

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

----- X

January 10, 2017
Start: 1:07 p.m.
Recess: 3:28 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: DANIEL R. GARODNICK
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Vincent J. Gentile
Julissa Ferreras-Copeland
Karen Koslowitz
Ruben Wills
Donovan J. Richards
Inez D. Barron
I. Daneek Miller
Joseph C. Borelli

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Deputy Chief James Kehoe, Executive Officer
Borough of Manhattan South
New York City Police Department

Vincent Grippo, Deputy Commissioner
Management and Budget
New York City Police Department

Seth Severino, Executive Director
Capital and Budget Analysis Division
New York City Police Department

Greg Bishop, Commissioner
Department of Small Business Services

Louis Sanchez, Commissioner
Manhattan Borough
Department of Transportation

Kathy Wylde, President & CEO
Partnership for New York City

Tom Cusick, President
Fifth Avenue Business Improvement District

Rebecca Kriegman
Appearing for Senator Brad Hoylman

Derek Walsh, Owner
Judge Roy Bean Public House

Jessica Walker
Manhattan Chamber of Commerce

Joseph Loonam, Organizer
Riders Alliance

2 [sound check, pause]

3 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Good afternoon

4 and welcome to the Economic Development Committee of
5 the New York City Council. Today is Tuesday, January
6 10th, 2017. My name is Dan Garodnick, and I have the
7 privilege of chairing this committee. Today we will
8 be taking a close look at the economic impact of the
9 security measures undertaken by the NYPD, and Secret
10 Service to ensure the safety of President-Elect
11 Donald Trump and his family while they are in New
12 York City. I would like to note for anyone watching
13 at home or joining us in the Chambers today you can
14 join our conversation on social media by using the
15 hashtag #TrumpImpactNYC. As the local council member
16 representing the district that includes Trump Tower
17 and the surrounding area, my office is particularly
18 attuned to the concerns of the local residents, and
19 businesses whose lives have been impacted every day
20 since Mr. Trump was elected president. Since
21 November, the area around Trump Tower has been a
22 heightened security zone. 56th Street between
23 Madison and Sixth was completely closed to traffic.
24 For the hair salons, bars, restaurants and hotel on
25 the block, this had a major impact. They could not

2 reliably get deliveries. The street was filthy
3 because garbage collection would not take place
4 properly, and due to the heavy police presence,
5 including an NYPD Command Center at the Fifth Avenue
6 end and the truck screening station on Sixth Avenue,
7 people did not feel welcome to go down the block and
8 spend their money. Seniors and people with limited
9 mobility had to avoid the area entirely as they were
10 unable to get the curbside drop-off that they needed.
11 The Judge Roy Bean Pub reported a 30% reduction in
12 sales during the normally busy holiday season, and
13 according to the Fifth Avenue BID, it has been
14 estimated that some businesses on Fifth Avenue are
15 seeing a significant decrease in sales when the
16 President-Elect is in town. A survey by the New York
17 City Controller in late November revealed that some
18 of those business owners had already begun
19 anticipating laying off employees, relocating
20 elsewhere in the city, or simply closing altogether.
21 Simply put, the heightened security around Trump
22 Tower has had a very negative impact on businesses
23 operating in that area. As I noted before, I happen
24 to represent this district, and have made repeated
25 visits to hear these concerns from the local

2 businesses, and I was pleased to be joined by the
3 Small Business Services Commissioner Greg Bishop, who
4 is one of our witnesses today, on a walk-through of
5 the area just before the holidays. We heard from the
6 local businesses. We heard their concerns, and I
7 know that he will be sharing some of those today. My
8 office pushed for the re-opening of 56th Street to
9 through traffic between Fifth and Sixth, and we are
10 grateful that the city saw fit to open it—reopen it
11 on December 28th. While the committee commends the
12 efforts made by the Mayor's Office and NYPD to
13 restore a semblance of order and normalcy to this
14 block, the barricades and unannounced closures have
15 continued intermittently. Are they only temporary
16 changes to the security landscape or is this the new
17 normal? We're looking at four years of potential
18 disruptions. Businesses need to know how they can
19 plan for and survive them, and yes I am fully aware
20 that this depends on the President-Elect's own plans
21 and office and how often he intends to be himself at
22 Trump Tower. The impact of a president with a
23 residence in Midtown Manhattan is significant,
24 unprecedented, and can impact New York City's bottom
25 line in a variety of ways. When people do not shop

2 at the retailers on or near Fifth Avenue, the city
3 loses out on important revenue streams. CVS-2
4 reported the Fifth Avenue icon Tiffany & Co paid \$11
5 million in city taxes just last year, and when sales
6 are down, taxes are down, and layoffs cannot be far
7 behind. This means New Yorkers out of work, a
8 difficult burden for families in our city. There's
9 also traffic and congestion: Trump Block, as some
10 have dubbed it. Punishing traffic that has and will
11 accompany the movement of the President through
12 Manhattan streets. For those stuck in a car or a bus
13 in the middle of it, our stress levels rise, and
14 productivity falls. This congestion will impact our
15 ability to get to our jobs, and home to our families
16 and as a city, it also affects our ability to respond
17 to emergencies. In November, the President-Elect
18 traveled to his golf course in New Jersey by car,
19 which required the entire Lincoln Tunnel to be shut
20 down during a Friday rush hour. Since the election,
21 DOT has stated the travel time has increased by 66%
22 on Sixth Avenue, and by 25% heading east on 57th
23 Street. It should be noted that Fifth Avenue is the
24 city's busiest bus route carrying 140 buses an hour
25 every morning during the morning rush including

2 express buses to the Bronx, Queens and Staten Island.
3 This has citywide ramifications. And the traffic is
4 not limited to the streets. When Air Force 1 flies
5 in and out of JFK, of course, this is not unique to a
6 Trump Presidency. They clear the runways, and limit
7 arrivals and departures. Fueling and maintenance
8 trucks remain idle and incoming flights need to
9 circle or get diverted elsewhere. JFK, as we all
10 know, is the 15th busiest airport in the world with
11 over 1,200 flights per day on average. If the
12 President-Elect decides to visit each weekend here in
13 New York City, there will be frequent and
14 unpredictable delays in and out of JFK, which will
15 likely send ripple effects throughout the entire
16 domestic and international aviation system. This is
17 not even to mention the cost to the New York City
18 Budget that NYPD says is \$500,000 a day--\$500,000 per
19 day to provide security for the President-Elect. The
20 cost will amount to approximately \$35 million between
21 election day and inauguration day, and the federal
22 government to date has agreed to reimburse New York
23 City for only a paltry \$7 million. We should not be
24 losing \$28 million on this operation. We have a city
25 to run here, and a budget to balance, and we cannot

2 allow all of our resources and opportunities to be
3 swallowed up by this sudden obligation in Midtown.
4 To the President-Elect we understand that you have a
5 home Fifth Avenue, and we ask that you not treat
6 Trump Tower like a pied-a-terre. We ask that you
7 spend your time over the next four years at the White
8 House. The White House is lovely at any time of the
9 year, and that is a much better place to accommodate
10 these significant security obligations. We invited
11 the President-Elect or a representative to testify
12 today to talk about his plans. I don't believe we've
13 gotten a response, and I don't know if there's a
14 representative here. Mr. Trump is a New Yorker. He
15 inevitably has gotten stuck in traffic during a
16 president visit himself at some point, and we want to
17 remind him that he is about to travel with a very big
18 footprint. We appreciate that he has a home here,
19 but we also hope that he does not use it too often.
20 And on that note, I look forward to hearing today's
21 testimony. We have been joined by Council Members
22 Borelli and Richards, and I want to just remind you
23 that you can continue to share your opinions and
24 voice on this subject at the Hashtag #TrumpImpactNYC,
25 and now I want to welcome from the City Louise

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT 10

2 Sanchez for the Department of Transportation; Greg
3 Bishop, the Commissioner of the Department of Small
4 Business Services; Vincent Grippo, who is the Deputy
5 Commissioner of Management and Budget for NYPD; and
6 Deputy Chief James Kehoe, who is the Borough of
7 Manhattan South for NYPD. Gentlemen, welcome. We're
8 glad you're here. We know the challenges are tough,
9 and we look forward to hearing from you today. So,
10 are you going to start?

11 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: I'll start.

12 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Go right ahead.

13 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: [off mic] Good
14 afternoon, Chair Garodnick and members of the
15 Council. I am Deputy Chief James Kehoe—[on mic]
16 Deputy Chief James Kehoe, Executive Officer for
17 Borough of Manhattan South for the New York City
18 Police Department. I am joined here today by Vincent
19 Grippo, the NYPD Deputy Commissioner of Management
20 and Budget and Seth Severino, Executive Director,
21 NYPD'S Capital and Budget Analysis Division. We are
22 also joined here today by Greg Bishop, Commissioner
23 of the Department of Small Business Services and
24 Louis Sanchez, Manhattan Borough Commissioner for the
25 Department of Transportation. On behalf of Police

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT 11

2 Commissioner James P. O'Neill, I wish to thank the

3 City Council for the opportunity to speak with you

4 today about the impact that increased for the

5 President-Elect has had in Midtown Manhattan. At the

6 outset of my testimony today, I believe it is

7 essential for me to stress that protecting the

8 President-Elect and his family while in New York City

9 is a responsibility that Police Department takes very

10 seriously. Each day the NYPD performs unique and

11 complex tasks associated with safeguarding millions

12 of people each day who live and work and visit

13 America's most popular city as well as protecting one

14 of the country's busiest ports, infrastructure,

15 public transportation and waterway system. It is a

16 job that the NYPD readily and willingly takes on

17 ensuring the safety of New Yorkers and of the

18 President-Elect is common. As everyone is probably

19 aware, the President-Elect's residents and functional

20 transitional headquarters is located within Trump

21 Tower, a 58-story mixed-use skyscraper located on

22 Fifth Avenue between 56th and 57th Street in Midtown

23 Manhattan. The Tower is located in the heart of a

24 prime commercial area in Manhattan adjacent to high

25 profile hotels, multi-use buildings, department

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT 12

2 stores, highly used sidewalks and near subways and

3 bus stops as well as iconic tourist attractions like

4 Central Park. Following the results of the

5 presidential election, in cooperation with our

6 federal law enforcement partners, the NYPD promptly

7 implemented a 24-hour security protocol around Trump

8 Tower. While out of security concerns we cannot

9 provide specific deployment figures, officers and

10 tactical teams have been deployed to security posts

11 and screened checkpoints and civilian traffic

12 enforcement agents have been posted to manage traffic

13 disrupted by security operations and increased

14 pedestrian flow. The NYPD and its federal partners

15 have been working closely with the others to secure

16 the perimeter around Trump Tower and keep the area

17 safe for all. Nevertheless, providing an ongoing

18 presidential level of security in Midtown Manhattan

19 has presented challenges for the city. The cost of

20 providing the President-Elect with the necessary

21 level of security through this transition period has

22 been substantial and unprecedented in terms of

23 personnel required to full scope and duration.

24 Providing this protection is logistically complex and

25 requires a significant commitment of resources. This

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT 13

2 is why the Administration along with the Council has

3 called upon the Federal Government to reimburse the

4 city for funds that have been expended to date as

5 well as to engage in conversations on anticipated

6 security related expenses to protect the President-

7 Elect and his family over the course of this first

8 term. This is why the Administration along with the

9 Council has called upon the federal government

10 reimburse the city for funds that have been expended

11 to date, as well as to engage in conversations on

12 anticipated security related expenses to protect the

13 President-Elect and his family over the course of his

14 first term. Several small businesses and bigger

15 retail stores that operate in the vicinity of Trump

16 Tower have also experienced challenges particularly

17 with respect-respect to constraints on customer

18 traffic and delivery, protecting the President-Elect

19 while minimizing the impact to nearby businesses has

20 required constant dialogue from everyone involved.

21 The businesses, elected officials, key stakeholders

22 and our fellow city agencies. As this unique and

23 unprecedented situation continues to evolve, the

24 Police Department along with our colleagues in

25 government will continue to conduct outreach to those

2 that have been acted-impacted so that were are
3 informed of any security related challenges.
4 Recently, as we mentioned earlier, in order to
5 alleviate some of these constraints, the city
6 reopened 56 streets between Sixth and Fifth Avenue
7 and the NYPD has relocated our mobile command post
8 from the southwest corner of 56th Street to the
9 northwest corner of 56th Street. This has allowed
10 for an opening of the south side of 56th Street to
11 one lane through traffic while still allowing the
12 mobile command post to act as its traffic deterrent
13 to keep vehicular threats at that. These changes,
14 which were implemented in coordination with the
15 Department of Small Business Services, the Department
16 of Transportation, Secret Service and other law
17 enforcement partners will improve traffic flow while
18 also ensuring that the safety and security of Trump
19 Tower and the surrounding area remains intact. While
20 the safety of the President-Elect and everyone in the
21 surrounding area is top priority, the Administration
22 is committed to maintaining ongoing conversations
23 with businesses, residents, and pedestrians that have
24 been impacted by these extraordinary circumstances.

2 Thank you for the opportunity to speak with you
3 today, and we are pleased to answer any questions.

4 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Thank you.

5 Chris, do you have--? Okay, so that's the formal
6 testimony. Okay, terrific. Alright, well, then
7 we're certainly going to have a number of questions.
8 I want to note that we have been joined by Council
9 Member Koslowitz, and Deputy Chief, we thank you for--
10 for your testimony, and we recognize that this is a
11 unique situation, and that you all have your hands
12 full. We also want to think about ways to minimize
13 the impacts here to the small businesses, and even
14 the large businesses in the area, and they are really
15 struggling today. But the questions that I have for
16 you at least to start have to do with the costs and
17 the resources here to the City that are being
18 expended in Midtown Manhattan today. You noted that
19 the--the city has asked for reimbursements, but let's
20 talk about the costs. There have been reports and
21 even this--the reimbursement that was sought was an
22 estimated \$500,000 a day. Can you help us understand
23 how we get to that number?

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GRIPPO: Deputy
25 Commissioner of Management and Budget, Vincent

2 Grippo. With respect to the cost so there are a
3 couple of numbers that you've heard publicly, and
4 I'll sort of restate here. We have an estimate that
5 runs from election day to inauguration day. The
6 estimated cost for that period of time based on
7 deployment numbers is \$37.4 million. That includes
8 salary, full-time salary for the officers assigned to
9 those locations. It includes overtime because the
10 tours are extended at that location, and it includes
11 fringe benefits, which we traditionally do when we
12 seek reimbursement. So it's the fully loaded cost to
13 the city of having that officer on either straight
14 time or overtime at that location. That \$500,000
15 number that you cited is the deployment—if you look
16 at the deployment model, the number of officers, and
17 traffic enforcement agents I should add, at that
18 site, that it comes out to—the projection is \$500,000
19 per day, which is an estimate we derive from the
20 number of officers, the numbers of hours assigned,
21 and what the average salary would be for those
22 officers. At this time, we are looking at that same
23 deployment model any—on any day that the President—
24 Elect or after the Inauguration the president resides
25 within Trump Tower.

