

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

----- X

NOVEMBER 18, 2019
Start: 1:22 P.M.
Recess: 4:48 P.M.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON

COUNCIL MEMBERS: FERNANDO CABRERA
ANDREW COHEN
CHAIM M. DEUTSCH
RUBEN DIAZ, SR.
RAFAEL L. ESPINAL, JR.
PETER A. KOO
STEPHEN T. LEVIN
MARK LEVINE
CARLOS MENCHACA
I. DANEEK MILLER
ANTONIO REYNOSO
DONOVAN J. RICHARDS
DEBORAH L. ROSE

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

2 PEDRO LUEL (SP?): Sound check, sound
3 check. This is a sound check for the Committee on
4 Transportation. Today's date is November 18th, 2019.
5 Located in the Council Chambers. Recording done by
6 Pedro Luel (sp?).

7 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:
8 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). I think that you know
9 it is important to put you know these hearings in
10 context of how we are here today and especially when
11 the growing of the opt in the black car, in the no
12 corporate black car industry in the city of New York
13 without any control in the context that you know we
14 are ready to vote in a package of Legislation. But I
15 remember that day where we would be able to sit down
16 in an office and be able to put together an agreement
17 where they wanted to put together a correlation of
18 supporters but as someone as I said before that I was
19 1/12 of Cali car service at 207 Inego (SP?) and then
20 I was a 1/12 Bally Car Service when some driver from
21 Cali and from Riverside Drive from Simon Car Service,
22 they created Bally Car Services that was first
23 established as on University before they moved to the
24 new location. (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). You know
25 when you are, I always told the drivers that there

2 are two Bills that I am able to pass in the City of
3 New York that for me, they have been the most
4 important one that you know I don't, I go to sleep
5 knowing that I was able to move this Bill from what
6 was intended at the beginning. We passed the Bill at
7 the end. The City of New York wanted to pass a law
8 saying if a driver hit a pedestrian license would be
9 suspended and for months I negotiated a Bill and the
10 Bill came out saying if the driver hit a person and
11 the person dies or in critical condition then the
12 license is suspended for 30 days for the
13 investigation. Then, when the City wanted to
14 increase you know the penalty for illegal street
15 hail, a pickup citywide and I was able to make those
16 changes only down 96th Street. I know the positive
17 impact that I have throughout the City of New York.
18 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). I am Council Member
19 Ydanis Rodriguez the Chair of the Committee of
20 Transportation. Across the City we are seeing
21 thousands more drivers and base owners that are being
22 impacted by the changing industry. They have been
23 many policies and programs that have been implemented
24 to try to help the struggling taxi drivers and
25 owners. We need to look for ways to help all for-

2 hire vehicles in the industry. Taxi services that
3 once were booming are now seeing decreases in rider-
4 ships by almost 50% of what they once saw. Many of
5 them are immigrants like myself, born and raised in
6 another country living with a Green Card that I have
7 since '83 to 2000. They are here to make a living
8 and support themselves and their families. They
9 majority of taxis that operate in my District in the
10 South Bronx, in the auto world are livery bases which
11 are mostly made up of immigrant drivers. We went
12 from having 50,000 livery cars in 2014 to 10,5000 at
13 the end of the year in 2018. We lost over 30,000
14 livery cars. We must address this before we lose any
15 more drivers. The livery basis in our underserved
16 communities are the icon. There is no Washington
17 Heights, there is no Salvo Bronze (SP?) without those
18 bases being there. (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). As
19 we have the Yellow Taxi Yellow Medallion Task Force
20 we need to have a Livery Base Corporate Black Car
21 Task Force that should be able to dedicate resources,
22 time, composed by drivers, Livery owners, the black
23 car, corporate black car city hold the Council
24 Academic Institution to put together a on how we are
25 going to risking this industry. I believe that the

2 livery drivers should start being targeted by TFC
3 officer who have been patrolling in the auto world
4 areas. These drivers need to be left a piece
5 especially this day as we are getting close to
6 Thanksgiving and to a holiday. They should be
7 allowed to make a living without all the heavy fines
8 and enforcement that they have been facing. TFC
9 should be focusing on enforcement area below 96th
10 Street, la Guardia and JFK. They should not be
11 targeting the auto world community. (SPEAKING
12 FOREIGN LANGUAGE). Even the yellow taxi industry
13 maintain that they are on board. (SPEAKING FOREIGN
14 LANGUAGE). Livery serve many immigrants in
15 underserved communities like those areas that many of
16 the, the members of the public who are here live.
17 They live in the auto world areas. They work in the
18 auto world areas and we need to understand that they
19 are providing transportation in transportation desert
20 areas. They don't add to congestion. The provide a
21 solution to congestion because they are the only one
22 to take a teacher to the school in those places.
23 They are the only, the they are only ones who
24 provided services where the yellow they don't go. We
25 must treat our drivers with dignity and respect. It

2 doesn't matter what the skin tone or religion they
3 practice other than come from a community that they
4 work so hard to support and support their family here
5 in the City and also back in the country where they
6 come from. With all that being said today, we will
7 be conducted oversight hearings on the current
8 situation for livery and corporate black cars from
9 black cars. First let me recognize again my
10 colleagues who are here, they were here, Council
11 Members Reynoso, Cohen, Diaz, Cabrera and Deutsch.
12 In the past five years the number of licensed
13 drivers, vehicles operating in the City has declined
14 by over 50% and livery services and livery services
15 are completing about half as many trips a day as they
16 were in 2014. Today's hearing focuses on addressing
17 the issues facing livery and corporate black car
18 basis, owners and most important their drivers. This
19 committee has worked with TFC to make a stay over the
20 proceeding months to address the impact of the rise
21 of at base for hire vehicle service in the City.
22 These steps include the passes of local law creating
23 a new high-volume license and authorizing TFC to
24 establish vehicle utilization standard and cap the
25 number of for-hire vehicle license issued. However,

2 that cap should be addressed. We need to let. We
3 need to put together a plan to let the livery bases
4 to let the corporate black car to go to the number of
5 the higher number and again we will be working with a
6 lot of the transportation advocate groups. We are
7 not advocating to add to congestion. What we are
8 advocating to bring fairness to the livery bases, to
9 the corporate black car that they being a target also
10 of understanding the consequences. The growing of
11 liv and uber and others is completely different than
12 where the pains are growing that those two sectors
13 have. What we are seeing is that many livery bases
14 closing. What we are seeing is bases such as Dagman,
15 they have 250 drivers. Today they have like 100
16 something. We got auto they have hundreds and
17 hundreds and they are struggling to survive. Those
18 two bases reflect most bases in the City of New York.
19 And as you can see many of them, they are also senior
20 citizens. So, if any senior citizen decides to go
21 back to their country that base loses their spot.
22 They are not able to get their license for their
23 drivers to be able to be affiliated with those bases.
24 Then they are to rely on the listing and the renting
25 and others that already have those license. So, we

2 need to sit down with peers, see how they plan to
3 also work with the livery bases. (SPEAKING FOREIGN
4 LANGUAGE). TLC and of course we bill. We also have
5 someone that has showing that his fair, someone is
6 showing that he is listening. That he can continue
7 being offering accessible, not only to the drivers
8 but also the bases and someone that I hope again that
9 is, that the city hall across this room will be able
10 to look ahead a potential leader also at TLC. You
11 know the farther we are months without having the
12 permanent TLC Commission is a challenge that we have.
13 When we have someone that is able to work with us
14 close that is able to come with the, the experience,
15 I hope again that TLC can work together with us very
16 close to be able to address the lack of commissioning
17 and public assay that he can be a great commissioner.
18 I would like to work on the representative
19 administration who are here with us today. Thank you
20 for being here and I now ask the Committee Counsel to
21 administer the affirmation and to invite you to the
22 livery use testimony.

23 COUNSEL: Please raise your right hand?

24 Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and
25 nothing but the truth in your testimony before this

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION 10

2 committee and to respond honestly to Council Member
3 questions?

4 MALE 1: I do.

5 MALE 2: I do.

6 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON: You
7 may begin?

8 BILL HEINZEN: Thank you. Good
9 afternoon, Chair Rodriguez and members of the
10 Transportation Committee. My name is Bill Heinzen, I
11 am the Acting Commissioner for the New York City Taxi
12 and Limousine Commission. With me today is Dianna
13 Pennetti. She is TLCs Deputy Commissioner for our
14 Uniform Services Bureau which includes our safety and
15 emissions inspection division as well as our
16 enforcement division. Thank you for inviting me to
17 join you today, I just want to give some very brief
18 remarks. The Taxi and Limousine Committee regulates
19 over 130,000 vehicles, and 118,000 of these are for-
20 hire vehicles but within the for-hire vehicle sector
21 about 26,000 are affiliated with one of the
22 approximately 390 traditional livery bases and one of
23 the approximately 400 non-app black care bases.
24 Based on trip data that is collected by the City we
25 estimate that these traditional segments of the FHV

2 sector dispatch over 50,000 trips per day. Livery
3 and black car bases have historically played an
4 important role providing for-hire transportation to
5 New Yorkers especially as the chair mentioned in
6 neighborhoods underserved by both public
7 transportation and historically by yellow taxis.
8 Livery bases have offered their clients reliable
9 neighborhood based for-hire service provided by
10 drivers and base owners from the communities. These
11 passengers may not speak English or have access to a
12 credit card and livery services can reduce barriers
13 to mobility and immigrant and lower income
14 communities. For their part, black care bases have
15 traditionally built a loyal base of passengers
16 ranging from those looking for premium for-hire
17 service to corporate account work for businesses like
18 banks and law firms. All of the long-standing
19 segments of TLC regulated industries have been
20 impacted by the onset of these app-based car services
21 now known as the high volume for-hire services and
22 subject to new enhanced licensing requirements. Not
23 only do the apps provide trips in Manhattan and at
24 the airports which are areas traditionally served by
25 yellow taxis, they also work with large corporate

2 clients and in communities that previously relied on
3 livery service. For people who prefer to book a trip
4 by phone call or to pay in case the liveries continue
5 to fill this need. But the influx of tens of
6 thousands of new drivers and vehicles who work for
7 the apps has altered New York City's For Hire
8 Transportation landscape for drivers and bases alike.
9 Although the City missed the opportunity to cap the
10 number of for-hire vehicles in 2015 when the apps
11 began to provide a large number of trips, the City
12 was able to collect and analyze a large amount of
13 trip and fair data generated by the apps and last
14 year the Mayor and City Council worked together to
15 enact a cap on the vehicle licenses last year and
16 granted TLC the authority that we previously lacked to
17 begin addressing the effects of four years of
18 uncontrolled growth. These impacts have included
19 significant additional congestion and damaged air
20 quality as well as lower driver pay in all sectors.
21 Many of these new regulations only apply to app-based
22 services with taxis and traditional livery and black
23 car services exempt. These additional app-based
24 requirements include greatly enhanced trip data
25 reporting providing New York City with greater

2 insight into the trips provided by the apps also
3 driver pay protection rules with enhanced driver pay
4 reporting requirements and limitations on the amount
5 of the time that vehicles working with the apps are
6 allowed to spend cruising empty in the most congested
7 part of Manhattan below 96th Street. These data-
8 based regulations have been major wins for the City
9 our drivers and the companies looking for a fair
10 chance to compete against the new app-based services.
11 The changes to the industry did not occur overnight
12 and it will take time to see the impact of recent
13 changes in our regulation. I can say that for the
14 first time since 2014, the number of for-hire
15 vehicles has slightly declined. Additionally, the
16 two largest app companies stopped accepting new
17 drivers last spring, creating opportunities to
18 attract additional drivers in the taxi and
19 traditional livery and black car sectors. While the
20 TLC worked to develop the new regulatory responses to
21 the influx of app-based services the agency has also
22 worked to support the traditional sectors that we
23 regulate. Together with Council Members and driver
24 advocates we have worked to address challenges facing
25 livery and black car drivers. A wide range of TLC

2 employees and divisions, meet regularly with
3 representatives of the industry including drivers and
4 businesses and we have regularly, we have greatly
5 increased our industry outreach in the past three
6 years allowing us to meet with more and more drivers.
7 We regularly hold TLC in your borrow events across
8 the City to meet drivers in their neighborhoods and
9 to provide help addressing driver's issues. This
10 includes understanding licensing requirements.
11 Speaking to a TLC prosecutor about a summons working
12 for reduction and sharing information about policy
13 changes and connecting drivers to available no cost
14 city resources such as financial counseling. Staff
15 from licensing and prosecution divisions, work with
16 drivers and bases to resolve these complaints where
17 possible, offering settlements and reduced fines. In
18 addition to calls to 3-1-1 in our call center, we
19 also fill dozens of questions, complaints and
20 requests from elected officials' offices each week.
21 At Chair Rodriguez's invite we recently took part in
22 his Washington Heights Constituent Night where we met
23 with several dozen drivers and we will continue to
24 attend those events including this Wednesday evening.
25 Although we as a City have taken great strides to

2 address the challenges and struggles facing many of
3 our licensees, work still remains. Working together,
4 the Council, the Mayor and TLC have an active ground
5 breaking policies to respond to changes in for-hire
6 service. Changes felt not only in New York City but
7 in cities across the globe. As we implement and
8 evaluate these policies, I know that there may be
9 disagreements. These conversations may not always be
10 easy and the solutions can be complex but we welcome
11 the opportunity to continue collaborating with you to
12 address these continuing changes and we think this
13 hearing is another important step. Thank you.

