20 like the cruise terminals because we have the
21 opportunity to redo those leases recently with all of
22 your support. We were able to put in place new
23 things that we did not or our predecessors I guess
24 had not followed at the time as—as some of the goals

1 were changing, and we are certainly happy to sit down
2 and look at that for that for the airports with you.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: It's a long thing,
5 and my last question and I'll turn it over to the
6 chair is when we're seeing the advocates, what are
7 their direct impacts to whether it's Midtown or lines
8 in the Broadway Theater is the quality of life that
9 is surrounding theaters and generally about that.
10 What is your role in helping coordinate the quality
11 of life that's so dependent on the tourist experience
12 in a round number which is Times Square, but for the
13 rest of the city.

14 MATTHEW BARTLETT: The—the question is
15 what is EDC's role in supporting quality of life
16 around the city?

17 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Or coordinating
18 with NYPD or expanding the amount of budget that we
19 have for local security detail? What is the future
20 for—we talked about at that—that meeting at the stage
21 and we didn't create any kind of budget just for a
22 tourism time of officers that could be a visible help
23 to not only tourism, New York City, too as to where
24 things are, is the safest group? Did you put the
25 most trusted forms of—of attractions I could use?

1
2 There needs to be more of their notices on helping
3 the visitors and provides this economic impact, and
4 giving them the tools to be able to handle the daily
5 quality of life issues that they encounter or as we
6 encounter in the city?

7 MATTHEW BARTLETT: So, it's—it's a good
8 question. We agree it's important. I think there
9 are some things I know that are very specifically
10 kind of slated around that. That team has been
11 involved with I believe, but I think I want to turn
12 the question to the President, and want him to help
13 me to discuss it more specifically.

14 MATTHEW BARTLETT: Thank you. It's a
15 great question and we agree with you, and feel very
16 strongly that the things that happen in everyday New
17 Yorkers lives are the things that also impact
18 districts. It's the things they care about, things
19 like infrastructure and transportation and quality of
20 life, and as that is improved, we see tourism
21 improve. One of the greatest things that ever—that
22 helped tourism grow over the last many years was that
23 we need to come to such a state of the city, and that
24 resonates, you see almost tracking together the—the
25 lowering of the—of the crime rate with the growth in

1
2 tourism. So, it goes to counter a lot of the public
3 perception that comes that from movies and television
4 over the past. You might think you grew. It wasn't
5 necessarily—it wasn't necessarily our best friend in
6 some of the situations. So, there are a lot of
7 gaping points there, and we have to get them back for
8 our members with—with the city and better
9 organizations, you know, issues around you get
10 tellers on the street for example, and other issues
11 that in terms of way finding we agree. We think
12 there's—there's more options there, and it's
13 something we would—we would be happy to explore as
14 well.

15 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: I'd like to turn it
16 over to our Co-Chair Jimmy Van Bramer.

17 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Thank you very
18 much. Yes, people it's great. So, first of all,
19 thank you all for being here and for your testimony.
20 I do want to say as the Chair of Cultural Affairs it
21 is absolutely wonderful to have a hearing like this
22 that amplifies just how important we are to the city
23 of New York, how important the Department of Cultural
24 Affairs is to New York and how important our cultural
25 organizations and the institutions are. When you

1
2 look at the numbers as market profile in terms of
3 culture and—and the arts, it should be a signal to
4 every policymaker, every boss or leader in the city
5 of New York that we should be increasing the level of
6 support for culture and the arts, and I get that we
7 should be increasing support for your organization.
8 Because they are read, and they should be linked to
9 the turn of billions of dollars, and—and we know that
10 when culture and the arts was strong people come, and
11 New York City grows, and not just a little bit. It's
12 not just a great budgetary (sic) amount. It's not
13 just pretty pictures of the wall or great dancers on
14 the stage. It's 30 million people coming to the city
15 of New York almost exclusively for culture and the
16 arts, and generating billions and billions in revenue
17 and making sure that tens of thousands of people have
18 jobs. It is so vitally important. It leads me to a
19 question about your organization's like the—your
20 budget is a little bit smaller than some other
21 cities, you know, and just as the Department of
22 Cultural Affairs I'm sure would welcome another \$200
23 million in funding for the arts. [laughter] So, I'd
24 like to call the state of funds up. So, when we go
25 and do that is done, and that affirmation, we'll tell

1 you're late or like it just happened and then check
2 your budget, and talk to me about your budget. These
3 are the other cities because your—you just said
4 you're competing for a lot with other cities to bring
5 folks here. We know what happens when you bring
6 people very successfully, what does that mean and
7 then are there budgets, your marketing budget? What
8 does that look like and shouldn't it be increased?

10 MATTHEW BARTLETT: Well, thank you for
11 the question and we—we agree with the line of
12 conversation absolutely. We always would like to
13 talk about additional resources. It is a competitive
14 world. It's more competitive today than it's ever
15 been before because other cities, I mean localities
16 will end to the reality of tourism as a strong engine
17 for their communities, and so you see people
18 beginning to invest more and more. And I believe as
19 a—as a part of the Tourism Association we have been
20 able to—to manage the city funds effectively. So, I
21 am proud of that work there, and also I'm proud of
22 the fact that we've—we've acquired more supports.
23 So, we have our membership as well, and we have world
24 partners that are coming to the table to support our
25 programs, and culture and arts are rather in the

1
2 forefront of that for a number of reasons. And to
3 your point, culture and arts are great if you can
4 discover the neighborhoods. You know, there's two
5 ways getting people to explore. One have been
6 proven. You're selling all the things you—and also
7 arts and culture, and we see it at great exhibitions
8 whether it's the Brooklyn Museum or the Queens
9 Museum, any time there's lot of--or exhibition at any
10 time, you see visitation grow. So, in terms of—in
11 terms of the budget, we absolutely—we're growing the
12 conversation. The destination is a little bit
13 different. People often compare us to Las Vegas, but
14 the devil is always in the details. Las Vegas also
15 manages their Convention Center. So, there—of their
16 \$200 million a significant portion of that goes to
17 funding and operating the buildings. So, every
18 locality is a little bit different in that way, and
19 I'm really proud of the work that our team has done
20 in amplifying the property that we do have, and I'm
21 sure we'll be able to have those conversations with
22 everyone's support at the right moment to just see
23 what we can do for the future.

24 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: So, we talked a
25 little about infrastructure and its impact here. We

1
2 also talked a lot about tourism going to boroughs
3 other than Manhattan as wonderful as Manhattan is,
4 and—and this is a serious questions. The 7 Train in
5 Queens is an impediment for a lot of people. If—if-
6 if you follow social media at all, and you know how
7 difficult that train and other trans can be, and
8 it's—it's the 7 Train is the rout to get to Flushing
9 Meadows-Corona Park and the Queens Museum, and the
10 Queens Theatre, and the Queens Zoo, and so many of
11 the other amazing institutions, it doesn't concern
12 either of you in particular, and EDC maybe more
13 specifically about—obviously it's—it's the MTA and
14 actually the transit, but—but you've got to have a
15 piece of this, right, and how do we talk about mass
16 transit, the 7 Train in particular, and this is a
17 specific example and how that impacts people's
18 ability to get to and from those places that we all
19 want people to go to. It's just as important for
20 folks to see Flushing Town Hall, and if he's all the
21 way down in Holland Point, but they've got to be able
22 to get there, and people talk and they look at social
23 media all the time, and if all they're reading is the
24 7 train doesn't work, then they may forego the effort

1
2 to use those neighborhoods and those cultural
3 institutions.

4 MATTHEW BARTLETT: Thank you, Council
5 Member. We definitely agree in terms of trying to
6 improve transportation and across the entire city.
7 We have also seen the issues with the 7 Train and we
8 are at least some of us will do improvements that
9 continue to progress, but also--

10 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: [interposing] This
11 is the first week that we've had EDC's lead attending
12 to that, but we as members--

13 MATTHEW BARTLETT: [interposing] Yes,
14 it's--it is managed by the MTA, and we are dedicated
15 at EDC to--to continue to explore all transportation
16 options, and transportation is a critical art of
17 economic development and, of course, for tourism as
18 well.

19 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: It's just got to
20 be all of our concern, and--and so I wanted to ask a
21 little bit about the legislation. Maybe Council
22 Member Powers is going to talk a little bit more in-
23 depth about it, but your--your--I read your concerns,
24 and--and so you're one thing in particular. We
25 addressed it, but just as this hearing is amplifying

1 the importance of-of tourism and in particular remind
2 us of the cultural tourism, it gets us all to focus
3 about and our--and think about it more. The Report
4 obviously stirred all of this. The-the dashboard
5 seemed to be a part of that continuum, right?
6 Getting us to-to drill down even further, and think
7 about this and we inform public-public policy in
8 funding. So, talk a little bit about maybe all of
9 you, what you think the merits of the Dashboard would
10 be, and then-and then maybe just a little bit, and
11 I'm sure Council Member Powers will talk more about
12 this, but your concerns for about the inability to
13 get the data. We would have some experience to be
14 able to get data like this, and there are a lot of
15 willing partners in industries that I would think
16 would want to provide some of this data. So-so a few
17 questions, and everything and I'll leave it at just
18 this.

19
20 MATTHEW BARTLETT: Yeah, I'd be happy to
21 go first. Thank you for the question, and I'll defer
22 to my colleague Donna Keren on the segues because
23 she's the expert obviously in this area. Really to
24 do more research is always a good thing, and that's
25 something that we are constantly looking at. As a

1
2 part of the Trade Association, we do commission
3 research and go into more detail from a variety of
4 sources. Often times that is—is made available by
5 home and buying a subscription, and those
6 subscription terms don't allow us to share it. So,
7 we needed to guide our—our decision making and our
8 strategies, but many of the sources are—are—we're
9 unable actually to make those public because a lot of
10 the data sources are private. We have had a
11 challenge in getting information from—from Department
12 of Industry in the past, and particularly the
13 culturals. I mean that's a venue we can work on in
14 terms of sharing a lot of that data because it is—it
15 is an important metric and it will—it will guide us
16 more, but I'm going to defer to Donna to say a little
17 bit more about that, about the Dashboard and when we
18 have this behind. How—how can we get to—to more
19 data, more regularly, and that is—that is a
20 challenge. We'd love to have more data on what's
21 happening today.

22 DONNA KEREN: Thank you. Thank you for
23 the lovely comment on our Cultural Visitor Fact
24 Sheet. There is a great deal of work from our team
25 and the vendors and suppliers that we work with.

1
2 Fred Dixon, and he cited in his remarks that much of
3 the data we are able to share is only provided on an
4 annual basis. We use a number of proxy variables to
5 take the temperature during the middle of the year.
6 Hotel for us is provided to us on a weekly basis on
7 this assertion that we purchase from a vendor named
8 STR. We are buying the contract not able to release
9 that publicly when those conversations we have
10 internally. We also rely very heavily on the very
11 valuable data that the lead, the Barclay (sic) Lead
12 provides publicly every week. Again, given the
13 percentage of visitors to Broadway, it's a very good
14 barometer let's call it for what is happening in the
15 city on a more timely manner. In order to know how
16 many visitors, where they go, what they do, we are
17 dependent upon purchasing national syndicated
18 research studies, and the timing on that is basically
19 it's annual. We will get the final results in 2018,
20 sometime between March and June of 2019, at which
21 point our team will sit and compile the report
22 they're looking at, and bring it together with our
23 forecast modeling and a variety of other indicators.
24 We just as a shorthand list, the U.S. Department of
25 Commerce and can travel to the Tourism Office, and

1
2 can shift with tourism economics. It means if you
3 travel and focus right and data research, U.S. travel
4 Association destinations, international travel style,
5 EFT Consulting, the Commerce Board and others, and
6 that's just a sampling of data. Some of it comes in
7 monthly. Some of it comes in annually, and our job
8 is to put it together in a profile that allow the
9 industry to think about where they're going, and what
10 they need to be focused, and to help us with our data
11 driven working strategy. As a data person, I would
12 be ecstatic to put together a dashboard. As a
13 practical researcher, a little challenge to think
14 where the data are going to come from, but I'm happy
15 to continue the conversation.

16 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: We'll take that in
17 here. [laughter] That would be nice.

