

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

----- X

June 5, 2017
Start: 10:18 a.m.
Recess: 1:53 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

- DANIEL R GARODNICK
- JUMAANE D. WILLIAMS
- ANTONIO REYNOSO
- JAMES VACCA
- DAVID POLLACKG. GREENFIELD
- I. DANEEK MILLER
- MARGARET S. CHIN
- STEPHEN T. LEVIN
- DEBORAH L. ROSE
- JAMES G VAN BRAMER
- DONOVAN J. RICHARDS
- COSTA G. CONSTANTINIDES
- CARLOS MENCHACA
- MARK LEVINE
- PETER KOO
- BRAD LANDER

BEN KALLOS
ANDREW COHEN
COREY JOHNSON

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Polly Trottenberg
Commissioner of the New York City Department of
Transportation

Thomas Chan
Chief of the Transportation Bureau of the New
Police Department

Eric Beaton
Acting Deputy Commissioner for Transportation
Planning and Management

Bruce Schaller
Principal of Schaller Consulting in Brooklyn, New
York

Alex Matthiessen
President of Blue Marble Project

Harry Malakoff
Private Citizen

Roderick Hills
Teacher at New York University Law School

Kendra Hems
President of the Trucking Association of New York

Mike Simas
Executive Vice President of the Partnership for
New York City

Eric McClure
Executive Director of StreetsPAC

Alec Slatky
Testifying on behalf of AAA Northeast

Adriana Espinoza
Manager of the New York City Program at the New
York League of Conservation Voters

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

David Pollack
President of the Taxi Cab Service Association,
Taxi Dave

Arthur Goldstein
Counsel to the TSA

1

2

[gavel]

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Buenos dias, good morning everyone and thank you for attending today's hearing of the New York City Council Transportation Committee. My name is Ydannis Rodriguez and I chair this committee. We are joined by my colleague Council Member's Koo, Levine, and Lander. As most New Yorkers can tell you our streets look like parking lots given the slowing pace of traffic. Over the past five years the vehicles have moved about ten percent slower through the central business district hindering the movement of goods, services, and people. The impact of these can be severe. In a study by the partnership for New York City which is now nearly ten years old found that the original cause of congestions are 13 billion in lows economy output and 52,000 jobs per year. This cause has likely grown in the past decade as our economy has expanded and traffic has become a nightmare. On top of this more cars on our roads means more dangerous conditions for cyclists, pedestrians, and other users. We are working hard to achieve Vision Zero and we have great partner from Mayor De Blasio, Chief Chan, Commissioner Polly Trottenberg and the TLC Commissioner and many great

1
2 friends and investing hundreds of millions of dollars
3 to save lives and it is counterproductive to have a
4 train so we're driving over other modes and lastly
5 this congestion adds considerably to our carbon
6 output and hurts our environment. While some in
7 Washington may not think it wise to commit to saving
8 our planet, New York certainly does and we will. We
9 hurt this effort when we allow congestion to build up
10 with millions of idling cars. The increase in
11 congestion has been caused by several factors some
12 positive, others not so much. Thankfully we have had
13 a healthy growing economy and an uptake in
14 construction both of which add to congestion. This
15 has corresponded with increase in job growth and
16 drops in unemployment, positive trends for our city.
17 We have also seen population growth and more tourists
18 than ever coming to New York City adding to our
19 status as a global one and attracting the talent of
20 tomorrow. This means more people on our streets and
21 sidewalks and more people supporting local businesses
22 and paying taxes. However, the factors that are less
23 positive stem from our inefficient movement of people
24 and goods are... and a lack of enforcement of assistant
25 lows. A recent study by former DOT Traffic

1
2 Commissioner Bruce Schaller shows that the... that the
3 rapid increase in for hire vehicle trips has added
4 considerably to congestion on our streets. With
5 500,000 trips per day adding 600 million more miles
6 driving on our streets. While it is good to see
7 innovation and technology improving access to
8 services, New Yorkers value the massive uptake means
9 people are choosing not to leave their personal cars
10 at home but to leave public transit, walking and
11 other modes and take cars instead. In New York we
12 have another reliance on trucks to move goods. With
13 an increase in online shopping what many have called
14 the Amazon Effect more packages are being delivered
15 to more people than ever before. Trucks often make
16 deliveries during the day even during rush hour.
17 Without better curbside management, these trucks are
18 often left to double park when they make deliveries
19 clogging a full lane of traffic and backing up a
20 street for blocks. Finally, the prevalence of double
21 parkers, people parking illegally in bike and bus
22 lanes and the misuse of parking placards is probably
23 our lowest, lowest hanging proof when it comes to
24 fighting congestion. According to Dr. Bob Paaswell,
25 Professor for the Civil Engineer City College, who

1
2 will be... who we will hear from today just by, by
3 enforcing our system traffic laws we can cut
4 congestion in Manhattan by close to 15 percent.
5 Through these and other means which we hope to
6 address today in full we can reduce congestion and
7 make our streets healthier and safer for all users.
8 Yet ultimately one thing remains very clear Manhattan
9 and our central business district is no place for
10 personal and luxury vehicles. This is the densest
11 island on the planet where with millions of
12 pedestrians and cyclist moving about with buses, car,
13 commercial, and municipal vehicles keep the city
14 clean, moving, and producing, producing. One way to
15 start is to legislation introduced by Council Member
16 Mark Levine and myself Intro 1031 which would require
17 that DOT to study the impact of traffic of trucks
18 making deliveries at night instead of during the day.
19 DOT encouraged this through a pilot program in recent
20 year and participating businesses found positive
21 results both in logistically efficiency and to cost
22 savings. This is an astringent approach that we
23 should look at more seriously for wider
24 implementation. Just over a month ago in the lead up
25 to our car free day in April I propose several ideas

1
2 for reducing congestion through rethinking how
3 deliver of large goods... large goods are made in
4 cities around the world including here in the United
5 State in Portland, Oregon large scale deliveries are
6 broken up and delivered by electric tricycles. They
7 take up less space, are less likely to hit or injure
8 pedestrians or other cyclists and do not dominate
9 curbside and close lanes and double park. This means
10 changing a state law to allow of electronic cyclists
11 but it is something that could have a positive impact
12 on our streets. I'm calling out Albany, the Governor,
13 and the State Legislator to work with the city to
14 make those changes happen now. In our most congested
15 area we have a responsibility as a city not to
16 contribute directly to this issue. This means reusing
17 the use of city vehicles in the Manhattan core unless
18 absolutely necessary and I hope to see all the city
19 agencies getting those workers to use the train and
20 the buses unless they have to use city vehicles to do
21 inspections or other jobs related to the city. There
22 needs to be restrictions on black car use in the
23 Midtown and Downtown areas so that these vehicles are
24 not even considered when employees need to travel to
25 this area. I hopeful... I am hopeful we will hear from

1
2 DOT some strategies in the Mayor's for calming
3 congestion plan including some ideas about curbside
4 management, parking pricing models that make driving
5 less incentivized especially in Manhattan's core.
6 From the NYPD, I'm hopeful... I'm hopefully... hopeful we
7 will hear more about the enforcement plan for illegal
8 placard use including any early results how we can
9 better address double parking and how we are
10 responding to trucks running of designated truck
11 routes. And from TLC I'm hopeful we can hear about
12 industry trends and how we might better consider the
13 number of for hire cars operating on our roads
14 particularly in Midtown, Western Queens and
15 Northwestern Brooklyn. From our other panelists, I'm
16 interested in hearing solutions to this congestion
17 challenge... challenges we face and how we can discuss
18 driving into Manhattan. I'm hopeful, hopeful we can
19 hear about how many drivers in New York City on a
20 given day are actually city residents and how many
21 are just passing through. Lastly, the challenge we
22 face and that many New Yorkers feel comfortable that
23 they will get to their destination faster, cheaper,
24 and safer in cars than in other ways this means we
25 must make other forms of transportation better

1
2 options when it comes to affordability, safety and
3 most of all speed. This is a major challenge but I
4 know there are very good ideas out there and it is
5 incumbent upon us as leader in the city to put that
6 in, into action. In the last couple of hours, we'll
7 hear a plan for plan Move New York, we will need to
8 get some briefing from that proposal but we need to
9 discuss any proposal that came to in front of us.
10 Before we begin I'd like to thank our committee staff
11 for putting this hearing together today; Policy
12 Analyst Jonathan Masserano, Kafar Salobe, and Emily
13 Rooney and my staff Russell Lewis, Russell Murphy and
14 Stephanie Miliano, welcome back Russell. And I would
15 like to give my colleague Council Member Levine an
16 opportunity to speak on our bill, Intro 1031 and
17 before that I would like to recognize Council Member
18 Chin, Richards, Van Bramer, Rose, and Menchaca.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Well thank you
20 Chair Rodriguez for convening this hearing and thank
21 you for that incredibly comprehensive and cogent and
22 I think powerful summation of this challenge and what
23 we need to do to meet it. I'm just going to briefly
24 add my voice to those acknowledging that congestion
25 is at crisis levels in the city, it's a mounting

1
2 crisis especially in the lower half of Manhattan and
3 nearby parts of Brooklyn. This is a threat to our
4 economy, it is a threat to our environment, it is a
5 safety threat for motorists and vulnerable
6 pedestrians and bicyclists and frankly for drivers
7 its driving them crazy to be stuck in traffic longer
8 and longer and longer periods. This is not good for
9 anybody, we need to attack this crisis on many, many
10 fronts. I happen to be a supporter together with the
11 Chair of the Move New York Plan to bring about
12 fairness in the cost that people pay to get into
13 Manhattan whether it's by mass transit or by a bridge
14 or a tunnel. I understand we're going to be hearing
15 today from the Move New York about new develops and
16 what they believe are the legal options of the city
17 to move that agenda forward. Clearly, we have to
18 engage in the ongoing effort of enforcing traffic
19 rules for everybody. We have to make sure that the
20 ongoing degradation in the subway system is reversed
21 so that we can once again begin adding to the people
22 who are riding the subways and not seeing a reduction
23 as we did in the past year and there's no doubt that
24 the strange phenomena of stores taking their
25 deliveries during the busiest, busiest hours of the

1
2 day needs to be examined. There's nothing more
3 frustrating than seeing an 18-wheeler backing up
4 making a delivery to a store on a busy street at the
5 busiest time day. I think that the rise in the number
6 of chains in Manhattan has contributed this phenomena
7 and the almost previously unknown presence of big box
8 stores in these focus areas is part of the problem
9 and, and I think that those two parts of the retail
10 landscape need to get the closest scrutiny, this is
11 complicated, it effects neighborhoods who will be
12 impacted by off hour deliveries, I think the impact
13 on mom and pop stores who don't have the staff
14 necessarily to handle deliveries at off hours needs
15 to be considered but it is definitely time to look
16 hard at this and so I'm pleased to be sponsoring
17 Intro, Intro 1031 together with the Chair and many of
18 our colleagues that would examine this issue in a
19 sober and and urgent way as warranted. Thank you Mr.
20 Chair.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Now we have the
22 lawyers to do the affirmation for the administration.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Please raise your right
24 hand. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole
25 truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony

1
2 before this committee and to respond honestly to
3 Council Member questions?

4 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Thank you Mr.
5 Chairman. Good morning Chairman Rodriguez and members
6 of the Transportation Committee. I'm Polly
7 Trottenberg, Commissioner of the New York City
8 Department of Transportation and with me here today
9 is Eric Beaton, our Acting Deputy Commissioner for
10 Transportation Planning and Management. I'm also
11 pleased to be joined by Transportation Chief Thomas
12 Chan, who will be speaking about NYPD's enforcement
13 efforts. Thank you for inviting us to testify today
14 on behalf of Mayor De Blasio about congestion on our
15 streets and the steps our agencies are taking to
16 address this challenging and multidimensional issue.
17 As you alluded Mr. Chairman, New York City is
18 currently experiencing a period of remarkable growth
19 that is straining our transportation system as never
20 before. Between 2010 and 2016, the city's population
21 rose to over 8.5 million, an increase of more than
22 360,000 new residents. The number of jobs in the city
23 has swelled to 4.3 million, up 500,000 since the pre-
24 recession peak of 2008. Tourism is booming; nearly 61
25 million people visited the city in 2016, up 68

1
2 percent just since 2000. And as we all know
3 development is everywhere. In recent years the city
4 has added tens of thousands of new housing units and
5 millions of square feet of new office space. Up until
6 now, New York City has largely been able to meet the
7 travel demand generated by this growth with existing
8 subway capacity and increased walking and biking.
9 Between 2010 and 2016 citywide subway ridership
10 increased 22 percent to 1.76 billion. Ridership is
11 now 78 percent higher than during the system's nadir
12 of 991 million riders back in 1982. The number of
13 frequent bike riders has risen 54 percent to 778,000
14 in the last five years and pedestrian activity has
15 increased dramatically. To support these shifts, the
16 city has significantly expanded bus, bike, and
17 pedestrian facilities and has done so in most cases
18 without reducing overall vehicle throughput. But
19 there is fierce competition for curb and street
20 space. Growth in population and economic activity has
21 led to an increase in truck deliveries and associated
22 double parking. As the city attracts more visitors,
23 workers, and residents, sidewalks and crosswalks are
24 busier than ever. With more construction has come an
25 increase in lane closures, impacting traffic flow.

1
2 The rapid growth of the for-hire vehicle industry has
3 also raised questions about their role in
4 contributing to congestion, particularly in the
5 Manhattan core. The app based dispatch sector has
6 continued to rise dramatically, with active vehicles
7 growing from around 20,000 in June of 2015 to nearly
8 55,000 by March of 2017 and trip volumes growing from
9 around 100,000 trips per day in June 2015 to over
10 400,000 trips per day in March of 2017 according to
11 the most recent TLC data. Starting in June of this
12 year, the TLC will begin collecting more complete
13 data... trip data from the for-hire vehicle including
14 both trip duration and destination, in addition to
15 pick up location. This additional data will enable
16 the city to better understand where and when FHV's
17 are operating and how they may be impacting traffic
18 flow. This improved data stream will be used to
19 inform future policy responses. But overall, DOT
20 believes that the city's extraordinary growth is
21 likely the dominant factor leading to congestion and
22 dropping traffic speeds on the streets in Midtown and
23 in major commercial streets across the five boroughs.
24 In Manhattan South of 60th Street, for example,
25 yellow taxi GPS data show that the average weekday

1
2 speeds drop from 9.5 miles per hour in 2010 down to
3 8.0 miles per hour in 2016. And of course, I don't
4 need to tell this committee that traffic congestion
5 is a significant issue in the outer boroughs as well
6 especially at the approaches to major river crossings
7 and highways and in hubs like Downtown Brooklyn,
8 Downtown Flushing, and Long Island City. And the
9 sheer size of our city more than 300 square miles of
10 densely built urban area spread across three separate
11 major islands and a portion of the mainland means
12 that some New Yorkers face particularly long
13 commutes. While on the one hand increased congestion
14 is a sign of a thriving economy, we hear loud and
15 clear from community boards, elected officials,
16 businesses, and New Yorkers who drive, are stuck on
17 the bus, or use crowded sidewalks that they're
18 frustrated by congestion and are asking the city for
19 answers. As we consider strategies, the city is
20 thinking about roadway congestion as one dimension of
21 a larger challenge. New York City's overall
22 transportation system including our streets and
23 subways is nearing the limit of its capacity given
24 the current way we manage and operate our streets and
25 enforce their use. So, our response to vehicular

1
2 congestion must be part of a larger integrated
3 strategy to make our entire transportation system
4 more efficient. Rather than framing the problem only
5 around average travel speeds or vehicle throughput,
6 DOT is focused on improving street efficiency, by
7 which I mean the number of people and the quantity of
8 goods that a street can process on a typical day. And
9 efficient street balances the need of all users while
10 giving priority to the most space deficient modes
11 like bus, transit, walking, and biking. This also
12 means managing our curbs to facilitate deliveries
13 which cannot be shifted to other modes while
14 eliminating double parking. Efficient streets also
15 provide travel choices to residents, support Vision
16 Zero, advance the city's 80 by 50 greenhouse gas
17 emission reduction goals, and support economy and
18 tourism. Today I'm going to speak about the range of
19 measures that DOT and its partner agencies are
20 considering for New York City to improve street
21 efficiency but before I turn to that discussion I
22 want to briefly address one argument that invariably
23 comes up whenever the problem of traffic congesting
24 is raised. Some New Yorkers see the changes DOT has
25 made to our streets, like more bike lanes and bus

1
2 lanes and increased space for pedestrians and assume
3 those changes are solely responsible for the increase
4 in congestion that we're experiencing. I want to be
5 clear on this point; given the city's dramatic
6 population growth, our streets would be experiencing
7 rising congestion even if we'd not added a single
8 bike, bus lane, or pedestrian plaza. In fact, without
9 the growth in transit, biking, and walking that these
10 improvements have supported, congestion would likely
11 be worse and the city would be deprived of the
12 significant safety, environmental, and mobility
13 benefits that these street efficiency investments
14 provide. Other global cities like New York City that
15 are experiencing record growth while facing finite
16 street capacity, including London, Los Angeles,
17 Paris, and Stockholm, are deploying two major
18 responses to reduce congestion and keep people and
19 goods moving. The first is road pricing and the
20 second is major investment in transit expansion.
21 Although pricing has proved to be an effective tool
22 to reduce traffic congestion, it is also
23 controversial. Several pricing plans have been put
24 forward over the years for New York City but none has
25 thus far gained traction in Albany. On the other

1
2 hand, major transit investment seeks to shift car
3 trips from car or taxi to mass transit by providing a
4 fast, reliable and convenient alternative. In dense
5 urban centers, this typically means large scale
6 investment in rail and subway networks on grade-
7 separated rights of way. When we look at peer cities
8 across the globe, we see what kind of major transit
9 expansion is possible. London is planning 59 billion
10 in transit investments through 2021, including 31 new
11 miles of rail, 26 miles of which will be built in
12 tunnels under the heart of the city. Paris is
13 investing 25 billion in its metros to create four new
14 lines with 68 stations and more than 120 miles of
15 track. And the voters of Los Angeles recently
16 approved a sales tax increase, which will fund 44
17 billion in transit projects over 40 years, including
18 45 miles of new rail by 2031. Overall, U.S. cities
19 and states passed 55 ballots in 2016 to provide tens
20 of billions in funding for new transit investments.
21 Closer to home, the MTA recently completed the first
22 phase of Second Avenue Subway, which now serves over
23 176,000 riders daily and has reduced passenger
24 volumes on the overcrowded Lexington Avenue Line.
25 Since service began, traffic volumes have decreased

1
2 on the Lexington Avenue and Second Avenues and taxi
3 speeds are up seven percent. Taxi trips on the
4 quarter have decreased by 32 percent, compared to a
5 citywide decrease of only 11 percent during the same
6 period. But despite its 4.5-billion-dollar tag, the
7 Second Avenue Subway is less than two miles long,
8 includes only three new stations and took decades to
9 complete. Although the MTA is planning over 32
10 billion in capital spending through 2019 for the
11 region, most of that money will go towards
12 maintaining the MTA's aging system to keep it in a
13 state of good repair. While the MTA absolutely must
14 maintain the subway system and we've seen recently
15 what happens when this trillion dollar asset is not
16 adequately cared for, we must also be able to expand
17 the system at the same time. Looking forward, the
18 city and region are unlikely to see the level and
19 pace of transit investment necessary to meet growing
20 travel demand and make a meaningful dent in
21 congestion. Were the MTA positioned to truly meet
22 that need, the agency would be completing major
23 projects like the Second Avenue Subway every few
24 years. As it stands, full funding for the next phase
25 of the project, a two-mile extension from 96th Street

1
2 to 125th Street has yet to be identified and
3 construction is years away. Without these two tools,
4 pricing in major subway system expansion, the city is
5 nonetheless looking at a whole range of tools that we
6 do have at our disposal to tackle congestion. I'm
7 going to talk about these approaches largely in the
8 context of the Manhattan core, but these ideas could
9 also be tailored to other congested corridors across
10 the five boroughs. As these strategies move forward,
11 we'll continue to have in depth discussions and
12 collaboration with our colleagues at NYPD, the
13 Department of Finance, Taxi and Limousine Commission
14 to identify strategies regarding enforcement,
15 curbside parking, placards, freight deliveries,
16 technology, and traffic rules and penalties. Chief
17 Chan will speak about the NYPD's overall enforcement
18 efforts, including the NYPD's newly expanded Midtown
19 Traffic Enforcement Taskforce. In addition to these
20 initiatives, DOT and NYPD are considering curb
21 regulation and street design changes to improve
22 traffic flow during the most congested times. One
23 option under consideration is to expand upon existing
24 parking regulations on key crosstown streets by
25 restricting deliveries to one side of the street.

1
2 Several streets in East Midtown have these
3 restrictions in place today. An expansion of this
4 approach could increase rush hour capacity, but would
5 require a significant expansion of NYPD personnel to
6 effectively enforce. DOT is also developing a
7 citywide parking blueprint, a data driven and context
8 sensitive plan to better manage the curb in
9 commercial districts across the five boroughs. In
10 areas such as Downtown Flushing, Downtown Brooklyn,
11 and Long Island City, the agency will explore new
12 strategies for efficiently managing parking,
13 including progressive meter rates, extended meter
14 hours, and integration of delivery zones with
15 passenger parking. But even the best conceived
16 parking rules and rates can do little to address
17 congestion unless they are effectively enforced and
18 carry meaningful penalties for violations. This too
19 would require major new resources for the NYPD,
20 particularly for personnel. And many of our parking
21 rules have not been updated in decades. In
22 collaboration with NYPD and the Department of
23 Finance, we're working to identify ways to make our
24 rules easier to understand and enforce and advocate
25 for increased penalties for congestion causing and

1
2 safety related violations, especially in traffic
3 hotspots. As DOT Commissioner, I probably hear more
4 complaints about improper use of placards than almost
5 anyone else in city government. So, I'm glad that
6 Mayor De Blasio recently announced several steps that
7 we're taking to immediately combat placard abuse. The
8 city needs a parking placard system to ensure that
9 law enforcement, city agencies, and our court systems
10 can function effectively, but we know there are real
11 impacts to placard abuse. These include increased
12 congestion and blocked bus lanes, reduced curb access
13 for customers and deliveries for businesses, safety
14 issues when bike lanes are obstructed or fire
15 hydrants are blocked, millions of dollars in lost
16 parking revenue, and public frustration with a system
17 that appears unfair and rife with abuse. DOT is
18 responsible for issuing parking placards to city
19 agencies and public officials, non-profits, to clergy
20 and the disability community. Our Authorized Parking
21 team, which includes an enforcement unit, is working
22 hard to improve all aspects of our system, including
23 making placards harder to forge and training NYPD
24 personnel on identifying fraudulent placards. We are
25 also looking at parking enforcement best practices

1
2 from around the world, such as using advanced license
3 plate readers capable of quickly spanning... scanning
4 all the vehicles on a block and then automatically
5 issuing violations. This will make the enforcement
6 process much more efficient and fraud proof.

