

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

COMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC
SITINGS, AND DISPOSITIONS

----- X

January 20, 2021
Start: 2:03 p.m.
Recess: 3:00 p.m.

HELD AT:

B E F O R E: Kevin Riley
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Inez D. Barron
Peter A. Koo
Stephen T. Levin
I. Daneek Miller
Kevin Riley
Mark Treyger

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Tami Rachelson
School Construction Authority

Tamar Smith
School Construction Authority

Christine O'Connell
Director of Affordable Neighborhood
Cooperative Program
Housing Preservation and Development

Sarah Mallory
Acting Assistant Commissioner for
Government Affairs
Housing Preservation and Development

Chris Bramwell

Kate Lee McHale
Director of Research
Landmarks Preservation Commission

Anthony Fabre
Director of Intergovernmental and
Community Affairs
Landmarks Preservation Commission

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,
AND DISPOSITIONS

4

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: OK, Sergeant Martinez,
3 can you please start your recording?

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS MARTINEZ: PC recording
5 is under way.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Backup is rolling.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: OK, good afternoon,
8 welcome to the New York City Council Subcommittee on
9 Landmarks, Public Sitings, and Dispositions. [clears
10 throat] Excuse me. At this time we ask that all
11 council members and council staff [inaudible] their
12 video for verification purposes. Please place any
13 cell phones and electronic devices to silent or
14 vibrate to minimize disruption throughout the
15 hearing. If you have any testimony to submit for the
16 record you can do so by sending it to
17 testimony@council.nyc.gov. Once again, that is
18 testimony@council.nyc.gov. Mr. Chair, we are ready
19 to begin.

20 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Good afternoon. I am
21 Kevin Riley, chair of the Subcommittee of Landmarks,
22 Public Siting, and Dispositions. I am joined
23 remotely today by Council Members Koo and Council
24 Member Barron. Today we will be holding a public
25 housing on a school siting submitted by the School

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS, 5
AND DISPOSITIONS

2 Construction Authority, an affordable housing project
3 submitted by HPD and the landmark designation
4 submitted by the Landmarks Preservation Commission.

5 Before we begin, I recognize the subcommittee counsel
6 to review today's hearing procedures.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Chair
8 Riley. I am Jeffrey Campagna, counsel to the
9 subcommittee. Members of the public who wish to
10 testify were asked to register for today's hearing.
11 If you wish to testify and have not registered,
12 please go to www.council.nyc.gov to sign up now. If
13 you are a members of the public who wants to watch
14 this hearing, please watch hearing on the New York
15 City Council website. All people testifying before
16 the subcommittee will be on mute until they are
17 recognized to testify. When the chair recognizes
18 you, please confirm that your mic is un-muted before
19 you begin speaking. Public testimony will be limited
20 to two minutes per witness. If you have additional
21 testimony you would like the subcommittee to consider
22 or if you have written testimony you would like to
23 submit in lieu of appearing before the subcommittee,
24 you can email it to landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov.
25 Please indicate the LU number or project name in the

2 subject line of the email. During the hearing
3 council members who would like to ask questions
4 should use the Zoom raise hand function. The raise
5 hand button should appear on the bottom of the
6 participate panel. I will announce council members
7 who have questions in the order that they raise their
8 hands. Chair Riley will then recognize members to
9 speak. Witnesses are reminded to remain in the
10 meeting until they are excused by the chair. Lastly,
11 there may be extended pauses if we encounter
12 technical problems. We ask that you please be
13 patient as we work through these issues. Chair Riley
14 will now continue with today's agenda items.

15 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Counselor.
16 We began today with the public hearing on the
17 preconsidered land use related to application number
18 20215009SCK, submitted by the New York City School
19 Construction Authority pursuant to Section 1731 of
20 the Public Authorities Law. The application requests
21 approval of a proposed site selection for new,
22 approximately 475-seat, intermediate school facility
23 on the former site of St. Catharine of Alexandria
24 School at 402 Fort Hamilton Parkway in Community
25 School District 15 in the Council District

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS,
AND DISPOSITIONS

7

2 represented by Council Member Lander. Counsel,
3 please call in the applicant panel.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The applicant panel
5 for the School Construction Authority is Gayle
6 Mandaro, Tami Rachelson, and Tamar Smith.

7 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Counsel, please
8 administer the affirmation.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Panelists, please
10 raise your right hands and state your names. Please
11 unmute the panelists. Do we have Gayle Mandaro, Tami
12 Rachelson, and Tamar Smith? One moment please while
13 we get the SCA panel.

14 TAMAR SMITH: Good afternoon.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We have Tamar Smith.

16 TAMAR SMITH: Yes.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Is Tami Rachelson
18 here?

19 TAMI RACHELSON: Um, yes, I am.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you.
21 Panelists...

22 TAMI RACHELSON: [inaudible] run out for
23 a minute. Sorry.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Do you have video?

25 TAMI RACHELSON: Ah...

2 UNIDENTIFIED: I can see...

3 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Can you hear by
4 phone?

5 TAMI RACHELSON: I can see you [laughs].

6 UNIDENTIFIED: I can see you, yes.

7 TAMI RACHELSON: [inaudible] yes.

8 UNIDENTIFIED: But I, can you see me?

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We cannot see you.

10 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Oh, we can't.

11 UNIDENTIFIED: Can you hear me?

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Um, we can hear you.

13 UNIDENTIFIED: OK, good.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Ah, then we'll take
15 this [inaudible]. Do you affirm to tell the truth,
16 the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your
17 testimony before this subcommittee and in answer to
18 all council member questions?

19 TAMI RACHELSON: Yes.

20 TAMAR SMITH: Yes.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, you may begin
22 the hearing.

23 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. Before
24 you begin, please state your name and affiliation
25 again for your record. You both may begin.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS, 9
AND DISPOSITIONS

2 TAMI RACHELSON: OK. Ah, good afternoon,
3 Chairperson Riley and council [inaudible]

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Are we having video
5 problems, ah, audio problems?

6 TAMAR SMITH: I was just knocked out, ah,
7 from [inaudible]. I think it's back.

8 TAMI RACHELSON: [inaudible] can you hear
9 me now?

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes.