18 FRED DIXON: Just to follow on with the
19 Council Member's question, we—as I think I've said in
20 response, tourism is really important to us as an
21 industry. We have a monthly economic dashboard (sic)
22 that we produce. We have some researchers that look
23 about—at about 27 different indicators that include
24 jobs and industry indicators, but we then use
25 publicly available data from the Barclay (sic) and

1
2 also from the Port Authority to report on some of
3 this information and I think it's pretty clear the
4 expertise that NYC & Company has that we also rely
5 heavily on. In terms of the legislation, we have
6 still some of the concerns just about specifically
7 tracking some of the economic transactions. If they
8 are fast transactions, it's very hard to track what
9 is occurring, and if they're credit card
10 transactions, they are subject to privacy and
11 disclosure agreements I think are more challenging.
12 That said, we also would be very happy to sit down
13 and—and discuss ways we can get around that or a
14 little bit different data sources to get—to get it.

15 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: It sounds
16 remarkably positive on those numbers. So, I just
17 wanted to finish before we go to Council Member
18 Powers by saying in particular when it comes to the
19 cultural tourism piece here, you're trending
20 remarkably in all the right directions, right. The
21 city of New York and our cultural sector are
22 producing, increasing, growing. A true story. The
23 Governor and I were in Tucson a couple hours ago
24 sending grants to Henry Garrido, the Leader of DC 37
25 and we just happened to talk about the increase in

1 union employees at our culturals and libraries
2 because we've been able to increase funding for the
3 arts, and those jobs, of course, are all over the
4 city, and—and we just need to the tools to be able to
5 continue to influence public policy and funding that
6 keeps all of these bars going up, and—and these
7 incredible numbers. I just wish every single person
8 in the city of New York knew these numbers when it
9 comes to culture and the arts and tourism. If we did
10 it, we'd never have folks proposing to cut funding
11 for culture and the arts in the city of New York.
12 You would never have that discussion because you'd
13 know how devastating that would be to the city of New
14 York, and I'm certainly committed to working with my
15 colleagues to make sure that we do everything we can
16 to continue to see these trends and do everything we
17 can to make them be a permanent part of the landscape
18 in the city of New York.

20 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank you and
21 that's exactly why this is all here, and this not the
22 last of these hearings. This is the first step
23 because this is such an important, and somebody
24 offering topics here. I'll turn it over to Council
25 Member Powers.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you, thank
3 you for answering those questions, and I now call the
4 bill because that's an inside that. (sic) I want to
5 just kind of—and talk on a number of Van Bramer's
6 points. It's exactly about the hearing, which is
7 what tools can we put into the tool box to help us
8 continue to grow? I think that's my intention. I
9 hear it from Times Square Alliance, what the yellow
10 is about, challenges in this area in Times Square
11 with safety and security. We need to think about it
12 I think even more broadly. What are the things that
13 you're seeing other cities do that we could be doing
14 here with new need to help with the Council, the
15 Mayor's Office or otherwise to be able to expand your
16 bill to do your job, and what are—what are the things
17 that you see as stress points and challenges as we
18 kind of move forward and see city data, I think is
19 one of the biggest ones, economic growth and national
20 and international, strengthen the dollar internally,
21 but what are the challenges, and also what are the
22 things that we can be helpful to in terms of your
23 ability to do your job?

24 FRED DIXON: Thank you for the questions
25 and that is that it speaks to the heart of the issue,

1
2 and we probably could be here two days I think in
3 discussing all what that does. That's a very deep
4 question, but in terms of the stressors, you know,
5 you, too, mentioned that the—the biggest ones and
6 that is obviously the strength of the dollar. You
7 know with 13 million international visitors coming to
8 New York City, it's interesting to -to observe if
9 there are 20% of the volume, but they're 50% of the
10 spending. Sometimes they're staying here longer, but
11 they're and they're spending more money and they're
12 exploring more. You know, it's—it's probably not the
13 531 that they merit until the last ones go on the
14 subways, but the international travelers are the ones
15 that are the most—the most explorers. They're the
16 most intrepid ones, and they're the ones that are
17 setting the trends. So, you'll see us focus a lot on
18 international because they just punch out their way
19 in so many ways. It's a trend for others to follow.
20 So, the dollar on the street these days is probably
21 our biggest threat at any given moment in terms of
22 shifting the tides. There are a number of national
23 policies or concerns for all. We do—we do lobby with
24 the Tourist Association and others in Washington on
25 these like the truck ban, which we are deeply opposed

1
2 to. You should not be discriminating against any
3 group of people, and we feel very strongly that New
4 York City was built on access, and that it is a
5 global city, and it has for main global, and so we
6 are firm advocate of open borders and welcome the
7 doors—open doors and welcome borders, and so we—we
8 always advocate strongly on that behalf. So,
9 national policy and currency aside, the—the
10 limitations are locally. There is a lot of
11 competition for timing and wallet. We do see that
12 from neighboring areas. Congestion is one the
13 biggest issues that we. We don't take—we don't count
14 anyone that's coming from within 50 miles from New
15 York City between Ulster County from Westchester if
16 you don't kind of listen to us, but if you spend the
17 night, if you come a Valentines and bring your
18 partner and spend the night, then we do need to count
19 you. But, you know, otherwise, you know, congestion
20 is a major issue and we find that we are competing in
21 the region. One of the things that makes the tourism
22 industry so strong is because of our location. It is
23 an enormous population based in the Northeast that is
24 around us. We've part of this, but people may not go
25 to Disney World, but you're going to bring your kids

1
2 to see Disney on Broadway. That is an important
3 thing that we have observed over the years, and it
4 keeps us strong in times of—of challenge. So,
5 congestion is a big issue, and access to the city is
6 an—is an issue. You see people punch up when there's
7 construction on the tunnels or the bridges. Those
8 issues they can have an impact because there's so
9 much opportunity in local areas now outside of the
10 city and in the region where people can go the little
11 museums because everyone is investing to that place.
12 So, those kind of issues, ease of access is probably
13 I think we're a part of that, and in other terms and
14 we touched on probably drivers use safety as in all
15 is fine. That has I think opened do much opportunity
16 for us. People that--that are coming here see how
17 welcoming and friendly our city is and how open it is
18 and how exciting for us. In terms of tourism, the
19 first thing that we have to do is we have to get
20 people to choose New York. We have to choose New
21 York City versus other destinations. One is Paris,
22 Orlando and Saint Louis. You need to choose New York
23 City first, and that's where we really spend a lot of
24 our energy, and then once they're in the city then we
25 work on getting them around, getting them to sport.

1
2 Yes, they're going to go to Times Square the first
3 time. There is not much we could do about that.
4 That's a good thing I think in many ways because it
5 is such an iconic attraction, but once they're there
6 then we really work strongly on encouraging
7 distribution through space and through time. So, we
8 encourage—we try to shift the van into winter when
9 things are slower, when the trains are less
10 congested, when—when the shops are less—less full.
11 So, we—you'll see—see a lot of big energies there in
12 terms of shifting people into winter. Both of the
13 allies, this is much of the year at Hotel Sovani at
14 95+ percent occupancy. We are the envy of almost
15 every city in America when it comes to our hotel
16 occupancy. So, literally there are moments when we
17 can't get more people into the city. So, that has
18 been addressed. I mean there is growth in our hotel
19 industry, but you'll see because of the popularity of
20 New York that those hotels are full as soon as they
21 are. So, in terms of demand, we think it's selling a
22 million and half to 2-1/2 million overnights every
23 year, and so the occupancy rate has remained very
24 strong. The hotels will be challenged on rates, and
25 because they're selling more competition, and so

1 there's been a lot of pressure on their returns, but-
2 but in terms of volume of people coming and staying
3 in hotels, we've been able to pull all those
4 available to us, and capacity is a real issue,
5 capacity and infrastructure and transit, and also the
6 hotels are going to continue to grow.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: And-and from
9 proactive strategies that we've been doing visions
10 like the sort of a baseline things and take the, you
11 know, keeping economic growth. Things like that.
12 So, there are other things and visions that we're
13 doing just to highlight, you know, the important
14 parts and from data is there things? We just went
15 to New York City that day, trying to get people to
16 back for us, but really like there are things that
17 are trying to help people go visiting cultural
18 institutions. Are there other things we could be
19 doing that would help drive people here for the
20 first, second and third time not from New York City
21 to make their-make their experience more
22 accommodating or other things that we can do to-I
23 sense some funding is big part of it, too, and I must
24 say in present that would be if given more funding
25 can you tell us how you would be using it in terms of

1
2 how what the expected return would be in terms of
3 policy?

4 FRED DIXON: It's a—it's a publication
5 (sic) in advance, but—but knowing what the
6 opportunities were we could be more precise in the
7 future with you, but I think one of the great subject
8 is arts and culture. I think the more we can promote
9 arts and culture and more programs that the detail
10 this is encouraged, the more we're able to—we're able
11 to use that to drive visitation especially the
12 immigrants. That is one of the ways that make the
13 program be able to—to make sure that everyone
14 benefits from the rising tide of tourism. It's
15 getting people out more, and we can come in the
16 borough. We have a five-borough strategy. It was
17 alongside the NYC & Company. I've been there since
18 2005, but every year, the department grows, and we—
19 and so, as more cultural institutions open I think
20 more about tourism. Our Tourism Ready Program I
21 think is one of the things I'm most proud of because
22 it is showing culturals and small businesses the
23 opportunities in tourism, and to have exhibitions and
24 to promote them properly and how that can drive
25 business, and enable film shops nearby, and people

1
2 have to eat lunch and they want to shop. So, we—we
3 will—we look forward to—to working with you on more
4 opportunities in terms of that funding. It would
5 definitely be a part of—of that, but one of the areas
6 that I'd like to shed a little focus on is—is groups
7 and conventions. That is an area where we are really
8 challenged compared to other legislations in terms of
9 a bit of mistakes. The Jazz Center by all
10 comparisons is the busiest commission center in
11 America in terms of the vendors. It's so popular and
12 it's full. It has the highest like two-way radio in
13 the country. So, we have—this is when we were close
14 to really seeing things like Pier 4 and other
15 locations to put rooms into unexpected spaces.
16 Digging a lot into boroughs into—into buildings that
17 are—that are able to occupy conventions and the ease
18 of trade shows and special events. But there is a
19 real opportunity there, and I'm glad that it was
20 mentioned before and I think it is something that we
21 should be as far as the city. How do we know the
22 facility has brought people to their neighborhoods
23 and probably more groups? Because groups are an
24 important component of the business. Last year
25 having 6-1/2 million people came here on—on—for a

1
2 labor convention or a trade show, and there is so
3 much opportunity there, and the ninth (sic)
4 intersection is for EDC. It's been really helpful,
5 but that's the intersection of different sectors.
6 So, we have freedom when we're close to them on
7 tracks and tech conferences where they spend a lot of
8 money on the time for a lot of great press for New
9 York and it feeds the local economy. It's a bit
10 engraved and very supportive of what's there.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you. I'm
12 going to leave my questions at that. I know—I
13 apologize. I asked him. I'll—I'll stick around. On
14 the bill, I'd be happy to work with all of you to
15 figure out whether or not we can record like how to
16 make sure that we can highlight the work that you're
17 doing, and do use bigger rating this. It's probably
18 available. So, we'll set the times and we'll talk
19 about it, and I understand, gentlemen. So, thank
20 you. Thank you and I want to say thank you again for
21 doing this hearing.

22 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank you,
23 Councilman Powers. So the councilman are lined up
24 for portions or time of evictions, (sic) and Carlos
25 Menchaca is back. So, gentlemen.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you so
3 much, and oh. It's been a while without me. I want
4 to say thank you Chairs and congratulations on a
5 great hearing. First off, let me congratulate NYC &
6 Company and EDC on phenomenal work, and when you look
7 at these numbers it's just astounding at how much
8 revenue we are—our city is generating in terms of
9 culture and the arts. I do want to move this towards
10 an equity lens a little bit, and I'm certainly
11 interested in hearing how are we really reaching
12 global communities specifically I guess with Adrienne
13 and I we're both in Southeast Queens and I represent
14 the Rockaways. I'm interested in hearing a little
15 bit more about what has your strategy been to ensure
16 restaurants or they now serve city airports. At
17 Rockaway Beach I was there and we served our eight
18 million visitors last year, last summer, but I one of
19 the challenges have always been from an equity lens
20 how we ensure that there's a plan in place that
21 ensures the entire Rockaways is part of cultural and
22 arts funds. So, will you speak to a little bit more
23 of art? Are you looking at this from an equity lens?
24 A lot of money here, a lot of jobs. Can you speak to

1
2 how this is reaching low-income communities? That is
3 something that NYC & Company and EDC is focused on.

