

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

----- X

September 29, 2020

Start: 11:06 a.m.

Recess: 11:41 a.m.

HELD AT: Remote Hearing

B E F O R E: Rafael Salamanca, Jr.  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Rafael Salamanca, Jr.  
Adrienne Adams  
Diana Ayala  
Inez D. Barron  
Chaim Deutsch  
Ruben Diaz, Sr.  
Vanessa L. Gibson  
Barry S. Grodenchik  
Peter A. Koo  
Rory I. Lancman  
Stephen T. Levin  
I. Daneek Miller  
Francisco P. Moya  
Antonio Reynoso  
Donovan J. Richards  
Carlina Rivera  
Mark Treyger

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

SERGEANT AT ARMS LEONARDO: Sergeants,  
can we start our recordings, please?

SERGEANT AT ARMS JONES: All started.

SERGEANT AT ARMS LEONARDO: OK. Sergeant  
Martinez, opening statement, please.

SERGEANT AT ARMS MARTINEZ: Good morning.  
Welcome to today's remote City Council hearing on the  
Committee on Land Use. Participants, at this time  
please turn on your video and please place any  
electronic devices that may cause disruption to  
vibrate or off. Thank you for your cooperation.  
Chair Salamanca, we are ready to begin.

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: All right, thank  
you. So, ah, [gavel] good morning. Um, I am Council  
Member Rafael Salamanca, chair of the Committee on  
Land Use, and I am joined remotely today by Council  
Members Adams, Reynoso, Grodenchik, Rivera, Deutsch,  
Ayala, Chair Moya, Barron, Koo, Lancman, um, Diaz,  
and Gibson, and Chair Adams. Um, I want to thank  
Chair Moya and Chair Adams for their work on our  
zoning and landmarks subcommittees. Today we will  
vote on a number of applications referred out of  
these subcommittees. But before we begin, I would

1  
2 like to recognize the committee's counsel to review  
3 the remote meeting procedures.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Chair  
5 Salamanca. I am Julie Lubin, counsel to the  
6 committee. Council members who would like to ask  
7 questions or make remarks should use the Zoom raise  
8 hand function. The raise hand button should appear  
9 at the bottom of the participate panel. I will  
10 announce council members who have questions or  
11 remarks in the order that they raise their hands.  
12 Chair Salamanca will then recognize members to speak.  
13 I would like to remind council members and the public  
14 that there may be extended pauses if we encounter  
15 technical delays. We ask that you please be patient  
16 as we resolve any technical difficulties that may  
17 arise. Chair Salamanca will now continue with  
18 today's agenda items.

19 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Thank you, thank  
20 you, Counsel. Today we will vote to approve LUs 678  
21 and 679, ah, the 59-14 Bay Parkway rezoning relating  
22 to property in Council Member Yeger's district. The  
23 application seeks a zoning map amendment to change an  
24 R5 district to an R6/C2-4 district and a zoning text  
25 amendment to map a mandatory inclusionary housing

1 area on the east side of Bay Parkway between 59th and  
2 60th Street, with MIH option 1 and 2 and the work  
3 force option. The proposal will facilitate the  
4 development of a nine-story mixed use building with  
5 ground floor retail, community facility use, and  
6 residential use. We will also vote to approve five  
7 items submitted by the Department of Housing  
8 Preservation and Development. LU 666, the Weeksville  
9 NCP is an application submitted pursuant to Article  
10 16 of the General Municipal Law and 197-C of New York  
11 City Charter for the designation of an urban  
12 development action area, an Urban Development Action  
13 Area Project and the disposition of property to a  
14 developer selected by HPD for property located at  
15 1559-1563 Prospect Avenue, Brooklyn, in the council  
16 district represented by Council Member Ampry-Samuels.  
17 LUs 667 and 668 concern the 641 Chauncey portion of  
18 the Old Stanley Project. LU 668 was submitted  
19 pursuant to Article 16 of the General Municipal Law  
20 and Section 197-C of the New York City Charter, for  
21 the designation of an urban development action area,  
22 an Urban Development Action Area Project, and for the  
23 disposition of property to a developer to be selected  
24 by HPD. LU 667 was submitted pursuant to Article 11  
25

1 of Private Housing Finance Law, requesting an  
2 exemption for real property taxes for the disposition  
3 area. Both items relate to property located at 641  
4 Chauncey Street, Brooklyn Council District 37. LU  
5 669, the Old Stanley 2, was submitted pursuant to  
6 Article 16 of the General Municipal Law and Article  
7 11 of the Private Housing Finance Law. In this  
8 application, HPD requests approval of an Urban  
9 Development Action Area Project, waive of the  
10 designation requirement of Sections 197-C and 197-D  
11 of the charter, and an exemption from real property  
12 taxes for property located at 676 Central Avenue and  
13 1277 DeKalb Avenue, Brooklyn, in Council District 34,  
14 which is represented by Council Member Reynoso, and  
15 Council District 37, which is vacant. LU 670, Open  
16 Door Bed-Sty Central in North 1 was submitted  
17 pursuant to Article 16 of the General Municipal Law  
18 and Article 11 of the Private Housing Finance Law.  
19 HPD requests your approval of an Urban Development  
20 Action Project, waiver of the designation  
21 requirements of Section 197-C and 197-D of the  
22 charter and an exemption from real property taxes for  
23 16 properties located in Brooklyn in Council District  
24 represented by Council Member Cornegy. We will also  
25

