

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

STATED MEETING

----- X

October 28, 2019  
Start: 2:01 p.m.  
Recess: 4:05 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: COREY D. JOHNSON  
Speaker

Laurie A. Cumbo  
Majority Leader

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Adrienne E. Adams  
Alicka Ampry-Samuel  
Diana Ayala  
Inez D. Barron  
Joseph C. Borelli  
Justin Brannan  
Fernando Cabrera  
Margaret S. Chin  
Andrew Cohen  
Costa Constantinides  
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.  
Laurie A. Cumbo  
Chaim M. Deutsch  
Ruben Diaz, Sr.  
Daniel Dromm

Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.  
Mathieu Eugene  
Vanessa L. Gibson  
Mark Gjonaj  
Barry Grodenchik  
Robert Holden  
Ben Kallos  
Andy King  
Peter Koo  
Karen Koslowitz  
Rory I. Lancman  
Brad Lander  
Stephen T. Levin  
Mark Levine  
Farah Louis  
Alan N. Maisel  
Steven Matteo  
Carlos Menchaca  
I. Daneek Miller  
Francisco Moya  
Bill Perkins  
Keith Powers  
Antonio Reynoso  
Donovan J. Richards  
Carlina Rivera  
Ydanis Rodriguez  
Deborah Rose  
Helen K. Rosenthal  
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.  
Ritchie J. Torres  
Mark Treyger  
Eric A. Ulrich  
Paul Vallone  
Jimmy Van Bramer  
Kalman Yeger

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

1 STATED MEETING

4

2 STEVEN SIDOWSKI: Radio check, radio  
3 check. Today's date is October 28, 2019, on the  
4 Stated Meeting, recorded by Steven Sidowski.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Ladies and gentlemen,  
6 could I please have your attention. At this time  
7 please place all electronic devices, all electronic  
8 devices to vibrate. Will all non-council employees,  
9 non-council employees please leave the main floor of  
10 the chambers. There is additional seating upstairs  
11 in the balcony. Thank you.

12 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Welcome to the  
13 Stated Meeting of October 28, 2019. I'm Majority  
14 Leader Laurie Cumbo. Please rise for the Pledge of  
15 Allegiance.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise.

17 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I pledge  
18 allegiance to the flag of the United States of  
19 America, and to the republic for which it stands, one  
20 nation under God, indivisible, with liberty and  
21 justice for all.

22 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Roll call.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Present.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel.

- 2 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Present.
- 3 COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala.
- 4 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Present.
- 5 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron.
- 6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.
- 7 COUNCIL CLERK: Borrelli.
- 8 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Present.
- 9 COUNCIL CLERK: Brannan.
- 10 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: I'm here.
- 11 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera. Chin.
- 12 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.
- 13 COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen.
- 14 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.
- 15 COUNCIL CLERK: Constantinides.
- 16 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Present.
- 17 COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy.
- 18 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Present.
- 19 COUNCIL CLERK: Deutsch.
- 20 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Present.
- 21 COUNCIL CLERK: Diaz. Dromm.
- 22 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.
- 23 COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal. Eugene.
- 24 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Present.
- 25 COUNCIL CLERK: Gibson.

2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Here.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj.  
COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Present.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Grodenchik.  
COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Here.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Holden.  
COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Here.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos. King.  
COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Koo.  
COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz.  
COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman.  
COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Lander.  
COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Levin.  
COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Levine.  
COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Louis.  
COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Present.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel. Menchaca.

1 STATED MEETING

7

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.  
3 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller.  
4 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Present.  
5 COUNCIL CLERK: Moya. Perkins.  
6 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Present.  
7 COUNCIL CLERK: Powers.  
8 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Here.  
9 COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso.  
10 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Present.  
11 COUNCIL CLERK: Richards.  
12 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.  
13 COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera.  
14 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Present.  
15 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez. Rose.  
16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Present.  
17 COUNCIL CLERK: Rosenthal. Salamanca.  
18 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.  
19 COUNCIL CLERK: Torres. Treyger.  
20 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.  
21 COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich.  
22 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Here.  
23 COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone.  
24 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.  
25 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Yeger.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Here.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo.

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Present.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Present.

11 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: We will now have  
12 today's invocation, which will be delivered by  
13 Reverend Mark E. Erson, pastor of St. John's Lutheran  
14 Church, located at 81st Christopher Street, New York,  
15 10014.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise.

17 REVEREND MARK E. ERSON: In this time of  
18 harvest and home, feast and family, we give thanks.  
19 But we also hear the call to open our eyes and our  
20 hearts to those who do not share in this abundance.  
21 And so we pray. God of creation, lover of all,  
22 divine mystery we call by many names, the diverse  
23 works of your hands proclaim your majesty, your  
24 creativity, and your inclusivity. As we rejoice in  
25 the wonder and beauty of the season, as we give



2 thanks for all that you have made and for all with  
3 which we have been blessed, open our eyes to see  
4 those who are in need, those who are hungry, those  
5 who are alone, those who are oppressed. Open our  
6 hearts to show compassion and mercy. Give us courage  
7 to turn towards and not away, to walk with and not  
8 away, to invite in and not shun away. Remind us  
9 always that there is no justice in the land until all  
10 have a place at the table. Bless our city. Grant  
11 wisdom and courage to those who govern. Comfort all  
12 with your peace. Amen.

13 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Speaker Corey  
14 Johnson to spread the invocation in full.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you, Majority  
16 Leader Cumbo. I want to thank Pastor Mark Erson for  
17 being with us today. I make a motion that the  
18 invocation be spread in full upon the record. And  
19 Pastor Mark has served at St. John's Lutheran Church  
20 on Christopher Street in my district since 2011. He  
21 combined his love of theology and theater and spent  
22 years as an actor and as a theater teacher. Although  
23 he grew up in the church led by his father, Messiah  
24 Lutheran Church on Staten Island, Pastor Mark feared  
25 that he would not to be able to follow in his

2 father's footsteps because he is gay. But he  
3 followed his calling and was ordained in April of  
4 2009 after studying at the General Theological  
5 Seminary in our great city and then the Theological  
6 Seminary in Philadelphia. And now he is a welcome  
7 and integral figure in the West Village. He leads  
8 St. John's with acceptance and optimism and drives  
9 forward countless initiatives to engage the LGBTQ  
10 community and further the artistic history of the  
11 Village. He has tirelessly worked [inaudible]  
12 homeless LGBTQ youth, offering opportunities and  
13 space for our trans community to gather and host  
14 activities, so I want to thank you again, Pastor  
15 Mark, for all you have done to support New Yorkers  
16 and especially the work you've done to minister on  
17 behalf of LGBTQ young people. And with that, Madam  
18 Majority Leader, I again make a motion that the  
19 invocation be spread full and upon the record.

20 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,  
21 Speaker Corey Johnson. We will now have the adoption  
22 of minutes.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

24 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Messages and  
25 papers from the mayor.

1 STATED MEETING

11

2 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

3 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Communication  
4 from city, county, and borough offices.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

6 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Petitions and  
7 communications.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Land use call-  
10 ups.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

12 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. We  
13 will now have communication from Speaker Corey  
14 Johnson.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Good afternoon. Thank  
16 you, Majority Leader Cumbo. We are here today on a  
17 very serious matter. Like all of you, I have read  
18 the report of the Committee on Standards and Ethics  
19 and accompanying Resolution 1138, which is before us  
20 today. You will hear from Steven Matteo, the  
21 minority leader and the chair of Standards and Ethics  
22 after I speak, and we will also give Council Member  
23 Andy King the opportunity to speak freely after Chair  
24 Matteo. I'll begin by saying that I believe that  
25 Council Member King's behavior, which has been

2 substantiated by the committee, is intolerable and  
3 unacceptable. Those violations outlined in the  
4 report are appalling, particularly coming from an  
5 elected official who is duty-bound to serve the  
6 public. I will leave it to the committee who heard  
7 and evaluated the evidence over the course of days to  
8 discuss those violations. But as the council  
9 speaker, I have to say that Council Member King's  
10 conduct goes well beyond seriously violating the  
11 council's equal opportunity employment policy, our  
12 rules and the City Charter's conflict of interest.  
13 His conduct also shows complete and utter disdain and  
14 even contempt for this body and its processes, which  
15 he himself voted to approve at the beginning of each  
16 of his terms. Council Member King came before the  
17 Standards and Ethics Committee in 2017 for a  
18 violation of the council's EEO policy, which the  
19 committee substantiated. Because of that 2017  
20 violation he was required to take specialized  
21 training. What we didn't know then was that he had  
22 released the name of that staffer who had complained  
23 about his conduct to his staff. Both in retaliation  
24 against that staffer and in an effort to intimidate  
25 the rest of his staff from cooperating with the

2 committee in his duty to assist in this council's  
3 role to judge the conduct of its members. We found  
4 this out during the course of the investigation that  
5 is before us today. In addition, as soon as the  
6 second investigation opened he immediately began  
7 intimidating his staff to ensure that they would not  
8 cooperate with the committee's investigation and the  
9 council's processes. This time the intimidation  
10 involved literally driving staffers out of his office  
11 through suspensions and the attempts to fire.

12 Council Member King even jeopardized the health of  
13 one his staffers in attempt to force that staffer to  
14 leave his employment. The original complainant,  
15 referred to in the report as the 2017 complainant,  
16 spoke out publicly earlier today on her experience  
17 and her desire to see Council Member King expelled  
18 from this body. I applaud her courage and deplore  
19 what she went through, and I hope every one of us  
20 here does. I applaud the courage of the witnesses in  
21 the current investigation who faced retaliation and  
22 came forward to speak to the committee. I am  
23 sickened by what they have endured because of Council  
24 Member King's odious behavior. As for Council Member  
25 King, I deplore his cowardice and the disdain with

2 which he treated his employees, the committee, and  
3 this entire body. He refused to speak to council  
4 investigators about the charges against him. He  
5 refused to meet with our special counsel. We gave  
6 him three weeks to prepare for the Standards and  
7 Ethics Committee hearing. We gave his attorneys the  
8 procedures for presenting evidence and calling  
9 witnesses. But instead of preparing a defense he  
10 tried to destroy the evidence that could be used to  
11 substantiate the charges. He did this by  
12 intimidating and attempting to fire witnesses that  
13 had come forward. This shows an unprecedented level of  
14 contempt for the rules and processes of this body.  
15 No council member in the history of the modern city  
16 council has ever refused to participate in every  
17 phase of an investigation that actually resulted in a  
18 hearing before the Standards and Ethics Committee.  
19 This conduct merits sanctions of magnitude that we  
20 can be sure will serve as a significant deterrent,  
21 while fully protecting the staff that have been  
22 through so much and that allows for the swift  
23 detection of any bad behavior that might occur which  
24 could result in even harsher sanctions for Council  
25 Member King. Despite his claims to the contrary, I

2 have no doubt in the integrity of this process. The  
3 Standards and Ethics Committee spent months on this  
4 case, in meetings, hearings, and deliberations. They  
5 weighed the precedence. They unanimously agreed on  
6 these sanctions before us - a 30-day suspension, the  
7 imposition of a monitor, and a large monetary  
8 penalty. This is a thoughtful and appropriate  
9 substantial sanction in light of Council Member  
10 King's egregious behavior and the complete disregard  
11 for our process. I will recognize the chair of  
12 Standards and Ethics by our rules which Council  
13 Member King has voted to approve. It was this  
14 committee that was charged with hearing and weighing  
15 the evidence and ensuring that the sanctions were  
16 commensurate with the violations. I think they did  
17 their jobs admirably and we owe them a debt of  
18 gratitude. I want to turn it over as part of speaker  
19 time to Chair Matteo.