2 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: So that's a--that
3 estimate is a--a day in which you say that the
4 President-Elect was there.

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GRIPPO: Correct.

6 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay, and the
7 \$37.4 million when you talk about the salary for the
8 assigned personnel overtime plus fringe benefits,
9 that is above what we otherwise were paying these
10 officers for their work in New York City. Is that
11 correct?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GRIPPO: No, this is--
13 this is what it's costing to have that officer there
14 whether on straight time or overtime. So understand
15 the--the deployment model pulls officers from other
16 details, from precincts, puts them at that location.
17 We're seeing reimbursement from the federal
18 government for that because ultimately what happens
19 is the city is then reliant on overtime in the
20 commands that are now down in officers to compensate
21 for the lost officer that's now located at Trump
22 Tower. So, it ends up being--the best way for us to
23 receive compensation is ultimately to calculate the
24 cost of having that officer there. That then helps
25 us with the overtime issue we are seeing incurred

2 because we have so many officers assigned to this
3 location.

4 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: So that is...that
5 \$500,000 a day is your estimate for the days in which
6 the President-Elect is present in Trump Tower?

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GRIPPO: Correct.

8 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Let's talk now
9 about the days in which he is not present in Trump
10 Tower, and you can answer that question as--in terms
11 of whether his family is there or his family is not
12 there based on however you calculate it. But tell us
13 how you think about that, and what the costs end up
14 being?

15 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: Well, what I can say
16 is I cannot go into specific figures as far as
17 manpower goes, but I...what I can say is that there is
18 continuous dialogue between the NYPD and our federal
19 enforcement partners what the security would be
20 versus in-residence and out of residence. The mere
21 fact that the--Trump won the election puts Trump
22 Towers in that area as a security risk. So if there
23 is going to be a presence, and then one is out, but I
24 cannot--I cannot elaborate on the facts of these.

25

2 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Does-is that
3 because the dollar amount tells you how much security
4 that you would be putting out there on Trump Tower?
5 Is that reason why you can't answer that question?

6 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: No, it has to do
7 with the security of the President-Elect.

8 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay. so the--

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GRIPPO:
10 [interposing] It's also-it's also just to say, I
11 think it's-there are-there are so many variables we
12 really to my knowledge don't have a firm model for
13 days at which the President-Elect and the President
14 of the United States is not there simply because it's
15 likely that many factors will come into play with
16 respect to what's needed at that site. The model
17 we've created is for the President post-inauguration
18 making residents in that building. What we also know
19 is that on any day that he's not there, that location
20 that address, that building is clearly an elevated
21 risk building than it was prior to the President's
22 election, and so there will be an increased presence.
23 It's not-we haven't looked at in dollars and cents
24 because it's not something we would ultimately be
25 seeking compensation for. We're seeking compensation

2 for what we view as an unprecedented event to have a
3 President of the United States, a sitting president
4 residing outside the White House in New York City in
5 a high-rise building in Midtown Manhattan. That cost
6 and burden is what we're seeking compensation for.

7 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: So just to be
8 clear, the City is not seeking compensation for days
9 in which there's family present, but not the
10 President—the President-Elect or President?

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GRIPPO: Not—not at
12 the current time no. That's correct.

13 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay, and the
14 number of officers that would have to be redeployed
15 from other areas in order for that \$500,000 number to
16 be reached is how many?

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GRIPPO: That—that
18 answer I cannot give due to—due to security reasons
19 for the President-Elect.

20 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Is there any way
21 that the Police Department has or can break down—has—
22 has the Police Department broken down that number for
23 the purpose of seeking reimbursement or for arguing
24 for the—the number itself that would not cause risk
25 to the President-Elect. I mean how—how—how—how does

2 somebody take that number seriously unless we know
3 how you arrive at it?

4 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: We look at the
5 number. We have broken down the number, but in this-
6 this arena I-I'm not able due to the-due to security
7 risks of the President-Elect about that number.

8 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Do you have
9 anything to add on that? Okay, talk for a moment
10 about the impacts on the precincts around the city.
11 You-you-you noted that it-it causes an overtime
12 obligation where you're pulling officers from one
13 precinct and redeploying them to Midtown. What has
14 been the practical impact for the precincts where
15 that has-that has been happening and what precincts
16 are there?

17 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: Well, the precincts
18 from all over the city, and that's determined by the
19 Operations Unit. I think the overall impact on the
20 Police Department is very minimum. We still, you
21 know, enjoying you know, low crime numbers, low
22 shootings, low homicides. We're still able to police
23 events, Christmas tree lightings and the-the beach.
24 So we're-we're still operating with minimum impact.

25

2 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: There have been
3 repots, public reports, about the numbers of officers
4 that have been deployed to Midtown on a given day,
5 300, 400, 500. Would you...would you like to
6 corroborate or-or-or say that those numbers are
7 inaccurate in any way?

8 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: I have not seen the
9 numbers posted in newspapers for deploying for the
10 Trump Hotel or, you know, for-for the Midtown area.

11 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Did those numbers
12 sound accurate to you?

13 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: No.

14 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Too high?

15 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: They just don't seem
16 accurate?

17 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay. Let me go
18 to the-to Mr. Bishop and thank you. I-I appreciate
19 the challenges that you're under.

20 COMMISSIONER BISHOP: Thank you, Chair,
21 for this opportunity and-and, of course, thank you
22 for your advocacy for the businesses in-in the area.
23 First and foremost, the retailers and small
24 businesses on the Fifth Avenue Corridor and adjacent
25 to the Fifth Avenue Corridor are important to the

2 City of New York, and certainly this has been an
3 unprecedented situation. And I want to thank the
4 NYPD for working with us. Certainly we are seeing
5 the security apparatus evolve over time, and
6 certainly we have been working closely with NYPD to
7 minimize the impact that it has on the retailers and
8 small businesses. So when we actually went out and
9 and talked to the small businesses, obviously their
10 their biggest concern, there was a couple of
11 concerns. One was the impact that it would have on
12 pedestrian traffic. Certainly the impact that it had
13 on deliveries. 156 was closed, and certainly, you
14 know, the businesses expressed concern about just
15 communications. And NYPD has been on the ground.
16 Their Community Affairs Unit that has been in
17 constant communication with those small businesses.
18 With the reopening of 56th, that has been received
19 well with the small businesses. They have been very
20 excited. The hotel, the...the bars and all of the
21 businesses that's—that's on there have expressed
22 relief. We are now working closely with NYPD to
23 ensure that we do more communications. Certainly
24 there's a big unknown, which is, you know, what the
25 President-Elect will do but certainly the NYPD has

2 been working closely with us that when we do have a
3 plan solidified, we will be—we will make sure that we
4 minimize the impact on the businesses.

5 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: It's early to
6 know a direct impacts as we now question, but is that
7 something your agency has been able to quantify in
8 any—in any way either sales tax data, or income tax
9 data or employment data or anything along those
10 lines?

11 COMMISSIONER BISHOP: Yeah, I think
12 you're absolutely correct. It—it is too early. You
13 know, we work and we will be working closely with the
14 Fifth Avenue BID, and I think you'll be hearing from
15 them later. They are working with the retailers to—
16 to get to that number. We have the tools to help the
17 small businesses figure that number out, but it is
18 certainly too early to tell. We've heard different
19 numbers from small businesses. We've heard a
20 negative impact in November, but we've also heard
21 that December was fine. So, I think it's too early
22 to tell. I think, you know, our main goal is as the
23 NYPD works with their federal partners, we work with
24 them to ensure that we minimize the impact to the
25 retailers and the small businesses in the corridor.

2 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: And how soon is
3 an appropriate amount of time to know what you're
4 dealing with here? Because, you know, we've had a
5 couple of months down, but I, you know, when in your
6 experience do you have a reliable picture on impacts
7 when you have a change in the environment and for one
8 reason or another?

9 COMMISSIONER BISHOP: Yeah, I-I think,
10 you know, in my experience, you know, it-it usually
11 runs a fiscal year for that particular business.
12 Certainly the message that we want to send today is
13 that Fifth Avenue is open. Fifth Avenue is open for
14 business, 56th and the-the surrounding streets are
15 open for business, and then New York just should come
16 out in support, and certainly, you know, in the
17 retail cycle, you know, the-the impact that they saw
18 maybe in November might be erased in the future. So
19 it is difficult to tell based on just a couple
20 months. We typically rely on a-on a complete cycle
21 for the business.

22 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Do you have a
23 liaison for businesses in the area?

24 COMMISSIONER BISHOP: We do. So we have
25 an Emergency Response Unit. Actually, they're-

2 they're in the room. Bernadette Nation leads that
3 team. The businesses have their contact information.
4 Any time there is any differentiations from what we
5 have told them, they can contact us. But they do
6 have a good relationship with NYPD. I have to
7 commend the NYPD with their Community Affairs Unit.
8 The Community Affairs Officers have given the
9 businesses their contact information. There's direct
10 access to the command post for any issues that the
11 businesses may have. We worked closely with them
12 again to reopen 56th, and certainly because we do not
13 know what's going to happen after the Inauguration,
14 we are working closely with retailers and the small
15 businesses and with NYPD that once a security package
16 is designed that it would be—it will have minimum
17 impact on those businesses.

18 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Is—is SBS being
19 consulted when it comes to the security package?
20 Because obviously if the—the future of the area for
21 the next four years starting on January 20th, is
22 devised by PD and Secret Service, obviously there are
23 particular concerns that are being considered there.
24 And important I might add concerns being focused on
25 there, but the—the impact on the rest of the area

2 should also be at the table in those conversations.

3 How is that being incorporated?

4 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: There is continued
5 dialogue. NYPD and law enforcement partners, as we
6 talk if there's something that's going to—that we
7 feel may significantly impact the area, we reach out.
8 We reach out to the community. We reach out to the
9 business owners. We reach out to Mr. Bishop, and—and
10 we inform him of what may be or may not be occurring.

11 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay, well, I
12 mean that—that doesn't sound like--

13 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: [interposing] It's
14 continuous—it's continuous dialogue.

15 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: That doesn't
16 sound like business at the table. It sounds like
17 business being informed after the fact to their
18 staff.

19 COMMISSIONER BISHOP: No, I—you know, the
20 fact that I'm here and I've been in conversation with
21 the NYPD. So the, you know, the NYPD is sensitive to
22 the business community. We are—are working closely
23 with the NYPD to create a communication mechanism.
24 But, you know, this is unprecedented, and I have to
25 remind everyone that it—it is not uncommon. This is

2 not the--you know having the President-Elect in
3 Midtown is not a normal situation. So, the NYPD has
4 to work on protecting the President-Elect first, and
5 then the citizens of New York and the businesses in
6 the area. So, certainly I appreciate the--the
7 tremendous work that they have, and we'll be working
8 closely with them.

9 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: I do, too, and
10 certainly recognize the position that they are in,
11 but also want to make sure that, you know, when we're
12 thinking about and the decisions as I understand them
13 are being made right now about what that security
14 apparatus looks like starting in 10 days, and for
15 perhaps four years. So this is the moment when, you
16 know, things are going to be put in place that we're
17 either going to need to re-evaluate and work to
18 minimize, et cetera or, you know, the considerations
19 of the businesses today or brings to the table, and
20 have been bringing to you, Commissioner, and to me
21 over the past month or so, will be incorporated in
22 that. So I think it's a--it's a sensitive moment and
23 I--and I hope that those issues are being not just,
24 you know, informing but also being considered and
25

2 adopted in the—in the security plan. Is that a fair
3 request?

4 COMMISSIONER BISHOP: That's fair.

5 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay. One more
6 question for—for PD and then I'm going to go to
7 Council Member Richards, and—and I'll be back. We
8 appreciate the opening of—of 56th Street because that
9 was having a—a, you know, particularly harmful effect
10 on—on the businesses on the block. Tell us what
11 other adjustments PD has made since the election that
12 has, you know, improved either pedestrian or
13 vehicular movement in the area?

14 COMMISSIONER BISHOP: Well, we've also
15 reconfigured the barriers on 56th Street between
16 Fifth and Sixth to make it more—we're hoping to
17 remove it from the sidewalks on both the south side
18 and the north side of it, and around the command
19 post. We removed the Terrahawk (sp?) that we
20 originally had there post-election. We removed that
21 vehicle from 56th Street. If you remember initially
22 when—when President-Elect Trump won the election, we
23 had sand trucks surrounding Trump Tower. We moved
24 the sand trucks and—and placed Jersey barriers. We
25 also put some chains on the pedestrian crossings

2 since they're more aesthetically, you know, able to
3 cross people, pedestrian crossings across 56th Street
4 and across 57th Street.

5 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: This--this--go
6 ahead, Commissioner. Do you want to add something?

7 COMMISSIONER BISHOP: Yeah, I just wanted
8 add that we have been working with PD on this site
9 looking to--looking ways to maximize pedestrian flow,
10 and make the traffic flow--flow a little bit more
11 efficiently. Well, that included realigning some of
12 the barricades. Obviously, one of the other things
13 was to make sure that the pedestrian ramps were open
14 to maintain ADA access, and that has worked out well.

15 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Do we...so 56th
16 Street is open, but only open with one lane of--of
17 through traffic. Is that--is that accurate?

18 COMMISSIONER BISHOP: Correct.

19 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: So if--if a
20 business wanted to do a delivery on the block, what
21 are the parking regulations over there for them to do
22 t at this point?

23 COMMISSIONER BISHOP: Well, nothing has
24 changed to that in terms of regulations, and my
25 understanding is that we're still commercial loading

2 regulations. Obviously because it's a restricted
3 area. You know, there's more—ample—there's—there's
4 probably more space for vehicles to load and unload.

5 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: What we're
6 hearing just so you know is that there are still
7 challenges for businesses to get their delivery right
8 there, and that police are telling them to parking on
9 Sixth Avenue and move things over by hand. In some
10 cases they're getting tickets on Sixth Avenue in the
11 place where they're being told to look at. So, I do
12 think that this is—it's clearly an improvement, and
13 we're grateful for the opening of the street, but I
14 think we need to consider whether there are ways to
15 further aid these folks because it's—I don't think
16 that their challenges are--are yet resolved. But,
17 Commissioner, while—while I've got you, one—one or
18 two more DOT questions before I go to Council Member
19 Richards and Council Member Koslowitz. DOT has
20 reported that the traffic impacts have been rather
21 significant. There's a 66% increase in the amount of
22 time, you know, to move up Sixth Avenue a—a 15%
23 increase in the times north of Fifth Avenue on Fifth
24 Avenue, and—I'm sorry, north of 57th Street on Fifth
25 Avenue, and then a 25% increase when heading

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT 32
2 eastbound on 57th Street. Have you seen—now that
3 you—and—and DOT recently did something, which I think
4 is very helpful, which was to do the truck
5 inspections for 56th Street, for 56th Street itself as
6 opposed to on Sixth Avenue.