4 FRED DIXON: Sure. Thank you. Thank you
5 for the question. At this hearing we think about a
6 lot because it's really important to us, and that I
7 think we'll go out on a limb here and Donna can
8 correct me if I'm wrong, but I think that the tourism
9 industry is one of the industries that offers the
10 most opportunity for everyone. There are
11 opportunities whether you are college educated or
12 you're not. I grew up in the tourism industry, and
13 my family is in it and—and I know that it has been a
14 real impact in the community in terms of folks who
15 where it—where it doesn't matter what their
16 educational backgrounds especially for immigrant
17 communities. It is often one of the first ways up in
18 the workforce is an office job in tourism, hotel
19 jobs, restaurant jobs. They are—they're vital in
20 that—in that sense, and—and we really—the more we
21 grow the pie, the more things are for everyone. And
22 there was—the neighborhoods are cheaper in the
23 cheaper in the Rockaways, and the ferry has—has
24 changed that scenario significantly. And again, we
25 tried to merge in some way. Okay, as far as tourists

1
2 access, I guess I should say this may be the more
3 attractive. Again, we are trying to encourage
4 tourists to not go during peak times. Let--let the
5 locals have--have the--the--

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: [interposing]
7 We want them to come during peak times, and going
8 there for

9 FRED DIXON: [interposing] Oh, okay.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: We will take
11 everything we can get.

12 FRED DIXON: I got you alright, alright
13 very good. Thanks a lot, but for us I mean we--we use
14 things, communities like the Rockaways as a great
15 example of getting press on the local underworld.
16 (sic) One of the things that's you're seeing is
17 always fascinating for people, and journalists in
18 particular visiting journalists is--is how popular
19 that our area is for surfers, and so one of the
20 things we have to do, you know, there--there are
21 certain communities that will come non-businesses.
22 Like they are suffers for example. All of our
23 research shows that the Australians believe it or not
24 love to come and surf in the Rockaways. They think
25 that the surfing is so amazing, and it is a bucket

1
2 list dream item for them to go and say that they've
3 done it, and take their surfboard home and try and go
4 out there, but we think management goals are
5 opportunists to get the focus for the community. We
6 have seen folks that are first. Once we get them
7 there, and we get—we get bowings (sic) known in my
8 mind and then it's on their list. So we get them to
9 New York or we get them out there, the internship
10 opportunity is very received there, and that's where
11 the Tourism Ready Program comes in, in terms of how
12 to work. So, we use the--

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: [interposing]
14 I can use it. So, I need it. Can you speak to how
15 the link also turns from failure? What is the—is
16 there a specific plant that draws them to—to all
17 parts of the Rockaways? So that's what I'm looking
18 to hear a little bit more about. So, your
19 restaurants. How does the other opportunities—have
20 your—has your organization thought about how we can
21 tie all of these in together?

22 FRED DIXON: Yeah, we—through our content
23 and I'd be happy to share it all with you on—on the
24 content of the app. Our website developer he took
25 channels in the promotion. Some of that is

1
2 information that we create. So, if we're curious
3 about the city businesses, and I mean we bring
4 journalist from around the world to influence with
5 comments that basically sell. We want everyone to
6 look through their own lens on it, and that's where
7 you are going to get the most exposure. I think we
8 want to live here, and I'd love to work with you and
9 talk to you more about how we can be available to
10 hearing you and about promoting local businesses even
11 further. It is a lot about a Siri (sic) development
12 in curation for us, and so the more content we have,
13 we have—we have it scoped on over 71 different
14 neighborhoods, and currently through our programs
15 across the five boroughs. The Rockaways certainly
16 are one of the hottest ones today in terms of
17 interest, and so we—we will be able to talk with you
18 more.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Perfect and—and
20 so for Adrienne and I who share TWA, folks that were
21 very happy that—and got to see the tour, it's going
22 to be a big job generator. I do want to move from
23 the venue here to portions of the—service of the
24 airport a little bit. How do you work, and this is a
25 question for the EDC. Do you work—do you work with

1 City Planning? Is there any strategy around showing
2 that we create development opportunities on the
3 outskirts for local communities? So, for instance on
4 the outskirts of the airport in the bottom land on
5 some of the eaves, you know, I know Bartlett is
6 coming in, and this is going to be a being a big job,
7 a generator for us, but I'm interested in hearing
8 whether the strategy around luring people to stay in
9 low communities on the outskirts of a commercial
10 entertainment standpoint, destination resale and
11 also, commercial building space. You know, I think
12 these are all strategies we have to look at if we're
13 going to, you know, as we move and this industry
14 grows how do we ensure not just the Rockaways or the
15 communities in Southeast Queens. Also going out
16 there to the airport benefits the industry. So,
17 what's your strategy working with City Planning?

19 MATTHEW BARTLETT: Let me just say--

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And, gentlemen
21 I know—I know. I've been going all day.

22 MATTHEW BARTLETT: We—we have part—

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: [interposing]

24 Yes, I know, but yes I know. I know. I got one last
25 question after this and then—and then I'm done.

1
2 MATTHEW BARTLETT: Okay, and I'll try to
3 answer.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Is the--the end
5 of the story and concise.

6 MATTHEW BARTLETT: I'll live by that.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Alright.

8 MATTHEW BARTLETT: Urge me along. So,
9 we've got--we agree that greater access is really
10 important across the five boroughs. With City
11 Planning we do spend a lot of time looking for
12 opportunities for development specifically in areas
13 like we're talking about. Although I'm not
14 personally on that team, I am happy to connect you
15 with folks that already about it, and we have whether
16 it's strong growth, that I think that's been going on
17 for quite some time in terms of destination resale
18 although I know some in your district where we're
19 very proud of Empire Outlets and City Planning is
20 really driving all of that, and the job growth, and
21 has I'm sure you all know we pioneered the HireNYC
22 program. Back in 2008 we started it at EDC to ensure
23 that New Yorkers got the first looks at jobs, and
24 really that has expanded to other agencies in 2013,
25 and it is a very strong way of ensuring that at least

1
2 there are opportunities connected to all of these
3 profits whether they are profits that we do with NYC
4 & Company or Cultural Affairs. So, we're really
5 proud of that and our MWBE program where we think
6 we'll be our numbers, and in addition, for Outer
7 Borough strategies, we are working very closely with
8 the Department of Cultural Affairs around the
9 Affordable Real Estate For Artists Program, which
10 really is looking at targeted areas that could use
11 the benefit that we discussed earlier how culture is
12 really raising those places as a destination in
13 equity.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Alright, in
15 light of Paul telling me I'm too long on data, I'm
16 going to begin to wrap up, but I do want to say that
17 I am certainly interested in hearing a little bit
18 more about how we're reaching I guess that well in
19 some communities with jobs, the CTE Program for sure,
20 the Snow Program in Southeast Queens and the
21 Rockaways. Surrounding that, I also point out that I
22 have not seen much of them off the strategy for the
23 cultural centers that are in Southeast Queens, and we
24 had-did a lot of inspections there. We have Jay
25 Tower. We have New York College for the Performing

1
2 Arts; and how are you tying in people who are getting
3 off the plane to JFK and staying at airports--
4 surrounding the airport to ensure that they are aware
5 of the opportunities of culture in our community.
6 The last question is--that was my question, but the
7 last question is so I remember under the prior
8 administration, one at JFK Airport the lease being up
9 in 2005. When is that up again? Will that provide
10 and opportunity for more negotiations, and then
11 lastly, have you thought about ferry service from JFK
12 into the Rockaways because I know that is something
13 we have in mind of--of the prior Administration, and I
14 think that that's a great way to draw tourism into
15 the Rockaways as well. So, those are my last two
16 questions. I look forward to I can send you the
17 conversation on the equity piece around tourism.
18 These jobs have to come from there where it will give
19 you reason and that's why we're getting a person
20 right now being that. So, I look forward to working
21 on this issue.

22 MATTHEW BARTLETT: We definitely look
23 forward to working with you on that as well. I'm
24 going to have to get back to you on exactly when the

1
2 JFK lease turns over. I will certainly have to
3 follow up on that, and what was the one other?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Well, certainly
5 it's about JFK. [background comments] Yeah, I know
6 that, and it's very-

7 MATTHEW BARTLETT: We-we hear you. The
8 Rockaways, so you asked me about the-the-there is a
9 study underway and we have heard of requests for
10 various service, and the Mayor will respond to those
11 requests.

12 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: And now Council
13 Member Menchaca.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you to
15 the Chairs. Thank you for being here today. I'm
16 going to go right into it. What neighborhoods have
17 seen the greatest growth in tourism in the tourism
18 industry outside of Manhattan, and I know you
19 mentioned that.

20 FRED DIXON: That's a great question.
21 Thank you, Council Member. I'm going to defer to my
22 colleague Donna Keren to answer that.

23 DONNA KEREN: Yes and thank you for the
24 question. That is one of the challenges that we face
25 in understanding where people go, and the data. The

1
2 investment in the hotel sector has been a good—a good
3 proxy indicator of where there are communities in the
4 neighborhoods, hotel growth in Brooklyn and Queens
5 both at around the airports, as well as in other
6 neighborhoods. We're also seeing that growth happen
7 in neighborhoods in the Bronx, Staten Island and
8 parts of Brooklyn. The ferry service is a part that
9 we would love to better understand who is riding on
10 that service—on that ferry. Activists standing on
11 every ferry going around the ports and asking people
12 are you a visitor and where are you from?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Rightly a right
14 jealous program by the way.

15 DONNA KEREN: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I got some you
17 know do that. [laughter]

18 DONNA KEREN: Yes, and the 24/7 public
19 transit work. So, assume we have it. It's around
20 the block. We are very interested in understanding
21 that we're looking at a variety of measures and ideas
22 on where people actually are going, but it is a huge
23 challenge for us.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Well, and I
25 think that this is—this is really critical when we

1 think about it, and a lot of—this law premise here
2 that is—that is missing getting this other—other
3 permission. Certainly hoping that we can get some
4 commitment. That way we'll figure it out, and I
5 don't think it's a—that's all I'll say right now.
6 Let's figure that out because I think it's going to
7 be one of the requests from Jimmy Van Bramer alright
8 for tourism, and—and—and—and Chair Vallone, but we
9 need to figure this out. And on the second side to
10 that, I'm kind of curious about the impacts that it
11 has on the neighborhoods, and how you're measuring
12 the impact of tourism on neighborhoods. That's all,
13 and so while you may not know who is going where,
14 you do know that if our tourists live on these
15 streets and talking about the different neighborhoods
16 outside, and what happened, who might have the—don't
17 have the DNA of a Manhattan neighborhood, but impact
18 it as well. How are you measuring that?

20 DONNA KEREN: Our Annual Economic Impact
21 Study does look at sending across all five boroughs
22 and in the job category we were with a company called
23 Tourist & Economics, and it starts needing our recent
24 data combined with economic impact, mode, text data
25 from let's say in the city to look at that, to get

1 down to the—the street that will as it were. I would
2 actually refer to my colleague who's probably still
3 sitting behind me, Jonathan Balls because they have
4 done some truly extraordinary work on how different
5 industries play out through the city, and the
6 neighborhood development.
7

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Got it and I
9 need somebody to testify later so—but what I'm really
10 curious about is gentrification, and the acceleration
11 of gentrification as it relates to tourism. Does
12 anyone just cover that, an employee, but I want to
13 get it for—yeah, I think we want us to touch that.

14 DONNA KEREN: Again, to our role and as
15 we've been discussing and NYC & Company is primarily
16 alarming and sorry visitation informing people that
17 the city is entirely across the five boroughs and the
18 neighborhoods. The more localized cycle development
19 and perhaps you can refer to my colleague for me.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Following the
21 New Yorkers' shoreline around those bays it's been—
22 it's been to Red Hook, the Bishop Terminal. This will
23 be a million dollars for the whole package, a cruise
24 ship, and other money to use. How are you measuring
25 the impact of the Bishop Terminal on the lower level

1 of the economy? So, this is for EDC. How are you
2 measuring the impact for the local Red Hook economy?
3 For the Red Hook Bishop Terminal.
4

5 FRED DIXON: Thanks for the question. I
6 think that we are very intensive and always trying to
7 make sure that all of our projects have a positive
8 impact on the local economy to the point that maybe
9 have been raised. There are different sources of the
10 information to try and understand what is going on.
11 We have our overall economics now shopped in terms of
12 industry that I was referring to earlier that have
13 the 27 indicators. For the tourism piece we really
14 look to our partners here at NYC & Company, but we
15 also filed the reports with the Furman Center and
16 tried to understand what impacts there are on the
17 different affordability of housing, and we also look
18 to our partners at HPD around that, and then as you
19 know, we have a pretty developed program for trying
20 to save-create affordable manufacturing and as
21 opposed to this.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: So, our Mayor's
23 intention, but no answers about the actual path that
24 maybe Red Hook, local economies having the cruise
25 ship terminal. Is that correct?

