

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

June 24, 2019  
Start: 1:06 p.m.  
Recess: 2:56 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway-Committee Rm, 14<sup>th</sup> Fl.

B E F O R E: HELEN K. ROSENTHAL  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:  
DIANA AYALA  
LAURIE A. CUMBO  
BEN KALLOS  
BRAD S. LANDER

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Cecile Noel  
Commissioner of the Mayor's Office for Domestic  
And Gender Based Violence, END GBV

Sarah Hayes  
Deputy Director of the Economic Empowerment  
Program at Sanctuary for Families

Andrew Sta. Ana  
Director of Legal Services at Day One

Rie Walker  
Policy Intern at Girls for Gender Equity

Mary Luke  
President of UN Women Metro New York City, Member  
Of the Board of Directors of PowHer

Merble Reagon  
Executive Director of the Women's Center for  
Education and Career Advancement

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Good afternoon. I am Council Member Helen Rosenthal, my pronouns are she, her and hers. I'm Chair of the Committee on Women and Gender Equity and welcome to our oversight hearing on domestic violence initiatives, indicators and factors in New York City. Today we ask what might seem like a simple question but is of course much more layered, are we meeting the need for survivors of domestic violence in New York City. As violent crime rates continue to drop across the five boroughs each year, domestic violence remains stubbornly pervasive. Alarming statistics reveal that domestic violence continues to assume a larger proportion of overall crime... let me reword that, sorry, alarming statistics reveal that domestic violence assumes over time a larger proportion of overall crime and homicides in the city. In order to assess the city's ability to meet the need for domestic violence services, the Council recently passed my legislation, Local Law 38 of 2019, which requires the Mayor's Office to end domestic and gender based violence or END GBV to submit an annual report detailing information on select program activities and

1 initiatives. Earlier this month END GBV published its  
2 first annual report for 2018 in compliance with Local  
3 Law 38. This report includes data on total clients  
4 served, type of utilization rates, legal services  
5 staff, language access, economic empowerment  
6 programming to address financial abuse and other  
7 nuanced issues that accompany many domestic violence  
8 cases. My legislation also requires the New York City  
9 Police Department to report on indicators and factors  
10 of chronic domestic violence cases which will provide  
11 us with a generalized context for END GBV's report.  
12 I'm deeply disappointed that the NYPD has yet to  
13 produce this data, but I am assured that it will... it  
14 will be provided no later than July 5<sup>th</sup>. The data  
15 from both agencies matters. As more survivors  
16 courageously come forward to report abuse, we must  
17 make sure that the city is capturing the demand for  
18 services. The bottom line is making sure that there  
19 are appropriate resources so the city can implement  
20 the necessary strategies to end and confront... to  
21 confront and end this epidemic. END GBV's report  
22 provides us with a window to assess the city's  
23 resources, programs and services and there are some  
24 slides up on the screen for people in... who are here  
25

1 to look at, for those of you who are watching online  
2 you'll have to go online to the City Council website  
3 for this hearing where the report will be posted and  
4 of course the Commissioner I'm sure will say that the  
5 report is on her website as well. Today we will  
6 review END GBV's portion of its annual report to  
7 better understand the services provided to survivors  
8 in New York City. It's critical that we understand  
9 how all survivors engage with systematic responses,  
10 how are the differing concerns of various populations  
11 taken into account, how are staff trained in trauma  
12 informed practices, how can the city best collaborate  
13 with community based providers to provide culturally  
14 competent and language appropriate services and how  
15 are these efforts tracked. All of these inquiries  
16 lead us back to this hearing's overreaching question,  
17 are we meeting the need for DV services in New York  
18 City. Domestic violence involves physical, emotional,  
19 mental, sexual and financial terror. This violence  
20 can affect any New Yorker, but it also  
21 disproportionately harms our city's most vulnerable  
22 and marginalized populations; women, LGBTQI plus  
23 individuals, peoples, people of color and low-income  
24 New Yorkers and I'm committed to addressing this  
25

1 issue. Again, I want to stress the importance of  
2 ensuring that we are meeting the needs of all  
3 survivors in New York City. I'm grateful that we are  
4 joined today by Cecile Noel and GBV Commissioner who  
5 is one of the city's best leaders on this issue. I'm  
6 also very pleased to have survivors and advocates  
7 from across the city here to testify, thank you.  
8 Finally, today the Committee will also hear  
9 Preconsidered Resolution co-sponsored by our newest  
10 Council Member, Farah Louis and myself which calls  
11 upon Congress to pass and the President to sign the  
12 violence against women reauthorization act of 2019.  
13 As violence against women persists in 2019 and  
14 against trans women of color in particular, the  
15 federal government must be obligated to provide the  
16 solutions needed to end this crisis. Before we hear  
17 from the administration I'd like to thank Ned Terrace  
18 my Legislative Director as well as the awesome  
19 Committee staff for their work in preparing for this  
20 hearing; Brenda McKinney my amazing Counsel, General  
21 Counsel; Chloe Rivera, the Legislative Policy Analyst  
22 and Monica Pepple the Financial Analyst. Finally, as  
23 Committee Members enter, they will be acknowledged as  
24  
25

1 well and with that I turn it over to my General  
2 Counsel.

3  
4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Please raise your right  
5 hands? Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole  
6 truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony  
7 before this committee and to respond honestly to  
8 Council Member questions today?

9 CECILE NOEL: Yes, I do.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

11 CECILE NOEL: Okay, ready... [sneeze] bless  
12 you, bless you. Good afternoon Chairperson Rosenthal  
13 and members of the City Council on Women and Gender  
14 Equity. I am Cecile Noel, Commissioner of the Mayor's  
15 Office to End Domestic and Gender Based Violence or  
16 END GBV. Thank you for the opportunity to speak with  
17 you about END GBV's 2018 annual report on domestic  
18 violence initiatives, indicators and factors. The  
19 Mayor's Office to End Domestic and Gender Based  
20 Violence or END GBV, which was relaunched and  
21 expanded in 2018 via executive order 36, develops  
22 policies and programs, it provides training,  
23 prevention education and operate... performs community  
24 outreach, and conducts research and evaluations and  
25 operates the New York City Family Justice Centers. We

1 collaborate with city agencies and community  
2 stakeholders to ensure access to inclusive services  
3 for survivors of domestic and gender-based violence  
4 including intimate partner violence and family  
5 violence, elder abuse, sexual assault, stalking and  
6 human trafficking. The office also operates the New  
7 York City Family Justice Centers or FJCs, which are  
8 walk in, multiservice centers in each borough for  
9 survivors to access free, confidential services and  
10 support. Key city agencies, community partners, civil  
11 legal services, providers and district attorney's  
12 offices are located on site at each FJC to make it  
13 easier for survivors to get help. FJCs welcome people  
14 of all incomes, ages, sexual orientations, gender  
15 identities, regardless of the language they speak or  
16 immigration status. Service delivery at the FJC is  
17 consistent with trauma informed, client centered  
18 approaches. On June 1<sup>st</sup>, 2019, END GBV released the  
19 2018 annual report on domestic violence initiatives,  
20 indicators and factors and in compliance with Local  
21 Law 38 of 2019 which reflects data from calendar year  
22 2018 and is publicly available and accessible via our  
23 website, [www dot NYC GOV forward slash END GBV](http://www.nyc.gov/forward/slash/END-GBV) and on  
24 open data. The 2018 annual report provides an  
25



1 overview of select programs, activities, initiatives  
2 under END GBV including information about the  
3 contracted service providers at the FJC. The number  
4 of clients and services they access, the available  
5 programming at the... at the FJCs, END GBVs outreach  
6 and training efforts and the reports released by END  
7 GBV. The New York City Family Justice Centers, the  
8 largest network of FJCs in the country provide a  
9 variety of services to survivors and their children  
10 through on site community partners and other city  
11 agencies including safety planning, crisis  
12 intervention, case management, mental health  
13 counseling, economic empowerment services, criminal  
14 justice and civil legal assistance, children's  
15 programming and counseling, wellness programming and  
16 other supportive services. Last year the FJCs had  
17 over 65,000 client visits across the borough serving  
18 over 25,000 unique clients. In 2018, 20,656 unique  
19 clients received safety planning services which is...  
20 which is the most frequently accessed service across  
21 the five FJCs followed by criminal justice services,  
22 14,292 unique clients, civil legal services, 7,112  
23 unique clients and counseling services, 600... 6,277  
24 unique clients. In addition to providing legal  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 services and crisis related services such as safety  
3 planning and counseling, the FJCs also have onsite  
4 supportive services and programming to assist with  
5 other client needs including long term assistance and  
6 planning. In 2018, 2,131 unique clients accessed  
7 economic empowerment services which include financial  
8 literacy, entrepreneurship, information and  
9 assistance with applying for public benefits, housing  
10 education and assistance, computer skills training  
11 and job readiness. Just last week END GBV announced  
12 the launch of a learning lab at the Manhattan Family  
13 Justice Center, a new state of the art training  
14 facility that will be the site of economic  
15 empowerment programming for survivors of gender based  
16 violence to help build long term economic stability.  
17 On site community partners and city agency partners  
18 provide direct services that are available at the  
19 FJC. The city holds contracts with some of the onsite  
20 community partners to deliver the following core  
21 services; screening and case management, immigration  
22 law, family law, housing, legal and children  
23 services. Other in-kind providers at the FJC may also  
24 deliver services in these core areas. In total, over  
25 40 community-based organizations are onsite at the

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 five FJCs in addition to a large network of offsite  
3 providers that the FJCs work closely with on, on a  
4 referral basis. The New York City Family Justice  
5 Centers are committed to providing language access to  
6 persons with limited English proficiency. Each...  
7 providers at each of the five FJCs deliver legal and  
8 non-legal services in many languages, languages,  
9 excuse me and additionally, END GBV is able to  
10 accommodate requests for in person or telephonic  
11 interpretation as needed and appropriate. Through the  
12 contract with a telephonic interpretation vendor, FJC  
13 clients have access to telephonic interpretation in  
14 over 200 languages. In 2018 a considerable number of  
15 contracted legal provider staff spoke a language in  
16 addition to... in addition to English. END GBV  
17 emphasizes the importance of language access to  
18 service providers at each of the five FJCs to ensure  
19 all clients are provided with an opportunity to  
20 access programs and services. END GBV is continually  
21 exploring ways to enhance service delivery at the  
22 FJCs providing efficient and effective services to  
23 survivors in a collaborative and supportive  
24 environment. In the spring of 2016 END GBV launched a  
25 new policy and training institute. The institute

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 includes a policy team, a training team and the New  
3 York City Healthy Relationship Training Academy, the  
4 academy as we call it and leads END GBV's training  
5 and prevention work. The institute was created to  
6 enhance, enhance city agency and community-based  
7 organization's responses to the issues of domestic  
8 and gender-based violence, identify key areas for  
9 policy change and development and engage in primary  
10 prevention through work with young people throughout  
11 the city. In 2018, the training team conducted 321  
12 trainings for city agency staff, not for profit staff  
13 and community... and community members to enhance... to  
14 enhance their engagement with and response to  
15 survivors of domestic and gender-based violence. In  
16 2018, the academy conducted 725 prevention based  
17 healthy relationship workshops and trainings with  
18 youth, parents and professional staff in schools and  
19 community settings. END GBV will continue to build  
20 out our training topic areas and will explore new  
21 mechanisms to access our training and prevention  
22 programming. In addition to training, outreach is a  
23 key component to raising awareness about domestic and  
24 gender-based violence and connecting survivors to  
25 services. END GBV's outreach team focuses on broad