7 COMMISSIONER BISHOP: DOT does not do the
8 truck inspections.

9 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: I'm sorry.
10 Allowed on the space to do that, yes.

11 COMMISSIONER BISHOP: Yes we moved--

12 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: [interposing]
13 Maybe I'm crediting the wrong agency. Maybe I'm—it
14 wouldn't matter.

15 COMMISSIONER BISHOP: Well, we moved the
16 bike share station 56th Street to accommodate the
17 ~~check point~~checkpoint at NYPD's request. Correct.

18 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay, good.

19 COMMISSIONER BISHOP: Secret Service
20 means ~~check point~~checkpoint.

21 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay, the point
22 is for local purposes, the checking is not happening
23 Sixth Avenue. It's happening around the corner on
24 56th Street. So the question for DOT is have you
25 seen an improvement of the traffic flow on Sixth

2 Avenue as a result of the moving of that ~~check~~
3 ~~point~~checkpoint.

4 COMMISSIONER BISHOP: Oh, without a
5 doubt. The-the Sixth Avenue ~~check point~~checkpoint
6 was taking out the equivalent of two travel lanes.
7 There is the bus curb lane and the travel lane. Now
8 that that has been freed up, it's pretty much I'll-
9 I'll say back to near normal conditions before the
10 election.

11 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Other than the
12 stats that I cited that came from DOT, have you been
13 able to quantify any impacts, and this also could be
14 for-for PD on emergency vehicles and their ability to
15 get to their destination either police or fire,
16 ambulances as a result of that, um, increased time or
17 it's just the obvious that when you have an increased
18 time for any vehicle, it would include a fire truck,
19 it would include a police officer, it would include
20 an ambulance. Is that a fair observation?

21 COMMISSIONER BISHOP: That's fair.

22 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Yes. Okay. I'm
23 going to go to Council Member Richards, and note that
24 Council Member Miller has joined us. Welcome.
25 Council Member Richards.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you so
3 much, Mr. Chairman and I think we certainly had a way
4 to find out many of these answers, but Council Member
5 Borelli left for Trump's New York State Director.
6 [laughs] And I'm—I'm sure you guys have questions for
7 him, too. So just a few questions and I—I want to
8 hit definitely on the—the police issue because I've
9 definitely heard from inspectors in my community that
10 officers are being diverted, and I know for Queens
11 South in particular I know Council Member Miller and
12 myself share Queens South, and Karen Koslowitz is
13 from Queens. And by the way, I hope Queens is not
14 being punished because we don't necessarily claim
15 Trump, but I wanted to know are officers being
16 diverted from the outer boroughs and—and can you just
17 speak to how many officers are from the outer
18 boroughs?

19 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: I can speak to yes,
20 officers are being pulled from outer boroughs. As
21 far as the numbers, I—I can't speak on the numbers of
22 officers that are being pulled.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And—and you
24 don't have a guesstimate of how many members?

25 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: No.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And would you
3 say that officers are being diverted from community,
4 from commands in particular that have a major need
5 for-

6 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: I'm sorry, could you
7 repeat the please? I'm sorry.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So commands
9 that officers are being diverted from, I'm-I'm
10 assuming that are you taking from all different
11 commands? It doesn't matter which precinct?

12 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: That's correct.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So communities
14 like Brownsville, Southeast Queens where-Far Rockaway
15 in particular where crime is an issue in some areas.
16 You're taking-diverting officers from those areas as
17 well?

18 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: Officers are
19 diverted all over the city.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So from all
21 over the city. Um, do-have you seen any correlation
22 between taking officers from these particular
23 communities from crimes going high or low and I know
24 crime is historically on the trends of going low
25 across the city, but are we now seeing any direct

2 correlation between crime figures increasing or
3 decreasing in some areas or has there been no change
4 since?

5 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: No correlation that
6 I'm aware of. No correlation I am aware of.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So there's no
8 correlation at all?

9 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: That I'm aware of.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: That you're
11 aware of and that's a steady fact, and do you
12 anticipate as we move forward—I mean it's hard to
13 obviously anticipate crime trends, but do you
14 anticipate the more we take away from these commands,
15 crime could increase in some of these areas?

16 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: I don't know if I
17 can comment on that. That's speculation.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay, but I
19 would assume if you're taking away from areas that—so
20 if there are 100 officers who are normally staffed at
21 a precinct—let's just throw that number out there and
22 it's now. I don't know. I'm say maybe 70 officers
23 everyday. You wouldn't say that we're taking away
24 from something that, you know, is near and dear to
25 us, and that's something called community policing,

2 which has been something that we work very closely
3 with the administration on. And I know this is
4 through no fault of yours. I don't want you to take
5 it as an attack on you. This is more aimed at
6 President-Elect because we wouldn't be in this
7 predicament obviously if he was not staying in New
8 York City. But, is this moving us away from the goal
9 of actually moving toward a community policing model
10 in the city?

11 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: Most of the officers
12 are assigned to Trump are on overtime. So they don't
13 pull from their street force figures so to say. So I
14 would be—it would be speculation for me to say that
15 it's going to increase crime by pulling an officer
16 who's on overtime any time. (sic)

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So all of the
18 officers are—who are patrolling are specifically on
19 over time. So you're not diverting from precincts
20 during the day or--?

21 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: Let me clarify, but
22 I—I mean I think generally—well, we--we testified to
23 this earlier. So, the—the model works in that we
24 create a detail, and we assign officers and we
25 redeploy them from a precinct over to Midtown to

2 cover this. In the precincts at which they're
3 pulled, so there's overtime in that-and-and built
4 into the model for the detail, which extends the
5 tour.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: [interposing]
7 Okay.

8 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: Which decreases the
9 number of officers we would need because we have them
10 on extended tours. That's one way we deal with the
11 issues in the other precincts. The other thing we do
12 is the Operations Division will authorize overtime in
13 the precincts that are-that have had a reduction in
14 the number of officers on a particular-on a
15 particular tour. So that that overtime will
16 compensate the additional hours necessary for the
17 lost individual. So the bottom line is, you know,
18 we-the NYPD ensures that the neighborhoods across the
19 city are not adversely impacted by having less
20 people, less boots on the ground, less-less uniformed
21 officers on patrol. The impact comes on the fiscal
22 side where we're now incurring overtime both for the
23 officers assigned to the detail, and then we're
24 incurring overtime what we call operational overtime
25 in the commands that we wouldn't otherwise be

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT 39
2 incurring because we're extending tours for officers
3 because on the next tour there may be fewer officers
4 there because some of them are assigned to details.
5 So that's how we deal with the issue. We end up with
6 a financial hit, but ultimately not a number of
7 officers on patrol or officer hours on patrol hit.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And for
9 overtime so right now I think you've tagged \$35
10 million I think is the number we're at that we're
11 asking for reimbursement. How much more do you
12 anticipate? Because I think you said that he's going
13 to go back and forth between New York City.

14 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: Right.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So how much
16 over the next four years, God willing, do you
17 perceive-for-for-foresee costs being incurred on the
18 city?

19 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: So, I assume it is
20 \$500,000 per day. That's built off of the same model
21 that gets you the \$37.4 million. For the period
22 between Election Day and Inauguration Day. So that-
23 that-that model we've created it's going to
24 essentially cost the city \$500,000 per day that the
25 President chooses to reside within Trump Tower.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And they
3 haven't signaled to you—and it's my last question—
4 that, you know, he's going to stay in D.C. or decide
5 to stay in D.C. at all.

6 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: Talks are ongoing
7 but no. No indication.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay. Alright,
9 thank you so much, Mr. Chairman.

10 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Thank you. Just
11 one follow-up on that before we go to Council Member
12 Koslowitz. \$37.4 million was the number that you
13 cited on the costs. The federal government has
14 indicated a much smaller sum at least for the moment.
15 The Police Department has allocated a—a significant
16 budget every year in the budget process. Which—which
17 area of the—the NYPD budget does the extra let's say
18 \$30 million come from if it were not to be
19 reimbursed?

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GRIPPO: It will be
21 overtime. So at the end of this year, I can assure
22 you, in fact, in two months I'll be back here
23 testifying on our budget, and people will already see
24 that there is—the-the budget shows additional
25 overtime. We can point to a portion of that that is

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT 41
2 directly for the detail, as I explained before. It's
3 directly for the detail assigned to Trump Tower, but
4 there's another impact of overtime in the—in the
5 precincts that isn't under that same overtime code.
6 But it's leading to an increase in overtime. So what
7 you will see at the end of the year, is an—an
8 exponentially higher overtime budget depending on the
9 number of days that Trump does reside in—in—in
10 Midtown. You will see that impact in additional
11 overtime that the Department has incurred, which will
12 likely push us above the proposed overtime budgets
13 that we had at the beginning of the year.

14 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: How much was the
15 proposed overtime budget at the beginning of the
16 year?

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GRIPPO: The
18 overtime budget, just to be clear, is very complex
19 because there's a—there is the overtime budget in
20 city tax levy dollars, and then there are
21 counterterrorism funds that come in. I can say that
22 the uniformed overtime budget is approximately—and
23 this is a very rough approximation—between \$500 and
24 \$550 million, and what we look like we are going to
25 spend is something likely north of that. We don't

2 know the full impacts because there are other
3 offsets. It's—our budget is a personnel services
4 budget. It's larger than just overtime, and so when
5 we look at the overall personnel services budget,
6 we're like to—to be able to cover some of the
7 additional overtime, but there will still likely be a
8 shortfall if we cannot get reimbursement from the
9 federal government.

10 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay, um, now I'm
11 going to go to Council Member Koslowitz.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Thank you, Mr.
13 Chair. This kind of doesn't feel fair. The
14 President-Elect said that his wife is going to remain
15 in New York City while their son continues school.
16 Is this until he finishes this term? Is this for the
17 next four years because his wife also said that she
18 wasn't going to be doing presidential First Lady
19 duty. Are there any plans for this? Have we spoken
20 to anybody about this that is New York Going to keep
21 paying the money? It's not fair because every
22 president has always moved into the White House.
23 After their inauguration they moved into the White
24 House with their families, with children. They all
25 have children, and it just doesn't seem fair. So do

2 we have plans on what's going to happen after January
3 20th?

4 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: I would just say,
5 Council Member, we—our arguments in terms of how
6 we're attempting to justify reimbursement with the
7 feds is consistent with—with the notion that this an
8 unprecedented event. I think that—that's the key.
9 Having the President reside ultimately outside the
10 White House in—in-anywhere would be somewhat
11 unprecedented, but then adding the complexity of the
12 location at which he resides, a high-rise building in
13 Midtown Manhattan, it—I—for obviously reasons it's—
14 it's unprecedented. So, the—the heart of our
15 argument with the—with the federal government in
16 terms of why we feel this should be reimbursed is—is
17 for that exact reason that it's unprecedented, and
18 that New York City taxpayers should not ultimately be
19 on the hook for that considering the—the—the
20 significant expense that it—that it will be.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: It just—I
22 mean it just doesn't seem fair because the President,
23 of course, if his family is going to be moving here,
24 it's—it's—he's going to be coming here more, and I
25 know every time we have a President coming to New

2 York it ties up traffic. It does so many other
3 things. You know, not just on Fifth Avenue, but
4 throughout the whole city, and I'm concerned about
5 the quality of life that New Yorkers will have during
6 this time. I think that the President-Elect has to
7 understand that nobody has ever done anything to
8 inconvenience, you know, their--their town where they
9 live. For instance, Obama moved right to the White
10 House, and didn't--I don't think went back hardly ever
11 to Chicago, and I just think that the federal
12 government has to understand and, you know, certainly
13 I would be willing to do anything to make them
14 understand that they have to cooperate with us where
15 we're being inconvenienced. You know, we have eight
16 million people here that are going to be
17 inconvenienced. I know there's nothing really to--to
18 say, but that's how I feel, and, you know, annoyed at
19 this whole situation. I mean I--and the truth of the
20 matter is wasn't my candidate, [laughter] but I--I--if
21 it was any other president that was my candidate, I
22 would feel the same exact way because he's--it's an
23 inconvenience to the people of the city of New York.
24 I mean my tax money is going to be paying for his
25

2 security, and I resent that since he has a lot more
3 money than I do. [laughter]

4 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Thank you,
5 Council Member Koslowitz, and I—I would also note
6 that your tax money is going to pay for it
7 regardless. It's just a question of whether it's a
8 local tax expenditure or a federal tax expenditure.
9 So the—the costs are there, and we're paying for them
10 regardless of which pot it's coming from, but our
11 concern here today is the local pot, and I wanted to
12 just ask a few questions about the dynamic between
13 the PD and the Secrete Service for a moment. Because
14 it—I know that you all are in conversations, and
15 jointly making decisions, but if the Secret Service
16 were to say we believe that for the cause of
17 security, we need to close down Fifth Avenue or 57th
18 Street or 55th to 60th Street or whatever, at what
19 point does the PD say no, that is not within our
20 local interests to do that. How—how does that
21 dynamic work?

22 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: What I say is the
23 conversations and the dialogue is continuing. No
24 decisions have been made on—on a lot of security
25 issues. There's just continuing dialogue.

2 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: I feel like I
3 heard you say that once or twice. Okay, does the-
4 does the Secrete Service have the right to close down
5 a street on its own, legal right?

6 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: I'm not sure.

7 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: If—does the
8 Secrete Service have the right to order the New York
9 City Police Department to add more officers to the
10 street if they felt that it was necessary?

11 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: We continue the
12 dialogue with the Secrete Service, and I don't think
13 anybody knows the streets better than the NYPD. So
14 if we feel it's necessary to provide extra police
15 officers to something, we would normally do that on
16 our own without the request of the Secrete Service.

17 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: But you don't
18 take orders from them, do you?

19 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: I don't believe so.

20 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: And if the NYPD
21 were to decline to provide service in and around
22 Trump Tower because of cost or lack of reimbursement
23 or whatever, what would be the resulting dynamic,
24 the—the result? What would happen then?

25

2 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: I'm unable to answer
3 that question.

