

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE
& LABOR

Jointly with

COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY
MANAGEMENT

And

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

----- X

October 22, 2025
Start: 10:18 a.m.
Recess: 12:51 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Carmen N. De La Rosa
Chairperson

Joann Ariola
Chairperson

Yusef Salaam
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Tiffany Cabán
Erik D. Bottcher
Eric Dinowitz

Oswald Feliz
Kamillah Hanks
Julie Menin
Frank Morano
Francisco P. Moya
Simcha Felder
James F. Gennaro
Kevin C. Riley
Lynn C. Schulman
Susan Zhuang
Diana Ayala
Robert F. Holden
Rita C. Joseph
Christopher Marte
Chi A. Ossé
Althea V. Stevens

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Richard Napolitano
NYPD Assistant Chief

Bienvenido Martinez
NYPD Communications Director

Paul Miano
FDNY EMS Chief

Denise Werner
FDNY Chief Emergency Medical Dispatch

Oren Barzilay
FDNY EMS Local 2507

Tabitha Sheppard
President PCT Local 5911 DC37

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Kadeem Denoon
Vice President Local 5911 DC37

Iliana Gordon
PCT

Christopher Leon Johnson

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 4

3 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good morning. Good
4 morning. Welcome to the New York City Council
5 hearing on the Committee on Civil Service and Labor
6 joint with Fire and Emergency Management and Public
7 Safety. At this time, please silence all electronics
8 and do not approach the dais. I repeat, please do
9 not approach the dais at this time. If you have
10 testimony, make sure also have filled out a slip with
11 the Sergeant at Arms, and if you have any questions,
12 you can also contact the Sergeant at Arms. Chairs,
13 you may begin.

14 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: [gavel] Welcome
15 to today's hearing of the New York City Council's
16 Committee on Civil Service and Labor. I am Council
17 Member De La Rosa, Chair of the Committee. I am
18 joined by Council Member and Minority Leader Joann
19 Ariola, Chair of the Fire and Emergency Management
20 Committee, as well as Council Member Yusef Salaam,
21 Chair of the Committee on Public Safety. Today's
22 hearing is focused on working conditions for our
23 City's 911 emergency response workers who work
24 tirelessly to deliver aid to New Yorkers in their
25 times of crisis. Each year, the City's 911 operators
receive over 7 million calls. These calls set in

3 motion a variety of emergency responses and protocols
4 which are coordinated across thousands of first
5 responders. The NYPD's 911 Dispatchers or Police
6 Communications Technicians must make assessments
7 about which teams to contact for each specific
8 emergency, ranging from Emergency Medical Units,
9 firefighters, patrol officers, team of service social
10 workers, or behavioral health professionals.
11 However, these individuals dedicate their lives to
12 responding to the needs of New Yorkers.

13 Unfortunately, many of these roles are not met with
14 guarantees of fair pay and working conditions, and
15 they deserve-- that they deserve for their service.
16 Despite working in high-stress roles and high-
17 incidences of traumatic experiences, many workers are
18 barely making above minimum wage. Additionally,
19 emergency medical responders, including paramedics
20 and emergency medical technicians, have faced chronic
21 understaffing, high attrition, and mandatory overtime
22 for the past three years, all while working without a
23 contract. Despite promises from then candidate Eric
24 Adams during his mayoral campaign, that EMS workers
25 would receive improvements to their pay, no such
agreement has come to fruition. Before we begin, I

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 6

3 want to express our collective disappointment that
4 the Office of Labor Relations has declined to testify
5 today. While we recognize that labor negotiations
6 are confidential, OLR plays a central role in
7 ensuring that essential workers receive fair
8 contracts and working conditions. Their
9 participation today would have provided valuable
10 insights into the City's ongoing efforts to address
11 the longstanding challenges facing these employees.
12 We share the frustrations of many of our emergency
13 workers and are deeply discouraged that this
14 administration in its final days has chosen to not
15 engage with this council on such a critical issue
16 affecting those who protect and serve New Yorkers.
17 This job is hard. The questions are hard, but the
18 council has a responsibility to come up with answers
19 for the issues that are plaguing our city, and the
20 fact that this administration continues to disrespect
21 this Council by not sending a full panel to answer
22 our questions is truly disappointing and egregious.
23 The Council is committed to ensuring that our City's
24 emergency responders are guaranteed good working
25 conditions and fair pay, that they are met with good
faith bargaining practices, and that their titles are

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 7

3 fully staffed and ready to meet the moment for any
4 New Yorker who needs assistance. We look forward to
5 a productive hearing today, and I hope to learn more
6 about both the challenges and solutions for the
7 problems facing our city's heroes. I'd like to thank
8 Committee staff, Senior Policy Analyst Elizabeth
9 Artz, and Senior Legislative Counsel Rie Ogasawara
10 for their hard work in preparing for this hearing.
11 I'd also like to thank my staff, Chief of Staff
12 James Burke [sp?], Legislative Director Kiana Diaz
13 [sp?], and Communications Director Freya Familia
14 [sp?] for their hard work. Furthermore, we recognize
15 that on the Civil Service and Labor Committee we've
16 been joined by Council Members Marte, Dinowitz,
17 Cabán, Felder, Salaam, and I know there's some
18 others that are here that are part of the Fire and
19 Emergency Management Committee as well. I now turn
20 to Chair Ariola for her opening remarks.

21 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Thank you, Chair,
22 and align myself with your comments regarding this
23 administration and the absence of OLR at this
24 hearing. Good morning and welcome to this hearing
25 of the Committee on Fire and Emergency Management
meeting jointly with the Committees on Public Safety

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 8

3 and Civil Service and Labor. I am Chairperson Joann
4 Ariola, and I represent the 32nd Council District in
5 Queens. I would like to thank my co-chairs, Chair
6 Salaam and Chair De La Rosa, for holding this hearing
7 today. I would also like to recognize the members of
8 Fire and Emergency Management Committee who are
9 currently present. One is Chair De La Rosa, and
10 another is new to our committee. Welcome, Council
11 Member Simcha Felder. Today, the Committee will be
12 examining an issue that has been at the center of the
13 Committee for numerous years which is the working
14 conditions of our first responders. Our firefighters
15 have been doing work that is nothing short of heroes.
16 They risk their lives every day to protect New
17 Yorkers from fires and other hazardous conditions. We
18 want to take a look at our bravest working
19 conditions, specifically housing, improvements on
20 gear, and any challenges that are faced by the
21 Department as it relates to working conditions. As
22 previously stated by my colleague, our city's 911
23 Dispatchers receive over 7 million calls. Often our
24 medical and fire dispatchers are overworked with long
25 shifts, and yet, they work tirelessly to keep our
city safe and help those in need. We look forward to

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 9

3 hearing specific concerns when it comes to taking our
4 city's calls in the 911 system. Additionally, EMS
5 has historically been affected by numerous areas of
6 alarm regarding attrition, overtime usage of EMS
7 workers as a result in multiple consecutive shifts,
8 assaults on EMS workers, and above all, EMS pay
9 parity. EMS salaries should be comparable to their
10 counterparts in the FDNY and NYPD. By remedying this
11 longstanding pay disparity, the City would help
12 provide equality among EMS and other emergency medial
13 personnel. With that said, we look forward to
14 hearing testimony from the administration on this
15 topic and exploring how this council can continue its
16 dedication in delivering world-class emergency
17 responses to New Yorkers and our city's visitors. I
18 will now turn the microphone back over to Chair De La
19 Rosa.

20 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you so
21 much, Chair. We've also been joined by Council
22 Member Morano as well as Council Member Holden. I now
23 turn over to Chair Salaam for his statement on his
24 resolution.

25 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Good morning
everyone. I'm Council Member Yusef Salaam, Chair to

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 10

3 the Committee on Public Safety. I want to welcome
4 everyone and thank my colleagues Chair De La Rosa of
5 Civil Service and Labor and Chair Ariola of Fire and
6 Emergency Management for co-chairing this very
7 important joint oversight hearing on working
8 conditions within New York City's emergency response
9 system. We are joined by Public Safety Committee
10 Members Marte, Holden, and Cabán. From a public
11 safety perspective, the issues we will discuss today
12 go to the very heart of how our city responds in
13 moments of crisis. When a New Yorker dials 911,
14 whether they are reporting a crime, a fire, or
15 emergency medical situation, their first point of
16 contact is often a Police Communications Technician,
17 commonly referred to as a 911 operator or dispatcher.
18 These professionals answer our calls for help, triage
19 emergencies and coordinate with fire and EMS-- to
20 direct police, fire and EMS units personnel and
21 equipment-- and equipment emergencies. The accuracy,
22 speed and judgement of these operators are vital to
23 saving lives and getting help to the public. In
24 recent years, we have seen troubling signs that the
25 system is under strain. Reports from dispatchers,
union leaders and oversight entities point to

3 staffing shortages, excessive mandatory overtime, and
4 burnout among 911 operators. These conditions affect
5 workers and threaten the reliability and the
6 timeliness of the city's entire emergency response
7 network. We have also heard concerns about delayed
8 or mishandled 911 response during major incidents,
9 operators working 16-hour shifts and a growing
10 reliance on overtime to fill essential coverage gaps.
11 These are not just labor issues. They are public
12 safety issues. When our emergency call system is
13 stretched thin, it directly impacts how quickly help
14 arrives when New Yorkers need it most. Additionally,
15 we want to discuss NYPD's continued challenges with
16 overall headcount, recruitment and retention of
17 uniformed officers, and consider how these pressures
18 compound one another. From the moment a 911 call is
19 received to when officers are dispatched on the
20 ground, ensuring adequate staffing, proper working
21 conditions and modernized supported systems for both
22 dispatchers and responding officers is critical to
23 maintaining the public safety. Today, this committee
24 wants to better understand the scope of these
25 challenges. We want to know how the NYPD is
addressing staff shortages among operators and

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 12

3 officers and ensuring that they are not overworked or
4 fatigued and adequately staffed. We also want to hear
5 what safeguards fire and-- what safeguards are in
6 place to ensure that emergency calls including those
7 related to mental health are answered and triaged
8 accurately without delay. Our goal is to understand
9 how the Department plans to stabilize both its
10 civilian and uniformed workforce so that New Yorkers
11 can count on timely and effective emergency
12 responses. I thank all our witnesses and
13 participants for being here today, and we look
14 forward to a thoughtful and construction discussion.
15 I'll now turn it back to Chair de La Rosa.

16 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you so
17 much, Chair Salaam. We will now hear testimony from
18 representatives of the NYPD and the FDNY. I turn the
19 Committee Counsel to administer the oath for this
20 panel.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell
22 the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth
23 before this committee and to respond honestly to
24 Council Member questions?

25 UNIDENTIFIED: I do.

UNIDENTIFIED: I do.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 13

3 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you.

4 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Good morning, Chair De
5 La Rosa, Chair Ariola, Chair Salaam and members of
6 the Council. I'm Assistant Chief Richard Napolitano,
7 Commanding Office of the Office of the First Deputy
8 Commissioner of the New York City Police Department.
9 I am joined today by Inspector Bienvenido Martinez,
10 Commanding Officer of the Department's Communications
11 Division, as well as our partners from the New York
12 City Fire Department. On behalf of Police
13 Commissioner Tisch, we thank you for the opportunity
14 to discuss the critical services provided by the
15 Department's Police Communications Technicians, or
16 PCTs, who serve as the Department's 911 call
17 operators. Under Commissioner Tisch, the Department
18 has taken substantial steps to reduce call delays in
19 the 911 system time while simultaneously enhancing
20 the quality of life for our PCTs. We look forward to
21 sharing with you the significant strides we've made
22 towards both of these goals. PCTs serve as the hub
23 for the Department's daily efforts to ensure public
24 safety. As 911 call-takers they serve as the first
25 point of contact to New Yorkers in moments of stress,
agony, and sometimes terror. The 911 call-takers

then share vital information with the PCTs serving as
dispatchers to generate a rapid and effective police
response. All of this must be done quickly,
accurately and with sensitivity to the needs of
witnesses and victims calling for help. This is
demanding and stressful work and the Department has
responsibility to ensure the health and welfare of
our PCTs. This is why one of Commissioner Tisch's
earliest priorities as Police Commissioner was to
optimize the efficiency of the call-taking system,
expedite hiring, bolster training and improve the
quality of life of our PCTs. The most important step
has been to increase staffing levels. We have hired
over 200 PCTs since April. With another class
expected before the end of the year, we are on track
to far surpass 2023 and 2024 PCT hiring. We analyze
where inefficiencies exist in our deployment of PCTs
and discover that certain tours were understaffed
while others were over-staffed. These mistakes have
been corrected. We found particular staffing
challenges for PCTs working 10-hour and 12-hour
tours, so we reintroduced the eight-hour tours for
PCTs. We also created a voluntary over-time sign-up
system and allowed PCTs to swap tours as necessary.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 15

3 This ensures flexibility and allows PCTs to better
4 schedule their days. These adjustments helped our
5 PCTs and simultaneously resulted in a reduction in
6 call delays. Between January and the end of
7 September 2024, there were 189,343 delayed calls and
8 in the same period in 2025, there was 108,421 delayed
9 calls, a 42.7 percent decrease year-to-date. Year
10 over year looking at September 2024 compared to
11 September 2025, we decreased call delays by 87
12 percent. Now the Department answers 92 percent of
13 calls within five seconds, and 98 percent of calls
14 within 30 seconds. For comparison, the established
15 national standard for 911 calls is that 90 percent
16 should be answered within 15 seconds. We also
17 realized that we needed additional supervisory
18 oversight in the 911 system. We now require a
19 supervisor to review response times every two hours,
20 and to make real-time decisions about staffing and
21 job assignment. What that means, for example, is
22 that when a call comes over and there are no nearby
23 units available to respond, the desk sergeant is
24 alerted to the delay and we will either re-direct a
25 call that is responding to a less critical job or
reach out to an adjoining precinct for assistance.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 16

3 The small change helps quickly direct responses to
4 emergencies and drive down response times. The
5 Department is also taking steps to improve working
6 conditions for PCTs and boost morale. We're having
7 regular meetings with DC37 and Local 5911, the unions
8 representing the PCTs, to understand the concerns of
9 PCTs and affirmatively address them. We're working
10 to update and modernize 911 call centers where PCTs
11 work. We are taking steps to recognize our top-
12 performing PCTs for their outstanding efforts, and we
13 are making sure that when a PCT experiences a
14 traumatic call, that the PCT is able to take a break
15 from the phones and has mental health resources
16 available to provide support. The PCTs are so
17 important to the Department and to the people of New
18 York City, and we must continue to provide them with
19 resources and support. Thank you for the opportunity
20 to speak with you today, and we look forward to
21 answering any questions you may have.

22 ACTING CHIEF MIANO: Good morning, Chair
23 Ariola and members of the Fire Emergency Management
24 Committee, Chair De La Rosa and members of the Civil
25 Service and Labor Committee, and Chair Salaam and
members of the Public Safety Committee. My name is

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 17

3 Paul Miano and I am the Acting Chief of EMS for the
4 Fire Department of New York. Today is my first day
5 as the Acting Chief of EMS for the Fire Department of
6 New York, and I am honored to spend part of it here
7 with the Council Members who sit in these committees.

8 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Congratulations
9 and welcome.

10 ACTING CHIEF MIANO: Thank you. Thank
11 you.

12 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Very much so.

