

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON OVERSIGHT AND INVESTIGATION JOINTLY
WITH COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

----- X

February 6, 3018
Start: 10:18 a.m.
Recess: 4:53 p.m.

B E F O R E: RITCHIE J. TORRES
Chairperson

ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Ben Kallos
Rory I. Lancman
Keith Powers
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Mark Treyger
Kalman Yeger
Diana Ayala
Laurie A. Cumbo
Mark Gjonaj
Carlos Menchaca
Donovan J. Richards
James G. Van Bramer
Speaker Corey Johnson
Public Advocate Letitia James
Margaret Chin
Barry Grodenchik
Brad Lander
Robert Cornegy
Helen Rosenthal
Will Perkins

Chaim Deutsch
A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Shola Olatoye, Chair & Chief Executive Officer
New York City Housing Authority

Cathy Pennington, Acting Executive Vice President
Operations, New York City Housing Authority

Deborah Goddard, Executive Vice President
Capital Projects, New York City Housing Authority

Zachary Carter, Corporation Counsel
City of New York

Vito Mustaciuolo, Acting General Manager
New York City Housing Authority

Sideya Sherman, Executive Vice President
Community Engagement and Programs
New York City Housing Authority

Kerri Jew, Executive Vice President & Chief
Administrative officer
New York City Housing Authority

Anthony Drummond Appearing for:
Brooklyn Borough President Eric Adams

Marricka Scott-McFadden
Bronx Deputy Borough President

Ray Sanchez, General Counsel & Deputy VP
Bronx Borough President's Office

Victoria Reign
Director of Policy & Deputy Counsel
Bronx Borough President's Office

Aixa Torres, Smith Houses

Crystal Glover, Washington Houses

Bertha Akin, Director of Training and Education
Trainer of HPTs
International Brotherhood of Teamsters Local 237

Chuck Norman, Director
Housing Division
International Brotherhood of Teamsters Local 237

Gale Brewer, Manhattan Borough President

Daniel Karpen, Environmental Engineer

Robert Rollendorf (sp?), NYCHA Resident

Karen Blondel, Representative
Gowanus Neighborhood Coalition for Justice and
Turning the Tide

Charlene Nimmons, Public Housing Communities, Inc.

Diana Blackwell Appearing for:
Audrey Clemmons, President
NYCHA PS 139 Conversion, Senior Development

Carrie Jackson, Former HPD employee

Dorothy Gray, NYCHA Resident, Morningside Heights

1
2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: That is a departure
3 from what has been told to us--

4 ZACHARY CARTER: [interposing] That's
5 not--

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: --for the last two
7 weeks.

8 ZACHARY CARTER: That is not a departure
9 in the least. The two things are not mutually
10 exclusive. There was a lack of clarity in the
11 information provided to the chair.

12 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Okay.

13 ZACHARY CARTER: As a result--

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: [interposing] That's
15 what we're asking about.

16 ZACHARY CARTER: And as a result, a
17 mistake was made during the course of that testimony
18 that conflated two different--

19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: [interposing] So, our
20 question, Counselor is if the person--

21 ZACHARY CARTER: [interposing] Council
22 Member you have to look at the--

23 SPEAKER JOHNSON: --did give clarity are
24 they being held accountable? That's the question.
25 It's not a complicated question? Yes or no?

1
2 ZACHARY CARTER: If people—if mistakes
3 were made—were made in assisting the Chair with the
4 presentation, it is not under all circumstances in
5 large organizations where lots of people are involved
6 in trying to give the best answers they can, that is
7 appropriate to hold any single person or group or
8 group of persons responsible. You—you use that
9 occurrence as a learning experience so people are
10 aware that a mistake was made. I assume that no
11 people feel worse about the fact that the mistake was
12 made than the people who assisted in her preparation,
13 and it is very highly unlikely the mistake of that
14 sort given the attention that was given to it will
15 ever happen again, period.

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I hope that means that
17 the person or persons are being held accountable.

18 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: We're going to move
19 on. Council Member Salamanca.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Alright. Good
21 afternoon everyone. So, um, I just have some very
22 basic maintenance questions about the boilers. Back
23 in October I requested from NYCHA a list of all the
24 capital needs in my district, and I have over 20
25 developments. I have about 80 buildings and I have

1 5,785 units in my Council District alone. In the
2 list of capital needs that they gave me, the-the
3 total was a little over \$700 million. If I want to
4 fix everything in NYCHA in my district, and so in
5 October 2017, I got this capital needs from NYCHA,
6 but boilers were not on the list in terms of capital
7 needs that are needed, and I can forward you that
8 email, Madam Chair. So, my-my question is now that
9 we're going into budget season, is NYCHA, are you
10 directing your staff to work directly with the local
11 Council members so that you can give us an accurate
12 amount, a dollar amount in terms of what's the cost
13 that fits these individual boilers for NYCHA
14 developments that are not on that list of 20 NYCHA
15 developments that need to be fixed?
16

17 SHOLA OLATOYE: So, thank you for your
18 question, and absolutely we will continue to work
19 with Council Members to make sure that they have a
20 number as we have. I know Council Member Espinal
21 actually funded boilers I believe starting last year
22 through capital allocation. So, we absolutely look
23 forward to working to with on that.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Okay, alright.
25 So, I look forward to working to that capital dollar

1 amount so that I can advocate for my NYCHA
2 developments.
3

4 SHOLA OLATOYE: And I believe we had a
5 meeting—we had a meeting—we had a meeting with your
6 office on the 13th to discuss this further.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Okay. We'll
8 see. So, I have about three developments in my
9 district that are in dire need: The Stebbins Avenue-
10 Hewitt Place that went out for weeks without hot water
11 or heat; Morrisania Air Rights and Melrose, no heat
12 and hot water coming in and out, Jackson Houses no
13 hot water coming out, and so the... So address the
14 issue in terms of Morrisania Air Rights. NYCHA
15 proposed to bring in a temporary boiler. How many
16 temporary boilers does—does NYCHA do? Does NYCHA
17 actively have in the City of New York?

18 SHOLA OLATOYE: I'll get you that number
19 in one second.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Yeah, and
21 while they look for that, what's the cost per
22 temporary boiler and what's the cost of a new boiler.

23 SHOLA OLATOYE: Why don't we start with
24 that list? A new boiler is about \$21--\$2.1 million
25 per boiler.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: But that's-
3 that's-those are big NYCHA developments correct?

4 SHOLA OLATOYE: Right, so, um, Jackson
5 for instance is scheduled to be placed through the
6 state appropriation, and that has four boilers.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Okay, so those
8 four boilers are about \$2.1 million.

9 SHOLA OLATOYE: So, \$8.4.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: \$8.4. Okay.

11 SHOLA OLATOYE: Estimated, not assessed.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Okay and these
13 are estimated. There are not exact numbers. I
14 understand and what's the cost of a temporary boiler?

15 SHOLA OLATOYE: We're just getting that
16 number for you.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Alright, while
18 they get that, the cost of temporary boilers and how
19 many temporary boilers do we have in the city of New
20 York that are active right now in NYCHA? Now, in
21 terms of maintenance, how many-how many boiler
22 maintenance workers did you originally have before
23 you made that initial cut of about 100?

24

25

1
2 SHOLA OLATOYE: So, I just want to be
3 clear. We didn't cut our heating plant technician
4 staff. There has been a reduction in our overall-

5 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: So, how much
6 did you reduce that-that division by?

7 SHOLA OLATOYE: Well, I'll give you-I'll
8 defer again to our EVP of Operations who testified
9 earlier to these numbers and can provide you with it
10 again.

11 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: The gentleman
12 that was the counsel, that was just up speaking, can
13 you come back and just let us know your name and
14 exact title for the record?

15 ZACHARY CARTER: Hi, Madam Chairman. I'm
16 Zachary W. Carter. I'm Corporation Counsel for the
17 City of New York.

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Corporation
19 for the City of New York?

20 ZACHARY CARTER: That's right.

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Alright, thank
22 you.

23 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Council Member
24 Salamanca you've raised your question?
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Yes. So, I'm
3 waiting for these answers in terms of temporary
4 boilers and then while they look for that, how many
5 boiler maintenance workers did you have before you
6 phased them out?

7 CATHY PENNINGTON: So, at the end of
8 2017, we had 248 HPTs on staff.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: And then prior
10 to that, how many were there?

11 CATHY PENNINGTON: [interposing] At the
12 end of 2016, we had 267 on staff.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Okay, who—who—
14 who made this decision to reduce the numbers of HPT
15 workers?

16 CATHY PENNINGTON: We-we didn't reduce
17 the number of budgeted HPT workers. It was during
18 the year when the HPTs had been promoted to
19 maintenance worker, there were vacancies created, and
20 so we had to backfill those vacancies, which we are
21 still working to do.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Okay, and so—
23 and I take it that this—these HPT workers in terms of
24 the backfill, you know, the point that I'm trying to
25 get to is that I—these boilers are, in my opinion,

1 you know, I don't think that they were maintained
2 properly. I think, you know, during the summer, you
3 know, you come in and you change the filters, you
4 bleed the lines. You do whatever maintenance is
5 necessary, um, to fix these boilers, and the point
6 that I'm just trying to make here is the
7 mismanagement that there was in terms of NYCHA of
8 properly maintaining these boilers in the warmer
9 months, and now we have what's occurring now where
10 our boilers are not working properly, and so my
11 question is, is there a plan in place after this
12 winter is over so that—that NYCHA can go and maintain
13 all of these boilers during the warm months so that
14 next year, we're not having the same issue and having
15 the same hearing?

17 CATHY PENNINGTON: So, I just want to
18 clarify. You're—you're not speaking about mobile
19 boilers, you're speaking about our plans?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: [interposing]
21 Well, I'm waiting on the answer on our mobile
22 boilers.

23 CATHY PENNINGTON: So, on the—on the
24 mobile boilers, we have mobile boilers at 13 Sandy

1 sites, and 6 other NYCHA sites that are not Sandy
2 Sites.
3

4 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: So, there's 19
5 boilers-temporary boilers out?

6 CATHY PENNINGTON: Let us confirm that
7 number on mobile boilers and get back to you with
8 precision. We appreciate the question, and we'll get
9 back immediately. Just a point of clarification,
10 there's the number of boilers at each site. I was
11 just mentioning the number of sites. So, the number
12 of developments that have none of those.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: So, it's 19
14 developments that have temporary boilers. I'm
15 interested also in how many temporary boilers are
16 actually out there.

17 CATHY PENNINGTON: Right for each site.
18 We can get that for you.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Okay, it's
20 alright, and then my last question is to fill this
21 gap has NYCHA hired a third party contractor to help
22 maintenance these boilers that are down, or is this
23 something that's being done internally?

24 CATHY PENNINGTON: So, our Deputy
25 Director can speak to our Summer Overhaul Program,

1 but we do have a Summer Overhaul Program where every
2 boiler is thoroughly inspected and repaired during
3 the summer months. Additionally, our insurance
4 company also does a thorough inspection of every one
5 of our boilers every year, and we get a written
6 report on the result of those inspections.
7

8 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: So, you have
9 insurance companies doing inspections on these-

10 CATHY PENNINGTON: [interposing] Yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: -- boilers as
12 well?

13 CATHY PENNINGTON: Yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: And they just--
15 I mean how often do they do these inspections and
16 during the summer months?

17 CATHY PENNINGTON: They do them annually.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Okay, and so
19 are you--are you--are you going back to the insurance
20 companies and saying you inspected these boilers and
21 you found nothing wrong with them?

22 CATHY PENNINGTON: They--they report to us
23 whatever deficiencies they find, and then we work
24 from there to make repairs. So, that we do know. We
25 are informed after the inspections.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: So, you have
3 information as to what issue—what are the issues of
4 each boiler--

5 CATHY PENNINGTON: [interposing] Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: --in every
7 NYCHA development?

8 CATHY PENNINGTON: Yes, in addition to
9 our own in-house repair work, and I can have that
10 described in more detail if you'd like, but we have
11 multiple ways that we are assessing and attempting to
12 maintain our ancient inventory of lawyers.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Alright, in
14 terms of the third-party contractors, how many do you
15 have?

16 CATHY PENNINGTON: We have National Grid
17 and at three sites.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Alright thank
19 you. Well, Madam Chair, I look forward to your staff
20 giving me a list of the dollar amounts to address the
21 boilers in my Council District.

22 SHOLA OLATOYE: On the 13th.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Alright, thank
24 you.

CHAIRPERSON TORRES: I have a question for the Corporation Counsel with you. Yes, Corporation Counsel, my understanding is that you're a lawyer for the city of New York, which includes the Mayor's Office, the City Council. NYCHA claims to be an authority within an independent board. So, in what capacity are you here on behalf of the Housing Authority?

ZACHARY CARTER: The, um, the NYCHA or the New York City Housing Authority while not a city agency will from time to time seek legal advice from the Corporation Counsel's Office, and I'm here in that capacity.

CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Okay.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Mr. Carter, why, particularly, why are you here. I'm happy to always see you. I think you're a great lawyer, and you've had a tremendous record of service long before your time as Corporation Counsel. So, I have the utmost respect for you.

ZACHARY CARTER: Thank you.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: But was there a particular reason to be here today? Was there any— was there any flag or any issue that made you think

2 that it was important to be here? I just trying to
3 understand because you typically don't show up to
4 hearings like this, and I want to understand if
5 there's a particular reason.

6 ZACHARY CARTER: it's an important
7 hearing. I don't think that there's a greater reason
8 that there are 400,000 New York City residents living
9 in NYCHA housing.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: With respect, we're not
11 pressing that for the sake of the hearing.

12 ZACHARY CARTER: Excuse me. I'm
13 answering your question.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I know. I'm the
15 Chairperson but you're free to answer the question.

16 ZACHARY CARTER: [off mic] I'm answering
17 you, sir. (sic)

18 SPEAKER JOHNSON: It's my committee.
19 Thank you. You can answer the question.

20 ZACHARY CARTER: I think I've answered
21 it.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: The point the Chair was
23 making was you weren't here for the—the safety
24 hearing. So, we were just wondering. You're always
25 welcome.

2 ZACHARY CARTER: Sure.

3 SPEAKER JOHNSON: You're always welcome
4 in front of this Council. You're always welcome to
5 testify. I have a huge amount of respect for you and
6 your service, and I think you've done a very able job
7 for the city in your role the last four years. Just
8 the question was we were just wondering as an—as an
9 oversight body, it's a special occasion when the
10 Corporation Counsel comes, and so we were wondering
11 why you were here today. If there was any specific
12 focus of the hearing that concerned you that made you
13 think it was important to be here today. That was
14 the real question.

15 ZACHARY CARTER: No, no specific focus.
16 Just the—the—the fact that, um this is an important
17 issue, and an important, an important occasion in
18 which the Chairman and her senior staff are
19 testifying. The Corporation Counsel's advice has
20 been sought on this and other issues by NYCHA during—
21 during this past year, and that's why I'm here.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I understand. Thank
23 you for being here. We appreciate you being here.
24 Thank you.

25

2 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Council Member
3 Ayala.

4 CATHY PENNINGTON: If I could just
5 correct the record on the question of about how many
6 sites we had with National Grid it's actually five.

7 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Five. Okay.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I think that my
9 question is—thank you, Chairs. In moving forward so
10 the Mayor has announced that he's allocated an
11 additional \$200 million in resources to remove old
12 boilers in some of the neediest developments, some of
13 which happen to be in my district Taft and Patterson
14 Houses, which suffered significantly this winter.
15 You testified today that you're working on
16 accelerating some of the permitting issues in order
17 to accelerate some of this work. What does that look
18 like? Are we—we're talking about accelerating it by
19 a week, a month, a year? What does it look like?

20 SHOLA OLATOYE: Thank you for your
21 question. I'll allow our EVP of Capital Projects to
22 respond.

23 DEBORAH GODDARD: I do not want to over-
24 promise. I think we can we can pull our months at
25 different points whether it's DOB or DEB even our

1 board process. So, at this point I do not want to
2 over-promise, but I would be happy to come back and
3 talk with you once I'm working with Vito and City
4 Hall to come up with what we think we can do to
5 expedite.
6

7 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Thank you. I
8 appreciate it.

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Council Member
10 Williams.

11 CHAIRPERSON WILLIAMS: Thank you very
12 much, and thank you for this hearing. Just briefly,
13 on behalf Linden Houses, NYCHA is generally
14 responsive. So, I want to say thank you for that. We
15 did have one building out from the 5th to the 11th
16 with no heat and hot water and one building (coughs)
17 on the 7th. On the 7th to the 11th with no heat until
18 the 11th and they were restored. I just wanted to be
19 on record because I've been to a lot of meetings and
20 hearings on what's happening, and it's tough for me.
21 I have in my hipe of disagreement with Commissioner
22 Kelly, I never asked for him to be removed because I
23 think there's systemic issues that are much larger
24 than any one person. Every time particularly in a
25 few areas whether it's NYCHA or the Police

2 Department, Education, every time there's a problem,
3 we say we need a new person, and I know that it's
4 more systemic than that. It's a huge issue, but I...
5 You know, because I actually believe no matter who is
6 here at this moment in time we probably wouldn't be
7 here having this discussion because of how bad the
8 problems are at NYCHA. So, I'm going to separate
9 that out from what I'm seeing as either malfeasance
10 or nonfeasance when it comes to management, and
11 that's where my problem is, and that's—that's the
12 problem I'm having to wrap around my head because I
13 haven't called for a resignation, but I'm getting
14 very close to doing that. Because it seems that
15 there's—it seems that there's a disrespect between
16 the partnership that I think folks want to have,
17 which his we need to have additional money. But I
18 heard the exchange going back and forth where you
19 refuse to even answer if there was accountability
20 with someone who did something wrong. Now, if you
21 want to have a partnership with us, and we want to
22 try our best to help you do your job, you have to
23 help us do ours. We have a charter mandate to ask
24 these questions. We have a charter mandate to
25 provide oversight. I think it's disrespectful and

1 reprehensible that some of the questions that are
2 being asked won't be answered because we want to
3 assist in making sure that the management is
4 happening properly and Chair Olatoye, I think you've
5 done some—a good job in so many areas, but it's
6 either there's purposeful lying going on or just
7 mistakes in management, and if the latter is what it
8 is, we shouldn't be hiding where those mistakes are,
9 and being a good manager and holding people
10 accountable. Those answers should be forthcoming.
11 So, I have question and do you not want to answer
12 this publicly, this is a conversation we want to have
13 privately, but we can't go on supporting you if
14 you're not going to answer the questions that we
15 have. [applause]

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: So, now, folks, no, no,
18 no clapping. No clapping. Let's keep it—use your
19 hands. Thank you.