4 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: The 56th Street
5 dynamic is one which, as we noted, continues to be a
6 challenge. The block itself is open with one lane,
7 but it's still periodically closed or closing. The
8 businesses and the local councilmen have not real
9 clarity on what the basis is for a closure of that
10 street time to time. Can you share with us what's
11 going on out there?

12 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: Well, it hasn't
13 always been perfect. We—we do try to keep the street
14 open as long as possible for everything. You know,
15 sometimes there's a garbage truck that comes down the
16 street. It's picking up garbage, traffic is backed up
17 to Sixth Avenue. We periodically close it so the
18 garbage truck can or Sanitation could pick refuse and
19 roll it back, you know, make their way to Fifth
20 Avenue. There are times where the President-Elect is
21 on a move, and we have to freeze—freeze 56th Street
22 as well as freeze pedestrian traffic on Fifth Avenue
23 for a presidential movement.

24 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Let's talk about
25 that for a second. So in a presidential movement,

2 you freeze 56th Street so no traffic on 56th Street
3 and no pedestrians between 57th and 56th on Fifth
4 Avenue. Is that accurate?

5 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: That would be
6 accurate on the—more than likely on the east side of
7 the street.

8 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: East side of
9 Fifth Avenue?

10 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: Correct.

11 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Are there any
12 other areas that are frozen during a presidential
13 movement?

14 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: Not that I'm aware
15 of.

16 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Is there any way
17 for businesses in the area to—even if it is just with
18 a short period of time to have a little bit of
19 warning? Obviously, a presidential movement doesn't—
20 doesn't happen in an instance because of all the
21 things that need to happen to accommodate that
22 significant footprint. Is there anyway to send a
23 notice out to businesses that there is a—there's, you
24 know, a frozen zone that's happening or about to
25 happen so they know things are going on?

2 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: Absolutely not. We-
3 we would never publicize.

4 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Sorry. Say
5 again.

6 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: We would—we would—we
7 wouldn't do that. The presidential movements is a
8 security detail, a security risk. We—we don't
9 announcement movements of frozen zones--

10 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: [interposing]
11 yeah, but once I'm standing. Okay, how about
12 contemporaneous then? Like let's say it's done.
13 You've frozen it. How about a contemporaneous notice
14 businesses saying we've frozen this area for, you
15 know, temporarily.

16 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: We continue dialogue
17 with—with our business community our community
18 affairs officers as well as our federal partners.

19 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Commissioner
20 Bishop, is that fair to small businesses?

21 COMMISSIONER BISHOP: I—so I—I think
22 what—what you're—you're experiencing is the—the—the
23 nature of a presidential movement. Certainly, we had
24 a really good meeting with the retailers on—on Fifth
25 Avenue. They understand that in a presidential move,

2 the security is important for the President-Elect
3 and—and certainly the small businesses on 56th also
4 understand that the security is paramount. What the
5 businesses and retailers have asked for is if there's
6 any planned closures and—and the NYPD has—is working
7 on a communications plan for planned closures where
8 if there's a known protestor, if there's something
9 that's going to be planed closure, we will be able to
10 notify the small businesses. During a presidential
11 move, I think everyone is sympathetic to the fact
12 that we do have the president—to protect the
13 President-Elect and, therefore, you know,
14 broadcasting where he's going to move, doesn't seem
15 like, you now, good security.

16 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: Just to be clear,
17 I'm not asking you to tell me where he's going to
18 move, and I'm not even tell—asking you to tell me
19 when he's going to move. I think it is fair to say—
20 to say that there are frozen zones contemporaneously
21 with the frozen zones happening. It's something that
22 I could Tweet if standing out there on Fifth Avenue
23 in the middle of the frozen zone is not a secret any
24 more once it's happening. So, you know, I don't why
25 in that circumstance we wouldn't actually allow some

2 businesses and areas to at least know why suddenly
3 they can't get a-a delivery. They can't get--

4 COMMISSIONER BISHOP: [interposing]

5 That's something we can work on.

6 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay. Thank you.

7 I appreciate that. Let's talk about the plans and
8 I'm-I'm going to go to Council Member Miller in a
9 moment. The planned closures, things like the
10 protests. Let's just talk about that a moment before
11 I go to Council Member Miller. We expect to have
12 some rather significant protests around Trump Tower,
13 around Inauguration Day, and certainly I'm sure
14 throughout the next four years. Can you tell a
15 little bit about PD's plans for managing the people,
16 traffic, businesses when that is expected, and
17 specifically what, you know, what you have in store
18 for protecting all those various interests on January
19 20th and 21st where we know at least there will be
20 some protest activity?

21 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: Around the vicinity
22 of Trump Tower north of 57th Street between 57 and 58
23 and then south of 56th Street between 56 and 55, we
24 have demonstration plans. If we're notified or we
25 have information that a demonstration is going to

2 occur, or a march is going to occur, we do notify all
3 the businesses in the area depending on the numbers.
4 Some have been small. We've had some small
5 demonstrations and if you look back at post-election,
6 we had rather large demonstrations. If we have
7 information it's a large demonstration, there may be
8 times where we may have to close the street. You
9 know, all are the demonstrations on the sidewalk?
10 Are they are in the street? The traffic-traffic
11 closures. You know, it's not really planned in ahead
12 of time that we would close streets. We do look to
13 keep traffic open and the flow of traffic, but there
14 are time where and in the past at post-election where
15 we've had to close streets. There was significant
16 demonstrations/protests. We do put the information
17 out. We have Community Affairs Officers in Midtown
18 and all precincts(sic)as well as patrolled Manhattan
19 South. We visit all of the local businesses. If we
20 do have something that we think is significant, we do
21 make a notification, but closing streets is mostly
22 done on an ad hoc basis depending on the size of the
23 protest or demonstration that we get. But in place
24 we do have demonstration pens along Fifth Avenue, and
25

2 they've been pretty much successful using those pens
3 as of late.

4 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay so it's east
5 side of Fifth Avenue between 55th and 56th and east
6 side of Fifth Avenue between 57th and 58th where you
7 have the demonstration pens, is that correct?

8 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: Correct.

9 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay, and when
10 your officers do notification, advance notification
11 to businesses in the area about what is anticipated,
12 how is that notification done? How do you do that
13 outreach to—to businesses?

14 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: The Community
15 Affairs Officers and Midtown all the precincts visit
16 the locations. They—they have—they have personal
17 relationships with some of the businesses on those
18 blocks. There's a very good communication and
19 dialogue that goes back and forth.

20 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: And look, and--
21 and many of these businesses we've visited them. You
22 walk in the front door, the owner of the—the business
23 may not be present at that particular moment. Do you
24 do anything by email? Do you communicate?

25

2 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: We are working on an
3 email chain. We soon hope to have that, you know,
4 viable and up and running, but it's something that's
5 being worked on as we speak.

6 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay, well,
7 certainly we can help with that, too, and I know, of
8 course, Commission Bishop—

9 COMMISSIONER BISHOP: [interposing] We
10 are working on it.

11 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: You have—you have
12 what you need, right? Okay, and we have some of the
13 contact information as well, but I'm sure that
14 Commissioner Bishop has what we have—what we have.
15 Okay, Council Member Miller.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Mr.
17 Chair. Good afternoon. I want to kind of preference
18 my-my-my line of questioning is around the area of
19 this—the President-Elect's impact on the city at
20 large. Obviously, we've been focusing on the—the
21 area around Trump Tower. But certainly there is an
22 impact to the Outer Boroughs, and the other portion
23 of the city as well that we—I think deserves
24 attention as well. I know you said that there is
25 allocated overtime by the NYPD specifically for the

2 safety detail of the President-Elect. Now, at what
3 point is there any point that you may anticipate that
4 this overtime, which has been preapproved, will
5 impact the overtime allocated for other precincts
6 throughout the city? Is—and I know and—and this is—
7 there is an assumption here that we will be
8 reimbursed by the federal government. Without that,
9 with the limited resources that we have, and—and not
10 just in terms of dollars and cents, but to replace
11 bodies that may be out for an indefinite amount of
12 time or even an allocated amount of time considering
13 things happen every day within the City of New York.
14 What impact have you anticipated? What provisions do
15 you have in place for those—to replace those officers
16 that are out. Also, to replace the allocated
17 overtime in the cases in which normal overtime
18 situations may occur where—where certainly the Outer
19 Boroughs and other portions of the city are prone to
20 have protests and activities and events that require
21 additional policing? How—how—what impact would we—
22 would this have?

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GRIPPO: It's about—
24 the—the question I think it's like sort of--I'm going
25 to take it in three parts. The—the first part the—

2 the overtime that we are expending in and around
3 Trump Tower for the detail assigned there has
4 absolutely no impact on the department, the overtime
5 allotted to the rest of our commands. We—we are
6 making—we are essentially treating this as an
7 unplanned event. It's something that was not
8 budgeted in the beginning of the year, and the
9 department's policy on any unplanned event is
10 reassign the resources needed to deal with the event,
11 and we do not impact staffing levels or what's needed
12 in the commands on patrol to handle crime fighting.
13 So that overtime, and this is the reason we're
14 seeking compensation from the federal government, is
15 unplanned overtime that ultimately is likely to
16 create a whole gap in our budget at the end of the
17 year. In addition, what you spoke about is something
18 I—I touched on earlier we are—it—we're also now going
19 to have the effect of having in certain commands
20 fewer officers because of the officers assigned to a
21 detail. The way the department handles that just
22 like I said earlier, it's an unplanned event. It's
23 not something that was budgeted or assumed in our
24 budget prior to the year. We then have to extend
25 tours in those comments, which means unplanned

2 overtime. Not necessarily expended at Trump Tower,
3 or even around Trump Tower, but it's now being
4 expended in the other commands. It's unplanned
5 overtime, but it's necessary to keep our patrol
6 strength at where—what is required on any given day.
7 So all of that is going to amount to what we're
8 projecting to be a gap of about \$37.4 million. That
9 is to deal with the period from Election Day to
10 Inauguration Day, and the going forward, the number
11 we have is \$500,000 per day that the department will
12 incur if the President chooses to reside ~~at~~ at Trump
13 Tower. The—the bottom line is none of that will—none
14 of that comes from our existing overtime budget, and
15 it will not impact deployment levels in those
16 boroughs. It will just lead to something we'll be
17 discussing at large.

18 ~~CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK:~~

19 ~~DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE:~~

20 ~~CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK:~~

21 ~~DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE:~~

22 ~~CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK:~~

23 ~~COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Honestly—~~

24 honestly, I—I did get that the first time. It didn't
25 go—I don't it went above anyone's head here, but

2 you're right. We have—talking about—we have spoken
3 about and obviously in finance and budget hearings in
4 the past, unscheduled overtime, and certainly I think
5 that there would be a degree of naivete that if
6 believe that at some point that the city could bear
7 all the costs that would be incurred—that are going
8 to be incurred here, and that it would not impact
9 those unscheduled event in overtimes that occurred
10 throughout the city. And I'm merely saying how do we
11 assess? Is there a plan for us to report back, and—
12 and assess the impact of the overtime and policing in
13 the city over the next year? That's—that's fine. You
14 don't have to answer that now because I need the same
15 question for the rest of the city agencies, whether
16 it's Sanitation, it's Public Safety, it's DOT. I—I-I
17 happen believe that it's going to have an impact, and
18 that we have a responsibility to address that impact
19 now as now rather than later. Speaking about the
20 Outer Boroughs, I happened to be on the Northern
21 State and Grand Central at a time that the President-
22 Elect was coming back from the Hamptons. Now, being
23 a Queens resident and being in between La Guardia and
24 Kennedy Airports, often we experience dignitaries
25 coming in. Our current POTUS has been known to

2 frequent New York City, but I am assuming that that
3 number is going to increase tremendously. What are
4 provisions that—that DOT whether it is the city and
5 are we coordinating with the State around those
6 highways, and—and to just what impact is it going to
7 have? And then certainly, as—as—as highways have
8 been known to back up into here in the city and what
9 we do, we kind of jump off and go into the city, what
10 happens then? Is—is—are—are—is—are Springfield and
11 Linden Boulevards prepared to—are we ready for the
12 motorcades to come through local streets if
13 necessary?

14 COMMISSIONER SANCHEZ: Well, just
15 speaking on behalf of DOT, you know, street closures
16 to accommodate the motorcade. They happen
17 instantaneously and they usually are a very short —
18 duration. As far as what happens on the highway
19 network, obviously, you know, if we know of a closure
20 coming, we would certainly work with State DOT to put
21 them, put the information on the variable message
22 sign. A lot of it again would depend on what we're—
23 what we can or can't publicize.

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CRIPPO:

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, and-and the
3 necessary resources to provide services around the
4 President-Elect's visits, stays or travels throughout
5 the city are-[ringing cell phone] are-are-are they
6 going to those agencies whether the city agencies or
7 the Port Authority whomever that are providing
8 additional services going to be compensated or are
9 they going to, are we coordinating our efforts to
10 ensure that it's not impacting and taking away from
11 services that will be delivered to everyday New York
12 citizens?

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CRIPPO:

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER:

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CRIPPO:

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER:

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CRIPPO:--DEPUTY CHIEF

18 KEHOE: We would treat him or treat the President-
19 Elect like the office as any other presidential--

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: [interposing]

21 Yeah, no, no-what I'm saying is--

22 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: [interposing] -at
23 the time. (sic)

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: --is that it's
25 pretty obvious that they're going to be afforded

2 services that beyond anything that we have seen on a
3 regular basis. Again, it would be naïve and
4 disingenuous for us to believe that we as the
5 agencies are currently constituted are not going to
6 have to pay Peter to—take from Peter to pay Paul.
7 What's the plan?

8 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: I don't understand.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: That's just not
10 for the Police Department. It is that there are an
11 incredible amount of services necessary in protecting
12 and housing the President of the United States on a
13 daily basis. Are we prepared to do it? Have—have
14 agency by agency have we assessed that?

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GRIPPO: I mean I
16 think all we can say at this—at this table, the
17 agencies represented here I think are very aware of
18 that, and this is exactly why we're asking for
19 reimbursement because ultimately we believe this is
20 an unprecedented event of a tremendous scale and
21 size, and—and the reimbursement is necessary to
22 ensure that operations are not impacted.

23 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE:

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, and while
25 I—while we have the Finance Chair here and I'm not

2 looking for more work or, but it seems that we should
3 request from each agency that will be impacted and
4 involved a projected budget, and what that cost
5 should be and—and what we can do make sure that we
6 are not taken it away from everyday citizens to
7 provide a service, a well deserved service, and
8 needed service obviously. But we—we want to make
9 sure that we are able to provide the services that we
10 are mandated to do so. So thank you, Mr. Chair.

11 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Thank you,
12 Council Member Miller, and with that, I'm actually
13 going to go to the Finance Chair, Council Member
14 Ferreras-Copeland who has joined us. Council Member.

