

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

1

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

March 20, 2019

Start: 10:06 a.m.

Recess: 5:56 a.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: MARK TREYGER  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL

INEZ D. BARRON

JOSEPH C. BORELLI

JUSTIN L. BRANNAN

ANDREW COHEN

ROBERT E. CORNEGY, JR.

CHAIM M. DEUTSCH

DANIEL DROMM

BARRY S. GRODENCHIK

BEN KALLOS

ANDY L. KING

BRAD S. LANDER

STEPHEN T. LEVIN

YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ

DEBORAH L. ROSE

RAFAEL SALAMANCA, JR.

ERIC A. ULRICH

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Richard Carranza  
Chancellor of New York City Schools

Lindsey Oates  
Chief Financial Officer for the New York City  
Department of Education, DOE

Lorraine Grillo  
President and CEO of the New York City School  
Construction Authority, SCA

Karin Goldmark  
Deputy Chancellor of the Division of School  
Planning and Development at the New York City  
School Construction Authority, SCA

Tom Taratko  
Chief Executive at the New York City Department  
Of Education, DOE

Michael Mulgrew  
President of the United Federation of Teachers,  
UFT

Mark Cannizzaro  
President of the Council of School Supervisors  
And Administrators, CSA

Donald Nesbit  
Vice President of Local 372, District Council 137

Randi Levine  
Policy Director at Advocates for Children of New  
York, AFC

Mike Schnall  
Vice President of Government Relations and  
Community Investment at New York Roadrunners

Brenda Triplett  
Director of Educational Achievement and  
Partnerships at Children's Aid

Ornella Enoise  
Senior, Youth Ambassador at Bushwick Campus,  
Participant of Make the Road Brooklyn

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

1 Rikya Theresa Kee  
2 High School Student in New York City, Leader in  
3 Sisters and Brothers United and the Urban Youth  
4 Collaboration

5 Mikali Clifton  
6 Youth Leader with the Rockaway Youth Task Force,  
7 Urban Youth Collaborative

8 Jovany Nunez  
9 Senior at the Academy of Innovative Technology,  
10 Core Leader with Future of Tomorrow and Urban  
11 Youth Collaborative

12 Casey Starr  
13 Assistant to the Executive Director of Samaritan  
14 Suicide Prevention Center

15 Christina Aguirre  
16 Program Manager at National Dance Institute, NDI

17 Khushayah Morris  
18 Sophomore at Tilden High School, Education  
19 Justice Advocate with the Children's Defense Fund  
20 Member of the Dignity in Schools Campaign

21 Aurora Hernandez  
22 Parent Coordinator at Frederick Douglass V.,  
23 Bronx

24 Gregory Brender  
25 Director of Children Services at United  
Neighborhood Houses, UNH

Brittany Brathwaite  
Organizer and Innovation Manager at Girls for  
Gender Equity

Oumou Kaba  
Student at Urban Assembly School for Global  
Commerce, African Activist, Youth Organizer with  
Young Women's Advisor Council at Girls for Gender  
Equity

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

1  
2  
3 Juliette Verrengia  
4 Social Worker and Policy Advocacy Specialist at  
5 New York City Anti-Violence Project

6  
7 Jenny Veloz  
8 Representing Fair Play Coalition

9  
10 Sarah Sanchala  
11 Director of Government Relations of Planned  
12 Parenthood of New York City

13  
14 Anooj Bhandari  
15 Restorative Justice Coordinator with Make the  
16 Road New York and Bushwick Campus Community  
17 School

18  
19 Joscelyn Valdes  
20 Restorative Justice Youth Ambassador at the  
21 Bushwick Campus and Core Youth Leader at Make the  
22 Road New York

23  
24 Kenny Olivia  
25 Youth Leader at the Bushwick Campus Student  
Success Center, Participant with Make the Road  
New York

Diane Reyes  
Youth Leader at the Bushwick Campus Student  
Success Center with Make the Road New York

Adilka Pimentel  
Lead Organizer at Make the Road New York, Member  
Of the Urban Youth Collaborative

Julie Quinton  
Director of Adult Education Programs

Rachida Rouias  
Resident of New York City from Morocco, ESOL and  
Bridge to Health Graduate, Make the Road New York

Lisa Caswell  
Senior Policy Analyst for the Day Care Council of  
New York

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

1 Alice Bufkin  
2 Director of Policy for Child and Adolescent  
3 Health at Citizens' Committee for Children, CCC  
4

5 Andrea Ortiz  
6 Manager of Education Policy at the New York  
7 Immigration Coalition

8 Robert Robinson  
9 Senior Managing Director of College Bound  
10 Initiative at Student Leadership Network

11 Iman Abdul  
12 Director of Education and Engagement of Integrate  
13 NYC

14 Obrian Rosario  
15 Queens Resident, Director of Mobilization at  
16 Integrate NYC

17 Jahmya Valentine  
18 Student in Brooklyn, Member of Integrate NYC and  
19 Fair Play

20 Hope Gruppel  
21 Educational Director at the Sheltering Arms  
22 Early Childhood Center

23 Alice Mulligan  
24 Executive Director of Our Savior's Lutheran  
25 Preschool

Brett Shampaner  
Owner and Educational Director of the Learning  
Tree in Queens

Carlyn Cohen  
Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer at the  
Chinese American Planning Council, CPC

Michael Zink  
Assistant Vice President for Educational Services  
At the New York Foundling

Maureen Fonsesca  
CEO of the Sports and Arts in Schools Foundation

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Martin Mintz  
New York City Program Manager for Generation  
Citizen, GCNYC

Greg Mihailovich  
Community Advocacy Director of the American Heart  
Association of New York City

Denis Yu  
Program Coordinator for the Coalition for Asian  
American Children and Families, CACF

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Good morning and welcome to the Education Committee's hearing on the fiscal 2020 preliminary budget. This morning we will focus on the Department of Education's preliminary expense budget. We will be hearing from Chancellor Richard Carranza and DOE's Chief Financial Officer Lindsey Oates. After that we will hear from DOE's Deputy Chancellor Karin Goldmark and School Construction Authority President and CEO Lorraine Grillo who will testify on the Department's capital budget. Finally, we will hear public testimony which is scheduled to begin hopefully around 1:30 p.m. The Department of Education's fiscal 2020 preliminary budget totals 26.9 billion dollars excluding pension and debt service which represents 29 percent of the city's total budget including pension and debt service DOE's total fiscal 2020 budget is 33.9 billion dollars, 37 percent of the city's total budget. While the majority of DOE's funding does support our district public schools, we must remain focused on ensuring education funding is reaching the classroom and having a positive impact on educational outcomes. Since becoming Chair of the Education

1  
2 Committee, I have been relentlessly focused on  
3 increasing school budgets by raising the fair student  
4 funding or FSF floor. FSF is a critical source of  
5 funding for New York City schools supporting two  
6 thirds of a school's budget on average. I appreciate  
7 the funding investing... invested over the course of  
8 this administration to raise the FSF floor which  
9 includes 125 million dollars invested last year at  
10 the Council's urging. This brought the FSF floor to  
11 90 percent and the average to 93 percent, but the  
12 goal is to get every school to 100 percent. In fiscal  
13 2019 the FSF shortfall is 756 million dollars. This  
14 brings me to my next point, state funding. The  
15 executive budget proposed by the Governor would  
16 result in a 300 million dollar cut to New York City  
17 schools. the so-called education equity formula in  
18 the executive budget is an alarming overreach. FSF  
19 already allocates funding to schools based on the  
20 instructional and academic needs of students and the  
21 idea that the state knows how to allocate funding to  
22 schools better than the city does is outrageous. I  
23 was pleased to see both the senate and assembly  
24 reject this proposal as well as include more funding  
25 for school aid and foundation aid in particular in



1  
2 their one house budgets. The state still owes New  
3 York City schools 1.2 billion dollars based on the  
4 campaign for fiscal equity. This money would get all  
5 schools to 100 percent FSF and then some. The Council  
6 will continue to fight for this funding because our  
7 students deserve it. I deeply appreciate DOE's  
8 collaboration and advocating for the funding our  
9 schools are owed and I hope that the enacted state  
10 budget includes a funding increase that will allow  
11 the city to raise FSF floor again. DOE's preliminary  
12 budget includes a number of areas of concern starting  
13 with the 104-million-dollar PEG target that OMB has  
14 given DOE. While the Mayor has said his signature  
15 initiatives will not be considered for PEG cuts, I  
16 believe we should be taking a hard look at the entire  
17 DOE budget. This includes examining the many equity  
18 and excellence initiatives funded over the past five  
19 years to determine whether or not these investments  
20 are having their intended impact and if the funding  
21 is being used as efficiently as possible. While the  
22 Council supports much of the work of the equity and  
23 excellence agenda, which includes programs like AP  
24 for All, Algebra for All, college access, Single  
25 Shephard, and Universal Literacy, that does not

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 exempt these significant investments from oversight.

3 As we recently saw with renewal schools, sometimes  
4 well-intentioned education interventions do not have

5 the full impact we hope for. The Council has also

6 identified a number of major holes in DOE's prelim,

7 prelim budget including spending on carter cases and

8 related staff, spending on pupil transportation

9 contracts, and the new GPS system for school buses

10 and spending on school facilities particularly the

11 contract with New York City school support services

12 or NYCSSS. I hope DOE can explain why the budget

13 doesn't yet accurately reflect these costs and

14 provide insight into plan spending in these areas.

15 The most egregious hole in DOE's budget is the lack

16 of supports for students in temporary housing. Since

17 fiscal year 2017, the city has funded supports for

18 students in shelter but never baselined the funding.

19 I fail to understand why the current program is not

20 included in this budget, current funding of 13.9

21 million dollars which includes two million dollars in

22 Council discretionary funding provides critical

23 supports to students in temporary housing including

24 69 bridging the gap social workers. The program has

25 been widely supported and lauded not only by the

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 Council and advocates but by DOE officials  
3 themselves. I hope to hear answers about why this  
4 funding is not included in the fiscal 2020 budget  
5 today. More broadly, there is a need and I would say  
6 an urgent need for additional social emotional  
7 supports in schools. Our school system has more  
8 school safety agents, approximately 5,500 than  
9 guidance counselors, social workers and school  
10 psychologists combined. We must support the whole  
11 student to ensure they can succeed academically. I  
12 believe funding social emotional support staff has a  
13 significant return on investment and I look forward  
14 to discussing ways to increase the number of guidance  
15 counselors and social workers in schools. I  
16 personally know of schools that are choosing to  
17 invest their limited resources in guidance counselors  
18 and social workers and as a result are seeing real  
19 improvement in their student's academic performance.  
20 Finally, in fiscal 2020 the Early Childhood Care  
21 system will transition from Administration for  
22 Children Services known as ACS to DOE. Both agencies  
23 have been preparing for this transition for almost  
24 two years and we remain hopeful that this transfer  
25 will achieve its goals of stream, streamlining

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 services for providers and families. However, the  
3 Council still has concerns and I am particularly  
4 disheartened that there is no plan to address pay  
5 parody. As long as a teacher with the exact same  
6 credentials in a CBO provided early childhood  
7 education classroom is making less than they would in  
8 a DOE classroom, our entire early childhood education  
9 system is destabilized and at risk. Perhaps even more  
10 importantly, many of the staff working in CBO  
11 provider early childhood classrooms are women of  
12 color and the lack of pay parody reflects fundamental  
13 inequities in compensation that the city should not  
14 support. I am concerned that we are investing 174  
15 million dollars in 3-K in fiscal 2020 when we haven't  
16 adequately supported the foundation of the existing  
17 UPK system by providing pay parody. And some  
18 housekeeping, I'd like to remind Council Members that  
19 the Chancellor and CFO are here to testify on the  
20 expense budget, please save your capital questions  
21 for Deputy Chancellor Goldmark and President Grillo.  
22 Council Members will be limited to three minutes for  
23 their first round of questions and two minutes for  
24 the second round if necessary. Public testimony on  
25 the education budget will begin at approximately

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 again we're hoping 1:30 p.m. and if you are here to  
3 testify please fill out a witness slip with the  
4 Sergeant at Arms and before I conclude I would like  
5 to thank the Committee staff, the outstanding  
6 Committee staff Kaitlyn O'Hagan; Chelsea Bitmore;  
7 Dohini Sompura; Malcolm Butehorn; Jan Atwell and  
8 Kalima Johnson. I would like to thank also my staff  
9 Anne Scaife; Vanessa Ogle and Eric Feinberg and I'd  
10 like to introduce my colleagues who have joined us  
11 this morning; so far we have Council Member Andy  
12 Cohen who got... is going to get the gold star, shares  
13 it with Debi... Council Member Debi Rose and more  
14 members will be joining us... Council Member Margaret  
15 Chin is here as well, thank you Council Member and  
16 now I would like to thank Chancellor Carranza and CFO  
17 Lindsey Oates for coming to testify before the  
18 Committee today and we'll hear the testimony after  
19 the Counsel swears them in.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: If you could both just  
21 raise your right hand and do you affirm to tell the  
22 truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in  
23 your testimony before this Committee and to respond  
24 honestly to Council Member questions? Thank you, if  
25 you can just hit the button.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yes.

3 LINDSEY OATES: Yes.

4 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, good morning Chair  
5 Treyger and all the members of the Education  
6 Committee that are here today. Before I continue I'm  
7 always particularly excited when I see students  
8 availing themselves of their first amendment rights  
9 to not only participate to... but to be present and I  
10 understand we have a number of our students here from  
11 Urban Youth Collaborative and I want to publicly  
12 recognize them and thank them for their presence here  
13 today. My name is Richard Carranza and I have the  
14 privilege of serving as New York City schools  
15 Chancellor. Joining me this morning is Lindsey Oates,  
16 Chief Financial Officer for the New York City  
17 Department of Education. Thank you for the  
18 opportunity to testify on Mayor Bill De Blasio's  
19 fiscal year 2020 preliminary budget as it relates to  
20 the Department of Mental... of Education. As we embark  
21 on this year's budget, I would like to thank Speaker  
22 Johnson, Chair Treyger and the City Council for your  
23 partnership, advocacy and generous funding that  
24 includes over 41 million dollars last year alone in  
25 centrally funded initiatives as well as the millions

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 allocated by individual council members to support  
3 our school communities. Through the Council, we have  
4 been able to support additional social workers and  
5 guidance counselors, provide schools with LGBT  
6 curricular resources and expand the reach of our  
7 restorative justice programs. Together we have made  
8 great gains, and together we have a lot of work to  
9 do. the Mayor's preliminary budget of 33.9 billion  
10 dollars allows us to continue our progress. During my  
11 nearly one year, 11 months exactly but who's  
12 counting, as Chancellor for New York City, equity has  
13 been at the heart of my mission for our students, let  
14 me repeat that, equity not yesterday, not maybe in  
15 the future, equity now has been at the heart of my  
16 mission for our students, our families, our educators  
17 and our schools. My highest priority can actually be  
18 boiled down to three words; as I've mentioned,  
19 advance equity now. These three short words  
20 encapsulate the enormous and profound obligation that  
21 we have to disrupt the entrenched systems that,  
22 throughout our history, have kept underserved  
23 students from achieving their potential. We must  
24 address the opportunity gaps that face students of  
25 color. Only an equity approach can right these

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 wrongs. That is why we are looking at every single  
3 policy through an equity lens and investing in an  
4 agenda that disrupts the status quo. This  
5 administration has cumulatively made four billion  
6 dollars in new education investments in an equity and  
7 excellence for all agenda to improve outcomes for our  
8 students. And we're seeing historic results, our  
9 schools are the strongest that they've ever been. We  
10 have the highest graduation rate on record at 75.9  
11 percent, which is 76 percent, rising across our city  
12 and amongst every demographic group. We have our  
13 highest college enrollment rate at 59 percent, and  
14 our lowest high school dropout rate on record at 7.5  
15 percent. For the third year in a row, city students  
16 have outperformed students across the state on  
17 English language arts exams, and our students are  
18 continuing to close the gap with the state on the  
19 math exam. More students than ever before are taking  
20 and passing advanced placement exams in 2018, and we  
21 continue to build upon this administration's historic  
22 investments in early childhood education with the  
23 expansion of 3-K for All. One of the things I am  
24 proudest of, however, cannot be captured purely in  
25 numbers. It is the beginning of a cultural



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 transformation at the DOE around family and community  
3 empowerment. I believe with every fiber in my body  
4 that we cannot do things to communities or for  
5 communities; we must do things with communities. That  
6 is how we will get more of our children on a pathway  
7 to success. We have been turning this commitment into  
8 action since the moment I arrived almost exactly a  
9 year ago by bringing more family input into  
10 everything we do. Once I touched down in New York  
11 City, I began a citywide tour to hear what parents  
12 were thinking about the DOE's strengths, the  
13 challenges, and opportunities and the work that we  
14 need to do. This listening tour brought me to 62  
15 schools and 45 town halls where thousands of students  
16 and teachers, principals, parents, advocates and  
17 elected officials across all five boroughs  
18 enthusiastically shared their thoughts with me. I  
19 heard parent leaders ask for several specific changes  
20 and improvements, from better technology to faster  
21 deployment of air conditioning in schools, both of  
22 which we are delivering on. But above all, I heard  
23 them ask for school... a school system that's more  
24 streamlined and responsive to their questions. That  
25 is why I'm proud that I hired Hydra Mendoza, the

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 DOE's first ever Deputy Chancellor for Community  
3 Empowerment, Partnerships, and Communications, to  
4 strengthen our efforts to build deeper connections to  
5 families and communities. Deputy Chancellor Mendoza  
6 has been instrumental in developing the Mayor's and  
7 my five-borough parent empowerment tour to hear first  
8 hand from parent leaders about their priorities for  
9 our school system. This is also why I reshaped the  
10 DOE's organizational structure, creating new  
11 executive superintendent positions on the ground to  
12 give families clear lines of communication, and to  
13 bring resources closer to schools and provide them  
14 with clear lines of accountability and support.  
15 Finally, no effort to empower school communities is  
16 complete without making real moves to empower  
17 students themselves. This is why we will soon be  
18 bringing onboard our first ever student voice  
19 manager, who will spearhead efforts to strengthen our  
20 dialogue and collaboration with student leaders from  
21 across our city and to harness their feedback to  
22 effectuate real change in the Department of  
23 Education. Now that the landscape more effectively  
24 includes family voices, we are focused on working  
25 together to advance equity now. I want to be clear

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 about the expansive view we take of equity. We have  
3 renamed the Division of English language learners and  
4 student support to the division of multilingual  
5 learners to reflect the value of the hundreds of home  
6 languages spoken by New York City public school  
7 students and the division's goal of ensuring all  
8 students master English while honoring and supporting  
9 their multilingualism. We are similarly working to  
10 change the culture around our students with  
11 disabilities, special education is a service, it is  
12 not a program, and our Chief Academic Officer Dr.  
13 Linda Chen and our Executive Superintendents are  
14 leading this work as we expand special education  
15 services and hire staff. We've hired approximately  
16 4,300 special education teachers and therapists under  
17 this administration. These too are efforts to advance  
18 equity for students who deserve the same access to an  
19 excellent education as their peers. The notion that  
20 every student in a zip code has access to an  
21 excellent education underpins our equity and  
22 excellence for all agenda, which I am pleased to  
23 report is in action throughout the city. For the  
24 first time, this past fall, Universal Literacy  
25 programs were in all of our 32 districts. We have 437

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 reading coaches currently working to ensure all of  
3 our students are reading on grade level by the end of  
4 second grade. Last school year, through computer  
5 science for all, 134,000 students received computer  
6 science education, a 44 percent increase from the  
7 previous school year. The number of students taking  
8 an AP computer science exam in 2018 also rose to  
9 5,190, more than a fourfold increase since 2016. We  
10 have also opened 47 new career and technical  
11 education programs in the last three school years  
12 alone. These programs equip our students with the  
13 skills necessary to seamlessly transition into  
14 college or the workforce. As a first-generation  
15 college graduate, I was thrilled to celebrate my  
16 first college awareness day as Chancellor. This  
17 school year, through college access for all, every  
18 middle school student will have the opportunity to  
19 visit a college campus. Likewise, every high school  
20 student will have the resources and support at their  
21 school to graduate with a plan for college and a  
22 career. College access for all has also eliminated  
23 the CUNY college application fee for low income  
24 students and made the SAT exam available free of  
25 charge during the school day for all high school

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 juniors. Our third citywide SAT school day will be a  
3 week from today. These are just a couple of  
4 highlights of equity and excellence agenda. Every  
5 school in the city is experiencing an element of the  
6 expansive E and E agenda and this includes schools  
7 that are... that have taught us a great deal of  
8 valuable lessons from their participation in four  
9 years of the renewal program, like how important it  
10 is to support school leadership and teacher growth,  
11 and family and community empowerment. I'm excited to  
12 move our system forward with a citywide, equity  
13 driven approach to supporting all schools, in place  
14 of a binary approach, where either you got a renewal  
15 designation or not. Our approach is called  
16 comprehensive school support, CSS for short and it is  
17 not a program or a designation. It is a strategy for  
18 identifying needs and delivering support to all  
19 schools, using the DOE's new streamlined structure  
20 and implementing a new system of collecting real time  
21 data. This kind of tailored support is the basis for  
22 our recently launched collaborative schools' model,  
23 known as the Bronx Plan, which is designed to address  
24 the specific needs and challenges of historically  
25 underserved schools across our city. The Bronx Plan

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 builds off of the new 43-month contract with the  
3 United Federation of Teachers, UFT, encouraging  
4 educators to invest their talents and energies in 180  
5 historically underserved schools with harder staff  
6 pay differential for certain critical positions. The  
7 first cohort of 50 schools that agreed to participate  
8 in the Bronx Plan include, 32 schools in the Bronx,  
9 11 in East New York and Brownsville, and seven from  
10 the Rockaways. In addition to reforming the ways we  
11 support schools; we are finally acknowledging the  
12 elephant in the room and that is segregation. I've  
13 lived and worked in communities throughout the nation  
14 and I can tell you that in all of those places, there  
15 is housing and school segregation. But a public, and  
16 I emphasize public, school system should represent  
17 the entire city that it serves. The work to address  
18 segregation and make schools more reflective of the  
19 diversity of our city is key to increasing academic  
20 achievement and opportunity. That is why we are  
21 taking a hard look at some of our enrollment  
22 practices from 3-K through twelfth grade. In fact,  
23 our recently released birth to five early childhood  
24 RFP aims to make early childhood education classrooms  
25 more socioeconomically and racially integrated by

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 bringing together programs that have traditionally  
3 served low income families with our 3-K and Pre-K  
4 programs that are universal for all families. After  
5 community driven processes, I was pleased to approve  
6 plans put forward by districts three and 15 to  
7 increase middle school diversity. Including those  
8 districts, 90 schools across the city now have a  
9 diversity in admissions plan in place. That's up from  
10 just seven schools when the diversity in admissions  
11 program started three years ago. And we want to  
12 support communities throughout our city in developing  
13 locally driven diversity plans, which is why we  
14 launched a two-million-dollar grant program to do  
15 just that. School districts have been submitting  
16 applications over the last month and we have also  
17 released a plan to improve diversity at our  
18 specialized high schools and are continuing to review  
19 the initial report issued by the school diversity  
20 advisory group. Our students deserve to learn with  
21 one another, and to see themselves reflected in the  
22 books they read and the lessons they're taught. Our  
23 curriculum is uplifting a diverse range of voices.  
24 This includes the Passport to social studies  
25 curriculum, which has lesson plans about Africa,

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 Latino, Asian, Middle Eastern, and Native heritage  
3 people as well as about gender, LGBTQ and religious  
4 history. Other new curricula will recognize and  
5 purposefully include undocumented students and we  
6 know there's much more work to do in this area. This  
7 culturally responsive approach will complement the  
8 work of the newly created Division of School Climate  
9 and Wellness, which honors and supports every child's  
10 experience in the classroom and school community by  
11 offering social emotional support and restorative  
12 practices. Deputy Chancellor LaShawn Robinson is  
13 spearheading this work as she leads the way in  
14 examining how to reduce racial disparities in school  
15 discipline. This division is investing 23 million  
16 dollars to provide anti bias and culturally  
17 responsive training for all school staff, 47 million  
18 dollars annually to support schools with critical  
19 resources to strengthen their culture and climate,  
20 and eight million dollars annually to anti bullying  
21 initiatives. These investments are essential to  
22 ensuring that our schools have high expectations for  
23 all students and are safe spaces for children and  
24 adults alike to share the truest version of  
25 themselves. So, as we approach the 50<sup>th</sup> anniversary



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 of Stonewall, we are continuing our work to support  
3 our LGBTQ students, families and staff through events  
4 and trainings and other efforts to ensure that our  
5 school communities are gender inclusive. And yes, you  
6 can again count on me to march with our school  
7 communities in the march... in the Pride March this  
8 year. In order to continue our work to advance equity  
9 and meet the needs of our most vulnerable students,  
10 this administration has targeted 12 million dollars  
11 in federal funds to programs for students in  
12 temporary housing, bringing this administration's  
13 total investment in Students in Temporary Housing  
14 programs to 28 million dollars. This additional  
15 investment includes 100 school based STH community  
16 coordinators, an improved structure for overseeing  
17 STH resources, and expanded professional development  
18 to staff supporting Students in Temporary Housing.  
19 The new 12-million-dollar investment builds on an  
20 existing 16-million-dollar investment that includes  
21 bridging the gap social workers, the afterschool  
22 reading club at shelters and the school proximity  
23 project. I am also grateful for the Council  
24 leadership in allocating additional funding for  
25 social workers and guidance counselors. I know the

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 School Construction Authority will testify on the  
3 Capital Plan this afternoon, but I want to say that  
4 we are excited by the unprecedented investments in  
5 our 17 billion dollar capital plan and what they will  
6 bring, including a record 750 million dollars for  
7 accessibility initiatives, as well as funding for  
8 57,000 seats over the next five years. Importantly,  
9 we've coupled our capital plan's accessibility  
10 investments with a reform to our admissions policy  
11 that gives students with accessibility needs  
12 admission priority to fully accessible schools. We're  
13 continuing to put money directly towards Fair Student  
14 Funding, including over 800 million throughout this  
15 administration to raise the FSF floor. When this  
16 administration started, the FSF floor was 81 percent  
17 and the average school had an FSF level of 87  
18 percent. With the Council's help, the FSF floor is  
19 now 90 percent and the system wide average is 93  
20 percent as Chair Treyger has mentioned. We must do  
21 more to ensure that every school has the resources  
22 its students need, however, we cannot meet this goal  
23 without the state fulfilling the promise of the  
24 campaign for fiscal equity. I am very supportive of  
25 Chairman Treyger's comments. In this fiscal year

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 alone, the state has shortchanged our students to the  
3 tune of 1.2 billion dollars. Instead of meeting its  
4 obligation to the CFE, the Governor has a proposal  
5 that would essentially force DOE to redirect existing  
6 funds. The proposal would mandate that 75 percent of  
7 our funding increase go to 22 percent of schools,  
8 leaving out nearly 1,300 schools. The remaining  
9 funding would not be enough to keep up with costs for  
10 the nearly 1,300 schools left out of the formula's  
11 focus, literally robbing from Peter to pay Paul.

12 Under the leadership of this Mayor and through the  
13 hard work of our talented educators, we have a great  
14 deal to be proud of, from free, full day, high  
15 quality Pre-K for All and our ever expanding 3-K for  
16 All, to 70,000 seventh graders going on yearly  
17 college visits, to the highest graduation and college  
18 enrollment rates on record. We are hopeful that  
19 legislators at the state level will extend Mayoral  
20 accountability to enable us to push harder and help  
21 our children go even farther. Because the history  
22 that we are writing together is one that doesn't  
23 accept the status quo. We are changing the system and  
24 advancing equity now. And yet, we all know we have  
25 more work to do to unleash our students' innate

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 brilliance, unlock their creativity and put them on a  
3 path to their dreams. We are grateful for the City  
4 Council's continued partnership and support in this  
5 necessary and hard work. I want to thank you for your  
6 time, and we will be happy to answer any questions  
7 that you may have at this time, thank you very much.

8 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you Mr.

9 Chancellor, I just want to note that we've also been  
10 joined by Council Member Cornegy, Council Member  
11 Dromm and Council Member Brannan. So, Mr. Chancellor  
12 it's almost your one-year anniversary here with New  
13 York City schools and we, we thank you so much for,  
14 for being here today. Can... my first question actually  
15 I think is just a reflection question, in your almost  
16 one year here on, on the job what would you say are  
17 the areas of strength in the city school system and  
18 areas of weakness that we have to do much, much  
19 better on?

20 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you for that  
21 question. I would say that the areas of strength,  
22 I've lived now and worked in five states in five  
23 urban school systems from the west coast to the  
24 Midwest to the east coast, I have never found in  
25 anywhere that I've lived and worked in my almost 30

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 years as an educator a more informed, passionate and  
3 active community around its traditional public  
4 schools from students to teachers to parents to  
5 advocacy groups, very well informed, very articulate,  
6 passionate people that care about public schools. I  
7 would also say that, and this is by no means because  
8 of who I'm sitting with, but I would also say that I  
9 have never found elected officials who actually put  
10 their resources where their mouths are in terms of  
11 supporting public schools. I am consistently  
12 impressed as I go around and see schools and speak  
13 with principals and community organizations the level  
14 of investment that City Council people and assembly  
15 people and senators and borough presidents invest in  
16 their schools and can tell me chapter and verse of  
17 how that investment is related to the school's  
18 academic plan. That is something you do not find  
19 across the country. I would say the other strength  
20 that we have in New York City is that we have a Mayor  
21 under Mayoral accountability that has a vision for  
22 education and uses the weight and the bully pulpit of  
23 the mayoralty and the leadership of the mayoralty to  
24 actually put programs in place that serves students  
25 in this community. I've mentioned a number of those

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 programs but there is no where else in America where  
3 the residents have free universal Pre-K available to  
4 all of their students. In fact, it pains me to say  
5 there are places in America where children don't even  
6 have full day kindergarten yet in New York City we've  
7 added a whole grade level called Pre-K and we are  
8 adding a, an additional grade level we call 3-K that  
9 is unheard of and unprecedented. So, I would say that  
10 also we have within the Department of Education a  
11 number of folks that are very committed that have  
12 dedicated their life to serving the students in New  
13 York City. Again, I think that that is remarkable in  
14 a system that is so large. The challenges that we  
15 have in New, New York City are not unlike challenges  
16 I've seen elsewhere, and some are unique to New York  
17 City. I think one of the biggest challenges is just  
18 the size of our system. There is no one that compares  
19 to New York City in terms of the size of the system,  
20 we are the largest system in America, I would say in  
21 the world in terms of a free public education, that  
22 creates its own opportunities but its challenges as  
23 well, messaging, implementation, etcetera. I would  
24 say one of the challenges that we have is that New  
25 York City prior for.. or at least the last.. past 20

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 years there's been a number of approaches that have  
3 been taken which have led to a very loosely coupled  
4 system where decentralization is seen as kind of the  
5 life blood of our system and while I am not in any  
6 way, shape or form against decentralized approach I  
7 think that there should be in a system, we are a  
8 system of schools, we are not schools that exist,  
9 exist within a system. So, it is important that we as  
10 a system believe in certain things and that we invest  
11 our resources, that we invest our time and our talent  
12 into achieving those values that we believe in as a  
13 school system. That is a, a challenge with a system  
14 that is so large and then the third thing that I  
15 would say is while folks have said to me since I've  
16 arrived, we are the best funded state in America in  
17 terms of public education and that no one comes even  
18 close, I think you have to look at the challenges  
19 that come in living in an urban environment, the cost  
20 of living in a city like New York City and when you  
21 then do the math on what that costs we are not the  
22 highest funded education system in America and the  
23 fact that the state of New York has yet to live up to  
24 its financial responsibility in terms of the campaign  
25 for fiscal equity has real consequences at the ground

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 level for communities and principals that want to  
3 hire additional staff members. The communities that  
4 want to hire or create extended learning  
5 opportunities, communities that want to establish  
6 fine arts programs in all of their particular schools  
7 so I think that that really is a challenge that I am  
8 extremely excited about this Council's voice, this  
9 Chairman's voice and quite frankly our assembly and  
10 senate colleagues that have put forward proposals to  
11 rectify that wrong. We could spend the rest of the  
12 day on the good and a little part of the day on some  
13 of the challenges but in general as I reflect on the  
14 12 months that I've been here, I am extremely,  
15 extremely energized and optimistic about our future  
16 but those are my initial thoughts about our, our  
17 strengths and, and some of the challenges.

18 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you Mr.

19 Chancellor so we'll get right into budget questions.  
20 The first question which is an issue that is of deep  
21 importance to me and this Committee and this Council  
22 certainly, why isn't the 13.9 million dollars  
23 invested in students in shelter supports including 69  
24 bridging the gap social workers include in the fiscal  
25 2020 budget?



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, we are very  
3 supportive of, of those resources, we as, as no one  
4 has to explain to the Council we are in the  
5 preliminary budget so we are continuing those  
6 conversations with our colleagues in City Hall and we  
7 have made it very clear that we think those resources  
8 are extremely important. I would also point to the  
9 fact that as we are really focusing on serving our  
10 most vulnerable student populations and by any  
11 accounting students that are in temporary housing  
12 would fit that definition. We are adding in addition  
13 to the Councilors, we mentioned the 100 community  
14 based personnel that are supporting our students, we  
15 are also working with our existing counselors not  
16 necessarily based in the shelters but in schools  
17 around how to identify, how to access support  
18 services for students in temporary housing so in  
19 short we are looking at how comprehensively we can  
20 wrap our arms around this particular group of  
21 students and, and again I want to reiterate that we  
22 also see the value in, in that investment and are  
23 continuing to work with our colleagues and advocate  
24 for the inclusion in the executive budget.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right, I appreciate  
3 Mr. Chancellor your... you know your appreciation of  
4 the value of the program just... and I think the CFO  
5 would, would agree with me that there are contractual  
6 challenges when there's uncertainty at this time of  
7 year about whether the funding will exist or not and  
8 it took a while for the social workers to even get  
9 hired in the first place which we'll get to in, in my  
10 deeper line of questioning and it's really not fair  
11 to the students that are being served by these social  
12 workers and to the social workers themselves whether  
13 or not they will have a position in our schools next  
14 year. So, I want to flag this as a very significant  
15 priority for this Council and I think myself on a  
16 personal level we have so much more work, work to do  
17 in this area and we understand that there are 100  
18 schools with 50 or more students living in shelters  
19 and no bridge, bridging the gap social worker. This  
20 includes PS 288 in Coney Island in my district which  
21 has 52 students living in shelters. Will you work  
22 with us to ensure that more of these schools get  
23 bridging the gap social workers through this year's  
24 budget process?

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 RICHARD CARRANZA: Noted and we are  
3 supportive.

4 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And, and we are... we  
5 are... we are supportive as well Mr. Chancellor. In  
6 November the DOE announced that the city will spend  
7 12 million dollars on new supports for homeless  
8 students including 100 coordinators for schools with  
9 high percentages of students in temporary housing, is  
10 this funding reflected in the budget and where did  
11 DOE find these resources?

12 RICHARD CARRANZA: Lindsey.

13 LINDSEY OATES: Thank you Chair for that  
14 question. That program is funded by Title IV dollars  
15 so federal resources are funding that program and it  
16 is... it is in our... it, it... we're... it's funded by  
17 federal dollars.

18 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And how did DOE  
19 decide to invest in coordinators rather than provide  
20 other supports?

21 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, Chairman Treyger I  
22 think we want to have a multifaceted approach which  
23 includes not only coordinators but counselors, social  
24 workers, etcetera. The, the real reason is that with  
25 coordinators they can work 12 months and we chose to

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 invest in those positions so we would have a 12 month  
3 footprint working with the students in temporary  
4 housing rather than investing first in the  
5 pedagogical staff which is a ten month position. So,  
6 we chose which to go first so that we would have a  
7 continuity of services, it doesn't mean that we don't  
8 want to continue to add but that's why we went with,  
9 with the coordinators first.

10 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Alright, just to  
11 note Mr. Chancellor that in my understanding in the  
12 briefing that I received the family assistance  
13 coordinators they're called they themselves are not  
14 licensed social workers, this is an area of concern  
15 for us because they're the folks at the frontend of  
16 the process interacting with families at that... at the  
17 frontend, we have learned historically that if folks  
18 who are engaging and informing our most vulnerable  
19 families about critical information if they  
20 themselves don't know what questions to ask and what  
21 to do and how to follow up it becomes a bigger  
22 problem in the long run, you know we... this is an area  
23 of significant weakness and quite frankly from a  
24 budgetary standpoint I think there's a greater impact  
25 of having let's say 50 social workers than 100

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 coordinators who are not licensed and really trained  
3 and skilled in dealing with our most vulnerable of  
4 student populations and I'd like to just kind of hear  
5 your thoughts on that.

6 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yeah, so I, I, I note  
7 the concern, it's again a strategic decision, do I  
8 want families and students in temporary housing  
9 receiving ten months of service or do I want 12  
10 months of service? I will be very clear that I  
11 support social workers, I think the training is  
12 incredibly important, we are training those  
13 coordinators to... obviously they're not MSWs but we're  
14 training those coordinators around what they should  
15 be asking, we have a protocol of what they are  
16 looking for and then we are I think which is very  
17 strategic, making sure that they are connected to the  
18 right services that they can refer clients to but  
19 again it's, it's not a perfect situation in a perfect  
20 world, the funding exists to do both at the same  
21 time. I want to reiterate that we believe social  
22 workers are important, we believe counselors are  
23 important and we look to be able to add that level of  
24 support very, very soon but it was a very practical  
25 decision, do we want 12 months of service or do we

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 want 10 months with a gap of two months, we didn't  
3 want to do that.

4 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, Mr. Chancellor  
5 I, I appreciate your remarks that, you know you value  
6 and I, I believe that you do value social workers and  
7 guidance counselors, if that's the case why did the  
8 city impose a freeze on hiring guidance counselors  
9 and social workers?

10 RICHARD CARRANZA: Well I want to.. I want  
11 to remind everyone that the freeze is reviewed on a  
12 yearly basis and actually more than a yearly basis  
13 but I also want to remind everyone that we have a  
14 body of excessed counselors and social workers  
15 through school closures etcetera that are fully  
16 qualified or fully licensed to fill the need and what  
17 we've been doing is actually matching social workers  
18 and counselors with appropriate schools to try to  
19 make those matches first. Now in some cases where we  
20 haven't found, found the right fit on a case by case  
21 basis we've been allowing schools to, to hire but  
22 again we do have counselors and social workers that  
23 are available to be assigned in those positions and  
24 that's why the freeze has extended to those  
25 particular positions. Again, we are reviewing what

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 need still exists out there and that freeze may be  
3 lifted as well.

4 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Mr. Chancellor and  
5 for, for interest in clarity is it your call to lift  
6 the freeze or is this a call that the Mayor and OMB  
7 has to make?

8 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yeah, this would be my  
9 call.

10 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And so, I am  
11 respectfully asking you Mr. Chancellor to lift the  
12 freeze and to make it easier for our schools to hire  
13 much needed guidance counselors and social workers. I  
14 understand the complexity of the system, I fully  
15 understand but I think you and I have exchanged some  
16 of the challenges schools face and, and even dealing  
17 with some of the folks who have accessed in the ATR  
18 pool, I think schools just need greater flexibility,  
19 I think the current structure is just not working and  
20 there are public schools in our system in the year  
21 2019 that do not have one guidance counselor or one  
22 social worker and that is unacceptable.

23 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yeah, so you're,  
24 you're concern is noted sir and, and we are working  
25 to make that happen, as I am briefed on those

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 particular concerns there, there is a, a conversation  
3 to be had, is it that a school does not have a social  
4 worker or a guidance counselor because they don't  
5 have the budget for that or is it because they  
6 haven't found the right person for that and then we  
7 are actually looking at licensed, credentialed people  
8 and, and is there a way to match them with those  
9 services so you are absolutely right that this is a  
10 complex issue but I do share your, your concern and  
11 your focus on making sure schools are able to hire as  
12 quickly as possible within a responsible fiduciary  
13 environment where we are taking a look at every  
14 option that we have.

15 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And just to note  
16 that even with schools that might have one guidance  
17 counselor or one social worker or maybe one school  
18 psychologist many of these schools don't have them  
19 full time... [cross-talk]

20 RICHARD CARRANZA: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

21 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...so they might have  
22 them for a few days a week, but I will tell you what  
23 they do have five days a week, school safety agents.  
24 We need to turn this ratio around Mr. Chancellor. In  
25 fiscal year 2019, DOE found 273.7 million dollars in



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 savings through the citywide savings programs  
3 including 137.7 million dollars that was baselined.  
4 In fiscal year 2018, DOE found 166.4 million dollars  
5 in savings including 172.7 million dollars that was  
6 baselined. DOE has already identified 133.6 million  
7 dollars in savings across the November and prelim  
8 plans including 95.6 million dollars that is  
9 baselined. OMB has set a PEG target of 104 million  
10 dollars for DOE, can you describe how DOE will  
11 identify these savings?

12 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, I'm going to ask  
13 our Chief Financial Officer to give some more detail  
14 on that. We are part of the city and as the city  
15 grapples with what could be a tumultuous financial  
16 outlook, we understand our responsibilities as part  
17 of the city with that being said in light of the fact  
18 that the needs of our students don't diminish over  
19 time. In fact, the needs of our students increase  
20 over time. I am grateful that the target could have  
21 been much larger, I am not obviously thrilled that we  
22 have any target, but we also understand that we're  
23 part of the larger city infrastructure and that all  
24 of us are tightening our belts. With that we are  
25 trying to be very thoughtful about how we meet our

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 target and that's why I'm going to ask our Chief  
3 Financial Officer to talk a little more in detail  
4 about what that looks like.

5 LINDSEY OATES: Thank you sir and thank  
6 you for the question. Under the Chancellor's  
7 leadership and, and my own we are constantly looking  
8 for efficiencies in the Department's budget not just  
9 in a PEG climate but all the time because it's the  
10 right thing to do. We have, you know fiscal  
11 responsibilities for our students to ensure that  
12 services are provided in the most efficient way  
13 possible and so this is ongoing work not just in the  
14 time now that we're asked for certain targets but  
15 it's ongoing. We're continuing to look at  
16 opportunities internally and we'll be working with  
17 our city partners in this work and there's going to  
18 be more to come on the specifics at a later point.

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: This has been a  
20 theme at many of these budget hearings in the prelim  
21 that the administration is not being clear and  
22 transparent with the Council about these areas where  
23 the agencies are being asked to propose cuts to OMB  
24 and respectfully that's just not acceptable, you know  
25 we are a co-equal branch of government, we have to

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 advocate just as well as you advocate and how are we  
3 supposed to know what to advocate for if, if there's  
4 no transparency in, in terms of the budget process, I  
5 mean clearly we have identified some areas that have  
6 been cut that we're going to fight like hell to get  
7 restored like bridging the gap social workers but  
8 this is a major area of concern and frustration for  
9 us in the Council and this is not how the budget  
10 process should work. Will school budgets be  
11 considered for PEG cuts?

12 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, there are no  
13 sacred cows, no sacred cows and you mentioned early  
14 that equity and excellence agenda items were not to  
15 be touched, we're actually looking at everything. So,  
16 we're looking at every aspect of the DOE, we're  
17 looking for efficiencies, we're looking on return on  
18 investment. Obviously when you look at school site  
19 budgets that is the last area, we would ever want to  
20 even look at for cuts so everything is on the table,  
21 but some things are first, schools are last.

22 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Well I... alright Mr.  
23 Chancellor because that leads us to our next kind of  
24 line of questioning. The fiscal year 2020 spending on  
25 algebra for all, AP for all, college access, single

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 shepherd and universal literacy totals 207.2 million  
3 dollars, how does DOE track the performance or return  
4 on investment of these equity in excellence programs?

5 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, we have... we have a  
6 tracking system, I think some of it is evident in  
7 terms of when you look at our math academic  
8 achievement as measured by just one particular  
9 metric, it's going up, our college access rates are  
10 going up, our graduation rates are going up, our  
11 suspension rates are decreasing so there are some  
12 generalized ways of taking the temperature as to  
13 whether they're being effective but we also have a  
14 number of ways of tracking those particular  
15 initiatives because I'm going to ask our Chief  
16 Financial Officer to talk a little bit in more detail  
17 about those.

18 LINDSEY OATES: Sure, so again thank you  
19 for the question. We have teams internally both the  
20 program officers that manage this work and other  
21 teams who are evaluating these programs in real time,  
22 they are looking at the outcomes, they're looking at  
23 the outcomes across demographic groups. Another thing  
24 just to remember is that these programs are still  
25 relatively new, many of them are only phased in to

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 all schools this year so initial... you know initial...  
3 evaluations at this point are still initial and we  
4 are continuing to review the impacts as they are  
5 rolling out across the system.

6 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, I, I appreciate  
7 that there is some sort of tracking going on, on the  
8 effectiveness of these programs, is there a timeline  
9 by which DOE expects to see improved outcomes based  
10 on, on these programs?

11 LINDSEY OATES: I mean... go ahead...

12 RICHARD CARRANZA: Go ahead...

13 LINDSEY OATES: So, I... you know a  
14 timeline for outcomes, I mean obviously every year  
15 we're looking at the metrics that the Chancellor  
16 mentioned and we are, you know reevaluating and, and  
17 attempt to be dynamic to the, the feedback that we  
18 get in real time to make sure that if there's  
19 something that needs to be changed its changed.

20 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And can you share  
21 any of those outcomes that you have so far?

22 LINDSEY OATES: Many of them were in the  
23 Chancellor's testimony but we can certainly get back  
24 to you with a lot more specifics on that topic.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yeah, I mean  
3 particularly for example, has the number of students  
4 reading at grade level by second grade increased as a  
5 result of the program?

6 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, we can get all of  
7 the details on all of those programs that you've  
8 mentioned, and we'll get those to you in written  
9 form.

10 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yeah, I, I am  
11 deeply concerned about the area of literacy in our  
12 elementary school grades.

13 RICHARD CARRANZA: I am too.

14 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And you know and  
15 that's one of the reasons why I'm a big supporter of  
16 UPK and the... and the full promise of it, of course we  
17 need more funding to get parity across the board  
18 because to identify those issues early on and to make  
19 sure that kids are reading and writing at level  
20 because it's very hard later in the system as  
21 Chancellor you would agree to... [cross-talk]

22 RICHARD CARRANZA: Absolutely... [cross-  
23 talk]

24 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...address these  
25 challenges so I would like to get some data and

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 feedback on that. The area of social emotional  
3 supports. There are currently fewer social workers,  
4 guidance counselors and school psychologist combined  
5 than school safety agents, does DOE believe  
6 additional social emotional support staff are needed  
7 in our public schools?

8 RICHARD CARRANZA: Some... Chairman Treyger  
9 I, I'm going to give a little more of an extended  
10 response and, and I, I will tell you that one of the  
11 things that I should have included as one of the  
12 things in my first year that I think goes very well  
13 in the DOE has actually been the relationship that  
14 the DOE and the Chancellor, yours truly has had with  
15 you as the Education Chair and this City Council. I  
16 think that has been an incredibly powerful  
17 conversation and action but I'm going to push back a  
18 little bit on this notion that we constantly conflate  
19 school safety agents with counselors and social  
20 workers. It is a false narrative and let me tell you  
21 why because I believe as a lifelong educator, I truly  
22 believe as a lifelong educator that there are not  
23 enough counselors, there are not enough social  
24 workers, there are not enough trauma counselors in  
25 our public schools especially in urban environments,

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 there just aren't. Living in an urban environment is  
3 getting more complex, it's becoming more difficult,  
4 when you add into the mix all of those societal ills  
5 that happen in an urban environment of which New York  
6 City is definitely one of those cities it's, it  
7 defies logic for anyone to ever say that we shouldn't  
8 have more counselors, we shouldn't have more social  
9 workers and as I testified at the assembly and at the  
10 senate it's just a matter of money, if we have more  
11 money we're going to hire more of those positions but  
12 the sad reality is that principals in this system in  
13 a decentralized system are given an allocation and  
14 the allocation is based upon what funding is  
15 available and then those principals are told you may  
16 do with what you have in your allocation and  
17 principals have to make the very difficult decision  
18 do I hire another teacher to reduce class size or do  
19 I use that funding to hire an additional counselor or  
20 as you very, very astutely have noted do I use that  
21 funding to hire one counselor and I think that the  
22 real conversation that I appreciate that you are  
23 leading is where is the funding, the formulated  
24 funding that comes from the state to allow us to fund  
25 our schools so that the principals don't have to make



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 those kinds of choices, that is what we should be and  
3 I, I'm glad that we are pushing on it but the issue  
4 of school safety is not an issue, it is not an issue  
5 until its an issue and I'm sorry I worked like I've  
6 said across this country and I think it's the wrong  
7 conversation to have about how many safety agents you  
8 have because it's not issue until god forbid  
9 something happens in one of our schools and then  
10 folks are going to say well we should have had safety  
11 agents then they're going to say we should have had  
12 this, we should have had that. As the Chancellor I am  
13 an educator and I will always say put that money in  
14 counselors, social workers, high quality teachers,  
15 make sure you have programs and programmatic  
16 approaches but I will not conflate that with making  
17 sure our schools are safe, that they are being  
18 protected, that we know who is entering our  
19 buildings, that we can monitor the exits of our  
20 buildings where we can make sure that they are being  
21 safe and supported and the one thing I'm going to ask  
22 in that conversation is that while it's important to  
23 know how many school safety agents we have and we  
24 have a conversation about what they do, how they do  
25 it, when they do it, its important to understand that

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 safety in the 20<sup>th</sup> century, the 21<sup>st</sup> century in  
3 America's public schools in an urban environment is  
4 something that has to exist and I will continue to  
5 work with our partners in the New York Department in  
6 the NYPD to make sure that our school safety agents  
7 have the appropriate training but I will also  
8 continue to lock arms and work very, very  
9 aggressively with this City Council and this Chairman  
10 in making sure we get additional funding so we can  
11 hire more of those counselors and more of those  
12 social workers, more of those trauma informed  
13 counselors, psychologists, I think that's really  
14 important but I, I am going to continually ask that  
15 we don't conflate the two because they are different  
16 and, and I think the issue of not enough counselors  
17 is a real issue that we should take on in and of  
18 itself.