20 SHOLA OLATOYE: Thank—thank you for your
21 question, and one, I have always endeavored to be
22 candid probably to a fault about the challenges that
23 face the New York City Housing Authority and we have—
24 we have done that here in this setting. We've done
25 it, you know, privately. I know it would feel good

2 for me to give the name of a person who provided one
3 or two or three facts incorrectly sort of the chain
4 to the executive. I would like to respond, but what
5 I'm saying to you is in preparation particularly for
6 a hearing of this magnitude of any hearing because we
7 take this incredibly seriously as you can tell by the
8 number of people who are here today. There's a lot
9 of information that's gathered. There's a lot of
10 work that's put forward. You hope that it is correct.
11 We recognize that we failed in—in certain instance.
12 This is why we've created our Compliance Department
13 and we'll work to ensure to that information that
14 this body requests is as accurate as we can make it.
15 Am I going back? Have I had the message been
16 communicated? Have protocols been put in place in
17 my—in the organization to ensure that briefings
18 written or verbal are verified? Yes. That's
19 accountability. Have we used this and—and all of our
20 business as an opportunity, as a learning
21 opportunity? Yes. We have a new—this is a natural
22 time in transition in four years. We have a new team
23 that are coming, are coming in, and to the Council—
24 Council Member's point about there are a lot of
25 people who were not here four years ago. So, we are

2 bringing in new people. We have some people who have
3 been here for four years. We have some people who
4 have served the city for 30 plus years whose
5 experience we look to leverage and-and bring in. So,
6 that is part of continuous improvement. I know that
7 you want that simple answer, and I want you to hear
8 my respect by not only sitting here, but endeavoring
9 to be as forthright-excuse me-forthright as I can
10 about the information that I know, and my job is to
11 make sure that I have put in place those checks and
12 balances to ensure that information is accurate so
13 that you can do your chartered-your charter mandated
14 responsibilities.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you. I
16 know my time is up. If I can just close, Mr. and
17 Mrs. Chair. I just want to be clear. We're here
18 because there has been a series of misinformation
19 provided to the federal government, which might be
20 illegal. There's information that was misinformation
21 provided to the City Council, which borders on I
22 think in reality based on being under oath.
23 Misinformation given to the public. People not
24 having heat and hot water. That's how we got here.
25 We're not here because NYCHA said they wanted to come

2 and provide helpful information. There's a series
3 of-of things that happened. Some of it I'm not even
4 sure I actually wanted it to come to light, but it
5 did, and so that's how we got here. And now, that
6 we're here, what I'm saying is-and I hear the answer
7 to your-I heard what you just answered, but we have a
8 right to ask whether there has been accountability.
9 They even lightened the questions so you don't even
10 have to say whether or not if the person-who the
11 person is. But we do have a right to ask what that
12 accountability is and how it's going to be moving
13 forward. Because right now, I don't trust what comes
14 out of NYCHA, and if I don't trust what comes out of
15 NYCHA, it's hard for me to tell my residents and my-
16 my-constituents to trust what comes out of NYCHA.
17 I want to gain that trust again, and I want to gain
18 trust in you as the head. That is hard to do that,
19 if there is just a refusal to have this conversation
20 a little bit more public particularly around
21 accountability, particularly when you've given wrong
22 information to this committee in the-in the past.
23 So, I'm just saying please keep that in mind when
24 these questions are being asked. If there's
25 something you'd rather have with the chairs in

2 private, say that, but to say that you're not going
3 to give this information that we have a right to
4 know, makes it very hard to keep supporting you and
5 so please bear that in mind. When it comes to the
6 money we have a huge problem. I hope the State is
7 listening. I hope Governor Cuomo is listening
8 because the city is going to have a difficult time
9 bearing this by themselves. We're not going to get
10 it from the Orange Man, so we have to buckle up, and
11 I hope everybody is paying attention. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you.
13 Council Member Gjonaj

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: I want to thank
15 the Speaker and the Co-Chairs. Today has been quite
16 a bit of an eye-opener led down the path of going
17 back to this accountability, and what I learned today
18 is there is no accountability or responsibility. I
19 sympathize with the tenants and NYCHA residents, but
20 when they hear explanations of how the person feels
21 bad, made a mistake, didn't understand the exact
22 question. When children can be subjected to ill
23 reparable damage, when families are suffering to the
24 degree that there is, no one is going to be held
25 accountable or responsible for their action or

2 inaction, it is not only alarming, it is beyond
3 disappointment for me as an individual and a resident
4 of this body and Council Member of this body. My
5 question to you is going—is along the lines of
6 operating costs. I believe it's \$3.4 billion is the
7 operating costs for 2018. [bell]

8 SHOLA OLATOYE: Perhaps.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: That equates to
10 about \$19,000 per unit--

11 SHOLA OLATOYE: Correct.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: --and it's
13 steadily been increasing year over year during the
14 tenure.

15 SHOLA OLATOYE: I'm sorry.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Those operating
17 costs have been steadily increasing.

18 SHOLA OLATOYE: The costs to operate
19 them. Yes.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: With a \$25
21 billion capital investment that's needed.

22 SHOLA OLATOYE: Estimated.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Estimated to be
24 approximately \$140,000 per unit.

25 SHOLA OLATOYE: It's here now? (sic)

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Just about.
3 You're the higher and I would imagine close enough.
4 Those operating costs do not include real estate
5 taxes and water and sewer rates correct? NYCHA is
6 not subject to--

7 SHOLA OLATOYE: They do include water so-
8 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: But not real
9 estate taxes.

10 SHOLA OLATOYE: Correct. That was--were
11 given under this administration in 2014.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Roughly that--?

13 SHOLA OLATOYE: About \$40 million a year.
14 It was both the--it was the PILOT payment and that has
15 been forgiven now.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: I'm sorry. Repeat
17 that one more time, please.

18 SHOLA OLATOYE: The PILOT, Payment in
19 Lieu of Taxes was what the Housing Authority was
20 subjected to for many, many years prior to this
21 administration. The--Mayor de Blasio essentially
22 waived that fee, um, for what is the city's largest
23 affordable housing provider.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Okay. The
25 industry standard of operating costs per unit

1 citywide I believe is in the neighborhood of \$9,000 a
2 year.
3

4 SHOLA OLATOYE: Uh-hm.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: You believe it to
6 be the same number?

7 SHOLA OLATOYE: That's the same number.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: So, this is--

9 SHOLA OLATOYE: [interposing] Yeah, that
10 is, but that's sounds right.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: So, roughly your
12 operating costs are more than 200%--

13 SHOLA OLATOYE: [interposing] Uh-hm.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: --of an average
15 apartment maintenance in New York City, which has
16 been--and rent collections for the year ending 2017,
17 what percentage of your rents were you successfully
18 in collecting rent and fees?

19 SHOLA OLATOYE: Approx--and I just--just
20 want to note that we also run the country's largest
21 Section 8 programs. So that's included in that \$3.2
22 billion, right that's--that's so it was two--about
23 90,000 households that receive Section 8 assistance
24 for--through the Housing Authority. So, in totality
25 that \$3.2 billion is public housing and Section 8.

1 Just to be clear and a billion of that dollars just
2 go in direction payments to Section 8 owners.
3

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: What is the total
5 percentage wise of permitable collections year over
6 year?

7 SHOLA OLATOYE: So, now that's a rent
8 collection.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Yes.

10 SHOLA OLATOYE: I'll have to get the most
11 recent numbers. We measure that on a monthly basis.
12 We'll come back to you with the exact number.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Yes, we spoke--

14 SHOLA OLATOYE: [interposing] But it's
15 low.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: It's low?

17 SHOLA OLATOYE: Yes.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: So, you're
19 spending twice as much as the average property
20 manager to do less than standards, substandard work
21 and services. You're collecting low collections of
22 rent. So, the question is why would they give you
23 more money to--to mis-spend?
24
25

1
2 SHOLA OLATOYE: Thank you for the
3 question. I appreciate it, and I know—I believe you
4 know property management well--

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: [interposing]
6 Yeah.

7 SHOLA OLATOYE: In fact, we talked about
8 that in the past. Those are the numbers, and there
9 are many reasons—there are many inputs into those
10 numbers. Um, what we have done over the course of
11 the last four years is actually bring the operating
12 costs down, centrally—central office costs down,
13 which is a very explicit strategy outlined in Next
14 Generation NYCHA. We recognized that central office
15 costs were too high. So, we've painfully begun to
16 cut costs there, and push the savings out to the
17 front line. Last year we were able to hire
18 approximately 200 new caretakers and maintenance
19 workers as a result of those savings. So, there is
20 absolutely an imbalance in costs. I am not going to
21 apply it. I'm not going to, you know, sit here—you
22 have the numbers, and there are some real obstacles
23 to that. Or we have fixed labor costs. We have an
24 aging portfolio. As you heard earlier in terms of
25 some of the challenges in bringing people on, and—and

1 our ability to bring people on. And so these are the
2 realities that we are managing with.
3

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: But yet year over
5 year you're operating costs continue to increase, and
6 you provide less service to NYCHA residents. So, the
7 question again is why would we entrust you with
8 additional money so it will be misspent?

9 SHOLA OLATOYE: I think it's important to
10 note that we have also balanced the budget for the
11 last two years. That has been—the—the Authority had
12 not historically balanced its operating budget in
13 many—in many years. That has changed under this
14 administration. There's been a proven record that
15 we've been able to make hard choices with regard to
16 some of the financial challenges that we face. Do we
17 have a lot more work to do? Absolutely. We also
18 have a Capital Program that is being deployed in a
19 way now it's actually getting more work done. This
20 is a turnaround effort. We never said that it was
21 going to be overnight, and I just—one point in
22 particular is when we started, it took a very—almost
23 13 to 14 days for basic maintenance at the Housing
24 Authority. That's now down to between 5 and 7 days.
25 So, there has been improvement on some basic issues.

2 We remain challenged for sure on some of the more
3 complex and trade-trade areas.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: You have yet to
5 explain why it cost you 200% more than it does a
6 private owner, and the accomplishments and the long
7 way we have to go in itself is not the explanation.
8 If private industry can do it for a fraction of what
9 you're doing it for and much better and be held to a
10 higher standard, why are we going to entrust you with
11 more money when there's no one accountable or
12 responsible?

13 SHOLA OLATOYE: Well, I would disagree
14 that there's no one being held accountable. I've been
15 sitting here trying to answer the questions, but
16 first I would also say I very clear. I believe that
17 there are some fixed costs that we are unable to-to
18 manage. We have a staff that is represented. We
19 have a staff whose-whose rates are represented and
20 are-are negotiated outside of the NYCHA, you know,
21 without really NYCHA's sort of direction. They're at
22 a cost premium to the Authority that our fixed and
23 those are realities that we're managing with. We
24 have-we worked very closely with our colleagues to
25 make sure that we are protecting the men and women

1 who are currently at the Authority, but those are
2 real costs that are there, and I look forward to any
3 ideas that you have about how to reduce those costs.
4

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Do you believe
6 you should be held to the same standard as private
7 industry?

8 SHOLA OLATOYE: I believe that our
9 residents deserve to have a safe and clean and decent
10 place to live. So, the answer is yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: So, they should
12 live in the same comfort conditions and be protected
13 by the same rights and privileges as any other New
14 York City tenant.

15 SHOLA OLATOYE: And, in fact, NYCHA and
16 public housing residents have even more rights than-
17 than privately residents in privately owned buildings
18 as per the-as per HUD.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: No, they don't
20 because if they did, they'd get rent reductions.
21 They would-they would be subject to a 24-hour live-in
22 super. They would get immediate repairs done. If
23 not, emergency repairs would step in. There would be
24 reimbursement for unforeseen financial burdens placed
25 on them when the gas is turned off for months at a

2 time, where their refrigerator is not working, their
3 stove is not working so they can cook and provide for
4 their families. They would be—they would be
5 reimbursed for those expenses. So, your—our NYCHA
6 residents are not treated equally or on the same
7 footing or standard as other New York City residents.
8 [applause] But for—with that, I just want to say I
9 think it's evident that eventually we'll get to the
10 explanation of this is unsustainable in its current
11 trends, and probably privatizing the management of
12 NYCHA is the only solution. It is just how much more
13 good money are we going to throw after bad money
14 before we get there, and with NYCHA real estate
15 management. Not NYCHA privatizing. There's a big
16 difference.

17 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: We're going to move
18 on.

19 SHOLA OLATOYE: Interesting.

20 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
21 down, please. Keep it down.

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you,
23 Council Member.

24 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Good question. You—
25 you pointed out that NYCHA has been able to achieve a

1 surplus. How much in op-how many-how much in
2 operating funds have you received from the
3 administration over the last four years?
4

5 SHOLA OLATOYE: The administration, which
6 administration, sir?

7 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: The administration
8 to which you report.

9 SHOLA OLATOYE: But you must be clear.
10 The Federal Administration we're in a federal agency.
11 So, we primarily received capital dollars from-from
12 the City of New York. There's nothing on the
13 operating side-various, there are some dollars in the
14 operating sense. Primarily they have been capital or
15 nothing.(sic)

16 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Because I have a
17 press release from the Mayor's office announcing the
18 \$200 million to replace the boilers and upgrade the
19 heating systems of 29 NYCHA developments. It said in
20 the actual press release: Part of the Mayor's
21 unprecedented investment in NYCHA including \$2.1
22 billion in capital infrastructure and \$1.6 billion in
23 operating funds. Are you familiar with that \$1.68
24 billion operating investment from the City of New
25 York?

2 SHOLA OLATOYE: I would like to
3 understand a little bit more about those dollars.
4 There are some dollars that we are due that we have
5 not received that would be operating funds. So, for
6 example the--the funds that accompany the families who
7 accessing shelter. Those are operating funds. I'm
8 not really--

9 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] But
10 you don't know where this number comes from?

11 SHOLA OLATOYE: I don't know the
12 document, that document.

13 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, I take it that
14 the Mayor's Office did not get this number from that,
15 this \$1.6 million

16 SHOLA OLATOYE: I'm not saying that. I
17 just want to be very clear and precise in my response
18 since I know that is important to you in this--

19 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] Oh,
20 it's very important.

21 SHOLA OLATOYE: Absolutely.

22 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Very important.
23 Who's our next person? Who's our next speaker?
24 Council Member Miller. Thank you. Council Member
25 Chin. I apologize.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Chair.

3 You know, I have 10,000 residents in public housing
4 in my district and I was a little bit disappointed
5 when I found out that none of my development was in
6 the 20 that's going to be getting new boilers
7 especially as la Guardia Houses. The residents
8 they're really suffering during this winter season,
9 and it started right after Thanksgiving. So, it's
10 been more than a month where they were like getting
11 hot water outage constantly. I know that Vito
12 visited the complex, and we've been working with the
13 residents, and my office found out about it through a
14 residents meeting. But there were not notices, and I
15 brought that to this path because even simple notices
16 in multiple language in the development just to let
17 people know that their problem with the boilers and
18 there's no heat and hot water we'll work on it, I
19 thin that makes a big difference because you talk
20 about setting our robocalls. I don't know if you
21 have robocalls or in multiple languages because not
22 everybody now has a land line or even if they don't,
23 if they have it, they may not understand it was only
24 English. So, I hope that when you do send out
25 robocalls, that it's in the language that the

2 residents understands, but just basic simple posting,
3 and letting the resident know that it's a boiler
4 problem, that's why there's no heat and hot water,
5 and you're fixing it, you're on it. And then the-the
6 issue that my colleague has raised is something that
7 my residents has faced, too, is that the problem
8 hasn't been resolved and then their-their ticket is
9 closed. So, I think that is something that NYCHA
10 really has to work on. How to make sure that
11 residents are getting the heat and hot water fixed.
12 And in our situation, we were working over the
13 weekend. Brian was getting my calls, and I was happy
14 that NYCHA gave us staff persons' numbers, cell phone
15 numbers of the weekend that we can call, and we
16 actually asked NYCHA to go visit the apartments that
17 we gave them to check to see if the heat and the hot
18 water is back on. And that was helpful because we in
19 one development we had a new born baby, and the
20 parents was telling us that if they knew that it's
21 going to take a certain amount of time to fix the-the
22 problem with the heat and hot water, the could have
23 rented as well as this house. So, I think getting
24 the information to the residents is so important.
25 Just simple postings, right, and let them know so the

1 residents can work with you, and the--the complaint
2 number I think that is something that I wish, you
3 know, the police work on that. Because that is
4 something that residents are telling us that.
5 Calling that number is not that efficient. So, I
6 really wanted to raise the issue about really looking
7 at decentralizing again because within each
8 development, you have a management office, you have a
9 manager. You have a housing assistant there. If
10 they are aware of the problem and they can get right
11 on it. So, really go back to really focusing on each
12 development, and my one last question is that on
13 your--your housing--I mean it's the heat personnel,
14 HPD, right. I know that you said that some group got
15 promoted. So, you have like 143 less. So, they got
16 promoted to maintenance. So, how do we--can we keep
17 these people who are experienced, right, and now
18 they're promoted to a higher level. They're
19 maintenance. Well, taking care of a boiler is
20 maintenance, too. So, it's impossible to also have
21 them do some of their jobs of maintaining the boiler.
22 Because one of the situations that in La Guardia the
23 boiler was fixed but it was the right-- with the
24 distribution system that was the problem that it
25

2 wasn't getting the heat to the individual apartment.
3 So, I think looking at personnel that's why I just
4 couldn't wrap around my head like these are
5 experienced people. They've been there for three
6 years, and now they have an opportunity to get
7 promoted to maintenance. So, why not. They can
8 continue to have some responsibility in terms of
9 taking care of the boiler, and if it's a union issue,
10 let's talk to the union about it, but it doesn't make
11 sense to lose the experience and then you don't have
12 enough staff to take care of the—of the boiler
13 situation. So, I think that's something that I would
14 like you to look at, and also from my district, I
15 would really like to have an assessment in terms of
16 the boiler situation in each of my eight
17 developments, and let's see if there are ways that
18 individual council members that we want to be helpful
19 in our capital dollar whether we can help solve a
20 problem in the development that we have.

21 SHOLA OLATOYE: If I—if I may. Thank you
22 for your—thank you for your question, Council Member,
23 and I want to have the team respond. I do want to
24 just go back to something that Chair Torres said in
25 terms of the expense dollars. The—the expense money

1 while not direct, it was the forgiveness of the
2
3 PILOT. It was the, um, forgiveness of the NYPD--

4 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] NYPD
5 and PILOT?

6 SHOLA OLATOYE: So that's about \$100
7 million a year in—in operating dollars that remained
8 in the New York City Housing Authority. So, just to
9 be clear in terms of just—

10 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] Okay.

11 SHOLA OLATOYE: --being responsive to
12 that. Thank you, and now in response to the Council
13 Member Chin's question. So, we're happy to give you
14 a full report and get them so soon. I do want to
15 point out that we prioritize boilers with the state
16 money that we hope to get. That was forbade last
17 year. Smith Houses is on that list, and La Guardia
18 is right below the cut-off. So, we are looking at
19 how to get down to the next level of boilers.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Let's talk about
21 that because I think La Guardia had a lot more
22 problems. Smith Houses is great, but they are—I
23 think some of the boilers could have been damaged by
24 Sandy because they were—they had some damages there.
25 So, we just want to work with you to make sure that

2 our residents, you know, get the heat and hot water
3 that they deserve because public housing is the real
4 affordable housing that we have in the city, and we
5 have to do everything we can to preserve these
6 affordable housing in our city. So, Vito, I'm glad
7 you're there on board, and I will look forward to
8 working with you to make sure that we improve the
9 conditions there?

10 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Thank you, [coughs]
11 and—and Councilwoman, I think, you know, again I've
12 heard over and over again the same message and it's
13 about open communication, and just for the record I
14 have three and a half decades of public service, and
15 I think that—that where I am today stands on open
16 communications. I think I have had an open and
17 honest relationship with every one of you that will
18 continue. I certainly agree with you that we can do
19 better in opening up the laws of communication
20 between the NYCHA staff and the residents. I was
21 with Council Member Menchaca in Red Hook, and one
22 observation that I made and this is true of La
23 Guardia and the other complexes. It's pretty simple
24 with two handset phone. Right, when a resident walks
25 into the office, right, they can get a translator on

1 the phone. There's privacy because each the resident
2 and the worker are on separate phones—phones, and so
3 it's opening up lines of communication. You've
4 passed legislation that requires notices be posted,
5 right, and so I certainly want to bring a lot of the
6 experience that I have in dealing with the private
7 sector, and hoping to make some improvements again to
8 an existing system that already is in place.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you because I
11 think today I mean one thing that was really shocking
12 that I've heard is that 80% of the units had some
13 experience, you know, heat and hot water outage.
14 That's a huge number and that has really sent a
15 strong message that we've got to do something about
16 that. I, you know, I—even with all my developments
17 in the district La Guardia was really bad this winter
18 but, you know, we have an outage here and there, but
19 to really hear about 80% that is something that we
20 really need to focus on. Thank you and thank you,
21 Chair.

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, just a
23 point to that. I know we mentioned just something
24 that we need to focus on, but I want to know about
25 right now. It's cold outside. It's going to be cold

2 tonight and tomorrow. How many apartments are
3 without heat right now?

4 SHOLA OLATOYE: So the report I have is
5 the 9:00 a.m. Report. There will be another report
6 out in a couple of hours. There were three
7 properties that did not have heat, which was Webster,
8 Saint Mary's and Armstrong II. They may have been
9 restored since this report came out, and there is one
10 property without out hot water, Queens Bridge South.

11 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, I just
12 received a text message that Tilden is without heat
13 and hot water right now, and this is—is they're going
14 through a test, and management does not know when the
15 problem will be fixed, and they're waiting on
16 National Grid to show up now. You didn't mention
17 that development. So, can you tell me what's
18 happening there? Because they don't have heat or hot
19 water right now.

20 SHOLA OLATOYE: I'll have the staff look
21 into it. That's one of our contractors, National
22 Grid.

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay. So, you
24 provided to the committee that over 20% of the
25 outages for this heating season does not show a

2 completion or it does not have a resolved date. Does
3 this mean that the problem still continues or that it
4 just was not flagged in your database that it's
5 actually been completed?

6 SHOLA OLATOYE: I'm not sure—quite sure I
7 understand the question. What's the 20%?

8 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, we
9 received notice that 20% of the outages for this
10 heating season do not show up a completion or a
11 resolved date within your database. So, does this
12 mean that the outages are still continuing?

13 SHOLA OLATOYE: I'd have to look into
14 that. That doesn't sound correct. So, we'd have to—
15 I don't know what you're looking at. If you're
16 looking at the data that was sent to you. I—I can't
17 speak to that, but I—I—we can pull a report and say
18 how many individual units have no heat and for how
19 long but we're restoring in less than 24 hours. So,
20 I can't imagine that these would be days old, but I'd
21 have to look at it.

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, there's a
23 problem either with the recordkeeping or the
24 information that we have been provided.