20 CHAIR MATTEO: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I  
21 want to begin my remarks today by acknowledging two  
22 groups of people. First, every council member and  
23 member of the public owes a tremendous debt to the  
24 witnesses who courageously came forward in this  
25 matter. In the face of repeated retaliation,

2 threats, and in some cases attempted firing, these  
3 individuals gave credible and powerful testimony to  
4 the committee. Without them we would not be in a  
5 position to carry out one of our sacred duties as  
6 representatives of the people and hold a fellow  
7 member accountable for egregious misconduct. I must  
8 also thank my colleagues on the Committee on  
9 Standards and Ethics, as well as committee staff. As  
10 you all know, this matter has been ongoing for nearly  
11 eight months and we have accumulated dozens of hours  
12 of witness interviews, hundreds of pages of document  
13 discovery, and conducted a two-day trial. [clears  
14 throat] Excuse me. Without the steady and consistent  
15 support of my colleagues on the committee and staff,  
16 the thorough objective and complete investigation and  
17 adjudication of this matter would have been  
18 impossible. With that said, I want to assure the  
19 rest of my colleagues that we on the committee did  
20 not take this duty lightly. From the outset, we  
21 operated with the assumption that Andy King is a duly  
22 elected member of the council and the representative  
23 of the constituents in the 12th District. We knew  
24 that if we found any substantiated evidence of  
25 wrongdoing, any punishment we recommended must be



2 offered with the understanding that our colleague was  
3 elected by the people of the 12th District and should  
4 be measured to both adequately address misconduct  
5 while also respecting the rights of his constituency.

6 We on the committee strongly believe that we have  
7 struck that delicate balance with our recommended  
8 sanctions. These sanctions respect the will of the  
9 voters of the 12th District while also addressing  
10 some of the most egregious conduct the council has  
11 ever seen. As anyone who has read our report knows,  
12 this is Council Member King's second substantiated  
13 complaint before the Committee on Standards and  
14 Ethics. In 2017 he was found to have violated the  
15 council's EEO policy and was directed to complete  
16 mandatory training. Because of the settlement, that  
17 matter was never presented to the rest of you as a  
18 body. However, less than two years later we received  
19 a communication from the city's Department of  
20 Citywide Administrative Services that one of Council  
21 Member King's former staffers had been denied  
22 unemployed benefits and had appealed that denial by  
23 claiming that the staffer had been constructively  
24 fired due to gender-based harassment by Council  
25 Member King. It was this written finding by a state

2 agency that Council Member King had again engaged in  
3 gender-based harassment, which started this second  
4 investigation. We began the investigation into these  
5 allegations in March of 2019 after receiving that  
6 notice from DCAS. The committee was ultimately  
7 unable to fully investigate the gender-based  
8 harassment allegations made by the former staffer, in  
9 part because the staffer ultimately declined to  
10 participate further in that investigation. However,  
11 during interviews allegation after allegation and  
12 problem after problem surfaced regarding the function  
13 of Council Member King's office. Perhaps one of the  
14 most disturbing allegations, which the committee  
15 eventually found to be credible and substantiated,  
16 was that in 2017 Council Member King in an effort to  
17 obstruct the first Standards and Ethics  
18 investigation, held a staff meeting in his home where  
19 he identified the 2017 complainant by name and  
20 disparaged the complainant to his entire staff. This  
21 outrageous conduct was testified to at the  
22 disciplinary hearing by three staffers who would not  
23 have known the complainant's name but for Council  
24 Member King's behavior. This is conduct that cannot  
25 and will not be tolerated at the council. The

2 evidence also clearly demonstrated that with regard  
3 to the investigation that led to the report now  
4 before you Council Member King repeatedly intimidated  
5 and punished staff who he thought had or would  
6 cooperate with the committee's investigation. Soon  
7 after the second investigation opened in an effort to  
8 root out whomever had cooperated with us, Council  
9 Member King held yet another staff meeting at his  
10 home and demanded to know what staffers had spoken  
11 with council investigators and disclosed what they  
12 had discussed. Of the three staffers who admitted  
13 they had cooperated, one was driven out of Council  
14 Member King's office, another would have been fired  
15 but for the last-minute intervention of  
16 Administrative Services and our Office of the General  
17 Counsel. And the third so clearly got the message  
18 that even a subpoena wasn't enough to compel that  
19 staffer's cooperation. In addition, Council Member  
20 King attempted to fire another staffer who had  
21 witnessed much of this conduct and who ultimately  
22 testified before the committee. Not only did our  
23 witnesses fully support each other in this, but we  
24 have the actual documents showing that on the same  
25 day as four superseding charges were against him,

2 Council Member King came down to 250 Broadway and  
3 handed these separation forms into our Administrative  
4 Services division. The evidence also clearly  
5 demonstrated that Council Member King allowed his  
6 office to become unsafe and disorderly by condoning  
7 the conduct of a supervisor who repeatedly threatened  
8 staff with physical violence and create a volatile  
9 and dangerous work environment. Among the many  
10 examples of this egregious conduct, which Council  
11 Member King not only implicitly condoned but actually  
12 explicitly supported during a single conversation  
13 with council investigators, included threats of  
14 violence against and intimidating behavior towards  
15 Council Member King himself. Beyond threatening the  
16 member, the staffer in question also threatened or  
17 intimidated multiple other King staffers. Condoning,  
18 facilitating, or permitting this conduct is wholly  
19 unbecoming of an elected representative of the people  
20 of New York City and must not be tolerated by the  
21 council. It is also clear that Council Member King  
22 permitted, condoned, or facilitated numerous  
23 conflicts of interest in his office, conflicts that  
24 benefitted both himself and his wife. Although this  
25 conduct is exhaustively laid out in all of its

2 multifaceted and disturbing detail in the committee's  
3 report, we were perhaps most troubled by how our  
4 colleague allowed a space, his spouse, rather, to use  
5 both council staff and council resources to further  
6 her own personal and professional interests. This  
7 included the use of council staff and time to plan,  
8 prepare for, and carry out an annual Caribbean  
9 retreat that prominently featured our colleague's  
10 wife and once even including her daughter's wedding.  
11 It also included the regular use of Council Member  
12 King's email address to direct council staffers to  
13 carry out work on behalf of the wife's employer. We  
14 were also deeply troubled to learn of Council Member  
15 King's outrageous and egregious statement about a  
16 picture taken at the Pride Parade. While the  
17 statement alone, which equates to celebration of our  
18 LGBT friends, families, and loved ones with child  
19 pornography, it is utterly and despicable and  
20 disgusting, to make such a statement during a staff  
21 meeting and in the presence of a staffer who  
22 identifies as LGBT, is simply unacceptable and must  
23 not be tolerated. Even with all the egregious  
24 behavior I have just laid out, the truth is that were  
25 it not for Council Member King's behavior during the

2 pendency of the investigation we would probably not  
3 be discussing sanction of this magnitude contained in  
4 this resolution. From the beginning of this matter,  
5 which opened nearly eight months ago, Council Member  
6 King was aware of the investigation and was offered  
7 the opportunity to engage with the committee. He was  
8 also advised to retain counsel to protect his  
9 interest during any such engagement. However, and  
10 from the outset, Council Member King adamantly  
11 refused to cooperate. He refused many overtures from  
12 both the committee and the special counsel and never  
13 once appeared for an interview with either committee  
14 investigators or the special counsel, except for one  
15 brief conversation which was intended to defend the  
16 supervisor and his office who was accused of  
17 threatening and intimidating behavior. During that  
18 conversation Council Member King never once denied  
19 that any of that supervisor's behavior had occurred  
20 and in fact appeared to condone it. Indeed, instead  
21 of cooperating, Council Member King attempted to make  
22 a mockery of this committee and the council's rules  
23 and policies. I must reiterate for all of my  
24 colleagues and the public that Council Member King  
25 was afforded every opportunity from before this

2 matter was even officially opened by the committee  
3 until the moment before we voted to send to the full  
4 body to engage with us, talk with us, and present his  
5 side of the story. Council Member King had nearly  
6 eight months to engage with us. And this engagement  
7 could have taken the form of an interview with  
8 committee investigators, document exchange with the  
9 special counsel, and appearance at the disciplinary  
10 hearing. On that last point, and contrary to the  
11 narrative our colleague is portraying to the public,  
12 Council Member King had the opportunity to face the  
13 special counsel, challenge her evidence, present his  
14 side of the story, and question and cross-examine  
15 witnesses on the record. However, rather than  
16 present his case and attempt to exonerate himself,  
17 Council Member King attended a back-to-school event.  
18 We should not allow the waters to be muddied here.  
19 There are most definitely examples of due process  
20 being violated and individuals not being afforded a  
21 fair chance to defend themselves. This is  
22 unequivocally not one of those cases. Council Member  
23 King was afforded every opportunity to defend himself  
24 and present his side of the story and squandered all  
25 of them. One of our colleague's many claims about

2 this matter is that he did not have enough time to  
3 adequately respond to the charges brought against  
4 him. Despite all the posturing and pontificating,  
5 the plain and undisputed fact is that the original  
6 charges were filed and sent to Council Member King on  
7 August 21. The hearing began on September 13.

8 That's over three weeks. The committee's procedures  
9 only require 10 days between service of charges and  
10 the hearing. You've also heard arguments from  
11 Council Member King and his attorneys that they  
12 weren't granted an adjournment of the hearing. While  
13 the committee took those requests and certainly would  
14 have been inclined under normal circumstances to  
15 consider a reasonable adjournment, the evidence  
16 demonstrated that Council Member King appears to have  
17 used the period leading up to the hearing to further  
18 retaliate against staffers who were cooperating, or  
19 potentially could cooperate with our investigation,  
20 by suspending or attempting to fire these witnesses.  
21 When the committee learned of this behavior we were  
22 not going to stand by and give Council Member King  
23 more time to hurt staffers who had done nothing more  
24 than carry out their obligations to the council to  
25 cooperate with our investigation. We were not going



2 to allow him to undermine this committee's and this  
3 council's authority to judge the conduct of its  
4 members. When it actually came time to provide a  
5 hearing of the evidence for and against Council  
6 Member King the committee meticulously followed its  
7 internal disciplinary procedures and provided his  
8 attorneys with copies of all proposed exhibits and  
9 list of witnesses. We then held the hearing on the  
10 record at which the committee heard from the special  
11 counsel as well as various witnesses. As laid out in  
12 the committee's procedures, Council Member King was  
13 provided the opportunity to present his own witnesses  
14 and evidence and to question and attempt to impeach  
15 the special counsel's witnesses and evidence. As I  
16 just mentioned, and all of you know by now, Council  
17 Member King failed to appear at the hearing. His  
18 attorneys only appeared to briefly object to the very  
19 fact that the hearing was taking place and then they  
20 abruptly got up and left. As we lay out in the  
21 report before you, the committee found the witnesses  
22 at the hearing to be credible and damning. Over and  
23 over again they supported and corroborated each  
24 other's testimony and there were many pieces of  
25 objective documentary evidence that further supported

2 the charges brought by the special counsel.

3 Ultimately, after fully and thoroughly reviewing the

4 evidence and assessing the credibility of the

5 witnesses, the committee was unanimous in its

6 determination that the four superseding charges had

7 been substantiated by a preponderance of the

8 evidence. In coming to this conclusion, the

9 committee found that the evidence demonstrated that

10 it was more likely than not that the conduct and

11 behavioral alleged in the charges had occurred. Now,

12 there are some of you who may think this penalty is

13 harsh. We have never before imposed sanctions of

14 this magnitude, including suspension and a monitor.

15 To those concerned about leveling too harsh a

16 penalty, I ask can we, a committee who has an

17 obligation to protect staff, send staff back to an

18 environment of fear and intimidation and give the

19 council member the chance to finish firing the rest

20 of the staffers he considers disloyal? And,

21 remember, he considers them disloyal because they did

22 their duty to this body and the council. The

23 committee exhaustively deliberated and debated the

24 terms of this resolution and concluded that the

25 suspension is significant enough that it will

2 function both as a deterrent against future bad  
3 behavior and also give us the chance to get a monitor  
4 in place in Council Member King's office who can  
5 develop a relationship with staff before Council  
6 Member King returns. Once the member returns to his  
7 office, the monitor will only oversee employment-  
8 related matters between Council Member King and his  
9 staff. The monitor will have no part in Council  
10 Member King's role as a representative of his  
11 district. Council Member King will continue to  
12 introduce legislation, make budget and funding  
13 decisions, and negotiate land use matters. For those  
14 of you who think this penalty is not harsh enough, I  
15 must return to the opening of my remarks.