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, Mr. Chancellor  
20 sorry, I just want to share with... I just want to  
21 share with you, in one school in particular, it  
22 actually happened in my district what was considered  
23 an NYPD activity, a seven year old child, a seven  
24 year old child did not have his assigned  
25 paraprofessional for a particular day, the DOE could

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 not provide a sub paraprofessional for that day, the  
3 child had a bad day, police were called, school  
4 safety agents, NYPD had to respond to a seven year  
5 old child having a bad day in a school that has  
6 inadequate supports and so I fully appreciate the  
7 role and value that safety agents can play and should  
8 play in shaping school climate, I think... I would hope  
9 you would agree with me that a seven-year-old having  
10 a bad day is not an NYPD matter.

11 RICHARD CARRANZA: Absolutely

12 unacceptable and that is not a... that is an issue that  
13 goes to why was that treated in that way, why, why  
14 was NYPD called, that is an issue of supervision  
15 quite frankly, that is an issue of training quite  
16 frankly, that's an issue of not having the  
17 appropriate resources, it's not an issue of how many  
18 safety agents versus how many counselors is the point  
19 that I'm trying to make and I absolutely agree with  
20 you Chairman Treyger that is unacceptable.

21 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: On the topic of  
22 NYPD, when will DOE and NYPD be releasing their  
23 updated MOU which the department has been promising  
24 to come soon for a number of... for years actually?  
25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

RICHARD CARRANZA: I haven't been here for years sir; I've only been here for 11 months and I will... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right... [cross-talk]

RICHARD CARRANZA: ...tell you that in the 11 months that I've been here because I have had conversations with hundreds if not thousands of students, communities, parents, advocacy groups, we have had a very robust negotiation and conversation with NYPD around this MOU, I was not satisfied with what I saw was developing and we have had those conversations to get us to a place where I think we can all be very supportive of it. I will tell you that it, it is in its final stages and I wish I could be more specific, but we are in the very final stages of that MOU.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And, and just to note I definitely agree that you... this is just one year on the job NYPD has... just to note Mr. Chancellor has not been responsive to even the Mayor's signature and so in 2015 a law was signed, passed requiring that they provide us data on where metal detectors and scanners are in schools, they still have not given the Council that information.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 RICHARD CARRANZA: Wow...

3 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: What we pass are  
4 not recommendations they're laws and I think some  
5 folks, NYPD need a civics lesson on what a law is and  
6 just as we flagged this because public safety had,  
7 had its hearing they had mentioned that the DOE is in  
8 possession of this data about... with... of the MOU and  
9 anything you could share Mr. Chancellor at this point  
10 about where, where it kind of stands at this moment?

11 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, as I've mentioned  
12 Chairman Treyger there are a number of issues that  
13 we've really pushed each other on and we've been very  
14 clear about what we believe in terms of student  
15 rights, what we believe schools should be and more  
16 importantly what they should not be so we both are in  
17 a position now where we are almost at the signature  
18 stage so I would say to you that I'll be very, very  
19 clear about the fact that its time to sign the  
20 document and there are things that we have both moved  
21 on but again we're holding the line on what schools  
22 should be and what should happen in schools and  
23 we're ready to sign.

24 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Because just to be  
25 clear and to give greater context to this issue as,

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 as Chalkbeat noted which I want to give them a shout  
3 out, we're technically still under a Rudy Giuliani...  
4 Rudy Giuliani era school safety system which is  
5 unacceptable. I want to remove all remnants of that  
6 system under Rudy Giuliani, that, that system has  
7 really had a disproportionate impact on students of  
8 color and the most vulnerable marginalized students  
9 in our... in our... in our school system in terms of  
10 suspensions, in terms of long term suspensions, in  
11 terms of school arrests, what some folks in  
12 government would deem an emergency crisis could be a  
13 young child having a bad day because their supports  
14 are not in the school and, and so we cannot... you know  
15 this is a school system, this is not an NYPD system  
16 and I just, you know I, I think we need to make sure  
17 that the power pendulum swings back in terms of  
18 schools controlling schools and again understanding  
19 that agents have a role in shaping school climate  
20 they cannot be dominating that climate, school  
21 officials should be controlling their, their schools.  
22 I just have a few more questions on FSF and then I'll  
23 turn to my colleagues who have been very patient and...  
24 what portion of this year's FSF increase was used for  
25 staff?

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

RICHARD CARRANZA: Our CFO will answer.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Great.

LINDSEY OATES: Sure, thank you for that question, 95 percent of the increase was used to support teachers and guidance counselors and social workers.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Now was that for new staff or just existing folks in their schools?

LINDSEY OATES: New staff.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: 90... you're saying 95 percent?

LINDSEY OATES: Uh-huh.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Does the DOE track the titles of school-based staff that are hired using additional FSF or resources and do you have like a breakdown of, of the different titles?

LINDSEY OATES: Yes, we can provide that, but it is... it is a... it's what I said its teachers, guidance counselors, social workers and then some other, other titles but we can provide the specifics.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So... and how many additional school-based staff were hired as a result of the FSF increase?

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 LINDSEY OATES: I don't have that  
3 information with me but I'm happy to provide it to  
4 you afterwards.

5 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I, I would be very  
6 happy to get that information because I think, you  
7 know we, we had a meeting about this issue and I just  
8 want to kind of apply this again that there are  
9 schools in our city that have an average teacher  
10 salary.. and average building teacher's salary that is  
11 higher than the citywide average teacher salary and  
12 so for example, there is a school in Southern  
13 Brooklyn that has 250 teachers, their average teacher  
14 salary went up from 87,000 to 89,000 dollars, their  
15 FSF increase was about 500,000 dollars but that's  
16 exactly how much they needed to stay afloat in terms  
17 of paying teachers in their.. in their school who's  
18 there's contractual obligations to give them raises  
19 and so forth so they technically did not see much or  
20 at all of an increase in terms of their overall  
21 school budget so they couldn't really hire additional  
22 support staff, is there a plan to kind of right this  
23 ship understanding that there are certain schools  
24 that teacher salaries are below the citywide average  
25 but I do think that we when making a public promise



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 and a pledge for schools to better meet the needs of  
3 our kids it's not about just kind of keeping their  
4 budgets afloat, if you could speak to this?

5 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, I'll, I'll start  
6 and then if our CFO wants to add I'd be happy to have  
7 her add to this. So, there are a number of ways that  
8 you budget for schools, in my experience during my  
9 time in a previous district we were the creators of  
10 the weighted student formula which is what we've  
11 adopted in New York City and the notion is very  
12 simply that the money follows the student and that  
13 there are certain weights that are attached to a  
14 student based on the special needs of the student;  
15 multilingual learners, students with disabilities,  
16 etcetera and then within that system there are ways  
17 of calculating how those adjustments and those  
18 allocations are made. One way is what New York City  
19 does, which is you use the, the actual salaries of  
20 the employees and then whatever your... just as a very  
21 simple analogy, if you have 100 dollars and you have  
22 a very experienced staff that adds up to 85 dollars  
23 you've only got 15 dollars left to spend on  
24 everything else whereas a school that has a similar  
25 population of students which generates that funding

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 and a very inexperienced staff they may only have to  
3 spend 50 dollars and they've got 50 dollars that's  
4 exactly what you're talking about Chairman Treyger.  
5 There are models where you can average the salary so  
6 that there you take the composite of the entire  
7 system of all teachers, all counselors, all social  
8 workers, all paraprofessionals and you develop a  
9 composite average so that every school then knows  
10 that the average cost per teacher is an average,  
11 you're not paying for the highly paid, you're not  
12 paying for the lowly paid, you're paying for the  
13 average it in general will give more flexibility in  
14 the school budgets for schools to allocate resources.  
15 Now it may seem like a real no brainer that's... why  
16 don't we just do that, there are down sides to that.  
17 The downside to that is that then you run the risk if  
18 you're not paying attention that you have certain  
19 schools that would accumulate the most experienced  
20 teachers and not necessarily have to pay for that and  
21 we know that experience as it pertains to quality and  
22 just experienced instruction in the classroom equates  
23 to higher achievement so it becomes more difficult  
24 for schools that have a constant churn to get the  
25 leverage that they need to really improve their

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 academic achievement and they're paying a higher  
3 price for their average teacher. Now the reason I  
4 give that little lesson in school finance is because  
5 when I said that there are no sacred cows there are  
6 no sacred cows, we're exploring what would that look  
7 like to move to a different kind of average salary  
8 system, what were... what would be the consequences,  
9 the unintended consequences, the intended  
10 consequences, how would that look in the terms of the  
11 financial picture so we're exploring all of those  
12 particular different kinds of funding mechanisms. I  
13 would be remiss if I didn't also say we're also  
14 looking at can you identify a set of what we would  
15 call essential positions, what would an essential  
16 position be, this would be a conversation with our  
17 community but it could be as an example, every school  
18 has to have a counselor at a certain ratio, every  
19 school has to have a, a nurse at a certain ratio, you  
20 identify essential positions. The difficulty with  
21 that in all transparency is that the way the system  
22 is currently funded and with the 1.2 billion that is  
23 still owed to the children of New York City we can't  
24 possibly afford that right now. So, again we want to  
25 be sure what we're looking at, how we're looking at

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 that and I, I would say you should expect to see in  
3 the next few months, 12 months at least some ideas  
4 about how that could look in our system especially  
5 after we have a little more clarity in terms of  
6 what's happening with the state budget as well.

7 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right, I, I just  
8 want to explain very quickly for the public in  
9 greater context, under the current budgeting  
10 structure for schools they're required to use the  
11 average building teacher salary in terms of how much  
12 they have to pay their, their educators. FSF which  
13 we've been fighting for is a precious funding stream  
14 that they use to pay for teachers, social workers,  
15 counselors and paraprofessionals. Under the current  
16 structure a school that retains quality, veteran  
17 educators are punished for retaining veteran  
18 educators because they're cost increased but we're  
19 not... we're not kind of keeping up with those cost  
20 increases so there are some schools that are... that  
21 say we have to save money by somehow maybe letting go  
22 of veteran teachers and all that experience to hire  
23 new, newer teachers and look at the areas, the  
24 commonality of where this dynamic happens in many  
25 communities that need veteran, quality, experienced

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 educators for our students that, that need seasoned  
3 educators in the classroom so we do need to kind of  
4 right this ship because this is a glaring  
5 instructional issue for many of our schools so I'll  
6 be mindful of time and turn now to my colleagues to  
7 remind them that there's three minutes per member,  
8 first we'll begin with Council Member Andy Cohen.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Thank you Chair,  
10 thank you Chair but I have notes so I'm all ready. I  
11 do want to say that I appreciate the good news in  
12 your testimony about the graduation rates, the drop  
13 out rates, college entrance that's very exciting and,  
14 and good to hear and I also did want to echo a point  
15 that the Chairman made that was so important, with  
16 UPK... with the rollout of UPK when it came to my  
17 district I had literally zero in DOE school, existing  
18 buildings seats, not one, CBOs all stepped up to fill  
19 the gap for every single... the UPK seat I got.  
20 Subsequently, there has been some build out of  
21 infrastructure but you know not only pay parody but a  
22 lot... but a lot of these CBOs that stepped up really  
23 when there was a challenge, when you built out the  
24 capacity you kind of kicked them to the curb and it's  
25 really destabilized a group of social service... school

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 providers, UPK providers, nursery school providers  
3 that existed for... some of them for a tremendously  
4 long time in my district and I really, I do feel like  
5 we need to do a better job, I don't know if they're  
6 going to take the bait with 3-K like they may be like  
7 we're not going to help you so we need to work on  
8 that. You know one of the things that I really  
9 struggle with too and, and I think in this  
10 conversation about diversity and equity it really  
11 galls me when someone says oh, oh that's a bad  
12 school. I go to my... I really visit particularly my  
13 elementary schools and my middle schools and I know  
14 that like, you know on, on the statewide test that  
15 this school performs higher than that school but when  
16 I go through the building I see classrooms where it  
17 appears to me that learning is taking place, the  
18 bulletin boards are covered with art, that things are  
19 happening and I don't know how to frame the  
20 discussion with people like that is not a... like what,  
21 what do you want from this school, things, things...  
22 seems to me... the right things seem to be happening  
23 there and I... and I wonder like... I just don't know how  
24 to communicate it to people like, like the Chair said  
25 like a school has a significant population living in

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 shelter or you know I have a significant, you know  
3 huge immigration population from Bangladesh, from  
4 Central and South America, you know the kids are  
5 learning to speak English so they don't score as well  
6 on the test but it's not... it's not the school, I  
7 don't know how to communicate that, I don't know how  
8 you communicate that, I'd appreciate a little help on  
9 that.

10 RICHARD CARRANZA: Well Council Member I,  
11 I appreciate this so I'm going to invite our hundreds  
12 of closest friends to our therapy session. So, I, I  
13 couldn't agree with you more, I, I will tell you I  
14 visit schools every week, I, I visited... I visited in,  
15 in my 12 months... 11 months here now hundreds of  
16 schools and I will tell you that my impression is  
17 that schools are doing gods work in many difficult  
18 circumstances and in those schools I have never met a  
19 school where the faculty and the leadership say I  
20 think we're just going to be a bad school today, I  
21 don't think we're going to do well by kids today,  
22 what I have seen are people that are very, very  
23 committed to doing well by children. What, what I say  
24 in terms of historical... historic underserving of  
25 schools is why I referred to it as historic

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 underserving of schools and communities because we  
3 have not invested the resources or the supports to  
4 help the school communities that are doing that work  
5 actually do that work in a much more strategic way.  
6 So, what I would say to folks when I get that  
7 question on the subway and people say well, you know  
8 why do you have so many bad schools, I said tell me  
9 which school you visited that's a bad school, well I  
10 haven't visited a school, I've been told that this  
11 school... well I have... why have you been told that's a  
12 bad schools, well look at their test scores and I  
13 said well then test scores aren't the sole  
14 determining of a bad school or a bad anything, have  
15 you talked to the teachers, have you felt the  
16 environment, have you looked at what they do, do you  
17 look at who their students are, have you seen what  
18 the growth is every day, do you know what they do in  
19 the community so one of the things I would challenge  
20 people to do and if its useful I'd add... I'd give this  
21 to you as well, is challenge people to visit schools  
22 that they think or have been told are bad schools, I  
23 think they will have a very different impression  
24 about what the school really is once they actually  
25 step foot in the school and experience it.



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Thank you  
Chancellor, if there's a round two Chair if you can  
sign me up, I'd appreciate it, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you so much  
Council Member Cohen, next we have Council Member  
Rose.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you, hi  
Chancellor, how are you doing, I haven't seen you on  
Staten Island in a little bit but... [cross-talk]

RICHARD CARRANZA: I'm, I'm coming, I  
need my pizza fix.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay, okay. So, I  
have a bunch of questions so I'm just going to go  
into them. Have you talked about the possibility of  
baselining teachers choice because we're talking  
about school success and making sure that schools are  
equipped with what they need, this is a big necessity  
and teachers shouldn't have to and the City Council  
frankly shouldn't have to provide equipment and  
supplies for teachers to do their job so is there any  
talk about baselining teacher's choice?

RICHARD CARRANZA: We're, we're actually  
engaging in that conversation, we've engaged in that  
conversation and, and again we think it's very

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 beneficial for teachers but there are ongoing  
3 conversations about that very topic with, with our  
4 partners at OMB and City Hall.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: So, is there a  
6 possibility that we'll see it in this budget?

7 RICHARD CARRANZA: I, I'm an optimist so  
8 I think there's always a possibility, the realist  
9 side of me says without the additional funding you  
10 have to weigh that against other priorities and then  
11 that, that's what becomes the difficult choices but  
12 we, we think there's value to it and that's why we're  
13 continuing to have those conversations.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay, I understand  
15 the importance of weighing things because I really  
16 want to see guidance counselors and social workers  
17 however how do you get the job done if you don't have  
18 the equipment to do it? So, title IX does DOE  
19 currently have a title IX coordinator on staff and if  
20 not, what is your hiring estimation?

21 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, title IX... yes  
22 ma'am, as a title... as a federal requirement I, I am  
23 sure we have a title IX coordinator, I don't know the  
24 exact name, but we can get that information to you  
25 right away.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: So, there are over  
3 1.1 million students in DOE public schools and yet  
4 DOE... you have one title IX coordinator, are you  
5 planning to increase this number so that students  
6 will be able to have a title IX... the appropriate  
7 number of title IX coordinators and what do you think  
8 would be the appropriate staffing level for DOE to  
9 properly respond to title IX concerns?

10 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, Council Member  
11 Rose I think first and foremost title IX one of the  
12 fundamental responsibilities of title IX is to ensure  
13 that all students are being served especially as it  
14 pertains to opportunities so I think that we should  
15 have as robust an infrastructure as possible. Now  
16 what is the appropriate way of doing that, it  
17 depends... it depends how you organize that service. I  
18 worked in a very large urban school system nowhere as  
19 large as New York but I did work in a large urban  
20 system where we had a, a system wide director of  
21 title IX and then what we did is we actually trained  
22 an administrator at every campus and an administrator  
23 in every department to be the associate if you will  
24 title IX person so they were trained, they had a  
25 reporting structure, they had a responsibility matrix

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 and we... that was our way within a constrained budget  
3 to be able to have that service represented at the  
4 school site and at the department level site as well.  
5 So, we, we will get back to you on where we are now  
6 but I will tell you that there are other ways other  
7 than just having people solely designated that I've  
8 seen be successful in making sure that we have a  
9 robust title IX enforcement structure..

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: So, do you have an  
11 idea of what the appropriate number would be to  
12 adequately address this population and are you  
13 planning to increase?

14 RICHARD CARRANZA: Well it's a... its an  
15 equity issue for us so absolutely we're focused on  
16 it, I'll... let me get back to you on what, what the  
17 team is developing on that.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay, thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you Council  
20 Member. Next, we have Council Member Chin.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you Chair,  
22 Chancellor good morning. Chancellor we've been  
23 spending so much time on this specialized high  
24 school, I think that, you know of course New York  
25 Times when they said only seven black students out of

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 895 were accepted but what is the administration  
3 going to do in the long run because we have invested  
4 money in the dream program in trying to do more  
5 outreach and test prep to help but what's missing is  
6 the pipeline. We don't even have gifted and talented  
7 program in every single district in our schools,  
8 right, we used.. it's not enough and that's something  
9 that the administration should really look at and  
10 also how do we make sure that every single high  
11 school as you said earlier, we have good schools but  
12 people don't know about it and they just hearsay. I  
13 have a lot of different types of high schools in my  
14 district from the elite specialized high school to  
15 the regular school but I support every single one of  
16 them because every kid who goes to that school  
17 expects the best education and we need to turn this  
18 conversation around, how do we make each school safe  
19 and great for our kids because they deserve that?  
20 Funding is one thing and we need to get the resources  
21 from Albany but we need as a city as a whole we all  
22 need to help promote those schools and to make sure  
23 that they have the resources but really setting up a  
24 pipeline and really putting honors programs in high  
25 schools creating every single high school as the best

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 there is, I think that is something that DOE needs to  
3 work with us. As you said earlier, the City Council,  
4 we have invested so much resources in our schools,  
5 all these technology labs, even science labs. One of  
6 my first capital projects was a science lab in a  
7 middle school, why are we doing that, how come DOE is  
8 not doing that? Right, so we need to really work on  
9 that partnership and we really want your commitment  
10 into creating more gifted and talented programs  
11 throughout the district in every single school in our  
12 district.

13 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you Council,  
14 Council Member Chin. So, we, we share your passion  
15 for making sure that all of our students have a  
16 rigorous opportunity for pursuing education whether  
17 it's at the middle school level when they leave our  
18 elementary schools or high school level so we share  
19 that and part of the data that I shared in my opening  
20 remarks in terms of what are... what's the evidence in  
21 terms of how are we doing, we have continued  
22 increases in the areas we should be increasing;  
23 academic achievement, it's continued to tick upwards,  
24 graduation rates, college going rates, attendance  
25 rates, drop out rates are coming down, suspension

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 rates are coming down. So, there are some good  
3 barometers that show yes, we are investing in the  
4 right things at elementary, middle school and high  
5 school. The other thing is and I respect the voices  
6 around this conversation that is happening around  
7 opportunities to go to certain schools, I think what  
8 is important to also recognize is that a system will  
9 give you what a system is set up to give you. The  
10 system in structures will produce what its designed  
11 to produce and what we're talking about here is three  
12 things if, if I may. Number one, the 1.1 million  
13 students in the New York City Department of Education  
14 70 percent of the students are black and Latino, 70  
15 percent so it is absolutely abhorrent and  
16 unacceptable that students... ten offers are made to  
17 students to go to a specialized school, that is  
18 unacceptable given who we are in New York City and  
19 anyone who says that that is and I'm not saying you  
20 are... [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: No, I'm not, I'm  
22 saying... [cross-talk]

23 RICHARD CARRANZA: ...I know... I... [cross-  
24 talk]

25

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: ...that is  
3 unacceptable.

4 RICHARD CARRANZA: I, I heard you very  
5 loud and clear and I want to re-emphasize you're not  
6 saying that but there are voices out there that say  
7 well they should just work harder, there are voices  
8 out there that say well if they cared more about  
9 their education they would be able to do it because  
10 look at others are able to do it. There is an  
11 opportunity gap and the system that's been set up and  
12 I'm going to be very specific because I've been on  
13 the record about this, the specialized high school  
14 admissions test is neither valid nor reliable as the  
15 sole criteria to determine talent to go to a  
16 specialized environment, there is no evidence for  
17 that yet we depend on that as the sole criteria to  
18 identify students that are able to go to those  
19 schools.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Now does DOE have a  
21 say in those tests, I mean can DOE reform those  
22 tests?

23 RICHARD CARRANZA: No, there is a state  
24 law that requires that specific test and as I've done  
25 my homework as well I would encourage everyone to do...



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 in the audience, I know the Councils done their  
3 homework, fight... Chalkbeat had a great article about  
4 what was the initial intent in the 1970s around  
5 putting this state law in place, who was it intended  
6 to keep from going to those schools, read the  
7 newspaper they'll, they'll tell you all about it. So,  
8 I think there's a structural issue that as a  
9 Chancellor, as an educator I cannot be quite about,  
10 there is a structural issue. Number two, when we talk  
11 about gifted and talented if you ask and this is work  
12 that we're engaging in right now, if you ask 100  
13 people what is a gifted and talented program, you  
14 will get 200 answers of what a gifted and talented  
15 program is and when you look at the gifted and  
16 talented program what it basically boils down to in  
17 our current iteration as expressed in New York City  
18 is you test early, you identify them and then it's  
19 just more and faster, its not an enriched curriculum,  
20 it's not a significantly different curriculum and  
21 then the, the fact that we test four year olds for a  
22 gifted and talented program for me there's no basis  
23 in the research that shows that's the effective way  
24 so we've got a lot of work to do on gifted and  
25 talented and we're doing that work by engaging our

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 communities as we speak but I think it also gets put  
3 into the body politic that says if you only had more  
4 gifted and talented programs you would have more of a  
5 pipeline, that's not true. There are incredible  
6 things that are happening in our schools that are  
7 preparing black and Latino and other students the  
8 opportunities aren't there because it doesn't matter  
9 how well they do in school, even if a student is in a  
10 gifted and talented program that really doesn't  
11 matter because they have to just take one test that's  
12 not aligned to state standards and that's the sole  
13 determinate if they get to go to one of these  
14 schools. There's a... there's a misalignment of  
15 resources. The third thing that I would say and I've  
16 said this publicly as well is that there is a  
17 perception with my fellow New Yorkers that say and  
18 it's to the Council Members early, early comment  
19 about there is this perception that you have to go to  
20 certain schools if you want to get a good education,  
21 people have not even looked at these schools, they've  
22 not even walked into different schools but there is  
23 this perception that you have to go to certain  
24 elementary schools and if you don't forget it, don't  
25 go to the public schools and then you have to go to

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 certain middle schools and if you don't get to one of  
3 those 21 middle schools that will get you to one of  
4 the special high schools then forget it, all is lost  
5 and then you only can go to these specialized  
6 schools, they don't even take a look at the wonderful  
7 schools that you have in your... in your area. So, we  
8 have a conversation in New York to be had about look  
9 at your schools, look at the incredible opportunities  
10 there are in your schools, consider for a minute that  
11 there is more than a portfolio of four or five  
12 schools that there are tremendous opportunities. I  
13 truly believe that if New Yorkers actually looked at  
14 the incredible panorama of educational opportunities  
15 in the schools in their neighborhoods they would find  
16 hidden gems that they hadn't even considered because  
17 somebody told them way back when you don't want to go  
18 to any school except that school. So, I think that  
19 there are a lot of different facets to the  
20 conversation but what I'm really excited about is  
21 that we're having this conversation, we need to have  
22 this conversation because New York can lead in this  
23 particular respect especially with who we are.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I think we can  
25 start with the middle school directory and the high

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 school directory that it should not just base on the  
3 test scores... [cross-talk]

4 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yes... [cross-talk]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: ...that every school  
6 should be able to highlight, you know the positive  
7 aspect of that school, the information are not there  
8 and not... you know parents are not going to be able to  
9 visit every school but information about that school,  
10 the good stuff about that school, that should be in  
11 the guide so the parents can read about it and then  
12 consider it and right now its missing.

13 RICHARD CARRANZA: Look forward to  
14 working with anyone on that but I think that's an  
15 excellent point.

16 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay...

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, thank  
18 you Chair.

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yes, thank you,  
20 thank you very much. And just a quick follow up Mr.  
21 Chancellor, who, who... I know the state mandates the  
22 exam, who actually pays for it?

23 RICHARD CARRANZA: The school system I  
24 believe pays for it, we pay for that, it's part of  
25 the state law.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right and does the  
3 city have any say in terms of the contracting with...  
4 what's the name of the company that produces the, the  
5 exam?

6 RICHARD CARRANZA: We'll have to get that  
7 information for you.

8 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right, I, I would  
9 appreciate that because I'm just... I'm curious to know  
10 if we're paying for it and we bid out and we select  
11 the company does the city of New York have any say in  
12 shaping the test at minimum as... one criticism that  
13 I've heard correctly which is valid why isn't it  
14 aligned for example to state curriculum, does the  
15 city have discretionary power to make it aligned to  
16 state curriculum and so I would appreciate follow up  
17 on that, thank you Mr. Chancellor.

18 RICHARD CARRANZA: Sure.

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Next we have  
20 Council Member Brannan.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Thank you Chair.  
22 Chancellor always good to see you. I have two things,  
23 first thing, I have to bring something to your  
24 attention that was in a local newspaper in my  
25 district, it's a story that warmed my heart and broke

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 my heart at the same time. It's IS201 and it's a  
3 story about three kids who for their STEAM expo  
4 project they built a desk for one of their classmates  
5 who's a wheelchair user which is great but it kind of  
6 blew my mind because I'd assume that, you know kids  
7 who are using wheelchairs were already given some  
8 sort of special desks and the kids go on to say that  
9 there are four other students who use wheelchairs in  
10 their school. So, for kids that use wheelchairs, I  
11 mean are they given... I know... and the school is ADA  
12 compliant of course but are they given special desks  
13 of some sort; I don't know why these kids have to  
14 build them a desk?

15 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yeah, so I, I also  
16 read that article and similarly warmed my heart, but  
17 it did raise some questions so we're looking into why  
18 exactly... [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Okay... [cross-  
20 talk]

21 RICHARD CARRANZA: ...we don't know if they  
22 decided to build this in lieu of what's provided to  
23 meet the needs of that student but I will say to you  
24 that a student with a disability, with an IEP where,  
25 where it's clearly identified what they need to be

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 able to address the curriculum we provide that for  
3 them.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Yeah... [cross-  
5 talk]

6 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, we can come back...  
7 [cross-talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: ...and that's what  
9 I thought it was... [cross-talk]

10 RICHARD CARRANZA: ...with more details on  
11 that...

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Yeah, okay. And  
13 then I have... I have to echo strongly what my  
14 colleague Andy Cohen said before, I'm hearing the  
15 same thing from CBOs in my district and I've been  
16 working closely with Deputy Chancellor Wallack on  
17 this. These CBOs feel like they were there during the  
18 hot and heavy days of Pre-K when we were... I mean I, I  
19 worked for DOE, I remember we were stashing kids in  
20 garages if we had to, to make those numbers, you know  
21 because the demand was so high... [cross-talk]

22 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yeah... [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: ...and it was  
24 great. Now that things have leveled out a lot of  
25 these CBOs feel like they've been hung out to dry, I

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 mean they've been sold out and then that they're  
3 being cannibalized by... that we're building more and  
4 more of these early ed centers, so somethings got to  
5 give here. Look I don't... I don't think that the DOE  
6 is responsible for, for keeping private businesses in  
7 business but you've got small businesses that are  
8 having teaching generations of kids that are now  
9 after decades now are considering closing because  
10 they can't make ends meet because they rely on, on  
11 these seats and, and have... and teaching these kids. I  
12 don't know what the answer is, I know, you know 3-K  
13 we're sort of dangling that carrot but a lot of these  
14 groups I don't blame them that they don't have much  
15 faith in that so it's... certain... and hearing from,  
16 from Councilman Cohen today who's a million miles  
17 from my district it's clear that it's a citywide  
18 issue... [cross-talk]

19 RICHARD CARRANZA: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: ...and I'm hoping  
21 that you guys will, will take a serious look at it.

22 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, Council Member  
23 Brannan again thank you for that. As, as I mentioned  
24 earlier in my testimony we absolutely are committed  
25 to working with our community based organizations and



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 our partners and I will tell you that I've had the  
3 ability to visit many of those classrooms out in the  
4 community, I'm impressed by what I see and the  
5 dedication of what I see so in the current RFP that  
6 we've put out we've alluded to the fact obviously  
7 within the environment of we don't have a settled  
8 budget yet that we are committed to doing right by  
9 those organizations. I think there's also a perfect  
10 storm that the state has a responsibility in this  
11 specifically there are early education advise..  
12 agencies and businesses that provide services to  
13 students with disabilities that we work with that are  
14 funded through the state and we've brought this to  
15 the attention of the state as well that as they are  
16 not keeping up with the funding those businesses are  
17 being forced to close which overnight it results in  
18 us then having to find placements somewhere for  
19 students with disabilities almost overnight so  
20 there's, there's not only a local concern but there's  
21 a state concern and we've made that really clear to  
22 the state as well and in addition I know that folks  
23 have talked about the issue Chairman Treyger talked  
24 as well about the issue of the teachers that are out  
25 in the community, I just want to be really clear that

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 we also believe that anyone working with children  
3 should be compensated and compensated well but it's  
4 also important for me to be very clear with the  
5 record that those teachers obviously don't work for  
6 the DOE, they work for... they have their own union,  
7 they work for their own organizations, we are  
8 involved in those conversations in helping to move  
9 those conversations forward but there is negotiations  
10 that are happening and again we know we don't  
11 negotiate in public but we... and, and they don't  
12 negotiate with us but we have expressed how much we  
13 are in support of the, the, the direction that you  
14 expressed and we want them to be treated fairly.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Yeah, just...  
16 Chair thank you, Chancellor I just... I, I want to be  
17 able to tell these CBOs in good faith to hand in  
18 there, I, I just don't want to be caught lying to  
19 them that, that there's nothing... [cross-talk]

20 RICHARD CARRANZA: I agree... [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: ...coming so  
22 anything you can do in messaging to them that this is  
23 a rough patch and it'll level out when 3-K comes I  
24 think they've always worked with us in good faith so  
25 now is not the time to, to change that.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

RICHARD CARRANZA: I agree...

COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: You know... thank you.

RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you, next we'll hear from Council Member Dromm.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you very much Mr. Chair and good to see you Chancellor.

RICHARD CARRANZA: Good to see you sir.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you for mentioning lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender students in your opening testimony and for again offering to march in the Pride Parade, I look forward to hopefully joining you on that day.

RICHARD CARRANZA: It's a lot of fun.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: It was historic first that you did that and I'm very, very proud of that.

RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: And I understand also that Jared Fox held a summit where over a thousand to maybe a thousand and five hundred students attended about a month or so ago near the

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 end of January, I guess it was and that was quite  
3 successful also...

4 RICHARD CARRANZA: It was impressive, it  
5 was... it was a beautiful sight to see.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: It really was,  
7 yep. Let me just talk to you a little bit about  
8 implicit bias training. Last year the city funded  
9 implicit bias training for all DOE staff over the  
10 next four years, you announced that you'd be  
11 accelerating the program to take place over two years  
12 so can you tell us how many staff have been trained  
13 to date and how many staff do you expect to be  
14 trained by fiscal... at the end of fiscal 19?

15 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, yes sir, so for  
16 the specific numbers I'm going to ask our Chief  
17 Financial Officer to give you those specific numbers.

18 LINDSEY OATES: Hi, thank you for the  
19 question Council Member Dromm, we've trained several  
20 thousand teachers and other staff members this year  
21 and we're looking to train upwards of 20,000 next  
22 year and its been exciting to see the work get off  
23 the ground and, and see the real impact that its  
24 making in people's lives.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: So, when you say  
3 several thousand like can you tell us about how many  
4 thousand?

5 LINDSEY OATES: I believe... I don't want  
6 to say the incorrect number but it's several  
7 thousand, I think its approximately 8,000 year to  
8 date... [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: 8,000... [cross-  
10 talk]

11 LINDSEY OATES: ...with more to come for  
12 the rest of this school year but we can provide the  
13 exact numbers...

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Okay and how are  
15 you prioritizing which staff get that training?

16 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, what we're doing  
17 is a number of ways. First and foremost we want to  
18 make sure that we have folks that are willing because  
19 we want them to be the, the, the champions, as we  
20 train them we want then to go out as well then we  
21 look at our data, where do we have the greatest need  
22 based on the data and the data is disproportionality  
23 and suspensions, disproportionality in terms of  
24 academic achievement, etcetera and then we go out and  
25 work with those superintendents to get not only

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 central staff but also school based staff as well.

3 So, we're prioritizing where we see the need based on  
4 the data that we're seeing.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Do you still  
6 expect to be able to train all staff by the end of  
7 2020?

8 RICHARD CARRANZA: That's our goal sir  
9 and I know you asked do we expect, it's just a matter  
10 of money so if we have the funding we can absolutely  
11 do that and we're continuing to advocate for that to  
12 be able to meet our goal.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: And Chancellor I  
14 think I mentioned this to you before and to your  
15 First Deputy Chancellor as well, some teachers are  
16 telling me that in that training they're not hearing  
17 the LGBT words, have you looked into that at all and  
18 are you... is that integrated into the discussions  
19 around implicit bias?

20 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, yeah and I  
21 appreciate you bringing that to my attention, we've  
22 actually taken a good look at that and we want to  
23 make sure that as we mention any particular group of  
24 people that we want to make sure that that's not  
25 being excluded so the good news is that that is

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 absolutely part of the training. The, the not so good  
3 news was that as we started rolling it out people  
4 were kind of doing the training, there wasn't always  
5 consistency in what happened, that's been solved for  
6 now but if I may sir I just also want to be sure  
7 because implicit bias gets defined in lots of  
8 different ways, at the core of implicit bias training  
9 is what it says it is, its about taking an inner look  
10 at who you are, what are your belief systems and how  
11 do you act in the world based on your belief systems  
12 and how do your belief systems manifest themselves as  
13 you interact with other individuals so at its core  
14 implicit bias is about self-reflection, self-  
15 identification and then self-actualization. So, that  
16 means that if I know who I am and I know what my  
17 biases are, we're going to just assume unintended and  
18 in some cases could be intended then I know how to  
19 call myself on it, I know how to check it and then I  
20 know how that manifests onto others. When you think  
21 about that you may or may not hear people talk all  
22 the time about LGBTQ or you may not hear them talk  
23 about immigrants, you may not hear because its so  
24 personalized but as we do multiple sessions that  
25 becomes much more relevant and prevalent in those

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 conversations because then as you understand yourself  
3 and then how do you work with others, the others are  
4 all represented by all of the groups of people. So,  
5 part of it also is how we're, we're rolling it out  
6 and at what stage people are being trained but you  
7 have my commitment here sir that... as you know you  
8 know my personal story and my family and this is an  
9 issue that is very dear to my heart and will continue  
10 to be part of what we do to make sure that all  
11 students and all people are being accounted for and  
12 valued in our system.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I know I'm out of  
14 time but let me just wrap it up by saying the reason  
15 why I harp on the LGBT is because often times I think  
16 that unless its explicitly stated people tend not to  
17 think of that or to include that and that's why it's  
18 so important I think that we make that effort to make  
19 sure people know that that is part of it.

20 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you for that, I  
21 appreciate it...

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you. Thank  
23 you.

24 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you Chair  
25 Dromm for your leadership, continued leadership on



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 this very important issue. Next, we'll hear from  
3 Council Member Cornegy.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Good morning  
5 Chancellor, how are you?

6 RICHARD CARRANZA: Good morning sir.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: While I respect  
8 and appreciate the comments that were made around  
9 gifted and talented, I guess you knew I would  
10 probably be bringing up gifted and talented..

11 RICHARD CARRANZA: I had an idea.. [cross-  
12 talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: We've had this  
14 conversation offline a thousand times. I just want to  
15 provide a different perspective to what you've  
16 offered before the body today, that perspective being  
17 that for context.. for contextual purposes I think  
18 the, the way that the gifted and talented programs  
19 have played out are a little bit more insidious than,  
20 than you've led to... prior to you being here. Just for  
21 context purposes in 1989 for example, 51 percent of  
22 the students at Brooklyn Tech for example were black  
23 and Hispanic, ironically that's the same time that  
24 they centralized the gifted and talented program  
25 meaning they took it out of the minority communities

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 and put it in a central location and changed the  
3 complexion literally of it. I think that it's worth  
4 noting that as many people well know seven... there are  
5 seven zip codes that predominate the populations for  
6 upstate prisons. Ironically, those gifted and  
7 talented programs were removed from those same seven  
8 zip codes. I think when we talk about pipelines there  
9 are absolute pipelines in the city to the specialized  
10 high schools, in theater schools, some of my  
11 colleagues have districts that have predominate  
12 theater schools, in my community we had Philippa  
13 Schuyler, we had 308 which were literally theater  
14 schools which created a pipeline for minority  
15 communities those no longer exist so I think not, not  
16 giving it context doesn't give it the proper respect  
17 that it needs, it's, it's way more insidious and I  
18 think that... my question to you is how much money has  
19 been spent on enrichment programs and or test prep, I  
20 prefer to say enrichment programs because nobody  
21 wants to teach to a test, I get that 100 percent, I  
22 do agree that the new model for gifted and talented  
23 programs at 3<sup>rd</sup> grade as an onramp are way better  
24 than trying to test a four year old that was a fit...  
25 you know that, that was based on vocabulary and was

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 discriminatory in practice in some circles but I want  
3 to know what we're doing now, how much money is being  
4 spent on enrichment and or test prep for minority  
5 students to get into specialized high schools?

6 RICHARD CARRANZA: Sure, so I'll start  
7 and then I'll ask our Chief Financial Officer to give  
8 you specifics. So, I appreciate the context, I think  
9 that's an important piece of it. When you look at the  
10 continuum of learning for all students we often talk  
11 about students with disabilities as needing services  
12 and supports but we rarely talk about gifted students  
13 and what do they need to be serviced in a classroom  
14 environment so that they can maximize their learning  
15 potential as well. So, these are ends of a continuum  
16 that you have to look at how do you provide services  
17 to those students. So, as we're getting better and  
18 we're becoming much more grounded in the research of  
19 what is effective and brain science and how, how  
20 children actually learn I agree with you we should  
21 have those specific programs represented in all of  
22 our communities but specifically in our historically  
23 underrepresented communities so that students and  
24 families know how to access those programs, that's  
25 our goal but in order to do that what we've been able

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 to do now is to start to really take a look at in  
3 that continuum of instruction how are we structuring  
4 those gifted and talented programs to truly be number  
5 one, about identifying giftedness in a student and  
6 then how do you develop that talent, what does that  
7 curriculum look like so that you're actually  
8 enriching those students because of their particular  
9 gifted needs. With that said we have made some  
10 investments; I'm going to ask our Chief Financial  
11 Officer to talk a little bit about that.

12 LINDSEY OATES: Thank you Council Member.  
13 So, we have two programs the discovery program which  
14 is designed to increase enrollment of low-income  
15 students who are just at the threshold of a  
16 specialized high school threshold, that's about half  
17 a million dollars that, that we invest annually in  
18 that program. In addition to that we have the dream  
19 program, we invest two and a half million dollars in  
20 that program, that's an after-school program which is  
21 tutoring students on the specialized high school  
22 exam.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: So, thank, thank  
24 you for that, I really appreciate that. We've... I've  
25 asked from our body another a million dollars to be

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 given to nonprofits to help with that process, I'm  
3 hoping that my, my colleagues will agree with me and  
4 sign onto that. I, I just think that we have to  
5 reimagine the way this works, current... listen we made  
6 a huge stink about this under the... under the former  
7 administration and reinstated gifted and talented  
8 programs so this is actually new for minority  
9 communities where we've reinstated those programs  
10 back into the community over the last three years.  
11 Unfortunately, they were reinstated and are  
12 tremendously under resourced so parents still have a  
13 quandary, you should know and, and I've talked to you  
14 about it but on the record I'd like to say that we've  
15 also created legislation that added the 3-K... I mean  
16 that added the gifted and talented offering for the  
17 exam in the universal 3-K package because access was  
18 another difficulty that parents were, were  
19 experiencing so we're, we're trying from a Council  
20 perspective to do everything we can, we want to work  
21 in tandem with the DOE where we recognize that there  
22 are pathways to building capacity for minority  
23 communities to participate in this and I know that  
24 there's a movement to... you know there's all kinds of  
25 conversations about taking away the test in the

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 interim there are still students who could benefit  
3 from a pathway into it... into the gift... into the  
4 specialized high schools through gifted and talented  
5 programs, I think that's a pipeline that we need to  
6 revisit because it's already been reinstated in our  
7 communities it just needs to be resourced correctly.

8 RICHARD CARRANZA: Sure, thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay, thank you  
10 very much. And members again just be mindful of time  
11 because we do have a lot of folks who are... no  
12 worries. Next, we'll hear from Council Member Kallos.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you Chair  
14 Treyger for your advocacy for guidance counselors,  
15 psychologists and social workers in every school,  
16 you're welcome to stand up, I want to associate  
17 myself with those comments. For five years I've been  
18 focused on school seats this will of course continue  
19 Chancellor. I get three minutes to ask one years'  
20 worth of questions and you don't get a buzzer so  
21 pencils out, please be ready to answer each and every  
22 question in detail. Today I'll focus on school seats;  
23 3-K, Pre-K, gifted and talented, transportation,  
24 civics and segregation. I appreciate that we're on  
25 track for 1,100 Pre-K seats on the Upper East Side,

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 five years after Pre-K for All was announced. There  
3 were 2,577 children born in 2014 who are eligible for  
4 Pre-K in 2019, how many four-year olds applied for  
5 Pre-K as of Monday's deadline in my district? It took  
6 five years to scale up for 4-K, what is DOE's plan  
7 for 3-K in 2022 in less than three years? Onto the  
8 topic of transportation, Houston where you were  
9 previously Chancellor has an app to track buses, I've  
10 now written the law to mandate that you bring that  
11 app to New York City by the new school year in  
12 September, are you on track? On the issue of civics,  
13 this is the first year I missed high school voter  
14 registration day because it was held on a Jewish  
15 holiday, will you support legislation to mandate  
16 voter registration in the classroom on days that  
17 aren't Jewish holidays so that Jewish students can  
18 register too and would you couple that with mock  
19 voting? On the topic of desegregation, you are the  
20 Chancellor for a school system that is more  
21 segregated today than it was before Brown versus the  
22 Board of Education was decided. I have schools that  
23 are 95 percent students of color across the street  
24 from schools that are two thirds Caucasian. When I  
25 have asked DOE to invest in my schools with students

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 in... almost entirely of color you have truncated the  
3 schools then collated... co-located a charter in that  
4 same school, Chancellor your Department of Education  
5 is actually making segregation worse in my district,  
6 will you invest in public/private partnerships for my  
7 schools in need along with rolling out honors  
8 programs and gifted and talented programs to  
9 desegregate? I'd like to associate myself with the  
10 comments of Council Member Robert Cornegy. As we come  
11 upon re-districting in 2020 will you move forward  
12 with redistricting school districts like mine to  
13 desegregate? When we have limited educate...  
14 integration will you commit to personally taking on  
15 racism? Today Tyler Davis, a student at Wagner Middle  
16 School is home today because other students put a  
17 noose of yarn around his neck and taunted him saying  
18 this is what your ancestors went through. Will you  
19 personally come with me to meet with Tyler and his  
20 mother, Allison Davis to let them know that you'll  
21 make our school safe for every race, religion and  
22 creed?

23 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yes, that's a no  
24 brainer, absolutely, that's absolutely... [cross-talk]



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you...

[cross-talk]

RICHARD CARRANZA: ...unacceptable so let's go right now, no more questions... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you...

[cross-talk]

RICHARD CARRANZA: ...we're leaving.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: After the hearing seriously.

RICHARD CARRANZA: After the... no, I'm serious, that is absolutely unacceptable so absolutely I look forward to doing that. I'm going to do my best to answer your questions and I want to congratulate you on articulating them so well, you get an A for preparation. 3-K, Pre-K, look a lot of work goes into 3-K, Pre-K as you know, what we will do is come back to you with a detailed plan of when we're looking at the 3-K seats. The four-year olds, do you have the number?

LINDSEY OATES: No, we'll have to...

[cross-talk]

RICHARD CARRANZA: ...yeah... [cross-talk]

LINDSEY OATES: ...get back to you...

