

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES AND
INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

----- X

April 17, 2018
Start: 1:18 p.m.
Recess: 3:21 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: JAMES G. VAN BRAMER
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Joseph C. Borelli
Laurie A. Cumbo
Karen Koslowitz
Francisco P. Moya

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Tom Finkelppearl, Commissioner
NYC Department of Cultural Affairs

Jerin Arifa, Founder and President
Young Feminists and Allies Chapter
National Organization for Women

Ann Marie Lonsdale, Deputy Director
Alliance of Resident Theaters of New York

Corinne Woods, Programs Coordinator
Alliance of Resident Theaters of New York

Lisa Phillips, Director
New Museum of Contemporary Art

Leslie Mock, Professional Musician and Intern,
Center for Arts Education

Wilhelmina Frankfurt, Former Ballerina
NYC Ballet Company and Dance Educator & Dance NYC
Certified Public School Teacher

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

[sound check]

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: The signal that we can begin. [pause] And we are good to go?

FEMALE SPEAKER: Good to go.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Great. Thank you so much. Good afternoon everyone, and welcome to today's hearing of the Committee on Cultural Affairs, Libraries and International Intergroup Relations. I am the Chair of the Committee and we are now formally in session, and I want to welcome Council Member Margaret Chin, Co-Chair of the Women's Caucus who is here with us today, and we welcome other members who will be coming shortly. This afternoon we're discussing a very important and overdue topic, #MeToo and culture and the arts. Now, obviously just about everyone is familiar with the #MeToo Movement, and how it came about shortly after numerous accusations of sexual misconduct against Hollywood producer Harvey Weinstein by many actresses, actors and others, some high profile, some not. Now, the term was first coined by activist Terana Burke in 2006, and has been employed to spread awareness and understanding about sexual assault particularly in communities of color affecting many women of color.

1
2 Saying #MeToo unifies those who have been victimized
3 by sexual violence, which includes far too many
4 people. A recent pole suggests that 81% of women,
5 and 43% of men have experienced sexual harassment or
6 assault during their lifetimes. My guess is that
7 we'll—that number may even be low particularly as it
8 relates to women. Now, Actress Alyssa Milano used
9 #MeToo to as a rallying cry to encourage people who
10 have experienced sexual harassment or assault using
11 the hashtag #MeToo on social media, and following
12 that, came a deluge of many, many women and even some
13 men talking about what they have experienced. Now,
14 in just the last few months at least 150 powerful men
15 have since been accused of sexual misconduct ranging
16 from inappropriate texts to groping to rape. This
17 includes James Toback a Hollywood writer and director
18 who has been accused of sexual harassment by more
19 than 200 women. He has denied the charges, and will
20 not be facing sex crime charges in Los Angeles. Terry
21 Richardson, a high-end fashion photographer who has
22 been accused of sexual assault by multiple women,
23 which he denies. He has since been banned from Conde
24 Nast. Kevin Spacey, an Academy Award Winning actor
25 who has been accused of sexual assault by several men

1 who were much younger than him at the time.

2 Obviously, he has been denied his role in House of
3 Cards among other things. There have been others.

4 Adam Venit, a powerful Hollywood agent who was a
5 former NFL player and current actor Terry Crews
6 accused of groping him in front of others at a party.

7 Venit was suspended for one month before returning to
8 work, and will not be facing criminal charges after
9 prosecutors decided not to move forward with this
10 case, and there are many other cases. So, from the

11 allegations against Harvey Weinstein in particular,
12 we recognize that there are certain power structures
13 and vulnerabilities that artists and cultural workers
14 are subjected to, the engrained casting couch culture
15 in Hollywood has allowed countless powerful figures
16 to intimidate, coerce and rape actors and employees.

17 Then this past weekend, high-end fashion designer
18 Karl Lagerfeld revealed his own dated attitude
19 towards sexual harassment in an interview where he
20 said that he was fed up with the #MeToo Movement, and
21 questions starlets who have taken 20 years to
22 remembers what happened. Regarding a wide range of
23 sexual misconduct by more than 50 models, including
24 yanking their breast, touching their crouches or
25

1 aggressively pulling down their underwear without
2 asking them during shoots against Karl Templer, the
3 creative director of Interview Magazine. Lagerfeld
4 express disbelief, and then insisted that if you
5 don't want your panties pulled about, don't become a
6 model. Obviously, that is reprehensible that there
7 are still many who believe these things. Of course,
8 we can't talk about this issue without talking about
9 Donald Trump, the President who himself has boated
10 about his own sexual misconduct. All of this is
11 simple unacceptable. Sexual misconduct has no place
12 in our society, let alone our places of work or
13 sacred institutions of art and culture. The #MeToo
14 Movement is relevant in every aspect of the cultural
15 and arts communities, and the modern #MeToo hashtag
16 movement not only came out of the cultural and
17 artistic communities, but it has provided a lens
18 through which we are reconsidering and re-
19 contextualizing artwork and how to respond to
20 behavior at a time when society determines how to
21 grapple with the scope of this issue. As chair of
22 this committee, I will continue to work with my
23 colleagues in government to promote arts and culture
24 and to support artistic endeavors that aim to engage
25

with the issues brought up by the #MeToo Movement.

Now the Department of Cultural Affairs and

Commissioner Finkelppearl who is here recently held

office hours on sexual harassment, and the cultural

community highlighting resources and partnerships.

We look forward to learning more about those

resources and partnerships and ways in which we can

recognize the value and importance of art and culture

in light of the #MeToo Movement. Today, we also want

to hear more about how members of the cultural

community themselves have faced issues of sexual

harassment, sexual violence, and what the #MeToo

Movement means to them. We're also interested in how

art and culture have been employed in this era of

political uncertainty, and to explore new ways to

hear concerns and suggestions to address those issues

that may be unique to the cultural and art

industries. Art has the ability to harness the power

of expression and provide outlets to address #MeToo

both within and beyond our communities. As such, we

want to learn more about the ways in which art is

integrated into transformative programming and

services for victims and survivors. We also want to

learn more about how the department intends

1 continuing utilizing the arts to effective service
2 the community in light of the #MeToo Movement. So, I
3 want to thank and recognize we've also been joined by
4 members of the committee Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo
5 and Council Member Joe Borelli in addition to the
6 fabulous Margaret Chin, who I introduced earlier, and
7 I want to thank the staff including my staff David
8 Ginsberg our Legislative Director as well as our
9 committee counsel Brenda McKinney, to my right, and
10 Legislative Policy Analyst Chloe Rivera to my left
11 and Senior Finance Analyst Aliya Ali, who is not here
12 with us. So, obviously an incredibly important time
13 in our country and across the world, a very important
14 time for our committee and again I wanted to have
15 this [siren] committee and I wanted to have this
16 topic because I feel like there are so many women and
17 even some men who in our community in particular
18 incredibly vulnerable and have been for a very long
19 time, and we're just starting to see more come to
20 light, but with that, I want to ask our Counsel to
21 administer the oath to Commissioner Finkelpearl
22 before he begins his testimony.

24 LEGAL COUNSEL: If you can please raise
25 your right hand. Do you affirm to tell the truth,

1 the whole truth and nothing but the truth in your
2 testimony before this committee, and to respond
3 honestly to Council Member questions?

4
5 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: I do.

6 [coughs]

7 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Commissioner
8 Finkelpearl.

9 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Thank you.

10 Good afternoon Chair Van Bramer and members of the
11 committee. Thank you for this opportunity to discuss
12 the critical issue of sexual harassment in the
13 cultural community. Over the past few months, there
14 have been an onslaught of stories about sexual
15 harassment in the workplace implicating a wide range
16 of industries. The appalling reality is that the
17 arts and culture community has been the source of
18 many of these incidents. [coughs] These disturbing
19 stories highlight an urgent problem that we must take
20 efforts to address—to understand and address. People
21 are courageously coming forward to expose what has
22 been happening in our industry, and to begin to put
23 an end to it. This is an issue that we have—that we
24 have to face head on when brought forward by brave
25 people that need to be acknowledged and supported.

1
2 In addition to these individual acts of courage, we
3 also need to examine the power dynamics that have
4 allowed this behavior to go relatively unchecked for
5 so long. My agency's efforts to promote Diversity,
6 Equity and Inclusion, that is DEI Diversity [coughs]
7 focus not only on who is working in the cultural
8 sector, but who has a seat at the table when
9 decisions are made. I believe there are steps
10 organizations can take to create a safe environment
11 where diverse perspectives are represented and
12 respected. These include, but are not limited to
13 having women, trans and gender non-conforming
14 individuals and people of color in leadership
15 positions within organizations and on board, and
16 making anti-oppression and anti-harassment training
17 more widely available to all staff. One way we're
18 working with the cultural sector [coughs] to promote
19 equity and inclusion is by requiring the 33 members
20 of the Cultural Institution Group to adopt their own
21 DEI plans. These will be among the first cultural
22 institutions in the country to adopt such plans.
23 This could provide a template for moving forward
24 toward a more equitable inclusive cultural community.
25 A true DEI policy must include the creating and

1 protection of state work-safe work spaces for all
2 employees. Employees should be able to hold
3 employers accountable for their actions in ways that
4 are widely known, transparent and safe. In addition,
5 employers could make available appropriate resources
6 for emotional and medical support as well as legal
7 recourse. Many of these themes came forward during
8 the public engagement process of Create NYC. As part
9 of our commitment to continuing a dialogue, we opened
10 up during the Cultural Plan engagement process, we
11 convened a Create NYC Officer hours with the
12 Commissioner to talk about sexual harassment in the
13 arts and cultural community last month at the Whitney
14 Museum. In attendance were workers from a variety of
15 cultural institutions both large and small and we're
16 particularly gratified that a group of CUNY students
17 showed up because of their dedication to addressing
18 sexual harassment. At the convening, the Department
19 of Cultural Affairs was accompanied by staff from two
20 sister agencies: The Commission on Human Rights, the
21 CCHR, and the Mayor's Office to Combat Domestic
22 Violence, OCDV. They were able to lend expertise and
23 offer avenues for help. [coughs] The experts from
24 these two agencies spoke of legal protections and
25

1 resources for emotional support in the wake of sexual
2 harassment in the workplace. A lot of the questions
3 of this event, this event covered areas of workplace
4 harassment that are currently accounted for under the
5 law, but some questions pertain to newer modes of
6 harassment to take place online. These new varieties
7 seem particularly difficult to address as the
8 perpetrators may be anonymous or hiding behind an
9 identity they adopt. They also seem particularly
10 difficult to stop and the volume [coughs] of
11 frequency of attacks can be unbearable. Regardless,
12 there are steps that any responsible employer can
13 take to ensure that they are responding to harassment
14 claims to the best of their ability and creating a
15 safe work environment for their employees. I'm
16 grateful for the expertise of CCHR and OCDV at this
17 event because they were able to lead a discussion on
18 how to engage the organization's Human Resources
19 Department. However, as one participant pointed out,
20 many cultural organizations across the city are too
21 small to have an HR director let alone an HR
22 department. Of the approximately 95 organizations we
23 fund, about half have budgets of \$250,000 or less.
24 These organizations that sometimes have two, one or
25

1 even no full-time employees. At the convening, we
2 committed to coordinating HR training offered
3 [coughs] by CCHR for these smaller groups. In
4 addition, these groups will be able to talk about
5 their institutional structures how harassment may
6 happen, and offer ideas to seek advice on prevention.
7 We're also exploring new ways to use creative
8 practices to support people who are vulnerable to
9 harassment. One of the four new Public Artists In
10 Residence or PAIRs, my agency announced in January is
11 with the artists Tatiani Fazlalizadeh-Fazlalizadeh,
12 sorry, who is working with CCHR as a woman-as a
13 street artist and painter, her series *Stop Telling*
14 *Women to Smile* takes aim at gender-based street
15 harassment around the world. She will work with CCHR
16 to continue to support people facing discrimination
17 particularly women and girls, and to educate the
18 public on discriminatory behavior. Through the
19 Mayor's Grant for Cultural Impacts that funds
20 partnerships between city agencies and cultural non-
21 profits, we're all supporting *Hands Are For Holding*.
22 This is a collaboration between Give Me Dance and
23 the Mayor's Office to Combat Domestic Violence. He
24 uses dance as a tool to preventing-for preventing
25