15 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE:

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER:-

17 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE:

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER:-

19 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank
20 you, Chair, and thank you for holding this very
21 important hearing, and thank you for the agencies
22 that have come today. Duly noted, Council Member
23 Miller. We will be following up with the agencies.
24 As expected, I'm going to talk about the budget and
25 its impact, and I'm sorry if the questions have been

2 asked, but I have to ask them very directly. Can you
3 walk me through the difference between protecting the
4 President of the United States and protecting let's
5 say the First Lady Melania Trump and her son who has
6 chosen to stay for an unprecedented I guess amount of
7 time. So is there a difference in cost if they
8 decide we want—we don't want to move the White House.
9 We'd like to stay here?

10 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: We are in
11 conversation and dialogue with the United States
12 Secrete Service and our federal law enforcement
13 partners. As you had mentioned earlier, this is
14 unprecedented. So, the talks continue, and we will
15 develop with our partners our security measures that
16 we need to seek that. (sic)?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: So is
18 the quality of security different? Do you need more
19 officers if it's the President? Do you need less
20 officers if it's the First Lady? Do you need double
21 the amount of officers if it's the whole family? Or
22 can you walk us through that process?

23 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: For security reasons
24 for the President-Elect and his family, I'm—I'm
25 unable to give facts and figures, but what I can say

2 is that we are in constant dialogue with our federal
3 partners in providing security to the President-
4 Elect, his family as well as the citizens of the city
5 of New York.

6
7 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay,
8 well from—from our perspective, we have to pay for
9 this. So we have to have some idea of how much is it
10 going to cost. Because right now we're kind of just
11 spending with an unlimited—an unlimited credit
12 really, and hoping that maybe the federal government
13 will pay. Maybe not, and then the City is going to
14 get the short end of the stick, and I'm sorry. We
15 haven't been doing too great with our overtime issues
16 period before the President-Elect. So then now we're
17 here and I'm very, very fearful that in a couple of
18 weeks when I have you before me, you basically blew
19 up the entire plan that you've been proposing to me
20 for the last three years about bringing down
21 overtime. Now, it's completely blown out of the way.
22 So, you know, help me at least have a little bit of a
23 line of hope because if not, we're not going to have
24 a very good time in March.

25

2 DEPUTY CHIEF KEOE DEPUTY COMMISSIONER

3 GRIPPO: --Well, the--so I'll restate the numbers. The
4 projections are \$37.4 million Election Day to
5 Inauguration Day, and what that is, Council Member,
6 as you're probably more intimately knowledgeable
7 about out budget than others, this is a--this is a
8 complex thing to calculate because ultimately in
9 order to get reimbursement we have to be reimbursed
10 for the detail at Trump Tower. So what we're
11 calculating is officers either straight time hours or
12 because they have extended tours, overtime that's
13 necessary to extend their tour. And then we have
14 Traffic Enforcement Agents as well, and then on top
15 of that we have what are called our fringe benefit
16 costs, which give you the fully loaded cost to the
17 city of having those officers assigned on that
18 detail. The reality is the way it will show up in
19 our budget in all--unless we were to take the hit
20 elsewhere, which we're not willing to do because that
21 would come at the sake of public safety in New York
22 City is you will see somewhere in that--and the exact
23 number we don't know yet, and we're doing those
24 calculations. We have data for--for the first month,
25 but we--we're going to continue to calculate that.

1 There's a lag. You're going to see some number close
2 to that that is a hit to our overtime budget. Now,
3 when we're in front of-of you in March, we'll be
4 looking at the overtime budget in totality. There
5 are areas where fortunately we are under budget.
6 There are areas where we're over budget. You end up
7 with some likely gap that the city...that the NYPD will
8 have in overtime because of this event. This is an
9 unplanned event. If-if we are to look at it just
10 from an over-Election Day to Inauguration Day, it's
11 still looking, you know, not order or magnitude of
12 Hurricane Sandy, but as big as anything else that
13 we've seen in this city since 9/11. This is a huge
14 event, a huge unplanned event, and again, that is why
15 we are going to be aggressively seeking reimbursement
16 from the federal government. If we get that
17 reimbursement, we're not going to have a problem at
18 the end of the year. If we don't get that
19 reimbursement, we likely are, and the only option we
20 would have to avoid that would be to essentially take
21 reductions in officers on patrol across the city to
22 handle this event.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: Which
25 is absolutely unacceptable for us, right? Because

1 that is not what this is about, and not-not what
2 we've advocated for. We increased the number of
3 officers because you made a call for the need for it,
4 and we responded as a Council. So you now can't say
5 well, we have to protect the President of the Unite
6 States so, therefore. So tell me what happens if we
7 just say we can't afford it? Does the federal
8 government send more Secrete Service? Is there an-
9 another entity that can make up for what the city
10 can't do? Because what if the-what if the President
11 of the United States lived in a city that had much
12 smaller force, couldn't afford the amenities that
13 they need to have this level of security, what
14 happens? I think in some ways we are being charged,
15 or-or expected to provide a service because we have
16 the best force, and because we have the bodies. But
17 it's only for a matter of time because this is not
18 sustainable. So what is our point for being able to
19 push back and say, you know what, no we cannot
20 provide that service. So we don't think it prudent
21 that the President is able to come to New York.

22 President of the United States

23 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE:—DEPUTY COMMISSIONER

24 GRIPPO: Well, the last part I'm not sure we-we can
25

2 accomplish, but here-so-so what-what-what we say is
3 there-the President in 2009, 2008 or 2009 when
4 President Obama was elected there was an
5 appropriation that went through Congress to
6 compensate Chicago for essentially the additional
7 costs related to having him there from when he was
8 elected to inauguration. So we are seeking the same
9 type of appropriation to cover the President-Elect
10 for that period? And there is precedence for that.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND:

12 [interposing] And what was the appropriation? So you
13 know the number of that appropriation?

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GRIPPO: [background
15 comments] \$9 million. Yeah about \$9 million.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: \$9
17 million and the First Family did not remain in
18 Chicago?

19
20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GRIPPO: That's
21 right. That's right.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: So ours
23 would be a much larger ask?

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GRIPPO: That's right.
25 So what we are arguing, which I think is consistent

2 with what you said, again, somewhat restating is this
3 is really an unprecedented event where you now have a
4 president who has said publicly--we aren't certain
5 where we sit today if, in fact, it will happen--but he
6 has said public that he would reside in this city
7 some number of days throughout the year. That as far
8 as we can tell is unprecedented, and our argument is
9 the Secret Service provides a level of protection
10 for the President that's secures the President in and
11 around the area he is in. The city has always had
12 the responsibility of then dealing with things like
13 traffic mitigation, but also security for not just
14 the president but all of the people that could be
15 impacted by the President's movements. That is a
16 much larger effort, and for any presidential visit
17 that has fallen on the NYPD. It's not inconsistent.
18 The thing that's unprecedented here is him residing
19 in the city, which is very different than anything
20 we've seen, and the fact that he's residing in a
21 high-rise building in Midtown Manhattan, which adds
22 complexity at a level that is going to increase the
23 cost dramatically. So we--our whole argument for
24 reimbursement, and it will be reimbursement not just
25 based off of that 2009 appropriation for the period

2 at which they had to deal with him prior to the
3 inauguration, but this reimbursement that we believe
4 should be sustained any time that he is going to use
5 that as his residence. Because frankly, you know,
6 we-our relationship with the Secrete Service is as
7 strong as it can be, but the requirements to protect
8 everyone in that location not just the president, the
9 people that live in that building, the people that
10 are having to-to commute in and around that building,
11 is larger than what the Secrete Service could
12 provide, and that will have to fall on the shoulders
13 of the NYPD.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: And
15 what I hope it doesn't have to fall on, and I'm sure
16 that you're trying to prevent is that because we have
17 to pro-protect that whatever, one block radius or
18 two-block radius or whatever the perimeter is. But
19 then you expose the other communities because, you
20 know, there is no one New Yorker that's more
21 important or more valuable or one New Yorker that
22 should have more security versus another, and that is
23 what this Council will be questioning you on, and I'm
24 hoping that we will have more answers in our first
25 budget hearing after the Preliminary Budget is

2 released. So, thank you, and I'll be following up
3 with you offline on some other matters. Thank you
4 very much, Chair.

5 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Thank you, Chair
6 Ferrerias-Copeland. I want to note that we've been
7 joined by Council Member Barron. Let me just pose a
8 couple more questions, and I'm going to go to Council
9 Member Barron for questions herself. One of the
10 critiques that we've had of the PD in the area is
11 that there's sometimes been some inconsistent rules
12 out there as to whether a delivery can take place,
13 what to do, et cetera. And that inevitably is the
14 result of pulling officers from all around the city
15 to be able to—to do what you need to do out there.
16 But is there any effort to create a Trump Tower Unit
17 similar to what we have in Times Square like the
18 Times Square Unit to allow a—an assortment of
19 knowledgeable officers who are familiar with the
20 protocols, have the direct relationship with Secrete
21 Service and even the businesses to be able to respond
22 most effectively and know exactly what's happening?

23 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: I'm unable to answer
24 that question. I don't have the answer to that.

25

2
3 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Is this something
4 you think is a good idea?

5 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: I think every avenue
6 could be explored, but in my position I'm not aware
7 of-of that type of talk.

8 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Well, let me just
9 suggest then that it seems to me that this is one of
10 the circumstances in which the local knowledge of
11 what's happening out there is something which would
12 be a real help to the people who are most impacted in
13 the area, and establishing a-a unit that knows the
14 precise challenges, and that they're not starting up
15 fresh on any one given day. Something which I think
16 would be productive and also would be very helpful in
17 the area. So, I-I recognize that you may not be in a
18 position to make a decision on that. I'm sure that
19 you're in a position to have a view on it whether you
20 share it or not, but I do hope that you will take
21 that suggestion back, and we will make the--

22 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: [interposing] We
23 will.

24 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay, thank you.
25 If-if-if a business had a PD related challenge, we-

2 we—we know SBS has its liaison and we know that your
3 officers are frequently around and engaging with
4 businesses, but is there a single person who they
5 should call or could call at, you know, at any moment
6 to know that they could get a response or clarity on
7 the rules, you know, in the absence of a Trump Tower
8 unit?

9 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: We have a command
10 post on 56th and Fifth. If it was an urgent matter
11 that needed to be addressed, it's manned 24 hours a
12 day, seven days a week.

13 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Does it have a
14 phone?

15 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: With a supervisor.

16 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Is there a phone?

17 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: There is a—a phone
18 in there. I—I do not know the number off the top of
19 my head, but there is one.

20 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: [interposing]
21 Okay, and do the businesses in the area know?

22 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: Absolutely.

23 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: They do and
24 Commissioner Bishop, do you—do you feel satisfied
25 that the business—businesses in the area know that

Formatted: Superscript

2 they can call the commander center and on the block
3 if they—even if they're remote to be able to get
4 answers to questions?

5 COMMISSIONER BISHOP: Yeah, so I think
6 after we did our walk-through with the businesses.
7 I—I think what you alluded to earlier is that
8 sometimes when you walk into a business it's actually
9 employees and not the owner. In our Emergency
10 Response Unit we want to make sure that everyone has
11 the information because it is possible for the owner
12 to have the information, but the manager not to have
13 the information, and we want to make sure working
14 closely with PD that everyone that will need to get
15 in touch with PD has the—the proper information, and
16 we will continue working not only in the Corridor,
17 but also working with the retailers because I—I think
18 what you're hitting on is consistency, and—and
19 proactive communication, which PD and—and myself we
20 are working on.

21 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Thank you, and
22 one last one for—for PD. Do we free streets for the
23 family, too, or just for the President?

24 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: I'm sure it's done
25 on an ad hoc basis.

2 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Say-I'm sorry.

3 Say it again.

4 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: It's really done on
5 an ad hoc basis but I'm not at liberty to discuss
6 frozen zones for the movement of the First Family or-
7 or the President-Elect.

8 COMMISSIONER BISHOP:

9 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: So there are
10 circumstances in which a street could be frozen a
11 First Family without the President?

12 COMMISSIONER BISHOP:

13 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK:

14 COMMISSIONER BISHOP:

15 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK:

16 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: They could be.

17 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Have there been?

18 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: Not that I'm aware
19 of. Council Member Barron.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you-thank
21 you, Mr. Chair. Just one or two questions. The \$37
22 million that we're asking to be reimbursed for is
23 about \$500--\$500,000 a day, is that-did I hear you
24 say that's for the officers' straight time, officers'
25 overtime, traffic enforcement, and fringe benefits.

2 Are there other items that would be a part of that
3 cost?

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GRIPPO: No, that's
5 correct.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And what does it
7 normally cost New York City when the President comes
8 in town just for a day? What is the average cost of
9 a presidential visit coming in?

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GRIPPO: It's
11 extremely variable and you have to understand that
12 the President may come in. There may be limited
13 movements. The President may come in and move
14 multiple times. The bottom line is it's never been-
15 we've never gotten reimbursement for presidential
16 visits, nor am I aware of any precedent for that.
17 The only reimbursement we get in this city that's in
18 any way related is--was when the UN is in session, and
19 there is a mechanism for the--the feds through an
20 appropriation to compensate us for the security and
21 traffic details necessary in and around the UN to
22 move delegates and to deal with the--the UN Assembly.
23 There's no precedent for presidential visits.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So given the
25 complexity of the President-Elect being a resident

2 and his family wanting to stay here, do you think
3 that it would be appropriate for us to perhaps
4 establish that request?

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GRIPPO: No, I--

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing]

7 Because I don't see how the city can bear the cost
8 and--and if you can give me what the range has been
9 for the president to just come in and out that would
10 be something we would like to know. We don't have
11 that?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GRIPPO: And I'll--we
13 can try and get back to you, but I-I can tell you
14 there's a really wide variance on that depending on
15 what--what happens with a particular presidential
16 visit.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So with--

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER GRIPPO: Islamophobia
19 But certainly we are in agreement and with respect to
20 this being unprecedented and this being--it being
21 necessary for us to be reimbursed by the Feds because
22 of that.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, and Council
24 Member Miller asked about a plan that perhaps should
25 be in place now that we know that the President will

2 be here, and that agencies are going to have to
3 respond to various agencies that are here and perhaps
4 others. Do we think that the federal agencies, your
5 federal partners would take the lead on that? Would
6 you have any kind of idea as to how that relationship
7 will go forward?

