

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 1

3 CITY COUNCIL
4 CITY OF NEW YORK

5 ----- X

6 TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

7 OF THE

8 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
9 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER
10 EDUCATION

11 ----- X

12 Thursday, October 31, 2024
13 Start: 10:17 A.M.
14 Recess: 12:01 P.M.

15 HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

16 B E F O R E: Hon. Carmen De La Rosa, Chair
17 Hon. Eric Dinowitz, Chair

18 COUNCIL MEMBERS:

19 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR:

20 Tiffany Cabán
21 Erik D. Bottcher
22 Eric Dinowitz
23 Oswald Feliz
24 Kamillah Hanks
25 Julie Menin
Francisco P. Moya
Yusef Salaam

THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION:

Erik D. Bottcher
Gale A. Brewer
Oswald Feliz
Christopher Marte

Other Council Members Attending: Restler

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 2

3 **A P P E A R A N C E S**

4 Katrina Porter,
5 Chief Human Capital Officer and Deputy
6 Commissioner of the Human Capital Division at the
7 Department of Citywide Administrative Services
8 (DCAS)

9 Kadian Outar,
10 Assistant Commissioner for Workforce Operations
11 at the Department of Citywide Administrative
12 Services (DCAS)

13 Lauren Andersen,
14 University Associate Provost for Careers &
15 Industry Partnerships and Chief Workforce
16 Officer for the City University of New York
17 (CUNY)

18 Ludwig Lou Vouitsis,
19 University Director of Civil Service Support for
20 the City University of New York (CUNY)

21 Arthur Cheliotas,
22 Former President of CWA 1180; Chairman of the
23 Labor Advisory Board of the City University of
24 New York School of Labor and Urban Studies and
25 President of the CUNY School of Labor Studies
Foundation

Sal DeRosalia, Representing: Self

Christopher Leon Johnson: Representing: Self

Cecille Chala, Student Researcher - CUNY

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 3

(BLANK PAGE)

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 4

3 SERGEANT POLITE: Testing one, two, one two.

4 Today's date is October 31, 2024. Today's hearing is
5 the Committee on Civil Service and Labor, being
6 recorded in the Chambers by Keith Polite.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Quiet, please. Good morning,
8 and welcome to today's New York City Council hearing
9 from the Committee on Civil Service and Labor, joint
10 with the Committee on Higher Education.

11 At this time we ask that you silence all
12 electronic devices, and at no time is anyone to
13 approach the dais.

14 If you would like to sign up for in person
15 testimony, or have any other questions, please see
16 one of the Sergeant at Arms.

17 Chair, we are ready to begin.

18 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: (GAVEL SOUND) (GAVELING
19 IN) Good morning, and welcome to City Hall Chamber.
20 Happy Halloween, everyone.

21 I'm Council Member De La Rosa, chair of the Civil
22 Service and Labor Committee.

23 Welcome to today's joint hearing being held in
24 collaboration with my good friend and neighbor, Chair
25 Dinowitz, and the Higher Education Committee, to

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 5
3 discuss various pathways into New York City Civil
4 Service Workforce.

5 Every year, hundreds of thousands of New Yorkers
6 take civil service exams in the hopes of joining the
7 municipal workforce. Our city agencies are staffed by
8 hardworking, dedicated New Yorkers who deliver
9 essential city services across the five boroughs.

10 We are immensely grateful to the to these
11 employees who keep our city running smoothly every
12 day. Beyond ensuring we retain such exemplary staff,
13 over the past few years, the City Council has taken
14 action to expand recruitment efforts and to bring
15 more talent into civil service.

16 In 2022, the City Council enacted Local Law 2,
17 which directs DCAS to establish a Civil Service
18 Ambassador Program. This initiative aims to engage
19 and educate potential candidates about employment
20 opportunities within the city's workforce. Building
21 on this progress last year, DCAS implemented Local
22 Law 4, which launched the Public Service Corps
23 program.

24 This program provides internship opportunities to
25 diverse undergraduate, graduate, and law students
from a wide range of academic disciplines. Within the

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 6

3 program, managers provide interns with guidance and
4 training, supplying them with the tools and knowledge
5 needed to pursue successful careers in civil service.

6 CUNY, as always, has played a pivotal role in
7 helping students navigate the Civil Service system,
8 providing them with training and expertise needed to
9 thrive in public sector careers.

10 Many CUNY alumni have gone on to become
11 indispensable members of our city's workforce, and we
12 deeply appreciate CUNY's continued commitment to
13 building a strong partnership with the City.

14 Our goal at the City Council is clear, to
15 enhance accessibility to civil service jobs, promote
16 diversity, and equity within the workforce, and set a
17 standard of excellence that cities across the country
18 can look to.

19 Today, we look forward to hearing from DCAS and
20 CUNY about their ongoing efforts to further these
21 goals.

22 I'd like to thank the committee staff for their
23 hard work in preparing for today's hearing,
24 Elizabeth Arzt, Senior Policy Analyst, and Rie
25 Ogasawara, Legislative Counsel.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 7

3 I'd also like to thank my staff half, James
4 Burke, my Chief of Staff, Deputy Chief of Staff,
5 Kiana Diaz, and Communications Director, Fray
6 Familia.

7 I would also like to recognize that we've been
8 joined by Council Member Yusef Salaam, my other
9 neighbor.

10 And, now I turn it to Chair Dinowitz for his
11 opening statement.

12 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you, to my good
13 friend and neighbor, Chair De La Rosa. I'm Council
14 Member Eric Dinowitz, Chair of the Committee in
15 Higher Education, and a CUNY alum.

16 We are pleased to join The Committee On Civil
17 Service and Labor for this Oversight Hearing on:
18 *PATHWAYS INTO NEW YORK CITY'S CIVIL SERVICE.*

19 Before turning to today's hearing, I want to
20 speak directly to New York City students for a
21 minute.

22 So to our CUNY students, I know many of you are
23 registered and ready to vote on November 5th or even
24 early. In our hearing last month, we heard about the
25 many important efforts that CUNY staff and faculty,
and indeed national organizations have made to talk

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 8

3 to you about the importance of voting and getting you
4 registered.

5 We also know that registration is one thing and
6 actually voting is another. To CUNY students, please
7 make sure you vote early or on November 5th, if you
8 haven't already done so during this early voting
9 period or by absentee ballot.

10 And, for those of you who are 18-year-old, new
11 voters, welcome to our democratic process.

12 And, now a word to our city's public high school
13 seniors and your families.

14 I hope you have already heard this from your
15 teachers and counselors at school, but in case you
16 haven't, CUNY is waiving application fees across all
17 of its campuses until November 15th. So apply now. Do
18 not wait.

19 SUNY is waiving its application fees for up to
20 five colleges until November 3rd. So there's another
21 great public higher education option for you. This is
22 the savings of \$50 to \$65 per college application, so
23 please take advantage of it.

24 And further, if you didn't already know it,
25 admission to all seven community colleges is
guaranteed for all New York City public high school

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 9

3 graduates. We are very proud of the 75,000 students
4 CUNY Community Colleges served last year, and we hope
5 to see a lot of you on CUNY campuses next fall.

6 And that brings us to today's hearing, Chancellor
7 Félix Matos Rodríguez wrote in an op ed piece, which
8 I have quoted in the past, that it is CUNY's job to
9 turn out graduates who are well informed, socially
10 aware, and actively engaged in the world,
11 particularly when our society is so polarized.

12 He further explains that CUNY must ensure that
13 its graduates are not only prepared to participate in
14 society, but also motivated to make it better. And he
15 notes the large number of New York City and New York
16 State public officials who have graduated from CUNY -
17 including me. He claimed that CUNY's colleges were
18 the incubators of our public service aspirations.

19 It is those public service aspirations that have
20 led and continue to lead CUNY's current students and
21 graduates to pursue a career in civil service in our
22 city.

23 Putting CUNY students, whether before or after
24 graduation, on a clear and certain pathway to a good
25 job contributes to the civic, social, and economic
mobility of those students. To that end, CUNY offers

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 10
3 a wide variety of apprenticeships, internships, and
4 fellowships that help CUNY students and graduates
5 make a successful transition from school to work.

6 I look forward to hearing today about CUNY's
7 efforts in engaging students with a couple of
8 programs that do just that.

9 And I want to acknowledge my colleagues on the
10 Higher Education Committee who are present. We've
11 been joined by Council Member Brewer.

12 I would also like to personally thank Adam
13 Staropoli, my legislative director, Jenna Klaus, my
14 chief of staff, Sahar Moazami the Committee's
15 counsel, Regina Paul, the committee's policy analyst,
16 and Ally Stauffer (phonetic), the Committee's
17 financial and analyst.

18 Back to you, Chair De La Rosa.

19 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you, Chair
20 Dinowitz, we have also been joined by Council Member
21 Moya on Zoom.

22 We will now be hearing testimony from
23 representatives from the Administration, and I now
24 turn it to the committee counsel to administer the
25 oath for the panel of administration officials.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 11

3 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Chair. We will now
4 hear testimony from the Administration. Before we
5 begin, I will administer the affirmation. Panelists,
6 please raise your right hand, and I will read the
7 affirmation once, then call on each of you
8 individually to respond.

9 Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth,
10 and nothing but the truth before this committee, and
11 to respond honestly to council member questions?

12 PANEL AFFIRMS

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you.

14 (PAUSE)

15 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you, we have also
16 been joined by Council Member Hanks on Zoom.

17 You may begin your testimony.

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PORTER: Good morning, Chair
19 De La Rosa, Chair Dinowitz, and members of the City
20 Council's Committee on Civil Service and Labor and
21 Committee on Higher Education.

22 My name is Katrina Porter, and I am the Chief
23 Human Capital Officer for the City of New York and
24 Deputy Commissioner of the Human Capital Division at
25 the Department of Citywide Administrative Services,
more commonly known as DCAS.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 12

3 I am joined here today by my colleague, DCAS
4 Assistant Commissioner for Workforce Operations,
5 Kadian Outar.

6 I am grateful for the opportunity today to
7 discuss our program and processes with you, and I
8 will be presenting several general but incredibly
9 meaningful ways in which the City provides pathways
10 to civil service for New Yorkers.

11 DCAS's commitment to equity, effectiveness, and
12 sustainability guides our work in providing city
13 agencies with the resources they need to carry out
14 their respective missions. It is through this lens
15 that we view the promotion of civil service which we
16 provide multiple doors to access as a gateway to good
17 paying, middle class jobs.

18 I'd first like to discuss the legislative
19 mandates under which we operate that help us in our
20 efforts to provide pathways to municipal work. Then I
21 will focus on the programs DCAS has initiated to
22 create a pipeline for New Yorkers to work for the
23 City.

24 Several key laws guide our promotion of civil
25 service, including Local Law 173 of 2018, which
requires DCAS to provide civil service exam

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 13

3 information to New York City Public School students
4 who will be graduating from high school in either the
5 current or following school year.

6 Under Local Law 2 of 2023, DCAS established and
7 implemented a Civil Service Ambassadors Program that
8 provides education and outreach at programs and
9 institutions deemed opportunity areas such as high
10 schools, colleges, universities, and social work
11 programs.

12 In fiscal year 2023, DCAS participated in 86
13 events to share information about the benefits of
14 joining the City's workforce. Enhanced by Local Law 4
15 of 2023, DCAS operates a public service corps program
16 that places both graduate and undergraduate students
17 from diverse backgrounds into meaningful internships
18 in a broad range of city agencies.

19 Established in 1966, The Public Service Corps is
20 the oldest, off campus work study program
21 administered by the City that places students into
22 paid internship experience for academic credit.

23 In fiscal year 2024, 116 students from 15
24 academic institutions, including eight CUNY schools,
25 participated in the PSC internship.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 14

3 Local Law 113 of 2023 requires DCAS, in
4 collaboration with the Department of Correction, and
5 the Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice to make
6 available information about civil service
7 examinations to criminal justice involved
8 individuals, including those who are currently
9 incarcerated.

10 Outside of the city, in accordance with the New
11 York state civil service legislation that Governor
12 Hochul signed into law this past September, DCAS has
13 begun to expand the time frame by which educational
14 requirements for competitive civil service exams must
15 be met.

16 Previously, applicants had to satisfy those
17 educational requirements by January 1st the following
18 calendar year. Instead, candidates now have up to one
19 year following the completion of an exam to fulfill
20 such requisites.

21 In addition to complying with local legislative
22 priorities, DCAS also undertakes a host of
23 initiatives designed to attract New York City's best
24 and brightest, in fact, it is at the core of our
25 work. Central to our mission is the administration of
civil service examinations. The most reliable path

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 15

3 into civil service for New Yorkers is through
4 competitive examinations. Each year, DCAS
5 administers between 185 and 200 examinations,
6 offering pathways to civil service jobs for tens of
7 thousands of New Yorkers.

8 This year to date, we have administered 205
9 exams, which are the most ever undertaken by DCAS in
10 a single year.

11 Beyond our general examinations, we have also
12 been piloting efforts to increase pathways to civil
13 service through the Bridge Exam. This initiative
14 allows candidates to pay one application fee and take
15 a single test that can be used for multiple job
16 titles.

17 Our most recent Bridge, which covers jobs
18 including bookkeeper, clerical associate, secretary,
19 maintenance worker, and staff analysts, have
20 attracted more than 8,000 applications.

21 This year, DCAS launched the Public Safety exam,
22 adopting the innovative approach we used in creating
23 the Bridge exam. The Public Safety exam level one
24 affords applicants the opportunity to pay one at one
25 fee for a single test allowing them to qualify for
Sanitation Enforcement Agent, School Safety Agent,

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 16
3 Special Officer, and Traffic Enforcement Agent titles
4 all at once.

5 While I can't cover all of our initiatives today,
6 I want to highlight a few that are particularly
7 impactful.

8 First, our Office of City Wide Recruitment, which
9 among many things, collaborates and engages with
10 institutions, community based organizations, elective
11 officials, and faith based organizations to create
12 pathways to city jobs.

13 To give a sense of scale, in fiscal year 2024,
14 OCR participated in over 186 outreach events and
15 reached over 16,600 participants, sharing widely the
16 benefit of employment and promoting pathways into
17 civil service for New Yorkers.

18 Our CUNY oriented programs and other pathway
19 programs, like the Civil Service Pathway Fellowship,
20 Urban Fellows Program, and Automotive High School
21 Internship offer real life experience and provide
22 career guidance and practical training and municipal
23 fields. And our teams have been hard at work
24 promoting these programs as well.
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 17

3 In fiscal year 2023 and 2024, DCAS participated
4 in close to 50 events across 18 CUNY schools,
5 engaging over 5,400 participants.

6 Lastly, I want to highlight our immensely
7 successful Minimum Qualification Review Project. This
8 ongoing initiative reviews minimum qualifications for
9 entry level titles to expand the pool of eligible
10 candidates and reduce employment barriers. To date,
11 we have expanded educational requirements for 44
12 titles affecting approximately 22,000 jobs. Similar
13 efforts are taking place across the country, as city
14 and states work to make public sector employment more
15 accessible and inclusive.

16 In conclusion, it is clear that DCAS is not just
17 committed, but passionate about helping New Yorkers
18 access civil service opportunities. The Civil Service
19 system unquestionably provides a path to the middle
20 class for underserved and underrepresented
21 communities. Through the initiatives, programs,
22 apprenticeships, and partnerships we've detailed
23 here, DCAS continues to expand access to government
24 jobs. We are proud of our partnership with CUNY, and
25 others, and look forward to continuing the success of

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 18
3 collective efforts already achieved in the years to
4 come.

5 Lastly, I'd like to thank the City Council for
6 its dedicated partnership with DCAS and the City in
7 advancing this work.

8 Thank you for your time and attention, and I'm
9 happy to answer any questions you may have.

10 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you.

11 PROVOST ANDERSON: Good morning, Honorable Chairs,
12 De la Rosa and Dinowitz, and members of the Civil
13 Service and Labor Committee and the Higher Education
14 Committee. Thank you for the invitation to come and
15 speak today on pathways to New York City Civil
16 Service.

17 My name is Lauren Anderson, and I am my
18 colleague, Ludwig Vouitsis, are proud to represent
19 the City University of New York here today.

20 I have the honor of serving as the University
21 Associate Provost for Careers and Industry
22 Partnerships and Chief Workforce Officer at CUNY. In
23 this capacity, I oversee an office that was recently
24 elevated to report directly to the chancellor as well
25 as the university provost. This is a reflection of
the importance that CUNY places on ensuring our

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 19

3 students can successfully launch careers while
4 helping to fuel the growth of New York employers.

5 Last July, CUNY released a strategic plan
6 entitled CUNY Lifting New York. We chose this title
7 deliberately in recognition of the role that CUNY
8 plays as a leading engine of inclusive economic
9 mobility in New York City.

10 New York's economic growth must be equitable. It
11 has to lift all New Yorkers, particularly communities
12 of color, and residents who are underrepresented in
13 critical careers long before the pandemic.

14 No other institution is better positioned to lift
15 up all New Yorkers than CUNY. And that's because
16 advancing economic mobility at scale is in our DNA,
17 It was instilled a 175 years ago with the founding of
18 CUNY's progenitor, a school called the Free Academy.
19 It was created to educate and provide access, equity,
20 and opportunity to people from families of modest
21 backgrounds and qualify them for, quote, "usefulness
22 hereafter".

23 Through decades and generations, CUNY has shaped
24 and transformed the city and state's professional and
25 middle class, it has gained national reputation for
propelling more graduates up the economic ladder than

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 20
3 all ivies Stanford, Carnegie Mellon, and MIT
4 combined.

5 Today, with 400,000 degree and non-degree seeking
6 students, served across 25 campuses, CUNY continues
7 to commit to transforming itself into the higher
8 education system our city and state needs both in
9 this moment and for decades to come.

10 Central to this transformation is an effort to
11 ensure that even more CUNY students have the exposure
12 preparation, experience, and connections needed to
13 fuel an inclusive and thriving workforce, including
14 in the public sector, which served as an essential
15 backbone of our city and state.

16 CUNY is an unparalleled talent pipeline for city,
17 state, and federal agencies. According to our Cap and
18 Gown Survey of CUNY graduates, over 100 city and
19 state entities have hired CUNY students during the
20 2023 - 2024 school year. Our top single employer of
21 graduates is NYC Public Schools, where nearly a third
22 of new teachers each year come from CUNY. And CUNY is
23 actively working to grow this pipeline through Three
24 key strategies:

25 The first is expanding paid internships and
fellowship collaborations with public agencies. In

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 21

FY24, 14 city agencies partnered with the CUNY Internship Program to introduce over 650 students into the public sector workforce while they are still in school. This effort expanded last year beyond the strictly city agencies with an additional internship partnership with the MTA (Metropolitan Transportation Authority). And students are hungry for the chance to work for the institutions that keep their city and state running.

In our first round of recruitment for the MTA positions, over 16,000 students applied for a 150 spots. We've continued to grow this essential partnership and have connected 500 students to MTA internships since the collaboration began last year. Moreover, managers of CUNY interns have realized what an essential pipeline our campuses can be. Many have sought to convert their interns into full time civil service positions once they graduate. However, they quickly learned how difficult that was in the past, even with a bachelor's degree, many interns did not meet the two-year experience requirement that was previously needed for to qualify for roles. So, in collaboration with our city partners, we've built that into programming.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 22

3 As you've heard previously, DCAS has restarted
4 the Civil Service Pathways Fellowship. This
5 fellowship built in the three-year pathway for
6 students to work and learn while working to qualify
7 for civil service titles. As a result of this
8 program, students can now more seamlessly transition
9 into civil service roles at agencies that are
10 delighted to have them.

11 The second strategy is integrating connections to
12 public sector career paths into the curriculum.
13 Beyond internship opportunities that exist outside of
14 a student's degree path, CUNY is also working to
15 integrate exposure to the public service as part of a
16 student's classroom experience. The Edward T.
17 Rogowsky, or ETR, Public Affairs Internship Program
18 integrates public service directly into the classroom
19 by coupling a credit-bearing course with the
20 opportunity to intern in the state legislature. And
21 many former city council members have hosted ETR
22 interns as well in the past few years. We're eager to
23 continue to expand the number of city council offices
24 that are participating in this program.

25 The third and final strategy is expanding access
to full time civil service hiring opportunities.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 23

2 In addition to efforts to build early pipelines
3 in the past year, CUNY has also worked to ensure that
4 full time opportunities are more accessible to
5 students. As you heard, this year CUNY campuses
6 hosted hiring fairs for city civil service roles in
7 partnership with the City University of New York,
8 making public sector positions and career paths more
9 visible to students and the community. We've also
10 launched the CUNY Industry Support Hub, a front door
11 for any organization, public or private, looking to
12 partner with CUNY.

13 In FY24, the Industry Support Hub and campus-
14 based industry specialist network worked with 76
15 public agencies to connect students to open roles.
16 This is the work CUNY has embarked on to expand
17 opportunities and partnerships that will enable
18 students to pursue rewarding careers in the civil
19 service. We are eager to do more to expand our
20 collaboration to other city and state agencies.

21 In the meantime, we also recognize CUNY's
22 invaluable role as a civil service employer
23 ourselves. And at this point, I'll turn things over
24 to my colleague, Lou, who can speak a little bit more
25 to this.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 24

3 (PAUSE)

4 DIRECTOR VOUITISIS: Thank you, Lauren.

5 Good morning, Honorable Chairs, De La Rosa and
6 Dinowitz, and members of the Committee on Civil
7 Service and Labor, and the Committee on Higher
8 Education. Thank you for the invitation to speak on
9 Civil Service at CUNY. My name is Ludwig Vouitsis,
10 please call me Lou, I serve as the University
11 Director of Civil Service Support for the City
12 University of New York, CUNY.

13 Attracting and retaining qualified individuals
14 for civil service positions poses ongoing challenges.
15 Competitive markets and evolving job preferences
16 require strategic measures to ensure a robust and
17 diverse talent pool. With that being said, CUNY has
18 reviewed our processes and taken several measures to
19 increase our recruitment and retention efforts,
20 including online exams for enhanced accessibility. To
21 ensure accessibility and flexibility for candidates,
22 all of our written exams are now online, and
23 candidates take the written exam using their personal
24 computers on the day and time of their choosing.

25 For promotional exams, CUNY has increased
communication with the HR teams at the 25 colleges to

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 25

3 advertise promotional examination opportunities for
4 staff to increase employee career development.

5 For public safety and security titles, in terms
6 of recruitment, in response to challenges posted by
7 recruiting for security titles, Campus Peace Officer
8 or CPO, and Campus Security Assistant or CSA, we have
9 taken several approaches to recruit for these
10 positions. Public safety recruitment staff attended
11 in-person job fairs providing candidates with
12 information about the positions as well as the use of
13 tablets so they can apply for the exams immediately.
14 We developed a new website dedicated to recruit CPOs
15 by making the information more attractive and
16 accessible for candidates to explore and apply for
17 the CPO exam.

18 Continuous Recruitment Exams: recognizing the
19 urgency in filling security positions, we instituted
20 continuous recruitment examinations for Campus Peace
21 Officer and Campus Security Assistant titles. This
22 allows candidates to apply for these examinations 24
23 hours a day seven days a week, 365 days a year, even
24 on holidays.

25 The New York State Helps Local Program: CUNY is
in the process of requesting approval from New York

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 26

3 State Civil Service Commission to have over 40 CUNY
4 titles in our blue and white collar unions be
5 approved for the New York State Help's Local Program.
6 This will allow CUNY to fill vacancies in the
7 approved titles faster while allowing the employee to
8 gain permanent civil service status.

9 Recruitment of CUNY students: CUNY is exploring
10 the creation of new trainee or intern titles in order
11 to create opportunities for students and recent
12 graduates to gain valuable experience, which will
13 allow them to transition into permanent civil service
14 titles and create a pipeline for CUNY students.

15 Additionally, we're exploring opportunities to
16 partner with the CUNY Internship Program and the
17 Civil Service Pathways Fellowship Program.

18 To conclude, we believe that by addressing these
19 aspects of recruitment, retention, and highlighting
20 the inherent benefits of civil service positions, we
21 can strengthen the foundation of our workforce at
22 CUNY. Your support and advocating for policies that
23 recognize and enhance the value of civil service
24 roles at CUNY, will undoubtedly contribute to the
25 continued success and growth of our institution.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 27

3 We appreciate your time and consideration of
4 these matters and look forward to the opportunity to
5 discuss them further. Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you so much for
7 your testimony. I will start with a few questions to
8 DCAS.

9 So, in 2023, the Council passed Local Law 4,
10 which requires DCAS to submit an annual report on
11 August 30th, starting in 2024, regarding the
12 description of the steps taken to administer the
13 Public Service Corp Program.

14 In late September, the Council's Compliance
15 Division received a notice from DCAS stating that
16 the inaugural report was taking longer than
17 anticipated to complete, but that the report was
18 forthcoming.

19 Can you please share the expected timeline for
20 the submission of this report?

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PORTER: Thank you for that
22 question, Chair.

23 So, I am happy to announce that we are near
24 completion with compiling the data for the report,
25 and we expect to have it to the City Council by the
end of this month.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 28

3 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: By the end of November?

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PORTER: Yes, end of November.

5 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Great, thank you.

6 How many PSC interns were recruited in 2024? And
7 could you provide the breakdown of agencies where the
8 interns were placed?

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PORTER: Absolutely, I'll turn
10 this question over to Kadian for a response.

11 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you.

12 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: Thank you so much
13 for that question, and thank you, Katrina.

14 For just a bit of a background, the Public
15 Service Corp Program, it is a program that allows
16 individuals that are currently undergraduate or
17 graduate in schools to participate in an internship
18 at any of our city locations, city agencies. It
19 requires that they are... received financial aid, so
20 federal work study, in order to participate and
21 allow... the school has to allow them to serve off-
22 site. So, so far we've had a 116 interns that
23 participated in Fiscal Year 2024, which represents a
24 50 percent... almost 50 percent increase over the
25 previous years.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 29

3 Right now, they're serving at about 11 agencies,
4 including DCAS. We are proud to say that Department
5 Of Homeless Services, Department of Records and
6 Information Services, Department of Youth And
7 Community Development, The District Attorney's Office
8 -Kings County, the Health + Hospitals, Housing
9 Preservation and Development, Human Resources
10 Administration, the Law Department, the Office Of
11 Technology and Innovation, and also the Public
12 Administrator for New York.

13 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Great, thank you so much.

14 What outreach efforts did DCAS engage in to
15 recruit PSC candidates, and how many outreach efforts
16 did DCAS conduct in 2024?

17 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: Thank you.

18 So, a bit of a background in terms of the process
19 for engaging students - the program is threefold in
20 terms of one building collaboration in partnerships
21 with different entities. So, the first part of the
22 program requires us to engage with the schools to
23 ensure that they are, you know, participating in the
24 program, and they do allow for their students to work
25 off-site.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 30

3 The second part of it is engaging in the city
4 agencies to make sure that they have positions and
5 they're interested in participating in the program.

6 And, then, the next part of it is engaging in the
7 students to make sure, you know, there's
8 opportunities available. They are, you know,
9 receiving federal work studies, so they can work at
10 our city agencies.

11 So we do a bit of engagements in the different
12 areas focusing on the students. We participate in
13 various career fairs and information sessions, we do
14 targeted internship specific events with some of our
15 schools. We also work with private institutions,
16 because sometimes, you know, the information is there
17 - we're getting people that are attending different
18 events, so you want to make sure that we're spreading
19 that information as widely as possible.

20 We also leverage the job boards. For example, we
21 use Simplicity and Handshake, because that's really
22 where students go when they're looking to apply for
23 internships and fulltime positions. And we
24 participate in different workshops and webinars that
25 are geared towards students. So, we try to do
targeted events where we are working with the

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 31

Financial Aid Office at the schools, or the career counselors, to make sure that folks that are engaged are able to complete an application on the spot. So, we do... of that, we did about 23 events that were targeted towards that population. But, in addition to the PSC specific events that we've done, we work with the Office of Citywide Recruitment, which includes information on all of our programs, including the Public Service Corp program at all of the events that we attend.

CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Great, and, so, the most direct vehicle for students is through the Financial Aid... Have you found that it's through the Financial Aid Offices?

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: I'm sorry, can you repeat that question?

CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: The most direct vehicle to students, have you found that's through... Inside of the institutions, is through the Financial Aid Office?

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: Yes, we have to work with them, because they have to confirm that the person is receiving federal work study.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 32

2 And, I don't know how I forgot it, but I also
3 want to mention the PSC Expo that we held in June.
4 This was an opportunity, it was a hiring event that
5 we held, partnered with the schools and our city
6 agencies, to have the opportunities for students to
7 interview and get offers on the spot for PSC
8 internships that we had. So, we were able to fill
9 about 28 positions from that event.

10 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: So, one of the things
11 that is very near and dear to my heart from my
12 previous service for the State, is the Dream Act and
13 making sure that undocumented students are also
14 having access. So, have you found that ,you know,
15 documented, mixed status students, all types of
16 students, are being able to take advantage of the
17 program?

18 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: So, I know one of
19 the requirements within the program is that folks are
20 able to work within the US, so that's the requirement
21 on it. We don't really have a breakdown of whether or
22 not they're documented or undocumented. That's
23 something that we can definitely look into.

24 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you.
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 33

3 What additional findings or information regarding
4 the administration of your Public Service Corp
5 program over the past year, that we can expect to see
6 in the report when it's completed... what other
7 details are in that report?

8 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: One of the things
9 that you will see in the upcoming report is just a
10 demographic breakdown of the individuals that are
11 serving in the program. And you will see that the
12 majority of them are female and are from diverse
13 backgrounds. About 75 percent of folks are either
14 Black, Hispanic, or Asian. So, we're really excited
15 to show that there is diversity in the program, which
16 is a result of the outreach that we're doing.

17 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Great. I am going to ask
18 one more question, and then I will turn it over to
19 Chair Dinowitz.

20 This is a multipronged question, but it's about
21 Local Law 2. In Fiscal Year 2023, DCAS hosted 86
22 outreach events in compliance with Local Law 2 as
23 part of the Civil Service Ambassador Program. These
24 events were held across various venues, including
25 drop-in centers, youth workforce career training
programs, adult reentry programs, and others.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 34

3 How do you prioritize outreach to different civil
4 service pathways? And is there a focus on a certain
5 demographic or area that is underserved?

6 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: Thank you.

7 That is a really good question, because there is
8 this need to focus on Local Law specific events, but
9 also the natural nature of the work that we do,
10 making sure that everyone is getting... has access to
11 the information that we share.

12 So, each quarter, we look at the different
13 populations that we need to reach. We look at the...
14 we're also guided by the exam schedule as well as the
15 needs of the city. So, we take into consideration how
16 we can combine events. For example, if we need to
17 engage folks that are justice impacted, are there
18 particular opportunities that we can promote, or are
19 there agencies that have a particular need within
20 these programs? So, we try to do that by making sure
21 that we are at least meeting the minimum, though we
22 don't just work on the minimum, but at least we are
23 engaged in the different communities as outlined in
24 the Local Law, but also based on the needs of the
25 city.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 35

3 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: In your experience, which
4 one of these venues proved to be the most successful
5 in engaging civil service candidates?

6 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: Oh, thank you.

7 I think it's... thank you for recognizing that
8 there's maybe some that are more engaging than
9 others, but I think each of the venues provide... are
10 proved successful in its own way. For example, when
11 we engage with the educational institutions or the
12 community based organizations, the broader ones, we
13 see more engagement. We see more engagement in terms
14 of participants if we do virtual versus in person,
15 this is because those programs usually have some kind
16 of career development component to it. So, CUNY
17 schools, the goal is to get a job afterwards, the
18 community based programs, they have some kind of
19 workforce element to it. We do find that it's a bit
20 challenging for when we're engaging in other programs
21 such as the drop-in centers or foster care, or the
22 mental health. This is because not all the time that
23 they do have a workforce program, but we do try to
24 work around that challenge, because we understand
25 that there is a need to expose this information to
folks who may be in those situations, but also may

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 36

3 not know that there are opportunities available
4 within city government and how they can go about
5 applying for those jobs.

6 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: According to OCR's 2023
7 report on Civil Service Ambassador Program, 70 of the
8 86 events were held virtually. Did you notice a
9 difference in participation, such as the overall
10 amount or the demographic composition and engagement
11 between in person events and virtual events?

12 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: So, in terms of the
13 engagement between the in person and virtual events,
14 we see that as both ways. We see more people who will
15 register and attend the virtual events. For example,
16 we would put, uh, we do these general sessions, and
17 we post them on our website, and we'll get about a
18 thousand people that are registering for them -
19 versus when we're partnering with the schools or
20 particular organizations, it's limited to only those
21 folks that are engaging in those services, so we may
22 get a lower turnout.

23 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Mm-hmm.

24 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: But in terms of the
25 engagement with the information that is being shared,
I think it's the same, because regardless of where

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 37

we're going, I have a team of folks that are really engaged with the information and wanna make sure that even though civil service, you know, isn't very exciting, we want to make sure that folks leave understanding the information, understanding where they can go to apply for jobs, what it means to apply for these jobs, what it means to apply for exams. So, we include different interactive activities during the sessions, both virtually and in person.

CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you.

Local law 2 was passed part way through FY23, which we understand meant that you weren't able to visit all boroughs as per your report, but specifically Staten Island. And, you know, our colleagues here in the Council have much reason to complain about Staten Island being the forgotten borough, but we're committed to changing that. Okay? We're committed to making sure that they're not forgotten.

So, have you held any events on Staten Island since the report? And if not, then do you plan to?

ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: Yes. And I do want to clarify that although we didn't report any events under Local Law 2...

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 38

3 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Mm-hmm?

4 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: because of the
5 definition of what's considered a civil service
6 pathway, there are certain criteria that had to be
7 met, we did have events in Staten Island...

8 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Great...

9 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: So we may have
10 participated at a job fair, or we may have held a
11 career or an information session with a private
12 institution.

13 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Mm-hmm.

14 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: So we did events in
15 Staten Island. We actually did four events in Staten
16 Island in Fiscal Year 2023. And in 2024, we're
17 doubling that to about, I believe, eight. So, we are
18 focused on making sure that we are going to Staten
19 Island and partner with the different organizations
20 there.

21 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Great. And I encourage
22 you to also reach out to some of our Staten Island
23 council members. I'm sure they're happy to host you
24 and have you there.

25 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: Oh, we are happy to
work with them.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 39

2 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Great.

3 For FY24, how many events have you held the met
4 the requirements specified under Local Law 2 for the
5 Civil Service Ambassador Program?

6 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: Thank you. We're
7 still compiling the data for that. The report is due
8 on the 20... in December, but I can say that, so far,
9 we've seen upwards of 90 events that are targeting
10 Local Law 2 criteria.

11 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Great. Thank you so much
12 for answering my questions. I'm gonna pass this to
13 Chair Dinowitz, and then I'll come back for more,
14 thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you, Chair De La
16 Rosa.

17 I don't know what it is, but when you mentioned
18 Staten Island, I looked around the room and a number
19 of people seem to be chuckling. It's a real borough,
20 everyone.

21 ALL: (LAUGHTER)

22 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: It matters.

23 Just going off that, you held four events in
24 Staten Island, and in the other boroughs, you held
25 how many?

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 40

3 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: So, in... For
4 Fiscal Year 2023, we have had 10 events in the Bronx,
5 20 in Brooklyn, 33 in Manhattan, uhm, 17 in Queens,
6 and then 132 of those were online. (INAUDIBLE)...
7 (CROSS-TALK)

8 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: I'm sorry, how many in
9 Queens?

10 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: I'm sorry?

11 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: How many in Queens?

12 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: Uh, Queens was 17.

13 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay, that's a lot in
14 Manhattan.

15 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: And that is...
16 (CROSS-TALK)

17 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Do you find that Manhattan
18 residents are more interested in civil service, and;
19 therefore, you have most of the events there?

20 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: I think it is
21 really about the engagement of the different groups
22 that we reach out to. So, one of the things that we
23 do when we are doing outreach is to make sure that we
24 are reaching out to organizations that are across the
25 five boroughs. So, we have individual staff members
that are working on outreach for those particular

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 41

3 areas. So, within Manhattan, you may have a lot more
4 entities that are responsive to our outreach. But,
5 that was Fiscal Year 2023; in Fiscal Year 2024, we
6 have increased those numbers to 16 in Manhattan, uh,
7 32 on Brooklyn... I'm sorry, 16 in the Bronx, 32 in
8 Brooklyn, 31 in Manhattan, 22 in Queens, and eight in
9 Staten Island. So, we are making sure that we are
10 reaching out to the outer boroughs.

11 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Yeah. It just...just going
12 off that, it just sounds like there's a... you know,
13 sometimes we don't have the same number of entities
14 or engaged organizations in the Bronx to do that
15 work. Manhattan is very rich in those. So, it just
16 sounds like a little more outreach needs to be done
17 in the Bronx for that.

18 For CUNY, you spoke a little bit about
19 curriculum, and in your testimony you said, the
20 integration curriculum consists of internships in the
21 state legislature and that in the past there have
22 been internships. But, are there any... what do you
23 do, or what investments are you making in new
24 curricular or updating your curricular to ensure that
25 Civil Service Pathways Fellows are equipped for their
respective career tracks?

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 42

3 PROVOST ANDERSON: Sure, thank you for the
4 question.

5 Part of our strategy around ensuring that
6 students are prepared to be able to enter the
7 workforce, whether they are interest in going into
8 the public sector or the private sector, is making
9 sure that from day one the curriculum is connected to
10 careers. So, one of the things that we've done is we
11 have now about a 100 faculty across CUNY who have
12 been designated as Career Success Fellows. And what
13 they have committed to doing is to integrating into
14 their classes, key connections, both to specific
15 careers and specific jobs, in the public sector and
16 private sector, but also some of the foundational
17 skills that those students are going to need when
18 they move into the private sector, like
19 communication, stakeholder engagement, etcetera.

20 For public sector pathways in particular, we have
21 several schools notably the CCNY Colin Powell School,
22 the Mark's School at Baruch, who have taken on
23 additional efforts to be able to integrate
24 partnerships with the public sector into their
25 classes in the form of real world projects, in the
form of consulting projects with public agencies,

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 43
3 etcetera. So, there are a couple different ways that
4 we do that at CUNY.

5 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Can you talk more about
6 that? Because, it sounds... you said a 100 faculty
7 Career Fellows over 25 campuses. What efforts are
8 being made to increase the number? Because, again,
9 preparing our students for the workforce, I think, is
10 critical. So what efforts are being made to increase
11 that number and do more of that investment in, you
12 know, sort of the work you were just speaking about?

13 PROVOST ANDERSON: Sure, in addition to committing
14 to updating their own classroom curricula, the other
15 things that these fellows commit to doing are to...
16 hosting training and events on their campuses for
17 other faculty. We found that it works best for really
18 mobilizing faculty to make changes around their
19 curriculum when their peers are encouraging them to
20 do so. That's one of the requirements of The Career
21 Success Fellows Program is that they host local
22 events to be able to get more faculty engaged and
23 deploying these strategies.

24 In terms of efforts to invest in scale, we are
25 very excited that over the past couple of years,
26 we've been able to prioritize this project in terms

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 44

of the transformational funds that are coming from
the state, but we're very eager to expand that work.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: What is attendance like at
those workshops? Would you consider them... you said
workshops, that the career fellows are hosting for
the colleagues, what are... what is the attendance
there, and what is the impact? Do you do you find
that other faculty members are indeed updating their
curricula in response to those workshops?

PROVOST ANDERSON: So, as you can imagine, with 25
campuses, it's variable from campus to campus. But,
one of the things we've been doing is, as a result of
those workshops and the Career Success Fellows work,
we're actually tagging the courses in our system that
have been updated based on the work of these fellows.
So we are able to track that. I don't have those
numbers with me, but I'm happy to get them to you.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Oh, it sounds very easy if
you're tagging them, the data... I love the data you
are collecting.

I'd certainly be interested to know how many of
the courses have been updated and what those updates
what those updates look like.

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 45

Then in addition to the career fellows, does CUNY have current degree majors available that could support even more additional career tracks for the Civil Service Pathway Fellowship, for example, Human Resources Management?

PROVOST ANDERSON: We can get you a list of degree programs that mapped the civil service pathways. Again, I don't have them with us here, but we have over 1,700 degree programs, and, yes, there is a lot of overlap.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: There's a lot? Maybe some of those are tagged, too.

PROVOST ANDERSON: One would hope.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: What's that?

PROVOST ANDERSON: One would hope.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: You're a big system, you gotta keep track of this data.

What... Can you talk about some of the limitations, in other words, could CUNY provide more qualified graduates for the Civil Service Pathways Fellowship if slots were available? And who places the limits on the number of graduates in the program. Is it DCAS or is CUNY?

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 46

3 PROVOST ANDERSON: I can take the recruitment
4 piece, and then I will leave the second part to you.

5 So, through the CUNY Internship Program that we
6 run, that I alluded to before, we have had over
7 68,000 applications for the public sector roles that
8 we have available to students in terms of internships
9 - 60,000 to 655 is a ratio where, yes, there are many
10 more students who would take advantage of the roles
11 should they be open. So, we are excited to exploring
12 how we get more and more city agencies involved in
13 that effort.

14 Do you want to talk Pathways in particular?

15 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: Yes. To clarify, we
16 have the Civil Service Pathways Fellowships, which is
17 at partnerships with CUNY and DCAS, this particular
18 program allows for, and we're... thankfully, we just
19 got an increase for us to place 200 individuals in
20 those programs. So this is a limit that is set by the
21 state, so we have those programs Cover Policy and
22 Program Analysis, Procurement and Finance,
23 Information Technology and Data Analysis, Creative
24 Services and Digital Media, Project Management, and
25 then Architecture and Engineering.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 47

3 So, a part of how we recruit for this is to make
4 sure that we're engaging with CUNY schools and making
5 sure that we open the application, we provide
6 announcements on the application, and so far, we've
7 seen an increase year over year in how many people
8 are applying for this particular program. For the
9 cohort that is starting on Monday, with 68
10 individuals, we had over a thousand folks, uh, CUNY
11 students that applied for the program.

12 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: I would like to acknowledge
13 that we have been joined by Council Member Cabán.

14 I just wanna go back to what you said, you said
15 the limit is placed by the state. The state limits
16 the number of students that you're able to recruit
17 for the Civil Service Pathways Fellowship?

18 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: The Civil Service
19 Pathways Scholarship is a specific title, uh, a civil
20 service title that we use, so in order to allow... to
21 hire folks utilizing that title, we have to get
22 approval from the state. And, of course, Katrina can
23 add to that if needed.

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PORTER: Thank you, Kadian.

25 Yes, because the title that's being used is what
we call a noncompetitive title, we have to request

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 48

3 authorization from the state Civil Service Commission
4 to utilize the title. So, when the Civil Service
5 Pathway Fellowship was first launched in 2019, we
6 received approval from the state Civil Service
7 Commission to fill 100 positions, and there were
8 three specific tracks that we were focused on.

9 And so over the last year, we submitted a
10 proposal to the state Civil Service Commission to
11 increase that number, just due to the success of the
12 program and the importance of having more
13 flexibility. So, we received approval most recently
14 to increase the number of allocated positions from
15 100 to 200.

16 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: And what do you think is...
17 why do you think there are so few positions given the
18 number of applicants? Why do you think they're
19 setting the limits so low?

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PORTER: So it's really driven
21 by the request from the Administration, from the
22 City. And, so we will continue to monitor the success
23 of the program and, you know, request increases
24 periodically. This is a 100... a 50 percent increase,
25 so the last cohort might have had about 30-something

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 49
3 folks in it. This one we were able to double the
4 number to 60.

5 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you. I just want to
6 bring up the 311 Internship Program. Can you...
7 that's been canceled. Can you talk a little bit about
8 that?

9 PROVOST ANDERSON: Yes, I certainly can.

10 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you.

11 PROVOST ANDERSON: So, right now, it's slated to
12 end in March. And essentially, CUNY has put at the
13 core of its strategic plan a desire to increase paid
14 internships for students. We've set out a bold goal
15 around that, growing from 10 percent to 30 percent of
16 all students participating in these paid internships.

17 What that means in terms of absolute numbers,
18 because of the size of our organization, is that we
19 need to find an additional 32,000 paid internships
20 every year in a city that only supports 11,000 of
21 them posted online.

22 So, we know that a lot of what we have to do is
23 not just accept what's in the market, but also create
24 these opportunities for students through programs
25 that we run across CUNY.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 50

3 Today, those programs serve about 4,500 students.
4 We're really interested in doubling that number over
5 the next... until 2030. In order to do that with
6 limited resources, we have to make some tough
7 decisions about maximizing the amount of that money
8 that goes to student wages and making sure that those
9 internships are actually launchpads to jobs. And what
10 we found is that in some of our internships, students
11 who had bachelor's degrees were being aligned with
12 jobs that don't require any degree to achieve them.
13 So, 311, that collaboration, is part of a much
14 broader program called CUNY Internship Program that
15 serves 655 students each year. We are so excited to
16 grow that and continue to work towards it. But, when
17 we looked at the actual jobs that students were in,
18 the 311 jobs were not well aligned with the
19 priorities that we have.

20 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: So they were replaced. So,
21 the... I guess, the positions for the 311 Internship
22 were replaced with other internships that do require
23 degrees? Is that how the math works out?

24 PROVOST ANDERSON: Our intention is to, yes, grow
25 other internship opportunities that are more aligned

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 51
3 with student career aspirations and the degrees that
4 they have.

5 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: So, just to be clear, it's
6 not a cut in the number of internships, it's not a
7 cut in the program, you're just shifting resources to
8 internships that do require those bachelor's degrees
9 that you're providing at CUNY?

10 PROVOST ANDERSON: We are ending the internships
11 in the 311 Call Center as part of this program. So,
12 those numbers at 311 are no longer gonna continue
13 after March.

14 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: No, I understand. What I'm
15 saying is however many students, however many
16 positions there are at 311, the number of students
17 receiving internships aren't decreasing, those 311
18 positions are gonna be shifted to another agency or
19 service that does require the degrees that you
20 provide at CUNY?

21 PROVOST ANDERSON: So we are actively building
22 other partnerships with agencies to grow that. The
23 way that the funding works is it's tied to each
24 agency. Each agency contributes the funds for their
25 own interns. So we can't move 311's funding to a
different agency, but, yes, we are growing our

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 52
3 partnerships with agencies overall so that the number
4 of opportunities for community students does not go
5 down.

6 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay. So I just wanna be
7 clear, even with the ending of this program, the
8 number of CUNY students, there won't be fewer CUNY
9 students for with opportunities for internships?

10 PROVOST ANDERSON: Right, that's our intent.

11 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay. And, I think that's
12 an important point is that you wanna align their
13 internships with the degree attainment, with what
14 they're getting. And are there other areas, other
15 internships where you're finding like 311, the
16 internship they're being placed in isn't really a
17 launch pad into a career, or doesn't align... a
18 different career rather, or doesn't align with their
19 degrees?

20 PROVOST ANDERSON: Generally, no. Generally, we've
21 done a lot of work with agencies to make sure that
22 they are identifying internships and role titles that
23 have a clear progression into roles that are aligned
24 with degrees. This is not the norm.

25 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Yeah. I mean, working in a
311 call center, I think is a is a great career, I

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 53

3 think, you know, the pay is great, it's really an
4 important service, but I think I do agree that it's
5 important that if you're going to college for a
6 specific purpose, that it... that your internship is
7 aligned with that purpose.

8 I want to pause it here... and we've also been
9 joined by Council Member Erik Bottcher.

10 I want to pause here and turn it back to Chair De
11 La Rosa for council member questions.

12 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Yes, Thank you so much,
13 Chair Dinowitz, Good questions on 311 and all of
14 that.

15 We were joined momentarily by council Member
16 Restler and Council Member Marte, so I want to
17 recognize them. And then Council Member Brewer has a
18 question.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I'm concerned about this
20 311 because, I mean, I was there when it was started.
21 It's got the king, Texas contract, city workers, and
22 CUNY students. They learn something that's lifelong
23 though. If you can handle those crazy people on the
24 phone, you can handle anything.

25 ALL: (LAUGHTER)

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 54

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I'm serious, having been
4 in that world for quite some time. So, I'm just
5 wondering, did you kind of survey them to see what
6 they think of that job? Do they... the ones...
7 because you've been there for what, 15 years now, 20
8 years almost. I think it's a real launching pad for
9 future survival in New York City, literally.

10 PROVOST ANDERSON: So, we have several alumni of
11 the program who work in our office, and it's true,
12 some of the skills that they learned there were at
13 absolutely essential and very valuable skills.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Yeah.

15 PROVOST ANDERSON: The work...

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Dealing with the public is
17 no joke.

18 PROVOST ANDERSON: Nope. Yes, indeed.

19 The work that they... that a lot of our students
20 aspire to though, those particular roles were not
21 particularly aligned with how they advance in their
22 career path overall. So, we definitely hear you. I'm
23 happy to reconsider and to have some additional
24 conversations, but we really need to make sure that
25 those roles in the call center have clear link...

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 55

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: No, I agree. I mean, it was all switched... I mean, I think... I don't need to get into past history, but there was a lot of work that went into having that kind of threesome for a whole series of reasons. I mean, I think you should... I think you should look at it, because when somebody says they were in that role for another job, I would hire them because that is a tough job. And the fact that you've been able to be successful at it, I would think would give you a leg up for different reasons.

But my other question is, will the report list... because I teach at Hunter, I teach in the Public Service Program, which is another entry into the workforce. There's no question. It's at Roosevelt House. There's no question that when our students leave, they're in internships for that year, they get a job. This nobody has ever not gotten a job - in city government, state government, nonprofit, obviously, they're selected, so it's a creaming of the crop to start with. But those relationships are what gets you the job. Obviously, if you take a test, it's a different path, but there's no question that the relationships work.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 56

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: So, my question is, will
4 the report that you are going to get to us list
5 ... It is a little confusing to hear all of these
6 different programs, it's great, but it's not clear.
7 So, is that something that will be in the report
8 between what DCAS is doing and what you're doing, and
9 so on? How does that work?

10 PROVOST ANDERSON: So, the information that I
11 referred to earlier, one, getting you all a list of
12 the courses that have been updated the Career Success
13 Fellows...

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Right, that's one portion.

15 PROVOST ANDERSON: May or may not include that,
16 because it depends on if those faculty members are
17 part of this group.

18 The second thing is the alignment of our degree
19 programs against civil service paths that we have
20 that, I believe, will reflect that too. But I don't
21 know if you wanna say something...

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I mean, all the... you are
23 both listing excellent opportunities, but if you're
24 from the public, it's confusing. And I just didn't
25 know, is there any central place for people to go, or
you have to be at this hearing today to know what's

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 57

3 going on? Does DCAS have a... I don't know, how does
4 this all work for the public? I'm always trying to
5 think, you should know that city government sucks at
6 communication, we're is terrible at it. And, so DCAS
7 is no different.

8 So my question is, where is all this listed for
9 both the public to know that you're doing all these
10 great things and also for students?

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PORTER: Thank you for that,
12 Council Member.

13 So, there are many different ways where the
14 public can find out about the services and programs
15 that the City offers. I will mention at a high level,
16 and then, Kadian, I'll turn it over to you for you to
17 drill down.

18 So, you know, we have a website where, you know,
19 there's general information about workforce programs
20 that are available through the city.

21 We recently updated our NYC Jobs website, which
22 very clearly outlines any internship opportunities,
23 or events like Civil Service 101, which provides the
24 general public with information about how to enter
25 the civil service system. And the Office of Citywide
Recruitment, they also have a newsletter that goes

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 58
3 out to over 200,000 New Yorkers monthly with general
4 information about the civil service system.

5 Kadian, please fill anything and that I may have
6 missed.

7 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: I think you covered
8 it, you covered it. One of the things that we do
9 recognize is that we have to figure out different
10 ways to engage different communities. Some folks are
11 going on our job board and usually will have our
12 events listed on a separate (TIMER CHIMES) site. So
13 we found that it was really impactful to have the
14 events in our upcoming and listed on that website.

15 And then from the job board, there is a DCAS
16 specific page that speaks about the internships that
17 provide additional FAQs, application periods,
18 deadlines about the different programs that we have,
19 and then our engagement with the public.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, okay. The reason I
21 ask is, as we sit here today, there are many
22 shortages in city government. Like, that's a
23 different hearing. But, then you have all this CUNY,
24 these wonderful CUNY students, so many of which I
25 know, should be getting many of these city jobs. So
there's a disconnect, if you understand what I'm

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 59

3 saying. In other words, every here and I go to, we
4 can't do housing, and we can't do this, we can't do
5 that, we don't have inspectors, we don't have this,
6 we don't have people to do the jobs. Right? That's a
7 big talk. And, yet, here are all these great CUNY
8 students who could fill those jobs.

9 So as you're talking, it's a little bit nebulous
10 to understand how the two go together. So I guess I'm
11 trying to say between CUNY and DCAS, it's not just a
12 DCAS has the list, CUNY... there should be more
13 understanding of how... because if I were, you know,
14 in charge... and we all hope that more CUNY students
15 could get these jobs. Because they are diverse and
16 it's the greatest institution.

17 So, it's just not clear that, you know, because
18 when you're talking, there are just so many
19 opportunities, but it is hard to understand the...
20 and, obviously, funding.

21 Now, the ones at CUNY that you're mentioning, we
22 could always use more funding, but is there adequate
23 funding to be able to meet the needs? You listed some
24 programs that have x slots and just hundreds of more
25 people applying.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 60

3 So my question is, do you have some sense of
4 what... which programs would need funding in order to
5 meet some of that need at CUNY? Because, you're
6 talking about the kinds of jobs that are desperately
7 needed for city government.

8 PROVOST ANDERSON: Yeah. So, in the instances
9 where the funding is not the only barrier, barriers
10 also being the number of civil service titles,
11 obviously, there's something in addition to funding
12 that provides the bottleneck. But, for our programs
13 that do not require civil service titles in order to
14 start students along the path of interning, we do
15 have a number of programs that absolutely could scale
16 with more funding. Part of the issue, too, is that
17 our partnerships are with agencies directly. There's
18 an expectation that agencies or city council member
19 offices do pay students. And, so some of it, too, is
20 challenging because the individual agencies who also
21 need more funding in in order to be able to expand
22 the programs... (CROSS-TALK)

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay. I guess what I would
24 say, because I believe that information should be
25 shared is, the two of you should get together, DCAS
and CUNY. And you should make it clear, this

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 61

3 agency... you know, you have to be a little, you
4 know, challenged to OMB. But, you should say, we
5 are... I want to be clear, we are so desperate for
6 city employees. Let's be clear. And, yet, what you're
7 saying is, here are the potential students who could
8 be city employees, but there are so many barriers
9 that we can't fulfill even the students that want to
10 be city employees. That's a problem. So, I'm
11 suggesting that there be more understanding and you'd
12 be a little bit bold in saying, this agency has not
13 giving enough money to fill their amazing
14 applications for students, etcetera.

15 I mean, I can't tell how many times we can't do
16 things because there's nobody in the agency to do it.
17 So, I would make that suggestion. I know that's
18 challenging, because nobody wants to upset OMB. Well,
19 get with the program. That would be my suggestion,
20 thank you.

21 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: And, I just wanted
22 to add in terms of the partnerships that we have with
23 CUNY.

24 One of the main parts is the engagement and
25 making students aware of the opportunities available
26 So for example, tomorrow we have two events with

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 62
3 CUNY. We're at City Tech in the CUNY Graduate Center.

4 Uh, for the rest of the month, we have about seven
5 events scheduled with CUNY schools. And we engage
6 agencies to come out with us.

7 For the folks that apply for our internships,
8 like the Civil Service Pathways Fellowship, we know
9 that even though they may not be able to get into the
10 program this time around, we do communicate with them
11 and engage and say, hey, maybe the next time they can
12 do the application process... (CROSS-TALK)

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Now, why can't they get in
14 this time around?

15 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: I'm sorry?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Why can't they get in this
17 time around?

18 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: Because of the
19 amount of positions that we have available...

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Because of funding?

21 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: That could be a
22 part of the process. But, we have approval for only
23 200 positions, so that, again, is the mechanism for
24 being able to use the civil service title. So,
25 agencies are very much interested in partnering with
us, and we do get a lot of applications from our

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 63

3 agency partners who are looking to participate in the
4 program. So, there is definitely interest on both
5 sides, but because of the nature of the civil service
6 process, and that it is a noncompetitive title, we
7 are limited in how many folks we can hire this time
8 around.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I mean, I don't.. Go
10 ahead, did you want to add to that...

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PORTER: I was just going
12 mention that it is a competitive process. You know?
13 It's a, you know, group interviews, individual
14 interviews, and so everyone, you know, cannot be
15 selected in the program.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Right...

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PORTER: However, we do
18 understand how important this program is, and we will
19 continue to evaluate the scope and, you know, the
20 amount of available positions that we can offer.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I mean, if you want more
22 than 200 slots, you should say to us ,you know, lobby
23 the governor, lobby whatever, to get more slots if
24 it's appropriate. I mean, I don't know, I assume the
25 unions are happy with having more in that criteria. I
want to make sure that... I mean, I happen to be very

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 64

3 supportive of the unions. I want to be sure the...

4 I'm just saying, I don't know how else to say it.

5 Take a look! We don't have enough city employees! So,

6 these are wonderful students, there's enough backup,

7 et cetera, and I think we are limiting ourselves when

8 we are desperate, and hopefully they will have a

9 career in city government, which is what we are

10 looking for. You talk to anybody... I have been doing

11 this a long time, I have so many friend in city

12 government, they are really worried, really worried

13 about the lack of a long term city workforce. There

14 you have it.

15 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you, Council Member
16 Brewer.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: We are also going to
19 have that hearing on November 19th. So, DCAS will be
20 back to talk about our agencies and where we are on
21 vacancies. So, as you could already see the preview,
22 this is the concern that all of us on the Council
23 have right now with what is happening on city
24 agencies. But, November 19th, Gale, I know you will
25 be here, that is going to be our opportunity to
really hone in on those questions on the vacancies

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 65

3 and where we are in agencies. I think that Council
4 Member Brewer made some really, really good points,
5 things to consider. That's why we wanted to have all
6 of you here at the table, to ask these questions.

7 I'm going to ask about what supports are
8 available to students? So, if a student goes through
9 the Civil Service Ambassador Program, or goes through
10 any of the programs that are specialized to kind of
11 enhance our civil service experience, what supports
12 are available to them to prepare for the civil
13 service exam and to support them in that journey?

14 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: Thank you.

15 In terms of the support that's available, we know
16 that it's more than just getting the folks into the
17 program. We know that they have to have more exposure
18 other than the work that they're doing within their
19 respective agencies. So, for example, with the Civil
20 Service Pathway Fellows, the cohort that started on
21 Monday, they're getting, at the very first part of
22 it, they're getting information on the civil service
23 process and what that means. They're getting
24 different training opportunities that are available
25 to them, uh, as folks go throughout the different
programs, we do provide professional development

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 66

opportunities, specifically with the Civil Service Pathways Fellows. By the time they get to a year, they're able to take a particular civil service exam that would allow them to, after they complete the fellowship, they can be hired into a full time position.

But we do make a concerted effort to make sure that the different programs that we have, they have exposure to different information. We... for the Urban Fellows Program, we identify, uh, we have different seminars where we bring back folks that participated in the program, the alumnus, so they can speak about their journey and what worked and what didn't work for them.

So, we are consistently and continuously building on the support that we provide. But at the baseline, we make sure that folks are engaged and aware of the different opportunities and processes that are available to them.

CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: The Civil Services Pathways Fellows are placed in one of six career tracks, Policy and Program Analysis, Procurement and Finance, Information Technology and Data Analysis, Creative Services and Digital Media, Project

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 67
3 Management, and Architecture and Engineering - what
4 criteria does the agency use to define and select
5 these specific tracks?

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PORTER: So, the way the
7 program works, Council Member, is that we advertise
8 the program...

9 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Mm-hmm.

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PORTER: The students, they
11 submit their applications. We do a thorough review of
12 the application to determine which track they would
13 be most qualified for. And then it's a matching
14 process that happens. There's a group interview at
15 the first level. The second level is an individual
16 interview, and then the agencies and the
17 participants, they have an opportunity to pick, you
18 know, which jobs they are most interested in.

19 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Mm-hmm.

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PORTER: And then, you know,
21 that matching process happens, and then, you know,
22 the candidate goes through, you know, onboarding, and
23 they actually start at the agency.

24 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Great, thank you for
25 walking us through that. My question was more aligned

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 68
3 towards the agency and the decisions that are made
4 regarding which career tracks.

5 So, are there any plans to increase the number of
6 participating agencies or introduce new career
7 tracks? Like, how is the agency deciding that these
8 sort of buckets of careers are the ones that are
9 necessary or most popular? Like, what is the
10 criteria?

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PORTER: Thank you for that.

12 So, we determine what tracks to include in this
13 program based on data and feedback from agencies.

14 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Mm-hmm?

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PORTER: As to skill sets that
16 may be, you know, limited at their agency or where
17 they may have found it to be hard to recruit top
18 talent, we then have to put together a proposal for
19 the State Civil Service Commission, and then they
20 provided us with authorization to include at least
21 the three new additional tracks that we that we added
22 - which is Architecture, Engineering, Project
23 Management, and then expanding the Information
24 Technology track.

25 And, it's really just based on feedback from
agencies and data that we have access to.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 69

2 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: And how long does that
3 approval from the state take?

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PORTER: It's... Oh, how long
5 does it take?

6 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Yeah, so...

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PORTER: It takes a while. It
8 does take a while. Uhm... (CROSS-TALK)

9 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Like in months, like
10 years...

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PORTER: Nine months to a year
12 sometimes.

13 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay, so that's another
14 area where we can... we know a few people in Albany.
15 Right? We can talk to our state colleagues about
16 that.

17 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: (INAUDIBLE)

18 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: I know.

19 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: (INAUDIBLE)

20 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: I traded my commute.

21 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: (LAUGHS)

22 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay.

23 Could you please elaborate on the partnerships
24 that you have with the MTA and what the programs look
25 like?

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 70

3 PROVOST ANDERSON: Yes, thank you for that
4 question.

5 We have partnered with the MTA to run internship
6 programs that span a host of different types of
7 occupational tracks and career tracks for students,
8 everything from engineering and architecture through
9 back office management, accounting, communications,
10 etcetera.

11 As I said to date, we've placed 500 interns with
12 the MTA over the last two years, and we can get you
13 the exact numbers, which I don't have today, but we
14 have seen dozens convert into full time hires at the
15 MTA, which is always a thing that we ultimately wanna
16 see.

17 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: That's excellent news.

18 We're thrilled to learn also about your
19 initiative that helps to give students the experience
20 necessary to apply for civil service positions.

21 Can DCAS speak to whether you're open to
22 reviewing the experience requirement for young
23 applicants the same way that you're reviewing the
24 minimum education requirement for the regular civil
25 service?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PORTER: Absolutely.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 71

3 I do want to mention that Governor Hochul
4 recently signed a bill into law amending civil
5 Service Law Section 54, which will require... which
6 will allow candidates to have one year to meet the
7 age requirement and the education requirements for an
8 exam. So, this will allow us to focus our recruitment
9 efforts on high school students. So ,they are able
10 to... they will be able to take a civil service exam
11 at the age of seventeen and then, you know, be on the
12 list and then consider it for appointment, you know,
13 once they reach the age requirement. So that's one
14 way that we're doing that.

15 And, you know, that that's pretty much the
16 vehicle that we have right now to hone in on the
17 younger population.

18 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: You are going require
19 some collaboration with the DOE (Department of
20 Education) I'm assuming?

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PORTER: Yes, we already work
22 very closely with them.

23 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Great.

24 Governor Hochul also announced that all state
25 civil service exam application fees will be waived
through December 2025. Given that the City civil

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 72

3 service exempt fees range from \$40 to a \$101, and
4 these fees can present a barrier to entry for some
5 New Yorkers, has the City considered waiving the
6 application fees entirely?

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PORTER: So, I just want to
8 start up by saying that we're dedicated, and we're
9 always looking for ways to reduce barriers, you know,
10 related to application fees or entering the civil
11 service system. Currently, DCAS offers hardship fee
12 waivers to many different disparate groups who may
13 have financial hardships in paying for civil service
14 exams.

15 I also want to mention that we have piloted no
16 fee exams and we found that it is an ineffective
17 method of recruitment as we may see a larger number
18 of folks apply for exams, but then when it's time to
19 actually come in and sit for the exam, they don't
20 show up. So, we don't see that as an effective method
21 of recruiting top talent.

22 What has worked is the Bridge Exam, where
23 applicants can pay one application fee. It's a
24 standard application fee of \$40, they take one exam,
25 and then they're able to take multiple exams.

CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Mm-hmm.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 73

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PORTER: Upwards of 10 exams.

4 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: My understanding, though,
5 with the Bridge Exam is that there's a limit to which
6 categories of work the Bridge Exam covers. Correct?

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PORTER: Mostly entry level
8 titles.

9 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Mm-hmm.

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PORTER: Candidates do have to
11 meet the minimum qualifications for the titles being
12 offered, but we have seen great success with
13 attracting, you know, interested folks through that
14 method.

15 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: What would it take to
16 expand or scale that Bridge Exam to sort of cover a
17 more cross sector of the of the workforce that is
18 needed right now in our city?

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PORTER: Thank you.

20 So, we're actually on our third iteration of the
21 Bridge Exam...

22 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay.

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PORTER: And, then, we have
24 expanded it to include public safety titles.

25 So in my testimony, I had mentioned that this
year we launched The Public Safety Bridge, which is

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 74

3 similar to the traditional bridge exam. But it's
4 really focusing on public safety titles, because we
5 do see a decrease in interest in applications for
6 public safety jobs. So, we wanted to give the general
7 public an opportunity to have, you know, to expand
8 their ability to apply for these type of jobs.

9 We will continue to look for creative ways to,
10 you know, reduce barriers to, you know, examinations
11 and civil service...

12 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Mm-hmm.

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PORTER: especially through
14 the Bridge Exam.

15 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Great.

16 Thank you for answering those questions. I have
17 one more question on my end, then I'll pass it back
18 over to Chair Dinowitz.

19 The Council Data Team's Pay Disparity Report
20 found that the Civil Service Pathway Fellowship
21 Program effectively and retain diverse potential
22 municipal employees and reduced disparities. Over
23 two-thirds of participants were employees of color,
24 and more than half remained in municipal workforce.
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 75

3 Can you share any specific initiatives strategies
4 that have been implemented to promote diversity
5 within the program?

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PORTER: Specifically within
7 the Civil Service Pathways Program?

8 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Yes, but we're open to
9 oh, the more information, the better, but yes.

10 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OUTAR: Thank you.

11 We are very much committed to diversifying the
12 City and making sure that defined and various folks
13 have opportunities to apply for these programs, and
14 that's where the recruitment aspects come in.

15 So, one of the things that we do when we're
16 engaged in different organizations and schools is we
17 look at the population that they serve. So,
18 partnership with CUNY is really helpful, because we
19 know that certain CUNY schools have a higher level of
20 population for different folks. So, we may go to
21 Bronx Community College or Lehman College that way
22 we're able to engage various Hispanics or Black...
23 so, we do take that into consideration in terms of
24 the outreach that we're doing, and we're looking at
25 the end results. Right? What are we... Who are the

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 76

3 folks that are getting into the position? Are we
4 diversifying the applicant pool?

5 So, we want to make sure that we continue to
6 engage and work with organizations that work with
7 folks of a particular demographic, as well as the
8 educational institutions that serve those folks.

9 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you for answering
10 that question.

11 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you, Chair De La
12 Rosa.

13 So, looking forward, do you see... what
14 opportunities do you see in the future with the
15 agencies to serve as interns or fellows? What
16 agencies could be potential partners for CUNY?

17 PROVOST ANDERSON: We are delighted to work with
18 more city and state agencies. Thank you for the
19 question. It's appreciated.

20 Uh, the opportunity, though we work with 14
21 agencies today within our CUNY internship program,
22 obviously, that leaves a lot of room for growth.
23 There are a lot of agencies that are not partnering
24 with us on that, and we would love to expand that.

25 Additionally, our Industry Support Hub, as I
mentioned earlier, which isn't only focused on

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 77

3 internships, it's focused on full time hiring too, as
4 I mentioned, they work with 76 different city and
5 state agencies. And amongst those agencies, the
6 majority are city agencies, but still not as many as
7 we would like to see on there.

8 So we tend to work with - and are happy to
9 provide a list afterwards of all of those agencies -
10 many of the large agencies that have come to us that
11 employ a lot of people. But, the thing that we
12 oftentimes can reach are some of the smaller agencies
13 who we don't have existing partnerships with. So,
14 anything that can be done to expand our outreach to
15 them as well as the City Council would be very
16 welcome.

17 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: So, are you conducting
18 those outreach efforts, or are you asking for support
19 from the City Council in terms of connecting you with
20 agencies or both?

21 PROVOST ANDERSON: So, definitely when it comes to
22 getting more city council offices involved in our ETR
23 program, we'd love to do that directly with you.

24 In terms of city agencies, we do conduct outreach
25 to them on a regular basis. Obviously, a call to
action around this is very helpful no matter what.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 78

3 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Mm-hmm. And what have been
4 some of the challenges in working with city agencies,
5 whether it relates to funding, advertising, personnel
6 policies, or anything else?

7 PROVOST ANDERSON: So, funding is certainly a
8 challenge at the agencies, as I alluded to before,
9 because we do not use these programs to connect
10 students to unpaid opportunities. That's something
11 that we don't necessarily promote through our office.

12 So, funding is certainly an issue. Some of the
13 other issues we encounter are generally true whether
14 we're talking about the public sector or our private
15 sector internships, which is CUNY students are very
16 diverse. Half of them come from families that earn
17 less than \$30,000 a year in family income. So many
18 students have full time jobs. And when they're
19 thinking about the tradeoff between getting rid of
20 their full time year round job, and taking an
21 internship that doesn't necessarily have a guarantee
22 of immediately leading to a full time job thereafter.
23 (BACKGROUND NOISE) It's a challenging tradeoff for
24 them.

25 So, what we've attempted to do through our
programs to address the challenge of not making it a

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 79

3 zero sum game for students, leave your full time job
4 to take this internship that'll advance your
5 career...

6 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Right.

7 PROVOST ANDERSON: We've done a lot of work with
8 city agencies to try to think about parttime
9 internship programs that students can do while
10 they're working, while they're in school.

11 We also revamped our big summer internship
12 program to be more flexible in terms of hours
13 allowing for parttime hours, not requiring full time
14 hours, so that more students can actually advantage
15 of it while preserving the incomes that they need to
16 stay in school.

17 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: And how's that been? Have
18 the city agencies been receptive to parttime interns?

19 PROVOST ANDERSON: Yes, definitely. Our... the
20 city agencies we've been working with are interested
21 in retaining the students that come to their door. As
22 we've alluded to, they're very eager to have these
23 students.

24 So we found that there have been, particularly
25 over the last three years, very interested in
thinking about not just how they can have parttime

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 80

3 models that will bring more students on, but also
4 thinking about how they are clear in providing more
5 mentorship and helping students stay in their
6 internships and continue on.

7 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: And what else? I mean, you
8 mentioned a few things, but what else could the City
9 Council do to provide more support for the
10 collaboration and the collaborative internship and
11 fellowship programs run by CUNY and city agencies.

12 PROVOST ANDERSON: We always appreciate the
13 opportunity to highlight them. So, thank you, this in
14 and of itself is very useful.

15 I think some of your points, and valid points in
16 terms of challenging us to be clearer about the
17 opportunities, is a good note for us to take back and
18 work on.

19 In the meantime, I think the more that a call to
20 action, as I mentioned, around agencies participating
21 in these programs, opening up these pipelines, is
22 useful coming from everywhere, including City
23 Council.

24 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you. I will turn it
25 back to Chair De La Rosa.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 81

3 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: I actually think we are
4 good on questions. Thank you all so much for being
5 here and answering our questions. Obviously, there is
6 more followup to go, but we are excited about the
7 possibility (TIMER CHIMES) of these continued
8 partnerships. And we look forward to the
9 conversation.

10 PANEL: Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you for being here.

12 PROVOST ANDERSON: Thank you so much.

13 (PAUSE)

14 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: I now open the floor to
15 public testimony. Before we begin, I remind members
16 of the public that this is a formal government
17 proceeding and that decorum shall be observed at all
18 times. As such, members of the public shall remain
19 silent at all times.

20 The witness table is reserved for people who wish
21 to testify. No video recording or photography is
22 allowed from the witness table.

23 Further, members of the public may not present
24 audio or video recordings as testimony, but may
25 submit transcripts of such recordings to the Sergeant
at Arms for inclusion in the hearing record.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 82

3 If you wish to speak at today's hearing, please
4 fill out an appearance card with the Sergeant at Arms
5 and wait to be recognized. When recognized, you will
6 have two minutes to speak on today's hearing topic:
7 *Pathways into New York City's Civil Service.*

8 If you have a written statement, or additional
9 testimony you wish to submit for the record, please
10 provide a copy of that testimony to the Sergeant at
11 Arms.

12 You may also email written testimony to
13 testimony@council.nyc.gov within 72 hours after the
14 close of this hearing. Audio and video recordings
15 will not be accepted.

16 When you hear your name, please come up to the
17 witness table. For the first panel, we invite Arthur
18 Cheliotes...

19 (PAUSE)

20 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Hello, Mr. Cheliotes,
21 thank you for being here, and welcome. You begin when
22 you are ready.

23 ARTHUR CHELIOTES: First, Happy Halloween.

24 And thank you, Chairperson De La Rosa and
25 Chairperson Dinowitz, and my longtime friend Gale
Brewer for the comments that she made earlier

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 83

3 regarding OMB. I could give you horror stories, if
4 you're ready to listen. But, let me offer my
5 testimony here.

6 I entered city service in 1972 and served as
7 president of Local 1180 with 13 consecutive three
8 year terms starting in 1979, Gloria Middleton was
9 elected and took office in 2018.

10 For decades, we have been a team fighting for
11 dignity, justice, and respect for our members who are
12 predominantly women of color. So right in your
13 workforce, you have a diverse workforce.

14 I currently serve as the chairman of the Labor
15 Advisory Board of the City University of New York
16 School of Labor And Urban Studies and President of
17 the CUNY School of Labor Studies Foundation. I have
18 served in various advisory capacities at Queens
19 College and at Joseph Murphy Institute.

20 I am also a native New Yorker, son of an
21 undocumented immigrant who was also an army cook in
22 World War II. I am a proud product of the New York
23 City Public School system and a tuition free City
24 University.

25 Within a year of earning my degree from Queens
College, I qualified to take a competitive civil

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 84

3 service test and scored well enough to be appointed a
4 year later as an income maintenance specialist at
5 Department of Social Services. That was followed by a
6 succession of written, competitive, promotional tests
7 where I scored well enough to reach the top of my
8 occupational group as an administrative manager.

9 My ability to earn a good salary and health
10 benefits - and a tier 1 pension by the way - allowed
11 me to move from the working class to the middle
12 class.

13 The two important documents which symbolize my
14 success are my Queen's College diploma and my CWA
15 Local 1180 Union Membership card. They are the
16 vehicles to the middle class - unions and a college
17 degree.

18 The CUNY Civil Service Pathways Fellowship, a
19 partnership with CUNY and DCAS must be supported and
20 expanded. This program is important is an important
21 recruiting tool for city government. It must also
22 adhere to the important standards of merit and
23 fitness mandated by the state constitution and civil
24 service law. This partnership is laudable, but
25 recruitment is not enough, retention is also required
if we are to provide the important public services

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 85

3 New Yorkers, our families, friends, and neighbors
4 need and deserve.

5 In the committee briefing documents, when you
6 cite the following... Chancellor Rodriguez wrote in
7 his op ed, that CUNY bore a particular obligation to
8 our diverse student population, many of whom are from
9 the underrepresented communities cited by Speaker
10 Adams, and are prime candidates for pathways to
11 economic stability.

12 By increasing diversity in the civil service,
13 (TIMER CHIMES) may I continue?

14 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: You may continue, but we
15 have some more folks that also signed up to testify.
16 So, if you could summarize some of the points, that
17 would be...

18 ARTHUR CHELIOTES: Okay. Well...

19 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: amazing, but continue,
20 please, thank you.

21 ARTHUR CHELIOTES: Well, earlier this year, we
22 appeared before you regarding the Diversity of... The
23 Pay Diversity Report. And in it, the current public
24 workers, especially minority women, have been
25 segregated into low paying jobs. CUNY could be a
vehicle for them to move into higher paying jobs, but

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 86

3 it requires the cooperation of DCAS, who understands
4 that these current workers cannot be neglected as you
5 might... the Williamsburg Bridge before it was fixed.
6 But in fact, given opportunities, through CUNY, to be
7 able to get to bridge to promotional exams, that pay
8 much higher wages, to use, to work with CUNY, the
9 agencies that need the staff and their unions to
10 create those programs.

11 What unions provide and have provided for years
12 is tuition assistance that allows our members to go
13 to go to CUNY schools.

14 And our EEO case was one in large part, because
15 back in the eighties, we started a program with CUNY,
16 with Queens College, that gave our members the
17 opportunity to get their degrees. And when we filed
18 our EEO case, for administrative managers, we were
19 able to show that our members, these women of color,
20 had better educational credentials than the white
21 male predecessors that used to work in those jobs.
22 And because of that, we were able to win substantial
23 increases for administrative managers.

24 The Pay Disparity Report came out of our EEO
25 case. The legislation to create it was an
acknowledgment of how women and people of color are

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 87

3 ignored by DCAS and not given the opportunities to
4 advance.

5 And even today, When our members who are
6 administrative managers are offered higher level
7 positions, we often get reports that OMB is blocking
8 the promotion of our members.

9 Why? Because the pay scale is much higher after
10 the EEO case, and they don't want to pay it! Making
11 sure that we continue to suppress the wages of women
12 and people of color.

13 Now, we have other programs that are in my
14 written testimony. If you look at the para
15 professional, the teacher program, done through the
16 CUNY School of Labor And Urban Studies, you have
17 paraprofessionals, we had to negotiate. The CUNY
18 School of Labor Negotiated programs at various
19 colleges throughout the CUNY system, where these
20 paraprofessionals could go to... could take these
21 courses in the afternoon after to work so that they
22 could become teachers.

23 That means a nearly doubling of their salaries.
24 That is really an affirmative action program that
25 offers women minorities a career path - and going
forward, the opportunity to earn a Master's degree

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 88

3 plus credits, which will add to their salaries. These
4 are life changing events and can play an important
5 role in providing the city services that we need.

6 The CUNY School of Labor and Urban Studies has
7 done this for DC 37, for Local 1180, we do it day in
8 and day out. The school is also talking about going
9 into the high schools, and it's detailed in my in
10 report, in my testimony. All these are opportunities
11 to retain the women and minorities, the diverse
12 workforce you have.

13 I urge you to demand that not only do we deal
14 with recruiting, but with retention, but that there
15 be another key vehicle that offers opportunities
16 where these students can come in at the lowest rungs
17 and move up, and know that there is a path to the
18 higher paying jobs.

19 And with that, I'd be happy to answer questions,
20 and I thank you for your...

21 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you so much. Thank
22 you so much...

23 ARTHUR CHELIOTES: (INAUDIBLE) your time...

24 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: for your meaningful
25 testimony and for providing us all of this
information on which the Committee will review fully.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 89

3 I do have one question. Your last paragraph in
4 your testimony, it says, "The School of Labor and
5 Urban Studies requested but did not receive City
6 funding to implement this innovative program."

7 Which program are you referring to?

8 ARTHUR CHELIOTES: I was referring to the high
9 school program we attempted to initiate.

10 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay, we will follow up
11 on... (CROSS-TALK)

12 ARTHUR CHELIOTES: Which is... Which is... Which
13 is paralleled on the Junior ROTC. We talk about a
14 public service...

15 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Mm-hmm?

16 ARTHUR CHELIOTES: training corp.

17 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay, we will follow up
18 offline...

19 ARTHUR CHELIOTES: Yes...

20 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: So, that when we are
21 developing our budget priorities, I can make sure
22 that we are in communication...