1
2 teen dating violence and promoting healthy
3 relationships. Sexual harassment is not new or
4 specific to the field of arts and culture. Today we
5 are in what I hope is paradigm shift in which people
6 are being held accountable for their abuse of power
7 and discriminatory and predatory actions across all
8 sectors. A major part of the problem has been the
9 atmosphere of fear and silence that has shielded
10 perpetrators and suppressed victims' voices.
11 Thankfully, we seem to be turning a corner. This is
12 necessary [coughs] and long overdue. Several actors
13 in the cultural sector have taken the lead in these
14 issues. The Newman Center hosted a series of
15 workshops last month to, as they put it, provide
16 tools, support and guidance for both leaders and
17 workers in the arts and culture to combat sexual
18 harassment and discrimination in the workforce. I'm
19 glad to see that the Newman Center is here and will
20 testify in a couple of minutes. In addition, in
21 October of 1,800 women and gender non-conforming
22 people in the art world signed an open letter titled
23 *We Are Not Surprised*. The letter states: Where we
24 see the abuse of power, we resolve to speak out, to
25 demand that institutions and individuals address our

1 concerns seriously, and to bring these incidents to
2 light regardless of the perpetrator's gender. We
3 need to work together to change the workplace
4 environment to promote healthier interactions among
5 staff, boards, artists and others. DCLA looks
6 forward to continuing to learn more about this
7 important issue, and offer our unwavering support and
8 commitment to moving this cultural sector forward.
9 Thank you and I'm happy to answer any questions.

11 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Thank you
12 [coughs] Commissioner. I know you've had a—a busy
13 day. I saw you out there this morning shepherding
14 the removal of the J. Marion Sims statue among other
15 things. So, you say in your—your testimony and—and
16 obviously I agree sexual harassment is not new or
17 specific to the field of arts and culture, but I'm
18 sure you agree that the—the arts, culture and the
19 performing arts perhaps in particular. There are in
20 particular a disproportionate number of men who sort
21 of run many of the organizations and then a lot women
22 and some who are incredibly vulnerable as they
23 audition or try out or are seeking to advance in
24 their careers as any one else would. So, (a) do you
25 agree with—with that that in our field there are

1 particularly vulnerable people, and interested to
2 hear your thoughts on that.
3

4 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Yeah. I mean I
5 think there's no question about that, and that, you
6 know, as I said at the beginning of the testimony,
7 it's just appalling to see that kind of cascading
8 series or allegations and, you know, which I believe
9 many of which are correct, against cultural
10 organizations and cultural leaders, which is, you
11 know, so that's why we decided to do the open office
12 hours and to talk about it at the Whitney, but I also
13 think that the fundamental problem that you're
14 discussing, which is maybe that the power structure
15 of these cultural organizations would be better
16 served by a more diverse group of leaders, and that
17 is part of the Diversity Equity Inclusion Plans that
18 we expect cultural organizations to be adopting. I
19 think that [coughs], you know, there's been a-a
20 concentration especially in the larger institutions
21 of male leadership, which has proved out to be
22 problematic. So, I think that the Diversity Equity
23 Inclusion Plan is not separate from the issue, and
24 that's why I wanted to put it into the testimony.
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: No, I think it's
3 definitely a part of the—the solution here, but one
4 of the other things we talked about planning from
5 this meeting and you address it somewhat in—in the
6 testimony, obviously, a lot of these—a lot of our
7 organizations are very small, and not only don't have
8 HR departments, but that have very little in the ways
9 of structure. And if you are in a small environment,
10 and there's an artistic director and that is the
11 founding, and executive director and someone is
12 harassing or subjecting someone to acts of violence,
13 there is no one to go to, and so I wanted to ask you
14 -I know that the work with CCHR and others is
15 terrific, but should the department have someone who
16 can be that liaison because in larger organizations,
17 we make sure because often it is the CEO or the
18 president or the vice president who's doing things
19 like this and abusing the power, and—and you make
20 sure that there's somebody within that organization
21 who—who women can know, they can report this to and
22 be safe and not be retaliated against. But should
23 the agency itself have a liaison, have a point person
24 for those roughly 425 organization that you just
25

1 talked about below a budget of 250 who can those
2 women turn to?

3
4 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Yeah, so I
5 mean I—this is something obviously that was discussed
6 at the meeting there and that's—so, I think what we
7 want to do is to meet with this—we have another
8 session coming up. There's going to be a training
9 and HR training with the actual experts, and it was
10 really great to have CCHR. We had three lawyers
11 there who really had the depth of knowledge. So,
12 we're not an enforcement agency, you know, we're not
13 an investigative agency, but there is an enforcement
14 agency and investigative agency. There's the Police
15 Department and there's, you know, Human Rights. So,
16 the—I think we want to have the meeting to understand
17 what the issues are with these smaller groups, and I
18 do think you're exactly right. You know, if you're
19 in a big organization there's a policy. People know
20 what the policy is. You know, if you're being
21 harassed even by the executive director, you go to
22 the HR Department. It's confidential. You know who
23 the person is, but we are talking about even the
24 problem of, you know, things that are completely very
25 unregulated environment like the studio visit. Like

1
2 you're there and there's just two people there and
3 there's a power dynamic. How does that work out?
4 What kind of employment situation or non-outside
5 employment situation is it? There's a lot of
6 ambiguous things that go on, and that put people in
7 power for positions in contact directly with people
8 for whom, you know, they are beholden in some sense.
9 So, anyway, so that's our next step. You know, this
10 is something we open up a dialogue. We realize that
11 this is a important issue, and the next step is to
12 meet with the groups and find out what the next--what
13 the appropriate thing is, but also to understand, for
14 the groups to understand that there is an avenue that
15 if you go to CCHR's website there's a button that's,
16 you know, to report harassment right there.

17 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: I understand
18 that you're not the enforcement or investigatory
19 agency, and and--you'd be more a source of--of that's
20 trusted--

21 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Uh-hm.

22 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: -and then can
23 refer people, but a lot of folks don't know who CCHR
24 are--

25

1

2

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: [interposing]

3

Yes, right.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: --but if you're an artist and you're a cultural worker, the many know the Department of Cultural Affairs. So, so you're open to considering whether or not someone in your organization could be a--a liaison to cultural workers and artists in the city at least for the purpose of-- of taking concerns and complaints and then obviously putting them in touch with those who could actually.

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Yeah. So, I'm open to it. I think that the point of the meeting or not the point. One of the points they made or one of the take-aways of the meeting was that idea you're right that folks in the room maybe hadn't even heard of the agency. They have heard of our agency. They haven't heard of CCHR, who were in the room together, and it was like oh, here is the group of people and here are the lawyers and OCDV was there as well to deal with issues like, you know, of trauma, et cetera, extra legal issues. So, it seemed like the introduction was an extremely important thank to--to have done--

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: So--

1
2 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: --to open the
3 doors.

4 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Talk to me a
5 little bit about reporting. You know, we just passed
6 a very important package of bills here in the City
7 Council, and one of the things that's really
8 important to me is that organizations that receive
9 funding from the--from the city should be transparent
10 about the reports of sexual harassment within their
11 organization, and should actually also report what is
12 done about those complaints, what's substantiated,
13 what's not, what actions were take against for
14 example an executive director or artistic director if
15 the complaint is substantiated? Is there any such
16 mechanism currently for the Department of Cultural
17 Affairs, and I'm not just talking about your agency,
18 but I'm talking about all those agencies or
19 organizations that you fund. Do you get any of that
20 information? So, let's just say you had an
21 organization that we fund--

22 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Uh-hm.

23 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: --and that
24 receives cultural development fund and Passline(sic)
25 and there is an executive director or CEO or artistic

1 director who it's known acts inappropriately, has had
2 allegations leveled against him. What do we do in
3 those cases?
4

5 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: So, the—so
6 first of all, I'm not—I've been beginning to get
7 briefed on those new laws. So, Passline is similar
8 to city-city government how we operate ourselves and
9 similar to how we do business with us and operate.
10 So, I'm not fully and I do expect to be fully briefed
11 on that. We actually get training ourselves in the
12 new ways we have to hold ourselves accountable. But
13 so there—so, are you talking about cultural
14 organizations where there has been a criminal
15 complaint or where there are allegations or because
16 if there are—so, organizations that get funding from
17 us are required to, you know, report on any illegal
18 activity, anything that breaks the law that
19 absolutely could be grounds for denying funding to an
20 organization. If there's legal now in some cases
21 we're talking about something there's a rumor or
22 there's like, you know, allegations or something, but
23 if there's illegal activity, absolutely that is
24 grounds for denying funding.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: As I mentioned
3 in—in my testimony, allegations of sexual harassment
4 often aren't treated as criminal matters or—or there
5 is criminal prosecution, what happens much more
6 frequently is those things are dealt with within the
7 organization or at the board level, if they're dealt
8 with at all. Sometimes they're just pushed under the
9 rug, and—and sometimes where the complainant is
10 retaliated against fired or—or, you told they're
11 never going to work in this town again kind of thing—

12 -

13 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Yes.

14 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: --but I—I guess
15 it's sort of more than just rumor, but less than--

16 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: [interposing]
17 yes. So the--

18 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: --criminal
19 prosecutions. To what extent is that brought to the
20 agency's attention if at all?

21 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: So, there is a
22 differentiation also between the CIG where we do sit
23 on the boards, and we understand the board activity,
24 and cultural organizations who simply get funding
25 from us. So, the funding under the—so we would be

1 aware if anything to the board's attention of what
2 was happening and how the cultural organization is
3 handling that. So, obviously there have been issues
4 like that at cultural institutions in recent years,
5 and for, you know, in—in some cases those have been
6 appropriately handled. Right, I'm not certainly
7 going to go into details on that, but, you know, for
8 example what happened at Lincoln Center a director
9 was dismissed because he head, you know, broken
10 certain policies. It wasn't sexual harassment
11 exactly. It was a consensual relationship, but that
12 was reported to us, and we understood and we felt
13 that that was appropriately handled by the cultural
14 institution. In the case of the CDF applicants for
15 example, those are organizations where, as you know,
16 we're funding particular activities. We don't sit on
17 the board. So, it—a lot of it has to do with public
18 service. So, there could be a cultural organization
19 that's doing, you know, tremendous community work and
20 there's something else happening a different part of
21 the cultural organization, and it's not necessarily
22 reported to us. We don't have a mechanism to collect
23 on 950 organizations all of the information about
24 everything that's happened in the organization. We
25

1 hold people accountable for what we fund, but
2 obviously if any allegations come to us, we would
3 refer them to CCHR or the Police Department if
4 there's criminal allegations. So, that hasn't
5 happened when I've been Commissioner that something
6 has--an allegation has come to me about criminal
7 activity.
8

9 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Right. So, I
10 want to invite my colleagues to speak as well, but I
11 think, look, I think the new package that we passed
12 is going to go a long way towards helping with this.
13 But I think there has been and continues to be a
14 problem with transparency when it comes to these
15 issues, particularly at smallish non-profit
16 organizations where there executive director sits on
17 the board, has a great deal of friends on the board.
18 You know, everyone in the agency sort of knows that
19 person is widely known to be inappropriate, and-and
20 sometimes there are allegations. Sometimes there are
21 complaints filed. Either nothing is done or--

22 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: [interposing]
23 Yeah.