14 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON: I
15 would like also to announce that we have been joined
16 by Council Member Menchaca and Council Member Levin.

17 UNIDENTIFIED: I have a few questions for
18 my colleague. I also have other questions. How, can
19 you describe the way of how the livery bases being
20 included together with an Uber and Lyft. The other
21 73 apt company when it comes to does know that the
22 City has counsel to rule that having intended to look
23 at the level the playing field, addressing the
24 growing how much time? How much resources have been
25 invested to look at differentiating the livery bases

2 so that they are not a negative impact as they have
3 been impacted today? So, the rules that we passed
4 this summer for that of the Legislation last summer
5 when the City Council capped the number of for-hire
6 vehicle licenses that was across the board. We
7 received the authority for the first time to, to cap
8 vehicle licenses and we did that but we did that only
9 as a study that was mandated by City Council that
10 directed us to evaluate all of the impacts for-hire
11 vehicles but particularly the apps on New York City
12 and to address those, to examine and address those
13 impacts on income, on congestion, on the environment
14 among other causes. So, we I think we need to look
15 at this in the course of all of the legislation and
16 regulation that we have done, City Council, the Mayor
17 and TLC have done in the last two years over the
18 apps. This was built on the base of the data that we
19 began collecting but we did several significant
20 pieces of regulation, we did a driver pay, we did a
21 cap on cruising, we did a vehicle license cap, we did
22 enhance data requirements. Some of those apply
23 across the board to for-hire vehicle and some of
24 those don't. So, for example, driver doesn't apply
25 to the traditional livery and black car that only

1 applies to the app companies or what are called the
2 high volume for-hire services. Also, the cap on
3 cruising which limits the amount of time that
4 vehicles can spend in Manhattan below 96th Street
5 that only applies to the apps. So, we also in terms
6 of the vehicle license cap which was designed to
7 address things like a reduction in driver pay and
8 congestion. We have to look at several things. We
9 have to at the fact that we had 10s of 1000s of more
10 vehicles added between 2015 when she pointed out the
11 City did not cap licenses in 2018 when it did. So,
12 there is 50,000 more vehicles just in that period.
13 So, we have to look at all of those facts. We also
14 have to look at the fact that the apps can dispatch
15 not just to their vehicles but they can dispatch to
16 drivers who also drive for livery and for a
17 traditional for-hire and so the solution was then to
18 have the cap apply city wide and to have it apply
19 industry wide for the for-hire vehicle but again
20 there are many instances in which the traditional
21 livery and black car have to been subject to the new
22 regulation.
23

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION 18

2 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON: How

3 do you describe the current situation of the livery
4 bases today?

5 BILL HEINZEN: I think it's; I think it's
6 not a good situation. I think that they have
7 suffered since 2014 with the introduction of the app
8 so the introduction really in 2012 of the apps and
9 they have seen their affiliated vehicles decline,
10 they have seen their trips go down and they have
11 seen, they have seen their drivers drive for other
12 companies. So, I am not going to sugar-coat it. I
13 think it's been a, it hasn't been a good situation.

14 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

15 What, what can be done to help those sectors, the
16 corporate black car and the livery bases?

17 BILL HEINZEN: So, I think a few things
18 can be done and I think a few things are being done.
19 One is, as I said we don't, they area carved out and
20 exempt from some, some of the regulation. Secondly,
21 if you look at the number of vehicles overall has
22 stopped growing so the apps have stopped flooding the
23 market with competition, whether that is in vehicles
24 or in drivers. The app companies haven't accepted
25 any new drivers since the spring. Uhm there are

2 other, there are other areas where uhm the liveries
3 for example are not subject to regulations that
4 others are. They don't have to pay sales tax on
5 their fares. They don't have to pay an MTA surcharge
6 on their fares. They don't have to play, to pay a
7 black car fund but ultimately they are in a bad
8 situation and that bad situation is directly caused
9 by the increase of the apps in New York City.

10 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON: I
11 just feel that again that I sat at this table and I
12 said before. And I said at this hearing too, I, I
13 hear for my pain for the 6,000 individual medallion
14 owners that we have in the City of New York because
15 they were, they were individuals who they got into
16 the market, that they got into a loan to send their
17 kids to college when they thought that the value of
18 the medallion was, what we as a City marketing today.
19 But, I don't have in my District one yellow taxi
20 driver that I know. I don't have in my District one
21 medallion owner that I know, in District 10. So, my
22 base are the faces of those individuals here and
23 those individuals are people that have been working
24 so hard, raising family, contributing to the City not
25 only with the taxes but also growing the new

2 professional sector that we have in the City of New
3 York, police officers, teachers, lawyers, doctors
4 have been produced by this. And many other hard-
5 working immigrants, New Yorkers, so my right now and
6 this is something that I've been addressing with City
7 Hall. I've been addressing again in conversation
8 with you and the speakers offices, you know, we need
9 to highlight, we need to insert the crisis of the
10 livery bases in the corporate black car into the
11 crisis that we are discussing right now. Many of
12 those black care, they are providing insurance to
13 their drivers. Those drivers work you know with
14 salary so we cannot treat neither as we look at the
15 Uber and the Lyft and Via and Juno and the other 71
16 companies. So, I don't pretend that I don't hear and
17 we will be able to come out with a solution to the
18 problem when we need to know that we are open to sit
19 down, to follow. Not only we, you know, we are the
20 owners of the bases of the corporate but also with
21 the drivers and be able to realize and I say because
22 for the last couple of months I've been the co-chair
23 of the, of the medallion task for. And I introduce
24 the Legislation. I mean I put the language hopefully
25 that Bill will be introduced very soon that also we

2 create the corporate black car and the livery bases
3 task for to dedicate the same amount of energy.
4 Because I think that the City of New York has looked,
5 I think as a forgiving one. They are the one that no
6 one is talking about and it is like the yellow or the
7 apps but there is nothing in the middle and they are
8 in the middle. I feel that if we look on any
9 potential putting a plan together they have to be
10 rescued because if we don't they will disappear and I
11 think that this is something that we have this
12 responsibility. So, and in that direction, in how
13 do you think to be helpful to the drivers who are
14 affiliated through their bases. What are the things
15 that you feel can be done to help those riders?

16 BEN HEINZEN: So, and I just, I also just
17 want to respond to the statements that you made. We
18 agree with you. We are focused on the traditional
19 sector as well. We are not just focused on yellow or
20 on the apps. Uhm, I have, you have asked me at a
21 recent City Council hearing if we would support the
22 concept of a Livery Task Force and I said absolutely
23 and I've said that to you since then at the one of
24 our most recent Commission hearings, TLC Commission
25 hearings. A few of the commissioners raised the

2 question of what we were doing and what we needed to
3 do to help this segment and I but perhaps more
4 importantly all of the commissioner committed on the
5 record at the open hearing. They directed us to look
6 in to this. We do have ongoing efforts and outreach
7 across the City and we do visit livery bases. We do
8 have several events every week not just every month
9 but every week where we meet drivers and we meet
10 drivers. We have the TLC In Your Borough Event as I
11 said. We have just started going to Your Constituent
12 Night. We go to other events like that across the
13 City. We partner with houses of worship across the
14 City and when we go to these events we try to bring,
15 not just, we try to bring people from our outreach
16 team but we also try to bring people from enforcement
17 and we try to bring people from prosecution who can
18 sit, who can meet with the drivers and that includes
19 the livery drivers and talk to them and understand
20 their concerns and try to work with them if they have
21 concerns about summons, if they have concerns about
22 licensing. So, I can, you know commit to you and I
23 know that the Mayor has committed that we will
24 redouble our efforts in terms of that outreach and as
25 I've said we support the concept of a Livery Task

2 Force. We are working with out on the Medallion Task
3 Force now.

4 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

5 Okay, how do you think that we can get to the
6 place that at this particular moment and as I said
7 before, this is something that I mean you used to
8 require all Commission or the former Commissioner
9 that I've been asking for years but hopefully this
10 time we can at least advance the conversation. How
11 can we create a given honest and forgiveness to those
12 drivers that they have taken. Especially for picking
13 out about 96th Street.

14 BILL HEINZEN: So, and we have spoken
15 again this but we can slice and dice the numbers and
16 come up with the amounts. I do, you know, I have
17 some policy disagreements with you in that field. I
18 think illegal street hails are a public safety
19 program, I think they are a public safety problem
20 wherever they occur in the City and I think that they
21 are wherever you are driving or wherever you are a
22 passenger or wherever your base you should enjoy the
23 same protection against that as other places and I
24 think it can put passengers at risk. It can put
25 drivers at risk when you have a trip where there is

2 no record of who the passenger was or who the driver
3 was. Uhm I think that we also have an obligation
4 under state law to enforce that because the street
5 hail privilege is limited to taxis and from the local
6 law that we follow that sets for penalties for those
7 behaviors and so we that is something that was
8 created by City Council and that is something that we
9 follow. I think it is also important if you look at
10 the revenue TLC has received from fines and receives
11 from fines since Fiscal Year 2015 when the industry
12 has basically doubled. We have two times as many
13 drivers and we have two times as many trips. We
14 collect 30% less in fine revenue. So I don't think
15 that this is an agency that is out there gouging and
16 like trying to make money off of the backs of
17 drivers. I know that is not a popular opinion but
18 when I look at our revenue that comes in we are down
19 by 1/3 from what we used to collect and we've got
20 twice as many drivers out there and we have had
21 almost twice as many vehicles.

22 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

23 Commissioner, I just think that this policy that
24 we have in place that I don't necessary, I had
25 nothing in creating you know for the purpose that we

2 use it and it is not used but talking about we as a
3 City Policy and Law that we have, I feel that when we
4 establish that the only that the yellow taxi are the
5 only ones that had the right to pick up and drop off
6 in the five boroughs. I think I also provide you
7 know give them the exclusive to be the only one and I
8 feel that as we are having conversation in the Task
9 Force with the yellow taxi stay holders and I feel
10 that from their own end. The top down 96th Street,
11 JFK and La Guardia I think this is something that at
12 some point if we can build, you know a consensus and
13 see if it is by law that we do by law if it is you
14 know whatever it is. But those drivers they do pick
15 up in the South Bronx and in Washington Heights they
16 don't put the passengers in risk and this is
17 something again that we can look at and run down to
18 continue having this conversation with you. What
19 happened is, in those places, that first of all the
20 yellow they don't go there and many of those riders,
21 they are the working class, they don't have the apps
22 to do the prearrangement through Uber so this is
23 someone that came out from a restaurant, this is the
24 one that came out from a building in a place in the
25 out of world area. You know, we are talking about

2 poorest congressional area in the City community in
3 New York that we are here. This is places in the
4 South Bronx. This is about places in Brooklyn that
5 people been using. There is a relationship every day
6 between the drivers and those in the rider. Now they
7 are using because they don't have the apps. They are
8 using it because the yellow, they don't go there.
9 So, if at least we can you know dedicate some quality
10 time and have this conversation to see how we can
11 address it. You know to get accessibility to endorse
12 our borough areas. Where we need them further from
13 TLC is down 96th street. Where we need it is I went
14 to you know to the port saw one friend of mine
15 Josario Sapin (SP?) that had a racing boat in pier 93
16 and then they come out there was like 15 Uber drivers
17 there just asking me and the rest of the people do
18 you need a taxi. Where we need is some of those
19 luxury buildings here in the hotel. So, you know if
20 we can even look at this, this is something for me
21 that is important it is important for the driver.
22 They like to be working to be able to work in peace
23 and I know you know based on my experience we can
24 look at the data but they don't put riders in risk.
25 They are responding to the demand that the riders

2 bring to them which is we don't have a yellow, we
3 don't have the apps, we just stepped out from
4 Morrie's (SP?) and Tremont (SP?) and there I need to
5 get somewhere and that is where I get the taxi.