2 SHOLA OLATOYE: Again, I'm not sure
3 exactly how the City Council staff are looking at it.
4 We could look at it together, but--

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, okay,
6 thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: But how often do you
8 receive reports? You said the last report you
9 received was from 9:00 a.m. You received one. How
10 frequently do you receive them?

11 SHOLA OLATOYE: Well, we can—we can pull
12 data all along—all day long. You know, we publish
13 reports for routing purposes just as alerts to the
14 staff about, you know, 9:00 in the morning and I
15 think at 5:00 and we route a consolidated report.

16 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, you receive two
17 reports a day like your network?

18 SHOLA OLATOYE: Yes. Seven days a week.

19 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Do you feel
20 like you should receive more frequent reports?

21 SHOLA OLATOYE: Well, in addition to
22 these reports, management also gets individual unit
23 reports, with—with actual unit counts. Every morning
24 I get a report that's even more detailed than the
25 summary level. So, there's a lot of reporting. I'm

2 trying to focus on look at the data quickly, and then
3 deploy. You know, we have to keep everything moving,
4 but we have lots of data.

5 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: And I have a quick
6 follow-up of my surplus questions. So, the
7 administration said that it's providing NYCHA with
8 \$1.6 billion in operating subsidy. Without the
9 operating subsidy from the city, would NYCHA have
10 been able to close its deficit?

11 SHOLA OLATOYE: It certainly has helped,
12 and, um, it's hard to disapprove a double negative
13 because there were other things that were going on at
14 the same time. There's no question of having a \$100
15 million extra in our budget. It has absolutely
16 contributed to our ability to--and when we say
17 surplus, small amounts of--of that we've been able to
18 reprogram back into our operation.

19 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Well, you can
20 certainly project what the surplus or deficit would
21 have been in the absence--

22 SHOLA OLATOYE: [interposing] In the
23 absence of that.

24 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: --of city operating
25 support. So, what I'm asking--because I want to know

1 what's driving the surplus? Is it more efficient
2 management or is it more operating support from the
3 city? I believe it's more operating support from the
4 city. I'm curious to know what your opinion is.

5
6 SHOLA OLATOYE: Well, one, I think there
7 are—and we can provide you with information on this,
8 but to be precise, we do have an analysis that shows
9 sort of with--without Next Gen and with Next Gen kind
10 of where we would be.

11 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Well, the Next Gen
12 includes operating support by the city.

13 SHOLA OLATOYE: My point being exactly,
14 we can operate--

15 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] I want
16 to separate, but I think it's important. There's a
17 difference between generating efficient—generating a
18 surplus based on a greater efficiency within the
19 agency because that indicates an improvement in the
20 management structure and the day-to-day operations
21 versus just receiving more money from the city
22 government while you have the same dysfunction of
23 bureaucracy. Those are two different things in my
24 mind.

1 SHOLA OLATOYE: Well, I want to be
2 precise in my response to you.

3 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Okay.

4 SHOLA OLATOYE: So, I'd be happy to--

5 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] I look
6 forward to a precise answer.

7 SHOLA OLATOYE: If I may clarify, we did
8 get a report on Tilden, and I want to correct the
9 record. I misstated and said that it was under
10 private contract with National Grid. That's
11 incorrect, but we do have a report on Tilden. We are
12 aware of it status and responded.

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, and do
14 that, how many tenants live in the--in the buildings
15 that you mentioned from the other developments that
16 are without heat right now?

17 SHOLA OLATOYE: With both no heat and no
18 hot water that would be 3,641. Again, these may have
19 been restored. I don't have my restoration report
20 with me, but I'm hopeful that, you know, service was
21 restored. We get, um, immediate updates through our
22 emergency service department throughout the day. To
23 an earlier question, we get updates as these plants
24 are brought back online.
25

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, thank
3 you. We have been joined by Council Member Barron,
4 and next, we'll hear from Council Member Miller.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Madam
6 Chair, Mr. Speaker and Mr. Chair. I'm dreaming and
7 reading the testimony we talked about, I saw
8 something about the procurement of additional
9 boilers, but it wasn't much detail, and then in
10 testimony you had second testified-mentioned or
11 alluded to the maintenance of those boilers. Could
12 you speak-could you speak to that, and is it and it
13 is my assumption that it is going to be a private
14 group that is going to be maintaining those
15 buildings. Is that the fact, and can you speak to
16 that?

17 SHOLA OLATOYE: So, thank you for asking
18 Council Member Miller. So, you're-you're asking how
19 are we resourcing our heating?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: How do you intend
21 to maintain the new boilers to be?

22 SHOLA OLATOYE: [interposing] Right, and
23 so there are a couple of different strategies that
24 are underway, and I'm happy to have my staff talk
25 about that. So, one is the-our working with third-

1 party managers to operate, and this is currently on
2 the street and then open--

3
4 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: [interposing]
5 What does that mean, third-party managers?

6 SHOLA OLATOYE: Private industry to
7 manage about 69 or so approximate developments. We
8 already have I believe four or five developments that
9 are managed by National Grid already that's existing.
10 This will allow us to bring down the number of
11 boilers that our staff are currently responsible for
12 while not displacing or laying off any of our staff,
13 really concentrating them on those more challenging
14 boilers, working with our colleagues at 237 and
15 beyond around training the remaining staff to support
16 those many operations.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So-so these
18 private maintainers would that be by virtue of
19 procurement contract, or are these boilers under
20 contract and that means that the unionized laborers
21 who are NYCHA employees are not--they're touching for
22 the next three years, five years as long as they're
23 under warranty?

24 SHOLA OLATOYE: Well, it's an open
25 procurement right now as we speak, and it will mean

2 that they will be operated and serviced by a third
3 party. That is correct, sir.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Are they being
5 operated because the warranty forbids anyone from-
6 from operating those boilers?

7 SHOLA OLATOYE: No.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Then, I am not
9 understanding why the current trained technicians or
10 others who could be elevated to that status or not
11 maintaining them, why are we bringing in another
12 workforce.

13 SHOLA OLATOYE: We are--[background
14 comments]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So, please.
16 You're going to get a chance, and then I just want to
17 say for the record that I've had the opportunity to
18 work with just about everyone on this that has
19 testified here today. It's really been a pleasure in
20 doing so. You had some hardworking public servants
21 there, and--and that relationships are important, and
22 you cannot afford relationships in a moment of
23 crisis, and it seems like NYCHA is always in a moment
24 of crisis, right? That we have yet to have a
25 conversation about the state of good repair or will

1 we get there. I have—I happen to be one that has no
2 NYCHA developments—developments in the district.
3 Actually, I have a senior location that has its
4 problems as well, but I do having—having grown up in
5 NYCHA have this affinity for it, and I know that it
6 has real value, but we're not getting there. How—how
7 do we get to that value? And, I want to say this:
8 If there were 237 or any other represented employee
9 that were responsible for the mishap that occurred
10 that caused hundreds of thousands of people to be
11 without heat or hot water, there would be
12 consequences, and within those consequences whether
13 it was discipline or progressive discipline, don't do
14 it again, something would occur. There has to be
15 something equitable within management, upper
16 management, main management. So, to say that you
17 can't say, or you mentioned. No one is asking for
18 names or whatever, that is absolute disingenuous,
19 and—and it really undermines this relationship that
20 we all have developed here because everyone has to be
21 treated equally, and the person that was working on
22 the boilers, they messed it up, they would be
23 accountable. So, we expect the same at every level,
24 and—and I want to thank you for the work. I want to
25

1 thank the chairs and—and the Speaker for putting this
2 hearing together because it's just so much work to
3 do. Literally, it just leads to the state of
4 disrepair—disrepair. NYCHA is—and—and this—it—it—it
5 undermines the value of—of working families that
6 people should not walk into these buildings and—and
7 see what they see. It's—it's disgusting, and we
8 can't even get to talking about basic maintenance
9 because we have these problems all the time. I would
10 love to see the day that when we get there. Also,
11 just in—in closing, I'd like to see the numbers of
12 funding contributions that come from the city, the
13 state and the federal government in relation to
14 capital projects as well as operating expenses.

16 SHOLA OLATOYE: Sure.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Council Member
19 Menchaca.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you to—to
21 our Speaker and our chairs for this incredible
22 enlightening hearing. So, look, a lot has been
23 discussed today, and I want to thank you for your—for
24 your time and patience, and really I'm referring to
25 our community here that has been waiting to be heard,

1 and so thank you for staying here. I want to talk a
2 little bit about that first panel, and I don't want
3 it to go—I don't want to kind of leave and—and—and
4 bring it back as an echo in how we're thinking about
5 what's going on. You heard from a lot of leaders,
6 and resident leadership about what is needed. There
7 are things that I don't want to forget about, and I
8 want to get a clear answer now about developing this
9 resident-led oversight council. That idea is strong,
10 and I've heard it over and over again, that can help
11 amplify the work at the City Council that is really
12 led by members of the community. And so I'm kind of—
13 I'm wondering if you can appoint a person that we can
14 follow up with on this idea and take that further.

15
16 SHOLA OLATOYE: Sure.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Yeah. Is there
18 a person you can give us right now that we can follow
19 up with?

20 SHOLA OLATOYE: The person who--?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: That can help
22 us take this idea next?

23 SHOLA OLATOYE: Well, one I'd be
24 interested in the idea, and would like to learn more,
25 Sideya Sherman who's our EVP for Community—and

2 Community Engagement and Programs would be the person
3 and point person to-to discuss further.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Wonderful. So,
5 we'll follow up with them on that. There's a real
6 pop power to the participatory process that I think
7 residents that understand their-their everyday life
8 can really bring to the system. We've heard from
9 them about wanting to have the power to close the
10 tickets. We want to bring that into-into light, and
11 that has been something that has been done in the
12 past I believe. You can actually correct me if I'm
13 wrong, if that's never been done before, and whether
14 or not this would be a new idea on allowing residents
15 to close their own tickets if they see that the
16 problem has-has been solved? Is that a new idea or
17 has that been something that-that NYCHA has done in
18 the past?

19 SIDEYA SHERMAN: I-I-I think, well, in
20 today's technology, that would be a new idea, but
21 it's certainly something we can take a look at. We-
22 we are able to ask tenants to sign when, you know,
23 we've completed a repair at a unit. So, that's-that
24 is built in, but I think you're talking about when
25 something is incomplete or particularly related to

2 heat. So, yes, I think we need to improve some ways
3 to do that, and there have been several suggestions I
4 think that are worthy of us exploring.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And anything
6 that will come out of the Council and the work that-
7 that residents can kind of give us as a term-as a-as
8 a way to think about how-how to bring them into-into
9 the picture. I want to thank Council Member Chin for
10 bringing up the language access issues, and I know
11 Vito and I can get some-some in-depth conversations
12 on the ground. So, we'll follow up with how we can
13 bring that infrastructure. Some of that is-is
14 already known in our-in our other city agencies that
15 only you, but something that people are familiar
16 with, and then finally, the pipeline issue was
17 something that I-I heard loud and clear about how
18 entry level members of-of the community, NYCHA some
19 addressing our Section 3 work that we have to do to
20 hire local NYCHA residents. But just to clarify for
21 me because I want to follow up with-with the chairs
22 on this as well is, is there a real sense of
23 understanding that you have right now about entry
24 level, and I didn't get a sense about grounds-its
25 grounds keeper-

2 SHOLA OLATOYE: Do you mean the Heating
3 Plant Technician?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Well, so,
5 that's in the middle. That's not the beginning,
6 right? So, we're moving people up the ladder. Can
7 you give us a sense about the--the work title, the
8 salary and then move it all the way up because
9 there's been a discrepancy that the community has
10 told me that maintenance is after the HPTs and their
11 salary might not be higher, and their--the level is
12 actually a demotion and not a promotion, and so
13 that's--that's something that I keep on hearing
14 through text messages. So, just help clarify that
15 for us because that's something we want to follow up
16 with as well.

17 SHOLA OLATOYE: Okay.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Can you walk us
19 through the process, and--

20 SHOLA OLATOYE: Sideya Sherman can
21 answer about the HPT question.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: [interposing]
23 the job titles and the salaries as we move up. Just
24 so we can clarify for everyone what--what you're
25 actually talking about.

1
2 SIDEYA SHERMAN: Okay, so the HPT is a
3 job title that moves up into Maintenance Worker or
4 Assistant Resident Building Superintendent. It
5 doesn't have to. It's just that those are paths that
6 a person can choose to take. They choose to take
7 whichever exam they feel like they want to take.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: The community
9 feels like it's a demotion. Can you tell us what the
10 salaries are for those—those jobs?

11 SIDEYA SHERMAN: So, the HPD, the—so
12 these are salary ranges. The range is between
13 \$30,662 per year to \$50,379 per year, and the
14 Maintenance Worker, the new hire rate is \$57,587 per
15 year and the—the incumbent rate, which is, you know,
16 after you've been there is \$60,552 per year.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And is that all
18 you have on salary ranges?

19 SIDEYA SHERMAN: That's all I have right
20 now.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Okay. So, we'll
22 follow up on how that is, but we're hearing from
23 community members that—that the maintenance level is
24 actually a demotion, and that's a concern for us I
25 think as we think about how this pipeline is not only

2 broken as I think the chairs and the Speaker kind of
3 really kind of drill down about how we're losing the
4 opportunity to build a system that can actually
5 respond to community needs, and our boiler situation.
6 Thank you for your time.

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: I just want to
8 go back quickly to the question that I asked before
9 about the outages and the percentages. We received a
10 list on Thursday from the--from your database that you
11 sent us that had a column listing the actual finish
12 date. So, my question is from that column that
13 stated the actual finish date, 20% of those
14 developments were not--there was no completion date,
15 and so my question is, have those developments
16 actually gone down the line.

17 SHOLA OLATOYE: I do--

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [interposing]
19 I don't know. Do you have the list in front of you?

20 SHOLA OLATOYE: I don't. I don't know
21 what you're looking at. So, I appreciate the
22 question, and I want to be responsive to you, and
23 well, she stepped out. So, we will spot these and we
24 will absolutely follow up, and we'll give you a
25 clear-clarity on that particular answer.

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay.

3 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I-I have some--just a
4 couple of questions as well. So, I see, Madam Chair,
5 that I'm glad you brought it. It's actually very
6 helpful. The current heating system and placement
7 schedule. So, it's--I think it's important to give
8 context to folks so they understand, and I'm glad you
9 brought all of these slides today to tell the story
10 that you can't just snap your fingers and a boiler is
11 replaced. There's a process. There are laws that
12 are in place. There are procurement issues, and it's
13 important for the public and for NYCHA residents to
14 understand that. So, I'm really grateful that you
15 did this. So, the scoping and design one year.

16 (coughs) Procurement 4 to 6 months, construction and
17 commissioning 2 to 3-1/2 years. It seems like a long
18 time, but I don't know when they start that. (sic)

19 So, the total timeline for each major boiler
20 replacement is somewhere between 3-1/2 and 5 years.
21 So, when two weeks ago the Administration announced
22 over \$200 million for the boilers that you outlined
23 in your testimony today, and that's been reported in
24 the news, which is going to cover 46,000 residents,
25 10%--above 10% of NYCHA residents. We, of course,

2 have been pushing saying we can't wait four winters
3 to have these boilers replaced, and you've agreed
4 with that, that you want to get this done as quickly
5 as possible. I have a question for you: When Sandy
6 happened and the boilers were not in Coney Island and
7 Red Hook and the Lower Eastside and other places,
8 there was a declaration of emergency that was issued,
9 which didn't fix everything because you had to have
10 temporary boilers and FEMA was involved and other
11 agencies, but if the State gave us a temporary
12 declaration of emergency, it's my understanding that
13 that would cut down on some of the timeline involved.
14 Now, I don't want to do that if it's going to give
15 the State the opportunity to move inside and—and, you
16 know, micro manage NYCHA at that level, but I'm also
17 wondering if we did seek that, could that be
18 something that could actually expedite the timeline
19 for boiler placement. Are there pluses and minuses
20 to seeking a temporary emergency declaration?

21 SHOLA OLATOYE: So, one thing I want to
22 be clear about in terms of—on procurement—that, and
23 by community yes in savings, and even internally
24 because that gets us through our whole board vote. We
25 would still have to do some form of competitive. The

2 advertising period required by New York State Law is
3 only 20 days. So, I don't think it's when we get our
4 biggest bang. I will tell you that for the--this City
5 Plus award, we've had design firms already procured,
6 and so we are going to start design with firms that
7 are currently procured. So, for right now,
8 procurement and emergency declaration isn't critical
9 to moving these things forward. I would say in terms
10 of a longer look because we have federal and more
11 federal boilers coming. We've got the state money
12 coming. The Mayor dis speak to Design-Build
13 yesterday, and that would significantly cut down our
14 time in terms of the--allowing overlap between design
15 and construction.

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Could Design-Build be
17 used specifically on boiler and heating systems?

18 SHOLA OLATOYE: Yes, we use it on our EP-
19 EPCs are designed that way, and no pun intended. The
20 program assumes it, and we see significant savings
21 over time.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: So, if the State gave
23 us between--somewhere between now and June, hopefully
24 actually in the money process, if they gave New York
25 City Design-Build authority, that could really help

both in the cost savings and with timeline on all of
the projects we're talking about related to NYCHA?

SHOLA OLATOYE: Definitely timeline,
although I do want to be honest since we're starting
right now on the \$200 million work, we're in design.
We're not—we don't—we've skipped the first
procurement process.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: And so the—the \$200+
million that was put forward for the boilers, what is
the—the plan to cut down so that next winter we don't
have one of these top 20 developments that was
identified as part of this plan that again does not
have heat. Is there a—are there temporary boilers in
the meantime before the full system can be replaced?
What's the emergency plan for the top 20 that were
identified?

SHOLA OLATOYE: I'm going to let my peer
speak to next winter. I will say in terms of the
capital projects, the temporary boilers do go in at
the end of that first year and a half. So, it is one
of the first things we do. So, there would be more
reliable heat in the first 18 to 20 months.

1
2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: From the beginning of
3 the current schedule or just part of the construction
4 and commissioning part.

5 SHOLA OLATOYE: Right at the beginning of
6 the construction. So, after your--16 to 18 months,
7 your temporary boilers go in.

8 SPEAKER JOHNSON: But that's--

9 SHOLA OLATOYE: [interposing] That's all
10 I can--it's the source that I'm having.

11 SPEAKER JOHNSON: No, I'm just saying--
12 just so we're clear, that would be 2-1/2 years from
13 beginning to that--that point?

14 That would be a year and a half.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: No, it's 16 months plus
16 an additional 18 months. So, that's--

17 SHOLA OLATOYE: No, I may not have been
18 clear.

19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Okay.

20 SHOLA OLATOYE: It's the very beginning
21 of construction so it's the 12 plus the 4 to 6.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: 12 plus the 4 to 6.

23 SHOLA OLATOYE: So, 16 to 18 months.

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: To have--
25

2 SHOLA OLATOYE: Temporary boilers in,
3 which is what—so we'll have reliable heat.

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Why sometimes—why does
5 it take that long for temporary boilers?

6 SHOLA OLATOYE: So, I, um—well, we have
7 talked. Vito and I have started talking about
8 procuring the boilers separately from the
9 construction. We have talked to a lot of people
10 about capital cost eligibility, but it's one of these
11 things that we are talking about. I don't want to
12 promise it. I did mention it.

13 SPEAKER JOHNSON: What—what can we do as
14 a Council to be helpful in expediting this? Is it us
15 writing a letter to the Comptroller on some of the
16 things that the Comptroller requires? Is it us
17 asking the State to—to—to do something? What can we
18 do to ensure that we are now waiting a year and a
19 half for temporary boilers? That's—that's madness,
20 and I understand there are laws you need to follow,
21 and you are constrained and constricted by those
22 laws, but what can we do?

23 SHOLA OLATOYE: So, I am—I want to turn
24 it over to Operations to speak to the additional
25 temporary boilers that they will have by winter, but

2 just to follow up, yes, the Comptroller even
3 approached us. So, we are working with the
4 Comptroller, DEP, DOB, all of which have authority
5 over some piece of this process with us, and we—and
6 DEP and DOB have already agreed to provide us an
7 express lane, as I call it, through their permitting
8 and approval processes. If there's more, we can do
9 more.

10 DEBORAH GODDARD: So, other plans we are
11 taking are related to replacing eight boiler plants
12 at two properties: Union Avenue and Claremont Houses,
13 and also taking steps to winterize and change the
14 fueling on our existing mobile boilers and we're also
15 purchasing additional mobile boilers so that we have
16 a contingency in the event we have a major plant
17 outage that we feel we should at that point convert
18 to mobile boilers.

19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: How long did it take
20 after Sandy to get temporary boilers to NYCHA?

21 DEBORAH GODDARD: It took about a year.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: So, for a year people
23 were without heat and hot water?