24 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: --it goes
25 unreported and there's just the--the lack of

1 transparency feeds this really systemic problem, and
2 it's gone on for an incredibly long time obviously
3 and—and I think the more transparency we can get, the
4 more sunlight, the more we'll know and workers,
5 particularly women will be safer at work.

6
7 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Can I just
8 make a quick comment on that?

9 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Yes.

10 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: So, I think
11 really and again, this is just from what I've read in
12 the paper a classic example that was the allegations
13 that have been brought against the Architect Richard
14 Meier last week, and be—and this is a longstanding
15 set of predatory behavior I would say if the
16 allegations are correct. I have no reason to
17 disbelieve them. Many women have come forward. The
18 problem as you're stating is that he is he brand,
19 right? So, he is the person who brings the money to
20 the plate for that architecture firm and people are
21 terrified to bring a complaint against somebody
22 because they felt they could be jeopardizing the
23 entire operation of the firm. So, that thing where
24 you have the brand in the way of the organization
25 being one person--

1
2 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Right.

3 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: --is-is
4 endemic to these smaller organizations.

5 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Yeah and so,
6 [coughs] I want to also recognize we've been joined
7 by the amazing and fierce Council Member Helen
8 Rosenthal who I referenced the package of 11 pieces
9 of legislation that were passed last week that's been
10 incredibly instrumental in-in passing that through,
11 and-and before I-I call on Council Member Chin to go
12 first in this very, very strong and powerful row of
13 women to my left [laughter].

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [off mic] Now,
15 I'm nervous. (sic)

16 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Yeah, I want to
17 just reiterate because I told this story when we
18 passed the bills last week and it-it sort of to me is
19 indicative of all the problems that we face, and-and-
20 and I want to say women experience this almost on a
21 daily basis since the beginning of time. The fact
22 that I myself had this experience when I was 20
23 working for a non-profit agency where the executive
24 director was incredibly powerful and made very
25 inappropriate comments towards me and sort of

1 touching me, and-and wrote me inappropriate notes,
2 and-and I was 20 years old, and-and he was a legend
3 in the gay community and, you know, and I was just
4 like oh, my God, I don't want to like, you know, do
5 anything bad, and people like he's really powerful,
6 and, you didn't know who to speak to. I was
7 terrified, but ultimately did find a colleague who I
8 confided in who then said, you know-you know, Greg
9 over there is going through the same thing. He does
10 this to everyone and-and it's a real problem. We did
11 file ultimately a complaint with the board. They
12 stood by him, of course, and ultimately he was-he
13 retired or resigned several months later, but I raise
14 the issue because I think until it happened to me and
15 I spoke to my colleague, it had been going on for
16 years, right. That was just how he was. When young
17 men came into the agency who he liked, he did all
18 sorts of inappropriate things. Again, this happens
19 far to women, and I---I want to stress that, but
20 because I know that that happens is so many agencies,
21 it's really important for this transparency to-to
22 have this record of where the complaint is coming
23 from, how is the agency handling them? Are they
24 being treated seriously? What happens when they're
25

1 substantiated? What penalties do these powerful men
2 face, if any? Those are really, really important to
3 address and obviously particularly in the cultural
4 sector for us because we care so much about this.
5 So, with that, Council Member Chin.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Chair
8 for this important hearing. I-I just want to follow
9 up with a question, commissioner in your testimony
10 that you said that the agency's effort to promote
11 DEI, the Diversity Equity and Inclusion and that you
12 are requiring the CIG to also develop their own
13 plans. That's great, but there are other cultural
14 institutions that are not CIG. So, is the agency
15 also working on helping these other cultural
16 institutions--

17 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: [interposing]
18 Yeah.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: --to develop the
20 DEI plan? That's--that's one question, and then the
21 other thing is that I do want to emphasize on what
22 the Chair said earlier that being the Department of
23 Cultural Affairs, that is known to all the others and
24 cultural groups that I do see your agency having that
25 role of really providing the information, and people,

1
2 you know, that's the first group that people--the
3 first place that people would think maybe I can get
4 some help or get some information. So, I think it
5 would be great if your agency do provide that
6 expertise, that resource, and to be able to collect
7 information about what's going on in these cultural
8 institutions, that you can be the point even to help
9 provide training to the cultural organization and to
10 their staff to their others in terms of how to fight
11 against, you know, harassment, sexual harassment.
12 So, I think that's an important role that I really
13 urge you to--and we can help you to do that, right?

14 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: So, I--

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: [interposing] -but
16 I think you have an important role in that.

17 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Let me answer
18 the first--second question first and then the first.
19 So, we--again, we're not the experts because we don't
20 have the lawyer. WE have lawyers on our staff, some
21 of which are here, and they're experts in art law, in
22 contracts, sometimes the real estate. The people--we
23 do have lawyers, and experts in city government who
24 are experts, and those are lawyers we brought with us
25 to the--we're going to bring forth. So, CCHR does

1
2 trainings. So, we're going to organize a set of
3 trainings for the smaller groups, but it's not us
4 doing it. You see what I'm saying? So, it's a
5 conduit to information. Rather than us providing the
6 services, we're saying there's a group of people of
7 smart people with all the experience necessary within
8 city government and we're going to be the liaison to
9 make sure that you know who you should be boing to
10 and it is CCHR and their lawyers rather than our
11 lawyers who are dealing with, you know, intellectual
12 property questions and 25%.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Well, I-I-I agree
14 with that.

15 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Yeah, yeah.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: But my-my point is
17 really your agency as the agency that someone if they
18 have an issue, if they have a question, they can call
19 so that you do have someone. You still have your
20 staff to be able to point the person to the right
21 direction or to be able to sort of encourage them to
22 come in, and then you can do the referral. Because
23 like often times people don't know who to call.

24 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Uh-hm.

25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: And if it it's
3 theirs—you're the institution that they get funding
4 from or they have work with you, it's really is
5 important that you are the intermediary to really
6 work to kind of get them the resources they need, and
7 I think that's what I--

8 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: [interposing]
9 Yeah, and so, the—the idea of being an intermediary
10 and understanding—for us to understand better
11 exactly—and by the way, it's been really helpful to
12 have the Artists in Residence at these other agencies
13 because we're talking to other agencies in a much
14 more complicated daily basis, and so we've got people
15 at other agencies that we can call like CCHR we
16 didn't have a lot of contact with, but then having
17 these bridges at our agency has been quite good. So,
18 the idea that we can, you know, get—be the referral
19 point or to say here's where you can get the help you
20 need is quite different than saying here's—we can
21 provide that service for you because that's what I'm
22 saying. So, then the other question that you had
23 related to Diversity, Equity and Inclusion plans.
24 So, we have now also in the other funding, you know,
25 part of the agency as you know, the CDF there are now

1 questions that relate to Diversity, Equity and
2 Inclusion, two new questions on the application that
3 happened this year related to staff and board on the
4 one hand and audience on the other hand related to
5 diversity. So, as we understand it, we don't think
6 that there are any—we have yet to see Diversity,
7 Equity and Inclusion plans adopted by boards from
8 cultural institutions in New York City. We'll be
9 getting—we've been asking for this question publicly.
10 Almost nobody has it. So, with this, we're kind of
11 inventing the wheel, not reinventing the wheel.
12 [coughs] Colleges and universities have these,
13 businesses have these, you know, private businesses,
14 for-profits. Cultural institutions don't tend to
15 have these plans at all. We're looking all over the
16 country for these plans. So, I think that having 33
17 institutions by this time next year that the board
18 adopted Diversity, Equity and Inclusion plans is
19 going to lead the way to show what a plan looks like
20 for other cultural institutions. So, I think that's
21 going to be quite helpful for the CDF groups, the
22 other 900 groups to have those plans that they can
23 look at and understand what the constituent elements

1
2 have a good Diversity, Equity and Inclusion plan will
3 be.

4 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Thank you. So,
5 Laurie Cumbo.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Chair
7 Van Bramer, and I want to thank you for hosting this
8 very important hearing at this time, and I really
9 want to thank you for your voice and your passion on
10 the removal of the Dr. James Marion Sims sculpture.
11 I want to thank Council Member Helen Rosenthal for
12 the incredible work that she did on this very
13 monumental extraordinary package of leadership
14 surrounding sexual harassment, and I believe that the
15 work that you are doing and that all of us
16 collectively as the Women's Caucus in this body, have
17 led ultimately to this victory for the nation, and I
18 want to thank now Council Member Margaret Chin as
19 Chair of the Women's Caucus and the package of
20 legislation that we pushed forward also led by
21 Council Member Inez Barron who played an instrumental
22 role in having this particular sculpture removed from
23 Central Park after 84 years, and this is so important
24 to me personally as an African-American women because
25 to know of the torture and the humiliation and the

1 destructive behavior of Dr. Sims to see this
2 particular sculpture come down means so much because
3 as African-Americans and as African-American women I
4 think often that our resilience is mistaken for
5 apathy, and that often we are considered not whole
6 human beings, and when I say whole in terms of that
7 meaning the full depth of feelings, emotion, pain,
8 and all of these things that are often because of our
9 resilience seen as they don't matter. So, this
10 sculpture coming down—I'm not pleased that it's
11 coming to Brooklyn, but this sculpture coming down is
12 an important part of history particularly as we're
13 discussing the #MeToo Movement because art does
14 matter and sculptures do matter, and art does matter
15 in terms of where we place value, and what is
16 important in our community and our society, and so
17 today, this is one step on a journey of a million to
18 right wrongs, and to show that all human beings have
19 value, and that there's no one individual above an
20 individual, and that we can no longer continue to
21 celebrate gains in our country and in our world at
22 the expense of others or at the oppression of others.
23 So, today is certainly a herstorical day, and I'm
24 proud to be a part of this body, and so many dynamic
25

1 colleagues who work on so many different levels to
2 make this particular moment happen. So, I thank you,
3 and it's an honor to work with you all, and I wanted
4 to jump right in. As far as the—the discussion on
5 the Diversity, Equity and Inclusion, and we've had
6 this discussion many times and this is, of course as
7 we're discussion the #MeToo Movement, but it's also
8 in terms of diversity, and we've had numerous
9 conversations about diversity particularly as it
10 pertains to hiring. Once institutions create these
11 Diversity, Equity and Inclusion plans, what do we do
12 to enforce these plans so that they don't remain?
13 Just another white paper that sits on the shelf and
14 time and time again we come back, year after year
15 with no real movement in terms of diversity. No real
16 movement in terms of hiring that we're going to have
17 protests and rallies and op-eds, and that this
18 dynamic isn't changing, and so these great plans they
19 sound great, they look great, they play great at
20 hearings, but we are still four years in not seeing
21 the level of diversity particularly at our larger
22 institutions whether it's on the board or curatorial
23 positions. We're just not close to reflecting the
24 diversity of the city of New York.
25

1
2 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: So, thank you
3 and by the way, making the connection between what
4 happened this morning and this hearing is something
5 I've been feeling all day.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Uh-hm.

7 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Absolutely as
8 you say. So, the Diversity, Equity and Inclusion
9 plans again cultural institutions don't have these
10 plans.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Uh-hm.