7 Likewise, in the longer term, DOT and the NYPD are
8 exploring the transition from paper placards to a
9 more secure electronic placard system. As part of our
10 parking blueprint, DOT is also analyzing the parking
11 needs and challenges in commercial districts and
12 neighborhoods throughout the city. We hope to use
13 that information to come up with more comprehensive
14 solutions in areas, around courthouses for example,
15 where parking is both critical for government
16 functions, but also very scarce. We hope to
17 ultimately create a more rational parking system in
18 those areas which combined with strong enforcement by
19 the NYPD, will create a culture of compliance amongst
20 placard holders citywide. New York City relies on
21 trucks to bring in over 90 percent of its goods. As
22 our street grid lacks alleys, many deliveries happen
23 at the curb and often during busy times as Council
24 Member Levine has mentioned. Truck deliveries are
25 essential to our economy but as recognized by the

1
2 Council Member and Chairman Rodriguez with Intro
3 1031, they contribute to double parking, noise, and
4 air pollution as well as congestion. One way to try
5 and improve street efficiency is to shift truck trips
6 to less busy hours in the evening and overnight. In
7 2013, DOT worked with 400 businesses to encourage
8 them to shift to off hour deliveries through a
9 federally funded incentive program. Based on the
10 success of that program, DOT is launching a new off
11 hour delivery management program, this time with a
12 participation goal of 900 additional businesses. We
13 welcome Council Members joining us in the outreach
14 for this effort. In Manhattan, DOT's Midtown in
15 Motion system uses a network of sensors to monitor
16 real time traffic conditions. The system alerts
17 operators at DOT's traffic management center, who
18 them implement pre-programmed signal timing changes
19 to clear the bottleneck. DOT plans to expand the
20 system from 23rd Street down to the Battery and also
21 to implement it in Downtown Flushing. DOT also makes
22 use of a... of a variety of data to understand
23 transportation conditions and congestion deriving
24 information from taxi GPS units, from EZ Pass, and
25 from Bluetooth devices. We're also exploring

1
2 opportunities to use image analytics from mobile
3 cameras to monitor double parking and curb use, as
4 well as to improve traffic safety. I'm also happy to
5 say that to supplement TLC data and information from
6 DOT's own traffic monitoring equipment, DOT will be
7 purchasing data collected from GPS in cars and phones
8 from a commercial vendor. This more fine-grained data
9 source will provide vehicle speeds, origins, and
10 destinations citywide giving us a complete picture of
11 traffic flow and congestion, not just in Midtown but
12 across the five boroughs and will allow us to
13 quantify the congestion reduction potential of
14 different initiatives and measure their success.
15 Building out on our transit system, we're also going
16 to continue our work on improving bus service. DOT
17 will continue its partnership with New York City
18 Transit to expand select bus service and address the
19 delay and reliability problems on local and express
20 bus routes. We applaud New York City Transit for
21 their just released proposal to overhaul express bus
22 service on Staten Island and we look forward to
23 working with them on it. DOT and New York City
24 Transit are installing real time bus information
25 displays to improve the customer experience,

1
2 expanding the use of bus lanes and queue jumps so
3 buses can avoid traffic bottlenecks, and implementing
4 transit signal priority so buses spend more time
5 moving and less time stuck at red lights. And I'm
6 happy to announce that DOT is planning to upgrade the
7 curbside bus lane along 5th Avenue from 34th Street to
8 61st Street to a more effective double lane. Fifth
9 Avenue is the second busiest bus corridor in the
10 city, serving a remarkable 115,000 riders daily,
11 including over 43,000 express bus riders. Those
12 express bus riders include about 4,000 riders in
13 Council Member Vacca's district that take the BxM7
14 and the BxM8. Outside the Manhattan core, DOT and New
15 York City Transit are also working to launch SBS
16 service on two more routes in 2017, building on our
17 13 existing routes; Woodhaven Boulevard in Queens,
18 and 161st Street in the Bronx. By end of 2016, SBS
19 routes will carry over 380,000 daily riders or more
20 than 15 percent of New York City's 2.5 million
21 average weekday ridership, with speed improvements on
22 pre-SBS performance of 10 to 30 percent. Beyond bus
23 service, the city is continuing with its own new
24 rapid transit project, the BQX. Working with our
25 partners at EDC we continue to plan for the route

1
2 which will run along the Brooklyn-Queens waterfront.
3 And through our Citywide Transit Study we will
4 identify other opportunities for transit expansion.
5 DOT's also focused on expanding biking and other
6 alternatives to driving. We're continuing to make
7 investments in our now 1,125-mile bike network so it
8 reaches more parts of the city and better connects
9 key nodes. At the same time, DOT's working with its
10 partner Motivate to add about 2,000 more bikes to our
11 bike share network this year and expanding Citi Bike
12 service to new neighborhoods in three boroughs. We're
13 also investing in the Staten Island Ferry where
14 ridership is growing and we're working with EDC on
15 the very successful rollout of the Citywide Ferry
16 Service. As you know, on May 1st, New York City re-
17 launched ferry service to East 34th Street, Hunters
18 Point South, Greenpoint, North Williamsburg, South
19 Williamsburg, Dumbo, and Wall Street, with a new
20 operator, new boats, and a new, more affordable
21 price. At the same we've also launched new service
22 from Wall Street to the Rockaways with a stop in
23 Sunset Park. Just last Thursday the South Brooklyn
24 route launch, connecting Wall Street, Dumbo, Pier 6
25 in Brooklyn Bridge Park, Red Hook, Sunset Park, and a

1
2 new stop in Bay Ridge. Summer service to Governors
3 Island will also depart from Wall Street, Dumbo, Pier
4 6, and Red Hook. This August, ferries will begin
5 serving Halletts Point in Astoria with stops in Long
6 Island City, East 34th Street, and Wall Street. And
7 in spring 2018 we'll be adding service to the Lower
8 East Side and Soundview. And we're thinking
9 creatively about how to reduce car ownership, parking
10 pressure, and overall traffic volumes by facilitating
11 more convenient access to car sharing. This year
12 we'll launch a pilot program that will create
13 designated on street parking spots for car sharing
14 vehicles as well as reserve spaces in our city owned
15 lots and garages. As you know this pilot program was
16 codified by Council legislation and we've been happy
17 to have many positive conversations in recent weeks
18 and months with individual Council Members about how
19 they think the program might work in their districts.
20 In closing, I want to reiterate the congestion on our
21 streets should be understood within the larger
22 context of the economy of the city and the region.
23 New York is a global capital and a leader in finance,
24 culture, creativity, and innovation. The gross
25 domestic product of New York City region is 1.4

1
2 trillion dollars a year, equivalent to the entire
3 economy of South Korea. Each day almost a million
4 people commute into New York City from the region,
5 approximately 1.4 million enter Manhattan below 60th
6 Street and over a million tons of freight travel
7 into, out of, or through the city. This incredible
8 density and scale of economic activity makes some
9 level of congestion in New York City inevitable and
10 congestion is a sign of a thriving economy but we
11 know the larger challenge we face is how New York can
12 continue to grow our economy, increase the number of
13 middle class jobs, and attract people from all over
14 the country and the world to live, work, or visit
15 while ensuring the safety and mobility of the
16 traveling public. This task is bigger than any one
17 agency and requires the city to work together with
18 our partners at the MTA, the Port Authority, in state
19 and local government, as well as business and civic
20 organizations, our enforcement agencies to keep
21 people and goods moving efficiently. Thank you for
22 the opportunity to speak today and I look forward to
23 your questions.

24 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Alright and
25 before we hear from Chief Chan I would like to also

1
2 to recognize that we also have here Council Member
3 Miller and Council Member Dan Garodnick.

4 THOMAS CHAN: Good morning Chair
5 Rodriguez and members of the council. I am Chief
6 Thomas Chan, the Chief of the Transportation Bureau
7 from the New York City Police Department. In addition
8 to the Department of Transportation Commissioner
9 Polly Trottenberg, I am joined here today by my NYPD
10 colleagues, Inspector Dennis Fulton and Oleg
11 Chernyavsky, the Director of Legislative Affairs. On
12 behalf of the Police Commissioner James P. O'Neill, I
13 wish to thank the city council for the opportunity to
14 speak to you today about how the city can more
15 effectively address traffic congestion. At the outset
16 of my testimony today, I believe it's important for
17 me to state that the Police Department recognizes
18 that traffic congestion can have an inverse... adverse
19 impact on the quality of life, environment, and
20 public health of those living and operating within
21 the city and the region. Facilitating the efficient
22 movement of people in our city, especially in the
23 backdrop of growing populace, requiring the action of
24 multiple stakeholders. This includes the Police
25 Department as well as our fellow city agencies, our

1
2 state and federal partners. Given the magnitude of
3 this topic and the myriad of issues associated with
4 it, I believe it's essential that I discuss some of
5 the major initiatives that the department has
6 undertaken and will undertake to mitigate traffic
7 congestion. Part of Transportation Bureau's
8 responsibility is to design, develop, and implement
9 strategies to improve traffic flow, remove obstacles
10 impeding traffic flow, and to expedite the passage of
11 vehicles and bicycles within the city. Parking
12 summons enforcement is not performed only for its own
13 sake, but to enhance the safety and to improve the
14 flow of traffic. In fact, the Traffic Enforcement
15 District, which is under my command, expresses its
16 purpose and its goal with the phrase quote, "Move
17 Traffic, Reduce Collisions, Move Traffic, Protect
18 Pedestrians, Move Traffic, Save Lives, Move Traffic,
19 Move Traffic, Move Traffic." We take this idea
20 seriously and remind all our members of the Traffic
21 Enforcement District of their mission daily. As of
22 May 25th, the Traffic Enforcement Agents have issued
23 over 3.2 million parking summonses. Parking summons
24 enforcement has increased approximately three percent
25 from last year. Personnel under my command respond to

1
2 both planned and unplanned traffic conditions and
3 work with outside agencies regarding these issues.
4 For example, the Department's Traffic Operations
5 District regularly conducts traffic enforcement of
6 yellow taxi cabs and black car liveries. It conducts
7 joint operation with the Taxi and Limousine
8 Commission to target illegal street hails, which can
9 slow traffic and also performs parking enforcement at
10 taxi stands against unauthorized parking violators.
11 Additionally, the Traffic Operations District assigns
12 sergeants in Manhattan to monitor construction sites
13 and identifies conditions that are causing
14 congestion. Their duty is to maintain a close working
15 relationship with the Department of Transportation
16 and the Department of Buildings to alleviate the
17 congestion problems. When encountering construction
18 sites that are operating outside their scope of all
19 conditions, the construction sergeant will notify the
20 Department's Construction Compliance Unit to respond
21 to these locations and to issue violations. This unit
22 conducts highly specialized enforcement, issues
23 summonses to companies that break road surfaces or
24 otherwise take out lanes or use without having the
25 proper permits to do so. Where more serious issues

1
2 are presented, they will notify the Department of
3 Transportation's Highway Inspection Quality Assurance
4 Unit. The Department has also taken a targeted
5 approach to bus enforcement, specifically regarding
6 parking enforcement against vehicles that are not
7 buses but are utilizing bus layover areas.

8 Enforcement also involves identifying violations
9 pertaining to bus lanes, both moving and parking
10 summonses, and bus stops. The Department's Citywide
11 Traffic Task Force provides traffic control at
12 focused intersections along main traffic routes and
13 maintains a high visibility enforcement patrol in the
14 vicinity of major transportation hubs such as Penn
15 Station, Grand Central Station, and the Port
16 Authority Bus Terminal. Specifically, the Task Force
17 focuses on traffic flow violations such as double
18 parking, illegal U-turns, disobeying traffic control
19 signals. The Task Force is deployed to major
20 emergency incidents that take place in our city such
21 as large-scale fires, in order to isolate the
22 incident by diverting vehicles, pedestrians from the
23 area while expediting the response of emergency
24 personnel and equipment. Moreover, last year, our
25 Traffic Enforcement District created a separate

1
2 traffic task force to combat congestion and to move
3 traffic in Midtown Manhattan. This highly mobile unit
4 issues parking summonses, directs traffic, patrols
5 their posts in Department smart cars. It has also
6 identified two particular problems in Midtown that
7 slows traffic down; unauthorized layovers by buses
8 and abuse of hotel loading zones. As a result, our
9 traffic enforcement personnel have steadily focused
10 on these issues. The task force is a valuable
11 resource and we will be expanding it. It is also
12 important to acknowledge that the work of our
13 auxiliary officers perform regarding traffic
14 management. Our Auxiliary Units are assigned to
15 control the flow of pedestrians at major city events
16 such as parades, demonstrations, and holiday
17 celebrations. They are also tasked with responding to
18 large scale unplanned incidents to control vehicular
19 and pedestrian access to affected areas and they are
20 volunteers. Last year, as part of the Vision Zero
21 Initiative, the Department coordinated a citywide
22 traffic initiative focused on averting hazardous
23 parking and moving infractions that interfere with
24 the safe passage of our cyclists known as Operation
25 Safe Passage. This effort was initiated to provide

1
2 safe passage to our cyclist and reduce bicycle
3 involved injuries. During the summer and the fall of
4 2016, the Department conducted four of these citywide
5 safety initiatives, bicycle safety initiatives, which
6 resulted in the issuance of a total of 530,000
7 hazardous parking summonses and more than 7,000
8 summonses for parking in the bike lane. Recently, the
9 Administration announced new plans to enforce against
10 parking placard fraud and abuse. The department is
11 committed to reducing the improper and fraudulent use
12 of parking placards. When motorists believe that they
13 can park anywhere without consequences they can often
14 obstruct bike lanes, bus stops, crosswalks, and other
15 spaces that create hazardous conditions for all New
16 Yorkers. Under this new plan the Department will
17 create a dedicated unit that reports the Chief of
18 Department that will consist of 16 dedicated
19 enforcement personnel in the Transportation Bureau
20 Citywide Task Force. They will identify counterfeit
21 placards and misuse at hotspots in every borough. The
22 Department also intends to hire an additional 100
23 traffic agents for deployment citywide and to add
24 additional towing capacity to towing vehicles that
25 are using placards fraudulently and illegally. This

1
2 new initiative will help ensure our city streets are
3 kept clear and that the privileges are not abused.
4 Before concluding, I would like to commend the
5 council for highlighting this important topic, we
6 look forward to maintaining an open dialogue on how
7 the city can more effectively address traffic
8 congestion. There is no one size fits all approach to
9 this subject and the Police Department is committed
10 to working in collaboration with all our city
11 partners including the council to address this issue.
12 Thank you for the opportunity to speak to you today
13 and I'm pleased to answer any questions that you may
14 have.

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Ready to answer
16 questions, nobody else to testify? And so, I have
17 many questions but I'm going to be asking few since
18 my colleagues also they have questions to ask. When
19 you look at during the weekday which is the like the
20 weekdays and the time that you can say that
21 congestion is the worst in New York City, in this
22 case particularly in Midtown?

23 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Yeah, I mean I, I
24 think the... I mean the standard morning congestion
25 period is around seven to ten but I, I think we all

1
2 have to acknowledge that it is pretty congested in
3 Midtown, you know most of the day, you know you
4 certainly see a, a spike in the morning and again in
5 the evening but it's, it's in a state of heavy
6 congestion pretty much most of the day until you get
7 into the pretty late evening hours.

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Do you have
9 something else, NYPD but first... and before asking the
10 next question I would like to thank, you know the
11 administration that through both of you Chief Chan
12 and, and DOT, Commissioner Polly Trottenberg you came
13 with solutions and I think that that's what we need,
14 I think it's for the interest of the public and
15 private sectors to say we cannot live with the level
16 of congestion that is hurting our city. So, I'm happy
17 to see that... you know there's good solutions for the
18 problem that we have. It... can we agree that a more
19 efficient mass transportation system can also help to
20 reduce congestion since more New Yorkers will be
21 switching for car ownership to buses, ferry, train?

22 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Yeah, I mean I, I
23 think as I, I said in my testimony the, the really
24 impressive example of that is... you know that the MTA
25 as we know at the beginning of the year opened up

1
2 three new subway stops on the Upper East Side and
3 we're already looking at data and seeing more people
4 riding the subway, fewer, fewer people taking cabs
5 and a reduction in congestion and you know it was a
6 pretty.. it's a nice.. it was a two mile addition to
7 the system but I think we can all extrapolate that if
8 the city could build out more rapidly more
9 underground subway lines we would really I think see
10 a big dramatic improvement and people being able to
11 get out of cars and taxis and, and use mass transit.

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But can, can we
13 agree that you know we don't have the whatever ten
14 billion dollars to build a Second Avenue another type
15 of Second Avenue over.. in the next ten years but we
16 have buses in our city and someone who lives in
17 Queens that they have to take pay.. to pay three
18 fares, two fares because they have to switch from one
19 bus to the other and they just take a train and
20 definitely this is something that I hope that the
21 city keep pushing Albany to change the two fare
22 assistant and, and my suggestion is for us and I say
23 we as a city have a lot of influence because even
24 though we rely on the MYA to run the bus services but
25 the city controls the enforcement piece and I

1
2 believe... I don't know if you can share those prints
3 of the 5th Avenue where we've already been using the
4 technology and the lighting system is synchronized to
5 give preference to the bus drivers so what is the
6 experience that we have in 5th Avenue that we can say
7 this is something that we can expand through other
8 BSA... B... SBS and BLT so that the buses would continue
9 moving rapidly than what they're moving right now
10 because we can turn our buses as they are both the
11 ground tram system. We have... with the numbers of
12 buses that we have and the number of bus lanes that
13 we have and knowing that the buses they're running so
14 slow and by enforcing we can see they... we can see to
15 improving or efficiency I would say that that's the
16 area that we do not have to wait to have ten billion
17 dollars to build another train because those buses
18 already connect in New York and from Queens to
19 Brooklyn or from Queens to Manhattan.

20 POLLY TROTTENBERG: Let me... let me answer
21 a few of the things you mentioned there Mr. Chairman
22 it's no question as I said in my testimony with the
23 13 SBS routes that we've put up we see generally
24 improvements in travel time from ten to 30 percent
25 and I, I, I just want to say up front I hear you

1
2 that, you know at the moment I don't see a path
3 forward with major new subway expansion but I think
4 the improvements we can make in bus service I just... I
5 don't want to leave the notion that it's going to be
6 comparable obviously to running a subway line
7 underground, I think we are working with the MTA and
8 a lot of the things you've mentioned improving our,
9 our signal timing, looking at all door boarding, off
10 board fare collection I think what the MTA has just
11 done with its report on express bus service in Staten
12 Island is very promising. The MTA went back and did a
13 two year study looking at all the... all the express
14 bus service routes they run from... many which they had
15 not looked at for decades and decades and realized
16 that the, you know the routes we're making perhaps
17 more stops than they needed to that a lot of buses
18 were going both to downtown and Midtown and that it
19 actually made sense to send the... one set of buses to
20 one place and one set to the other and then that gave
21 them alternative routes when there are traffic
22 challenges. So, I think there is clearly a lot more
23 we can be doing to improve buses around the city and,
24 and, and certainly on the De Blasio Administration
25 we're very committed to that but you know it is

1
2 another thing to say that buses will move as a train,
3 I think that's always going to be a challenge in, in
4 our surface grid, we can do everything we can to
5 speed it up but it's not going to have a dedicated
6 right away obviously like a train would.

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Can we say that
8 we're ready to see like a major improvements or
9 enforcements especially in the bus lane because I
10 agree with you. I was speaking to someone this
11 morning saying he couldn't be on time because the F
12 train was not working and residents in Queens they've
13 been living with the seven train, you know in the
14 last couple of weeks being out of services and the..
15 you know we know that experience and we're working to
16 address it with the MTA the importance to do better
17 on maintenance but I think that with buses we have
18 some more control because they are running too slow
19 in our city. So, how... what can we expect on improving
20 law enforcement in the bus lane?

21 THOMAS CHAN: When we're talking about a,
22 a bus lane enforcement it's, it's a combination
23 strategy, not only police officers and NYPD resources
24 targeting people who are violating the bus lane
25 regulations but also automation technology, cameras

1
2 that capture individuals who are going into those
3 lanes and are in violation its certainly probably
4 more efficient utilizing a camera system so we would
5 certainly support that. Officers when we're doing
6 enforcement there's a possibility that when we pull a
7 motorist over for being in violation of the bus lane
8 we then impact the bus lane ourselves also. So, again
9 sometimes the, the technology is probably going to be
10 more efficient but again its certainly in the area
11 that the, the Police Department can add additional
12 resources or have people to take a look at and focus
13 on.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great and, and,
15 and when I talk... when I look at our, our enforcement
16 for me I don't expect to see a member of the NYPD who
17 are fighting crimes to dedicate many of their amount
18 to, to go out and give tickets however having the
19 traffic enforcement department I would love to see
20 increases with the number of men and women in that
21 area than the NYPD. So, can you share with us a
22 little bit on how are we doing and how many men and
23 women are part of the traffic enforcement department,
24 should we work together with support with the
25

1
2 colleagues here and the speaker to continue looking
3 at opportunities to see an increase in that division?

4 THOMAS CHAN: One of the things certainly
5 is, is that because the individual who's in a, a bus
6 lane is actually a moving violation, he's going to be
7 in a vehicle we will utilize police officers to give
8 out a moving violation which is a B summons which is
9 returnable to the Department of Motor Vehicle Traffic
10 Court. What happens is that our traffic agents in
11 general doing enforcement are giving A summonses or
12 parking summonses so that would be the difference in
13 the, the two... the... we would distinguish a police
14 officer and a traffic agent in terms of pulling
15 vehicles over because we, we require them to ask them
16 for their license, their, their insurance information
17 that's the difference between it too. In terms of
18 traffic agents there is always going to be a demand
19 for traffic agents, we get calls from our elected
20 officials and we have issues in terms throughout the
21 city, we've had some coverage also, our traffic
22 agents covering some of the school crossing posts
23 right now so again I can certainly use more agents
24 and I think that the New York City Police Department
25 along with DCAS are working to process and to move as

1
2 fast as they can to hire more agents and make it a
3 more desirable position so that people will apply.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Can, can you find
5 out how many members are in the traffic enforcement
6 unit task today?

