

City Council Testimony

November 27th, 2017

Barbara Chang

Executive Director

NYC Mayor's Office of Workforce Development

Committee on Small Business

Committee on Labor and Civil Service

Thank you, Chairs Cornegy and Miller for the opportunity to speak about the Office of Workforce Development and our systems-coordinating work. My name is Barbara Chang, and I serve as Executive Director of the Mayor's Office of Workforce Development (WKDEV). The WKDEV office works primarily on policy, system coordination and strategy; we work in partnership with more than a dozen City agencies, as well as business leaders, education and training providers, and community stakeholders to ensure the City's economic vitality today and in the future. We also oversee the Workforce Development Board – a body with a majority of business members required under the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) of 2014 and we coordinate with the Center for Youth Employment (CYE), an initiative of the Mayor's Fund.

In 2014, our office released the report *Career Pathways, One City Working Together*, a guiding strategy describing how elements of the City's workforce system should align and connect to one another to support the city's growing businesses and economic development and to ensure that New Yorkers are prepared to enter career-track jobs in key sectors. The Career Pathways approach connects progressive levels of education, training, support services and credentials, while working with employers to grow a pipeline of skilled workers for in-demand occupations.

In January of last year, our office testified regarding our *Career Pathways: Progress Update* on the progress the city has made towards an efficient and effective workforce system that helps New Yorkers connect with careers that provide economic stability and mobility. Since the last time we appeared before you, we have made progress in several of the key focus areas of the report:

1. **Build Skills Employers Seek:** Working with our partners at NYC Small Business Services, we have supported the launch and growth of five industry partnerships announced in Career Pathways. These include the New York Alliance for Careers in Healthcare, NYC Tech Talent Pipeline, the NYC Food & Beverage Hospitality Council, and Construction and Manufacturing Partnerships. The goal of these partnerships is to work with industry to provide sustainable solutions to connect New Yorkers to opportunities in these sectors. I am joined here today by Jackie Mallon, First Deputy Commissioner of the Department of Small Business Services who will speak further on the work SBS has been doing to promote industry-informed solutions to workforce development.
2. **Increase Participation in Bridge and Training:** As we have shifted to Career Pathways as the framework for New York City's workforce development system, we have seen

increased investments in training for growing sectors of the economy. When Career Pathways launched, we set a goal of providing occupational training to 30,000 New Yorkers a year by 2020. In Fiscal Year 2017, we provided training to 23,988 New Yorkers, a 64% increase from the previous year. We are on track to meet our goal.

In addition to increases in training, we have made significant strides in promoting Bridge programming across the system. Bridge programs combine industry-specific instruction with foundational skills such as reading, math, and English. These programs allow jobseekers with limited educational attainment and low English proficiency to make progress toward occupational goals as they build their basic skills.

Bridge programs offer participants a clear next step to education, occupational training, or employment. Following the Career Pathways approach, our goal is to invest in Bridge programs that support individuals with low educational attainment and limited English skills on a path to a quality job. To determine the best approach for both jobseekers and businesses, we have piloted new programs such as Bridge for young adults with limited educational attainment, bridge for English Language Learners, bridge for foreign-born workers with advanced degrees, and sector contextualization in health care, technology, and the trades.

We also launched the NYC Bridge Bank to share curricula that can be used by Community Based Organizations and other partners that want to offer Bridge programs. Bridge programs are now included in a variety of City-funded programs, including HRA Youth Pathways, DYCD's In School Youth and Out of School Youth programs, the Young Adult Literacy Pilot, and several training programs developed by the Industry Partnerships and launched by our partners at SBS. We look forward to continuing to invest in occupational training and Bridge programs across the city's workforce system:

- 3. Improve Job Quality:** The De Blasio administration continues to lead the way in providing better protections for workers, including Paid Sick Leave and the Fair Scheduling Act. In 2015 we also launched Best for NYC, a campaign that recognizes employers who are committed to offering high quality jobs and who value employee retention. Best for NYC has expanded to serve a network of 1,500 employers beyond the 2015 goal of 500 employers.

Building on the initial success of Best for NYC, in 2017, more than 100 employers began work to adopt a workforce innovation to improve the quality of jobs for their employees, including hiring, training, and promotion. Earlier this month, JP Morgan Chase Foundation announced a grant that will deepen the impact of Best for NYC in the Bronx, by connecting participating businesses to one-on-one support and business opportunities.



- 4. Connect Economic Development to the Workforce:** Working with our partners across the City, our office works to connect Economic Development activities and growth sectors to low-income jobseekers. In 2015, we launched HireNYC, one of the largest targeted hiring programs in the nation, which leverages our city purchasing power to create opportunities for more New Yorkers.

Since the program launched, HireNYC has connected over 5,000 New Yorkers to job opportunities, benefiting both businesses and job seekers. The jobs include a variety of industries; from human services to construction. We have also supported efforts to connect New Yorkers to living wage work, through the launch of ApprenticeNYC and the New York Works initiative, both of which are coordinated through NYCEDC.

- 5. Expand resources for youth employment:** A project of the Mayor's Fund to Advance New York City, the Center for Youth Employment is working to increase work experiences for young people to put them on career pathways. This past fiscal year more than 92,000 young adults participated in summer jobs, internships and mentorship experiences. This puts the Center for Youth Employment on pace to achieve the Mayor's goal of supporting at least 100,000 youth in career development experiences. We applaud the work of our colleagues at CYE and the City Council to connect more young people to these opportunities and we look forward to working with both of them in the coming years.

The Center for Youth Employment also helped inform the final report of the Youth Employment Task Force, that was released this last spring. The Task Force was co- led by Deputy Mayor Richard Buery and Council Finance Committee Chair Julissa Ferreras-Copeland and included leaders from non-profits, industry, philanthropy, and government. The report issued several recommendations on the Summer Youth Employment Program, which has nearly doubled under this administration—from 36,000 in 2013, the year before the Mayor took office, to nearly 70,000 this past summer. Additionally, funds have been baselined to ensure that the Summer Youth Employment Program remains at this higher level going forward. We are grateful for this productive partnership with the Council.

- 6. Coordinate Systems Change:** To address workforce and industry needs at the appropriate scale and in a long-term, sustainable way, we have been working to shift the workforce development system. The goal of the Mayor's Office of Workforce Development is to foster a more coordinated and collaborative effort across City-funded programs to connect New Yorkers to career pathways. This shift away from rapid-attachment to work is evident in the types of programs this Administration has invested in such as courses that lead New Yorkers to careers with family-supporting wages. The

Office of Workforce Development led the effort to establish common definitions and metrics across all City programs. By establishing these measurements, we are shifting towards a system that is better coordinated, and defines success beyond just training or job placement, but also the movement of an individual along a career path.

To give a few examples of our work with agency partners, in 2015, the Human Resources Administration released a series of RFPs that demonstrated a shift away from rapid-attachment to work, and an investment in training and bridge programming for low-income jobseekers. Likewise, with the support of the Council, DYCD included Career Pathways investments in both Out of School and In School Youth Programming. Our colleagues at SBS also continue to work with industry, neighborhoods, and small businesses to better connect the job seekers most in need in this city to pathways to opportunity.

Fundamentally, these systems-shifting changes lay the groundwork to realizing the Career Pathways goals of providing access to secure jobs for low-income, low-skilled New Yorkers and to help them maintain stable employment and earn a family-supporting wage, while ensuring that New York City's businesses can find the talent they need.

To share more about the work this Administration has accomplished with industry partnerships, small businesses, and local talent, I give the floor to my colleague Jackie Mallon at the NYC Office of Small Business Services.

TESTIMONY BY
FIRST DEPUTY COMMISSIONER
JACKIE MALLON
NEW YORK CITY
DEPARTMENT OF SMALL BUSINESS SERVICES
BEFORE
THE COMMITTEE ON SMALL BUSINESS
AND
THE COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
MONDAY, NOVEMBER 27, 2017

Good morning Chair Cornegy, Chair Miller and the members of the Committees on Small Business and Civil Service and Labor. My name is Jackie Mallon and I am the First Deputy Commissioner of the New York City Department of Small Business Services ("SBS"). At SBS, we aim to unlock economic potential and create economic security for all New Yorkers by connecting New Yorkers to quality jobs, building stronger businesses, and fostering vibrant neighborhoods across the five boroughs. Today I am pleased to provide Council with an update on our work in support of Mayor De Blasio's Workforce Development strategy, Career Pathways: One City Working Together.

In addition to assisting small businesses and commercial corridors, SBS is responsible for helping New Yorkers find jobs by connecting jobseekers to employers and local residents to industry-informed training. Through our network of 21 Workforce1 Career Centers, SBS provides recruitment expertise, industry knowledge, and skill-building workshops to match candidates to jobs. Annually, we successfully connect more than 25,000 New Yorkers with quality employment and nearly 4,000 New Yorkers with the training needed to advance their careers.

In support of the objective to help workers secure good paying jobs in fast growing sectors laid out by Career Pathways, SBS has instituted a job quality policy, which requires businesses receiving free recruitment services through our Workforce1 Career Centers to hire employees for full-time positions or pay at least the living wage rate (which is currently \$13.65 per hour). As a result, to date, we have seen a significant increase in the percent of New Yorkers connected to full-time work, from about 45% in 2014 up to around 80% in 2017. We've also seen a significant increase in the average wage of that work from \$10.70 in 2014 to \$13.25 in 2017. The City also utilizes our

Workforce1 Career Centers to connect New Yorkers to open positions created through the City's purchases and investments via HireNYC. Through the SBS-operated HireNYC Portal, vendors who receive certain new City contract awards are now required to consider New Yorkers for employment opportunities.

As projected in Career Pathways, SBS has significantly increased our investment in helping New Yorkers prepare, connect and advance in the key sectors that drive New York City's economy. Our training investments share two characteristics:

1. The trainings are designed to help low-income New Yorkers gain access to living wage jobs that they otherwise struggle to find and secure;
2. The investments are informed by industry and designed to meet employer needs.

One of the primary ways we ensure alignment with industry is through our industry partnerships. As proposed in Career Pathways, we have expanded our industry partnerships in Tech and Healthcare and have launched partnerships in Food Service/Hospitality, Construction and Industrial/Manufacturing. The goal of these industry partnerships is not only to connect New Yorkers to employment, but also to build a long term, sustainable connection between employers and the organizations that teach individuals the skills that are needed to enter and advance in the New York City job market. Through industry engagement, we are able to identify gaps in the labor market and develop new training models that can be replicated by providers throughout the City. We are aiming to address the systemic issues which have prevented some New Yorkers from participating in the economy of tomorrow.

With input from the employers of the industry partnerships, SBS has launched a number of new occupational training models to better meet the needs of employers and jobseekers, including models tailored for Out-of-School, Out-of-Work young adults, immigrants, and other low income New Yorkers.