11 TAMAR SMITH: Yes, Tami.

12 TAMI RACHELSON: OK. I'm gonna start
13 again. Um, good afternoon, Chairperson Riley and
14 council members. Before we begin the testimony, if
15 you are a member of the public who wishes to testify
16 please register on the City Council website at
17 council@nyc.gov. Please visit the City Council
18 website to watch live streams of all City Council
19 meetings to find recordings of previously held
20 meetings. Um, my name is Tami Rachelson and I'm a
21 senior manager for project operations in the New York
22 City Council School Construction Authority's real
23 estate services department. Also with me is Tamar
24 Smith, community relationships manager for the School
25 Construction Authority. The New York City School

2 Construction Authority has undertaken the site
3 selection process for a new, approximately 475-seat
4 intermediate school facility located on block 5597 on
5 a portion of lot 38 in the borough of Brooklyn. The
6 site contains a total of approximately 21,000 square
7 feet of [inaudible] area and to equate to
8 approximately 0.48 acres and is located on the
9 southwest side of Fort Hamilton Parkway, the
10 northeast side of 41st Street, and the southwest side
11 of 40th Street. The site is comprised of a portion
12 of a large lot that is privately owned in the Sunset
13 Park/Borough Park section of Brooklyn and is vacant
14 and unimproved. The site is located in Brooklyn
15 Community School District 12, at Community Board 12
16 and Community School District 15. Under the proposed
17 project the SCA would acquire the site and construct
18 a new, approximately 475-seat intermediate school
19 facility. The notice of filing for the site plan was
20 published in the *Post and City Record* on October 21,
21 2020, at which time Community Education Council 15,
22 Brooklyn Community Board 12, and the City Planning
23 Commission were also notified of the site plan. The
24 CEC and community board were asked to hold public
25 hearings on the proposed site plan. The CEC 15 held

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS, 11
AND DISPOSITIONS

2 a public hearing on November 2, 2020. Written
3 comments were not received from the CEC, community
4 board, and the City Planning Commission. The SCA has
5 considered all comments received on the proposed site
6 plan and [inaudible] the site plan pursuant to
7 Section 1731 of the New York Public Authorities law.
8 In accordance with Section 1732 of the Public
9 Authorities law the SCA submitted the proposed site
10 plan to the mayor and the City Council by letter
11 dated January 19, 2021. We look forward to your
12 subcommittee's favorable consideration of the
13 proposed site plan and are prepared to answer
14 questions from the committee. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Tami. Ah,
16 I, I, I guess I just have one question. I know
17 originally, ah, this proposal was supposed to be an
18 elementary school and it transitioned into
19 intermediate school. Can you just speak on why that
20 proposal happened?

21 TAMI RACHELSON: Um, yes, but I'm gonna
22 ask Tamar whose was more involved with the process
23 than I was.

24 TAMAR SMITH: Thank you so much. Ah, I'm
25 Tamar Smith, community relations manager at the SCA.

2 Um, thank you, Chairman Riley. The, ah, you're,
3 you're correct. At first, um, so first I'll say that
4 need for both kinds of seats exist in this community,
5 um, both elementary and middle school. However, so
6 it, it was a flexible plan and could have been either
7 one. Um, when the project was first spoken about
8 with community members, um, a good many of them asked
9 about whether it could be in middle school, um, as
10 that's also, you know, a great need in the community.
11 Um, and so from community feedback the Office of
12 District Planning at the DOE, ah, the SCA, the
13 superintendent, you know, and other stakeholders,
14 parents as well, had these discussions. Um, and it
15 was agreed that a middle school would be a really,
16 really needed, um, and positive addition to the
17 community. Um, and so that's how the decision was
18 made to change the, the level.

19 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: OK. So it did have,
20 ah, community input and that's why...

21 TAMAR SMITH: Yes.

22 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: All right, that's
23 beautiful. Um, I don't have any questions, just a
24 statement. Ah, this is my first, ah, committee
25 meeting and I'm so elated that my first decision and

2 vote will be, um, implementing a new school within
3 our community. Ah, this is so imperative, especially
4 through a pandemic now. So I, I look forward to
5 working you all, ah, moving forward. And now I would
6 just like to invite my colleagues if there are any
7 questions. Ah, if you've got any questions for the
8 panel please click on the raise hand button on the
9 participant panel. Ah, Counsel, are there any
10 council member questions? I do see we have Council
11 Member Menchaca, um, hand is raised. Ah, Council
12 Member Menchaca, did you want to ask your question?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Yes, thank you.
14 Thank you, Chair, and congratulations on this
15 incredible, ah, post. This is a very important
16 committee, ah, because you get to see, ah, schools
17 blossom, ah, and in Sunset Park where we have seven-
18 plus schools on their way, ah, in the district, ah,
19 we couldn't find a better partner than the community
20 itself. Ah, our parents, our, our schools, our
21 parents, and the School Construction Authority, ah,
22 and so, Tamara, hello. Good to see you again. I
23 hope you're doing well in this pandemic. I know
24 we're still in the middle of it. But I hope you and
25 your family and everyone is doing well. Ah, Chair, I

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS, 14
AND DISPOSITIONS

2 just wanted to say how excited I am that Angel
3 Guardian Home, ah, today, ah, and, and this is really
4 just the, the kind of conversations that we're having
5 later, ah, in the docket, but I wanted to make the,
6 and actually can I, Chair, can I make remarks on, ah,
7 Angel Guardian Home now or should I wait for later?

8 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Ah, sure, go ahead.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: OK, great. I
10 just have to jump off and, and so this committee will
11 be looking at Angel Guardian Home and this is in
12 Dyker Heights and this committee will be considering
13 the first historic landmark, ah, and have met with
14 community members and many times, ah, and not just
15 the last year or the year before, and there is huge
16 support for the landmarking and the preservation of
17 this site. Ah, both the architectural quality and
18 the history of Angel Guardian, ah, and there is great
19 value in bringing that kind of landmarking for, for
20 this building, the first of its kind. Ah, but we
21 also know that LPC is well aware that there's also
22 disappointment and frustration in the community. The
23 landmarking is gonna exclude the beautiful Mercy
24 Building, ah, and that just means we're gonna lose
25 it. Ah, but I do hope that this committee, ah, when

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS, 15
AND DISPOSITIONS

2 it comes up for a vote votes in support of that
3 landmark. Ah, and again, congratulations Chair and
4 hello to the SCA for bringing us yet another school
5 in front of the City Council. I am incredibly
6 grateful as well, and good luck, Chair. Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Council
8 Member Menchaca. And I am aware of that, ah, the
9 other, ah, part of the Angel Guardian Home and, and
10 definitely will be bringing up questions, ah, when
11 that time comes. Ah, Counsel, are there any more
12 questions pertaining to the intermediate school
13 siting?

