

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

STATED MEETING

----- X

March 10, 2022
Start: 1:53 p.m.
Recess: 4:02 p.m.

HELD AT: HYBRID HEARING - COUNCIL CHAMBERS
CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Adrienne E. Adams, Speaker
Keith Powers, Majority Leader

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Shaun Abreu
Joann Ariola
Alexa Avilés
Diana I. Ayala
Charles Barron
Joseph C. Borelli
Erik D. Bottcher
Justin L. Brannan
Gale A. Brewer
Selvena N. Brooks-Powers
Tiffany Cabán
David M. Carr
Carmen N. De La Rosa
Eric Dinowitz
Amanda Farías
Oswald Feliz
James F. Gennaro
Jennifer Gutiérrez
Shahana K. Hanif
Kamillah Hanks
Robert F. Holden
Crystal Hudson

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

2

Kristin Richardson Jordan
Rita C. Joseph
Ari Kagan
Shekar Krishnan
Linda Lee
Farah N. Louis
Christopher Marte
Darlene Mealy
Julie Menin
Francisco P. Moya
Mercedes Narcisse
Sandy Nurse
Chi A. Ossé
Vickie Paladino
Lincoln Restler
Kevin C. Riley
Carlina Rivera
Rafael Salamanca, Jr
Pierina Ana Sanchez
Lynn C. Schulman
Althea V. Stevens
Sandra Ung
Marjorie Velázquez
Inna Vernikov
Nantasha M. Williams
Julie Won
Kalman Yegar

1
2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: PC recording started.

3 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Cloud is up.

4 SERGEANT P. LUGO: Good afternoon,
5 everyone. Welcome to today's New York City Council
6 Hybrid Stated Meeting. At this time, would all
7 Panelists please turn on your videos?

8 To minimize disruption, please place
9 electronic devices to vibrate or silent. Thank you
10 for your cooperation.

11 We are ready to begin.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Ladies and gentlemen,
13 at this time please, quiet on the floor, please. Can
14 you please place all electronic devices to vibrate,
15 all electronic devices to vibrate?

16 Mr. Majority Leader.

17 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: [GAVEL] Good
18 afternoon, and welcome to the Stated Meeting of March
19 10, 2022. I'm Majority Leader Keith Powers, and I'd
20 like to thank everyone here for joining us today and
21 tuning in. If you would like to follow along today,
22 the agenda for our meeting is posted on the City
23 Council website.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Please join us for the
25 Pledge of Allegiance.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise.

CHAMBERS: I pledge allegiance to the flag
of the United States of America and to the Republic
for which it stands, one Nation under God,
indivisible, with liberty and justice for all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Roll call. Abreu.

COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Ariola.

COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Aviles. Ayala.

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Bottcher.

COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Brannan. Brewer.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Brooks-Powers. Caban.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABAN: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Carr.

COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: De La Rosa.

COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Dinowitz.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Farias.
COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Feliz.
COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Gennaro.
COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Here.
COUNCIL CLERK: Gutierrez.
COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIERREZ: Presente.
COUNCIL CLERK: Hanif.
COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Here.
COUNCIL CLERK: Hanks.
COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Holden.
COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Here.
COUNCIL CLERK: Hudson.
COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Joseph.
COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Here.
COUNCIL CLERK: Kagan.
COUNCIL MEMBER KAGAN: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Krishnan.
COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: Here.
COUNCIL CLERK: Lee. Lewis.

STATED MEETING

6

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER LEWIS: Here.
COUNCIL CLERK: Marte.
COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: Here.
COUNCIL CLERK: Mealy. Menin.
COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Here.
COUNCIL CLERK: Moya.
COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Narcisse.
COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Nurse. Osse.
COUNCIL MEMBER OSSE: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Paladino.
COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Restler.
COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Here.
COUNCIL CLERK: Richardson Jordan.
COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDSON JORDAN:
Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Lee.
COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Riley.
COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera.
COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Present.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

COUNCIL CLERK: Salamanca.
COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Sanchez.
COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Presente.
COUNCIL CLERK: Schulman.
COUNCIL MEMBER SCHULMAN: Here.
COUNCIL CLERK: Brannan.
COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Here.
COUNCIL CLERK: Stevens.
COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Here.
COUNCIL CLERK: Ung.
COUNCIL MEMBER UNG: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Velazquez.
COUNCIL MEMBER VELAZQUEZ: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Vernikov.
COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Williams.
COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.
COUNCIL CLERK: Won.
COUNCIL MEMBER WON: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Brooks-Powers.
COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Yeger.
COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here.

1 COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli. Powers.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Here.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Adams.

4 SPEAKER ADAMS: Present.

5 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We are
6 joined today and we'll hear today's invocation from
7 the Reverend Mark Hallinan, Associate Pastor at St.
8 Ignatius Loyola located at 980 Park Avenue in the
9 wonderful 4th Council District in Manhattan.

10 REVEREND MARK HALLINAN: Let us pray. Oh
11 God of tender mercies in these difficult times, we
12 ask You to pour forth your Spirit in great abundance
13 on the Members of this Council and their Staff who
14 have generously offered themselves in service to our
15 beloved City. In moments of debate, may they be
16 sincere in seeking what is right, just, and true for
17 Your people. In moments of decision, may they
18 remember their commitment to the common good of all.
19 In their service to their constituents, may they not
20 favor those of wealth and privilege but rather seek
21 out those whose need is great and whose voice is not
22 heard, and in all things may they remember that in
23 our great diversity we are united as members of one
24 family, for whom we are all really responsible for
25

1
2 all. With your help, may all who serve this great
3 City move us toward the realization of your beloved
4 community in which we are indeed brother and sister
5 to each other with none lacking what they need to
6 live in dignity. This we lift up in Your most holy
7 and precious name. Amen.

8 CHAMBERS: Amen.

9 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you for
10 that. I want to first say a few words and then I'll
11 make the motion. First, I want to thank you for
12 joining us here today from Loyola in my District, St.
13 Ignatius Loyola, which is not only a fantastic church
14 and a beautiful church but also a wonderful school
15 and a wonderful community. I am a St. Francis
16 (INAUDIBLE) I didn't go to Loyola High School, but
17 many of my friends did and are big parts of
18 (INAUDIBLE) Loyola community and as we enter into the
19 season of Lent and we think about Easter ahead, we
20 talk a lot about giving up and what we give up during
21 Lent but we also have to talk about how we give to
22 each other and I think the words that you shared and
23 (INAUDIBLE) doing here is about giving back to each
24 other every single day and giving back to New York
25 City so I want to thank you very much for being here

1
2 today. With that, I make a motion for unanimous
3 consent to spread the Invocation in full upon the
4 Record. Thank you so much.

5 REVEREND MARK HALLINAN: Thank you.

6 (INAUDIBLE): Adoption of minutes.

7 SPEAKER ADAMS: None.

8 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Messages and
9 Papers from the Mayor.

10 (INAUDIBLE): M 32, Preliminary Mayor's
11 Management Report.

12 SPEAKER ADAMS: Received, ordered,
13 printed, and filed.

14 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Communication
15 from City, County, and Burrough Offices.

16 (INAUDIBLE): Preconsidered Ms 33 and 34
17 Council budget.

18 SPEAKER ADAMS: Finance.

19 (INAUDIBLE): M 35, Department of
20 Education 5 Year Capital Plan.

21 SPEAKER ADAMS: Finance.

22 (INAUDIBLE): Ms 36 and 37 Reports from
23 the Controller and the New York City Tax Commission.

24 SPEAKER ADAMS: Received, Ordered,
25 Printed, and Filed.

1
2 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Petitions and
3 Communications.

4 (INAUDIBLE): M 38 Withdrawal of Intro 64.

5 SPEAKER ADAMS: Received, ordered,
6 printed, and filed.

7 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Land Use Call-Ups

8 (INAUDIBLE): None.

9 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll
10 now have communication from Speaker Adrienne Adams.

11 SPEAKER ADAMS: Good afternoon, everyone.
12 Happy, happy Thursday. As a quick reminder, masks are
13 strongly encouraged to be worn throughout our stated
14 meetings here in Chambers.

15 March is Women's History Month.

16 (Applause) As we just heard, this year's celebration
17 is particularly special because this is the first
18 women majority in the history of the New York City
19 Council. It is so inspiring to so many across the
20 City, and I'm extremely proud to be the Speaker of
21 this historic women-led legislative body that is
22 truly reflective of our City and the essential role
23 women play in leading it. We still have a lot of work
24 ahead of us in our struggle for justice and equity.
25 As we celebrate the achievements and contributions

1
2 that women of all backgrounds have made to our City
3 and Nation, we also honor the sacrifices that have
4 resulted in the transformation of our world into a
5 better place for all. Once again, happy Women's
6 History Month.

7 Today, we are voting on the first bill of
8 this legislative section. Introduction 70 will extend
9 the City's rent stabilization laws from April 1st to
10 July 1st 2022. This piece of legislation is led by
11 our Chair of Housing and Buildings, Council Member
12 Pierina Sanchez. Congratulations, Council Member
13 Sanchez, on passing your very first bill.

14 We are also voting on a few finance items
15 and several resolutions, 2 of which are in support of
16 Ukraine and the more than 150,000 Ukrainian New
17 Yorkers who call our City home as their homeland is
18 attacked by the Russian military. Several Council
19 Members are passing their first resolutions today
20 including Council Member Crystal Hudson, Council
21 Member Inna Vernikov, and Council Member Shahana
22 Hanif. Congratulations.

23 We are in the second week of our
24 preliminary budget hearings. It's been energizing to
25 see the focus of our Committees and Members have

1
2 brought to these hearings prioritizing our City's
3 recovery and investments in the programs and
4 initiatives that will strengthen the well-being of
5 children, families, and all New Yorkers as we ask the
6 hard questions of our City Agencies.

7 Addressing health inequities is a
8 priority for this Council and as the City lifts COVID
9 requirements, we need to be laser focused on tackling
10 public health disparities across our communities and
11 our schools while maintaining our vigilance in
12 response to the science and changing circumstances.
13 The City cannot afford to avert its attention to
14 ensuring adequate availability of testing and
15 continuing to increase vaccinations, especially in
16 parts of the City with greatest disparity rates.

17 The City also has an obligation to
18 clearly communicate new COVID-19 requirement changes,
19 ensuring information reaches all New Yorkers,
20 especially in our immigrant communities and among our
21 residents whose primary language is not English.

22 Unfortunately, throughout the pandemic,
23 we have also experienced a horrific rise in hate
24 violence and anti-Asian violence in our City and
25 across the country. Last year, there were 131

1
2 reported bias attacks against Asian Americans in our
3 City, a dramatic increase over the past 2 years, and
4 sadly that was second to anti-Semitic hate crimes. We
5 cannot allow the AAPI community, Jewish communities,
6 or any of our communities to be targeted in this way.
7 We must work to end these disturbing attacks by
8 holistically addressing these issues that leave New
9 Yorkers vulnerable and prevents them from happening
10 in the first place. We have an obligation to come
11 together around solutions that prevent all violence.
12 All of us deserve to be safe in our everyday lives,
13 and we will work tirelessly to ensure this is a
14 reality.

15 Let us now stand and acknowledge and
16 honor all those harmed as well as our fellow New
17 Yorkers who have lost their lives.

18 Thank you. You may be seated.

19 Before we delve into our Agenda for
20 today, let's get ready to spring forward because
21 Daylight Savings Time is almost here. Woohoo, woohoo.
22 On Sunday morning, Council Member Osse, don't forget
23 to set your clocks ahead 1 hour and next week, on
24 March 16 and 17, our Jewish friends and neighbors
25 will be observing the holiday of Purim. To everyone

1
2 celebrating, chag Purim sameach, and a happy and
3 joyous Purim from the heart.