16 Overturning the vote of the people of the 12th  
17 District or any other district should be reserved for  
18 cases in which we don't think we have any  
19 alternatives. While we are the judge of our fellow  
20 members' conduct under the Charter and are not bound  
21 by the state laws on elected office vacancy, I think  
22 it is instructive that the state law provides for the  
23 removal of an elected official only in instances  
24 involving conviction of a felony or a crime in  
25 violation of a member's oath of office. Most of what

2 we found were egregious acts of obstruction and  
3 retaliation, violations of the council's policy, and  
4 conflicts of interest violations. Simply put, while  
5 this conduct is unquestionably bad and completely  
6 unacceptable, we on the committee ultimately found  
7 that it did not rise to the level of warranting the  
8 harshest penalty we have. In closing, I would like  
9 to again commend my colleagues on the committee for  
10 working so hard on such a difficult matter. It is  
11 never an easy thing to be tasked with very publicly  
12 passing judgment on a colleague. And it is entirely  
13 a more difficult task when that colleague is an  
14 elected representative of your fellow New Yorkers. I  
15 thank you for your hard work. Even more importantly,  
16 I want to again remind my colleagues and the people  
17 of New York City of the huge debt they owe to the  
18 witnesses and complainants that came forward and  
19 cooperated with the committee. It takes tremendous  
20 courage and strength to tell their story and to  
21 appear at a hearing and open themselves up to cross-  
22 examination from someone who has already mistreated  
23 and retaliated against them. That is true strength,  
24 and the committee commends all those who helped us  
25 get to the place of holding an elected official

2 accountable for misconduct. To respect the bravery  
3 of our witnesses, we on the committee work to never  
4 lose site of the great and serious responsibility we  
5 all bear to make the council a safe place to work.  
6 We are all a fundamental part of this institution and  
7 this council is only as good and effective and worthy  
8 of its role in the city as its essential parts. With  
9 these considerations in mind and after a painstaking  
10 process and many months of investigation, the  
11 committee submits to you what are found to be the  
12 appropriate response to the conduct uncovered here.  
13 Thank you for your time.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you, Chair  
15 Matteo. I now recognize Council Member Andy King to  
16 speak. Council Member King, if you would care to  
17 speak, will be given 15 minutes to speak.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Thank you, Mr.  
19 Speaker, and thank you all today for coming in on  
20 your Monday when you probably could be in your  
21 district doing other work. I want to thank the Most  
22 High Christ who every day wakes me up to do the work  
23 of his children on this planet. Being a son of a  
24 veteran and learning discipline, being a son of a  
25 mother who has been a wonderful leader and guiding my

2 steps, to my grandparents, to my aunts, my daughters,  
3 my granddaughters, I say I love you and I thank them  
4 for their support. Equally, I want to say thank you  
5 to my neighborhood, my community of educating [and  
6 raised]me, and voted for me to come down here and  
7 represent them. It's a sad day when your elected  
8 representative gets put out to task on anything that  
9 disrespects or violates rules of integrity and  
10 respect. With that all being said, I am a man who is  
11 very respectful, full of integrity, stands for  
12 something, doesn't fall for anything and everything.  
13 And because people say things sometimes don't  
14 necessarily make it true. Because people get their  
15 feelings hurt doesn't necessarily make it true. It's  
16 a fact that we all have our feeling, but every  
17 feeling isn't a fact. So we're standing here today,  
18 sitting here today, with the task of figuring out how  
19 to respond to allegations and a document, a 40-page  
20 document, that have said I am the worst person on the  
21 planet. I am some type of martyr. I am some type of  
22 task master or whatever you want to call it. I am  
23 the oppressor in this case that says I've done such  
24 horrible things to my staff. That could be farthest  
25 from the truth. Ever since I've been in office I've

2 treated my staff like my own family. That means one,  
3 if you are hungry you got fed. If you needed  
4 clothes, I took you shopping. If you needed a pair  
5 of shoes, I went into the closet and gave you a pair  
6 of shoes. That's how I treated my staff. If you  
7 needed a ride home I took you home. If you needed  
8 money to pay your rent I gave you money out of my  
9 pocket to help you pay your rent. When you were down  
10 and desolate I did all I could to help assure that  
11 you had an opportunity to get your life together.  
12 And the sad thing is that I stand before you, I sit  
13 here before you today being judged as someone who is  
14 horrible, who has some other agenda of cruelty to  
15 hurt individuals. Everyone in my district knows the  
16 person that I am. You people know who I am. So to  
17 sit here and take a report to kill a character of a  
18 father, a grandfather, who we all are in here, and  
19 brothers and sisters, it's sad that we all are placed  
20 in this position to even have this kind of  
21 conversation. It's been argued since this case was  
22 opened up that I have not participated, made a  
23 mockery of this, and have disrespected this process.  
24 That is farthest from the truth. Let me just read  
25 something to you. My attorneys have reached out and

2 in May we were scheduled to meet to discuss this  
3 case. The scheduled meeting was postponed because  
4 the interviewer had to go on vacation. It was  
5 rescheduled again. My attorney and I was at her  
6 office waiting for the interviewer to come up. We  
7 sat there for half an hour. Nothing. Then my  
8 attorney decided to call. Oh, she's stuck in  
9 traffic. For three hours we waited to be interviewed  
10 and discuss this matter only for the counsel not to  
11 show up to talk to me. With no explanation why they  
12 didn't show up. Then during a hearing that was  
13 scheduled on September 13 Matteo asked a question  
14 when my attorneys put it on the record that we waited  
15 for three hours and thought she was stuck in traffic,  
16 the outside counsel that was hired by this council to  
17 crucify us, when Matteo asked her to respond her  
18 answer is respectfully, council, that's not true.  
19 This counsel went on the record and technically and  
20 actually lied to the committee and said I did not  
21 wait for three hours to be interviewed. If you can  
22 lie at the beginning of a conversation then the rest  
23 of your document is flawed. I am so bothered that I  
24 am being put in this situation and acting like I am  
25 some horrible individual. I've read the transcript.



2 I wish you all had an opportunity to read the  
3 transcripts, because the one and one doesn't equal  
4 two in these documents. Their one and one is  
5 equalling nine and I don't know how they got there.  
6 For them to come and say that I've done things that I  
7 haven't done, make statements I haven't made, they  
8 never sat with me, so the document is one-sided.  
9 It's a one-sided document they're asking you to vote  
10 on. Process, my due process has been violated and  
11 it's been said from the committee that the discretion  
12 is at the discretion of the committee. So why you've  
13 heard today that I was not attending the hearing,  
14 well, you know, you tell me in July, you tell me when  
15 you, when you started this conversation, when my  
16 attorney asked you for in May, asked you for the  
17 allegations, what are you charging my client with,  
18 we're told on a Friday we'll have it for you, then on  
19 a Monday you can't get it. My attorney was blown  
20 away. How do they tell you you can't get the  
21 allegations? Took them months before they responded  
22 to us with some allegations when they charged us on  
23 the 21st of August. And when they charged us on the  
24 24th of August my attorney could only say I guess  
25 they didn't have anything then so they had to build a

2 case against you. Months went by before they gave us  
3 information. But back in May and in June we, we made  
4 ourselves available for an interview, which they  
5 didn't show up. And one was canceled. But they sit  
6 here and tell you that I didn't want to participate  
7 and didn't want to engage. And then when the, when  
8 it gets scheduled on this, on the 10th when they  
9 rescheduled it to the 10th, on the, on the 21st they  
10 scheduled it on the 10th, my attorneys say I'm out of  
11 the country, can we get an adjournment. The  
12 committee has to power to give an adjournment. They  
13 chose not to. I got a new attorney that joined on  
14 and we asked for another adjournment for the 10th.  
15 Then they put superseding charges into the mix. And  
16 then they said we're going to adjourn to the 13th.  
17 On the 13th we told them that my attorney would not  
18 be available, ready, because you gave us discovery,  
19 which requires us to have five days to look at this  
20 stuff, so what the end up doing discovery, they send  
21 us 53 files we could not open. You know on the  
22 television show when you ask for discovery and they  
23 send you whole boxes of stuff you're supposed to go  
24 through within 24 hours, that's what my attorneys  
25 were dealing with. But you want to say you're

2 treating me fair in this whole process. And then on  
3 the 13th you knew I could not be there because why I  
4 had my big back-to-school rally. We all do the best  
5 for our students and our children in our district.  
6 Had a big back-to-school rally with DOE  
7 superintendents, educators, staff, thousands of kids  
8 with special guest [Kylie Urban] from the Brooklyn  
9 [net] and A Boogie Wit a Hoodie. You're telling me  
10 that with all that preparation that took months with  
11 the committee couldn't say let's schedule it another  
12 day when they had, had the power to do so. What was  
13 the rush? If you want to get justice, what was the  
14 rush? And then on the 13th when you didn't complete  
15 your conversation you adjourned it to the 16th. I  
16 find out through city and state that there's an  
17 ethics hearing on me on the 16th through city and  
18 state. But I'm being treated in this process fairly?  
19 That's what we call being treated fairly? So after  
20 the 16th my attorney reaches out and they say, well,  
21 they sent us this letter say since you didn't want to  
22 be bothered, you didn't want to comply with us, we'll  
23 just keep you informed. We'll get it back to you  
24 probably later on in the money, beginning of August.  
25 My attorney asked why. They said, oh, why, because

2 one of the council members that are on the committee  
3 is going on vacation. Excuse me? You couldn't give  
4 me an adjournment but you gonna hold, hold me hostage  
5 because someone on the committee is on a vacation.  
6 And you think that's fair? This is us doing this to  
7 us. So, again, we have a document that's not truly  
8 accurate because you only have a one-sided  
9 conversation. Because if someone says something it's  
10 not necessary it's true. If you were told today that  
11 someone stole your shoes so much you got to talk to  
12 them and say well did you steal the shoes or not?  
13 Somebody got to, you got to give them opportunity.  
14 People's emotions are hurting right now. People are  
15 upset and I think this is how we're operating. We're  
16 not operating on facts. We're operating on a  
17 violation of, my, my due process has been violated  
18 here and we're trying to figure out how to rush this  
19 through. Why are we so rushed to find a, an answer  
20 to this as opposed to finding the truth to this? If  
21 you had sat down with me, which I've always been  
22 willing to do, I read your, and I will read you this.  
23 This comes from my attorney. This, this document,  
24 excuse me. This document I read is dated May 30,  
25 2019. And it's addressed to Benjamin Smith from my,

2 from my counsel, and she says I'm writing to you to  
3 express my complete dissatisfaction in cancellation  
4 of a meeting with my office. Council Member King was  
5 ready, willing, and able to participate in your  
6 investigation. The meeting was to commence at 2:00  
7 p.m. at my office at 11 West Prospect Avenue in Mount  
8 Vernon. Myself and the Council Member King waited  
9 until 2:30, only to receive information that the  
10 investigator would be late. Thus, no courtesy was  
11 extended to myself or Council Member King to inform  
12 us of the delay. I spoke with the investigator  
13 directly. She said she was stuck in traffic. She  
14 told us she would be arriving 30 minutes [inaudible].  
15 My client and I, I had to attend another function  
16 about 3:30 but I was willing to wait. I received a  
17 call from you at 3:15 p.m. or so indicating the  
18 investigator would not be able to keep the  
19 appointment. Further, I continued to request the  
20 investigation report, which actually, which initially  
21 I was told I could review. Again, in all fairness to  
22 Council Member King due process requires that he  
23 receive the nature of the charges and what gave rise  
24 to such allegations. She concludes my client  
25 continues to deny any wrongdoing. We respect, we

2 respectfully and request mutually dates to complete  
3 your investigation. So we asked for more dates to  
4 sit down with this body that [had to do the]  
5 investigation. They did not so after this. But they  
6 sit here and give you a conversation that's  
7 misleading and misdirected. I'm offended that we  
8 would get offended. I'm even offended more the last  
9 week I ran into a colleague on Friday evening who  
10 told me that there was a democratic conference that  
11 were discussing the situation and when it was asked  
12 of them was Council Member King invited to this  
13 meeting, did he know about it, y'all were told he was  
14 invited. The sadness of that is that last week I  
15 sent a text to the Speaker's office telling him that  
16 I was out of town and for Land Use, because Land Use  
17 was supposed to be on Tuesday, I would not be in, in  
18 the city that week. They did not relay that message  
19 to you that I was out of town. They just told you  
20 that I was invited. Which gave the impression that I  
21 blew off this meeting that was so important that to  
22 discuss me. I just think I'm not being treated  
23 fairly. It's not right what's happening here and I  
24 don't want people making emotional decisions when due  
25 process has been violated. I'm asking you for your

2 support as someone who was duly elected, as you are,  
3 a father, a grandfather, a husband, someone who  
4 cares, someone who's in the hands of Christ, I'm  
5 asking you all to look inside yourselves and see the  
6 truths within this matter, and if we really want to  
7 have a real conversation about anything and  
8 allegations then everyone whoever in this body ever  
9 gets charged with anything should have the  
10 opportunity, but actually have that opportunity  
11 delivered to them in fairness to have their voices  
12 heard. This was not the case here today. Regardless  
13 of what you heard, you've heard a lot of striking  
14 conversations, a lot of words that were put out  
15 there, a lot of things to steer emotions, to make you  
16 feel that I'm this horrible individual, and people  
17 were crucified. That is not the case. I have been,  
18 I have been and I will always be a kind and loving  
19 soul and that's where I stand. I implore you today  
20 to make a decision, not only that protects this  
21 council but protects us all moving forward. I ask  
22 you for your support and know with that all being  
23 said I thank the Most High Christ and I pass it all  
24 up to him for favor and flavor. Thank you again for  
25 your time everyone.