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: If there are any
15 other council members who have questions please use
16 the raise hand button now. I see no other members
17 with questions.

18 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: If there are no more
19 questions for this panel, this panel is excused.
20 Thank you. Counsel, are there any members of the
21 public who wishes to testify on this item?

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: There are no members
23 of the public signed up to testify on this item.

24 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: There being no
25 members of the public who wishes to testify on this

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS, 16
AND DISPOSITIONS

2 item, the public hearing on application number
3 20215009SCK is now closed. The subcommittee will now
4 vote on this item. Counsel, please call the roll.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Riley.

6 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Present. Aye.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Barron. Oh, I'm
8 sorry. Koo. Please unmute Council Member Koo.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah, I vote aye.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member
11 Barron.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Hi, thank you.
13 Permission to explain my vote?

14 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Permission granted.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

16 First, I want to welcome Council Member Riley as the
17 chair, welcome him to the council, and say that we're
18 glad that you're here, ah, on behalf of the community
19 that you represent. Ah, in terms of the school
20 construction, as many of you know my previous life
21 before legislation, before being in this area, was in
22 fact in education. So I'm always excited to know
23 that we are taking the time and the effort and
24 recognizing the importance of building beautiful new
25 buildings for our children to be able to engage in

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS, 17
AND DISPOSITIONS

2 their learning processes so I very heartily vote aye
3 on this project. Thank you.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: By a vote of 3 in the
5 affirmative, zero in the negative, and zero
6 abstentions the item is recommended to the full Land
7 Use Committee. We will keep the vote open.

8 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Counsel.
9 Our next item is Land Use 711, the 110 Lenox Avenue A
10 and CP cluster. This item is an application
11 submitted by the Department of Housing Preservation
12 and Development pursuant to Article 16 of the General
13 Municipal Law and Article 11 of the Private Housing
14 Finance Law, requesting a waiver of designation,
15 requirements and the requirement of Section 197-C and
16 197-D of the charter, approval of an urban
17 development action area project and approval of real
18 property tax exemption for properties located at 110
19 Lenox Avenue, 128 West 116th Street, and 1971 Seventh
20 Avenue in the Manhattan Council District represented
21 by Council Member Perkins.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: I, I don't believe
23 Council Member Perkins is here, so you may continue.

24 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Counsel, please call
25 the applicant panel.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS, 18
AND DISPOSITIONS

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The applicant panel
3 for this application is Christine O'Connell and Sarah
4 Mallory on behalf of HPD, and Chris Bramwell on
5 behalf of CB Emmanuel Reality.

6 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Counsel, please
7 administration the affirmation.

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Before I do that, I
9 understand that Council Member Treyger is here, if I
10 may.

11 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Yes.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Um, Council Member
13 Treyger, we are voting on the school designation.
14 Are you there? Please unmute Council Member Treyger.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Yes, I'm, I'm
16 here.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Ah, how do you vote
18 on the siting of the school?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I vote aye.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. That's
21 four in the affirmative, zero in the negative, and
22 zero abstentions. [inaudible]

23 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: I believe, ah,
24 Council Member Miller also joined us.

25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS, 19
AND DISPOSITIONS

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member
3 Miller, ah, how do you vote on this item? We are
4 voting on the, ah, siting of the school in, ah,
5 Council Member Lander's district.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Ah, hold on. Am
7 I up?

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Yes.

9 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Yes.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: OK. Hey, Council
11 Member, how are you? You look good in that seat,
12 man.

13 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Ah, thank you
14 brother.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Just, just so
16 that you know. Ah, I, I, I vote aye.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: By a vote of 5 in the
18 affirmative with zero in the negative and zero
19 abstentions the item is recommended to the full land
20 use committee and the vote is now closed. Um, now do
21 we have our panelists for 110 Lenox? Again, the
22 panelists are Christine O'Connell. I see Sarah
23 Mallory and Chris Bramwell. Panelists, could you
24 please raise your right hands? Do you affirm to
25 tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS, 20
AND DISPOSITIONS

2 truth in your testimony before this subcommittee in
3 answer to all council member questions? Please
4 unmute yourselves.

5 DIRECTOR O'CONNELL: I do.

6 ACTING ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER MALLORY: I
7 do.

8 CHRIS BRAMWELL: I do.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. Before
11 you begin, please state your name and affiliation
12 again for the record. You may begin.

13 SARAH MALLORY: Great. Ah, thank you so
14 much for having us here today. My name is Sarah
15 Mallory. I am the acting assistant commissioner for
16 government affairs at HPD and I will go ahead and
17 start my testimony. [inaudible] number 711 consists
18 as a proposed disposition of four partially occupied
19 city-owned buildings and the approval of Article 11
20 tax benefits for properties located at 110 Lenox
21 Avenue. Block 1599, lot 70, 128 West 116th Street;
22 block 1825, lot 49, 102 West 119th Street; block
23 1903, lot 38, and 1971 Seventh Avenue; block 1903,
24 lot 64, in Manhattan Council District 9. Known as
25 the 110 Lenox Avenue ANCP Cluster, the buildings will

2 be developed through HPD's affordable neighborhood
3 cooperative program. Under the program guidelines,
4 city-owned and multiple dwellings are conveyed to
5 restoring communities HDFC for \$1 per tax lot, and
6 then rehabilitated by private developers selected
7 through a competitive process. The developer lease
8 ignorant a site development and management agreement
9 with restoring communities that will be in effect
10 until co-op conversion occurs and title transfers
11 from restoring communities HDFC to the individual
12 cooperative. From the time of the cooperative
13 conversion the developer will remain a property
14 manager for at least one year. After the first year
15 the co-op will have the choice of keeping the
16 developer as property manager or hire a new company,
17 approved by HPD. All of the buildings entered into
18 city ownership through an In Rem foreclosure process.
19 110 Lenox Avenue entered city ownership in 1980 and
20 joined the Tenant Interim Lease Program, or TIL, in
21 2000. 128 West 116th Street became city owned in
22 1988 and joined the TIL program in 2001. 102 West
23 119th Street became city-owned in 1977 and joined the
24 TIL program in 2002 and then transferred to the
25 Division of Property Management in 2018. And finally