24 DEBORAH GODDARD: No. no, no, no. We did
25 it under emergency procurement. We rented them under

1 emergency procurement. My, um, and then we replaced
2 them. So, it's an emergency procurement. You can do
3 what you need to do for the short term as a solution
4 of your problem. We got them in place. We then
5 during that time did a full-blown standard
6 procurement, and switched them out.

8 SPEAKER JOHNSON: So, why can't we do
9 that same thing now? If you were able to get them in
10 a matter of weeks because of emergency procurement,
11 why shouldn't we use the same road map we used after
12 Sandy? Sandy was considered an emergency. 320,000
13 outages since October 1st is an emergency. So, why
14 can't we do the same thing?

15 DEBORAH GODDARD: Well, I believe that's
16 part of the reason we're getting the additional
17 boilers, you know, the boilers is to be ready and in
18 place, ready, because those can be installed.

19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Are we doing it to
20 emergency procurement?

21 DEBORAH GODDARD: No, we're--

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: [interposing] So, what--
23 the question is, is why can't we do it through
24 emergency procurement?

2 DEBORAH GODDARD: So, one, as we take a
3 step back. One, we had resources. The board had
4 already adopted resources to support the beginning of
5 the type of work already. So, we had contracts
6 already. We will absolutely look towards with you
7 and other to-to determine if we can do-come up with a
8 legislative solution or something that would allow
9 things to move faster. We believe that with these
10 resources that we've just received that we have the
11 ability to install these mobile boilers with
12 quickness-quickly and-and obviously the conversation
13 happening in Albany around Design-Build will be
14 helpful to the longer term permanent construction
15 process. So, we look forward to working with you on
16 any other legislative-municipal legislative ideas,
17 um, and-and our ongoing conversation in Albany around
18 Design-Build.

19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I understand all that.
20 I'm not trying to be difficult. I just trying to
21 understand. Why not do emergency procurement in the
22 situation we're in now? What's the down side of
23 that? Are we legally restricted from doing that?
24 Because if that's going to-if that's going to get us
25 boilers more quickly for these 20 identified problem

2 developments that have been plagued by heating
3 outages, why not do that?

4 DEBORAH GODDARD: But those 20 are the
5 ones for capital replacement. Are you asking me--?

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: [interposing] Okay, but
7 what about the ones on top of the 20?

8 DEBORAH GODDARD: Are you asking me to
9 put 20 on mobile boilers now? Is that what--?

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: That's what I'm saying.
11 So in the meantime--

12 DEBORAH GODDARD: [interposing] Yes.

13 SPEAKER JOHNSON: --instead of waiting a
14 year and a half--

15 DEBORAH GODDARD: Right.

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: --why not do emergency
17 procurement--

18 DEBORAH GODDARD: [interposing] Right.

19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: --for temporary boilers
20 so we get some immediate remedy to the ones that are
21 seeing the most outages?

22 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: So, we are conducting
23 that review right now.

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I didn't hear you Vito.
25 Could you--?

1
2 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: I said we are
3 conducting that review right now and based—obviously,
4 that's our goal just to get those mobile units
5 installed before the beginning of next heat season.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: But I'm sorry. The
7 question is why not do emergency procurement?

8 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: It might not be so
9 simple as just declaring an emergency for procurement
10 purposes. So, I need to get a better understanding
11 of the process, and certainly where the Council can
12 be helpful, I will be reaching out to ask for help.

13 SPEAKER JOHNSON: So, we want to be
14 helpful and it would be helpful if I knew you had an
15 answer—if I can get an answer out on that on
16 emergency procurement and what are the downsides to
17 that? Why not do that in the interim between now and
18 when the 18 months comes, it would be nice to
19 understand that.

20 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Yes, and if you can,
21 just give me some time to work with the team in
22 coming up with a plan.

23 SPEAKER JOHNSON: How much time?

24 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Two weeks.

25 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Great. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON TORRES: You said EPCs are
subject to Design-Build.

SHOLA OLATOYE: They are—

CHAIRPERSON TORRES: That's your Energy
Performance Contracts?

SHOLA OLATOYE: The program presumes
Design-Build through the Energy Service Contract
Corporation.

CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, you're able to
do Design-Build—

SHOLA OLATOYE: [interposing] Yes.

CHAIRPERSON TORRES: --on Energy
Performance Contracts. I want to read to you a
provision that governs Energy Performance Contracts.
It's 24 CFR Section §990.185. It says: *Physical
improvements financed by a loan from the bank,
utility or government entity.* That's one of the
definitions of an Energy Performance Contract. So, it
seems to suggest that the city of New York could
provide a loan to a public housing authority like
NYCHA under and EPC, and if that is the case, based
on my reading of this provision, could that receive
the benefit of Design-Build? [pause]

2 SHOLA OLATOYE: So, that's just one of
3 those contracts under Design Build currently.

4 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Yeah, but that's
5 what I'm—I know it's Design-Build.

6 SHOLA OLATOYE: Yes.

7 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: But I want to figure
8 it out. Design-Build is the one mechanism--

9 SHOLA OLATOYE: [interposing] Yes.

10 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: --that would
11 dramatically expedite the construction of these ways,
12 right?

13 SHOLA OLATOYE: So, you're saying if the--
14 if the--if the city were to give a loan to NYCHA--

15 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing]
16 Suppose the city was the third party that provided
17 you with a loan under an Energy Performance Contract,
18 could that enjoy the benefit of Design-Build so that
19 we can get these boilers done? And if you don't know
20 the answer to that question--

21 SHOLA OLATOYE: The caveat, though, is
22 that it would have to be an Energy Performance
23 Contract.

24 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Yes.

25 SHOLA OLATOYE: Yes.

2 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Yes, so that's the
3 point to get the benefit of--

4 SHOLA OLATOYE: [interposing] So, the
5 Energy Performance Contract does the--as long as you
6 are within the structure of an Energy Performance
7 Contract, it's--it's not--it doesn't discriminate based
8 on the source on the capital, right. So, as long as
9 it is an Energy Performance Contract, then yes, you
10 can use Design-Build.

11 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: I think the point--

12 SHOLA OLATOYE: Under the HUD program.

13 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: --but my point is
14 could--could an Energy Performance Contract be a
15 mechanism by which we can efficiently and quickly
16 spend city capital dollars?

17 SHOLA OLATOYE: I just want to be clear
18 that the process we're getting into an Energy
19 Performance Contract itself is, um, it's--it's a
20 prescribed process by HUD. It takes about two years
21 of preparation all in to key it up before you get to
22 construction. So, while, um, once you are at the
23 point of having procured and you're at the point of,
24 you know--

25 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] Uh-hm.

1
2 SHOLA OLATOYE: --doing-getting your
3 vendors in place, but it does move faster, but the
4 caveat there is that to get into an Energy
5 Performance Contract there's also a-an administrative
6 process that's overseen by HUD and dictated by HUD in
7 terms of timeline. So, it depends-it may be faster.
8 It may not be faster. We would have to-have to look
9 at it.

10 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: What I would want
11 NYCHA to do is in addition to looking into the
12 possibility of an emergency procurement is explore
13 whether we as a city could provide NYCHA with a loan
14 under an Energy Performance Contract for the
15 installation of new boilers. Is that a feasible
16 option?

17 SHOLA OLATOYE: So, we can look at that.
18 The other caveat though is that because boiler time
19 jobs are-are very capital intensive, and relative to
20 the amount of capital that's required to do the
21 replacement, they don't generate as which a savings
22 on the utility costs then. So, it is actually-it-it-
23 it doesn't sort of--

1
2 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] Isn't
3 that the reason the city should be the lender because
4 a private lender would be less inclined--

5 SHOLA OLATOYE: [interposing] What it
6 does--

7 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: --to provide you
8 with the capital?

9 SHOLA OLATOYE: Well, what are we--what
10 are we meaning by lender? Right. So, if we're
11 talking about a capital grant that comes into it in
12 the form of, you know, some sort of forgivable loan
13 the way that some of the HPD's capital, you know, in
14 that case, I mean in that case I actually--it doesn't
15 need to be a loan per se because once you're in that
16 complex structure, you can give it to us as a grant
17 and we will deploy it. My point is simply that if we
18 are trying to pay back the loan for--for the plant
19 with savings from a boiler plant, that will not
20 pencil out. So, that--that boiler plant needs to be
21 subsidized with other savings from other measures
22 that are generating the savings above and beyond what
23 the--

CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] The
New York City Housing Authority, so NYCHA has 178,000
units.

SHOLA OLATOYE: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON TORRES: You have received
how much in EPC funding?

SHOLA OLATOYE: So, far we have \$167
million approved--

CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] \$167
million to new works for the development of 317
units.

SHOLA OLATOYE: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Received \$140
million--

SHOLA OLATOYE: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON TORRES: --in EPC funding.

SHOLA OLATOYE: Uh-hm.

CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Why was Newark able
to get a dramatically better deal than New York City
number one, and number 2, Newark was able to invest
those EPC dollars in the installation of a new
heating system, and you've shown that you can make a
cash flow.

2 SHOLA OLATOYE: Sure. So, um, I don't
3 have direct knowledge of the program at Newark. I've
4 had some conversations with them in the past, um,
5 trying to learn, you know, how they were doing their
6 programs. We—one of our vendors, one of our
7 performance contractors was also a performance
8 contractor from New York. So, we have also heard
9 some feedback about how that program was structured.
10 So, again, I'm not an expert in Newark structure
11 their program. However, what I can tell you based on
12 what I know from the conversations that I have had is
13 that their rate structures for their utilities are
14 very different from what NYCHA pays, and in
15 particular one of the things that they were able to
16 use is water savings. Um, we are—NYCHA is not able
17 to use water savings within our EPCs at the moment.
18 We spent a substantial—we've invested a substantial
19 number of—of effort discussing ways to enable NYCHA
20 to use water savings within EPCs with HUD with, you
21 know, and with assistance from the Mayor's Office,
22 and it is not something that we can include at the
23 month. And so, one of the reasons that why Newark
24 was able to—and many other housing authorities are
25 able to, you know, get to these—some of these bigger,

1 you know, scopes of working dollar amounts is that
2 they are able to include sources of savings that
3 currently NYCHA does not have access to.

4
5 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Now, we are—we're
6 receiving 167 or slated to receive \$167 million in
7 EPC funding. That's for how many units?

8 SHOLA OLATOYE: Give me one second.
9 [pause] I'm sorry. I don't have the unit count in
10 front of me. I will get back to you.

11 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Okay, my
12 understanding—I don't know the exact—I think it's
13 tens of thousands of units here.

14 SHOLA OLATOYE: It's quite a number--

15 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] Right.

16 SHOLA OLATOYE: --so it's relevant.

17 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: It could be nearly a
18 hundred. So, we're receiving \$167 million for tens
19 of thousands of units, whereas, Newark—Newark is
20 receiving \$140 million for only 317. It just feels
21 to me New York City is getting a raw deal or that we
22 are—we're not fulfilling our potential to achieve
23 greater funding under EPC.

24 SHOLA OLATOYE: Well--

2 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] But
3 that's more of a--

4 SHOLA OLATOYE: Sure.

5 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: That's not a
6 question but you can comment.

7 SHOLA OLATOYE: I-I can't comment, but
8 just a little bit. Again, much of the work that we
9 are doing the--the savings that we have access to, so
10 in order for you to be able to capitalize the savings
11 you had to generate some savings. The savings that
12 we have access to right now are tied primarily to two
13 things. One is electric savings. So, this is really
14 lighting. Those are--they're--in terms of dollar
15 amounts they're relatively modest. The other savings
16 that we have access to is cost savings on the heating
17 side by deploying the modernized EMS and control
18 systems that you alluded to and those--those savings
19 paying for themselves, for their project as well.
20 Because, you know, typical EPCs in other housing
21 authorities depend quite heavily on water savings,
22 because they're relatively cheap to generate and
23 they--they--they, you know, and water is expensive in
24 many places. So, the fact that we don't have access
25 to that particular source of savings makes it that

2 we're trying to go far on a relatively small savings
3 stream. And the other factor here is that part of
4 the reason why we're in so many developments is
5 because we are trying to move as quickly as we can to
6 modernize some of these, the building management
7 systems that you alluded to earlier as quickly as we
8 can, and so what we've-- Some of it is, you know, we
9 have to do it this way because of the savings that
10 are available to us, and some of it is it makes sense
11 for us to do it this way because it allows us to make
12 that technology upgrade as quickly as possible.

13 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: I mean I suspect,
14 and I don't—I would have to review the data so if we
15 could just—that we could generate huge savings from
16 our new heating plant. Just given the shear
17 inefficiency of the boilers we have in NYCHA, given
18 the—the utility costs, the outside contracting, the—
19 the overtime budget.

20 SHOLA OLATOYE: Yes, so--

21 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] If we
22 had modern heating systems all those plus would go
23 away.

24 SHOLA OLATOYE: Right. So, a couple of
25 things. First of all because of the type of heating

2 plants that we have, and—and these are again, if you
3 look at this closer, we're talking about a single
4 heating plant that's serving multiple buildings. So,
5 this not a typical situation where you have a
6 building and you have a boiler and it's serving just
7 that—that plant. So, these are—or that building.
8 So, these are large boilers. The technology, the
9 efficiency of these types of—type of large boilers
10 have not really changed very much in—in decades.
11 This is technology that-- So, if you go back to the
12 efficiency of this type of fire tube, then water tube
13 boilers, you know that, you know, in 2005 or before,
14 you will see that they are about the same as what you
15 can buy than if you replaced them new. So, at the
16 boiler level, the efficiency is dictated by the type
17 of system that we have to buy because of the size of
18 the plants, and that has not really moved over time.
19 There is—we expect to get some small amount of
20 savings in the new plant through, you know, more—more
21 modern burners, more, you know, better—better
22 controls and management and such. But that savings
23 at the boiler plant itself is not—not rich. So, most
24 of the savings that we're talking about when we
25 talked about savings from heating plants is coming

2 the manage—the building management system, the
3 temperature sensing that we would be doing, the hot
4 water modernization. So, those are the areas that
5 really give us the bigger portion of the savings when
6 it comes to heating plant work.

7 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Fine. Council
8 Member Barron.

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [interposing]
10 Just—

11 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Okay.

12 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Just one
13 second. There's a development that was consolidated
14 or we've consolidated that received—that benefitted
15 from what you were just mentioning. They had the
16 weatherization with the new windows, and they
17 received a new boiler over the summer, but that
18 development doesn't have heat right now, and we're
19 not sure if it's because the boiler was not turned on
20 or something is not working, and so in addition to
21 that, that development those residents pay an
22 electricity bill and so I'm looking now at a bill for
23 \$251.29 for just a month, and it's because they had
24 to use alternative heating with space heaters. And
25 so, is there someone dealing directly with this case

1 in this development where they have to use space
2 heaters and they also pay for their own electricity,
3 but they have a new boiler. If so, is NYCHA
4 reimbursing those?
5

6 SHOLA OLATOYE: So, I'll comment on the
7 weatherization, the work that we've done, and then
8 I'll ask Jackie to speak about this piece. Howard
9 Avenue Houses there is—is the development there
10 referring to impact route. That development did
11 receive a fairly comprehensive update through the
12 Weatherization Assistance Program. We were able to
13 replace the boilers that were there as well as
14 windows. They also are one of the developments that
15 has a—a cut-out in the wall for a through-wall air
16 conditioner, and many residents didn't actually have
17 air conditions in them or they weren't, you know,
18 they weren't fitted so that it was airtight. So,
19 they were getting a lot of drafts through both of the
20 windows that they had that were maybe not fitting
21 correctly, and then also through this coil that they
22 had for the—the through-wall air conditioner. So, we
23 were also able to come up with the weatherization
24 assistance provider, a solution to sort of seal those
25 holes as well, and when we— At the completion of

2 that work, folks were reporting that they were much
3 more comfortable and that they were—they did not have
4 the drafts and such that they were experiencing
5 before the work was done. In terms of— [background
6 comments]

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Oh, no, no.
8 She's getting. Please. Thank you, wait, wait, wait,
9 wait, wait, wait, wait, wait, wait, wait, wait, wait.
10 We're doing to let them respond. We're going to let
11 them respond. We're going to let [gavel]. Just
12 shortly we're going to let them respond.

13 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Be quiet, please.

14 SHOLA OLATOYE: So, in terms of the
15 performance of that plant, you know, we—we, the last
16 I looked at it, you know, personally was after the—
17 after the completion of that project, the boilers
18 were working well at that time. I don't know what
19 the situation may be at this moment. [background
20 comments]

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Right, so—so,
22 you'll just—you'll get back to us, right that it's—
23 it's noted and you'll get back to us on the Parkmore
24 issue. Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Council Member
3 Barron.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you to the
5 Chairs, and to the panel. I want to say that I echo
6 the comments of Council Member Miller that there
7 needs to be appropriate consequences for those who
8 were negligent, for those who were culpable from
9 getting us in the situation where we are now, and in
10 terms of closed tickets, I've been told by residents
11 in the develops in East New York that tickets are
12 being closed because when they come to measure the
13 temperature in the building in the apartment, it's
14 not noted that the temperature is whatever the
15 reading is based on the fact that there are pots of
16 water that are boiling, that there are space heaters,
17 and that the ovens are on. So, tickets are closed
18 not noting the circumstances that have raised the
19 temperature. So, is there a--a requirement that those
20 kind of conditions be noted?

21 SHOLA OLATOYE: I think we have to look
22 into that, but no--

23 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] Okay,
24 I--

25 SHOLA OLATOYE: We're dealing with that.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes, go ahead.

3 SHOLA OLATOYE: No, they wouldn't.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, I think
5 that should be a requirement. Not just come in and
6 take a reading and say oh, it's 75 degrees so it's
7 fine. Secondly, there was a problem at one of the
8 senior centers. Actually, two of the senior centers
9 that are in NYCHA developments and the question
10 became who is responsible for providing the heat? Is
11 it NYCHA or is the program developer who is there
12 operating the program at the center?

13 SHOLA OLATOYE: If-if you're talking
14 about-the provision of heat is the landlord's
15 responsibility so-

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing]
17 It's still what?

18 SHOLA OLATOYE: It's NYCHA's
19 responsibility.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, so Dahlia
21 Housing it's NYCHA's responsibility to make sure the
22 senior center--

23 SHOLA OLATOYE: Is there with a plan for
24 for-I'm not familiar with the-I know Ben Dahlia, but
25 I don't know what happened there.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay.

3 SHOLA OLATOYE: If there was an outage at
4 the development I would imagine that it would affect
5 the senior center as well. So, that is when, you
6 know, our staff would need to respond accordingly.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, and what is
8 the threshold for the number of units in a
9 development or the number of buildings in a
10 development to say that there's an outage at a
11 particular development. If half of the buildings
12 don't have heat or hot water, does that qualify the
13 entire development to say its outage, or do you wait
14 for the entire—all of the buildings to say that
15 there's an outage? What percentage of the number of
16 units? Because there may be developments that have a
17 large percentage that are not noted as having an
18 outage at the development?

19 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: So, outages are
20 classified as they're development wide, which would
21 mean that the entire—that the plant affected, the
22 plant is down and it affects the entire development.
23 They're also classified as single buildings or
24 there's an issue with the equipment in the building
25 affecting heat and hot water, then it's the single

2 building that's out, and if there is a faulty line
3 that has an issue whether there's a rupture line or
4 type in the basement, servicing that one apartment
5 line, and then the outage can be classified to just
6 pick up the apartment line.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, and in
8 terms of the question earlier from Council Member
9 Miller where I understood you to say that there are
10 some developments that have private entities that are
11 responsible for the heating, can you speak further to
12 that? How many developments does that involve? How
13 were they selected? What are the obligations, and I
14 believe the Council Member's question was does it
15 restrict others from operating and managing those
16 boilers?

17 SHOLA OLATOYE: So, we have five
18 properties that are under contract with the National
19 Grid, and that's Boulevard Houses, Linden Houses,
20 Coney Island House, Riverview and Bronx River. I'm
21 sorry, can you repeat the second part of your
22 question?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Are there
24 restrictions as to the personnel who can go in and
25 operate or make repairs to those boilers?

1
2 SHOLA OLATOYE: Well, they would have to
3 be employees of the—of the contractor.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, only NYCHA...I
5 mean only National Grid:

6 SHOLA OLATOYE: Let me confirm that. Is
7 that correct?

8 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Yes, that's correct.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, because two
10 of those developments are in my district, and I did
11 not know that it was National Grid that has the
12 responsibility for providing heat and hot water to
13 those developments. And how long has that
14 arrangement been in place?

15 SHOLA OLATOYE: Since 1996.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: 1996. Okay,
17 that's interesting, and if you could send me any sort
18 of data on that because now—so, for those who are
19 living in NYCHA, I mean who are living in Boulevard
20 and Linden, when there are complaints at those
21 developments, do they go straight to NYCHA? Does
22 NYCHA then turn them to National Grid or do they go
23 straight to National Grid or how are you tracking the
24 solution, the resolution of those complaints?