1
2 FRED DIXON: I do not have any answers
3 for you right now, but I'm happy to talk to my
4 colleagues in that—in our department and see anything
5 that something else is up. (sic)

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Okay, I think
7 that—because I think a lot of what we're talking
8 about here looks at bigger numbers. It's kind of
9 citywide numbers and our local neighborhoods that we
10 represent, we didn't feel that, and Red Hook is not
11 feeling the impact of the cruise ship terminal, and
12 hundreds of millions of dollars are going into
13 continuing to the cruise ship terminal and hundreds
14 of millions of dollars are going into—continuing, you
15 know, to the cruise ship terminal, and have since
16 seen that. And we will go without this synergy
17 between the cruise ship terminal. You can see the
18 lack of understanding here from the larger
19 conversations. There's no WiFi at the cruise ship
20 terminal. Some of the folks can't get on—you know,
21 international folks can get up to a phone and then
22 find that some local restaurant, and the way you find
23 to get to ferry in Red Hook is—is I love the ferry.
24 I do, but we can't get—we can't get to it if you
25 don't know that it's there already. The Port

1
2 Authority entrance at Pioneer if it's closed, and so-
3 so much of what we can do is very kind of localize
4 the point or the big numbers that has-are on the-the-
5 the kind of average some 60 some thousand entire
6 stores' wages. Well, I want to know the median of
7 those wages for-from the stores. So this is-this is
8 like the kind of real concern and everyone can see,
9 and it's member is committing or the Chair to figure
10 out how we get a reposition or a preview to look at
11 local air codes and their actual impact, and have an
12 answer to us about how you're measuring the impact.

13 FRED DIXON: If I can add one more thing
14 Council Member.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Both.

16 FRED DIXON: It works diligently while
17 you're speaking, and one of my colleagues told me
18 that we actually have a study specifically for Red
19 Hook on the impact of local businesses, and we would
20 be happy to share that with you, but still it's done
21 and in addition we have--

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: [interposing]
23 You have the lease or a copy?

24 FRED DIXON: I don't know the answer to
25 that, but it is some way? (sic) But also, in

1
2 addition I think you know this by developing. We are
3 upgrading BCP now, Brooklyn First Terminal and are
4 looking at some of the things that you described
5 certainly in terms of what I have, and what we're
6 finding, and things that you haven't seen before, but
7 I'm not sure of that actually, and we're very
8 concerned about them, and we'd be happy to follow up
9 with you first.

10 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: And we've been
11 hoping if the call is not working, we'll just get the
12 call working and we're up Council Member Barron.
13 [background comments]

14 MALE SPEAKER: You certainly believe
15 that.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So now the part
17 that I read is that I've been --[laughter/background
18 comments]

19 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE:

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I want to thank
21 the Chairs for the hearing and thank the panel for
22 coming. My questions are similar to those raised by
23 my colleagues, Council Members Richards and Menchaca.
24 These numbers are great and to pass it, and I want to
25 understand how they can support and help my community

1 and communities of color. So, you talked about—your
2 testimony says that there were 392,000 jobs with the
3 sixth largest in the Plains sector. I want to
4 understand how your department is shared with the DOE
5 and DYCD has generated specific numbers of young
6 people coming into that industry, and since I'm on
7 the clock, I'm going to give you all my questions and
8 you can answer them.

10 DONNA KEREN: Uh-hm.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: We talked about
12 the CIG and a number of cultural institutions that
13 are part of that. I know initially one of my
14 colleagues talked about NYCID. Initially when that
15 came online, there was the ability to for those who
16 had a car and who had reduced or free access to
17 members of the institutions. I'd like to know has
18 that been maintained, and how can we expand it.
19 We're talking about people who are coming to New York
20 City. We can't overlook those everyday New Yorkers
21 one that you mention who already live here or can't
22 deny them or rather we should expand the opportunity
23 for them to be able to take advantage of literally
24 the greatest cultural center of the world and the
25 aids and to their benefit of being here, and reduced

1 costs, and it has no question particularly about—
2 following that, I think of Menchaca's question about
3 the job titles in the this industry, and I would like
4 to be able to get the job titles disaggregated by
5 ethnicity so that I would know where people are in
6 that spectrum. Re jobs going as high as I think you
7 said the average was \$71,000. That's the average
8 that I'd like to get a printout on or data showing me
9 exactly what the job titles are, what the range is,
10 and now New York City people coming through the high
11 school, the DOE programs or sliding into those
12 positions, and in your partnerships, do you have
13 internships for young people to be able to take
14 advantage of that, to be able to get a feel of what
15 those industries are particularly through those CTE
16 schools to be able to get a foothold and get a leg
17 up, and to get them into that, and so that's 1770.
18 [laughter]

19
20 FRED DIXON: Thank you, Council Member
21 for that question. I'll—I'll start off and—and my
22 colleagues may have other things to say when had it,
23 and I'm certain my colleagues have done that from
24 research perspective. Where we come from the NYC &
25 Company is really identifying opportunities in the

1
2 employment sector and the private—in the private
3 sector. So, what programs are managed by the
4 Department of Education we worked to create
5 opportunities for them to place the students in, and
6 so we go—our members we go to the Hotel Committee and
7 we ask for these internships every summer, and I'm
8 proud to say every year we've been increasing them.
9 We're getting better response all the time because
10 the—the hotels in particular are raising their hand,
11 and they're saying we—we need workers, and we need—
12 we're looking to hire low pay. (sic) So, we're—
13 we're helping DOE place students into those programs.
14 So—so we—we are not in this actually to select the
15 students, but we're—we're on the other end of the
16 pipeline in providing this opportunity. So, we're
17 going to look to provide more, and really it is
18 definitely a creative conversation, and it is
19 important to us that we raise up the doors. So, it
20 is something that we have taken very seriously and
21 something that—that we are working on. With a lot of
22 issues we are working on supporting small businesses.
23 We feel strongly that New York City is not New York
24 City without its small businesses, and if we become
25 the hot shot as Jimmy Parts and Hardware, you get the

1
2 same offerings here you get in Atlanta or in Paris or
3 in Los Angeles than flying close to the point of
4 traffic here. So a lot of our efforts you will see
5 from a data perspective are focusing on travelers who
6 are pushing for local. We appreciate local unique
7 experiences so we look for a variety of patterns and
8 behavior in our—in our Geo Target agents, and how
9 they define central drivers here, and we want folks
10 who appreciate local, who want to shop local, who
11 want to support local businesses because we're not
12 going to be the same city if those folks for our
13 visits. So, those are areas that we focus on and—and
14 one of the things that we would—we would encourage
15 mothers to go, we feel very strongly that there is a
16 need for a certification program. For any young
17 person who is not college bound to be able to have a
18 certification in hospitality whether it's a six-month
19 program or a nine-month program, we mentioned it to
20 CUNY and we mentioned it to a few other institutions,
21 but there is a real need there for some basic
22 certification training. It's been here in the
23 workforce if you don't have a college education
24 because once you're in hospitality there are
25 tremendous opportunities for you to grow and go out.

1 Columbia Saint Mary and others have amazing
2 management training programs that—that need to be—it
3 is not common to see someone begin as a doorman or
4 housekeeper and quickly move up into management into
5 that middle-class lifestyle. So that is something
6 that we feel very passionate about, and we're getting
7 a lot of attention in that direction.
8

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Alright, do you
10 have the numbers of how many students were—came
11 through the Internship Program and were placed
12 against that. If you don't have it, get it and some
13 response to the CIG [squawking mic] involvement with
14 NYCIE program.

15 FRED DIXON: Yeah, and I would just say
16 the first question quickly is my helping hand and
17 she's a leader who has the proper education, and
18 calling the house down in tourism CTE Portfolio that
19 are 22 programs in 20 different schools of 3,000
20 students, and we would have to defer you to DOE I
21 think for more information on that.

22 FEMALE SPEAKER: With respect to the
23 IDNYC, we worked—we've been working closely with our
24 colleagues Jeff in government to support the cultural
25 factor and that is a benefit to public services. So

1 through that I see two symbols that I think I would
2 like to share with one and IDNYC and that is still
3 going on, and it has provided more than 630,000 free
4 cultural memberships to New Yorkers. The other one I
5 need to highlight is Culture Paths, which we worked
6 with NYC & Company on to advertise the program on NYC
7 Kiosks and bus shelters and that's a partnership with
8 the Citywide bus system and supported by DCLA, and
9 that's welcomed over 90,000 since it launched in the
10 summer, and they—they opened their doors to cultural
11 institutions in all five boroughs.

12
13 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And I think you
14 said there are 35 members of the TNT. How many of
15 those 35 institutions are participating in NYCID?

16 FEMALE SPEAKER: So, there's, yeah,
17 there's 33 CIDs and I don't have the other ones.
18 Those numbers that are—are the specific numbers on
19 that.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. Thank
21 you, Mr. Chair.

22 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Council Member
23 Rivera.

24 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: I just want to
25 say briefly Council Member Barron, though you're the

1 first to have the time in borough and staff. So, the
2 longest 10 seconds in the history of the world, but
3 [laughter] but just had to point to that, and as I
4 pointed out, I just want to say as we haven't done
5 yet, I think she's saying all the sergeants-at-arms
6 and all the members of the staff and the Speaker's
7 Office who when we have these off-site hearings do a
8 lot of work to put it together and make sure that the
9 Council Members have it sort of done as possible. So,
10 thank you to all of you for doing the work.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Well, I only have
13 one question. So, I probably could find—Jimmy, just
14 you. [laughter] Anyway, we'll make it on the mark.
15 So, certainly you market likewise as being a very
16 informed part of this other zone. So, whether it's
17 the bank calls, the meat packing or the warehouse
18 parties in Brooklyn or tending bar in the Lower East
19 Side in the East Village, this is certainly something
20 people do, and you mentioned in your testimony that
21 people book hotels and they book reservations. I
22 guess the question runs in bars and I'm curious as to
23 I was just at the—the last of the nightlife tour, the
24 Office of Night Life newly created and, of course,
25 the main concern is quality of life for the people

1 that actually move in these neighborhoods. People
2 live in Chelsea. People live in Bushwick. Are you
3 working with the new Office of Night Life and fully
4 realizing that they are new to kind of address—to
5 take those issues into consideration and how you
6 market to people who don't maybe know those rules or
7 or-or-or the cultural advocate of New York City.

9 FRED DIXON: Thank you for that question,
10 Council Member. That is a great question. It is
11 something that we have begun to outline. I don't
12 have any-any appropriate questions. Small business
13 is something that we can expedite, and speed up in
14 terms of how we work closely with them, and they are
15 new, and they're-they're getting up to speed on a
16 number of issues and-and I think tourism hasn't had a
17 full conversation yet, but that is something that we
18 will make happen sooner than later, and it is
19 something that we need to take seriously. It is
20 important. We see in other destinations around the
21 world how visitors are impacting local communities by
22 misbehaving, and that is not something we want to
23 happen here. And so that-that is and respective
24 culture. It is-it is an important one and it's
25 something that we will take to heart.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Right so this—
3 because we're—we're—the city is very much associated
4 with servants, and so that is certainly involving
5 your marketing campaign. So, I would first say it's
6 really important. I know in my district people are
7 always contacting us about sleeping in the street.
8 You know, marketing and sleeping and the sidewalks
9 are crowded and, you know, I want people to come and
10 visit the Lower East Side of the city, and I get—I
11 get—I always get a little bit jealous of tourists.
12 It seems like they're in the city for the first time.
13 So, I was born and raised here. It just seems
14 natural. So, I think that's just a really, really
15 important piece because we are open until 4:00 a.m.
16 more. So, thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Council Members, I
18 have four groups of panels. There's two panels, and
19 we have two Council Members with their names written,
20 and we're getting to you. It's just a few more
21 minutes, and then we'll call our first panel, and we
22 have Council Member Adams.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you very
24 much, Co-Chairs for this very lengthy discussion
25 today, and the hearing and thank you to all of the

1 panelists for your patience and your testimony today.
2 We really do appreciate it. This for me has been an
3 extremely eye opening. As Council Member Richards
4 said, we have been primarily focused to Community
5 Development, all those things that that process has
6 entailed, and just to be here in the site, in the
7 setting today, and so, you know, again, it's
8 breathtaking and seeing Broadway. The view was
9 spectacular. Just to echo a couple of points, I mean
10 just to opine that Council Member Richards pressed on
11 in Southeast Queens and taking a look at the issues
12 specifically in Southeast Queens, we have a lot of
13 things to offer tourists, and we have not seen he
14 benefits. So, I am—I am agreeing with Council Member
15 Richards and Barron that the numbers are spectacular
16 when it comes to New York City tourism. We have to
17 figure out a way so that there is equity in this
18 process and equity for all of the communities in the
19 city of New York, but I take a look at my area in
20 Jamaica—the Performing Arts Center, the Beckham
21 Theatre, the New York College of Performing Arts
22 Center. These are places that draw people into
23 these—these areas and—and these beautiful locations,
24 and have beautiful work done from art displays to—to