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,  
3 Council Member King. We will now move into General  
4 Orders. I just want to remind all of my colleagues  
5 that Rule 9.210 limits the amount of time a member  
6 can speak to no more than two minutes and five  
7 minutes for the minority leader. We will now begin  
8 this portion of General Orders, beginning with  
9 Minority Leader Matteo.

10 MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: Thank you.  
11 Briefly, I just want to make two points for the  
12 record. One, for the adjournment, I've said it  
13 numerous times. I've said on the record the  
14 adjournment was not granted because of our concern of  
15 protecting staff from being fired and harassed. And  
16 that is why the adjournment was not granted. Two,  
17 for the record, on June 26th Ben Smith, our legal  
18 counsel emailed Mr. King's attorney. The email  
19 states, "Hi Ms. Razer, my apologies for interrupting  
20 your vacation. Our special counsel is available the  
21 week you return, which I believe is the week of July  
22 7. Do you and the Council Member have any  
23 availability during that week? We will accommodate  
24 your and his schedules as much as possible. Thanks.  
25 As always, Ben." That was on June 26th. On July 9th



2 a response came from Ms. Razer by email that says,  
3 "Dear Attorney Smith, based upon my client's belief  
4 that this investigation is disingenuous we decline to  
5 participate. Thank you for your consideration." I  
6 thought it was extremely important that we ensure  
7 that these are on the record. Thank you.

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you, Chair  
9 Matteo. Are there any other members who wish to  
10 speak on General Orders at this time? Council Member  
11 Levin.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you, Madam  
13 Majority Leader. I want to thank Chair Matteo and  
14 the other members of the Standards and Ethics  
15 Committee. Ah, I sit on the Standards and Ethics  
16 Committee and I want to acknowledge the staff that  
17 worked on this diligently and I want to especially  
18 recognize the witnesses that came forward at  
19 significant risk to their professional future, and  
20 spoke with us honestly and with credibility. I do  
21 want to back up what Chair Matteo has said around due  
22 process. The fact of the matter is that at the  
23 outset of the hearing Council Member King's attorneys  
24 made an opening statement and, and then got up and  
25 left for the remainder of the proceeding. They had

2 the opportunity to cross-examine witnesses. They had  
3 the opportunity to call witnesses and present a case  
4 and they chose to do neither. And to the allegations  
5 and the charges themselves, it was very concerning in  
6 particular the conduct regarding Council Member  
7 King's calling staff to meetings outside of the  
8 office to his home, inquiring as to who was  
9 cooperating with the investigation, and then  
10 subsequent actions that were retaliatory in, in fact.  
11 And that includes suspensions and firings, [bell]  
12 making work very difficult for staff members, and the  
13 fact of the matter is that these...

14 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,  
15 Council Member Levin.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...allegations are  
17 credible and very serious and warrant these  
18 sanctions. I want to thank you very much for your  
19 time.

20 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,  
21 Council Member Levin. We will now have Council  
22 Member Gibson.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you, Madam  
24 Majority Leader, and good afternoon colleagues. It  
25 is difficult to be here under these circumstances,

2 but I certainly want to thank the chair of our  
3 committee, Steven Matteo, for his incredible  
4 leadership and really commitment. The members of the  
5 Standards and Ethics Committee have devoted a  
6 significant amount of time, endless hours of labor,  
7 to make sure that this process was extremely  
8 deliberate and fair and equitable. And I echo the  
9 sentiments of Chair Matteo in saying that due process  
10 and all of the regulations of this body were  
11 absolutely followed. What we have as a council and  
12 as a body to do and the responsibility of all of us  
13 as council members is not only to protect this  
14 institution, to protect the council members, but  
15 equally as important to protect staff. The staff  
16 that work so hard every single day, they give so much  
17 time to serve New Yorkers from across 51 council  
18 districts, and I really want to acknowledge the  
19 bravery and the courageous manner of all of the, all  
20 of the witnesses that really came forward under  
21 extremely difficult circumstances for sharing their  
22 story. Their stories were compelling and credible,  
23 and I believe them and what they endured while they  
24 were employed here at the council. And so it is my  
25 hope that this body has read the report and really

2 looked through all of the details and really  
3 understands that this committee did its job in a fair  
4 and equitable manner. And it is my hope that after  
5 today all of the witnesses that came forward, I truly  
6 hope and pray that they find healing and peace and  
7 know that this is a council that will always stand up  
8 for every staff member and making sure that we  
9 provide and promote a safe work environment that is  
10 free from harassment and retaliation. That is our  
11 obligation as elected officials to protect our staff  
12 and all of the staff that work here at the City  
13 Council. So I ask all of my colleagues to support  
14 the recommendations [bell] and the resolution before  
15 this body. Thank you.

16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,  
17 Council Member Gibson. We will now be followed by  
18 Council Member Menchaca, followed by Council Member  
19 King, and then Council Member Van Bramer.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you.  
21 Council Member King, you asked us to look inside and  
22 speak, and so that is what is compelling right now to  
23 speak, what I think about what's happening right now.  
24 Many words have been used today and leading up to  
25 today that include things like contempt and disdain

2 for this body, things that describe what's happening  
3 as lynching and crucifixion. These are intense words  
4 that should be taken seriously. And so that's what  
5 I'm doing. But we're also asking ourselves is  
6 whether or not this is a balance and whether or not  
7 we need to bring balance, and so that's what I want  
8 to just respond to, this idea that that this should  
9 at all be balanced and that the stories that we heard  
10 of these allegations are true. They hit me  
11 particular at the core, at the core part of what I'm  
12 supposed to be doing here on the floor of the City  
13 Council representing my community. But not just  
14 that. Representing the staff behind us. Each and  
15 every one of us has so many staff that work their  
16 hard, hardest to represent not just us, but our  
17 communities. And that's who I'm thinking about right  
18 now. Because it is a somber day and I feel the  
19 gravity of this moment and I want to ensure that the  
20 staff that are silent right now are heard. And I  
21 want to think about them right now. I also want to  
22 think about how we move forward. Because if these  
23 allegations are true I'm not sure that this body has  
24 a place for you, Council Member King. And so I will  
25 welcome a motion to expel this member. Because if

2 these allegations are true, this is not a time where  
3 we can balance this. This is a time where we need a  
4 new normal, and we are not in that place of a new  
5 normal. And that's what I'm asking for, for this  
6 body to continue to express itself and talk it  
7 through. So I'm asking all of you, like Council  
8 Member King has asked you, to speak out and tell your  
9 truth and tell you what you think and what you  
10 believe [bell] as we move forward. And the last  
11 thing I want to say is, ok...

12 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,  
13 Council Member Menchaca.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I'll come back.

15 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. We  
16 will now hear from Council Member King, followed by  
17 Council Member Van Bramer.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: If we were gonna  
19 have a trial today then we should have just went  
20 ahead and did that. I spoke and then there's a  
21 rebuttal to what I'm, what I've said. I don't know  
22 how that works in policies procedures. So I, right  
23 then again I don't know where we going with this.  
24 Menchaca, he just mentions if it's true. Well, I  
25 never had an opportunity, gonna tell you that they're

2 not true, my, we have denied everything. And I know  
3 one of the issues that people complain about, the gay  
4 statement, which I never said. But because someone  
5 says it, everyone's running down the street on fire  
6 saying, ooh, he said that. No, I didn't say that.  
7 So this is what we're talking about. If you ever had  
8 an opportunity to sit down with me to have a  
9 conversation on the allegations you would have found  
10 out what I would have said, my witnesses would have  
11 been there and said, what didn't happen and what  
12 didn't happen. Then [inaudible] gets on the record  
13 and says that I had it and my attorneys had the  
14 opportunity to address the witness. No, according to  
15 your own council rules if the council member is not  
16 present at a hearing the defending counsel cannot  
17 question the witnesses. But he's going to get on  
18 record and said my attorneys had the right to do so,  
19 when the policies of the council say they didn't.  
20 This is what I'm saying about misleading and, I don't  
21 want to say the word lie, but just downright lying to  
22 us. Because some of this stuff is just downright  
23 lies. And they're asking you to make a decision when  
24 you all don't know even know everything, all the  
25 facts. But they're going to skew it so you can only

2 go one way. Just not fair, just not right. My  
3 attorney weeks ago filed a notice of claim for  
4 defamation of character because during all this  
5 process people have gotten on television out of this  
6 committee talking about sexual harassment. I've  
7 sexually harassed somebody, sexually harassed, this,  
8 and there's not one piece of evidence or worse in any  
9 document accusing me of sexual harassment. You've  
10 just defamed my character everybody. I have girls,  
11 grandchildren and daughters. I'm supposed to live  
12 with that? Come on, man. If y'all gonna do this, do  
13 it right or don't do it at all. So when we file our  
14 notice of claim to sue the city for that, weeks later  
15 we get this 48-page document. My attorney said  
16 you've been retaliated against. Period. Thank you.

17 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you Member,  
18 Council Member King. We will now be followed by  
19 Council Member Richards and then followed by Council  
20 Member Van Bramer.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you,  
22 Madam Majority Leader. And I wasn't going to speak  
23 today on this issue. I really came just to cast a  
24 vote and to get out of here. But I'm finding it hard  
25 here today because of the lack of remorse. I'm



2 hearing insincerity, for staff members, and most  
3 importantly a young lady who had a substantiated case  
4 against Council Member King. It's not easy to speak  
5 against colleagues, as you can imagine. But I think  
6 we are in a new space here in our country and when we  
7 look at the harassment that women face, that we  
8 cannot move on and go on as if this is the new norm.  
9 We have an obligation to hold those who break the  
10 oath, those who retaliate against staff members, to  
11 the highest standard. When people put us in office  
12 we are to be held to the highest standard. And I  
13 will say everybody is due their due process as well.  
14 But today we're not here to talk necessarily just  
15 about process. These substantiated complaints are  
16 really troublesome, and if there is a recommendation  
17 for expulsion I will support that. But I will also  
18 put out there that these sanctions are the most  
19 extreme. I've been here 17 years at the council.  
20 I've never seen sanctions this extreme for a sitting  
21 member [bell]. So with that being said, I've said  
22 all I can say. I'm just hoping that anybody accused  
23 of anything or involved in a situation like this  
24 would show some remorse. That being said, that's all  
25 I have to say.

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,  
3 Council Member Richards. We will now hear from  
4 Council Member Van Bramer.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you  
6 very much, Madam Majority Leader. I am making a  
7 motion to amend Resolution number 1138. My motion,  
8 which I have in writing here, is to replace the  
9 current bill with a resolution to expel Council  
10 Member Andy King from the New York City Council.

11 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: The chamber will  
12 stand at ease. I want to inform Council Member Van  
13 Bramer that once the amendment is read you then have  
14 two minutes to then explain your proposed amendment.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: On the amendment from  
16 Council Member Van Bramer, with respect to Resolution  
17 1138-A, based on the report of the Committee on  
18 Standards and Ethics from October 22, 2019, it is  
19 resolved that the Council of the City of New York  
20 should expel Council Member Andy King.

