

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

STATED MEETING OF THE
NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL

----- X

November 3, 2022
Start: 2:04 p.m.
Recess: 2:50 p.m.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Adrienne E. Adams, Speaker

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

- Speaker Adrienne Adams
- Shaun Abreu
- Joann Ariola
- Alexa Avilés
- Diana Ayala
- Charles Barron
- Erik Bottcher
- Justin L. Brannan
- Gale A. Brewer
- Selvena N. Brooks-Powers
- Joseph C. Borelli
- Tiffany Cabán
- David M. Carr
- Carmen De La Rosa
- Eric Dinowitz
- Amanda Farias
- Oswald Feliz
- James Gennaro
- Jennifer Gutiérrez
- Kamillah Hanks

Shahana Hanif
Robert F. Holden
Crystal Hudson
Rita Joseph
Ari Kagan
Shekar Krishnan
Linda Lee
Farah N. Louis
Christopher Marte
Darlene Mealy
Francisco P. Moya
Mercedes Narcisse
Sandy Nurse
Chi A. Ossé
Keith Powers
Lincoln Restler
Kristin Richardson Jordan
Kevin C. Riley
Carlina Rivera
Pierina Ana Sanchez
Lynn Schulman
Althea Stevens
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Sandra Ung
Marjorie Velázquez
Inna Vernikov
Nantasha Williams
Julie Won
Kalman Yeger

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

2 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: ...of November 3 2022,
3 Majority Leader Keith Powers. I'd like to thank you
4 for joining us here today if you would like to follow
5 along the agenda for today's meeting is posted on the
6 city council website.

7 COUNSEL: Please join us for the Pledge of
8 Allegiance.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise.

10 ALL: I pledge to the Republic for which it
11 stands, one nation under God, indivisible with
12 liberty and justice for all.

13 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Roll call

14 CLERK: Abreu?

15 COUNCILMEMBER ABREU: Present.

16 CLERK: Ariola?

17 COUNCILMEMBER ARIOLA: Present.

18 CLERK: Avilés?

19 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Presente.

20 CLERK: Ayala?

21 COUNCILMEMBER AYALA: Here.

22 CLERK: Barron?

23 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: Here.

24 CLERK: Bottcher?

25 COUNCILMEMBER BOTTCHER: Here.

2 CLERK: Brannan?

3 COUNCILMEMBER BRANNAN: Here.

4 CLERK: Brewer?

5 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Here.

6 CLERK: Brooks-Powers?

7 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Here.

8 CLERK: Cabán?

9 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Present.

10 CLERK: Carr?

11 COUNCILMEMBER CARR: Present.

12 CLERK: De La Rosa?

13 COUNCILMEMBER DE LA ROSA: Present.

14 CLERK: Dinowitz?

15 COUNCILMEMBER DINOWITZ: Present.

16 CLERK: Farias?

17 COUNCILMEMBER FARIAS: Present.

18 CLERK: Feliz?

19 COUNCILMEMBER FELIZ: Present.

20 CLERK: Gennaro?

21 COUNCILMEMBER GENNARO: Present.

22 CLERK: Gutiérrez?

23 COUNCILMEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Present.

24 CLERK: Hanif?

25 COUNCILMEMBER HANIF: Here.

2 CLERK: Hanks?

3 COUNCILMEMBER HANKS: Present.

4 CLERK: Holden?

5 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: Present.

6 CLERK: Hudson?

7 COUNCILMEMBER HUDSON: Present.

8 CLERK: Joseph?

9 COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: Present.

10 CLERK: Kagan?

11 COUNCILMEMBER KAGAN: Present.

12 CLERK: Krishnan?

13 COUNCILMEMBER KRISHNAN: Here.

14 CLERK: Lee?

15 COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Here.

16 CLERK: Louis?

17 COUNCILMEMBER LOUIS: Present.

18 CLERK: Marte?

19 COUNCILMEMBER MARTE: Present.

20 CLERK: Mealy?

21 COUNCILMEMBER MEALY: Present.

22 CLERK: Menin?

23 CLERK: Moya?

24 COUNCILMEMBER MOYA: Present.

25 CLERK: Narcisse?

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

7

2 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: Present.

3 CLERK: Nurse?

4 COUNCILMEMBER NURSE: Present.

5 CLERK: Ossé?

6 COUNCILMEMBER OSSÉ: Present.

7 CLERK: Paladino?

8 CLERK: Restler?

9 COUNCILMEMBER RESTLER: Present.

10 CLERK: Richardson Jordan?

11 COUNCILMEMBER RICHARDSON JORDAN: Present.

12 CLERK: Riley?

13 COUNCILMEMBER RILEY: Present.

14 CLERK: Rivera?

15 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: Present.

16 CLERK: Salamanca?

17 COUNCILMEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.

18 CLERK: Sanchez?

19 COUNCILMEMBER SANCHEZ: Present.

20 CLERK: Schulman?

21 COUNCILMEMBER SCHULMAN: Here.

22 CLERK: Stevens?

23 COUNCILMEMBER Stevens: Here.

24 CLERK: Ung?

25 COUNCILMEMBER UNG: Present.

2 CLERK: Velázquez?

3 COUNCILMEMBER VELÁZQUEZ: Present.

4 CLERK: Vernikov?

5 COUNCILMEMBER VERNIKOV: Present.

6 CLERK: Williams?

7 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: Present.