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 outreach efforts across all five boroughs and works  
3 collective... and, and works collaboratively with  
4 elected officials, community members and stake,  
5 stakeholders, community based organizations and other  
6 city agencies to host and participate in events that  
7 build the capacity of local communities to prevent,  
8 recognize and respond to domestic and gender based  
9 violence. Outreach is done in communities across the  
10 city with special focus on immigrant, youth,  
11 vulnerable and other traditionally underserved  
12 communities. Through a myriad of community  
13 partnerships and by facilitating conversations, art-  
14 based practices and other methods of engagement,  
15 staff increased community awareness for domestic and  
16 gender-based violence and promote... and promote  
17 resources available to victims and survivors  
18 throughout New York City. In 2018 END GBV conducted  
19 764 outreach events including community events,  
20 community meetings, trainings, presentations and  
21 other events. Most recently END GBV launched a web  
22 base tool kit for salon and barbershop professionals  
23 and will be conducting outreach to local salons and  
24 barbershops to connect business owners, employees and  
25 clients to information and resources. In addition to

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 the two... 2018 annual report we are discussing today,  
3 END GBV also releases periodic fact sheets and briefs  
4 about pertinent topics to inform New Yorkers about  
5 the issues related to domestic and gender-based  
6 violence as well as to enhance access to data and END  
7 GBV program updates. We look forward to continuing to  
8 collaborate with the Council and our partner agencies  
9 and community partners to share information about END  
10 GBV's programs and initiatives. Thank you for the  
11 opportunity to speak to these issues and I welcome  
12 any questions the Committee may have.

13 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Thank you so much  
14 Commissioner, I, I guess we can end because you  
15 answered all my questions, this was terrific  
16 testimony, it really does put it in good context and  
17 I appreciate that so thank you for your testimony and  
18 we're going to look at it more closely, please be  
19 patient with me if I ask you some questions that you...  
20 [cross-talk]

21 CECILE NOEL: Sure... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...already answered  
23 in the testimony. I think my first and in fact my  
24 first question is trying to get at how Local Law 38  
25 can be meaningful and helpful and I think one thing...

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 you know one glaring component part that's missing  
3 which makes it hard for us to have this discussion is  
4 of course the NYPD part but in order... you know as you  
5 clearly are addressing the broader needs of people  
6 are there... and our goal is to reflect that work, do  
7 you think that there are services available, I'm  
8 looking at your 2018 report right now, programs, you  
9 know outreach to agencies which you have information  
10 about as I say but do you think that there could be  
11 more information in that report that would help the  
12 agency and the public understand the needs of  
13 survivors? For example, identifying the demand for  
14 services by language, you know how many people walk  
15 into the FJCs speaking in Russian and which boroughs  
16 is that in? Your report lays out beautifully the  
17 number of staff provided by borough who speak the  
18 various languages but... for example, in Queens it  
19 looks like there are five Spanish speakers but we  
20 know there are nearly 200 languages spoken, what is  
21 the demand by language spoken for services?

22 CECILE NOEL: Well I think... [cross-talk]

23 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: And hang on,  
24 right before you... I apologize, we're joined today by

25

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 Council Member Ben Kallos from Manhattan who's a  
3 member of the Committee, welcome.

4 CECILE NOEL: Our report or the 2018  
5 report that we are here to discuss really captures  
6 our contracted service providers. Our... the community-  
7 based service providers also come with additional  
8 capacities that are not... that are not reflected that  
9 what you have are contracted providers.

10 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: And as... and as I  
11 understand it and have seen myself the other  
12 providers are perhaps funded through a different  
13 funding stream... city government funding stream but  
14 come to the Family Justice Centers sort of free, that  
15 they're available there to provide services even  
16 though it's not a direct contract the way you have  
17 direct contract with Safe Haven, is that... [cross-  
18 talk]

19 CECILE NOEL: Safe Horizon...

20 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Safe Horizon,  
21 thank you, is that a fair way to characterize it?

22 CECILE NOEL: I would characterize it as  
23 we have a partnership... [cross-talk]

24 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yes... [cross-talk]

25



1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CECILE NOEL: ...a collaborative  
3 relationship and so our non-contracted partners are  
4 funded as you said through other sources and they  
5 bring... and, and through the Family Justice Center...  
6 [cross-talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yes... [cross-talk]

8 CECILE NOEL: ...they are able to get in  
9 kind services from us, so they get an office and they  
10 get... [cross-talk]

11 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Oh, right, sure...  
12 [cross-talk]

13 CECILE NOEL: ...lots of in-kind services  
14 so this is by no means just, I think you coined it  
15 as, as free in that way, I would coin it as... [cross-  
16 talk]

17 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Right... [cross-  
18 talk]

19 CECILE NOEL: ...much more... [cross-talk]

20 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Right... [cross-  
21 talk]

22 CECILE NOEL: ...a collaborative... [cross-  
23 talk]

24 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yes... [cross-talk]

25

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CECILE NOEL: ...mutually beneficial  
3 relationship.

4 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: A thousand  
5 percent I'm with you but then what it, it strikes me  
6 then that this report doesn't reflect all of those  
7 amazing partnerships.

8 CECILE NOEL: It does not, we reported on  
9 the contracted providers as was indicated in the  
10 actual legislation.

11 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: You... right, fair  
12 point, yes, exactly, got it. Okay, excuse me for a  
13 minute. So, a couple of things and with the  
14 understanding that the report did not require the,  
15 the law does not require you to provide this  
16 information so with that understanding in mind could  
17 you provide to the Committee a list of your community  
18 partners?

19 CECILE NOEL: Yes, we can, we can follow  
20 up with you.

21 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Great... [cross-  
22 talk]

23 CECILE NOEL: With a list of that.

24 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: And if you looked  
25 at the staff and this isn't... again, this is... I don't

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 mean to put you on the spot so this is something that  
3 I would expect you to get back but if you looked at  
4 the staffing in each of the centers what proportion  
5 do you think are provided by the contracted providers  
6 versus the collaboration providers?

7 CECILE NOEL: So, we ensure that every  
8 Family Justice Center has a robust core compliment of  
9 services... [cross-talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Of course..  
11 [cross-talk]

12 CECILE NOEL: ...and those are our  
13 contracted services and so the, the community-based  
14 providers that are non-contracted help enhance that  
15 but we would be happy to get back to you with a  
16 breakdown of what that looks like between our  
17 contracted and non.

18 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yeah, it's an  
19 amazing collaboration and what I'm getting at in my  
20 question is simply the report doesn't... our... [cross-  
21 talk]

22 CECILE NOEL: Yes... [cross-talk]

23 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...legally what we  
24 asked for we... doesn't capture the full breadth of..  
25 [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

3 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...the work that  
4 you're doing and, and that's important to know.

5 CECILE NOEL: And we... we're happy to  
6 follow up with you with the additional information.

7 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: And in many ways  
8 it answers my question of, in looking at the report  
9 and looking at the number of clients versus the  
10 number of staff and seeing... you know sort of saying  
11 wow that's a heck of a case, caseload but that's not  
12 in fact true because there are other providers there.

13 CECILE NOEL: That is correct.

14 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay, that's  
15 really helpful to know, thank you and if we could  
16 work offline... [cross-talk]

17 CECILE NOEL: We'd be happy... [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...after this  
19 hearing... [cross-talk]

20 CECILE NOEL: ...to do that... [cross-talk]

21 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...to get that  
22 information it'd be awfully helpful, thank you. I'm  
23 wondering about the intake form that the Family  
24 Justice Center uses. Do you have a... or does Safe

25

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 Horizons use a preliminary intake form and is that  
3 form the same that's used at all the centers?

4 CECILE NOEL: We have a standard form  
5 across all the centers for screening and assessment.

6 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: And is everyone  
7 asked to fill out that form first?

8 CECILE NOEL: Yes, in screening and  
9 intake, yes.

10 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: And so, given the  
11 nearly 200 languages in Queens how, how... what  
12 mechanism is used right at the beginning to... [cross-  
13 talk]

14 CECILE NOEL: Again... [cross-talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...address... [cross-  
16 talk]

17 CECILE NOEL: ...as I said in my testimony,  
18 we use telephonic interpretation services and we  
19 also... and Safe Horizon does have some capacity,  
20 language capacity... [cross-talk]

21 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yep... [cross-talk]

22 CECILE NOEL: ...and that's also utilized  
23 as well but we certainly use the interpretation  
24 services provided by the city.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Now I'm  
3 forgetting if this is already in your report, but do  
4 you have the numbers on how often you use those  
5 services?

6 CECILE NOEL: We can get back to you with  
7 that.

8 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Is that something  
9 that is trackable?

10 CECILE NOEL: Yes.

11 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Great, that would  
12 be interesting to know... [cross-talk]

13 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...and then if  
15 possible, to know by borough office.

16 CECILE NOEL: Okay.

17 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: That's great,  
18 thank you. Oh, can I just say out loud how much I  
19 appreciate my staff, I'm lucky, lucky to have this  
20 Committee and amazing staff. Do you... the language  
21 line employees, are those city employees, is that a  
22 city contract?

23 CECILE NOEL: It is a city contract, they  
24 are not city employees, they're... [cross-talk]

25

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Right... [cross-  
3 talk]

4 CECILE NOEL: ...contractor employees.

5 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay and have  
6 they been trained in; you know trauma centric  
7 sensitivity?

8 CECILE NOEL: First of all, I just want  
9 to correct one thing, our contract is with Voiance  
10 not language line.

11 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: What's it called?

12 CECILE NOEL: Voiance... [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: V o y a n c e?

14 CECILE NOEL: Voiance not language line.

15 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay... [cross-  
16 talk]

17 CECILE NOEL: ...and to every degree  
18 possible we make sure that the contractor understands  
19 both the Family Justice Center and our issues.

20 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: What does that  
21 mean?

22 CECILE NOEL: Specifically...

23 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Like... [cross-  
24 talk]

25

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CECILE NOEL: So, so if they're... we don't  
3 provide direct training to, to these... to, to Voiance  
4 but if issues come up that reflect any problem with  
5 the contractor those are immediately addressed.

6 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: How many times in  
7 the last year has there been an issue?

8 CECILE NOEL: We would have to get back  
9 to you, I, I don't know that off the top of my head.

10 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Is... right, I mean  
11 has there been one?

12 CECILE NOEL: I'd have to... I'd have to  
13 go... get back to you, there are five Family Justice  
14 Centers, we'd have to go back and look, that's... and  
15 we can get that information for you, I just... [cross-  
16 talk]

17 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Is that... [cross-  
18 talk]

19 CECILE NOEL: ...don't have it available...  
20 [cross-talk]

21 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...noted?