12 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: So, we're
13 going to be leading the way I think in the country to
14 saying you have to have these plans. If they don't
15 adopt these plans, there are going to be financial
16 consequences. That also is unusual. That hasn't
17 happened in other places. We're now working with
18 folks who are experts in this field to understand
19 what kind of Diversity, Equity and Inclusion plans
20 actually work to produce results. So, it's not just
21 a matter of adopting a plan. It's adopting a plan
22 that has goals and adopting plans that are—have a
23 likelihood to succeed. So, we're, you know, working
24 with consultants and those consultants and just sort
25 of the idea of, you know, what constituent elements

1 should be in the plan, but also what kind of plans
2 are successful, and there's a lot of literature on
3 this. There are—books have been written. There's a
4 book called *On Being Included* by woman named Sara
5 Ahmed that talks about this, and I've read it's—it's
6 a process that needs to be done consciously. We want
7 to see a lot of different kinds of Diversity, Equity
8 and Inclusion plan not one size fits all because
9 we're experimenting in 33 institutions at once to see
10 which ones are the most effective. `Sometimes plans
11 are quite short, but very concrete small set of goals
12 like we're going to do this, this, this and this.
13 Some are much more philosophical and in-depth and
14 lengthy. So, we're hoping to get—to have those
15 experiments be successful, to have these
16 organizations. We have a yearly review of their
17 plans, and that they submit an annual report
18 essentially to us in the fall. I mean we ask for it
19 in the fall and get it around February, around this—
20 the beginning of the year. So, we're going to be
21 reviewing those plans on an annual basis to make sure
22 that these organizations are following through on
23 these things. They're not sitting on the shelf. So,
24 you know, we have seen some movements nationally in
25

1 relationship to let's say curatorial diversity not
2 quickly enough, but we absolutely are committed, and
3 I-I do think it's a major step. These are board-
4 board adopted Diversity, Equity and Inclusion plans
5 in 33 institutions that constitute about half the
6 cultural life of New York City. I think it's a major
7 step.
8

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: So, two things to
10 that. (1) I think that a plan again sounds good.
11 I'll be honest. I don't have a lot of faith in the
12 plan, but a few questions that I want to ask about
13 that. So, what I think that should happen is that
14 when it comes to hiring and just say we're looking at
15 the CIGs, not to say I'm just discussing them in this
16 moment. There should almost be a regimented or
17 outline of where all the places, job postings are
18 going to be sent out to. So, that there are
19 publications that every time an institution because
20 we're receiving--these institutions are receiving
21 significant dollars, and as a result of that, their
22 postings should go wide and far, and so while they
23 may come up with their own internal plan, I think
24 that there should be an outward plan that
25 specifically says let's just say you've got to go to

1 the Russian Times the Amsterdam News, Our Time Press,
2 the Korean Daily Ledger, whatever the papers are that
3 way there's a way, online distributions or
4 institutions or HBCUs or whatever it is because I
5 don't want to single out a particular organization,
6 but it is the 800 pound gorilla in the room. I have
7 a tremendous amount of respect for the Brooklyn
8 Museum, but in that particular case, the challenge
9 that I have is that the outreach was not substantial.
10 In talking to other organizations in terms of the
11 outreach that was done, they—those organizations were
12 not reach out to. So, I believe that when it comes
13 to not just the Brooklyn Museum, but if we're talking
14 about institutions such as that focus on African art
15 and so on and so forth, there are very few if no
16 institutions throughout the city of New York that
17 have African curatorial directors. That's very
18 problematic, but I feel that it has—it's a
19 combination of two things. It's a combination of (1)
20 the institutions aren't doing the outreach. (2) I
21 think that the other aspect that needs to happen is
22 that that many of the funders they also need to
23 change as well as the institutions. What are the
24 qualifications for these positions, and we're not
25

1 talking about lowering the bar. We're talking about
2 looking at experience as relevant to PhDs or master
3 degrees. We have artists and professionals wo have
4 been working in the field for decades, generations
5 that are founders of institutions, have worked at
6 major institutions and those things could be replaced
7 in the way of how we look at who's hired, and that
8 sort of things. So, look, I think it's more than
9 just a plan. It's also changing structural things in
10 terms of who's qualified for the positions, what are
11 the outreach that we're doing? How are we ensuring?
12 What are the pen—what are the real penalties and who
13 are the people that are looking at these plans to say
14 that these plans are being followed and implemented
15 or not followed and implemented, and here are the
16 concrete ways that we're going to make sure that
17 there's diversity [coughs] for women and people of
18 color and so on. I've said a lot, but I have a lot
19 to say today.

21 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: So, I—I agree
22 with a lot of what you just said. I'm not sure that
23 there's a concrete question in that, but absolutely.
24 I think that there are different ways to look at
25 qualifications, and again not—it's not about lowering

1 standards, but understanding different kinds of
2 approaches, and sometimes there's a sort of a piece
3 of paper that makes you somehow the only person who
4 can get X, Y and Z job. I don't—I think that that is
5 something to look at. I think it—the other major
6 point you're saying is that—that [coughs] you can't
7 simply open the door that's been closed for
8 generations, and expect people to walk in the door
9 without an explicit invitation in that you have to
10 say it. So, that's affirmative action versus sort of
11 like equality versus equity, but to say this job
12 really is available to you, you know, you can't just
13 again—if somebody has been denied access to a door,
14 you can't just like unlock it and think they're going
15 to walk in the door. So, I absolutely recruiting,
16 being proactive, finding qualified people who have
17 understanding of—of subject areas, I think it's all
18 extremely important, and I think that that—those are
19 elements of Diversity, Equity and Inclusion plans
20 absolutely, you know, for sure.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I just—I'm—I'm
23 going to conclude, but I would say I think that the
24 greatest challenge that I faced in these five years
25 is it's not just in this industry. It's almost, you

1 know, when it comes to discussing who's going to be
2 the next chancellor, when it comes to who's going to
3 be the next director, when it comes to all of these
4 different positions, there always seems to be some
5 reason as to why we can't find qualified candidates
6 and people of color, and I'm simply not accepting
7 that. I-I feel that there is so much more that we
8 have to do in terms of identifying leadership,
9 cultivating leadership, securing leadership, changing
10 the dynamics of the qualifications because working
11 within communities, having extensive experience is
12 really a very valuable tool, and at one time let's
13 say in the City Council, the expectation was that you
14 would be a lawyer to serve in the City Council or to
15 have come up through the political ranks. I really
16 thank God that that is not the only way that you can
17 become an elected official now is because you've had-
18 you have a legal background, that there are people
19 that have college degrees, there are individuals that
20 don't. There are some that have doctorates, others
21 that don't. There are people that come from the
22 union world, the art world, small business world, the
23 educational field and many others, and those
24 different experiences are really what makes this body
25

1
2 as significant as it is with all different types of
3 legislation, and I feel that the city of New York
4 really loses out because we only value one type of
5 experience, and that's often academic experience, and
6 there are so many ways for people to contributed
7 without having a PhD or some of these other types of
8 experiences. I want to see more people of color with
9 varied backgrounds, and I—I really hope that this
10 just doesn't remain a paper that the next term of
11 Council members are going to have a hearing to
12 determine that it was ineffective four years ago, and
13 we didn't move the pendulum in any way on this. I
14 want to see some real change through this. So, that—
15 that's all I wanted to add, Mr. Chair.

16 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: [interposing]
17 Thank you very much, and I, too, am proud not to be
18 lawyer, and [laughter] I was a library organizer, and
19 I think that's actually served me well as a Council
20 member. So, now I'd like—am thrilled that we're
21 joined by the Chair of the Committee on Women,
22 someone who has been appropriately lauded for her
23 work in spearheading that historic series of bills
24 that have become law in the city of New York dealing
25

1 with this issue. So, I'm really thrilled to
2 introduce Councilwoman Helen Rosenthal.

3
4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you so
5 much, Chair Van Bramer, and I appreciate that, and
6 I'm really proud to have worked with all my
7 colleagues here and with our Speaker Corey Johnson in
8 getting this package of bills through. I think it's
9 the first package like we're doing a package under
10 his tenure. So, he really made clear what the
11 priorities are, and I appreciate your having a
12 hearing on this exact topic. I really do, and your
13 work at your bill having to do with the contract
14 agencies I think it's a great and—and all the
15 legislation actually I would say is a great first
16 step, but we all need to be clear that it's first
17 step. There's a lot—there—this was just—we're just
18 at the tip of the iceberg here, but there's so much
19 more than needs to be done, and Commissioner, I'm
20 wondering about your thoughts as Commissioner of this
21 agency whether or not you would be willing to move
22 forward on some policy changes that weren't
23 legislated, but that, you know, we all agree need to—
24 -need to know about. So, for example, now due to
25 Council Member Van Bramer's legislation, we will know

1
2 that the contract agencies, in this case all 950 I
3 guess--

4 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Uh-hm.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: --cultural
6 institutions has given sexual harassment training.

7 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: That's a big
9 deal, and the harassment training now that the CCHR
10 will have online is quite broad. I mean it has not
11 only the definition, and examples and a phone number
12 of where to complain, but also the Bystander
13 Intervention Training, which is incredibly important.
14 But my concern is, and--and I think of the arts as a
15 particularly vulnerable work employee situation where
16 the vast majority of workers are, you know, don't
17 have a lot of avenues open up for them, and are
18 really just waiting to be discovered, but their
19 protections that we find a way for their protections
20 to be meaningful. So, one thing that would be great
21 is that if you knew as the Commissioner not only that
22 the harassment training was given, but also the
23 number of complaints that came out of those cultural
24 institutions. In other words, you know, part of the

1 training is that management has to report on
2 complaints--

3
4 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Uh-hm.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: --internally,
6 and I think it would be meaningful for you to know
7 that information not just knowing about the stories
8 that hit the papers like what happened at the Met,
9 which, by the way, both of those stories, if I were a
10 worker there I'd be a little confused. I mean one
11 sexual harassment perpetrator it took a year just to
12 start investigating him, and the other person was,
13 you know, fired pretty quickly.

14 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Uh-hm.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So, how do you
16 as the Commissioner leading the way of these cultural
17 institutions get them to move--move the ball forward
18 even more?

19 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Yeah, I mean
20 so first of all I [coughs] have just begun to get
21 briefed on all the legislation, and to understand
22 sort of what it means as a city agency, and also our
23 responsibility in the relationship what we get
24 contracted, how we get contracted, but I'm not
25 exactly sure. You're saying that--so we--the 950

1 groups that we give funding to, we, you know, it's an
2 outside panel process, and we have, you know, a panel
3 evaluating. So, I'm not sure exactly what you're
4 suggesting in terms of-- So, is it a concrete
5 suggestion related to the grant giving process or--

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [interposing]

7 Sure. So, with the new legislation they are now
8 required to report on whether or not they've given
9 sexual harassment training.
10

11 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: I understood

12 that.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So, that's

14 great.

15 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: With the city
17 agencies, your agency for example, in addition to the
18 trainings, there will be a risk assessment that the
19 agency will have to undergo to see what areas of the
20 workplace is there more chance of sexual harassment--

21 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Uh-hm.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: --and not just
23 the risk assessment, but the plan for what you're
24 going to do to deal with that issue.

25 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Yeah.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Right, so
3 that's a next step. A next step is what the agency
4 will be required to do is report to DCAS on the
5 number of sexual harassment complaints that are made
6 in your agency, and of those, how many were
7 substantiated or withdrawn. That's a next step.

8 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Okay.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: A next step
10 after that is so what happened with those complaints.

11 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Uh-hm.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: With the ones
13 that stuck, what was meted out in terms of next steps
14 to the-to the perpetrator. You know was it pay
15 docked? Was it lost days? Was it a training? Was it
16 suspension? You know, the EEO lays out a number of--

17 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: [interposing]
18 Yes.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: --next steps.
20 What were they?

21 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Uh-hm.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: And, I could
23 imagine in your thinking about it with your different
24 institutions that there are some that are ginormous.

I'm very familiar with, you know, American Museum and
Natural History of the Metropolitan Museum.

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Correct.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Wouldn't it be
interesting for you to know that there are more
sexual harassment complaints levied at the American
Museum at one institution versus another. That's--
that's a place to go.

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: One of the
hardest places to go is with the smaller cultural
institutions where someone would fear retribution.