2 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: So when the residents--
3 (coughs) excuse me--of those five developments makes a
4 heat complaint, our staff responds to the individual
5 phoning in. We do not respond to the board room. If
6 we do find that there's something more than the heat
7 affecting the one apartment or in other words, if we
8 find that the entire line or there's something more
9 that's--that's--that may be related to the equipment
10 that's causing the--the heat outage, then when
11 communicate with National Grid, and they will look
12 into it further.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, it's up to
14 NYCHA to contact National Grid?

15 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: We make contact with
16 them, yes.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: To inform them
18 that there's an issue?

19 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Yes.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, thank you.
21 Thank you to the chairs.

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, next,
23 we'll hear from Council Member Rivera.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Hi, yes. Thank
25 you, Ritchie and Madam Chair for--for everything. I

1 know this has been an epic hearing. I want to go back
2 to your comment, Madam Chair on-on the Con Ed bill.
3 I-I know that a number of the-the people that had
4 been here all day expressing concern because though
5 we know covering your AC and moving the furniture
6 away from your heat baseboards certainly helps with
7 heating. A lot of the NYCHA residents do know how to
8 cover their air conditioner, and still they are
9 freezing. So, I just want to say to start a
10 conversation with-- You know, to start and answer
11 with some-some residents how to even cover their AC
12 sleeve, it isn't really helpful. I want to go to
13 the-to the Con Ed-the Con Ed bill. I have a number
14 of developments in my district including LES-5 and
15 LES-3 that-that face these very high Con Ed bills,
16 and I just want to mention--this is more of a comment
17 than a question-that a lot of it has to do with also
18 the condition of their windows. They're very old.
19 Draft comes in through the windows, and so this is a-
20 a multi-pronged capital projects approach, and so
21 while I understand there are things that we can do
22 within our own home owns, the windows and the-and
23 the-again, the condition and the age of these windows
24 are another big problem. So, I just wanted to-to add
25

1 that because I-I know that people here have been
2 waiting and they have a number of issues in terms of-
3 of what they're doing inside their homes to make sure
4 that they're warm throughout these-these cold months.
5 So, thank you for allowing me to comment on that, and
6 for bringing up the situation, which is very, very
7 important in terms of each tenant's finances.

9 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: And I have a few
10 more. What are the number of developments that are
11 privately run as far as boiler counts?

12 SHOLA OLATOYE: Five.

13 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Only five National
14 Grid.

15 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Now is NYCHA
16 planning to expand the privatization of boiler
17 plants?

18 SHOLA OLATOYE: Yes. That was the Request
19 for Proposals clarification. Besides National Grid.
20 We have some properties that are under what we call
21 private management.

22 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Yeah.

23 SHOLA OLATOYE: And that's with Kraus
24 Management and BMA and they maintain those, um, that-
25 the-the boiler plants at those locations.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: And what are the
3 number of units--what are the number of developments
4 you're about to privatize in terms of boiler
5 maintenance, the operation of the boiler plants.

6 SHOLA OLATOYE: So, the RFP--

7 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Yeah,

8 SHOLA OLATOYE: --you're thinking of? So
9 that is to add additional resources and the plan is
10 that that would affect 69 developments.

11 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Okay. Now is the end
12 gain full privatization? What's the--what's the
13 rationale for it?

14 SHOLA OLATOYE: You know, this--this--this
15 was an acknowledgement of our constant churn on
16 staffing and our inability to keep ourselves fully
17 staffed related to some of the issues that we talked
18 about earlier. So, this is seen as a--as a resource
19 that we can bring into the agency because these
20 contractors would have to be responsible for fully
21 staffing these--these facilities, but it also then
22 enables us to redeploy our staff so that instead of
23 housing the heat-plant technicians managing for--

24 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] Right.

2 SHOLA OLATOYE: --facilities, they would
3 get to that point.

4 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] So,
5 the--the objective here is to reduce the workload of
6 your municipal labor force. Is that--?

7 SHOLA OLATOYE: It is to--to better match
8 the staff to the boiler plant.

9 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: You--you want--

10 SHOLA OLATOYE: [interposing] More like
11 industry standards.

12 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: But you want your
13 municipal labor force to manage the boilers for
14 employees?

15 SHOLA OLATOYE: Yes.

16 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Then why not expand
17 your staff? Like why privatize?

18 SHOLA OLATOYE: So, I think your question
19 and the origin of your question is rooted in the
20 issue of resources and I know we don't want to talk
21 about that--

22 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing]
23 Privatization requires resources as well.

24 SHOLA OLATOYE: Yeah, so we also
25 recognize our challenge is to--as evidenced by today,

1 our challenge is to maintain that level of support.
2
3 Look, the-the 500 or so staff who do this work are
4 working in unbelievable conditions. I have seen it.
5 I've been there with them. Our goals is to (1) make
6 sure that the men who were coming in can stay and
7 that there's a real ladder, and that we also train
8 and support those more experienced leaders to really
9 work on those-those assets for our boilers that are
10 the most challenged. The reality is we are with
11 this-with these resources, our federal resources,
12 state resources the EPCs, we are still going to have
13 a number of very complicated and-and challenged
14 physical assets that need help. So, the objective
15 here was to try and allocate more staffing resources
16 to those, and really bring and augment our ability to
17 service the rest of our portfolio by relying on
18 private industry. It is-it is not a silver bullet.
19 It's meant to be a diversified approach to improve
20 heating service.

21 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Do you know for a
22 fact, have you studied whether privatization is more
23 cost-effective than expanding your existing labor
24 force?

2 SHOLA OLATOYE: We can sure follow up
3 with you with the analysis that we conducted on our
4 support--

5 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] Do-do
6 you believe it to be more cost-effective?

7 SHOLA OLATOYE: You asked me if I had the
8 research and I will follow up with on that.

9 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: It would be based on
10 the analysis you have done internally, right, do you
11 believe--you're privatizing for a reason. I imagine
12 this is-

13 SHOLA OLATOYE: [interposing] This is a
14 long-term. There's a short-term and a long-term set
15 of costs involved, and one is we are with your
16 support and others investing in very extensive
17 infrastructure. These boilers are new, they're
18 costing one of the major-

19 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] But
20 that's not my--but my question is whether is cost-
21 effective.

22 SHOLA OLATOYE: This is what you asked.

23 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: I'm asking a--I'm
24 asking a question about--

1 SHOLA OLATOYE: [interposing] You're
2 asking about operating.

3 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: --a cost benefit
4 analysis of privatization versus an expanded heating
5 division and expanded municipal labor force. Which
6 is more cost-effective in the short term? Which is
7 more cost-effective in the long term?
8

9 SHOLA OLATOYE: So, first we are trying
10 to address the immediate crisis in front of us while
11 planning on--

12 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] It has
13 nothing to do with my question. It has nothing to do
14 with my question.

15 SHOLA OLATOYE: So, well--

16 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] You've
17 had plenty of--

18 SHOLA OLATOYE: --you have to have a
19 plan.

20 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Do you have--

21 SHOLA OLATOYE: [interposing] You have to
22 have a plan in order to address these issues.

23 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: I understand, but
24 that's not my question.

1
2 SHOLA OLATOYE: [interposing] The short-
3 term into that--

4 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] I'm
5 asking the question about the cost of privatization
6 versus the cost of expanding the municipal labor
7 force and which one is larger than which?

8 SHOLA OLATOYE: We believe the long-term
9 costs both in terms of the capital investment that's
10 already been made will ultimately allow us to protect
11 the men and women we already have with-with-on staff
12 and allow to use our budget base--

13 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] I-I
14 just-Does that-so, you're saying that it's more cost-
15 effective or not? I feel like you're incapable of
16 answer the question.

17 SHOLA OLATOYE: We believe that long term
18 it is more cost-effective to be-for us to do that.
19 To-to approach it this way. We will assess it after
20 a year, and we will come back with more information
21 with-to inform going forward.

22 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: But what you're
23 telling me because I think cost is obviously weighing
24 heavily on a chronically under-resourced housing
25 authority. I-I just feel like I'm hearing

2 contradictory messages. On one hand you seem to be
3 suggestive that privatization is more cost-effective,
4 and if it's more cost-effective, then the Housing
5 Authority is going to move toward what is more cost-
6 effective, which is greater privatization. But then
7 on the other hand you're telling me you want to make
8 heating plant technician positions more attractive.
9 You want greater retention. Those seem to be
10 intention, though.

11 SHOLA OLATOYE: I don't think that those
12 are in—I don't—I don't believe that to be in
13 conflict. I think that there is work to be done to
14 ensure that the—the—the pathway for men and women who
15 choose to be heating plant professionals is clear,
16 and that—that there is a level of support and
17 training there. I don't think that's in conflict
18 with saying we are investing millions of dollars in
19 new assets that require a level of skill and support
20 that we want to make sure that we have. I don't
21 believe those two things are--

22 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] You--
23 you said required. Do you feel like your existing
24 staff has the skills--

2 SHOLA OLATOYE: [interposing] I think we
3 need to augment our--

4 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: --to operate those
5 existing--

6 SHOLA OLATOYE: I think we have to
7 augment our skill base. I am sure that we are all
8 learning. So that-

9 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] What
10 does it mean to augment your skill base? What does it
11 mean?

12 SHOLA OLATOYE: It means that we are
13 relying on or binging third-parties to aug-to augment
14 our site.

15 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, apart from the
16 third-party vendors, because I heard a plan earlier
17 or a semblance of a plan for staffing. What's the
18 plan for training your existing staff--

19 SHOLA OLATOYE: [interposing] Well, we--

20 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: --to operate these
21 new roles?

22 SHOLA OLATOYE: I'd be happy to allow our
23 EVP of Administration to provide you with that
24 information.

25

2 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: I'm sorry. Are you
3 up? [background comments, pause]

4 KERRI JEW: We are constantly looking at
5 these to ensure that our workforce is not only
6 properly trained currently, but also with an eye
7 toward their futures. So, in terms of working with
8 external partners, in terms of working with the
9 union, in this case and in HPT's case with Local 237,
10 in terms of trying to figure out what the best way is
11 to get the training that is needed for our-our
12 workforce, and then continue to grow and have a
13 career path.

14 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Do-do you currently
15 have a training plan?

16 KERRI JEW: I'm sorry. In terms of the
17 HPTs, right now HPTs are an entry level title, and so
18 right, as we have historically looked at it, the plan
19 was that HPTs would move up the ranks to jobs like
20 maintenance worker or assistant-

21 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: No, but if I
22 understand the Chairperson correctly, you're
23 investing in new assets. You want to ensure that you
24 have skilled workers to operate those assets. What's
25 the plan for ensuring that NYCHA employees have the

2 skills to operate these new assets, these new boiler
3 sites?

4 KERRI JEW: We are working on plan.

5 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Do you have a
6 timeline for when you're going to finalize that plan?

7 KERRI JEW: We'll have to come back to
8 you on that.

9 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Okay.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Madam Chair, I want to
11 thank you for being here today. I know today was not
12 an easy day, and I appreciate you (coughs) to the
13 best of your ability answering the questions and
14 having your top level staff here to answer the
15 questions. The one thing I would say (coughs) is
16 that, you know, we pointed out I think a series of
17 things that we discovered for the first time in
18 productive conversations that our staff had with your
19 staff in the lead-up to this hearing. The technology
20 systems not speaking to each other, the number of
21 individuals who were without heat, and not just
22 during the bomb (sic) cycle and event, but from the
23 beginning of the heating season until today, and a
24 variety of other concerns that we've had whether it
25 be emergency procurement, capital funds. We asked a

2 lot of questions. You heard from a lot of members,
3 and we're going to continue, of course, to do
4 vigorous oversight on that generally, but we also
5 want to be helpful. We want to be a partner. We
6 want to support you and your team, and Vito when he
7 comes in on all of these issues that are presented to
8 us in whatever the most productive and helpful way
9 it. Not just on money, though I was in Albany
10 yesterday echoing the Mayor's call for more capital
11 funds for the Authority, but other ways that we can
12 potentially be helpful. And, you know, I know that
13 politics aside, and the moments aside of when there
14 are instances where we might not always—not always
15 agree. You are an empathetic person. You have a big
16 heart. I've seen you interact with NYCHA residents
17 in my own district, and in districts across the city.
18 And so, I saw—I saw the pain on your face this
19 morning when those residents testified about the pain
20 that they were in give the challenges that they're
21 facing. I will never tell you how to act and behave.
22 That's up to you, but I know it's hard when you feel
23 like you're under attack or in a bunker a little bit
24 because of what's going on, and I would say that in
25 the past I think you've shown in many instances you

1 are able to both lead with your heart and your
2 empathy while at the same exact time take
3 responsibility for instances where your agency has
4 not come through enough. I think that's part of what
5 today is about. Of course, we had a lot of questions
6 and we're going to keep asking questions, but also
7 you see it from the emotion in the room. You see the
8 human toll that this takes on all of the families,
9 senior citizens and children who live in public
10 housing when the outdated infrastructure is failing
11 them, and I do not think that you are a bad person.
12 I do not think that you came here in December and
13 willfully misled us. I do not believe that. I
14 believe there are serious problems at NYCHA and that
15 it's your responsibility to fix them, and that
16 ultimately we're going to hold you responsible. So,
17 we're going to continue to have these hearings,
18 continue to have questions, continue to follow up,
19 continue to push you, sometimes make you
20 uncomfortable with our questions, but we're doing it
21 because we have a job to do. We have a job, a
22 serious job of oversight that's charter mandated, and
23 we're ultimately doing it for the residents who live
24 in public housing, and I believe you do this job in
25

2 that—in that spirit as well of service. This is not
3 an easy job. There’s probably not a lot of people
4 that would take this job. So, I really appreciate
5 you being here today and I look forward to continued
6 hearings and conversations on these matters, and it
7 may get rough, it may get tough, it may get
8 uncomfortable, but ultimately there needs to be
9 accountability, which we’re going to push for. And
10 ultimately I believe both you and the Council members
11 up at the deas and behind these tables today share
12 the same goal, which is making the lives better for
13 public housing residents. We just have to figure out
14 how to do that together, and we’re going to demand
15 transparency, accountability and answers as we do
16 that. So, I want to thank you for being here today,
17 and for answering our questions, and the questions
18 that you weren’t able to answer, the questions that
19 we didn’t get to as—as part of our questions today
20 we’re going to send them to you and your team, and we
21 expect a response within the next ten days, the next
22 ten business days. So that we can have the answers
23 to all these questions.

24 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down. Keep it
25 down, please.

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: You're going to have
3 the opportunity to testify. Thank you very much.

4 [pause]

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, as we
6 prepare for the next panelists, we're just going to
7 take five minutes. The next panel will be Borough
8 President Marricka and Borough President Gale Brewer,
9 and- I mean Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer
10 and Bronx Deputy Borough President Marricka Scott-
11 McFadden and Brooklyn Borough President Eric Adams.

12 [pause] And I would ask that NYCHA keep someone here
13 during the duration of the rest of the hearing. Is
14 there someone from NYCHA who will remain?

15 [background comments] Okay, thank you. Acting EVP
16 for Operations. Thank you.

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: So, if--if folks are
18 leaving, please step out of the room so we can get to
19 the next panel. [background comments] If you're
20 going to stay in the room, please take your seat.
21 Sergeants, if you--if you could escort some of the
22 folks out to make sure they actually move out.

23 [background comments, pause] Okay, folks who are
24 staying if you can please take your seat, we're going
25 to--we're going to start with the panels. [background

2 comments, pause] Rafael-Rafael, if you could shut the
3 other doors out there to muffle some of the sound
4 from the Rotunda. [background comments, pause] Thank
5 you very much. I'm going to turn this hearing back
6 over to our fabulous Chair who has done an incredible
7 job today, the Chair of our Public Housing Committee
8 Alicka Ampry-Samuel. So, Chair Ampry-samuel. [pause]

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [background
10 comments] Did everyone fill out a slip? Everyone
11 filled out a slip? [background comments, pause] Can
12 you just confirm your name?

13 ANTHONY DRUMMOND: Anthony Drummond,
14 Brooklyn Borough President Eric Adams' office.

15 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: If you want to have a
16 conversation, you all take it outside. Thank you.

17 MARRICKA SCOTT-MCFADDEN: Marricka Scott-
18 McFadden, Deputy Borough President the Bronx.

19 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay.

20 RAY SANCHEZ: Ray Sanchez, General
21 Counsel, Bronx Borough President's Office with Deputy
22 VP.

23 VICTORIA REIGN: Victoria Reign, Director
24 of Policy and Deputy Counsel, Bronx Borough
25 President's Office.

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, you're
3 to go. Okay, so thank you so much, and you can
4 start. We'll start with the Bronx Borough
5 President's Office.

6 MARRICKA SCOTT-MCFADDEN: Thank you.
7 Good morning Chairman Ampry-Ampry-Samuels and
8 Chairwoman Ampry-Samuels, and Chairman Torres. My
9 name is Marricka Scott-McFadden and I am the Deputy
10 Borough President of the Bronx, and I'm here this
11 morning to share or this afternoon, to share the
12 views of the Bronx Borough President Ruben Diaz, Jr.
13 regarding the failure of New York City Housing
14 Authority to provide adequate heat and hot water to
15 its 400,000 residents this winter. The hundreds of
16 thousand of individuals and families who call public
17 housing home should not be forced to suffer in the
18 cold. Our office has received numerous complaints
19 from residents of NYCHA, developments across the
20 borough. When seeking answers on when new boilers
21 would be installed, NYCHA advised my office in a
22 meeting on January 18, 2018 that their hands were
23 tied by the procurement process, contrary to recent
24 statements by City Hall. I know that the chronic
25 lack of heat and hot water in NYCHA is an emergency.

2 Formally declaring a state of emergency is a common
3 sense act, and the morally correct action NYCHA can
4 take to streamline-to streamline the procurement
5 process. Such a declaration would allow their office
6 to jump start the procurement process and install
7 much needed permanent boilers that are already in the
8 pipelines at a swifter pace. Further, if some aspect
9 of federal law hinders the emergency procurement
10 process, it is incumbent upon City Hall with all of
11 its resources at its disposal to take action and
12 building coalitions for change, not to throw its
13 hands up. The process to replace boilers in NYCHA
14 developments takes far too long, and does not reflect
15 the urgent need for these critical repairs. For
16 example, the Patterson Houses in the Bronx have been
17 forced to subsist using inadequate temporary boilers
18 since 2012. NYCHA has not been-NYCHA has not even
19 begin the RFP process to replace these boilers, which
20 means that even in the best case scenario, new
21 boilers will be years away. The recent extreme
22 weather events showed us just how vulnerable
23 temporary boilers are to very low temperatures, and
24 we have no reason not to expect similar extreme
25 weather in the future. NYCHA tenants should not have

2 to wait a decade for the basic human rights of
3 reliable heat and hot water. We must act to cut red
4 tape during this time of severe crisis. While the
5 recent announcement of some new funding for boilers
6 is a step in the right direction, the situation
7 remains an emergency, and NYCHA has told our office
8 that red tape ties their hands. An emergency must be
9 declared. We would not accept this kind of behavior
10 from a private landlord. NYCHA tenants are entitled
11 to warm apartments just like anyone else. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay.