8 CLERK: Won?

9 COUNCILMEMBER WON: Present.

10 CLERK: Yeger?

11 COUNCILMEMBER YEGER: Here.

12 CLERK: Borelli?

13 COUNCILMEMBER BORELLI: Here.

14 CLERK: Powers?

15 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Here.

16 CLERK: Speaker Adams?

17 SPEAKER ADAMS: Present.

18 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll now
19 have today's invocation delivered by Father Brian
20 Dowd of St. Patrick's Roman Catholic church located
21 at 9511/4 Avenue in Brooklyn.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise.

23 FATHER DOWD: Let us take a moment to prepare
24 ourselves for prayer. Let us pray. Glorious God,
25 you promised to open doors of blessing and abundance

2 for all your people. We ask that you would work
3 mightily in this great city council today. May your
4 spirit cause the members to have a productive
5 meeting, broaden their perspective, and lead each one
6 of them to make fruitful contributions, building up
7 the many communities of our great city. God of
8 Wisdom, we pray that you will bless our city, our
9 mayor, and our city council members. We give thanks
10 for the ways of service that they have chosen to take
11 up on behalf of all the citizens. Help them to have
12 the eyes to see how lives are all connected, and how
13 the common good is upheld when we listen and respond
14 to those most vulnerable among us. We pray that your
15 kingdom would come to New York City as it is in
16 heaven, through your power, working in each of these
17 Your servants. May our truth be revealed. May your
18 light shine brighter. May the voices of those most
19 silence be heard louder and clearer. Defend their
20 cause, oh God, through this governing body. And
21 recognizing your image in each person, we present
22 this our prayer today. Amen. God bless you.

23 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We will now
24 call on the councilmember from Bay Ridge, Justin
25 Brannan, to spread the invocation on the record.

2 COUNCILMEMBER BRANNON: Thank you Majority
3 Leader. Thank you Father Dowd. Father Dowd's family
4 immigrated from Ireland. He was ordained by Bishop
5 Daley back in 1991. Most importantly, Bay Ridge is
6 happy to have stolen Father Dowd back from Queens,
7 and now we have him in Bay Ridge as pastor of St.
8 Patrick Roman Catholic Church. I want to thank
9 Father Dowd for being here and make a motion for
10 unanimous consent to spread the invocation in full
11 upon the record.

12 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you, Councilmember
13 Brannon. We are now going to have the adoption of
14 the minutes by Councilmember Rafael Salamanca.

15 COUNCILMEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you. I make a
16 motion... I make a motion that the minutes of the
17 stated meeting of October 12, 2022, be adopted and as
18 printed.

19 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. Messages and
20 papers from the mayor?

21 COUNSEL: None.

22 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Communication from city
23 county and borough offices?

24 COUNSEL: None.

2 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Petitions and
3 communications?

4 COUNSEL: None.

5 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Land use call ups?

6 COUNSEL: None.

7 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll now
8 have communication from Speaker Adrian Adams.

9 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you so much Majority
10 Leader. Good afternoon, everyone. Hi. I'd like to
11 remind everyone that Tuesday, November 8, is indeed
12 Election Day. I know, I don't have to tell anyone in
13 this room. But let's remind everyone else that if
14 they have not already voted during early voting,
15 please, please exercise this fundamental right that
16 is a pillar of our democracy. And please don't
17 forget to flip the ballot to vote on the four ballot
18 proposals that are up for consideration this
19 November, including three initiatives that were
20 developed by the New York City Racial Justice
21 Commission. And I want to thank all of the
22 councilmembers who participated in the council's
23 racial justice ballot Day of Action last week to
24 engage and educate New Yorkers about the ballot

2 proposals. Let's continue to get the message out and
3 urge all New Yorkers to flip the ballot on Tuesday.

4 Before we continue, I do want to take a moment to
5 honor the life of Reverend Dr. Calvin Butts. We lost
6 Dr. Butts on October 28. He was a great community
7 leader who dedicated his life to serving his beloved
8 Harlem and the entire state of New York. He led the
9 historic Abyssinian Baptist Church with such passion
10 and care, which extended to a stewardship of
11 Abyssinian Development Corporation, to SUNY Old
12 Westbury, and many other educational and community
13 institutions. Dr. Butts' legacy of public service,
14 community empowerment, justice and equity will live
15 on through the people he inspired and all New Yorkers
16 who have benefited from his actions. As a council we
17 will continue to uplift and honor his memory by
18 advancing many, many of his efforts for our city and
19 its people. Our prayers and condolences are with Dr.
20 Butz family, friends, and of course, the Abyssinian
21 Baptist Church community. I was privileged indeed to
22 call him a friend. And like all New Yorkers, I will
23 miss him dearly. Please join me in a moment of
24 silence to remember Reverend Dr. Calvin Butts.

25 [All rise.]

2 [15 seconds silence.]

3 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you. November is Puerto
4 Rican Heritage Month and as we begin the new month,
5 I... I want to honor the many contributions and
6 accomplishments of our Puerto Rican communities.
7 Puerto Rico is often considered New York City's sixth
8 borough because of our close relationship with the
9 island and its people. Puerto Rican New Yorkers
10 helped shape our city into what it is today, and it
11 is important We acknowledge those continuing
12 contributions not only throughout the month of
13 November, but every day. November is also National
14 Alzheimer's Disease Awareness Month. Alzheimer's
15 affects more than 6 million Americans, and it is
16 important that we recognize not just those who have
17 been diagnosed with this disease, but also the
18 families and caregivers who support them. I know
19 this is an important month for Aging chair,
20 Councilmember Crystal Hudson, whose care for her
21 mother brought her into this great work. I want to
22 thank Councilmember Hudson for her fierce advocacy
23 and leadership of the aging committee, and all
24 members who continue to advance the care we need for
25 older adults in our city. Thank you.