13 ACTING CHIEF MIANO: I am joined by
14 Denise Werner, Chief of Emergency Medical Dispatch.
15 I appreciate the opportunity to speak on this
16 oversight topic, an issue that directly affects the
17 men and women who continuously give life to this
18 city, working conditions within New York City's
19 emergency response system. FDNY, EMTs, and
20 paramedics are amongst the hardest working people in
21 city service. They work long, demanding tours,
22 moving from emergency to emergency, providing medical
23 care, and saving lives hour after hour. Ambulances
24 cover every corner of New York City and its
25 surrounding waters, responding everywhere from the
tallest high-rise above to the deepest tunnels below.

Each member is assigned to a station where they report at the start of their tour, and then head to a predesignated cross-street location within the surrounding neighborhood, but the reality is they go wherever the calls for medical assistance takes them. On a busy day, a crew can transport a patient to a hospital and be called into action again before they even leave the ambulance bay. It is not uncommon for EMS members to start their tour in borough and finish it in another, never once seeing their assigned cross-street location. In a recent tour I spent on an ambulance with one of my crews, I responded to calls in three different boroughs myself. My priority is always the safety of our members. The reality is that EMS work often puts them in dangerous situations. EMTs and paramedics walk into the unknown on every single call, inside homes, out on the streets, below in the subways, anywhere someone needs help. They face situations that can turn unpredictable fast. At any moment, they can be confronted with a combative patient, distraught family members, or a chaotic crowd. During these moments, our members are threatened and too often they are assaulted while simply trying to save a

life. We train FDNY, EMTs and paramedics to stay safe in every situation they face. From their first day on the job and throughout their careers, they receive ongoing instructions focused on recognizing and managing danger. That includes how to deal with aggressive patients, false calls intended to lure members, and how to recognize potential threats to our city and our homeland. We teach them to size up a scene before they ever step out of a vehicle, maintain situational awareness, to never separate and keep in constant communication with their partners, identify an escape route and stay alert to everything happening around them. Our members are taught to clear exit paths, keep a safe distance from onlookers, and take control of the scene. They are also trained in tactical communication, knowing how to talk to be people under stress, how to de-escalate volatile situations, and how to keep themselves and others safe. While EMS members train and prepare for every imaginable scenario, tragedies still occur. In the last nine years, two of our own have lost their lives to senseless acts of violence while serving the people of the city. In 2017, EMT Adira Arroyo [sp?], a 14-year veteran, was murdered by an individual who

hijacked her ambulance. In 2022, Captain Allison Russo [sp?], a 24-year veteran, was murdered in an unprovoked knife attack. We mourn their loss and the loss of all of our members who have died in the line of duty, including those who have been victims of vehicular accidents like Andre Leham [sp?], communicable diseases like Tracy Allen Lee [sp?], cardiac events like Barbara Poppo [sp?], and injuries sustained while caring for others like Brendan Pearson [sp?]. Today and every day, their memory and their legacy continue to drive the Department's commitment to keeping every member safe. EMS members are trained to check premise histories of an address when available before they arrive so they have a better sense of the environment they are walking into. We work closely with our NYPD partners, and our EMTs and paramedics know that they can immediately call for help if they encounter weapons, acts of violence, or if the tone of a scene begins to turn aggressive. Members are trained to recognize when a situation may become unsafe and to act quickly by calling for assistance. Communicating with dispatchers who can alert nearby units, and in the worst cases, removing themselves completely from

3 danger. We know that not every scene is going to be
4 an ideal circumstance. However, when we approach a
5 situation, EMTs and paramedics ask themselves is the
6 scene safe enough. That is why the Department works
7 to make sure every member has the training, awareness
8 and support they need to complete their tour safely
9 and go home afterward unharmed to their families.

10 Beyond physical danger, the work of an EMT or
11 paramedic takes a heavy mental/emotional toll. Our
12 members operate in high-pressure situations where
13 every decision they make can mean the difference
14 between life and death. They are expected to be the
15 calm in the midst of chaos. Day after day, they
16 witness tragedy, trauma and loss while trying to
17 comfort people who are experiencing the worst moments
18 of their lives. It could be even harder when the
19 person in need is one of our own or another first
20 responder. When a police officer or a firefighters
21 is injured, it is my members who come to their aid.
22 Carrying the weight of being the difference between
23 life and death for both civilians and fellow first
24 responders can take a serious toll, leading to
25 stress, anxiety, depression, and post-traumatic
stress. To support our members, the Department has

3 built a strong network of mental health resources
4 through our Counseling Service Unit known as CSU.
5 Established more than 35 years ago, CSU has become a
6 national model for first responder mental health
7 care. It is staffed by FDNY members, volunteers, and
8 licensed mental health professionals who understand
9 the unique pressures of this work. The team includes
10 social workers, counselors, and for those in the
11 world trade health center programs, psychiatrists and
12 nurses. Every clinician is trained in specialized
13 therapies such as eye movement desensitization and
14 reprocessing which treats post-traumatic stress and
15 emotionally-focused therapy which helps members
16 process intense emotional responses. CSU provides
17 evaluation, treatment and referrals through the five
18 locations across the City. Members can connect in-
19 person or by phone 24 hours a day, seven days a week,
20 and every service is free and completely
21 confidential. In addition to clinical support, the
22 department runs a peer-to-peer program that connects
23 current and retired FDNY members directly with their
24 colleagues in the field. The program was recently
25 expanded and now operates two full tours of trained
peers who are available five days a week. We have

even added a therapy dog. Peer members visit stations throughout the year and service as proactive outreach, often bridging the gap between a member who is struggling and the professional help they may need. While CSU teams routinely visit EMS stations, they are also called upon to respond after major incidents such as a line of duty death or a serious injury, a major vehicle collision, a mass casualty event, or a pediatric cardiac arrest, or pediatric abuse call. Peer support members go to the scene, to hospitals and EMS stations to offer immediate support and then follow up as needed in the ensuing days and weeks. It can be difficult for a first responder to ask for help. In the past, doing so may have been viewed by some as a form of weakness, but Commissioner Tucker has made it a priority to change that mindset. He has emphasized the importance of destigmatizing mental health care and building a Department philosophy that encourages members to reach out before a problem becomes a crisis. CSU staff speak regularly at EMS Academy meetings-- at the EMS Academy, meeting with new EMTs, paramedics, and officers to reinforce that seeking support is a sign of strength, not a sign of weakness. Through

3 continued leadership, education, and normalizing
4 health care, we are working to make mental health as
5 much a part of our readiness as our physical and
6 operational safety training. EMS offers multiple
7 career paths for our members. Most begin their
8 service as EMTs and can advance through civil service
9 promotion exams to become paramedics. Once
10 paramedics, they can move into supervisory ranks such
11 as Lieutenant, Captain and Chief. Others choose to
12 take the civil service exam to become firefighters.
13 Chair Ariola is very familiar with that process,
14 having sponsored legislation that addressed an issue
15 of fairness for EMS members who missed the
16 firefighter exam because COVID-related delays. The
17 FDNY is grateful for her continued support for our
18 workforce. Another issue that Council Members have
19 raised in prior hearings is EMS pay. I have discussed
20 through my testimony the work of an EMT or paramedic--
21 that the work of an EMT and paramedic is demanding
22 both physically and emotionally. Every day they
23 respond to critical emergencies, make life or death
24 decisions, and represent this Department with
25 professionalism and compassion. I wear the paramedic
on my uniform-- I wear the paramedic patch on my

3 uniform's right shoulder with pride, and I have
4 witnessed and experienced firsthand the burden
5 carried by our EMTs and paramedics. When New Yorkers
6 call 911 because they fear their health or even their
7 life, it is-- they fear for their health or even
8 their lives, it is EMS members who respond and use
9 our formidable skills and training to give each
10 patient his or her best hope for recovery.
11 Compensation for that expertise is not determined by
12 the FDNY. It is established through collective
13 bargaining with the City's Office of Labor Relations.
14 The unions representing our EMS members are currently
15 in contract negotiations, and while the outcome is
16 not within the Department's control, we hope a
17 contract resolution will be reached soon. EMS
18 members are known as New York City's best. My
19 members deserve the best. New York City runs on the
20 strength of its people, and no one embodies that
21 strength more than the members of EMS. I thank the
22 members of the Council for their attention to these
23 issues and for their continued support. I'll be
24 happy to answer any questions at this time.

25 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you so
much, and again, congratulations on your first day.

3 Trial by fire, literally. I want to say that I would
4 be remiss if I didn't acknowledge that you all are
5 here, and that you're willing and the disposition of
6 answering this council's questions, and that is
7 important. As we noted the absence of OLR, we do
8 want to uplift your presence here, and we are hoping
9 as we take these issues so seriously because they're
10 the issues that New Yorkers are talking to us every
11 single day, that we're able to have a productive
12 conversation, and from your testimony that seems that
13 is the energy we're going into this hearing with. I
14 have a few questions for the NYPD and, you know, we
15 have a lot of questions overall. So, I'm going to
16 try not to hog up too much time. But I do want to
17 ask about-- the NYPD about recruitment for PCTs.
18 What's the average recruitment timeline for new PCTs
19 from exam to full certification?

20 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: It varies. So, but if
21 I had to speculate on an average, I would say
22 approximately six months from when they actually take
23 the exam to when they're hired.

24 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Great. And I'm
25 sorry, I would be remiss if I didn't recognize we've
26 been joined by Council Members Riley and Council

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 27

3 Member Bottcher. And so how many new hires are
4 projected for the next fiscal year to reach full
5 staffing capacity?

6 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: We're going to try to
7 hire around 400 new.

8 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: 400.

9 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Maybe possibly even
10 more.

11 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay. And
12 what's the shortfall right now? What is the gap?

13 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: The shortfall-- our
14 headcount allotment is actually 1,409, and we're
15 currently at 1,288.

16 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: And it seems
17 that for the active headcount for PCTs, 911
18 operators, there was a budget for 1,298, and so
19 you're going to-- that's what you have currently?

20 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: We have 1,288
21 currently. We're budgeted for 1,409.

22 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: 14, okay.

23 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: So, we're below the
24 actual allotment.

25 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay. Thank you
for answering those three questions on--

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 28

3 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: [interposing] You're
4 welcome.

5 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: PCTs. I want to
6 go into a little bit about working conditions, and
7 I'm sure that my colleagues will ask more questions
8 about the timeline and the experience of PCTs, but
9 what is the off-- what are the official maximum shift
10 lengths for 911 operators, and how often are these
11 exceeded in practice?

12 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: The maximum is 16
13 hours, but I'm going to defer to Inspector Martinez
14 to answer the second part of the question.

15 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay.

16 INSPECTOR MARTINEZ: Currently, we have
17 three shifts. We have a 12-hour shift, a 10-hour
18 shift, and then we just recently implemented in July
19 an eight-hour shift for our members.

20 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: How often are
21 the maximums exceeded, the 16-hour shifts?

22 INSPECTOR MARTINEZ: We don't exceed the
23 maximum. We just reached 16. For the most part, we
24 try to have them from two to four hours at the max.

25 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: How often are
PCTs required to work consecutive double shifts, 16+

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 29

3 hours, and what safeguards are in place in the new
4 contract to prevent fatigue?

5 INSPECTOR MARTINEZ: Currently, we don't
6 work past 16 hours. So, the max again is 16 hours
7 for the people that work 12 hours, or the people that
8 work 10 hours, usually is 14 hours, and for the
9 people that work eight hours, it would be 12 hours
altogether. We never exceed the 16-hour threshold.

10 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Is that a new
11 change or a new shift, because we've heard testimony
12 and analytical stories from workers who have said
13 that they've been booked to work double shifts?

14 INSPECTOR MARTINEZ: Would that be 24
15 hours or 32 hours? I'm trying to understand the
16 question.

17 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: My question is,
18 are there instances when the PCTs have been required
19 to work consecutive 16-hour shifts doubles?

20 INSPECTOR MARTINEZ: Not to my knowledge.

21 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay. Well,
22 we'll dig more into that in a bit. How does the
23 Department manage and operate sleep deprivation and
24 burnout?

25

3 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: We're doing our best
4 to staff up, and you're going to hear me probably say
5 this numerous times-- the 911 center, there's no way
6 to address this issue without hiring more people.
7 Commissioner Tisch understands that. She gets it.
8 She's the strongest supporter of the PCTs. She's
9 reduced overtime her first time she was here from
10 2014 to 2019. She's doing everything to increase the
11 headcount which would in turn reduce the overtime.
12 We've done it before under her guidance, and I know
13 we're going to do it again.

14 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay. And then,
15 what if an employee refuses to do the mandatory
16 overtime? What is the policy? And are there any
17 disciplinary actions that are applied?

18 INSPECTOR MARTINEZ: For the most part,
19 when the PCTs are at order, they tend to work the
20 mandatory overtime. In some instances when they say
21 they can't work the overtime, at times I even discuss
22 it with the union and they bring it to my attention.
23 If they can't work the overtime, again, we have to
24 provide our services to, you know, public New York.
25 One or two people that expressed that there may be
fatigue or tire, I'll allow them to go home.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 31

3 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: So, it's at the
4 discretion of the Department?

5 INSPECTOR MARTINEZ: Discretion and also
6 the needs of the Department. We have a certain
7 volume we have to maintain the flow, so we'll have to
8 hold them. But again, it's on a case by case basis,
9 and on occurrences people have brought it to my
10 attention, and I allow them to go home without any
11 type of discipline.

12 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay. I feel
13 responsibility as the Chair of this Labor Committee
14 to bring up an instance that I heard from the worker.
15 There was a 911 operator that I spoke to who said
16 that she has an open ACS case because she was unable
17 to be there for her child, and the school was calling
18 and the school was trying to get a hold of her, and
19 she was unable to leave her post because of the
20 mandatory overtime and no accommodations were made.
21 And so this worker now has an open ACS case, and that
22 is just one of the many stories we've heard. We've
23 heard instances where 911 operators are sleeping in
24 cots in the Department. And my question as a follow-
25 up is in situations where we're seeing that there is
an impact on the daily lives of these workers, and

3 they're saying we cannot, you know, perform a double
4 shift or the mandatory overtime at this time. I
5 understand that if everyone does it, then the
6 Department cannot function. But if there are
7 accommodations that are requested based on these
8 types of life circumstances, what is the policy of
9 the Department to accommodate?

10 INSPECTOR MARTINEZ: Well, the policy is
11 they bring it to the attention of either the
12 administration or the personnel office. Currently,
13 we have 92 either accommodations or hardships, and we
14 work with them on a case-by-case basis. Again, the
15 communication and [inaudible] with the members-- I
16 continuously walk the floor and they bring issues to
17 my attention. If the particular instance that you
18 mentioned with the ACS worker, I'm not aware with
19 that one, but again, I'm always open to have a
20 discussion with my PCTs. I've been there a little
21 amount of time, but I make myself available. Anytime
22 that anyone has to-- want to have a discussion with
23 me, I'm there to listen.

24 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay. And I'm
25 happy to chat more offline about that particular
case. In terms of salary, how does the NYPD justify

3 a starting-- the maximum salary for PCTs in the range
4 between \$42,000 and \$58,000 in comparison to Nassau
5 County whose starting salary is about \$75, and cities
6 like Boston and Los Angeles who are closer to
7 \$100,000.

8 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: We know how difficult
9 a job being a New York City 911 operators is, and we
10 would love to see them receive higher pay. However,
11 we're not in control of that. So, that is something
12 that the bargaining table between the union and OLR
13 will have to figure that out. But we are the biggest
14 fans of 911 operators, because we see what they do.

15 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: I, you know,
16 fully understand the collective bargaining impacts
17 here, and just want to note that this is why it would
18 be important to have OLR at the table to have these
19 conversations.