7 THOMAS CHAN: Currently head count in the
8 traffic enforcement district is approximately 3,200
9 people, three thousand two hundred.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And how many of
11 those are dedicated to Midtown?

12 THOMAS CHAN: I wouldn't... I wouldn't be
13 able to tell you... [cross-talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay... [cross-
15 talk]

16 THOMAS CHAN: ...exactly how many, we can
17 get back to you with that specific number.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I, I, I just hope
19 that we working together can look at the numbers to
20 see because I, I believe that with the congestion
21 plan that the Mayor, you know is sharing some aspects
22 today but I know that there's a more fully planned
23 that the administration will be putting together on
24 congestion I just hope that increase in the numbers
25 of men and women dedicated to traffic enforcement

1
2 should be there because we need to declare Midtown as
3 a... you know as a zero tolerance area... [cross-talk]

4 THOMAS CHAN: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: ...of double
6 parking, blocking bike lanes and bus lanes and this..
7 I think that this is not something that we have a lot
8 of time to catch up like it is hurting not only the
9 pedestrians and the business community it hurts in
10 the city and I think that I hope that you know that
11 we can work together to see the increase of... put
12 together whatever human resources we need. The last
13 thing that I got to highlight is... or the question
14 first, you heard... and I know my colleague, Council
15 Members that they been putting resolution calling for
16 the state to allow the city... or to pass a bill the
17 electrical bike bill, has the city... are you... are you
18 aware of the city's having any conversation with the
19 state to see a... that bill or any particular bill
20 passed in Albany so that FedEx and UPS and, and other
21 members of the public who... sector who do delivery for
22 them to also know that the tools are there for them
23 to look at bikes, tricycle and other type of... [cross-
24 talk]

1
2 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I'll, I'll talk about
3 that and, and Chief Chan may want to so... but I just...
4 I just wanted to go back on the bus enforcement Mr.
5 Chairman just to highlight, in addition to whatever's
6 happening on the, the personnel front we also do
7 think this is true in general in the parking and
8 congestion area the city does need to move more into
9 automated enforcement and you know some of you may
10 know we're currently authorized by the state to use
11 camera enforcement in 16 bus lanes, we have ten of
12 those bus lanes currently camera enforced. The MTA
13 actually also has the authority to put cameras in
14 their buses and to enforce that way, they haven't
15 been doing it yet but it's something we certainly
16 want to talk to them about because whatever the NYPD
17 comes up with we think obviously camera enforcement
18 can, can you know vastly supplement whatever they're
19 going to do. On the E-bikes I know it's, it's been an
20 ongoing discussion between DOT and NYPD and, and our
21 leadership at City Hall the understandable desire to
22 see what we can do to come up with a legal framework
23 for frankly what is already clearly happening on the
24 ground, we see... we see the use of them everywhere but
25

1
2 I know NYPD does have some issues about how you
3 properly enforce.

4 ERIC BEATON: Yes, so we're, we're
5 currently engaged with some... with some of the
6 advocates on the E-bike issue in the state and how to
7 properly define the conveyance because as you know
8 the, the BLT defines the different conveyances as a
9 motor vehicle something that's not human powered
10 versus a conveyance that is human powered so I think
11 it's, its important and we're trying to do analysis
12 to strike the balance to define the conveyance
13 properly so that our officers have the ability to
14 properly enforce it and that we don't have true motor
15 vehicles slipping into the definition without having
16 to register their vehicles but we're engaged in the
17 conversation.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you now
19 let's go to our colleague and so I want to recognize
20 Council Member Koo and now I'll call on Council
21 Member Koo for question and putting the clock on five
22 minutes.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you Chair
24 Rodriguez and thank you commissioners and chief come
25 here to testify. I represent a very congested area,

1
2 you know Downtown Flushing which is only like ten
3 blocks over here but it's really, really congested in
4 terms of pedestrians and vehicular traffic. So, I
5 encounter the following problems in my district. We
6 have buses, bus lanes and they, they don't move even
7 though they get a ticket they just stay there. The
8 second thing is that we see a lot of like trucks use...
9 they are not moving, they, they use trucks as a
10 storage space, you know for commercial vendors,
11 either on the streets or the stores they just park a
12 big truck there and use it as a storage space for
13 their fruits and vegetables and even though they're
14 ticketed they're still there, I mean there every day
15 for a few months they're still there, a few years.
16 And the third thing I want to complain is the, the
17 MTA buses they don't use bus lanes a lot of times,
18 they drive on the other lane, the bus lane's empty so
19 how do we do enforcements on, on that. The, the
20 fourth thing I want to complain is the... I want to ask
21 actually is whether DOT has any roles in stoop line
22 applications because in my area I found a lot of
23 stoop lines approved by the Consumer Affairs but
24 they're on really narrow sidewalks so a pedestrian
25 has nowhere to walk, they have to walk on the streets

1

2 because when you have stoop lines on the sidewalks
3 people stay there to look at... to pick their apples,
4 they take five to seven minutes to buy something
5 there and you create a lot of congestion on the
6 sidewalks. So, I want to know whether DOT has any
7 authority in, you know approving or disapproving
8 stoop line license, can you go to this question
9 first, yeah?

10

POLLY TROTTEBERG: We do, do that work
11 with the Department of Consumer Affairs and there are
12 city regulations about how much of a stoop... I, I
13 assume you're talking about a store taking up space,
14 you're meaning a store that has a display, there are
15 certain Department of Consumer Affairs regulations
16 about how much space they're allowed to take up if
17 they're particular in... in think its... I think its
18 three or four feet I can't remember if they're
19 particular merchants that you think are encroaching
20 on more of the space than they should be then we can
21 work with Department of Consumer Affairs to go take a
22 look.

23

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I, I didn't quite
24 understand your answer, yeah so you have no authority

25

1
2 over the application or, or you just work with...

3 [cross-talk]

4 POLLY TROTTEBERG: It's, it's... [cross-
5 talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: ...by stating the..
7 [cross-talk]

8 POLLY TROTTEBERG: It's, it's... [cross-
9 talk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: ...application..
11 [cross-talk]

12 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...Department of
13 Consumer Affairs but our inspectors they, they'll
14 grant how much of the, you know use of the sidewalk a
15 given store can have but if you think that that store
16 is encroaching further than it should then our
17 inspectors can go out and work with Department of
18 Consumer Affairs if, if they're encroaching on the
19 sidewalk in a way that's not legal.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: So, so in the
21 present process you have no vote in approving stoop
22 line license?

23 POLLY TROTTEBERG: No, I mean the city
24 has standard goals, again I think its three or four
25 feet.

1

2

3

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: No, so just go to
Consumer Affairs?

4

[off-mic dialogue]

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Because I found it
really hard to understand is the city agencies or...
especially the traffic department they have no role
in deciding on the stoop line, lines especially in
downtown areas which is close to all the public,
public transportation entrances, they are taking up
space and people are very frustrated... passengers are
frustrated when they use the subways or use the bus
lines, they have so many obstacles on the sidewalks,
people have to navigate when they want to go get on
the bus or get on the train, you know.

POLLY TROTTEMBERG: So, look it's, it's
no question downtown Flushing has some of the most
crowded sidewalks in the city part of why we're doing
the project to expand sidewalk space there but again
if there's particular areas where you think merchants
are encroaching too far into the sidewalks happy to
sit down with you all and Department of Consumer
Affairs see if there meeting what the city
requirements are, if they're exceeding what we might

1
2 be able to do in terms of, you know curtailing that
3 illegal activity.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah, I, I... my, my
5 point is and I think Consumer Affairs they don't know
6 anything about the, the sidewalks, they represent all
7 the applications so I'm proposing maybe in the future
8 we put Department of Transportation to be in charge
9 of stoop line license. So, this is just a, a
10 suggestion, you know.

11 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Okay, well I'm... again
12 I, I... that, that would be a big assignment but happy
13 to, to follow up with you on it, I, I think its... from
14 what I've heard it's, it's in some ways very much
15 neighborhood by neighborhood, in some places there's
16 obviously issues where the sidewalks are getting very
17 congested and some places people love having the
18 merchants put their wares out on the street so happy
19 to peruse that one with you further.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you Council
22 Member. Commissioner before I call on my colleague
23 Council Member Levine with a proposed yesterday again
24 with plan Move New York how do you feel, I know... I
25 personally have not seen details of the plan, I do

1
2 believe that it is important to invite the private
3 sector to be part of the solution because congestion
4 requires for everyone including the private sector to
5 be part of this and I think that this is something
6 that for years have been discussed and try to get
7 Albany to act on but now this proposal it is an
8 innovating one and we heard that they also got some
9 lawyer who also been saying that the city can do this
10 thing at the local level but of course we need to be
11 open as a city to discuss any proposal that we have
12 on the table but how does the city feel in this case
13 from the administration side?

14 POLLY TROTTENBERG: Well let me Mr.
15 Chairman echo what you say and I said it in my
16 testimony I, I certainly agree that we want to work
17 very much with the private sector with our major
18 employers and institutions as we look at potential
19 congestion solutions both talking to our elected
20 officials up in Albany and things as... like as Council
21 Member Levine has discussed is we're rolling out
22 working with them on, for example more off hour
23 deliveries which we want to do in a way which
24 obviously will decongest streets but also not hurt
25 those businesses, we want to make sure we're keeping

1
2 our economy humming. We just got to look at what the
3 Move New York books put out on Friday, I have to say
4 many attorneys over a number of administrations have
5 looked at this question very carefully as you know
6 the last administration was a big advocate of
7 congestion where I think... I think have all determined
8 that the city doesn't have that legal authority that
9 we need to get that authority from the state. So, I
10 think that's what our lawyers have concluded and look
11 again I mean our own administration as you know even
12 myself included we, we've been up in Albany asking
13 for the authority to do a lot of things so it's, it's
14 not that we're not interested in wrestling those
15 authorities back where we can be; speed cameras,
16 speed limit, mayoral control, you name it but again I
17 think a lot of legal minds in the city have looked at
18 it over the years and just have reached a different
19 conclusion.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member
21 Mark Levine.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you Mr.
23 Chair. Good morning Commissioner Trottenberg, great
24 to see you. I listened to your testimony and then
25 reread the statement all eight pages and I didn't see

1
2 a comment on the bill that we're considering today,
3 which I don't recall ever happening in a hearing so I
4 guess I'll just ask you directly the administration's
5 position on the bill and specifically whether you
6 support the idea further studying the ways in which
7 truck deliveries to stores contribute to congestion?

8 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Well I think the good
9 news is we're actually doing a, a citywide freight
10 study right now which we're actually hoping to
11 complete by the end of this year so certainly we're
12 looking at congestion as... not just in Midtown, we're
13 looking citywide and as you heard me testify today we
14 are also... and this is something where I really... I
15 think we would love the leadership and the
16 partnership of the council want to make an aggressive
17 push to go back and renew the off hour delivery
18 program but we recognize that and we want to try and
19 reach out and get 900, for example 900 new businesses
20 to sign up but that is one where you really have to
21 work very carefully with local businesses because as
22 you... as you said in your questioning we do want to be
23 sensitive, we're not trying to hurt mom and pop
24 shops, I mean we want to both reduce congestion but
25 also make sure that we... that our city is functioning

1
2 economically, that businesses can get the, the
3 deliveries and the services they need. So, I think
4 it's, it's going to be a very hands-on process and
5 obviously one that will be informed by our... not... so,
6 so I think we, we support the concept of your bill
7 and... but I think we're actually serve... have some of
8 that work underway.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Right, I put
10 small businesses and chains and especially big box
11 stores in different categories. The, the big box
12 stores are going to have staff to receive at any
13 hour, a mom and pop store will not so I'm very
14 sensitive to that. The program you described that
15 expired was voluntary, correct?

16 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Yes... it was voluntary
17 and we were fortunate we actually had a federal grant
18 which enabled us to provide some financial incentive
19 for participation.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: So, you're
21 looking to relaunch this program funded by the city?

22 POLLY TROTTEBERG: We're... this will be a
23 nonfunded effort.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Understood, when
25 will that be launching?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

POLLY TROTTEBERG: Well we're, we're basically getting it underway right now, part of my discussing today.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: How is recruitment going?

POLLY TROTTEBERG: Well we're just getting started so we're, we're... we've started some preliminary discussions particularly to some of the big building owners in Midtown, Manhattan but I think we want to have a more formalized process and again I think we would want to do that in collaboration with elected officials and, and other stakeholders, the big you know local industry groups, you'll hear from the partnership today and REBNY and the building owners all, all those players.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: And when, when is your target for when the... this new pilot would take effect?

POLLY TROTTEBERG: I think it would be rolling, I don't know that we would need to do it all in one fall swoop, I think our, our target is to start to get it underway pretty seriously this year.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Do you have a target for the number of businesses?

1

2

POLLY TROTTENBERG: 900 additional

3

businesses.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Okay, additional

5

but the, the, the original 900 of reverted to...

6

[cross-talk]

7

POLLY TROTTENBERG: There was originally

8

400.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Got it... [cross-

10

talk]

11

POLLY TROTTENBERG: And we're actually...

12

we had... we had surveyed them a couple of years ago

13

and now we're going to go back and resurvey them and

14

see who's still participating, get their feedback,

15

hopefully renew our bonds with them and then add

16

another 900.

17

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Are you calling

18

it a pilot or is this the beginning of what could be

19

a permanent program?

20

POLLY TROTTENBERG: I, I guess we can

21

call it a permanent program.

22

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Okay, we'll be

23

anxious to hear more about this as it unfolds. You

24

only made passing reference to congestion pricing in

25

your statement, only about a sentence or two and you

1
2 talked about... you called it controversial and in
3 response to the Chairman's questions you referred to
4 I guess political challenges via, via the state but
5 on the substance what's wrong with congestion pricing
6 plan?

7 POLLY TROTTENBERG: I mean look this is
8 an area that obviously has been debated, debated
9 pretty extensively in the city and the state, you
10 know we can look to some of our sister cities that
11 have done it, you know there's no question that when
12 you start to charge for the use of roadways people
13 will change their driving behavior, some may choose
14 to use other modes, some may choose to drive at less
15 congested times but it's also true it can impose a
16 financial hardship on people, you know it can have
17 other spillover effects so, you know this has been a
18 great debate, I'm sure this hearing today will, will
19 kind of bring that, that debate back to the fore
20 again, you know I can just say again reiterating from
21 the city's point of view I don't... I don't think we
22 believe again that our, our legal experts think the
23 city can peruse this on its own and... [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Under, understood
25 and just... [cross-talk]

1

2

POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...you know we need to do with our Albany partners.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: A, a few seconds left, so one, one of the more vivid portions of your statement was comparing our plan for expanding the subway system to that of other cities and I guess even Los Angeles has more than 40 miles of track planned and, and Paris, Los Angeles, London are all far ahead of us where's the funding going to come for New York City to catch up to our global competitor cities in subway expansion which you described in the case of Second Avenue as reducing congestion if we don't find any revenue streams such as congestion pricing?

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

POLLY TROTTEBERG: Well that's a... I mean I think that's the... that's the million dollar question and I, I, I guess I want to give two answers to it, I mean one is you know another trend and there's been a lot written about it RPA and other groups have talked about the fact that... and one of the thing we have to... we have to I think tackle is we're not getting as much for our dollar as they are even in comparable European cities like London or Paris that are old and have a lot of infrastructure

1
2 under the ground. So, one, one challenge we face is
3 currently our construction costs for subway expansion
4 are vastly higher than even very comparable sister
5 cities so even before we add more money to the mix I
6 think obviously we probably need to find ways to get
7 more for the dollars we do have but your, your bigger
8 question is an important one and one I, I have to say
9 I think it's, it's for the elected officials of the
10 state to grapple with. As I mentioned in my testimony
11 a lot of jurisdictions around the country have looked
12 at a lot of different ways to fund transportation
13 with ballot initiatives and other things and London
14 actually... there was a mention of private sector
15 there, the private sector joined with their national
16 government to put a lot of resources on the table,
17 the challenge we have here in New York I don't think
18 our national government is going to be riding to the
19 rescue with a big new influx of funds but I think
20 that certainly for the city as we continue to grow
21 and, and luckily grow and, and really prosper
22 economically, we're going to have to grapple with
23 that.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you
25 Commissioner, thank you Mr. Chair.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I would like to recognize Council Member Kallos, calling Council Member Lander now followed by Council Member Chin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you Mr. Chair, Commissioner, and Chief; good to see you. I guess I'm going to start following on Council Member Levine's... and where he... begin where he picked up because I think your testimony is strong but I, I'm really going to take issue with this one sentence, looking forward the city and region are unlikely to see the level and pace of transit investment necessary to meet growing travel demand and make a meaningful dent in congestion, it is surely true we are not on pace for it but we cannot let that become something that we are assuming and I agree with you that that is an MTA and a state and a gubernatorial issue and I think we have a shared... everybody in this room who cares about it got a shared responsibility to make next year's gubernatorial election a referendum on our subway and bus and transit service but that is the solution, the only... I mean like that's number's one, two, three, four, and five for me about our congestion problem and then six, I'm glad to start with all the other things we're talking

1
2 about at this hearing but if we can't get the
3 significant level of revenue we need just to maintain
4 much less expand and improve our subway and bus
5 service I just think we're going to be fiddling
6 around at the... at the margins and look I, I'm a
7 strong supporter of congestion pricing as a way both
8 to address congestion and provide a revenue to invest
9 in subway and buses, I worry about decoupling those
10 things truthfully to me they have to go together
11 which is why it's got to be done at scale work and
12 effect the subway and bus service but I guess one
13 question I have you refer passingly to the citywide
14 transit study and I just wondered to what extent that
15 will help shed some light on things we need to do
16 again without the... you know significant increase of
17 revenue at the level of London and Paris and LA I
18 don't know that it's going to matter but I'm still...
19 would love to know how it can contribute to helping
20 build the, the path to that future.

21 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I, I think that's
22 absolutely right and, and we've been working closely
23 with you and many of your colleagues on it and it's
24 been a really good experience and we've gotten out to
25 talk to New Yorkers and businesses and community

1
2 boards about... and, and look one thing as I mentioned
3 in my testimony when we have looked at other
4 jurisdictions that for example have the ability to do
5 ballot initiatives, what has won the day is when the
6 voters see a concrete list of projects and
7 essentially maybe they're being asked to, to pay more
8 in some way, shape, or form but they really see what
9 they're getting for their money and so I think having
10 that study and having that list of what we can all
11 agree are the important projects the city needs as
12 you say from one, two, three, four, and five of
13 tackling congestion and two, obviously helping
14 mobility, helping economic opportunity, helping our
15 economy to continue to grow. I think New Yorkers
16 giving them a more crystal-clear sense of what... you
17 know what the potential next generation of projects
18 could look like will certainly help us in what I
19 agree with you is going to be a big debate up in
20 Albany.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: And what's the
22 timeline for that?

23 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I think... I'm going to
24 look over there at Beaton here...

25 ERIC BEATON: [off-mic] Fall.

1

POLLY TROTTEBERG: He's saying fall.

2

3

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Great, fall is good, that's... as I said... [cross-talk]

4

5

POLLY TROTTEBERG: I'll say fall-ish...

6

[cross-talk]

7

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I think... [cross-

8

talk]

9

POLLY TROTTEBERG: Just be a little

10

careful.

11

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Oh and you heard

12

what I think the strategy is here which is making

13

next year's gubernatorial race a referendum on our

14

subway, bus, and mass transit service. It sounds like

15

it will be out in time to help us do that. Alright,

16

having said that I think that's most important I'll

17

now move down to I guess what I'm saying is a six or

18

below. You, you referred to it in your... in your

19

testimony but I guess I want to push a little more

20

understanding the growth and for-hire vehicle trips

21

which according to Bruce Schaller's report are unlike

22

when we looked at it before, a significant increase

23

in the congestion problem we as a result of a range

24

of, of both politics and that early data stepped back

25

from trying to do much about it but that data

1
2 certainly says it's time for us to come back to that
3 question, we've seen too much growth in one passenger
4 for hire vehicle rides, are we looking together at
5 some ways... I don't... whether that's incentivizing
6 shared ride or incentivizing less time that they're
7 driving around in between trips or... I'm not sure what
8 the answer is, it feels to me that should be part of
9 what we're working on?

10 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I, I think you're
11 right, it's certainly interesting between the report
12 that the city did basically in 2015... the end of 20...
13 end of 2015 and then, you know what Bruce has looked
14 at since then we've seen a real jump in the FHV
15 sector no question if you all have seen the report, I
16 know Bruce will be testifying it, a real increase in
17 those numbers and the numbers are continuing to rise
18 and for the first time last year we saw subway
19 ridership decline and I don't know that we yet have
20 quite the granularity we need to sort of say what's
21 causing what and I think now that we're going to be
22 getting as I said in my testimony more data going
23 forward from the FHV's and I give the TLC credit for
24 really sticking to that... the... I don't think... [cross-
25 talk]

1

2

3

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I testified.. I went there..

4

5

POLLY TROTTEBERG: Yeah, I don't think any... [cross-talk]

6

7

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...and testified in favor.

8

9

10

11

12

POLLY TROTTEBERG: Thank you because I don't know that any other jurisdiction is going to have the access to the kind of data that we have that will enable us to, to make the right policy decisions. The policy decisions are challenging.

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Yep.

POLLY TROTTEBERG: I mean there's no question anything you can do in that sector it's, it's not without controversy so I... you know obviously this will be the locust of that debate but I think we will have really good data and analysis about what the impacts are, where they're happening and what some policy levers might be.

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Alright and then my last question just isn't giving out 50,000 placards for 10,000 spaces the opposite of what we're trying to achieve in today's hearing?