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 RICHARD CARRANZA: We can come back with  
3 the specific number of four-year olds as of Monday  
4 that applied for the... for the, the Pre-K seats.  
5 Transportation let me be... let me be clear about this  
6 and we've met with Chairman Treyger and his staff and  
7 have updated them on this. We are in the process  
8 right now of an RFP for a GPS and tracking  
9 application and the reason we are in an RFP for that  
10 is that we could go with the current standard is  
11 currently, its also used in our snowplows, its used  
12 in other things. Let me tell you I'm an educator and  
13 I've worked in transportation systems it doesn't  
14 serve our need, we're not going to use a screwdriver  
15 to hammer a nail so we're going out for an RFP and  
16 what we want there are apps and GPS systems out there  
17 because I've seen them that can give us the  
18 functionality that we want. So, our goal is to do it  
19 right not to do it by an arbitrary deadline, an  
20 important arbitrary deadline of September. With that  
21 being said we're working with all due haste to make  
22 sure that we can get that done by September, I will  
23 not publicly state that it will be done by September  
24 because that would mean just accepting what we  
25 currently have in place and trying to make it work

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 and then next year at this time we would be having a  
3 conversation about why is the application so  
4 substandard, it doesn't have functionality, we're not  
5 able to do... and then the list of things we can't do,  
6 we're going to do it right and that may mean that we  
7 may not make the September deadline but it means that  
8 when we implement it will be the best in class and  
9 the best in market because I think that's what our  
10 residents deserve. In terms of voter registration,  
11 voter registration and mock voting in civics, I found  
12 out that, that we were set up on a holiday so again  
13 we're paying attention to when that's going to happen  
14 this coming year and as we go forward, we don't want  
15 any of our students not to be able to have those  
16 opportunities because of a holiday, that's the most  
17 basic of respect for our student body so we're  
18 looking to make sure that doesn't happen and I think,  
19 look as a former American government teacher, social  
20 studies teacher I think that every student should  
21 participate in mock voting. This year in particular  
22 with the upcoming federal elections, some state  
23 elections, some local elections, it's going to be  
24 very important for our students to know what the  
25 issues are and then have a way to express their

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 participating. Investing in schools, I'm so glad you  
3 mentioned that. As I mentioned in my testimony the  
4 lens through which we are looking at everything that  
5 we do and in some cases people nod their head and say  
6 okay, that makes sense and some people... some cases  
7 people will shake their head and say I can't believe  
8 he's actually saying that like you want to revamp how  
9 we admit kids to certain schools, you're darn right  
10 because they are not equitable, they are not fair and  
11 nowhere have you seen this more egregious than our  
12 historically underserved communities and there are  
13 communities in this city in specific neighborhoods in  
14 every borough where those communities have not had an  
15 investment of resources, not had an investment in  
16 attention and have not had an investment in helping  
17 those communities do well by their students, that has  
18 changed and where people used to be at the bottom of  
19 the list they're moving to the top of the list. One  
20 example of that is in the recently announced Bronx  
21 plan that we did through an agreement with the UFT  
22 and the DOE. What we did is we specifically looked at  
23 a number and I mentioned this in my testimony at the  
24 beginning, we looked at a number of indicators and  
25 through the number of indicators we looked at we

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 identified a portfolio of schools that we could  
3 honestly and sincerely say had historically been  
4 underserved and what we did is we invited those  
5 school communities to apply to be part of this grant  
6 process, we had the principal and the chapter leader  
7 agree to sign together if they were interested, we're  
8 going to give them training around the root cause  
9 analysis but what... more importantly as they develop  
10 their plan there are resources associated with being  
11 able to implement their plans. In addition to that  
12 we've done a full scale walk through, through those  
13 campuses that have agreed to be a part of it so we're  
14 not just looking at do you have enough technology  
15 which we are, we're not just looking at does your  
16 facility look good which we are but we're also asking  
17 fundamental questions like do you have the  
18 appropriate marketing for what you're doing in your...  
19 in your schools, what are the enrichment programs in  
20 your schools, what are the partnerships and how could  
21 we facilitate greater partnerships with community  
22 based organizations in your schools and I will tell  
23 you that in the communities there are 50 schools that  
24 are a part of this initial group they are fired up,  
25 they are excited because for the first time many of

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 them have said I actually am getting what I need  
3 without having to beg, borrow and steal for that. So,  
4 to your question about are we going to invest in  
5 schools that have historically been underserved, the  
6 answer is an unqualified, unmitigated absolute yes,  
7 we are...

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Will you invest  
9 in those schools that are underserved even if they  
10 are... [cross-talk]

11 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Council Member  
12 Kallos this... [cross-talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: ...any district...  
14 [cross-talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...is your final  
16 question because we do need... [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Yes but just to  
18 clarify, what I'm saying is I, I have a school that  
19 is 95 percent students of color, these kids are from  
20 all over New York City, they are part of communities  
21 that have been underserved, as far as I know you have  
22 not been to my district or toward any of my schools,  
23 my concern is that a school that is serving  
24 underserved populations is being overlooked because  
25 it happens to be on the Upper East Side and most of

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 the schools in my district actually serve children  
3 from underserved communities throughout the city and  
4 I feel that they're being overlooked. Have you been  
5 to any of the schools, will you focus on schools that  
6 are serving the underserved?

7 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, we're looking at  
8 schools that are serving all of our students from  
9 different parts of the city so that's one of the  
10 things we're looking at... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Have you been to  
12 my district?

13 RICHARD CARRANZA: Councilman Kallos I  
14 will say this to you, there are 1,800 schools in the  
15 New York City Department of Education if I visited  
16 one school per day excluding weekends I'll... it'll  
17 take me nine years to visit every school so I will  
18 absolutely make it a point to come visit some  
19 schools. In fact, I'll invite you to come with me  
20 after we go visit that young man.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you.

22 RICHARD CARRANZA: You bet.

23 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yes, and thank you.

24 And actually, I will note the Chancellor has been  
25 visiting a number of schools and I definitely

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 appreciate you following up with Council Member  
3 Kallos but thank you. Next, we will hear from Council  
4 Member Rosenthal.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you so  
6 much Chair, great to see you Chancellor. Some really...  
7 I have five questions. First of all, thank you for  
8 releasing the information on sexual harassment  
9 complaints, those that were substantiated, those that  
10 weren't. I'm wondering given that over half of the  
11 ones that were made, over half the complaints that  
12 were made they haven't been really resolved or looked  
13 into that much and I'm wondering if DOE plans to hire  
14 additional investigators to handle the complaints and  
15 you know what you're doing to reduce sexual  
16 harassment to make sure that people can work in a... an  
17 environment free of discrimination or harassment, you  
18 know sunshine is the key, sunshine and transparency  
19 so I do want to circle back to thanking you for  
20 putting out that information. Secondly, I'm wondering  
21 how the DOE is preparing for the likely rule changes  
22 to title IX given what Secretary DeVos has said?  
23 Third if you could explain what you think the  
24 responsibility of the DOE GEL is... [cross-talk]



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

RICHARD CARRANZA: Say that last part again?

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: GEL.

RICHARD CARRANZA: GEL?

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Gender Equity Liaison. It's my understanding that DOE spends approximately 30 million dollars on Thrive initiatives, can you provide a breakdown on how this funding is used and lastly, what money have you put toward funding the school diversity plans, you know certainly in my district a plan was put in place for the middle schools in addition to the rezone for the three schools which you... so... I'm so proud of how you... impressed with how you stood up for that on day one but, you know PS 191 is looking for funding to make sure they continue to be a school... [cross-talk]

RICHARD CARRANZA: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: ...that attracts students, they have a mandarin program that was funded a little bit in the first year but now they're asking me to fund the continuation of it. so, yeah, what exact dollar amount are you using to follow up on this zone... rezoned catchment enrollment and the diversity goals of the rezonings and that even

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 includes marketing materials to attract families to  
3 come to the schools that are under enrolled but  
4 provide a top quality education? Thank you so much.

5 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you Council  
6 Member Rosenthal. I want to thank you for being a, a  
7 strong voice as well in championing our equity  
8 conversations. I think sometimes are very difficult  
9 circumstances, but I appreciate your consistent  
10 voice. So, I'm going to go through the, the five  
11 questions and then I'm going to ask my colleague, our  
12 Chief Financial Officer Lindsey Oates to help me with  
13 some of them and some of them we may just need to  
14 come back to you because they're very specific  
15 questions. Sexual harassment has no place in the  
16 workplace or in the classroom period and I couldn't  
17 agree with you more that sunshine is the best remedy  
18 for those kinds of situations, you need to be open,  
19 you need to be transparent and people need to  
20 understand what it is and even when they think it may  
21 be unintended that they understand its perceived as  
22 intended and that's not okay. So, to that goal of  
23 making it a harassment free workplace, we've hired 11  
24 additional staff members specifically around not only  
25 investigating but also training and then having

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 continuous training. We have found that you can't do  
3 a one stop shop, you do it once a year then you check  
4 the list and then you're inoculated for the year, it  
5 has to be a consistent part of the workplace training  
6 but for our students as well as part of our anti  
7 bullying, as part of our safe and secure school  
8 environments, we've embedded that in everything that  
9 we do so that we're consistently talking about what  
10 that looks like. We're looking forward to reducing  
11 that number, but we understand that the very fact  
12 that people are coming forward also tells us that  
13 there is a growing feeling of being safe and  
14 supported when they come forward, but we have added  
15 11 staff members. Rule changes to title IX, we are  
16 ramping up on those rule changes and pushing back, I  
17 could not be more horrified at what I am hearing  
18 coming from Washington D.C. I think that I, I was  
19 saying when I first arrived in New York City that the  
20 silence from the Department of Education in  
21 Washington D.C. was deafening, I wish now it was  
22 still silent because what's coming from the  
23 Department of Education is horrific, the rollback of  
24 protections for students, LGBTQ students, the  
25 rollback of protections for students in terms of

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 disproportionality in suspensions, the, the lack of  
3 protections for students with disabilities, the list  
4 goes on and on and on. So, we are doing a number of  
5 things, most importantly we are a member of the  
6 council of the great city schools which is the 72  
7 largest urban districts in America, I sit on that  
8 executive committee and we are part of the board of  
9 directors and we as an organization are mobilizing  
10 all of our collective efforts around lobbying against  
11 those changes and then actually proposing  
12 countervailing legislation that could perhaps  
13 counteract some of the proposed changes. We are also  
14 on a local level again strengthening and looking at  
15 all of our policies that have to do with every single  
16 one of the, at least what's been rumored to be  
17 changes that are coming and those that have actually  
18 been put forward and then obviously working with our  
19 elected officials both local, state and federal  
20 around pushing back against those issues and then I  
21 would say that the, the sexual harassment training  
22 that we're doing is an opportunity as one of many  
23 opportunities to again lift up the notion of a safe  
24 supportive school environment for all of our students  
25 and employees in the workplace. So, there are a

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 number of things that we're doing, what I'm going to  
3 do is ask our staff to come back with you with an  
4 itemized list of things that we're doing and then  
5 perhaps identify where there's opportunities for the  
6 Council to actually work with us. The third question  
7 was around GEL and I'm going to ask our Chief  
8 Financial Officer Oates if she could talk a little  
9 bit about GEL or if you know it.

10 LINDSEY OATES: The Gender Equity

11 Liaison... [cross-talk]

12 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yeah... [cross-talk]

13 LINDSEY OATES: No.

14 RICHARD CARRANZA: Okay, so on GEL can we  
15 come back to you, I, I don't have that information.  
16 Thrive, this is one we can give you... [cross-talk]

17 LINDSEY OATES: Yes... [cross-talk]

18 RICHARD CARRANZA: ...a very specific  
19 breakdown so I'm going to ask Lindsey if she can give  
20 you the breakdown.

21 LINDSEY OATES: Yes, thank... [cross-talk]

22 [off mic dialogue]

23 RICHARD CARRANZA: Okay, we'll give you a  
24 quick one and then we'll send it over.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 LINDSEY OATES: Sure, so you are correct  
3 Council Member that the budget is approximately 30  
4 million dollars a year, the largest of that just to  
5 be quick is the community school mental health  
6 services program that is about 13 million dollars but  
7 we can get back to you with the specifics.

8 RICHARD CARRANZA: School diversity  
9 plans. So, as I've mentioned earlier in terms of  
10 equity and our focus on equity what we have attempted  
11 to do is to have some specific funding to some  
12 schools especially schools that are undergoing the  
13 transitions in the plans that we've approved so we've  
14 embedded those funds within the executive  
15 superintendents and superintendents to allocate  
16 specifically to school sites, we've also put forth a  
17 funding mechanism of two million dollars where  
18 schools can actually make proposals and that's more  
19 for the community engagement process that they go  
20 through for the diversity planning. As we look at the  
21 recommendations from the diversity advisory council  
22 part of our... part of our process is actually pricing  
23 out what would be required to make those  
24 recommendations real so there's a work in progress in  
25 terms of that particular subject area but one of the

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 things that I'm really proud of is that our  
3 superintendents have been working very closely with  
4 principals to identify what they need in terms of  
5 wrap around services, additional programming that  
6 could be in additional tutoring program or it could  
7 be an enrichment program, additional support services  
8 whether it's kind of specific counseling services or  
9 social services so we can also come back and, and  
10 kind of give you an amalgams of what that price tag  
11 is so far but we also see that this is important that  
12 when communities have taken these steps to diversify,  
13 to integrate, to really break down segregation you  
14 need to have a support system as well to help that  
15 become grounded in the way the school does the work.  
16 We absolutely agree with that and, and are, are being  
17 very, I think thoughtful about making sure schools  
18 have what they need.

19 [off mic dialogue]

20 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you, thank  
21 you so much Council Member, next we'll hear from  
22 Council Member Grodenchik.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you Mr.  
24 Chair. I was going to say good morning Chancellor but  
25 it's now good afternoon. I started my morning at

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 Martin Van Buren High School where we saw some new  
3 lab equipment that was donated by a new hall of  
4 famer, Marc Casper of Thermo Fisher who's a graduate  
5 of that school. I tagged you in the tweet so you can  
6 look at that later. I want to go back to some of what  
7 my colleagues Margaret Chin and Robert Cornegy talked  
8 about, I think you're absolutely right, you know  
9 people that feel that one group or another group  
10 cannot get into the schools for whatever reason that  
11 that is abhorrent and that's something that we all  
12 must condemn that kind of language. I am concerned  
13 because I represent far eastern Queens, a lot of the  
14 children that are going to Stuyvesant and Bronx  
15 Science and Brooklyn Tech live in my district and  
16 it's a long way, it is a really long way. I know I  
17 allow myself an hour and a half to get here from my  
18 house and there are people who live further out, and  
19 I know you don't run the MTA but it's not as good as  
20 it could be. So, I have been trying to rally support,  
21 the high school for sciences at York College has 412  
22 students, my friend Lorraine Grillo out there I think  
23 would like to build them a real building and it's  
24 something that I'd like to hear your thoughts on. We  
25 could easily put a school for 2,500 or 3,000 people



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 there, I will continue to push for this, all of the  
3 elected officials that represent that community have  
4 agreed to this, its not going to happen overnight I  
5 understand that. The kids that go to that school,  
6 it's one of the highest ranked schools in the  
7 country, there are basically on the second floor of a  
8 building in classrooms and I would love for you... I'd  
9 love for you to do it right now but I'd love for you  
10 to strongly consider adding your strong voice to  
11 this, it would also open up a great opportunity for  
12 all the children of Eastern Queens and to have  
13 another couple of thousand of seats at these  
14 selective high schools where these kids... I have a  
15 colleague, I don't want to name him, he got into  
16 Brooklyn Tech many years ago and his parents wouldn't  
17 let him go because of the... you know because of how  
18 long it took to get there and so I think we also need  
19 to think about spreading these schools out, we do  
20 have Townsend Harris High School at Queens College  
21 but it's not a science school. So, I'd like to hear  
22 your thoughts on that.

23 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, Council Member I  
24 just want to thank you very much first and foremost  
25 for... I have to tell you I feel like I am so connected

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 to your schools because you are the undisputed number  
3 one maybe in competition with Chair Treyger, tweeter  
4 of your visits to schools.. [cross-talk]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: You'll see  
6 another one today, I miss it, I undergo withdraw when  
7 I don't go to schools, there's nothing that is better  
8 except maybe being in a New York City park, I got to  
9 cover my Chairmanship there but there is nothing  
10 better than visiting the New York City schools and  
11 Council Member Cohen is absolutely right, we don't  
12 have bad schools, we have bad stories that happen and  
13 what I tell my civics 600 kids went to.. or 700 went  
14 to PS 115 today, they were fed twice, they learned,  
15 they socialized, they got exercise and they went home  
16 to their families, it's not a sexy story although it  
17 should be..

18 RICHARD CARRANZA: It should be..

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIIK: ...it's a  
20 blue-ribbon school, it's a great school, it's.. my  
21 schools are incredibly diverse but that's not sexy.  
22 If one kid falls and hurts himself or herself that's  
23 a story and that's... as Margaret Chin said we've got  
24 to start to change that dynamic but I know that Chair

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 Treyger's been very patient with all of us and I know  
3 Lorraine Grillo is waiting so... [cross-talk]

4 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yeah... [cross-talk]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: ...I would  
6 greatly appreciate you adding your strong voice, I'm  
7 going to continue to advocate for a real school on  
8 New York College campus. Many years ago my former  
9 boss Clair Shulman and former Congressman,  
10 Congressman Reverend Floyd Flake basically stole the  
11 FDA laboratory out from under Brooklyn and added it  
12 to the York College campus and that has been a god  
13 send to the children... or the young people that attend  
14 that school, it's a regional laboratory, imagine what  
15 we could do with a new high school there and cutting  
16 down those commuting times. With that you'll give me  
17 a yes, I know, just give me a wink. Okay, thank you.  
18 Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you Council  
20 Member and literally if... almost every Queens PTA  
21 breakfast I see a picture of Council Member  
22 Grodenchik... [cross-talk]

23 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yes... [cross-talk]

24  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...there so he, he,  
3 he is everywhere. Next, I'd like to call on Council  
4 Member Ulrich.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you Mr.  
6 Chair, I'm getting a little concerned Barry is even  
7 visiting schools in my district now, I don't know  
8 what's going on, but I know I'm term limited should I  
9 be worried, I don't know. There's nothing that says  
10 you can't run in a different district you just can't  
11 run in the same district. Anyway, all kidding aside I  
12 want to apologize for being late today Chancellor,  
13 but I did get a chance to review your testimony. I, I  
14 wanted to ask about the renewal program, I know it's  
15 sort of a touchy, I don't want to say controversial  
16 issue but it's definitely an issue that's gotten a  
17 lot of media attention and, and at one point in your  
18 testimony you mentioned that you've learned some  
19 valuable lessons from that program, 800 million  
20 dollars is a very expensive lesson to learn but what  
21 were some of the valuable lessons that you think the  
22 administration learned and that we will never repeat  
23 again obviously as a result of this experiment?

24 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, Council Member  
25 thank you so much for asking that question, if, if I

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 may. I don't think it's controversial, I, I don't... I  
3 for the life of me don't understand this notion that  
4 some folks have that had we not spent that money on  
5 these children in historically underserved  
6 communities with incredible challenges that somehow  
7 we would have saved that money and used it for  
8 something else, it's... it defies logic. Now when you  
9 look at the metrics graduation rates were above the  
10 graduation rates as compared to the rest of the city;  
11 I've already talked about the fact the city's  
12 graduation rates are increasing. We know that  
13 academics were accelerated faster in those renewal  
14 schools than as compared to the rest of the city and  
15 I've already talked about how we're surpassing the  
16 state of New York so I think there were a lot of good  
17 things that happened in the renewal program but  
18 people want the silver bullet, they want to know how  
19 do you add water and all of a sudden everything,  
20 decades of underinvestment, decades of  
21 underperformance automatically disappear but the  
22 things that we did learn about in the renewal schools  
23 was that it was number one, it was scientifically  
24 based so there's research that tells us if you pay  
25 attention to certain things in schools that you will

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 get better results in those schools. so, what are the  
3 things that we learned, we learned that principal  
4 leadership is critically important, some people would  
5 say duh, a principal is important but the right  
6 principal for the right circumstances with the right  
7 skill set critically important. What we learned in  
8 renewal is that in some cases we didn't change the  
9 leadership fast enough, we should have acted faster,  
10 that's a big lesson for us. The second thing that we  
11 learned was that educators, the teachers make a  
12 difference in the schools, duh, teachers make an, an  
13 important contribution, absolutely but it's not teach  
14 better, do more, it's how do we provide you with  
15 professional development, how do we provide you with  
16 a great leader that has a vision that is actually  
17 investing the resources that you have into helping  
18 you do your job better given who you have in front of  
19 you, very targeted professional development that's a  
20 huge lesson out of renewal. We also know that how...  
21 it's not just the academics it's also the  
22 socioemotional learning that happens in a school. So,  
23 if a school is not safe, if a school is not  
24 supportive, if there's not an environment where  
25 students feel respected and they see themselves in

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 the curriculum then students won't be engaged so  
3 investing and making sure that that was happening is  
4 a huge learning from the renewal program, it worked  
5 really well. Two more things very quickly, it's also  
6 important to understand that you cannot discount the  
7 role of the community and parents and we have  
8 Councilman refrained from talking about parent  
9 engagement. Parent engagement is a very low bar, we  
10 talk about parent empowerment and to empower a parent  
11 means that you bring parents to the table and you  
12 give them a voice in what's happening in the school  
13 but more than giving them a voice you also give them  
14 the information they need to advocate for their  
15 children. So, in the schools that had incredible or  
16 accelerated improvements in our renewal program where  
17 they had a great parent organization not everybody  
18 came to meetings, but they had information. For  
19 example, what should my child know and be able to do  
20 when they finish the fourth grade that prepares them  
21 for the fifth grade so that when parents then went to  
22 the parent teacher conferences it wasn't a  
23 conversation with the teacher about so, is Lindsey  
24 behaving in class? The conversation was, how is  
25 Lindsey doing in her nonfiction writing and can I see

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 samples of that nonfiction writing and is that on  
3 track to be successful for the next grade, specific  
4 information and the last part of this is our  
5 community schools approach which in general is how  
6 are we connecting schools with the resources and the  
7 community based organizations, the agencies out in  
8 the community so that as there are needs that were  
9 identified in these schools and remember our renewal  
10 schools none of the renewal schools were in what we  
11 would consider to be very affluent neighborhoods,  
12 they were all in communities that had real challenges  
13 so being able to connect communities and schools  
14 together so that the needs that are being identified  
15 are being addressed out in the community was another  
16 learning that we had with the, the renewal program.  
17 The final thing I'll say about this because I could  
18 spend all day and I don't want to do that, is that I  
19 think less.. being here less than a year I will say to  
20 you that I think what was happening with renewal was  
21 absolutely necessary. I would have considered it  
22 professional malpractice had the city not looked at,  
23 at the time the 92 schools that were in, in distress,  
24 the schools that were not performing well and done  
25 something to those schools and done something to



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 impact and interrupt and change what was happening in  
3 those schools, absolutely necessary but in the years  
4 since the creation of the renewal program we've  
5 evolved, we've learned some lessons but the biggest  
6 thing that I want to put out there is that I want  
7 people to think of the renewal program as a diet and  
8 when you have a need for a diet you need to do  
9 something right now, you need to eat better, you  
10 know... you need to know what to eat and you need to do  
11 an exercise program every single day, it's a diet but  
12 as you do that you then evolve into a lifestyle. So,  
13 the good habits that you develop in terms of what you  
14 eat, the good habits in terms of exercise that are  
15 getting you great results those become the way you do  
16 things. Renewal has transitioned into our  
17 comprehensive school support strategy which is taking  
18 all of the good things we learned from renewal and  
19 making it part of how we look at all of our schools  
20 and the reason I think that's so important is that as  
21 we look at these characteristics as these indicators  
22 in all of our schools we are now developing the  
23 ability to intervene in a just in time way so that  
24 schools don't get to a point where they are so far  
25 underperforming that you have to do that intensive

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 care approach. Lots to talk about, very complex issue  
3 but I really want to thank you for mentioning that  
4 and as the Chancellor I'm really excited about taking  
5 those lessons learned and making it part of our  
6 lifestyle in terms of how we support our schools in,  
7 in DOE.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you very much  
10 and just to quickly follow up on this, I... in my view  
11 the biggest problem with the renewal school program  
12 was the name renewal schools. The word renew means to  
13 almost resume or repeat. The original state of these  
14 schools were underfunded, in need of help in so many  
15 different areas and we shouldn't be resuming or  
16 repeating those systems and structures that led them  
17 to be struggling in the first place in communities  
18 predominately of color I, I would add as well and,  
19 and so we should... let's be clear I think as policy  
20 makers it is never a mistake to invest in public  
21 schools... [cross-talk]

22 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yes... [cross-talk]

23 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: It is never a  
24 mistake to give our public schools 100 percent of  
25 what they're owed which is a part of the renewal

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 school approach through FSF and through other types  
3 of support measures. It was... the, the branding, the  
4 names, the perception, the labeling of these schools  
5 that I had a... that had a profound negative impact on  
6 enrollment and still has an impact on those schools  
7 but I appreciate your, your answer to the question  
8 Mr. Chancellor.

9 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Next I'd like to  
11 call on Council Member Deutsch.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you, thank  
13 you Chair and good afternoon Chancellor. So, I would  
14 like to... I'd like to talk to you about... first of all  
15 nice haircut, it looks good.

16 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: I'd like to talk  
18 to you about DOE's emergency protocol and also the  
19 aftermath and the after effect of, of a potential  
20 threat to a school. On Wednesday evening on March 6<sup>th</sup>  
21 at about 11:30 p.m. I received a phone call from a  
22 parent who's child went on Instagram and there was an  
23 Instagram message of a potential threat and that  
24 threat stated can't wait for tomorrow Bay Academy  
25 kids watch out and it went... it went viral within the

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 school system and all the parents were talking about  
3 it and this was like I said 11:30 p.m. when I was  
4 notified and I immediately made notification that  
5 evening to NYPD counter terrorism unit, to Office of  
6 Emergency Management, the local precinct, the patrol  
7 borough, Brooklyn South of that and Southern Brooklyn  
8 also as well as the Mayor's... the Mayor's Office and  
9 the Speaker's Office. So, I received like... within two  
10 minutes I received a response from the Speaker's  
11 Office, they have an outstanding emergency response  
12 team, I made contact with OEM also as Commissioner  
13 Esposito they were amazing, they responded right away  
14 and the local precinct were... was notified and...  
15 because they have people working there 24 hours and I  
16 made a request to everyone that, that DOE should take  
17 ownership of this potential threat and communicate  
18 with the parents whether it's the middle of the night  
19 or in the morning and I have... and I asked for the  
20 DOE... I asked all these agencies to... I left a message  
21 to, to have DOE call me and also, I wanted them to  
22 take over the ownership because all the parents were  
23 contacting me literally... this was going on all night.  
24 So, after eight hours I sent out a tweet at DOE and  
25 then I get a phone call five minutes later from a

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 tweet and school began that next morning, 7:45 a.m.,  
3 parents held their children back from going from  
4 school, they haven't heard anything official, no  
5 official statement or communication from the  
6 Department of Education, Bay Academy principals were  
7 outstanding throughout the time but there was no  
8 official statement that came out from DOE because I  
9 guess their hands are tied because everything comes  
10 from, from above and I'm not talking about god,  
11 everything comes from DOE and a notification finally  
12 went out at nine a.m., a little after nine o'clock in  
13 the morning and that's more, more than an hour after  
14 school began so parents held their, their children  
15 from come.. from going to school. So, at a little  
16 after nine it was deemed that it wasn't a credible  
17 threat, they identified an 11-year-old child who sent  
18 out this, this Instagram message. So, my question is...  
19 oh, and then by the way the children were told that  
20 they will be marked absent for those who didn't  
21 attend so after speaking with DOE they said that  
22 we're going to give them excused absent. So, my first  
23 question is what is DOE's protocol, emergency  
24 protocol that when such an incident or any other  
25 incidents happens what is DOE's protocol on

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 communicating with parents, number? Number two, is  
3 that why are the children marked absent or even  
4 excused absent, there must be another way to do  
5 obviously you cannot say they were in school when  
6 they were not in school and no one is asking for DOE  
7 to do that but there must be another way to do it  
8 when there is a potential threat. Number three, is  
9 that even if it... even if they are marked excused  
10 absents what effect does that have on the child's  
11 high school admission or on someone that has a  
12 perfect attendance record on the attendance who wants  
13 to have that perfect attendance record?

14 RICHARD CARRANZA: Great so thank you for  
15 the question Council, Council Member Deutsch. So, to  
16 answer the... probably your second question first, so a  
17 student... if there is an incident at a school, a  
18 student should not be marked absent if there's a  
19 legitimate issue, we can follow up and figure out  
20 what exactly happened. In the narrative that you  
21 shared with me it's unclear if the, the, the threat  
22 on Instagram was directed to, to the school, were  
23 there parents that contacted you or did the school  
24 contact you, who knew about this threat and who was  
25 it reported to?

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: So, I... the... it was directed to, to children of Bay Academy... [cross-talk]

RICHARD CARRANZA: Okay... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: ...and it was seen on Instagram and I can't publicly say of... you know what... [cross-talk]

RICHARD CARRANZA: Sure... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: ...transpired but that, that 11-year-old child was identified... [cross-talk]

RICHARD CARRANZA: Sure... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: ...and DOE could get that information, so it was directed on the children of that school and, and they were all marked excused absent the next morning after having an argument with DOE... [cross-talk]

RICHARD CARRANZA: Sure... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: ...so your response is, is that they should not be marked absent so is that something that you could commit right now that they should not be even marked excused absent... [cross-talk]

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And, and I would encourage maybe could... this could be followed up offline because... [cross-talk]

RICHARD CARRANZA: Yeah... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...of issues of time and, and just try to get somebody... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Mr. Chair if I have permission just to get the response then?

RICHARD CARRANZA: There's too many circumstances here so we'll come back to you with what exactly happened. Look I've been a... I've been a high school principal, I've been a principal twice there are threats that are made believe it or not every single day, some are credible, some are not credible. In fact, some enterprising students will figure out that if I make a threat I send it through different people I can get school called off or maybe I can get the adults in a tizzy and I can cause a whole bunch of stuff and I'm never really going to mean to do it which is a crime by the way and you shouldn't do that but it becomes... it, it takes on it's own environment. So, we are very, very much aligned with what NYPD does and their protocols, as a principal sometimes I didn't even know what was being



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 put out there unless somebody brought it to my  
3 attention because I wasn't on Instagram or Facebook  
4 so there's a lot of questions, I'd love to set up  
5 some time to go through all the specifics with you.  
6 Did the principal know, when did the school know, I  
7 think the fact that it was sent and thank you for  
8 sending it to NYPD and sending it to OEM, making sure  
9 that the proper law enforcement officials were on it  
10 right away, I think that's critical. I will say the  
11 general rule as we have clarity about threats we try  
12 to communicate that to parents but I will tell you  
13 that the, the real challenge is that we are a very  
14 connected environment now so just as parents are  
15 emailing you and texting you students are doing the  
16 same thing and sometimes these kinds of events take  
17 on a whole life of their own while law enforcement  
18 and investigators are trying to get to the bottom of  
19 what's really going on, is it a credible threat, is  
20 it not a credible threat, where is it coming from so  
21 there's a lot of facets that I'd love to explore. As  
22 a general rule we want to communicate with parents as  
23 soon as we have some credible information hopefully  
24 before school starts, if we can't do that after  
25 school starts if we have some information that we

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 want to make sure parents know and the community  
3 knows we want to be able to communicate that as well  
4 and then the third thing is, is that if there are  
5 circumstances that are beyond student's and parent's  
6 control then I'm going to work with my colleagues to  
7 make sure that they're not penalized for those kinds  
8 of circumstances. So, that is what I am committing to  
9 you is to make sure that our policies are reflective  
10 of that.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSHC: Thank you

12 Chancellor, the office is well aware of... [cross-talk]

13 RICHARD CARRANZA: Okay... [cross-talk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: ...the incident  
15 that happened and... [cross-talk]

16 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Council Member...  
17 [cross-talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSHC: ...could we just  
19 have a... could we resolve this today; can I have a  
20 conversation today with your office?

21 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you, yeah, I  
22 mean you're welcome to talk to our folks, we want to...  
23 we want to figure this out.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Okay, thank you

25

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay, thank you  
3 Council Member and just to note this is one area of  
4 frustrations with the existing MOU, there's an  
5 unclear line of communication between NYPD and DOE,  
6 as of this moment with the existing MOU NYPD could  
7 enter schools no questions asked and arrest students  
8 for incidents that have nothing to do with the school  
9 and so there's no direct line of communication at, at  
10 times and I know this firsthand in my district when  
11 there was a shooting in Coney Island and my schools  
12 were not notified that there was a shooting nearby  
13 only to hear through me or through, through other  
14 channels so this is an area that we do need to make  
15 sure that we address, communication between NYPD and  
16 DOE hopefully with a very soon revised MOU as well.  
17 So, I want to next call upon Council Member  
18 Salamanca.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you  
20 Chair, good afternoon Chancellor. So, I have three  
21 minutes, I'm going to try to get to some of these  
22 questions and... very straightforward, you and I have  
23 had these conversations in the past, you are aware  
24 that I represent a very low income community, my  
25 schools in my district have been disinvested for, for

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 years if not decades, you know in some of my schools  
3 there's a lack of their fair share programs, there  
4 are other schools in other parts of the city may have  
5 that I may not have. I have certain schools in my  
6 district that may have one, one athletic program, you  
7 know whether it's a football or its baseball but  
8 that's it, you have other schools that have up to 14  
9 athletic programs. I have issues with my schools  
10 where there's a turnover of principals, there's  
11 issues with safety in the surrounding areas of the  
12 school, not particularly inside of the schools. One  
13 of my... one of my questions Chancellor is my district  
14 is ground zero for opioid use, my district and  
15 Council Member Diana Ayala's district. About a month  
16 and a half ago you visited a school in Diana's...  
17 Council Member Ayala's district, I was present and  
18 that day there was a hearing on having opioid... having  
19 Naloxone in the schools similar to a defibrillator  
20 should someone come into the school and they're  
21 overdosing or someone in the surrounding area  
22 overdoses, you know we can help save that life, has,  
23 has DOE, has your office taken a position on this?

24 RICHARD CARRANZA: Again we... I don't  
25 think we've taken an official position, I know that

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 the people that work in the schools as you know are  
3 represented so part of the conversation that we're  
4 having is with labor unions around who's the best  
5 person to be trained, how will they be trained and  
6 then how, how would that work...

7 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Commissioner  
8 this is a 30-minute training, everyone of my staff is  
9 trained on this, this is a very simple training, you  
10 know it's a spray so... I mean I really hope that these  
11 conversations... [cross-talk]

12 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yeah... [cross-talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: ...move along  
14 much quicker than they should because we're losing an  
15 opportunity to save a life. My, my other concern... my  
16 other issue that I have in my district and some of my  
17 colleagues that represent low income communities as  
18 well is homelessness, homelessness is a... is, is a  
19 real issue, you know children are the face of  
20 homeless... of homelessness in the city of New York.  
21 Last night 23,000 children slept in a homeless bed,  
22 you know six years or younger and, and so in my  
23 district I have a high level of homeless shelters and  
24 we also have a high level of what you call family  
25 transitional housing and, and these, these, these

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 children, these students are going to public schools  
3 in my council district and therefore, you know  
4 there's issues such as attendance, there's issues  
5 that that child may not know if they're going to go  
6 back to that same bed that they slept in that night  
7 and therefore there are many challenges that this  
8 child is going through throughout the day not... you  
9 know notwithstanding that they have to sit there and  
10 learn and so is your... is the Department of Education  
11 identifying which schools have a high volume or high  
12 population of children in transitional housing and is  
13 your agency providing that extra funding so that they  
14 can have extra social workers, counselors or whatever  
15 programs these children need so that they can  
16 succeed?

17 RICHARD CARRANZA: Absolutely, so we're,  
18 we're not only looking at where those concentrations  
19 are but we're working very closely with Commissioner  
20 Hansell for example, his agency and, and the DOE are  
21 working very closely around how are we providing wrap  
22 around services, if we can combine what they are  
23 doing with what we are doing and then wrap around  
24 those families that's critically important. We are  
25 seeing that in transportation, we're seeing that in

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 counseling services that get pushed into those  
3 homeless shelters. One of the big concerns that we  
4 have are the students that are not necessarily in  
5 shelters but are in somebody else's house, they're  
6 couch surfing as you know that's a big challenge for  
7 us as well. I would point to one specific example of  
8 how we're really trying to change the, the, the  
9 paradigm in our partnership. So, this summer we  
10 partnered, Commissioner Hansell and our agencies and  
11 we know that there are students that live in certain  
12 shelters but they go to school in areas that are far  
13 outside of where they live so what we did is we  
14 partnered and we're... it made sense because we know  
15 that some families have to live outside of where  
16 they've gone to school because of other reasons but  
17 where it made sense we combined our teams, we went  
18 and met with every single one of those families and  
19 we provided the ability for some of those families to  
20 actually move their shelter much closer to their  
21 school which in some cases eliminated, you know a  
22 long bus ride, in some cases it made it just walking  
23 down the street. We were able to get hundreds of  
24 families to make that move and we accommodated it so  
25 that we could increase the level of and the quality

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 of life for those children, that's but one example of  
3 how we're really honing in on this population and we  
4 agree with you, this is one of our most, I would say  
5 at risk populations so we're really trying to do  
6 everything we can to be thoughtful but strategic at  
7 partnering with other agencies and then the resources  
8 we have internally to serve those communities.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Alright, thank  
10 you, thank you Chancellor, thank you Mr. Chair.

11 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you Council  
12 Member and next we'll hear from Council Member  
13 Barron.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you Mr.  
15 Chair and thank you to the panel for coming. First I  
16 want to invite you to the press conference that I'm  
17 sponsoring tomorrow on the steps of City Hall at one  
18 p.m., we're going to be addressing the issue of only  
19 seven black students being admitted to Stuyvesant  
20 high school and we're going to be advancing support  
21 for the plan that says there needs to be multiple  
22 measures for admission to the specialized high school  
23 and we know that the American psychological  
24 association says that they have concluded that high  
25 stakes decisions were the major impact on a student's



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 educational opportunities such as admission to a  
3 specialized or gifted and talented program should not  
4 turn on the results of a single test so that's at one  
5 tomorrow. Secondly I want to thank you, progress is  
6 continuing on the new school, you had said that if  
7 you needed to get the bulldozer and come and run it  
8 yourself you would, that's not necessary, the new  
9 school is on schedule and should be completed by  
10 September 2021. I do want to talk briefly about a  
11 couple of issues. There's been a marked decline in  
12 the number of black faculty and the Governor noted  
13 that... it's an issue that I've raised with CUNY on an  
14 ongoing basis and the Governor now has an initiative  
15 where he will make sure that every SUNY college has  
16 an outreach for black faculty and a more diverse  
17 faculty. So, I would like to know what is the DOE  
18 doing to make sure that we increase black faculty and  
19 then secondly, concerning the AP classes that were  
20 held, how many students took the exam and do we have  
21 the results or the percentage of children who passed  
22 those AP classes, the exams that they took and what  
23 is the progress that we're making to close the gap  
24 between students who are graduating from DOE schools  
25 and who get to college and then not prepared for

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 college and they have to invest their time and their  
3 money in taking classes that will get them ready to  
4 be in the regular track and does every middle school  
5 and every high school have a state certified math and  
6 science teacher in the building? I know you have the  
7 Bronx plan where we're looking to make sure we bring  
8 in more teachers to address those areas of deficiency  
9 and perhaps a college access for all program will  
10 address part of that as well and finally, what  
11 special training will teachers of 3-K and 4-K and  
12 Pre-K have? It's not just that we're putting adults  
13 in front of children particularly early childhood,  
14 what... are we... are we making sure that they have the  
15 necessary classes in child development and an  
16 understanding of young children which is different  
17 from earlier on and, and middle school children so  
18 what particular training are those children... are  
19 those children going to have... are the teachers going  
20 to have for the children who are so young and so  
21 impressionable and an imprint can be made that can be  
22 damaging for years to come if a teacher is not  
23 adequately prepared?

24 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, that was a lot of  
25 questions.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I know you... I saw you taking notes, so I know you have them all.

RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you Council Member Barron. So, I, I want to say thank you for tomorrow's one o'clock, I'll have my folks check my availability... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you... [cross-talk]

RICHARD CARRANZA: ...it's an important topic and I want to thank you for your strong voice in, in, in this area. So, I'm going to get to some of these, I may have to come back to you with more specifics... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay... [cross-talk]

RICHARD CARRANZA: ...but in terms of black faculty, 71 percent of our students are black or Latino in the New York City public schools, I believe that the faculty, the leadership, everything that touches their lives in terms of students should reflect who we are as a community... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right... [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 RICHARD CARRANZA: ...in that regard we  
3 have made a concentrated effort before I ever arrived  
4 but definitely with my support to actually go out and  
5 recruit more candidates to become teachers in New  
6 York City's public schools. We have a program called  
7 One Hundred Black Men that we've continued to invest  
8 in, we've also... one of the very first conversations  
9 I've had with the new CUNY Chancellor is around this  
10 particular issue; how do we have more diversity in  
11 the teacher and teacher candidates that are coming to  
12 New York City's public schools so we are really  
13 working to engage our higher education partners as  
14 well. It can't be just DOE talking and working and  
15 strategizing on how to bring diverse candidates, we  
16 need help from our higher... institutions of higher  
17 learning as well. So, they are very committed to that  
18 and the new Chancellor is very committed to that.  
19 Thirdly, what I would say is that as I've been able  
20 to go around the city and look at some of our  
21 academies we have teaching academies in some of our  
22 schools and these are students that have as you know  
23 early on identified that they want to be teachers and  
24 what I was struck by as I visited these academies is  
25 that those students are diverse, they are diverse not

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 only in the ethnicity but they're diverse in gender.  
3 So, one of the things that I'm doing is paying  
4 attention to who those students are and very soon  
5 we'll get you some more information, I don't want to  
6 blow the surprise but I'm going to do something very  
7 special at every one of those academies to the  
8 graduating seniors that will paint the picture of  
9 what their job prospect is in the DOE as soon as they  
10 can bring me a teaching credential. Imagine that, a  
11 student before they even graduate from high school  
12 knowing I have a job... [cross-talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Uh-huh... [cross-  
14 talk]

15 RICHARD CARRANZA: ...right here in my  
16 community so we're excited about that and we're also  
17 partnering as part of our MBK work with the state  
18 around how are we creating the pipeline from  
19 historically black colleges specifically to bring  
20 those candidates here to New York City. A lot more to  
21 share but we'll get you some more specifics. In terms  
22 of AP exams, the number of students I'm going to have  
23 to get back to you, some of those exams are going to  
24 be as you know they start coming up in April and they  
25 start coming up in May but we can get you the data we

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 have so far and then we can actually do a little  
3 comparison for you of what's the trajectory been. The  
4 gap in readiness is another topic that the CUNY  
5 Chancellor and I have briefly talked about but that  
6 we also are talking about the next iteration of our  
7 working group. We can tell you that college readiness  
8 indicators for our students graduating from the DOE  
9 schools is increasing so we're seeing less necessity  
10 for students to, to have remedial studies as they go  
11 onto institutions of higher learning, we're seeing a  
12 slight uptick in the term... in terms of students  
13 staying in universities, in colleges. Again, we're  
14 going to give you some specific numbers about that  
15 and we'll break that down so that we have it by  
16 subgroup as well. You asked about state certified  
17 math and science teachers, I can tell you that in  
18 every one of our schools we have a state certified  
19 math and science teacher, the only exceptions are  
20 where we have had resignations or a vacancy that's  
21 been created and we've had to on a temporary basis  
22 fill with a substitute teacher. Even in those cases  
23 what we aim to do is to utilize individuals that are  
24 in the ATR pool and substitute teachers to do long  
25 term subbing in those particular classes, we can get

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 you those specific numbers as well. We also know that  
3 there are schools that are not part of the DOE that  
4 routinely don't use certified math and science  
5 teachers, you and I both know what those are but we  
6 also think that it's incredibly important to have  
7 certified teachers in, in those content areas and  
8 then finally, you asked about training for our early  
9 education... [cross-talk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes... [cross-talk]

11 RICHARD CARRANZA: ...teachers, 3-K and  
12 Pre-K. One of the things that I am most proud of is  
13 that we... when we talk about 3-K and Pre-K we talk  
14 about high quality 3-K and Pre-K and by high quality  
15 we mean that we engage in consistent professional  
16 development not only with those educators that are  
17 part of the Department of Education but those  
18 educators that are doing the work in 3-K and Pre-K  
19 centers, schools that are community based  
20 organizations, they participate in our professional  
21 development. I've been impressed with the fact that  
22 the professional development is age appropriate, I've  
23 also been impressed with the fact that it's not a  
24 drive by professional development where you have one  
25 time and you're done for the year... [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right... [cross-  
3 talk]

4 RICHARD CARRANZA: ...but its continuous  
5 and I have to give tremendous credit to Deputy  
6 Chancellor Wallack and his team, he's created an  
7 academic professional development team within the  
8 Department of Early Childhood Learning and again  
9 we're, we're now building a much more synergistic  
10 work plan with our K-3 colleagues so that there's a  
11 handoff, as those students exit the 3-K go to Pre-K,  
12 as they exit Pre-K now go into kindergarten there  
13 should be that transition that is smooth, students  
14 should feel just... it's the next step rather than it's  
15 a, a jarring experience and a different approach. So,  
16 we're very committed to that and continuing to do  
17 that kind of work, we'd be happy to come back and  
18 share with you what the, the plan is for that and  
19 what... even what one of those professional development  
20 calendars looks like so that you can have that with  
21 you.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you very  
23 much, thank you Mr. Chair.

24 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you Council  
25 Member and we just have two final members for



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 questions because we do need to hear from SCA, that's  
3 supposed to begin at 12:30, I'm trying to be very  
4 mindful of time so next we'll hear from Council  
5 Member Levine.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you so much  
7 Chair Treyger, its great to see you Mr. Chancellor. I  
8 want to call attention to... at a time when the, the  
9 city is rightly focusing on integration, long, long  
10 overdue conversation, must be an imperative for  
11 policy making and, and I solute you for shining a  
12 spotlight on this issue. I want to call attention to  
13 one strategy which has been quietly achieving  
14 integration in our schools but has gotten very, very  
15 little attention and that is dual language education,  
16 a policy I know that, that you believe in because  
17 we've spoken about that. These are classrooms all  
18 over the city that are mixing English language  
19 learners with other students in an emerging  
20 environment where they often spend half the day in  
21 English and half the day in a second language, it  
22 could be Spanish, it could be mandarin, it could be  
23 Greek or any other language on earth... [cross-talk]

24 RICHARD CARRANZA: Albanian...

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Albanian and

3 there's hundreds of these programs flourishing. My,

4 my sense is that the DOE leadership really views

5 these as primarily a strategy for ELLs which they are

6 and they're effective and integrative but they're

7 also a way to give the gift of multilingualism to

8 every child in the city with incredible benefits and

9 life; academic, career and opening up a world of

10 cultural opportunities for kids. It's the kind of

11 thing that rich families are providing for their kids

12 in schools like avenues where every child is in

13 either a mandarin or a Spanish language dual language

14 track, I want every child in the city whatever their

15 income to have that gift. There's a program in Harlem

16 that's starting next year at PS 242, it's a public

17 school in district five which has an Italian language

18 program, they have more applicants than they can

19 possibly serve, a diverse pool of applicants of, of

20 all racial and, and ethnic backgrounds. There's very

21 little additional money provided for these programs,

22 there doesn't appear to be a lot of infrastructure

23 support for these programs centrally, its required

24 generally activist parents to step in and organize

25 these programs who can bring a little extra resources

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 to the table and it's worked as.. in, in a number of  
3 communities but it's not a systemic approach and its  
4 still only touching a very small minority of kids.  
5 There's not money available for extra materials or  
6 extra staffing, there's not a systemic strategy to  
7 help solve the teacher shortage for dual language  
8 programs and I think there's a little bit of a hands  
9 off approach from, from Tweed in the case of programs  
10 where there's not a large ELL population such as  
11 Italian where there's very few recent immigrants but  
12 where there could be a great benefit so I said a lie,  
13 would love to turn it over to you Chancellor for your  
14 thoughts on how we can grow this program to achieve  
15 greater integration and give the gift of  
16 multilingualism to every child, please?