21 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. I now  
22 recognize Council Member Van Bramer, who will have  
23 two minutes to speak, followed by Minority Leader  
24 Matteo, who will have five minutes to speak,

2 according to the rules. Any other member who wishes  
3 to speak after that will be granted two minutes.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you  
5 very much. Within the 48 pages of this report are  
6 scenes of staff being held in a council member's  
7 private home and told they could not leave unless  
8 they divulged confidential information about an  
9 investigation. At one of these meetings the name of  
10 a young woman who had filed a sexual harassment  
11 complaint against the council member was revealed and  
12 her integrity attacked. The report then details that  
13 two of the three staff members who were forced to  
14 divulge that they had spoken to investigators had  
15 their employment terminated or they were forced to  
16 quit. The report then goes to detail incidents of  
17 violence in the workplace, possible gross misuse of  
18 council funds and staff, not to mention comparing a  
19 gay pride parade to child pornography. This  
20 committee has made a strong recommendation for strong  
21 penalties and the bar for expulsion should be high.  
22 But for me there is no doubt in my mind that given  
23 that this is a not a first offense and that this, the  
24 severity of this report is such that I believe  
25 expulsion is warranted. Now, even if I were the only

2 one to vote for expulsion, I am not afraid to stand  
3 alone because I want to stand with Chloe Rivera and  
4 all of the others who have come forward, felt  
5 harassed, abused, violated, or punished for daring to  
6 speak. Chloe Rivera works for the City Council  
7 today. She walks the hallways, is in the elevator  
8 with all of us, and she is watching and listening, as  
9 are hundreds of other staff members who work at this  
10 body. They want to hear what we see. They want to  
11 hear what we do. They want to hear that we hear  
12 them, that we see them. So because I personally feel  
13 these charges are so severe and reprehensible I am  
14 proud to make this motion even if I stand alone,  
15 because I stand with Chloe Rivera and all of those  
16 great people who have come forward. Thank you.

17 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,  
18 Council Member Van Bramer. Minority Leader Matteo.

19 MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: Thank you. I  
20 just want to rise and state respectfully I stand by  
21 this committee's hard work, findings, and  
22 recommendations, and while reasonable people can  
23 certainly disagree on the exact penalties, this  
24 council has charged the Standards and Ethics  
25 Committee with hearing matters of misconduct and

2 recommending the penalties. This committee did that,  
3 worked tirelessly, spent hours and hours doing that.  
4 So, respectfully, I ask my colleagues to vote against  
5 this amendment. Thank you.

6 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

7 Council Member Carlos Menchaca.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you. The  
9 motion has been put on the floor for us to consider,  
10 and I really hope that other members can speak if  
11 they feel good or bad about this amendment. I think  
12 it's important for us to have a fuller discussion in  
13 public if they're comfortable. For me, the way that  
14 I'm making this decision is the following. When I  
15 think about our staff. They continue to ask us to do  
16 more for them, to continue to create a new normal.  
17 That is what we're doing here today. As harsh as  
18 this might feel, this is the kind of standard that we  
19 need to set for ourselves and to the communities that  
20 we represent. Only a fraction of the people send us  
21 to come and represent us here. We are representing  
22 every single person. I'm thinking about undocumented  
23 folks that never get the opportunity to vote for me.  
24 We're talking about every single person in our  
25 district, not just the few who say that we are

2 eligible. We are speaking on behalf of everyone.  
3 And that's the kind of responsibility we have at this  
4 body, and the responsibility that we have on each  
5 other to ensure that we move forward together. I  
6 also cannot support a bill that puts money, taxpayer  
7 dollars on a monitor, a new person that's going to go  
8 out and put a Band-Aid essentially to monitor the new  
9 situation. This essentially makes it almost  
10 impossible for a member to do their work. And if  
11 these allegations are true, and this committee is  
12 saying that they are true and we have to move through  
13 that due process and accept that, then I say  
14 expulsion. And I hope that you can take that moment  
15 of courage to say no and to send a message to the  
16 rest of the body and the future council that's on its  
17 way here, that is going to flip completely, that they  
18 are in a new world, a world where this is not OK, and  
19 that we're going only to accept the things that are  
20 good for ourselves and our community and our staff.  
21 Our staff are asking to unionize. Our staff are  
22 asking for more pay. Our staff are asking for a lot  
23 right now. And that is why I hope that after this  
24 vote, whatever happens, we can continue to look at

2 them and figure out how we can support them. I will  
3 be supporting this amendment. [bell]

4 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Not seeing any  
5 others who wish to speak, this debate is now closed.  
6 We are now going to call the roll, but I would like  
7 first for the clerk to reread the motion that was put  
8 forward by Council Member Van Bramer so that members  
9 are clear about what they are voting on at this time.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you, Madam Majority  
11 Leader. Based on the report of the Committee on  
12 Standards and Ethics from October 22, 2019, resolved  
13 that the Council of the City of New York should expel  
14 Council Member Andy King.

15 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: And to be clear,  
16 if this vote passes we will adjourn this meeting. If  
17 this vote does not pass we are going to continue with  
18 the original mission, excuse me, motion that was put  
19 forward on the floor. So we will now begin. We will  
20 now have roll call.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: I vote no to the  
23 amendment.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel

25 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: No.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I vote no to the  
4 amendment.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote no.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: No.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Brannan.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: No.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera. Chin.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I vote no.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: No.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Constantinides.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: May I be  
17 excused to explain my vote?

18 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
19 granted.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: You know,  
21 this has been, I want to first thank Council Member  
22 Matteo and all of the committee who deliberated on  
23 these, these penalties, and I thank them for their  
24 hard work. This is not an easy decision. I've heard  
25 a lot today and I feel I need to say my piece. Ah,



2 you know, I think about the staffers, the public  
3 servants who work for us every single day, who come  
4 to work because they want to make the city a better  
5 place. They want to make their districts a better  
6 place. And this was a violation of their right to do  
7 so. This was an attack on them and their ability to  
8 make a living and feed their families, to be able to  
9 do the work that they love so, so much. It was a, a,  
10 and to hear the complete lack of remorse, to hear no  
11 recognition at all of the seriousness of this matter,  
12 the seriousness of the allegations, the seriousness  
13 of what's being alleged, it is disturbing, it is  
14 disappointing. It's something that is unbecoming of  
15 this body. This job is a privilege. We all swear an  
16 oath and have an obligation to the people of the City  
17 of New York to do our jobs and protect those who need  
18 a voice. Council Member King's staff did not have a  
19 voice because he sought to take it away from them and  
20 to penalize them and to attack them. And I am  
21 unbelievably in disbelief today on the myriad of  
22 statements that have been made. So I will be joining  
23 my colleagues, even if it's just two of us, but I  
24 will be voting yes on this amendment. Thank you.

25 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy.  
3 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: No.  
4 COUNCIL CLERK: Deutsch.  
5 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: No.  
6 COUNCIL CLERK: Diaz. Dromm.  
7 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: No.  
8 COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal.  
9 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: I vote yes.  
10 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene.  
11 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I abstain.  
12 COUNCIL CLERK: Gibson.  
13 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I vote no on the  
14 amendment.  
15 COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj.  
16 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: No on the  
17 amendment.  
18 COUNCIL CLERK: Grodenchik.  
19 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: No on the  
20 amendment.  
21 COUNCIL CLERK: Holden.  
22 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: No.  
23 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos.  
24 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: No on the  
25 amendment.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: King. Koo.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: No.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: No on the  
6 amendment.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Yes.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Lander.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: No.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Levin.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to  
13 explain my vote?

14 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
15 granted.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you, Madam  
17 Majority Leader. So I, I do appreciate very much the  
18 spirit by which this amendment was introduced.  
19 Council Member Van Bramer spoke eloquently and from  
20 the heart and in particular recognizing Chloe Rivera  
21 and, and what she has had to, the ordeal with which  
22 she has to endure. While I think it may be  
23 appropriate to call on Council Member King to resign  
24 the office and step down, and to acknowledge that the  
25 conduct that he has displayed is unbecoming of a

2 council member, it is unbecoming of this body, it  
3 weakens this body. It puts staff at risk. It puts  
4 their health at risk. It puts their well-being at  
5 risk. I stand by the process of this committee and  
6 we put forward a set of recommendations based on a  
7 process that included a lot of hours of work. It  
8 included a substantial body of evidence which we  
9 deliberated over for many hours, and while I think it  
10 may be appropriate to again call on Council Member  
11 King to resign his office, I do stand by the  
12 recommendations of this committee and therefore I  
13 vote no on this amendment. Thank you.

14 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Levine.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: No.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Louis.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: No on the  
19 amendment.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel. Menchaca.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Yes on the  
22 amendment.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: No.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Moya. Perkins.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Yes on the  
3 amendment.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Powers.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Permission to  
6 explain my vote?

7 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
8 granted.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you. You  
10 know, I came here today to support my colleagues who  
11 went through this process for, seemingly two years,  
12 and to uphold the process by which the City Council  
13 is able to go through and deliberate on issues and to  
14 give people a fair hearing, which I think is what  
15 Andy King received, and, you know, I was hoping to  
16 come here today and hear an apology for the people  
17 that were affected by this and to hear remorse for  
18 it. And instead we heard complaints about the  
19 process, complaints about times waiting, things like  
20 that. I have all the confidence in my colleagues to  
21 be able to, to be able to make a reasonable decision  
22 here. But I have to say I'm very disappointed in  
23 what I heard today in terms of remorse or apology,  
24 and I have to do what I think is my conscious here,  
25 and I'm going to vote yes. Thank you.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Permission to  
4 explain my vote?

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
6 granted.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I just want to  
8 acknowledge the fact that in this committee we have,  
9 our colleagues are a part of this committee as well,  
10 and I want to respect the process that they put forth  
11 and believe in them and believe that they did pursue  
12 due process and did the best they could to make sure  
13 they gave Council Member King an opportunity to  
14 defend himself. But hearing what I heard today and  
15 that the basis of the argument being made by Council  
16 Member King is a lack of due process and not  
17 necessarily being remorseful, speaking to the staff  
18 members that have come forward it just, it doesn't  
19 sit well by me, and to be perfectly honest what we're  
20 talking about here with the sanctions that we're  
21 moving forward with are going to make it very  
22 challenge for Council Member King to even do his job  
23 as a Council Member in his own district. The people  
24 did send him up here to do some work and he's not  
25 going to be on any committees. He's going to be gone

2 for 30 days. And to be perfectly honest it will be  
3 very hard for him, considering what we're about to  
4 put him through, ah, to do proper business in the  
5 City Council. Now, he has the right to do that  
6 business, but council members might not want work  
7 alongside him anymore, and it's just a challenging  
8 thing here. So I am going to vote yes on the  
9 amendment for expulsion.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Richards.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I wasn't going  
12 to say Chloe's name, but for Chloe Rivera I vote aye.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Permission to  
15 explain my vote?

16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
17 granted.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: We as council  
19 members, we have responsibilities. We have  
20 responsibilities to our district and we have  
21 responsibilities to this body. And we learn from  
22 constituents and we learn from our colleagues. Now,  
23 we might not always agree. Clearly, we disagree all  
24 the time. But we also have to acknowledge people's  
25 experiences, their perspectives, and what we've

2 heard. And to the staffers, I was one of you. Many  
3 people on this body were also on staff. The  
4 Committee on Standards and Ethics has former staff  
5 people. They have people of color, women of color, a  
6 woman of color from the Bronx who had to deliberate  
7 and thoughtfully think about what she was putting  
8 forward, and that is one of the reasons why I stand  
9 by this committee. How difficult it is to come to  
10 this decision when we all know how much work we do.  
11 And the reflection and the remorse that has come from  
12 Council Member Key, from Council Member King, safe to  
13 stay, is incredibly underwhelming. And that's what  
14 makes this decision so difficult for all of us and  
15 that we're disappointed. We're disappointed. So  
16 I've said this before, perceived character aside of  
17 the council member, this is about process and that  
18 process should be respected, and I'm going to stand  
19 by the Committee on Standards and Ethics and I'm  
20 going to vote no on this amendment. And I, and I  
21 think I stand with a lot of people when we ask and  
22 demand that more reflection and more remorse be  
23 evident and that apology be issued for all of the  
24 people on this staff who are going through this and



2 had the courage to step forward. Thank you. I vote  
3 no on this amendment.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Permission to  
6 explain my vote?

7 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
8 granted..