1
2 POLLY TROTTEBERG: That's a tough
3 question. I think... look obviously you've heard the
4 Mayor on this and, and he stood with NYPD and, and
5 DOT, you know that placard decision was one made
6 based on a set of lawsuits and, and labor grievances
7 that went back to the original ruling by, by Deputy
8 Mayor, Mayor Skyler, you know I think we're not
9 necessarily thrilled the way it all played out but I
10 think the decision was made, we had to get out of the
11 business of litigating. I think you also heard though
12 a real, I think a fresh commitment to being very
13 diligent on placard and placard abuse and, and my
14 agency we in particular have worked closely with DOE
15 to come up with what we think is a pretty tight
16 regime about how those placards can be used, about
17 every individual who gets one being very personally
18 responsible and accountable for making sure they're
19 not using them in abusive fashion, you know NYPD as,
20 as you've heard from Chief Chan is going to be
21 stepping up their enforcement and we're going to
22 continue what we're doing at the DOT end which is
23 looking at some of the bigger questions;
24 technological and fraud... you know fraud proof
25 improvements, there's technologies now that may make

1
2 it a lot easier for us to do enforcement and to look
3 realistically at some of the places where we see the
4 worst placard abusing; court houses come to mind. We,
5 we just had... as you know the Mayor was just up in the
6 Bronx for Bronx week and we... all of us spent a lot of
7 time on 161st Street standing around the... that area
8 where the courthouse is, there's obviously a need for
9 Court Officers and NYPD and others to go to the
10 Courthouses so how do we figure out a sensible way
11 just ticketing everybody or not ticketing everybody
12 probably isn't the most efficient way to ensure we
13 can do those municipal functions. So, we're really
14 going to be digging in with NYPD and our, our, our
15 parking blueprint to see can we come up with some
16 smarter solutions so that... if we can find some
17 rational solutions we can create that culture of
18 compliance which I think we all are longing to see a
19 bit more of.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member
21 Chin followed by Council Member Richards.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you Chair,
23 thank you Commissioner and Chief. I just want to
24 follow up a couple of questions; placard parking,
25 it's really a mess down in Lower Manhattan but we did

1
2 get some positive results in Chinatown where, you
3 know our precinct you know took the lead and started
4 posting up signs and its helpful but I think in the
5 rest of the Lower Manhattan what's happening is that
6 people don't feel it, I mean they just... it's not even
7 a placard, they put things that are expired or a
8 little fold up jacket that says NYPD or leave a
9 little note that saying that they are in, in a
10 precinct or they are in Court Officer, it's so
11 disrespectful and I think that its more than just
12 giving all of them a ticket maybe you have to start
13 towing, you got to send a strong message that they
14 cannot do this, I mean some of them are so blatant
15 fake and they get away with it. So, Chief Chan I
16 expect you, you know with this new policy to really
17 step it up and really teach these people a lesson
18 that they cannot abuse the law. How do they expect
19 other people to follow the law when the people who
20 are supposed to be enforcing the law don't follow the
21 law?

22 THOMAS CHAN: Well, well taken
23 Councilwoman, what happened is that at one of the,
24 the previous hearings you, you mentioned and we spoke
25 to the, the CO from the 5th precinct and also his XO

1
2 and they developed a plan and I think that we
3 actually had some very positive remarks from the
4 community and even the... one of the, the blogs they
5 were happy with the enforcement that they saw. A lot
6 of these solutions are going to take a little while.
7 Now for example, the 84 precinct we had an issue
8 there, the local precinct that, that covers the
9 courts in that area developed a plan, the 5th
10 precinct developed a plan with the placard
11 enforcement unit, the additional traffic agents are
12 going to come on board and also with our individual
13 borough investigations unit we are... you are going to
14 see more enforcement out there and you're going to
15 see the, the days of those jackets and thing... vests
16 and things that's going to disappear. What happened
17 is that the, the enforcement whether it be summons,
18 discipline, whichever the case may be or towing that
19 is going to happen and I think at... even at the
20 beginning when we had Vision Zero we had people who
21 are doubtful that we can do that with additional
22 enforcement by our officers, I think with the
23 enforcement out there you're going to see the
24 compliance. I understand your frustration, I know
25 that there are a lot of agencies in and around the,

1
2 the Lower Manhattan but what happened is that with
3 the, the effort that the, the Mayor has invested and
4 all the city agencies that have been notified, us
5 notifying our law enforcement and counterparts and
6 our training for our additional traffic agents how to
7 identify fake placards and things of that nature we
8 are going to get to that point and we're going to see
9 a vast improvement in that area.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: When my colleague
11 was talking about E-bike we together with my
12 colleague and the district and other elected official
13 we sent a letter requesting a meeting because it is a
14 big problem especially in my district and in other
15 immigrant districts, a lot of delivery people are
16 getting ticketed, getting their bike confiscated, yes
17 it's against the law to use electric bike but we got
18 to find a solution, you know these people they need
19 to make a living and often times they also say that,
20 you know they're being targeted and, and getting
21 their bike confiscated. So, we really need to find a
22 comprehensive solution about E-bike, you know either
23 we just like totally eliminate it or that we have to
24 make it a way that they could use it and be able to
25 follow the law and not, you know getting ticketed and

1
2 getting confiscated and it's hurting their
3 livelihoods and they're coming to my office and
4 they're coming to other Council Member's office so we
5 requested a meeting with NYPD and the other agency to
6 find a permanent solution to this problem. So, I hope
7 that we can meet soon because the problem is, is
8 continuing. The other... I know I don't have that much
9 time but the other issue about congestion I, I thank
10 you Commission about, you know doing the study down
11 here because there's got to be some interagency
12 coordination because in definitely my district as an
13 example you've got construction going on, you've got
14 tour bus, you got... you know express bus and it...
15 everything is down here, I mean anyone who lives and
16 works down here every day they experience, you know
17 cannot walk on the sidewalk because some truck is
18 parked on the sidewalk so we really have to find a
19 way to kind of make it a more livable city, people
20 love to, you know live in New York City, they love to
21 live down in Lower Manhattan but it's getting really
22 crazy out there. Flushing, I was out in Flushing and
23 I agree with my colleague it's just too congested.
24 So, we look forward to working on... [cross-talk]

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

POLLY TROTTEBERG: Thank you... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: ...trying to find a... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...we, we agree... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: ...solution... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...but both of the areas you're referencing and of course Midtown obviously require a multiagency approach. We, we work closely with PD but we recognize Department of Buildings, we got to get a lot of our other partners in there as well to try and tackle those hotspots.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member Richards.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you, thank you Chair and thank you Commissioner for attending the hearing today. I had a question on... so obviously we're talking about truck congestion, what is DOT doing to use our waterways more effectively so we get hundreds if not thousands of trucks delivering... making deliveries off of JFK Airport which obviously congests our neighborhoods, Council

1

2 Member Miller and our... myself but I also know they're
3 a major reason for congestion in the city period.

4 Have you thought of any plans to use our waterways to
5 deliver goods more effectively, is there a citywide
6 plan that your agency is working on or where are we
7 at with that?

8

POLLY TROTTEBERG: It, it's, it's

9 certainly a big challenge in New York compared to so
10 many other cities, we get over 90 percent of our
11 goods by trucks, most other cities, major cities in
12 the US have much better freight rail connections.
13 This, this is actually an area where, where EDC is
14 the lead agency and I know they have been looking at
15 potential ways, it's common sense that we can make
16 better use of our waterways obviously now we're going
17 to make better use of them with our ferry system but
18 you're certainly right, I think there's more we can
19 be doing on the, the waterway freight system but it's
20 also true, I mean obviously there has been talk about
21 can we make better use of potentially a freight
22 tunnel or maybe the gateway tunnel can partially be
23 used for freight. I think there's some other ideas
24 folks are looking at about other, other ways we can
25 get some of the trucks off the roadway.

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So, I

3

appreciate EDC certainly reaching out too so we can

4

hear a little... [cross-talk]

5

POLLY TROTTEBERG: Yes... [cross-talk]

6

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...bit more about

7

that obviously a lot of disinvestment I would presume

8

coming from the federal government on transportation

9

or concerns. Where are we at, how does that effect

10

select bus service, do you see your agency moving

11

wholeheartedly ahead with select bus service or where

12

are we at with that?

13

POLLY TROTTEBERG: I mean I think the

14

good news is so far at least with the initial budget

15

that congress passed with the new administration,

16

transportation funding was essentially left intact,

17

those of you know the President's now put out his

18

more robust budget which does call fortunately not

19

for cuts really in the major formula funding our

20

major highway and transit funds but looking at more

21

of some of the discretionary programs that do fund

22

new transit projects and... [cross-talk]

23

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And

24

privatization... [cross-talk]

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

POLLY TROTTEMBERG: Yes, well... yes, yes then he has his own... he's put out sort of a six-page infrastructure plan which, which very much looks at how to improve permitting and, and streamline project delivery, it doesn't appear to put I think a lot of new money on the table unfortunately but so far, I think transportation doesn't seem to be an area...

[cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTEMBERG: ...where we're going to see big... I think big changes in funding... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTEMBERG: ...so I think in terms of selective bus service and the things the city's doing we're going to continue onwards with our Woodhaven SBS we just got a good rating from FTA as a potential new start and we're going to continue to peruse that federal funding.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And then... so this is... and I... as a Southeast Queens resident who reluctantly has to drive in because mass transit has become so unreliable, you know driving in is... it took

1
2 me about an hour and 45 minutes to get in this
3 morning from Southeast Queens partly because of a lot
4 of construction going on too, how do the agencies
5 coordinate on this stuff, is there a way that
6 construction happening on these highways can be done
7 more effectively, we're talking about truck delivery...
8 and I know it's never a, a right time to do
9 construction in New York City technically, right but
10 rush hour, you know people are going to work, I'm,
11 I'm assuming we're the most busiest between peak
12 hours in the morning, has there been any thought of
13 moving construction to night hours or... [cross-talk]

14 POLLY TROTTEBERG: A couple... a couple of
15 answers on that and when you ask, you know whose...
16 [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And I don't
18 know if I'm crazy but... [cross-talk]

19 POLLY TROTTEBERG: No, no... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...you know...
21 [cross-talk]

22 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...certainly not, it's
23 a... it's a question I get all the time and it's a
24 very... it's a very good question, there is... I'm
25 actually fortunate in the moment to be the Chair of a

1
2 group called Transcom, which is actually made up of
3 the 16 transportation law enforcement agencies; NYPD
4 is a member, the big transit agencies of the New
5 York, New Jersey, Connecticut region and we do try
6 very hard to work together to coordinate when there's
7 major construction, when there's major incidents like
8 the Pope is visiting you name it and to try and use
9 data and a very advanced network of coordination to
10 try and anticipate so that, you know if, if, if New
11 York City DOT decides we need to close the Brooklyn
12 Bridge one weekend to do work but the MTA doesn't
13 close the, the Brooklyn Battery Tunnel at the same
14 time so we try very hard to do that bigger
15 coordination and we have a DOT pretty strict rules
16 about when construction can occur during busy periods
17 and I get a lot of complaints on the other side, a
18 lot of frustration from contractors and residents
19 about well why is the project taking so long well if
20 I'm only letting someone do work at night that's
21 going to add a couple of... so, it's, it's a balancing
22 act and one that I know can be very frustrating and I
23 think one question transportation agencies are
24 starting to ask themselves more and more is, is it
25 better to go to the public and say I can shave two

1
2 years off this project but it'll mean 24/7
3 construction would you rather we ripped off the band-
4 aid or not and, and have more of that dialogue but
5 there's always going to be that creative tension
6 unfortunately.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Well thank you
8 Commissioner and I, I do have other questions but I
9 will respect the Chairman's time and I'll just put...
10 you know we're, we're getting into these debates on
11 well whose responsibility it is mass transit is, it's
12 the MTA, it's the state so therefore the city should
13 net the seed but I think it's a... it's a question that
14 I think more and more we're going to have to
15 entertain a little bit more I'm not saying that we
16 should not have the state, you know be responsible
17 for what's going on in our trains and buses but you
18 know the city shouldn't necessarily say it's the
19 state's responsibility so we're wiping our hands with
20 this, you know of this as well so I'm hoping as we
21 move forward that the city is also going to entertain
22 a little bit more capital, I'm not saying that... and I
23 know we put a billion dollars there which is historic
24 but I think more and more from what we're seeing I
25 don't know if the administration is starting to look

1
2 at it a little differently but we can no longer pass
3 the... New Yorkers don't know the difference between
4 city and state, they don't care they call our offices
5 and complain about it so I'm hoping that while the
6 state is responsible that the city is also going to
7 continue to more aggressively look at ways to better
8 the system as well not that you're not doing that
9 now... [cross-talk]

10 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I, I, I appreciate
11 that and of course for the traveling public they
12 don't know or care who runs all these agencies and
13 it, it's our responsibility as, as transportation
14 professionals to try and serve them best we can. I
15 will say the city's putting in two and a half billion
16 in, in capital not one billion but I, I do think it's
17 certainly a good debate, I mean the MTA in its
18 current form was created back in... I think it's 1968
19 at a time when the city was very weak financially and
20 politically, the state was sort of the more powerful
21 entity and, and you know it, it, it was structured to
22 meet the needs of that time, it's 50 years later, I
23 certainly think it's a fair question about do we want
24 an agency that is both more responsive to city needs
25

1
2 and, and potentially that the city's more accountable
3 for... [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Uh-huh... [cross-
5 talk]

6 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...I don't know that
7 anyone's come up with the right formula but it's
8 certainly... it's certainly a fair question to debate
9 and, and one we would be happy to engage in.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you Mr.
11 Chair, good morning Commissioner and to the others.
12 So, could you... Commissioner could you talk to... talk
13 about some of the projects that you have engaged in
14 with the MTA along with other city agencies to
15 relieve congestion through... throughout the city aside
16 from select bus service?

17 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Well I... again I
18 would... I would put select bus service at, at the top
19 of the list and, and I do just want to... I'll, I'll
20 mention some of the others but just expand... I mean
21 the other thing we do select bus service are
22 particular routes and... but we have an... I'll maybe
23 have Eric say a few words about it. We work with the
24 MTA every day to try and figure out how we can
25 improve bus service, to look at traffic hotspots, to

1
2 look at where routing... old routes don't make sense
3 anymore and I'll, I'll have Eric get into a little
4 more glandular detail on that but I will just mention
5 a couple of other things obviously we've been very
6 involved in the discussion of City Ticket and..
7 [cross-talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Uh-huh... [cross-
9 talk]

10 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...we're, we're very
11 pleased that the MTA is going to do that pilot and
12 start it in Southeast Queens and parts of Brooklyn
13 and that's something we want to work with them very
14 aggressively on and as part of the city's capital
15 investment and we, we did also sort of loosely ear
16 mark particularly CBTC which can help speed up subway
17 lines and increase capacity, looking at stations
18 where we need capacity enhancements. So, I think to
19 the extent that the city can play a role we have been
20 very focused on those questions but actually I think...
21 I would like Eric, who has really done remarkable
22 work all over the city in partnership with New York
23 City Transit on a bunch of ways of improving bus
24 service.
25

1
2 ERIC BEATON: Sure and to, to the point
3 we certainly don't wash our hands of our
4 responsibility to help improve the transit system
5 from the city end and even beyond select bus service
6 expanding transit signal priorities that the buses
7 aren't caught at as many red lights. Looking at bus
8 lanes either on a full corridor or in targeted ways
9 but even just looking at how buses are routed so that
10 buses aren't going out of their way to... that maybe
11 there's a turn or a street direction that we've
12 changed over the years that's created hard places for
13 buses to go and by changing those... the... how those
14 streets are designed we can help those buses go
15 faster. So, we... I think we're not just doing what we
16 can we're also very much advocating with the MTA
17 using our connections whether at, at the board level,
18 as a... with the Commissioners role or even just at, at
19 staff levels to keep pushing for better ways to make
20 these things happen and then tapping into bus time,
21 the bus GPS system, figuring out where those buses
22 are really getting caught up and not just saying the
23 whole system is slowing down but knowing this
24 particular block in downtown Flushing or this block
25 in downtown Jamaica and we see a problem at a

1
2 particular place we work with you, you know we're
3 installing a new bus lane camera where we've seen a
4 lot of blockages of the bus lane attacking those at
5 very glandular levels can make a big difference too...
6 [cross-talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So... [cross-talk]

8 ERIC BEATON: ...that doesn't take away
9 from, from the need for the major investments but we
10 want to work at both the small and large levels.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: That, that is...
12 that is pretty impressive and having worked with both
13 agencies intimately, I've been employed by both
14 agencies actually over the past few years I, I know
15 that there's tons of things that can be done that,
16 that... things that, that you guys have been very
17 receptive to some of the ideas that we have talked
18 about agency coordination but over the past decade
19 there has absolutely been none and I worked in the
20 downtown Flushing plans and, and a bus stop would go
21 up one day and go down the next day and, and, and we
22 just couldn't coordinate so I, I... my hoping that that
23 would be the case obviously we've talked about being
24 better efficient, Freedom Ticket and, and other
25 things but we have express buses that don't run

1
2 during the, the, the off peak hours in our community
3 of downtown... or Southern Queens. We certainly would
4 be... love to walk to the, the, the major thoroughfare
5 and access a bus an express bus into Manhattan which
6 does not happen. They also don't come below 23rd
7 Street when the majority of the folks work below 23rd
8 Street, how do we coordinate that so that we can be
9 more efficient in those efforts but we talk about
10 also enforcement and, and, and just coordination
11 Sunset Boulevard, Long Island Railroad, L train, E,
12 F, J that is the.. for many folks the first New York
13 experience that you're going to have and that is an
14 absolute travesty, everything about it is bad, it's
15 congested, there, there needs to be capital
16 investment and none of those things happen and I will
17 say that I was recently contacted by the NCO Officer
18 to have a conversation about congestion in that area
19 but certainly the local NCO Officer is beyond his
20 means so I've asked DOT they're going to come in,
21 other agencies are going to come in, we're going to
22 have a real wholistic conversation about how do we do
23 that but agency coordination is very important and
24 there are also agencies that have refused to address
25 these issues even these common sense issues and how

1
2 do we pay for them and so I do before my time, you
3 know I, I do want to say that, that before this
4 committee many times we've had this conversation and
5 I've talked about as my colleagues Albany's
6 responsibility whether they come through lock boxes,
7 whether they come through dedicated funding,
8 mortgage... boarding fees and all those things that
9 currently exist that are not making its way down to
10 public transportation, mass transportation, we have
11 to as a city ensure that everyone is doing their job
12 and I certainly would not be willing to commit
13 another dollar for those who are already impaired
14 because of lack of transportation option in Southeast
15 Queens until other folks are living up to their
16 responsibilities and also the comprehensive studies
17 that this council has mandated have yet to come to
18 fruition and if we're not studying it we're not
19 talking about it and we're not fixing it and
20 Southeast Queens continues to be that extreme
21 transportation desert where people are suffering and
22 I, I don't expect those people to suffer and then on
23 top of that bear financial burdens and so I'd love to
24 continue this conversation... it has been an absolute
25 pleasure to work with this administration and, and

1
2 the Freedom Ticket is... we're really excited about
3 that but there's tons more work to be done.

4 POLLY TROTTEBERG: No, no question and
5 I... Council Member I'll try and answer a couple of
6 those questions and I, I know maybe Chief Chan will
7 talk about the enforcement because you mentioned the
8 express buses and I've certainly heard frustration
9 from you and other members and again I just want to
10 reiterate what I mentioned earlier in my testimony, I
11 think the MTA and New York City Transit it's very
12 exciting to study now that they've done looking at
13 the express buses in Staten Island, they've sent...
14 they found a lot of ways I think to potentially
15 streamline and speed up those routes and I know
16 they're going to want to be looking at other parts of
17 the city to do that, we're very excited to partner
18 with them, Southeast Queens, up in the Northeastern
19 part of the Bronx so I think now that they're sort of
20 getting in the gear of re-looking at a lot of the bus
21 routes and frequencies and all the other questions
22 about express buses that's going to be a great
23 exercise and hopefully we'll find a lot of ways to
24 improve service around the city.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Commissioner
3 before my colleague Council Member Dan Garodnick will
4 ask a question. In page three in your testimony you
5 shared with us how other city they have a major
6 transit plan as you say in that part you say when we
7 look at per city across the globe we see that kind of
8 major transit expansion is possible then you, you
9 know you mentioned London, 59 billion dollars
10 investment by '21; Los Angeles recently they put
11 their own initiative to raise 44 billion dollars what
12 is our ten year plan or should we have our ten year
13 plan that we can say public and private sector we
14 need to be... we need to sit in a round table and
15 discuss our resorting process how some benefits
16 should be going to invest on transportation, are we
17 looking for any initiative that we can say let's put
18 together our whatever 20, 30 billion dollar plan for
19 the next ten years so that we can take our
20 transportation system to the level of competition of
21 those three other cities that you mentioned?

22 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I, I think that's
23 absolutely the right question and I think that's the
24 way a lot of the other cities have approached this,
25 this challenge which is to have that vision of what

1
2 are... what does the next generation of major transit
3 investments look like, put a price on it and then try
4 and come together with what resources are needed just
5 to, to give some sense of, of comparison that... the
6 current MTA capital plan and we just voted, I, I
7 didn't actually vote for it but the, the board just
8 voted to amend that its now 32 billion over this
9 current five year period but the great majority of
10 those funds are going just to maintain the existing
11 system, we're not putting a lot of dollars into
12 system expansion so it is a very good question, I
13 think Mr. Chairman what should a full... what, what
14 should we spending... be spending in the next ten
15 years, how much should go for maintaining our
16 existing system which is old and obviously needs a
17 lot of maintenance and how much should go for
18 capacity expansion and what are the priority
19 projects, I think that would be a very important
20 exercise.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And, and
22 definitely I would bring into the speaker to the
23 suggestion to the... our speaker, Melissa Mark-Viverito
24 and the rest of the team but I think it would be very
25 interesting if we can put together like a group of

1
2 individual from the public, private, and the academic
3 sector and invite those institutions who also bring
4 suggestions so that we can put together our ten year
5 plan, you know if we want to compete with other
6 cities we need to be more aggressive in the... [cross-
7 talk]

8 POLLY TROTTEBERG: And, and I just would
9 mention, I mean two, two studies that I think will
10 help inform that discussion again we're working on
11 our own citywide transit plan and I know that the RPA
12 is looking to put out soon their, their fourth
13 regional plan which I think will also take a look at
14 what some of the... and I know a lot of you have talked
15 to them, some of what they think are, not just the
16 city's but the region's key transportation
17 priorities.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, thank you.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you very
20 much Mr. Chairman and thanks to all of you for your
21 testimony. I, I have the privilege of representing
22 Manhattan between 14th and 96th Street and I do want
23 to channel for a moment the frustration of my
24 constituents about a problem that is a mess and has
25 gotten materially worse over time. The quality of

1
2 life impacts for people who live in that area or work
3 in that area whether it's the honking or the fumes or
4 the inability to cross the street whether you're a
5 senior citizen or somebody with a, a baby stroller
6 because you can't actually find the crosswalk, there
7 are so many cars there is something that... you know
8 we're really struggling with and we need relief and
9 we need to find some creative solutions here, that's
10 just a normal situation, now of course right now we
11 have the Queens Midtown Tunnel problem and I have a,
12 a video on my phone that was sent to me by a
13 constituent of what it looked like over the weekend
14 where Second Avenue and 39th Street were just simply
15 not moving, there was a fire truck that the fire
16 fighters had to get out of the truck to direct
17 traffic to be able to get themselves to where they
18 were going, there were reports of a couple of
19 officers on the scene on 40th Street on Saturday one
20 of them on Sunday who were so overwhelmed by the
21 traffic that they simply did not stay for a long
22 period of time, I showed Council Member Williams the,
23 the video of what it looked like on Second Avenue on
24 Saturday and his comment was is that a video or is
25 that a photograph because really nothing was moving

1
2 at all and I will share this with you, it's, it's
3 really... it's rather shocking but what I wanted to ask
4 was about the, the traffic enforcement district and
5 the task force that exists, how many officers you've
6 got, how you're deploying them because, you know we
7 need... we need help, we need more officers, we need
8 enforcement out there, Chief we, we ask for some
9 guidance.