17 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you sir, in the  
18 spirit of dual language [Spanish dialogue]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: [Spanish  
20 dialogue]

21 RICHARD CARRANZA: [Spanish dialogue]  
22 See, I knew he was going to do that, I love that. So,  
23 I want to thank you, I think you're absolutely right,  
24 it makes sense in a city like New York City that we  
25 have just a tremendous respect and a value for the

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 multilingualism that exists in our city. I  
3 specifically mentioned Albanian because we created  
4 this year the first ever in the country Albanian dual  
5 language program right here in New York City, in fact  
6 we opened 43 new programs and bilingual programs in  
7 New York City to add to the portfolio of programs  
8 that we had. So, I appreciate you bringing this  
9 topic, so if I could share just a couple of data  
10 points with this particular topic, we value it. My  
11 experience... well let me start it this way, we  
12 actually do have a protocol that we utilize with any  
13 community that is interested in a dual language  
14 program and the protocol is very simply this, there  
15 has to be an interest and typically I will tell you  
16 one of the things that I love in New York City is  
17 that we have some entrepreneurial principals who come  
18 to us and will say hey, in my community there is an  
19 interest in this kind of a program, they'll come to  
20 us and part of what we provide to principals is we do  
21 a survey, is there an interest in the community for a  
22 dual language program whatever language that may be.  
23 If there is an interest is there sufficient interest  
24 so that we would be able to have a robust enrollment  
25 as these programs progress up the grade levels

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 because we start at one grade at a time. Now you  
3 bring up a very important point, there may be in some  
4 cases where you don't have a tremendous number of  
5 English language learner students like Italian for  
6 example, we found that case in the Albanian  
7 community, there were a number but in terms of raw  
8 numbers it wouldn't have necessarily meant the  
9 criteria in terms of a robust enrollment. We made a  
10 decision that it was critically important for the  
11 community so we should support it so there is an  
12 opportunity to be able to do that. The other parts of  
13 the, the protocol require is there room in the  
14 school, so is there a school identified that would  
15 house the dual language program so facility is an  
16 issue that we look at. Then there is the issue of the  
17 teacher, are there teachers that are fluent in both  
18 languages so that becomes the other issue. Once we  
19 have that we actually have a funding protocol, what  
20 would it take to start, we know what that would take  
21 to start and then we start working with the community  
22 and typically this is just generally speaking, it's  
23 anywhere from 18 months to two years after a  
24 community has said yep, we want to identify whether  
25 we, we can do this that you actually cut the ribbon

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 to that dual language program. So, we do have a  
3 process, we're going to get that to you so you know  
4 exactly what it is and if you're hearing people are  
5 doing something different other than following that  
6 process or are being told no right off the bat I'd  
7 appreciate you letting me know about that. The second  
8 thing has more to do with the, the philosophy and I  
9 am... I am a bilingually certified teacher, I taught  
10 for a decade in a bilingual classroom, so I  
11 definitely have my opinions about bilingualism and my  
12 experience has been this and I'm not saying this  
13 happens in New York City but in my experience, this  
14 is what happens with dual language. Dual language  
15 programs become the cache program that you're  
16 absolutely right, in some communities the community  
17 will view this as an ability not negatively, to have  
18 their children learn a different language in a  
19 public-school system and there's nothing wrong with  
20 that. We philosophically believe that a dual language  
21 program should be true to the philosophy of a dual  
22 language program, you have two languages that you're  
23 developing proficiency in and in the case of a  
24 Spanish dual language program, 50 percent of those  
25 students should be students that speak Spanish as the

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 first language who are working to continue to develop  
3 their Spanish language but are also developing  
4 proficiency in English, 50 percent should be English  
5 students... speaking students that are developing and  
6 continue to develop their, their proficiency in  
7 English but learning Spanish and at some point those  
8 students become bilingual, they become biliterate,  
9 they become bicultural and there you go, you're off  
10 and running that's what we want. We are very careful  
11 about those percentages because there have been in my  
12 experience situations where if you don't have  
13 sufficient numbers of students that are English  
14 language learners or you're not paying attention to  
15 making sure that English language learner students  
16 are developing proficiency in the target language  
17 which for them is English you will have this second  
18 language development program at the expense of  
19 English language learners. Now I'm not saying that's  
20 what's happening in New York but I have been very  
21 clear in my direction to our multilingual department  
22 that we will not allow our language programs to  
23 become enclaves of learning a second language at the  
24 expense of not developing the skill set of English  
25 language learners. So, there's been a little bit of a

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 kerfuffle out in the neighborhoods because I've  
3 really made that clear but it's something that we  
4 believe in wholeheartedly. With that being said we  
5 continue to invest in the programs because we believe  
6 just as you believe if we have a community that has  
7 historically not had the kind of robust programing  
8 that we want we're going to actually prioritize  
9 looking at why not have a dual language program or a  
10 different kind of program that will see value in  
11 other communities and they will say we will come into  
12 that community because we want that programming  
13 rather than what traditionally is talked about in, in  
14 a desegregation model is you take the black and brown  
15 kids and send them to another neighborhood, right, we  
16 want to create neighborhoods where people come into  
17 those historically neighborhoods of color and see  
18 hey, this is a great place to be, a great place to  
19 learn and we get some really incredible robust  
20 programming as well. I think we're totally on the  
21 same page with that and again I want to thank you for  
22 being a real champion for that.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: [Spanish  
24 dialogue]

25 RICHARD CARRANZA: [Spanish dialogue]



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you very  
3 much. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

4 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: [Spanish dialogue],  
5 you got it. Don't forget Russian Mr. Chancellor.

6 RICHARD CARRANZA: I'm, I'm trying to  
7 learn.

8 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay. Next Council  
9 Member Levin. The final member for...

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very  
11 much Chair, thank you Chancellor, I appreciate... I  
12 appreciate you staying and, and answering all of our  
13 questions. A couple of things I'm... I want to raise  
14 concerns about. I know that my colleagues and the  
15 Chair had mentioned bridging the gap social workers.  
16 That has to be restored in the executive budget  
17 because and it should be baselined and it should be  
18 increased obviously to, to 100 social workers across  
19 the city. This is... they have to be able to plan for  
20 after July 1<sup>st</sup> and for people who are MSWs to not  
21 know whether they have a job in three months is  
22 really unacceptable so that has to... you know its...  
23 this is in the big picture of the DOE budget this is  
24 not something that is going to make or break the  
25 DOE's budget, it's a commitment that... I mean frankly

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 we have... we have 23,000 children in shelter... [cross-  
3 talk]

4 RICHARD CARRANZA: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...as you know  
6 McKinney Vento definition of homeless is much higher...  
7 [cross-talk]

8 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yeah... [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...and, and that's  
10 not changing any time soon because we have, you know  
11 a structural affordable housing crisis in this city  
12 that, that is going to perpetuate for a long time in  
13 the future and despite all of this administration's  
14 efforts and this Council's efforts we've, we've... this  
15 is... we still haven't driven down the, the, the  
16 shelter population to anything that's even close to  
17 really, you know manageable and so this is the very  
18 least that we could do and it ought to be... it ought  
19 to be restored in the executive budget.

20 RICHARD CARRANZA: So, Council Member  
21 Levin I want to thank you. As I've... I mentioned  
22 earlier I do not disagree with you, I think whatever  
23 we can do to build supports for our students in  
24 temporary house... temporary housing which we knew... we  
25 know by every indicator are some of our most fragile

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 students in our school systems we need to do. I will  
3 tell you that in my conversations with the Mayor this  
4 is an area that is very, very important to him as  
5 well. So, I just... you know the preliminary budget  
6 being one thing, the eventual executive budget being  
7 another thing, I want to reiterate that we absolutely  
8 share your sense of urgency.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay because  
10 actually, you know just to, to highlight children  
11 that reside in a tier two shelter they have access to  
12 social workers through Thrive, those that are  
13 residing in a hotel which have less services don't  
14 have access to social workers through Thrive so if  
15 they're lucky they have access to a bridge in the gap  
16 social worker at school so it's absolutely essential.  
17 I'm... I want to raise the issue around a regulation  
18 change that is in... a potential Chancellor's reg  
19 proposed around bussing for children in shelter and  
20 the Mayor has made a commitment several years ago  
21 that every child that's in shelter will have access  
22 to a bus route... you know bus route or bussing to  
23 their... to their school to maintain consistency in  
24 their education but the proposed reg changes some  
25 language to... and I'll just read the, the, the line in

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 question, yellow bus transportation will be provided  
3 to homeless students in grades K through six whenever  
4 an appropriate route exists to provide such bus  
5 service, that's new language... [cross-talk]

6 RICHARD CARRANZA: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...and its  
8 concerning because the commitment is that every child  
9 have access to a... to a... yellow bus transportation  
10 not, not just where a route exists because children  
11 and families could be placed very far away from their  
12 home school where their safety nets are, where their  
13 support systems are, teachers that love them and  
14 administrators and social workers and guidance  
15 counselors and, and so that's a very big concern.

16 RICHARD CARRANZA: Sure, so thank you for  
17 bringing that up. So, the... philosophically and I  
18 would say morally absolutely on the same page, every  
19 student should have a guaranteed way of getting to  
20 school regardless of where they are, regardless of  
21 what shelter they're in. The language that we're  
22 proposing to change is very restrictive and let me  
23 give you an example and I'm... again I'm not saying  
24 that this is done in stone but it is going to require  
25 us to be... and, and I think it should require us to be

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 much more synergistic with other agencies that we  
3 work for. So, for example, this is just an example,  
4 what if it was possible that if we had a group of  
5 students in one particular area instead of a yellow  
6 bus we were able to have a fleet of passenger vans  
7 and we are working with an agency that could agree  
8 that for much less than a yellow bus we could  
9 actually transport those children every single day,  
10 get them to school at a much less cost. That could be  
11 game changing and if we could do that with another  
12 agency and partner with another agency it gives us  
13 flexibility. So, again I, I know what the.. and, and  
14 I've heard from our advocacy community and, and  
15 rightfully so we're in the process of responding to  
16 our advocates but what we want to be able to do is  
17 have the flexibility in regulation and policy that is  
18 commensurate with what our intent is morally to make  
19 sure that these children have a way of getting to  
20 school but give us the flexibility to figure out  
21 innovative ways of making that happen aside from  
22 putting them on the subway or anything because we  
23 don't think that's a good, good thing to, to.. [cross-  
24 talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Not a fifth  
3 grader...

4 RICHARD CARRANZA: Not a fifth grader, I  
5 agree. So, we want to just have flexibility and we're  
6 actually actively looking at what are those kinds of  
7 opportunities to be out of the box.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, I'm open to  
9 a discussion around that, but I think that... I think  
10 its important that we reiterate our commitment that  
11 every child residing in temporary housing, all 23,000  
12 children that are in shelter have the opportunity to  
13 go to their home school with, with transportation  
14 provided by the Department of Education and not  
15 getting on the subway.

16 RICHARD CARRANZA: Right.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you.

18 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you Council  
20 Member and just... I have... very quick two questions and  
21 then, then we're done to hear from SCA next. Mr.  
22 Chancellor how do you explain why DOE's budget is  
23 underfunded by hundreds of millions of dollars for  
24 critical school supports like pupil transportation in  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 school facilities as well as for the cost of carter  
3 cases?

4 RICHARD CARRANZA: I'm going to ask our  
5 Chief Financial Officer to give the technical  
6 response.

7 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Alright.

8 LINDSEY OATES: Thank you Chair, so, you  
9 know as we've discussed before and as the Chancellor  
10 has mentioned this is the preliminary budget all of  
11 those program areas that you mentioned are ones that  
12 we track the spending on very closely and we are  
13 working with our partners in City Hall and at OMB and  
14 I think there's more to come.

15 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: This has been... see  
16 I'm very happy Chair Dromm is with me here because he  
17 has had to sit through this as well with his hearing  
18 with OMB. Again, respectfully CFO... Miss Oates we are  
19 a co-equal branch of government, this is not how the  
20 budget process is supposed to work, we have to know  
21 the numbers now, it's not, you know a game of peek a  
22 boo when you guys feel it's okay to, to show us. This  
23 is really not acceptable and, and so I... but I, I do  
24 want to point this out for example because my follow  
25 up question is that last year in terms of actual

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 spending the DOE spent 463 million dollars on carter  
3 cases. Does DOE track the reason for carter cases and  
4 if so, can you provide this information?

5 LINDSEY OATES: We can provide that in as  
6 a follow up, yes.

7 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Is it possible to  
8 identify the, the common reason students can't be  
9 educated in the public-school system and target  
10 resources to expand DOE's ability to support these  
11 types of students?

12 RICHARD CARRANZA: What, what I will say  
13 is we're actually... that is actually the work that  
14 we're doing right now to identify what are the  
15 programmatic needs that are not being provided to  
16 parents where they feel the need to go outside of the  
17 DOE so that is part of the analysis we've done and  
18 we're actually working to see how we fund that. The  
19 other part of it is that as you look at parents and  
20 students that seek services outside of the DOE there  
21 are a myriad of reasons why they would seek services  
22 outside of the DOE not necessarily only because they  
23 don't either like the program that's in the DOE or  
24 they feel that it meets the needs of their, their  
25 students. We are working with parents to get that



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 information and be very clear about what that is as  
3 well. Part of the analysis that we're doing is what  
4 would it take to create programs so that we could  
5 start to bring students back but all of that work is  
6 very intensive work around projections and we do that  
7 in a budget... in a budget environment that is very  
8 austere or proports to be very austere, it becomes  
9 difficult to give you the specificity that you're  
10 looking at and I want to be really clear we're not  
11 trying to be obfuscating here, we're not trying to be  
12 not clear, we're really trying to dig into what we  
13 need, what we want and what we can do within an  
14 austere environment that makes it difficult to do  
15 some of that projection as well.

16 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: But I... Mr.

17 Chancellor I appreciate your answer to this I just  
18 want to flag that my issue with carter cases in  
19 addition to the rising cost of them is that not all  
20 parents are even aware of this right, many parents  
21 even have no idea that they have a right to these  
22 services. Number two, the way the system is currently  
23 structured it really favors those with a lot more  
24 money and resources because you have to shell out the  
25 tuition first and then wait for the government to

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 reimburse you and so many working families who live  
3 check to check can't afford to simply just shell out  
4 these critical resources and then wait for government  
5 to reimburse them after we hear testimony at a recent  
6 hearing where people have not been reimbursed for  
7 quite some time. So, the whole system is really  
8 problematic and I think in the long run the city will  
9 save money and provide better service if we could in-  
10 house these services to find the common areas where  
11 we have to contract out, provide those services in-  
12 house, build schools... I... Borough President Oddo from  
13 Staten Island worked to build I think a school to  
14 serve children with dyslexia, that might be an area  
15 that we're falling short on in our school system,  
16 why... I'm sure President Grillo is in the... is in the  
17 audience we... Mr. Chancellor you, you are on the  
18 school system with the Mayor, we have the power to  
19 create those schools too but the school that was  
20 created was a charter school if I'm not mistaken. So,  
21 I think that we have the power to in-house these  
22 critical service education areas so... no, the final...  
23 the final question Mr. Chancellor, what new needs did  
24 DOE request that are not funded in the fiscal 2020  
25 prelim budget? For example, Mr. Chancellor I was at a

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 recent Town Hall with you in district 20 where you  
3 had mentioned that you would like to see some more  
4 additional school psychologists, which I appreciated  
5 that, that answer, what... so, what new needs are the  
6 DOE requesting that are not funded in the prelim  
7 budget, can you share with us what your conversations  
8 have been like with the OMB?

9 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yes, so what I can do  
10 is give you some ideas and then we can follow up with  
11 more specificity.. [cross-talk]

12 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Sure.. [cross-talk]

13 RICHARD CARRANZA: ...but there is.. and,  
14 and this, this dovetails with your previous question,  
15 I as a Chancellor am not satisfied with how we  
16 provide services to students with disabilities, I've  
17 been very clear about that. I think that in order to  
18 provide an enlightened approach there's a number of  
19 things that have to change and the good news.. the bad  
20 news is, is that there are number of things that have  
21 to change, the good news is we are taking a systemic  
22 approach where it's not special education's  
23 responsibility to meet the needs of students with  
24 disabilities, its every single division and  
25 department in our systems responsibility to meet the

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 needs of students with disabilities, multilingual  
3 learners, etcetera. So, under, under this  
4 administration, this DOE administration we are being  
5 very focused on taking that systemic approach, I  
6 think you're going to see some, some exciting things  
7 that are happening. With that being said there is a  
8 need for more school psychologists, we know that  
9 there's a backlog in terms of when parents request  
10 evaluations and then the timeliness of those  
11 evaluations, that is strictly a man hour, how many  
12 people do you have to be able to be able to do those  
13 evaluations kind of an issue. There are the... I spoke  
14 earlier about lessons learned from the renewal  
15 program, I'm going to stop referring to the renewal  
16 program that's just the diet but the lessons learned,  
17 the, the good habits, the effective strategies that  
18 we are now trying to take as a lifestyle across all  
19 of our schools requires us to have some investments.  
20 We, we are in the process of that conversation, what  
21 do those investments look like? We are also in  
22 conversations around restorative practices and  
23 implicit bias. Again, I've been very vocal about the  
24 fact that we need to rollout implicit bias in a much  
25 more aggressive way, that takes funding, we're in the

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 process of having those conversations around what  
3 would that take. You yourself have mentioned the, the  
4 social workers and the counselors, we are in  
5 conversations about that. So, there are a number of  
6 things that there is not a lack of will to provide, I  
7 think right now it's a matter of what are the  
8 resources, how do we use those resources and then  
9 quite frankly I'm going to say this, as the  
10 Chancellor of the DOE part of my job has been to  
11 literally open the hood of this beautiful vehicle we  
12 call the DOE and take a look inside and in taking a  
13 look inside there are a number I think of  
14 opportunities that we have to sunset some programs  
15 and strategies, to reorganize what we've done, to  
16 really refocus some of our internal resources and we  
17 don't have a lot to be able to repurpose, most of our  
18 resources are in schools but whatever we do we want  
19 to make sure that we have efficacy and return on  
20 investment so I have a responsibility I feel to  
21 engage in those conversations about funding  
22 priorities while connotatively having a conversation  
23 about... and this is what my skin in the game is, this  
24 is what I'm reorganizing, this is what I'm not doing  
25 any more, this is why I'm not going to invest in this

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 and this is how I'm going to repurpose some of those  
3 dollars as well, so we are actively in that process  
4 right now but that gives you a little bit of a window  
5 the kinds of conversations we're having.

6 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And I, I appreciate  
7 that Mr. Chancellor and just in wrapping up is that...  
8 the reason why this is an area that's very personal  
9 as a former teacher its very dear to me and I'm sure  
10 for you as well, is that when... with, with regards to  
11 special education services regardless of what  
12 administration is in place, regardless of what  
13 Chancellor is in place these are mandates, these are...  
14 these are things that we have to adhere to regardless  
15 of someone's new bold plans or ambitious ideas we  
16 have to do this and the fact is in our city we're not  
17 meeting all those mandates, that's just not... that's  
18 not negotiable, we have to and so when I... in previous  
19 hearings when I heard that there will be pilots to  
20 translate IEPs that's also not acceptable because  
21 that's... federal law requires us to translate them  
22 when parents request them... [cross-talk]

23 RICHARD CARRANZA: Yeah... [cross-talk]

24 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...and, and so I, I  
25 just... I just want to... want to flag that and I... and I

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 appreciate that we did have a follow up meeting after  
3 that hearing and we gave you a lot of... a lot of stuff  
4 to review and, and... but you have been very accessible  
5 to us whenever we, we raise concerns and again I'm  
6 being mindful of time, I... because we expect to hear  
7 from now President Grillo. I thank you for coming,  
8 coming here Chancellor and also to Miss Oates and  
9 hopefully we'll see you back here shortly with some  
10 more transparency and information and resources  
11 restored for our... for our, our students, thank you  
12 very much... [cross-talk]

13 RICHARD CARRANZA: Thank you Mr.

14 Chairman... [cross-talk]

15 LINDSEY OATES: Thank you... [cross-talk]

16 RICHARD CARRANZA: ...thank you all.

17 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you.

18 RICHARD CARRANZA: Good to see you.

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Just for the  
20 audience, we're taking a quick five-minute recess and  
21 then we're going to hear from SCA next. Okay, good  
22 afternoon and welcome to the City Council Education  
23 Committee hearing on fiscal 2020 preliminary ten-year  
24 capital strategy, capital budget and capital  
25 commitment plan for the Department of Education.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 today's hearing is focused on the 17 billion dollar  
3 proposed DOE fiscal 2020 to 2024 five-year capital  
4 plan. The Committee on Education, the Committee on  
5 Finance and Subcommittee on the Capital Budget held a  
6 hearing in December on the November 2018 proposed DOE  
7 capital plan. We expressed serious concerns with the  
8 plan as proposed and hope to see at least some of  
9 those... these concerns addressed in the February  
10 proposed plan. I am displeased to share that very  
11 little has changed between the November proposed plan  
12 and the February proposed plan. Today I hope to  
13 continue the discussion of the Council's vision for  
14 the DOE's five-year capital plan and hear why the  
15 Council's suggestions and feedback were not taken  
16 more seriously. In October right before the November  
17 proposed fiscal 2020 to 24 capital plan was released  
18 the Speaker and Chair's Dromm, Gibson and I sent a  
19 letter to the Mayor, Chancellor and President Grillo  
20 outlining the Council's vision for the new five-year  
21 capital plan. We expected to see a significant  
22 investment in capacity given the unfunded seat need  
23 in the current fiscal 2015 to 2019 capital plan that  
24 the Mayor had committed to funding. We also hope to  
25 see key recommendations of the Council's March i2018



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 report on school planning and siting, planning to  
3 learn implemented. On capacity the proposed plan  
4 moves us backward not forward. Like the November  
5 proposal, the February 2019 proposed plan does not  
6 include identified seat need which was the focus of  
7 many of the Council's recommendations in planning to  
8 learn. The proposed plan funds approximately 57,000 K  
9 to 12 seats, the unfunded seat need identified in the  
10 current plan. However, where these seats are funded  
11 has shifted dramatically. For example, the proposed  
12 plan funds 2,630 less seats than we expected, this is  
13 especially difficult to comprehend given the  
14 Council's understanding that identified seat need is  
15 the need as of the final year of the plan. How is it  
16 that two years ago the SCA estimated a need of over  
17 10,000 seats in district 20 by this year, 2019 but  
18 now they will only be building 7,692 seats by 2024.  
19 In addition, by funding only the 57,000 seats  
20 identified seats identified as needed in the current  
21 plan, the proposed plan asks the Council to accept  
22 that there is no additional seat need when projecting  
23 out to 2024 compared to the current plan's projection  
24 which were through 2019. I find this impossible to  
25 believe and completely contradicts the statements

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 that the Mayor has made publicly to us as members and  
3 to the public that we have a growing city with  
4 growing needs. Similarly, the ten-year capital  
5 strategy includes no funding for new schools in  
6 fiscal year 2025 to 2029. The ten-year capital  
7 strategy is a critical planning document that in its  
8 own words anticipates neighborhood needs of tomorrow.  
9 No funding for new schools in the last five years of  
10 this ten-year capital strategy does not reflect  
11 holistic long-term capital planning. Another key  
12 capacity related recommendation from planning to  
13 learn was improving the transparency of the process  
14 for funding Pre-K seats including seats for three-  
15 year olds. The Council has no idea how DOE and SCA  
16 determine Pre-K seat need and prioritize funding for  
17 those seats. In the years since we published planning  
18 to learn, all we have received is vague statements  
19 regarding examining the demand for Pre-K seats as  
20 measured by applications and a reminder that Pre-K  
21 seats are different than K to 12 seats because some  
22 are provided by CBOs. We are well aware of this  
23 difference and it is explicitly acknowledged in the  
24 planning to learn report that does not preclude our  
25 need to understand in detail how the DOE is

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 identifying Pre-K seat need. The issue has become  
3 particularly concerning as we hear reports that some  
4 of the DOE Pre-K centers, we spend tens of millions  
5 of dollars building are underutilized or siphoning  
6 away students from CBO providers. At the same time,  
7 we're cramming Pre-K classrooms into elementary  
8 school buildings that are critically overcrowded. As  
9 the city moves forward with expanding 3-K we cannot  
10 afford to make mistakes spending millions on, on  
11 seats where they are not needed while leaving some  
12 communities without enough. How can the DOE and SCA  
13 seriously ask us to approve a five-year capital plan  
14 with 8.8 billion dollars for capacity project when  
15 there is no identified K to 12 seat need and we have  
16 no understanding of how Pre-K seat need is identified  
17 and funded. In addition to concerns regarding  
18 capacity funding, the letter outlining the Council's  
19 vision for the five-year plan asked for a re-  
20 imagining of how we fund essential school components  
21 such as bathroom upgrades, technology, physical  
22 education space and other specialized instruction  
23 spaces. Historically the plan has allocated an  
24 arbitrary amount of funding to these program areas  
25 and simply funded as many projects as possible

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 without clear goals or an assessment of overall need.

3 We hope to continue to work with DOE and SCA to

4 improve the process for funding essential school

5 components. One subject we did not discuss in detail

6 at our December hearing is technology. As if have

7 said many times before, our public schools have

8 severely outdated technology infrastructure, let me

9 repeat that, in the year 2019, in the 21<sup>st</sup> century in

10 the largest school system in the country, our public

11 schools have severely outdated technology

12 infrastructure. Adequate band width and state of the

13 art classroom technology should not be reserved for

14 the few schools that can afford their own networks

15 and are successful in advocating for discretionary

16 capital funding from elected officials. All New York

17 City students should have working internet in school

18 and access to the tools they will be expected to use

19 in college and their careers. Today I hope to hear

20 more from DOE and SCA on how proposed capital plan

21 investments will equitably support a 21<sup>st</sup> century

22 learning environment that prepares students for 21<sup>st</sup>

23 century jobs. Some housekeeping, I'd like to remind

24 Council Members that the... that this is the capital

25 hearing so please keep your questions related to the

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 capital budget, Council Members will be limited to  
3 three minutes for their first round of questions and  
4 two minutes for the second round if necessary. Public  
5 testimony on the education budget will be begin soon  
6 after, right... immediately after we hear from the  
7 members because we want to be timely, people have  
8 been very patient waiting and we want to hear from  
9 them. If you are here to testify please fill out a  
10 witness slip with the Sergeant at Arms. I'd now like  
11 to introduce my colleagues who have joined us; we've  
12 been joined by Council Member Grodenchik, Council  
13 Member Levin and Council Member Dromm. I'd like to  
14 thank Lorraine Grillo, President and CEO at the  
15 School Construction Authority and Karin Goldmark,  
16 Deputy Chancellor at the Department of Education for  
17 coming to testify before the Committee today and  
18 we'll hear the testimony after the Counsel swears  
19 them in.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: If you could raise your  
21 right hand and do you swear to tell the truth, the  
22 whole truth and nothing but the truth before this  
23 Committee and to respond to... honestly to Council  
24 Member questions?

25 [panel affirms]

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

3 LORRAINE GRILLO: Good afternoon Chair

4 Treyger as well as members of the Education

5 Committee. My name is Lorraine Grillo and I am

6 President and CEO of the New York City School

7 Construction Authority. I'm joined today by Karin

8 Goldmark, Deputy Chancellor of the Division of School

9 Planning and Development at the New York City

10 Department of Education. We are pleased to be here

11 today to discuss the February 2019 proposed fiscal

12 year 2020 to 2024 five-year capital plan, the largest

13 ever proposed plan. Since the last time we appeared

14 before the City Council in December 2018 to discuss

15 the proposed plan, we have authorized five new

16 projects that will create 2,650 new seats for our

17 students. We are planning to authorize another five

18 projects with over 2,500 seats serving students at

19 the elementary and middle school levels in the coming

20 months and we are continuing to move forward

21 aggressively. Including sites that are ready to move

22 forward, nearly 45,000 seats will be completed or in

23 process by the end of this fiscal year. This builds

24 on last year's work including the eight new capacity

25 projects with 4,016 new seats and seven new early

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 childhood centers serving 732 of our youngest  
3 students, all of which opened in September of 2018.  
4 For this upcoming school year, we will be opening six  
5 new capacity sites with 2,630 new seats as well as  
6 ten new early childhood centers serving 1,242 new 3-K  
7 and Pre-K students. This is a tremendous level of  
8 success. But I would be remiss if I did not  
9 acknowledge that we are successful because of the  
10 partnerships we have across the city and that  
11 includes with the City Council. We are deeply  
12 appreciative of your strong support and generous  
13 funding for our schools. We are all working towards  
14 the same goals and working to ensure our children  
15 have the best environment to learn in. The February  
16 proposed 20/24 five-year capital plan represents the  
17 administration's continued commitment to equity and  
18 excellence for all students and builds on the  
19 foundation that we developed with the current 2015 to  
20 2019 capital plan. Here are the highlights of our  
21 proposed plan: 7.88 billion dollars for nearly 57 new  
22 seats in fulfillment of the Mayor's commitment to  
23 reduce overcrowding; 750 million dollars to make 50  
24 percent of elementary school buildings partially or  
25 fully accessible and one third of all buildings fully

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 accessible; 284 million dollars for electrical work  
3 to support air conditioning in all classrooms by  
4 2021, which advances the program by one year; 550  
5 million dollars in support of 3-K and Pre-K for all  
6 initiatives and 750 million dollars for technology  
7 enhancements. As with our current capital plan, the  
8 proposed plan has funding allocated in three  
9 overarching categories: our capacity program,  
10 totaling 8.8 billion dollars; the capital investments  
11 category with 5.2 billion dollars allocated for work  
12 in our existing buildings and finally our mandated  
13 programs the three billion dollars in funding. The  
14 proposed 20/24 capital plan includes 8.8 billion  
15 dollars for capacity. Our capacity program consists  
16 of four categories: new capacity, 3-K and Pre-K early  
17 education, class size reduction and capacity to  
18 remove transportable classroom units or TCUs. Of the  
19 8.8 billion dollars allocated to capacity, 7.8  
20 billion is dedicated to creating nearly 57,000 new  
21 seats through an estimated 89 projects within school  
22 districts experiencing the most critical and existing  
23 and projected overcrowding. That includes just over  
24 8,000 seats which will be dedicated to addressing  
25 overcrowding at the high school level in Queens.



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 Included in our capacity program is 550 million for  
3 the city's 3-K and Pre-K for All initiative. In  
4 addition, 150 million dollars has been allocated to  
5 the class size reduction program. Additionally, 180  
6 million dollars is allocated for capacity to remove  
7 TCUs, a new program that is part of our effort to  
8 remove the remaining TCUs across the city. This  
9 program recognizes the need for targeted investments  
10 in areas of the city where additional capacity is the  
11 only solution available in order to facilitate the  
12 removal of TCUs not yet slated for removal. The  
13 proposed plan directs a total of 5.2 billion dollars  
14 for capital investments. Our proposed plan includes  
15 2.76 billion dollars dedicated to the capital  
16 improvement program. Within this category, we are  
17 funding 2.61 billion in work to address the buildings  
18 identified in our annual building survey as most in  
19 need of repairs, including work such as roof and  
20 structural repairs and safeguarding our buildings  
21 against water infiltration. The capital investment  
22 category also includes funding for athletic field  
23 upgrades and additional resources for the removal of  
24 TCUs. We will continue to make progress on the  
25 removal of TCUs through this capital plan. To date,

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 we've removed 2015 TCUs and developed plans to remove  
3 58 more leaving a balance of 91. A major focus of our  
4 capital improvement program is in our 2.42-billion-  
5 dollar school enhancement category and our work to  
6 improve school accessibility and investments in our  
7 school-based technology infrastructure needs. In  
8 addition to these two major priorities, which Deputy,  
9 Deputy Chancellor Goldmark will discuss in her  
10 testimony, we are allocating 284 million dollars in  
11 additional funding in this plan to the Mayor's Air  
12 Conditioning for All initiative, ensuring that all  
13 classrooms will have air conditioning in 2021 so that  
14 students are learning in a comfortable classroom one  
15 year earlier. The funding will not only ensure  
16 sufficient electrical capacity for the air  
17 conditioning units but will ensure that school needs  
18 are being met and there is sufficient remaining  
19 capacity, electrical capacity for other uses.  
20 Finally, the proposed plan also includes significant  
21 investments in lab upgrades, cafeteria, kitchens and  
22 other projects. In the mandated programs capacity,  
23 with three billion dollars allocate, allocated,  
24 includes approximately 650 million dollars for boiler  
25 conversions in buildings currently using number four

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 oil. The remaining funds are assigned to cover all  
3 required costs, including SCA's wrap up insurance and  
4 completion of projects from the prior plan. Public  
5 feedback plays a crucial role in our capital planning  
6 process. Each year, we undertake the public review  
7 process with Community Education Councils, the City  
8 Council and other elected officials and community  
9 groups. We offer every CEC in the city the  
10 opportunity to conduct a public hearing on the plan  
11 and have attended hearings at every CEC. As you know,  
12 we also partner with individual Council Members and  
13 CECs to identify local needs. Thank you again for  
14 your partnership and support. I will now turn it over  
15 to Deputy Chancellor Goldmark who will discuss  
16 additional aspects of the plan.

17 KARIN GOLDMARK: Thank you. Good  
18 afternoon Chair Treyger and Council Members. My name  
19 is Karin Goldmark and I am Deputy Chancellor of the  
20 Division of School Planning and Development. Thank  
21 you for the opportunity to be here today. I would  
22 like to echo President Grillo's sentiment and thank  
23 you for your continued support of our schools.  
24 Chancellor Richard Carranza and I are committed to  
25 ensuring that all students have access to an

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 equitable and excellent education, which includes  
3 creating a positive environment for learning. This  
4 proposed capital plan is a demonstration of  
5 Chancellor Carranza's commitment to equity and his  
6 responsiveness to students and families. The  
7 priorities that you see reflected in this capital  
8 plan are a direct result of the feedback that the  
9 Chancellor heard after meeting with thousands of  
10 students and families during his listening tour when  
11 he first arrived in New York City and in his many  
12 town halls subsequent to that time. Parents spoke  
13 loudly and clearly, and we listened. We heard from  
14 communities about the connection between quality  
15 facilities and rigorous instruction. We are proud to  
16 say that we are improving technology, accessibility  
17 and air conditioning for all students as we know  
18 these are central to moving our school communities  
19 forward and advancing our equity and excellence for  
20 all agenda. Chancellor Carranza recognizes the  
21 importance of ensuring access for all students and  
22 has articulated accessibility as a major priority. As  
23 a part of this administration's equity and excellence  
24 for all agenda, and as a direct result of the  
25 Council's and our community partners' support, this

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 capital plan allocates 750 million dollars towards  
3 the critically important work of making our school  
4 buildings more accessible. We greatly appreciate the  
5 Council's support in this area. Our team has been  
6 meeting with students, families and community  
7 partners to ensure that we truly understand the needs  
8 of students and families and can make the necessary  
9 changes as quickly as possible. We are committed to  
10 making a third of the buildings in every district  
11 fully accessible by 2024 and at least 50 percent of  
12 our buildings housing elementary school grades fully  
13 or partially accessible by 2024. We know that  
14 innovative and rigorous instruction requires  
15 technology and it is our goal to provide all students  
16 with the essential tools for academic achievement and  
17 professional success in today's digital age. Another  
18 anchor of the plan is the 750-million-dollar  
19 allocation towards improving school-based technology.  
20 The 750 million dollars will allow us to upgrade  
21 critical equipment such as routers, switches,  
22 firewalls and wireless access points in schools.  
23 Upgrading also ensures that the equipment has the  
24 latest security protections and controls in place.  
25 This strategy, which we call school tech refresh,

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 also includes installation of access points in  
3 additional common areas of the school building that  
4 can be used for instructional purposes and this was  
5 the result of feedback from educators, students,  
6 families and Council Members pointing out that common  
7 areas are really important from a technology access  
8 point of view. Included in the 750 million dollars is  
9 an allocation of 350 million dollars using funding  
10 provided through the smart school's bond act. This  
11 will allow more students to have enhanced and  
12 reliable access to essential science, technology,  
13 engineering and Math resources and will support our  
14 goal of bringing computer science to every school by  
15 2025 as part of our computer science for all  
16 initiative. Our goal is to provide all students and  
17 educators with the essential tools for academic  
18 achievement and professional success in today's  
19 digital age. In conclusion, I'll say that students  
20 across all of New York City's great neighborhoods  
21 will see the benefits of this proposed five-year  
22 capital plan. In the areas critical to advancing  
23 equity and excellence for our students, we are  
24 proposing the largest capital investments ever. In a  
25 system this big, there will always be more work to be

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 done. We will continue to update our capital plan on  
3 an annual basis in response to needs from our school  
4 communities and we will seek your input in that  
5 process. We are thankful again for all of your  
6 collaboration and generous support of capital  
7 projects. As shown by the city's highest ever  
8 graduation, college readiness, and college enrollment  
9 rates, our students have been able to expand and  
10 improve their educational experiences because of  
11 these projects and we look forward to seeing our  
12 future students benefit as well. Thank you again for  
13 allowing us to testify here today and we would be  
14 happy to answer any questions you may have.

15 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you very  
16 much. So, I'm joined by other members will the... staff  
17 will let me know but I, I will begin with some  
18 questions. At our December 2018 hearing on the  
19 proposed five year capital plan Chairs Dromm, Gibson  
20 and I expressed our strong disappointment at the lack  
21 of identified seat need as well as the lack of  
22 explanation for why the distribution of funded seats  
23 had changed so significantly from the last published  
24 identified seat need in November 2017. Can you  
25 explain why the February proposal still omits

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 identified seat need and does not explain the  
3 redistribution of funded seats?

4 LORRAINE GRILLO: Certainly, this  
5 particular capital plan presentation in this  
6 particular capital plan represents the fulfilling of  
7 the commitment that the Mayor made at the beginning  
8 of the last capital plan, this is not the first plan  
9 where in fact the future projected seat need is not  
10 included in this particular version, however, our  
11 projected seat need is and always has been  
12 transparent, it is online as we speak and you will  
13 begin to see that projection, we, we recognize that  
14 there is additional seat need and you begin to see  
15 that appear in the various amendments. As you know we  
16 come back to you every year with an amendment. This  
17 particular version, this particular book that you're  
18 seeing right now in front of you is clearly, clearly  
19 representing the commitment that was made by the  
20 Mayor at the beginning of the last plan. With that  
21 said, none of that information is unavailable, it is  
22 all available at any time. So, we're happy to share  
23 that with you. Now in terms of the distribution of  
24 the seats, in many... and, and I've actually spoken to  
25 Council Member Dromm about this after our last



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 hearing, in many of the districts that are  
3 represented particularly in Council Member Dromm's  
4 district of 24 and 30 we have provided over the last  
5 five years 20... I would say in district 24 at least  
6 2,500 new seats, in district 30 almost equal. We will  
7 continue and will always continue to look for sites  
8 in those areas, but we also found it necessary to go  
9 and look throughout the city at those districts that  
10 have not yet received any of that funding and begin  
11 to work on those districts. Again, we're not stopping  
12 our efforts in district 20, district 24 or any of the  
13 major overcrowded districts, we feel however that  
14 while it may take time for us to locate new sites,  
15 for us to acquire new sites that we should actually  
16 use that funding to provide seats in those districts  
17 that have been neglected.

18 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, so I, I

19 appreciate the response President Grillo just.. I want  
20 to just give you a concrete example of our  
21 frustration. So, for example, I represent a piece of  
22 district 20 and my colleague, Council Member Brannan  
23 I think has most of district 20, when the Mayor first  
24 rolled out UPK the DOE and folks in the  
25 administration were urging CBOs and urging folks,

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 providers to hey, apply for contracts with... you know  
3 respond to RFPs and this happened in Queens as well  
4 in other overcrowded districts and we have a lot of  
5 kids to serve and folks were rushing and... to get  
6 those applications in to respond to RFPs to provide a  
7 service that the city says is important and want to  
8 invest money in but now as we speak those same CBOs  
9 that the administration encouraged and pushed and  
10 rushed to, to apply, to respond are telling us a very  
11 different story, that they're worried about their  
12 enrollment because the DOE for some reason is  
13 building its own UPK DOE based centers in the same..  
14 down the block in some cases from some of the CBO  
15 sites so some of their enrollment is now actually  
16 being impacted and some DOE spaces are, are... you know  
17 so, so now you have CBOs who are on the verge of  
18 financial collapse because their budgets are  
19 determined by enrollment and the DOE is opening new  
20 centers without any type of clear methodology as to  
21 why, how, how this was determined and so if we had  
22 better transparency on the planning and how to ID  
23 these types of seat needs and what areas I think  
24 there would be better communication and coordination  
25 with our communities and our service providers and

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 families. If, if you'd like to respond to that I, I  
3 would appreciate it.

4 KARIN GOLDMARK: So, as you noted Pre-K  
5 is a mixed delivery system and absolutely the, the  
6 program does rely on CBO providers as well as DOE  
7 provided Pre-K. This... as you noted at the front this  
8 is a hearing about capital budget so I'm definitely  
9 not going to go into things that are solely expense  
10 related issues, but I'll try to address the  
11 intersection. So, at the DOE we use a number of  
12 different data points as... when we're assessing Pre-K  
13 demand because it is a more fluid and different  
14 structure, attendance is not compulsory, it is a  
15 program, it is not technically a grade so we look at  
16 parent choice, we look at registration, enrollment,  
17 wait list data, we look at some our outreach data  
18 because every year we do outreach to ensure that  
19 families are aware the program exists and we look at  
20 current seat capacity in community based  
21 organizations, in district schools and in existing  
22 Pre-K centers and sometimes we use geographic areas  
23 that are smaller than districts because as you know  
24 districts can be very large including some of the  
25 ones that you represent and so the realistic options

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 for families often feel that they operate at a  
3 smaller level. So, all that to say it's a bit more  
4 art than science and we're always happy to meet with  
5 individual Council Members and go through line by  
6 line each and every seat in Pre-K that's in the  
7 Council Member's district, we've done it in the past,  
8 we're happy to continue to do it. And in the  
9 particular district you're referring to there, there  
10 is... there is a building that is currently being used  
11 as an elementary school site that in our original  
12 planning we thought would be needed for Pre-K but we  
13 were able to actually address some of the elementary  
14 school overcrowding with that site.

15 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right, I... can you  
16 provide us the data that you have on capacity in  
17 enrollment?

18 KARIN GOLDMARK: You mean like for all  
19 70,000 seats, sorry...

20 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Like how is that...  
21 it... for the Pre-K I mean.

22 KARIN GOLDMARK: For Pre-K we can... we can  
23 take you through at an individual Council Member  
24 district level where... we've done that with individual  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 Council Members and we're happy to do that, I did not  
3 think that would be... [cross-talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yeah, I mean this  
5 is... I appreciate... [cross-talk]

6 KARIN GOLDMARK: ...done here... [cross-talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...the, the phrasing  
8 of the intersection between expense and capital but  
9 this is where if we had better understanding of the  
10 capital planning because there is an expense impact..  
11 [cross-talk]

12 KARIN GOLDMARK: Yes... [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...I mean and so  
14 that's why there is an intersection here. What I do  
15 know for a fact is that the DOE at, at the start of  
16 UPK did strongly encourage CBOs to go out and apply  
17 and to respond, that I... the message was clear and was  
18 heard but the same folks who took on that challenge  
19 are now telling us, you know why is... why did the DOE  
20 ask us to take on this program when down the block  
21 they're building now their own center which is now  
22 basically siphoning off students and hurting their  
23 enrollment and they are having a hard time meeting  
24 payroll and also having a hard time retaining  
25 teachers for an expense reason is because of the pay

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 parody issue but this is where we do need to have a  
3 better understanding and more transparency about how  
4 the DOE plans for this because they probably might  
5 not have... you know if, if they knew in advance the  
6 DOE was building these centers right down the block  
7 from where they provide these services I'm not sure  
8 if they would have taken that on to start.

9 KARIN GOLDMARK: Understood, I'll just  
10 say that we, we start with the providers who already  
11 exist, another words the... essentially the capital  
12 element is an avenue of last resort, we first start  
13 with existing providers and when it's not viable to  
14 serve all of the students that's when we look at the  
15 Pre-K centers and I believe we're... we've got three  
16 projects in the next plan, essentially the... building  
17 the Pre-K centers is not a major part of this  
18 proposed capital plan.

19 LORRAINE GRILLO: If I may that... [cross-  
20 talk]

21 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yes... [cross-talk]

22 LORRAINE GRILLO: ...that is correct. We  
23 basically met all the need except for these three  
24 particular projects, we've met all of the Pre-K need  
25 as it... as it currently stands.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right, I, I just...  
3 I... again, just to repeat I would definitely  
4 appreciate the capacity enrollment numbers for all  
5 these districts because I think we need some more  
6 data to make better decisions moving forward. Let me  
7 move on, how does the DOE and SCA engage with OMB and  
8 DCP in the development of the ten-year capital  
9 strategy?

10 LORRAINE GRILLO: First, if I may, I will  
11 respond to the SCA's role and the SCA's role and, and  
12 our responsibility, a legal legislative  
13 responsibility is to provide a five-year capital  
14 plan, that is how we move forward. Over, over time...  
15 as you know we do projections every year to see what  
16 the seat need will be over time, but we really do not  
17 engage in a ten-year capital strategy, we provide the  
18 information for a five-year capital plan.

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay. The proposed...  
20 speaking of the five year capital plan, the proposed  
21 fiscal 20/24 five year capital plan acknowledges the  
22 need for an additional 600 million dollars in funding  
23 in fiscal years 2025 to 2029 for projects that will  
24 start in fiscal 2020 to 2024, why isn't this  
25 reflected in the ten year strategy?

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 LORRAINE GRILLO: Again, if I may?

3 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yes.

4 LORRAINE GRILLO: We provide a five-year  
5 capital plan; we recognize however that at the end of  
6 every capital plan projects are started and will  
7 require obviously funding to finish those. Again, we  
8 have a very different relationship from other  
9 agencies with regard to our planning, our planning is  
10 a five-year plan.

11 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: With implications  
12 beyond the five-year plan?

13 LORRAINE GRILLO: Correct.

14 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right because one  
15 of the areas we flagged in my opening state... in my  
16 opening testimony it was that according to documents  
17 that we've received it seems to suggest that we don't  
18 need to build new schools after the year 2024, if you  
19 could elaborate on that.

20 LORRAINE GRILLO: I, I apologize if  
21 that's how that is represented, its certainly not the  
22 case and, and again historically since the SCA has  
23 provided these... the last four capital plans we've  
24 done it in a... in five year increments and every  
25 single time the need is there for additional seats.



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right, right and I,  
3 I appreciate that President Grillo it's just the need  
4 is there, I think we agree on that... [cross-talk]

5 LORRAINE GRILLO: Yep... [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...we're just not  
7 seeing the dollars to match the need budgeted for  
8 those years and... [cross-talk]

9 LORRAINE GRILLO: Exactly. Well because  
10 again, let me just go back to the same thing, we are  
11 required by law five year capital plans, we also feel  
12 that making projections now for seat need ten years  
13 down the road is just not, not sufficient, it will  
14 not create... it will not give you anything close to  
15 reality, we can project out but again with  
16 demographic shifts throughout the city, all kinds of  
17 new areas where we would never have considered ten  
18 years ago to need... have population needs or seat need  
19 suddenly have popped up. So, we just don't think that  
20 it's a logical place for us to go.

21 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right... [cross-talk]

22 LORRAINE GRILLO: ...we know that there  
23 will be need...

24

25

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yeah, we'll, we'll  
3 follow up with OMB, I think we'll, we'll have to see  
4 them again... [cross-talk]

5 LORRAINE GRILLO: Great... [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...it's just... I do  
7 believe that the inability to kind of... to effectively  
8 plan and project that far ahead got us into the  
9 situations that we're in today as far as some  
10 districts are very, very overcrowded and some  
11 districts do need additional capacities but we'll,  
12 we'll follow up on, on that. Okay, let me just move  
13 on. Accessibility, no accessibility projects are  
14 identified in the February proposal, when will  
15 projects for fiscal 2020 be identified?

16 [off mic dialogue]

17 KARIN GOLDMARK: Okay... [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: If, if you'd like  
19 to testify, we can call you up and just... [cross-talk]

20 KARIN GOLDMARK: Sure, just... would you  
21 like... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...swear you in...  
23 [cross-talk]

24 KARIN GOLDMARK: ...to come up and answer  
25 or you want me to just say what you just said, it's

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 up to you Tom? He's really the ace, Tom Taratko who  
3 works with me... [cross-talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Alright, so why  
5 don't you come up... [cross-talk]

6 KARIN GOLDMARK: ...he's amazing... [cross-  
7 talk]

8 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...and we'll, we'll  
9 swear you in.

10 KARIN GOLDMARK: And it... the short answer  
11 is that we are scoping out projects but that they  
12 aren't project by project... [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right... [cross-talk]

14 KARIN GOLDMARK: ...reflected out yet.

15 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: If you could just  
16 identify yourself for the record and the Counsel will  
17 swear you in.

18 TOM TARATKO: My name is Tom Taratko and  
19 I'm the Chief Executive for Space Management at the  
20 DOE.

21 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay, if you'd like  
22 to just respond to the question that we asked.

23 TOM TARATKO: Yes, so we've been moving  
24 quickly with the additional 50 million dollars that  
25 was added to this current plan, we identified four

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 additional projects for that and then we started to...  
3 we asked the SCA to scope out and begin design on 16  
4 projects, the scopes have not all come back yet, they  
5 will be determined... they're in the districts that  
6 have been historically underserved that have the  
7 lowest percentage of accessibility but the precise  
8 buildings have not been chosen yet.

9 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Are buildings that  
10 house district 75 schools being prioritized for these  
11 projects?

12 TOM TARATKO: In the past plan it was  
13 just an added bonus if a D75 program was in the  
14 building, in this plan its part of our criteria, we  
15 are looking out to increase greatly across the city  
16 to D75 accessibility needs.

17 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yes, I, I  
18 definitely want to flag that and, and what is the  
19 timeline for, for the identify... IDing all the  
20 projects in fiscal 21 and the out years of the five-  
21 year plan?

22 TOM TARATKO: I think we have about three  
23 to four months to wait for all the scopes to come  
24 back but they come back in different cohorts and as  
25 soon as they come out if the project is financially

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 feasible and it gives us the seat need.. the  
3 accessible seats we need in that district we will ask  
4 the SCA to move forward on design and construction.

5 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right and, and we  
6 do... we did I think, you know acknowledge, appreciate  
7 the investment the administration added to increase  
8 accessibility and the Council definitely has engaged  
9 in this effort as well, is there a figure, a number  
10 that we have or the city has in terms of the full  
11 number to make our schools fully accessible because I  
12 know that the... we have put in 750 million dollars  
13 which is a... I think is a good down payment but that  
14 is not the full amount.

