

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

----- X

December 14, 2017
Start: 10:20 a.m.
Recess: 1:39 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Daniel R. Garodnick
James Vacca
Margaret S. Chin
Stephen T. Levin
Deborah L. Rose
James G. Van Bramer
David G. Greenfield
Costa G. Constantinides
Carlos Menchaca
I. Daneek Miller
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Ronnie Hakim, Managing Director
Metropolitan Transportation Authority, MTA

Peter Cafiero, Chief of Operations Planning
Metropolitan Transportation Authority, MTA

Polly Trottenberg, Commissioner
NYC Department of Transportation

Eric Beaton, Deputy Commissioner
Transportation Planning and Management
NYC Department of Transportation

Rami Metal, Director, Strategic Engagement
NYC Department of Transportation

Craig Cipriano, Senior Leader
Department of Buses
Metropolitan Transportation Authority, MTA

Eric McClure, Executive Director
StreetsPAC

Kate Slevin, Vice President
State Programs and Advocacy
Regional Plan Association

Chris Leonard, Vice President of Membership
Brooklyn Chamber of Commerce
Appearing for: Andrew Hoan, President & CEO
Brooklyn Chamber of Commerce

Peter Walterspiel, Representing StuyTown and Peter
Cooper Village

Phil Vos, Energy Vision

Renee Reynolds

New York City Environmental Justice Alliance, NYCEJA

Kat Fisher, Director, Electric Vehicle Program

Sierra Club, New York State

Jessica Castle, Strategic Researcher

Alliance for a Greater New York, ALIGN

Appearing for: Ray DaSilva Farrel, Executive Director

Steven Bauman, Electric Bus Advocate

Steve Fabrican, Sierra Club

Adam Lerman

2 [sound check, pause]

3 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Good morning

4 everyone and welcome to today's hearing of the City

5 Council Transportation Committee, the last one of—in

6 2017. I'm Ydanis Rodriguez, the Chairman of this

7 Committee. First, let me recognize my colleagues who

8 is here, Council Member Garodnick and Reynoso.

9 Today, we are conducting an oversight hearing on the

10 plans the city and the MTA have to deal with the

11 upcoming L Train Tunnel closure that is necessary in

12 order to do major repairs. Starting April 2019, the

13 tunnel used by the L Train between Manhattan and

14 Brooklyn will be closed for 15 months to allow the

15 MTA to complete repairs necessary as a result of

16 Hurricane—Hurricane Sandy. Before I get into this

17 particular topic, I want to take two minutes also to

18 make some recommendations especially to the MTA not

19 necessarily to put them in a spot for—to answer any

20 questions, but I would like to, you know, have our

21 last hearing in 2017 with those recommendations to

22 the MTA and DOT. I believe that as we are in the

23 business to make our public transportation system in

24 New York City the best one in the nation, I hope that

25 the MTA, this work and get the support from the state

2 and the city raise the revenue. I believe that we
3 should definitely get the support from the Governor
4 and state legislation and the city to look at the
5 four initiatives that we have on the table, the
6 millionaire taxes, the toll on the bridges, Denosch
7 (sic) Initiative, Stringer Initiative, all those four
8 together can raise \$27 billion in the next ten years.
9 At the same time, I hope that also the MTA should
10 work together to control the cost and with the
11 reorganization of the MTA, I hope to see two seats of
12 the Board of the MTA to be designated by the City
13 Council. Those are only recommendations that I
14 believe should be considered. I don't expect again
15 to get any answer. That's not the topic of today,
16 but I believe it is important to take any moment and
17 opportunity to address the importance that over all
18 it has to make our transportation system in New York
19 City safer and more efficient. I also believe that
20 the MTA should focus from here to 28 only in mailings
21 (sic) and constructions. We should not be looking at
22 any new big mega projects, but yet to focus on those
23 two areas so that we should reduce the timing to
24 upgrade the signal system that we have today to 2045.
25 As someone—as someone 52 years old, I will be 80

2 years old if we follow that schedule. I think that
3 our New Yorkers and more than 50 million tourists
4 they would like and trust the new leadership of the
5 MTA to get that goal accomplished. Today, again we
6 will be addressing how destruction of the L Train
7 will affect over 400,000 New Yorkers everyday.
8 Everyone knows that because the L Train does not have
9 nearby lines, to shut it down will be even more
10 destructive than some of the other similar shutdowns
11 we have—we have seen recently such as the R Train
12 Tunnel a couple of years ago. That's why the Council
13 and riders expect that the city and the MTA present a
14 comprehensive and detailed plan for getting people
15 where they need to go during this construction. It
16 will take a lot of work and well planned and
17 coordination to get this done successfully, and we
18 trust the leadership of the MTA and DOT to get it
19 done. It will require extra services on the other
20 subway lines, ferry service, space for bikes and
21 pedestrians and, of course, shuttle bus services
22 across that I hope we will look for electrical buses
23 as the alternative. The Williamsburg Bridge with
24 dedicated lanes to keep the buses moving hopefully
25 again electric ones. This shutdown will require for

2 the MTA and the DOT to listen to passengers whose
3 commutes will be disrupted especially those residents
4 who live near by these areas affected. I commend my
5 colleagues who represent those areas who have been
6 proactive organizing town hall meetings on this
7 subject. They also will have the opportunity to say
8 a few words. We are New Yorkers, and we know how to
9 adapt, but we have strong opinions. We have done so
10 many times and at the end of the day when work
11 together, we get successful projects. However, we
12 need to make sure that the city and the MTA are doing
13 everything they possibly can do to help New Yorkers
14 be prepared and to keep everyone both informed and
15 moving. We know a lot of this work and collaboration
16 has been ongoing and we look forward to hearing more
17 about it today, and how the MTA and DOT is planning
18 to continue having a town hall meeting in the next
19 few weeks and months to explain to the riders their
20 plan. Because of the impact that this shutdown will
21 have, it is also vitally important that this work
22 gets done on time. We did it on time the Mario Cuomo
23 Bridge. We're working on LaGuardia, and we have
24 shown that we can get projects on time and on budget.
25 We look forward to hearing more from the MTA about

2 how they plan to make sure that happens. We also
3 know that this closure is a unique opportunity to
4 make important improvements to the L Line while the
5 trains aren't—are not running that will benefit the L
6 Train's riders once the line is fully back in
7 service. We know the MTA plans to complete important
8 work such as installing some of the beaters (sic) in
9 the subway system first platform door system. WE
10 hope to hear more about these plans and what more can
11 be done to make sure we are making the most of this
12 unique opportunity to complete meaningful and
13 beneficial enhancements to the L Line. And finally,
14 we cannot forget the many small businesses that will
15 be impacted during this closure, and who will need to
16 make sure our supported during that—those
17 constructions, and disruptive time for them. Today,
18 we are also hearing Resolution 1443, which will call
19 on the Governor and the MTA to commit to an
20 expeditious transition to an electric bus fleet and
21 to use electric buses as part of these replacement
22 services during the L Train shutdown. Doing what we
23 can to mitigate the impact of this shutdown and the
24 associated plan for travel alternative under
25 environmental, it's importance and I would like to

2 invite Council Member Rafael Espinal who is getting
3 here right now to deliver an opening statement on
4 Resolution 1443. You have some time.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Thank you.

6 [pause] Thank you, Mr. Chair for holding this very
7 important oversight hearing on the pending L train
8 shutdown, and on my Reso, which is calling on the MTA
9 to introduce 100% bus fleet in the immediate impact
10 area. As a rep of North Brooklyn, this shutdown will
11 inconvenience many of my constituents, and will force
12 200,000 New Yorkers to find alternate routes. More
13 importantly, it will have an impact on our
14 environment, and I say this because an obvious
15 consequence will be more buses and cars on our
16 streets. The MTA is actually estimating up to 30,000
17 displaced riders who will take public buses and not
18 to mention the cabs and personal cars people will
19 resort to. Yet, the MTA response to this crisis has
20 so far been to move those displaced riders by using
21 200 diesel buses. Just yesterday they gave us little
22 insight on how those buses will be used, but one
23 important fact that's missing is that we're using new
24 capital dollars to purchase 200 diesel buses at a
25 time when cities across the country are making a

2 commitment to purchase 100% electric buses. The
3 choice to use diesel buses could be disastrous for
4 our environment. Each bus emits carbon, which is
5 equivalent to having 22 cars on our street and after
6 doing some math, I've estimated 200 buses will be
7 equivalent to putting 4,400 in our city roads, and I
8 don't think I'm alone when I say this that during
9 this day and age that is unacceptable. The sad irony
10 here that L Train shutdown is a direct result of the
11 environment disasters called by-caused by Hurricane
12 Sandy. So, I'm not sure how a solution that would
13 further pollute our environment and clearly
14 contribute to climate change is what the MTA is
15 considering. We must do everything in our power to
16 slow climate change and implement smart progressive
17 strategies to protect our environment and move New
18 Yorkers throughout our city. New York City has
19 already committed to reducing our greenhouse gas
20 emissions 80% by 2050. Using electric buses during
21 this shutdown and committing to only buy electric by
22 2025 will help us reach that goal. I have to note
23 that the MTA did recently announce plans to purchase
24 ten electric buses for a three-year test run starting
25 in the late 2017, which I applaud this move. Many of

2 us feel—but many of us feel that is not enough. As I
3 mentioned earlier, major cities have committed to go
4 100% electric and those cities include Los Angeles,
5 Seattle, London and Paris. So, New York should step
6 up. Making a switch to electric buses goes beyond
7 protecting our environment. It also has a positive
8 impact on New Yorkers' health as well. It's
9 estimated that converting our fleet would—would
10 result in substantial reduction of emissions that
11 would also result in \$100 of health servings per
12 resident per year. New Yorkers will get less sick
13 and save more money because the MTA stood up and
14 decided to use electric buses. These are questions
15 about—these are—there are question about the cost of
16 these buses, but electric buses cost less to fuel and
17 maintain, and last longer than diesel buses. So, in
18 the long run, the MTA is saving more money. At a
19 time where we have a federal government being led by
20 climate change deniers, we as a city and a state must
21 develop long-term strategies to flight—to fight
22 climate change now. I truly believe the L Train
23 shutdown is the perfect opportunity to show that we
24 as New Yorkers are committed to resisting federal
25 policies. I urge the MTA and our friends in the

2 states to come up with a plan that utilizes these
3 buses as a more significant part of the replacement
4 strategy and work with us to transition to an all
5 electric fleet in the near future. Before, I wrap
6 up, I really want to give a big thank you to the
7 Sierra Club who is here joining us today, and
8 testifying. In particular Cat Fisher, who is part of
9 the Sierra Club's Electric Vehicle Initiative for
10 providing information to help draft this resolution
11 and for being a big part of this effort from the
12 beginning. A big thanks also to filmmaker Darren
13 Aronofsky, who's part of the Sierra Club's Board, and
14 a local resident—and a born and raised Brooklynite
15 and a businessman who has supported this effort
16 throughout the time we've been fighting this. So,
17 thank you to the DOT, all the advocates in this room
18 and MTA also for being here. I look forward to
19 hearing your testimony and future conversations.
20 Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
22 Council Member. Before we proceed, as this is the
23 last full hearing of this committee, and committee of
24 this section I would like to thank my fellow
25 committee members for all their thoughtful

2 collaboration over the past four years on so many
3 important transportation issues. We have accomplished
4 a lot together. I am perhaps most proud of the
5 robust series of hearings we have held and the many
6 pieces of legislation we have passed related to
7 Vision Zero more than 20, making our streets safer
8 for everyone especially pedestrians and cyclists.
9 It's so critically important. Every crash and death
10 prevented in meaningful—is meaningful as we have
11 heard the touching stories of family members for
12 Families for Safe Streets who had those loved ones in
13 traffic classes, and who have been brave enough to
14 share their experience with us. We have also passed
15 important legislation related to Citi Bike, commuter
16 vans strengthening the taxi industry that I hope the
17 Yellow Taxi industry will have a role to also be able
18 to provide services in that area that will be
19 affected by the closing of the L trains. Community
20 taxi benefits accessibility, car sharing in the for-
21 hire vehicle industry among many other things. Not
22 to mention many valuable oversight hearing—hearings
23 on so many issues affecting DOT, TLC, MTA and even
24 the Port Authority. As always, I would like to thank
25 Commission or DOT Polly Trottenberg for your great

2 leadership in being a partner to make transportation
3 safer and more efficient to the whole city. Thanks
4 to Mayor de Blasio and Speaker Melissa Mark Viverito
5 for their support, and my colleagues here especially
6 the committee staff and my staff in my office past
7 and present for all of their hard work. There is, of
8 course, a lot more to be done, and I look forward to
9 being a strong voice on all of the important
10 transportation issues we continue to face in the
11 upcoming sessions of the Council. I would like to
12 work on the Commissioner's [Speaking Spanish] I
13 would like to welcome Commissioner Trottenberg,
14 Managing Director Hakim and the other representatives
15 of DOT and the MTA who are here with us today. Thank
16 you for being here, but before I ask the Committee
17 Counsel to administer the affirmation, I would like—
18 and even though my colleague he also will have time
19 to ask his question, but since he represents an area
20 affected by the L Train, I'd like also to give the
21 opportunity to Antonio Reynoso to say a few words.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you.

23 Thank you, Chair. Yes, I am on. Thank you, Chair
24 for your work as well, and this committee has been a
25 great committee to be a part of the last four years,

2 and what better way to get to the conclusion of—of
3 this term than talking about the Apocalypse that
4 everyone is concerned about or the L Train shutdown.
5 For me, my main concern is most of my district uses
6 the L Train as the primary means of transportation
7 outside of the J/M/Z Line. Going through these plans
8 that I'm seeing in front of me and the testimony
9 that's coming soon, I'm very concerned about the lack
10 of progress we've been able to make on the Brooklyn
11 side regarding changes that would help in moving my
12 constituents and a lot of the residents of Brooklyn
13 around the 14th Street and 13th Street plans presented
14 to us seem well developed, and it's—it's a stark
15 contrast between what I would consider development on
16 Grant Street or in my district. What I'm hoping to
17 get here today is the reasoning behind the lack of
18 progress that we've been able to make, what I
19 consider we're able to make in Brooklyn, and speaking
20 to this 400,000 people that are going to be moving of
21 which most of them move from Brooklyn to Manhattan.
22 So, just being able to accommodate them. So, again, I
23 have huge concerns about where Brooklyn stands on
24 this—in this plan, and the lack of communication that
25 as an elected official I have been receiving from DOT

2 and the MTA over the last six months is also a
3 concern. I think you're going to need the elected
4 officials to be partners in this process especially
5 to assist with communication to constituents and
6 riders, and I think that we're falling short on being
7 able to do that the right way. So, again, I want to
8 thank you, Chair Rodriguez for hosting this committee
9 meeting. I'm looking forward to asking questions of
10 both MTA and the Department of Transportation. So,
11 thank you very much.

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member
13 Reynoso. Now, let's hear a few words from Council
14 Member Dan Garodnick.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you very
16 much. I'll be very brief. Thank you, Chairman for
17 this hearing, and to the MTA and DOT for-for
18 participating obviously. I am going to focus my
19 attention today on the Eastern end of the Manhattan
20 part of the L Train specifically in Stuyvesant Town
21 and Peter Cooper Village. Our estimate is about
22 8,000 residents from Stuyvesant Town and Peter
23 Cooper Village alone use the L Train and start at
24 14th Street and First Avenue. So, our concern in
25 that neighborhood is going to be (1) making sure that

2 there is the ability for those 8,000 people to get on
3 a bus, to head west, but also the sudden development
4 of Stuyvesant Town and Peter Cooper Village as a real
5 locust of activity for all transportation needs to
6 accommodate the shutdown and that means the Ferry
7 Terminal, 18th Street and C 14th Street and First
8 Avenue, which is already the busiest SBS stop on the
9 First Avenue Route and will also be a place to
10 accommodate many of the folks from—from Brooklyn. We
11 have the 30,000 people who live in that neighborhood
12 already and, of course, the existing construction
13 related to the L Train work itself. So, I'm
14 concerned about these impacts, and will be focusing
15 my attention on that subject today, and again, I than
16 you, Mr. Chairman for the opportunity.

17 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
18 Council Member. I now ask the Committee Counsel to
19 administer the Affirmation and then invite Managing
20 Director Hakim and the Commissioner Trottenberg to
21 deliver their statements, and I know that they are
22 ready to answer our questions.

23 LEGAL COUNSEL: Good morning. Please
24 raise your right hand. Do you affirm to tell the
25 truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in

2 your testimony before this committee, and to respond
3 honestly to Council Member questions?

4 RONNIE HAKIM: I do.

5 LEGAL COUNSEL: Thank you.

6 RONNIE HAKIM: Thank you. Good morning
7 Chairman Rodriguez and members of the City Council.
8 I'm Ronnie Hakim the MTA's Managing Director, and I'm
9 joined today by my colleague on my right Peter
10 Cafiero who's the Chief of Operations Planning at MTA
11 New York City Transit, as well s some other MTA New
12 York City Transit leadership. I'm pleased today to
13 be sharing my time with Commissioner Trottenberg, New
14 York City's Department of Transportation
15 Commissioner. As you may know, MTA and DOT have been
16 collaborating closely since the winter of 2016 when
17 we first announced the need for Canarsie Tunnel
18 Repair Project. We've been meeting and discussing
19 our plans for this project extensively since then,
20 and both teams have put in a lot of hard work and I'm
21 proud of our joint efforts to come up with the
22 comprehensive and multi-layered plan, which is what
23 we're here today to discuss, and it continues to be a
24 work in progress. Repairs began this summer and will
25 necessitate the complete closure of the L Line

2 between Bedford Avenue in Brooklyn and 8th Avenue and
3 14th Street in Manhattan scheduled to begin in April
4 of 2019. We know this will be tough on our city
5 especially for the 225,000 MTA customers who rely on
6 the L everyday to travel between Brooklyn and
7 Manhattan, and not just for them, also for the 50,000
8 customers who travel solely within Manhattan on the L
9 and really for our entire city and its vitality.
10 That's why before I describe our robust plans to
11 mitigate this inconvenience, I want to explain
12 exactly why this work is so vitally necessary. As
13 you know, five years ago our subway system was
14 devastated by a disaster unlike any of its 113-year
15 history. Super Storm Sandy dumped seven million
16 gallons of corrosive salt water into the Canarsie
17 Tunnel alone flooding it end to end. That tunnel was
18 built in 1924, and was not made to withstand that
19 level of flooding. No one thought something like
20 that could ever happen. The salt water caused
21 significant damage to the tube's structure. We are
22 seeing deterioration of track and track ties, damage
23 to signals and other electrical equipment. So, we
24 simply must make these critical repairs as soon as
25 possible. Toward that end, we are hard at work.