22 CECILE NOEL: Huh?

23 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: That, that is  
24 available?

25 CECILE NOEL: Yes... [cross-talk]



1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: You would have a...  
3 [cross-talk]

4 CECILE NOEL: Yes... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...notation that  
6 there was... [cross-talk]

7 CECILE NOEL: ...yes, we would... [cross-  
8 talk]

9 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...a problem...  
10 [cross-talk]

11 CECILE NOEL: Yes, we would.

12 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay, I mean  
13 obviously the reason I'm interested is again, the  
14 goal of the hearing in... the oversight hearing is to  
15 ensure that, you know you're providing great  
16 services... [cross-talk]

17 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...and we want to  
19 make sure that you have all the tools necessary to  
20 get the work done... [cross-talk]

21 CECILE NOEL: Right... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...for survivors  
23 and so in this particular case, you know in summary  
24 we have this great tool, there are nearly 200  
25 languages, you're not going to have staff available

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 so we... so the city uses a contract with, with

3 Voiance... [cross-talk]

4 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...and... but given  
6 the inherently sensitive nature of this work and, and  
7 what we've learned about the implications for people  
8 who are not trained to... for survivors... [cross-talk]

9 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...it would be in  
11 the interest of the Committee or the Council to  
12 understand how that's working out so we can under...  
13 better understand perhaps there should be more  
14 preventative training for these workers, don't...  
15 [cross-talk]

16 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

17 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...don't... I'm just  
18 describing...

19 CECILE NOEL: No problem and we're happy  
20 to get back to you with that information, we just  
21 don't have that available here today and I do want to  
22 emphasize that there is a language access coordinator  
23 that also addresses all of these issues and ensures  
24 that we're compliant with Local Laws really looking

25

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 at our usage as we track it and think about those  
3 things. So, so... [cross-talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: And that... [cross-  
5 talk]

6 CECILE NOEL: ...we're happy to get back to  
7 you with that information.

8 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Thank you and I'm  
9 sure that is there due to another Local Law that I  
10 should know but don't, the language interpreters is  
11 that for the Mayor's Office or out of DCAS?

12 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh, this is a DCAS  
13 contract and, and it's a relatively new vendor for us  
14 and we will get back to you but I, I think  
15 anecdotally just... again, anecdotally I think our FJCs  
16 have been very happy with the service and staff have  
17 been but we'll, we'll get to you with the exact...  
18 [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yep... [cross-talk]

20 CECILE NOEL: ...numbers.

21 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: I mean I  
22 definitely get that sense if, if... [cross-talk]

23 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

24 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...if there was a  
25 glaring problem... [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CECILE NOEL: Yeah... [cross-talk]

3 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...you would I'm  
4 guessing report on that in some fashion so that's...  
5 [cross-talk]

6 CECILE NOEL: Yes... [cross-talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...helpful to know.  
8 Do you... I want to get back to... then we got a little  
9 distracted by the language access forms... [cross-talk]

10 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

11 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...but... and by the  
12 Voiance services but I'm wondering if you have a  
13 sense of how many people come to the center perhaps  
14 with an unusual language and leave prior to filling  
15 out the intake form?

16 CECILE NOEL: Our commitment is to ensure  
17 that every person presented is seen and at least  
18 assessed in terms of their safety for that day and  
19 initial assessment and so that's our commitment to  
20 everyone coming into our space and that includes if  
21 we have to get someone on, on, on the, the telephonic  
22 interpretation.

23 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yeah, well I'm  
24 just looking at the numbers so 25... over 25,000 people  
25 walked through the door...

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CECILE NOEL: Unique clients, yes.

3 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Unique clients  
4 and what I'm asking is do we know if that is the  
5 total number who walked... I mean... or let me say it a  
6 different way, can I assume that each of those 25,000  
7 plus people filled out an intake form?

8 CECILE NOEL: Yes.

9 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: And then are  
10 those forms... is the information from the forms  
11 implemented electronically, digitally, or are those  
12 pieces of paper that you have on file or perhaps  
13 upload, scan in?

14 CECILE NOEL: Its completed on paper and  
15 then put into our database.

16 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yep, okay and I'm  
17 sure there are issues with privacy, I'm not... [cross-  
18 talk]

19 CECILE NOEL: Yes, there are... [cross-  
20 talk]

21 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...trying to...  
22 [cross-talk]

23 CECILE NOEL: Yes, there are... [cross-  
24 talk]

25

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...go down any one  
3 of those roads. Can you provide the Committee with  
4 the intake form?

5 CECILE NOEL: Yes.

6 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay, thank you.  
7 Do the forms collect demographic data like sort of by  
8 zip code or...

9 CECILE NOEL: Without seeing the form in  
10 front of me I, I would need to, to look at that but  
11 can we just get back to you on the... [cross-talk]

12 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: A thousand...  
13 [cross-talk]

14 CECILE NOEL: ...the staff on that... [cross-  
15 talk]

16 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...percent and the  
17 two other... [cross-talk]

18 CECILE NOEL: Okay... [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...questions that  
20 are going to be part of that and... [cross-talk]

21 CECILE NOEL: Okay... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...we can send you  
23 our questions.

24 CECILE NOEL: That would be fine.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Is... does the  
3 intake form allow a client to self-identify with  
4 regard to sexual orientation or gender or is there  
5 boxes that you check or is it true self  
6 identification and can you share aggregate data,  
7 again, don't want to run into any issues with privacy  
8 concerns on who the FJC clients are including age,  
9 language spoken, self-identified gender or  
10 orientation and race, race... self-identified race and  
11 ethnicity?

12 CECILE NOEL: Yes.

13 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay and again we  
14 will get this information when... [cross-talk]

15 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

16 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...we see it but  
17 I'm wondering if the FJCs collect any other sort of,  
18 you know basic data like that as a way to see what's  
19 going on. We're going to get that when we see the  
20 questionnaire, you don't have to answer that. I  
21 wanted...

22 [off mic dialogue]

23 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Could you  
24 describe the partnerships or other collaborative  
25 relationships that you have with other city agencies?

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CECILE NOEL: We have collaborative  
3 relationships with offsite partners so it's, it's  
4 quite possible that someone can come into our FJC and  
5 upon initial assessment of services and everything  
6 else and we determine or the client really feels  
7 better accessing the services with a community  
8 partner in their own community and so we have offsite  
9 relationships and we make those referrals and we  
10 follow up on those referrals.

11 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: I was... I gotcha  
12 and, and that's helpful to know because I think that  
13 gets to culturally competency, but I was really  
14 asking about city agencies... [cross-talk]

15 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

16 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...for example,  
17 ACS, you could imagine a situation... [cross-talk]

18 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...where a  
20 survivor... [cross-talk]

21 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...of domestic  
23 violence is having an issue with their children being  
24 taken away from them or not...

25



1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CECILE NOEL: Okay, on site at the FJC we  
3 have HRA on site... [cross-talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay... [cross-  
5 talk]

6 CECILE NOEL: ...filled with public  
7 benefits, we have NY, NYPD on site to help both if  
8 someone needs to make a police report, if we have a  
9 high risk case that they need to follow up on so  
10 those two providers are definitely on site and again  
11 we're co-located with the district attorneys office  
12 so should we need to follow up with something on the  
13 criminal justice side that's quite possible. So, in  
14 addition to that part of our role is to have a  
15 collaborative as well as coordinating relationship  
16 with other city agencies so we work closely with ACS...  
17 [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yep... [cross-talk]

19 CECILE NOEL: ...on cases that might come  
20 up, we work closely with ACS on training initiatives  
21 to ensure that case workers are, are getting training  
22 in domestic violence and intimate partner violence.  
23 Since our expansion we've been working closely with  
24 their child trafficking unit or anti-trafficking unit  
25 in ACS thinking about the continuum of services

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 unfortunately in trafficking sometimes that begins  
3 really early and then goes into adulthood and how can  
4 we work together in that space much more so we're  
5 working across agencies. We work with the Mayor's  
6 Office for Criminal Justice on issues so we, we, we  
7 are definitely collaborating and working with city  
8 partners on many issues and we do have a number of  
9 city partners that are actually in the FJC.

10 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: So, and if I'm  
11 looking at the report you report on healthy  
12 relationship... the healthy relationship training  
13 academy...

14 CECILE NOEL: Yes...

15 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Is that where I  
16 would find training of city agency staff?

17 CECILE NOEL: You would find training of  
18 city agency staff under our policy and training unit,  
19 right, which includes the, the healthy relationship  
20 academy but we've trained 189... we've had 189  
21 trainings for city agency staff.

22 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Oh, I see, at the  
23 training agency...

24 CECILE NOEL: Yes...

25

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Could you provide  
3 information on the agencies that are included?

4 CECILE NOEL: Yes.

5 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: While this is not  
6 directly related to domestic violence I was in a, a  
7 task force meeting the other day on female genital  
8 and mutilation, cutting and a concern was raised that  
9 ACS workers are not familiar with that practice..  
10 [cross-talk]

11 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

12 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...and so when they  
13 see it, they may have an inappropriate reaction, is  
14 that something that your office trains about?

15 CECILE NOEL: Yes, it is something that  
16 we train about and since our expanded mission we have  
17 been working with the coalition to end FGMC and we  
18 actually hosted one of the original... or the first  
19 meeting at one of the FJCs, we've been training both  
20 with community partners and we have also held  
21 listening sessions with community providers who work  
22 in this area to understand both the, the scope of the  
23 issue and how we as a city can really think about our  
24 response and ensuring that we are in fact responding  
25 in the best and most comprehensive way.

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: And I see your  
3 staff is eagerly providing additional information  
4 about that and I appreciate it, could we after this  
5 hearing provide that information to the Council  
6 about, you know I'm assuming it's going to be, you  
7 know how many trainings around this, what agencies  
8 are trained, the community partners, the task force..  
9 [cross-talk]

10 CECILE NOEL: Okay.. [cross-talk]

11 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...whatever it is..  
12 [cross-talk]

13 CECILE NOEL: Okay..

14 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Thank you, I  
15 appreciate that. Okay, is there.. what is the  
16 relationship between the.. or, or what's the  
17 relationship.. or what's the difference in a way  
18 between an FJC direct employee and an FJC contracted  
19 employee?

20 CECILE NOEL: An FJC direct employee, so..  
21 [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Are there any  
23 direct employees?

24 CECILE NOEL: We have administrative  
25 staff that are.. [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Got it... [cross-  
3 talk]

4 CECILE NOEL: ...so I want to just clarify,  
5 the, the administrative staff are END GBV staff...  
6 [cross-talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Right, got it...  
8 [cross-talk]

9 CECILE NOEL: So, the staff oversee the  
10 centers, each of the centers, ensure the centers are  
11 opened on time every morning, that everyone is there,  
12 all of the administrative functions as well as the  
13 coordination within that space of services and  
14 providers and troubleshooting any issue really are  
15 done by END GBV staff who are the administrative arm  
16 for each of the FJCs.

17 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Great, is that  
18 reported in the annual report?

19 CECILE NOEL: No.

20 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay, is that  
21 something we could get information about?

22 CECILE NOEL: Yes.

23 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay, great. Do  
24 you have any other direct staff?