4 Today, we will be voting on a
5 preconsidered introduction, accompanying
6 preconsidered resolution to automatically renew all
7 properties that had received a senior citizen's
8 homeowner property tax exemption or a persons with
9 disabilities homeowner property tax exemption,
10 collectively SCHE and DHE, in the year 2021-2022 tax
11 year for the 2022-2023 tax year. This would eliminate
12 the need for them to submit the otherwise required
13 application while requiring renewal applications
14 under certain limited circumstances where there is a
15 reason to believe the property is no longer eligible
16 to receive the exemption. These programs apply to 1,
17 2, or 3 family homes, and our approval will ensure we
18 continue to protect our seniors and New Yorkers with
19 disabilities who are homeowners with property tax
20 relief, placing the obligation on government rather
21 than eligible homeowners to access the program in
22 this time of need. With the prices of essential goods
23 increasing and our remaining in a pandemic, it is
24 essential that we prioritize our most vulnerable New
25 Yorkers. Without our action on this today, none of

1
2 our seniors or homeowners with disabilities would be
3 automatically renewed in this program and many would
4 certainly slip through the cracks of a looming March
5 15th deadline. There are an estimated 7,100
6 homeowners who have not yet renewed and could
7 potentially benefit from our action today.

8 Next, we'll be voting on 2 BID
9 resolutions. Resolution number 19 sponsored by
10 Council Members Brannan and Louis relates to the
11 establishment of the Castle Hill Business Improvement
12 District in Council Member Farias' District and sets
13 the date, time, and place for the public hearing to
14 hear all persons interested in the establishment of
15 such district.

16 Preconsidered resolution number 59
17 sponsored by Council Member Brannan relates to the
18 establishment of the West Village Business
19 Improvement District in Council Member Botcher's
20 District and sets the date, time, and place for the
21 public to hear all persons interested in the
22 establishment of such district.

23 Next, we have a transparency resolution,
24 preconsidered resolution 58 sponsored by Council
25 Member Brannan, which approves the new designation

1
2 and changes in the designation of certain
3 organizations to receive funding in the expense
4 budget.

5 Next, we have the Council's proposed
6 operating budget for fiscal year 2023 and schedule
7 thereof, preconsidered message M 33 and M 34 and
8 accompanying preconsidered resolutions 73 and 74
9 sponsored by Council Member Brannan, which would
10 establish the Council budget for the next fiscal
11 year. The budget supports the Council's role as a
12 coequal separate branch of government investing in
13 our professional staff, the hardworking public
14 servants who help this Body oversee City Agencies and
15 support our Members to represent their Districts. It
16 also addresses historic inequities in Council
17 Member's office budgets by centrally absorbing rent
18 costs for District offices to promote parity and the
19 ability of Members to focus their office budgets on
20 adequately hiring and compensating their own staff
21 while covering other essential costs of representing
22 constituents. This budget will provide the Council
23 with the resources necessary to meet the many
24 challenges of this next fiscal year, and we
25 appreciate you all and our Council staff immensely.

1
2 As Russia continues its senseless attack
3 on Ukraine, today we are voting on 2 resolutions to
4 support Ukrainian New Yorkers.

5 Resolution number 67, sponsored by
6 Council Member Crystal Hudson, condemns the military
7 action taken by the Russian government against the
8 nation of Ukraine. To denounce the military
9 aggression, which affects the people of Ukraine and
10 the nearly 150,000 Ukrainian Americans who live in
11 New York City, this resolution calls on the United
12 States Congress and President Biden to increase and
13 expand the severity of sanctions against Russia for
14 it's actions.

15 Preconsidered resolution number 72 by
16 Council Member Inna Vernikov recognizes the plight of
17 the Ukrainian people by calling on the Federal
18 Government to offer humanitarian aid and support for
19 the innocent civilians who are currently under threat
20 of military aggression and are being displaced due to
21 the armed conflict in Ukraine, estimated at over 2
22 million Ukrainians thus far. Staff for these 2
23 resolutions are Ali Harbani (phonetic), we thank you.

24 Moving on, another resolution we're
25 voting on today, preconsidered resolution number 66

1
2 by Council Member Shahana Hanif, calls on the State
3 Legislature to pass and the Governor to sign S-
4 7373/A. 7099-A prohibiting governmental entities from
5 entering into agreements to house individuals in
6 immigration detention facilities. New York counties
7 currently profit from contracts to detain immigrants,
8 which fuels a larger system of deportation and
9 detention that divides families and destabilizes
10 communities. This act in favor of the New York
11 Dignity Not Detention Act would get New York out of
12 the business of immigration detention by prohibiting
13 New York governmental entities from entering into
14 immigration detention contracts and from receiving
15 any payments related to immigration detention.
16 Additionally, it would prohibit New York governmental
17 entities from renewing any existing immigration
18 detention contracts requiring any New York
19 governmental entities with existing immigration
20 detention contracts to exercise the termination
21 provision in the contracts and prohibiting any
22 person, business, or private entity from owning or
23 operating immigration detention facilities. We once
24 again thank our staff, Harbani, for help with this
25 important legislation.

1
2 The next resolution is by Council Member
3 Justin Brannan. Resolution number 20 calls on the
4 State Legislature to pass The New Deal for CUNY,
5 S.4461-A/A.5843-A. In order to establish CUNY as an
6 engine for social and economic mobility, this State
7 Legislation would waive all tuition and create
8 certain staff-to-student ratios, including a ratio of
9 1 clinic health counselor per 1,000 students, 65
10 full-time faculty members per 1,000 students by
11 academic year 2026, and 1 academic advisor per 600
12 students by academic year 2015. CUNY is a critical
13 pathway to mobility and success for many New Yorkers,
14 often the best option for college education,
15 especially low-income and working class New Yorkers,
16 communities of color, and our immigrant neighbors.
17 Yet, students continue to have larger and larger
18 classes increasingly taught by underpaid adjuncts,
19 limited access to academic advisors, and a single
20 mental health counselor for every 2,700 full-time
21 students. The New Deal for CUNY presents a
22 comprehensive approach to improving the student
23 experience at CUNY, providing the appropriate
24 academic, social, and emotional support students need
25 to stay on track to graduate, and the resources

1
2 needed to renovate CUNY campuses while reducing the
3 need for students to seek outside income to cover
4 tuition and other expenses. CUNY is very special to
5 me because I attended York College for a year and a
6 half before transferring to Spelman College. My
7 father attended York College at the same time that I
8 did as he matriculated and achieved his degree in
9 economic development. I miss him dearly. I'll add
10 that as well. It was integral to my further success
11 academically and beyond. We thank our staff, Chloe
12 Rivera, for helping with this important legislation.

13 This afternoon, we are voting to extend
14 the City's Rent Stabilization Law. We know that
15 housing is among the most pressing issues for New
16 Yorkers. To maintain the Rent Stabilization Law of
17 1969, the City Council must periodically determine
18 whether there is an ongoing housing emergency defined
19 as a vacancy rate of less than 5 percent of the
20 City's rental housing stock. In response, the Council
21 may pass legislation extending the City's Rent
22 Stabilization Law until the due date of the following
23 determination. This determination is based on data
24 and findings from a triennial survey known as the
25 Housing and Vacancy Survey which is sponsored by the

1
2 New York City Council Department of Housing
3 Preservation and Development and conducted in
4 collaboration with the United States Census Bureau.
5 The most recent Housing and Vacancy Survey data comes
6 from the 2017 HVS which indicated a 3.63 percent
7 vacancy rate and resulted in a 2018 determination of
8 an ongoing housing emergency. Due to the 2020
9 decennial census, the survey scheduled for 2020 was
10 postponed to 2021 allowing the City Council until
11 April 1, 2022, to determine whether the housing
12 shortage was ongoing. Because the COVID-19 pandemic
13 created additional delays, in November 2021 Governor
14 Kathy Hochul signed legislation to amend the Local
15 Emergency Housing Rent Control Act authorizing an
16 additional extension of 3 months to determine whether
17 the housing emergency is ongoing. In accordance with
18 such amendment, Introduction number 70 out of the
19 Committee of Housing and Buildings will amend the
20 expiration date of the New York City Rent
21 Stabilization Law reflecting the additional extension
22 from April 1, 2022, to July 1, 2022. This local law
23 would take effect immediately. We'd like to thank our
24 staff, Audrey San (phonetic) for her work on this
25 important legislation.

1
2 Lastly, out of the Rules, Privileges, and
3 Elections Committee, we will be voting on the
4 confirmation of 2 nominees to the New York City
5 Conflict of Interest Board, one submitted by the
6 Comptroller of Georgia Pestana and another by the
7 Public Advocate of Ifeoma Ike.

8 This concludes our agenda for today.
9 Congratulations once again to all the Council Members
10 passing bills or resolutions today.

11 Thank you, and with that I now turn it
12 back to you, Majority Leader Powers.

13 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you so
14 much, and I also want to offer my congratulations to
15 all the Members passing their first resolutions and
16 bills here today.

17 We're going to now move into the
18 discussion of General Orders. I see we have Council
19 Member Yeger and then if any others want to sign up,
20 we'll give you an opportunity to sign up and then
21 we'll go to Council Member Sanchez. Council Member
22 Yeger.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you, Mr.
24 President. I am rising as those who followed the
25 Finance Committee hearing this morning might expect

1
2 on Introduction 71 and Resolution 54, which
3 essentially do the same thing. Ultimately, this is
4 being described in many different ways to many
5 different people and the most common description is
6 if we don't do this bill right now today people are
7 going to lose their exemption. It's really half a
8 truth. If we do the bill the right way today, people
9 won't lose the exemption. What's the right way?
10 Remove the ability of the Department of Finance to
11 decide without any information or without any
12 verifiable information or at least on their own
13 judgement anybody who they want off the list. We had
14 this debate in this House, or at least on Zoom, last
15 year, and our former Colleague, Council Member
16 Barron, the other one, worded it the best and I
17 mentioned that this morning. There are homeowners who
18 may not be here who may be with relatives living
19 elsewhere or maybe even hospitalized and not have the
20 ability to be contacted. I would be doing them a
21 great disservice and wouldn't want to have to meet
22 them someplace and ask me why I voted for a bill that
23 put them in this category when they are presently
24 already protected. Let's be clear, the Governor
25 signed authority for the Council to pass this

1
2 exemption. The Department of Finance is getting a
3 piece in there that allows them to knock anybody off
4 the list and require them to fill out a paper
5 application. As the information that I just received
6 from Council staff, 24,000 New Yorkers did not
7 receive the exemption automatically of the 36,000 who
8 were entitled to it. That's the information that is
9 being passed around by Council staff. So 24,000 are
10 being asked to renew and of that 24, the Department
11 found 817 weren't entitled to get it so we're saying
12 that 24,000 people have to, have to apply by paper
13 because the Department of Finance has reason to
14 believe they may not be entitled to receive it, and
15 of the 24,000 who the Department of Finance has
16 reason to believe, approximately 24,000 ultimately
17 get it so why go through the charade? Today, Mr.
18 President, I'm going to propose 2 friendly
19 amendments, amendment to Introduction 71 and
20 amendment to Resolution 54, which would very simply
21 strike the entirety of those sections that deal with
22 the allowance of the Department of Finance. I would
23 also request under the Rules of Council that these
24 items be decoupled from the General Order Agenda and

1
2 that they be voted on separately following the vote
3 on the amendments. Thank you, Mr. President.

4 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Okay, we'll stand
5 at ease for one minute.

6 I'm now going to call on the Legislative
7 Document Unit to read the 2 amendments that have been
8 proposed by Council Member Yeger.

9 LEGISLATIVE DOCUMENT UNIT: Thank you, Mr.
10 Majority Leader.

11 The first is a proposed amendment to
12 Intro 71 by Council Member Yeger. The proposed
13 amendment would strike the entirety of Section 3
14 which authorizes the Department to require a renewal
15 application from a recipient. The proposed amendment
16 would renumber the remaining Sections accordingly.

17 The second amendment, a proposed
18 amendment to Resolution 54 by Council Member Yeger.
19 The proposed amendment would strike the entirety of
20 Paragraph number 3 which authorizes the Department to
21 require a renewal application from a recipient. The
22 proposed amendment would renumber the remaining
23 sections accordingly.