Healthcare has the largest private sector employment in NYC. With the implementation of the Affordable Care Act and recent New York State Medicare and Medicaid redesign, this sector has added a significant number of new occupations. Through the New York Alliance for Careers in Healthcare (NYACH), our healthcare Industry Partnership, we have engaged healthcare employers to address the industry's rapidly changing labor force needs. To date, NYACH has developed a number of new training models, including a model designed to train low income immigrants with limited English proficiency for jobs as bi-lingual Medical Assistants. NYACH has also worked with the NYC Department of Education to redesign the core healthcare curriculum used by Career and Technical Education (CTE) schools to reflect the needs of today's healthcare employers.

Launched in 2014, our Tech industry partnership, the Tech Talent Pipeline (TTP) is designed to support the inclusive growth of the NYC tech sector and prepare New Yorkers for 21st century jobs. The Tech Talent Pipeline works with 225 companies, 16 local colleges, and additional public and private partners to define employer needs, develop training, education and recruitment models to meet these needs, and scale solutions throughout the City, delivering quality talent for the City's businesses and quality jobs for New Yorkers. Since the launch, TTP has developed 10 new trainings informed by industry, resulting in more than 450 people connected to employment.

These efforts are just a part of TTP's larger mission of catalyzing continuous and lasting alignment with industry throughout the City's public systems. For instance, TTP has worked closely with the City University of New York (CUNY) to launch an initiative to double the number of graduates with tech bachelor's degrees by 2022.

Another growing industry that provides an opportunity for good paying jobs is construction. Our construction industry partnership, "The Mayor's Committee on Construction," consists of the City's building construction trade unions, pre-apprenticeship programs, trade employers and associations, Mayoral Agencies and City Public Authorities. This year the Committee has focused on connecting more New Yorkers to apprenticeship programs through the Mayor's Green Jobs Corps program. Working with the Mayor's Offices of Sustainability and Climate Policy, SBS is leading this three-year initiative, which will train 3,000 individuals through a variety of trainings, including pre-apprenticeships.

Last year we launched our newest Industry Partnership, the NYC Food & Beverage Hospitality Council, an alliance of more than 30 leaders in foodservice, to promote the sustained growth of the local food and beverage industry. The Council's goals include addressing the industry's skills gap and labor shortage and helping small businesses navigate the regulatory environment. The Council has informed new initiatives, including Stage NYC, a new training program which provides out of school and out of work young adults on the job training and leads to careers in the restaurant industry, and Food Business Pathways, an entrepreneurship initiative designed to empower NYCHA residents to start and grow food businesses.

We have also launched our industrial and manufacturing Industry Partnership. Through this partnership, we are bringing together a wide range of manufacturing and industrial businesses across the City to address the industry's rapidly changing labor force needs and the fast pace of innovation. In support of the Mayor and the City Council's Industrial Action Plan, we have launched a number of trainings to prepare New Yorkers for the industrial and manufacturing jobs of the future, including a contextualized High School Equivalency Diploma program in partnership with DOE's District 79 in West Farms. Currently this partnership is focused on launching the Mayor's first Apprenticeship NYC program for Computer Numerically Controlled machinists. We expect that program to launch in the 2nd quarter of next year.

Through our Industry Partnerships, SBS is working hand in hand with the leaders of the fastest growing industries to ensure New Yorkers are equipped with the necessary skills to succeed in the 21st Century economy. Thank you and I will be happy to take any questions now.



Testimony of the United Federation of Teachers

By Sterling Roberson, Vice President for Career and Technical Education
Before the City Council Committee on Civil Service and Labor,
and the Committee on Small Business

Regarding Career Pathways and Workforce Development Systems

Nov. 27, 2017

Good morning and thank you for the opportunity to testify here today for the United Federation of Teachers. On behalf of the union's 200,000 members, we would like to thank Chairs I. Daneek Miller and Robert E. Cornegy, Jr., and the Committees on Civil Service and Labor and Small Business for holding this hearing. We're here today because of our commitment to providing all children educational pathways to a brighter future. Our members and students benefit from your diligence and critical oversight over the career and academic resources they need to best position our students for successful lives.

In 2015, Mayor de Blasio's administration released the OneNYC Plan, a comprehensive blueprint for addressing the city's social, economic and environmental challenges. To support the plan's ambitious goals for workforce development in growing sectors of the economy, the City committed to ensuring that all students in the five boroughs have access to an education that enables them to build the skills they need through real-world, work-based learning experiences.

It is critical to strengthen and expand career and technical education programs in the city to achieve these bold objectives. Career and technical education programs help keep students from falling through the cracks by offering alternatives to traditional higher education and equipping them for well-paid, secure work.

Our union's advocacy on behalf of expanding career and technical education programs is well known. I can speak firsthand about the impact of career and technical education on students, from my experience as both a veteran career and technical education teacher and as an advocate for quality CTE programs and policies that strengthen our efforts toward graduating young people with certified credentials.

We have made great strides in growing CTE opportunities in the city in recent years. Six new CTE programs launched over the past year, with 16 more coming by the end of next year and an additional 23 planned by 2019. Just last month, we held a CTE High School Fair at George Westinghouse High School, which represented 75 schools and drew 800 middle school students and their families.



We also held a CTE Expo at the Transit Tech High Schools for middle school guidance counselors this past June, as well as CTE expos featuring industry and college partners, including a panel discussion called Bright Futures: Girls in CTE. We've increased funding for CTE programs and made it available to all programs based on student enrollment.

Three years ago, the city set a goal to provide 1,000 additional work-based learning opportunities for students over a three-year period. We've exceeded that goal, and we're still creating internships for even more students. Internships provide real-world experience and on-the-job training in a nurturing environment. It's a great way to introduce our students to the rigors of a job.

We must continue developing work-focused educational initiatives in addition to career and technical education programs. To that end, we're working to expand access to computer science and technology education and have trained more than 100 teachers in that field. We're working with industries to help with reviewing curriculum to ensure students are learning what they need to succeed in CTE programs and obtain entry-level jobs. We're also providing industry with an opportunity to engage with and better prepare teachers to provide a truly positive CTE experience to their students.

We're increasing postsecondary attainment throughout the city through articulation agreements between CTE schools and universities. In October, the UFT held a symposium with LEGO Education to help educators explore how to use LEGO robotics to teach their students the critical STEM, coding, and mechanical skills that are in high demand in some of the city's highest-growth industries.

As we continue to work together to offer New York's children as many roads to success as possible, we must consider how we ensure access and equity. How do we make our programs accessible to students with disabilities and English language learners? How do we expand educational programs for incarcerated individuals to help them rehabilitate and start over — and to cut down on recidivism?

To answer these questions and keep advancing educational opportunities in the city, the UFT will continue to work with your committees and this council, and partner with local businesses to review curricula, provide professional learning opportunities, and improve CTE program quality our students need to succeed in a today's knowledge economy.

Again Chairs Miller and Cornegy, we thank you and your committees and we want you to know that the UFT is counting on your continued advocacy for the programs all of our students need and deserve.



**NEW YORK CITY
CENTRAL LABOR COUNCIL AFL-CIO**

President
VINCENT ALVAREZ

Secretary-Treasurer
JANELLA T. HINDS



**Testimony on Workforce Development in New York City
New York City Central Labor Council, AFL-CIO**

New York City Council Committee(s) on Small Business and Civil Service & Labor

November 27, 2017

Good morning, my name is Alex Gleason, and I am the Policy Associate at the New York City Central Labor Council, AFL-CIO. Representing 1.3 million workers across 300 affiliated unions, the Central Labor Council advocates lifting the floor on standards and wages for all workers in New York City. The Central Labor Council's workforce development arm, the Consortium for Worker Education (CWE), operates training programs positively impacting every neighborhood and tens-of-thousands of workers annually—this is only one of many examples.

The Consortium for Worker Education (CWE) provides a range of workforce development programs through more than 30 community-based organizations and its 29 union partnerships. One program in particular, Jobs to Build On, is funded in part by the City Council, and has trained more than 14,400 individuals, while placing 19,000 in jobs with an average wage of \$14.00 per hour. Last year alone, Jobs to Build On created and tracked over 2,000 placements. Connecting workers with the classes, skills, and certifications, Jobs to Build On places workers on track for in-demand positions with opportunities for training and career ladders. CWE trains tens-of-thousands of other workers through a multitude of programs across industries.

One industry the Labor Movement is particularly equipped to train and prepare workers for is in construction. A unionized apprenticeship program is only successful when there is a pipeline of work to grow and expand market share; this is made possible through rigorous safety and licensing standards, and successful labor-management partnerships. Fundamentally, this is controlled by the standards government places on a project; development is a vehicle for economic opportunity that can have long-run benefits.

As local hire and pipelines to apprenticeship have been established and implemented, the City's communities—and tax base—benefit. According to the Economic Policy Institute, minorities accounted for 61.8% of all city residents' union apprenticeships, and black construction workers earn 36.1% more than black nonunion construction workers; this goes directly back into communities most in need of investment and development¹. Union training and standards are not only anti-poverty tools, but positive contributors to the neighborhood multiplier effect.

The Labor Movement has already built the infrastructure to train and connect workers with careers; it is specifically our job. The New York City Central Labor Council and Consortium for Worker Education are prepared to collaborate in any ways that connect workers with the education and training necessary to succeed in the workforce.

¹ Mishel, Lawrence. "Diversity in the New York City Union and Nonunion Construction Sectors." March 2, 2017. Accessed November 2017. <http://www.epi.org/publication/diversity-in-the-nyc-construction-union-and-nonunion-sectors/>.

TESTIMONY OF CHRISTIAN GONZÁLEZ-RIVERA, CENTER FOR AN URBAN FUTURE
BEFORE THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL COMMITTEES ON
SMALL BUSINESS AND CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR

JOINT OVERSIGHT HEARING
"Update on Career Pathways/Workforce Development Systems"

November 27, 2017

My name is Christian González-Rivera, and I am a senior researcher at the Center for an Urban Future, an independent, non-partisan research organization based here in Manhattan that that generates smart and sustainable public policies to reduce inequality, expand economic opportunity, and grow the economy. For more than 20 years, the Center has focused on skills-building and jobs, publishing reports on subjects ranging from the importance of ESOL and adult basic education programs to the need to improve the city's youth workforce development system. The Center for an Urban Future produced the first independent assessment of Career Pathways a year after it was established, and since then we have published reports on how the workforce system can better serve New York's immigrant workers and on the challenges that small businesses face in connecting to the workforce development system. Thank you for the opportunity to testify.

Career Pathways is a strategy for boosting economic opportunity that makes sense for New York. In the past, workforce development relied on placing as many people as possible into available jobs with little regard for quality or fit. But in today's economy, employers in every industry are demanding more skills from their workers than ever before. The model laid out in the *Career Pathways* report is designed to create a human capital development system for people with less formal education or other barriers to employment by investing in training, education, and bridge programs, and aligning workforce development programs to the needs of employers.

To its credit, the de Blasio administration has acknowledged that human capital development is one of the most important factors in ensuring economic opportunity for New Yorkers and set about creating a blueprint for how New York City might create an effective human capital development system that connects workforce development, higher education, job training, and basic skills training into a cohesive whole. But our research has shown that there are serious barriers to implementation that could derail the momentum that has been built. I will mention five.