13 [background comments]

14 ANTHONY DRUMMOND: Alright. Good
15 afternoon, Chair Samuel and Chair Torres. My name is
16 Anthony Drummond. I'm with Brooklyn Borough
17 President Eric Adams' Office as his Policy Analyst,
18 and I'll be providing testimony to the-to the
19 committee on his behalf. My name is Eric L. Adams
20 and I am the Brooklyn Borough President representing
21 2.6 million Brooklynites including 99 New York City
22 Housing Authority developments, roughly equivalent to
23 the population of Utica, New York. In the past few
24 weeks I have heard from at least 19 developments
25 facing heating complaints potentially impacting

2 nearly 40,000 residents during one of the coldest
3 stretches over the past year. Too many tenants did
4 not get the services they deserve, and I appreciate
5 that our city recognizes the need for immediate
6 action. New York City has been the sole government
7 stakeholder to any semblance of responsibility for
8 the crisis putting real money on the table to address
9 emergency repairs, and its infrastructure backlog,
10 most recently by announcing the allocation of \$200
11 million in long-term funding for heating upgrades.
12 Despite this needed injection of funding, this amount
13 still only represents .8% of NYCHA's estimated State
14 of Good Repair Capital Funding deficit of \$25
15 billion. NYCHA has put forward some of these ideas
16 through its Next Gen proposals, and we should see
17 those proposals and others involved in city assets or
18 to discuss through a robust community process.
19 However, beyond this, more clearly needs to be done
20 to meet the increasing and ongoing demand to provide
21 safe, secure and healthy housing for the hundreds of
22 thousands of residents across the city who call NYCHA
23 developments home. Even without Albany and
24 Washington, NYCHA has the ability to meet this
25 challenge by better prioritizing its existing

resources, expediting its bureaucratic procurement process, and improving its communication and transparency with its tenants. Yesterday, I organized scores of NYCHA tenants at the Gowanus Houses in Brooklyn to call on NYCHA, the Fund for Public Housing and the state to do just this by addressing low-hanging fruit action that will go a long way to recapture existing savings, generate additional resources to further public-private partnerships, and cut red tape in order to speed up project implementation. To start, NYCHA must do more to reinvest the savings it has accrued through its important energy efficient programs and retrofits. According to Room to Breathe from July 2017 the Citizens Budget Commission, NYCHA saved \$48 million in utility costs from 2013 to 2016 due to lower natural gas expenditures, which were made possible from converting from oil to natural gas heating systems. Unfortunately, that \$48 million was not dedicated to specifically to reinvest in additional conversions, but rather went back to the NYCHA General Fund. This revenue stream should go directly to more conversions so cost savings can increase, creating a virtual cycle to support NYCHA. This is a

2 prefect example of smart policy leading to
3 substantial savings, and we need to continue down
4 this path until we are certain all residents have a
5 21st Century heating system that is reliable and
6 clean. History has shown us that we should make-
7 expect additional funding from Albany but today we're
8 demanding action from the State. Last week, myself
9 and more than 50 other elected officials demanded and
10 emergency declaration to expedite funding and
11 resources to make crucial improvements to NYCHA
12 infrastructure. To date, the city and state have not
13 declared such an emergency even though it is needed
14 yesterday. More importantly, Governor Cuomo and the
15 State Legislature must act to empower New York City
16 by passing Design-Build legislation to fast track
17 project implementation. Design-Build allows one
18 contractor to design, build and install necessary
19 infrastructure, shaving months off the implementation
20 of projects. Governor Cuomo has empowered his own
21 agencies to use this tool to fast track state
22 projects, but in the constant game of political gain,
23 it should be between the Governor and the Mayor. The
24 Governor has held New York City residents and
25 taxpayers hostage by failing to empower city agencies

2 to use these cost and time saving tools. We must
3 also do more to foster public-private partnerships to
4 support current NYCHA residents. There are thousands
5 of former residents who have gone on to live
6 successful lives. My office has been reaching out to
7 high profile NYCHA alumni in an effort to reconnect
8 them to NYCHA as a way to give back to the
9 neighborhoods that fostered them and provided the
10 foundation for their success. This effort—this
11 effort also includes initial conversations with the
12 Fund for Public Housing on to leverage this potential
13 public-private support for capital improvements.
14 Finally, we must empower residents with information.
15 NYCHA must stop viewing tenants as the opposition.
16 They should be our NYCHA first responders. They are
17 living and breathing the environment every day, and
18 we must empower them with real time data and
19 information to help guide project implementation. I
20 call for the creating of a publicly accessible NYCHA
21 capital project dashboard that goes beyond just
22 listing whether a reported issue is in progress.
23 This aligns previous efforts from my office to
24 successfully secure maps and a dashboard to publicly
25 track Build-it-Back and Sandy Recovery Resiliency

1 projects from New York City and to the Mayor's Office
2 of Recovery and Resiliency. While a Mayor's Capital
3 Project Dashboard exists for the entire city, we need
4 a project dashboard specifically for NYCHA Capital
5 Investments. With a city residential population in
6 NYCHA that is larger than most U.S. cities, including
7 Cleveland and St. Louis, we need to do better to
8 ensure that integral projects be undertaken to
9 improve the infrastructure and quality of life for
10 residents on track and on being implemented in a
11 transparent manner. I look forward to continuing to
12 work with NYCHA, the residents, this committee and
13 any and all partners in government to advocate for
14 the resources that residents need and deserve. Thank
15 you.

17 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you so
18 much. Just jumping right in. There's been a lot of
19 conversation around an emergency declaration. So,
20 since counsel is here and I'm not sure if you heard
21 the question posed to NYCHA earlier, but can you just
22 speak a little bit to just your findings and your
23 research around the legality around emergency
24 declarations and the process itself around

2 procurement and how that really does expedite the
3 process? [pause]

4 MARRICKA SCOTT-MCFADDEN: We feel NYCHA-
5 NYCHA needs to call for the-NYCHA needs to call the
6 heat situation an emergency. The agency's senior
7 leadership said that its hands were tied by red tape,
8 and that it-it was looking into an emergency
9 declaration although NYCHA and the agency has just
10 demonstrated no urgency in doing so. NYCHA needs to
11 untie its own hands. We believe--to respond directly
12 to your question-we believe that NYCHA executives
13 understand the-what is needed in order to declare
14 this state-this state of emergency as it was done in
15 Sandy, and that we feel that they-they are-it's
16 within their control to do that.

17 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, thank
18 you. Okay, thank you so much and thank you for your
19 testimony.

20 ANTHONY DRUMMOND: Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: We're going to
22 call up the next panel. Karen Caldwell, Mary Riddle
23 of Pink Houses, Karen Caldwell of Pink Houses, Louis
24 Green of Pink Houses and Aixa Torres of Smith Houses.
25 [background comments, pause] Are you sure, Borough

2 President, Madam President? [pause] Yes, thank you.
3 Karen Caldwell, Mary Riddle, Louis Green, Aixa
4 Torres. [background comments] Okay, Vick Bach from
5 Community Service Society, Crystal Glover from
6 Washington Houses, and Claudia Perez from Washington
7 Houses. Amanda Satemo, Bertha Akins, Kevin Norman,
8 Lucy Newman, Judith Goldner. Okay. [background
9 comments, pause] Okay, thank you. Please state your
10 name. Thank you.

11 AIXA TORRES: Good afternoon. My name is
12 Aixa Torres and I am the President of the Alfred E.
13 Smith Resident Association, Incorporated. I want to
14 thank the committee of Oversight and the Committee of
15 Public Housing for this hearing. Just before I read
16 my statement to say that I'm a members of GOALS and
17 GOALS has been one of my consultants in terms of help
18 us organize and making sure that our residents in
19 Alfred E. Smith know their rights. So, that being
20 said, there is a saying that there's a water drip—the
21 water dripped until it broke the rock. Smith Houses
22 has been complaining to NYCHA for over 20 years about
23 the boiler system and the problems we have with
24 heating and the consistency of water leaks. The
25 heating system is over 65 years old, and—and probably

2 in violation of several codes. The distant resident
3 of public housing by HUD has taken its toll on the
4 infrastructure of the buildings where we live. In
5 Smith Houses decisions were made by previous resident
6 leaders that they are now ours to fix. The
7 responsibility of these conditions in which we are
8 living in now belong to all those especially that ran
9 NYCHA in the past 20 years at the expense of
10 residents in public housing with their health and
11 safety. In Smith Houses the previous administration
12 chose to endanger the lives of our residents by
13 deciding not to replace gas pipes that desperately
14 needed to be changed. Only by the grace of the Lord
15 did we have—we did not have an active explosion in
16 Smith Houses. (coughs) Another example was as they
17 created the 718-707-7701 that is a failure and has
18 contributed to the massive repairs in NYCHA. Another
19 was centralizing skilled services and removing them
20 from the development or outsourcing work to
21 contractors who thought they were doing a favor for a
22 job well paid. The disrespect—the disrespect
23 displayed by some was criminal, an injustice to
24 residents. Most importantly, stop placing people in
25 positions of authority by merit instead of whose your

2 godfather and not understanding or respecting
3 residents, all done at the expense of public housing
4 residents. However, this administration has tried to
5 address the issue as something else comes up. What
6 Smith Houses needs are new boilers. The apartment
7 and some apartments are extremely cold or hot
8 depending on the line you live. The pipes systems
9 needs to be replaced so that the heat rises properly
10 to the apartment instead of leaks in them, and while
11 this administration has tried to address this problem
12 for 3-1/2 years, it cannot fix the negligence of 20
13 years nor can NYCHA correct overnight going 3-1/2
14 especially without funds. In Smith Houses we had to
15 prioritize the needs based on safety and the
16 wellbeing of residents, and so our first priority was
17 replacing gas pipes, which were done under this
18 administration because the previous administration
19 held us hostage because we refused to sign off on the
20 land lease. Our priority now is acquiring funds for
21 the pipe system and boilers in Smith Houses. We
22 families having to endure no heat or being overheated
23 because of the boiler and pipe systems, which are
24 eroded. This problem begins to affect the health of
25 residents especially the elderly and children

2 including residents that have cardiac or respiratory
3 conditions. Finally, our question today is why
4 investment is the City Council and the New York State
5 Legislature is going to do in supporting public
6 housing residents given the budget cuts from
7 Washington, D.C. to public housing in the city and
8 the state of New York. Our state and city government
9 must invest in supporting our homeless, and we demand
10 as taxpaying citizens of this country that you invest
11 and support residents of public housing.

12 Respectfully submitted Aixa Torres.

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you.
14 We'll just go down the line and please state your
15 name, and we have—as you noticed, we have just two
16 minutes for each one. Thank you.

17 BERTHA AKIN: I would say good morning,
18 but I don't think this is the morning. I want to
19 first say, good afternoon to all respective people,
20 respective persons in the City Council, et cetera, et
21 cetera. Before I read my testimony, I have to say
22 this: There are organizations that are stealing and
23 pimping our tenant leaders, our resident association
24 presidents and so forth. They're stealing them so
25 that their organizations can be on the spotlight, and

2 as a result, those tenant leaders are leaving their
3 residents, they're abandoning their residents because
4 we have bylaws that govern our tenant associations.
5 We have what are supposedly considered democratic and
6 what's the word, Aixa? Democratic and, um, um, what
7 is it? Democratic and (laughs) by resident
8 engagement they're telling us well we can't
9 intervene. The members have to hold their boards
10 accountable, and as a result, nothing is getting
11 done, and this is a major problem. So, we can sit up
12 here and blame them on that one, but we have our
13 resident associations are being pimped by
14 organizations. I can say that firmly because I know,
15 and they're stealing our tenant leaders causing our
16 memberships—members don't get involved because they
17 don't know what they're supposed to be doing, and
18 resident engagements if they don't step up the ante,
19 and help the members in these residents—in these
20 housing projects and help these black and brown
21 people, we will be dead. We will be dead. I want to
22 thank you for having this, um, this—this forum and,
23 um, now I can get to my testimony. I want to first
24 thank Mr. Victor Bach from Community Service Society
25 who keeps me informed. I thank you. Okay, good

2 morning ladies and gentlemen. My name is Crystal
3 Glover and I am a resident of Washington Houses here
4 in Manhattan. I want to thank—well, I already
5 thanked Mr. Victor Martina. I am a former resident
6 association president at Washington Houses in
7 Manhattan and yes, I am running for 2018 presidency.
8 Residents have always shown concerns about the lack
9 of heat and hot water, but 2017 seemed to be the most
10 disturbing. We went without heat and hot water on
11 one of the most important days of the year:
12 Thanksgiving. That was just shocking. No
13 explanation from management, although if I was the
14 president at the time because residents associations
15 are the conduit between and tenants, and when I was
16 on board, my management was Ms. Joseph—Ms. Joseph
17 gave me plenty of time to get up to her and talk with
18 her, et cetera. So, and if that wasn't bad enough we
19 were again inconvenienced Christmas Eve, Christmas
20 Day and half of the day after. I had contacted the
21 TV news and 15 minutes before they got to my
22 apartment the water turned hot. I also went knocking
23 on doors on the 24th of December because I didn't
24 have heat and hot water. I said to myself am I the
25 only one experiencing this or what? I have

2 signatures of residents that went through the same
3 thing. If I may finish because I've been here all
4 day, I am a firm believer in following NYCHA policies
5 and rules. I call the customer contact center
6 including TVs as needed. Tickets be posed often
7 before any maintenance workers come. If they come
8 and cannot gain entrance, there is a ticket they're
9 supposed to leave at the door. I have many tickets
10 that were closed before the work was done. I'm
11 concluding very shortly. Two more paragraphs. Another
12 thing particularly troubling is the amount of
13 residents that complain about no heat and/or hot
14 water on higher floors. My development's buildings
15 are 14 flights high. I live a lower floor. A few
16 friends of mine living on the 13th and 12th and even
17 10th floors complained about water pressure.
18 Sometimes complained about not having water at all.
19 I called Housing Emergency Service many times. I
20 contacted the Manhattan Borough President Gale
21 Brewer's office. I emailed Public Advocate Letitia
22 James. It can be very exhausting running behind
23 NYCHA employees who get paid to do a job, but don't
24 seem to want to work or just don't know what to do.
25 While there are people that work for Housing like

2 Housing Heating Plant Technician Carlos Alvarez who
3 is a very sweet person. He was on vacation
4 incidentally when all our water was cold and we
5 didn't have any heat. He was on vacation—that try
6 and is very nice. We as tenants and residents need
7 more transparency, and inclusion of heat and hot
8 water issues from NYCHA. Thank you once again and
9 have a nice evening.

10 BERTHA AKIN: [off mic] Good afternoon.
11 Can you hear me? [on mic] Good afternoon. My name is
12 Bertha Akin, and first of all, I'm a former resident
13 of public housing. I am presently the Director of
14 Training and Education at Local 237 and I am
15 responsible for training the HPTs. So, if you have
16 any questions about the pipeline, the number of HPTs,
17 I'm the person to ask.

18 CHUCK NORMAN: Good evening everyone. My
19 name is Chuck Norman. I'm here with Bertha Akin. I
20 am currently the Director for the Housing Division at
21 International Brotherhood of Teamsters Local 237. I'm
22 also here with Rube Torres our Vice President. So,
23 prior to joining the Local 237 almost three years
24 ago, I worked for the Housing Authority for 25 years.
25 I started in June 1990, and then April 2015. The

1 first ten years of my career, six as a caretaker, 3
2 as an HPT or Heating Plant Technician civil service
3 publicly, and one as a maintenance worker civil
4 service as well are uniquely relevant to today's
5 hearing. The next 15 years were a combination of
6 civil service, supervisory and middle management
7 roles as follows: As the Assistant Superintendent of
8 Forest Houses 2000-2002; Superintendent of Throggs
9 Neck Houses 2002-2004; Superintendent of Castle Hill
10 '04 to '06; Public Administrator Brooklyn Management,
11 '06 to '07; Public Deputy Director, Brooklyn
12 Management, '07 to 2010; Deputy Director for the
13 Finance and Asset Management Department, 2010 to 2012
14 and Government Finance 2012 to 2015. I was also the
15 Flagship Director for the Outbound (sic) and the Next
16 Gen pilot when I began in January 2015. So, in each
17 of these titles, Civil Service or appointed, I was
18 enjoyed the responsibility an proudly worked for
19 residents in NYCHA at more than half of NYCHA's
20 developments including recently separated Forest
21 Hills Co-ops and the privately managed developments
22 that you heard referred to earlier today. I'm also a
23 former resident of public housing. The rest of
24 friends in which still live in public housing. They
25

1 don't call me because they cannot stick to my-

2 Well, so we are here today on behalf of President

3 Gregory Flores to willfully and actively represent

4 the members and their desire to serve these residents

5 and counter any notion that we are not of one accord

6 with the mission of the Authority, which is to its

7 residents first and foremost, and as I remember to

8 provide safe, clean and decent affordable housing

9 despite recent rebranding for convenience. We

10 apologize. For close to two years now I have

11 attempted to use those very same years of service,

12 experience and interactions to improve the

13 relationship between housing executives, leadership

14 and local 237 for the sole purpose of avoiding days

15 like this for both the residents and our members. The

16 response has been some very token conversations,

17 swipes at the contracts and promotional opportunities

18 of our members and constant allegations that we are

19 not flexible or have prohibitive costs. I can't

20 understand how that statement does not resonate with

21 residents that are one-third of the Authority

22 workforce, but I do think that one day it will add

23 up. Today's conversation about the egregious

24 conditions that residents endure in those so-called

25

2 bomb/cyclones should be a surprise to no one. Over
3 the past 18 months we have tried to speak to, educate
4 and warn officials that their practices may be
5 flawed. We know because the members state to us over
6 and over how are we supposed to provide service to
7 the residents this winter when we don't have what we
8 need? My response is simple: Mother Nature is
9 undefeated, and you will need to rethink this. So,
10 clearly, some of the problems are not caused by the
11 Housing Authority and we are well aware of that.
12 Federal and other funding shortfalls are well
13 documented for more than a—excuse me—more than a
14 decade, but NYCHA has decided for us all to be here
15 by not using and supporting the greatest asset that
16 we feel, which is the workforce of Local 237. There
17 is no racked up potential resource in this case.
18 That is not the choice of the Housing Authority. It
19 is unfair for anyone to imply such, and contradicts
20 the simple and expected premise of agency executives
21 being strategic. For almost two years NYCHA had
22 Local 237 in a holding pattern regarding, according
23 to them the best in class training that we offer
24 members that are seeking promotions in to the Heating
25 Plant Technician title at their request to improve

2 what they claimed were a lack of basic skills that
3 then changed to tool and technical skills and then
4 morphed into high tech skills for new equipment. We
5 paused training and started meeting with NYCHA. We
6 explored suggested and offered every option to
7 improve training from restoration of an advanced
8 program that the agency let die in 2009 that advanced
9 skills for heating plant staff, and paid them \$6,500
10 more than the current heating plant staff makes
11 funded by us in perpetuity from our contract. We
12 asked and got NYCHA to bring their training partners
13 to the table from within the agency and they also
14 brought REES, Department of Resident Empowerment and
15 Economic Sustainability to the table to talk about
16 training. Those folks cooperated with the external
17 organization that test and train residents today for
18 current employment opportunities with NYCHA. They
19 facilitate the training and staging of hundreds of
20 residents for hire at NYCHA. Still, that was not a
21 good enough idea. No staff was replaced as they left
22 and no plan to do so that we know of. Last summer
23 they made intentions clear telling us that
24 privatizing 69 boiler plants was the answer. We
25 reviewed that request, reviewed the industry, and the

2 industry standards and responded that we can do it at
3 half the cost internally including new hires.

4 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Do you mind if I
5 inject?

6 CHUCK NORMAN: Yes, sir.

7 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, I asked NYCHA,
8 as did the Speaker, you know, why did the Housing
9 Authority fail to save the pipeline of trained
10 leading professionals? We-it was a failure to
11 arrange for the issuance of the Civil Service Exam,
12 arrange for the certification for provisionals, and
13 then one of employees at NYCHA testified that the
14 certification was provide by the FDNY.

15 CHUCK NORMAN: Yeah, so--

16 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: But it's provided by
17 Local 237?

18 CHUCK NORMAN: That's correct.

19 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Okay, so why-why
20 would a NYCHA employee in this--

21 CHUCK NORMAN: So, I can talk about that.

22 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Yeah.

23 CHUCK NORMAN: Alright. So, the training
24 that we provide is in hours of community training
25 that is technical in nature for everything that

2 Heating Plant Technicians do. The certification that
3 is in addition to that, that is required by the FDNY,
4 is simply a certification for low-pressure oil-oil
5 burner operators licensing. It's a \$25 exam. You
6 can walk into Metro Tech and take it on any given
7 day, an open book exam. We also recommend that HPTs
8 when they come out of our training or the Civil
9 Service Exam take that and the air compressor tests
10 or exam.

11 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: In order to be a
12 permanent Heating Plant Technician--

13 CHUCK NORMAN: Uh-hm.

14 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: --you would have to
15 pass the Civil Service Exam, go through your training
16 and secure certification?

17 BERTHA AKIN: No, not--our training is
18 before they're eligible to take the Civil Service
19 Exam.

20 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Okay.

21 BERTHA AKIN: They come to our training.
22 Our training usually starts from September to June.
23 They go two nights a week, three hours each night,
24 and then they graduate and then they have a
25 certificate. They can be hired provisionally by

2 NYCHA as an HPT before they take the Civil Service
3 Exam. When the Civil Service Exam is announced, I
4 prepare them for the Civil Service Exam. The last
5 Civil Service Exam was in December of 2015.

6 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: And so to be a
7 provisional, I would have to take the training-

8 BERTHA AKIN: [interposing] The training.

9 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: --and then obtain a
10 certification.

11 BERTHA AKIN: Yes.

12 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, what can NYCHA-
13 our understanding is that the certification class has
14 not been given at all since 2015.

15 BERTHA AKIN: Because they wanted to
16 revamp the program. We've had three meeting since
17 2015 with them with the Labor Relations and NYCHA, at
18 NYCHA to revamp the program, and we had a curriculum
19 meeting in September, so that's why there hasn't been
20 any training because they claim they wanted to change
21 it.

22 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, we're revamping
23 what programs with them?