10 THOMAS CHAN: One... Councilman Rodriguez
11 had previously asked for the actual number of agents
12 assigned specifically too and I will get back to him
13 with that number but I would venture to say that
14 Manhattan and Midtown congestion that is one of the
15 major priorities for our department, a large number
16 of our resources are deployed throughout Manhattan,
17 our traffic agents are covering the, the bridges, the
18 tunnels, Lincoln Tunnel in the vicinity of Holland
19 Tunnel, 59th Street Bridge and all these areas that
20 are incoming into the city certainly during the rush
21 hour, the Queens Midtown Tunnel has the detail of
22 traffic agents who cover us specifically on weekends
23 because what happens is that the, the tunnel only has
24 one lane in each direction so we actually have
25 personnel on the Manhattan side there covering it

1
2 because of the additional traffic volume and things
3 of other nature unfortunately sometimes we do have
4 situations where there might be other events that are
5 occurring in the city that, you know compound the
6 problem of the... of the volume of traffic trying to
7 move through that particular area but resources wise...
8 I mentioned the Manhattan Traffic Task Force this is
9 traffic enforcement agents who are deployed
10 throughout... from 23rd Street all the way up to 59th
11 Street from river to river and they're there
12 specifically to expedite traffic in the Manhattan
13 core area and what happened is that these agents, you
14 know it's very easy to spot them, they're in the
15 smart cars and it says traffic on there and they're
16 to move traffic along those corridors, they have
17 specific routes that they're covering and if they
18 come across problems where we have vehicles that are
19 double parked, blocking a bus lane and things of
20 other nature they will get out of their vehicles,
21 issue summonses but also actually, physically come
22 outside and move traffic themselves. We have
23 increased our enforcement towards no stopping, no
24 standing, double parked vehicles and those are
25 summonses that we want to move traffic and I

1
2 mentioned that our motto is to move traffic, protect
3 our pedestrians, move traffic, prevent collisions,
4 move traffic and continue to move traffic. The volume
5 of the traffic sometimes prohibits the agent from... if
6 the, the street is, is filled he cannot pull any
7 traffic through any more than what's available there.
8 We in working with the Department of Transportation,
9 the Midtown in Motion Program and things of that
10 nature but again we try to do the best we can. Each
11 of the local precincts have their traffic teams and
12 also their Executive Officer overseeing their traffic
13 safety programs so we and, and the transportation
14 bureau support the precincts in their efforts to deal
15 with traffic and also to do enforcement and things of
16 that nature. As I said before, I testified we
17 certainly would want more traffic agents because
18 there are problems throughout the city that develop
19 that we can use more personnel.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Well let me...
21 let me just say that I, I appreciate that resources
22 are limited and I also appreciate that the volume
23 outside that tunnel is so extraordinary that you
24 would have to be almost super human to be able to
25 navigate that but what you see in the... on, on the

1
2 street and when you're out there it, it, it looks and
3 feels like the absence of any authority to actually
4 move things along. The reports that we get and I've
5 seen it with my own eyes is we, we just don't have
6 enough personnel there, I don't know what other
7 events are drawing them away but we don't have enough
8 resources there and we're not diverting people
9 properly away from the tunnel on the weekends when we
10 know the tunnel is going to be closed at least in
11 part and it's going to be creating this back up. So,
12 we need... we need support, we need DOT support of
13 course we also need MTA support on this. The last
14 thing I will say is just a comment and it's just on a
15 positive note here Chief Chan there is an agent who
16 works down by the Brooklyn Bridge in the mornings and
17 she directs traffic and she is fantastic, she is
18 dynamite, she is one of the hardest workers that I
19 have ever seen and passed by her not infrequently, I
20 called once, I don't know if the message got to you
21 but I just want to say it now today I'm sure you have
22 a lot of great talented people this one deserves some
23 recognition and praise, I have no idea what her name
24 is but I wanted to mention, thank you.

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

THOMAS CHAN: I, I wanted to follow up we will take a look at again touch base with our counterparts in the Queens Midtown Tunnel in terms of personnel, the deployment of our agents in that area and the agent you're talking about is Guadalupe Rubino, if I could clone her I would clone her and have hundreds of models like her wandering about the city and helping us out, thank you.

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah and I, I was around the Midtown at the entry, I saw how dangerous it is for pedestrians to cross by in that area because the cars there they enter so fast, are you looking at that situation because I was just waiting on some pedestrians waiting for a friend of mine to pick me up to keep going to Queens and yes is standing, I even think that I took a photo, I can send it to you, how drivers like they enter through that area like so fast and I see... you know I don't know if you've been studying it, are we looking at that situation? Well my... I don't know if... is a concern that something that probably NYPD should work with us?

24

25

THOMAS CHAN: Certainly, any time where we have moving traffic and we certainly are trying to

1
2 expedite traffic coming out of the tunnel and also
3 going into the tunnel but nevertheless they are
4 cognizant and they have to pay attention to
5 pedestrians because again that's our Vision Zero and
6 our traffic enforcement district is part of our
7 program to protect our pedestrians, absolutely.

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member
9 Cohen followed by Council Member Kallos.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Thank you Chair
11 Rodriguez, good afternoon. Just briefly Commissioner
12 I, I, I'm sure you've been following but I, I wanted
13 to give props to my borough Commissioner,
14 Commissioner Lopez, we've been working very closely
15 together on a plan to try to deal with some safety
16 issues along the Broadway Corridor and your agency
17 has put an enormous amount of work in developing that
18 plan through community engagement and a number of
19 walk throughs and, and a very thoughtfully developed
20 plan but one of the, the things is that sort of as we
21 try to get community buy in that turned into a real
22 challenge was sort of the distinct silo that DOT was
23 working in without coordination I think with other
24 agencies and that really became a challenge because a
25 large number of people from the community came out, I

1
2 mean god forbid a bike lane, I mean you know what,
3 what terror that causes but the, the complaints that
4 the community had, had nothing to do with your agency
5 particularly they had to do with enforcement issues,
6 that, that portion of Broadway runs along Van
7 Cortlandt Park and there were issues related to the
8 park and it was one of those instances where it just...
9 sometimes I feel at a disadvantage when I deal with
10 the agency experts, they know their field, you know
11 and I'm... and I'm not as well versed but this was a
12 moment where I felt like, wow, I realize that there's
13 an intersection here between a lot of different
14 agencies and the agency... it did not feel like there
15 was good interagency coordination in, in getting that
16 to where we needed it to be. So, I wonder if you can
17 just talk about like on the borough level how that
18 works as opposed to like maybe on high?

19 POLLY TROTTEBERG: And first I, I want
20 to thank Council Member Garodnick for his nice
21 remarks about the TEA I, I have to say we... they have
22 very tough jobs and I, I want to thank my own team
23 too because being traffic engineers and planners in
24 this city they're out on the streets a lot, it... it's
25 challenging work so thank you for the recognition.

1
2 It's very dedicated folks at both agencies who... you,
3 you know and you're correct Council Member that, that
4 is a wonderful project, the Broadway Project and you
5 know I think we're, we're going to continue to work
6 with the community on it but we feel like the safety
7 benefits there are very, very crucial as that's,
8 that's been a notoriously dangerous corridor. We try
9 very hard to coordinate at the... at the highest levels
10 of agencies as well as down at the local precinct
11 level. I think up in the Bronx we've generally had
12 really good work with the NYPD but obviously you can
13 certainly find moments where the public is frustrated
14 and feels like there's been a disconnect and we need
15 to do more together and we hear that a lot when we go
16 to the community and its good feedback for us. So, to
17 the extent that people are frustrated about things
18 that aren't DOT but... NYPD or Department of Buildings
19 or where ever it is having those public meetings
20 gives us a chance to try and fix those connections
21 and obviously... you know we, we heard people's
22 concerns up there, we're going to try and address
23 them because we think that that project is such an
24 important one and, and thank you for your leadership
25 on it.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I really
3 appreciate your commitment too. Chief I will also...
4 just to echo some of the comments of my colleagues
5 about the, the abuse of placards, you know I... one of
6 the things Council Members love dealing with is
7 getting complaints from the commercial establishment
8 saying that all the metered parking is taken up by
9 illegal placards and the... you know it... I don't know
10 what you... you know you said that... earlier I heard
11 that it's going to take some time, I don't know what
12 takes time to tell the enforcement agents to enforce
13 the law but it's certainly not happening. I, I... the...
14 I find those yellow vests to be offensive that, that
15 the people are getting courtesies with that yellow
16 vest, I mean just plain old offensive but it is very,
17 very widespread and I do think that also... one of
18 colleagues made this point that it does make people
19 think that the NYPD doesn't obey the law then why
20 should anybody else.

21 THOMAS CHAN: Council Member one of the
22 areas and again I had indicated that there was going
23 to be an additional hiring of 100 traffic agents and
24 things of other nature year to date right now we've
25 issued over 12,000 summonses to placards already and

1
2 last year I believe it was somewhere about 26,000
3 that we issued so it's not as if... that there has been
4 no placard enforcement but again it's something that
5 we're going to be emphasizing and we're going to be
6 focusing but 12,000 year to day as of... at this date
7 as we speak.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Thank you Chair.

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member
10 Kallos.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you Chair
12 Rodriguez. In all honesty, I came to this hearing
13 following its profile as considering a toll at 60th
14 Street splitting my district creating cost for
15 resident's who cross the street so after I got
16 elected I came across an article in Wired magazine
17 quote, "the man who could unsnarl Manhattan traffic"
18 profiling Charles Cavanaugh, I reached out to him and
19 began using his massive excel file and he's creative
20 and shared publicly and so I'm a big person on data
21 and so... I wake up every morning on 80th and York
22 Avenue to gridlock and horns honking outside of my
23 window, this is not a unique experience, currently
24 traffic from Nassau, Suffolk, Westchester, or points
25 North or West use our local roads in the Bronx,

1
2 Queens, Brooklyn, Staten Island and even Manhattan to
3 avoid highway traffic and tolls. Now I support
4 efforts to reduce congestions but have concerns about
5 efforts to simply create new revenue sources. So, I
6 had a hypothesis using DOT's streamline data which
7 tracks, tracks how many cars travel between each and
8 every borough crossing that if we tolled all the
9 interborough crossings instead of just the central
10 business district we could substantially reduce
11 traffic congestion citywide. In fact, initial
12 analysis found that tolling all interborough
13 crossings instead of the central business district
14 would have such a drastic impact that it would reduce
15 overall revenue from a congestion pricing model that
16 only focused on the CBD, would you agree to study the
17 impact of tolling all interborough crossings and
18 whether it in fact would reduce congestion to a
19 greater degree than just tolling the central business
20 district and similarly would you put greater value on
21 reducing car trips and traffic congestion or on
22 having more traffic and more congestion that just
23 generates more revenue?

24 POLLY TROTTENBERG: These are big
25 questions, I'm not sure I, I could commit to such a

1
2 study today but obviously we're, we're having a
3 discussion today on all the, the proposals that have
4 been out there on congestion pricing and there are a
5 lot of different views about ways it could
6 potentially be done. I understand the, the concern
7 about a 60th Street corridor and, and I'll, I'll toss
8 in another thing out there for consideration and I'm
9 sure you'll hear from Bruce Schaller on this, a lot
10 of what we're seeing for example with the.. with the
11 app base services is they're actually driving around
12 Manhattan, they're not necessarily passing through a
13 lot of corridors of any sort during the day and so I
14 think there are a lot of different ways we could look
15 at potential solutions, this is something obviously I
16 would want to involve my city hall in discussion
17 about what we might analyze in the future but I, I, I
18 take your point about looking at the.. all the
19 crossings of Manhattan versus cutting it off at a
20 particular street.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: And I am a big
22 fan of some of the software that I've seen your
23 engineers using specifically Eric, who I'm a big fan
24 of and to the extent DOT has the ability to take a
25 version of that software and make it available to the

1

2 general public to get to see if they press a button
3 to see what happens if you add a dedicated turn lane
4 or something... and some sort I realize that may be
5 very difficult but anyway you could show folks as we
6 are changing different traffic patterns what the
7 computer simulation showed that would be amazing.

8

ERIC BEATON: Sure and, and you know
9 we're limited in, in the software and what it can do
10 and how it... easily it can be spread but we do take
11 the, the point that communication is very important
12 and that even when we think something is good making
13 sure that people understand why.. [cross-talk]

14

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I, I, I would
15 just love to see animated jiff exports so folks can
16 see the change in traffic patterns. Along the same
17 lines I you're your testimony, love working with you,
18 please sign me up to partner on getting businesses to
19 take deliveries in the evening. I also just want to..
20 [cross-talk]

21

POLLY TROTTEBERG: Thank you, we will..
22 we will.

23

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I want to thank
24 Chief Chan for your partnership on bike safety, it's
25 something that another one of my colleagues brought

1
2 up and I want to thank you... we have the 17th and 19th
3 precincts which I say are the best in the city and
4 they've had support from you in terms of training
5 their officers to do that. I would like to however
6 ask for the traffic safety task force to support my
7 precincts in doing the enforcement and adding it to
8 our general totals and in addition for there to be a
9 coordination between NYPD, DOT, and my office and the
10 neighborhood associations because residents everyday
11 they say I see people breaking the law but I never
12 see enforcement, I'd like to go to 79th and 1st with
13 Betty Cooper Wallerstein from the East 70th Street
14 Neighborhood Association, stand there while we're
15 doing the enforcement action so she can see it with
16 her own eyes, can you help me with that?

17 THOMAS CHAN: The, the NYPD and our local
18 precincts we pair up all the time in terms of having
19 collaboration and also joint initiatives so that
20 should not be a problem and what happened is that
21 we've done that throughout the city, I didn't get to
22 mention in, in Queens we've done numerous operations
23 targeting illegal liveries of vans and things of that
24 nature, tow and towing vehicles in the 103, the 113
25

1
2 precincts with the problematics so again we certainly
3 would love to partner up with... [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Five operations
5 per month in June, July, and August during the
6 heaviest season?

7 THOMAS CHAN: I will sit down and have my
8 personnel sit down with the local precinct, the 17th
9 and 19th and we'll work out something where we can do
10 joint operations whether it be TLC or other agencies
11 also involved.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: And I think just
13 last piece just to wrap up we have a lot of double
14 parked cars, I'm going to work with our DOT
15 Commissioner on some sort of pilot but they get
16 tickets... if we can just start towing them on York,
17 1st, 2nd, 3rd so that they know that they can't just
18 stay there pay the ticket as a cost of doing business
19 but that they will get towed, it's worked for
20 FreshDirect and I believe it would work with a lot of
21 the other folks who just do, do it every day.

22 THOMAS CHAN: And I just wanted to
23 mention on top of some of the traffic flow summonses
24 that we've been working on, no stopping, we've
25 actually increased that 20,000 summonses in that area

1
2 up 28 percent, no standing, 352,000 were up almost
3 ten percent in that category. Bus lane summonses,
4 7,322 up 59 percent, bus stops, 97,000 up ten
5 percent, traffic lane summonses up 66 percent, double
6 parking, we've written 224,000 summonses for that up
7 19 percent, block the box up... 22,000 summonses in
8 that category and we're up almost 2,000 percent in
9 that category. So, we are working, we're targeting
10 and certainly towing, we're going to tow the vehicles
11 that again are blocking the flow of traffic, that's
12 going to be on the hydrant and things of that nature
13 so we are working on that.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, thank
15 you Council Member. Now the last three Council
16 Members are Council Member Menchaca who was here
17 before, Council Member Williams, and Council Member
18 Reynoso and then from there we move to the rest of
19 the public, great presentation and suggestions from
20 public and from the private and academic to come
21 after the administration finishes testifying.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you Chair
23 and thank you for coming today and testifying. I, I
24 really have enjoyed the conversation that's, that's
25 been having... happening today and I want to direct the

1
2 conversation on the... in the concept of congestion, in
3 light of the most recent expansion of the NYC
4 Ferries; Brooklyn, Red Hook, and Sunset Park now have
5 two stops in the district and its really opened up
6 the imagination of many of my constituents and one of
7 them I said I would bring to you today about really
8 thinking and utilizing our waterways as another
9 method of transportation of goods. In this bill which
10 I incredibly support this idea of, of DOT really
11 taking a, a real responsibility on how to remove
12 congestion, how do the waterways play a role in this;
13 Port Authority and EDC two agencies both alike in
14 dignity, I mean these guys have been in constant both
15 battle and now... and, and now collaboration how do you
16 think about that in this question because we're going
17 to be pressuring you to do that?

18 POLLY TROTTEMBERG: Well I, I like the
19 Shakespearian reference, it's very erudite... [cross-
20 talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: That's how I
22 feel it... [cross-talk]

23 POLLY TROTTEMBERG: You know look as I...
24 as I did mention you are... you're right traditionally
25 freight movement within the, the city family has been

1
2 EDC focused and, and the Port Authority obviously is
3 the big agency that is the mover of that between the
4 ports, the airports, etcetera but look it is
5 certainly a fair question as we were saying today in
6 this hearing it is one of the biggest challenges we
7 have in this city that so much of our freight moves
8 on truck, the congestion, the environmental, the
9 safety considerations that that brings. I think it is
10 an imperative for all of us to try and look for some
11 fresh solutions, I do think honestly though that is
12 going to for the waterways that does bring up the
13 question of potentially things like the Cross-Harbor
14 Tunnel of really looking at how we can build out some
15 major capacity but I think you're also right Council
16 Member the, the citywide ferry service has... it has
17 opened people's imaginations and it... I think it's
18 fair to challenge us to go back and say we're looking
19 at new ways to move people what else can we do on the
20 freight front, on the waterways, it's, it's been a
21 lot of fun to see this service get up and running.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Well since,
23 since it... since there is a lot of openness that I'm
24 hearing from you I think... I think it's, it's, it's
25 imperative that we move forward with, with a kind of

1
2 small scale demonstrations of how we can think about
3 really opening up with some things that we can
4 actually demonstrate things and goods that come in
5 and out of Red Hook. I think you heard from, from the
6 sponsors a little bit about our big chains versus our
7 smaller businesses that I think are, are more
8 connected to the local economy, Sunset Park and Red
9 Hook both kind of stand for not just the investment
10 that's coming in from the city, Busch Terminal and,
11 and SBMT but also at the Red Hook Terminal where its
12 future really is, is dependent on us thinking about
13 it in our future and I think there's so many rumors
14 right now about the Red Hook cranes be... disappearing
15 and, and luxury condos coming in we want to... we want
16 to kind of send some strong signals to the market
17 that this is a vital component and DOT I think needs
18 to be at the forefront and not just let EDC which has
19 a kind of one mind set which is... which is what
20 they're supposed to be doing, economic activity but
21 really thinking about it and transportation which
22 leads me to my last few items about how we really
23 think about a kind of focused area about the
24 waterfront so if you are open to waterways as, as, as
25 a reliever of congestion then how do... how do we

1
2 really place leadership within your agency to say got
3 it, we have a czar that will take care of this and
4 think about it with you Council Members... Council
5 Members because we... I think multiple Council Members
6 represent water, waterfronts that can engage you and
7 really bring the public, our small businesses, and
8 our residents to talk to you, a lot of this is mixed
9 use in nature, our waterfront communities and... which
10 also bring up other issues like impacts from the
11 ferry and we've been talking about the, the traffic
12 light on Van Brunt Street, at Pioneer it's just one
13 example of Pioneer and Van Brunt. One example of
14 other things that will be impacted as we think about
15 congestion rising through infrastructure like the
16 ferries.

17 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Well I think I'm..
18 it's not for me to appoint a czar for the
19 administration but certainly a good discussion to
20 have with us and EDC and, and City Hall and, and you
21 know look I, I, I think you're, you're right I think
22 I, I... you know I applaud the Mayor and, and EDC for,
23 for taking a fresh look at our waterways and I think
24 the Mayor has spoken very eloquently about the fact
25 here we are a city of islands with all these

1

2 remarkable rivers and waterfront communities and
3 you're right in Red Hook obviously you have a lot of
4 big box and industrial uses on the waterfront,
5 certainly I think if we put our heads together we
6 could come up with some good solutions. I'm happy to
7 say on the, the signal we're hoping to get you an
8 answer in the next couple of weeks so it... [cross-
9 talk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Great... [cross-
11 talk]

12 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...you, you know we are
13 accelerating on that one and, and you know I know
14 it's frustrating but hopefully we'll have an answer
15 soon.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Well again
17 thank you for working with us on that. Thank you
18 Chair.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member
20 Williams followed by Council Member Reynoso.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you Mr.
22 Chair, thank you Commissioner and all for, for the
23 work you're doing. My, my question really is around
24 congestion pricing because I know that they're going
25 to be... we may hear some presentations soon and so it

1
2 may have been talked about, I'm sorry if I missed it
3 I was a big supporter of congestion pricing
4 previously and I assume I will be again and I just
5 want to hear what your thoughts were on it and if
6 you're repeating it I'm apologize but I wanted to
7 hear what your thoughts are in general?