2 We've awarded a contract to rebuild the tunnel
3 through a competitive process. Through this process
4 and its negotiations, we selected a contractor who
5 was able to reduce the tunnel outage time from 18
6 months to 15 months, which is a significant victory
7 for our customers and our city. We'll continue to
8 minimize the tunnel outage by providing substantial
9 incentives for early completion by that contractor
10 and severe penalties for delays. We are undertaking
11 one of the most extensive community outreach
12 campaigns in the history of the MTA. Since May 2016,
13 we've held about 40 meetings to discuss plans and
14 preparations for this project, large community
15 meetings, public workshops, community board
16 presentations, and these will continue. We'll be out
17 doing more outreach into next year. We're meeting
18 with affected businesses, property owners, building
19 representatives in Brooklyn and Manhattan and will
20 continue to address issues arising from the project.
21 We're working with adjacent properties to do
22 inspections, place equipment and coordinate
23 deliveries. We've paid for two temporary bus shelter
24 relocations at 14th Street Avenue A and Avenue B to
25 replace those shelters closed due to construction,

2 and we are trying to put graphic banners around the
3 construction with pictures to inform the community of
4 what the stations will look like when we're done.
5 This project involves far more than rebuilding the
6 Canarsie Tunnel. As part of this project, we will
7 renew and improve 14 subway stations along the L Line
8 as well as the G, J and M lines. Many of these
9 improvements will be focused on increasing station
10 capacity before April 2019. So, we can accommodate
11 more customers during the repairs. For example,
12 before tunnel repairs begin, we'll improve capacity
13 at the Marcy Avenue Broadway Junction and
14 Metropolitan Avenue Stations. We'll add stairs at
15 Court Square and open station entrances at U Street
16 and Metropolitan Avenue. We'll also take advantage
17 of the closure to improve further. We'll add new
18 power substations and circuit breaker houses to
19 enable two additional L Trains per hour to travel
20 along the line to increase capacity. We'll make
21 major capacity and accessibility improvements at
22 Brooklyn's Bedford Avenue Station and at Manhattan's
23 First Avenue Station. We'll install elevators at
24 both these stations to make them fully accessible
25 while building a completely new entrance at Avenue A

2 in Manhattan. We'll improve customer circulation and
3 capacity also at Union Square by augmenting our fare-
4 our turnstile capacity and adding a new escalator
5 from the L Train platform to the station mezzanine.
6 We'll upgrade all five L Stations in Manhattan with
7 improvements such as refurbished stairways, new
8 lighting and painting. We'll revitalize four L Line
9 Stations in Brooklyn and one in Manhattan at Morgan
10 Avenue, Dekalb, Halsey Street, Bushwick Avenue,
11 Aberdeen Street and Sixth Avenue. We'll be repairing
12 and replacing wall tiles, columns, platform edges,
13 platforms and floors, and we'll introduce platform
14 screen doors, similar to those on the Air Train, as a
15 pilot program on the L's Third Avenue Station in
16 Manhattan. Together with New York City we're working
17 on three categories of mitigations with added subway
18 service, bus service, and ferries. The best choice
19 for most of our customers will be to connect to an
20 alternate subway service, and because our city is
21 extremely lucky to have a redundant and robust subway
22 system. A full 70 to 80% of L Train customers are
23 expected to replace their trips in part by using
24 other subway lines, which is why we'll increase
25 service on the G, J/M and Z Lines to every extent

possible. For example, we'll lengthen G as well as C Trains to increase capacity. We'll bolster M Line service to run to 96th Street and Second Avenue in Manhattan on weekends and over nights. We'll offer free Metro Card transfers between the G Lines' Broadway Station and the J/M and Z Lines Lorimer Street and U Street Stations, and will offer free Metro Card transfers between the No. 3 Line's Junius Street Station and the L Line's Livonia Avenue Station as well as between the G and the No. 7 at Hunter's Point Avenue. We're working with New York City's Economic Development Corporation to add a new temporary ferry service. We anticipate that this will be niche market that will meet the needs of about 5% of the affected L Train customers. This service would travel between North 6th Street in Williamsburg and the soon-to-be constructed Stuyvesant Cove Pier at East 20th Street in Manhattan where it would connect with the M23 SBS and the New M14 SBS, which I'll discuss more in a moment. During these repairs, we'll provide an unprecedented level of new inter-borough bus service across the Williamsburg Bridge and across 14th Street in close coordination with DOT. We anticipate that about 15%

2 of affected L Train customers will rely on this bus
3 service. We'll add about 200 buses as part of this
4 entire project, and electric buses will be a part of
5 this service. We recently leased all-ten all-
6 electric buses through a pilot program that will
7 bring both fast charging and overnight charging
8 electric buses to city streets by the beginning of
9 next year. This pilot program will inform the-planned
10 inform the planned purchase of 60 more all-electric
11 buses from 2019 to 2021. Fifteen of these buses are
12 currently scheduled for service during the Canarsie
13 Tunnel repairs, and we're actively looking for
14 opportunities to increase that number. We plan to
15 create three new bus routes between Manhattan and
16 Brooklyn over the Williamsburg Bridge during the
17 repairs. In peak hour, we hope to run 70 buses per
18 hour on these routes. To provide this service
19 effectively we estimate that buses must be able to
20 complete their one-way trips in around 25 minutes or
21 less. We realize that slower times will hinder our
22 ability to provide that frequent service, will
23 increase crowding and would lengthen loading times on
24 both buses and at subway stations. So, we want to do
25 everything we can to work together so as to avoid

2 making traffic in Manhattan and on the Williamsburg
3 Bridge even worse, and we'll be working closely with
4 DOT to implement street and traffic treatments in
5 order—and other forms of traffic demand management.
6 On 14th Street in Manhattan, we'll add M14 Select Bus
7 Service, which is already served by the M14A and the
8 M14D. The M14 SBS will travel between 10th Avenue
9 and a new temporary bus terminal we're building near
10 Stuyvesant Cove, the Ferry Pier stopping at current
11 Manhattan L Train Stations. We plan to run the M14
12 SBS up to 34 trips an hour in each direction in
13 addition to the M14A's eight trips an hour and the
14 M14D's 12 trips an hour. We estimate that buses
15 should be able to complete river-to-river trips in 15
16 to 20 minutes so as to provide this service
17 effectively and frequently. In order to achieve
18 these times, again we will continue to collaborate
19 closely with DOT to implement all the surface
20 treatments Commissioner Trottenberg will discuss in a
21 moment. Council Members, again, we know this will
22 not be an easy time. Closing this essential tunnel
23 will be a major inconvenience for many of our
24 customers and for our entire city, but we'll deal
25 with it by working to improve L Train Service as much

2 as possible. We'll get the repairs done. We'll get
3 in and out of the Canarsie Tunnel as fast as
4 possible, and by giving our customers plenty of
5 options. Our service and our city will be the
6 stronger for it. Thank you again for inviting me to
7 speak today and, of course, stand ready to answer
8 questions. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. Now,
10 let's hear from Commissioner Trottenberg from DOT.

11 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Thank you
12 [coughs]. Excuse me. Good morning, Chairman
13 Rodriguez and members of the Transportation
14 Committee. I'm Polly Trottenberg, Commissioner of
15 the New York City Department of Transportation.

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Commissioner,
17 before you continue I would like—I would like to
18 recognize Council Members Chin, Vacca, Van Bramer and
19 Levin who also joined us. Sorry.

20 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah. No
21 problem. I'm also the city's representative on the
22 MTA Board. With me today are Eric Beaton our Deputy
23 Commissioner for Transportation Planning and
24 Management, and Rami Metal, Director of Strategic
25 Engagement. I'm also very glad to be here today with

2 my colleague and—and partner in this challenge, MTA's
3 Ronnie Hakim. Thank you for inviting us today to
4 testify on behalf of Mayor de Blasio about the city's
5 plans for the 15-month closure of the Canarsie Tunnel
6 starting in April 2019. We all know this closure
7 will be a challenge for the city, the MTA and the
8 traveling public be they subway riders, bus riders,
9 drivers, pedestrians or cyclists. I want to start by
10 saying we're preparing for an extraordinary event.
11 Our traffic engineers and transit planning experts
12 have done extensive modeling, planning and detailed
13 on-site reviews as well as numerous public meetings,
14 community board presentations and open houses. From
15 our analysis, it's abundantly clear that whether we
16 like it or not, hundreds of thousands of New Yorkers
17 will be inconvenienced including those in communities
18 beyond the immediate areas along the L Train
19 Corridor. Getting through this will involve shared
20 sacrifice for many of us. While we cannot overstate
21 the magnitude of the disruption, we also realize it
22 represents an opportunity to think creatively and be
23 bold. The plans we present today will mitigate a
24 major interruption of service, but they will also
25 support dramatically improved bus operations, make

2 transformative enhancements to cycling in both Lower
3 Manhattan and North Brooklyn and create extensive new
4 pedestrian spaces. A total of 400,000 daily riders
5 use the L Train. Fifty thousand live in Manhattan,
6 225,000 between Manhattan and Brooklyn and 125,000
7 within Brooklyn. At peak hours the L Train carries
8 as many people into Manhattan as all six East River
9 bridges and tunnels together carry in vehicles. The
10 L Train carries as many people into Manhattan as the
11 entire Long Island Railroad. The 50,000 who use the
12 L train to travel solely within Manhattan along 14th
13 Street is a larger ridership than any single bus
14 route in the city, and 61% greater than the M14's
15 current daily ridership of 31,000. One thing we know
16 is that nothing matches the efficiency of the subway
17 system, and as the MTA has laid out, alternative
18 subway routes will carry 70 to 80% of the displaced L
19 Train riders needing to enter Manhattan from
20 Brooklyn. At the same time, MTA buses will carry up
21 to 15% of affected commuters coming into Manhattan
22 and along 14th Street. Additional ferry service will
23 carry up to 5% and we expect 1 to 2% of affected
24 commutes to cycle. While alternative subways may be
25 crowded, they will provide the best option for most

travelers. However, we both know a reliable bus ride into Manhattan will also be critical for those for whom taking the subway is infeasible, and buses will be necessary to relieve some of the pressure on the subway system overall. Even though subways will absorb the large majorities of displaced riders, we will require transformative steps to move tens of thousands of commuters by bus. To visualize and understand everything we're proposing, we thought it best to look at our planned changes by affected community. It's the longest cross down street in Manhattan from the Whitney Museum to Stuytown 14th Street is a vibrant mix of cultural, retail, educational and health institutions along with dozens of residential buildings. It's a bus lane hub of activity fueled in part by the mobility the L Train has provided since it first opened 93 years ago. The 50,000 Manhattan only L Train riders will need a reliable above-ground replacement. As a result, DOT will implement bus service improvements and protected bike lanes, and we will need to dramatically increase sidewalk space to prevent pedestrians from dangerously spilling onto the street. To support dramatically enhanced bus service and provide relief

2 for acute pedestrian crowding, DOT plans to implement
3 a bus way that will be exclusively for buses during
4 rush hour in a core zone as well as 24/7 dedicated
5 rust--red bus lanes all along 14th Street, and as
6 announced by the Mayor in October, it will be bringing
7 Small Business Service to 14th Street as part of this
8 effort. Small Business Service has already proven
9 successful in increasing ridership and reducing
10 travel times on three other cross-town Manhattan
11 routes. As you can see, actually, you can see from
12 the rendering behind me, this will be an SBS--that
13 rendering--an SBS upgrade plus that will include
14 temporary bus bulbs, sidewalk expansion, and improve
15 station elements at the stops. Bus stops will be
16 offset, out of the travel lane with commercial
17 loading zones in between. Applying this bus way
18 treatment to a core zone between Third and Eighth
19 Avenues traveling westbound and between Ninth and
20 Third Avenues traveling eastbound will help us meet
21 the targets the MTA has set for bus travel times
22 while minimize--minimizing choke points and traffic
23 spillover that would be caused by a busway treatment
24 for the full length of 14th Street river to river.
25 The 14th Street Busway will require focused--focused

2 bus lane enforcement. DOT is working with NYPD on an
3 enforcement plan, and also hopes to rely on automated
4 bus lane enforcement. Our working plan is to allow
5 Access-A-Ride at all times, allow access to the three
6 garages on 14th Street and limit deliveries during
7 rush hours. But we intend to work closely with local
8 elected officials, community boards, businesses,
9 major institutions, BIDs and the Taxi and Limousine
10 Commission to further refine our plan. We are also
11 focused on providing the best possible bike
12 connection along this corridor as we expect demand
13 for cycling will double as a result of the closure.
14 We've concluded that the sheer volume of buses that
15 will be on 14th Street and the need for expanded
16 pedestrian space will not mix well with the high
17 cyclist volume we expect. Therefore, as you can see
18 from the rendering behind me, we will be adding
19 Manhattan's first protected two-way crosstown bike
20 lane along 13th Street from Avenue C to 9th Ave. This
21 change will help us meet the demand for cycling,
22 which was growing even without the L Train closure
23 safely and with few conflicts. To accommodate the
24 necessary redesign of 13th and 14th Streets, DOT will
25 repurpose approximately 300 metered parking spaces on

14th Street, and a mix of about 250 metered and non-metered parking spaces on the south curb of 13th Street. At the same time we're proposing to add 75 new commercial loading spots on 14th Street. Since we expect crosstown cycling and walking to increase dramatically as an alternative to the L Train, we're proposing other exciting public space improvements on repurposed road bed on Union Square West and University Place. On Union Square West, we'll maintain a service loop between East 16th and East 15th Streets while closing the blocks between East 17th and East 16th and East 15th and East 14th for new pedestrian space in an area that is right now typically filled with pedestrians. On University Place between East 13th and 14th we will create bike parking with potentially expanded Citi Bike capacity, a bike parking concession kiosk and several bike corrals along with ne pedestrian space. We will also explore various options to enhance secure and in some cases weather protected bike-bike parking options for private bicycles along the corridor using temporary structured lease space and innovative partnerships. And our plans will complement 13th Street's new protected bike lane with upgraded infrastructure

2 along East 20th Street to ensure a safe and
3 convenient cycling route to connect the Stuyvesant
4 Cove Ferry Landing and the East River Greenway to our
5 protected bike lanes on 1st and 2nd Avenues. We're
6 also looking at ways to improve pedestrian crossings
7 and boarding areas for ferry passengers connecting
8 with the bus. On Delancey Street on the Lower East
9 Side, we'll bring long awaited improvements that
10 create a direct protected bike lane between Allen
11 Street and the Williamsburg Bridge as well as an
12 eastbound connection from Chrystie Street. Together,
13 these new bike lanes will create a high quality
14 protected bicycle route all the way from Brooklyn to
15 14th Street in Manhattan while calming traffic and
16 reducing bike and pedestrian conflicts. Keeping 14th
17 Street and other crosstown streets in Manhattan in
18 motion is only our first challenge. The L Train
19 closure will put a tremendous strain on the
20 Williamsburg Bridge. When it comes to getting New
21 Yorkers over the bridge, we've looked at a range of
22 options. We projected MTA busses will need to serve
23 about 30,000 riders per day or the equivalent of 25
24 packed L Trains, and we need to take aggressive
25 action if our crowded streets and bridges are going

2 to handle this surge of buses. If we were to make no
3 changes to our streets to efficiently move buses,
4 they would simply not be a reliable alternative
5 option. We would expect to see severe overcrowding
6 on our subway lines and worsening congestion in
7 Midtown, Williamsburg and near the approaches of all
8 our East River Crossings as transit riders shifted to
9 taxis and other services. From DOT's side, our goal
10 is to make sure that New Yorkers who are traveling by
11 bus over the Williamsburg Bridge will have travel
12 times that are as fast and reliable as possible. At
13 the same time, we want to minimize congestion caused
14 by these changes both in Williamsburg and around the
15 city. To this end, DOT will create a set of
16 dedicated bus lanes that connect from the Grand's 3 L
17 Train station along Roebling Street across the
18 Williamsburg Bridge and onto Delancey Street and
19 other key locations in Manhattan. Note that I said
20 Grand Street, which is not the closest Brooklyn L
21 Train station to Manhattan, but will be the best
22 connection to buses headed over the Williamsburg
23 Bridge. Once those buses get to the 114-year-old
24 Williamsburg Bridge, the narrow lanes mean that buses
25 and trucks will need to share this space. We are

2 also evaluating how best to handle car traffic bound
3 for Clinton Street in Manhattan, which may also need
4 to use the outer deck of the Williamsburg Bridge so
5 as not to delay buses with late merging behavior. We
6 will handle the increased demand for the Williamsburg
7 Bridge through the imposition of high occupancy
8 vehicle restrictions of a minimum of three people
9 during rush hour. Together with bus lanes on the
10 approach bands and along the L alternative bus routes
11 on both sides of the bridge. This will permit buses
12 to move reliably over the Williamsburg Bridge. We
13 don't make these plans in a vacuum. We have some
14 experience with HOV restriction in the past: After
15 September 11th, during the 2005 Subway Strike and in
16 the aftermath of Super Storm Sandy, and we've
17 prepared for such restrictions again in anticipation
18 of a Long Island Railroad strike in 2014. HOV
19 restrictions are complex. We will need to facilitate
20 pickup zones that allow for the safe and efficient
21 loading of passengers by both private and for-hire
22 vehicles, create clear signage and community
23 understandable travel options and regulations for
24 affected commuters. When it comes to enforcement of
25 restrictions such as those that will be needed for

2 the Williamsburg Bridge, the city will seek temporary
3 state authorization for additional automated bus lane
4 enhancement. And always, we'd welcome the support of
5 our elected officials to help land this authorization
6 in Albany. We anticipate that some L Train riders
7 will choose ride share services as either their main
8 mode, or to connect to another mode. DOT will work
9 with our partners at the TLC wherever possible to
10 encourage high occupancy taxi and FHV services that
11 improve overall mobility, but without duplicating
12 mass transit or interfering with the MTA's critical
13 replacement bus services. Finally, I want to caution
14 that our modeling shows that with new HOV
15 restrictions on the Williamsburg Bridge, significant
16 traffic will shift to other East River crossings and
17 approaches, potentially causing significant backups,
18 and these backups would not just be on our highways.
19 They would have a direct effect on Queens Boulevard,
20 Tillary Street, Flatbush Avenue and other streets
21 miles away many of which are already heavily
22 congested during peak hours. We will continue to
23 analyze this issue and we'll be engaging in further
24 discussions about the bridges. Now, I want to
25 further discuss our work in Brooklyn where we've made

2 major improvements already for bus riders,
3 pedestrians and cyclists and more are on the way. As
4 with much of our work on the Manhattan side,
5 Brooklynites will also benefit from these operational
6 and safety improvements long after the L Train
7 returns in 2020. Those of you who have been in
8 Williamsburg lately know that working closely with
9 the MTA, DOT has made improvements to the B44 SBS Bus
10 Terminals there including major sidewalk upgrades.
11 We have a lot of other plans for nearby areas. With
12 7,000 cyclists per day, the Williamsburg Bridge is
13 already the busiest East River crossing for cycling.
14 We're once again using our Sandy experience as a
15 guide, we can reasonably expect daily bicycle volume
16 to double during the L Train closure. To improve
17 bike and pedestrian access to and from the
18 Williamsburg Bridge, and as part of our record 25
19 miles of protected bike lanes in 2014, we recently
20 added protected bike lanes at Brinkland Place, South
21 4th and South 5th Streets linking to the existing bike
22 network in Williamsburg. We also recently added new
23 routes on Shoal Street, and Metzeler Street to
24 improve access deeper into Bushwick. These new
25 projects lay the groundwork for further enhancements

2 to the neighborhood network to provide a direct bike
3 route in Brooklyn for cyclists headed to the
4 Williamsburg Bridge. Getting Grand Street right will
5 be important, and I will say it is going to be one of
6 our biggest challenges. This street serves at once
7 as a critical mapped truck route connecting the North
8 Brooklyn IBZ with the Williamsburg Bridge, a thriving
9 commercial corridor, a bus corridor for the Q54 and
10 Q59 and a major bike route. Our plan for Grand
11 Street will have to balance all of these needs, but
12 it will include new protections for cyclists and
13 dedicated spaces for buses to accommodate the L
14 alternative buses and the growth in cycling we
15 anticipate. We've mentioned the critical role of the
16 Williamsburg Bridge as an alternative bus and cycling
17 route for L riders, but by far most New Yorkers who
18 use this bridge will be those taking the J/M and Z
19 trains. We're preparing to ensure that the Corridor
20 along Broadway and Myrtle where this elevated line
21 runs can safely accommodate the influx of pedestrians
22 and cyclists arriving to take the train in South
23 Williamsburg and Bushwick. We'll be installing new
24 crosswalks and curb extensions, bike parking and
25 expanded pedestrian space, and we're studying street

2 design, and trafficking controls—controls to reduce
3 conflicts, shorten crossings and create simpler,
4 safer returns. Likewise we'll make street
5 improvements around the Nassau Avenue G Train Station
6 in Greenpoint. As you've heard, like the J/M/Z, the
7 G is expected to see a big increase in ridership and
8 we will create shorter, safer and more direct
9 crossings to the train. To maximize our investments
10 in these new bike lanes, DOT will be working to
11 expand bike parking in areas where we expect cyclists
12 to make transfer modes especially from bike to
13 subway. I mentioned expanded bike parking in Union
14 Square earlier, but we're also looking at robust new—
15 robust new bike parking facilities near stations at
16 both ends of the Williamsburg Bridge. We also look
17 forward to working with our partners at Motivate to
18 enhance Citi Bike's capacity to serve displaced L
19 riders. Citi Bike Improvements might include robust
20 valet services to move riders along the L Train
21 Crosstown Corridor, and disburse them from bus drop-
22 off points in Manhattan as well as increase capacity
23 and bicycles in Brooklyn and throughout the system.
24 I'd like to conclude by saying there's no question
25 Hurricane Sandy dealt us all a tough hand, and as we

2 of the MTA have done or analysis, we've done—we've
3 become convinced that many New Yorkers will be
4 affected even though they may not realize it yet
5 whether on the roads they travel, the buses or trains
6 they now ride on that will see an influx of L Train
7 riders. I want to commend the very talented and
8 dedicated DOT and MTA staffs for their hard work and
9 creativity in putting this ambitious plan together,
10 and I know our agencies will continue to be strong
11 partners on behalf of the traveling public as we face
12 the challenges of the Canarsie closure. We will be
13 jointly conducting a significant new round of public
14 outreach on these plans in January and February of
15 the coming year. We will be seeking input from all
16 the elected officials, community boards, businesses,
17 civic groups, institutions and everyday New Yorkers.
18 We will need your help as we finalize our plans and
19 make tough decisions. But we also tend to stay on
20 track to make the changes I've just described over
21 the course of the year ahead. This will be important
22 to give us a chance to work our any kinks, and
23 deliver some great mobility and safety improvements.
24 Understanding some of—understanding that some of this
25 timing may change, we plan to install bike lanes on

2 Delancey Street this spring. The treatments on 13th
3 Street, 14th Street and on Grand Street in Brooklyn
4 will be installed in late summer or early fall, and
5 SBS on 14th Street will commence in late 2018 or
6 early 2019. I want to thank you for inviting me to
7 testify today. I'm happy to take questions, and in
8 closing I just wanted to thank you, too, Mr. Chairman
9 as we reflect on the four years of working together
10 on this committee. It's been a real pleasure and
11 thank you. I think we have accomplished a lot of
12 terrific things with Vision Zero and a lot of the
13 other transportation work we've done together. So,
14 than you and the committee.

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, and
16 hope MTA and DOT will be ready for our third Car-Free
17 Day, Sunday, April 22nd.

18 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Well, thank
19 you.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: You've been a
21 great partner in the—in the two previous ones. My
22 colleagues they have questions. I also want to
23 recognize Council Member Menchaca joined by Chaim
24 Deutsch and Greenfield who are here. I have many
25 questions, but I'm going to be asking a few since my

2 colleagues also have many other questions. To the
3 MTA, who is the private contractor and does that
4 company or corporation have a history of finishing
5 projects on time?