15 KARIN GOLDMARK: So, we don't have a full  
16 number for what that would cost, we have many  
17 buildings that are over 100 years old, we have  
18 buildings that are in the 60 to 85-year-old range so  
19 the full cost would be extensive. What we'd like to  
20 do is continue making more and more of the buildings  
21 accessible and get to a point where we can ensure  
22 that students are within a reasonable distance of an  
23 accessible building no matter where they live in New  
24 York City. Down... to get to the point where we... where  
25 every building in New York City would be accessible

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 would likely involve tearing down some buildings and  
3 rebuilding them because some of our architecturally  
4 terming, historic as the Chancellor likes to say  
5 buildings simply have no pathway to accessibility but  
6 again this is the large... by far the largest  
7 investment that we've ever made, we worked very  
8 closely on adding to the now ending capital plan and  
9 this is something where the Council has shown a lot  
10 of leadership, where advocates have been really at  
11 the table with us helping us figure it out and where  
12 we are really thrilled and, and Chancellor Carranza  
13 has made it clear that this is a major priority so  
14 we're... [cross-talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right... [cross-talk]

16 KARIN GOLDMARK: ...making more progress  
17 than we've ever made, we're thrilled about that, will  
18 there still be work done at the end of this capital  
19 plan for it to be done, yes.

20 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Alright, I would  
21 just flag it, I appreciate that, I would just flag  
22 that knowing the number even if it requires building  
23 new schools is helpful from an advocacy standpoint  
24 just like we know the number to get all schools to  
25 100 percent of FSF, we need a number here as well to

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 lobby our state law makers, our federal partners,  
3 this is... we could work together on this because our  
4 schools should be fully accessible.

5 KARIN GOLDMARK: Will do, it will be a  
6 large number.

7 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: We... and we, we, we  
8 like to take on large problems. The SCA is beginning  
9 to comply with the ADA path of travel requirements  
10 this year, the ADA's path of travel requirements  
11 stipulate that when alterations are made to a primary  
12 function area up to 20 percent of the project's  
13 eligible costs must be used to make the path of  
14 travel to area accessible. How will SCA comply with  
15 the path of travel requirements?

16 LORRAINE GRILLO: Again, we, we have  
17 factored in the path of travel requirements into  
18 those projects that are within a school building and  
19 changes the, the use of a particular room. We've been  
20 actually meeting with members of the City Council to  
21 discuss this because I know that the Council has been  
22 very generous in providing funding for things like  
23 science labs and the like which will require dollars  
24 for path of travel as well. So, this is now  
25 incorporated into our designs.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Will the funding  
3 for the path of travel projects come out of the 750  
4 million that was allocated for accessibility  
5 projects?

6 LORRAINE GRILLO: No.

7 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay, just...  
8 technology very quickly. The plan allocates 750  
9 million dollars for technology, how much of this  
10 funding is for classrooms technology such as laptop  
11 carts and smartboards?

12 KARIN GOLDMARK: So, this funding I want  
13 to just take a minute to describe the places where we  
14 have sort of technology needs so one is in the...  
15 there, there are basically four stops along the way,  
16 one is the amount of data we bring into the system.  
17 The second is how we distribute that data across the  
18 DOE's network to schools. The third is the equipment  
19 in the school that receives the data and then  
20 distributes it through the school and the fourth are  
21 the devices at the end, the laptops and the, the  
22 devices to which you're referring. The 750 million  
23 dollars in the capital plan addresses largely that  
24 third place, the network infrastructure at schools  
25 and with some work on the first and second stops. In



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 terms of devices and laptops etcetera that is  
3 typically... sometimes that is capital funding,  
4 sometimes generously provided through Council  
5 Members, sometimes that is expense funding, but this  
6 funding is not directed at the device level.

7 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Alright, I just  
8 want to flag it and I'll turn it to my colleagues  
9 because we're, we're... time is of the essence here but  
10 there are schools that I know of that have purchased  
11 on their own... from their... using their own money  
12 throttling devices so students cannot log into the  
13 school's internet because if, if the students had  
14 internet access the school's internet would basically  
15 collapse and they can't send emails out. There are  
16 some schools that have created their own wi-fi  
17 network outside of the DOE's internet network and  
18 then there are some schools that are just stuck  
19 without internet all day throughout much of the  
20 school year and use their smart boards as chart  
21 paper... chart paper holders, I know that because I've  
22 seen them and I've observed them and that's not why  
23 smart boards were purchased. This is a... this is a  
24 problem Deputy Chancellor, this is something that we  
25 just... we can't... especially with the amount of money

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 we're talking about, three quarters of a billion  
3 dollars in technology schools should have functioning  
4 internet, schools... this is... this is just... there's  
5 something deeply wrong and flawed here, I, I know  
6 we've discussed this in the past but I continuously  
7 see this in schools visits, there's something deeply  
8 wrong and flawed especially when the DOE's own  
9 superintendents visit these schools knowing the  
10 internet is, is problematic but still ask them how do  
11 you use technology to improve instruction, that's an  
12 unfair question to educators who have complained the  
13 internet's not working.

14 KARIN GOLDMARK: Absolutely and that is  
15 the driving reason for this 750 million dollar  
16 proposed investment because we need every school to  
17 be in the place where students have access, teachers  
18 have access and the entire school is wired using the  
19 latest infrastructure because without the latest  
20 infrastructure even if the data in the system is, is  
21 better which actually has already happened the school  
22 can't access it without the up to date  
23 infrastructure, absolutely true and it's a major  
24 priority for us to ensure that all of the schools  
25 that have the oldest equipment get the upgrade first.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 I just want to amend what I said about this 750  
3 million not including any funding for devices because  
4 it... I was mistaken it actually does include almost  
5 130 million dollars for, for some devices at the  
6 school level.

7 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And, and how will...  
8 how will those schools be selected?

9 KARIN GOLDMARK: Let me get back to you  
10 in one moment. So, that will be determined by the  
11 Chancellor and obviously he is using an equity lens  
12 to ensure that traditionally underserved schools are  
13 getting access to the resources.

14 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: If we can get more  
15 data on that to the Council, we'd appreciate it.

16 KARIN GOLDMARK: Absolutely.

17 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Alright, I'll turn  
18 it around to my colleagues, Council Member we're on  
19 the clock today because we're trying to be very  
20 mindful of time. Next, we'll hear from Council Member  
21 Dromm.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you very  
23 much Chair, President Grillo good to see you and  
24 Deputy Chancellor Goldmark good to see you as well. I  
25 just wanted to follow up a little bit on the

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 discussion about the identified seat need. So, in 20...  
3 and you know this is a concern to me, we've had this  
4 discussion. So, in 24, in district 24 in the November  
5 17 plan there was an identified 9,403 seats, of that  
6 1,912 were completed between 2015 and 18 and 2,066  
7 are expected to be completed between 2019 and 2022  
8 for a total of 3,978 so that's good. Where I'm  
9 getting a little bit confused is that there is an  
10 identified seat need not met of 5,425 and we're only  
11 going to do 1,464 which leaves us with a deficit of  
12 3,941, I've been using that number everywhere I go, I  
13 might... I might play that number although I'm not a  
14 gambling man but my question and, and I've heard your  
15 explanation in terms of, of why you're doing it and  
16 why you're redistributing the funding, what happens  
17 to that 3,961 moving forward, do you pick that up at  
18 some point because I know... and I also hear you saying  
19 there's zeros from 2025 on over the, the next five  
20 years, how do you pick up that 3,000 so, so that we  
21 don't lose that so we know that that need is still  
22 there?

23 LORRAINE GRILLO: Correct, thank you  
24 Council Member, actually just to clarify, in district  
25 24 since 2008, between 2008 and 2018 we've provided

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 over 12,000 seats in district 24 which has been a  
3 terrific record. When we determine how these seats  
4 would be distributed in this particular capital plan  
5 based on 57,000 which we talked about was the...  
6 following up on the commitment that the Mayor made we  
7 looked at our record of locating sites, okay and  
8 because of the way and the timing that it required to  
9 locate sites we felt comfortable shifting those  
10 dollars for the time being, the seat need around for  
11 the time being but as I said earlier we will continue  
12 to locate sites in those districts as they become  
13 available, we just feel and we... based upon history  
14 know that it's, it's over a long period of time and  
15 we will do our best to continue to look for those  
16 sites but again why have that funding sit for several  
17 years, okay rather than use it in a district that has  
18 been underserved but that need will continue.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: So, you're  
20 recognizing that you still do need the 3,961 seats?

21 LORRAINE GRILLO: Absolutely, we have not  
22 eliminated that need. What we have done is shift,  
23 shifted the capacity needs throughout the city in  
24 areas that have been neglected as well as knowing how  
25 long it takes to site new schools.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: My time is up.

3 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I, I... if the Chair  
4 would like to ask a follow up question because I...  
5 [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Okay, so... [cross-  
7 talk]

8 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Just, just because  
9 we, we have to be mindful of folks, but I will not  
10 deny the Finance Chair a follow up question.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: So, just along  
12 those same lines it's my understanding that 50,000 of  
13 the 57,000 seats that you're funding are not actually  
14 going to be built until about 2024... [cross-talk]

15 LORRAINE GRILLO: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: ...is that correct?

17 LORRAINE GRILLO: Sure, I mean when you  
18 think about it a school takes a year to design and  
19 three years potentially for a... for a reasonable sized  
20 school to construct so a number of those schools that  
21 have started in the end of this plan will not  
22 complete until, you know or, or those that start in  
23 say 2020 or 2021 will take several years to complete,  
24 it just...

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Okay, let me... let  
3 me go just to a very quick different topic. Pre-Ks in  
4 NYCHA buildings, I've been on this for a while and  
5 one of my concerns because I used to be a day care  
6 center teacher and director before I joined the DOE,  
7 those sites in many circumstances, many places are  
8 not in good condition, how is SCA going to go in and  
9 look at those sites, what is the, the plan for  
10 looking at the conditions at those sites?

11 KARIN GOLDMARK: So, we are having a  
12 phased approach as leases come up the SCA is taking  
13 them on so we will actually have to get back to you  
14 as to what that intersection with NYCHA will be  
15 because I don't think that the leasing process  
16 effects those sites.

17 LORRAINE GRILLO: We'll have to... we'll  
18 have to get back to you on that one... [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Okay, because you  
20 know having worked in the NYCHA building in a...  
21 [cross-talk]

22 LORRAINE GRILLO: Sure... [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: ...day care center  
24 it is extremely difficult, as you know with all of  
25 the stuff that... all the controversy that's going on

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 even to get them to come in and paint and those  
3 centers... the big concern that I have is, is that  
4 there's lead paint in those centers and I brought  
5 this up with the Health Commissioner during the last  
6 round of budget season so I, I would really like to  
7 know what the plan is for the taking over of those  
8 NYCHA day care centers the ones we're putting in 3-K  
9 and UPK sites. Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank, thank you  
11 Chair and next we'll hear from Council Member  
12 Grodenchik.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Do I get an  
14 extra question for being the Parks Chair or is it  
15 just, you know...

16 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I think it's just  
17 the finance chair overall... [cross-talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Okay, I just  
19 wanted to clear that up Mr. Chairman, thank you Miss  
20 Grillo, Miss Goldmark, always good to see you. I want  
21 to thank you for the expansions at 46 and at Cordoza,  
22 I look forward to breaking ground on them hopefully  
23 this fall, I got a little smile there, okay I'll take  
24 that. Two quick things, one joint operated playground  
25 which we know I had a hearing on that with the Parks



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 Committee in the fall. I would like to know... I'm,  
3 I'm... had a brief discussion and I'm going to talk  
4 more about this with the Chairman of Education. As  
5 Parks Chair it concerns me that we have a lot of  
6 parks that look like a duck, walk like a duck, you  
7 know quack like a duck but they're not on parkland  
8 and I would want to know if SCA and DOE would be  
9 amenable to a task force that would look at all of  
10 these and identify those very carefully working with  
11 the Parks Department and with the Department of  
12 Education, SCA and the City Council where we could  
13 map them officially as parkland, I realize that would  
14 be a long process but we would only put those into  
15 the pot that you didn't need such as say Shift  
16 Playground in Councilman Levine's district which is  
17 an outstanding New York City park and we're doing a  
18 lot of work there, a lot of money has been put in by  
19 the Councilman so I'd just like to know your opinion  
20 on that.

21 KARIN GOLDMARK: Well you had me at about  
22 half that... till, till half way through so we're happy  
23 to look at all of the jointly operated playgrounds  
24 together, the JOPs, however obviously the DOE has a  
25 real priority around ensuring access... [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: I, I

3 recognize... [cross-talk]

4 KARIN GOLDMARK: ...for students... [cross-  
5 talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: ...that but  
7 there, there certainly are parks that I have seen  
8 that there is no way in a thousand years the city is  
9 ever going to build on those for schools, I am using  
10 part of a JOP to expand 46 and if Miss Grillo is  
11 amenable and the Superintendent of 26 is amendable  
12 we're going to do more of that but... and I recognize  
13 that and that's the parks Chair talking but I also  
14 recognize that there are vital parklands that need to  
15 be protected and so I'm going to have further  
16 conversations with the Education Chair on that and of  
17 course with, with you and, and Miss Grillo as well.

18 KARIN GOLDMARK: I apologize I thought  
19 you meant in terms of... I was speaking about ensuring  
20 access for current DOE students and DOE buildings...  
21 [cross-talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Oh, no, no,  
23 no... [cross-talk]

24 KARIN GOLDMARK: ...to essentially... [cross-  
25 talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: ...we... [cross-  
3 talk]

4 KARIN GOLDMARK: ...to playgrounds because  
5 we, we love for a community to have access to  
6 playgrounds... [cross-talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Absolutely,  
8 no.

9 KARIN GOLDMARK: You're talking about  
10 siting, absolutely... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: I'm talking  
12 about... [cross-talk]

13 KARIN GOLDMARK: ...let's talk about it...  
14 [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: ...you know  
16 those, whatever number it is, X, it could be ten it  
17 could be five, it could be 50 where we're definitely  
18 never going to build a school and that way we could  
19 protect them for all time because there is a concern  
20 in that community. With my... rest of my 11 seconds I  
21 pressed the Chancellor on a new high school building  
22 for the high school for sciences at York and its  
23 desperately needed so we'll be having further  
24 conversations about that. We could add a great number  
25 of seats to the pot, I'm talking... there's 412

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 students I believe there now, they work very hard,  
3 these are some of the best kids in the city, we can  
4 make that opportunity available for children all the  
5 way from Rosedale all the way up to White Stone and I  
6 would greatly appreciate... [cross-talk]

7 KARIN GOLDMARK: I'll just note that all  
8 1.1 million school children in New York City are the  
9 best kids... [cross-talk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Yes, they  
11 are... [cross-talk]

12 KARIN GOLDMARK: ...in New York City,  
13 however I do look forward to having a conversation...  
14 the conversation about siting that's obviously a  
15 major priority... [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: And, and  
17 every school is the most important school, that's the  
18 way I think about my parks too.

19 KARIN GOLDMARK: True...

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you  
21 very much.

22 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you and next  
23 we'll hear from Council Member Kallos.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you SCA  
25 President and DDC Commissioner Grillo for being here

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 today despite managing two important agencies. I will  
3 confine my questions to your role at just the SCA.

4 LORRAINE GRILLO: Thank you sir.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: After five years  
6 of advocacy I couldn't have been more grateful to the  
7 SCA to have called my attention to 93 million dollars  
8 in the plan for 640 seats, I just wanted to confirm  
9 and not to look a good... gift horse in the mouth that  
10 that is still in the plan?

11 LORRAINE GRILLO: That's correct.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I want to thank  
13 you for renovating schools in my district including  
14 30 million dollars for a restoration of a century old  
15 building at PS 158 that got a lot of news attention  
16 as well as winning awards, I'm curious about the  
17 status of additional renovations you've been doing at  
18 PS 198 slash PS 77 and PS 183. Along the same lines ,  
19 last year we cut the ribbon at Pre-K centers at 57<sup>th</sup>  
20 and 95<sup>th</sup> Street and broke ground on a new Pre-  
21 kindergarten center on 76<sup>th</sup> Street, parents email me  
22 every single day asking if we are on track to open  
23 this new site for September and if perhaps they'll  
24 have a chance to see it before the first day and I  
25 think along those same lines, it took us five years

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 to... after the promise of Pre-K for All to get up to  
3 1,100 Pre-K seats on the Upper East Side, however in  
4 2014 there were 2,577 children born, I'm waiting to  
5 hear back from DOE that did not have the answer for  
6 the number of children who applied on Monday... [cross-  
7 talk]

8 LORRAINE GRILLO: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: ...but I'm  
10 concerned that as we try to roll out 3-K, I believe  
11 it's supposed to be citywide by 2022 but that is  
12 going to take a planning process, Chancellor Carranza  
13 actually he surprised me quite a few times today, he,  
14 he said that he'd be willing to come forward with a  
15 plan for how you're going to do that, I wanted to  
16 call that to your attention and see whether SCA would  
17 share their plan and those are my questions.

18 LORRAINE GRILLO: Okay, well thank you  
19 very much. In terms of the renovations at 183 and  
20 198/77 we'll have to get back to you on that. In  
21 terms of the schedule for the new Pre-K on 76<sup>th</sup>  
22 Street, yes, we are on time, you can assure your  
23 parents that we will be ready. As far as the rollout  
24 for the 3-K, this is a much more phased roll out than  
25 Pre-K had been which was a very compressed timeline

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 so by 2019 this September we will have rolled out and  
3 I'm just going to double check the number here, I  
4 believe 13 districts, okay, so you will see a rollout  
5 over time of that... of that 3-K otherwise I missed the  
6 last question.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I was just  
8 asking... so, the Chancellor said he'll come to me with  
9 a plan and... [cross-talk]

10 LORRAINE GRILLO: Sure... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: ...so whatever the  
12 plan is for when... I'm in... I'm council district five  
13 but school district two... [cross-talk]

14 LORRAINE GRILLO: Two... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: ...so whenever the  
16 plan is for rolling out to the second largest school  
17 district in the city of New York I would like to just  
18 see how we're going to back into those, I assume if  
19 we have 1,100 4=K seats we will need 1,100 3-K seats  
20 and so it will take time to build so I'm asking for  
21 your commitment to participate in that process.

22 LORRAINE GRILLO: Absolutely.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay, thank you so  
25 much and just very quickly just two follow up

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 questions, does the DOE track the amount of time it  
3 takes to fix critical repairs such as a broken lift  
4 or an elevator?

5 [off mic dialogue]

6 KARIN GOLDMARK: Yes, we do.

7 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And can you provide  
8 us with that information, do you have that with you  
9 right now?

10 KARIN GOLDMARK: I do not have that with  
11 me right now, I am happy to provide that as a follow  
12 up.

13 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yeah, I am... I'm  
14 becoming increasingly concerned in this area be...  
15 especially after hearing some of the stories I've  
16 heard from educators that it took almost a year to  
17 fix in some cases a school lift and so I would... it's  
18 almost like asking NYCHA how long does it take to fix  
19 certain things in buildings and we have to now ask  
20 how long does it take to, to fix certain things in  
21 schools and I would also flag that there was an issue  
22 of confusion whether it was a DSF issue or an SCA  
23 issue and that, that should, should not be happening  
24 so I would appreciate that. Very quickly also, is  
25



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 there an update on the transition from Verizon to  
3 light tower in terms of the internet provider?

4 KARIN GOLDMARK: It... so, there are only  
5 102 schools left that still need the transition and  
6 we should be done by June with that transition to  
7 Light Tower, that's the transition to the fiber optic  
8 system as I was talking about those four components  
9 that's carrying data throughout the system in much  
10 faster way. Sorry, 120 not 102, so we should be done  
11 by June and there are 120 schools remaining out of  
12 the 1,600 schools in New York City... [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Done by June...

14 [cross-talk]

15 KARIN GOLDMARK: ...almost done.

16 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Done by June.

17 January SCA had a job posting for a Director of  
18 Accessibility Compliance, is this a new position at  
19 the SCA and has this job been filled?

20 LORRAINE GRILLO: The, the SCA actually  
21 has a Director of ADA Compliance who has done such a  
22 phenomenal job that's he's been promoted to Senior  
23 Director...

24 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay...

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

LORRAINE GRILLO: ...and so now we have an opening for a Director.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay and one quick follow up to the path of travel requirements. You had mentioned that the funding will not come out of the 750-million-dollar pot for accessibility projects, how will they get funded?

LORRAINE GRILLO: Again, as, as every project that we do we, we include all the components and, in this case, when we do our estimates for our typical capital improvement projects that will be included if it's... if it's required.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: How will this effect discretionary capital projects and progress, will SCA set aside funding for path of travel requirements for discretionary capital projects already funded by elected officials?

LORRAINE GRILLO: No, I believe where we are moving forward those will be required but right now, I think we're, we're keeping a... keeping things as they are and moving forward slowly on this.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Alright, the final, final point. The attorney for the Southern district of New York found that many school construction

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 projects completed after the passage of ADA did not  
3 conform to accessibility requirements siting  
4 elevators that are not ADA required width, bathroom  
5 grab bars that are not the appropriate dimensions,  
6 office counters that are too high and door knobs that  
7 require tight grasping and, and twisting to operate,  
8 how does the SCA explain this lack of ADA compliance?

9 LORRAINE GRILLO: So, talking... speaking  
10 with Tom Taratko and, and the SCA is working closely  
11 with him to currently scope... look at every single  
12 building after... built after 1992 to see exactly if  
13 they meet... if they comply.

14 TOM TARATKO: Yes, Council Member so our  
15 first rounds of surveys for our building  
16 accessibility profile is focused on elementary... high  
17 schools first then we went to the elementary school  
18 partially or fully buildings now, working with the  
19 advocates they asked us to go back through the fully  
20 accessible buildings, the buildings that are listed  
21 as fully post 1992 construction and we're about 25  
22 schools into a couple of hundred so the process will  
23 probably take us about a year to have... a year to have  
24 building accessibility profiles on them but that,  
25 that goes into our list of our self-reported

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 deficiencies and then we are going to be working on  
3 that over the next five years to make sure that  
4 everything is the way it should be.

5 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And is the attorney  
6 for the Southern district asking for updates, how,  
7 how are you communicating with their office, is there  
8 some sort of a monitor that you're... that you're in  
9 touch with?

10 KARIN GOLDMARK: We do that through the  
11 law department.

12 LORRAINE GRILLO: With Southern district...

13 KARIN GOLDMARK: Yeah.

14 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: The DO... DOJ?

15 KARIN GOLDMARK: Yes...

16 TOM TARATKO: Yeah, we're, we're back...  
17 corporate council, DOE council we go back and forth  
18 and we're actually entering into some type of  
19 agreement with them right now on everything, there... I  
20 know there's been a lot of back and forth on that.

21 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: If... yeah, we'd like  
22 to kind of be briefed a little bit, bit on that  
23 because that's also important news and lastly,  
24 President Grillo can SCA move forward on projects  
25 that are not listed in the five-year plan?

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

LORRAINE GRILLO: Can we move forward on the projects that are not listed in the five-year plan, certainly if we make sure that they are included in every amendment as it comes up.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Because the, the follow up to that is how many additional projects in the current plan were identified after adoption?

LORRAINE GRILLO: I'd have to... I'd have to get back to you on that.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay, well we, we appreciate it, there is some, some more follow up and I, I do... I do appreciate the partnership and, and you noted it takes about three or four years to build a new school you said President Grillo?

LORRAINE GRILLO: Yes...

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And you're... and you... now you head DDC as well?

LORRAINE GRILLO: That's correct sir...  
[cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And it takes eight years to build a bathroom in a park so something to flag for DDC in the Parks Department as well. So, on that note we, we will... we will adjourn this... [cross-talk]  
talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 KARIN GOLDMARK: And that's why President  
3 Grillo is at DDC, she has the track record.

4 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Very good, thank  
5 you, thank you very much. We are now going to begin  
6 the public testimony portion of our hearing. Due to  
7 the large number, number of persons wishing to  
8 testify I'd like to remind everyone that we'll be  
9 calling up witnesses in panels of around four to  
10 five. In addition, in order that we may hear everyone  
11 today all persons testifying will be on a three-  
12 minute timer that means that we're asking everyone to  
13 please summarize your testimony and give the  
14 Committee the salient points that you wish to share.  
15 Your written testimony will be placed into the record  
16 and reviewed by Committee staff and therefor we ask  
17 you do not read your testimony verbatim. Again, in  
18 order to be fair and hear from everyone who wishes to  
19 testify today please summarize your points to us as  
20 we will have a three minute timer for every panelist  
21 today and please say your name and the organization  
22 you are with for the record before your, your  
23 testimony, I would actually appreciate that. Since  
24 we, we do have some distinguished, critical  
25 stakeholders I would actually call them leaders in

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 many of the efforts that we raised here today. I'd  
3 like to first call up to, to speak to us the  
4 President of the United Federation of Teachers,  
5 President Michael Mulgrew.

6 MICHAEL MULGREW: Thank you Chairman  
7 Treyger, Treyger and thank you to the City Council  
8 for holding these hearings and I will be brief  
9 because I know there are a lot of people who have a  
10 lot to say. First and foremost, I want to thank the  
11 City Council's partnership for what we've been able  
12 to accomplish over the years but specifically over  
13 the last couple of years we have been able to move  
14 programs inside of schools that have truly made a  
15 difference in student's lives. Our community learning  
16 schools, our positive learning collaborative, both of  
17 those programs you have been great funders for, and  
18 both of those programs supply guidance counselors and  
19 social workers to all the schools that are using  
20 those programs. The dial a teacher program will  
21 receive over 80,000 phone calls this week, the BRAVE  
22 program which we use for our anti bullying and we  
23 thank you for all of that support and help and one  
24 thing I can say here with the utmost integrity is  
25 that every program that we come here and advocate for

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 you know that every single one of those dollars goes  
3 to schools, goes to students, to parents and to  
4 teachers and we believe that is the way to actually  
5 move our school system. On Monday of this week, over  
6 1,100 people went up with the... with our... my union; it  
7 was parents, it was teachers, it was... it was  
8 advocates to advocate on behalf of our school system  
9 for funding and this is a very difficult year and I'm  
10 sitting here before you today asking you to continue  
11 to fund the programs that you've done in the past and  
12 we are asking for increases because we do know on  
13 like money we receive from the state that that  
14 funding is actually going to get to the schools. So,  
15 my frustration and part of my ask is that we're  
16 asking you not just to continue your support but to  
17 also support us in helping us actually get the  
18 funding from the state to the schools. We feel there  
19 is a complete lack of urgency inside of what we call,  
20 the teachers of New York City affectionately call the  
21 land of Tweed or the bureaucracy of the Department of  
22 Education. We appreciate and support the equity in  
23 excellence agenda of both the Mayor and the  
24 Chancellor, we have seen changes inside of the  
25 Department of Ed since this Chancellor has taken over



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 but again we do not feel that there is an, an urgency  
3 inside of that agency to do what needs to be done on  
4 behalf of our school system. We continue to be  
5 frustrated by the fact that in our consultations and  
6 discussions and meetings with the Department of  
7 Education it is clear to us that they are more  
8 concerned about protecting their bureaucracy, they  
9 are more concerned about what they think of each  
10 other in their own internal fights and discussions  
11 for turf inside of the Department of Ed and they are  
12 not concerned or connected with the communities of  
13 where our schools are, they do not have real  
14 conversations with our students and they are not  
15 completely engaged as they should be with the parents  
16 of our New York City public school students. So, I am  
17 asking you to continue on our programs but at the  
18 same time to help us move that bureaucracy which we  
19 feel... we clear, clearly feel that this moment is  
20 almost diseased in its ability to actually fix itself  
21 because they can't get out of their own way and they  
22 never remember that the only reason they come to work  
23 every day is on behalf of the children of New York  
24 City and not on behalf of themselves and I thank you  
25 for letting me testify today.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I, I want to thank  
3 you President Mulgrew and I want to share with you a  
4 recent visit that I made to a school in Washington  
5 Heights, PS 8 where we met with the principal, we met  
6 with educators, we met with the parents and this was  
7 a principal making the request not just a... not just a  
8 teacher but... [cross-talk]

9 MICHAEL MULGREW: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...the biggest  
11 request in addition to 100 percent of fair student  
12 funding for their school, their biggest request was a  
13 full-time school psychologist, a full-time social  
14 worker, additional guidance counselors... [cross-talk]

15 MICHAEL MULGREW: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

16 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...500 students, 97  
17 percent of them live in poverty, very high needs  
18 community, that was the appeal of the school and that  
19 was the appeal made by the children even... they want  
20 to go on additional trips which we should fund trips  
21 as well for them to explore their city. So, it's not  
22 just coming from the UFT, we're hearing this from  
23 every educational stakeholder that we want more  
24 counselors in our schools, social workers, school  
25 psychologists and I'll point out for the record that

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 before the current administration's approach for  
3 community schools there was the community learning  
4 schools model approach already adopted by the UFT  
5 before it became a buzz term. As a matter of fact, I  
6 would think that the UFT model is actually more  
7 inclusive because it involves a lot more  
8 stakeholders...

9 MICHAEL MULGREW: Uh-huh...

10 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: As a former teacher  
11 I'll continue to say this and I think the folks who  
12 have heard my exchange with the Chancellor, I don't  
13 know if you missed it President Mulgrew, we are  
14 failing to meet the socioemotional needs of our  
15 children, we're failing, its not on them, its on us,  
16 we're failing the children and so when I'm hearing  
17 the appeal from the UFT is to meet that need, it's  
18 about the children, it's about making sure that we  
19 have the personnel that's licensed and credentialed  
20 to address that need, is that correct President  
21 Mulgrew?

22 MICHAEL MULGREW: Yes, the school system  
23 and all the work that we do is about the classrooms  
24 and the schools of New York City not about the  
25 building across the hall from... across the street from

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 you and there seems to be a disconnect at this point  
3 in time, its been there a while but it seems to be  
4 going more and more frustrating for us that they  
5 don't understand that they're here to serve the  
6 schools, they believe that the schools are here to  
7 serve them and that's what's wrong right now with our  
8 system. When we have to come to you for support to  
9 put guidance counselors in schools, to put social  
10 workers in schools, when we spend our own dues money  
11 to support and put guidance counselors and social  
12 workers in schools, to put real intervention programs  
13 inside of schools and they just would rather hire a  
14 consultant, put a team around it, give everyone a  
15 nice title and continue to meet amongst themselves  
16 rather than actually just go to the schools and  
17 actually talk to students and talk to parents and  
18 ask... find out what they need they would rather spend  
19 money on once again hiring a consultant to do a study  
20 and then meet about it 38 times and then come up with  
21 a program that is completely irrelevant to the actual  
22 schools and their needs and that is what our  
23 frustration is.

24 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Absolutely and I  
25 would just echo and add to that the conversation

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 around school climate. We go through this every year  
3 when they release their suspension figures and some  
4 folks take victory laps, school climate is a need of  
5 improvements and I think you would agree that school  
6 officials... [cross-talk]

7 MICHAEL MULGREW: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

8 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...should run the  
9 schools not the NYPD, schools should control the  
10 schools... [cross-talk]

11 MICHAEL MULGREW: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

12 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...but the UFT has an  
13 approach... the UFT has an approach, the positive  
14 learning collaborative where you work with again,  
15 licensed and skilled people to meet the needs of our  
16 children, you can't rely on a consultant. Again,  
17 respectfully to some folks who they've hired and I'll  
18 even say for the record, you know they hired... and I...  
19 the Chancellor and I had this exchange, coordinators  
20 to deal with students in temporary housing, that's  
21 not good enough folks, they're not licensed social  
22 workers, you need people who know what they're doing  
23 working with our children. When I taught history, my  
24 students and my school expected me to have a license  
25 to teach history, you can't wing it and I think

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 that's the appeal that we're hearing from our... from  
3 our partners in, in labor and, and from the UFT.

4 MICHAEL MULGREW: It's, it's extremely  
5 frustrating because we have so many people and the  
6 school communities themselves are moving themselves  
7 into a better place but as we see now if we have a  
8 Department of Education their job is supposed to be  
9 to help the school. I understand bussing is very  
10 complicated, I understand food service is very  
11 complicated, those things need to be done, there's  
12 compliance documents but after that it should all be  
13 about listening to the schools. We were just able... we  
14 had to put into a contract a provision known as the  
15 Bronx plan which is a great idea and it's a... it's the  
16 smart thing to do but think about what the... what it  
17 actually says, it actually says for the first time we  
18 had to ensconce as a right that a school community  
19 gets to tell the Department of Education what it's  
20 needs are and they have to support that. We had to  
21 put that in a contract because we knew if we didn't  
22 have that in a contract the Department of Education  
23 would never listen to what a school wanted, it would  
24 just tell them what they were going to do even though  
25 it wouldn't work for them.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: That's, that's  
3 correct and lastly President Mulgrew a quick question  
4 on teacher's choice. We heard the Chancellor mention  
5 earlier that there is now a conversation internally  
6 with the DOE and the administration on funding,  
7 picking up and potentially even baselining or... so, so  
8 to speak teacher's choice. I, I just want to flag for  
9 the public that when I was teaching at the time... at  
10 the time of, of my tenure teacher's choice was down  
11 to about 75 bucks or so per teacher... [cross-talk]

12 MICHAEL MULGREW: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...thanks to the UFT  
14 the number is now up to 250 and that's the great  
15 champions of the... of their advocacy but the students  
16 I was serving, I was serving were high needs and they  
17 didn't, you know have all the supplies that they  
18 needed to succeed in my class so the teachers in my  
19 department would pool all of their teacher's choice  
20 resources together to make sure that every child  
21 would have paper and pencils for the scantron, I  
22 don't know if they use those... still use scantron  
23 exams these days but... so they would have supplies...  
24 they don't, I, I don't know... so that they would have  
25 supplies each day. Teacher's choice is not just a, a

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 wish list item for anyone, this is about making sure  
3 that our schools are adequately supplied. Could you  
4 just imagine, I have to... I have to say this on the  
5 record in the year 2019 that schools in the largest  
6 school system in the country in a budget of over 92  
7 billion dollars have to make sure that we have enough  
8 pencils, pens, paper, supplies for our kids. I cannot  
9 believe that I have to say that for the record in  
10 this day and age but that is what teacher's choice  
11 really amounts too and if you could just speak to  
12 where things are at from your lens... [cross-talk]

13 MICHAEL MULGREW: So... [cross-talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...President Mulgrew  
15 I would appreciate it.

16 MICHAEL MULGREW: We, we have been... we  
17 have been advocating for years that this program  
18 should be baselined into the city's budget because  
19 once again you get the assurance that every dollar is  
20 actually being spent on a supply that's being used  
21 inside of our schools. If you could ask the  
22 Department of Ed if you... they could guarantee you  
23 that every dollar they spend is about the school's  
24 good luck with that because I'm telling you the  
25 answer is no...



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right...

3 MICHAEL MULGREW: ...so, for us its... we  
4 know once again that that money is going directly  
5 into supplies that are being inside of... used inside  
6 of schools and you know that, we audit this program,  
7 it's there and that's the only way that that money is  
8 used. The fact that we have to have that program I  
9 share with your... in your frustration because this is  
10 something that should... that Department of Ed should  
11 take on as its responsibility but clearly since  
12 they've advocated that responsibility it should be  
13 part of the city's budget and if I was the Mayor of  
14 New York City I'd be asking the Department of Ed why  
15 do the teachers have to go to City Council to get  
16 supplies when I give you billions of dollars and  
17 you're telling me they're getting supplies but  
18 clearly they're not, somebody is not being held  
19 accountable.

20 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: That's correct and  
21 just for the record for the public to know the City  
22 Council because we support our kids, we support our  
23 educators, we pick up the tab of over 20 million  
24 dollars to support teacher's choice which in turn  
25 goes to fund supplies in our... in our schools. If we

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 did not pick this up many of our children would not  
3 come prepared to class every single day so... but Mr...  
4 President... but I will tell you what I do see if you  
5 follow a lot of the social media of, of, of tweet and  
6 DOE I'll tell you one industry that I think is doing  
7 very well under them, they have so many different  
8 workshops run by consultants and they have so many  
9 tasty, delicious muffins and cookies and trays of  
10 food at every one of those workshops and... which the  
11 taxpayers pick up. I would rather redirect those  
12 dollars directly into our school budgets, so every  
13 child has a pen, pencil, paper ready to learn each  
14 and every day and so this is a major priority for us  
15 here in the City Council, we thank you... [cross-talk]

16 MICHAEL MULGREW: And I appreciate that.  
17 In terms of what you just said about the consultants,  
18 the main part of my testimony really was about  
19 something I feel every year is a year in a child's  
20 education...

21 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right...

22 MICHAEL MULGREW: ...so, I don't want to  
23 wait any longer and make incremental steps in trying  
24 to change what goes on at the Department of  
25 Education. I believe the leadership in place wants

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 these changes but I do not believe that the  
3 bureaucracy wants the changes so now we're going to  
4 need out... people from the outside helping us to get  
5 to this place because they are very good and when I  
6 say they I'm talking about this culture inside of  
7 this agency is truly a self-serving culture about  
8 themselves, there are people in there who are well  
9 meaning but I don't think they realize that once  
10 they're inside of it it's really about the  
11 continuation of their own ability to build their own  
12 like... we, we like to call them the, the land of Tweed  
13 where everyone builds their own little castles and is  
14 never... no student of New York City schools may enter  
15 and its sad that I'm out here testifying this way but  
16 we are asking for your help to try to finally just  
17 say enough is enough with this, stop and if you  
18 can't... if you're going to continue to just hire  
19 people and blame this one and no one is held  
20 accountable then we're going to have to go a  
21 different route in terms of what we want from our  
22 school system overall because this is what I do know,  
23 the teachers, the students they are the ones who now  
24 have our school system at it's highest performance  
25 level ever... [cross-talk]

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Correct... [cross-talk]

MICHAEL MULGREW: ...they are the ones and if you can go to... into almost any school in New York City and if you ask them what would you want or what do you want from the Department of Ed central they will tell you to... for them to stay away and that's the problem we have.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you, we're going flag... we have a question from Council Member Kallos and then Rosenthal.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you for being here today as well as the work you do on behalf of tens of thousands of... [cross-talk]

MICHAEL MULGREW: Thank you... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: ...teachers. Today Taylor Davis is a student at Wagner Middle School and he's home today because other students put a noose of yarn around his neck taunting him with a... what they said quote, "this is what your ancestors went through", end quote. I asked Chancellor Carranza if he would come and meet with this student and their parent, he, he has agreed to do so. I am curious about what teachers can do in these types of

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 situations, what positive learning collaborative can  
3 do, what the BRAVE anti bullying initiative could  
4 have meant in this situation and whether you'd be  
5 open to joining us and seeing what we can do to help  
6 this child and their family in a community that is in  
7 pain?

8 MICHAEL MULGREW: Well first, thank you  
9 for bringing this up because more people need to be  
10 talking about it and of course anything that I can do  
11 personally to help I would be there for you if you  
12 needed somewhere I would be more than happy to help  
13 get... do that work. When we talk about discipline  
14 we're usually talking about the child who has done  
15 something that has caused a discipline problem and  
16 that is very important that we continue that being  
17 part of the conversation because in the positive  
18 learning collaborative schools which you... we are now  
19 up to 25 in New York City, we have dropped  
20 suspensions down to almost nothing, they're down 82  
21 percent and we did that by first and foremost having  
22 the right people in place to do interventions, we  
23 want to know why this child did this act and we need  
24 to have a conversation about getting them to a better  
25 place. The part you don't hear in the discipline

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 debate is what happens to the child who was the  
3 victim and what happens to the other children in the  
4 classroom who have witnessed this and at the same  
5 time who have had their educational process for that  
6 at least one day disrupted greatly and those are  
7 parts of the conversation that, that have to be  
8 addressed. So, this child if he is not in a positive  
9 learning collaborative school or a school with a  
10 social worker now goes home, his guidance counselor  
11 may or may not have the time because all they're  
12 doing is paperwork to actually help that child if he  
13 was in a school with a guidance counselor. The best I  
14 could offer at this moment is that child could call  
15 the BRAVE hotline which is where I know they will... he  
16 would get access and thank you for funding and  
17 supporting that program, that child will get access  
18 to a, a clinician whether it be a psychologist or a  
19 social worker but as we talk about discipline all of  
20 this should be part of the debate and its always  
21 about school climate. We always talk about discipline  
22 as a punitive thing and I'm telling you now in  
23 schools who have addressed this and tackled this head  
24 on it is not a punitive thing, it is a process to

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 make it a positive thing and that is what, what is  
3 missing in this debate.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you and I  
5 believe the number for the BRAVE hotline is 212-709-  
6 3222?

7 MICHAEL MULGREW: Yep...

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: ...or they can text  
9 BRAVE to 43961 to just have a conversation for anyone  
10 watching at home.. [cross-talk]

11 MICHAEL MULGREW: Absolutely, they will  
12 get through directly to a psychologist or a clinical  
13 social worker and of course it's completely  
14 confidential.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you..  
16 [cross-talk]

17 MICHAEL MULGREW: And that's not just for  
18 anyone who has been a victim, that is for a parent if  
19 they're looking for some sort of support or help and  
20 that is for a friend of a... of a... of a student who  
21 they believe might need help also.

22 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right and I would  
23 just also note that in dial a teacher for example  
24 these programs are language, language accessible to  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 many languages, I think ten... at least ten or even,  
3 even higher than that... [cross-talk]

4 MICHAEL MULGREW: I think we're 17 this  
5 year... [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...yeah, 17 so...  
7 [cross-talk]

8 MICHAEL MULGREW: ...on dial a teacher..

9 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...so we, we... they  
10 definitely address the needs of all New Yorkers,  
11 definitely appreciate that. Next, we'll hear from  
12 Council Member Rosenthal.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you so  
14 much Chair Treyger, great to see you President  
15 Mulgrew thanks... [cross-talk]

16 MICHAEL MULGREW: It's nice to see you...  
17 [cross-talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: ...for all the  
19 work you do. I, I love hearing about the positive  
20 collaboration learning collaboration, we need this in  
21 all our schools..

22 MICHAEL MULGREW: Yep, we absolutely need  
23 it... [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay, nice...  
25 [cross-talk]



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

MICHAEL MULGREW: ...it's... you know when you see suspensions almost completely nonexistent, when you... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Right... [cross-talk]

MICHAEL MULGREW: ...see school communities coming together and for those who are here today listening to this that, that process is about that everyone in the school is trained through Cornell University, a TCIS program and its turn... it's... they're trained in a whole bunch of different tools which you can use and it's not just teachers, it's just... not just the administrators, it's the school security guard, the custodian, the food service workers, the entire school is trained and then they are... then they are... after they're... they go through their training it's about working as a team to create a positive learning collaborative which is what it should be.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you. I'm going to bring in some issues that are important in other agencies not DOE... [cross-talk]

MICHAEL MULGREW: Okay... [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: ...but are  
3 relevant to the things I think about as Chair of the  
4 Committee on Women and that is how sexual... issues of  
5 sexual harassment are addressed in any agency or for  
6 the NYPD how they address and how they work with  
7 victims of sexual assault and the main tools are ones  
8 that where you are taught about respect for each  
9 other... [cross-talk]

10 MICHAEL MULGREW: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: ...for each  
12 other's space and understanding better what someone  
13 who's been traumatized has gone through if we're  
14 talking about sexual assault or for sexual harassment  
15 learning how to listen better and come up with fair  
16 solutions. I'm wondering... literally this question  
17 comes with no judgment, you, you really need to  
18 understand that, the reason I love the stop sexual  
19 harassment in New York City act which the Speaker got  
20 passed into law last year is because it throws light  
21 on the issue. So, I love that you can document that  
22 suspensions have gone down 82 percent and... [cross-  
23 talk]

24 MICHAEL MULGREW: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: ...that's a wonderful finding, I would be so interested to know if in those schools similarly there are fewer complaints made of sexual harassment that by creating this positive learning environment you've created mutual respect among the staff and as you said administration, custodial workers, could you... is that a fair... [cross-talk]

MICHAEL MULGREW: I could ask... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: ...thought... [cross-talk]

MICHAEL MULGREW: ...the team who... our wonderful team who works with so many of you to put that together because now that you've asked this question I'm quite interested to see exactly what that number looks like because I'm optimistic that your hypothesis might be correct.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you very much for all your hard work on behalf of the teachers and of course all our students.

MICHAEL MULGREW: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Council Member Levin.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very  
3 much Chair, thank you President Mulgrew. I just want  
4 to ask a little bit about... you mentioned in your  
5 testimony support for homeless students and the... and  
6 the social workers bridging the gap social workers.  
7 How... what type of interventions do you hear your  
8 membership teachers doing for homeless students or  
9 students in temporary housing of which one in ten  
10 students in New York City... [cross-talk]

11 MICHAEL MULGREW: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: ...is in temporary  
13 housing, they... you know the, the needs of students in  
14 temporary housing far exceeds their stably housed  
15 counterparts because of a variety of issues; mental  
16 health issues, practical issues of being able to get  
17 to school, attendance is ten percent lower for  
18 students in temporary housing than it is for, for the  
19 average across the city and I know that teachers go  
20 above and beyond for these students... [cross-talk]

21 MICHAEL MULGREW: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: ...and so I was  
23 curious if there's anything in addition to the social  
24 workers that we could be doing in helping your

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 membership support students that are living in  
3 temporary housing?

4 MICHAEL MULGREW: Well the... this is  
5 something we have been testifying about for years,  
6 way before people realized what a real issue it was  
7 and a problem that we had as a city and it continued  
8 to grow over... way over a decade. The challenges that  
9 a student in that situation face are unimaginable so  
10 the, the first thing we tried to do is identify them,  
11 see what we can do on behalf of them if they're in a  
12 school where we're running programs like a community  
13 learning school we will reach out to the family  
14 itself so that we can first start helping them just  
15 on basic food needs as well as financial literacy  
16 needs and what we had found out is that, that  
17 everybody runs around talking about financial  
18 literacy but financial literacy courses are designed  
19 for people who are not in homeless situations so  
20 you're... that, that is... the need there is a family in  
21 an economic crisis how do you help stabilize them so  
22 that you can get them on that path... [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Right... [cross-  
24 talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 MICHAEL MULGREW: ...and then the other  
3 thing that we do is they... by working with advocacy  
4 groups is trying to get the city services that are  
5 supposed to be there to these families, what we would  
6 like, I've always said this especially when I'm here  
7 inside of City Hall is that the idea that families  
8 have to go out of their way to go find these services  
9 makes no sense. We know where the schools are with  
10 the largest populations of children in these service...  
11 in these situations why not invite the parents there  
12 so that on one day we show up, the city shows up with  
13 all the services and we're going... we're going to get  
14 it done right here and now, you don't have to travel  
15 to another borough, we're going to make sure all the  
16 need... everything you need in terms of the forms you  
17 need to fill out and everything else is all here and  
18 we're going to take care of it right now and that's  
19 the way it should be because we keep running into...  
20 the attendance clearly is a problem to begin with but  
21 also attendance is exacerbated because a parent might  
22 have to take a day off and because they won't be  
23 there to pick up their child they have to take the  
24 children out of school and travel to another borough  
25 in order to get them to the agency where they're

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 supposed to be, this whole thing if we could just  
3 figure out the service needs to be where the people  
4 are, you shouldn't have to drive people from all  
5 different places across our city to go find one  
6 office. We should do it like a bookmobile, if you  
7 remember those, if you are... [cross-talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Uh-huh... [cross-  
9 talk]

10 MICHAEL MULGREW: ...my age or... if you  
11 remember bookmobiles would show up and just say here  
12 you want to... you want to borrow a book, borrow a  
13 book, we should be doing this with our city services.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: In the community  
15 learning schools is that... do, do you find that that's  
16 being addressed in a... [cross-talk]

17 MICHAEL MULGREW: We coordinate... [cross-  
18 talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: ...better fashion...  
20 [cross-talk]

21 MICHAEL MULGREW: ...a lot more inside of  
22 our community learning schools, our community  
23 learning schools are not just for children in  
24 homeless situations but we've gravitated towards that  
25 because when we are faced with... when a school is

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 faced with such a high need we feel that it's our  
3 responsibility to get it there and help them so we do  
4 a lot of that work inside of our community learning  
5 schools but some of this stuff is just common sense  
6 and there is a way for the city if it could break  
7 through some of it's silos and it's agencies to do...  
8 [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Absolutely...

10 [cross-talk]

11 MICHAEL MULGREW: ...a much better job on  
12 this.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Yeah, yeah, I  
14 mean one other thing that just... that comes to mind  
15 is, is... the... we don't have enough DOE personnel at  
16 the path center which is where... path is where like if  
17 you're a homeless family or family that's  
18 experiencing homelessness... [cross-talk]

19 MICHAEL MULGREW: I am not going... [cross-  
20 talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: ...that's where  
22 you... [cross-talk]

23 MICHAEL MULGREW: ...to be here advocating  
24 for more DOE personnel from central, I'm just... sorry,  
25 I'm not going to it... [cross-talk]



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Right, right,  
3 okay. Fair enough but lastly I just want to thank  
4 your, your, your members because I know that they,  
5 they do whatever they have to do to support their,  
6 their students and that often means, you know really  
7 going above and beyond and, and putting up their own  
8 money and buying supplies if they... if the kids need  
9 it or buying food if the kids need it or, you know  
10 acting... you know as a mentor, you know really taking  
11 care of kids that, that are in desperate need and,  
12 and... [cross-talk]

13 MICHAEL MULGREW: Thank you... [cross-talk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: ...and so I, I want  
15 to acknowledge that that's a... that's a... they're  
16 heroes for doing that so... [cross-talk]

17 MICHAEL MULGREW: Yeah, they're  
18 absolutely wonderful people but the reason we're here  
19 today is they continue to do that work and they feel  
20 frustration and are bewildered because they thought  
21 that government should be paying a better role in  
22 this, thanks.