2 In a few days, colleagues, we will be observing
3 Veterans Day. That happens on November 11. And this
4 day is meaningful for all of us, especially veterans
5 and families of those who have served in the armed
6 forces. My father, my father in law, and my husband,
7 all served in the United States Air Force.

8 [APPLAUSE]

9 So as for many of you, this day is very personal
10 for me and for my family and I thank all of our
11 veterans for their service and sacrifice for our
12 nation. Have a very safe and meaningful Veterans
13 Day.

14 On November 6, don't forget to fall back one
15 hour. Grumble, grumble, grumble, for daylight
16 savings time and enjoy colleagues. Enjoy that extra
17 hour of sleep this weekend.

18 Family please help me to say happy birthday to
19 council member Lynn Schulman.

20 [APPLAUSE]

21 Happy birthday to you. Lynn, I hope you have a
22 wonderful birthday.

23 Now let's move on to our stated agenda. Today
24 we're voting on several legislative and finance
25 items. We will be voting on the following finance

2 item: Resolution 362, sponsored by Finance Chair
3 Justin Brannan, pertains to an increase in the annual
4 expenditure for the 125th Street and DUMBO business
5 improvement districts. This resolution sets the
6 date, time, and place for the hearing of the Local
7 Law, increasing the annual expenditure for these
8 bids. The council will also vote on important pieces
9 of legislation to help improve the diversity of the
10 New York City Fire Department, a struggle that has
11 been underway for decades.

12 Today, we're voting on a package of bills to
13 improve the Diversity, Equity and Inclusion practices
14 at the FDNY. Our city's firefighters define what it
15 means to be New York's Bravest. Their heroic work
16 saves lives every single day. And as the largest
17 fire department in the country, the FDNY responds to
18 over 1 million emergencies every year. As the mother
19 of an FDNY paramedic, I am incredibly proud of the
20 FDNY and our first responders. However, we cannot
21 deny that the fire department still does not
22 accurately reflect the rich diversity of our city.
23 The statistics are striking. The department is still
24 disproportionately made up of white men. Only 8% of
25 our firefighters are black. 13% are Latino, and just

2 2% are Asian. The gender... the gender disparities
3 are far worse. While we certainly celebrate the
4 appointment of Laura Cavanaugh as the first woman in
5 our city's history to serve as Commissioner of the
6 Department, the reality is that just 1% of
7 firefighters are women. The overall lack of
8 diversity within the FDNY is something we must
9 address, and as a council we are committed to
10 advancing solutions that can help correct this
11 historic injustice. This critical set of bills we're
12 voting on today are focused on boosting diversity in
13 the department by requiring the implementation of
14 substantial efforts confronting exclusionary
15 practices that undermine diversity and increasing
16 transparency on the FDNY is ability to maintain a
17 diverse workforce free from harassment and
18 discrimination.

19 Before we get into the specific bills, I do want
20 to acknowledge the work of so many advocates who have
21 fought for decades to increase diversity in the FDNY.
22 Organizations like the Vulcan Society have been
23 leaders and partners in this work, and the many
24 firefighters who are women and people of color have
25 blazed a trail and fought for equitable treatment and

2 equal representation. This legislation comes out of
3 years of efforts by so many of them who continue to
4 advocate fight and push without the scale and
5 strength of backup and support that exists today. I
6 also want to thank the council's Black, Latino and
7 Asian caucus for its leadership on this package of
8 Bill's, as well as our fire and emergency management
9 committee chair Joann Ariola, for shepherding through
10 for shepherding it through the committee.

11 The first bill is my own, Intro 516A that would
12 require the FDNY and consultation with the Department
13 of citywide Administrative Services to develop and
14 implement a plan for the recruitment and retention of
15 firefighters from underrepresented groups within the
16 department, including female firefighters and
17 firefighters of diverse racial and ethnic
18 backgrounds. The FDNY would also be required to
19 report annually on these efforts.

20 And I just want to say this about my own
21 legislation and this entire package: Achieving
22 diversity and equity requires more than just words.
23 It requires intentional planning, implementation,
24 transparency, and accountability. And that is what
25 these bills are all about. My legislation is focused

2 on requiring the type of planning and implementation
3 for recruiting and retaining firefighters from groups
4 that are underrepresented in the FDNY. It also
5 includes important transparency about these efforts
6 and their outcomes, and the council will be in the
7 position to hold the administration and FDNY
8 accountable. We know from history, that many
9 barriers have existed to stifle diversity in the
10 FDNY, from the firefighter exam being discriminatory
11 against women and applicants of color to hiring
12 practices, and it was not until 2014 Just eight years
13 ago, that the department settled a discrimination
14 lawsuit for \$98 million and agreed to make changes to
15 its hiring practices. By passing this package of
16 bills today, we hope to move the FDNY forward to
17 achieving a workforce fully reflective of the
18 diversity of our city.