1  
2 vote to approve three items submitted by the  
3 Landmarks Preservation Commission pursuant to  
4 Sections 3020 of the City Charter and Sections 25-303  
5 of the administrative code. LU 671, the proposed  
6 rescission of the landmark designation of Beth  
7 Hamedrash Hagodol Synagogue of 60-64 Norfolk Street  
8 in Council Member Chin's district in Manhattan. The  
9 landmark no longer exists as it was destroyed by  
10 fire. LU 672 is an amendment of the landmark  
11 designation of the Alexander Hamilton House, also  
12 known as Hamilton Grange, to mark as landmark site  
13 414 West 141st Street in Council Member Perkins's  
14 district in Manhattan. LU 673 is an amendment to the  
15 landmark designation of Kingsland Homestead to make  
16 its landmark site 143-35 37th Avenue in the district  
17 represented by Council Member [inaudible]. Members  
18 of the committee and members representing affected  
19 districts who have questions or remarks about today's  
20 items should use the raise hand button. Now, Counsel  
21 will announce members in the orders that the hands  
22 were raised. Any members wish to make any comments  
23 or statements? All right. So, ah, seeing none, I  
24 now call for a vote in accordance with the  
25 recommendations of the, I'm sorry.

2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member  
3 Reynoso has a comment or a question.

4 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: I didn't, OK, um,  
5 Council Member Reynoso, I'm sorry, Council Member, I  
6 didn't see your hand.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: It's cool,  
8 Chair. How are you? Hope you're doing well. Glad,  
9 glad to see everyone on the, on the call. I wanted  
10 to speak to the 5914 Bay Parkway rezoning before we  
11 get to a vote, um, instead of explaining it on my  
12 vote. I wanted to make sure that I, ah, talked to  
13 members before, before the vote. Ah, this, ah,  
14 project is looking to, ah, change the district from  
15 R5 to R6 and in doing so using a work force option.  
16 We're talking about, ah, allowing for one-bedroom to  
17 be rented out at \$2500. Ah, and we have an adjacent,  
18 ah, or not an adjacent, another application that's  
19 being done in a black district, um, or a district  
20 represented by a black member, um, that is doing 100%  
21 affordable housing, ah, for a one-bedroom under  
22 \$1000. Um, and the one that's, ah, a one-bedroom for  
23 \$2500 is, is in a white affluent district. And what  
24 we're doing here is continuing to, ah, perpetuate the  
25 segregation and the burden of building all the



1  
2 affordable housing in our city to black and brown  
3 minority districts. Um, it's exhausting all of our  
4 resources. The burden of the development of all the  
5 affordable housing, getting people out of homeless  
6 shelters, continuing to fall on the backs of, ah,  
7 black and brown districts. At some point, ah, we  
8 need to get serious about dealing with affordable  
9 housing and not allowing for members, ah, that are in  
10 districts that are affluent and white, um, ah,  
11 escape, at this point escape, ah, to the  
12 responsibility of, of taking care of the greater  
13 good. Um, if you are in a district that has built  
14 affordable housing, especially the ones in South  
15 Bronx, southeast Queens, central Brooklyn, which  
16 continue to be the leaders in building affordable  
17 housing, um, we're at a loss here. Um, and this is  
18 gonna continue. And, again, I just want to make sure  
19 that I, I communicate that the work force option,  
20 it's a one-bedroom for \$2500 a month. That does not,  
21 um, assist or support anyone in my district or anyone  
22 in homeless shelters from getting an apartment. This  
23 doesn't, the greater good is not achieved here.  
24 Thank you for giving me the opportunity to speak, and  
25 I hope that, um, my members will look twice at, ah,

land use number 678. Ah, I believe it's 678. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Thank you, Council Member Reynoso. Ah, is there any other member that wish to speak or make a comment? Counsel, is there anyone with their hands up?

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: I, I see no other hands.

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: OK, thank you. So I will now call for a vote in accordance with recommendations of subcommittees and the local council members to approve LUs 666 through 673, and LUs 678 and 679. Will the clerk please call the roll?

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Good morning, William Martin, committee clerk, roll call vote, Committee on Land Use. All items are coupled. Chair Salamanca.

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Thank you, one second. Gibson.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I vote aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Thank you. Barron.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to  
3 explain my vote?