23 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yes, and in closing  
24 I just want to thank you President Mulgrew for the  
25 UFT advocacy and I just want folks to understand

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 that... I know the word teachers, you know is, is an...  
3 you know is in the UFT, their advocacy is really  
4 about the kids, children are always front and center  
5 in all of their conversations and advocacy for  
6 resources and one thing I'll flag for you President  
7 Mulgrew that I'm worried about internally and that I  
8 have my eye on the radar as well is our teacher  
9 retention rates, the number of teachers that I think  
10 after a certain number of years burn out because of  
11 the lack of... the continued lack of support from  
12 central and from others... [cross-talk]

13 MICHAEL MULGREW: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...when they see the,  
15 the system systematically continue to fail to meet  
16 the kid's socioemotional needs, I am deeply concerned  
17 about that and the shortage areas that we hear about;  
18 bilingual educators, bilingual social workers and  
19 counselors, we have a lot more work to do but I, I  
20 wish to thank you and your team for always having  
21 kids front and center in your advocacy.

22 MICHAEL MULGREW: Thank you very much and  
23 again I want to thank you for your support, for the  
24 entire Council's support on these programs that we  
25 know have actually made a difference and again I will

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 tell you this with complete assurance that the work  
3 you do with us and the money you fund goes directly  
4 to the schools, to the children, and to the teachers  
5 and... because that's where we're going to make a  
6 difference not anywhere else so thank you for  
7 everything that you've done.

8 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you President  
9 Mulgrew, thank you so much. Next panel we'll hear  
10 from Mark Cannizzaro, President of the CSA; Donald  
11 Nesbit, Vice President of Local 372, DC 37; Randi  
12 Levine, Advocates for Children of New York; Dr.  
13 Brenda Triplett, Children's Aid and Michael Schnall,  
14 Road... New York Road Runners. Okay, so guess we, we  
15 could start with President Cannizzaro I guess  
16 whenever you're ready.

17 MARK CANNIZZARO: Good afternoon and  
18 thank you for listening and, and thank you for being  
19 here for today and this Council has been extremely  
20 supportive of us and, and we truly appreciate it and  
21 Council Member Treyger we truly appreciate all the  
22 hard work and research you do in order to do this  
23 very difficult job efficiently. So, here we are  
24 again, I think I've been here several years in a row  
25 now with the same exact number one priority and

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 that's to increase fair student funding for... in the  
3 schools that are currently below 100 percent. We've  
4 heard a lot of things and, and rather than get in the  
5 weeds and you have my testimony so there's no reason  
6 to really reiterate my, my testimony, my written  
7 testimony. Just a couple of things, I would like to  
8 point out some of the things that underfunded schools  
9 typically lack. They typically lack reduced sized  
10 classes for students that need academic intervention  
11 services. They typically lack enrichment programs.  
12 They typically lack arts programs like dance, drama,  
13 the fine arts, music, etcetera and they typically  
14 lack technology but in addition to that there are  
15 safety concerns. They typically have fewer, fewer  
16 assistant principals, fewer deans and other behavior  
17 specialists, they have fewer school aid.. they have  
18 fewer school aids, they have fewer counselors and  
19 mental health professionals. The.. we have over 100  
20 schools in this city with zero assistant principals,  
21 we have school aids that are.. that, that we use to  
22 man certain exit doors and cafeterias that end up  
23 going unmanned and when I hear people say that it's  
24 up to the principal to use their budget more  
25 efficiently or more wisely it really gets me a little

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 bit angry I should say... I guess angry is the proper  
3 word because what happens is this, principals take  
4 their budget and they use it the best way they  
5 possibly can, and they hope and pray that the holes  
6 that are left are not exposed at some point. But when  
7 they are exposed the first thing that we hear is well  
8 that was the principal's decision and that's why that  
9 hole was left where it was, that's why this child  
10 walked out a back door and was undetected, that's  
11 why... while someone got hurt, that's why this  
12 particular reading program that we would love to have  
13 in this school is not there and that's something that  
14 I'm getting a little bit tired of hearing and what  
15 I'm asking people to start asking back is how is that  
16 school funded. When you tell me why that... when you  
17 tell me why something happened and you blame someone  
18 in that building whether it's a teacher or anyone  
19 else in that building ask the question how is that  
20 school funded and how is it funded according to your  
21 own formula. With all that said I just have to ask  
22 for one more thing from this Council, you have been  
23 extremely generous in supporting our school leaders  
24 with professional development through our ELI or  
25 Executive Leadership Institute Program, our Executive

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 Leadership Institute program is one of the only  
3 professional development programs for school leaders  
4 around this country. We're very proud of it, we're  
5 very proud of the work we do, we've invited many  
6 Council Members to come see it and we provide  
7 opportunities for our brand new assistant principals  
8 to learn the nuts and bolts of the job, we provide  
9 opportunities for our seasoned assistant principals  
10 to learn the nuts and bolts of becoming a principal,  
11 we have many, many single work... single topic  
12 workshops and we've recently added some real  
13 comprehensive workshops on socioemotional learning,  
14 creating an LGBTQ inclusive environment and  
15 addressing cyberbullying and bullying in our schools.  
16 So, we're going to be asking and, and you'll see in  
17 the written testimony for a modest increase in that  
18 funding this year and we know that this is a  
19 difficult, difficult year as far as funding is  
20 concerned but as President Mulgrew said the funds  
21 that we get go directly to our schools, there's no  
22 administrative costs, there's nothing else, it goes  
23 directly into our schools to support our leaders and,  
24 and they desperately need the kinds of professional

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 and the quality professional development that we  
3 offer. So, once again thank you so much.

4 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I, I appreciate  
5 that and we're going to go through the entire panel  
6 but I just want to flag very quickly the institute  
7 that you're referring to President Cannizzaro I  
8 witnessed this myself with my own two eyes because my  
9 principal when I was a teacher was... who was highly  
10 effective and very helpful to me professionally was a  
11 leader for other up and coming leaders and folks we  
12 want good educators preparing future leaders for our  
13 schools. Under the Bloomberg model it was the  
14 business world, no, no, we want education folks,  
15 educators preparing future school leaders and so I, I  
16 saw the effectiveness myself and I, I am a big  
17 supporter, a big fan so thank you and we'll have some  
18 more questions afterwards but next panelist.

19 DON NESBIT: Good afternoon Education  
20 Committee Chair, Councilman Treyger and the  
21 distinguished members of the Committee. I am here  
22 today on behalf of the 24,000 local 372 members under  
23 district council 37 as me under the leadership of  
24 President Shaun D. Francois to provide testimony on  
25 the Mayor's proposed budget for education. The 24,000

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 members of Local 372 perform essential support  
3 services to help 1.2 million school children of New  
4 York City be learning ready. Our school crossing  
5 guards make sure that children cross the street  
6 safely, our school aids are with students throughout  
7 the day, they greet the children in the morning,  
8 engage in numerous activities with them, support  
9 their educational development and help the children  
10 get to their buses at the end of the day. Our school  
11 lunch employees unload, prepare and serve food every  
12 day including during the summertime. Our community  
13 titles; parent coordinators, our community titles and  
14 paraprofessionals work with parents and advocate the  
15 Department of Education and work with the Department  
16 of Homeless Services to make sure that children not  
17 only get to school but that they have a place to  
18 sleep at night. Our substance abuse prevention and  
19 intervention specialists work with students in mental  
20 health, anti-gun violence, anti-bullying, gang  
21 prevention and, and medication.. meditation in  
22 schools... mediation in schools, excuse me. Before any  
23 further discussion I would like to thank the Mayor,  
24 the Chair and the members of this Committee again for  
25 recognizing the importance of investing money in New



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 York City schools, however there are some  
3 deficiencies. School children need food in order to  
4 concentrate and learn in the classroom. An example of  
5 that was when the Council and the Mayor's Office  
6 implemented the breakfast in the classroom program  
7 but staffing standards and current guidelines spread  
8 school lunch employees too thin... too thin between the  
9 breakfast in the classroom program and preparing  
10 lunch for the students. Local 372 members are  
11 extremely supportive of the programs but again they  
12 are spread too thin. In a recent report in the Daily  
13 News it was discussed the times that kids are eating,  
14 right, so just imagine we're preparing for breakfast  
15 in the classroom and right after that we have lunch  
16 for kids at nine o'clock in the morning, right. It's  
17 back to back. An additional struggle for school lunch  
18 employees is the direct impact to sanitation and  
19 hygiene in the school cafeterias when we have no AC.  
20 In the report... in a report by Councilman Lander we  
21 went into the details but I'm just going to go  
22 briefly, you have the testimony. We also represent  
23 family workers who work in the shelters and provide  
24 assistance to the children and their families. We  
25 have community titles who work, our parent

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 coordinators work closely with the parents to provide  
3 some of the avenues in where they can get resources,  
4 they work as a, a liaison. We have school crossing  
5 guards who are out there and dedicated but we still  
6 have too many posts that are not manned and is  
7 unsafe, conditions for kids leaving school and coming  
8 to school and with the homeless crisis in the city I  
9 just want to be clear that not only the kids that are  
10 in temporary housings but we have our members who a  
11 lot of times in Local 372 we have members who come to  
12 us and tell us while servicing kids we have to return  
13 to sleeping on the train at night and it's just a sad  
14 state when someone who is working for the city of New  
15 York has to go sleep on a train because they have  
16 nowhere to live and they can't afford rent. But we  
17 thank the Council for their efforts and your support  
18 in working with us and the continued support and we  
19 will continue to work to solve some of these problems  
20 together. Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you so much,  
22 thank you.

23 RANDI LEVINE: Thank you for the  
24 opportunity to speak with you today about the fiscal  
25 year 2020 preliminary education budget. My name is

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 Randi Levine and I'm the Policy Director at Advocates  
3 for Children of New York. For more than 45 years  
4 Advocates for Children has worked to ensure a high-  
5 quality education for New York students who face  
6 barriers to academic success focusing on students  
7 from low income backgrounds. You have our written  
8 testimony with detailed information about our budget  
9 recommendations, I will discuss them briefly today.  
10 First, during the 2017 to 2018 school year 114,659  
11 students in New York City schools were identified as  
12 homeless, if these students made up their own school  
13 district it would be twice the size of the entire  
14 Boston public school system and our written testimony  
15 has information about the needs and the abysmal  
16 educational outcomes of these students. We were  
17 pleased that the administration invested 11.9 million  
18 dollars for DOE support for students living in  
19 shelters including 53 bridging the gap social workers  
20 at schools with high populations of students living  
21 in shelters and literacy programs at shelters after  
22 school in the fiscal year 19 budget and that the City  
23 Council added two million dollars in discretionary  
24 funding for an additional 16 bridging the gap social  
25 workers. These social workers have had a significant

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 impact and that's why we dismayed to see that the  
3 fiscal year 20 preliminary budget does not include  
4 any funding to continue this admin... this initiative.  
5 The administration must restore and baseline this  
6 funding but must go further and increase it. We still  
7 have 100 schools in the city with 50 or more students  
8 living in shelter and no bridging the gap social  
9 worker and we need to make sure that this year we end  
10 the budget process with funding for at least 100  
11 bridging the gap social workers. Our written  
12 testimony has information as well recommending an  
13 education support center at Path so that DOE staff  
14 can meet with families who are applying for shelter  
15 as well as for some additional support for students  
16 in temporary housing. Next, we've heard a lot today  
17 about the need to increase strategic school climate  
18 investments and supports that help students and  
19 school communities and help dismantle the school to  
20 prison pipeline. Week after week we get calls from  
21 parents of students with emotional, behavioral and  
22 mental health disabilities who are not getting the  
23 targeted, trauma informed and restorative supports  
24 they need in school and instead are removed from  
25 class, suspended, handcuffed, arrested and taken away

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 by EMS when medically unnecessary. These are not the  
3 right responses for our schools to have in response  
4 to student behavior. And so we're recommending an  
5 expansion of the number of social workers in the  
6 fiscal year 20 budget, at least 20 million dollars to  
7 add at least 150 full time social workers for high  
8 needs schools, expanding whole school restorative  
9 practices to 100 additional schools and investing in  
10 a mental health continuum to provide direct mental  
11 health support to students with significant mental  
12 health needs, this was a recommendation of the  
13 Mayor's leadership team on school climate and school  
14 discipline, it is ready to go we just need the  
15 funding for it. Third, the DOE has long overlooked  
16 the needs of students in foster care, you'll be  
17 hearing more about that today from a couple of my  
18 colleagues but we are joining with nearly 30  
19 organizations to recommend that the DOE better  
20 support students in foster care by providing bus  
21 service for kindergarten through sixth students in  
22 foster care and establishing a DOE office focused on  
23 students in foster care because currently in the  
24 entire DOE bureaucracy there is not a single staff  
25 member focused on this population of students. We

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 want to ensure that there's a Preschool special  
3 education class for every child with a disability who  
4 needs one as there is currently a shortage of these  
5 seats and we're currently violating the civil rights  
6 of these children and wasting an opportunity to  
7 intervene early in their lives. And finally, I just  
8 want to thank the City Council for your leadership  
9 and support on the issue of school accessibility, we  
10 were very pleased to see 750 million dollars proposed  
11 in the five-year capital plan and want to make sure  
12 that that work continues moving forward. Again,  
13 there's more in our written testimony and we thank  
14 you so much for your leadership and time today.

15 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you so much,  
16 appreciate it, next.

17 MIKE SCHNALL: Good afternoon Chair  
18 Treyger. My name is Mike Schnall, I serve as Vice  
19 President of Government Relations and Community  
20 Investment at New York Roadrunners. Most of you  
21 probably know us best for the TCS New York City  
22 marathon but we actually have a mission to help and  
23 inspire people through running, we are the largest  
24 nonprofit provider of free youth programs in New York  
25 City schools with over 800 schools and 125,000

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 children each year taking part in our rising New York  
3 Roadrunner program. We're devoted to making physical  
4 education and fitness accessible to all children, our  
5 programs are designed for kids from Pre-K to 12<sup>th</sup> and  
6 we build their confidence, motivation and desire to  
7 be physically active for life. We have a request for  
8 500,000 dollars to be part of the physical fitness  
9 and education initiative. What I think is more  
10 important though than my words is I want to share  
11 with you the words of Kendall Holman who's an  
12 ambassador with our rising New York Roadrunner  
13 program, she couldn't take off school today, we  
14 thought it was better if she go to class so I'm just  
15 going to share with you a few inspiring words that  
16 she shared with me. She said hello my name is  
17 Kendall, I'm a rising New York Roadrunner youth  
18 ambassador, I attend PS 165 in Queens. As part of the  
19 rising New York Roadrunner program I run at least ten  
20 to 15 laps a day with my friends and classmates.  
21 While I have not run any races yet, my favorite  
22 running distance is a mile. I like running a mile  
23 because I have time to relieve stress and take things  
24 off my mind. Becoming a youth ambassador allowed me  
25 to learn how to communicate, project my voice,

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 overcome stage freight and write a speech. Last  
3 November I was given the opportunity to present the  
4 award and she got to walk across the finish line  
5 during the TCS New York City marathon opening  
6 ceremony. I was very nervous, but I maintained my  
7 confidence using the tools that I learned, I stayed  
8 professional and poised. Before becoming a youth  
9 ambassador my anxiety and stage freight would have  
10 gotten the best of me. I am proud of myself and so  
11 was my family and the New York Roadrunner staff. So,  
12 I just want to not take up too much more time but I  
13 wanted to just give you a snapshot of what running,  
14 walking and free youth programs throughout the city  
15 provided by New York Roadrunners can do to help kids  
16 get better in their... in their learning, their  
17 abilities to be healthy and well and to stay active  
18 and so we're asking for the City Council to help  
19 support us, to help support all of those kids across  
20 the city and with the support of the City Council  
21 keep increasing the number of kids that would receive  
22 the free rising New York Roadrunner program in  
23 schools across all 51 council districts. Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you so much,  
25 next.



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 BRENDA TRIPLETT: Thank you. Good

3 afternoon, my name is Dr. Brenda Triplett, I'm the  
4 Director of Educational Achievement and Partnerships  
5 at Children's Aid. I'd like to thank the Chair Mark  
6 Treyger and members of the Education Committee for  
7 the opportunity to testify on how the New York City  
8 Department of Education can strengthen services for  
9 the nearly 5,000 students who are in the foster care  
10 system. I'm a retired public-school administrator,  
11 educator having served over 35 years as a teacher,  
12 vice principal, principal, district administrator and  
13 also as a proud foster parent two times. At  
14 Children's Aid I'm charged with the task of improving  
15 the academic outcomes for nearly 500 school aged  
16 youth in foster care. Two federal laws, every child  
17 succeeds act and the fostering connections, it  
18 requires school districts and child welfare agencies  
19 to collaborate to keep students in their original  
20 schools of origin for obvious reasons, the only  
21 consistent for many of our student's place is the  
22 school. To keep them in their original schools when  
23 they enter foster care or to change for.. or when they  
24 change foster care placements which happen quite  
25 frequently. We are able to transfer schools if it is

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 in the child's best interest of course if that's what  
3 it comes down to. But I'd like to share a story about  
4 one of our families to illustrate the complexity of  
5 compliance. Four siblings who lived in and attended  
6 different schools in Woodside Queens were placed in  
7 care with our agency. We found a foster home willing  
8 to take all four siblings, but it was in the Bronx.  
9 We learned that DOE only provides bus service to  
10 students who have special transportation recommended  
11 on their IEPs, none of the four siblings had that on  
12 their... none of the four siblings had an IEP. We could  
13 also submit a request to OPT to have the children  
14 added to an existing bus route, there were no  
15 existing bus routes between woodside Queens and the  
16 South Bronx. The final option was that DOE could  
17 provide a metro card for the student to travel on...  
18 for the students to travel on public transportation  
19 to and from school. A Children's Aid staff member  
20 actually made a personal commitment to this family to  
21 wake up every morning at 5:30 a.m. to pick the  
22 children up from their foster parent's home in the  
23 Bronx and transport them to the Queens school for the  
24 remaining three months of the school semester. In the  
25 afternoons other staff members took turns picking the

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 children up from school. Sacrifices like these are  
3 being made every day at agencies across the city to  
4 reunify families and to keep children safe. So, I...  
5 it's critical for the city to invest in the  
6 infrastructure to tackle the barriers to learning  
7 that students in foster care experience and  
8 Children's Aid is in support of the following  
9 recommendations. One is to include five million  
10 dollars annually for bus service or other door to  
11 door transportation for students in foster care who  
12 are in grades kindergarten through sixth grade and  
13 then secondly, establish a DOE office for students in  
14 foster care at 1.5 million. Thank you again for the  
15 opportunity to testify on this very, very important  
16 issue dear to my heart and I'd be happy to answer any  
17 questions. Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Absolutely, I just  
19 want to note for, for the public and for the record  
20 that the DOE spends over 1.2 billion dollars on  
21 school bus contracts and yet they're fall... they're  
22 falling short and they fail to provide transportation  
23 for students in foster care, that is unacceptable,  
24 that is unacceptable. Budgets are not just numbers;  
25 they are a document that reflect values. In our city

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 we value all of our children and so the Mayor is  
3 going to have to match his rhetoric with his budget  
4 documents. Some of my colleagues have some questions,  
5 Council Member Kallos.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you Chair  
7 Treyger, I want to start by asking a quick question  
8 to CSA President, Mark Cannizzaro, thank you for the  
9 great work you do for your members who happen to be  
10 residents of our city. Community based organizations  
11 that provide Pre-kindergarten in my district pay  
12 their workers and administrators less than their  
13 counterparts at the Department of Education public  
14 schools leading to retention problems, should people  
15 doing the same work get paid a different amount and  
16 how much would it cost to pay your members, the  
17 administrators at these locations to actually have  
18 pay parity and full disclosure I will be stepping out  
19 of here to go to a rally on the steps of City Hall on  
20 this very issue... [cross-talk]

21 MARK CANNIZZARO: Right, well thank you  
22 first of all and thank you for your support Council  
23 Member Kallos and for your support of our workers in,  
24 in daycare centers, community based organizations and  
25 as a part of this Council I know you passed a

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 resolution very, very recently to support pay parody  
3 and, and we certainly support our brothers and  
4 sisters outside rallying. The, the... our members who  
5 work in daycare centers are as qualified as our  
6 principals and assistant principals in our Board of  
7 Education Department of Education schools so of  
8 course they deserve pay parody, they are all 12 month  
9 employees, they often work incredibly long hours and  
10 they do the job with our youngest citizens and put  
11 them on the path to success. Most of our directors  
12 and assistant directors as well as the teachers in  
13 those are minority women and they are severely  
14 underpaid. So, yes of course they should be brought  
15 to parody and it would cost for our members about 15  
16 million dollars annually.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you, I  
18 think that is a rounding error in the city budget. To  
19 Donald Nesbit at DC 37, thank you very much for being  
20 here. To the extent we can get the ACs in kitchens  
21 I'm proud to work with you and the public employees  
22 occupational safe and... safety and health so I just  
23 want to know just where we are in terms of that and  
24 then to Randi Levine I want to thank you for your  
25 partnership in getting passage of a law saying that

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 we should just have a, a GPS on school busses, you  
3 can buy a smart phone for like 20 bucks now, you can  
4 put it on the busses. We just had Chancellor Carranza  
5 say that despite getting it done in Houston he  
6 doesn't think he can get it done in six months, six  
7 months to buy 1,400 phones and put them in the busses  
8 so parents know where their kids are, what are you  
9 going to do about it?

10 DON NESBIT: The, the AC... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Either one, I  
12 have 16 seconds for my side.

13 DON NESBIT: The, the AC first, well with  
14 the ACs we're... we've been in conversation with  
15 members of the Council, we've also been in  
16 conversation... we have another local at DC 37, Local  
17 3005 that's the School Construction Authority members  
18 who have been in deep conversations with us, they  
19 want to assist because they call us while they're  
20 fixing certain things on schools, they see the  
21 conditions that our, our members are experiencing in  
22 the kitchens and so they said ACs may be a part of  
23 the solution but there are some other things that we  
24 could work on in terms of ventilation so they're

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 working with us as well. So, the conversations have  
3 to continue. Thank you.

4 RANDI LEVINE: Thank you Council Member  
5 Kallos for all of your work on the bill and now a law  
6 to get GPS installed for... on all of our busses for  
7 all of our students, we think it's going to make a  
8 big difference. In the past two weeks I've learned a  
9 bit more about the current system that the DOE uses  
10 on some of its busses and think that the Chancellor  
11 is right to think that we should be looking for a  
12 more effective system so I am encouraged that we're  
13 not just sticking with what we have because we  
14 already have it but are giving some thought to what  
15 we actually need. With that said we would like to  
16 partner with you to make sure that we move forward on  
17 this initiative as quickly as possible and would love  
18 to have it up and running for September.

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you very much  
20 and next we'll hear from Council Member Rosenthal.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I'll keep this  
22 brief, I, I really want to thank all of you for the  
23 work that you do on behalf of our, our children. Each  
24 of you represents a different population so it's hard  
25 to focus but to our union leaders, vice President

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 Nesbit and, and President Cannizzaro I, I'm going to  
3 ask you the same question that I asked President  
4 Mulgrew which is as Chair of the Committee on Women  
5 I'm hoping that the... that, that City Hall is giving  
6 our agencies enough money to train people to work  
7 with respect for each other and to create an  
8 environment that is free of sexual harassment and  
9 whether or not... I'm wondering if you feel like that  
10 City Hall is doing a good enough job.

11 DON NESBIT: So, so far in regards to  
12 sexual harassment we know that our members were  
13 mandated to take an online course between a certain  
14 period... a time frame in which they had to respond to  
15 it or the DOE reaches out to you to tell you hey you  
16 have to do this, right, so it is a mandated thing. In  
17 terms of feedback in regard to it we haven't quite  
18 got all of the necessary feedback, but we will get  
19 that feedback and continue to have communication...

20 [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you...

22 [cross-talk]

23 DON NESBIT: ...with you guys but it is  
24 definitely necessary that people know how to work in



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 an environment with each other without these kinds of  
3 situations occurring.

4 MARK CANNIZZARO: Thank you for that  
5 question and thank you for making it back by the way.  
6 So, in, in reference to the online training all city  
7 workers have, have been mandated to, to complete that  
8 online training but, but to get back to the  
9 conversation you were having with President Mulgrew  
10 it goes beyond the training and more into the culture  
11 and climate that is created holistically not just  
12 related to harassment of any type but holistic  
13 climate and we have what I would say an uneven  
14 application across the city and, and we certainly can  
15 do a lot more to improve the climate and conditions  
16 that, that... in the workplace to make things better.  
17 I, I think the city is committed to, to getting this  
18 done but I, I also think it's, it's a larger effort  
19 and some places have further to go than others.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you for  
21 that, I'd love to follow up, I mean if there are any  
22 places where we need to push the city to focus in  
23 particular, I'm very interested in that. I mean your  
24 principals are underfunded for their schools and are  
25 asked to do too much and so, you know with so many

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 frustrations a lot of times things get left, left  
3 behind so I, I want to make sure that your principals  
4 have what they need to create the environment that  
5 everyone needs...

6 MARK CANNIZZARO: And, and thank you for  
7 that because the truth is the, the job of, of  
8 principal is undoable.. [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yep.. [cross-  
10 talk]

11 MARK CANNIZZARO: ...and something always  
12 gets left out like I... like I mentioned before,  
13 something always gets left out you just hope it's not  
14 the thing that's going to come back to you.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yeah, thank  
16 you all and Randi thank you so much for the work you  
17 do on behalf of our children, it's been a pleasure  
18 working with you.

19 RANDI LEVINE: Same here, thank you for  
20 all of your work as well.

21 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you so much,  
22 I just have a couple of quick... some quick follow up  
23 questions. President Cannizzaro I want to thank you  
24 for first really educating the Council on the  
25 significance of FSF, Fair Student Funding which in

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 turn has led to some effective advocacy and we have a  
3 lot more work to do and for the public to understand  
4 and for the children to understand that Fair Student  
5 Funding is the most effective fastest way to hire the  
6 additional counselors and social workers and  
7 psychologists in our schools, it is the biggest part  
8 of a school's budget and it's also the most flexible  
9 part that the school can hire the, the, the personnel  
10 that's most needed to meet the needs, needs of  
11 children. I do have a... just a quick question with  
12 regards to the pending... the... for the never, never  
13 ending pending MOU that we have not seen yet from DOE  
14 and NYPD. One of the concerns I've heard from  
15 principals, I'm just curious to get your thoughts on  
16 this, is that there have been times that... where NYPD  
17 has entered school buildings and the principal would  
18 have no idea as to why and according to the existing  
19 MOU NYPD can enter schools no questions asked to make  
20 arrests of students for non-school related issues or,  
21 or matters, I'm just curious to, to hear your  
22 thoughts on that and a follow up question is that,  
23 you know we, we value the role that school safety  
24 agents can play in shaping school climate, they  
25 should not dominate climate, they have a... everyone

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 has a role to play in a school community but one of  
3 the areas that I think needs significant tweaking is  
4 that right now school safety agents have no legal  
5 responsibility to really answer to a school leader or  
6 to a principal, they answer to the NYPD superiors  
7 just like in the case of custodians, principals have  
8 the power to evaluate their performance in their  
9 schools, I'd be curious to hear your thoughts on  
10 giving principals the ability to evaluate the  
11 performance of agents stationed in their buildings.

12 MARK CANNIZZARO: Well you, you mentioned  
13 the NYPD superiors and we have a terrific  
14 relationship with Commissioner Garcia and Chief  
15 Beltran both in charge of school safety and security  
16 and we meet with them on a monthly basis and, and  
17 often informally also we have direct lines with cell  
18 phone numbers and, and conversations so I, I think  
19 that the issues you discussed are sort of one offs as  
20 far as going in and principals not having any  
21 knowledge and when they do happen we have a direct  
22 line so that, that's a... that's a real positive there  
23 and we have a great working relationship with the  
24 NYPD. I think that something that the Department has...  
25 is, is lacking in this particular area is they need

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 the UFT, the CSA as well as Gregory Floyd from 237  
3 the safety office for us to sit down and have a  
4 conversation and, and they never put us all in the  
5 same room to have that conversation. As, as far as  
6 the evaluation I think that... and, and as you know we,  
7 we do that with the... with the school custodians now,  
8 that was done through collective bargaining and open  
9 and, and open dialogue and discussions, I don't think  
10 my members would have an issue doing that and in, in  
11 fact I think they already do informally do it and  
12 they meet with their superiors and, and the borough  
13 commands and, and they do have these conversations  
14 but, but I think that needs to be a conversation  
15 where we all sit down and work this out and I think  
16 it can... [cross-talk]

17 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right... [cross-talk]

18 MARK CANNIZZARO: ...be worked out  
19 amicably.

20 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yeah, I, I would  
21 agree that certain... I'm a big believer in collective  
22 bargaining and this is definitely a big, big part of  
23 that as well. The issue that I think it would help  
24 address that I saw during my tenure was that there  
25 were times where the school leaders would ask both

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 the deans and school agents to be stationed for  
3 example in terms of dismissal to get students on,  
4 onto train... subway stations safely so they can get  
5 home safely and there have been instances where  
6 sometimes agents would say I'm sorry but I don't  
7 actually report to you, I report to my NYPD superiors  
8 and there would be these turf issues between agents  
9 and school leadership and are you... have you heard of  
10 cases such as this?

11 MARK CANNIZZARO: Of, of course, you know  
12 in a system as large as this, you know you're going  
13 to have those issues but I, I do have to tell you  
14 that it's, it's not common... it's, it's a lot less  
15 common today than it was 15 years ago and, and I  
16 think that's through the efforts of, of the folks I...  
17 the leadership that I just mentioned but yeah, I mean  
18 from, from time to time there are going to be those,  
19 those type of conflicts, I'm not sure if the rating  
20 system alone would be the answer but like I said I  
21 think we should probably sit down together in, in a  
22 room and work through these type of issues and, and  
23 ultimately what it comes down to is for the safety of  
24 the kids, right, you need somebody in a certain area  
25 because you've just heard that there may be a

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 conflict in that area well that person needs to be  
3 there and, and... you know I personally I never had  
4 those issues fortunately but from time to time those  
5 things do, do arise.

6 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yes, okay well I...  
7 again I appreciate all of your powerful testimony, we  
8 have a lot more work to do in this budget and look  
9 forward to your partnership, thank you... thank you so  
10 much...

11 MARK CANNIZZARO: And we appreciate what  
12 you do as well, thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Sure. Folks we're  
14 going to take a brief ten-minute recess and we will  
15 restart shortly in ten minutes. Okay, we will return  
16 from recess. This is great, we have a student panel.  
17 First Mikali Clifton; Ornella Enoise; Rikya Theresa  
18 Kee; Jovany Nunez; and Obrian Rosario. Whenever  
19 you're ready just make sure the mic is turned on, the  
20 red light there which would signal that it's on and  
21 you may proceed and just make sure just state your  
22 name for the record before you begin.

23 ORNELLA ENOISE: Hello, okay, that's  
24 good. Good afternoon, my name is Ornella Enoise and  
25 I'm a 17-year-old senior, Youth Ambassador at

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 Bushwick Campus and an active participant at Make the  
3 Road Brooklyn. So, when I walk into the campus I'm  
4 greeted by uneasy stares and impatient shouting  
5 reminding me to make sure I don't have keys, a belt  
6 or anything on me that would alert the walk-through  
7 metal detector. Unfortunately for me about a week ago  
8 I forgot my counselors not cops pin was under my  
9 sweater and was subjected to a hand wand because I  
10 couldn't find out what was making me go off as I  
11 walked through. Over the four years of going to this  
12 school I was never hand wanded and was very confused.  
13 The SRO that hand wanded me didn't tell me what was  
14 going on and just ordered me to come towards her away  
15 from scanning. She wasn't clear on what was about to  
16 happen just told me come over here. After about four  
17 times of me asking her why and what was about to  
18 happen to me if I followed her another SRO jumped in  
19 and said you're about to get hand wanded. As I put my  
20 hands flat against the wall and separated my legs to  
21 be hand wanded I felt embarrassed, uncomfortable and  
22 criminalized. This unfortunately is an everyday  
23 occurrence for students across New York City, there  
24 shouldn't be a constant increase of money allocated  
25 into the quote, unquote "school safety". The money



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 allocated isn't being used to protect students and  
3 faculty, it's being used to criminalize and oppress  
4 the young students of color. I ask that 30 million  
5 dollars be put towards the expansion of restorative  
6 justice practices across New York City. This would  
7 ensure that the DOE hires and trains restorative  
8 justice coordinators that would help students become  
9 better people of their community and create a more  
10 safe and supportive school environment. In 2018,  
11 black and Lantin X students were 93 percent of all  
12 students who received summons, 89 percent of all  
13 students arrested and 91 percent of all juvenile  
14 reports. Suspensions continue to be a practice used  
15 today in schools; however, they continue to not work.  
16 The amount of days lost because of suspensions are in  
17 the hundreds of thousands and it's imperative that  
18 restorative justice is implemented citywide to combat  
19 this problem. That's it.

20 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Next.

21 RIKYA THERESA KEE: Good afternoon, my  
22 name is Rikya Theresa Kee and I'm a high school  
23 student in New York City, a leader in Sisters and  
24 Brothers United and the Urban Youth Collaborative. My  
25 peers and our lives extending, extend beyond being

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 students and face a slew of hardships beyond learning  
3 Pythagorean theorem. Outside of school we face  
4 bullying, economic issues, racial issues, family  
5 issues and many more devastating issues. Once we step  
6 into school, we are expected to leave those issues  
7 outside the door and become reformed human beings,  
8 that's expectation not reality. Those issues burden  
9 us along with the added stress of school work, some  
10 kids act out, others don't address their issues and a  
11 few kids talk to their teachers about their issues.  
12 Teachers that listen to these kid's issues have a...  
13 have to take on an unnecessary load of trying to  
14 provide hope for the future and assist with solving  
15 problems on top of what they actually get paid to do,  
16 teach. The current ratio of students to full time  
17 guidance counselors is one to 394 and the ratio for  
18 full time social workers is one to 860, this is an  
19 astonishing amount, yet Mayor De Blasio decided more  
20 funding for counselors and social workers was not  
21 necessary. NYC... NYC should reach a ratio of one to  
22 100 guidance counselors in high needs schools. Rather  
23 than stopping the school to prison pipeline more  
24 money is being invested in it. In, in the preliminary  
25 budget he prioritized the school safety, doubling the

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 budget for school safety infrastructure from 100  
3 million dollars to 200 million dollars and provided...  
4 and is providing more than 431 million dollars per  
5 year to the NYPD school safety division. Many may  
6 thing this investment was necessary because of the  
7 kids who they may consider to be menaces to society  
8 and believe that those kids deserve the consequences  
9 for their actions or that they deserve to be  
10 suspended, arrested and whatever else it takes. In  
11 actuality school buildings are being treated as  
12 prisons and that effects everyone in the building not  
13 only those specific kids whether you realize it or  
14 not. In 2018 black and Latin X students were 93  
15 percent of all students who received a summons, 89  
16 percent of the students arrested and 91 percent of  
17 all juvenile reports. We go to school to gain  
18 knowledge, as the saying goes knowledge is power, in  
19 actuality the implementation of knowledge is power.  
20 Mayor De Blasio has been presented with the knowledge  
21 of the issues young people of color face in schools  
22 and the statistics show his way of going about things  
23 aren't helping us. So, I am here, we are here  
24 demanding that you divest from policing of youth of  
25 young... of policing of youth of color and invest 162

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 million dollars to reach our recommended ratio of  
3 counselors in schools so that we are provided with  
4 the power we need to become thriving members of  
5 society.

6 MIKALI CLIFTON: Good afternoon, my name  
7 is Mikali Clifton and I'm a Youth Leader with the  
8 Rockaway Youth Task Force and the Urban Youth  
9 Collaborative. Mental health and communities of color  
10 are often stigmatized and frowned upon, this means  
11 that the chances of young people seeking help for  
12 mental issues are limited and rare. Schools should be  
13 a place of safety where students are not afraid to  
14 express themselves and their feelings. In the current  
15 New York City school system these youthful bursts of  
16 emotion are suppressed and mishandled by people who  
17 are incapable and inadequate for this role. These  
18 people are the school safety agents, officers and the  
19 NYPD. Guidance counselors and mental health service  
20 workers are qualified and trained professionals that  
21 can provide the emotional support and understanding  
22 that students need to deal with daily challenges in a  
23 healthy manner. The NYPD continues to be the first  
24 responders to emotional and mental health crisis in  
25 schools and communities, yet they only further

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 agitate and escalate situations. The NYPD should not  
3 be the first contact a child has in the time... in a  
4 time of crisis, they should not be delivering force  
5 to such a delicate situation and they should not be  
6 in schools to deliver this type of escalation. In the  
7 2017/2018 school year, NYPD interventions involving  
8 students in emotional distress sent to hospital for  
9 psychiatric evaluation increased by more than 31  
10 percent from the prior year from 2,702 to 3,542  
11 incidents and the NYPD continues to handcuff some  
12 children in emotional distress including some as  
13 young as five years old. ninety five percent of these  
14 interventions involve students of color, about half  
15 are... or 49.6 percent were black students. Although  
16 they compromised only 26.5... although they comprised  
17 only 26.5 percent students enrolled. Counselors and  
18 mental health service workers only are certified with  
19 the skills and attitude necessary to handle these  
20 emotionally charged situations. We, we recommend that  
21 the fiscal year 2020 budget include and baseline at  
22 least 15 million dollars per year to launch and  
23 sustain a mental health continuum. The continuum will  
24 create a network of mental health services that  
25 connect schools with the mental health network to

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 help them deescalate during crisis and create mental  
3 health support teams staffed by mental health  
4 professionals. Mental health needs to be handled by  
5 mental health experts not the police.

6 JOVANY NUNEZ: Hey everyone, my name is  
7 Jovany Nunez. Good afternoon, I forgot to say that.  
8 I'm a senior at the Academy of Innovative Technology  
9 and a Core Leader with Future of Tomorrow the Urban  
10 Youth Collaborative. My goal here today is to make it  
11 abundantly clear that in order to create safer and  
12 more inclusive school communities we must divest from  
13 policing young people of color in our schools. As a  
14 student of middle school, I was suspended for a total  
15 of 42 days, three separate suspensions and all for  
16 related incidents. In case you were wondering I was  
17 fighting since that's the question that everyone asks  
18 but no one seemed to ask the important questions like  
19 why was I fighting, am I okay, what's going on  
20 outside of school? The answer to that was no, I  
21 wasn't okay, I was dealing with the loss of my father  
22 and juggling homes, I was never fully sure where I  
23 was going to sleep at night so I acted out because I  
24 was hurting but I received no mental or emotional  
25 support and to top it off, my exclusion from the

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 classroom only made me more reluctant to go to  
3 school, I started to hate it. If we want young people  
4 like myself to be successful we have to stop the  
5 harsh discipline policies and policing that govern  
6 our schools. The city is now spending more than 431  
7 million per year on police and the NYPD school safety  
8 division that just gets bigger and bigger. This is  
9 the same division that handcuffed me after my fight  
10 and pushed me out of school. We need to support... we  
11 need the support of this City Council and we need you  
12 to listen to our vision for school safety. Not only  
13 does school policing hurt our academic achievement,  
14 it fails to make students safer, it criminalizes us,  
15 the black and Latin X students of New York City and  
16 its just racist. For example, the School Construction  
17 Authority is proposing they doubled their five-year  
18 capital plan budget for school safety and  
19 infrastructure from 100 million to 200 million,  
20 that's a ridiculous amount of money. This money will  
21 only expand the oppressive criminalizing  
22 infrastructure that includes metal detectors, video  
23 surveillance, ID card control and radio  
24 communications and more. On behalf of young people  
25 gathered here today and young people across New York

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 City, we ask that you immediately divest the more  
3 than half a billion dollars wasted annually on  
4 criminalizing and surveilling us. To sum up what each  
5 of has said we're asking that you reorganize the  
6 budget to start with a 30 million dollar investment  
7 to fund restorative practices city wide, 15 million  
8 dollar investment to launch and sustain a citywide  
9 mental health services continuum and 162 million  
10 investment to our recommended.. to reach our  
11 recommended ratio of guidance counselors in our  
12 schools. We deserve a high-quality education no  
13 matter which part of New York City we may live in.  
14 Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I want to thank you  
16 for sharing that very powerful testimony. As a former  
17 teacher it, it hit here for me and I, I want to first  
18 of all thank all of you for having the courage to  
19 come testify here at City Hall, it's, it's a  
20 courageous thing to do for young people and, and I  
21 want to say I'm sorry that the city is failing you  
22 and your peers because we are failing you in so many  
23 different ways and I think you heard earlier our  
24 exchange with the Chancellor and others that we are  
25 failing to meet the socioemotional needs of our



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 children, we are relying on personnel that is not  
3 trained to deal with your needs or to address your  
4 needs, there's an over reliance on NYPD when quite  
5 frankly as I pointed out earlier a seven year old  
6 having a bad day is not an NYPD matter, that school  
7 could use a full time social worker and a full time  
8 counselor, they don't have it. So, I just want to  
9 thank you because your advocacy and your testimony is  
10 definitely helping shape the priorities of this  
11 Council and we're not going to stop fighting until we  
12 get more social workers and counselors and meet the  
13 goal of that ratio that you talk about because there  
14 are counselors that have sometimes 700 students in  
15 their portfolio and it's impossible to provide that  
16 one on one attention which students desperately need.  
17 So, again thank, thank you all for your powerful  
18 testimony, thanks for being here today. Next panel...  
19 yes, we will have Aurora Hernandez; Casey Starr;  
20 Christina Aguirre; Gregory Brender; and students  
21 Khushayah, forgive me if I'm mispronouncing the name,  
22 Khushayah Morris. Whenever you're ready you may... you  
23 may begin. Oh, make sure the mic is on, yeah.

24 CASEY STARR: Okay, my name is Casey  
25 Starr, I'm the Assistant to the Executive Director of

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 Samaritan Suicide Prevention Center. I want to thank  
3 you for the opportunity to speak today and to  
4 acknowledge all of the support for increasing student  
5 support personnel in New York City public schools. As  
6 someone directly involved in Samaritan's delivery of  
7 suicide prevention education, we've been doing that  
8 for over 35 years and being credited as bringing that  
9 as a priority to NYCDOE. So, long before emotional  
10 first aid, safe talk assist, QPR Samaritans has been  
11 addressing the key issues faced by NYCDOE student  
12 support personnel and assisting them as they respond  
13 to the culturally and socially diverse at-risk  
14 populations that they're responsible for. Our  
15 training isn't cookie cutter, it's not one size fits  
16 all, it is designed and developed to deal with the  
17 real and timely pressing issues that guidance  
18 counselors, social workers and psychologists are  
19 facing at the moment. You don't need us to go over  
20 the statistics but I will mention one which is that  
21 eight percent of New York City high school students,  
22 that's as many as 25,000 students attempt suicide  
23 every year and you know that the frontline workers  
24 are overwhelmed, they're overstretched and they don't  
25 have the resources that they need to respond to that...

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 to that demand. So, one of the things that we've  
3 learned in training over 40,000 people is that when  
4 responding to a young person who's suicidal it's not  
5 about how much you know, it's not your knowledge of  
6 risk factors or assessment models, it's not about how  
7 much information you can give someone, how many  
8 resources you have or what referrals you can give,  
9 simply put if they don't trust you, if the young  
10 person is not comfortable talking to you, if they  
11 feel you're responding to your agenda and your  
12 paperwork more than to their needs you're not going  
13 to get very far and we see that as a huge gap in  
14 development training. So, for us preventing suicide  
15 is not about saving lives in some grandiose scheme,  
16 it's really about creating a safe environment where  
17 someone can make contact and communicate in an  
18 effective manner and get through the moment they're  
19 dealing with, this moment now and so Samaritans is  
20 looking to work with the Council to advance suicide  
21 prevention education, provide resources to the social  
22 workers we do have and hope that our sensitivity and  
23 awareness programs are adopted and mandated by  
24 NYCDOE.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 CHRISTINA AGUIRRE: Good afternoon, my  
3 name is Christina Aguirre, I'm the Program Manager at  
4 National Dance Institute also known as NDI located at  
5 217 West 147<sup>th</sup> Street. NDI was founded in 1976 by New  
6 York City ballet dancer Jacques d'Amboise and leads  
7 the field of arts education with a model program that  
8 has been studied and replicated worldwide. At the  
9 root of NDI's method is the belief that the arts have  
10 a unique power to engage children of every  
11 background, ability and socioeconomic position and  
12 motivate them toward excellence in an environment,  
13 environment of inclusivity. We utilize dance and  
14 music to instill in students a love of the arts, a  
15 passion for learning and a desire to strive for their  
16 personal best. Our program also helps foster the  
17 social development, global awareness and cultural  
18 literacy of our partners. NDI serves close to 7,000  
19 children each week through our in-school program and  
20 brings a full year of dance classes integrated with  
21 live music to students at over 41 New York City  
22 public schools. Our classes are taught during the  
23 school day alongside core curriculum, placing dance  
24 and music on par with math and science in our  
25 student's academic studies. Since inception we have

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 reached over two million children, free of charge.  
3 Arts and culture are central to the education and  
4 success of New York City's young people and has been  
5 proved by study after study. Today I'm joining with  
6 my colleagues from New Yorkers for Culture and the  
7 Arts as we ask that culture be held harmless at two  
8 million for... in funding for 2020. Thank you for  
9 allowing me to speak to you today. It's good to be  
10 here, it's my first time in this chamber and I'd like  
11 to thank the members of the Committee on Education  
12 and the city of New York for its ongoing support of  
13 cultural community. As somebody who's benefited from  
14 arts education when the arts thrive, our youth  
15 thrive, and New York City thrives.

16 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: For your first time  
17 you did a great job and we love the arts. Yes, thank  
18 you.

19 KHUSHAYAH MORRIS: Good afternoon City  
20 Council members and staff. My name is Khushayah  
21 Morris, I'm a sophomore from Tilden High School and  
22 I'm an Educational Justice Advocate with the  
23 Children's Defense Fund and a Member of Dignity,  
24 Dignity in Schools Campaign. I am here today to  
25 discuss a matter that will limit our education and

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 will take us a step back if we continue with this.

3 The matter is increasing the school's safety division

4 expense budget by 30 million and increasing the

5 school's security capital budget by 100 million. Why

6 would we want to pay for... why would we want to pay

7 more for what students say is hurting them like more

8 school safety and more metal detectors and more

9 punitive measures? We should invest in more

10 restorative alternatives to ensure that if there is a

11 problem that it can be solved in a more understanding

12 way. I'm a student in the district 18, where the city

13 stated a project in bringing restorative practiced to

14 all schools in my district. I have never heard or

15 witnessed restorative practices happening in my

16 school but there are resources that we want and need,

17 and I know that we must have much, much more support

18 to make this work. As a teenager when I find myself

19 in a problem, handling it in an aggressive only makes

20 it more stressful for me and most students feel the

21 same way, most even feel pressured and that's no way

22 to fix a problem. Students need more of a shoulder to

23 lean on in times like this. We must push towards a

24 budget that funds restorative resources, including

25 more guidance counselors, more social workers and

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 more school psychologists, psychologists. There is so  
3 many capital budget demands that our school needs  
4 instead of more surveillance equipment, like fixing  
5 up schools simply things like repairing walls,  
6 bathrooms, hallways, and making schools more  
7 accessible so that we can actually feel welcomed like  
8 we belong and are safe... in a safe school. There is no  
9 doubt in my mind if we take better actions that are  
10 more understanding and not punitive it can really go  
11 a long way. It all starts with fixing this year's  
12 budget. If we don't change the amount of money that's  
13 going to the NYPD and not schools, it shows that the  
14 student's voices are not being heard and we're being  
15 ignored. Thank you for your time and please help make  
16 the change.