Career Pathways is running on a fraction of the funding it needs. The *Career Pathways* report called for an annual investment of \$100 million on training programs and \$60 million on bridge programs. Yet currently a little more than half of the training investment goal has been hit, and just \$6.4 million out of the \$60 million has been secured. New York City cannot depend on the federal government right now to make investments in the success of lower-income folks and people without a postsecondary degree who make up 51 percent of the city's

workforce. And while the state should really be stepping up its investments in workforce development, New York City cannot wait for the state to act. Furthermore, the kinds of investments needed to truly transform the workforce development system into a human capital development system that can meet the challenges of the 21st-century economy can only come from funding that is flexible and attuned to the demands of New York's entrepreneurial workforce development providers. Federal and state funding is mired in red tape, and its measures for success have been out of date since the 1990s. Private philanthropic dollars provide flexibility and encourage innovation, but there is not enough funding there to scale up programs and models that work to serve more people, and to sustain that funding long-term. New York City can do much better, but it must invest in Career Pathways itself, just as it invested in universal prekindergarten and mental health services through ThriveNYC.

The workforce development system is not serving small businesses. Last month, the Center published an entire report, entitled *Making the Connection*, analyzing this disconnect. Despite the laudable goal of career-track skills building articulated in the Career Pathways plan, workforce development providers are evaluated and reimbursed largely based on how many people they can place into jobs. This economic reality means providers have an overwhelming incentive to work almost exclusively with large businesses that can hire big batches of workers at once, rather than with small businesses that might add only one or two employees at a time. As we document in our report, this represents a huge missed opportunity for New York, because small businesses are the engine of growth in New York City's economy. Every year since 2001, firms with fewer than 20 employees have added three times as many jobs to the city's economy as companies with more than 500 employees: a net average of 17,521 jobs annually in small businesses, compared to 6,504 jobs at firms with 500 employees or more. Small businesses are the leading edge of job creation in many of New York's emerging and fastest-growing industries, including tech, life sciences, restaurants, and healthcare. Yet many small businesses report that they are encountering challenges in recruiting and retaining workers. Having access to talent is one of the most important factors that determine whether a small business that may have been born in New York will choose to stay and grow up here. As one expert quoted in our report says, "Most of the jobs in New York City are in small businesses. We are leaving a lot of jobs on the table."

The workforce development system isn't listening enough to employers. In a rapidly changing economy, one of the toughest jobs for workforce development providers is figuring out what employers need when it comes to recruiting and retaining talent. Career Pathways intended to solve this problem by establishing Industry Partnerships, which were meant to serve as workforce intelligence units for six of the city's biggest industries. In a nutshell, the idea was that stakeholders from industry, workforce development, education, and other relevant fields would sit at the same table to discuss what employers in each industry want and expect from workers, and workforce development and education providers work to provide that. Of the six Industry Partnerships, the New York Alliance for Careers in Healthcare (NYACH) has been the most engaged. Established with philanthropic support in 2004, NYACH has been engaging large employers in the healthcare industry as well as CUNY to develop better programs. The Tech Talent Pipeline has also been coordinating training efforts in the tech industry. But the fact is that we know very little about what the other four Industry Partnerships are doing, because they are being operated by SBS largely behind closed doors. The Industry Partnerships were supposed to create a two-way street between the city's industries and the entire workforce development system, and importantly, the *Career Pathways* report intended them to be a resource for the entire workforce development community. But SBS has not been transparent about what the goals of each of the Partnerships are, and few stakeholders outside of SBS have been able to engage substantively with them. This was the case two years ago when the

CUF did its independent evaluation of Career Pathways, and it's still the case today. Our research, which included interviews with dozens of workforce development experts, providers, and others, indicates that in maximize the effectiveness of the Industry Partnerships, their host entity should fulfill three conditions. First, the entity should have the greatest credibility within each of the industries, to ensure that there is continuing support for their work. Second, funding support for the partnerships should be diversified to ensure that they are not vulnerable to the vagaries of political support across administrations. Finally, the entity that hosts them should be completely open to sharing the capacities of and learnings from the partnerships with all the other workforce stakeholders, both inside and outside the city administration. If any of these key elements are missing, the Industry Partnerships will simply not be effective.

The workforce development system doesn't have enough market intelligence on what works and how to scale it up. The Center for an Urban Future held a forum last week in which we asked five respected leaders in the workforce development community what it would take for more promising and proven programs to scale up. One of the main themes that came out of that discussion is that we don't have enough research and data from rigorous evaluations that show what works and what doesn't. Another was that too often, public contracts go to the organizations that submit the best RFPs, not necessarily the ones that have models that have been proven to work. And in the face of declining federal support for innovative approaches, more and more providers of effective programs are choosing to opt out of applying for public funding altogether. Public money is largely funding programs on the cheap, and certainly not providing resources for programs to evaluate what they are doing. The prospect of the best providers opting out of public funding is a crisis that threatens the ability of the human capital system to deliver services to the tens of thousands of New Yorkers who need them. Also, programs funded through public funds are still using those old yardsticks from the 1990s to measure success. Career Pathways was supposed to change that by establishing common metrics among all workforce development programs and agencies, but that effort is stalled due to lack of funding and an over-reliance on public sources of funding that do not prioritize evaluation and that are not optimized to fund what works.

The workforce development system falls far short when it comes to serving the hardest to serve. Immigrants, people with very low math and English-language literacy, youth and young adults who are neither in school nor working, formerly incarcerated people, and other hard-to-serve New Yorkers are all in the workforce development system's blind spot. Only specialized programs are serving these people adequately, but at a scale that is way below the need. The Center for an Urban Future in partnership with the Center for Popular Democracy published a study on the particular challenges immigrants face in the labor force—and also in connecting with the city's workforce development system—and found that the vast majority of people who do the lowest-wage jobs in the city are immigrants. Immigrants are 47 percent of the city's workforce, and yet half have only a high school degree or less. This makes immigrants the prime clients for the city's workforce development system, yet our research found that publicly funded workforce programs are just not producing results for them. As a result, many turn to predatory for-profit employment agencies that charge high fees to place them into jobs or take a cut of their wages. On the other side of the educational achievement spectrum, we also found that a third of immigrant workers have a bachelor's degree or higher, but more than one in four of these work in jobs that require little education. This "brain drain" is a losing proposition for educated immigrant workers as well as the city's economy. And all of this is for want of a system that can really meet the needs of these workers. But on this topic, the *Career Pathways* report is silent. But as we demonstrated in our report, most of the low-wage people with less formal education that Career Pathways is designed to help are immigrants. So, if Career Pathways doesn't work for immigrants, it just won't work.

As a keen observer of the workforce development community for several years now, the most remarkable transformation that I have been witnessing after the publication of the *Career Pathways* report is how much energy it pumped into the community. Immediately after publication providers were avidly debating its pros and cons, private foundations renewed their already sizeable contributions to the advancement of the field, and everyone engaged in productive conversations about what it means to remake workforce development to address the pressing needs and challenges of the modern economy.

But most of all, it has strengthened the debate about how public-sector investments need to modernize. There have been great workforce organizations who have been leveraging private money as well as public to do great work. And most of them have said that it is the private money that allows them to be innovative. Government investments have a long way to go to catch up to the innovation that private philanthropy is fomenting. But *Career Pathways* represents the city's best effort to move in the right direction. There's no reason to lose momentum now.

The Center for an Urban Future recommends doing the following:

- Fully fund Career Pathways with local city funds at least at the levels indicated in the report.
- Set aside some of that funding for rigorous evaluation of programs and setting up research infrastructure
- Put funding towards scaling up systems-level approaches that work
- Ensure that providers have incentives to work with small businesses as well as larger ones.
- Strengthen accountability for the Industry Partnerships. IP are a crucial lynchpin of the Career Pathways model, and must be held accountable to the entire human capital development system: city agencies, workforce development providers, and higher education institutions, adult education providers, and others.

The future of New York City's competitiveness lies in the quality of its workforce. The future of New York's role as a city of opportunity lies in how well its human capital development systems meet the needs of the modern economy. With *Career Pathways*, the de Blasio administration has done so much to build momentum around creating a cohesive human capital development system. But in order for this ambitious vision to realize its full potential of fulfilling the promise of opportunity for thousands of New Yorkers, it must be fully funded, and its main goals should be to foster innovation and collaboration.

Project Renewal

FOR THE RECORD

Stephanie Cowles, Deputy Director

11/27/17

My name is Stephanie Cowles. I work for Project Renewal. First I want to thank Councilman Cornegy for the opportunity to offer my testimony. It's a pleasure to be here today.

Project Renewal is a not for profit agency whose mission is to end the cycle of homelessness by empowering adults and children to obtain health, homes and jobs.

Project Renewal created the Culinary Arts Training Program in 1995 as a way to help homeless men and women *prepare for, get* and *advance in* good jobs in the food service industry. The six-month job-training program consists of two twelve-week segments. In the first, students learn basic cooking theory and food preparation; in the second, students intern in corporate dining services, catering companies and other food establishments. Upon program completion, clients receive a New York City Department of Health Food Handler's Certificate, which is necessary to work in all commercial kitchens in New York. All graduates work with our job developer for as long as it takes to find the best job for them. We follow them for at least a year after graduation and provide ongoing support groups for alumnae.

Our outcomes are excellent.

In 2016 84 students graduated from the Culinary Arts Program.

- We placed 74% of those who graduate in jobs

This compares very favorably to the outcomes of the U.S. Department of Labor report on the Job Training for the Homeless Demonstration Program, a study of 45,000 homeless people enrolled in federally-funded employment programs. According to the JTHDP study, the average placement rate for graduates was 47%,

- 79% retain their jobs for at least 3 months; the national average is only 50%.
- 74% of Culinary Arts graduates retain their jobs for at least 6 months and
- 57% keep their jobs for at least a year.
- Average starting wage \$12.89 per hour

The rates at which Culinary Arts graduates retain their jobs are also markedly higher than the national average.

FOR THE RECORD

Along with our culinary program, we also train people to work in the social services sector. Our new on the job internship program (NSIP) trains people to work as residential aides or maintenance technicians in supportive residences and shelters. This is an 8 week program in which people are paid while they learn the ins and outs of working in residential facilities. Trainees receive 4 industry recognized certificates when they graduate. Outcomes for this program are also highly successful and mirror those of the Culinary Training Program.

So why have these program been so effective in getting the hardest to employ New Yorkers jobs? For two reasons. For one, along with skills training, our employment programs provide case management services to help trainees with some of the many issues that arise preventing them from succeeding at the job like child care, substance use or criminal justice involvement. This consistent support has been crucial to helping people get trained, get employed and sustain a job. Our services are tailored to each individual. Over the years, we have developed long term relationships with many employers who work well with our interns and graduates. Secondly, our training is sector specific. We train people in skills where we know jobs exist. And the opportunities are for people with educational and vocational backgrounds similar to our clients. In New York City, food service and social services are sectors that always have openings for entry level positions. Plus these are positions in which a real career ladder exists leading to higher paying jobs.

We are very grateful for the support the city council has given us over the years and hope for continued support for these very important programs. Thank you.