19 The next bill is Intro 519. A sponsored by our
20 Fire and Emergency Management committee chair, Joann
21 Ariola. It would require the FDNY to survey each
22 firehouse to determine permanent facility upgrades
23 necessary to create a workplace environment that
24 supports a mixed gender workforce. Now, this is the
25 year 2022. And this is the legislation that we are

2 passing in the year 2022. The bill would also employ
3 interim measures to ensure privacy, including
4 physical barriers at locations awaiting such
5 upgrades.

6 Upon completing the survey, the department would
7 be required to report its findings to the council and
8 mayor and provide information related to any current
9 or forthcoming construction plans to make relevant
10 upgrades to areas such as bathrooms, changing unrest
11 areas and any interim measures taken at firehouses to
12 accommodate a mixed gender workforce until permanent
13 upgrades are made.

14 Next we will vote on the following bill sponsored
15 by Councilmember Kevin Riley, Intro 552A would
16 require the FDNY to produce an annual report on the
17 number of firefighters assigned to each fire company,
18 and special operations unit within the department,
19 disaggregated by the gender and race or ethnicity of
20 such firefighters. Additionally, the FDNY will be
21 required to provide demographic information of the
22 population residing in the immediate service area of
23 each fire company in the city. This will provide
24 information revealing whether the demographics at a
25 firehouse actually reflect the community that they

2 serve. Introduction 553 A would require the FDNY, in
3 consultation with the Department of Citywide
4 Administrative Services, to develop and implement a
5 plan to provide the annual training and education to
6 all employees regarding diversity and inclusion,
7 including on the department's anti-harassment and
8 anti-discrimination policies. Firehouses where
9 multiple instances of harassment or discrimination
10 take place would receive additional targeted and
11 interactive training.

12 Lastly, we will be voting on Intro 568 sponsored
13 by Councilmember Nantasha Williams. This bill would
14 require the FDNY to produce an annual report on
15 complaints filed with the department's Equal
16 Employment Opportunity office regarding potential
17 violations of the city's Equal Employment Opportunity
18 policy. The report would include information on the
19 number of complaints that were received and closed
20 during the prior year. Information on types of
21 misconduct alleged in such complaints, and case
22 outcomes including any corrective action taken by the
23 department. We want to thank staff Rachel Cordero,
24 Josh Kingsley, and William Hangac.

2 Thank you for your attention. Now I turn it back
3 into the hands of our Majority Leader.

4 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you, Speaker
5 Adams. We're now going to move in discussion of
6 general orders. We will first hear from
7 Councilmember Williams.

8 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you. I am
9 thrilled to cast my vote today for my third bill to
10 pass this year, Intro 560 which will make the EEO
11 violations of the FDNY more transparent.

12 Since the DOJ Vulcan lawsuit against the FDNY in
13 2007, there have been regular public reports
14 regarding the hostile work environment within the
15 fire department faced by women, ethnic minorities,
16 and members of the LGBTQIA+ community.

17 Various news agencies have highlighted hazing
18 incidents within the firehouses, an issue that some
19 claim perpetuate the lack of diversity and attrition
20 issues within the department. In 2021 a lawsuit was
21 filed against Queens firefighters, who allegedly
22 hazed a rookie colleague for being Hispanic and
23 suffering from PTSD after his service in the
24 military. In 2022, and openly gay firefighters sued
25 the Department for discrimination based on his sexual

2 orientation and claiming he was repeatedly called
3 homophobic slurs. Additionally, following numerous
4 incidents of racist and discriminatory behavior
5 within the department, particularly during a time of
6 civil unrest following the murder of George Floyd in
7 2020, the FDNY initiated disciplinary actions against
8 nine members with punishments involving suspension
9 without pay up to six months for some offenders.
10 These incidents including the use of inappropriate
11 and racist comments made by uniformed firefighters is
12 something we are looking to address. Intro 560 would
13 help these issues by creating better transparency
14 around EEO complaints and corrective actions. I want
15 to thank all who helped to make this happen, past and
16 Present, Chair Ariola, and of course, Speaker Adams.

17 I would also like to congratulate my colleague,
18 Councilmember Riley, who also has bills in this
19 package, and I'm honored to have a bill as well so
20 that we can truly fight firefighter discrimination.
21 Thank you.

22 MAJORITY POWER: Thank you, we now call on a man
23 whose birthday is coming up as well in between this
24 stated and the next, Councilmember Kevin Riley.

2 COUNCILMEMBER RILEY: Thank you Majority Leader.

3 It is fitting and significant that in today's
4 historical diverse Council, we make our mark to
5 address the systematic disparities in our
6 infrastructure, as well as to create more welcoming
7 and safe workplaces for all New Yorkers. As Co-Chair
8 the Black Latino Asian caucus, it is a priority for
9 the caucus that all legislation passed through the
10 council upholds the true means of diversity and
11 inclusion that seeks to benefit and protect all New
12 Yorkers. And that's what Intro 552A, and 553A will
13 be doing.

14 I would like to thank my colleagues in government
15 for backing this transformative legislation, and also
16 the thing to Bronx Borough President, Vanessa Gibson,
17 for her hard work and partnership on these bills.

18 But most importantly, thank you to the Vulcan
19 Society, Arc Of Justice, and all the advocates. And
20 thank you to the FDNY. We are grateful to the
21 leadership service and sacrifices that our fire
22 members perform daily to keep our families and our
23 community safe. This package of legislation will
24 only strengthen the department and our city to ensure
25 that all our heroes are well supported and protected.