8 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Yeah, well what, what
9 we testified to earlier today and you will be hearing
10 testimony today, a new theory that the city has
11 potentially the legal authority to do some sort of
12 congestion pricing or tolling, just... I think what,
13 what I testified to is I think legal experts for
14 various administrations including the current one
15 have looked at this legal question and do feel that
16 it really is an authority that has to be derived from
17 the state and, and as I said it's, it's obviously
18 been a big and controversial debate up in Albany and
19 one that I know a lot of Council Members here and I
20 think actually a growing number feel perhaps they
21 want to urgently make that case, you know and, and I
22 think as we've seen in other cities it can be a
23 tremendously useful tool. In, in London and Stockholm
24 and other places where they've done congestion
25 pricing they've seen congestion be reduced by as much

1
2 as 20 percent which in this city would make a real
3 difference on the streets.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: So the
5 administration is supportive of the concept of
6 congestion pricing?

7 POLLY TROTTEMBERG: I'm not going to say
8 the administration is supportive, I'm going to say we
9 looked at the question for the purposes of this
10 hearing about whether the city has that authority
11 absent authorization from Albany and I think we've
12 concluded the answer is no. I think the Mayor has
13 said on this he just doesn't think at the moment this
14 is something Albany is, is going to be granting the
15 city and, and not something he's going to put on the
16 top of his list... [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: So in the... in,
18 in the dream world where the city can do it what is
19 DOT's position on the concept of it?

20 POLLY TROTTEMBERG: I, I, I think I... I
21 don't think there is unfortunately a dream world
22 where the city can do it, I think it's something...
23 it's not really a DOT... it's not really a matter for
24 DOT it's really a matter I think for the elected
25 leadership of the city and the state, you know to

1

2 come together on... could you come up with a congestion
3 plan hearing just even from your colleagues, there
4 are a lot of different views about where you would do
5 it, how much you would charge, whether it would be...
6 [cross-talk]

7

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Hey, I'm just
8 try... I guess I'm trying to get at what the
9 administration's belief in the concept is because
10 its' hard to... if we... for us to come up with things if
11 the... if the administration is opposed to the concept,
12 supportive, it sounds like you said some nice things
13 are happening to other cities so I just wanted to get
14 a... if... I guess there's no official position on the
15 concept now, I just really want to kind of understand
16 where the administration... [cross-talk]

17

POLLY TROTTEBERG: Yeah, I, I, I... again
18 I, I can just channel what the Mayor has said which
19 is, you know at the moment he doesn't think this is
20 something that's really going to be a viable debate
21 up in Albany, it's not something he's put on the top
22 of his list so... I think that's the best thing to...
23 [cross-talk]

24

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Alright...
25 [cross-talk]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...about... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: ...so we're not going to get into whether there is support for the concept or not support for the concept but I just want to make sure I again put my voice on the record and last time I had constituents that actually were opposed to it and I think, you know there was a lot of confusion because most of the people who were opposed to it probably take... would not of been affected by it because a lot of my constituents don't drive in the city, I think there's just this feeling of feeling nickel and dimed whether or not it's on, on them but I hope to convince them otherwise once this begins to move forward because straphangers always feel the brunt of increases and... for both who drive cars like myself, actually don't unless we take Battery Tunnel and what have you and obviously we want to deal with the congestion at the bridges so I want to make sure I put my voice on and... but... and my hope is sooner than later we can get past the Albany, not Albany and really get to the heart of whether we believe it is a good issue or not because the Mayor has at many times went to Albany for things he believed was important whether or not it was

1
2 successful or not and so this might be one of those
3 things. Thank you very much.

4 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member
6 Reynoso.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Hello
8 Commissioner, thank you all for being here this
9 morning. I just wanted to ask, I, I know you made
10 references to several cities outside of New York that
11 have some type of pricing that has actually reduced
12 congestion and in some cases a significant amount.
13 So, I'm just going to read into that as a, a... you
14 know something that I know DOT specifically to do
15 very well is look at information and data and made
16 decisions off of information and data and given that
17 that's the information and data that you gave us I'm
18 going to feel comfortable should that conversation
19 begin regarding congestion pricing that you land on
20 the right... in the right side, I'm not saying which
21 side that is but I feel confident that you will
22 always land on the right side of that but I think
23 we're... what I want to get to I guess is I believe the
24 problem here are vehicles, we have more vehicles than
25 ever and more people driving those vehicles than

1
2 ever, we have less people riding buses overall, our
3 ridership is going down there but it is increasing in
4 the subway system. So, there are modes of
5 transportation that are preferred throughout the city
6 of New York to, to some folks like me that are pretty
7 obvious and the MTA in effort to increase the... I
8 guess the, the quality of ridership, I'm going to
9 call it that, the quality and safety of ridership,
10 you know they continue to do upgrades to its
11 infrastructure and in doing so need a lot of money
12 and they need a lot of money and they get some of
13 that through increases on a regular basis for their
14 fares. Now other infrastructure in the city of New
15 York that doesn't have a toll base system or fare
16 base system don't get the exact or the same amount of
17 love let's say that an MTA system would be able to
18 get through a fare system. So, for me... and so we
19 don't tackle the issue that we need to disincentive...
20 de-incentivize folks from driving cars and that that
21 be something that the city does publicly and state
22 publicly and people got to get out of their cars and
23 move to other means of transportation to make this a
24 more livable and viable city and a more
25 progressively... a progressive transportation city, I

1
2 mean it's going to be very difficult to do, it
3 doesn't matter where you live you have to understand
4 that vehicles are what's causing the congestion not
5 bike lanes, not pedestrians, not sidewalks, not speed
6 cameras, it's the vehicles, get out of your car and
7 things will move easier and if you don't want to get
8 out of your cars then you have to suffer, suffer
9 repercussions, we're not going to incentivize you to
10 do it we're going to actually tow you, we're going to
11 tax you, we're going to do other things so that you
12 can get out of your vehicle. I just I guess my one
13 question is what is the city's position on vehicles
14 being the primary culprits I guess or whatever
15 regarding congestion in the city of New York that
16 they are the problem and whether or not the
17 Department of Transportation is prepared to do
18 something about that?

19 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Well I mean by
20 definition vehicles are the main cause of their own
21 congestion and it certainly is a joke if you're
22 sitting in a car complaining about congestion, you
23 are actually part of the congestion as well... [cross-
24 talk]

25

1

2

3

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you so much... [cross-talk]

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

POLLY TROTTEBERG: I, I, I think... I think our approach has been... because again we don't... you know at the moment we don't have congestion pricing as a tool is at least to try and provide the best possible options and incentives we can for people to get out of their cars, the number one way to do that is to have a good mass transit system and we've had a good discussion today about the way the city is trying... the city is trying to partner with the MTA on that but that... some of that is some sort of bigger more existential questions about how we can continue to seriously build out our subway system but we're looking at all the other routes as you've talked about you know well because you've worked with us on building out our bike network, on city... on expanding city bike, on expanding a ferry system and things that we're looking at now like car share which we do think can really be a way if we do it well to potentially enable... you know you can have one car share that ten people can essentially shed and a bunch of those... can share and a bunch of those people can shed their cars. I think another model that we're

1
2 starting to see it's emerging now in Asia is a bigger
3 bike share model, you've, you've probably heard about
4 city's like Shanghai and other places where tens of
5 tens of thousands of bikes are coming onto the
6 streets, I think there could be a lot of challenges
7 to that in terms of safety and, and the orderliness
8 of the streets but it may be a real way of really
9 doing some real mode shift if there's that much
10 availability of bikes that may also induce people to
11 give up their cars, for cities to give up more of the
12 space that's dedicated to parking for example and use
13 it for bikes so I think there's some trends on the
14 horizon that I think are going to continue to help
15 induce people and provide other modes for them if
16 they want to give up their cars.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: The, the last
18 thing I would say is, you know I, I, not the
19 administration, no one in the administration but I
20 believe that everything we do to make it as
21 uncomfortable as possible for folks who continue to
22 buy new cars and continue to travel in vehicles is a
23 good thing for the city of New York, I personally
24 think that, I need... folks need to understand that it
25 is a climate change issue and just infrastructure

1
2 destruction overall and then safety issues, more
3 people are dying and people die, Vision Zero we
4 haven't been able to cheat it yet and it's because of
5 vehicles and that's another thing that people have to
6 understand, it isn't because of bikes and pedestrians
7 again it's the vehicles, vehicles are the problem and
8 so we don't publicly start addressing vehicles this
9 is going to be something we're going to be talking on
10 long after we're no longer elected officials or
11 commissioners and so forth.

12 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I, I would just say I
13 think it's very hard to generalize about a city as
14 big as New York that there are... there are... big parts
15 of the population where you're fortunate enough to
16 live very closely to one of the most remarkable
17 subway systems in the world but then there are big
18 parts of the city where people are pretty
19 disconnected from the subway system, our employment
20 patterns in some places they're dense, if you're
21 working in Midtown or Lower Manhattan it's probably
22 pretty... or downtown Brooklyn easy, you have a lot of
23 transportation options but if you're working in some
24 other places not so much. So, again I think a policy
25 that is looking for alternatives and particularly

1
2 connecting those parts of the city that need better
3 transportation connections will help achieve your
4 goal.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you Chair
6 and thank you Commissioner, thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.
8 alright, for the record Council Member Levine was
9 here my two colleagues that had like a 30 second
10 question.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, first I
12 wanted to thank you Commissioner for walking with us
13 looking at opening Park Row for pedestrians and
14 bikers so hopefully that will make it safer for them
15 because they just can't go down War Street and Saint
16 James it's just crazy with the congestion. My final
17 point is the, the two-way toll on the Verrazano
18 Bridge if we could fix that now that would ease a lot
19 of construction on Canal Street and Broom Street and
20 all the streets that lead to the Holland Tunnel.

21 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I'm, I'm... and thank
22 you, we enjoyed the walk on Park Row and I, I think
23 it'll be wonderful if we can create a more pedestrian
24 and cycle friendly environment there and I think
25 we're going to have a great partnership with NYPD

1
2 Counterterrorism and figure out ways to do that. I'm
3 happy to say that the, the MTA bridges and tunnels
4 division is now actually taking an... a serious look at
5 the question of two way tolling and looking at the
6 data so I think when we get that data back it'll
7 really enable us to look at what, what the benefits
8 would be potentially for Brooklyn and Lower
9 Manhattan, what some of the implications might be
10 about where the traffic would go so I think we're
11 going to have some real data and that's really going
12 to help all of you that are decision makers.
13 Ultimately as you know we need to get congressional
14 authorization down in Washington to, to change that
15 tolling because that was something done at the
16 congressional level but I, I'm hoping we'll have
17 good, good data there and I know Congressman Donovan
18 has certainly expressed an interest in seeing that
19 data and having that discussion, he would clearly be
20 a, a key player if we were ever going to reverse that
21 tolling policy.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Now thank you,
23 thank you and I'm also asking my republican colleague
24 and the city council to join us and help us, thank
25 you.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you Chair.
3 So, Commissioner I'm so glad that your last comment
4 about the congestion pricing included the... how
5 services get delivered equity or the responsibility
6 of public transportation and those options throughout
7 the city are not equitable throughout the city and,
8 and so that remains my argument and I always look to
9 reinforce that that in communities that are
10 transportation deserts until we address those
11 concerns then it would be awful that we overburden
12 those communities that's already burdened. Chief I, I
13 just have a question on, on, on enforcement and in
14 particular of vehicle... and summonses that are issued
15 those vehicle summonses as opposed to traffic and
16 actual traffic enforcement summonses what I don't see
17 in particular in the downtown Jamaica area is those
18 bus lanes enforcement that no standing four to seven
19 and so forth enforcement that really keeps traffic
20 moving along and prevents congestion I see more of
21 the vehicle summonses and, and... on the off block and...
22 that, that generate revenue as opposed to address the
23 issue of traffic enforcement do you have numbers of
24 summonses around traffic enforcement as to... against
25 vehicle enforcement and just revenue generators?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

THOMAS CHAN: I mentioned earlier in the Queens South area and I'm going to divide it by the 113 precincts also, the 103 precincts in 2016 we towed 84 vehicles in the 113th precinct and then 103 precinct we towed 639 vehicles, in 2017 in the 113 we, we wrote... towed 32 vehicles and then in the 103, 202. Now with those vehicles being towed they had to be issued a summons first for a parking violation first and quite often those are vehicles that may be blocking traffic and we want traffic to move so certainly that's what we did in the 113 and also the 103. Some of the programs through... as we mentioned earlier with our NCO's and the 103 precinct Inspector Cappelmann there, Parsons, they've issued parking summonses there in, in April and May they've done some operations, 51 parking summonses, 119 movers and also... so again we are targeting those areas working with our NCO, the NCO program is very effective, the officers understand what the problems are... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLRT: So, with all due respect if... [cross-talk]

THOMAS CHAN: Yes... [cross-talk]

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...if, if you look at the numbers from versus last year to this year the numbers are down tremendously is, is that because of the, the, the case that, that, that was... did not allow the city to tow the, the, the commuter vans and, and, and quite frankly 150 summonses is woefully insufficient you can do that in two hours down at... in, in downtown Jamaica... [cross-talk]

THOMAS CHAN: Those were actually done during specific operations, doesn't... that's not the total number, we didn't specify but again... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I would still submit that that's woefully insufficient considering that is the major transportation hub down there and we really need for agencies to coordinate, we passed legislation for bidding the commuter vans from operating there and let me just say while we still have the Commissioner there that bus lane has cameras and it has cameras everywhere except for at the subway stops where the commuter vans congregate and that, that, that's an absolute oxymoron, it just doesn't make any sense there and you talked about police issuing summonses there is a controversy as to

1

2 whether or not they are violating their right to
3 actually pick up or drop off in a standing zone as
4 opposed to... [cross-talk]

5

6

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Sorry... [cross-
talk]

7

POLLY TROTTEBERG: So... [cross-talk]

8

9

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...whether or not
it's a summons.

10

11

12

13

14

POLLY TROTTEBERG: Just on the cameras
Council Member in, in light of your concerns we have
just installed a new one, Eric Beaton was just saying
it, 153rd and Archer which we hope will help get at
the, the commuter van issue.

15

16

17

18

19

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great, Council
Member Levin for one question and then my colleague
here who also was chairing the hearing on planning..
on land use he also will be asking questions. I also
would like to acknowledge Council Member Johnson.

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very
much Mr. Chair and thank you Commissioner and the
rest of the panel. A quick question and you, you
addressed this I think largely in your testimony but...
and, and somebody might have asked this already but
do, do you... do you see congestion as an... as an ever-

1
2 growing problem or is, is it getting... if you were to
3 quantify or qualify it would you say it's getting... it
4 continues to always get worse, does it ever get
5 better?

6 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I mean certainly when
7 we look at the, the taxi GPS and bus speed data it
8 has gotten worse in recent years. Throughout the
9 history of New York, I mean congestion often has a
10 lot to do with the economic health of the city so
11 their periods... when I first lived here in the early
12 80's it wasn't so bad and you could find a parking
13 space too but I think that was times when the
14 population was much smaller, we had much less job
15 creation, construction, tourism, all the factors now
16 that we think, you know come into play of congestion.
17 To some degree I think there is a notion in economics
18 that at some point congestion is self-correcting,
19 which is... it does... obviously it, it, it can't
20 continue infinitely at some point people will start
21 to use other means but again I think the challenge we
22 have now in this city is we need to give people those
23 other means and you know I do think when you're
24 looking at what some of our sister cities are doing
25

1
2 they're making major investments in transit that's,
3 that's the key way to get people out of their cars.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
6 Council Member Greenfield.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you
8 Chair for the indulgence, I apologize as the chair
9 mentioned I had a concurrent hearing that I was
10 chairing next door on the land use committee. I just
11 have a, a thought and a question related to that and
12 I certainly appreciate all the work that the
13 Department of Transportation as well as the NYPD does
14 in relation to congestion, I know it's, it's a
15 difficult battle and as you point out Commissioner it
16 seems like a losing battle partially quite frankly
17 because of the popularity of the city and economic
18 development as well. One of the challenges I know
19 we've discussed is the fact that we have hundreds of
20 thousands of trucks on the road each and every year,
21 we get our goods primarily through truck as opposed
22 to rail. I'm curious whether you would consider
23 supporting the adding a freight capability to the
24 proposed gateway rail tunnel under the Hudson River
25 which while it wouldn't solve the problem would

1
2 certainly have the potential of taking many thousands
3 of trucks off the road so that we can get more of our
4 goods here by rail as most of the country does as
5 opposed to trucks not to mention obviously security
6 and other issues which would be improved by the
7 virtue of bringing in things by rail, I think all,
8 all of us know that trucks are really one of the
9 biggest sources of frustration, congestion, and also
10 harmful to the environment as well.

11 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I, I've, I've
12 certainly heard some of the, the ideas for proposals
13 to do that particularly maybe at night to some
14 degree, the, the... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Yeah... [cross-
16 talk]

17 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...tunnel could
18 function also as a rail tunnel and could even be
19 revenue generating, I think the challenge that we're
20 looking at on the city side is once those trains come
21 into Midtown then how do we get that freight up to
22 the surface and distributed but certainly I think
23 that's... I, I know some of the folks who are involved
24 in, in running the gateway corporation and I know it
25 is something they're considering right now I think

1
2 they have perhaps a more existential question which
3 is making sure that there is some financial
4 commitment from the two states and the federal...

5 [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Of course...

7 [cross-talk]

8 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...government to see
9 this project go forward.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: And I think
11 of course there is ability once it does come to
12 Midtown to your point to get it to Brooklyn and
13 Queens through existing infrastructure and I
14 certainly agree with you that there is that issue of
15 whether or not it's going to happen but I'm just
16 curious as to whether that's a concept that you might
17 consider endorsing as a possibility of bringing in...
18 bringing in freight via train at least some freight
19 as you point out during the night and certainly
20 someone with your federal background and expertise
21 you can appreciate how that might be helpful.

22 POLLY TROTTEBERG: No, I, I, I think
23 it's, it's intuitive, it seems like it could be a
24 good idea but again I would... I would want to know... I
25 need a little more detail on what, what it looks like

1

2 in terms of passenger frequencies because you know
3 another phenomenon we're all looking at in this
4 region is that the travel between... trans Hudson
5 between New York and New Jersey is also projected to
6 grow quite extraordinary... [cross-talk]

7

8

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Sure... [cross-
talk]

9

10

11

12

13

POLLY TROTTEMBERG: ...so how much capacity
would this tunnel have to spare and how would we on
the city side where would we receive the freight, how
could we work that in terms of the actual... [cross-
talk]

14

15

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Right...
[cross-talk]

16

17

18

19

POLLY TROTTEMBERG: ...physical
characteristics of the tunnel, where would the trucks
stage, you know there's, there's sort of the, the
land side questions on the city.

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I'll follow
up with your office on some of those suggestions or
recommendations that we've gotten for the advocates
and I do want to thank the NYPD as well for their
focus, thank you Chief I know that you are spending a
lot more time on transportation issues here in the

1
2 city as a police department and we recognize that and
3 we're grateful for that and we're seeing less
4 congestion in some spots but overall safer streets
5 which I think is good for everyone as well, thank
6 you.

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member
8 Johnson for one question.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Yes, I'll be
10 very quick. I just want to make a quick statement and
11 then a quick question. So, Commissioner good to see
12 you, thank you all for being here, you know my
13 district which covers the neighborhoods of West SoHo,
14 Hudson Square near the Holland Tunnel, Greenwich
15 Village, the West Village, Chelsea, Flatiron, Hell's
16 Kitchen, a little bit of the Upper West Side,
17 Columbus Circle, Time Square, the theatre district,
18 the garment district, the Javits Center, the Port
19 Authority Bus Terminal, Penn Station, Moynihan
20 Station, it's a heavily congested district and each
21 one of us in the council represent about 170,000
22 constituents but the average daily population of my
23 district is about two and a half million people
24 because of all of that and any day no matter what day
25 it is except maybe Sunday mornings, six other days a

1
2 week, 6th Avenue, 7th Avenue, 8th Avenue, 9th Avenue,
3 10th Avenue and 11th Avenue from 14th Street to 59th
4 Street it's, it's just gridlocked, it is just
5 gridlock, I mean honking, trucks, double parking,
6 deliveries, inner city buses, it's chaos and it is
7 such a big problem it's... it might be the biggest
8 complaint that I receive on a regular basis is the
9 level of congestion in the district on all of the
10 major avenues, on the major thoroughfares going East
11 to West, 14th Street, 23rd Street, 34th Street, 42nd
12 Street all of those as well and so I just wanted to
13 come here to say that we, we need a real plan and for
14 me I support congestion pricing, I don't know much
15 about what is being discussed today with the new
16 proposal but I support congestion pricing because I
17 really feel like we need to do something and on a lot
18 of the great things that your agency has done this is
19 not me in anyway minimizing it but these things are
20 things that I asked for and the community asked for
21 so I'm extremely grateful but it feels like tinkering
22 around the edges in some ways, that there are
23 important things but they're not transformational
24 things, they're not things that are actually going to
25 relieve the problem of major congestion and my own

1
2 thing is we just have to disincentives cars from
3 coming into the city and the way to do that is
4 through congestion pricing. So, I don't know if
5 there's anything... I know you testified I wasn't here
6 for it, I read your testimony, I don't know is there
7 anything that you want to say in response to kind of
8 that statement I made but I just wanted to come today
9 because I experience it on a daily basis in my
10 district and so do my constituents and I really just
11 want to work with you all on a plan that fixes
12 congestion or alleviates congestion in New York City,
13 thank you.