Testimony of Evelyn Ortiz, Chief External Affairs Officer – Opportunities for a Better Tomorrow (OBT)

**Oversight Hearing - Update on Career Pathways/Workforce Development Systems
Monday, November 27, 2017**

Good morning. My name is Evelyn Ortiz and I am the Chief External Affairs Officer at Opportunities for a Better Tomorrow (OBT). Thank you Hon. Chair Members Miller, Cornegy and fellow members of the Council. I am pleased to be here today to provide testimony regarding the city's Career Pathways program.

Founded in 1983, OBT is currently one of NYC's largest provider of workforce development and education services for opportunity youth, ages 17-24, and adults who are disconnected from education, and/or employment. OBT serves over 4,000 youth and adults annually across six sites in Brooklyn and Queens within the neighborhoods of Sunset Park, Bushwick, Bedford Stuyvesant, and Jamaica, Queens. OBT's programming is based on a model that combines the most comprehensive academic and vocational support needed to move individuals to self-sufficiency.

First, we want to thank the city for the recognition that a pathways approach means that workforce training is not necessarily linear, nor one-size-fits-all. Community-based organizations, like OBT, have an opportunity to better support program participants with a more holistic group of services that have multiple entry and exit points, offering ongoing educational and career advancement opportunities at every step of their career, and critical interventions such as childcare assistance, housing referrals, food stamps, and other benefits. The Career Pathways model aspires to create this "multiple entry/multiple exit" approach that not only aligns with our mission as an organization, but reflects the reality of what our communities need to fully participate in the economy of this city. Yet, this is aspirational, and the resources necessary to truly implement a system of services, trainings, and resources across the city are many. Some of these resources are needed on the ground, with service providers who everyday are seeing individuals and families looking for opportunities to build their skills. Other resources are necessary to continue to build a citywide system of workforce services that is clear for both clients and service providers, where information is accessible and consistent, and promotes innovation, flexibility, and quality.

While the Career Pathways model aims to create a more differentiated system, at OBT we continue to experience several factors that continue to put pressures on the system and require both additional resources and an increased coordination of services.

- *Increased need for basic skills support*
 - Over the past five years, OBT has seen some important shifts in who our high school equivalency program is serving. For our most recent cohort in FY17
 - In literacy, 51% of youth participants, are at a 9th grade level or below; with 20% are at a 7th grade level or below

- In numeracy - 63% are at a 7th grade level or below; 37% are at a 5th grade level or below
- *Students are taking longer to pass the TASC compared to the GED*
 - At OBT, we have seen that the amount of time that it takes someone to prepare for the TASC exam increased from 5 months to a full year. While we collaborate with the NYC Department of Education's District 79 Pathways to Graduation program, we have had to make investments in strengthening basic skills preparation for those individuals with the lowest levels of readiness. The increase amount of time towards completion requires additional resources, and creates a significant hurdle in the job placement timeline.
- *Increase in barriers faced by youth and adults*
 - While OBT has always served youth with significant barriers to employment, we have seen increases in the number and level of need. Barriers include court-involved youth, young parents needing child care, youth in or transitioning out of foster care, youth living with unstable housing conditions or are homeless, food insecurity, lack of access to transportation, and an increased number of applicants with an IEP
 - The most recent data shows approximately 40% of young people at both OBT's Out of School Youth Programs in Bushwick and in Sunset Park have received IEP services in the past.

OBT Successful Bridge Programs

As we look at our most effective initiatives targeting youth with significant barriers to employment, requiring strategic City funded bridge programs, we have found that individualized services create high impact support. Some examples include:

For Youth

- **Young Adult Literacy Program:** In spring 2016, OBT was awarded funding to implement a bridge program for youth who read below a 5th grade level. The goal of the program is to increase participants' literacy levels to enable them to qualify for HSE classes and job-training. Academic instruction is combined with intensive counseling and service learning projects. Within the first year, approximately 72% of participants were able to make a reading or math gain of which 30% placed above a 9th grade literacy level and were then placed in OBT's full HSE program.
- **Young Adult Internship Program Plus:** In May 2016, OBT was just one of two direct service providers selected to administer a new Young Adult Internship Program specifically for foster care or court-involved youth with an Administration for Children's Services (ACS) case. After success in its pilot year, and exceeding its goals, OBT continues this programming and we are looking to build on its success.

- **P3 Initiative:** Made possible by the Federal Department of Education Performance Partnership Pilot (P3), the NYC Department of Youth and Community Development chose OBT to administer the program for youth parents between the ages of 17-24 within OBT's Out of School Youth Program. The initiative aims to assist young parents with securing child care, and facilitate parenting workshops. In this way, young parents can attend job training, earn their HSE, and receive free child care. The initiative will enroll a total of 50 youth at Sunset Park and Bushwick, who will have up to 2 years to complete programming.
- **College Persistence:** OBT provides college exploration workshops, financial assistance workshops, access to practice tests, one-on-one counseling, college tours, help with navigating the application process, and providing support once enrolled. Our most recent data shows that 68% of OBT alumni who enrolled in college in FY16 successfully completed their first year at a 2 or 4-year college.

For Adults

OBT's Bushwick Workforce Resource Center serves over 2,000 adults and families per year, serving as the hub of OBT's adult service programs, housing OBT's immigration services, adult literacy and job training programs. These programs are essential towards creating pathways for adults who lack basic literacy, numeracy and computer skills, are in need of HSE preparation, and assistance in obtaining their work authorization and naturalization.

As evidenced in this testimony, OBT's approach is one of meeting individuals where they are, with the singular focus on building pathways to meaningful employment.

The City's Career Pathway model makes three key assumptions, and all require resources and a sustained focus:

1. Workforce development is not a one-size-fits-all approach. There is a critical need to increase resources for providers to effectively build programs that implement multiple "entry/exit points" with fidelity. This means a more rigorous approach to collecting and analyzing data around basic skills, length of time in programs, and promoting effective practices.
2. Collaborations and strategic partnerships amongst workforce and other providers are necessary to ensure the opportunity for advancement in skills, education and work experience, addressing important wraparound services that can assist participants in advancing their self-sufficiency. No single provider can assist participants with all their needs; and there is an assumption that organizations will work together to achieve a common set of goals. This type of coordination often happens at a local level, with organizations utilizing resources that we do not have in order to ensure that partnerships are meaningful, that they are cultivated, and can continue to be mutually beneficial. While some level of this will always occur via the local network of organizations, there is a need for

the city's workforce strategy to include a more deliberate effort to support and facilitate these types of collaborations.

3. Leverage existing best practices of employer-driven networks of workforce providers. Additional funding would support critical partnerships with local employers, including the skilled trades, where curriculum can be co-designed and co-delivered, and ongoing, real-time feedback can inform program design. Local job training non-profits like OBT, are well-positioned to function as pre-apprenticeship programs, preparing individuals to meet the necessary thresholds for apprenticeships, advanced trainings, and for entry to mid-level employment in sectors that will see significant hiring needs over the next ten years.

At OBT we are committed to the future of the people we serve, and want to ensure that every organization has the resources and support necessary to achieve the goal of economic mobility for every individual and family in this city.

Evelyn Ortiz, Chief External Affairs Officer
Opportunities for a Better Tomorrow
718-369-0303
eortiz@obtjobs.org
www.obtjobs.org

Testimony of Albert Johnson, Young Adult Literacy Program Participant - Opportunities for a Better Tomorrow (OBT)

**Oversight Hearing - Update on Career Pathways/Workforce Development Systems
Monday, November 27, 2017**

Good Morning Everyone,

My name is Albert Johnson. I was born and raised in a Hispanic family in Staten Island, and for the past twelve years I have been living in Williamsburg, Brooklyn.

I am filled with joy to share with you that last week I passed the TASC exam. I am overwhelmed knowing that in a few weeks I will receive my High School Equivalency Diploma. It might not seem like much to some people, but to me it means a life's dream. All made possible with the tremendous help I received through the Young Adult Literacy Program and the Out of School Youth Program at Opportunities for a Better Tomorrow.

I am here today to talk to you about the importance of education and bridge programs like the Young Adult Literacy Program that are available for youth who are between the ages of 16-24 like me, seeking to succeed in college or at work, but need extra support.

I joined OBT in 2016, after dropping out of high school during my sophomore more year when I was only 16 years old. I dropped out not by choice, but because life happens. One day while waiting for the bus to go to school, a car hit me, and left me without the ability to walk again. You can only imagine the excruciating physical pain and emotional struggles I was going through.

With all that, I still attended my regular high school walking with crutches, and when this became too much, I transitioned to home schooling, up until one day when this alternative was no longer available. I could no longer go to school and felt like all was lost.

I fell into a depression, and for a few years all I did was sleep, wake up, watch TV, and research about my condition. I couldn't believe that I was out of school for seven years and that I was already 23 years old. I was at a point in my life when I did not have many expectations.

One day, my friend Hector Gonzalez, talked to me about Opportunities for a Better Tomorrow, and how they helped him get his GED. Hector suggested I give it a try, and I did.

OBT welcomed me, and it was a breath of fresh air to be there. After taking the reading, writing and math assessment, I was placed in the Youth Adult Literacy Program at the Bushwick location. It is a bridge program that would help bring my reading and math scores up so that I could successfully transition into OBT's Out of School Youth Program where I would get my TASC, obtain job readiness skills and obtain assistance in enrolling in college or finding employment.

At OBT I felt a true sense of belonging in a community that cared about me and that cared about all the participants. It was hard work since I had not been in school for a while. I had to readjust my sleeping schedule, and had to cut off on watching cartoons so I could get to classes on time. [Smile]. While I was in the program I had 100 percent attendance, except when my wheelchair broke down.

All my teachers, my counselors, and the staff at OBT helped me build my confidence, self esteem and motivation; they ensured I completed my homework and that I participated in all activities. At OBT I learned academics, financial literacy, how to build my resume and to interview properly. I learned how to present myself to others, and to network with professionals. They taught me how to dress professionally, and I received clothing when needed from their Opportunity Boutique. I also explored career and college options. For all these great things I want to thank OBT.

What's next for me? I will keep coming back to OBT because they help me stay focused and motivated. I want to make sure I stay on track. I aspire to become a voice over artist one day, so with OBT I trust that my career pathways are just beginning to take shape. The possibilities are endless now that I will have my High School Equivalency diploma, thanks to the caring staff at OBT.

Please help continue to invest in bridge programs like the Young Adult Literacy Program at OBT and help the thousands of youth like myself who just need additional support in order to obtain employment or a higher education.



The
Brooklyn
Alliance

BROOKLYN
ALLIANCE
CAPITAL

November 27, 2017

Written testimony submitted by the Brooklyn Chamber of Commerce before a joint hearing of the New York City Council Committees on Small Business and Civil Service and Labor

Good Morning Chairs Cornegy, Miller, and members of the committees:

I am Varun Sanyal, Vice President of Economic Development at the Brooklyn Chamber of Commerce and I am delivering testimony on behalf of Andrew Hoan, President and CEO of the Brooklyn Chamber. Also with me is Athena Hernandez, Director of the Brooklyn Chamber's workforce development program, *Good Help*.