1 musical concerts, et cetera. You name it and-and
2 these institutions have them. I-I really would like
3 to know what the plan is, if there is a plan to draw-
4 tourism, into Southeast Queens, into some of these
5 areas that have been neglected. Is there a plan? If
6 not, when will the plan be planned? How can we do to
7 help you plan, and when can we all get together to
8 plan?
9

10 FRED DIXON: Well, it's like-[background
11 comments] Thank you for the question. I'll be happy
12 to take that one. It is a-it is a great question,
13 and I agree with you, their instruments are in tune
14 strictly in those institutions that you mentioned,
15 and I'm diving down and I do follow that team almost.
16 We have a chosen ready committee based in things and
17 we talk about creating one in the-in a spec area. We
18 have not done that yet. We may need your help in
19 identifying businesses and communities that-that want
20 to raise their hand. We often times go out with open
21 solicitation for engagement if it's a free program,
22 and sometimes it's just people displays overall. They
23 don't perhaps realize what it is or so we may have an
24 opportunity with your office to actually penetrate
25 more deeply because once we get folks in and they

1
2 actually understand the tourism ready program and how
3 it works, and the opportunities that are there, I
4 think there's—there is really unlimited potential,
5 and such as it related to you, one of the things we
6 didn't talk about today that is—is a term that we use
7 in tourism call VFR and VFR is Visiting Friends and
8 Relatives, and it is an enormous and powerful part of
9 the tourism economy because we have people here from
10 all over the world, and their family and friends come
11 to visit them because why not? It's New York. I
12 want to sit by the couch. I want to go to store in
13 your community and—and I want to see the Rockettes or
14 the tree or whatever it is. So that [bell] is an
15 area where we have lot of opportunities especially
16 in—in neighborhoods outside of Manhattan.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you.

18 FRED DIXON: Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Laurie Cumbo. (sic)

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. I want
21 to jump in because of the time. So, you say that in
22 the testimony that many industries are doing well as
23 a result of culture and tourism like our hotels, our
24 restaurants and many other others. Has there been a
25 thought given to the fact that you mentioned that our

1 hotels are booming and they're doing very well, many
2 other cities wish they had the type of occupancy, and
3 many other cities, and I'm sure you're aware that San
4 Francisco and Houston, and many others they have a
5 hotel tax, and that hotel tax is utilized in order to
6 support arts and cultural programming. San Francisco
7 I believe was the first to kick it off in the 1960s
8 and they utilize that as a way to support arts and
9 culture programming. Has there been—I know in my
10 previous life there was a push where we started the
11 process of looking at a hotel tax in order to provide
12 greater support for the arts. Because if all these
13 industries are going to be doing so well and
14 benefitting from arts and culture, they should
15 contribute to a cycle of making sure that it's
16 successful.

18 FRED DIXON: Thank you, Council Member
19 for the question. Donna, would you like to—to take
20 this question? Yes, I'll pass it.

21 DONNA KEREN: Thank you. Council Member
22 thank you for the question. All of the taxes
23 currently paid visitors in hotels goes directly into
24 the City's General Fund. It is there to be
25 allocated. Currently, visitors to New York City is

1
2 5.875% hotel room occupancy tax on their hotel room
3 rate. They also pay the city and state sales tax.
4 They also pay \$2.00 per room per night to ACC also
5 collected. Currently the city combines city sales tax
6 and the hotel taxes generally about a billion dollars
7 a year from the hotel sectors that is in the General
8 Fund. New York City does have the highest rate of
9 hotel tax charges on any consumer's bill, and with
10 also the highest room rate. We are taxing our
11 visitors at an extraordinarily high level, and they
12 are aware of it. As President Dixon mentioned, we
13 have an international market that's extremely
14 important, but they are also feeling the pressure on
15 your currencies of the strong power.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: But that funding
17 that's being—the taxes that are coming in are not
18 specifically designated towards the arts. You're
19 saying it just goes towards the General Fund.

20 DONNA KEREN: Into the General Fund, and
21 it is then up to the Council in given your
22 relationship with the budget to allocate that money,
23 as the industry as a whole contributes \$4.5 billion
24 [bell] a year to the General Fund through sales
25 taxes, personal income taxes, corporate taxes,

1
2 property taxes all generated from that \$66 billion
3 economic impact.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: So, we've got to
5 figure out a way to bring those resources back into
6 our cultural institutions, and I just want to close
7 with one. Prior to running for office, I started an
8 initiative when I was the Director of the MoCADA's
9 union call the Soul of Brooklyn, and the Soul of
10 Brooklyn was created because for me as an African-
11 American woman wherever I travel anywhere in the
12 world, I want to see black culture. So, if I'm going
13 to London I want to go to Brooks Theater. If I'm
14 going to Puerto Rico, like we just did, I want to go
15 to Louisa. I want to see here people of color live,
16 but it's often something that I have to research and
17 figure out myself. So, I think it would be very
18 advantageous to be able to create a mechanism for
19 people that are coming to the city that are like I'm
20 Dominican, and all I want to see is where Dominicans
21 are in the five boroughs, and I want to experience
22 that. I'm African-American. I want to see our
23 theaters, our libraries, our cultural institutions,
24 our art spaces. It-it would be advantageous to
25 create a mechanism so that people could find

1 themselves particularly in a city like New York, and
2 often when we think about the outer boroughs, we're
3 thinking about the larger institutions, and just by
4 getting to the larger institutions, makes individuals
5 feel like we're reaching the outer boroughs, but
6 it's—it goes—it has to go much deeper than our major
7 large sum institutions. I don't necessarily want to
8 go to go to a major institution when I travel. I
9 want to see the little cultural institution that
10 speaks to my history and my culture and my identity.
11 The Soul of Brooklyn is still in existence. It's—it's
12 a smaller version of what I would like to see for the
13 city, but it is certainly something that I think
14 would be advantageous because when we go into a
15 hotel, you see the magazines that promote the larger
16 institutions, the bigger restaurants when they're in
17 the airport, and they're reading a magazine on the
18 plane, it's about the bigger institutions and the
19 bigger restaurants. Everything is big, but people
20 really want to have that intimate experience, and
21 it's—it's—it's critical that we do that, and I know
22 that these are not innovative that we're coming up
23 with. These are things that in this new 2018 are
24 diversity, things that should be already at this
25

1 time. So, I hope when we come back from this panel
2 discussion like this maybe on a higher floor
3 somewhere here. [laughter] That—that we're able to
4 really celebrate some of the—the—the developments of
5 the Broadway thing. Thank you.
6

7 FRED DIXON: Thank you. Council Member
8 that is—that is a great notion and I love that you
9 thought that up because that is a powerful force in
10 travel and tourism. People want to see others like
11 themselves, and--and so our identification is very
12 important, and we have that in abundance in New York
13 and so we actually had identified several
14 opportunities in the Hispanic community in Red Hook,
15 in particular that we would like to explore with some
16 new funding. I'll be quite honest with you, and
17 those are areas that we would be able to tap into if
18 we had more resources. We recently took on one in
19 the Spanish language promotion in Press World to
20 expand our messaging more and more into the Hispanic
21 Press in America because we didn't—we didn't have
22 that ability before. That's one of the things we did
23 with our existing budget, but there are lots of
24 opportunities, and we think that the proposed—we
25 have—we have some planning on some real cultural

1
2 specific communities and—and they created just to
3 your point opportunities for smaller businesses and
4 smaller institutions. Okay, that's what people want
5 today. I mean it's not only smart from a community
6 standpoint, it's smart from mind standpoint because
7 that's what people are looking for when they travel.
8 Yes, they go to the institutions. New York has the
9 higher re-visitation rate. People come back here
10 time and time again, and they want to go into
11 communities. We've seen a lot of successful areas
12 and food tours, and in that the small business area
13 it—but its tour right now, and it's easy for someone
14 to get into that business and learn how to conduct
15 tour, and they take you to one of the communities to
16 explore the different communities. And I think that
17 we can just take that even for—to your point, I'm
18 going to look into the soul of what that would look
19 like. Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Well, thank you and
21 before we let the panel go, we just want thank the
22 committee all for staying for the whole two hours of
23 questions from our—we do have them on a lot of those
24 committees, and this Council is just for this reason,
25 and one of the future bills that already we covered

1
2 is awesome creation of a tourism agency. Because of
3 all of this, maybe the Council can directly help with
4 funding and priorities that way. So, we're very
5 excited to see the growth. Yes, and this the first
6 and second name. So with that, we thank you, the
7 first panel we'll call up our first panel. The panel
8 of four will be Jonathan Boles from the Center for an
9 Urban Future; Tim Thompkins from the Times Square
10 Alliance; Melissa Diaz from the American Museum of
11 Natural History; and Charlotte Saint Martin from
12 Brooklyn. Thank you, panel. [background comments]
13 But we're not finished here. We're not finished
14 here. [background comments]

15 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet,
16 please. We're going up here and we're going to keep
17 it down. Take your conversations outside.

18 [background comments/pause]

19 JONATHAN BOLES: Should I go?

20 MALE SPEAKER: Yes, you're already.

21 JONATHAN BOLES: Alright. Well, good
22 afternoon and thanks so much for—it's amazing
23 location, and we're bringing us all here. I want to
24 thank you. I not only get a chance to testify, but
25 also for your leadership on this issue. [off mic]

1
2 The past year we wrote the op-ed that you guys
3 offered today, and I wanted to really echo my support
4 for the bill that's introduced around the tourism
5 dashboard. I'm Jonathan Boles, the Executive
6 Director of the Center for an Urban Future. We cover
7 studies on a range of things such as economic
8 opportunity and economic development in New York
9 City. We're not a tourism advocate, but we come with
10 this looking at what's important of New York City's
11 economy, and earlier this year in partnership with
12 Times Square Alliance and ASME, we published our
13 first ever report looking at the economic impact of
14 the tourism industry. We know that tourism is
15 important. I think what we didn't expect was just
16 how much more important it has become over the last
17 couple of decades. Everybody kind of knows, and they
18 see tourists around. I do. I see several buses and
19 buses have been on Wall Street every single day
20 around the cities, but-but I think that what we try
21 to measure was what's been the impact to New York
22 City's economy as the number of tourists each year
23 climb from about 33 million 20-20 years ago to 62 or
24 63 million last year, and what we found is that the
25 impact has been enormous. Hundreds of thousands of

1
2 jobs has been created and tourism went from what was
3 a pretty important industry to one of the higher
4 industries in New York City. I'm going to skip
5 around. I'm not going to talk about all the data you
6 can find in the report, but I will highlight a few—a
7 few things. One is a couple people mentioned it
8 earlier that tourism is so important for—for lots of
9 other industries, and that's one of the reasons why I
10 think the Dashboard is so important because sometimes
11 it will get tours and you're saying oh, that's just
12 hotels, and you look into the hotel jobs and there's
13 only, you know, so many of them, but what we found is
14 that 24% of all credit card sales at restaurants come
15 from tourists, and restaurants added 143,000 jobs
16 over the last 15 years or so. First, now for 18% of
17 all Visa transactions at retail stores in the city.
18 Not only is that important because retail created a
19 lot of jobs over the last 15 or 20 years, but think
20 about the challenges facing retail today. You know,
21 with tourists are helping out some of our great
22 retailers are able to get that extra cash from
23 tourism, and that's really important, and it's not
24 just in—in Manhattan and we show that in the report.
25 We also, you know, I'm not going to go into the great

1 numbers you already cited some of the numbers around
2 tourism, but there's actually jobs created and lots
3 of them in museums and cultural institutions around
4 the city, and so much of that is because of tourists,
5 and we also found that tourism is really an important
6 growing source of middle-class jobs for New York.
7 The one—well, skip over is, too, is just that, you
8 know, I think we can't rest on our laurels. This is
9 one of those industries that I think we—we know the
10 grasp, how big it is [bell] but it also could be
11 lost, and given how —given that it is fourth most
12 important sector in the city's economy, we need to do
13 things to take care of it, to make sure we don't lose
14 what—what we have. I'm just going to go over a couple
15 of quick suggestions, if I may, and I give a lot of
16 credit to NYC & Company. I think they've been a
17 great tourism promotion agency, probably one of the
18 best if not the best in the world. I think, though,
19 that what our report shows is that we also need help
20 from other agencies: Planning, Economic Development.
21 We feel that we've never adequately planned for a
22 city that has 60 million plus tourists a year. You
23 know, there's things like what—where do all the tour
24 buses go? How do you accommodate that? How do you