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: I believe that  
10 the committee has done a great job. They've been  
11 going through a process. I will respect the process  
12 and their recommendation. And also knowing that even  
13 though we believe that justice is blind, but usually  
14 that justice when you look at black and Latino is  
15 completely difference, so all the people who are not  
16 black and Latino, I will respect this process. I  
17 think they have done their job. I don't believe that  
18 the council based on what we heard and what we read  
19 had the right to expel the council member. I believe  
20 that their recommendation that they have made are  
21 fair and therefore I will vote no on this amendment.

22 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Rose.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: No on the  
25 amendment.

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Rosenthal.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: With permission to  
4 explain my vote?

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
6 granted.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: On behalf of Chloe  
8 Rivera and all staff, I vote yes.

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Salamanca.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: No on the  
12 amendment.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Torres.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Permission to  
15 explain my vote?

16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
17 granted.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Like most of my  
19 colleagues, all of them, all of my colleagues, I'm  
20 just, I'm appalled and sickened by what I read. And  
21 there's no question a case could be made that the  
22 conduct is so egregious that's disqualifying. But I  
23 want to respect the process that was conducted by my  
24 colleagues, who put far more time and energy into  
25 this than I did. And I just want to say that I

2 resent the trumpian insinuation that this is a witch  
3 hunt. I have as much confidence in the integrity of  
4 this process as I have in the integrity of Corey  
5 Johnson and Karen Koslowitz and Steve Levin and  
6 Margaret Chin and Vanessa Gibson. There is no doubt  
7 in my mind that all of them as stellar public  
8 servants conducted this investigation fairly and with  
9 integrity, and I want to respect their  
10 recommendations, so I'm going to vote no on the  
11 amendment.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Treyger.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to  
14 explain my vote?

15 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
16 granted.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: As elected  
18 officials, as people with considerable power within  
19 this body, we need to do more to hold one another  
20 accountable. We are mandated to report harassment  
21 and we need to take that obligation seriously. We  
22 need to have challenging conversations with one  
23 another about appropriate behavior even when it  
24 strains collegiality. We need to stand up for staff.  
25 They work long hours in high-pressure jobs for far

2 too often not enough pay, and they are at-will  
3 employees. We owe it to them to be their allies and  
4 advocates, in addition to benefitting from the fruits  
5 of their labor. Even during the course of today's  
6 discussion when there was an opportunity to display  
7 an ounce of remorse, instead we heard finger pointing  
8 and name calling amongst our colleagues. And it is  
9 with that that I vote yes on this amendment.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Pass for now.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: No on the  
14 amendment.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Permission to  
17 briefly explain my vote?

18 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
19 granted.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: I, I wanted  
21 to mention, because in the rush to make to make two  
22 minutes previously, that I have great respect for  
23 Chair Matteo and the work of the committee, and,  
24 look, I've been very public about my feelings about  
25 this since day one. But I do want to echo what many

2 of my colleagues have said, regardless of how they  
3 vote, while I was prepared to make the amendment, it  
4 was only after I heard Council Member King speak that  
5 I knew that I had to, and the absolute lack of  
6 remorse, the absolute lack of even understanding that  
7 anything had been done wrong, anything, blaming other  
8 council members, blaming lawyers, blaming staff, that  
9 to me is just even more of the pattern of behavior  
10 that brought us to this moment in the first place,  
11 and to say all of that with hundreds of City Council  
12 staff members, either in this room as we speak right  
13 now or listening or watching this on their computers  
14 in their cubicles over across the street in 250  
15 Broadway, is absolutely disgraceful. Absolutely  
16 disgraceful. And I want to say, again, because she  
17 came bravely forward today in a *Daily News* op ed, to  
18 Chloe Rivera, ah, who gave me permission to share her  
19 story, ah, in my comments, that is an unbelievable  
20 act of bravery, as is staying here and working in  
21 this body after having had the experience of filing a  
22 complaint against a council member. She is still  
23 here because she is smart. She is a public servant  
24 and wants to do this work. We should honor all of  
25 the young people like Chloe Rivera who are doing this

2 work and so because I want to honor that work and  
3 because I'm so outraged by the lack of remorse [bell]  
4 I vote yes.

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,  
6 Council Member Van Bramer.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Yeger.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: No.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I would like to  
11 explain my vote, if I may.

12 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
13 granted.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you. I  
15 have tremendous respect for my colleagues, especially  
16 for my good friend, the chair of the ethics  
17 committee, Steven Matteo. I respect the process that  
18 brought us here today, ah, the deliberative process  
19 and the amount of time that they spent. But I do  
20 think that perhaps what's missing is respect for, ah,  
21 putting more importance in respect for the people  
22 over the process, and based upon the report, what  
23 I've read, based upon what I read in today's *Daily*  
24 *News*, and, and just listening to everyone's comments  
25 today. That's why I asked for a pass, not to make a

2 mockery of the process, but because I genuinely  
3 wanted to listen to what my colleagues had to say. I  
4 will be voting yes for the amendment. I am voting  
5 yes for the amendment. Thank you.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo.

7 MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: No.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo.

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I vote no.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson.

11 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Permission to explain  
12 my vote?

13 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
14 granted.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: You know, I said it  
16 when I gave my remarks during speaker time, but one  
17 thing that has been done over the course, over the  
18 course of the last, ah, eight months and was done  
19 again today here on the floor of this body is Council  
20 Member King attacking the process, attacking the  
21 integrity of the process, attacking the committee,  
22 and I, I find so much of what has happened to be  
23 unacceptable and odious and wrong. But what I have  
24 tried to do as speaker of this body is to allow a  
25 process with integrity that respects confidentiality,

2 that respects due process rights, that goes by the  
3 letter of what we are supposed to do here, internally  
4 in the council. That is why you saw an independent  
5 prosecutor hired. That is why you saw the committee  
6 not rush to judgment, but to take a long time. That  
7 is why you saw the Office of General Counsel protect  
8 the witnesses over and over again when they were  
9 facing retaliation. So the easy thing to do for me  
10 today would be yes, to vote to expel Council Member  
11 King. But, as I said, I think he should resign. I  
12 think given what he has done he should resign. But I  
13 need to stand by, as speaker of this body, I must  
14 stand by the five members that have deliberated over  
15 hours and hours and hours and spent months and months  
16 and months working on this. I am speaker. I support  
17 the committee. This is a terrible situation that  
18 Council Member King has put this body in. The way he  
19 has treated staffers is unacceptable. I want to  
20 thank them again for their bravery, for their courage  
21 in coming forward. His behavior is egregious and  
22 appalling. I have tremendous sympathy for these  
23 staffers. We will continue to protect them and make  
24 sure their livelihoods are not threatened. We will  
25 monitor his office. But I have to vote no on this



2 amendment because [bell] I have to stand by the work  
3 that the committee did.

4 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,  
5 Council Member, Speaker Corey Johnson. This chamber  
6 will stand at ease for a moment. In order for this  
7 amendment to pass it needs a majority vote of the  
8 members present. If it does not, the resolution will  
9 be laid over for a future Stated Meeting. At that  
10 meeting it would require a two-thirds vote of all  
11 members. If it does fail we continue with general  
12 discussion of General Orders and we have members that  
13 are signed up at this time. According to the  
14 amendment that was put for a vote by this body, we  
15 have 12 in the affirmative, 34 in the negative, and  
16 no abstentions abstention. This motion is defeated.  
17 We will now continue with General Orders on Bill  
18 1138, and on the docket we had Council Member Robert  
19 Cornegy. Council Member Cornegy, would you care to  
20 speak at this time.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: No, no, Majority  
22 Leader. Thank you.

23 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. We  
24 now have Council Member Ritchie Torres to continue to  
25 speak on 1138, as originally presented.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Thank you, Madam  
3 Majority Leader. You know, the egregious misconduct  
4 of Council Member Andy King offers us an occasion for  
5 deeper soul searching as an institution. I've been  
6 in the City Council for nearly six years and I've  
7 seen more activity by Standards and Ethics in the  
8 past year and a half than I ever saw in the preceding  
9 four years. It could be that in prior City Councils  
10 there were no abuses of power to investigate, or it  
11 could be that there were in fact abuses of power, but  
12 those abuses have historically been swept under the  
13 rug. History tells us that covering up abuse is what  
14 institutions do. It is in the nature of  
15 institutions, whether it be a news organization in  
16 relation to Harvey Weinstein, or the church in  
17 relation to victims of sex abuse, or the City  
18 Council. It's in the nature of institutions to  
19 protect themselves, to protect their own insiders,  
20 their own interests, their own image, often at the  
21 expense of truth and often to the exclusion of  
22 justice and closure for the victims. So we are not  
23 only voting to punish Council Member King. In a  
24 deeper sense we're voting to break the culture of  
25 secrecy and impunity that for too long might have

2 enabled the abuse of public office in the City  
3 Council. And so I applaud the Speaker not only for  
4 exposing abuses of power, but also holding  
5 accountable the very elected officials who abuse the  
6 public office that has been entrusted to them by the  
7 people. And the operative word here is trust. As  
8 elected officials, none of us enjoy the divine right  
9 of kinds. None of us is entitled to govern. Our  
10 power has been entrusted, and when we abuse that  
11 power, when we betray the trust that is the source of  
12 that power, we must be held accountable. The rule of  
13 law must be upheld without fear or favor, without  
14 exception or hesitation. And so I want to commend  
15 the Speaker for his leadership. [bell]

16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,  
17 Council Member Torres. We will now hear from Council  
18 Member Koslowitz.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Thank you.  
20 First, I want to say thank you to Council Member  
21 Matteo, leading us to come to the decision that we  
22 made. You know, we didn't elect Council Member King.  
23 The public did. But we want to remind the public of  
24 what he did. We sat and listened to his employees  
25 come and talk separately, and it was, it brought us

2 to tears of what they had to go through. Nobody  
3 should have to go through that. Nobody should have  
4 to get up in the morning and dread going to work  
5 because they were going to be ridiculed, punished,  
6 threatened, anything that could harm them. I think  
7 that it was very hard for us to, at first to judge a  
8 colleague, but it became easier to judge the  
9 colleague after everything we heard that the  
10 colleague had done. And we came to the conclusion of  
11 the sanctions that we put on the colleague. You  
12 know, for the next two years and two months Andy King  
13 will remember what he did. He will have someone  
14 watching over him. He will have to pay retribution.  
15 And I think that is punishment that he deserves, and  
16 hopefully his constituency, if he ever decides to run  
17 for any kind of office again, his constituency sees  
18 what he has done and he is not fit to run for any  
19 kind of office. So, obviously, I was a part of this  
20 and I stick by what we came up with. [bell]

21 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,  
22 Council Member Koslowitz. Are there any other  
23 members who wish to speak on General Orders at this  
24 time? We will now close General Orders and we will go  
25 on now to Report of Special Committees.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

3 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Reports of  
4 Standing Committees.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee  
6 on Standards and Ethics, Preconsidered Resolution  
7 1138.

8 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
9 Orders, and at this time I will ask for a roll call  
10 vote on Preconsidered Resolution 1138.

11 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Permission to  
14 explain my vote?

15 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
16 granted.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you, Madam  
18 Majority Leader. I sit here today listening to  
19 everything that's transpired, and this has been such  
20 a disappointing session. It's been a disappointing  
21 meeting for me. It's been disappointing that we're  
22 here today discussing very, very difficult and  
23 disappointing circumstances. You know, when I read  
24 the report and read all the witness accounts it was  
25 painful to read the accounts, and as difficult as the

2 accounts were to repeat, I would imagine, before the  
3 committee my decision today is difficult. And I'm  
4 sure, like the rest of my colleagues, at least some,  
5 it is a painful one to come to a conclusion as this,  
6 as it pertains to one of our colleagues. That said,  
7 I vote yes to the recommendations of the committee.

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Permission  
11 to explain my vote?

12 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
13 granted.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: As my  
15 colleague just stated, this is very difficult. No  
16 one wants to be in this position. But having read  
17 the entire recommendations and what was put forth by  
18 the committee, I just want to, one, applaud the  
19 committee members. But I also want to recognize all  
20 of the brave staffers who came forward. Having been  
21 a staffer several times and even in this body,  
22 sometimes you feel like you're just an employee at  
23 will and no one will listen. But today I'm proud of  
24 my colleagues for listening and actually doing  
25 something about it, and so it is difficult. But at

2 the same time I'm comfortable in how I'm voting  
3 because this is really about the staffers and making  
4 sure that they are supported and people know that  
5 when they come to work they're serving their  
6 community. But they also have the support of the  
7 entire council. So with that I vote yes for the  
8 recommendations, the resolution.