With over 2,000 active members, the Brooklyn Chamber is the largest and # 1 ranked Chamber of Commerce in New York State. We promote economic development across the borough of Brooklyn, as well as advocate on behalf of our member businesses. The Brooklyn Alliance is the not-for-profit economic development affiliate of the Brooklyn Chamber, which works to address the needs of businesses through direct assistance programs. Brooklyn Alliance Capital is the third affiliate of the Brooklyn Chamber and provides loans to immigrant and minority-owned small businesses.

Job creation and workforce development is a key priority for the Brooklyn Chamber, because an effective workforce is vital to meeting the needs of the robust economic development happening in Brooklyn. In the Brooklyn Chamber's 2016 State Member Issues Survey, 52 percent of participants indicated that they planned to hire 1 to 5 new employees; however, many firms said that finding and hiring qualified workers was a challenge.

We believe that one way to reduce the occurrence of short-term placements is to increase the focus of employer led workforce development. While job placement satisfies recruitment goals, gaps will appear in the system if individuals are not comprehensively supported by evaluating their current skills, inquiring about their desired field of work, and mapping out a tangible pathway to a sustainable career through training and skill development.

Judging from the placements that we facilitate, Healthcare, Hospitality/Accommodations & Food Service, and Construction/Manufacturing are the top sectors with hiring needs in Brooklyn. However, these sectors largely lack accessibility to training and entry level careers, especially for those that come from economically disadvantaged populations. Apprenticeship and training opportunities that create pipelines into these sectors would particularly benefit individuals who do not have a post-secondary education and provide prospects for financial security.

We recommend several enhancements to the current city system of workforce development focused on empowering employers to be the centerpiece of the network:

- increased accessibility and funding for on the job training and customized training programs, along with a focus on streamlining the process for accessing the funding available through these programs.
- creation of satellite workforce offices as opposed to one primary center that may not be accessible for residents living in neighborhoods across the borough and city.



The
Brooklyn
Alliance

BROOKLYN
ALLIANCE
CAPITAL

-
- enhanced funding for training vouchers for Workforce1 participants to seek employer-mandated certificate and training programs that may otherwise not be available through the centers.

New York and Brooklyn continue to lead in private sector job creation and it is critical that our workforce program is as innovative and adaptable as the innovation economy of the borough.

On behalf of the members of the Brooklyn Chamber of Commerce, thank you for the opportunity to testify, and we look forward to working with you and your colleagues to strengthen workforce development across our city.

AH/mc

Testimony of Nelson R. Gonzalez, Director of Adult Employment Programs– Opportunities for a Better Tomorrow (OBT)

Oversight Hearing - Update on Career Pathways/Workforce Development Systems

Monday, November 27, 2017

Good Morning!

My name is Nelson R. Gonzalez, and I am the Director of Adult Employment Programs for Opportunities for a Better Tomorrow. I would like to share a story of an adult participant limited by challenges affecting many New York City residents, but yet still seeking sustainable employment in order to achieve economic mobility.

Ms. WB, is a single mother of 3, who has to juggle her time between securing her children's health, nutrition and shelter needs, while having to make sure she prepares herself for her future and that of her children. While searching for certifications that would support her career goals, she walked into OBT's Bushwick Workforce Resource Center, to earn a chance at acquiring certifications as a Microsoft Office Specialist and through the National Retail Federation in Customer Service Skills through our Adult Employment Program for SNAP recipients.

Like her, there are many that without funding for bridge employment programs which create pathways into careers, would find it hard to access such trainings due to their financial limitations, lack of education and employment experience. These programs provide intensive job readiness, case management services, one-on-one support from job developers that understand employer needs, and provide access to job opportunities that are not readily accessible.

We need to continue to evolve to fit the needs of our communities as change is undeniable. Through the implementation of the Career Pathways initiative to move away from mass recruitment and hiring towards one focused on education and job training providing families with sustaining wages, we are stepping in the right direction.

While we keep in mind individuals such as Ms. WB, we cannot forget to engage the local and small business sector of our communities. According to the NYC Dept. of Small Business Services 81% of business in NYC, and 84% of those in Brooklyn and Queens are small businesses, whose owners wear many hats, including that of recruiters. It is hard for understaffed companies, due to financial restrictions, to meet their recruitment needs, as they remain underserved by most workforce programs. We must strengthen industry partnerships with employers to meet their staffing demands, keep fostering local business growth, and provide individuals like Ms. WB with access to local employment opportunities.

It is with much delight that I inform you that Ms. WB contacted us last week to thank us for the services and support she received while in the program. The approach of teaching soft skills as part of the certifications program combined with 1-on-1 meetings, opened her eyes to the potential she did not realize she had. After completing the training, she applied for a team member position with a local non-profit. Not only was she hired, but was hired as a team leader, providing her with a better wage and opportunity.

Please continue to invest in bridge employment programs which help provide high impact support services and industry recognized credentials for the most underserved populations seeking advancement in order to sustain themselves and their families.

Nelson R. Gonzalez
Opportunities for a Better Tomorrow
718-381-3222

ngonzalez@obtjobs.org

www.obtjobs.org

Nontraditional Employment for Women (NEW)
Erik Antokal, Workforce Development Officer
Testimony: The Career Pathways Model, 11/27/2017

FOR THE RECORD

I am submitting testimony on behalf of Nontraditional Employment for Women (NEW) in support of a Career Pathways System that works for all New Yorkers. At NEW, we believe in the impact of a construction career on skills, wealth and economic independence for women and their families. And of course, we especially support a career-centered workforce model that works for those who have historically not had access to a career growth trajectory.

Apprenticeship in construction is a robust career pathway that affords apprentices the opportunity to earn while they learn a skilled trade, sustain themselves and their families. Since 2005 alone, 2,500 of our graduates have secured employment as union apprentices, utility workers, maintenance workers, and in other blue collar career tracks, all of which offer built-in equal pay for their hard work.

Just one example is the District Council of Carpenters, of which ~20% of NEW tradeswomen are members. 1st year Carpenters earn approximately \$20/hour and at Journey level, they earn over \$53/hour, to say nothing of the health and retirement benefits which allow New Yorkers to support their families and communities. And as they progress, they are trained, both in the job and in the classroom, by experts in their craft. These skills and networks are the core of what makes a successful career, and the core of why we do what we do.

But, to get New Yorkers ready to succeed in any long term career, be it construction or another long-term ambition, the most underserved among us need preparation, de-mystification, and networks. That's where CBOs like NEW come in. The city's programs must continue to support local institutions that provide a "laboratory" - a place and a program where aspirations can be equipped with skills, mistakes can be made, and guiding mentor relationships can be forged. Furthermore, support must be given for social services provided to career-seekers, if we are truly seeking to serve New Yorkers who have the greatest obstacles to long, gainful careers. Finally, "bridge" support to better prepare New Yorkers for the basic requirements of training programs and careers is imperative. The Workforce1 Centers are key entry point institutions for jobseekers, and should be equipped with key basic training options that New Yorkers need before enrolling in a training program such as NEW. Trainings should include computer literacy, basic math, basic reading, and interview preparation, and should be followed with a genuine career pathway, through referrals to sector-specific trainings like those offered by NEW, or key employers with growth options for employees.

NEW gratefully receives support from several City sources: City Council Discretionary funding, the Speaker's Young Women's Initiative, NYCHA pre-apprenticeship funding, as well as the Jobs to Build on and Worker Service Center programs through the Consortium for Worker Education. These funding sources are time-tested vehicles by which the supports I've discussed can be enacted, especially via CWE. The Consortium knows the landscape of training and local nonprofits, and is a trusted grantmaking partner of the City, which I encourage you all to support even further with funding for bridge programs, so that more people are ready for training, and holistic wraparound social services for jobseekers, so that training can be effective. Before New

Yorkers take those first few steps down a career path, they need to have these resources in place, or we run the risk of those steps just being jobs, not careers.

In closing, I want to note that organizations like NEW, that not only provide these trainings and supports, but also drive workforce progress, must be central to a career pathways model. For women, NEW closes the skill gaps, provides the long term industry and social supports to aspiring tradeswomen. And for the industry, NEW connect unions and employers directly to the workforce they need in so many ways. This kind of work must be key to the Career Pathways program, and support for bridge programs and social services for jobseeking New Yorkers are significant steps toward accomplishing that goal.

Thank you for your time, and for your partnership.



**Testimony by Jesse Laymon, Director of Policy and Advocacy,
New York City Employment and Training Coalition (NYCETC)**

**Before the New York City Council Committees on
Small Business and Civil Service and Labor
Meeting Jointly on November 27, 2017
Chairmen Hon. Robert Cornegy and Hon. I Daneek Miller**

Good morning and first of all let me thank Chairmen Cornegy and Miller for holding this oversight hearing on an important topic. Thank you for inviting us to testify on how the City can do more to improve the lives of our low-income and unemployed residents, and the strength of our local economy.

My name is Jesse Laymon, and I am the Director Policy for the New York City Employment and Training Coalition (NYCETC). NYCETC is an association representing the expertise of over 180 community-based, educational and labor management organizations, that annually provide job training and employment services to more than 800,000 New Yorkers, including public assistance recipients, unemployed workers, opportunity youth, individuals with court involvement, immigrants, veterans, the homeless, and individuals with disabilities. The Coalition is the only citywide association exclusively focused on workforce development and plays a key role bringing together the city's workforce community, advancing policy priorities and convening to share best practices.

Context

The central challenge facing our City in the 21st Century is the large and growing level of income inequality between disparate communities of New Yorkers. This challenge was correctly identified by Mayor de Blasio as the focus of his two campaigns for office, and has been a policy focus of his Administration.

Certainly, with regard to policies aimed at improving the lives of impoverished New Yorkers, the last four years have seen some significant accomplishments for workers employed in low-wage jobs (chiefly through the increased minimum wage) and in expanded and improved programs for families living in poverty, especially for impoverished youth (such as Pre-K for All and SYEP).

However, as recently noted in the *Gotham Gazette* ("*de Blasio's Record on Poverty and Inequality*" Nov. 1 2017), while the Administration has made gains in improving the quality of life for New Yorkers in poverty, it has made precious little progress in helping families rise out of poverty.

The Administration's own most recent NYC Poverty Measure demonstrates the persistence of this inequality through several statistics:

- From 2013 to 2015, poverty decreased significantly more for employed New Yorkers (from 8.4% down to 7.2%) than for part-time (23.9% down to 23.2%) or unemployed New Yorkers (38.2% up to 38.4%).
- From 2010 to 2015, poverty decreased significantly more for white New Yorkers (from 14.9% down to 13.3%) than for black New Yorkers (21.9% down to 21.2%) or Hispanic New Yorkers (23.8% up to 24.6%)
- Consistently throughout recent years, the poverty rates have been roughly 3x higher for New Yorkers with only a high school degree than with a bachelor's degree, and 4-5x higher for those with less than a high school degree than those with a bachelor's.
- The Citywide unemployment rate is near an all-time low at 4.7%, yet the rate for young people between the ages of 18-24 who aren't in school is 13%.

Taken together, these facts and the broader context of a generally healthy, growing NYC economy suggest that not nearly enough is being done to channel the abundant opportunities for employment and meaningful wages to the workers and families who haven't had access to them before.