2 Our agencies operate at their best when they are
3 people that truly understand and represent the
4 communities that they serve. Thank you for this
5 opportunity to speak, Majority Leader.

6 MAJORITY LEADER: Thank you. Do we have anyone
7 else signed up to speak? Seeing none, we'll move to
8 the report of special committees.

9 COUNSEL: None.

10 MAJORITY LEADER: Oh, sorry. Hold on one second.
11 Sorry. We have Councilmember Barron.

12 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: Thank you very much, my
13 colleagues. You know, we've been on the Fire
14 Department for decades. When I was first here, Paul
15 Washington, who was a black firefighter, and head of
16 the Vulcan Society, we did the same kinds of things.
17 And you know what, the percentage is still the same:
18 7% black, 2% female. We've got to come down harder
19 on the Fire Department.

20 They also have complaints when they come into our
21 community, most white male firefighters, God forbid,
22 that you have a pot on fire, they'll wreck your whole
23 apartment, saying they're trying to put the fire out
24 on the pot on the stove. So this kind of stuff has
25 got to stop. When with this legislation, we have to

2 put more teeth into... once this legislation has
3 passed, we need to bring the fire department in here
4 constantly. And as a body, we need to go to the fire
5 department even if we have to continuously protest
6 until they pass... hire more of us and stop some
7 practices. In one instance, they had a noose in the
8 locker room in front of one of the firefighters. So
9 this has been like 20 or 30 years, and we've come up
10 with similar legislation. I appreciate all the work
11 that was done. I supported and voted for it 100%,
12 but when it comes to execution and implemented, no
13 pun intended, but the fire department needs heat.
14 They need some heat on their racist policies so that
15 we can make sure that we are respected. So thanks to
16 my colleagues for what you're doing. But we need to
17 get a little stronger because it's been decades. And
18 we have the same thing.

19 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: We'll now go to
20 Councilmember Feliz.

21 COUNCILMEMBER FELIZ: Thank you Majority Leader.
22 I want to start by thanking members of the fire
23 department every single day we see them risking their
24 lives to save the lives of people in burning
25 buildings. I'm very thankful for the service that

2 they do every single day at all hours. However,
3 we've had challenges with our fire department,
4 historical challenges obviously related to racial
5 diversity, gender diversity, and diversity in every
6 way. I want to thank my colleagues, Speaker Adams
7 BLAC Co-Chair, Kevin Reilly, Councilmember Natasha
8 Williams, for their leadership on these bills. We
9 live in a diverse city. We need to make sure that
10 every single government agency, including our fire
11 department, but every single other government agency
12 as well, is as diverse as... as our city. Diversity
13 creates strong fire departments. Diversity creates
14 strong communities. And we need to make sure that
15 everyone growing up in the city of New York,
16 regardless of your race, or gender, you could see
17 yourself and you could become a firefighter. So I
18 want to thank all of you for your work on these very
19 important beliefs. We're building a better New York
20 City for all of us and for future generations. Thank
21 you.

22 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We will
23 now... Seeing no other people signed up, we will now
24 move into the report of special committees.

25 COUNSEL: None.

2 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Reports of standing
3 committees.

4 COUNSEL: Report of the Committee on Finance,
5 Resolution 6... Excuse me 362, Business Improvement
6 Districts.

7 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

8 COUNSEL: Report of the Committee on Fire and
9 Emergency Management, Intro 516A, firefighter
10 recruitment and retention.

11 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and coupled on General
12 Orders.

13 COUNSEL: Intro 519A, firehouse surveys.

14 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and coupled on General
15 Orders.

16 COUNSEL: Intro 552A, demographic information
17 reporting.

18 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and coupled on General
19 Orders.

20 COUNSEL: Intro 553A, diversity and anti-
21 harassment training.

22 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and coupled on General
23 Orders.

24 COUNSEL: Intro 560A, reporting on employment
25 opportunity complaints.

2 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and coupled on General
3 Orders. I now ask the clerk take a roll call vote on
4 all of the items coupled on today's general orders
5 calendar.

6 COUNSEL: Williams.

7 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: I vote aye.

8 CLERK: Abreu?

9 COUNCILMEMBER ABREU: Aye.

10 CLERK: Ariola?

11 COUNCILMEMBER ARIOLA: Aye.

12 CLERK: Avilés?

13 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Aye.

14 CLERK: Ayala?

15 COUNCILMEMBER AYALA: Aye.

16 CLERK: Barron?

17 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: May I be excused to
18 explain my vote?

19 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

20 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: We also have a High School
21 of Fire Science in East New York. We fought hard for
22 that. And it's graduating a lot of black students.
23 And we just want to see if the City Council can
24 monitor that so that those graduates then become
25 firefighters and not just graduates. We had one from

2 East New York who moved up the ladder, saved some
3 lives, and he graduated right from the High School of
4 Fire Science. So one of the ways we can do that is
5 if more of our communities have high schools that
6 focus on fire science, and making sure that our black
7 and brown in particular, our children... our youth we
8 see that kind of attention and qualifications and
9 graduating degrees and be incorporated into the fire
10 department. I vote aye on all.

11 CLERK: Thank you. Bottcher?

12 COUNCILMEMBER BOTTCHEER: Aye on all.

13 CLERK: Brannan?

14 COUNCILMEMBER BRANNAN: Aye.

15 CLERK: Brewer?

16 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: I vote aye, and know that
17 the Fire Department still needs prevention officers
18 and inspections because they do not have enough.

