

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

STATED MEETING

----- X

December 10, 2019

Start: 1:30 p.m.

Recess: 2:40 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Corey Johnson
Speaker

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Adrienne E. Adams
Alicka Ampry-Samuel
Diana Ayala
Inez D. Barron
Joseph C. Borelli
Justin Brannan
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret S. Chin
Costa Constantinides
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Laurie A. Cumbo
Chaim M. Deutsch
Ruben Diaz, Sr.
Daniel Dromm
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Mathieu Eugene
Vanessa L. Gibson
Mark Gjonaj
Barry Grodenchik
Robert Holden

Ben Kallos
Andy King
Peter Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Rory I. Lancman
Brad Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Farah Louis
Alan N. Maisel
Steven Matteo
Carlos Menchaca
I. Daneek Miller
Francisco Moya
Bill Perkins
Keith Powers
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Carlina Rivera
Ydanis Rodriguez
Deborah Rose
Helen K. Rosenthal
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Ritchie J. Torres
Mark Treyger
Eric A. Ulrich
Paul Vallone
Jimmy Van Bramer
Kalman Yeger

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

2 [TRANSCRIPTION NOTE: BEGINNING OF AUDIO
3 FILE IS BLANK, AUDIO STARTS AT 00:06:52}

4 UNIDENTIFIED: [beginning of sentence
5 missing] over the last three years before he passed.
6 But the compassion and the care that SIUH showed my
7 father and my family, ah, second to none. So I just
8 want to thank you once again from the bottom of our
9 hearts, on behalf of Council Member Borelli. Thank
10 you, and I know Dr. Cooper, maybe you want to say a
11 few words?

12 DR. COOPER: Well, thank you so much for
13 having all of us and, John, I just want to thank you
14 and all of Staten Island and New Yorkers who entrust
15 their family members to our care. Many of us,
16 including myself, have had family members at Staten
17 Island University Hospital and we stand as hopefully
18 a beacon of hope for patients who are badly injured
19 or have complex wounds, when you come to our hospital
20 to know that among our clinical staff, our clerical
21 staff, our administration that we give you 100%
22 dedication and that we're so thankful to have you to
23 support us and our council to recognize our nurses
24 and other administration today, so thank you so much.

2 UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you. [applause] And
3 just asked John if he wants to say a few words and he
4 humbly said no, but I know how, I know what it means
5 to him, so on behalf of Council Member Dromm, who,
6 and Joe and I were going to ask the clerk and of the
7 Speaker, of course, to, we're OK?, to read the proc.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Council City of
9 New York Proclamation. The New York City Council is
10 proud to honor Dr. Michael Leslie Cooper, Dr. Kimlin
11 Charmaine Long, and the entire nursing staff of the
12 Burn Center at Northwell Health, Staten Island
13 University Hospital, for their unwavering commitment
14 to providing the highest quality of care. And
15 whereas Staten Island University Hospital, a member
16 of Northwell Health, is the borough's foremost
17 teaching hospital and one of the largest in the New
18 York metropolitan area, now in its 155th year, it has
19 grown into a two-campus, 668-bed certified medical
20 center and the borough's largest employer with 7000
21 positions. Its medical-dental staff comprises over
22 1000 physicians and dentists who practice in more
23 than 40 medical, surgical, and dental specialties and
24 subspecialties. On this occasion it is a great
25 privilege to pay tribute to one of its incredible

2 centers of care and the people who have worked
3 tireless to make it such a success. And whereas
4 Staten Island University Hospital's Jerome L.
5 Finkelstein, M.D. Regional Burn Center offers 24-
6 hour, family-focused medical care to critically and
7 acutely ill patients. It also includes therapeutic
8 services as needed for rehabilitation in addition to
9 occupational and resiliency therapy. And whereas Dr.
10 Cooper and the entire nursing staff in the 10-bed
11 intensive care unit at the burn center are truly
12 committed to providing world-class comprehensive,
13 compassionate, innovative care to their patients.
14 Knowing how traumatic and life-changing a burn injury
15 can be, they address the patient's healing in both
16 body and mind. They also give loved ones 24-hour
17 access to the patient's bedside and involve them in
18 every aspect of the healing process. In effect, the
19 staff treat the patient's family as one of their own.
20 And whereas day in and day out the burn center's team
21 demonstrate a profound dedication to quality care and
22 compassion to their patients and do their very best
23 to promote healing and support their recovery.
24 Although every person working there could be
25 considered an unsung hero, let us sing their praises