17 AURORA HERNANDEZ: Good afternoon, my  
18 name is Aurora Hernandez and I'm a Parent Coordinator  
19 at Frederick Douglass Academy V in the Bronx. I would  
20 like to first thank Chair Treyger and the Committee  
21 on Education for the opportunity to speak to you  
22 today about Urban Advantage, which, which is a  
23 citywide science education program unlike anything  
24 else in the country. Because of Urban Advantage,  
25 thousands of New York City middle school children are

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 in classrooms receiving high quality science  
3 education, which I have seen personally in my role as  
4 a parent coordinator. My role as a parent coordinator  
5 has been to make sure that all of our families in the  
6 communities that are underserved know about science  
7 and how does that happen? Through Urban Advantage  
8 I've been able to bridge the socioeconomic gap by  
9 providing opportunities to our families to attend the  
10 partnering institutions for free. I do a... twice a  
11 year, I do a trip on a Saturday and the criteria is  
12 that the parents have to come with their students and  
13 they get to experience for free and I say free  
14 because it is a hardship, economic hardship for a lot  
15 of our families to be able to go to the museum of  
16 American history, the Bronx Zoo and some of the other  
17 partnering institutions. Urban Advantage began 15  
18 years ago in 2004, thanks to the leadership and  
19 support of the City Council Speaker and the New York  
20 City Council. Over the years, the City Council has  
21 continued supporting the program as it has expanded  
22 from middle school... sorry, I forgot... to now being in  
23 nearly half of all New York City middle schools.  
24 Urban Advantage is a partnership between the city's  
25 Department of Education and eight of New York City's



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 science rich, rich institutions; the American Museum  
3 of Natural History, the Bronx Zoo, New York Aquarium,  
4 New York Hall of Science, Queens Botanical Garden,  
5 Brooklyn Botanical Garden, New York Botanical Garden,  
6 and the Staten Island Zoo. Urban Advantage has given  
7 families in under resourced communities the  
8 opportunities to participate in educational programs  
9 and to visit these partnering institutions. For  
10 example, some of our families live directly across  
11 the street from the Bronx Zoo and have never had the  
12 chance to visit and learn from this institution  
13 because of economic hardship but because of the Urban  
14 Advantage Program we have been able to create a  
15 better understanding of science not only for our  
16 students but their families as well. It is key and  
17 essential to continue to support our students and  
18 their families through the Urban Advantage Program  
19 because it opens doors for our students in the field  
20 of science. We live in a time of constant scientific  
21 discovery and change for our students. The way you  
22 and I learned science as students is no longer enough  
23 to prepare them for college and careers in science.  
24 Urban Advantage partner... excuse me, partnerships give  
25 students opportunities to conduct hands on

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 investigations that engage them in science as a way  
3 of thinking and investigating, instead of just  
4 learning from a book. Quite simply, the way to learn  
5 science is to do science and Urban Advantage is  
6 giving teachers high quality professional development  
7 and teaching resources so that their students can do  
8 science. With these incredible scientific  
9 institutions in our neighborhoods, it is crucial that  
10 we continue these partnerships so that all students  
11 can get the benefits and the recipients are public  
12 school students; 84 percent of students being served  
13 in Urban Advantage are either black, Latino or Asian  
14 and 49 percent are female. Now, we are asking for the  
15 Council's support for the Urban Advantage as we  
16 continue the middle school program but also as we  
17 expand our work in elementary schools. Three years  
18 ago, UA launched an elementary pilot program in  
19 grades three, four and five with 20 schools  
20 participating. We see that there is a demand for more  
21 science education for elementary learners. With your  
22 support, we hope to expand UA's work with elementary  
23 grades to many more schools, teachers and students.  
24 It begins with an investment in those students which  
25 is what we are asking this Council to do. With your

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 help, we can continue expanding science education  
3 across all boroughs and into the younger grades so we  
4 can begin building on children's interest in science  
5 as early as 3<sup>rd</sup> grade. Thank you Chair Treyger and  
6 the members of the Committee for the opportunity to  
7 appear before you and just a quote from Frederick  
8 Douglass, "it is easier to build strong children than  
9 to repair broken men". Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you very  
11 much, great job, thank you so much. Mr. Brender.

12 GREGORY BENDER: Thank you so much for  
13 the opportunity to testify and thank you also for  
14 your great leadership around salary parity for early  
15 childhood educators, I just came from the press  
16 conference at which you spoke and we're really  
17 grateful for all your strong support and leadership  
18 on this issue. My name is Gregory Brender, I'm from  
19 United Neighborhood Houses. We are New York City's  
20 federation of settlement houses and our member  
21 agencies provide a wide range of services from early  
22 childhood education to after school to senior centers  
23 to job training and adult literacy. And today I  
24 really just wanted to focus on early childhood  
25 education and particularly the two, two requests for

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 proposals that DOE has just released for contracted  
3 early childhood programs as well as two more that  
4 they're going to release. We along with our members  
5 who have been providing early childhood education for  
6 over a century have started really a comprehensive  
7 review of these RFPs and at this point have to  
8 conclude that there's at least five major problems  
9 we've identified that make these RFPs unworkable and  
10 there's a longer testimony that I'll submit that has  
11 all of the information on each but the issues are  
12 that one, it fails to address the, the salary  
13 disparities between the teachers, staff and directors  
14 in the community based organizations and their  
15 counterparts in the Department of Education really  
16 undermining the call for a unified system that's been  
17 central to the Mayor's campaign around early  
18 childhood. Second, it includes... it fails to include  
19 cost escalators, these are eight year contracts so  
20 there should be a reasonable expectation that things  
21 like rent and building maintenance will increase over  
22 time and similarly because some of these programs are  
23 transferring from ACS which is part of the human...  
24 which... as part of the human services COLA to DOE  
25 there's not even those cost escalators for the basic

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 COLA for the staff. Third, the two RFPs that have  
3 been released already, the birth to five RFP and the  
4 head start RFP, do not fund indirect costs. These are  
5 programs that require a significant amount of  
6 management. For example, the, the early childhood  
7 quality framework that DOE has just... that DOE has  
8 just published has 78 separate indicators and the  
9 2018 head start performance standards are 172 pages  
10 long. These are programs that need a significant  
11 amount of oversight and management. Fourthly, these...  
12 the proposals go back to the pay for enrollment  
13 system whereby programs actually reduce... have their  
14 funding reduced if there's a slight dip in  
15 enrollment, this has been something that was... been  
16 from... deeply problematic and was actually eliminated  
17 earlier by the De Blasio Administration and we're  
18 very deeply, deeply shocked to see it come back in  
19 full... in the form of this new RFP. And lastly, the  
20 reorganization of extended day programs what we would  
21 now call early learn programs, splits the day into  
22 what they're calling core and non-core hours, where  
23 essentially the six hours and 20 minutes of a pre-  
24 kindergarten or 3-K education are considered core  
25 hours and then there's non-core hours with lower

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 staff qualifications and expectations. This really  
3 goes against the model of early childhood education  
4 that understands children are always learning that  
5 their interactions throughout the day are important  
6 and thank you again for all your leadership on this  
7 issue and the opportunity to testify.

8 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you Mr.

9 Brender, I just came back from recess but I spoke at  
10 the press conference because it really... it really is  
11 just shocking and appalling that this is even an  
12 issue the fact that the educators who teach in UPK  
13 classes or early learn or now the expansion of 3-K  
14 are grossly underpaid compared to their DOE under,  
15 under... counterparts and work longer hours, longer  
16 days but the requirements to teach are the same...

17 [cross-talk]

18 GREGORY BENDER: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...the Mayor has been  
20 publicly saying at a number of TV shows as he... as he  
21 is traveling the country that there's a lot of wealth  
22 in this country but it's in the wrong hands that's  
23 what I call chutzpah for a person who oversees a 92  
24 billion dollar budget, for a person who has a lot of  
25 power and the city charter gives the Mayor a lot of

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 power in overseeing and managing and administrating  
3 our budget. So, you oversee, and you administer a 92-  
4 billion-dollar budget and you still cannot resolve  
5 the issue of parody for educators, that is what we  
6 call in southern Brooklyn chutzpah. So, we stand in  
7 solidarity with you and, and your members, we know  
8 this is an issue not just in terms of the financial  
9 impact it has for the educators, but it is  
10 destabilizing in those... in those classes...

11 GREGORY BRENDER: Absolutely.

12 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Because... yes, if  
13 you want to just elaborate on that.

14 GREGORY BRENDER: Oh, I was just going to  
15 joke that I'm from Queens and we think it's chutzpah  
16 too.

17 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yes, Queens... yeah,  
18 the five boroughs would agree this is chutzpah. It is  
19 destabilizing for those... for those classes for  
20 children because for children... when you're at that  
21 age, that, that tender age of four or three or from...  
22 this is... from birth now to five all the programs  
23 these are the formative years of, of the children's  
24 lives and we're working so hard to help build trust  
25 with them and adults. It's hard for parents, you know

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 on the first day of school to even let go of their  
3 children and there's, there's a period of time of  
4 transitioning that has to happen and occur. Imagine  
5 to have to go through that over and over and over  
6 again and try to explain to your child why the adult  
7 that you, you grew bonds with is no longer there...  
8 [cross-talk]

9 GREGORY BRENDER: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...and for some  
11 children who face enormous challenges at home school  
12 in many cases is the only stabilizing force in their  
13 lives and to make them confront that unnecessary  
14 challenge in their school which is supposed to be  
15 their sanctuary that's just not acceptable. So, we  
16 are not going to stop fighting until we get this done  
17 once and for all, this Council is very vocal, we're  
18 not shy... [cross-talk]

19 GREGORY BRENDER: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

20 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...we know the money  
21 is there. He's not telling us where he's moving money  
22 around but at the end of the day if he wants a budget  
23 passed he has to work through this Council and so  
24 we're, we're going to work very hard on this issue  
25 Mr. Brender so I appreciate that and I appreciate



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 your testimony of all of the wonderful service  
3 providers, students great job as well. This, this is  
4 some powerful testimony on behalf of our kids, thank  
5 you so much, appreciate you all...

6 GREGORY BRENDER: Thank you so much.

7 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Sure. Next panel  
8 Oumou Kaba; Juliette Verrengia, forgive me if I'm  
9 mispronouncing it; Sarah Sanchala; Jenny Veloz; Aaron  
10 Bouska; and Brittany, I think for Girls for Gender  
11 Equity. Okay, so whenever everyone is ready just  
12 state your name and make sure the mic is on and you  
13 may proceed.

14 BRITTANY BRATHWAITE: Hello, my name is  
15 Brittany Brathwaite, I'm the Organizer and Innovation  
16 Manager at Girls for Gender Equity. Good afternoon  
17 Chair Treyger, Council Members, staff of the  
18 Committee of Education. Thank you for holding this  
19 important hearing regarding the city budget as it  
20 relates to education. GGE is an intergenerational  
21 youth development and advocacy organization based in  
22 New York City, committed to the physical,  
23 psychological, social and economic development of cis  
24 and trans girls and gender non-conforming youth of  
25 color. We are also proud members of the Dignity in

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 Schools Campaign and the Sexuality Education Alliance  
3 of New York City. Over the past two years, we have  
4 watched the nation respond to the call of the me-too  
5 movement to end sexual violence once and for all. The  
6 City Council held hearings about sexual harassment in  
7 the workplace last year resulting in widespread  
8 policy changes and trainings across all city  
9 agencies. However, there was one place that was  
10 forgotten in that call to action and that was  
11 schools. Schools are the workplaces of young people.  
12 Sexual harassment and violence is pervasive in our  
13 society and the school system for young people. One  
14 in four young women experience sexual assault before  
15 the age of 18. For black girls these numbers are even  
16 more striking, six in ten black girls report being  
17 sexually assaulted before their 18<sup>th</sup> birthday. Our  
18 2017 report, the School Girls Deserve, which surveyed  
19 over 100 girls and gender non-conforming youth of  
20 color in New York City public schools revealed that  
21 one in three students experience some form of sexual  
22 harassment in school. While they reported  
23 experiencing sexual harassment to our research team,  
24 they did not report it to their schools, most  
25 revealing they did not know who to report it to and

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 think... or they thought that nothing would be done.

3 Title IX is a section of federal law that was created

4 to protect students from gender discrimination,

5 sexual harassment and violence in school. The city

6 has not prioritized compliance. New York City

7 currently has one title IX coordinator for 1.1

8 million students in over 1,800 schools. We've heard

9 that because New York City is such a large school

10 district, this is appropriate and that liaisons or

11 pseudo coordinators are a practical model for dealing

12 with sexual harassment and violence, we believe this

13 response is insufficient and underscores the gender

14 equity and sexual violence are not a priority for the

15 New York City Department of Education. Without

16 sufficient staff with the exclusive responsibility of

17 doing the work to prevent and respond to sexual

18 harassment, we believe that students will go

19 unprotected. In fact, other large school districts do

20 not see it that way. Chicago Public School District

21 has one third of our student population around

22 300,000 students and has a team of 20 full time staff

23 solely dedicated to title IX training, compliance,

24 coordination and investigations. Today we're calling

25 on the New York City Council and the Department of

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 Education to support our budget ask to fund seven  
3 full time title IX coordinators at the citywide  
4 borough offices formerly known as field support  
5 centers, to ensure better protections and supports  
6 for young people and create school environments that  
7 are one day free of sexual discrimination, sexual  
8 harassment and sexual violence. We would like to  
9 ensure that no student misses out on their education  
10 that they deserve because of gender based violence.  
11 Thank you again for your support on this issue and we  
12 look forward to continuing conversations about this.

13 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you so much  
14 for flagging a very, very important serious issue, we  
15 truly appreciate it, next.

16 OUMOU KABA: Hello, hello. Okay. Hello,  
17 my name is Oumou Kaba and I'm 16 years old and will  
18 be turning 17 years old tomorrow. I'm a junior at  
19 Urban Assembly School for Global Commerce. I am the  
20 first-generation high school student and I identify  
21 as an African activist. I am also a Youth Organizer  
22 with the Young Women's Advisory Council, YWAC at  
23 Girls for Gender Equity who I am here also  
24 representing today. Girls for Gender Equity is an  
25 organization that teaches young women of color and

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 gender non-conforming youth, people of color  
3 political and social justice education and then  
4 supports us in community organizing and civic  
5 engagement to advance policy that affects us. GGE  
6 also supports us socially, emotionally, and mentally.  
7 On behalf of the Young Women's Advisory Council, I  
8 would like to thank you for having myself and my  
9 organization here. I really appreciate you taking the  
10 time to hear my voice and through this I know my  
11 voice matters. I am testifying today because I want  
12 different communities to be aware of what girls of  
13 color like myself go through all the time in school  
14 and the trauma we have and can have because of this.  
15 The lack of title IX coordinators in schools prevents  
16 us from feeling safe and being able to be ourselves  
17 in school. When things happen to us, we're blamed for  
18 it and we have no one to report it to or go to for  
19 support. In my school, the school safety agents make  
20 girls feel very uncomfortable. I remember one day my  
21 friend and I were in the hallway on our way to class  
22 and one of the security guards stopped us and began  
23 to flirt and talk to us in a very nonconsensual  
24 romantic way. He looked at us in a very sexual and  
25 objectifying manner. It made me feel like I was a

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 piece of meat. He then tries to escort us to class  
3 even when we denied being escorted. This made my  
4 friend and I feel unsafe and confused. I felt like a  
5 sexual object and not a... and not a student. What left  
6 me feeling even more unprotected was that there was  
7 no one I could even share this story with. There was  
8 no one that would do anything. The people who were in  
9 my school to protect me were trying to hurt me. With  
10 the weather getting warmer I also dread going to  
11 school because I know my administrators are going to  
12 police my body and dehumanize me. Last year, when  
13 summer rolled around and I wore jeans that had rips  
14 in them, our principal instructed one of the  
15 teacher's assistants to put cardboard on my legs to  
16 cover the holes in my jeans. I was told that I would  
17 be distracting boys even though no matter what I'm  
18 wearing boys cat call in the hallways everyday and no  
19 one does anything about it. my school condones rape  
20 culture and boys are always being catered to instead  
21 of understanding the perspective of girls of color in  
22 school, they continue to victim blame us and shame  
23 us. Title IX and title, title IX and title IX  
24 coordinators are important to ensure that young women  
25 in New York City schools feel safe and protected. By

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 hiring seven full time trained title IX coordinators  
3 in New York City and including this in the budget for  
4 2020, girls of color and students of color like  
5 myself will be able to have an experience in schools  
6 that's more about what we're learning and less about  
7 what our bodies look like and what we're wearing.

8 These are just a few stories that I have experienced  
9 and even fewer than what I know about and what my  
10 peers and I have experienced. With title IX  
11 coordinators, there, there will be someone specific,  
12 specific responsible for supporting us and who we can  
13 report to when we're experiencing gender-based  
14 violence and discrimination in our schools. Students  
15 who are most vulnerable at these traumas in schools  
16 will be able to rely on someone that is trained on  
17 how to help them. I join organizations like GGE  
18 because it gives me a safe space to talk about the  
19 ways I've been a victim in school and how I can bring  
20 change to my school and community. I'm hoping that by  
21 testifying today, you take into consideration how  
22 much the lack of title IX coordinators in schools  
23 directly affects us and how you can help to change  
24 that by fulfilling our budget ask. Please remember my  
25 stories as you are moving forward and making

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 decisions that will impact myself and the other 1.1  
3 million students in New York City who are being  
4 denied their safety every day. Thank you again for  
5 having me here today.

6 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I, I, I will not  
7 forget your story, I am so sorry that this happened  
8 to you, it is outrageous. I commend you for your  
9 courage for sharing that with us, we have a lot of  
10 work to do in this area and secondly, I want to on a  
11 brighter note wish you a very happy birthday  
12 tomorrow... [cross-talk]

13 OUMOU KABA: Thank you...

14 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...and hopefully for  
15 better years ahead for you and for all of your peers  
16 because this is a very serious issue that you're  
17 raising with us here today and again it's, it's  
18 unacceptable what happened to you and thank you for  
19 being here and for sharing that story. Next.

20 JULIETTE VERRENGIA: Good afternoon and  
21 thank you Chair Treyger and the rest of the Committee  
22 for holding this budget hearing. My name is Juliette  
23 Verrengia, I'm a Social Worker and the Policy  
24 Advocacy Specialist at the New York City Anti-  
25 Violence Project. AVP houses the national coalition



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 of anti-violence programs and we're working to end  
3 violence against and within LGBTQ and HIV impacted  
4 communities across the country. Today I'm here to  
5 advocate for increased funding in the budget to hire  
6 seven more full time title IX coordinators for New  
7 York City schools. The impacts of sexual violence and  
8 harassment are severe especially for young people.  
9 High school and college students who experience  
10 sexual violence often drop out of school, switch  
11 schools, avoid areas on school property and have  
12 lower GPAs after events than before. Sexual violence  
13 has been associated with poorer physiological health  
14 outcomes including increased risk of STIs, depression  
15 and anxiety disorders, substance use and truancy. The  
16 negative impacts of sexual violence are amplified for  
17 LGBTQ students who are already targeted and  
18 discriminated against. Sexual violence happens in  
19 every state, every city and every school and this  
20 issue deserves to be prioritized for our students.  
21 The fact that there is one single title IX  
22 coordinator serving 1,800 schools and 1.1 million  
23 grade school students across New York City is simply  
24 unacceptable. This shortage is especially troubling  
25 considering the federal attacks on title IX, which if

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 passed would make it even harder for students to find  
3 support and justice after violence or harassment.

4 Title IX was created to ensure that all students are  
5 able to equitably access their education and to

6 ensure cases of violence are handled diligently and  
7 comprehensively. These are not goals that our city

8 can cut corners on. Experiencing sexual harassment  
9 and violence without institutionalized support can

10 severely alter the emotional, social, physical and  
11 educational wellbeing of survivors especially for

12 young people in crucial developmental stages

13 throughout grade school. The work of title IX

14 coordinators is essential in preventing further

15 violence and mitigating the harmful consequences of  
16 these incidents, such as the aforementioned impacts.

17 Allocating increased funding for more full time title

18 IX coordinators sends a message to New York City

19 schools, parents, and students that discrimination

20 based on gender and related sexual violence is not

21 tolerated. New York City cannot continue to fail its

22 young people by limiting access to resources and

23 support around sexual violence. I hope you take these

24 points into consideration when making your decisions

25 and thank you for your time.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 JENNY VELOZ: Good afternoon, my name is  
3 Jenny Veloz and I am here representing the Fair Play  
4 Coalition. Thank you to Chair Treyger and the  
5 Education Committee for always giving us the  
6 opportunity to speak on the critical issue of access  
7 to after school sports and how the Department of  
8 Education allocates public school athletic league,  
9 PSAL, resources. The Fair Play Coalition is a  
10 coalition of students, teachers, coaches, principals,  
11 parents, activists and advocates standing together  
12 for all high school students in New York City public  
13 schools to have equitable access to the PSAL and to  
14 all athletic fields and courts controlled by the DOE.  
15 Currently there are approximately 20,800 students who  
16 attend a school with no PSAL, PSAL team, 83.5 percent  
17 of these students are black and Latino. Black and  
18 Latino students have less access than students of  
19 other races to every single PSAL sport. We are here  
20 today to discuss the importance of ensuring that the  
21 DOE is funded to equitably distribute PSAL sports. At  
22 the end of the day the budget is always about  
23 priorities, we are asking that the Council hold the  
24 DOE accountable to literally put their money where  
25 their mouth is and fund the restructuring of the PSAL

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 to be more equitable including with capital funding  
3 for more sports facilities in underserved  
4 communities. We are asking to make our issue the  
5 priority today not tomorrow. The DOE is currently  
6 engaged with plaintiffs in a class action lawsuit  
7 over the discriminatory way sports are allocated in  
8 an attempt to try and settle the matter. For true  
9 change to occur, a systemic overhaul would need..  
10 would be required of the PSAL. The vision of our  
11 coalition shares with the plaintiffs in the lawsuit  
12 is one where the PSAL is transformed to unite under  
13 resourced, smaller or historically discriminated  
14 against schools together to play under one umbrella  
15 athletic program. These umbrella programs would  
16 expand the number of teams available to any one  
17 student and would ensure that students have the  
18 facilities, courts, fields and tracks on which to  
19 compete. This will take funding, investment, staff  
20 time, as well as patience. We hope that the DOE would  
21 have expanded funding based on plans to meaningfully  
22 transform the PSAL however, based on the physical  
23 education and fitness line in the preliminary plan  
24 and report, we are disappointed to see it appears as  
25 though it is simply business as usual, funding 1.125

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 million to the PSAL with the large majority of that  
3 going to the SSAL. Please fund PSAL with terms and  
4 conditions and provide enough funding to support the  
5 addition of staff who will be required to assist in  
6 the transition from the current discriminatory system  
7 to the future more accessible umbrella program and  
8 ensure that this chunk of money set aside for the  
9 SSAL is instead devoted to the restructuring of the  
10 entire system. Last year, the supposed division of  
11 the PSAL, known as the Small Schools Athletic League,  
12 received one million in the budget and we don't know  
13 where that... where all that money went. We have... we  
14 have told you before and we'll tell you again, that  
15 the SSAL is a farce. It is where the PSAL puts  
16 students who attend small schools, most of whom are  
17 black and Latino, to appear as though they are  
18 receiving separate but equal sports, where in  
19 reality, most SS, SSAL teams play no more than three  
20 or four games per season if that. Our coalition  
21 demands that the SSAL no longer be funded and that  
22 this one million dollars be instead invested into  
23 hiring staff to ensure that the restructuring of the  
24 PSAL to provide more equitable access, have adequate  
25 staff, management and monitoring. Finally, the

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 capital budget must include funding for the building  
3 of new sports facilities, courts, and fields in  
4 underserved areas where the continual lack of access  
5 to such facilities serves as a pretext for the PSAL  
6 to deny access to play on competitive sports teams.  
7 The capital budget appears to actually set aside less  
8 money for athletic field upgrades than previously,  
9 and we see no money devoted to ensuring that any new  
10 facilities are created or upgraded in underserved  
11 areas. Thank you.

12 SARAH SANCHALA: Hi, my name is Sarah  
13 Sanchala, I'm the Director of Government Relations at  
14 Planned Parenthood of New York City. Thank you for  
15 the opportunity to testify before you today. Planned  
16 Parenthood of New York City provides essential sexual  
17 and reproductive health care and innovative education  
18 programs throughout New York City. For many New  
19 Yorkers, PPNYC is the primary length to health care  
20 and where they turn to for their annual checkups as  
21 well as cancer screenings and sexual and reproductive  
22 health information. In addition to our clinical  
23 services, PPNYC has a robust education department,  
24 providing both youth and adult education programs to  
25 more than 25,000 New Yorkers annually. We provide

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 sexual health education programming for young people,  
3 adults, parents, caregivers and professional  
4 educators throughout New York City. Our programs  
5 provide tools and help our participants lead healthy,  
6 healthy, safe and responsible lives. We are committed  
7 to reaching young people and caring adults in the  
8 communities where they live through youth and adult  
9 peer to peer education models. We are seeking an  
10 enhancement to the reproductive and sexual health  
11 initiative which helps us meet our funding needs for  
12 education and health services including for low  
13 income patients who often have no health insurance  
14 because of immigration status or safety concerns but  
15 additionally this funding is used towards our youth  
16 health promoters program. The youth health promoters  
17 are highly trained peer educators who engage in  
18 outreach in their community and conduct interactive  
19 workshops to educate fellow youth about teen rights  
20 and access to sexual and reproductive health care.  
21 The program reaches thousands of young people each  
22 year with youth friendly information on reproductive  
23 and sexual health. Our education department also  
24 partners with schools to implement comprehensive  
25 sexuality education workshops. This workshop series

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 addresses many topics traditionally left out of some  
3 evidence-based programs including gender identity and  
4 healthy relationships. We are proud to support the  
5 city's efforts to implement inclusive and innovative  
6 programming that gives young people the reliable  
7 accurate information that they need to stay healthy.  
8 Thank you, we appreciate your support and look  
9 forward to continuing to work with you.

10 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you all,  
11 thanks to the, the entire panel for your very  
12 powerful testimony today, thank you. Next panel I  
13 think we have Rachida from Make the Road; Diane  
14 Reyes; Joscelyn Valdes; Anooj Bhandari; Kenny Olivio;  
15 Adilka Pimentel and Julie Quantum from Make the Road,  
16 Quinton. Okay, whenever you're ready just turn the  
17 mic on, introduce yourself and you get, get started.

18 ANOOJ BHANDARI: Great, thank you. Hi, my  
19 name is Anooj Bhandari and I work as the Restorative  
20 Justice Coordinator with Make the Road New York and  
21 at the Bushwick Campus Community School. Between this  
22 and the last year we've worked tirelessly to remove  
23 the school to prison pipeline from our school to  
24 instead be a pipeline of growth, transformation and  
25 opportunity. Between the last two school years alone



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 we've seen over... we've seen a 57 percent decrease in  
3 superintendent suspensions from 176 one year to only  
4 74 the next and that number continues to decrease.  
5 Along from that in one of our schools of 30 students  
6 who had multiple restorative justice interventions  
7 last year, 26 of them have not had a single incident  
8 this year. I'll add that of those students, many of  
9 them are on... many of them are students who were on...  
10 who are on IEPs, who previously were also not getting  
11 support in terms of representation during  
12 superintendent suspension hearings or proper MDR  
13 processes. While this work is largely associated with  
14 intervening during times of conflict and tension  
15 between young people I do want to shed light that as  
16 the cultural shift of restorative practices becomes  
17 more and more engrained in our communities we see a  
18 trend rising that's really beautiful and that's of  
19 students naming issues they care about and their  
20 community rising to the occasion to address them. One  
21 of our students who spoke earlier, Ornella and one of  
22 her peers Melissa, run monthly solidarity sessions  
23 for young women of color in the schools to be able to  
24 explore issues that are impacting them. Another one  
25 of our students, Shaquille single handedly leads town

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 halls that bring in the voice of his entire 230-  
3 person student class. We have students asking their  
4 teachers for circles about support systems in this  
5 school and those teachers responding ready to take  
6 part in those conversations. RJ's close association  
7 with alternatives to punitive discipline is important  
8 but it's not the complete story of restorative or  
9 transformative justice. A more complete story can be  
10 found in our school community where young people are  
11 actively making steps to create platforms for their  
12 peer's voices to be heard. As you know for many who  
13 have spoken today, the Urban Youth Collaborative has  
14 been doing years of work to outline the necessity of  
15 resources for restorative justice and this year along  
16 with parents, educators, and advocates they're  
17 demanding a 30-million-dollar commitment in the  
18 Mayor's budget. I hope that the Council can, can  
19 stand with them. In addition to this, I want to  
20 briefly address the, the issue that was brought up  
21 earlier by the Chancellor of the conflation of  
22 counselors and cops. I would say that we are not the  
23 ones responsible for this conflation and this  
24 conflation is one that has been created and held by  
25 institutions historically. The conflation of safety

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 and police, the conflation of counselors and cops,  
3 what we are doing is fighting to undo that. One of  
4 our youth Ornella is headed to Toronto next week to  
5 meet with the folks who have led the charge in  
6 creating policy for police free schools. I hope that  
7 upon her return our city won't let her down. Thank  
8 you.

9 JOSCELYN VALDES: Good afternoon, my name  
10 is Joscelyn Valdes, I am a Restorative Justice Youth  
11 Ambassador at the Bushwick Campus and a Core Youth  
12 Leader and Make the Road New York. Entering Bushwick  
13 Campus in the morning can sometimes feel like walking  
14 inside of a jail. When you walk through the door  
15 you'll be welcomed with school safety agents yelling  
16 and students waiting in line to pass through a metal  
17 detector and worst of all if you come late you have  
18 to wait 15 minutes to pass in order for someone to be  
19 called from your to let you in. This environment is  
20 not a safe or welcoming school environment for  
21 students of any community. This is why I think all  
22 schools in New York City should have restorative  
23 justice as part of the culture. Restorative justice  
24 is an alternative to harsh punishment but most  
25 importantly it is community building practice, you

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 will be able to get to the root cause of the conflict  
3 which allows you to explore different ways of  
4 handling situations. As a restorative justice youth  
5 ambassador, I am a liaison between my schools and  
6 other schools in the building, having a restorative  
7 justice coordinator and an ambassador in the Bushwick  
8 Campus has opened up possibilities for many of the  
9 students in the campus. It has allowed all youth  
10 ambassadors of the campus to connect and impact the  
11 lives of the students by educating them in what  
12 restorative justice is and what our rights are and  
13 advocating for ourselves. This should begin as soon  
14 as we enter school but it is not part of too many  
15 schools, we know it is a necessity because students  
16 will be aware of the different ways that harm can be  
17 repaired without having to be suspended, without  
18 having to suspend someone or send them away from  
19 their communities. This is why funding for  
20 restorative justice should be expanded city wide so  
21 schools can have access to it and help maintain  
22 students feeling safe and welcome. Many of us  
23 normalize being suspended and pushed away by... when  
24 something happens, and it effects the way we see...  
25 students see each other in the world. It also effects

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 the way we see ourselves and the world when we see  
3 that funding is always prioritized to policing us,  
4 putting us in handcuffs, putting us in courts and  
5 cages. I don't know how this city always finds money  
6 for policing in schools, we are demanding for the  
7 city to fund... find funding for restorative justice.  
8 We are also asking for 30 million dollars as the  
9 first step and look forward to working with the City  
10 Council to make it happen. Thank you.

11 KENNY OLIVIO: Hello, good afternoon  
12 everyone. my name is Kenny Olivio and I'm a Youth  
13 Leader at the Bushwick Campus Student Success Center  
14 and I'm an active participant with Make the Road New  
15 York. The Student Success Centers are full-service  
16 college access sites where youth leaders like myself  
17 are trained to support our peers throughout the whole  
18 college application process and create a college  
19 going culture on serving New York City high schools.  
20 youth leaders are trained and receive a stipend at  
21 work at their SSE supporting their peers to get to  
22 college and some schools with SSE had 100 percent of  
23 their students apply to CUNY and FASFA. Across all  
24 SSEs 87 percent of students applied to, to CUNY and  
25 67 percent completed their FASFAs. Also, the six-

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 month enrollment rate also increased over ten percent  
3 in that four year period. Despite the impressive  
4 results, increasing access to college for low incomes  
5 and first-generation students, the student success  
6 center model is woefully underfunded with no secure  
7 funding stream from the city or the DOE. Currently  
8 many of the SSEs across the city are primarily funded  
9 through college access for all funds which are due to  
10 expire within the next year or two and then what'll  
11 happen to these places that matter to us this much? I  
12 want to tell you a little bit about what being a  
13 youth leader means to me. For me being a youth leader  
14 means guiding my peers through the college process  
15 using knowledge that I've gained through summer  
16 training with CARA and my own experiences to help  
17 them apply to colleges and hope that they attend the  
18 school that they want and make sure that they  
19 complete everything the way it's supposed to be. The  
20 SSE matters and is important for the students of  
21 Bushwick because they need as much knowledge as they  
22 can get when thinking about their future. Many  
23 students come in without the knowledge of the  
24 necessary, necessary steps that they need to move on  
25 with their lives after high school and how to apply

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 to college and the SSE is the perfect place to  
3 educate those students on what they need to do next.  
4 I love being a youth leader because I find it  
5 exhilarating to watch my peers succeed. As a youth  
6 leader I'm tasked with giving my fellow peers  
7 guidance when applying for college and my role is  
8 important because they need more support than anyone  
9 actually really knows. I'm a youth leader because I  
10 love helping others succeed and areas like the SSE  
11 should receive more funding because it's a safe space  
12 for students that is successful because it empowers  
13 students to take the lead. The SSE for me has  
14 personally done so much to me, for me and I don't  
15 think I would have any of the opportunities I have  
16 today without them. Schools with SSEs are 87 percent  
17 black and Latin X, 86 percent low income and 22  
18 percent English language learners and they've done so  
19 much for me that I don't think I could ever repay  
20 them for it, without them I probably would not have  
21 gotten into the dream university that I got into and  
22 we are requesting that the Department of Education  
23 provide 3.4 million this year for the current student  
24 success centers and to open three new student success

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 centers to reach 20,000 students in underserved high  
3 schools across the city. Thank you.

4 DIANE REYES: Good afternoon, my name is  
5 Diane Reyes and I'm a Youth Leader for the Bushwick  
6 Campus Student Success Center with Make the Road New  
7 York. The Bushwick Campus SSE run by Make the Road  
8 is... it was opened in 2007. Since then hundreds of  
9 students have been supported by their peers to visit  
10 the college of their dreams. There are... there are  
11 youth leaders at 33 high schools across the city  
12 helping over 14,000 of their peers on the path to  
13 college. Being a part of this family as a youth  
14 leader means we guide others to show them that they  
15 are capable of accomplishing their goals. We may help  
16 many of them with encouragement not to give up during  
17 a really hard process of applying to college. The  
18 Student Success Center is important space in this  
19 school because there are a lot of students that need  
20 motivation and also don't know all the information  
21 that we as a youth leader can provide and also  
22 supporting my... my first generation student is a big  
23 pride for me because they come from countries where  
24 everything is completely different and don't have the  
25 access to what we do, they may not get support if



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 there wasn't an SSC. I have a student that has come  
3 to the Student Success Center with a confusing face  
4 not knowing nothing about what the senior do and a  
5 lot of them barely can speak English but when they  
6 see the support and fixing all the misunderstanding  
7 that they had about applying it's amazing to see,  
8 their facial expressions change feeling more  
9 confident with themselves and satisfied is a big  
10 change for me that, that I made that possible and  
11 they'll start feeling comfortable with us coming  
12 often that will just make my day all the better. I'm  
13 a youth leader for many reasons but specifically  
14 because I like to influence others and keep them  
15 inspired in order to achieve their goals. Having the  
16 responsibility of helping a student through the  
17 classification and other things about college is like  
18 a great, great experience of myself and for my peers  
19 and also seeing people looking up to you as juniors  
20 who would like to keep the tradition of being a youth  
21 leader in representing their school. We are asking  
22 for 3.4 billion... million dollars this year, we need  
23 the City Council's support, I hope you work with us,  
24 thank you.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 ADILKA PIMENTEL: Good afternoon, my name  
3 is Adilka, I am a Lead Organizer at Make the Road New  
4 York, a member of the Urban Youth Collaborative and a  
5 Graduate of Bushwick Campus from 2007. Assata Shakur  
6 once said, "the schools we go to are reflections of  
7 the society that created them" and I'm here to not  
8 only tell you that she was right but also that it  
9 means that both our schools and our society have  
10 criminalized, disenfranchised and ultimately are  
11 failing our black and brown young people. I was  
12 undocumented, the oldest of three children who all  
13 went to New York City public school and I am a  
14 survivor of the school to prison pipeline. I have  
15 chosen the word survivor because every day that I  
16 walked into my school building meant another chance  
17 of having an encounter with police in my school which  
18 could have led to an arrest and deportation. In fact,  
19 I had a few interactions with police in my school  
20 including having to stop my graduation and having to  
21 rush outside with the school administrators because  
22 the police would not let my undocumented mother in,  
23 to watching police shove my friends in the hallways  
24 and being told to take my boots off to be scanned  
25 while there was snow all over the floor. These

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 experiences were dehumanizing and raging and cruel.  
3 My experiences aren't unique, they are unfortunately  
4 very common. One of the biggest hurdles I encountered  
5 in high school was navigating the higher education  
6 process. Although the staff was very supportive, no  
7 one knew how to help me as an undocumented person  
8 applying to school and as the first person, person in  
9 my family graduating high school, no one was able to  
10 help me at home either. I knew that this couldn't  
11 continue to be the standard. As youth leaders we took  
12 matters into our own hands and created a legacy that  
13 we are still fighting to keep alive today. We  
14 launched the first pilot Student Success Center in  
15 New York City in the Bushwick Campus in 2007. This  
16 came after years of brainstorming, going down to meet  
17 with the Philadelphia Student Union who had an  
18 existing model and organizing to get the resources.  
19 Student Success Centers can be transformative spaces  
20 for young people within an institution that can often  
21 oppressive. Young people are given the opportunity to  
22 help one another often first-generation graduates  
23 with applying to college in a profoundly incredible  
24 way. Youth organizing is also transformational. Being  
25 a part of the fight for the SSC 13 years ago not only

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 empowered me but allowed me to feel seen and heard in  
3 a moment where not have documents made me feel  
4 invisible and silenced. We knew what we needed as  
5 students and we fought for it. However, it is  
6 exceptionally disheartening to be sitting in this  
7 chair 12 years later as a mentor and supporter of the  
8 young people here and still be calling for divestment  
9 of invasive surveillance tactics and calling for an  
10 investment and expansion for Student Success Centers.  
11 The young people of the city are worth investing in,  
12 protecting and loving, we are doing a great  
13 disservice to our young people by not supporting  
14 their demands. The time to back them up is now. Thank  
15 you.

16 JULIE QUINTON: Hi, good evening.

17 Councilman Treyger thank you for sticking it out and  
18 hearing us in person and to everybody else for being  
19 here today. I'm, I'm Julie Quinton, I have the great  
20 honor of working with the folks to my right, I direct  
21 the adult education programs. Most of the colleagues  
22 in... that are doing this work are in the immigration  
23 hearing at this time. I wanted to represent our over  
24 a thousand students a year served by Make the Road  
25 and, and many of our other members. I imagine that we

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 work with parents of the very people at this table  
3 and in this room. I'm here to say thank you for your  
4 historic support over the last three years and to  
5 really stress how critical the Council's support of  
6 adult education is this year in particular. The  
7 Council has been wonderful in making sure that 12  
8 million have been added to, to what is baselined,  
9 we're really needing it be baselined this year  
10 permanently because DYCD is issuing a new RFP and you  
11 may or may not have heard from colleagues and friends  
12 but programs have had to shudder because adult ed  
13 programs are not funded thoroughly. Often times  
14 programs... the, the money does not cover up to 30  
15 percent of the cost and some amazing community-based  
16 programs have had to close. We're asking for you to  
17 stretch your education vision to include the parents  
18 of young people, this isn't a P-K through 12 system,  
19 it needs to include everyone. We believe education is  
20 a right for adults as well as young people. There are  
21 over 2.2 million people in the city who either don't  
22 have adequate English language, basic education or a  
23 high school diploma. It seems like a cornerstone of  
24 any, any platform for social justice and yet it  
25 continues to be treated as kind of an afterthought

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 and we really see you as a... as being in a role where  
3 you can help to amplify this issue and really move it  
4 forward this year. It would be wonderful if we could  
5 transition from talking about one-year funding to  
6 really embracing a vision where we maintain... we make  
7 programs stable and able to grow where we can support  
8 full time staff, where we can provide adequate  
9 professional development. I'm going to pass the mic  
10 to a, a wonderful colleague, former student of mine  
11 who can speak to the power of our programs. Thank  
12 you.

13 RACHIDA ROUIAS: Good afternoon. My name  
14 is Rachida Rouias. I am from Morocco; I have lived in  
15 New York City about 19 years. I started to learn  
16 English in classes at Make the Road New York. Before  
17 that I studied English at Ridgewood Library. In 2017,  
18 I studied in a Bridge to Health Career class and  
19 later at Community Health Worker class at Make the  
20 Road New York. I took these classes to improve my  
21 English speaking, reading and writing proficiency and  
22 to learn more about how to get in, into health and  
23 social service careers. When I graduated from my  
24 health training classes I could get involved in my  
25 children's education much more easily; I texted my

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 son's teachers in ClassDojo. I helped my child to  
3 open an account in Raz kids. In addition, I am now so  
4 happy to go to parent teacher conferences because I  
5 can communicate with teachers without asking for a  
6 translator. Actually, my children are in the top  
7 classes because of the skills and the knowledge which  
8 I got from Make the Road New York. Furthermore, at  
9 Make the Road New York I got a lot of certifications  
10 as a community health worker, OSHA certification,  
11 Nutrition certification, and other health  
12 certifications Infectious Disease and Disaster  
13 Resiliency certification. As part of my training I  
14 did an internship at Make the Road New York and I  
15 worked part time as a case manager to help other  
16 English students at Make the Road New York. I feel I  
17 have the power. I do outreach to bring more Arabic  
18 speaking students to Make the Road to learn English.  
19 With their English they can obtain job and they can  
20 get involved in their children's education too. If  
21 there weren't free, free English classes it would  
22 affect me and my family a lot. If this happened I  
23 could... I could not continue to study English. I  
24 couldn't... I couldn't improve my speaking, writing,  
25 reading in English and get a job or help my children.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 Please, please, please and put more money permanently  
3 in the city budget for free adult education classes.  
4 This year we are asking to baseline 12 million  
5 dollars in the budget. This is money we fought for  
6 the last three years and one each year. We don't want  
7 to have to fight for it every year, we want it  
8 permanently in there. If there are no free classes,  
9 no education for adults, this won't just hurt  
10 individual people, but it will hurt our families and  
11 the whole city too.

12 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: That was excellent,  
13 that was excellent, and I could not agree more.  
14 There's been a theme that we've been hearing during  
15 the course of this budget hearing and... budget process  
16 that many of the critical social safety net programs  
17 such as adult education or bridging the gap social  
18 workers they seem to be attached and then detached  
19 year after year. I agree, we must baseline them once  
20 and for all and create a sense of stability and  
21 certainty for our families and I appreciate your  
22 powerful testimony because in many cases parents are  
23 their children's first teachers and the more we  
24 empower you and educate you the more you could  
25 effectively fight and advocate for your children and



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 the... and that's what I heard in your testimony  
3 because in many cases the government does not want  
4 folks to know what their rights are but you deserve  
5 to know every one of your rights... [cross-talk]

6 RACHIDA ROUIAS: Thank you... [cross-talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...and to fight for  
8 your... for your kids, I really thank you for your  
9 leadership and advocacy and thank all of you, our  
10 young people, our advocates, I am... as a former civics  
11 teacher this, this is... this is like gold to me to see  
12 young people out here testifying for things that  
13 actually do make a difference in, in schools and  
14 classes every day, thank you so much, I truly  
15 appreciate you. Next, we'll hear from Alice, Alice  
16 Bufkin; Lisa Caswell; Marsha Jean-Charles; Robert  
17 Robinson; Ivelisse Gilestia; Andrea Ortiz And Denis  
18 Yu. Okay, whenever anyone's ready just turn the mic  
19 on, introduce yourself, you may begin.

20 LISA CASWELL: Okay, Good evening, my  
21 name is Lisa Caswell, I'm the Senior Policy Analyst  
22 for the Day Care Council of New York. For more than  
23 70 years, the Day Care Council has successfully  
24 served the needs of nonprofit organizations that  
25 sponsor child care programs across the five boroughs

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 of New York City. Currently, we have 91 members who  
3 operate more than 200 early childhood education  
4 programs under contract with the Administration for  
5 Children's Services. We are also responsible for  
6 negotiating collective bargaining agreements on  
7 behalf of our member agencies with the two unions,  
8 District Council 1707 and the Council of Supervisors  
9 and Administrators, who represent the child care  
10 workforce and their programs. First, we'd like to  
11 sincerely thank you for the City Council's consistent  
12 support on this critical matter that we're facing at  
13 this point. My comments are going to fall into three  
14 categories; salary parody, program vacancies and the  
15 overall physical infrastructure of the system. The  
16 recent release of the Department of Education's birth  
17 to five requests for proposals will have long ranging  
18 repercussions and we're at the apex of those issues.  
19 Our members continue to struggle with the, the hiring  
20 and retention of qualified teaching staff in the face  
21 of ongoing professional staffing competition with the  
22 Department of Education. Entry level early childhood  
23 education teachers who have their master's degrees  
24 are state certified.. and are state certified continue  
25 to be paid 16,000 dollars less than their entry level

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 counterparts at the DOE. For more than a year, the  
3 Day Care Council has been engaged in complex research  
4 on salary parody to determine the specific fiscal  
5 impact. Our goal is salary parody for all staff.  
6 However, we are starting the analysis by focusing on  
7 CBO directors and masters and bachelors' level  
8 certified teachers for two reasons. Our members have  
9 repeatedly discussed the difficulty in hiring  
10 management and state certified teaching staff for  
11 their agencies and Article 47 of the New York City  
12 Department of Health and Mental Hygiene's regulations  
13 requires this staffing for all early childhood  
14 education programs. Our calculations are based on the  
15 UFT's collective bargaining agreement salary scales,  
16 with specific attention to cost of living adjustments  
17 and longevity increases. In calculating the funding  
18 amount, consideration has been given to the current  
19 employee benefits structure which includes salary,  
20 FICA, a pension and health insurance. We are  
21 currently scheduling a presentation for members of  
22 the City Council in the next few weeks. Salary parody  
23 is the only path forward for an integrated early  
24 education system and we are committed to laying a  
25 proper foundation for long term stability. We will be

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 following up with your offices to make sure that this  
3 works for you in particular. Our second area of  
4 concern is focused on the DOE RFP policy of linking  
5 funding to enrollment. At this time, the average  
6 enrollment rate for early learn is 78 percent with  
7 child care programs at 74 percent, dual enrollment  
8 programs at 80 percent and head start programs at 83  
9 percent. The RFP states that programs with enrollment  
10 rates of 58 percent or less will receive 65 percent  
11 of the monthly contract value, programs with an  
12 enrollment rate between 58 and 93 will receive  
13 funding for their monthly enrollment rate plus seven  
14 percent and programs enrolled at 93 percent or higher  
15 will receive the 100 percent of their monthly  
16 contract. The DOE has made significant adjustments to  
17 its centralized enrollment system that have  
18 benefitted nonprofit Pre-K settings for all, but we  
19 are also witnessing success in the recent efforts to  
20 boost head start enrollment levels. Despite this, we  
21 are extremely concerned about the immediate and long-  
22 term repercussions of this fiscal policy. Providers  
23 do not necessarily have control over the enrollment  
24 numbers and that is the issue that now their budgets  
25 are going to be affected. Finally, and I'm sorry for

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 going over, while the RFP includes infrastructure  
3 funding for startup and renovation, programs located  
4 in NYCHA facilities continue to face complex  
5 obstacles when trying to maintain or upgrade their  
6 facilities. Following is a quote from parents who  
7 chose a school-based Pre-K setting over the nonprofit  
8 where their child had been in attendance. "We would  
9 like to come back, but the facilities need  
10 improvement. Also emergency closings because of  
11 various issues with the building have caused us to  
12 miss work." While we acknowledge the administration's  
13 recent establishment of new protocols that are  
14 expediting repairs, there is still so much that needs  
15 to be done. NYCHA's 2017 Physical Needs Assessment  
16 projected 31.8 billion in capital repair needs across  
17 their portfolio over the next five years to keep the  
18 authority's decades old buildings in condition.  
19 Consequently have... we have recently joined in  
20 coalition with United Neighborhood Houses and LiveOn  
21 New York to advocate for additional infrastructure  
22 funding at both the state and city, city levels.  
23 Ultimately, this administration must give the DOE the  
24 tools and funding CBOs need to effectively serve  
25 their children, parents and staff. Together we can

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 make it happen. The Day Care Council stands ready,  
3 whenever we are needed and thank you for opportunity  
4 to testify.

5 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: It... I appreciate  
6 that just very quickly, is there an estimate that,  
7 that you have in terms of what would it cost to, to  
8 resolve parody once and for all, is... was, was there..  
9 because I'm not sure if we heard numbers... [cross-  
10 talk]

11 LISA CASWELL: Yes, we have those... we  
12 have those numbers and we wanted to show you the  
13 respect by giving them to you first.