24 Thank you.
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you.

Pursuant to Rule 9.40, the City Council rules, the Council Member has 2 minutes to explain his amendment.

COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you, Mr.

President. This is very simple. We pass this amendment today, the bill is changed, the message of necessity comes from across the hall because it is necessary and I am confident that the Mayor wants this to happen because the Mayor wants people to have this benefit in our City. We pass it in time, but we don't have language in the bill that says that applicants have to get an application in by March 15, 5 days from now which is what the bill currently says. That section is being stricken by my amendment so if you vote for this amendment, you are striking 2 things. The part where it says that the Department can determine at will whoever they want to knock off this list and require them to submit a paper application, last year 24,000, and the second part is the due date of March 15, which would be statutorily enshrined notwithstanding the Department's representation oh, we'll work with people and give them extensions. It's in the statute. It says shall,

1 shall by March 15. That's 5 days from now. Those
2 entire paragraphs in the Resolution and the
3 Introduction would be stricken so through the course
4 of this debate, you will hear folks say well, it's
5 terrible if we do this, won't be enough time to age.
6 We don't need to age. The message of necessity from
7 across the hall, we can get this passed. We can get
8 on Zoom tomorrow, pass it, no problem so there is no
9 requirement for aging, there is no conundrum that is
10 keeping us from changing it. It is simply a fix so
11 some staff work that needs fixing and that's what
12 we're here to do. We're here to fix the staff work
13 that needed a fixing and we're fixing the bill right
14 here on the floor of the Council, the People's House.
15 I urge you all, please, friends, this is a friendly
16 amendment. This is not designed to hurt the bills.
17 This is designed to get these exemptions into the
18 hands and the pockets of the people who need them the
19 most, the seniors and the disabled people who we
20 represent. Eighteen members joined last year to get
21 this done. This is a chance to do it right this year.
22 It's okay to vote no on a bill that you don't agree
23 with. It's also okay to amend a bill to make it a
24

1
2 little better so I urge you all to vote yes on these
3 amendments. Thank you very much, Mr. President.

4 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We're
5 now going to open up debate on the amendment if
6 anyone would like to speak. I'm recognizing Council
7 Member Osse.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSE: Thank you, and can I
9 agree with Council Member Yeger's statement right
10 now? Is that considered a debate if I'm agreeing with
11 him?

12 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: You are allowed
13 to make a statement.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSE: Amazing. My District
15 has had the largest displacement of black people in
16 all of New York City, and a lot of them were
17 homeowners. Everything that happens in this city is
18 magnified in my District. I do not believe this bill
19 is ready and it does not reflect the best of what we
20 can be without the amendments that Council Member
21 Yeger proposed. Bed-Stuy and Crown Heights are trendy
22 to the world, but we have extreme pockets of hard to
23 reach families and seniors, and we are also a NORC,
24 full of people who have retired decades ago without
25 new income to match yesterday's cost of living,

1
2 forget about today. I'm forced to vote yes on this
3 bill but with these amendments I would be more
4 excited about voting yes on this bill because I do
5 know that there are approximately 5,000 people that
6 will be hurt if we don't extend this renewal, but how
7 many thousands of people are we hurting by not giving
8 them the best bill and governance we possibly can. As
9 I asked in the Finance hearing today, I did request
10 to see how many possible families could benefit from
11 this bill if we were to extend this, and I did not
12 receive an answer, but I do believe that that number
13 could be in thousands. I do not believe the bill
14 should've left Committee, but as it did I will vote
15 yes if these amendments are voted on today. Thank
16 you.

17 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Any other
18 individuals or Council Members who would like to
19 speak on this topic? Council Member Brooks-Powers.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.
21 While I share concerns that have been raised in the
22 discussion around this piece of legislation, I do
23 want to underscore that today is in fact our last day
24 to act on this so what that means is if this
25 amendment goes through and the Council does not act

1
2 today, those same seniors that we are concerned about
3 will then be required to manually submit their
4 application as opposed to automatically be renewed. I
5 just want to underscore that and take that into
6 consideration before we move forward on an amendment
7 that could impact the same seniors we're trying to
8 protect.

9 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We're
10 now going to go to Council Member Barron.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you very
12 much. I, like Council Member Osse, agree with the
13 content of the amendment but the other person he was
14 talking about is my wife, Council Member Inez Barron,
15 and after speaking with her and after speaking with
16 my Chief of Staff and also I wanted to thank Tanisha
17 Edwards, the Deputy Chief of Staff for the Speaker's
18 office, and others in my community, I'm going to vote
19 yes on the original bill, but I think these
20 amendments will be good. I agree with Council Member
21 Osse, and I'm going to vote yes on the bill rather
22 than, but these amendments would work if it could be
23 done in a timely fashion so that 7,000 people aren't
24 hurt trying to get something passed that would hurt
25 the clock. My abstention in the Committee has turned

1
2 into a yes vote after speaking to the people I had
3 mentioned before, but I think these amendments are
4 right on time and it would've been good had they been
5 done initially in Committee.

6 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. I'm
7 going to call on Council Member Mealy.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I just would like
9 to concur with my Colleagues. We are judged how we
10 handle our seniors and our youth and so far it seems
11 like our seniors are second or third thought so I
12 commend you, Councilman Yeger, for thinking about our
13 seniors and that's what we all should be thinking
14 about and I think this body has a great opportunity
15 to help those who cannot be that voice or cannot even
16 get a fax machine because they're scared to come
17 outside and just imagine our seniors have to get
18 recertified (INAUDIBLE) housing do not have a
19 computer or a email so I commend you for thinking
20 about our seniors. I'm voting yes proudly. Thank you.

21 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. I'm
22 now going to call on council Member Brannan to speak.
23 Thanks.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Thank you. I
25 agree with Councilwoman Mealy in that there's nothing

1
2 more important than taking care of our seniors, which
3 is why we need to vote to approve this preconsidered
4 reso as it stands. I certainly learned in my new role
5 as Finance Chair that voting on any amendment like
6 this hastily without speaking to the folks that
7 really know this stuff in the Finance Committee, I
8 think would jeopardize what we're trying to do here
9 which is to, this is just accepting the Governor's
10 invitation to automatically renew SCHE and DHE
11 recipients for another tax year. It doesn't shut
12 anybody out of these exemptions. All it does it
13 automatically renew folks which if we don't do it,
14 over 5,000 people could potentially be left out in
15 the cold, which is not what we want to do so if we
16 care about seniors, we should move forward with the
17 Preconsidered Intro, Preconsidered Reso as they
18 stand. I do not feel that it would be responsible to
19 vote on an amendment now without being able to speak
20 with the Finance Team with what the repercussions
21 could be for the amendment so I would urge my
22 Colleagues to vote no on the amendment and vote yes
23 on the bill as it stands now. Thank you.

24 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you,
25 Council Member Brannan. Just a point of order and

1
2 then anyone else has their hand, point of order, if
3 we approve the amendments today, we'll not be able to
4 pass the legislation today pursuant to rule 9.40 in
5 the City Council rules. If we approve the amendment,
6 we will lay the bill over to be voted on at the next
7 Stated Meeting.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Point of
9 information, Mr. President, point of information...

10 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Council Member
11 Yeger, I'll call on you.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Okay, thank you.

13 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Do we have any
14 other hands up? Council Member Nurse?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: I'm just trying to
16 get a little bit of clarity in relationship to the
17 March 15th deadline because what Council Member
18 Brooks brings up and what you're saying, while I
19 agree with what you're saying, if you could just
20 reiterate, those 5,000 seniors who would be
21 automatically renewed with this amendment, is it
22 removing that March 15th deadline or not? Because
23 what you're putting out is really important but again
24 I really agree with Council Member Brannan it's
25 rushed, it's hasty, and we're not having time to

1
2 absorb this so I would just like a little more
3 clarity on that March 15th piece.

4 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Just a point of
5 clarification, I believe it's a state deadline so it
6 would not remove the deadline of March 15th. Next
7 hand. Council Member Narcisse.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: I think we
9 should do yes. While the amendments would certainly
10 help but right now you're just like we're going to
11 cut the seniors' lane because we want them to have
12 the opportunity. I understand fully what you're
13 saying about the amendment, but if we go for the
14 amendment, what happens then? We have to do something
15 today. It is late in the game. I understand that, but
16 we have to do something today. We love the seniors. I
17 believe we want to do the right thing, but what is
18 the right thing today? Today, it's to protect the
19 seniors while we can with a yes, which I respect all
20 of what you've been doing. I would love to go with
21 you, but for today what do we do today? That's our
22 responsibility not to cut the seniors' lane.

23 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: I'll now call on
24 Council Member Hudson followed by Council Member Carr
25 and Council Member Paladino.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: I think ultimately
3 what I think I hear everyone saying is this is about
4 process and government perhaps maybe being not as
5 efficient as we should be and so, you know, I agree
6 with so many of the previous comments that my
7 Colleagues have made but I think the bigger picture
8 is that we continue be presented with, or I should
9 say, we're put in positions where we have to rush
10 votes, we don't have the full information, and I
11 think, you know, I just want to raise the point that
12 overall as a practice we should be looking to be more
13 efficient as government rather than less. Thank you.
14 Lastly, you know, my own mother was a recipient of
15 SCHE program and so I know that, you know, she
16 wouldn't have been able to renew on her own, you
17 know, if she wasn't automatically enrolled and so I
18 will be voting yes on these bills. Thank you.

19 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you, and
20 I'll go to Council Member Carr.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Thank you, Majority
22 Leader. If the debate or the offering of these
23 amendments was hasty, then so too was the debate on
24 the overall bill. This is the first time we're able
25 to discuss it. The Governor issued her Executive

1
2 Order giving us the option on February 14th. We
3 could've been having longer debates both in Committee
4 and before we got to this House before then so the
5 offering of the amendment is hasty because so too was
6 the overall debate. I think that all my Colleagues
7 share, you know, my belief in how important this
8 program is. We all represent significant numbers of
9 seniors and the disabled, many who are both, and like
10 Council Member Mealy said, many of these individuals
11 are among the less able to respond timely to
12 Department of Finance solicitations for additional
13 paperwork, and I think if we're going to extend auto-
14 enrollment, we should it extend it writ large given
15 the difficult conditions that we have at this time.
16 This is not a poison pill amendment. There's time to
17 adopt the amendments and then to proceed and actually
18 adopt an amended version of this bill without
19 jeopardizing the 5,000 plus individuals who have not
20 yet applied according to DOF testimony earlier today.
21 I think no one should have cause that they're going
22 to cause someone to lose an exemption by voting yes,
23 but they should have concerns about who might lose
24 their exemptions if they vote against the amendments

1
2 and then vote for an unamended bill. That's what I'd
3 like to say. Thank you.

4 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: I will now call
5 on Council Member Paladino followed by Council Member
6 Ayala.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: I want to echo
8 what Council Member Carr said and I fully back what
9 Councilman Yeger said. I too represent a District
10 that is loaded with seniors. Most of our demographics
11 are seniors, and all we're asking for is that this
12 can be voted on tomorrow via Zoom. We are not looking
13 to put this off for weeks or months or anything like
14 that. We need due process and the proper timing, and
15 the proper timing can be tomorrow via Zoom so I say
16 I'm in all favor of the bill as it sits right now but
17 the timing is off. To leave it 5 days, for senior
18 citizens to get it together to file the necessary
19 papers is not enough time so we could this the right
20 way and we could do this tomorrow on Zoom. Thank you.