6 RONNIE HAKIM: Yes, the contractor is the
7 Doug-Jug Lau Contractor who is the same contractor
8 that also worked on the Montague Street tube, which
9 was on time and budget.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: What is the
11 history besides the projects?

12 RONNIE HAKIM: On this kind of work
13 quite-quite good. We are in the process right now of
14 working on trying to get them to accelerate some work
15 they're doing at the Cortlandt Street Station, but
16 otherwise we have a good track record with them.

17 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Are they
18 using like Design Build as part of finishing the
19 project on time and-and reducing the cost of that
20 project?

21 RONNIE HAKIM: This-this project was
22 actually fully designed, but ultimately through
23 negotiations they brought a lot of innovation in
24 terms of how they're going to go about doing the
25 work. The cost of the contract is about \$477

2 million. That contract includes an incentive
3 provision, which was negotiated with the contractor
4 to see if they can reduce the outage period by up to
5 two months, and in the event that they succeed in
6 doing that, we would pay a premium for that, and
7 we're prepared to pay a premium for that of another
8 \$15 million.

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: When is the month
10 of completion for this project?

11 RONNIE HAKIM: It's—the closure starts in
12 April of 2019. It goes for currently 15 months and
13 so it would be mid-2020.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: What is the
15 month? [pause] [background comments] Twelve month
16 of 2017.

17 RONNIE HAKIM: July of 2020.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So, July 2020
19 okay, everyone, all New Yorkers, okay, you know, we
20 need to be sure we have seen Tappan Zee Bridge be on
21 time. We have seen La Guardia—La Guardia being major
22 renovation expected to be on time. We have seen UPK
23 in the city. We have seen many projects. So,
24 everyone expect for both MTA and DOT to be sure about
25 July 2020 this project is complete. So, for me, more

2 than the details and the logistics I chose the new
3 leadership of the MTA and DOT. I know that we are
4 starting on time, but more concerned—my concern is
5 also to be sure that we also finish by the month and
6 the year, and we don't get delayed and short aim this
7 project. What are we doing with the small
8 businesses? They need a lot of support.

9 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: They are going
10 to need support, and I think particularly, you know,
11 we've been in communication with both the businesses
12 in—in North Brooklyn and those along 14th Street, and
13 our—the city's Small Business Commissioner Greg
14 Bishop has—and his team have been a part of our
15 meetings and I think going forward in this coming
16 year they're going to be part of our continued
17 outreach, and we're going to use every tool at the
18 city's disposal. I think the one thing that I have
19 certainly heard from the BIDs and small businesses
20 is, you know, as we—sort of to add to our challenges
21 as we are accommodating buses and cycling and
22 pedestrians can we make sure that they can get their
23 deliveries that their businesses can continue to
24 operate. And so that's some of the—I think the fine

2 grain things we're going to have to work through in
3 this outreach period.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Uh-hm. What role
5 will Con-Ed play in the whole renovation of the L
6 Train?

7 RONNIE HAKIM: Con Edison there's a
8 significant utility portion of this work. Some of
9 that work is already underway, and so Con Edison will
10 also be one of the partners that we'll be working
11 with.

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Is that a
13 separate contract to connect or it's part of the
14 contractor who was awarded this contract to work as a
15 subcontractor with Con Ed?

16 RONNIE HAKIM: Most of the work Con
17 Edison works as they do themselves. They do contract
18 a little bit our. We pay them for that work.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Well, what is the
20 budget that the MTA have for Con Ed?

21 RONNIE HAKIM: The utility budget is
22 approximately \$15 million.

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: \$15?

24 RONNIE HAKIM: Yes.

25

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Was there
3 any possibility when you look at this project to, and
4 again I'm not the engineer, so I don't know the
5 details. Do you look at any time to run like a
6 shuttle train to focus first on the reconstruction of
7 the tunnels and be able to have this L Train continue
8 running as a shuttle train from Brooklyn up to a
9 river, and the same thing for Manhattan?

10 RONNIE HAKIM: So, between the—the
11 Terminus at Rockaway Park by Canarsie up to Bedford
12 there are approximately 125,000 people who use that
13 service exclusively in Brooklyn today. They will
14 continue to have the same type of service during the
15 shutdown period. The—the choice that we made was one
16 that was informed by a lot of community interaction
17 about not running one track at a time, and having to
18 have the closure be more than twice what it was
19 anticipated to be, 36 months. Everybody said to us
20 wholeheartedly: Bring it down, do it all at once,
21 get it done, get—get it done right and reduce the
22 level of impact, the time of that impact. S o,
23 initially, we thought 18 months was going to be the
24 closure and in negotiating with this contractor we're

2 able to bring it down to 15 months that we're looking
3 at today.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Have the
5 city looked on how the requirement and I'm all about,
6 you know, putting us many passengers as possible in-
7 in taxis, but have they--did the city look at how they
8 Yellow Taxi that has been hurt big time in the last
9 couple of years be able to be part of the providers
10 of the services as the requirement is going to be
11 like three passengers per vehicle?

12 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: We certainly
13 have taken a look at that, and we are going to be
14 working closely with the TLC. Look, one--one thing I
15 think we feel strongly about on the Williamsburg
16 Bridge those HOV restrictions, but we want to very
17 much use facility and apps to help connect drivers
18 with potential passengers and there are examples in
19 other parts of the country where they're called slug
20 lines where cars can come and pick up passengers. We
21 want to try and find some of those places. I think
22 we'll be working with--with local Council Members to
23 identify some potential sites to do that. You know,
24 we--we recognize that--that cabs and--and FHV's are going
25 to play role here, but we do also recognize again to

2 facilitate the kind of bus movements we need, the
3 growth we're going to see in cycling. We are going
4 to have to manage that piece of the traffic very
5 carefully.

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I just would like
7 to encourage, you know, you as leading in this
8 process especially working with TLC should look and
9 bring to the table the Yellow Taxi industry because,
10 you know, what I'm getting right now is email from
11 those medallion owners especially the 6,000
12 individual medallion owners that they don't know what
13 to do with the medallion because of the whole crisis
14 that is affecting their industry. So, as I know that
15 the Uber and Lyft and the other app companies, they
16 are just waiting to take advantage of the opportunity
17 that this closure of the train will provide for
18 them. I just want to be sure that everyone who gets
19 the opportunity also to provide the services there.
20 Is that something that you are able to?

21 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, the—
22 again we're going to work with the TLC on that, and—
23 and as you know, now the—the—the taxi industry has
24 got their own app. They've got curb. I think they
25 are starting to have the kind of technologies that

2 will hopefully enable them to be able to pick up
3 multiple passengers and participate in the—in the HOV
4 and the other changes we're making.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, when the—
6 the bike lane like in—you refer to—you mentioned that
7 it's going there's going to be some area on the
8 Manhattan side that is going to be protected,
9 expanding the protected bike lane. So you look at
10 making most of the bike lane in the whole area of the
11 closure protected bike lane?

12 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Our goal is
13 and I'm—I'm pretty sure we're going to accomplish it
14 to have protected bike lanes that run from the key
15 parts of Bushwick and Williamsburg where people will
16 be getting off the L Train, getting off buses that
17 will take you over the Williamsburg Bridge, connect
18 along Delancey Street to the major bike routes in
19 Manhattan and, you know, you can see we—we've fleshed
20 out the piece on 13th Street and as I just talked to
21 the Council Member quickly about the Williamsburg
22 piece before the hearing, we—we're going to be having
23 protected infrastructure on Grand Street. I think
24 that's the one part I will admit that there's some
25 frustration that we still need to work through some

2 details on the design, and potentially where some of
3 the other bike lanes are going to be in Williamsburg.
4 But as I mentioned in my testimony, for the past
5 couple of years we have been working very
6 aggressively to build out a bike network further into
7 Williamsburg into Bushwick. We've improved the
8 connections on the Brooklyn side of the Williamsburg
9 Bridge and in the spring we'll be doing work on the
10 Delancey Street side. So, I think we will have a
11 very robust protected network that will take you
12 throughout all the places you need to go in Brooklyn
13 on into all the connections in Manhattan.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Alright and—and
15 with the—my last question and then I will call on my
16 colleagues who has a question. It's about the bus
17 services. Like when we see new buses, will those
18 buses be electric?

19 RONNIE HAKIM: Yes.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Like--?

21 RONNIE HAKIM: Yes. We're in the process
22 of procuring new buses that the idea would be for the
23 supplement, for the majority of those 200 buses to be
24 new buses. We anxiously are looking forward to the
25 pilot program that we're about to kick off on the all

2 electric bus to see how successful that can be and
3 become part of our strategy as well.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. I just
5 hope that—and—and—I assume that the services there
6 will be as again as we will have the taxis and I hope
7 again in those services for the yellow to be a major
8 player in that providing those services? When it
9 comes to buses, do we anticipate that most—all buses
10 to be providing services will be Rep—TWU members?

11 RONNIE HAKIM: Yes, I think that's
12 correct, sir.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay.

14 RONNIE HAKIM: They'll—they'll be part of
15 our—our MTA New York City Transit bus fleet.

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, I just hope
17 again that as I have seen and looked at some vehicle
18 companies, they're doing contracts with some of those
19 new taxis industry and trying to bring new services
20 taking now advantage and opportunities in
21 transportation deserts that we have in the city than
22 in this particular area. We focus on the services
23 that we are right now, and especially with the bus
24 services. I just hope for the TWU to be the one who
25 provides those services there.

2 RONNIE HAKIM: Yes, all of our bus
3 service is represented by--the majority by the TWU
4 with some ATU representation as well, but it's all
5 represented service.

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: No, I-I
7 understand that other MTA buses are represented by
8 the TWU. What I am saying is I just hope to see an
9 increase of those buses, and not being short with the
10 number. So, others will come and take advantage. For
11 me, I'm all about New York City provide opportunity
12 for everyone to do well--

13 RONNIE HAKIM: Yes.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --but when it
15 comes to the public transportation, my main focus is
16 to support those services represented by TWU.

17 RONNIE HAKIM: Yes.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Thank you.
19 Council Member--[audio cut out] because he has a
20 resolution and then followed by Council Member
21 Garodnick and Reynoso.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Thank you.
23 That's so kind of you. Thank you, Mr. Chair and
24 thank the MTA for being here. I really appreciate
25 you being here, and I'll be able to give testimony on

2 the issue. So, I just want back on-on the buses.
3 Has the MTA ever purchased used or even tried
4 electric buses on our city streets?

5 RONNIE HAKIM: No, I'm-I'm joined by
6 Craig Cipriano a Senior Leader in the Department of
7 Buses, but we have been at the forefront of some new
8 technology whether it was the implementation of
9 compressed natural gas, new ultra low sulfur diesel
10 fuel, and now moving into the electric bus realm.

11 CRAIG CIPRIANO: Yeah, we had some test
12 buses on loan for a short period of time a year or so
13 ago, and as you know, we have ten test buses that
14 we're anxiously waiting to pilot in 2018, and we're
15 looking to learn from that pilot to inform, you know,
16 the L Line closure and what we can do.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: So, what is the
18 hesitation of-of purchasing more than ten buses? We-
19 other cities across the country, other cities across
20 the globe have hundreds if not thousands of buses
21 operating and working well. You know, the MTA I'm
22 sure can learn from that. What is the hesitation of
23 putting these buses on our streets as soon as
24 possible?

2 RONNIE HAKIM: We think that taking the
3 approach of piloting initially both in Brooklyn and
4 Manhattan will give us a good sense of the viability
5 of these buses. You know, what we don't want to do
6 is make a mistake. These are expensive investments
7 that we're making, and we'll continue to make, and
8 think that there--there is an opportunity here. We
9 just have to confirm it, work on it, I mean then work
10 with the manufacturers of these buses to meet our
11 needs.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: We have a year
13 and a half 'til--'til the closure of the L Train.
14 Isn't a year enough time to get a bus out in January
15 and just see how they're working by--by--by 2019?

16 RONNIE HAKIM: We hope to have a good
17 sense in 2018 how these buses are working.
18 Absolutely. That's why we're looking forward to
19 putting them on the streets as quickly as possible
20 in--in the next several weeks.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: So, the--has the--
22 so the MTA--is the MTA fully committed to purchasing
23 200 diesel run buses? Because I know back in--back in
24 August 2016 the Board did approve to purchase those
25 buses?

2 RONNIE HAKIM: The—the purchase of the
3 200 buses as part of the initial plan was to proceed
4 with the purchase of diesel buses. We are planning
5 on adding hoping that the pilot works well, more all
6 electric buses to our bus fleet as well, and if we ae
7 able to mix up the number, we will certainly take a
8 hard look at that and try to push as much clean
9 technology as possible.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: What—what is the
11 average life span of a diesel bus?

12 CRAIG CIPRIANO: We plan for a 12-year
13 useful life of a bus.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: 12 years. So, so
15 these 12—the—these 12-year buses that we're going to—
16 that the MTA is willing to purchase will be on street
17 in 2030 or 2031, if I'm not mistaken?

18 CRAIG CIPRIANO: Yeah, approximately.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: I just—I just
20 feel that we as a city and as a state should be
21 leading this conversation. You know, L.A. and
22 Seattle have committed to going 100% electric by 2025
23 to 2030, but what we—what we're hearing here is that
24 by 2031 we will still have diesel buses on our New
25 York City roads, you know, and I—and I think that

2 that New Yorkers should know this is a very important
3 issue not only because of the conversation on climate
4 change but, you know, North Brooklyn is one of the—is
5 one of the neighborhoods that has the worst air
6 qualities in the city of New York, you know. We have
7 the highest asthma rates because of that air quality,
8 and to bring 200 buses into those—into those
9 neighborhoods is only going to further impact that—
10 that—that reality and I think that this is a—a great
11 opportunity to use this—to use this as—as a way to
12 make a commitment to the communities that we are
13 working to improving their quality of lives, but also
14 a commitment to the globe that we're also going to
15 commit to doing our part when they're dealing with
16 the issues of climate change.

17 RONNIE HAKIM: The MTA takes that
18 responsibility very seriously, and overall, as part
19 of the MTA network we are a net carbon emissions
20 saver. We take off about 17 metric tons of emissions
21 annually. So, we feel that the MTA does have a
22 responsibility to—to be a good participant and a good
23 neighbor in—in all of our communities that we serve.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: So, how much
25 money is being dedicated towards the 200 buses?

2 CRAIG CIPRIANO: What I--what I could say
3 is currently the--the, you know, standard bus costs us
4 in the neighborhood of about \$500,000 and the
5 articulate buses, which will be operating on 14th
6 Street in the neighborhood of \$850,000.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Okay. I'm just,
8 you know, and I'm--I'm not going to continue
9 struggling with this question, but it--it just doesn't
10 make sense to me that we're purchasing. We're
11 spending millions of dollars on new buses when the
12 MTA is committed as--as you said to get into a pilot
13 program to start transitioning our fleet into
14 electric that we're making--we're doubling our
15 commitment on diesel. I just think that we should
16 take a harder look at why we're spending new money on
17 diesel when there is a pilot that's going to come out
18 soon to electric out on streets that would--this
19 should be something that we should have a much deeper
20 conversation around how we spend this new money.

21 RONNIE HAKIM: Glad to do so.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

24 Before I call on my colleague, I have a question
25 related to the--to the ferry. I know, Commissioner

2 that you mentioned with that one, but will the
3 temporary ferry service will be run by the MTA or
4 DOT? Will it be integrated with the citywide New
5 York City Ferry System or will an RFP be issued for
6 a private operator?

7 RONNIE HAKIM: We are actually in
8 discussions with EDC now who does oversee the ferry
9 system to create a supplement to that system.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Can we use
11 at this time of the closure on this is my suggestion,
12 I would like to suggest that during the time of the
13 closure of the L Train riders should be allowed to
14 transfer from the ferry to the buses with the same
15 fare.

16 RONNIE HAKIM: Yes, that--that--that's the
17 currently the intent. We're still looking at various
18 fares strategies but certainly that would be a--a--a
19 reasonable policy.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, and I hope
21 that this will serve for as a pilot, you know, as a
22 pilot project because if it work, I hope that one day
23 New York City, you know, we should integrate the
24 pending system for riders from the bike Citi Bike to
25 the ferry, buses and the train to be able to transfer

2 with the same fare. Is that something that we can do
3 at least the MTA can look at it?

4 RONNIE HAKIM: I think that's a separate
5 conversation, but one that we would clearly
6 participate in.

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. Thank
8 you. Council Member- [background comments]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: I just have one
10 more question. I'm back to the buses, electric
11 buses. If-if the City Council was gracious enough to
12 donate some capital dollars to the MTA, would the MTA
13 consider using those dollars to buy electric buses?

14 RONNIE HAKIM: I'm never one to turn down
15 graciously offered funding. [laughter] So, let me
16 start there, but I-I-I do-I do caution. I mean
17 let's-let's be careful. Let's make sure that the
18 buses work in this very harsh environment on which we
19 run our buses. We have had problems in the past
20 making a quick buy of something, and it didn't turn
21 out so well. So, I do-I-I do want to take the-the
22 pilot program. I'm glad we're rushing to get it on-
23 those buses on the streets, and then let's continue
24 the conversation.

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Is there any
3 other city that they mainly use the buses that the
4 buses are electrical buses?

5 RONNIE HAKIM: Yes, but there's no place
6 like New York.

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But as announced
8 at the--at the National--at the National Convention
9 the Democratic National Convention, I know that
10 there, there was the new company providing the
11 services and doing the exhibition in front of the
12 hotel--

13 RONNIE HAKIM: Uh-hm.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --showing how
15 Philly (sic) is going in many areas electric bus--

16 RONNIE HAKIM: Yes.

17 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --and New York
18 City should be leading that one, too. So, I, you
19 know, I congratulate them and today taking and also I
20 understating the precaution that you are having, but
21 I hope that we as a city look at leading.--

22 RONNIE HAKIM: Yes.

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --that effort to
24 be electric. Council Member Dan Garodnick.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you, Mr.
3 Chairman, and thanks to all of you for your testimony
4 today. Obviously we fully recognize the challenges
5 that you are facing, for circumstances that are what
6 they are. But with that I—I will note that the—the
7 notion that there would be some sort of a physical
8 bus terminal across the street from Stuyvesant Town,
9 is news to me, as I learned it just as we were
10 chatting before the hearing, and news to the property
11 management in Stuyvesant Town and certainly to all
12 Stuyvesant Town tenants. [coughs] So, we just ask
13 that that there be particularly on the, you know, the
14 significant structural changes that you might
15 anticipate a higher level of exchange here.
16 Obviously, I'm—I have only a couple of weeks left in
17 this roll, but this is going to be important going
18 forward. So, I'd like to talk to you about that
19 first. So, the—the ferry landing that's anticipated
20 to come in at Stuyvesant Cove, it comes in around
21 20th Street just off of Avenue C obviously at the
22 East River. Avenue C is a two-lane in each direction
23 road, which is frequently backed up particularly in
24 the southbound direction as a result of existing
25 buses. So no standing at any time. Cars are not

2 supposed to stop there, but there is a bus stop on
3 Avenue C and particularly on the north side of 20th
4 Street. Where is this—where is this terminal exactly
5 anticipated to go, and how exactly would it work?

6 RONNIE HAKIM: Before I turned it over
7 to Peter Cafiero to provide some details, I do want
8 to—do want to define the word terminal. I think, you
9 know, we use that word at the start and end of our
10 lines. That does not mean the construction of some
11 kind of an imposing structure or a significant amount
12 of buses just hanging out there. This is a safe—we
13 think this is going to be a moving—a moving facility,
14 a moving line and that's the intent.

15 PETER CAFIERO: But to add to that, we
16 are fortunate that there is infrastructure there that
17 provides a little bit of—of shelter, which is the FDR
18 Drive. So, the—the concept, which is elevated, as
19 you know, at that point. Our goal was to make sure
20 that customers coming off the ferry could get to
21 buses easily without having to interact with the
22 traffic. If possible that we could have a place that
23 the bus could—could recover for its next trip get so
24 we have some time to make it—it has scheduled
25 departure, it could operate safely all the car and

2 pedestrian interactions. So, we're working with the
3 city to adapt the parking lot right in that areas so
4 that buses can come in, have a convenient boarding
5 area, let their customers off, take on new customers
6 and then come out at 20th Street and go back down at
7 the 20th Street signal and go back down Avenue C.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: You—you would
9 need physical changes to be able to allow for a
10 terminal whether it's for a bus—

11 RONNIE HAKIM: Uh-hm.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: --or several
13 buses at a time to be able to lay over there. Is
14 that accurate?

15 PETER CAFIERO: That is accurate.
16 We're—we would be doing some minor physical changes
17 there and then restoring it at the end of the
18 project.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: I-I-I'm-I
20 think we should discuss what minor physical changes
21 constitute. We've had conversations about Stuyvesant
22 Town's own trucks that they use for garbage movement
23 and disposal not even being able to potentially fit
24 into that space, and they are smaller than a city
25 bus. So, I-I would just note for you that the

2 physical changes may be more significant than perhaps
3 anticipated. But there currently are uses for that
4 space underneath the FDR Drive. What are those uses
5 today?