14 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I... [cross-talk]

15 LISA CASWELL: ...and so that is the  
16 purpose of the hearing...

17 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I truly appreciate  
18 that... [cross-talk]

19 LISA CASWELL: Yep...

20 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And I am sure that  
21 whatever the number is the Mayor has the power to  
22 make it happen.

23 LISA CASWELL: I think... well we've heard  
24 from the Comptroller's Office that the money is there  
25 and so you'll have that number quickly.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you, we'll  
3 follow up, appreciate it, thank you, next.

4 ALICE BUFKIN: Good afternoon, my name is  
5 Alice Bufkin and I am the Director of Policy for  
6 Child and Adolescent Health with Citizens' Committee  
7 for Children. CCC is a nonprofit child advocacy  
8 organization dedicated to making sure that every New  
9 York child is healthy, housed, educated and safe.  
10 Thank you very much for this opportunity to provide  
11 testimony today. My written testimony includes  
12 detailed and additional recommendations, today given  
13 the time I just want to focus on a handful of those  
14 priorities that we have. First we join other  
15 advocates and many on this committee in urging the  
16 City to support the nearly 115,000 homeless students  
17 in New York City by restoring and baselining funding  
18 for bridging the gap social workers and expanding the  
19 bridging the gap from 69 to 100 social workers at  
20 schools with high rates of students living in the  
21 homeless settings. We've seen a 28 percent increase  
22 in family homelessness since 2013 and as you know one  
23 in ten students are, are homeless currently in our  
24 city. This is unacceptable, it's critical that we  
25 make sure that this funding is restored, baselined

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 and increased. Second, we urge you to strengthen  
3 supports for foster care children including by  
4 investing five million dollars to provide bus  
5 transportation for K through six grade students in  
6 foster care. Providing this support will not only  
7 enable New York to meet its legal obligations to  
8 foster care students but also help prevent these  
9 vulnerable children from being forced to transfer  
10 schools which often removes one of their most  
11 important sources of stability. Third, we want to  
12 commend the City Council, as you've heard from, from  
13 many others today for your longstanding support for  
14 salary parity as you just heard earlier and including  
15 today in the rally. We urge you to continue  
16 advocating for fair salaries. As you know CBO  
17 teachers often work longer hours, more months during  
18 the year than their counterparts and over time can  
19 face salary disparities in the tens of thousands of  
20 dollars. This is unacceptable from an administration  
21 that has committed itself to an equitable education  
22 system and we strongly urge the city to establish  
23 salary parity for early educators. Fourth, we want to  
24 emphasize the critical need for additional  
25 socioemotional and behavioral health supports for



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 students in schools. As we've heard today from many  
3 including some, some wonderful young advocates this  
4 starts by funding 150 additional full-time social  
5 workers in high needs schools. social workers play a  
6 critical role in our schools, yet they are currently  
7 dealing with overwhelming caseloads. Nearly half of  
8 all NYC schools lack a full-time social worker. We  
9 also support investments in restorative practices and  
10 in a mental health support continuum pilot for 100  
11 high needs schools. As you heard earlier today, this  
12 is a model originally proposed by the Mayor's  
13 leadership council on school climate and discipline  
14 and it includes school partnerships with hospital  
15 based mental health clinics and call in centers,  
16 school response teams, whole school trainings and  
17 evidence based models of collaborative problem  
18 solving and program evaluation. Finally, we urge you  
19 to improve the expansion of the universal school  
20 lunch. The city's establishment of universal school  
21 lunch is an incredible accomplishment and has led to  
22 a substantial increase in, in students accessing  
23 school meals, however many students and parents  
24 remain unaware that this is an option for them.  
25 Recent federal policies targeting immigrant

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 communities have made it more important than ever to  
3 protect and promote city funded services that may be  
4 safer to access which includes school lunch. We and  
5 other advocates believe the city should provide  
6 dedicated funding to promote school lunch through  
7 sustained communications and marketing plan. Again,  
8 my written testimony includes additional and more  
9 detailed recommendations and I really thank you for  
10 your time and commitment to children and families in  
11 this city, thank you.

12 DENIS YU: Good afternoon, thank you to  
13 Chair Treyger and the Council... the Committee on  
14 Education for giving me this opportunity to testify.  
15 My name is Denis Yu and I am the Program Coordinator  
16 at CACF, the Coalition for Asian American Children  
17 and Families. I oversee our youth leadership program  
18 AASAP, the Asian American Student Advocacy Project.  
19 Since our beginning in 1986, CACF has been the  
20 nations only pan-Asian children and families advocacy  
21 organization and we lead the fight for improving  
22 equitable policies, systems, funding and services to  
23 support those in need. The Asian Pacific American APA  
24 population comprises a growing percentage, 15 percent  
25 of the New York City population which is now over 1.3

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 million people and yet the needs of our community are  
3 consistently overlooked, they are misunderstood and  
4 they are uncared for in part because of the harmful  
5 impacts of stereotypes such as the model minority  
6 myth. And we understand that the city is facing  
7 budget cuts on the state level and also financial  
8 uncertainty on the federal level, however, we think  
9 that it is very important that we continue funding  
10 education programs that are key to the wellbeing of  
11 New York City youth including young APAs. So,  
12 considering that one out of every five APA students  
13 do not graduate high school on time or at all and  
14 those who graduate 40 percent are not college ready  
15 upon graduating, that one out of four English  
16 language learner students or as the Chancellor will  
17 call them now, multilanguage learner students, is APA  
18 and that nearly two out of three of APA students in  
19 New York City come from homes where language is...  
20 other than English is spoken and finally, the Asian  
21 Americans have the highest rate of linguistic  
22 isolation of any group in the city of 42 percent  
23 meaning that no one over the age of 14 in the  
24 household speaks English well or at all. Considering  
25 all of these, we are very happy that the city is

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 investing in programs such as 3-K for All, however,  
3 we do need to restore and perhaps even increase  
4 funding for programs and services that are a direct  
5 investment in the futures of our youth. And in  
6 addition, I do want to highlight that these services  
7 also need to be language accessible and culturally  
8 competent and of the many budget recommendations that  
9 are listed in my testimony there's one that I  
10 particularly want to highlight which is as Chair  
11 Treyger you had emphasized earlier today, a citywide  
12 investment in social and, and emotional learning in  
13 our schools and on that note I want to share a  
14 testimony from one of our youth advocates. I'm Edison  
15 Zu, a young... a youth leader from AASAP and a senior  
16 at the Bronx High School of Science. The two million  
17 dollars cut to guidance counselors and social workers  
18 will ultimately prove detrimental to us teenagers. My  
19 best friend at school isn't open to speaking her  
20 mind, at one point due to personal life issues she  
21 was incredibly depressed and borderline suicidal,  
22 self-harming and having shock induced short term  
23 memory loss. After months, days, hours of counseling  
24 from friends through text, calls and person talks we  
25 convinced her to see the single social worker at our

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 school which has over 3,000 students. She gradually  
3 got better returning to her typical cheery self. I  
4 myself experience isolation, like many other  
5 teenagers I was alone in a large high school with no  
6 middle school friends to accompany me and I kept  
7 feeling that I failed to live up to the expectations  
8 of my family and culture. At my school my guidance  
9 counselor is responsible for 80 students and we only  
10 have one social worker, so I didn't bother to go. For  
11 four years I held everything in, my choice was to  
12 bear it all and laugh it off. The choice I made  
13 brought me countless sleepless nights where I  
14 literally suffocated over my thoughts, lack of  
15 motivation in the morning where I risked being late  
16 and lifelessness throughout parts of my day.  
17 Thankfully I was able to vent to my best friend and  
18 I'm reassured by the presence of my new Asian  
19 American counselor who constantly vouched for me and  
20 assisted me whenever I needed it but other students  
21 are not so lucky which is why I ask City Council to  
22 make sure that the city maintains or even increases  
23 the funding for my... for more guidance counselors and  
24 social workers to address student mental health  
25 barriers and student discomfort in asking for help. I

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 thank you for this opportunity to testify and I look  
3 forward to working with City Council to ensure that  
4 the youth across our city are receiving the services  
5 and the programs that they need to thrive. Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you and thank  
7 you for flagging the need for bilingual social  
8 workers and counselors in our school system, truly  
9 appreciate that, thank you. Next.

10 ANDREA ORTIZ: Hello, thank you. My name  
11 is Andrea Ortiz and I'm here on behalf of the New  
12 York Immigration Coalition where I'm a Manager of  
13 Education Policy. I'm here also representing the New  
14 York City Coalition of Adult Literacy. Today we want  
15 to thank honorable Council Member Treyger for your..  
16 for being a devoted leader and, and champion of  
17 English language learners and for taking leadership  
18 on educational issues that affect immigrant families  
19 as well as their educators and we also want to.. we  
20 appreciate the City Council as well as the Mayor for  
21 adding an additional 12 million dollars in funding to  
22 adult literacy programs over the last three years.  
23 But today we want to talk to you about the need to  
24 permanently baseline this funding for adult literacy.  
25 As part of the NYC's expansive approach to education

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 many of our members run adult literacy programs that  
3 are crucial to ensuring the success of immigrant  
4 families. Currently approximately 2.2 million adults  
5 in the city lack English language proficiency, a high  
6 school diploma or both of which 75 percent are  
7 immigrants yet due to the lack of adequate funding  
8 for adult literacy less than four percent of them are  
9 able to actually access basic education, high school  
10 equivalency or English language at any given year.

11 So, today we also want to point out that Mayor De  
12 Blasio has failed to include of this additional 12  
13 million to his preliminary budget which jeopardizes  
14 the education of 8,500 adult students in New York  
15 City whose programs rely on it as well as our members  
16 who serve them. And also due to the limiting changes  
17 of the workforce innovation in opportunities act  
18 known as WIOA which now puts added emphasis on  
19 employment outcomes, an estimated 8,000 immigrant  
20 students who attended WIOA funded classes, civics  
21 classes in New York City were displaced or deemed  
22 ineligible as of July 1<sup>st</sup>. And as funding streams are  
23 becoming more scarce, it is important to note that  
24 even before these troubling changes, adult literacy  
25 programs were already majorly struggling to fully

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 fund their programming. So, it is time for the City  
3 Council and the administration to stand up for those  
4 thousands of adult learners in New York and baseline  
5 the 12 million in addition to the 3.5 million  
6 currently baselined to support the Department of  
7 Youth and Community Development funded adult literacy  
8 programs. And as you said this is important for our...  
9 the perpetuity of the programs but also just for the  
10 sustainability and, and the wellness of the people  
11 that run them. And once the 12 million gets baselined  
12 for 2020 we also urge the Council and administration  
13 to ensure that all programs that receive funding for  
14 adult literacy services in 2019 including those that  
15 have to be... have to be funded with discretionary  
16 dollars are able to secure the funding that they need  
17 to continue to provide these crucial services going  
18 forward. Thank you again Chair, Chair Treyger and the  
19 members of the Council Committee on Education for  
20 this opportunity to testify and I also want to thank  
21 all the students and advocates in this room for  
22 making this incredible day more important because  
23 hearing your voices it makes it so that we actually  
24 know what we need to fight for. Thank you very much.



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I, I want to thank you and we're hearing it loud and clear the need to baseline adult, adult education which should have been baselined and increased years ago and you know I, I don't know how to accept the answers from the administration that this is like budget dance issue, you can't contract that way, you can't conduct business that way... [cross-talk]

ANDREA ORTIZ: No, I mean you're... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...it, it's, it's impossible and I... [cross-talk]

ANDREA ORTIZ: ...don't have to fear for their jobs and that doesn't make it for the... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...you know they... [cross-talk]

ANDREA ORTIZ: ...best people to... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...they're living in a... in a lala land when they talk like this, but the impact is real on our families and of course your organizations so you have our full support and we

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 will go to battle for these critical programs, thank  
3 you.

4 ANDREA ORTIZ: Thank you, I look forward  
5 to working with you...

6 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Sure, yes, thank  
7 you, next.

8 ROBERT ROBINSON: Good evening, my name  
9 is Robert Robinson, I'm the Senior Managing Director  
10 of College Bound Initiative, a student leadership  
11 network formerly known as the Young Women's  
12 Leadership Network. I heard a gentleman earlier say  
13 this was his third or fourth time testifying. I'm  
14 excited because this is my first time, I'm excited  
15 because I've learned a lot today to bring back to my  
16 office. I'm excited because I want to share my  
17 passion for the work that I'm doing. I'm excited  
18 because I'm a New York native, Brooklyn to, to be  
19 specific. I'm excited because I'm an alum of the New  
20 York City public school system, I went to PS 219 in  
21 Brownsville where, where I'm from, IS 68 in Canarsie  
22 and Edward R. Murrow High School in Brooklyn...

23 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Me too...

24 ROBERT ROBINSON: Yeah and, and I'm  
25 excited because that public school education allowed

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 me to be the first person in my family to go to  
3 college and, and going to NYU through the higher  
4 education opportunities program was an amazing  
5 experience for myself and my family but also my  
6 community and it also allowed me years later to be  
7 able to join student leadership network as the  
8 Director of College Counseling and work in my  
9 neighborhood to support students who were first  
10 generation to enroll into college. On behalf of the  
11 Student Leadership Network I thank you Chair Treyger,  
12 I thank you to all the members of the Committee for  
13 allowing us to testify, for sticking with us on this  
14 long day, I appreciate that but I want to give you  
15 some reasons to be passionate about some of the  
16 things that we're doing. So, let me share a little  
17 bit about our organization and, and our stats to get  
18 everyone passionate. We were founded in 1996 by Ann  
19 and Andrew Tisch. We have two programs; we have the  
20 Young Women's Leadership Schools where we create  
21 single sex girl schools throughout New York City and  
22 then we have College Bound Initiative where we place  
23 full time directors of college counseling in 32 high  
24 schools throughout New York City. So, we're currently  
25 serving about 17,000 students throughout the city and

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 all of this is because of the partnership we have  
3 with individual principals who recognize the  
4 importance of this work, the partnerships we have  
5 with the New York City DOE and the partnership we  
6 have with the New York City Council who support the  
7 amazing work that's being done in our schools. The  
8 secret sauce... people ask all the time, what's the  
9 secret sauce, it's providing a full time director of  
10 counseling in the schools to ensure that students are  
11 getting individualized attention, that's the secret  
12 sauce and that's the dream I have that one day we can  
13 do that at every high school here in New York City.  
14 Since 2001, we're happy to report that we've helped  
15 more than 15,000 students enroll in college, on  
16 average about 94 percent of our students are  
17 graduates from our 32 schools are accepted to college  
18 and 89 percent of them are directly enrolling that  
19 first semester which is an important piece and we  
20 know that the city's average is about 59 percent so  
21 there's lots of work to be done and we want that work  
22 to continue. What we're asking is for support,  
23 support and increased support for college access  
24 programming. Someone mentioned earlier, in a year  
25 college access for all is on the chopping block and

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 we don't want to see that happen, there are a lot of  
3 schools that don't have the capacity to support and  
4 give our students individualized attention to help  
5 them get into college. We recognize that getting in  
6 is, is just the start but what we want to focus on  
7 additionally is enrollment, persistence and success.  
8 We want to change student's lives and their  
9 trajectories through education and we hope that the  
10 Council, the DOE can continue to support these  
11 initiatives and continue that funding. Thank you so  
12 much for giving me this time.

13 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you so much  
14 and as a fellow Murrow graduate you did an excellent  
15 job for your first time and we look forward to seeing  
16 you here and hopefully celebrating good and better  
17 news for our... for our kids, truly appreciate you and  
18 I thank the entire panel for your great testimony,  
19 appreciate it.

20 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Sure, next panel;  
21 Iman Abdul; Jahmya Valentine; Hope Gupple; Brett  
22 Shampaner, Shampaner; Alice Mulligan; Carlyn Cohen;  
23 and Obrian.

24 [off mic dialogue]  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, whenever folks  
3 are ready just turn the mic on and introduce yourself  
4 and we... you may proceed.

5 IMAN ABDUL: Good after... good afternoon,  
6 it's not even afternoon anymore, that's crazy. Good  
7 evening, my name is Iman Abdul and I'm the Director  
8 of Education and Engagement at Integrate NYC as well  
9 as an ally to all the youth groups that have come  
10 here today to stand with us. With all due respect I  
11 just wanted to start by saying that today's meeting  
12 could have actually been kept on schedule and... but  
13 the conversations that were being held earlier were  
14 truly unengaging and extremely repetitive. There were  
15 a bunch of students that have taken off of school to  
16 be here all day and we didn't get to hear their  
17 voices until five p.m. and they've been here since  
18 nine a.m. so they missed an entire school day just to  
19 get what they wanted to say out there when there have  
20 been no Councilman here, the Chancellor is not here,  
21 the news is not here to actually listen and record  
22 the voices of the people that are being impacted the  
23 most and like when the... when the young people were  
24 talking I started crying back there because it  
25 shouldn't have taken till 5:30 p.m. for us to

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 actually hear what they have to say because this is  
3 impacting us and we know exactly what's going on in  
4 our schools more than anybody that's here today. So,  
5 I just wanted to mention that first. As I stand in  
6 front of you today as a CUNY student and as a New  
7 York City public school graduate. As an individual  
8 who's several identities have affected the type of  
9 educational experience I have received. As an  
10 individual who had to graduate from this city's  
11 public schools without having peers that looked like  
12 me in a classroom until the seventh grade, without  
13 having a teacher that looked like me until the tenth  
14 grade, without learning about my own history and my  
15 culture in the classroom, without even attending a  
16 single arts class to further expand on my creative  
17 thinking because you, you know young people are the  
18 creative individuals that are going to change this  
19 world for the better future. But in order for this to  
20 happen, there needs to be an equitable and just  
21 educational system that accommodates all of us as a  
22 collective not individually. Being that our  
23 beautiful, multicultural city contains the most  
24 intensely segregated public schools in the country,  
25 this budget allocation for our schools needs to be

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 very well thought out. The students of Integrate NYC  
3 have developed a five R platform for real  
4 integration... for real integration and real  
5 transformational change in our city's public schools.  
6 the 5R's being race and enrollment, resources,  
7 relationships across group identities, restorative  
8 justice and representation among teachers and staff  
9 must work simultaneously in order for real  
10 integration to be achieved. The school diversity  
11 advisory group, as appointed by Mayor De Blasio in  
12 2017, just recently released a report on how to  
13 effectively reimagine our schools. The report uses  
14 our 5R framework to make these recommendations. For  
15 race and enrollment, we want to see city resources  
16 devoted to funding community engagement processes,  
17 similar to district 15, to develop district wide  
18 integration plans. The DOE has already offered two  
19 million to fund ten districts over the next two  
20 years, City Council should identify two million as  
21 well to support ten more and support from members as  
22 these processes are underway. For resources we want  
23 to see CFE funds allocated by the state, but while  
24 that is under discussion in Albany, we believe that  
25 the city must invest in every single district to



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 ensure all schools have access to a sound basic  
3 education. a meaningful place to begin would be to  
4 make sure all schools offer an adequate number of  
5 PSAL sports to students, in stance with Fair Play who  
6 was here earlier. Relationships, we are proud that  
7 the DOE has invested 23 million in anti-bias and  
8 culturally responsive training for New York City  
9 public teachers, but we believe that more is needed.  
10 We would like to see committed from City Council to  
11 match those funds to ensure that all teachers are  
12 trained to meet the diverse needs of our students.  
13 For restorative justice, we stand with Urban Youth  
14 Collaborative who was here as well earlier in calling  
15 for a divestment from over policing in schools and a  
16 reinvestment in our students. They call to reallocate  
17 the nearly 400 million invested in the school to  
18 prison pipeline in supportive programs and  
19 opportunities for our students to thrive. We would  
20 like to see 66 million invested in restorative  
21 justice, seven million invested in mental health  
22 services, 163 million in universal youth jobs, 115  
23 million for metro cards for low income New Yorkers  
24 and 15 million for college access programs. With  
25 representation we demand an expansion of support

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 programs like NYC Men Teach and the Young Men's. We  
3 need more programs to attract more individuals of  
4 different identities and backgrounds to educate and  
5 prepare our young people for the... from the global...  
6 for the global world that they are entering because  
7 there are no teachers in our buildings that look like  
8 us. With the city being over 71... about 71 percent  
9 black and Latin X youth, 54 percent of teachers are  
10 white and we have... like I said I haven't had a  
11 teacher that looked like me until the tenth grade and  
12 I've been in all these gifted and talented programs  
13 where no student and no teacher has ever looked like  
14 me, I'm Puerto Rican and Lebanese so being a double  
15 minority, identifying as Muslim and Arab and  
16 identifying as Latino from New York City you  
17 experience things that you can never imagine and for  
18 you to not even have a teacher that looks like that  
19 can further empower you it's a shame that this city  
20 doesn't have educators that are diverse of all  
21 identifies and of all backgrounds. 2019 marks 65  
22 years since Brown versus Board of Ed and young people  
23 are still here fighting the same exact issues. Since  
24 65 is the age to retire, how about we retire  
25 segregation? Thank you.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank, thank you  
3 very much.

4 OBRIAN ROSARIO: Good evening, my name is  
5 Obrian Rosario. I'm not going to be as powerful as  
6 Iman, but I'll try. I'm 17 years old and I'm from  
7 Queens and I am the Director of Mobilization at  
8 Integrate NYC and my people come from the Dominican  
9 Republic. I'm here to stand alongside youth voices  
10 who are tired of seeing funding go to the wrong  
11 places. The Fair Play Coalition stands for sports  
12 equity throughout the city. Sports are extremely  
13 crucial to high school... to the high school experience  
14 and I can attest to that personally being that a  
15 sport which was track and field... track and field  
16 rescued me from being the high school student that  
17 goes straight home after school every day to being  
18 the socially outgoing scholar athlete that I am  
19 today. In continuation, I also stand with the Urban  
20 Youth Collaborative... the Urban Youth Collaborative in  
21 demanding that funding be divested from cops and  
22 invested into guidance counselors. Bringing in  
23 counselors would transform our current punitive  
24 system into a... into a restorative system as we would  
25 help students learn from mistakes and build the

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 leaders of tomorrow. Sports equity and counselors are  
3 just two of the many nonnegotiable things that we  
4 stand for here today. The DOE is responsible for  
5 creating a safe and supportive school environment  
6 that gives access to sports teams and counselors, yet  
7 it continues to fund a short list of schools and  
8 expand the school to prison pipeline. It is time to  
9 hold them accountable and I hope that all of us can  
10 stand here today and realize what the DOE is doing  
11 and how we can move together in creating a front... in  
12 creating change in, in New York City. Thank you.

13 JAHMYA VALENTINE: Good afternoon, my  
14 name is Jace, I am 17 and I go to high school in  
15 Brooklyn. I'm a member of both Integrate NYC and Fair  
16 Play. I'm here as a walking testimony because I have  
17 been impacted by your past decisions and I am here to  
18 tell you how you can improve the New York City  
19 Department of Education school system. We are here..  
20 we are at school for at least eight hours every day  
21 Monday through Friday, school is our second home.  
22 However, 1.1 million students are lacking the basic  
23 needs they deserve in schools. In my 13 years of  
24 school I have only had one black teacher, Mr. E. Mr.  
25 E influenced me and inspired me to want to go to

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 college and get my master's in business. He made  
3 geometry simple to me and my grades in math have  
4 increased since I've had his class. He is a big role  
5 model for me, and I feel every student should be  
6 given the opportunity to relate with... to relate with  
7 their teachers. The DOE needs to hire more culturally  
8 diverse staff, so students feel comfortable in their  
9 classes. Also, teachers need to be trained in  
10 culturally responsive education. In my freshman year  
11 of high school, a teacher took a handful of my  
12 dreadlocks which made me very uncomfortable and I no  
13 longer wanted to attend class because I did not want  
14 it to happen again. Our learning needs must be met.  
15 Students should have laboratories to actually do  
16 their labs, shouldn't have to share textbooks with  
17 three other students, but should have the chance to  
18 choose from a variety of electives, elective classes  
19 and sports teams. Students shouldn't be... students  
20 shouldn't be training for basketball... for baseball in  
21 their school hallways or going to a neighboring  
22 school to use the gyms. Sports is a place of relief  
23 for many students across New York City. Sports,  
24 sports have requirements for students to be able to  
25 stay on the team. Whether it be 80 percent attendance

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 or at least a 65 percent in every class, these  
3 requirements enforce better school habits and better  
4 learning. In addition, sports can lead to athletic  
5 scholarships allowing students who otherwise  
6 wouldn't, would not be able to attend college to  
7 attend. While many... while many schools have these  
8 resources, many don't. And it's up to you to change  
9 that. Understanding that you weren't affected by your  
10 decisions, I was. Me and the students I represent  
11 have been affected. These past decisions have made a  
12 permanent imprint on me and many other students  
13 lives. You may not be affected; you may not be  
14 impacted but my five-year-old brother will be. Thank  
15 you.

16 HOPE GUPPLE: Good evening, my name is  
17 Hope Gupple and I'm an Educational Director at the..  
18 at the Sheltering Arms' Early Childhood Center. Thank  
19 you Chair Treyger for the opportunity to testify  
20 before you. Sheltering Arms is one of the city's  
21 largest providers of education, youth development and  
22 community and family wellbeing programs in the Bronx,  
23 Manhattan, Brooklyn and Queens. We serve more than  
24 1,500 low income children and families throughout the  
25 year through our 11 early childhood centers and a

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 network of 80 family child care providers located in  
3 some of our highest need areas. The RFPs are, as  
4 you've heard, released the DOE... was released by DOE  
5 birth to five, head start and early head start but  
6 did not include a model budget, a process that the  
7 city including DOE has committed to through the  
8 nonprofit resiliency committee. The limited budget  
9 guidance through the RFP includes recommended salary  
10 for lead teacher that's nearly 14,000 dollars lower  
11 annually than UFTs salary of... for teachers with a  
12 bachelor's degree and 15,000 dollars lower for a  
13 masters degree. With extended day and year models the  
14 RFP... are considered the disparity in pay becomes even  
15 more stark. Teachers with a bachelor's degree from  
16 DOE programs work 180 days and a daily rate of 321  
17 dollars a day, even there per diems make 188 dollars  
18 per day which is much less than the CBO teachers who  
19 make only 153 dollars per day. We urge the City  
20 Council, which has made a public stand and thank you  
21 very much for that, for equity salaries for teachers,  
22 to pull these two RFPs and require the inclusion of a  
23 model budget that truly reflects pay equity. Please  
24 consider CBOs provide nearly 60 percent of the seats  
25 for UPK and provide all subsidy eligible care for

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 infants, toddlers and three-year olds. Without  
3 equity... without pay equity our centers have become a  
4 revolving door where we have less qualified, less  
5 experienced teachers, we spend time recruiting, we  
6 spend time training just to see them walk out the  
7 door once they receive their certification and I  
8 cannot blame them. So, please again pull these RFPs.  
9 Sheltering Arms also provides foster care services to  
10 more than 220 school aged children and youth  
11 throughout the year through our foster, foster care  
12 program. We stand with nearly 30 foster care agencies  
13 and child advocacy organizations calling to the city  
14 provide again five million dollars to provide,  
15 provide bus serve... transportation to K through six  
16 for our foster care children and also 1.5 million  
17 dollars to establish a DOE office focused on  
18 supporting students in foster care. This funding was  
19 not included in the Mayor's budget but is vital to  
20 supporting the wellbeing of the students in foster  
21 care. More of this information is included in my full  
22 written testimony and I thank you again for listening  
23 to me so late in the evening.

24 ALICE MULLIGAN: Good evening and thank  
25 you Chair Treyger for this opportunity. My name is



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 Alice Mulligan and I am the Executive Director of Our  
3 Savior's Lutheran Preschool. I'm speaking to you on  
4 behalf of many of the community-based organizations  
5 in partnership with the Department of Education in  
6 providing Pre-kindergarten services to young children  
7 and their families. Historically CBOs have been the  
8 backbone of early education in New York City, we now  
9 represent over 60 percent of DOE Pre-K sites, we are  
10 non for profits, women and minority owned businesses,  
11 religious institutions, private schools and  
12 storefront day cares, we are your neighbors. In 2014,  
13 we responded to the DOE's urging to expand our  
14 enrollments to meet Mayor De Blasio's goal of  
15 enrolling 70,000 children for his Pre-K for All  
16 initiative. We were surprised this year when, for the  
17 first time, many of our schools were unable to fill  
18 our available seats. Consequently, the DOE began  
19 deducting over tens of thousands of dollars from our  
20 annual awards which unless corrected threatens our  
21 viability. Upon researching this unprecedented drop  
22 in enrollment, we learned that the DOE has spent over  
23 eight million dollars constructing their own Pre-K  
24 centers in close proximity to existing CBOS. This was  
25 never shared with us even as contracts were being

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 initiated or renewed. Many of these buildings also  
3 have empty seats in classrooms. In November, we met  
4 with Deputy Chancellor Josh Wallack and the expansion  
5 team, they heard our many concerns and openly  
6 acknowledged that the DOE made mistakes and the  
7 overexpansion of Pre-K especially in district 20. We  
8 asked Mr. Wallack to correct this costly error, we  
9 were simply told no and were subsequently told that  
10 there is no plan to reduce the unneeded Pre-K seats.  
11 In fact, the DOE plans to continue spending tax payer  
12 money opening new sites where there is no need.  
13 Throughout this winter we attended many meetings with  
14 the DOE in preparation for the release of the new RFP  
15 for birth to five services. We shared our many  
16 concerns and were assured that equitable reforms were  
17 being considered. With the recent release of the RFP,  
18 we now know that all of our concerns have been fully  
19 dismissed. Of note, our average cost per child of  
20 11,000 dollars which has been stagnant for seven  
21 years will remain stagnant for another eight. The  
22 average cost per child in a DOE run school is over  
23 30,000 dollars. No increase in salaries, a fully  
24 qualified teacher in a CBO earns an average of 42,000  
25 dollars yet her equally qualified DOE counterpart has

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 a starting salary of 59,000 dollars. The DOE now  
3 strongly encourages us to provide health insurance  
4 and retirement plans for our staff though they offer  
5 no resources for these exorbitant costs. Many CBOs  
6 can no longer retain qualified staff due to the gross  
7 inequity of compensation. Under Mayor De Blasio and  
8 the DOE there is no equal pay for equal work. When  
9 the DOE needed us as their partner we provided. When  
10 the Mayor needed us to help reach his goal of serving  
11 70,000 children we provided. Again, and again the DOE  
12 has come to us when they needed us and now, we are  
13 being dismissed and ignored. Why must our centers,  
14 dedicated to helping families and improving early  
15 education opportunities for New York City children be  
16 the collateral damage of the Mayor's signature  
17 initiative?

18 BRETT SHAMPANER: Good evening, my name  
19 is Brett Shampaner, I'm the Owner and Educational  
20 Director of the Learning Tree, we're a private  
21 preschool in Queens. We've been partnering with the  
22 DOE with UPK, Pre-K for All actually for 20 years and  
23 most recently we were proud to be able to help the  
24 Mayor achieve his goal of 70,000 children enrolled.  
25 For years, as Miss Mulligan just said, CBOs were the

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 backbone of the city's Pre-K program at one time  
3 serving over 90 percent of the children. We fully  
4 support the program structure and appreciate having  
5 an age and developmentally appropriate program that  
6 helps guide the children through their early  
7 childhood education. Over the last few years however,  
8 there have been few trends that have hurt the ability  
9 of CBOs like mine to continue to provide high quality  
10 Pre-K that families of New York City are accustomed  
11 to. Most importantly, the DOE has over expanded Pre-K  
12 for All in the public schools and newly constructed  
13 DOE Pre-K centers and have poached our students even  
14 though the CBOs have enough seats to fill demand. As  
15 Miss Mulligan just said Josh Wallack and the DOE  
16 expansion team admitted to us that they over expanded  
17 and that buildings where millions of dollars were  
18 spent are now operating with empty classes while CBOs  
19 need to rework their budgets to make ends meet and  
20 kindergarten classes across the five boroughs  
21 continue to be overcrowded. In addition, when CBOs  
22 have empty seats, the Department of Education takes  
23 100 percent of that child's funding from the budget.  
24 Although this may seem reasonable on paper, it does  
25 not accurately reflect how a business operates

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 especially in child care and this is how the children  
3 are being shortchanged as I'm about to explain. The  
4 state sets an arbitrary beds date by which our seats  
5 need to be filled or else we lose funding even if we  
6 sign a child up after that date which are... which we  
7 are actually encouraged to do. Some schools like mine  
8 are missing only two children but several others are  
9 missing enough where they have been forced to lay off  
10 staff and close classes. Okay, most of the costs that  
11 go into our budget including rent, payroll,  
12 insurance, and utilities are fixed and do not change  
13 whether we are at 100 percent capacity or we're  
14 missing a half a dozen children, that means the only  
15 areas in our budget where we can take money from are  
16 those that directly impact the children including new  
17 furniture, equipment, trips, toys and manipulatives,  
18 art supplies and family involvement; in short the  
19 items that go directly to the children. Mr. Treyger  
20 earlier said that a budget is not just items and a  
21 number, he said it's a reflection of your values.  
22 Here is how the Department of Education at the city  
23 and state level values the CBOs. Four years when my...  
24 when my school first started this current contract we  
25 were able to spend almost nine percent of our budget

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 on those items that go directly to the children, this  
3 year with missing two seats and having to work with  
4 the same amount of funding and the increases in  
5 direct costs we are now spending just under two  
6 percent of our budget on the children, it's almost  
7 one fifth of what we had initially intended to spend.  
8 The nature of the Pre-K classes demands that the  
9 money be spent on those items that go directly to the  
10 children to aid in socioemotional development, fine  
11 gross motor skills and exploring the world around  
12 them. It's our hope that the City will cease its over  
13 expansion, stop depriving children in the CBOs of the  
14 funds necessary to fulfill the Mayor's initiative and  
15 to provide the highest Pre-K program available to  
16 them. We are willing to work with the City and the  
17 Department of Education to come up with viable  
18 solutions to these critical issues so that children  
19 and small businesses in this city can continue to  
20 succeed. Thank you very much.

21 CARLYN COHEN: Good afternoon, my name is  
22 Carlyn Cohen, I'm the Chief Policy and Public Affairs  
23 Officer at the Chinese American Planning Council,  
24 CPC. We are the nation's largest social services  
25 agency for Asian American New Yorkers serving over

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 60,000 every year in all five boroughs. I would like  
3 to uplift the statements that United Neighborhood  
4 Houses and other CBOs have made so I'm going to keep  
5 this testimony short also in part because I think I  
6 think I just got called to testify at the immigration  
7 hearing. But I want to make sure that one thing goes  
8 on the record, my colleague has been with CPC as an  
9 early childhood educator in our Queens community  
10 center for 47 years. The city of New York pays her  
11 less than a first year DOE teacher, I'm going to  
12 repeat that one more time. The city of New York  
13 chooses to pay an early childhood educator that has,  
14 has been doing that work for nearly 50 years less  
15 than a first year DOE teacher. Thank you for the  
16 opportunity to testify.

17 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I, I thank... I thank  
18 you all for... this is... what you're sharing here is  
19 unacceptable, it has a direct impact on of course the  
20 life of educators but also the children and that's  
21 what we're here about is, is for the kids and I... we  
22 have a lot of work to do and in regards to the  
23 service providers to the wonderful students that we  
24 heard... we heard from I, I could tell you that we, we...  
25 that we hear you loud and clear. This is a

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 frustrating part of government for us because  
3 technically we live in a mayoral control school  
4 system, we have the power to advocate, we have  
5 oversight, we have the bully pulpit, we have... we  
6 could... we, we negotiate but the way he's administered  
7 the... these programs or... for example, we're not  
8 funding enough social workers and counselors for our  
9 kids, it's just... it's just... it's not acceptable so we  
10 will do all that we can within our power of oversight  
11 and from the Council to make sure that the Mayor  
12 hears us loud and clear and what he did to service  
13 providers is unacceptable as well because I, I know  
14 for a fact that many on... are on the verge of  
15 financial collapse and what I'm hearing from young  
16 people and I'm hearing from a number of advocates is  
17 that they want culturally responsive education, they  
18 deserve it well what better way than to partner with  
19 your local CBOs, they know the communities better  
20 than anyone else that could provide that customized  
21 culturally responsive education to our young people  
22 and then continue to fund that all across their  
23 academic careers into schools as well. So, I, I  
24 really appreciate your testimony here today. Thank  
25 you all.



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 ALICE MULLIGAN: Thank you.

3 CARLYN COHEN: Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: The final panel Liz  
5 Accles; Michael Zink; Martin Mintz; Greg Mihailovich  
6 and Maureen Fonseca. Okay, so whenever you folks are  
7 ready turn the... turn the mic on and get started.

8 MICHAEL ZINK: Chair Treyger, Education  
9 Committee and staff thank you for being here so late,  
10 thank you for the opportunity to speak with you  
11 today. My name is Michael Zink and I'm the Assistant  
12 Vice President for Educational Services at the New  
13 York Foundling. In my role I oversee tutoring and  
14 educational advocacy programs for the 837 young  
15 people placed in foster care with the Foundling. The  
16 Foundling is joining with our peer foster care  
17 agencies and child advocacy organizations to call on  
18 the city to include in the 2020 DOE budget five  
19 million dollars to bus transportation to children in  
20 grades K through six in foster care and 1.5 million  
21 dollars to establish a DOE office to be an internal  
22 champion for youth in care and to provide training to  
23 DOE staff on, on essential and commonly misunderstood  
24 policy and practice issues surrounding child welfare  
25 involved families, issues like confidentiality of a

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 child's foster care status, the educational rights of  
3 birth parents, understanding the experiences of child  
4 welfare involved kids and parents and the importance  
5 of school stability. I'll be focusing the balance of  
6 my comments today on transportation and school  
7 stability. Federal law requires us to ensure that,  
8 unless it is in their best interest to do otherwise,  
9 every child is able to stay in their school of origin  
10 upon a foster care placement or home move and for  
11 good reason; to uproot a child in care from their  
12 school, to separate them from their friends and  
13 teachers and to force them to adjust to another  
14 curriculum and another school environment in the  
15 middle of the year compounds the trauma of foster  
16 care and impedes their academic achievement. At the  
17 same time, the limited ability of... availability of  
18 bussing for students in care, along with the  
19 expectation that foster parents escort students on  
20 car service when busing is unavailable, is forcing  
21 case planners and foster families across the city  
22 into untenable positions. The average round trip  
23 commute for a New York Foundling foster parent  
24 escorting a child to school on car service is over an  
25 hour. A foster parent who starts work in Queens at

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 eight a.m. but whose child has to be dropped off at  
3 school at 8:30 in the Bronx or Staten Island,  
4 fundamentally cannot make this schedule work. This  
5 kind of challenge is especially common in kinship  
6 foster care placements where the child's extended  
7 family lives in another borough. Foster parents are  
8 an... are an incredible group of people, but their  
9 powers do not extend to being in two places at once  
10 and sacrifices by foster care staff like the one that  
11 my colleague Dr. Triplett described earlier today are  
12 rare and remarkable but she would be the first to  
13 tell you that they are not scalable. In many cases,  
14 when DOE busing is denied and the foster parent  
15 cannot escort the child on car service the, the  
16 agency must then make a terrible choice between  
17 changing the child's home or changing their school.  
18 An investment in transportation then would support  
19 two important goals, first it would increase the  
20 number of foster parents available to take a child  
21 into their home, limiting the amount of time that  
22 kids await placement in ACS's Children's Center or  
23 elsewhere and making it easier to place kids with  
24 relatives. Secondly, it would reduce the number of  
25 home and school disruptions experienced by students

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 in care, removing a substantial roadblock to these  
3 young people reaching their full potential. We look  
4 forward to continuing the conversation on this issue.

5 MAUREEN FONSECA: Thank you so much Chair  
6 Treyger and the Committee and the staff that's here  
7 for giving us time despite this late hour. I wanted  
8 to commend you on your listening abilities because  
9 that's the essence of leadership and it's been  
10 remarkable to watch even as we waited. But we also  
11 want to thank the, the Council for its longstanding  
12 support of the sports and arts in school's  
13 foundation, SASF. My name is Maureen Fonseca and I am  
14 the CEO of SASF. We are seeking 1.5 million dollars  
15 in fiscal year 20, citywide funding under the  
16 Council's after school enrichment initiative and the  
17 request does represent an increase of 500,000 over  
18 what we received in the FY 19 budget. Our mission is  
19 to help bridge the opportunity gap for New York City  
20 students by extending the school day and the school  
21 year with activities designed to improve their  
22 academic performance, their health and wellness,  
23 their whole attitude towards school, their self-  
24 confidence and, and opportunities for lifelong  
25 employment. So, we were founded as an organization 27

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 years ago focused on sports for a short time, but we  
3 quickly evolved through the years to meet the needs  
4 of New York City's children and families, we also  
5 work with families. Today's academic instruction  
6 makes up more than half of what... of all of our  
7 programs so whether it's STEAM, literacy programs,  
8 leadership and civic and service engagement for our  
9 students as well as a big emphasis on socioemotional  
10 learning this... these provide the pathways to success  
11 for our participants, preparing the middle school  
12 participants for high school and high school  
13 participants for college and helping them navigate  
14 those systems and we have great data to show that  
15 success. We're also tracking data and documenting the  
16 impact of socioemotional learning on the cognitive  
17 development of our children. We have 21 pilot schools  
18 that we're working with, we're sharing that with  
19 other CBOs as well and with DYCD. So, with the  
20 Council as our partner we have become the largest  
21 school-based provider free after school and summer  
22 programming and we annually serve over 35,000  
23 children and young people citywide in all the  
24 boroughs. So... well we're actually in 42 of the 51  
25 Council districts, we operate 317 programs right... in

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 this current year. So... and the overwhelming... I just  
3 wanted to highlight, the overwhelming majority of our  
4 young people are from areas... they're, they're black,  
5 Hispanic, new immigrant populations, children in  
6 temporary housing, families that are struggling  
7 severely and from the highest poverty neighborhoods  
8 of the city. So... and we've been known for very high  
9 quality and for the professional development we do  
10 with our staff, high levels of enrolment and  
11 attendance. So, just quickly to high... the funding of  
12 1.5 million would allow us to extend our programs  
13 into every council district in the city to meet the  
14 rising costs of the existing summer camp programs  
15 especially and increase the camp budget to reflect  
16 the operations that, that we're trying to do to  
17 increase the hours of service by 20 percent and to  
18 have STEAM programs added in every single camp which  
19 we haven't been able to do to date but we have them  
20 in some. So, in order for us to keep innovating we're  
21 asking you to please on behalf of the 35,000 young  
22 people to support our, our request for the 1.5  
23 million. So, thank you for all you've been doing to  
24 support our children.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 MARTIN MINTZ: Good evening everyone,  
3 Chairman Treyger. Thank you so much for the  
4 opportunity to testify today on behalf of Generation  
5 Citizen. My name is Martin Mintz, I am the Program  
6 Manager at Generation Citizen New York City, GCNYC.  
7 GC is a nine-year national nonpartisan, nonprofit  
8 dedicated to bringing civics education back into the  
9 classroom through an... through an engaging pedagogy  
10 action civics. In GC's action civics course students  
11 debate issues directly affecting them like affordable  
12 housing, gun violence, police brutality, domestic  
13 violence or discrimination and work as a class to  
14 decide on one focus issue to address during the  
15 semester. Through our student led program, they  
16 develop strategic action plans to effect systemic  
17 change on an identified issue, implement the plan by  
18 engaging directly with influencers and decision  
19 makers and present their findings at civics day, a  
20 semester end showcase. Students learn valuable  
21 academic life skills like public speaking,  
22 collaboration, and how to work through difference,  
23 they also gain firsthand experience engaging in an  
24 important lifelong habits, understanding how they can  
25 directly inform and influence change in their

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 community through the democratic process. GC is the  
3 largest action civics education organization with a  
4 national model. This year GC will educate  
5 approximately 18,000 students through our flagship  
6 New York City site and five additional sites across  
7 the country. Thanks to the City Council's 1.5 million  
8 investment in GC's program through the civics  
9 education in New York City school's initiative since  
10 fiscal year 2017, GCNYC has tripled our impact in New  
11 York City, educating and empowering approximately  
12 10,550 sixth through twelfth graders via our DC or  
13 democracy coach model. This school year GCNYC  
14 recruited, trained and placed 84 CUNY college  
15 volunteers as chapter directors and DCs in our  
16 classrooms to co-facilitate our curriculum alongside  
17 experienced NYC public school teachers as well as  
18 serve as peer to near peer mentors to students in the  
19 classrooms. We are incredibly thankful for the City  
20 Council's funding which allows GCNYC to provide  
21 stipends to volunteers from our five CUNY college  
22 partners and through that model educate and empower  
23 3,425 students in 130 classrooms this year alone. We  
24 at GC know there's much more to be done and our goal  
25 is to ensure that every single student in the United



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 States gains the knowledge and skills necessary to  
3 participate in our 21<sup>st</sup> century democracy as active  
4 lifelong citizens. GCNYC is encouraged by the De  
5 Blasio Administration's civics for all initiative to  
6 implement civics education in all academic  
7 disciplines. As we have all experiment... as we have  
8 experimented with this approach in our partnership  
9 with city schools with great success. We look forward  
10 to continuing to partner with the Council to deliver  
11 our DC model in the 2019/2020 school year and request  
12 that the Council continue its civics education in New  
13 York City school's initiative. GCNYC appreciates the  
14 Council's leadership and commitment to GC's DC  
15 program model to allow us to expand our impact and  
16 ensure that the next generation of New Yorkers  
17 develops the civic knowledge, skills and dispositions  
18 necessary for them to become active and engaged  
19 citizens of our democracy for the long term. Thank  
20 you and the Committee for your consideration of this  
21 testimony.

22 GREG MIHAILOVICH: Okay, so thank you  
23 Chair Treyger for hanging in there and, and giving me  
24 the opportunity to testify. My name is Greg  
25 Mihailovich, I'm the Community Advocacy Director for

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 the American Heart Association here in New York City.  
3 American Heart Association is the nations oldest and  
4 largest voluntary organization dedicated to fighting  
5 heart disease and stroke and that's why we prioritize  
6 policies that promote children health and instill  
7 healthy habits early on in life. So, you know we've  
8 been here and talked about physical education,  
9 obviously physical education is something that, that  
10 we support and we're... as part of the New York City  
11 Phys Ed for all coalition we're thrilled with the  
12 recent improvement in New York City physical  
13 education under PE Works initiative. Seventy five  
14 percent of schools now meet PE requirements in  
15 2017/18, up from just 54 percent, you know 75 percent  
16 is still... is still a B, right so there's still some  
17 room for improvement. Our concern is that the funding  
18 for PE Works is dedicated through FY 20 but that  
19 funding is going to go away and we're concerned that  
20 these certified PE teachers that are funded by PE  
21 Works they're not going to be sustainable in the long  
22 term so one of the things that we advocate for is  
23 some sort of baseline funding in PE Works to make  
24 sure that the schools that need help keeping those  
25 certified Phys Ed... Phys Ed teachers can keep them...

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 [clears throat] excuse me... also additionally we know  
3 that beyond certified PE teachers a lot of schools  
4 don't have adequate space for PE so that's why we're...  
5 we thank you for including an examination of adequate  
6 PE space as part of the planning to learn project.

7 The universal PE initiative was helpful in starting  
8 that conversation to make sure kids have adequate PE  
9 space but it's only 76 schools out of the hundreds so  
10 we would like to continue that expanding the funding  
11 in FY 20 and beyond to make sure that everyone has  
12 space for PE. After school athletic activities, we  
13 appreciate what the Council is doing to make sure  
14 that there's equitable access, part of that is also  
15 making sure that there's funding for athletic fields  
16 and running tracks. Personally when I went to high  
17 school in New York City and my school did not have a  
18 field, did not have a track, we were... just had to go  
19 all over the place to do the athletic stuff, so  
20 making sure the kids have the access help keep that  
21 healthy lifestyle and finally CPR in schools. Part of  
22 the New York high school requirement is being trained  
23 in hands only CPR and it's great, but we always ask  
24 the Council to establish and maintain a one million  
25 dollar fund to help schools support this program.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 There are low, low cost and free options but funding  
3 this really helps the school. When you have a school  
4 that has hundreds of students for one beat up CPR  
5 mannequin you can really kind of expand and help that  
6 because cardiac arrest is sudden, nine out of ten  
7 people die because they didn't get CPR when they  
8 needed it, by making sure that these kids learn  
9 these, these skills you're training the next  
10 generational life savers and it makes a difference in  
11 the long term. Thank you for your support, we look  
12 forward to continuing to collaborate on children's  
13 health in New York City and eight seconds to spare.

14 MAUREEN FONSECA: You get a prize.

15 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you for being  
16 timely but very effective and I thank the entire  
17 panel, we have a lot of work to do in this budget.  
18 Thank you so much.

19 MAUREEN FONSECA: Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And with that I  
21 believe this hearing is now adjourned.

22 [gavel]

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date

May 8, 2019