14 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I, I will respond and
15 you know it's interesting as, as a lot of you know
16 the Mayor has been doing town halls all over the city
17 in all the council districts and, and I think when
18 we, we did yours I said you at the time Council
19 Member your district is pretty unique, I'd have to
20 say obviously you possess in your district I think
21 four or five of the biggest transportation facilities
22 in the world and so it, it's, it's absolutely true
23 that I think some of the day to day work we do we
24 have some, some titanic challenges how we deal with
25 the major Hudson River crossings and New Port

1
2 Authority Bus Terminal, I mean big projects that
3 certainly the city plays a role but they involve the
4 state, they involve our regional partners, you know I
5 think we, we are working very hard and some of my
6 team is here that have been particularly engaged on
7 the frontlines working with the Port Authority and
8 kind of glandular how do we improve traffic flows
9 around the tunnels which is a huge challenge but also
10 the bigger questions of how do we improve trans
11 Hudson challenge in general, how do we reduce
12 congestion, how do we provide more ways to travel
13 between New York and New Jersey so there's a
14 glandular piece and a big picture piece and you know
15 again happy to continue to engage because I do
16 recognize your district is, is unique in that regard.
17 I think it's fair to say you have the biggest
18 impacts, transportation impacts in the city.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you
20 Commissioner thank you for dedicating almost three
21 hours or more than three hours almost four to this to
22 be taking all those questions and, and as, as I said
23 before this is one area that I heard New Yorkers
24 across social, economic and any background congestion
25 is a problem that we need to resolve and I'm happy to

1
2 hear, you know on how Mayor De Blasio through you as
3 a Commissioners and Chief Chan is so committed to
4 invest or address the situation, I know that today we
5 heard good ideas, good suggestions, good initiatives,
6 I hope that this is only a beginning for something
7 that we know is so critical for all... of all... for all
8 private and, and, and public sectors. I hope also
9 that we can work together with that idea to put
10 together a group of individuals that allow to a
11 brainstorm and take the best suggestion on how we can
12 put together like a ten-year plan related to funding,
13 transportation, and also addressing the issue of a...
14 congestion. One thing that I want to say to Ann is
15 that I'm one of those 1.2 million New Yorkers who own
16 a car so those of us who own a car are not the
17 problems for congestions in the city by our self
18 because in order to reduce congestions and to get New
19 Yorkers who own cars to switch from car ownership to
20 public transportation we need to modernize our
21 transportation system. I know that my experience to
22 be able... I leave most of the time on train and not my
23 car and that is 6th and Broadway and I take my train
24 every day but for me to drop off my daughters in the
25 morning to two different school and be able to come

1
2 here in the morning when I have meetings or hearings
3 impossible so I also... I'm familiar with the
4 experience of New Yorkers who live in Queens that
5 they have to walk 15 blocks to... from... to take a
6 train. A teacher who work in a school in the South
7 Bronx and they have to walk 10 blocks to go to their
8 school. In order for us to reduce cars in the street
9 first we need to address those car drivers that they
10 come from out of the city that's one group. Second,
11 we need to create better condition for those New
12 Yorkers who live in transportation desert areas and
13 we know that we passed one of my bills which the
14 Mayor signed also now will call on DOT to do the
15 study of the transportation deserts. We also need to
16 do better on, on the maintenance and repair of the
17 train station, it should be the best experience for a
18 New Yorker to say if I get into the bus I can get to
19 my destination on time. So, I believe that the
20 congestion is a problem that we can address, it is
21 important to get the public and the private sector
22 together, I think that also now the proposal that we
23 have presented by Move New York this is something
24 that we should entertain, that we should discuss and
25 hear from everyone the pros and cons but I think that

1
2 the solution of congestion in Midtown is the
3 responsibility of all New Yorkers and I think it is
4 doable and I think that we can fix this problem.
5 [Spanish audible]. With that thank you Commissioner,
6 the professor that I... we... probably have to leave I
7 will give you the testimony but thank you for all the
8 time that you're dedicating Chief Chan on the whole
9 thing, thank you. Now I'm going to be calling the
10 first panel. Bruce Schaller a former Commissioner. We
11 will hear from Bruce and his plan as he's also
12 addressed the same proposal before on the issue of
13 congestion and then we will call the second panel.
14 Let's wait two minutes Bruce so that Commissioner is
15 back with us, I would like for the Commissioner to be
16 here by the time that also you present your
17 testimony. DOT Commissioner is now leaving for the
18 media information, she'll be back to listen to the
19 testimony.

20 BRUCE SCHALLER: Thank you, good
21 afternoon Chair Rodriguez and members of the city
22 council. I'm Bruce Schaller, Principal of Schaller
23 Consulting in Brooklyn, New York and I'm also the
24 former Deputy... Commissioner of Traffic and Planning
25 at New York City DOT and I've worked extensively on

1
2 traffic, transit, taxi, and related issues in New
3 York and nationally. I appreciate the opportunity to
4 testify this morning, I'm here on my own behalf and
5 I'll focus on two key points that are related to
6 traffic congestion in the Manhattan core and I'm
7 particularly pleased to respond to some of the needs
8 expressed this morning for new and creative solutions
9 to traffic congestion in this area. The first point
10 is recent declines in Manhattan traffic speeds are
11 primarily due to the growth in jobs, tourism,
12 construction, and pedestrian and other activity.
13 Vehicle entries... [cross-talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Would you mind to
15 re-start again I wanted the Commissioner to be here
16 from the beginning she's back right now.

17 BRUCE SCHALLER: Sure.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thanks.

19 BRUCE SCHALLER: [off-mic] it's so good
20 to have you... hi, okay. Good afternoon Chair Rodriguez
21 and members of the city council. I'm Bruce Schaller,
22 Principal of Schaller Consulting based in Brooklyn,
23 New York and I'm also the former Deputy... Commissioner
24 of Traffic and Planning at New York City DOT. I'll
25 focus this morning on two key points related to

1
2 traffic congestion in the Manhattan core and I'm
3 particularly pleased to, to have the opportunity to
4 respond to some of the needs expressed this morning
5 for new and creative solutions to the problem of
6 traffic congestion in this area. The first point is,
7 recent declines in Manhattan traffic speeds are
8 primarily due to the growth in jobs, tourism,
9 construction, and pedestrian and other activity in
10 the core of Manhattan and Commissioner Trottenberg
11 made this point earlier. Vehicle entries, another
12 word traffic counts crossing both 60th Street and on
13 the river crossings, have been falling since the
14 last... since the late 1990's. So, to accommodate the
15 growth in activity in Manhattan while avoiding
16 gridlock, what the city needs put very simply and
17 this was said by one of the Council Members earlier
18 today, what the city needs is less traffic,
19 dramatically less traffic. One essential part of the
20 solution here is clearly road pricing. Without
21 pricing, Manhattan traffic will continue to just
22 crawl along. Speeds on Midtown avenues have been
23 stuck at about eight miles per hour for nearly 90
24 years and there are studies from the 20's that show
25 this. Only a congestion charge such as Move New York

1
2 and that's one example and there may be others, can
3 dramatically reduce Manhattan traffic volumes and
4 improve speeds. The second basic point I'd like to
5 touch on is that the city needs to address the rapid
6 growth in on demand ride services such as Uber and
7 Lyft. There are two sides to this growth. Clearly
8 these services have added a valuable new option for
9 getting around town but they have also added 50,000
10 vehicles and 600 million miles of driving to city
11 streets since 2013 as I showed in a report earlier
12 this year. That translates to an increase of about 20
13 percent since 2013 in mileage driven in the Manhattan
14 core by the for-hire sector as a whole including
15 Uber, Lyft, yellow cabs, and black cars. So, that's a
16 significant increase to Manhattan traffic volumes.
17 This proliferation of ride service vehicles can be
18 seen as a problem but I also think that it presents
19 an opportunity. The city can achieve the goal of less
20 traffic by reducing the amount of time the time the
21 taxis and ride service drivers spend cruising around
22 empty or double parked while waiting for the next
23 passenger or otherwise taking up some of the most
24 valuable real estate in America. Reducing this
25 unproductive and unnecessary time on Manhattan

1
2 streets would benefit everybody. Taxi and for-hire
3 drivers would make more trips each shift boosting
4 their earnings, everyone else would get to their
5 destination faster and, and have less traffic to
6 contend with. There would also be fewer crashes and
7 cleaner air. The city should act to reduce
8 unnecessary mileage and time the taxi and for-hire
9 drivers spend on Manhattan's congested streets. I've
10 been looking at this issue and looking at potential
11 solutions and as I have results for my analysis I'd
12 be very happy to share them with you. to conclude,
13 less traffic would benefit all New Yorkers, whether
14 they're in a motor vehicle or not. Reducing
15 unnecessary driving I think is a good place to start.
16 So, I thank you for your time and I'd welcome any
17 questions.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Did he... put a cap
19 in the number of city for hire vehicles?

20 BRUCE SCHALLER: No.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Why?

22 BRUCE SCHALLER: So, I think... the problem
23 with a cap is twofold, one is I don't think it works
24 because if you put a... if there were a cap on the
25 number of for-hire vehicles citywide a lot of those

1
2 drivers who are in the boroughs would come into
3 Manhattan so the result would be less service in
4 Eastern Queens, Eastern Brooklyn, areas that have
5 poor transit service currently and there'd be just as
6 many vehicles in Manhattan so we wouldn't be solving
7 the problem but we would be causing other problems
8 which is a lack of service that they've very
9 helpfully brought throughout the city. The second
10 reason is that I think there are other means that are
11 more amenable to the goals we have here and I think
12 the place to start and I think there's a number of
13 different opportunities, I think the place to start
14 is by identifying what is really unnecessary which is
15 what I've been calling unnecessary driving,
16 unproductive driving without a passenger. So,
17 vehicles, cabs, and Ubers and the like are spending
18 ten or 12 minutes from dropping off one passenger to
19 the time they pick up the next one. It doesn't need
20 to be that amount of time, it could be less and
21 through some combination of fleet management and, and
22 I think pricing I think we can reduce that, I think
23 that would be a useful place to start both in terms
24 of, of addressing congestion issues in Manhattan and
25 also, it'd be sort of a starter place for dealing

1
2 with pricing, we've all felt pretty stuck with
3 proposals for congestion pricing which I worked out
4 very extensively a decade ago. So, if we can do some
5 other creative pricing that's very fleet, fleet based
6 I think there's some opportunities there to do that
7 that there would be broad public consensus on that we
8 could get the necessary approvals, we might through
9 the franchise power have the... have the power... the
10 city might have the power to do that itself I think
11 although we'd need some legal opinion on that and I
12 think if we can show the effectiveness of, off fleet
13 management and the effectiveness of pricing in a
14 targeted way we can then work from there as a
15 building block and go forward with other fleets and
16 other pricing mechanisms.

17 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great and my
18 second question is do you think that the city should
19 work with the truck company, the truck association
20 those representing that, that industry and work to
21 continue incentivizing for delivering to be made not
22 during the rush hours?

23 BRUCE SCHALLER: Yes, absolutely and I
24 worked on this program while I was at the DOT, it was
25 a very promising program, there are benefits... they

1
2 need incentives at the beginning because it's big
3 change, over time in the pilot the companies, both
4 the shippers and receivers found that they benefited,
5 it made business sense to do it and so I'm very
6 encouraged by DOT's program to expand this and work
7 closely with the industry because it's a... it, it's
8 beneficial to the companies involved and it's
9 obviously beneficial from a street and, and
10 pedestrian standpoint.

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Bruce and we will
12 continue being in touch with you and as I say now
13 that it is a responsibility of everyone, you know
14 from leaders in previous administrations and the
15 courts administration to put their best talents in
16 place so that we can take our transportation system
17 to the best place in the next couple of decades.

18 BRUCE SCHALLER: Great.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. Thank
20 you Commissioners. Next panel... okay, our next...
21 Roderick Hills, Michael Simas, Harry Malakoff, and
22 Kendra Hems. Alex, we called you.

23 ALEX MATTHIESSEN: Sorry for the delay
24 there was a little bit of a scrum out there, a little
25 interest in what we have to say today. Chairman

1
2 Rodriguez and honorable members of the New York City
3 Council Transportation Committee. Thank you for the
4 honor of inviting me to speak to your committee
5 today. I am President of Blue Marble Project, my name
6 is Alex Matthiessen, I am President of the Blue
7 Marble Project, an environmental consulting firm as
8 well as the Director of the Move New York Campaign
9 and Coalition, on whose behalf I am testifying today.
10 Move New York is a region wide grassroots campaign
11 seeking to build support for a master transportation
12 plan for the New York City metropolitan area
13 developed by traffic guru "Gridlock" Sam Schwartz and
14 the Move New York Coalition. The coalition comprised
15 of business groups, unions, clergy, civic leaders,
16 transportation and environmental advocates, and good
17 governance organizations, formed in 2010 in response
18 to the growing crisis facing the region's
19 transportation system; severe service cuts,
20 escalating fares and tolls, potholed roads, roads,
21 deteriorating bridges, and a dwindling funding base
22 with which to fund the maintenance and improvement of
23 our transit and road network. I think we can all
24 agree that the crisis is even more acute today which
25 is of course why you Chairman Rodriguez called this

1
2 important hearing and we're very grateful to you for
3 your leadership. I just do want to say as an aside I
4 live in Carrol Gardens, Brooklyn normally if I were
5 to take a cab it takes about 15 to... it should take
6 about 15 to 20 minutes to get to City Hall, it took
7 me 50, five zero minutes to do so today and the only
8 reason I took a cab because I, I normally ride my
9 bike or take public transit is that my colleague Rick
10 Hills told me the F train was having a lot of trouble
11 and it was not reliable so it just... case and point
12 of, of, of the trouble we face. Most of you are by
13 now familiar with the Move New York fare plan, which
14 was introduced last spring in a pair of similar bills
15 in the New York State Assembly and Senate. In
16 essence, the Move New York bills envision a toll swap
17 where by tolls are restored on the four East River
18 bridges as well as along 60th Street and reduced by
19 nearly half on the MTA seven bridges. The plan would,
20 would place a surcharge on all for-hire vehicles
21 which are otherwise exempt from the CBD tolls within
22 the taxi exclusion zone. The Albany plan would raise
23 an estimated 1.5 billion dollars a year, improve
24 Manhattan traffic speeds by up to 18 percent, commit
25 350 million dollars a year to New York City road and

1
2 bridge maintenance, and generate through bonding 15
3 to 20 billion dollars in capital funding to upgrade
4 and expand the MTA Transit system including 4.5
5 billion dollars that would be controlled by local
6 officials to meet local transit needs. Unfortunately
7 for the time being that plan has stalled in Albany,
8 we got to the ten-yard line with goal to go while we
9 had nearly 30 co-sponsors on the assembly bill and a
10 powerful bipartisan pair of senators on the senate
11 bill there were too many legislators who privately
12 support the bills but couldn't justify signing on
13 without leadership from the Governor. Likewise, the
14 Governor who has said the plan has merit may not have
15 seen enough explicit support in the legislature to
16 justify expending the political capital needed to get
17 the plan passed, the ultimate catch 22. However,
18 there is another path, Move New York is here today to
19 unveil a quote, unquote, "home rule" version of its
20 toll reform plan that the New York City council can
21 enact without approval from Albany. Based on
22 extensive legal analysis conducted by NYU law school
23 professor, Roderick Hills we are confident that the
24 city has the full legal authority to toll its own
25 roads and bridges. In a moment Professor Hills will

1
2 explain exactly how, the case he will make has been
3 vetted and endorsed by five luminaries in New York
4 City law including former Corporation Council Fritz
5 Schwarz. before I turn the mic over to Professor
6 Hills allow me to outline the Home Rule version of
7 the Move New York plan that we envision. Let me say
8 upfront that it will not solve the city's subway
9 crisis nor the MTA's funding shortfall only the
10 Governor and the State Legislature in our... are in a
11 position to do that but the Home Rule plan as we've
12 dubbed it could be a boon to New Yorkers. Here's how
13 it works. Like the state version of the Move New York
14 plan an electronic charge would be imposed on drivers
15 using any of the four East River Bridges or crossing
16 60th Street in each direction. For-hire vehicles are
17 exempt from the CBD tolls instead they pay a
18 congestion surcharge based on travel time and
19 distance within the Manhattan taxi exclusion zone
20 which as you guys know is South of 110th Street on
21 the West side and 96th Street on the East side.
22 Unlike the state plan, the toll would only be \$2.75
23 less than half the amount under the original plan.
24 And the surcharge which has been endorsed by... I'm
25 back to the taxis, sorry, the surcharge which has

1
2 been endorsed by Uber, the Metro Taxi Board of Trade,
3 Black Car Fund, and other through support Move New
4 York's toll reform efforts is designed to keep for-
5 hire vehicles from flooding the town and downtown and
6 also ensure that the largest share of total revenue
7 raised is paid by Manhattan residents. Prior
8 congestion pricing initiatives such as the Bloomberg
9 Plan that died in the state legislature in 2008
10 required residents of Queens and Brooklyn to shoulder
11 the greatest burden. after expenses, the Home Rule
12 Congestion Pricing Plan generates over one billion
13 dollars annually which the city can use to better
14 maintain the East River Bridges and city owned roads,
15 work with the MTA to expand the city's bus system,
16 and pay the... for the fair share... sorry, the fair fare
17 proposal to discount cost... the cost to metro cards
18 for low income households. Under our plan legislation
19 implementing the plan would include a lockbox
20 provision to ensure that 100 percent of the revenues
21 are spent on transportation infrastructure and
22 transit improvements. At the risk of stating the
23 obvious let me say one thing about the amount of the
24 new CBD, it's no coincidence that our \$2.75 charge is
25 the same as the fare New Yorkers pay to ride the

1
2 subway or bus, I would challenge any driver to come
3 up with a credible argument as to why it's not fair
4 for him or her to pay \$2.75 to drive a car into the
5 most congested part of the city when everyone else in
6 the city and region and I mean everyone save
7 pedestrians and bicyclists is paying that amount or
8 more to make the same trip. This is especially true
9 when you consider the relative impacts of a vehicle
10 trip with its attendant carbon emissions, wear and
11 tear on taxpayer, taxpayer funded roads and danger of
12 collisions as compared to a straphanger occupying a
13 few square feet of space, on a good day, on a New
14 York subway. I'm sorry he's not here but we have
15 temporarily named this the Daneek Miller Plan because
16 I don't think that even Councilman Miller could argue
17 against the logic and fairness of a subway priced
18 toll. To be clear the Move New York Coalition would
19 much prefer that Albany implement our original
20 version of the plan which would price the new tolls
21 at \$5.76 each way and cut tolls by an average of over
22 40 percent on all seven MTA Bridges. The 1.5 billion
23 raised annually would not only maintain the East
24 River Bridges and other roadways but also finance a
25 15 to 20-billion-dollar investment in the MTA's

1
2 faltering subway system. But if Governor Cuomo and
3 the State Legislature are not prepared to get behind
4 the Move New York proposal the city should take the
5 lead in adopting a common-sense alternative that will
6 go a long way towards fixing our roads and bridges,
7 reducing traffic and improving our bus network and
8 reap the rewards of being able to control the revenue
9 and improve the lives of New Yorkers. To borrow a
10 phrase, New York is burning, New Yorkers are
11 suffering and increasingly late to work, appointments
12 or opportunities to patronize the city's businesses.
13 They're increasingly stuck on slow buses impeded by
14 traffic, or on crowded unreliable subways, or idling
15 in their cars. We need leadership and we believe that
16 the body most equipped to provide it and I mean this
17 quite sincerely is the New York City Council. I will
18 just say as an aside in the last 24 hours since the
19 Wall Street Journal reported on this new plan and the
20 city's authority to toll its own roads and bridges I
21 have had many conversations and texts with many of
22 your colleagues and I've gotten a very impressive
23 number of very enthusiastic responses including some
24 that I would characterize as ecstatic. So, I think
25 there's potentially a lot of enthusiasm for this

1
2 idea. So, the Move New York coalition looks forward
3 to rolling up our sleeves to help you get it done. I
4 appreciate the opportunity to share our view and
5 would welcome any questions you might have and I do
6 hope that my colleague, Professor Rick Hills has a
7 chance to testify as well because he's the one that
8 really has the crux of the information you need which
9 is that in fact the, the city council, the city of
10 New York does in fact have the authority to toll its
11 own roads and bridges and I would just say as a kind
12 of prelude to that that as much as I respect and
13 appreciate Commissioner Trottenberg whose done
14 terrific things for the city and as a great
15 transportation commissioner I think she's relying a
16 little bit on conventional wisdom which we all have
17 and we all have, have been guilty of which is the
18 general feeling that the city's looked in this... at,
19 at this issue and has concluded that the city does
20 not have the authority, I think Professor Hills will
21 make a pretty compelling case that that's in fact not
22 the case, that the issue has not been looked at
23 extensively, we finally have and we are very
24 confident in our finding that the city does indeed
25 have that authority. Thank you very much.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

HARRY MALAKOFF: My name is Harry...

[cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I'm sorry Alex,
is the Professor here?

RODERICK HILLS: Right here.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So, go to... get
the Professor and then we... [cross-talk]

HARRY MALAKOFF: Yeah, you go...

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Get another
chair, if, if you move a little bit... another one
chair there...

RODERICK HILLS: I don't want to take any
chair, alright this is good.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay.

RODERICK HILLS: Thank you Chairman
Rodriguez and... for allowing me to offer an opinion
regarding the statutory power of New York City.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Sorry, and for
the time you're going to be given like three minutes
so if you can summarize and then... [cross-talk]

RODERICK HILLS: You bet... so, my name is
Roderick Hills, I teach at NYU Law School, I teach
among other things, local government law with a focus
on New York City. For years I've taught a class

1
2 former corporation council on New York City law and
3 in the course of that class we've studied the
4 question of whether New York City has the power
5 independently under the Vehicle and Transportation
6 Law to toll its roads and bridges. As a written
7 submission, I have provided to the Commission a memo
8 explaining in greater detail my reasons for believing
9 that New York City indeed does have the power to toll
10 its bridges and roads without further state
11 legislation. As indicated by the cover letter it has
12 been endorsed by Fritz Schwarz, a former Corporation
13 Counsel, Eric Lane, who served as both the Executive
14 Director and Counsel to the historic New York City
15 Charter Revision of 1989, Richard Briffault,
16 Professor at Columbia Law School and currently Chair
17 of the Conflicts of Interest Board and a regular
18 consultant for the New York City on its Home Rule and
19 statutory powers. Now I'm not here to express any
20 opinion about the wisdom policy merits of congestion
21 fees only to give you a legal opinion but before I do
22 that and in fact in lieu of that I just have to say a
23 word about Commissioner Trottenberg's testimony. She
24 says something that has been repeated to me
25 repeatedly by law department lawyers and by agency

1
2 lawyers, many of whom are close friends of mine.
3 Indeed, one of them is a colleague who's my co-author
4 Vicki Been that they, they will say this legal expert
5 have repeatedly studied this issue and have expressed
6 the, the opinion that the city lacks the power to
7 impose fees or tolls. Now let me set the record
8 straight on that, the public record is completely
9 devoid of any serious legal analysis or even an
10 official corporation counsel opinion on the scope of
11 the city's power under the Vehicle and Traffic law to
12 toll bridges and roads. The last opinion on this
13 subject that we know about dates from January 16th,
14 1959 60 years ago and contrary to what Commissioner
15 Trottenberg says as far as we can tell that
16 corporation counsel opinion says the city does have
17 power without further state legislation to impose
18 tolls pursuant to Section 1642(a)(4). So, it's
19 strange to me to hear the city repeatedly say we've
20 studied this and we don't have the power. Now on top
21 of that keep in mind that in the 1970's under Abe
22 Beame's administration Mayor Beame sought state
23 legislation to outlaw East River tolls, what sense
24 does that make if the city never had the power in the
25 first place. The Lindsey administration and the Koch

1
2 administration also took the position that they could
3 toll the East River Bridges without further State
4 legislation. So, next time a city lawyer tells you
5 we've studied the issue, we don't have the power ask
6 them for an official opinion, you have the power to
7 ask the corporation counsel for an official opinion,
8 you can even get them to waive the privileges on
9 whatever opinions they currently have or failing that
10 why not ask Cathy on your own general counsel for an
11 opinion about the city's power. I've talked to Liz
12 Fine, Jeff Metzler's a friend of mine, none of them I
13 think will readily accede to the opinion that you've
14 been given.