1 do a better job of making sure there is the equity
2 and that there is tourism promotion all over the five
3 boroughs. Those are the things that Planning and
4 Economic Development could be helping with, and we
5 advocate for a five-year tourism strategy plan that
6 the city should undertake. Let me say one more idea
7 really quickly, and that is that Diana Campbell a
8 little bit earlier just said we could use some of the
9 tools and improve the connections. Not only at the
10 airports and so many people come to our airports that
11 the connections between airport and the subway
12 stations, and I know Council Member Donovan, Donovan
13 Richards talked about what could be done in Southeast
14 Queens where there's a major airport in New York
15 City. You know, our report talks about how that
16 connection to the Jamaica subway station, which has
17 something like six million tourists a year. People
18 come off the—the air train. They change at the
19 Jamaica Subway station. This is such an easy thing.
20 Right now it is a pretty disgusting transfer to the
21 subway station. There's no signage. There's nothing
22 that makes you feel welcoming. This is often
23 people's first taste of our New York City subway.
24 It's often the first taste of New York City outside
25

1
2 of the airport, and we nothing to make it less of an
3 arrival place for New York City. Not only can we
4 have signage that welcomes people, but what about a
5 video loop or some kind of LED signage about what's
6 happening in Jamaica. Let's tell them who are those
7 famous people that are from Jamaica a few feet from
8 where they're standing right there, right? You know,
9 there's opportunities to for doing that—and do it as—
10 as Council Member Menchaca was talking about the Red
11 Hook Terminal earlier, we could do the same thing
12 there at the Red Hook and have those kind of local
13 linkages about okay, you're getting off the—the boat
14 the cruise ship in Red Hook, what can we do for the
15 local community there? I think there's a lot of
16 those opportunities around the city, and we've only
17 just begun to—to look at them. Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank you,
19 Jonathan, and you can see where most of our notes
20 came from. So, we appreciate your report there.

21 [bell]

22 TIM THOMPCKINS: So, just I wanted to say
23 also a great piece in Queens today, and thank you for
24 all your leadership on this. Also, in addition of
25 being the Chair of the Times Square Alliance, I was

1 the Co-Chair of the New York City BID Association
2 where I was constantly hearing from 75 BIDs
3 throughout every—all five boroughs about—they were
4 marketing neighborhoods and their commercial strips,
5 but they were interested in nurturing this kind of
6 tourism, and so I know that this is a huge thing. We
7 know that Times Square that tourism plays a role
8 Times Square economy but, you know, I think what
9 we've all been talking about is how much of a
10 difference it could make beyond sort of Midtown as
11 well, and for Times Square, you know, sure people are
12 going to come there for their first, but it's good
13 for us. If there's—if they are like a cultural
14 cuisine tourism package or—or—or they kind of do it.
15 We're talking about it's hardly the people, and we
16 get these mailers from Ontario, from—there's ads in
17 Penn Station from Baltimore. If we're in that same
18 thing even just sort of vocally, again people come
19 down and do, and, and you know, their second trip or
20 their third trip to New York City most people won't
21 go with other choices. (sic) It's—it's good for the
22 entire economy of the city, and—and—and—and on some
23 even those. And I think that the—the gas work is
24 really, really important for the techs, and with
25

1
2 respect to the equity issue, I think one thing is
3 this really hard question that Carlos has around
4 which is just like: What—what's the baseline where
5 money is being sent? And I'm sorry, but it's just
6 that it does exist. We felt though it's being—not
7 perfect. It's an approximation Visa or Master Card.
8 You can go buy those, and you can get them by zip
9 code. We did that. For instance we did it a long
10 time ago. We got—we bought that information from
11 Bed-Stuy and we know that that's the case, and for
12 Brooklyn and Jackson Heights and Elmhurst because we
13 bought it for Times Square. We wanted to know what's
14 our baseline, and what they do is they say is
15 disaggregated, it's anonymous, but it says X
16 percentage of the spending, Visa spending, which is a
17 pretty heavy approximation for overall spending, came
18 from Zip Codes beyond the metropolitan—the New York
19 metropolitan area, and that's what they found, and we
20 found that in Bed-Stuy and in Prospect Heights, and
21 then when we go to a separate one for Jackson Heights
22 and Elmhurst, 20% of retail and restaurant spending
23 for example with Visa was from—I know from people
24 visiting, and sometimes it might be those family
25 friends visiting. Sometimes it might have been other

1 people but that's where you set it as a baseline.
2
3 The other and so—so one of the equity pieces how many
4 of the folks that are coming to Times Square on their
5 first trip, or their second trip or third trip? To
6 go out to some of the neighborhoods where that
7 economic activity isn't happening, and making sure
8 that it's not disruptive to sort of the communities
9 that are there or sort of just building up there.
10 The other is how do we make sure that—that folks who
11 have not had an economic opportunity to get funded in
12 the pipeline of jobs with the, you know, the hundreds
13 of thousands of hotels and other weekend restaurant
14 jobs, how do we make sure there's a connection
15 between sort of communities where there's a need for
16 greater employment opportunities with this job
17 creation machine, which is now greater than
18 financing, finance or made in country (sic). With
19 some—in terms of jobs, it's the fourth largest, you
20 know, it's the fourth largest job—job producer. So,
21 those are the things where you can also buy data
22 where you could bring that. [bell] What are the
23 industries, and because we did this for ourselves.
24 We said for people who work in Times Square, where in
25 New York City do they live? And so and then you

1
2 could sort of say okay, well, I missed, and if
3 they're work retail, and we know that things you from
4 Times Square 50% of retail jobs are driven by tourist
5 spending. Then you could say if 50% of jobs are, you
6 know, are affected in this particular neighborhood by
7 what's going on with tourism. So, there's a way to
8 do it, and that's why the Dutch door is needed.
9 They're looking for something, and in and out of
10 baseline to see if you're moving or needle by doing
11 these promotional programs. And then you also see
12 which-which people do all the time, you can also see
13 okay if we invest in this promotion and we do a buy,
14 you are going to see that it's amazing work. If you
15 do a buy in Toronto, you know, what-how many plays do
16 you get? What kind of return do you get for a sole
17 booking tour? And that's a way of showing that
18 you're getting more return on your investment. As a
19 member of New York & Company, I think they do
20 amazing, amazing work. I think it's a funny thing
21 that Fred is willing to answer all these questions
22 about these thing. The reason he will go beyond his
23 scope as a marketing person, obviously they should be
24 at the table, as everyone has said, it's EDC, the
25 Small Business Services, t's DOT and it's City

1
2 Planning. Those are the entities they also need to
3 be thinking of this as an economic engine that
4 drivers the city. That's really, really important,
5 and that there's an integrated strategic multi-year
6 plan. As it was mentioned, among the top 10 U.S.
7 destination cities, New York was the only one that
8 doesn't dedicate a portion of that hotel debt. So,
9 those are huge hotel debts, and that's up to \$1.1
10 billion in tax receipts, but that money does-in-in
11 every other of the top 10 destination cities some of
12 that money is channeled back into sort of tourism
13 promotion and our gain, (sic) and that's-that's what
14 we think. You know, start your baseline and capture
15 that money because those numbers have gone up hugely.
16 Like just during the last 10 years, those taxes grew
17 by 74%, but the city's contribution from NYC &
18 Company decreased by 19%. That's what we're saying.
19 Those numbers have gone way, way, way, way up over
20 the last, you know, 15 or 20 years. Just take a
21 slice of that and reinvest it, and why do we need to
22 reinvest? Because we all know that if you don't
23 continue to update or improve your age or experience,
24 and you don't market even if your market is a dot and
25 your dot been spinning and it's sort of retro. I got

1 hit days. It's all about grade. Remember when they
2 dominated the market, but they didn't work on
3 improving the user experience. [background comments]
4 Right. [background comments/laughter] So, if you
5 don't work on, you know, improving you user
6 experience, and you don't work on keeping the market
7 evenly or at the top of the market and Apple has been
8 there. They're spending money on those. They're
9 still doing upgrades, then you stay on top. We can't
10 assume this that it's going to take us there over
11 time? (sic) Thank you.

12
13 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: A great product.
14 Are you still using it to market?

15 TOM FERRUGIA: Well, our suggestion is
16 keep the product is around. (sic) [background
17 comments/laughter]

18 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: The talent show has
19 changed.

20 TOM FERRUGIA: Yes, apologies. So, the
21 President of the Broadway League Shows and Charlotte
22 St. Martin was here ready to testify. Unfortunately,
23 she wasn't able to stay. So I'm Tom Ferrugia, the
24 Director of Governmental Affairs for the League. I'm
25 going to read portions of her statement for time.

1
2 Just reiterate, we are The Broadway League. We're
3 the trade association for the commercial data
4 industry. So, my testimony is going to be
5 specifically about the economic impact of Broadway
6 and tourism impact before we—I talk about the city,
7 and it might favor you to help some businesses in the
8 area. Thank you for the—for holding this hearing. We
9 want to acknowledge Kathryn House who represents
10 Katherine House who represents Times Square, and
11 Council Members thank you. I'd like to jump right
12 into the numbers. So, each year we post a notice of
13 travel from all over the world. We're talking
14 specifically about Broadway and come to attend the
15 last show of the 13.8 million Broadway Fair tickets
16 sold in seating and the ending of one-seating in
17 2018. 8.6 million of those 13.8 million tickets were
18 purchased by people residing outside of New York
19 City. That includes two million international
20 visitors, and Broadway's cumulative fiscal impact on
21 New York City was almost \$13 billion, \$1208 billion
22 to be exact; \$9.8 derived from all their spending and
23 that does not include the cost the theater tickets.
24 We exclude that one to determine our impact from
25 audience things. \$2.8 billion from show backing and

1 approximately \$45.7 million from capital
2 improvements. Collectively the Broadway employs
3 22,600 (sic) individuals who are mostly union
4 members: Actors, directors, ushers, electricians,
5 stage hands and musicians and many more, and money
6 spent by patrons supports an additional 74,500 full-
7 time jobs in restaurants, hotels, shop sand livery
8 services. Broadway has a long history of partnering
9 with the New York City. The Council is the general
10 sponsor of our Planning for Techs(sic) program with
11 providers here meetings to ask for events to
12 underserved families. Your support of our New York
13 Religious (sic) Program, which is endeavoring to
14 ensure that every New York City public high school
15 student attends a Broadway show before graduation.
16 The tool has been fully implemented where we meet
17 7,000 kids per year, but we've also sought the
18 Broadway Week administered by NYC & Co, which is a
19 semi-annual event, which encourages theater
20 attendance by offer 2 for 1 tickets to popular shows.
21 We also work closely with the Mayor's Office and
22 meeting at the 10 in many, many, and just by example,
23 recently we taught to promote Brother, the PSAs on
24 that league. So despite federal for-profit sectors,
25

1
2 it's approximately 4 out of 5 Broadway shows set for
3 a roof or capitalization closer than one year.
4 Broadway productions are incredibly risky and
5 expensive, and primarily support by groups of
6 individual investors who put their own money at
7 stake. Despite reported Star, Tents and Roses (sic)
8 the numbers don't change with regard to activity.
9 Rising production costs and attracting capital is in
10 certain talents. Going forward we would encourage
11 the Council to support legislation and the rules of
12 economic-economic barriers and the operating expenses
13 for current capital and exciting productions. [bell]
14 This is promotion. This includes Introductory Bill
15 1107-2013, having to do with commercial rent tax. We
16 also encourage strong review of commercial rent tax.
17 It-it's-we find it oppressive as small pockets of-of
18 all of New York City cater the tax that-that no other
19 business in the entire city two parts, and they're on
20 their normal property taxes. We would also encourage
21 continued house and Super Bowl access to Times Square
22 and we gave obstacles and disincentives to visit
23 (sic) in the meantime. We talked this stuff and
24 oversight on the Main Street actively. It turns out
25 that Times Square is-though it represents a very

1
2 small portion of the entire footprint of New York
3 City, has a massive disproportionate amount of—of
4 street fairs that take place there, which it causes a
5 tremendous amount of congestion, and we get a lot of
6 complaints from customers that they were unaware that
7 these events are taking place, and have hotel
8 accessing venues. So, again, so my name is Thomas
9 Ferrugia, and I thank you for this opportunity and
10 were are ready to answer questions. Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank you, Thomas
12 and make sure you give Charlotte our regards, and
13 former Ted Sweeney and congratulations are in order.
14 We acknowledge he is here from Council. So, good
15 morning. (sic)