25

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CECILE NOEL: Contracted staff, hour  
3 staff, in kind.

4 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay, great. One  
5 of the things... the reason I ask and... [cross-talk]

6 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...one of the  
8 things that I've been trying to wrap my head around  
9 is working with OMB to provide us with a clear under,  
10 understanding or you know spending level across city  
11 agencies for your office, is that something you can  
12 help us with?

13 CECILE NOEL: At this point I believe  
14 there has been an agreement with OMB to provide that  
15 information for FY 2021 and I believe that the  
16 request is in to look at the wider city spending as  
17 well.

18 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay, that is  
19 great to know. Thank you. Hang on one second, sorry.  
20 Okay, one of the... in looking at your report... [cross-  
21 talk]

22 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

23 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...the section on  
24 economic empowerment programs and what's provided at  
25 each of the borough offices... [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

3 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...we'd like to get  
4 at, you know is... are, are we meeting demand and  
5 trying to understand that so, wondering like with  
6 your collaborative partners who, who I'm guessing  
7 provide these trainings... [cross-talk]

8 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

9 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...how often they  
10 come, is it once a month, once a week, are they there  
11 permanently like what, what, what is being provided  
12 compared to demand?

13 CECILE NOEL: Okay, so there are two  
14 questions in there so you asked how often, that will  
15 vary, vary by center and program. So, how often, it  
16 could be once a month, it could be once every week.  
17 If you look at one of our economic... the sanctuary  
18 program they're there every day in terms of doing  
19 that work because that's what the program really  
20 requires so that the, the, the expectation or the  
21 programming and the amount of times that they're  
22 there will really vary across the programming and,  
23 and these programs are brought, brought to us, they  
24 seek their own independent funding and really bring  
25 the programming... the programming there so..

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: No, that's... it's,  
3 it's part of the whole collaboration which is...  
4 [cross-talk]

5 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...amazing. So,  
7 when on the economic empowerment side when you  
8 provide the list of the CBOs... [cross-talk]

9 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...that are doing  
11 that work... [cross-talk]

12 CECILE NOEL: Right... [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...if you could  
14 indicate what boroughs they're in and how often they  
15 provide that service and I imagine so in my mind's  
16 eye what I'm seeing is the... you have determined eight  
17 categories of empowerment programs which is fantastic  
18 so in each of the categories my guess is there might  
19 be different providers and they might be coming in  
20 different days of the week... [cross-talk]

21 CECILE NOEL: Yes... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...so in my mind's  
23 eye that's how I'm envisioning a chart.

24 CECILE NOEL: Okay. Alright, so we'll  
25 absolutely look at this and get back to you.



1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay and then how  
3 do we get at this issue of space, physical space and  
4 whether or not there's enough physical space to have  
5 all of your partner workers there, manage all the  
6 clients successfully, is that... you know when we were  
7 looking at the NYPD SVD for example, we could see as  
8 we visited the different borough offices real  
9 differences in physical space... [cross-talk]

10 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

11 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Do you have  
12 thoughts about the five boroughs and where you might  
13 have... where you're a little more tight?

14 CECILE NOEL: You know I think from a  
15 city perspective I, I, I don't think you can talk to  
16 an agency that doesn't say that space is tight so I  
17 think just as a general rule we, we as the city are  
18 always thinking about looking at and considering what  
19 that space need is and DCAS as a partner is always  
20 working with us to really... [cross-talk]

21 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yes... [cross-talk]

22 CECILE NOEL: ...entertain that but let me  
23 just say that for each of the... each of the Family  
24 Justice Centers definitely have a different footprint  
25 in terms of their space... [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yep... [cross-talk]

3 CECILE NOEL: And our staff, the  
4 administrative staff actually do a... just an  
5 outstanding job in managing that space and  
6 continually evaluating what's needed and how do we...  
7 and how do we ensure that we are really providing the  
8 right services at the right time for the clients that  
9 we're seeing and that changes over time so that we  
10 are always looking at our onsite providers and trying  
11 to maximize in every way possible the service  
12 delivery that they bring and that's a constant  
13 reevaluation. So, five years ago X agency might have  
14 been a wonderful partner but we're not seeing any  
15 referrals right now, how can we maximize that by  
16 maybe shifting that partner to an offsite partner and  
17 bringing on a partner that we actually need so we're  
18 always looking at that and I think that ensures that  
19 we're making the best use of the space that we do  
20 have and managing it well.

21 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: So, then it begs  
22 the question if you could provide by borough the  
23 onsite providers and the offsite... [cross-talk]

24 CECILE NOEL: Sure... [cross-talk]

25

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...CBOs, that would  
3 be helpful... [cross-talk]

4 CECILE NOEL: Yes... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...and then if you  
6 could... so, the way you manage demand would it be fair  
7 to say that the way you manage demand and capacity is  
8 capturing spill over with your partner CBOs?

9 CECILE NOEL: A spill over demand, I  
10 think that we work collaboratively to ensure that  
11 everyone coming in is addressed and when... and when  
12 there's a need for a survivor who chooses to see  
13 someone off site then we make that possible as well.

14 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: If you were to  
15 pick one borough where you could increase the size of  
16 the FJC what would it be?

17 CECILE NOEL: I think we'd, we'd... in an  
18 ideal world everyone wants a great deal of space and  
19 I think that we do a great job of maximizing what we  
20 have.

21 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: I, I've seen the  
22 Staten Island one, we visited together... [cross-talk]

23 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

24 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...that was  
25 tremendous... [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

3 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...and I know  
4 you're doing some work in the Manhattan one... [cross-  
5 talk]

6 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...I was thinking  
8 you were going to say Queens only because of the size  
9 of the borough and, and the different demands.

10 CECILE NOEL: We have a robust team in  
11 Queens and we're doing a great job managing that  
12 space.

13 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay. I just want  
14 to mention, and we've been joined by Council Member  
15 Ayala from the... from East Harlem and Central Bronx...  
16 southern Bronx and we welcome her, when you're ready  
17 for questions let us know. Okay. Can you  
18 differentiate in your report or separately the  
19 difference between an economic empowerment program  
20 versus a workforce training program?

21 CECILE NOEL: As part of our follow up,  
22 we can... [cross-talk]

23 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yeah... [cross-  
24 talk]

25 CECILE NOEL: ...certainly do that, yes.

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay. I mean do  
3 you see it... do you... is that part of your... [cross-  
4 talk]

5 CECILE NOEL: I think... I think there's  
6 some programs that involve both, right... [cross-talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Uh-huh... [cross-  
8 talk]

9 CECILE NOEL: If you were to take let's  
10 say the economic empowerment program at Sanctuary,  
11 they're probably doing both, right...

12 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: And... exactly and  
13 so the... that exact program is listed as being  
14 provided in Manhattan and Brooklyn...

15 CECILE NOEL: It serves all of the Family  
16 Justice Centers, we just have the space in Manhattan,  
17 that's the designated training space but recruitment  
18 happens across all five boroughs.

19 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: And would it make  
20 sense to replicate the program in Queens or the  
21 Bronx?

22 CECILE NOEL: Again, Sanctuary, the  
23 provider brings that program to us, they make the  
24 determination based on capacity, funding and all  
25 kinds of issues where that... where this program would

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 be most effective given all of the variables that  
3 they actually work with as well.

4 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Last year END GBV  
5 received 3.3 million in new funding to be allocated  
6 to the Family Justice Centers to increase mental  
7 health services for DV survivors using psychotherapy  
8 and psychiatric methods in a holistic approach to  
9 trauma, do you know... could you articulate which of  
10 those services might overlap with the services  
11 highlighted in your report?

12 CECILE NOEL: The, the mental health  
13 program that's referenced there is a collaboration  
14 that we have with H and H and it's very specific to a  
15 psychiatric provider that's hired by H and H,  
16 psychotherapists and psychiatrists and that program  
17 is what's highlighted there separate and apart but it  
18 lives within our Family Justice Centers and clearly  
19 takes referrals if needed from other providers as  
20 well as external domestic violence providers who  
21 might need this service.

22 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: So, that's one of  
23 the CBOs that will be listed as... [cross-talk]

24 CECILE NOEL: Its not a CBO, it's H and  
25 H, Health and Hospitals.

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: But they're  
3 contracting with someone, that's why... [cross-talk]

4 CECILE NOEL: Health and Hospitals...  
5 [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...I said it...  
7 [cross-talk]

8 CECILE NOEL: ...directly delivers that  
9 service... [cross-talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay... [cross-  
11 talk]

12 CECILE NOEL: ...to us so they have staff,  
13 they hire a psychiatrist, psychotherapist... [cross-  
14 talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Got it... [cross-  
16 talk]

17 CECILE NOEL: ...to be on staff with us.

18 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Alright. So,  
19 could you identify how many of those staff already to  
20 the FJCs separately?

21 CECILE NOEL: Yes.

22 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yeah, okay,  
23 great. And was that ongoing funding, baselined?

24 CECILE NOEL: Yes.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay, great. I  
3 just want to make sure I'm reading the data right on  
4 the report and I'm going to go back to the first page  
5 where you have clients versus... client visits versus  
6 unique clients... [cross-talk]

7 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

8 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: It implies... if we  
9 could go back... oh, there... to this one, if that's  
10 there. Oh, okay. So, the total of unique clients is  
11 over 25,000 and the total for client visits is  
12 65,000... [cross-talk]

13 CECILE NOEL: Yes... [cross-talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Is it... I'm trying  
15 to interpret it, is it fair to say every client  
16 visits 2.5 times or...

17 CECILE NOEL: It's fair to say that  
18 clients are engaged in our services and come back  
19 multiple times for multiple services, on average each  
20 client engages in, in life five different services in  
21 our Family Justice Centers so they're coming back and  
22 they're actually... [cross-talk]

23 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay... [cross-  
24 talk]

25



1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CECILE NOEL: ...engaging in these  
3 services.

4 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: So, what does  
5 client visits mean?

6 CECILE NOEL: Its actually the number of  
7 times that a client comes into our centers so it's...  
8 so, it's the amount of times that the client comes  
9 into our center.

10 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: I see, so if each  
11 client is on average using five services, they might  
12 use two services or three services at the next visit  
13 and that's why it's not reflected... [cross-talk]

14 CECILE NOEL: Right... [cross-talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...in visits.

16 CECILE NOEL: Right.

17 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: And that answers  
18 the question for the next page for your next chart  
19 which the number of unique clients by service type is  
20 utilized... [cross-talk]

21 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...that number  
23 adds... [cross-talk]

24 CECILE NOEL: Is much larger... [cross-  
25 talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...up to 56, 57...

3 [cross-talk]

4 CECILE NOEL: Yes... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...thousand.

6 CECILE NOEL: Its much... its much larger.

7 That's right because you're, you're engaging in more  
8 than one service and that could happen at one visit  
9 if... as you've said so well. I, I have a legal  
10 appointment and I'm going to see a case manager.

11 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: But then wouldn't  
12 you assume that the number of services providers  
13 would be higher than the number of client visits?