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Permission to  
12 explain my vote?

13 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
14 granted.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: You know, I just,  
16 I've been sitting here listening quietly and just  
17 reflecting on everything that has been said and I'm  
18 just, I'm really saddened because I, too, was a  
19 staffer and I didn't have, thank God, I never had to  
20 work in an environment such as the one that has been  
21 described today. But as a woman, as a woman of  
22 color, as a woman who has endured harassment, I, I am  
23 appalled. I am disgusted that there was, there was  
24 ample opportunity to apologize, to explain, and that  
25 we had to sit here and listen to complaint after

2 complaint and complaint about due process being  
3 violated. Well, there were people that were  
4 violated. I felt that they were violated and those  
5 people did not feel heard today because the council  
6 member neglected to so much as even apologize. And I  
7 get it. If you don't feel that you did something  
8 wrong then you probably feel like you shouldn't have  
9 to apologize. But there is documented evidence.  
10 There was more than one individual that came in with  
11 the same complaint. And so I am voting aye, and I  
12 pray for peace for all of those individuals that felt  
13 that we didn't hear them and that so much time  
14 elapsed before anything was done. I proudly vote  
15 aye.

16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Request to  
19 explain my vote?

20 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
21 granted.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. We  
23 know that staff is very critical and essential to the  
24 work that we do. I've always tried to make sure that  
25 I support staff in their interests and the things



2 that they bring forward. The person who's been named  
3 works with the higher education committee and when it  
4 became known to me definitively that this was an  
5 allegation that had been brought I contacted the  
6 Speaker's office to make sure that I did all that I  
7 needed to do so that there was no undue interaction  
8 between the parties involved. So I'm always very  
9 concerned about fulfilling the responsibility of my  
10 position when I know that there's an issue at hand.  
11 When I was in Albany this person was also in Albany.  
12 I didn't know her at the time, ah, and was subjected  
13 to a similar kind of situation, and in that instance  
14 I believe I was the only one who wrote a letter  
15 saying that the process where this person was  
16 subjected to this type of behavior was inadequate,  
17 inappropriate, and needed to be corrected. I believe  
18 I was the only one to speak on behalf on this  
19 claimant in Albany at that time. However, today on  
20 this resolution I am abstaining. But I do want to  
21 note it for the record that I believe that staff  
22 should be supported and protected in all instances.  
23 Thank you.

24 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Borrelli.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Brannan.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Permission to  
5 explain my vote?

6 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
7 granted.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: I think I speak  
9 for a lot of my colleagues when I say that we, we  
10 didn't sign up for a job where we have to vote on the  
11 behavior, to censure the behavior of our colleagues.  
12 It's not easy. I give credit to Council Member  
13 Matteo and his committee for the work that they did  
14 over months and months on this case, and the facts  
15 that, for most of us, we're still just learning about  
16 now. As a staffer, as a former staffer in this  
17 council I know what a thankless job it is. I know  
18 how hard it is, and having a boss that's supportive  
19 is, is basically the baseline with work that is so  
20 difficult and demanding. But I support, I have faith  
21 that if the committee whose job it is to investigate  
22 issues like this, if they felt, that they felt that  
23 this was the strongest punishment that they could,  
24 that they could give, and that's why I'm voting yes  
25 on the resolution.

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera. Chin.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Permission to  
5 explain my vote?

6 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
7 granted.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Yes. First, I  
9 wanted to thank Chair Matteo and all my colleague on  
10 the committee. We have spent so much time  
11 deliberating on this, and every piece of evidence we  
12 review carefully, and I wanted to personally thank  
13 all of the staff witness that came forward, and thank  
14 you for your courage. Because when we heard your  
15 testimony it is so unacceptable that in the City  
16 Council that staff get treated like that. All of us,  
17 we work with our staff, we respect our staff, and  
18 they help us in everything that I do, and every  
19 council member also feel that. But we went through  
20 so many training in this council. The issue is how  
21 do we treat people with respect? Is the whole power  
22 dynamic? How can we disrespect people just because  
23 they work for us? This is really, really unacceptable  
24 and that's why the committee, all of us, look, we  
25 have family, we have kids, we spent a lot of time

2 deliberating on this. And I hope that my colleague  
3 will support our recommendation and I strongly vote  
4 yes. Thank you.

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Permission to  
8 explain my vote?

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
10 granted.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Thank you. Well,  
12 there is no doubt that substantiated facts here are  
13 very, very disturbing. I do just want to talk for a  
14 second about the process. You know, I know most of  
15 my colleagues probably do read every bill before  
16 they, they vote. But I personally rely on the  
17 committee system to do their job and I have  
18 tremendous confidence in the people on this committee  
19 that they did do the work that was necessary. They  
20 did sit through all, listening to all the testimony.  
21 They reviewed all the evidence. They voted  
22 unanimously. That is very, very meaningful to me and  
23 based on the recommendations of the committee I'm  
24 going to vote aye on the resolution.

25 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Constantinides.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: May I be  
4 excused to explain my vote?

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
6 granted.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank  
8 you. You know, I just came off a vote for a harsher  
9 penalty. And it would be easy for me to stay to vote  
10 no and saying that we deserve to have passed that  
11 resolution. But the choice before me now is to vote  
12 for the penalties that this committee has worked  
13 diligently and hard on, or to allow Council Member  
14 King to go on without punishment. He has shown no  
15 remorse. Today it's about the staffers that have  
16 been attacked. This is about the attack on their  
17 livelihood, the attack on their identities, attack of  
18 who they are. And I cannot play politics we that.  
19 We need to make sure that we send a stark message,  
20 not only to Council Member King, but to anyone who  
21 would think to violate the sanctity of this  
22 institution, the sanctity of anyone's employment,  
23 that we will hold them accountable. So I vote yes  
24 today on this current resolution as well, because we  
25 need a better body. We need to make sure that this

2 institution continues to operate in a way that  
3 protects all, that hears all, that fights for all,  
4 and that we continue to recognize that this is a  
5 privilege, that we serve our constituents every  
6 single day with a privilege to take care of them and  
7 give them a voice. So I, I, thank you again to the  
8 committee for their strong work, and I vote yes.

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Deutsch. Diaz. Dromm.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Yes.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Permission to  
16 explain my vote?

17 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
18 granted.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Just as a former  
20 staffer, first and foremost, I just want to thank the  
21 staff for speaking up when they felt that their  
22 rights were violated. I know it's not easy and it  
23 takes a lot of courage. I also want to thank Matteo.  
24 I know him to be someone who is fair, someone who  
25 respects the process, and he doesn't have the easiest

2 job in this, in this, in this body, being that he  
3 holds a committee that takes on the important work as  
4 we're seeing today. So I want to thank him and, and  
5 everyone in that committee for taking, for doing the  
6 work and putting up this recommendation. And for  
7 those reasons I vote aye.

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Gibson.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to  
13 briefly explain?

14 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
15 granted.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you again.

17 And I just want to add on and just say that, you  
18 know, I really thank the Speaker and Chair Matteo and  
19 all of the members of the committee. This has been a  
20 physically and emotionally draining process for the  
21 five of us that sit on this committee. And I  
22 appreciate all of my colleagues in respecting and  
23 having confidence in the process. We certainly  
24 wanted to, again, be extremely fair and follow  
25 protocol and follow the rules of this body. And I

2 appreciate the witnesses coming forward under  
3 challenging times, feeling disloyal, you know, in the  
4 council and not really feeling the strength to come  
5 forward, but somehow, some way they did it and so I  
6 stand with them again in what they have endured and  
7 really want to make sure that we assure those staff  
8 members and really every staff member that it is our  
9 responsibility to protect them at all times. And so  
10 once again I thank the wits for coming forward and  
11 thank my colleagues on the committee, Council Member  
12 Levin, Council Member Koslowitz, Council Member Chin,  
13 and Chair Matteo, and I will be supporting the  
14 resolution before the body. Thank you.

15 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Aye.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Grodenchik.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Holden.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: King.



2 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Briefly, I want to  
3 say thank you to all of you who are voting today. At  
4 the beginning of my conversation I mentioned how I  
5 felt about my staff, um, maybe it might have fell on  
6 deaf ears, um, but at the end of the day I thank all  
7 my staff who's worked with me, um, and I'm continuing  
8 to do what I can to be Christ's child and serve and I  
9 vote no on this today. Thank you.

10 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Deutsch.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Yes.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Koo.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I vote aye.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Lander.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I vote yes.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Levin.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to  
23 explain my vote?

24 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
25 granted.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you, Madam  
3 Majority Leader. I just want to clarify a remark I  
4 made earlier. With regard to the due process and the  
5 hearing that we had of the Standards and Ethics  
6 Committee, ah, Council Member King is correct that  
7 without him being present his attorneys could not  
8 call witnesses or, or cross examine the witnesses  
9 presented by the prosecution. However, they could  
10 have objected. They could have remained and  
11 objected, and he himself could have been present and  
12 therefore have called on either two of the hearing  
13 dates, called witnesses and allowed his attorneys to  
14 cross examine witnesses, and in both instances he  
15 declined to participate on either hearing day his  
16 attorneys declined to even remain present to render  
17 an objection to any answers that any of the witnesses  
18 gave. So that is just to clarify the record there.  
19 And then secondly I do want to, ah, to speak directly  
20 to those witnesses that came forward in this process.  
21 They took on such a responsibility to do this and  
22 truly endured an immensely difficult situation and  
23 time and had to wrestle with facing these dilemmas in  
24 their professional life that nobody should ever have  
25 to face. Nobody should ever have to face that,

2 what's detailed in this report. And, ah, and so my  
3 heart goes out to them. I wish them nothing but the  
4 best in their professional endeavors, and I want to  
5 thank them for coming forward. It took real guts.  
6 And I want to thank also Chloe Rivera [bell] for, for  
7 coming forward as well, and displaying genuine  
8 courage at this time.

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,  
10 Council Member.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: And with that I  
12 vote aye. Thank you.

13 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Levine.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Permission to  
16 briefly explain my vote?

17 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
18 granted.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: You know, abuse  
20 of power, abuse of staff is not a new offense. It's  
21 been occurring in legislative bodies for a long time.  
22 But it is rarely, rarely does it face consequences  
23 because staff often fear to speak up and to speak  
24 out, and because colleagues often fear to hold one of  
25 their own accountable. And I am really proud of the

2 staff who against very clearly articulated threats  
3 found the courage to speak out, publicly and  
4 privately. It's because of them that we're here, and  
5 I'm really proud of the Standards and Ethics  
6 Committee and Speaker, ah, Chair Matteo, who put  
7 forward a meticulous, extensive, profoundly fair in  
8 my opinion, process, to arrive at, ah, one of the  
9 most serious sanctions that I'm aware this body has  
10 ever levied, and we're sending the message to staff  
11 who may be victims in the future that you can speak  
12 out and we will back you when you do, and so I will  
13 be voting yes.

14 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Louis.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Aye.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel. Menchaca.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to  
19 explain my vote?

20 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
21 granted.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you. I  
23 will be voting in support of this resolution and I  
24 know the other resolution or amendment failed, but I  
25 also remain committed to maintaining my voice for the

2 resignation of my colleague, Council Member Andy  
3 King. I also want to make sure that we think about  
4 this in terms of a long-term commitment to a better  
5 City Council that has staff that are supported, and  
6 so let's figure out how we do that. That's the kind  
7 of work that I think we can do more of and I hope  
8 that after this vote we can sit down and caucus  
9 around that. Imagine what would happen if we allow  
10 staff to tell how we could support them. What would  
11 they say? How could we do that? I think that would  
12 be, that would leave me feeling good in terms of the  
13 kind of work. And I know that we've done a lot  
14 already. I don't think we've done enough. Let's do  
15 more. Let's let them lead us as a sign of  
16 reconciliation as we move forward with our staff, who  
17 need our support. I vote aye.

18 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Permission to  
21 explain, please?