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Right, and--and
you have to sort of start thinking creatively about
that. The reason I bring it here is (a) because my
colleague very wisely had a hearing about this--

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Right.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: --but because
those employees are so vulnerable---

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: [interposing]

Uh-hm.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: --because and
I'm thinking of musicians and, you know, who are

1 entrepreneurs themselves, you know, maybe work for
2 themselves or, you know, trying to get gigs. What-
3 how-what more could we be doing?
4

5 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: I mean, so I-
6 look, we-this is long overdue, and I admit, but I
7 think that we're sort of at the beginning of this
8 process in terms of that discussion, but to actually-
9 I think, you know, I was there at the Whitney for
10 that whole discussion. I plan to be at this next. I
11 mean the next workshop is specifically for the
12 smaller cultural institutions, and I think you're
13 absolutely right that there's a-there's a unique
14 vulnerability, but I think it's also important (a) to
15 sort of educate people in terms of what your rights
16 are, and what your recourses is-are. So, to just get
17 people that basic information, but also listen to
18 them and find out what's going to be the most helpful
19 to those employees, you know, to bring forward the
20 kind of stories like what are the real problems in
21 those very tiny cultural organizations, which aren't
22 you know, often individuals. There's the founding
23 director syndrome, all these, you know, issues. I
24 have no idea also, and I don't know how you would
25 verify this statistically whether there is more or

1 less sexual harassment going on in the smaller places
2 than the bigger places. Right, the bigger places
3 have their own power structures that are hard to
4 address. So, I think that, you know, it's something
5 I want to, you know, I'm-not just want, I will take a
6 deep dive into what is meaning-what these new laws
7 mean for our agency in terms of how we operate, but
8 then to understand what rules or sort of lessons we
9 can learn from those laws in terms of how we deal
10 with our grantees. But since I don't-so, I'm just now
11 learning about this new set of legislation. I don't
12 know exactly how to translate it yet.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay. I mean
15 that's a little disappointing because this is an
16 issue that's been out in the ether for a really long
17 time, and--

18 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Uh-hm.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: --I don't
20 think it's just because I'm Chair of the Committee of
21 the Women that I've sat around and thought about it,
22 but I mean-So, let me just and-and happily your
23 lawyer is my lawyer. So, if we could-if I just want
24 to make this right, get this right. So, requirement-
25 requirement now is that there be a poster that CCHR

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

is going to come up that is in plain language, that, you know, gives examples and—and says what people's rights are. Does it also have the phone number on there, the hotline? We hope so. I'm sure the Commissioner will do that because that would make sense.

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: It hasn't been designed yet, right. So, it's yes. Right.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Right.

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Yeah, I know about this one.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So, one thing that would be very helpful as you consider what you're doing is the requirement is the poster go up some place visible.

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Yep.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So, one thing that would be great is as you—in any interaction that you have with these 950 grantee, you know, contracts or grantee partners, that one question be where are you posting your signs?

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Uh-hm.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: That's an
3 example of helping to make sure that the word get
4 out.

5 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Yeah,
6 absolutely, and then I mean the thing also when you
7 thin of like small non-cultural organizations, I mean
8 I can think of places I've worked, and I know exactly
9 where that should go, the place where people
10 congregate, the place where people have lunch, all
11 that kind of stuff. There are many cultural
12 organizations that actually don't have a place,
13 right. So, it's just run out of somebody's
14 apartment. What do you do in those cases, and how do
15 you make—but they also have a workplace, which could
16 be moving around from lace to place. Like they could
17 be a theater company that doesn't have a theater, but
18 performs in a bunch of different places. So, this is
19 the kind of thing to understand how to best contact—
20 be in contact with those employees of those very
21 small organizations. It's something I want to hear
22 from the organizations as well, but I'm—I'm familiar
23 with it.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Well, I love
25 that point. I mean and my reaction to that is this

1 is great that you're thinking about it. So, there's
2 going to be the low-hanging fruit--

3
4 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: --the Whitney,
6 AMH, the Met and then the middle hanging fruit. I
7 mean on the--if I can just double check for the
8 posters, they go up in any business or is that, too,
9 wit the 15 employees or more?

10 FEMALE SPEAKER: [off mic] I don't know
11 exactly what it is for that.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you.
13 Sorry to put you on the spot. [background comments]
14 Trainings. Yes, yep. We'll double check on all of
15 this.

16 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: [interposing]
17 But if I may intervene there. We're also--

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [interposing]
19 But the point is being that--

20 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: I'm sorry.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: --if you could
22 for all the ones that do have a place--

23 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: [interposing]
24 Yeah.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: --perhaps you
3 could voluntarily report back, you know, when you're--
4 when you report on saying yes, they all have done
5 sexual harassment training. You could report that
6 yes, we've double checked. They all have their
7 posters up. You know, we don't have to, you know,
8 put it in a bill--

9 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Yeah, true.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: and that or
11 that you would say half of them did, and half of them
12 didn't, and we went after them. Here's a copy of the
13 follow-up letter that we sent, and for the ones that
14 don't have a physical location, we have documentation
15 that they sent them email with the poster in it.

16 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: [off mic] Uh-
17 hm, uh-hm. That's good news.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I think that's
19 the kind of--if you could spend some time thinking
20 about it, that's how you could move it forward. For
21 the groups that are counting on you for the workers
22 who are counting on you for help.

23 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Yeah, I mean
24 this is, by the way, that email idea that's a great
25 idea. Yeah, and I'll have to ponder that, but in

1 other words to get, yeah, you know, to get it to the
2 people who need to see it and understand it and—and
3 feel empowered to use it and call the number, it's
4 not always going to be a lunchroom or something like
5 that, but maybe there's a way to get it to them
6 nonetheless no matter what the size of the
7 organization.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So, I guess
10 just to end, Chair Van Bramer, again, I really want
11 to thank you for holding this hearing, and perhaps at
12 a further--future hearing, you know, in a year we'll
13 be able to hear back from the Commissioner what the
14 findings are because the laws to into effect pretty
15 quickly.

16 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Yes.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you.
18 Thank you, Commissioner, and thank you for your work
19 this morning. It was a thing of beauty watching the
20 statue come down, and I—I spoke with the communities.
21 This is the Marion Sims statue. I spoke with the
22 community who are anxious to get involved in that
23 community dialogue about what should go up in it's
24 place, and I think they would appreciate hearing.
25 Even if there's no information, they would appreciate

1 hearing from you with their next Parks Committee
2 meeting--

3
4 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: [interposing]
5 Now the Community Board?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: of Community
7 Board 11.

8 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Okay.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you so
10 much.

11 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Right.

12 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Thank you very
13 much Council Member Rosenthal. Just before I let you
14 go, I just want to drill down further on a point that
15 we seem to I think rightly have sort of focused on,
16 and before you even said it, I was thinking about all
17 those theater companies and dance companies that do
18 not have a home. We both know, we all know that
19 there are lots of cultural organizations that are two
20 employees, and what if one of those employees is the
21 managing director who is harassing the only other
22 employee who is the artistic director and running the
23 operation, and--and that's why I sort of come back to
24 again both the agency having a role to play and you
25 having a designated liaison to handle these kinds of

1 issues because if it's two people, and-and we know it
2 happens or if it's an organization that only has one
3 employee, but has a lot of dancers or-or performers
4 who are paid on per gig basis, but who come in-and-
5 and there's really one employee of the organization,
6 you know who are they going to? Where is the poster
7 if they're just renting space at Junior High School
8 363 for the performance, right, which happens all the
9 time. You're funding those organizations as-as we
10 all know, we are funding those organizations, but
11 you're granting the money.

12
13 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Yep.

14 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Yep, and-and so
15 I just want to say that-that-that I'm going to keep
16 pressing both the organ-the-the agency to have and
17 play that role as the trusted source particular for
18 those who are in smaller organizations and then also
19 I think Council Member Cumbo was going three a little
20 bit, too. With your DEI plans in particular for the
21 CIGs (sic) but also in-in the paper work for the
22 program groups, you have the ability to ask all of
23 those organizations about the number of sexual
24 harassment complaints that have been filed and/or how
25 they've done. You do that administratively. So-so

1 once again, you're open to playing that role and
2 having someone on the DCLA staff as-as a-as a point
3 person on sexual harassment complaints within the
4 cultural organizations that you fund in particular,
5 and then number 2, you are, I would hope, open both
6 in your DEI plans with respect to the CIGs, but then
7 also with the program groups open to asking, you
8 know, you could ask two questions at a minimum and
9 get a lot of information, and actually know what
10 we're doing in terms of how many sexual harassment
11 complaints were leveled in our organization last
12 year, if any, and number 2, what was the disposition
13 of said complaint?
14

15 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: So, in terms
16 of that first part, I mean, look, we're already
17 engaged in the idea to try to figure out how we could
18 be the liaison and get the right information to the
19 right people. And so, again, we're not the
20 enforcement agency, but we are already have already
21 started in this idea of let's say, in a trusted and
22 safe environment introducing the cultural community
23 to the people who actually do that work, which is the
24 folks from these other agencies. So, being that
25 bridge is something absolutely we're already engaged

1 in. We're interested in that. In terms of new
2 questions, like I'll have to talk to my lawyers about
3 what we can collect, to not collect or I don't know.
4 This is a new thing that I'm being asked right here
5 in life, and I've always been trained not to make any
6 promises live and in person like this, but I
7 absolutely hear what you're saying, and it sounds
8 interesting and--

10 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: [interposing]

11 That's why we call them live hearings, and the-the--

12 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: [interposing]

13 And that's why--

14 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: --the questions

15 are not in the can, and-and--

16 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: [interposing]

17 Are not.

18 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: --and-and it's

19 important. So,

20 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: [interposing]

21 Yep.

22 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: --again I just

23 think, you know, if-if you had the legal ability to

24 do it, which I think you do, and you were able to ask

25 all 950 organizations two additional questions,

1 right, on the forms, I realize it's a competitive
2 panel review process. We all know the process, but
3 there are still forms that people fill out in terms
4 of drawing down the money, and-and asking whether or
5 not folks in an organization whether it's two people
6 or-or 20 people. Because I agree with that-that-that
7 the sexual harassment isn't necessarily more systemic
8 in an organization of three people as it is in an
9 organization of 1,500. But, the person-the young
10 woman who works for two men at a small theater
11 company in many ways is a lot more vulnerable and
12 fought fewer avenues if she is being harassed, and-
13 and that's sort of where I want to get at in terms of
14 you all being that trusted source, and being a place
15 where she could go to if she's facing that because
16 she certainly can't go to the other two, right?

18 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Absolutely
19 not. Yeah, yeah.

20 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: So, we'll-we'll
21 pursue that. It sounds like you're open to it all,
22 but not committing to any of it.

23 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: That sounds
24 like a reasonable summary.