1 STATED MEETING

7

2 from this day forward and convey the appreciation
3 they truly deserve. Now therefore be it known that
4 the New York City Council gratefully honors Dr. Mic
5 Leslie Cooper, Dr. Kimlin Charmaine Long, and the
6 nursing staff of the Jerome L. Finkelstein, M.D.
7 Regional Burn Center at Staten Island University
8 Hospital for their extraordinary service to New York
9 City. Corey Johnson, speaker for the entire council,
10 Steven Matteo, Minority Leader, 50th District, Staten
11 Island, Joseph Borelli, Council Member, 51st
12 District, Staten Island, and Deborah Rose, Council
13 Member, Council Member, 49th District, Staten Island.

14 [applause]

15 UNIDENTIFIED: So, again, we're gonna get
16 a picture. I just want to, again, thank everyone.
17 Dr. Cooper, thank you to you and your wonderful staff
18 on behalf of all of us at the council. We thank you.
19 Please keep up the great work. We're counting on
20 you. And on behalf of Council Member [inaudible]
21 Holden, Koo, and Dromm, we want to say thank you
22 again and let's get a nice group picture. [applause]

23 [no sound from this point to 39:38]

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Quiet on the floor
25 please, quiet on the floor.

1 STATED MEETING

8

2 UNIDENTIFIED: Sit down, please, sit
3 down.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: At this time please
5 place all electronic devices, all electronic devices
6 to vibrate, and will all non-council employees, non-
7 council employees, please leave the main floor of the
8 chambers. There is additional seating upstairs in
9 the balcony. Thank you. Madam Majority Leader.

10 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: [gavel] Good
11 afternoon and welcome to the Stated Meeting of
12 December 10, 2019. I am Majority Leader Laurie
13 Cumbo. Please rise for the Pledge of Allegiance.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise.

15 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I pledge
16 allegiance to the flag of the United States of
17 America, and to the republic for which it stands, one
18 nation under God, indivisible, with liberty and
19 justice for all. Roll call.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Adams. Ampry-
21 Samuel. Ayala.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Here.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Barron.
24 Borelli.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Brannan.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.
3 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Cabrera.
4 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.
5 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Chin.
6 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.
7 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Cohen.
8 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.
9 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Constantinides.
10 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Present.
11 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Cornegy.
12 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Present.
13 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Deutsch.
14 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Here.
15 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Diaz.
16 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Present.
17 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Dromm.
18 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.
19 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Espinal.
20 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.
21 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Eugene. Gibson.
22 Gjonaj.
23 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Present.
24 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Grodenchik.
25 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Here.

2 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Holden.
3 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Here.
4 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Kallos.
5 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.
6 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: King. Koo.
7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.
8 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Koslowitz.
9 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.
10 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Lancman.
11 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.
12 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Lander.
13 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.
14 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Levin. Levine.
15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.
16 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Louis.
17 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Here.
18 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Maisel.
19 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.
20 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Menchaca.
21 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.
22 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Miller.
23 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Present.
24 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Moya. Perkins.
25 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Present.

1 STATED MEETING

11

2

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Powers.

3

COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Here.

4

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Reynoso.

5

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Here.

6

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Richards.

7

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

8

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Rivera.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Present.

10

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Rodriguez.

11

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Presente.

12

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Rose.

13

Rosenthal.

14

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.

15

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Salamanca.

16

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.

17

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Torres.

18

Treyger.

19

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.

20

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Ulrich.

21

Borelli.

22

COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Here.

23

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Vallone.

24

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

25

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Gibson.

2

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Here.

3

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Van Bramer.

4

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Yeger.

5

COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here.

6

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Matteo.

7

MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: Here.

8

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Cumbo.

9

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Present.

10

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Speaker Johnson.

11

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Right here.

12

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: We have a quorum

13

and we will now have today's invocation, which will

14

be delivered by Rabbi Mark Kaiserman of the Reformed

15

Temple of Forest Hills, located at 71-11 112th Street

16

in Forest Hill, Queens.

17

SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise.

18

RABBI KAISERMAN: It is a season of

19

giving. Our lives shift towards presents and helping

20

those in need. How sad that January will soon arrive

21

and we will all go back to our selfish existence.