2 1971 Seventh Avenue became city-owned in 1974 and
3 joined the TIL program in 2001. As part of the TIL
4 program tenants are required to form tenant
5 associations to self-manage their buildings, which
6 includes collecting rents under a [inaudible] lease
7 agreement with HPD. The cluster is comprised of 55
8 units and the residents are ready to move forward
9 with the next steps in cooperative conversion under
10 HPD's [inaudible] program. The designated developer
11 CB Emmanuel Reality, LLC, has been selected to
12 develop the site. The four buildings in this cluster
13 will require a substantial rehabilitation that
14 includes structural joist replacement, replacement of
15 building system, including electrical upgrades,
16 plumbing upgrades, and the installation of new
17 boilers. Additionally, work to the envelope of the
18 building is needed, including new windows, new roofs,
19 and masonry repair. The scope of work also includes
20 new bathrooms, kitchen fixtures, entry doors, new
21 flooring, new mailboxes and hallway upgrades,
22 painting, asbestos and lead removal. It is also to
23 be brought into compliance with current 2014 building
24 code and ADA accessibility requirements.

25 Additionally, 5% of the units will be renovated with

2 accessibility for mobility and 2% for hearing and
3 visually impaired households. Post rehabilitation 55
4 residential units will include seven one-bedrooms, 17
5 two-bedrooms, 22 three-bedrooms, and nine four-
6 bedroom apartments. Of the total unit count, 30 are
7 currently occupied by returning shareholders.

8 Household incomes for existing tenants range between
9 a reported 3% to 88% of area median income and the
10 cooperative interest attributable to occupied

11 apartments will be sold to the existing tenants for
12 \$2500. Maintenance will be set at 40% AMI for
13 existing tenants. Monthly rent for each unit size

14 for existing tenants is anticipated to be roughly
15 \$860 per one bedroom, \$1030 for two bedrooms, and
16 \$1180 for a three-bedroom, and \$1310 for a four-
17 bedroom apartment. The cooperative interest

18 attributable to vacant apartments will be sold for a
19 price affordable to families earning no more than
20 110% of the area median income. In addition to

21 seeking disposition approval for 110 Lenox Avenue

22 ANCP cluster, HPD requests a 40-year Article 11 tax

23 exemption in order to help the shareholders maintain

24 affordability. The term of the tax exemption will be

25 coterminous with the regulatory agreement and the

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS, 24
AND DISPOSITIONS

2 total tax benefit is approximately 7.6 million with
3 the net present value of approximately 2.1 million.
4 In order to facilitate development at 110 Lenox
5 Avenue ANCP cluster HPD seeks approval of this land
6 use item. Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Sarah.

8 Um, my question is, ah, how many current tenants of
9 the building have elected to purchase, ah, units in
10 the co-op and, ah, will they have the option to rent
11 instead of buy in?

12 ACTING ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER MALLORY:

13 Yeah, great question. Ah...

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Could you, ah, could
15 you unmute, ah, Christine Lenox?

16 ACTING ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER MALLORY:

17 Yeah, thank you.

18 DIRECTOR O'CONNELL: Hi, this is
19 Christine O'Connell, ah, the director of the
20 Affordable Neighborhood Cooperative Program at HPD.

21 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Hey, Christine.

22 DIRECTOR O'CONNELL: Hey. So the 30
23 existing tenants, um, by participating in the Tenant
24 Interim Lease Program they have indicated their
25 interest in becoming homeowners. We do not actually

2 offer the, the opportunity to purchase until the
3 construction is nearly complete. Ah, the conversion
4 of co-op requires an offering plan approved by the
5 New York City attorney general, which is a process
6 that we coordinate during construction. Um,
7 residents also have to meet certain criteria in order
8 to become a co-op, including attending home ownership
9 trainings, ah, which we facilitate during
10 construction, um, and residents also have to be
11 current in rent in order to have the opportunity to
12 buy. So we work with residents during construction
13 to make sure that they remain current in rent. For
14 any resident that does not want to become a home
15 owner we absolutely do return them to the renovated
16 building. Um, they will become a rent-stabilized
17 tenant and we will provide them with Section 8, ah,
18 assistance, ah, if available as well.

19 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: OK. Ah, during the
20 rehabilitation of the building is there a relocation
21 plan for the tenants, ah, while this is occurring?

22 DIRECTOR O'CONNELL: Yes. So we have
23 been working with CB Emmanuel Realty LLC, our
24 assigned developer, to make that plan to relocate
25 families. Um, one of the buildings in the cluster

2 has already been relocated, um, due to, um, the
3 condition of the building and the relocation was done
4 in tandem with CB Emmanuel. Um, the other three
5 buildings will be relocated after we have a
6 construction loan closing, um, which we hope to have
7 by May of this year. Um, we work with the individual
8 tenants, assess their needs, move them to comparable
9 apartments with the same geographic proximity, um, so
10 that we can make sure that the process is as seamless
11 as possible.

12 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: OK. And my last
13 question is, is there a, ah, a reason why HPD decided
14 that the AMIs for the vacant units, um, would be set,
15 ah, at 110, ah, percent to 120% of AMIs?

16 DIRECTOR O'CONNELL: Yes. So the way
17 that we finance the rehab of these buildings is
18 there's a mix. There's, ah, HPD city capital, our
19 term sheet is about \$200,000 a unit. There's also a
20 private bank that comes in and funds the
21 construction, and we get grants from the State of New
22 York through the Affordable Housing Corporation.
23 What happens is we want to pay down a private loan as
24 much as possible so that it doesn't become permanent
25 debt and then increase the monthly maintenance fee.