20 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Understood.

21 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: To at least
22 listen to our concerns as we navigate the contract
23 negotiations that are upcoming. Going into 911
24 response. What the current average wait time for a
25 caller to reach a live 911 operator during peak and
off-peak hours?

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 34

3 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: The average wait time
4 for all 911 calls is two seconds, and that's actually
5 for peak and off-peak times, because during off-peak
6 times, the only thing that changes is the volume of
7 calls dropped, but we staff up to handle that volume
8 of calls. So, it's pretty level right across the
9 board.

10 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: A few months ago
11 our committee held a hearing where we were shocked to
12 listen to a 911 recording where the call went to
13 voicemail, and DC37 President, Executive Director
14 Henry Garido brought up the situation about calls
15 being routed to an automatic message due to the
16 unavailability of operators. How often do callers
17 receive voicemail.

18 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Thank you for that
19 question, and I want to make it clear, the 911 system
20 has never had a voicemail. What happened was there
21 was a voice message when the caller would wait 30
22 seconds, they would play a voice message to let them
23 know to wait for the next available operator, but
24 there was a tone in that message for the deaf and
25 hard of hearing. if they had a TTY device. To just
explain what that is, is the tone is sent across the

3 landline or the cell phone and it's transcribed into
4 letters. So, they would hear that tone and they
5 would be confused that that was a voicemail, and it
6 was understandable. So, as soon as that was brought
7 to our attention, as soon as we found out about that,
8 we immediately changed that message, that delay
9 message is what we call it, to the current one, and
10 that happened on April 10th. But just to repeat
11 that, 911 has never had a voicemail.

12 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: So, there's no
13 voicemail. So, if a person is calling in, what will
14 happen if they don't get through to a person, they're
15 just put on hold?

16 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: If there's not an
17 answer within-- the phone's going to ring. So, it's
18 going to say-- you could say five, six second rings.
19 You're going to hear that. then it's going to go to
20 a voice message that's going to say, "Please hold for
21 the next available operator. There are none
22 currently available." That's what'll happen. Then
23 once it's ready for a call-taker has open, you know,
24 basically and open slot to take that call. Then it
25 will transfer to the call-taker. You're going to hear
a very short ring, you know, maybe a half a second

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 36

3 and then the call-taker will pick up the phone, and
4 say, "911, do you need police, fire or medical?"

5 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay.

6 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: So, there's absolutely
7 no voicemail and there never has been.

8 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: So, but you
9 mentioned the 30 seconds. So, at the 30-second mark,
10 they get this message.

11 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: They do.

12 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay.

13 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: And that message that
14 was so confusing was changed on April 10th of this
15 year.

16 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: So, how often--
17 do you have data that shows how often callers are
18 getting the 30-second, sort of, message?

19 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Yes, I do. There was
20 111,973 delays for this year. So, they would hear
21 that message that many times. They may just hear the
22 first second of that message, because then a call-
23 taker picks it up. But any time there's a delay
24 which is defined as when there's no operator
25 available for 30 seconds after they dial 911.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 37

3 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: And after the 30
4 seconds, what is the additional delay, what are you
5 finding is the average delay time?

6 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Well, our average
7 answer time is two seconds.

8 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Yes, but 11,100
9 something three times that, it went over the 30
10 seconds.

11 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Yes.

12 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: How long?

13 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: We don't delineate
14 after 30 seconds, we just have the total number of
15 delays, but from being there for many years, I'm very
16 confident it's just right around the 30 seconds.
17 Most calls even when you hit the delay, they're
18 picked up within a couple of seconds after.

19 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay. it would
20 be important for us as we, you know, examine the
21 delay process to have a tracking delay practice, to
22 have a tracking of how many times it goes past the 30
23 seconds, and have an approximation of how long that
24 time is. Is it at 60 seconds? You know, how long?
25 Because it is important--

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 38

3 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: [interposing] I can go
4 back and see if we can take a look at that and figure
5 that out.

6 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay. Sounds
7 good. I have a ton more questions, but I want to pass
8 it to my co-chairs and I do have a few questions for
9 Fire, but I will come back after Chair Ariola.

10 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Thank you, Chair.
11 So, thank you, EMS. Thank you for what you do.
12 Thank you for doing it being underpaid, underserved,
13 not having enough equipment, not having enough
14 ambulances, and having enumerable calls that you have
15 to address. And you do all of that, and you save
16 people's lives, and you do it without complaining.
17 But hearings like this is where we have ot kind of
18 undress why you're not getting the funding that you
19 need. And I as Chair of Fire and Emergency
20 Management through our budget hearings fight
21 constantly to get FDNY and EMS more money, and every
22 year, four years, I'm doing this. And four years,
23 FDNY stayed flatlined. And this year, I was told
24 they got \$180 million more. We asked for \$1 billion,
25 but when we looked back-- because you see, this is
not an uninformed council. We're very informed. And

3 we want to look back, and that money, that was money
4 that was promised to your department in the outyears.
5 It wasn't new money. There was never any new money
6 for FDNY, and yet, you go out and do your job, and
7 for that I am really grateful. I know that OLR is not
8 here today, but I just want to ask a question. If
9 you don't have an answer for it, it's fine. It
10 really is, because it's really not for you to answer,
11 but I just-- it's just something I want to clear up.
12 So, the FDNY is always telling me that they're
13 advocating for EMS pay parity, and I know that's
14 true. I want to say both the NYPD and the FDNY,
15 you're very fortunate to have two commissioners that
16 fight for you. It may not have been tht way in the
17 past, but it is that way now. So, FDNY goes to OLR
18 and they're advocating for pay parity. Does OLR just
19 ignore the recommendation? Are you not hearing back?
20 Is there any kind of interaction that you would have
21 in your capacity? I know you're new to this
22 particular position, but is anything that you could
23 tell us that OLR has said in the past with past
24 conversations that have been had?

25 CHIEF MIANO: First and foremost, I want
to thank you for your support as I stated in my

3 testimony and I just want to say it once again,
4 without your support, the Fire Department wouldn't
5 have-- wouldn't have the things that we have, what
6 [inaudible] was. So, we appreciate you and council.
7 In regards to the contract negotiations, personally,
8 I was involved in the last one. It was my first one
9 there, and I hate to use that an excuse, but -- it
10 was my first one and I was just becoming acclimated
11 with it. Chief Michael Fields did make
12 recommendations at the end of that meeting, and I
13 guess at the next meeting, I will see where those
14 recommendations went.

15 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay, great. And
16 EMS has been work-- they-- you've been working, and
17 you haven't had a salary change since 2019. So,
18 there was a new contract. There was a minimal amount
19 of pay that was increased in the new contract,
20 despite all the work that the front line workers and
21 the first responders did during COVID. Did that
22 include back pay? Do you remember if that included
23 back pay?

24 CHIEF MIANO: I believe there was
25 retroactive pay in that.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 41

3 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: It was retro, okay,
4 thank you. Thank you. Great start for your first
5 day. So, EMS workforce has reportedly declined from
6 4,600 pre-pandemic to about 4,100 members in their
7 workforce now. What exit data or surveys has FDNY
8 collected from departing EMTs and paramedics?

9 CHIEF MIANO: So, thank you for that
10 question. We did think that that may be a question.
11 I do have the information here. So, we look at our
12 attrition rate, and currently our attrition rate for
13 2025 is that five percent of our workforce has
14 separated from the FDNY.

15 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay. And how long
16 on average does it take to fill an EMT and paramedic
17 position once it becomes vacant?

18 CHIEF MIANO: So, that varies, because we
19 do not replace any EMT or paramedic on a one-for-one
20 basis. We do a calling off of the civil service
21 list. Just yesterday we graduated 152 new members of
22 New York City's best. They are out there right now,
23 maybe in that ambulance that you hear going back.
24 But in regards to our training classes, we have
25 expanded the amount of people we're able to put into
a training class up to the number of 200, and we are

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 42

3 looking on how to expand that even further. We do
4 between two and three training classes a year, and
5 each one of those training classes lasts 18 weeks
6 before members are able to come out into the field.

7 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay. How does the
8 FDNY ensure adequate coverage during periods of high
9 attrition or sick leave?

10 CHIEF MIANO: So, during periods of high
11 attrition or sick leave, you know, the burden becomes
12 on the members. We do offer overtime. The members--
13 there is an overtime program we have called the Known
14 Vacancy Overtime, our KVO program, and that's posted
15 at the beginning of the month, and that lets members
16 at the station know that we do have vacancies on some
17 ambulances on certain days, and that allows the
18 members to kind of look ahead and schedule overtime
19 based on their schedules. Unfortunately, in
20 situations where there are there are vacancies that
21 arise that are not known, that are like unscheduled
22 vacancies. Members are offered overtime to stay and
23 work on the ambulances.

24 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay. And what are
25 the maximum shift hours for an EMS worker and how
often are these exceeded in practice?

3 CHIEF MIANO: So, we have two types of
4 shifts within the FDNY EMS. We have eight-hour
5 shifts and we have 12-hour shifts, but both of those
6 shifts have a cap of 16 hours. Now, I can't say that
7 we've never exceeded that, because if in your 15th
8 hour you get called for a job that is maybe a fire or
9 an extended incident, members will stay. They perform
10 their duty and they stay for that incident and
11 continue care. But if we are able to control it like
12 on a scene of a fire or a major incident, we do a
13 roll call and see who is beyond their 16 hours, and
14 we immediately try and get them on-site relief.

15 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Alright. And this
16 is a very important question because I know that EMS
17 worker are over worked. I know they're over-taxed. I
18 know that the-- sometimes grueling hours and the
19 hardships that they see when patients die or
20 critically injured, how it affects them both
21 emotionally and mentally. So, are employee
22 assistance programs or trauma counseling mandatory or
23 optional? And how is the utilization tracked?

24 CHIEF MIANO: So, employee assistance
25 programs like the counseling service unit as well as
our peer support unit are in place. They're

available 24 hours a day. We do not mandate someone, but we do give referrals, and we do encourage members to go. Like I started earlier, it may have been a stigma at one point to admit that you were suffering from something, but we are trying to destigmatize that, and just this year alone, our counseling service has seen 9,260-- has had 9,264 visits from members. And as a reminder, all of those visits are confidential.

CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: That's very good to know, and thank you. Recruitment is always a problem, especially when the pay for the beginning of an EMT worker is slightly above minimum wage. So what strategies are being used to recruit and retain EMS personnel, and how effective have they been to date?

CHIEF MIANO: So, before I answer that question, I just want to go back to the last one. I gave you the wrong number. I gave you the total of the last five years was 9,264. This year, calendar year-to-date, it's 878. So, in regards to recruitment, the FDNY has recruitment drives constantly. We just this weekend had open house where we invited families and children into the open

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 45

3 houses. We also partnered with some K9 rescues who
4 were there. So not only did we invite people in to
5 visit our EMS stations, we found some dogs and cats
6 some homes. So that's always good, too. I, myself,
7 contacted every volunteer ambulance agency within the
8 five boroughs last year, and asked if I could come to
9 their meetings, their monthly meetings, and speak to
10 them about how to join the FDNY. Because the
11 volunteers play such a vital role in the community,
12 and they're already performing this for nothing. So,
13 I wanted to go there and talk to them and encourage
14 them to come, you know, to explore a career in FDNY.
15 I had some communication with some of those volunteer
16 agencies. I plan on trying to get back into those
17 volunteer companies and have them come over, but the
18 FNDY tirelessly tries to recruit for EMS.

19 Unfortunately, throughout the country, this is not
20 just an issue that we're seeing here in New York.

21 Throughout the country, EMS recruitment is going
22 down. So, we have-- we are-- I'll say it over and
23 over and over again, we are the best EMS service is
24 not just in the New York area, but in the world. And
25 I would love, love, love-- invite anyone who has any
interest in coming over to EMS to contact our

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 46

3 recruitment department so we can get the information
4 they need.

5 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: I am so impressed
6 with your answer, all of your answers, but your last
7 answer, because you recognize the value of volunteer
8 Fire Department and ambulance course. I have five in
9 my district, and a lot of times they also
10 underappreciated and the fact that you would look to
11 recruit from those, that particular demographic shows
12 that you really know how to think out of the box, and
13 you shouldn't be interim. You should be actual.
14 Let's talk about operational reforms and response
15 times. In the 2025 Mayor's Management Report shows a
16 drop in daily in-service ambulance hours and a rise
17 in response times. What factors have contributed to
18 the decline in the in-service hours, and how many
19 ambulances are currently out of service each day due
20 to staffing shortages?

21 CHIEF MIANO: So, in regards to ambulance
22 outages due to staffing shortages, I receive those
23 numbers daily, and last night, we were-- we ran-- we
24 ran down 27 ambulances out of the 646 ambulances that
25 we would-- that we are-- normally run in a day. All
of those were due to staffing. None of them were due

3 to vehicle issues or vehicles being off-service. In
4 regards to response time, there is so many different
5 factors that affect response times, from your recent
6 video about bike lanes, right, all the up and through
7 emergency room turnaround times in which the Fire
8 Department has addressed by starting our Hospital
9 Liaison Unit where we have EMTs and an officer inside
10 of a hospital. We have 15 of them throughout the
11 City in three boroughs, and what they do is when we
12 have a low-acuity call that comes into the emergency
13 room, they're able to take over that patient so that
14 this way the ambulance can return back to service,
15 and they can-- those members can make sure that the
16 patient who's brought in by EMS is seen by the
17 emergency room, and they receive the same report as
18 if the-- if the ambulance that brought them was going
19 to give it. You know, staffing is an issue, but we
20 daily-- actually moment by moment we have our central
21 resource coordination center, and they monitor the
22 trends throughout the City, and see where we have
23 areas of high call volume and relocate ambulances
24 from areas of low call volume into areas of high call
25 volume. I said in my testimony that recently I rode
on an ambulance for a 12-hour shift, and I did go to

3 three different boroughs. They didn't spare me
4 because I was on the ambulance. I went with them
5 everywhere, and it was great because I was able to
6 see actually what the members go through every single
7 day, and it's an invaluable experience, and it helps
8 me be able to answer your questions today.

9 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Thank you, again.
10 I'm going to now yield to Chair Salaam so that he can
11 ask some questions, but I will come back. Thank you
12 so much for your answers.

13 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you. So, I
14 want to go into officer headcount, attrition, and
15 recruitment. The NYPD's actual uniformed headcount
16 remains roughly 1,400 below budgeted levels. What
17 are the main barriers preventing the Department from
18 reaching full staffing?

19 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: I'll do my best to
20 answer that. It's a little bit not quite in my
21 wheelhouse, but I know I can say that Commissioner
22 Tisch is dedicated to staffing up police officers as
23 quickly as possible. There's a thousand or so in the
24 Academy right now, and as soon as that Academy
25 graduates I know it's scheduled for another thousands

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 49

3 towards the end of the year. So, she's doing
4 everything she can to staff up.

5 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: How many officers
6 have retired or resigned so far this calendar year,
7 and how does that compare to prior years?

8 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: I don't have those
9 figures in front of me. I would have to get back to
10 you with that.

11 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Sure. Has lowering
12 the college credit requirements, 24 credits,
13 meaningfully improved recruitment or Academy graduate
14 rates?

15 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: That would-- again, I
16 could speculate, but I do believe that that would be
17 helpful. That's why they reduced it just to get more
18 candidates.

19 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Reliance on overtime
20 and officer fatigue, how much current overtime
21 spending is tied to filling routine patrol in 911
22 coverage gaps, rather than special events or
23 initiatives?