6 BILL HEINZEN: So, we can definitely look
7 at the data and let's, let's sit down and let's agree
8 to everyway you want to slice in terms of fine
9 revenue, summons revenue, geographically, etc. let's
10 do that. I agree there is a problem in Manhattan
11 below 96th Street and there is a problem at the
12 airports and that's why, you know that's the biggest
13 area where we enforce against people who poach other
14 people's rides and then we go street hails,
15 absolutely that is why we issue more summons at the
16 airports total than we issue in the Bronx, absolutely
17 but there is still, there is still 1 million trips a
18 day. There are still 500,000 trips a day that are
19 not at the airports and that aren't in Manhattan
20 below 96th street and I do feel that we have a
21 responsibility, we have a public safety
22 responsibility to enforce the law citywide and on
23 some of those, you know, we have a lot of illegal
24 street hails where the driver, the vehicle may be
25 licensed but the driver isn't licensed so we have a

2 lot of unlicensed drivers driving around and picking
3 up as well. So, so I can't agree that it's not a
4 public safety issue and I can't..

5 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON: I
6 think that we need, we have to look at the law
7 because many of the laws that we have as I said
8 before. You know, it's like I have a bill that will
9 allow drivers to pi... to park their car after
10 sanitation cleans the street and their position for
11 years and years is because of those sanitation truck
12 pass by twice. At the end of the day, I free pass a
13 law, the City will reduce by \$38 million of revenue
14 and I feel that it is partly related to where should
15 we focus. You took the yellow. The yellow is saying
16 we just want to have not only the numbers that we
17 have today in TLC Enforcement. They would like they
18 are asking to double the number of enforcement down
19 96th Street. When I land the last wind from DR. Yes
20 in the airport there, there was a driver doing also
21 illegal pickup. What is the security here? We don't
22 know that those activities happen so I feel that you
23 know there is enough demand that we have in other
24 area and when you look to those places where through
25 and before they say it through the two-way. Now

2 there is not a two-way anymore. Now through the
3 apps. You know, drivers sharing the information.
4 TLC is here. In some places in Brooklyn, in the
5 Bronx, why are they there when they are providing the
6 services to people who live on the poverty line? To
7 people who live in communities where they don't,
8 where the yellow they don't go. Where the people who
9 live they don't have an Uber in the apps. So, you
10 know for me, you know I don't want to. You know its
11 back and forth on this particular one. At least you
12 can agree that we can look at it. For me this is a
13 good place to continue this conversation but we need
14 and I am committed to work with other drivers here to
15 get to growth to get to the finish line where the
16 enforcement on TLC should be focused down 96th
17 Street. (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). Uhm my last
18 question and then I will you know call my colleagues
19 who has a question. Two que... one question is about
20 when the drivers get a ticket, right and they go to
21 answer to respond to the ticket, are those
22 individuals who hear those cases hired by TLC or are
23 they independent? The judge.

24 BILL HEINZEN: Those are oath judges.

2 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

3 What's that?

4 BILL HEINZEN: That's, that's oath
5 judges. That there is no. They are not TLC
6 employees.

7 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON: They
8 are not TLC employees?

9 BILL HEINZEN: They work for OATH.

10 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

11 Okay. (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). Okay.
12 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). So we will follow you
13 know with that particular question. You know they
14 believe that they are not independent and I get that
15 you know that they are between OATH and the TLC
16 agency but if we can do even one day with walk with
17 some drivers, some members of the livery bases. I
18 think it would help because the perception that they
19 have is that the judge that listens to those cases
20 they are TLC employees.

21 BILL HEINZEN: They are not.

22 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON: Okay
23 and.

24 BILL HEINZEN: And yes, if it, we, we do
25 meet with drivers and bases and we sent people from

2 prosecution and other divisions to go and to explain,
3 this was at the request of one of the livery bases,
4 actually would you come and speak and talk about the
5 summoning process and what to expect when you get a
6 summon and the fact that you can contact TLC before
7 the hearing and you know try to resolve it before
8 that so you don't have to go in so yes, if you or
9 anyone brings those driver groups or bases to my
10 attention we can, we can do that outreach and have
11 those conversations.

12 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON: I'm
13 going to say it in Spanish and in English. (SPEAKING
14 FOREIGN LANGUAGE). So, uhm one of my questions is
15 related as you know the entrapment you know that we
16 already have decided that that is a practice that
17 shouldn't happen anymore. That if a TLC enforcement
18 CS1 is able to prove to someone that he or she did
19 this is now based about a TLC agency whatever that
20 dressed as a senior citizen got the driver to stop
21 and then come out and pull out the plug and give him
22 the ticket. I assume because this is something that
23 they have already said that that practice doesn't
24 happen anymore.

2 BILL HEINZEN: Mara Zocchi (SP?) said it
3 to you. I think I have said it, it's correct. We
4 don't do those. We do not engage. I wouldn't call
5 it entrapment but that so.

6 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

7 Okay.

8 BILL HEINZEN: But absolutely we don't
9 engage, engage in those practices and Dianna can give
10 you specifics on that.

11 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

12 Okay.

13 DIANNA PENNETTI: Thank you Council
14 Member Rodriguez. I am Dianna Pennetti the Deputy
15 Commissioner for the Uniform Services Bureau and one
16 of the divisions that I oversee is the enforcement
17 division. I have been in USB since January of 2017
18 and one of the first things that I did after speaking
19 to different groups like the livery groups especially
20 was to address the professionalism and policies of
21 the enforcement division. The enforcement division
22 has a strict policy regarding plain clothes operation
23 which is what you are describing that strictly
24 prohibits the use of any deceptive tactics.
25 Officers are prohibited from using props such as

2 canes, wheelchair or defame a disability that may
3 play on the emotions of drivers. They are prohibited
4 for asking for transportation to hospitals funeral
5 parlors or any location that implies an urgencies
6 like my mother is sick I need to go now.
7 Additionally, they are prohibited from entering a
8 vehicle prior to a driver agreeing to transport them.
9 Since I have been here every officer has received
10 this training it also includes officer and driver
11 safety in that training and it has been instituted as
12 an annual training so, at this point in time, if
13 there is anyone with type of complaint, I would urge
14 you to contact TLC, the department of investigation
15 or call 3-1-1 so that we can conduct a thorough and
16 immediate investigation something prompt. Because
17 honestly I continue to come to the meetings, I
18 continue to hear your concerns, but there is no
19 complaints on my desk.

20 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

21 Okay.

22 DIANNA PENNETTI: None that can be
23 investigated. I do have a livery base operators and
24 owners come to me with specific cases with specific
25 people and you can ask them. I address it right

2 away. Sometimes we agree to disagree. At the end of
3 the day it is probably up to the Oath Judge what
4 happens but everything that is brought to me by the
5 bases is investigated but honestly nothing has come
6 to me through 3-1-1 or DOI.

7 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

8 Thank you. (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). My
9 last, my last question before calling this is about
10 drivers been asking me, including some in there on
11 how we can work with them? Especially those who
12 bring their assess to drive passengers to the
13 hospital. So, and of course, like I said this may
14 followup. We will follow because I know that also
15 you are operating with a law that we have as a City.
16 What they are asking is can we the City work with you
17 guys to allow those drivers to be able to pick up,
18 drop off those passengers close to the hospital where
19 we have a no standing anytime sign in those location
20 and as also they need to drop a passenger who is in a
21 wheelchair condition that he or she cannot walk but
22 they need to be dropped off in an area that its
23 building is in front of the bus lane.

24 BILL HEINZEN: So, and I know
25 nonemergency medical transport is a very important

2 part of the business that the livery industry does.
3 You are asking if we could work with enforcement to
4 have a certain tolerance for drop offs, for
5 nonemergency transports that are happening.

6 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON: To
7 those pass, to those drivers who are dropping off
8 passengers is an individual who are in health
9 condition?

10 BILL HEINZEN: I definitely agree, commit
11 to discussing that as soon as you want to and with
12 whoever you want to.

13 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON: And
14 what about the building that they are close to the
15 bus lane? To drop off with the same, with the same
16 criteria.

17 DIANNA PENNETTI: Right, so I can only
18 commit for the TLC. A lot of those violations I
19 believe are enforced by other agencies, especially up
20 in Manhattan North and the Bronx. But officers in
21 TLC have discretion and we can discuss some, some
22 issues that require discretion especially in
23 instances like this. On a case by case bases, when
24 they have been brought to my attention, we have dealt
25

2 with it. So, I think that working together we can
3 come up with a policy that would, that would.

4 BILL HEINZEN: Okay, it sounds like we
5 should have DOT and the precincts at the table as
6 well.

7 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

8 Okay. (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). So, (SPEAKING
9 FOREIGN LANGUAGE). Are you going to say something.
10 So, so with the corporate black car, how do you? We
11 touch on the livery bases.

12 BILL HEINZEN: Uh-huh.

13 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON: And
14 of course, similar situation, many of them they are
15 family business. Uhm they also have been going
16 through the same situation. What can be done also to
17 be helpful to that sector of the corporate black car?

18 BILL HEINZEN: I think many I think the
19 answer is largely the same. It is a sector that also
20 has really suffered since the apps entered in and a
21 lot of their traditional custom... what we call the
22 line work which is having a dedicated fleet sitting
23 outside a bank, an investment house, a law firm. A
24 lot of that work has gone away and has gone to the
25 apps. Uhm, so I think although the business model is

2 different from livery, I think some of the solutions
3 are the same and I think they should also be helped
4 by the heightened regulation of the apps.

5 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON: Okay
6 thank you. Council Member Reynoso?

7 ANTONIO REYNOSO: Thank you Chairman,
8 thank you for being here. (SPEAKING FOREIGN
9 LANGUAGE). Uhm I want to ask them a couple of
10 questions just to understand the position that the
11 administration is taking on how this taxi industry is
12 working in general. Uhm, the first thing is I heard
13 you made a statement where you don't think we're in a
14 place uhm where we are let's say taking care of the
15 taxi industry especially the livery cab drivers, that
16 you are concerned about.

17 BILL HEINZEN: I don't.

18 ANTONIO REYNOSO: You made some statement
19 that we are far from perfect, I guess, uhm in the
20 work that we are doing here in the taxi industry?
21 So, okay I'll ask it differently.

22 BILL HEINZEN: I don't remember saying
23 that.

24 ANTONIO REYNOSO: I will try it this way.
25 Do you believe the reforms that are put in place over

2 the last six years since we have been council members
3 and the Mayor has taken office has sufficiently or
4 effectively changed the work for the TLC license
5 drivers for the better?

6 BILL HEINZEN: I think that they will. I
7 think that obviously the industry is still in crisis.
8 I mean, no one would deny that especially the
9 traditional segments of the industry are in crisis
10 but I think we laid the ground work through
11 significant data collection to size the problem
12 through the policies that you and your colleagues
13 passed a year ago in terms of capping the number of
14 licenses being issued in terms of driver pay policy,
15 several other and regulations also that TLC passed,
16 so.

17 ANTONIO REYNOSO: Okay.

18 BILL HEINZEN: I think we have made,
19 we've progress and we are making progress but.

20 ANTONIO REYNOSO: Okay.

21 BILL HEINZEN: But absolutely this
22 industry is still in crisis.

23 ANTONIO REYNOSO: I gotcha so.

24 BILL HEINZEN: Some, some segments much
25 worse than others.

2 ANTONIO REYNOSO: Yeah so I guess I
3 misspoke I meant to say that I heard you say the
4 industry is still in crisis so I just wanted to make
5 sure that we put that in perspective here given that
6 you are the acting TLC head or chair?

7 BILL HEINZEN: Correct.

8 ANTONIO REYNOSO: Okay, so given your
9 understanding of where we are now in the taxi
10 industry, uhm do you feel that you have any authority
11 or autonomy to set forth some reforms in this
12 industry that could get us out of this crisis?

13 BILL HEINZEN: I, I don't think it is a
14 question of. I think I have authority it's not a
15 question of autonomy. There is nothing holding me
16 back I think the administration has been very
17 committed to working to help different segments of
18 the industry including livery, including yellow taxi.