16 MELISSA DIAZ: Yes, [bell] I am Melissa
17 Diaz. I am Director of Urban Affairs at the American
18 Museum of Natural History. You maybe have seen the
19 museum already, but for context, just wanted to
20 provide a brief overview with my full time. We first
21 want to thank the committee for your ongoing support
22 over the years. The museum could not have grown as
23 much as it has over these past few decades without
24 all your help. So thank you for that. The museum
25 and the city has had been a long partnership. Since

1 1869 our founding, almost 150 years ago. We'll be
2 celebrating out 150th next year. We have also a 25-
3 building complex of 1.6 million square feet. We have
4 a sizeable staff over 200 people. We're engaged with
5 research, and the brings graduate students, post-
6 graduate students, Pre-K, all the years, seniors and
7 that sort of thing to our Belkin Program and our on-
8 site programming. We are a member of the CIGs, which
9 is a diverse coalition of 33 non-profit
10 organizations. We represent museums, performing arts
11 centers, dues, guidance in all five boroughs, and we
12 often sit on city-owned or operated parkland. The
13 museum itself generates \$1.3 billion per year in
14 economic activity. We employ over 1,300 people, over
15 1,000 of whom are New York City residents and live in
16 the five boroughs. One in three of our employees are
17 union members. Our unions include the Local 3, 1539
18 and D37. The Museum of Art is one of the nation's
19 largest and most diverse audiences while bringing
20 over 5 million visitors on site. In the last fiscal
21 year we welcomed about half a million children and
22 chaperons through school and camp groups alone. Our
23 institution contributes to the city's economy and the
24 city's tax base. Every dollar that we receive in
25

1
2 city support is worth 20 some dollars in economic
3 impact on he city. We also have a residual tax
4 supports local businesses like print shops, mailing
5 centers, tailors, contractors. In Fiscal 18 we spent
6 over \$64 million on attraction services with over
7 1,110 New York City based vendors, again from all our
8 boroughs. That doesn't take into account the impact
9 we have on bus transit, shops and neighborhood
10 businesses. We work with the Columbus Avenue BID to
11 make sure that we are contributing to a mobile
12 economy as well. Our educational impact is felt
13 worldwide. We have teachers who are prepared
14 throughout the city to have the skills necessary to
15 develop our next generation of scientists and
16 technologists through programs like Business Intent
17 (sic) which have in place since 2004 because of a
18 public private partnership we have with the DOE and
19 eight of our city's leading scientific institutions
20 many of which are ingredients. (sic) The partnership
21 has facilitated a model—sorry. A model language
22 based on program. It demand public schools,
23 teachers, and students with effective science
24 experience with us. [bell] Early Advantage is
25 serving 915 teachers, over 900,000 students and 284

1 middle and high school students. At a time when the
2 scene of science education is of grave concern, we
3 are incredibly proud of Urban Advantage's success and
4 to enroll the next generation of scientists. We also
5 have the only patient program in any museum in the
6 western hemisphere. They are masters of science for
7 the 10 program, which produces one-third of nearly
8 all tour guides. This science future is interesting.
9 Next we will start our--the Richard Giller Science--
10 sorry, the Richard Gillard. I'm sorry for Science
11 Education and Innovation, which will have a total
12 economic impact \$700 million to the city. Over the
13 construction period the expansion will generate over
14 500 full-time union jobs, and it will contribute an
15 estimated \$31 million--sorry--\$30.1 million tax
16 revenues for the city. We collaborate with the city,
17 whether it is on making something happen or
18 institutional programs happen every year. So, we
19 thank you for the upcoming festival and funding for
20 our programming.

22 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: Thank you, Melissa,
23 and what's that long road Tappan Zee and Occipital
24 Planters Market. [laughter] It is some that we have,
25 and I don't know. My kids were much younger then and

1 I was here. They're sleeping in one of the rows
2 right now. So, thank you all for your testimony.
3 Again, we clearly see that this hearing was really
4 based on the work that you are doing, and we're
5 listening, and this is the first step. So, we are
6 going to work with you on the next steps, and this is
7 not just one hearing. So, thank you everybody.

9 MALE SPEAKER: Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: We have one more
11 panel. Thank you to those who stayed. So, we have
12 Vijay Dandapani from the Hotel Association; Rob McKay
13 from the Queens Economic Development Corporation,
14 Anna Bukes (sp?) from South Harbor Cultural Center;
15 and Alexander Silversmith from the Alliance of-what's
16 that, Graham Local Development and the Association
17 for a Better New York. So, I wrote that down.

18 [background comments/pause]

19 VIJAY DANDAPANI: Good evening Co-Chairs
20 Van Bramer and Vallone and Council Member Keith
21 Powers for convening this board. I am Vijay
22 Dandapani, President of the Hotel Association of New
23 York City, and actually to the President of Tasman
24 (sic) on this very important topic to all of us.
25 Firstly, let me thank Councilman Powers for putting

1 forward this idea of a national and existing that
2 would impact, close to the actual capacity and
3 repeated rewards, and it is so important that the
4 metrics that this plays is a cohesive effort and our
5 collaborative efforts through certain economy members
6 who succeed. So the Hotel Association is one of the
7 oldest associations, trade associations in the
8 country and we always have been an association and
9 we're under a foreign leagues advocate. We represent
10 an overwhelming majority of hotels in New York City,
11 and we are the voice of the hotel representing a
12 diverse group of owners, operators, and employees in
13 some of the finest establishments that the city has.
14 Once again, we like these houses, finishes, and the
15 hassle and we look forward to continuing and
16 conquering the sound and expanded tools and policies
17 that results in even stronger and larger tools in the
18 sector. New York City the U.S.'s third market hotels
19 and nearly 600 of them and 150,000 buildings. Fred
20 Dixon and Don Carano, they would put of those metrics
21 on they've grown since the Great Recession. Al
22 Fernandez, the Comptroller sends—sends his regards,
23 and last year, you know, city hotels rented 38
24 million room lines bringing in several billion
25

1
2 dollars in revenue, and he was an industry—a
3 significant contributor to the city's economy both
4 economically and socially. The total taxes that we
5 paid Tim Tompkins mentioned on point already. That's
6 the savings in occupancy tax, and if you add it with
7 property taxes, which probably has doubled since the
8 recession, I would say \$2 billion. So, unlike any
9 other retrievage, and probably one that is
10 significantly also after the Recession, we have
11 always known the RCS (sic) notably one in Astoria
12 because as you know, they were very sad. They were
13 all union workers, and they would come to put a new
14 contract. So, in fact, approximately in 2008 and now
15 has seen a number of jobs in the hotels increase by
16 maybe 30% to a total of 55,000 jobs. But I must
17 caution effective bringing this year the higher offer
18 to those fields due to the fact that we put up our
19 raise. On that they were, in fact, adjust the
20 information there are trying to send to the lower
21 degree recession, and while all the costs have
22 increased pretty mightily during—there were several
23 costs to address. We were the main office to bond
24 and with the New York City Center for Youth
25 Employment, and it's an initiative that seeks to

1 enable summer-long internships for high-achieving New
2 York City high school or college students, and we've
3 made [bell] every attempt withal our members to make
4 sure that all these employers who participate in
5 that. We value the Sahbahii relationship and many of
6 the key players from the Land of the Lakes and we're
7 close to others who are chosen cohorts, and we—we
8 really set that in how we work together and—and we
9 bring tourism to the city. We—we all sorts supporter
10 or a high tech incubator while getting two for the
11 past two years. The matches are being held every
12 year in the Forum for having greater tech vision for
13 us planning the street work from salvage companies as
14 well as New Frontier Tech Travel. So, we're up to
15 using those in future. (sic) We look forward to
16 talking with you and community status for our
17 programs, which is NYCD for growing partnerships, and
18 let just close by saying a couple of things, you
19 know, to the construction team. I'm completely, you
20 know, the city has great cultural heritage and those
21 attractions with manmade and human made as well as
22 natural. But construction is one, and it was not
23 tested on Javits frameworks as well the—the role of
24 capacity. I think expansion of Javits would testify
25

1
2 it was done adequate. The template we should use is
3 another destination showing the city. Like London
4 that's all believe a major cities were our cities and
5 they have two convention sites as well outside the
6 city of London and oh, the scope is their jazz, if
7 you will. That's something the Building Congress and
8 I talked about, and we look to expand that as well.
9 Thank you for your time, and I look forward to
10 watching of course.

11 ROBB MCCANN: Well, thanks. Well, first
12 of all thank you all for this opportunity, well first
13 of all, thank you all for-for this opportunity that
14 we is doing everyday. Thank you Chairman Vallone.
15 Hi, Timmy. Everything I wanted to say has already
16 been covered pretty much, but let me just tell you
17 about myself. My name is Rob Mccaan. I work with
18 the Queens Economic Development Corporation. My boss
19 is someone some of you might know. About seven years
20 go we came, and I do have a founding in Queens stores
21 and Council, which I know well, and it started in
22 this space close to different people, getting
23 rejections with some, but we've built ourself up to
24 right now we have about 50 members, exactly 50% I
25 would say. Twenty-five of them are hotels. The

1 other members are everything you could imagine. We
2 have the big ones like Resource World, the Mets, the
3 USDA. We have the other ones like when we see a
4 moving imagine and at Queens Museums, we stay, and we
5 go all the way right down to the historic houses in
6 boroughs like Queens, which sets it quite good. We
7 get all of our promotions to through the Queens Brand
8 on our website is inqueens.com. Twitter is #it'sin
9 queens24.com/it's in queens; Instagram./it'sinqueens
10 and even more it's in Queens T-shirt, which you could
11 buy for \$10. It's a very good price. It matches
12 very—it would match very well with your tie, I might
13 add, Mr. Vallone. So, I have the same old ad. I
14 spend my days—I take a tour. I take tourism riders
15 and cabways around tours in the borough. I go to
16 conferences. I tell it all where you talk about the
17 people in the industry, and a weekly comment with
18 vets of what's going on in the borough. We also do a
19 weekly Thursday morning e-bar to tell what's going on
20 in the borough. We organize events such as Queens
21 Pay Plus. Queens has its own restaurant week.
22 There's a New York City company that's in Queens. It
23 has a restaurant week. The price point is a little
24 bit high in our borough. So, we do our own, which is
25

1
2 actually three weeks because the restaurants are so
3 good in Queens when we do the math, and so that's
4 kind of what I do. We're basically for all intents
5 and purposes we're a line item on-on-on the Queens
6 Economic Development Corporation's budget, but we've
7 been through a lot with-with little because we work
8 New York City & Company, which provides us with a lot
9 of these giant hurdles, and the foundation funds us.
10 Plus the Queens Borough President gives us some
11 money, and give us free office space, which is very
12 important. In terms of we serve the Council and the
13 Queens Economic Development Corporation, we are both
14 very much in favor this legislation, and how we work
15 with you, and how we want, and as collaborate and
16 we're involved with the City Council in general and
17 other initiatives the involve tourism. We do work
18 with the BIDs. We do work-work with a lot of the
19 agencies that receive city money, and so, you know, I
20 think this is the-the larger pool. I want to also
21 tell you a little story about what's [bell] those do
22 right now. I knew I was going get that. Keep going?
23 Alright, we've got \$112,000 from the state, which is
24 the Empire State Development Corporation. It's
25 basically to have a New York entity for this time of

1 the year. Okay? We created bottom through a 5,000
2 copies of Queens in Your Pocket, which is notebook
3 that tells you all about everything that's going on
4 in the world. We did a culinary thing about the
5 restaurants with culinary factories, just a really
6 good piece about a culinary sector company. If you
7 ever want to like go to Athens or Istanbul or Muslin,
8 they have great books on where to eat. We—we did a
9 photo called the Great Day in Queens about our—also
10 the borough and we got 133 different immigrants for
11 that. They take a photo, which mimics the famous
12 photography, a famous photo of jazz rates that was
13 taken in 1958. This was taken by that photographer's
14 son. We've promoting it through a poster and other
15 ways, and we—we also have with that money we—we did
16 a—a pull-out sessions in the Daily News on the
17 Rockaways. We started a weekly Tide Cast. We took
18 the whole page ad I the Wall Street Journal's Travel
19 Magazine, which comes out in October. This is
20 another one USA today. They're the same thing and we
21 has a kiosk at the US Open where we gave away stuff
22 for the entire two weeks. That was with \$112,000.
23 Just imagine when you give it—when you're giving
24 funds to small non-profit agencies, you can get a lot
25

1 done in the juris sector, and I know I'm way over
2 time. So, thank you very much, and I will happy tax
3 money. (sic)
4