2 Um, the way that we can pay down the construction
3 loan is by having sales of vacant apartments, ah,
4 come in and pay down the loan. The, the AMIs, ah,
5 are set about 110, but it, it's still something that
6 we're working on, trying to finalize the budget. Um,
7 so we do expect that sale prices will be somewhere
8 between 105 and 110.

9 ACTING ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER MALLORY:

10 The only thing I'll add on top of that is whenever
11 possible we do try to go deeper into, ah,
12 affordability. Um, that's our mission and our goal.
13 Ah, it just always will also depend on the finances
14 of the building to make sure that it is sustainable
15 for all tenants going forward. So there, there's no
16 issue, um, of future displacement.

17 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Sarah.

18 Thank you, Christine. Um, I'm gonna yield my time to
19 my other council members who have any questions. I
20 see Council Member Barron has her hand raised.
21 Council Member Barron.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Mr.

23 Chair. And thank you to the panel for coming. I
24 just have a couple of questions. I may have missed
25 some of the information and I apologize for that.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS, 28
AND DISPOSITIONS

2 How many apartments are presently occupied in the
3 buildings that you plan to renovate?

4 DIRECTOR O'CONNELL: Thirty, ah, 30 units
5 are occupied out of 55.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thirty out of 55?

7 DIRECTOR O'CONNELL: Um-hmm.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And of the 30 how
9 many have indicated that they are interested in
10 purchasing, and what is the purchase price for those
11 30?

12 DIRECTOR O'CONNELL: So of, of the 30,
13 um, we, three of the buildings will be converted to
14 co-op and one of the buildings will become a rental
15 building. Um, the, the residents in the three
16 buildings that are intended to become co-op, all of
17 them have indicated their interest and willingness to
18 pay the purchase price of \$2500, um, at the time of
19 construction completion.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And how many is
21 that? All 30?

22 DIRECTOR O'CONNELL: It, it's not all 30
23 because one of the buildings will become a rental,
24 um, and so for that building, um, those units will
25 not be sold [inaudible].

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So is there an
3 opportunity for someone who is in the rental building
4 to purchase a co-op in the other buildings?

5 DIRECTOR O'CONNELL: No.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Oh.

7 DIRECTOR O'CONNELL: Um, the building...

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [inaudible] talk
9 about. If they were interested in it why can't they
10 be offered that opportunity?

11 DIRECTOR O'CONNELL: So 22 out of 30
12 existing families are in the buildings that are
13 intended to become co-op. Ah, 102 West 119th Street
14 had been in the TIL program for, ah, a number of
15 years and did not meet the criteria to continue in
16 the program. So the criteria were regular rent
17 payment, submission of monthly financial reports, um,
18 and also annual elections. HPD, TIL, the Tenant
19 Interim Lease Program, worked with that building for
20 a number of years to ensure that they meet the
21 criteria but, um, through, um, multiple attempts and
22 through also a corrective action plan the building
23 was unable to meet the criteria and was terminated
24 from the program. The building is still being
25 renovated. Ah, the building will still have, um,

2 affordability restrictions and the residents will be
3 offered Section 8 assistance in order to ensure that
4 they can afford the, the restructured rent after the
5 completion of construction.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: The first
7 residents in the rental building, that would be,
8 what, about eight of them? OK.

9 UNIDENTIFIED: Right.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And what would be
11 the change in their rentals amount?

12 DIRECTOR O'CONNELL: Today the, those
13 units pay somewhere between \$250 to \$350 a month in
14 rent. Um, when we complete the renovation, ah, we're
15 expecting that those units will pay somewhere between
16 \$800...

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Oh, that's a
18 problem [laughs].

19 DIRECTOR O'CONNELL: It's a difference.
20 It is definitely a difference.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Huge increase.

22 DIRECTOR O'CONNELL: And that's why we
23 provide Section 8 subsidy in order to make sure that
24 residents don't have a financial hardship as a result
25 of the renovation. The truth of the matter is the

2 rents that the City of New York collects from these
3 buildings today is not enough to fund the operations
4 of the building. The City of New York is paying the
5 majority of the cost to fund fuel and, um,
6 maintenance and, um, you know, other upkeep. And so
7 once we do the renovation of the building and the
8 building is no longer in city ownership there's a
9 required rent restructure in order to make sure we
10 can fund the operations. But, like I said, in order
11 to ensure that the existing residents don't have a
12 financial hardship we prioritize Section 8 for those,
13 those residents. And we guide them through the
14 process. It is, it is definitely a process that we,
15 um, you know, we make multiple outreach attempts.
16 We, we have folks on staff that are reaching out and,
17 and doing everything they can to help them gather
18 documents and make sure that they successfully obtain
19 a voucher if that's what they want.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So of the other
21 residents, the 22 remaining residents, they will all
22 be eligible to go into the co-op that will be
23 established. And, um, how many do we know are
24 interested in doing that and what will happen to the
25 others that don't want to purchase a co-op?

2 DIRECTOR O'CONNELL: To our knowledge all
3 22 of the families that live in the other three
4 buildings are interested in purchase. Um, if any
5 resident through, through the process decides home
6 ownership is not for them, they don't want to
7 participate in home ownership, they will still be,
8 come home to a renovated building. Um, they will
9 become a rent-stabilized tenant instead. They will
10 pay the same amount of maintenance that we, or rent,
11 that we quoted previously, so about \$860 for a one-
12 bedroom. Um, the only difference is they won't, they
13 won't be able to participate in the board, um, but
14 they will definitely come home and they will be
15 protected under rent stabilization.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: What is the
17 average rent now in that development for a one-
18 bedroom? You said after renovations it will be
19 approximately \$860 for a one-bedroom. What is
20 presently?

21 DIRECTOR O'CONNELL: It's, ah, again,
22 it's between \$250 and \$350 while these buildings are
23 still in city ownership.

2 ACTING ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER MALLORY:

3 And again that \$800 is a number that includes Section
4 8 housing in order to help fill the gap.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Well, is there a
6 guarantee that all of them will get Section 8?

7 DIRECTOR O'CONNELL: No, there's not a
8 guarantee. But of all of the HPD programs that, um,
9 that we work on this is the one with the, with the
10 greatest demonstrated need. These rents have not
11 been changed in decades, ah, which is why they are so
12 low.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Sorry.