19 ANTONIO REYNOSO: So I think the problem
20 that I have is when I am in the transportation
21 committee and I see this population of individuals
22 consistently come back concerned about harassment,
23 concerned about fares, of jobs, a whole slew of
24 things that continuously come back and they are never
25 satisfied. So maybe the problem isn't necessarily

2 uhm the work that you are doing or I think that the
3 problem is that I think you guys are working at the
4 margins. You are changing things at the edges and
5 that maybe we should be having a more thoughtful
6 conversation about blowing this whole thing up and
7 starting over. Maybe what TLC needs is a complete
8 retool, so we could talk about what works and what
9 doesn't work instead of having these folks come in
10 every single day about something new or every single
11 time. Whether it is the black drivers, the FHV's, the
12 app base. Everyone comes and everyone has problems.
13 Why not just sit down, retool the entire thing and
14 then start over. And not give these people the sense
15 of insurance of security when there absolutely isn't
16 in any thing that we are doing. We are going to keep
17 talking about another law that we will pass to do
18 this. Another law that we will pass to do that and
19 then two months later they will be right back because
20 it didn't work. Because it doesn't work. Our system
21 doesn't work and I feel at this time the TLC is just
22 going to continue to change these at its margins and
23 at the edges and wait for the next mayor and the next
24 council to actually do some meaningful work. So
25 that, that wasn't a question but I am going to ...

2 BILL HEINZEN: Can I respond?

3 ANTONIO REYNOSO: Sure, sure, absolutely.

4 BILL HEINZEN: So yes, we regulate
5 205,000 drivers. We get complaints every day for
6 drivers, absolutely. I don't think that just getting
7 complaints means that we haven't done any work, I
8 think it means that we are very open to getting and
9 to meeting with drivers and we get a lot of feedback
10 and we go out and we meet with them and we court that
11 feedback.

12 ANTONIO REYNOSO: I think objectively, so
13 Commissioner, objectively.

14 BILL HEINZEN: I would disagree.

15 ANTONIO REYNOSO: Objectively..

16 BILL HEINZEN: Characterization that we
17 have only done things at the margin. I think in fact
18 we have enacted pretty broad policies. And by we, I
19 mean not TLC but the mayor and City Council together.

20 ANTONIO REYNOSO: I agree. Objectively no
21 one can see the work that we have done over the six
22 years in modifying the TLC objectively from someone
23 outside looking in and say you know what these guys
24 figured it out. These guys have a plan. There is no
25 way that you can do that.

2 BILL HEINZEN: That is your subjective
3 opinion of what.

4 ANTONIO REYNOSO: I believe we have
5 incapable uses fighting against each other to figure
6 this out. It is not compatible. The truth is to
7 tell the that their system is not compatible and
8 isn't, can't survive in this environment. Being
9 honest with them and telling them straight up what it
10 is. Instead we are like pulling them in slowly and
11 beating, beating around the bush to something of
12 reality that the app-based environment is what is
13 going to lead, being king here in the City of New
14 York. Let's just be honest and start moving towards
15 a system that they are very well-educated on, very
16 well-informed on so that they can move in a direction
17 that makes a lot of sense. I think we have
18 incompatible uses of people and it is never going to
19 work. And I don't think that we are going to get to
20 that in end case. So, that is all that I am saying.
21 I just think that we are doing again is while we can
22 put 10 pieces of Legislation and think we are doing
23 robust reform, they are all margin, very at the
24 margin type of legislation. I think we should blow
25 TLC up, we should start new and we should figure it

2 out for everyone instead of doing this at the margins
3 work. That's, that's what I am asking.

4 BILL HEINZEN: So, and I understand
5 your opinion. Before you, I would just say before
6 you blow it up, can we talk. I would love to meet
7 and have a discussion. I have offered it before.

8 ANTONIO REYNOSO: I think so.

9 BILL HEINZEN: I have proposals of how.

10 ANTONIO REYNOSO: I had a conversation.

11 BILL HEINZEN: And I have no, it's like
12 take my ego out of it.

13 ANTONIO REYNOSO: Last time I met TLC told
14 me.

15 BILL HEINZEN: Some structure, I would be
16 happy to discuss it.

17 ANTONIO REYNOSO: TLC told me they were
18 going to talk me about the idling and we still
19 haven't met about that, about the how long a car. I
20 think it is at 41% we are trying to get it down to
21 31%. They said they were going to meet with me on
22 that, we have yet to have a meeting on that.

23 BILL HEINZEN: We offered, we offered to
24 meet with you. I didn't understand there was

2 interest on your part but I will schedule that this
3 afternoon.

4 ANTONIO REYNOSO: Of course, there is
5 always.

6 BILL HEINZEN: I will do it this
7 afternoon.

8 ANTONIO REYNOSO: Alright then I'm just
9 going to say a statement in Spanish so just people
10 that couldn't understand it, that they understand.
11 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). (applause).

12 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:
13 Council Member Diaz?

14 RUBEN DIAZ: Thank you Mr. Chairman.
15 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). You know, Mr. Chairman
16 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). Let me say it English.
17 I am going to start with the lady. When you say that
18 you have no complaints about people being in
19 entrapment or an entrapment situation. I met with
20 you various occasion and I told you about you being
21 in this meeting when I was the chairman we talked to
22 you about my office. Chaney Mahea (SP?) has called
23 your office about this. So to tell, to come here
24 today and say I have no complaints in my office about
25 entrapment, you know, that's, that's unfair to say

2 that because we have met with you about it. We have
3 conducted a hearing here about it when the other
4 commissioner, so you know about it. So, you know
5 about the situation that the driver faced and Mr.
6 Commissioner, Bill Heinzen, how long have you been
7 with TLC?

8 BILL HEINZEN: Uhm four years and three
9 months.

10 RUBEN DIAZ: So, you worked in the TLC
11 before the, for-hire committee was formed?

12 BILL HEINZEN: Correct.

13 RUBEN DIAZ: So, your job was a
14 counselor, an advisor to the chair, to the uhm to the
15 commissioner?

16 BILL HEINZEN: I had a few different
17 positions but that was one of them.

18 RUBEN DIAZ: So, when all of those laws I
19 gave the driver, what, what were being done and
20 executed by the TLC, were you part of the counseling?

21 BILL HEINZEN: Which laws?

22 RUBEN DIAZ: Entrapment? The double, the
23 double fines? The double points? All of the abuses,
24 were you part of that? To counsel the Commissioner
25 to do this?

2 BILL HEINZEN: I think that if you look
3 back you will see that there was a change in
4 leadership and in direction in the enforcement
5 division three years ago.

6 RUBEN DIAZ: Not any changes. No change.

7 BILL HEINZEN: I disagree with you?

8 RUBEN DIAZ: They keep complaining in my
9 office every day, complaining, complaining of that.
10 So if you, if we are going to do something, let me.

11 BILL HEINZEN: I just you know.
12 Councilman you talk about abuses and entrapment, you
13 mentioned yes we hear from your office every day. We
14 get, we've gotten hundreds and hundreds of complaints
15 at your request and we resolve them. We got 22 last
16 week and we resolved them when we can. And I am
17 always.

18 RUBEN DIAZ: And I appreciate you. And I
19 thank you. And I thank you. My office has been
20 dealing with your office complaining and Jenny Mehi
21 (SP?) is only assigned to do that. That is the only
22 office in the City of New York in a politician that
23 does that, that is there. Nothing is going to change
24 that and we are very proud of that office. Now, we
25 say, we say we before the for-hire committee, when

2 the for-hire committee was created, it was created
3 because of the abuses that the drivers were being
4 going through. And in the for-hire committee, we
5 passed my law, uhm, Local Law Number 149 to regulate
6 Uber and you were supposed to.

7 BILL HEINZEN: You passed the law, the
8 law created a new license class for the high-volume
9 for-hire services.

10 RUBEN DIAZ: So you have, so today there
11 is no report on that. You have how much money you
12 are collecting? How is it, how are you implementing
13 that?

14 BILL HEINZEN: We collected a very large
15 fee for the four app companies. I really apologize
16 because I can't remember how much it is now. It is
17 certainly, it is at least \$200,000. I think it is a
18 lot more. We are processing those applications now.

19 RUBEN DIAZ: What about what about?

20 BILL HEINZEN: I agree that was a
21 significant piece of Legislation that allowed us to
22 regulate and to pass different requirements in terms
23 of data and, and how and where the apps are able to
24 operate so I agree that was a significant piece of
25 Legislation.

2 RUBEN DIAZ: When, when a driver takes a
3 passenger or drops a passenger. If they do that, in
4 a, in a bus, in the bus uhm..

5 DIANNA PENNETTI: Lane?

6 RUBEN DIAZ: Uhm standing for the bus.
7 They get your agent to fine them why?

8 DIANNA PENNETTI: What?

9 BILL HEINZEN: You are asking why, you
10 are asking?

11 RUBEN DIAZ: Let me ask.

12 BILL HEINZEN: Whether we are, whether we
13 are summonsing people who are either?

14 RUBEN DIAZ: A driver, a drive picks a
15 passenger or has to drop a passenger in a bus line.
16 Your agent would come would come and fine then
17 because they are dropping somebody in the bus line
18 why?

19 BILL HEINZEN: I'm going to let Chief
20 Pennetti answer that question.

21 DIANNA PENNETTI: Okay.

22 BILL HEINZEN: My understand is that
23 you can you can drop someone off or pick someone up
24 briefly if there is not a bus right there.

2 DIANNA PENNETTI: Yeah that is correct,
3 if there not a bus right there you can pick drop
4 someone off or pick someone up quickly. And just to
5 clarify my, my earlier statement, Council Member Diaz
6 (background noise). Just to clarify my earlier
7 statement to you Sir, I did not say I was aware of
8 complaints, I said that I have not been getting
9 complaints through the formal channels of 3-1-1 or
10 TLC or DOI. I have and I stated before been dealing
11 with complaints on one on one situations with
12 different members of the industry especially some of
13 the base owners here today. And the, and to your
14 credit the reason why this training was instituted
15 was because of our meeting back in 2017 when you
16 expressed these concerns.

17 RUBEN DIAZ: So, you know about it?

18 DIANNA PENNETTI: Yes.

19 RUBEN DIAZ: That's what I'm saying
20 because you say I don't.

21 DIANNA PENNETTI: No I know about it but
22 I need you I need people with complaints to formalize
23 a complaint and put it through the proper channels so
24 that other people including myself and other than
25 myself like DOI can do an independent investigation.

2 I can continue to speak to people one on one and deal
3 with them individually like that but it should be a
4 more formal process where, when it happens. Because
5 usually it comes to me like six months later or two
6 months later. Investigations like this need to be
7 done right away. They need to be prompt so that's
8 what I am saying go through the regular channel of
9 calling, of calling 3-1-1 or calling TLC where the
10 complaint is actually recorded and then forwarded for
11 investigation. That was, that is probably the
12 miscommunication.

13 RUBEN DIAZ: My office, you know Jenny,
14 right? You know Jenny.

15 DIANNA PENNETTI: Yes Jenny.

16 RUBEN DIAZ: My office, daily talking to
17 you on different complaints. I am also on traveling.

18 DIANNA PENNETTI: Right.

19 RUBEN DIAZ: So when you say formally,
20 what is formally?

21 DIANNA PENNETTI: Formally, not everybody
22 can go to you or Jenny or have the resources to do
23 that with not the people to do that? As a general
24 rule for the entire industry.

2 RUBEN DIAZ: The Chairman wants me to
3 shut up.

4 DIANNA PENNETTI: Excuse me?

5 RUBEN DIAZ: The Chairman is telling me
6 that I should end it.

7 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON: So,
8 I was reminding you that the clock is for five
9 minutes for every Council Member.

10 RUBEN DIAZ: No more questions. Thank
11 you.

12 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON: You
13 may answer the question.

14 DIANNA PENNETTI: I don't, I'm not sure
15 what his question was. My point is that regardless
16 of what industry that you work for if there is a
17 complaint it should go through 3-1-1 or call TLC so
18 it can be formally documented and followed up on
19 investigation. We have a very friendly relationship
20 with, you know it is more, it is less formal with the
21 liveries where people just call and give us the
22 information, that is fine. I'm just proponing that
23 they do a formal complaints, through the proper
24 channels.

2 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

3 Thank you, Council Member Levin.

4 MARK LEVINE: Thank you Chair.

5 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

6 Sorry.

7 MARK LEVINE: It happens a lot. Thank you
8 Mr. Chair and I be brief to my colleague with a
9 similar name.

10 STEPHEN LEVIN: That's alright Council
11 Member you have five minutes.

12 MARK LEVINE: Not a problem. I am always
13 honored to be confused with you Steve. (SPEAKING
14 FOREIGN LANGUAGE). Nice to see you Commissioner and
15 Deputy Commissioner. Uhm there is not a single
16 class of taxi driver which isn't struggling now and I
17 know today the focus is not on the yellows but I
18 can't not ask you about this. This is a crisis that
19 still festers, has been festering for years. I know
20 you know the background but I have to repeat it which
21 is that beginning in the early 2000s this city took
22 actions and at times failed to act in ways that have
23 ultimately led to a real financial crisis for the
24 owner driver of our yellow taxi industry. Thousands
25 of who are now uhm living under crushing debt. It is

2 destroying their lives. I know you are aware of
3 that. Uhm, this is a problem that can be solved.
4 This is a problem that can be solved through smart
5 policy solutions that are reasonably priced, maybe
6 even little to no cost depending on the kind of
7 system we develop and solutions that need to be
8 weighed against the nearly \$1 billion that the city
9 made itself during the bubble years of the taxi
10 medallion sales. Uhm and we've spoken about this
11 before and actually Council Member Levin has been
12 very active on this as well. Uhm, we could put
13 together a plan which offered debt relief for the
14 owner-drivers perhaps by guaranteeing some of the
15 outstanding loans by purchasing and re-financing
16 them. Uhm these are strategies which ultimately
17 might not even cost us anything because the loans
18 will likely be repaid but they would be life-changing
19 for drivers who would finally have a chance of
20 working under debt conditions which are commensurate
21 to the reality of today's market and that are
22 realistic considering what they can pay. Uhm can you
23 tell me the administration's current position on what
24 we need to do for the owner-drivers and particularly

2 your assessment of, of just the kind of resources it
3 would take to fix this?