24 CHUCK NORMAN: They said that they needed
25 additional math and how to prepare forms.

2 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: I'm sorry,
3 additional what?

4 BERTHA AKIN: Math.

5 CHUCK NORMAN: Math, what is that? Oh,
6 on--

7 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: For the conversions
8 of course.

9 CHUCK NORMAN: For regimens and
10 conversions and you convert all oil and gas to CCS or
11 energy burns.

12 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So--so your workers
13 need more--more background in mathematics. So, why not
14 provide training that provides them a greater
15 background in mathematics?

16 BERTHA AKIN: We don't have a problem
17 with that.

18 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Okay. So, what
19 prevents--prevents them from going--that seems like a
20 solvable problem to me.

21 BERTHA AKIN: It is. We already have the
22 program, the curriculum set up, and we're going to
23 start in March. We--I went ahead and decided to start
24 the training without any further input from them
25 because they were dragging their feet.

2 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: And I suspect you
3 were monitoring the exchange between the chairperson
4 and myself about a privatization-

5 BERTHA AKIN: Yes.

6 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: --versus cost. It
7 took me awhile to elicit and answer. I'm not even
8 clear I actually got an answer on the comparative
9 cost effectiveness of privatization-

10 CHUCK NORMAN: Correct.

11 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: --and an
12 expendedness of the labor force. I suspect-I know
13 your position, but do you have any thoughts on that.

14 CHUCK NORMAN: Sure. So, we-when we
15 initially approach a crack this is so provisionals
16 see it and they have to know the fire. We went
17 through that, and we want them to examine things that
18 are being done now. I am aware with my history and
19 the authority of the five places that have been
20 managed by Keyspan for the last 20+ years, and
21 understand it to be the same. For what they have
22 budgeted, we said we can do it at a third to half of
23 what that cost is what it looks like. Simply, why
24 wouldn't we just hire more folks and train them and
25 pay them back.

2 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: And it seems to me,
3 and I didn't—I was not able to explore this in my
4 questioning with NYCHA, but it seems to me a Heating
5 Plant Technician should be regarded as a skilled
6 trade, and it doesn't appear to be.

7 CHUCK NORMAN: So, it's on--

8 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: It-it has like
9 limited—there's no continuity.

10 BERTHA AKIN: Okay.

11 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: It's poorly paid.
12 It's one notch above a caretaker.

13 CHUCK NORMAN: Uh-hm.

14 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: It doesn't—I feels
15 like it should be a skilled trades position, but it's
16 treated as a lower level position. Is that an
17 accurate observation?

18 CHUCK NORMAN: So, it—I would say to some
19 extent yes. I worked in that title as well. It's a
20 very scientific title, and it is a way out of being a
21 caretaker. Therefore, it is an endless amount of
22 folks that you can—that always want to not be
23 caretakers, right and move up. So, the other side of
24 that is in heating you can maintenance work in the
25

2 heating. You can be an assistant super in heating as
3 well. You don't have to trip out of heating--

4 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Yeah.

5 CHUCK NORMAN: --as you would trip out of
6 the title, and there was a program in place where we
7 paid HPTs a differential of \$6,500 more. It was
8 called an advance HPT program--training program. So,
9 they made \$6,500 more than just the typical HPT,
10 right because they had advanced skills, and
11 specialized ability.

12 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: And because I feel
13 like there's a difference between someone who is
14 applying to be an HPT because you want to--you no
15 longer want to be a caretaker versus someone who is
16 immersing himself or herself in the science of where
17 are the mains.

18 CHUCK NORMAN: Correct.

19 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: And it's not clear,
20 which is more common.

21 CHUCK NORMAN: I think that there's many
22 that are more common. (sic)

23 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Whether we're
24 treating it with the prestige that we should treat it
25 with.

2 CHUCK NORMAN: Absolutely. Um, yeah I
3 have questions. I don't know if you have--
4 [background comments]

5 CRYSTAL GLOVER: If it's possible, can I
6 say one more thing? Our maintenance managerial, Sir
7 Torres, our Management Offices, as you know, we have
8 this locked box thing that we mail in our rent, et
9 cetera. Here at Washington Houses when I was in
10 office, we had--there was the RFP, Request for
11 Proposal for the infill, and on my watch as leader we
12 were able to knock that out of the box at Washington
13 Houses. I was here--I can remember I was here in
14 Chambers back in 2013 the day before the freedom of
15 my daughter. That's how concerned I am about mixing
16 houses. I'm a project girl. My mother was a leader.
17 She did the same thing grassroots. Our management
18 offices, like I said, these RAs got to step up again.
19 The membership has to challenge these RAs, and
20 because NYCHA says it's independent and democratic so
21 they can't intervene in a resident engagement. My
22 point being that these management offices when we
23 didn't have heat and hot water, mind you, this has
24 been going on since like '89 with some the education
25 home ware. Once they got rid of those chainlinks

2 that was around the grass, and they put those heavy
3 metal bars on continuing education, all the rules
4 went out the window, and so I'm saying that to say
5 what? Our management offices when we brought it to
6 their attention at the monthly meeting, she was
7 oblivious to what was going on in terms of no heat,
8 hot water Thanksgiving, Christmas Eve, Christmas Day
9 and the day after that, et cetera. So our management
10 even though they're already presidents, they can—they
11 can—they're the conduit between management and
12 tenant, and so hopefully, I'll get back in because we
13 can sit her and talk about NYCHA is as long as the
14 day is long. We got good people like this sister here
15 who give her life. I gave my life. We got Ms.
16 Blackwell. There's so many of us, and we need to
17 know how the City Council is going to represent us.
18 You asked us here. You want money. They have money.
19 I heard a prophet say once: Provision is in the
20 house. Why you got to always be begging and asking
21 for money when the provision is in the house.
22 There's something very wrong when we sit home
23 freezing. I don't care if you was on welfare. I
24 don't care what it is, but something's not right, and
25 we—I'm going to say one more thing.

2 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Yes, very quickly.

3 CRYSTAL GLOVER: Because I'm going to
4 tell you something, Mr. Torres, I am at my—I am at
5 the point where I say I'm about to become a Jehovah's
6 Witness because they prepare for the hereafter.
7 They're telling us there's no hope here. If should
8 only be enough, and the people who work for NYCHA was
9 here supposedly had all the information, all the
10 dotted Is and crossed Ts, they couldn't tell us why
11 we didn't have heat and hot water. Something wrong
12 with that picture.

13 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Yeah.

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: I agree.

15 CRYSTAL GLOVER: I'm not getting paid for
16 being here. These people that want salaries, they
17 get a good one. I don't know what you all did to
18 earn that. I'm here for free, and I'm tough. Thank
19 you.

20 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Thank you, thank
21 you. One—actually one more question for, um, the end
22 here. You know, I pointed out during the exchange
23 with the Chairperson that even a boiler dated back to
24 1950. It is outperforming much younger boilers and
25 it's largely attributable to boiler maintenance,

2 which tells me that the--the lack of quality
3 maintenance is very bit as much a problem if not more
4 than the actual obsolescence of the age of the
5 boilers. And so my question to you is why is boiler
6 maintenance so lacking in public housing? Is it
7 because we're chronically understaffed or is there a
8 lack of skills?

9 CHUCK NORMAN: I think the answer is both
10 legitimately.

11 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Okay.

12 CHUCK NORMAN: I think that--I think that
13 the lack of staff and the drop in staff over the last
14 seven to ten years, right, forces folks to be
15 stretched beyond what they can actually deploy
16 without a skill. You were constantly--and working--
17 working that way you are constantly sending your best
18 people to the hottest fire, and that's where they're
19 going to live, and so every time a boiler plant goes
20 down, speaking of this as a syndrome, right, those
21 folks are going to be there, and less skilled people
22 are going to be out somewhere, but that fire is just
23 raging and rising and becoming more serious and you--
24 So, what they ended up doing is chasing down work
25 orders.

2 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, boosting the-the
3 staffing device is great for these, but there not
4 always resource there. How do you close the skills
5 gap? Like what--?

6 CHUCK NORMAN: The training, the
7 training.

8 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Like what training.

9 CHUCK NORMAN: There--there--there is
10 training. I mean--

11 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] Yes,
12 but--but these--the workers, these workers have
13 received their training by virtue of being--

14 CHUCK NORMAN: Yes.

15 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Heating Plant
16 Technicians.

17 CHUCK NORMAN: Uh-hm.

18 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Do they need more
19 training beyond what you're presently offering?

20 CHUCK NORMAN: So, I would say that they
21 do need more training beyond where they are for
22 things that are going to be moving forward in terms
23 of the technology in these types of boiler plants.
24 You heard one of them mentioned, personnel say that
25 this stuff has not really changed much, ese large

2 fire-tube, water tube boilers they—they absolutely
3 have not.

4 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: But it sounds like
5 there's something acknowledgement, that the training
6 you offer is a starting point without an end point,
7 but there should be advanced training.

8 CHUCK NORMAN: Absolutely.

9 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Okay, and have you
10 had conversations with NYCHA for the purpose with an
11 eye toward creating more of these frames?

12 CHUCK NORMAN: So, we—we both have had
13 our conversations, and reminded them that in the past
14 when that very same thing came up and there—there was
15 a need for more advanced training for a mechanic type
16 training, specialist type training, we collaborated
17 and did that successfully for several years running,
18 and we paid for it. We—we split the cost.

19 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: But in the present
20 with the present Administration and NYCHA?

21 CHUCK NORMAN: Yes.

22 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: And we had
23 conversations regarding advanced training for boiler
24 technicians, and what have been the results of those
25 conversations?

2 CHUCK NORMAN: So, I mean I think what
3 the answer to that is we have had those conversations
4 for the better part of 6, 7, 8 eight months now, and
5 they have not progressed very much at all.

6 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: And—and, where—this
7 is probably speculation on your part, but I'd be
8 curious to hear your thinking. Do you sense the
9 resistance from NYCHA is concern for a lack of
10 resources or they're just—they want to privatize
11 eventually all the--?

12 CHUCK NORMAN: So, I think that the--
13 They obviously have a statement on privatization. I
14 think you heard them say that they are doing this.
15 Not that we intend to put a bid forth, because we do,
16 we're absolutely expecting to—to put a bid forth to
17 counter it because we know that we can do it for less
18 money, and just as good and in comparison to what is
19 happening. What they're using as the model--

20 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] Are
21 you participating in the BID?

22 CHUCK NORMAN: We—we absolutely are, yes.
23 There's a provision our--

24 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] I mean
25 judging by the Chair's testimony, we get it. (sic)

2 CHUCK NORMAN: [interposing] I-I know it.
3 I understand. We feel the same way. It sound moot
4 but we will participate in the BID and hope that in
5 good faith we are able to go forward responsibly for
6 our-One of the responses was it is not an exercise in
7 fiscal restraint that this is a service enhancement
8 initiative. It wasn't around money, which we-we find
9 hard to understand. Our commitment is to keep the
10 cost low, but do the work and provide the training,
11 you know, and respond the right way. So, if there
12 are things learned from those 20 years with those
13 other folks, the advisable thing in my estimation and
14 my experience that the place would be to go and
15 assess that and pass it onto your current workforce
16 because if you bring in private contractors that do
17 something well, and they've been there that long, and
18 folks are kind just willing to look at, there are all
19 kinds of ways for us to pass those things on
20 especially if your systems are not very different at
21 all.

22 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Thank you for
23 testimony.

24 CHUCK NORMAN: You're very welcome.

25 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: I don't have
3 any more questions. Thank you. Thank you so much.

4 CHUCK NORMAN: Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And next we'll
6 hear from our Manhattan Borough President, Madam
7 President Gale Brewer. [pause]

8 GALE BREWER: Okay. So, good afternoon.
9 I'm Gale Brewer, Manhattan Borough President and I
10 want to thank the Chair Ampry-Samuel, Chair Torres
11 and the Speaker, and all of you for being here, and I
12 appreciate the Speaker for being here for such a long
13 time because that's not usual. Thank you all. So,
14 I'm just going to summarize. I have the material
15 being passed out, but I know it's late. I know,
16 you've heard a lot and you know a lot. Amelia
17 Rosario Rodriguez has been working on NYCHA for the
18 past 20 years, and they write about I don't know,
19 500, 700 letters a year if not more to NYCHA on
20 different topics, and we try really hard to work with
21 the residents in the Borough of Manhattan. Just
22 recently during the cold spell in Manhattan, we had
23 service failures in at least 14 developments, some of
24 which you've heard about today, and the ones—the
25 large ones you know about, but I just want to mention

2 something that may or may or not have come up today,
3 which is the scatter site issue. So, I have in
4 Council District I have 14 brownstones. PS 139 is an
5 old school. These are considered scatter site, and
6 there are no—everything from cabinet to floor there
7 is no hardware available at NYCHA. So, in addition,
8 we know that we're fixing the windows. At least I
9 think you heard that from NYCHA, but are you going to
10 fix the school windows, which are bigger than the
11 windows in City Hall? So, I'm just saying as we
12 talked about, that site's are bigger because it's an
13 old school, and the wind comes in. So, I don't care
14 how much heat you have, the wind is going to continue
15 to come in. Weatherization is not going to cut it.
16 So, when you have scatter site situation, it doesn't
17 look anything like a NYCHA building and they don't
18 have right size materials. I just want to throw that
19 out as we're talking about making sure that NYCHA
20 does that it's supposed to do. I do want to thank
21 Vito Mustaciuolo, just like everybody else. If he
22 can't pull this off, nobody can, and he's—to me he's
23 the best public servant in the United States and I
24 think we all agree with that. And I also just want
25 to thank also just generally the staff has been very

2 responsive, but when you don't have the funds, and
3 you hear about some of these other issues, it's
4 really, really hard to address. I think that in the
5 cold period in December and January the grounds draft
6 in Manhattan tried to resolve in Manhattan alone over
7 10,000 heat and hot water tickets. That's a lot. We
8 know, as you've heard earlier, that the Band-Aid
9 fixes are very different than the long-term
10 solutions, and I think to the credit of the City
11 Council, you're trying to find long-term solutions.
12 We do know because the staff and I have been doing it
13 for a long time. We have a lot of friends who work
14 for NYCHA. I'm not going to mention them all, but
15 without--the \$200 million is great, but it's not
16 going to be able to deal with all of the challenges.
17 It's \$82 million allocated to replace 39 boilers. In
18 104 buildings, you need more. The Borough President
19 of the Bronx I know you heard earlier from his staff
20 in February we wrote a letter to NYCHA listing all
21 the different challenges and how we see them. I want
22 to say what can we do? One of the problems I heard
23 earlier as a data person myself, Open Data Bill and
24 so on, having passed. I understood today that you're
25 going to find a CCC to be compatible with 311. Right

2 now there has been no indication that that is
3 possible. We have—with all the community boards in
4 Manhattan I have board stats and every 311 data is on
5 a graph in real times for every community board in
6 Manhattan. So, for 311 data, every community board
7 has access to it. It's broken down and we put it on
8 a graph for noise, for potholes or heat and hot
9 water, but we cannot do that for NYCHA because
10 there's what I call a firewall. So, if it's possible
11 to get that data, and make it compatible or have a
12 311 system that works with both, that would be a huge
13 step in the right direction.

14 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing]
15 Although, Madam Borough President, I—I believe the
16 Chairperson testified or someone testified in NYCHA
17 that CCC and 311 were compatible.

18 GALE BREWER: That's what I'm saying, but
19 we don't see the data. I don't have the—the 311--

20 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing]
21 Alright, okay.

22 GALE BREWER: --data or CCC. So, if
23 they're compatible, that's fine, but are they being
24 used to do any kind of analysis for the community.
25 Example: With my data on board East Harlem where

1 there's a lot of NYCHA, you see all of the data
2 available for heat and hot water, but nothing from
3 NYCHA. So, it's not in the 311 system. It's
4 separate. So, if it's compatible, why isn't it in
5 the platform? And that will be my question. The
6 other thing that I want to mention about what to do
7 is we want to talk about NextGen. I have La Guardia
8 and Holmes. Holmes being the one that's most
9 challenging, a developer market, and affordable, but
10 it's a very tall building. I don't think the
11 community was asked in way that really gave them the
12 opportunity to come up with some suggestions as to
13 what the money should go for. We have to be really,
14 really careful, and I do want with any Next Gen to
15 have it be a ULURP. If you're building on the ground
16 any kind of infill, it should be ULURP because it is
17 not something that NYCHA alone should decide. I want
18 to also mention the RAD Program, the process is not
19 transparent. People have a lot of concerns about
20 because they have no clue as to what exactly it means
21 to them personally. I want to just mention
22 technology again. There is something called Low Rock
23 and a lot of technology mounts are Heat Seek and
24 other start-ups where you can under Heat Seek you can
25

1 measure the heat. Under other start-ups you can
2 measure the mold, and they both being piloted in the
3 city of New York. The question is who's looking at
4 the data? What are they doing about it? It's real
5 time. How is it being analyzed? We've got to find a
6 way of doing that on a real time basis. All of these
7 start-ups are able to deal with the concrete walls of
8 NYCHA. They are not wireless. They have gone with
9 repeaters, and it's a way to make sure that the
10 tenants have real time information. So, in summary,
11 I want to say that we obviously have to figure out
12 how to deal with the retrofits and energy efficiency
13 upgrades. That's what you've been focusing on today.
14 I want to make sure that we're doing the NexGen that
15 ULURP. I think it should be 100% affordable, but if
16 not, at least the cost, the amount of revenue coming
17 in should pay for the needs of that development.
18 That is not true with homes. And then finally, the
19 Fund for Public Housing could be used to crowd for
20 some of these more innovative technology suggestions
21 to see if they can move at least information and data
22 about the hot-the heat and hot water issues that are
23 not fair to tenants in terms of what is going on in
24 their building. Thank you. Congratulations on this
25

1 hearing and I look forward to working with you.

2 Thank you very much.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Thank you, Madam
5 Borough President.

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Next, we'll
7 hear from Beatrice Desandra--DeSandro, Charlene
8 Nimmons with Public Housing Communities,
9 Incorporated; Danielle--Daniel Krisman; and Mildred
10 Martinez.

11 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Looks like Vito
12 wants to go again on behalf of NYCHA. Maybe he wants
13 a second round. [background comments]

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, I know--
15 okay, I see Charlene Nimmons, Beatrice DeSandro,
16 Mildred Martinez or Daniel Krisman. [background
17 comments] Okay. Dr. Fellani, Leah Brooks, Robert
18 Winago, Agnes Rivera, Agnes Rivera, Robert Winago.
19 Okay. Lera Brooks from Throggs Neck and Dr. Fellani.
20 Daniel Karpen, Curly Santos, Rose Clifton, Esther
21 Devore.

22 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Karen Blondel.

23 [pause]

24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And please,
25 just remember to repeat your name before your

2 testimony, and I beg you to be within two minutes.

3 Thank you.

4 DANIEL KARPEN: My name is Daniel Karpen.
5 I am a professional engineer. I do energy
6 conservation engineering. My address is 3 Harbor
7 Hill Drive, Huntington, New York. I came to this
8 hearing because I found about two years ago that NYPA
9 build-NYCHA buildings typically use twice as much
10 energy per square foot as similar buildings in the
11 private sector. The reason for that is that NYPA
12 has-NYCHA has oversized central heating plants that
13 are expensive to operate. These plants were designed
14 when the buildings had single glazed windows. I'm not
15 sure if NYPA-NYCHA has upgraded all of its plant
16 heating-buildings to double glazing, but the
17 testimony today indicates that a lot of the windows
18 still leak an enormous amount of air. We could save
19 an enormous of energy at NYCHA by going to passive
20 construction, i.e., R7 triple glazed windows, six
21 inches of non-flammable insulation applied to the
22 exterior of the building to insulate it, and NYCHA
23 buildings typically have no insulation. The R value
24 of the walls are about R4. We can increase that to
25 about R30 and insulate the roof, put in better

1 windows. We'll be able to cut the heating costs of
2 NYCHA buildings by 80%. Also, to segment out the
3 separate domestic hot water systems and using-
4 condensing gas boilers would be the most efficient
5 way. Also, the pipes-I've been hearing about pipe
6 free-ups in NYPA build-NYCHA buildings. The reason
7 is they don't have adequate pipe insulation. When I
8 write insulation specifications and engineer for
9 insulating pipes, I want three inches of fiberglass
10 insulation around them. I've also applied for a
11 number of jobs at NYPA-at NYCHA. They haven't hired
12 me yet. I'm giving a list of those jobs that I've
13 applied for as part of the hearing record. Do you
14 have any questions of me?

16 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Let's just say, I-
17 I-I don't know if you were here for my opening
18 statement, but I can assure you that a recommendation
19 from you is the kiss of death at NYCHA (laughter) So,
20 if you want a job, I don't think you should give them
21 your resume.