21 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. Just
22 another point of clarification. We would require a
23 Mayor's Message of Necessity in order to be able to
24 vote on a bill at a Stated that we'd have to

1
2 schedule. Next, we're going to Council Member Ayala
3 and then Council Member Krishnam.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I think that
5 there's a little bit of confusion or a lot of
6 confusion about what this bill is intended to do
7 because many of you are making the argument that
8 seniors aren't able to process applications because
9 they don't have access to fax machines or copy
10 machines or scanners and it's going to take too long
11 to gather the documents that they need in order to
12 recertify. That's exactly why the bill was proposed
13 is because, and I know this for a fact because I did
14 Constituent Services for a really long time, and a
15 lot of our seniors forget to submit the
16 recertification and they lose the subsidy because
17 they did not reapply. This is a no-brainer. I mean,
18 this is common sense legislation that would
19 automatically enroll them so that they don't have to
20 go through the trouble of finding a fax and a copy
21 machine and gathering the information. I just feel
22 that this is too important and we really don't have
23 the time for this. I do, however, see that because we
24 did not have enough time to debate it that there is a
25 lot of confusion about what the bill is intended, but

1
2 I am telling you that the very reasons for why you're
3 objecting to it is the reasons why it makes sense to
4 pass this bill today. Thank you.

5 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Council Member
6 Krishnan, and then we'll come back to Council Members
7 who have spoken before.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: The central
9 purpose of this legislation is to allow for the
10 automatic renewal of a public benefit and in this
11 city, having represented many tenants in these
12 situations, it is extraordinarily difficult for
13 tenants to attain public benefits because of how
14 bureaucratic and how complicated these procedures
15 are. This includes applying for SCHE or for DHE and I
16 think we can't lose sight of the bigger picture that
17 right now facing a deadline of March 15th, this
18 actually makes the process simpler for seniors and
19 individuals with disabilities to secure a crucial
20 benefit. We can't lose sight of the fact that this
21 bill would make them automatically renewed for a
22 benefit that if they lose would be catastrophic for
23 so many. Facing this deadline, I think 5 days before,
24 the amendment being offered is not timely and would
25 undermine, as Council Member Ayala said as well, the

1
2 very purpose of the bill to protect many senior
3 citizens and individuals with disabilities in their
4 homes so I think it's a crucial piece of legislation
5 that needs to pass and will eliminate a major
6 obstacle for many to attain a public benefit in this
7 city. Thank you.

8 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. Do we
9 have any other Members who want to (INAUDIBLE) who
10 want to speak again and I'll come to them
11 momentarily. Do we have any other Members that would
12 like to speak on this. We have Council Member Abreu.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: I have
14 grandparents, and automatic renewals are a great
15 Christmas gift. Let's get this done.

16 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Short and to the
17 point. We like that (INAUDIBLE) Any others who would
18 like to speak at this point in time?

19 Okay, we'll come back. Council Member
20 Ariola.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Thank you. Thank
22 you, Mr. President. I don't think that the renewal
23 portion of this bill is what is part of Council
24 Member Yeger's friendly amendment. What really stuck
25 out to me was it said the Department will notify such

1
2 recipients as soon as practical of the requirement to
3 submit a renewal application and require such renewal
4 application be submitted by March 15th of the
5 appropriate year. My mother is also a recipient of
6 this, and half the time, she's 84 years old, she has
7 all of her faculties, but she doesn't always see when
8 she gets a renewal so what is the practical time now
9 and March 15th so all we're saying is if we give it a
10 day we can keep what is already wonderful about the
11 bill, which is the automatic renewal, and we can add
12 to it what could make it better. Yes, it was rushed,
13 but we still have time to make this the best possible
14 bill for our seniors. Thank you.

15 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. Do we
16 have any other Council Members who would like to
17 speak in this first round?

18 Okay, we'll now go back for Members who I
19 presume want to add. We'll first go to Council Member
20 Yeger then Council Member Brannan then to Council
21 Member Osse.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you, Mr.
23 President. Let me be clear, this doesn't take away
24 the automatic renewal. Doesn't matter what Staff
25 says. My amendment doesn't take away the automatic

1
2 renewal. This can't be passed in time is the
3 argument. Not true. This Council can be called back
4 and vote tomorrow on a bill. Oh, we can't do it
5 because it has to age. Not true. The Mayor will give
6 us a Message of Necessity. There's no problem with
7 that. There's no reason the Mayor wouldn't do it.
8 That we are messing up the process of the automatic
9 renewals. Not true. These are not truthful arguments.
10 The arguments that you're hearing is that somebody
11 here in the Council, a Staffer, appeared a bill and
12 they don't want to see it changed and we are carrying
13 that water. It's very clear. We have an opportunity
14 now to fix this bill and, just in reference to timely
15 amendments, look, no amendment on the floor is ever
16 timely. It's happening on the day we're voting for
17 it. That's the way amendments work. No amendment
18 could be timely. That's the nature of amendment. The
19 idea of an amendment is to take a bill that is okay
20 and make it actually work the best way possible. It
21 is 5 days away from the City of New York using the
22 best practical way of reaching out to 24,000
23 possibly, 24,000 New Yorkers who receive this
24 exemption and telling them you have to apply for
25 renewal by the 15th, in 5 days. When is this

1
2 practical time? Are they doing it over the weekend,
3 sending it out on the 12th? That's 3 days from now, 2
4 days from now. When are they sending this out?
5 Putting it in Saturday's mail, Sunday's mail? If we
6 change the bill, the City doesn't have to do
7 anything. Sit back, wait, everybody's going to send
8 in their payments with their exemptions. Nobody will
9 have lost it. All we have to do is be willing to show
10 up tomorrow on Zoom and vote in favor of an amended
11 bill. So simple. I'm willing to. I hope you all are
12 as well. I urge you to vote yes on these 2
13 amendments. Thank you very much.

14 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you,
15 Council Member Yeger. We'll now go to Council Member
16 Brannan.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Thank you. What
18 Council Member Yeger is suggesting sounds fantastic,
19 but it's not practical. We don't have the time to do
20 this amendment. We're not going to get a Message of
21 Necessity from the Mayor. If we fail to enact this
22 bill today, we will lose our chance to get this done.
23 The Council will not have another opportunity to pass
24 legislation that would auto-renew these folks. I
25 appreciate the robust debate on this bill, but

1
2 there's really nothing controversial about this. No
3 one is carrying anybody's water. The bottom line is
4 if we don't pass this bill today, 5,000 plus seniors
5 will no longer get the benefit and if we pass this
6 they'll all be auto-renewed. That's it. That's all
7 this is about. That's what this boils down to. It's
8 about auto-renewal, and we're talking about seniors
9 and disabled homeowners. We need to vote down the
10 amendment, and we need to proceed with the
11 Preconsidered Intro and Reso and get this done. We
12 can revisit this, the language of it, at a different
13 time, but we have to get this done. This is very,
14 very important, and we will not get a Message of
15 Necessity from the Mayor. We will not have another
16 chance to do this. We will jeopardize the 5,000 plus
17 seniors who are on the hook now to be auto-renewed.
18 If this fails or if the amendment passes and there's
19 no time to actually get the Reso done, which there
20 will not be, then we'll have to go back to our
21 Districts and tell 5,000 seniors sorry, we argued
22 over a couple of words and now you're not get auto-
23 renewed for your benefits.

24 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll
25 go to Council Member Osse.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSE: I just wanted to
3 clarify that I don't think, and I'll speak for
4 myself, I don't think this is a bad bill. I think this is a
5 pretty good. I just do believe that it can be better.
6 This is the greatest city in the world, and I think
7 our government can be the same. After consideration
8 and speaking to Council Member Brooks-Powers, I am
9 aware that there would have to be some statewide
10 changes in order for these amendments to follow
11 through so I will be voting no on the amendments. I
12 do not want to see seniors hurt. I don't think any of
13 us want to see seniors hurt if this bill is not
14 passed, but I just do wanna say that, you know, we
15 knew this March 15th deadline existed. I think we
16 could've, you know, put in some more work to think
17 this bill through a little more and then make it more
18 inclusive to many of the residents that I know exist
19 across all of our districts, and, you know, I will
20 vote yes on this bill and no on these amendments.
21 Thank you.

22 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. Are
23 there any other Council Members who'd like to speak
24 on these amendments at this point in time? Give one
25 second. If anyone else would like to speak.

1
2 Okay, I'm going to now call on the Clerk
3 to take a vote on these... Sorry, we're going to stand
4 at ease one second. Thank you. Everybody can find
5 your seats. We are now going to have the Clerk call
6 for a roll call vote on the coupled amendments. Just
7 as a reminder, this is not a vote on the bill. It's a
8 vote on the amendments. If you're voting yes, you're
9 voting for the amendments. If you're voting no,
10 you're voting against the amendments.

11 Sorry. Yes. I can repeat again. This is a
12 vote on the amendments to the bill, not on the actual
13 bill. If you are voting, if you're in support of
14 Council Member Yeger's amendments, you're voting yes
15 on the amendments. If you're against the amendments
16 to the bill, you're voting no on the amendments. This
17 is a vote on the amendments, not on the actual bill.
18 We will take a vote on the bill potentially
19 afterwards. We are going to now ask for the Clerk to
20 take a roll call on the coupled amendments from
21 Council Member Yeger.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Abreu.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: Respectfully no.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Ariola.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Yes.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

48

COUNCIL CLERK: Aviles. Ayala.

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: No.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I think we can get
a Message of Necessity from the Mayor. I think it can
be done. I vote yes, but if this fails I will be
voting yes on the other proposed bill. I vote yes.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Bottcher.

COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: No.

COUNCIL CLERK: Brannan.

COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: No.

COUNCIL CLERK: Brewer.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: No.

COUNCIL CLERK: Brooks-Powers.

COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: I vote no.

COUNCIL CLERK: Caban.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABAN: No.

COUNCIL CLERK: Carr.

COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Yes.

COUNCIL CLERK: De La Rosa.

COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: No.

COUNCIL CLERK: Dinowitz.

COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: No.

COUNCIL CLERK: Farias.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: I just want to say that I agree with Council Member Yeger but bureaucracy is in the way, and I'm really nervous about the failure to support seniors so I'll be voting no on amendments.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Feliz.

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Permission to explain my vote.

MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: We have to do everything within our power to protect our seniors. I understand the concerns and the reasons for the proposed amendment. However, due to the posture of the matter and given the strict deadlines, I have to vote no.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Gennaro.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Yes.

COUNCIL CLERK: Gutierrez.

COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIERREZ: I vote no.

COUNCIL CLERK: Hanif.

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: I vote no.

COUNCIL CLERK: Hanks.

COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: No.

COUNCIL CLERK: Holden.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I vote yes.

COUNCIL CLERK: Hudson.

COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: No.

COUNCIL CLERK: Joseph.

COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: No.

COUNCIL CLERK: Kagan.

COUNCIL MEMBER KAGAN: Permission to explain my vote.

MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Permission granted.

COUNCIL MEMBER KAGAN: Yes, I understand concern of Council Member Kalman Yeger and others, but I believe, today is March 10th. I do not want to jeopardize the automatic renewals. It's crucial. It's important so I'm voting no.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Krishnan.

COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: No.

COUNCIL CLERK: Lee.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Permission to explain my vote.

MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Yep, go ahead.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: I just wanted to echo the sentiments of my other Council Members as someone who ran senior centers and did social services for a

1
2 lot of our older adult communities. I actually really
3 appreciate the thought that Council Member Yeger has
4 put into this and agree with his sentiments but
5 because the timeline and the fear that they won't get
6 automatically renewed, I also vote no, but thank you.
7 I appreciate it.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Louis.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Permission to
10 explain my vote.

11 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Thank you. I echo
13 the same sentiments. I agree with the recommendation.
14 The timing is off, and I hope we could consider
15 having these conversations and then conference and
16 take it a little bit more seriously to have it in
17 advance. I vote no today.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Marte.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: No.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Mealy.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Yes, I think that
22 this amendment is a great amendment, but I really
23 feel that we should have more time, that we could
24 really analyze it and do what's best for our seniors.
25 We really don't know if the Mayor will pass that home

1
2 rule right away so at this time I will vote no for
3 the amendment, but I know we have to revisit this
4 because our seniors are the lost voices in this whole
5 process and not thinking about the homeowners, some
6 of them still have their faculties at 97 years old,
7 still doing electric slide so please we need to help
8 them in this endeavor. Thank you.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Menin.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: No.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Moya.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: No.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Narcisse.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Permission to
15 explain my vote.