22

May this time of kindness stick with us everywhere we

23

go, when we walk down busy New York streets, when we

24

concern ourselves the needs of our family, friends,

25

and coworkers, when we consider laws and bills and

2 how we might dispense justice, when we look at each
3 person and treat them as if they were created in the
4 image of God. May the year ahead be a year of
5 blessing, compassion, and caring. Not for the
6 presents we might get or simply to reflect the
7 seasons, but for the gifts we can give each day and
8 the season we can create throughout our lives. May
9 we each find the strength and love to make this a
10 better world for everyone, every day, throughout the
11 entire year. Amen.

12 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you so
13 much, Rabbi Kaiserman, for that inspirational 2020
14 invocation. I'd now like to call on Council Member
15 Karen Koslowitz to spread the invocation onto the
16 record.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Thank you.
18 Rabbi Mark Kaiserman became the rabbi of Reformed
19 Temple of Forest Hills in July 2013, returning to his
20 childhood New York City and becoming part of this
21 dynamic synagogue community. During his rabbinic
22 career, Rabbi Kaiserman has worked at all ends of the
23 country. He served as the rabbi of Temple Emmanuel
24 in Livingston, New Jersey, as assistant associate
25 rabbi of Temple Emmanuel in Dallas, Texas, and interim

2 rabbi at Congregation B'nai Tzedek in Fountain
3 Valley, California. Originally from Brooklyn, New
4 York, Rabbi Kaiserman received a BA in English
5 literature and Judaic studies from Binghamton I'm
6 tired, Binghamton University. He earned his MA in
7 Hebrew letters in 1996 and his rabbnic orientation,
8 ordination, from the Hebrew Union College, Jewish
9 Institute of Religion, Cincinnati Campus, in 1997.
10 With a childhood love for acting, he has co-written
11 numerous popular Purim spiels for all ages, adapting
12 the music from shows such as the Sound of Music,
13 Grease, Fiddler on the Roof, Disney, and the Wizard
14 of Oz. Interfaith work has been a concentration
15 throughout Rabbi Kaiserman's career, serving on the
16 Forest Hills Interfaith Clergy Association. He works
17 regularly with social justice organizations to help
18 us all make a better world. He also is an active
19 volunteer in the Central Conference of American
20 Rabbis and his alma mater, the Hebrew Union College,
21 currently serving on the CCAR Ethics Committee. I
22 just want to say that Rabbi Kaiserman is my rabbi and
23 he is great. And with that I spread the invocation
24 in full upon the council.

1 STATED MEETING

15

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you so
3 much, Council Member Koslowitz. What an honor to
4 have your rabbi here today. I think we should all
5 have a moment to speak with him to find out some of
6 the Karen Koslowitz tricks. At this time we'd like
7 to have the adoption of the minutes by Council Member
8 Danny Dromm.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you. Motion
10 to adopt the minutes of the Stated Meetings of
11 October 28, 2019, and October 30, 2019, be adopted as
12 printed.

13 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,
14 Council Member Dromm. We will now have messages and
15 papers from the mayor.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Excuse me, M-196
17 through M-198, various appointments.

18 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Rules, privileges, and
19 elections.

20 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Communication
21 from city, county, and borough offices.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: None.

23 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Petitions and
24 communications.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: None.

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Land use call-
3 ups.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: None.

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you, and we
6 will now have communication from Speaker Corey
7 Johnson.

8 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you, Madam
9 Majority Leader. Good afternoon, and I want to thank
10 you all for being here on this important Stated date.
11 Last week, as many of you know, New York City lost a
12 giant in public service, Jay Kriegel. Jay spent
13 decades serving this city with unmatched vigor and
14 energy. He was a confidant to countless city leaders
15 and devoted his life to making New York City a better
16 place. He impacted city government for six decades,
17 six, 60 years of service to the city that he loved.
18 Many of us here knew Jay Kriegel and were grateful
19 for his friendship. I was at services last night in
20 Park Slope. I saw Council Members Torres and Lander
21 there, and countless individuals who were impacted in
22 a great way because of Jay's service and life. You
23 always saw him coming with that mane of hair. He was
24 energetic and wonderful. I spoke with him about two
25 weeks ago. In my last conversation, I asked him how