19 CLERK: Brooks-Powers?

20 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Permission to
21 explain my vote.

22 MAJORITY LEADER: Go ahead.

23 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: I want to thank my
24 colleagues Speaker Adams, Chairwoman Ariola,
25 Councilmember Riley, and Councilmember Williams and

2 others for their work on this package of bills aimed
3 at increasing diversity, equity, and inclusion in the
4 FDNY. And that's why I'm a proud co-sponsor of the
5 entire suite of transformative legislation. The fire
6 department has made a meaningful effort over the last
7 few years to diversify its workforce, and I
8 appreciate the mayor's recent appointment of Laura
9 Kavanagh, the first ever woman to lead the fire
10 department. But the department as it's been said, a
11 few times already has a long history of
12 discrimination. And we all know the city has a long
13 way to go. In fact, it was a matter in my own
14 district that I've had to deal with over the course
15 of the last few months. So I am hopeful that this
16 legislation will bring the change that we would like
17 to see. These bills will help ensure women and
18 members of underrepresented communities can join the
19 fire department's ranks, and that they can be safe at
20 work.

21 So again, I appreciate the work of my colleagues
22 to move this package of legislation forward and with
23 that vote aye on all.

24 CLERK: Thank you. Cabán?

25 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Aye on all.

2 CLERK: Carr?

3 COUNCILMEMBER CARR: Aye on all.

4 CLERK: De La Rosa?

5 COUNCILMEMBER DE LA ROSA: Aye.

6 CLERK: Dinowitz?

7 COUNCILMEMBER DINOWITZ: Aye.

8 CLERK: Farias?

9 COUNCILMEMBER FARIAS: I vote aye on all.

10 CLERK: Feliz?

11 COUNCILMEMBER FELIZ: Aye.

12 CLERK: Gennaro?

13 COUNCILMEMBER GENNARO: Aye.

14 CLERK: Gutiérrez?

15 COUNCILMEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Aye.

16 CLERK: Hanif?

17 COUNCILMEMBER HANIF: Aye.

18 CLERK: Hanks?

19 COUNCILMEMBER HANKS: Aye.

20 CLERK: Holden?

21 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: Aye.

22 CLERK: Hudson?

23 COUNCILMEMBER HUDSON: Aye on all.

24 CLERK: Joseph?

25 COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: Aye on all.

2 CLERK: Kagan?

3 COUNCILMEMBER KAGAN: Aye.

4 CLERK: Krishnan?

5 COUNCILMEMBER KRISHNAN: Aye.

6 CLERK: Lee?

7 COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

8 CLERK: Louis?

9 COUNCILMEMBER LOUIS: Aye.

10 CLERK: Marte?

11 COUNCILMEMBER MARTE: Aye.

12 CLERK: Mealy?

13 COUNCILMEMBER MEALY: Aye.

14 CLERK: Menin? Councilmember Menin?

15 CLERK: Moya?

16 COUNCILMEMBER MOYA: I vote aye.

17 CLERK: Narcisse?

18 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: One second. I just want

19 to say that I love firefighters, but we need equity

20 and diversity. And thank you, Madam Speaker for the

21 work that we're doing and all my colleagues, but I

22 love firefighters. We just need equities and

23 diversity. Thank you.

24 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: How do you vote?

25

2 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: Aye. I just wanted to
3 say I love firefighters.

4 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: I assume you're going to
5 vote aye after that, but I wanted it to be on the
6 record.

7 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: I vote aye.

8 CLERK: Nurse?

9 COUNCILMEMBER NURSE: I vote aye.

10 CLERK: Ossé?

11 COUNCILMEMBER OSSÉ: Aye on all.

12 CLERK: Paladino?

13 CLERK: Restler?

14 COUNCILMEMBER RESTLER: I vote aye, and I'd like
15 to congratulate my friends in... at the DUMBO BID who
16 do a terrific job. Thank you.

17 CLERK: Thank you. Richardson Jordan?

18 COUNCILMEMBER RICHARDSON JORDAN: Permission to
19 explain my vote?

20 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

21 COUNCILMEMBER RICHARDSON JORDAN: So first, I
22 want to definitely share in condolences for the
23 family of Reverend Butts. My grandparents were
24 actually married at Abyssinian Baptist Church. So my
25 roots go there as well. And you know, our ancestors

2 are always with us, and one of the best things we can
3 do to honor them is to protect our community. And in
4 the true spirit of Christ, that really means all the
5 children of God and not just the wealthy.

6 I wanted to in the spirit of saying protect
7 communities and ancestry, I wanted to also say that
8 I'm proud to co-sponsor and support these FDNY bills.

9 My grandfather actually on my... on the other
10 parent's side, was a black NYC firefighter. And so
11 it's really diversity and FDNY is huge. Yes, we do
12 still have a long way to go. I'm also glad that
13 we're taking a step.

14 Lastly, I wanted to shout out the 125 Street BID,
15 not just for this increase, you know,
16 congratulations, I'm proud to support, but also for
17 all the work that the BID has been doing,
18 particularly around cleaning and safety. And thank
19 you. I vote aye on all.