6 RONNIE HAKIM: It's a--

7 PETER CAFIERO: A parking lot.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay, so it's
9 parking. Do we have--does the city have any
10 obligation to the--to the people who've entered into
11 an agreement for that purpose or--or is that waivable
12 by a month's notice or so?

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: It's--it's--it's
14 EDC parking and they're committed to working with us.
15 Again, I think from the city's point of view we--we--
16 we're in urgent mode here. So, and it's incredibly
17 important that we have a good staging area for these
18 buses.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: I got it. I'm
20 really just asking what the--what the legal rights are
21 in the future. We use that for--

22 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I--I think
23 we'll--we'll have the ability to work through the--the
24 process. (sic)

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: And how about
3 the Chief Medical Examiner. I believe they're also
4 parked down there.

5 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: We will work
6 with all our city agencies, and—and do our best to
7 accommodate them as needed.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay, if for
9 some reason this is not about to be accommodated
10 either because of the structural limitations of the
11 area under the FDR Drive or the cost. Oh, boy, I
12 didn't even know I was on a clock. I can't believe
13 it. Alright, Mr. Chairman, may I ask this last
14 question then? What alternatives do the MTA or DOT
15 have to using this space as a terminal location and—
16 and also while you're at it, if you could tell us
17 what you believe the cost to be any physical changes
18 that you might need to do under the FDR Drive to make
19 it amenable to a terminal that would be useful. I'm
20 just going to do two questions in one, and I'm going
21 to drop it.

22 PETER CAFIERO: I think to your second
23 question we'd have to get back to you on the cost.
24 We're still evaluating that. To the first question I
25 think this is the only feasible location for a ferry

2 and the ferry is a key part of the plan. It's
3 described as a niche market, but the—we expect the
4 equivalent of one L Train is worth the customers to
5 come over this way, and that's good for them, but
6 also good for our management of the entire L volume
7 of customers and we'll—we'll work with you and—and
8 others to figure out how to make it fit.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: I'm sorry and
10 the—so the—the costs--

11 RONNIE HAKIM: We'll—we'll get--

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: --you said you
13 don't know yet.

14 RONNIE HAKIM: We'll get—we'll get back
15 to on the cost of that landing.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: And on the—on
17 the feasibility if it does not—if it is not feasible,
18 the answer is it just has to be feasible.

19 RONNIE HAKIM: We think it is feasible.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay.

21 RONNIE HAKIM: And so, we're starting
22 from that premise--

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay.

24 RONNIE HAKIM: --and the alternative
25 would be more street—street running.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay.

3 RONNIE HAKIM: Not like-not free.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay.

5 Alright, well I think we're going to need to have
6 more-more conversations about that. Thank you
7 again, Mr. Chairman.

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member
9 Reynoso followed by Council Member Chin.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you again,
11 Chair and thank you for being here. I just want to
12 point out that I hope moving forward a hearing is not
13 the reason is not the reason why we get updates on
14 exactly what's happening for the L Train shutdown. I
15 really feel that if it wasn't for the Chairman-the
16 Chairman's leadership to bring this hearing today, it
17 might have taken a longer time to hear from you on
18 updates about what's happening with the L Train
19 shutdown. I just hope moving forward as partners in
20 making this happen, this is going to happen, and it
21 has to happen the right way. We all have to be on
22 the same team making it happen. I don't want it to
23 be an us versus them situation. It makes it very
24 difficult, and I feel that the communication is just
25 not happening at the rate that it was happening

2 earlier on where I really felt that we were
3 communicating on a regular basis. So, I hope we-to-
4 to reinforce the fact that meeting with us regularly
5 will help this transition, and will help this process
6 along. It's a statement that I want to make. Then I
7 want to speak to Williamsburg especially Grand
8 Street. I know it's complicated. It's not as wide
9 as 14th Street. So, I heard in your statements that
10 we will be getting a protected bike lane on Grand
11 Street. Just hearing that is a-is a step in the
12 right direction towards our ultimate goal of making
13 Grand Street a model to-to the future of street
14 design here in the City of New York is what I'm
15 hoping that we're looking to. I want to make sure
16 that I acknowledge that we're getting increased
17 service on the G Line and emptying (sic) the train to
18 increase capacity, increased service on the J and Z
19 Lines, additional station turnstiles at Marcy and
20 Lorimer stops. Weekends over nights Ms will run to
21 976th Street. The free Metro Card transfer-transfers
22 between Broadway G, Lorimer and Hughes, which is
23 huge; ne platforms at the Metropolitan and Lorimer
24 stops, which I'm guessing are G related as well off
25 of Powers is what I'm hoping we're talking about.

2 Actually opening up those entrances, and thinking
3 about opening up the entrance on Union and Grand
4 Street as well. The ADA compliance at Bedford is
5 going to be amazing. I think that's good, and the-
6 the new ferry route from North Williamsburg to
7 Stuyvesant Cove. I don't want to take away from the
8 work that you are doing from Brooklyn, but I think
9 we're falling short in comparison to what we're
10 seeing happening in Manhattan when most of the riders
11 are going to be moving from Brooklyn to Manhattan.
12 So, I just wanted to ask about that movement, and the
13 HOV lien on the Williamsburg Bridge is what is
14 currently being proposed. I saw in a statement that
15 it was the minimum of what will happen is an HOV lane
16 of three plus people. So, I wanted to ask is that
17 the minimum because there's still an opportunity here
18 to get a bus dedicated lane on the Williamsburg
19 Bridge?

20 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Well, I don't
21 know if you want to start again with sub-Brooklyn
22 subway service and then I'll jump in on bike lanes
23 and HOV lanes.

24 RONNIE HAKIM: Okay, I think you hit the
25 high points of the improvements on all of the subway

2 service in Brooklyn as well as the station
3 improvements that we'll be doing at Marcy, Lorimer,
4 Broadway Junction, Court Square, Nassau Street,
5 Metropolitan and Lorimer. Reopening station
6 entrances on the J/M/Z, Flushing Avenue at Fayette
7 Street, Metropolitan Avenue at Powers and U Street
8 that you mentioned as well. I—I think you—you have a
9 very good handle on all of the upgrades that will be
10 going on, and the benefits of the project not just
11 the tunnel reconstruction, but the Bedford Avenue
12 Station, the accessibility of that station and also
13 in Manhattan.

14 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: And, I do want
15 to respond. I--I hear you, Council Member. I—I think
16 we will acknowledge that the past few months we have
17 not been as good communication as we should. I'll—I
18 think I'll say on behalf of both our teams this—this
19 plan literally has thousands of moving pieces and—and
20 I think we took some time to try and get it in good
21 enough shape. The hearing was certainly timely and
22 we appreciate having it and we certainly pledge going
23 for it. We agree, we need your—your partnership,
24 your leadership, your help from all of the elected
25 officials in these areas. As you're hearing from our

2 honest testimony, a lot of challenging decisions to
3 be made. The Williamsburg Bridge—just—just to
4 explain those of you who are very familiar with it,
5 the outer roadways although they are technically two
6 lanes because it's 114-year-old bridge those—those
7 lanes are really only 9 feet wide. So, they really
8 can only accommodate, you know, trucks ad buses. So,
9 our vision is HOV-3 in the inner roadway, and that
10 will help with traffic flow into Williamsburg.
11 Trucks and buses on the outer roadway. So, they will
12 essentially be bus ways. The one exception is cars
13 that are going to be making a right onto Clinton
14 Street in Manhattan when you get off the bridge.
15 Because if you put them in the inner roadway, you
16 have more complication and conflicts when you get to
17 the Manhattan side, but we don't think that will be a
18 big volume and tremendously disruptive on the bus
19 run. [bell] So that is the plan for on Williamsburg,
20 and you're correct that we've started off by saying
21 peak hours is the minimum, but I think that's going
22 to be the discussion about what peak hours looks
23 like, how long that needs to be and—and we look
24 forward to engaging with people on that discussion

2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO:

3 And-and, Chair, just the timing, there's
4 a very important issue in my district, and I just
5 feel like one question wasn't enough. I'm just going
6 to ask a couple more. I apologize. The-the
7 enforcement on-on-in the Williamsburg Bridge it just
8 seems very impractical. There's no shoulders on the
9 Williamsburg Bridge. How exactly are we going to
10 reinforce that buses and-and HOV lanes are being
11 respected to make sure that this happens.

12 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: We are talking
13 to the NYPD about how best to do that enforcement. I
14 think it will be on the-the bus lanes and the bridge
15 itself, a combination of PD enforcement and we're
16 hoping to get authority from the state to do more
17 automated enforcement with cameras. It is a
18 challenge certainly on the New York City bridges that
19 you don't have great areas on either end to pull
20 people over, but we have found there are ways where
21 perhaps NYPD can be at one end of the bridge and-and
22 give word ahead to officers on the other end of the
23 bridge. So, so we are going to work through the
24 logistics of that while acknowledging it's-it's
25 challenging.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: And then Citi
3 Bike. We—we didn't necessarily hear about Citi Bike
4 expansion specifically in Bushwick where it seems
5 that a lot of L Train riders are from Bushwick. It's
6 growing in population, and it actually has two decent
7 bike lanes on Evergreen and Central, and it just
8 doesn't seem like we're looking to expand Citi Bike
9 into Bushwick ahead of time because of the L Train
10 shutdown. I think it would be something that we
11 should look at because it's going to mean—it could
12 mean the difference between folks climbing into a
13 bus, the subway on the J/M/Z for example and Myrtle,
14 Broadway, and maybe just taking a bike in a route
15 that makes a lot of sense along Evergreen and
16 Central.

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: We agree. I,
18 you know, had initial discussions with Jay Walder at
19 Motivate about how we're going to work with-with them
20 as the L Train shutdown occurs. This also feeds
21 into, as some of you know, the larger discussion
22 we're having about what the phase 3 of Bike Share is
23 going to look like in the city. You know, potential
24 mix of dockless bikes. All those questions are in
25 the air by Motivate is very committed to working with

2 us, and then we know that Bushwick is an area where
3 we're going to want to see Bike Share if we can make
4 it work.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: And then my—I
6 got two, just two more questions regarding the
7 electric buses. So, we have three times the asthma
8 rates as entrants into Woodhill Hospital than
9 anywhere else in the city of New York, and the
10 average of the city of New York. The Marcy Avenue
11 Hub I would call it. I don't know what you guys call
12 it. I guess it's Hagemeyer by South 5th and Broadway
13 is a bus depot. That bus depot is going to be
14 probably the most populated bus depot when this shuts
15 down that we've seen like in quite some time in North
16 Brooklyn. Given that it is the epicenter of asthma
17 rates and pollution, to add more buses to that that
18 are not electric is a huge concern for us when we
19 talk about the—the future of our children, and what
20 that means for the health of the young people on the
21 south side, which is already a big problem. I just
22 find it practically unacceptable that we would even
23 consider anything but electric buses in—for the
24 expansion of what's happening ton the L Train. I
25 have to let you know you cannot leverage or—or—or

2 gamble away the—the health of our children because of
3 this crisis when there is an obvious alternative in
4 electric buses. So, I really want to actually ask
5 for a hold or a moratorium. You know, we're the City
6 Council. We're not the state. So, we—we're limited
7 in our capacity to oversee and—and hold you
8 accountable to certain things, but I would appreciate
9 it if you hold procuring and purchasing of the 200
10 diesel buses until after the pilot regarding the
11 electric buses is completed so that we can see, and
12 just to see if we can have an opportunity to then
13 move forward with possibly purchasing 200 electric
14 buses by 2019. I'm really hoping that you—you take
15 heed and pay attention to that. And then the last
16 thing is the deliveries along Grand Street are a huge
17 concern, and I understand that that makes it
18 complicated. So, again I want to say with the BID
19 and with DOT to really discuss how we can do that the
20 right way, but it is not a reason, and it should not
21 be the reason on why we can't figure something out on
22 Grand Street. I feel that we're smart enough here to
23 put our heads together to think through a plan that
24 can allow that to happen, and when we speak about
25 parking on Grand Street, also that—the majority. I

2 think it's over 84% in survey that was done in 2012
3 by Graham Avenue actually found that 84% of the
4 people are walking or taking the train or a public
5 bus to shop along those corridors. That vehicles
6 were the last means to people to get to shopping on
7 Grand Street and Graham, and that most of the parking
8 is actually used by the workers and the owners of
9 these businesses. So, I would really think twice
10 about whether or not parking is a priority there, and
11 to really get through this delivery issue so we can
12 finally get a plan to present to our constituents
13 before it's too late, and before we get an
14 opportunity to speak on those issues.

15 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Look. I mean
16 let me pledge to you. As we've discussed, Grand
17 Street I think remains the biggest piece that we need
18 to finalize our plans, and we understand that
19 everyone is anxious to—to make sure we get that right
20 as soon as possible. We—this is something we could
21 sit down before the end of this year and start, you
22 know, finalizing those plans, talking to the—the
23 business interest, and I agree with you. We have
24 enough smart people that we should be able to figure

2 this one out and—and we'll thank you for your
3 leadership on that.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you,
5 Chair.

6 RAMI METAL: [coughs] Sorry, Council
7 Member. Rami Metal, DOT Director of Strategic
8 Engagement. I just wanted to point out that we've
9 already been in touch with your office about setting
10 something up for as soon as next week, and if you
11 want to include the BID in that conversation, we're
12 happy to have that. If they want to see us, just let
13 us know.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Rami, you play a
15 double role. You're a former North Brooklynite.
16 We're going to hold you accountable to higher
17 standards.

18 RAMI METAL: [interposing] I understand,
19 Council Member. I understand.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: [laughs] Well,
21 thank you. Thank you for—for your leadership and
22 thank you, Chairman.

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.
24 Council Member Johnson followed by—I'm sorry.

2 Council Member Chin followed by Council Member
3 Johnson.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Chair.
5 Good morning and thank you, Commissioners and
6 Director. I look at this map and your testimony.
7 Seventy buses per hour? [background comments] That's
8 more than one bus a minute. I just can't envision
9 them coming down Williamsburg Bridge, and the turn
10 that you make it's not just 14th Street going down
11 Delancey and making that—that turn. I guess the
12 question is like then they're going to go back on
13 Delancey back on the Williamsburg Bridge right? This
14 is the—the Lower Manhattan part.

15 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Uh-hm.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: My question is that
17 right now, Commissioner Trottenberg, you know that my
18 constituents has been complaining about the
19 congestion along Delancey and Grand where people are
20 turning to get on the—the bridge all the honking. And
21 so, for theme to see all these buses coming,
22 especially during peak hour, rush hour and then
23 making that turn where all those streets are so
24 congested, I mean it might work in a model, but in
25 reality because the bus also have to make stops

2 right? I'm looking at here. I assume they stop at
3 certain streets so that they could get on the subway.

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Lafayette and
5 Delancey and Houston.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: [interposing] So,
7 it's not just-- So, if you can, you know--

8 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: There's no--
9 there's no question that this is going to be one of
10 our biggest challenges. Part of the reason we do
11 feel strongly that we're going to need those HOV
12 three lanes for a certain amount of time everyday and
13 the Williamsburg Bridge is on a normal day, we're
14 seeing 4,000 cars come over during those peak
15 periods, and so to the extent that we're seriously
16 reducing that car traffic, that is going to help
17 process those buses. But, I-I, you know, believe me
18 I think we have, you know, part of again why it took
19 us a little time to come back to all is we are
20 spending a lot of time looking at those. And I-I
21 totally agree, modeling is one thing, human behavior
22 is another and, you know, as I said we have so many
23 moving pieces to this whole plan that human behavior
24 is going to play role. But we are, again, doing what
25 we can to minimize the traffic that comes over the

2 bridge with the HOV lanes. We are going to have to
3 work very closely with PD and our own roadway design
4 folks. You're right, as those buses get into Lower
5 Manhattan to ensure that they can make the turns and
6 don't completely clog the streets in the process.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Are you going to
8 be—are you going to do any trial runs--

9 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: No, no.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: --to see how this
11 will work? I mean maybe we can come along and our
12 constituents also could participate to really see
13 how--

14 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Uh-hm.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: --you can get those
16 buses to really be able to circulate those crowded
17 streets, and I fully support HOV lanes. We should
18 implement them now. You know, it should be a daily
19 occurrence because there is too many cars coming in
20 with just one person in there. So, we—we should
21 definitely get that going, but just in terms of
22 making that circulation, and also relating to the
23 subway, I mean the MTA are you prepared to
24 accommodate more riders on those platforms that's
25 already extremely crowded right now especially on the

2 joint at the F Train and also the F Train doesn't run
3 on most of the weekends now because of the repairs
4 that's going on.

5 RONNIE HAKIM: So, in terms of your—your
6 first points on the bus routes itself, you know,
7 this—this plan that we have put forward is what we
8 think a good preliminary. We are trying to connect
9 people to the subway stations that are in this area,
10 as indicated on the map on the—on the board. I—I
11 think your idea of taking a ride with us to see how
12 this—this route actually works is a good one. We'll
13 take you up on that, and consider an opportunity to
14 do that. It does require the HOV-3 to work and to be
15 enforced and work well. I—I think that's correct as
16 well, and in terms of the subway capacity, yes we
17 will be coordinating with our subway folks to make
18 sure that if we're bringing riders to a station, it
19 can—it can have the capacity in the subway service to
20 meet those demands as well, and that is really one of
21 the reasons why we need to go back out into the
22 communities and do another round of outreach and get
23 more feedback.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I think that's very
25 important in terms of like Community Board 3, the

2 residents. We will be happy to go ride along with
3 you to see how the traffic will get impacted, but I
4 think that for the HOV lane, I really urge the city
5 get that started now because with that [bell] you
6 could do that and that could help us minimize some
7 congestions that we have already. So, that—that
8 would be a great start, and that's what I would push
9 for, too. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Chair
11 Rodriguez. I want to concur with Council Member
12 Reynoso and thank you for calling this hearing and
13 for your leadership on this issue of you and your
14 staff. For those of us whose neighborhoods it deeply
15 affects, I really want to thank you for your
16 leadership on this. So, I want to start with
17 Managing Director Hakim. Thank you for your
18 testimony and what I'm about to ask is not me being
19 confrontational. It's just me being skeptical. So,
20 how confident are we on the timeline that's
21 presented?

22 RONNIE HAKIM: We're very confident, and
23 I would say the contractor has put a lot of money on
24 this table because there are delayed damages. If he

2 were to be late finishing in this time period, it
3 would cost him \$400,000 a day.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Okay, so, I
5 heard the same things when the 7 Train at Hudson
6 Yards ended up being almost two years late. Tom
7 Pendergast who's a fantastic guy kept coming here and
8 saying it's going to open. It's going to open. It's
9 going to open, and it was two years late. The Second
10 Avenue Subway, we know what happened and trying to
11 rush and get it done. So, I just want to be clear
12 like this has to get done in the time. I don't want
13 two months before July of 2020 for you all to come
14 and say, You now, what, it's supposed to be July of
15 2020, but it's going to be October of—it's going to
16 be September of 2020. Like it's just—I understand
17 the—the cost penalty escalation that you all put in,
18 and I hope that's a big incentive for the contractor
19 that's involved, but the number of riders and not
20 just riders, residents in the affected corridor from
21 Canarsie to the West Village and West Chelsea is
22 enormous and we cannot have any delay on this.

23 RONNIE HAKIM: I—I agree with you, and on
24 the Montague Street Tube job, the same contractor,
25 same type of work done a little ahead of schedule.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Okay, great.

3 So, Commissioner Trottenberg, 14th Street I don't
4 really understand what and I would like to know what
5 data was used to decide that vehicular traffic should
6 no longer be on the eastbound corridor that's
7 highlighted on the L Train Mitigation Map, and the
8 westbound corridor on 14th Street where vehicular
9 traffic will no longer be allowed. What data was
10 used to determine these things? Because as I've said
11 to you and your staff who have been fabulous. Rami
12 has been incredible to work with. Two years ago 17th
13 Street between 7th and 8th Avenues were shut down for
14 six weeks. During that time, every other side
15 street, one block area was a parking lot. You—I live
16 on 15th Street between 7th and 8th Avenues. Couldn't
17 get down the block. 13th Street, couldn't get down
18 the block. So, now vehicular traffic is going to be
19 rerouted off of a major crosstown thoroughfare to
20 12th Street, 13th Street, 15th Street, 16th Street, 17th
21 Street, 18th Street, 11th Street, and it is going to
22 have such a deleterious impact on these local
23 residential blocks. We saw it happen on one block,
24 17th Street. So, I'd like to understand what data
25 was used to figure out that this is the best plan not

2 just for ride—not just for moving people across 14th
3 Street, but for the entire neighborhoods and areas
4 that are affected by the L Train shutdown.

5 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So, I'm—I'm
6 going to sort of make some overarching comments, and
7 then I'm—I'm going to let—let our expert Eric Beaton
8 talk about the data, and—and just to sort of remind
9 you what we're proposing at the moment, and again
10 this is very much subject to a I think the outreach
11 and the feedback were going to get from elected
12 officials, businesses, community boards, you name it.
13 We're proposing a key bus way that essentially runs
14 3rd —between 3rd and 8th or 9th, rush hour periods
15 buses only. So, not—we're not closing that. At the
16 moment, the proposal is not to close that stretch off
17 to all vehicular traffic all the time, but in those
18 key rush hour periods when as you've heard from my
19 colleague, she needs to run a bus basically every
20 minute to accommodate the 50,000 formerly underground
21 L riders. Now, one thing we did, as you know, there
22 was an original—there was hope that we would perhaps
23 run that busway the entire length of 14th Street.
24 One of the things I'm going to have Eric talk about
25 the data is we did conclude that 3rd, 2, 8th and 9th

2 was the stretch that got us the most transportation
3 benefits during those rush hour periods of keeping
4 buses moving and at least the best we could minimize
5 some of the traffic impacts. But I-I can't promise
6 there aren't going to be any traffic impacts on
7 neighborhoods.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Three are going
9 to be huge traffic impacts.