2 he was and he told me that he didn't want to talk
3 about that, that he had a proposal to save the yellow
4 taxi industry in New York City and that he wanted to
5 present it to me soon. I will miss Jay. He was a
6 great and amazing man, 25-year-old chief of staff to
7 then-Mayor Lindsay and his impact will be felt for
8 generations. A real loss for the City of New York,
9 and I still am in disbelief that Jay is gone. I, I
10 still can't believe that he is not with us anymore.
11 I'd also like to take a moment, as we do in each
12 Stated Meeting, I want to take a moment, as we do
13 during each Stated Meeting, to remember the lives of
14 9/11 First Responders that we have lost. Vincent
15 DeMarino, a retired NYPD deputy police chief, passed
16 away from 9/11-related cancer at the age of 61 on
17 December 6th. We remember Deputy Chief DeMarino for
18 his courage in a time of crisis and his lack of
19 hesitation to respond when New Yorkers needed him.
20 My heart and our hearts are with his wife, Charlene,
21 his family, and the entire NYPD. I would also like
22 to acknowledge the loss of an NYPD tow-truck
23 operator, Anthony Edgehill, who died on duty last
24 Monday. He was 61 years old. And our thoughts are
25 with his family as well. Let us take a moment of

2 silent for these three New Yorkers. [moment of
3 silence] Thank you. This month is AIDS Awareness
4 Month. This is an opportunity to honor those we have
5 lost to this devastating disease, but it also
6 provides us with an opportunity to celebrate the
7 progress we've made to reduce the number of new HIV
8 and AIDS cases to historic lows. As a council we
9 will keep fighting to end this epidemic. Last year
10 we saw the lowest number of new infections ever
11 reported in the history of the epidemic, and as
12 someone living with HIV I am really grateful to the
13 members of this body who continue to fight people
14 living with HIV and AIDS. Before we dive into our
15 legislative agenda, I want to acknowledge that we're
16 joined by a former council member, June Iceland, who
17 we are really happy is here [applause], happy she is
18 here. She served this body for many years with
19 distinction and honor, and she served during the time
20 of the first speaker of the council, Peter Vallone,
21 Sr. Speaker Vallone has been a great role model and
22 advisor to many members of this body. I wish him and
23 his family all the best in this holiday season. We
24 celebrated and surprised him for his birthday. He is
25 turning 21 years old this Friday, he's turning 85,

2 and he looks magnificent, and we were so grateful
3 that he was here, honoring his life and his legacy.
4 [applause] Yes. Now let's dive into our legislative
5 agenda. We will be voting on the following land use
6 items. 515 Blake Avenue, a series of applications to
7 facilitate the development of approximately 500
8 affordable units of housing, 50% of which will be
9 affordable to people earning 50% or below of area
10 median income, including 30% of the units for
11 formerly homeless individuals, and this is in Council
12 Member Barron's district. 101 Fleet Place, to
13 provide for the construction of 14-story commercial
14 building in Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo's district,
15 and the council will be restoring the original
16 proposed zoning in order to facilitate the retention
17 of a daycare center in the new development. I want
18 to thank the staff, Rosa Kelly and Brian Paul, for
19 their work on these applications. Moving on, the
20 council will be voting on the following pieces of
21 legislation. First, we have a transportation bill up
22 for a vote, proposed Introduction number 1412-A,
23 sponsored by Council Member Robert Holden, would
24 provide that the police department tow trucks may
25 remove unattended vehicles that are obstructing a

2 sidewalk, crosswalk, fire hydrant, bicycle lane, or
3 bus lane if the vehicle poses a threat to safety or
4 would inhibit the safe and expeditious passage of MTA
5 buses. This bill would also require the police
6 department to issue a report in January of 2021 that
7 includes for each month in 2020 the number of
8 vehicles towed, disaggregated by police precinct, and

9 I want to thank James Digiovanni from the staff for
10 his work on that bill. Second, we have a piece of
11 housing and buildings legislation by our Housing and
12 Buildings Committee chair, Chair Cornegy,

13 Introduction number 1481-A, which would amend the
14 Administrative Code of the City of New York and the
15 New York City Plumbing Code in relationship to
16 bringing such code up to date with the 2015 addition
17 of the Internal Plumbing Code with differences to
18 reflect the unique character of the city, and repeals
19 Chapter 11 in appendices C, F, and G of the New York
20 City Plumbing Code in relationship there to. I want
21 to Jeanin Zilka for her work on that bill. Next, we
22 have two governmental operations bills up for a vote.
23 They are both by our Governmental Operations chair,
24 Fernando Cabrera. Introduction number 1095 would
25 increase transparency within the New York City Board