Opportunity abounds for those with college degrees and/or in-demand skills. But for those lacking either, the recession never ended and poverty acts as a trap.

Career Pathways

To address this challenge, the de Blasio Administration launched an advisory commission in 2014 called the Jobs for New Yorkers Task Force, which produced the new blueprint for workforce development in New York, called **Career Pathways**.

The *Career Pathways* report made a set of 10 recommendations in three broad categories, focusing especially on the category of "Building Skills Employers Seek."

The set of policy changes and benchmarks included in the report sought to build the pathway out of poverty for approximately 800,000 unemployed and low-wage workers.

The report's top three recommendations were:

1: *"Launch or expand Industry Partnerships with real-time feedback loops in six sectors ... which will focus on training more New Yorkers for jobs with career potential [and on] improving the quality of low-wage occupations."*

2: *"Establish Career Pathways as the framework for the City's workforce system."*

3: *"Invest \$60 million annually by 2020 in bridge programs that prepare low-skill jobseekers for entry-level work and middle-skill job training."*

However, in the three years since the report was published and embraced by the Administration, there has been minimal and halting progress on these key recommendations, and as a result the focus of my testimony today is on the need for the City to work with urgency to live up to these commitments for the sake of the hundreds of thousands of workers and their families affected.

Immediate Recommendations for 2018

The New York City Employment and Training Coalition offers the following three immediate recommendations for implementation of the Career Pathways blueprint, which we feel could be achieved without delay in the coming year.

Recommendation 1: The Administration must get on budgetary track to meet its benchmark of \$60 million annually in bridge programs by 2020. This would require at least an immediate doubling of the existing ~\$6.4 million in funding from FY 2018 in the next budget, and a fiscal plan to reach \$60 million over the next three budgets.

Our top priority would be the creation of new funding streams in appropriate agency budgets to support bridge programs that help New Yorkers with gaps in their skills, education or credentials get the training they need to either find a quality job or enroll in a more advanced course of study.

The City's Career Pathways blueprint, which ought to govern the use of workforce dollars in the City budget, called for **\$60 million in funding for bridge programs** by FY 2020, yet the FY18 budget had only **\$6.4 million included**.

Bridge programs are designed to provide workers with very limited skills, English proficiency or math proficiency with the supplemental education they need to take advantage of the City's investments in training programs. The scale of the need for bridge programs is vast – there are 1.7 million New Yorkers with limited English proficiency and thousands more with basic skills needs.

Without bridge programs to help these New Yorkers take the next step in their education or career, our City's workforce system will be stuck perpetuating the existing inequalities in our society.

Funding for bridge programs could be spread across the agencies that serve the highest-need populations, with new bridge programming available through DYCD for the City's Opportunity

Youth, through HRA for recipients of public assistance, through the Department of Probation for court-involved individuals, and so on.

What links these programs together would be a focus on building the basic skills necessary to compete for jobs in the current economy.

Recommendation 2: Restructure and/or otherwise empower the Mayor's Office of Workforce Development and its relationship with the new Industry Partnerships and the existing workforce agencies (especially SBS), to create a structure of authority and accountability for meeting the goals of Career Pathways.

Subsequent to the publication of the Career Pathways plan, the City unveiled four new Industry Partnerships, with retail and food service partnerships to focus on improving the quality of low-wage occupations, and construction and industrial partnerships to focus on training New Yorkers for new careers, alongside the two existing partnerships in technology (Tech Talent Pipeline) and healthcare (NYACH).

However, these four new partnerships have struggled to gain any traction, often going unstaffed, and have not produced new programming on any significant scale. This is a tremendous untapped potential for the City to use a public-private structure to create new training and employment grants and programs, in direct response to the needs of local employers.

The Mayor's Office of Workforce Development, meanwhile, has been tasked with overseeing the progress of the Career Pathways plan, but without the policy-making, budgetary or oversight authority to ensure that these new as well as existing workforce entities in the City are achieving their potential.

We suggest that the Career Pathways plan will not be successfully implemented until such time as a higher-level authority is given to the plan and its management within the Administration.

Recommendation 3: Towards establishing Career Pathways as the framework for the City's workforce development system, the Department of Small Business Services should begin by calculating and reporting on the key demographic data of the clients served by the existing Workforce1 system.

As previously noted, good jobs with meaningful wages are being created and filled on a regular basis in New York's vibrant and growing economy. Some of these jobs are certainly being filled through the existing Workforce1 system, serving clients who visit one of the City's employment centers across the five boroughs.

However, it is unclear whether this system is contributing in any way towards the reduction of income inequality in New York. SBS issues general reports on the numbers of clients served and placed in new jobs, but does not analyze client data or report on such analysis enough to demonstrate whether higher-needs populations are being served adequately.

We ask that the City Council pass legislation (potentially an amended form of Intro 1736, currently referred to the Committee on Small Business) to require SBS to report key demographic information about the people served with training programs or with job placements as a result of visiting a Workforce1 center.

Key indicators would include the educational attainment of the clients, their basic employment history (ie, period of unemployment and/or amount of work experience), their language skills, history of court involvement if any, disabilities, family responsibilities and whether they are recipients of public assistance.

Shedding light on the population currently served by the City's workforce system would both spur changes within SBS that might help it focus more on the populations in the most need of assistance, and it would also lay bare for the Administration the need to fund job training and readiness programs through other agencies (such as DYCD, HRA, EDC, etc) to achieve its stated goal of reducing inequality across the City.

Thank you for taking our concerns into consideration, and we look forward to continuing to work with the City Council as well City Agencies to make sure that the needs of New York City's jobseekers are addressed through the full implementation of the Career Pathways plan.



#WorkforceAdvocacy

2017 NYCETC Policy Priority

Reject Austerity and Invest in Good Jobs for New Yorkers

NYC Must Prepare 100,000+ Workers for New Careers

Our City is at a crossroads. The new President in the White House is likely to freeze or reduce investments in social services and aid to cities like New York. Our state and local governments must decide whether to pass along federal budget cuts to the programs that sustain the quality of life for hundreds of thousands of New Yorkers, or to step up and fill the gap by investing our local wealth to defend vital services.

We believe that the right answer is to *counter-act these cuts with bold new investments* that expand economic opportunity and promote equality for New York's workers, with a focus on **preparing 100,000+ New Yorkers** for middle-class careers that are currently beyond their reach. The City of New York must play a central role in preparing these workers by re-focusing economic development on real people. That means the City must begin to **prioritize graduations and job placements, not ribbon cuttings and job promises.**

The blueprint already exists: by fully implementing and funding Mayor de Blasio's plan for workforce development, **Career Pathways**, the City can re-orient its workforce development system towards developing jobseeker skills, achieving high-quality job opportunities for all. By doing so, the City would ensure that New Yorkers living in poverty have access to **essential education, quality training and living-wage career tracks**, and that each aspect of the City's workforce and economic development system is geared towards opening the doors to opportunity for New Yorkers who've been left behind in the past. New Yorkers cannot wait years longer for the system to work for them - *now is the time to invest in our workforce.*

To prepare 100,000+ New Yorkers for good careers, the City must move quickly to:

Fund Promised Bridge Programs

Bridge programs are designed to provide workers with very limited skills or English proficiency with the supplemental education they need to take advantage of available jobs and training programs. In order to prepare 100,000+ New Yorkers for new jobs, we must fulfill the goal set in the Career Pathways plan of **\$60 million in annual funding** for bridge programs by FY 2020. As of 2017, the City is far behind track.

The City can achieve this target through a rapid ramping-up of successful current and recent bridge programs funded by EDC, CUNY, DYCD and SBS, such as iBridge for highly-skilled immigrants, CUNY Prep, and the Young Adult Language Program. Doing so is essential for New Yorkers currently shut out of high-quality careers.

Prioritize Services for Communities in Need

In order for our City's workforce development system to combat persistent income inequality in New York, SBS, the City's primary portal for jobseekers, **must focus on the various populations who have the highest unemployment** rates and need job training and placement services the most.

SBS should begin to achieve this by issuing annual public reports on the number of jobseekers it has served (via either job placement or connections to training) who fall in each high-unemployment population: youth, recent immigrants and english-language learners, people with disabilities, with criminal justice histories, or with limited work experience or educational attainment.

Expand on Successful Neighborhood Networks

The City should **fund an expansion of the employment network model** that has been pioneered with the Lower East Side Employment Network and the East Harlem Talent Network. These networks are essential to connect quality local service providers and regional economic development.

They allow employers to quickly and efficiently find new employees from the local community, and they help community-based organizations share their resources and specialize in the services that they each provide. Expanding this model to more neighborhoods would open new doors of opportunity to unemployed New Yorkers.

Empower the Office of Workforce Development

Under the Career Pathways blueprint, the Mayor's Office of Workforce Development (WKDEV) is responsible for shepherding the plan's goals to fruition. However, WKDEV does not have budgetary or contracting authority and has not been able to play a leadership role in shaping policy.

The Administration must **empower WkDev in policy-making around economic development and job creation**, allowing WKDEV to set job placement goals for relevant programs at SBS, EDC and HRA, and coordinating cross-agency budgeting for Career Pathways commitments such as funding for bridge programs.

As a Coalition of 180 members, we are the voice of strong and diverse community-based organizations, educational institutions and labor management organizations focused on New York City workforce development. We showcase NYCETC member organization programs and advocate for the need for local training. We work together to improve policy, practice & outcomes for the city's workforce development system.