10 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Oh, I know, I-
11 I-I--

12 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: But what's the
13 plan for that?

14 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, you
15 know, part of the plan is going to be again doing
16 what we can to discourage people from driving into
17 Manhattan during this time period, and I'm going to
18 say that very strongly. During these 15 months, we
19 really need to discourage people from driving into
20 Manhattan. It is going to be [bell] extremely
21 challenging to do so. But let's--let me now have Eric
22 talk about the data and part of how we crafted this
23 plan.

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Sure and one
25 thing I'll-I'll say, and we've talked about this at

2 community meetings and with a lot of your
3 constituents is we don't—we don't think there's
4 anything we could do or not do here that wouldn't
5 have some traffic effects on the west—on the west
6 side in the Village in Chelsea that even if we did
7 nothing on 14th Street, just the dramatic number of
8 people coming to the surface, the additional bus
9 service, it would all have some spillover effect on
10 the streets around it. So, what we see as our
11 mission is we have to figure out how we're going to
12 move as many people as possible while minimizing to
13 the extent we can the affect on those streets. So,
14 what we did was we collected a tremendous amount of
15 new data, traffic counts on every street in the area,
16 and we used a number of simulation models to say
17 okay, if we close this stretch, how does traffic
18 reroute? If we close this stretch, how does traffic
19 reroute? And try to do that in the most careful way
20 we could, and one of the things that we found is that
21 sometimes if we close a very, very small stretch, it
22 can cause worse traffic compacts because what you get
23 it people get a little bit confused. They're not
24 expecting it. They—they, you know, when you close a
25 single block like this situation we're talking about

2 17th Street, people try to just reroute very locally,
3 and what we saw and this was both something that came
4 out of our analysis and something that we think
5 reflects how people really use the city is that when
6 you close a longer stretch and really message it
7 correctly, some of the people really reroute out of
8 that area. They don't—is the FDR Drive—

9 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: [interposing] Is
10 this data available?

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: We can
12 certainly share traffic counts.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Can we post this
14 data on a website? Because my constituents are
15 apoplectic this morning after reading about this plan
16 in the New York City Times last night. I mean they
17 are literally apoplectic wondering what the impact is
18 going to be, and so this is no disrespect to—to
19 Commissioner Trottenberg who has been a great
20 advocate and ally and partner the last four years,
21 but I can't go back to them and say the DOT
22 Commissioner is going to discourage people from
23 driving in Manhattan. They're going to laugh at me
24 if I say that.

2 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: And yet, I-I
3 have to say it.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I understand you
5 have to say it.

6 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: And I-I-I do-I
7 do think this is, you know, the-the enormity of the
8 challenge we're facing with, you know, 50,000 people
9 on 14th Street that were formerly traveling
10 underground coming up to the surface accommodating
11 them and again, we want to accommodate them with
12 buses so they don't all try and get into Ubers
13 because that will only make the traffic situation
14 worse. So, I-I think it's funny. I've heard some
15 complaints this is too minimalist. We're not doing
16 enough for buses on 14th Street. I hear for your
17 constituents they may feel like we're doing too much.
18 We tried to strike that right balance. We will be
19 happy to share the data when we're through this, but
20 I want to sort of emphasize what Eric said. If we do
21 nothing, unfortunately the streets of Lower Manhattan
22 will be filled with traffic during these 15 months.
23 I mean it's--

24 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: So, can we post
25 this data?

2 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Absolutely.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Okay, and then
4 lastly, Mr. Chairman then I know we have to move on,
5 is PD here? Okay. So, any day of the week without
6 the L Train being shut down with the new protected
7 bike lanes, which I've been supportive of and again
8 my constituents don't love this protected bike lanes
9 most of them, but I've been supportive of them on 8th
10 Avenue, 9th Avenue, 7th Avenue. Traffic is horrendous
11 because tractor-trailer trucks double park, which
12 causes vehicular cars to back up two blocks, three
13 blocks, four blocks and they can't get around it.
14 There is zero enforcement or it's a cost of doing
15 business if there is enforcement. So, it's everyday
16 of week, come to 8th Avenue, come to the 7th Avenue.
17 It causes huge traffic snarls. We need to figure
18 this out and how the local precincts and the-the
19 Commissioner Chan is going to reallocate resources to
20 do something about this because I understand there's
21 a lot of competing pieces right here, but it all is
22 MTA, DOT, TLC, NYPD and all of the agencies working
23 together in a coordinated way. And I feel like
24 currently even with this being a problem that's
25 ongoing nothing is really done on a day-to-day basis.

2 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So, we—we—we
3 have started those discussions with the NYPD and with
4 Chief Chan who, as you know, I work very closely
5 with, and look, obviously they're going to need to be
6 at the table, and, you know, we are starting coming
7 in the—the coming weeks and months to start to
8 implement some of what the Mayor announced a couple
9 of months ago on tackling congestion. NYPD is
10 getting a lot of new resources to bring to the table,
11 but of course, strategic enforcement is a big
12 challenge in the city. I won't say otherwise and,
13 you know, I hear you. I think as part of the
14 outreach piece of this we're going to need to make
15 sure they're at the table to hear from you all, hear
16 from your constituents and really focus on where
17 there hot spots are going to be, and I recognize
18 there will be quite a few of them.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: So, I'm going to
20 come back for a second round. I just want to say I
21 know you have to say it, Commissioner Trottenberg,
22 about discourage—discouraging people using cabs in
23 Manhattan, coming into Manhattan. I need a better
24 answer to my constituents, and I don't feel like I
25 have that answer today from reading the Times' story,

2 and from reading the testimony. I don't say that in
3 an adversarial way. I say that because I need to
4 understand how you arrived at these decisions so that
5 I can explain that to my constituents, and then we
6 can move forward to figure out how to mitigate the
7 impact on residential side streets and on these
8 neighborhoods. Thank you. If you could put me down
9 for a second round of questions.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Before calling on
11 my colleagues that has now—have now have a question,
12 Council Member Deutsch and—and Levin, have you
13 looked--? First of all, we—we agree, right, that
14 when we look at the bus services in New York City I
15 assume the leadership of the MTA is looking at DOT
16 with that opportunity on areas that we have to
17 improve services like to running buses safer, faster
18 from point A to point B?

19 RONNIE HAKIM: Yes, we're—we're always
20 reviewing our bus service to—to see what we can
21 improve.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: We've been—I'm—
23 I'm more, and I know that you are, you know, in a
24 place right now where from the state to the city, you
25 know, New Yorkers have the big expectation with the

2 new leadership of the MTA and I do, too, and I'm very
3 proud to see again in the role that you're having
4 with the MTA. So, I also have my expectation that
5 this is not like business as use-as usual. Like that
6 there's a plan that we have right now that we are
7 saying from how we're running the train and the buses
8 we have our five, ten-year plan, and we want to leave
9 a legacy during the time that we serve that we will
10 make major improvements.

11 RONNIE HAKIM: Yes.

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So, is that
13 something that we can say that the buses is like
14 services one of those areas--

15 RONNIE HAKIM: [interposing] Yes.

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --that we can
17 make major changes in New York City?

18 RONNIE HAKIM: Yes, it is and the most
19 recent example that I have was the discussion
20 recently on the State Island Express bus market, and
21 how to completely change that routing and can make
22 great changes, dramatic changes to improve that
23 service, and that is the model that we're going to be
24 using to review our bus service going forward.

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. So, I just
3 want to and I hope, I'd like to believe, right, that
4 we are looking at this area where riders will be
5 affected by the closure of the trains. As the
6 opportunity also for we should do some pilot program
7 to be able to say what things can we do during those
8 times of construction with the bus services that we
9 can learn from it. From that, we can expand it
10 citywide. So, what is our plan that we have when it
11 comes to the bus services? You know, SBS is great.
12 Can we make those buses BR-BRT? Can we have more
13 features in those services that we can say those
14 buses will be running, you know, faster and safer
15 that we have a plan to tend those buses as the above
16 the round train system for the rider to say here we
17 are looking in that area. How the bus services will
18 be operating in the future in New York City?

19 RONNIE HAKIM: I-I think specifically as
20 an example will be the work that we do jointly
21 working together on the rollout of the new M14 SBS
22 service and the improvements that DOT will be
23 implementing and we'll be working in coordination
24 with them on 14th Street and so--

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Have you looked,
3 and again, I guess looking at what you have explained
4 to us. Commissioner, how much it take to build a
5 ferry landing on average?

6 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: How much
7 money?

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah.

9 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I-it's-I think
10 it depends on the infrastructure that's already there
11 and I-I have to admit that's been on the MTA side. I
12 don't know if you all have gotten an estimate yet on
13 Stuyvesant Cove.

14 RONNIE HAKIM: [interposing] No, we-we're
15 still working for what the new ferry landing on
16 Stuyvesant Cove at 20th Street will cost, but working
17 with EDC on that.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Can we say that
19 that probably is less than \$10 million?

20 RONNIE HAKIM: Oh, yes, significantly.
21 Yes, significantly.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Have you looked,
23 and again, I want to be there in 2020 when we finish
24 this project to be sure that, you know, we show that
25 we really are making improvements on how we're

2 building, saving money and also doing projects on
3 time, and I believe again on your capacity. Have you
4 looked at the possibility for the ferry landing
5 instead of being at 23rd Street to be at 14th Street,
6 and to run bus-shuttle buses? My idea is have you
7 looked at the possibility to maintaining the
8 services, similar services in the area affecting by
9 the train stations?

10 RONNIE HAKIM: There's the large Con
11 Edison facility there that would block access to the
12 waterfront. So, that—we think 20th Street is the
13 right place for that ferry landing.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. What about
15 shuttle buses across from 14th Street through Bedford
16 Avenue? [pause]

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: So, just—

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: When the ferry
19 ride—the ferry landing on the Brooklyn side.

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Right, so—
21 so.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: The Brooklyn side
23 from that particular area where the ferries landing
24 from there to maintain—

25 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Okay.

2 RONNIE HAKIM: --bus shuttle services
3 along Bedford Avenue.

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Okay, so-so
5 the ferry itself, first of all the North—we're taking
6 advantage of the City ferry piers that are going to
7 be in both locations. So, we may expand those a
8 little bit, but largely we will be using the—the
9 sites the city has developed coincidentally. North
10 6th Streets it's basically impossible to get bus
11 service in there. It's a narrow side street to get
12 to the waterfront in that area. Also, the—the
13 capacity of the ferry we feel will be filled with—
14 with people who live within walking distance of that
15 pier. So, it's primarily—it will be serving people
16 who—residents who live along the waterfront in
17 Williamsburg and—and that's a key market it serves
18 rather than walking south to the J or—or west back—
19 east back to the L Train.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay.

21 RONNIE HAKIM: But there is another bus
22 route that we should perhaps discuss.

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Right. So
24 there's—there's what we're right now calling the L3.
25 Obviously work on—on the naming of this to make sure

2 it's—it's clear to the public when we launch it, but
3 it's a route that will run from North 5th Street,
4 which is as close as we could get to the Bedford
5 and—and have a good street flow, and—and an area for
6 a bus stop. The area around Bedford Station itself
7 will be under construction, but basically to serve
8 that market. The stop at North 5th Street will also
9 stop near the entrance of the Williamsburg Bridge and
10 then go across and connect with subways in Manhattan.

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member
12 Deutsch followed by Council Member Levin.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you, thank
14 you, Chair and good afternoon everyone. First of
15 all, I'd like—I have some questions about operation
16 discouragements. First of all, my question is if the
17 closure will—it's supposed to take place in April of
18 2000—in 2019. So, when do you—when do you plan on
19 implementing your—your plan on increasing bus service
20 and ferry service and are you—do have any plans on
21 exercising the plan, and if yes in what stages?
22 Because obviously you don't have like certain bike
23 lanes and other things in place now. But I know like
24 in the NYPD if God forbid there's a terrorist attack
25 they have a counter terrorism that constantly does

2 exercise training to see how things will play out.
3 We can't wait for that date to happen. Again when
4 there's a catastrophe we start panicking, and saying
5 oh, this is what it is. We have to wait 'til-'til
6 the end of-to July 2020 and this affects over 225,000
7 riders so.

8 RONNIE HAKIM: So, the-the different
9 strategies I think will be phased in over a period
10 time [coughing] aside from the implementation of the
11 SBS route on 14th Street that the Commissioner
12 referenced as-as going in 2018. I don't think we
13 have a calendar yet for those implementation dates.
14 We'll be continuing to discuss them with-with your
15 constituents and-and different community boards.
16 What we did before the summer plans is we did
17 exercise. We ran bus routes, we ran ferry services,
18 and we anticipate we'll do the same thing here.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Okay, great.
20 That-that sounds good. So, are there any studies or
21 stats that you have on how many calls there are for
22 first responders for EMS, NYPD in that-in the
23 impacted areas where this plan is taking place where
24 you-we-we are assuming that they're expecting

2 actually that there's going to be a heavy traffic
3 area?

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yeah and
5 obviously emergency services are something that we
6 take very seriously and it's why traffic management
7 is such an important part of how we look at this--this
8 whole piece that it's not just about moving the
9 buses, but about looking at where there will be
10 congestion, and trying to find ways to mitigate that.
11 One of our big concerns was that if we didn't look at
12 -at peak hour each, there will be restrictions on the
13 Williamsburg Bridge, there could be such traffic
14 congestion in Williamsburg that not only would the
15 buses not be able to get to the bridge, but that
16 other necessary services, which include emergencies
17 but even, you know, police and fire and school buses
18 and all the--the day-to-day activities wouldn't be
19 able to get to those places. So, it's why
20 complementing all the transit improvements that--that
21 we together with the MTA are making, we want to make
22 sure we're managing the traffic system as well as we
23 can so that all those necessary activities can
24 happen. We're working closely with the Police
25 Department. We're talking with the Fire Department

2 to make sure that anything we do is in mind with
3 their response routes and helping me to get places.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Great. That
5 sounds good. In addition, do you have Access-A-Ride?
6 Do you have any stats on how many people use Access-
7 A-Ride in that—in that areas where it would impact
8 the Access-A-Ride users even more than how it does
9 now, and if you do have a plan for Access-A-Ride, how
10 do you reach out to those people to the ridership to
11 let them know that they're going to be impacted, and
12 to let them know that if they need to go to doctor
13 appointments, don't expect to leave like [coughs] a
14 half hour before or to plan ahead?

15 RONNIE HAKIM: We will be maintaining
16 obviously our Access-A-Ride service including along
17 14th Street as well, and we will be—that is one of
18 our communities that we will have to be in very good
19 communication with about just what the plans are,
20 what the changes are, if there are potential road
21 changes that—that they're aware of them and how that
22 might impact an appointment schedule, et cetera. Our
23 customer service for Access-A-Ride will need to—to
24 kick in a communication strategy along this plan as
25 well.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Okay, if you let
3 us know how that's going to be done. If you don't
4 have a plan now if you could just let us know in the
5 future how that's going to be done.

6 RONNIE HAKIM: Certainly.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: And also you—you
8 spoke about we have two agencies here. We have the
9 State MTA and New York City DOT, but I don't see
10 NYPD. Like you asked before if NYPD is here. They
11 are not, and so I know that when it comes to traffic
12 and throughout the city they have traffic control
13 officers. I have not heard one word about the
14 traffic control officers. So, how are you work with
15 the NYPD to bring in traffic control officers and
16 what is your plan of that? Because I know we don't
17 have enough traffic control officers to—to direct
18 traffic throughout the city. So, what is your plan
19 on increasing them and coming to the Council and
20 asking us to see what we can do to put it in the
21 budget, and making sure that you have enough traffic
22 control officers [bell] for this plan and across the
23 city for the rest of the year?

24 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So, we have
25 started those discussions with the NYPD with

2 obviously with lots more discussions to come and as I
3 said to some of your colleagues and clearly we're
4 going to want to have them at the table as we do this
5 outreach and—and we work with all of the elected
6 officials, they are starting to staff up in part to
7 address the Mayor's Congestion Plan that was
8 announced a couple months ago and—and some of this,
9 some of those activities will dovetail. One of their
10 areas of enforcement for example is going to be
11 Flatbush leading onto the Manhattan Bridge. So, some
12 of what we already have planned, we hope is going to
13 help with this, but we recognize it's going to
14 require resources and personnel, and we will
15 obviously need to—to partner with the Council to—to
16 get this--

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: [interposing]

18 Okay. So, if you could let us know on this before--

19 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [interposing]

20 We certainly will.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: --before this

22 goes into effect because I think that is very

23 important. Also, to the MTA, you did mention here

24 that we'll install elevators on both of these

25 stations to make them—to make them fully accessible

2 under the Americans with Disabilities Act while
3 building a complete new entrance at the Avenue A in
4 Manhattan. So, you proudly testified that you will
5 be abiding by the Americans with Disabilities Act,
6 but what is happening in the rest of the areas across
7 the city that you are not abiding by the Americans
8 with Disabilities Act?

9 RONNIE HAKIM: Well, we feel that we are
10 abiding with the requirements of the ADA, and are
11 fully committed to increasing accessibility in the
12 system. All of our buses are accessible. We have
13 our station plan that's almost finished. We will
14 invest in this capital program almost \$1 billion in
15 additional station accessibility work. So, this is a—
16 a full commitment for us. It happens that in this
17 program, these are the stations that are going to be
18 coming ADA compliant as part of this program, but
19 there's a lot of work system wide going on.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: So, how many—how
21 many entrances do you have to—to mass transit to the
22 train stations throughout the city?

23 RONNIE HAKIM: We have 472 stations.
24 That means thousands and thousands of entrances. I
25 don't know the specific number.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Is there any way
3 to—to get the numbers—

4 RONNIE HAKIM: [interposing] Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: --of how many
6 entrances and tell me which ones currently are
7 handicap accessible, and if you could tell me that
8 the rest of the entrances you are abiding by the—by
9 the Americans with Disabilities Act, like you just
10 said?

11 RONNIE HAKIM: We'll give you a breakdown
12 of which stations are accessible. It's by station.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Yeah, but which
14 ones are not that--

15 RONNIE HAKIM: Yes, we'll—we'll--

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: --that they
17 don't need to be handicap accessible?

18 RONNIE HAKIM: We'll give you a breakdown
19 of that.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Okay, can I get
21 it like within the next couple of weeks or I'm going
22 to have to wait until they implement April 2019?

23 RONNIE HAKIM: No, we'll do it--

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: [interposing]
25 Thank you.

2 RONNIE HAKIM: --we'll do it as quickly
3 as possible.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you very
5 much, and also finally I just want to say that thank
6 you for inviting the Council Member to-to come with
7 on-on that-on that ride. I-I would like to invite
8 you to come-to come with me in my district, if you
9 don't mind to wait with me with-with a lot-many of my
10 constituents in wheelchairs and elderly at certain
11 bus stops just to show you first hand how late those
12 buses are coming. So, I'd like to invite you to-to
13 my district.

14 RONNIE HAKIM: I know you have raised
15 those concerns before and we'll-we'll coordinate with
16 your office.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you so
18 much. Thank you. Have a great day tomorrow.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member
20 Levin.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very
22 much, Mr. Chair. Thank you very much Director Hakim,
23 Commissioner Trottenberg, everybody on the panel.
24 So, I'm going to start off with a simple request for
25 about 15, 16 months out. Will both agencies agree to

2 come to monthly meetings with the community, the L
3 Train Coalition? We've already formed. We have a
4 name. We have a Twitter Handle or whatever. You
5 know, we're all-we're all set. We're waiting.
6 Because of the urgency here and because there are so
7 many moving parts, as you say Commissioner
8 Trottenberg, will you guys commit-

9 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Absolutely.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: --to monthly
11 meetings at this point?

12 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yes, we will--
13 we will commit to monthly meetings for sure.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay.

15 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Or more if
16 needed.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay. I think
18 monthly should be fine.

19 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Ditto.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Me, too. Okay,
21 excellent, excellent--have one--one thing that we've
22 heard that hasn't been addressed and I've just heard
23 it from some constituents, and I represent Greenpoint
24 and Williamsburg, the north side. There are kids that
25 go to school in District 1 in Manhattan that--that

2 reside in District 14, which is Williamsburg-
3 Greenpoint. You know, elementary school kids because
4 of, you know, that that's--there's elementary school
5 on the--on the Lower--Lower East Side, East Village.
6 How are we looking at making sure that elementary
7 school kids, middle school kids are able to get to
8 school in the morning?