16 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Yep, go ahead.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Thank you. In my
18 district alone, I have 60 percent of small
19 homeowners. In my office, ever since we opened, we've
20 been addressed to help the seniors in the District
21 that don't have a fax, which I'm in agreement, that
22 don't have, probably even to notarize their papers so
23 I appreciate what my Colleague's been working on so
24 hard, Yeger, which I understand, but today we are
25 forced to do what we supposed to do which is

1
2 represent. Sometimes it is tough to make decisions,
3 but today since we don't have the time, the Mayor is
4 not obligated to give us the Necessity Message to get
5 it done so in the meanwhile we have to take the
6 decision. I would have to say no. Thank you so much
7 and respect for you.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Nurse.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: Permission to
10 explain.

11 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: Thank you. I fully
13 agree with Council Member Yeger on the need to make
14 this a better bill. I agree with my other Colleagues
15 who have expressed. I just personally cannot in real
16 time absorb this level of information and make
17 responsible decisions so I would really encourage
18 more thoughtful planning and consideration in the
19 future for something as significant and impactful as
20 this. I vote no.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Osse.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSE: Permission to
23 explain my vote.

24 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSE: For the record, this
3 is a good bill. I think we could always be better,
4 and I think that's what we should strive for in life,
5 to always be better so I vote no.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Paladino.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: I vote a firm
8 yes.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Restler.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: No.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Richardson-Jordan.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDSON-JORDAN:
13 Permission to explain my vote.

14 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDSON-JORDAN: I don't
16 really understand why the Mayor wouldn't give us the
17 Necessity and I don't really understand why we
18 wouldn't then just lobby the Mayor for what we need
19 to get this done right and correctly and in time so I
20 vote yes on the amendment.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Riley.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: No.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you to my
25 Colleagues who have spoken really eloquently. I want

1
2 to align myself especially with the comments from
3 Linda Lee and Council Member Sandy Nurse, but I do
4 respectfully vote no.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Salamanca.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I vote no.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Sanchez.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: I vote no.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Schulman.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER SCHULMAN: Permission to
11 explain my vote.

12 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Granted.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER SCHULMAN: As someone who
14 represents the District that has the highest, or one
15 of the highest numbers of seniors of any Council
16 District, it's important to me that a lot of these
17 seniors who will be negatively affected by us not
18 voting for the bill, that they get the services they
19 need so I vote no on the amendments.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Stevens.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Permission to
22 explain my vote.

23 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Granted.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: I agree with my
25 Colleague Kalman Yeger about the amendment and

1
2 understand his sentiments around it. However, I do
3 think in timely manner we have to make sure we're
4 working efficiently and making sure we're given some
5 time, but I want to just urge our Colleagues moving
6 forward that we do use conference to have these
7 conversations and debates to get things done because
8 like our Colleague Sandy Nurse just said, it's really
9 hard to try to absorb these things in such a timely
10 and really get the full understanding, but right now
11 because we have to do what we need to do for our
12 seniors, I firmly vote no.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Ung.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER UNG: I vote no.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Velazquez.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VELAZQUEZ: No.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Vernikov.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Yes on the

19 amendment.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Williams.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Respectfully no.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Won.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: No.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Yeger.

25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: I appreciate very
3 much the kind words from my Colleagues and
4 particularly those who voted no but proceeded with
5 the word respectfully. I'm grateful for that. I do
6 vote yes on this, and I still do think it's a good
7 idea. Thank you very much, Mr. President.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Yes.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Powers.

11 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: I vote no.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Adams.

13 SPEAKER ADAMS: I vote no.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: I have yet to
15 vote.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Excuse me, Council Member.
17 Council Member Gennaro.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Yes.

19 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. My
20 apologies. Thank you. By a vote of 40 in the
21 affirmative, 10 in the negative, sorry, sorry, that
22 is incorrect. The final vote tally is 10 in the
23 affirmative, 40 in the negative, and 0 abstentions.
24 That motion is defeated. I'm not going to call on
25 Council Member Yeger.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you, Mr.
3 President. Just briefly, my previous request to
4 decouple the main question on Introduction 71 and
5 Resolution 54 from the General Orders Calendar, I'd
6 like to withdraw that request and have it recoupled
7 with the General Orders Calendar so that they'll be
8 one roll call.

9 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We're
10 now going to resume the General Orders. We'll now
11 first hear from Council Member Sanchez.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you, Mr.
13 President. In echoing some of my Colleagues, just
14 want to acknowledge Council Member Yeger's amendments
15 as good ones but ones that I did not find timely. I'm
16 actually speaking to Colleagues of Intro 70, the one
17 right before 71. I'm just so excited today to be
18 sponsoring and voting in support of my very first
19 piece of legislation, Intro 70, which is going to
20 extend the deadline for the Department of Housing,
21 Preservation, and Development to finish the housing
22 vacancy survey. The HVS is what allows New York City
23 to issue a determination to Albany that then allows
24 Albany to allow us to have rent stabilization. Rent
25 stabilization protections 1 million renters in the

1
2 City of New York. That's of 3 million households.
3 Thirty percent of our households are protected by
4 rent stabilization which protects them from not
5 receiving lease renewals, protects them from seeing
6 unconscionable increases in their rents from year to
7 year and so I want to urge all the Colleagues to vote
8 aye on Intro 70 and also to keep the push for good
9 cause legislature which would extend very similar
10 protections in Albany to many more renters across the
11 State of New York, including in New York City. Thank
12 you.

13 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We're
14 now going to call on Council Member Barron.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you very
16 much. My Colleagues, I'm just asking unanimous
17 consent to vote on all General Order items and
18 resolutions. I do have a dental emergency so I would
19 appreciate that.

20 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Okay, thank you.
21 Any objections? How do you vote?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I'd like to on all
23 General Order items, I vote yes and on the
24 resolutions on Ukraine (INAUDIBLE) I have to abstain
25 from that. I strongly suggest that you read the

1
2 history of Ukraine and the role that the United
3 States, NATO, the North Atlantic Treaty Organization,
4 and the European Union plays in creating this tension
5 and conflict. In 2014, they had a coup d'état where
6 they took out a duly elected president in Ukraine so
7 that they can expand the national corporations
8 capital expenditures and profits in the Ukraine and
9 they took out a duly elected president and this led
10 to the tension and they put in a rightwing
11 conservative president and then the other resolution
12 doesn't recognize at all the way Africans are being
13 treated in the Ukraine. At the border, they're beaten
14 and Africans have been stopped from leaving and
15 discriminated, there's been racism. The AU, the
16 African Union, spoke out against that. The NAACP
17 spoke out against that, and none of this is mentioned
18 in our resolution. I thank you. I know you're sorry
19 you gave me unanimous consent, but I thank you for
20 doing it and I encourage you to read the history.
21 NATO is a military coalition of European countries.
22 There in Africa created 23 coup d'états, killed women
23 and children. NATO backed by America so we need to
24 read the history of these conflicts, and I condemn
25 all killing of innocent women and children in the

1 theater of war. I am abstaining from these
2 resolutions. We got to read the history, and you'll
3 see the role of imperialism and capitalism in that
4 region and all over the world. We must be fair and
5 honest in this. I thank you. I abstain on the
6 resolutions on Ukraine resolutions, and I vote yes on
7 (INAUDIBLE) I really think that that was a good, good
8 piece put together and when (INAUDIBLE) I do support
9 this bill because it will help our seniors.
10

11 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you,
12 Council Member Barron. We're now going to go to
13 Council Member Hudson and then Council Member Farias.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Today, we're
15 voting on 2 appointments to the New York City
16 Conflicts of Interest Board, Georgia Pestana and
17 Ifeoma Ike. Both of these nominees are trailblazers
18 in their own right. Miss Pestana was the first woman
19 and first Latinx person to lead the Law Department.
20 Miss Ike is a black woman who has held senior
21 positions at various organizations and is the first
22 (INAUDIBLE) Appointee by a Public Advocate. Both of
23 these appointments came before the Council with
24 alleged conflicts of interest. Each nominee was given
25 the opportunity to testify under oath about the

1
2 circumstances of the alleged conflict and provided
3 documentation to support their claims. The Rules
4 Committee voted 8-1 to send these nominations to the
5 full Council for a vote. This system of due process,
6 one in which potential appointees are asked to
7 address any concerns head on worked. Both women
8 submitted to thorough questioning and each came out
9 exonerated. This process ensures all appointees are
10 qualified and committed to serve the City of New York
11 with the utmost integrity, and we should understand
12 that facing greater questioning and heightened
13 scrutiny is not tantamount to the existence of a
14 valid conflict with an appointee but rather part of a
15 process that guarantees the integrity of the Council.
16 This process showed that Miss Pestana and Miss Ike
17 are qualified appointments for the Conflicts of
18 Interest Board. That said, I would like to call
19 attention to the line of inquiry of some of my
20 Colleagues. During the hearings, Miss Ike faced
21 extensive questioning regarding some statements she
22 made on social media that were irrelevant to her
23 qualifications for this role. My suggestion is not
24 that Miss Ike should be exempt from robust
25 questioning but impugning her character and her

1
2 ability to serve impartially reflects the long
3 history of racist and dog whistles levied against
4 black women to suggest they are somehow less
5 qualified. I urge my Colleagues to reflect and
6 recognize how systemic biases, though often
7 unintentional, influence our approach to fact finding
8 and the disproportionate impact on women of color,
9 queer folks, people living with disabilities, and
10 other marginalized communities. We can be both
11 thorough and fair. Thank you.

12 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll
13 go to Council Member Farias followed by Council
14 Member Holden followed by Council Member Nurse.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Thank you,
16 Majority Leader. I just wanted to highlight for
17 everyone here today that will be voting on the
18 creation of the Castle Hill Business Improvement
19 District in my Council District. The formation of the
20 Castle Hill BID has been a long process long before
21 myself and predecessor, way back to Council Member
22 Annabel Palma's days, and there's so many community
23 members, steering community members, adjacent BIDs
24 that have worked really, really hard to make this
25 happen. The BID, which will be the second in my

1
2 District, is extremely important to promote the
3 economic development in my Council District, and I
4 encourage all of my Colleagues to support it and vote
5 yes. Thank you.

6 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. Now
7 Council Member Holder.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you,
9 Majority Leader. I ask for unanimous consent to vote
10 on all items on the General Order calendar and
11 resolutions.

12 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. Any
13 objections? How do you vote?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye on all with
15 the exception of M16 of which I vote no. Thank you.

16 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you,
17 Council Member Holden. We'll now go to Council Member
18 Nurse.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: Good afternoon. I
20 just want to express my wholehearted, full support
21 for one of the nominees to the Conflict of Interest
22 Board, Ifeoma Ike. Ife is a leader, an innovator, and
23 someone who thankfully speaks truth to power. She is
24 a talented black woman who has worked hard as a
25 successful lawyer and a respected advocate. I believe

1
2 Ife will truly be an asset to this administration and
3 without a doubt will work to support her Colleagues
4 with integrity and accountability. I just want to
5 echo Council Member Hudson's comments and remind this
6 body that due diligence has been done, and the
7 Committee has voted to move her forward after
8 extensive questioning so I urge my Colleagues to vote
9 yes. Thank you very much.

10 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll
11 now go to Council Member Williams.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.
13 Echoing the sentiments of Council Member Hudson and
14 Nurse, Ralph Marston said you are here to be real and
15 not to be perfect. Bell Hooks once said there must
16 exist a paradigm, a practical model for social change
17 that includes an understanding of ways to transform
18 consciousness that are linked to efforts to transform
19 structures. In a small way today, we have made a real
20 step forward towards daring to not only diversify our
21 structure but to transform who gets heard within our
22 systems. The Conflict of Interest Board is about
23 fairness, where fairness is a place we're all trying
24 to achieve on a daily basis. We are not perfect but
25 alas we can be real. Every space is a microcosm for

1
2 the larger systematic realities we face and city
3 government is no different. We can walk and chew gum
4 at the same time. We can use the systems we have in
5 place to work hard, to be fair, while also
6 questioning those systems and looking at how they
7 impact communities differently. I commend the Public
8 Advocate for making his first nomination for Ifeoma
9 Ike, a well-recognized and respected leader in
10 equity, activism, and leadership. Her experiences in
11 government and communities across our City have been
12 critically impactful. Ife has a passion and expertise
13 in fighting for justice, which makes her fully
14 equipped for this role. I trust that careful
15 investigative work has commenced. I also want to
16 thank the Council Staff for their rigorous vetting
17 process. Thank you so much.