14 CECILE NOEL: You're, you're breaking  
15 that... it's utilized by unique client type I think in  
16 the bottom. So, the unique clients, these are the  
17 unique clients in the bottom so it's really over the  
18 25,000 so these are unique clients not the total  
19 visit. The bottom chart is unique clients.

20 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: But then it  
21 would... [cross-talk]

22 CECILE NOEL: That client... [cross-talk]

23 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...add up to 25,000  
24 if it was unique clients, it adds up to 56,733.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CECILE NOEL: A unique client may access  
3 more than one type of service; a unique client may  
4 access more than... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Absolutely...  
6 [cross-talk]

7 CECILE NOEL: ...one... [cross-talk]

8 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...so let's say  
9 you, you use three services on your first visit...  
10 [cross-talk]

11 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

12 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...two services on  
13 your second visit that would be two visits, five  
14 services...

15 CECILE NOEL: Right...

16 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: And so... which is  
17 how I would imagine it... [cross-talk]

18 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...works... [cross-  
20 talk]

21 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...I... that's why I  
23 was wondering why if you add up all the services  
24 utilized... [cross-talk]

25 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...it comes to five... 56,700 and some change compared to the number of visits, 65,855, my guess the answer to that question is people are so busy doing the job of certain... meeting the needs of the clients they may not be checking all the boxes but help me if I'm misunderstanding... [cross-talk]

CECILE NOEL: We track... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...the chart... [cross-talk]

CECILE NOEL: ...we, we try to ensure that we're collecting the data simply as robust as possible... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Sure, sure... [cross-talk]

CECILE NOEL: ...so, so the administrators really look out for that but it's not... it really is no one to one match and I think that's what we're trying to do with this, they're accessing... they're accessing more than one service and these are unique clients accessing those services. So... and the visits are just how many times you come in for a particular service.

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: I'm going to let  
3 it go but I'm not sure I understand the chart...  
4 [cross-talk]

5 CECILE NOEL: Okay... [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...then maybe we'll  
7 talk offline about it. We were just looking across  
8 time... [cross-talk]

9 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...at the number of  
11 outreach events and it seemed like if I'm recalling  
12 correctly two years ago the number was higher than  
13 one year ago and then it's bounced back up again a  
14 little bit but why was there that big drop?

15 CECILE NOEL: Staffing factors, just  
16 attrition in staff and the time it takes to hire new  
17 staff and get them trained and on board, it was just  
18 an... a staffing...

19 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Got it, that's  
20 fine but is it... I thought that... so, it... oh, so your  
21 staff not only administers the program at each of the  
22 FJCs, it's your direct staff who does the outreach to  
23 other agencies or other providers... [cross-talk]

24 CECILE NOEL: Yes... [cross-talk]

25 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay...

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CECILE NOEL: Yes...

3 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Got it... got it,  
4 so that was literally staffing but are you budgeted  
5 for enough... how many vacancies does your agent... your  
6 office currently have?

7 CECILE NOEL: We would have to go back  
8 and get you that information but we are budgeting for  
9 staff to do outreach in the community much like our  
10 training staff, we're budgeting for that as well,  
11 that's are staff as well... [cross-talk]

12 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: What's your total  
13 number of FTEs for your office?

14 CECILE NOEL: We can get back to you with  
15 that. We... and because we've had attrition and  
16 vacancy, so I want to tell you what the number is as  
17 of whatever... [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Sure, sure. I  
19 guess... I mean if we're going to get... if you're going  
20 to get back to me what I would want to know exactly  
21 is for the last two fiscal years what was your  
22 budgeted number and what was your actual number for  
23 each year and then for this year what's your budgeted  
24 number and... [cross-talk]

25 CECILE NOEL: Okay... [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...if you can do  
3 that separated out by training folks versus FJC  
4 administrative folks versus anything else... [cross-  
5 talk]

6 CECILE NOEL: Okay... [cross-talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...that is  
8 appropriate that would be super helpful.

9 CECILE NOEL: Okay.

10 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay, great,  
11 thank you. I think we've hit a lot of our questions,  
12 hang on one second. Do you provide services and... or  
13 does one of your CBOs provide services and... or  
14 programming for the perpetrators of domestic based  
15 violence?

16 CECILE NOEL: In the... in the community or  
17 the community, community-based providers offer that  
18 service, that service is not in the FJC.

19 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay. So, you're  
20 not... you don't have a contract with... [cross-talk]

21 CECILE NOEL: No, we do not.

22 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay. But does  
23 each FJC like have a list of those CBOs?

24 CECILE NOEL: Centrally we do and C... and,  
25 and the FJCs have it as well.

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay, could you  
3 include that in the information and maybe if you have  
4 it the demand, how often... [cross-talk]

5 CECILE NOEL: That we do have... [cross-  
6 talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...people ask...  
8 [cross-talk]

9 CECILE NOEL: ...yes... that we do have, yes.

10 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay. Alright.  
11 Thank you. In your database... I want to get at the  
12 issue of unique clients... [cross-talk]

13 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...for one second.  
15 If someone visits a Manhattan FJC and also a Queens  
16 FJC are, they counted as one person or two unique  
17 clients?

18 CECILE NOEL: That, that honestly, I will  
19 have to get back to you on, on that one.

20 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Great, that would  
21 be really interesting to know, it gets at the..  
22 [cross-talk]

23 CECILE NOEL: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

24 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...question of  
25 whether or not the databases you have which are



1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 completely private and secure and would never be  
3 forward facing but that it captures... [cross-talk]

4 CECILE NOEL: Yes... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...somebody who's  
6 using duplicative centers and.. just in order to track  
7 them holistically for their case managers.

8 CECILE NOEL: Yep.

9 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay, thank you.  
10 Okay. Oh, sure, Council Member Ayala.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Hi Commissioner,  
12 I'm sorry... [cross-talk]

13 CECILE NOEL: Hi, how are you... [cross-  
14 talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: ...I was late, we're  
16 running around from hearing to hearing this morning.  
17 I, I just had a question regarding the, the Justice  
18 Center, the... what... do you know what the average and  
19 if you've already responded to this my apologies,  
20 what the average number of individuals being serviced  
21 at each center is per year?

22 CECILE NOEL: We have over 25,000 unique  
23 clients across the five Family Justice Centers.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: That's across all  
25 four... [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CECILE NOEL: Five... [cross-talk]

3 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: ...five?

4 CECILE NOEL: All five.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: That's annual?

6 CECILE NOEL: Yes.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Okay, do you track  
8 how many of the 2,500?

9 CECILE NOEL: Thousand.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Thousand, sorry,  
11 of the 25,000 are coming from referrals, from  
12 district attorney's offices, from the, the hospitals  
13 or how many are walk ins, how many are referred from  
14 NYPD, is there a tracking mech... a tracking mechanism?

15 CECILE NOEL: We don't... we don't really  
16 track referrals in that way, we certainly have an  
17 array of services and in a client centered model we  
18 are really being directed by what the client is  
19 presenting and seeking at that moment and they may  
20 not always tell us that they were referred from here  
21 or there so, no is there... are we keeping that  
22 information, no.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: The reason that I  
24 ask is because I've bene to the one in the Bronx, I  
25 haven't yet been to the one in Manhattan and I was

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 floored by the number of resources that you're  
3 offering there and if I was a person seeking those  
4 services, you know I would be ecstatic to find all of  
5 them under one roof and I just wonder if, you know  
6 the... if a... if a... just a regular person, you know that  
7 may be at home and may not be connected to services  
8 how is that person... how are we getting to that  
9 person, how does... how does she or he know this is  
10 where I need to be, right, if you're referred by NYPD  
11 or if you're referred by the district attorney's  
12 office that's easy, right but if we don't know how  
13 many are actually walking in because they heard about  
14 it, you know in the radio or they saw an ad, you know  
15 in the subway then, you know it'll kind of help us  
16 better service our constituents if we knew that they  
17 were being referred as opposed to they actually just  
18 run into the information because we're doing such a  
19 great job, you know in, in our outreach campaign.

20 CECILE NOEL: Well clearly if the  
21 district attorney or NYPD they are referring to us,  
22 NYPD even, even the uniform responses will carry  
23 cards for the FJC, we also do extensive outreach in  
24 communities that's where we're working, we're working  
25 to help folks really understand the services there

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 and connect in every way possible so we are always  
3 seeking new partnerships and new opportunities, if  
4 you know of any please let us know, to be able to go  
5 out there and really inform communities and let them  
6 know the center is there, the services are available  
7 as, as well as we work with health care providers to,  
8 to ensure that they're aware as well.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: No, I'm... listen,  
10 I'm your number one fan however I do believe that a  
11 tracking mechanism is really essential because it  
12 will... it will guide us, right, it will help... it's,  
13 it's a guiding tool, it will tell us, you know this  
14 is where the bulk of our constituents are coming  
15 from, right and this is where we need to maybe do a  
16 little bit better. So, I would strongly urge, you  
17 know some consideration to some sort of, of mechanism  
18 that allows us to, to better gauge that.

19 CECILE NOEL: And we'll certainly  
20 consider it.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Thank you so much.

22 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Thank you Council  
23 Member, we hadn't addressed that at all so thank you...

24 [cross-talk]

25

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Oh, look at that I  
3 found the one question that hasn't been asked.

4 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Wouldn't have  
5 even thought of it so thank you. And Commissioner you  
6 mentioned that the... did you... did I hear you just say  
7 that the NYPD police officers carry... [cross-talk]

8 CECILE NOEL: They have our... [cross-talk]

9 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...cards... [cross-  
10 talk]

11 CECILE NOEL: ...our, our palm cards.

12 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yeah... [cross-  
13 talk]

14 CECILE NOEL: And those are the DVPOs and  
15 they, they... [cross-talk]

16 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: The DVPOs carry  
17 them?

18 CECILE NOEL: Right...

19 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Got it. And then  
20 lastly, I want to ask about the sensitivities around  
21 undocumented individuals coming to the FJCs. How is  
22 that addressed when someone walks in and it's noted  
23 that they're an undocumented individual, how is that  
24 person... that information about that person handled?

25

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CECILE NOEL: Again, we work from a  
3 trauma informed, client centered model so we are...  
4 [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Sure, sure...  
6 [cross-talk]

7 CECILE NOEL: ...being directed by the  
8 survivor in a lot of our work, we understand many of  
9 the issues that undocumented clients face, one we  
10 want to ensure that we're communicating in the  
11 appropriate language that's the first thing and so  
12 again, I spoke about our telephonic interpretation  
13 services that were there, we are also trying to make  
14 sure that clients where possible if they're not  
15 comfortable... if, if, if they would like to be  
16 connected to a provider in the community that they  
17 feel is closer to home, better for them to access  
18 that we are supporting that in every way possible, we  
19 have expanded our immigration legal services to be in  
20 communities with organizations that are not normally  
21 DV organizations... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yeah... [cross-  
23 talk]

24 CECILE NOEL: ...to embed both DV,  
25 immigration and legal in those agencies to make our

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY  
2 response much more robust for, for undocumented  
3 clients who may not want to come into a Family  
4 Justice Center but we are also working closely with  
5 our, our, our community partners because they're the  
6 strongest voice, right... [cross-talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yeah... [cross-  
8 talk]

9 CECILE NOEL: ...they're the strongest  
10 voice in validating the work that happens in the FJC  
11 and even accompanying someone if they need to come.