9 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean I--I--I
10 think that's going to sort of be something we'll have
11 to tailor situation by situation and, you know,
12 something obviously we'll--we'll--we'll work with the
13 MTA on. I mean our--our goal again is to try and
14 provide as much basically robust duplicative first
15 subway service for places that are going to be
16 affected further out into Brooklyn, bus service as
17 you get closer in. So, you know, if there's a
18 particular school or there's a particular
19 circumstance we could--

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [interposing]
21 Well, there's--there's--I mean it might be helpful to
22 inquire with DOE of the number of District 14 kids
23 and parents that are going to District 1 elementary
24 and middle schools, and that might be a good place to
25 start. So, you can kind of track where--exactly how

2 many kids we're talking about and—and where they're
3 going to school because it's—it's a thing. I mean
4 there's, you know, so we've heard it now from—from
5 multiple—multiple people.

6 RONNIE HAKIM: That's a good suggestion.
7 Thank you.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: So, I've, you
9 know, I have a confession. I drive to work like most
10 days, and I live in Greenpoint and I work down here,
11 and most days, let's say 90% of the time whether it's
12 Google Maps or Ways or whoever is—whenever I'm—
13 whatever app I'm using to tell me the best way to get
14 to work, tells me to bypass the Williamsburg Bridge
15 and go down to the Brooklyn Bridge, and I drive on
16 the—and I take the Brooklyn Bridge over almost every
17 day, almost every day. I'd say one out of—about two
18 out of 100 times it will tell me to take the
19 Williamsburg Bridge because the Williams—it's mostly
20 because, and this is something, you know, after eight
21 years of driving here everyday, I go on the bridges,
22 you know, multiple times a day, it—the traffic on a—
23 on the bridges is always based on how vehicles are
24 exiting on the other side of the bridge. So, for
25 example, the Brooklyn—if you look at the Brooklyn

2 Bridge right now going into Brooklyn, it's going to
3 be backed up probably to Manhattan because getting
4 onto Cadman Plaza west there. There's a light there
5 on Cadman Plaza West at Old Fulton Street, and so
6 that—that will—that backs it up all the way to—to
7 Manhattan. It's almost—it's almost ongoing
8 perpetually, continually. On the other direction
9 going into Manhattan, the Brooklyn Bridge is usually
10 clear because cars can go onto the FDR Drive and most
11 of the time the FDR Drive isn't that backed up. So,
12 there's a—I mean if you—this morning I drover over
13 the Brooklyn Bridge and it was like—it was clear, it
14 was clear. I could just go right the, you know, go
15 right over the Brooklyn Bridge and that's most days.
16 This is—I know this sounds anecdotal. I did this
17 every day for eight years. So, you know, I—I have
18 some—some experience with this. On the Williamsburg
19 Bridge going towards Brooklyn it's usually pretty
20 clear because it will—because most of the cars clear
21 out onto the BQE. Once they get onto the BQE, they
22 might get stuck in traffic, but the bridge itself is
23 pretty clear. It's usually not backed up into
24 Manhattan. Conversely, on the other side--and this
25 is my whole point in this--on the other side going

2 into Manhattan it is always backed up, the
3 Williamsburg Bridge because the Delancey Street there
4 are—you—you run smack into traffic lights and
5 multiple crossings. You have a pedestrian crossing
6 at Clinton Street, Suffolk Street and Norford Street,
7 Essex, Allen all the way through past Bowery you
8 have, you know, you have multiple crossings, and
9 there's not a—there's not enough traffic enforcement
10 agents to be able to [bell] clear it out. My point
11 in all this is if you're going to do the HOV on the
12 inner roadway, trucks and buses on the outer roadway,
13 it is absolutely essential that those buses have the
14 right of way on Delancey Street so that they're not
15 caught in that snarl of traffic that is perpetual.
16 It could be a rush hour, it could be at 5:00 in the
17 afternoon on a Sunday. It's always there. And so,
18 to get—it's just—they—they have to be able to get to
19 Allen Street to go up First Avenue, and so that
20 Director Hakim you mentioned 25 minutes. I've said
21 all along if people, if commuters' commute extends
22 past an extra 20 minutes, you know, there's going to
23 be hell to pay. People are willing to accept that
24 this is a major capital project that needs to happen.
25 We can all live with that. Twenty minutes extra per

2 each way, I think is what people are willing to put
3 up with. Any thing more than that, they're not. So,
4 25 minutes that's a great--that's a great objective,
5 but it absolutely totally depends on having that
6 right-of-way for the buses. I'm going to say I don't
7 even know why people need to turn right on Clinton
8 Street. I mean I don't--I mean I don't know why they
9 can't go down to Essex Street and make a right on
10 Essex street. So, but however it--however it has to
11 happen there's got to be that right of way, and I
12 know that the DOT knows how to do it.

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [interposing]
14 Well, let me--let me--let me answer that question. We--
15 we are going to be creating dedicated right-of-way
16 for the buses on Delancey Street, but I want to take
17 a moment of realism on Delancey Street, too. It was
18 a Vision Zero Corridor, and part of what we did do
19 there actually we did a--we did a press even there and
20 even the Mayor noticed it, is we also tried to give
21 people enough time to cross that street safely.
22 There is a lot of pedestrian activity on that street.
23 So, it is going to be a balancing act, and that is
24 why I will confess--your colleague didn't like to hear
25 me say it, but if you can avoid driving into

2 Manhattan it—it will be a good thing in this time
3 period. You referred to this as sort of a big
4 capital project. This is—this transcends any capital
5 project that I have ever worked on because the
6 impacts are so far reaching. It will affect hundreds
7 of thousands of people, and I think you're correctly
8 getting at the point it's—it's not just going to
9 affect people, people may think it's just 14th Street
10 in Williamsburg, but it—it will affect motorists much
11 further out into Brooklyn and Queens trying to come
12 into Manhattan and, you know, we are, I will say
13 quite honestly as I said in my testimony, still
14 grappling with the traffic impacts of that, and what
15 the other mitigations are going to be. The HOV lanes
16 will clearly help process buses onto the Williamsburg
17 Bridge and off of the Williamsburg Bridge, but we are
18 dense city. We have a lot of pedestrians who are
19 also trying to cross our streets. So, we have to
20 make sure that that's handled safely as well.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Right, it's—but
22 it's—it's also it's just—it's dealing with making
23 sure that at least there's—if there's—if it involves
24 traffic enforcement, you know, a constant presence of
25 traffic enforcement, you know, traffic mitigation

2 officers, NYPD, on-on that side of the Williamsburg
3 Bridge, it's just-it's-it's how do we make sure that
4 the traffic is getting cleared out from the direct
5 exit of the Williamsburg Bridge? So, and-and I-I
6 will say the-the Brooklyn Bridge can probably handle
7 the displaced traffic from the HOV-3 on the
8 Williamsburg Bridge. I really think-I mean again, I
9 drive it everyday. I can tell you it-it is-it's-
10 unless there's construction happening on the
11 Williamsburg on-on the Brooklyn Bridge itself where
12 they close a lane, and that was happening for a
13 couple of years, but it-that-that work is done now.
14 That-that generally moves, and that can handle more
15 vehicular traffic. Now, the BQE is always messed up,
16 Tillary Street is always messed up. So, yes, there's
17 a lot of moving parts there, but the actual crossings
18 I don't necessarily think that like for example that
19 like the Brooklyn Bridge needs to have an HOV lane as
20 well. Like I don't think that that's a requirement
21 or that anything here should be dependent on HOV
22 lanes happening on the other bridges.

23 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Right, and
24 look, we're-we're not-we're not proposing what we're
25 going to do on the other bridges yet, but even as you

2 start to describe all the routes and streets and
3 challenges, I mean I would sort of—would make the
4 joke this is—this is, you know, it's multi variable
5 calculus for right now. I mean there are just many,
6 many thousands of factors we're trying to piece
7 together. When you adjust one part of it, it has an
8 effect on the other part. As you've heard from Mayor
9 Beaton, we've done a lot of traffic modeling, but
10 there will be more to come as we refine these plans.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: And I appreciate
12 the modeling. I drive these—these bridges every
13 single day for eight years. I—I know this stuff.
14 Like I could—I think sometimes I could actually drive
15 it with my eyes closed. I wouldn't do that.

16 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Please—please
17 don't.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I wouldn't do that
19 but it is seriously I mean it might just—there's—as
20 Council Member Chin said, I mean there's—there's
21 modeling and then there's also lived real world
22 experience and human behavior, and I think all of
23 that needs to be done with a certain common sense.

24 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Right. No,
25 look, we—we—we are very much relying on elected

2 officials, local residents, regular commuters to give
3 us precisely that person feedback. I'm—I'm not one to
4 say modeling tells the whole picture. There is a—
5 there is a human factor when you do transportation
6 planning, and how people will behave, models don't
7 always capture it.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Right.

9 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So, you know,
10 in the coming months that is certainly going to be
11 part of refining the plans.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: About actually
13 Clinton Street, who is using—who is turning right on
14 Clinton Street at the end of the Bridge? Why does
15 anyone need to do that?

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: So, or
17 challenge is that a huge portion of the people coming
18 of the bridge do want to go north, and if they don't
19 do it at Clinton Street, it's actually much more
20 disruptive to the buses if they turn on Essex or at
21 Allen or at some of the other places. Clinton at
22 least has sort of the takeoff, the—the slip lanes
23 that has its own place. If they—if you forced them
24 to turn at the next intersections, then they have to
25 merge across the bus lane to do that. So, we

2 actually think even just to move the buses, the more
3 people we can get out of the way early, the better.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: So, basically so
5 what you're going to say is at the entrance to the
6 bridge, if you want to turn right on Clinton Street,
7 you must be in the outer roadway at the outset. So,
8 you're not then merging on-

9 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [interposing]
10 Exactly.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: --after the--all of
12 the--individually?

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: And--and
14 slowing down the MTA's buses, which is the very thing
15 we're most trying to avoid.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Because--because
17 I'm telling you if people are sitting on a bus and
18 it's not moving on the Williamsburg Bridge, people
19 are just going to get out and start like walking on
20 the bridge. They're just going to like march in
21 protest on the Williamsburg Bridge if that happened.
22 So, I--I just--I'm telling you that whatever we have to
23 do to prevent that scenario from happening where
24 people are just sitting there, just like stewing in,
25 packed in like sardines in one of these buses sitting

2 there on the Williamsburg Bridge and it's not moving,
3 that is not what we what we want to see happening.

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I-I-look--

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [interposing] And
6 we all agree on that.

7 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: --I think-I
8 think-

9 RONNIE HAKIM: [interposing] We all agree
10 on that.

11 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: --I think yeah
12 both agencies are committing to trying to minimize
13 that, but-but I-I will just say one more time this
14 is-it's not a voluntary situation we find ourselves.
15 Hurricane Sandy very much damaged a tunnel, which is
16 a crucial link that unfortunately does not have
17 either subway redundancy or a nice bridge redundancy.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I See.

19 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So, all eyes
20 are on the Williamsburg Bridge. We get that, but it
21 is-it is going to take a lot of hard work to keep
22 that moving.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: So, then there's-
24 sorry, I have two more questions here. One is
25 construction. Right now--you know, a couple of years

2 ago I, you know, I had a bill to cap FHV's in the city
3 of New York back when there were like 20,000 FHV
4 licenses and now there's like 100,000, right, and we
5 did. We worked. We ended up not doing the bill. We
6 worked with McKenzie. We had this great study that
7 was done, and one of the things that the study showed
8 was that construction is one of the major drivers of-
9 of congestion right now in New York City, and that
10 has only gotten worse. You know, the global economy,
11 knock on wood it's doing pretty well. That means
12 that's a good sign for construction in New York City.
13 Thanks to lending buildings are building, and we're
14 rezoning things. Things are happening in New York
15 City all over the place, and all you have to do is go
16 outside and see all the building that's happening.
17 Every building that happens usually takes up a lane
18 of-of roadway to be able to do it because we're in
19 New York City. So, that has to be better coordinated
20 because that will continue to be a driver of-of
21 congestion on both sides of the bridge, on the
22 approach and on the exit, and if that's not better
23 coordinated, I mean I just-sometimes I don't think
24 it's-it's just coordinated at all, but it's got to be
25 very intricately coordinated I think between the

2 Department of Buildings, any developer that's
3 applying for taking up a lane of traffic for an
4 extended period of time, and DOT and MTA.
5 Throughout, you know, if it's anywhere on any of
6 these routes, it has the—it has the possibility of
7 like, you know, creating all types of havoc. So, we
8 make sure that like the DOB is—is—has a protocol in
9 place to inform you guys of when—when they're looking
10 at issuing a permit, anywhere along these lines?

11 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean, we,
12 you know, we work pretty closely with DOB and—and we
13 work together very closely on permitting. As you
14 know, there is a tremendous demand for construction
15 activity and places for people to live, for new
16 businesses. So, yes, we're going to—we're going to
17 work hard to try and, you know, coordinate that
18 construction activity the best we can, but there is
19 as you correctly pointed, there is an—there is an
20 insatiable desire for construction right now in New
21 York City. It is an on—it's a challenge even before
22 we—we faced the—the—the closing of the Canarsie
23 Tunnel.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: And my last
25 question is have you—have you examined how you're

2 going to be approaching the fare structure here. So
3 are—are the shuttle buses going to be free and then
4 people will have to pay when they get on the subway
5 because my general on it is this: Everybody should
6 probably pay to take the public transportation that
7 they're going to take to get to wherever they're
8 going, but they shouldn't have to pay twice. So,
9 either—either they're going to get a free transfer or
10 they shouldn't have to pay when they first get on,
11 and if the—if the major interest is making sure that
12 things are moving quickly, I would say, you know,
13 having some kind of free transfer system might not be
14 the way to go because that's probably just going to
15 take more time.

16 RONNIE HAKIM: So, we really—first we
17 needed to figure out what we were going to propose
18 and then we would need to address what the fare
19 policy recommendations would be to our board. What
20 we have been talking about and—and was asked a little
21 bit earlier was, you know, about a transfer from the
22 ferry to the SBS bus. We think that probably makes a
23 lot of sense, but again a complete package of what
24 the fare policy will be around. This plan is—is
25 still a little ways away.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay. I think
3 that there's going to be an expectation from
4 commuters that they're happy to pay for their
5 commute. Nobody is expecting a free ride, and nobody
6 should have to pay twice, right. So, you know, just
7 the—you know, they shouldn't. If—if they would have—
8 if they would have otherwise been able to do a free
9 transfer from the L Train--

10 RONNIE HAKIM: [interposing] Right.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: --to the 6 Train.
12 They should still be able to do that.

13 RONNIE HAKIM: Right. Thank you.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: So, and—and so
15 just to be clear, the ferry involves some kind of
16 City-State coordination. Something where it's the
17 buses, that's all the MTA.

18 RONNIE HAKIM: Correct.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Exclusively your
20 decision. Okay, and then lastly, I know you're both
21 here. It's great. I want to make sure that you guys
22 continue to work well together, and that the city and
23 state is, you know, does not, you know, that it
24 doesn't get into some kind of rivalry or, you know,
25 like there needs to be-- I think we, you know, we

2 citizens of--of New York City we're counting on you
3 guys, the residents of New York City are counting on
4 you guys to--to work seamlessly together. So, I just
5 want to encourage that from happening--

6 RONNIE HAKIM: Agreed.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: --and continue.

8 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I know that my
10 colleague has a few more questions, very short?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Yeah,

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Dan and then
13 Corey.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you very
15 much, Chair--Mr. Chairman. I just wanted to focus
16 back on now 14th Street and First Avenue. We have a
17 high level of demand coming straight out of
18 Stuyvesant Town and Peter Cooper Village, about 8,000
19 people using that stop, you know, in the peak
20 periods. I also assume that it's a much higher
21 number when adding folks from points further east and
22 south. Do you--do you know the--the numbers of people
23 who board the--the L Train at 14th and First in--in the
24 morning rush? Give me, you know, if there's an

2 average number at 8:00 in the morning a number, 7:30
3 in the morning number?

4 PETER CAFIERO: I don't have the page,
5 but all day it's 23,000 entering in that station. We
6 can get you the peak hour.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay. So,
8 alright, would like to know the answer to that, and
9 really what and I'll—and I'll spare you all of the
10 questions to get to the point, which is do you have
11 in your plan enough capacity to be able to
12 accommodate people who are getting on the bus heading
13 westbound at 14th Street and First Avenue in a way
14 that it is sufficient that people will not watch bus
15 after bus that is full passing them by? And if you
16 could explain how you know that to be the case. That
17 really is and I'll—I'll spare everybody the time and
18 all the questions, but that's really what I'm
19 interested in.

20 RONNIE HAKIM: And we can follow up with
21 further details, but just before talking the
22 specifics, the idea would be not to have every bus
23 that comes out of the Ferry Cove be full before it
24 got to First Avenue and 14th Street. And so, whether
25 that means that we stage buses and not run every bus

2 from the Ferry Cove with customers and start some
3 buses at First Avenue, I think the opportunity to
4 make some of those. There definitely is the
5 opportunity to make more of those plan adjustments.
6 So, that was the discussion that we were having next
7 to the board before the hearing began.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay, and the—
9 and the number of people that you plan to come in off
10 of the ferry per hour is how many?

11 PETER CAFIERO: The peak capacity is
12 about 1,200 per hour. It's 150 per boat.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay, 1,200
14 per hour and how many people can you fit on a bus
15 that you expect to be running from the Cove?

16 PETER CAFIERO: It's about 60. These
17 are—are groups of 60 to 80 per bus total. So, again
18 we—we wouldn't completely fill them up at that—at
19 that stop, and we absolutely need to make sure that
20 the—the other big stop is going to be First Avenue,
21 clearly and we need to have the capacity there.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: I'm sorry.
23 The other? I'm sorry. I couldn't hear you.

24 PETER CAFIERO: The—the major stop on
25 this route, the major boarding stop will be First

2 Avenue and 14th Street, and that's absolutely the—the
3 stop that we intend to—to make sure there's capacity
4 to serve it.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Alright.

6 Well, I would like to follow up with you. I would
7 actually like to ask that you follow up with me with
8 those numbers, and thank you, Chairman and we'll look
9 forward to speaking with you about this further.
10 Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member
12 Johnson.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Okay, I should
14 have been clear. I apologize and I hope everyone is
15 listening. I am not advocating for more cars. I
16 want less people to drive in Manhattan. I support
17 congestion pricing. I support disincentivizing cars
18 from coming in—in Manhattan and I'm glad that our
19 great Transportation Commissioner is going to tell
20 people don't drive in Manhattan, but for me what I
21 was trying to get at earlier is I don't think that
22 presents a full solution to the impacts that I'm
23 concerned about, and the impacts that I'm concerned
24 about are not impacts on drivers. The impacts that
25 I'm concerned about are impacts on pedestrians,

2 cyclists, local residents who walk and don't use
3 cars. I apologize that I was not clear in my line of
4 questioning earlier that was—is what I was trying to
5 get at. So, for me the issue here is I feel like we
6 are trying to fit a square peg into a round hole, and
7 what I mean by that is congestion is probably the
8 biggest local day-to-day. Congestion and
9 homelessness are the two biggest local day-to-day
10 quality of life concerns that exist in my district on
11 cross town streets, on cross town thoroughfares, on
12 uptown and downtown avenues on the West Side highway
13 and in overcrowded subway trains. So, that is the
14 biggest issue for me. The concern that I have is
15 what are we doing, and someone in Twitter just sent
16 me a study from Seoul and San Francisco on if you do
17 these type of things, actually more cars don't show
18 up because they realized they changed their patterns
19 and their behavior. They decided they're not going
20 to drive into the city. I haven't seen that data.
21 This is the first time I've seen it, and so my
22 concern here is if that doesn't come to pass, if
23 people actually do continue to drive into Manhattan,
24 and drive into this district, and for 14th Street is
25 closed off to vehicular traffic, how does that impact

2 these side streets? I guess I wasn't clear earlier
3 with my line of questioning, but that is what I'm
4 getting at, and that is what I'd like to understand
5 more. And someone sent me a study, which maybe DOT
6 knows about from other municipalities around the
7 world that bear that out, but I would love to hear a
8 little bit about that.

9 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So, since--
10 since you went back to pedestrians and cyclists
11 let's--let's just take that back because, you know, we
12 recognize in addition to vehicular congestion, of
13 course, Lower Manhattan has--is very full of
14 pedestrians and cyclists as well, and that's why I do
15 want to again mention I think what we're proposing to
16 do on 13th Street it will be, you know, a very robust
17 east-west protected bike lane, you know, our--

18 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: [interposing]
19 Which I support and think is great.