20 CLERK: Thank you. Riley?

21 COUNCILMEMBER RILEY: Permission to explain my
22 vote.

23 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

24 COUNCILMEMBER RILEY: Just real quick. I wanted
25 to give my gratitude and condolences to Reverend

2 Calvin Butts family. I had the opportunity of
3 building a relationship with Reverend Calvin Butts at
4 my tenure as SUNY College of Westbury, but not only
5 as a president, but also as a fraternity brother of
6 Kappa Alpha Psi fraternity Incorporated. He was an
7 amazing brother, and I just wanted to extend my
8 gratitude and condolences to his family. And I vote
9 aye on all.

10 CLERK: Thank you. Rivera?

11 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: I vote aye. Congrats to
12 all my colleagues.

13 CLERK: Salamanca?

14 COUNCILMEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

15 CLERK: Sanchez?

16 COUNCILMEMBER SANCHEZ: Aye on all.

17 CLERK: Schulman?

18 COUNCILMEMBER SCHULMAN: Aye on all.

19 CLERK: Stevens?

20 COUNCILMEMBER Stevens: Aye on all.

21 CLERK: Ung?

22 COUNCILMEMBER UNG: Aye on all.

23 CLERK: Velázquez?

24 COUNCILMEMBER VELÁZQUEZ: Aye.

25 CLERK: Vernikov?

2 COUNCILMEMBER VERNIKOV: Aye on all.

3 CLERK: Won?

4 COUNCILMEMBER WON: Aye on all.

5 CLERK: Yeger?

6 COUNCILMEMBER YEGER: Sorry to rain on this aye
7 on all parade. But I can't, as you know, vote aye on
8 all, because that just wouldn't be me.

9 I vote aye on all with the exception of the tax
10 increase about to be rubber-stamped by the council,
11 masquerading as a BID assessment, Resolution number
12 362, on which I vote no. Thank you.

13 CLERK: Councilmember Menin?

14 Borelli?

15 COUNCILMEMBER BORELLI: Aye.

16 CLERK: Powers?

17 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Aye..

18 CLERK: Speaker Adams?

19 SPEAKER ADAMS: Happy belated birthday
20 Councilmember Feliz. I vote aye on all.

21 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Happy Birthday
22 Councilmember. All today... All items on today's
23 general order count are adopted by a vote of 49 in
24 the affirmative zero in the negative and zero
25 abstentions, with the exception of Resolution 362

2 adopted by a vote of 48 in the affirmative, one in
3 the negative and zero abstentions.

4 We will now move into the introduction and
5 reading of bills.

6 SPEAKER ADAMS: All bills have been referred to
7 committees as indicated on today's agenda.

8 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. There are no
9 resolutions on today's calendar. So we'll now move
10 into general discussion. We will first hear from
11 Councilmember Farias.

12 COUNCILMEMBER FARIAS: Thank you Majority Leader.
13 I just want to take this moment to honor a family and
14 my district. This Sunday morning we saw a tragic
15 fire in the Castle Hill community that took the life
16 of four of my neighbors: 10 year old Kalheed Waleed
17 Ban Saleh, his 12 year old brother Mohammed Waleed
18 Ahmed, their older brother, 22 year old Ahmed Saleh
19 Sally, and his 10-month-old baby girl, Barah Saleh.
20 There's also a 21 year old woman, their mother and a
21 44 year old man, their uncle, who are still in
22 critical condition. I and my community are
23 heartbroken to see our neighbors gone too soon and
24 their families suffer from the wreckage of this fire.
25 I have spent time with the family and want to honor

2 them today and express their appreciation for the
3 outpouring of support, not only from our community,
4 but from the city. My office and I are continuing to
5 do everything we can to help and I just want to
6 appreciate the condolences from Madam Speaker, Mayor
7 Adams, Borough President Gibson, and my colleagues in
8 government. Finally a huge gratitude to my local
9 fire house, engine 96 and ladder 54, and engine 64
10 ladder 47, and the entire FDNY for their quick
11 response and continued outreach in my district.
12 Thank you to everyone who has reached out.

13 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll now go
14 to Councilmember Hudson followed by Councilmember
15 Bottcher.

16 COUNCILMEMBER HUDSAON: Thank you. And as the
17 speaker mentioned, November is Alzheimer's Awareness
18 Month most folks know by now that I cared for my
19 mother for eight years when she was diagnosed with
20 Alzheimer's disease. And while those eight years
21 weren't at all easy -- they call it the long goodbye
22 -- I'm grateful for the time I had with my mother,
23 and I was able to keep her at home until her last
24 breath.

2 My office gets calls often from constituents who
3 are concerned about older neighbors who seem to be
4 exhibiting signs of Alzheimer's disease, and I can't
5 imagine my office is the only one receiving those
6 calls. More and more older adults are living alone
7 isolated and finding themselves without the care and
8 resources they deserve. Currently, more than 6
9 million Americans live with the disease and by 2050,
10 that number will grow to almost 13 million. One in
11 three seniors dies with Alzheimer's or another
12 dementia, and while Alzheimer's has been such a
13 significant part of my story, I am most certainly not
14 the only one with a story. And I want to just
15 mention I sent an e-mail. We will be doing an info
16 brief with an organization called Caring Kind that
17 delivers services and resources to families
18 experiencing Alzheimer's disease, and I encourage
19 everyone to join. I can't remember the date off the
20 top of my head right now. But please check your
21 emails and all the information is there. Thank you.

22 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We will hear
23 from Councilmember Bottcher followed by Councilmember
24 Cabán.