23 ARTHUR CHELIOTES: Thank you. And all I can tell
24 you is, again, the programs that you have started
25 here are wonderful...

CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 90

3 ARTHUR CHELIOTES: They need to be expanded. I
4 thank you, thank you (INAUDIBLE)... (CROSS-TALK)

5 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: I really appreciate you,
6 and, through you, I also give our thanks and
7 gratitude to the members of CWA 1180, who have been
8 trailblazers in this movement before we got here. So,
9 we are grateful for your service to our city. Thank
10 you so much for being here.

11 ARTHUR CHELIOTES: Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: We have also been joined
13 by Council Member Oswald Feliz.

14 And, our next panel, public panel, includes Sal
15 DeRosalia, if you hear your name, please come up to
16 the microphone... and Christopher Leon Johnson.

17 SAL DEROSALIA: My name is Sal DeRosalia and I
18 live in Long Island City.

19 So, I was literally just on a tour here, and I
20 happen to scan the code and sit down. And, I really
21 love what I hear, so I appreciate it. Thank you,
22 everybody, for being here and doing these jobs. I
23 think it's really important.

24 My short personal story is, I just moved back to
25 New York a couple of years ago to help take care of
my father and my mother. I have kind of reentered the

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 91

3 workforce a little, I'm reenrolled in school. I just
4 moved to the city a couple months ago, and I just
5 love city government. I love the city in general, and
6 I find it really hard to break through. It is...it is
7 challenging at best. I've been to job fairs. I've
8 been to just a lot of different things, and I'm
9 learning, and I am, you know, following the path, but
10 sitting back there and hearing it, I thought those
11 were very good questions about how to promote it
12 more, how to increase the opportunities for people
13 there. I appreciate the 311 and how many qualified
14 people can get in.

15 But, yeah, I just I just found myself sitting in
16 that chair. I'm 45 years old, too, not that matters,
17 but just to give you a little time stamp. I want to
18 be a part of, I wanna contribute. So, and I know
19 there should be a bar to get in there, but at the
20 same time, I feel like there should also be ushering
21 of people who are ready, willing, and able.

22 And so whatever you all can help to do that, I
23 appreciate it. That's it. Thank you very much.

24 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you so much for
25 being here, coming over, and participating. That's
what these public hearings are for. And I invite you

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 92

to touch base with our staff afterwards to see how we
can be helpful. Thank you so much... (CROSS-TALK)

CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Hey...

CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Mr. Johnson?

CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Yeah, yeah, hello. My
name is Christopher Leon Johnson, thanks for having
this panel. I didn't know they had this, I'm across
the other side with the sexual harassment stuff. A
lot of people over there.

Uh, I look, here's the thing, right? We're in the
time where nonprofits are the thing right now. It's
where the money's at, it's a billion dollar industry.
Everybody's getting into nonprofit, because it's
where the money at and, you know, how to work at
McDonald's.

I believe the City Council should work with CUNY
to instead... I understand we need civil service, but
when you start training people for... these college
students for nonprofits, because a lot of these
nonprofits need these type of minds and these type of
attitudes in here, the problem with civil service is
it's too hard to get a job in civil service.

There was a video that's viral on Instagram of
somebody trying to get a job with the MTA, and they

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 93

was told, like, oh, we had to they just made everybody goes to go scan thing and scan and apply. It's on Instagram. It's a viral video on Instagram. Like, telling somebody... somebody to scan and apply. And they were pissed off.

I understand a lot of people need city jobs, because it's where the money is at and the benefits and never need benefits. But, look, it's hard to get it. It's hard to get civil service jobs. It's easier to get a nonprofit job. Nonprofits pop up like... like nothing these days, nonprofits open up every week. And I believe City Council, starting with this panel, like this three here, Feliz, since you are the Small Business Chair, nonprofits, some of them are small businesses. And, Mr. Dinowitz, you're the CUNY chair, and that De Le Rosa, you for Labor. I think you should all get together and work with CUNY and small business services to open... But you should call it Pathways at Nonprofits, Pathways to NGOs, uh, because the City Council, they deliver all this money to these nonprofits. So, you might as well start training these kids, these college students. Mainly people that's under 24 years old, under 24, to work for these nonprofits, the ones that you guys fund,

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 94

1 like borrowing basics... I don't borrowing basics
2 and, like, low (INAUDIBLE) or work with justice
3 project. What else we got here? NMIC, you know,
4 these, like, these like, maybe they, like, the this
5 what is it? The human justice nonprofits. Like,
6 #JustPay, hash tag, JustPay nonprofits.
7

8 So, I believe that we should go this route
9 instead. We should really go this route, because if
10 you start telling these students to go apply for city
11 jobs, when they know... they know most of them are
12 not gonna get, because you got to know someone to get
13 those jobs, they're gonna be frustrated. We got a
14 mental health crisis in New York City. And that's
15 gonna add to the mental health crisis in the city.

16 So there's a different way. It's nonprofits. I'm
17 a journalist. I'm not in my journalist capacity, but
18 is where is that right now, it's what the money's at.
19 So, we have to change course. I'm not saying it's
20 gonna happen today, but I hope very soon that you
21 give the Speaker, and, including the Majority Leader,
22 because she oversees the economic development, uh,
23 Council Member Amanda Farías, to start having the all
24 the other chairs like CUNY, Mister Feliz, and the new
25 chick, (INAUDIBLE) their name to start moving looking

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 95

3 into nonprofit sector, start opening more
4 opportunities for nonprofit sector. (TIMER CHIMES)
5 So, thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you so much for
7 your testimony today.

8 CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Yeah.

9 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you all who came
10 here today to share your thoughts and experiences. If
11 there is anyone in the Chamber, who wishes to speak,
12 but has not yet had the opportunity to do so... Okay,
13 please, raise your hand, fill out the appearance card
14 with the Sergeant at Arms in the front of the room.

15 (PAUSE)

16 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Alright, it says Cecile
17 Chala? Okay, you may begin.

18 CECILLE CHALA: Hello, my name is Cecile Chala,
19 and I'm currently a freshman student of Brooklyn
20 College, CUNY University of New York.

21 I really appreciate what you mentioned about the
22 benefits of CUNY University and their
23 internship/apprenticeship.

24 I'm just concerned about the internships of how
25 they can, like, benefit me. Because, I'm a freshman

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 96
3 year student who's going to start an internship on
4 spring 2024, so I'm really interested on that.

5 And I really want to know how that can benefit me
6 as a student currently at a Brooklyn College. So
7 that's my concern. Yeah. But also, I like that you
8 like, the council member mentioned that the
9 apprenticeships and the benefits of how CUNY has its
10 and its (INAUDIBLE) standards of educational... Yeah.

11 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Great.

12 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you...

13 CECILLE CHALA: Oh, wait, and, also, uhm, as a
14 research student, I really like participating in your
15 committee as, like, a student, and I really do,
16 really, yeah...

17 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Can you tell us a little
18 bit about... Okay, I have a few questions...

19 CECILLE CHALA: Yeah...

20 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: One is, what drew you to
21 this hearing today? It isn't frequent that students,
22 such as yourself, come to join hearings like this.

23 What drew you to this hearing today?

24 CECILLE CHALA: What drew me, like, to this
25 hearing is to get to know more about the committee,
26 like, to know more about, like, the benefits on

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 97

higher education, because I'm in college, I want to know more about it and get more involved.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Love to hear it. And, you have applied for an internship, and you have been accepted to an internship for next spring? (CROSS-TALK)

CECILLE CHALA: No, I mean, I am waiting for the acceptance. I got an interview as a freshman...
(CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Interview...

CECILLE CHALA: Yes...

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay, wonderful. And, did you apply for a specific internship?

CECILLE CHALA: Yes, I applied for the Healthcare Hub.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Oh, that's very fine...

CECILLE CHALA: And...

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: And you expect to hear...
When is your interview?

CECILLE CHALA: My interview? No, I just had it.
It was a couple of weeks ago.

CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay, I am sure you did great.

CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Yeah...

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 98

3 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: And, when do you expect to
4 hear back about whether you...

5 CECILLE CHALA: I expect to hear back that I get
6 accepted for the reward to, like, (INAUDIBLE)

7 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: At what, sorry, what?

8 CECILLE CHALA: I... I, like, me, like, as a
9 student, I expect to get high standards from the
10 internship.

11 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Good. And, do you know when
12 you receive word whether you've been accepted to the
13 internship?

14 CECILLE CHALA: No, I haven't received an email
15 yet.

16 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay.

17 CECILLE CHALA: But, I am looking forward to it
18 for working on the spring 2024.

19 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Okay...

20 CECILLE CHALA: to help, like, others with, uhm,
21 mental health conditions. My major is psychology and
22 my minor is neuro science.

23 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Oh, hey! Is there anything
24 else you'd like to share with us, with this committee
25 today?

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 99

3 CECILLE CHALA: Uhm, yeah, I would like to share
4 about, uhm, the internships, any help that the, uh, I
5 think there was a person here next to the other
6 person speaking about... to the committee, to you,
7 right, uhm, about how, uhm, the internships (TIMER
8 CHIMES) has a major impact on how we view things and
9 how... How do you say this? Like, how does the
10 internship benefit others, and what are the, like,
11 consequences of it, too. Because, some students, I
12 know don't get paid for internships, so... I know
13 that they don't, but I would love to get paid for
14 that...

15 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Thank you so much. Thank
16 you for testifying today.

17 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Yeah, that's good
18 feedback, and I think you are well on your way to the
19 advocacy route. I mean...

20 CECILLE CHALA: Yeah...

21 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: showing up at the City
22 Council and...

23 CECILLE CHALA: Yeah...

24 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: giving your testimony is
25 brave and courageous, and we are hopeful that you
will get that internship. But, Chair Dinowitz and

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 100
3 myself are here if you need any assistance, and if we
4 can be helpful to you in your process.

5 CECILLE CHALA: Okay, thank you so much.

6 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you for being here
7 today.

8 So, now, I will turn the microphone over to Zoom
9 testimony. When your name is called, please wait for
10 a member of your team to unmute you, and that
11 indicates that you may begin.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

13 UNKNOWN: (NO RESPONSE)

14 (PAUSE)

15 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Well, there's no one...
16 Seeing no hands, I would like to note that everyone
17 can submit written testimony at
18 testimony@council.nyc.gov within 72 hours after the
19 close of this hearing.

20 To conclude, I would like to thank all of the
21 folks who opened up pathways for municipal workforce
22 for aspiring civil workers, and to CUNY for
23 pioneering so many great programs to equip students
24 with the skills they need to thrive in their careers.
25 In addition, we would like to take a moment to
express thanks to all of the advocates who attended

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR
2 JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION 101
3 today's hearing to share their experiences, and to
4 our dedicated staff who organized this hearing.

5 Chair Dinowitz, any final remarks?

6 CHAIRPERSON DINOWITZ: Well, thank you, Chair De
7 La Rosa, I want to thank you for your hard work on
8 the Committee, and, of course, to DCAS and to CUNY. I
9 think the importance of this is recognizing what so
10 many of us in the Council recognize, that ,you know,
11 your job, your education, none of those exist in
12 silos, that your education is on a pathway to getting
13 a good career. And your good career comes from
14 getting a good education. And I am extremely proud to
15 work with people like Chair De La Rosa, who recognize
16 that, and work with the CUNY system, and in a city
17 that is recognizing that, and is making more of an
18 investment in that. So, I will turn it back to you,
19 Chair De La Rosa.

20 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you all for being
21 here. And, with that, we conclude today's hearing.

22 (GAVEL SOUND) (GAVELING OUT)
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date November 26, 2024