20 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Which is going
21 to be our first one cross town and--and frankly we
22 hope we'll follow it with others. They're not easy
23 to put in and there's--there's been a lot of
24 discussion about it. Likewise just to emphasize
25 we're adding 50,000 square feet of pedestrian space

2 on 14th Street because we know that those 50,000
3 travelers that were formerly on the L Train a lot of
4 them will be up on the street. They'll be catching
5 buses. Some of them may be walking between subway
6 stops. So, you know, we are focused on accommodating
7 that growth. On the vehicular side, I mean, you
8 know, we're—we're string with the proposal of HOV on
9 Williamsburg Bridge. I think we'll be taking a look
10 at other things. This is, you know, you were saying
11 your constituents' congestion and homelessness on the
12 top of their list. I would say for—for many of your
13 colleagues, congestion is up there on the list, and
14 so it is a challenging, challenging thing to manage
15 in a city that is now over 8-1/2 million people, and—
16 and booming economically.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: And the average,
18 you know, each one of us in the Council represent
19 170,000 residents who live in our district. The
20 average daily population and I'm not talking about
21 people in cars. I'm talking about people outside of
22 cars that are in my Council District from Canal
23 Street up to 63rd Street from Fifth Avenue to Hudson
24 river with Penn Station, Moynihan Station, Times
25 Square, the Broadway Theaters, the Javits Center, the

2 Port Authority Bus Terminal, the Highline the Whitney
3 Museum and all the other incredible and wonderful
4 things that are in my district is 2.2 million people.
5 So, 2.2 million people are moving through this
6 district not—that we're in right now, but my district
7 every single day, and what does that cause? That
8 causes congestion on sidewalks. That causes
9 congestion of people just trying to get around. That
10 is my concern here. My concern is if we are
11 diverting cars off of 14th Street, the other side
12 streets that right now have traffic on them, will be
13 significantly worse. The blocks will be blocked for—
14 the blocks will be blocked for pedestrians on some of
15 these side streets now. The crosstown bike lanes
16 like on 15th Street, which is not a protected bike
17 lane will have double parked cars on it. So, it's
18 hard for cyclists to get through. So that is why I
19 am asking these questions. It's not about protecting
20 car drivers. It's not about protecting vehicles. It
21 is what will the impact be locally for all the other
22 blocks in the vicinity of 14th Street, and I still
23 would ask to see the data and to understand other
24 municipalities or even other places in the city that
25 have done this, what is the impact?

2 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: We're—we're
3 happy to share the data. You know, I will just I
4 think sort of close by saying I think this closure of
5 the L Train is it's pretty unprecedented. I mean,
6 you know, our agency and we work closely with MTA,
7 NYPD, sister agencies to manage the congestion in the
8 city on a day-to-day basis and there's no question.
9 As—as I recall from the town hall meeting in your
10 district, your district is unique. The volume of
11 commuters—the size of the transportation facilities I
12 mean you—you—I certainly recognize very special
13 challenges in your district and—and you and I have
14 talked frequently about the—the frustrations you see
15 there day to day. You know, I just have to add on
16 top of that unfortunately this—this L Train shutdown
17 it's—it's—it's not something I think we've really had
18 a precedent in. So, it is going to take I think, you
19 know, all hands on deck. There—there—there is going
20 to be as I said in my testimony, some—some shared
21 pain here for everybody. But we will get you the
22 data. We will, you know, we are open to all creative
23 solutions. Believe me, I recognize in your district
24 in particular on a good day congestion is a

2 tremendous problem, not only on roadways but in the
3 subways, in the buses and on the sidewalks.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: And I don't ask
5 you this as a got you question, Commissioner, at all.
6 I know that, of course, you as Commissioner work for
7 the Mayor and you're appointed by the Mayor and I
8 respect that. So, I'm not saying this in a got you
9 way. I know the Mayor is not sold on congestion
10 pricing and, of course, he supports a millionaire's
11 tax, which would put more money into the MTA and
12 throughout the bus transit and in other things that
13 are really important for the vast majority of folks
14 in New York City that are using the public
15 transportation system. But for me, I sort of feel
16 like until we deal with congestion, until we
17 disincentivize cars from coming into Manhattan, we
18 can try any mitigation plan we want. We can come up
19 with the best, most thoughtfully engineered plans,
20 but until we actually disincentivize cars from coming
21 below 96th Street into Manhattan, everything we do,
22 and I don't say this in a negative way about the—the
23 work that your team has done, we've spent years
24 working on coming up with a full plan on this. It
25 feels to me like tinkering around the edges, and I'm

2 not saying you guys are just trying to tinker around
3 the edges, but until we deal with the elephant in the
4 room, which is there are too many cars coming into
5 Manhattan, and until we do something to drastically
6 disincentivize that, we're going to keep spinning our
7 wheels on figuring out ways to try to lessen the
8 impact on pedestrians, small businesses, cyclists.
9 You have delivery trucks, as I talked about earlier,
10 and—and I feel like all these other things are not
11 big things that are going to move the needle in a
12 significant way. I'm not saying that congestion
13 pricing is the silver bullet, but I think that it is
14 probably one of the bigger things that would help
15 alleviate all the things we're talking about and all
16 the things we're trying to deal with as it relates to
17 an L Train shutdown.

18 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: So, just—just
19 a couple of thoughts on that. I mean I—I hear what
20 you're saying, which is I actually think we're trying
21 to propose some—some pretty big things here. I'm not
22 going to pretend they're going to solve congestion on
23 the island of Manhattan. That wouldn't be real and,
24 look, the Mayor has made his views know, but as we
25 know, the Governor has appointed a commission. You

2 know, we understand that they've been meeting.
3 They've been looking at different potential
4 scenarios, and my understanding is that they will
5 produce a report with recommendations towards the end
6 of the year. So, we will have some ideas on the table
7 from the Governor and his panel, and I think will
8 give us all a chance to react, and see how it looks.
9 I'm hoping they might produce some things that will
10 help us with what we're facing here. I-I for one
11 would be—would be very happy if that were the case.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you very
13 much. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, and to
15 close, adding [bell] to what Council Member Johnson
16 said, you know, everyone knows that most New Yorkers
17 rely on public transportation. That only 1.4 million
18 New Yorkers own a vehicle from the 8.5, and as we
19 know, everyone I think this working 24/7 to improve
20 our transportation system, which is like one of those
21 also systems in the nation that works 24 hours that
22 cover most of the neighborhood. But we understand
23 that transportation deserts is real that there's
24 places in the Bronx and Queens and Brooklyn where the
25 teachers had to walk ten blocks from the train

2 station to the school where they teach, and I believe
3 that doing—and those, your construction on the L
4 Train, we should, as I said before, think outside the
5 boxes on how can we learn from the bus services in
6 that area so that we keep expanding those. And I
7 think that again buses are running too slow in many
8 areas, and enforcement is needed. We need to do more
9 at BLT, SBS, and—and those things are critical. So,
10 my—one of my last—my last thing is on our
11 responsibility from the city government and the state
12 government is to look at what will be the services
13 provided in that area that will replace the train
14 services, the L Train services? I believe—I will
15 assume, right, that we agree that bus services,
16 ferry and bike are like three of the most important
17 services that we have to act and expand in that area.

18 RONNIE HAKIM: And I would add the subway
19 system.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, exactly but
21 beside that expanding services in the other train
22 line close to that area, but when it comes to—when it
23 comes to that area that the L Train covers, ferry,
24 bus and bike lane, are going to be very critical,
25 right. Is there a possibility to integrate the

2 payment—the payment system? And, of course, I heard
3 from you. You're talking on the ferry, but is there—
4 because that's the vision. That's the New York City
5 that I would like to see 10, 20 years from now.
6 Where we use—where there's cyclists, and the—the
7 pedestrians. New Yorkers can say when we paid one
8 time, that payment can allow, too, for us to do a
9 transfer. So, it seems those three, the bus
10 services, the bike lane, and—and the ferry will be
11 very critical. The Centers of services that we need
12 to replace, bring there to replace it. Can we work
13 together? Is there any hope again that you look for
14 integrating and creating an integrated payment system
15 including those three services.

16 RONNIE HAKIM: So, we have recently
17 awarded a contract for a new fare payment system that
18 will be the next technology to replace the Metro Card
19 system, and it's in that context where there probably
20 are greater opportunities to use technology, whether
21 it's a phone payment system or a credit card enabled
22 chip—a chip enabled credit card or some other
23 mechanism. But as I said earlier, I think that is a
24 separate conversation, and one we would we would
25 participate in.

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I-I just hope
3 that in that—and again, and just first of all thank
4 you for being here. Thank you for all your time
5 answering all the questions, and your commitment to
6 continue going through all those communities and
7 responding to other question, and as I said your goal
8 is about some opinions, and we need to be ready to
9 respond and answer all those questions. But my
10 concern is that yes we will have the ferry. We have
11 the bus services. We have the Citi Bike, but we—up
12 to now we're expecting that those New Yorkers they
13 will be doing three different payments. You know that
14 there's not a—right now, you know, I know that you
15 are working to—for the new payment system, but are—do
16 we have that concern that with the closure of the L
17 Train, those three services that we would provide or
18 expand them, will come over those riders to do three
19 different payments for those three different
20 services.

21 RONNIE HAKIM: While I—I continue to say,
22 you know, our fares—our fare policy and our fare
23 structure around the alternate service plans that
24 will be required for the L, are still evolving. I do
25 think that there is the possibility that—that the

2 ferry is using that as an example. Somebody will come
3 up and right now there is the ability to pay for the
4 ferry and get a receipt, and that receipt could then
5 easily be the fare payment mechanism for the free
6 transfer onto the SBS Bus on the other side of the
7 river. So, I think there are opportunities. We just
8 need to continue the—the dialogue.

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I just hope that
10 you look at it, and first of all, I'm happy to hear
11 that, and I also like your team also to look at how
12 Citi Bike can be part of that plan for those times of
13 construction to also receive anything that, you know,
14 in the same payment for the Citi Bike to be able to
15 also to use the bus and to use the ferry, too. With
16 that, thank you, and happy holiday.

17 RONNIE HAKIM: Thank you, Chairman.

18 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. We're
20 doing to be taking a five-minute break so that we
21 will continue with the three panels that we have.
22 [background comments, pause] The next panel will be
23 composed by Eric McClure, Manhattan Borough President
24 represented by Sheila Warren (sic), Farise (sp?)
25 Leonard; Emily Provonshol (sp?) and Kate Levin.

2 Everyone will have the opportunity to have two
3 minutes to present their testimony. If it's longer
4 than that, please summarize. [background comments,
5 pause]

6 ERIC MCCLURE: Sorry. Good afternoon.
7 Thank you, Mr. Chair. My name is Eric McClure. I am
8 the Executive Director of StreetsPAC. While the plan
9 released yesterday by the MTA and Department of
10 Transportation is a significant step forward in
11 addressing the transportation crisis that will be
12 created by the 15-month shutdown of the Canarsie
13 Tubes beginning in 2019, it does need to go further.
14 Our hope is that this is merely opening bid that will
15 be revised and made stronger over the coming months.
16 For starters, we believe the buses running across the
17 Williamsburg Bridge should have a dedicated
18 physically separated lane discrete from trucks and
19 turning cars. In order to move 70 buses with 3,800
20 passengers per hour across the bridge, they must be
21 able to travel unencumbered by other vehicles. In
22 addition, the bus approaches to the bridge must be
23 dedicated and protected. While HOV-3 plus
24 restrictions are absolutely necessary, we have deep
25 concerns about enforceability of those restrictions,

2 and would like to see a detailed enforcement plan.

3 Furthermore, we believe that occupancy restrictions

4 on the bridge should be in place 24 hours, 7 days a

5 week as commuting patterns and time will more likely

6 evolve during the shutdown. The same is true for bus

7 only restrictions on the 14th Street Core Busway,

8 which should be extended well beyond rush hours. We

9 are certain to see major increases in for-hire

10 vehicle traffic along the affected route, the effects

11 of which will only be mitigated by dedicating space

12 for much more efficient buses. We also need to

13 better understand how bus loading and especially

14 unloading will work. During peak traffic of 70 buses

15 per hour the potential for bottlenecks caused by

16 passenger entrance and egress will be high. Will bus

17 stops be extending along the route? Will bus stops

18 be extended along the route? What accommodations

19 will be in place to speed passenger movement? This

20 is an important detail. The added ferry service

21 enhanced by infrastructure outlined in the plan will

22 help around the margins. However, we have deep

23 concerns about the ability of the G, J, M, and Z

24 Lines to absorb the 160,000 to 180,000 displaced

25 regular L riders that the MTA and NYC DOT expect on

2 those routes. While extending the G Trains and more
3 frequent service will help, we will--will--new free
4 transfers in stations--as will new free transfers and
5 station enhancements, we're skeptical about the
6 ability of the existing East River Subways to full
7 accommodate the extra passengers. In case anyone
8 hasn't noticed, the subway system hasn't been working
9 terribly well lately without the huge added challenge
10 of the L shutdown. Speaking of station enhancements,
11 the MTA should take this opportunity to make all
12 stations affected by the shutdown ADA compliant. To
13 do--to not do so is a big missed opportunity. We
14 applaud what seems like a pretty significant plan
15 for public outreach and engagement, which is
16 critical. The shutdown of the L is going to cause
17 significant hardship for many people for an extended
18 period of time, and given affected riders plenty of
19 opportunity to weigh in and vent will help ease the
20 pain. And finally, the effects of the L shutdown
21 would be additionally mitigated if we have a
22 congestion pricing plan in place. That needs to
23 happen and soon. Thank you.

24 KATE SLEVIN: [off mic] Good afternoon.

25 [on mic] Good afternoon. I am Kate Slevin, Vice

2 President of State Programs and Advocacy at Regional
3 Plan Association, an organization that works to
4 improve mobility, economic opportunity and
5 sustainability in the New York City Metropolitan
6 region. Thank you to the Chairman and his colleagues
7 for holding this hearing today. The closure plans
8 released by New York DOT and MTA are a good starting
9 point for discussion that we expect will continue for
10 several months. RPA proudly supports the concepts in
11 their proposal, but we hope they can become bolder in
12 the weeks and months ahead. The MTA and DOT must use
13 this opportunity to create transformative change,
14 providing lasting benefits both above and below
15 ground. While we are still reviewing their plans
16 released yesterday, we have some preliminary comments
17 today. We thank the DOT for putting—putting forth a
18 new street design for a busway across 14th Street,
19 but still have questions about how to ensure the
20 buses don't get stuck behind trucks making
21 deliveries. Whether there will be delivery windows
22 for trucks at certain times a day and allowing the
23 buses to run without being stuck behind the trucks
24 throughout other periods. We hope the agencies will
25 take advantage of this dedicated space by making it

2 long more of the day. So, allowing buses to run, and
3 having the busway be more than just the peak hours
4 during the day, and we hope they will work with the
5 NYPD on proper enforcements, and by running buses
6 from both Brooklyn directly along 14th Street to not
7 having them all stop at Delancey or Bleecker Street.
8 We hope that the DOT will take a hard look at bus
9 access to the Williamsburg Bridge as the plans
10 presented do not convince us that the bridge will
11 have free flowing access, and this is vitally
12 important to keep bus-bus riders moving. Also, it's
13 clear that HOV restrictions beyond just rush hours
14 and at other crossings in the East River are
15 necessary and should be considered and, of course, we
16 strongly support a congestion pricing and continue to
17 do so. We support the free Metro Card transfers and
18 ask the MTA to do more with fares. They should
19 implement new contact list fair payment system for
20 buses during the closure and reduce Long Island
21 Railroad fares for trips within New York City. This
22 can be done by implementing the so-called freedom
23 ticket discount for Long Island Railroad trips
24 between Jamaica and Atlantic Avenue. Discounted
25 fares would better connect people to their jobs

2 because our analysis shows that Downtown Brooklyn is
3 a key employment hub for people who live along the L
4 Line. The MTA seems to be expanding its capital
5 improvement plans for the closed stations, and we
6 support that and we hope they'll continue to do more.
7 This means adding new elevators at 3rd and 6th
8 Avenues, continuing to improve circulation elements
9 at Union Square and eventually track and terminal
10 improvements to 8th Avenue that will allow more
11 service to run on the L Train in the future. We
12 support the longer term shutdowns that the MTA is
13 considering, because we think this can save time and
14 money and improve our subways faster. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

16 CHRIS LEONARD: Good morning, Chair
17 Rodriguez and members of the Transportation
18 Committee. My name is Chris Leonard, Vice President
19 of Membership of the Brooklyn Chamber of Commerce,
20 and I'm delivering testimony on behalf of Andrew
21 Hoan, President and CEO of the Brooklyn Chamber.
22 With over 2,000 active members, the Brooklyn Chamber
23 is the largest and number one ranked chamber in New
24 York State. We promote economic development across
25 the Borough of Brooklyn as well as advocate on behalf

2 of member businesses. From Canarsie to Bushwick to
3 Williamsburg, L Train ridership is diverse and
4 dependent on the L Train. So, you get to work,
5 school and doctor's appointments. In addition, the
6 local businesses along the L Train are at risk since
7 they are heavily dependent on it to maintain brisk
8 foot traffic. Earlier this year the Brooklyn Chamber
9 collaborated with the North Brooklyn Chamber of
10 Commerce to conduct a small survey of businesses
11 along the L Train in North Brooklyn to gauge how they
12 may be impacted by the shutdown. According to the
13 survey, 40% of the businesses expected a loss of up
14 to 50% of revenue. In addition, 75% mentioned that
15 their employees rely on the L Train to get to their
16 place—to their place of work. So, we recommend the
17 following to mitigate the impacts of the L Train
18 closure for these small businesses. Provide tax
19 incentives or relief that will help Brooklyn
20 businesses keep up with the already high operational
21 costs of the—in the face of the potential decreased
22 sales. Additional cars on both the elevated and non-
23 elevated lines including the J/M/Z, which you've
24 already addressed today. Additional electric buses,
25 which we've already addressed, and especially funding

2 for an ombudsman for small business services along
3 the L Train route, The Brooklyn Chamber also
4 supports resolution 1443 and reducing the risk of
5 increased pollution especially in areas that already
6 have unusually high or poor air quality. During the
7 15-month shutdown of the L Train, there will be
8 significant increase in car and bus traffic during
9 which—which will generate higher carbon emissions in
10 neighborhoods along the L Line. This will
11 undoubtedly put the more than 200,000 daily commuters
12 at risk of developing or making worse health
13 conditions such as asthma. The resolution represents
14 a responsible approach to perfecting the health or
15 residents by transitioning to electric busses during
16 the shutdown so as not to already exacerbate an
17 already challenging situation. On behalf of the
18 members of Brooklyn Chamber of Commerce, thanks for
19 the opportunity to testify. I had to summarize our
20 statement. So, there's more to read, which you have
21 right in front of you. Thank you so much Chair
22 Rodriguez and members of the Transportation
23 Committee.

24 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you and I
25 would like to acknowledge also for the record that we

2 have testimony from Manhattan Borough President Gale
3 Brewer, and from the Tri-State Transportation
4 Campaign. Thanks, and also from New York City Alicia
5 Winship(sp?) from Etinger—I'm sorry Alicia Winship.
6 The next panel will be Steve Bauman, Kat Fisher;
7 Karen Cornello; Renee Reynolds; Phil Vos, Marissa
8 Seva-Farrell. (sic) [background comments, pause] So,
9 let me call the next one, which is the last one.
10 Peter Walters, Bill Adam Lerman, Alicia Winship,
11 Steven Bowman. If I did not call anybody else,
12 please be sure—whichever I called sit in the table.
13 [background comments] This is a first. Everyone fix
14 their attention. [background comments, pause] You
15 may begin.

16 PETER WALTERSPIEL: Good afternoon, Mr.
17 Chairman. My name is Peter Walterspiel. I--

18 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet,
19 please.

20 PETER WALTERSPIEL: I represent StuyTown
21 Peter Cooper Village in Congressman, in Council
22 Members Garodnick's district. The numbers don't add
23 up for us, quite frankly, although we're thankful
24 that we finally had a mitigation plan presented today
25 because there's a little bit of a shame that it took

2 a hearing to do so. We have 28,000 resident-
3 residents living in StuyTown of which about 18,000
4 are part of a commuting population. 8,200 of these
5 use the L Train on a daily basis. That's 16% of the-
6 within Manhattan ridership of the L Train. We now
7 add a couple of thousand people that live in the East
8 Village to this. We're at 30% of daily riders, and
9 now with the new ferry stop we add another 10,000
10 riders. So, we're basically at 50% of the daily
11 existing Manhattan ridership that has to be
12 transported in a different manner. That's 25,000
13 people. The ferry alone, as we were told, adds 1,200
14 individuals per hour with a bus that holds about 60
15 people if it's full. That's 17 buses just for the
16 ferry passengers per hour. I wonder where those
17 other 15,000 people will find room even on the bus
18 that will have to cross 14th Street. The other thing
19 that is a little bit disturbing, as we can see here,
20 to me is that the busway doesn't start up until third
21 avenue. So, anyone who gets on the bus at the ferry
22 stop all the way to 3rd Avenue has to contend with
23 other traffic on 14th Street being that cabs,
24 individual cars, trucks making deliveries, and even
25 though we have bus lanes, I think we all know that

2 bus lanes are a perfect stop for rideshare vehicles,
3 and cabs to simply pull over, turn on their flashers
4 and load and discharge passengers. In the meantime,
5 there are buses trying to get by. So, I think this
6 plan does not go far enough as presented. Thank you

7 PHIL VOS: Good afternoon, Mr. Chairman.

8 Thank you and to the Committee also for this
9 opportunity to testify on behalf of Energy Vision a
10 New York City based non-profit environmental
11 organization. My name is Phil Vos. Through public
12 education, research and analysis Energy Vision
13 advocates for the use of non-petroleum, low carbon
14 transportation fuels particularly for heavy duty
15 vehicles like trucks and buses. Energy Vision has
16 become recognized nationally and internationally as a
17 leading independent expert on alternative fuels for
18 heavy fleets. Electric shuttle buses are clearly
19 part of the L Train shutdown conversation, and while
20 vehicle electrification will no doubt, no doubt play
21 an important role, I want to look at an additional
22 emerging low carbon technology that is already being
23 used by thousands of heavy vehicles in American
24 fleets. It is deployable in New York City now in
25 vehicles that are already on the road, and using

2 fueling infrastructure that is already in place.