18 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. Now
19 we'll go to Council Member Caban.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CABAN: Thank you. I just
21 want to echo the sentiments of my Colleagues that
22 came before me, Council Members Hudson, Nurse, and
23 Williams. I too am urging my Colleagues to support
24 Ife Ike for this position. As we should rightfully so
25 critique, question, which was done here, due

1
2 diligence was done, one thing that really resonates
3 that came to mind that I felt very strongly was the
4 sentiment that life is somebody who time and time
5 again speaks truth to power, and that's what we need
6 more than anything in this moment, in this position.
7 She sat, she handled the questioning I thought with
8 such great poise, with radical transparency and
9 honesty throughout the entire process, and is just a
10 brilliant legal mind and an incredibly, incredibly
11 dedicated public servant and beyond that has shown
12 such a dedication to specifically black and brown
13 low-income New Yorkers and I can't think of a better
14 person to sit on the Conflicts of Interest Board so I
15 hope my Colleagues will join us in supporting her.

16 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. Do we
17 have anybody else signed up for General Orders? I
18 have a list for resolutions, but anybody for General
19 Orders. I have Council Member Riley.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Thank you, Majority
21 Leader. I wasn't going to speak today but I had a
22 horrific murder, suicide happen in my District this
23 weekend. Gabrielle Nunez, 26, and her daughter who
24 was 6 years old who was also murdered. I just wanted
25 to state domestic violence is very real within our

1
2 communities, and I just urge my Colleagues if you
3 could just support any domestic violence groups
4 within your Districts and really pay attention to
5 what's going on because this murder has really played
6 a tough role, it's been a tough weekend because I
7 have my 6-year-old and I could just imagine how she
8 would've felt if she was in the same predicament so I
9 just wanted to raise Gabby and Rosara's (phonetic)
10 name to the skies and please, please just pay
11 attention to domestic violence and what's happening
12 in our community. Thank you.

13 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. Anyone
14 else? Okay. Okay. Report of Special Committees.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

16 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Report of
17 Standing Committees.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee on
19 Finance, Preconsidered Intro 71, Property Tax
20 Exemptions.

21 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled with General
22 Orders.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Resolution 19, Castle Hill
24 BID.

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

69

SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled with General
Orders.

COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered Reso 54,
Property Tax Exemptions.

SPEAKER ADAMS: Couple with General
Orders.

COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered Reso 58,
Transparency.

SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled with General
Orders.

COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered Reso 59,
West Village BID.

SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled with General
Orders.

COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered M33 and Reso
73 and Preconsidered M34 and Reso 74, Council Budget.

SPEAKER BUDGET: Coupled with General
Orders.

COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee on
Housings and Buildings, Intro 70, Rent Stabilization
Law.

SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled with General
Orders.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

70

COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee on Rules, Privileges, and Elections, M15 and Reso 75 Approving the Appointment of Georgia Pestana, Conflicts of Interest Board.

SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled with General Orders.

COUNCIL CLERK: M16 and Reso 76, Approving the Appointment of Ifeoma Ike, Conflicts of Interest Board.

SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled with General Orders.

COUNCIL CLERK: Resolution appointing various persons, Commission of Deeds.

SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled with General Orders, and I would now ask that the Clerk take a roll vote on all of the items coupled on today's General Orders calendar.

COUNCIL CLERK: Salamanca.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Abreu.

COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Ariola.

COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Aye on all except M15 and Resolution 75.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL CLERK: Aviles. Ayala.

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye on all with the exception of Resolution 76.

COUNCIL CLERK: I'm sorry, Council Member.

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: No on Reso 76, aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Bottcher.

COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Brannan.

COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Brewer.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I want to vote aye on all, and I wanted to point out as part of the Rules Committee, the good discussion that took place. Some of us were not sure, we didn't know the individuals, they stood up extremely well under questioning, and I think that's an example of the way in which the People's House, the City Council, can have these kinds of discussions (INAUDIBLE) and I feel very strongly in terms of the Speaker's bill number 71 because I think that the Department of Finance will complete their work and they are going to get us the names of the individuals per Council District and we can make sure that they are

1
2 considered positively if appropriate for their
3 discount on their property tax, whether their seniors
4 and disabled, so I vote aye on all.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Brooks-Powers.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Aye on all.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Caban.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CABAN: Aye on all.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Carr.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Permission to
11 explain my vote.

12 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Granted, yes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Thank you. I
14 abstained on Preconsidered Introduction 71 and
15 Preconsidered Resolution 54 in Finance Committee
16 earlier today because I had hopes that we would amend
17 them successfully and then adopt them in a timely
18 manner as amended so that no one would be at risk of
19 losing their senior citizen or disabled homeowner
20 exemptions. With the defeat of those amendments,
21 unfortunately, for me, I judge the risk now be more
22 if we do not pass the bill because of those who have
23 yet to timely return their paper applications and so,
24 given that that's the case, I'll be supporting those
25 bills now on the floor. I also disclosed on the

1
2 record in Finance, but I'll do so again now we're
3 funding CUNY in this transparency resolution and I
4 have a domestic partner of mine who's a student there
5 and so I'll be voting no on M15 and M16 with
6 accompanying Resolutions 75 and 76 and Introduction
7 70 and aye on the rest. Thank you.

8 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. Just a
9 very quick announcement. We have to maintain a quorum
10 for the resolutions so we need folks to stay here
11 until we get an opportunity to vote on them. Thanks.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: De La Rosa.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Aye on all,
14 and I'd just like to thank Councilwoman Sanchez for
15 her leadership for rent stabilized tenants across our
16 city.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Dinowitz.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Aye on all.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Farias.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: I vote aye on all.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Feliz.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Aye.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Gennaro.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Mr. Leader, I
25 wish to speak on my vote.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Yes, go ahead.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: I vote aye on all, and I would ask the Finance Committee to lend me some assistance as to how I may be able to identify those seniors who may be at risk for being purged for the tax exemption, the seniors and disabled. If the Finance Committee or the Department of Finance could lend me some assistance in that matter, this is my formal request from my office to receive that assistance. The (INAUDIBLE) didn't pass but certainly I'll be voting yes on the bill that relates to, I guess it's 71, and everything else on the General Order calendar, but I wish assistance with regard to identifying my constituents who might be affected by being purged by the Department of Finance.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Council Member Ariola.

COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Thank you for the opportunity. Aye on all except for M15, 16, coupled reso 75, 76, and Intro 70.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Gutierrez.

COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIERREZ: Aye on all.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL CLERK: Hanif.

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Permission to explain my vote.

MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: I'm so proud to be voting in favor of my first bill, Resolution 66, which calls on the State to pass the Dignity Not Detention Act.

MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Council Member Hanif, I think we have you signed up for the Resolution (INAUDIBLE)

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Okay.

MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: We'll come back to you. Okay?

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Got it. Thank you.

MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: All right. Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Hanks.

MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Oh, and how do you vote?

COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Aye on all.

MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thanks.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Council Member Hanks.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Hudson.

COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Joseph.

COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Kagan.

COUNCIL MEMBER KAGAN: Permission to
explain my vote.

MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

COUNCIL MEMBER KAGAN: First of all, I
would like to thank my Colleagues, Council Member
Hudson and Council Member Vernikov and everybody
else, who expressed solidarity with peace-loving
people of Ukraine who are currently under bombardment
from imperialistic (INAUDIBLE) Council Member Barron
said Russia.

Second of all, I'm voting yes on all
resolutions, and I'm abstaining from Resolution 20.
I'm proud product of CUNY. I'm a graduate of Borough
College. I support Borough College fund, but this
resolution doesn't explain the mechanism of paying
for all of this.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: (INAUDIBLE) we're not on resolutions yet. We're voting on the bill so do you want to cast your vote?

COUNCIL MEMBER KAGAN: Yes.

MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Council Member Ariola.

COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: It's me again. I'm an aye on Intro 70.

COUNCIL CLERK: You are an aye on Intro 70?

COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Yes.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Thank you for your consideration.

COUNCIL CLERK: No problem. Krishnan.

COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: Permission to explain my vote.

MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: I'd like to make some comments regarding Intro 70. I first want to thank Chair Pierina Sanchez of the Committee on Housing and Buildings for her leadership on this issue when it comes to extension of rent

1
2 stabilization. We are facing a perpetual housing
3 emergency in this city where rents are skyrocketing.
4 Tenants, especially in communities of color and low-
5 income communities of color, are being displaced
6 overnight from their homes. I have represented too
7 many tenants in situations where their ceilings are
8 caving in, where they're being harassed by the
9 landlords, where their rents are being raised
10 illegally overnight by slumlords bent on getting them
11 out of their homes. It is crucial we pass and extend
12 the rent stabilization protections because that's
13 just the first step that we can do to keep tenants in
14 their homes.

15 The bigger fight that we have ahead of us
16 is to ensure that the rent stabilization laws are
17 actually enforced on the ground everyday in
18 communities far from here, far from City Hall, but to
19 get to that point we must ensure that given the
20 housing emergency we face, the very low vacancy rate,
21 that we ensure rent stabilization continues in this
22 city. I proudly vote in favor of it and vote aye on
23 all the other pieces of legislation as well.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Lee.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Aye on all.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL CLERK: Louis.

COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: I vote aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Marte.

COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Mealy.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Menin.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Moya.

COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: I vote aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Narcisse.

COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Nurse.

COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Osse.

COUNCIL MEMBER OSSE: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Paladino.

COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: I vote no on M15

and M16 and Resolution 75 and 76. I vote on 70 and

aye on all on the rest.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Restler.

COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Aye on all, and I

just want to congratulate my friend, Pierina Sanchez,

1
2 on her leadership protecting rent stabilized tenants
3 across our City. Thank you.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Richardson-Jordan.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDSON-JORDAN: Aye on
6 all.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Riley.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Aye on all.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Aye.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Sanchez.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Aye on all.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Schulman.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER SCHULMAN: Aye on all, and
15 I want to congratulate Chair Sanchez, especially
16 since I'm a rent stabilized tenant.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Council Member
18 Stevens.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Aye on all.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Ung.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER UNG: Aye on all.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Velazquez.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER VELAZQUEZ: Aye on all.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Vernikov.
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

81

COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Aye on all
except M15 and M16 with accompanying Resolutions 75
and 76.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Williams.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Won.

COUNCIL MEMBER WON: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Yeger.

COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Aye on all with the
exception of M16, accompanying Resolution 76, and
consistent with how I voted in the past on these
topics, I vote no on M33 and 34 and accompanying
Resolutions 73 and 74 and Resolutions 19 and 59.
Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. One moment.
Borelli.

COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: I vote aye on all
except Intro 70, M15 and accompanying Resolution 75,
M16 and accompanying Resolution 76. Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Powers.

MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: With a very big
congratulations to Council Member Sanchez on her
first and very important bill that hopefully becomes
law, I vote aye.

1
2 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Adams.

3 SPEAKER ADAMS: Congratulations once again
4 to Chair Sanchez on this very important legislation.
5 With that, I do vote aye on all.

6 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: All items on
7 today's General Order calendar adopted by a vote of
8 50 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative, and 0
9 abstentions with the exception of M15 and Resolution
10 75 which is adopted by a vote a 45 in the affirmative
11 and 5 in the negative and 0 abstentions, and M16 and
12 Resolution 76 which is adopted by a vote of 42 in the
13 affirmative, 8 in the negative, 0 abstentions, Intro
14 70 which is adopted by a vote of 48 in the
15 affirmative, 2 in the negative, 0 abstentions,
16 Resolution 19 which is adopted by a vote of 49 in the
17 affirmative, 1 in the negative, and 0 abstentions,
18 and M33 and 34 with Resolutions which is adopted by a
19 vote of 49 in the affirmative, 1 in the negative, 0
20 abstentions.