NYCETC Advocacy on Social Media



Name:

New York City Employment and Training Coalition

Handle:

@NYCETC

Link:

www.facebook.com/NYCETC/



Name:

NYCETC

Handle:

@NYCETC_org

Link:

https://twitter.com/NYCETC_org



Name:

New York City Employment and Training Coalition

Link:

www.linkedin.com/groups/8260714

Campaigns and Allied Projects

The NYC Employment and Training Coalition Supports These Campaigns

#WorkforceAdvocacy

LiteracyLiftsNYC - for Adult Basic Education in NYC

Sustain our Sanctuary - for a 12% increase in funding of human services contracts in NYC

InvestinYouthSkills - for more effective state funding for youth job training

Restore Opportunity Now - for full funding of nonprofit contracts & wages by New York State

FairFares - for NYC to provide half-price Metrocards to New Yorkers living in poverty

Climate Works for All - for NYC to invest in clean buildings and the jobs they would bring

The EARNS Act - federal Legislation in support of increased Apprenticeships

The Campaign for Summer Jobs - in support of the Summer Youth Employment Program

NYCETC Coalition Partnerships

The NYC Employment and Training Coalition is a Member Organization of These Coalitions

Federation of Protestant Welfare Agencies - FPWA

Human Services Council (of New York) - HSC

National Skills Coalition - NSC

New York Association of Training and Employment Professionals - NYATEP

New York Nonprofit Coordinating Committee - NPCC

NYC Coalition for Adult Literacy - NYCCAL

United Neighborhood Houses - UNH

For more information or to join our Legislative, Policy and Advocacy Committee, contact:

Jesse Laymon, Director of Policy and Advocacy: jlaymon@nycetc.org



130 East 59th Street, New York, NY 10022
 Tel: 212.980.1000 • Fax: 212.888.7538
 ujafedny.org

President
 Jeffrey A. Schoenfeld*

Chair of the Board
 Robert S. Kapito*

Chief Executive Officer
 Eric S. Goldstein

Treasurer
 Jeffrey M. Stern*

General Chairs
 2018 Campaign
 Alisa F. Levin*
 David L. Moore*

Chair, UJA Women
 Judith K. Baum*

**Chair, Planned Giving
 & Endowments**
 Lawrence J. Cohen*

General Planning Chair
 Alisa R. Doctoroff*

Planning Department Chairs
 Brett H. Barth*
 Amy A.B. Bressman*
 Jodi J. Schwartz*

**Executive Committee
 at Large**
 Stephen J. Girsky*
 Cindy R. Golub*
 Jonathon C. Held*
 Barry A. Kaplan*
 Suzanne F. Peck*

**Special Advisor to
 the President**
 Aaron L. Zises*

**Executive Vice President
 Financial Resource
 Development**
 Mark D. Medin

**Chief Planning Officer
 for Community Planning
 and Agency Resources**
 Deborah A. Joselow

**Senior Vice President
 External Relations
 and Public Policy**
 Louisa Chafee

Chief Financial Officer
 Irvin A. Rosenthal

**General Counsel
 Chief Compliance
 Officer & Secretary**
 Ellen R. Zimmerman

Chief Marketing Officer
 Graham Cannon

Executive Vice Presidents
 Emeriti
 Ernest W. Michel**
 Stephen D. Solender
 John S. Ruskay

TESTIMONY: UJA-FEDERATION OF NEW YORK

NYC Council, Committee on Small Business
Honorable Robert E. Cornegy, Jr., Chair
NYC Council, Committee on Civil Service and Labor
Honorable I. Daneek Miller, Chair

Submitted by:
Ariel Savransky, UJA-Federation of New York

Re: Oversight – Update on Career Pathways/Workforce Development Systems

November 27, 2017

Honorary Officers: Meshulam Riklis • Laurence A. Tisch** **Life Trustees:** Robert H. Arnow • Lawrence B. Buittenwieser • William Kahn** • Irving Schneider** • Stephen Shelom • Daniel S. Shapiro** • Samuel J. Silberman**
Sanford Solender** • Wilma S. Tisch • James L. Weinberg** • Elaine K. Wink** **Life Benefactors:** The Belfer, Ruben & Saltz Families • Jack E. & Zella B. Butler Foundation • The Fisher Family • Leo & Julia Forcheimer Foundation
 Ruth & David Gottesman • Kathryn & Alan** C. Greenberg • The Jesselson Family • Leni & Peter W. May • Paul & Irma Milstein Foundation • Seymour & Vivian Milstein Family • Henry & Lucy Moses Fund, Inc. • Samuel I. Newhouse
 Foundation, Inc. • Milton Petrie** • The William Rosenwald Family • Jack & Lewis** Rudin • Family of S.H. & Helen R. Scheuer • Helen** & Irving** Schneider & Family • Marvin & Donna Schwartz • Joseph and Marcy** Sirulnick
 The Sheldon H. Solow Foundation • The Tisch Family • Wachtell, Lipton, Rosen & Katz • Weil, Gotshal & Manges LLP • The Weiler Arnow Family • The Harry & Jeanette Weinberg Foundation **Past Chairs, Board of Directors:** Morton
 A. Kornreich** • Joseph Gurwin** • Irwin Hochberg** • Larry A. Silverstein • Judith Stern Peck • Larry Zicklin • Morris W. Offit • Susan K. Stern • Jerry W. Levin • Alisa R. Doctoroff • Linda Mirels **Past Presidents:** Peggy Tishman**
 David G. Sacks** • Alan S. Jaffe • Louise B. Greilshelmer • James S. Tisch • Larry Zicklin • Morris W. Offit • John M. Shapiro • Jerry W. Levin • Alisa R. Doctoroff

*Executive Committee member **Of Blessed Memory

Good morning Chairperson Cornegy and Chairperson Miller and members of the Committee on Small Business and the Committee on Civil Service and Labor. My name is Ariel Savransky and I am an Advocacy and Policy Advisor at UJA-Federation of New York. Established 100 years ago, UJA-Federation of New York is one of the nation's largest local philanthropies. Central to our mission is to care for those in need. We identify and meet the needs of New Yorkers of all backgrounds and Jews everywhere. We connect people to their communities and respond to crises in New York, Israel and around the world. We support a network of nearly 100 nonprofit organizations serving those that are most vulnerable and in need of programs and services. On behalf of UJA, our network of nonprofit partners and those we serve, thank you for the opportunity to submit testimony on New York City's Career Pathways and Workforce Development Systems.

We greatly appreciate the commitment of the New York City Council and the Administration to investing in adult literacy programs in New York City, which we view as an integral component of an effective workforce development system. Notably we'd like to thank the Council and the Administration for the historic \$12 million investment in educational opportunities for immigrant New Yorkers, a commitment which was renewed for Fiscal Year 2018. For the 2.2 million adults in New York City – one-third of the adult population – who lack English Language Proficiency, basic literacy skills, or a high school diploma, these programs are necessary tools in teaching these individuals how to read, write, obtain an equivalency diploma, and enter job training or post-secondary education programs. By continuing the \$12 million investment, more immigrants will be able to access higher education programs as well as jobs and careers that will allow them to take care of themselves and their families.

We would also like to thank the Administration for the recent investment in a workforce development program serving Haredi Jews throughout the City. Haredi Jews make up seven percent of low-income youth in the City, yet due to this sector's unique needs, they are often left out of mainstream career development programs. By investing in a workforce development pilot program involving career direction and counseling, vocational/embedded ESL and adult basic education, and career track training classes leading to an industry recognized certificate/credential and job placement, we can ensure that Haredi Jews are a part of the Career Development advancements being made in the City.

While we are grateful for these investments, New York still has a long way to go towards achieving the goals laid out in the Career Pathways blueprint. We offer the following recommendations to help ensure that the City is effectively serving those most in need of crucial workforce development programs.

1) Use the Career pathways blueprint as a guide to create a stronger workforce

Fiscal Year 2018 marks the third year of a five-year plan to transform the City's workforce development system. The goals of this transformation are to expand access to career-track jobs in fast-growing industry sectors, improve job quality and foster a more cohesive workforce. The Career Pathways model strives to ensure that individuals build skills employers seek, therefore expanding access to high quality jobs and achieving the goal of aligning both workforce and economic development initiatives. However, in order to realize these goals, significant increased economic investment is necessary. If substantial new City resources are not made available to fulfill these promises of Career Pathways, hundreds of thousands of low-income and unemployed New Yorkers will be left out of our growing economy. We urge the Council

and the Administration to work together to resolve these shortfalls in the FY19 budget and create a stronger workforce using the Career Pathways blueprint as a guide.

2) Increase investment in bridge programs for low-skilled job seekers and middle-skill job training

Bridge programs are essential in helping New Yorkers with gaps in their skills, education or credentials get the training they need to either find a quality job or enroll in a more advanced course of study. The Career Pathways blueprint calls for an investment of \$60 million annually by Fiscal Year 2020 in bridge programs that prepare low-skill job seekers for entry-level work and middle-skill job training. The budget for fiscal year 2018 included only \$6.4 million in funding for these programs. With the inclusion of only \$6.4 million, many New Yorkers are left out of these important programs, including the immigrant populations that fare to benefit the most from these bridge programs.

When HRA embarked on re-imagining its Employment Services contracts in 2015, it included this Career Bridge concept with an estimated funding level of \$9.7 million. However, when the RFPs were eventually released, Career Bridge was not included alongside Career Compass, Career Advance or Youth Pathways, and the dedicated funding to support bridge programs was not added to these contracts.

Our agencies work with many immigrant families and communities, providing services to put these individuals on a career trajectory and setting them up to be able to support themselves and their families. We urge the Council to work with the Administration to push for Career Bridge or comparable bridge programs for New Yorkers most in need and ensure increased funding is included in the FY19 budget to remain on track with the recommendations made in the Career Pathways blueprint.

3) Restore and baseline \$12 million for adult literacy programs and work to develop a taskforce on adult literacy

New York City is home to over 3 million foreign-born residents, comprising over 37% of the total population, and 43% of the City's workforce. Many of these individuals are stuck in low-wage, low-skilled jobs due to both low educational attainment and limited English proficiency. Within New York City, 13% of the US-born population over the age of 19 lacks a high school diploma, but this rate is more than double for immigrants, of which 27% lack a high school diploma.¹ This results in lower wages for these workers. According to Census data, median income for those without a high school diploma is \$19,281, while median income for a high school graduate, including equivalency, is \$27,259. This number increases to \$36,101 with some college or an associate's degree.² In 2016, the median New York City household income for the native born was \$65,853 while the median household income for the foreign born was \$50,914.³

According to the Community Needs Assessment conducted by DYCD in 2016, which collects input from New York City residents and institutional leaders regarding service needs and gaps in their communities,

¹ McHugh, Margie and Morawski, Madeline. April 2016. Migration Policy Institute. *Immigrant and WIOA Services; Comparisons of Sociodemographic Characteristics of Native- and Foreign-Born Adults in New York City, New York*. <http://www.migrationpolicy.org/research/immigrants-and-wioa-services-comparison-sociodemographic-characteristics-native-and-foreign>.

² United States Census Bureau. *American Fact Finder*. <https://factfinder.census.gov>

³ Id.

education, primarily adult education/literacy classes, was one of the greatest needs and service gaps reported.⁴ This finding was consistent throughout the city. Furthermore, the City's ability to offer adult literacy programs is fairly constrained. Considering all local, state, and federal investments, the City's Office of Workforce Development reports just 61,000 individuals are served annually in "basic education" programs.⁵

We urge the council to work with the Administration to restore and baseline the \$12million that was included in the FY18 budget. Thousands of students will lose their classes without the restoration of this funding. Furthermore, single-year funding makes it difficult to operate programs, retain talented teachers and threatens to interrupt student gain. It also does not allow DYCD to update reimbursement rates and program design.

Additionally, we urge the council to work with the Administration to launch an Adult Literacy Task Force. One of the long-standing impediments to New York City having a comprehensive strategy and system of adult literacy is the fact that services are provided by so many entities with no coordinated oversight or vision. There are six City entities providing some form of adult literacy programs, either directly or outsourced through contracts. They include: DYCD, HRA, DOW, CUNY, MOIA, WKDEV and others. In addition, dozens of community based organizations, library branches, and unions also provide services with a combination of city, state, federal and philanthropic dollars. An Adult Literacy Task Force would bring all of these stakeholders to the table, in addition to advocates, researchers and subject area experts, to examine the City's adult literacy system and make recommendations to improve coordination, referral and outcomes.

We look forward to working with the City Council and the administration to create an effective workforce development system that has the capacity to serve the individuals who need these services. Thank you again for the opportunity to testify, as well as for the commitment of the New York City Council and the Administration to investing in workforce development programs in New York City. Please contact Ariel Savransky at savranskya@ujafedny.org if you have any questions.