8 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: If the past is any
9 indication of the future, we've had a very good
10 relationship with presidential visits to New York
11 City with the Secrete Service. I don't see any
12 reason why that relationship going forward is not
13 going to be viable and good, and the dialogue will
14 continue, but this is an unprecedented event. Talks
15 are evolving, but the important thing is we continue
16 to talk and we continue to have a good relationship.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And as those
18 talks are going forward, do you have anything on
19 paper, anything concrete specific to the
20 characteristic of New York City that you would want
21 them to consider as you're working out these plans
22 that certainly have to be put in place?

23 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE: We talk continually.
24 Dialogue is ongoing. Plans are ongoing.

25

2 Unfortunately, we can't discuss the presidential
3 security plan at this moment.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. Thank
5 you, Mr. Chair.

6 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Thank you,
7 Council Member Barron, and just maybe one or two
8 final questions before we go to our next panel with
9 appreciation to all of you for—for your time today.
10 There was a proposal in the New York Times today in
11 the Op-Ed page, which involves closing down Fifth
12 Avenue to traffic essentially allowing buses and
13 pedestrians. It was made by the former
14 Transportation Commissioner of New York City Janette
15 Sadik-Khan, and I wanted to see if any agency had any
16 view on the subject or if you wish to comment on it
17 in any way? I'll start with you, Mr. Sanchez.

18 COMMISSIONER SANCHEZ: Well, I think
19 right now we—we have been monitoring the traffic
20 situation, and it's really too early to tell what
21 future plans will be. A lot of it will obviously
22 depend on what this future security footprint will be
23 on Fifth Avenue and some of the cross-streets. So
24 it's—it's really tough to comment right now on what

25

2 that is. Will we act accordingly? Will just
3 continue monitoring and see what happens.

4 DEPUTY CHIEF KEHOE:

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON:

6 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: The DOT is not
7 proposing this for the moment it sounds like?

8 COMMISSIONER SANCHEZ: As far as I know,
9 Commissioner Sadik-Khan is no longer the DOT
10 Commissioner.

11 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay,
12 Commissioner Bishop.

13 COMMISSIONER BISHOP: And-and we have had
14 a terrific meeting earlier this week with the
15 retailers on Fifth Avenue and I-I do not-we did not
16 hear that as a request from the retailers. We-we did
17 not hear that from the request of the small
18 businesses on the side streets. What we heard was
19 that the retailers want more people to come to Fifth
20 Avenue. They want more people to come on 56th. They
21 want people to be able to enjoy, you know, all the-
22 the shopping and-and the restaurants in the area.
23 So, you know, certainly I defer to DOT, but I think,
24 you know, it's way too early and-and we did not hear

25

Formatted: Superscript

2 that from the retailers that they would want this
3 street to be closed.

4 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay. In
5 conversations and dialogue? Got you. But gentlemen,
6 thank you, very much. We appreciate it. We
7 appreciate your--your time and your testimony today,
8 and recognize the real challenges that we're under
9 and want to be supportive. I want to make sure that
10 New York City is making its--its own thoughtful and
11 independent decisions here while we also ensure the
12 safety and security of the--the President-Elect, the
13 soon to be President and his family. So we thank you
14 for your testimony, and we're going to call our next
15 panel. So thank you. The next panel is Kathy Wylde,
16 the Partnership for New York City; Rebecca Kriegman
17 with Senator Brad Hoylman; and Tom Cusick of the
18 Fifth Avenue Business Improvement District. So when
19 you all come on up and get settled, we will pick it
20 up. [pause] Let me make a quick public service
21 announcement. If you--if you wish to testify today,
22 and have not filled out a--one of these little slips
23 here, which the sergeant-at-arms has at the table--
24 and he is waving his hand right now--please take a
25 moment to fill out the slips so that we know that

you're interested in testifying. And with that, it looks like we are settled, and I'm going to start with Kathy Wylde with the Partnership, and we'll just move in this direction. Actually, you know, what it doesn't—it doesn't—if you all have a preference, it doesn't really matter to me. I'll just go in one direct. Okay. [background comments]

KATHY WYLDE: Thank you, Chairman Garodnick, and Council Members for this opportunity to testify on the economic impact of the increased security for the President-Elect. The Fifth Avenue is certainly one of the city's most important commercial and cultural destinations drawing people from around the world to New York City. In 2015, Manhattan retail stores employed nearly 180,000 workers and sold almost \$30 billion in goods, and Fifth Avenue, the area between 50th and 60th Streets is really an anchor of all this activity. There are about 1,400 resale-retail stores per square mile in zip code 122, which includes Fifth Avenue, this section of Fifth Avenue, and this is among the highest concentrations of retail activity in the city. Since the presidential election, the Fifth Avenue Retail District surrounding Trump Tower has

Formatted: Superscript

Formatted: Superscript

1 experienced an influx of security personnel, new
2 barriers, press, gawkers, that have severely
3 obstructed pedestrian and vehicular access to the
4 blocks between 50th and 58th Street. It has the look
5 and feel at times of an occupied zone. The result
6 has been a significant loss of economic activity
7 during the most important shopping season of the
8 year, and this condition is likely to get worse after
9 the Inauguration given the security requirements
10 around the sitting president. Traffic problems are
11 not new to this section of the city. In 2006, the
12 partnership worked with engineering firm HDR to
13 conduct an analysis of the city's traffic burden
14 generated largely by Manhattan south of 60th Street.
15 We concluded that the annual losses to the economy at
16 that time were \$13 billion a year. Due to the
17 congested condition, today that cost is undoubtedly
18 much higher and severely exacerbated by street
19 closings and variance and activities associated with
20 the securing of Fifth Avenue. It's important to
21 recognize that the world is watching what happens
22 around Trump Tower, particularly along Fifth Avenue,
23 which contributes much to the international image of
24 the city. New York businesses and residents well
25

Formatted: Superscript

Formatted: Superscript

Formatted: Superscript

2 beyond the immediate area are affected by what
3 happens here, not just in terms of cascading traffic
4 problems, but the image of the city's style and the
5 magic that draws so many people to our city.
6 Discussions between City officials and employers in
7 the affected area have resulted in some important
8 actions to improve conditions like the re-opening of
9 56th Street and a variety of proposals to mitigate
10 the economic impact of the necessary security
11 provisions. The partnership recommends, as I believe
12 the city is now committed to working relationships
13 between the city and local employers to monitor
14 conditions in the area, and take actions required to
15 ensure that this important shopping and cultural
16 destination is safe, attractive and accessible. We
17 also recommend some specific actions to deal in a
18 more proactive way with the potential security and
19 other issues—business issues affecting the area. The
20 NYPD currently has a network—a security network with
21 major private sector businesses that grew out of 9/11
22 called Operation Shields where they're exchanging
23 regular information providing input on conditions in
24 the city. We think that either this network might be
25 expanded to include the businesses, the major

Formatted: Superscript

businesses in this area or it might be Operation
Shield might be a model for ongoing communication
between law enforcement and—and the local employers.
To improve pedestrian vehicular access to the area,
we would endorse recommendations of local employers
for a temporary moratorium on street vendors and
parades on this stretch of Fifth Avenue, its
sidewalks and relevant side streets. We support the
provision of accessible drop-off and pick-up
locations for taxis and for-hire vehicles as well as
accessibility to bus stops. Closing of streets to
vehicular traffic should be minimized and certainly
the unpredictable closing of streets or redirection
of traffic should be minimized. Obstruction of store
entries should be avoided, and attention should be
paid to the design and location of security barriers
and the location of press, protestors and police
~~check point~~checkpoints to reduce obstruction of
pedestrian and vehicular traffic. Finally, there
should be a concerted effort to promote this area,
and encourage tourists and residents to continue to
visit and shop here. Through marketing initiatives,
rapid response to problem conditions, and proactive
planning for minimizing the impact of demonstrations,

2 presidential security activities and other potential
3 disruptions. Safety and security is obviously the
4 top priority for this district, and the NYPD and
5 Secrete Service will continue to provide for that.
6 I'm confident. At the same time, cooperation and
7 responsiveness to the unprecedented problems the area
8 will continue to face during the Trump Presidency
9 requires the city to take extraordinary actions to
10 ensure that the great contributions this district
11 makes to the city in terms of jobs, tax revenues,
12 tourist attraction and global branding are not
13 diminished. The Partnership is prepared to work with
14 public agencies, and the Council to achieve those
15 objectives. So thank you very much.

16
17 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Mr. Cusick.

18 TOM CUSICK: Good afternoon, Mr. Chairman
19 and members of the Committee. My name is Tom Cusick.
20 I am President of the Fifth Avenue Business
21 Improvement District. Thank you for giving me the
22 opportunity to discuss the unintended consequences of
23 the security associated with the fundamental need to
24 protect the President-Elect and his family. I want
25 to begin with a brief review of the last two months.

November 9th, was a bit of nightmare on Fifth Avenue.

Formatted: Superscript

As the President-Elect settled into Trump Tower that morning, Hillary Clinton prepared to deliver her concession speech just one block away at the Denzsel ~~(sp?)~~ Hotel. As a result—a result, two sets of security service contingents and two sets of ± police security teams descended on Fifth Avenue and also closed both 55th Street and 56th Streets.

Formatted: Superscript

Formatted: Superscript

[coughing] In addition, some 40 to 50 vehicles were parked on the avenue including back-to-back dump trucks in front of Trump Tower and TV cameras were heavily represented. The rest of November was almost as bad, although there were some adjustments of the barricades to accommodate a few of our stores. As each day passed, things got a little bit better with the help of the Secrete Service, the Police Department and the Trump Organization. Retail business picked up, but things have never returned to normal. When the President-Elect was out of town, security was more relaxed. While I cannot give a firm dollar amount at this time simply because most of our retailers are public corporations, and we all have to wait for their public disclosures, what I can say based on private conversations within individual

1 retailers, is that the overall impact on business was
2 significant. It was not unlike our experience when
3 there are parades on Fifth Avenue, when depending on
4 the location, retail revenue drops from 30 to 60%.
5 The hardest hit businesses were on Fifth Avenue
6 between 55th Street and 58th Street and on 57th Street
7 between Madison Avenue and Avenue of the Americas.
8 As of today, the formal estimates indicate that more
9 than \$40 million may have been lost. Now, that'd
10 different than the hand-out that I gave you simply
11 because, as Mr. Chairman, you were in the meeting
12 when I made the request to give me unofficial results
13 without identifying the corporate source, and that is
14 how the prior number was developed. But let me give
15 you some practical examples of how difficult things
16 have been. The entrances to retail stores on the
17 west side of Fifth Avenue between 56 and 57, are
18 literally inaccessible from time to time for three
19 reasons: First, pedestrian traffic is mostly
20 prohibited on the east side of Fifth Avenue, and is
21 directed to the west side. Second, about 10 to 12 TV
22 cameras set up on the west side are omnipresent while
23 the President-Elect is in town; and third, tourists
24 and passers-by stop near the TV cameras to take their
25

Formatted: Superscript

Formatted: Superscript

Formatted: Superscript

own photos mostly with cell phones raised above their heads. While this inaccessibility is not constant, variations of lesser crowds still keep shoppers away from these stores. Another example involves stores on the northeast and the southeast corners of 56th Street and Fifth Avenue where there's a security checkpoint. As pedestrians on the south side are asked about their destination, pedestrian traffic moving north is severely impeded. At the same time, the front doors of stores on the south side are frequently blocked. All of this is not to say that there has been progress. We're particularly thankful to supervising Secrete Service agent Paul La Bosco, and Police Deputy Inspectors Hart and Dennis for their availability and responses within their mandates to keep this area secure. We're also grateful to Matt Calamari with the Trump Organization for his cooperation and assistance, to Borough President Gale Brewer and to our local Council Member Dan Garodnick. I'd like to end with a few very specific recommendations for additional action that we might take under consideration. First, we recommend that the TV cameras be moved to the east side of the family to alleviate the severe crowding

Formatted: Superscript

on the west side. Second, we recommend that the 56th Street checkpoint be modified to allow a direct lead into Gucci, which would unclog the limited access and corresponding back-up that hinders entrances to north and south stores. Third, we recommend that a taxi stand be located on 58th Street since it's often difficult of impossible to drop off customers near our stores. Fourth, would it be possible to replace the cement barriers with much cleaner looking barriers. We'd also recommend that some consideration be given to moving parades south of this area to mitigate the sales losses that occur on those days, which could make up for some of the sales that were lost. Finally, Mr. Chairman, I want to thank you for this hearing today, and for your repeat visits to our neighborhood to understand our problems, your willingness to suggest to practical solutions to these problems. Happy to answer-answer any questions you might have.

CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Thank you.

Rebecca.

REBECCA KRIEGMAN: Hello, my name is Rebecca Kriegman. I am testifying on behalf of State Senator Brad Hoylman. Thank for the opportunity to

Formatted: Superscript

Formatted: Superscript

testify today. We're grateful to Chairman Garodnick for holding this hearing as well as Mayor de Blasio, Deputy Mayor Glenn, Borough President Brewer, Partnership, the Fifth Avenue BID and all the local business owners for the involvement and input into creative solutions that we hope can alleviate the burden that Midtown continues to face as we near the President-Elect's Inauguration date with little insight into his continued New York City operations. Senator Hoylman represents a large part of Central Manhattan including Fifth Avenue up to 55th Street. His district contains many beloved Fifth Avenue institutions and businesses including Rockefeller Center, St. Patrick's Cathedral, Saks Fifth Avenue, and not to mention countless small businesses, hotels, restaurants. The massive footprint of President-Elect Trump's transition operation in New York has already blocked customer access to local businesses, obstructed retail deliveries and deterred shoppers from visiting the overcrowded and chaotic area. Midtown Manhattan streets and sidewalks first in play are not built to handle the combined capacity of a pre-presidential security operation, a full press flow including media vans and protest groups.