12 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Have you ever had  
13 an incident where ICE was waiting outside the door or  
14 has come in?

15 CECILE NOEL: No and we don't ask  
16 anything about immigration status.

17 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay... [cross-  
18 talk]

19 CECILE NOEL: So, we do not ask unless  
20 it's related as I said it could be... [cross-talk]

21 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yeah, sure, sure...  
22 [cross-talk]

23 CECILE NOEL: ...related to immigration  
24 services, if we are... [cross-talk]

25

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: I was wondering...

3 [cross-talk]

4 CECILE NOEL: ...applying so we do not ask.

5 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay, hang on. I,  
6 I think that's it, thank you... [cross-talk]

7 CECILE NOEL: Okay... [cross-talk]

8 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...so much for your  
9 time, thank you to your... [cross-talk]

10 CECILE NOEL: Thank you, thank you...

11 [cross-talk]

12 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...staff the  
13 amazing work that your office does...

14 CECILE NOEL: Thank you...

15 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...really... you know  
16 we're all fans, we just want to make sure you have  
17 all the resources you need... [cross-talk]

18 CECILE NOEL: Really appreciate that,  
19 thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yep and if  
21 someone from your staff could stay to hear... [cross-  
22 talk]

23 CECILE NOEL: Yes... [cross-talk]

24 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...the comments...  
25 [cross-talk]



1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CECILE NOEL: ...somebody will be here...

3 [cross-talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...from the  
5 advocates and survivors?

6 CECILE NOEL: Absolutely, someone will be  
7 here... [cross-talk]

8 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Great... [cross-  
9 talk]

10 CECILE NOEL: ...thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Thank you  
12 Commissioner. I'm going to call up the next panel.  
13 I'm calling up Sarah Hayes from Sanctuary for  
14 Families; Andrew Sta. Ana from Day One and Rie Walker  
15 from Girls for Gender Equity. If Miss Hayes from  
16 Sanctuary for Families could kick it off... [cross-  
17 talk]

18 SARAH HAYES: Certainly... [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...that would be  
20 great, thank you for coming and we're going to...  
21 should we have a three minute clock or... if you could  
22 try not to have a 20 minute presentation and keep it  
23 around three minutes that would be helpful but I'm  
24 not going to start the clock yet.

25 SARAH HAYES: Okay...

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Thank you.

3 SARAH HAYES: Good afternoon, I'm Sarah  
4 Hayes, Deputy Director of the Economic Empowerment  
5 Program at Sanctuary for Families, New York City's  
6 largest provider of Services exclusively for  
7 survivors of domestic violence and other forms of  
8 gender-based violence. We are so grateful to the  
9 Committee on Women and Gender Equity and its Chair,  
10 Council Member Helen Rosenthal for the opportunity to  
11 speak today. We deeply appreciate the Council's  
12 strong efforts to support gender-based violence  
13 survivors and to better understand the range of  
14 issues that confront them. Sanctuary has worked in  
15 close partnership with the Mayor's Office to End  
16 Domestic and Gender Based Violence, END GBV since  
17 that office was established nearly two decades ago as  
18 a key community partner providing services at the New  
19 York City Family Justice Centers, FJCs since the  
20 first center was launched in Brooklyn in 2005.  
21 Sanctuary has a strong presence in all of the FJCs  
22 with 44 full time staff based out of the Manhattan,  
23 Brooklyn, Bronx and Queens FJCs and a monthly  
24 rotation of family law attorneys at the Staten Island  
25 FJC. Sanctuary is contracted to provide FJC family

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY  
2 law legal services and children services through  
3 grants administered by the Mayor's Office of Criminal  
4 Justice and provides counseling, case management,  
5 family law and economic stability services through  
6 our nonresidential services grant through DHS, DHS  
7 and HRA. Immigration legal services in Manhattan,  
8 Queens, Brooklyn and the Bronx are supported through  
9 a longstanding grant from the Robinhood Foundation  
10 and leveraging of City Council funds. We also offer  
11 our intensive four month career readiness training  
12 program in a beautiful recently completed 25 seat  
13 learning lab at the Manhattan FJC, the construction  
14 of which we are deeply grateful to the city for  
15 financing and executing in full. Here I want to  
16 directly acknowledge END GBV Commissioner Cecile Noel  
17 for her tireless advocacy in getting this center  
18 completed, her vision helped ensure that every detail  
19 of the learning lab was executed in the most high  
20 quality intentional way to invoke... to evoke the  
21 dignity and empowerment that the abused survivors who  
22 will use it in the years to come need and deserve...  
23 [cross-talk]

24 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Miss Hayes?

25 SARAH HAYES: Yes.

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: I'm, I'm looking  
3 at your testimony... [cross-talk]

4 SARAH HAYES: Yes... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...is there some  
6 way you could pick out the choice paragraphs and read  
7 those, all of it will be submitted for the... [cross-  
8 talk]

9 SARAH HAYES: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...record but if  
11 there's anything in particular that you would want us  
12 to know in order to... [cross-talk]

13 SARAH HAYES: ...certainly... [cross-talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...reflect  
15 something, thank you.

16 SARAH HAYES: Uh-huh.

17 [off mic dialogue]

18 SARAH HAYES: Got it, okay. So, here it  
19 is important to differentiate between two vital but  
20 often inaccurately completed areas of need for our  
21 survivors of violence in the city; economic stability  
22 and economic empowerment, Sanctuary addresses both  
23 areas looking at our client's needs as part of a  
24 continuum from immediate safety and survival to  
25 stability to long term self-sufficiency and freedom

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 from violence. Our economic stability specialist as  
3 well as family, immigration, housing and public  
4 benefits attorneys work with clients on a range of  
5 needs that help them achieve stability in the wake of  
6 violence, obtaining and maintaining public benefits,  
7 finding affordable housing with subsidies where  
8 available, securing child and spousal support and  
9 obtaining other income and material supports such as  
10 emergency cash, food and clothing. By contrast our  
11 economic empowerment program and programs like it  
12 focus on preparing abuse survivors to enter and  
13 thrive in the city's service sector economy. EEP's  
14 goal is to impart the skills and experience  
15 participants need to meet this job marketplace on  
16 it's own terms and find career track jobs and  
17 ultimately cycle off public benefits for good.

18 Sanctuary delivers EEP signature four month career  
19 training programs to 150 to 180 survivors annually, an  
20 increase of over 50 percent from previous capacity  
21 thanks to the opening of the MFJC learning lab last  
22 year. Graduates obtain nationally recognized  
23 certification in Microsoft word, excel, power point,  
24 and outlook as well as enhanced literacy skills and  
25 extensive professional development. The program has a

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 strong emphasis on social justice and belief system  
3 development, the... sorry, for, for participants  
4 believe specifically in self and the belief that they  
5 have a place in the city's robust 21<sup>st</sup> century  
6 economy. There outcome... our outcomes are  
7 extraordinary. More than 950 clients have been  
8 trained and 450 placed in jobs since the program  
9 began in 2011. Since January 2019, EEP has placed 60  
10 graduates in jobs with starting wages averaging over  
11 20 dollars per hour. Seven clients have been hired as  
12 administrative staff at JP Morgan Chase at salaries  
13 of 60 to 70,000 dollars annually and many more at  
14 Wilmer Hale, Goldman Sach and other major firms,  
15 there are even several EEP graduates in training at  
16 the City Council. But programs like this are  
17 inherently intensive, meaningful career training  
18 cannot be fast tracked in a few hours a day over... or  
19 over a week or two. With most short term job  
20 readiness training and rapid placement programs abuse  
21 survivors are tracked into low skill, low wage work,  
22 jubs that, that... jobs which generally offer no  
23 opportunity for career advancement or wage growth...

24 [cross-talk]

25 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Miss Hayes?

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 SARAH HAYES: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

3 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: If you could just  
4 pick one more choice paragraph... [cross-talk]

5 SARAH HAYES: Sure. So, I'll just jump  
6 down to the bottom. So, we know that these women many  
7 of them EEP clients, many of these survivors do  
8 remarkably well in service sector jobs ranging from  
9 health care, technology to finance and law and we  
10 know that helping them attain economic empowerment is  
11 a sound investment particularly given that so many  
12 are single mothers bringing up the next generation of  
13 our city's children. Sanctuary's vision for the  
14 future includes opening our career training program  
15 in other boroughs... [cross-talk]

16 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: There you go,  
17 that's what I'm looking forward to hearing about...

18 SARAH HAYES: ...such as replicating the  
19 successful program END GBV has helped us to launch at  
20 the Manhattan's FJC. It includes expanding the range  
21 of available career pathways to accommodate those  
22 clients for whom service sector office jobs may not  
23 be attractive or attainable and it includes enhancing  
24 EEP's literacy offerings to provide more robust  
25 assistance with high school equivalency, college

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 access and English for speakers of other languages.

3 All of these goals are attainable but not without

4 substantially more investment from the city. We're...

5 shall I continue or... [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: I think... well...

7 thank you but can I just ask you a quick question?

8 SARAH HAYES: Certainly.

9 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: What do you

10 think... what do you think is holding the city back

11 from having a learning lab at all the FJCs, is it a

12 matter... are there boroughs where it's a matter of

13 physical space, on site physical space or is it, you

14 know funding?

15 SARAH HAYES: Well I, I don't have the

16 inside track on that, I would imagine... it, it took

17 time for the lab to be built out at the Manhattan FJC

18 and then they had to kind of like commandeer space

19 that was being used and they shifted people so I

20 would imagine that that is a barrier but I'm not

21 exactly sure what... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: I'd love to

23 follow up on that with you but let's keep going and...

24 sure.

25 SARAH HAYES: Uh-huh...



1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 [off mic dialogue]

3 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: You know what  
4 you're... how about we do this, come on up and, and  
5 just say your name and... it, it's important to speak  
6 into the microphone for the purpose of the record or  
7 transcript... [cross-talk]

8 [off mic dialogue]

9 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Thank you, we'll  
10 follow up.

11 ANDREW STA. ANA: Hi, my name is Andrew  
12 Sta. Ana, I'm the Director of Legal Services at Day  
13 One. I'm going to keep my comments brief and since  
14 they are already written I think I just want to  
15 respond to some of the things that were said and ask  
16 some... add a little bit to the conversation. Just for  
17 folks who don't know, Day One is the only  
18 organization in New York committing its full  
19 resources to dating violence among youth aged 24 and  
20 under. We work to create a world without dating  
21 violence by delivering a combination of services that  
22 include social services, legal advocacy for young  
23 survivors of relationship abuse, leadership  
24 development for teenagers and preventative education  
25 for students K through 12. We've been around since

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 2003 and we have educated or assisted annually more  
3 than 18,000 youth under the age of age 24. We work  
4 both inside and outside of traditional systems but  
5 also within the courts, schools, with law  
6 enforcement, through partnerships with the DOE and  
7 also of course with END GBV and so where END GBV is  
8 at this access point between a bridging space between  
9 let's say the community and systems. We know that  
10 many systems and services are adapting to serve youth  
11 but these systems were not designed with young people  
12 in mind so with that said, a lot of... a lot of our  
13 services from courts to schools, to case managers, to  
14 attorneys, to police, to HRA, to shelters a lot of  
15 the work that we do is to transform those systems so  
16 that it can be more accessible to youth. So, with  
17 that in mind we're offering this testimony that  
18 focuses on our unique experiences of working with  
19 young survivors. We're an onsite partner at a couple  
20 of FJCs and we're an offsite partner for all of them  
21 so with that we're hoping to provide some valuable  
22 information towards this testimony. So, what that  
23 means is... and just truth be told we're also working  
24 with END GBV pretty closely on a lot of these issues  
25 so they're not going to be a surprise to anyone

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 there. So, with that said from initial appointments  
3 to regular visits, Family Justice Centers should be  
4 an accessible point for young survivors and I'm not  
5 sure other folks have raised this but there's often  
6 this perceived concern about the actual accessibility  
7 or inaccessibility of Family Justice Centers.