4 BILL HEINZEN: Well I think you know that
5 we have undertaken several steps to try to assist the
6 yellow sector and that is included in the past few
7 years trying to identify regulation that was overly
8 burdensome whether that is extending the vehicle
9 retiring age for yellow, whether that is reducing the
10 transfer tax on medallions from 5% to 0.5%. We have
11 done that in partnership with the City Council. We
12 announced that we would stop and we have stopped
13 collecting the medallion renewal fees and we are
14 doing that. In reliance I would say on Legislation
15 that I know that you introduced that would have the
16 same effect and that would actually wave those fees.
17 We only have a power to not collect. There is a
18 medallion task force that Councilman Levin but also
19 Chair Rodriguez are the co-chairs of. The mayor has
20 representation on that. TLC has representation on
21 that. We have been participating very actively and
22 working together and I know there are several
23 solutions. I think you have heard the mayor say many
24 times that what he doesn't want is a bail out and he

2 doesn't want a bail out of credit unions and banks
3 which are the ones who pulled of.

4 MARK LEVINE: I have to jump in because
5 my time is up and uhm you know this is not a bail out
6 of the credit unions or the banks. Some of them
7 probably should go to jail. This is relief for
8 drivers who are suffering in part because of the
9 actions of the city. This is not a multi-billion
10 dollar proposition. This is the kind of thing that
11 could be done for far, far less than what we made in
12 the run up during the bubble years and is the least
13 that we owe these drivers. The steps you've taken so
14 far are welcome but they are not enough for someone
15 who is now suffering under half a million or 3/4 of a
16 million-dollar debt. So, but what, what about a plan
17 to guarantee some of these loans, for example in a
18 way that would ask the lenders to take a write down
19 but would leave the drivers with reasonable fairly
20 valued loans.

21 BILL HEINZEN: So, I can't, I mean I
22 think you know that I can't commit to a plan that I
23 haven't seen and I'm not going to negotiate from the
24 stand but as I said we are working on this process
25 but I believe the task force is developing, you know,

2 examining, looking at different alternatives. And we
3 are cooperating with the task force.

4 MARK LEVINE: Okay my time is up, we are
5 going to continue to push on this. This is a wound
6 that has not yet healed and we are going to hold the
7 city accountable until it does the right thing by
8 these owner-drivers. Uhm thank you Mr. Chair.

9 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

10 Thank you and before I call in the next colleague
11 here and because of the work that also we have been
12 doing in this field, also Council Member Levine also
13 to put it in perspective of to think that we are
14 discussing right now with the livery bases and the
15 corporate black car and they are related to one
16 situation that you know as we address it with the
17 commissioner here and that is something that would
18 like to give light, so something that the City is not
19 seeing right now which is how the not the Uber, not
20 the Lyft, not the Juno and Via and the other 71
21 companies but how this situation that is happening
22 in the City of New York that is affecting the auto
23 world bases because many of them they used to have
24 500 drivers affiliated, they went down to 250, many
25 of them been closing. Some of them were 200, so they

2 are going through that crisis that is the matter of
3 time they can be able to survive or not. So one of
4 the things that we are trying to discuss is the
5 possibility to let that group to be able to grow to
6 when they used to have the higher number and the
7 second part also that piece that we are discussing is
8 a language that we are discussing on creating a
9 livery bases and corporate black car task force so
10 that also we can discuss similar time and energy
11 that we are discussing with the yellow taxi
12 medallion. Because this crisis is affecting their
13 big time but no one is talking about it.

14 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON: So,
15 with that, Council Member Miller.

16 I. DANEEK MILLER: Thank you very much
17 Mr. Chair. Uhm and I apologize if this was asked
18 before. How many bases have closed in the livery and
19 black car bases have closed in the last uhm five
20 years? And are we tracking kind of specifically why
21 each base is closing and kind of when it is happening
22 and trying to see if it is, where the trends are?

23 BILL HEINZEN: So, I may have, I may have
24 those numbers right in front of me but I don't want
25 to waste your time and dig through them but I can get

2 you those numbers but we know that several bases have
3 closed we know maybe more significantly it is not so
4 much how many bases have closed or not, it is how
5 many vehicles do they have affiliated with them? How
6 many drivers are working with them? How many trips
7 are they doing and in those instances the numbers are
8 down in almost every case and they are significantly
9 down and that has been something that started around
10 2013 or 2014.

11 I. DANEEK MILLER: Okay uhm you know if
12 we were looking at the industry from a kind of
13 30,000-foot view, uhm there are obviously more
14 drivers uhm in the city now than there was in 2013.

15 BILL HEINZEN: Twice as many.

16 I. DANEEK MILLER: There is also a lot
17 more trips? Right?

18 BILL HEINZEN: Twice as many.

19 I. DANEEK MILLER: Twice as many, so,
20 what's, when you think about the amount of revenue
21 that has been spread around or the amount of income
22 that is spread around uhm that universe, uhm, what I
23 think, I mean are we doing an analysis of kind of
24 where all of that revenue is going? Because my sense
25 is that uhm in that big picture so there has been

2 twice as many trips with twice as many drivers,
3 everybody, people were making a living in 2013 doing
4 this job. They are not making a living in 2019 doing
5 this job. Uhm, but the revenue is there. There is
6 plenty of, there is plenty of money being spent by
7 consumers for for-hire vehicles in New York City.
8 Uhm, is it because the app-based companies have been
9 taking such an outsized share of the revenue that we
10 are seeing that everybody else, the drivers, the
11 livery and black car bases, uhm the medallion owners,
12 the driver owners, the other drivers, everyone else
13 is kind of seeming to have trouble making ends meet
14 now even though there is a lot more revenue than
15 there was five or six years ago.

16 BILL HEINZEN: So we have done, you know
17 we have done studies some of them ordered by City
18 Council into the, into the income and the expenses of
19 different categories or drivers and some that
20 resulted in the driver pay policy that the City
21 Council uhm authorized. And that has resulted in,
22 you know an increase in, in, in the amount of money
23 going to drivers for those drivers who drive for the
24 apps but yes that, that was done to address the
25 problem that you speak of which is we had so many

2 more drivers and so many more vehicles and even,
3 although there were more trips they did create some
4 more demand. There have been too many drivers for
5 the amount of trips there are and so that there was a
6 race to the bottom in terms of driver pay especially
7 in the beginning when the apps were charging very,
8 very, very low fares and they were pricing other
9 people out of business and they were also not paying
10 their drivers very much but because they were the
11 font of all of the trips, the drivers didn't, didn't
12 have a lot of choice but to go to them for those
13 trips and to try to work harder and harder even if
14 they were making less and less and we've tried to
15 address that.

16 I. DANEEK MILLER: Have you spoken to
17 driver, livery drivers to see why they are staying
18 with the livery system? Those drivers that are still
19 dispatching with the livery base?

20 BILL HEINZEN: I mean we speak with
21 livery drivers all the time. I think the ones that
22 are staying with it it is because it is a reliable
23 source of employment and income and they know the,
24 they know the other drivers, they know the people in
25 the bases. They are often people they have grown up

2 with. They know the passengers it is a part of their
3 community.

4 I. DANEEK MILLER: Uh-huh and our
5 drivers, livery drivers uhm do you get a sense also
6 driving frat based and uhm?

7 BILL HEINZEN: Yes.

8 I. DANEEK MILLER: And sometimes even
9 yellow as well?

10 BILL HEINZEN: Yes, with the universal
11 license which is something that you guys created by
12 local law a couple of years ago there is now one
13 driver licensing, with that you can drive across most
14 of the different sectors.

15 I. DANEEK MILLER: Uh-huh.

16 BILL HEINZEN: But definitely drivers
17 drive for different sectors and drivers are going
18 where as you would expect, they are going where the
19 trips are which is where the money is so many people
20 mix. They won't just drive with one app, they will
21 drive with different but they will also pick up trips
22 from livery and traditional bases as well.

23 I. DANEEK MILLER: Okay, if I, if we
24 could get a list of the bases that have closed and
25 kind of when they were closing and any other

2 additional data that you would have from those
3 closures, that would be helpful to know. Thanks.
4 Thank you Chair.

5 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON: Thank
6 you. Council Member Deutsch?

7 CHAIM DEUTSCH: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
8 LANGUAGE). I want to ask the chair permission if
9 Reverend Ruben Diaz could be my translator after my
10 question? Thank you. So uhm Commissioner you uhm
11 before the chair mentioned that he has, he is going
12 to draft a bill to create a livery task force and you
13 agree that it is a good idea, that you would support
14 it?

15 BILL HEINZEN: Yes, I've said that,
16 I've said that before and I will say it again today.
17 I am saying it again today.

18 CHAIM DEUTSCH: Okay, so my questions is
19 why would you support having a livery task force?
20 What is the benefit?

21 BILL HEINZEN: Well let me say, let me
22 say one other thing which is that if that Legislation
23 doesn't pass then I would support.

24 CHAIM DEUTSCH: No, no, I'm just asking
25 you.

2 BILL HEINZEN: Then I would support
3 working on a livery task force.

4 CHAIM DEUTSCH: My question is, why would
5 you support a livery task force?

6 BILL HEINZEN: I would support, uhm for
7 the reasons that I think we have discussed which is
8 to get people together and stakeholders together to
9 work on trying to understand what the problems are in
10 the industry better and to do that systematically and
11 to try to, TLCs role would be to try to assist that
12 in terms of the trip data that we do collect and some
13 of just our industry experience and looking at ways
14 that may be whether it is licensing or other
15 divisions, you know could, could work better with the
16 industry if there are issues.

17 CHAIM DEUTSCH: And I would support that
18 too so doesn't, don't you have discretion to
19 implement something without waiting for a bill and
20 that bill to pass and for you to come here to another
21 hearing and to waste these people's time because
22 right now while they are here they are losing money.
23 No one is reimbursing them. The city should
24 reimburse each and every one of them for being here
25 today and not to waste their time on another Bill

2 that you have discretion to implement before a bill
3 is even drafted?

4 BILL HEINZEN: I understand your
5 questions. I didn't all this hearing. I understand
6 that for drivers every time they are not, they come
7 to something like this I understand that they are not
8 making money. I understand that. I understand that.

9 CHAIM DEUTSCH: But I also understand
10 looking, you also said that you are going to be
11 looking into his Bill, let's not look into the Bill
12 let's get it done.

13 BILL HEINZEN: That's right and we have
14 already started working. We have already started
15 conversations.

16 CHAIM DEUTSCH: These people here, uhm
17 have a difficult time to, to put food on their table,
18 to make ends meet, to take care of the families, to
19 pay for the colleges and are wasting their time.
20 Let's form a livery task force today, today. People
21 are struggling each and every day. We have suicides
22 that are happening all across the city. We need to
23 take care of them.

24 BILL HEINZEN: So I...

2 CHAIM DEUTSCH: And I would recommend
3 that every livery driver should have a picture in
4 there vehicle of every TLC commissioner from all five
5 boroughs and when you are waiting on the street for a
6 livery car they should not pick anyone up until we
7 get the job done. I would like to ask Ruben Diaz to
8 translate for me.

9 RUBEN DIAZ: I, I just.

10 CHAIM DEUTSCH: Just my answer.

11 RUBEN DIAZ: Yeah.

12 CHAIM DEUTSCH: As I've said and I've
13 said before we've agreed to work with the task force
14 but we've already started the work and we've already
15 started the meetings and those meetings have taken
16 place uhm with Chair Rodriguez, with members of the
17 livery community and with drivers and we've had
18 discussions and we continue having those discussion
19 if you. Let's stop discussions. Are in this office
20 for more than three years, let's get it done. Enough
21 with discussions I'm being serious. I'm not here.
22 There is no press here. There is no one standing
23 there. Let's get the job done and let's get this task
24 force rolling.