Formatted: Superscript

2 We must find a way to alleviate and organize the
3 vehicular and fast streamed traffic in the area to
4 allow for better access to stores and institutions.
5 This includes designating areas for cabs and for-hire
6 vehicles and clearly communicating parking rules and
7 limitations. Additionally, while the city has
8 indicated that parade routes will not be altered for
9 2017, we should study alternative parade routes for
10 following years to reduce the strain on an already
11 overburdened area. The city should, for example,
12 consider limiting parades to the more southern
13 portion of Fifth Avenue or to another avenue
14 entirely. Likewise, the city should consider moving
15 street vendors to areas north and south on Fifth
16 Avenue. Moreover, the NYP-NYPD presence assigned to
17 President-Elect Trump and at Trump Tower is, as we
18 heard earlier, and unfortunate allocation of
19 resources in a city of eight million people who
20 depend on NYPD officers to protect and serve everyday
21 New Yorkers. Over the next four years, the NYPD will
22 spend an untold sum of money on the protection of
23 President-Elect Trump without a guarantee of
24 reimbursement by the federal government. This is
25 simply unacceptable and we must do everything in our

2 power to ensure that New York City's taxpayers are
3 not unfairly pushed for the President—the presence of
4 a President-Elect in our city. While the relocation
5 of the President-Elect's transition had quarters to a
6 more suitable site, and his eventual move to the
7 White House would —provide for the immediate
8 alleviation of undue strain on the area. We must
9 prepare for the likelihood of the President-Elect's
10 continued presence at Trump Tower after his
11 inauguration. New Yorkers need more information to
12 fully understand the extent of the traffic
13 disruption, and how deeply the impact from that
14 disruption will influence citywide economic patterns.
15 This hearing is an excellent step in give the
16 community an opportunity to share their concerns and
17 ideas and determine what changes are necessary to
18 ease congestion, and improve business activity. We
19 must use this information to make every effort to
20 support New York residents, business owners, and
21 tourists and act expeditiously to improve the current
22 situation, and prepare for changes that may occur
23 following the Inauguration. If nothing is done to
24 change the status quo, President-Elect Trump will
25 literally put New Yorkers out of business. Thank you

2 for your time and consideration. If any members of
3 the public would like to read our full testimony, I
4 have printed copies and it will also be posted on our
5 Senate website. Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Thank you very
7 much to all of you, and we appreciate your—your
8 taking the time to be here today. I wanted to just
9 ask two questions and, you know, if—if you want to
10 answer, feel free. If not, that’s also okay. Having
11 listened to some of the testimony from the Police
12 Department, and your own experience from what you’re
13 seeing out on the street, do you feel like the NYPD
14 is being sufficiently sensitive to the needs of
15 businesses in the area of Trump Tower? That’s really
16 the question. You know, we recognize here that
17 they’re under significant constraints. We don’t know
18 whether they’re, you know, taking orders or
19 collaborating on orders with Secrete Service per
20 their testimony today, but we know that they—they’ve
21 got real challenges. Do you think that they are
22 being sufficiently —sensitive to the needs of
23 businesses in the area?

24 TOM CUSICK: Without qualification, yes.
25 We do have some problems from time to time. As the

2 Police Department representative in the earlier panel
3 had discussed, drawing people from other areas means
4 that some people who come to the area aren't familiar
5 with our neighborhood. Interestingly enough, Bob
6 Louittit, who is our Executive Vice President sitting
7 in the back there, showed me an email, as we were
8 preparing to walk forward, that one of the businesses
9 there was complaining that his business was
10 inaccessible because a police officer stopped him
11 from going down 56th Street, which is his business.
12 That—that's simply because that police officer didn't
13 get the word, and just to—to—to give you an example
14 of what I mean by an unqualified yes, that they are
15 responsive. We immediately contacted our
16 representatives in the Police Department to get the
17 word to that police officer on the street that, in
18 fact, anyone going to that particular business on
19 56th Street has access. So, our experience is that
20 when we sit down and talk with the Police Department
21 and Secrete Service, they do all in their power
22 within the confines of keeping the secret—of keeping
23 the family secure.

24 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Listen, I—I
25 appreciate that, and I'm—and I'm glad to hear that

Formatted: Superscript

Formatted: Superscript

2 they are being responsive when you call. I think
3 that what I would like to see is a little more
4 proactivity on their part so that they do not have
5 fresh officers on the street who do not know that
6 56th Street is open. This is New York. Thanks
7 happen fast. You know, those businesses that are
8 waiting for whatever it is that they were waiting
9 for, they are out of luck if things don't happen in
10 the way that they expected them. And so, we want PD
11 to think about an appropriate unit for the area,
12 people who are trained with sophistication on the
13 rules and, you know, I-I-I hope they will continue to
14 be as responsive to you and to me and to others as
15 they have been. But I-you know, we're, you know,
16 bracing ourselves for a four-year period of a
17 security apparatus, which appears not to have been
18 determined at this moment in time. We need them to
19 be thinking ahead, not just responding, and that's
20 really to the extent that, you know, I feel criticism
21 toward NYPD. It is that, not a lack of
22 responsiveness to you.

23 TOM CUSICK: Uh-huh.

24 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: So I think that's
25 a-I think your point is a-is a good one, though.

Formatted: Superscript

2 TOM CUSICK: Alright.

3 KATHY WYLDE: I think the other big issue
4 for the entire surrounding area going all the way
5 from Third to Eight Avenue was that up until this
6 week, there were 300 traffic agents deployed by the
7 NYPD in the area who pretty much seem to have
8 individual authority to close streets, stop-stop
9 people from turning, et cetera with regard to
10 vehicular traffic, and-and sometimes pedestrians.
11 And that-that was-I think that was very disruptive.
12 I'm-I'm told that that has been dramatically reduced
13 now, and so I think that will be probably helpful.

14 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Any comment on
15 that proposal from the New York Times today? Do you
16 want to-do you want to weigh in on that.

17 KATHY WYLDE: It's really dumb.

18 TOM CUSICK: Oh, yeah, an absolutely
19 terrible idea, and I scribbled a couple of notes here
20 because I thought that might be asked. Comparing
21 Times Square and Fifth Avenue retail environments is
22 a gross error to begin with, and-and by doing that,
23 it indicates a lack of understanding of the
24 differences between those two retail communities. If
25 there were no southbound vehicle traffic from

2 whatever area, which one-to commission one or two to
3 shut it off on, we would then have no southbound
4 lanes from Park Avenue to Seventh Avenue. Think
5 about that for a moment. No southbound lanes from
6 Park Avenue to Seventh Avenue. Not a good idea.
7 There would be absolutely no change in security in
8 and around Trump Tower if this plan were to be
9 implemented. None whatsoever. The highest sales on
10 Fifth Avenue come from fairly wealthy customers who
11 arrive in private vehicles. Eliminate those sales
12 and there will be a dramatic decrease. I've already
13 referred to the more than \$40 million lost to date.
14 It's going to cascade if this were to be implemented,
15 and I would-I would just say as a footnote that the
16 author of this Op-Ed article is no friend of Fifth
17 Avenue. While she was an active commissioner, she
18 attempted to put bike stands in front of our stores
19 on the sidewalk. So, I-I just don't see that this is
20 in the interest of our residents, and our businesses.

21 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Fair enough.

22 Thank you. Do you want to add anything or...?

23 REBECCA KRIEGMAN: Not comments
24 specifically on the Fifth Avenue proposal in the New
25 York Times BID, but in general we-we do think it is

2 paramount that the DOT continue studying traffic
3 patterns in the area, and evaluating ways that they
4 can improve the traffic pattern. So-so we hope that
5 they come up with creative proposals, but we-we do
6 not simply have a position on this-with that new
7 proposal.

8 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay, well thank
9 you and thanks to all three of you for your
10 testimony. I'm going to call our last panel. We
11 look forward to working with you, and thinking
12 through-thinking about ways to make life a little
13 better over there, and thanks for the concrete
14 proposals that you all put out. I want to call
15 Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer and welcome
16 here back to her favorite chamber, and I'll call
17 Derek Walsh of the Petition to Remove Barricades, et
18 cetera, and we thank him for his advocacy on behalf
19 of those business on 56th Street and beyond. Jessica
20 Walker, President of Manhattan Chamber of Commerce
21 and Joseph Loonam of the Riders Alliance, and that's
22 going to close it out for today. So this is our last
23 panel, and Borough President Brewer, I'm going to
24 call on you first, and then we will go to the rest of
25 the group.

Formatted: Superscript

2 GALE BREWER: Thank you very much, Chair
3 Garodnick, and the—the committee. This is an
4 important topic. I know you know it well. We
5 appreciate very much the opportunity to testify to
6 further overuse the most overused phrase of this
7 election season. The situation surrounding security
8 at Trump Tower is unprecedented. Midtown Manhattan
9 is the largest central business district in the
10 entire nation, as I know you heard from Mr. Cusick.
11 It's by a long shot the largest business district.
12 Anything disrupting economic opportunities in this
13 part of the city for hours is significant for days or
14 for weeks is serious and for months or years is
15 devastating. The Fifth Avenue businesses, as you
16 heard of Trump Tower include iconic New York gems
17 such as Tiffany's, Bergdorf Goodman's, American
18 flagship stores and international companies such as
19 Bulgari and Chanel. These stores were national and
20 international tourists and directly provides
21 thousands of good jobs while indirectly they support
22 many times that number of jobs. We have heard the
23 concerns of these businesses that customers are
24 staying away and anecdotally some have reported
25 comparatively better holiday sales at some New Jersey

2 mall branches. A horrible idea. Better at the New
3 Jersey Mall branches, and as our flagship Fifth
4 Avenue stores this year. This weekend in the New York
5 Post reported that Torneau had recently suffered a \$2
6 million revenue decline. This is a situation that in
7 my opinion cannot be allowed to continue. I was glad
8 to learn that the Fifth Avenue BID and NYC and
9 Company are working together on a promotional
10 campaign. You know that as well as we do, but we
11 need a sustained and more comprehensive effort, and
12 you've heard a lot of those suggestions from the
13 previous panel. While not as renown as these Fifth
14 Avenue gems, the small businesses in the area, and
15 you're hear immediate from the leader who is
16 phenomenal. We're going to talk specifically about
17 56th Street between Fifth and Sixth Avenues. They
18 are just as important. We have met, as you have, Mr.
19 Chair, with these business owners, and while the
20 reverberations on Manhattan and the city may not be
21 as big as from—from some of these small businesses as
22 the Fifth Avenue, they're important to not be
23 overstated. Collectively, there are at least 105
24 small businesses located on West 56th Street between
25 Fifth and Sixth. There are about 31 ground floor

2 businesses and over 70 on upper floors. This could
3 mean in the neighborhood of 1,000 jobs, and while
4 each of these businesses may not have nearly as
5 significant an impact on the city's economy as an
6 international flagship, a downtown-downturn in
7 activities and a pub, as we'll hear, a small
8 restaurant or a hair salon is more likely to cause
9 the downfall of such a business and the loss of
10 quality jobs, and the collective danger to all of
11 these small businesses could significantly damage the
12 neighborhood. We have heard from these owners that
13 in November following the election, revenues were
14 down an average of 30%. You, Mr. Chair, the Small
15 Business Commissioner, and others reached out to the
16 businesses. However, we have heard that despite a
17 rebound for some of the small businesses in December,
18 the last few weeks have brought additional declines
19 in business. Our understanding is that this decline
20 is due to the combination of second command post
21 located on the block. It is due to barricades
22 running the length of the block, and it is due to
23 only one lane of traffic being open. In addition, on
24 a couple of occasions, even the one lane has been
25 closed again, and we have photographs here, which we

1 will share with you. In one instance, local traffic
2 agents closed the street when a Sanitation truck was
3 collecting trash. Understandably, the trash has to
4 be picked up. It might make sense, but to do it
5 without notification is problematic. This points to
6 the need for using technology such as used as list-as
7 lister to ensure proper notification. I noted the
8 Administration and NYPD do not have primary control
9 for the security measures surround Trump Plaza, and
10 appreciate the work they are doing to provide the
11 necessary security as well to work with the business
12 community. We have to continue to work with these
13 businesses to ease the unfair burden they are being
14 asked to shoulder. We have to work hard and be open
15 to all reasonable ideas to make the area as inviting
16 as possible. That means improving the looks of the
17 security measures, and pushing to make sure we aren't
18 arresting more impediments to foot and vehicle
19 traffic that are necessary. It means making sure
20 West 56th Street is generally open, and that people
21 know it is open, and making it as inviting as we
22 possibly can. It means implementing proficient means
23 of communicating with all businesses all of the ones
24 on 56th Street so that if a change must occur, they
25

2 are notified as soon as possible about the change,
3 and how long the change will be, and it means
4 promoting the area as a whole from Bulgari to Bengal
5 Tiger to this amazing pub that we'll hear about in a
6 minute. Thank you for taking up this matter. We
7 will all continue to work together, but this is a
8 really messed up situation for the businesses on
9 Wests 56th Street, and to answer your question
10 earlier, with all due respect, all to the parties
11 enough is not being done, and some of them are going
12 to close if you don't do more. Thank you very much.

13 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Thank you, Madam
14 Borough President. We appreciate your testimony.
15 Now, the most famous bar owner on 56th Street, you're
16 up.

17 DEREK WALSH: This is Kevin Kunin. (sp?)
18 [coughs]. Thank you very much. Everything Gale
19 said. Where do I start. I guess looking back I can
20 only speak on behalf of my own business. I'm kind of
21 worried why there wasn't a plan in place. We-we-we
22 thought a lot of things were done very sporadically
23 at the start. It took a while before, you know,
24 after a few weeks passed by, we saw numbers go down.
25 We're like where's our help going to come by? Thank

2 you, Mr. Garodnick, for calling in and starting the-
3 starting to help. We—at the time I went around. I
4 guess I can only speak on behalf of the 46 business
5 owners there. They signed a petition, and we asked
6 for the barricades to be moved across the street that
7 the barricades, the command post, which I was told it
8 protects the—the barricades that protect the command
9 post. There was a bomb squad there at the time and
10 Turlock (sic). And we were asking for those to be
11 moved across the street because tourists weren't
12 walking down the street. It wasn't—it wasn't
13 pleasing to the eye. People were walking by. With
14 those barricades on Fifth Avenue by Trump Towers,
15 it's like a maze. People were kind of forced to—to
16 move fast, to keep moving especially in November and
17 December there's a lot more people on the street that
18 time of the year. I guess that's where we—we saw our
19 business not doing as well as it normally does in
20 November and December. So with that petition we
21 asked any chance could we open up the street? Can we
22 get a voice in it? And speaking with Mr. Cusick
23 here, I'm jealous. I'm not on Fifth Avenue. I know
24 there's another—there's a co-op on Sixth Avenue, B-I-
25 D on Sixth Avenue. We're not on that either. We're

2 on 56th Street between Fifth and Sixth Avenues. We
3 don't have a co-op. We don't—we don't have a voice
4 when it comes to this. We don't a Mr. Cusick that
5 can stand in and do the great work that he's doing.
6 I guess that's where we're struggling. When—when I
7 went around to these businesses asking about the
8 petition, it surprising, you know, how I got to meet
9 some, you know, have been on the block seven or eight
10 years, and the same person. I got to meet them, and
11 a lot of people are frightened. Some people are
12 thinking about moving away, moving out of the block,
13 relocating their businesses and not renewing their
14 leases. And I could see why because the lack of
15 communication I guess not knowing what's going on
16 frightened a lot of people. You know when you're—
17 when you're renewing your lease for a business, you
18 don't renew it for a year or two years. It's usually
19 a five to ten-year lease that you're renewing with
20 that. So renewing your—your business for ten years
21 and not knowing the next month or the next four years
22 is frightening. There was questions, as I said, bout
23 the command post that Fifth Avenue service, which is
24 open to the NYPD and their posts. (sic) Why is it
25 that—what is the protection? Is it there for

2 protection? As I said, 56th is between Fifth and
3 Madison. It's already closed down. The street I see
4 is already closed down to pedestrians and to
5 vehicles. Why not move the command post there if
6 it's already shut down? Why not move it to the other
7 side of the block on the Madison side? Maybe unpack.
8 You're still the same distance from Trump Tower.
9 You're on Trump path. But the building owner I think
10 takes up the whole block. But I guess what we're
11 asking for really is just more communication, and
12 knowing what's going on, you know. I-I think
13 personally what makes sweet (sic) the inauguration is
14 protest like a simple thing as that. Do I-do I put
15 extra staff working that day or do I close the door
16 because the street may get closed down? You now,
17 it's-it's just-it's very-the communication I wish
18 there was more, the Community Affairs have helped us,
19 but, you know, hopefully-I'm happy to just help
20 Council Member Garodnick, Manhattan Borough President
21 Gale Brewer and the Commission of Small Businesses,
22 Greg Bishop. Hopefully, we can get this moving
23 quickly because right now, as I say, I got that
24 petition together in the end of November and start of
25 December. People were kind of convinced. (sic) This

2 six weeks later. This is nearly nine weeks after the
3 election, and we're seeing that major struggle with
4 communication. Maybe I should stop talking.