2 of Standards and Appeals and ensure temporary special
3 permits don't go on indefinitely. The bill does the
4 following. It requires the BSA to notify building
5 owners when a special permit is about to expire.
6 Such notification must go six months before the
7 special permit expires, and because use of such
8 property after the special permit's expiration may be
9 in violation of the building's Certificate of
10 Occupancy the BSA's notification must inform the
11 owner that a special permit may not be extended until
12 any penalties for such violation are paid, and lastly
13 it requires such notification be sent to the
14 community board in which the property is located.
15 This bill builds on Local Law 84 of 2017, which
16 required the BSA to provide similar notification when
17 a variance to the zoning resolution is about to
18 expire. Next, Introduction 1249-B, again by Chair
19 Cabrera, would eliminate the Critical Driver Program,
20 a redundant and confusing New York City Taxi and
21 Limousine Commission program that operated in the
22 same manner as a different program, the Persistent
23 Violator Program. The only non-duplicative element
24 of the Critical Driver Program is that it allows
25 drivers to reduce accumulated license points through

2 DMV accident prevention courses. The Persistent
3 Violator Program lets drivers reduce points through
4 TLC accident prevention courses. This bill would
5 consolidate the points reduction elements into one
6 program, the Persistent Violator Program, allowing
7 drivers to reduce accumulated points through DMV and
8 TLC prevention courses. These programs were separate
9 until Local Law 30 of 2014 as an element of the
10 mayor's Vision Zero action plan and it included both
11 TLC and DMV issued points under the Persistent
12 Violator Program. However, according to the Taxi and
13 Limousine Commission, this caused confusion for
14 drivers, many of whom thought they were being
15 penalized twice for the same violation. And I want
16 to thank the staff that worked on this - Daniel
17 Collins, Elizabeth Cronk, and Emily Forgione.
18 Finally, the council will be voting on a critical
19 piece of legislation aimed at reducing the number of
20 bird deaths throughout our city. Annually, it is
21 estimated that between 90,000 and 230,000 birds are
22 killed annually throughout New York City as a result
23 of building collisions. This number is so high
24 because they are unable to detect and avoid glass, as
25 well as artificial night light that confounds night

2 migrating species. This council has done a lot this
3 year to protect animals and I'm really proud that
4 this bill continues that work. A lot of these bird
5 deaths are totally avoidable and it's incumbent upon
6 us to do what we can to protect these animals from
7 dying unnecessarily. And Introduction number 1482-B,
8 sponsored by Council Member Rafael Espinal, would
9 require 90% of the building envelope for the first 75
10 feet of any new building or any building that's
11 proposed to undergo major alterations, to be
12 constructed of bird-friendly materials that meet a
13 specified design standard that's intended to decrease
14 bird strikes. This bill would also require the
15 installation of these bird-friendly materials or an
16 exterior wall envelope as adjacent to a green roof
17 system, or on such installations that create hazards
18 for birds, such as glass awnings, hand rails,
19 windbreak panels, acoustic barriers, and parallel
20 glass panels. This bill would take effect one year
21 after it becomes law and would not apply to
22 applications to construction document approval filed
23 before such effective date. And I also want to thank
24 Jeanin Zilka for her work on this. That concludes
25 today's agenda. Thank you, Madam Majority Leader.

1 STATED MEETING

24

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. We
3 will now move into discussion of general orders. We
4 have no one on the docket today to speak on general
5 orders. And so we will now move right into, seeing
6 none, we will now have report of special committees.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: None.

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Reports of
9 standing committees.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Report of the
11 Committee on Governmental Operations, Intro 1095,
12 expiration of variances.

13 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
14 orders.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Intro 1249-B,
16 Critical Driver Program.

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
18 general orders.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Report of the
20 Committee on Housing and Buildings, Intro 1481-A,
21 Plumbing Code.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
23 general orders.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Intro 1482-B,
25 Bird-Friendly Materials.

1 STATED MEETING

25

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
3 general orders.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Report of the
5 Committee on Land Use, LU 564 through LU 567.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved with
7 modifications and referred to the City Planning
8 Commission pursuant to Section 197-D of the New York
9 City Charter.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: LU 572 and Reso
11 1187 through LU 575 and Reso 1190, 515 Blake Avenue.

12 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
13 orders.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: LU 580 and Reso
15 1191, sidewalk cafe.

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
17 orders.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: LU 581, zoning
19 amendment.

20 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved with
21 modifications and referred to the City Planning
22 Commission pursuant to Section 197-D of the New York
23 City Council.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: LU 591 and Reso
25 11972, sidewalk cafe.

1 STATED MEETING

26

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
3 orders.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Report of the
5 Committee on Transportation, Intro 1412-A, removing
6 unattended vehicles.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
8 general orders.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: On the general
10 order calendar, LU 561 and Reso 1193 through LU 562
11 and Reso 1194, 101 Fleet Place.