2 BILL HEINZEN: I have not, as I've said
3 not only am I willing to cooperate with that, we
4 already are cooperating and having those discussions
5 and I'm happy to. I will come and meet with you in
6 your District. I know you have a lot of drivers.

7 CHAIM DEUTSCH: I don't need to meet. I
8 want to get this done. We can meet after the livery
9 task force is implemented and I'll tell you
10 something, I stand with Reverend Ruben Diaz since day
11 one. He's the one and only the one and only who
12 stood up for each and every one of you since day one.

13 BILL HEINZEN: I have nothing further to
14 say.

15 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON: And by
16 the way you were the only one who voted in favor of
17 the committee. The only one who voted to keep the
18 committee open. You was the only one and I would
19 like to thank you for that. Great and so now we are
20 going to reopen the second, giving a second round of
21 two minutes. So, if anybody else have like a second
22 round of questions we have two minutes. This way,
23 Mark. COunc...

24 MARK LEVINE: Thank you Mr. Chair, uhm
25 commissioner some of the, the established bases have

2 made a request for some sort of restrictive license
3 whereby a car would be attached to a particular base
4 so that those cars don't, uhm essentially do double
5 duty with one of the app-based companies, etc. Some
6 of the folks in the bases describe the competition
7 for drivers to be as much of a severe challenging as
8 the competition for passengers. Does the
9 administration have a position on such a proposal?
10 Could you talk about your thoughts of the workability
11 of such a proposal?

12 BILL HEINZEN: So, as you know this is
13 something there is there is a feeling and we have
14 heard a lot of concerns from livery community that
15 because of the vehicle license cap where before it
16 has been harder for them to get affiliated vehicles.
17 It is something that goes back before the vehicle
18 license capped as I said to about 2013, 2014 to the
19 introduction of the uhm of the apps. We've committed
20 to uhm working you know we've committed to working
21 with the commission or with the community and trying
22 to come up with solutions. I will say that the
23 vehicle license cap was responding to a very problem
24 that.

2 MARK LEVINE: But wouldn't new licenses
3 that are restricted to not, not the app-based
4 companies with the high volume but some of these uhm,
5 longer standing community-based companies. Wouldn't
6 that help solve the problem for them?

7 BILL HEINZEN: That is something that you
8 know we would want to look at. How attracted how
9 much that would help the bases and how attractive
10 that would be for the drivers and I am willing to
11 have those conversations.

12 MARK LEVINE: Okay, if you can followup I
13 would like to hear more about that from you. Okay, I
14 appreciate your consideration. Thank you. Thank you,
15 Mr. Chair.

16 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:
17 Councilman Diaz do you have any questions?

18 RUBEN DIAZ: No.

19 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:
20 Thank you. Uhm Commissioner I just hope again
21 that we will continue, you know working together
22 addressing the urgency of this situation. I feel
23 that you know leadership comes with responsibility
24 and that is what we've been trying to do. You know
25 to be able to listen to the voices and listen to the

2 need but also to focus on solution. You know it is
3 not only to use it for any purpose but it is now
4 right now the focus should be how do we get the City
5 of New York that sometimes videoing a commission,
6 that is videoing a council member. It is a whole
7 body, including it when you are in a leadership
8 position you have to listen and discuss in the
9 pressure comes from all the sectors. Not a chairman
10 is a commissioner, chairman of a committee,
11 especially like this one where we have so much
12 interest. We are the debating a failing by giving so
13 much power to the app company and they did it with
14 support of people in this room. So, it is a way for
15 the crisis. While in 2014 they were meeting with
16 Uber and they give Uber the okay to with our
17 coalition to be able for Uber to say if you promote
18 \$4000 to a driver, let's recruit those drivers from
19 the bases. (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). (background
20 noise). Thank you Commissioner. (SPEAKING FOREIGN
21 LANGUAGE).

22 BILL HEINZEN: Thank you.

23 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON: Your
24 time by any chance at least for the first panel you
25 can?

2 BILL HEINSEN: I have to go another
3 people but I've people here who will stay.

4 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON: Okay
5 thank you. (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). Sierra
6 Angeles, Scott Rutter, Diana Clemente, Habek Caleza
7 (SP?). (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). No, they do,
8 they will, they live between there. Thank you.
9 (extended silence). So, if the testimonies is again
10 longer than two minutes, yes, summarize please. It's
11 got to be in two minutes.

12 SIERRA ANGELES: Good afternoon
13 honorable Chairman Rodriguez and members of the
14 transportation committee. My name is Sierra Angeles
15 and I represent the livery base owners. The livery
16 base owners have affiliated 250 livery bases in New
17 York City which actually serve 150 New Yorkers every
18 day in every borough across the City. Our passengers
19 are residence of the outer boroughs and open
20 Manhattan who may or may not speak English as a first
21 language. Our bases are equipped to serve these
22 passengers because most of membership are immigrants
23 as well who come, we come from the same communities
24 as our passengers. There is a word that can best
25 describe the state of our industry and that work is

2 dying. We are calling on the City Council to help
3 bring us back to life. In 2014, our sector of the
4 for-hire livery industry enjoyed over 25,000
5 affiliated vehicles. Today according to the TLC we
6 only have about 9000 vehicles. The state of our
7 industry is not due to mismanagement, it is not due
8 to loss of demand. We have served transportation
9 deserts for years and we have a healthy customer
10 base. Rather we are victims of the priority
11 practices of the high-volume for-hire services and
12 the city efforts to regulate them. As described by
13 Commissioner Hansen in 2018 we had 437 bases. Today
14 we have 390 bases. We lost 47 in all. This cap of
15 the new for-hire licenses must be tweaked to create a
16 lane for the small bases under the existing cap that
17 TLC does not allow a new FHB license that a driver
18 holds to enter or re-enter the market when an
19 existing license is lost. Drivers can lose their
20 licenses for any number of reasons. Accumulated
21 infractions on easy pass, insurance lapse or even
22 driver career change or retirement. In the past this
23 wasn't an issue because TLC will allow the driver to
24 restore their license once a defect was cured or they
25 were regularly issued new licenses which allows us to

2 replace the drivers in summarizing who retire or
3 change careers; however, under the cap, the TLC will
4 not issue new licenses for those for those drivers.
5 We understand that the public policy behind the cap
6 is to curb congestion in Manhattan Central Business
7 District; however, our community car service bases do
8 not contribute to that congestion. The vast majority
9 of our rides are local, therefore the livery base
10 owner supports the creation of a new class of license
11 or restricted vehicle license. We also support the
12 creation of the task force to look at the industry,
13 to bring the drivers and the bases together and to
14 respond to the needs and concerns of drivers and
15 bases alike. We believe the TLC can make these
16 changes through the rule making process, but we also
17 ask the City Council to support the TLC in that
18 process; however, if the TLC fails to adequate
19 address our needs for a restricted license then we
20 call on City Council to take Legislative action to
21 ensure our small bases can continue to serve our
22 communities. Respectfully Sierra.

23 SCOTT RUTTER: Good afternoon, my name is
24 Scott Rutter, I am representing the luxury limousine
25 base operators here in New York City. I am going to

2 paraphrase for time sake. We fully support the
3 city's effort for a well-regulated injury here;
4 however, our concern is that many of the regulations
5 that come out from the city and from the TLC take no
6 consideration over the various different base license
7 types within the city and we desperately need
8 differentiation between what regulations are, are
9 impacting what base type because frankly a number of
10 our bases are struggling like all the others to
11 survive in this environment. A few examples I would
12 want to point out. First, the minimum pay driver
13 requirements, this was an extremely important
14 initiative that the city took on and we applaud that
15 but these regulations were clearly not needed in our
16 base segment, right? The high majority of our
17 drivers are employees of the company they are not
18 independent operators. They have no expenses when
19 they work throughout the day. Our bases pay all of
20 those expensive, expenses including the cost of the
21 car, the fuel, the insurance, the maintenance, even
22 if there is damage to that vehicle. These drivers
23 are protected by Fair Labor Standards, Minimum Wage,
24 Overtime, Sick Leave, Unemployment, Disability, in
25 many cases health insurance. These drivers make

2 \$50,000, \$70,000, \$100,000 a year and these were W2
3 wages, these are not 1099 before the driver then is s
4 saddled with all the expenses. Uhm, more importantly
5 our bases, next issue of congestion, congestion
6 issues, our bases don't offer demand on demand
7 service which is the prime issue. The majority of
8 our business are established customers that are all
9 prearranged hours, days, weeks in advance. They go
10 out, they service they don't uhm, they don't cruise
11 the streets. One last point, the vehicle moratorium,
12 we build our business selling new accounts; however,
13 if I got out and sell a new account today I can't add
14 the employees or vehicles to service that or worse if
15 I lose an account I will have to lay off those
16 drivers, get rid of my cars which I then cannot
17 replace. That is forcing our businesses to shrink
18 which is putting an end to the luxury base which is
19 one of the highest paying sectors in the, in the FHV
20 industry. We desperately need differentiation
21 between various different base types and what
22 regulations are impacting, not a one size fits all.
23 Thank you.

24 HABEK CALEZA (SP?): Good afternoon my
25 name is Habek Caleza I am from the livery roundtable

2 and I am also the Chairman of the New York State
3 Worker's Compensation Fund and I want to take a few
4 seconds to remind everybody here how, how did we live
5 before Uber and Lyft. Medallion was over 1 million.
6 We grew at the 5% year over year in direct
7 correlation to the growth of population and tourism.
8 Then came Uber and Lyft and what did they do?
9 Medallion went down from 1 million to 140, drivers
10 were tempted and rushed with promises and subsidies
11 that are no longer existent or being abused and us,
12 we lost 70% of our business. We didn't cause none of
13 it and we knew, we didn't have issues of congestion
14 when it was us. We didn't have an issue of driving
15 being abused when it was us. We ran the city and
16 served the City in direct correlation to the need.
17 Then came the temporary cap and now the permanent.
18 The livery cannot survive another year of a cap. On
19 the livery fund we used to have 28,000 drivers,
20 vehicles, now we have 9,000. Chairman I applaud you
21 for what you are doing. What we are asking for is
22 very simple. The commissioner who was here said that
23 they inflicted the cap on everybody because they were
24 afraid that if they will give us the exemption that
25 Uber and Lyft will be able to bypass the cap and

2 dispatch to our drivers. This is why we are
3 suggesting that restricted license. That cannot be
4 dispatched by Uber and Lyft and will allow us, will
5 allow us the same recovery and help that Council
6 Member Levine here was looking for the taxi. The
7 other gentleman was looking for the drivers. We are
8 looking for a chance to recover and resume our normal
9 growth and normal service of customers in our
10 neighborhoods that are not serviced by taxis. Thank
11 you.

12 SCOTT RUTTER: Uhm Thank you Mr. Chair,
13 so was I accurate in stating that you have as much of
14 a problem competing for drivers as customers at this
15 point? Or was that a little off? With the cap,
16 Council Member it is much tougher competing for
17 drivers. No matter what amount of marketing I can
18 do, I can get many more customers but I cannot answer
19 the demand because I have no drivers. And I think
20 that, I don't know the Council Member sitting at the
21 end was trying to tell us that the way of the app is
22 the way of the future. I also want to remind him
23 that they are losing \$1 billion a year and if this
24 companies are going to run the city, I don't think it
25 is going to last long. So, we are asking and we are

2 grateful for your support. We are asking just to
3 recover, the option to recover what we lost under
4 this unfair competition and the same way that you are
5 suggesting the bail out for the taxi, our bail out
6 will not even cost a penny to the city, will actually
7 maybe add a little bit more on fees but absolutely
8 serve the community in the five boroughs. So, so
9 yeah I will fight this for drivers right now. Now
10 the drivers, people often confuse between the, the
11 increasing ridership to, to the fact that we are
12 losing drivers. And I think I would like to take a
13 second to explain. Uber and Lyft drivers are abused
14 when, when, when the demand is low and customers are
15 abused when the demand is higher. This is why you
16 have so many unhappy Uber and Lyft drivers because
17 you cannot make money on the rush hour. They are
18 abused with the \$6 local limit when the demand is
19 high and they are abusing the customer with \$150 when
20 the demand is high. We don't have this relationship
21 with a customer or with the driver. We have a steady
22 rationale relationship throughout the day. Uber
23 being able to drive those drivers every rush hour
24 makes our customer, leaves them stranded. By giving
25 us this change of being a restricted livery and

2 restricted black car and luxury limousine we will be
3 able to honor. Those are not big numbers, we are not
4 growing at 65% year over year like Uber did. We are
5 growing at 5 to 6% so we are asking and we are
6 applauding you Commissioner, Chairman Ydanis for
7 doing what you are doing. You are giving us, this is
8 the first light, this is the first light of a chance
9 that I am seeing in the last six years. Thank you
10 Council Member Ydanis.