4 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Council Member  
5 Barron to explain her vote.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Ah, thank you,  
7 Mr. Chair. I just wanted to comment. I support the  
8 comments made by my colleague, Council Member Antonio  
9 Reynoso, and I wanted to just comment additionally on  
10 item 670. It's a project located in Community  
11 District, ah, Community Board 3 neighborhood, where  
12 29% of the population is considered severely rent  
13 burdened. And I went on ANHD to see what the, ah,  
14 what the demographics were for that community, and  
15 the poverty rate there is 27%. There's been a  
16 decrease in the population from 2016, no, from 2018  
17 to 2019, a decrease of 23%. And there's also  
18 similarly been a decline in the poverty rate of 3  
19 percentage points and I wondered about that and tried  
20 to make, ah, an understanding of how that happened.  
21 And what happened was that there was a significant  
22 increase in the white population. So it's not that  
23 the black population that presently lives there was  
24 able to find jobs and able to gain employment, but  
25 that another population came in, displacing the

1  
2 existing population, and that way impacting the  
3 poverty rate. The homes that are being offered in  
4 this project, three-family home, will range from  
5 \$677,000 to \$804,000. That's way beyond the reach of  
6 the majority of the population that's there and for  
7 me that means that that population would be, ah, not  
8 eligible to apply for the program and in fact there  
9 would be additional displacement of the black  
10 population. So for that reason I'm voting no on Land  
11 Use 670, 678, 679, and any accompanying resolutions.  
12 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Thank you,  
14 Council Member. Council Member Deutsch.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: I vote aye on  
16 all.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Council Member  
18 Koo.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I vote aye on all.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Lancman.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Thank you.

23 Miller. Council Member Miller?

24 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Council Member  
25 Miller, you're muted.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Hear me now?

3 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Yes, we can hear  
4 you now.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: You're muted  
6 again, Council Member.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye on, aye on  
8 all, with the exception of 678 and 679, on those I'll  
9 be abstaining. Did you get that?

10 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Yes, thank you.  
11 Thank you. Reynoso.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Permission to  
13 explain my vote?

14 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Council Member  
15 Reynoso to explain his vote.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I also just want  
17 to mention before I vote that, ah, this council was  
18 entertaining the idea of, ah, of removing or  
19 objecting to member deference in a brown and black  
20 community in, ah, in Industry City, ah, and when it  
21 comes to member deference in other areas that are not  
22 black and brown it seems like, um, it's still Holy  
23 Grail, and I just want to make sure that with the  
24 double standard there is something that we  
25 acknowledge and pay attention to. But I want to vote

1  
2 aye on all with the exception of land use items  
3 numbers 678 and 679. Thank you.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Thank you.  
5 Grodenchik.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye on all.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Council Member  
8 Levin.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Um, if you can  
10 come back to me in a moment, I'm just getting a  
11 little bit of clarification.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Sure. No  
13 problem. Adams.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: I vote aye.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Ayala.

16 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: We couldn't hear  
17 you, Council Member Ayala.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Sorry, can you  
19 come back to me in a second?

20 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Sure. Diaz.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Si a todo.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Moya.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: I vote aye.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Rivera.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Aye.

2 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: One moment.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I vote aye.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Thank you.

5 Council Member Ayala.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Thank you. One  
8 moment. OK. All items on today's land use calendar  
9 have been adopted by a vote of 15 in the affirmative,  
10 zero in the negative, and no abstentions, with the  
11 exceptions of the following land use items. LU 670  
12 is adopted by the committee 14 in the affirmative, 1  
13 in the negative, no abstentions, and land use items  
14 678 and 679 are adopted by the committee 13 in the  
15 affirmative, excuse me, correction, land use items  
16 678 and 679 are adopted by committee 12 in the  
17 affirmative, 2 in the negative, and 1 abstention.

18 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: All right, thank  
19 you. I would like to thank the members of the  
20 public, my colleagues, and counsel and land use staff  
21 for attending today's hearing. We're...

22 UNIDENTIFIED: Chair, Chair, um, oh, I'm  
23 sorry, I just wanted to make sure that you knew that  
24 we may have another member voting.

2 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: We're going to  
3 leave the roll open for five to ten minutes. Thank  
4 you. [pause] All right. Council Member Treyger is  
5 about to [inaudible].

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Hello?

7 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Council Member.

8 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Hey, thank you,  
9 Mr. Chairman. I really appreciate you, um, and, ah,  
10 I, I vote aye.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Thank you,  
12 Council Member.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: OK, the final  
15 vote on all land use items, it now stands at 16 in  
16 the affirmative and zero in the negative and no  
17 abstentions, again with the exceptions of the  
18 following land use items: 670, with 15 in the  
19 affirmative, 1 in the negative, no abstentions, and  
20 land use items 678 and 679 are adopted by 13 in the  
21 affirmative, 2 in the negative, and 1 abstention.

22 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Thank you, Clerk.  
23 Um, so I would like to thank, ah, the members of the  
24 public, my colleagues, counsel and land use staff for  
25



attending today's hearing. Ah, this meeting is  
hereby adjourned. Thank you. [gavel]

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date October 12, 2020