24 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: I came here as a
25 representative. I'm not trying to dodge any
questions for the 911 center. I really do not have

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 50

3 the patrol figures in front of me, but we can get
4 back to you with that.

5 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Sure. Alright, so
6 what I'll do is I'll yield back and come back for a
7 second round. Thanks.

8 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you, Chair
9 Salaam. So, we're going to-- I want to recognize
10 that we've been joined by Council Member Stevens as
11 well, and we want to recognize Council Member Feliz
12 on Zoom who has joined us, and we want to pass it
13 over now to Council Member Cabán followed by Council
14 Member Holden, and then Council Member Stevens for
15 questions.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Thank you very
17 much. I will start with the FDNY. What training is
18 provided to EMTs serving on B-HEARD teams?

19 CHIEF MIANO: I'm sorry, did you say
20 training for B-HEARD teams?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Yeah. What
22 training-- what training is provided to EMTs that are
23 serving on B-HEARD teams and how does it differ from
24 standard EMT training at all.
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 51

3 CHIEF MIANO: So, B-HEARD members-- the
4 B-HEARD team is a collaboration with H+H where EMS
5 members are staffed with social workers.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Yep.

7 CHIEF MIANO: These members go to
8 specific classes that they learn how to work
9 alongside of these social workers to be able to de-
10 escalate situations where someone is having a mental
11 issue crisis, and you know, they work to be able to
12 control these situations along with the social
13 workers, and if that situation leads to the patient
14 needing to be able to-- needing to be transported to
15 a hospital, the members are able to identify that
16 with social workers, and they work--

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: [interposing] But I
18 guess what I'm asking, is there like specifically
19 different training protocols or something additional
20 to sort of the standard EMT training for those who
21 are part of B-HEARD team? And if you're not sure
22 what that is, I would love if you could get back to
23 us on that.

24 CHIEF MIANO: So, all members go through
25 a B-HEARD-style training, but members specifically
assigned to B-HEARD do go to an additional training

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 52

3 class. The specifics of that class, I'll be more than
4 happy to get back to you on.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: That would be
6 great. I would love to know the length and sort of
7 what's involved in it. What's the current turnover
8 rate for EMTs on a B-HEARD team?

9 CHIEF MIANO: Specifically, for B-HEARD,
10 that also-- I apologize-- I would have to get back to
11 you on.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Sounds good. I'm
13 going to be asking a lot of questions about B-HEARD.
14 I'm actually-- I'm really grateful for the work that
15 B-HEARD is doing, and I know that there's lots of
16 room to increase the quality of that work. What
17 mental health supports or wellness resources are
18 available to B-HEARD teams? Like, are any of the
19 supports mandatory? Are they optional? Are they
20 embedded into the workplace practices, or are those
21 just the general supports that are available to EMT
22 across the board? And I will just also mention that,
23 you know, I was one of the members who fought really
24 hard for the Crisis to Care package that won the
25 pilot EMS Wellness and Peer Support Program to expand
mental health services to your workers. So, that's

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 53

3 incredibly, incredibly important to myself and
4 obviously a lot of our colleagues.

5 CHIEF MIANO: Thank you for that. Our
6 peer support and CSU services available for all of
7 our members, 24 hours a day. There isn't one
8 specifically set up for B-HEARD members. All of our
9 members can seek support.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: And are they-- how
11 are they embedded into the workplace? Are they at
12 station houses? Are they at a particular location?
13 Are they virtual? What does access to them look like?

14 CHIEF MIANO: So, B-HEARD members and
15 social workers are stationed at stations throughout
16 the City in--

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: [interposing] I
18 mean the wellness supports for the workers, sorry.

19 CHIEF MIANO: Oh, I'm sorry. I apologize.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: I wasn't clear.

21 CHIEF MIANO: So, the wellness support
22 for-- so, if someone calls and they need support
23 immediately, we have five centers throughout the City
24 that--

25 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: [interposing] Okay.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 54

3 CHIEF MIANO: a member can go to, but we
4 also have our peers who can go to a station--

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: [interposing] Yeah.

6 CHIEF MIANO: or to a member and speak
7 with them, and if they needed to be escalated, we can
8 do that.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Great. So you
10 guys use peers, because peers are--

11 CHIEF MIANO: [interposing] We do.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: important in the
13 work. I guess then that brings me to the question of
14 are you guys open to-- willing to pursue having peers
15 on the B-HEARD teams? You know, in Albuquerque in
16 their responder program, they have peers. In
17 Portland in their response system, they have peers.
18 There's a lot of really good data around that, but B-
19 HEARD does not have peers at this point. So, what's
20 the Department's position on that?

21 CHIEF MIANO: So, you know, the B-HEARD
22 program, like I said, is a collaboration with H+H and
23 the FDNY supports H+H in that program. So, I don't
24 currently have a position on what you just raised.
25 This is the first time that I'm hearing of something

3 like that, but I'm sure it'll-- we can bring it up in
4 ongoing discussions.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Thank you. And
6 I'm just going to rapid fire a few questions, because
7 I know I don't have much time left. Might be going
8 back and forth between NYPD and FDNY, so I apologize.
9 But going to dispatch-- and I actually had the
10 opportunity to stand in a dispatch room in Portland
11 as they were doing these calls. Are there-- one, is
12 there a mental health professional or clinician in
13 dispatch helping dispatchers code calls? Because
14 again, that is something that actually is being done
15 in some municipalities to help with the coding,
16 because after collecting data, you know, there have
17 been struggles with how calls are getting coded, and
18 more of them could be going to the alternative. So
19 that's one question. The other question, I'm going
20 to shift to the support for the dispatchers. When a
21 dispatched member has a particularly traumatic or
22 triggering call, what's the protocol there? Are
23 they immediately taken off the floor? Where are they
24 taken to? How long are they taken off of the floor
25 for? Is it something where they might get sent home
for the day if they feel that it's appropriate?

3 Like, how are we supporting dispatchers on that
4 front? And then, Chairs, can I just add one or two
5 mor questions on there? Okay. And let's see-- and
6 then, okay. And also to dispatch, I guess it's
7 connected to my question about if there's a mental
8 health professional in dispatch. How does dispatch
9 algorithm determine when to route calls to B-HEARD
10 teams? Like, what's the criteria, decision-making
11 logic, and what circumstances are emergency calls
12 ever diverted to 988 instead of 911 and vice versa?
13 Sorry, that was a lot.

14 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: I can answer for the
15 NYPD. There actually is professional counselors that
16 we have, because we have an EAU unit staffed of one
17 and five that cover both centers, and we're actually
18 bolstering that shortly if we haven't already. We
19 might have just started that. So, the second part of
20 the question was, if there's a very traumatic call,
21 we actually do basically tap the dispatcher, the
22 call-taker on the shoulder when there's a minute
23 break, and we actually-- we mandate it, but just
24 mandate them to go sit down with the counsel that's
25 on service. So, we find that they've been very
receptive to that. We have over 543 referrals this

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 57

3 year for that unit, EAU, where they actually sat down
4 and spoke with the counselors. It's been very
5 productive.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: How long are those
7 conversations? Like, how long are they sitting
8 there, or are they allowed to just like sit in a room
9 after they've spoken to a counselor, decompress? You
10 know, are there limitations on how long they sit?
11 Just trying to get a sense of what that process looks
12 like for a dispatcher.

13 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Yes. It's really up to
14 the individual. If somebody says to us I'm fine, you
15 know, I'd like to go back to work, we honor their
16 request. If somebody is visibly shaken or says, you
17 know, I'm going to need a little more time, that was
18 very stressful and I'm little shaken up, we will give
19 them as much time as they need, and that could go on
20 for a couple of weeks if need be. we would give them
21 a different assignment, something at a less-stressful
22 pace. So, we're very understanding when it comes to
23 this. we understand how difficult their job is and
24 we give them all the time they need.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Thank you.

3 CHIEF MIANO: So, for EMS, we do not have
4 someone specifically there, but we do have, like I
5 said, that 24-hour service as well as the peer
6 supports who can come. I will tell you that we
7 recently-- I believe it was last year-- we wrote a
8 procedure, and that procedure does not allow a member
9 to just shake it off. The last thing I want is
10 somebody who tells us that they're okay, and then
11 they go home and they're not-- so in that procedure,
12 while we can't mandate someone to seek help, we-- in
13 that procedure, we have the member speak with someone
14 from our counseling service unit and to gauge their
15 feeling, and then if we really feel that that member
16 is-- needs additional assistance, we will insist that
17 that member seeks it.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: And just to make
19 sure those last two questions got answered, and these
20 are for NYPD-- is there a mental health professional
21 listening to dispatch to the 911 calls to help
22 dispatchers when they're coding and deciding who to
23 end, and the information around the dispatch
24 algorithm to determine how they're routing calls to
25 B-HEARD teams, like the criteria, and whether there

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 59

3 are circumstances where emergency calls are diverted
4 to 988 instead of 911 or vice versa?

5 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: The counselors that
6 work in that EAU unit, they're actually-- they're not
7 listening to calls, but the supervisors on the floor
8 are, and they're notified of any serious calls, any
9 person shot, any type of major event. So the
10 supervisor would get involved immediately, and then
11 the supervisor would reach out to EAU, and they would
12 actually go and speak with the person, bring that
13 individual--

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: [interposing] No,
15 no, I mean, is there somebody helping a dispatcher?
16 It's not for the mental health of the dispatcher. I'm
17 talking about when they're trying to figure out how
18 to code a call and who to send, whether it's--

19 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: [interposing] Oh--

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: police first or
21 EMT first or B-HEARD, is there a mental health
22 clinician? Because there are some alternative
23 responders in different cities like Portland who
24 actually have that person in there to help
25 dispatchers make that determination.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 60

3 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: I understand the
4 question. I got it now.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Yeah. Sorry, I
6 know it's--

7 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: We do not-- we do not
8 have mental health professionals there. We--

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: [interposing] Would
10 you consider it?

11 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Well, I'll just
12 explain the process and maybe it'll explain why I
13 don't know if that would work. It's possible. But
14 we refer it to EMS. So, the NYPD is the initial
15 point of contact. Once we realize that we have a
16 call that could possibly have response from B-HEARD,
17 we transfer that call to EMS, and then EMS is the
18 deciding entity, deciding agency to see if, you know,
19 it should be going to be B-HEARD or it needs
20 emergency, you know, NYPD, EMS response.

21 CHIEF MIANO: And to best answer that
22 question, I'm going to give the microphone to Chief
23 Denise Werner from EMS Emergency Medical Dispatch.

24 CHIEF WERNER: So, once we receive that
25 call from NYPD, we go through an algorithm that's
been developed by the Office of Medical Affairs that

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 61

3 tells our call-takers what questions to ask the
4 caller, and there's a process of elimination on what
5 is an inclusion or exclusion criteria for what we
6 call the-- it's coded as an EDPM, and that's what
7 would go to the mental health unit. So, it's all
8 built-in to an algorithm that is an application that
9 all the call-takers use.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Finally, would you
11 be able to provide a copy of what the-- what those
12 questions are to the Council? And then, Chairs,
13 you've been very patient with me, so thank you. I'll
14 pass it back to you guys.

15 CHIEF WERNER: I'm sorry, are you asking
16 about what questions are asked?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Yeah, what the
18 protocol is.

19 CHIEF WERNER: Right. I can get the
20 algorithm actually supplied to you.

21 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Yeah, if you
22 could send it also to the Committee. Thank you,
23 Council Member Cabán. We've also been joined by
24 Council Member Menin, and now we have questions from
25 Council Member Holden.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you,
4 Chairs, and thank you, Chiefs, for your testimony.
5 It's nice to see you again. Let's say-- to follow up
6 on some of the questions from my colleague. We have
7 a mental health episode. EMS arrives first. The
8 person is deemed to be dangerous. What's the
9 protocol on that? The police are called, but they're
10 not there because we have a shortage of police and
11 EMS. So, first of all, how often does an episode like
12 that or a call like that where the EMS responds
13 first, and what do you do? Do you go-- do they, you
14 know, disengage with the person? There might be a
15 weapon involved. What's the protocol from EMS?

16 CHIEF MIANO: So, in a situation like
17 that, you know-- in my previous testimony I stated
18 EMS enters dangerous situations at all times.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: We know that,
20 yes.

21 CHIEF MIANO: Sometimes we don't know
22 what we're walking into until we get there.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Right.

24 CHIEF MIANO: So, if we find ourselves in
25 one of those situations, the EMS members are trained
to try and de-escalate that situation. At the same

3 time, while they're de-escalating that situation,
4 they're-- they are relaying that information, that
5 critical information, to our emergency medical
6 dispatch who is contacting NYPD and additional
7 resources of EMS members in the area to assist. EMS
8 members are also trained to remove themselves as best
9 as possible from those situations, and try and-- and
10 re-- you know, I hate to use the word retreat, but
11 retreat to a safe area, an area of refuge where
12 they're not, you know, in immediate harms way.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: And this probably
14 happens a lot. So, let's say the person has a weapon
15 and they're experiencing an episode, but the police
16 are minutes away or longer. Again, do you-- do they
17 just di-engage, go into the ambulance let's say, lock
18 the doors? Do they have anything like mace to
19 protect themselves? Do they have a Taser? Are they
20 trained in mental health? That kind of-- you know,
21 how do they de-escalate, first of all, but more
22 importantly, if there's a dangerous situation, what
23 do you tell your EMS workers?

24 CHIEF MIANO: Okay, so we do not carry
25 any type of Taser, mace, or anything like that. I'm
going to give you a brief personal experience when I

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 64

3 was an EMT in Brooklyn where I myself had a gun
4 pulled on me at the scene of an assignment. Knowing
5 that that was happening, my partner relayed to our
6 dispatchers that we were in trouble, and honestly
7 within moments, my NYPD partners were there, and they
8 were able to take control of that situation. And
9 I'll forever-- I forever am thankful for that. So,
10 thank you, NYPD, for that specific incident and the
11 ones that you come to my member's aid all the time.
12 What I will tell you is that our members are trained
13 in tactical communication and trying to have the
14 ability to de-escalate those types of situations. We
15 do also provide them a self-defense training. That
16 self-defense training is not the initial response
17 from EMS members. My EMS members are professionals,
18 and they're professionals in what they do every
19 single day, and that self defense is the absolute
20 last resort of defense against a situation that they
21 might find themselves in like the one you described.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: So, again, but if
23 they have-- if the person has a weapon, whether it's
24 a knife, gun or anything, or a club or anything else,
25 they need to-- so do they move the ambulance away?

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 65

3 Do they go inside? Do they get out of the area? I'm
4 not clear on this.

5 CHIEF MIANO: So, it's situational
6 dependent, right? If they are inside of a building,
7 then they are going to try-- they're going to leave
8 that building. If they-- if it's outside in a crowd,
9 they will get inside their ambulance and move the
10 ambulance to a safe location, relaying this
11 information through our emergency medical dispatch to
12 our NYPD partners who we know are just moments away.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: And again, this
14 counseling service unit, is that for the worker's
15 counseling, or do they also go onto the scene of an
16 episode, let's say a mental health episode?

17 CHIEF MIANO: Our counseling services are
18 for our members, our FDNY members.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Only the members,
20 not on the situation.

21 CHIEF MIANO: No.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: How many mental
23 health experts are hired by EMS?