12 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
13 orders.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Resolution
15 appointing various persons, Commissioner of Deeds.

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general
17 orders. And at this time I'm asking for a roll call
18 vote on all of the items on today's general order
19 calendar.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Powers.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Aye.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Torres.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Adams. Ampry-
25 Samuel. Ayala.

1 STATED MEETING

27

2 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye.

3 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Barron.

4 Borelli.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: I'm sorry, we're
6 voting on all general, general items?

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Everything on the
8 calendar.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all,
10 except for Intro 1482.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Brannan.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Cabrera.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Permission to
15 explain my vote?

16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
17 granted.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I'll make it
19 really quick. Ah, the speaker did a fantastic job
20 explaining all the bills, but I just wanted to thank
21 the Government Operations Committee, staff Daniel
22 Collins, Emily Forgione, Elizabeth Cronk, Sebastian
23 Bacchi, and Elliot Lin, as well as my own legislative
24 director, Claire McIlvane, for the fantastic work
25

2 they did on these two bills. And with that I vote
3 aye on all.

4 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Chin.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Cohen.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Constantinides.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Cornegy.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Deutsch.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Diaz.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Si in total.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Dromm.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Espinal.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Permission to
21 explain my vote?

22 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
23 granted.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: I just want to
25 give a big thank you to the speaker on supporting

2 1482-B, the Bird-Friendly Glass Bill, and the staff
3 for getting this done so quickly. This is a bill
4 that I worked introducing in the past year and I
5 think it will...

6 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Quiet in the
7 chamber.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: I did not think
9 it would move so fast, but because of this body and
10 the speaker and their concerns over our city's
11 wildlife and our environment we're going to get this
12 done. As, you know, as was mentioned in New York
13 City we have between 90,000 to 230,000 birds that
14 collide within our buildings and this bird-friendly
15 glass will lower that number by 90% and make sure
16 that we're a leader in the conversation around our,
17 our globes biodiversity. So thank you all, and I
18 vote on aye on all.

19 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Eugene.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye on
22 all.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Gibson.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I vote aye.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Gjonaj.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Aye on all.

3 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Grodenchik.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Holden.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Permission to
7 explain my vote?

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
9 granted.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I vote aye on
11 all, and I want to thank the speaker for advancing
12 Intro 1412-A, which will make our streets much safer,
13 as part of the placard abuse. And I want to thank
14 Jason Goldman, Jeff Baker, James Digiovanni, my chief
15 of staff, Dan Curzina, and communication director
16 Ryan Kelly, who worked on it, and certainly much
17 thanks to the Transportation Committee and Chair
18 Ydanis Rodriguez for supporting it. And, again, I
19 think making our streets safer should be the number
20 one priority of any towing from the NYPD and this
21 package of bills by the speaker and certainly with
22 the support of the Transportation Committee will
23 just, will do just that. Thank you so much.

24 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Kallos.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye on all.
3 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: King. Koo.
4 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye on all.
5 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Koslowitz.
6 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.
7 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Lancman.
8 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.
9 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Lander.
10 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye.
11 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Levin.
12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.
13 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Levine.
14 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.
15 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Louis.
16 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Aye.
17 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Maisel.
18 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.
19 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Menchaca.
20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye.
21 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Miller.
22 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Boy, I hate to
23 break up that rhythm. Um, permission to explain my
24 vote?
25

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission
3 granted.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you. I'm
5 going to vote aye on all and I really want to commend
6 Council Member Barron, who is not here, but on her
7 tireless and relentless work on behalf of homeless
8 families, not just in her community, throughout the
9 city, on this Blake Avenue Project. It is a landmark
10 project and a template for how we service the
11 homeless in our city. So with that, I'll be voting
12 aye on all. Thank you, Madam Majority Leader.

13 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Moya. Perkins.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye on all.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Reynoso.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Richards.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Rivera.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Aye.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Rodriguez.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Rose.

25 Rosenthal.

2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Salamanca.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Treyger.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Ulrich.

Vallone.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye, and a special thank you to our speaker, Corey, and all the council to make the day so special for my dad and our family. He doesn't get surprised often, but he really was today. And I think I may have saw a tear in his eye. So thank you, everyone, and aye on all. And if anyone is not here at the next meeting, Merry Christmas, Happy Holidays to all.

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Yeger.

COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Aye on all, with the exception of 1482, in which I vote no, and 1412, which I abstain. Thank you.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Matteo.

2 MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: No on 1482, aye
3 on the rest.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Cumbo.