⁴ The City of New York Department of Youth and Community Development. *Community Needs Assessment Report 2017*. http://www1.nyc.gov/assets/dycd/downloads/pdf/2017_CNA_FINAL.pdf

⁵ <http://www1.nyc.gov/assets/careerpathways/downloads/pdf/Career-Pathways-Progress-Update.pdf>



Testimony of JobsFirstNYC at the New York City Council Joint Oversight Hearing before the Committee on Small Business and the Committee on Civil Service and Labor regarding an Update on Career Pathways / Workforce Development Systems on November 27, 2017 delivered by Kevin Stump, Vice President of Policy, Communications, & Postsecondary Practice and Keri Faulhaber, Vice President of Partnership and Community Engagement

Good afternoon, distinguished members of the City Council. My name is Kevin Stump and I am the Vice President of Policy, Communications, & Postsecondary Practice at JobsFirstNYC/Keri Faulhaber and I am the Vice President of Partnership and Community Engagement. We are a practice to policy intermediary working to reduce the number of out of school and out of work young adults in New York City.

For ten years, JobsFirstNYC has been working with local communities across the five boroughs developing and supporting collaborative and innovative strategies to find effective solutions to support out-of-school, out-of-work young adult New Yorkers. Core to JobsFirstNYC's approach is using the lessons learned throughout our work to inform systems-level policy needs. We welcome the opportunity to provide high-level feedback on the progress of the Career Pathways strategy and look forward to working with each of you to ensure that every young adult can access the economy and reach their fullest potential.

This testimony is focused on two critical areas: first is how the Career Pathways framework—and by extension the City of New York—does not adequately address the specific needs of the out-of-school, out-of-work young adult population. Second, is the City's painfully slow approach to funding and scaling effective bridge programs.

Over the past five years, New York City has seen a notable decrease in the number and share of young people ages 18 through 24 who are out of school and out of work: from 22 percent (188,588 young adults) in 2010, to 17 percent (136,483) in 2015. However, the barriers faced by the remaining 136,483 young adults aged 18–24, increases the challenges to serving them.

Recent research by JobsFirstNYC (to be published in the coming weeks) has also surfaced a new set of structural challenges that New York City's out-of-school, out-of-work population is faced with. Among them include how most job growth over the last five years has been in part-time work, as full-time jobs—even for young people not enrolled in school—have decreased. And even with a tighter labor market and increased demand for labor, wages for young people have decreased. Additionally, despite higher high school graduation rates and increasing college enrollment rates, a growing number of young people are leaving college without credentials to enter the labor market with many falling into low-wage work or becoming part of the out-of-school, out-of-work population. Despite these new structural challenges as well as some persistent barriers for young adults to participate in the economic life of New York City, the City has not adequately responded with its own strategy. In fact, much of the youth workforce development discourse has been focused on programs that mostly serve in-school youth (i.e., Summer Youth Employment Program).

We recommend New York City create a comprehensive strategy that addresses the specific needs of out-of-school, out-of-work young adults. JobsFirstNYC is encouraged by the creation of the New York

City Disconnected Youth Task Force and will look to this initiative as a vehicle to developing, executing, and watchdogging a citywide strategy to fully address the specific needs of New York City's out-of-school, out-of-work young adults similar to the one the City of Los Angeles has implemented.

The Los Angeles Performance Partnership Pilot is a leading effort of the City of Los Angeles, the County of Los Angeles, Los Angeles Unified School District, Los Angeles Community College District, local Cal State Universities (CSU 5), Los Angeles Chamber of Commerce, Los Angeles Housing Service Agency, and over 50 public, philanthropic and community-based organizations to improve the service delivery system for the disconnected young adult population and connect them to the economy. This initiative—outlined in *Los Angeles Performance Partnership Pilot (LAP3) 2017-2020 Strategic Plan: Serving Disconnected Youth*—is an unprecedented effort in Los Angeles, and across the country, to coordinate and integrate the delivery of education, workforce, and social services to disconnected youth. Its core functions are to:

1. Align and coordinate with public and private agencies in Los Angeles to better serve youth 16-24 through the development of a platform for collaboration and exchange of best practices.
2. Increase capacity and sustainability of the regional Los Angeles Workforce Development System by developing innovative strategies and process improvements that increase and enhance service provision.
3. Champion policy and systems change to improve individual outcomes and reduce school & work disconnection.
4. Develop programs and policies that empower youth to be self-sufficient and resilient by respecting their needs and desires.

The LAP3 initiative includes targeted strategies that cut across multiple systems to serve young adults who face a variety of structural barriers. These areas include homeless and foster care, justice-involved, young adult parents, young adult immigrants, and other targeted groups. New York City has a wealth of resources and opportunities that must be coordinated, aligned, and integrated to break down barriers so out-of-school, out-of-work young adults can access them.

One glaring example of the City's absent strategy to address the specific needs of the out-of-school, out-of-work population is reflected in the lack of urgency to effectively scale bridge program models. According to the latest Career Pathways Progress Report, the City has only invested \$6.4 million into bridge strategies. This is only about 10 percent of the \$60 million annual investment Career Pathways commits the city to fund by 2020 and only accounts for one year (FY16) of funding.

We appreciate the City's careful approach to systems-building and recognize this can take time and applaud the City for taking steps in the right direction. This includes launching the Building Bridges Professional Development course, which engaged more than 120 staff from 60 community-based organizations with panel presentations, workshops, site visits, resources and materials, and more. NYC Bridge Bank is another effort to build the field by creating an open-source, online platform of bridge program curricula, design manuals, teachers' guides, and other useful resources for practitioners.

However, after nearly three years of building, the time to make a significant investment in the system is now. _

We recommend that the City invest \$20 million to fund and scale bridge programs in the next budget year and the remaining \$33.6 million the year after, which would bring annual funding to \$60 million by 2020 as the City committed to in the Career Pathways plan. Importantly, we recommend the City follow the federal Workforce Innovation & Opportunity Act (WIOA) funding ratio, which dedicates 75 percent of funding to serving out-of-school, out-of-work youth. In an effort to further reduce the number of out-of-school, out-of-work young adults, we also recommend that program models serving students attending high schools with low graduation rates be included in the 75 percent funding formula. This would include the more than 15,000 students attending New York City Transfer High Schools, as they are most at-risk of becoming disconnected and unattached from school and the economy—ultimately dropping into the out-of-school, out-of-work population. Bridge programming will increase access and create a clearer career pathway for these at-risk students.

JobsFirstNYC is committed to designing, testing, and scaling effective practice models that can be brought to scale through public policy. Our 10 years of experience building collaborative partnerships to serve disconnected youth provides a menu of practice models that the City should consider when building its plan to scale bridge program models across communities to ensure out-of-school, out-of-work young adults connect to a viable career path.

Key elements of effective bridge strategies can be found in the Young Adults Sectoral Employment Project (YASEP), which is one of JobsFirstNYC's signature initiatives. YASEP utilizes a comprehensive and collaborative approach that enables "longer runways and stronger pipelines"—in other words, enough time and preparation for young adults to master the competencies necessary for success in the workplace, and sufficient employer input to ensure that participants who complete training programs are ready to contribute from their first day on the job. Two YASEP partnerships demonstrating the effectiveness of bridge programs include TechBridge and The CDI Career Academy.

Delivered in partnership with The Door and Per Scholas, **TechBridge** is a free-of-charge 5-week course for 18-to-24-year-olds that provides young adults with the opportunity to strengthen their professional skills, begin to establish their professional network, and gain hands on technical training. All this while developing the academic skills needed to pass the Test for Adult Basic Education (TABE) and succeed in Per Scholas' Information Technology Support course. After successfully completing this 5-week bridge course, students directly enroll into Per Scholas' 15-week IT Support course where they learn the necessary skills needed and prepare to earn the industry recognized certifications launching them into a career in Technology.

Another YASEP partnership demonstrating how bridge programs are a linchpin to connecting out-of-school, out-of-work young adults to economic opportunity is **The CDI Career Academy**, which began in 2014 as a collaboration between Comprehensive Development, Inc., The New York Alliance for Careers in Healthcare, and The Borough of Manhattan Community College. The Career Academy trains 50 young men and women each year as Certified Medical Assistant specialists. CDI Career Academy participants take part in a rigorous, seven-month college level program that was developed with input from healthcare sector employers. The program includes workforce skills and customer service training,

classroom and occupational training, two days at NYU Langone's Simulation Lab, certification, and job placement.

We greatly appreciate the opportunity to testify here today and look forward to working with each of you to ensure that all of New York City's young adults have access to the economy life of New York City. Thank you.

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 11/27/17

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Alex Gleason

Address: 275 7th Ave agleason@nyc16.com

I represent: NYC Central Labor Council, AFL-CIO

Address: 275 7th Ave

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 11/27/17

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Erik Antokol

Address: 243 W 70th St, New York, NY

I represent: Metropolitan Employment Union

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 11/27/17

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Varun Sanyal

Address: _____

I represent: Brooklyn Chamber of Commerce

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____
 in favor in opposition

Date: _____

Name: Kevin Stump / Keri Faulhaber Jobfirst (PLEASE PRINT)

Address: 332 West 87th Street

I represent: Jobfirst NYC

Address: 11 Park Place

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____
 in favor in opposition

Date: 11/27/2017

Name: Barbara Chang (PLEASE PRINT)

Address: 253 Broadway 8th Fl

I represent: Mayor's Office of WKDEV

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____
 in favor in opposition

Date: 11/27/2017

Name: Jackie Mallon (PLEASE PRINT)

Address: 110 William Street 7th Fl

I represent: NYC Dept of Small Business

Address: Services

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____
 in favor in opposition

Date: 11/27/2017

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: CHRISTIAN GONZÁLEZ

Address: CTR. FOR AN URBAN FUTURE, 120 WALL ST.

I represent: 20TH FL.

Address: NYC 10005

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____
 in favor in opposition

Date: 11/27/17

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Ariel Savransky

Address: _____

I represent: UJA - Federation of Jewish Men

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____
 in favor in opposition

Date: 11/27/17

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Stephanie Cowles

Address: Stephanie.Cowles@projectrenewal.org

I represent: Project Renewal

Address: 200 Varice ST NY

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____
 in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Leslie Koberger

Address: V.P.O.T.E.

I represent: DFT

Address: 52 Rully

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____
 in favor in opposition

Date: 11/27/17

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Jesse Layman

Address: 36-50 Crescent St. Queens, NY

I represent: M/C Employment and Training Coalition

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____
 in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Erik Autokal

Address: _____

I represent: Nontraditional Employment for Women

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____
 in favor in opposition

Date: 11/27/17

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Keri Faulhaber (Replacng Kevin Stump)

Address: _____

I represent: Jobs First NYC

Address: 11 Park Place, NY, NY

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____
 in favor in opposition

Date: 11/27

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Eirelyn Ortiz

Address: 783 4th Avenue, Brooklyn, NY 11232

I represent: Opportunities for a Better Tomorrow

Address: Sam as above

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms