

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

STATED MEETING

----- X

June 26, 2014
Start: 1:56 p.m.
Recess: 4:02 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E:

LETITIA JAMES
Chairperson

MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO
Speaker for the Council

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

- Maria Del Carmen Arroyo
- Inez D. Barron
- Fernando Cabrera
- Margaret S. Chin
- Andrew Cohen
- Costa G. Constantinides
- Robert E. Cornegy
- Elizabeth S. Crowley
- Laurie A. Cumbo
- Chaim M. Deutsch
- Inez E. Dickens
- Daniel Dromm
- Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
- Mathieu Eugene

Julissa Ferreras
Daniel R. Garodnick
Vincent J. Gentile
Vanessa L. Gibson
David G. Greenfield
Vincent Ignizio
Core D. Johnson
Ben Kallos
Andy L. King
Peter A. Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Rory L. Lancman
Brad S. Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Alan N. Maisel
Steven Matteo
Darlene Mealy
Carlos Menchaca
Rosie Mendez
I. Daneek Miller
Annabel Palma
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Deborah L. Rose
Helen K. Rosenthal
Ritchie Torres
Mark Treyger
Eric A. Ulrich
James Vacca
Paul A. Vallone
James G. Van Bramer
Mark S. Weprin
Jumaane D. Williams
Ruben Wills

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

1 STATED MEETING

4

2 [sound check]

3 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Twelve hours ago,
4 we passed a great budget for the City of New York,
5 and I want to thank everyone that was here. We are
6 going to started today's Stated with two ceremonials.
7 One by Council Member Koo. We're going to start off
8 with that one. He is giving recognition and issuing
9 proclamations to four Con Ed workers who saw--
10 [background comment] five Con Ed workers who saw two
11 cars collide and raced to rescue a baby and two women
12 after the accident caused a light pole to topple over
13 with live electrical wires and gasoline spreading on
14 the street. These are the kinds of ceremonials that
15 I really enjoy in this chamber, people that step up
16 to the plate. And so, thank you, Council Member Koo,
17 for doing this today.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: [off mic] Well,
19 thank you. [on mic] May I ask the Con Ed employees
20 come up? [applause] Really, Con Ed. Which?

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Go right ahead.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Okay, my colleagues,
23 Speaker, and members of the public. They told us
24 [sic] five Con Ed workers when they are working they
25 saw an accident and they rescued a baby and two women

2 trapped in an auto accident. And then when the two
3 cars they were driving collided bringing down a
4 traffic light and exposing the electric wires to
5 spilled gasoline. These workers they immediately run
6 over to the scene, and rescue the baby out of the
7 car, and also the two lady drivers. And so, we are
8 here to commend them for the heroic efforts in
9 addition to their regular work. They are always
10 working very hard to make sure we have energy, we
11 have light, and we have power. It is really
12 critical. People don't realize just how important is
13 it. Once we have a power outage, we realize we
14 cannot do anything. So we are here to recognize the
15 heroic efforts. This is the City Clerk with the
16 proclamation piece.

17 CLERK: Council City of New York
18 Proclamation.

19 Whereas, the Council of the City of New
20 York is proud to honor Rich Coyle, Chris Jensen,
21 Mauricio Rincon, William Connolly, and James DeVita
22 for their heroic life saving rescue in Flushing,
23 Queens, and

24 Whereas, the DMV recorded nearly 295,000
25 car crashes in 2012 in New York State alone and more

2 than 1,000 of those crashes resulted in fatalities.

3 Within New York City, approximately 4,000 New Yorkers

4 are seriously injured, and more than 250 are killed

5 each year in traffic crashes. As the City of New

6 York reaffirms its bold commitment improving street

7 safety through the Vision Zero program and other

8 measures, we are proud to recognize five individuals

9 all Con Edison workers who recently went above and

10 beyond their call of duty to ensure the safety of

11 their fellow New Yorkers, and

12 Whereas, on Tuesday, May 20th, Con Edison

13 Workers James DeVita, Rich Coyle, Chris Jensen,

14 Mauricio Rincon, and William Connolly were in

15 Flushing, Queens installing an overhead transformer

16 new P.S. 62 at the intersection of Francis Lewis

17 Boulevard and 53rd Avenue. From this area perch, the

18 men suddenly heard a tremendous crash as two cars

19 colliding sending one vehicle careening into a

20 pedestrian crossing sign. In a split second a

21 traffic light slammed to the ground, electric wires

22 were exposed and gasoline began to spew from one of

23 the cars. Within this cacophonous scene, the men

24 could see the drivers of both vehicles trying to get

25 out; and

2 Whereas, although they immediately
3 recognized the dangerous mix of gasoline and voltage,
4 these Con Edison workers immediately lowered
5 themselves, and putting the safety of the strangers
6 before their own, they ran toward the crash. As they
7 reached the cars, the gasoline continued to spill,
8 they spotted a baby girl in the back seat. As gas
9 fumes grew stronger, James DeVita, Rich Coyle, and
10 Chris Jensen worked to free the infant from her seat
11 by cutting through the straps and also carrying the
12 unconscious woman from the driver's seat. Meanwhile,
13 Mauricio Rincon pulled another injured woman from
14 behind the wheel of another car through her undamaged
15 rear door. William Connolly immediately dialed 911,
16 and worked with others to get all of the victims far
17 enough away from the accident. And consoled the
18 families until NYPD and FDNY responders arrived to
19 take over the scene.

20 Now, therefore, be it know, that the
21 Council of the City of New York gratefully honors
22 Chris Jensen, James DeVita, Rich Coyle, Mauricio
23 Rincon, and William Connolly for the life saving
24 rescue of two women and a child on May 20, 2014.
25 Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker for the entire

1 STATED MEETING

8

2 Council, Peter Koo, Council Member, 20th District
3 Queens. [applause, cheers]

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Again, thank you.
5 As the clerk was reading that, wow. Right? The
6 suspense and knowing the danger I mean it really
7 brings to light really what an effort you took to
8 save those lives, and we thank you for that. You not
9 only did this individually, you worked collectively,
10 and you really made something miraculous happen. So
11 thank you so much for your efforts. I'm not sure.
12 Does any one of you want to speak on behalf of the
13 group? Say a few words? Again, we want to thank
14 Peter for bringing this to our Chambers.

15 MALE SPEAKER: So I just want to thank
16 the Chamber for recognizing my crews. Thank you for
17 recognizing. We are very proud of them at Con
18 Edison. We spend a lot of time in training in
19 emergency response, and we're very proud that they
20 were able to protect the public in the manner that
21 they did. So thank you, again. [applause, cheers.]

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you. Thank
23 you both. [background comments]

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Okay, we have
25 one--one more ceremonial by Council Member Cabrera on

2 behalf of the Bronx Community College Nursing
3 Program, and I'll had it over to the Council Member.
4 Oh, and the Bronx Delegation as well.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Madam Speaker,
6 thank you so much, and I love your T-shirt.
7 Beautiful. Limited Edition. We want to congratulate
8 also the United States Soccer Team for advancing.
9 [applause] Awesome, awesome. But it gives me great
10 honor as Bronx Community College they make their way.
11 It gives me great honor to-- We are going to be
12 facing that way yes. Beautiful. It gives me great
13 honor to talk to you, and to give you the great news
14 that the Nursing Program at Bronx Community College
15 out of 77 practical nursing programs in school in the
16 State of New York were ranked number one [applause,
17 cheers] in the State of New York. As a matter of
18 fact, the ranking was based on the National Council
19 Licensure Examination for Practical Nurse Exam, which
20 is considered one of the best measures to determine
21 how well a school is preparing its students for a
22 career in practical nursing. As a matter of fact,
23 since 1991, from its very first day, every year since
24 1991, every student has aced the exam with 100% score
25 with the exception of three years. This is an

2 amazing program, a program that I always tell young
3 people to go and sign up because if you get in,
4 you're going to come out a five star nurse. And so,
5 congratulations to Bronx Community College Nursing
6 Program. [applause] Madam Speaker. To the clerk
7 to do the reading.

8 CLERK: Council City of New York
9 Proclamation. Since 1957, Bronx Community College,
10 BCC, has advanced from its humble beginnings of 123
11 students to become the educational cornerstone in the
12 success of tens of thousands of students. Over the
13 last 57 years, BC has been a leader in education
14 ensuring that its students receive the quality
15 instruction, skills, and training needed for future
16 success. In 2012, BCC became the nation's first
17 community college campus to be designated a national
18 historical landmark, and

19 Whereas, each semester BCC provides
20 nearly 12,000 students with quality academic
21 programs, and outstanding faculty, and flexible class
22 schedules to equip them for the 21st Century
23 opportunities. These ambitious students represent
24 over 100 countries, but all share a passion for
25 learning and achievement. This is particularly

2 evident in its Licensed Practical Nursing Program, an
3 evening and weekend program within the Department of
4 Nursing and Allied Health Sciences that offers 22
5 transferrable nursing credits to BCC's RN Program.
6 Upon successful completion of the course work,
7 students are eligible to sit for the New York State
8 National Council Licensure Examination for Practical
9 Nurses, and

10 Whereas, this year practicalnursing.org,
11 a national organization dedicated to providing
12 students with better transparency regarding practical
13 and vocational nursing programs recognized Bronx
14 Community College's Licensed Practical Nursing
15 Program number one among New York State's 77
16 practical nursing programs in schools, and

17 Whereas, this ranking based on National
18 Council Licensure Examination passing rates is
19 considered across the country as one of the best
20 measures for determining how well a school is
21 preparing their students for a career in practical
22 nursing. BCC's Licensed Practical Nursing Program was
23 the only one to receive a perfect 100% score. Over
24 the last five years every BCC student, who
25 successfully completed the Practical Nursing Program

2 went on to ace the exam required of all licensed
3 nurses in New York.

4 Now, therefore, be it known that the
5 Council of the City of New York honors and
6 congratulates the Bronx Community College Licensed
7 Practical Nursing Program for its well-earned
8 recognition as the number one practical nursing
9 program in New York State. Melissa Mark-Viverito,
10 Speaker for the entire Council and Fernando Cabrera,
11 Council Member, 14th District Bronx, and the rest of
12 the Council Members of the Bronx Delegation.

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Okay. Thank you
14 so much. [applause] To all of you that are here,
15 all those that run the lead--the Nursing Program for
16 Bronx Community College and to the Bronx Delegation
17 for bringing this to our attention. It is a great
18 honor to be able to present you with a proclamation
19 your success. And it's something to be proud of in
20 the City of New York. We definitely encourage people
21 to enroll. So thank you very much for being here.
22 Anybody want to speak on behalf of--? Yes.

23 FEMALE SPEAKER: On behalf of Bronx
24 Community College, our President Dr. Berotte Joseph,
25 the Program Director for the Licensed Practical Nurse

1 STATED MEETING

13

2 Program, who couldn't be here today, Professor Ellen
3 Boyce, we would like to say we are very proud of our
4 achievement. And we would like to thank you very
5 much for honoring us. Thank you. [applause]

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic] Thank
7 you all. And that concludes ceremonials.

8 [Pause]

9 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Ladies and gentlemen,
10 can I have your attention, please? Can I please have
11 your attention. At this time, please place all
12 electronic devices, all electronic devices to
13 vibrate. Will all non-Council employees, non-Council
14 employees please the main floor of the Chambers. We
15 have seating upstairs. Can I have quiet in the
16 Chambers, please?

17 [Pause]

18 [gavel]

19 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: All rise.

20 PREISDENT JAMES: All rise for the Pledge
21 of Allegiance.

22 [Pledge of Allegiance]

23 FEMALE VOICE: Roll call.

24 CLERK: Arroyo.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Here.

1 STATED MEETING

14

2 CLERK: Barron.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.

4 CLERK: Cabrera.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.

6 [background noise]

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet in the Chambers,
8 please.

9 [gavel]

10 CLERK: Chin.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

12 CLERK: Constantinides.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.

14 CLERK: Cohen.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

16 CLERK: Cornegy.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Present.

18 CLERK: Crowley.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: [off mic]

20 CLERK: Cumbo.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [off mic]

22 CLERK: Deutsch.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Yes.

24 CLERK: Dickens.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Here.

2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CLERK: Dromm.
COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.
CLERK: Espinal.
COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: [off mic]
CLERK: Eugene.
COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Present.
CLERK: Ferreras.
COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: [off mic]
CLERK: Garodnick.
COUNCIL MEMBER GAROLDNICK: Here.
CLERK: Gentile.
COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Here.
CLERK: Gibson.
COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Here.
CLERK: Greenfield.
COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Here.
PRESIDENT JAMES: Quiet in the Chambers,
please for roll call. Please quiet.
SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet down.
CLERK: Johnson.
COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Here.
CLERK: Kallos.
COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.
CLERK: King.

1 STATED MEETING

16

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.

3 CLERK: Koo.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

5 CLERK: Koslowitz.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

7 CLERK: Lancman.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.

9 CLERK: Lander.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.

11 CLERK: Levin.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.

13 CLERK: Levine.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

15 CLERK: Maisel.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.

17 CLERK: Matteo.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Here.

19 PRESIDENT JAMES: Please quiet down in
20 the Chambers. Please simmer down. Roll call.

21 CLERK: Mealy.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [off mic]

23 CLERK: Menchaca.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.

25 CLERK: Mendez.

1 STATED MEETING

17

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.

3 CLERK: Miller.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Here.

5 CLERK: Palma.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: [off mic]

7 CLERK: Reynoso.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Present.

9 CLERK: Richards.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

11 CLERK: Maisel.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.

13 CLERK: Rodriguez.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Present. [off

15 mic]

16 CLERK: Rose.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.

18 CLERK: Rosenthal.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.

20 CLERK: Espinal.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ESSPINAL: Here.

22 CLERK: Torres.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: [off mic]

24 CLERK: Miller.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Here.

1 STATED MEETING

18

2 CLERK: Treyger.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.

4 CLERK: Ulrich.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Here.

6 CLERK: Vacca.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: [off mic]

8 CLERK: Vallone.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Madam Advocate,
10 permission to vote aye on all matters on today's
11 calendar including on Land Use Call-ups.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you very
14 much.

15 [Pause]

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, taking a
17 vote.

18 CLERK: Weprin.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Here.

20 CLERK: Williams.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.

22 CLERK: Wills.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Here.

24 CLERK: Ignizio.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Here.

1 STATED MEETING

19

2 CLERK: Van Bramer.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

4 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic] Here.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please rise for
7 the Invocation delivered by Reverend Pat Bumgardner,
8 Executive Director of Global Justice Institute,
9 Metropolitan Community Churches. Please rise.
10 Everyone remain quiet.

11 REVEREND BUMGARDNER: [off mic] When New
12 Yorkers woke up this morning [on mic] they learned
13 why this municipality is sometimes dubbed the city
14 that never sleeps. Because you, the members of the
15 New York City Council were hard at work passing a
16 budget that expands daycare programs, and gives every
17 middle-school child the assurance of this day's daily
18 bread. And provides scholarships for some and after
19 school programs for other. You were hard at work on
20 a budget that funds a summer jobs program for teens,
21 and makes sure that community centers stay open. You
22 were working on a budget that invests in affordable
23 housing, and ensures services for mentally ill
24 inmates. The most diverse council in the history of
25 our city did a most amazing thing. It put our money

2 where many of our hearts are with those most in need
3 of our care and protection. As the pastor of a
4 community of faith where many have been among those
5 seeking asylum and a chance at freedom, and a better
6 life. I want to personally thank you for now making
7 sure that every poor, poor and born New Yorker in
8 immigration detention will be able to seek and have
9 legal representation at the deportation hearings.
10 Restoring the promise of a statute not far away,
11 "Give me your poor, your tired, and your huddled
12 masses."

13 Many years ago, the great preacher and
14 prophet, the Reverend Dr. Martin Luther King spoke of
15 Rip Van Winkle as the man who slept through a
16 revolution. When he went up the mount, King said the
17 sign said, King George. And when he came down, it
18 read President George. You have not only remained
19 awake, but positioned yourselves as leaders in a
20 great a revolution of change that sees difference not
21 as something that separates us. But as the very
22 special something that gives us the opportunity to
23 cross previously erected social borders, and be more
24 together than we ever possibly could have been alone
25 or apart.

2 You are helping our city learn the lesson
3 of America's greatness, namely that oneness is not
4 about muting our differences. It is not about
5 uniformity or conformity. Rather, it is about
6 reciprocity and mutuality, and sharing what we have
7 with other who many be different from us on the
8 outside, but bear a strong familiar difference on the
9 inside as members of the one family of God.

10 And so, today as you begin your work, let
11 us pray that God will continue to give you the
12 courage and conviction, the stamina and grace it
13 takes to do the things that will model for the world
14 what a city at peace with its own diversity looks
15 like, and how it is governed. Let us pray that
16 borders and boundaries once used to segregate and
17 exclude become the crossing over places where we have
18 the opportunity to learn together, and expand our
19 horizons together.

20 As we approach this Sunday's LGBT Pride
21 March, may our focus be on all we hold in common, as
22 human beings, and our hope and prayer be for the day
23 when all people, Black people and White people,
24 people of Asian descent and African heritage, Native
25 Americans and immigrants. All people of every sexual

2 orientation and gender identity of every culture,
3 class and creed shall live together in peace. Equal
4 not only in the eyes of God, but under our cities and
5 our nations and our world's codes and covenants. We
6 have won when we are one. May that sacred truth
7 guide every choice and decision. I ask this blessing
8 today in the name of all that's good and holy. Amen.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER: Amen.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Motion to spread
11 the Invocation in full upon the record by Council
12 Member Johnson.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Madam
14 Public Advocate, and I want to--

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
16 Chambers, please.

17 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet down, please.
18 Quiet down.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
20 Johnson.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you Madam
22 Public Advocate, and I want to thank Reverend Pat
23 Bumgardner for being here today. Metropolitan
24 Community Church --

25 [background discussion]

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please, quiet in
3 the Chamber. Please everyone take their seat. Thank
4 you. Council Member Johnson.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Metropolitan
6 Community Church of New York is a spiritual home for
7 the lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender community
8 located on 36th Street in Manhattan in my district,
9 and is open to everyone. Reverend Pat who has been
10 with MCC New York for 30 years, and is a senior
11 pastor. She is also a resident of my district and is
12 renowned around the world for her work on the rights of
13 LGBT people and their families. MCC's work is not
14 just around faith, but working towards of an LGBT
15 person here in New York, the United States and around
16 the world to be treated with dignity and respect.
17 [background discussion.] They do this by housing the
18 Global Justice Initiative, which advocates for human
19 and LGBT rights around the world. They pride
20 themselves on being a safe space for anyone, but in
21 particular LGBT and Queer Youth, many of whom are
22 homeless. MCC is a food pantry program that is open
23 to anyone who is hungry, and perhaps most importantly
24 they shelter LGBT youth in a safe and welcoming
25 environment.

1 STATED MEETING

24

2 Metropolitan Community Church of New York
3 encompasses the values of the Third Council District
4 and of the City of New York. And I believe that
5 today, two days, three days before the 45th
6 anniversary of the Stonewall uprising there is no
7 better person to spread the Invocation here at the
8 City Council than the Reverend Pat Bumgardner, Senior
9 Pastor at the Metropolitan Community Church. I thank
10 you Reverend for a wonderful Invocation, and for all
11 that you have done in our city on a day-to-day basis.
12 Thank you very much.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
14 Vallone.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Madam Advocate,
16 permission to aye on all matters on today's including
17 the Land Use Call-ups.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you very
20 much.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
22 Council Member Wills.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: May I have a
24 minute to explain my vote?

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Thank you. I do
3 apologize for voting and leaving. I do have a
4 graduation to go to. But I just wanted to say on the
5 record that I had every intention on coming here
6 today and voting no on this bill. I didn't believe
7 that this bill was drafted with everybody in mind,
8 but a certain group. But then, everybody else was
9 included. But the gentleman from Brooklyn, Carlos
10 Menchaca, had a conversation with me yesterday. And I
11 really want to tell you I appreciate it. I do not
12 agree with any group of people that our outside of
13 our legal framework with immigration, but I also have
14 to say that I do not believe any group should face
15 any oppression whether it's financial, political,
16 spiritual or any others. People are here inside of
17 our borders for a greater chance at life. This
18 municipal I.D. card has been explained to me in
19 detail, again by the gentleman. And I wanted to just
20 tell you that I do appreciate. Ms. Bertha Lewis
21 [phonetic] gave me stats on how many are actually in
22 my district. This Council has passed funding for
23 citizenship now, which is my office. We have an
24 attorney two days a week, and the stories that have
25 come in have--

1 STATED MEETING

26

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
3 Council Member, can you please bring your comments to
4 a close?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: I'm sorry. Yes, I
6 will. So with that, I do want to thank you again.
7 And I keep going over and over again, the gentleman
8 Carlos Menchaca from Brooklyn. You definitely are a
9 gentleman, and because of that and because of your
10 honesty, I vote aye.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
12 Adoption of minutes.

13 CLERK: None.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Messages and
15 paper from the Mayor.

16 CLERK: M80 submitting Cheryl Cohen for
17 appointment to the City Planning Commission.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Rules,
19 Privileges, and Elections.

20 CLERK: M81 submitting Bomee Jung for
21 appointment to the City Planning Commission.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Rules,
23 Privileges, and Elections.

24 CLERK: M82 submitting Marcie Kesner for
25 appointment to the Landmark Preservation Commission.

1 STATED MEETING

27

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Rules,
3 Privileges, and Elections.

4 CLERK: M83 submitting Larisa Ortiz for
5 appointment to the City Planning Commission.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Rules,
7 Privileges, and Elections.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication
9 from City, County, and Borough Offices.

10 CLERK: None.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and
12 Communications.

13 CLERK: None.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use Call-
15 Ups.

16 CLERK: None.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication
18 from Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Madam
20 Public Advocate. Not too long ago we all met in
21 these Chambers to pass a wonderful budget. And as
22 was mentioned by Council Member Cabrera before, we
23 took a point of personal privilege earlier. We
24 started a little bit late because we were in the
25 Members' Lounge watching USA play. [whistles] They

2 advanced, which is a good thing. [applause] So, I'm
3 excited for that.

4 One of the items-- I want to talk about
5 a couple of things. One of the items on our agenda
6 today is going to be our street co-naming bill,
7 something we do about twice a year. And as we're
8 voting on that legislation, I wanted to direct
9 everyone's attention to what we will be producing as
10 our new interactive map. It's up here on the screen,
11 which will be available to all New Yorkers to keep
12 them aware of every new co-naming. Every one of
13 those dots is a street that is being co-named. And
14 when you click on it, it pulls up the information of
15 the person that the street is being named after or
16 for the event that the street is being named after.
17 So this is a work in progress, but I wanted to thank
18 Erica Morsales [phonetic] and Maureen Agna for their
19 work on this project. We're going to continue to
20 grow and expand, and hopefully, we can go back as
21 well in time and include others. So it's a great
22 addition to our website.

23 I also wanted to give a special mention
24 before we move onto the next item. It's not normal
25 to go into detail about street co-namings at our

2 stated meetings, but I'm going to make an exception
3 to note that a portion of 10th Avenue in Manhattan is
4 being co-named Stan Brooks Way in this legislation.
5 Stan Brooks is a legendary reporter for 1010 WINS
6 Radio, who in his career covered monumental events
7 including the Attica Prison riot; the Vietnam War
8 protests; civil rights demonstrations; the 1968
9 Democratic National Convention; and the attacks on
10 the World Trade Center. I think everyone here at
11 City Hall has felt the loss since Stan passed last
12 December. And I'm happy that today we're able to
13 honor him for the co-naming that we will be voting
14 on.

15 The main item on our agenda today is the
16 voting on legislation to create the largest municipal
17 ID program in the nation. I'm very, very excited for
18 that. This safe and secure ID will provide
19 identification for many New Yorkers who have never
20 had one before. It is sound policy, and it is humane
21 policy. The New York City Identity Card would be
22 available to any resident of New York City who can
23 establish identity and residency and meet the minimum
24 age requirement for eligibility. Plain and simple,
25 this will be an ID for everyone. It's particularly

2 important for undocumented individuals living in our
3 city, seniors, and displaced youth who may not have
4 access to the documents needed to obtain State ID.

5 The card will include at a minimum the
6 cardholder's photo, name, date of birth, address, and
7 an expiration date. Applicants will be able to elect
8 to include his or her self-designated gender.

9 Through this legislation, we'll also make sure that
10 it's easy for New Yorkers to find application
11 centers. The administering agency will designate
12 access sites for applications to be made available
13 for pickup and submission. At a minimum, there will
14 be one site in each borough.

15 Additionally, applications will be
16 available online. In addition, we'll find ways to
17 incentivize the card to encourage New Yorkers to sign
18 up. To do this, the City will be required to find
19 ways to expand benefits associated with the card,
20 including promoting acceptance of the card by banks
21 and other public and private institutions. The
22 administering agency will determine the fee, if any,
23 to be charged for the card. If a fee is charged, the
24 administering agency is required to provide a full or
25 partial waiver for those who cannot afford it. The

2 cost will be about \$8.4 million in Fiscal Year 2015,
3 and is expected to be about \$5.6 million in the out
4 years. The card will be designed to protect against
5 fraud, a priority we've made in this process. So to
6 keep the card secure the administering agency will be
7 required to produce the card in a manner that deters
8 fraud.

9 The identification and residency of the
10 requirements while flexible are substantial. And the
11 card does not need to be accepted if City agencies
12 have reason to believe that the individual presenting
13 the card is not the individual to whom the card was
14 issued. It will also help improve interactions with
15 the police. People who are reticent to go to the
16 police to make a complaint or to report a crime
17 because they do not have ID or no longer need to be
18 concerned. This is critical legislation that is
19 going to help make people's lives easier and better.
20 The program can give a helping hand to those who have
21 never had one before. These are people with
22 families, jobs, kids in school, and who pay their
23 taxes. These are undocumented parents who can enter
24 their child's school like everyone else.

2 The transgender woman who can finally
3 carry an ID that reflects her identity. A New Yorker
4 who is stopped by the police and can avoid arrest, or
5 a homeless teenager who can more easily access city
6 services. This is an ID for all of them. We're
7 committed as a Council to helping New Yorkers, and
8 that is why we scaled up funding for the New York
9 Immigration -- Immigrant Family Unity Project, which
10 will provide legal representation to immigrants in
11 deportation proceedings, and that is why we're
12 passing this legislation today. When New York leads,
13 the world follows. We can serve as a model for the
14 rest of the nation today. While we wait for
15 immigration reform in Washington, we can take steps
16 to help our own right here. We are a vibrant city
17 forming with a mosaic of different communities, and
18 this is an ID that will be for all of them.

19 I want to thank the Council for their
20 collaboration on this very important issue. I'd like
21 to thank Julian Beckford [phonetic], Jennifer
22 Montalvo [phonetic] from the Legislative staff for
23 their tremendous work on this bill. I want to thank
24 all the staff on my team from the Speaker's office as
25 well. So those are my comments regarding the

2 Municipal I.D. I'd like to ask both Council Members
3 Dromm and Council Members Menchaca, co-lead sponsors
4 of this bill to say a few words.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you very
6 much, Madam Speaker. Let me start off by thanking my
7 staff and those who were involved in the actual
8 writing of this. I want to thank Julian Beckford,
9 Jennifer Montalvo, Rob Newman, who was an excellent
10 negotiator for the administration on this. My
11 Counsel Sebastian McGuire, who put so many hours of
12 work into this, and Carlos Menchaca's staff person,
13 Lee Wellington as well. Let me thank Carlos Menchaca
14 for everything he did to promote this. He is
15 definitely a gentleman, and I feel very fortunate to
16 have shared this piece of legislation with him.

17 Madam Speaker, you know, this has been a
18 dream for me for about five years from the time
19 before when I was the Immigration Chairperson. And
20 moving this forward is a huge step in the right
21 direction for New York City. The New York City ID
22 for All will in many ways help make the lives of all
23 New Yorkers easier from the homeless family in Sunset
24 Park to the transgender youth in Jackson Heights.
25 Most notably, this program reaffirms the Council's

2 commitment to helping immigrant New Yorkers integrate
3 into the life of our city. Having a widely accepted
4 ID Card will only strengthen relations between our
5 immigrant communities and schools, police, and the
6 other city agencies.

7 Beyond the access so city services that
8 this card will facilitate, are the exciting
9 possibilities for additional benefits to be added.
10 The program outline in the legislation lays the
11 foundation for such growth. Together with the
12 Mayor's stated commitment to dedicating resources to
13 its success, the New York City's ID For All is poised
14 to become the must-have accessory for all New
15 Yorkers. I look forward to lining up with my
16 colleagues to apply for an ID once the program is
17 launched. Thank you very, very much.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
19 Menchaca.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you
21 Speaker and I also want to give many, many thank you
22 today. Today is a special day. In the wake of
23 passing the budget, really this morning actually. I
24 know a lot of us have been working around the clock,
25 and there are some incredibly important thank you to

2 move forward with. First, I really want to make sure
3 that everybody on staff including Sebastian from
4 Danny's office, who work in partnership with my Chief
5 of Staff Lee Wellington to really bring the efforts
6 of a City Council Member driven process. This was an
7 incredible team effort with prime sponsored Danny
8 Dromm.

9 And it was a beautiful thing in my first
10 six months to be experiencing such incredible caliber
11 from him and his staff, and allowing me as Chair of
12 Immigration to be moving with his, was such a
13 beautiful experience. The Speaker had been an
14 incredible component to this entire thing. Really,
15 without her and her office and her staff, this would
16 not have been possible. Her staff includes Robert,
17 Rob, Joline, Jennifer, Elizabeth, Joe, Amelia, and
18 Michael. In the Engagement Office Ivan, Joey,
19 Katrina -- Karina, sorry, Pfizo [phonetic], Joyce and
20 the rest of the office was such an important part.
21 They were the ones that were communicating to the
22 community about how important this was.

23 And so I want to make sure that you all
24 get your respect today. And then, of course, the
25 Mayor's office for being at the table the entire

2 time. This was something that no one thought was
3 possible and they were there. NYPD, the Mayor's
4 Office, the Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs.
5 Everybody was at the table the entire time working
6 through this, and it is an incredible appreciation.
7 This is an historic moment for us and our city. The
8 precedent setting is modeled for the rest of the
9 country for municipalities to rethink how they can
10 engage their residents. And we're going to be
11 sending a very strong message today as we pass this.

12 We're going to ensure and protect rights
13 for historically under-served and under-represented
14 communities. And give us new ways to engage each and
15 every one of them to increase our specific
16 participation. This landmark legislation is never
17 easy, but this administration proved it today. And
18 so, really what I want to end with, and also I want
19 to thank before I end actually. I want to thank my
20 staff. Back to the reality, this is my first session
21 in the City Council. I would not have been able to
22 do it without Lee and Jorge, and Vlam [phonetic], and
23 Kenneth and Jessie, and Jimmy and Jean, and everybody
24 else who has been supporting us throughout this
25 entire year. Thank you.

2 Then finally, you in January we came in
3 and people wondered what is this progressive Council
4 and progressive mayor going to do. What was going to
5 manifest? This is the direct manifestation of a
6 mayor and city council working together day in and
7 day out. And I look forward to continuing to work
8 for our immigrant communities, our LGBT communities,
9 our seniors. And let us not forget. Thank you. [In
10 Spanish]

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
12 Council Members. Very exciting. And so I'd like to
13 also acknowledge that today is our Land Use
14 Director's Gail Benjamin's last stated with the
15 Council City. Gail has served this institution for
16 many, many years as a true wealth of knowledge. It
17 has been a pleasure for me to work with her the past
18 eight years, and now as Speaker. So Gail, I don't
19 know if she is around. Where is she? In the back.
20 Oh, there she is in the back. Hi, Gail. Thank you so
21 much. [applause, cheers] It's well deserved, very
22 much well deserved. So Gail, thank you. Thank you
23 so much for your service to the City Council to the
24 City of New York. And I believe I speak on behalf of
25

2 the Council when we say we wish you the best. Thank
3 you so much.

4 And a couple of just quick items before
5 we move on. The blood drive. We have a blood drive
6 always that we hold in this Council. We have one on
7 July 8th. There is always a critical need for
8 donated blood. So I really want to urge everyone to
9 schedule an appointment to give. It takes just about
10 30 minutes out of your day to donate, but for the
11 recipient it could be a lifetime gift. So make sure
12 you're taking iron pills because I know I've been
13 rejected a couple of times because my iron levels
14 were too low. So also the Council outing is on July
15 11th, and I would definitely encourage all of our
16 colleagues to join.

17 And lastly, we have sent out a survey to
18 all of you and all of our members regarding public
19 engagement, and how do we want to increase public
20 engagement through our Internet and through the
21 website, et cetera. So we please as that you submit
22 those by Monday, and anyone can reach Erica Gonzales
23 for more information. So thank you again, all. It's
24 exciting. We are entering the summer. We still meet
25 once a month during the summer months, but it's

2 really been an incredibly productive six months, and
3 I looking forward to oncoming months. Thank you very
4 much, and that concludes the Speaker.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: The message from
7 the speaker.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

9 Council Member Palma.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Permission to vote
11 on all items on today's calendar.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Congratulations to
14 Danny Dromm and Carlos Menchaca. I vote aye.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

16 Council Member Johnson.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you Madam
18 Public Advocate. Today the Council is approving two
19 street renamings in my district. One in Chelsea and
20 one in Hell's Kitchen. Phyllis Gonzalez Way will
21 recognize the tremendous contributions made to the
22 Chelsea community, in particular those at the Elliott
23 Chelsea NYCHA houses in West Chelsea. A born and
24 raised New Yorker, Phyllis passed away at 65 in 2012.
25 She served as President for four terms of the Elliott

2 Chelsea Houses Tenant Association, and was a social
3 worker at the Hudson Guild. There were not many
4 things in Chelsea that Gonzalez was not active in.
5 She was on the PTA of P.S. 33, was a member of
6 Manhattan Community Board 4 at the same time I was.
7 Served on the Hudson Guild Neighborhood Advisory
8 Council. I'm proud that we're taking this step to
9 recognize someone who worked for the greater good of
10 the community.

11 Further to the north in my district on
12 43rd Street and 10th Avenue, as the Speaker
13 mentioned, we're naming the street in honor of a
14 legendary radio reporter Stan Brooks. Stan was a
15 native New Yorker from the Bronx. From early on in
16 his life he was writing and publishing his own work
17 from the printing press he received for his birthday
18 at the age of 13. Throughout his career he was
19 recognized for his diligence, professionalism, and
20 commitment to top quality journalism. He was a
21 resident at Manhattan Plaza, which is an affordable
22 housing development for artists and actors in Hell's
23 Kitchen.

24 In 2013, Mayor Bloomberg renamed the
25 Radio Reporter's Room in City Hall after Stan, and

2 it's fitting that today reporting his name on a
3 street to always remember a man whose name is
4 synonymous with New York radio and journalism. I ran
5 into Stan many times during the course of my campaign
6 on 43rd Street between 9th and 10th Avenues. He
7 would shop every weekend for his wife at the Farmer's
8 Market and ask me how the campaign was going. Stan
9 was, as many New Yorkers would say, a true mensch.
10 And I'm happy that we are renaming this street after
11 him today. Thank you very much, Madam Public
12 Advocate.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. This
14 is the discussion of General Orders. Council Member
15 Garodnick.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you very
17 much, Madam Public Advocate. I wanted to rise today
18 to speak about the Municipal ID Legislation. I am
19 voting yes on this bill, but I had some concerns
20 about a number of the details, which the Council is
21 delegating to the Mayor to resolve. I know that I'm
22 not alone in the belief that the ID will only work if
23 we find ways to encourage many New Yorkers to sign
24 up. Today, it is not evident why most documented New
25 Yorkers would want or need one. For many, their

2 driver's licenses do them just fine, and they are
3 averse to getting another form of ID that they may
4 not need. If this card does not gain widespread
5 voluntary acceptance, I fear that it will serve the
6 opposite purpose than what is intended, namely that
7 it will, in fact, simply identify the undocumented
8 for the government.

9 There also appears to be considerable
10 disagreement between the banking industry and the
11 advocates about whether this card can actually help
12 you open a bank account. The Patriot Act creates
13 legal liability for any bank that allows someone to
14 open an account without adequate proof of their
15 identity. Will this do it? Will the banks accept
16 it? I hope we will get to a place where that is the
17 case, but it is far from clear. And I think that
18 this detail should have been worked out before we
19 sent this bill over to the Mayor. I fear that
20 despite the way that it's billed, the ID may not
21 resolve our continuing problem of unbanked New
22 Yorkers.

23 There are open issues here that we are
24 delegating to the Mayor to sort out, including how to
25 conclusively prevent fraud. I recognize the premium

2 that is being placed on speed, but my preference for
3 this institution would have been for the Council to
4 work these questions out in advance. I do think they
5 can be worked out, though, and I strong agree that
6 documenting the undocumented is an important goal,
7 and I very much hope that this card will satisfy its
8 intended purpose. I will be voting yes, and I look
9 forward to the follow up with the Administration.
10 Thank you.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

12 Council Member Van Bramer.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you

14 very much, Madam Public Advocate, and I too rise to
15 talk about the Municipal ID bill. And before I speak
16 to some of the specific issues, I wanted to
17 congratulate our colleagues, Council Members Dromm
18 and Menchaca for this monumental achievement on
19 behalf of all of the people of the City of New York.
20 And there are so many people who will benefit from
21 this including seniors or transgender community, and
22 the undocumented. And I just want to highlight the
23 importance of our cultural institutions and libraries
24 in this very important endeavor. In partial response
25 to some of the comments, that my good friend Council

2 Member Garodnick just made. One of the ways that I
3 believe this card will become so valuable is because
4 we are working with cultural institutions to make
5 sure that there are some terrific incentives that go
6 along with having this card that would bring
7 increased access to our cultural institutions all
8 across the city. I know we've already had some
9 conversations. They're very receptive to this idea,
10 and I will work very closely with my colleagues on
11 this to make sure that our cultures play an
12 incredibly important part of this.

13 But an access point to cultures all
14 across the city would make this card desirable for
15 everybody in the City of New York. And, of course,
16 our libraries are always access points for virtually
17 everybody in the City of New York. They have an
18 important role to play in making sure that this works
19 as well as I believe it will work. So I want to
20 point the importance of those two incredible sectors,
21 and also pledge my support to make sure that both are
22 coming to the table and making this work for all New
23 Yorkers. So congratulations to everybody for this
24 very, very historic achievement. Thank you very
25 much.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
3 Council Member Williams.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.
5 Today, I have a street renaming in my district for
6 Errol Elijah Duran Aster Millard [phonetic] also
7 known as Prophet, died on Thursday, July 4th 2013 in
8 the City of Shiran in the far off Province of
9 Afghanistan. He was born in Brooklyn on October 5th,
10 1994 to Joanna Millard and Iban Gibson. Elijah was
11 smart and a dynamic man. Elijah was reared and
12 nurtured in a Christian home, and he was especially
13 close to his Great Grandmother Gigi who chronicled
14 his spiritual growth in the family Bible. Her Bible
15 recalls three significant events occurring on
16 Thursdays in Elijah's life. They are Thursday,
17 October 5th at 7:00 p.m. his fourth birthday when he
18 said, I would like Jesus to come into my life.

19 Thursday, April 13th at 9:30 he said,
20 Gigi, I want to be baptized. He was six years old.
21 Thursday, July 4th, he went home to be with the Lord.
22 He was 18 years old. Elijah spent his early years in
23 Brooklyn attend the Bible Speaks Elementary and
24 military-- and Middle School. He loved much in
25 which he played violin. He was active in sports and

2 trained in Shodokan, Karate, Obertan [phonetic],
3 Cobocab [phonetic] in Brooklyn along with his cousin
4 Joline. He competed in various tournaments
5 eventually winning first place in his division.
6 Elijah began active duty in the Army in October 2012.
7 Private El Elijah Duran Aster Millard graduated from
8 Fort Leonard Wood in Missouri. In February, he was
9 deployed from White Sands Missile Range in New Mexico
10 as part of Operation Enduring Freedom.

11 He was assigned to the 595th Sapper
12 Company, Second Engineer Battalion and 36th Engineer
13 Grade. [sic] On a mission with the Zuni on July
14 4th, 2013, Private El Elijah Millard was killed in
15 action in Afghanistan. Private Duran, a Combat
16 Engineer was posthumously promoted from Private B2 to
17 Private First Class, and he was awarded the Bronze
18 Star Medal, the Purple Heart, and the Good Conduct
19 Medal. His other awards and decorations include the
20 Army Service Rating, Overseas Global War on Terrorism
21 Expeditionary, NATO Medal and many more. His White
22 Sands Missile Range Commander Brigadier General Glenn
23 Bingham wanted the family to know that our comrade
24 Errol made a positive different daily with his valued
25

2 service, and the ultimate sacrifice that we will
3 never forget him or his family.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
5 Council Member Rose.

6 **COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you. First
7 I would like to commend Council Members Menchaca and
8 Dromm for their successfully crafting and guiding
9 this bill through the legislative process And thank
10 you to Speaker Mark-Viverito for her leadership in
11 moving this to the floor so swiftly. I am a big
12 proponent of municipal IDs because I've seen first
13 hand how a lack of photo identification can lead to
14 tragic circumstances. A few years ago we witnessed a
15 series of biased attacks within the Mexican community
16 in Port Richmond in my district. Investigations
17 revealed that many of these were crimes of
18 opportunity. Many members of the Mexican immigrant
19 community carry larges amounts of cash on their
20 persons. Working closely with the Mexican Consulate
21 and local banking institutions, we were able to have
22 ID cards issued to the immigrants by the consulate,
23 which could be accepted by the banks. And once
24 people were able to open bank accounts, and stop
25 carrying large amounts of cash, the attacks stopped.

2 So I just want to say that this is not only
3 beneficial to the immigrant community, but it's also
4 beneficial to seniors and to poor New Yorkers who are
5 not able to accumulate the number of points needed to
6 get a New York State non-driver's license. The
7 benefits outweigh the problems that are related to
8 the issuing of these cards. It ensures that people
9 are not also subject to check cashing places, and
10 other predatory services, and that they can access
11 services like all New Yorkers.

12 And I want to say that I have a street
13 naming in my district, Kenneth Cubas Way. Kenneth
14 John -- Ken Cubas was the Vice President at Fiduciary
15 Trust --

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
17 Council Member, could you bring your remarks to a
18 close?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Oh, okay. Sorry.
20 [laughs] Anyway, he was a dutiful son, and he gave
21 his life at the World Trade Center. After having
22 successfully escaped for himself, he went back in
23 numerous times to bring out members of -- His friends
24 and co-workers. He died trying to rescue them after
25 a third time going in so--

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
3 Council Member you can explain during the break.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [interposing] So I
5 am humble and proud --

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
7 Thank you.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: -- about the street
9 naming. Thank you.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
11 Gentile.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: I want to speak
13 about the Municipal ID cards. I'm voting today in
14 support of this legislation because it serves the
15 practical everyday needs of many residents. And
16 hopefully, it will serve, hopefully, as a gateway for
17 those looking to fulfill the dream of becoming an
18 American citizen. America was built on the strength
19 of its immigrants. My mother emigrated from Italy,
20 and it was her dream to become an American citizen
21 and she did. She wanted to be able to fully enjoy
22 all of that, this bountiful and limitless new world
23 had to offer, and she did not want to live in the
24 shadows. So naturally, in support of the immigrants
25 and their rights, and I hope that all immigrants who

2 come to this country have a very strong desire to one
3 day become U.S. citizens. But while there are many
4 things this country could and should do to make new
5 immigrants feel welcome, we must always be mindful
6 not erase the distinction between immigrant and
7 citizen. Rather, we need to encourage immigrants to
8 become citizens through the proper channels and
9 rights of passage just as our ancestors did. And
10 yet, identification documents are critical to
11 performing a wide array of everyday tasks for
12 accessing schools and other city buildings to opening
13 a checking account. Particularly for seniors, many
14 of whom are my constituents and often have access
15 issues without a proper photo ID. This card can be a
16 valuable assist in getting healthcare, picking up
17 grandchildren, possibly opening a bank account,
18 securing a lease, or even helping the senior to get a
19 library card. And this card can be even more useful
20 to get them to other New Yorkers once additional
21 services and benefits become attached to the card
22 over the next year. This aspect of additional
23 benefits is critical to making this truly a card for
24 all. And that with the committed of both co-sponsors
25 that the work in enhancing this card will continue in

2 earnest. So through an application process, we must
3 ensure that only those who truly need or desire this
4 new type of identification be eligible to receive it.
5 It is not a come-one, come-all proposition. Rather,
6 the types of criteria required to gain eligibility
7 such as present a utility bill, a property tax
8 assessment, a statement of a mortgage payment--

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
10 Council Member, could you bring your comments to a
11 close?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Sure. Suggests
13 that by and far that people who already contribute in
14 the form of tax dollars should, therefore, not be
15 stymied from obtaining a beneficial service due lack
16 of a recognized piece of ID. For these and for the
17 fact that the NYPD has made a statement on this bill,
18 I will vote in the affirmative.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
20 Minority Leader Vincent Ignizio.

21 MINORITY LEADER IGNIZIO: Thank you very
22 much, and I welcome my colleagues. I feel like we
23 were just here. I'm proudly wearing U.S. colors
24 because we will be advancing, and thank you, Madam
25 Speaker, for point that out. I wanted to speak about

2 the Municipal I.D. Bill. I understand the good
3 intentions of my colleagues. But the reason why
4 we're here is because of the very failed national
5 immigration policy. I think everyone can agree with
6 that in this room. But the fact that this bill
7 creating a municipal ID has many holes in it with
8 regards to legitimate security concerns, that I feel
9 we all ought to be concerned about.

10 The bill speaks about the identity and
11 residency, proof of identity. And on the bottom of
12 it says, or quote, "Any other documentation that the
13 administering agency deems acceptable." With regards
14 to proof of residency, it talks about some that they
15 could use. And then it goes on to say, "And any other
16 documentation that the administering agency deems
17 acceptable." So we, this Council, are turning over
18 the entire rule making process, the entire law making
19 process to the administration.

20 It then goes on to say that we will
21 destroy that documents that we retain, that we take
22 from those that are seeking it. So, potentially, if
23 we have someone that came here illegally, that
24 created or committed crimes, and we potentially know
25 through that process where that is, we would have to

2 destroy that evidence so we will never be able to
3 trace back to that man or woman that perpetrated that
4 crime. I think that's a mistake.

5 I think the Police Department would and
6 should think that's a mistake, and I hope they would
7 convey that. Of course, we have comparison. Of
8 course we have a responsibility to ensure that people
9 aren't mistreated in this city. But we also have a
10 responsibility to ensure that people much like my
11 colleagues said a moment ago has an immigration
12 status that is consistent with the United States. We
13 want to encourage people to come here legally. There
14 are a countless amount of people around this country,
15 around this world, excuse me, that want to come here
16 legally, and we should encourage that. And we ought
17 to lobby our federal government to ensure that our
18 immigration policy reflects that as well.

19 But I will vote no on this bill because I
20 believe there are legitimate security concerns that
21 have no been adequately addressed in it, and
22 notwithstanding the desire of my colleagues to act in
23 a compassionate manner to ensure that people aren't
24 treated fairly -- unfairly. I think there are ways
25 we can tighten it up, and I think there is a way we

2 should tighten it up. I don't question anybody's
3 motives. I want to be clear.

4 So, too, an issue was raised about
5 putting the veteran status on this. My colleagues
6 raised this that we would put on the bottom of the
7 Municipal ID if the person, he or she was a veteran
8 of the United States. That was dismissed. That
9 wasn't added to this bill. So if somebody went to
10 Home Depot and wanted to get a 10% discount because
11 they're a veteran, the Municipal ID Card, the idea
12 was that it would reflect that on the bottom, this
13 person is a veteran. That's not here. Why? Is that
14 not an easy fix? Is that not something we want to
15 encourage for veterans who served this country to be
16 able to avail themselves of their veteran's rights.
17 That's something that should be fixed, and should
18 this bill pass, which I anticipate it has the ability
19 to do so, this Council should reach out to the Mayor
20 because they gave him full discretion on this bill,
21 and that ask that that be put into the bill. So
22 there is a -- concerns that I have in regards to this
23 bill. That's why I'll be voting no.

24 There is a Council here that seeks to its
25 passage, and I just hope that the rule making ability

2 that we have given over to the administration we're
3 able to engage in to tighten it up, and to ensure
4 that these security concerns are properly addressed.
5 Thank you.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
7 King.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Thank you Madam
9 Public Advocate. I rise today in the spirit of
10 democracy. As we don the strips of the red, white,
11 and blue, and you wear it quite well, Madam Public
12 Advocate, and we're all excited about what's
13 happening on the soccer field. This piece of
14 legislation and the ideas, while I believed it's
15 great in its principle, in its thinking, I am one
16 that is somewhat concerned. In regards to how do we
17 make sure that these IDs are delivered and the people
18 who can misuse them, who can create an environment of
19 deception, that doesn't get hold of being able to do
20 so. My district is considered one of the largest
21 immigration -- immigrant populations and citizens.
22 Now, we work tirelessly to make sure that our
23 brothers and sisters are on the path of citizenship.
24 And I'm urging us to do more as legislators on the
25 local level to address our colleagues at the federal

2 level. To do something that will allow immigration
3 reform to really be substantial. That we can allow
4 all of our brothers and sisters who want to
5 experience the American dream that there is a path to
6 citizenship that's a little more simplified, and it's
7 less challenging than it is today. But I will be
8 offering my support, but I wanted to be put on the
9 record that I do have some concerns in regards to
10 this piece of legislation. But I think it's good in
11 principle, but I think there is more to be done.

12 Secondly, I want to acknowledge Keith Ferguson's
13 family, Sergeant Keith Ferguson Way, which will be
14 established today, as we voted for in this meeting.
15 [sic] He was a police officer who died in the line
16 of duty. He will never be forgotten as we rename the
17 street out there, and blessings to his family. Thank
18 you.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And now for the
20 first time speaking on the floor, Council Member
21 Maisel.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: [applause,
23 cheers] How could you tell. I don't often speak. I
24 didn't speak very much in Albany. I usually felt
25 that people had more important things to say, and

2 could day it better than I did. But I did want to
3 speak about this identification bill. There is
4 nothing in the bill that I oppose. There is nothing
5 in the bill that is wrong. I think everything in the
6 bill is appropriate, and just would solve a lot of
7 problems. But I'm concerned about one thing. When
8 we pass laws, we don't pass laws or write laws to
9 protect people from good government. We are supposed
10 to write laws to protect people from bad government.
11 One of the reasons why I was opposed to Mayoral
12 control, was although I never doubted Mayor
13 Bloomberg's motivation, I always had in the back of
14 my mind the return of Jimmy Walker.

15 So this bill has one defect in it, and if
16 someone can explain and correct me and allay my
17 fears. Right now we have an Administration
18 Washington that's friendly to immigration. What
19 happens two years from now or six years from now when
20 we have an administration that is not friendly to
21 immigrants? When we have a House and a Senate that
22 is not friendly to immigration, and undocumented
23 workers. We are basically presenting and preparing a
24 list of undocumented workers to be presented to
25 whatever authority there is that will be able to just

2 take these people and say, Look, we know you're
3 undocumented. We are deporting you. So, it could
4 very well be that these are fears that are maybe not
5 important, or maybe they're not going to be ever
6 realized. But it is a serious concern that I have.
7 I don't think people should be placing themselves in
8 the position where they could be identified when they
9 are not here legally. And if it could be changed in
10 some way, perhaps I would be willing to support it,
11 but otherwise I'm going to abstain. Thank you.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
13 Council Member Chin.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Than you, Madam
15 Public Advocate. At first, I want to speak on two
16 co-naming that I am co-sponsoring with Council
17 Mendez. The first one is the Dashane Santana, a
18 middle school student that was killed on Delancy and
19 Clinton while crossing the street. And because of
20 her death, her grandmother and people in the
21 community came together, and worked together with
22 their elected official and city agency to make that
23 area safer with countdown clocks and redesign. And
24 this is a great way to remember her. And then the
25 second one is Marie Christopher Way. Marie was such

2 a tenant advocate. I think we heard about her in the
3 City Council when she passed away last year. So I
4 really wanted to thank the City Council for doing
5 this, and I urge my colleagues to support it.

6 On the Municipal ID Bill, the ID is the
7 ID for every single New Yorker. We are proud to be
8 residents of New York City. So I think the ID we
9 will have to encourage everyone to apply. It's not
10 just for undocumented immigrants. There are a lot of
11 seniors. There are a lot of people with green cars
12 that don't have ID because they just don't have
13 enough information to go and get a non-driver's ID.
14 Many of us don't drive. So for us to get a non-
15 driver's ID, we have to have so many forms of
16 documents, and where do you go to get a non-driver's
17 ID? It's very difficult to find. I had a hard time
18 finding the Motor Vehicle place to do it. So I think
19 having a Municipal ID we could send a strong message
20 that New York City is a City that loves all its
21 residents, and we will do everything we can to make
22 sure everyone who wants to apply will be able to
23 apply easily, accessible. Hopefully, there will be
24 offices in every borough, and the card should get us
25 benefits, visits to museums, libraries, cultural

2 institutions. It is a way to show that we are proud
3 to be a New York City resident. So I urge my
4 colleagues to support the bill. Thank you.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
6 Koo.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Madam Public
8 Advocate. I want to congratulate Council Member
9 Menchaca and Dromm for initiating the Municipal ID
10 Bill. I think this is a good bill. It's not a
11 perfect bill. It has many technical things we have
12 to work out, but like Council Member Chin said before
13 the main purpose is only for identification, that
14 they are New York residents. It is not a universal
15 [sic] card. It is not some document they can use for
16 traveling overseas. But for locally it's really good
17 for them. They can get library cards. They can go
18 to museums. They can open bank accounts if we can
19 talk to some banks to arrange that. So I think this
20 is a good bill. There are some details, but we will
21 have to support this. So I vote yes for this bill.
22 And I also want to use this opportunity to welcome
23 two of my lead hands, Sarah Yang and Emma Larsar
24 [phonetic] . If they are here. Can you stand up.
25 [applause]. They have been doing a wonderful job for

2 our office. So thank you very much. And I also want
3 to thank the Speaker for doing a wonderful job for
4 passing the bill this morning. Thank you very much.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
6 Levine.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you, Madam
8 Public Advocate. I'll be proudly voting in support
9 of the Municipal ID Bill, and I want to respond to
10 some of the criticisms that my colleagues have
11 articulated on this thus far. As Council Member Chin
12 spoke about, the existence of driver's licenses in
13 New York does not render this new ID redundant. In
14 fact, New York City is among the localities in
15 America with the lowest rates of driver's license
16 among its residents. Well under 60% among adults,
17 and it's plummeting among young people. That number
18 is trending downward. This at a time when the
19 circumstances in which we need IDs is rapidly
20 proliferating. You need it to get into a public
21 school, to use it to get into many office buildings,
22 in law enforcement encounters. So this provides a
23 solution for the over 40% of adults in New York, a
24 number which is growing, that do not have municipal
25 IDs. As for security concerns, the law enforcement

2 community in New York City and in other localities
3 where such IDs have been implemented have supported
4 this. Why? Because good law enforcement benefits
5 from having IDs for anyone, which law enforcement
6 officials have an encounter. Having identification
7 facilitates law enforcement. And it's why after very
8 substantial negotiations, the NYPD has come on board
9 with this bill. As for the fact that some of the
10 fact that some of the greatest benefits have yet to
11 be implemented related to banking, cultural
12 discounts, integration with library services, mass
13 transit payments. All of those can and will be
14 implemented as we roll out this important service.
15 But there is no reason to delay by a single day the
16 immediate benefit that this new form of ID will offer
17 all New Yorkers of all documentation statuses. I do
18 believe this will be embraced by a wide section of
19 residents--

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

21 Council member, can you bring you comments to a
22 close?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: --of our city.

24 That's why I proudly support the bill. Thank you.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
3 Council Member Constantinides.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Madam
5 Public Advocate. May I be allowed to vote on all
6 items in the general calendar today --

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
8 Yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: -- and
10 explain my vote.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: With
13 congratulations to our speakers and the sponsors of
14 the bill, Danny Dromm and Carlos Menchaca, I proudly
15 vote for Intro 253 today that will be transformative
16 and beneficial to all New Yorkers. Lastly, I will
17 say to Gail Benjamin, you rock, and we definitely
18 appreciate you and what you have given us. I vote
19 aye on all. Thank you.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
21 Council Member Greenfield.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you
23 Madam Public Advocate. You know, the challenge in
24 being an elected official is that actually have to
25 decide things, right. Most people the extent of

2 their decisions perhaps on a daily basis are not
3 necessary weighty. You go into a shop, and you try
4 to decide large Coke, medium Coke, or small Coke.
5 The problem with being an elected official is that
6 people expect you to decide everything, and even when
7 there are complicated issues. And today, it
8 certainly is a complicated issue in terms of
9 Municipal ID, and I share the concerns that some of
10 the members have raised. I think that we could have
11 had some tweaks to the bill. We could have had more
12 robust discussion on the bill, and we certainly could
13 have improvements on the bill.

14 But we in our position as elected
15 official we don't get to vote on perfect legislation
16 normal. We generally get to vote on imperfect
17 legislation and try to figure out the merits of said
18 legislation. And so for me the overwhelming factor
19 is actually on a personal level. There's a small
20 shop in Borough Park, and I shop there frequently.
21 For every Saturday for shabbat obviously I go to the
22 store and I purchase my goods. And there's a young
23 woman who works behind the counter, and after a few
24 weeks she got up the courage to turn to me and she
25 said, Can I ask you a question? I said, Yes. She

2 said you're like a Councilman or something. And I
3 said, Yeah. She said, You know, I need some help
4 with immigration.

5 I'm from Mexico, and I have some issues.
6 She said, You know, between me and you, I'm not
7 exactly legal. I said, Sure. I said, No problem. I
8 said, In my office we happen to have a lawyer. I
9 said, You can come in, and we'll give you those
10 services. And through her, I met some other folks
11 who were affiliated with her. And then one day, I
12 heard from one of her friends that her friend was
13 arrested. Why was her friend arrested? Because he
14 was on his way to work, and he was Mexican as well.
15 He was on his way to work, and he was stopped. And
16 had a piece of paper, some sort of ID -- Just a few
17 more second, Madam Public Advocate -- from the
18 Mexican government, and it had a very common name.

19 So they ran his name through the
20 database. It picked him up, and he was in the system
21 for 48 hours. So they reached out and said, Can you
22 help? I tried. I called the police precinct but the
23 end of the day there really was no quick way to
24 resolve it. And I remember thinking back then it was
25 very frustrating all right. This guy did nothing

2 wrong. He walked down the street. It was mistaken
3 identity, and that's what I think this Municipal ID
4 could, in fact, correct. And to the folks who are
5 worried, I give you this assurance that if, in fact,
6 the Mayor, who supports, and the Police Department
7 who supports it, are not able to have an effective
8 ID, I will stand with you the steps of City Hall and
9 be among the first with you to ask for a repeal. But
10 certainly I think we deserve to try to correct those
11 mistakes and those errors--

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
13 Council Member, please bring your comments to a
14 close.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: --and that's
16 why I support, and thank you very much, Madam Public
17 Advocate.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
19 Council Member Mendez.

20 [Pause]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you. I
22 wanted to talk about three of my street co-namings,
23 two with Margaret, and I'm just going to make it very
24 short. Dashane Santana Way and Marie Christopher
25 Way. Dashane's grandmother out of this very tragic

2 event has become an activist, has joined the
3 Community Board, has become very involved in
4 transportation issues, and housing issues in our
5 city. And Marie Christopher, who was like a mother
6 to me, and Margaret and I knew her way before we ever
7 got into this. She became an activist because she
8 was burnt out of her home, and displaced from Harlem.
9 And to our benefit, she was relocated in the Lower
10 East Side, and fought for all kinds of housing, not
11 just for project based Section 8. But for public
12 housing, and private housing, and she's been very
13 much missed. And I want to thank my colleagues for
14 supporting these three co-namings. Thank you.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
16 Lander.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you, Madam
18 Public Advocate. I am so proud today to be voting in
19 favor to the New York City ID For All Card. And I
20 want to say congratulations to the gentlemen both
21 from Queens and from Brooklyn, Council Member
22 Menchaca, and Dromm and the Speaker. I, too,
23 appreciate the concerns being raised, but I really
24 believe that this bill has the right mix of
25 specificity and flexibility that reflects on the

2 lessons learned from L.A. and Oakland and New Haven
3 where everything is already in place. And it's the
4 right balance between authorizing legislation, which
5 is what we do, and administrative implementation,
6 which is how the city runs. I'm really confident
7 that it will work, and Meg and I look very forward to
8 getting our own NYC ID Cards. Both because of the
9 value that it will hold for all New Yorkers, and as a
10 sign of our progressive patriotism as proud residents
11 of this diverse and welcoming city.

12 I also want to note today that we'll be
13 voting to rename Nevins Street between Flatbush and
14 Livingston after the incomparable organizer and my
15 dear friend Jon Kest. John was taken from us far too
16 young, but not before he had worked together with low
17 income and disenfranchised New Yorkers to accomplish
18 more for justice than most of us can ever dream of.
19 As a leader of ACORN, New York Communities for
20 Change, and the Working Families Party. Jon helped
21 New Yorkers come together, organize to build power,
22 raise their voices, and win incredible victories, for
23 living wage jobs, for affordable housing, for good
24 schools for all our kids. And for better
25 neighborhoods for al New Yorkers regardless of where

2 they come from. Jon has extraordinary living
3 legacies as well like the Fast Food Forward Campaign
4 and the Car Wash Campaign, people who are fighting
5 for justice on initiatives that helped them get
6 started. But this street -- and I want to thank
7 Council Member Levin whose district it's in -- will
8 serve as one more important memory and part of his
9 legacy. I know that today on this day when we're
10 voting for this Municipal ID Card, and when changes
11 in Albany portend an increase in the minimum wage for
12 low wage New Yorkers that Jon is smiling down on us.
13 And I proudly vote aye on all.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
15 Cabrera.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so
17 much, Madam Public Advocate. I want to congratulate
18 our leading sponsor of the bill, Council Member Dromm
19 and Chair Menchaca for your leadership in the
20 Municipal ID. I just want to address some of the
21 things that were brought out regarding the security
22 issues. You know, we only need to look at the other
23 states. The reality is that we're not the first one.
24 And so, we have no heard from any other places where
25 this has been implemented where this has become an

2 issue. I don't know why it is that New York City we
3 always think that we're going to get it worse, that
4 still is going to show up. And that somehow it's
5 going to be worse here. Other states, other cities
6 have the same concerns that we have when it comes to
7 security concerns. And I believe the NYPD is going
8 to do a tremendous job regarding that.

9 Regarding the veterans designation, I
10 want to strongly suggest the option should be given
11 to those veterans that if they want the designation
12 that it should be there. To be honest with you, they
13 have their own badge. They are our heroes. They are
14 our protectors, and having a father and a grandfather
15 who fought in World War II and a father who served in
16 the military I can truly tell you that they truly
17 deserve that.

18 One piece that I would like to add here
19 that I've been a staunch advocate from day one when
20 it comes to this is the banking piece. Because at
21 one point, this card is going to reach its
22 limitation. There are only going to be so many
23 banking institutions that will accept that. I think
24 that the largest -- larger financial institutions
25 like Master Card and Visa that they option will be

2 given for those who want this ID to have that
3 component regardless of if they are documented or
4 undocumented. Because there is an added advantage
5 that it was mentioned by Council Member Rose for
6 people not to carry cash especially that population
7 that's very vulnerable. Thank you very much.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
9 Rodriguez.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: First, I would
11 like to say that I'm supporting one of the streets to
12 commend, Emmett Basset, who was a citywide leader who
13 marched against apartheid, against nuclear weapons,
14 and also who marched for immigrant rights. He's a
15 father, he was father of the Health Commissioner of
16 New York City. But also, I would like to, after
17 listening my colleague, Ignizio, I've been motivated
18 to invite him to join me on calling the Republicans
19 at the Congress level to join the Democrats and fight
20 for immigration reform. I think that since we are a
21 national media, it is important that a Republican and
22 the Congress they should know that there are
23 Republicans in cities such as New York City joining
24 the Democrats calling for immigration reform. I also
25 would like to say that the NYPD has been involved in

2 this conversation of the Municipal ID, and
3 Commissioner Bratton he expressed that he is looking
4 for the passage of this legislation.

5 And lastly, I would like to say that
6 everyone, not only undocumented, to get this ID and,
7 you know, we should know that undocumented contribute
8 with billions of dollars to this city and to this
9 state. No one asked for ID when undocumented go to
10 Marshall or Home Depot or to any store to contribute
11 to the economy of our city. So it is our turn also
12 to pay them back for their contribution that they do
13 in our finance. And I would like also to vote yes,
14 and ask permission to leave.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
18 Kallos.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: The New York City
20 Municipal ID hopes to empower our residents to access
21 services that are currently obstructed by the
22 requirement of government issued identification. I
23 co-sponsored this legislation to remove that hurdle.
24 As the program gets rolled out, I have been promised
25 by my peers and by the Administration, and I plan to

2 act as a guardian to ensure that the City does not
3 require Municipal Identification for any services
4 where identifications not already required to protect
5 individual privacy. To maintain the Municipal
6 Identification as an optional benefit, to protect our
7 residents from a mandatory requirement for Municipal
8 Identification because no American should be forced
9 to carry identification to live here. And to ensure
10 that the Municipal cards can never be used as
11 presented proof of citizen status. I congratulate
12 the Speaker, Council Members Menchaca and Dromm as
13 you move towards a better city, and thank you for
14 your leadership.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

16 Council Member Koslowitz.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Thank you. I
18 want to vote. Permission to vote on all general
19 order, and be excused to explain my vote.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I vote aye on
22 General Orders, and I want to congratulate Gail
23 Benjamin. Thank you for all the years you have
24 served the Council, and thank you for building New
25 York City the way it is now. Thank you so much. And

2 I also want to recognize my intern, Alex Anderson,
3 who is with me. [applause] He's going to be working
4 with me this summer. Thank you.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
6 Council Member Weprin.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Thank you, Madam
8 Public Advocate. Just briefly on the Municipal ID.
9 I was inspired by hearing some of the comments and
10 concerns of my colleagues to just say relax a little
11 bit. Because this bill -- this bill really authorizes
12 us to create an ID card. It doesn't -- I understand
13 all the details aren't worked out, but they will be
14 eventually. And let's be pragmatic here. By making
15 this statement that we think it's really important to
16 have these IDs so people don't have to live in the
17 shadows, we're getting that process moving forward.
18 Many of them have left, but there are a bay of
19 cameras here from across the country that are
20 covering this story.

21 And we're making a statement, and what's
22 that statement? It's that we live in the coolest
23 city in the world, right? And now we're going to
24 have a membership card, and people are going to want
25 to be part of that club. And the people who live

2 here are going to want one of these cards because
3 they want to be part of New York City, the style and
4 life, and that's what we're going to have. So I
5 think a lot of these concerns about -- You know, the
6 last time I checked, we had a pretty good
7 relationship with the guy across the hall, and we're
8 gong to be working with him on the details. So we'll
9 work that out.

10 We wanted to make a statement here today
11 that some of the people like David Greenfield
12 described who we meet everyday. New Yorkers deal
13 with people who are undocumented everyday of the
14 week, whether they realize it or not or want to admit
15 it or not. They're working in their restaurants, and
16 their stores and paying taxes themselves. And they
17 need to be able to live their lives and raise their
18 family just like the rest of us. So I'm voting for
19 this bill, and I just wanted my colleagues to know
20 that I think that, yeah, let's just relax a little
21 bit. I think some of these fears are unwarranted,
22 but we're going to work together to make sure that
23 they're addressed. Thank you.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
25 Crowley.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Thank you Madam
3 Public Advocate. If I could have permission to vote
4 on all calendar items?

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I vote aye. I
7 support the Municipal ID Bill, and like my colleague,
8 Council Member Weprin said, I, too believe we do live
9 in the coolest city in the world, and that we should
10 have the right to have Municipal ID for all New York
11 City residents. Thank you.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And the last
13 speaker on the General Order Calendar, Council Member
14 Torres.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: So, I want to
16 congratulate the sponsors of Intro 253, Council
17 Member Danny Dromm and Council Member Carlos
18 Menchaca, two members whom I deeply admire, and I
19 consider them among the finest advocates for
20 immigrants in our city. So the city is lucky to have
21 the both of you. Just one point. I find the
22 criticisms about the lack of detail in the bill to be
23 odd. If we were to craft a bill and micromanaged its
24 implementation I believe that would be curtailment.
25 So I think the bill is appropriately flexible and

2 broad, as legislation should be. And I note the
3 conversation has largely been centered around 253 as
4 an immigration bill, but so many of the actions in
5 which we engage require multiple forms of
6 identification. When I was applying for an
7 apartment, I had to submit multiple forms -- proofs
8 of residence. And I feel this would be a convenience
9 that would benefit everyone not only immigrants in
10 our city. But the final point is that this
11 fundamentally a debate about equality. We cannot
12 claim to be an equal city when there is a part of our
13 population that does not have equal access to city
14 services. And when it comes to access to city
15 services, this bill will bridge a morally untenable
16 gap between the tale of two cities. So I'm a
17 wholehearted supporter, and again I want to
18 congratulate the Speaker and Council Member Menchaca
19 and Council Member Dromm for making history.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Seeing no other
21 speakers, on General Orders, Report of Special
22 Committees.

23 CLERK: None.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports of
25 Standing Committees?

1 STATED MEETING

78

2 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
3 Immigration, Intro 253-A, New York City Identify Card
4 Program.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And are getting
6 coupled on General Order.

7 CLERK: General Order Calendar. LU 62
8 and Res 0330 through LU 64 and Res 0332 Zoning
9 Amendment

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
11 General Order.

12 CLERK: LU 65 and Res 0333 UDAAP in
13 Manhattan.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
15 General Order.

16 CLERK: LU 71 and Res 0334 Property Tax
17 Exemption.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
19 General Order.

20 CLERK: LU 72 and Res 0335 UDAPP
21 Brooklyn.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled to be
23 filed pursuant to order of withdrawal.

24 CLERK: LU 75 and RES 0336 UDAAP
25 Manhattan.

1 STATED MEETING

80

2 CLERK: Resolution Appointing various
3 persons commissioner of deeds.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
5 General Order, and would now ask for a roll on all
6 items on the General Order Calendar.

7 CLERK: Arroyo.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO:

9 CLERK: Barron.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye, with the
11 exception of Land Use 88.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Could you repeat
13 your vote, Council Member?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye on all except
15 Land Use 88.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
17 You're abstaining on the land use?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

20 Roll call.

21 CLERK: Cabrera.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye.

23 CLERK: Chin.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Permission to
25 explain my vote?

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: First of all, I
4 want to thank -- say a big thank you to Gail Benjamin
5 for all her guidance and support, and all the new
6 work that we did in the last during District 1. And
7 I also want to congratulate my colleagues, Council
8 Member Dromm and Menchaca, and our Speaker for the
9 Municipal ID Legislation, and I also wanted to
10 welcome a group of my summer interns, Allen Kildare
11 [phonetic], Abe Zinger, Alice Yang, Christine Well,
12 Jessica Chang, Juan Wang, Ashula Rouse [phonetic],
13 Taylor Banning, and Amika Summer. I was very proud
14 of the summer, but welcome, and I proudly vote aye on
15 all. Thank you.

16 CLERK: Cohen.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

18 CLERK: Cornegy.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye on all.

20 CLERK: Cumbo.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Aye.

22 CLERK: Deutsch.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye.

24 CLERK: Dickens.

1 STATED MEETING

82

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Permission to
3 explain my vote.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: I want to say
6 thank you to Gail Benjamin who is probably the
7 smartest woman, or the smartest person that I have
8 met when it comes to New York City land use. I'm
9 going to miss her, and I'm definitely going to miss
10 the institutional knowledge and information that she
11 has shared with all of us. I want to congratulate my
12 colleagues Council Members Dromm and Menchaca and to
13 the Speaker, and I vote aye on all and may everyone
14 have a wonderful summer.

15 CLERK: Dromm.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye on all

17 CLERK: Espinal.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Permission to
19 explain my vote.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Thank you. I
22 just want to talk about a street renaming happening
23 in my district. On behalf of Monsignor John Peyton.
24 He was a pastor in my district for over 25 years, but
25 he did not only serve the people of his parish. He

2 was a dedicated active community leader in East New
3 York. He was responsible for many social programs
4 like soup kitchens, adult literacy classes, and the
5 youth center. And he is the reason I stand here today
6 as a City Councilman. Actually, many years ago when
7 I graduated college, he called me and told me a local
8 politician was looking for an aid in his office, and
9 I rose to the opportunity and took that job. He did
10 pass away three months later. Unfortunately, he did
11 not get to see me elected, but I just want to say
12 Monsignor John Peyton rest in peace and thank you for
13 everything you done for me.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: How do you vote?

15 [Pause]

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: How do you vote?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: I vote aye.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

19 CLERK: Eugene.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.

21 CLERK: Ferreras.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: [off mic]

23 CLERK: Garodnick.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GAROLDNICK: Aye.

25 CLERK: Gentile.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye.

3 CLERK: Gibson.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to
5 explain my vote.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you, Madam
8 Public Advocate. I want to speak on one of the
9 street renamings in Intro 388. It is the renaming of
10 the Nelson Avenue between 167 and 168 in the
11 Highbridge Community. After Bishop Wenzell P.
12 Jackson, who was a good friend of mine, a father
13 figure. And he was the Chair of the Bronx Community
14 Board 4, the Vice Chair of the 44th Precinct Council.
15 He was Chair and Founder of the Highbridge Clergy
16 Coalition, and he was Senior Pastor of the Mount
17 Herman Baptist Church. He left a mark on our
18 community. He was also a part of a group that
19 founded the first middle school in the Highbridge
20 community that has a green roof. And we are so
21 excited that last September that opened to 400 middle
22 school students. He was someone who stood so tall
23 for equality and just for so many people, and I am so
24 honored to still be a friend to the Mount Herman
25 Family, his wife of 24 years, First Lady Tamal

2 Jackson, and the entire Mount Herman Baptist Family.
3 I'm so honored to be a member of this Council to
4 introduce this bill to rename a street so that
5 forever we remember Bishop Wendell Jackson.

6 And in addition, I would just like to
7 offer my strong support for Intro 253, the New York
8 City Municipal ID Program. Certainly this is a wise
9 investment to ensure that all New Yorkers have access
10 to obtain an identification card and access to these
11 services like libraries and museums, banking
12 institutions, and many other critical human services.
13 Many of my residents in the Bronx will significantly
14 benefit from this. I believe this is a great step of
15 progress in the right direction to address many of
16 the challenges facing many New Yorkers.

17 I also urge my colleagues as we work in
18 full implementation and rollout to focus on education
19 and communication. This is the largest city in the
20 nation, and we want to make sure we do this right and
21 serve as a model for others. I want to thank my
22 distinguished colleagues Council Members Dromm and
23 Menchaca for their leadership as well as our Speaker,
24 and I will be voting aye on all.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

2 CLERK: Greenfield.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you.

4 May I explain my vote, please?

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you.

7 I'm very excited today about the co-naming that I
8 will put in for Rabbi Michael Ber Weissmandl to rename
9 a portion of 50th Street between 14th and 15th Avenue
10 in honor of his memory. Rabbi Weissmandl was born in
11 Hungary in a very small town. He lived his life as a
12 prominent Rabbi, and then when the Nazis came he
13 dedicated his life to saving lives. He created a
14 working group. He went from country to country, and
15 did everything that they could. They pled, the
16 bribed, they threatened, and together they literally
17 saved hundreds of thousands of lives.

18 It was his plan, in fact, which was the
19 plan that would have had the United States on the
20 railways to Auschwitz. It made its way to the
21 President's desk. Unfortunately, the President did
22 not see fit to do so. He reached folks like FDR and
23 Winston Churchill and Pope Pius, and the Archbishop
24 of Canterbury. He was an unassuming man. He was
25 actually on the trains himself to a death camp, and he

2 managed to escape by breaking a lock open with a wire
3 that he had hidden in a loaf of bread. Unfortunately,
4 his family was surrounded and they did not manage to
5 escape. His family had died. When he came to the United
6 States of America, there are reports that he would walk
7 around banging his head on the wall at the inability to
8 save his own family while saving others.

9 But he realized that he had to move on. He
10 remarried. He built a family. He created many
11 congregations, and the renown Shiva called the Knights
12 for Shiva [sic]. And, in fact, one of those
13 congregations is currently on 50th Street between 14th
14 and 15th Avenue, which will be renamed in his honor.

15 In my final seconds, I just want to once
16 again acknowledge and thank Gail Benjamin for her
17 outstanding leadership and work service, three decades of
18 being the Land Use guru for not just the New York City
19 Council, but for the City of New York. She is a person
20 of great integrity and her and her knowledge will be
21 sorely missed. Thank you very much.

22 PRESIDENT JAMES: How do you vote?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I'm going to
24 go with aye.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

2 CLERK: Johnson.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Permission to
4 explain my vote.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you Madam
7 Public Advocate for the opportunity to share my
8 support today for Clinton Urban Renewal Area Site 7,
9 Land Use Item 62 to 65. This project will bring two
10 new buildings, approximately 508 units, 184 to be
11 affordable. That is 39% affordability, 39%
12 affordable housing. And it will come with units from
13 80% to 100% to 130% of area meeting an income; 165%.
14 It is a true mixed-income development. Every unit
15 regardless of the market are affordable. They have
16 the same fixtures, the same finishes so that none of
17 the units are different throughout these buildings.

18 It achieves 82% of distribution so that
19 affordable units are not segregated on certain floors
20 in these buildings. This project will support three
21 new community gardens, 7,000 square feet of new open
22 space. It's going to join network gardens, in-house
23 kitchen operated by the Clinton Housing Land Trust.
24 I'm grateful to Taconic Whitterman [phonetic]
25 Developer for a \$200,000 contribution to this land

2 trust to support Dawiccaland [phonetic] Park, an
3 important park in the district. This development
4 should set a new standard for how developers look at
5 the community and the city to achieve high rates of
6 distribution and permanent affordability.

7 Thank you again for letting me comment,
8 and I want to just finish by saying this was one of
9 the, I think final things that Gail Benjamin really
10 put her mark on, worked on, worked with my office on,
11 worked with all of the advocates and the community
12 board on. I spent 8-1/2 years on a community board
13 on the West Side of Manhattan. I chaired a land use
14 committee. Gail Benjamin is invaluable. It is a
15 real loss for the Council, and I'm excited for her,
16 and I just give my deepest gratitude and thank for
17 her tremendous service to the City Council and City
18 of New York. Thank you very much.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Quiet
20 in the Chambers, please.

21 CLERK: Kallos.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Permission to
23 explain my vote?

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.
25

1 STATED MEETING

90

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I would like to
3 take a brief moment to acknowledge that Taylor Digby.
4 She's my Senior Fellow and Director of Human
5 Services. I want to thank her for her service, and I
6 also want to take a moment to thank Gail Benjamin for
7 her decades for service to the people of the City of
8 New York and I vote aye on all.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

10 CLERK: King.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: King.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: I will vote aye on
13 all, and I just wanted to thank my new intern Sabrina
14 Guzman [phonetic] joining us for the first time in
15 the Council Chambers.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

17 CLERK: Koo.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I vote aye on all,
19 and I also want to wish Gail Benjamin a happy
20 retirement, and I want to wish everyone that you have
21 a good summer. Thank you.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

23 CLERK: Lancman.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye on all.

25 CLERK: Lander.

1 STATED MEETING

91

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I vote aye.

3 CLERK: Levin.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to
5 explain my vote.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you, Madam
8 Public Advocate. My colleagues I want to thank and
9 acknowledge Council Members Dromm and Menchaca for
10 their work in passing this bill, and for crafting
11 this bill for Municipal ID because it is going to
12 have a great benefit to countless New Yorkers and
13 change people's lives, and change our city. And it
14 shows that we as New York can be the progressive
15 leaders that we know that we are in this country. I
16 want to take a moment to thank Council Member Brad
17 Lander on working to establish Jon Kest Way on Nevins
18 Street between Flatbush and Livingston. We are
19 honored to be able to do this in honor of a
20 tremendous and compassionate individual.

21 Jon Kest is a great inspiration to many
22 of us, and I'd like to think that one important part
23 of Jon's legacy is where we all are today here in New
24 York City in this Council and working with Mayor de
25 Blasio on -- and rally working for the people of New

2 York City. And working for working people, and
3 making sure that we have a fair city, and a city that
4 lives up to our ideals. And Jon was such a big part
5 of that, and this is -- I like to think that the work
6 that we're doing today, is really part of his legacy.

7 And lastly, I want to acknowledge the
8 great work of Gail Benjamin, and all the great things
9 that she's done for me personally both in my role as
10 a Council Member and my role as the former Chair of
11 the Subcommittee of Dispositions and Concessions.
12 Gail was always there for me to offer wise and sage
13 advice, and to tell me when I was doing things wrong,
14 and tell me when I was doing things right. And I
15 will miss her very much. Thank you, Gail.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: How do you vote?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I vote aye on all.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

19 CLERK: Levine.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you. I
21 want to say a word about Land Use Item 87, which is
22 in my district on 106th Street between Columbus and
23 Amsterdam. This would actually down zone, lower the
24 height and density allowable on this block bringing
25 it in line with a previous down zoning of a broader

2 neighborhood of the Northern Upper West Side. Until
3 six months ago, this area was in the district of then
4 Council Member Melissa Mark-Viverito. And I want to
5 acknowledge that she worked tirelessly, and
6 effectively for more than four years to navigate what
7 was a very complicated political and economic and
8 community issue. And I'm happy to be building on her
9 work today in the Council.

10 I also want to say a word about a Land
11 Use Item up for consideration in my district, which
12 would rename the corner of 121st Street and Broadway
13 in honor of the great George Carlin who grew up on
14 that block. He was not only a world famous
15 entertainer, actor, and comic, but he was also a
16 groundbreaking and influential voice for the
17 principle of expression in the arts. And that's why
18 I'm so pleased that we're going to be honoring him in
19 this important way. And I want to acknowledge local
20 activist Kevin Bartini [sp?], who has worked for
21 years to build a coalition unlike any other I've seen
22 organization for a street naming. And deserves a
23 world of credit on bringing us to this day. Thank
24 you.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And your vote.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: And I'll be
3 proudly voting aye on all.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 CLERK: Maisel.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: I'm going to
7 abstain on Intro 253-A and aye on the rest.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

9 CLERK: Matteo.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: No, on Intro 253-
11 A. Aye on the rest.

12 PRESIDENT JAMES: Thank you.

13 CLERK: Mealy.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [off mic]

15 CLERK: Menchaca.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to
17 explain my vote.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you,
20 Public Advocate, and I really want to thank my
21 colleagues today for many of these conversations
22 we've been having for weeks and months. And so I
23 continue to encourage you to engage both Council
24 Member Dromm and I as we move forward to really
25 perfect what we think is an incredible opportunity

2 for this city. Thank you for all those that are in
3 support of this, and I really want to dedicate this
4 vote to the entire coalition of organizations that
5 have been fighting for this and more. As we continue
6 to move through our legislative victories in this
7 Council, that coalition has been strong. They have
8 been meeting with us day in and day out at all hours
9 of the day. And so to them, I dedicate this vote.

10 [Speaking Spanish] I vote aye on all.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

12 CLERK: Mendez.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Permission to
14 explain my vote.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: So first, I want
17 to start off by saying while we're ending this
18 legislative session now in June, we're also coming to
19 the end of Gay Pride Month. I want to wish everyone
20 a happy pride, and ask everyone to march with us on
21 Sunday on the parade. And we have the largest LGBT
22 delegation in this Council now with six members, and
23 we'd be proud to have all the other member march with
24 us on Sunday. And I speak about this also to talk
25 about the Municipal ID bill. It just does not help.

2 I mean it helps immigrants, but it also helps the
3 LGBT community. Today, here, my Brian Allicotte
4 [phonetic] is sitting up there. And this would allow
5 him to get his ID, and to self identify as the man
6 that we know that he is. And, that will be a very
7 good moment for all of us. And for so many of the
8 transgenders who have been going through this
9 problem, and want to self-identify and have the
10 identification adequately say who they are and what
11 they feel. So I proudly vote aye on this bill, and
12 thank my colleagues Danny Dromm and Carlos Menchaca
13 for bringing this bill to the floor. And I also want
14 to say my kudos to Gail Benjamin. She has been an
15 incredible for here. I met here in 2000, and she's
16 been a friend and ally and helped me through lots of
17 land use issues. I will miss you. And I also to
18 thank the Controller Scott Stringer. I understand he
19 signed checks in the Central Park Five. We can make
20 that part of history, and put that behind us. Thank
21 you very much, and I vote aye on all. [applause,
22 cheers]

23 CLERK: Miller.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I would listen
25 to-- I would also like to echo the sentiments of

2 Gail Benjamin leaving. She's been stalwart, and very
3 helpful during my brief period of time here in the
4 Council, and she will be sorely missed. I also want
5 to talk about the -- I want to thank the Speaker for
6 her leadership, and the other leaders within the
7 Council here for making my transition here, my first
8 year a smooth and successful year. I thank you very
9 much for that. I would also like to thank my team --
10 Team Miller for the work that they have done.
11 Obviously, Joe Goldblum, Ali Dasumanejad [phonetic]
12 and my interns Jay and Jim, and I'm leaving someone
13 out and that would be Sammy Henson, and I vote aye on
14 all. Thank you.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

16 CLERK: Reynoso.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Permission to
18 explain my vote.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I'd like to just
21 say that I'm extremely grateful for today living in
22 the greatest city in the world where we actually get
23 things done unlike our counterparts in the federal
24 government and in the state at times. When we live
25 in a country where in some places it's easier to get

2 a gun than it is to get an ID, I think we're doing it
3 the wrong way. I call on my Republican colleagues to
4 co-lead or co-sponsor a resolution to call on
5 immigration reform in the federal government. I hope
6 that they can sponsor with me. And I want to
7 congratulate Council Member Danny Dromm for the great
8 work that he's done in leading this push for the last
9 five years. And to the first Mexican-American
10 elected to office in this state. You truly are a
11 super star, and you're my brother, and, of course, I
12 proudly vote aye. [Speaking Spanish] [laughter]

13 CLERK: Richards.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye on all.

15 CLERK: Rose.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

17 CLERK: Rosenthal.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Permission to
19 explain my vote in Spanish.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: All right,
22 here it goes.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Here it goes.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: And --

1 STATED MEETING

99

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: You only have
3 three minutes.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [Speaking
5 Spanish] [applause, cheers] My district and I are
6 very much looking forward to applying for a Municipal
7 ID.

8 CLERK: Torres.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Wow, Helen, you
10 speak better Spanish than I do. I want to commend
11 Gail Benjamin actually. When I joined the Land Use
12 Committee hearing, I pointed out that Gail was two
13 when she started her career in her City Council. I
14 was two when she started. So someone is getting old.
15 I'm getting old. But I was two when Gail began her
16 career in the City Council, and I admire the length
17 and the quality of your service here, and it's an
18 example for all of us. And I thank you for
19 everything you have done. The city has benefitted
20 from your institutional memory and this body as well.
21 And I, too, look forward to the moment when I get a
22 Municipal ID. I proudly vote aye.

23 CLERK: Treyger.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to
25 explain my vote.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: When I was a
4 teacher, there was a learning environment survey that
5 we asked parents to return. And the number one group
6 that we had difficulties with getting them back were
7 immigrants because-- And I think Council Member
8 Dromm could agree with that, and others here as well.
9 And the fear was about who will see this information?
10 Where does it go? And this would count against
11 schools not getting a high number of them returned.
12 And I had to go to the painstaking effort of making
13 phone calls, meeting with parents to ensure them that
14 this information would not be used in any way against
15 them. There was nothing on there that could be used
16 against them, anyway. I truly commend and have much
17 respect for my colleagues, Council Member Menchaca,
18 Council Member Dromm. I believe that this is an
19 absolute. The concept is phenomenal. I believe that
20 we need a New York City card. We need a discount
21 card to the culturals, and I can see great potential
22 in this.

23 But the concerns raised by Council Member
24 Maisel are the ones I share as well. For two years,
25 information will be stored in the database, and in

2 two years we'll probably have a new president. And I
3 am concerned that we might be inadvertently
4 unintentionally creating a database that a future
5 president that might not be as friendly to immigrants
6 as our current one is. To look to this to be a
7 database tool to shift through to harass and
8 intimidate immigrant communities. And that is why I
9 look forward to working with my Council colleagues
10 and the Administration to make sure that we correct
11 this potentially fatal flaw.

12 Because immigrants -- those colleagues
13 raised the concerns that-- security concerns that
14 potential criminals could abuse. Immigrants are not
15 criminals. They are the fabric of our city, of our
16 nation. They built this country. But I feel
17 compelled today to abstain until we resolve this
18 potentially fatal flaw that could be used to
19 potentially hurt our immigrant brothers and sisters.
20 So I'm going to abstain on Intro 253-A, and I vote
21 aye on the rest. Thank you.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

23 CLERK: Ulrich.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Permission to
25 explain my vote.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, sir.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Madam Public
4 Advocate, I have the utmost respect for my two
5 friends and colleagues who are the prime sponsors of
6 Intro 253-A, and I share their passion, and their
7 commitment to fighting for comprehensive immigration
8 reform because I believe it is desperately needed.
9 And as it was said previously, I think that
10 Washington has failed not only our city, but our
11 country--

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Excuse me Council
13 Member. Can we have quiet in the Chambers, please.

14 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet in the Chambers,
15 please.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: --in not passing
17 comprehensive immigration reform at the federal
18 level. But I want to identify myself with the
19 comments made by my colleague Council Member
20 Garodnick, and also to a larger extent, Council
21 Member Maisel. I fear that the immigrants that I
22 represent, and the immigrants in our city because of
23 this bill and because of the Municipal ID Card
24 potentially could be lulled into a false sense of
25 security. And that one day when the political tides

2 turn, because it is a pendulum that swings both ways,
3 that immigrants might be targeted because we are
4 collecting this information from them.

5 I'm also disappointed because I had
6 expressed a willingness to support this measure and
7 this bill, and I wanted to see other components
8 included in the final measure including as the
9 Minority Leader mentioned a veteran component. The
10 fact that we allow veterans to identify themselves on
11 a New York State driver's license or a New York State
12 identification card, and we're not doing that here is
13 a disservice to our veterans. It's also
14 disrespectful to our veterans. The fact that an
15 undocumented person in our city can get a Muni ID
16 card and get a discounted at the museum, but a
17 veteran and an American citizen has to pay full price
18 if they don't have that identification because quite
19 frankly they think that they don't need one is also a
20 disservice to those individuals. So I hate to say
21 that I let the perfect be the enemy of the good here,
22 but that is, in fact, the case. So I am respectfully
23 voting no on Intro 253-A and aye on the rest. Thank
24 you.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

2 CLERK: Weprin.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Madam, I'd like
4 to explain my vote in Korean.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Okay, I don't
7 speak Korean. Otherwise, I would like to, though.
8 [laughter] No, just briefly. I would be remiss if I
9 didn't mention Gail Benjamin also. Gail is the most
10 knowledgeable person I've met in government. It's a
11 lot of people I'm putting her in the class with, and
12 she is someone we are going to miss tremendously
13 because she has a historical perspective that no one
14 else does, and is knowledgeable on so many aspects of
15 this. And I said the other day that one of the
16 things that is so great about her is that she never
17 acts like she's better than you are, she just is
18 better than you are, [laughter] and I think that's
19 true. So that in mind [Speaks Korean] and I vote
20 aye.

21 CLERK: Williams.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Madam, please
23 excuse my vote.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.
25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.

3 First, I do want to say thank you to our Mayor and
4 our Speaker, who are the fabulous teacher, [sic] for
5 providing leadership on this in making the Municipal
6 IDs an issue that was a priority. And, of course,
7 congratulations to Council Members Dromm and Menchaca
8 for this landmark legislation. I, too, like many of
9 my colleagues have some big concerns about how much
10 is left after this bill is passed. I know that we
11 can't. We can't legislate every eventuality. But I
12 wish there were more public statements on three
13 categories: The weighting of what you have to submit
14 to provide who you are area, that the NYPD is going
15 to do with the data, which I know hopefully we'll be
16 seeing quarterly.

17 And most importantly, the incentives that
18 will be made so that people like me and others, who
19 want to get one, will get one. I think that a lot of
20 these things could have been worked out a little more
21 before it was brought to the floor. But it wasn't,
22 and today I'm forced into what is basically a kind of
23 binary choice that has to be made. And so, for my
24 parents who came here as immigrants and now are
25 citizens, but for my brother who is blood who could

2 not go to his mother's funeral because he was
3 undocumented. I'm going to vote to support what I
4 believe is the authorization to create this ID on
5 faith that we will correct a lot of the issues, and
6 really make sure that this is not dangerous those who
7 are actually getting it.

8 Because if we don't, I believe that we
9 will be endangering some people. And if we don't fix
10 those three categories and make it plain, I believe
11 we will not be doing what we achieved to do. And I
12 will be one of the people leading the charge to
13 retract this, and make sure that it doesn't go any
14 further. So I am concerned about these things, but
15 again, I'm going to vote aye with the hope that the
16 final product when it comes out will have addressed
17 these things. So, I'd like to vote aye on all with
18 the exception of L Use -- Land Use 88, and I want to
19 say congratulations to Gail Benjamin.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
21 Council Member, on Land Use 88, you're voting no or
22 you're abstaining on Land Use 88?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Sorry. I'm
24 abstaining.

25 CLERK: Ignizio.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: I would just
3 like to vote no on 253-A and aye on all others, and I
4 wish Gail Benjamin, a woman I've known for 17 years,
5 a great retirement. When I first came in, Gail
6 taught me the ropes like she taught so many of us,
7 and always helped us. I had more hair. It was
8 blacker. She looks just as beautiful, and I'm sure
9 she's going to enjoy her retirement. I wish her
10 well, and to all my colleagues who effectively are
11 going on recess, I wish you a very good summer. And
12 I see that staff is really happy that we're getting
13 out of town. I just want to be honest with
14 everybody. Thank you all and have a good summer
15 until I see you a couple of weeks.

16 CLERK: Van Bramer.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye on all.

18 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic]

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: As we await the
21 results, let's congratulate Council Member Richards
22 on his upcoming marriage, and Gail Brewer on his
23 retirement. All items--

24

25

1 STATED MEETING

108

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I've been --
3 wait, wait, wait, wait. I've been married three
4 years. No controversy here.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughs] Miller.
6 I'm sorry. Miller. I'm sorry.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Oddo is getting
8 married?

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughs] All
10 items on today's General Order Calendar were adopted
11 by a vote of 48 in the affirmative, zero negative,
12 and zero abstentions with the exception of Intro 253-
13 A, which was adopted by a vote of 43 in affirmative,
14 three in the negative, two abstentions. Land Use
15 Call-ups -- Land Use, LU 88 and Res 0342, which was
16 adopted by a vote of 46 in the affirmative, zero
17 negative, two abstentions. Congratulations Council
18 Member Miller. Closing remarks from Speaker Melissa
19 Mark-Viverito.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you again,
21 Madam Public Advocate. Again, this is a really -- I
22 think Council Member Inez Barron had something to
23 say.

24 [Pause]

25

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
3 Inez --

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: General
5 discussion.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

7 Introduction and Reading of Bills. Discussion of the
8 Resolutions. None. Resolutions: None. General
9 Discussion: Council Member Gibson.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you very
11 much, Madam Public Advocate. Let me take a quick
12 opportunity. Earlier when we voted on the budget, I
13 neglected to acknowledge several people.
14 Unfortunately, my speech was cut short, colleagues.
15 I'm sorry for that. But I do want to thank again--
16 This has been exciting journey for me as someone who
17 worked in Albany for many years starting out as an
18 intern and now coming to this body and working some
19 incredible public servants. It's been an honor, and
20 a true blessing. And I want to thank our Mayor Bill
21 de Blasio, and our Speaker, and the entire Finance
22 Team that I recognized yesterday. But I also want to
23 recognize Latanya McKinney [phonetic], as well as
24 Tanisha Edwards, and my folks Ellen Ang, Regina Ryan,
25 and Isha Wright for all of their work. And I do this

2 as a team. I cannot forget my incredible Budget
3 Director Martin Munoz, who is here with me everyday,
4 as well as my Communications Director, Jamie Gilkey
5 [phonetic]. It has truly been a pleasure working
6 day-to-day with all of you, and now as we embark on
7 this summer season, I want to wish each and every one
8 of you a wonderful and blessed summer season. And to
9 Gail Benjamim, who has made an incredible mark on
10 this Council. Gail, you have been a footprint in the
11 City Council, and you are irreplaceable, and we truly
12 thank you for your dedication, your integrity, your
13 commitment, your character, and your investment in
14 the City of New York. We're going to miss you. But
15 we're going to follow in your foot steps, and
16 continue to create sound development in his City of
17 New York that provides equity for all of our New
18 Yorkers. And with that, I want to thank everyone
19 again for just allowing me to be a part of this City
20 Council family. I've really, really appreciated each
21 and everyone of you, my brothers and sisters. Thank
22 you so much. God bless you all, and congratulations
23 again to Council Members Menchaca and Dromm on this
24 monumental legislation. Thank you again.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet. Quiet in
3 the Chambers, please. Council Member Barron.

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARM: Quiet, please.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Madam
6 Public Advocate. I'll be brief. I just want to say
7 that last night as I commended this body for
8 presenting a budget that for the first time had an
9 equitable distribution of the funds that we were able
10 to allocate. I forget to commend the Finance Team,
11 my staff, and my interns as well for helping guide me
12 through the process. And I forgot to acknowledge the
13 trailblazers who talked about reform in the City
14 Council. So I want to make sure that it goes on the
15 record that first to my City Council that was headed
16 by Council Member Charles Barren, Allen Jennings, and
17 a group of about 20 other Council members. Thank
18 them for their leadership in that regard.

19 I want to add my comments of appreciation
20 and thanks to Gail Benjamin as she goes forward in
21 her retirement. To the sponsors of the immigration
22 card, I want to commend you. And I want to say this
23 is a card that will also benefit people who need
24 services such as you and senior and homeless. So we
25 want to appreciate the fact that they're working in

2 that regard. And as has already been mentioned,
3 thank you. Last night, I talked about the fact that
4 the Comptroller was dragging his feet. As has been
5 said, he has signed that settlement, and there will
6 be a press conference on the steps of City Hall
7 tomorrow at 1:00, and you are all invited to be
8 there. Thank you.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
10 King.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Thank you. The
12 DLAC 15-minute meeting inside the Committee Room, and
13 happy summer to everyone. Thank you.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
15 Williams.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you. I,
17 just, too, wanted to make sure I make mention on the
18 record. I thank all those who worked to help Central
19 Park Five get this settlement. I thank the Mayor for
20 pushing it through, and thank you, for the
21 Comptroller Scott Stringer for signing it.
22 Hopefully, we can get this chapter behind us. I know
23 what happened to the young lady was a travesty. I
24 also remember what I felt like as a young Black male
25 in this city during that time, opening papers and

2 seeing people like me being called wolf packs and
3 wilding. And so, I would say hopefully we can move
4 this chapter behind us. And I do want to ask Mr.
5 Donald Trump, if you're not going to apologize for
6 your stupidity 25 years ago, please shut up now.
7 Thank you.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
9 Gentile.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Just quickly.
11 Illegal building conversions are just that, illegal.
12 So I ask you to look and review Intro 393. It is a
13 bill that I'm introducing that would allow DOB to
14 issue violations for illegal conversions based on
15 observable evidence. Like rebuttable presumption,
16 but observable evidence. So please review, and co-
17 sponsor Intro 393.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
19 Cumbo.

20 [Pause]

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
22 Cornegy.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Thank you, Madam
24 Public Advocate. I just wanted to invite my
25 colleagues out this Saturday to my district. We will

2 be celebrating the 25th anniversary of Spike Les's Do
3 the Right Thing with a huge block party and street
4 co-naming, which actually had to go through the
5 Mayor's Office. I didn't realize that through the
6 City Council you can't co-name an event, but a
7 person. So please join me from 12:00 to 6:00 on
8 Stuyvesant between Quincy and Lexington to celebrate
9 the 25th Anniversary of Do the Right Thing.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
11 Rose.

12 [background comment]

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
14 Rose.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I just want to say
16 to Gail Benjamin, thank you for helping us get the
17 biggest thing that happened to Staten Island, the Big
18 Wheel, and I wish you all the best. Thank you.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
20 Lander.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Well, I do want
22 to congratulate Council Member Levine on George
23 Carlin Way. I do want to object that his speech in
24 nomination was wholly inadequate and insufficiently
25 offensive. And I just want to officially record that

2 we miss Jimmy Oddo, who I believe is the only council
3 member in my tenure who could have respectfully paid
4 sufficient tribute to George Carlin.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
6 Ulrich.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Very quick, Madam
8 Public Advocate. I should have brought this up
9 during the introduction of bills, but Council Member
10 Treyger and I are introducing a bill to create a
11 Hurricane Sandy monitor to help the city oversee all
12 the federal, the billions of dollars in federal aid
13 that we are receiving in federal disaster aid.
14 Essentially, it's an IG, but it's not called an IG.
15 We have to call it monitor. It will be under the
16 Department of Investigation. It's Intro 406, and I'm
17 encouraging all of my colleagues who are still here,
18 all 12 or 13 of us to please co-sponsor this piece of
19 legislation.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Speaker Melissa
21 Mark-Viverito to close.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Madam
23 Public Advocate. Again, thank all my colleagues for
24 a great first part of the session. It's been
25 wonderful. We still meet in the summer, but not as

1 STATED MEETING

116

2 often. I hope everyone has an enjoyable time with
3 their family, and time off. And again, it's really
4 been great working alongside all of you and the staff
5 has been awesome as well. So with that, it's about 4
6 o'clock, and have a good one everybody. [applause,
7 cheers]

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date June 29, 2014