25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I just want to
3 associate myself with the comments and the
4 recommendations of Council Member Jimmy Van Bramer.
5 I think he's really onto a very important element to
6 what this hearing is actually all about, and that
7 really is bringing home particularly for women, but
8 for all people the dynamics that sexual assault is a
9 really big deal, sexual harassment is a really big
10 deal, and anywhere and everywhere that it takes
11 place, it's a huge deal because what we've seen over
12 the last four years is that there has been a
13 celebration of a decrease in violence all across the
14 city, but then there's little footnote: Except for
15 when it comes to women. So that it's kind of this as
16 long as all other forms of-of violence are down or
17 crimes are down, but as long as it's happening to
18 women, it's not as big of a deal. We can still
19 celebrate, and so I think that what Council Member
20 Jimmy Van Bramer is bringing up is critical to this
21 conversation, and I want to also associate myself
22 with the comments of Helen Rosenthal because I
23 believe that what should take place in the place of
24 Dr. Sims' sculpture is something that does revere and
25 acknowledge and recognize the trauma as well as the

1 brutality against those women, and that their memory
2 should be celebrated, acknowledged, recognized, and a
3 true story should be told there, and with the
4 incredible legislation that Council Member Jimmy Van
5 Bramer and I passed in regards to the Percent for Art
6 program, I believe this would be a tremendous
7 opportunity to have African-American woman sculpture
8 to celebrate and to recognize those lives and we have
9 plenty from Betty Saar to Allison Saar to Barbara
10 Chase Rabeau to Chakai Booker to Wangechi Mutu,
11 Mickalene Thomas. We have plenty, and I'm here to
12 assist and help so that we know that we can actually
13 secure and find a prominent African-American woman
14 sculptor to tell that very important story. Thank
15 you.
16

17 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Alright, and I
18 would like to associate myself with those remarks.
19 [laughter] Yea.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [off mic] If you
21 can say something today here on it. (sic)

22 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Yeah. So, I
23 think this is the beginning, right. There are a
24 series of beginnings here long overdue. I do think a
25 lot of really interesting ideas came out of this

1 discussion with you, Commissioner, that I feel like
2 all three of us feel very strongly about pursuing,
3 and whether that's administratively or legislatively,
4 but I think there's--there's a lot more that--that the
5 agency can do. You're doing a lot of work. I know
6 how much you care about these issues, and I know how
7 much you care about all of the artists and cultural
8 workers that you fund and support, but there's always
9 more that--that we can be doing, and--and I think
10 together we'll make sure that it gets done. So, with
11 that, I want to thank you for being here today, and
12 we're going to call up--I think we only have one panel
13 of folks from the cultural community to talk about
14 their own experiences. So, I want to call up
15 Wilhelmina Frankfurt from Dance NYC. Wilhelmina.
16 Lisa Phillips from the New Museum, Anne Marie
17 Lonsdale from the Alliance for Resident Theaters, and
18 I think we have four seats there. We have five
19 folks. So, if we could all just come together. I
20 think it's Leslie Mock from the Center for Arts
21 Education and Nusrat Jerin Arifa, Young Feminists and
22 Allies National Organization for Women. [background
23 comments, pause] So, if we can all five or together
24 and we'll go from left to right, if that's alright
25

1 with everyone. [background comments] [laughter] I
2 love this committee. [background comments] Yes.
3 Why don't we start on--on my left, and then we'll go
4 right down, and we're going to go to--just for time
5 purposes, we'll have about three minutes each, right.
6 I'm not going to cut anyone off, but-but if you can
7 be sensitive to the--the timer. Thank you. Just
8 identify yourself before you deliver your testimony,
9 and feel free to begin. [pause] Is--

11 FEMALE SPEAKER: [off mic] I'm making
12 sure that--I'm checking is your mic on with the red
13 light?

14 ARIFA JERIN: No, it is on. [laughs] My
15 name is Jerin Arifa. I'm the founder and president
16 of the Young Feminists and Allies Chapter of the
17 National Organization for Women. We have quite a few
18 members in New York, but across the country also. I
19 was also one of two students who spearheaded the
20 Sexual Harassment Policy for all of CUNY, and I did
21 that while I was undocumented. So, I have a first-
22 hand understanding of how race, class, and different
23 things interest that, and how we can create
24 systematic change despite obstacle. So, I want to
25 thank the Council for having this hearing, and for

1 giving me the opportunity to testify. As, cultural
2 community moves forward with the recently sexual
3 harassment legislation, I wanted to share some of the
4 lessons from our work at CUNY. We intentionally
5 engaged in a two-year process because we wanted
6 feedback from the various stakeholders. We wanted
7 the policy to the present represent the voices of
8 half a million students and staff at 24 institutions.
9 I think in that way it's similar to the City Council.
10 Our experience shows what you know already: Art has
11 the power to change culture, and to end sexual
12 harassment we need a culture reboot. We need to
13 change the culture that allows the entire spectrum of
14 gender based discrimination, everything from sex as
15 jokes to sexual violence because experts consider
16 sexual harassment and sexual violence in this extreme
17 form of gender-based discrimination. These extreme
18 forms of discrimination persist only because we allow
19 the less extreme forms to take place like the exist
20 jokes. Since graduation, I've continued my anti-
21 violence work as a proud American citizen, a design-
22 led and evaluated trainings for hundreds on ending
23 sexual harassment. In my work at both corporate and
24 non-profit sectors, I've seen first hand how art can
25

1
2 change culture. I hope you'll consider using similar
3 tools on using art and theater to change the culture
4 that allows sexual violence, and I hope that you'll
5 bring the communities of artists together with
6 women's rights advocates because artists understand
7 their craft, but do not understand the nuanced
8 dynamics of sexual harassment. By bringing them
9 together, we can create powerful change. I love New
10 York City. I love this initiative and thank you so
11 much for giving me the time.

12 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Thank you and
13 congratulations on so many levels. Tucked within
14 that testimony is a really, really incredible
15 personal story as well. I just want to say thank
16 you. I didn't want to interrupt you to congratulate
17 you, but I'm sure Councilwoman Rosenthal and I agree,
18 that was pretty amazing stuff. So, thank you. Who's
19 next?

20 ANNE MARIE LONSDALE: Good afternoon,
21 Chairman Van Bramer and Council Member Rosenthal. My
22 name is Ann Marie Lonsdale. I'm the Deputy Director
23 of the Alliance of Resident Theaters of New York and
24 I'm joined today by my colleague Corinne Woods, who
25 is our Programs Coordinator. We're really please to

1 participate in this hearing. Over the past many
2 months and years, this movement has empowered artists
3 to voice an urgent need to address sexual harassment
4 uneven power dynamics and other gender-based violence
5 that exists in the theater from the audition room to
6 the office to the rehearsal studio. We—this kind of
7 gender-based violence has led to unsafe workplaces,
8 ongoing sexual harassment and abuse, and created a
9 culture of silence around victims because of the fear
10 of being labeled difficult to work with, losing work
11 safety in the workplace and ultimately also
12 retaliation. Art New York represents hundreds of
13 theater companies. Many of them, in fact, the
14 majority of them have budgets under \$500,000 a year,
15 and only a few staff members or, you know, people who
16 are empowered to run those organizations. These
17 small institutions often lack codified policy to deal
18 with sexual harassment and provide safe working
19 conditions for their artists and cultural workers,
20 and even in larger institutions where codes may be in
21 place, power is so often skewed towards directors or
22 other top artistic personnel making change difficult
23 and creating a layer of protection around abusers
24 that enables them because of their perceived quality
25

1 of their artistic work or their prowess as
2 fundraises. I also just want to take one quick
3 moment to acknowledge the survivors in the room
4 today, and everyone who has voiced their
5 survivorship. I think that's really important, and
6 to also recognize that there are survivors of all
7 gender identities, who suffer inside of these
8 systems. Corinne is going to talk a little bit
9 specifically about what we're hearing about and
10 seeing in the theater community.

12 CORINNE WOODS: Apologies. I'll be
13 quick, and so I want to acknowledge that when we're
14 talking about artists in this respect we're not just
15 talking about actors, but also technicians, artistic
16 associates, designers, artists (sic) within rehearsal
17 rooms and small theaters organizations are as
18 mentioned incredibly skewed towards the artistic
19 version often of a single person or a small group of
20 people at the top, and the realities of the
21 theatrical working environment in New York City make
22 artists highly vulnerable to harassment because they
23 have multiple short-term employers, don't often know
24 their employment rates, are constantly having to go
25 out and ask for work, and have a lack of reporting

1 options and a mechanism for doing so. We've also
2 decided kind of as a society that we have a balance
3 of whether art is worth more than the humans who are
4 creating it, and we need to look at a cultural shift
5 that re-evaluates the balance of those two pieces of
6 the work that we're doing from the craft-creative and
7 theatrical field in order to make humanity a more
8 crucial part of what we're doing.

10 ANNE MARIE LONSDALE: so, just quickly.

11 In the testimony that we've submitted, we've
12 addressed pretty in-depth pragmatic response that Art
13 New York is undertaking over the next at least two
14 years. So, we're excited for you read that
15 testimony, and we hope that the work that we're going
16 to do in this space will build accountability, center
17 survivors, and create space for healing and justice
18 for our artists and arts workers in New York, and
19 hopefully beyond. So, thank you so much for holding
20 this hearing and for having us here today. Thank
21 you.

22 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Thank you.

23 Next. [pause/background noise]

24 LISA PHILLIPS: Lisa Phillips, Director
25 of the New Museum of Contemporary Art. Thank you,

1
2 Chairman Van Bramer and members of the Committee for
3 holding this hearing today. The New Museum was
4 founded in 1977 by Marsha Tucker, a woman, a
5 feminist. I'm the second Director. We have a lot of
6 strong women leaders at the New Museum. Our Board is
7 over 50% women as well. So, this is an issue that
8 means a lot to us. It's close to us so we feel
9 passionately about it, and—and I personally do. We
10 started talking about this several years ago before
11 the allegations broke, and when they started coming
12 fast and furiously in the fall, we gather together a
13 group of our staff and our board had a conversation a
14 very frank conversation about what we might do, and
15 then we decided out of that we had to take some
16 concrete actions, and organized a series of workshops
17 in March around this issue first what is harassment,
18 how do you draw the line. Second, upholding due
19 process and—and what our responsibilities are there,
20 dealing with the transgressions and gray areas around
21 this issue and there are still many, and that's
22 really the place to drill down because we see a lot
23 of that, and then finally changing the balance of
24 power and getting what we deserve, which is, you
25 know, the power dynamics are such a big part of this.

1 They were overwhelmingly received. We had people
2 form both the not-for-profit and for profit sector,
3 people from very small organizations to the large
4 museums and there were many, many people from other
5 museums that came to us. You're all looking for a
6 place to get-to have the conversation, to get
7 information to find resources because they're really-
8 it's lacking as you all know that it's just-it's not
9 there. So, it's a-it's an opportunity for us to step
10 up. We did publish our findings on our website. We
11 shared it with leaders in the field. What we learned
12 one in four women are harassed. Eighty-four percent
13 of those reporting harassment are women. Only 25% of
14 those harassed report the incident, and 75% of those
15 who do report, say that they faced retaliation. I
16 mean those are well published statistics, but it's
17 worth repeating, and then we made a list of
18 recommendations for both employers and for employees.
19 One of the things I should just mention, this is on
20 our website. I'm happy to share it with any of you.
21 I would like it all of you, but one of the things
22 that did come out in the course of these workshops at
23 almost every table [bell] is that there were repeated
24 instances of donor harassment. So, that's something
25

I just want you to think about. It's not only within staff, but also with donors.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Absolutely.

LISA PHILLIPS: My-my time is up. Okay.

[laughs]

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Next.

Good afternoon. Thank you to the Committee for the opportunity to speak to—speak to you today about the effects of the quality arts education—arts education on gender equality. My name is Leslie Mock. I'm a professional musician and also an intern at the Center for Arts Education. A year ago, I graduated from Berklee College of Music and have since worked as a performing artist and educator. My experience as a teaching artist has opened my eyes to the palpable and demonstrated power of dance, music, theater and visual arts and how it continues to engage our students and impact our schools and communities. Art education offers students rich and creative hands-on learning experiences, experiences that illuminate a process of the rehearsal, revision, reflection and challenges to think deeply about our social behavior and responsibility as respectful and inclusive citizens.