11 MARK LEVINE: I will pass it back. I just
12 want to observe the powerful point that you are
13 making which is if you have two different business
14 models competing for the same license one is going to
15 get crowded out and so I appreciate you articulating
16 that. We definitely are very concerned about making
17 sure that the service remains available for all New
18 Yorkers. Thank you, thank you very much.

19 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

20 Sierra can you, can you tell us a little bit
21 about how big is the crisis that is affecting? Let's
22 say since you are familiar citywide but especially
23 those bases that we have you know and you work very
24 closely with all of them particularly how serious is
25 the reduction of cars that those bases that we have

2 let's say from the uptown to Robario (SP?) to
3 Washington Heights in the Bronx. How serious is the
4 problem on the reduction of cars in those bases?

5 SIERRA ANGELES: It is a very serious
6 issue that needs to be looked at for various regions.
7 In 2014, we were approximately 508 bases and at the
8 end of 2018 the TLC said that we were at 437 and
9 today from the commissioner's testimony we heard that
10 we are barely 390. So, you can see the, the direct
11 impact but that impact is on the bases but is also on
12 the drivers. Whenever you see the impact and whether
13 or not there is differences between drivers and bases
14 you still have a community that stays together and
15 stays strong. The difference as you pointed out
16 Council Member Levine before our drivers feel
17 comfortable. Because they can speak to a manager,
18 they can speak to everybody and when you agree to
19 disagree there are other options that you can
20 actually go for. The fact is that the at base
21 companies do not even give you that option is just
22 the simple person hat is there and they are not there
23 to help you or to assist you. It is a machine. We
24 have grown by demand 3 to 5% as stated by Habek
25 Caleza (SP?). We have not grown based on the numbers

2 that we have to produce for our investors. We are
3 growing organically as the demand comes from our
4 community. As the drivers are able to make
5 relationships in our communities and build that
6 relationship with the neighborhood. So, that's the
7 reason why it is also good because the driver is in
8 control of the money. When the driver holds a \$10
9 ride is his ride he pays on a weekly bases to the
10 base that is convenient to him. He is to hold for
11 one base in particular. So, the crisis has elevated
12 to a point with the cap in which we see that it has
13 impacted more of the driver than us to an extent why?
14 Because our drivers sometimes due to the
15 circumstances of the inability to make money all the
16 time the same way, it all depends on passenger
17 demand, that driver faces difficulties paying you
18 know renewing their licenses or if they get into an
19 accident and they have to go in and inspect the
20 vehicle. They were not able to renew that diamond.
21 Now, the diamond is called the FHB license that is
22 attached to the vehicle. That vehicle can no longer
23 be put back in the system. Jenny, for instance sent
24 me a gentleman that had an issue because he was three
25 months out of his insurance payment and he wasn't

2 able to make it because when he came in it was like
3 almost 13 or 17 days after and the company refused to
4 accept the payment because it was over a certain
5 amount of time. He lost a license. He was bear with
6 the burden to return the plates. The TLC, the City
7 can create a system in which you say okay we are
8 going to have a cap. If the cap started in 2018 at
9 135,0000 vehicles by 2019, we are talking about
10 120,000. So, what cap are we talking about? It's
11 not it is not a cap. A cap is a number, a threshold
12 that we put together and we allow our drivers to be
13 able to re-enter the system if something happens to
14 their vehicle, why? Because now you have put that
15 driver in the predicament to find someone to rent a
16 vehicle from while his own vehicle that he owes to
17 the bank is sitting in a garage. So, imagine the
18 economic burden that that driver has now and their
19 predatory practices that now you have forced that
20 driver to be in. If he wants to retire and he says I
21 want to sell my car to my friend he wants to be a
22 driver, and he wants to have his own car I cannot
23 sell the car you don't want because there are no more
24 licenses for 5-passenger vehicles and 7-passenger
25 vehicles. The only vehicles that can come into the

2 industry are the electric vehicle and the wheelchair.
3 But a lot of our drivers don't have the money that a
4 wheelchair vehicle costs and to maintain that vehicle
5 and/or the wheelchair creating also an economic
6 burden more on the drivers than on the bases. So,
7 therefore, I believe it has to be a mechanism that
8 allows the drivers to if he has any issues and he an
9 prove and he can had a previous license that he is
10 able to re-register that he is able to come back into
11 the industry as well what we are asking and for a
12 restricted license because that concern that city had
13 was that they didn't want those drivers going back
14 into the high-volume basis affiliation and we feel
15 that if the driver wants to work in the community, if
16 he wants to make a living, we have shown to grow by
17 demand and we can continue to show them that there is
18 a way to make an honest and decent living. I believe
19 that we can bring consensus and we help both the
20 drivers and the bases because we do not operate, you
21 know indistinctively of issues. We have them
22 together and we are here together to serve a
23 community that needs the rights because that has also
24 created a wait time that we never had before that
25 has also created issues where you have to a passenger

2 call me back later in five minutes because I don't
3 have any vehicles. So, all of those things that we
4 are seeing and many people can give you many reasons
5 but this was, these are things that we see on the day
6 to day.

7 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

8 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

9 SIERRA ANGELES: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
10 LANGUAGE).

11 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON: And

12 my last question and of course you don't have any
13 position. I understand if you have any position on
14 this, the said Bill that is at a counsel that will
15 allow drivers, will expand from yellow to also
16 include the livery bases and the corporate black car
17 opportunities if they would like to do it to also let
18 the driver who put advertise in the type of the car
19 so that they can make the corporate \$100 if they
20 decide to do it. Have you looked at it? (SPEAKING
21 FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

22 SIERRA ANGELES: Uhm my understanding of
23 that bill is that it procures to give the drivers
24 \$300 a month paid uh twice a week, every two weeks
25 I'm sorry. We don't have any issues with that. I

2 thin that is a decision that the drivers have to
3 make. It is in their vehicle and they can chose you
4 know to do it or not. (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

5 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

6 Okay. (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). So, with
7 that (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). Thank you.

8 RUBEN DIAZ: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).
9 I want to ask Sierra Angeles a question but I would
10 like a short answer to respond? How much money, the
11 driver pays each base. (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

12 SIERRA ANGELES: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
13 LANGUAGE).

14 RUBEN DIAZ: Average.

15 SIERRA ANGELES: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
16 LANGUAGE).

17 RUBEN DIAZ: For that money what is the
18 base salary to the driver?

19 SIERRA ANGELES: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
20 LANGUAGE).

21 RUBEN DIAZ: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

22 SIERRA ANGELES: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
23 LANGUAGE).

24 RUBEN DIAZ: 200,000.

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

85

2 SIERRA ANGELES: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
3 LANGUAGE) .

4 RUBEN DIAZ: To be clear, (SPEAKING
5 FOREIGN LANGUAGE) .

6 SIERRA ANGELES: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
7 LANGUAGE) .

8 RUBEN DIAZ: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE) .

9 SIERRA ANGELES: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
10 LANGUAGE) .

11 RUBEN DIAZ: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE) .

12 SIERRA ANGELES: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
13 LANGUAGE) .

14 RUBEN DIAZ: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE) .

15 SIERRA ANGELES: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
16 LANGUAGE) .

17 RUBEN DIAZ: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE) .

18 SIERRA ANGELES: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
19 LANGUAGE) .

20 RUBEN DIAZ: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE) .

21 SIERRA ANGELES: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
22 LANGUAGE) .

23 RUBEN DIAZ: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE) .

24 SIERRA ANGELES: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
25 LANGUAGE) .

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

86

2 RUBEN DIAZ: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

3 SIERRA ANGELES: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
4 LANGUAGE).

5 RUBEN DIAZ: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

6 SIERRA ANGELES: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
7 LANGUAGE).

8 RUBEN DIAZ: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

9 SIERRA ANGELES: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
10 LANGUAGE).

11 RUBEN DIAZ: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

12 SIERRA ANGELES: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
13 LANGUAGE).

14 RUBEN DIAZ: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

15 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON: So,
16 like we are going to working again with all the bases
17 that they are affiliated in the association of the
18 livery bases and the corporate and hopefully after we
19 create a task for and what we heard so far. I can
20 say is a good opportunity that we have. I think that
21 we are in a good place in this conversation and what
22 I have experienced now as a co-chair of the yellow
23 taxi or the medallion task force is that by creating
24 the task force we will be able to bring together a
25 group of people to spend quality time. You know

2 identifying not only the challenge but also thinking
3 about solution and one suggestion that I made is
4 about starting looking for any academic institution
5 because I think that this is something that is
6 important and doesn't want from the NYU, Columbia,
7 CUNY, SUNY that you feel that could be an interest
8 you know to be part of this conversation from the
9 beginning. They can be very helpful. (SPEAKING
10 FOREIGN LANGUAGE). When we lose as base, like I
11 would never imaging Washington Heights without car
12 service and probably because I know how they fought
13 to (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). You know thinking
14 about the diamond car service of our living in that
15 area. No one on Divine Avenue (sp?) same thing I
16 present. (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). So, thank
17 you.

18 SIERRA ANGELES: Thank you Chairman.

19 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON: In
20 this panel, Carlos Perez, Mero Lanza (SP?), Roberto
21 Rodriguez, Luis Reyes, Alahesa Perrero (SP?), Jose
22 Luis de la Rosa. (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). The
23 time is in two minutes as we did it before to the
24 other one is because we want to be sure that there is
25 opportunity for everyone so if by any chance the

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

88

2 testimony is longer than two minutes, summarize it.

3 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). (background noise). You
4 may begin.

5 ROBERTO RODRIGUEZ: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
6 LANGUAGE).

7 JOSE DE LA ROSA: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
8 LANGUAGE). (background speaking).

9 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:
10 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

11 CARLOS PEREZ: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
12 LANGUAGE).

13 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON: On
14 is what you said before, definitely going to be
15 working with you. You know your concerns about how
16 we can work with you guys and support you know the
17 fight and the cause on those drivers being arrested
18 by TLC so, (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE) whatever,
19 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). The last Wednesday of
20 the month is the community board TLC has a delegation
21 of 13 that they listen in to all cases. (SPEAKING
22 FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

23 CARLOS PEREZ: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
24 LANGUAGE).

25

2 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

3 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

4 CARLOS PEREZ: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
5 LANGUAGE).

6 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

7 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). Next person please.

8 ZITO LANZER: Hi my lane is Zito Lanzer
9 (SP?). I've been driving in New York City yellow
10 taxi for over 41-1/2 years. The first five years I
11 worked for a company to save money to buy a taxi
12 medallion. You know thank God for the integrity of
13 the current City Council Committee on Transportation
14 and the one decent taxi commissioner I've known in
15 41-1/2 years is here Christopher Lin. Before Uber
16 and Lyft the yellow medallion taxis had the
17 technology before them and it was already being used.
18 It was caused halo. The black car services sued, it
19 went to court and the judge said that we cannot use
20 halo is a street hail. It was the same lawyer
21 representing the black car services then represented
22 Uber and with their money the judge says it is
23 prearrangement. What a corrupt system 86,000 Uber
24 and Lyft cars come into the city without having to
25 buy medallions, destroy environmental protection laws

2 of traffic and pollution, 86,000 Uber and Lyft cars
3 destroyed to supply and demand the medallion that the
4 TLC was selling for over \$1 million and then the TLC
5 says, it blames the brokers and lenders for predatory
6 lending. 86,000 cars have TLC on the back of these
7 Uber and Lyft and App cars. Not one has the name
8 Perleon on the back of it or Melrose Credit Union,
9 86,000 pieces of proof who rub us, who put their non-
10 fee labor hands on my labor and my contract and took
11 \$1 million and made it worthless so that he could get
12 everything for free and they don't have to drive a
13 taxi one day. They created modern day slavery where
14 they get everything for nothing at the expense of my
15 labor and contract and robbing me. (bell ringing).

16 ALAHESA PERRERO: Good afternoon, my name
17 is Alahesa Perrero. Good afternoon Chairman
18 Rodriguez and council members, taxi community and
19 everyone.

20 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

21 Sorry miss if you don't. Let's follow with your
22 case and see how we can. Let's follow after the
23 hearing with you so that we can get some time to sit
24 down. Okay.

2 LUIS REYES: I would just like
3 compensation for the crimes for the robbery of the
4 medallion that they did today because I picked up a
5 woman who was 73 yesterday and she said when she was
6 70 she could stop driving. I said I can't stop
7 driving when I'm 70 because they rubbed my million
8 dollar asset was my only asset in life. That I
9 worked over 41-1/2 years for and she said that this
10 is the person who was driving when they were 82 and
11 they ran into a bunch of people and these are all of
12 the people that.