24 CHIEF MIANO: They're not specifically
25 hired by EMS. They're hired by the Fire Department
and EMS members being members of the Fire Department

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 66

3 are-- you know, utilize those counseling services. I
4 will tell you, though, on staff at CSU, there are
5 several clinicians who are former EMS members who
6 went on to receive training to become mental health
7 clinicians, and that is absolutely key. Because when
8 these members speak to my members they can absolutely
9 put themselves in the situations that my members are
10 coming to them about, and it helps them relate and
11 talk more about the situation.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Okay. Just one
13 follow-up. How often do-- you know, your EMS workers
14 obviously have been attacked you said-- you mentioned
15 that, and threatened. Has that gone up in recent
16 years?

17 CHIEF MIANO: We have seen an escalation
18 of that. This year-- I'm sorry, last year, we saw
19 313 documented cases of physical assault on EMS
20 members.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: And how many were
22 injured?

23 CHIEF MIANO: That's 313.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: 313 were injured?
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 67

3 CHIEF MIANO: 313 members documented
4 assault and injury from, you know, a patient or
5 bystander.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: But I guess
7 there's been a-- certainly situations where they
8 weren't injured, but they were attacked, they were--
9 the person attempted to hit them or attempted
10 violence, right?

11 CHIEF MIANO: Those situations exist,
12 yes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Okay. So, just
14 one last question. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.
15 You've arrived at a situation where the person is
16 dangerous, EMS, and you arrive first before the
17 police like I mentioned before. Has that-- is that
18 happening more often since we have a shortage of
19 police officers?

20 CHIEF MIANO: That would be anecdotal,
21 and I would not be able to give you an answer there.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: So, you have--
23 there's no-- when you go to a scene, let's say it's a
24 mental health scene situation, and-- I see the EMS
25 arrive many more times before-- and even the Fire

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 68

3 Department with their units arrive before the police.

4 Do you keep track of that?

5 CHIEF MIANO: So, you know, there are
6 several situations where that could occur, right? It
7 depends on the call type. If the call type is like,
8 Chief Werner described, an EDPM, that does not get an
9 NYPD response. So, you would only see EMS at that
10 scene.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: No, but where
12 both were called.

13 CHIEF MIANO: So, what I just want to
14 explain about the 911 system is that when a call is
15 made into 911, it looks for the closest unit from
16 NYPD as well as EMS, as well as Fire. So, it just
17 may be that the ambulance was the closest unit to the
18 call at that time, but that does not diminish the
19 response--

20 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing] But
21 I just want to-- I just want to gather the
22 information. If EMT is arriving more often than
23 before-- the NYPD used to have more when we had
24 38,000 officers. Now we have 32,000. There's got--
25 there has to be some kind of ramifications and

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 69

3 problems that are putting EMT workers in harm's way
4 more.

5 CHIEF MIANO: So, again, I understand and
6 appreciate what you're saying, but I don't have that
7 information to be able to comment on it.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Okay, alright.
9 Thank you. Thank you. Thank you, Chairs.

10 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay. And if
11 there's a way to get that information back, if there
12 is some way to aggregate it and give it back to the
13 Committee, we're happy to accept it after. Thank
14 you, Council Member. Council Member Stevens?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Hello, good
16 morning, or good afternoon, or both. When I came in
17 you guys were talking about some of the recruitment
18 that I guess EMS was doing, and also just wanted to
19 just say, would love to partner with you guys. I
20 heard you were doing like stuff with volunteer folks,
21 and I would love for us to think about how do we get
22 young people excited about it, especially like EMS
23 workers and 911 dispatchers. Those, I think, are
24 very admirable jobs, but sometimes young people don't
25 see it as an option until they're much older. And so
would love for us to have a further conversation

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 70

3 offline to think about some ways that we could get
4 young people more involved in both of those things,
5 because that's what I do best, right? But just
6 wanted to, like, offer that up. And in my district
7 as well-- so if you do-- the next time you have a
8 recruiting session or something like that, would love
9 to partner in my district. One of the things that we
10 get a lot of calls about are jobs. People in my
11 district are often looking for jobs, and I say this
12 to all the agencies, sometimes you guys don't use us
13 in the way that you should. So, if there are job
14 openings and things like that, I always say please
15 send it out, not just to my offices, but to all the
16 Council Members so we can blast it out to our
17 community members and when folks are coming in to be
18 able to share that information, because I think both
19 of these units are looking for people and have been
20 doing recruitment. And we should think in ways to
21 think outside of the box, and one of those ways to me
22 is always to use the Council Members who are in the
23 community each and every day and people just come in.
24 I know for me specifically housing and jobs. So, I
25 would love to make sure that we have all that
information to be able to work together. But I just

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 71

3 have a question-- this if for EMS, and this is a very
4 niche question, because this is very specific to my
5 district. As you guys know-- I'm not sure if you
6 guys know about the Ogden Avenue EMS station who we
7 love, but the trucks, they're always double-parked,
8 and every time I either call or yell or put it on
9 Twitter, 10 minutes later they're removed. But can
10 you-- we have to do something about it, because it's
11 dangerous. And the same way you want to be able to
12 get to things, no one can move. So, the buses-- it's
13 a two-way street. The buses are always stuck on
14 traffic because they're always tripled and double-
15 parked on Ogden Avenue. I need help. I need a
16 solution. I can't. I've got stuck there for 45
17 minutes to go two blocks.

18 CHIEF MIANO: So, first, I apologize.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: And I know y'all
20 moving and it's still in my district.

21 CHIEF MIANO: So, I apologize for you
22 getting stuck 45 minutes. For your first question,
23 just give them an hour with me, and I will get
24 somebody very inspired to come on my job. So, but we
25 would love collaborate with you, and I'll have
recruitment do that when we do recruitment drives.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 72

3 Yes, we are moving at EMS station 17, but what I will
4 do is I will have that captain and that division
5 commander and the borough commander make contact with
6 your office and you guys can-- I'll encourage them to
7 work together with your office on a solution.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: I've spoken to
9 them a hundred times. It has to stop, please. Like,
10 I don't--

11 CHIEF MIANO: [interposing] I'll speak to
12 them.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: I don't think
14 you understand. Like, you know what, come up there
15 one day with me just to surprise. I'm telling you,
16 the bus always gets stuck, and once the buses are
17 stuck, no one else can move on Ogden Avenue.

18 CHIEF MIANO: Yeah.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: And we love
20 them, and like I don't want to be fighting with them,
21 but you know, just-- we got to-- and also just be
22 mindful that we're still sitting in a district-- and
23 I've said this before. I don't want them to move,
24 and yes, we know that there's going to be parking. I
25 know the details. But I don't want it to be moved
and we move one issue from one part of the district

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 73

3 to another part of the district. And so, I really,
4 really want us to, like, resolve this so that I could
5 feel good about them moving to the other side of my
6 district.

7 CHIEF MIANO: Yeah, completely
8 understood, and I will join you in the conversations
9 that we have with them, and I will do my best to get
10 that resolved.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Thank you so
12 much, and I look forward to talking to both of you
13 around recruitment and some ideas I have around like
14 getting some young people excited about this work.

15 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Thank you. We
16 appreciate that.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Absolutely.

18 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you,
19 Council Member. We'll turn it back to Chair Salaam,
20 followed by Council Member Restler.

21 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you again for
22 your testimony. I actually have a maybe unorthodox
23 question, but I think it might be worth asking about
24 self-defense. What types of self-defense are being
25 offered for the workers? Because we know when you go
to like ground zero spaces, it's very, very

3 challenging, very difficult sometimes, and we don't
4 want anybody to get hurt, and I'm just wondering is
5 there a specific form of self-defense, or is there
6 also additions to that that will provide safety?

7 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: If I'll just jump in
8 for a second. Our PCTs are all inside a police
9 building or I should say a police-- a building that's
10 secured by the police, so we really do not go into
11 self-defense techniques for them, but I'll hand it
12 over to EMS.

13 CHIEF MIANO: So, that training is-- it's
14 self-defense training basically with ways to be able
15 to create separation between yourself and the person
16 and be able to get to an area of safety. It's not--
17 it's not training that is meant to completely
18 neutralize that threat. It's training to be able to
19 save yourself from it. If I have a moment and I can
20 comment on a question that was asked me just a few
21 minutes ago about training that involves this, the B-
22 HEARD training, the extra training that they get is
23 four weeks long, and that does include topics like
24 team building, role-playing, assessing children,
25 substance abuse, autism spectrum awareness, de-

3 escalation, self-defense, and intimate partner
4 violence.

5 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: So, I want to move
6 to detection of inefficiencies. Earlier, your
7 testimony-- earlier in your testimony, I believe you
8 testified that there were more than 100,000 calls,
9 reportedly delayed calls, before deployment
10 adjustments were mad this past April. What internal
11 monitoring or performance tracking systems does the
12 NYPD have in place to detect such large-scale
13 efficiencies? And how did those systems fail to flag
14 these issues somewhere?

15 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: I just to put it in
16 perspective. That's 111,000 calls out of
17 approximately 6.5 million. So, as I said earlier, 92
18 percent of all calls are answered within five
19 seconds, and over 98 percent are answered within 30
20 seconds which is well above the national standards,
21 well above, significantly above. So, we're actually,
22 you know, proud of that figure. We would want zero?
23 Of course. We would love it if there were zero, and
24 we're doing our best to staff up. Which, again,
25 it's-- I'm repetitive with this, but by staffing up,
delays go down because we have more call-takers

3 available to handle the emergencies. So, we're down
4 44 percent compared to last year in delays. So, I
5 just want to explain, you know, put it in the big
6 picture. It's the biggest call center in the
7 country, the most 911 calls in the country, and that
8 figure compared to the enormous figure of the number
9 of calls coming in is relatively small.

10 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Got it. So, when
11 there are delays and blockages that become apparent,
12 what-- was there any internal review or after action
13 analysis conducted to understand what went wrong, and
14 to hold supervisors or managers accountable and if
15 so, what were the findings?

16 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Yes, sir. We have a
17 robust basically to double-check on everything. We
18 have plenty of double-checks, and what happens is as
19 soon as we realize we're taking delays or if we even
20 forecast we'll be taking delays, we get all the
21 administrative staff out of the office up to the
22 operational floor where they would actually plug in
23 with a headset. We would hold additional people from
24 previous tour if they're going end-of-tour, and for
25 all large-scale events such as the Fourth of July,

3 New Years, we plan well in advance to have additional
4 call-takers to address these things.

5 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Do the PCTs union or
6 call center supervisors raise concerns about
7 prolonged hold times or excessive workloads prior to
8 April 2024? And if they did, how did the NYPD
9 management respond, and were any corrective measures
10 taken at that time?

11 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Yes, we've received
12 those complaints and I can just say that from my time
13 being there that it happens, and we want to do the
14 best for everyone, but of course you inevitably
15 receive some complaints like that. So, in April,
16 that's when we started again. That's when we started
17 this big hiring push to address this. So, they did
18 voice their concerns in April. We-- I actually got
19 involved with the 911 system again. I used to work
20 there in the past. Now I'm involved. We have
21 regular meetings with the union. I actually, myself
22 and Commissioner Hart [sp?], we have them with the
23 overhead union, and Inspector Martinez sitting next
24 to me has been with the local union. So, we're in
25 constant communication with them to address any of
their issues.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 78

3 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Does the Department-
4 - bless you. Does the Department conduct regular
5 audits or automated reporting to compare live call
6 volumes against staffing capacity.

7 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Absolutely,
8 constantly. We have systems in the office where we
9 can actually see the number of calls that are coming
10 in, how many operators are on calls, how many are
11 available. We send out basically the call volume
12 every hour showing where the call volume was so we
13 can prepare for the next hour. So, it's like a
14 constant job. You basically have to keep your eye on
15 this at all times, and that's exactly what they do.

16 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: And what procedures,
17 accountability mechanisms or staffing review
18 processes have been implemented since April 2024-- or
19 April, since April, to prevent this kind of systemic
20 breakdown from reoccurring in the 911 system?

21 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: We've put several
22 things. I don't know if I would actually say
23 systemic breakdown, but we keep improving it. And
24 one of the major things that has been done under
25 Inspector Martinez is the response times. We're
laser-focused on that. We created a response time

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 79

3 supervisor that's actually on the dispatch floor
4 looking at all of the crimes in progress to make sure
5 the response is sent immediately. Then we have the
6 second layer where a uniformed supervisor I alluded
7 to in my opening testimony. Every two hours they
8 review it as well. So, you have the first layer of
9 the supervisor right on the floor, and then we have a
10 second uniformed supervisor also reviewing this to
11 make sure. And our response times are down 6.6
12 percent for the year.

13 CHAIRPERSON SALAAM: Thank you. I yield
14 back.

15 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Thank you. Council
16 Member Restler?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Thanks so much,
18 Chair Ariola and Chair Salaam and especially to Chair
19 De La Rosa for their leadership. It was some months
20 ago-- don't know when, but earlier-- late last year,
21 early this year that Chair De La Rosa and I co-
22 chaired a hearing where executive Director Garido
23 came to testify about extensive unanswered calls and
24 911, people working 12-hour shifts en masse,
25 tremendous understaffing. We-- my office and Council
Member De La Rosa's office has been in touch with the

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 80
2 union and we've been really concerned about the lack
3 of response [inaudible] for people calling 911. It
4 sounds to me from reviewing testimony, and I'm sorry
5 for being a little late this morning-- that Chief
6 Napolitano was brought in in April back to an area
7 where you worked previously to help address the
8 situation. And sounds like Chief Miano, this is your
9 first day on the job. I hope it's not your last. I
10 hope my colleagues haven't been too tough on you.
11 But-- that we didn't scare you away. But it sounds
12 like from the testimony there is some improvement. I
13 just would like to drill down a little bit on that
14 improvement and understand things. Chief Napolitano,
15 in your testimony you mentioned that 200 PCTs have
16 been hired since April. My staff and I did a review
17 of the city record, and we only found 93 operators
18 have been hired. Could you just clarify those 200
19 individuals who have been hired? Are they all in
20 place at this time? What's the status of those
21 additional 200 reports-- 200 people?

22 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Sure.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: And just to be
24 clear, my staff did a review of the city record from
25 January 1st to the present of hits current calendar

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 81

3 year, and at least what was reported publicly through
4 that mechanism as all hires are supposed to be
5 reported, we found only 93 operators had been added.

6 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Okay, I'll do my best
7 to explain that. 93 were hired in April.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: No, since
9 January 1 of this year.

10 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Okay. I'm just
11 breaking it down. That's when they were hired.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Oh, got it,
13 sorry.

14 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: First group was hired
15 in April, and we had a second group hired in August.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Okay.

17 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: And I guess that
18 wasn't in the public record at the time.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Or we may have
20 missed it.

21 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: That's of 120. So,
22 they're still in class right now.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Got it.

24 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: They graduate on
25 November 7th and November 13th, I believe, and I'm
certain that that's going to help the overtime issue.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 82

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Yeah.

3 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: And just the overload
4 issue.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Got it.

6 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: It's a very big class.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: So, we're two
8 weeks away from 120 additional folks helping out in a
9 meaningful way and providing some significant relief.

10 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Almost 120, because
11 some drop out.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Close, close.

13 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Close.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I'm also
15 concerned about attrition. Based on our review of
16 the city record since the beginning of this year, we
17 found 119 PCTs have left-- have quit, have left their
18 jobs. Is that consistent with your data? I didn't
19 see that in your testimony. I was wondering if you
20 could speak to it.

21 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Yes, I can. I have 170
22 up-to-date. Again, maybe our figures-- you have
23 pretty--

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: [interposing]
25 Those are more accurate than mine.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 83

3 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: They're the most
4 recent. So, we have 170 currently, but looking back
5 at previous years just to give it some perspective.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: 170 people have
7 attritted, have quit--

8 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: [interposing] Yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: over the course
10 of this year.