22 DANIEL KARPEN: If-if NYCHA wants to hire
23 me as an energy conservation engineer, I'm available-

24 -

25

2 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] Would
3 you be the public housing committee?

4 DANIEL KAPREN: --and I have submitted
5 applications for which they--which I've still applied
6 for.

7 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: I hear there's a
8 vacancy at HPD. [laughter]

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you.

10 ROBERT ROLLENDORF: [off mic] My name is--
11 [on mic] My name is Robert Rollendorf (sp?) I've been
12 a resident of NYCHA for 60 years, and I've seen
13 things coming and going either way you want to look
14 at it. I'll give you one example of the last few
15 years. Before the Sandy came to destroy the Lower
16 East Side, we had--NYCHA had replaced all the pipes,
17 all the steel pipes and everything else supposedly to
18 provide heating to our development to avoid that.
19 And guess what, we didn't have the heat--the heating
20 the last two weeks. It was on and off. Second--
21 second of all, is--there is a problem with--I go to the
22 NYCHA meetings occasionally for the last ten years,
23 and there's always a questionable contrary to be into
24 things or avoid it, which I objected to, and some of
25 them were cancelled. You're more like \$400 million

1 of questionable expenditures promoted by NYCHA
2 management. I don't know where they're come up with
3 those things unless they're given the right to
4 promoted something that's not worth-worth them doing.
5 Now, the-the last thing is I wanted to say is within
6 our metropolitan area, we have 15 million people.
7 You mean we cannot find 300 qualified boiler
8 maintenance people? We have elevators that break
9 every other week. I mean where is NYCHA's
10 responsibility to hire the right people? This is not
11 a matter of management to just-most likely they go
12 there to pick up their paychecks and they do nothing
13 else besides that. So, the problem is deeper than we
14 certainly anticipate, and we should look into it
15 because the City Council is together with HUD is
16 responsible for the wellbeing of 600,000 people, and
17 I think that you do-you're doing the right thing to
18 examining the operations of NYCHA, which need to be
19 examined like deeper than just superficial blah, blah
20 blah blah blah, you know, like we heard from the
21 Chairman. Thank you so much, and I hope you really
22 look into it.

23
24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you,
25 thank you. The next person.

2 KAREN BLONDEL: Thank you. Good
3 afternoon. I'm Karen Blondel and I'm representing the
4 Gowanus Neighborhood Coalition for Justice. It is a
5 group out of the Fifth Avenue Committee, a 39-year-
6 old community development organization in South
7 Brooklyn. I also have a-a group called Turning the
8 Tide, which educates public housing residents on
9 environmental issues both indoors and outdoors in
10 regards to their environment. So, a lot of the
11 things were asked here. So, I'm not going to go into
12 the letter. I did deliver it-copies, at least plenty
13 for everyone here, and please take note that there is
14 a picture from the weekend of January 15 when the
15 Gowanus residents had to go outside and actually get
16 water because their tank on top of their building had
17 frozen, and burst and all the water cascaded down the
18 stairs and they had to turn off their actual water.
19 So, they had no water, and these were elderly people
20 who had to go out and get water from a truck. I want
21 you also to know that most of the demographics for
22 public housing we're all getting older. There are a
23 lot of elderly there, and they're on fixed incomes,
24 and a lot of them are paying over \$1,000 for their
25 apartments. So, it's-it's very important that we

2 take care of the elderly in public housing. I'd also
3 like to give you a little texture around some of this
4 stuff that you heard. When we talk about the-the
5 Energy Performance Contract, we looked at the map of
6 the outages in Brooklyn, and the-where that \$200
7 million is going, and it's not going to any of the
8 developments that I'm representing here today. I'm
9 representing Gowanus Houses, Wyckoff, Warren, Red
10 Hook East and West, and none of them are getting
11 that, but for Red Hook and Gowanus Houses, they are
12 getting FEMA money. Now, with FEMA, with the FEMA
13 money let me explain something that Bomee taught me
14 from NYCHA. The old boilers were manual. So, they
15 hire people from a back to work program back in the
16 '80s and they were doing manual labor, which is okay
17 without a high school diploma. But now going forward
18 into the-to the new systems, you do need to know more
19 math, and you have to be able to write reports
20 because you'll be looking at the sensors that they're
21 going to now place inside of the building where it's
22 on the-- You know, in the past we took temperatures
23 from the outside of the building. So, it was 30
24 degrees outside, the heat just kept going up in the
25 building, kept going up in the building and it

2 wouldn't stop. Once you bring in the controls inside
3 of the buildings, now that person who is monitoring
4 the heat can say, hey, the—the heat has reached the
5 sixth floor. It's a 80 degrees. Let's start cooling
6 this building down because we're wasting a lot of
7 money by having our window open. The other thing,
8 when he talks about windows, there is a problem with
9 the windows because you have to pull them up like
10 this. The balances, you can look at any public
11 housing—I'm looking at this, the balances are skewed.
12 They're off centered, and that's where a lot of the
13 heat is leaving and coming in and as well as exchange
14 of air. So, these are things that I want to bring to
15 your attention. I want to sit down and talk to you.
16 As part of the initiative that we have in Red Hook
17 and Gowanus, I think that we can make a lot of good
18 recommendations that's based on our experience and
19 the fact that some of us in public housing do have
20 backgrounds in engineering. We can do blueprints.
21 We can turn valves, you know. So, we want to help,
22 and I think it's a joint effort by all of us. Thank
23 you.

24 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: But we—we have to
25 hire him first.

2 KAREN BLONDEL: Yes. [laughs] Thank you.

3 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And then he
4 has to bring in 30% of new light. [laughs]

5 KAREN BLONDEL: Yeah, okay.

6 CHARLENE NIMMONS: My name Charlene
7 Nimmons, Alikca, I'm so proud of you. We all are
8 council. In fact, back in the days she wasn't always
9 in Brownsville and doing work. She was always
10 Downtown Brooklyn and all across the city. Ritchie,
11 you know I love you. He's always all over the place,
12 too, Brooklyn and everywhere else. [laughs] So, I
13 just want to say thank you guys and congratulations
14 for your new positions. So, quickly, though, I-I
15 gave in an op-ed that I-I did and it was-as soon as
16 the cold weather hit, I'm thinking oh, my God, here
17 we go. They're going to start pointing the fingers.
18 They're going to, you know, start screaming this one
19 did that one, and no I didn't do it-I didn't do it.
20 But, I'm not going to go through the whole process,
21 but I heard some things there that today really
22 there's too much lying going on. I stood up and I
23 went over today with Christian and he was here a
24 minute ago. There you go, and I said go over there
25 and kick them under the table because they're not

2 telling the truth. We do not all get robocalls, and
3 when you find out what those calls, when they give
4 you that information, please find out if it's the
5 robocalls for rent, if it's the robocalls for
6 activity that's happening, or if it's robocalls of
7 energy issues or if it's robocalls because you closed
8 out a ticket. The app does not work. So they talked
9 about the apps, that's how they communicate. Every
10 time I had an outage in White Horse, I never knew
11 when I looked at my app. So, clearly, there are some
12 issues, and I'm tired of talking to the Housing
13 Authority and saying to them, listen guys, you know,
14 we—we—we're in the trench. We know what's going on.
15 How can we work together? And then they make up
16 these excuses. I'm really getting tired of the
17 excuses. So, I went off my message of what I wanted
18 to read, but I also want to make sure that you know
19 that attached is a letter that we're circulating and
20 we're asking resident leaders to sign, and we're
21 submitting to you. We're talking about these
22 conversions. That means that there's going to be a
23 high demand on gas, and it's not only a mandate that
24 is among the private sector, but now we're talking
25 about bringing on the public housing onto this. We

2 have to look at supply, and the northeastern
3 enhancement-supply enhancement project is coming to
4 New York City or wants to come to New York and that
5 letter is saying please--

6 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: What is that?

7 CHARLENE NIMMONS: It's called the North-
8 the Northeast Supply Enhancement. They're suppliers
9 for National Grid, and National Grid is saying that
10 there is going to be a major demand because of the-
11 the laws that are being passed and the increase of
12 supply that they need to do this project. So, it's
13 outlined in here also. Also, the-the costing, when
14 we talk about energy efficiency, he's so correct. I
15 mean we get heat constantly, right, and Wyckoff, and
16 we have outages as well. So, we are part of that,
17 but what when we do get heat, it's constant. It does
18 not go down. It's burning up. We have to open the
19 windows. However, when it's a windy condition, you
20 don't have to open up the windows because the wind is
21 going to come in, and it's going to drop the
22 temperature in the apartments. So, it's just a waste
23 of heat. So, even if we get these boiler systems up
24 and running, we've got to do an energy efficiency
25 initiative that's got to be connected to this.

2 There's also ways that we could wrap buildings. There
3 are things that can be done and with a savings. With
4 the savings there should be a system set in place
5 that is not only going to be about doing the
6 conversions to the gas and putting in new boilers,
7 but there's got to be a system in place that is going
8 to keep the heat inside rather than losing it. I
9 think that's it. Okay, Alicka.

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you. I
11 don't have any questions for the panel.

12 DANIEL KARPEN: Any questions of any of
13 us.

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: No, we—no
15 questions. Thank you so much for the information.

16 DANIEL KARPEN: No problem. Just have to
17 figure it out.

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And next we'll
19 hear from

20 DANIEL KARPEN: Passive House is the way
21 to go.

22 FEMALE MALE: It will be a bad thing, but
23 go do it.

24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Dorothy Gray,
25 Ms. Sherry Scheiber.

2 FEMALE SPEAKER: She's not there. They
3 left.

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Ms. Williams
5 from Sedgwick Houses, Ramon Cordero, Ramon Cordero.
6 [pause] Ms. Carrie Jackson from Fury. (sic) Agatha
7 Campbell, Miriam Cordon-Miriam Cordon, Roxanne Reed,
8 Roxanne Reed, Diana Blackwell, Diana Blackwell.

9 Okay. [background comments, pause] And this should
10 be the last panel. Am I missing anyone? This should
11 be the last panel? These are all the cards that I
12 have.

13 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: I don't see anyone
14 else.

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, and
16 please state your name. [background comments,
17 laughter]

18 DIANA BLACKWELL: Good afternoon. My name
19 is Diana Blackwell, and I want to do greetings to
20 Chair-Chairman Torres and Chairwoman Samuel, and all
21 the other honored members. I would like to just read
22 two letters. So, this would be pretty simple. The
23 first one is from a-a president of a senior building
24 who can't be here. She's just coming out of the
25 hospital, but she is over the PS 139 conversion in

1 Central Harlem, and she reads: Dear Oversight
2 Committee, my name is Audrey Clemmons, and I'm
3 president of NYCHA PS 139 Conversion, Senior
4 Development. On December 18, 2017, the boilers
5 completely went out on all 125 units on both the
6 north and south sides of the building. This is an
7 old building. Former Middle School PS 139 Central
8 Harlem between 7th Avenue and Lennox Avenue. The
9 history of the building states that all of the
10 original equipment is still intact because they've
11 never been replaced including the windows.
12 Conversion date is unknown. It was only after
13 countless numbers of complaints and the assistance of
14 Councilman Bill Perkins' office did the boilers and-
15 get repaired, and the heat restored. Since that
16 time, our seniors, who are most vulnerable to
17 sickness, sit and hope that this won't happen again.
18 We look forward to the day that the boilers will be
19 replaced so that we won't live in the fear that we
20 will suffer another cold spell, and face
21 hospitalization or a long illness. Signed Ms.
22 Clemmons. Now, the second letter is from myself.
23 Again, Oversight Committee. My name is Diana
24 Blackwell, and I'm the President of Fred Samuel
25

1 Apartments in NYCHA. Pleased forgive me for two of
2 them. I'm here on behalf of my 40 buildings in
3 Central Harlem, which the majority have low heat or
4 no heat. This problem has escalated to the point
5 that many of our residents have successfully reached
6 out to a television station, and we have their—have
7 successfully reached out to a television station, and
8 have had their complaints aired. Their problem got
9 fixed while others I'm working on, and with our
10 management and to get a resolution. But without the
11 boiler replacements, these problems are only a
12 temporary fix, that is a Band-Aid on a long and aging
13 problem. These are non-traditional NYCHA buildings
14 that were purchased in the late '90s. Of the 40
15 buildings, I cannot testify that any of them to this
16 day have been replaced. Therefore, due to the age of
17 these boilers, they are in need of replacement. If
18 they are 20 years then they—if they're 20 years old,
19 then they have passed their normal life expectancy,
20 and the equipment of this caliber have the need to be
21 replaced. To my knowledge, there is no preventive
22 maintenance performed in the summer to assess the
23 future need of the equipment. So, when winter is
24 upon us, the boilers break down, and there is a
25

2 minimal staff to repair them in a timely manner.
3 Given the age of the boilers, when it stops, the
4 order time for the broken parts takes longer because
5 it's no longer in stock or must be ordered from a
6 distant place. This keeps the tenants waiting longer
7 than it should be for repair. What is not recognized
8 in the complaints at Fred Samuel is that here the
9 electricity is paid by the tenants separately. Many
10 of the seniors have expressed that they were using
11 the oven with the water on top, but when it comes
12 down to using their heaters, they would rather not
13 because it will drive up their Con Ed bill. In other
14 words, they must make a choice between being cold or
15 finances. There is not enough money for the
16 following month's medicine or food. This is
17 unacceptable. The lack of federal funding is
18 understood, but failing to prevent what is fixed upon
19 demand is not. It is my hope that there is an
20 immediate change to the current practices that get a
21 repair done when brought to the forefront, when
22 pressured from the media. Prioritizing preventive
23 maintenance is a must, and in all seasons a necessity
24 tool while waiting for the replacement boilers. My
25 hope is that this is taken seriously into

2 consideration for the future. On behalf of the 40
3 buildings, representing over 1,600 residents, we ask
4 for you advice and assistance with the problem. It
5 is greatly appreciated on behalf of the Fed Samuel
6 residents, and I think you the committee for allowing
7 the voice and concerns to be represented and heard.

8 CARRIE JACKSON: [off mic] Good evening.
9 I'm Carrie Jackson. [background comments] I'm
10 Carrie Jackson. I'm a member Fury, and a board
11 member of the Board of Facts and I'm a former NYCHA
12 resident. I'm a former HPD employee who signed off on
13 J-51. I'm a former HPD employee who did dwellings,
14 small dwellings, and I stayed, and that design, I see
15 NYCHA talking about replacing the boilers. Is that
16 to include-is that including a vaccum steam tank.
17 It's only to some of them, but it is never in their
18 statements. Their statements because they operate
19 separate-the boilers, they're replacing the boiler.
20 They have it in the picture, but I don't trust NYCHA,
21 but are they replacing the vacuum steam tank that is
22 nor working properly. That is what is generating the
23 extra steam, the vac-the boiler water-the vacuum
24 steam tank is overheating. It's eating up the
25 electrical wiring. It's eating out the telephone

2 wiring that's causing the residents not to have
3 telephone service from Verizon, which you are forced
4 to go to the cable company. It's also eating—if it
5 eats up the telephone lines, it's eating out the
6 intercoated (sic) group. That means the doors are
7 don't remain working that people come in insecurely.
8 That's what I'm saying. Second, the only way that I
9 found that you can get around a 311 call to NYCHA, if
10 you call 311 for NYCHA, they refer you to the center
11 or something down there, but you have to tell there
12 is—you have to tell them that you want to do an
13 agency complaint. They may take a while. They go
14 and then they take your information. Then they—then
15 they take you through this long process that is to
16 get a letter from Quality Control. You get a letter
17 from the district—the borough office, the management
18 office, and saying that--

19 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] Thank
20 you so much for your—thank you so much your
21 testimony. There are people in front of you.

22 CARRIE JACKSON: And one other thing.

23 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Yeah, one more
24 thing, yes.

25 CARRIE JACKSON: Okay, with homes--

2 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: I'm sorry, the what?

3 CARRIE JACKSON: With homes.

4 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: The homes?

5 CARRIE JACKSON: Like the homes. I know
6 you have a problem here. They focus at doing it at a
7 loss. There's no--they broker to do it at a loss. For
8 the next money that they need to repair, but they--
9 before they the sucks from you, the state and
10 everything else. All of these developments that are
11 coming into the--

12 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] Ma'am.

13 CARRIE JACKSON: --need financial and
14 legal advice. How with all these degrees, these
15 advanced degrees, and they teach you how to do a
16 deal. How do you broker a deal at a loss, and
17 secondly accountability is needed. That is most
18 important. If we do not have that accountability,
19 everything is going to fail.

20 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: And we need to move
21 on, but very quickly, we've--we've done it and we
22 actually did a hearing Holmes regarding NYCHA's
23 Infill Program, and I know Ben Kallos has been
24 focusing on it doing the details of the program, and
25 has been on top of it. So--

2 CARRIE JACKSON: So, you're going to
3 protect all of the residents, all of the developments

4 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: And the other
5 Council Member who is aggressive in advocating for
6 his residents, absolutely.

7 CARRIE JACKSON: Okay.

8 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Thank you.

9 DOROTHY GRAY: Hi, my name is Dorothy
10 Gray, and I'm here speaking on the part of Mike
11 Golden (sic) especially from the elders—elder people
12 that live in my building.

13 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Which building do
14 you live in?

15 DOROTHY GRAY: 107 West 109th Street,
16 Morningside Heights. Okay, first of all, I am on the
17 Tenant Neighborhood Board, and since I've been on the
18 Tenant Neighborhood Board, we haven't been having a
19 lot of heat. I called 311, okay, and they came in to
20 my apartment, but there was on the outside there was
21 ice on my window. It had froze up the window so the
22 windows couldn't come up. So, I went upstairs to
23 this—this elder man. He's 90—almost 100 years old.
24 He was sitting there with his coat, and his coat and-

2 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] Is
3 this—is this a NYCHA property? Do you—do you live in
4 public housing or private housing?

5 DOROTHY GRAY: I live in HUD House.

6 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Okay, is NYCHA your
7 landlord. Who's your landlord?

8 DOROTHY GRAY: My landlord—oh, well,
9 listen, they just changed to a new landlord.

10 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: It sounds like you
11 live in—because you said to one. It sounds like you
12 live in private housing. So, if you have--

13 DOROTHY GRAY: No, it's a private house.
14 I live in a private housing and that's HUD.

15 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Okay. so we should
16 just get your information, and if there were heat or
17 hot water complaints, actually--

18 DOROTHY GRAY: [interposing] They—that
19 and listen, that's all I'm saying. Then they--

20 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing] So,
21 right behind you--

22 DOROTHY GRAY: Huh?

23 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, right behind you
24 is—is—is Vito Mustaciuolo who--

2 DOROTHY GRAY: Well, I've never seen him
3 before. He looks weird to me.(sic) [laughs]

4 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: That's--that's true
5 of most of the city, right.

6 DOROTHY GRAY: What?

7 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: But he went--so, the
8 inspectors who come to your apartment all of them
9 report to him.

10 DOROTHY GRAY: They--they came to my house
11 and this is not the first time, and there was ice on
12 the panes of my windows now on the inside.

13 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: So, it's--it's out-
14 out--it's out of topic, but we can--we can follow up on
15 your issue. We can have Commissioner Mustaciuolo
16 speak to you.

17 DOROTHY GRAY: Thank you. [background
18 comments]

19 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Thank you for your
20 testimony everyone. Thank you for taking the time
21 and waiting.

22 DOROTHY GRAY: So, he's under--he's in the
23 building?

24 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Sure, it's very
25 perfect.

1
2 DOROTHY GRAY: There's another man in
3 there that a stove.

4 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Okay.

5 DOROTHY GRAY: He's been there without a
6 stove so long—he's been there since 1960, and he have
7 not been cooking because he hasn't been—he hasn't
8 been getting a new stove, and the—and I had
9 complained to the one—the work flow in that building.

10 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: [interposing]
11 Actually, ma'am, so, Commissioner Mustaciuolo will
12 speak to you privately. You don't have to testify.
13 We're willing to solve your problems without you
14 testifying.

15 DOROTHY GRAY: Alright, okay.

16 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: We'll—we'll follow
17 up. We'll—does he need a stove or a hot water
18 heater?

19 DOROTHY GRAY: They need a lot of things.
20 They've been in that apartment, and I mean it's an
21 old building.

22 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: That's--

23 DOROTHY GRAY: And given the mouses are
24 eating up your bread.

2 CHAIRPERSON TORRES: Okay, thank you so
3 much. Thank you. I think that's the final-

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: I just want to
5 say for the record, we received testimony from Pratt
6 Center for Community Development. We received
7 testimony from Stanley Isaac Neighborhood Center,
8 Manhattan Legal Services, as well as Clay Avenue
9 Tenants Association, Incorporated. Thank you
10 everyone for bearing with us and being here to the
11 very end, and that will in-that will conclude our
12 hearing today. [gavel]

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date February 10, 2018