13 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

14 Let's, let's follow with you. I promise you.
15 Sorry miss.

16 ALAHESA PERRERO: Okay. Alright uhm I
17 had a whole speech about different topic that I
18 wanted to speak of but I just to make entity on the
19 hardship that the community the taxi community is
20 facing with the high summons, the harassment, the
21 arrests they are facing not only by the TLC agents
22 but other city agencies that are being given tickets
23 to the taxi community left and right. There is a new
24 rule that has been established on 7th avenue which is
25 given uhm tickets to the drivers for \$115 which is a

2 crisis because a passenger that would cost you \$10
3 now can cost you a loss of \$95. Uhm the taxi
4 community has always been open to working with the
5 taxi and limousine commission and the city to find
6 the solution for all of the problems that we have
7 been facing for more than five years. We have
8 meetings previously with you Chairman about finding a
9 solution for this community. We urge you to work
10 with us. We are open to working with the community
11 with the taxi, limousine, with the councilmen to find
12 the solution to the problems. So, if you are going
13 to create a committee to work from every party to
14 have a person representing the issues that we have at
15 hand we are open to it but we don't want promises to
16 go into the air. We want action and we are seeking
17 for those actions now because we are at a point where
18 the people are just suffering too much and we need to
19 do something for it. We are citizens as everyone and
20 we need to have our rights and our livelihood and
21 family to be recognized. Thank you.

22 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

23 Thank you. (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

24 RUBEN DIAZ: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

25

2 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

3 Thank you. Next panel. Lucci Fabrin, Elesie
4 Cologne, Amalos Lopez, Raul Rivera, (SPEAKING FOREIGN
5 LANGUAGE). Okay Luis Reyes, I called on him before.
6 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). Jose Sanchez, Juan
7 Rivera. Luis Pomagamasi.

8 LUCCI FABRIN (SP?): (SPEAKING FOREIGN
9 LANGUAGE). The transport to the (SPEAKING FOREIGN
10 LANGUAGE).

11 LUIS POMAGAMSI (SP?): (SPEAKING FOREIGN
12 LANGUAGE). (bell ringing). (SPEAKING FOREIGN
13 LANGUAGE).

14 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:
15 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

16 JOSE SANCHEZ: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
17 LANGUAGE). (bell ringing). (SPEAKING FOREIGN
18 LANGUAGE).

19 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:
20 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

21 JOSE SANCHEZ: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
22 LANGUAGE).

23 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:
24 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

25

2 JOSE SANCHEZ: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
3 LANGUAGE).

4 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:
5 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

6 JUAN RIVERA: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
7 LANGUAGE). (bell ringing).

8 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:
9 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

10 RAUL RIVERA: Good afternoon Mr. Chair.
11 Before I read my statement I took a couple of notes.
12 I was listening, I was paying attention. TLC decoys
13 and entrapment continue. What we need is a CCRB for
14 the TLC. Do you know the CCRB? Right? We need
15 something similar, that's what we need independently
16 of the TLC. Uhm I just gave Bill Heinzen a formal
17 complaint. This dates back to March, March of this
18 year when a TLC inspector threatened me with arrest.
19 He harassed me with arrest. So, I filed a complaint
20 on him. I was interviewed by the TLC and I am still
21 waiting for a reply. I gave a copy to your office
22 and also to Mr. Heinzen and the young lady that was
23 speaking too. She gave me her card and I gave it to
24 her. Uhm, also last year the City Council gave
25 permission to the TLC to regulate pay and I don't, I

2 don't think that we actually need a bill passed. All
3 the City Council has to do is say to the TLC give
4 drivers 80% to 85% of the full fare. We discussed
5 this at the meeting that we had back in November just
6 a few weeks, a few days, a few days ago at your
7 office. This is a simple, this is a simple request,
8 80% to 85% of the full fare is going to benefit all
9 drivers across the board. It is going to be a domino
10 effect. All the boroughs are going to hear it, all
11 the drivers are going to hear it. Now, I will read
12 my statement. My name is Raul Rivera. I am a New
13 York City TLC driver. I was born and raised in the
14 Bronx. I am also a driver advocate, not by choice,
15 on October 3, 2018 at a TLC public hearing I told
16 Chairwoman Mara Joshi and the rest of the TLC
17 Commissions that if another driver took their life,
18 that I would create a petition to reform the TLC.
19 Unfortunately, on November 5, 2018, fellow brother
20 Roy Kim so heavily in debt took his own life. So,
21 on December 7, 2018 I created a petition to reform
22 the TLC in the hopes of stopping drivers from
23 committing suicide. As a fellow driver, I also
24 created the petition to help fight for my rights. I
25 cannot believe how my city has failed me and my

2 fellow TLC drivers. One by one I have been reaching
3 out to all City Council members as leaders and
4 gatekeepers of New York City I ask that you sign the
5 petition to reform the New York City Taxi and
6 Limousine Commission. If you are a City Council
7 Member and have not yet signed the petition, please
8 do so, support the New York City TLC driver, support
9 the reform of the TLC. Support the reform of the
10 Taxi and Limousine Commission. Thank you to Kalina
11 Rivera, Margaret Chin, Donovan Richards, Carlos
12 Menchaca, Ritchie Torres, Jumanne Williams, Fernando
13 Cabrerra, Ydanis Rodriguez. I would also like to
14 thank IBG, Families for Safe Streets, Vocal New York,
15 Edward Escobar, founder of Alliance for independent
16 workers, Rafael Rosario, Pedro Costa, Sloan Jueros
17 (SP?). The reform of the TLC must come from the
18 drivers. Drivers we will reform the New York City
19 Taxi and Limousine Commissions (SPEAKING FOREIGN
20 LANGUAGE) the TLC.

21 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

22 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

23 RAUL RIVERA: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

24 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

25 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

2 RAUL RIVERA: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

3 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

4 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

5 RAUL RIVERA: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE)

6 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

7 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

8 RAUL RIVERA: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE)

9 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

10 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

11 RAUL RIVERA: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

12 Mr. Rodriguez. (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). Ydanis.

13 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

14 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE) I think that we are

15 going in the good direction.

16 RAUL RIVERA: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

17 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

18 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

19 RAUL RIVERA: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

20 I just want to say one more thing.

21 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON: 30

22 seconds.

23 RAUL RIVERA: We have to pay attention

24 that we are entering a holiday season and we don't

25 want any more driver suicides. The 80%, 85% you don't

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

98

2 have to create a bill, all you have to do is tell the
3 TLC pay the drivers 80% of the full fare and prevent
4 another suicide.

5 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

6 Okay. (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). Next panel,
7 Maria Rodriguez, Ina Loyota (SP?), Oscar Martin,
8 Edgar Guzman. Lionel Baseline Biltray (SP?).
9 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

10 UNIDENTIFIED: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
11 LANGUAGE).

12 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:
13 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

14 UNIDENTIFIED: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
15 LANGUAGE).

16 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:
17 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

18 UNIDENTIFIED: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
19 LANGUAGE).

20 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON: Oh
21 no, 30 seconds more and then I move to the next
22 person, okay.

23 UNIDENTIFIED: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
24 LANGUAGE).

25

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION 99

2 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON: Okay

3 thank you. No sorry. Hold it leave it there next
4 person please.

5 UNIDENTIFIED: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
6 LANGUAGE)

7 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:
8 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

9 UNIDENTIFIED: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
10 LANGUAGE).

11 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:
12 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). Thank you.

13 UNIDENTIFIED: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
14 LANGUAGE).

15 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:
16 Okay, thank you.

17 UNIDENTIFIED: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
18 LANGUAGE).

19 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:
20 Thank you.

21 UNIDENTIFIED: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
22 LANGUAGE).

23 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:
24 Thank you. (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). Next

25 person please?

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION 100

2 OSCAR MARTIN: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
3 LANGUAGE).

4 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON: Hear
5 from you. (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

6 MARIA RODRIGUEZ: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
7 LANGUAGE). (bell ringing).

8 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:
9 Okay, okay. Thank you.

10 MARIA RODRIGUEZ: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
11 LANGUAGE).

12 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:
13 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). Thank you. Do you
14 speak Spanish?

15 EDGAR GUZMAN: No. So, I like to try to
16 speak a little English so no one would be able to
17 understand him, what I want to say. The good faith of
18 this committee of you know have this hearing held and
19 because we had, we can express our voice and somehow
20 you can understand the human part of the taxi
21 industry. In many, many channels that on television
22 I see the discussion on the taxi industry as a
23 microeconomic perspective. And we only talk about
24 the humane part of the industry that are affected.
25 You know the drivers, they held you know a lot of

2 part of their life are affected. Today, we are
3 talking about the livery, how it is affected and I
4 think uh in many ways because to these applications
5 they have been like operating in a loss and giving
6 more incentives to the riders, in a way to hurt the
7 competition. The use it as unfair competition. They
8 give you 50% when it is low but they charge you two
9 or three times when it is high demand and that is how
10 it can hurt the local bases because we can in no way
11 compete with that kind of business you know method.
12 So, another thing that I want to you know put on the
13 table is one of, one of the things that taxi
14 limousine can do it allow like the livery bases to
15 that we can charge up front to the riders, like you
16 know like the, if they say it is \$20 or \$15 or \$10
17 like as long as the rider get in, they pay the fare
18 and that way we feel more comfortable and we can
19 avoid issues between the riders and the drivers.
20 Thank you so much for the opportunity and I hope I
21 really going out of here more optimistic you know
22 spirit, so, I hope you guys keep your promises and we
23 will see.

24 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON: And
25 you know what we, what we've been looking to

2 accomplish is to insert you know the situation of
3 this sector into like whole talk right now in the
4 city about yellow, black car and livery and every one
5 so this is you know what we are today and you know we
6 are going to be the next hearing is going to be on
7 the 25th. That one is going to be with the MTA and
8 as you know there is a lot of things that we have
9 been doing. And the reason, that's a good thing to
10 be where we are because if you are shooting from the
11 bleachers and then you don't get to see let's say all
12 of those changes you know, someone you mentioned
13 Mario saying that the whole group now they are
14 providing new services for people with Medicaid and
15 Medicare and you know those things also have happened
16 because we have pushing the City to find a different
17 way on how the Taxi driver they should be able to
18 make additional record. As I said, we were able to
19 get TLC to remove 15 tickets that they used to give.
20 We created the universe license. Now, what we are
21 trying to do again is to have the conversation;
22 however, we can win, we need to fight together the
23 TLC they don't give any ticket to the driver who pick
24 up above 96h Street in the south Bronx, in Brooklyn,
25 in Queens, in other location. But those things

2 doesn't happen because they all missed the measure of
3 TLC. Let those drivers to pick up there. You know
4 it takes a lot of forces, it takes a lot of
5 conversation.

6 MARIA RODRIGUEZ: Uhm we are ready.

7 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON: So,
8 while we need to be able to build that voice, you
9 know to advocate to the, to focus on the results
10 because if we spent time on identifying things that
11 are dividers then we wouldn't win. So the only way
12 of how we would win that to be able to bring the
13 dignity to the drivers is by again working together,
14 making the reforms, pushing the City of New York to
15 let the driver to pick up those livery drivers at
16 both 96th Street without being to get a ticket from
17 TLC. But the law today, doesn't allow that to
18 happen. We need to change the law. So, when we try
19 to include a bill, you know to move a bill. There is
20 going to be 51 different voices. There is going to
21 be the mayor in the other side. So (SPEAKING FOREIGN
22 LANGUAGE).

23 MARIA RODRIGUEZ: (SPEAKING FOREIGN
24 LANGUAGE). We will be dismissed before December. I
25 want to, to go with that with that.

2 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

3 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). Yes, uhm I also
4 forgot that, that like the value, the values to this
5 city is priceless. We are, we transport people like
6 you know you heard it, to the hospital, to dialysis
7 at 4 o'clock in the morning. You know I think we
8 deserve respect and I think it is a good idea that we
9 can get uhm that thing that the city workers have,
10 the MTA drivers like if you put, attack the bus
11 drivers it is a felony and is up to 7 years so if you
12 put that there, like we can't, having the car and a
13 actual low so, people think to change some things to
14 arms one of the fellow drivers that have counseling
15 you know risking their life on the road with all kind
16 of weather I think with this or that or more.

17 RUBEN DIAZ: (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE).

18 YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ, CHAIRPERSON:

19 (SPEAKING FOREIGN LANGUAGE). Thank you and with
20 that this hearing is adjourned. (gavel pounding).
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 23, 2019