8 They're... they are loco... co-located with district  
9 attorneys offices so what that means is that for many  
10 folks including young people, including, including  
11 undocumented folks, including LGBTQ survivors,  
12 including young people or, or clients generally who  
13 have involvement in the criminal legal system that  
14 access point is, is hobbled a little bit, it's a  
15 space where some folks have some questions about can  
16 I actually enter this space and so what we'd offer to  
17 that conversation is that that also is... presents  
18 problems for young people, right, so you can imagine  
19 for a young person going to a Family Justice Center  
20 on a metro card or wondering if their parents are  
21 going to be alerted if they go through security,  
22 things like that. So, for thing... these are  
23 conversations that we have on an ongoing basis with  
24 the FJC because for a young person, right, who could  
25 conceivably be LGBTQ, be undocumented and experience

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 dating violence, we wonder about what it means for a  
3 young person or really any client to access these  
4 systems. What does it mean for a young person to  
5 create... to file a police report, will they be taken  
6 seriously? What happens to the data that, that is  
7 delivered and so I know that that was a little bit of  
8 a conversation about this here... through this hearing  
9 but where does it go, does it live in the city  
10 forever, right, so what happens with this? For young  
11 people particularly at an organization that values  
12 the data of young people, what does it mean like does  
13 this just exist in perpetuity including somebody's  
14 age and name, what legal protections are there to  
15 protect that data and is it ever actually deleted,  
16 right. Other questions that we ask... or think and  
17 again we're in partnership with the FJCs and END GBV  
18 about this, can young people visit the FJCs without  
19 their parent's knowledge or more particularly, in  
20 cases in which disclosing harm that they're  
21 experiencing in their relationship to their parents  
22 or to the schools or to other service providers can  
23 that cause more harm, right. So, for anyone accessing  
24 the FJC... [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Sorry to  
3 interrupt but... [cross-talk]

4 ANDREW STA. ANA: Yeah... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...quick question,  
6 are... [cross-talk]

7 ANDREW STA. ANA: Sure... [cross-talk]

8 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...you saying that  
9 you don't have an answer to that question?

10 ANDREW STA. ANA: I'm saying that these  
11 are questions that we've raised at the FJCs and we're  
12 working with them on those issues so that is to say  
13 that the... [cross-talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: But... so,  
15 yesterday someone came in, a young person came in  
16 were they given a clear answer whether they walked  
17 in, in one borough or another about whether or not  
18 that information... whether or not someone at the  
19 center is obligated to call the parent?

20 ANDREW STA. ANA: Right, so that actually  
21 is an active question, right, so I think... [cross-  
22 talk]

23 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay... [cross-  
24 talk]

25

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 ANDREW STA. ANA: ...to the extent we... and  
3 for us I think... and, and again this is often through  
4 partnership with the FJCs because I think... again  
5 going back to my earlier point, these systems were  
6 not designed with young people in mind and so there's  
7 an adaptive curve that happens as we make these  
8 spaces more accessible to young people.

9 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Legally do you  
10 happen to know if they're required?

11 ANDREW STA. ANA: So, I think I could  
12 answer that from the perspective of... from the work  
13 that we do at Day One, I certainly couldn't speak on  
14 behalf of the city or whatever their responsibilities  
15 are. At Day One I think... you know it's because we  
16 often engage in a legal relationship with young  
17 people that young person can... is entitled to, you  
18 know sort of confidential legal services things like  
19 that. I think on other spaces particularly for things  
20 like let's say therapy there are other protections  
21 that could potentially protect young people but I  
22 think on... as it scales out to other community based  
23 organizations in relationship with the city those are  
24 still ongoing questions, does that make... does that  
25 offer...

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yeah, that... thank  
3 you for raising that.

4 ANDREW STA. ANA: Sure, the other... and I,  
5 I want to keep it quick is I, I know that to the  
6 extent that there's also data collected we know that  
7 there are many statistics that are often produced by  
8 END GBV and other partner organizations about the  
9 ages of people who are victims of homicide, right and  
10 so to the extent that 26 percent of victims of  
11 homicide were between the ages of 16 to 29, you know  
12 to the extent that there is information that we pull  
13 out about... on the ages of victims that also can help  
14 us figure out how great the need is and where to...  
15 potentially resources should be directed towards  
16 younger folks, you know there was a, a report maybe  
17 perhaps for another hearing, there's one report  
18 issued by END GBV in January 2019 that talked about  
19 the prevalence of stalking between... for... that impact  
20 young people ages 18 to 24, that's another thing to  
21 look into, right, so when we think about how abuse  
22 manifest across ages and it's disproportionate impact  
23 on young people whether through cyberstalking or  
24 stalking in person, I want to keep that... I want to  
25 raise that to the attention of the, the Council.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: That's very helpful, just quickly say we've been joined by Council Member Brad Lander from Brooklyn and are you... just to make sure I understood what you just said, would you recommend that they issue that report on an annual basis?

ANDREW STA. ANA: I don't... I, I, I guess I wouldn't want to make... I would love for that to happen and I also want to be mindful of the resources request... required to issue a report on that... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay... [cross-talk]

ANDREW STA. ANA: ...annual basis... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Thank you.

ANDREW STA. ANA: A couple... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yeah, if you could just finish up.

ANDREW STA. ANA: Yeah, sure... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Thanks... [cross-talk]



1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 ANDREW STA. ANA: ...the other quick points  
3 that I want to make is that, I, I know that this is a  
4 hearing on, on the work of the, the, the.. of END GBV  
5 but there was one thing that was issued in the report  
6 that I wanted to comment on which is the conference  
7 number, we have safety, accountability and support,  
8 exploring alternatives to intimate partner violence.  
9 I just want to briefly say that at Day One we firmly  
10 believe that the end of intimate partner violence  
11 includes accountability for the person who caused  
12 harm but also a deeper conversation about the role  
13 that communities and family can play in the  
14 community... the elimination of all harm. We recognize  
15 that, that restorative practices might not be  
16 relevant for all survivors but we recognize  
17 particularly in the intersections of youth, for  
18 communities of color, for LGBTQ communities and for  
19 communities who have negative, negative experiences  
20 of the criminal legal system that, that there are  
21 practices that we can learn from around those issues.  
22 So... and to reiterate and clarify, we believe that  
23 there are... there is a role for END GBV and the  
24 Mayor's Office and even government systems to play in  
25 helping bridge that space but we also do not believe

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY  
2 that, that, that... we believe that there's a framework  
3 of, of addressing intimate partner violence that  
4 doesn't equate punishment as the exclusive form of  
5 accountability and that's really important for us as  
6 the work we do with young people and I know that  
7 there was... and the last thing I'll just say, I know  
8 that another piece of the agenda was to urge congress  
9 to reauthorize VAWA and we're here for that too. So,  
10 thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Thank you.

12 RIE WALKER: Good afternoon Chair  
13 Rosenthal and Council Members. MY name is Rie Walker  
14 and I'm a Policy Intern at Girls for Gender Equity or  
15 as we refer to it GGE. Thank you for holding this  
16 hearing and giving me the opportunity to speak, I'll  
17 give an abridge version of the testimony... [cross-  
18 talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Thank you..  
20 [cross-talk]

21 RIE WALKER: ...that you have on record  
22 just for times sake. We at GGE share s common goal  
23 with the initiatives today, we are a youth  
24 development organization and advocacy organization...

25 [off mic dialogue]

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 RIE WALKER: Oh, sorry. We're based in  
3 New York City and we're committed to the physical,  
4 psychological and social and economic development of  
5 girls and women. We are offering testimony today in  
6 order to ensure that this body and the general public  
7 understand how important it is to consider and work  
8 with young people particularly young people of color  
9 when reviewing the harms of domestic violence and  
10 programs to mitigate its prevalence. As many of you  
11 know domestic violence is not abuse which occurs  
12 between or at the hands of adults especially as you  
13 spoke to. Nationwide nine percent of female and  
14 approximately six percent of male high school  
15 students report having experienced physical dating  
16 violence in the last year. In New York City the  
17 average is even higher, 12 percent of students report  
18 experiencing physical dating violence. Studies  
19 indicate that teen survivors of dating abuse are  
20 three times more likely to miss school due to not  
21 feeling safe, three times more likely to carry a  
22 weapon to school and twice as likely to experience  
23 bullying at school. These behaviors are a  
24 characteristic of a process called school push out, a  
25 term coined, coined by Dr. Monique Morris and it

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 describes how girls and non-binary youth often lose  
3 out on educational opportunities because of system  
4 failures including school based sexual harassment. As  
5 an organization which directly works with young  
6 people and being a 20-year-old myself I understand  
7 how imperative it is to recognize the many ways young  
8 people are implicated in domestic violence so it can  
9 be comprehensively addressed. GGE has been a leader  
10 in a conversation around gender-based violence  
11 including sexual harassment, abuse and dating  
12 violence for close to two decades with the allocation  
13 of funding for full time title IX coordinators we  
14 celebrate... we and the city celebrate a huge victory  
15 for our youth. We thank the Council Members for  
16 seeing the necessity and taking concrete steps toward  
17 making schools safer spaces, ones more adequately  
18 able to address dating violence. We have been an  
19 advocate for comprehensive sexual health education  
20 which includes topics such as consent and dating  
21 violence. Sexual health education is not taught in  
22 this way, rape culture and similar gendered  
23 assumptions and the negative stereotypes of male and  
24 female sexuality continue to be perpetuated. We are  
25 given a unique opportunity in the classroom to

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 execute preventative programs and kickstart  
3 generational cultural change. I hope this continues  
4 to be recognized in the city's work. I also want to  
5 speak quickly to VAWA, when calling for resources to  
6 be allocated for the protection of women from sexual,  
7 domestic and intimate partner violence many  
8 organizations at the forefront of VAWA historically  
9 ignored the threat that law enforcement presents for  
10 cis and trans black girls and women, GNC communities,  
11 native American girls or women, immigrants and sex,  
12 sex workers who long experienced harm at the hands of  
13 law enforcement and other state actors. VAWA's annual  
14 allocations appear primarily as grants to coalitions  
15 with a great deal of those resources going to police  
16 departments and prosecutor's offices. These  
17 investments fail to recognize how law enforcement and  
18 prisons operate as added sources of sexual violence  
19 for people of color within the U.S. Our hope is that  
20 anti violence organizations which look to  
21 alternatives to incarceration and criminalization  
22 will be lifted up and any resources to domestic  
23 violence on the city, state and federal levels. In  
24 addition, we look forward to continued commitment to  
25 prevention and education. We thank the Council and in

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 particular the Committee on Women and Gender Equity  
3 for the opportunity to share our work and look  
4 forward to continuing to support as we serve all New  
5 Yorkers together.