5 AILEEN FUCHS: Wow, so that's involved.
6 Good-good afternoon, Chairs. My name Aileen Fuchs.
7 I'm the President and CEO of Snug Harbor Cultural
8 Center & Botanical Gardens in Staten Island. Thank
9 you for inviting our testimony. Snug Harbor is a
10 historical complex of 26 buildings, 14 gardens,
11 wetlands, parkland, a farm and multiple organization
12 on 80 acres. We are a proud member of the CIG,
13 Facility Affiliate and a Cultural Neighbor of Staten
14 Island. We have programs in health, live lines,
15 horticulture and agriculture. Snug Harbor is the
16 property manager and home to Staten Island museums
17 and the Children's Museum, and Bear Collections (sic)
18 and other organizations and 40 plus volumes in the
19 arts. We are the borough's only botanic gardens. We
20 are Staten Island's back yard and a source of
21 tremendous community pride. Our patrons are upwards
22 of 400,000 visitors a year to our gardens, galleries,
23 school and museums. Our site employs over 250 people
24 who may be collectively the largest cultural
25 organization on Staten Island. Using statistics on

1
2 American city—Americans for the Arts, we estimate our
3 current impact at \$17.6 million per year and nearly
4 \$1 million in the tax burden there. Snug Harbor has
5 held up strongly against the public empire partners
6 including the Borough President's Office, the
7 Department of Transportation, NYPD and any around
8 this mall to maximize the economics out to the North
9 Shore. We are located in Staten Island Opportunity
10 Ville, which is the highest property area under one
11 vitalization. We in the know this district from
12 beyond the local area with confident impact on local
13 businesses, simulating economic development.
14 Increasing our construction (sic) by just 10% would
15 generate at least \$1.5 million and permanent impact
16 for already underserved North Shore Community.
17 Today, they are reading the impact of transportation
18 information to improve our office and the Staten
19 Island Ferry and infrastructure to upgrade our own
20 security, safety and bring that on our site and
21 improve visitor experience. Some harbors are known
22 to attract tourism as a precedent. A lasting
23 partnership with New York Event communicated we would
24 have been the first annual NYC Winter and the
25 Festival, which will run through January 6th. To

1 date more than 30,000 tickets have been sold. The
2 crowd is getting tremendous. That's a huge, huge for
3 us. The festival is the official event that we're
4 Tri-National Tourist Office New York for 2018, and we
5 have it at the Indoor/Outdoor Mall, which is
6 providing channel service to the North Shore. (sic)
7 We see this as an opportunity to introduce new
8 audiences to the magic of the Snug Harbor. Snug
9 Harbor is a major—a major cultural attractions at our
10 North Shore. So, our residents across the Borough in
11 New York City and terms be made with an increasing
12 number of domestic and international tourists whose
13 members will only grow throughout this mall, and
14 folks out of nearby St. George's in records today.
15 With 1003, lessons they have brought and Invited new
16 energy as interest in Snug Harbor from Eastern Road.
17 Further investing Snug Harbor in the North Shore
18 Transportation infrastructure will provide our
19 community with our new jobs and new opportunities and
20 to strengthen our position and our mission to become
21 a nationally invisible and it will impact all across
22 the nation. Thank you so much.

24 ALEXANDRA SILVERSMITH: Thank you. So
25 good afternoon. Thank you for having me. My name

1
2 Alexandra Silversmith and I'm the Executive Director
3 of Alliance for Coney Island. Our non-profit
4 represents a lot of the 12 business or I should say
5 all as well all the stakeholders in Coney Island,
6 Snug Harbor, the things all around the Aquarium. The
7 fights that has been going on. That as you actually
8 might have noticed we wouldn't--did not come up to
9 today, which I was actually quite shocked and Paul is
10 wondering about EDC and NYC & Co. So, all the more
11 reason that I'm going to use this advocate and also
12 strongly support the use of the South Shore, this
13 very harbor of tremendous visitorship. Among other
14 places, we have no gates, and so all of our
15 leadership has really been from the MTA and the MTA
16 was to open our gates on the high business days like
17 July 4th and Mothers Again for Free (sic). So I'm
18 here today because believe that it is an essential
19 for the city to support us as we continue to grow our
20 amusement district. As the a growing destination we
21 are evolving and continuously have our amusement
22 district adding new attractions to the landscape.
23 Well, we-they are marketing entities that are
24 clearing these for marketing support and engaging in
25 the New York City Campaign. Alongside our growing

1
2 attractions, we think increase in foreign tourism to
3 the area, which points to a need for the city's
4 empirical(sic) markets and attract foreign visitors
5 to the subways once they're coming out. Our unions
6 need to know that the primary family and businesses
7 has grown to include the new funding for
8 amphitheater, and welcome the expansion of integral
9 punctual covered establishments like new aquarium.
10 Many of these business are latent key businesses
11 meaning they've been kind of surviving from the
12 development plans, rebuilding and to preserve them.
13 And posters will be part of it coming on the scene
14 today. We complete in the face of challenging
15 perception of crime (sic) and spacing and I believe
16 the city can help tremendously by encouraging the
17 increasing the visibility and all coming out to us
18 to offer, and improving our image for New Yorkers and
19 the mentors through marketing support. Finally, we
20 welcome any questions, and stand on opportunities in
21 Coney Island. We face many challenges with transit
22 access. While we are excited with development of so
23 many of the vacant lots that would take our landscape
24 precisely, we are losing an area that has been used
25 for parking, and our same authority we used for

1 multiple parking lots and use of MINS (sic) While we
2 have a—we continue to push public—public
3 transportation to areas to need, we are but a beach
4 destination and that type of destination brings more
5 garbage literally than any other cultural destination
6 in the New York City. Public transportation also
7 hinders the growth as we are under the mark of the
8 MTA and on average abides from a high states of rent.
9 On a good day, both churning the litter from visiting
10 and, you know, you can't a lot it much time to get
11 them there. So, we—we community for Rapid Bus and
12 Train service as well as implementation of ferries
13 both of which we—we desperately need it to provide
14 transit alternatives, and enable the visitors to at
15 least try the plan so they can experience the salt
16 and need of our neighborhood. The last thing I will
17 [bell] mention because I know I'm out of time is just
18 the Report of Challenge (sic) and it came up with an
19 event code that we have been instructed to build
20 partnerships. We have hundreds of jobs. Be sure
21 you're part of the Partners so we have over 7 million
22 visitors, but we have not created a top pipeline so
23 we can tap into that opportunity, and we think that
24 there's a big opportunity for college students
25

1 especially from someone if he wants to really build
2 that relationship and manage his staff. Thank you so
3 much.
4

5 ANGELA SUNG PINSKY: I am—my name is
6 Angela Sung Pinsky. I'm the Executive Director for
7 the Association for a Better New York. Thank you for
8 allowing me to testify. So, earlier this year ABNY
9 partnered with Times Square Alliance to support and
10 sponsor the Center for an Urban Future Study that
11 continued work, and really, I just want to echo
12 around the thing that both Jonathan and Ken mentioned
13 that are support for the Dashboard and our support
14 for comprehensive planning, but really what ABNY was
15 interested in the Study was because, you know, year
16 over year we saw the Bedford number for it coming in
17 for nearly two decades and the question according to
18 us as we saw the conversations about growth both in
19 residential and in in the—in the employee sector is
20 space work. Those are also hitting record highs.
21 What is this growth really doing to the city? Sixty
22 million people come to the city is a great
23 opportunity for economic revenue, and the supporting
24 of our goal of cultural, retail and businesses and in
25 the other institutions, but our we paying for it

1
2 appropriately? What are the demands that these
3 people bring to the city in our public realm and our
4 transportation infrastructure and other
5 infrastructure and are we really making the most
6 these opportunities that they bring by having all
7 these additional people come. So, we really thought
8 it would be interesting to learn those—those
9 questions. It's important to sit down with you guys
10 and nobody lying to you. The buying, which I know
11 that the tourist industry is the bigger part of our
12 economy than we previously thought that they grow
13 tourism in the street and just support our
14 traditional tourism institutions, but they have
15 spurred growth in these sectors including the travel
16 tack which we find really exciting and
17 transportation. The tour—and the tourism sector is
18 vital source alone of employment, but good paying
19 jobs and jobs that have a ladder for people to
20 advance on So, it's a vital part of our employment
21 economy, and our concern also with that the tourism
22 industry is also subject to and very sensitive to
23 changes. We've seen in the past what a strong dollar
24 and a weak dollar does to the influx of international
25 tourism, and we also at the time of—of engagement and

1 study we're concerned about what the national
2 sentiment we're getting to -to our local economy.
3 So, I think that it's important for us to be aware
4 that now that the tech-the tourist sector is such a
5 big portion of our economy that flush issues downward
6 are also very dangerous for us in addition to the
7 amount of pressure that our created with the growth.
8 So, a couple of our additions to the report that-that
9 were in such time that they need to-to strategically
10 plan for growth in this sector. The city should
11 created multi-dimensional plans and strategies, but
12 it didn't have to subject to the same way or in the
13 same comprehensive way that approaches affordable
14 housing and economic development. There needs to be
15 a strengthening of the immigration of tourism
16 missions with other city efforts and other city
17 agencies [bell] initially, and planning, and increase
18 in the priority and improving the tourism experience
19 from way finding to airports with translations
20 services. There are ways to improve the
21 accessibility of the city and sometimes it's just
22 minor adaptations. So, we are all very excited
23 because this industry keeps growing, but we also
24

1 excited about the opportunity to work with you to
2 plan for this sector.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: That's the four
5 panes. Thank you. I'm just going to ask for the
6 closing statement by Councilman, Councilman Powers.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Sure. I want to
8 ask for just a question, and then give our closing
9 statement, and I-I-I have loved today, but I just
10 felt the echo--there was a--there was to BJ and the
11 hotel folks. There was a recommendation earlier for
12 Diaz and Tim brought it up, and I listened to it
13 about I think you had said we should definitely do
14 it. We should look at doing a--a--editing a portion of
15 the hotel passes and perhaps all the stuff that is
16 generated from hotels towards--towards tourism, and in
17 general, the New York City & Company or something
18 like that. Do you have any--any thoughts on that?

19 VIJAY DANPANANI: Well, we certainly
20 encourage that to doing great times and compliment
21 that I think. (laughter) So, the history and so
22 tourism was doing a big mistake in the past that you
23 did call just before you time of the Giuliani
24 Administration. New York City had a big policy so
25 that likes of people's--the highest tax structure for

1
2 any city in the country. So we lost over 5% from
3 that, and there's almost, you know, Coalition on
4 Causation that they're careful relation between the
5 drop in the hotel one and the increases that they
6 got. So the Gen Fund is a logical replaceable and
7 earmark for it growing. We are big supporters of NYC
8 & Company and what Fred does. We think he does a
9 remarkable job. Suddenly this Coney Island aspect is
10 on the--on the--we--we should look it. They say if it
11 miss--this was missed, but we think that's where the
12 money should be going to enhance the real chapters.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: And all of them in
14 that section. Is--you mentioned the rates going--
15 declining or defining in terms of--

16 VIJAY DANPANANI: [interposing] Well, the
17 reason that--that they need this hotel file. Well,
18 one it's simple and two reasons. One reason they
19 supply growth, but the other reason is there's shadow
20 inventory for almost 110,000 rooms, and if you recall
21 my testimony I said there are 150,000 rooms in the
22 city. There's 110,000 relating the hallway, and one
23 seeing a few others that are in this mess. Even what
24 we now found and we see 2,000 of things, but also you
25 don't know that there's something on 2,000 hotels,

1 and so—and that is a problem. They bring the shadow
2 (sic) from landlords indicating this cultural fight,
3 but these guys are equally capable as I am.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Do they pay you
5 hotel taxes?

6 VIJAY DANPANANI: No, no, and it will be
7 really tough taxes. They said they are referring
8 taxes down 100%. There's a huge outage Friday,
9 already telling him I would transfer. He gave me the
10 same marketplace, and you don't have the same rules.
11 80 years by 70 and we sent it.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Okay, thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: And our Co-Chair
14 Jimmy Van Bramer.

15 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Just this it's
16 currently 4:00 at City Hall. I just want to say
17 thank you to all of you for you for joining us, and I
18 think it was a great hearing, and great partnership
19 between the two of us and Rocky(sic) we're not sure.
20 It just made it perfect so—[laughter]

21 CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: I think that's
22 wild. I think you—you have one other than that.

23 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: You live about
24 50 feet from him. [laughter] Do that with anyone.
25

1

2

CHAIRPERSON VALLONE: With that I think

3

I'm going to thank you and thank you to the staff and

4

to those for saying this is just the first step. So,

5

none of us are going to have that. [laughter]

6

[background comments/pause]

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 28, 2018