1 The Arts Education Partnership, a center within the
2 Education Commission of the State recognizes arts
3 education as a key to ensuring students' success in
4 the workplace. The arts embody the characteristics
5 of socially and culturally responsive pedagogy that
6 can lead to the affirmation and validation for girls
7 by nurturing a sense of empowerment and in promoting
8 their voices. This engagement through a high quality
9 and culturally responsive arts education supports
10 them in non-vocational ways and expands their
11 intellectual and emotional developments as they
12 mature into thoughtful critically thinking women and
13 enter the workforce. Increasing women's and girls'
14 education contributed to higher economic growth.
15 Research has reported correlations and associations
16 of arts education with increased GPA and reduced
17 drop-out, but more recent studies have shown
18 additional student level outcomes such as socio-
19 emotional qualities to enhance what we know about the
20 relationships between arts education, academic
21 performance, reduced dropout and overall increased
22 student success. The ability to manage behavior,
23 make decisions, learn from mistakes, self-criticize
24 and reflect are all immediate outcomes of an arts
25

1 education. In a 2016 study of schools across
2 Philadelphia, researchers found that prior attitudes
3 play an important role in determining the impact of
4 arts education. The study found that nine-year-old
5 students who participated in a music program
6 increased their tolerance for the perspectives of
7 others, increased their growth line set, and boosted
8 the academic goal orientation, and across all age
9 groups, students who showed higher levels in certain
10 domains like socio-emotional development prior to the
11 participation in an arts program went on to
12 experience a disproportionate benefit from the art
13 education. In 2011, Federal Report from the
14 Committee on the Arts and Humanities also shows that
15 high quality arts education develops habits of mind,
16 including problem solving, critical and creative
17 thinking, dealing with the ambiguity and complexity
18 [bell] integration of multiple skill sets and working
19 with others. I'd just like to end with expanding
20 arts access in equity city-citywide starts with
21 school day instruction taught by qualified arts
22 teachers. They are the seat in which great art
23 programming grows. I am lucky enough to have had
24 great arts teachers who built enriching and engaging
25

1 curriculum in the public schools I've attended. It's
2 helped me see the world from different perspectives
3 and understand people, places, periods of history and
4 issues with which I may otherwise be unfamiliar, but
5 most importantly, it's taught me to be a confident,
6 self-assured and independent woman. Arts education
7 can be crucial to changing attitudes and ending—
8 accepting gender equality as a fundamental social
9 value. I hope that every child in New York City can
10 experience first hand the benefits of a quality arts
11 education so that we can continue to build socially
12 responsible citizens. Thank you for the opportunity
13 to testify today.

14
15 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Thank you.

16 Last, but certainly not least.

17 WILHELMINA FRANKFURT: [laughter] Wow,
18 wow, wow, what an incredible meeting. Thank you so
19 very much, Chairman Van Bramer. I'm Wilhelmina
20 Frankfurt. I was a former ballerina with the New
21 York City Ballet Company, and I am now a Dance
22 Educator/Certified Public School Teacher in New York
23 City working in the South Bronx with—at a school for
24 K through 5 developing a program for children who are
25 really and truly underserved who deserved who deserve

1 the same training that all of the [coughs] not yet
2 equity inclusion is available at the School of
3 American Ballet. So, in November of this year, my
4 whole changed. I'm one of the first people that came
5 forward about Pete Martin's allegations, which are
6 not corroborated, but the case is closed and sealed.
7 So, you should know. I'm just going to read my op-ed
8 from Dance Magazine. I'll try to go quickly. In
9 1994, I began to write a book of essays about my life
10 in dance mostly as an exercise. When the #MeToo
11 Movement began this year, I knew it was time to brush
12 the dust off and take another look. Although
13 incomplete, these essays address the roots that have
14 long run between sexual assault, alcoholism and
15 ballet. They involve George Balanchine, and Peter
16 Martin and numerous stars of the New York City
17 Ballet. It's painfully clear that my story is the
18 same story that has occurred thousands of times all
19 over the world. That story is essentially this: An
20 abused and/or fatherless child is brought by an
21 ambitious mother to the court of the fairy tale
22 castle to perform for the drunken king. The girl
23 soon learns how to get and keep his attention, and
24 roles in ballets. She learns how to maneuver in a
25

1 deviant alcoholic culture. She learns how to ignore
2 boys her own age and seduce old rich men who write
3 checks for the company, and if she is smart, she
4 marries one of them before she is 30. For by that
5 age she's usually too old to dance. One of my essays
6 was published in Psychology Tomorrow Magazine in
7 2012, and in light of the Harvey Weinstein
8 accusations, I unearthed the link and posted it to my
9 Facebook page. It sparked a conversation about the
10 sexual misconduct and the abuse of power in the
11 ballet world. The subject became Peter Martin's.
12 He's currently being investigated. He is now retired
13 in case you don't know. [coughs] I have to this
14 date been contacted by all interested parties in the
15 press, the School of American Ballet and the law firm
16 conducting the investigation for both New York City
17 Ballet, and the School of American Ballet speak up
18 further about Martins. I have the utmost respect for
19 Sarah Kaufman from the Washington Post who I worked
20 with on this for months. R. Kelly's story of mental
21 and physical abuse in the Washington Post paints a
22 clear picture of that aspect. Am I a victim of
23 Martin's abuse? [bell] Can I finish?

25 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Yes, of course.

1
2 WILHELMINA FRANKFURT: Yeah. Am I a
3 victim or Martin's abuse? Yes. Was it sexual? Yes.
4 Was it consensual? No, but my own trauma is a
5 surmountable issue. What keeps me up at night is the
6 thought of how many dancers still live in fear
7 subject to the confused sexuality and morality of
8 these powerful people. Why are they not educated,
9 informed and protected and who are the adults that
10 turn their heads the other way knowing what they
11 know. I pose this question: Is Martin being thrown
12 under the bus to avoid addressing the larger more
13 deep seated problem? Shouldn't the Board of
14 Directors of both organizations and all related
15 organizations be a part of this investigation?
16 Unearthing lurid details of past abuses for public
17 consumption is to me far less important than exposing
18 35 years of cover-ups, mismanagement, greed and
19 corruption all of which created a toxic, dangerous
20 work environment for generations of vulnerable
21 dancers. Thank you Dance Magazine for the
22 opportunity to speak in my own voice. I have a
23 statement from Dance NYC. I am on their committee to
24 address this issue. I'm available to help, and I
25 just want you to know that, and we certainly did a

1 lot of research in our meeting at Dance NYC one very,
2 very cold night about these smaller organizations. I
3 gave you a list of organizations that can be—you can
4 get in touch with. It's not published, but I could
5 certainly give it to you, and I'm—I am thrilled that
6 there's some progress being made. You know, I—I-my
7 life has—I've lost a lot of friends, I've gained a
8 lot of friends. You know, I—I have stories, which I—
9 are too horrible to tell, and you don't need to hear,
10 but to me in my life at this point and I'm old, if I
11 can do anything to help younger people not have this
12 experience, I will do whatever I can do. Thank you
13 for letting me speak.

15 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Thank you for—or
16 everything you are doing to help other young women,
17 and for—for having the courage to come forward and
18 share, and just looking at your—your list of
19 organizations. When I talked about my situation,
20 obviously, no two situations are alike and—and I'm
21 not equating anything, but when—when I had this
22 experience, my experience, I went to the Anti-
23 Violence Project because it—it was the Gay and
24 Lesbian Anti-Violence project--

25 WILHELMINA FRANKFURT: Right.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: --but I knew
3 about that because I had volunteered for them and--and
4 they had and provided me an advocate, right and that
5 advocate then represented me and wen to the board
6 meetings, and helped me file the formal complaints,
7 and--and go through the process, which was dreadful,
8 in it's own way because of the--

9 WILHELMINA FRANKFURT: [interposing]
10 Yeah.

11 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: --fighting that--
12 that took place then as the Board resisted, you know,
13 doing anything. So, so thank you. I wanted to ask
14 the panel because you heard obviously a lot of the
15 discussion around both the smaller organizations that
16 you referenced and whether or not you think the
17 Department of Cultural Affairs were they to have
18 someone on staff who could be a liaison, would that
19 be helpful? Is that a meaningful addition? It's not
20 a solution, and there is--there's no one--a thing
21 that's going to solve this that the deeper cultural
22 shifts that--that both of you talked about ultimately
23 are--I'm going to go a long way, but is that helpful,
24 and then in terms of the transparency and--and the
25 reporting that we're talking about, is that helpful?

1
2 WILHELMINA FRANKFURT: I'd like to speak
3 to the transparency. I-I-it's something that has
4 been a discussion in my community that it's to me
5 maybe the largest issue because there's, you know,
6 [laughs] there's so much of this I can't tell you.
7 So, you know, we have to be transparent in-in school.
8 We have to-other organizations have to be
9 transparent. I think transparency is-is vital, and a
10 person to go to if you're a small organization just a
11 human being that you can reach out to, someone who
12 can-that's awesome in my opinion.

13 ANN MARIE LONSDALE: I couldn't agree
14 more, and I want to lift up two things that I think
15 are critical. One is the relationship between money
16 and power, and any organization mine included that's
17 giving away money need to think about the structural
18 power that that entails, and so any grant making
19 organization or organization government, private
20 foundation or otherwise thinking about ways to
21 resource the field needs to be aware of their
22 position in terms of being able affect change, and I
23 think that we've seen that happen in other arenas
24 that have not been replicated around gender justice,
25 and I'm happy to speak more specifically about that,

1 but then, you know, also just wanting to—sorry, I
2 totally lost my train of thought. But yeah, wanting
3 to kind of lift up this idea that there are—there are
4 mechanisms for reporting that exist that are both
5 anonymized and—and not that use technology as a
6 platform for reporting of sexual assault and sexual
7 violence that could be implemented for the workplace,
8 and that there are already a number of really
9 powerful extra governmental solutions. HR and Arts
10 is one, wanting to lift up survivor and Marin Island
11 in her work and other sort of programmatic responses
12 and responses that can create space for survivors to
13 figure out how they choose to address issues. Think
14 that we need to think about the ways in which the
15 justice system can re-traumatize victims, and we need
16 to be really conscious of that in the creation of
17 responses to this kind of violence, which exists on a
18 spectrum of my co-testifier so rightly mentioned.

20 JERIN ARIFA: I wanted to speak
21 specifically about having somebody at the Department
22 of Cultural Affairs who's responsible. I think it's
23 an amazing idea. what I would question again is that
24 person not report to the Department of Cultural
25 Affairs because in my work with sexual assault

1 polices for universities, there---schools are
2 required to have a Title IX Coordinator, but they
3 report to the university. So, we're asking Title IX
4 Coordinators to blow the whistle on their employers
5 who can then fire them, and so it creates a just
6 impossible situation where they are not able to do
7 their jobs. So, I think this person who might be
8 liaison for the Cultural Affairs community should
9 actually report to the City Council and not--not be
10 scared that, you know. I mean how many of us we feel
11 comfortable telling our bosses that they're screwing
12 up. So, I think having that independence would be
13 really helpful.

14
15 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Anyone else on
16 the panel want to address those two questions?

17 CORINNE WOODS: I think having more
18 resources available to people is important. As we've
19 seen there's a big need for that. So, you know, how
20 that's provided and I'm not sure, but I also think
21 sending a strong signal to the leaders of cultural
22 organizations and to their boards is really key
23 because it's--the whole culture has to shift. So
24 sending that strong signal over and over again, as
25 we've started to now with the Diversity, Equity and

1 Inclusion. It's important and we just have to keep
2 at it.

3
4 LESLIE MOCK: Graduating from a music
5 school and also having most of my friends and peers
6 also going the same path, I would say there is just a
7 lot of oversight of the music schools or music
8 institutions. Just in the fall, 11 teachers from
9 Berklee were fired for—for sexual harassment. Right,
10 now actually there are—there's a Title IX suit. So,
11 I think that there just needs to be mandatory sexual
12 assault training at all of these institutions,
13 particularly because I think after the military, it's
14 the most—there's the biggest gender gap, and for some
15 schools actually. It's the number one institutions
16 for the gender gaps.