2 COUNCILMEMBER BOTTCHER: So today I'm introducing
3 a bill that will clarify and strengthen the rules
4 around those sidewalk news boxes. Most of them are
5 fine, but some of them as we all know, become
6 abandoned, broken, soiled, vandalized, tipped over.
7 And I've in the past tried to address this but
8 there's really not much the city can do about it
9 under the current rules. So the introduction that we
10 are submitting today, would have some... just some
11 common sense stuff like requiring them to put the
12 owners of the boxes, which is often not even the
13 publication... put their contact information on the
14 box. So there's someone to contact, a way to have an
15 address. I want to thank my co-sponsor, Sandra Ung,
16 Councilmember Ung, and everyone who has signed on.
17 Thanks so much.

18 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll now go
19 to Councilmember Cabán, followed by Councilmember
20 Restler.

21 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Thank you. I just wanted
22 to highlight for folks that right outside of city
23 hall today, there are family members and loved ones
24 of people killed on Rikers Island, who had been there
25 since 6 a.m., along with advocates that are calling

2 for the end of solitary confinement and the closure
3 of Rikers Island. Initially, when they started
4 planning the event, it was supposed to be 16 hours,
5 and then became 17, and now 18, because in those
6 couple of short weeks, we saw more lives lost on
7 Rikers.

8 And I want to share very briefly the story of the
9 Tavidas family, who was the 17th victim on Rikers,
10 who had spoken to her son who seemed... who struggled
11 with mental health issues... struggled with mental
12 health issues, and seemed hopeful that he might be
13 able to come home and access a program and services
14 in just a few weeks. And two days later... She lives
15 in public housing. That's an important thing to
16 note. Two days later, a bunch of men in matching
17 jackets showed up at her door -- English is not her
18 first language -- and she let them in. And she said,
19 "I thought I have so many open tickets in my
20 apartment, everything is broken, nothing works. And
21 I let them in because I thought I thought they were
22 here to fix something. Finally, I thought they were
23 here to fix something in my apartment." And she let
24 them in. And they told her that her son was dead.

2 And it is no coincidence that this family,
3 relegated to public housing could not get a damn
4 thing fixed in their apartment, who had a son with
5 mental health issues, who couldn't get access to
6 services, but had access to Rikers Island, and then
7 was killed there.

8 We have to understand the trajectory in this
9 pipeline and end the practice of solitary
10 confinement, in addition to the people dying.
11 Recently, a corrections officer stabbed 18 times.
12 People are not safe there. We need to decarcerate.
13 We need to end solitary. And for folks who are still
14 on the fence on signing onto that really important
15 legislation, please: The empirical evidence, the
16 data, the research shows that conditions of solitary,
17 exacerbate and increase violence, and that there are
18 proven methods to decreasing the violence on all
19 sides. So I'm asking my colleagues, please sign on
20 to the Halt Solitary Bill. Thank you.

21 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We'll now go
22 to Councilmember Restler, followed by Councilmember
23 Holden.

24 COUNCILMEMBER RESTLER: Thank you Majority
25 Leader. Firstly, I'd like to just echo the eloquent

2 sentiments of Councilmember Cabán. I couldn't agree
3 with her more strongly.

4 Also just wanted to mention that today I'm
5 introducing intro 816 to suspend ASP during Tisha
6 B'av, and Tisha B'av is a day of communal mourning.
7 It's one of the holiest days in the Jewish calendar,
8 commemorating the destruction of the first and second
9 temples in Jerusalem, and other tragedies that
10 occurred on that same date. Constituents in my
11 district and folks all across the city mourn from the
12 earliest hours until late in the night, and they
13 cannot be bothered by ASP on a day of such
14 importance. So I hope that we can remove this burden
15 together, I want to thank the bill drafter and, and
16 the folks on my team who worked on it, and especially
17 the folks in the community of Williamsburg, who
18 brought this issue to my attention. I think it's a
19 sensible modification that I hope we can adopt.
20 Thank you.

21 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. And now
22 we'll hear from Councilmember Holden.

23 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you, Majority Leader
24 and today I'm introducing Intro 813 a bill that will
25 help our small businesses compete with larger chains

2 on third-party delivery apps. My bill will keep fee
3 caps in place as mandated by this council. But it
4 will also allow restaurants the option to opt out of
5 regulations that can hurt their marketing efforts.

6 Providing small businesses more options is good
7 for business and good for all consumers who use third
8 party delivery apps like GrubHub and UberEATS. I
9 want to thank... thank you to consumer and Worker
10 Protection Committee Chair, Marjorie Velazquez, and
11 to all my colleagues on the Council for being pre-
12 intro sponsors. I ask my colleagues to sign on to
13 this important bill, and thank you Majority Leader.

14 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you, Councilmember
15 Holden. Do we have anyone else signed up to speak?
16 Seeing none on that call Speaker Adrienne Adams to
17 close today's Stated Meeting.

18 SPEAKER ADAMS: Before we close I'd like to
19 acknowledge that a longtime staffer of ours will be
20 leaving us on Monday. She's in the balcony. Let's
21 everybody wave to Jenny Lowe.

22 [APPLAUSE]

23 Jenny will be missed dearly. She has seen us
24 through many speakers, many councils, and she is
25 going on to very, very green pastures. We

2 congratulate you for the move, Jenny. We're very
3 proud of you, very, very proud of the work, and
4 thankful for your service to this council.
5 Congratulations. Thank you.

6 The stated meeting of November 3, 2022 is hereby
7 adjourned.

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date 11/10/2022