14 DIRECTOR O'CONNELL: That's OK. Ah, and
15 so it, we prioritize Section 8 for ANCP tenants, um,
16 more, I can't say more than other programs, but we
17 definitely understand the need for this program
18 veterans other privately owned buildings.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Um, OK, I've got
20 lots of concerns about the project. Um, I do know
21 that CB Emmanuel has done some work locally also, so,
22 thank you for your presentation and thank you to the
23 Chair.

24 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Council
25 Member Barron. Um, I have one last question, um, if

2 there's no other questions from council members, and
3 this is for CB Emmanuel Realty. I'm just interested
4 on the community engagement efforts, um, being that
5 you guys are coming into the community. Um, what has
6 been the engagement efforts with the residents, um,
7 and do you plan on formulating a resident association
8 board? Can someone please unmute Chris?

9 CHRIS BRAMWELL: Hello, can you hear me?

10 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Yeah, we can hear
11 you, Chris.

12 CHRIS BRAMWELL: Good afternoon, Chair,
13 and, and members. Um, your question about the
14 community engagement, ah, we've been in that
15 community for some time now. Um, we're working with
16 a lot of Canaan Baptists churches, actually one of
17 our clients that we work with, the, the senior
18 buildings, the [inaudible], um, and also their, their
19 family, ah, housing as well. So we're, we're pretty,
20 ah, instilled in that community and we've been
21 engaged with these residents as well. We've had a
22 number of, of resident, ah, meetings, kind of
23 helping, because they're part of the design. So as
24 we're redesigning these buildings for them we've
25 engaged them with the architects and, and had a

2 number of meetings. And as far as associations, yes.
3 I, I think that that is the only way to make these
4 co-ops successful is if they have associations and
5 they kind of work as a business. So, um, we're very
6 much so, um, for associations and, and kind of
7 getting them set up so that they can survive.

8 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Chris.

9 CHRIS BRAMWELL: You're welcome.

10 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: And how long have you
11 guys been in the community? I'm sorry.

12 CHRIS BRAMWELL: Ah, I've been working
13 for Canaan probably for the last 10 years. Um, maybe
14 longer, actually. Um, and we've also done projects
15 up higher in Harlem on 146th Street with a veteran
16 group. Um, we've done some housing, um, where we
17 partnered with them. But I've been in, in the Harlem
18 area probably for the last 10 or 12 years.

19 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Chris.

20 CHRIS BRAMWELL: No problem.

21 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: There being no more
22 questions for this panel, this panel is excused. Oh,
23 sorry.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: One moment, Council
25 Member Barron has another question.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS, 36
AND DISPOSITIONS

2 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Council Member Barron
3 has a question. Sorry, Council Member Barron.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. Ah,
5 thank you. I do have another question. So the
6 selling price for those who presently living there is
7 going to be 2500. What is the price for those who
8 don't presently live there but would be interested in
9 purchasing, becoming an owner, a co-op owner?

10 DIRECTOR O'CONNELL: Sure. So our sale
11 prices for the vacant apartments. Um, there, are
12 one-, two-, three-, and four-bedroom apartments
13 available for sale after the renovation is complete.
14 Um, a one-bedroom apartment would be 339. A two-
15 bedroom apartment would be 4007. A three-bedroom
16 apartment would be 4710, and a four-bedroom would be
17 5025.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So vacant
19 apartments will be sold at, give me that again, a
20 one-bedroom will be sold?

21 DIRECTOR O'CONNELL: 339.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: 339. And a two-
23 bedroom 407, a three-bedroom 471, and a four-bedroom
24 525,000?

25 DIRECTOR O'CONNELL: Yes.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: That's another
3 factor. OK. Thank you very much.

4 DIRECTOR O'CONNELL: Thank you.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Miller
6 has a question.

7 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Council Member
8 Miller.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member
10 Miller, are you there?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Does this, does
12 this program, ah, allow for community preference?

13 DIRECTOR O'CONNELL: No, um, this is
14 something that we've, we've addressed that for
15 projects where there are returning families the
16 community preference has already been met.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So was it, yeah,
18 we go through this all the time and it's built in.
19 But therein lies the problem and, and how do we
20 maintain and, and, and address the concerns of what
21 buildings within communities of color and certainly
22 to address gentrification if in fact that, you know,
23 that didn't happen. Of course you just can't put out
24 the people that are already there. That's, that's,
25 that's kind of a given. You know, how do we get

2 beyond that and are there any subsidies afforded to
3 those new homeowners, um, and for this project from
4 moving forward?

5 DIRECTOR O'CONNELL: Sure.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: How do you kind
7 of mitigate those steep prices that we're seeing?

8 DIRECTOR O'CONNELL: Sure. So the, the
9 first thing I want to mention is that there is a New
10 York City preference, although is not a community
11 board preference, it is a New York City preference,
12 and that the developers responsible for advertising
13 the opportunity, so by reaching out to local elected
14 officials to promote the opportunity, um, by having a
15 local, localized seminar which is hopeful by then we
16 will be having in-person meetings again, um, and we
17 can have members of the community and hear about the
18 project and, and, you know, ask questions if they
19 have any. Um, as it relates to opportunity subsidy,
20 HPD has a Home First, um, down payment assistance
21 program, um, that I believe currently provides up to
22 \$25,000 in down payment assistance. Um, there are
23 other lenders that we work with that also provide
24 down payment assistance, which could be layered. Um,
25 you know, these, there are definitely opportunities

2 for, ah, for some of our banks to, our partner banks,
3 ah, to provide, um, assistance for lower-income
4 families to be able to come into this opportunity
5 and, and become a first-time home buy.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you. Thank
7 you, Mr. Chair.

8 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Council
9 Member Miller. And thank you, Council Member Barron,
10 for your amazing questions. Ah, if there are no more
11 questions for this panel, this panel is excused. Ah,
12 Counsel, are there any members of the public who wish
13 to testify?

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: There are no members
15 of public signed up to testify for this item.

16 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: There being no other
17 members of the public who wish to testify on this
18 item, the public hearing on land use 711 is now
19 closed. Our last item today is the preconsidered
20 land use related to application number 20215011HIK,
21 the Landmarks Preservation Commission historic
22 landmark designation of the Angels Guardian Home
23 located at 6301 12th Avenue, block 5739, part of lot
24 1, in Borough of Brooklyn in the Council District
25 represented by Council Member Menchaca. Council

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS, 40
AND DISPOSITIONS

2 Member Menchaca gave his remarks earlier. Um, I just
3 wanted to note that for the record. Thank you,
4 Council Member Menchaca, for giving your remarks
5 earlier. He had to step out, ah, to another event.
6 Counsel, please call the applicant panel.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: The applicant panel
8 for LPC is Kate Lemos McHale and Anthony Fabre.

9 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Counsel, please
10 administer the affirmation.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: One moment while we
12 wait for the panelists to be admitted to the room.
13 Panelists, please raise your right hands and state
14 your names.

15 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: I'm Kate Lemos
16 McHale.

17 ANTHONY FABRE: Anthony Fabre.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell
19 the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth
20 before this subcommittee and in response to all
21 council member questions?

22 ANTHONY FABRE: I do.

23 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. Before
24 you begin, please state your name and affiliation
25 again for the record and then you may begin.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS, 41
AND DISPOSITIONS

2 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: Thank you. I'm Kate
3 Lemos McHale, director of research for the Landmarks
4 Preservation Commission.

5 ANTHONY FABRE: And I'm Anthony Fabre,
6 director of intergovernmental and community affairs,
7 ah, Landmarks Preservation Commission.

8 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: We had sent over a
9 presentation, is that available to go through? OK,
10 great.

11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: One moment while we
12 load the presentation.

13 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: Great.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Kate, can you see it?

15 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: Yep, I can, thanks.
16 Shall I just start?

17 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Yes, you can go ahead
18 and start. Sorry about that, go ahead.

19 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: Great, no problem.
20 Thanks so much, Chair Riley, it's great to see you
21 and I look forward to working with you here. Thank
22 you for the opportunity to present the Angel Guardian
23 Home in Dyker Heights, Brooklyn, which was designated
24 on November 10, 2020, as a New York City landmark.
25 Ah, could we go to the next slide, please. The

2 Angel Guardian Home was designed in 1897 by George H.
3 Streeton for the Sisters of Mercy, who operated it as
4 an orphanage until the late 1970s. Prominently
5 elevated on a raised lawn, surrounded by a historic
6 stone wall, the monumental Renaissance Revival and
7 Beaux-Arts style building is an enduring reminder of
8 the role played by religious social service
9 organizations in Brooklyn's early 20th century
10 history and it stands out within the surrounding low-
11 scale residential streetscape. On August 11 of 2020
12 LPC held a public hearing on the proposed designation
13 of the Angel Guardian Home. Sixteen people spoke in
14 favor of designation, including the property owners,
15 Council Member Justin Brannan, representatives from
16 Community Board 10, the Historic Districts Council,
17 the City Club of New York, the Dyker Heights Civic
18 Association, the Guardians of the Guardian, and six
19 individuals. Several of these people also asked the
20 commission to designate another building on the site
21 as well. No one spoke in opposition. The commission
22 also received 69 letters in favor of designation,
23 including one from Brooklyn borough president, Eric
24 Adams, and one from Council Member Justin Brannan,
25 Senator Andrew Gounardes, and Assembly Member Peter

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS, 43
AND DISPOSITIONS

2 J. Abate, Jr., signing jointly. Among these letters
3 was a joint from Council Member Carlos Menchaca, ah,
4 signing jointly with, um, Brooklyn Community Board 10
5 and several advocates, ah, and we did also receive an
6 email campaign recognizing the significance of the
7 Angel Guardian Home and asking the commission to
8 designate another building on the site. Ah, next,
9 please. This is the first landmark in Dyker Heights.
10 The landmark site is located on 12th Avenue between
11 63rd and 64th Street, encompassing the historic main
12 building of the Angel Guardian Home and its north
13 and south lanes and the entire 12th Avenue frontage,
14 including its front lawn and historic stone wall
15 surrounding it. Next slide, please. Historically
16 part of the town of New Utrecht, shown on the left in
17 an 1873 atlas, this neighborhood remained a sparsely
18 developed suburb that was considered part of Long
19 Island until it was annexed to the City of Brooklyn
20 in 1894 and then incorporated into Greater New York
21 City in 1898. Dyker Heights began to develop in the
22 1880s and early 1890s and at this time, ah, the block
23 was under the ownership of the Sisters of Mercy.

24 Next step please. The Sisters of Mercy are a
25 Catholic religious order founded in Ireland in 1831

2 by Katherine McCauley. They arrived in New York in
3 1846 and opened an orphanage on Second Avenue in
4 Manhattan in 1860. They expanded their charitable
5 activities in the city in response to an increase in
6 New York's Catholic population in the late 1800s. On
7 the left is an image of their convent in, um, Clinton
8 Hill, Brooklyn, in the 19th century. They also
9 opened a campus in Syosset, Long Island, as an
10 orphanage for boys and from 1880 to 1892 acquired the
11 large parcels of land in Dyker Heights. In 1897 the
12 Sisters of Mercy hired the architect George H.
13 Streeton, a notable designer of ecclesiastical
14 buildings, to design the Angel Guardian, Angel
15 Guardian Home on the Dyker Heights site, ah, which is
16 shown on the right. Ah, next slide please. At its
17 opening in 1899 the Angel Guardian Home originally
18 consisted of just a four-story main building, which
19 was extended, ah, by around 1910 to include north and
20 south wings containing a school, administrative
21 functions, and a chapel. In addition to housing
22 children waiting for adoption placement, by 1906 the
23 Angel Guardian Home also offered a residence for
24 unwed mothers. Behind the prominent main building a
25 nursery building was constructed on 63rd Street in