21 We are now going to move into the
22 discussion of Resolutions. My apologies. Introduction
23 and Reading of Bills.
24
25

1
2 SPEAKER ADAMS: All bills have been
3 referred to Committee's as indicated on today's
4 agenda.

5 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Got it. Thanks.
6 We are now going into move into discussion of
7 Resolutions, and I'll call (INAUDIBLE) just as a
8 reminder, on resolutions, this is a voice vote. If
9 you wish to vote against or abstain from any of the
10 resolutions that we're voting on today, you can
11 notify the Legislative Documents Unit by email or you
12 can approach the dais now and give them your vote.
13 Before we go into the voice vote, we are now going to
14 call on Council Members to speak on the resolutions
15 that we're voting on today, and we are going to start
16 with Council Member Hanif.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Thank you so much.
18 Take 2. First, I would just like to thank all my
19 Colleagues who reached out to me showing their
20 compassion and checking in. I just got my left hip
21 replaced for the second time because of lupus. I'm
22 healing very well, and I can't wait to see you all at
23 the end of this month, fully mobile.

24 I'm so proud to be voting in favor of my
25 first bill, Resolution 66, which calls on the State

1
2 to pass the Dignity Not Detention Act. This act would
3 prohibit localities within New York State from
4 entering into contracts with the federal government
5 for the purposes of immigration detention. Thank you
6 to Public Advocate Williams for introducing this bill
7 alongside me and to 10 Council Members who have
8 joined as cosponsors. Last Monday, I chaired a more
9 than 6-hour Immigration Committee hearing where we
10 heard from directly and formerly detained people
11 about the absolutely horrifying conditions at the ICE
12 facility in Orange County. This is a county jail in
13 the Mid-Hudson Valley that contracts with ICE to
14 detain New Yorkers in their custody. These are mostly
15 New York City residents, none of whom are facing any
16 criminal charges and they are solely being held for
17 civil immigration violations. At the hearing,
18 detained constituents detailed the harrowing
19 experiences including lack of healthcare, racist
20 staff, and inedible food. Nobody should have to live
21 like this. These New Yorkers should be back in their
22 communities where they can work and be with their
23 families. I want to thank the advocates, elected
24 officials, and formerly and currently detained
25 immigrants who shared their testimony and stories to

1
2 help this resolution advance to the floor today. I am
3 so proud to be part of the City Council that is
4 taking a bold stand against the inhumane practice of
5 immigration detention.

6 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. Before
7 we move on, I want to announce that we also had
8 Resolution 59 which was adopted by a vote of 49 in
9 the affirmative, 1 in the negative, and 0
10 abstentions. We are now going to go to Council Member
11 Vernikov.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Thank you. First
13 of all, I'd like to disagree with some of the
14 propaganda expressed here earlier by Council Member
15 Barron regarding Ukraine. I'd like to thank Speaker
16 Adams for her partnership as well as the
17 collaboration of Chair Dinowitz and the entire Jewish
18 caucus in bringing forth this resolution. I'd also
19 like to thank Council Member Hudson for bringing
20 forth her resolution which condemns Russian
21 aggression and calls for stronger sanctions on
22 Russia. Our 2 resolutions go hand in hand, and I
23 encourage my Colleagues to vote yes on Resolution 67.
24 In the last 2 weeks, President Putin has unleashed a
25 violent, unprovoked assault on liberty in Ukraine.

1
2 His aggression has triggered a humanitarian crisis
3 with ramifications across the globe. Despite Putin's
4 arrogance, the people of Ukraine have stood strong,
5 defending their homeland with remarkable courage and
6 strength. As a Ukrainian-born American, I have been
7 incredibly touched by the outpouring of support that
8 has flown from my fellow New Yorkers. In my District,
9 we have organized planeloads of humanitarian and
10 medical aid and sent them to the border. The last 2
11 weeks have been a challenging and frightening time
12 for Ukrainians as they fight for democracy in the
13 face of violence and tyranny. A shining spot of hope
14 has been the incredible support of good people across
15 the world, including here in the United States. Here
16 in New York City, folks have rallied together to
17 support frontline fighters in Ukraine, the refugees
18 who are forced to flee their homes, and the 150,000
19 Ukrainian-born New Yorkers, and here in the Council
20 my Colleagues have similarly demonstrated their
21 support. The New York City Council's action today
22 sends a strong message to the people of Ukraine. We
23 stand with you as you fight for your right to life,
24 liberty, and peace. Thank you so much.

1
2 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll
3 go to Council Member Hudson, Council Member Osse,
4 Council Member Caban, Council Member Kagan. Thanks.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Thank you. Today,
6 I'm introducing a resolution condemning Russia's
7 invasion of Ukraine and calling upon Congress and
8 President Joseph R. Biden to increase and expand the
9 severity of sanctions imposed on Russia. As a nation,
10 we've quickly mobilized our support for Ukraine and
11 condemned Russia and President Vladimir Putin for
12 violating Ukrainian sovereignty. The Russian military
13 has destroyed hospitals, schools, and apartments,
14 killed thousands of Ukrainians, and displaced more
15 than 2 million residents. Russia has committed the
16 most serious military intervention in Europe since
17 World War 2. Russia's actions have been met with near
18 universal condemnation with politicians of all
19 ideologies criticizing Putin's actions and calling
20 for a swift response. This resolution shows that we,
21 the New York City Council, stand in solidarity with
22 the people of Ukraine and urge the Biden
23 administration to use all diplomatic means available
24 including stronger sanctions to stop the Russian
25 encroachment of Ukrainian sovereignty and halt

1
2 Vladimir Putin's egomaniacal land grab. It is also my
3 hope that we stand in solidarity with the black and
4 brown New Yorkers who are from and have family in
5 other countries plagued by similar circumstances of
6 violence and displacement. It may come as a surprise
7 to most that a black queer woman would have any
8 interest in what's happening in Ukraine and Russia. I
9 tend to focus my advocacy and efforts on issues here
10 in New York, particularly those relating to black and
11 brown folks and my constituents in Central Brooklyn,
12 but my District is made up of many immigrant
13 families, some of whom are from Eastern Europe. If a
14 black queer woman can champion a resolution relating
15 to a foreign conflict in Eastern Europe, then
16 certainly any of us could lend our voices to and
17 advocate for the black and brown folks of nations
18 like Haiti, Honduras, and Syria as they face military
19 and humanitarian conflicts that threaten the
20 existence of their traditions, family, and homelands.
21 This resolution can mark the beginning of a shift,
22 one that defines us as a legislative body guided by
23 unwavering love, compassion, and support for all
24 marginalized groups, not just some. Let this be a
25 lesson to us. The way we're standing up for all

1
2 Ukrainians is how we as a legislative body and as a
3 nation should stand up for all refugees seeking
4 asylum here in the United States. Thank you.

5 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We're
6 going to go to Council Member Osse followed by
7 Council Member Caban.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSE: Thank you. I commend
9 Council Member Vernikov and Council Member Hudson for
10 their steadfast leadership on both of these
11 resolutions. I do want to acknowledge some of the
12 same sentiments that I shared in our Committee
13 hearing yesterday or committee vote yesterday. The
14 approach we are taking to Ukrainian refugees is noble
15 and I'm warm to see the nations of the world extend
16 this welcome to the victims of Russia's bloodthirsty
17 war. We must take the same approach to Haitian
18 refugees who are instead met with ICE agents on
19 horseback brutalizing them at the border and Syrian
20 refugees who like the Ukrainians seek sanctuary from
21 war. The world is showing it is capable of humane and
22 welcoming treatment towards refugees. Let's ensure
23 black and brown refugees can receive it too. I
24 condemn Vladimir Putin's ruthless aggression and call
25 on our state and federal leaders to take stronger

1
2 action to weaken his army and his hand. I stand in
3 solidarity with the proud Ukrainian people and,
4 again, I commend the 2 Council Members for both of
5 their resolutions. Thank you.

6 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Incredible
7 timing. Go to Council Member Caban followed Council
8 Member Kagan.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CABAN: Thank you. I want
10 to make clear that I am no expert in foreign policy
11 and I want to emphasize that I strongly condemn the
12 Russian military's invasion and give my wholehearted
13 support for the resolution in favor of humanitarian
14 aid for displaced Ukrainians.

15 However, my understanding is that in
16 places like Venezuela and Iran, broad-based punishing
17 sanctions have not resulted in the governmental
18 changes sought by US policy makers but rather poverty
19 and hunger among everyday Venezuelans and Iranians so
20 I don't wish to punish the everyday people of Russia,
21 many of whom are courageously standing up against
22 Putin's war. If we want to target Putin's inner
23 circle, we have a good way of doing that. Luxury real
24 estate in New York City is one of the favorite
25 investment pursuits of the Russian ruling class that

1
2 supports Putin, and I agree with Manhattan Borough
3 President that we should be seizing those assets.
4 With these considerations in mind, I vote no on
5 Resolution 67. Thank you.

6 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll
7 go to Council Member Kagan followed by Council Member
8 Narcisse.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KAGAN: Thank you. First of
10 all, I would like again to thank Council Member
11 Hudson and Council Member Vernikov for their
12 resolutions expressing solidarity with Ukraine and
13 also support the idea of Resolution 20 to make CUNY
14 more affordable. I am a proud product of CUNY. I'm a
15 graduate of Borough College and (INAUDIBLE) to
16 Borough College fund and a member of Borough College
17 Alumni Association, but this resolution does not
18 provide mechanism to pay for this, and maybe this is
19 like calling for another tax and another cut of
20 social services or anything like this, I would be
21 against it. I would abstain on Resolution 20 and I
22 will support all other resolutions. Thank you so
23 much.

24 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll
25 hear now from Council Member Narcisse.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: I want to say
3 thank you to Council Member Hudson (INAUDIBLE).
4 Growing up in a country which I experienced political
5 unrest, which is Haiti, tragic natural disasters,
6 extreme poverty and so much more, I can somewhat
7 understand what the people of Ukraine are now facing.
8 We're saying the people of Ukraine, not the
9 government, which is why my heart breaks for the
10 Ukraine people as I watch the horrors of war in their
11 country broadcast on the news. Ukraine did nothing to
12 provoke this war, and they deserve any reasonable
13 assistance our country can provide. I join the call
14 to ask President Biden to increase sanctions against
15 Russia and help put an end to this senseless
16 bloodshed. I have to go (INAUDIBLE) for my Council
17 Member Hanif. As an immigrant, I know firsthand why
18 individuals travel, sometimes by any means necessary
19 to the shore of the United States. These individuals
20 are seeking a better life and do not belong in cages
21 or be in bars often separated from their families.
22 Immigration is a fundamental part of the American
23 dream and a testament to the promise our great nation
24 holds. Hostility and cruelty to immigrants should not
25 be welcome here, and this resolution makes it clear

1
2 that the torch held high in New York Harbor still
3 burns as a beacon of light for those yearning to
4 breathe free. I commend Councilwoman Hanif, and I am
5 proud to be cosponsor of this resolution and call for
6 the Dignity Not Detention act passing into law. Thank
7 you, and obviously I support it.

8 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. Do we
9 have any other Council Members who'd like to speak on
10 the resolutions that we're voting on today? Okay.
11 Thank you. We're now going to have a voice vote on
12 today's resolutions. Again, if you wish to vote
13 against or abstain from any of today's resolutions,
14 please notify the Legislative Documents Unit by email
15 or approaching the dais now. I'll read today's
16 resolutions into the record, and then we will take a
17 vote on each one in order.