6 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Thank you. Do you  
7 know how much I love your organization so thank you  
8 for always being here? We're, we're going to follow  
9 up offline on a couple of the issues that were raised  
10 today, thank you so much for coming to testify. I'm  
11 going to call up the next panel unless Council Member  
12 Lander...

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: No, just thank  
14 you guys for all your work and for being here and  
15 thank... [cross-talk]

16 RIE WALKER: Thank you... [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...you to the Chair  
18 for convening this important hearing. Alright, well  
19 I'd, I'd be honored to be added as a co-sponsor to  
20 this important resolution, thank you for bringing it  
21 forward.

22 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Next I would like  
23 to call up Merble Reagon from the Women's Center for  
24 Education and Career Advancement as well as Mary Luke  
25 from the UN Women Metro New York City and PowHer,

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 didn't know that, great. You want to start? You're  
3 welcome to start... [cross-talk]

4 MARY LUKE: Oh, okay... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...thank you.

6 MARY LUKE: Well thank you so much for  
7 this opportunity. As you know UN Women is really such  
8 a, a strong advocate and really symbolizes the  
9 importance of women's economic empowerment as well as  
10 political participation and violence against women.  
11 So, I'm here to speak on behalf of the  
12 intersectionality of all of these issues and as a  
13 member also of the PowHer Board of Directors. So,  
14 it's really... you know we're, we're just so pleased  
15 that the Commission has really taken this approach of  
16 joining the issues of ending gender-based violence  
17 and economic empowerment. This is being done I think  
18 in a very unique way not only for the city but also  
19 for the state and for the country and I think that  
20 the lessons that we learn from that are going to be  
21 very, very useful as we really enter, you know the  
22 next decades. So, I think it would be wonderful to  
23 see much more documentation about the  
24 interrelationship between these issues, it would be  
25 wonderful to see the economic empowerment programs

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 growing. In the data that, you know we've seen in the  
3 reports and as we enter... as the UN enters the 25<sup>th</sup>  
4 anniversary of the Beijing Platform for Action it  
5 would be wonderful if we could see some stories from  
6 the city and data from the city that really speaks to  
7 the issue of the linkages between these issues.  
8 Finally, I, I really want to commend you and now Brad  
9 Lander for your resolution to have the city pass the  
10 violence against women act, it is so important that  
11 this country, the senate and the president takes a  
12 stand on ending domestic violence and gender based  
13 violence. So, we appreciate your, your efforts in  
14 that regard. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Thank you.

16 MERBLE REAGON: Hello, my name is Merble  
17 Reagon, I'm Executive Director of the Women's Center  
18 for Education and Career Advancement. I also want to  
19 thank the Women and Gender Equity Committee of the  
20 New York City Council for this opportunity to speak  
21 briefly about the current economic status of working  
22 aged women in our city. I want to thank also the  
23 Mayor's Office to End Domestic and Gender Based  
24 Violence. Over the decades that our senator helped  
25 thousands of women to prepare for further education,



1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 jobs and careers we learned that full time jobs in  
3 New York City didn't always mean that they were  
4 earning enough money to meet their family's most  
5 basic living expenses. For four decades we made the  
6 case for economic empowerment of women as a key  
7 factor in the wellbeing of New York City working  
8 families. For more than 20 years we've provided  
9 comprehensive services for New York City displaced  
10 homemakers, the majority of whom were victims of  
11 ongoing domestic violence. The intersectionality of  
12 economic empowerment and domestic violence informed  
13 the range of services that the Women's Center  
14 provided to thousands of New York City women. Since  
15 2000 we partnered with other human services agencies  
16 to define exactly what incomes New York City working  
17 families need to earn to make ends meet depending on  
18 where they lived in New York City and the ages of  
19 their children, also I want to announce that I'm a  
20 newly elected board member of PowHer New York, which  
21 families in our cities are working and can't afford  
22 the basic necessities. More than 2.5 million New York  
23 City men, women and children and working families  
24 many headed by women who are experiencing economic  
25 distress on a daily basis are routinely overlooked

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 and undercounted. We have attached to this testimony  
3 sample self-sufficiency budgets. Note that these  
4 budgets... these are break even budgets, they do not  
5 include extras such as vacations, emergency, college,  
6 retirement or other savings, food from outside the  
7 home, credit card or loan payments and many other  
8 things the rest of us take for granted. We are  
9 encouraging the City Council, when we work toward  
10 economic... equity and empowerment for women and their  
11 families to think not just about moving families  
12 above the poverty level. Where a family in New York  
13 City of four rising above poverty means that that  
14 family earns 28,000 dollars a year for four people.  
15 Fifteen dollars an hour provides an income of about  
16 30,000 dollars for a family of four, we all know  
17 wherever you live in New York City that's not enough  
18 money. If you take a look at the two budgets, sample  
19 budgets that we included one is for an adult and a  
20 school aged child, the other is for two adults and  
21 two school aged children. In general, 15 dollars an  
22 hour does not support any family of any size in New  
23 York City. So, we encourage the City Council and  
24 actually the government of New York City including  
25 the Mayor when we think about women's equity and

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 empowerment let's think in terms of how much money it  
3 actually takes to make ends meet. We have calculated  
4 self-sufficiency budgets for over 700 family types in  
5 seven different parts of New York City. So, we have  
6 northwest Brooklyn, the balance of Brooklyn, we have  
7 Queens, we have Staten Island, we have the Bronx, we  
8 have north Manhattan and we have south Manhattan. The  
9 reason that it is 700 plus family types in each  
10 geographic area is that we make a distinction among  
11 ages of children, for women in particular women  
12 headed families whether you have an infant, a  
13 preschooler or school aged or a teenager determines  
14 how much money you need for each aspect of your  
15 budget. So, we encourage public policy makers,  
16 educators, trainers to think within the context of  
17 what's reality based for New York City. Since you  
18 have distributed my testimony, I'm not going to go  
19 over all of the details and the findings. We have  
20 seven different briefs in our most recent economic  
21 self-sufficiency reports. As I said we... you know we  
22 worked with thousands of women over the years, we  
23 placed them in jobs and thought great we have done a  
24 terrific job, they came back to us and what they said  
25 is, I'm having trouble managing credit, can you help

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 us with financial education. We did the research, we  
3 worked with hundreds of women and what we determined  
4 is that they were not abusing credit and they were  
5 not abusing the income that they had. They were  
6 working in full time jobs which did not support them  
7 and their families which is how we came in the year  
8 2000 to try to figure out how much money do people  
9 need to earn to make ends meet in New York City. So,  
10 I'm going to skip over the findings and say that we  
11 have since the year 2000 generated reports on what it  
12 actually costs to live and work in New York City. The  
13 most recent report is the fifth one and you can see  
14 what we've... through what has been distributed that we  
15 worked on the data for a year and a half for this  
16 most recent report. After that time we collaborated  
17 with the 32 community based and human services  
18 organizations on the back of each brief to determine  
19 what public policies would help most to help our low  
20 wage working families in New York City who are not  
21 earning enough money, they represent over 900 family...  
22 900,000 families in New York City and so we worked  
23 with our colleagues from the 32 agencies to develop a  
24 series of public policy recommendations which you'll  
25 find in this key findings and recommend,

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 recommendations brief. We looked at specific  
3 characteristics, the public policy changes that would  
4 be most impactful in increasing income, those that  
5 would be most powerful in reducing major non-  
6 discretionary cost, those that would reach a broad  
7 audience and traditionally marginalized New York City  
8 populations, those that would advance coordinated and  
9 interconnected solutions and we looked for policy  
10 changes that have already gained traction  
11 legislatively and or have established public support.  
12 So, specifically, I mean there are lots of them here  
13 in this document. I'll just talk about two that  
14 relate to the women that we're most concerned about  
15 in this testimony, one would be to increase wages to  
16 align with the true cost of living. The cost of  
17 living in New York City since we've been doing these  
18 reports in the year... since the year 2000, have  
19 increased three times the rate of wage increases and  
20 so we think that's an episode. People are doing the  
21 right thing, working hard, earning money, getting  
22 incremental increases but the cost of living has  
23 increased three times that much. So, we need to  
24 address the reality of their lives. I won't go over  
25 the thank yous that I was going to make on behalf of

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 all of us for the state and city progress that we've  
3 made over the last four years except to say that I  
4 think this is an important time in which the city and  
5 the state can be aligned on enacting some really  
6 progressive and consequential legislation and so we  
7 encourage everybody to use the data, this is very  
8 exciting reading for your summers on the beach and  
9 every place else. You can go to the website that's  
10 listed here and you can do a number of things. You  
11 can put in a client family's actual budget and income  
12 and you can... you will see what that family's break  
13 even self-sufficiency budget is. You can look at  
14 different parts of Brooklyn or the Bronx and see  
15 where the need is greatest. You can play with your  
16 own budget. One of the things that we've... we have  
17 over the years trained over 5,000 city workers to use  
18 our self-sufficiency calculator which as it says at  
19 the end here, in less than five minutes, you put in a  
20 client family's or your own income and budget and it  
21 will tell you whether you are now working at a  
22 deficit or a surplus, it will show you which benefits  
23 that will supplement wages or reduced expenses you  
24 might be eligible for and the impact on your budget  
25 and it will give you your self-sufficiency income.

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

2 So, I will just say on behalf of some of you here in  
3 the audience that as we have done this work, I said  
4 we trained over 5,000 people to use our calculator,  
5 they represented over 500 nonprofit organizations, at  
6 least half of the staff of those organizations ran  
7 the calculator on... for themselves and their family  
8 and said I am working in a job that pays me so little  
9 that I am going into debt every month. So, that's  
10 another session about people who work for human  
11 services organizations, but it is relevant to the  
12 women that we want to protect through the work that's  
13 being done by this particular city agency. And then  
14 there's a little box at the end which says that we  
15 have a new self-sufficiency calculator, it will be  
16 open source which means that any agency, any  
17 organization can take it at no cost, customize it for  
18 their client base, it was developed as open source  
19 because we did not want people to make money from it  
20 but we wanted them to be able to use it and Council  
21 Member Ben Kallos was one of the initial, initial  
22 funders for this project. So, we'd like to come back  
23 in the fall and demonstrate that for you, it takes  
24 about three minutes.

25 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Game on.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

MERBLE REAGON: Thank you.

MARY LUKE: Great.

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Thank you both for your hard work, it's extraordinary and we'll be coming back.

MERBLE REAGON: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: And with that... is there other... any other... okay. And with that this hearing is called to an end, thank you.

MERBLE REAGON: Thank you.

[gavel]



C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date

June 30, 2019