2 1906 and a boiler house and other utilitarian
3 structures were also constructed on the site. The
4 historic stone wall seen in this historic photo is,
5 um, at the site's 12th Avenue frontage, was extended
6 in the 1920s with a high brick wall that encircled
7 the entire block east of the main building. Ah,
8 next, please. The distinguished main building that
9 housed the orphanage occupies a full block front at
10 12th Avenue, consists of a central section rising
11 four stories of a raised base, with a three-story
12 north wing that contained classrooms and offices, and
13 a two-story chapel extension to the south. The
14 design of the original central portion blended
15 Renaissance Revival and Beaux-Arts style elements,
16 and these were styles that were popular in use at the
17 time to impart a sense of grandeur and civic purpose.
18 The wings were designed in the same blend of styles.
19 Um, the building features red brick with limestone
20 trim, a copper cornice, Mansard roof embellished with
21 carved limestone, door surrounds, um, and other
22 decorative details. Um, the combination of its
23 sophisticated architectural style with its monumental
24 civic scale and elevated position on an expansive
25 lawn makes the Angel Guardian Home's main building

2 highly prominent, um, on the site and within its
3 neighborhood. Next slide please. These are views of
4 the building from 63rd Street on the left and 64th
5 Street on the right. The wings, as I said, have
6 similar architectural treatment to the main building.
7 Um, the rear façade of the main building is less
8 embellished than its 12th Avenue façade and a tall
9 brick chimney and some modest utilitarian extensions
10 were added over the year. Ah, next, please. The
11 Angel Guardian Home main building is prominent within
12 the site and community of Dyker Heights. Its
13 significance is derived from a combination of its
14 historic importance as the original orphanage
15 building, housing the primary functions of the Angel
16 Guardian Home social services, its architectural
17 quality, its civic monumentality, and its prominence.
18 Other buildings on the site do not possess this same
19 combination of factors. Ah, next, please. The
20 Sisters of Mercy operated the Angel Guardian Home in
21 Dyker Heights for close to 120 years, as an orphanage
22 and residence for unwed mothers, until the 1980s,
23 expanding the focus of the social service work to
24 include foster care in the 1960s and later providing
25 senior assisted living on the site. They sold the

2 property in 2018 with the deed restriction
3 stipulating certain uses to serve the community,
4 consistent with the sisters' mission. Ah, next
5 please. To conclude, the elegantly designed Angel
6 Guardian Home with its monumental civic scale and
7 adept blend of Renaissance Revival and Beaux-Arts
8 architectural details is symbolic of the importance
9 given to social services in the progressive era and
10 the role of the Sisters of Mercy in Brooklyn for over
11 a century. The distinctive and remarkably intact
12 main building is significant, um, within Dyker
13 Heights and I hope the council will vote to uphold
14 this landmark designation. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, Kate. Is
16 that the end of your presentation?

17 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: Yes, it is. Thank
18 you.

19 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: OK.

20 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: Though [inaudible]
21 questions of course.

22 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you, thank you.
23 Ah, so I know landmarks like this usually happen when
24 a building is being threatened to be demolished or
25 remodeled. So is there any effort that LPC puts, um,

2 to landmark any designations, ah, prior to that
3 happen, ah, before any, um, specific landmarks are
4 being demolished or, or spoken about being
5 demolished, so is there any effort that LPC does
6 prior to that even happening, um, to designate any
7 landmarks?

8 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: Yes, the, the agency
9 is always serving and researching and identifying
10 potential landmarks throughout the city. Um, the
11 research department, um, which is the part of the
12 agency that does this work is, is really, um, we do
13 geographic surveys, we do surveys by theme, building
14 type, historical significance, to identify buildings
15 that, um, throughout the city. So there are times
16 that buildings that are threatened, um, that we have
17 not yet designated obviously and so there is a
18 process of review, um, and evaluation of significance
19 and whether they merit designation.

20 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Anthony?

21 ANTHONY FABRE: Yeah, sorry, I, I think
22 Kate kind of, um, mentioned this but, um, I mean, we
23 look at buildings even when they're not, um,
24 necessarily being threatened by development. So, um,
25 that sometimes does occur, that that is the case,

2 but, um, it's not what leads us to necessarily look
3 at a building. We're always looking across the city
4 like, like Kate mentioned. It doesn't have to be,
5 um, because we believe the building is threatened.

6 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Um-hmm. And I
7 justice want to echo, um, Council Member Menchaca
8 before he, ah, in his remarks, he did mention that
9 there is another building located on that landmark,
10 um, and I just want to understand why was, ah, only
11 building, which was the main building, a landmark and
12 not that building, um, even though many people in the
13 community wanted both buildings to be landmarked? Is
14 there any specific reason why it was just the bigger
15 building that was landmarked. Is there any specific
16 reason it was just the bigger building that was
17 landmarked opposed to the smaller building?

18 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: Yes, I mean, we did a
19 lot of very careful, um, review and evaluation. We
20 spoke a lot with community members, um, and others
21 about this. It's a very large site and there's a
22 complex set of development plans for it that are in,
23 you know, keeping with the sisters' mission for
24 community services there. Our focus really was on
25 merit and what really represents, um, the best way of

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITINGS, 50
AND DISPOSITIONS

2 preserving what is significant about this site, and
3 in our evaluation the main building with its
4 architectural prominence, um, its physical prominence
5 on the site, its full block front, really is the most
6 essential part of this site to preserve.

7 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: OK. OK, ah, Counsel,
8 I'm going to yield my time to see if there's any
9 questions from any of my colleagues. I don't see any
10 questions, ah, from any of the council members. Ah,
11 there being no more questions for this panel, this
12 panel is excused.

13 KATE LEMOS MCHALE: Thank you.

14 ANTHONY FABRE: Thank you, Chair.

15 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: Thank you. Counsel,
16 are there any members of the public who wishes to
17 testify on this item? I think, Jeff, you're on mute.

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: There are no members
19 of the public signed up to testify on this item.

20 CHAIRPERSON RILEY: OK. There being no
21 other members of the public who wishes to testify,
22 the public hearing on application number 20215011HIK,
23 the landmark designation of Angel Guardian Home, the
24 public hearing on this and all open items are now
25 closed and laid over. That concludes today's

2 business. I remind you that if you have written
3 testimony on today's item you may submit it to
4 landusetestimony@council.nyc.gov. Please indicate
5 the land use number or the project name in the
6 subject heading. I would like to thank the
7 applicants, the members of the public, my colleagues,
8 subcommittee counsel, land use staff especially, and
9 the Sergeant at Arms for participating in today's
10 hearing. This meeting is hereby adjourned [gavel].
11 Thank you all.

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date February 15, 2021