11 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Have quit for various
12 reasons.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: It happens.

14 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Some, you know, jobs,
15 moving, so there's many reasons. Looking at that
16 compared to previous years, though, since it's almost
17 the end of the year, we had 335 leave the job in
18 2022. We had 256 leave the job in 2023, and even we
19 believe-- we had 189 in 2024. So, the attrition is
20 going in the right direction, and I credit Inspector
21 Martinez and his whole team with many of the things
22 they are doing to improve morale.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: So, I appreciate
24 that, and that data is helpful, but I think it's just
25 important to add and subtract the new hires verse the
folks that have attritted. It sound like in a best

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 84

3 case scenario if close to 120 make it over the finish
4 line, plus the 93 that you've already brought on
5 board, we're looking at about 210, 213 additional
6 hires this year, and so far this year, the number of
7 the people who have left the agency again is 170?

8 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: 170.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: So, we've added
10 about-- between 30 and 40 additional PCTs over the
11 course of the year. That would be the net number at
12 this time. I mean, if-- we'll see, but that's--
13 we're looking at approximately a net of 30 additional
14 PCTs.

15 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: We also plan on
16 hiring-- and I completely believe it's going to
17 happen. This Police Commissioner, I've said it
18 multiple times, dedicated to the 911 center.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: She certainly
20 is.

21 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: And we're looking to
22 hire approximately 130 in November. So, as soon as
23 this class graduates, we put another class right in.
24 they're all going to be back to back, and--

25 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: [interposing] I'm
happy to hear that.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 85

3 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: all the resources.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I raised these
5 issues with Commissioner Tisch when she appeared
6 before us at Finance Committee hearings in the
7 spring. She committed that she was invested in
8 helping to improve the system and address some of the
9 issues. It sounds like that's why you've been
10 brought in and that there's some progress. Could
11 have an additional minute or two to keep going?

12 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: And if I could just
13 say, she did it last time. She's going to do it
14 again. I have 100 percent confidence in that.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I do, too. It's
16 worth noting that there's about 70 days left in this
17 administration. Staffing-- so of the 1,200 employees
18 who have actively worked-- of the 1,200 employees, if
19 I have that number right, are you able to give a data
20 point on the number who actively worked shifts in the
21 past week?

22 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: I don't have that
23 right in front of me.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Okay. Any? No?
25 Okay. do you have a re-- okay. I'll keep it moving.
Non-answered calls, and I'm sure this has been

3 discussed and I apologize again if I'm bringing
4 things up that have already been answered, but I know
5 you've gone through the average call times. But
6 we've been very concerned about reports from the
7 union and from constituents about non-answered calls.
8 When we ask Commissioner Tisch about this in the
9 Spring, she said, you know, that doesn't happen,
10 essentially, but I think that that's not exactly
11 right. Could you give us some clarity on non-
12 answered calls?

13 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Sure, I'll do my best,
14 and I actually do remember that exchange. I believe
15 she was referring to it doesn't go to voicemail.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: It doesn't go to
17 voicemail.

18 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Yes.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I think I
20 answered the-- I think I asked the question poorly,
21 so it's probably my fault in the way that I phrased
22 it, but I think that we didn't get clarity on the
23 record and for New Yorkers to understand the gravity
24 of this issue. So maybe we can clear it up today.

25 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Sure. So, 911 has
never had a voicemail.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Right.

4 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: That was confusion
5 with the current delay message that would actually
6 tell the caller to please hold for the next available
7 operator, but then it could play a TTY. It's called
8 a Baudot tone where sounds are changed into letters
9 across the machine, so they can-- so somebody that's
10 deaf or hard of hearing can type. So, they would
11 hear that tone and they actually thought it was going
12 to voicemail. Due to text to 911, TTY is virtually
13 obsolete. We did away with that message. On April
14 10th, we put a message that would no longer confuse
15 the callers. But again, just to make it clear--

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: [interposing]
17 That's helpful.

18 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: 911 has never had a
19 voicemail.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: So, how many
21 times in the past year have callers had to wait over
22 30 seconds?

23 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: I have 111,973.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: So--

25 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: [interposing] But
that's compared 202,000 from last year.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 88

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: So that's down
4 by almost 50 percent. That's great. That's
5 progress. And I recognize you guys get something
6 like 7.5 million calls a year. So, when we're talking
7 about 100,000 calls waiting over 30 seconds, it's--
8 you know, it's not-- I don't want to overstate it. I
9 also think it's concerning. So, progress, but still
10 a concern. Do you track how many have to wait over a
11 minute?

12 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: I don't have those
13 figures in front of me.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Do you have data
15 on specifically for those 100,000+ who had to wait
16 over 30 seconds, do we know if they just hung up or
17 what percentage of those calls just give up?

18 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: We don't have that
19 figure.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: We don't track
21 that?

22 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: We do not track that.
23 At least I'm not aware of that.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: So, look, I
25 think that-- and it sounds like as a result of some
improved management and emphasis on hiring we've been

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 89

3 able to drive down the number of calls that are over
4 30 seconds. What needs to happen for us to drive
5 that number down further?

6 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Increase the hiring.
7 There's some problems, some issues that cannot be
8 resolved without just increasing the headcount. This
9 is absolutely one of them, and we're doing everything
10 we can with every single bureau in the Police
11 Department to increase this.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Well, no
13 argument here. We need more 911 call operators and
14 appreciate that, you know, this is an issue that
15 especially Chair De La Rosa and I and others have
16 been very concerned about. It sounds like there's
17 been some meaningful progress. We still have a ways
18 to go to get to where we should be, but happy to hear
19 that things are moving in the right direction.

20 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: There's been a huge
21 amount of progress. In April, we were up over--

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: [interposing] I
23 acknowledged it. I mean, I wasn't-- you know, I'm
24 not-- I did not--

25 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: [interposing] Okay, so
then say no more.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 90

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: acknowledge it.
4 You should hear me on a regular day with the Adams
5 administration.

6 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Thank you.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Thank you,
8 Chair.

9 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Thank you. I want
10 to just go back to the Hospital Liaison Program
11 because I think it's great. And I want to thank
12 Commissioner Tucker for enhancing that program,
13 because it'll make a difference. But back in
14 November of 2024, FDNY testified that there was a
15 vacancy of 90 lieutenants and that was being
16 remedied, and then in-turn that would cause a
17 reduction in hospital turnover times. A-- were those
18 90 lieutenants hired, and did it have an impact?

19 CHIEF MIANO: So, we did do a hiring of
20 lieutenants and we are currently down 12 lieutenants,
21 and we're-- I'm looking at everything now, and I'll
22 see if we're able to get that number resolved in the
23 near future.

24 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Oh, that's great.
25 That's great. That is progress. And the FDNY is
coordinating with H+H, but-- and private hospitals to

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 91

3 address persistent bottlenecks in patient transfer
4 and ambulance availability, and they're doing it in
5 these ways, and I think that's great. But do you
6 have any numbers that could tell us the measuring of
7 the impact and efficacy of the Hospital Liaison
8 Program since it was started up again?

9 CHIEF MIANO: So, I could make a broad
10 statement and say that we have seen progress and
11 that-- in hospital times are down during the period
12 of times that our HOU members are in the hospitals.
13 I would have to-- you know, because they're so
14 widespread, to give an exact number would be hard,
15 but at the moment, but I would be able to break that
16 down and get that to your office.

17 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: That's fine. Okay,
18 great. And is there criteria or the thought of
19 expanding the Hospital Liaison pilot beyond the 10
20 current H+H sites, and if so, how will FDNY ensure
21 consistency across all hospitals?

22 CHIEF MIANO: So, we are always looking
23 at expansion of ways that are helping us trend in a
24 positive direction. We have a-- I have a chief
25 assigned to the HOU unit, and he has gone out to
26 hospitals and has regular meetings with them about

3 the program to see the hospitals' interest in the
4 program.

5 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: And those both H+H
6 and not-for-profit or private hospitals, or just
7 within H+H.

8 CHIEF MIANO: We are in both, yes.

9 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Good wonderful.
10 Let's talk about paramedics. What role do paramedic
11 response units play in reducing response times
12 citywide, and are there plans to expand or modify the
13 model based on the results so far?

14 CHIEF MIANO: So, the paramedic response
15 unit, just to give a little bit of context, an ALS or
16 a paramedic unit has two paramedics that ride in an
17 ambulance and when they come upon a patient, they are
18 responsible for that patient for the totality of the
19 call. What a paramedic response unit is, is it's two
20 paramedics in a non-transport vehicle. That vehicles
21 is simultaneously dispatched with a transport
22 vehicles, and when they get on the scene of that
23 assignment, they assess the situation, and if it's
24 deemed that this patient does not need advanced life
25 support, then that patient is then taken over by the
basic life support unit and transported to the

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 93

3 hospital allowing the paramedics to become available
4 again for another high-priority assignment.

5 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Excellent. In 2024,
6 how many patients were diverted from hospital
7 transport through the 911 to telemedicine programs?
8 And do you have any metrics that are used to assess
9 patient safety and outcomes?

10 CHIEF MIANO: I'm very sorry. You asked
11 if we have any metrics?

12 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: I know. I saw Jason
13 whispering in your ear at the same time. Thank you,
14 Jason. It's alright. He's a good guy. Do you have
15 any metrics that'll show how many patients were
16 diverted from hospital transport through the 911
17 system to telemedicine programs, and can you assess--
18 and how do you assess the safety of the patient and
19 their outcomes?

20 CHIEF MIANO: So, in regards to the
21 telemedicine, we do have a process in place that
22 sends patients through dispatch, when the dispatcher
23 is speaking to the alarm-receiving [sic] dispatcher
24 is speaking to the patient, there are different
25 situations where they could be sent to telemedicine.
And I'm going to allow Chief Werner to speak on that.

3 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Thank you.

4 CHIEF WERNER: It's pretty similar to the
5 mental health calls. It goes through an algorithm
6 and they reach an inclusion and exclusion criteria,
7 and if they're eligible for telemedicine, they
8 transfer it. If the call is required to come back
9 into the system, we do keep that call in a "not sent"
10 state so that we can reopen it.

11 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Thank you.

12 CHIEF WERNER: And that's for low acuity
13 calls.

14 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay, and I just
15 have one last question. It really isn't-- it's a
16 statement. In addition to the members that you
17 mentioned that you lost in 2020, 14 EMS workers died
18 by suicide, and reports of assaults have increased
19 from 15 in 2011 to 386 in 2022. I know that this
20 council has voted to provide bullet-proof vests for
21 your members and I'm just-- I'm glad to hear the
22 numbers of people that are seeking counseling through
23 your peer support systems, and that you yourself,
24 Chief, are going out and making sure that-- on the
25 ambulances, because-- to make sure that everything is
going well. I think that you're doing a wonderful job

3 with the tool that you have. FDNY, it's no secret
4 that I am a fan, and I'm only a fan because you get
5 the job done. Thank you very much.

6 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you,
7 Chair. I do want to ask the question about the
8 contract, and I understand that it's not maybe for
9 you to answer, but I do want to ask the question on
10 the record. EMS workers have been on an expired
11 contract for three years. What progress has been
12 made in negotiations with the EMS Local 2507 and
13 3621? What specific terms remain point of contention
14 between the city and unions, and has the city
15 examined the long-term costs of turnover including
16 recruitment and training compared to the cost of a
17 fair contract?

18 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: So, I don't have the
19 exact answers to those questions, but I do want to
20 state again that the work that my members do is
21 absolutely invaluable. They give the one thing that
22 we hold most valuable back to people and that's time.
23 And I don't know if you could put a number on time,
24 except to say that the members, the work that they do
25 is invaluable and we're hoping, hoping that there is
a positive resolution with OLR.

3 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you so
4 much for those comments, and we're hoping the same.
5 Any other questions from members? No? Alright, I
6 want to thank you all again for the productive
7 conversation, for being here, for being present, and
8 for being collaborators in our, I think, aligned goal
9 of making the workforce more empowered and making
10 sure that we're here to respond to New Yorkers in
11 need. So, thank you for your service to the City as
12 well. Thank you for coming.

13 CHIEF NAPOLITANO: Thank you for your
14 support.

15 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Of course.

16 CHIEF MIANO: Thank you very much.

17 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you.
18 Looking forward to working with you. While the dais
19 clears, I want to now open the floor to public
20 testimony. But before we begin, I want to remind
21 members of the public that this is a formal
22 government proceeding and that decorum shall be
23 observed at all times. As such, members of the
24 public shall remain silent at all times. The witness
25 table is reserves for people who wish to testify. No
video recording or photography is allowed from the

3 witness table. Further, members of the public may
4 not present audio or video recordings as testimony,
5 but may submit transcripts of such recordings to the
6 Sergeant at Arms for inclusion in the hearing record.
7 If you wish to speak at today's hearing, please fill
8 out an appearance card with the Sergeant at Arms and
9 wait for your name to be called. Once you have been
10 recognized, you will have two minutes to speak on
11 today's hearing topic on the working condition of New
12 York City's 911 emergency response workers. If you
13 have a written statement or additional written
14 testimony you wish submit for the record, please
15 provide a copy of that testimony to the Sergeant at
16 Arms. You may also write-- email written testimony to
17 testimony@council.nyc.gov within 72 hours of this
18 hearing. Audio and video recordings will not be
19 accepted. When you hear your name, please come up to
20 the witness table. For the first panel, we invite
21 Oren Barzilay, FDNY EMS Local 2507-- sorry about your
22 last name-- Tabitha Sheppard, PCT Local 5911 DC 37,
23 Kadeem Denoon, PCT Local 5911 DC 37. And when you
24 begin your testimony, just identify yourself for the
25 record so that we can, you know, adequately know

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 98

3 who's speaking. It's good to see you all. Thank
4 you. Alright, you may begin when you're ready.

5 OREN BARZILAY: Good morning, Council
6 Members.

7 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Morning.