22 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
23 granted.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Madam  
25 Majority Leader. First, I want to express my respect

2 for the work of, of Chair Matteo and the members of  
3 the Committee on Standards and Ethics, as well as  
4 [central] staff in their efforts in regards to this  
5 matter, and ensuring that we're protecting the, the  
6 body, not just the integrity of the body but those  
7 who've, who've come forth to, to have their voice  
8 heard. The seriousness of these charges that have  
9 been made demand that the members of the body be  
10 afford every opportunity to weigh all of the evidence  
11 presented. Despite the reasoning, the reasonings of  
12 the committee and its decision to recommend  
13 disciplinary actions outlined in the resolution, I  
14 myself, I'm still troubled with voting to sanction,  
15 ah, to these sanctions without hearing the, the total  
16 defense of Council Member King. As many have stated  
17 how important the, the charges that we have heard,  
18 then the testimony we heard today was, the fact of  
19 the matter is the fact that remains that, um, it is a  
20 lot of information to digest, it is information that  
21 me in good conscious have not been able to come to,  
22 um, because of the lack of not just information for  
23 me prior to this point in time, but the time to be  
24 able to assess that. We have an obligation to ensure  
25 that we are taking this vote, ah, to ensure justice,

2 not for any other reasons. Therefore, I, I will be  
3 abstaining on the vote.

4 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Moya. Perkins.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Powers.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Permission to  
9 explain my vote?

10 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
11 granted

12 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you. I'm  
13 voting yes. As I stated earlier, I came her today  
14 with the expectation to vote yes on this resolution,  
15 which was a culmination of two works, two years of  
16 work by my colleagues and I walked into the chamber  
17 prepared to vote on this resolution. Chair Matteo, I  
18 feel strongly, is one of the best servants in the,  
19 the council and perhaps the only person who could  
20 ensure that this was a fair process outside of  
21 politics and his, and the colleagues on the  
22 committee, Council Member Chin, Gibson, Koslowitz,  
23 and Levin, I feel the same way. They are fair  
24 arbitrators and people who ensure a fair present.  
25 But after I heard the comments, previously I didn't

2 believe there would be anything that would truly  
3 change the behavior of the council member here in  
4 question, and that's ultimately why I believe I had  
5 to vote yes, but with that being said I fully support  
6 the committee here, the work that's done by the staff  
7 and Chair Matteo, and, you know, and I am voting yes  
8 alongside my colleagues because I believe we have to  
9 move on a motion here to ensure that there is a  
10 penalty for the behavior in that report, and I want  
11 to thank all of them for their work. I vote yes.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Permission to  
14 explain my vote?

15 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
16 granted.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: In order, in  
18 order for someone to rehabilitate they have to  
19 recognize, they have to recognize that there's an  
20 issue. An inability to recognize any wrongdoing is  
21 very, very dangerous. I just want to be mindful, ah,  
22 make sure we're mindful of that, that there has been  
23 no recognition of wrongdoing whatsoever by Council  
24 Member Andy King at this moment, and that is a  
25 problem for even staff that would be overseen by a



2 monitor. I was also a staff member, like many of us  
3 here, and just the, the council member, the council  
4 member's presence in and around these staffers that  
5 have been harassed in itself can be traumatizing and  
6 can have severe consequences, and we hope, and I  
7 guess I'll speak to Council Member King, that we work  
8 towards rehabilitation in, in the outcome of what we  
9 have here today, which is following through on the  
10 recommendations made by the committee. I want to  
11 thank the staff for their courage to come out and  
12 speak and to know that we're going to continue to  
13 build the process by which they feel protected and  
14 safe and that if and when this type of stuff happens  
15 we, we do something about it and that we take it  
16 seriously. I also want to thank Council Member  
17 Matteo and the committee, who I have the utmost  
18 respect for, Matteo, Chin, Gibson, Koslowitz, Levin  
19 are outstanding elected officials that I have the  
20 utmost respect for. So thank you for that work and  
21 thank you, Speaker Corey Johnson, and I'm going to  
22 vote aye on this amendment.

23 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Richards.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I vote aye.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Permission to  
4 explain my vote?

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
6 granted.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I just want to  
8 send, I guess, just a clear message that if, you  
9 cannot bring yourself to operate respectfully within,  
10 to operate respectfully within the expectations of  
11 this body then maybe this body isn't for you. And I  
12 say that because we have had other elected officials  
13 here, in Albany and D.C., across the country, behave  
14 irresponsibly, and we have rules and we have a  
15 committee to deal with, with those consequences and  
16 those penalties. And, again, I, I stand with the,  
17 with the committee and those women who had to read  
18 those allegations and to make those decisions  
19 thoughtfully and pragmatically and with all of their  
20 constituencies in mind. And so with that,  
21 unequivocally I vote yes on this amendment.

22 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Permission to  
25 explain my vote?

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
3 granted.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: This is about  
5 protecting the staff in the public and private  
6 sectors, and whatever we do in the City of New York  
7 definitely has an impact on other municipalities in  
8 our nation. [speaks in Spanish] yes.

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Rose.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Permission to  
12 explain my vote?

13 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
14 granted.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: It is really my  
16 hope that Council Member King will reflect on this  
17 decision and see the error of his ways and how  
18 egregious his actions were and the impact that it has  
19 had on others. As a woman of color, I cannot  
20 sanction his actions. I hope that staff will not  
21 view this as the norm and will view today's  
22 procedures as unconditional support for our staff and  
23 the value that they bring to this body. And I want  
24 to thank the committee and all those who spoke  
25 courageously against the violation of our staff's

2 rights and our sensibilities. And with that I sadly  
3 vote aye.

4 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Rosenthal.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Permission to  
7 explain my vote?

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
9 granted.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: First, I want  
11 to express my gratitude to Chloe Rivera. I give  
12 enormous credit to her for speaking truth to power  
13 and refusing to back down in her pursuit of justice.  
14 To go through sexual harassment multiple times in  
15 one's career, as she has, and to demand justice each  
16 time is excruciatingly hard and courageous. This is  
17 a burden that survivors of workplace harassment and  
18 abuse are forced to carry in addition to the  
19 harassment itself. We have seen this again and again  
20 as the Me Too movement has spread across the country  
21 and the world. Survivors who come forward are in  
22 grave danger of being retraumatized. I am grateful  
23 to all those who have come forward with nothing to  
24 gain and much to lose. In the private sector if  
25 sexual harassment the perpetrator is disciplined. If

2 retaliation happens the perpetrator is fired. To see  
3 lawmakers not being held to the same standard is  
4 incredibly disheartening. Taking appropriate  
5 disciplinary action against Council Member King is  
6 complicated by the fact that he was chosen by his  
7 constituents to represent them. He is responsible to  
8 them. But he is also responsible to this body and  
9 that is why I'm voting for these disciplinary  
10 measures. And that is why I am urging Council Member  
11 King to resign his seat immediately. He must take  
12 full responsibility for his own actions and not allow  
13 his status as council member to protect him. [bell]  
14 Council Member King is not above the law.

15 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Torres.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Permission to  
18 explain my vote briefly?

19 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
20 granted.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I, when I was  
22 praising the integrity of the members of the  
23 Standards and Ethics Committee I neglected to pay  
24 tribute to Steven Matteo, who I think is as  
25 apolitical, as dispassionate, as even-tempered a

2 member as any in this body. And I trust any findings  
3 that he presents to us. So I, I'm going to vote aye  
4 without hesitation, and as far as I'm concerned, you  
5 know, Helen Rosenthal, Council Member Rosenthal,  
6 referenced the Me Too movement. The Me Too movement  
7 for me is more than about sexual harassment. It's  
8 about the abuse of power and I think today we're  
9 voting not only on the fate of one particular member,  
10 but we're voting affirmatively on a culture shift  
11 that was brought on by the Me Too movement and, and  
12 that is a culture shift that I vote for  
13 affirmatively, so I vote aye.

14 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Salamanca.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Treyger.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to  
19 explain my vote?

20 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
21 granted.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: So I do, I want  
23 to thank the staffer who filed the initial complaint  
24 and the members of Council Member King's staff who  
25 cooperated with the investigation, who chose at great

2 personal sacrifice to hold this body accountable for  
3 upholding the council's internal rules and laws  
4 against harassment. Their courage and personal  
5 integrity should never be forgotten. And I also want  
6 to just publicly note that Chair Matteo is one of the  
7 most honorable people that I know, both in this body  
8 and in public life. And so I want to thank him for  
9 his incredible work and integrity throughout this  
10 entire process, and with that I vote aye.

11 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Madam Majority  
14 Leader, permission to explain my vote briefly?

15 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
16 granted.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you very  
18 much. I, I'm going to be voting yes for, I'm sorry,  
19 in favor of the committee's report and  
20 recommendation. But I want to bring out just another  
21 point, if I may. I consider the chair of the  
22 Standards and Ethics Committee, Steven Matteo, a  
23 personal friend and I think he is above reproach, and  
24 he has always conducted himself with the utmost  
25 integrity and carried out his duties to the best of

2 his ability. So my vote for the amendment is not any  
3 slight to him or to any members of the committee,  
4 whom I also have the utmost respect for. My concern  
5 is that the council today is voting to punish Andy,  
6 Andy, and also his constituents. His constituents  
7 did not break any rules. His constituents did not  
8 commit any crime, and yet they are going to be  
9 deprived of the same type of representation and  
10 advocacy that we all strive to provide for our  
11 constituents because we are going to render their  
12 council member ineffective. We are taking him off  
13 committees. He will not have the same oversight  
14 capability that we have and that we enjoy to hold  
15 agencies accountable on behalf of the districts that  
16 we represent. And his voice will be not somewhat,  
17 but, but substantially diminished in this body. And  
18 so if you think that what he has done and what is  
19 contained in this report is so egregious and so  
20 wrong, then why not offer a stiffer penalty for him  
21 individually, politically, financially, or some other  
22 way? Why must we also be punishing his constituents?  
23 I know that's not the goal of the report or the  
24 committee. But I think that inadvertently that is  
25 what we are doing. But I vote yes. Thank you.



2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Permission to  
7 briefly explain my vote?

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
9 granted.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: So I, I too,  
11 just want to mention again, Chair Matteo and I spoke  
12 a few times over the last 48 hours and I, I respect  
13 him and the committee's work on this matter.  
14 Obviously, my strong personal feelings about, ah, how  
15 severe the penalty should be, notwithstanding, I  
16 vote in favor of this amendment.

17 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Yeger.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Aye.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo.

21 MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: Just a moment to  
22 briefly explain my vote, please.

23 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
24 granted.

25

2                   MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: Thank you. I  
3 want to start off by thanking my colleagues on the  
4 committee. My colleagues certainly do not want to be  
5 in this position or on the committee and I think  
6 that's the exact reason why you want them on the  
7 committee. I thank them for their, their  
8 professionalism and feeling the emotions of the  
9 witnesses and acting prudently and responsibly, so I  
10 thank them. More importantly, I thank the witnesses  
11 for their bravery. We certainly felt their emotion  
12 and felt obligated to make sure that they are safe  
13 and we are doing that today. I stand by our  
14 recommendations, that we are acting responsibly,  
15 prudently, and justly. And for staffers watching, we  
16 will always do what we can to ensure that you are  
17 safe. And with that, I thank all my colleagues and I  
18 vote yes.

19                   COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo.

20                   MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I vote aye.

21                   COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson.

22                   SPEAKER JOHNSON: I vote aye.

23                   MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Before reading  
24 the vote tally I want to make sure that everyone is  
25 absolutely clear on the votes we have taken today.

2 The motion to amend this resolution, brought forward  
3 by Council Member Jimmy Van Bramer, failed by a vote  
4 of 34 in the negative and 12 in the affirmative, and  
5 one abstention. And therefore we will not have any  
6 future votes on this amendment. The vote we just  
7 took on Resolution 1138 requires two-thirds of the  
8 council in order to pass. We have 44 votes in the  
9 affirmative, one negative, and two abstentions. So  
10 in this case we have the two-thirds that is required  
11 by the council in order put forward the sanctions,  
12 and that this particular resolution now passes. We  
13 will now have the introduction and the reading of  
14 bills.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: We will now have  
17 Speaker Corey Johnson to close this meeting. But we  
18 will have prior to that the discussion of  
19 resolutions. Seeing none, we will now go into  
20 resolutions. None. And then we will go into general  
21 discussion. Are there any members that are present  
22 here today that wish to speak on general discussion?  
23 Seeing none, we will now go into closing by Speaker  
24 Corey Johnson.

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: This meeting of Monday,  
3 October 28, is hereby adjourned. Thank you, Madam  
4 Majority Leader.

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,  
6 Speaker Corey Johnson. [gavel]

7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date October 29, 2019