17 LISA PHILLIPS: I wanted to—I wanted
18 single this what she said about mandatory training.
19 So, when we worked on the CUNY policy

20 ARIFA JERIN: I wanted to—I wanted single
21 this what she said about mandatory training. So,
22 when we worked on the CUNY policy, I actually started
23 working on the policy because they wanted mandatory
24 training. So, as a women's rights activist, I kept
25 coming across my fellow students, which is just

1 horrific stories, and I didn't want to just help them
2 after the fact. I wanted to prevent it, and
3 mandatory training is key because if you tell an
4 agency that they need to do training, but not spell
5 it out, they will do the least amount of work
6 possible, just so that they can check off the box.
7 So mandatory what we found through our research and
8 in my written testimony I included information from
9 the New York Times where they looked at research
10 across the country. It has to be in-person mandatory
11 prevention training. It cannot be online, and it has
12 to be a certain amount of hours. It has to be a
13 certain number of times, and I think really spelling
14 that out for our different organizations, and maybe
15 this liaison for the Department of Cultural Affairs
16 can check up and make sure that this training is
17 being done.

19 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: So, I wanted to—
20 we talked a lot, it was Brenda, Corey and myself
21 about that number that we have in our city of 81% of—
22 of women reporting harassment, which I think is low,
23 and we talked about part of the reason we think
24 that's low is because there are probably cases where
25 women don't believe that what happened merits that or

1 is, in fact, harassment, but I think there's still a
2 lot of work to be done there in terms of letting
3 everyone know what is and what is not appropriate,
4 and—and I—I recall a very recent situation where we
5 went into a—a classroom of a technical school where
6 everyone was sort of building things, and they were
7 young men and young women in the classroom, and a
8 very powerful male figure greeted everyone with me,
9 and then somehow noticed that some of young women had
10 nail polish, and then asked to see all of the—the
11 girls' nails, which I thought was a really bizarre
12 request as all of them are sort of mechanically
13 putting things together. He didn't ask to see the
14 boys' nails if they had done their nails and it—it
15 was just one of those really, you know, instances
16 where all of the young women maybe didn't think
17 anything of it, and—and, you know, did show the
18 nails, but I think it happens all the time. So, I
19 guess it—it was just one of those really, you know,
20 instances where all of the young women didn't think
21 anything of it, and—and—and, you know, did show the
22 nails, but I think it happens all the time. So, I
23 guess I wanted to ask all of you, too, about that
24 piece of it, which is what constitutes harassment,
25

1 how each of us experienced that sometimes in
2 different ways and—but it's always wrong, and—and we
3 know what it is when we experience it, but we have to
4 also talk about what it is, and what it means. And
5 what it feels like, and—and that's a culture shift
6 thing as well both, you know, for maybe that very
7 powerful man to know that that was sort of a
8 ridiculous request and a ridiculous question to ask,
9 but maybe also for those young women who maybe
10 thought it was a harmless thing to—to—to show her
11 nail colors and—to make sure that they were somehow
12 nice even though they were putting together engine
13 parts. Just very bizarre, but I open that up to all
14 of you in terms of the cultures of question and—and—
15 and what is and then what is sexual harassment.

17 JERIN ARIFA: So, as someone who's led a
18 lot of trainings, that's one of the topics we covered
19 is to really drill down into what is harassment
20 because I think most people are good, and don't want
21 to offend other people, but most of us don't know
22 when they're being offensive, and—and it's a learning
23 process. You know, we don't have to think about an
24 identity that or a situation that doesn't affect us
25 like as an able body person I have to learn about

1 disability and it affects and make sure I didn't say
2 words that are offensive. So, I think there's a big
3 education piece, and I'm so glad you pointed that out
4 about the women who didn't recognize. So, research
5 shows that about 40% of women if—who are sexual
6 assault survivors when they're asked if they've ever
7 been raped, they will say no because they—there are
8 sets to it. One if it is they're such a stigma with
9 being a survivor that they would rather tell
10 themselves it's something else, and the other part of
11 it is saying they did something wrong. So it wasn't
12 sexual assault so this will never happen again. So,
13 I think that education piece again becomes crucial.
14 You know, when we get hired, most of us have in play
15 books or even if it's a smaller community there's—
16 there's some kind of orientation process. At CUNY
17 that's what we wanted to do is it needed to be part
18 of the mandatory orientation process when you join an
19 organization to learn about these things.

21 CORINNE WOODS: Yeah, I wanted to touch
22 on that. I think the education piece as you have
23 very eloquently stated is so crucial. They think
24 that it is much more expansive than we traditionally
25 think of anti-harassment training as being. Part of

1 that is we as a culture are working off a model of
2 consent that says that everything is okay until
3 someone says no rather than it is only okay for you
4 to utilize my body and my emotions in a manner that I
5 actively and affirmatively consent to and say yes.
6 That is a cultural shift that also needs to happen,
7 and it's really crucial to be part of this harassment
8 training. So, we don't get these responses by
9 powerful people saying well she didn't say not to me.
10 So, how could I possibly have known. That was the
11 part one. Part two, the—I have lost my train of
12 thought. The model of training as well that once
13 again we're talking about a culture and a population
14 that of employment that is very strange. It is a gig
15 economy. It is for many of our member theaters,
16 actors or artists aren't employees. They're
17 independent contractors, they're volunteers who are
18 getting travel stipends, and as compensation, and
19 within those, how do you put together a training
20 program for people for whom they spent eight weeks at
21 one job and eight weeks at another, and how do you
22 put any kind of structure across all of them? And I
23 think that this is—a space for some of our art
24 service organizations like Art New York as well as
25

1 city government and fundraising organizations that
2 work with individual employers to help to bridge some
3 of those gaps to make some work standardized and to
4 make their—make there—make there a baseline of what
5 expect the behavior within the arts to be.

7 ANN MARIE LONSDALE: Just super quickly
8 in terms of culture shift. I want to lift up the
9 idea of pay equity in particular with reference to
10 artists and administrators who are working in small
11 cultural organizations often in, you know, as my
12 colleague mentioned being paid either as independent
13 contractors or as itinerant workers, but that, you
14 know, so many women I think are involved in what we
15 affectionately refer to as the non-profit industrial
16 complex. Their labor is considered to be feminized
17 labor. We're all sort of thought of as volunteers
18 and non-professionals and that that sort of—that
19 misogyny infects the entire field, and it's something
20 that I personally have experienced, and that I—I know
21 that other colleagues of mine have experienced as
22 well. So, you know, our—our fight for 15, the way
23 that the minimum wage laws are—are changing how our
24 small organizations in particular can interact with
25 their even seasonal part-time employees, is-is

1 bringing around a huge amount of heat, but I would
2 just want to lift up like women and center--center
3 people, and especially women of color who are
4 consistently underpaid and paid less than white
5 colleagues and male colleagues.
6

7 LISA PHILLIPS: I agree that mandatory
8 anti-harassment training is really critical and
9 something that probably should be required for anyone
10 receiving funds from the city. Also, we learned in
11 our workshops that harassment is--is never about your
12 intentions and I think a lot of people feel their
13 intentions are innocent or even well intentioned, but
14 it's about how the person receives or perceives what
15 you say or do. So, there is responsibility to say,
16 to speak up that doesn't make me comfortable or, you
17 know, and that does get into the gray area. It's
18 sexual assault, unwanted touching. That's all clear,
19 but there are many things that aren't clear. So,
20 there's a lot to work out and that's why the
21 workshops are important, and we're going to have on e
22 tomorrow.

23 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Anyone else?

24 WILHELMINA FRANKFURT: It's--I also think
25 it's essential. I completely agree with that. There

1 are some things that are specific to dance and I
2 think that that poses a problem in the arts because
3 there are some things that are specific to each art
4 form. In dance there's tremendous body shaming that
5 goes on, and it just starts in ballet school when
6 children are very small, and there's also a lot of
7 hands-on touching dancers when they're being
8 corrected, and I—I have completely changed that and
9 when I am in a position where I can do this, I say to
10 others, I always ask a student first, is it alright
11 for me to touch you? You know, I'm just single-
12 handedly pushing that myself at this point, but, you
13 know, it's an idea. I think that dance teachers
14 should also get this training about it. Because body
15 shaming is—it crosses the sexual line actually, and
16 it does a lot of damage. So, defining—perhaps
17 defining in each art form what is and isn't sexual
18 harassment might be something that we need to do.
19 There are some things that are universal, but there
20 are some things that are not, and dancers are very,
21 very young. It's like gymnastics. It's like a
22 gymnast, you know. So, we—it's something we're
23 talking about at Dance NYC for sure, but all of this
24 is very helpful, and workshops. I think if there's a
25

1 way to come up with some kind universal workshop that
2 can begin to be done or handed out to organizations
3 large or small, and you have to do this for this for
4 your organization. It would be fantastic, and I'm
5 happy we're having the conversation. Thank you.

7 LESLIE MOCK: Sorry, one more point.

8 When we're talking about the definition of
9 harassment, which you had asked about earlier, I did
10 want to make sure to bring into the room as well that
11 some definitions of harassment especially in some
12 legalities is defined as attraction and that is
13 incredibly reductive. I myself have experienced
14 sexual harassment from people who are not attracted
15 to me who identify as gay men. So, that is also
16 something that we need to start testing that
17 definition of what harassment is as well as
18 recognizing that while this committee maybe
19 specifically focused on sexual harassment, the abuse—
20 the overlap between non-sexually based abuse,
21 harassment and bullying within the artistic space,
22 and those power dynamics are very closely linked with
23 the sexual harassment that we've really seen the
24 proliferation of recently.

1
2 JERIN ARIFA: I couldn't agree more. The
3 work that I do, I come across more people
4 experiencing bullying that doesn't necessarily have a
5 sexual tone to it, and Americans, I think 70% of
6 Americans have reported being bullied at work.
7 That's mind-blowing, and some of that is sexual
8 harassment, but there's just—I think sexual
9 harassment is about power structures, and so is
10 bullying. So, the—the dynamics are very, very
11 similar. I also wanted to just piggyback off what
12 you said, this is why in my testimony I talked about
13 bringing together artists with—with sort of activists
14 because I think each art form will look slightly
15 different on what the sexual harassment training
16 looks like, and by bringing somebody who is an—who's
17 an expert in dance somebody who's an expert in this
18 type of training, I think we can come up with really
19 amazing individualized programs.

20 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: So, I want to
21 thank you. I—I meant to thank Commissioner
22 Finkelpearl for sticking around, but he just had to—
23 to leave, but he—he did stay and listened to
24 virtually all of the testimony and—and I appreciate
25 the Commissioner doing that. So, I—I think this was

1 a really, really important discussion to have at the
2 City Council and for our committee. I thank all of
3 you fro being here, and, you know as the chair of the
4 committee, the person who fights for all this funding
5 that—that then Tom gets to give away, and—and, you
6 know, I get to go to all these organizations and—and—
7 and—and I do think about this all the time and—and
8 I'm glad you brought up the very specific sort of
9 consensus of dancers and—and—and ballet dances,
10 because I—I—I think about that all the time with
11 respect to this that there are different norms.
12 There are different practices, and different
13 vulnerabilities, and—and I sort of wanted to get at
14 that a little bit here, which is joining has
15 happened. So, also think some really good ideas we
16 heard about from all of you, and we'll definitely
17 continue the—the discussion with the Commissioner and
18 the Department of Cultural Affairs, but I want to
19 thank all of you for being here, and being a part of
20 this really important discussion and for sharing your
21 experiences and—and potential solutions. So, with
22 that, thank you very, very much all of you, and that
23 concludes this hearing of the Committee on Cultural
24

COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES AND
INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

98

Affairs, Libraries and International Intergroup
Relations. Thank you.

[gavel]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date May 7, 2018