3 That technology is organic waste derived by a methane
4 sometimes called renewable natural gas. Many people
5 are familiar with the idea of landfill gas, the same
6 kind of methane rich gases captured around the
7 country at wastewater treatment plants, and in
8 purpose built anaerobic digesters. All this gas can
9 be refined to pipeline quality biomethane and used
10 just like geologic natural gas including as vehicle
11 fuel, but the greenhouse gas emissions from
12 biomethane are 40% or more lower than from geologic
13 natural gas and 70% or more lower than from diesel
14 fuel. Such a fuel could help New York City move
15 rapidly towards 20 x 50 greenhouse gas emissions
16 reduction goals. At least 800 MTA buses use
17 compressed natural gas as fuel. Biomethane, which is
18 available on the market can be used in any natural
19 gas vehicle with no modification, and can be
20 transported and dispensed using existing
21 infrastructure. With the change in procurement
22 practices, MTA buses could switch over to Biomethane
23 immediately reducing their emissions by 40% or more.

24 [bell] The L Train shutdown represents an opportunity
25 to pilot Biomethane and surface transit in New York

2 City. The Spring Creek Bus Depot on Flatlands Avenue
3 near the L Train Terminus at Rockaway Parkway houses
4 natural gas buses now. If buses from that depot
5 served as L Train shuttles and that depot converted
6 to Biomethane even on a trial basis, it would allow
7 MTA to become the first New York Fleet to utilize
8 this ultra low emission solution. Biomethane is also
9 a closed loop solution for New York City. With
10 appropriate investment and building on existing
11 infrastructure, our own huge waste streams could be
12 converted to vehicle fuel. The fuel is proven
13 solution that is available now, and it's ready to be
14 deployed in New York City. We encourage the MTA and
15 the Committee to consider piloting its introduction
16 as part of the L Train shutdown. Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. Thank
18 you, and we definitely will be following or following
19 your recommendations as the other members of the
20 panels.

21 RENEE REYNOLDS: Good afternoon
22 Chairperson Ydanis Rodriguez and members of the City
23 Council. My name is Renee Reynolds and I'm here to
24 testify on behalf of New York City Environmental
25 Justice Alliance. Founded in 1991, NYCEJA is a non-

2 profit citywide membership network linking grassroots
3 organizations from low-income neighborhoods and
4 communities of color in their struggle for
5 environmental justice. NYCEJA empowers its member
6 organizations to advocate for improved environmental
7 conditions and against inequitable and environmental
8 burdens. Through our efforts, member organization
9 coalesce around specific common issues that threaten
10 the ability of low-income communities and communities
11 of color to thrive and coordinate campaigns designed
12 to effect city and state policies including
13 transportation policies that affect their
14 communities. I'd like to thank Council Member Rafael
15 Espinal for sponsoring the resolution calling on
16 Governor Cuomo and the MTA to commit to an
17 expeditious transition from fossil fuel burning
18 diesel buses to a modern electric bus fleet.
19 Communities in North Brooklyn are overburdened by
20 heavy vehicle traffic and their emissions. When
21 compared to the rest of Brooklyn and New York City as
22 a whole, the neighborhoods of Williamsburg, and
23 Bushwick fair worst in asthma hospitalization rates
24 across all age groups. And overall increase in
25 asthma prevalence are contributing to growing

2 healthcare costs for New York employers, consumers
3 and taxpayers. In 2016, we conducted a community
4 survey in partnership with our member organization El
5 Puente, and found that in certain intersection in
6 North Brooklyn over 200 bus-trucks converged across
7 intersections in a one-hour period. We think that
8 the 2019 shutdown of the L Train represents an
9 opportunity to act intentionally and deriving a
10 replacement strategy that would fill the gaps in
11 transit service and also play a part in the longer
12 term strategy reducing vehicle emissions in the city.
13 The city could save on mass transit expenditures
14 while cleaning [bell] the air that we breathe,
15 reducing oil consumption and reducing the amount of
16 greenhouse gas emissions. The MTA operates 500-5,700
17 buses, and should be a standard bearer for the United
18 States. They should look at the examples from other
19 cities across the country and move towards creating
20 transportation options that improve health benefits
21 for our communities rather than worsening them.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. I
23 would like also to acknowledge that Council Member
24 Rose is here, and we will continue listen-listening
25 to the other members of the panel.

2 KAT FISHER: Thank you. Thank you to the
3 Chairman Rodriguez and to Council Member Espinal who
4 has pushed this resolution into being with us and for
5 all those who co-sponsored. So, I'm Kat Fisher from
6 the Sierra Club and I lead the Electric Vehicle
7 Program in New York State, and we are thrilled that
8 we have so many allies here today. We've had several
9 members who had to leave. New York City, as you
10 know, is rated among the top 25 most polluted cities
11 in the American Lung Associations State of the Air
12 Report. More than 2 million in the New York
13 Metropolitan area have had asthma including nearly
14 half a million children. We say why go with low
15 emissions when we can go with no emissions, and with-
16 with respect to the MTA statement today about being
17 cautious or wise about their investment, when you can
18 save \$39,000 a year per bus with electric buses and
19 their own Columbia Feasibility Study proved, we think
20 that there's a lot of savings to be had not only
21 through fuel and through maintenance, but through-
22 obviously through emissions as well. And not to
23 mention with electric buses we're preventing further
24 storm damage to subway tunnels like the L Train.
25 Electric buses whose production was ramped up

2 significantly as a global response to climate
3 disruption, have come down in price by hundreds of
4 thousands of dollars each year, and now offer the
5 lowest total cost of ownership, life cycle global
6 warming emissions from battery electric buses are
7 more than 70% lower than those from fracked gas or
8 diesel according to the Union of Concerned
9 Scientists. This transition also needs to be a just
10 one that includes the retraining of current New York
11 workers and cities like Los Angeles, Seattle,
12 Worcester, Massachusetts and Philadelphia and
13 countless cold weather cities in Europe have already
14 made the commitment to zero emissions buses. The
15 MTA's current electric bus pilot is not its first.
16 In a fleet of 5,700 [bell] a 1% bus pilot for three
17 years is too small and doesn't go far enough. We
18 need a shorter pilot and bigger commitments. The
19 Sierra Club is calling on the State's largest transit
20 agency to make a serious and speedy switch to an
21 electric fleet. Super Storm Sandy, which cost New
22 York businesses billions in damages and lost revenue
23 showed us just how vulnerable our communities are to
24 the effects of climate disruption and our
25 transportation sector is a crucial part of the

2 solution. That's why over 100 New York City business
3 owners in Brooklyn and the Bronx signed onto a letter
4 of support to a switch for a clean electric buses.
5 Extracting and burning oil creates more than 40% of
6 the climate disruption—disrupting emissions in the
7 U.S. and for those of us who believe in climate
8 change, we have to summon the courage to acknowledge
9 the urgency of the situation. The urgency of key
10 transition like zero emission transit stems from the
11 fact that from the inertia of our climate system, it
12 doesn't respond quickly to change. With a 2-1/2 mile
13 deep ocean and almost two mile thick ice sheets, it
14 takes a long time for the changes we make today to
15 take effect. Electric buses are a crucial piece of
16 the solution and we don't have time to wait.

17 JESSICA CASTLE: Good morning. Thank you
18 for the opportunity to testify today. My name is
19 Jessica Castle and I'm Strategic Researcher at ALIGN,
20 the Alliance for a Greater New York, and I'm
21 testifying on behalf of my Executive Director Ray
22 DaSilva Farrell. ALIGN is a longstanding alliance of
23 labor and community and environmental justice
24 organizations united for a just and sustainable New
25 York. Our vision for the future prioritizes

2 investment in sustainable energy, the creation of
3 career track job in green industries and ensuring the
4 health and welfare of every neighborhood particularly
5 low-income communities and communities of color that
6 ae disproportionately affected by climate change.
7 Resolution 1443 will help ensure the sustainability
8 of our environment as well as our communities. The
9 neighborhoods that rely on the L Train should not
10 have to deal with more dirty buses clogging their
11 streets on top of service disruptions that are a
12 result of chronic underfunding. Cleaner electric
13 buses are quieter and generate far less emissions
14 than diesel buses. This means cleaner air for
15 pedestrians, bus riders and bus drivers. Our
16 researchers—our research with community groups in
17 Bushwick found particulate matter was up to five
18 times higher than the average for North Brooklyn. An
19 all electric fleet would help alleviate these harmful
20 pollutants from threatening the health of our
21 communities. At ALIGN we believe electrifying the L
22 Train Shuttle fleet is a step in the right direction.
23 However, a full transition to an entirely electric
24 fleet of all buses on our streets including MTA as
25 well as school buses will ensure a significantly

2 cleaner future for our communities and to keep New
3 York on track to meet the Mayor's goal of reducing
4 emissions by 40% by 2030. A fully electric MTA bus
5 fleet would save New York City over 575,000 metric
6 tones of CO₂ equivalent a year. Electrifying bus
7 fleets should—excuse me—also provides an economic
8 opportunity for the city to generate jobs while also
9 saving money. Electric charging stations for the
10 buses open up a new sector of jobs in green energy.
11 These jobs can be career track jobs that build skills
12 and prioritize hiring from low-income communities and
13 communities of color. In addition to generating more
14 jobs, the city will save money over the life of an
15 all electric fleet compared to their fleet. When
16 considering upfront costs, fuel costs and maintenance
17 costs, electric buses cost just under 40K less
18 annually than diesel powered buses. Considering the
19 health benefits for workers and community members,
20 the economic opportunity to expand job sectors and
21 the sustained cost savings it's clear that an all
22 electric bus fleet provides us an opportunity to
23 achieve both a more sustainable future as well as a
24 healthier economy and environment for all New
25 Yorkers. Thank you.

2 STEVEN BAUMAN: My name [coughs] My name
3 is Steven Bauman. I'm here a s private citizen.
4 Dwight Eisenhower developed the war operations plans
5 over three months time in 1942. The closure has been
6 on-has-came about-was first presented in January or
7 2016. The operations plans for the MTA have taken 23
8 months. That puts them 20 months behind Eisenhower's
9 pace. Presently with regard to the impact of the
10 shutdown, the service in Brooklyn is going to be
11 reduced by 62.5%. This was not mentioned in the
12 report. It will make a big impact on the people who
13 use only the L Train in Brooklyn. That's 125,000
14 people. Right now there are 20-the L Train operates
15 20 trains going between Brooklyn and Manhattan during
16 the peak hour. They hope that 20% of the people will
17 avoid the L Train for the duration. That still
18 leaves 16 train loads of passengers to be shuttled
19 to-16 train loads need to be added to the schedules
20 on various routes. The promised G Train service
21 increase doesn't count because the G train does not
22 go into Manhattan. The proposed transfer points at-t
23 to the No. 3 and No. 7 won't help either because no
24 additional trains are possible on these two routes.
25 The only additional proposal has been increase the

1 J/M-J/M and Z lines. The total amount that they can
2 have on there is eight trains. The constraints are
3 limited by traffic on the F and M Line existing and
4 also rate constraints on the Williamsburg Bridge.
5 That means 8 out 16 trains or the only ones that had
6 happened. That's a 50% solution at best with regard
7 to this thing. Take a look at other infrastructure
8 replacements. Hudson River Tunnels, what they're
9 going to do is put [bell] build an in tunnel and then
10 repair the existing ones. Ditto for the bridges, the
11 Kosciuszko Bridge, the Mario Cuomo Bridge and so
12 forth. 200,000 people use the Hudson River Tunnels.
13 180,000 vehicles use the Kosciuszko, 79,000 use the
14 Goethals and 140,000 use the Mario Cuomo Bridge
15 versus 265,000 for the Canarsie Tunnels. Those of-
16 clearly, the number of people adversely affected
17 isn't what drives the decision to avoid closure who
18 the people are and where they live plays an important
19 point. Approximately 400,000 people will be
20 affected. If for an average of 30 minutes per trip,
21 the total cost to them at minimum wage over the 15
22 months is \$1.15 billion. That's the cost that the
23 public will have to pay for disclosure. In addition
24 the money, what that means for that money plus the
25

2 amount of money that the businesses who will suffer
3 would have paid for an additional tunnel, and would
4 have avoided the entire closure problem. One big
5 difference is after this money has been spent for the
6 Hudson River Tunnels or the Cuomo Bridge they come up
7 with better infrastructure. What we will have left
8 is something that is no better than what the Canarsie
9 Tunnels was before Sandy occurred.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. We
11 have one more person.

12 STEVEN FABRICAN: Good afternoon. Sorry.
13 Good afternoon. Mr. Chairman. I'm here to speak on
14 behalf of electric buses. My name is Steve Fabrican.
15 I'm a New Yorker and bus and subway rider. I've been
16 involved with Sierra Club with Initiative through Kat
17 Fisher for the last few years. I have been driving
18 an electric BMWI3 and love it. For those that have
19 never been in an EV or behind the steering wheel I
20 highly recommend it. Not only is it a quiet-not only
21 is it a quiet less stressful ride, much needed noise
22 in New York City, I know I'm not spewing awful fumes
23 into the air-into the air. A few months ago I got to
24 see and electric bus being showcased at a Sierra Club
25 meeting right here in Midtown Manhattan as part of

2 the Annual National Drive Electric Week in September.
3 Even though the bus didn't move from its location, I
4 got to tour it inside. It was an awfully hot day and
5 the bus' air conditioning was totally powered, nice
6 and cold like we New Yorkers love it. I realized the
7 bus was idling and not spewing awful carbon dioxide
8 into the air. It made me think of all the stops
9 buses make to pick up and drop off passengers, all
10 those fumes. Electric buses will keep the city
11 quieter and cleaner, and as a progressive city and
12 state, New York we need electric buses. Not only
13 will the customers be educated about New York City
14 being progressive, they will love the clean and quiet
15 experience electric buses will bring to our city.
16 Thank you.

17 ADAM LERMAN: Good morning everyone and
18 thank you for the opportunity to speak. My name is
19 Adam Lerman and I—I live here and I'm a person. So,
20 a lot of the points that I was going to make have
21 already been made. I don't need to bother you with
22 redundancy, but I want to bring up two very specific
23 points, one local/economic and one personal. The
24 first is essentially the—the local issue. A 2016
25 study, as we've heard and many other studies have

2 talked about the effects, the asthma issues that we
3 have in the city, and I want to bring up a specific
4 economic point. As we know, the State co-funds
5 Medicaid providing a significant amount of funding
6 for the poor and elderly who are suffering from such
7 issues as these respiratory ailments. This funding
8 is derived from general tax revenues, i.e., the
9 taxpayer, which means that if we don't make a change
10 now to the causes of these respiratory ailments we,
11 the taxpayers, are going to have to pay even more
12 especially if Congress' proposed tax plan is enacted
13 and New York finds itself getting hit with across-
14 the-board tax increase that many democratic states in
15 this country are about to endure. Electric buses in-
16 in very simple summary decrease emissions, which
17 decrease asthma related illnesses, which decreases
18 Medicaid responsibilities on the State and taxpayer.
19 Everybody wins. The personal issue is this: I'm the
20 father of a two-year-old. I'm about to have a second
21 one in a month. I live in an area, a building. There
22 are four apartments that look out on a bus stop. A
23 lot of these newborns and young toddlers have windows
24 that are facing the street, and we simply can't
25 cross-ventilate by, you know, saving electricity and

2 thus the environment with air conditions. We can't
3 cross-ventilate using windows because as these
4 windows sit out and look at these buses passing by,
5 we are seeing as we all understand and we've all seen
6 a million times that black particulate that forms on
7 the windowsills. That's the kind of thing that lands
8 in our rooms and in the lungs of our children.
9 Idling buses are not the only causes of this
10 particulate, but they are a major contributor, and
11 the idea of the MTA and the DOT [bell] saying that
12 New York is a unique city and using that kind of
13 cheeky non-excuse for pursuing a 100% electric fleet
14 is not only irresponsible but absurd. Because this
15 is not an idea that needs to be pilot tested because
16 you don't need to test a proven theory. Let us as-as
17 you had mentioned consider and test immediately
18 electric bus fleet and recognize, as has been
19 mentioned, the incredible economic incentives of
20 reorganizing our infrastructure to power a fully
21 electric fleet. And not only the-the plausibility
22 and the sustainability, but the inevitability of a
23 completely electric fleet because in-in the mind of-
24 mindset of there are no jobs on a dead planet, we
25 must completely eliminate any reliance on fossil

2 fuels and we have the opportunity to be as we believe
3 ourselves to the greatest city in the world, one of
4 the greatest leaders in implementing this kind of
5 philosophy into our infrastructure. Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: My colleague
7 Council Member Espinal has a question.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: I just—I'd love
9 to get the Sierra Clubs thoughts on the MTA's
10 testimony and their—and—and their view that there
11 isn't enough data, and that they have to run this
12 pilot just to make sure that their money is being
13 well invested, and they're not purchasing buses that
14 at some point cannot be—cannot work in our city
15 streets.

16 KAT FISHER: Well, it's interesting that
17 they did commission a study by Columbia, the
18 recommendation of which was on electric buses, the
19 recommendation of which was a one-year pilot, and so
20 now they're in the midst of a three-year pilot, which
21 we just think is excessive, and we wonder if they're
22 waiting on the universalization of charging, because
23 there isn't a universal charging system right now for
24 buses. But we see other cities making the plunge and
25 there are—they manufacturers of these buses also have

2 all different kinds of contractual arrangements that
3 would protect their investment not the manufacturer's
4 but that would help the MTA to protect its investment
5 and make sure that they don't get stuck as she
6 mentioned.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: So, I'm sure
8 they have a warranty of some sort if-if for some
9 reason it doesn't work in New York City streets.

10 KAT FISHER: There's really not an issue
11 of it not working in New York City streets. So there
12 have been four pilots. I mean this-this would be the
13 fourth pilot, but they are fully operational in-in
14 other cold-cold weather cities. So, I don't think
15 it's really an issue.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Are there any
17 other comparable cities where we-where they have more
18 than ten electric buses on-on the roads?

19 KAT FISHER: Well, we know Chicago has
20 just purchased some, and Philadelphia has. So, in
21 addition to Worcester, Massachusetts, which probably
22 isn't comparable, it is weather wise, but maybe not
23 with the condition of their streets, there is data
24 out there that-and from-from Europe as well that-
25 that-I'm sure that they must be privy to.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: And so, do you
3 agree that it's—it would be wise for the MTA instead
4 of using this capital tax—our tax dollars to invest
5 on diesel buses instead of—Well, do you think it
6 would be smarter for the MTA to use our new tax
7 dollars that they have towards electric buses when
8 we—when they are saying that they are going to pilot
9 this program, and hopefully in the future it expands.
10 Just—just make that commitment upfront instead of
11 waiting and—and waiting for the data.

12 KAT FISHER: You know, so what we're
13 asked her to compare is the cost of the health of New
14 Yorkers. So, there is a risk. There's a risk
15 everyday in the lives of people who breathe this as
16 lung disease and—and heart disease and all the
17 related illnesses to—to air quality not to mention
18 exacerbating future storms. So, when they're talking
19 about a financial risk, we're talking about a risk to
20 human lives and to human health and to, you know,
21 more damage to subway lines and to coastal cities
22 like ours. So, this really doesn't seem like a fair
23 comparison to me.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Alright, thank
25 you. Appreciate it.

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So, with that,
3 we're coming to the end of this hearing. Thank you
4 for your testimony and, you know, your voices are
5 going to be very important and conversation will
6 continue. I know that you will go also to those
7 community meetings that the MTA and DOT that we put
8 together. I would personally like to invite you for
9 now to be part of our third Car Free Day that we will
10 be doing Sunday, April 22nd on Earth Day. Last year
11 we were able to close the Broadway from 44th to Union
12 Square, and hopefully we'll be able to close a
13 similar area, and dedicate that day to have
14 conversations about how important for everyone to do
15 their part to protect our Mother Earth. Wit that, I
16 would like o close again this hearing, and first of
17 all expressing my support to Council Member Espinal's
18 Resolution. I hope that we can be able to work with
19 the rest of the colleagues and be able to pass this
20 resolution before the end of the year. I will also
21 repeat that the closure of the L Train provides
22 everyone the opportunity to do many pilot projects.
23 One should be also to be able to centralize a payment
24 system to create an integrated payment system where
25 with one payment riders should be able to transfer

2 from buses, Citi Bike and ferry, something that I
3 also hope will be the future of transportation in New
4 York City. I also believe that it is important as we
5 are closing this year to be open for everyone to do
6 their part to raise revenue to the MTA and for the
7 MTA to open more the book and be more transparent on
8 how they are controlling the costs. I believe that
9 the city should—will also be open to increase the
10 contribution if those contributions is used for a
11 particular project related to maintenance and repair,
12 and finally I hope that the MTA should be able to
13 provide two or three additional seats to New York
14 City at the Board that is designated by the City
15 Council, and also for the MTA to focus the next ten
16 years only in maintenance and repair. So that I hope
17 that from 2018 to 2028 we should get to see the MTA
18 being involved in many new mega projects, but yet to
19 complete and all the work that they got to do related
20 to maintenance and repair. With that, this hearing
21 is adjourned. Be tuned since we as the Committee of
22 Transportation we're going to be—we're going to be
23 voting good bills before the end of this year. This
24 hearing is adjourned. [gavel]

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

171

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date January 9, 2018