8 OREN BARZILAY: Thank you for having us
9 today. I don't have a written testimony, as I've
10 submitted the same complaints over and over. I've
11 listened to the questions that were presented today,
12 and I don't blame our chiefs for any of the
13 mishappening that is currently going on in the FDNY.
14 They work very hard to provide service to the City,
15 and that our men and women are kept protected.
16 However, by the sign that OLR is not here, reflects
17 the exact way that we are being dealt with when we
18 sit down with them to negotiate. There is a total
19 disrespect when we sit down for over a year and
20 haven't moved one inch from what we have asked for.
21 There are many problems that this city faces when it
22 comes to my members, their members. It's poverty
23 wages. That's why there's such a high rollover. How
24 can you afford to live in a city with a starting
25 salary of \$39,000, and somebody like me, 30 years,
\$59,000. If you don't do any overtime it's

3 impossible to survive. If you don't get a second or
4 third job-- I have men and women that are living in
5 shelters, sleeping in their cars, sleeping at bus
6 depots to avoid paying the toll or the train to go
7 home to avoid that expense. There is no fair
8 contract. They're giving us the same bargaining offer
9 that they give people who are making six figures to
10 those that are making \$39,000. There's no
11 negotiations whatsoever. We are stuck. They're
12 refusing to budge. They want to oppress us, and they
13 are keeping us oppressed. Majority of my men and
14 women are people of color. Thirty percent are women.
15 They're struggling. The FDNY testified today about a
16 five percent turnover rate. Those numbers don't add
17 up. If they put three classes a year of 200 people a
18 class, that's 600 people. That's over 20 percent of
19 my membership. They play funny numbers. when my men
20 and women leave to other city agencies jobs that pay
21 far better, they don't call-- they don't consider
22 that as leaving the agency. As long as they remain
23 employed by the City, that's not reflected in their
24 resignation numbers that they gave of five percent.
25 I have 4,000 members. In 10 years, we hired 5,000.
Nobody stays. We're spending millions of dollars in

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 100

3 retraining and training new recruits every year. Just
4 last week, 175 people left on a Friday in one day to
5 become firefighters. You can't hold these people--
6 you can't blame them for leaving. Their starting
7 salary is what the top salary is. They don't include
8 people who are leaving for Sanitation, to become
9 police officers, or even Uber drivers make more than
10 us. \$18 an hour, and then you take off the taxes,
11 you're left with \$12. A dog walker makes \$25 an hour
12 on the average. A cashier at Target, Walmart, Costco
13 is making \$21-\$22 an hour. And that's the reason our
14 response times are through the roof, and it's going
15 to consider that trend until the City acknowledges
16 that there is a issue here. Last week, we had people
17 waiting for an ambulance for seven hours in the
18 Bronx. It's a common occurrence. It's the busiest
19 borough. People are dying. This past November, we
20 were here. We heard from two family members. One, a
21 father who did CPR on his son for over 20 minutes
22 before an ambulance arrived. That's the highest
23 priority call that we have in our system. His son
24 succumbed unfortunately. We had a daughter here who
25 her father fell in the bathroom, waited over 30
minutes. Her father bled to death. He also succumb

3 to his injuries. These are daily occurrences that
4 the Fire Department is trying to resolve. However,
5 OMB is refusing to give them the resources and the
6 budget that we need. I know that they're asking for
7 more funding to get more ambulances, more people.
8 However, we get turned down every time we ask for
9 more help, and we're paying with people's lives. In
10 the coming weeks, even the private sector is pulling
11 out of our system. Northwell has informed the
12 Department two weeks ago that they will be removing
13 six ambulances out of their system-- our of our 911
14 system. That will also impact response times, both
15 in Manhattan and Queens. Our members are faced with
16 dangers all the time. This past Monday, this Monday,
17 the FDNY released a data report that shows a 20
18 percent increase on assaults on EMTs and paramedics,
19 470 versus the last year which was 330 that they
20 mentioned earlier. The governor over the weekend
21 vetoed a bill to protect EMS personnel. We have
22 supervisors who ride along all the time. The Fire
23 Department thought it would be too costly. They
24 wouldn't be able to hire an additional 290 members.
25 Yet, we had Lieutenant Allison Russo [sp?] stabbed to
death because she was by herself. She had no

partner, nobody to call for help other than the public who watched what was happening. She would have been here today, but we're refusing to invest in EMS. Although I don't have a testimony, I wanted to just rebuttal some of the issues that were discussed today, and I'm welcoming your question.

CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: We're going to listen to the full panel, and then we do have questions so please stay. And thank you for your testimony. It's impactful and what we've been hearing for years, and we share the frustration that the needle hasn't moved, but we want to listen to the rest of the panel. Please. Just make sure you mic is on. There you go.

TABITHA SHEPPARD: Chair De La Rosa, Chair Ariola, and Chair Salaam-- he's not here-- and other members of the council. My name is Tabitha Sheppard. I am the new elected Local 5911 President and Supervisor for 911. Thank you. I am here to think about the critical issues that affect our ability to perform at our highest level and chronic understaffing across the Department. The number one issue that we face is that we are severely understaffed. The shortage directly impacts response

3 time, accuracy, and safety on both the public and our
4 operators. During my research and conversations with
5 colleagues I proposed two concrete compressed
6 schedules aimed to alleviate the excessive overtime
7 and reducing the burden on our operators.

8 Regrettably, these proposals were denied by labor
9 relations. Instead, labor relations has a history of
10 proposing schedules that require mandatory overtime
11 for our operators. This approaches unsustainable
12 strain on our workforce and does not address the root
13 cause of the understaffing. To illustrate the human
14 impact, I must share a truth that weighs heavily on
15 our operators. Many of our operators are working
16 extended hours, including two and three tours with
17 limited holidays or no holidays at all. They're
18 working three to four days a week, 16 hours a week,
19 all tours. And this is time away from their loved
20 ones. They also have children they have to take care
21 of. They have elderly parents that they assist, and
22 you know, people have underlying illnesses that they
23 can't be at work for 16 hours every day. You know,
24 they're exhausted. They're tired. This has been
25 going on for at least three years straight. This led
had fatigue and decrease in morale and concerns of

long-term health and job performance. Our personnel,
our current circumstances threatening both in
wellbeing and quality of service we provide to the
community. I respectfully request attention to the
following points: 24-hour coverage without reliance
on overtime, a reliance to the schedule. Like our
schedules are not aligned properly, they need to be
aligned properly. It's like it's done purposely to
order them every day for overtime. I want us to
revisit and collaborate on practice proposals that
balance the operational needs with wellbeing of the
workforce, and prioritize schedule practices and
allow adequate rest. Our goal is to deliver the call
test, most accurate compassion response for every
call. Achieving that requires a sustainable we-
staffed team that can safely handle the call volume
without excessive overtime. Thank you for your time
and consideration.

CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you so
much, and congratulations on becoming President.

TABITHA SHEPPARD: Thank you.

KADEEM DENOON: Good day, Council De La
Rosa. My name is Kadeem Denoon. I'm the Vice
President, actually, of the Local 5911. I do not

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 105

3 have a testimony, but I'm here in of support of my
4 President in regards to the issues that are going on
5 at 911, which is clear issues. I welcome any
6 questions that you guys have. I have been on the job
7 for eight years. I am active still at the job, so I
8 know about the overtime. I know about what is being
9 done at the job. I know every question that you could
10 possibly have-- possibly have an answer for you. So,
11 I welcome every question that you guys have. And
12 once again, I'm here to support. Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you so
14 much, and we do have some questions. I mean, the
15 first question that I have is-- you heard me question
16 the admin about the mandatory overtime and the double
17 shifts, and the response that we got here was that
18 the double shifts are not occurring. Can you speak
19 to that? because I've heard from workers who have
20 said that double shifts are occurring. Can you speak
21 to the situation with the double shifts?

22 TABITHA SHEPPARD: Go ahead.

23 KADEEM DENOON: Okay. So, in laymen's
24 terms, a double-- when you're saying a double shift,
25 right? If you're working a regular five-hour-- if
you're working a regular five-day, you work eight

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 106

3 hours a day, right? So, a double shift will be you
4 do another eight hours which is 16.

5 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: The 16 hours.

6 KADEEM DENOON: Right. So, we do have a
7 five-day. We have a four-day, and we have a three-
8 day. So, the three-day, you'll work 12 hours, right?
9 The other-- on four days you'll work 10, which is
10 9:45-8:45, because we don't get paid for our meals,
11 so it'll take out the hour, right? And then the five
12 days is the eight. So, if I'm working let's just say
13 a five-day, I would 16 hours every day that I'm
14 scheduled to work, right? They do have members
15 that'll work 16 hours. I'll say this, the Inspector
16 who you just spoke to, he's very hands-on. So he
17 will let people go, right? But once again, it's the
18 needs of the command. So, if I need you to work 16
19 hours, you're going to work 16 hours. So, we have
20 PCTs which our members working 16 hours straight.
21 Our whole midnight--

22 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: [interposing]
23 For how many days?

24 KADEEM DENOON: For four days, three
25 days.

CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Straight?

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 107

2 KADEEM DENOON: Straight. Yes.

3 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: So, the double
4 refers to the two eight-hour shifts.

5 KADEEM DENOON: Or it could be if I'm
6 working 12-- whatever amount of hours would make my
7 16. So, they-- we don't get held past 16, right?
8 So, if I'm working a 12-hour shift, the four hours
9 added on will make my 16, so that will be my 16
10 hours. So, I will be working-- if I'm working four
11 days, I'll work 16 hours every day. Our midnight is
12 from midnight to 9:45, right?

13 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Yeah.

14 KADEEM DENOON: And then they'll order
15 them 'til 1500, 'til 1600, which is 4:00-- which is
16 4:00 in the afternoon, or it will be 2:00 in the
17 afternoon, but we're getting ordered every day. I
18 just came from work about two days ago. I got
19 ordered. We're getting ordered every day.

20 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: And once you do
21 the 16-hour shift, you get a rest day, or you're
22 then-- then you have eight hours to go home, go to
23 sleep and come back for another 16 hours.

24 KADEEM DENOON: So, it's not directly
25 eight hours, because some of our members work in the

3 Bronx and then they'll commute and stuff like that.

4 but no, we don't get a rest date. You come back to
5 work. You get ordered again. You come back to work
6 the next day, you get ordered again. So,--

7 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: [interposing]

8 Yeah.

9 KADEEM DENOON: When are you-- when
10 you're scheduled to work, you're going to get ordered
11 pretty much. Once again, the Inspector is very
12 hands-on. He will let people go if you ask or if you
13 talk to them, but for the most part, our command is
14 getting ordered every day. The overtime is
15 ridiculous.

16 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Okay. I think
17 we're going to dig more into that, but I did want to
18 pose the same questions that we posed to the
19 administration earlier about the contract. What
20 progress has been made in negotiation? We heard Oren
21 and you say nothing, right? No progress yet. But we
22 want to hear from you what progress has been made?
23 What are the specific points of contention? We heard
24 some of them here, and then has the-- well, I guess
25 that was for the city about the long-term impacts.
But can you tell us anecdotally for your colleagues

3 what are the long-term impacts of not having this
4 contract negotiated for the last three years. And
5 you can take that question in whatever order you feel
6 comfortable, those questions.

7 OREN BARZILAY: Look, every day we have
8 on average two people resign, every day, one to two
9 person leave. In February of next year, 350 are
10 going to leave on the same day to become
11 firefighters. That's a normal occurrence between
12 FDNY EMS. Any time a Police Academy starts,
13 Sanitation class starts, they leave. So, it's like a
14 revolving door here. They don't want to give people
15 the option to make this a career that they love. We
16 save lives. We bring people back from the dead, and
17 when they see that there is no reward for it-- and
18 when I say a reward, it's livable wages. We're not
19 asking to be rich. We know we're not going to be
20 rich working for the City, but commensurate us to the
21 other agencies. They are earning twice as much as us
22 doing the same 911 calls. We are faced with the same
23 dangers, same risks. We ask for pay parity. They
24 adamantly said there's no way we're going to give you
25 guys pay parity. I don't want to mention, you know,
that it's humiliating what's happening to us.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 110

3 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Can you describe
4 what pay parity looks like for you all just so that
5 folks who are listening in understands what it means?

6 OREN BARZILAY: So, a firefighter will
7 make \$109,000 after five years. An EMT makes
8 currently \$59,000. That's a \$50,000 pay difference.
9 That's a difference of paying your rent, food-- I
10 mean, there are studies out there that shows how much
11 a single person needs to make to live in New York
12 City. It's in the six figures for a single person.
13 Yet, we are here over and over again. The Council--
14 and I thank you all for appropriating the \$50 million
15 to give us that pay parity. However, the Mayor
16 vetoed it. It won't cost us \$50 million. They
17 actually had told us at the table it's about \$20 to
18 \$30 million to fix this pay parity issue, but yet,
19 they are refusing. My members are suffering. The
20 overtime is through the roof. There's no issue with
21 finding work, because we run down 40 to 50 ambulances
22 every day, because we don't have the staffing, and
23 that's just for the minimum. That's not even for the
24 extra units that we need. We are running below
25 minimum every day, and it's a reflection on our
response times. As the Mayor's Budget Report shows

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 111

3 all the time, it keeps going up every year, and we
4 are at a level where people-- more people will die.

5 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: I appreciate
6 that. Chair Ariola?

7 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Oren, I know that
8 you were dealt quite a blow when the Governor vetoed
9 the pay parity bill just recently, and part of from
10 what I read it was because the Mayor-- she vetoed it,
11 which honestly, during election years everything is
12 yes. As soon as election is over, things are vetoed.

13 OREN BARZILAY: Yes.

14 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: And you're right,
15 \$25 million would bring you to pay parity. The \$50
16 million we asked for is a drop in the bucket. When
17 you speak to other first responders who are settling
18 contracts in the multi-billions, multi-billions, but
19 you were also promised through this administration
20 that the \$50 million would be appropriated after we
21 asked. But I imagine that failed along with his
22 failed attempt to become the Mayor for a second term.
23 And I'm sorry about that. but guess what, Oren?
24 We're still going to be here, and we're still going
25 to be advocating for you guys. We're still going to
make sure that you get what you need, and I know that

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 112

3 you have been so patient, but we're not giving up and
4 we don't want you to give up either.

5 OREN BARZILAY: I appreciate it.

6 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Because what's been
7 happening to EMS is a travesty. It's an absolute
8 travesty. You're being used, used for political
9 purposes and political pawns, and in the meantime
10 your members are either leaving as you said for other
11 agencies, living in homeless shelters, or unable to
12 provide for a family, so they're living at home. So
13 we're going to work this year coming to make sure
14 that that ends. Thank you for all that each and
15 every one of you do.

16 OREN BARZILAY: I appreciate all the help
17 and support.

18 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Oren, your
19 partnership has been invaluable. Thank you.

20 OREN BARZILAY: You know, you go 10 miles
21 to Elizabeth, New Jersey, the EMTs make over \$80,000.
22 You go 10 miles to Nassau County, \$140,000 they pay
23 for their paramedics. We're nowhere near that.
24 We're not even asking for that. We're asking to
25 bring us a little more than what you're offering us.
If the inflation rate was a little over 20 percent

3 last year-- offer us that at least. They're not even
4 offering us what the inflation rates are. I don't
5 want to continue rambling the same issue, but that's
6 the reality, and hopefully somebody will wake up one
7 day and realize that New York City is paying poverty
8 wages, not just to us. To my colleagues on the
9 right, when I heard they're only making \$58, I mean,
10 it's terrible. That's why everybody-- that's why
11 there's a vicious cycle of hiring, because people
12 don't know what they're getting into until they
13 realize, wait a second, I got to be here and get beat
14 up for this money? This is what's happening to us.
15 We're getting beat up for \$58,000 a year.

16 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: And a highly-
17 trained workforce at that, right? And so, I want to
18 echo Chair Ariola's sentiments. She said it so
19 eloquently. You have our commitment. We're not
20 going anywhere. We're going to be here and we're
21 going to continue to fight for both of these sectors,
22 because they're equally important, right? Like I see
23 you all sitting at the table, and I'm like, this is
24 one side of the system and this is the other side of
25 the system, and both sides of the system are being
failed, and when that happens, New Yorkers don't

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 114

3 trust us. We're going to stay committed to that. I
4 know that Council Member Holden also has a question.

5 OREN BARZILAY: I just want to add one
6 thing.

7 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Sure.