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I vote aye.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I vote aye on all.

7 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. All
8 items on today's general order calendar adopted by a
9 vote of 44 in the affirmative, zero negative, and
10 zero abstentions, with the exception of Intro 1482-B,
11 which was adopted by a vote of 41 affirmative, 3
12 negative, and zero abstentions. And Intro 1412-A,
13 which was adopted by a vote of 43 in the affirmative,
14 zero negative, and 1 abstention. We will now go into
15 the introduction and reading of bills.

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: All bills have been
17 referred to committees as indicated on today's
18 agenda.

19 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. There
20 aren't any resolutions on today's calendar, so we
21 will now move into general discussion.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: No one signed up.

23 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Oh, wow. Oh, no,
24 no, no, no, no. Before we start the celebrations...

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: When no one signs up
3 you say no one signed up and then we end the meeting.

4 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I did see, I
5 missed her, but I did see Council Member Vanessa
6 Gibson, who had been raising her hand. I couldn't
7 see her through you.

8 SPEAKER JOHNSON: OK. So let's go.

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: [laughs] Council
10 Member Gibson.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you, Madam
12 Majority Leader. And good afternoon to all of my
13 colleagues and our speaker. I want to congratulate
14 all of our colleagues that passed important
15 legislation today and I come before all of you in a
16 very emotional and somber moment. For the past seven
17 years I've had the honor and privilege of working
18 with a young lady who started out as an intern in my
19 office back in 2012 from CUNY. And what I didn't
20 realize is she would ultimately become family. And
21 during my time as a member of the New York State
22 Assembly for four years to now serving in council
23 here, for the past six years this young lady has
24 stood at my side. She started out as an intern and
25 worked her way through the ranks and ultimately for

2 the past few years has been proudly serving as my
3 chief of staff. And over the next several weeks, as
4 we enter a new year, she is going to transition into
5 a new position, moving into the private sector, and
6 so since this is one of the last Stateds in which she
7 will be with us, on behalf of my staff I just wanted
8 to say thank you so much for your incredible
9 commitment to my outgoing chief of staff, Wendy
10 Guyegos, who has been with me through thick and thin,
11 through good and bad, every health code, stomach ache
12 in the world, and she has never given up on the work
13 we do every day on behalf of our constituents in the
14 Bronx. I am so very proud of her. I have watched
15 her grow, as she graduated from college and she
16 pursued her graduate design, and I've always
17 encouraged her. And I say to all of my staff, you
18 should always be better as you leave than the way
19 that you came because that means we've done our job.
20 It means we've elevated our young people to be the
21 next generation of leaders. And so I say to my
22 staff, Wendy, job well done, and on behalf of our
23 family I just want to present her with these
24 beautiful flowers. You give people flowers while
25 they can still smell them. And I just want to say

2 thank you, Wendy, for all of your work.

3 Congratulations to you and may God bless you and keep
4 you in your future endeavors. [applause]

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: OK, Council
6 Member Borelli. And finally with Council Member
7 Yeger. All right, Staten Island has yielded their
8 time. Council Member Yeger.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Oh no, the
10 pressure's really on because I like to stand with
11 Staten Island.

12 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you, Madam
13 President. I just very briefly wish to add my voice
14 to those in this chamber and those in our family of
15 New Yorkers who have spoken in the last couple of
16 days about the passing of Jay Kriegel. He was a
17 friend to many, a mentor to young people in politics
18 and some of us who are not so young anymore. He grew
19 up in my district and so whenever we got together for
20 breakfast, for kosher breakfast on Avenue J he would
21 tell me what used to be at this store and what used
22 to be at that store and what was there and what was
23 there, and he would talk about his block and the
24 neighborhood and how it had changed and how he still
25 loved it anyway and loved to come back. He was

2 incredible. His work in creating the Lindsay Fellows
3 at CUNY, which has benefitted a number of members of
4 this body, including Mr. Speaker and some of my
5 colleagues who have joined in this term is growing
6 us, I think is fair to say, to be better legislators
7 and better New Yorkers, and I think we're all
8 grateful for Jay's work and with that, Madam
9 President, thank you for your time.

10 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. And
11 Council Member Deutsch.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you,
13 Majority Leader, for remembering me, thank you.
14 Permission to, I have an Intro I'd like to speak
15 about.