18 Resolution 20 calls on the New York State
19 Legislature to pass and the Governor to sign the New
20 Deal for CUNY, Senate Bill 4461 and Assembly Bill
21 5843, which are intended to reestablish the City
22 University of New York as an engine for social and
23 economic mobility by waiving all tuition and creating
24 certain staff to student ratios in order to increase
25 student success. All those in favor, please say aye.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAMBERS: Aye.

MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: All opposed? Any abstentions?

COUNCIL MEMBER KAGAN: Abstain.

MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Pass. The ayes have it. Just waiting one second.

Preconsidered Resolution 66 calls on the New York State Legislature to pass and the Governor to sign Senate Bill 7373 and Assembly Bill 7099 which prohibit governmental entities from entering into agreements to house individuals in immigrant detention facilities. Will all those in favor please say aye.

CHAMBERS: Aye.

MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: All nays?

CHAMBERS: Nay.

MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Any abstentions?

COUNCIL MEMBER UNKNOWN: Sorry, could I...

MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: We're voting now so I think it's (INAUDIBLE) apologies. The ayes have it.

We are now going to vote on Preconsidered Resolution 67 which condemns Russia's invasion of Ukraine and calls upon Congress and President Joseph

1
2 R. Biden to increase and expand the severity of
3 sanctions opposed on Russia. Will all those in favor
4 please say aye?

5 CHAMBERS: Aye.

6 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: All opposed?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CABAN: Nay.

8 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Any abstentions?

9 The ayes have it.

10 Lastly, Preconsidered Resolution 72
11 expresses support for the people of Ukraine. Would
12 all those in favor say aye?

13 CHAMBERS: Aye.

14 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: All opposed say
15 nay. Any abstentions? The ayes have it.

16 Thank you. We'll now move into General
17 Discussion. We will begin with Council Member Menin.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Thank you so much.

19 New York City is facing an ongoing affordable
20 childcare crisis. The pandemic heightened stress of
21 parents who are already making tough decisions about
22 how to care for their infants or toddlers and their
23 children. This is a deeply personal issue to me as a
24 mother of 4 children myself. Parents are being pushed
25 out of the workforce because they can't enroll their

1
2 children in programs that provide proper care and
3 support. Often, if they can find a program, there are
4 exorbitant costs that make it out of reach. That's
5 why today I'm proud to introduce Resolution 69 which
6 calls on the New York State Legislature to pass and
7 the Governor to sign legislation that will make
8 universal childcare a reality for all New Yorkers. I
9 want to thank my Colleagues, Council Member Caban,
10 Council Member Osse, Council Member Restler, and
11 Public Advocate Jamani (phonetic) Williams, who are
12 already signed on as prime cosponsors. As we envision
13 the future of our City, we have to strengthen the
14 support system needed to meet the demand for
15 excellent childcare. Centers around the city severely
16 lack resources and they can't adequately pay
17 childcare providers or retain qualified staff. this
18 childcare crisis has a ripple effect throughout our
19 City and I urge everyone to join in signing on to the
20 resolution. Thank you.

21 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. I now
22 have Council Member Nurse.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: Thank you, Majority
24 Leader. I just want to highlight the introduction of
25 Resolution 55 in support of an extended producer

1
2 responsibility bill at the state level, and I want to
3 thank the Speaker for bringing this forward. Over the
4 past few years, New York City has seen a major
5 increase in paper and plastic waste that is creating
6 additional barriers on our pathway to zero waste and
7 added stress to our aging and inequitable waste
8 infrastructure. Governor Hochul and the State Senate
9 have begun to advance EPR this session, and it is
10 critically important for New York City stakeholders
11 to shape this so it is rooted in zero waste and
12 environmental justice. As one of the largest
13 municipal waste management operations in the country,
14 the Department of Sanitation stands to benefit
15 greatly in financial resources to support our
16 operation. Four Borough based solid waste advisory
17 boards, the Department of Sanitation, and other
18 advocates are engaging to ensure we establish a
19 strong and equitable framework for the program and
20 one that provides accountability. I urge the Governor
21 to adopt their recommendations before moving it
22 forward. This is a huge step towards ending the
23 ongoing public subsidy of a free utility to
24 corporations who take no responsibility for the end
25 cycle of their products. I hope you all join us in

1
2 sponsoring this resolution, and thank you again to
3 Speaker Adams for bringing this forward.

4 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We are
5 now going to go to Council Member Sanchez.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Good afternoon,
7 everyone. Today, alongside Council Member Tiffany
8 Caban and Council Member Amanda Farias with the
9 support of Comptroller Brad Lander, I am proud to be
10 introducing a resolution calling on New York State
11 Legislature to not renew Section 421a of the real
12 property tax law. Enacted in 1971, a drastically
13 different context for New York City than it is today,
14 421a is a property tax exemption in New York that is
15 given to real estate developers for building new
16 multifamily residential housing in New York City. In
17 its 51 years of existence, 421a has subsidized luxury
18 units at the expense of tax-paying New Yorkers. 421a
19 costs the City 1.7 billion dollars in forgone revenue
20 in 2021 alone, making it the single biggest tax break
21 in New York State, and I would point out to my
22 Colleagues that a majority of advertised income-
23 restricted units were set at the middle income rents
24 of 130 percent of the area median income. That's the
25 equivalent for a family of 4 who makes 155,000

1
2 dollars and pays 3,000 dollars in rent. Our taxpayer
3 dollars are subsidizing that. In a city where 75
4 percent of New Yorkers cannot afford the units that
5 are set aside through this program, 421a does not aid
6 in providing low-income New Yorkers with the
7 affordable homes they need. I am proud to cosponsor
8 this resolution, and I look forward to working with
9 our Colleagues in the State and in the City in
10 ushering a new program that will secure affordable
11 housing for our constituents. Thank you.

12 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We're
13 going to go Council Member Farias followed by Council
14 Member Krishnan.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Thank you,
16 Majority Leader. Today, I introduce my first bill as
17 a Member of this Body, a resolution calling on our
18 State Legislature and the Governor to sign and
19 restore higher education funding for people in
20 prison. Now that Pell grants have been reinstated for
21 people in prison, it is time for New York State to
22 restore to New York State tuition assistance programs
23 eligibility. Lifting the ban on TAP for people in
24 prison is a simple, easy, and uncontroversial step to
25 promoting educational equity, strengthening

1
2 democracy, and building racial justice. Restoring TAP
3 would account for less than 1 percent of the overall
4 1.1 billion dollar TAP budget, all while boosting
5 economic security and upward economic mobility. We
6 can no longer justify excluding marginalized
7 communities impacted by mass incarceration from
8 access to higher education. Restoring TAP is a step
9 to promote educational equity and close the racial
10 wealth gap in our communities. Black and brown people
11 are disproportionately represented in the prison
12 system historically and presently. 61 percent of
13 Latinx New Yorkers and 45 percent of black New
14 Yorkers do not have a college degree. Our government
15 should not prevent any single person that lives
16 within our communities from pursuing a higher
17 education. Our role is to provide more opportunities
18 and additional options within our educational system,
19 not squander them. We need to continue the work
20 countering systemic failures by finding meaningful
21 solutions for justice-impacted people. I urge my
22 Colleagues here today both in person and virtually to
23 sign on to this resolution to support our commitment
24 to educational equity and racial justice by restoring
25 TAP. Thank you.

1
2 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We are
3 now going to go to Council Member Krishnan followed
4 by Council Member Abreu.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: Thank you so
6 much, Majority Leader Powers, for accommodating me
7 and my belated...

8 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: My apologies. I
9 did not get (INAUDIBLE) on the resolution.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: Don't worry. I
11 just wanted to go on record regarding Resolution 66
12 and first say a big thank you and congratulations to
13 my Colleague and Chair Shahana Hanif for her
14 leadership on this issue calling for the New York
15 State Legislature to pass Dignity Not Detention act.
16 In the Immigration Committee hearing, we heard
17 disturbing testimony of what has been happening at
18 Orange County Jail, solitary confinement, retaliation
19 against hunger strikers, and overall horrific civil
20 rights abuses against those who are incarcerated
21 there. As evidenced by the testimony we heard at the
22 Committee, immigration detention is cruel,
23 unnecessary, and inhumane, and immigrants should be
24 with their families and their communities, not in
25 detention centers, especially where there are blatant

1
2 civil rights abuses. At the time of the hearing, the
3 officials of the Orange County Jail failed to have
4 the courage to show up to account for their behavior
5 and to be accountable for their actions. I do
6 remember reading one article as I had mentioned
7 during the hearing where an Orange County official
8 had said that the actions of the hunger strikers was
9 not some sort of Gandian thing, which I find deeply
10 offensive as the first Indian-American City Council
11 Member in this body. When I see hunger strikers as an
12 incarcerated people taking action to protect their
13 rights, I have seen Gandian principles at work in
14 civil disobedience and acting out against injustices
15 and so in solidarity with those who are incarcerated
16 at Orange County Jail and in solidarity with all
17 those who are in detention and incarcerated in our
18 horrific immigration penal system, I proudly have
19 casted a vote in favor of this resolution and urge
20 New York State to join the movement to provide
21 dignity for immigrant families and not detention and
22 end detention in this State. Thank you.

23 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll
24 now go to Council Member Abreu followed by Council
25 Member Caban and Brewer.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: First, I want to
3 congratulate Pierina Sanchez for her leadership on
4 the rent stabilization. We have a lot of rent
5 stabilized tenants between the Heights and the West
6 Bronx. I am also excited to be doing a joint hearing
7 with Pierina with Housing in the State (INAUDIBLE)
8 Legislation to discuss 421a next month. I think
9 there's a lot of reform that needs to be done there
10 to achieve true affordability for the residents and
11 working-class families of New York City. Thank you so
12 much.

13 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll
14 now go to Council Member Caban followed by Council
15 Member Brewer.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CABAN: Thank you. I'm
17 really excited and proud to have worked on Resolution
18 64 with Comptroller Lander and Housing and Buildings
19 Chair Sanchez, a resolution calling on the New York
20 State Legislature to not renew the 421a program. As
21 was mentioned before and as many folks know, 421a
22 first created in 1971 to subsidize the creation of
23 "affordable housing" cost New York City 1.7 billion
24 dollars in foregone revenue in 2021 making it the
25 single biggest tax break in the New York State

1 budget. What are we getting for that tax break?
2 Research has shown that a majority of 421a units
3 built since 2017 are set at 130 percent AMI, 75
4 percent of New Yorkers can't afford units at 130
5 percent AMI, and while the subsidized units are
6 supposed to be rent stabilized, enforcement is non-
7 existent leaving tenants at risk. This program is a
8 massive developer giveaway for a pathetic amount of
9 real affordable units and (INAUDIBLE) should scrap
10 the program entirely and we should instead focus all
11 of our efforts on reworking the City's broken
12 property tax system and on building the new programs,
13 tools, and laws to meaningfully address our City's
14 housing crisis so I urge my Colleagues and invite
15 them to sign on as sponsors of this resolution today.
16 Thank you.

17
18 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. To
19 close us out, we'll hear from Council Member Brewer.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you very
21 much. First, I want to the legislative staff for
22 helping my staff to draft all of these Intros, one in
23 particular, Intro 77. One of the issues is if there
24 is a tenant who ends up on one of these lists, called
25 a black list, not a great name, then it's very hard

1
2 to get another apartment and sometimes it has nothing
3 to do with their situation. Sometimes buildings are
4 emptied because they have end of 421a, end of day 51,
5 everybody has to leave, it's a long story, and they
6 end up in housing court and it ends up being a list
7 that they do not want to be on so we should not have
8 those lists. Accompanying although different
9 (INAUDIBLE) which it will go to is Intro 80, which
10 has to do with some of the Bureaus that license some
11 of these lists that I think should not exist. I just
12 want to bring them to your attention but mostly I
13 want to thank the staff for so much work. Thank you
14 very much.

15 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. Would
16 any Council Members like to speak in General
17 Discussion? Okay. I'll now call on Speaker Adrienne
18 Adams to close today's Stated Meeting.

19 SPEAKER ADAMS: The Stated Meeting of
20 March 10, 2022, is hereby adjourned. Have a great
21 afternoon.
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date March 29, 2022