8 OREN BARZILAY: To that bill that was
9 vetoed. The FDNY does a safety report when there's a
10 major incident, especially when it comes to somebody
11 dying, and in their own recommendation, they suggest-
12 - they requested that a supervisor never go out on
13 his own again, and they once again failed to follow
14 their own direction, that we should never be out
15 there alone. I'm sorry.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: No, but thank you
17 all for your testimony and fighting for your
18 membership. And Oren, we've been-- this is my eighth
19 year, and it-- you could have given that testimony
20 eight years ago and you probably did, and we're still
21 in the same spot. I just can't believe that the
22 administration has turned a blind eye to this. Let
23 me just-- not to mention, and you didn't bring this
24 up, but during the pandemic, all your staff, your
25 members, were out there. You didn't work remotely.
You were there. First responders put themselves in

harm's way. You would think any administration would
reward that, that they were out there. But the
\$39,000 starting salary is an insult. You can't make
it-- you can't even make ends meet. Even with two
salaries, you're both EMS workers who are in the same
family, they still couldn't make it in New York City.
That's how-- we're in such dire straits. But given
the pandemic, and then with your testimony, 350 are
leaving-- of your members-- are leaving for-- to be
firefighters. You would think that would be an
incentive for more parity. So, this is a disgrace
and a failure of this administration which they
should be ashamed of themselves for not fixing this.
But I just want to bring up the pay parity, Oren,
again. They just-- the administration flat out says
no, and that's it? There's no room for negotiation?
I mean, are you also bringing up retro pay and so
forth, because three years without a contract

OREN BARZILAY: So, they flat out said
no, and we tried to compromise, maybe meet in the
middle somewhere, no.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: And when you say,
well, our members are out there and we save lives,
it's not like we're-- and they're overworked

3 obviously, but they go into very stressful situations
4 every single call almost-- that somebody's on the
5 phone and they're frantic that somebody's not
6 responding, one of their loved ones and so forth and
7 so on, they're down. And your staff has to actually
8 bring them back to live or save their lives, and
9 that's not important for pay parity, that alone? I
10 just, you know-- again, I could feel your anger. I
11 felt it for eight years, and I commend you, but we
12 have to really get to a point. And the Governor, by
13 the way, the veto is another insult, and I think your
14 members should remember that. Even if the contract
15 is signed, doing that is a disgrace what the
16 government just did. Not getting to pay parity, but
17 not rewarding past work that you've done during the
18 pandemic which you were asked to do much, much more.
19 Thank you. Thank you all of your testimony.

20 OREN BARZILAY: I appreciate the kind
21 words of support. And I just want to go back to the
22 question that you had to the Department about the EDP
23 calls, the mental health. Our members don't go in
24 unless the police is there. Sometimes we wait an
25 hour or two until the police get there. No fault on
the police colleagues, they're busy. But we don't go

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 117

3 in. We wait for the police whether it's down the
4 block--

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing] But
6 they didn't say that.

7 OREN BARZILAY: They won't tell you
8 that. We wait sometimes two hours for the police to
9 arrive, because the police is busy dealing with other
10 crisis.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: You know, I've
12 heard that over and over again from first responders,
13 that the police are-- because of the shortage and
14 each unit is holding multiple jobs.

15 OREN BARZILAY: Yeah.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: And they're
17 sometimes they're last at the scene. Sometimes they
18 don't even make the scene. The firefighters are
19 telling me that, that the police rarely show up to
20 these, to these situations.

21 OREN BARZILAY: No, we don't go in unless
22 the police-- unless the crew decides on their own to
23 take that chance, but our protocol is you do not go
24 in unless the police is there.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Alright, thank
you. Thank you, Chairs.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 118

3 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: I want to thank
4 this panel. Oh, I'm so-- I'm sorry. Too much going
5 on. Council Member Felder has a question.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: Thank you. I
7 don't know if this is something that's, you know,
8 really should have been posed for the previous panel,
9 but I'm just curious. I don't understand, and
10 perhaps one of you can explain-- when 911 gets a call
11 that someone is having I'll just say a meltdown,
12 right, you and the police-- they send out the-- your
13 people and a police to the scene, is that accurate?

14 OREN BARZILAY: On certain calls, we both
15 go.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: Okay.

17 OREN BARZILAY: Not on all calls. Not on
18 all medical calls, but on EDP--

19 COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: Okay.

20 OREN BARZILAY: But on EDP calls, except
21 for the B-HEARD EDP calls, the police don't go. But
22 for the regular psych patients that have violent
23 tendency, the police get dispatched with us.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: Right. Are any
25 of you aware, you know-- I haven't read up on it, but
are any of you aware on, again, like when they do

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 119

3 show up-- somebody mentioned something about mace or
4 other things. How are they-- how are they trained to
5 respond to someone who's having a meltdown?

6 OREN BARZILAY: We have de-escalation
7 training that we get. Basically, it's a little self-
8 defense.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: It's what?

10 OREN BARZILAY: It's Self-defense 101,
11 you know, like to block an arm. You know, they go--
12 it's simple tactics that they teach us, but those
13 things happen unexpectedly. You know, you're
14 treating your patient on the stretcher--

15 COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: [interposing]
16 Right.

17 OREN BARZILAY: You don't anticipate him
18 to punch you in the face or bite you in the face.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: But before the
20 stretcher, in other words-- there's a young man who's
21 not well who's holding a knife, you know, waving a
22 knife, you know, somewhere, you know, down the alley
23 or something. Some neighbor call says he's--

24 OREN BARZILAY: [interposing] Just
25 retreat. Retreat. That's the only--

COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: [interposing] Huh?

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 120

2 OREN BARZILAY: We have to retreat.

3 That's the only thing.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: So, you retreat,
5 and then the police show up at some point, and how--
6 are you aware on how they respond to that?

7 OREN BARZILAY: I am not familiar with
8 that.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: Okay.

10 KADEEM DENOON: On our side, no, we are
11 not aware of how they respond.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: Okay.

13 KADEEM DENOON: So, we just cover when
14 the call come in and stuff like that, in regards to
15 that. Also, to his point, if MHR-- which is the B-
16 HEARD is responding, then we'll see the message on
17 the dispatcher's side and we won't send the police,
18 but if it is a threat or it is someone that's violent
19 and is going through a crisis, yes, we do send the
20 police.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: Okay, thank you.

22 KADEEM DENOON: Let me just say, I know--
23 I want to thank everyone here that asked the hard
24 questions, right, and are standing up for us, because
25 we do need that, because like he said, a lot of

things are not going to be said when our chiefs and
our inspectors and they sit here, but we the Local
and we the members, we are going through this
everyday, right? We spoke about pay, the pay is
ridiculous. It's laughable to be honest with you.
Our members also are in shelters. Our members are
also going through a lot. We have people who are
sleeping in the command. We voice these complaints
over and over and over again. Sometimes it feels
like it's falling it on deaf ears, and I'm thanking
you for your reassurance that you're going to fight
for us. I hear-- I heard every question you asked,
which shows me that you guys are doing the research.
You're asking the hard questions. I do wish that we
still had a couple more people that was here who
asked questions that I had an answer for. But the
overtime is ridiculous. We-- and some people,
sometimes we have to do overtime to survive in New
York, right, and that's clear. When we go in, a
member going into 911 is using 911 as a stepping
stool, right? So, you-- I think they said six months
is the training. So that six months, you're spending
all these money on these new recruits for the six
months. Some of them are already on lists to be

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 122

2 called for PD. So, every class, every city class
3 that gets paid more, they're going to go. So, that's
4 why we don't retain. So, staffing is a problem. It
5 is. But we could get the bodies in. We cannot keep
6 them because they're not getting paid to stay there,
7 right? You kick in with the overtime and the short
8 staff, it's a slew of stuff that you're going to be
9 going through as a 911 operator, and you're not going
10 to stay. So, we talked about call volume, talk about
11 call waiting and all these things. So, we think
12 about it like this. if-- let's just say for example,
13 our call volume is a thousand. I'm just giving an
14 example of a thousand. And we have 200 PCTs which is
15 members to answer those calls, right? We don't have
16 that. So, it would be like 1,000 to 20. So, a PCT
17 is doing more of the work. There's calls back to
18 back to back to back. Yes, we have members sleeping
19 on call-- unfortunately, we have members sleeping on
20 calls. We have members there-- we cannot stay awake.
21 Then for you to leave there and to go home, some
22 members live in Brooklyn. Once again, the Inspector
23 is very hands-on. I have to say this. He's very
24 hands-on. We go to him with a problem. If he can fix
25 it, he will. But some members live in Brooklyn.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 123

2 Let's just say I live in Coney Island. I have to go

3 to the Bronx to work, right? I do a 16-hour shift.

4 My commute from the Bronx to Coney Island is probably

5 like an hour or two hours. Let's just say I get off

6 at midnight where the trains are not running express.

7 They're running local. So, my commute is now longer.

8 Now I get home-- by the time I get home, it's-- I

9 fall asleep for an hour. I have to go back to work.

10 Now, I got back to work and have to do those 16 hours

11 again. So, we understand there is a problem,

12 everyone as a collective. I understand why the City

13 or NY-- why they don't see it as a problem. The pay,

14 I can't stress enough how much it is a problem. If

15 you compare our pay to other call centers, you will

16 laugh. Our call volume is one of the highest. New

17 York City call volume is one of the highest. So, I

18 would like someone to make it make sense to me. How

19 is that our staffing is low, our call volume is one

20 of the highest, but we are the least paid. That

21 makes absolutely no sense at all. I don't think

22 anyone could understand that. So, yes, we

23 understand, and we do the job. No matter what they

24 say, the job gets done. The staffing is low, the job

25 gets done. We don't get paid enough the job gets

3 done. Because we know it's important the job that we
4 work. Trust and believe, our members do. But we're
5 all human. We're not robots. The body gives out
6 when it gives out. We work hard every day. It's not
7 a light day at no point in time. There's not a light
8 day. Once again, I'll say this again. The
9 inspector, he works with us. He's one of the best
10 inspectors that we have. I could go on record and
11 say that. But what I'm saying to you, some problems
12 is kind of bigger than the inspector. You could bring
13 in-- I think we said we have like 80-something people
14 coming in for training. That's not [inaudible],
15 meaning we don't know if the members are going to
16 pass the test that we have, right? So, we have to
17 have a test-- we don't know how many people are
18 going to pass. By the time the six months over, you
19 could get 100 people-- 100 people already left. 150
20 people already left, and don't let us-- once again,
21 don't let us have a city exam. It's more. So, we
22 have to focus on the pay and how to retain-- how to
23 retain the staff, but thank you once again. I
24 appreciate you.

25 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Yes, that
message is clear to us about retention. It's also

3 clear to us that even if the inspector has good
4 intentions and is hands-on, if the system is broken
5 it is never going to work, because your attrition
6 level is so high that it never catches up to the
7 actual need, and the reasons why is because of the
8 pay which is at the end of it, and also the working
9 conditions, right? So we're clear on that, and I
10 guess our job here is to have-- and this is why these
11 hearings are important, to bring this to the level of
12 consciousness so that the city is compelled to move,
13 and we're going to continue to do what we can to make
14 sure that happens.

15 KADEEM DENOON: I just want to say one
16 thing also. In regards to scheduling.

17 TABITHA SHEPPARD: Yeah, I was going to
18 say that.

19 KADEEM DENOON: So, think about it as
20 this. So, if I'm a PCT, I would much rather work 16
21 hours for three days and have four days off so I
22 could get-- I could recoup, I could do these things,
23 right? If-- right now we are on sort of a
24 compressed, and the direction that we're going is
25 kind of go away from three days on to four days off,
to go to four days on to three days off. Regardless

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 126

3 of what schedule we get, we're going to get overtime.

4 So, our members would much rather do a double three
5 days in a row and have four days off than to have--
6 to do 16 hours for five days or 16 hours for four
7 days.

8 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: I get that.

9 KADEEM DENOON: Right? It just makes
10 more sense. Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you so
12 much, and thank you all for coming here and sharing
13 your thoughts and your experiences today. We really
14 appreciate it. We have gratitude for your service to
15 the city, and we're going to keep talking about this.
16 So, thank you all for coming. If there's anyone in
17 the chamber who wishes to speak, but has not yet had
18 the opportunity to do so, please raise your hand and
19 fill out an appearance card with the Sergeant at Arms
20 in the back of the room. Seeing no hands in the
21 chamber, we will now shift to Zoom testimony. And
22 our first and only panelist is Iliana Gordon.
23 Iliana, when you're unmuted, you may begin.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

25 ILIANA GORDON: Hi, good afternoon
Councilman De La Rosa. Thank you for this

3 opportunity. I must say that the last time I spoke
4 with you in 2022, the same problem persists. It has
5 gotten worse. My-- as my coworker said, there are
6 people sleeping in shelters, people sleeping at the--
7 at PSAP [sic], inside the PSAP, because they have--
8 they're sleeping there because of the excessive
9 overtime. They're sleeping there also by choice,
10 because sometimes they don't have nowhere else to go.
11 It's so sad that in New York City, right, with the
12 City that has the budget that rivals of a developed
13 country-- a developing country, that we can't pay our
14 city workers. The Eric Adams administration has
15 significantly failed us. We cannot afford to live in
16 this city, right? We've been treated by the Eric
17 Adams administration literally like human waste. My
18 coworkers cannot afford to live in this city. The
19 aim of the city, the aim of the NYPD should be to
20 retain-- should be to recruit, retain, and develop,
21 and they have been stuck in the retaining stage for
22 more than 15 years, because they cannot retain labor.
23 They're only able to recruit. Like, what is the
24 sense in recruiting when you're not able to retain
25 and develop. You cannot get a phase two and phase
three. People are not staying. They're saying

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 128

2 they're going to hire people. Those people are not
3 going to stay. They're going to make biweekly a
4 thousand dollars in New York City. They are not
5 going to stay. All this money spending on
6 recruiting, these people are not going to stay. The
7 system is broken.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time's expired.

9 ILIANA GORDON: I don't--

10 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: [interposing] You
11 can--

12 ILIANA GORDON: I don't know when will it
13 be fixed, but it's not-- my coworkers are suffering.

14 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Yes. Thank you
15 Iliana. I know that you and I have had multiple
16 conversations on this issue, and I appreciate you for
17 your comments and your continued advocacy. I
18 appreciate you being here today. If you're currently
19 on Zoom and wish to speak, but have not yet had the
20 opportunity to do so, please use the raise hand
21 function and our staff will unmute you. Seeing no
22 hands, I would like to note that everyone can submit
23 written testimony. Okay, we have one person in-
24 person. Christopher Leon Johnson, you can begin.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 129

3 CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Yeah. Hello.

4 My name is Christopher Leon Johnson. Thanks for
5 having this hearing. [inaudible] I know. Sorry.

6 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: It's okay. Take
7 your time.

8 CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Alright, so
9 I'm here to show my support to the people that work
10 for OEM. I think that the City Council needs to
11 start protecting the female people more, the female
12 employees more in this stuff. Now, today is
13 domestic-- this month is Domestic Violence Awareness
14 Month, and I believe that the City Council need to
15 put more initiatives to protect the city workers,
16 especially for the people that work in OEM. I'm
17 calling the City Council to really step up their game
18 when it comes to really showing proof that they
19 support women in the workplace, because females get
20 abused all the time in these city workplaces and
21 nothing ever happens. So, that's basically-- that's
22 all I got to say, and thank you so much. Enjoy your
23 day.

24 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: Thank you so
25 much.

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON
2 FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY 130

3 CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Thank you.

4 Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON DE LA ROSA: We thank the
6 administration and the public for attending this
7 hearing and sharing your thoughts on this oversight
8 topic, and we recognize the importance of the topic
9 and will continue to work to make positive strides
10 for these workers of our city that are essential. I
11 look forward to following up and continuing ot work
12 with the Chairs, and with that, this hearing is now
13 adjourned. Thank you all so much.

14 [gavel]

1	COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE & LABOR JOINT WITH COMMITTEE ON FIRE & EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AND COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY	131
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing tranYouipt is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date October 28, 2025