16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Please.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you. So
18 I'm pleased to be introducing Intro 1818 today, a
19 bill that will require the city to install protective
20 bollards at all bus stops across the five boroughs.
21 In the Jewish religion the number 18 stands for Chai,
22 which translates to life. This bill is fittingly
23 numbered 1818, life, because it will indeed save
24 lives. On September 10 of this year 10-year-old Enzo
25 Ferracio was waiting for a bus on Ocean Avenue and

2 Avenue L. Enzo had just been dismissed from his
3 sixth-grade class at Hudde Junior High School and he
4 was looking forward to catching the bus to get home
5 and see his mom, his dad, his big brother, and their
6 dog. Surveillance videos shows that Enzo was looking
7 down at his phone and did not see the out-of-control
8 SUV that crossed the intersection, jumped the curb,
9 and crashed into him, taking his young life in an
10 instant. Enzo's life was cut short in a tragedy that
11 could have been prevented. At their home that night
12 Enzo's parents expressed their desire to turn their
13 pain into purpose and make our streets safe for
14 pedestrian, for pedestrians so that no family would
15 have to go through a similar circumstance. Intro
16 1818 will implement an important layer of protection
17 for New Yorkers who utilize city buses. Curb jumping
18 is extremely common and the danger rises when a
19 vehicle curb jumps at a bus stop where people are
20 gathered. Bollards will combat that risk and help
21 protect our city's commuters. I ask all my
22 colleagues to please sign on, on Intro 1818. Thank
23 you.

24 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,
25 Council Member Deutsch. And as the first African

2 American woman selected to be the majority leader of
3 the City Council, I could not let today go without
4 recognizing the brilliance and beautiful of Miss
5 Universe, who is from South Africa, and I just want
6 to celebrate Zozibini Tunzi as being elected,
7 selected, and winning the international competition.
8 This is a historic day, herstoric day, for black
9 women all over the world. I also want to recognize
10 Miss America, Nia Imani Franklin, Ms. Teen USA
11 Kaliegh Garris, and Miss USA, Ms. Chelsea Kryst. And
12 this is such a remarkable day for African American
13 women who have been told for centuries that they were
14 not beautiful. And so this is such a proud and
15 historic time to see four African American women
16 holding these titles all across the universe and we
17 couldn't be more proud, and we celebrate them and we
18 applaud them. And I think as black women we all feel
19 that much more beautiful today as a result of this
20 wonderful and amazing accomplishment. Thank you.
21 And now we have this meeting closed out by Speaker
22 Corey Johnson.

23 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I want to give my
24 thoughts and prayers to the family and the child who
25 was killed yesterday in East Harlem, the 3-year-old

1 STATED MEETING

41

2 boy, the 3-year-old child, I don't know if it was a
3 boy, the 3-year-old child was a boy, who was killed
4 in a crosswalk, and we're holding that family and
5 that young lost life in our hearts. And with that,
6 the Stated Meeting of December 10, 2019, is hereby
7 adjourned.

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,
9 Speaker Johnson. Can you please hold for one minute?
10 This meeting is not adjourned as of yet, if you could
11 just hold for one moment. We've been joined by two
12 council members.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Council Member
14 Adams.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Present. I vote
16 aye on all.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Council Member
18 Moya.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Aye on all.

20 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you, and we
21 will now retally the vote. Thank you. All items,
22 give us one moment, give us one moment. Thank you,
23 colleagues. Thank you for your patience. In order
24 for us to allow, excuse me, quiet in the chamber. In
25 order for us to allow the two additional council

1 STATED MEETING

42

2 members that have just entered the chamber, we need
3 unanimous consent for us to allow the two additional
4 council members to vote, similar to a resolution.

5 All in favor of allowing our members to vote say eye.

6 [chorus of ayes]. Any abstentions? Any nays? OK,

7 by unanimous consent we will allow both council

8 members to vote. We will call the roll again for the

9 two members and then we will close this meeting.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Council Member

11 Adams.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: I vote aye on all.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Council Member

14 Moya.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: [inaudible]

16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: All items on

17 today's general order calendar are adopted by a vote

18 of 46 in the affirmative, zero negative, and zero

19 abstentions, with the exception of Intro 1482-B,

20 which was adopted by a vote of 43 in the affirmative,

21 3 negative, and zero abstentions, and Intro 1412-A,

22 which was adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative,

23 zero negative, and one abstention. At this time

24 today's council meeting is adjourned. We will now

25

1 STATED MEETING

43

2 have the meeting closed by Council Member Corey
3 Johnson.

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: The Stated Meeting of
5 December 10, 2019, is hereby adjourned.

6 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

7 [gavel]

8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 16, 2019