15 HARRY MALAKOFF: Good afternoon, my
16 name's Harry Malakoff, I'm a private citizen whose
17 had an interest in this subject for many years.
18 According to a recent report in Crain's New York
19 Business, an estimated 25 percent of New York City
20 car drivers improperly register their vehicles out of
21 state. The main reason given that people do this is
22 due to our very high auto insurance costs. According
23 to Insure.com the average car insurance in New York
24 City is about 2,800 dollars a year, compared to 900
25 dollars nationwide or almost 2,000 dollars more here

1
2 in the city. If we take the New York State DMV figure
3 of 1.9 million cars registered in the city and use
4 Crain's estimate of 25 percent more due to improper
5 registration we actually have just under half a
6 million additional illegally added cars. Many of
7 these nearly half a million vehicle owners would be
8 highly motivated to give up their cars if their
9 insurance costs were to increase by 2,000 dollars a
10 year. If even only ten percent of such owners were to
11 change to using mass transit there would be 50,000
12 fewer cars on our streets. you might ask how do we do
13 this, one easy way is to enforce proper registration
14 would be to enact resident only parking in the city.
15 Many other US cities have such rules including
16 Boston, Philadelphia, Washington, Dallas, Chicago,
17 San Francisco and many others. I believe we would
18 need state enabling legislation to implement resident
19 only rules but based on the environmental good that
20 it would bring it's a no, no brainer. There's another
21 major additional benefit to enacting this change.
22 According to Crain's there would be revenue
23 enhancement of 100 million dollars per year to the
24 city and state. The New Yorkers who practice this
25 improper registration cheat the city and state of

1
2 much needed revenue each and every year. The money
3 would come to us without enacting any new tax or user
4 base. Newly collected sales taxes, auto use fees,
5 registration charges, and parking ticket fines would
6 make up this total. In 1991 the New York Times
7 reported that Mayor Dinkins invited city residents to
8 City Hall to make suggestions to improve the city.
9 Fully ten percent of the ideas submitted to the DOT
10 that they urge the city to impose resident only
11 parking. In October... [cross-talk]

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I'm sorry, sorry,
13 now summarize.

14 HARRY MALAKOFF: Okay... [cross-talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: 30 seconds.

16 HARRY MALAKOFF: Enactment of resident
17 only parking will result in a reduction of car
18 ownership by city residents, the city and state would
19 collect according to Crain's about 100 million
20 dollars more per year and many New Yorkers including
21 the New York Times in an editorial have advocated for
22 such rules.

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great... [cross-
24 talk]

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

HARRY MALAKOFF: The, the council should push hard for the city and state to enact this legislation, we would have another 100 million dollars in our pockets and reduce the number of cars.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great, thank you.

KENDRA HEMS: Good afternoon, my name is Kendra Hems, I am the President of the Trucking Association of New York. I'd like to thank Chairman Rodriguez for the invitation to be here today. We are a non-profit member driven organization that represents the trucking industry in New York. We strive to enhance the operating and business environment of the industry and one of our primary missions is to improve safety within the industry and among all users of our roads and highways. You have a copy of my full testimony rather than reading that I'd like to just highlight a couple of key points. Recently there was a survey by the American Transportation Research Institute that calculated annual congestion costs just to the trucking industry to be over 63 billion dollars nationwide. In this region which ranks the worst as far as cost, it is 4.6 billion dollars annually in total congestion costs to the trucking industry. And as unfortunately

1
2 we know congestion in the region is only getting
3 worse. Between 2014 and 2015 we saw a 13.2 percent
4 increase in congestion in the area. As an industry,
5 we are well aware that commercial vehicles are often
6 looked at as one of the primary causes... culprits
7 causing congestion. It should be noted however that
8 based on multiple studies from various sources
9 commercial vehicles actually account for less than
10 ten percent of all traffic in the city. As it relates
11 to environmental impacts from congestion, the
12 trucking industry continues to improve energy and
13 environmental efficiency even while increasing the
14 number of drive... miles driven. Through advancements
15 and engine technology and fuel refinements new diesel
16 truck engines produce 98 percent fewer emissions than
17 similar engines manufactured prior to 1990. In fact,
18 in newer diesel engines the air exiting the exhaust
19 is actually cleaner than the air it takes in.
20 currently 91 percent of all goods transported into
21 and out of New York City are carried by truck and
22 through 2040 projections show freight tonnage in the
23 region to grow by 46 percent. While theories such as
24 freight tunnels or freight ferries sound attractive
25 to reduce the number of trucks in reality only those

1
2 trucks that bypass the city's central core would use
3 this option and the resulting traffic may adversely
4 affect South Brooklyn. By and large trucks will
5 continue to be the dominant mode of freight delivery
6 well into the future.

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great, thank you.

8 MIKE SIMAS: Thanks Chairman, my name's
9 Mike Simas, I'm the Executive Vice President of the
10 Partnership for New York City. We represent the
11 city's business leaders and largest private sector
12 employers and work to promote economic growth here in
13 New York. in 2006 the partnership commissioned a
14 study that estimated the annual cost of traffic
15 congestion at 13 billion dollars. Over the last
16 decade conditions have gotten worse which we've heard
17 about here today, we'd estimate it to be over 20
18 billion if you did the same study today. Ultimately
19 congestion threatens the city's competitiveness and
20 economic growth. Companies have been willing to pay
21 high costs to be in the city because of ready access
22 to a productive workforce as well as clients,
23 customers, business relationships, and amenities. If
24 access to these assets becomes less predictable the
25 value proposition declines. Traffic problems are more

1
2 complicated today than they were a decade ago; online
3 shopping, on demand delivery, increase of app based
4 ride companies are all growing. So, how can New York
5 more effectively address, address congestion. In
6 2007, we supported a congestion pricing plan that
7 would have imposed a charge on all private vehicles
8 entering Manhattan below 60th Street. We also support
9 increasing the price of on street parking and
10 reducing the use of parking permits issued by
11 government agencies. It should be understood however
12 that these are not necessarily going to be a source
13 of significant net revenues since the primary
14 objective is to reduce, reduce traffic and its costs
15 not to enhance revenues. At the same time, the city
16 needs to implement new policies to manage freight and
17 other commercial traffic such as tourist buses. The
18 city should also work with businesses to help
19 increase the percentage of deliveries that occur
20 outside of peak hours. There are some creative
21 entrepreneurial companies, like Homer Logistics, that
22 are providing deliveries by bicycle rather than
23 vehicle that should be encouraged. Finally,
24 convincing people to switch from vehicles to public
25 transit requires a major effort to improve the public

1
2 transportation experience. The Governor recently
3 announced its commitment to do whatever it takes to
4 reduce delays and service interruptions and improve
5 conditions within the MTA system. This is a good
6 start but it's going to require public and private
7 interest in the city, the region, and the state
8 legislature to get behind the effort. It's also
9 important that city initiatives like the ferries
10 provide intermodal transfers and, and are easier to
11 use. These are a few of the highlights but we would
12 recommend and offer to help convene and fund a formal
13 effort to review these issues and mobilize support
14 for actions to reduce congestion in all of these
15 areas. We hope you will agree that this is something
16 that we can as a city undertake in partnership with
17 the MTA and other interested parties. Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: With that what I
19 can say that with a plan Move New York we will be
20 reading your proposal and as I said before like we
21 should welcome all suggestions on how we can address
22 congestion in New York City. Okay, with that we can
23 call in now the next panel.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Stefano Trevisan from
25 ReThink Studio, Alec Slatky from AAA Northeast, Eric

1
2 McClure from StreetsPAC, David Pollack, Pollack,
3 Pollack there you go and Adriana Espinoza.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: You may begin.
5 You can go.

6 ERIC MCCLURE: Thank you, good, good
7 afternoon. My name is Eric McClure, I'm the Executive
8 Director of StreetsPAC. On behalf of my colleague's
9 thanks for the opportunity to weigh in on... today on
10 the increasingly vexing problem of congestion in New
11 York City. The elephant in the room of course, is
12 congestion pricing, which would be undoubtedly the
13 most effective means of relieving congestion and
14 discouraging car trips to Manhattan as we heard many
15 times already today. It's high time for the State
16 Legislature to grant New York City the right to pass
17 a congestion pricing plan and if Alex and Professor
18 Hills are correct, even better if New York City has
19 that authority and will exercise it itself.

20 Notwithstanding Albany's inaction, there are a number
21 of measures New York City can enact on its own apart
22 from a congestion pricing plan to deal with
23 congestion. We've borrowed four of these verbatim
24 from an article that David Meyer published on
25 Streetsblog on February 15th, entitled "four ways the

1
2 Mayor can reduce congestion without congestion
3 pricing," since we couldn't say it any better or more
4 plainly than David did it's detailed in our written
5 testimony. I'll just highlight some points some...
6 number one is to charge smarter prices for curbside
7 parking. Underpricing of curbside parking fuels
8 unwarranted demand for driving and, and free parking.
9 The city also needs to revive and greatly expand the
10 PARK Smart program which has been proven successful
11 in open... opening up parking spaces and reducing
12 cruising for parking spots. And the launch of the
13 PARK NYC app should serve as a first step to
14 developing a dynamic pricing system for pricing
15 curbside parking. Second point is on parking placard
16 reform. As Council Member Lander mentioned earlier
17 the, the recent decision to grant 50,000 parking
18 placards to the Department of Education is exactly
19 the opposite of what we need to be doing in, in
20 dealing with parking placards. We need much, much
21 better enforcement of the placards that have been
22 issued already and need to reduce that number rather
23 than grow it. The city can also implement HOV
24 restrictions on East River Bridges. While rush hour
25 HOV restrictions are a blunt instrument compared to

1
2 toll reform the impact could still be significant
3 reducing the amount of cars coming into Midtown and
4 Lower Manhattan at times when the street grid needs
5 the most relief. This is something that should be
6 strongly considered during the L train shutdown over
7 the coming years. Point number four is to prioritize
8 bus service on city streets, DOT has identified
9 street segments where buses need priority and the ADC
10 is in the process of generating a citywide plan to
11 speed buses up. It won't cure congestion but strong
12 follow through on this initiative from the Mayor will
13 help New York City's car free majority bypass traffic
14 bottlenecks. In addition to these four critical areas
15 there are at least two more policy areas worth
16 examining. The first is getting a handle on app based
17 ride hailing services like Uber and Lyft. One only
18 needs to look at the number of GMC Suburbans with TLC
19 plates applying the streets of Manhattan often
20 carrying just a single passenger. To know that these
21 vehicles are a major contributor to increased
22 congestion but we have more than an anecdote thanks
23 again to Bruce Schaller who in February released his
24 report on the effective growth of app based ride
25 services on our city streets, we have data. Mr., Mr.

1
2 Schaller's report shows that ride service trips have
3 boomed since June 2015 and added 600 million miles of
4 driving to city streets in 2016. It's time for the
5 City Hall to revisit a means of reigning in these
6 ride... these, these miles driven and if City Hall
7 won't act the City Council must take the lead in
8 crafting a solution. Lastly, better management of
9 truck deliveries on city streets could also help
10 address the congestion problem. As the growth of
11 deliveries by UPS and FedEx and FreshDirect and
12 others grow unabated we need to take a hard look at
13 our freight systems. We support Council Member
14 Levine's Intro 1031 which would require DOT to study
15 the effect of truck deliveries on congestion. It's a
16 good first step that will likely... to requiring off
17 hour deliveries in the city's most congested areas,
18 more dedicated loading zones and smaller, smarter,
19 more nimble vehicles for the last mile. Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

21 ALEC SLATKY: Good afternoon, my name is
22 Alec Slatky, I'm here testifying on behalf of AAA
23 Northeast, which serves a membership of over 570,000
24 drivers in the five boroughs. I want to thank the
25 committee for holding this hearing and you know

1
2 congestion is a problem obviously that's endemic to
3 New York City, it's not one that we want to see
4 eradicated entirely as we talked about a lot of the
5 congestion as... is the result of, of growth which is
6 great for the city and reflects the booming economy
7 and a lot of the major infrastructure projects which
8 can help prevent congestion from getting worse like
9 Gateway, Port Authority Bus Terminal, a Cross Harbor
10 Freight Tunnel are outside the city's purview but
11 there are some things that I want to mention that
12 haven't been mentioned. I, I won't go through the
13 whole testimony. A couple of things about maybe
14 taking a fresh look at some alternate side parking
15 restrictions which if there are multiple days where
16 there's alternate side parking that could be
17 incentive for someone to, to drive rather than leave
18 the car there and take mass transit for that day,
19 evaluating the addition of dedicated turning lanes
20 that congest, congest intersections and one thing I
21 wanted to highlight I think in September 2015
22 Manhattan borough President Gale Brewer convened a
23 forum about congestion and there we called for
24 increased enforcement of blocking the box and the
25 city's delivered that in calendar year 2016 drivers

1
2 received over 31,000 tickets for blocking the box
3 which is more than double what they received in 2015
4 and that's, that's good news but one thing we want to
5 highlight is to enhance the deterrent effect of
6 parking tickets and.. parking tickets like for double
7 parking which are also obviously related to
8 congestion. We have to take a look with the DMV and
9 with DOT at the most egregious and frequent violators
10 because I listed here there are 63 cars with at least
11 50 violations of violation code 47, its double
12 parking in Midtown, 97 cars with at least 50
13 violations of violation code 46, that's double
14 parking outside of Midtown, zero were registered in
15 New York, most of them were registered in New Jersey
16 and just one example someone who has 195 tickets in
17 calendar year 2016 for double parking outside Midtown
18 registered in New Jersey. So, we have to check to
19 make sure that they.. and, and that's all I have to
20 say, thank you for the opportunity to comment.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you for all
22 that's been here.

23 ALEC SLATKY: Sure.

24 ADRIANA ESPINOZA: Good afternoon. My
25 name is Adriana Espinoza, I'm the Manager of the New

1
2 York City Program at the New York League of
3 Conservation Voters. I would like to thank Chairman
4 Rodriguez for the opportunity to testify today. From
5 One New York City's plan to reduce Greenhouse Gas
6 emissions 80 percent by 2050, to last Friday's
7 executive reaffirming our commitment to the Paris
8 Accord, this... Mayor De Blasio and his administration
9 have demonstrated a significant environmental
10 leadership. Making good on these commitments,
11 however, requires aggressive action in all sectors of
12 city life, including transportation. In 2014, our
13 city's transportation sector was responsible for 28
14 percent of the city's overall Greenhouse Gas
15 emissions and these emissions were overwhelmingly
16 from private vehicles at 91.6 percent. The city's
17 Roadmap to 80 by 50, identifies strategies to achieve
18 our 80 by 50 goal in transportation that would not
19 only reduce our carbon footprint but also have a huge
20 impact on traffic congestion. Reducing congestion on
21 our streets means providing a range of fast,
22 affordable, frequent, and convenient, low carbon
23 alternatives to riders. Approximately half of the
24 workers who live in the Bronx, Queens, Brooklyn,
25 Staten Island work in their own borough yet fewer

1
2 than half of these commutes are made by transit
3 because driving across town is often easier, faster,
4 and more appealing than riding the bus or taking the
5 train if those options even exist. This is... this has
6 an enormous impact on traffic congestion and
7 emissions. Serious investments in our region's
8 subways, commuter rails, buses, and bicycle network
9 combined with limits on the construction of new off-
10 street parking can help shift trips to more
11 environmentally friendly modes of transportation thus
12 reducing congestion. This work requires integrating
13 new technologies and smarter strategies into our
14 public infrastructure like upgrades to the bus
15 system, encouraging cycling. For example, with the
16 rise of inexpensive ride share services to fill in
17 gaps in the transit network, our bike network must
18 become an enticing alternative if we are to reduce
19 congestion. The city must continue to work with
20 motivate to help... to expand and improve citi Bike
21 while making matching improvements to bike
22 infrastructure. Outer borough rail service, access to
23 passenger rail service along the underused freight
24 rail line between Bay Ridge and Jackson Heights
25 nominally known as the Tri borough deserves

1
2 additional study and serious consideration and
3 reconsidering road pricing. This often-polarizing
4 topic must be considered as a means of shifting
5 automobile trips from... to transit and developing a
6 mechanism to better fund and increase ridership on
7 our transit network. Strategies such as pricing on
8 for hire vehicles in congested areas, congestion fees
9 in the central business district, or reforming tolls
10 similar to the Move New York Plan that we heard here
11 today must be an essential part of the congestion.
12 Thank you so much for the opportunity to testify
13 today.

14 DAVID: My name is David Pollack, I'm the
15 President of the Taxi Cab Service Association. I'm
16 also known as Taxi Dave, I have a radio show and a
17 newspaper and my testimony today is actually my
18 editorial called, "Congestion Kills People and
19 Businesses". I'll read that and then I have a couple
20 of other comments. Just when you thought traffic
21 couldn't get any worse in New York City the TLC
22 announced they expect an additional 35,000 FHV's to
23 be licensed in 2017. I met an old timer last week and
24 he told... and I've known him for 40 years and he says
25 that traffic has never been worse than it is today

1
2 and I've been driving in Manhattan a lot recently
3 myself and I have to state traffic has never been
4 worse in Manhattan, add an additional 100,000
5 vehicles registered in New York City over the past
6 five years most of them FHV's and the formula for
7 total gridlock is approaching. There was once a time
8 not too long ago when an emergency vehicle with their
9 sirens could move swiftly even during rush hour in
10 Manhattan because there was enough street space for
11 other vehicles to move and yield. Today congestion is
12 the norm with 30 percent less street space caused by
13 dedicated bike lanes. Yes, bike lanes are not a
14 cornucopia, they are an accessory to congestion, a
15 culprit of sorts if you will. Additionally,
16 pedestrian areas that used to be driving streets such
17 as Times Square of 33rd Street between 7th and 8th
18 Avenues result in and are the cause of an acceptable
19 waiting time for traffic flow at every traffic signal
20 for surrounding areas and obviously the additional
21 cause of congestion. In the recent past delivery
22 trucks could pull alongside the curb to deliver goods
23 to restaurants, food stores, clothing shops,
24 etcetera; locksmiths used to park curbside to help
25 those locked out and deliveries of flowers by truck

1
2 were common. A friend of mine got rid of five of his
3 six delivery trucks because the cost of parking
4 tickets outweighed the cost of the flowers delivered,
5 now he only delivers to hospitals and locations
6 outside of Manhattan even though his shop is in
7 Midtown Manhattan. He also told me he sends two men
8 in the truck so one of them can move the truck
9 instead of getting a parking summons. Parking ticket
10 income is back to close to a billion dollars in New
11 York City and you pay for those parking summonses.
12 Higher expenses for those delivery food trend
13 translates into higher food prices, higher restaurant
14 prices and now you know why everything in Manhattan
15 costs so much such as flowers and your local
16 locksmith, congestion kills business. Take taxis,
17 statistics show drivers of yellow taxis picked up 20
18 percent fewer fares than just a couple of years ago
19 and earned 15 percent less. This means the perception
20 of not being able to get a yellow cab is being
21 enhanced by congestion while tourism and residency
22 grows the ability to service this growing Manhattan
23 population is diminishing due to congestion. Now
24 Vision Zero, we all love Vision Zero, it's about
25 saving lives and why the heck isn't someone doing

1
2 something constructive about traffic congestion in
3 Manhattan so emergency vehicles like ambulances can
4 get to the injured and the sick to a hospital. I'm,
5 I'm just going to sum up and say that congestion does
6 kill, I wanted to make a couple of comments about
7 we've been... yellow cabs have been cruising for a
8 hundred years, it was never a problem and now there
9 are 100,000 vehicles licensed by the Taxi and
10 Limousine Commission only 13,000 of those are yellow
11 cabs. A cap, the cap, Bruce Schaller said he wouldn't
12 be in favor of, the cap should be for app based
13 companies, app based FHV's not all FHV's, the app
14 based FHV's and LaGuardia traffic was a mess, you
15 read the stories about seniors walking across the
16 Grand Central Parkway to catch their planes, Bruce
17 Schaller, Bruce Schaller, Gridlock Sam came in and he
18 has a designated waiting area, okay at LaGuardia and
19 that solved the traffic problem. We don't need for-
20 hire vehicles cruising in Manhattan, we need yellow...
21 [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great... [cross-
23 talk]

24 DAVID: ...cabs. Thank you for your time.

25 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great, thank you.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

ARTHUR GOLDSTEIN: Just one comment,

Arthur Goldstein, the Council to the TSA. At the last budget hearing after the Commissioner of TLC testified about one of the items testified was the 35,000-dollar figure that David Pollack just referenced... [cross-talk]

DAVID: 35,000 vehicles.

ARTHUR GOLDSTEIN: 35,000 vehicles and the... Chairman Rodriguez commented and kind of opened the door to this conversation about a cap. We strongly encourage you to continue that, that dialogue on, on a cap because the rest of her testimony referenced a continued growth in the number of, of vehicles beyond the 35,000. We, we said it a couple of years ago when it was 20,000 vehicles we're, we're now tens of thousands of vehicles past that, it's, it's time to reconsider the cap as, as you mentioned at the last budget hearing. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And with this panels we've finished this hearing today and I think that everyone making important contributions to this discussion, thank you.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date

June 29, 2017