5 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: We can pose some
6 questions to you, too, if you want.

7 DEREK WALSH: No, you're—you're good. We
8 can—we can—Gale can get those.

9 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay.

10 DEREK WALSH: She's got it. [laughter]

11 GALE BREWER: Derek has them.

12 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: No. Okay. Yeah.

13 TOM CUSICK: Do you want to pose
14 questions to me.

15 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay, well, I'm
16 going to—I'm going to hear from Ms. Walker and—and—
17 and the rest of the panel, and then—and then we'll
18 come back to you, but Jessica, go ahead.

19 JESSICA WALKER: Thank you. I'm with the
20 Manhattan Chamber of Commerce, and we're an
21 organization that drivers economic prosperity by
22 helping businesses of all sizers here in the city
23 particularly the small businesses to succeed here in
24 New York. We harbor significant concerns for the
25 businesses that have been disrupted by the security

1 measures around Trump Tower. While traffic on 56th
2 Street was partially reopened in recent weeks,
3 barricades and a strong police presence continued to
4 diminish foot traffic in the area. Some of these
5 businesses may lose—lose revenue. As we've heard
6 today, it sounds like it's already happening, and
7 this can be catastrophic if this continues to go on
8 for a prolonged period. I want to use the recent
9 opening of the Second Avenue Subway as a prime
10 example, something that we've been very involved in.
11 First, let me preface my comments by saying that I am
12 ecstatic about the extension of the Q-Train, and
13 everybody knows that this is going to alleviate
14 congestion on the 4, 5, 6 train runs, and also
15 attract new residents and shoppers on the Second
16 Avenue. But this change did not come without some
17 pain. Multi-year construction to lay the new tracks
18 was immensely disruptive for businesses in that area.
19 Rats, explosions, dust, noise and scaffolding kept
20 business, kept customers away. And at the same time,
21 of course, rapidly escalating rents further
22 threatened these businesses. So, throughout it all,
23 however, the Manhattan Chamber of Commerce was there
24 to support businesses, and lure customers back to the
25

2 area. All the affect shops and restaurants were
3 offered free membership in the Chamber. We launched
4 a Second Avenue website and app with support from the
5 City Council to show that Second Avenue was still
6 open for business. We sponsored a Second Avenue
7 Restaurant and Retail Week in 2013 that
8 highlighted special discounts, and we continue to
9 host our two annual street fairs in the vicinity to
10 bring—to bring in customers and tourists. All of
11 this helps many businesses hang on during
12 construction so that they may now reap the benefits.
13 However, the challenges proved insurmountable for
14 some. Since 2010, the Chamber has tracked the 452
15 businesses along the area the Second Avenue impacted
16 by the subway construction zone, and for us that was
17 between 69th and 97th Streets. Our staff walk the
18 avenue every few months to monitor changes, and at
19 our last walk in August 2016, we found that only 48%,
20 208 of all the businesses in the zone remained in
21 continuous operation since 2010. Some businesses
22 relocated to be certain, but others likely closed,
23 and so even—and even those that did remain were often
24 forced to reduce staff or business operations to make
25 ends meet, and we do have some examples of that. For

1 example a restaurant in the area who went from four
2 managers to one, and the business owner basically
3 doesn't rest or take—take any vacation. So we fear
4 that the business use—the businesses near Trump Tower
5 could be similarly threatened if this goes on for
6 years. The Chamber stands ready to help these
7 businesses continue to attract customers, and we're
8 beginning to canvass the area to help along with SBS
9 and some of the elected officials. But we also want
10 to offer two other proposals for your consideration.
11 First, is the creating of a fund to potentially
12 mitigate real time business losses especially for
13 those small businesses in the area. This was a
14 successful strategy employed to help business survive
15 and thrive in two cities: Seattle, Washington and
16 St. Paul, Minnesota as they recently built extensive
17 new light rail lines through neighborhoods that were
18 rich with small local businesses. And there are
19 several ways to structure this types—this type of
20 mitigation fund, but the goal is really to provide
21 grant payments or forgivable loans that will mitigate
22 revenue losses until business returns to normal.
23 Second is suspending the commercial rent tax, the
24 Councilman's favorite topic, for affected businesses
25

2 in the area. As you may know, the Chamber actually
3 is in favor of phasing out this burdensome tax
4 altogether, but in this instance, it may be a fast
5 and efficient way for the city to provide targeted
6 relief very quickly for the businesses that are
7 seeing revenue losses. We look forward to working
8 with you to safeguard the businesses in the community
9 and we think that, you know, that these businesses
10 have an important role to play in our cities, but
11 also in tourism. So we want to be helpful there.

12 Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Thank you. Mr.
14 Loonam.

15 JOSEPH LOONAM: Hello, my name is Joseph
16 Loonam and I'm an Organizer with the Riders Alliance.
17 The Riders Alliance is a grassroots organization that
18 fights for better and more affordable subway and bus
19 service. We at the Riders Alliance are concerned
20 about the impact that the Trump Administration might
21 have on public transit for the residents of the city
22 of New York. The most immediate concern is about the
23 potential disruptions to inter-borough bus service
24 through the announcement of unprecedented security
25 protocols on 57th Street. We need to understand the

2 impact that these protocols will have on inter-
3 borough buses especially the Q-101, the Q-60, the Q-
4 32 and 57 bus and the M-31 bus, and on the 43,527
5 riders who depend on these buses everyday. We hope
6 that the city is dedicated to finding options for
7 riders who may have been affected by street changes
8 due to increased security. Having these buses run
9 reliably is essential to the daily lives of New
10 Yorkers in many boroughs. The Riders Alliance is
11 also very concerned with securing revenue that the
12 MTA needs to operate. Trump has made a lot of
13 promises about funding infrastructure, but it is
14 unclear whether or not that will include funding for
15 public transit. On the whole, the incoming Congress
16 has expressed an interest in shrinking the size of
17 the federal government, and that endangers many
18 revenue streams that the MTA and DOT rely on,
19 including small starts, new starts, and other federal
20 programs that allow for public transit infrastructure
21 investments. If government spending shrinks on a
22 federal level, it will be up to the State and the
23 City to identify and protect revenue sources, and
24 ensure that we keep our subways and buses running,
25 and that we can all afford to ride them. As a

2 grassroots organization, we at the Riders Alliance
3 believe that the solution to these problems will be
4 found with the people who rely on the MTA everyday.
5 We are seen as a transit organization. However, in
6 reality, [coughs] we are a democracy organization. As
7 government and democracy come under assault in the
8 Trump Administration and the incoming Congress, we
9 take seriously our goal of being an example of the
10 good that comes from citizens involving themselves in
11 the democratic process. We will continue to protect
12 the communities we serve by involving them in the
13 democratic process. We are glad that our local
14 representatives here in New York City are doing the
15 same. Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Thank you very
17 much, and thanks to all of you. Derek, I just have a
18 couple of questions for you that--

19 DEREK WALSH: [interposing] Sure.

20 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --I-I wanted to
21 perhaps finish out the hearing with. You-you were
22 for the testimony of NYPD, and the--

23 DEREK WALSH: [interposing] Uh-uh.

24 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: --the Department
25 of Small Business Services and DOT. Was there

2 anything in that testimony, which you felt was
3 inconsistent with your experience or is there
4 anything that you would flag for us as something that
5 we should be focusing on—on 56th Street or beyond
6 that they are not?

7 DEREK WALSH: [pause] Communication.

8 That has—there was very little communication during
9 that. When you go to that command post, you don't
10 necessarily get to speak with the supervisor. More
11 times than not, I haven't been able to speak with the
12 supervisor. I remember when the—when the command
13 post was first—they actually closed up—they closed
14 down the street, the—the sidewalk. So the only
15 sidewalk coming from Fifth Avenue to Sixth Avenue
16 down 56th Street was at the—the northwest corner,
17 right by the corner of Abercrombie. So, you can
18 imagine all the pressure that's on that in November
19 and December with the abundance of people, and the
20 only exit off that block is at that corner. I tried
21 to speak with a supervisor in there I say maybe three
22 or four times, and every time I got turned away
23 because the command post was barricaded off. I
24 couldn't even get my hands and knock on the door. So
25 every time I approached it, I was turned away. There

2 was a day I was outside, and I—I waited for a guy in
3 a white shirt, Lieutenant McNamara I think his name
4 was. I spoke with him, and he was there I think
5 regarding the arrest afterwards of—after the
6 protesting. I spoke with him just about the simple
7 idea—idea of why not open the sidewalks at least and
8 at least let the people down the street, you know.
9 But, you know, 20 minutes later what happened is the
10 street cut open. But, by going back there maybe two
11 or three times since, I've learned to realize that
12 whoever is in charge there is usually somebody from
13 the out of the Borough of Manhattan, and whoever is
14 in charge, the supervisor, it seems to change all the
15 time. So how can you have consistent conversation
16 with the supervisor when the supervisor keeps
17 changing every day.

18 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: So the idea that
19 a business owner could just walk up to the command
20 post, and get answers to his questions you don't
21 regard as credible?

22 DEREK WALSH: Oh, no, not—not then. Now
23 previously for me, no.

24 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: How about the
25 telephone.

2 DEREK WALSH: [interposing] But I've-

3 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Do you have a
4 telephone number for inside?

5 DEREK WALSH: Yeah, well, for-for the
6 command post no, but I will say let's not knock the
7 NYPD. They've been phenomenal, and I think I've
8 asked for them to have them get me to speak to a
9 supervisor in the command post. They've come across
10 with it. I worked with the Community Affairs
11 Officers a lot in Midtown or the Midtown section.
12 They've been great. Monday night, Tuesday and
13 Wednesday morning of last wee, the street was closed
14 up. What reason I don't know. I called the
15 Detective Alex Marsh (sic) from the Town South (sic).
16 He's here today. A lot of great help that man has
17 been. I called him at 8 o'clock I think that
18 morning, Wednesday morning. I think the NYPD were
19 having a little inauguration in Madison Square
20 Garden. I called him 12 hours later with the same
21 problem. The street was again closed up, and after
22 speaking with the guy, whatever he does, in 10 or 15
23 minutes later I look out my door and there's traffic
24 again. The street is back open. So what I was
25 saying is NYPD has been great. I just wish there was

2 some questions that I could ask. I mean why is the-
3 the command post there? Why not move it across the
4 street to a street that's already closed up?
5 Communication is there somewhere were we can maybe
6 get an app for the business owners on the block to
7 say, you know, there is going to be Sanitation coming
8 between 2:00 and 4:00 a.m. or between 10:00 and 11:00
9 here. There has to be some sort of communication.
10 It has to be better than this. The stories I've
11 heard from going around even not being able to get
12 into your own businesses, is--some of them I'm--I'm not
13 going to get into but there is that obviously maybe
14 we were a co-op and we had some way to do that, but
15 then, you know, I find it very hard to have a co-op
16 on 56th Street between Fifth and Sixth Avenue go into
17 business and looking for finances to--to begin a co-op
18 when these businesses are struggling. So are we
19 going to do that? I don't know. Again, this is just
20 me think--thinking on my own but, you know, I guess
21 the last point I got to say is just there everyday
22 and seeing it everyday, and doing the long hours of
23 having the four managers and down to one. And just
24 it's--people are avoiding the area, the New Yorkers
25 are. They don't want to go through. They don't want

2 to go through the hustle-bustle of not knowing if you
3 can cross a street on the east side and not on the
4 west side. How did you come across from the east
5 side to the west side. When you come across 56th
6 Street you got to walk up to the 57th and as you walk
7 up to 57th then you come across from the east side to
8 the west side on 57th. There's too much of it there
9 are going-of it going around. We ask for better
10 communication. We know if the President-Elect is
11 going to live there a few days a week, well, then I
12 think the businesses have got to get together and we
13 got to find some way to advertise our street and to
14 market our street, you know. Council Member, thank
15 you.

16 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay, thank you,
17 and just to-just for the last question. Your
18 business I cited in-in my testimony as being down in-
19 in November. Tell us how-how business has been
20 going over the past two months.

21 DEREK WALSH: We're very small. It's a
22 small place. It's 500 square foot. It's very easy
23 to-to fit all the establishment. I remember the day
24 that they opened the streets. The first day I think
25 the President-Elect was-he was not New York, and they

2 opened the streets. I hadn't seen as many tourists
3 in bar in a long time. One lady actually came to me
4 and said you're understaffed, and I was like no,
5 we're not understaffed. They opened the street
6 today, but again communication. I didn't know and I
7 was understaffed. If commun-if the communication is
8 there, we can work it.

9 CHAIRPERSON GARODNICK: Okay. I'm going
10 to let that be-be the last word here, and we
11 certainly appreciate your testimony and the testimony
12 of-of everybody on the panel, and everybody who came
13 today, and clearly this is going to be the beginning
14 of this conversation because we do not, as we sit
15 here today, know exactly what PD-PD in conjunction
16 with Secrete Service, PD in response to Secrete
17 Service or any combination therein is going to
18 proposed to do in the area after January 20th. So we
19 are going to need to stay vigilant, and we'll look to
20 find ways to mitigate impacts, and recognize that
21 this is a-if it's unprecedented or unique or whatever
22 it is, we know that this is different. So we thank
23 everybody for their presence here today, and we look
24 forward to continuing this conversation. With that,
25 we're adjourned. [gavel]

1 COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

121

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date January 12, 2017